

Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository: https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/84272/

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Smith, Thomas Aneurin ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7221-1868 2014. The student is not the fisherman: temporal displacement of young people's identities in Tanzania. Social and Cultural Geography 7, pp. 786-811. 10.1080/14649365.2014.926562 file

Publishers page: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14649365.2014.926562 http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14649365.2014.926562

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies.

See

http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



information services gwasanaethau gwybodaeth

1

The student is not the fisherman: temporal displacement of young people's identities in Tanzania.

Thomas Aneurin Smith

Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, S10 2TN, United Kingdom.

Email: <u>t.smith@sheffield.ac.uk</u>

To cite this article: Thomas Aneurin Smith (2014) The student is not the fisherman: temporal displacement of young people's identities in Tanzania, *Social & Cultural Geography*, 15:7, 786-811, DOI: 10.1080/14649365.2014.926562

Abstract

This paper examines how young Tanzanians have their identities as environmental actors displaced into the future by local adults, teachers, educational institutions and teaching materials which seek to educate them about environmental sustainability and conservation. Whilst there has been considerable attention to young people's agency in reproducing their own identities, I argue here that the temporal displacement of young identities operates through a network of interlinked structures which act on young people's lives, including the identity work of young people themselves. Educational material produced by Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), and the discursive work of adults, both seek to position young people as having agency to act in and make decisions about the environment at an undetermined time in the future. Young people themselves can perform different identities within the space of the school and in the community or family, yet they may also understand their own identities as only having agency at a temporally distant point. The displacement of young identities has important implications for pedagogy which relates to environmental education, and for how the reproduction of young people's identities is conceptualised.

Key words

Identity, Young People, Education, Environment, Tanzania, Institutions

1. Introduction

This paper explores how young people's identities as environmental actors are temporally displaced, imagined in the future rather than in the present, by an array of intersecting structures operating at a range of scales, as well as by young people themselves. Through a study of an environmental education project in three communities in Tanzania, I reflect on how young people's identities are structured by and through the institutional time-space of the school, and consider the consequences of this temporal displacement of identity for young people's actions in their local environment.

To address this spatio-temporal reproduction of identities, I draw on literature which has examined young people's agency in producing their own subjectivities alongside work which has reflected on processes which structure young identities. Some contemporary work in childhood studies and children's geographies has sought to highlight young people's autonomous agency (Tisdall & Punch 2012), whilst others have explored the societal and material influences on young identities in both Majority and Minority World contexts (Dyson 2010; Hyams 2000; Sutton 2009). I draw on renewed attention to the role of educational institutions (Ansell 2002; Hammett 2009; Jeffrey et al. 2004; Jeffrey 2010a) to analyse their role in the temporal displacement of young identities.

I illustrate how globalised knowledges of environmental sustainability represented in educational materials, local conceptions of young people's roles as environmental actors, and young people's own identity performances, all work to position young identities as environmental actors in the future, when they are adults. This is despite young people's

obvious material agency as environmental actors in Tanzania, yet I argue this positioning may reassert their lack of decision-making power and thus reproduce the dominance of adults in everyday life. I underline the importance of considering young identities for educational policy, practice, and further research in understanding and enabling young people as environmental actors.

1.1 Identity and young people

Geographers have explored the intersections between identity, space and place for some time and in some depth (Parr & Philo 1995). If the performance and (re)production of identities takes place through social relations and in particular spaces (Van Blerk 2005), then Geographers are well placed to provide reflection on how identities are embedded through the spaces and timings of everyday lives. Geographers have illustrated how identity may be fractured, messy and fluid, disrupting ideas of identity as bounded and fixed (Pile & Thrift 1995). Such exploration has also revealed the dialectic processes through which identities and places are constructed (Holloway et al. 2000).

Yet how identities are shaped during childhood and youth, particularly for young people in the Majority World, has received comparatively less interest from Geographers until more recently. Study of the Geographies of young people emerged as a subdiscipline in the late 1980s, and since the early 2000s there has been recognition that young people's lives in the Majority World need distinct attention (Dyson 2008). Young people in the Majority World often lead quite different lives to their counterparts in the Minority World. Many make considerable contributions to household livelihoods (Katz 2004), and can take very different transitions towards adulthood (Müller 2006; Punch 2004). If childhood is a rich site for the study of identity (Sutton 2009), then the different experiences of those in the Majority and

Minority World may result in quite different performances, productions and formations of identity.

Geographers are also well positioned to consider the broader processes which impact on young people's identities in the Majority World, particularly those associated with globalisation. Studies by Katz (2004), Jeffrey (2010a) and Aitken (2007) have illustrated how young lives are being transformed by the processes of global economic restructuring, whilst Hammett (2009) examines the intersection of global and local cultures and young people's identity performances. These studies illustrate that the lives of young people offer a lens through which to better understand networks of global and local processes.

One of the key challenges for the study of young people's identities, and their lives, is to understand the myriad of networks and entanglements between young people's agency and the societal structures which impact on their life choices. This is a very old question about the role of structure and agency in attempts to understand the position of the individual in the world (Pile & Thrift 1995), yet it takes on an important meaning when considering the ways in which young people form their identities within society. The emergence of a new sociology of childhood in the 1990s asserted the importance of understanding young people as social actors who have agency (Punch & Tisdall 2012), rather than passive subjects of social structures. Yet this new celebration of young people's agency has neglected the role of society, institutions, and indeed geographies in shaping young identities.

1.2 Agency and identity

Studies of childhood have illustrated that young people are independent social actors (Porter et al. 2012), and there is now a plethora of analysis which valorises the agency of young people in constructing their own subjectivities (Konstantoni 2012). For example, in the Minority World, young people perform their own identities in relation to perceptions of class

and wealth (Sutton 2009). In the Majority World, young people's agency is perhaps more materially apparent as they are commonly key social and economic actors, with the capacity to contribute significantly to livelihoods and to transform human and natural landscapes (Katz 1991; Katz 2004). As such, studies of young people's agency and their identities in the Majority World have disrupted notions of childhood from the Minority World which suggest that childhood is a protected stage in the life course (Dyson 2008). Young people in the Majority World shape their own identities as political actors (Jeffrey et al. 2004), and through engaging in cultural productions (Hammett 2009). Yet there has not been enough attention to cross-cultural similarities between notions of childhood agency in Majority and Minority World contexts, and it is these similarities which will be interrogated later in this paper.

Young people's agency and identity formation can extend beyond their own subjectivities to interact with, and act upon, those of others. Young people can construct the identities of others, whilst also identifying themselves against others (Sutton 2009). Their identities may be closely linked to a group (Thompson & Philo 2004), and in the Majority World both Dyson (2010) and Jeffrey (2010a) have demonstrated how identity building can allow young people to establish friendship, solidarity and belonging with others, creating opportunities for collective action. Young people are capable of rapidly adapting their identity. Van Blerk (2005) illustrates that for Ugandan street children, the fluidity and adaptability of identity can, in some cases, contribute to coming out of street life, in others allowing them to survive on the street, suggesting how fluid identities may be empowering.

The exercise of young people's agency in constructing fluid identities is closely linked to space. Holloway et al. (2000) have shown that young people can reproduce particular forms of gendered identity within different classroom environments, attributing different meanings to different time-spaces and microgeographies which are linked specifically to how identities are performed. Young people may perform quite different

identities in informal spaces outside of adult institutions and care, and may interpret and use spaces differently from adults (Thompson & Philo 2004), shaping distinctive identities in accordance with place (Van Blerