

University of Warwick institutional repository: <http://go.warwick.ac.uk/wrap>

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of PhD at the University of Warwick

<http://go.warwick.ac.uk/wrap/4107>

This thesis is made available online and is protected by original copyright.

Please scroll down to view the document itself.

Please refer to the repository record for this item for information to help you to cite it. Our policy information is available from the repository home page.

**Visual and Textual Images of Women:
1930s Representations of Colonial Bali as Produced
by Men and Women Travellers**

by

JoJOR Ria Sitompul

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Translation Studies

University of Warwick, CTCCS

June 2008

Table of Contents

	page
List of illustrations	iv
Acknowledgments	v
Abstract	vii
Introduction: Explorations, Travels, and Colonialisms	
1. Textual and Visual Images of Bali	3
2. Images of Women	6
3. Balinese Beauty	9
4. The 1930s Travel Writing	13
5. The 'White' Man's Prestige, Gender Loathing, and Racial Loathing	17
6. Balinese Identity	19
7. Methodology	24
8. Women as Producers of Images and Writing	37
Part I	
1. Chapter 1	
Preconceptions: Travel and Literature in the 1930s Bali	46
1. 1. <i>Java: The Garden of the East</i> (1897, 1912, 1998)	49
1. 2. <i>Bali: Enchanted Isle – a Travel Book</i> (1934)	52
1. 3. <i>A Tale from Bali</i> (1937)	56
1. 4. Means of Transport – Ships	60
1. 5. <i>Insel Bali</i> (1920)	66
1. 6. <i>The Last Paradise</i> (1930)	72
1. 7. <i>Island of Bali</i> (1937)	80
1. 8. Visual Attractions	87
1. 9. Textual Images of Balinese Women	93
2. Chapter 2	
Printed Images of Balinese Women and their Image Makers	105
2. 1. Thilly Weissenborn	106
2. 2. Gender and Identity (Hybridity)	117
2. 3. The 1930s Photographers	124
2. 4. The Photographic Illustrators: Rose Roland de Covarrubias and André Roosevelt	127
2. 5. The Photographer as the Author: Helen Eva Yates	132
2. 6. The Photographer as the Author: Geoffrey Gorer and Collin McPhee	135
2. 7. Feminine Beauty and the 'Bare' Factors	139
2. 8. The Content and Style of the Paintings	146
2. 9. Paintings and Photographs	153

Part II

3. Chapter 3

Travelling Colonists, Pro and Anti Colonial Attitudes	162
3. 1. Vicki Baum (1888 – 1960)	165
3. 2. K'tut Tantri (1899 – 1970)	175
3. 3. Nationalism, Identity and Gender Issues	189
3. 4. Geoffrey Gorer (1905 – 1985)	198

Part II

4. Chapter 4

Colonial Photography and Anthropology in Bali	208
4.1. Science and Colonial Photography in the Dutch East Indies	209
4.2. Scholarly Writing in the 1930s	227
4.3. Translating Words	229
4.4. Textualising Images, the Visual and the Verbal Concept	237
4.5. Gender Issues in Scientific Writing	243

5. Chapter 5

Displays as Texts and Image Making	266
5.1. Bali in Paris	268
5.2. Printed Media	271
5.3. Repetition of Motifs and Captions	273
5.4. Catalogue Texts	278
5.5. Image Circulation	287
5.6. Museum/Colonial Photographs Language	300

Conclusions	305
-------------	-----

Appendix

- A. Illustrations
- B. Short Biographies
- C. Chronology of Bali

Bibliography	325
--------------	-----

Part II

3. Chapter 3

Travelling Colonists, Pro and Anti Colonial Attitudes	162
3. 1. Vicki Baum (1888 – 1960)	165
3. 2. K'tut Tantri (1899 – 1970)	175
3. 3. Nationalism, Identity and Gender Issues	189
3. 4. Geoffrey Gorer (1905 – 1985)	198

Part II

4. Chapter 4

Colonial Photography and Anthropology in Bali	208
4.1. Science and Colonial Photography in the Dutch East Indies	209
4.2. Scholarly Writing in the 1930s	227
4.3. Translating Words	229
4.4. Textualising Images, the Visual and the Verbal Concept	237
4.5. Gender Issues in Scientific Writing	243

5. Chapter 5

Displays as Texts and Image Making	266
5.1. Bali in Paris	268
5.2. Printed Media	271
5.3. Repetition of Motifs and Captions	273
5.4. Catalogue Texts	278
5.5. Image Circulation	287
5.6. Museum/Colonial Photographs Language	300

Conclusions	305
-------------	-----

Appendix

- A. Illustrations
- B. Short Biographies
- C. Chronology of Bali

Bibliography	324
--------------	-----

Illustrations

- Fig. 1. *Een Balinese Schone* (Balinese Beauty)
- Fig. 2. A young girl in sarong
- Fig. 3. A child is taking a bath under *pancuran*
- Fig. 4. *Twee Balinese Vrouwen* (Two Balinese Women)
- Fig. 5a. *Balinees dansmeisje* (Balinese dancing girl)
- Fig. 5b. *Balinees dansmeisje* (Cover page)
- Fig. 6. *Djogjakarta*, a Javanese girl
- Fig. 7. *Soendanees Meisje* (Sundanese Girl),
- Fig. 8. Gusti Ngurah Ketut Jelantik, Regent of Buleleng, Bali (seated)
- Fig. 9. Comparative Physiognomy: "Irishman" vs Terrier
- Fig. 10a. *Frau Sucht eine Badestelle* (Woman looks for a bath place)
- Fig. 10b. *Hockender Knabe* (Squatting boy)
- Fig. 11. Girl Feeding Brother
- Fig. 12. *Erfpoort van Laagste Kast* (The doorway of the low caste)
- Fig. 13. Unmarried young girl
- Fig. 14a. Alexander King's illustration
- Fig. 14b. *Frau beim Haarwaschen* (Woman washing hair)

Acknowledgments

I should like first of all to thank God for His grace that this thesis is finally completed. I owe my greatest debt to Dr. Joanne Collie who for years has read the most and the roughest drafts of my work, from its inception, and went over the final draft. Early discussions of my work first decided its direction, and her reading of subsequent versions improved it at every point. I would like to express my sincere gratitude for her unfailing support and guidance throughout the project, her invaluable feedback and encouragement and also her care.

During the stages of writing, I have received second opinion and benefited from the critical commentaries and the intellectual support of Professor Susan Bassnett, who has read and commented on Chapter 1. I am deeply grateful for the scrupulous care with which she helped to shape, to sharpen and to bring this research up to the required standard.

I would like especially to thank (former and current) directors Dr. Piotr Kuhiwczak and Dr. Lynne Long for handling interlibrary loan and immigration-related requests with patience. I also thank the countless people over the past several years, including the academic and support staff at the CTCCS, who in different ways, have made this thesis possible, giving freely their support.

I have benefited greatly from conversations and discussions with other PhD students during doctoral seminars and conferences; they have offered continual inspiration and guidance since the beginning of my graduate study. Among many friends and colleagues who gave generously of their time to read versions or sections of the thesis.

Special thanks are also due to my sisters, Tiur and Lina, who have provided continual moral and financial support since the beginning of my graduate work. This thesis is dedicated to my mother, and to the memory of my father.

ABSTRACT

All kinds of travellers came to Bali in the 1930s. Many of them produced books and photographs, which later incited more visitors to come and see Bali for themselves. The works of these image-makers who travelled to Bali are the result of actual experience and recounted journeys. Their descriptions of Bali, although based on authentic experience, are also the result of literary and pictorial readings. Their accounts or representations are often enriched with material accumulated from fiction, biblical references, and scientific books, as well as paintings and photographs. These image-makers of Bali did not arrive without mental luggage. Both the textual and visual image-makers constructed images of the paradise according to their own fantasies and personal experience, as did the consumers of those images. The representation of Balinese women was thus heavily influenced by earlier travellers, photographers, and scholars. However, it is difficult to know who imitates whom and whose images can be cited as authentic. The previous readings or visual representations condition expectations in each traveller, so that she or he fashions images inspired by those already in circulation. The themes which recur over and over in photographs confirm existing stereotypical concepts. In other words, these representations influence perceptions of the 'other' that persist to the present day.

Jojo Ria Sitompul

INTRODUCTION:

EXPLORATIONS, TRAVELS AND COLONIALISMS

For Europe to gain control of the world, it required not only a 'landscape practice that could first survey and describe,'¹ but also 'traveller's accounts and topographical information'.² In fact, the first voyage to the Indonesian archipelago, which later resulted in the colonisation of Indonesia by the Dutch³, started with some documents stolen by Jan Huygen van Linschoten (1563-1611) from Portugal.⁴ Linschoten went to Spain to learn about trade. However, he managed to copy all the important information that had been studied and collected by the Portuguese government about its colonies. When Linschoten returned to Amsterdam, he published *Itinerario* (1596), which includes valuable information about the Portuguese's voyage to Guinea Coast and navigation to the East.⁵ The Dutch then used the navigation information to travel to the East and to reach the

¹ Nicholas Thomas, *Colonialism's Culture: Anthropology, Travel and Government*, (Cambridge, UK: Polity, 1994), p. 148.

² Emma Jinhua Teng, *Taiwan's Imagined Geography: Chinese Colonial Travel Writing and Pictures, 1683-1895* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Asia Center, 2004), p. 6.

³ The use of words such as 'Dutch' or 'White' is unavoidable and the intention is to recognise, distinguish or identify one over the other so that when speaking about colonialism, for example, it is clear whether it is Dutch, British or French's colonialism. Here I draw on Worth's remark: 'What we call 'true to life' must be a stereotype if it is to be recognized ...' Sol Worth, *Studying Visual Communication* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 1981), p. 183.

⁴ Leo Wahyudi S, 'VOC: a Sore Memory 400 years after', *The Jakarta Post*, 20 March 2002; Eddi Santosa, 'HUT VOC ke-400: Berawal dari Penghianatan Anak Seorang Notaris', 2002. *Detik*. Online. Available: <http://www.detik.com>. 25 February 2002. For further discussion on this subject, see Kees Zandvliet, *The Dutch Encounter with Asia 1600-1950* (Rijksmuseum Amsterdam: Waanders Publishers Zwolle, 2004), especially pp. 13-15.

⁵ Santosa, n. p.

Indonesian archipelago, where a Dutch settlement remained for almost three and a half centuries.⁶

In the era of exploration, Bali was not fully known to the ‘outside’ world. Due to its geographic location, Bali was considered as merely an extension of Java. Indeed, the ‘Account of Bali’ was placed as ‘Appendix K’ in Sir Thomas Stamford Raffles’ *The History of Java*.⁷ Before this book was published, references to Bali appeared only sporadically in the register of VOC.⁸ In 1817, shortly after the Dutch regained Java from the British, having learnt more about the Indonesian archipelago from *The History of Java*, they sent envoys to Bali.⁹ Soon, Bali was well known for its slave trade.¹⁰ It was also popular among the Europeans and the Americans, for its purported witchcraft and its noble savages, or to borrow Raffles’ phrase, ‘semi-noble savages’.¹¹ There were positive¹² and negative images attached to this little island. Early colonial writings pay a great

⁶ There was a short British rule, from 1811-1814, under Thomas Stamford Raffles; and during World War II, with the Netherlands under German occupation, Japan occupied the Dutch colony. On 27 December 1949 the Netherlands formally transferred sovereignty over Indonesia. For more information on Indonesian history see Ricklefs, M. C., *A History of Modern Indonesia Since c. 1200* (Palgrave: Macmillan, 2001), pp. 284-85.

⁷ Sir Thomas Stamford Raffles, *The History of Java* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1817), pp. 159-168. This two-volume book was written and published within seven months. Raffles (1781-1826) was the Lieutenant-Governor of the Indies during the British interregnum, 1811-1816. Available: <http://galenet.galegroups.com/servlet/MOME>. 28 November 2006. Raffles (1781-1826) was the chief administrator of the British interim government from 1811 to 1816.

⁸ VOC stands for Vereenigde Oost Indische Compagnie (The Dutch East India Company). Margaret J. Wiener, *Visible and Invisible Realms: Power, Magic, and Colonial Conquest in Bali* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago, 1995), p. 25. This is simply because Bali was little commercial or strategic important to the company. It was only by in mid 1830s the colonial government show interest in Bali (Wiener, p. 27). VOC is famous for its dualistic approach: trading as well as colonizing.

⁹ Wiener, p. 27.

¹⁰ In the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, the slave trade was very important to the Dutch. See Vickers, 1996, p. 7; From 1619-1830 Balinese women slaves were in great demand in Bourbon, see Miguel Covarrubias, *Island of Bali* (Singapore: Periplus, 1973), p. 12; The French came from the island of Mauritius to recruit slaves in Bali for their sugar plantations. See Ide Anak Agung Gde Agung, *Bali in the 19th Century* (Jakarta: Yayasan Obor, 1991), p. xxi and p. 4.

¹¹ Raffles, p. 431.

¹² Only two positive images of Bali emerged in the early history of European: the 16th century civilised yet exotic Bali and the 19th century enthusiasm of Raffles, Vickers, 1996, p. 78.

deal of attention to Bali's status as an 'uncivilised' and untouched world, one that is full of mysticism.¹³ The European perception of Bali was often contradictory, and it tended to think of Bali as the island of the demons; the land of the Gods; the land of artists; the land of witchcraft; the land of *goona-goona*¹⁴ (black magic); the land of women; and the land of bare breasts.¹⁵ All of these associations changed over the course of time, according to the kind of travellers who frequented Bali.

1. Textual and Visual Images of Bali

It was not only the written accounts of Bali that attracted attention; the visual representations of Bali drew attention as well. Most travellers to Bali, including both amateur and professional photographers, arrived already bearing a host of mental images they had picked up from word of mouth, literary works, films,¹⁶ music, exhibitions, and above all photographs they had seen before hand. These European image-makers saw Southeast Asia through Western eyes. It was from this perspective that they created their travel books, films, and scientific texts, which in turn stimulated the imaginations of other writers, film producers, scholars, and photographers. It should be noted that this was an age when few people, let alone women, travelled. These colonial photographs of exotic images

¹³ Certain *Kris* (traditional dagger), for example, are believed to have spirit and is very powerful during wars. In the history of Bali known as Kusamba War, Klungkung kingdom was defeated because the Dutch knew the 'secret' to weaken the Kris; see Wiener, particularly, 'The Destruction of the World', pp. 275-313. Why Klungkung was last defeated possibly because it had more magical power compared to the other kingdom. See also 'The Magic Kingdom', Wiener, pp. 44-55.

¹⁴ *Goona Goona* was also the title of the film on Bali. Within the next two months or so, in American slang at the time, *goona goona* was a term for breasts. See Cedric Belfrage, *Away from it All: An Escapologist's Notebook* (Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1940), p. 114.

¹⁵ *The Island of Bare Breasts* is the title of a French novel. Edouard de Keyser, *Llle des Seins Nus* (Paris: Les Editions de France, 1933).

¹⁶ In addition to American film producers, Bali also became an important setting for German films.

were regarded as evidence of what was happening in the distant places located at the edges of the Empire. It should also be remembered that before the thirties, almost all of the people who took these photographs were upper-class male travellers.¹⁷

The advance of photographic technology in the 1930s allowed women and men to use and carry cameras easily. This is another reason that it is necessary to include visual images and different genres of cultural production in this empirical study. By 'empirical', I mean that this research will collect data that originates in or is based on observation of texts (visual and textual) and their authors. Although this research relies on close observation of certain images, it is capable of being verified or disproved.

Some travellers or writers used the knowledge of the foreign lands that they had accumulated before travelling either to support their travel accounts or to manipulate their readers into believing that their journeys were authentic. Travellers to Bali, for instance, were equipped with some prior knowledge about the island, which they gained through different channels.¹⁸

Textually, female bodies are presented in a sexual manner considerably more frequently than are male ones. While men tend to describe women's bodies in detail, women's descriptions of women's bodies seem relatively brief. In representing Balinese women in literature, female writers/photographers (like male image-makers) make use of photographic and other literary imagery that is

¹⁷ Thirties documentary practice linked together filmmakers, photographers, and writers in a largely male network. See Marsha Bryant, *Auden and Documentary in the 1930s* (Charlottesville, London: University Press of Virginia, 1997), p. 12.

¹⁸ K'tut Tantri saw a movie; Vicki Baum saw photographs; Colin McPhee, the Canadian composer and ethnomusicologist, heard Balinese music recordings, while Helen Eva Yates came across scientific books on Bali.

already in circulation. In contrast to men, female travellers do not describe these 'bare' factors in a prurient fashion. It would be interesting to speculate on the reasons for this 'dominance' of women over men. The related question of whether or not the whole of Western representation is patriarchally determined comes to mind as well.

More women than men were posed or photographed bare-breasted or in the nude. However, not all image-makers produced stereotyped images. Like her contemporary female writers, the photographer Thilly Weissenborn's depictions of the breasts were hardly erotic.¹⁹ If men's cameras were normally employed to maintain men's prestige, Weissenborn used her representations to reconstruct her own photographs and her fellow women's. Like artists, some photographers laid the foundation for the idea that their photographs could play a critical role in crafting a new image for the Balinese. Such 'administrators cum ethnographers'²⁰ also played an important role in developing the concept of Self vs. Others.

Similarly, photographers, who often imitated poses from paintings or art, participated in the creation of an image of the natives. Sometimes these photographers followed the anthropologists' lead in their photography, showing the natives as 'primitive' or of a lower race. This unequal relationship of power

¹⁹ Margarethe Mathilde Weissenborn, was born in Kediri, East Java on 22 March 1889 and died on 28 October 1964 in Baarn, Netherlands. Her parents had a coffee plantation in Kediri. In 1892, her mother took all the children back to The Hague. Her father arrived in the following year. She returned to Indonesia in 1913 and found a job in a well-established studio owned by Kurkdjian in Surabaya. After Surabaya she moved to Garut in 1917 and in December she opened her first 'Lux' studio as part of the already established pharmacy Garoetsche Apotheek en Handelsvereniging Co. owned by Denis G. Mulder. In 1920, when Dr Mulder left for Bandung, he handed over the property to Weissenborn. She then became the manager of the firm of Foto 'Lux'. Ten years later, Lux Fotograaf Atelier NV was established (1930-1940) also in Garut. More information can be found in Thilly Weissenborn and Ernst Drissen, *Vastgelegd voor Later: Indische Foto's (1917-1942) van Thilly Weissenborn* (Amsterdam: Sijthoff, 1983).

²⁰ Ann Laura Stoler, *Race and the Education of Desire. Foucault's 'History of Sexuality' and the Colonial Order of Things* (Durham, NC: Duke University, 1995), p. 39.

between the ‘white’ photographer and the colonised subject has been discussed by, for example, Elizabeth Edwards²¹ (1992), David Bate²² (2004), and David Prochaska²³ (2004). Although this thesis focuses primarily on photographs, some images from paintings will also be discussed.

During the Dutch colonial era, texts and photographs were vital to Dutch propaganda, as well as in promoting tourism. As the Dutch wanted to expand further, with some interest from other colonial rulers (the British)²⁴, the travellers’ popular accounts and scientific accounts played a very important role in establishing their rule over the colony. Therefore, visual knowledge was an important counterpart to textual knowledge.

2. Images of Women

There are many earlier studies of images of non-European peoples. In the case of Balinese women, an array of stereotypes has already been identified, including perceptions of Balinese women as slaves, dancing girls, witches, and as exotic and erotic Balinese beauties: beauties with bare breasts. Inderpal Grewal has studied both the Indian women who travelled West and the Englishwomen who travelled East.²⁵ Other scholars focus on the representations of the ‘Orient’ by European colonial women, namely travellers, writers, and missionaries, who travelled East

²¹ Elizabeth Edwards (ed.), *Anthropology and Photography 1860-1920* (New Haven: Yale University in Association with the Royal Anthropological Institute, 1992).

²² David Bate, *Photography and Surrealism: Sexuality, Colonialism and Social Dissent* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2004).

²³ David Prochaska, *Making Algeria French: Colonialism in Bone 1870-1920* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2004).

²⁴ See again note no. 6. The British were interested in colonizing Bali as well.

²⁵ Inderpal Grewal, *Home and Harem: Nation, Gender, Empire and the Cultures of Travel* (London: Leicester University, 1996).

(Rana Kabbani,²⁶ 1989 and Lisa Lowe,²⁷ 1991). This study focuses on the visual and textual representations of Oriental women in Bali by European men and women. In contrast with Grewal, however, who studies women who travelled from the metropolis to the periphery and vice versa, this study does not specifically focus on women writers alone: it focuses more generally on journeys to and representations of Bali.

There have been some previous studies undertaken regarding images of women: those done by Susan Koppelman Cornillon²⁸ (1973), M. (Melva) Joyce Baker²⁹ (1981), Malek Alloula³⁰ (1986), Sarah Graham-Brown³¹ (1988) are among them. While the first three studies mostly deal with textual images of women, the last one focuses on photographic images of women, particularly in the Middle East. Although the local Raja in Bali practised concubinage and some early descriptions of Bali used the images of the harems, the portrayal of Balinese women in this study is not limited to the study of Balinese harems. Unlike Billie Melman's study, whose broad time-span compares English women and Middle Eastern women, my study is not limited to the portrayal of Balinese women by Dutch women but also takes into account portrayals by men of other nationalities.

In colonial societies, many Western women and men were of the same race and class as the rulers. Sara Mills' study, for example, analysed the writing of

²⁶ Rana Kabbani, *Europe's Myths of Orient: Devise and Rule* (London: MacMillan, 1986).

²⁷ Lisa Lowe, *Critical Terrains: French and British Orientalism* (Ithaca: Cornell University, 1991).

²⁸ Susan Koppelman Cornillon (ed.), *Images of Women in Fiction: Feminist Perspectives* (Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling Green University, 1973).

²⁹ M. Joyce Baker, *Images of Women in Film: The War Years, 1941-1945* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research, 1981).

³⁰ Malek Alloula, *The Colonial Harem* trans. by Myrna Godzich and Wlad Godzich (Manchester: Manchester University, 1986). See also Grewal, 1996.

³¹ Sarah Graham-Brown, *Images of Women: The Portrayal of Women in Photography of the Middle East, 1860-1950* (New York: Columbia University, 1988).

British women travellers in relation to colonialism.³² Mills' case studies include 'lady pioneers,' such as Mary Kingsley, Nina Mazuchelli, and Alexandra David-Neel, who travelled to West Africa, India and Tibet. More recent research by Susan Morgan discusses British imperialism/colonialism in terms of its relationship to different parts of Southeast Asia, which includes the non-British colonies (the Dutch-controlled colony).³³ Both Mills' and Morgan's studies on imperial writing focus on the British travel writers. Here, Morgan takes particular interest in different locations within the region of Southeast Asia, but does not deal specifically with Bali.

There are various texts that have been utilised in previous studies. First, there are travel narratives: in this category, the texts that have been studied (by scholars such as Mary Louise Pratt³⁴, for example) include travel writing involving the writings of famous feminist writers, travellers, ethnographers, missionaries, archaeologists, and biblical scholars. Secondly, postcards have been studied: Alloula investigates French photographic postcards of Algerian women in her analysis of postcards in the colonial era.³⁵ Anandi Ramamurthy, meanwhile, makes use of advertisements.³⁶ While Cornillon (1973) investigates fiction, Baker (1981) studies film in relation to feminism. Thus, in addition to my exploration of the narrative of travel, I will focus in this study on cultural products that are not strictly

³² Sara Mills, *Discourses of Difference: Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991).

³³ Susan Morgan, *Place Matters: Gendered Geography in Victorian Women's Travel Books about Southeast Asia* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University, 1996).

³⁴ Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992).

³⁵ See note no. 30.

³⁶ Anandi Ramamurthy, 'Constructions of Illusion: Photography and Commodity Culture', in *Photography: A Critical Introduction*, ed. by Liz Wells (London: Routledge, 1997), pp. 151-98.

seen as travel narratives, such as drawings, paintings, colonial/travel photographs, museum/exhibition guidebooks, and advertisements regarding colonial Bali.

This use of different kinds of texts allows us to investigate the image-makers' imagination, intentions, and experiences as they are represented in many different forms. The selected miscellaneous texts are used, firstly, to illustrate how complex the making of the images is; secondly, they are used to investigate how image-making comes about. Does it come first from imagination alone?

The different nationalities of the women writers represented here enable us to study whether their vision of the Orient was, in addition to gender and class, shaped also by nationality or by race. I will argue that these images were constructed by men, and will also supply an argument as to how the travelling colonists and the European public in general succeeded in holding on to the myth for as long as they did. Therefore, although the texts and the image makers discussed in this research are primarily drawn from the 1930s, a range of earlier texts will also be utilized. In order to place this study in the proper context and evaluate the patriarchal challenges faced by women of that day, it is impossible not to write about men.

3. Balinese Beauty

Balinese women were famous for their beauty.³⁷ From the era of explorations, travel and tourism, representations of the Balinese women changed according to the particular label put on the island. Therefore, these very images of Balinese

³⁷ Michel Picard, *Bali: Cultural Tourism and Touristic Culture*, trans. by Diana Darling (Singapore: Archipelago, 1996), p. 24. (First published in French as *Bali: Tourisme Culturel et Culture Touristique*, Editions L'Harmattan, Paris, 1992), p. 27; Covarrubias, 1973, p. 12; Yates, 1933, p. 77.

women are central to my investigation. Particular attention is devoted to the image of the bare breasts – the images of nude bathers and dancing girls – which is different from the images of ‘women with sagging breasts of medieval and Renaissance accounts’³⁸ or the Jaipur’s dancing girls.³⁹ Analysis of these images must also relate to depictions of bathing habits and clothing, which are part of the construction of femininity and ideal beauty.

Dutch propaganda used the theme of clothing to promote the native’s need for ‘civilization’. After the Dutch occupation of Buleleng in 1848,⁴⁰ according to Miguel Covarrubias, there was a law passed that was intended to make Balinese women wear blouses. Covarrubias did not state that it was the Balinese who were seductive, nor did he believe that they needed to be ‘civilised’ via clothing. Michel Picard observed that it was not the missionaries but the average Dutch who required Balinese women to cover their breasts. In other words, this stricture was applied in order to protect the morals of Dutch men.⁴¹

Both Covarrubias and Picard were talking about the Dutch colonial concern regarding the morale of their fellow Dutch in Bali. This breast-covering issue is, in fact, another form of Dutch propaganda. In suggesting that Balinese women did not wear enough clothing, the Dutch were suggesting that the local people were in need of civilization. Of course, there were other factors which

³⁸ Thomas, p. 22.

³⁹ See also note no. 365, p. 114.

⁴⁰ Bali consists of several kingdoms: Badung, Gianyar, Bangli, Klungkung, Karangasem, Buleleng, Mengwi, Tabanan and Jembara. In present days, they become the names of eight regencies. (A ninth kingdom, Mengwi, existed until the end of the 19th century.) Mengwi was defeated by the Sasak or Islamic inhabitants of Lombok. However, the Dutch regards this civil war to justify their conduct and then conquered Lombok in 1891. Karangasem and Gianyar both ceded following the Mengwi incident. Tabanan and Badung were defeated in 1906 (known as *puputan*) leaving the prestigious Klungkung to stay until the next *puputan* in 1908; Alfons Van der Kraan, *Bali at War: A History of the Dutch-Balinese Conflict of 1846-1849* (Clayton: Monash University, Centre of Southeast Asian Studies, 1995).

⁴¹ Picard, 1996, p. 41.

contributed to the Dutch suppression of the Dutch East Indies (now Indonesia). However, since these hidden agendas were not made public, they were instead covered up under the guise of “civilising” Bali. The Dutch were apt to use the Darwinian theory of evolution in order to position themselves as having better ‘morals’ and a higher status than the Balinese.

In reality, the motivations of this policy were political, economic, religious, and cultural. The Dutch used images of bare breasts to attract more tourists to Bali. A set of *See Bali* pamphlets circulated in 1939 still promoted the breasts of Bali. In these adverts, Balinese women were not depicted as ‘Bali savages’.⁴² Several, brochures, and tourism posters featured illustrations depicting topless women bearing offerings on their heads.⁴³ The aim of the Dutch colonists is propaganda, or as Adrian Vickers said ‘marketing ploys’.⁴⁴ In short, the breasts of Balinese women continued to constitute a major attraction for the island during that time.

These images of bare breasts are also defined, photographed, and recorded in scholarly texts. Women are frequently sat or posed with ‘exotic’ props such as earthen vessels or water carriers. These poses could be dated back to early anthropological photographs. Men were rarely depicted carrying water; in the case

⁴² Adrian Vickers, *Bali: A Paradise Created* (Singapore: Periplus Editions, 1996), p. 2. Some of these brochures were published by the KPM (*Koninklijk Paketvaart Maatschappij* = The Royal Packet Navigation Company) for its use in the shipping company. From 1924, the KPM organized a weekly steamship service from Batavia (Jakarta), Surabaya and Makasar to Buleleng, Bali. Many men, such as Covarrubias, who came to Bali expressed how they were curious to see the Balinese beauty with their bare breasts. Belfrage, p. 112: ‘(...) but there was something else which the shipping company did not have to express in print. Their brochure’s cover-picture of a native girl in two colours, brown and red, told the story better than words. A feature of Bali’s lure that could not be lightly dismissed was nothing more nor less than the human mammary gland.’

⁴³ These adverts were painted by a Dutch painter Willem G. Hofker who lived in Bali from 1938-1944.

⁴⁴ Adrian Vickers, ‘Colonial Era: Conquests and Dutch Colonial Rule’, in *Bali: Periplus Travel Guide*, ed. by Eric Oey (Singapore: Periplus, 1994), 30-33 (p. 32).

of Bali, they were often pictured/described with their precious fighting cocks, ready for gambling (cockfighting).⁴⁵

These were the proper settings for the lithe brown-skinned women returning from market with baskets of fruit on their heads and for the men in loincloths sitting in groups around the baskets in which they kept their favourite fighting cocks. Energetic women thresh rice or bathe quite unconcerned in the ditch by the roadside, and serious naked children play in the middle of the street with a cricket they have just captured.⁴⁶

And the commonest sight on the roads in Bali in the afternoon is a man holding his rooster in his arms and caressing it, or carrying it along in the open-work bamboo cloche-shaped basket in which the birds are habitually kept.⁴⁷

In describing a group of people – both men and women – it is always women who are described at length, and the visual focus is on the heads and the breasts:

I stood there and watched them coming, a long long never-ending line, men, women, and children, swinging up the slope. The women's heads were piled high with offerings, and they swung along with erect, easy grace. Their arms were swinging also. The rain poured down, and glistened on their breasts.⁴⁸

At least there is one man who shows interests in men's 'nakedness',⁴⁹:

The Balinese are a very hermaphroditic race; both sexes wear their hair long, and ornament it with the scarlet hibiscus; there is little difference in height between them; both have fairly broad shoulders and relatively narrow hips, so that from a back view it is very difficult to distinguish; the breast muscles of many of the men are so developed that even when they are seen from the front confusion is justifiable.⁵⁰

⁴⁵ Geoffrey Gorer, *Bali and Angkor: A 1930s Pleasure Trip Looking at Life and Death* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1987), pp. 64-5. See also Alexander King's illustrations in Powell's *The Last Paradise*.

⁴⁶ Covarrubias, 1973, p. xx.

⁴⁷ Gorer, 1987, p. 62.

⁴⁸ Hickman Powell, *The Last Paradise* (Singapore: Oxford University, 1985). First published in 1930 by Jonathan Cape and Harrison Smith, New York. First issued in Oxford Asia Paperbacks 1982, p. 162.

⁴⁹ Shirley Foster observed that 'the sexual attractiveness of foreign men was hardly ever admitted to'. See Shirley Foster, *Across New Worlds: Nineteenth-Century Women Travellers and Their Writings* (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1990), p. 19.

⁵⁰ Gorer, 1987, p. 61.

4. The 1930s Travel Writing

This project deals with foreigners' travel writings and visual images of Bali before and after the island became an integral part of the Dutch colony. However, its main focus is on the Western travelling writers who visited Bali in the 1930s. The term "travel writing", for the purposes of this research, refers broadly to the writings of travelling writers that resulted from their travel to 'foreign' places; such writings include novels, autobiography, travel books, and academic/scientific writings such as ethnography and anthropology. The 1930s were chosen for particular scrutiny because it was in this period that Bali became witness to what James Clifford describes as 'travelling cultures'. Likewise, this was also the period in which Bali was inundated with the rich, the famous, and the intellectual from other countries.⁵¹

Some of these visitors received a letter of introduction⁵² from earlier visitors, from expatriates, or from long-term residents such as Walter Spies. Others came to know one other while there.⁵³ The arrival of artists, scholars, and celebrities transformed Bali into a colonial metropolis. Bali was a site of cross-

⁵¹ Laura May Corrigan (wife of James William Corrigan, president of the Cleveland Steel Company) flew to Batavia and chartered a ship just for themselves. Other rich visitors include Charlie Chaplin, who read of Walter Spies from Covarrubias' book, Cole Porter, H. G. Wells, Barbara Hutton, Clemenceau and Noel Coward. The Duke and Duchess of Sutherland, and Leopold Stokowski were among the visitors to Bali (Shavit, p. 89). Some of these visitors were sent by mutual friends and some got to know Spies, the longest residence of Bali, through his works displayed in the salons of New York, Paris and Berlin. For more detailed information on how Spies became the source of these European travellers see Vickers, 1996, p. 120.

⁵² Vickers, 1996, p. 115. The Covarrubias had a letter of introduction to Spies from André Roosevelt and were introduced via the KPM's tourist agent Bob Morzer Bruyns. In January, 1929, the Dutch artist Rudolf Bonnet came to Spies with a letter of introduction from Jaap Kunst, see Hans Rhodius and John Darling, *Walter Spies and Balinese Art* (Amsterdam: Tropical Museum, 1980), p. 35.

⁵³ In 29 April 1936, Mead wrote this in her journal: 'We had written Walter [Walter Spies] that we were coming – or I had written him and Gregory [Bateson] had written Beryl de Zoete (an English woman who is writing a book on Balinese dancing with Walter)', Margaret Mead, *Letters from the Field 1925-1975* (New York: Perennial, 2001), p. 170. (First Harper Colophon Books edition published 1979.)

cultural exchange and became an extension of the salons of Paris, Berlin and New York. (Bali became ‘The Island of the world’: the Bali bombs⁵⁴ and the drug case of Michelle Leslie⁵⁵ and Ronald Ramsay⁵⁶ brought Bali international attention. Despite these negative images, Bali was still selected as the world’s favourite tourist island in 2005).⁵⁷

Why colonial Bali? Not only did the 1930s, as Clifford suggests, witness the development of a ‘travelling culture’, it witnessed an explosion in the numbers of travelling colonists as well. This is simply because the travellers used the vehicle of travel writing to advance specific political arguments. Travel and politics, as per Bernard Schweizer, are inseparable.⁵⁸ I am not interested in questioning the travellers’ attitude towards colonialism per se. Rather, I merely want to demonstrate how literary and visual images modify and shape writers’ attitude towards colonialism; how these travelling colonists employ travel writing self-consciously as a platform for voicing their radical political ideas; and how the colonists’ past experiences are shaped by their respective ideological positions.

Travel writing derives from similar books and from other writings. The writers’ colonial contacts and preconceptions about the political situations in the colonies may influence their ‘political’ writings. Geoffrey Gorer (1905-1985), for

⁵⁴ The first Bali bomb was on 12 October 2002 and the second was on 4 Oct 2005.

⁵⁵ Michelle Leslie is an Australian model who was caught in Bali in 12 August 2005 for the possession of ecstasy. She is best known as a model for Antz Pants and Crystelle lingerie.

⁵⁶ Ronald Ramsay is Gordon Ramsay’s younger brother who was caught in Bali having possessed heroin and was sentenced to 10 months in prison.

⁵⁷ Bali was chosen, for the third consecutive year, as the best tourist destination by *Travel and Leisure World* magazine based in New York. ‘Bali again named world’s favourite tourist island.’ *The Jakarta Post* 11 July 2005. Online. Available:

<http://www.thejakartapost.com/misc/PrinterFriendly.asp>. 11 July 2005.

⁵⁸ Bernard Schweizer, *Radicals on the Road: The Politics of English Travel Writing in the 1930s* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 2001), p. 4.

example, echoed some racial statements used in George Orwell's *Burmese Days*⁵⁹, making use of terms like 'whitish-pink' and 'brownish-yellow' skins.⁶⁰ The travelling writers discussed in this thesis were indeed 'on the road', and they had been influenced by some pictorial and literary readings that had come before them. However, my query is not as to the validity of their travels; it does not focus on the product, but on the process – how the writers' preconceptions shaped their opinions or political inclinations.

Why travel to and write about Bali? Many of these 1930s travellers, writers, and scientists, such as Margaret Mead and Colin McPhee,⁶¹ became famous because of their works about Bali. The destinations chosen by travellers, to some extent, are indicative of their home-grown ideologies, rather than reflecting a disinterested approach to foreign politics. Joseph Conrad went to Africa, Orwell to Burma, Gorer to Angkor and Bali, and Vicki Baum to Bali, Malaya, Java, Siam, and French Indo-China. While Orwell worked for the Raj, Gorer did not. Gorer, for example, positions himself and the Dutch (the colonial) at the same level as 'the rich and genteel Javanese,'⁶² rather than that of the classless Sumatran. Gorer's account was developed from different readings and images: 'the Cambodian dancers at the Colonial Exhibition in Paris,'⁶³ 'A film was shown in London in the

⁵⁹ George Orwell, *Burmese Days* (London: Secker & Warburg, 1961), first published by Harper Bros New York, 1934. This is Orwell's first novel.

⁶⁰ See Gorer, 1987, p. 22.

⁶¹ Colin McPhee was a Canadian turned American composer and became famous internationally. His collection of photographs, field notes, papers and correspondence and recordings of Balinese music, are lodged at UCLA Ethnomusicology Archive (McPhee, p. 10). McPhee and his wife Jane Belo had taken a lot of photographs for their own research long before Mead and Gregory Bateson came to Bali. Although the McPhees were later divorced, it was Belo who continued to support him financially. However, McPhee hardly mentioned this. For further information on McPhee, see his biography by Carol J. Oja, *Colin McPhee: Composer in Two Worlds* (Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1990).

⁶² Gorer, 1987, p. 19.

⁶³ *ibid.*, p. 155.

summer of 1935, called *Beyond Shanghai*.⁶⁴ The author (Gorer) was also aware of Somerset Maugham's texts about the plantation in Malaya; Gorer says, 'All that is necessary to say about the planters has already been said by Mr. Somerset Maugham ...'⁶⁵ Gorer also read Orwell's first novel, *Burmese Days* (1934).⁶⁶ Thus, Orwell may have shaped Gorer's preconception of Burma and the Burmese. Certainly, Gorer's borrowing from Orwell is obvious. My point, however, is not to speculate on how much Gorer borrowed from Orwell, but rather to examine how Gorer's attitude towards colonialism depended on the identity of the colonisers and the location of the colonies. In this thesis, I include a novel by Vicki Baum. By using Baum's historical novel, I wish to investigate whether women's political travelling views have a lot in common with those of their male contemporaries, and whether the colonial location matters.

Is image-making a construct of the image makers alone, or is it transformed according to the historical context? Paul Fussell claims that '[b]efore tourism there was travel, and before travel there was exploration. Each is roughly assignable to its own age in modern history: exploration belongs to the Renaissance, travel to the bourgeois age and tourism to our proletarian moment.'⁶⁷ However, due to the nature and the geographical situation of Bali and the Anglo-

⁶⁴ *ibid.*, p. 173.

⁶⁵ Although Gorer admitted that 'I am not in a position to say anything about the Colonial policies pursued in these countries' (p. 12), his attitude towards the Dutch and the French can be read on pp. 12-20.

⁶⁶ On page pp. 18-9, Gorer wrote: 'Besides the essential falsity of your position – so admirably analysed by Orwell in his *Burmese Days* – which poisons every activity there is the horror of never being able for a moment to put on anonymity, to sink into the crowd'.

⁶⁷ Paul Fussell, *Abroad: British Literary Travelling Between the Wars* (New York: Oxford University, 1980), p. 38.

Dutch rivalry, not to mention the interest of the Asiatic (Japanese) colonists.⁶⁸ the image-making process regarding this area has not always been produced in the same sequence. Tourism may bring travel, and travel may incite exploration. This can be explained by focusing the research on the ‘colonial period’ and the web of imperial power relations.

5. The ‘White’ Man’s Prestige, Gender Loathing, and Racial Loathing⁶⁹

It is difficult to see McPhee the musician, or Orwell the administrator, or Gorer the traveller as the mouthpiece of the colonisers. Regardless of McPhee’s inclination towards the Dutch colonial, the following incident shows how he was taught to ‘maintain the dignity of the white race’:

For in this little gesture anything apparently was to be read, possible friendliness and intimacy, and even worse, equality, so abhorrent from the colonial point of view. You must keep your distance, said the manager; the correct place for a white man is in the back seat.⁷⁰

It is not only sitting rule that matters; dress code is also important in maintaining racial ‘equality.’ The Dutchman refused to meet K’tut Tantri⁷¹ in her native dress:

⁶⁸ The Japanese occupation was from 1942 to 1945. Indonesian Independence’s day is 17 August 1945. However, the former coloniser continued to recognize only 27 December 1947 as marking its independence, since this was when the Dutch formally transferred sovereignty to Indonesians. It was not until sixty years after independence that the Dutch foreign minister Bernard Bot, on behalf of the Dutch government, declared the acceptance of the independence date of the 17 August 1945. Bot was the first Dutch minister ever to attend Indonesia’s Independence Day anniversary in August 2005. ‘Netherlands Recognizes RI’s Independence Date, *The Jakarta Post*, 16 August 2005. Online. Available:

<http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20050816.%4003>. 16 August 2005.

⁶⁹ For discussion on ‘racial loathing’ see: Ranajit Guha, ‘Not at Home in Empire’, *Critical Inquiry*, 23 (1997), 482-93 (p. 489).

⁷⁰ Colin McPhee, *A House in Bali* (Singapore: Periplus, 2002), p. 16.

⁷¹ Tantri (1899 -1997) is a Scottish-born American woman who lived in Bali from 1932-1947. She was adopted by a Balinese king and was given the name K’tut Tantri (the fourth born). She is the first person who holds Indonesian passport and K’tut Tantri, not Muriel Stuart Walker, is the name printed in it. Her autobiography *Revolt in Paradise* (1960) has been translated into a dozen of languages, including Indonesian in 1965.

‘I refuse to meet any white woman in a sarong! This is *koerang hormat!*’ The phrase means *lèse-majesté* – disrespect to the representative of the Dutch Queen.⁷²

Do clothes make a man, or a woman? How would the ‘white’ women react to Tantri? Wearing her native dress, Tantri ‘came face to face with a party of European women, carefully groomed, expensively dressed’.⁷³ Those women stared at Tantri, ‘at first in mere curiosity and then in swiftly rising contempt’.⁷⁴ Their reactions are: ‘Disgraceful!’ ‘Shocking – horrible ----’ ‘A white woman in native dress ---’ ‘Consorting on the same level as ----.’⁷⁵ Drawing on these two examples, I seek to investigate whether clothing, and the photographed subjects’ position (sitting or standing) in photographs, are determinants of social class. I also wish to explore whether maintenance of the ‘White’ man’s prestige is an inheritance of colonialism.

McPhee’s and Tantri’s texts were written and set during the colonial period. Although both of them lived in this setting, they could distance themselves from colonialism. In discussing colonial texts such as those set in Southeast Asia, an author like J. M. Gullick may implicitly express negative attitudes toward the colonised or the travellers. In one of his chapters in his anthology, Gullick grouped some of the women travellers to Southeast Asia under the label ‘Women Looking for Trouble’.⁷⁶ The question to be posed here is – how much influence do colonial narratives have on present readers? (In Chapter 5, I discuss how, in

⁷² K’tut Tantri, *Revolt in Paradise* (London: William Heinemann, 1960), p. 64.

⁷³ Tantri, 1960, p. 42.

⁷⁴ *ibid.*

⁷⁵ *ibid.*

⁷⁶ J. M. Gullick, *Adventures and Encounters: Europeans in South-East Asia* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1995), pp. 145-180. These selections include Emily Innes’ ‘A Narrow Escape from Death’; Isabella Bird’s ‘A Ramble through Saigon’; Anna Forbes’ ‘Alone on Timor with Malaria’ and Ethel Hume’s ‘Stranded in Semenyih’.

writing about colonial photographs, the authors are influenced by the words or texts surrounding them.)

6. Balinese Identity

Writing about ‘Others’ is very complex. In a sense, it asks questions of social and cultural ideas that are different from the observer’s. As an insider-outsider⁷⁷, my origin, background, and convictions influence how I see Bali. It is important, therefore, to devote a section to Balinese Identity as seen through my insider-outsider connection.

Indonesia is officially a republic, whose sovereignty is vested in the people to be exercised by an elected People’s Consultative Assembly. As a republic, Indonesia is a secular state and has an elected parliament and president. Although it has the highest population of Muslims in the world, Indonesia is not an Islamic state. However, as the dominant religion (90%), Islam politically dictates what is proper and what is not socially acceptable. Thus, Indonesia has very strict laws about showing any bare skin. In 1999, at the urging of several radical Muslim organizations, the government attempted to restrict certain kinds of artistic expression, especially in relation to sexuality; therefore, an anti-pornography bill was proposed. The draft, which consists of 11 chapters and 93 sections, was expected to be passed in 2001. However, because of tremendous controversy, it was not made law until recently. The content of the bill partly regulates how people, particularly women, should wear clothing and cover their bodies.

⁷⁷ The term insider-outsider was first introduced by James Clifford (1997). See James Clifford’s *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, 1997).

As the world's largest archipelago, Indonesia consists of more than 17,000 islands. There are five major islands – namely, Java, Sumatra, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, and Irian Jaya. Bali is the ‘paradise island.’ Originally, each island, or even each part of an island, represented a certain religion. Among those islands, Hinduism is predominantly practised by the population of Bali. The majority of Balinese, unless they convert, are Hindu. If the anti-pornography bill becomes law, it will have a major impact on Balinese society. The Balinese have threatened to separate themselves from Indonesia if the bill is passed. In the past, most of Balinese women did not cover their breasts. At present, some Balinese women still retain this tradition. As it is a popular tourist destination and known for its beautiful beaches, it is hardly possible to require tourists to cover themselves and refrain from wearing bikinis. I fear that the bill, if implemented, will bring greater oppression to women regardless of their ethnicity and religious background. The anti-pornography law infringes on women’s rights.

As a woman, I have a natural interest in women’s rights, and this is linked to my long-standing concern for the rights of the minorities, such as women educators, based on my own principles but also my experience as a member of a minority. As Batak, I was born into a society that is patriarchal, organised in clans called *marga*. My *marga* is Sitompul. The majority of North Sumatrans, especially Batak Toba, belong to religious minority of Christians. Christianity was first introduced in Sumatra by a Lutheran German missionary, Ludwig Ingwer Nommensen, in the 19th century.

My being minority doubled up because I was born and grew up in Pontianak, Kalimantan. I was not considered a ‘native’ Pontianak. even though I

spent my childhood and adolescence also in Pontianak. After finishing my first degree in Jakarta, I returned to my 'hometown' and became an academic. My Western education both in the US and in the UK proceeded unlike that of many people of my class, ethnic, and generation. To some extent, my views about women covering up, perhaps, are a result of this specific religious background and upbringing.

A glimpse of early postcards from 1893 to the early 1930s shows Batak women who are fully clothed, compared to Balinese women, whose breasts are bare. During those years, Sumatra had already been in contact with various civilizations for over a thousand years. Contact with India and Middle East cultures was possible because of Sumatra's westernmost position of the Indonesian archipelago. At that time, Sumatra was the entrance point for traders from India and the Middle East.⁷⁸ I believe that the draft bill is a betrayal of Indonesian identity, which is plural, hybrid, and rich.

Compared to other islands in Indonesia, Bali could be considered the island that has been influenced most by the West; it receives the highest number of Western tourists. Bali and Balinese women are considered to be open to foreign influence. In modern times, they do not necessarily have to practise the old tradition that women of a higher caste cannot marry men of a lower class. With its predominantly Hindu population, Bali shows its willingness to accept and tolerate outside influences and changes. When there was a controversy over an Indonesian edition of *Playboy* magazine, Velvet Silver Media, the publisher, decided to move its office from Jakarta to Bali. One of the protests came from Front Pembela Islam

⁷⁸ Leo Haks and Steven Wachlin, *Indonesia: 500 Early Postcards* (Singapore: Archipelago Press, 2004, p. 29

(FPI) or Islamic Defenders Front. Muhammad Alawi Usman, the spokesperson, said that *Playboy's* contents 'degrade women.'⁷⁹

My own background influences the way I view images of Balinese women with uncovered breasts. Batak women do cover their breasts. Like most moderns in the West, I was brought up to believe that women have a right to their own sexuality. It is their right to have the power to decide how much bare skin they want to show and this has nothing to do with degrading women. Therefore, the questions of morality should be based on what and whom one believes and not decided by the dominant religion. From a Balinese viewpoint, the draft bill is not justifiable because it goes against their customs and traditions, which should be respected, even though they may be misused by non-Balinese people. Apparently, the draft bill intends to construct or reconstruct women so that their representation corresponds to the government ideology of 'national identity.' Indonesia is a multicultural society with different social norms and religious values. Since national identity is normally associated with certain customs or habits, it is impossible to have a 'uniform identity'.

The Batak and Balinese certainly have their own definition as to what degrades women. We have a different concept and interpretation of what could be categorised as sensual or pornographic. My perception or appreciation of an image depends also upon my way of seeing. As a Christian Batak, I do not have to wear a headscarf. From this perspective, the regulations will massively curtail individuals' rights and particularly those of women. Regarding pornography, Indonesia's laws are unclear. In an Indonesian context, the distinction between art

⁷⁹ 'Playboy's Indonesia Edition Enrages - and Disappoints' Online. Available <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/asia/article703003.ece>. 7 April 2006.

and pornography is apparently vague. In 2004, Lembaga Sensor Film (LSF), the Indonesian film censorship institution, banned *Buruan Cium Gue* (Kiss Me Quick) simply because there is a kissing scene in the movie. However, there are many ‘obscene’ reliefs and statues that can be found on Javanese-Hindu temples, such as Candi Sukuh, in which there is a relief depiction of male and female genitals, symbolizing sexual intercourse, and a headless statue of a male figure holding his erect penis.

One of the postcards produced by H. Buning in 1898 was a statue of Mendut’s Buddha. The naked Buddha was sent to Rotterdam with a New Year’s greeting. The local postal officers then enveloped the postcard, considering it too ‘piquant’, and required the receiver to pay for the surcharge.⁸⁰ In the ‘30s, the Dutch colonial authorities used their power to regulate how Balinese women dress, demanding that they cover their breasts. Observing this from the United Kingdom, I can see how and why those who are in power control and dictate Indonesian women’s behaviour. Women’s bodies should not be used to represent Indonesian national identity and traditions, and the government should not regulate which parts of the bodies must be covered or must not be exposed. Authorities thereby define what religious practices are relevant to or conflict with culture and tradition – and what is and what is not Indonesia. However, women also have power – power to buy mini skirts or expensive tank tops. My socio-cultural background influences the way I think and write. I do not know Bali intimately, although I have been there as a visitor. My knowledge of it comes from representations of various kinds.

⁸⁰ Haks and Wachlin, p. 20.

My roots as a non-Balinese woman and my Western education, combined with the ‘Oriental’ culture, have shaped my representation and interpretation of Bali. My insider-outsider connection means that I cannot fully distance myself from my Oriental origin as an Indonesian. Following Clifford, “I do not accept that anyone is permanently fixed by his or her “identity”; but neither can one shed specific structures of race and culture, class and caste, gender and sexuality, environment and history”.⁸¹

7. Methodology

In this thesis, I do not organize the texts in a straightforward, year-by-year chronology, nor do I analyse each text separately by individual author in terms of the order of their comings or timings in Bali. In part, this is simply because many of the writers made repeated trips to Bali; additionally, not all of them wrote after the act of travel, and those who wrote for a living wrote with more than one book in mind. As well, it is because I need to make a clear distinction between both texts and authors, and between photographers and their photographs.

Visual anthropology, ethnography, cultural studies, photographic studies, colonial studies, and feminist studies are the key disciplines to which I shall refer. The interlinking of feminist studies, colonial studies, and anthropological approaches is particularly pertinent to the textual and visual representations of Balinese women. In addition, this research seeks to question whether there are gendered attitudes to colonialism. The ambiguity of visual images and the subjectivity of their viewers are also central concerns of my study.

⁸¹ Clifford, 1997, p. 12.

In the first part of this thesis, which is devoted to images of Balinese women, my goal is to show the interrelation of visual and textual images. I will thus examine the predominant image of Bali that was distributed to promote tourism in the 1930s, which involved the depiction of bare breasts. I will then trace these images back to literary representations and to colonial and anthropological photography, as well as paintings. There are three chapters in this first part, namely – Chapter 1: Preconceptions: Travel and Literature in the 1930s Bali; Chapter 2: Printed Images of Balinese Women and their Image Makers; and Chapter 3: Travelling Colonists: Pro- and Anti-Colonial Attitudes.

In the second part, I examine the Western scientific travel accounts of the ‘text providers’⁸², focusing on Margaret Mead and Beryl de Zoete. This of course involves addressing the contentious questions of the collusion between anthropology and colonialism and women’s attitudes towards colonialism. Part Two is then divided into two chapters – Chapter 4: Colonial Photography and Anthropology in Bali; and Chapter 5: Displays as Texts and Image Making.

Chapter 1 situates the 1930s representations of Bali within the context of Dutch colonialism. Colonial travel writers viewed Bali through a romantic lens, a fact which is emphasized by the titles of the books written in this period. The main text examined in this chapter is *Bali: Enchanted Isle*⁸³, which was published in 1933 by a female travel writer. The fact that this writer was female is notable; since most of the first visitors to Bali were men, they also associated Bali with its beautiful women and centred their descriptions of them around the women’s bare breasts. Therefore, most of the representations of Balinese beauty almost always

⁸² I use this term as opposed to the provider of lucid prose used by Vickers, 1998, p. 112.

⁸³ Helen Eva Yates, *Bali, Enchanted Isle – A Travel Book* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1933).

subject women to voyeurism. This chapter includes close readings of travel books by these men, such as *Bali: The Last Paradise*⁸⁴ and *The Island of Bali*. The inclusion of men's narratives is designed to enable the investigation of whether or not, in representing the images of women, women's writings on Balinese women are similar to those of men. Texts from an earlier period, such as *Java: The Garden of the East* (1899), are also studied in order to evaluate whether or not there were repeated motifs in the representations of Balinese women. Moreover, Chapter 1 seeks to investigate whether the writers' pre-conceptions of Bali influenced their writings and how much textual images and visual scenes the writers had consumed prior to their travels fired the writers' imagination. Publications from after 1930, such as Christine Jordis' *Bali, Java in my Dreams* (2002), are also consulted in order to examine whether the same stereotype persists.⁸⁵

In Chapter 2, I will concentrate on visual texts. Here I will make a distinction between the photographer as illustrator and the author as photographer. The reason for making this distinction is that it enables me to investigate whether or not there is a gender bias in this profession. I will also distinguish between male and female photographers/writers. This is done in order to ascertain whether there is a significant difference between men and women's representations of Balinese women, in both the visual and textual media. The writers and photographers

⁸⁴ *The Last Paradise* was the first book in English about the island of Bali and its people and written by an American reporter. Hickman Powell came to Bali for the usual three days' tour, but Roosevelt asked him to write this book, and Powell decided to remain longer. The book was illustrated with Roosevelt's photographs and Alexander King's illustrations. King had never come to Bali. Although he never visited the island of Bali, King became a Bali enthusiast from listening to the stories of Bali told by Roosevelt (Shavit, p. 71).

⁸⁵ Christine Jordis, *Bali, Java in my Dreams*, trans. by Guido Waldman (London: The Harvill, 2002).

discussed in this chapter do not have any specific anthropological/academic background, so their texts are not purely anthropological.

Chapter 2 also examines how visual representations of Balinese indigenes have served to visualize 'racial difference.' In these pictorial representations, native dress, adornment, and bodies are studied in order to examine whether or not they are overt manifestations of cultural differences. Visual representations of Balinese women help us to understand how ideas about physical difference, cultural difference, and moral difference have intersected in the construction not only of the Other, but also in the construction of the image-makers' identity. By investigating the similarities and differences between the textual and visual images of these women, I wish to observe whether the content and style of the visual images follows what had been described textually. In addition, I need to examine whether this particular image of the female only appears in, or dominates the imagination of, a certain age (nude bathers' and the dancing girls' images). For this purpose, I will discuss photographs by female photographers such as Thilly Weissenborn, Rose Covarrubias⁸⁶, and Helen Eva Yates⁸⁷, as well as photographs, drawings and paintings by male photographers such as André Roosevelt, Alexander King, Miguel Covarrubias and Geoffrey Gorer.

⁸⁶ Rosemonde Cowen (1895-1970) was born in Los Angeles of a Mexican American mother and European American father. She was a beautiful dancer, almost always recognised and mentioned by writers who wrote about her husband Covarrubias whom she met and married in 1925. She took all the photographs in *Island of Bali*.

⁸⁷ Helen Eva Yates was the women's editor of the *China Press* in Shanghai and writer for the Dutch East Indies government in Java; Shavit, p. 71. She visited Bali and other parts of Asia in the 1900s. There appears to be no evidence that she ever produced any published work before her Bali visit. *Bali: Enchanted Isle* (1933) was followed by *The world is your Oyster: The Art of Traveling Smartly* (1939); *How to Travel for Fun* (1950); *Shopping all over the World* (1953); *Shopping and Sightseeing in Hong Kong* (1954); *Shopping in India* (1954). She dedicated the book to her good friend Lowell Jackson Thomas (1892-1981) at whose suggestion it was written. Thomas was an American writer, broadcaster and the world's foremost globetrotter that link to *Lawrence of Arabia*.

I have elected to study Covarrubias' *Island of Bali* and Gorer's *Bali and Angkor* in this chapter due to the fact that they were both amateurs. When Covarrubias travelled to Bali, he was a student of anthropology, but he himself never made anthropology his profession. However, he insisted that he did not plan to write an anthropological account. His second trip to Bali in the summer of 1933 was partly funded by the Guggenheim Foundation. On the way back from his first visit, Covarrubias and his wife stopped in Paris to see the Colonial Exposition, where Bali was the subject of a display created by the Dutch East Indies (colonial Indonesia) government.⁸⁸ Covarrubias did return to Bali for a second time. To what extent did exposure to the exhibition influence the way the travellers of the 1930s saw the Balinese? How did the exhibition shape scholars' and armchair photographers' representations of the foreign land? The answers to these questions will be discussed in Chapter 5. (Mead – Bateson and de Zoete – Spies will be discussed separately in Chapter 4.)

The inclusion of earlier publications, such as Gregor Krause's *Insel Bali*⁸⁹ (Volume 1: *Land und Volk* and volume 2: *Tänze, Tempel, Feste*), with its different editions and translations *Bali 1912*,⁹⁰ is undertaken for the purpose of observing whether there is any repetition of motifs in photographs, drawings and paintings. The inclusion of Colin McPhee's photographs is designed to enable the

⁸⁸ Information and images of the Dutch East Indies pavilions can be found in Patricia A. Morton, *Hybrid Modernities: Architecture and Representation at the 1931 Colonial Exposition, Paris* (Cambridge, MA: MIT, 2000), see especially pp. 60-2.

⁸⁹ Gregor Krause, *Insel Bali Erster Teil: Land und Volk, Zweiter Teil: Tänze, Tempel, Feste* (Hagen: Folkwang), 1920.

⁹⁰ Gregor Krause, *Bali 1912: Photographs and Reports by Gregor Krause*, trans. by W. H. Mabbett (Singapore: January Books, 1988). First published in 1920 in two volumes. The second edition is published in only one volume and co-authored with Karl With (1891-1980). The revised edition of the 1988 edition was published by Pepper (2001).

investigation of whether his sexual liaisons influenced how he represented Bali/Balinese women visually/textually.

In Chapter 3, I analyse travellers' attitudes towards colonialism. As we will see, the writers' stance helped to promote both positive and negative perceptions of Bali and its women. Their attitudes were also used both to denigrate and to idealize the colonised and the coloniser, which in return determined how the travellers represented Balinese people textually and visually. Some of these male travelling colonists, such as Gorer and Krause, were apologists for colonialism. Their work tends to be dominated by stereotyped images that were based on their previous readings and the coloniser's general sense of superiority – an attitude which may have been influenced by patriarchal imperialism.

Visual relations are never innocent; they are always determined by the cultural systems and political affiliations that travellers bring with them.⁹¹ These travellers use their works to air their political ideologies. Schweizer discusses the faith of 1930s travel writers and their political travelling. He analyses four British travel writers: George Orwell, Evelyn Waugh, Graham Greene, and Rebecca West. Schweizer maintains that 'the political utility of their books was a relatively short-lived phenomenon.'⁹² He further asserts that after the war, their works were

⁹¹ E. Ann Kaplan, *Looking for the Other: Feminism, Film and the Imperial Gaze* (New York: Routledge, 1997), p. 6.

⁹² Schweizer, p. 180.

no longer appealing.⁹³ However, this is not the case with Vicki Baum.⁹⁴ Baum (1888-1960)⁹⁵ had already become an established novelist before she spent a few weeks in Bali. To cite just one example, Baum was best known as the writer of *Menschem im Hotel* (People in a Hotel, 1929), which was made into a play and a movie (*Grand Hotel*, 1932). The filming of this novel brought Baum temporarily to Hollywood. She left Germany permanently in early 1932. She concentrated on her career as a screenwriter from 1931-1941. Starting in 1941, with *The Ship and the Shore*, Baum wrote all her books in English, thereby ensuring that her works reached a wider audience. The second factor that stimulated Baum's international career was the translation of her previous novels into English. She settled in America from 1938 onwards. After *A Tale from Bali* (1937), she published *The Ship and the Shore*⁹⁶ (1941) and followed this with *The Weeping Wood*⁹⁷ (1945), which dealt with a political situation in Malaya; her books were then well-received. As will be demonstrated, there is an inconsistency in Baum's position towards colonialism.

⁹³ *ibid.*

⁹⁴ Similar to Yates, Vicki Baum travelled to write. She had journeyed to the East and had already lived in Malaya, China and Japan. From Austria, she later moved to Hollywood where she became a screenwriter. It is here that her works reached a wider audience. Unlike Yates, she had already become popular and established when she spent a few weeks in Bali. To cite only two examples, she is best known as the writer of *Grand Hotel* (1931) which was made into a movie, and *The Weeping Wood* (1942).

⁹⁵ Her original name was Hedwig Baum. See her autobiography: *I know what I'm Worth* (London: Joseph, 1964), published in the US as *It was all Quite Different: The Memoirs of Vicki Baum* (New York: Wagnalls), 1964. For a biographical study, see Lynda J. King, *Best-Sellers by Design: Vicki Baum and the House of Ullstein* (Detroit: Wayne State University, 1988). See also *World Authors (1900-1950)* eds. Martin Seymour-Smith and Andrew C. Kimmens (New York: H.W. Wilson, 1955).

⁹⁶ Vicki Baum, *The Ship and the Shore* (London: Geoffrey Bles, 1941). She once again addressed the issue in *Ship and Shore*, initially published in English in 1950. A Dutch translation, *De Vreemde Nacht*, came out in 1965. Paul Fussell describes the travel atmosphere of the 1930s as one dominated by images of sailing and sailing away, which is also the theme of Baum's novel. See Paul Fussell, *Abroad: British Literary Traveling Between the Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980, p. 51).

⁹⁷ Vicki Baum, *The Weeping Wood* (London: Michael Joseph, 1945). *Kautschuk*, a German translation was published in the same year. In her novel, Baum criticized the exploitation of plantation workers under Dutch rule.

Prejudices sometimes stood in the way of women writers, especially those whose books became popular. This is supported by Barbara Korte, who asserts that ‘[f]or a long time, prejudices stood in the way of women travelling and writing about their travel experiences’.⁹⁸ Both Baum and Tantri suffered due to sexual prejudice, and I will discuss them in turn. Critics of *A Tale from Bali* accused Baum of being a colonial apologist; the author’s main character, a Balinese man named Pak, praised the colonials. At the same time, as a woman, Baum herself was attacked because of her involvement in politics, which according to one critic was a “man’s domain”. Tantri, however, was dubbed a ‘white’ traitor and was excluded from history. Whether or not she should have been included in histories will be dealt with later.

Just as there is debate over whether or not Joseph Conrad’s *Heart of Darkness*⁹⁹ (1899) or Orwell’s *Shooting the Elephant*¹⁰⁰ (1936) are racist and pro-colonial, so critics are still divided over Baum’s attitude towards the colonial system. Since these women’s colonial/imperial attitudes are to be contrasted with those of men, it is necessary to look at men’s texts. Gorer’s account of Bali, *Bali and Angkor: a 1930s Pleasure Trip Looking at Life and Death*,¹⁰¹ reflects how Gorer passed through two different colonies in one journey. Gorer had had previous ‘colonial’ travel experience before he went to Bali. *Africa Dances*¹⁰² was the result of his impulsive trip to part of French West Africa and the Gold Coast.

⁹⁸ Barbara Korte, *English Travel Writing from Pilgrimages to Postcolonial Explorations*, trans. by Catherine Matthias (Houndmills: MacMillan, 2000), p. 108.

⁹⁹ Joseph Conrad, *Heart of Darkness* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973). Edited with an Introduction by Paul O’Prey. Originally published in 1902.

¹⁰⁰ George Orwell, *Shooting an Elephant, and Other Essays* (London: Secker & Warburg, 1950).

¹⁰¹ In 1935 Gorer spent three months travelling to Sumatra, Java, Bali, and Indo-China, with short stops in Malay States and Siam (Gorer, 1986, p. 11). This was the same itinerary and within the same year (1935-1936), that Baum did.

¹⁰² Geoffrey Gorer, *Africa Dances* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1983). First published by Faber and Faber in 1935. Published in Penguin books in 1945.

While I include Gorer's previous writing (*Africa Dances*, 1935) in order to trace his earlier colonial experiences, I use Baum's later publications (those written after her Bali trip) to argue against women's wishful thinking towards colonialism – how people were wrong to hold these views. It is also important to observe the travellers' itineraries during those times. This is particularly important due to the fact that transport was not terribly advanced and there was not a great deal of literature on Bali that was available in English. Travellers such as Baum or Gorer, who used the same means of transport – the vessel, would probably experience different journeys from those who had their own yachts. In Chapter 3, questions such as 'who' was colonizing and 'where'¹⁰³ will be investigated.

Chapter 4 demonstrates how 1930s anthropologists' photographic representations of Bali differ from those of their predecessors, who were mostly men. The early anthropological image of Balinese women as beautiful savages was gradually replaced by an image of a person with a name and identity. After the *puputan* (1908), in representing the Balinese people visually, 'otherness' was no longer emphasised. These photographs eventually came to show the real situation of those portrayed. This chapter also explores how travellers' genders and nationalities determined how they represented the Other. The aim is to see whether early anthropologists and photographers were men, and how images of women were first created.

The scientific travel writings on Bali discussed in this thesis are *Balinese Character: A Photographic Analysis* (1942) by Margaret Mead and Gregory Bateson, and *Dance and Drama in Bali* (1938) written by Beryl de Zoete and

¹⁰³ Thomas, p. 97.

Walter Spies. For their research, Mead and Bateson were in Bali from March 1936 to March 1938 and from February to March 1939. Mead and Bateson got married while they were doing separate research in New Guinea. de Zoete stayed in Bali from 1935-1936, while Spies had already been in Bali since 1928¹⁰⁴, from the age of twenty-five. Since this research is focused primarily on the 1930s, I will not include *Trance and Dance in Bali* by Bateson and Jane Belo, which was published in 1951, the year that Evans-Pritchard published his well-known *Introduction to Social Anthropology*.¹⁰⁵ The selection of these two scientific accounts in this study is due, firstly, to the writers' use of photographs taken by (male and gay) photographers and, secondly, to the fact that they address the emergence of the use of photography in social anthropology. The advances in photographic technology at that time were significant: if the technology of photography at the time allowed men and women to use the camera without so many difficulties, the question that must be asked is whether the photographer's world is indeed patriarchal.

Although Vickers described de Zoete as 'a gifted English writer from the fringe of the Bloomsbury set', it is important to note what Vickers, the same man who criticised the 'anti-colonialist' Baum, said: 'Spies was the expert' and de

¹⁰⁴ Walter Spies (1895-1942), the son of a German diplomat, came to Java in August 1923. He worked as a pianist in a Chinese movie theatre in Bandung before being appointed as the conductor of the colonial orchestra in Jogjakarta. After a short visit to Bali in 1925, Spies decided to settle in Ubud. With the help of his friend, Cokorde Gde Agung Sukawati, he built a house at Campuan. He produced some paintings, photographs and books about Bali. He was arrested by the Dutch when the war broke out. He was on a ship with many other German prisoners who were on their way from Sumatra to Ceylon, but the ship was bombed and he died. For more information on Spies, see Rhodius and Darling's *Walter Spies and Balinese Art* (1980); Spies and de Zoete's *Dance & Drama in Bali*, 'Introduction', pp. iii-vii, p. iv; Oja, p. 71; Hitchcock and Norris' *Bali the Imaginary Museum*, pp. 3-10.

¹⁰⁵ E. E. Evans-Pritchard, *Introduction to Social Anthropology* (London: Cohen & West, 1951).

Zoete was 'definitely the junior partner, the provider of lucid prose'.¹⁰⁶ If one agrees with Baum and her critics about the 'real' author of her novel (*A Tale from Bali*), then it was Spies who was the provider of a lucid tale. Baum should not be considered as anti-colonialist. The fact that she is considered as the mouthpiece (i.e., subordinate) for Spies brings up gender-related questions. This brings us to another writing couple, Margaret Mead and Gregory Bateson, who worked together and co-wrote academic works. One provided the texts and the other photographs.¹⁰⁷

In addition, I also discuss the work of Collin McPhee, Miguel Covarrubias, and Rose Covarrubias in order to examine the fact that female spouses are regarded as incorporated wives¹⁰⁸ and to investigate how their work was being reviewed, accepted, and ignored by these mostly male, educated critics. In addition, wives are used to investigate the male egos of their spouses. Bateson implicitly claimed that his photographs could stand alone without Mead's written words; McPhee never mentioned Belo's name, despite the fact that even after their divorce she still supported McPhee financially; Covarrubias seems to value his own paintings and drawings more highly than his wife's photographs. This is again another loaded gender-related issue. I also selected these examples because the authors were the first users (as opposed to the secondary users) of the photographs, and their initial use of photographs is made with ethnographic intent. These photographs were initially designed for the purpose of publication in

¹⁰⁶ Vickers, 1989, p. 112.

¹⁰⁷ Issues surrounding the question of author-function are discussed further in Chapter 3.

¹⁰⁸ Indira Ghose, *Women Travellers in Colonial India: The power of the Female Gaze* (Delhi: Oxford University, 1999), p. 33. Hillary Callan and Shirley Anderer wrote: 'One tends to overlook the fact that she travels as an 'incorporated wife' whose life was intimately bound up in her husband's duties and not merely for pleasure as an independent lady traveller.' See Hillary Callan and Shirley Ardener (eds.), *The Incorporated Wife* (London: Croom Helm, 1984).

scholarly works on Bali. (The photographs had never before been published.) The issue of their secondary users is discussed in Chapter 5.

The selection of *Balinese Character*, rather than Mead's other works on Bali, is primarily due to the fact that it was the first anthropological work on Bali that introduced the island to the anthropological scene world-wide. Secondly, it is due to its inclusion of a separate section on photography by Bateson. Authorship is questions here as well. Mead was chosen because she is 'one of this century's best known anthropologists, who put Bali on the map of international scholarship'.¹⁰⁹ Mead and her then-husband Bateson were 'the most famous Western scholars on the island during the thirties.'¹¹⁰

The inclusion of de Zoete, who has 'less authority' in the anthropological world, and of Spies is designed to allow me to investigate whether there is a gender bias in questioning these women scientists' 'professional standard' and 'authority'. These women are included, firstly, in order to investigate whether or not women's writings were marginalised; secondly, they are included in order to argue that, when it comes to representing Bali at least, visual and written representations are not solely based on gender, as Martin H. Krieger argues that people believe they are. Krieger argued that the value difference between the visual and the verbal is rooted in the differences between sexes:

Pictures have been seen as feminine, deceptive, and irrational when compared to words, which are male, truthful, and rational. *Showing* (which is actually kinaesthetic but we take to be pictorial), however, is often seen as more effective and less subject to misinterpretation than *telling* (which is oral but we take to be verbal and written).¹¹¹

¹⁰⁹ Vickers, 1996, p. 5.

¹¹⁰ Oja, p. 79.

¹¹¹ Martin H. Krieger, 'Truth and Pictures: "Fetishes," "Goodness," and "Clarity"', in *Images of Information*, ed. by Jon Wagner (Beverly Hills: Sage, 1979), pp. 249-257 (p. 253).

My research reveals otherwise. Utilizing Mead and de Zoete as my case studies, I observed that the ‘sex’ of the visual or textual images does not depend on a fixed statement, such as “pictures are feminine and words are masculine”. On the contrary, this perception changes according to the gender of the critics and/or the observers. The question now is no longer whether women are colonisers by race, but whether they are ‘native’ or not – i.e., colonised by gender.¹¹² Although I shall devote a lot of space to consideration of European travel writing in the Dutch colonial context, I will also focus on Western academic writings within the same period, and the reception of texts by women scholars such as Mead and de Zoete in the male-dominated field (anthropology) at that time.

My approach to anthropology assumes anthropology to be the child of Western imperialism.¹¹³ Likewise, there have long been allegations of similarities or connections between colonialism and anthropology. This accusation, according to Talal Asad, is similar to an argument about professionalism, as well as questioning the authority of ‘common sense’.¹¹⁴ In Asad’s view, it is a mistake to view social anthropology in the colonial era primarily as an aid to colonial administration, or as a mere reflection of colonial ideology.¹¹⁵ By giving these illustrations, I wish to show to what extent the image-makers of the 1930s and the pre-modern users of the anthropological or colonial photographs differ in representing the Other.

¹¹² ‘Colonised by gender, but colonisers by race’ was first introduced by Ghose, see Ghose, 1999, p. 5.

¹¹³ Kathleen Gough, ‘New Proposals for Anthropologists’, *Current Anthropology*, 9 (1968), 403-7 (p. 403).

¹¹⁴ Talal Asad (ed.), *Anthropology & the Colonial Encounter* (London: Itacha, 1973), p. 16.

¹¹⁵ *ibid.*, p. 18.

In Chapter 5, I analyse how Bali was imagined in the 1931 International Colonial Exhibition in Paris, and how this ‘first impression’ by the European public shaped the changes in the representations of Bali and the ‘unchanged’ stereotype that remained. In this chapter, I will also explore the agency of these images’ display in (permanent) exhibitions and museums, particularly the museum/exhibition catalogues/books that are published in conjunction with the exhibitions.

As with all items of material culture, photographs have their own histories. They move from one exhibition to another, from walls to books, and from family albums to museum displays. Although the content of the photographs remains the same, they are, in a sense, ‘transformed’ by these transitions. Unlike the original photographers, secondary users of photographs may sometimes have to negotiate with publishers, who are usually responsible for final editorial decisions relating to those photographs. In other words, different producers and viewers of images give subjective meanings to their content and form. It is within this connection that the interplay between texts and images, which is the main focus of this research, is investigated.

8. Women as Producers of Images and Writing

My Master dissertation is a study of advertisements in *Glamour Magazine*’s first edition. It is about photography— specifically, photographs used in advertising. Several books written by scholars from India and the Middle East were obtained on the subject of the marginal.

A particularly illuminating book found to be useful in this research was *Photography: A Critical Introduction*, edited by Liz Wells. A list of travel literature on the subject of Southeast Asia was also obtained from Cornell University¹¹⁶, and contained a list of books on Indonesia and the East Indies. *Bali: A Paradise Created* by Adrian Vickers and *Bali: Cultural Tourism and Touristic Culture* by Michel Picard contained useful visual images.

This thesis initially consisted of research on two separate subjects: i) pictorial images and scholarly writing and ii) travel writing. Due to limited access to original photos, the subject of photography was initially a difficult subject to research. However, this issue was resolved when copies of exhibition catalogues were obtained. These included *Toward Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed* (borrowed from the University of Warwick's interlibrary loan) and *Toekang Potret: 100 Years of Photography in the Dutch Indies 1839-1939*.

Direct access to original photographs was also obtained through the use of the website <http://www.kitlv.nl/>. This is the website of Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal- Land- en Volkenkunde (the Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies), which was founded in 1851.

The colonial period was selected as the initial framework for this thesis and represents a relatively wide framework, as representative examples include works of fiction and autobiography. However, those texts and genres were not the only types to be produced during that historical period. To narrow the scope of this thesis, the period of 1900 – 1950 was selected. To this end, several works relevant to that era were studied, including Janet Montefiore's *Men and Women*

¹¹⁶ Online. Available: <http://www.library.cornell.edu/Asia/guides/travel.html> 04/07/2005

Writers of the 1930s: The Dangerous Flood of History, Bernard Schweizer's *Radicals on the Road: The Politics of English Travel Writing in the 1930s*, and Geoffrey Gorer's *Bali and Angkor: A 1930s Pleasure Trip Looking at Life and Death*. It was at this stage that the 1930s was selected as the focal point of this research. The textual images of Balinese women are taken from various genres such as travel writing, anthropological writing, novels, and autobiography. As with visual representations, this textual representation is merely an interpretation of the viewers.

As mentioned earlier, this thesis presents an empirical study of a specific location and phenomenon. It is a close observation of Bali, its people, and its culture. As it is of an interdisciplinary nature, this study is conducted in the context of a number of theoretical debates on subjects such as gender studies, colonial/postcolonial studies, and visual studies. The present study will shed light upon and possibly question some existing assumptions of the theoretical debates surrounding the issues of Orientalism, gender, nationalism, travel writing, and photography, using as examples the writings of scholars such as Edward Said, Susan Sontag, Mary Louis Pratt, and Benedict Anderson.

Said's *Orientalism* is a study of how North Africa and the Middle East were represented by the Western colonial powers of Britain and France in the late nineteenth and early 20th centuries. According to Said, Westerners' views on the Orient are based on images in the popular imagination, and are gained from travel writing, colonial gaze, and academic Oriental studies. In Said's "Orientalism," women are portrayed as having been marginal to the process of colonization. Said's gender-blindness with respect to the centrality of sexuality and gender in

Orientalist discourse is obvious. Said is aware of this subject, but he does not seriously consider these facts. Therefore, it is difficult to say that he is “gender-blind.” In his claim that Orientalism was exclusively male, Said underestimated the centrality of gender issues.

Orientalism itself, furthermore, was an exclusively male province; like so many professional guilds during the modern period, it viewed itself and its subject matter with sexist blinders.¹¹⁷

Feminist scholars such as Billie Melman and Reina Lewis have criticized Said for being gender-blind in presenting his views on Orientalism. Since Said did not analyse women’s writing in Orientalism, they have attempted to undermine Said’s view by documenting the ways in which women have participated historically in the construction of Orientalism. For many male colonisers, Oriental women were considered as the cause of their moral degeneracy. In addition to criticisms linked to gender bias, it has been claimed that Said’s Orientalism does not give due consideration to colonised resistance, which could apply to both men and women.

As a Western fantasy, Orientalism was constructed and possibly originated within the imagination of Westerners. However, it has subsequently been inscribed in more concrete realities. According to Said, the Oriental community is imagined through certain discourses, texts, and images. This fantasy has shaped representations of the Orient from the beginning into the present.

Said’s concept of “imaginative geography” is implicated in the way that “the West” imagines “the East.” He argues:

A group of people living on a few acres of land will set up boundaries between their land and its immediate surroundings and the territory beyond, which they call “the land of the barbarians.” In other words, this universal practice of designating in one’s mind a familiar space which is

¹¹⁷ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin, 2003), p. 207.

“ours” and an unfamiliar space beyond “ours” which is “theirs” is a way of making geographical distinctions that can be entirely arbitrary. I use the word “arbitrary” here because imaginative geography of the “our land-barbarian land” variety does not require that the barbarians acknowledge the distinction.¹¹⁸

Benedict Anderson’s *Imagined Communities* presents an argument that is similar to Said’s description of imagined geographies. These communities, according to Anderson, were bound together by religion, region, and language, which provided fellow citizens a sense of belonging with respect to a particular nation. As a unified body of individuals, this nationalistic community is merely imagined:

It is imagined because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion.¹¹⁹

When the first photographs of Bali were produced in the early 1920s, photographic technology had made it possible for the photographers to make reproducible images. They did not have to be confined to the studio, and they were able to move to the field easily. The advent of this technology allowed image makers to record the local people going about their daily activities. The photographers’ ideologies are frequently reflected in their choice of subjects. Each image embodies a way of seeing. On the other hand, the meaning of an image depends upon the viewers’ way of seeing as well. The spectators are very often assumed to be men. This raises the question of whether one’s sexual inclination influences how a person perceives or presents his or her works.

In her book *On Photography*, Susan Sontag argues: “What is written about a person or an event is frankly an interpretation, as are handmade visual

¹¹⁸ *ibid.*, p. 54.

¹¹⁹ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities* (London: Verso, 2006), p. 6.

statements, like paintings and drawings.”¹²⁰ As visual statements, photographs are often surrounded with written words that explain the images. Although verbal texts attempt to compel the viewers to choose the interpretation that is closest to what is written, there is still room for other meanings:

In fact, words do speak louder than pictures. Captions do tend to override the evidence of our eyes; but no caption can permanently restrict or secure a picture's meaning.¹²¹

Western women write about and record visual statements about the Orient, and they resort to the same stereotypes as men. As producers of images, women photographers and writers are not only expected to record the scene before them; they are also expected to reference their relationships to their predecessors. Pratt claims that the travellers constructed the “Other” primarily through the sense of sight.¹²² In addition, women travellers frequently express their disbelief about the sights they have seen, indicating that they have seen the scenes firsthand. It is their sense of sight and their ability to act as eyewitnesses which later confers travellers' authority.¹²³

Most of the early writers and photographers to Bali were “white,” middle-class and educated men who provided eyewitness observations. As observers, they practiced what John Urry called a “voyeuristic colonial gaze.” According to Urry, this is a kind of gaze which is “more often male rather than female [and] is always linked to a sense of mastery over the image, which is composed out of an

¹²⁰ Susan Sontag, *On Photography* (New York: Picador, 1977), p. 4.

¹²¹ *ibid.*, p. 108.

¹²² Pratt, 1992, p. 5.

¹²³ Clifford Geertz, *Works and Lives: The Anthropologist as Author* (Cambridge: Polity, 1988), p. 121.

accumulation of the writer's experience."¹²⁴ John Berger argues that this experience includes what the viewers know and believe:

We never look at just one thing; we are always looking at the relation between things and ourselves. Our vision is continually active, continually moving, continually holding things in a circle around itself, constituting what is present to us as we are.¹²⁵

As image producers, both women travel writers and ethnographers cannot avoid including personal remarks and autobiographical narratives in their works. In an article entitled "Field in Common Places" (1984), Mary Louise Pratt claims that while ethnographers may use their ethnographic notes to write travel narratives, travel writers are likely to include the history, geography, and even anthropology of the people and habitats they encounter. They do this in order to justify their representations of the Other.

Pratt's most cited work, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*, argues that because of the geography of their colonial encounters, Asia, Africa, and America are considered as peripheries to colonisers. Pratt argues convincingly that locations are either on the periphery or in the centre relative to the observer. However, it is difficult not to argue with the claim voiced by Dorinne Kondo, who says that "Japan is another Western [country] rather than a non-Western country."¹²⁶ Having said all this, it is important to examine not only who is speaking about whom, it is also equally importantly to consider the

¹²⁴ John Urry, *The Tourist Gaze: Leisure and Travel in Contemporary Societies* (London: Sage, 1990), p. 88.

¹²⁵ John Berger, *Ways of Seeing* (London: BBC and Penguin Books, 1972), p. 9.

¹²⁶ Dorinne Kondo, 'About Face: Preforming Race in Fashion and Theatre', cited in Hiroshi Narumi, 'Fashion Orientalism and the Limits of Counter Culture', *Postcolonial Studies*, Vol 3, No. 3, pp. 311-329, 2000, p. 313. Here Kondo investigates the representation of Japan and Asia in the discourse on Japanese fashion. Kondo presents three layers of an Orientalising gaze: i) Western Orientalising, which is the Western gaze applied to other cultures; ii) self-Orientalising, which is the other's gaze diverted to themselves through an appropriation of the Western gaze and iii) Orientalism directed at other Asian countries.

location from which the issue is raised. In short, as is revealed later, the space of colonial encounters exists not only in the peripheries, but also in the colonial zones themselves.

Orientalism has played a significant role in the formation of Dutch cultural identity and Dutch racism. Due to the nature of colonial zones, all travellers from and to the Dutch East Indies are also influenced by their understanding of the Oriental. This Oriental perception is constrained and produced by dominant discourses, which always serve the function of self-definition. Writers' and producers' specific depiction of woman in the images they create depends upon the discourses of femininity that were circulated at a specific moment in the past. Even if new motifs of femininity are produced, they are necessarily constrained by the network of social/cultural practices and conditions of production and reception for these texts.

In addition to pornographic photographs, colonial administrators and officials made use of women in the colony as well as women from "home." In the Dutch East Indies, and according to Groeneveld, it was mostly white men who frequented prostitutes; some of these prostitutes were of native origin, but most were Indo-European or Chinese. Young unmarried Europeans often had a "housekeeper." The best concubines were thought to be the Japanese *njais*, who arrived directly from Japan, where they had been specially trained in advance for their job.¹²⁷ (The native inhabitants made comparatively little use of prostitutes, since sexual intercourse was not restricted to monogamous marriages). According to Pratt, the practices of the colonial officials were different from those outlined

¹²⁷ Groeneveld, p. 81.

by Groeneveld: “The European men on assignment to the colonies brought local women from their families to serve as sexual and domestic partners for the duration of their stay.”¹²⁸

Often, the Western conquerors claimed themselves as resolute moralists, while Oriental women were portrayed as the immoral ones. Are women’s perceptions of the Other reflected in their writings, or do these writings reconstruct the perceptions of men? To what degree do male and female travellers’ accounts differ in presenting and producing images of Balinese women?

¹²⁸ Pratt, 1992, p. 95.

CHAPTER 1

PRECONCEPTIONS: TRAVEL AND LITERATURE IN 1930S BALI

The colonization of Bali was a conquest carried out after the shipwreck; however, the history of Bali is very different from what appears in children's literature.¹²⁹ In Balinese tradition, any shipwreck that landed in their land is considered as a gift from the god of the sea and they have a right to take anything from the ship. One day, vessel called Sri Kumala wrecked on the kingdom of Badung seashore. The owner, a Chinese trader complained to the Dutch and required the Badung King to be responsible. This issue was later revived by the Dutch in 1906, accusing the Balinese had violated the international laws and used this strategy to intimidate the King by sending military troops and giving the King the options whether to fight or flee. The King and the Balinese prefer to kill themselves as part of their *puputan* tradition.

Bali is not an imaginary island that hosts shipwrecked sailors. It is the living museum of the Dutch.¹³⁰ Over the course of two centuries, Dutch literati produced a significant corpus of travel accounts, maps, and pictures of Bali, providing a wealth of knowledge about the once-unknown island and concomitantly transforming its image. Before the Dutch fully conquered Bali, there were only a handful of first-hand accounts of the island, which were written in Dutch. W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp's two-volume books, *Bali en Lombok* (1906), for

¹²⁹ Stephanos Stephanides and Susan Bassnett (eds.), *Beyond the Floating Islands* (COTEPR: University of Bologna, 2002), pp. 7-8.

¹³⁰ Picard, 1996, pp. 16-38.

example, was the first serious chronicle on Bali, but as it was written in Dutch, it did not reach a worldwide audience.¹³¹

Bali was fully under Dutch control after the second *puputan* (literally meaning ‘the end’) in 1908.¹³² This mass suicide of the Balinese royals brought Bali to international attention and resulted in harsh criticism of the Dutch. In order to clear their bad reputation, tourism was introduced; however, for the next thirty years the Dutch did their best to preserve Balinese culture by interfering as little as possible in the island’s centuries-old traditions.¹³³ The Dutch felt the need to promote Bali. Slowly the Dutch welcomed tourists to the island. What had once been considered an island that was not worth colonising eventually became a popular tourist destination for the Dutch. The view was propagated that the people needed civilisation on the one hand, while on the other the island’s supposed eroticism and exoticism was promoted—a move that Vickers refers to as ‘marketing ploys’.¹³⁴ Thus, certain images of the island such as ‘the bare breasts’ predominated.

Beginning in 1924, the KPM¹³⁵ organised a weekly steamship service from Batavia (Jakarta) Surabaya and Makasar to Buleleng, Bali.¹³⁶ It was from this date that tourism took off. In conjunction with this sea transport service, there

¹³¹ Yu-Chee Chong, ‘Covarrubias and the Art of Bali’ in Adriana Williams and Yu-Chee Chong, *Covarrubias in Bali* (Singapore: Didier Millet, 2005), pp. 50-61, p. 53. Nieuwenkamp published *Bali en Lombok* at his own expense (Shavit, p. 18). The first American book in English to provide information about Bali is *Where the Strange Trails Go Down* (1921) by an American war correspondent and adventure writer E. Alexander Powell. See his chapter on Bali titled ‘Down to an Island Eden’, pp. 143- 162. Roosevelt, Introduction to *The Last Paradise*, p. x; Shavit, p. 45.

¹³² For more historical views on this issue, see Agung’s *Bali in the 19th Century* (1991) and Wiener’s *Visible and Invisible Realms* (1995).

¹³³ John Darling, ‘The Context of Bali’, in *Walter Spies and Balinese Art*, ed. by Hans Rhodius and John Darling (Amsterdam: Tropical Museum, 1980), pp. 55-91, p. 57.

¹³⁴ Vickers, *Bali*, 1994, p. 32.

¹³⁵ KPM stands for Koninklijk Paketvaart Maatschapij (Royal Packet Navigation Company), a steamship line. KPM owned a monopoly on travel between the various islands of the Dutch Indies, see Williams and Chong, p. 13.

¹³⁶ Covarrubias, 1973, pp. xviii-xix.

was also a special issue on Bali published by *Inter-Ocean*.¹³⁷ The following year, this monthly magazine started including a supplement and a tourist pamphlet published by the Tourist Bureau. *Enchanted Isle* (n.d.)¹³⁸ first appeared in one of the tourist pamphlets written by Yates for KPM. In 1928, on the very site of the massacre, the Bali Hotel was erected by the Dutch through KPM.

Travelling to Bali became more accessible than was ever thought possible;¹³⁹ better land transport, facilities, and publications on the island made Bali more open to tourism. The modes of transportation that resulted from Dutch colonialism were more diverse and more comfortable. Starting in the 1930s, air travel became possible. In 1933, there was a flight from Surabaya to Bali, and as soon as the construction of a new airport in Tuban near Denpasar was completed, Bali became a regular, weekly stop-off point for KNILM¹⁴⁰ flights to Australia and Makassar.¹⁴¹ Land transport became possible in 1934. The advances in travel technology and facilities brought distant colonisable regions into the purview of European expansionism.¹⁴² This expansion was driven particularly by the modern technologies of travel and the media. In addition, this advancement of sea, land,

¹³⁷ To celebrate the opening of this new service, there was a special issue on Bali published in the *Inter Ocean*, formerly named *Sluyters' Monthly*. *Inter-Ocean* was a magazine devoted to promoting the Netherlands Indies abroad. For the local travellers or tourists, the KPM then published pamphlets about Bali and illustrated them with dancing girl photos taken by Thilly Weissenborn. For more information on tourist pamphlets before this year, see Picard especially pp. 24-5. Some early descriptions of Bali also appeared in magazines in *National Geographic*. One of those articles is read and kept by Covarrubias.

¹³⁸ Helen Eva Yates, *Bali, The Enchanted Isle* (Weltevreden: KPM, n.d.). As most pamphlets are not normally dated, it is difficult to know when exactly this advert was published. According to Picard, it was in the 1930s, (Picard, 1996, p. 37). From 1914 onwards, the Official Tourist Bureau advertised Bali as the 'Gem of the Lesser Sunda Isles' (Picard, 1996, p. 23).

¹³⁹ Communication was possible in a way that it never had been before. The first airmail service from Batavia to Amsterdam was in 1924 and it took almost two months.

¹⁴⁰ KNILM is an abbreviation of *Koninklijke Nederlandsh-Indische Luchvaart* or Royal Netherlands Indies Airways.

¹⁴¹ Shavit, pp. 50-1

¹⁴² Matthew Edney, *Mapping an Empire: The Geographical Construction of British India 1765-1843* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1997), p. 1; See also Said, p. 53; Teng, p. 45 and Suleri, p. 128.

and air transport affected the timing and the location, which helped to fortify colonial rule.¹⁴³

The introduction of tourism led to a significant change in the late 19th century East Indies; the Dutch colonial authorities in Java did not encourage tourists—nor did they welcome them. This was simply to avoid having the travellers ‘tell disagreeable truths about Dutch methods and rule’.¹⁴⁴ The *toelatings-kaart* (admission ticket) system was applied to all visitors. It was also difficult for private individuals to settle in Indonesia for long periods because of this system of permits.¹⁴⁵ Each newcomer had to find two people to stand as financial guarantors, which meant that periods of stay were usually quite short.¹⁴⁶

1. 1. *Java: The Garden of the East* (1897, 1912, 1998)

Before people can travel by means of efficient communication and transportation networks, literature travels first and brings back information about the foreign land. Consequently, due to easier travel conditions and a developing market for

¹⁴³ Daniel R. Headrick, *The Tools of Empire: Technology and European Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century* (New York: Oxford University, 1981), p. 10.

¹⁴⁴ E. R. Scidmore, *Java: The Garden of the East* (Singapore: Oxford University, 1998), p. 22. First published by The Century, New York, 1899. Parts of this book originally appeared in *Century Magazine* (Scidmore, p. viii). Scidmore, an example of female tourism, also wrote about China, Japan, Korea, India, Ceylon, Canada, and Alaska. This American writer did not write her name in full. The fact that she did not attach any reference to her gender in her title shows how confident she was in her writing. Speaking about the British women travellers, from the 1880s to about 1914, Hsu-Ming Teo suggests, ‘[t]he growing confidence women had in themselves as travelers is also demonstrated by the gradual omission of all reference to their sex in their titles of their books. Hsu-Ming Teo, ‘Femininity, Modernity, and Colonial Discourse’, pp. 173-190, in *In Transit: Travel, Text, Empire*, ed. by Helen Gilbert and Anna Johnston (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), p. 178.

¹⁴⁵ Similar permits were applied in French West Africa. When Gorer went to Africa, he noticed that: ‘Besides a rigorous customs examination, every European has to receive a special permit and make a deposit of sixty pounds; negroes pass as they please.’ See Gorer, 1983, p.162.

¹⁴⁶ Anneke Groeneveld, et. al. *Toekang Potret: 100 Jaar Fotografie in Nederlands Indië 1839-1939/Toekang Potret: 100 years of Photography in the Dutch Indies 1839-1939* (Rotterdam: Museum voor Volkenkunde, 1989), p. 49. This book was simultaneously published with the exhibition of the same name in the Museum of Ethnology at Rotterdam from 4 March to 28 May 1989.

travel literature, more and more women felt encouraged to undertake ‘touristic’ journeys – with or without male company.¹⁴⁷ In the Preface to *Java: The Garden of the East*, E. R. [Eliza Ruhamah] Scidmore (1856-1928), who visited Java¹⁴⁸ in the late 19th century, invites her readers to come to the Indies, giving them a list of dos and don’ts:

In presenting this account of a visit to one of the most beautiful countries of the world, I shall hope that many will be induced to follow there, and that my record may assist them to avoid certain things and to take advantage of others that will add to their enjoyment of the island where nature has been so prodigal with beauties and wonders.¹⁴⁹

Scidmore, who described her own journey as ‘pleasure travel’,¹⁵⁰ emphasised her regret at not having read the publication of a certain guidebook, *Guide to the Dutch East Indies*,¹⁵¹ that came out in the same year as her *Java*.¹⁵² She mentioned this covertly not only because she wanted to add more credibility to her authority, but also because she valued such books, which during Scidmore’s time were rare. This was the era where mass productions were limited and English

¹⁴⁷ Jedamski, p. 11: ‘In the second half of the nineteenth century, new trends in colonial policy encouraged more and more women to visit the Malay Archipelago. Wives, daughters, sometimes mothers would more commonly accompany their husbands, fathers, or sons to their plantations, colonial posts, or missions.’

¹⁴⁸ Early references to Bali almost always place it in relation to Java – as a Java minor, or merely an attachment to Java island. See again the Introduction of this thesis.

¹⁴⁹ Scidmore, p. vii.

¹⁵⁰ *ibid.*, p. viii.

¹⁵¹ Dr. J. F. van Bemmelen and Colonel J. B. Hooyer, *Guide to the Dutch East Indies*, trans. by Rev. B. J. Berrington (London: Luzac, Batavia: G. Kolff, 1897). The book, which contained 12 pages of advertisements, is sponsored by KPM. The introduction of this handy guidebook covers general observation, outfit, language, gratitude, washing, mode of living and mode of life on board. Bemmelen was the lecturer on Natural History at the Gymnasium Willem III at Batavia (now Jakarta); Hooyer was a retired Lieutenant Colonel of the East Indian Colonial Army; Berrington was a private teacher of the English language at The Hague.

¹⁵² Scidmore, p. ix. After her second visit to the Netherlands East Indies, Scidmore mentioned, in the preface of the 1912 edition, that ‘the Netherlands officials have greatly relented in their attitude to travellers, and really welcome them. There are guidebooks, even an official tourist bureau, and one may be personally conducted or go with his own coupons everywhere. The hotels have been enlarged and modernized, and the automobiles have made a driving tour over the beautiful country roads a still more perfect pleasure’ (Scidmore, 1912, p. ix), cited by Jedamski, p. 24.

translations were scarce. Even if the books existed, they were published in a language that she did not understand.

Although she regretted not being able to read *Guide to the Dutch East Indies*, she admitted to having read related books; it is possible that she had pre-conceptions about the East Indies before embarking on her trip. Scidmore makes a fleeting acknowledgement of Captain Schulze's guidebook:

After the body of this work had gone to press, the first copies of a small, compact, and most admirable "Guide to the Dutch East Indies," written by Dr. J. F. Van Bemmelen and Colonel J.B. Hoover, by invitation of the Royal Steam Packet Company, Amsterdam, and translated into English by the Rev. B. J. Berrington, reached this country, and to this work I hasten to extend my salutations, since my own pages contain so many complaints for some such guide. It treats of all the islands under Dutch rule, turning especially light upon the so little-known Sumatra, where many attractions and possible resorts will invite pleasure travel; and, leading one from end to end of Java, it more than supplements what Captain Schulze's little guide had done for Batavia and the west end of the island.¹⁵³ Translating so much of local¹⁵⁴ and special lore hitherto locked away from the alien visitor in Dutch texts, it at last fairly opens Java to the tourist world, and excites my keen regret that its earlier publication had not lighted my way.¹⁵⁵

Perhaps Java would have been included in Bali's reputation as 'one of the many ports in a round-the-world cruise'.¹⁵⁶ Moreover, the concept of 'Paradise' would not have been attached to Bali if the Dutch had not implemented the admission ticket policy. It is possible, as Scidmore observed, that Java would have

¹⁵³ Fedor Schulze, *West Java Traveller's Guide for Batavia and from Batavia to the Preanger Regencies and Tjilatjap* (Batavia: Visser, 1894).

¹⁵⁴ It was only in 1928 that Indonesian nationalism was consolidated in *Sumpah Pemuda* (Youth Pledge) in which the whole nation believed in one nation, one nationality and one language.

¹⁵⁵ Scidmore, pp. vii-viii. In her 1912 edition, Scidmore refers to *Guide to the Dutch East Indies* merely as a 'guidebook' (Scidmore, 1912, p. ix, cited by Jedamsky). Gorer, one of the authors on Bali discussed in this thesis, mentioned similar things. He said that he was unable to obtain copies of Graham Hutton's *Midwest at Noon* (1946) or John Gunther's *Inside U.S.A.* (1947) until he had finished *The American People*. See Gorer, *The Americans: A Study in a National Character* (London: Cresset, 1948), p. 20.

¹⁵⁶ Covarrubias, 1973, p. xvii.

ranked on the same level as Japan as one of the Dutch's favourite tourist destinations, if more travel-guides had been in circulation during her time:

If Baedeker or Murray would only go to Java and kindly light the tourist's way; if the Dutch government would relax the useless vexations of the *toelatings-kaart* system, and the colonists welcome the visitor in more kindly spirit, Java would rank, as it deserves to, as a close second to Japan, an oasis in travel, an island of beauty and delight to the increasing number of round-the-world travellers, who each year are discouraged from visiting the country by less heedful ones who have ventured there.¹⁵⁷

The corollary of this is that not only would a better means of transport have caught the attention of many a would-be-traveller, but also tourist pamphlets, travels articles, and books describing the island would have done so as well. In other words, tourism served the crucial purpose of opening up the world for the 'white' Western traveller.

1. 2. *Bali: Enchanted Isle – A Travel Book (1933)*¹⁵⁸

Both textual and visual records of Bali attracted writers, photographers, painters, and throngs of musicians, singers, and dancers to visit, to write about, and to visualise the island. Unlike Scidmore, who incorporated only a few photos but many drawings in her book, Helen Eva Yates, who travelled to Bali in the 1930s, included two portraits of herself and some pictures of Bali that she had taken herself.¹⁵⁹ She was not one of the day-tripper tourists, for she went on a journey to

¹⁵⁷ Scidmore, pp. 335-36.

¹⁵⁸ There appears to be no evidence that Yates ever produced any published book before her Bali visit. Yates other publications include: *The World is Your Oyster: the Art of Travelling Smartly* (1939); *How to Travel for Fun* (1950); *Shopping all Over the World* (1953); *Shopping and Sightseeing in Hong Kong* (1954) and *Shopping in India* (1954).

¹⁵⁹ Marina Vaizey argues that 'By the 1880s and 1890s, the era of the new portable cameras, photography was unavoidable, and further technical advances have made it ubiquitous: the omnipresence of photographs in publications of all kinds, its use as a sophisticated vehicle for information accepted as authentic, the nearly universal practice of photography as a hobby and in casual haphazard manner by the general public, ordinary people with no particular training,' Marina Vaizey, *The Artist as Photographer* (London: Sidgwick and Jackson, 1982), p. 8.

Bali in order to write. Yates published her travel book and called it *Bali: Enchanted Isle – A Travel Book* the same title that she had used for her tourist pamphlets twenty years previously, only adding ‘A Travel Book’ and omitting ‘the’ as her subtitle. She dedicated her book to her good friend Lowell Thomas at whose suggestion the book was written.¹⁶⁰

According to Yates, *Bali: Enchanted Isle* was ‘not meant to be a guide-book,’¹⁶¹ but she hoped her account may tempt her readers ‘to go forth and adventure for themselves in Bali’ as she did.¹⁶² Not only did Yates believe that written accounts of certain places, with or without images, were crucial before a visit, but, in turn, by using photographs, she also contributed to luring future travellers to visit Bali:

Two weeks in Bali give the traveller a picture of this idyllic isle of mythical people. That is time enough to make impressions that will last a lifetime, and fill one’s memory with glowing pictures to recall on less happy days. As in all travelling, the more you read and bring to a country in the way of study and interest, the more you carry away in experience and understanding.¹⁶³

At this point, Yates comes to the conclusion that impressions and memories can sometimes be recalled later on, rather like a memento. This past memory becomes an absent image and it can be used to associate a present image with an experience in the past. How many of these experiences influence travellers’ understanding of

¹⁶⁰ Yates, (1933), p. 7. Lowell (Jackson) Thomas (1892-1981) was an American scholar, writer, broadcaster, and a historian of Palestine campaign and Arab revolution who wrote *With Lawrence in Arabia* (1925).

¹⁶¹ This kind apology – self deprecating – is also expressed by some other writers such as Krause, (Mabbett, 1988, p.7); Covarrubias refers to himself as an ‘unscientific artist’ (Covarrubias, 1973, p. xxv); meanwhile, Roosevelt expressed his lack of writing skills: ‘People are kind enough to admire my pictures, both still and movies; audiences seem to enjoy my lectures and seldom leave before the end, but I have yet to find anybody who has ventured to assert that I am a successful writer. As an author I must confess that I am a most dismal failure,’ (Roosevelt, Introduction to *The Last Paradise*, p. ix); Gorer recounts his travels in Africa saying that ‘The journey described in this book turned me into a more or less professional anthropologist, for it left me deeply conscious of my incapacity to understand much of what I had witnessed’ (Gorer, 1983, p. 10).

¹⁶² Yates, 1933, p. 181.

¹⁶³ *ibid.*, p. 177.

this present image—and to what extent? It seems that the heavier the mental ‘luggage’ the travellers bring, on either their arrival or their departure, the better their adventure will be. However, as we shall see later, some 20th century travellers pretend that they have left their luggage behind or even claim to have lost it. They ignore the fact that exposure to literature or popular books is usually unavoidable.

In a similar manner to her predecessor, Scidmore, who freely mentions her previous knowledge of the island, Yates refers explicitly to Sir Thomas Stamford Raffles’ *The History of Java* (1817) in the explanatory notes of her travel account, stating that she had read his scientific account of Bali. Raffles’ 1817¹⁶⁴ account tends towards the ‘noble image’ of the islanders, and this is a feature highlighted by later writers.¹⁶⁵

In addition to her scientific pre-conceptions of Bali, Yates was also familiar with the negative images of the island. The following quotation is an example of Yates’ exposure to the magic tales of Bali:

And I heard of the “belladonna” lily, which is supposed to contain a strong narcotic. The natives, who believe in all the wiles of goona goona magic make a brew of the belladonna flowers as a potion to slip into the cup of a rival. You hear many strange tales in Bali. I could hardly believe the story of the giant flower called the *Rafflesia Arnoldi*, whose blossom is said to have a spread of thirty inches and a height of six feet! – the largest flower in the world. I did not see it growing, but I brought home a picture of it.¹⁶⁶

The flower was named after its discoverers, Sir Thomas Raffles and Dr Joseph Arnold, who was a naturalist as well as Raffles’ personal physician. In addition to her extensive knowledge of the literature on Bali, Yates expressed what she

¹⁶⁴ Around this year, similar book is published about India. See James Mill’s *The History of British India* (1820).

¹⁶⁵ See for examples: Krause, Yates, and Covarrubias.

¹⁶⁶ Yates, 1933, p. 47. Yates must have heard the tale about a ‘Malay revenge’, see Scidmore, pp. 120-21.

believed or did not believe about Bali. She heard and seemed to believe in this negative trait of the natives, but not in the more scientific accounts of the flower. As a travel writer, she made no claims about having seen the flower herself, but as with any writing in this genre, she trusted records such as tales¹⁶⁷ and actual photographs. Therefore, the photograph of the flower becomes the substitute for the absent image – her ‘eyewitness’. Yates moved from describing the tales to documenting the giant flower that she at first did not believe existed. She wanted people ‘back home’ to believe that the flower did indeed exist. She combined her opinions, rumours from others, and her background literature for her own publication. In returning to Yates’s photographs, the picture of the flower that she kept is meant to authenticate its ‘growing’. For Yates, the representation of Bali relied on a dual structure of authority: being an eyewitness and providing a visual record. Yates includes twenty-three photographs of her journey to Bali in her travel book, which I will discuss further in the next chapter.

Before Yates came to Bali, travelling had long been associated with photographs. As discussed earlier, Scidmore added some photos and drawings in her book. Similarly, Yates produced some photographs for her own publication. The purpose is clear: it was a sophisticated vehicle to present her information as authentic – as coming from someone who was actually there. Along with her travel photographs, she educated and persuaded her readers and would-be visitors to make a journey. Thus, she showed her readers how to ‘see’ Bali and produced for them a paradise.

¹⁶⁷ It should be noted that tales that Yates heard are not necessarily false; they simply have a different epistemological status.

1. 3. *A Tale from Bali* (1937)¹⁶⁸

If Raffles' book left Yates with a strong impression of Bali, 'some very beautiful photographs'¹⁶⁹ of Bali lured Baum to visit the island. In 1916, Baum admitted to having seen some photographs that had been given to her by a friend of a friend. Baum did not explicitly mention the origin of the photographs or her source, nor did she explicitly mention the friend's name. It is likely that she had seen Gregor Krause's photo album.¹⁷⁰ Not only Baum, but also a generation of Bali enthusiasts would be enthralled by Krause's attractive two-volume work. (More discussion on

¹⁶⁸ Vicki Baum, *A Tale from Bali*, trans. by Basil Creighton (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford in Asia paperback, c. 1983). First published in German in 1937 as *Das Ende der Geburt* (The end of life). The Japanese translation in 1942 was called *Barito Monogatary*, which literally means 'Bali Island Story'. The Spanish translation, *Amor y muerte en Bali* (1949) was translated from another German version: *Liebe und Tod auf Bali*. In 1953, its Dutch translation, *Liefde en dood op Bali*, was published. The Dutch version, along with Esperanto (*Amo kaj morto en Balio*, 1986) and the French versions, *Sang et volupte a Bali* (Blood and Pleasure in Bali, 1939) are also translated from *Liebe und Tod auf Bali*.

A Tale from Bali is a historical novel about the mass suicides of the royal courts in 1906 and 1908 in Bali. This was an act of the refusal towards the Dutch colonialism. While the cover of the 1973 edition shows one of Covarrubias' painting, the 2002 edition by Tuttle Publishing reproduced an image of the suicides by a Frenchman – see *Le Petit Journal*, Supplement Illustré, 14 October 1906.

For a detailed examination of this conflict from the Balinese perspective, see Agung, 1991. A brief profile of Bali before the Dutch invasion is found in Willard A. Hanna, *Bali Profile: People, Events, Circumstances 1001-1976* (New York: American Universities Field Staff, 1976). Reprinted by Rumah Budaya Banda Naira Moluccas Indonesia, Jakarta, 1990.

¹⁶⁹ Baum, c. 1983, p. vii. Other visitors who have seen Krause's memorable photographic images of Bali include the Covarrubiases (Covarrubias, 1973, p. xvii), and the painter Emilio Ambron. Ambron first encounter with Bali was in the exhibition of Balinese art in Paris. In a bookstore in Basel Emilio Ambron came across Krause's 1920 book, whose powerful and exotic photographs brought Bali to the attention of the entire world. A few weeks later, Emilio was captivated by a documentary film on Bali. Shortly after, he came across a collection of Balinese paintings in a gallery. See Bruce W. Carpenter, *Emilio Ambron: An Italian Artist in Bali* (Singapore: Archipelago, 2001.)

¹⁷⁰ Baum must have seen Gregor Krause's album. Krause visited Bali for the first time in 1912 and his two-volume photo collection, *Insel Bali*, was not published until 1920. The book was such a publishing success that its first printing was sold out within six months, Karl With, Foreword to the second edition, Gregor Krause and Karl With, *Bali: People and Art* (Bangkok: White Lotus, 2000), p. vii; Shavit, p. 18.

The two-volume books were first published in German, the second edition, *Bali*, which is condensed into one volume, circulated in 1922. A revised edition was published in 1926 in Munich and a French translation appeared in Paris in 1930. The first editions were then translated and reproduced in one volume by W.H. Mabbett as *Bali 1912: Photographs and Reports by Gregor Krause* (Singapore: January Books, 1988). This is the first English translation of *Insel Bali* (1920). The 2000 edition was translated from the 1922 text by Walter E. J. Tips and titled *Bali: People and Art*.

Krause' photographs can be found in Chapter 2). Baum did not fulfil her longing for this exotic land immediately upon seeing the photographs. The German writer, not yet able to replace those photographic images with actual travel, admits her strong attraction to Bali:

A strange relationship grew up between these photographs and me; I felt that I should one day come to know those people and that I had actually walked along those village streets and gone in at those temple doors.¹⁷¹

It was not until 1935, almost twenty years after Baum had seen the photographs, that she actually saw Bali.

Moreover, Baum's statement in the introduction of her novel confirms that one of her motives for travelling was to escape from 'the horrors' her generation faced, her position that of someone whose values and attitudes had been predominantly formed by the Weimar Republic:¹⁷²

It must, I think, have been in 1916, a time when Europe was too much preoccupied to remember the existence of a little island called Bali, that I came by chance into the possession of some very beautiful photographs. One of my friends had got them from an acquaintance – a doctor who lived in Bali. They made such an impression on me that I begged my friend to give me them; and I kept turning again and again to these pictures of men and beasts and landscapes, whenever the horrors my generation was exposed to – war, revolution, inflation, emigration – became unbearable.¹⁷³

Encounters with the Other provide travellers with an opportunity to look back at the self, and literary representations of Bali and its indigenous people frequently expressed, and were coloured by, the author's social, philosophical, or political concerns. (I will deal with the political concerns later in Chapter 3.) It has long been said that, from the end of the 19th century,

¹⁷¹ Baum, c. 1983, p. vii.

¹⁷² Graham Bartram (ed.), 'The German Novel in the Long Twentieth Century,' in *The Cambridge Companion to the Modern German Novel* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2004), pp. 1-14 (p. 6).

¹⁷³ Baum, c. 1983, p. vii.

‘a yearning for foreign lands, and an escape from civilisation were not new motives for travel’.¹⁷⁴ In fact, Baum’s emigration to America is another story.¹⁷⁵ Baum’s temporary escape or displacement became a permanent escape or displacement of her status as a traveller and later as a migrant. Baum’s testimony also reveals how a novelist portrays the society of her world. She spoke for her society as well as for the issues of her day.

Christine Jordis implies that she had no literary precedents before she had the opportunity to travel. Although she wrote in the year 2002, Jordis employed a similar practice to that of her predecessors; by doing so, she intended to make her authority more acceptable. She lists the names of 19th century literary ‘explorers’ such as Flaubert, Nerval, Loti, Conrad, Stevenson, and Melville.¹⁷⁶ Moreover, she mentions Rimbaud’s short visit to Java as well as that of her fellow citizen travel writer and painter Henri Michaux (1899-1984):

More recently, there was of course Michaux, and others of minor celebrity, but I had none of these travellers’ writings in mind when I left for Asia that first time. All I did was pay a visit to a relative who worked in Jakarta. The books came later, the guidebooks and studies likewise, and the need to return.¹⁷⁷

Jordis stressed that the accounts of her predecessors and her contemporaries did not influence her travel and travel writing at all. But it is unlikely, as Nicholas Howe argues below, that Jordis did not carry her literary baggage with her.

Writing in 1993, Howe observes that:

¹⁷⁴ Korte, p. 105; Howe, p. 63.

¹⁷⁵ In her autobiography, Baum explained the reason she came to America: ‘And so my *Grand Hotel* brought me to the US in 1931, long before the great exodus, the wholesale torturing and dying had begun in Germany; for this I’m infinitely grateful’, see Baum’s autobiography: *I know What I’m Worth* (London: Michael Joseph, 1964).

¹⁷⁶ Jordis, p. 7.

¹⁷⁷ *ibid.*, pp. 7-8.

This late in the day, no one can travel anywhere on the planet without having seen it before arriving. There are books, photographs, movies, even videos that allow you to preview a vacation spot before leaving home. The corollary is that the experience of travel, and thus the writing of travel, is grounded in the images and stories of the place. What we bring from our reading is ultimately the most useful baggage of all, but only if we know we carry it. Otherwise, it delays us along the way.¹⁷⁸

Between 1600 and 1800, as John Urry suggests, treatises on travel changed from ‘an opportunity for discourse’ to travel as ‘eyewitness observation’.¹⁷⁹

Furthermore, Urry continues, within this shift, there was a visualisation of one’s travel experience and the development of the ‘gaze,’ which was influenced by the burgeoning popularity of guidebooks. Urry mainly discusses the tourist gaze.

However, as James Clifford suggests, talking about travel means entering a terrain redolent with markers of imperialism.¹⁸⁰ By the time Schulze Fedor wrote his guidebook on Batavia (now Jakarta) in 1894, travellers to the East Indies had already developed their own gazes in relation to, and as a result of regarding, colonised people—possibly people from the West Indies. (In the early days of tourism, as mentioned before, Bali was something of an appendix to Java.)

Those travellers such as Raffles and Gorer who visited the Dutch colonies had read the colonial texts written by the Dutch and they adopted the colonisers’ way of seeing the colonized. If earlier visitors claimed that they had not been exposed to literary books before embarking on a trip to the colony, it did not mean that there were virtually no literary precedents for their journey. Later visitors, like travelling colonisers, might have been influenced by the mood and colonial

¹⁷⁸ Nicholas Howe, ‘Reading Places’, *The Yale Review*, 81 (1993), 61-73 (p. 66).

¹⁷⁹ Urry, p. 4. See also Grewal, 1996, p. 1, and J. Adler, ‘Origins of Sightseeing’, *Annals of Tourism Research*, 16 (1989), 7-29.

¹⁸⁰ James Clifford, ‘Travelling Cultures’ in *Cultural Studies*, ed. by Lawrence Grossberg et. al. (New York: Routledge, 1992), pp. 96-112 (p. 99).

discourse at the time, a subject that I will discuss at length in the subsequent chapters.

The travellers discussed so far had all read some travel literatures before they set foot on the paradise island. They were men and women travellers of the late 19th and early 20th centuries. Some of them openly revealed the source of the publication or the circular they read and some did not. In short, their travels could be said to have been shaped by various texts. Their reading included popular writings, tourist pamphlets, and even scientific writings. To strengthen their authority, they gave the impression that they were not affected by their previous textual readings. It is the writers' claim to empiricism and to the authority of 'eye witnessing' that interests me. All of them try to recover a way of seeing that was free from preconceived notions. In other words, travel writers, whether deliberately or not, presented the question of authority in their travel accounts.

1. 4. Means of Transport – Ships

Opportunities for travel, especially for the upper class, increased rapidly as soon as there were better methods of communication and transport. These were the days of genteel travel, of long sea voyages and lengthy sojourns in far away places. There was a Malay phrase book available in the market.¹⁸¹ It was also when on board that the travellers could brush up on their Malay.¹⁸² When the Covarrubias set sail, it took six weeks by *Cingalese Prince*; Theodora Benson

¹⁸¹ Michael Hitchcock and Lucy Norris, *Bali the Imagining Museum: The Photographs of Walter Spies and Beryl de Zoete* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1995), p. 25.

¹⁸² The Covarrubias took daily lessons in elementary Malay (then Bali's official language) from a young Javanese sailor on the ship, Covarrubias, 1973, p. xvii; Williams, p. 61. Benson had learnt Malay before travelling to the East Indies, but did not use her time on the ship to learn more. She recalled: 'I had learnt some Malay happily and successfully at the School of Oriental Languages in London. (...) On the boat the Javanese boys had been too smart, and I too lazy, for me to keep it up,' (Benson, p. 21).

spent four weeks on the Rotterdam Lloyd liner¹⁸³; E. Alexander Powell who went to Bali in the early 1920s on the coast-guard cutter *Negros*, spent eight weeks travelling there.¹⁸⁴

I would go by sea, four weeks on a Rotterdam Lloyd liner, and come back by air. It feels right to go out slowly, getting used to the heat, rubbing up your Malay, making friends on board, having time to spare for that loss of time (which means loss of sleep) that happens when you travel from West to East.¹⁸⁵

Like most travellers who wanted to forget the horrors of the war, Benson considered her journey an escape:

I came to love her dearly as a home, but always an unreal home; life on shipboard is fantastic, an escape, something happens to your sense of proportion so that the troubles and affections of the world behind you and the opportunities of the world ahead cease to exist.¹⁸⁶

Benson mentioned that she read a lot about the East Indies before embarking on her journey.¹⁸⁷ Obviously, travellers arrived on Bali with expectations shaped by reading about the island, expectations that in turn informed their own writings.

In addition, the long sea voyages provided travellers with ample time for conversation and speculation, and there was always the chance of running into somebody who had already been to Bali,¹⁸⁸ or they could just make small talk or listen to first-time travellers' reactions:

We were glad to get back to the comforts of the steamer and amused to listen to the various reactions of the sightseers as to Bali. "So cultured!" said one. "So Pagan!" contradicted another. "Such artistic dancing!"

¹⁸³ Theodora Benson, 'Bali', *In the East my Pleasure Lies* (London: William Heinemann, 1938), pp. 163-207 (p. 5). (Eleanor) Theodora (Roby) Benson (1906-1942), a novelist and travel writer. Her father was Godfrey Rathbone Benson, first Baron Charwood.

¹⁸⁴ E. Alexander Powell, *Where the Strange Trails Go Down* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1921), p. 9.

¹⁸⁵ Benson, p. 5.

¹⁸⁶ *ibid.*

¹⁸⁷ *ibid.*, p. 3.

¹⁸⁸ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 25.

declared the third. [sic] So tiresome!” said a fourth. In fact, there were almost as many opinions as tourists!¹⁸⁹

Similar expressions probably shaped a writer such as Covarrubias, who wrote part of his book on board the ship.¹⁹⁰ (Covarrubias completed six paintings and wrote three chapters of *Island of Bali* during the return voyage.)

In Dutch Bali, where the travellers were not necessarily Dutch, it is arguable that their journey fostered a sense of superiority, developed their sense of supremacy, and at the same time heightened their ‘expected expectations.’¹⁹¹ That is to say, the voyagers were probably anxious and excited throughout their journey. In the first half of the 19th century, English travellers who went to India viewed the colony mostly from boats. According to Bernard Cohn, this means of travel emphasises the separation between seer and seen. Moreover, as Inderpal Grewal claims, it contrasts the travellers’ mobility as opposed to the immobility of the Indians.¹⁹²

During Yates’ short cruise to Bali, which was ‘only three days from Batavia by a snug little Dutch steamer’ and a half-day trip from Surabaya to Bali,¹⁹³ her mental image, perceptions, and expectations apparently added to and changed from listening to the personal ‘experiences’ of the ‘real’ people that she met on the voyage, for example ‘the Hon. Caron.’ Caron was an official Resident of the Dutch government in the East Indies and was, as Yates describes him, ‘the

¹⁸⁹ Isabel Anderson, LL.D., Litt. D (Known as Mrs. Larz Anderson), ‘Bali, Island of Lovely Women’ in *In Eastern Seas: With a Visit to Insulinde and the Golden Chersonese* (Boston: Bruce Humphries, 1934), pp. 191-213 (p. 212). In this chapter, there are six black and white photographs, three of which about the dancing girls and one picture depicts two Balinese girls with a caption: ‘Lofty loads carried by women in Bali’. (One of the two girls is shown bare breasted.) A photograph of a Balinese dancing girl is chosen as the cover of this book.

¹⁹⁰ Williams, 1994, p. 80. Covarrubias completed six paintings and wrote three chapters of *Island of Bali* during the voyage.

¹⁹¹ For more information of the use of ‘expected expectations,’ see Jedamski, p. 3.

¹⁹² Grewal, p. 101.

¹⁹³ Yates, 1933, p. 20.

equivalent of a king'.¹⁹⁴ It is interesting to learn that travelling women were also interested in this phenomenon. Referring to someone as 'Honorary' in this way is rather unusual. This idiosyncratic trait perhaps indicates Yates' attitude towards class, which I shall discuss later.

For E. Ann Kaplan, travel provokes conscious attention to gender and racial difference.¹⁹⁵ In the case of Yates, her travel incited her consciousness of class. Yates considered those travelling in foreign lands to be 'more democratic than [those] at home'.¹⁹⁶ Kaplan, however, believes that 'people's identities when they are travelling are often more self-consciously *national* than when they stay home'.¹⁹⁷ It seems there was no class difference between the Carons and Yates. (Yates was not conscious of the different social status they held.) Yates' sense of class-consciousness was determined by the cultural systems – i.e., British – that she brought with her. If in Europe 'us' and 'them' meant the upper class and the working people, in the Dutch East Indies' colonial context, 'us' means all 'white,' while 'them' is distinguished by race – the natives. This happened more often than not to the foreigners who might have been of the same race although not of the same class as their rulers.

Yates did not tell her readers much about her 'Bali conversations' with the Carons, but she felt fortunate to have met the colonial officer and trusted him a great deal: 'What a treat Providence handed me; for my new friend proved to be the Resident, the Hon. Caron. ... It was a joy to meet someone who knew the

¹⁹⁴ *ibid.*, p. 21.

¹⁹⁵ Kaplan, p. 6.

¹⁹⁶ Yates, 1933, p. 20.

¹⁹⁷ Kaplan, p. 6.

island from many years' experience.'¹⁹⁸ This is, perhaps, the kind of joy that was experienced by Baum, Covarrubias, and de Zoete, who happened to know Spies, a long resident and 'must see' person in Bali. (Who Spies was and what he did in Bali will be discussed in Chapter 4.) It was during this conversation that Yates began to test her knowledge about Bali against that of her non-native informant.

Of course, not all the passengers on a ship are going to the same destination. Conversations may lead to things based on hearsay. Hickman Powell, who was on three-month research trip for his book, met by chance a British woman. He recounts their meeting:

One day, on a ship westward bound, I was telling these things¹⁹⁹ to a young woman who had been visiting in Malaya. Her hair had been waved by an expert *coiffeur*; her nails were fastidiously polished; Paris had cultivated the charm and precision of her dress. Every device that little Renang knew not, she had used to enhance her natural beauty; though being British, she walked like an Englishwoman.

"But why," she exclaimed with a lady-like shudder, "didn't you live in a bungalow,²⁰⁰ with servants? I never heard of anybody wanting to live with natives."

So, after paying what tribute was due to her own lily whiteness, I told her things about the people of Bengkel: that they had developed a civilization which was not one of germicides and bathroom fixtures; that they were far advanced in some respects in which we were generally barbarians; that they were beautiful – She interrupted me.

"But if you married one of them, you'd soon get tired of her!"²⁰¹

Perhaps this European woman had never heard about Western men who practised

¹⁹⁸ Yates, 1933, p. 21.

¹⁹⁹ Powell is telling the woman that 'brown skins are far more beautiful than white skins ever can be' (Powell, 1985, p. 52).

²⁰⁰ For more discussion on bungalows in Bali, see Lindsey, pp. 58-61. Compare to bungalows in the Indian context in E. M. Collingham, *Imperial Bodies: The Physical Experience of the Raj, c. 1800-1947* (Cambridge: Polity, 2001), pp. 99-103; For more examples of the colonial bungalow see also Robert Fermor-Hesketh, *Architecture of the British Empire* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicholson, 1986), p. 58; Henry H. Saylor, *Bungalows* (Philadelphia: John C. Winston, 1911), p. 5; and Ladislao Szekely, *Tropic Fever: The Adventures of a Planter in Sumatra*, trans. by Marion Saunders (Singapore: Oxford University, 1989), p. 79.

²⁰¹ Powell, 1985, pp. 52-3.

concubinage²⁰² in the colonies. Ineke Zweers observes that it was a common practice for young unmarried Europeans to have a ‘housekeeper’.²⁰³ Whatever reasons this American man might have had in trying to give the woman a positive image of Bali, one thing is certain: he was attracted to a young Balinese girl. In addition, this man had his own ideal beauty that was different from that of his fellow citizens, which I will discuss later in Chapter 2.

Men sometimes share ‘men’s stories’ with other men. The Canadian composer Collin McPhee was told by the Dutch administrator that: ‘In the old days [...], Hollanders married natives; to-day it is different. Take them to bed if you like, but see they come in at the back door.’²⁰⁴ Men told women about the native women’s *goona-goona* and that it was the native men who had many wives. It is unlikely that men were told of the danger of having a relationship with Balinese girls. An English writer, Benson, said:²⁰⁵

I have been told that no country girl of decent Balinese family will have a liaison with a European. But I have also been told that it is not the difficulty but the danger that should hold the European in check; inasmuch as though the race shows no signs of disease, seeming in course of time to have become almost immune, white people very often find them infectious. I cannot judge of the reliability of my sources of information.²⁰⁶

This dangerous or infectious country girls’ story was possibly spread by Dutch colonials, who wanted to maintain their racial purity, a topic that I shall analyse in the next chapter. Thus, it would be instructive to consider, for example, the implications of the first accounts of Bali by men who passed on all the stories

²⁰² Ineke Zweers, ‘Commercial Photography,’ in Groeneveld, pp. 53-118 (p. 81).

²⁰³ *ibid.*

²⁰⁴ McPhee, 2002, p. 16.

²⁰⁵ Benson, p. 190.

²⁰⁶ *ibid.*

about Bali to women. Therefore, it is necessary to study what men have written about their experiences in Bali.

1. 5. *Insel Bali* (1920)

The pervasive influence of Krause's book is indicated by references made to it on numerous occasions by later visitors, including Spies and Covarrubias. Before discussing the accounts of men of 1930s Bali, it is useful to talk about Krause, an earlier traveller-cum-colonial administrator, and his textual representations of Balinese women. Gregor Krause (1883-1960) was born in a city that came under German, Polish, and then Russian territory. Krause went to the Dutch East Indies after finishing a medical degree in Germany; he then went to Leiden for a Dutch medical qualification.²⁰⁷ Krause arrived in Bangli, Bali in August. The young German bachelor was stationed there as a temporary²⁰⁸ medical officer in the Dutch colonial army in what is now called Indonesia. Like some other doctors who were in medical service, Krause was also an amateur photographer.²⁰⁹ Most of Krause's photographs were taken in 1912. In 1917,²¹⁰ in an Exhibition of

²⁰⁷ Mabbett, 1988, p. 11.

²⁰⁸ At first, he had planned to stay only three years in the Orient, but they had become forty, Mabbett, 1988, p. 13.

²⁰⁹ Gregor Krause took photographs of the inhabitants on Bali at intimate and domestic moments from 1912 to 1914. Although army doctors were mainly interested in employing photography for medical purposes, like Krause, they also photographed ethnographic scenes while on active service. It is their confidential position that enabled them to take photographs at private moments. C. J. Neeb and H.M. Neeb, for example, made extensive and shocking photographs of the military campaigns on Lombok (1894) and in Atjeh (1904-1907). In addition, Neeb also photographed native sicknesses, see Groeneveld, p. 110.

²¹⁰ Win Pijbes, 'The Artists of the Tropics: The Artists of the Future,' *IIAS Newsletter* No. 20. Asian Art. Online. Available: <http://www.iias.nl/iiasn/23/asianart/23ART1.html>. 10 March 2006. Another source said it was in 1918 (Shavit, p. 18). It was around this time (1916) that Vicki Baum, the novelist, heard, saw or (as she claimed) was given some photographs, most probably of Krause's, from a friend.

Balinese Art at the Amsterdam artists' society *Arti et Amicitiae*²¹¹, he held an exhibition of his work, together with W. O. J. (Wijnand Otto Jan)

Nieuwenkamp.²¹² Both of them introduced Bali to the Europeans, who at that time could only imagine what Bali was like based on the writings of the novelists Multatuli²¹³ and Louis Couperus (1863-1923).²¹⁴ Soon after this exhibition, however, arrangements were made for the publication of Krause's book *Insel Bali*.²¹⁵

It was in Bangli that the young doctor (then in his late twenties) took over 4000 photographs,²¹⁶ mostly of bare-breasted women in the market and at their

²¹¹ *Arti et Amicitiae* was founded at Amsterdam in 1837.

²¹² This is the first exhibition of Balinese art held in Amsterdam. While Krause displayed some of his Bali photographs, Nieuwenkamp showed numerous Balinese objects. Similar exhibitions outside the Netherlands followed. Some works from Dutch collections were displayed in the Musée des Arts Décoratifs, Paris in 1927. The following year, part of Nieuwenkamp's private collection was on show in different museums: Hagen, Munich and again Paris, (Pijbes, 2006; Shavit, pp. 17-8).

After the exhibition, some of Krause's photos were also published in *Nederlandsch-Indië Oud en Nieuw*, see for example the 1918/1919 edition, 'For Evidently, the Fine Arts do not Thrive in the Indies' Koos van Brakel, pp. 103-128 (p. 107), *Pictures from the Tropics: Paintings by Western Artists during the Dutch Colonial Period in Indonesia*, ed. by Marie-Odette Scalliet et. al. (Amsterdam: Pictures Publishers-Royal Tropical Institute, 1999). Published on the occasion of the eponymous exhibition at the Tropenmuseum, Amsterdam, which took place from February 16th 1998 to January 3rd 1999. The Dutch edition is called *Indië omlijst Vier eeuwen schilderkunst in Nederlands-Indië*.

²¹³ Multatuli, *Max Havelaar or The Coffee Auctions of the Dutch Trading Company*, trans. by Roy Edwards (London: Penguin, 1987). Originally published as *Max Havelaar, of, De Koffiveilingen der Nederlandsche Handelmaatschappij* by Leyden, Sijthoff, London, Heinemann (1860). Multatuli is Edward Douwes Dekker's pen name. Dekker was an Assistant Resident of Lebak in West Java in 1856. Max Havelaar is protagonist who criticized the Dutch colonial policies such as the corrupt coffee trade. Popular interest in the Indies grew as soon as *Max Havelaar* appeared in the Netherlands (Groeneveld, et. al., p. 21.)

²¹⁴ Louis Couperus, *The Hidden Force*, trans. by Alexander Teixeira de Mattos (London: Quartet Book, 1992). Originally published in Dutch under the title *De Stille Kracht* in 1900 by L.J. Veen, Amsterdam. Couperus' great-grand mother was Malay and the big family had been in Malacca and Java since the 18th century. He was born and spent his childhood in the Indies; he only went back to Java three times. During his second stay, he remained there from March 1899 to February 1900 to write *De Stille Kracht*. He was then 36 and married although he had homosexual tendencies. See E.M. Beekman, Introduction to *The Hidden Force*, pp. 1-40, p. 9 and p. 20. As one of the best writers of Dutch literature and one of its classic novelists, five of Couperus' masterpieces enriched Dutch colonial literature. *The Hidden Force* is about the supernatural events and heated passions in the Tropics. It comes as no surprise that some critics labelled him as a writer of 'pornography' and 'improper decadence,' (Beekman, p. 12).

²¹⁵ Mabbett, 1988, p. 11.

²¹⁶ *ibid.*, p. 7.

bath. The album also contains vivid images of beautiful landscapes, temples, and Balinese people of all ages and ranks, such as priests, native royalty, farmers, and dancers. His two-volume photo collection, *Insel Bali* (1920) which consists of nearly 400 pictures, was published two years after the exhibition. Krause maintains that he took the photographs without the intention of providing a complete description of Bali. It was such a publishing success that its first printing was sold out within six to nine months.²¹⁷ Written in the aftermath of World War I, the book's success was probably because of the need for escapism after the Europe-wide war.²¹⁸ Furthermore, Europe's fascination with the decadent and exotic was in harmony with the mood created by the profusion of semi-naked bodies (such as Josephine Baker's), which were circulated in the form of postcards and via magazine journalism in the 1920s.

Even if the European readers did not understand German, for example, surely they 'understood' the album that provided them with images of the landscapes, rituals, rulers, and naked bodies of the bathers as recorded by Krause. The second edition was condensed into one volume, used only half of the pictures from the original version, and was circulated in 1922. It was written with the assistance of Karl With, an expert on the island. Both the first and the second editions were published in German. A revised edition (of the 1922 edition), also in German, was printed in 1926 in München.²¹⁹ Other readers from different parts of the world finally had more access to the photo-album. The book was later translated into various languages such as French and English; therefore, it was able to reach a wider audience and experienced even more success. A French

²¹⁷ Krause and With, p. vii; Shavit, p.18.

²¹⁸ Mabbett, 1988, p. 9; Hitchcock and Norris, p. 25.

²¹⁹ Krause, *Bali: Volk, Land, Tänze, Feste, Tempel* (München: Georg München, 1926).

translation appeared in Paris in 1930.²²⁰ These photo albums and their subsequent editions must have spoken for themselves—after all, the English translation appeared almost seventy years after the original German publication. The English translation came out in 1988, with its second printing in 2001, entitled *Bali 1912: Photographs and Reports by Gregor Krause*. The 2000 publication is the translation of the one-volume edition (1922).²²¹

Krause cannot help describing Balinese women in the way that professional anthropologists would do. It is worth quoting Krause verbatim at this stage; we can learn much from his testimony as an *in situ* observer:

Balinese women are beautiful, as beautiful as one can imagine, with a physiologically simple and dignified beauty, full of Eastern nobility and natural chastity. Their shoulders are almost of the same breadth as their hips. Carrying every burden on their heads with raised arms develops their shoulders and their muscular system, and the always powerful great chest muscle provides the most favourable foundation for beautifully formed breasts. The hips are strikingly slim, as are the legs, yet they are of almost masculine strength, a consequence of walking daily through steep valleys. Their gait is so splendid and functionally simple that one can see all the truths of the laws of statics revealed in a most magnificent way.²²²

Here, the colonial physician describes his observations in ways that reveal his preconceptions about Eastern beauty. He fulfils the reader's expectations regarding the detailed description of the exotic female. He emphasises the women's physical beauty as well as the burdens that form the female breasts. He describes what he saw in the village square and in the temple: 'In the village square I watched groups of girls and women appearing everywhere, all with heavy loads of fruits and vegetables in baskets on their heads. A few men joined each

²²⁰ Krause, *Bali: La Population, le pays, les densés, les fetes, les temples, l'art*, trans. by L. Ningler (Paris: Duchartre et Van Buggenhoudt, 1930).

²²¹ Krause and With, *Bali: People and Art*, trans. by E. J. Tips (Bangkok: White Lotus, 2000). The front cover was one of Krause's photographs depicting some bare breasted women in the market.

²²² Krause, 1988, p. 55.

group,²²³ and ‘From early morning until late afternoon, women and girls in endless procession have brought their offerings to the first day of a temple festival.’²²⁴

The bathing scene is the most frequently photographed in Krause’s *Insel Bali*. His photographs of women and young women, mostly in full figure, dominate his words. The captions under each photos are self-explanatory: *Frau sucht eine Badestelle*, *Frau beim Haarwaschen*, *Frau ordnet die Haare nach dem Bade*, *Badende Frau*, *Frau wäscht sich die Unterarme*, *Junge Frau prüft die Wärme des Wassers vorm Baden*, *Frau im Bade*, *Junges Mädchen beim Baden*, *Junges Mädchen unterm Wasserfall*, and *Nach dem Bade in der Sonne liegend*. Sometimes he uses the same captions twice: *Ältere Frau beim Baden*, *Mutter und Kind im Bade*, and *Mädchen und Frau beim Baden*.²²⁵ There are 26 nude themes in the 176 female photographs in the 1922 edition and about 37 are included in the 1988 publication (and 11 in the 2000 edition). These images ignited a worldwide obsession with the Balinese female figure and particularly the bare-breasted female. The craze for something Balinese was not only restricted to Europe, but also America and elsewhere.

Texts that show public bathing or nude bathers were a popular theme in literature, photography, and art, long before Krause’s *Insel Bali* was published. One well-known and documented example is the 18th century illustrations and descriptions found in Montesquieu’s *Lettres persanes*²²⁶ (1721) and in Lady Mary

²²³ *ibid.*, p. 71.

²²⁴ *ibid.*, p. 97.

²²⁵ There are ten nude bathers of Krause’ photographs added in the 1988 edition that had never been published in the earlier version.

²²⁶ Philippe Jullian, *The Orientalists: European Painters of Eastern Scenes*, trans. by Helga and Dinah Harrison (Oxford: Phaidon, 1977), p. 98.

Wortley Montague's French translation edition of the *Letters*²²⁷ (1805). Jean-Auguste-Dominique Ingres (1780-1867), a painter of the Orientalist school, painted his famous *Le Bain Turc* (Turkish Bath, 1862), which is inspired by these two texts. In *Le Bain Turc*, one of the naked women is posed like Ingres' famous painting *Odalisque and Slave* (1839) in a classic reclining pose. It is possible that the verbal descriptions of those slaves inspired Ingres. Although Ingres had never visited the bath himself,²²⁸ the painting he created is quite typical of the time and represents widely shared attitudes towards Oriental sensuality that likewise appear in the texts. Here, with or without alteration, there are certain mimetic or imitative functions between painting and literature. (The mimetic functions between literature and photographs will be dealt with accordingly in the next chapter.)

The image of Bali as part of the exotic/erotic island was promoted by descriptions of the 'bare breast habit', girls with offerings, and female bathers – the very images that dominated Krause's photo album. This depiction of bare-breasted women not only signified an 'uncivilized'²²⁹ character but also catered to

²²⁷ Jullian, p. 98; MaryAnne Stevens (ed.), *The Orientalists, Delacroix to Matisse: European Painters in North Africa and the Near East* (London: Royal Academy of Arts Catalogue published in association with Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1984), p. 17.

²²⁸ The ideas of the Orient have existed long before the invention of the camera. Brushes were made before cameras. Two of Eugène Delacroix's famous paintings *Scenes from the Massacres at Chios* (1824) and *Women of Algiers in their Apartment* (1834) were the result of an incident in the Greek war against the Ottoman Empire and his visual record of his expedition to Algeria respectively.

²²⁹ The trance dance of Bali is also considered a sign of primitivism and attracts social scientists. See for examples publication of *Trance in Bali* (New York: Columbia University), 1960 by Jane Belo and a motion picture titled *Trance and Dance in Bali* (New York: New York University Film Library), 1938 by Gregory Bateson, Jane Belo and Margaret Mead. According to Teng: 'Dancing natives' became a standard visual trope of primitivism, one commonly found in the Miao albums (Teng, p. 158).

Van Linschoten, who judged the Asiatic world according to Calvinist and republican norms, indicated that idolatry, homosexuality, slavery and the way people dress determined people's level of civilization, see Zandvliet, pp. 13-14; Nudity is sometimes used to indicate 'primitivity, underdevelopment, indecency and indigeneity', see Willem van Schendel 'A Politics of Nudity: Photographs of the 'Naked Mru' of Bangladesh,' *Modern Asian Studies*, 2 (2002), 341-374 (p. 341).

the established label of Bali as ‘a land of women’,²³⁰ thus promoting the image of sexually promiscuous and uninhibited women. In the context of the Dutch colonialism, such pictures rendered the ‘savage’ female body available to the voyeuristic colonial gaze, and thus subjected these women to civilisation and colonisation – terms that excited anthropologists, colonisers, and a subject that I will return to in Chapter 4.

The image of Bali as a land of exotic sensuality has long been promoted by descriptions of the nude bathers in Krause’s book. It would not be an exaggeration to say that Krause’s book of photographs had the single greatest impact on the spread of Bali’s fame until the publication of Covarrubias’ *Island of Bali* (1937). Although *The Last Paradise* (1930) was published much earlier, its impact was not as great as *Island of Bali*.²³¹ The timing of Covarrubias’ publication and his wider circle of friends made all the difference. The male norms are retained: patterns of description and ideals of beauty are repeated by Krause’s successors. That Krause played a pivotal role in circulating the image of the Balinese beauty is undeniable; however, the impact of his fellow travellers and ways of presenting the island and the women is a point that we shall attempt to determine.

1. 6. *The Last Paradise* (1930)

Hickman Powell²³² came to the island in 1928. He also wanted to escape from the so-called modern civilisation of industrialised America. He presents himself as

²³⁰ Yates, 1933, p. 76. Anderson noticed similar thing: ‘There are more women than men on the island, and the men may have more than one wife,’ (Anderson, 1934, p. 197).

²³¹ Vickers claimed that ‘Covarrubias’ *Island of Bali* has outlasted all other travel books to become the key descriptive work on Bali, known practically to all visitors to the island.’ Vickers, 1996, p. 114.

²³² Powell was one of the top reporters at the *New York Morning World*. He took leave for a trip around the world, Shavit, p. 65. For information on why André Roosevelt, the photographer, chose Powell to write the book, see Introduction to *The Last Paradise*, pp. ix - xvii.

one of the early 20th century versions of the ‘beachcomber’, a character that arises in the popular novels of the 1920s and 1930s.²³³ This American journalist, who heard about how the Balinese women dressed, expressed disappointment at the sight before him. He gives an example—that he does not want to see what other people have seen: he does not want to see something as much as he wants to perceive it. Powell wants to prove that other writers have lied in their descriptions of Bali:

I hardly know why I went to Bali. Perhaps it was to satisfy myself that other men had lied. For I was disillusioned. (...) I had suspected, but now I knew: travellers *were* liars. Buleleng. Corrugated iron roofs. Chinamen in white pyjamas. Bombay traders, lost tribe of burlesque show comedians, with their shirt tails hanging out. Sweat and mosquitoes. Tin cans, through all the East the worst malfeasance of the Standard Oil Company. Dutchmen in peaked official caps, with high-buttoned choking collars. The belles of Bali, where were they?²³⁴

The means of transport to Bali during Powell’s time was made possible because of the KPM, and almost every traveller who visited the island at that time benefited from the same itinerary. All the visitors during those years followed the same route and arrived at the same port: Buleleng.²³⁵ Therefore, it is not surprising (as we shall see in the following pages) that those travellers, in describing their first impression of Bali, made reference to similar scenes, such as

²³³ Vickers, *Travelling to Bali: Four Hundred Years of Journeys*, 1994, p. 25; Williams and Chong, p. 11.

²³⁴ Powell, 1985, pp. 3-4.

²³⁵ The port Buleleng had become the object of several photographers long before it was recorded in writings and in paintings. Isidore van Kinsbergen (1821-1905) had taken views of this Bali port between 1862 and 1868. Van Kinsbergen made some official photographic documentation of Javanese antiquities, (Chong, p. 53).

the unsightly and polluted harbour.²³⁶ In the case of the journey to Bali, the travellers expressed their first (negative) impressions as well as their predecessors' accounts, as explained below.

Powell describes the people in relation to their clothing, and in so doing has recourse to stereotypes. He tells his readers how certain clothes mark one's race or ethnic group. The perception was quite 'acceptable' in the late 1920s, but it would surely be considered racist today. While it is impossible for anyone to look at another culture in a way that is entirely free from their own prejudices or racial expectations, it may be harsh to call Powell's way of seeing racist; it is fair at least to call it colonialist. Powell's ideas coincide with the ideas of physiognomy,²³⁷ the image of the exotic nude, and certainly those surrounding race.²³⁸

²³⁶ Isabel Anderson, who arrived on Bali in the same year as Powell, described the view in terms that were to some extent positive: 'Buleleng, a small town, was disappointing from the water, with its few little red-roofed houses along the shore, many palms, and a range of green mountains in the distance – a hybrid sort of town,' Anderson, 1934, p. 195. She did not catalogue the appearance of the Chinese or Arabs that Powell and Covarrubias detailed. A few years later, Theodora Benson would describe Buleleng more positively: 'Arriving at Bali is very pretty, for it is all mountainous and green with some fringy palms and the nice little town of Bouleleng [sic] showing up good and well from the sea. It all looked very dawn-swept in the early morning. This wasn't the part of Bali that people stay in; they go south to Den Pasar, which is a good centre for activity and where the KPM have built them a right elegant hotel,' Benson, p. 166. It is clear how the men are so desperate to see the blouse-less women that they have to vent their disappointment in a straightforward manner.

²³⁷ E. Alexander Powell who visited Bali in February 1920 catalogued the Balinese women's eyes, noses, lips, and complexion before adding: 'But the chief charm of these island Eves is found, after all, not in their faces but in their figures – slender, rounded, willowy, deep-bosomed, such as Botticelli loved to paint.' For more discussion on physiognomy, see Robert Young, *Colonial Desire, Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race* (London: Routledge, 1995), p. 95, and Mary Cowling, *The Artist as Anthropologist: The Representation of Type and Character in Victorian Art* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1989). It is probably after 1933, the year in which de Keyser's novel appeared in France, that the popularity of the 'bare' aspects of the island increased within the literary world.

²³⁸ By the 1920s, anthropology had accrued sufficient products, both narrative and pictorial, made by its own practitioners to supersede the texts and photographs with which the discipline had been invented. Alison Devine Nordstrom, 'Persistent Images: Photographic Archives in Ethnographic Collections' in Photogenic Papers, *The Australian Journal of Media & Culture* vol. 6 no. 2 (1991) ed. by John Richardson. Electronic. Available: <http://wwwmcc.murdoch.edu.au/ReadingRoom/6.2/Nordstrom.html>. 11 July 2005.

Powell, whether consciously or unconsciously, produces knowledge about the Other and circulates colonial stereotypes. The natives in question were the objects of the colonial and racial discourses at that time;²³⁹ therefore, his travel writing is unavoidably implicated in the reproduction of colonialism. By reading Powell's 'colonial text,' the readers or future travellers are carried away by the mood, regardless of their colonial attitude towards the Dutch – the colonisers. The idea of racism as a colonial preserve will be dealt with in Chapter 5.

Visually, Powell's description of the Other in relation to their different clothing can be compared to the depiction of natives with their traditional costumes and artefacts, which is quite similar to the practice in Western anthropological writings. Powell's projection of cultural 'others' into different clothing bears a striking resemblance to the labelling of museum artefacts or to the categorisation of ethnic groups that are often used in Western anthropological discourse. By recounting the Chinese and the Dutch, who are fully clothed, Powell prepares himself and his readers for his unclothed figures. This is an act that Johannes Fabian refers to as the 'denial of coevalness.'²⁴⁰ Powell distances himself; the people surround him (the Dutch, the Chinese) and the absent Balinese women in such a way as to create a gap between the observed and the observer,

²³⁹ Lothrop Stoddard's *Rising Tide of Colour* 22 (London: Chapman and Hall: 1922). First published in 1920). Published simultaneously in America, England and appeared in France as *Le Flot montant des peuples de couleur*, followed by Maurice Muret's *The Twilight of the White Races* (1926) which was the translation of *Le Crépuscule des nations blanches* (1925). Written in the aftermath of World War I, *Rising Tide of Colour* 22 saw that cataclysm as a weakening of white racial unity – a "white civil war" – of which other races would hasten to take advantage. Stoddard was inspired by Madison Grant's racial classic *The Passing of the Great Race, or The Racial Basis of European History* (New York: Scribner's, 1918; orig. publ. 1916). Grant's racial classic exemplifies the patrician pedigree of early 20th century racism. In fact, William Z. Ripley, author of *The Races of Europe*, a large, scholarly volume of 1899, had described the three races. Ripley called the three: Alpine, Mediterranean, and Teutonic.

²⁴⁰ Johannes Fabian, *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes its Object* (New York: Columbia University, 1983), p. 1 and p. 31.

which is the practice in traditional Western ethnography. This enumeration of people and their clothing, as we shall see later, is repeated by future travellers who come after Powell.

Do we see what we want to see, as we want to see it, and as we want to perceive it? It seems that for Powell, the answer is 'yes'. When Powell travelled to Bali in April 1928, racism was still strong. As the twenties ceased roaring, certainly there were many changes in perception all over the Western world, and people began to see the colonised people on non-racialist grounds.

It was also from this standpoint, specifically through the researches of Boas' students, that the actual historical connections between African and African American cultures began to be appreciated in the 1930s on non-racialist grounds.²⁴¹

Powell is not alone in enthusiastically expecting to see interesting top-less women, for there would be many visitors seeking similar images.

After discussing Powell's impressions upon his arrival, it is useful to analyse how he uses his preconceptions, his expected expectations, and his imagination. The imagination or absent images may become a substitute for voyeurism. Powell is a man who enjoys the presence of naked bathing women, but not in the photographs, and not in paintings. Painters or photographers who name their sitters or models imply that there is an emotional tie between them.²⁴²

²⁴¹ George Hutchinson, *The Harlem Renaissance in Black and White* (Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University, 1997), p. 183.

²⁴² Adrien Jean Le Mayeur de Merpres, the Belgian painter, arrived on Bali in 1932 at the age of 52. Le Mayeur remained there until shortly before his death. He met a beautiful *legong* dancer, who soon became his only model and lover. He married Ni Pollok when she was 18 in 1935, Spruit, 'Le Mayeur', pp. 95-107 (p. 95). One of his paintings is titled *Ni Pollok with fan* (n.d.). According to Michael Levey, the presence of the artist's favourite models and the way they were identified, by naming or portraiture, demonstrated that emotional ties existed between the artist and the sitter. Therefore, Levey continues, 'the particular features and expression of the model's face assumes greater importance.' (These 'emotional ties' as revealed later determine the expression of the photographers' models.) However, '[o]nce the artist identifies the model, either by naming or portraiture, the attitude of the artist and viewer seems to change and the sitter is no

The following discussion shows the young man's special yearning for Renang.²⁴³ By extracting the absent images of Francesca and Rowena²⁴⁴ from his memory, Powell was struggling to defend himself ('let's not be finicky', he says); he was quick to defend himself for fear of being accused of degrading a 'white' man's taste – there was also the issue of prestige in preferring a native over a 'white' woman. He writes:

And now, while some feminine readers squirm squeamishly, I must insist that these people of Bengkel were personally quite as meticulous as our great grandparents, and undoubtedly Renang was more so than Paolo's Francesca or *Ivanhoe's* Rowena. There are virtues in the fastidiousness of this Age of Listerine, but let's not be finicky.²⁴⁵

This again is an absent image of Powell's fictitious/imagined standard beauty. His mind longs for Renang. It is obvious that the idea of desiring a native woman troubled him. Then Powell turns to 'common sense'; he wants to justify his craving for a native girl.

Eyes differ. When Harry Hervey saw the dancers of Angkor, he saw the Apsarases of Cambodian legend in a poetry of motion. When Harry A. Franck saw them, he observed that they had dirty necks.²⁴⁶

Powell is writing for an American audience, an audience that was also informed of the fact that, after the publication of his book, a moving picture would soon be released by Andre Roosevelt (the man who persuaded Powell to write the book).²⁴⁷

It is interesting to see how one's education and social milieu construct attitudes. In Powell's writing about Bali, he situates himself as an American man

longer nude but naked.' Michael Levey, *The Nude: Themes and Painters in the National Gallery* (London: National Gallery, 1976).

²⁴³ Powell, 1985, p. 49. Powell mentions Renang on almost every page. Renang was Kumis' beautiful niece and Kumis (meaning moustache) was the head of the village of Bengkel where Powell and Roosevelt lived while on Bali.

²⁴⁴ Walter Scott, *Ivanhoe, a Romance* (London: Archibald Constable, 1820).

²⁴⁵ Powell, 1985, p. 50.

²⁴⁶ *ibid.*, p. 51.

²⁴⁷ André Roosevelt, Introduction to *The Last Paradise*, pp. ix-xvii.

who desires a young Balinese woman. However, Powell is too weak to confront the ideology of the Americans as he continues:

Consciously or unconsciously, like every American whose life had been bounded by two oceans and who is not one of an esoteric group, I had a Credo. It might be more or less approximated as follows:
Any coloured person is in all respects inferior.
A beautiful woman is one with face and ankles like those in hosiery advertisements.
A beautiful skin is white, like mine. Religion is Christianity.
Beautiful dancing is what you see in Mr. Ziegfeld's shows.
Beautiful music is that made by Paul Whiteman or (theoretically) Toscanini.²⁴⁸

Unfortunately, Renang is not the woman whose face and ankles can be seen in hosiery advertisements. Moreover, this Balinese girl is not the showgirl of Florenz Ziegfeld (1869-1932). Nevertheless, Powell adores Renang. Does he hate being 'White'? Is he jealous of the native men, his protagonists?

Maybe it was Ida Bagus Gidéh that Renang liked. I remembered that she had gone to speak to him that day beside the sea. I looked at Renang, dancing there, head twitching, fingers flying, all unconscious of my gaze. What a pair they would make. As I have said, there was no sex-obsession among these brown folk. But I was white. My romantic imagination would not down [sic].²⁴⁹

It is not Francesca, nor is it Rowena, that Powell wants. Powell's craving for Renang is no longer in his mind; it has become a physical desire. Here is the

²⁴⁸ Powell, 1985, p. 35. Florenz Ziegfeld was an American theatrical showman who produced a series of spectacular shows known as Ziegfeld Follies based on Follies Bergères in Paris. On the topic of his girls, see Linda Mizejewski, *Ziegfeld Girl, Image and Icon in Culture and Cinema* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University, 1999). Josephine Baker is, in fact, one of Ziegfeld's girls. E. Alexander Powell who arrived on Bali before Hickman Powell shares his expected expectation: 'I half expected to find a Balinese edition of the Ziegfeld Follies chorus waiting to greet me with demonstrations of welcome and garland of flowers,' (Powell, 1921, pp. 143-144). He too gives reference to Ziegfeld and Tahiti's girls. Like Hickman Powell, he remembered other half-nude images, the images of Ziegfeld's girls: 'Indeed, I have seen girls far more scantily clad on the stage of the Ziegfeld Roof or the Winter Garden than I ever have in those distant lands which have not yet received the blessings of civilization,' (Powell, 1921, p. 150). Powell journeyed in *Negros* since KPM fleets were not in operation yet.

²⁴⁹ Powell, 1985, pp. 64-5. The fact that there is no equivalent for the word 'love' in the Balinese language is discussed by many others, including Yates and Powell himself. The first observes: 'Upon inquiry I found there is no word in Balinese language for love' (Yates, 1933, p. 43); the latter: 'It was not romantic love that sprang between them. In their tongue there was no word of love,' Powell, 1985, p. 67.

obsession of one 'white' man who is trapped by the norm or standard values of his fellow Americans. However, unlike the image of the unnamed naked bathing woman discussed previously, there is one particular fantasy that he prefers to hold on to, which is the imagination of a naked Renang. The fantasy of a man whose imagination of the 'breasts were golden domes'²⁵⁰ never subsides. Month by month, he has been watching Renang's breasts develop. Has he forgotten how they look?

Now, from the row of kneeling dancing girls arose a tiny slender form. Renang! I had forgotten her. She wheeled in the centre of the dancing square. Her arms extended were a wood nymph's incantation. Renang was growing up. Renang would soon be ripe for marriage. Beneath the binding of her golden scarf shone promissory undulations of her budding breasts.²⁵¹

Powell might have forgotten Renang, but not her breasts. While dancing, like most Balinese dancers, Renang covers her breasts, but to Powell's eyes, she is 'bare'. Here, there is interplay between the present and absent female body.

Travel as a motive has been deployed in a variety of modes: as real, as imaginary, as virtual travel, as time travel, and as travel in hyperreality. Again, it has always also been concerned, in one way or another, with constructing notions of the Self and the Other, or of utopian and dystopian worlds. It is perhaps stating the obvious to say that this also applied to travelling photographers, who, in representing Others, could not avoid revealing themselves. Unlike Powell, they failed to notice how colonial power was inscribed within particular forms of visual representation. (Photographers and their objects will be discussed in Chapter 2).

²⁵⁰ *ibid.*, p. 120.

²⁵¹ *ibid.*, p. 198.

1. 7. *Island of Bali*²⁵² (1937, 1973)

Miguel Covarrubias²⁵³ (1904-1957), a noted and talented Mexican caricaturist,²⁵⁴ book illustrator,²⁵⁵ set designer,²⁵⁶ and painter²⁵⁷ first visited Bali in 1930.²⁵⁸

²⁵² First published by Cassell in London (1937), *Island of Bali* was later reprinted in Singapore by Periplus Editions in 1973 from the 1946 publication by Alfred A. Knopf. It reached a wider audience not only during Covarrubias' time but also posthumously. Six separate issues were excerpted in *Asia* magazine. The same magazine published two of the author's Balinese paintings as its April and June cover in 1937 (Williams, p. 82). In 1996, José G. Benítez Muro, a Mexican scholar, reproduced films taken by the Covarrubiases during their Bali travels. The result was a series of five videos entitled *La Mirada de Covarrubias* (Covarrubias' Gaze), which was nominated in the International Emmy Awards in the following year. Following this success, in 1998, the same scholar then produced *La Isla de Bali* (Island of Bali) using the Covarrubiases' original footage shot in 1930 and 1933 (Williams and Chong, p. 113).

²⁵³ Covarrubias travelled to Bali when he was a student of anthropology. He was only 26 when he wrote this book. Although he never took up anthropology as his profession, from 1942-1949 Covarrubias was the site director of the excavations in Tlatilco, Mexico, where he worked with Mexican and American archaeologists. He developed theoretical concepts that are an important step in explaining today's theories on Mesoamerican origins. In 1943, Covarrubias started teaching at the Escuela Nacional de Antropología e Historia (National School of Anthropology and History) by the invitation of Daniel F. Rubín de la Borbolla, the director, (Williams and Chong, p. 112).

²⁵⁴ Covarrubias' first caricature appeared in the *Vanity Fair* 24 January 1924 issue, where he was one of the contributors. Two months later, in his first exhibition at Whitney Studio Club, he exhibited his original caricatures that had appeared in the same magazine, (Williams, p. 20). In 1925, the collection of his caricatures was published in *The Prince of Wales and Other Famous Americans*. In December, Covarrubias held a one-man show at the Dudensing Gallery New York featuring many of the caricatures from this. Some of Covarrubias' collections can also be found in Beverly J. Cox, Miguel Covarrubias and Denna Jones Anderson, *Miguel Covarrubias Caricatures* (Washington: The Smithsonian Institution, 1985). This is a catalogue of an exhibition held at the National Portrait Gallery, Washington D.C. from 16 November 1984 to 13 January 1985.

²⁵⁵ As an illustrator, Covarrubias' illustrations ran in many American publications from as early as 1926 (John Handy's *Blues: An Anthology, New York City*) to 1953 (Alfonso Caso's *El pueblo del sol* or *People of the Sun*). Other illustrations include John Riddell's *Meaning No Offense* and Theodore Canot's *Adventures of an African Slaves* (both 1928), Taylor Gordon's *Born To Be* (1929), John Riddell's *The John Riddle Murder Case, A Philo Vance Parody* and John Huston's *Frankie and Johnny* (both in 1930), Marc Chadourne's *China* (1931). For complete lists, see 'A Covarrubias Chronology' by Luis Alberto de la Garza C. in *Covarrubias in Bali*, pp. 110-113.

²⁵⁶ Covarrubias was not entirely inexperienced in theatrical design. In 1921, he created sets for the centennial *Noche Mexicana*. In 1925, Covarrubias designed a set for Rancho Mexicano, a number in the Theatre Guild's *Garrick Gaieties*. It is here that he met his future wife, the dancer Rosemonde Cowan, the star of this piece, whom he married in 1930. (His wife's stage name was Rose Rolanda.) In November, he designed costumes and sets for Theatre Guild's *Androcles and the Lion* by George Bernard Shaw. He also designed sets for *La Revue Nègre* with Josephine Baker, produced by Le Théâtre des Champs-Élysées in Paris, France. In 1955, Covarrubias designed the stage sets and costumes for the Mexican National Ballet Company: *Salon México* (Mexico Salon), *La Comedia del Arte* (The Comedy of Art), and *El Alma en Pena* (The Afflicted Soul), (Williams, p. 41); (Williams and Chong, p. 110 and p. 113).

²⁵⁷ After his Bali trip, Covarrubias took painting seriously and soon his *Balinese Dancers* painting was exhibited in the *Dance in Art* exhibition held by the Brooklyn Museum from 24 January – 15 March 1936 (Williams, p. 82). The coloured illustrations in the *Island of Bali* were reproduced courtesy of The Condé Nast.

²⁵⁸ The Covarrubiases set their first journey on 3 May 1930. The 3 months they had intended spending there became nine. On the way back from the first visit, Covarrubias and his newly wed wife stopped in Paris to see the Colonial Exposition where 'Bali' was on display in the Dutch

Covarrubias was famous in the world of visual art,²⁵⁹ he drew sketches of Harlem nightlife, including the sets for Josephine Baker's performances.²⁶⁰

Covarrubias went to Bali with Rose, his wife. They arrived not without preconceived mental images of the island. Like Baum, they had seen some fabulous photographs of the island that motivated them to set out on the journey:

We had seen a splendid album of Bali photographs (*Bali*, by Gregor Krause), and gradually we had developed an irresistible desire to see the island, until one spring day of 1930 we found ourselves, rather unexpectedly, on board the *Cingalese Prince*, a freighter bound for the Dutch East Indies.²⁶¹

In the case of travel features, the texts often contained accounts of the travel experiences of people the authors met as well as those of the authors themselves. For example, like some of the female travellers mentioned earlier,

pavilion (Williams, p. 67; Williams and Chong, p. 12, 16; Oja, p. 60). Their second trip to Bali in the summer of 1933 was partly funded by the Guggenheim Foundation. Later in 1940, Covarrubias was granted another Guggenheim Fellowship. The result was *Mexico South: Isthmus of Tehuantepec* (1946). It is also in this year that the Covarrubiases moved to Mexico permanently. (Williams and Chong, p. 112).

²⁵⁹ In the thirties, Covarrubias' illustrations appeared in *Life*, *Time*, *The New Yorker*, *Theatre Arts*, and *Fortune*. At the Ninth Annual Exhibition of Advertising Art in May 1930, Covarrubias won the National Art Directors' Medal for an advertisement he had done for Steinway & Sons, the piano manufacturer. The cash prize enabled the couples to go on an extended honeymoon to the South Pacific and Bali (Shavit, p. 108; Williams, p. 60). (Bali has today become one of the world's romantic wedding locations – a celebrity couple Christina Aguilera and Jordan Bratman went to Bali for their honeymoon at the end of 2005.) Later, in July of 1937, Covarrubias' cover for *Vogue* won an Art Director's award for *Best Magazine Cover* of the year (Williams, p. 72).

²⁶⁰ Phyllis Rose, *Jazz Cleopatra: Josephine Baker in her Time* (London: Vintage, 1991), p. 3; Williams and Chong, p. 110.

²⁶¹ Covarrubias, p. xvii. This 'irresistible urge' phrase is frequently quoted. See for example, Williams and Chong, p. 11, and Vickers, 1996, p. 114. It was Krause's 1926 edition that the Covarrubiases read (Williams, pp. 60-1). In addition, Covarrubias had read the manuscript written by Hickman Powell and seen photographs taken by André Roosevelt of *The Last Paradise* (1985) and lent by his friend Alexander King who at that time was working on the illustrations of the book, a fact that Covarrubias did not openly mention in *Island of Bali*. It was also King who arranged for Covarrubias to meet Roosevelt, who later showed Covarrubias clips from *Goon-Goon* (Williams and Chong, p. 11). Covarrubias also read 'Artist Adventures on the Island of Bali,' by Franklin Price Knott written in *National Geographic* in 1928. The article that was illustrated with photographs must have impressed Covarrubias for the copy of the magazine was still kept in his archives even after he died in 1957 (Williams and Chong, p. 12). In his book, Covarrubias also mentioned (and had probably read) Alfred R. Wallace's *The Malay Archipelago* published in 1869 and Raffles' *History of Java* (1817).

The journey itself took six leisurely weeks to get to Bali from America. Ships went to Batavia from the United States, or Europe or Australia. This was of course tourism for the upper classes (Vickers, 1996, p. 95.)

Covarrubias gives the impression that he arrived on Bali without any prior knowledge of the place. However, he later admitted that, in addition to Krause's photo essay, he had seen tourist pamphlets and 'a splendid album of Bali photographs'.²⁶² He had some contact with the island prior to his journey.

Keeping in mind the few publications and promotions on Bali during those years, Covarrubias' views may not have been shaped by tourism alone, but by his wide circle of friends and his acquaintance with Spies.²⁶³ In this respect, Covarrubias foregrounds the authenticity of his writing by obscuring his secondary sources.

Covarrubias openly expressed that he was enchanted by the tourist promotion of the bare breasts of Bali. Undoubtedly, tourism played a part in promoting colonial Bali.²⁶⁴ When he arrived in Buleleng, it was the bleak atmosphere that greeted him²⁶⁵ and not the bare-breasted women. Although he finally found what he wanted to see, the following excerpt reveals how the advertisements attracted him:

The car darts through narrow streets lined with dingy little shops of cheap crockery and cotton goods run by emaciated Chinese in undershirts or by Arabs with forbidding black beards. Javanese in black velvet skull-caps mingle with Dutch officials in pith helmets and high starched collars, but the beautiful Balinese of steamship pamphlets are not to be seen anywhere. The people on the streets are ugly and unkempt, and instead of the much

²⁶² Covarrubias, 1973, p. xvii.

²⁶³ Williams, p. 66, and Vickers (1996, p. 115). While Vickers described Spies as the 'ultimate romantic European artist seeking escape from Europe' (Vickers, *Travelling to Bali*, 1994, p. 239), Covarrubias referred to Spies, who later became his close friend, as 'Bali's most famous resident.' Covarrubias had admired and had cut out reproductions of Spies' paintings of Russia in 1923 (Covarrubias, 1973, p. xxi). After Covarrubias' Bali trip, there was a subtle shift in his work: from a maker of drawings he became a maker of paintings. On 18 January 1932, Covarrubias exhibited thirty-two of his Balinese oil paintings at the Valentine Gallery and Diego Rivera wrote the foreword to his one-man show catalogue (Williams, p. 69). See also Jeannette ten Kate, 'Painting in a Garden of Eden,' pp. 129-140, esp. pp.132-34.

²⁶⁴ See for example tourism posters such as *See Bali* painted by J. Korver (1939).

²⁶⁵ First time visitors to Bali came with expectations and preformed ideas about Bali. To their disappointment, this bleak sight is repeated by many different writers due to the port in the northern Buleleng.

publicized beauties, there are only uninteresting women in not very clean blouses.²⁶⁶

While Powell relates the scenes to more ancient images, Covarrubias compares Bali to a more familiar paradise at that time (the South Seas). Like Powell, the Covarrubias and many other visitors who travelled by sea landed ‘on the primitive wooden pier’ and described a bleak Buleleng – the port – thus: ‘the eternal tin roofs and dilapidated Chinese houses, the concrete steamship office, and the scraggy coolies of every small port of the Indies’.²⁶⁷ In a similar manner to Powell, Covarrubias was also gazing at the people surrounding him: the Chinese ‘in undershirts’, the Arabs with ‘forbidding black beards’, the Javanese wearing their ‘black velvet skull-caps’, and the Dutch in ‘pith helmets’.²⁶⁸ (The writings of some upper-class writers such as Gorer also have a tendency towards such stereotyping and racialist understandings, an issue that I further develop in Chapter 2.)

Here, Covarrubias articulates how the KPM’s pamphlets captivated him.²⁶⁹ He was disappointed, as he did not find what he was hoping to see. Unsurprisingly, Covarrubias’ previous pictorial readings forced him to see those images for real. However, he was still disappointed. Although Covarrubias does not express his disappointment openly, it is clear that he is eager to see the beautiful, blouse-less Balinese women. Here, Covarrubias’ experience (and Powell’s) fits neatly with the argument that John Collier, Jr. and Malcolm Collier make: ‘We see what we want

²⁶⁶ Covarrubias, 1973, pp. xviii-xix. The Spanish edition, *La Isla de Bali*, was published in 2004.

²⁶⁷ *ibid.*, p. xviii.

²⁶⁸ *ibid.*, pp. xviii-xix.

²⁶⁹ It was Krause’s photographs that inspired them to visit Bali (*ibid.*, p. xvii; Williams, pp. 60-1).

to see, as we want to see, as we want to perceive it'.²⁷⁰ Covarrubias' expectations of nature and the beauty of the island are at long last fulfilled when he arrives in Bangli.²⁷¹ He finally finds what he wants to see:

Soon he is on the road again; the car winds and turns sharp curves down the mountain, the fog vanishes, and the air becomes warmer and clearer. Tropical vegetation reappears, and riding among tall palms and enormous banana trees, he enters Bangli, which is at last like the Bali of the photographs.²⁷²

Early travellers to Bali describe their 'discoveries' using the perceptual tools and references that are already known to the world; and this is not restricted to the best aspects of the destination alone, but also to the next destination down the scale of available comparisons. In order to understand how literatures attracted more writers to write about or to visit Bali, it is necessary at this point to study how Covarrubias introduced Bali to his readers and how he circulated Krause's ideas.

Take the following passage from the Introduction to *Island of Bali*.

TODAY ALMOST EVERYBODY has heard of Bali. To some it means a smart place to go, one of the many ports in a round-the-world cruise; to others it brings mental images of brown girls with beautiful breasts, palm trees, rolling waves, and all the romantic notions that go to make a South Sea Island paradise.²⁷³

Covarrubias relates the '*belles* of Bali' to the exotic and erotic Oriental figures that were widely known to the general European public. While Powell associates beauty with the more ancient and anthropologically related postures such as the

²⁷⁰ John Collier Jr, and Malcolm Collier, *Visual Anthropology: Photography as a Research Method* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico, 1990), p. 5. Compare to the use of 'expected expectations' by Jedamski.

²⁷¹ Bangli is the place where Gregor Krause, the medical doctor, was stationed. It is here that Krause took most of the pictures for his book. Thilly Weissenborn also came to Bangli to take some photos and Covarrubias insisted on making a short stop to this village even before he reached the hotel (Williams and Chong, p. 14).

²⁷² Covarrubias, 1973, p. xix.

²⁷³ *ibid.*, p. xvii. Bali was discovered after the South Seas. Depending on where the ships came from, its position was either the last of the Pacific islands, or the final outpost of Asia, (Hitchcock and Norris, p. 25).

earthen pot, Covarrubias compares the Balinese beauty to a similar ‘belle’ from another romantic island: the South Seas. To describe to others what Bali is, Covarrubias places Bali in the same category as Tahiti. For Covarrubias, Bali has more to offer because it combines all the good qualities and beauties of the South Seas paradise.

Having seen Krause’s photographs, Covarrubias uses his personal experience to describe Balinese women. He compares the Balinese with the people on other islands. His illustration links the island to romantic and exotic views that the Europeans held. When Covarrubias recounts the images of ‘brown girls with beautiful breasts’ he revives memories of women from the South Sea Islands. These images reached viewers around the globe and perpetuated ideas and fictions about Balinese people. The cover of the latest reprint shows a picture of four Balinese girls; all are bare-breasted, and each of them carries an offering on their head.²⁷⁴ Without any revisions at all, except for the different cover illustration, this book was last printed in 2002.²⁷⁵ These pictures – their depiction of the female figure with ‘an earthen pot above her head’ – have left an incredible mark on the Western imagination, creating representations of Oriental female figures that have had tremendous staying power—until well into the 20th century²⁷⁶ and indeed into the 21st (2002).

²⁷⁴ *Balinese Girls and their Offerings* is one of Covarrubias’ paintings that is included in his *Island of Bali* (1937); it was reproduced for the 2002 cover. His other painting, *Baris Gede – Ceremonial War Dance* is reproduced as the cover of Baum’s *A Tale from Bali*.

²⁷⁵ The back cover of the 2002 edition claims that the book is ‘still regarded by many as the most authoritative text on Bali’ and that the author’s account is ‘as fresh as insightful as it was 50 years ago’.

²⁷⁶ Available in a White Lotus version (2000) as the first English translation of the 1922 edition, *Insel Bali* has not been revised. It pays no attention to the developments of the last 80 years of modern Bali. The bare breast images continue to circulate, with the image of *Banana Saleswomen at the River* on the front cover and *A Woman from Bangli* on the back (Krause and With, 2000).

How we describe things depends on what we have seen in the past and where we have travelled before. In this respect, it is necessary to engage again with the concept of contextualisation. In short, in order to describe Bali, one has to use similarities and comparisons; the speaker needs to fill in the gaps. This is an example of what Kenneth Burke calls contextual definition: 'To tell what a thing is, you place it in term of something else. This idea of locating, or placing, is implicit in our word for definition itself'.²⁷⁷ In addition, Tim Youngs agrees that 'This proposition imperial or colonial context, is an expression of identity based on sameness to and yet remoteness from the members of the home societies'.²⁷⁸

This is another way of saying that travellers or writers cannot help comparing home societies to the Other's societies. And this idea is supported by Susan Bassnett, who maintains that '...travel writers constantly position themselves in relation to their point of origin in a culture and the context they are describing'.²⁷⁹ Here images and perceptions of the Other are created based on the Self and what the target audience knows about the subject. However, the accumulation of these images is not restricted to literary texts alone. The representations of Bali are also shaped by visual images, moving or still. (I will deal with the latter in Chapter 2). What male and female travellers have in common is that they have their own pre-conceptions before arriving on the island. They bring their own literary baggage with them, and in the process their expectations, contextualisation and visualisation of Bali and its women are imbued with meaning derived from the writers' own experience, literary baggage, and imagination. They

²⁷⁷ Kenneth Burke, *A Grammar of Motives* (Berkeley: University of California, 1969), p. 24.

²⁷⁸ Tim Youngs, *Travellers in Africa: British Travelogues, 1850-1900* (Manchester: Manchester University, 1994), p. 3.

²⁷⁹ Susan Bassnett, *Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993), p. 99.

continue to promote the well-established image of the Balinese as savage yet exotic.

The relationship between literature and travel is rich and complex. For professional writers in particular, literature can provide both an initial inspiration and a continuing reference-point during different phases of travel. Such literary inspirations may, of course, take many forms, ranging from historical and archaeological works and travel writings from an earlier age to works of the imagination.²⁸⁰ These may include feature films or documentary motion pictures.

1. 8. Visual Attractions

As previously mentioned, visual images of Bali do not come in still photographs only, but also moving pictures. Indeed, the effect of motion pictures is greater than that of photography. To imagine and to visualise are two separate activities.

Imagination, with the help of technology, may become real and visible. It is like magic. In late colonial Indonesia, due to the advances in technology,²⁸¹ to visualise something from one's imagination —let alone reality—is not easy, at least it was not easy for Tantri when she arrived in Bali in the 1930s. We have discussed how visitors have prior knowledge before going to Bali. Those travellers revealed how the textual and visual images (printed images) influence the way they see Bali. We also observed that some of their perceptions about Bali changed. Tantri is the one

²⁸⁰ Clive J. Christie, 'British Literary Travellers in Southeast Asia in an Era of Colonial Retreat', *Modern Asian Studies*, 28 (1994), 673-737 (p. 673).

²⁸¹ Motion pictures have a greater effect compared to photographs during these years. The advance of film technology involved the transition from silent film to sound. The emergence of motion pictures began in 1927; however, as early as 1926, Germans were filming on Bali; they filmed the famous and fantastical events of a temple festival, a cremation, and of course many forms of music and dance. The film directors were advised by Gregor Krause. See Ruud Spruit, *Artists on Bali* (Amsterdam: The Pepin), 1997, p. 61. In later years, Spies replaced Krause in giving advice to other film directors.

who describes how moving images persuade her to see Bali. Upon entering a palace, which she first thinks is a temple, Tantri describes what she sees.

The scene that met my eyes might have come straight from the Arabian Nights. It was a tableau that even the moguls of Hollywood could not have imagined in their wildest flight from reality. I stood dumbfounded and wondered if I had a fever and were imagining things.²⁸²

When Tantri sees a movie she thinks it is real; however, when she sees reality she thinks she is ‘imagining things’. The present image blurs with the past, absent image. It should be acknowledged that Tantri’s visualisation of Bali derives from her previous knowledge/experience, imagination, and current experience. First, her observations of the temple processions consist of a set of ideas associated with the Arabian Nights. Here, there is a ‘substitution of what is familiar for what is alien’.²⁸³ Secondly, her understanding of Bali as the island of the gods enables her to convey the fact that ‘the Balinese people do not object to strangers entering their temples’.²⁸⁴ This is a wrong substitution for she has actually entered a palace – not a temple. Her reference to Hollywood is a movie that she watched in 1932, *Bali, the Last Paradise*.²⁸⁵ ‘The moguls of Hollywood’ had visualised Bali as a moving image, a picture, a referent that is present as an object in Tantri’s eyes when she views it. It is real. When she witnesses Bali in person, she believes she has seen an ‘authentic’ Bali. The Bali that was ‘aglow with an agrarian pattern of peace, contentment, beauty, and love’²⁸⁶ is different from the Bali in front of her. She begins to hesitate and wonders whether it was the visualisation of the

²⁸² Tantri, 1960, p. 25. With the image of a temple in her mind, Tantri went on by telling her readers about ‘temple bells’, the ‘priest’ and ‘offerings to the gods’.

²⁸³ Introduction to *Images and Empires: Visuality in Colonial and Postcolonial Africa*, Paul S. Landau and Deborah D. Kaspin (Berkeley: University of California, 2002), p. 1.

²⁸⁴ Tantri, 1960, p. 7.

²⁸⁵ *ibid.*, p. 5.

²⁸⁶ *ibid.*

filmmaker or ‘the scene that met her eyes’ that was merely imagination. In short, Tantri’s image of Bali is the result of the accumulation of visual components – either real or imaginary. This again suggests that eyewitness accounts are always constructed by the imaginary.

India is frequently used as a reference point for Bali in relation to the Hindu religion and colonialism.²⁸⁷ It is no surprise that upon arriving on Bali in the 1930s, Tantri was told how Bali had a lot in common with India:

As we chatted over our coffee, my new-found friend told me that Bali was the child of India. Of all the islands of the Dutch East Indies, only Bali was Hindu. The Balinese, although surrounded by Moslems on the other islands, had clung for hundreds of years to the customs and religion of India.²⁸⁸

K’tut Tantri, who went to Bali to paint, claims that in 1932, she had seen a film titled *Bali, the Last Paradise*. She was so inspired that she decided to set sail immediately for Bali on her own.²⁸⁹ It is not clear whether Tantri merely forgot the title of the film or just wanted to conceal her source. There is no film made under such a title²⁹⁰, but there is a book called *The Last Paradise* (1930), written by Hickman Powell. In this instance, Tantri may not have remembered correctly regarding the source or original film she viewed. *Goona-goona: Authentic Melodrama of the Isle of Bali*,²⁹¹ released in 1932, is possibly the film that Tantri watched. Although known as the ‘enchanted island’, Bali is also famous for its

²⁸⁷ There are plenty of comparative studies between India and Indonesia from the viewpoint of colonialism, see, for example, the special issue of *Itinerario*, 11 (1987), *The Heyday of Colonial: Rule India and Indonesia from the 1830s to 1914*.

²⁸⁸ Tantri, 1960, p. 14.

²⁸⁹ Tantri said: ‘My decision was sudden but it was irrevocable’ (Tantri, 1960, p. 5.)

²⁹⁰ Timothy Lindsey, *The Romance of K’tut Tantri and Indonesia* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1997), p. 79.

²⁹¹ Although the movie was filmed in 1928 and re-filmed in 1929 due to a processing accident, it was not released until 16 September 1932. The distribution rights of *Goona-Goona* were sold for \$35,000 and it was shown for sixteen weeks at the Marigny Theatre on the Champs-Élysées, Paris (Denis p. 52). *Goona-Goona* soon became popular in New York City. It opened at the Cameo and

magic: *goona-goona*. Goona-goona, which means ‘bare breasts’,²⁹² is pronounced and written as *guna-guna*, a Malay and Indonesian term for love magic.

The film that André Roosevelt and Armand Denis produced in 1932 is a musical film about class. It is a love story, a melodrama, about a Balinese prince who falls in love with a low class girl. Comparable to the practice in India, people in Bali use a Balinese caste system. In the videocassette version, it was known as ‘love powder’ in the United States, and it was released in the same year as ‘*The Kris*’ (literally means a traditional Balinese dagger) overseas. It is beyond the scope of this thesis to discuss moving images in detail. However, it is worth mentioning that in 1933 and 1951 respectively, inspired by this exotic motion picture, there was another ‘goona-goona’ cultural production – a musical production called *Goona-goona: A Balinese Love Song*²⁹³ and *Goona Goona: A*

ran for nine weeks (pp. 102-4). For more info on this *goona-goona* genre and other films in the 1930s, see ‘*Goona-Goona*’ Shavit, pp. 101-106. For more information on the moving images of Bali during these years, see Lindsey, p. 79. See also Vickers, 1996, p. 108. For a more scholarly discussion on this movie, see Fatimah Tobing Rony, *The Third Eye: Race, Cinema, and Ethnographic Spectacle* (Durham: Duke University, 1996), pp. 145-149. One of the rich and famous captivated by such films was Barbara Hutton, granddaughter of Frank Woolworth. In 1931, Hutton went to the movies and saw a film about Bali. After watching the movie, she pronounced: ‘I’m going to Bali,’ (Shavit, p. 87). Hutton probably watched *Die Insel der Dämonen* (The Island of the Demons), produced and directed in 1931 by the German Baron Victor von Plessen, for which the casting and choreography were done by Spies.

André Roosevelt, the first cousin of Theodore Roosevelt, was an agent for American Express and Thomas Cook. He guided tourists now and then as a means to earn money. He had been living in Bali since 1924, (Williams, p. 11; Powell, 1985, p. 41). *Goona-Goona* was Denis’ first movie. He was Roosevelt’s son-in-law, but he never mentioned Roosevelt, his wife Leila and his three children that came with him to Bali, not even in relation to his making of *Goona Goona* with his father-in-law. On this topic, see Denis’ autobiography: *On Safari: the Story of my Life* (London: The Companion Book Club, 1964), especially ‘Escape to Bali’ pp. 34-52. For the plot of the film, see Denis, p. 36 and for a recollection of these families see an autobiography by Denis’ daughter Renee Roosevelt Denis, *To Live in Paradise* (Fort Bragg, California: Lost Coast, 1996.)

²⁹² *Goona-Goona* also links with sex allure and magic, see the comments by Covarrubias, *Island of Bali*, p. 391; Vickers, 1996, p. 108; Shavit, p. 101; Williams, pp. 60-1, and Williams and Chong, p. 12. (This is also the main theme of Couperus’ novel of 1900, *De Stille Kracht*.) Within a month of the release of *Goona-Goona*, the term was incorporated into American slang as the ‘mammary gland or glands of the human female,’ Belfrage, p. 112. There were also *goona-goona* sundaes, with the recipe: ‘Two scoops full of chocolate ice cream, side by side, topped with two maraschino cherries’, (Shavit, p. 106; Denis, p. 54.)

²⁹³ Walter Serge, Mitchell Parish, Lou Leaman and Dasnee, *Goona-goona: A Balinese Love Song* (New York: Mills Music, 1933).

*Tale of Magic in Java*²⁹⁴. The point is that once a term becomes popular, it is used repeatedly.

The 1930s, the golden years of film,²⁹⁵ recorded Bali in the form of moving pictures: in addition to *Goona-Goona*, there was also *Insel der Dämonen*²⁹⁶ (The island of the demons, 1931). The abundance of films in this era allowed women, including Tantri, the freedom to attend movie houses unescorted, because there they would not be suspected of being in search of sex in the way that they were when they visited public houses.²⁹⁷

The key point here is that accessibility to different genres is important and helps circulate and promote images of Bali. The access to different literary genres is very important, as Jeffrey Richards observes:

Accessibility was axiomatic, and paintings, music and plays were as much designed to be 'read' as poems and novels. Novels, poems, plays, music and paintings overlapped and interpenetrated to an extraordinary degree.²⁹⁸

In addition, there were writers, academics, ethnographers, and medical doctors who wrote about Bali. They all came from different countries and they had different audiences in mind. They used a language that was also used by the audience in their home countries. The general public and specialist readers used and circulated popular words or expressions, either to counter, to promote, or to

²⁹⁴ See for examples Gwendolen Brooks Penniman, *Goona-goona: A Tale of Magic in Java* (Los Galos, California: World Youth, 1951) and Stephen Bissette, *We are going to eat you! Third World Cannibal Movies and the Inside Story of Goona-Goona Films* (Wilmington, Vt: Spider Baby Grafix & Publications, 1990). For a different view of the use of *goona-goona* in Java and Bali see Note, 'Digressions and Afterthought' Powell, 1985, pp. 271-292, especially pp. 289-290.

²⁹⁵ Ralph Bond, 'Cinema in the thirties: Documentary Film and the Labour Movement', in *Culture and Crisis in Britain in the Thirties*, ed. by Jon Clark, Margot Heinemann, David Margolies and Carole Snee (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1979), pp. 241-256 (p. 241).

²⁹⁶ See also a Dutch novel by Johan Fabricus entitled *Eiland der Dämonen* (The island of the demons), (Amsterdam: De Muiderkring, 1948).

²⁹⁷ Jeffrey Richards, 'Modernism and the People: the View from the Cinema Stalls', in *Rewriting the Thirties: Modernism and After*, ed. by Keith Williams and Steven Matthews (London: Longman, 1997), pp. 182-201 (p. 182).

²⁹⁸ Richards, p. 182.

use them as parody; these are some of the issues that I will elaborate on further in Chapter 5.

We discussed how Krause's photographs lured many visitors to Bali and how photographs have the same potential for attracting tourists as written texts – however, certain effects are not possible in literature. On the other hand, cinema is built on moving images and the spoken word; it has a far greater impact on audiences than literature or still pictures. The visual quality of moving pictures has become an effective medium that can be viewed many times. (VCD was uncommon in the 1930s.) In the 1930s, when mass production was limited and transportation was not as convenient as in the present day, colonial exhibitions became a venue for armchair travellers/photographers. The live displays and the catalogues were in demand and had a greater impact—particularly for those who could not travel and see the foreign land for themselves. The circulation and the reproduction of images and the re-exhibition of displays from exhibition catalogues is one of the issues that will be dealt with in Chapter 5.

What the male and female travellers discussed so far have in common is that they had their own pre-conceptions before arriving on the island. They brought their own literary baggage with them. As a result, their expectations, contextualisation, and visualisation of Bali and its women are imbued with meaning derived from the writers' own experience, literary baggage, and imagination. They continue to promote the well-established image of the Balinese as savage yet exotic. (The pre-Second World War literature of the 1920s and 1930s is saturated with 'exoticism' and 'orientalism' and I will elaborate more on the 1930s in the next chapter.)

1. 9. Textual Images of Balinese Women

After discussing the literary baggage, the on-arrival situations, the first impressions of Bali, and the expected expectations of the writers, it is important to analyse how they use all of this information and their personal experiences to present Bali to their audience. This section deals with a comparison between men's and women's textual representations of Balinese women. It seeks to show how the image-makers constructed images of Bali, which suited not only their own fantasies, but also those of the consumers. In other words, there was a demand for such images.²⁹⁹ In the following section, I will discuss how male and female writers differ in presenting the images of the bare breasts, the nude bathers, and the burden on the head.

First, the bare breasts. Most visitors who went to Bali showed an interest in the women's bare breasts. Some give second-hand information and some describe stereotyped depictions of the enthusiastically praised ideal of Balinese physical beauty. The question is whether a human being's sexual inclination determines how he or she represents the opposite sex. Alternatively, is it more to do with class or nationality? In other words, does one's identity determine how he or she perceives things?

It is well to be specific about attitudes. I shall be accused of writing about Bali as a romantic, without the excuse of being Irish. But I think I have made clear that I reached Bali in a very disillusioned frame of mind, for my eyes persisted in seeing things. I kept the same eyes in Bali, and I have not ventured into the world of Let's Pretend.³⁰⁰

²⁹⁹ During the Harlem Renaissance, George Schuyler and J. A. Rogers observed that in writing for the elite audience, there was a 'White' demand for something exotic and sensational; therefore, there were not many realistic fictions about the 'best' Negroes, (Hutchinson, p. 300).

³⁰⁰ Powell, 1985, p. 51.

Seen within the context of the quoted passage, Powell claims that not being an Irish man does not influence the way he sees Bali. Interestingly, he stereotypes the Irish as much as he stereotypes the Indonesians. Still, his disillusionment does not last long, for he finds what he expects to see:

Then appeared a solitary female figure, swinging toward us up the road. The sun shone russet on an earthen pot above her head, matched to the stripes of a bold sarong trailing easily from waist to feet. A scarf fell carelessly from a shoulder, and the bronze bowls of maiden breasts projected angular, living shadows. She walked majestically, with slowly swinging arms, with never a glance for staring eyes that now rolled past her. And all at once she was but a part of a vast spreading wonderland, embodied dreams of pastoral poets.³⁰¹

However, Gorer³⁰² goes against the grain. The much-advertised Balinese bare breasts do not appeal to him. Gorer wrote *Bali and Angkor* (1987)³⁰³ in his capacity as a travel writer – not as an anthropologist. None of his photographs depict bare breasts, as we shall see later. (Gorer's photographs and his career as anthropologist will be discussed in Chapter 3.)

The following quotation explains how the interplay between Gorer's negative expectations and observations forced him to find a substitute. The full paragraph is quoted here to illustrate Gorer's fantasy search and his search for a similar absent image, the image closer to his memory, the iconic image that is stored in his mind. The image of Josephine Baker,³⁰⁴ the African American dancer,

³⁰¹ *ibid.*, p. 6.

³⁰² He went to Bali as part of his travels to Indo-China and the Dutch East Indies (Shavit, p. 150; Gorer, 1983, p. 10).

Gorer became fully engaged in anthropology in 1935 when he received training from Margaret Mead, Ruth Benedict and John Dollard. See Gorer, 1948, p. 1. Gorer was Margaret Mead's student. Mead was Ruth Benedict's student, and Benedict was Franz Boas' student.

³⁰³ Originally published by Michael Joseph, 1936.

³⁰⁴ Josephine Baker (1906-1975) was of mixed ethnic background: Indian/Negro (as they would say in 1906) or Native American/African American (as we would say today). She descended from Apalachee Indians and Black slaves in South Carolina. Baker was the icon of nude dancing in the twenties in France and became the most famous expatriate in that country during her time there.

and perhaps the images from *Africa Dances* (1935), which he had written the previous year, haunted him.³⁰⁵ Note Gorer's description below:

The physical beauty of the Balinese has to my mind been greatly exaggerated by people who have written about them. They are well-made and healthy looking; actual ugliness among them is uncommon, but so is outstanding beauty. I know of at least half a dozen races in different parts of the world where in an ordinary crowd you will find more satisfying physical types. The reputation of the Balinese is, I believe, founded on two facts; firstly, they photograph extremely well, their brown and even skin, with the contrasting hair and well-marked features being pre-eminently photogenic; and, secondly both sexes habitually go naked except for a sarong. A typical Frenchman wrote in the Bali hotel's visitors' book: "L'hôtel du sein; L'Ile du sein," and from many visitors' point of view he has said everything. Female breasts are considered to be sexually stimulating; those of the Balinese, though often rather broad, are firm and round and well shaped; if Josephine Baker could be induced to settle in the country you would have a non-stop revue a grand spectacle, with a personnel even larger than that of the Folies-Bergère under Lemarchand.³⁰⁶

It is difficult to claim that there is nothing salacious or pornographic in Gorer's mind, or his eyes. Compared with other males' ideas about the Balinese beauty mentioned previously, Gorer's seems to be more resistant to change. He was not an innocent traveller; like his predecessors and contemporaries, he arrived in Bali with a mental image of what the island would be like. It is an absent image, one that he brought with him from Paris (an image of Baker, for example). From his different readings, the translation of the written text from the visual was 'greatly exaggerated'. This is because the Balinese were 'pre-eminently photogenic'; the camera made the models more pleasant to look at. Here, for the young and bright Gorer, the Balinese women's sexuality is of a 'lower' quality than that of African American breasts.

³⁰⁵ A discussion on the ideal feminine beauty of the 1920s can be found in Chapter 2.

³⁰⁶ Gorer, 1936, p. 61. Gorer identified an ostrich with Josephine: 'The ostrich Josephine Baker was becoming a bit of a nuisance (...)', Gorer, 1983, pp. 56-7.

When Gorer made his three months' pleasure trip in the first months of 1935, he travelled in considerable luxury; the roads and transportation were good with excellent hotels everywhere.³⁰⁷ His quotation from the hotel guest book, '*L'hôtel du soin; L'Ile du sein*', explains everything.³⁰⁸ It is here that Gorer's playful attitude began to emerge once he found a substitute; he slowly describes the 'sexually stimulating' breasts of Baker.

The moment, as captured through Gorer's eyes, like a search engine, momentarily seeks similar images to those he once consumed at the Parisian music hall Folies Bergère. Along with Powell and Covarubias, Gorer's cultural knowledge fits the description that travel depends on 'the interplay between expectation and observation.'³⁰⁹

In representing Balinese women in literature, like male image-makers, women make use of photographic, still, and moving images, and other literary images already in circulation. It seems that women's description of the bare breasts is relatively shorter and less erotic. Isabel Anderson recounts her short visit to Bali in a chapter titled 'Bali, Island of Lovely Women.' From her twelve pages of text, she dedicates a full page to Balinese women. This description immediately follows her description of cock fighting:

It is a long jump from fighting cocks to women, but I mention the latter here because the first European adventurers to Bali who wrote of its fascination and wonders, rather stressed the sex appeal of the women and the playtime of the people, their music and dancing, intimating that the life on the island was one continuous and somewhat hectic holiday. While this legend has added to the desire of travellers to visit the island, yet it has spread an unjust reputation of the Balinese, for while some of the women are exquisite, the exposure of the upper part of their bodies is not immodest (except to the foreign-minded visitor), as they are entirely

³⁰⁷ Gorer, 1936, p. 11.

³⁰⁸ *ibid.*, p. 61.

³⁰⁹ E. H. Gombrich, cited by Howe, 1993, p. 68.

unconscious of any suggestion of impropriety. This has simply been their custom for hundreds of years. On entering a temple, however, they must cover up a scarf over the shoulders; ordinarily, they wear nothing higher than the *sarong*. Franklin Knott, an enthusiast about Bali, writes: "Its women are the fairest in all Malaysia, and a dressmaker would starve!"³¹⁰ These coffee-colored girls of Bali walk with a lively free grace and seem very strong. They have a Chinese slant to their eyes and long thick hair, which they do up very untidily without hairpins and sometimes with the help of a scarf. Such morals as the people have are, at their worst, we must remember, according to a code of their own. As for the playtime, it is relaxation from hard work, for we had never seen, even in the paddy fields of China, so industrious a people.³¹¹

Anderson carries her literary baggage with her: there were references to Powell's 'Lost Paradise' and a book on Bali's nearby island, Komodo Island, by Douglas Burden.³¹² She tries to give a fairer report about Balinese women. Rather than emphasizing the sex appeal of these women, she rectifies the false myth. In describing the upper part of female bodies, Benson simply writes:

Many women were naked above the waists; sometimes a good thing, sometimes not. Little jackets are on the increase now, but once upon a time if a woman wore anything upon the upper part of her body, except for entering a temple, it meant that she was a prostitute.³¹³

The brief comment above is written as part of 'The Balinese dances' section (pp. 172-184) rather than 'The Balinese' (pp. 185-191).

Yates, for example, ignoring the fact that the bare-breasted girls of Bali are wide spread, expresses how visitors may be shocked by the scenes:

The first days you are on the island your eyes nearly pop out of the sight of so many "Eves," – but after a few days of seeing these bronzed natives, busy about their living, entirely unconscious of their bared beautiful breasts, you no longer notice them.³¹⁴

³¹⁰ Benson quoted what she read in the hotel's guest book: 'I hate Bali!!' signed N. Ipple, Pres: Amalgamated Brassière Co., Buston (sic), Mass. (Benson, pp. 168-69).

³¹¹ Anderson, 1934, pp. 200-1.

³¹² *ibid.*, p. 194 and p. 196.

³¹³ Benson, pp. 175-76. Later travellers such as Krause, Yates and Powell (p. 7) also mentioned about this 'covered' prostitutes.

³¹⁴ Yates, 1933, pp. 76-7.

No wonder Balinese women are acclaimed the most beautiful native women in the world. While they are young, they are tall and lithe, with splendidly-shaped shoulders, legs, and hips – regal in bearing and with shapely hands and feet. As they swing along the forest paths, with the glint of the sun on their broad shoulders and full-cupped breasts, they seem the natural daughters of Eve.³¹⁵

Here Yates refers to the half-clothed female figures in biblical terms: the Eves. For her it is something that needed no exaggeration. All the mental forms and notions, which together formed Eden or, rather, a variety of Eden, shaped her representation of Balinese women. This is an example of how eyewitness accounts are always constructed by the imaginary, in this case an imaginary Eden.

The second popular image is bathing. Bathing activities involved the idea of nakedness and hygiene. One of the negative images that usually appeared in the literature concerned the ‘cleanliness’ of the colonised people.³¹⁶ It is partly for this reason that travel writers expressed great interest in the bathing habits of indigene women, noting in particular the frequency and openness of this practice. One example of a literary account of bathing is written by Yates. Her description of bathing makes use of the same Eden-like framework:

You have to arise with the birds to catch them at their ablutions, but it’s well worth while, for you will see men, women, and children, as shapely as bronze figures, disport in the crystal mountain water. It is like happening in on the Garden of Eden at dawn. The tiniest tots, intent on their toes, scrub themselves vigorously with bits of stones! The women have an ingenious way of bathing quickly and slipping into their *sarongs* almost before you glimpse them, - they move with such rapidity. Then, filling their pottery bowls where the water springs forth from the earth, they go off through the lanes about their day’s work.³¹⁷

³¹⁵ *ibid.*, p. 77.

³¹⁶ As part of this ‘cleanliness,’ the colonial/traveller’s anxieties are sometimes combined with their concerns over infectious disease. Anderson, for example, after realising that she may not escape from a bout with malaria, exclaimed bitterly: “Bali is no Paradise at all!” (Anderson, 1934, p. 205). More information on colonial anxieties can be found in Nigel Leask, *British Romantic Writers and the East: Anxieties of Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1992), pp. 6-8; Sara Suleri, *The Rhetoric of English India* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1992), pp. 89-91; Ghose (1999), p. 47.

³¹⁷ Yates, 1933, p. 38.

Here Yates merely describes the quick bathing ceremony where one has hardly had a chance to peep. There is nothing exciting about it and there is no time to dream or to enjoy these rare scenes. Contrasting with colonial anxieties towards diseases, and measured against her ideas of cleanliness and regularity, Yates was astonished to see the natives' extra attention to bathing:

In such a warm and languid climate, I hardly expected to find the natives over-particular in the matter of cleanliness. But the Balinese seem to have a passion for bathing, and the pools are used every morning of the year.³¹⁸

Yates' surprise would have doubled if she knew that many Balinese, if they felt like it, took a bath twice a day, as least as according to Covarrubias and Krause:

They bathe frequently during the day, whenever they feel hot or after strenuous work, but two baths a day are the rule, in the morning and evening, before each meal.³¹⁹

They bathe at least twice a day at innumerable splendid bathing spots, not neglecting to massage every muscle and joint, to rub down the skin with fine pumice, and afterwards to treat it with scented oils and fine rice-powder.³²⁰

All these travellers express their interest and curiosity in the bathing habits of the Balinese. They pay great attention to the time and frequency of bathing. In addition, the manners and the openness of the bathing are recorded.

It is interesting to learn that a more detailed description of this segregated bathing place and activities comes from a man. Covarrubias' anthropological account, for example, elaborates the etiquette and the manner of taking a bath (which is violated by him and Krause):

There are strict rules of etiquette for bathing-places; for example, sexual parts should not be concealed even among persons of the same sex. A man simply covers himself with one hand not to offend his fellow bathers. It

³¹⁸ *ibid.*, pp. 37-8.

³¹⁹ Covarrubias, 1973, p. 115.

³²⁰ Krause, 1988, pp. 64-5.

would be unthinkable for a man to look deliberately at a nude woman although she may be bathing within sight of everybody in the irrigation ditch along the road. It is customary to give some indication of one's presence on approaching a public bath.³²¹

Women wade into the water raising their skirts to a respectable level, a little above the knee, and after considering the possibilities of the place sit suddenly in the water, quickly taking off the skirt. The process is reversed in getting out of the water: the skirt which has been lying on a stone or held in one hand, is gathered up in front of the bather and dropped like a curtain as she stands up. She wraps it around her hips and walks off without bothering to dry herself.³²²

The quick removing of sarongs is also observed by Tantri:

Much of the way, the road to Den Pasar followed winding streams. Frequently I saw natives bathing, washing their buffaloes, and even attending to other bodily functions, all in the same stream. But always modestly. The women carefully concealed themselves up to the waist before removing their sarongs, and the men never exposed themselves fully.³²³

Covarrubias is aware that deliberately looking at a nude bather is taboo.

Nevertheless, he is able to give a detailed description of the gradations in the colour of the bathers' skin:

Because they are tanned by the sun, their golden-brown skin appears generally darker than it really is, and when seen at a distance, people bathing are considerably whiter around their middles, where the skin is usually covered by clothes, giving the impression that they wear light-coloured pants. Watching a crowd of semi-nude Balinese of all ages, one cannot help wondering what the comparison would be should men and women of our cities suddenly appear in the streets nude above the waist.³²⁴

Covarrubias carefully uses the words 'seen at a distance' as if avoiding being accused of penetrating 'private zones.' With his camera-like eyes, he compares

³²¹ Covarrubias, 1973, pp. 116-17.

³²² *ibid.*, p. 101.

³²³ Tantri, 1960, p. 19.

³²⁴ Covarrubias, 1973, pp. 12-13

the colour of his skin and the Other's skin.³²⁵ He wishes to be 'one of them', or to be more precise, he wants the scene to be part of his own, his 'home.' Although his description does not explicitly eroticize the act of bathing, he is caught in the act of voyeurism. Covarrubias' description explicitly eroticizes the women's nakedness by linking it with play, self-mocking, and voyeurism. This man indeed has a predecessor: the objectification of women is particularly apparent in Krause's ethnographic photos in which women are often depicted in sensual poses of the act of bathing.³²⁶

For a straight man like Powell, it is all different. He would rather enjoy the voyeurism on the spot:

With my camera I leap atop a wall. A Chinese tourist guide is there. He chortles: "I got a picture of a naked lady! A picture of a lady, *all* naked!" Clothes are forgotten. Girls, who in the morning chill wear more clothes for bathing than at any other time, now in the pious rapture of the moment give themselves unclothed and unashamed to the pouring crystal of the sacred fountain. Like amber nymphs³²⁷ they sparkle in the waters.

Snap the camera shut! To hell with photographs and naked ladies. No film can catch the glamour of this moment. No gelatine can tell the music of the *gamelan*, the bursts of colour, the swirling tide of human piety. I give myself to the surge of life. Here is the end and aim of living, the

³²⁵ 'The view on the Other is reflected in an examination of oneself '(Jedamski, p. 36); 'What emerges from the travel accounts is how the other is constituted ambivalently, but always serves the function of self-definition,' (Ghose, 2001, p. 10). See also Kabbani's *Europe's Myths of Orient* (1986); Pratt's *Imperial Eyes* (1992); Youngs' *Travellers in Africa: British Travelogues 1850-1900* (1994).

³²⁶ Although there are not any significant number of drawing/painting of bathing women in *Island of Bali*, Covarrubias' later paintings include *Bather Holding up her Kemban*, *Three Bathers*, *Two Girls Bathing*, and *Bathing in the River*. Since he took up painting much later after becoming an established caricaturist, Covarrubias sometimes painted from a related line drawing that he illustrated in his *Island of Bali*. *Three Bathers* (1895) has been used by Renoir as the title of his painting.

³²⁷ 'Nymph' is one of the popular imaginations in the twenties. (...) I have listened with doubt and distrust to the tales told by returned travellers of the nymphs whom they had found, leading an Arcadian existence, on distant tropic isles,' Powell, 1921, p. 143. See Billie Melman *Women and the Popular Imagination in the Twenties: Flappers and Nymphs* (London: Macmillan, 1988); Pierre-Auguste Renoir's *A Nymph by a Stream* (1869-70). 'Bronze,' however, is frequently used to describe a gradation of colour, which does not necessarily have to do with beauty but also other object as well, for example, 'rather shy bronze water nymphs.' See William Douglas Burden, *Dragon Lizards of Komodo: An Expedition to the Lost World of the Dutch East Indies* (New York: Putnam, 1927), pp. 61-4.

fierce identity with something rich and strange, beyond all human ken or feeling.³²⁸

The word 'naked' is repeated by the tourist guide twice and it reveals his excitement. Powell, who happens to be there, directs himself to the scene being discussed and, more philosophically, he enjoys the images better. The voyeuristic gaze, which is more often male rather than female, is always linked to a sense of mastery over the image, which is composed out of an accumulation of the writer's experience.

The third popular image of Balinese women is the burden image. In addition to the images of bare breasts, the textual description of Balinese women includes women, or more often, young girls with a burden on their heads. Apart from the other writers discussed in this study, Benson is the only one who focuses on the details of the offerings. Having seen this procession, she certainly catches a sight of half-naked bodies. However, that is not the sight that she is interested in describing in detail:

The chief outlet for creative talent for women is the construction of beautifully ornamental temple offerings, pyramids of fruits or cakes with cut-out palm leaves and flowers. Sometimes these are quite small, sometimes towers that rise even to ten feet, though I have never seen one anything like so high. It is a charming sight to see a procession of women walking gracefully by at leisured pace with offerings on their heads.³²⁹

This repeats the depiction of Krause's photographs of Balinese girls holding offerings or market ware. It is the same image that is captured by a female photographer, Thilly Weissenborn. (Both Krause's and Weissenborn's photographs will be discussed in the following chapter.) The novelist Baum makes similar

³²⁸ Powell, 1985, p. 215.

³²⁹ Benson, pp. 187-88.

observations. She repeats the images captured by Krause's camera: the women in the market, the heavy loads on their heads, and the bare breasts.

Women came from field or market carrying baskets or sheaves of rice or towers of coconuts or great pyramids of earthenware vessels on their heads. The habits of carrying loads on their heads gave them an erect carriage and a rhythmic step, and their breasts and shoulders were at once soft and muscular.³³⁰

Tantri remarks on a related scene of the blouse-less Balinese women with, again, burdens on their heads:

Most striking to a new arrival is the practice among the women of leaving their breasts fully exposed. I saw them everywhere, along the road or in the rice fields, the women innocently displaying their large firm breasts as they walked in single file, balancing huge loads on their heads.³³¹

Baum's 'earthenware vessels' and Tantri's 'huge loads' descriptions are not, however, an act of voyeurism. Similar to the imagery of the 'Balinese Girls and their Offerings' to which they are a counterpart, this particular image had a long pedigree that went back to the era of early anthropology/ethnography where nakedness in general was a sign of impropriety and thus cultural inferiority.

Scidmore, who travelled to Java, for example, recalls an absent image from India, whose origin was the bas-reliefs:

Women fill their water-vessels at the tanks and bear them away on their heads as in India now, and scores of bas-reliefs show the unchanging customs of the East that offer sculptors the same models in this century.³³²

Similarly, when visitors or travellers see a live group of Balinese dancers in Paris, a display of colonial photographs, or an ethnographic film about 'goona-goona,' he or she is not seeing the images for the first time. The exotic is always already known. Krause's photograph album certainly plays an important part in

³³⁰ Baum, c. 1983, p. 262.

³³¹ Tantri, 1960, p. 19.

³³² Scidmore, p. 188.

circulating the image of Balinese women. The popularity of his book in Europe and its translation attests to the importance of photography in establishing Bali's fame. Many visitors to Bali frequently refer to his book. There is a distinction between male and female writers in describing the bare breasts and the sexual liaisons of the photographers.

It should be noted there were also armchair travellers/anthropologists who managed to invent images of people from far away places without actually 'being there.'³³³ The link between anthropology and colonialism is a subject I wish to touch upon in Chapter 4.

³³³ Until 1926, anthropologists were not required to have actually gone to the field, Rony, p. 29.

CHAPTER 2

PRINTED IMAGES³³⁴ OF BALINESE WOMEN AND THEIR IMAGE-MAKERS

With the prose came visual images. In Chapter 1, I discussed the textual images of Balinese women. It is not only written accounts of Bali that attracted attention, but also how the island was represented visually. In this chapter, I will concentrate on the visual accounts. By the time the image-makers began to focus on Bali, photography was already a well-established industry in the Netherlands East Indies.³³⁵ In this context, I will make a distinction between the photographer as illustrator and the author as photographer. The reason for this distinction is to investigate whether or not there is a gender bias in this profession. A distinction is also made between male and female photographers. This is done to find out whether there is a significant difference between men and women in presenting Balinese women visually. The writers and photographers discussed in this chapter are those without any specific anthropological/academic background and whose texts are not purely anthropology. (Works on Bali by more established anthropologists, such as Margaret Mead, will be discussed separately in Chapter 4). Before discussing the visual images of women in Bali in the 1930s, it is useful to deal with images from an earlier period.

³³⁴ By printed images, I mean any photographs, paintings or drawings that appear as illustrations in publications. This may include images that are printed for the first time or reprinted either from the original books or from the glass plates for use in other publications.

³³⁵ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 52; Groeneveld, p. 54.

2. 1. Thilly Weissenborn (1889 – 1964)

We discussed how Krause's photographs had a great impact in luring visitors to Bali and also the different ways in which male and female writers presented Balinese women textually. Yet, in order to understand the influence of female photographers and their image making, it is essential, to begin with, to have a look at one female photographer at work before the 1930s.

Margarethe Mathilde Weissenborn³³⁶ was born in Kediri, East Java,³³⁷ on 22 March 1889 and died on 28 October 1964 in Baarn, Netherlands. She had two older sisters and three older brothers. Her parents, Herman Weissenborn and Paula Roessner, were German-born naturalized Dutch who had a coffee plantation in Kediri. In 1892, her mother left Kediri and took all the children back to The Hague. Her father arrived in the following year. Five years later, her father, along with her eldest brother, went to Tanganyika, where he bought a plantation.

While in The Hague, Weissenborn learned about photography from her elder sister, Else, who had opened a photography studio in 1903. She and her brother Theo returned to Indonesia in 1913³³⁸ and lived with another brother, Oscar, in Bandung, west Java. Then they moved to Surabaya, where Theo got a job. Weissenborn herself found a job in a well-established studio owned by Kurkdjian. She worked under the supervision of the skilled English artisan, G. P.

³³⁶ Biographical information was mainly derived from the following sources: Weissenborn and Drissen (1983). Drissen is the son of Marie Da Paula Weissenborn, Thilly's sister; Vickers, 1989, pp. 102-3; Vickers, 'The Romance of the Indies', in *Towards Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed*, ed. by Jane Levy Reed (San Francisco: The Friends of Photography, 1991), pp. 79-95. (Published in conjunction with an exhibition organized by The Friends of Photography and presented at the Ansel Adams Centre in San Francisco, September 25- December 1, 1991.

³³⁷ According to Vickers, 1991, p. 79, Weissenborn was born in Kediri, East Java in 1889, however other source says she was born in Soerabaja on March 22nd 1883; Groeneveld, p. 122.

³³⁸ Vickers, 'Thilly Weissenborn: The Romance of the Indies', in *Toward Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed*, ed. by Jane Levy Reed (San Francisco: The Friends of Photography, 1991), pp. 79-85.

Lewis,³³⁹ and her apprenticeship included touching-up photographs and a full range of technical work. The studio had thirty employees, European and native, and she was one of only two women.³⁴⁰

After Surabaya, Weissenborn moved to Garut in 1917 and in December she opened her first 'Lux' studio³⁴¹ as part of the already established pharmacy, Garoetsche Apotheek en Handelsvereniging Co., owned by Dr. Denis G. Mulder. In 1920, when Mulder left for Bandung, he handed over the property to Weissenborn. She then became the manager of the firm Foto 'Lux.' Ten years later, Lux Fotograaf Atelier NV was established (1930-1940), also in Garut.³⁴² She worked there until she was interned during the Japanese occupation, and her studio was destroyed during the period called 'police action' (20 July - 5 August 1947). She got married at the age of fifty-eight to Nico Wijnmalen (then almost sixty), whom she had been friends with for a long time. After the marriage, they lived in Bandung. In 1956, they decided to return to the Netherlands for good.

Weissenborn was probably one of the first major female professional photographers of the Indies and many of her photo collections reached a wider audience.³⁴³ Unfortunately, her name was often overlooked. In Hein Buitenweg's *Bandoeng*, for instance, recognition of her consisted only of the name of her

³³⁹ Weissenborn and Drissen, pp. 12-13.

³⁴⁰ *ibid.*, p. 13.

³⁴¹ One of the most famous photographic studios was *Woodbury & Page*, established by Walter Bentley Woodbury (1834-1885) and James Page who arrived in Java in 1856. They set up the studio in Batavia in 1857. *Photographie*, founded by A. F. Lecouteux, was one of the first photographic studios that lasted longer. Lecouteux worked in Batavia during the later half of the 1850s. The number of photographers and studios increased after 1870 not only in Java but also throughout the Indies (Groeneveld, pp. 50-1.)

³⁴² Garut was then one of the major stops of the tourist routes. There were two other studios in Garut from 1920 to 1925: *Lie An Photograaf* and *Preanger Photograaf* (Groeneveld, p. 190).

³⁴³ For list of books in which her works were published see Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 16; Vickers, 1991, p. 79.

studio.³⁴⁴ In H.H. Kol's 1914 work on Bali, Sumatra, and Java, however, Weissenborn's name is mentioned in relation to the Kurdjian photo studio.³⁴⁵

As is revealed in her collections of photographs from 1917-1942,³⁴⁶ Weissenborn seemed to be consistent in her choice of images. Most of her photographs were about nature and beauty spots such as coasts, seascapes, landscapes, caves, mountains, volcanoes, lakes, rivers – the same romantic/paradisiacal images that Krause's camera caught. In addition, Weissenborn's photo collections included historical buildings, such as palaces, botanical gardens, bridges, gardens, hotels, parks, and also religious rituals such as funerals. Before the 1920s, Weissenborn already had taken these kinds of photographs, but in different locations in Java: Sukabumi (1915) and Tasikmalaya (1918). In 1920, she took photographs while travelling to Bogor and Bali. Similarly, in 1925 some panoramic photographs were taken in Pasuruan, Bandung, and Cianjur. Two years later, she travelled to another island called Flores, bringing back some more panoramic pictures from Ende.³⁴⁷ Of her photographs, most of them were taken in Garut in 1920, 1925, and 1930. Sometimes she included people in her frames (for example, a picture of a man sitting cross-legged among three Balinese temples); however, they were normally photographed as part of the scenes and were rarely full figures.

Her Bali photographs, which were taken in 1920, consisted of similar themes, such as landscapes, seascapes, and religious ceremonies/rites, repeating

³⁴⁴ Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 16.

³⁴⁵ H. G. Kol, *Drei maal dwads door Sumatra en Java, met zwerftochten doo Bali* (Rotterdam: Brusse, 1914); Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 10 and p. 13.

³⁴⁶ See Weissenborn and Drissen's *Vastgelegd voor Later: Indische Foto's (1917-1942) van Thilly Weissenborn* (1983).

³⁴⁷ Ende is one of the regencies in Flores (Portuguese for 'flowers') island in East Nusa Tenggara province, Indonesia.

the already romantic style that she had developed in Garut. This was the year of the publication of Krause's photo albums. Weissenborn made an effort to go to Bangli, where Krause had taken his nude bather's photographs in 1912. Unlike Krause in Bangli, Weissenborn produced pictures of lakes, temples, and mountains. Did Weissenborn's images of nature create a change in the way images of naked bodies were portrayed?

As opposed to her counterparts, such as Krause, who frequently showed Bali in the context of a benevolent colonialism and the erotic and exotic Balinese women, Weissenborn introduced an elemental transformation in the European way of seeing the region. Her artistic photographs, especially of the dancing girl, show how different her image is from the images that were circulating at the time. Through her photography, Weissenborn (like Krause) implemented the earlier vision and applied her sense of romanticism. In addition, she also included very few bathing scenes, women with water carriers,³⁴⁸ topless women, or bare-breasted men. The following is a discussion of her photographic styles and motifs.

The first element of her imagery has to do with the female bosom. In only one case, as a woman herself, she tried to conform to the male-dominated photographic style by producing typical naked breast images. She produced a portrait pose of a single, bare-breasted woman, titled *Balinese Vrouw*, which later, in the collection of KITLV (Fig. 1), was categorised as 'Bali, Balinese Women.' The un-named woman in the photograph was given an image code (9199), a date (circa 1920), her creator's name (Weissenborn), a reference to her old number (3.200.15) and her size; she was 21 x 16 cm/ Black & White. Since the photograph

³⁴⁸ For an example of a male water carrier, see Krause, *Balinese man met een kruik op het hoofd om water te halen* (1912-1914); see also 'children water carrier,' by Krause (c.1912).

was not yet included in an album; it had no album number. It bore some notes: ‘Nederlande en Engelse tekst. 2e ex. Opgenomen onder fotonr 12423 (A45)’. This nameless woman was not an individual, merely a collection of numbers, perhaps subject to change in the future. As soon as the archivists found something new or wanted to catalogue her differently, she was given new code numbers. She is now 12423 (image code) and 45 (album number). She has shrunk into 21 x 14 cm with a new description: ‘with notes 2e ex. Opgenomen onder fotonr 9199’. Oftentimes ‘she’ was duplicated in different sizes, printed and displayed in places such as books, catalogues, museums and exhibitions at different times, in different locations and for different audiences. No matter how many times her numbers were changed, or whatever texts/captions were attached to her, she will remain a bare-breasted woman for the next thousand years.

In labelling this photograph, for their own particular purposes, the secondary users, such as scholars, authors and curators, used already known words or motifs, which helped to circulate the existing images. It is less surprising then, given all the male photographers at that time,³⁴⁹ that the user of this particular image was Weissenborn’s nephew, Ernst Drissen, who captioned ‘12423’ with *Een Balinese Schone* (A Balinese Beauty).³⁵⁰ Writing this caption in 1983, he undoubtedly associated the ‘bare’ look with his ideal beauty and tried to persuade

³⁴⁹ According Vickers, Weissenborn was one of the first major female photographers in the Indies, Vickers, 1991, p. 79.

³⁵⁰ Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 58. The same caption is also used by the painter Willem Gerard Hofker (1902-1981) for his painting. Hofker stayed in Bali from 1938-1946. For information on foreign artists and their works on Bali see Ruud Spruit, *Artists on Bali* (Amsterdam: The Pepin, 1997). For textual information on artists outside Bali see Jan Poortenaar, *An Artist in Java and Other Islands of Indonesia* trans. by Horace Shipp (Singapore: Oxford University, 1989). Translated from *Een Kunstreis in de Tropen* by Horace Shipp in collaboration with the author. Originally published as *Artist in the Tropics* by Sampson Low (London: Marston, 1928).

other men to accede to it accordingly. This museum collection/text and the secondary users of the photographs will be discussed thoroughly in Chapter 5.

The second element in which Weissenborn differs from dominant styles is the way she captured the bathing activities. Unlike her (male) contemporaries, such as Krause, she managed to show the Balinese taking their baths without exposing their nakedness. Although she did not take a lot of photographs of this kind, one of her photographs of a bathing scene depicts an open bathing space where three young boys are taking a bath, squatting, with a man, still in a sarong, about to join the boys.³⁵¹ All these men were photographed at the far end on the left side of the spacious bathing place, the space that in Krause's photographs was dominated only by the full figure of the naked bathing men or women.

Weissenborn's non-Bali bathing type showed a young girl who is still in sarong³⁵² (Fig. 2) and a child squatting under the *pancuran* (Fig. 3).³⁵³

Thirdly, the 'burden' type of imagery was common to her photographs. In addition to the semi-nude type, the classic style of women with water carriers was evidenced in Weissenborn's photographs of two Balinese women,³⁵⁴ showing two women along a roadside (Fig. 4). One of the women carried a vessel on her head, with an uplifted hand pose, echoing Krause's earlier clinical portrayals. It was revealed later that the pose and the material culture (the vessel) that was attached to the figure on the left derived from early anthropological photography in which the

³⁵¹ *Mannenbadhuis te Tedjakoela op Bali* (Man's bathing place in Tedjakoela, Bali.)

³⁵² See the reproduction of this photo in Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 120. The words accompanying the photo read: *Scheppingen der natuur* (Enjoying the nature).

³⁵³ Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 121. The caption says: *Een Soendanees peuter vermaakt zich bij het baden onder een pantjoeran, een bamboekoker, die als waterleiding dient*. A Soendanees enjoys himself at bathing under pantjoeran, bamboekoker, which serves as water control.

³⁵⁴ Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 97. The unequal relationship of power between the white photographer and the colonised subject has been discussed by many, including for example Edwards, 1992.

supposed 'otherness' becomes visible. (Discussion of the influence of anthropology in popular writings will be dealt with in Chapter 5.) The second woman half timidly 'exposes' her breasts. Weissenborn's photographic images, including this one, were also used by the secondary users in different publications, including an exhibition's catalogue for example, and will be discussed further in Chapter 5.

A similar theme has been used by Weissenborn's predecessors. An earlier pose came from Sri Lanka and the 'Motu Water Carrier – Port Moresby', a photograph by Johannes Lindt, 1885, featuring bare breasts and a grass skirt. It originated from early anthropological photographs in which photographers, using their cameras, projected their absent individual's image in the form of photographs.

There seems to be an unavoidable pattern of visual mimesis as well. Weissenborn employed literary and photographic imagery that had been circulated earlier in representing Balinese women visually. According to Vickers, Weissenborn could not help following the male photographers' trend in recording female beauty because she was 'unable to change substantially the masculine bias of this generalized image'.³⁵⁵ In this instance, Vickers acknowledged that there is a bias: there is a distinction between male or female image-makers, and as discussed before, the sexual liaisons of the photographers/painters/image makers.

The fact that these Balinese women, and many other women from India, Sri Lanka or Algeria, do indeed carry heavy burdens seems to be forgotten;³⁵⁶ they are just exploited because of their 'beauty' or their physical appearance. Men

³⁵⁵ Vickers, 1991, p. 80.

³⁵⁶ See again Yates' explanation of the weight of the offering that needs two men to lift it (Yates, 1933, p. 5).

are rarely depicted carrying water;³⁵⁷ in the case of Bali, they are often pictured/described next to their precious pet, ready for gambling (cockfighting).³⁵⁸ Is it because fighting cock is a man's game or is it also a gay game?³⁵⁹ Although it involves a little gambling, the Balinese perform cockfights as part of a religious duty. Unlike bullfights, in which women are involved (either as spectators or as bullfighters), cockfighting is a man's world. It is also a meeting place for young men.

Weissenborn also photographed bare-breasted men when, for example, depicting a man by a temple.³⁶⁰ From the Dutch side, all these bare photographs served two purposes: to justify colonialism (on the grounds that the 'natives' needed clothing) and to promote tourism (encouraging visitors to come to Bali before all the Balinese women could be clothed). The Dutch are well known for their *politik adu domba* (devide et impera). The above example – the contradictory justifications – is one such instance.

Weissenborn was not immune to the men's bias. Nevertheless, she was not an absolute follower of the classic motif, for she infused a new trend into her photography. She introduced a new bare-breasted genre – a picture of a girl by the temple's gate (1923). This looked like a snapshot, with the girl by the gate gazing casually at the camera. A group of young girls in the background, inside the gate, were not clear in the photograph, adding to the 'authenticity' of this image. The

³⁵⁷ With the exceptions of Krause's photos which include children and men's water carrier, see Krause (1926), p. 50.

³⁵⁸ Gorer, 1986, p. 62. He wrote: 'And the commonest sight on the roads in Bali in the afternoon is a man holding his rooster in his arms and caressing it, or carrying it along in the open-work bamboo cloche-shaped basket in which the birds are habitually kept.'

³⁵⁹ Water Spies was a homosexual. As a surrealist painter, female nudity was not in Spies' repertoire. One of Spies' drawings is *Balinese Men with their Fighting Cocks* (Bali, n.d.). *Seated Balinese Youth* (Bali, 1945) is a painting by Bonnet depicting seated young man showing his nude body from the back. Bonnet was also a homosexual.

³⁶⁰ *Balinese man bij een tempel* (A Balinese man by a temple, c. 1920)

girl's pose and her naked upper body were far from erotic and it was certainly not a sensuous standing portrait – a recurrent Krause photographic style. This composition was later used by Willem Hofker³⁶¹ (1902-1981) in his paintings.³⁶² Hofker and Maria, his wife, also a painter, came to Bali in 1938. These European artists tried to translate the images that they were already familiar with and later modified them by adding repeated or new icons. This Western consumption of otherness, whether in the metropolitan centre or periphery (inside or outside the West), does not take place without affecting the Others. Here, Hofker's paintings reinforced the already existing stereotype of the erotic and exotic Balinese woman, echoing Krause's photographic images from a century earlier. Therefore, his paintings helped to contribute to the stereotypical way in which the world viewed Balinese women.

Additionally, in her photographs, Weissenborn fixed the pose of a dancing girl, a type known from 1920s postcards³⁶³ (Algeria) for its connection to sexual stereotypes. In this early 20th century era, postcards from the colonies reproduced images of an erotic Orient on a mass scale, thereby circulating the trend and reinforcing existing stereotypes.³⁶⁴ A decade earlier, images of Jaipur's dancing girls (1910) had appeared in postcards photographed by Gobindram Oodeyram.³⁶⁵ However, Weissenborn rejected the popular movement in photography by

³⁶¹ For more information on this artist see Bruce W. Carpenter and Maria Hofker-Rueter, *Willem Hofker, Painter of Bali* (Wijk en Aalburg: Pictures Publishers, 1994).

³⁶² See for example one of his paintings 'Twee Legong Danseressen bij Tempelpoort' (1945).

³⁶³ Most of Weissenborn's Bali photographs were taken in 1920.

³⁶⁴ Martin Evans (ed.), 'Culture and Empire 1830-1962: An Overview', in *Empire and Culture: The French Experience 1830-1940* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 1-26 (p. 16). See also Alloula's *The Colonial Harem* (1986).

³⁶⁵ Compare with Pierre-Auguste Renoir (1841-1919) paintings: *Dancing Girl with Castanets* (1909) and *Dancing Girl with Tambourine* (1909); see also Hofker's painting *Bali* (1944), a topless dancer with headgear. (Traditionally Balinese cover their breasts when dancing.)

depicting a dancing girl in an unusual pose (Fig. 5a).³⁶⁶ Weissenborn's encounter with the Oriental dancing girl forced a modification of this type in her photographs, resulting in images often different from the typical dancing pose circulated during her time. Unlike most of her photographs, which were taken outdoors, this one was a studio image.

This particular image (See again Fig. 5a) was used frequently in official tourist pamphlets of the 1920s and 1930s and was mostly discussed and reproduced in books on Bali. It was also used as the cover of books such as David Shavit's *Bali and the Tourist Industry*³⁶⁷ (Fig. 5b), and the cover of Adrian Vickers' *Bali een Gecreëerd Paradijs*.³⁶⁸ It is also the CD cover of *Gamelan of the Love God* described as audio music that normally 'accompanies the king and his consort making love in their sleeping quarters.' The dancer's sitting position, which is uncommon for a Balinese dancer, is totally different from the pose of the typical dancing girls in India. Here, Weissenborn managed to change the erotic image of the dancing girl.

Weissenborn and her best known photographs had a great impact in changing the trend from bare-breasted native to dancing girl. One of her photographs, the images of the Balinese dancing girl, replaced the earlier bare-breasted images. It has frequently been chosen by the tourist authority in their tourist pamphlets and been discussed and reproduced in books about Bali. Following this success, there were more and more similar images of dancing girls

³⁶⁶ This particular photo, *Balinese Danseres*, is frequently reproduced and analysed. For a thorough discussion of this pose see Vickers, 1996, p. 103.

³⁶⁷ For full reference see bibliography.

³⁶⁸ Adrian Vickers, *Bali een Gecreëerd Paradijs* (Nieuwegein: Signature, 1997). This is the Dutch translation of *Bali, a Paradise Created* by the same author, in which the cover was a photograph of Balinese women with offerings.

reproduced. However, they are qualified by one critic 'less beautiful photographs of dancing girls.'³⁶⁹

From the 1920s onwards, a number of photographic studios based on Java and Bali produced the first postcards and photographs for the official government tourist bureau promotions. Furthermore, there were some tourist magazines, such as *Tropical Netherlands*, *Sluyter's Monthly*,³⁷⁰ and *Inter-Ocean*, catering to international audiences, and some of Weissenborn photographs were published in those magazines. Soon, many new books and articles appeared. The bare-breasted women seem to disappear to be replaced by the dancing girl. From this time onward, a range of magazines, books, and pamphlets issued by tourist authorities and travel writers were designed to attract travellers to the East Indies by showing the exotic but civilised Bali.

More often than not, the earlier images of dancing girls reflected the sensual side of the dancers. However, the one that Weissenborn created changed the way people think about dancing girls in general. The 'bare' photographs of Balinese women seem to be replaced by this new image. As I mentioned before, this particular photograph was frequently selected to promote tourism in Bali. For the visitors who came to Bali during those years, Bali was not merely the land of the bare-breasts.

In the photograph (see again Figs. 5a and 5b), a young and beautiful girl was posed in front of a *gong*, but the *gong* itself had been removed. The *gong*'s

³⁶⁹ Vickers, 1996, p. 103.

³⁷⁰ The KPM and the other liners also sponsored a number of early tourist pamphlets and publications, the most lavish of which was the journal *Sluyter's Monthly*, the first tourist magazine of the Netherlands Indies, published in Batavia (now Jakarta) by G. Kolff. (It was later renamed *Inter-Ocean: A Netherlands East India Magazine Devoted to Malaysia and Australia*.) *Sluyter's Monthly* (1920-1923) began with volume 1 May 1920 and ceased with volume 4 February 1923 (Shavit, p. 27). *Inter Ocean* began publishing with its June's edition on 6 March 1923 and stopped on June 1932. Succeeding titles are *Netherland Indies Review* and *Java Gazette*.

holder became the crown of the dancer, leaving her and her highly ornamented dancing costume as part of the *gong*. She was seated cross-legged, revealing part of her left foot; her left hand was holding a flower and her right hand was positioned on her chest, informing her viewers that her breasts were covered. The photographer avoided the prurient interest in images of the female anatomy. The five fingers of her right hand signify the act of eating, meaning perhaps that dancing is her way of living. At the same time, judging from the Indonesian standard of body language, this pose can be translated as that of someone who cannot express herself – someone oppressed. The dancer directed her eyes to the photographer, who was also communicating with her, expressing the same oppression.

If the earlier images of bare-breasted women reflected the way Bali was seen as a South Seas paradise, then the dancing girl images show Bali, according to Vickers, as part of the mysterious East. Vickers describes this imagery thus:

It captures that mysterious, ineffable quality of Bali – the inscrutable oriental culture of the island, rich but not threatening, that made it a place to which Europeans could escape from the drabness of their home.³⁷¹

Perhaps Vickers' interpretation is still his 'mystery,' a mystery that can be interpreted differently.

2. 2. Gender and Identity (Hybridity)

In order to learn how the craze for exoticism came into being, it is necessary, at this point, to discuss exoticism itself. As one of modernism's outstanding motifs, the emergence of something exotic (and erotic) certainly influences how images

³⁷¹ For discussion of images of Bali and tourism, see Vickers (1996).

of Balinese women were perceived and constructed in prints. The 19th century construction of exoticism, however, resulted from increased travel and exploration outside Europe, to foreign (especially tropical) countries. Exoticism as a post-colonial concept can be interpreted as the process by which the exotic was domesticated. Seen in this light, the nakedness of the people of conquered colonies was also portrayed as erotic.

Images of mixed race sometimes depict an exotic and a sexualized other as a by product of hybridity such as Josephine Baker (1906-1975). In order to better understand the nature of exoticism, it would be advisable to explore hybridity. The undulation between the opposite poles of civilised/uncivilised, clothed/unclothed, and the European ideal of beauty/savage beauty encapsulates what is considered exotic in the 19th century. In representing the native, the Dutch colonial tried their best not to drastically changed who, what, and how the colonised were in their native environment. They did this to maintain surprises, and to give the impression that the indigenous people are not as 'barbarous' as they are generally portrayed. At the same time, they would never be depicted as modern as the coloniser. Graham Huggan says that, 'to domesticate the exotic fully would neutralise its capacity to create surprises.'³⁷² Thus, the dominant culture safely re-created and defined the marginal in its own domestic environment according to Dutch terms. As an icon of the 1920s, for some people, Baker's hybridity is considered a kind of natural exoticism. Problems arise when Baker's origin is questioned. A more complex exotic range of hybrid representations of the other reveals how judgments

³⁷² Graham Huggan, *The Postcolonial Exotic: Marketing the Margins* (London: Routledge, 2001), p. 14.

of aesthetic value, cultural background, and gender identities are both restated and contested.

Europeans who travelled to the colonies often returned home with some stories of the colonised people, including their exotic ordeals. Encouraged by the picture postcards of veiled but bare-breasted Algerian women, which were popular in France in the early twenties, European people were also amazed by the sensational live dance shows featuring Baker. It was possibly this same craze that made later photographers, such as Krause, want to photograph similar images.

In discussing Baker as a symbol of unfettered female sexuality, for example, we should remember Sigmund Freud's views on feminine psychology. Freud's psychoanalytic theory of around 1922 was influenced by contemporary (Victorian) attitudes toward women in Europe and the world. Here, Freud's theory, which is based on the social conditions of a certain culture, becomes a parameter of the phenomenon of the world's view of women. As the classic example of hybridity, Baker was descended from Apalachee Indians and Black slaves in South Carolina. She was a stage performer in Paris during the 1920s. She also became one of Ziegfeld's girls in the Ziegfeld Follies. Baker's image changed the way the world conceived ideal beauty at that time.

Despite the fact that she was born and grew up in America, she was, according to the French metropolitan governing elite's definition, a native African and was therefore part of a French colony. This claim, as we will see later, stirred strong protest from the French public in general. This is ironic, as Baker's identity was characterized through her language (her French was considered poor), but not through her birthplace (America). For the anti-nationalists, Baker was identified

according to her speaking a 'foreign' language and having a different colour of skin.³⁷³ Here, in order to identify Baker, her specific characteristics (accent, hair, skin colour) are selected and fixed to a set of established cultural boundaries that were circulated in the mainstream and stereotyped, as is explained by Hilda Kuper:

Stereotyping proceeded in two directions – generalizing from selected characteristics of individuals to arbitrarily defined categories of people; and, conversely, applying to particular individuals the preconceived image of the broad category.³⁷⁴

On 2 October 1925, an ensemble of musicians and dancers from Harlem, New York, performed at the Théâtre de Champs-Élysées in Paris. At the height of the program, a wild new dance called the Charleston, performed by the young star, Baker, then age 19, captivated the Parisians. The craze for the 'new' meant she had to recreate herself according to contemporary expectations of the primitive. Soon, Baker became an icon of jazz. Following overwhelming success in Paris, in a guest performance on 31 December 1925, Carolyn Dudley Reagan's all-black revue, *La Revue Nègre*, featuring Baker, was heralded in Berlin as the incarnation of the primitive. Baker was reviewed in terms of her 'primitiveness':

In her the wildness of her forefathers, who were transplanted from the Congo Basin to the Mississippi, is preserved most authentically, she breathes life, the power of nature, a wantonness that can hardly be contained.³⁷⁵

³⁷³ Terry Eagleton, 'Nationalism: Irony and Commitment', in *Nationalism, Colonialism and Literature*, ed. by Terry Eagleton, Fredric Jameson and Edward Said, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1990), pp. 23-39 (pp. 32-3).

³⁷⁴ Hilda Kuper, 'Colour, Categories and Colonialism: The Swazi Case', in *Colonialism in Africa 1870-1960 Volume 3 Profiles of Change: African Society and Colonial Rule*, ed. by Victor Turner (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1971), pp. 286-309, (p. 291).

³⁷⁵ Nancy Nenno, 'Femininity, the Primitive, and the Modern Space', in *Women in the Metropolis: Gender and Modernity in Weimar Culture*, ed. by Katharina von Ankum (Berkeley: University of California, 1997), pp. 145-161 (p.145). Compare to Balinese dancers, 'the incarnation of the exotic,' who were exported to Paris in 1930s.

Before discussing the Berliners' image of Baker in more detail, it is necessary to question whether she could pass as a native African and be 'displayed' in a colonial exhibition, and whether the reception of the Parisians was different from that of the Berliners. The following lengthy quotation is what her biographer, Lynn Haney, had to say about the issue:

The Colonial Exhibition Committee [1931] elected Josephine "Queen of the colonies," a title that carried considerable honor. Josephine was ecstatic, for she felt she had truly been adopted by France. But when the committee's choice was announced in the papers, the news was greeted by a cyclone of protest. France's President Gaston Doumergue, Minister of the Colonies Paul Reynaud, and the General Commander of the Exposition, Henri Oliver, all received letters of complaint, to wit: Josephine was a product of Harlem, scarcely a French overseas possession. She did not speak proper French or any of the native African dialects.³⁷⁶ What's more, she had taken the curls out of her hair and oiled it as smooth as a Caucasian. On that issue *The New York World-Telegram* ran the headline, QUEEN, WHERE IS YO' KINK? Finally, the objection that hurt her most was that she was too old for the job. Her critics argued that Africans marry young, often at twelve or thirteen. "Therefore, an African woman of Josephine's age would be a grandmother."³⁷⁷

For the German audience, Baker was read more as an African descendant (Congo Basin) than as an American (the Mississippi). The French government and the Exhibition Committee were not of the same opinion as the general public in France. The latter believed Baker belonged to Harlem. To the French government, however, she was one of France's precious possessions. Baker was a symbol of 'Negro' talent, honoured by France for her aesthetic attributes and not for extolling her exotic 'primitiveness.'³⁷⁸

³⁷⁶ Langston Hughes remembered Baker's fluency in French and English. Arnold Rampersad, *The Life of Langston Hughes: 1941-1967 – I Dream a World Vol. 2* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1988), p. 55; Arnold Rampersad, *The Life of Langston Hughes: 1902-1941 I, Too, Sing America Vol. 1* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1986), p. 342.

³⁷⁷ Lynn Haney, *Naked at the Feast* (London: Robson Books, 1995, 2002), p. 185; Rose, p.149.

³⁷⁸ This corresponded to the distinction between Franz Boas' interests in classical African civilizations, on the one hand, and the ecstatic, Bergson and Freud-inspired fantasies of the Zayas and other 'high modernists,' Hutchinson, 1997, p. 182.

According to the French protesters, Baker did not qualify as Queen of the Colonies³⁷⁹ firstly because of her cultural identity, her native tongue – she did not speak a dialect; secondly, because of her physical identity, her hair – she could pass for ‘Caucasian’; and finally, because of her gender identity – her age. These are the cultural identities – stereotypes – that have long been established by colonialism. The fact that she officially had become a French citizen in 1937 had nothing to do with her rejection or acceptance as a queen of the colonies. The colonial mission towards her had been accomplished: she was no longer ‘barbarous’:

The Exposition’s purpose and message contained, however, an internal contradiction that troubled the neat representational division between colonized and colonizer: the colonized peoples had to be proved barbarous to justify their colonization, but the *mission civilisatrice* required too much civilization and became truly assimilated to France, colonization could no longer be defended, having fulfilled its mission.³⁸⁰

The sensation created by Baker likewise fascinated leading artists,³⁸¹ who not only defined Baker on their own terms, but also promoted the blend of the modern and the primitive – the hybrid – that added to Baker’s popularity (particularly since this image was also circulated through postcards).³⁸² Baker’s postcards, in addition to those depicting Algerians and to Krause’s photo album,

³⁷⁹ She was the star in *Princesse Tam-Tam* (1935). (VCR recording, 2005) This French musical comedy motion picture was subtitled by Helen Eisenman.

³⁸⁰ Morton, p. 7.

³⁸¹ Pablo Picasso (1881-1973) (who called Baker the ‘Nefertiti of now’), graphic artist Paul Colin, cubist Henri Laurens (who depicted her doing the Charleston), Jean-Gabriel Domergue (1889-1962) (whose nude portrait of Baker hung in the Grand Palais) and sculptor Alexander Calder (1898-1976) (whose caricature of Baker became the prototype of the mobile, the form for which he is famous) captured ‘Le Baker’ in media as varied as the art they created. Cheryl A. Wall, *Women of the Harlem Renaissance* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1995), p. 105.

³⁸² By 1927, Baker was the most photographed girls in the world’s *Photographie Girauden*, Haney, p. 101.

helped to create the craze for exotic nudity that perhaps still fills the fantasies of men all over the world.³⁸³

Baker's popularity and hybridity³⁸⁴ were being manipulated via her public image. Seen from the French government's side, Baker was the queen of the colonies belonging to France. The fact that Baker was formally accepted as 'French' generated protest. It is arguable that it was because she did not have any French blood connection to that Baker was adopted by France. Still, the public complained about her being 'mixed.' People argued that her physical characteristics did not fit with her being considered as the colonised. While the French believed she was the product of the colony, many were still in doubt. The French ignored Baker's hybridity, a hybridity that underscored the complexity of the divide between coloniser and colonised. Furthermore, in defining hybridity, as is revealed later, the notion of 'pure' and 'mix' is hardly ever fixed; rather, it distorts³⁸⁵:

The hybrid is one of colonialism's unintended consequences, however, the product of cross-breeding between the metropolitan and the colonial. The mixture of "superior" populations with "inferior ones," which produced people neither purely French nor indigenous, was the horror of colonialist fantasies. The apprehension it produced in Europeans centered on the danger that a "superior" people might generate to a lower level of evolution by mixing with an "inferior" one and that its position on the racial ladder would therefore sink. In this logic, the final consequences of hybridization might be erasure and blurring of boundaries between races and dissolution of codes of difference established by colonialism.³⁸⁶

³⁸³ See for example T.J. Clark's study of Manet and other Parisian painters, *The Painting of Modern Life*; Alloula's deconstructive reading of early 20th century French postcards of Algerian women, *Le Harem Colonial* revealed how the Orient became a place of promise and power. See also Rose, p. 23: 'Like the picture postcards of veiled but bare-breasted Algerian women that were popular in France in the early twenties, the *Revue Nègre* excited its audiences by reminding them of a world that was both mysterious and sexually available, alien yet subject.'

³⁸⁴ In German, Baker is called 'Josefine.' Nenzo, p. 150. At a gala celebration for the monumental Art Deco exposition of 1925, 'La Baker' was featured as the guest artist.

³⁸⁵ Morton, p. 11.

³⁸⁶ *ibid.*

As the daughter of Carrie MacDonald and Eddie Carson,³⁸⁷ Baker was of mixed ethnic background: Indian/Negro, as they said in 1906, or Native American/African American, as we would say today. The ‘cross-breeding’ of the two ‘inferiors’ characterizes how some people thought of her position on the racial ladder. The question from the metropolitan New York daily, ‘Queen, where is yo’ kink?’ perhaps indicates a rejection by some Americans. By making this dichotomy (self vs. other) visible and legible, this anti-queen sympathy was intended to provide a rationale for her elimination (as the queen) in order to reveal more of her ‘otherness’ – including that of gender ‘otherness’.

2. 3. The 1930s Photographers

Photographers are not necessarily authors; similarly, not all authors are photographers. The publication of *The Last Paradise*, for example, was initially suggested by Roosevelt, an American explorer and photographer. He chose Powell, an American reporter, whom he knew from Powell’s other published work, to ‘illustrate’ his photographs, which means that Roosevelt wanted Powell to append narrative to his pictures. In Covarrubias’ case, in the writing of *Island of Bali*, Covarrubias used and selected his wife’s photographs, which, he admitted, were not related to the ideas that he was to write about: ‘I had some random notes, and Rose had taken hundreds of photographs. Someone in Paris suggested publishing an album of the pictures, with text from the notes, which Covarrubias later decided

³⁸⁷ Will Baker is her second husband and she used his name as her own.

were disconnected and quite unsatisfactory.³⁸⁸ He does not elaborate what he meant by ‘disconnected’ and ‘unsatisfactory’. Maybe he wanted to emphasise the importance of his own drawings that illustrated his descriptions.

The first group of photographers from this era included the photographer as illustrator. André Roosevelt and Rose Roland de Covarrubias³⁸⁹ were the photographic illustrators who took the photographs in *The Last Paradise* and the *Island of Bali* respectively. They were the first users of the photographs; and these particular photographs were published in those books, and nowhere else, for the first time. This means that the photographs were taken specifically to illustrate these books. Both the authors and the photographers have an audience in mind. In addition to photographic images, their books were also illustrated by Alexander King, in the case of *The Last Paradise*, and drawings and paintings by Covarrubias himself in *The Island of Bali*.

Roosevelt, the producer of *Goona-goona*, was Powell’s photographer whose thirty-eight pictures along with drawings from King illustrated *The Last*

³⁸⁸ Covarrubias, 1973, p. xxiii. It was Covarrubias’ friend, the novelist André Gide who encouraged Covarrubias to write a book about Bali (Williams, p. 69, Williams and Chong, p. 26). An illustrated story entitled ‘Mexican Covarrubias in Dutch Bali’ appeared in *Life* magazine 27 September 1937 issue; Before the publication of *Island of Bali*, Covarrubias’ illustrated magazine articles, his exhibitions and drawings, and the Franklin Simon production all contributed to a Balinese popularity in New York City that persisted through the 1930s. As soon as the book published in November 1937, it became an instant best-seller. Alfred Knopf reprinted the book. By February 1938, the book had been reprinted three times. The first run consisted of 6,000 copies, followed by another 5,000 and added by 3,000 more (Williams, p. 83).

³⁸⁹ Rose was a popular dancer and choreographer in a musical revue on Broadway. She appeared in hit shows such as *The Rose Girl*, Irving Berlin’s *Music Box Revue* and Jay Kaugman and H. Mankiewicz’s *Round the Town*. She choreographed and performed dance sequences in five silent films directed by the French director, Maurice Tourneur, for Paragon Studios. She met her future husband Covarrubias in New York (Williams, p. 22; Williams and Chong, pp. 10-11).

Rose changed her name from Cowan to Rolanda when she was a member of the Morgan Dancers. She continued to make adjustments in her name from Rose to Rosa and finally from Rolanda to Roland. Her beauty became the talk of many and she had been photographed by among others: Edward Weston (1886-1958) in 1926; Carl van Vechten (1880-1964) 30 October 1932; Nickolas Murray (1892-1965) c. 1922-1961 (Williams, p. 28). Rose learned about photography from Edward Weston and Tina Modotti, using one of the first Leicas that came to New York (Williams, p. 46).

Paradise. On the other hand, Covarrubias' travelling companion, his wife, provided Covarrubias with 114 photos. Covarrubias himself included his own coloured illustrations and drawings. Yates, however, includes twenty-three photographs as her illustrations.

Secondly, there was the group of authors as photographers. Yates, Gorer, and McPhee³⁹⁰ were the photographers for their own publications: *Bali: Enchanted Isle – a Travel Book* (Yates), *Bali and Angkor: a 1930s Pleasure Trip* (Gorer), and *A House in Bali* (McPhee). Apart from Roosevelt and Weissenborn, the photographers discussed in this chapter, were amateurs. As the title of this section suggests, the discussion was mainly about the visual images. Although the main focus is on the photographic illustrations, nevertheless this chapter also deals with paintings and drawings as printed images.

Both Gorer and McPhee were the first users of their photographs and they were also the text-providers of their own texts. The process of selection and the decisions as to which subjects/objects and settings belonged to the authors/photographers. These social scientists themselves took all the photographs published in their books, but Powell and Covarrubias did not.

Most of the descriptive images such as the burden, bare breasts and market images discussed in Chapter 1 were also documented in the form of photographs. However, as we shall see later, there were certain motifs that were not represented

³⁹⁰ Born in Montreal, Canada, in 1900, of Canadian and Scottish parents, Colin McPhee spent his childhood in Toronto where he first acquired an education in music. He then moved to New York in 1918 and became a naturalized American. In late 1926, McPhee went to Paris to further study composition, as did many American composers in the 1920s. Back in New York, in 1929, he was introduced to gamelan by way of early gramophone recordings at an exotic dinner party on Manhattan's East Side – it was a recording of Spies' gamelan made by the European companies Odeon and Beka in 1928. Through a widening circle of friends, McPhee came in contact with several key figures, including especially the anthropologist Jane Belo, the writer Carl Van Vechten, the artist Miguel Covarrubias and some experts in music such as Aaron Copland, Carlos Chavez, and Henry Cowell (see Oja, especially, p. 6, p. 33, and p. 58).

in textual form, for instance the rice-pounding girl and the weaving girl images. Before discussing such photographs, it is important at this point to discuss the photographers.

2. 4. The Photographic Illustrators: Rose Roland de Covarrubias and André Roosevelt

As a photographic illustrator, Rose's contribution ultimately consisted of one hundred and fourteen photographs. Rose took photographs as additional illustrations to (Miguel) Covarrubias' book. Apart from some drawings by Balinese artists, there are ninety black and white illustrations, reproductions of 5 paintings by Covarrubias, and 114 black and white photographs, which were taken by Rose. The 90 black and white illustrations of Covarrubias are separate from the 114 black and white photos. The illustrations are inserted next to the descriptions in the book. Rose's photographs, however, are placed at the end of the book. Although in the acknowledgements Covarrubias wrote that 'Rose Covarrubias' cooperation speaks for itself in the photographs which are so essential a part of the book',³⁹¹ on the back cover, the photographer's name was not mentioned: 'Also included are 114 half-tone photographs, and five full-colour paintings by the author'.³⁹² This statement seems to signal to the readers that the photographs were taken 'by the author'.

The 114 black and white photographs located at the end of the book include images of landscapes, such as beaches, sunsets, and trees, and activities such as dancing, echoing the work of the earlier photographers, Weissenborn and

³⁹¹ Covarrubias, 1973, p. v.

³⁹² *ibid.*, back cover.

Krause. Some of these photographs, as Covarrubias admitted, were not related to what he wrote. This is possibly because Covarrubias and Rose had different agendas. It seems that all Rose's photographs that are published in *Island of Bali* are taken from the collections based on the Covarrubias' first trip to Bali (undertaken to fulfil their curiosity) and not the second, when they had the book project (funded by the Guggenheim Foundation in 1933) in mind. It is also possible that the Covarrubias' first trip was purely 'touristic,' which means their photographs were perhaps kept as a family album. On their second trip, it is possible that both of them had an audience in mind. One can only guess that Rose's photographs were taken without any intention of including them in Covarrubias' book; in other words, those photographs are records of Rose's travelling per se.

It is useful at this point to discuss Rose's photographs. Out of 114 photographs published in *The Island of Bali*, 10 are of bare-breasted women. The girls in Rose's photographs are not described as types because their names are used as the captions. Rose's photographs include: 'Mukluk'; 'Tjiblun'; 'Ayu and Tjamplong in modern dress'; and 'Mukluk carrying her offering to the village temple' (with one arm raised). In comparison, two out of the 38 photographs taken by Roosevelt show bare-breasted girls. Similarly, some of Roosevelt's photographs are captioned with names of the subjects of his photographs: 'Sironé and Nioman', for example, shows two girls smiling naturally to the audience while filling water jugs with a 'centong' (a coconut shell dipper); 'Day after day Renang³⁹³ was weaving'; 'Sayu'; 'Madé Rei and Runis dressed like other girls when not dancing';

³⁹³ This is the picture of the girl that haunted Powell. Rose took a similar picture: 'A noble woman at her loom', see *The Island of Bali's* album of photographs.

‘Madé Rei and Runis dance in golden costumes before a gold-framed gong’.

However, both of these photographic illustrators do not normally put names to individuals in group pictures: for example, ‘Women carry loads on their heads, men over the shoulder’ (Rose) and ‘Janger girls in every-day garb’³⁹⁴ (Roosevelt). They perhaps did this because they did not know those people by name, thus creating a distance between the photographed and the photographer.

This naming of people could imply both having a special attachment to them or possession. In this case, all the photographs belong to the photographers and the naming of some of their photographic subjects means that they know the models quite well. Both Rose and Roosevelt took pictures of men and women. Typical scenes such as the people in the market theme or the rice-pounding girls theme, which are common in Krause’s book, also appeared in Rose and Roosevelt’s photographs: ‘Sweet drinks of crushed leaves are popular in the markets’ (Rose) and ‘In the market’ (Roosevelt); ‘Irsak with a rice pestle’, ‘Girls of Sanur pounding rice’ (Rose) and ‘”Little Renkog" would help Madé pound rice’ (Roosevelt).

Both Rose and Roosevelt took photographs of young and old people in different settings, such as weddings, cremations, and religious ceremonies. In addition, they also took photographs of men with their pets/ cocks: ‘Preparing for the cockfight: tying on the steel spurs’, ‘The owners of the cocks’, ‘Ready for the fight’, ‘The loser’ (Rose); and images of men at prayer: ‘Three men from the mountain’ (Rose) and ‘High caste man at prayers’ (Roosevelt).

³⁹⁴ This is a group picture of five dancers.

What Rose and Roosevelt as photographic illustrators have in common is that they produce photographic representations of Balinese people as individuals and not as types. They still repeat earlier motives such as women or young girls in the market/temples with offerings/burdens. Men are mostly depicted with their fighting-cocks. These photographic images are similar to those discussed in the texts. However, in the texts on Bali, there are motifs that are rarely described textually in literature but are recorded photographically. They are images of the ‘rice-pounding girl’ type,³⁹⁵ and the ‘weaving girl’.³⁹⁶ A type commonly found in anthropological writings/photographs.

The texts/captions discussed here are done so in conjunction with the photos. The captions used by Rose and Roosevelt are self-explanatory. In other words, within these examples, the photographs and the written text (captions) represent the same information in the same way. However, not all the photographs directly are related to the content of the book; some of Rose’s photographs have nothing to do with Covarrubias’ text. This confirms what Covarrubias said about Rose’s photographs – that the photographs are not related.

Images of women with loads on their head became an icon of Bali. These visual representations have been discussed and described widely. They appeared in texts, advertisements, paintings, and photographs. The front cover of Covarrubias’ *Island of Bali* (1973) shows ‘Balinese Girls and their Offerings’, a reproduction of a painting by the author. The text attached to the reprint does not

³⁹⁵ See for example Rose Covarrubias’ photographs: ‘Irsak with a rise pestle’ and ‘Girls of Sanur pounding rice’ in ‘Album of Photographs.’

³⁹⁶ This theme is frequently used in anthropological writings. A. W. Nieuwenhuis, for example, photographed some ‘weaving’ women: *Wevende Kajanvrouw te Boven Mahakam op Midden-Borneo*, Kalimantan Tengah Kayan c. 1900; *Zijdeweefster in Atjeh*, Aceh Besar, Acehnese silk weaving women, 1892; *Weefster op Atjeh*, Aceh, Acehnese weaving women c. 1900.

really explain the visual image it carries. What the text does not explain is that three out of four of the girls are bare-breasted. Is the picture worth a thousand words or is it the text that translates the pictures? Discussing photographs, Sarah Pink suggests that written words translate the image better than the visual:

Photographs and written text cannot be expected to represent the same information in the same way. If photographs are thought of as a substitute for written words, and expected to achieve the same ends, then a comparison of the two is bound to conclude that written words do the job better.³⁹⁷

Pink seems to suggest that words should not be thought of as substitutes for photographs. In other words, texts translate the image in a different way. The questions of what visual images can tell that the written text cannot and vice versa will be elaborated further in Chapter 5. How about ethnographical texts?

Roosevelt seems to have a different agenda as well. He is the one who commissioned Powell to write *The Last Paradise*.³⁹⁸ The photograph of Renang, the girl that haunted Powell (discussed in Chapter 1), is included in the publication. Under this photograph by Roosevelt, the caption reads: ‘Day after day Renang was weaving.’ This caption was adapted from a line in Powell’s book:

Day after day Renang sat weaving. She was on the little shady platform under the high-peaked granary. The light shone through from behind her, etching her delicate profile and the soft, gentle swelling of her bosom. She was there just a few steps from our *balé*, and I liked to sit and watch her. Sometimes she smiled at me as she walked through the yard.³⁹⁹

It is not clear whether Renang’s photograph and the inclusion of her photo was the decision of Powell alone. However, Powell’s description of ‘the native’ is different from the typical narration of the Other. Although it mentions the activity

³⁹⁷ Sarah Pink, *Doing Visual Ethnography: Images, Media and Representation in Research* (London: Sage, 2001), p. 134.

³⁹⁸ For information on how Roosevelt chose Powell, see Roosevelt’s introduction to *The Last Paradise*, pp. ix-xvii.

³⁹⁹ Powell, 1985, p. 54.

of a native girl (weaving), the author writes the name of the sitter (Renang). Like his predecessors, however, Powell never fails to notice the breasts.

Both Covarrubias and King, the graphic illustrators, have their own audiences in mind. While Covarrubias may draw his paintings from life, King, who had never visited Bali, sketched his drawings from imagination and, it is highly possible, from Krause's photographs.⁴⁰⁰ There are 18 illustrations by King. Two of them are nude female bathers that copy Krause's photos and the rest includes the sketches of cock fighting, women in the market, and women with offerings and burdens, including topless dancing girls.

2. 5. The Photographer as Author: Helen Eva Yates

As mentioned in Chapter 1, Yates used the photographs to lure would-be visitors.

In this section, I will discuss how Yates persuaded her readers to follow her journey through her visuality. Yates probably made a three-day standard trip to Bali and the twenty-three illustrations published in her book reflect that exactly. If Rose and Roosevelt indicated their closeness to the people they photographed by attaching their names, Yates's short visit did not allow her to get to know the Balinese people in her photographs.

Although Yates described the public bathing and bathing activities here and there in her book, she failed to take pictures of them – they are not shown at all in her travel book. This is partly because of her short stay and partly because of

⁴⁰⁰ King never visited Bali, however he (and 'Godmother' Mason) persuaded Roosevelt to book passage on the freighter. In return, the stories of Bali were told by Roosevelt, who had corralled Powell into writing the book and King into illustrating it (Williams, p. 273; Shavit, p. 71; Williams, pp. 60-1). See the 'similarities' between Krause 'Badende Manner' theme in *Insel Bali*, pp.135-67, especially 'Frau beim Haarwaschen' on p. 150 and King's drawings.

her failure to get up early to catch them.⁴⁰¹ However, like Rose and Covarrubias, she also took photographs of dancers including one dancer in a trance-like state. She captured the Balinese women's burden and their 'Nature' – the bare breasts. She is the only photographer discussed in this study who put two of her own portraits in her publication. The first one showed her by a Hindu temple taken in Bali⁴⁰² and the other one, which looks like a studio portrait, depicts Yates wearing batiks and posed while holding a Balinese puppet.⁴⁰³ Part of her private collection of Balinese batiks⁴⁰⁴ and curios⁴⁰⁵ such as masks, a miniature Hindu idol, two rings, a market basket and silver bowls are also presented in the book; thus they become public.

Like her male and female predecessors or contemporaries, Yates, as discussed in Chapter 1, did represent the Balinese women with their burdens textually, as well as successfully recording them in a picture.⁴⁰⁶ A text written underneath this photograph is as follows:

Balinese maidens carrying their own decorated offerings to the temple. One of these giant pyramids of brightly arrayed fruit, grain, and sweet cakes, trimmed with bamboo fringe and flowers, often weighs over twenty pounds and is lifted on to the girl's head by two men.⁴⁰⁷

This photograph is unlikely to be a 'posed' one; it is a snapshot. There is a group of women walking with offerings on their heads. In the caption, there is no romantic reference to, for example, the sway of the hip or the grace of their walk

⁴⁰¹ Yates, 1933, p. 38.

⁴⁰² *ibid.*, facing p. 105.

⁴⁰³ *ibid.*, facing p. 73.

⁴⁰⁴ *ibid.*, facing p. 81.

⁴⁰⁵ *ibid.*, facing p. 56.

⁴⁰⁶ Balinese men are hardly represented in carrying water, with the exception of Krause's '*Wasser holend*'. See Krause (1920), p. 67.

⁴⁰⁷ Yates, 1933, facing p. 112.

in this procession.⁴⁰⁸ Compared to other writers discussed in this study, Yates examines the weight of the burden that these women have to bear;⁴⁰⁹ that, for example, it needs two men to lift the offerings on to the women's head.⁴¹⁰ If Rose can only represent the semi-nude women photographically, Yates does so textually and photographically. Yates took three different photographs of people naked above the waist. The first is a posed group photo of five young girls, clothed with sarongs only, in front of a small temple. The explanation of the text is as follows:

A *meroe* is the simpler type of temple found in the smallest villages of Bali. During an offering these thatched roofs are stuck with "prayers" – little rosettes and wheels made of white palm leaf.⁴¹¹

The all-standing, full figure girls all look straight into the camera. In the background is a temple of pagoda-like structure. This long shot is quite different from the full figure close up of Krause's earlier images in a similar pose: offering girls.

The second example is the pounding girls in which three Balinese maidens happily posed in front of the granary. They seem to be photographed on the spot while they are doing the job. The two onlookers behind them add to the atmosphere that this picture is not totally directed by the photographer.

Underneath this photograph, Yates wrote:

⁴⁰⁸ She did describe the way the maidens walk in her book, but it is not as sensuous as the way it was portrayed by male authors.

⁴⁰⁹ On page 76, Yates (1933) says: 'In Bali, the heaviest tasks fall to the women.'

⁴¹⁰ Different from Yates who explained that it was men who helped lift the burden, two of the photographs taken by Krause in the 1912 book bear the following texts: '*Frauen helfen einander schwere Töpferwaren absetzen*' (p. 106) and '*Frauen beim Abnehmen der Last*' (p. 108). Here it was the women. These pyramids of offerings can be seven feet high and sometimes weigh 50 pounds, Williams, p. 77; Williams and Chong, p. 32.

⁴¹¹ Facing p. 40. Yates can certainly describe the detail of these 'prayers,' for she took one of the palm leaves and studied it carefully. However, she had to put it back where it was when the chauffeur reminded her that she must not take it away (Yates, 1933, p. 36.)

These Balinese maidens are happy and contented to grind the rice to make the cakes the gods like. There is no worry about changing styles here. One new *batik* a year is the main item of a Balinese belle's wardrobe.⁴¹²

Here Yates not only elaborates the purpose of grinding the rice, but also informs her readers about the practice of the Balinese's dressing – a style that requires change only once a year.

The last example of this genre is a portrait of the *sirih* seller. Yates agrees with earlier Gorer's remark that the Balinese are photogenic. The tone of her caption implies that she is a bit surprised to see how the lower classes, like this tobacco girl, can be beautiful. The beauty is described by the author via euphemism: 'nature'; the beauty of a half-naked girl selling tobacco.

Even the Balinese girl who sells *sirih* (tobacco) in the market-place is a beautifully formed child of Nature with shining cocoa skin and lovely dark eyes.⁴¹³

The rest of Yates photographs repeat the previous motifs, such as dancers, temples, and ritual ceremonies. What makes Yates different from the rest of the photographers in this study is that she writes a lengthy description for her photographs. Although she hardly ever describes the Balinese by their names, she is far from stereotyping them. Most of Yates' photographs are equipped with useful information. Her texts give the same information as the images. Is there a difference between the female and male author as photographer?

2. 6. The Photographer as Author: Geoffrey Gorer and Collin McPhee

Gorer and McPhee were the photographers and writers of *Bali and Angkor*

⁴¹² Yates, 1933, facing p. 32.

⁴¹³ *ibid.*, facing p. 80.

(1936) and *A House in Bali* (1946)⁴¹⁴ respectively. In addition, their photographs in those texts had never been published before. We learnt in the previous chapter that bare-breasted women did not seem to attract Gorer the writer; in this section I will explore whether this image interested him as a photographer. Similar investigations will also be undertaken in relation to McPhee.

None of Gorer's thirty-nine photographs in *Bali and Angkor*, ten of which were taken in Bali (but only five were photographed by Gorer himself), show any images of bare breasts. His photographic interests⁴¹⁵ encompass non-living things such as palaces, statues, gates, walls with relief including 'A statue in the wall of Banteai Srei' – a statue of a bare-breasted woman in Bangkok.

McPhee, however, included 53 photographs. There were 14 photos about Balinese musical instruments and musicians. The text that accompanied his photographs – such as 'The deep-toned *jégogans* carry the bass;' 'The *gangsas* fill the air with ringing sound;' '*G'ndérs* plays the melody for the *lélong* (sic) dance'; 'Cymbals and little bells add shimmer to the music of *Semara* the Love God;' 'The soft-toned flutes of the ancient *gambuh* play' – explained what the tape recorder could not do at that time. (Tape recorders were not yet invented and only became available after the war.) McPhee's words replaced the sounds of the music. Through his interest in the music, McPhee indirectly reveals his encounters with the local people. This composer described the 'natives', the musicians, the composers, the dancers as persons: 'Gedé Manik, drummer, dancer, composer of *kebyar*;' 'Lotring, the composer, was also famous for his subtle spicing of feast

⁴¹⁴ Although published in 1944, *A House in Bali* was the result of McPhee's travel account about Bali in the 1930s. McPhee's earlier publications are limited to music only. First Periplus Editions 2000, second printing with introduction (2002) in Singapore.

⁴¹⁵ McPhee learned about photography from other photographers, such as Jack Mershon and Hugo Bernatzik, when they were in Bali (Oja, p. 81).

dishes;’ ‘Gusti Lanang Oka, a musician;’ ‘Sampih,’ and ‘Durus’. Where possible groups are photographed with material artefacts associated with their occupations, occupations that in many cases were thought to be implied by a presumed biological identity. By presumed biological identity, I mean the people are photographed according to their gender-related activities such as ‘women are weaving or cooking’ while men ‘enjoy cock-fighting.’

If Gorer shared one bare breasts photo in the form of a statue, McPhee provided his readers with the photograph of ‘Rantun⁴¹⁶, the cook,’ the only bare-breast person to appear (and be named) in his photographic records. Additionally, there was ‘a stream of houseboys and chauffeurs: Kesyur, Durus, Pugig, and I Madé Lebah, the most important of them all’, wrote his biographer, Oja.⁴¹⁷ ‘Durus’, one of the houseboys, and ‘Sampih’,⁴¹⁸ who saved McPhee’s life from drowning⁴¹⁹, were special. After the flash flood incident, the two became friends and Sampih was seen visiting McPhee frequently; eventually, Sampih came to live there. Sampih was only eight when he met McPhee. Most of the photographs are of men. It is interesting to learn that the photograph of I Madé Lebah,⁴²⁰ the chauffeur cum travelling companion, was not there. Most of McPhee’s photographs are portraits of men with an ‘identity’ – with names. Does this have something to do with McPhee’s sexual liaisons.⁴²¹

⁴¹⁶ Among the cooks, Rantun was special. Oja, p. 74.

⁴¹⁷ Oja, p. 74.

⁴¹⁸ McPhee dedicated a long passage entitled ‘Sampih’ in his book. See McPhee, pp. 116-29.

⁴¹⁹ Oja, p. 88.

⁴²⁰ Lebah was also McPhee’s guide, interpreter and travelling companion, who was presented as individual throughout. Although McPhee himself was in poverty, he offered Lebah a share of the book’s royalties. Oja, p. 186.

⁴²¹ Bali is also popular because of its homosexual atmosphere – a homosexual paradise. While McPhee was married to Jane Belo, he was also having a relationship with a man (Oja, p. xii) and Belo knew about this (Oja, p. 57). For more theoretical information on the homosocial structure of

As we saw in the previous chapter, Powell's attraction to Renang is obvious, but the inclusion of Rantun the cook who is dear to McPhee is not done in the same way. McPhee's sexuality was indefinite; he was gay by inclination and eventually divorced Belo. As a gay man, McPhee was not enchanted by the idyllic beauty of Balinese women. This, arguably, shows how the more homosexual writers/photographers were, the more men in nude dominate women in nude. Without discussing the writers' homosexuality, analysis of their works remains incomplete because their thoughts were often driven by desires and sexual longings. The point being made is that one's sexual inclination influences how he or she perceives or presents his or her works. The discussion of homosexual artists' works of art will be discussed later in this chapter.

In contrast to Rose's and Roosevelt's photographic representations, where both photographs and captions show the same information in the same way, McPhee's photos and his own written texts cannot fully represent what he wishes to convey for they need other tools, such as recordings. Descriptions such as 'fill the air with ringing sound' cannot fully be represented photographically. It can be concluded that neither written words nor photographs can achieve the same interpretation. The case in point is the representations that are created by both the photographer and the author of the same book. The photographers in 1930s Bali still imitate the motifs of earlier representations. However, the photographic representations of Bali by men and women in the 1930s are merely focused on not type but person.

modern masculine life, see Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick, *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial Desire* (New York: Columbia University, 1985).

2. 7. Feminine Beauty and the 'Bare' Factors

By the 1860s in Victorian England there developed conventional standards of female beauty and womanly behaviour, which, themselves, reflected middle-class notions of femininity.⁴²² In Bali 'beauty' seems to be identical with the bare breasts. The popularity of the 'bare' aspects of the island is increased within the literary world as soon as a novel entitled *L'Île des Seins Nus* (The Island of Bare Breasts) by Edouard de Keyser was published in 1933. There is also a version within the scientific world. In 1881, long before Krause was stationed in Bangli, a medical doctor named Julius Jacobs went to Bali.⁴²³ Instead of concentrating on a campaign of smallpox vaccination, he introduced the beauty of Balinese women's breast to the European public, for the first time. His interest coincides with the ideas of physiognomy and certainly of race.

Jacobs notes that there are racial similarities between the Balinese, Javanese, and other Malay people, and illustrated his 'observations' with pictures of bare-breasted women. Jacobs' study was conducted when (the South of) Bali was still an independent kingdom and Jacobs was the official Netherlands East Indies vaccinator.⁴²⁴ As a visitor in a new land, Jacobs' scientific account recorded a whole lot more (of private issues) than the personal and medical observations of its author. It is not actually 'scientific', though it purported to be so. His discussions of Balinese women placed great emphasis on the idea of them

⁴²² Melman, 1995, p. 113.

⁴²³ Julius Jacobs, *Eenigen Tijd onder de Baliërs. Eene Reisbeschrijving met Aanteekeningen Betreffende Hygiëne, Land- en Volkenkunde van de Eilanden Bali en Lombok* (Batavia: G. Kolff, 1883).

⁴²⁴ Vickers, 1996, p. 86.

living in harems,⁴²⁵ thus creating a link between Balinese court life and the sensual perceptions of Middle Eastern potentates, perceptions that are still strong in Western thinking about Asia.⁴²⁶

In the Dutch East Indies, before the colonial period, there were few narrative histories about the natives, let alone about the history of the Balinese woman. There are no personal accounts, diaries, or official records either. Early documentation from the indigenous' source was probably depictions of women in the classical epic poetry of the ruling court of Java and Bali. While access to the court is limited to the European man, and research based on native sources requires mastery of the regional language, the representations of the Balinese rely mostly on Dutch sources. It is necessary at this point to see how the Dutch get and construct images of Balinese women.

Before the invention of photography in 1839, the art of drawing and painting was initially used for 'scientific' research. At the end of Raffles' administration, in 1815, Professor C.G.C. Reinwardt was appointed as the 'Director of Agricultural, Artistic and Scientific Affairs on Java and its adjacent islands'. His main task was, among others, to restore Holland's reputation in the international world.⁴²⁷ Reinwardt, like some writers who did not have the ability to draw, was accompanied by A.J. and J.T. Bik who served as his draughtsmen, whose task was to create Indonesian landscape paintings. Their travelling companion, Payen, also belonged to the new generation of painters. He was

⁴²⁵ Studies on harem from different countries such as Algeria, Turkey, and India see: Alloula (1986); Leslie P. Peirce, *The Imperial Harem: Women and Sovereignty in the Ottoman Empire* (New York: Oxford University, 1993); Grewal (1996).

⁴²⁶ Vickers: 1996, p. 87; Morgan, p. 236.

⁴²⁷ Terwen – De Loos, J., *Nederlandse schilders en tekenaars in de Oost, 17de – 20ste eeuw*, Amsterdam, 1972, p. 18 quoted in Groeneveld, p. 12.

specifically asked to paint scenes of daily life for the 'Indonesian Gallery' that in due course was supposed to be established in The Hague. Here the painters' work was used for scientific purposes. It is here that Reed began to notice that 'The arts of drawing and painting, largely serving scientific purposes, developed in tandem.'⁴²⁸ Here, in the era before the scenery or objects were being aimed at or shot (photographed), the hired painters or the draftsmen became an adjunct of the scientists. Reinwardt was also accompanied by Payen, who was hired to paint daily life scenery for the collection of the Indonesian Gallery in The Hague.⁴²⁹

Bali was not yet known as the land of artists when Payen came to Java. Payen's job was later, after the invention of photography, replaced by photographers, writers, and anthropologists, to supply the much-needed photographic documentation for museum specimens. He wrote a travel diary, recorded the scenery in writing, and then painted it. What are the functions of these visual texts?

During the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, at the time of the Dutch East India Company⁴³⁰, the colonisers wrote travel memoirs and upon returning to the Netherlands inscribed the travel in the forms of drawings and paintings. In this period, this trading company manifested little interest in Bali although it had established itself firmly in other islands such as the Molukkas (Maluku), Java (Jawa) and Sumatra. This was possibly because this island of gods did not have

⁴²⁸ Reed, p. 12.

⁴²⁹ Groeneveld, p. 12.

⁴³⁰ Known in the East as the VOC (*Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie*).

any spices. Bali has no suitable land for plantation farming⁴³¹ to offer, and as the new Tahiti, Bali became the place of painting making.

Bali does seem to have opened some sort of trading post in about the year 1602. This imperial interaction through trading was officiated in a 'document.' A letter signed by Cornelis van Eemskerckin on 7 July 1601 indicated that the Dutch had special rights to open trade in the island.⁴³² The first merchant was asked to trade, amongst other things, rice, beast, provisions, and women. Later trade in the case of Bali meant opium and female slaves.⁴³³ Following this, there was very little indication of subsequent activities or of any continuing European presence until the persistent intrusions of the English. During those years (before the signing of the treaty), there were some other countries who wanted to expand into Balinese waters. Regarding Bali as the indisputable patrimony of the Netherlands, the Dutch felt unhappy with the English.⁴³⁴ It is ironic that this rivalry between the Dutch and the English had a massive Western impact on Bali. Realising Bali's 'true' potential and being suspicious of the 'predatory English', to use Hanna's words, the Dutch gave more attention to this ugly little Bali. Gradually, however, the libraries of Holland had been filling with scholarly volumes on the literature, the archaeology, and the religion of Bali.⁴³⁵

⁴³¹ Picard, 1996, p. 19. Unlike Java and Sumatra, Bali has no rubber or tea plantations to offer. The Dutch took over the highly profitable opium monopoly.

⁴³² For discussion on the 'agreement' between Prince Maurits, the then King of Holland and Dewa Agung (the Balinese King) see Hanna, p. 11.

⁴³³ Hanna noted that the King of Bali, as a token of appreciation, presented van Heemskerck with a beautiful Balinese female slave, Hanna, p. 12.

⁴³⁴ In 1915, the British and Dutch signed a treaty fixing the boundary between North Borneo (Sabah) and The Netherlands Indies.

⁴³⁵ Bali was only conquered by the Dutch in 1908. The 'Puputan' from 1904-1906, which literally means 'the end', was the Balinese way of ending the war with the Dutch, whereby they voluntarily killed themselves with their *kris* (traditional dagger).

As discussed in Chapter 1, the impact of Raffles' written account of Bali, which tends towards reproducing noble images of indigenous Bali, is demonstrated by later writers and, eventually, artists. Along with the more 'modern' image of the islanders as depicted by later visitors, the gallery and the museum exhibit more 'human-like' displays, as opposed to exotic, ancient, or anthropological related images. (I will return to this later in Chapter 4.) Raffles himself compiled the comprehensive *The History of Java*, complete with sixty-six plates, which were of a much higher quality than the Dutch drawings. It is here that public interest in the Indonesian islands was slowly starting to grow, particularly within scientific circles. Here science became a camouflage for colonialism.

Soon, these 'natural' looking inhabitants replace the fierce-looking 'savages' images. This propaganda is apparently meant to restore the image of the Dutch following the tragic *puputan*. As we discussed in Chapter 1, this voluntarily mass suicide brought Bali to international attention and tarnished the reputation of the Dutch. It was also used to justify the need for Dutch, as opposed to British, 'civilisation,' in the Indies. In addition, the Dutch also needed to demonstrate their ownership of the Indies to the world. In order to justify the colonisation in the East Indies, they used propaganda to show only the 'positive' changes they had brought to the colony such as clothing the Balinese women.

As we discussed earlier, the idea of the bare-breasts and their covering was exciting to Western men. Within the Victorian context, men lack of access to female bodies in the media. Men use an 'anthropological' guise to view female breasts.

The first foreign artist to visit Bali was W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp⁴³⁶ (1874-1950). Nieuwenkamp came in 1904 and the last time he visited Bali was in 1937. He came with not only his own painting style in mind, but that of Balinese traditional one too. Nieuwenkamp was one of the many artists who were exhilarated by the Orient. One cannot fully guess how he was first attracted to Bali's art. In 1918, together with Dr Gregor Krause's photos⁴³⁷, Nieuwenkamp exhibited his drawings in Amsterdam on the occasion of the first 'Balinese Art' exhibition. Little is known about how they first met, but sometime later the remote little island soon revealed itself as a land for artists. In addition to the Dutch, there were various artists from different parts of Europe, who travelled to, and remained in Bali to work there in a free-lance capacity and without any scientific aim.⁴³⁸ These artistic figures who came from Sweden, Switzerland, Belgium, and the Netherlands, along with literary figures discussed in earlier chapters, transformed Bali into a little Europe rather than a *Jonck Hollandt* (Young Holland), as claimed by Cornelis de Houtman centuries ago.

One of the Dutch artists who was influenced by Nieuwenkamp was Rudolf Bonnet. His travelling to Italy to become an artist was an escape from his *petite bourgeoisie* background. However, Bonnet first crossed the Mediterranean to travel through Northern Africa. It was here that he met Nieuwenkamp who at that time had a villa near Florence. Nieuwenkamp managed to persuade Bonnet to follow the route that Nieuwenkamp had taken some twenty years previously.

⁴³⁶ One of Nieuwenkamp's books *Bali en Lombok* is an important early ethnographic and archaeological study. Nieuwenkamp visited Bali many times.

⁴³⁷ Krause visited Bali for the first time in 1912 and his two-volume photo collection, *Bali 1912*, was not published until 1920. First published in German, the second edition, which is condensed into one volume, circulated in 1922.

⁴³⁸ For more discussion on 'foreign' artists on Bali see Ruud Spruit's *Artists on Bali* (1997).

When Bonnet arrived in Bali in 1929, he met a Dutch musicologist, Jaap Kunst, with whom he travelled to Nias and made sketches and photographs. The following year, Bonnet settled in Ubud, Bali.⁴³⁹

Like many travel writers and photographers discussed earlier, who sought adventure or ideas to write, the European artists looked to Bali for inspiration. These artists wanted to follow their predecessors. Paul Gauguin (1848-1903) never visited Bali but he did go to Tahiti to paint. Gauguin, however, indirectly influenced at least two painters to come to Bali: Adrien-Jean Le Mayeur de Merpres⁴⁴⁰, the cousin of the King of Belgium at that time, and Theo Meier from Switzerland. Some artists wanted to follow Gauguin to find new inspiration in the South Seas. Painters such as Meier and Le Mayeur did not realise the decline of the South Seas' – Tahiti and French Polynesia – beauty, even during Gauguin's time. Le Mayeur found nothing but disappointment, which led to him going to Bali in 1930. Admiring Gauguin's work in an exhibition held in Switzerland, Meier sailed off to Tahiti in 1932 before discovering this 'new' painting spot in 1936. A Swedish painter, John Sten, who came from a humble family, received a grant to travel to the South Seas in 1922 to paint but ended up in Bali. He died in Bali the following year. Little is known about his 'Balinese' paintings except that the Pont Aven group and Rondism influenced him during his stay in Paris at the end of the 19th century. It seems that during those years, a number of painters travelled to find inspiration and to follow other people's paths because they could afford it.

⁴³⁹ Spruit, p. 40.

⁴⁴⁰ Le Mayeur was one of the foreigners allowed to marry a native. He let his wife stay bare-breasted. Because the Dutch wanted to continue their propaganda of civilisation, they warned him. He pleaded for backup from his royal family in Belgia and he won the case.

Having discussed some reasons why artists came to Bali, it is time to talk about the object of their paintings, and how this constitutes and circulates the earlier images of Bali. Many travellers to Bali just desired adventure. However, some of them finally settled permanently in the island. In 1915, C. L. Dake, a free-lance painter, did this. Dake was one of the most successful painters of the impressionistic ‘Beautiful Indies School’ of painting, which was dominated by the Dutch East Indies during the pre-WW II period. Dake’s favourite style is temple gates with naturally twisted frangipani trees. Although his style was not imitated by the later generation of painters, this Balinese cultural symbol – frangipani trees –, like the repeated use of India’s banyan trees in an Indian context, was featured repeatedly, not only in the textual representations discussed earlier, but, as revealed later, in photography. It is here that the different objects of paintings are discussed.

2. 8. The Content and Style of the Paintings

The Dutch painter Willem Dooijewaard (1892-1980), for example, often painted geishas during his stay in Japan.⁴⁴¹ Dooijewaard’s other works depict markets, religious ceremonies and elaborate temples.⁴⁴² *A Balinese Girl with Sacrificial Vessels* and *Balinese Girl at an Elaborately Sculpted Water Spout*⁴⁴³ echo an

⁴⁴¹ Some of Dooijewaard’s works include *Geisha Smoking*, *Geisha Reading/Geisha Resting*, *A Portrait of a Geisha*, and *A Geisha* (one in water colour and the other in coloured chalks). *A Balinese Girl with Sacrificial Vessels* echoes an earlier theme.

⁴⁴² Museum Groh Gallery exhibition ‘Among Friends: Drawings by Dooijewaard & Singer’ (29 September – 10 December 2006 featuring William H. Singer, Jr. (1868-1943) and Willem Dooijewaard (1892-1980) – to commemorate the museum’s 75th anniversary.

⁴⁴³ Dooijewaard’s colored chalks on paper *Balinese Girl at an Elaborately Sculpted Water Spout*, made S\$40,000 from the estimated S\$16,000-18,000. Carla Bianpoen, ‘Auction House Makes Name for itself in S’pore,’ *The Jakarta Post*, 28 December 2006. Online. Available: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20031228.F01>. 19 December 2006.

earlier theme. In 1913, Dooijewaard decided to adventure to Bali and spent almost 12 years in the island.⁴⁴⁴ He then introduced Bali to his fellow artist, the Austrian Rolland Strasser. Both Dooijewaard and Strasser liked to share a model, and worked together in the open air.⁴⁴⁵

In the 1930s, a good example of an artist painting nude women is Willem Hofker (1902-1981), a Dutch painter, who came to Bali on 3 January 1938. Hofker came with his wife, Maria, a painter. Maria was the daughter of Willem Rueter, also a painter. Unlike other artists who came to the Indies for its exoticism, Hofker was invited by J. E. Backer, the director of KPM. As a commissioned painter, he was sent to KPM's headquarter in Batavia (now Jakarta) to paint a portrait of Queen Wilhelmina and presented the portrait himself for the Queen's jubilee.⁴⁴⁶ During the voyage with KPM, Hofker was given the chance to draw and paint to create works for use in KPM advertising campaign.

As a painter, Hofker's strong point was his portraits.⁴⁴⁷ When he was in Batavia, Hofker tried to draw the common people, but the models refused to be drawn due to religious prohibition. The local people in Jakarta, who were (and are) mostly Moslems, did not want to pose.⁴⁴⁸ It was possibly his unfulfilled expectation – to paint Jakartan girls – that brought him and Maria to Bali. Soon, Hofker was fascinated by the elegant *legong* dancers and was delighted to learn

⁴⁴⁴ He signed a six-year contract as a planter and returned in 1919. See Eddy Katimansah's *W. Dooijewaard, a Dutch Artist in Indonesia* (Jakarta: Aneka Pasti Raya, 1992), p. 106 and p. 108.

⁴⁴⁵ van Brakel, p. 116.

⁴⁴⁶ The portrait of the Queen was officially presented in 1938. However, when the Japanese arrived in 1942, it was publicly set on fire. Spruit, p. 74.

⁴⁴⁷ According to one critic, 'Hofker's strength was in his portraits; he was able to paint his models in relaxed realistic poses. Clothing and hair were painted with great skill, while the expression in the eyes on each of Hofker's portraits draws attention because of their surprising naturalness.' (Spruit, p. 74).

⁴⁴⁸ See Spruit, especially 'Hofker' pp. 73-4.

that Balinese girls did not mind posing for free. The Hofkers decided to stay and in 1940 eventually moved to Ubud on the advice of Bonnet.⁴⁴⁹

Hofker painted the same model, Goesti Made Toewi, at least four times. Two of them, which were painted in 1943, have as their title the name of the model. In these two paintings, the same model, painted by the same artist, wearing the same 'outfit' and posed half-naked, represents an individual: Goesti Made Toewi. It is clear that Hofker was fascinated above all things by the sensuous beauty of Balinese women. There seems to be an attachment between Hofker and Toewi. He repeatedly posed a certain model and gave the model's name as the title of his paintings. Toewi became Hofker's substitution and fulfilment of the clothed Jakartans' model. According to Michael Levey, the presence of an artist's favourite models and the way they are identified, by naming or portraiture, show how emotional ties exist between the artist and the sitter. Therefore, Levey continues, 'the particular features and expression of the model's face assumes greater importance'. (These 'emotional ties,' as revealed, later determine the expression of the photographers' models.)

On reading the title *Girl at the Campuan Temple*⁴⁵⁰ (1943) by Hofker, the viewers expect to see a ritual place or ceremony of people of Bali. Instead, this painting shows a bare-breasted young girl, posed against the background of the temple. *Girl at Temple* (n.d.), *Ni Noneh* (1941) and *Gusti Made Toewi* (1943) are examples of Hofker's other paintings of girl-gate type. The titles of the last two

⁴⁴⁹ Bonnet was one of the Dutch artists who came to Bali. Bonnet arrived on Bali in 1929. In 1936, along with Cokorde Gde Agung Sukawati, I Gusti Nyoman Lempad and Walter Spies, Bonnet founded *Pita Maha* (meaning: Great Spirit Guiding Inspiration). When the war broke out, Bonnet and Hofker were interned. In 1947, he went back to Bali and only left for the Netherlands in 1957. When he died on April 18, 1987, his body was cremated. His Balinese friends requested that his ashes be brought to Bali. On January 1981, Bonnet's ashes were burnt with Sukawati's body in a traditional ceremony, Spruit, pp. 42-4.

⁴⁵⁰ Now in Neka Museum, Ubud, Bali.

paintings are the names of the models. There are traditional connotations for the Balinese regarding their dwellings. According to Covarrubias, the Balinese believes that a house is like a human being. Each part of the house represents part of the body. The head is the family shrine; the arms are the bedrooms and common rooms; a navel is the courtyard; the legs and feet are the kitchen and the granary; the anus is the pit, waste or disposal area at the backyard; and the gate symbolises the sexual organs.⁴⁵¹

The native girl, the Balinese model in *Girl at the Campuan Temple* is merely a decoration. In posing the model, the painters and the photographers usually create their own directional approach based on what they themselves consider as ways to represent others. Unconsciously, there is a tendency to portray the native girls using the Balinese connotations. However, he was not the first who introduced this ‘girl-gate’ composition, for, as discussed previously, it was used widely by Weissenborn in photography. Interestingly, the girl and the temple gate combination is widely imitated by local painters, as well. These kinds of paintings are still being produced and sold in Bali.

Hofker’s fascination, indeed obsession, in painting nudity and all the romantic images of the pristine Balinese beauty indicates his interest in the elegant beauty of Balinese girls. Hofker’s other paintings showing Balinese girls dancing and performing ritual ceremonies, such as *A Balinese Dancer* (1944), *Three Young Balinese Women with Offerings*, (1947) and *A Seated Balinese*

⁴⁵¹ Covarrubias, 1973, p. 88. For more information on Balinese traditional house, see Popo Danes, ‘Balinese Architecture from Cosmic to Modern’ in Urs Ramseyer and I Gusti Raka Panji Tisna (eds.), *Bali Living in Two Worlds: A Critical Self-Portrait* (Basel: Schwabe, 2001), pp. 95-104. Also published in German language under the title *Bali – Leben in zwei Welten* (2001).

*Beauty with Offerings*⁴⁵² (n.d.), all feature women without coverings on the upper part of their bodies. Many sources describe women covering their breasts.

Balinese girls cover their breasts upon entering the temple: 'On the afternoon of the second day, a very strange procession moves towards the temple. Women and girls move in long rows, wearing white sarongs, the upper parts of their bodies covered in silk interwoven with gold thread'⁴⁵³; when performing ritual dances: 'Girl dancers in full dress wait patiently for their cue'⁴⁵⁴; 'For this evening practice the girls had bound their breasts with scarves, and that was all'⁴⁵⁵; 'When the girl of Bali prepares to dance in public she puts on clothes'⁴⁵⁶; and the same happens during religious festivals: 'Above the waist, they go bare, except for festive occasions...'⁴⁵⁷. This image is also portrayed by a female photographer discussed previously. One cannot help but see this as part of the European (male) painters' erotic fantasy⁴⁵⁸ and ideal beauty.⁴⁵⁹ What the viewer or armchair travellers saw is not 'a girl by a temple' but a sexually available young woman who seemingly shows an 'invitation.' This composition therefore has a strong erotic connotation. These European artists try to translate the images that they are already familiar with and later modify them by adding repeated or new icons. This Western consumption of otherness, whether in the metropolitan centre or

⁴⁵² This particular painting (estimated S\$600-800) was sold S\$ 5.000 in an auction titled Pictures of Asia Fine Art, Carla Bianpoen, 'Auction House Makes Name for itself in S'por,' *The Jakarta Post*, 28 December 2003. Online. Available:

<http://thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20031228.F01>. 19 December 2006.

⁴⁵³ Krause, 1988, p. 99.

⁴⁵⁴ *ibid.*, p. 82.

⁴⁵⁵ Powell, 1985, p. 58.

⁴⁵⁶ *ibid.*, p. 113.

⁴⁵⁷ Yates, 1933, p. 77.

⁴⁵⁸ Alloula, 1986; Graham-Brown, 1988.

⁴⁵⁹ Edwards, 1977, p. 8.

periphery (inside or outside the West), does not take place without affecting the Others.

It is interesting at this point to discuss how certain printed images were being used for different publications. It was, in fact, Hofker who painted Ni Gusti Kompiang – the model – wearing Balinese costume, and titled it *A Balinese Beauty*; and when ‘Ni Gusti Kompiang’ appeared in Michel Picard’s book, ‘A Balinese Beauty’ is the title used by Picard to accompany the blouse-less Goesti Made Toewi. This not only provides an example of how ‘Paintings are often reproduced with words around them,’⁴⁶⁰ but also how certain texts are added in order to serve the purpose of the image users. This relates to another discussion on captions later. Before discussing the caption and how meaning is interpreted, it is useful at this point to discuss the colonial photographs. What has been discussed so far is how there is a certain mimetic function among artists, amateur and professional photographers alike. In mimetic theories of art, Ghose claimed that ‘texts are presumed to transparently reproduce a visual experience’.⁴⁶¹ This also applies, as discussed in Chapter 1, to written accounts of Bali, where earlier narratives or stereotypes are copied and used repeatedly. However, the conditioning or the inter-relationship in recycling images from the earlier ones, either from paintings or photographs, is not easy to tell, at least according to Vaizey:

So artists from the beginning of modern photography have themselves both used photography and been conditioned by photographic imagery, a photographic vision. Simultaneously, photographers have often imitated artists, and in many poses, many point of view, shared by photographers and artists it is difficult if not impossible to say what conditioned what.⁴⁶²

⁴⁶⁰ Berger, p. 27.

⁴⁶¹ Ghose, 1999, p. 55.

⁴⁶² Vaizey, p. 11.

It is clear that at the beginning, photographers, with several new and quite unorthodox techniques, produced pictures that looked like paintings.⁴⁶³ A new pose, frequently found in paintings, in which the hand of the subject is brought up to the face, appears in early portrait photographs.⁴⁶⁴ In representing Balinese women in paintings, artists used literary and photographic imagery circulated earlier. They directed the same poses and with the material culture available, as well as knowledge of the local culture, they created a new trend.

In a similar vein, the Balinese were actually affected by the first tourists and the first foreign artists to have set foot on Bali. Nieuwenkamp's depiction of a bicycle, for instance, was represented in Balinese art.⁴⁶⁵ Soon Balinese's paintings were inundated with foreigners holding their cameras, cars, and other things.⁴⁶⁶ Although Nieuwenkamp came earlier, Spies' influence on the revolutionary changes in Balinese painting was undeniably important.⁴⁶⁷

The suggestion that Balinese art leaped from 'medieval' to 'modern' because of the intervention of the foreigners, both as advisers and patrons, ignores the part of each story which tells that the first impulse came from the Balinese themselves, and it implies that Spies and Bonnet were exercising a kind of artistic colonisation.⁴⁶⁸

Historically, the Balinese produced arts and crafts for their traditional purpose. These art products were used as adornments to temples, palaces, or court houses. There were not many outside influences, and because of that Balinese art had remained unaffected until 1928. As for paintings, the Balinese hardly ever

⁴⁶³ Aaron Scharf, *Art and Photography* (Middlesex: Penguin, 1974), p. 15.

⁴⁶⁴ Scharf, p. 50.

⁴⁶⁵ Depiction of Nieuwenkamp riding his bicycle can be found in a stone relief on the temple of Medoewe Karang, (Spruit, p. 17).

⁴⁶⁶ Spruit, p. 42.

⁴⁶⁷ Rhodius and Darling, p. 67; Picard, 1996, p. 32; Covarrubias, 1973, p. 194.

⁴⁶⁸ Rhodius and Darling, p. 67.

signed paintings because paintings were not for sale. The fact that there is a significant change in Balinese painting does not mean that there is a sort of 'artistic colonisation' on the part of an advisor or patron. If we do not know for sure who the 'advisor' or the 'patron' is, it is difficult to say who colonises whom. The fact that many of Spies' paintings are influenced by Balinese arts, makes it safe to say that there was a two-way exchange between the Balinese and the foreign artists; it was an internal phenomenon.

In Balinese traditional art, the artists are encouraged to copy from what their forebears had done. It is even considered satisfactory if they copy as closely as possible. The development of Balinese modernist art produced paintings in modern style that were free from the constraints of normal convention. Regardless of whether there were internal or external influences, Balinese artists showed their personal imagination and creativity.

2. 9. Paintings and Photographs

This section discusses how visual images are imitated, reproduced, and circulated. Word of mouth, drawings, paintings, travel books, novels, autobiographies, magazines, scientific accounts and colonial tourist pamphlets all contribute to the early image of Bali, but the chief instrument is photographs, thanks to their mass-production capability and also to transportation. In 1924, the first airmail service from Batavia to Amsterdam began. At that time, it took two months for the airmail to travel. This means the speed of distribution of the images had become important. When the camera was first invented, it was claimed that it had a special

relationship to ‘reality’ and ‘truth.’⁴⁶⁹ Therefore, it is useful at this point to talk about the relationship between paintings and photographs.

As discussed in Chapter 1, texts, produced during the Dutch colonization, portrayed the sexualised native women, their tradition and culture, their bathing and dressing code, and their similarities with the apes. This section investigates whether photography produces similar images and themes.

Some artists, like some travellers discussed in Chapter 1, copy an image that is circulated earlier. The representations of slaves in paintings create images of two opposite fantasies of an alien culture: between violence – savage, and pleasure – erotic. In his book *The Orientalists: European Painters of Eastern Scenes*, Philippe Jullian argues that ‘Most of the Orientalists sought to evoke pictures of easy pleasure and passive beauties, the slaves’.⁴⁷⁰ Here, in the context of colonial Bali, European painters and photographers find voyeurism in Balinese ‘easy pleasure’ not only in slaves, but also, as revealed later, in their variants: servants, odalisques, and prostitutes (sex slaves).

In 1839, the year the invention of the fixed photographic image was announced, Paul Delaroche⁴⁷¹ (1797-1856) declared that painting was dead; some painters refused to believe that was so. For them, photography brings a form of imitation; it gives some painters new inspiration. Because of the newly invented photography, some artists use photographs they have taken themselves but some just copy the fixed images of other people in their paintings. For some, there are

⁴⁶⁹ Terry Barrett, *Criticizing Photographs: An Introduction to Understanding Images* (California: Mayfield, 1996), p. 36; Vaizey, 1982, p. 8.

⁴⁷⁰ Jullian, p. 96.

⁴⁷¹ Paul Delaroche was the chair of a committee set up by the French Academy in 1839 to investigate and evaluate the claims of Louise Daguerre (1789-1851) to have succeeded in the elusive business of permanently, through chemical means, fixing a momentary image of the real world. He said: ‘From today painting is dead!’ See Vaizey, p. 9.

upon occasion very strong correspondences between paintings and photographs. If Ingres' paintings were based on description in literature, then Eugène Delacroix⁴⁷² (1798-1863) painted some of his art works from photographs as well as from life. 'Delacroix was a founder member (1851) of the first national photographic society in France (Société Héliographique) but was never himself, as far as is known, a photographer.'⁴⁷³

Eugène Durieu was a good friend of Delacroix and he often photographed models under the direction of Delacroix, who posed the model for Durieu to photograph. Durieu's *Photograph of a Naked Woman*, which shows what 'naked' usually means, represents a photographic image of an unidentified woman without clothes. Delacroix enjoyed painting either in the photographic studio or from the photographs taken by Durieu.

One of Delacroix's paintings, *The Odalisque*⁴⁷⁴ (1857) was the 'copy' of Durieu's photograph taken four years earlier. Although the pose of the naked woman is slightly altered, it is identical to the *Photograph of a Naked Woman*. However, it is now a 'nude'. However, in contrast to the photograph, the painting represents an image of an Odalisque, a chambermaid; a slave; a prostitute: not just any woman. It never occurred to Delacroix that photography would replace

⁴⁷² The poetry of Lord Byron inspired Delacroix's painting for the 1827 Salon, *Death of Sardanapalus*.

⁴⁷³ Vaizey, p. 13.

⁴⁷⁴ The word *odalisque* comes from the Turkish *odaliq*, meaning chambermaid (from *oda* = chamber). Initially a chambermaid or a slave in the service of the women of the harem, the odalisque was metamorphosed by Orientalist painting (see Jean Auguste Dominique Ingres) into the sublimated image of the one enclosed by the harem. This prohibited space is endowed by the Western imagination with a strong erotic connotation. See Ingres' *La grand Odalisque* (1814) and *Odalisque and Slave* (1839).

painting. Such a 'pictorialism', to apply Barthes' formula, 'is only an exaggeration of what the photograph thinks of itself.'⁴⁷⁵

It is really difficult, given the fact that Delacroix is the sole director/producer of the art, to tell which 'copy' is 'real' for he believes that photography is a reflection of the real, a copy, and 'in some ways false just because it is so exact'.⁴⁷⁶ The woman in the painting is shown reclining on the sofa, one hand, an uplifted one, touching her hair. Although this is not a new motif, one can guess when and where the image has been used before. It is reminiscent of Cleopatra lounging by the Nile. Cleopatra also had inspired Artemisia Gentileschi (1597-1651). 'Reclining Woman' appears repeatedly as a title of paintings, as well as a theme, in the repertoire of artists and photographers. According to Mary D. Garrard, 'the crossed legs and arm curved over the head' is 'an antique convention indicating sleep.'⁴⁷⁷ The earlier pictorial roots for the idea of sleeping women could be found in a 15th century relief. See Greco-roman's *Venus dei Medici* and Giorgione's *Sleeping Venus*.

The origin of this reclining pose can be traced back as early as the Mesopotamia period: A figurine of a reclining woman from 2nd century B.C. – 2nd century A.D; and Gustave Courbet's (1819-1877) painting *Reclining Woman* circa 1865/1866. There are at least three other art works with the same title, *Reclining Woman*, but which use a different medium. The first is made of marble and is by an unknown artist from the 19th century; the other one is made of stone and was

⁴⁷⁵ Roland Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Vintage, 1993), p. 31.

⁴⁷⁶ Vaizey, p. 14.

⁴⁷⁷ Mary D. Garrard, *Artemisia Gentileschi: The Image of the Female Hero in Italian Baroque Art* (Princeton: Princeton University, 1989), p. 252. See also M. MacDougall, 'The Visual in Anthropology', in *Rethinking Visual Anthropology* ed. by M. Banks and H. Morphy, (London: Routledge, 1975), p. 359.

produced by Henry Moore in 1930. The source for the *Reclining Woman*, for example, is surely the famous classical statue in the Cortile Belvedere of Vatican: *The Sleeping Ariadne* (c. 240 B.C).⁴⁷⁸

In addition to Delacroix, a 19th century French painter who is not threatened by the invention of photography, to take one example, is Gustave Courbet (1819-1877), a pioneer of radical Realism. Delacroix's *The Painter's Studio* (1855) is believed to be a 'copy' of Julien Vallou de Villeneuve's (1795-1866) photograph *Nude Study* (1854).⁴⁷⁹ A very young woman is depicted clutching the material and trying to cover her naked body with it. This is a much-copied romantic image which resembles curtain-like material. This motif is also applied to the Javanese (Fig. 6) and Sundanese photographs (Fig. 7). This pose is a spontaneous reaction, which arises when a woman realises that she is found without clothes.

The purpose and intention of the painter is imposed upon the photographer. Here Delacroix used photography that he himself directed. He is the one controls the model. However, the purposes behind the two different image-makers, the painter (Courbet) and the photographer (de Villeneuve), were and are different. In comparing the two nudes, one is astonished to see the photographic-like image of the painting. It is not clear whether Courbet knows de Villeneuve in person, but these images only complicate the relationship between art and photography.

⁴⁷⁸ Now in Museo Vaticano, Rome.

⁴⁷⁹ Although there is no evidence that Courbet himself took photographs, he painted from photographs and was interested in working from photograph. The photographer, Villeneuve, was a printmaker and painter who took up photography in the 1840s. It is thought that Alfred Bruyas, a patron of Courbet's, and the subject of several of Courbet's paintings, introduced Courbet to Villeneuve's photographs of women (Vaizey, p. 21).

In addition to imitation of photography and painting, the circulation of imagery is also influenced by the caption attached to the image. Fig. 8 shows how different image users put different text to the same picture. In his book *Bali in the 19th century*, a Balinese scholar, Ide Anak Agung Gde Agung, applied the following lines to the photo:

Gusti Ngurah Ketut Jelantik, Regent/Raja of Buleleng who in 1860 was appointed by the Netherlands Indies government as the highest Balinese authority over the region. However, in 1872 he was removed by the Netherlands Indies government and exiled to Padang in West Sumatra.⁴⁸⁰

Agung places emphasis on who Jelantik is, and ignores the presence of the assistant. He points out Jelantik's status, as well as when and by whom he was appointed and removed. Although Agung ignores the scribe completely, as a Balinese himself he offers a more accurate description of the regent. Agung perhaps shows more emotional ties towards Jelantik. Vickers, however, writes: 'Gusti Ktut Jlantik, raja of Buleleng, north Bali, with his scribe, 1865'.⁴⁸¹ Here Vickers needs to tell the readers the status of the other man, who is caught in the act of writing, along with his pen, paper and some kind of briefcase. Once again, it is a traditional one. The scribe is not given an identity; he is a 'type'.

Jelantik was the Balinese ruler most favoured by the Dutch. However, he was part of the new development of elite Indonesian self-assertion. He is also the favourite of Dutch or Dutch related photographers, perhaps because of his charisma and his photogenic features. Another portrait of Jelantik is one of Weisseborn's series of Balinese aristocrats taken during the 1920s. The costume, setting, display, and the European style jacket and chair affirm what we

⁴⁸⁰ Agung, p. 140.

⁴⁸¹ Vickers, 1996, after p. 84.

have been discussing so far. All these – the Jelantik series – are frequently reproduced in many books.

Now it is time to compare the images of Balinese rulers to those of the Dutch. In the drawing of Governor General Hendrik Brouwer, he was pictured in his uniform, one hand on hip. Unlike the King of Buleleng whose *kris* seems to be pointed out strangely (in order to be captured by the camera), Brouwer is holding his sword naturally, revealing only the handle. Brouwer's name, his occupation, and the governor's insignia are printed underneath. The same posture, the controlled pose, hands on hips are also applied to Jan Chretien Baud, the Governor General of the Netherlands Indies 1833-1836, and General J. van Swieten. Both wear their uniforms. The image-makers seems to state 'how things are', who and what these high-ranking officials are; but in representing Others, the people are portrayed so as to show that 'this is what they should be' within the image-makers' own terms.

As a metaphor of Bali, it is interesting to learn how both Bali and the women were being subjugated. After the Dutch occupation of Buleleng in 1848, according to Covarrubias, there was a rule to have Balinese women wear blouses. Covarrubias did not mean that it was the Balinese who were seductive nor did he believe that they needed to be 'civilised' by clothing them. Although this law was passed because 'the morals of the Dutch soldiers needed protection,'⁴⁸² it was implemented only in Singaraja and Denpasar.

⁴⁸² Covarrubias, 1973, p. 393. See also Powell's *The Last Paradise*.

In addition to Covarrubias, Picard observed that it is not the missionaries but the proper Dutch who required Balinese women to cover their breasts. This is applied in order to protect the morals of the Dutch men:

Out of concern for morality and decency, the colonial authorities had long before, ordered that Balinese women cover their breasts in public, but this order was followed only in Singaraja and Denpasar. Already in 1939, the Balinese nationalists had urgently requested that the Dutch government take the necessary steps to prevent tourists from photographing the breasts of Balinese women and to forbid the circulation of the pamphlets and postcards illustrated with photos of bare-breasted Balinese women.⁴⁸³

While it is possible that models were paid to pose, it is also not impossible that they were forced to pose bare-breasted. All this reveals the hidden agenda of the Dutch, for example the need for propaganda. The Dutch wanted to justify colonisation in terms of their 'civilising' the unclothed people at the same time as they wanted to promote tourism:

The tour operators were more cynical. While they paid lip-service to the enlightened paternalism of the colonial authorities, they used the argument of the imminent degradation of Bali to incite visitors to hurry and come before it was too late.⁴⁸⁴

It is obvious that for the Dutch one way to exploit Bali is through tourism. One key tourist attraction is the Balinese's breasts. In a series of tourism posters, *See Bali* (1939), such as the one painted by J. Korver, issued by the Travellers official information Bureau of the Netherlands Indies, Batavia, a bare-breasted young woman was shown carrying an offering on her head.

The controversy was echoed in the Tourist Bureau, whose spokesmen, since the installation of their representative in Singaraja in 1924, criticized the attitude of Western artists and writers who, having helped to popularize Bali by extolling the beauty of the land and the richness of its culture, nevertheless wanted to forbid tourists access to the island. Now

⁴⁸³ Picard, 1996, p. 41; see also Powell, 1985, pp. 6-7.

⁴⁸⁴ Picard, 1996, p. 37.

that the curiosity of the West was aroused, it was too late to back-paddle.⁴⁸⁵

Both Covarrubias and Picard were talking about the Dutch colonial concern of the morals of their fellow Dutch in Bali. This breast covering issue is, in fact, another form of Dutch propaganda. As we discussed earlier, the idea of the bare-breasts and their covering was exciting to Western men. It is also this very image that was used to lure the Dutch at 'home' or European men to come to Bali, as can be seen from publications (popular and scientific) and exhibitions. In other words, the Dutch believed that the practice of baring breasts corrupted their soldiers' conscientious and rendered the Balinese women immoral. By distinguishing 'them' and 'us' and by showing how uncivilised or immoral the indigenous are the colonisers always portrayed them in sharp contrast to the rulers.

Preserving Bali largely meant three things to the Dutch: creating a colonial society which included a select group of the aristocracy, labelling and categorizing every aspect of Balinese culture with a view to keeping it pure, and idealizing this culture so as to market it for the purposes of tourism. Although these may sound contradictory, they meshed well together.⁴⁸⁶

⁴⁸⁵ *ibid.*, pp. 36-7.

⁴⁸⁶ Vickers, *Bali: Periplus Travel Guide*, 1994, p. 32.

CHAPTER 3

TRAVELLING COLONISTS: PRO AND ANTI COLONIAL ATTITUDES

As pointed out in the Introduction, the texts that are used in this research are not restricted to accounts by women alone. In addition to travel writing, I include other genres such as the novel and autobiography. In this chapter, I will discuss the novelist Vicki Baum (1880 – 1960) and the autobiographer K'tut Tantri (1899 – 1997). Their works, the novel *A Tale from Bali*⁴⁸⁷ and the autobiography *Revolt in Paradise*, are used to consider critically a generalised idealisation of women travellers as anti-imperialist that Kuczynski terms as 'feminist wishful thinking.'⁴⁸⁸ Since the context of this study is 1930s Bali, the texts being used are those published, and/or studies that took place, within the given period.⁴⁸⁹

Therefore, Multatuli's *Max Havelaar* written from September – October 1859 and published 1860 is not included. *A Tale from Bali* was first published in 1933, but *Revolt in Paradise* did not come out until 1960 (this book was the result of Tantri's life in the 1930s). Both Baum and Tantri were in Bali in the 1930s.

It is important at this point to discuss why women are hardly included in histories. Talking about the Auden Generation, Janet Montefiore asserts, 'Another reason for the exclusion of women from the histories is that very few of them fit the standard assumptions about writers' ages.'⁴⁹⁰ Tantri was born in Glasgow where she spent her childhood until she was thirteen. Born in 1899 she is too old

⁴⁸⁷ In 1933, the German works most frequently translated were the best-selling novels of Vicki Baum. Sabine Werner-Birkenbach, 'Trends in Writing by Women 1910-1933', in *A History of Women's Writing: in Germany, Austria, and Switzerland*, ed. by Jo Catling (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2000), pp. 128-145 (p. 129).

⁴⁸⁸ Kuczynski, 1993, p. 13 quoted in Korte, 2000, p. 125.

⁴⁸⁹ This includes research, such as that of Margaret Mead, done during the 1930s.

⁴⁹⁰ Janet Montefiore, *Men and Women Writers of the 1930s: The Dangerous Flood of History* (London: Routledge, 1996), p. 22.

to fit to Auden generation. Was it Tantri's 'romance' with the Balinese Prince that downgraded the 'white' man's prestige? Alternatively, was it because of her education or economic status that she was excluded? Beryl de Zoete (discussed in Chapter 4) was not fully accepted in Bloomsbury's group either, despite her class.

People or writers may change their views from time to time, and this is further complicated if the travellers in this period travel as outsiders in their own culture or, as in the case of Baum, are writing in exile. We must be aware that texts do not necessarily reflect the writers' personal views. In addition, it is for this reason that, wherever possible, I will use the title of the book to indicate the 'book's view' and the name of the author to indicate his or her own view.⁴⁹¹ Most writers have their own popular and private audience. If we trace the writers' files or memoirs, for example, we can find out that which was shared in letters or correspondence. Once these personal logs or notes enter public spheres in the form of autobiography, for example, the essence might not be the same. In some cases, what was written for publication is somewhat different. Perhaps the best way to see the writers' attitude of curiosity is to place them in the context of other writings as well as their own personal views.

Many writers have a plan for a book or a novel when they are still working on a certain text.⁴⁹² As a German émigré in the late 1920s and early 1930s, Baum's values and attitudes were predominantly formed by the Weimar

⁴⁹¹ For more discussion on this topic, see Greg Garrett, 'Relocating Burton: Public and Private Writings on Africa,' *The Journal of African Travel-Writing*, 2 (1997), 70-79. Electronic. Available <http://www.unc.edu/~ottotwo/burton.html>. 12 July 2005.

⁴⁹² According to Gina Kaus, Baum knows how to 'craft a powerful plot.' Gina Kaus, 'The Woman in Modern Literature', in *The Weimar Republic Sourcebook*, ed. by Martin Jay (Berkeley: University of California, 1994), p. 516. Baum used her experiences in the thirties as the basis of her later work.

Margaret Mead and Bateson used their unpublished photographs, while they worked on *Balinese Characters*, for other publications.

Republic⁴⁹³, and she was not attached to the colonisers in terms of marriage or any colonial post, to cite two examples. Baum's works include *The Ship and the Shore* and *The Weeping Wood*. Part of *The Weeping Wood*⁴⁹⁴ was represented in an experimental form in *The Ship and the Shore*.⁴⁹⁵ This emphasises the fact that some writers do have some plots/plans for their future publication. It also shows how the writers use their skills and hands-on experiences to maintain their textual authority and ensure the readers' attention.

Most accounts of the literature of the 1930s focus on the left-wing writers, including and emphasising women writers.⁴⁹⁶ The authors who were writing in this period can also be regarded as the writers of Orwell's decade.⁴⁹⁷ This is simply because the travellers used travel writing to advance specific political arguments. In addition, some of them referred to Orwell in their texts or even mentioned Orwell overtly (as discussed below). Travel and politics, according to Schweizer, are 'inseparable companions'.⁴⁹⁸ Unlike Orwell, Baum's travels may not have been induced by her ideological convictions. She demonstrates different attitudes towards colonialism in her novels. In short, her attitudes are ambiguous. In *A Tale from Bali*, Baum praises the Dutch; however, in her two other novels

⁴⁹³ Graham Bartram (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to the Modern German Novel* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2004), p. 6.

⁴⁹⁴ In the Introduction to *The Weeping Wood*, Baum wrote: 'The author conceived the idea of writing a rubber book in 1935-36 during her visits to the rubber plantations of Malaya, Java, Sumatra, Siam, and French Indo-China; it further crystallised into shape during repeated visits to Akron, and caused the author to write a few experimental rubber chapters into her little novel *The Ship and the Shore*. 'Now that this book has finally been midwifed into life, its subject has become almost embarrassingly topical,' p. viii.

⁴⁹⁵ The result of this 'experiment' is a fragmented novel, in which one part is titled 'The Ship' and the other 'The Shore'. Baum and her publisher, Ullstein, liked to do some experiments to test the market. Her other best-selling novel, *Stu. Chem. Helene*, for example, was first published as a series in one of Ullstein's magazines.

⁴⁹⁶ Montefiore, p. 4

⁴⁹⁷ Siegfried Mews, 'Grass' *Kopfgebirten*: The Writer in Orwell's Decade', *German Studies Review*, 6 (1983), 501-517 (pp. 507-9). Although Mews mainly discussed about Grass' *Kopfgebirten*, he also examined Baum's *Liebe und Tod auf Bali*.

⁴⁹⁸ Schweizer, p. 4.

(mentioned above), she is against the ‘rubber’ (plantation). It is not my intention to discuss how strong this writer’s inclinations were towards colonialism or imperialism. My argument is focused on the fact that colonial inclination has nothing to do with one’s gender or nationality; instead, as will be explained later, it is dependent on the travelling colonists’ background knowledge, understanding, and exposure to the coloniser. In other words, whether or not travellers agree with colonialism is likely to depend on who the colonisers are. As with identity and hybridity, this colonial inclination is not a fixed entity. In other words, colonial representations are informed by cultural, historical, and gendered prejudices. A representation of the colonised, which often originates in the imagination, was, in fact, caused by the advent of technology.

3. 1. Vicki Baum (1888-1960)

Baum’s novel abounds with historical events while K’tut Tantri’s autobiography deals with heroic personal experience. Baum was questioned by critics because of the novel’s support for colonialism. The popularity of her book caused her trouble and her authority was doubted. Tantri’s accounts of Bali, her view of the war – how she involved herself in the Indonesian struggle for independence – later attracted criticism, as we will see.

In the preface of *A Tale from Bali*, Baum explained that she got to know the oldest Dutch resident, Doctor Fabius, whom she described as ‘of an ironical turn of mind and rather averse to visits from persons like myself’.⁴⁹⁹ Baum was referring to the throngs of (male) artists before her. Baum returned to Bali the

⁴⁹⁹ Baum, c. 1983, p. viii.

following year for a longer visit, because, when she was in America, she ‘had a strange feeling of home-sickness for Bali.’⁵⁰⁰ Baum learned that Fabius had died of pneumonia. Fabius bequeathed her a box, which contained, among other things, a draft of a novel and diaries. The theme of the novel was centred on the conquest of Bali by the Dutch, known as *puputan*.⁵⁰¹ The *puputan* was the scene of two mass suicides in the royal courts of Badung in 1906 and Klungkung in 1908. The suicides were a demonstration of Balinese resistance towards the Dutch invasion. This *puputan* brought the Dutch harsh criticism from the rest of the world.⁵⁰² In addition, ironically, it was this tragic incident – the courts’ suicide – that later brought Bali into tourism.

In his will, claimed Baum, Fabius authorised her to publish a novel based on his material. Baum explained that to protect the anonymity of some people, the names and characters in her novel were altered, because the Dutch officials in Fabius’ diary were nearly all still living and were good friends of his. According to Baum, it was Fabius himself who re-named the other characters in the novel. Although the names of the Dutch officials in Fabius’ draft were changed, they had connections with the real persons. This is a kind of ‘roman à clef;’ a novel that has a key. The intention, claimed Baum, was not hers but Fabius’. That is why she left them as they were: ‘it was his [Fabius’] aim to present the truth from the inside, even at the cost, when he thought it was necessary, of sacrificing outward

⁵⁰⁰ *ibid.*, p. viii.

⁵⁰¹ A detailed examination of the *puputan* can be found in Agung’s *Bali in the 19th Century* (1991).

⁵⁰² The cover of the 2000 edition published by Charles E. Tuttle was a reproduction of a French image of Badung *puputan* as illustrated in *Le Petit Journal, Supplément illustré*, 14 October 1906. (Picard, 1996, after p. 78.)

accuracy.⁵⁰³ Here, Baum seems to say that the ‘inauthenticity’ was already plotted by Fabius. It appears that Fabius is Baum’s imagining character. In other words, despite some altering of names, there seems to be some kind of ‘authenticity.’

The device that Baum uses is not uncommon in 19th century novels. Receiving an inheritance from someone as a plotline had been used by her female and male contemporary writers. Although Baum never explicitly revealed the identity of her benefactor, if there was one, some critics, such as Adrian Vickers, assumed her source was Spies.⁵⁰⁴ Vickers made the criticism that without Spies’ inside information Baum could never have written a novel such as *A Tale from Bali*. Vickers failed to see that with or without the help of Spies, Baum had long been a best-selling author. In her time, Baum, along with Selma Lagerlöf and Martha Ostenso, was considered as someone who knows ‘very well how to craft a powerful plot.’⁵⁰⁵ Another male critic, Timothy Lindsey, said that Spies was Baum’s ‘ghost-writer’, implying that *A Tale from Bali* was not originally Baum’s work. Others claimed that it was Krause.⁵⁰⁶ Michael Hitchcock and Lucy Norris said that the character, in this case Fabius, was inspired partly by Spies and partly by Krause.⁵⁰⁷ Less harsh criticism comes from David Shavit who believed that Baum had a letter of introduction to Spies. As a host, therefore, Spies escorted Baum to remote villages. Shavit further claimed that ‘Baum based her noel [sic]

⁵⁰³ Baum, c. 1983, p. ix.

⁵⁰⁴ Vickers, 1996, p. 110. See also Rhodius, ‘Walter Spies’ in *Walter Spies and Balinese Art*, pp. 9-53. According to Rhodius, Baum wrote her best novel with Spies’ help, p. 39.

⁵⁰⁵ Kaus, p. 516.

⁵⁰⁶ According to Spruit, some people thought that Baum was inspired by the German doctor, Krause (Spruit, p. 61.)

⁵⁰⁷ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 29.

on information received from Walter Spies, although she pretended that she was left notes by “Dr. Fabius,” a fictional Bali hand’.⁵⁰⁸

Whatever the significance of those claims are, in the preface Baum expressed her gratitude to some people including Spies. Baum thanked the Resident of Bali and Lombok, Mynheer van Haaze-Winckleman, Mrs. Katharene Mershon of Sanoer, Herr Walter Spies of Oeboed, and many others of her Bali friends, for their ‘help and encouragement in sifting and examining the mass of material’.⁵⁰⁹ The way Baum created Doctor Fabius and his alleged manuscript was not merely a device to ‘lend authenticity to her story’⁵¹⁰ as Adrian Vickers claimed. Here Vickers could be thought to imply that only male characters are authoritative. Although it is perhaps not his intention to make such a claim, he indirectly promoted ‘the world view’ of the male as an authority.

Baum’s novel itself embraces the years from 1904 to 1906 (thirty years before Baum set foot on Bali), Baum’s plot shows her talented skills as a writer and a participant observer. The device, Dr Fabius’ manuscript, functions like any memoir of a famous politician, political leader, general, or dictator; such memoirs are commonly used in more realistic or historical writings. In the spectrum of autobiography they are usually regarded as legitimate evidence; they are important personal contributions to social, political, and military history. In the writing of her fiction, by adapting this literary device, Baum attempts to authenticate her text and her position has nothing to do with her sex and the sex of the character in her novel.

⁵⁰⁸ David Shavit, *Bali and The Tourist Industry: A History, 1906-1942* (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 2003), p. 153.

⁵⁰⁹ Baum, c. 1983, p. x.

⁵¹⁰ Vickers, 1996, p. 110.

As stated in the previous chapter, Baum first visited Bali in 1935. Similar to Yates and her other contemporaries, Baum had some pre-formed ideas about the island, first from the photographs that she asked for from a friend of a friend. In addition, given the fact she was a prolific writer and had travelled in the East, her ideas of Bali might have altered as she mingled with the expatriates or bohemians of Bali. However, she was disappointed by her second visit in 1936 because the island no longer matched up to the beautiful images of Bali she had seen years ago:

When I came back from the island, where in many places life and customs have remained unaltered for thousands of years, I found an irruption of Bali bars and Bali bathing costumes and Bali songs.⁵¹¹ I need not say that Doctor Fabius's book has nothing to do with this Bali – if only because this Bali does not exist.⁵¹²

As the previous discussion indicates, novels portray societies at one particular time. Perhaps Baum used the timing of her publication to reverse her attitude towards the anti-imperial current within America where she lived at that time. Baum was concerned for Balinese culture but suggested in her novel that colonialism was the best solution for the island's problems. What one writes, however, does not always reflect one's ideology or true self. If this novel represents the writer's self then Baum helped spread the idea of the noble peasantry of Bali, at the same time acting as an apologist for Dutch imperialism. It is the Dutch, she argued, who brought good things to the Balinese. However, the Balinese abused the civilisation:

Since then [the *puputan*] the Dutch have carried out an achievement in colonization that reflects the highest credit on them. Scarcely anywhere in the world are natives free to live their own lives under white rule so

⁵¹¹ Bali also became the subject of many songs, to name but one, *On the Beach at Bali-Bali*, which was recorded by at least eight American bands in 1936. See Oja, p. 121.

⁵¹² Baum, c. 1983, p. x.

happily and with so little interference and change as in Bali; and I would like to believe with Doctor Fabius that the self-sacrifice of so many Balinese at that time had a deep significance, since it impressed upon the Dutch the need of ruling this proud and gentle island people as considerately as they have, and so kept Bali the paradise it is to-day.⁵¹³

Baum assumed that Bali would remain as paradise forever if it were always being ruled by the Dutch. She was referring to colonial benevolence. However, this again does not necessarily reflect the author's personal opinion. As discussed in the previous sections, when it comes to analysing women's travel writing, some critics assume the texts are autobiographical and that everything the writers write represents their whole beings. Some readers assume that the 'I' or the narrative voice is synonymous with the writers' self. This is exactly what Mills argued against: 'But if we accept that the writer's self in the first place is not a coherent entity, nor is it entirely under the control of the writer, then we cannot imagine that what we read in the text is a faithful representation of the writer.'⁵¹⁴ The question remains whether words actually represent the self. Not everything in the writer's mind can be entirely and faithfully expressed in written words. How is it possible for a writer to copy his or her mind consciously while simultaneously trying to satisfy the audience or perhaps the publisher⁵¹⁵ and at the same time presenting a coherent form, structure, and style? Seen in this light, *A Tale from Bali*, which is pro-colonialism, may or may not reflect the writer's real attitude towards colonialism.

In the process of producing a novel, the novelist, consciously or unconsciously, also needs to be sensitive to his or her immediate surroundings. In

⁵¹³ *ibid.*

⁵¹⁴ Mills, p. 36.

⁵¹⁵ For more information on Baum's publisher see King (1988), particularly 'The House of Ullstein: Literary and Journalistic Entertainment as Big Business,' pp. 45-71.

different measures, writers are influenced by the societies they inhabit. The timing of Baum's writing, the device she chose in plotting her novel, the year of the actual Bali battle and the year of the novel's publication (1937) are subject to compromise. This is because the real *puputan* itself took place in the years from 1904 to 1906. Baum invented persons and situations and changed the time frame. She also created characters and situations based on real events:

Names and characters have been altered and the order of events is sometimes arbitrary. For example, the burning of widows at Tabanan took place three years and not three months before the dispatch of the punitive expedition.⁵¹⁶

In addition to the technical nature of writing, writers need to be aware of their audience and the contexts in which their texts are read. Texts from colonial Bali, for example, will be read with different frames of reference from the writers or readers of the time. This is further complicated with novels such as *A Tale from Bali*. This historical novel, which symbolises the Balinese resistance to Dutch imperialism, can be read differently in either the Dutch or Indonesian context, never mind the post-Bali bombs climate.

It seems precipitate to describe Baum, who is not Dutch, as a Dutch mouthpiece. Her colonial doctor was created so Baum could speak easily about the good deeds of the colonisers. The doctor gives Baum a strong narrative voice and enables her to describe events that are beyond her experience, which for many seem implausible within the discourses circulating around women at that time. The fact that some of her popular novels were banned in Germany in 1933⁵¹⁷ perhaps made her think further about how her books would be received.

A Tale from Bali, in a sense understood by Vickers,

⁵¹⁶ Baum, c. 1983, p. ix.

⁵¹⁷ Her popular books were banned in Hitler's Germany; see King (1988), p. 13.

bears the imprimatur of Spies's ideas. It is unclear whether he would have agreed so whole-heartedly with Baum's support of imperialism, but on the other hand he was never against imperialism, only opposed to the stuffiness and formality of petty bureaucrats. What Baum was displaying was a typical attitude to colonialism, which, at the time, was only questioned by a few such as E.M. Forster and George Orwell.⁵¹⁸

Vickers proposes two things. First, that the text provider is Spies.⁵¹⁹ In other words, his statements could be seen as implying that the novel belongs to men, whose writings, in their customary meanings, relate to the breadth of their intellectual range. Vickers fails to see that, perhaps, Baum used the man's gender for the sake of authority or authenticity as argued earlier – the general knowledge that it is man who is more authoritative; a motif to attract general public and to increase sales, as will be explained later. Literary 'history' has long been said to be a male preserve, a history of writing by men.⁵²⁰ Additionally, one critic also believes that 'Males represent experiences of self, others, space, and time in individualistic, objective, and distant ways, while females represent experiences in relatively interpersonal, subjective, immediate ways.'⁵²¹ Vickers and those who questioned Baum's authority and authenticity insist that as a woman it is impossible for her to write such a historical novel.

Secondly, Vickers hardly believes the fact that Baum's 'real' self – a female novelist – a woman whose novel supports colonialism. He contrasts

⁵¹⁸ Vickers, 1989, pp. 111-12. E. M. Forster's *A Passage of India* (1924) was a criticism of British rule in India. At that time, England was still in full control of India. Orwell's aversion to British imperialism was expressed in his essays such as *A Hanging* (1931) and *Shooting an Elephant* (1936).

⁵¹⁹ Vickers is one of the critics who questions Baum's authority. As a long-time residence in Bali, Walter Spies, who was quite popular in Europe as a painter at that time, frequently acted as a host to many visitors to Bali.

⁵²⁰ Nancy K. Miller, *Subject to Change: Reading Feminist Writing* (New York: Columbia University, 1988), p. 27.

⁵²¹ Sidonie Smith, *A Poetics of Women's Autobiography: Marginality and the Fictions of Self-Representation* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1987), p. 13; Kaus, p. 516.

Baum's viewpoint with those of men of her time who felt uneasy with colonialism. Here, Vickers concludes that Baum is not anti-colonial, unlike these men. Travel or colonial writing is associated with gender.

In examining Vickers' assertions, it is important to note that, as mentioned before, the central figure in Baum's novel was in fact a local peasant named Pak. Pak is characterized as a hardworking and a very helpful person. Although he is quite superstitious, he is very practical in terms of politics, cockfights and women. Dutch writer Doris Jedamski does not seem to have a gender-bias towards Baum when she says:

Remarkably, she chose the perspective of a Balinese rice-farmer. It is not unique that a woman writer chooses a male perspective (or a male author a female one). This narrative device helps to gain creative distance from one's own gender-specific background.⁵²²

For Jedamski, the problem with Baum's narrative is not the gender, but the race and class: 'It is rare, however, that a woman writer multiplies this distance by turning the cultural Other, which in this case was widely considered inferior, into the narrating authority'.⁵²³

Baum was aware of voices such as those later uttered by Vickers and tried to conform to similar (male) voices. Baum tactfully turned a low-class 'Other' into a powerful authority. Perhaps Baum inclines towards colonialism but she cannot be described as a coloniser – a 'white man'. One must remember, too, that when one belongs to the more powerful side in the imperial and colonial encounter, it is possible to overlook the unpleasant aspects of what went on 'out there'.⁵²⁴

⁵²² Jedamski, p. 23.

⁵²³ *ibid.*

⁵²⁴ Edward W. Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (London: Vintage, 1994), p.157.

If Baum's inclination is indeed towards imperialism, it could be said that she acted as a Dutch mouthpiece, especially as she praised the Dutch colonists in her preface.⁵²⁵ In fact, there are no colonial affiliations or vested interests between Baum as an individual and the Dutch. Baum's novel supports Dutch colonisation but this position may not be a faithful representation of Baum, as argued by Mills and discussed previously.

As noted earlier, Baum's first encounter with Bali was via the Eden-like photographs of Krause. Such pictures were very different from the 'the horrors my generation was exposed to'.⁵²⁶ She added, 'revolution, inflation, emigration – became unbearable'.⁵²⁷ This reveals her attitude towards what was happening in her country at that time. It would be very dangerous to label Baum as the Kipling of the Bali island. In her other writings, her attitude is anti-imperialist. In *Weeping Wood* (1943) and in *Ship and Shore* (1950), which was translated as *De Vreemde Nacht* (1965) in Dutch, Baum criticized the exploitation of plantation workers under Dutch rule. People do change their views and so does Baum. She becomes anti-imperialist in one novel and not in the other. Baum's attitude towards colonialism depends on who the coloniser and the colonised are.

Is Baum simply apolitical? Baum herself confessed that she is 'completely lacking of political sense'.⁵²⁸ Her upbringing under the Weimar Republic contributes to her apolitical stance.⁵²⁹ Baum's ideological position should not be separated from Ullstein, her publishing house that supported the liberal side. It is

⁵²⁵ The first edition, *Liebe und Tod auf Bali* (Amsterdam: Querido, 1937) is not supplied with this preface, Mews, p. 509.

⁵²⁶ Baum, c. 1983, p. vii.

⁵²⁷ *ibid.*

⁵²⁸ King, 1988, p. 480.

⁵²⁹ *ibid.*

possible that Baum's political attitudes depend on Ullstein and her commercial goals.⁵³⁰

3. 2. K'tut Tantri (1899-1997)

The autobiographer of *Revolt in Paradise* is K'tut Tantri. Tantri wrote about the story of the Indonesian revolution, which led to the country's independence in 1945. Tantri belongs to those who write as a result of long settlement in a 'foreign' country that turned into an 'adopted' country, in this case Indonesia. She planned the book upon returning to New York in 1947, fifteen years after she had first left America. (During these fifteen years, she had never returned to the Isle of Man or America.) Although *Revolt in Paradise* was not published until 1960, it is included in the discussion of 1930's books. This is because it represents Tantri's life and experience in the 1930s in Bali. In addition, Tantri's book became an example of what Said called 'an imaginative geography.'

Before discussing her text, it is necessary at this point to introduce the author and the reason why she came to Bali. Tantri was born in Glasgow on 18 February 1899 as Muriel Stuart Walker and lived there until the age of fourteen. She went to school in Scotland. In the 1930s, after the death of her father that she had never met, Tantri and her mother moved to the US West Coast and settled in Hollywood. She died in her sleep at the age of ninety-four in Sydney, Australia on 27 July 1997 and she had her ashes scattered in Bali.⁵³¹ She was also known as

⁵³⁰ *ibid.*, p. 144.

⁵³¹ Her coffin was covered with the Indonesian flag and Balinese yellow and white cloth. In the burial speech, the Indonesian deputy ambassador said that Tantri had been a true hero of the revolution, see Ron Witton, 'The Romance of K'tut Tantri', *Inside Indonesia*, 52 (1997) n.p. Electronic. Available: <http://www.insideindonesia.org/edit52/ktut.htm>. 30 December 2002.

Vanine Walker. Moreover, she became famous as a propagandist for the Indonesian revolution under the pseudonym Surabaya Sue.

How does Tantri describe herself? 'I myself was really a painter', she claimed repeatedly. However, she realised that being an artist could not support her financially. As a screen journalist, she made money by conducting interviews and writing articles about Hollywood celebrities, which were published abroad in British film magazines. Although the success was 'more than adequate, comfort and security assured,'⁵³² she did not enjoy this job. If Yates wished to be an artist, Tantri, however, wanted to be an archaeologist, not in a real sense, but as 'a real excuse for going to far places.'⁵³³ In addition, she wanted nothing else but to paint. She managed to produce some paintings but during the Japanese invasion of Bali from 1942-1945, she lost eight years of work which had been due to be exhibited in the United States.⁵³⁴ All of her paintings and her Balinese art collections were stolen by the Japanese.

Before discussing whether autobiography is history or not, it is necessary to discuss what constitutes an autobiography. Traditionally, an autobiography deals with the life experience of the writer at a certain time. The 'history' told by the writer is probably written entirely from memory. While an autobiography is then assumed 'true' to the writer's present conception, some of the irrecoverable past tends to be left hidden or uncovered. Often the autobiographer presents only the more positive side of the story. Tantri's present, when she wrote *Revolt in Paradise*, was America; yet her past – her heroic adventure in Indonesia – and the

⁵³² Tantri, 1960, p. 4.

⁵³³ *ibid.*

⁵³⁴ *ibid.*, p. 122. However, Lindsey saw this cynically: 'She was an "artist" but her works cannot be found. She was a "writer" but she only published one book, a melodramatic memoir.' See Lindsey, p. 326.

historical context of her story, shaped the final product. In other words, the autobiographical truth of her autobiography is concerned with both fact and the interpretation that she attaches to it. The timing of her writing also conditions everything she has to say. This is supported by Erik H. Erikson, who writes that an autobiography is concerned with three passages of time – the writer's present, the writer's past, and the historical context.⁵³⁵

One of the historical people in her life and in her autobiography is Nura, her alleged lover who died in 1960, the year the book was published. But in her autobiography Tantri claims he died earlier (sometime before Indonesian independence in 1945), shot by his compatriot.⁵³⁶ This perhaps helped Tantri to bury the memory of him, even if it was indeed a platonic one.

The idea of 'colour' for example, which recurs throughout her autobiography, has more significance in the US where the book was first published. Within three years of the publication of the first edition, there were fourteen different editions⁵³⁷ launched simultaneously all over the world. This increased the circulation of the book; yet it took about thirty-five years for the book to be published in Dutch.⁵³⁸

In Tantri's account, her 'lover' died young. It is not clear whether she did this to end her 'scandal' or simply to conform to the myth that it was the native who died first. In the colonial love stories, regardless of the sex of the colonised lover, the ending is almost always the same: the European returned to Europe and

⁵³⁵ Erik H. Erikson, 'Gandhi's Autobiography: The Leader as Child,' *The American Scholar*, 35 (1966), pp. 632-46.

⁵³⁶ Tantri, 1960, p. 235.

⁵³⁷ Tantri, *Revolusi di Nusa Damai*, trans. by Maj. Abd. Bar Salim (Jakarta: Gunung Agung, 1965), p. xxi. By the time the 1964 Indonesian's edition was published, the Burmese, Indian, and Thai editions were prepared for publication.

⁵³⁸ The Dutch version titled *Opstand in het Paradjjs* trans. by Jan Beerens (Bresa: Uitgeverij De Geus, 1995).

the non-European died earlier.⁵³⁹ Perhaps Tantri intentionally ‘killed’ her lover to conform to the colonial love stories and not using her Balinese *goona-goona*.

It is possible that there was chemistry between Tantri and the native prince, Nura, and that she wanted to forget all about it. Critics speculate whether the relationship is sexual, but this is still difficult to confirm. In addition, to cure her past, Tantri, like Virginia Woolf and Vera Brittain, was fearful of her private and ‘lovable’ self being overwhelmed by a public, egotistical persona.⁵⁴⁰ She did not want to turn her private life into public consumption in the form of a movie. She describes her relationship with the Balinese prince as merely platonic:

It was indeed a rather strange relationship, which existed between Agung Nura and me, a difficult one to explain. We were very close, and yet I did not love him in that sense in which love between a man and a woman is usually understood. It might have been different – this I admit – but I was wise enough to know that only by keeping our friendship on a platonic basis could I live at the *puri* as I desired.⁵⁴¹

This implies that Tantri tried to deny her love for Nura to herself. As Lindsey himself pointed out, even if there was a romantic, even sexual, relationship between Tantri and the noble native, Tantri might try to deny it, simply because

The attitudes of Western bohemians regarding sexual relations with the Balinese were often ambivalent, if not even hypocritical. In fact, sexual relationships between the Western bohemians and the Balinese were not uncommon in 1930s Bali.⁵⁴²

⁵³⁹ Pratt, 1992, p. 97. Compare with John Gabriel Stedman’s ‘Joanna or The Female Slave: A West Indian Tale’ (London: 1824) in *The Making of the Modern World*. Here, Stedman wrote about his transracial love affairs with Joanna, whom he married, but who refused to follow him back to England. Stedman who later married another girl in England was told that Joanna was poisoned to death by people who were envious of her prosperity. See also Stedman’s *Narrative of a five Year’s Expedition against the Revolted Negroes of Surinam* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts, 1972).

⁵⁴⁰ Linda R. Anderson, *Women and Autobiography in the Twentieth Century: Remembered Futures* (London: Prentice Hall Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1997), p. 84.

⁵⁴¹ Tantri, 1960, pp. 56-7.

⁵⁴² Lindsey, p. 32.

It was more common for Western men to have relationships with Balinese women. How could Tantri turn this convention round and situate herself in a masculine discourse of acting as a 'white' man?

At the beginning of her autobiography, Tantri mentions that it is really difficult to be honest with oneself. She is aware of the potential conflict between truth telling and revealing the self. Her autobiography, her horrific experiences during the Indonesian revolution, her platonic romance, if it existed, perhaps serve as a form of self-therapy. Subconsciously perhaps she is motivated by a desire to free herself from her past by re-experiencing it. This is in line with a widespread belief among creative writers in general and autobiographers in particular that, as D.H. Lawrence claimed, 'one sheds one's sickness in books – repeats and presents again one's emotions, to be master of them'.⁵⁴³ This is also very similar to the assumption underlying the psychoanalytic process. In the preface, Tantri ponders her own motivation for re-experiencing her past:

Would I do this thing all over again? Yes, I think I would. I survived, that is obvious, and more or less unscathed. The Manx⁵⁴⁴ are a sturdy people with a strange resistance to hardship. As I have said, Fate brushed my shoulder'.⁵⁴⁵

By asserting her Manx identity, Tantri boosts her ego. Critics have long been aware of the presence of a less conscious subtext in imaginative writing of all kinds. Nevertheless, this subtext assumes special significance in autobiography because it throws light on author, narrator, and protagonist alike. Therefore, an author or narrator's attempt to give an 'objective' picture of the protagonist will

⁵⁴³ George. T. Zytaruk and James T. Boulton (eds.) *The Letters of D. H. Lawrence, Vol 2, June 1913-October 1916* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1982), p. 90.

⁵⁴⁴ In her text, Tantri describes herself as 'not a Scott,' Tantri, 1960, p. 3.

⁵⁴⁵ Tantri, 1960, p. 5.

unconsciously reveal something more subjective about the way the writers see themselves at the time of writing.

Tantri begins her first chapter with the following sentences:

This is the story of a white woman who lived for fifteen years in Indonesia, knowing the country and its people, from the highest to the lowest, and sharing their joys and their sorrows. This woman is myself: which makes the story more difficult to tell because it is hard to be completely honest about oneself.⁵⁴⁶

She describes herself as ‘white’ and her difficulty in retelling her story honestly. How is it possible for an autobiographer to explore with honesty the recesses of the self while simultaneously he or she is trying to satisfy aesthetic criteria concerning form, structure, and tone? Paradoxically, it is precisely because of her conflicts in revealing her experience, despite some appreciation and acknowledgement here and there, and the success of her book, as its subsequent editions and translations attest, that she was attacked and discriminated against by some critics.

First, she seems to be excluded from history. As an Indonesian resistance fighter, she worked as a broadcaster and a campaigner during the Indonesian revolution. The Indonesian government recognised her role and her name was mentioned in *In the Service of the Revolution* written by Adam Malik, the then Vice-President of Republic of Indonesia. In the preface of the Indonesian translation of *Revolt in Paradise*, the Indonesian first president, Soekarno, acknowledged Tantri’s history. He wrote that with the exception of public figures, names of villages and individuals have been changed. All happenings are based

⁵⁴⁶ Tantri, 1960, p. 3.

on *kebenaran* (truth). Moreover, the historical events are certainly correct.⁵⁴⁷

Hanna, the American Balinese chronicler claimed that Tantri is ‘an author of a highly imaginative autobiography’;⁵⁴⁸ nevertheless, Hanna praised Baum’s work as a story ‘sufficiently romantic, tragic, exotic, and authentic to rate as one of the classics of Balinese studies’.⁵⁴⁹ However, her name failed to appear in a thesis written about Surabaya 1926-1946,⁵⁵⁰ where she played a significant role. Nor did her name mentioned in Geoffrey Robinson’s *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali*.⁵⁵¹ Apart from a brief note in Adrian Vickers’ *Bali: a Paradise Created*, Tantri’s role, in what Lindsey described as ‘serious’ histories of the 1930s and 1940s in Indonesia, seems to be forgotten.⁵⁵²

Secondly is the genre of Tantri’s writing. Lindsey contends that Tantri’s main problem was the fact she wrote her autobiography as a romance:

Her chief obstacle, however, was probably not what she was, nor what she did, but how she wrote it. Her history was presented in the form usually taken by popular romantic fiction. Romance, however potent a way to tell a story, is rarely accepted as legitimate ‘history’.⁵⁵³

What is wrong with romance? As discussed previously, some fictions are realistic. In addition, nearly all fundamentally realistic fictions have their romantic colour. Writers may choose whatever form they like, but the publisher/library catalogue cannot just put the label ‘autobiography’ to *Revolt in Paradise*.

⁵⁴⁷ Similar acknowledgements come from some of the Indonesian ministers and the chief of immigration officer, Tantri, 1965, p. iv. See also Adam Malik’s *In the Service of the Revolution* (Singapore: Gunung Agung, 1980), p. 175.

⁵⁴⁸ Hanna, p. 15.

⁵⁴⁹ *ibid.*, p. 116.

⁵⁵⁰ See William Frederick, *Indonesian Urban Society in Transition: Surabaya 1926-1946*, Ph.D. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1978.

⁵⁵¹ Geoffrey Robinson, *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1998).

⁵⁵² Lindsey, p. 4.

⁵⁵³ *ibid.*, p. 13.

According to Sidonie Smith, autobiography's legacy has long been particularly problematic because of its 'identification with the western romance of individualism'.⁵⁵⁴ Lindsey insists that Tantri's autobiography is merely fiction simply because it has 'all the ingredients of a modern romantic novel':

The idealist who flees dreary, depressed civilization for the primitive and vital Far East; the creation of a fantastic paradisiacal world in the form of the 'Arabian Nights' Kuta beach hotel; the erotic exotica of between-wars Bali, the 'island of bare breasts'; a romance with a heroic Balinese prince educated in Western ways; the budding fight for freedom from colonial oppression; the coming of war to the peaceful Pacific; intrigue, espionage, spies, imprisonment, torture, madness – and then revolution; brave boy guerrillas and revolutionary heroes; the death of her beloved; running blockades and outsmarting entire navies; smuggling guns and buying torpedo boats – and, finally, escape to America, 'land of the free'.⁵⁵⁵

At first, Lindsey's criticism is aimed at the different perceptions of romance and history, but he himself cannot deny that Tantri's achievement was questioned because of her gender and her race. Lindsey asserts that 'Certainly K'tut Tantri's place in accounts of Indonesia from the 1930s was always at risk because of both her race (a White in an Indonesian revolution) and her gender (a woman at war)'.⁵⁵⁶

Discussing autobiography, Nancy K. Miller argued that women 'justify an unorthodox life by writing about it [autobiography]...to reinscribe the original violation, to reviolate masculine turf'.⁵⁵⁷ For her the act of writing autobiography can only serve to intensify a woman's sense of transgression. On the link between masculinity and war Sally L. Kitch observes that 'participation in one (war) historically has served to enhance the other (masculinity), even in a woman like

⁵⁵⁴ Smith, p. 37.

⁵⁵⁵ Lindsey, p. 11.

⁵⁵⁶ *ibid.*, p. 13.

⁵⁵⁷ Miller, p. 52.

Margaret Thatcher'.⁵⁵⁸ How could Tantri avoid the association of her experience with an aggressive 'masculine' drive for success? This perhaps is, as Kuczynski put it (and as discussed earlier), feminist wishful thinking.⁵⁵⁹

As an autobiographical writer, all the memories Tantri has selected are important in her self portrayal. According to the psychologist Katherine Nelson, there is episodic memory which involves 'conscious recollection of previous experiences' that is 'remarkable'.⁵⁶⁰ According to Brian Finney, reminiscences provide invaluable biographical information about individuals and social groupings; they resemble group portraits in which the artist includes himself. Finney claims that '[t]hey are a sub-genre in their own right and have their own rewards'.⁵⁶¹

Tantri's critics might as well question whether she used her memory rather than her imagination. Since Tantri's biography covers the years from 1932 – 1947, she does not talk about her childhood, which might have involved more imagination than reality. Like the rest of the writers discussed in this study, Tantri's journey really did take place. However, unlike Baum or Yates, Tantri did not travel to Bali to write. Unlike Beryl de Zoete or Margaret Mead, who were never without their notes and cameras, Tantri did not rely on any form of recorded material or documentation. She only used her memory. Luce Irigaray describes memory as 'the place where identity is formed, the place where each person

⁵⁵⁸ Sally L. Kitch, 'Does War Have Gender?,' in *On Peace, War, and Gender: A Challenge to Genetic Explanations*, ed. by Anne E. Hunter (New York: The Feminist, 1991), pp. 92-103 (p. 93).

⁵⁵⁹ Kuczynski, p. 13.

⁵⁶⁰ Katherine Nelson, 'The Psychological and Social Origins of Autobiographical Memory.' *Psychologist Science*, 4 (1993), 7-14 (p. 7).

⁵⁶¹ Brian Finney, *The Inner I: British Literary Autobiography of the Twentieth Century* (London: Faber, 1985), p. 14.

builds his or her ground or territory'.⁵⁶² For Finney, memory is 'notoriously unreliable':

Memory is normally the principal source of raw material for the autobiographer. Even when he has had the help of letters or diaries, it is still memory that gives life to the incidents selected for their significance from such documents.⁵⁶³

He points out that any documentation consulted has been selected. Thus some information has escaped the selection. He further argues that 'What imbues them with significance is likely to be the strength and vividness of the memories they evoke. So that memory is an unconscious agent of selection'.⁵⁶⁴

If Finney sees memory as 'unreliable selection', Shumaker sees it as a failure of creativity.⁵⁶⁵ Shumaker observes that 'the novelist, within limits, may 'create' persons and situations, the autobiographer can only recreate.'⁵⁶⁶ Baum, the novelist, invents the character, but Tantri, the autobiographer, only recreates, as opposed to invents, what she selected from her memory. As Finney observes:

The autobiographer can shape, dramatize or stylize his material, but he cannot knowingly invent it. Not that his material has to be confined to facts, as we have already seen. It can include memories, however inaccurate, reported fact, true or false, and fantasies, dreams and myths all of which avoid the true/false dichotomy.⁵⁶⁷

In the case of Tantri, her use of the romance form, which is associated with fiction, does not necessarily undermine the 'truthfulness' of her autobiography, as Timothy Lindsey assumes it must. Lindsey wrote a biography of Tantri, entitled *The Romance of K'tut Tantri and Indonesia: Text and Scripts, History and*

⁵⁶² Luce Irigaray, *Sexes and Genealogies* trans. by Gillian C. Gill (New York: Columbia University), 1993, pp. 153-65 (p. 161).

⁵⁶³ Finney, p. 44.

⁵⁶⁴ *ibid.*

⁵⁶⁵ Shumaker, quoted in Finney, p. 44.

⁵⁶⁶ Finney, p. 71.

⁵⁶⁷ *ibid.*

Identity. He claimed to have more documentary evidence than Tantri and described *Revolt in Paradise* as 'K'tut Tantri's public history of part of her own past'.⁵⁶⁸ For Lindsey, both Tantri's written and oral account were fabricated:

...there is K'tut Tantri's other, oral, version of the events recorded in *Revolt in Paradise*, conveyed to me in interviews. This second version of K'tut Tantri's 'own story' complicates matters. Rather than clarifying, it obscures her past. I began to realize that K'tut Tantri has protected her history by deliberately making her past a mystery, as John Darling has put it. Perhaps she could not help it.⁵⁶⁹

As discussed earlier, the interval between Tantri's Bali experience and its publication is greater than that between the actual publication of Lindsey's thesis and the interview he conducted. Lindsey said that he had a dilemma regarding publishing his scholarly writing in a more popular audience. Since it was a biography of a living subject Lindsey decided 'not to publish my research while I believed to do so would cause her significant harm'.⁵⁷⁰ The biography was later printed in 1997, in the year Tantri died. She was ninety-four. It is difficult to say whether the revelation of Tantri's history in the form of a thesis caused less harm to Tantri than her biography.

By calling a book an autobiography a writer creates expectations in the mind of the readers which are different from the expectations of a novel or a history. As is discussed in the previous section, generally history is based on documentary evidence and autobiography is based on what the autobiographer considers as fact. Tantri writes explicitly about her own life. Autobiographical truth is concerned with both fact and the meaning the autobiographer attaches to the facts. Here, Tantri asserts her right to present herself, consciously, in whatever

⁵⁶⁸ Lindsey, p. 7.

⁵⁶⁹ *ibid.*

⁵⁷⁰ *ibid.*, p. 316.

form she finds appropriate and necessary. However, Lindsey insists on some documentary evidence – historical rather than fictional – materials.

Revolt in Paradise was Tantri's only masterpiece. It enjoyed numerous translations and was published as a series of short stories in magazines. Tantri and her book became internationally well known. Although Lindsey is aware of the autobiography's popularity, in his biography of Tantri he insists that her book is merely a romance; a fantasy.⁵⁷¹ For Lindsey, Tantri's story is merely fantasy because it is not supported by any formal documentation. In defence of his work, Lindsey claims:

The aims of this book are to consider whether *Revolt in Paradise* is, as its critics claim, 'romantic fantasy' (whatever that may be), and if so, why, and what significance should be attached to it. It also attempts an explanation of why K'tut Tantri, notwithstanding her popular autobiographical text, has had virtually no significant historical identity. These issues, in turn, become part of a wider consideration of the nature of history and its role in the creation of individual identity.⁵⁷²

Some American critics insist that autobiography can refer not just to memoirs, reminiscences, confessions, apologies and the like, but to diaries, letters, novels and even to a poem such as *Four Quartets*.⁵⁷³ William C. Spengemann claims that whether or not the reader satisfies depends on the persuasiveness of the texts. He continues to argue that:

[h]owever various critics have defined autobiography, their ability to recognize one has always depended on some evidence that the writer's self is either the primary subject or the principal object of the verbal action. In the former case, the self is seen to exist independently of whatever the writer says on its behalf, and the verbal action seeks either to describe that self historically, or analyze it philosophically, or express it poetically. In

⁵⁷¹ Lindsey, p. 326. He also remarked that 'She was an "artist" but her works cannot be found. She was a "writer" but she only published one book, a melodramatic memoir'.

⁵⁷² *ibid.*, p. 4.

⁵⁷³ Finney, p. 13.

the latter case, the self is seen to depend for its existence upon the verbal action, which therefore describes its own poetic creation.⁵⁷⁴

Perhaps this is only partly a matter of perspective. For Lindsey, *Revolt in Paradise* is a 'melodramatic memoir'. The following are some reviews from around the world: 'Revolt in Paradise is a fantastic story of Indonesia, and one of the most stimulating autobiographies I have read in years' (*Evening Express, Scotland*); 'An extremely interesting autobiography told in an easy flowing style, and lovingly describes the beauty of Indonesian life' (*The Times of Malta*); 'Revolt in Paradise is a wonderful story, much of it now history' (*Manchester Evening News*).⁵⁷⁵ As stated before, there have been various vain attempts to make a film out of Tantri's heroic adventures. Lindsey uses this failure to attack Tantri. According to him, she vetoed several screenplay adaptations of *Revolt in Paradise* solely on the basis that they implied she had a romance with Nura. Tantri's refusal to alter her 'hybrid history' (Lindsey's words) leads Lindsey to believe the alleged romance was true. He concentrated primarily on negative aspects of Tantri's autobiography and managed to find the 'hidden content':

Any reasonably undefended autobiographer knows that he is likely to tell his readers more about himself than he intends. Any attentive reader of such an autobiography is constantly on the look-out for clues to this hidden content. It performs a dual function. It reveals a secret area of truth that its author never consciously intended to uncover and it helps to correct the 'official' ego-oriented version of the truth. It is the nearest autobiography comes to expressing the unconscious self.⁵⁷⁶

Lindsey is on the look-out for any possibilities for re-shaping Tantri's own history. Whether or not such a relationship existed, *Revolt in Paradise* reveals, in

⁵⁷⁴ William C. Spengemann, *The Forms of Autobiography: Episodes in the History and a Literary Genre* (New Haven: Yale University, 1980), p. xvi.

⁵⁷⁵ Tantri, 1965, p. xviii.

⁵⁷⁶ Finney, p. 65.

some way, the writer's modesty, rather than showing off her best side. *The*

Northampton Evening Telegraph England wrote:

Revolt in Paradise is a lively story of adventure and a modest recital of courageous deeds spiced with pointed comments on the relationship of Black and White. A book whose true story of courage will remain in my memory after I have forgotten most of the fictitious stories of brave exploits [...] Here is a book I thoroughly recommend.⁵⁷⁷

Lindsey did not argue that women should stay at home and not go to war. Neither did he claim the assumption that the war 'belonged' solely to men, as Vera Brittain, and Kitch did. If Brittain merely questions the assumption that war is a 'man's game',⁵⁷⁸ Kitch strongly believes that:

war has gender, rather than sex, by demonstrating the connection between the war ethos, which is a matter of public policy and political behaviour, and the ethos of masculinity, which relates to qualities of personal identity. While the male ethos defines a highly individuated, autonomous, unemotional, rational, and powerful human being, the war ethos promotes competition, authoritarianism, and the use of coercive force to maintain or promote a social system often deemed self-evidently good.⁵⁷⁹

An example of this war ethos is the sad myth that women are more emotional than men are. A British woman doctor, who in 1914 offered the war office fully staffed medical units was told 'to go home and keep quiet' because the commanders 'did not want to be troubled with hysterical women.'⁵⁸⁰ Miller, different from some other male critics, believes in the ethos of masculinity and may regard Tantri as violating her feminine boundaries.

⁵⁷⁷ Tantri, 1965, p. xvii.

⁵⁷⁸ See Vera Brittain, *Testament of Experience* (London: Virago, 1979). First published by Victor Gollancz in 1957.

⁵⁷⁹ Kitch, p. 93.

⁵⁸⁰ Joshua S. Goldstein, *War and Gender: How Gender Shapes the War System and Vice Versa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2001), p. 313.

3. 3. Nationalism, Identity and Gender Issues

Perhaps Tantri's heroic conduct troubled the assumed male coloniser who was mindful of losing the prestige and dignity of the 'white' race. Lindsey claims that 'Her [Tantri's] later support of the Indonesian revolution, for example, led to her being branded as a 'white traitor' who had 'let down the white race''.⁵⁸¹ Whatever negative label Lindsey attached to Tantri, according to the *Salt Lake Tribune*, Utah, hers was a 'story of pure heroism without heroics. This story is told with touching directness'.⁵⁸²

In her autobiography, 'K'tut Tantri evokes vividly life in Indonesia, and her heroic personal story commands respect' (*The Echo*, Darlington, Durham).⁵⁸³ Here, the historical context is important in interpreting meaning. Lindsey regards Tantri's collaboration with the Japanese during the World War II as unforgivable if seen from the Western perspective: 'Clearly, from the point of view of most Westerners during the war, collaboration with the Japanese was an act of treason, a betrayal of race and nation'.⁵⁸⁴ In this case, the distinction between 'us' and 'them' refers at least partly to 'white' and 'non-white'. The notion of colour is of particular significance because it demonstrates a common theme of nationalism, where the observer's country is seen as superior to other countries.

In her autobiography, Tantri writes that she is the Japanese's enemy not a collaborator, simply because she is a 'white' woman and an American: 'My nationality, even more than my colour, might mark me for brutal treatment'.⁵⁸⁵

⁵⁸¹ Lindsey, p. 33.

⁵⁸² Tantri, 1965, p. xxv.

⁵⁸³ *ibid.*

⁵⁸⁴ Lindsey, p. 134.

⁵⁸⁵ Tantri, 1960, p. 103.

Here Tantri is aware that for the Japanese her being an American is more dangerous than being British or Scottish.

In Lindsey's interview with Tantri, Tantri denied the accusation that she had collaborated with the Japanese. Nevertheless, Lindsey continues to criticise her:

If K'tut Tantri did collaborate with the Japanese (whether as 'hotelier', 'free girl-friend', or broadcaster), then the conclusions to be drawn from it depend entirely on the judgment we make as to the significance of the collaboration. What view are we to take of the accusation, and her denial, of collaboration? Clearly, from the point of view of most Westerners during the war, collaboration with the Japanese was an act of treason, a betrayal of race and nation.⁵⁸⁶

Was Tantri attacked because she was not a coloniser by race? If Lindsey's position is similar to 'most Westerners during the war,' is he simply defending 'his' women? Whether in peace or war, however, Western 'white' people did not think that they should support the Dutch or German just because of their skin colour. In other words, it is really difficult to believe that people of the same colour should support each other regardless of the nature of the circumstances. As to which race and which nation Lindsey is referring to remains unclear.

During a war, it is important to know where someone is coming from. However, it is sometimes difficult to define nationalism in precise terms. People with the same nationalities are not required to have similar political views. However, they cannot simply express their beliefs openly. Dr S, an Indonesian man, believes otherwise:

Let this be a lesson to you that not all white people are enemies. Even among the Dutch we still have friends. Because of their nationality they cannot take sides openly. Their countrymen would consider that treason.

⁵⁸⁶ Lindsey, p. 134.

As for other nationalities, this is not a war. Neutral countries can choose the side their conscience tells them to choose.⁵⁸⁷

From the Dutch side, Tantri's stance is considered treason. The following is one of Tantri's conversations with the Dutch: 'How can you, a white woman, fight for a race that can never be your equal?'; 'What could you have in common with them? What is wrong with a white skin, that you should prefer brown or black?'.⁵⁸⁸

Throughout the imperial world during the decolonising period, protest, resistance, and independence movements were fuelled by nationalism. While waiting on the dock at Singapore to arrange her US passport, Tantri used her Britishness to influence the British immigration officers. Even though they argued that Tantri was an embarrassment to them, they were willing to help. The Dutch, however, complained that the officers were helping one of the Dutch's worst enemies, just because Tantri was British-born. Tantri replied by saying: 'I took a great risk in coming back here because I believed in the tolerance and chivalry of British officials'.⁵⁸⁹ At the same time, Tantri was also challenged for her Scottishness:

Think of the headlines it would make in Scotland: "Scots Girl Refused admission by brutal British!" "Former Japanese Prisoner Tortured by her Own Countrymen!" It'll cause an uprising by all the Scots who long to be free of England!⁵⁹⁰

One of the officials accepted this point and Tantri was allowed to enter and stayed in Singapore. However, some of the headlines circulated at approximately the

⁵⁸⁷ Tantri, 1960, p. 181.

⁵⁸⁸ Tantri, 1960, p. 298.

⁵⁸⁹ *ibid.*, p. 301.

⁵⁹⁰ *ibid.*, p. 302.

same time as this incident read: ‘Alien to be deported’⁵⁹¹ and ‘Scots Girl Who Fights for Indonesians’.⁵⁹²

The question that needs to be asked may be less how far is one entitled or enabled to read *Revolt in Paradise* as fictionalised autobiography rather than how is one entitled to question someone else’s identity. Tantri assumed her new name when she was adopted as a Balinese king’s daughter. (It was also the name she printed in her passport; the first Indonesian passport to be issued.) She saw her Indonesian name as her legitimate name and this was also the name she used when publishing *Revolt in Paradise*. It should be noted that in autobiographies, the author, the narrator, and the protagonist share the same name. According to Finney, ‘All the staple ingredients of narration – theme, form, characterization, style, imagery – cast light on the subject of the book and are integral to the autobiographical process of self-portrayal’.⁵⁹³ In addition to this self-portrayal, in Tantri’s case, it includes a process of self-identification.

Although it is clear that Lindsey’s criticism is aimed at the genre, I would argue that it is obvious that, from the Western point of view, Tantri, a ‘white’ woman, is colonised by both gender and race – she is subjugated because of her gender and her racial background. Indira Ghose described these female autobiographers as ‘colonized by gender, but colonizers by race’.⁵⁹⁴ In a similar vein, Dea Birkett insisted that unmarried women travelled ‘not “only” as women, but often took on the role of “white” men’.⁵⁹⁵ I would argue, in opposition to Ghose and Birkett, that female travellers in 19th century Bali were not bound to

⁵⁹¹ *Sun*, 5 November 1947.

⁵⁹² *Smith’s Weekly*, 2 August 1947.

⁵⁹³ Finney, pp. 71-2.

⁵⁹⁴ Ghose, 1999, p. 5.

⁵⁹⁵ Dea Birkett, *Spinster Abroad: Victorian Lady Explorers* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1989), p. 140.

the dominant discourses of Dutch society. Unlike women travellers in colonial India, they did not return to the Netherlands after their travels. My argument, on the contrary, concludes that Tantri is, due to the reception of her book and her role in the Indonesian revolution, indeed colonised by gender. In addition, due to the fact that she is anti-Dutch (and anti-British), she cannot be described as coloniser by race either:

Why is it that the Dutch in Holland screamed with indignation when the Nazis overran their country and plundered it, yet now that the allies have liberated Holland are trying to do the same thing in Indonesia? For three hundred years the wealth of Indonesia has found its way to Holland. Isn't it about time for that flow to be diverted back into Indonesia, at least in part?⁵⁹⁶

As discussed previously, it is possible that it is because of her race, a 'white' in a 'non-white' struggle for independence, that Tantri was written out of history. As an hotelier and as a 'playgirl,' Tantri was considered by the Dutch to be in collaboration with the Japanese. Such collaboration, according to the Allies, was evidence of anti-Western sentiments.

Women at war have inspired some cartoonists. Warnings of espionage by Western women appeared in the form of cartoons such as 'Glamour girls in the clutches of Allied propaganda'⁵⁹⁷ and 'The devil, a girl and the Kenpeitai'.⁵⁹⁸ Here, Western women were represented as high-class call girls, as well as devils and spies. Both these cartoons appeared in *Java Shimbun*, a Japanese paper. The first illustration shows the image of four glamorous girls with curvaceous figures, wearing high heels, and jewellery. The garments they wear approximate the European women's fashion of the time. One of these 'Beautiful Soul' girls is

⁵⁹⁶ Tantri, 1960, p. 298.

⁵⁹⁷ *Java Shimbun*, 14 March, 1943.

⁵⁹⁸ *Java Shimbun*, 20 March, 1943.

smoking a cigarette. All of them are in the hands of supposedly Allied propaganda. Although the women look like everywoman, they are controlled by a scary figure with long fingernails. The second illustration depicts a Western girl as a devil. A 'white' girl depicted as a feminine woman becomes, when observed through a magnifying glass, the devil. The two depictions of glamour girls and devil girl bear one message: a collaborator with Japanese.⁵⁹⁹

If war is often portrayed as an opportunity to prove one's manhood,⁶⁰⁰ this image confirms the negative view of women at war. Another negative image of women at war is about pornography and prostitution and will be discussed in Chapter 4. In one of the collections in the Imperial War Museum in London there is a British poster that says 'Keep mum she's not so dumb! Careless talk costs lives', portraying prostitutes, lovers and any women as 'smart' and dangerous for they can serve as an enemy intelligence source.⁶⁰¹ Here women are described as Mata Hari or James Bond girls because of their sexualised and manipulative activities.

Referring to the emergence of Ottoman political cartoons from 1908-1923, Göçek argues that:

Political cartoons became a very significant form of visual rhetoric in nineteenth – and twentieth – century Europe when they were coupled with emerging public opinion and the nascent "imagined community" of the nation. Especially during World War I, political cartoons were used as a mode of propaganda to mobilize the population both morally and intellectually, explain setbacks, confirm belief in the superiority of the fatherland, and proclaim the hope of final victory.⁶⁰²

⁵⁹⁹ A study of the representation of Ottoman women in cartoons during the 1908-1911 demonstrates that, in addition to being collaborators, women were also depicted as the heroic figure of Türkiye, as the citizen-patriot and as everywoman. See also Göçek.

⁶⁰⁰ Fatma Müge Göçek, 'From Empire to Nation: Images of Women and War in Ottoman Political Cartoons, 1908-1923,' in *Borderlines: Gender and Identities in War and Peace, 1870-1930*, ed. by Billie Melman (New York: Routledge, 1998), pp. 47-72 (p. 53).

⁶⁰¹ Goldstein, p. 340.

⁶⁰² Göçek, p. 53.

Any political cartoons contain physiognomical satire, often transformed into comical parodies which are more socially accepted. In addition, they are also designed to affect the viewer's opinion. Within the Ottoman context, this political cartoon, according to Göçek,

was employed both in Europe and the Ottoman Empire to reinforce the impact of this portrayal; the presence or absence of sexual desire in the images of women was used to suggest approval or condemnation for what they represented in the cartoon.⁶⁰³

The same is true in Japan. The cartoon images in Japan, Europe and the Ottoman context have explicitly political purpose from the start. Depictions of women in cartoons most likely consist of contradictory elements. They become a symbol to which all people could respond and establish a connection between a drawing and a specific political idea in their own imagination. This contradictory idea involved the depictions of women as asexual heroines, immoral vixens or mothers. The female figures in the cartoons often play on accepted symbols or repeated imagery, and the intent is to provoke a specific response from the viewer. This representation persisted and the use of women in political cartoons is still common in wartime propaganda today.

In Japanese cartoons, the presence of sexual desire is used to condemn women. Here, Tantri and her war story experienced what is called by the prejudiced genre and gender. *The Evening Herald*, Dublin, wrote: 'Widespread in general appeal, *Revolt in Paradise* is far above the usual rut of war stories and places it high on the list of books well worth reading'.⁶⁰⁴

⁶⁰³ *ibid.*, p. 55.

⁶⁰⁴ Tantri, 1965, p. xvii.

As a woman who struggled for Indonesian independence, Tantri should have been treated in the same way as fellow male autobiographers. Patricia Meyer Spacks explains that:

Of course, it is by no means true that books by women necessarily differ vividly from books by men. Male writers are often “sensitive,” women frequently knowledgeable: the stereotypes don’t apply.⁶⁰⁵

Lindsey claims that what Tantri did in the past does not really matter. Spacks opposes this. She demonstrates that an autobiography has nothing to do with gender but with the intensity of the battle encountered. Spacks continues:

The autobiography of a woman who has struggled to become an artist or a labor leader or a scientist may bear striking analogies to that of her male counterpart; housewives and average men seldom write their autobiographies.⁶⁰⁶

No matter how courageous the resistance fighters are, in the eyes of Lindsey they are just average women:

Her [Tantri’s] past now defining her future, the romance – the Babad Tantri – had become what Hannah Arendt called ‘the treasure’. K’tut Tantri had become like Arendt’s French resistance fighters who, after hostilities and political involvement had ceased, found themselves to be ‘liberated from what they originally had thought to be a “burden” and thrown back into the weightless irrelevance of their personal affairs, once more separated from “the world of reality” by an *epaisseur triste*, the “sad opaqueness” of a private life centred about nothing but itself’.⁶⁰⁷

Tantri not only levelled sharp criticism at imperialism, which might in part have been motivated by her Scottish origins, but she also fought for her adopted country’s freedom. It is really difficult to accept Tantri’s capability if one grants more weight to the romance part and ignores Tantri’s world of reality, the reality that shows Tantri’s courageous fight. *The Baltimore Sun* wrote:

⁶⁰⁵ Patricia Meyer Spacks, *The Female Imagination: A Literary and Psychological Investigation of Women’s Writing* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1976), p. 4.

⁶⁰⁶ Spacks, p. 4.

⁶⁰⁷ Lindsey, p. 15. For more information see also Hannah Arendt, *Between Past and Future* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985), p. 4. First published in New York by Viking in 1961.

More important than the adventures is K'tut Tantri's deep love for the Indonesian people. A leading United States newspaper said, "It is hard to think of K'tut Tantri leaving the land with the highest standard of living and going Indonesian in an international way – at least to the point of taking the United Nations Charter seriously ... It is possible she is way ahead of the rest of us, internationally speaking."⁶⁰⁸

Fictions and popular autobiographies are not usually regarded as historical texts. The whole question of what constitutes 'history' is a problematic one. Some texts reveal more about themselves, their ego, and their true self. *Revolt in Paradise* may and may not reveal a faithful representation of the author. However, as an autobiography, it is a genre in its own right and has its own rewards.

In a similar manner to the travel writers discussed earlier, the novelist and the autobiographer in this study are treated unfairly. The relationships between women and colonialism or war are considered negatively. There was also a myth that women should not be part of war. Therefore, during those years, writing by women, either on war or on colonialism, is considered only as the result of dreaming – of the imagination. Men have long been the great writers and although Baum's novel has become a classic of Balinese literature, she is still associated with Walter Spies. Histories of women resistance fighters such as Tantri, on the other hand, have not attained the 'historical' status of the Great War novels or autobiographies by men such as Stephen Crane or Ernest Hemingway.⁶⁰⁹

It is necessary at this point to discuss how male attitude towards colonialism/imperialism changed as well. The fact that critics are still divided as to whether Orwell's *Shooting the Elephant* and Joseph Conrad's *The Heart of*

⁶⁰⁸ Tantri, 1965, p. xxviii.

⁶⁰⁹ Jean Bethke Elshtain, *Women and War* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1995), p. 212.

Darkness are pro-colonial indicates the uncertainties that surround this issue.⁶¹⁰

Orwell's first novel, *Burmese Days*⁶¹¹ is indeed anti-colonial.

3. 4. Geoffrey Gorer (1905-1985)

This section is about men as travelling colonists. Gorer was one of the travelling colonists who went to Bali. Gorer was born in London but was educated at Charterhouse and at Jesus College Cambridge. He took a year off and went to the Sorbonne from 1922-1923 before graduating from Cambridge in 1927. He obtained a degree in classics and modern languages. He wrote some books and plays but he never became a playwright. His *Africa Dances* lead him into the anthropological world and he became quite a famous writer in the field of scholarly British anthropology.

From Bali, Gorer journeyed to Angkor.⁶¹² Although he clarified that he was 'not in a position to say anything about the Colonial policies pursued in these countries',⁶¹³ he could not help giving his preference to one of the rulers in both places. Although he first appears to be neutral in his description of the Dutch and French (Indo-China) colonisers, Gorer seems to favour the former.⁶¹⁴ Unlike *Heart of Darkness* that was supposedly anti-colonial, *Bali and Angkor's* (1936) intention was, as mentioned above, neutral. Gorer insists that both the Dutch and the French shared 'a dislike of untidy or exuberant nature'.⁶¹⁵ However, being an

⁶¹⁰ However, some critics, such as Edward W. Said, and Chinua Achebe, saw Conrad's inclination towards colonialism or imperialism in *Heart of Darkness*.

⁶¹¹ For Orwell's discussion on racial discrimination, see the *Textual Note* of the 1961 edition of *Burmese Days*, p. 309.

⁶¹² Gorer had gone to Bali as part of his travel to Indo-China and the Dutch East Indies. Shavit, p. 150.

⁶¹³ Gorer, 1987, p. 12. As some authors discussed before, Gorer makes similar apologies.

⁶¹⁴ *ibid.*

⁶¹⁵ *ibid.*, p. 18.

outsider to both cultures/colonial territories, Gorer generalised that the Orientals regarded the Dutch as ‘dirty’:

I think it may be said as a generalisation that Orientals despise Europeans, even when they are afraid of them, thinking them ugly, and clumsy and gross and stupid: for Hindus and Mohammedans they are also infidels and unclean. This attitude is on the whole unjustified; although Orientals have not yet made as much of a mess of their lives as we have, although they are not yet faced with apparently ineluctable death from starvation or poison gas, their escape is I think chiefly due to inertia.⁶¹⁶

Despite his excuse that he was generalising, the racial tone in Gorer’s description was even clearer:

The Oriental seems far more alien to me than the African negro,⁶¹⁷ for the very reason that the former are so like us; except for rare isolated communities there seems to me to be little difference of quality, as opposed to degree, between people with whitish-pink and brownish-yellow skins. They are therefore to me – with the exception of these small communities – of very little interest; unless there are fundamental differences I am more interested in my compatriots. I do not think we have anything to learn from the Asiatics, except from the Chinese and Japanese⁶¹⁸ good manners; I also think there is very little we can teach them, except labour-saving devices.⁶¹⁹

Here Gorer defines the ‘alien’ according to the gradation of the skin colour. He seems to follow Madison Grant⁶²⁰ who believed that the darker the skin the more primitive and the closer to animals a race is. This, according to Grant, is because animals generally have dark eyes. Thus far, Gorer praised the Chinese and Japanese for their good manners. Still, in Gorer eyes, they have some drawbacks.

As mentioned before, Gorer publicly referenced to Orwell.⁶²¹ In fact he was an admirer of Orwell, and expressed his appraisal of *Burmese Days* privately

⁶¹⁶ Gorer, 1987, pp. 21-2.

⁶¹⁷ Gorer had had experience of Africa before.

⁶¹⁸ In the Dutch East Indies, Chinese and Japanese photographers were considered as ‘honorary’ Europeans. In the 1850s, for instance, the Japanese were classified as ‘foreign Asiatics’. Before the turn of the century, the Japanese were regarded as the same level as the Europeans before gaining equality as Europeans in the eyes of the law. See Groeneveld, p. 124.

⁶¹⁹ Gorer, 1987, p. 22.

⁶²⁰ See again Grant’s *The Passing of the Great Race* (1916).

⁶²¹ Bernard Crick, *George Orwell: A Life* (London: Penguin Books, 1992).

in a letter to its author.⁶²² This emphasises that writers have their own channels when it comes to sharing opinions or political inclinations, either publicly or privately. Here, it is not surprising that Gorer's racist description of the Oriental echoes Orwell's *Burmese Days*, which is satiated with images like 'whitish-pink and brownish-yellow skins'.⁶²³ Gorer's description of the Asiatics reveals his 'racial loathing.' He implied that skin colour determines one's level. He compares his 'whiteness' with the Chinese and Japanese and speaks well of them, only to claim his and his fellow citizens' superiority. Gorer's simultaneous praising and loathing of the Asiatics explains how it needs three ('my compatriots', 'Chinese' and 'Japanese') to make the superlative. Did his attitudes towards the French change when he went to Africa? In order to answer this it is necessary to study Gorer's past journeys, especially to French West Africa.

After the publication of his first work, *The Revolutionary Ideas of the Marquis de Sade* (1934),⁶²⁴ Gorer went to Morocco. He returned via Paris and visited his friend, a Russian artist, Pavel Fedorovich Tchelitchew (1898-1957). It was during this short visit that he was introduced to a Senegalese Wolof dancer,⁶²⁵ Féral Benga,⁶²⁶ who became the great ballet dancer of 1930s Paris. Some

⁶²² Gorer wrote a letter to Orwell in 1935. From this unexpected letter, they built a long friendships, see Crick, p. 264.

⁶²³ Gorer (1987), p. 22.

⁶²⁴ Revised and reprinted as *The Life and Ideas of the Marquis de Sade* (London: Panther, 1965). It reflects Gorer's interests in abnormal psychology.

⁶²⁵ For more information on the West African dance see Georginia Gore, 'Traditional Dance in West Africa', in *Dance History: An Introduction*, ed. by Janet Adshead – Lansdale and June Layson (New York: Routledge, 1994), pp. 59-80.

⁶²⁶ Féral Benga was born into Senegal's dominant Wolof tribe. His grandfather was one of Dakar's richest property owners. He left Dakar for Paris in 1925.

homosexual artists occasionally used Féral Benga as their nude model.⁶²⁷ Gorer went to Africa with Benga to study traditional dances. Unlike the real Baum and the fictitious writer in *Princesse Tam-Tam*, the movie, Gorer went to West Africa not to find inspiration for his novel. With Benga, Gorer soon found himself in West Africa. Beginning from Dakar, the journey led through much of what was then French West Africa – Senegal, French Guinea (now Guinea), the Ivory Coast and Dahomey (now Benin), and also into the then British-ruled Gold Coast (now Ghana) and Nigeria.

Gorer remained there for three months. In his travel account, *Africa Dances* (1935), he criticises French colonialism in West Africa. (His attitude towards French Indo-China will be discussed below). He observed how African traditional culture⁶²⁸ was affected by French colonial administration. Gorer's first amateur anthropological analysis, however, brought him to the attention of a number of leading anthropologists, in particular Margaret Mead⁶²⁹, Ruth Benedict, and John

⁶²⁷ Benga, a famous African dancer in Europe and America during the 1930s. He became a model for James Richmond Barthé's sculpture. Barthé (1901-1989) is the only African-American sculptor of his generation for whom the male nude was central. *Féral Benga* (1935) is a bronze nude figure that becomes Barthé's signature. Benga was also the sitter for a Russian artist, Pavel Fedorovich Tchelitchev (1898-1957). Tchelitchev's *Deposition* (1938) shows Benga in the nude. Benga also inspired an American photographer, Carl van Vechten (1880-1964). Both Van Vechten and Tchelitchev made portraits of the Benga during his New York visit. The model and the image makers are homosexuals. Margaret Rose Vendryes, 'Casting Féral Benga: A Biography of Richmond Barthé's Signature Work', *Masters of African American Art*, June 2003. (Journal of Publications by Professional Scholars Grant Recipient). Electronic. Available: http://www.anyonecanflyfoundation.org/library/Vendryes_on_Barthe_essay.html. 11 July 2005.

⁶²⁸ According to Georgia Gore, Gorer's dance analysis can be regarded as a historical sources for he gave detailed examples of certain dances in the 1930s, eventhough Gorer himself claims that he is not a dance expert (Gore, p. 63).

⁶²⁹ Gorer said 'It is impossible for me to state adequately my intellectual debt to Dr. Mead'. He was also 'conscious of having derived information from' many individuals including Wystan Auden. See Gorer, 1964, p. 19. According to Shavit, it was Gorer who inspired Mead and Bateson with an interest in Bali (Shavit, p. 160).

Dollard.⁶³⁰ Gorer received his training in anthropology from these American scholars in 1935.⁶³¹ He in turn evinced a keen interest in the science and decided on social anthropology as his lifelong career. The book, *Africa Dances*, was a financial success. The latest reprint was in March 2005 by Kessinger.

Africa Dances is dedicated to Gorer's travel companions: Féral Benga, Fodé Sanghor, and Alioune Diouf. The last two are his chauffeurs. Gorer gives detailed portraits of his companions on the journeys, who are presented as individuals throughout. Gorer gives such a detailed account that he cannot avoid racist description:

Alioune Diouf is a colossus of a man, very tall and very broad, with a skin so black that it seemed as if it would leave a mark on whatever it touched. His skin was very smooth, close-knit and satiny in texture; it may be said indeed as a generalization that the darker the skin, the farther evolved epidermically from the ape. The European with his coarse hairy skin and straight lanky hair is uncomfortably simian; the Oriental is a less hairy animal, but a woman's coat could as well be trimmed with Annamite's hair as with monkey's fur; it is only the negro with his almost complete absence of body-hair and his short curly head-hair whose surface does not recall the ape's.⁶³²

This is a passage that was written by a man who said he was not intending to write a book about politics, but someone who wanted to write about 'the negro as an individual'.⁶³³ Was he not talking about types?

Gorer, then, an untrained anthropologist, keeps repeating that he was making a kind of generalization. Still, he made a comparison among the Africans

⁶³⁰ Dollard influenced Margaret Mead's work. Mead once made a sketch of her intellectual genealogy where she put herself in the same generational line as Dollard, Gorer and Bateson. See Jane Adams and D. Gorton 'Southern Trauma: Revisiting Caste and Class in the Mississippi Delta', *American Anthropologist*, 106 (2004), 334-345 (p. 343).

⁶³¹ Gorer, 1964, p. 9.

⁶³² Gorer, 1983, pp. 39-40.

⁶³³ *ibid.*, p. 81.

between the Oriental and the European.⁶³⁴ Is he being objective in stereotyping human beings? He self-mocked the European, albeit uncomfortably, through comparisons to the simian. With the manners of his class, would Gorer eat the same food as his chauffeurs?

Fodé [Fodé Sanghor – the chauffeur] considered me as a young child whom he had to look after and protect – I was to the chauffeurs an extraordinary phenomenon because I talked to them, looked after them when they were sick, and particularly because I ate the same food as they did, a thing which had never been imagined before; I was not a ‘toubab’, the semi-mocking name for a European, but Geoffrey (in conversation among themselves: to my face I was *Monsier*) – and he made this particular business throughout the journey to see that I was not cheated and did not spend too much money; he would walk for miles to save centimes at distant markets, would bargain endlessly on every occasion, and would hardly allow me to make the necessary repairs to the car.⁶³⁵

Gorer did eat the same food as Sanghor and Diouf, but he was still the *Monsier*.

Although it is impossible to be sure that he dislikes being called *Monsier*, he puts himself higher than the average ‘European’ because he was not a ‘toubab’. He is the superlative.

Most Frenchmen who come to the colonies are of petit-bourgeois origin. Like his French fellows, Gorer comes from the same background. When he was in Africa, he was looking for a hotel. When his servant showed him a hotel ‘for coloured people,’ he decided not to go there, because he ‘felt rather sensitive about going there’.⁶³⁶

Gorer very well knew what his position was and when to take advantage of his colour; he traded his ‘pigment prestige’ for his pride:

⁶³⁴ Gorer later (in his 1983 reprint) admits his ‘error’: ‘There are many generalizations about primitives in these pages which I would now indignantly repudiate, I was far too much under the influence of Lévy-Bruhl and his concept of ‘primitive mentality,’ Gorer, 1983, p. 10. Orwell made similar correction as well.

⁶³⁵ Gorer, 1983, p. 39

⁶³⁶ *ibid.*, p. 165.

When we were finally ready to start it was discovered that Fodé had not got the necessary certificates of vaccination and immunization against plague, without which we could not leave the neighbourhood. We went to the native Service d'Hygiène, which was already full of negroes who had arrived that morning, but I used my pigment prestige and got Fodé treated before any of the others. I never got over the shame of taking advantage of my colour, but it was so useful and saved so much time that I constantly traded on it. For anyone who has not a naturally Imperialist constitution this is one of the most disagreeable facets of African travel.⁶³⁷

Is Gorer part of this 'Imperialist constitution'? Alternatively, is he just as ambiguous as his idol, Orwell? In a section titled 'taxes' Gorer wrote that he disagrees with the French in French West Africa. He condemns colonization:

The idea of colonization becomes increasingly more repugnant to me. To collect taxes, that is the chief preoccupation. Pacification, medical aid, have only one aim: to tame the people so that they will be docile and pay their taxes. What is the object of tours, sometimes accompanied by bloodshed? To bring in the taxes. What is the object of ethnographical studies? To learn how to govern more subtly so that the taxes shall come in better.⁶³⁸

It was noted previously that in order to rule the colony the rulers needed to learn about it first. In the quotation above, Gorer tries to present the case from the colonized standpoint; he thinks something needs to be said from the other side – the imperialist one.⁶³⁹ However, in a section called 'Voiceless Protest,' Gorer admitted that he was completely ignorant of the political and administrative conditions of the African and 'had no background of comparison'⁶⁴⁰ by which he could judge what he saw. However, Mr. V., whom he met on the boat, gives Gorer a long lecture on colonization.

One of the most intelligent administrators I met was a Monsieur V., who travelled back on the same boat as I did. He said to me: 'We French have really very little use for our colonies. We do not need them for a surplus

⁶³⁷ *ibid.*, p. 49. During the Japanese invasion to the Dutch East Indies, many Dutch and mix race claimed to be natives.

⁶³⁸ Gorer, 1983, p. 69.

⁶³⁹ *ibid.*, p. 81.

⁶⁴⁰ *ibid.*, p. 80.

population, we are not to any extent dependent on their products for our food, we make practically no use of them as a market. [This is certainly true; practically the only French goods you see in West African stores are drinks and cosmetics; most machinery and metal goods are American or German, most textiles English, Japanese or Russian, in that order.] A few private companies have had concessions to exploit the rubber and minerals, but they have on the whole harmed the colonies without enriching themselves. Consequently the only group of people who have a permanent interest and influence on colonial policy are the militants. Roads and communications are developed on the basis of military strategy, naturally about fifty years out of date; military interests are always paramount. The colony is run like an armed camp. We are destroying our colonies by stupidity and you English are losing yours by sentimentality;*⁶⁴¹ the Dutch⁶⁴² are the only people who know how to run colonies. Although I am not certain of Monsieur V.'s exact words, I am sure I have not distorted the gist of his remarks, which I noted immediately; it is as far as it concerns the French colonies on the whole a judgement which concurs with mine, and which is founded on far greater experience.⁶⁴³

Gorer is in agreement with the French administrator concerning the colonizers:

the military strategy, the stupidity of the French government and the

sentimentality of the British government, and the 'wise' Dutch. It is this long

encounter with a Frenchman that perhaps shapes Gorer's ideas about the Dutch in

the Indies. It is not clear what Gorer's personal interests in the French are, but his

position as an outsider vis-à-vis West Africa's and Indo-China's culture ensures

that he displays a different attitude towards French administrations. Although

Gorer shows deep sympathy towards the colonized people, his description of them

is almost always derived from generalizations or racist remarks. Is this because of

his relatively young age and lack of training in anthropology? Is it the

anthropologists that should be blamed? Revising the preface to *Africa Dances*

⁶⁴¹ Asterisk original: *This 'sentimentality', of course, only applies to our West African colonies, and possibly India.

⁶⁴² Gorer is not alone. The following is what some writers said about the Dutch: 'the world's greatest colonizers' (Powell, 1985, p. 23); 'The Dutch are wise colonists' (Yates, 1933, p. 162) and; 'the greatest colonizing nation on earth' (Roosevelt, 1985, p. xvii).

⁶⁴³ Gorer, 1983, p. 77

from Washington D.C.⁶⁴⁴ in 1944 (the reprint was in 1945), Gorer seems to put the blame on the anthropologists:

The journey described in this book turned me into a more or less professional anthropologist for it left me deeply conscious of my incapacity to understand much of what I had witnessed. There are many generalizations about primitives in these pages which I would now indignantly repudiate; I was far too much under the influence of Lévy-Bruhl⁶⁴⁵ and his concept of 'primitive mentality'. I think some anthropologists go too much the other way in ascribing to every African negro or South Sea Islander the realism of Bayswater or Birmingham; but in the greater part of their lives African Negroes are much more sensible than I have described them here.⁶⁴⁶

In addition to the author's encounter with the colonial officials, Gorer had done some anthropological reading⁶⁴⁷ before. His encounter with, and his preconceptions of, the 'primitive' are also shaped by absent images that haunted his mind, images that he saw in a museum:

His [Banoué Ajouba's] head made the same sort of impression on me that certain pictures of Indian and Chinese sages do – I was particularly reminded of the porcelain statue of a Lohan in the British Museum.⁶⁴⁸

The next question is which of these three past experiences (encounters, texts and absent images) influenced the European's sense of superiority?

In contact with the French administrators I had become very superior and class conscious; the great majority were ignorant, incurious and ill-mannered. It was a pleasant surprise to meet someone who was interested in the same subjects as I was (chiefly anthropology), and who could discuss them intelligently; we even had acquaintances in common. It was easy to foresee that prolonged residence amongst colonials would turn me into an arrant snob.⁶⁴⁹

⁶⁴⁴ Gorer came to the United States for the first time in 1935.

⁶⁴⁵ Gorer possibly refers to Lucien Lévy-Bruhl's *How Native Think*, trans. by Lilian A. Clare (Princeton, N J: Princeton University, 1985). Translated from *Fonctions Mentales Dans Les Sociétés Inférieures* (1910).

⁶⁴⁶ Gorer, 1983, p. 10.

⁶⁴⁷ Gorer's West Africa journey was also enriched by Charles Fort's *Wild Talents* (New York: Claude Kendall, 1932)

⁶⁴⁸ Gorer, 1983, p. 108. The roles of anthropologists and the museums in circulating the stereotypes will be discussed in Chapter 4 and 5 respectively.

⁶⁴⁹ *ibid.*, p. 175.

The young and bright Gorer, with the manners of his rank, becomes more conscious of his class after prolonged contact with the colonials. It is arguable that colonials have something in common with the anthropologists; that anthropology is another name for colonialism. Those like Gorer, who perhaps had some compassion towards the African, will later, after some 'anthropological encounters', modify their view. In short, Gorer's attitude towards colonialism is dependent upon his past experience and his cultural baggage. In other words, people's perception or attitudes towards colonialism changed for better or worse. Ten years later Gorer acknowledged his past mistakes:

It is a chastening and, in some ways, humiliating experience to re-read a book one has written ten years before. So much is crude, so much might be better written or better expressed, so many other things might have been said.⁶⁵⁰

Gorer, Orwell, Conrad and Baum's ambiguity or inconsistency on this issue makes critics question their racial attitudes as well as their political stance towards colonialism. What Gorer, Orwell and Conrad have in common is that they try to distance themselves from any association with the colonisers (even Orwell, who himself was officially 'colonial'). Their critiques of colonialism are indeed original; however, they have to make racial remarks about the colonised people simply because they were the topic of conversations at that time. Women travelers to Bali do not necessarily have to uphold 'white' men's prestige. Pigment prestige is a male creation. What Gorer and Baum show is objectivity and their works cannot be evaluated in isolation. How about female anthropologists? Are their attitudes towards colonialism similar to those of their opposite sex? This issue will be discussed in the next chapter.

⁶⁵⁰ Gorer, 1983, p. 9. Preface to the 1945 and 1985 editions of *Africa Dances*. Orwell made similar 'apology' for his *Burmese Days* see Orwell's *Burmese Days*, 1961, p. 309.

CHAPTER 4

COLONIAL PHOTOGRAPHY AND ANTHROPOLOGY IN BALI

In the 1930s, Gregory Bateson and Margaret Mead undertook anthropological work in Bali. The result is *Balinese Character: A Photographic Analysis*. The book appeared at a time when photography was just beginning to be used as an aid to travel writing and as the title suggests the photographs became the medium of analysis. These photographs, in which more recognisable situations are depicted, reached a much smaller public than Krause's photos; they circulated among scientists or scholars. They sometimes appeared in publications, but since they were technically and aesthetically of inferior quality, they do little to counter-balance the primitive image of the natives and their culture as displayed in the work of commercial photographers. Ironically, like the demand for pornographic photographers, who imitate previous images (either photographs or paintings), the commercial studio photographer too worked in a way similar to how the anthropologists pictured the indigenous people. Soon, words such 'picturesque,' 'exotic,' 'savages' and 'native type' become the vocabulary of commercial and amateur photographers alike. It can be concluded that the perception of the 'Other', most powerfully manifested in early representations, mixed with findings of both armchair and fieldwork anthropology, as well as the expansion and maintenance of European colonial power. Thus, in order to read 'properly' one needs an understanding of the code, the caption, and the context of the photographs and an investigation of the intentions of the photographers and the users. By producing pictorial images of the native and circulating their

stereotypes, the photographers are in a sense reproducing a new form of colonialism. In so doing, the photographers imitate the colonisers' ways of seeing. Fabian is right to claim that 'there is no knowledge of the Other which is not also a temporal, historical, a political act'.⁶⁵¹

4. 1. Science and Colonial Photography in the Dutch East Indies

In the 19th century, science more or less serves trade and colonialism. The invention of photography in 1839 gives it a boost and photography is said to be pre-eminently suitable for scientific data. Photography, whose development runs parallel to that of science, is an essential resource for comparative anthropological research. The Dutch colonial presence helps promote the use, the sale and the business of photography. In other words, photography is very useful in aiding science, as I illustrate below.

Before discussing the role of social scientists in Bali, I will discuss a number of aspects of photography used for scientific purposes in the East Indies. From 1840 to 1873, there was an archaeological commission, which was limited to the remains of the Hindu-Javanese culture, although the Dutch government had been active in this area since 1805. The first scientific inventory of Indonesia was made possible by the establishment of the Royal Dutch Geographical Society in 1873, whose aim was not only to support expeditions and travellers alike but also to support and promote geographical knowledge, which later was used to expand the Dutch territory. It is not surprising to learn that '[s]cientific expeditions often preceded the actual expansion'.⁶⁵²

⁶⁵¹ Fabian, 1983, p. 1.

⁶⁵² Groeneveld, p. 35.

In addition to advanced science, these explorations were also used as propaganda, promoting Dutch prestige in the 'civilised world.'⁶⁵³ The Dutch research was seen as scientific evidence of cultural difference and hierarchy. It is necessary to note that at the beginning of the 19th century Dutch rule in the Indonesian archipelago was limited to Java, Ambon, Makassar and a number of outposts. As I mentioned earlier, there was not much in Bali that attracted the Dutch initially in terms of its natural resources. During those years, Bali was known for its magic and love potion and hard working slaves.

During this time, science was undergoing many changes, including the emergence of anthropology around 1850. Because of the more permanent nature of the Dutch colonial presence, there was growing interest in the indigenous population. This knowledge of the local people is also used to control them better.⁶⁵⁴ We have seen in a previous chapter that (whether they admit it or not) ordinary visitors who do not belong to the academic world come to Bali with some background knowledge or pre-conceived notions. The scientists' attraction to Bali as a place to be studied was influenced by their predecessors in the literary world and those who did research in neighbouring countries such as Papua New Guinea, Australia and Malaysia. These anthropologists were endeavouring to classify the external characteristics of all the races on earth. In fact, the earliest photographic representations of non-European peoples are produced by anthropologists.⁶⁵⁵ Some of these anthropologists worked at exhibitions and others in the colonies.

⁶⁵³ Groeneveld, p. 16.

⁶⁵⁴ Said, 1994, p. 120.

⁶⁵⁵ Anne Maxwell, *Colonial Photography & Exhibitions: Representations of the 'Native' and the Making of European Identities* (London: Leicester University, 2000), p. 38.

For the purposes of anthropometry, in 1882 Herman F. C. ten Kate required the subjects of the research to be photographed in the following ways: ‘divested of clothing and ornaments, full-length or a bust in three stages - en face, in profile and from the rear’.⁶⁵⁶ Some of these poses, frontal and quarter turned, for example, are still used in today’s standard passport photos. The photographs are taken solely for scientific purposes. However, at that time, it was mostly the Balinese women who were asked to strip off for ‘scientific’ purposes. Krause’s photo album is one such record. The purpose of the photographs switches from anthropometry to voyeurism. It is important in this respect not to mix up the exposed (female) breasts with the maternal and mothering aspects – the mother who breastfeeds her baby – recorded by Mead and Bateson in *Balinese Character*. Of course, men are asked to strip as well, as we can see for example in Krause’s *Bali 1912*. One of Krause’s uncensored photos shows a totally naked man squatting, facing the camera, covering – almost toying with – his sexual organ. Although there is some male nudity, they are unlikely to outnumber the images of female nudity. Many of these Balinese bare-breasted women’s photographs are still reproduced, circulated and sold online.⁶⁵⁷

In the early 1880s, Alfred Burton, a New Zealand photographer set sail for the South Pacific islands, which resulted in the publication of his travel account entitled *The Camera in the Coral Isles*. At that time, among anthropologists, Polynesians were regarded as ‘only slightly less advanced than the people of

⁶⁵⁶ Groeneveld, pp. 35-6.

⁶⁵⁷ See for example, Tempo Doeloe. Online. Available: www.tempo-dooeloe.com. 17 August 2005 and Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies’ website). Online. Available: <http://www.kitlv.nl>. 19 August 2005.

China and South Asia'.⁶⁵⁸ It was said that they (Polynesians, Chinese, South Asian women) share many physical characteristics. The predatory New Zealanders,⁶⁵⁹ that had set their eyes on Fiji and Samoa, agreed to 'commission' Burton to photograph the local women blouse-less to discover the 'similarity' of the Polynesians' women with those in China and South Asia. Maxwell notes that:

The narrative that accompanied the photographs reveals that the photographer expected these women to participate in a symbolic form of prostitution, which would simultaneously underline the higher moral reputation of Anglo-Saxon women and afford the European male voyeuristic pleasure.⁶⁶⁰

Returning to the studio bathers' series discussed in the earlier section, it is possible that the prostitute's status is merely the fabrication of the image-maker, while the *abdi dalem* turned 'Lady from Bandung' photograph is the invention of the image user. Maxwell further asserts that:

Slaves and prostitutes were not an exploited labour-force, nor merely degraded sexual objects however, they eventually become one of those slaves or prostitutes in order to justify the White man's arrogance.⁶⁶¹

Whether or not the models are indeed prostitutes it is interesting to learn that during her two-week excursion in the island of Bali, Yates notes that: 'Only the prostitutes and female *baliangs* (oracles) cover their breasts with the *kabaju* (jacket)'.⁶⁶² Yates' narrating authority suggested that *kabaju* symbolised an opacity that was to be found only in the prostitutes. Breast covering or applying one's face with decoration or make-up is another genre of the 'curled and painted' prostitutes. Krause makes similar observations: 'The upper part of the body is

⁶⁵⁸ Maxwell, p. 153.

⁶⁵⁹ *ibid.*

⁶⁶⁰ *ibid.*

⁶⁶¹ *ibid.*

⁶⁶² Yates, 1933, p. 77.

bare-though only a pure woman may appear thus; wearing a jacket is the sign of a prostitute'.⁶⁶³

We have discussed how Burton, the New Zealand photographer, examines some blouse-less women to study Balinese breasts. We discussed how women (more often than men) from other parts of the world, Fiji, Samoa, China, South Asia, under the guise of scientific reportage, women are subjugated – they are forced to strip. Nevertheless, it is a mistake, as I said before, to think that only women are photographed. Why are women photographed more than men? It would be interesting to speculate on the reasons for this ‘dominance’ of women over men. Berger insisted that women are still ‘depicted in a different way to men - because the “ideal” spectator is always assumed to be male and the image of the woman is designed to flatter him’.⁶⁶⁴ David Freedberg observes, correctly I believe, that:

It may of course be that the whole Western representation (and, I suspect, most representation across the world) is patriarchally determined, since it is clear that female bodies are presented sexually considerably more frequently than male ones.⁶⁶⁵

Most of Freedberg’s discussions are on the power of images in ‘art’. Here, I should add that most of the image-makers (artists and photographers) in Dutch colonial Bali were males.

To return to Jacobs, as an expatriate in a new land, Jacobs’ scientific account records a whole lot more (of private issues) than the personal and medical observations of its author. It is not actually as ‘scientific’ as it purported to be. As I have already discussed, in addition to Jacobs, Krause, a Dutch doctor stationed

⁶⁶³ Krause, 1988, p. 55.

⁶⁶⁴ Berger, p. 64.

⁶⁶⁵ David Freedberg, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1991), p. 324.

in Bali also illustrates his book with some bathing-scene photographs. Some of these image-makers become ‘amateur ethnographers’ and their works are well received. There were, for example, Nieuwenkamp and Krause, whose works were both exhibited in Amsterdam in 1918. Despite their scientific accounts, their works enhance the oriental eroticism and exoticism in Bali.

There was a time when social anthropology could and did define itself unambiguously as the study of primitive societies.⁶⁶⁶ In the beginning, like travel writing, photography was also connected to the newly developed discipline of anthropology, which, according to Rana Kabbani, later becomes ‘a leveller of cultures and races, its beginnings often serve[s] to bolster the self-esteem of the European by convincing him that he was the culmination of excellence in the human species’.⁶⁶⁷ The goal of the early anthropologists who conducted research in Bali was to document the physical and cultural characteristics of what they believed were the world’s least evolved races – the ‘primitive’. Following the tracks cleared by medical doctors, missionary doctors and colonial administrators, they travelled to the East Indies to cater for the public hunger for information on exotic peoples’ appearance and living habits. Some set out to Bali because they had been exposed to exhibitions and had seen Balinese music or Balinese art performances outside Bali. They confined their studies to certain regions in Bali that had some mission influence or colonial presence.

Another trend is ethnography, which studies man precisely in terms of his material culture. Early ethnographers were enthusiastic photographers, for the camera gathers the descriptive details sought for in the material inventory phase of

⁶⁶⁶ Asad, 1973, p. 11.

⁶⁶⁷ Kabbani, p. 8.

anthropology. As soon as the camera gained in popularity, commercial photographers concentrated on ethnographical pictures as well, which also appealed to the general public in the Netherlands and in the Indies. Their works tended to be dominated by stereotyped images based on the Western sense of superiority.⁶⁶⁸ In these photographs, it was otherness that was emphasised, romanticised or presented as inferior. They scarcely showed the real situation of those they portrayed.

Other writers, however, denounced the long accusation of similarities or connection between colonialism and anthropology. Asad also argues that

We must begin from the fact that the basic reality which made pre-war social anthropology a feasible and effective enterprise was the power relationship between dominating (European) and dominated (non-European) cultures. We then need to ask ourselves how this relationship has affected the practical pre-conditions of social anthropology; the uses to which its knowledge was put; the theoretical treatment of particular topics; the mode of perceiving and objectifying alien societies; and the anthropologist's claim of political neutrality.⁶⁶⁹

Before discussing the women scientists' work in Bali, it is useful to review how, in order to bolster the self-esteem of the European, the non European, the 'less civilised people' or the 'lowest order of man' are, more often than not, compared to animals. One of the practices to boost the travellers' self-esteem is by comparing and labelling the Other as part of the animal kingdom.

In Chapter 3, we learned how the natives are often times compared to animals such as the apes. This practice which was first borrowed from methods acquired in natural sciences is usually done by men. It is also the practice taken by travel writers who have no direct relation with the colonial government. The following are some traces of colonial attitude that are also applied in a 'proper'

⁶⁶⁸ Groeneveld, p. 47.

⁶⁶⁹ *ibid.*, p. 17.

scientific writing. We shall see in the following discussion the role of early anthropology in shaping the negative perception of Other. The next available animals that are used as the native reference are dogs. Here I wish to clarify that I use the photographs as illustrations as opposed to my first hand documentation. By this I mean I use photographs taken by others from different sources and am not using my own photographs.

Before discussing the anthropologist's and the social scientist's work in Bali, it is necessary to understand the anthropologist's works outside Bali. The first illustration is the drawings in Fig. 9. It shows a terrier that is believed to bear close similarities to the Irish people's features. Here the Irish man seems to resemble the dog. The two figures are sketched side by side to emphasise the similarities between the drawings, which are obviously made by the same person, James W. Redfield, in 1852. The notes accompanying the image say 'Comparison of an Irishman with a terrier dog'.⁶⁷⁰ Observe also the side view of the drawings (which recall poses from anthropometry and physiognomy) where the two figures both share much the same animal-like proportions of face and head.

In Chapter 2, I give some examples of colonial photographs that are displayed in exhibitions (not the anthropological ones). I have discussed how they are selected, reproduced, interpreted and re-used in different time periods and in different media. My next two examples are photographs of Australian Aborigines that are taken by the French anthropological photographer Prince Roland Bonaparte whose great-uncle is Emperor Napoleon III. Bonaparte is also a good example of an 'armchair photographer'. By this, I mean Bonaparte has enjoyed

⁶⁷⁰ James W. Redfield, *Comparative Physiognomy or Resemblances between Men and Animals* (New York: Redfield, 1852), p. 269.

this anthropological display without undergoing the inconvenience of travel to the remote area. One thing that must be mentioned in this connection is that there is a difference between photographs that are taken at the location of the display and those taken in the 'natural' setting. Bonaparte's capacity for rounded vision is certainly related to the degree of his involvement with the environment, of which he has none. Here Bonaparte's vision is solely influenced by the way the exhibition is displayed.

The exhibition itself took place at *Folies Bergère*, Paris in November 1885. For the purpose of this exhibition, nine aborigines were kidnapped by R.A. Cunningham in Western Australia two years prior to the exhibition, but only 'Billy', 'Jenny' and 'Little Toby' survived and were displayed. Giving names to the subjects, as we noted in the previous chapter, indicates possession. In some respects, this naming supposedly makes the Aborigines more 'human', rather than a 'type'. In fact, the new names should have indicated some 'affection' – something valuable and personal – to the possessors or to whoever named them. (Toby's real name was Wangong). The Aborigines are merely life displays. I have had occasion in a previous chapter to quote Alloula's reference to the Algerian harem: the native are 'akin to the butterflies and insects that museums of natural history and taxidermists exhibit in their glass display cases'.⁶⁷¹

These nine Aborigines were first forced to appear in some American museums in 1883. When they arrived in England in 1884, there were only seven of them. In May in the same year, the *Société d'Anthropologie de Bruxelles* who examined them found that they were suffering from tuberculosis. In the following

⁶⁷¹ Alloula, p. 92.

year in Frankfurt, they were reduced to five. In Paris when they were examined by Paul Topinard – Bonaparte’s teacher – and his colleagues, only three remained.

Different anthropological displays have different audiences and agendas. Different anthropologists have different interests as well, and those native Australians were measured, examined and photographed either frontal or side view. Their ‘identities’ were recorded by various tools such as callipers, measuring-rods and cameras. The local people

[...] had become recognised as “types”, instances in a hierarchy of groups which are by then enumerated by censuses, measured by anthropometrists, sociologised by anthropologists, problematised by administrators and sanitized by hygienists.⁶⁷²

Bonaparte, for instance, took photos of the three Australian Aborigines for his immediate audience – the *Société d’Anthropologie de Paris*. Bonaparte’s photographs of these Aborigines people are now in the collection of the Royal Anthropological Institute (RAI), London. He photographed his subjects in side and frontal views. As Paul Broca’s student, it is difficult to say that Bonaparte is not influenced by Broca’s concept of polygenesis. Hence, the death of six Australian Aborigines from tuberculosis convinced Bonaparte that the races are like species and that ‘most aboriginal races were incapable of surviving if placed in contact with the white race’.⁶⁷³ In some shots, they are seen naked and they are also clothed with special show clothes. Bonaparte does this to reinforce his point of view. In other words, Bonaparte believes that ‘inferior’ race should not mix with the ‘superior’ one. The ‘cross’ between different races, according to him,

⁶⁷² Christopher Pinney, ‘Underneath the Banyan Tree: William Crooke and Photographic Depictions of Caste,’ in Edwards, pp. 165-73 (p. 166).

⁶⁷³ Rony, pp. 26-7.

will produce even a 'more inferior' mix. Both Broca and Topinard are in favour of evolution, and it is possible that Bonaparte is on their side.

Both Bonaparte and the originator of the anthropological display regard the Australian Aborigines as low on the evolutionary scale. The following is an excerpt of an advert found on the back cover of Cunningham's pamphlet for his British audience (1884):

First introduction in England of the band of seven Australian boomerang throwers. Consisting of male and female Queensland black trackers and ranting man eaters! The celebrated bushmen. From the continent on the other side. The only captive band of these ferocious, treacherous, uncivilized savages with deep scars and seams in the scarred flesh, and bones and huge rings thrust through the nose and ears as ornaments. Veritable blood-thirsty beasts in distorted human form. With but a glimmering reason & gift of speech. They will be introduced in their peace, war, kangaroo, emu, & cockatoo dances. Their midnight corrobories, casting of the spear, and whirling of the boomerang. Worth journeying a hundred miles to see these specimens of the lowest order of man.⁶⁷⁴

This advert is self-explanatory and reveals some of the colonial's attitude towards the world that I mentioned before. Those photographs emphasise the local people's otherness, exoticism and inferiority. Whether or not Cunningham, as a businessperson, shares the prestige as an upper-class, as a showman, he knows exactly what to sell. As the exhibitor, his work involved working out the best way to make a profit. He was also the one who set the programme and arranges the performance for his displays. Bonaparte, who had access to this rare exhibition, eventually had a different role. In photographing the Australian Aborigines, he was responsible in arranging the sitters and for the layout and the settings.

Although he had never seen the Australian Aborigines in their natural environment, he managed to arrange poses according to what he understood and

⁶⁷⁴ R. A. Cunningham, *A History of R.A. Cunningham's Australia Aborigines, Tattooed Canibal, Black Trackers and Boomerang Throwers* (London: Elliot, 1884).

how he wanted them to be. In the drawings mentioned earlier, in order to prove the similarity, it is the human being that is drawn to look exactly like the dog. Here in these photographs, the dog is made to resemble the man. The presence of the dog in the photograph and in the exhibition itself directs the viewers' attention to their resemblance. Whether it is a live show or a still photograph, both the photographer and the user of the image have an audience in mind – they know who their audience are. What is being discussed here is that the location, position and selection of props determine meaning; they indicate the image-maker's intention. When the photographs are used by other scholars or users, they serve as merely 'illustrations' – the use of the photographs are different from the initial use or purpose of the photographers.

The first set of photograph is used by Roslyn Poignant to support her argument that 'photographs have evidential value for anthropology, in particular for a history of anthropology'.⁶⁷⁵ Anne Maxwell, however, uses the photograph of these Australian Aborigines to illustrate her critique of Bonaparte, the photographer. She questions how the same photographer represented two different cultures – Native American and Australian Aborigines – differently.⁶⁷⁶ In one of her chapters, entitled 'A lens on the other: photographs of non-Western peoples by anthropologists and travellers', Maxwell argues that both anthropologists' and travellers' photographs on 'the Other' were based on 'racial essences'.⁶⁷⁷ She continues to argue that 'The result was a rapidly expanding body of images that

⁶⁷⁵ Roslyn Poignant, 'Surveying the Field of View: The Making of the RAI Photographic Collection', in *Anthropology & Photography 1860-1920*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (New Haven: Yale University in association with the Royal Anthropological Institute, London, 1992), pp. 42-73 (p. 42).

⁶⁷⁶ Maxwell, p. 48.

⁶⁷⁷ *ibid.*, p. 38.

concealed the traces of Europeans' violence behind a rhetoric of physical, intellectual and moral superiority'.⁶⁷⁸ By giving these illustrations, I wish to show how in representing others, the image-makers of the 1900s, to a certain degree, believe that they are of higher strata than the Other. This they do by constructing the settings and prescribing poses. Edward T. Hall supported this view, as he admitted that 'Few of us Westerners are aware of the degree to which our visual perceptions are highly selected stereotypes.'⁶⁷⁹

We can observe that the whole arrays of prop, cultural artefacts and weapons, are carefully disposed by the exhibitors or photographers and meant to suggest a more 'realistic' and 'exotic' display. However, in this 'live' show, the tense look of the performers indicates their unwillingness or resentment towards their new environment. The presence of the dog is perhaps to indicate a hunting scene and to show man with traditional occupational tools – the norm in ethnographic writing at the time. At the same time, the photographer (and the showman) directs the audience in terms of how it should see, think, interpret and value. Although I try to distance myself from giving any aesthetic or cultural judgements about this image, the terrier dog and the Irishman discussed before springs to mind. By placing the dog in the photograph, the photographer encourages his readers to make a similar interpretation, one that suggests a similarity between the human being and the animal. Maxwell, however, has a different interpretation regarding the dog. The fact that the photograph was taken

⁶⁷⁸ *ibid.*

⁶⁷⁹ Edward T. Hall, introduction to *Visual Anthropology: Photography as a Research Method* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico, 1990), p. xv.

just before the death of 'Toby' makes Maxwell conclude that the prop is 'an allusion to death that was shockingly insensitive'.⁶⁸⁰

In reading the visual correctly, one needs an understanding of the code, the caption and the context. The preference for a certain word or photo may serve different purposes. How one sees an album as a whole collection is different from seeing them as one single picture that is picked up by Maxwell or the set of three pictures selected by Poignant. Both Maxwell and Poignant use Bonaparte's collection from the RAI and perhaps their interpretation would be different if the photos were selected from other institutions or private collections.

Maxwell's and Poignant's approach is different from those of the image makers. They do not show the same tendency as the earlier anthropologists. A modern beholder's response, such as those of Poignant and Maxwell, is unlikely to be the same as that of their male anthropologist colleagues of 1900s. Seen from the early anthropological point of view, there is a tendency for 'the Other' to be seen as 'lower' than the image-makers, while the more recent works show more sympathy to the natives.

At a time when photographs still compete with drawings, scientific writings compete with travel writing or colonial writing in terms of 'lowering' the local inhabitants. From the inception of photography, photographic images were still competing with graphic images. Soon after, as photography became less specialised because of the introduction of the medium of film, photography reached an ordinary public. It can be concluded that even though Maxwell and

⁶⁸⁰ Maxwell, p. 47.

Poignant see the same photographs and analyse them scientifically (anthropologically) they arrive at entirely different interpretations.

During the colonial period the 'anthropological worlds' do not always involve scientists but often medical or army doctors, amateur ethnographers, armchair photographers, commissioned photographers, showmen and missionaries. In representing others through the lens, they sometimes see themselves as the colonial rulers who tell the subject society what to do, what to wear, how to pose and what they are by giving them new names or identities. They are evident in the photographs when the Dutch allow their presence to be registered among the colonised people. One of the predecessor is perhaps Lt. Schutsal.⁶⁸¹ He is captured arrogantly with both hands on hip. While the king gives him a kind of military salute, the lieutenant gazes at the viewers instead. He does not need to greet the King of Gianyar in return. It is clear that Schutsal's predecessors have established this form of feudalism; and what is more important to him is to show to the world that it is he who is superior and that the native has the lower rank.

The following example reveals how someone who regards himself as better than the native boasts about his 'purity' in his own terms, ignoring that there is misconception about Balinese words. On one occasion, Dutch arrogance and ignorance derives from their own misunderstanding of the local language or terms. Myron Zobel, for instance, explains that the Malay terms the Dutch still water as 'ajar blanda'.⁶⁸² Here 'ajar' means water while 'blanda', an embedded form of the word 'Belanda', which, in Malay or Indonesian, may mean either the

⁶⁸¹ Vickers, *Bali: Periplus Travel Guide*, 1994, p. 32.

⁶⁸² In other text, 'ajar blanda' was spelt 'aer blanda' and translated as 'mineral water'. See Poortenaar, p. 3.

Netherlands (noun) or the Dutch (adjective). In this context, 'ajar blanda' literally refers to 'the Dutch's water'. In Malay, the term for drinking water is 'air putih'. Putih literally means 'white' and in this instance has nothing to do with skin colour. Zobel's lack of understanding of the native language leads him to such a conclusion:

The word water in Malay is *ajar* and bottled water is *ajar blanda* which means white water. Perhaps this distinction is made because the native water is black – or at least brown – having run every foot of the way from the mountain tops over a succession of muddy rice paddies.⁶⁸³

A lack of understanding on the part of the 'translator' (writer) is one of the problems in self-representations and in representing Others. It is apparent that this lack of understanding (and indeed misunderstanding) is compounded by the conclusion drawn by Zobel. Zobel simply does not understand that not all the water runs through the rice field. The Malay makes use of the word associated with 'Dutch-ness' to set the terms, using their own categories. Travellers/writers never forget to draw parallels with the things or experiences that they encounter before and thus compare them with their own new experiences. Jedamski observes that 'The view on the Other is reflected in an examination of oneself.'⁶⁸⁴ The Dutch translate what the native people say without knowing or understanding the cultural background or the linguistics form of the words. In order to understand the fundamental meaning of other people's culture, the observer needs to act as both anthropologist and linguist. This has been clearly explained by Asad:

One difference between the anthropologist and the linguist in the matter of translation is perhaps this: that whereas the latter is immediately faced with a specific piece of discourse produced within the society studied, a

⁶⁸³ Myron Zobel, 'An Inn in Klungkung,' in *Travelling to Bali: Four Hundred Years of Journeys*, compiled and introduced by Adrian Vickers (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1994), pp. 191-199 (p. 192).

⁶⁸⁴ Jedamski, p. 36.

discourse that is then textualized, the former must construct the discourse as a cultural text in terms of meanings implicit in a range of practices. The construction of cultural discourse and its translation thus seem to be facets of a single act.⁶⁸⁵

What is clear at this stage is that in order to represent or to visualise the Other, one cannot avoid revealing who one is, as represented by one's identity and culture.

At this point, I do not wish to say that this way of seeing is only the way the West sees the East – and not the other way around. Our cultural backgrounds, but also our historical and gendered prejudices, will always inform our representations of other people or culture. The following discussion, considering the voice of the native, explains the case.

It is necessary at this stage to discuss what 'culture' is. There has been a lot of discussions as to what culture is, and it is not my intention to review what the experts (middle class European) term as culture. Therefore, although the subject of this chapter is on scholarly writing, I would like to cite a quotation from a non-scholarly text – *The Painted Alphabet: A Novel Based on A Balinese Tale*. In one of the novel's sections, entitled 'The Benefits of Tourism', Diana Darling retells a traditional Balinese story which can be seen as a translation. Darling's first career was as a sculptor before working as a freelance writer and novelist. *The Painted Alphabet* was her first novel. Here is a long quote, how the native Bali defines Balinese 'culture':

'The future of Mameling is in tourism. Our foreign guests are powerful people in their own countries. They do us a great honor by showing so much interest in our culture. Do you know what culture is?'

There was a short silence. 'Culture is the way we do things. The tourists do things differently. They have a different culture – a very poor one, which is why they are so interested in ours. They have lots of money,

⁶⁸⁵ Talal Asad, 'The Concept of Cultural Translation in British Social Anthropology', in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Berkeley: University of California, 1986), pp. 141-64 (p. 160).

yes, but they know nothing about the gods, they can't dance or play music, except for their own sort on radios, they don't understand rice, many of them don't even eat rice.'

...

'They need to buy things. And after they buy things, they need a cold drink of beer. They need to eat and sleep, just like we do, but they need to eat in a tourist way and sleep in a tourist way. And they don't know how to go to the river.'

...

'We must use our heads and our hands to make things for the tourists to buy,' the prince went on. 'Some of us can paint. Let's make paintings for the tourists. Some of us can carve. Let's make sculpture for the tourists – or jewelry, if we're good at that. Perhaps our children can dance. Let's have them dance for the tourists! But let us protect our heirlooms. Don't sell your krisses. Don't sell your silver offering bowls and the fine old carvings from your house temples. Let us protect our heritage, our culture!'⁶⁸⁶

Here the local people understand 'culture' as 'way of life', music, arts and tools. In comparing other cultures, one's culture is said to be superior to the other. By using their own standards, the foreign culture is considered 'poor' and the foreigners are regarded as in need of some 'river training'. Regardless of whether one is chauvinistic or not, there is a pattern to viewing one's culture as better than the other's. The degree of these 'shortcomings' – do not know how to go to the river – indicates that the foreigners are not 'advanced'. Things would probably be the same if the 'native' is in the 'foreign' country. Asad, discusses the tension between what native speakers 'say' about their own culture and what they actually 'know' but cannot articulate using Western categories.⁶⁸⁷

In contrast, the perceptions of the first viewers, in this case, the image-makers, are related to not only their interaction or intensive first hand experience with their total environment, but also to how they present themselves. To return to the short quotation above, we can see how the local people use the terms that they

⁶⁸⁶ Diana Darling, *The Painted Alphabet: A Novel Based on Balinese Tale* (Singapore: Periplus, 2000), pp. 97-8.

⁶⁸⁷ Asad, 1986, p. 161.

know. When they have to describe the things that they do not know, or activities that they do not practise, they just describe them by using their own terms, for example 'going to the river.' This enables us to see how the anthropologists used the native terms in their texts.

4. 2. Scholarly Writing in the 1930s

As discussed in earlier chapter, the making and using of photographs of Bali provides valuable material for travel writers, musicians and photographers, amateurs and professionals alike. Photographs are also of use to social scientists whose works are sometimes called visual sociology and visual anthropology. As discussed in the previous chapters, Bali became the inspiration for authors, painters, photographers, and film makers. In addition, it was also 'the testing ground for one of the earliest systematic studies of the use of photography in the social sciences'.⁶⁸⁸ In the second half of the 1930s, in addition to Western visitors mentioned in earlier chapters, there are social scientists such as Gregory Bateson, Margaret Mead, Miguel Covarrubias, Jane Belo and Colin McPhee who visit Bali for scientific reasons. In this chapter, I have chosen to concentrate on Mead and de Zoete as the text providers.

I want to note here that I will be concerned with publications before Indonesian independence (1945). The reason for this restriction is to investigate whether the anthropologists who did some work in the Dutch East Indies were apologists of colonialism. African leaders and administrators believe that,

anthropologists before independence were 'apologists of colonialism' and subtle agents of colonial supremacy who studied African customs merely

⁶⁸⁸ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 60.

to provide the dominant white minority with information damaging to native interests but normally opaque to white investigation.⁶⁸⁹

In the case of Bali, however, the relationship between anthropology and colonialism depends on who the anthropologists are. In other words, this chapter intends to examine whether the 1930s anthropological writing was the handmaiden of colonialism.

The selection of the two scientific accounts in this study, published a few years before the end of Dutch colonialism in Indonesia, also deals with the emergence of the use of photography in social anthropology and the advent of photography – by this I mean that the technology of photography at the time allowed men and women to use the camera without many difficulties.

The inclusion of de Zoete and Spies is in order to enable investigation as to whether there is a gender bias in questioning these women scientists' 'professional standard' and 'authority'. The reasons in dealing with women writers are first to investigate whether or not female scholarly works are marginalised; secondly, to show how, when it comes to representing Bali at least, visual and written representation are not solely based on gender as Martin H. Krieger believes they are. Like many, Krieger argues that the value between visual and verbal texts is rooted in the differences between sexes: 'Pictures have been seen as feminine, deceptive and irrational when compared to words, which are male, truthful and rational'.⁶⁹⁰ Following this concept, Clarice Stasz finds that in a study of social sciences articles written in the 19th century, most articles that

⁶⁸⁹ Victor Turner (ed.), *Introduction to Colonialism in Africa 1870-1960 Volume 3 Profiles of Change: African Society and Colonial Rule* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1971), p. 1.

⁶⁹⁰ Krieger, p. 253.

were published by women include pictures.⁶⁹¹ Scherer observes that it is mostly women who published critical analyses of historical photographs.⁶⁹² There is no information as to how or who took the photographs that were included in Stasz' and Scherer' books. Nor it is clear whether the critiques that are mentioned in their books were of (male) historical photographers/scientists. However, most of the photographs discussed in their books were taken by male photographers. From this standpoint, my investigation will proceed with the works of two couples of writers and my discussion will primarily focus on the still photographs and the documentations (written texts) accompanying the photographs.

Finally, the 'professional standards' and the 'authenticity' of their photographic images, either 'science' or 'art', are beside the point I will make. If Krieger and Stasz believe that the distinction between the verbal and the visual lies in the differences between sexes, John Collier Jr. and Malcolm Collier's insistence on the visual and verbal dichotomy is not on the femininity or masculinity divide. They emphasise the fact that it is in Western culture that the visual is normally associated with intuition, art and implicit knowledge, while the verbal is often associated with reason, fact and objective information.⁶⁹³ The question is whether the difference is really determined by culture or gender.

4. 3. Translating Words

Unlike their predecessors, Mead and Bateson do not rely on colonial exhibition. They did some fieldwork and record what was happening in the field, staying and

⁶⁹¹ Clarice Stasz, 'The Early History of Visual Sociology', in *Images of Information: Still Photography in the Social Sciences*, ed. by Jon Wagner (London: Sage, 1979), pp. 119-36 (p. 135).

⁶⁹² Scherer, p. 32.

⁶⁹³ Collier and Collier, pp. 169-70.

doing field work in Bali from March 1936 to March 1938 and for a six-week period in February and March 1939. Before analysing the book, it is useful to discuss what is meant by fieldwork. According to James Clifford, 'Fieldwork normally involves physically leaving "home" (however that is defined) to travel in and out of some distinctly *different* setting'.⁶⁹⁴ This travelling away from home may include 'a neighborhood, house, office, hospital, church, or lab'. The length of time required to conduct this fieldwork may range from spending hours in a cab, which is normally defined as a mobile society, or making repeated short visits to an area, to dwelling in a community. Within the framework of the discipline, the anthropologist needs to do something other than 'pass through'. Clifford concludes that '[o]ne must do more than conduct interviews, make surveys, or compose journalistic reports'.⁶⁹⁵ Here Mead does not merely pass through, but as a field worker she makes use of the native informant and uses photographic analysis in describing Balinese character.

The difficulty in textualising a discourse is also experienced by Mead and de Zoete. All the Balinese words in *Balinese Character* are written in parentheses for the use of the intended readers. In order to reach greater audiences, Mead also prepares an Index and Glossary for ordinary readers.⁶⁹⁶ I will elaborate more on this later. *Dance and Drama in Bali* (1938) written by Beryl de Zoete and Walter Spies seems like the first complete book on Balinese dance and drama. Previous works include the two-volume *Insel Bali* by Krause (1920). In contrast to Mead, de Zoete gives some explanations of the native words. Furthermore, de Zoete

⁶⁹⁴ Clifford (1997), p. 58.

⁶⁹⁵ *ibid.*, p. 59.

⁶⁹⁶ Margaret Mead and Gregory Bateson, *Balinese Character: A Photographic Analysis* (New York: The New York Academy of Sciences, 1942), p. 52.

explains that '[u]navoidable Balinese terms are explained the first time they occur'.⁶⁹⁷ Like Mead, de Zoete provides her readers with an Index Glossary. But in contrast to Mead, de Zoete's target audience is more general. However, de Zoete avoids using too detailed explanations and lists the Balinese words instead. Similar to Mead, she keeps her audience in mind. She declares:

It would be pedantic to give too exact a description of details, which are, like almost everything in Bali, very flexible, and tiresome to burden the reader with lists of Balinese names for parts of costumes which have no exact counterpart in English.⁶⁹⁸

Here de Zoete is aware of the fact that it is difficult to find the English equivalent for the names of the costumes' attributes in the Balinese words. In their research, Mead and Bateson, like de Zoete and Spies, discern that there are Balinese words which have no exact counterpart in English. If de Zoete leaves the Balinese words as they are, Mead and Bateson use ordinary English words instead. de Zoete merely talks about names (part of costumes), whereas both Mead and Bateson, using their own (separate) past work as examples, speak about the 'old fashion' ways of doing and presenting fieldwork, and representing the other. From their own experience, Mead and Bateson conclude:

As no precise scientific vocabulary was available, the ordinary English words were used, with all their weight of culturally limited connotations, in attempt to describe the way in which the emotional life of these various South Sea peoples was organized in culturally standardized forms. This method had many serious limitations: it transgressed the canons of precise and operational scientific exposition proper to science; it was far too dependent upon idiosyncratic factors of style and literary skill; it was difficult to duplicate; and it was difficult to evaluate.⁶⁹⁹

⁶⁹⁷ Beryl de Zoete and Walter Spies, *Dance and Drama in Bali* (Hongkong: Periplus, 2002), preface by Arthur Waley. First published in London (1938).

⁶⁹⁸ de Zoete and Spies, p. 40.

⁶⁹⁹ Mead and Bateson, p. xi.

Mead and Bateson are aware of the dangers in translating or representing the native personality; there are 'serious limitations' with such an approach. However, this method, using the mainstream standardized forms or norms, as Mead has done in previous research, is unavoidable. Because of the nature of their research, de Zoete-Spies and Mead-Bateson have different considerations when using and translating Balinese words. de Zoete and Spies leave the names of the costumes' attributes in the Balinese words but Mead and Bateson decide to translate the adjectives of the Balinese concepts into their own. They use verbal description to visualise particular Balinese characters.

Most serious of all, we know this about the relationship between culture and verbal concepts – that the words which one culture has invested with meaning are by the very accuracy of their cultural fit, singularly inappropriate as vehicles for precise comment upon another culture. Many anthropologists have been so impressed with this verbal inadequacy that they have attempted to sharpen their comment upon other cultures by very extensive borrowing from the native language. This procedure, however, in addition to being clumsy and forbidding, does not solve the problem, because the only method of translation available to make the native terms finally intelligible is still the use of our own culturally limited language. Attempts to substitute terms of cross-cultural validity, while they have been reasonably successful in the field of social organization, have proved exceedingly unsatisfactory when finer shades of cultural meaning were attempted.⁷⁰⁰

Mead and Bateson (and many anthropologists) generally speaking agree that vocabularies of one culture cannot be substituted easily by words from other cultures. Instead of translating the verbal concepts, these scientists attempt to use some borrowed words. This action, according to Mead and Bateson, does not help much in explaining the foreign cultural concept accurately. They further argue that any attempts to translate this foreign concept into the researcher's language result in the same output simply because of the 'culturally limited language.' By

⁷⁰⁰ Mead and Bateson, p. xi.

this, Mead and Bateson do not explicitly say English is a weaker or stronger language than the local language or vice versa. At this point, it is important to consider what an ordinary traveller (not a scientist) says about his experience regarding Balinese words or the local language – Malay.

Powell's experience in learning and acquiring Balinese words helps him to understand the environment better:

This economy of vocabulary makes Malay a racy, colourful tongue. When I learned that the sun was *mata hari*, "eye of day," I was charmed. I enjoyed thinking of a fried egg as *mata sapi*, "eye of a cow." I was delighted by the idea that pink was "young red." But when I was told that *prumpuan*, "woman," meant literally "something to be forgiven," I knew that it was fun to learn Malay. And as I learned words, I grew closer to the life around me.⁷⁰¹

Powell's examples show how words are culturally determined. Imagine how the Balinese would react when they learn that *mata sapi* in American English is 'sunny-side up' – 'eye of a cow' is as 'big' as 'eyes of day'. Here, I am talking about translation within the word level. However, as we should be aware by now, translation does not merely involve words; it may involve actions or processes.

Sometimes, there are actions that cannot be described, such as how one does one's hair. This is because not only is there no equivalent word, but also meticulous attention is perhaps needed to translating 'action': the process of doing one's hair that Powell finds difficult to describe:

She had long silky hair. Most of the hair in Bengkel was black, but hers was a rich dark brown. She perfumed it with frangipani. She paid a lot of attention to it. She never used any hairpins. *She had several ways of doing up her hair, which I can't describe.* Usually it was wrapped around the head and interwound with a scarf, with the ends hanging in a feathery fringe. Sometimes she would knot it in back [sic], with a tassel dangling. Sometimes she would roll it inside itself in a great puff on the side of the

⁷⁰¹ Powell, 1985, p. 46.

head, tied in place with a few strands that had been separated from the rest.⁷⁰² (My italics)

Though it is a process that is not easy to describe, Powell's writing is intensely visual in its descriptions, although he cannot describe the whole process or the many different ways of doing hair. In his travel book, Powell does not have to pay attention to details such as how the Balinese girl does her hair up in many different ways – the details that perhaps are needed by social scientists who want to study how to tie hair the Balinese way. Whereas Powell experiences difficulty in describing daily ritual such as hair doing, Yates' difficulty lies in describing a dance: an art. Even with a long description, Yates admits that she is having difficulties in describing the dance. Note the process that she uses to describe it to her English-speaking audience.

One of the most extraordinary performances I saw I called the "sitting dance." It is often given by the Dutch hotel at Den Pasar for their visitors. Just at dusk, the dancer, usually a man, comes and sits cross-legged in the courtyard, while the *gamelan* plays an introduction. This sounds ordinary enough, and the visitors sit in prosaic Dutch chairs in the shadows and wait for the native to arise and dance.

But he only sits quietly with his eyes closed, a superb figure of bronze muscle bared to the waist with a dark *sarong* around his hips. His *batik* head-cloth has an odd tab hanging over one ear.

The *gamelan* quiets down to a faint tattoo, but still the dancer sits with eyes closed, as if in a trance. The music beats a little faster, and the dancer rouses as from a long sleep and lifts his arms in quivering undulations like a snake about to pounce. He bends his shoulders down to his knees weaving in a circle as if caressing the ground. He extends his body, arching his neck like a cobra. Shudders run down your spine, as he quivers and darts like some strange animal creeping out of the dark woods. *This dance is difficult to describe,** - watching it, one felt the vague motions of different animals. His long brown fingers, bent back, looked like claws, and trembled like little birds shivering before the onslaught of an enemy hidden in the leaves.⁷⁰³ (*My italics)

⁷⁰² Powell, 1985, pp. 49-50.

⁷⁰³ Yates, 1933, pp. 138-39.

Yates' and Powell's difficulties may also be experienced by the natives who perhaps encounter similar obstacles in explaining such activities: hair doing and dancing. The fact that there is no word for 'dance' in Balinese makes the translation even more difficult, if not 'untranslatable'. Even de Zoete, the dance expert, cannot fully describe a dance verbally; it needs an action:

Between each step, and as if anticipating it, is an accent called *angsal boeang*, which literally means an accent which has been thrown away – discarded, dropped, rejected – *clearly only the step itself can describe it!** It has the effect of having miscarried, and the result is a hesitating, postponed step, as if the dancer were feeling his way.⁷⁰⁴ (*My italics)

What is experienced by de Zoete is exactly what Colliers observed: that not all research insight and knowledge could be fully translated into verbal forms.⁷⁰⁵

If the English speakers are having problems in translating the visual, in this case the hair and the dance, the non-English speakers are certainly in a similar, or even more difficult, position. The best that the local people can do is to find the best equivalent in a 'stronger' (English) language.

Similar problems are not only experienced by social scientists, but also by travel writers such as Yates. Writing in 1934, as an 'ordinary' traveller, Yates knew the difficulties in writing about Bali and understanding the Balinese. She suggests that one needed to be a noted linguist or even convert to Hindu in order to understand Balinese society. Here is her lengthy explanation:

In the first place, the Balinese language is a very difficult and complex tongue which takes years to master; and as there are no text-books except in Dutch, this is an added difficulty, unless you're an accomplished linguist. And granted you learn the Balinese language, you must still become a Hindu *really* to understand – for there's an ancient ritual behind even the most casual blessing of the rice fields.⁷⁰⁶

⁷⁰⁴ de Zoete and Spies, p. 22.

⁷⁰⁵ Collier and Collier, p. 170.

⁷⁰⁶ Yates, 1933, p. 177.

Although Yates is more concerned with the mystery of Bali rather than in a scientific inquiry, her observation is enough to remind the readers of the difficulty of understanding other cultures. Yates is not questioning her authority as a travel writer; she simply shares her difficulty in understanding Balinese culture and gives some insight as to how to overcome that problem. For Yates, knowledge of or access to the local language is crucial. Yates does not discuss a role of a local informant specifically, but she talks about literature available in a language that she speaks and understands. Yates does not question the ‘authenticity’ of the Dutch texts on the Balinese either. It is only in her final point that she remarks the need for becoming a Hindu. However, there is an indication that coming from a culture that displays similarities with the other culture, and having knowledge of its linguistic form, influences the writer’s understanding of the Other. Finally, Yates’ aim in this kind of exegesis is certainly not to persuade her Western English speaking readers to adopt Balinese religious practices. She merely explores the most difficult form of translation: religion.

Yates, the travel writer, estimates that a two-month stay in ‘the field’ cannot guarantee the writer’s comprehension of ‘the secret inner life of the natives’. Mead and Bateson, whose combined research in Bali is the result of their study in the ‘field’ for more than two years,⁷⁰⁷ understand this problematic cultural translation. Does one’s understanding of a foreign culture really depend on the length of one’s stay or does it have anything to do with whose language is ‘weaker’ or ‘stronger’? For Clive J. Christie, they are language’s roots and geography:

⁷⁰⁷ Mead and Bateson, p. v.

Few of them had more than a rudimentary knowledge of the local languages, and could not therefore have anything other than a superficial knowledge of the societies they observed. This is, generally speaking, in marked contrast to travel-writers in Europe and the Mediterranean periphery of the same period.⁷⁰⁸

What can be concluded so far is that the way one looks at other cultures depends on not only who makes the observation and where the observation is made, but, as I observe in Chapter 3, also on cultural similarities, in this case the origins of particular languages.

Whereas Yates' position concerns her travel writing on Bali, Asad pursues such issues in relation to anthropology. According to Asad, 'anthropologist's translation is not merely a matter of matching sentences in the abstract, but *of learning to live another form of life and to speak another kind of language*'.⁷⁰⁹ Here Asad's central argument refers, in addition to the use of the 'right' words/terms in writing (as discussed by de Zoete and Mead) and speaking, to the fact that in any cultural translation there is a need to become one of 'them'.

4. 4. Textualising Images: The Visual and the Verbal Concept

Although Mead (1975) characterized anthropology as 'a discipline of words',⁷¹⁰ it is not because it is easy to translate the visual into verbal, but because anthropologists are interested in the life-styles of past times. And, as we have discussed previously, this has been experienced by Mead herself and some travel writers such as Yates and Powell in visualising Bali. We also discussed, among other things, that some of the difficulties include vocabularies or registers. If Yates' and Powell's difficulties lie in decoding what they see at the captured

⁷⁰⁸ Christie, 1994, p. 732.

⁷⁰⁹ Asad, 1986, p. 149.

⁷¹⁰ Mead cited by Scherer, p. 33.

moment they themselves witnessed, Mead's difficulties in this crucial translation process lie with the recorded moment in the form of photographs and video recordings. If we forget for a moment about its 'authenticity,' the translation of the visuals (photographs) can be reproduced and multiplied so that they can be witnessed or observed by a third party. With the help from I Made Kaler, a native secretary, Mead's analysis of photographs includes the decoding of visual components into written forms. This decoding is subject to Mead's cultural background. In other words, the concepts of the visual and verbal are culturally determined. This is clearly explained by Collier and Collier, who believe that:

Decoding or translation serves as a bridge between the visual, which in Western culture we associate with intuition, art, and implicit knowledge, and the verbal, which we have come to associate with reason, fact, and objective information.⁷¹¹

By this decoding process, Mead tries to verbalise the photographic evidence into scientific literature; as a result of this, the recorded visual material is no longer a picture, but a scientifically coded message. According to the Colliers, '[i]t frees the photographs from their limitation as document or illustration and allows them to become the basis for systematic knowledge'.⁷¹²

Secondary users of the image sometimes repeat the texts used by photographers or other users either to serve their purposes or to unconsciously promote or circulate earlier images or captions. In this section, I want to analyse how both the creators of the text within the scientific accounts and the photographer verbalise the visual.

The followings are some factual criteria that Mead and Bateson included in captioning their pictures. The first is contextual setting, which is applied for the

⁷¹¹ Collier and Collier, pp. 169-70.

⁷¹² *ibid.*, p. 170.

plates. For each plate, the authors give a general statement about the location including some theoretical points that they think the plate convey.⁷¹³ In Plate 37 (Water and Drinking), for example, they provide eight photographs. In addition to captions under each photograph, they also write a brief description of the plate:

Drinking, like the eating of snacks, is done casually and without shame. Water is, in fact, actually regarded as purifying. Before eating, a Balinese washes his hands and his mouth; after eating, he usually washes his mouth again and then drinks.

At the springs where people go to wash, a little gutter is installed so that the water comes out in a jet, and there are many special bathing places in temples, where pools are constructed under such gushing jets (*pantjoran*).⁷¹⁴

Secondly, the names and the relationships of the subjects are listed in the caption of each photograph or each series of photographs. Here, the authors do not use 'type' in identifying the principal people in the photographs. Whenever possible, the names of the most photographed children and their parents are provided. Here, Mead distances herself from using 'type' and does not give a new identity (by giving new names for example) to the subjects. One of the purposes in naming the subjects of the research is for future reference. In addition to names, wherever possible Mead and Bateson include the name of a specific locality. Finally, they put the date and the frame number of the negative.⁷¹⁵

According to the Colliers, '[t]he non verbal language of photorealism is a language that is most understood inter-culturally and cross-culturally'. Howard Becker argued that photographs, taken by either artists or scientists, could be used to understand the workings of the social world. In an exhibition called 'Exploring

⁷¹³ Mead and Bateson, p. 53.

⁷¹⁴ *ibid.*, p. 128.

⁷¹⁵ *ibid.*, p. 52.

Society Photographically,' Becker, a curator, displays some photographic works by both artists and scientists and remarks that their works complement each other:

The photographers represented here cover the full range of possibilities. Some are more concerned with the presentation of evidence than others. ... They all leave us knowing more about some aspect of society than we did before we absorbed their work.⁷¹⁶

It should also be noted that, as I have argued in Chapter 4, the photographic production may or may not be used by the scientists or scholars in their capacity in the academic or scientific world (as in the case of doctor Krause). Here, my focus will be on the first users. In the following quotation, Mead and Bateson explain how they write the caption for each photograph:

The reader is thus provided with scientific statements of a number of different degrees of objectivity and generality. Each single photograph may be regarded as almost purely objective, but juxtaposition of two different or contrasting photographs is already a step toward scientific generalization. The introductory statement on each plate provides, in many cases, an extreme of generality, whereas the detailed captions contain a blending of objective description and scientific generalization. We have assumed that the objectivity of the photographs themselves justifies some freedom in the writing of the captions. We have not hesitated, therefore, to select for emphasis those features of the photograph which seemed most revealing, and to describe those features in words and syntax which might convey a sense of the emphases of Balinese culture as we understand it.⁷¹⁷

If Bateson is the author of the photographic text, Mead is the translator. There are four points to be made here: first, despite some retouching and polishing of the photographs (referred to earlier), Mead and Bateson insist that their photographs are 'authentic' as opposed to 'posed' ('almost purely objective'); secondly, they both agree that they feel some generalisation is desirable ('already a step towards scientific generalisation'); thirdly, they believe that, because of its 'objectivity', the photographic record is then translated according to how they understand it.

⁷¹⁶ Barrett, p. 59.

⁷¹⁷ Mead and Bateson, p. 52.

Therefore, these photographs give them some authority to write as objective a caption as they can. In giving a sense of those photographic texts, they have selected certain features and interpreted their meanings. In translating this Balinese culture, they use the words and syntax that are normally used in their field and in their own society ('white', middle class, academic). Finally, their use of the selected vocabularies is based on the way they understand Balinese culture, and not on the way the Balinese express their culture to scientific authorities, notably the English-speaking people. It is only in their last point that Mead and Bateson cannot avoid the availability of the language of typification of their own culture, although the tendency to use any racial notions has been minimised or totally excluded. This comes close to the notion that cultural interpretation is confined to the terms or idioms that are familiar to the interpreters. Can this be avoided? As far as possible, every culture must be seen in its own terms. It is here that the role of a local informant is important. This can be accomplished by hiring a secretary. For, as the Colliers contend, '[t]hrough photography it is possible to learn to see through native eyes. Verbally we can interview natives and share the realism of their visual context'.⁷¹⁸ In producing *Balinese Character*, there are some negotiations between Mead, Bateson and Kaler – the secretary.

As I have mentioned before, for the publication of *Balinese Character* a native secretary was employed to take notes on Balinese conversations on site. As a result, an Index and Glossary is attached at the end of the book. Although *Balinese Character* is aimed at specific readers, the inclusion of these attachments, according to Mead and Bateson, provided not only for readers who

⁷¹⁸ Hall, 1990, p. xvii.

are ‘already familiar with Balinese language and custom’ but also for the ordinary reader who ‘wishes to set side-by-side the various photographs connected with one ceremony or native concept’.⁷¹⁹ In *Balinese Character*, it is not clear who interprets this native concept and who makes cultural statements based on the native conversations, let alone how is it translated. However, the role of the native secretary seems to bridge the gap. His role was to keep a record in his own language to furnish Mead and Bateson with a vocabulary and to enable Mead to crosscheck her observations.

‘All translation,’ Walter Benjamin wrote, ‘is only a somewhat provisional way of coming to terms with the foreignness of languages’.⁷²⁰ Here, like any kind of translation, the idea of cultural translation is not only limited to its foreignness of languages, but also to the sameness of audience. Should there be a marriage of ‘competence’ and ‘performance’ in solving the problems of translating others?

As I observed in the previous chapter, ‘non-scientific’ writings may be regarded as ‘art’ – something that needs skills but not an academic specialty. From the different genres that I discuss earlier, art can be anything whether it is ‘true’ or ‘untrue’, but scholarly writing is expected to be always ‘true’. According to Christie,

Understanding foreign cultures and languages has become the province of the academic specialist; conversely, travel-writing itself has become a similarly compartmentalized skill. The almost inevitable result is that those who know a society in depth cannot write about it in a way that could possibly attract the general reader – and those who can write well will only know the society they are describing in the most superficial terms.⁷²¹

This is an observation I would agree with.

⁷¹⁹ Mead and Bateson, p. 52.

⁷²⁰ Walter Benjamin, *Illuminations*, trans. by Harry Zohn (London: Jonathan Cape, 1970), p. 75.

⁷²¹ Christie, 1994, pp. 732-33.

In returning to Mead and Bateson, the academic specialists, and the professional/amateur photographers, it is not hard to believe what Christie said is true. In dealing with their photographic texts, what happens is just the opposite. In terms of the photographs' reception, it is those whose works are more professional that are well received and widely accepted regardless of their 'authenticity'.

4.5. Gender Issues in Scientific Writing

In this section, I wish to discuss the authenticity and authority of scientific accounts. *Balinese Character* is a monograph about the mountain village of Bayung Gede, Bali. It attempts to portray the relationships among the different types of culturally standardised behaviour. *Balinese Character*, however, places the scientific relevance over the visual (photographs). 'Conflict between scientific relevance and photographic merit has usually been easily settled in favour of the former, and a large number of pictures have been included in spite of photographic faults'.⁷²² It seems that both Mead and Bateson value the scientific relevance of their texts more than the aesthetic quality of the photographs. However, as we shall see later, there are some exceptions.

In *Balinese Character*, it is clear that Mead is the one who provided the texts and Bateson the photographs, except for one chapter that was written by Bateson on some technical procedures on photography that I will discuss later. Mead insists that (in *Balinese Character*) Bateson's photographs demonstrate her arguments; it is the photographs that support her scientific analysis and not vice versa. In using such a large collection, Mead argues that she and Bateson had

⁷²² Mead and Bateson, p. 51.

made a ‘quantum leap from any previous use of still photography’.⁷²³ Mead and Bateson further claim that *Balinese Character* was the outcome of what they regard as the most ‘methodologically innovative portion’ of their research in Bali between 1936 and 1939. However, Clifford Geertz argues that hardly anyone, including Bateson, agrees with Mead.⁷²⁴ Even though this quotation may reflect what Geertz thought regarding Bateson’s opinion, it is possible, keeping in mind that Bateson is the one who provides the pictures, that Geertz is the one who is not in agreement with Mead. Is this a gender issue?

One of Mead’s works devoted to Samoa brought posthumous controversy. In his works own on Samoa,⁷²⁵ Derek Freeman (cited by James Clifford) points out that ‘that Mead constructed a foreshortened picture, designed to propose moral, practical lessons for American society’.⁷²⁶ In other words, Freeman suggests that the photographs are constructed to demonstrate Mead’s scientific purposes. It is not the purpose of this section to debate Mead’s and Freeman’s study of the Samoan, however. Clifford offers a compromise position:

One is left with a stark contrast: Mead’s attractive, sexually liberated, calm Pacific world, and now Freeman’s Samoa of seething tensions, strict controls, and violent outbursts. Indeed Mead and Freeman form a kind of diptych, whose opposing panels signify a recurrent Western ambivalence about the “primitive.”⁷²⁷

⁷²³ Mead, 1976, p. 6.

⁷²⁴ Geertz, 1988, p. 4. Mead’s controversial research, *Coming of Age in Samoa: A Psychological Study of Primitive Youth for Western Civilisation* (New York: Morrow, 1961).

⁷²⁵ See for examples: *Margaret Mead and Samoa: The Making and Unmasking of an anthropological Myth* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, 1983) and *The Fateful Hoaxing of Margaret Mead: A Historical analysis of her Samoa Research* (Boulder, Colorado: Westview, 1999).

⁷²⁶ James Clifford, ‘On Ethnographic Allegory’, in *Writing Culture: Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Berkeley: University of California, 1986), pp. 98-121 (p. 102-3).

⁷²⁷ Clifford, 1986, p. 103.

Clifford is simply admitting that there is a difficulty in representing the Other, in representing the 'primitive' and not speculating on this Mead-Freeman controversy. In order to answer whether or not there is a gender bias in this dispute, it is important to see what Geertz said about Mead and Bateson:

Mead was also one of the few academics who attracted a wider readership, and her perspective on the way culture influenced personality fired the popular imagination. *Balinese Character* did not, however, attract as much attention as Mead's earlier work, though the book is regarded as a benchmark in the development of visual anthropology because of the inclusion of a chapter, written by Bateson, on their photographic research methods.⁷²⁸

Here, Geertz claims that it is only one chapter, the one written by Bateson, that is valuable to the development of visual anthropology; these are also the tools that are used by Mead in her much criticised research on Samoa. For Geertz, it seems that the male author is regarded as superior and more talented. Whether or not *Balinese Character* was well received, it is really difficult to understand Geertz's attitude towards Bateson. Keeping in mind that Bateson (in addition to his being Mead's husband) is a noted anthropologist,⁷²⁹ it is really impossible for him, the co-author, to disagree, as Geertz has said, with Mead about 'their' photographs; because of the photographic research method they employed, their work is considered, as Geertz himself claimed earlier, a pioneer of visual anthropology.

Mead died in 1978. Freeman's critiques on Mead's study on Samoa are drawn from the historical record and from his own fieldwork. His attacks, which are emphasized the titles of his works, were published in 1983 (*Margaret Mead and Samoa: The Making and the Unmaking of an Anthropological Myth*) and in

⁷²⁸ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 60.

⁷²⁹ Bateson had just published his acclaimed monograph on New Guinea, *Naven* (1936). *Naven* is a survey of the problems suggested by a composite picture of the culture of a New Guinea tribe drawn from three points of view.

1999 (*The Fateful Hoaxing of Margaret Mead: A Historical Analysis of her Samoa Research*). As I noted earlier, a similar book written by Bateson with Jane Belo was published years later. Bateson and Jane Belo's work on Bali, *Trance and Dance in Bali*, was published in 1952. Therefore, it is quite strange for Bateson to express his disagreement, if he disagrees with Mead, while Mead is still alive and to think that *Balinese Character* is a threat to *Trance and Dance in Bali*. If Bateson is the 'author' of the visual image and Mead is the textual provider, who is then the real author of *Balinese Character*? If texts, the selected words and images, are produced by more than one writer, the products are the result of disagreements, negotiation, and, most importantly, agreement. I believe it is a mistake for critics – the outsiders – to argue over what has been agreed by the producers.

Balinese Character is the work of both Mead and Bateson. As part of a team, Bateson takes the pictures at random and Mead does 'some necessary directing to the photography'. Bateson explains his role: he shot his subjects randomly and that is why he obtained 'a very imperfect view'.⁷³⁰ Meanwhile Mead takes notes of what is going on in the field. In addition to Mead's taking notes, as I explained previously, they are occasionally accompanied by Kaler, their native secretary, who jots down the conversations, which are spoken as in everyday life, among the subjects. The three keep good field notes, making accurate recordings of what is going on. As the photographer, Bateson admits that 'it is so hard to predict behavior that it was scarcely possible to select particular postures or gestures for photographic recording',⁷³¹ and that 'any attempt to select

⁷³⁰ Mead and Bateson, p. 50.

⁷³¹ *ibid.*

for special details was fatal'.⁷³² In order to overcome this difficulty, Bateson again emphasises the need for pursuing the activities at random.

Here, Bateson emphasises the importance of the medium in explaining the Balinese behaviour. The problem lies, perhaps, in verbalising what Mead sees with her naked eyes and what the man behind the camera sees. Perhaps it is here that there is a disagreement between the two. As Bateson himself declares, '[t]he photographic sequence is almost valueless without a verbal account of what occurred'. Bateson uses the visual as their raw data: as document. Here Bateson, the anthropologist and the photographer, repeats what Joanna C. Scherer has said about the visual: 'Since the invention of photography in 1839, pictures have more often than not been subordinated to the written word'.⁷³³ In sum, Bateson considers Mead's written comments as valuable. This seems to apply to photographs in aid of social science/anthropology only, for there is a different perspective offered by a Leiden geologist Karl Martin, who carried out a geographical survey in Indonesia in 1891-1892. He claimed that without the photographs that he himself took on location (not in exhibitions or museums), 'a faithful representation of my opinion is hardly possible'.⁷³⁴ In this case, Martin uses his photographic images as documents supporting his arguments and scientific accounts. Some writers, including Martin, believe that images can give form to a concept of reality. This can be clarified perhaps by focusing our minds on the progress in photographic technology. In Martin's time, debate on the 'true'

⁷³² *ibid.*

⁷³³ Joanna C. Scherer, 'The Photographic Document: Photographs as Primary Data in Anthropological Enquiry', in *Anthropology and Photography 1860-1920*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (New Haven: Yale University, in association with the Royal Anthropological Institute London, 1992), pp. 32-43 (p. 32).

⁷³⁴ Groeneveld, p. 37.

nature of the photographs was still going on. The two examples are contradictory. Whereas Bateson values the verbal account more than the visual, Martin valorises the visual – the photographic image – instead. I am not in favour of Bateson or Martin. I stand somewhere between the two, and I accept the idea that written words help explain the visual – that written words can communicate in ways images cannot. However, in some cases visual representations are already self-explanatory. This does not mean that written words are always more privileged than images. Therefore, it is not easy to agree with the Colliers, as quoted at the beginning of this chapter, that Western people perceive the written word as reality and visual imagery as impression.

I discussed in the previous chapter that the colonial (studio) photographs include painted backgrounds and employ painterly conventions of posing – selected and prescribed by the photographers. The same practice is also employed by some exhibition-travelling photographers. By exhibition-travelling photographer in this context I mean those who travelled to colonial exhibitions other than their natural habitat (outside the photographer's and the colonial subject's immediate environment).

Although Delaroche has claimed, as I mentioned in Chapter 2, that as soon as photography is invented, painting is dead, the reproduction of painted backdrops that are used at that time for studio photographs indicates that painting is still alive. Similarly, in the exhibition of the Other, the 'displays' are also decorated with reproductions of the natural settings or the memorabilia of the artefacts of the indigenous people. I have discussed how, in order to bring more authenticity and authority to her novel, Baum mentions the name of an individual

who is considered reliable by many. In authenticating the visual, however, the photographers or the image-makers try to give references to the natural settings or traditional gears which for many reasons cannot be taken to the exhibition location. If photographs are believed to reflect 'reality' better than painting, why is there a need to include something 'inauthentic' in their works? In a defence of this, Johannes Lindt (1845-1926) a well known 19th century photographer in Australia, cited by Peter Quartermaine, says that such a practice, especially in the exploration photographs, is done to show what the 'foreign lands and their inhabitants look like'. Moreover, he contends that the photographic image and painterly decorated practice are 'the legitimate and proper means' in photography.⁷³⁵ In this context, Lindt seems to say that 'art' has changed its status from merely 'illustrations' to 'facts' and become documents. I am not interested, at this point, in discussing whether or not Lindt's representations of the native are evidence of the situation of the natives within their own habitat. I just want to emphasise, as I concluded in Chapter 3, that the influence of art can be seen in photography rather than the reverse.

However, not every photographer agrees with Lindt. When it comes to the importance of aestheticism or 'authenticity', Mead and Bateson put more weight on the latter.⁷³⁶ Bateson's statement does not mean that there is no retouching involved in the visual representation of the Balinese behaviour. With the help of

⁷³⁵ Peter Quartermaine, 'Johannes Lindt: Photographer of Australia and New Guinea', in *Representing Others: White Views of Indigenous Peoples*, ed. by Mick Gidley (Exeter: University of Exeter, 1994), pp. 84-102 (p. 92).

⁷³⁶ Mead and Bateson, p. 51.

Karsten Stapelfeldt⁷³⁷, some of the blemishes in the photographs have been removed and artistic works were added:

We have to thank Mr. Karsten Stapelfeldt for skillful work which he very kindly performed in spotting out blemishes in the prints. In this work, he scrupulously respected the scientific conventions, removing faults which confused the picture, but adding nothing without consulting us. After such consultation, he made the following additions involving draftsmanship: on Pl. 31, fig. 5, he painted in the strip of background, which was obscured by lichen and erosion; and in Pl. 62, fig. 4, he painted over the hand and forearm of the man inside the Dragon.⁷³⁸

The 'painted background' in Bateson's photographs of course is not the same as the one in Lindt's photographic images. The only difference is that in Lindt's photographs, when he decided to use this mass-produced art work, the artist (whoever painted the backdrops) was not available for consultation. It is possible that, from my observation, the practice of decorating the exhibition stand (the culture of travelling anthropological photographers) derives from the culture of the studio photographer.

It has long been asserted that scientific anthropology is also an 'art', that ethnographies have literary qualities.⁷³⁹ Mead, however, sees herself as both anthropologist and literary artist.⁷⁴⁰ Here, although the authors are quite firm in separating art from science, they feel the need to have an expert apply some finishing touches; nevertheless, the authors still have the authority to decide which photographs need polishing, even if it is in a form of 'shading':

In a large number of cases, some shading was done in the process of enlarging the photographs, but this adds no drawing to the photograph,

⁷³⁷ It is not clear whether Stapelfeldt has ever visited the Indies, but it seems that due to the demands on special - if different - skills of photography at the time, there is a need to have someone with special skill. I. van Kin Bergen (1821-1905), for example, is a retoucher and portrait painter who worked in Batavia (now Jakarta) in 1850.

⁷³⁸ Mead and Bateson, pp. 51-2.

⁷³⁹ James Clifford and George E. Marcus (eds.), *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography* (Berkeley: University of California, 1986), p. 4.

⁷⁴⁰ Clifford and Marcus, p. 3.

only making it possible for the paper to give a more complete rendering of what is present in the negative.⁷⁴¹

Despite the minor corrections, the photographic images in *Balinese Character* are perhaps more reliable in terms of scientific convention. However, *Balinese Character* does not attract the academic world as much as Mead's previous work.⁷⁴² This 'failure', according to Hitchcock, is simply because the photographic images are not aesthetically taken:

When set alongside *Dance and Drama in Bali*, *Balinese Character* appears to be the more overly pedantic and obscure of the two, and with hindsight, it is possible to appreciate why Mead failed to repeat her earlier success with the *Balinese Character*. In contrast, Beryl de Zoete, Mead's arch-rival in Bali, was unhindered by academic inhibitions. When faced with the same problem as Mead and Bateson – of the need to balance text and illustration – she kept aesthetic criteria very much in mind.⁷⁴³

I mentioned earlier that when photography reaches a wider public, more and more ordinary people use cameras. They take photographs of the local inhabitants within their recognisable situations. However, their amateurism, which entails poor quality aesthetics, means these 'authentic' photographs reach a smaller public. Therefore, they do very little to counter-balance the primitive image of the natives and their culture as displayed in the work of commercial photographers.

Who produces literature of visual anthropology is not my concern here. Rather I draw from this literature to discuss who has the right, when speaking of 'authenticity', to present others visually. From this, we may make a sound judgement as to the values of both the artistic and scientific representations in the photographs. Who has the authority to separate science from art? *Balinese*

⁷⁴¹ Mead and Bateson, pp. 51-2.

⁷⁴² Hitchcock and Norris, p. 60.

⁷⁴³ *ibid.*, p. 65.

Character lacks aesthetic criteria, according to Hitchcock and Norris, simply because the authors stick ‘too closely to academic orthodoxy’; and this, they argue, meant the book was not as well received as Mead’s earlier works.⁷⁴⁴ Here Hitchcock and Norris emphasise the saleable point and its relation to aesthetic value.

In contrast to Hitchcock and Norris, Geertz has made it clear that it is Bateson’s chapter that is the most valuable part of *Balinese Character*. Here Geertz is referring to Bateson only, without including Mead. In *Visual Anthropology: Photography as a Research Method*, John Collier, Jr., and Malcolm Collier announce that, ‘Gregory Bateson and Margaret Mead made the first saturated photographic research in another culture’.⁷⁴⁵ Although Collier and Collier mentioned Bateson’s name first, it is clear that the Colliers acclaim the anthropologists’ photographic research method. Hitchcock and Norris regard this method as a technique used merely to ‘advance her (Mead’s) theories on culture and personality’ in which Mead puts more emphasis on the mother-child relationship. Hitchcock and Norris argue that ‘[t]he photographs were also not sensationalist’. They add that ‘Bateson draws attention to the criteria used for their selection’.⁷⁴⁶ In other words, Hitchcock and Norris seem to say that the photographs are taken according to some theories set out in advance with the express purpose of illustrating their ethnographic texts, rather than by analysing the Balinese behaviour by means of photographs. It should be noted that Mead and Bateson invent their photographic methods of recording and describing in the course of doing the research. For them, it is a kind of trial and error.

⁷⁴⁴ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 64.

⁷⁴⁵ Collier and Collier, p. 12.

⁷⁴⁶ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 64.

Both Mead and Bateson are aware of the possibility that critics such as Hitchcock and Norris will question the validity of their photographic statements. In the chapter on their photographic research method, Bateson explains that he and Mead use the camera as a recording device to overcome their limited vocabularies – as an added tool – and not as a replacement for other tools such as measuring rods or callipers. Here, the photo explains what words/translation cannot. In other words, their photographs provide a sense of Balinese environments in a glance that written descriptions and tables fail to convey.

Bateson supports his arguments thus:

We tried to use the still and the moving-picture cameras to get a record of Balinese behavior, and this is a very different matter from the preparation of “documentary” film or photographs. We tried to shoot what happened normally and spontaneously, rather than to decide upon the norms and then get Balinese to go through these behaviours in suitable lighting. We treated the cameras in the field as recording instruments, not as devices for illustrating our theses.⁷⁴⁷

From 25,000 frames printed as diapositives and strips of positive film, they have selected 759 pictures to be included in their book.⁷⁴⁸ Although Mead and Bateson insist that they record the Balinese behaviour naturally and do not direct any poses, they admit that there were eight ‘posed’ photographs. For them, being posed means that ‘the postures of the subjects were directly influenced by the knowledge that a picture was being taken’.⁷⁴⁹ Here Mead and Bateson clarify that what they meant by ‘posed’ photographs is totally different from ‘constructed’, since they ‘never asked to take pictures, but just took them as a matter of

⁷⁴⁷ Mead and Bateson, p. 49.

⁷⁴⁸ Motion-picture camera is also used in Mead and Bateson field research, but for economic reason, is only reserved for behaviour that they consider as ‘more active and interesting’.

⁷⁴⁹ Mead and Bateson, p. 49.

routine'.⁷⁵⁰ Bateson uses the Leica camera and takes about 25,000 photographs within two years. He argues that 'it is almost impossible to maintain camera consciousness after the first dozen shots'.⁷⁵¹ Here he simply defends himself from posing the Balinese. He distinguishes between the arranged pictures and the planned scripts for the video shoots commonly used in early anthropology. Therefore, there is no 'constructedness' in the way that there is in the work of Krause, Bonaparte, or Lindt.

In order to validate the authenticity of his photographs, Krause claims that because of his camera's size, his subjects are not conscious of being photographed. In a similar situation, Mead and Bateson give a more detailed explanation of that which contributed to diminishing camera consciousness in their subjects. First the large number of images taken within two years; secondly, they took the photographs as part of their routine and never asked to photograph the natives. Because the interest of their field research was on mother and child, they frequently focused on photographing small babies, concluding that the parents overlooked that they were being photographed. Neither Mead nor Bateson explains where Bateson pointed the camera when it comes to photographing children who are notably more conscious than babies are. Finally, they frequently used an angular view finder if they perceived that the subjects were reluctant to be shot.

The factual and technical information given by Mead and Bateson reveals that they recorded the Balinese character as they were; the poses are far from being constructed. As Mead and Bateson explained, for them, posed means the

⁷⁵⁰ *ibid.*

⁷⁵¹ *ibid.*

subjects are aware of being photographed. 'Paying for the dance' and 'asking a mother to delay the bathing of the child until the sun was high' are not considered as being posed. According to Mead and Bateson, asking dancers or theatrical groups to perform is a common practice in Bali, because some Balinese earn their living that way. Bateson asks the mother to bathe the baby at a certain time so that the researchers can pay more attention to the baby and at the same time to 'diminish the mother's awareness that she was to be photographed'.⁷⁵² The decision to delay bathing the child, as Bateson argued, is not for aesthetic reasons, as it was for Krause in his bathing photographs.

As we must be aware by now, Mead and Bateson's study is praised for its method in using photographs. A six-page chapter, written by Bateson, is prepared to explain the factual and technical information regarding the pictures taken, selected and used in *Balinese Character*. The question of authenticity – of posed and not being posed – is not new in the scientific world. Look at the photographs of 'Two women grooming' taken by Captain F. R. Barton (1865-1945) a colonial administrator based in Port Moresby, Papua New Guinea, and by Reverend Harold Dauncey (1863-1919) from the London Missionary Society. When set alongside, the colonial official's photograph appears to be the more artistic of the two. There is no unwanted shadow such as the one that appears in the missionary photograph. The missionary does not try to correct the shadow, which emphasises the authenticity of the scene: he is recording the local people's activity when they are at the point of doing it. In contrast, the colonial administrator keeps aesthetic criteria very much in mind. When these two images are used by Martha Macintyre

⁷⁵² Mead and Bateson, p. 50.

and Maureen MacKenzie, both pictures are titled 'grooming' rather than, for example 'the hunt' or 'hunting'.⁷⁵³ It is not clear whether these writers consider 'grooming' as feminine and hunting as masculine.

For Collier and Collier, posing does not always mean under the full control of the photographer. Collier and Collier are in disagreement with Erving Goffman who considers a snapshot (a photograph of three men) as posed and not natural. Collier and Collier argue that '[w]hat Goffman failed to recognize was that while the pose was arranged, the kinesics was not'.⁷⁵⁴ Although both Mead and Bateson and Collier and Collier seem to have different perceptions of what 'posed' means, they seem to agree that kinesics mean something. For Mead and Bateson, '[k]inesics behaviour, facial expression, and body posture can also indicate social status'.⁷⁵⁵

Bateson, unlike the Colliers, considers posing as something related to the fact that the subjects being photographed are aware of the photographer's presence and action. Bateson tries to convince the readers that he does not arrange or control the pose. He does not construct the setting nor prescribe poses. Bateson's photographs are almost like snapshots. While the Colliers insist on the 'un-pose-able' kinesics, it is difficult to disagree with them that the photographed is not arranged. Whatever the arrangements of the setting and the posing are and whoever constructs them (the photographers or the subjects), I have to say that they are all posed or constructed photographs. The following quotation will perhaps help explain my position. Here, Mead, McPhee's Balinese friend

⁷⁵³ There is one, 'typically native', posed photograph showing men busy removing lice from their heads. Such scene is often sardonically called 'The Hunt'.

⁷⁵⁴ Collier and Collier, p. xiv.

⁷⁵⁵ Mead and Bateson, p. 83.

expresses how he wants to have his personal photograph, his visual self-representation, professionally taken:

I was touched, especially when he said one night he must have something to remember me by. A photograph. Of course, Made. I shall have Lai Heng make one tomorrow. How shall it be – I alone, or the two of us together? But he only said, It does not matter if you are in the picture or not. So Made had his picture taken, and at his request the photographer finished the print in style by touching up the buttons of the jacket in gold before he framed it.⁷⁵⁶

In this case, Made wants his personal picture to be taken according to his own specification so that McPhee can always remember him. It is difficult to believe that Lai Heng does not prescribe Made's pose to some degree. However, Collier and Collier are correct in saying that the kinesics cannot be totally controlled. Certainly, there is a negotiation between Made and Lai Heng; and this is different from the way Bateson takes the snapshots of the Balinese people. It is not the same as the fully constructed photographs presented in the collections the photographers or anthropologists at work during the early days of colonial or anthropological photography.

In the previous section, I discussed briefly the difference between a travel writer and an anthropologist. In this section, the focus is on the authority of travel writers and ethnographers. What distinguishes the ethnographer and the traveller is also a question considered by Mary Louise Pratt, who claims that:

The authority of the ethnographer over the 'mere traveller' rests chiefly on the idea that the traveler just passes through, whereas the ethnographer lives with the group under study. But of course this is what captives and castaways often do too, living in another culture in every capacity from prince to slave, learning indigenous languages and lifeway proficiency any

⁷⁵⁶ McPhee, 2002, p. 72.

ethnographer would envy, and often producing accounts that are indeed full, rich, and accurate by ethnography's own standards.⁷⁵⁷

Pratt agrees to some extent that the difference between an ethnographer and a travel writer lies in the duration of their stay in the location. However, she also makes a claim for the authority of other settlers who do not fall within the ethnographer category, such as captives or castaways. Their long stays, their fluency in the local language, and perhaps their living in the way that the natives do enables them potentially to share their lives in the 'field' with their Western readers.

Earlier we saw how for Becker photographs produced by both artists and scientists complement each other. Writing in 1983, De Certeau asserts that fiction and science are not opposed but complementary terms.⁷⁵⁸ If the photograph's status is that of 'art' and the ethnographic account is that of 'fiction,' is it really necessary to discuss who has the authority to separate art/fiction vs science?

So far, I have discussed how a social scientist – an anthropologist – deals with translating other cultures and cultural practices: specifically Balinese behaviour. Here I shall discuss how an ethnographic account represents another form of culture: the arts. Asad argues that the 'success' of representations of another culture depends on what form of culture is being translated:

Indeed, it could be argued that "translating" an alien form of life, another culture, is not always done best through the representational discourse of ethnography, that under certain conditions a dramatic performance, the execution of a dance, or the playing of a piece of music might be more apt. These would all be *productions* of the original and not mere

⁷⁵⁷ Mary Louise Pratt, 'Fieldwork in Common Places' in James Clifford and George E. Marcus (eds.) *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography* (Berkeley: University of California, 1986), pp. 27-50 (p. 38).

⁷⁵⁸ Cited in Paul Rabinow, 'Representations Are Social Facts: Modernity and Post Modernity in Anthropology,' in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Berkeley: University of California, 1986), pp. 234-61 (p. 243).

interpretations: transformed instances of the original, not authoritative textual representations of it.⁷⁵⁹

Before discussing *Dance and Drama in Bali*, it is useful to talk about the authors. Beryl de Zoete was born in London and claimed to be of Dutch descent; it seems that her attraction to Bali was accidental. Her Bali connection began when she determined to see a dance performance by Uday Shankar in Paris and travelled East to witness the Chleuh dancers in Casablanca. If Baum was extremely impressed by Krause's still performance photographs, de Zoete was greatly overwhelmed by the live performances of the Balinese dancers at the Exposition Colonial at the Parc de Vincennes she witnessed as part of her dance excursions in 1931. She had not yet become one of Britain's respected dance critics and dance ethnographers. Her earliest work, *Homes of the First Franciscans in Umbria, the Borders of Tuscany and the Northern Marches*, a travel account, was published when she was only twenty-one. In addition to her exclusive formal education – she studied English at Somerville College, Oxford in the early 1900s – she studied ballet in London and ballroom dancing with Monsieur Pierre. de Zoete also studied and then taught Dalcroze Eurhythmics for years. It was perhaps here, during her years in the Dalcroze School in Hellerau, that she got to know Spies, the photographer and co-author of her book. (Spies moved to Hellerau after being released from internment in the Urals.) Upon inheriting some money, she decided to stop teaching and travelled to Europe and North Africa to do research on dances.⁷⁶⁰

After seeing the Balinese dancer at the exhibition, de Zoete went for a short visit to Bali in December 1934. This she did during a six-month journey

⁷⁵⁹ Asad, 1986, p. 159.

⁷⁶⁰ Hitchcock and Norris, p. 4 and p. 38.

devoted to the study of dance in countries which still retained a Hindu cultural background.⁷⁶¹ It was here during de Zoete's first stay on the island that she and Spies, who at that time had lived there for fifteen years, planned *Dance and Drama in Bali*. They commenced their collaboration a year later when de Zoete returned for the second time. Though it appears that de Zoete had not started working on the book, Spies by comparison had seemingly done his homework:

When I returned a year later he [Spies] placed all his dance notes at my disposal, and, in the course of many conversations, orientated me in the complicated dance world of Bali in which, without his help, it would have taken me so much longer to find my way.⁷⁶²

The book was published in 1938 when de Zoete was fifty-four and Spies nearing forty.

In contrast to Baum, who tried to disguise her informant (though she credited him as 'Herr Walter Spies of Oeboed'), de Zoete openly paid tributes to Spies' 'musical knowledge and genius for vivid imagery' without which she might have had to stay longer than the actual fifteen months she spent in Bali. Many of the stories of Balinese dance-dramas were documented by Spies himself; therefore, they were unrecorded elsewhere.⁷⁶³ In addition to her travel accounts, mentioned previously, she translated the second volume of *A History of Art* (1908), which is a translation of *Corso elementare di storia dell'arte*. Since de Zoete was good at German, as well as some other foreign languages (French, Italian, and Greek, which enabled her later to learn Persian, Urdu and Malay), she had no difficulties in translating Spies' notes:

⁷⁶¹ de Zoete and Spies, preface.

⁷⁶² *ibid.*

⁷⁶³ *ibid.*, p. ix.

I have only translated these from his German version, itself a translation, so I fear they have no literary value in their present form. To us, as we collected them, each in turn appeared more exciting than the last!⁷⁶⁴

Speaking of her co-author Walter Spies, Beryl de Zoete, in her study, humbly voiced the opinion that

although this book is throughout the result of my own observation and experience during fifteen months I spent in Bali, and I must take responsibility for its final form, I could never have written it without his collaboration, and it belongs to us both.⁷⁶⁵

As an expert on dance, it is unlikely that de Zoete has a hidden agenda in mind, other than her devotion to art. Without any training in anthropology, she did fieldwork in Bali from 1935-1936. *Dance and Drama* was well received popularly, though much criticised by social scientists at that time since de Zoete was considered a 'laywoman.'⁷⁶⁶ *Dance and Drama in Bali*, according to Hitchcock is 'the best book on Bali of the period' and 'remains the authoritative reference on the dance-dramas of Bali.'⁷⁶⁷ As mentioned earlier, Vickers acknowledges de Zoete as a figure one could associate with the Bloomsbury circle. However, it is important to note what Vickers, the same man who wrote slightly negatively about Baum's writing talent, (discussed in an earlier chapter), said of de Zoete: she was 'definitely the junior partner, the provider of lucid prose' and 'Spies was the expert'.⁷⁶⁸

Hitchcock and Norris, who study both de Zoete's and Spies' photographs, clarify why there are scholars (mostly those working on Southeast Asia, such as Vickers) who do not take de Zoete's authority seriously. They explain that

⁷⁶⁴ *ibid.*

⁷⁶⁵ *ibid.*

⁷⁶⁶ de Zoete studied English at Somerville College, Oxford and graduated in 1901. It was only in 1920 that women were formally granted degrees.

⁷⁶⁷ Hitchcock, introduction to *Dance and Drama*, p. vii.

⁷⁶⁸ Vickers, 1989, p. 112.

although de Zoete's connection to Bloomsbury was ambiguous, a prominent Bloomsbury figure and an old friend of de Zoete, Harold Acton, said that de Zoete was indeed part of it but that she never really cared as to whether or not people identified her with Bloomsbury. When Hitchcock and Norris had a close look at de Zoete's and Spies' works – their publications and photography archive – they concluded that both de Zoete's and Spies' capabilities were 'equal.'⁷⁶⁹

Writing as a dance expert rather than a travel writer, de Zoete described her book as 'only an introduction to the dancing of Bali'.⁷⁷⁰ Narrowing her target audience down to a more specific readership, the aim of de Zoete's book was 'to show dancing as an integral part of the Balinese scene, though with far more detail than was possible in the admirable general study of Covarrubias, and to provide a starting-point for a still more specialist study'.⁷⁷¹ Each text, even within the same genre, has its own target audience. The key point here is that it needs a specialist to write for a 'specialist' audience.

All the photographs published in *Balinese Character* are taken by Bateson. For the publication of *Dance and Drama in Bali*, both de Zoete and Spies took some pictures of the dance performances. But only two of de Zoete's photographs were used. Unlike Bateson, both de Zoete and Spies do not explain how many photographs each of them took before making a selection. It is not clear whether there is a gender bias here. However, according to John Stowell, Spies' photographs in *Dance and Drama* 'were so carefully printed to his (Spies)

⁷⁶⁹ Hitchcock, introduction to *Dance and Drama*, p. v.

⁷⁷⁰ de Zoete and Spies, p. 7.

⁷⁷¹ *ibid.*, pp. 10-11.

specifications.⁷⁷² Stowell discusses the artistic side and not the scientific content of the book. This reveals the need for an ‘author’ to collaborate with the ‘photographer.’ Despite some negative views from the scholars working on South East Asia, reviews point to how the text and images in *Dance and Drama* complement each other. It is not known how Spies learned photography. However, he is one of those painters who use photography as an aide-memoire for some of his landscape paintings.

⁷⁷² John Stowell, ‘Walter Spies: The Artist as Photographer’ in *Toward Independence: a Century of Indonesia Photographed*, ed. by Jane Levy Reed (San Francisco: The Friends of Photography, 1991), pp. 97-105 (p. 97).

CHAPTER 5

DISPLAYS AS TEXTS AND IMAGE MAKING

Perhaps this chapter should have been the first in my study, rather than the last. It is here because, within the time period under discussion, this study reveals how image of Bali was first created, proceeding from simple to more complex circles of production via ways of seeing, imagining, believing, rejecting, writing, visualising, painting, and photographing. If the image makes its way into the museum, its route goes back to the beginning: the seeing. However, the discussion is not just about the time period, but its later repercussions. This chapter also shows that the images created and circulated in the time period continue to be circulated and perhaps influential in shaping perceptions, right up to the present time.

I have given examples from different genres such as autobiography, novels and scholarly writing. I have shown how the visitors' views or impressions of Bali are confirmed, rejected or changed; what attracts them to record Bali in words, drawings and prints; and how those images, absent or not, provide alternative ways of seeing Bali. We have discussed how art and photography imitate each other and how they make claims for 'truth'; how their meanings change according to the context and period of time. The content and style of the visual images – graphic and photographic – bear resemblance, and conform, to the aesthetic conventions of the time.

Scientific accounts follow suit. As we have seen, some social scientists have aesthetics in mind when documenting the visual. The social scientists apply some work of art or use photographic technology to correct the photographs that are of poor quality. They give some justification that such application is still within the boundaries of scientific convention. In Chapter 4, I discussed the objects (i.e. art or scientific works) that are purposely sought for the exhibitions, museums or galleries. The focus of Chapter 5 is on the permanent collections and the exhibition of those collections. I have also discussed texts (publications, exhibition photos on sale) that can be read in another place at another time. In the present chapter, my concern is with the texts that are experienced as part of the physical environment of the museum (i.e. written on the walls/signposts, panels or labels in the exhibition). Most exhibition texts include titles and sub-titles, introductory panels, group captions, interpretive panels, and object captions. This may include other interpretive media such as maps, charts, or posters. However, the texts used in this study are limited to the exhibition catalogues. (I am using examples of catalogue texts.)

In Chapter 1, I discussed the absent and present images that come to the visitors' minds while they are on the island. In this chapter I will discuss Bali's presence outside the island – in the European world – at the 1931 International Colonial Exposition in Paris. It was here that performances of Balinese music and dance were presented live in Europe for the first time.⁷⁷³ These groups of dancers and musicians captivated artists, scholars and the European public in general. One of the celebrities who travelled to see Bali after seeing the Balinese dancers in

⁷⁷³ I discussed in Chapter 2 the first exhibition of Balinese art in Amsterdam in 1918 conducted by Nieuwenkamp and Krause.

Paris was Serge Lifar,⁷⁷⁴ the well-known dancer from the Paris Opera Ballet.

However, there is no information as to whether or not he incorporated Balinese components in his ballet. Bali's participation in this international event occurred only once⁷⁷⁵ in this location and it had lasting effects on the visitors who saw Bali on site.⁷⁷⁶

Some of the artists and scholars became more famous after their encounters with Bali. Undoubtedly, Balinese elements became part of Western discourses on art and culture; the work of Margaret Mead, Gregory Bateson, Colin McPhee, Beryl de Zoete, Jane Belo, Miguel Covarrubias, Walter Spies and Antonin Artaud,⁷⁷⁷ and others saw to that. Artaud was the only one who had never made his way to Bali; the rest went in search of Bali and the mysteries of performance and recorded their visions in many different forms.

In Chapter 4, I mentioned how, after seeing the Balinese dancers at the exhibition, de Zoete went for a short visit to Bali in December 1934. Her experience of this colonial exhibition produced an important book. McPhee's attraction to Balinese music bore similar fruit. Again in Paris, in 1930, McPhee met the Mexican artist and traveller Covarrubias, and his wife Rose, who had just arrived from Bali. They further fuelled McPhee's interest in Bali. Here, too,

⁷⁷⁴ Shavit, p. 187.

⁷⁷⁵ Although this event occurred only once, there are plenty of publications including a film called *Goon-Goon*.

⁷⁷⁶ Ethnography's practice of taking cultures out of their contexts and placing them in new epistemological or phenomenological contexts is always an act of an unacknowledged ethnographic surrealism, Clifford, 1994, p. 147.

⁷⁷⁷ The review of the Balinese dances that Artaud wrote for *Nouvelle Revue Française* (1931) appeared in revised form seven years later in *The Theater and its Double* (1938, 1993) and, chronologically, was the earliest article of the book. See Nicola Savarese, *Parigi/Artaud Bali: Antonin Artaud Vede Il Teatro Balinese All'esposizione Coloniale Di Parigi Del 1931* (L'Aquila: Textus, 1997) Reviewed by Segio Costola, *Asian Theatre Journal*: ATJ; Fall 2003; 20, 2; ProQuest Direct Complete, pp. 253-255. Susan Sontag described Artaud's work on Balinese dance as the most alluring fictions of the Oriental theatre. See Sontag, *Under the Sign of Saturn* (London: Writers and Readers, 1983).

McPhee heard Balinese gamelan live for the first time, when it was performed at the Colonial Exhibition by a group of Balinese dancers and musicians from the village of Peliatan, led by the great Balinese musician Anak Agung Gede Ngurah Mandra. As mentioned in the introduction, the Covarrubiases, who stayed in Bali for just six months, returned via Paris in 1931. They arrived at a time when Balinese dancers and musicians were ‘the sensation’ of the International Colonial Exposition.⁷⁷⁸

My aim in this study is not to discuss Balinese arts as living signs – live performances – but as photographic texts, to see how they are inscribed in books or displayed behind glass at a remove in space, time and language from the site described. I will explore the relationships of the *avant-garde* to anthropology and pay particular attention to literature and visual arts and their repositories, namely museums. After describing the Dutch pavilion and its Balinese performances. I will explore the process through which they are represented in the newspapers, books, and museums. Subsequently, I will talk about how these still images are made to ‘perform’ their meaning for the readers/visitors by the very fact of being collected and exhibited; in turn, I will discuss the powerful messages conveyed not only by the objects shown but also via specific techniques of display.

Many museums were formed on the basis of collections and buildings featured at world fairs. In the early 20th century, for example, the Musée National des Arts D’Afrique et d’Océanie near the Bois de Vincennes was once the ministry for the French colonies. It was then used as a museum of Art from

⁷⁷⁸ Oja, p. 60.

Africa, South East Asia and South America, as well as an old fashioned aquarium after the 1931 Paris Exhibition.

Before analysing the texts, it is necessary to discuss what 'showing' means and how meaning is constructed by display. In order to answer this question I will explore the agency of display in (permanent) exhibitions and museums, including the museum/exhibition catalogues/books that are published in conjunction with the exhibitions. My focus is on the photographs and not on the moving images: moreover, I will concentrate on the publications rather than the sites themselves. Before discussing the catalogue texts, it is necessary to discuss the early encounters and representations of Bali in Europe. In this instance, I will concentrate on the experience of the anthropologists and the travelling photographers of the 1931 exhibition.

5. 1. Bali in Paris

The 1931 International Colonial Exposition in Paris dramatically proved the world's receptivity to the lure of the legend of Bali as a paradise island through the tremendous success of a Balinese troupe of dancers and musicians. They were the sensation of the exhibition. The fire that burnt the Dutch East Indies' Pavilion to the ground on the night of 28 June brought the Balinese dancers who slept there on to the front pages of the Paris newspapers the following day.⁷⁷⁹ Over a six-month period, more than eight million visitors flocked to the site (Exposition Coloniale 1931).⁷⁸⁰

⁷⁷⁹ Nicola Savarese, 'Antonin Artaud Sees Balinese Theatre at the Paris Colonial Exposition,' *The Drama Review* 45 (2001), 51-77 (p. 59).

⁷⁸⁰ Savarese, 2001, p. 54.

On 6 May 1931, France's Colonial Exhibition finally opened at the Bois de Vincennes in Paris, and it ended on 15 November.⁷⁸¹ It took four years in the making and covering about 110 hectares. Marshall Louis Lyautey, the legendary soldier and administrator who had brought Morocco under French control, was put in charge of the Colonial Exhibition in 1927.⁷⁸² The participants came from Brazil, Belgium, Denmark, the USA, Italy, Portugal and The Netherlands.⁷⁸³ The dancers who performed at the Paris Colonial Exhibition came from Peliatan, Ubud and Mas and were sponsored by the KPM shipping line. The most spectacular dance was perhaps a *pendet*.⁷⁸⁴ It was this dance that later brought scholars and artists alike to Bali:

Throughout the thirties the number of wealthy globetrotters from Europe and America increased; even some itinerant artists were there. Books and films spread the publicity which brought the visitors and gave them the expectation of seeing exotic dance performances and acquiring articles of value for next to nothing.⁷⁸⁵

This international Exposition was primarily a French event. I will not elucidate differences between French colonial policies and practices and those of participating colonisers, nor do I examine the Dutch pavilion in detail.⁷⁸⁶

Practices such as the exported Balinese dance and Balinese performances developed for the Colonial Exposition in Paris in 1931 were brought back to Bali. Similar performances continue to be presented to tourists. These events were developed to attract tourists who would hopefully contribute to the local economy.

⁷⁸¹ Evans, pp. 1-26.

⁷⁸² Lyautey was put in charge of the colonial Exhibition in 1927, Evans, p. 16.

⁷⁸³ Evans, p. 1 and p. 16. Evans, p. 17: (...) culminating with a majestic reconstruction of the Cambodian temple of Angkor Wat. Indeed this became such a popular attraction that entry to it was restricted to the weekends.

⁷⁸⁴ *Pendet* is a welcoming dance in which young girls present offerings.

⁷⁸⁵ Rhodius and Darling, p. 61.

⁷⁸⁶ For more information on the colonial practice of the Dutch in Indonesia, see Frances Gouda, *Dutch Culture Overseas: Colonial Practice in the Netherlands Indies 1900-1942* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University, 1995).

For the Balinese, the dances are only performed as part of ritual ceremonies. The hybrid dances embodied the intersection of the colonised's and the coloniser's experience, the 'in-between' that Homi Bhabha identified as postcolonial space.⁷⁸⁷ This hybrid is one of colonialism's unintended consequences. It is the product of cross-breeding between the metropolitan and the colonial, 'civilisation' and 'savagery', 'white' and 'coloured'.

The hybridity is, however, not just the product of postcolonial migrations and diasporas. It cannot be separated from the colonial contact and is, in fact, the result of colonialism's institutions and systems. Moreover, this contact with the global world was made possible because of this 'Tour of the World in One Day',⁷⁸⁸ where people, material culture, industries, manufactured goods, raw materials, and arts of global empires were displayed.⁷⁸⁹ This international exhibition conveyed an image of peaceful, economically progressing societies whose diverse peoples were grateful to be living under benevolent tutelage.

In presenting this hybrid, there was a strict social and cultural hierarchy between members of the dominant and members of the subject races. The presence of the Dutch pavilion, for example, emphasised the 'exoticism' of Bali. And what most surprised the non-European visitors to the exhibition was the realism of the artificial.⁷⁹⁰ The dichotomy is made visible and legible and this Exhibition is intended to provide a rationale for Dutch colonization. The exotic dancers served as models for those who supposedly needed civilising by way of colonisation. They create a distance between the colonised and the coloniser. This

⁷⁸⁷ Homi K. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 1-18.

⁷⁸⁸ This Exposition was publicized as *Le Tour du Monde en Un Jour*, Morton, p. 3.

⁷⁸⁹ The British Empire had staged its own exhibition a few years earlier.

⁷⁹⁰ For information on colonialism in South East Asia, see Nicholas Tarling, *Imperialism in South East Asia: A Fleeting Passing Phase* (London: Routledge, 2001), p. 272.

dichotomy appears in the catalogue texts for the same purpose, that is, to show the difference between 'us' and 'them.' As Fabian points out:

the root metaphor of knowledge remains that of a difference, and a distance, between thing and image, reality and representation. Inevitably, this establishes and reinforces models of cognition stressing difference and distance between a beholder and an object.⁷⁹¹

In order to discover what constitutes the difference, it is essential to talk about printed media.

5. 2. Printed Media

As discussed previously, there were books, circulars, pamphlets, and catalogues that were published in conjunction with the Paris exhibition.⁷⁹² What attracted these viewers/visitors to the exhibition and to Bali was certainly the stamp of authenticity. This realism of the artificial in the exhibition was no different from the artificiality of the realism of photographs in the earlier era:

But by the 1880s and 1890s the era of the new portable cameras made photography unavoidable, and further technical advances have made it ubiquitous: the omnipresence of photographs in publications of all kinds, its use as a sophisticated vehicle for information accepted as authentic, the nearly universal practice of photography as a hobby and in casual haphazard manner by the general public, ordinary people with no particular training.⁷⁹³

Most of the authors in this study claim the authenticity of their work by blurring, concealing, and even dismissing the origin of their informants or publication sources. The distinction between authentic and imaginative accounts, to many writers, is essential.

⁷⁹¹ Fabian, 1983, p. 160.

⁷⁹² Walter Spies helped arrange the displays of Bali section (Vickers, 1996, p. 108). His film on Bali, *Goon-Goon* was also released to coincide with the exhibition.

⁷⁹³ Vaizey, p. 8.

Upon returning to their own countries, many of the visitors continued to express what they saw in the foreign land, either verbally or textually. Many use previous pictorial images as a reference text to support their experience.

Sometimes these images are used as a source of ethnographic data and sometimes they are cited as an authority – as authentic. The images that they produce do not only reveal the Other's culture, but also their own.

The reproductions of photographs and the republications of the books help maintain the circulation of the image. The use of the earlier photographs is not only confined to the authors alone. Publishers took part in popularising certain images. In the cover page of the 1982 edition, for example, the publisher wrote: '*A Tale from Bali* is not a historical novel in the strict sense but more a free rendering of actual events seen from the Balinese point of view'. This cover blurb emphasises that it is also a 'remarkably vivid portrayal of the character of the Balinese, their customs and way of life; and for this reason alone, *A Tale from Bali* deserves to be put in print again'. While the tale itself had become a thing of the past, the publisher gave the impression that the 'tradition,' such as the customs and the way of life, continues.

This tradition had many origins, from biblical stories, ancient mythologies, and oriental texts to more recent ethnographic writings or sciences. The reproduction of earlier images may sometimes help circulate the same idea or concept of the Other and at the same time reinforce the claim to authenticity. The front cover of Baum's 1973 edition was taken from Covarrubias' *The Island of Bali* and the 1989 and 2000 covers of *A Tale from Bali* are reproductions of a contemporary illustration from the French newspaper, *Le Petit Journal*. Although

the painting shows how the painter visualises the incident, the book itself is not entirely about the *puputan*.

When the travellers/scholars embarked on their journeys, the writers discussed in this study also took with them their pre-formed imaginary Orient. Thus, their works were constituted by, and in, the real and imagined Orient; they fall between fiction and scholarly writings. The works of these writers who travelled to Bali in the 1900s were the result of actual experience and depicted journeys which had actually taken place. However, the motivations and circumstances of their travels could hardly have been more dissimilar from their predecessors. The element of subjectivity was there. Each traveller, especially within the less scholarly texts, depended on each other's testimony in forging their narratives so that there was a balance between 'truth' and 'lie'. In addition, writers and publishers alike reproduced certain images – verbal and pictorial – not only to prove their having travelled but also to excite travel.

5. 3. Repetition of Motifs and of Captions

Museum is an ideal place for research on colonial photographs. It has been used to display the museum's photographic collections. Those old photographs may reveal how certain themes recur over and over and how people's conceptions of the Other come into being. Before discussing an exhibition or a museum display, it is important at this point to discuss the repetition of motifs and captions.

As mentioned earlier, some poses that are used frequently in the paintings are typical of early photographs. The following discussion revealed how similar poses are used repeatedly. In Alloula's findings on the Algerian postcards, she

reveals how the sitters were having a ‘hasty pose.’⁷⁹⁴ By this she means that it is ‘embellished with breasts that are raised by uplifted arms’.⁷⁹⁵ A similar pose is also used by Krause when photographing the Balinese women. One does not have to be a doctor to see this logic, but perhaps this explains why there are many unclothed models, like the Odalisques, posed with their hands lifted. This very image is also depicted textually in a novel by Baum:

Women came from field a market carrying baskets or sheaves of rice or towers of coco-nuts (sic) or great pyramids of *earthenware vessels* on their heads. The habit of carrying loads on their heads gave them an erect carriage and a rhythmic step, and their breasts and shoulders were at once soft and muscular.⁷⁹⁶ (My italics.)

Although Baum herself does her ‘fieldwork’ in Bali and has other Asian experiences behind her prior to her Bali trip, she admits that she has seen a collection of photographs – a reference to Krause’s photographs.⁷⁹⁷ Baum and Krause speak and write in the same language in this respect at least.

Baum’s ‘earthenware vessels’ are also depicted by Weissenborn’s camera, showing two women along a roadside. One of the women carries a vessel on her head, again with an uplifted hand pose. The second woman half timidly ‘exposes’ her breasts. When Weissenborn’s photographic image appears in *Vastgelegd voor Later Indische Foto’s (1917-1942) van Thilly Weissenborn*, it is captioned *Balinese danseressen* [Balinese Dancers]. The same caption is used to accompany two other single figure photographs of female dancers and a young girl with an offering. When Vickers uses this photograph in *Towards Independence*, his accompanying text reads ‘Balinese woman carrying water’. The presence of this

⁷⁹⁴ Alloula, p. 98.

⁷⁹⁵ *ibid.*

⁷⁹⁶ Baum, c. 1983, p. 262.

⁷⁹⁷ *ibid.*, p. vii.

traditional water jug is nonetheless to authenticate the otherness of the subject and to contrast the ‘we – they’ notions. And, in case we forget, this motif has been used by the anthropological photographers. Accordingly, the photographers, anthropologists and the image users – the people who use, recycle and publish the image for different purposes – include and enumerate the photographs and caption them with something ‘native.’

As for the curators and the photographers within the exhibition, they use words or place those artefacts or objects according to their own eyes and terms. Krause, for example, describes *kris* as a wavy-bladed dagger.⁷⁹⁸ This enumeration of exotic curios serves as a ‘rhetorical strategy to underline the authenticity of the traveller/narrator.’⁷⁹⁹ Within the context of the colonial exhibition, the naming of the objects and the display indicates ownership. Other acts of possession include collecting and hunting, which, according to E. Janet Browne, are ‘different expressions of a single urge for possession.’⁸⁰⁰

Given the fact that most photographers at that time were men, Weissenborn cannot avoid following their style. During Weissenborn’s time, it was usually the name of the studio that appeared as the signature of the photographs, not that of the photographers. Two of Weissenborn’s photographs published in *Vastgelegd Voor Later* show bare-breasted women. As mentioned before, when Drissen later republished one of those images, he captioned it with *Een Balinese Schone*⁸⁰¹ (A Balinese Beauty). Is beauty universal? These words are also used to describe the beauty of other young girls in different parts of the

⁷⁹⁸ Krause, p. 25.

⁷⁹⁹ Ghose, 1999, p. 43.

⁸⁰⁰ E. Janet Browne, *Charles Darwin: Voyaging* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University, 1995), p. 220.

⁸⁰¹ Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 58.

world. Whether or not the image-makers are men or women, artistic works – in a way similar to the literary works discussed in the previous chapters – more often than not reflect and reinforce patriarchal stereotypes of women. The fact that these women and many other women from India or Algeria indeed carry heavy burdens seems to be forgotten; they are just exploited because of their beauty. Men are hardly ever depicted carrying water; in the case of Bali, they are often pictured/described with their precious cock, ready for gambling (cockfighting).

Weissenborn is not alone in expressing her understanding of the beauty and the beast, the noble and the peasant, the blouse-less and the fully dressed. In one case, as a woman herself, she tries to conform to the male dominated domain of photography by producing typical naked breast images. Weissenborn is not immune to sexual, to say nothing of racial, stereotypes, for she uses the pose of the water carrier theme, a type known in numerous variants (women with earthenware vessels or women water carriers). The phrase ‘Een Balinese schone’ is used by Drissen, the user of Weissenborn’s photographs (Fig. 1) to verbalise his understanding of the Balinese beauty. However, it is not clear whether the caption *Balinese danseressen* attached to Fig. 1 is the result of the image user’s misunderstanding of Balinese dancers or of his intention to capitalise on the popularity of Weissenborn’s other famous photographs. Different image makers use already known words or motifs for different purposes and this helps to circulate the existing images.

Yates ‘bronze figures’ are also captured by Krause’s camera. The following statue-like photographs (Figs. 10 a, b) are good examples. They show the subjects in poses borrowed from classical statuary. Given the fact that late 19th

century and early 20th century photographs are almost entirely in black and white. the female bathers emulate the images of Hellenic sculptures, which emphasises their ‘bronzeness’. It is worth investigating whether the making of these photographs in 1912 may have coincided with the presentation of the Little Mermaid, a symbol of Denmark, in 23 August 1913. The statue was commissioned by the Dane Carl Jacobsen (the founder of Carlsberg) in 1909 after having been overwhelmed by a ballet performance of *The Little Mermaid* – the stage version of the Hans Christian Anderson fairy tale published in 1837. It was sculpted by Edward Eriksen (1876-1959). The Little Mermaid’s head, as Jacobsen requested, was modelled after the leading dancer Ellen Price. Since Price refused to pose naked, the sculptor used as a model the breasts of his own wife, Eline, who was also a ballet dancer, as well as a model. The mermaid has been vandalised at least eight times in ninety years, from painting her with bra and knickers (1 September 1961) and decapitating her head (24 April 1964 and 6 January 1998) and her arm (22 July 1984), to attempting to remove her from the stone and pushing her into the water on 11 September 2003.

Artists and photographers alike do imitate each other. The images, literary or scientific, have almost always existed before. A portrait of a girl feeding rice to her baby brother represents Krause’s favourite ‘human interest’ subject (Fig. 11). *The Koninklijk Institute voor de Tropen*, or Royal Tropical Institute in Amsterdam, which retains the rights to this photograph, wanted to enliven the exhibition by using one of Krause’s Bali photographs. The Institute hired a sculptor to ‘copy’ the photographs of a Balinese girl who was feeding her little

bother. A sculpture was created based on this photograph. The sculpture appears to have been based on Krause's photograph.⁸⁰²

Krause's series of photographs illustrating native bathing and statue-like figures reflect, unmistakably, his 'directorial' approach and are supplemented by his prior knowledge. It would be interesting to know, for example, if he was aware of the images in *The Brook* and *The Source* that Annie W. Brigman made in 1909, as well as of Ingres' painting *La Source* (1820-56). Whether or not he is aware of this, there have been a lot of repetitions in pose and title, either from painting to photograph or from photograph to painting.⁸⁰³ The emergence of photography allowed for the reproduction of paintings as mass products. In 1861, Ingres had his paintings photographed and sold.⁸⁰⁴ This is resulted in the practise of painting through photography, which Aaron Scharf later called 'photographic painting'.⁸⁰⁵ This reaffirms that photographers and artists, painters and sculptures alike, adopt the same conventions: they imitate each other and claim their 'authenticities', which again leads to the question of 'authorship' and ownership (to be discussed in the next section).

5. 4. Catalogue Texts

We have seen that within a single photograph, repetition of motifs is sometimes followed by repetition of words. Those who were at the 1931 exhibition are likely to have arrived with some background knowledge of Bali. They brought their past

⁸⁰² Ever since photography was invented, it has served as a handmaiden to art. In the past, studies of drapery arts were done by studying the photographs of sculptures of cathedrals. See Scharf. p. 99.

⁸⁰³ For more information on the influence of painting on photography, see Scharf, p. 13.

⁸⁰⁴ Scharf, p. 162.

⁸⁰⁵ *ibid.*, p. 242.

experiences with them. During the exhibition, the visitors' mind was sharpened and controlled by the texts' surroundings. Although some of the 'displays' were live performances and presented at visually, some objects in the exhibitions were collections from museums. If they happened to have a copy of the catalogues or pamphlets related to displays, visitors could recall their experience, discuss it, and view the images or read the texts over and over. Once the exhibition is over there will be more exhibitions and more publications in the future. People still continue to go to exhibitions and museums and we see how written language influences or rather controls their interpretation of museum objects such as photographs. The words used in museums most probably create an approach to the past, and an attitude to the present: the choice of a theme for an exhibition, and the nature of the language used to present it, for example, create and display a particular interpretation of experience. According to Alan Radley, people's recollections of visiting museums are constructed out of their experiences, and their grasp of museum objects relates to their grasp of a past, the memories of which are culturally formed.⁸⁰⁶ The onlooker's encounter with colonial photography is more or less similar.

How one understands a photograph depends more or less on where the photograph is located. 'Intentionally', or perhaps, 'accidentally', a photograph is occasionally situated in certain media, be it books, newspapers, magazines, pamphlets, or albums, and in certain places, such as galleries, museums, or exhibitions. This is what Terry Barret called 'external contexts'. He asserts that they are forms of interpretation in which things are presented in their immediate

⁸⁰⁶ Alan Radley, 'Boredom, Fascination and Mortality: Reflections upon the Experience of Museum Visiting', in *Museum Languages: Objects and Texts*, ed. by Gaynor Kavanagh (Leicester: Leicester University, 1991), pp. 63-82, p. 37.

environment. As interpretations, they ought to be evaluated for their 'accuracy, fairness, reasonableness, and for their consequences'.⁸⁰⁷

From the moment of its creation the photograph will mean something. It reflects the intention of either amateur or professional creators. In other words, photographers always have an original audience in mind. They use their photographs for either professional interest, or for private pleasure, or both. However, once these photographs are reproduced and placed in different locations, the meaning becomes stratified beneath other meanings attributed to the image, as can be seen in the meanings of paintings discussed previously. In other words, any secondary users of this image, either scholars or writers, intentionally select certain photographs to serve their purposes. In this way, the photographs may have different meanings from the photographer's intention. This section will focus on how meaning is created or constructed. It will analyse the reproduction of photographic images in the catalogues.

Taken in 1938 by J.C. Mol (1891-1945)⁸⁰⁸, a scientific photographer and filmmaker, this photo was displayed in June 1941, during the exhibition *Het Daghet in den Oosten*⁸⁰⁹, in the Koloniaal Instituut (now the Royal Institute for the Tropics) Amsterdam (Fig. 12). The length, the reception and the audience of this exhibition are not fully investigated, nor are the rest of the photographs exhibited. As one of the photographs on sale in the exhibition, however, Mol's photograph sold well. This is articulated in the text accompanying the photo:

'This photograph helped to make the exhibition of photography from the Indies a

⁸⁰⁷ Barret, p. 94.

⁸⁰⁸ Mol (1891-1954) is the director of Multifilm Ltd. in Haarlem (with a branch in Batavia) and makes a large number of photographs on Java and Bali for the Rotterdam Lloyds office in 1938.

⁸⁰⁹ A title of a hymn begins with these words which means 'The day breaks in the East'.

success'.⁸¹⁰ This reveals that the bare-breast image not only remained 'static' but also had economic value. It strengthened Dutch Romanticism⁸¹¹ and helped in the circulation of earlier or existing images. This is the image that is known to the world: that of the Balinese slave as the most beautiful. I will discuss this photograph in more detail later.

Held in the Museum of Ethnology at Rotterdam from 4 March to 28 May 1989, another exhibition, *Toekang Potret: 100 Jaar fotografie in Netherlands Indie: 1839-1939*, used this image. The textual information bears the following words: 'Photograph of Bali shown at the Indonesian Photography Exhibition in the Colonial Institute in Amsterdam in 1941'.⁸¹² In the old Indonesian spelling (influenced by the Dutch), the vowel 'u' is used instead of 'oe'. Even the words *tukang potret* (photographer) are not used today; we use *tukang foto* or *fotografer* instead. From the Dutch perspective, the vowel 'oe' in 'Toekang Potret' has entered the modern text. However, the words 'Netherlands Indie' are undoubtedly reminiscent of the Dutch Golden Age and Dutch attitudes towards their former colony.

In addition, as a reminder of the Dutch Golden Age – whether consciously or unconsciously – it becomes a reminder too of all of the 'good deeds' performed by the Dutch in Indonesia. One realises how apt the use of the old spelling *toekang* was, since, as Susan Sontag notes, 'photographs actively promote nostalgia. Photography is an elegiac art, a twilight art. ...All photographs are

⁸¹⁰ Groeneveld, p. 160.

⁸¹¹ There is a consensus that there is no such a thing as Romanticism in Netherlands, however, the Kunsthall Rotterdam has proof otherwise. The first major exhibition of the Dutch Romantic was held at the Kunsthall Rotterdam from 8 October 2005 to 8 January 2006. 'Masters of the Romantic Period: Dutch Painting 1800-1850.' Electronic. Available:

<http://www.kunsthall.nl/archief%20uk/2005/Dutch%20Romanticism.html>. 11 December 2006.

⁸¹² Groeneveld, p. 160.

memento mori.⁸¹³ The publication of this bilingual (Dutch and English) *Toekang Potret*, was certainly intended to reach a wider audience, though that does not necessarily mean Indonesians.

Geographical location and the timing of the exhibition are yet another important element in shaping the meaning of photographs. The motives given for the 1941 and the 1989 exhibitions are apparently different. The first is still within the context of Dutch domination and propaganda while the latter is not. The pre-independence one was designed possibly to establish the Dutch colonial scientific and artistic supremacy among other major European nations⁸¹⁴; to encourage trade, tourism and immigration, and a mandatory exercise for countries aspiring to become world powers⁸¹⁵; as an important medium for the validation of the colonial presence in Indonesia⁸¹⁶; to take inventory of their possessions in the Dutch Indies⁸¹⁷; and to demonstrate their superiority over their colony. The act of exhibiting as if creating a shop display, an exhibition and a collection, derives from the desire of imperialism.⁸¹⁸

Unlike the first international photography salon held in Batavia, now Jakarta, in 1923, or the second one in Bandung in 1925, whose aims were to promote the development of photography and 'to show current state of the art of making images with light both in the Dutch Indies as well as in the Netherlands and other countries'⁸¹⁹, the 1989 exhibition is perhaps just a mere occasional cultural event. Another post-independence exhibition was organised by The

⁸¹³ Susan Sontag, *On Photography* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1978), p. 15.

⁸¹⁴ John E. Findling, *Historical Dictionary of World's Fairs and Expositions 1815-1988* (New York City: Greenwood Press, 1990), pp. 16-7.

⁸¹⁵ Maxwell, p. 4.

⁸¹⁶ Crystal, p. 19.

⁸¹⁷ Soerjoatmodjo, p. 117.

⁸¹⁸ Timothy Mitchell, *Colonising Egypt* (Berkeley: University of California, 1991), p. 18.

⁸¹⁹ Groeneveld, p. 163.

Friends of Photography from 25 September to 1 December 1991 and presented at the Ansel Adams Center, a privately funded, member-supported organisation in San Francisco (Founded in 1967 in Carmel, California). A book, *Toward Independence: A century of Indonesia Photographed*⁸²⁰, was published in conjunction with the exhibition. All the photographs in *Toekang Potret* (1839-1939) and *Toward Independence* (as early as the 1840s – 1945)⁸²¹ reflect a one hundred year time span. Bearing in mind the nature of the sponsors and authors of the exhibition and the book, clearly each has its own representational aims.

The many prints of photographs, the publication of books in conjunction with the exhibitions, the selections of the photographs – all have different agendas as well. Two different exhibitions, viewed from both the Indonesian's and the Dutch's perspective, were perhaps meant to bridge the gap. To mark the anniversary of VOC, *The Dutch Encounter with Asia, 1600-1950* and the *Indonesia's Encounter with the Netherlands* exhibitions were held from 10 October 2002 – 9 February 2003 in Rijksmuseum Amsterdam.

In Chapter 2, we discussed the situation of the photographer as author, in which the photographer takes and produces some photographs to illustrate a book. In those instances, both the author and the 'illustrator' work together. In publishing colonial photographs for an exhibition, for example, the text writers become both the author and illustrator. Although they do not originally produce the image, they can be called the image makers whose words attempt to control

⁸²⁰ Jane Levy Reed, *Towards Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed* (San Francisco: Friends of Photography, 1991). Published in conjunction with an exhibition organised by the Friends of Photography and presented at the Ansel Adams Center in San Francisco, September 25-December 1, 1991. VOC period 1609-1799. First Dutch Period (1800 – 1811). British Period (1811 – 1816). Second Dutch Period (1816 – 1942). Japanese Occupation (1942-1945). Republic of Indonesia (1945 – now).

⁸²¹ It was only in 27 December 1949 that the Dutch formally transferred sovereignty to 'Republik Indonesia Serikat' (Republic of United States of Indonesia).

the audience and are controlled by their institution. In terms of ownership, it is possible that the photographs formally belong to the museum, either temporarily or permanently. However, the words, the interpretations of the colonial photographs belong to the text writers – it is their ownership. They secure all rights to the written texts. This leads on to the examination of printed materials, authors and their ‘commissioners.’

As with the case of ‘authenticity’ and authorship of photographs based on paintings and vice versa, similar characteristics with regards to the circulation, reproduction and captioning of these cultural products are evident. At this point, it is necessary to talk of an ‘author-function’. For Michel Foucault, the author-function is characterised by the mode of existence, circulation, and functioning of certain discourses within a society. His argument is that:

Once a system of ownership for texts came into being, once strict rules concerning author’s rights, author-publisher relations, rights of reproduction and related matters were enacted – at the end of the eighteenth and the beginning of the nineteenth century – the possibility of transgression attached to the act of writing took on, more and more, the form of an imperative peculiar to literature.⁸²²

Foucault mentions two realms of discourse, namely fiction and science. For him, the first is constituted by history, biography, philosophy and poetry and the latter includes private letters, legal contracts and political broadsides. He thus distinguishes between ‘authors’ and ‘writers,’ whom he calls founders of discursivity, and producers. Barthes, however, makes a distinction between ‘text’, written by a ‘writer’, and ‘work’ which is produced by an ‘author’.⁸²³

⁸²² Michel Foucault, ‘What is an author’ in Josué V. Harari (ed.) *Textual Strategies: Perspective in Post-structuralist Critics* (Ithaca: Cornell University, 1979), pp. 141-60, p. 148.

⁸²³ Geertz, 1988, p. 18.

Similar to Barrett's aforementioned idea of the meaning of an image, Victor Burgin argues that texts have a great impact when it comes to understanding images:

We rarely see a photograph in use which is not accompanied by writing: in newspapers the image is in most cases subordinate to the text; in advertising and illustrated magazines there tends to be a more or less equal distribution of text and images; in art and amateur photography the image predominates, though a caption or title is generally added. But the influence of language goes beyond the fact of the physical presence of writing as a deliberate addition to the image.⁸²⁴

In the case of photographers and the suggested textual information, if they have one, perhaps a distinction should be made, using Barthes' classification, between 'titles', which the photographers author, and 'captions', which the writers/editors/curators produce. Burgin proposes that the visual image of this 'documentation' is much influenced by its verbal text. Whether or not the verbal texts are written by the photographer or the text writer, verbal texts show and make people select the interpretation that is closest to what is written. If people see an image and they can make meaning from that image, normally they do not bother to read the texts. In short, the captions help the onlookers to make at least one single 'true' interpretation.

Talking about colonial photographs, Edwards however insists that, '[t]he relationship between the visual and textual documentation is seen to be a complementary nature rather than a matter of primacy of one over the other'.⁸²⁵ It seems that Edwards believes that both visual and textual documentation are equally important. However, judging by the Dutch colonial context, when those

⁸²⁴ Victor Burgin (ed.), 'Photography, Phantasy, Function,' *Thinking Photography*, ed. by Victor Burgin, (London: The Macmillan Press, 1982), pp. 177-216, p. 192.

⁸²⁵ Edwards, 1992, p. 36.

colonial photographs – and the colony – still belong to the coloniser, greater weight will be given to words.

Discussing the Dutch colonial context, Groeneveld suggests that the majority of commissioned photographers in those years only gave one side of the ‘reality’. She further argues that ‘[c]ommissioned photographs facilitated identification with those depicted, commercial photographs created distance and emphasised difference’.⁸²⁶ Just as it is between amateur and professional photographers, the border between commissioned and commercial photographers is likewise vague. It could also be argued in this respect that during the colonial period some photographs are taken anonymously and many use the name of the studios, rather than the photographers. Even if the negatives of the films belong to the same cameras or individuals, it does not guarantee that the photos were taken by the owners of the cameras. In taking photographs for their book (*Dance and Drama in Bali*), de Zoete and Spies sometimes used each other’s cameras. What is being discussed here is that due to advanced technology and documentation at that time, it is sometimes difficult to be certain who took the photographs and whether or not the images are ‘authentic.’

Before analysing the captioning, it is necessary to discuss how meaning is first created. The live performances that the European public saw have inescapably been supplemented from elsewhere by images and ideas encountered before in, for example, photographs, novels and paintings. All those present images intermingle in the visitors’ memories, associations, and experiences. In other words, with or without captions, consciously or unconsciously, learned or

⁸²⁶ Groeneveld, p. 145.

acquired, images usually exist somewhere before. While the image itself has its own meaning, the texts that accompany it add a new meaning. Thus, meaning is always changing depending on location, learned behaviour, the absent image that the exhibition goers bring with them and what a photograph means to a viewer. This brings us to the examination of meanings, interpretations and captions.

5. 5. Image Circulation

Compared to the 1941 exhibition, where exhibition goers were invited to buy a 'Photograph of Bali,' the 'readers' of the 1989 exhibition or *Toekang Potret* who are unable to possess this photograph can at least return to the book, or catalogue, and enjoy these voyeuristic photographs (Fig. 12). Leaning against what looks like an entrance to a Balinese house, the picture shows a young girl wearing a *sarong*, covering her body from the hip down. In this photograph, taken from the inside of the house, Mol makes use of the light to emphasise the curve of the upper half of her body. 'Accidentally' the background is arranged in such a way that it looks like a Dutch windmill. In the first exhibition, the girl, just like the 'prostitute photographs' discussed previously, represents a saleable commodity.

In the catalogue of the 1989 exhibition, what is written underneath this image is *Erfpoort van laagste kast op Bali* (The doorway of the low caste of Bali). In the previous chapter, I discussed how a 'door' symbolises the sexual organs in Bali. The composition picture is another example of how a girl by an 'entrance' seems to be a conventional setting. By placing a caption underneath the image, the onlookers gaze is directed to caste. Here the girl is identified by her caste simply by adding some textual information. In other words, meaning is so strongly

controlled by a caption. How this language works is also discussed by Hooper-Green who insists that 'language works to construct and delimit ideas, concepts and mental images'.⁸²⁷ It should be pointed out that this text was written for the colonial photographs many years ago and would undoubtedly be handled differently now, but that does not change the fact that the pose along with the repetition of its motif is still currently there for all visitors to see. Whether or not this particular photograph was originally intended for exhibitions, Leask rightly noted that:

Museums, and to a greater extent popular exhibitions, shared with travel narratives the aspiration to make distant lands present; given that 'spatial and temporal distance are forms of absence, for which the presentness of the artifact [or narrative] itself must compensate.'⁸²⁸

While it is difficult to disagree with Leask, this 'presentness' that Leask considers does sometimes keep the old or absent images new and alive. In order to investigate the presentness of these curios, it is important to discuss the earlier images (the images before 1930).

The first photograph was taken by Krause in around 1912-1913 (Fig. 13). In the Exhibition of Balinese Art at the Amsterdam artists' society *Arti et Amicitiae* in 1917, Krause, together with W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp, introduced Bali to the European world, which had hitherto imagined Bali only in relation to its

⁸²⁷ Eilean Hooper-Greenhill, *Museums and their Visitors* (London: Routledge, 1994), p. 122.

⁸²⁸ Leask, 2002, p. 30.

portrayal by the novelists Louis Couperus and Multatuli.⁸²⁹ Soon after this exhibition, however, arrangement was made for the publication of Krause's book *Bali 1912*. In addition to Krause's photographs, there was a large selection of drawings and etchings by the travelling artist W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp (1874-1950), and an exhibition of numerous Balinese utensils, textiles, sculptures and artefacts. There is no information regarding the caption added to this image in the 1989 exhibition. This 8,0 x 8,0 cm photo now features in the collection of the *Museum Voor Volkenkunde*, Rotterdam. It is also the cover of *Bali 1912* (2001 – Fig. 13).

Krause insisted that he took the photographs without any intention of giving a complete description of Bali.⁸³⁰ Although it is easy to believe that he took the images without a book in mind, Krause does have German spectators in mind. This two-volume book was first published in German in 1920, displaying some four hundred pictures. If readers do not understand German, or lack of information, for example, they surely 'understand' the landscapes, naked bodies, rituals, and rulers that are recorded by Krause. The album was translated into various languages, including English and French; thus it could cater for wider audiences. The second edition was published in 1922, but in only one volume. It was written with the assistance of Karl With, an expert on the island.

⁸²⁹ Pijbes, 'The Artists of the Tropics: The Artists of the Future' *IIAS Newsletter* Online. No. 20. Asian Art. 'Doing it in Style by Louis Couperus, pp. 13-24. Couperus (1863-1923) is best known for his novel *De Stille Kracht*, the title of which is usually translated into English as 'The Hidden Force' or 'The Secret Force', a lurid tale of magic and heated passions in the tropical setting of Java. For this and a number of other works, the *fin de siècle* novelist is regarded as one of the best writers in Dutch, his name being mentioned along with that of Multatuli, the author of *Max Havelaar* (which is also set in the Indies). Couperus came from a well-known Indische family, that is, a Dutch family who thought of themselves as belonging more to the Indies than to the Netherlands. His family had been in Malacca and Java at least since the 18th century; his great-grandmother was Malay.

⁸³⁰ Mabbett, p. 7.

More than sixty years later, the book was translated by W.H. Mabbett as *Bali 1912: Photographs and Reports by Gregor Krause*.⁸³¹ From the title it is clear that the photographs and the reports were Krause's. However, due to some technical problems in reproducing the photographs from the first edition and a change of ownerships, Mabbett, the translator and the reproducer of Krause's *Bali*, excluded some images. However, he included more photographs taken by Krause that had never been published before.⁸³² The translator included some photographs from Mrs Sioe Kie Kroes-Lie's private collections, which were not in the first nor second edition. Kroes-Lie was one of Krause's two adopted daughters. The reproductions were then taken from the glass positives kept in the Museum voor Volkenkunde Rotterdam. In short, translation does involve a lot of parties and some technical issues.

If, as we have seen in Covarrubias' *Island of Bali*, the front cover of a book had a selling point, does the back cover? The following quotation is taken from the cover blurb of *Bali 1912*:

This new selection of Gregor Krause's best work, including many prints made from his original glass slides, offers a unique view of traditional Bali and proves once again that good black-and-white photography can easily hold its own against today's glossiest work in colour. *Bali 1912* deserves a proud place in the libraries of all who love that fascinating island.⁸³³

Mabbett, the translator of Krause's *Bali*, is a good example. His eight-page introduction and the new selection of photographs⁸³⁴ gives Krause's book an original look. Krause is the first user of those newly selected photos, as well as the

⁸³¹ Because of his use of new prints that were not included in the first and second editions, Mabbett, unless otherwise stated, will be referred to as the author or the photograph provider.

⁸³² Mabbett, p. 13. These included a painting and some photographs of Krause, see p. 8 and pp. 10-13.

⁸³³ Cover blurb, Krause, 1988 and 2001.

⁸³⁴ Mabbett indicates the selections or reselections of Krause photographs. A certain code is used to identify the origin of Krause's photographs, see Mabbett, p. 4.

secondary user of Krause's photographs that were originally published in 1920s. The distinction between the image makers, the photographers, and the first users of the printed images should be made.

Unlike its first printed edition, which catered for a German audience, the latest edition is intended for more general readers, as is emphasized in the foreword to the translation of the second edition:

The success of this book which makes publication of a new edition needed 6-9 months after it was first published proves how powerfully these images address us. In order to make the second edition even more accessible to a wide audience of readers than the first one, and therefore, to keep the price down as much as possible, I have brought together the two volumes of the first edition into one. The texts have been incorporated unchanged and unabbreviated. However, those of the plates that were only of scholarly interest have been omitted so that the overall impression becomes even more consistent. Karl With – Cologne, December 1921.⁸³⁵

From the citation above, it is clear that in the 1988 and 2000 edition, some of the photographs that Karl With thought only of interest to scholars are omitted. The 1988 edition, as mentioned previously, includes certain images that are more attractive to general readers. Both of the selections of the photographs for the second and the 1988 edition are done without the photographer's presence. If the 1988 selection is due to Krause's death, the selection for the second edition was done by Karl With because Krause was in Borneo, as was stated in the foreword to the first edition:

In the absence of Dr. Krause who lives in Borneo, I have chosen the plates in such a way that no important life events were left undocumented and the entire span of life unfolds before our eyes in its entire width and corresponding sequence. The first volume contains the morphological-physical environment of this life, i.e. nature and landscape, the vegetation of untouched and cultivated soil, management, settlements, home, village and court life, trade and market and the people themselves. The second volume comprises the gamut of life in art, feasts, religious and cult

⁸³⁵ Krause and With, p. vii.

ceremonies under the title: dances, temple and ceremonies, containing: theatre and dance, processions and religious ceremonies, devotional offerings and cremation, architecture, sculpture and painting. Thus, though their art has to remain incomprehensible to us, these plates do not only unfold images of life an Asian people with their rich life cycles, but at the same time the unity of life in touching beauty, the realization of which is nearly lost to us.⁸³⁶

In the previous chapter, I discussed how image-makers produce and select certain images to appeal to popular taste and satisfy the artistic conventions of the era.

Writing in 1988, using a textual and visual report for an audience of the early 1900s, Mabbett includes additional images to those in the 'original' report.

Although Mabbett marks clearly which images are which and whose collections they are in now, not all modern readers have access to the original.

Most of the photographs in this edition, it is claimed, 'have never appeared anywhere else before'. Some of these photos, in fact, belong to private as well as public collectors: from a family collection – Kroes-Lie, one of Krause's two adopted daughters – and from the Museum Voor Volkenkunde Rotterdam, which collects this 'salvage ethnography'.⁸³⁷ The idea of collecting ethnographic texts or documents reveals the desire of the coloniser to control the colony. The colonisers need to show their possessions in the form of shop displays, exhibition and collection.⁸³⁸ Walter Benjamin remarks that:

the phenomena of collecting lose its meaning as it loses its personal owner. Even though public collections may be less objectionable socially and more useful academically than private collections, the objects get their due only in the latter.⁸³⁹

Even though Krause's collection of photographs has become more accessible to wider public, this does not mean that the photographs lose their meaning. The

⁸³⁶ *ibid.*, p. vi.

⁸³⁷ Clifford, 1988, p. 113.

⁸³⁸ Mitchell, p. 18.

⁸³⁹ Benjamin, 1970, p. 67.

more accessible one's collection, the more 'truth' can be revealed about the collectors as well as the collections.

It is by accident that when Mabbett tries to find information for his other book, *In Praise of Kuta*, he eventually gets in touch with Krause's adopted daughter.⁸⁴⁰ Mabbett insists that his motive in republishing Krause's book is merely 'an interest in the man himself'.⁸⁴¹ Given which photographs were selected for use, one is led into at least to speculating about Mabbett's or the publisher's intention. At the back of this book, an aesthetic claim is made as one of the criteria selection.

This new selection of Gregor Krause's best work including many prints made from his original glass slides offers a unique view of traditional Bali and proves once again that good black-and-white photography can easily hold its own against today's glossiest work in colour.⁸⁴²

Although the Netherlands Indies no longer exists, she does not put an end to the encounter with Indonesia.

The 1988 edition, *Bali 1912*, comprises altogether fewer than 100 pictures published for the first time. This reduction of the earlier edition, according to Mabbett, is 'not so much to cut costs as to delete scenes which have become common place, to minimise repetition and to help produce a book more likely to retain interest throughout'.⁸⁴³ The assumption is that Bali images are somewhat different: 'changed.' Mabbett's decision to delete some photographs in the original *Bali 1912* is to 'minimise repetition.' Therefore, in the 1988 'popular' translation of *Bali 1912* which has an added sub title: *Photographs and Reports by*

⁸⁴⁰ Mabbett, p. 11. The writing of a book about Kuta leads Mabbett to meet Bob and Louis Koke who run Kuta Beach Hotel in Bali in 1936. Trace of the hotel's guest book gave Mabbett Krause address in Brastagi. There he learnt that Krause got two adopted daughters.

⁸⁴¹ Groeneveld, p. 10.

⁸⁴² Krause, 1988 (back cover).

⁸⁴³ Hugh Mabbett, Introduction to Krause's *Bali 1912*, 1988, p. 10.

Gregor Krause, Mabbett includes some works – photographs – that are produced by, using Barthes' classification, the author: Krause. It is really difficult to classify Mabbett as either a translator, a writer or an editor, for by using Krause's reports Mabbett includes some photographs, taken by Krause, that were not published in the previous editions. The selection of these 'new' and accidentally found photographs was done not by Mabbett but by Miss Chua Ban Har, whom Mabbett described as 'one of the Singapore's most talented book designers'.⁸⁴⁴

It could be argued that Mabbett's decision to add and to delete particular images is not so much to keep the book in circulation, as he consciously claims it to be, but rather is done to enliven the myth. In a sense, instead of minimising the appearance of the same images, he maximises the repetition of 'common scenes.'⁸⁴⁵ The 'new' images added to this first English translation are images such as that of the very intimate washing of a female private part (described as 'woman washing at pipe' in the 2001 edition). As I mentioned before, all of the photographs in this edition are marked with certain codes that distinguished whether they belong to the old edition, a private collection or a family album.

Whatever label we ascribe to Mabbett, he, as Tan Poay Lim has observed, is the 'owner' or publisher of the 1988 edition and subsequent versions. Mabbett lost his ownership as soon as he died in 1990. Lim is now the new owner, publisher and book designer of the 2001 edition. Even though the originator of this book (Krause) and the next owners or publishers (Mabbett) may lose their rights and cease to remember how Bali was back in 1912, the readers and the future owners of the book will remember those images of old Bali:

⁸⁴⁴ *ibid.*, p. 13.

⁸⁴⁵ *ibid.*, p. 10.

The original English edition of this book ceased publication soon after the death of its publisher Hugh Mabbett in 1990. This made available the opportunity to republish it to remind us of how Bali looked and felt in 1912.⁸⁴⁶

As a publisher, Lim, who visited Bali in 1971 for the first time, justified the images in the book as authentic of a particular time in Bali:

Many of the sights in Bali today will be new. The innocent unselfconsciousness may have disappeared. But many of the images captured in this book are still there to be found amidst the genuinely hospitable Balinese.⁸⁴⁷

It is clear that Lim believes that eyewitness accounts, words and images play an important role in attracting readers. It is not only the words of the originator of the book that are persuasive, but also the words of those such as Mabbett who produced the translation and the introduction: 'And Hugh Mabbett's introduction makes the publication all the more compelling to read.'⁸⁴⁸ Another strategy on the part of Lim to lure more readers is the re-arranging of the photographs. He certainly believes that not only do texts and images complement each other, but that positioning too is influential:

Apart from a fresh presentation of the materials at my disposal, I have left the book intact. But I wish to add my own thanks to Dr Krause's adopted daughter, Lay Song, for her blessing to reproduce the work. To Charles and Lydia, Hugh's heirs, for their consent to republish this English edition, I am very grateful.⁸⁴⁹

The second picture is the one in Figure 13.⁸⁵⁰ Medium shot, the model seems indifferent. Gazing at the audience she is posed next to a wooden pillar; her left hand barely touches it. She covers her nakedness with her other hand; with the help of back lighting, the curve of her upper part is revealed. The smallpox scar,

⁸⁴⁶ Tan Poay Lim, preface to *Bali 1912* (Singapore: Pepper Publications, 2001), p. 7.

⁸⁴⁷ *ibid.*

⁸⁴⁸ *ibid.*

⁸⁴⁹ *ibid.*

⁸⁵⁰ This photograph is selected as the cover of Krause's *Bali 1912* (2001).

her wooden earplugs through her distended lobes and her artistically arranged sarong create a sense of interplay between pleasure and frustration, as well as an image of 'savage beauty'. This method of viewing women reveals them as both dangerous and pleasurable. The uncorrected scar perhaps adds to the authenticity, whereas some other photographers may want to hide it for aesthetic reasons.

In *Toekang Potret*, however, this untitled picture is described as 'Unmarried young woman from Bali, her only disfigurement being the scars from smallpox vaccinations.' This caption is placed on the right side of the image. The narrative within the main text reads: 'A young woman lets a lock of hair hang down as a sign that she is not married'.⁸⁵¹ John Berger once said that 'Hair is associated with sexual power, with passion'.⁸⁵² Like the Odalisques and nude portraits, where hair is a metaphor for sexuality, here it also identifies the girl's marital status. With no personal name, in fact, the female figure is, again, represented as a general type – another way of saying 'a very available young woman'. In taking the images, Krause claims that he 'sought out neither the most beautiful nor the most ugly'.⁸⁵³ Krause's statement gives the impression that the pictures are 'true' to nature, perhaps to convince his viewers that such is 'how things are'.

Without any intention of reducing the 'authenticity' of Krause's written text, Mabbett, by attaching the same textual information to a new 'selection' of Krause's posthumously published photographs, nevertheless makes it clear that

Dr Krause's romantic and extravagant text has been handled less drastically; there has been some trimming in the interests of a more coherent complete volume, but it is difficult to cut a writer whose

⁸⁵¹ Krause, 1988, p. 55.

⁸⁵² Berger, p. 55.

⁸⁵³ Mabbett, p. 8.

enthusiasm for Bali overflows so engagingly and so often Bali and the Balinese made a huge impression on this young doctor and at times his descriptive writing slides off into language so extravagant that to edit it would be perverse.⁸⁵⁴

Here are some examples of Krause's extravagant language: 'Rising up apparently from the middle of the lake stands a mighty cone covered with a dark violet velvet dress of lava. It is bounded by beautiful lines swinging down in a concave descent, with giant openings from which snow-white steam rises in splendid peace';⁸⁵⁵ '...virgin forests lack the gloomy, impenetrable sultriness of forests in other tropical area which are so oppressive to human beings';⁸⁵⁶ 'The always powerful great chest muscle provides the most favourable foundation for beautifully formed breast ... Clothing cannot enhance this beauty but it has merit of not diminishing it'.⁸⁵⁷

Perhaps Mabbett is right in saying that Krause's photographs possessed 'a rare and special charm' because the people in them had not been posed, and often did not even know that they were being photographed.⁸⁵⁸ However, it is possibly that the failure is Mabbett's, not Krause's, for not editing, or for including, the 'posed' photographs such as this one. Since the latest publication (like the earlier ones) does not provide a definitive answer as regards the selection from the 4000 photos from the original edition, one can only question how, given the number of photographs subtracted (from the earlier publication) and added (from 'private' collections), not to mention Krause's suggestive language in describing the Balinese female body, this book manages to retain the 'authenticity' of Krause's

⁸⁵⁴ *ibid.*, p. 10.

⁸⁵⁵ Krause, 1988, p. 17.

⁸⁵⁶ *ibid.*, p. 19.

⁸⁵⁷ *ibid.*, p. 78.

⁸⁵⁸ Groeneveld, p. 9.

text. This again emphasises how photographs' 'original' meanings changed according to the subsequent users and locations.

Bathers are a common motif in European art. Images of naked Balinese women bathing are also a popular theme in literary and pictorial images of Bali. A photographer such as Krause is no exception and adopts the same conventions, taking pictures of several Balinese bathers. Unlike a studio photograph (Fig . 7) Krause's examples of washing are in open places and in 'natural' settings. But the image is quite typical and represents widely shared attitudes towards Oriental sensuality.

As discussed previously, there are certain mimetic or imitative relationships established between paintings/drawings and photographs, with or without alteration. The following is an example of a drawing by Alexander King who copied the image from a Krause photo. The similarities of the following images are striking. Looking at these two photographs (Figs. 14a, b) is like looking at a reflection in the mirror. Fig. 14a is one of the many 'artistic' drawings inserted in Hickman Powell's book *The Last Paradise* (1930) drawn by Alexander King. Fig. 14b is a photograph taken by Krause, which is now in the collection of the Museum voor Volkenkunde Rotterdam. (This image does not appear in the first edition of Krause's book.)

The Balinese divert the cool river water through conduits to richly decorated bathing pools that are segregated by sex.⁸⁵⁹ This is what the Indonesians called *pancuran*, which is normally an open space. In order to take a shower, one needs to stand right under the *pancuran*, as shown by the position of the women

⁸⁵⁹ See Hitchcock and Norris, plate no. 83 (n. p).

(See again Figs. 14a, b) and the little boy (See again Fig. 3). This *pancuran* is sometimes made of a piece of bamboo, which is normally used in other natural settings such as rivers/springs. It is important to note that there is a separation between the 'gents' and the 'ladies' – in Bali it is a taboo for someone to go into or even see the opposite sex in an open public bathing place.

In this sense, one cannot dismiss the possibility of reading Krause's photograph as constructed. First the *pancuran*: the black and white film means that one cannot tell whether it is a bamboo pipe or just a piece of wood. It is quite impossible for Krause to move the rock whose function is to frame his picture and to balance the model; it is probably easier for Krause to move the *bamboo*. One will notice that water never comes out of this pipe. Significantly Krause has positioned the stance and posture of the body in such a way that the camera's eye is fixed on the bosom. The model's closed eyes and the set of her mouth alone connotes sexuality. It calls attention to what the photographer conceals. She is no longer cold but warm living flesh. Her torso is arranged in the way it is to display it to the man looking at the photograph. It is made to appeal to male sexuality. On closer examination, this full-length figure is not shot from a low angle; and from the position of the bamboo, it must have been very difficult for the bather to wash her body. Compare it, for example, with a naked child photographed by Thilly Weissenborn (see again Fig. 3).⁸⁶⁰ The essential point here is that even if the photographs are taken in 'natural' settings, it is difficult to accept their authenticity.

⁸⁶⁰ Weissenborn and Drissen, p. 121.

To return to Krause's photograph: although there is no technical information on the exposure, lighting and so on, one is left wondering how much time is spent ensuring that the sun falls just on to the model's breasts, let alone recording the bather's quick way of bathing. It is unlikely that this picture is taken in early morning light.

If photography gives special evidence for its quality of 'authenticity,' does photography get closer to the 'truth' than does textual representation? For Barthes, 'Photography never lies: or rather, it can lie as to the meaning of the thing, being by nature *tendentious*, never as to its existence.'⁸⁶¹ Here, Krause bathers do exist, but Yates' writing may not lie. Therefore, in order to measure an image's 'validity', visual and textual images should be a cross-referenced.

This 'dropped like of a curtain' romantic image inspires many painters and photographers alike in their representations. Tantri, who had converted into a native herself, never took a bath the way the native does. The fact that she knew that '[t]he women carefully concealed themselves up to the waist before removing their sarongs, and the men never exposed themselves fully' may mean either that she relied on other people's testimony or that she violated the code by peeping into a male's bathing place.

5. 6. Museum/Colonial Photographs Language

Any objects (including photographs) in a museum collection need interpretation, because not all of them can speak for themselves. Visitors need to know the significance of each display. The words that are used by the text writers or the

⁸⁶¹ Barthes, p. 87.

curators are likely to have been influenced by museum policy and the writers/curators' personal 'world view.'⁸⁶² The words used in museums create approaches to the past, and attitudes to the present: the choice of a theme for an exhibition, and the nature of the language used to present it, for example, create and display a particular interpretation of experience.⁸⁶³ As in any themed exhibitions, the meaning of the displays of photographs in a permanent collection is also determined in non-verbal ways, such as the positions or locations of those photographs.

In the past, displays in colonial exhibitions and museums have focused on science or scholars. In order to survive, museums strive to widen their range of visitors. There is a change in the way the museums communicate with the audience. Therefore, to reach greater audiences, adjustments in the nature of the information provided – from the academic to the everyday – have been made. Museums in modern times use a more contextualized approach in displaying and labelling the museums' objects. In order to communicate with the visitors, the objects need words. This becomes more important if the museum wants to display its collection in a certain exhibition:

Although museums and galleries are fundamentally concerned with objects, these objects are always contextualised by words. Museums are in fact perhaps as much concerned with words as they are with objects, although in many ways, because of the focus on the material object, the words have become invisible. However, in the classifications used for documentation, in exhibition themes and in the ideas about the museum presented through publicity posters and leaflets, language is necessarily used.⁸⁶⁴

⁸⁶² Helen Coxall, 'How Language Means: an Alternative View of Museums Text, in *Museum Languages: Objects and Texts*, ed. by Gaynor Kavanagh (Leicester: Leicester University, 1991), pp. 83-99, p. 85.

⁸⁶³ Hooper-Greenhill, p. 115.

⁸⁶⁴ *ibid.*

Usually, those who work for museums, such as the curators, designers, or conservators, have been trained and are committed to a set of values. However, each museum has its own policy and the text writers' ideology can be easily identified from museum labels, signs and publications. Language is so powerful that it can control people by shaping thought, directing perception, and creating meaning for a particular view of the world. In short, whether the writers intend this or not, the world is grasped through language.⁸⁶⁵

Radley produced an analytical method for the analysis of the museum's intended messages and discovered how the sense of the past becomes an indicator for what is being displayed:

What is less tangible, I suspect, and what I shall have to make an effort to show, is how the original experiences were premised upon a different form of remembering, of sensing the past. In this case, boredom and fascination are not encapsulated experiences, so much as indicators of different ways of grasping mortality, of sensing what is absent from the display.⁸⁶⁶

In a similar manner to visitors to Bali, museum goers, upon entering a museum, bring with them their pre-conceptions and orientations, which according to Radley expose their cultural and personal biographies. The museum object itself is perceived aesthetically and morally, as well as functionally or nostalgically.⁸⁶⁷

The experience of seeing the museum objects does not stop on remembering the visitors' cultural pasts, but continues to exist in the realm of personal and family recollection.⁸⁶⁸ The influence on defining the meaning of certain objects does not only come from within the museum, but also from outside, such as via new

⁸⁶⁵ Coxall, 1991, p. 95; Hooper-Greenhill, p. 124.

⁸⁶⁶ Radley, 1991, p. 65.

⁸⁶⁷ *ibid.*, pp. 76-7.

⁸⁶⁸ *ibid.*, p. 70.

findings in the field, the present socio-political climate, and the vested interest of funding bodies.⁸⁶⁹

Collections or the act of collecting have a lot to do with the life history of the original owner or collector. Some of the collections are very personal and the collectors or the possessors have to struggle before deciding to display their collections in public. Things would be different if, for example, the collections are donated and made public after the owners' death.

One of the ways to present information is through the words of the curators, which later comes in the form of leaflets, catalogues and similar publications. Sometimes, the text writers, curators, scholars or editors are influenced, unconsciously, by the documents – for example, texts, photographs or paintings – being prepared for the exhibition, documentation or further research. In the process of writing, it is possible that certain negative attitudes, such as racist ones, come to the fore. It is not that the writers themselves are racist, but due to the nature of the documents being studied and to the accuracy of its history, certain 'racist' vocabularies are used and thus the writers unintentionally give the impression of being racist. There is a kind of 'translation' process:

In the writing of museum text, documents relating to the period being studied are frequently used as sources. When ideas and vocabulary from these documents are transferred from the document to the label, which may happen as writers strive for 'historical accuracy', the concepts which were sustained by these words may also be transferred.⁸⁷⁰

I have discussed how, in reproducing certain photographs for publications, authors and scholars alike will consider the aesthetic side of the whole presentation of the book including the selection of the photographs. If language constructs a social

⁸⁶⁹ Coxall, 1991, p. 92.

⁸⁷⁰ *ibid.*, p. 95.

worldview and the audience are controlled by it, it is the perceptual skills acquired through exposure to objects, opinion and, experience that influence people's aesthetic experience.⁸⁷¹ In a similar fashion to writers who visit Bali, museum visitors' recollections of their museum visits are constructed out of their past experiences as well as the memories that are culturally formed.

⁸⁷¹ Hooper-Greenhill, p. 153.

CONCLUSIONS

This thesis, in spite of its empirical approach, has nevertheless attempted to make an original contribution to the debates surrounding stereotypical concepts and representations of the 'other'. The empirical data chosen highlights the essentialist nature of textual and image production, both by men and by women. The essentialism in my argument is related to two major issues: gender and colonial attitudes.

Essentialist positions consider gender to be a fixed trait. They do not allow for variations in this trait among individuals or over time. In social thought, essentialism is often conflated with biological reductionism. Some scholars distinguish biological sex from gender roles. Other disciplines make a distinction between "nature" and "nurture". In the production of images of Bali, there is a conventional relationship between women and nature, in which nature is used as a rationale for gender – gender is thought to be based in nature rather than nurture. This can be contested. I have argued that biological sex is not necessarily an indicator of gender. Man's physique is caught up in various processes of social construction.

These essentialist characteristics become clichés that serve to justify colonial practices. An essentialist concept suggests that there is a reality that exists independent of, beneath, or beyond language and ideology. It argues that there is such a thing as "feminine beauty". Essentialist thinking tends to follow political conservatism and to disagree with social change. In addition, it implies inalterability and permanence. The dominant culture is usually saturated with essentialist modes of thinking, in which an ironic or strategic essentialism can

sometimes be politically advantageous to a culture that threatens to reinscribe patriarchal and colonial discourse. This practice has an innate existence or universal validity, rather than being considered as a social, ideological, or intellectual construct. This tradition believes in an eternal and unchangeable human nature, such that of the Balinese “savage”. Having said this, the two discussions regarding feminism and colonialism cannot really be separated: similar forces operate within each issue. Take for example, representations of gender that inferiorise women are similar to representations of race, ethnicity, or culture that inferiorise the ‘Other’.

Based on some visual examples from book illustrations, book covers, photography catalogues, and textual representations from travel writings, I have shown how Western preconceptions came into being, as well as how and why prejudices and false information were caught in the circulation of power relations. The methodology I selected enabled me to argue against the grain of orientalism, feminism, and colonialism, positing instead that there is some essentialist element in the textual production of men and women. I have examined particular images of feminine beauty that reveal how colonial discourse circulates above and beyond the boundaries of individual colonial states. In other words, colonialism systems do not cease to exist when the colonies become independent. In this particular case, they became part of contemporary Bali, in which Balinese men, in turn, gaze upon scantily dressed female tourists on the beach and elsewhere.

Colonial/anthropological photographs of Bali were originally produced and published for specific readers and purposes. They have functional origins, and they were made for a reason. They are often produced with a clear biographical

intention. These photographs aimed to communicate information within a culture of realism, and are expected to be as objective as possible. Since the production of those images was normally intended for 'home' audiences, pictures of colonial Bali emerged and became iconic, and they were circulated in many media channels in the West. It can be argued that they form an image world that is focused on narrow, repetitive themes. As with textual images, which sometimes refer to material published earlier, photographs cannot distance themselves from photographs that were taken before. Once displayed, their meanings depend not only on who is displaying them, but also on where they are found – for example, at a museum.

This thesis shows how literature travels not only with the travellers, but also with the novelists themselves, and how it moves through translation, movement, and migration. In addition, it illustrates how literary, pictorial, and political readings eventually shape the travellers and their travel writings, which later stimulate the imaginations of other writers or visitors. This relationship is relatively complex. Professional writers use literature as a continuing reference point, even before they begin their own travel. This literary inspiration may come from travel writings of an earlier age, works of the imagination, or historical, archaeological, or other scientific works.

The romantic travellers and image-makers relied on their imaginations, perceptions, and expectations, as well as previously assimilated verbal and visual images, in creating representations of Bali. Even before the Dutch East Indies had been reached by the Westerners, Orientalist literary influences were at work. It is

impossible to discuss the prevalent images that were at work during this time without also discussing early colonial and anthropological stereotypes.

Travel writers in Bali used prior knowledge in describing their thoughts and experiences on the island. In addition, in order to examine the cultural differences displayed among the local people, scientists have always referred to earlier ideas. In this process, some of their preconceptions are confirmed, while others are rejected. In order to authenticate their travel accounts, the image-makers or the travellers sometimes conceal the fact that they have previously seen, read, or heard about their destinations. Few of the sources are ever openly revealed. Both the textual image-makers and the visual image-makers describe objects and experiences in a language style that utilizes a 'reality effect' that is sufficient to satisfy the viewers or readers' curiosity. It seems that most of what is said and thought about Bali today goes back to the accumulation of representations that have been preserved from cultural productions and events. The literal and iconographical conventions of Balinese beauty were derived from conceptions of similar exotic or enchanted places, such as the real India and the imaginary land of the Arabian Nights.

Some travel writers arrived with pictorial and/or literary readings that they accumulated before they went on the road. They 'travelled' with contemporary writers, exploring rationally, what had been written about Bali. The pervasive influence of Gregor Krause's book (*Insel Bali*, 1920), for example, is indicated by the frequent references to it in the work of later visitors, including Walter Spies and Miguel Covarrubias. Alexander King, the illustrator of *The Last Paradise* (1930, 1985) never set foot on Bali, but he managed to copy Krause's

photographs. It was routine for those who saw the remarkable photos to decide that they had to visit the island. Krause's photographs helped to persuade more writers and photographers to follow him to Bali. It would not be an exaggeration to say that his book of photographs had the single greatest impact on the spread of Bali's fame, until the publication of Covarrubias' *Island of Bali* (1937).

A recent study conducted by Morgan (1996) focused on Southeast Asia in general. My study is different from other studies because it focuses exclusively on Bali. While previous studies have focused on either visual or textual representations, this study focuses on both the visual and textual representations of the Oriental women in Bali by European men and women. Additionally, this study is unique because many of the studies prior to this one have concentrated on either male or female writers; however, this study focuses on visual and textual images of both women and men. Specifically, it deals with the 1930s representations of colonial Bali as produced by both male and female travellers.

The visual images of Bali indigenes served to visualize 'feminine beauty' and 'racial difference.' These visual representations include overt manifestations of cultural differences, which were seen as being related to moral differences as well: native dress, adornment, and physical appearance were all emphasized, with the concept of nakedness receiving particular attention, and the idea of 'oriental beauty' was explored as well. Visual representations of the Balinese help us to see how ideas about caste became visible through the material culture attached to the sitters or models.

In an age when few people travelled, old photographs of exotic images were regarded as evidence of what was happening in distant places in the age of

the Empire. It should also be noted that those who took the photographs were upper-class travellers. Leaving aside the issues of class, gender, socio-cultural background and genre as they relate to the image-makers, as well as the purpose of their travel, the matter of their targeted audience is also an important feature to evaluate. Originally, travel literature and colonial photography circulated within the same milieu. They were produced, consumed, and circulated among educated, middle-class, “White” males. As documents of cultural contact, however, those photographs were interpreted differently by subsequent consumers.

Sometimes modern readers are exposed to the photographs in different contexts than those in which their original audience viewed them. This means that people read these older works as though the photographs existed in isolation from the texts. Those photographs can liberate aspects from the modern readers’ preconceived notions by drawing their attention to elements that eluded the notice of those present at the time.

Women writers and the travel accounts they wrote were generally regarded as inferior by male critics. The same were true for female photographers and their visual images. Most of the photographers who photographed the Dutch East Indies in the 19th and early 20th century were Dutch men. (Even the first ‘native’ photographer, Kassian Céphas [1845-1912], shares the colonial way of seeing Bali. He often depicted the natives in a lower position than the Dutch.) A method of showing the Dutch East Indies in the light of benevolent colonialism was established. Weissenborn, the first major female photographer of the Indies, brought about a fundamental transformation in the European view of the region.

All visitors had pre-conceptions, either textual or visual, before they came to the island. These visitors later produced more textual and visual images. As travellers in the 1930s, image-makers were also influenced by the political situation that Bali was in at the time. More often than not, 1930s travellers used their travel writing to advance specific political arguments. Racism, which is the handmaiden of colonialism, was revealed in this writing, or else became an acknowledged or unacknowledged theme addressed by writers and photographers. In some cases, visual and textual images that did not entirely reflect the life of the Other continued to modify and shape the writers' attitudes towards colonialism; these images influenced the way in which the writers self-consciously employed travel writing as a platform for voicing their radical political ideas. and how these past experiences came to be shaped by the observers' respective ideological positions. The same things that happened to writers happened also to photographers.

We cannot see the world while simultaneously ignoring our prior experience of and knowledge of the world. The travellers' and writers' colonial contacts, and their preconceptions about the political situations in the colonies. may have influenced their 'political' writings. Travel writing was inevitably derivative of similar books and other writings. The travelling writers of Bali were indeed 'on the road', and they had been influenced by some pictorial and literary readings before arriving in Bali. The travelling colonists discussed in this thesis had had some experience in other colonies, such as ^{British or French ones} ~~England or France~~. Some travellers admitted openly that they had read books about other colonies. Their preconceptions shaped their opinions and political inclinations.

In the thirties, when sea transport was limited, the East Indies was the last place at which a traveller could disembark. Much of the international tourism of the 1930s took place on international oceanic cruises. Therefore, travellers' prior experiences, knowledge of the colonial world, and actual travels to colonial places tended to determine their political stance, which in turn was reflected in their writings. During the era of sea voyages, their political affiliations might have changed if, for example, the Dutch East Indies (especially Bali) had been their first place of arrival. Visual relations are never innocent; they are always determined by cultural systems and by the political affiliations that people bring with them.

Travelling colonists' works tended to be dominated by stereotyped images, based on their previous readings and the coloniser's general sense of superiority – a sense which may have been influenced by patriarchal imperialism. Here, in addition to personal experience in colonial locations, visual and textual images also served an important ideological function. There is an indication that Gorer's colonial attitude was influenced by Orwell and by the racialist discourse at that time. In this thesis, a novel by Baum is discussed. Baum's historical novel shows the ways in which women's political travelling views were similar to those of their male contemporaries, and how colonial locations tended to affect travellers' views. A study of her work demonstrates that Said failed to see women's participation in the construction of Orientalism. On the other hand, according to Said, these travelling colonists show how the "truth" of a discourse depends on when and where it is said and on who is saying it. The relationship between

discourse and power gives rise to certain “rules” that regulate what can be said and thought about a particular colony.

Some of the scientific photographs discussed above are kept in museums, which later published and exhibited the photographs at different times and in various places. Whether the exhibitions are held within the museums or outside the museums, most of the time the photographs are surrounded by written text. Museum catalogues repeat what is displayed in the museums, either visually or textually. In short, the ‘museum’ has the potential to be visited in another place and at another time. Often a particular pictorial image is reproduced in different media or in a different location, and thus is narrated by different authors. The relationship between images and text is rich and complex. For modern readers, in particular, museum texts can provide an approach to the past or to colonial settings, while simultaneously providing a continuing reference point for future research. The meaning of a text is dependent upon the choice and combination of the language used by the writer. Yet interpretation also depends on who finds the photographs and where they are found –for example, in books, galleries, exhibitions, or private collections.

Most of the early photographers and anthropologists were men. They produced photographs and anthropological writings that are sometimes considered ‘true,’ ‘authentic,’ and ‘authoritative’ – they are taken for granted, and accepted as truth. Perhaps it is not the intention of the photographer to label the sitters as ‘types’; however, as soon as these photographs enter museums, they are labelled as such. The image-makers construct images of women according to the patriarchal ways of thinking. Some of their successors help maintain the

circulation of the image. They reveal how certain images, once codified in verbal or visual language, remain static and final. They had many origins, from biblical stories, ancient mythologies, or oriental texts, to more recent ethnographic writings or scientific exploration. Before the travellers/scholars embarked on their journeys, the writers brought with them their pre-formed imaginary Orient; thus, their works were constituted by, and in, the real and imagined Orient; between fiction and scholarly writings. As far as the text and its narrative techniques are concerned, there appears to be no essential distinction between actual travel accounts and the purely fictional forms of travel literature; between travel writing and scholarly writing. Any text has the potential to circulate colonial stereotypes and images of the other. They play roles in the production of knowledge and the dissemination of the effects of power. By producing knowledge about the Other, those texts are implicated in the reproduction of colonialism.

Bali has long attracted the attention of modern anthropologists such as Gregory Bateson, Jane Belo, Clifford and Hildred Geertz, and Margaret Mead. Noted anthropologists, such as Mead, produced photographic representations of Balinese people as individuals, rather than as types. Even though these images do repeat earlier motifs, such as women or young girls in markets/temples with offerings/burdens, the construction of these images is different from the type commonly found in early anthropological writings. The contemporary understanding, practice and ways of seeing that modern anthropologists have initiated have become a fundamental component in correcting the negative representation of women within the media. Today's anthropologists and scholars may have succeeded in giving people a better and more realistic picture of certain

images, and in providing counter-narratives to the dominant history; however. on the other hand, due to the nature of the texts, those anthropologists and scholars have unavoidably circulated and promoted old images of Bali as well.

The issue of who has access to the old, stereotyped photographs is also important. Access to them is increasing, but this may have contradictory consequences. While some photographs remain in private collections, print images are far more widespread than they once were. There are always people who want to do further research and dig for old photographs. Photo collectors and researchers continue to hunt for handpicked old photographs. For example, the Italian anthropologist Maurizio Rosenberg Colomi started collecting photographs from private and museum collections in Europe and Bali in 2003. Colomi who happens to be one of the founders of Italy's National Photo Archive, has collected hundreds of photographs. His first exhibition, titled *Unveiled Bali*, took place from 7 September – 23 November 2007 in Quidzy Gallery, Seminyak and from 23 September – 1 October 2007 in Campuhan College, Ubud. This exhibition displayed twenty-six rare photographs taken in Bali from 1890 – 1960s.⁸⁷² These “rare” photographs, which mostly depicted bare-breasted Balinese girls, were mass-produced for public consumption and sold at a price of Rp 2. 200.000, 00 (equivalent to £119).⁸⁷³ Colomi, who has lived in Bali for 40 years, knows what he is doing. The exhibition in Campuhan College took place just opposite the venue for the Ubud Writers and Readers Festival, which was held from 25 – 30 September 2007. Although the Ubud exhibition displayed entirely different photographs they depict the same theme.

⁸⁷² Online. Available: <http://www.adnkronos.com/AKI/English/CultureAndMedia/?id=1.0.1271085338>

⁸⁷³ Online. Available: <http://blog.baliwww.com/people-community/973/>

Text and pictures are essential to one another: visual knowledge is an important counterpart to textual knowledge. Travellers' visual and textual experiences and memories almost always influence the way that they communicate things, either visually or textually. Their photographs become visual representations of actual occurrences, occurrences that take place before the travellers' eyes – or camera lenses. Subconsciously, later travellers seek out and produce similar images, which take the form of either inner images or photographic pictures. Sharing these actual occurrences may take two forms: through the use of language and its narrative conventions, or through photographic documentation. Texts/photos that were circulated previously affect later perception.

Ethnologists and early anthropologists tried to photograph, record, and 'preserve' native culture in the remote areas of Bali. They used photographs as evidential scholarship to 'prove' how 'uncivilized' the 'natives' were. However, not all research, insight, and knowledge could be fully translated into verbal forms. Yet to really "see" a photograph means to appropriate it and to be transfigured by it. The photographers and text writers tried to convince others to share their positions through images and/or texts. This is not the same process that we experience when we, as modern readers, read displays in certain locations – for example, in an exhibition. Although we are equipped with more 'accurate' and 'reliable' background information than readers/writers had during the colonial period, our perception and our judgement regarding certain images is influenced by the texts surrounding the photographs – by the involvement/interference of the human being who set the display. This does not mean, however, that we

cannot understand one single photograph when it is isolated from any text or surroundings. Rather, the social space of the display narrows and focuses the viewers' perception and understanding, promoting a certain interpretation.

The time in which people (either the text writers or the audience) engage in viewing photographs of the past may already be influenced by their pre-conceptions – by words that are no longer used in modern time, or words whose meanings have changed. The interpretation of photographs cannot be restricted to the sorting out of different meanings; it must also consider the social biography of the photos, their surroundings and whole nature of the display. Any final judgment as to what a photograph means depends on how defensible and convincing the display is, in addition to a careful interpretation of the descriptions surrounding the photograph.

In this instance, surviving colonial photographs should be given careful attention in terms of inscription and archiving. Inscription of the content should not be limited to the usual phases, running from possessing/gathering through archiving, labelling, and displaying. The immediate surroundings of the display and the ethnographic appearance within the performative quality of the image must be noted as well. This is what ethnographers such as Geertz call “thick description”.

In order to understand a colonial text, any modern reader needs to examine the process of its production, exchange, and consumption. The inscription of the colonial gaze essentially defines the colonial ideology, which may not reveal the ‘true’ meaning of a certain text. Each photograph presents a specific photographic experience. The making of an image usually operates in the fluid spaces of

ideological and cultural meaning. The term 'Balinese beauty,' for example, encapsulates the ways in which the Dutch used their knowledge of subordinate people, symbolized in their nakedness, to justify their colonial powers through the use of binary opposition. In their perpetuation of images of this 'beauty,' they show the world 'inferior' beauty by using their own cultural meanings. Representations of gender and of colonial subjects converge at this point.

In creating meaning, the viewer experiences a process of negotiation and opposition. Each reader's interpretation of the display varies according to his or her life experience and cultural background. The message of the display will become meaningful to its viewers only when they are able to recognize the intended meaning of the display.

Readers change over the course of time. Colonial photographs have been in circulation for a long time. Although these images are rooted in the past, they are also active in the present, and they will continue to communicate the past in the future. In order to understand the complex processes involved in creating the meaning of certain images, readers must consider the production of photographs, their social biography, their circulation, and their shifting use and changing values. This thesis, to some extent, helps to maintain the circulation of the images discussed herein.

Today, Bali continues to attract many different kinds of travellers. Year after year, the island of Bali is voted the most enchanting travel and holiday destination in the world by the readers of *Travel and Leisure World* magazine. Although there are some who are Balinese keen on modernization and tourism, many still uphold their rich traditions. There are some indications that Bali has

suffered from the negative effect of tourism. Tourism was encouraged by previous representations of the island, but it has not been a benefit to Bali. There are times when the development of tourism has led to clashes with the local people. The development of a new resort in Tanah Lot in 1994, for example, was only stopped by military intervention. There are people who want to commercialise both the island's environment and its cultural history. Still, due to Bali's cultural richness, most of the Balinese heritage has withstood the test of time.

The case of an Australian woman who smuggled nine pounds of marijuana into Bali and was sentenced to twenty years in prison on 27 May 2005 led to a call for a tourist boycott of the island. Some of Australia's travel agents have advocated this boycott. Additionally, the terror warning surrounding Indonesia has drawn international attention to the archipelago. It brought to mind images of the terrorist attack on 12 October 2003 – an attack often thought of as Australia's September 11. All of these memories, whether good or bad, transform the present. Whether or not this will stop people from visiting Bali, only time will tell: however, the Lonely Planet will continue to promote modern Bali:

Bali is so picturesque that you could be fooled into thinking it was a painted backdrop: rice paddies trip down hillside like giant steps, volcanoes soar through the clouds, the forests are lush and tropical, and the beaches are lapped by the warm waters of the Indian Ocean.⁸⁷⁴

Publishers such as the Lonely Planet know how to sell Bali. The beauty of Bali is described as a product of art and of painting. This painted backdrop was commonly used in photographic studios at the beginning of photography. Any reference to the past brings back previous images, which simultaneously enliven old images. The claim of contemporary photographs' closeness to art cannot

⁸⁷⁴ *Lonely Planet*. 'Bali.' Online. Available: http://www.lonelyplanet.com/destinations/south_east_asia/bali'. 7 September 2005.

distance them from photographs or paintings produced previously. In conclusion, reproductions of photographs and the republications of books help to maintain the circulation of the images of Bali.

Here, the case studies focus on images of Balinese women, revealing how complex the processes of the construction of meaning are in relation to such images. Any late 20th/early 21st century viewer is necessarily a product of his or her own particular cultural background. People's knowledge, beliefs, values, and attitudes are heavily influenced by their culture. Thus, they are also reflected in the photographs that they analyse. Modern readers therefore need to take into account the production of photographs, their circulation, and their shifting use and changing values. Future researchers need to examine the ideologies surrounding the making, exhibiting, and captioning of photographs, as well as the writing about them.

The issue of gender has remained largely unexplored. There are not many scholars or researchers among the Balinese people themselves. In order to understand and appreciate 21st century images of women, it is necessary to demonstrate their historical background. In order to examine certain widely held preconceptions, it is necessary to trace gendered discourse and images of femininity, which have been characterised in these terms in Western academic discourse. Previous research is indebted to Dutch colonial writers for their creation of the conception of Bali.

Any research involving local sources requires a mastery of one or more regional languages. In the case of Bali, researchers will probably need to master Balinese characters in order to understand the written language. However, there

are also potential research materials that have been written from a Balinese perspective on history, such as *Babad*. *Babad* is a semi-historical literary account of the origins and exploits of certain clans. The earliest written records from indigenous sources describe only the images of women that were depicted in *kakawin* poetry, a classical epic poetry of the Indic courts. Since the European male's access to the court was limited, the outsider's view of Balinese women eventually came to be taken from the ruling court elites. Thus, the representation of women from different classes has been ignored to a certain degree. Hence, the 'reality' of the image of Balinese women probably most accurately represents the experiences of women somewhere between the upper and the lower class. For this reason, the historical and cultural construction of gender in Bali requires further investigation.

From my perspective, one of the possible weaknesses of this research is that I had only limited access to the original copies/archive of the images being discussed. Since earlier documentations of the Dutch East Indies are, for the most part, available in Dutch, these could present problems for researchers who do not speak Dutch. Information about Weissenborn and her photographs, for example, is written in Dutch. It would be interesting to discuss her photographs at length, although to address her 1920s work would have led this thesis too far off topic. Future research could be extended by expanding the period of study into a later period – for example, the 1940s, or the period after the Independence Day (1945). This would allow for the analysis of more native photographers. Co-authoring books with Balinese scholars, as has been done by Michael Hitchcock and I

Nyoman Darma Putra in their book titled *Tourism, Development, and Terrorism in Bali* (2007), will possibly “correct” the image of Bali accordingly.

Additionally, more research might be needed to determine just how pervasive the influences of the earlier dissemination of textual and visual images have been. In order to know whether this dissemination has indeed persisted to the present day, and to see whether or not these images are now in the process of change, further research should cover more up-to-date documentation of visual and textual images. The international Ubud Writers and Readers Festival (UWRF) would provide a good starting point. This annual event is a part of the Saraswati Foundation for the Arts, which focuses on the artwork of people from Indonesia, Southeast Asia, and the West. The festival itself was initiated by Janet de Neefe, a Melbourne artist and restaurateur, whose Balinese cookbook entitled *Fragrant Rice: My Continuing Love Affair with Bali* (2003), was nominated for the Nita B. Kibble Literary Award for women writers. De Neefe is married to Ketut Suardana, a Balinese man, and has lived in Bali for 20 years. The festival first began as a development project after the Bali Bombing in 2002, and it always takes place in October, the month of the first bomb; the fourth festival (2007), which took place in September instead, seemed to indicate that this annual festival is likely to become one of the world’s prestigious literary venues, and quite possibly the most prestigious event of its kind in Southeast Asia. In 2006 Festival, Condé Nast Traveler said that the URWF was ‘one of the world’s great book events.’⁸⁷⁵ Harper’s Bazaar claimed that it is ‘among the top six literary Festivals

⁸⁷⁵ Online. Available: http://www.ubudwritersfestival.com/UWRF_FACT_SHEET_2007.pdf. 30 December 2006.

in the world'.⁸⁷⁶ Among the guest lists in this year's Festival (2007) is Kiran Desai, the winner of last year's Man Booker Prize.

Some emerging writers from Southeast Asia, such Vira Safitri, Dina Zaman, Angelo Suarez, and Yong Shu Hoong, all of whom have been inspired by Bali to some degree, attended the 2006 festival. Jamie James, a New York art critic, has recently written a first novel entitled *Andrew and Joey: A Tale of Bali* (2002), which presents the story of a gay couple named Joey Breaux (who is Cajun) and Andrew Tan (who is Asian-American); this novel is set partly in Bali. (James, who stayed in Bali in 1999, now lives in Jakarta.) In the novel, Joey receives a grant to produce a modern ballet based on Spies' life in 1930s Bali. Spies himself was gay. During his stay in the island, Joey has a relationship with Wayan, a young Balinese dancer. The subtitle of the novel echoes the title of Baum's novel, *A Tale from Bali* (1937). The cover of the novel is a reproduction of Spies' painting, and the plot of the story is reminiscent of the heyday of homosexuality in old Bali. This novel alone has already demonstrated how images of Bali in the past have been enlivened in the present. This merits further elucidation.

The impacts of tourism and foreign ideas on the Balinese will continue to influence contemporary literature and the representation of Bali. In other words, modern Western viewpoints will also enrich and reinvent the Balinese, as the Balinese search for their place and identity in the globalised modern world. Bali will remain an inspiration for artists, photographers, writers, and scholars from the West. Before the Dutch came to Bali, there were few available narrative histories

⁸⁷⁶ *ibid*

and no official records about the Balinese. In the absence of adequate indigenous data, research that was completed during the colonial period inevitably becomes prevalent in Western sources.

Appendix B

CHRONOLOGY

- c. 1700 In the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, the slave trade was very important to the Dutch. Balinese slave of Batavia: Adrian Vickers' *Bali: A Paradise Created* 1996, after p. 84.
- 1814 Jean-Auguste-Dominique Ingres' *La Grand Odalisque*.
- 1817 Sir Thomas Stamford Raffles: *The History of Java*. 'Account of Bali' was placed as 'Appendix K'.
- c.1827/28 Eugène Delacroix: *Odalisque Reclining on a Divan* – a centuries-old motif in Western painting that echoed several years later not only by the same artist but contemporary artists.
- 1834 Eugène Delacroix: *Women of Algiers in their Apartment*.
- 1846 The first Dutch military expedition against the Rajas of Buleleng and Karangasem (June).
- 1848 The second expedition against the Rajas of Buleleng, Karangasem and Klungkung (June).
- 1849 Joint Dutch and Lombok expedition against Buleleng, Karangasem and Klungkung (April – July).
- 1852 James W. Redfield, MD: *Comparative Physiognomy or Resemblances Between Men and Animals*.
- 1853 Delacroix: *Photograph of a Naked Woman*.
- 1855 Paris World Exposition (6 May – 15 November).
Gustave Courbet: *The Painter's Studio* – a painting of a female nude based on a photograph taken by Julien Vallou de Villeneuve.
- 1856 John Crawford: *A Description of the Indian Islands & Adjacent Countries*.
- 1857 Delacroix: *The Odalisque*.
- 1860 Multatuli: *Max Havelaar, of de koffij-veilingen der Nederlandsche Handel-Maatschappij* with English translation (c. 1867) and Indonesian translation (1972).
- 1865 Slaves on Bali, including one from Papua called 'Brit' in Vickers' *Bali* (1989), after p. 84.
- c.1866/68 W. Holman Hunt: *Isabella and the Pot of Basil* – a painting of a reclining woman.
- 1869 Alfred R. Wallace: *The Malay Archipelago*.
- 1885 Prince Roland Bonaparte: 'Billy, Little Toby and Jenny' – a series photograph of Australian Aborigines at the Folies Bergère in Paris.
Johannes Lindt: 'Motu Water Carrier – Port Moresby' – a photograph.
- 1887 Etienne-Jules Marey produces roll-film camera.
- 1888 Kodak No 1 introduced.
- c.1890 *Samoan Women* – a photograph of a 'native' reproduced in Elizabeth Edwards, p. 11.
Rodiya Girls, Sri Lanka – a photograph of 'water carrier' girls, reproduced in Edwards, p. 11.
- 1892 A. W. Nieuwenhuis: *Zijdeweefster in Atjeh*, Acehnese silk weaving women.
- 1899 Rudyard Kipling: *The White Man's Burden*.
- c.1900 A. W. Nieuwenhuis: *Wevende Kajanvrouw te Boven Mahakam op Midden-Borne*, a photograph of Kalimantan Tengah (Central Borneo) weaving women.

- 1901 A. W. Nieuwenhuis: *Weefster op Atjeh*, Aceh, Acehnese weaving women.
Anonym: Soendanese meisje, Javaansche, Djogjakarta, Jogjakarta:
Photographs of 'prostitutes', nude/semi-nude, bathing. Anneke Groeneveld,
et. al's Toekang Potret (1989), p. 79, p. 80, p. 81.
- 1902 Heer van Kol's book: *Uit Onze Kolonien* (Out of Our Colonies).
Joseph Conrad: *Heart of Darkness*.
- 1904 The arrival of the first painter: W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp (Dutch).
- 1906 The first *puputan*.
W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp: *Bali en Lombok (1906-1910)* (2 volumes).
- 1908 The second/final *puputan*. The whole island is fully under Dutch control.
- 1912 Krause's photograph: *Frau Sucht eine Badestelle*, c 1912 (Woman looks
for a bath place), *Insel Bali* vol 2 (1920), p. 138; Also reproduced in
Krause (1926), p. 132; Krause (2001), p. 59.
Krause's photograph: *Unmarried young girl* – Cover page of Krause's *Bali*
1912 (2001).
Krause's photograph: *Frau beim Haarwaschen* (A woman washing her
hair) – bathing in nude, Krause's *Insel Bali* vol. 2 (1920), p. 150. Also
reproduced in Krause (1926), p. 131; Krause (2000), p. 112; Krause
(2001), p. 58.
Marcel Duchamp: *Nude Descending a Staircase* – a painting which
becomes a major image for modern movement.
First Balkan War.
- 1913 Oskar Barnack produces Leica camera.
Second Balkan War.
- 1914 Great Colonial Exhibition in Semarang.
Helen Eva Yates: 'Enchanted Isle', a pamphlet.
- 1915 Dutch painter: C.L. Dake came to Bali. His favourite Balinese subject
is temple gates with wonderfully twisted frangipani trees.
British and Dutch sign treaty fixing the boundary between North Borneo
(Sabah) and The Netherlands Indies.
P. A. J. Moojen designs the much praised Netherlands Indies Pavilion
for the 1931 Paris Exhibition.
- 1918 German Revolution.
First Exhibition of Balinese Art in Amsterdam of Gregor Krause's photos
and W.O.J. Nieuwenkamp's drawings.
Madison Grant: *The Passing of the Great Race, or The Racial Basis of
European History*.
- 1919 KLM opens long-distance air service from Amsterdam to Batavia (now
Jakarta).
- 1920 Gregor Krause: *Insel Bali* (2 volumes).
Thilly Weissenborn's photograph: *Soendanese Schoonheid* (Sundanese
Beauty).
Weissenborn's *Balineses Dansmeisje* (Balinese Dancing Girl) from Ernst
Drissen's *Vastgelegd voor Later* (1983), p. 84; reproduced in Vicker
(1996) after p. 148; become the cover page of Vickers' *Bali een
Gecreëerd Paradijs* (1997) and David Shavit's *Bali and the Tourist
Industry* (2003); the CD cover of *Gamelan of the Love God* (n.d).
Weissenborn's photograph: *Een Balinese Schone* c. 1920 (*Balinese
Beauty*) Ernst Drissen's *Vastgelegd voor Later* (1983), p. 95; reproduced
in Geoffrey Robinson's *The Dark Side of Paradise* (1998), p. 5.

- Moojen's book: *Bali: Verslag en voorstellen aan de regeering van Nederlandsch-Indie*.
- 1921 The arrival of Willem Dooijewaard – a Dutch painter.
- 1922 Krause's book: *Insel Bali* (2 volumes).
Lothrop Stoddard's book: *The Rising Tide of Colour* 22.
Weissenborn's photograph: *Twee Balinese Vrouwen* (Two Balinese Women) Ernst Drissen's *Vastgelegd voor Later* (1983), p. 97; reproduced in Jane Levy Reed's *Toward Independence* (1991), p. 79 as 'water carrier' women.
Henri Matisse's painting: *Odalisque in Red Trousers*.
Roland Strasser: Austrian painter came to Bali – a good friend of Dooijewaard.
The arrival of John Sten a Swedish painter.
- 1923 Weissenborn: 'Balinese girl at a temple's gate' (c. 1923).
The First Dutch Indies Amateur Photographer's Association in Batavia.
- 1924 First airmail service from Batavia to Amsterdam.
Weekly steamship service introduced by KPM.
- 1926 Maurice Muret's book: *The Twilight of the White Races*.
Moojen's book: *Kunst op Bali, Inleidende Studie tot de Bouwkunst* (Bali's Art and Architecture).
Krause's book: *Insel Bali* (2nd edition, 1 volume).
W. Mullens' films: *Bali - Leichenverbrennung und Einäscherung einer Fürstebwitwe* (Royal Cremation) and *Bali - Sanghijang und Ketjaqtanz* (Sang Hyang and Kecak Dance).
- 1927 Multatuli: *Max Havelaar or The Coffee Auctions of the Dutch Trading Company* trans. from the Dutch (1868).
Calon Arang: first fiction film set on Bali.
- 1928 Colin McPhee's book: *The Roots of Gamelan*.
The arrival of Rudolf Bonnet – a Dutch painter.
- 1930 Hickman Powell's *The Last Paradise* – with photographs by Andre Roosevelt and illustrations by Alexander King. All of King's illustrations are drawn from Krause's book. One example is a 'bathing in nude' (after p. 186) – a 'copy' of Krause's *Frau beim Haarwaschen* (1922).
Krause's book: *Bali: La Population, Le Pays, Les Danses, Les Fetes, Les Temples, L'art* (French translation of *Insel Bali*).
Tourist postcards – Images from 'The Island of Bare Breasts': Vickers' *Bali: A Paradise Created* (1996), p. 148.
- 1931 Paris Colonial Exhibition (6 May – 15 November).
Roelof Goris and Walter Spies: *The Island of Bali: Its Religion and Ceremonies* (published in conjunction with the Paris Colonial Exhibition).
Walter Spies, Baron Victor von Plessen, Friedrich Dahlseim and Wolfgang Zeller: *Die Insel der Dämonen* (Island of the Demons) a film.
The arrival of Isaac Israel a Dutch painter.
- 1932 André Roosevelt and Armand Denis: *Goona-Goona: Authentic Melodrama of the Isle of Bali* (other titles: *Love Powder* and *The Kris*) a film.
Covarrubias: *Offerings of Fruits for the Temple* – an illustration
Published in *Vanity Fair* in May.
Covarrubias' Balinese painting solo show at the Valentine Gallery in

- New York City: *Every Night is Festival Night*; also exhibited at the 1987 exhibition in Mexico City.
- The arrival of Adrien-Jean Le Mayeur de Merpres – a Belgian painter. Most of his early paintings are undated: ‘Women dancing’, ‘Two women Weaving’ and ‘Bathing in the garden’ are reproduced in Ruud Spruit (p. 97, p. 103).
- 1933 Baron Viktor von Plessen, Dr Dalsheim and Walter Spies: *Insel der Dämonen (The Island of the Demons)* – a movie.
- Walter Serge, Paris Mitchell and Lou Lemans: *Goona-goona: A Balinese Love Song*.
- Edouard de Keyser’s novel: *L’île des seins Nus* (The Island of Bare Breasts).
- Helen Eva Yates’ book: *Bali: Enchanted Isle – A Travel Book*. “The Balinese maidens are happy and contented to grind the rice to make the cakes the gods like Bali: Enchanted Isle (1933), p. 33 (three young Balinese girls posed grinding the rice); “Even the Balinese girl who sells *sirih* (tobacco) in the market-place is a beautifully formed child of Nature with shining cocoa skin and lovely dark eyes” *Bali: Enchanted Isle* (1933), p. 81.
- 1935 Henri de la Falaise and Robert Sydney: *Legong: Dance of the Virgins* – a movie.
- 1936 Pitamaha artists’ association was founded. Key figures: Spies, Bonnet and the prince of Ubud Cokorde Gde Agung Sukawati.
- Miguel Covarrubias’ and Rose Covarrubias’ book: *The Theatre in Bali*.
- McPhee’s book: *The Balinese Wayang Koelit and Its Music*.
- Covarrubias: *Balinese Dancers* a display at ‘The Dance in Art’ exhibition at the Brooklyn Museum in New York.
- The arrival of Theo Meier a Switzerland painter.
- 1937 Miguel Covarrubias’ *Island of Bali* – illustrated with Covarrubias’ drawings and Rose Covarrubias’ photographs.
- Vicki Baum: *Das Ende der Geburt (A Tale From Bali)*.
- McPhee’s *Angkloeng Gamelans in Bali*.
- In April, Covarrubias published a series of articles on Bali in *Asia* magazine.
- Covarrubias’ painting *Rice Granary*.
- Nieuwenkamp: *Balinese Dancer* – a drawing of a bare breasted dancer, Spruit’s *Artists on Bali*, 1997, p. 29.
- Nieuwenkamp: *Market Scene* – a drawing reproduced in Spruit’s *Artists on Bali*, 1997, p. 33.
- 1938 Beryl de Zoete and Walter Spies: *Dance and Drama in Bali*.
- Andre De la Varre: *Ceremonies in Bali* (11-minute documentary film).
- J.C. Mol – bare breast by door/ windmill – class – later exhibited at the Het Daghet in den Oosten exhibition (1941) *Erfpoort van Laagste Kast* (The Doorway of the Low Caste) Groeneveld’s *Toekang Potret* (1989), p. 160.
- Willem G. Hofker: ‘Painting of the Pura Gunung Lebah temple in Campuan’.
- McPhee’s book: *Children and Music in Bali*.
- The arrival of Emilio Ambron an Italian painter.
- Friedrich Dalsheim and Baron Victor von Plessan: *Wajan* – movie of

- Balinese ritual.
- c.1938/39 Willem Hofker: poster for the Bali Hotel – showing 2 girls ‘charming and beauty’ offering reproduced in Spruit’s *Artists on Bali* (1997), p. 8 also in Picard (1996) after p. 78.
- 1939 Second World War begins.
J. Korver: ‘See Bali’ a set of pamphlets showing bare-breasts images, young girls with offerings on their head.
- 1940 Germany invades the Netherlands.
The government of the Netherlands Indies declares a state of siege.
- 1941 Pearl Harbour Attack.
Het Daghet in den Oosten an exhibition in Koloniaal Instituut (The Royal Institute for the Tropics) Amsterdam.
Covarrubias: *Balinese Girl* is exhibited in the “First American Drawing Annual” at the Albany of History and Art, New York.
Hofker: *Ni Noneh* – a girl bare by the door/entrance of a building reproduced in Spruit, p. 90.
- 1942 Margaret Mead and Gregory Bateson: *Balinese Character: A Photographic Analysis*.
Japanese occupation of Indonesia (until 1945)
Baum: *Barito Monogatari* – a Japanese translation of *A Tale from Bali*.
- 1943 Willem Hofker: *Goesti Made Toewi* a painting of a bare breast girl holding artefacts – a Balinese Beauty; Hofker painted Toewi at least four times. Two of them were painted this year and reproduced in Spruit (1997), p. 75, p. 78.
- 1944 Hofker: *A Balinese Dancer* – a painting.
- 1945 Indonesian Independence Day.
- 1946 McPhee’s book: *A House in Bali* – including some of his photographs.
- 1947 Willem Hofker: *Three Young Balinese Women with Offerings* – a painting.
- 1948 Johan Fabricus: *Eiland der Dameronen* a novel.
- 1949 McPhee’s book: *Dance in Bali – The Five-Tone Gamelan Music of Bali*.
Dutch formally transfer sovereignty to ‘Republik Indonesia Serikat’ (Republic of United States of Indonesia).
- 1951 McPhee’s book: *Maghi Musici e attoria Bali* – an Italian translation of *A House in Bali*.
Gwendolen Brooks Peniman’s: *Goona Goona: A Tale of Magic in Java*.
- 1952 *The Road to Bali*: an American movie starring Bob Hope and Bing Crosby.
The arrival of Antonio Blanco a Philippine of Catalan descent – a painter.
- 1955 Rudolf Bonnet: *Two Balinese Girls* reproduced in Oey (1994), p. 73.
- 1956 Arie Smit came and lived in Bali. (In 1938, he came to Jakarta and worked as a lithographer for the Dutch colonial army.)
- 1960 K’tut Tantri’s book: *Revolt in Paradise*.
de Zoete, Henri Cartier-Bresson and Antonin Artaud: *Bali: Tanz und Theater (Bali: Dance and Theatre)*.
- 1965 Tantri’s *Revolusi di Nusa Damai* – an Indonesian translation of *Revolt in Paradise*.
- 1966 McPhee’s book: *Music in Bali*.
- 1968 Electricity arrived in Bali when the Bali Beach Hotel was built.
- 1975 Baum’s *Amor y Muerte en Bali* – Spanish translation of *A Tale From Bali*.
- 1983 Ernst Drissen’s book: *Vastgelegd voor Later: Indische Foto’s (1917 –*

- 1942) *van Thilly Weissenborn* – a collection of photographs taken by Weissenborn.
- 1987 Covarrubias' painting exhibited at Centro Cultural Arte Contemporaneo, Mexico City: *The Beauty Ritual* – two Balinese girls showing one girl is looking for lice on the other girl's head, *Two Girls Bathing* – a painting of two women bathing in nude, *Tropical Fruit for Sale*; *Selling Jackfruit* and *Lady of High Caste Wearing Gold Subang*.
- 1988 Krause's *Bali 1912* (translation from *Insel Bali* by W. H. Mabbett).
- 1989 Anneke Groeneveld, et. al: *Toekang Potret 100 Jaar Fotografie in Netherlands Indie – 100 Years of Photography in the Dutch Indies 1839-1939* – a bilingual catalogue of photography exhibition which is held in the Museum of Ethnology at Rotterdam from 4 March to 28 May.
- 1991 Jane Levy Reed (ed.): *Toward Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed* – exhibition catalogue organised by The Friends of Photography presented at the Adams Center in San Francisco from 25 September – 1 Desember.
- 1992 Gordon D. Jensen and Luh Ketut Suryani's book: *The Balinese People: A Reinvestigation of Character* – a critique to *Mead's Balinese Character*.
- 1995 Tantri's *Opstand in het Paradijs* – a Dutch translation of *Revolt in Paradise*.
- 1997 Timothy Lindsey: *The Romance of K'tut Tantri and Indonesia*.
- 2000 Krause: *Bali: People and Art* – a translation of *Insel Bali* by E. J. Walter.
- 2002 The first Bali Bomb was on 12 October.
- 2004 The 1st Ubud Writers and Readers Festival (UWRF) 11 – 17 October.
- 2005 The second Bali Bomb (4 October).
The 2nd UWRF 6 – 10 October.
Historiography Exhibition – one of the prominent events of the Summit Bali Biennale.
- 2006 The 3rd UWRF 30 September – 3 October.
- 2007 The 4th UWRF 25 – 30 September.
Unveiled Bali Exhibition took place from 7 September – 23 November In Quidzy Gallery, Seminyak and from 23 September – 1 October in Campuhan College, Ubud displaying twenty-six rare photographs taken in Bali from 1890 – 1960s.

Appendix C

SHORT BIOGRAPHIES

Gregor Krause (1883-1960)

first came to Bangli, Bali, in August 1912; at the time he was a temporary medical officer in the Dutch colonial army. Although he planned to stay only for three years, in fact he remained for a full forty years. This young German bachelor was also an amateur photographer. From 1912 to 1914, he took about 4000 photographs of Balinese people. In 1920, he published a two-volume photo album, *Insel Bali*, which consist almost 400 of his photos. The second edition (1922) came in one volume, which was revised four years later. It was translated to French in 1930. The English translation appeared in 1988 and 2001. The first printing (1920) was sold out within six months. The photographs were so admirable and powerful that they brought Bali to the attention of the world. Although Krause also took pictures of the culture and of nature, most of Krause's photographs were depictions of Balinese women, either nude or semi-naked. Visitors such as Miguel Covarrubias, Vicki Baum and Emilio Ambron were among those who read Krause's book before travelling to Bali. Krause's books continue to lure generations of Bali enthusiasts.

Thilly Weissenborn (1889 - 1964)

or Margarethe Mathilde Weissenborn, was born in Kediri. Herman Weissenborn and Paula Roessner, her parents, were German-born naturalized Dutch who owned a coffee plantation in Kediri. She stayed there until the age of three before moving to The Hague. There she learnt about photography from Else, her sister, who opened a studio in 1903. When she was 24, she returned to Indonesia with her brother, Theo. She went to Surabaya and worked in a famous studio owned by Kurkdjian. Among

thirty male employees, she was one of only two women. In 1917, she moved to Garut and opened her own 'Lux' studio. In 1930, her second studio, Lux Fotograaf Atelier NV, was established, also in Garut.

Like her predecessors and contemporaries, Weissenborn could not avoid producing images of the bare breasted women. Her most famous photograph, in fact, was of a dancing girl, posed near a Balinese gong. The pose represented in this photograph was totally different from the images that were popular in the mainstream at that time, and this image has been frequently reproduced and discussed from the 1920s through the present day.

Walter Spies (1895-1942)

was the son of a German diplomat who came to Java in August 1923. He was a man with many talents, among which were numbered painting, music, languages, dancing, choreographing, photography and filmmaking. His first job was as a pianist. He played music to accompany silent movies in Bandung. The following month, he moved to Jogjakarta and became the conductor of Jogjakarta Sultan's orchestra. In 1925, he visited Bali for a short time; he visited several more times before deciding to settle in Ubud. He was also the curator of Bali Museum in Denpasar. As the longest European resident of Bali, Spies became the 'must-see' person and he was willing to help. Through his works, which were displayed in Berlin, Paris and New, he helped to bring Bali international fame. When the war broke out, Japan occupied Indonesia via Bali, and Germany attacked Holland. Spies was arrested by the Dutch and was interned. On 18 January, 1942, along with some other German civilian internees, he sailed to Ceylon. The ship, Van Imhoff, was hit by a Japanese bomb the following day. Spies died at the age of 46.

Rose Covarrubias (1895-1970)

California-born Rosemonde Cowan was a popular dancer and choreographer. Before performing in musical revues on Broadway such as *The Rose Girl*, *Music Box Revue* and *Round the Town*, she performed in the Theatre Guild's Garrick Gaieties' *Rancho Mexicana*. This was where she met her future husband, Miguel Covarrubias, who was the set designer of that show. She changed her name from Cowan to Rolanda when she was a member of the Morgan Dancers. She later made some further alterations to her name, changing Rose to Rosa and Rolanda to Roland.

Artists and photographers never failed to admire her beauty. She was photographed by many famous photographers of the time, such as Edward Weston, Carl van Vechten, Max Eastman, Man Ray and Nickolas Murray. Among the many artists who painted her were Miguel Covarrubias and Diego Rivera. Writers who wrote about the Covarrubias almost always acknowledged her beauty. She learned about photography from Edward Weston and Tina Modotti. She later became an accomplished photographer, writer, and artist. She took all the photographs in *Island of Bali*.

Miguel Covarrubias (1904-1957)

was born in Mexico City. His father was a cabinet minister. Covarrubias was a famous caricaturist with various talents. His works appeared in *Vanity Fair*, *The New Yorker*, and *Vogue*. He was also an anthropologist, author, painter, muralist, and stage designer. He married Rose Covarrubias in 1930. On their honeymoon, they travelled extensively to the South Pacific and made an extended nine-month stopover in Bali.

He received a Guggenheim Fellowship and, with Rose Covarrubias, returned in 1933 to Bali. The result of this trip was his best-selling book *Island of Bali* (1937), which included many of his paintings and drawings and Rose Covarrubias' photographs. It was here that he developed his passion for anthropological research. After his Bali trip, Covarrubias took up painting seriously, and this soon eclipsed his affection for caricature. Although he never took up anthropology as a profession, obituaries have concentrated on his anthropological works, mentioning his caricatures only slightly.

K'tut Tanti (1899 -1997)

Muriel Stuart Walker was a Scottish-born American woman who lived in Bali from 1932-1947. She was adopted by a Balinese king and was given the name K'tut Tantri (the fourth born). She was the first person to hold an Indonesian passport, and K'tut Tantri, not, is the name printed in it. Her autobiography *Revolt in Paradise* (1960) has been translated into a dozen of languages, including Indonesian in 1965. It was later reprinted both in Indonesian and English in 2006 by Gramedia Jakarta.

Many critics have cast aspersions on its accuracy, especially in regard to her contribution to Indonesian independence. However, she was a wartime radio propagandist in Surabaya, resulting in her nickname of 'Surabaya Sue'. She spread propaganda in a magazine called *The Voice of Free Indonesia*. She often wrote speeches for President Sukarno. In the preface of *Revolusi di Nusa Damai* (the Indonesian translation of *Revolt in Paradise*), both Sukarno and A.H. Nasution, the Army Chief of Staff, acknowledged Tantri's struggle.

Tantri, who was a naturalized Australian, died in Sydney. Her coffin was covered with an Indonesian flag and a Balinese cloth. In her will, she asked that her ashes be scattered in Bali and her inheritance be given to poor Balinese children. At

the memorial service, the Indonesian deputy ambassador stated that Tantri was a 'true hero of the revolution.' In 2005 there was a proposal to make K'tut Tantri the name of a street in Kuta, Bali.

Vicki Baum (1888-1960)

Born Hedwig Baum to a Jewish family in Vienna, Baum moved to Germany in 1910. She was known in the German literary circles in mid-1920s. In 1926, she wrote exclusively for Ullstein, Europe's largest publisher at the time. After the success of *Menschen im Hotel* (1929), as well as its translation as *Grand Hotel* (1930) and the movie it inspired (1932), she moved to America in 1932. Baum still wrote in German until 1937, a year before she became an American citizen and enjoyed international fame. Her books were banned by the National Socialists Germany in 1933. She went to Bali and published *A Tale in Bali* (1937) which subsequently brought Bali and Balinese *puputan* into the world.

Geoffrey Gorer (1905-1985)

Born in London, Gorer was educated at Charterhouse Cambridge. After taking a year off in the Sorbonne from 1922-1923, he returned to Cambridge and graduated from Jesus College Cambridge in 1927. His background was in modern languages. He was fully engaged in anthropology in 1935 when he received training from Margaret Mead, Ruth Benedict, and John Dollard. After his *Africa Dances* (1935), he was noted as a prominent scholarly British anthropologist. *Bali and Angkor* (1936) was his other cultural study of the Balinese. It was the result of his travels to Indo-China and the Dutch East Indies.

Bibliography

- Abu-Lughod, Lila, 'Orientalism and Middle East Feminist Studies', in *Feminist Studies*, 27 (2001), 101-113
- Acton, Mary, *Learning to Look at Paintings* (London: Routledge, 1997)
- Adams, Jane and D. Gorton 'Southern Trauma: Revisiting Caste and Class in the Mississippi Delta', *American Anthropologist*, 106 (2004), 334-345
- Adler, J., 'Origins of Sightseeing', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 16 (1989), 7-29
- Adshead – Lansdale, Janet and June Layson, eds., *Dance History: An Introduction* (New York: Routledge, 1994)
- Agung, Ide Anak Agung Gde, *Bali in the 19th Century* (Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 1991)
- Allen, Charles, ed., *Tales from the South China Seas: Images of the British in South-East Asia in the Twentieth Century* (London: Abacus, 1998)
- Alloula, Malek, *The Colonial Harem*, trans. by Myrna Godzich and Wlad Godzich (Manchester: Manchester University, 1986)
- Allport, Gordon W., *The Nature of Prejudice* (Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, 1954)
- Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities* (London: Verso, 2006)
- Anderson, Isabel, LLD., Litt. D., *In Eastern Seas: With a Visit to Insulinde and Golden Chersonese* (Boston: Bruce Humphries, Inc., 1934)
- Anderson, Linda R., *Women and Autobiography in the Twentieth Century: Remembered Futures* (London: Prentice Hall, 1997)
- Anggraeni, Dewi, 'Hofker's Bali Paintings Make their Way Back Home', *The Jakarta Post*. Online. Available:
<http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20041219.M02>.
31 May 2005
- Arendt, Hannah, *Between Past and Future* (Hamondsworth: Penguin, 1985)
- Asad, Talal (ed.), *Anthropology & the Colonial Encounter* (London: Ithaca, 1973)
- 'The Concept of Cultural Translation in British Social Anthropology', in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Berkeley: University of California, 1986).

pp. 141-164

- Baker, M. Joyce, *Images of Women in Film: The War Years, 1941-1945* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research, 1981)
- 'Bali again named World's Favourite Tourist Island', *The Jakarta Post*. Online. Available: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/misc/PrinterFriendly.asp.11>. July 2005
- Banks, M. and H. Morphy, eds, *Rethinking Visual Anthropology* (London: Routledge, 1975)
- Barber, Francis, Peter Hulme and Margaret Iversen (eds.), *Colonial Discourse/Postcolonial Theory* (Manchester: Manchester University, 1994)
- Barrett, Terry, *Criticizing Photographs: An Introduction to Understanding Images* (California: Mayfield, 1996)
- Barthes, Roland, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Vintage, 1993)
- Bartram, Graham, ed., 'The German Novel in the Long Twentieth Century', in *The Cambridge Companion to the Modern German Novel* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2004), pp. 1-14
- Barwise, J. M. and N. J. White, *South East Asia* (London: Cassell, 2002)
- Bassnett, Susan, *Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993)
- Bate, David, *Photography and Surrealism: Sexuality, Colonialism and Social Dissent* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2004)
- Bateson, Mary Catherine, *With a Daughter's Eye: a Memoir of Margaret Mead and Gregory Bateson* (New York: HarperPerennial, 1994)
- Baum, Vicki, *The Ship and the Shore* (London: Geoffrey Bles, 1941)
- The Weeping Wood* (London: Michael Joseph, 1945)
- I Know What I'm Worth* (London: Joseph, 1964)
- A Tale from Bali*, trans. by Geoffrey Bless (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, c.1983)
- Belfrage, Cedric, *Away from It All: An Escapologist's Notebook* (Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1940)

- Belo, Jane, *Trance and Dance in Bali* (New York: Columbia University, 1960)
- Bemmelen, Dr. J. F. Van and Colonel J. B. Hooyer, *Guide to the Dutch East Indies*, trans. by Rev. B. J. Berrington, (London: Luzac, Batavia: Kolff, 1897)
- Benjamin, Walter, *Illuminations*, trans. by Harry Zohn (London: Jonathan Cape, 1970)
- Benson, Theodora, *In the East my Pleasure Lies* (London: William Heinemann, 1938)
- Berger, John, *Ways of Seeing* (London: BBC and Penguin Books, 1972)
- Bernard, Emily, ed., *Remember Me to Harlem* (New York: Vintage Books, 2002)
- Bernatzik, Hugo Adolf, *South Seas*, trans. by Vivian Ogilvie (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1935)
- Bhabha, Homi K., *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994)
- Bianpoen, Carla, 'Auction House Makes Name for itself in S'pore,' *The Jakarta Post*. Online. Available:
<http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20031228.F0119/12/2006>. 28 December 2006
- Birkett, Dea, *Spinster Abroad: Victorian Lady Explorers* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1989)
- Bissette, Stephen, *We are Going to Eat You! Third World Cannibal Movies and the Inside Story of Goona-Goona Films* (Wilmington, Vt: Spider Baby Grafix & Publications, 1990)
- Blanton, Casey, *Travel Writing: The Self and the World* (London: Twayne Publishers, 1997)
- Bond, Ralph, 'Cinema in the Thirties: Documentary Film and the Labour Movement', in *Culture and Crisis in Britain in the Thirties*, ed. by Jon Clark, Margot Heinemann, David Margolies and Carole Snee (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1979)
- Boon, James A., *The Anthropological Romance of Bali 1597-1972: Dynamic Perspectives in Marriage & Caste, Politics & Religion*, ed. by Clifford Geertz (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1977)
- Brittain, Vera, *Testament of Experience* (London: Virago, 1979)

- Browne, E. Janet, *Charles Darwin: Voyaging* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University, 1995)
- Bryant, Marsha, *Auden and Documentary in the 1930s* (Charlottesville, London: University of Virginia, 1997)
- Burden, William Douglas, *Dragon Lizards of Komodo: An Expedition to the Lost of the Dutch East Indies* (New York: Putnam, 1927)
- Burdett, Charles and Derek Duncan (eds.), *Cultural Encounters: European Travel Writing in the 1930s* (New York: Berghahn Books, 2002).
- Burgin, Victor, 'Photography, Phantasy, Function', in *Thinking Photography*, ed. by Victor Burgin (London: The Macmillan Press, 1982), pp. 177-219
- Burke, Kenneth, *A Grammar of Motives* (Berkeley: University of California, 1969)
- Callan, Hillary and Shirley Ardener, eds, *The Incorporated Wife* (London: Croom Helm, 1984)
- Carey, Peter, ed., *Voyage a Djocja-Karta en 1825: The Outbreak of the Java War (1825-30) as Seen by a Painter* (Paris: Association Archipel, 1988)
- Carpenter, Bruce W. and Maria Hofker-Reuter, *Willem Hofker, Painter of Bali* (Wijk en Aalburg: Pictures Publishers, 1994)
- Carpenter, Bruce W., *Emilio Ambron: An Italian Artist in Bali* (Singapore: Archipelago, 2001)
- Castle, Gregory, ed., *Postcolonial Discourses: An Anthology* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001)
- Catling, Jo, ed., *A History of Women's Writing: in Germany, Austria, and Switzerland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2000)
- Chambers, Iain and Lidia Curti, *The Post-Colonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons* (London and New York: Routledge, 1996)
- Chong, Yu-Chee, 'Covarrubias and the Art of Bali', in *Covarrubias in Bali*, ed. by Adriana Williams and Yu-Chee Chong (Singapore: Editions Didier Millet, 2005)
- Christie, Clive, J., 'British Literary Travellers in Southeast Asia in an Era of Colonial Retreat', *Modern Asian Studies*, 28 (1994), 673-737
- Clancy-Smith, Julia and Frances Gouda, *Domesticating the Empire: Race, Gender, and Family Life in French and Dutch Colonialism*

- (Charlottesville: University of Virginia, 1998)
- Clifford, James, 'On Ethnographic Allegory', in *Writing Culture: Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus, (Berkeley: University California, 1986)
- Clifford, James, and George E. Marcus, *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography* (Berkeley: University of California, 1986)
- Clifford, James, 'Travelling Cultures', in *Cultural Studies*, ed. by Lawrence Grossberg et. al. (New York: Routledge, 1992), pp. 96-116
- The Predicament of Culture Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art* (Cambridge: Harvard University, 1994)
- Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century* (Cambridge and London: Harvard University, 1997)
- Collier Jr., John and Malcolm Collier, *Visual Anthropology: Photography as Research Method* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico, 1990)
- Collingham, E. M., *Imperial Bodies: The Physical Experience of the Raj, c. 1800-1947* (Cambridge: Polity, 2001)
- Conrad, Joseph, *Heart of Darkness* (Harmondsworths: Penguin, 1973)
- Cornillon, Susan Koppelman, ed., *Images of Women in Fiction: Feminist Perspectives* (Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling Green University, 1973)
- Couperus, Louis, *The Hidden Force*, trans. by Alexander Teixeira de Mattos (Amherst: University of Massachusetts, 1992)
- Covarrubias, Miguel, *Island of Bali* (London: Cassell, 1937)
- Island of Bali* (Hongkong: Periplus, 1973)
- Cowling, Mary, *The Artist as Anthropologist: The Representation of Type and Character in Victorian Art* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1989)
- Cox, Beverly J, Miguel Covarrubias and Denna Jones Anderson, *Miguel Covarrubias Caricatures* (City of Washington: The Smithsonian Institution, 1985)
- Coxall, Helen, 'How Language Means: an Alternative View of Museums Text, in *Museum Languages: Objects and Texts*, ed. by Gaynor Kavanagh (Leicester: Leicester University, 1991), pp. 83-99
- Crick, Bernard, *George Orwell: A Life* (London: Penguin Books, 1992)

- Cunningham, R. A., *A History of R. A. Cunningham's Aborigines, Tattooed Canibal, Black Trackers and Boomerang Throwers* (London: Elliot, 1884)
- Cuthbert, Denise and Maryanne Dever, *Feminist Perspectives on Postcolonialism* (Harlow: Prentice Hall, 2000)
- Danes, Popo, 'Balinese Architecture from Cosmic to Modern', in *Bali Living in Two Worlds: A Critical Self-Portrait*, ed. by Urs Ramseyer and I Gusti Raka Panji Tisna (Basel: Schwabe, 2001)
- Darling, Diana, *The Painted Alphabet: A Novel based on a Balinese Tale* (Singapore: Periplus, 2000)
- de Keyser, Edouard, *L'Ile de Bali* (Paris: Duchartre et Van Buggenhoudt, 1930)
- L'Ile des Seins Nus* (Paris: Les Editions de France, 1933)
- de Zoete, Beryl and Walter Spies, *Dance and Drama in Bali* (London: Faber and Faber, 1938)
- Dance and Drama in Bali* (Hongkong: Periplus, 2002)
- Denis, Armand, *On Safari: The Story of My Life* (London: The Companion Book Club, 1964)
- Denis, Renee Roosevelt, *To Live in Paradise* (Fort Bragg, CA: Lost Coast, 1996)
- Derrida, Jacques, *The Ear of the Other: Otobiography, Transference, Translation*, ed. by Christie McDonald, trans. by Peggy Kamuf, (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska, 1985)
- Dhaimeler, D.H., Th. B. Van Lelyveld and Sapta Eka, *W. Dooijewaard, A Dutch Artist in Indonesia* (Jakarta: Aneka Pasti Raya, 1992)
- Dovidio, John F., Peter Glick, and Laurie A. Rudman, *On the Nature of Prejudice: Fifty Years after Allport* (Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2005)
- Eagleton, Terry, Fredric Jameson and Edward W. Said, *Nationalism, Colonialism and Literature* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1990)
- Eco, Umberto, *Experiences in Translation*, trans. by Alastair McEwen (Toronto: University of Toronto, 2001)
- Eddi, Santosa, 'HUT VOC ke-400: Berawal dari Penghianatan Anak Seorang Notaris', *Detik*. Online. Available: <http://www.detik.com>. 25 February 2002
- Edney, Matthew, *Mapping an Empire: The Geographical Construction of British*

- India 1765-1843* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1997)
- Edwards, Elizabeth, ed., *Anthropology and Photography 1860-1920* (New Haven: Yale University in Association with the Royal Anthropological Institute, 1992)
- Edwards, Elizabeth and Janice Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories on the Materiality of Images* (London: Routledge, 2005)
- Edwards, Elizabeth, *Raw Histories: Photographs, Anthropology and Museums* (Oxford: Berg, 2006)
- Edwards, Elizabeth, Chris Gosden and Ruth B. Phillips, *Sensible Objects: Colonialism, Museums and Material Culture* (Oxford: Berg, 2006)
- Elshtain, Jean Bethke, *Women and War* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1995)
- Erikson, Erik H., 'Gandhi's Autobiography: The Leader as a Child', *The American Scholar*, 35 (1966), 632-46
- Evans, Martin, *Empire and Culture: The French Experience 1830-1940* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004)
- Evans-Pritchard, E. E., *Introduction to Social Anthropology* (London: Cohen & West, 1951)
- Fabian, Johannes, *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes its Object* (New York: Columbia University, 1983)
- Fabricus, Johan, *Eiland der Demonen*, (Amsterdam: De Muiderkring, 1948)
- Fermor-Hesketh, Robert, *Architecture of the British Empire* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicholson, 1986)
- Findling, John E., *Historical Dictionary of World's Fairs and Expositions 1815-1988* (New York City: Greenwood Press, 1990)
- Finney, Brian, *The Inner I: British Literary Autobiography of the Twentieth Century* (London: Faber, 1985)
- Fort, Charles, *Wild Talents* (New York: Claude Kendall, 1932)
- Foster, Shirley, *Across New Worlds: Nineteenth-Century Women Travellers and Their Writings* (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1990)
- Foucault, Michel, *The History of Sexuality* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1990)

- Discipline and Punish* (London: Penguin, 1991)
- Frederick, William, *Indonesian Urban Society in Transition: Surabaya 1926-1946*, Ph.D. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1978
- Freeberg, David, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1991)
- Freeman, Derek, *Margaret Mead and Samoa: The Making and Unmasking of an Anthropological Myth* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, 1983)
- The Fateful Hoaxing of Margaret Mead: A Historical Analysis of Her Samoa Research* (Boulder, Colorado: Westview, 1999)
- Fulford, Tim and Peter J. Kitson, eds., *Travels, Explorations and Empires: Writings from the Era of Imperial Expansion 1770-1835, Vol 2 Southeast Asia* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2001)
- Fusco, Coco, *The Bodies That Were Not Ours: And Other Writings* (London: Routledge, 2001)
- Fussell, Paul, *Abroad: British Literary Travelling Between the Wars* (New York: Oxford University, 1980)
- Garrard, Mary D., *Artemisia Gentileschi: The Image of the Female Hero in Italian Baroque Art* (Princeton: Princeton University, 1989)
- Garrett, Greg, 'Relocating Burton: Public and Private Writings on Africa', *The Journal of African Travel-Writing*, 2, (1997), 70-79. Electronic. Available: <http://www.unc.edu/~ottotwo/burton.html>. 12 July 2005
- Geertz, Clifford, *Negara: The Theatre State in Nineteenth Century Bali* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University, c. 1980)
- Works and Lives: The Anthropologist as Author* (Cambridge: Polity, 1988)
- The Interpretation of Cultures* (London: Fontana, 1993)
- Geertz, Hildred, *Images of Power: Balinese Paintings Made for Gregory Bateson and Margaret Mead* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii, 1994)
- Ghose, Indira, ed., *Memsahibs Abroad: Writings by Women Travellers in Nineteenth Century India* (Delhi: Oxford University, 1998)
- Women Travellers in Colonial India: The Power of Female Gaze* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1999)

- Nineteenth-Century Travels, Explorations, and Empires: Writings from the Era of Imperial Consolidation, 1835-1910* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2003)
- Gilbert, Helen and Anna Johnston, eds., *In Transit: Travel, Text, Empire* (New York: PeterLang, 2000)
- Göçek, Fatma Müge, 'From Empire to Nation: Images of Women and War in Ottoman Political Cartoons, 1908-1923', in *Borderlines: Gender and Identities in War and Peace, 1870-1930*, ed. by Billie Melman (New York and London: Routledge, 1998)
- Goffman, Erving, *Gender Advertisements* (London: Macmillan, 1979)
- Goldberg, David Theo and Ato Quayson, *Relocating Postcolonialism* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002)
- Goldstein, Joshua S, *War and Gender: How Gender Shapes the War System and Vice Versa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2001)
- Gore, Georginia, 'Traditional Dance in West Africa', in *Dance History: An Introduction*, ed. by Janet Adshead – Lansdale and June Layson (New York: Routledge, 1994)
- Gorer, Geoffrey, *Africa Dances* (Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1935)
- The Americans: A Study in a National Character* (London: Cresset, 1948)
- The Life and Ideas of the Marquis de Sade* (London: Panther Books, 1963)
- Africa Dances* (Hardmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1983)
- Bali and Angkor: A 1930s Pleasure Trip Looking at Life and Death* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1987)
- Goris, Dr. R. and Walter Spies, *The Island of Bali: Its Religion and Ceremonies* (Batavia: G. Kolff, n.d.)
- Goris, Dr R. and Drs P. L. Dronkers, *Bali Atlas Kebudajaan/Cults and Customs Cultuurgeschiedenis in Beeld* (Jakarta: The Government of the Republic of Indonesia, n.d.)
- Gouda, Frances, *Dutch Culture Overseas: Colonial Practice in the Netherlands Indies 1900-1942* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University, 1995)
- Gough, Kathleen, 'New Proposals for Anthropologists', *Current Anthropology*, 9 (1968), 403-7

- Graham-Brown, Sarah, *Images of Women: The Portrayal of Women in Photography of the Middle East, 1860-1950* (New York: Columbia University, 1996)
- Grant, Madison, *The Passing of the Great Race, or The Racial Basis of European History* (New York: Schribner's, 1918)
- Grewal, Inderpal, *Home and Harem: Nation, Gender, Empire, and the Cultures of Travel* (London: Leicester University, 1996)
- Groeneveld, Anneke, et.al., *Toekang Potret: 100 Jaar Fotografie in Nederlands Indië 1839-1939/Toekang Potret: 100 Years of Photography in the Dutch Indies 1839-1939* (Rotterdam: Museum voor Volkenkunde, 1989)
- Grossberg, Lawrence, Cary Nelson and Paula Treichler, *Cultural Studies* (New York: Routledge, 1992)
- Guha, Ranajit, 'Not at Home in Empire', *Critical Inquiry*, 23, (1997), 482-93
- Gullick, J. M., *Adventures and Encounters: Europeans in South-East Asia* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1995)
- Haks, Leo and Steven Wachlin, *Indonesia: 500 Early Postcards* (Singapore: Star Standard Industries, 2004)
- Hall, Edward, T., Introduction to *Visual Anthropology: Photography as a Research Method* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico, 1990)
- Haney, Lynn, *Naked at the Feast: A Biography of Josephine Baker* (London: Robson, 1981)
- Hanna, Willard A., *Bali Profile: People, Events, Circumstances 1001-1976* (New York: American University Field Staff, 1976). Reprinted by Rumah Budaya Banda Naira Moluccas East Indonesia, Jakarta, 1990
- Headrick, Daniel R., *The Tools of Empire: Technology and European Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century* (New York: Oxford University, 1981)
- Hilda, Kuper, 'Colour, Categories and Colonialism: The Swazi Case', in *Introduction to Colonialism in Africa 1870-1960: Profiles of Change: African Society and Colonial Rule*, ed. by Victor Turner (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1971)
- Hitchcock, Michael, and Lucy Norris, *Bali the Imagining Museum: The Photographs of Walter Spies and Beryl de Zoete* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1995)

- Hollitzer, Annemarie, 'Painter in Paradise.' Online. Available: <http://www.asiafoto.com/article1.htm>. 10 July 2004.
- Holmes, Rachel Amanda, *Red, White and Blue Highways: British Travel Writing and the American Road Trip in the Late Twentieth Century*, Ph.D. thesis, University of Warwick, 2001
- hooks, bell, *Outlaw Culture: Resisting Representations* (New York: Routledge, 1994)
- Hooper-Greenhill, Eilean, *Museums and their Visitors* (London: Routledge, 1994)
- Howe, Nicholas, 'Places of Fear', *The Yale Review*, 88, (2000), 43-50
- 'Reading Places', *The Yale Review*, 81, (1993), 61-73
- Huggan, Graham, *The Postcolonial Exotic: Marketing the Margins* (London: Routledge, 2001)
- Hunter, Anne E., ed., *Genes and Gender VI: On Peace, War, and Gender: A Challenge to Genetic Explanations* (New York: The Feminist, 1991)
- Hutchinson, George, *The Harlem Renaissance in Black and White* (Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University, 1997)
- Irigaray, Luce, *Sexes and Genealogies*, trans. by Gillian C. Gill (New York: Columbia University, 1993)
- Jack, Gavin and Alison Phipps, *Tourism and Intercultural Exchange: Why Tourism Matters* (Clevedon: Channel View, 2007)
- Jacobs, Julius, *Eenigen Tijd onder de Baliërs. Eene Reisbesschrijving met Aanteekeningen Betreffende Hygiëne, Land-en Volkenkunde van de Eilanden Bali en Lombok* (Batavia: G. Kolff, 1883)
- Jedamski, Doris, *Images, Self-Images and the Perception of the Other: Women Travellers in the Malay Archipelago* (Centre for South-East Asia Studies: The University of Hull, 1995)
- Jensen, Gordon D. and Luh Ketut Suryani, *The Balinese People: A Reinvestigation of Character* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1993)
- Jordis, Christine, *Bali, Java in my Dreams*, trans. by Guido Waldman (London: The Harvill, 2002)
- Juliastuti, Nuraini, 'Classic Photographer Cephias Presents Beautiful Past', *The Jakarta Post*, 24 Juni 1999

- Jullian, Philippe, *The Orientalists: European Painters of Eastern Scenes*, trans. by Helga and Dinah Harrison (Oxford: Phaidon, 1977)
- Kabbani, Rana, *Europe's Myths of Orient: Devise and Rule* (London: MacMillan, 1986)
- Imperial Fictions: Europe's Myths of Orient* (London: Pandora, 1994)
- Kaes, Anton, Martin Jay and Edward Dimendberg, eds., *The Weimar Republic Source Book* (Berkeley: University of California, 1994)
- Kaplan, Caren, *Questions of Travel* (Durham and London: Duke University, 1996)
- Kaplan, E. Ann, *Looking for the Other: Feminism, Film and the Imperial Gaze* (New York: Routledge, 1977)
- Katan, David, *Translating Cultures: An Introduction for Translators, Interpreters and Mediators* (Manchester: St. Jerome, 1999)
- Katimansah, Eddy, *W. Dooijewaard, a Dutch Artist in Indonesia* (Jakarta: Aneka Pasti Raya, 1992)
- Kaus, Gina, 'The Woman in Modern Literature', in *The Weimar Republic Sourcebook*, ed. by Anton Kaes, Martin Jay and Edward Dimendberg (Berkeley: University of California, 1994)
- Kavanagh, Gaynor, ed., *Museum Languages: Objects and Texts*, (Leicester: Leicester University, 1991)
- King, Lynda J., *Best-Sellers by Design: Vicki Baum and the House of Ullstein* (Detroit: Wayne State University, 1988)
- Kitch, Sally, L., 'Does War have Gender?', in *Genes and Gender VI: On Peace, War, and Gender: A Challenge to Genetic Explanations*, ed. by Anne E. Hunter (New York: The Feminist, c. 1991)
- Koke, Louise G., *Our Hotel in Bali* (Singapore: Pepper Publications, 2001)
- Kol, H. G., *Drei maal dwads door Sumatra en Java, met zwerftochten doo Bali* (Rotterdam: Brusse, 1914)
- Korte, Barbara, *English Travel Writing from Pilgrimages to Postcolonial Explorations*, trans. by Catherine Matthias (Houndmills: MacMillan, 2000)
- Krause, Gregor, *Insel Bali Erster Teil: Land und Volk, Zweiter Teil: Tänze, Tempel, Feste* (Hagen: Folkwang, 1920)

- Bali: Volk, Land, Tänze, Feste, Tempel* (München: Georg München, 1926)
- Bali: La Population, le pays, les densés, les fetes, les temples, l'art*, trans. by L. Ningler (Paris: Duchartre et Van Buggenhoudt, 1930)
- Bali 1912: Photographs and Reports by Gregor Krause*, trans. by W. H. Mabbett (Singapore: January Books, 1988)
- Bali 1912: Photographs and Reports by Gregor Krause*, trans. by W. H. Mabbett (Singapore: Pepper Publications, 2001)
- and Karl With, *Bali: People and Art* (Bangkok: White Lotus, 2000)
- Krieger, Martin H., 'Truth and Pictures: "Fetishes", "Goodness", and "Clarity"', in *Images of Information: Still Photography in the Social Sciences*, ed. by Jon Wagner (London: Sage Publications, 1979)
- Landau, Paul S., and Deborah D. Kaspin, *Images and Empires: Visuality in Colonial and Postcolonial Africa* (Berkeley: University of California, 2002)
- Leask, Nigel, *British Romantic Writers and the East: Anxieties of Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1992)
- Curiosity and the Aesthetics of Travel Writing, 1770-1840* (Oxford: Oxford University, 2002)
- 'Legong of the Virgins', Milestonefilms. Electronic. Available: <http://www.milestonefilms.com/pdf/LegongPK.pdf> 14 August 2005
- Levey, Michael, *The Nude: Themes and Painters in the National Gallery* (London: National Gallery, 1976)
- Lévy-Bruhl, Lucien, *How Native Think*, trans. by Lilian A. Clare (Princeton, N J: Princeton University, 1985)
- Lewis, Reina, *Gendering Orientalism: Race, Femininity and Representation* (London: Routledge, 1996)
- Lim, Tan Poay, preface to *Bali 1912* (Singapore: Pepper Publications, 2001)
- Lindsey, Timothy, *The Romance of K'tut Tantri and Indonesia: Texts and Scripts, History and Identity* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1997)
- Lowe, Lisa, *Critical Terrains: French and British Orientalism* (Ithaca: Cornell University, 1991)

- Mabbett, W. H., introduction to *Bali 1912* (Singapore: January Books, 1988), pp. 7-14
- MacDougall, M., 'The Visual in Anthropology', in *Rethinking Visual Anthropology*, ed. by M. Banks and H. Morphy (London: Routledge, 1975)
- Malik, Adam, *In the Service of the Revolution* (Singapore: Gunung Agung, 1980)
- Mann, Richard, *400 Years and More of the British in Indonesia* (Great Britain: Gateway Books, 2004)
- Mansfields, Katherine, *Novels and Novelists* (London: Constable, 1930)
- Maxwell, Anne, *Colonial Photography & Exhibitions: Representations of the 'Native' and the Making of European Identities* (London: Leicester University, 2000)
- Mbembe, Achille, *On the Postcolony*, (Berkeley, California: University of California, 2001)
- McPhee, Colin, *A House in Bali* (Singapore: Periplus, 2002)
- Mead, Margaret, and Gregory Bateson, *Balinese Character: A Photographic Analysis* (New York: The New York Academy of Sciences, 1942)
- Mead, Margaret, *Letters from the Field 1925-1975* (New York: Perennial, 2001)
- Melman, Billie, *Women and the Popular Imagination in the Twenties: Flappers and Nymphs* (London: Macmillan Press, 1988)
- Women's Orient: Englishwomen and the Middle East 1718-1918*
Sexuality, Religion and Work (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1995)
- Borderlines: Gender and Identities in War and Peace, 1870-1930*
(New York: Routledge, 1998)
- Mews, Siegfried, 'Grass' Kopfgeburten: The Writer in Orwell's Decade', *German Studies Review*, 6 (1983), 501-17
- Midgley, Clare, ed., *Gender and Imperialism* (Manchester: Manchester University, 1998)
- Mill, James, *The History of British India* (London: Printed for Baldwin, Cradock and Joy, 1820)
- Miller, Nancy K., *Subject to Change: Reading Feminist Writing* (New York: Columbia University, 1988)

- Mills, Sara, *Discourses of Difference: an Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991)
- Mitchell, Timothy, *Colonising Egypt* (Berkeley: University of California, 1991)
- Mizejewski, Linda, *Ziegfried Girl, Image and Icon in Culture and Cinema* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University, 1999)
- Montefiore, Janet, *Men and Women Writers of the 1930s: The Dangerous Flood of History* (London: Routledge, 1996)
- Morgan, Susan, *Place Matters: Gendered Geography in Victorian Women's Travel Books about Southeast Asia* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University, 1996)
- Morton, Patricia A., *Hybrid Modernities: Architecture and Representation at the 1931 Colonial Exposition, Paris* (Cambridge, MA: MIT, 2000)
- Multatuli, *Max Havelaar or The Coffee Auctions of the Dutch Trading Company* (London: Penguin, 1987)
- Muret, Maurice, *The Twilight of the White Races* (London: Fisher Unwin, 1926)
- Nadel, Ira Bruce, *Biography: Fiction, Fact and Form* (New York: St. Martin's, 1984)
- Nelson, Katherine 'The Psychological and Social Origins of Autobiographical Memory.' *Psychologist Science*, 4 (1993), 7-14
- Neeno, Nancy, 'Femininity, the Primitive, and the Modern Space', *Women in the Metropolis: Gender and Modernity in Weimar Culture*, ed. by Katharina von Ankum (Berkeley: University of California, 1997)
- 'Netherlands Recognizes RI's Independence Date, *The Jakarta Post*, 16 August 2005. Online. Available: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20050816.%4003>. 16 August 2005
- Nieuwenhuys, Rob, *Mirror of the Indies: A History of Dutch Colonial Literature* (Singapore: Periplus, 1999)
- Nordstrom, Alison Devine, 'Persistent Images: Photographic Archives in Ethnographic Collections', *The Australian Journal of Media & Culture*, 6 (1991), n.p. Electronic. Available: <http://wwwmcc.murdoch.edu.au/ReadingRoom/6.2/Nordstrom.html>. 11 June 2005

- Northrop, F.S.C., *The Meeting of East and West: An Inquiry Concerning World Understanding* (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1946)
- Oey, Eric, ed., *Bali: Periplus Travel Guides* (Singapore: Periplus Editions, 1994)
- Oja, Carol J., *Colin McPhee: Composer in Two Worlds* (Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1990)
- Orwell, George, *Shooting an Elephant and Other Essays* (London: Secker & Warburg, 1950)
- Burmese Days* (London: Secker & Warburg, 1961)
- Osborne, Peter D., *Travelling Light: Photography Travel and Visual Culture* (Manchester: Manchester University, 2000)
- Pearson, Keith Ansell, Benita Parry and Judith Squires, *Cultural Readings of Imperialism: Edward Said and the Gravity of History* (London: Lawrence & Wishart, 1997)
- Peirce, Leslie P., *The Imperial Harem: Women and Sovereignty in the Ottoman Empire* (New York: Oxford University, 1993)
- Penniman, Gwendolen Brooks, *Goono-goono: A Tale of Magic in Java* (Los Galos, California: World Youth, 1951)
- Picard, Michel, *Bali: Cultural Tourism and Touristic Culture*, trans. by Diana Darling (Singapore: Archipelago, 1996)
- Pijbes, Win, 'The Artists of the Tropics: The Artists of the Future', *IIAS Newsletter*, 20. Online. Available: <http://www.iias.nl/iiasn/23/asianart/23ART1.html>. 10 March 2006
- Pink, Sarah, *Doing Visual Ethnography: Images, Media and Representation in Research* (London: Sage Publications, 2001)
- Pinney, Christopher, 'Underneath the Banyan Tree: William Crooke and Photographic Depictions of Caste', in *Anthropology Photography 1860-1920*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (New Haven: Yale University in association with the Royal Anthropological Institute, London, 1992), pp. 165-73
- Poignant, Roslyn, 'Surveying the Field of View: The Making of the RAI Photographic Collection', in *Anthropology Photography 1860-1920*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (New Haven: Yale University in association with the Royal Anthropological Institute, London, 1992), pp. 42-73
- Polezzi, Loredana, *Resiting Genre : A Study of Contemporary Italian Travel*

- Writing in English Translation*, Ph.D. thesis, University of Warwick. Centre for Translation and Comparative Cultural Studies, 1998.
- ‘Rewriting Tibet, Italian Travellers in English Translation’, *The Translator*, 2, (1998), 321-42
- ‘Between Gender and Genre: The Travels of Estella Canziani’, in *Perspectives on Travel Writing*, ed. by Glenn Hooper and Tim Youngs, pp. 121-137
- Poole, Deborah, *Vision, Race, and Modernity: A Visual Economy of the Andean Image World* (Princeton: Princeton University, 1997)
- Poortenaar, Jan, *An Artist in Java and Other Islands of Indonesia*, trans. by Horace Shipp (Singapore: Oxford University, 1989)
- Powell, E. Alexander, *Where the Strange Trails go down, Sulu, Celebes, Bali, Java, Sumatra, Straits Settlements, Malay States, Siam, Cambodia, Annam, Cochin-China* (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1921)
- Powell, Hickman, *The Last Paradise* (Singapore: Oxford University, 1985)
- Prakasa, Bintang, ‘Piano Recitals Trace Walter Spies’ Life and Times’, *The Jakarta Post*. Online. Available: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20030419.Q02>. 19 April 2003
- Pratt, Mary Louise, ‘Fieldwork in Common Places’, in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Berkeley: University of California, 1986), pp. 27-50
- Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992)
- Prochaska, David, *Making Algeria French: Colonialism in Bone 1870-1920* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2004)
- Quartermaine, Peter, ‘Johannes Lindt: Photographer of Australia and New Guinea’, in *Representing Others: White Views of Indigenous Peoples*, ed. by Mick Gidley (Exeter: University of Exeter, 1994)
- Rabinow, Paul, ‘Representations Are Social Facts: Modernity and Post Modernity in Anthropology’, in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. by James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Berkeley: University of California, 1986)
- Radley, Alan, ‘Boredom, Fascination and Mortality: Reflections upon the Experience of Museum Visiting’, in *Museum Languages: Objects and*

- Texts*, ed. by Gaynor Kavanagh (Leicester: Leicester University, 1991), pp. 63-82
- Raffles, Sir Thomas Stamford, *The History of Java* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1817). Electronic. Available: <http://galenet.galegroups.com/servlet/MOME>. 28 November 2006
- Rajan, Rajeswari Sunder, *Real & Imagined Women: Gender, Culture and Postcolonialism* (London and New York: Routledge, 1993)
- Ramamurthy, Anandi, 'Constructions of Illusions: Photography and Commodity Culture', in *Photography: A Critical Introduction*, ed. by Liz Wells (London: Routledge, 1997), pp. 151-98
- Rampersad, Arnold, *The Life of Langston Hughes: 1902-1941, I, Too, Sing America Vol. 1* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1986)
- The Life of Langston Hughes: 1941-1967, I Dream a World Vol. 2* (Oxford: Oxford University, 1988)
- Ramseyer, Urs and I Gusti Raka Panji Tisna, *Bali Living in Two Worlds: A Critical Self-Portrait* (Basel: Schwabe, 2001)
- Redfield, James W., *Comparative Physiognomy or Resemblances between Men and Animals* (New York: Redfield, 1852)
- Reed, Jane Levy, ed., *Towards Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed* (San Francisco: The Friends of Photography, 1991)
- Rhodus, Hans and John Darling, ed. by John Stowell, *Walter Spies and Balinese Art* (Amsterdam: Tropical Museum, 1980)
- Richards, Jeffrey, 'Modernism and the People: the View from the Cinema Stalls', in *Rewriting the Thirties: Modernism and After*, ed. by Keith Williams and Steven Matthews (London: Longman, 1997), pp. 182-201
- Imperialism and Juvenile Literature* (Manchester: Manchester University, 1989)
- Ricklefs, M.C., *A History of Modern Indonesia since c. 1200* (Palgrave: Macmillan, 2001)
- Ripley, William Z., *The Races of Europe* (London: Paul, 1899)
- Robertson, George, Melinda Mash, Lisa Tickner, Jon Bird, Barry Curtis and Tim Putnam, *Travellers' Tales: Narratives of Home and Displacement* (London: Routledge, 1994)

- Robinson, Geoffrey, *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1998).
- Rony, Fatimah Tobing, *The Third Eye: Race, Cinema, and Ethnographic Spectacle* (Durham: Duke University, 1996)
- Rose, Phyllis, *Jazz Cleopatra: Josephine Baker in her Time* (London: Vintage, 1991)
- Ruhe, Alfred Hornung Ernstpeter, *Postcolonialism & Autobiography* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1998)
- Rushton, J. Phillippe, Race is More than Just Skin Deep: a Psychologist's View, *Mankind Quarterly*, 39 (1998), n.p. 19p. Online. Available: http://www.geocities.com/race_articles/rushton_view_race.html?200619. 19 December 2006
- Said, Edward W., *Culture and Imperialism* (London: Vintage, 1994)
- Orientalism* (London: Penguin, 2003)
- Sardar, Ziauddin, *Orientalism* (Buckingham: Open University, 1999)
- Saylor, Henry H., *Bungalows* (Philadelphia: John C. Winston, 1911)
- Scalliet, Marie-Odette, et. al., *Pictures from the Tropics: Paintings by Western Artists during the Dutch Colonial Period in Indonesia* (Amsterdam: Pictures Publishers - Royal Tropical Institute, 1999)
- Scharf, Aaron, *Art and Photography* (Middlesex: Penguin, 1974)
- Scherer, Joanna C., 'The Photographic Document: Photographs as Primary Data in Anthropological Enquiry', in *Anthropology and Photography 1860-1920*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (New Haven: Yale University, in association with the RAI London, 1992)
- Schulze, Fedor, *West Java Traveller's Guide for Batavia and from Batavia to the Preanger Regencies and Tjilatjap* (Batavia: Visser, 1894)
- Schweizer, Bernard, *Radicals on the Road: The Politics of English Travel Writing in the 1930s* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia, 2001)
- Scidmore, E. R., *Java: The Garden of the East* (Singapore: Oxford University, 1998)
- Scott, Walter, *Ivanhoe, A Romance* (London: Archibald Constable, 1820)
- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky, *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial*

- Desire* (New York: Columbia University, 1985)
- Seymour-Smith, Martin and Andrew C. Kimmens, eds, *World Authors 1900-1950* (New York: H.W. Wilson, 1955)
- Shavit, David, *Bali and the Tourist Industry: A History, 1906-1942* (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarlan, 2003)
- Simpson, Paul, *Language, Ideology and Point of View* (London: Routledge, 1993)
- Sitompul, Jojor Ria, *Consuming 'Glamour': A Case Study of 'Britain's First Magazine for Truly 21st Century Women*, M.A. dissertation, University of Warwick, 2001
- Smith, Sidonie, *A Poetics of Women's Autobiography: Marginality and Fictions of Self-Representation* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1987)
- Snell-Hornby, Mary, 'Communicating in the Global Village: On Language, Translation and Cultural Identity', in *Translation in the Global Village*, ed. by Christina Schäffner (Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, c.2000)
- Sontag, Susan, *On Photography* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1978)
- Under the Sign of Saturn* (London: Writers and Readers, 1983)
- Spacks, Patricia Meyer, *The Female Imagination: A Literary and Psychological Investigation of Women's Writing* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1976)
- Spengemann, William C., *The Forms of Autobiography: Episodes in The History of A Literary Genre* (New Haven: Yale University, 1980)
- Spruit, Ruud, *Artists on Bali* (Amsterdam: The Pepin, 1995)
- Stanley, Liz, *The Auto/biographical I: The Theory and Practice of Feminist Auto/biography* (Manchester: Manchester University, 1995)
- Stasz, Clarice, 'The Early History of Visual Sociology', in *Images of Information: Still Photography in the Social Sciences*, ed. by Jon Wagner (London: Sage Publications, 1979)
- Stedman, John Gabriel, 'Joanna or The Female Slave: A West Indian Tale', (London: Printed for Lupton Relfe, 1824) in *The Making of the Modern World*. Electronic. Available:
<http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/MOME?dd=0&af=RN&locID=warwick&srchtp=a&c=1&ste=11&d4=0.33&stp=Author&dc=flc&docNum=U104575929&ae=U104575929&tiPG=1&an=19010234500800>
 26 November 2006

- Narrative of a Five Year's Expedition Against the Revolted Negroes of Surinam* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts, 1972)
- Stepanides, Stephanos and Susan Basnett, eds, *Beyond the Floating Islands* (COTEPR: University of Bologna, 2002)
- Stevens, MaryAnne, ed., *The Orientalists, Delacroix to Matisse: European Painters in North Africa and the Near East* (London: Royal Academy of Arts Catalogue published in association with Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1984)
- Stevenson, Catherine Barnes, *Victorian Women Travel Writers in Africa* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1982)
- Stewart, Susan, *On Longing: Narratives of the Miniature, the Gigantic, the Souvenir, the Collection* (Durham: Duke University, 1993)
- Stieglitz, Alfred, *The Complete Illustrations 1903 – 1917* (Köln: Benedikt Taschen Verlag, 1997)
- Stoddard, Lothrop, *The Rising Tide of Colour 22* (London: Chapman and Hall: 1922)
- Stoler, Ann Laura, *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault's 'History of Sexuality' and the Colonial Order of Things* (Durham, NC: Duke University, 1995)
- Stowell, John, 'Walter Spies: The Artist as Photographer', in *Toward Independence: a Century of Indonesia Photographed*, ed. by Jane Levy Reed (San Francisco: The Friends of Photography, 1991)
- Suleri, Sara, *The Rhetoric of English India* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1992)
- Sullivan, Gerald, *Margaret Mead, Gregory Bateson, and Highland Bali: Fieldwork Photographs of Bayung Gedé, 1936-1939* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1999)
- Surat-Surat Perjanjian Antara Keradjaan-Keradjaan Bali/Lombok Dengan Pemerintah Hindia Belanda 1841 s/d 1938* (Djakarta: Arsip Nasional, 1964)
- Suryani, Tri Vivi, 'Antonio Blanco's Heritage Secure in Unique Museum', *The Jakarta Post*. Online. Available: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/yesterdaydetail.asp?fileid=20030220.P02>. 11 July 2004
- Szekely, Ladislao, *Tropic Fever: The Adventures of a Planter in Sumatera*, trans.

- by Marion Saunders (Singapore: Oxford University, 1989)
- Tagg, John, *The Burden of Representation: Essays of Photographies and Histories* (Houndmills: Palgrave, 2002)
- Tantri, K'tut, *Revolt in Paradise* (London: William Heinemann, 1960)
- Revolusi di Nusa Damai*, trans. by Maj. Abd. Bar Salim (Jakarta: Gunung Agung, 1965)
- Revolusi di Nusa Damai*, trans. by Agus Setiadi (Jakarta: Gramedia, 2006)
- Tarling, Nicholas, *Imperialism in South East Asia: A Fleeting Passing Phase* (London: Routledge, 2001)
- Tchen, John Kuo Wei, *New York before China Town: Orientalism and the Shaping of American Culture 1776-1882* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University, 1999)
- Teague, Ken and Michael Hitchcock, *Souvenirs: the Material Culture of Tourism* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2000)
- ten Kate, Jeannette, 'Painting in a Garden of Eden', in *Pictures from the Tropics: Paintings by Western Artists during the Dutch Colonial Period in Indonesia*, ed. by Marie-Odette Scalliet, et. al., (Amsterdam: Pictures Publishers – Royal Tropical Institute, 1999), pp. 129-140
- Teng, Emma Jinhua, *Taiwan's Imagined Geography: Chinese Colonial Travel Writing and Pictures, 1683-1895* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2004)
- Teo, Hsu-Ming, 'Femininity, Modernity, and Colonial Discourse', in *In Transit: Travel, Text, Empire*, ed. by Helen Gilbert and Anna Johnston (New York: Peter Lang, 2000)
- 'The New Pictures'. *TIME Magazine* Archive Article. 26 September 1932. Electronic. Available: <http://time-proxy.yaga.com/time/magazine/article/qpass/0,10987,744454,00.html?tick> ... 14 August 2005
- The Oxford English Dictionary*, 6 (London: Oxford University, 1961)
- Thomas, Nicholas, *Colonialism's Culture: Anthropology, Travel and Government* (Cambridge, UK: Polity, 1994)
- Tucker, Herbert F., *A Companion to Victorian Literature & Culture* (Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1999)

- Turner, Victor, ed., *Introduction to Colonialism in Africa 1870-1960, Profiles of Change: African Society and Colonial Rule* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1971)
- Colonialism in Africa 1870-1960 Vol 3, *Profiles of Change: African Society and Colonial Rule* (Cambridge: The University, 1971)
- Urry, John, *The Tourist Gaze: Leisure and Travel in Contemporary Societies* (London: Sage Publications, 1990)
- Consuming Places* (London: Routledge, 1995)
- Vaizey, Marina, *The Artist as Photographer* (London: Sidgwick and Jackson, 1928)
- Van Brakel, Koos, 'For Evidently, the Fine Arts do not Thrive in the Indies', in *Pictures from the Tropics: Paintings by Western Artists during the Dutch Colonial Period in Indonesia*, ed. by Marie-Odette Scalliet, et.al. (Amsterdam: Pictures Publishers, 1999)
- Van der Kraan, Alfons, *Bali at War: A History of the Dutch-Balinese Conflict of 1846-1849* (Clayton: Monash University, Centre of Southeast Asian Studies, 1995)
- Van Schendel, Willem, 'A Politics of Nudity: Photographs of the 'Naked Mru' of Bangladesh', in *Modern Asian Studies*, 2 (2002) 341-74
- Vendryes, Margaret Rose, 'Casting Féral Benga: A Biography of Richmond Barthé's Signature Work', *Masters of African American Art*, June 2003 Online. Journal of Publications by Professional Scholars Grant Recipient). Available:
http://www.anyonecanflyfoundation.org/library/Vendryes_on_Barthe_essay.html. 17 July 2005
- Venn, Couze, *Occidentalism: Modernity and Subjectivity* (London: Sage, 2000)
- Vickers, Adrian, 'Thilly Weissenborn: The Romance of the Indies', in *Toward Independence: A Century of Indonesia Photographed*, ed. by Jane Levy Reed (San Francisco: The Friends of Photography, 1991), pp. 79-85
- 'Colonial Era: Conquests and Dutch Colonial Rule', in *Bali: Periplus Travel Guide*, ed. by Eric Oey (Singapore: Periplus, 1994)
- Travelling to Bali: Four Hundred Years of Journeys* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1994)
- Bali: A Paradise Created* (Singapore: Periplus Editions, 1996)

- Bali een Gecreëerd Paradijs* (Nieuwegein: Signature, 1997)
- von Ankum, Katharina, ed., *Women in the Metropolis: Gender and Modernity in Weimar Culture* (Berkeley: University of California, 1997)
- Vries, Dirk de, *Gordel van Smaragd* (Amsterdam: Uitgeverij Contact, 1946)
- Wagner, Jon, ed., *Images of Information: Still Photography in the Social Sciences* (Beverly Hills: Sage, 1979)
- Wahyudi S, Leo, 'VOC: a Sore Memory 400 Years after', *The Jakarta Post*, 20 March 2002
- Wall, Cheryl A., *Women of the Harlem Renaissance* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1995)
- Walter, Serge, Mitchell Parish, Lou Leaman and Dasnee, *Goona-goona: A Balinese Love Song* (New York: Mills Music, 1933)
- Weber, Charlotte, 'Unveiling Scheherazade: Feminist Orientalism in the International Alliance of Women, 1911-1950', *Feminist Studies*, 27 (2001), 125-57
- Weissenborn, Thilly and Ernst Drissen, *Vastgelegd voor Later: Indische Foto's (1917-1942) van Thilly Weissenborn* (Amsterdam: Sijthoff, 1983)
- Werner-Birkenbach, Sabine, 'Trends in Writing by Women 1910-1933', in *A History of Women's Writing: in Germany, Austria, and Switzerland*, ed. by Jo Catling (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 2000), pp. 128-145
- Whorf, Benjamin Lee, *Language, Thought and Reality* (Cambridge, MA: MIT, 1974)
- Wiener, Margaret J., *Visible and Invisible Realms: Power, Magic, and Colonial Conquest in Bali* (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1995)
- Williams, Adriana, *Covarrubias* (Austin: University of Texas, 1994)
- and Yu-Chee Chong, *Covarrubias in Bali* (Singapore: Editions Didier Millet, 2005)
- Winius, George, Pieter Emmer and Dirk Kolff (eds.), 'The Heyday of Colonial: Rule India and Indonesia from the 1830s to 1914', *Itinerario* 11, 1 (1987) (Leiden: Grafaria, 1987)
- Witton, Ron, 'The Romance of K'tut Tantri', *Inside Indonesia*, 52 (1997) n.p. Electronic. Available: <http://www.insideindonesia.org/edit52/ktut.htm>. 30 December 2002

- Worth, Robert F. 'Nigger Heaven and the Harlem Renaissance', *African American Review*, 29 (1995), 461-473. Online. Available: 4783%28199523%2929%3A3%3C461%3ANHATHR%3E2.). CO%3B2-4. 15 February 2005
- Yalom, Reid Samuel, *Colonial Noir: Photographs from Mexico* (Stanford: Stanford University, 2004)
- Yates, Helen Eva, *Bali, The Enchanted Isle* (Weltevreden: KPM, n.d.)
- Bali: Enchanted Isle – A Travel Book* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1933)
- Yegenoglu, Meyda, *Colonial Fantasies: Towards a Feminist Reading of Orientalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1998)
- Young, Robert, *Colonial Desire, Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race* (London: Routledge, 1995)
- Youngs, Tim, *Travellers in Africa: British Travelogues, 1850-1900* (Manchester: Manchester University, 1994)
- Zandvliet, Kees, *The Dutch Encounter with Asia 1600-1950* (Rijksmuseum Amsterdam: Waanders Publishers Zwolle, 2004)
- Zobel, Myron, 'An Inn in Klungkung', in *Travelling to Bali: Four Hundred Years of Journeys*, compiled and introduced by Adrian Vickers (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University, 1994), pp. 191-99
- Zweers, Ineke, 'Commercial Photography', in *Toekang Potret: 100 Jaar Fotografie in Nederlands Indië 1839-1939/Toekang Potret: 100 Years of Photography in the Dutch Indies 1839-1939*, ed. by Groeneveld, Anneke, et.al. (Rotterdam: Museum voor Volkenkunde, 1989), pp. 53-118
- Zytaruk, George T. and James T. Boulton, eds, *The Letters of D. H. Lawrence, Vol 2, June 1913-October 1916* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1982)

- Robinson, Geoffrey, *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1998).
- Rony, Fatimah Tobing, *The Third Eye: Race, Cinema, and Ethnographic Spectacle* (Durham: Duke University, 1996)
- Rose, Phyllis, *Jazz Cleopatra: Josephine Baker in her Time* (London: Vintage, 1991)
- Ruhe, Alfred Hornung Ernstpeter, *Postcolonialism & Autobiography* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1998)
- Rushton, J. Phillippe, Race is More than Just Skin Deep: a Psychologist's View, *Mankind Quarterly*, 39 (1998), n.p. 19p. Online. Available: http://www.geocities.com/race_articles/rushton_view_race.html?200619. 19 December 2006
- Said, Edward W., *Culture and Imperialism* (London: Vintage, 1994)
- Orientalism* (London: Penguin, 2003)
- Sardar, Ziauddin, *Orientalism* (Buckingham: Open University, 1999)
- Saylor, Henry H., *Bungalows* (Philadelphia: John C. Winston, 1911)
- Scalliet, Marie-Odette, et. al., *Pictures from the Tropics: Paintings by Western Artists during the Dutch Colonial Period in Indonesia* (Amsterdam: Pictures Publishers - Royal Tropical Institute, 1999)
- Scharf, Aaron, *Art and Photography* (Middlesex: Penguin, 1974)
- Scherer, Joanna C., 'The Photographic Document: Photographs as Primary Data in Anthropological Enquiry', in *Anthropology and Photography 1860-1920*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (New Haven: Yale University, in association with the RAI London, 1992)
- Schulze, Fedor, *West Java Traveller's Guide for Batavia and from Batavia to the Preanger Regencies and Tjilatjap* (Batavia: Visser, 1894)
- Schweizer, Bernard, *Radicals on the Road: The Politics of English Travel Writing in the 1930s* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia, 2001)
- Scidmore, E. R., *Java: The Garden of the East* (Singapore: Oxford University, 1998)
- Scott, Walter, *Ivanhoe, A Romance* (London: Archibald Constable, 1820)
- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky, *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial*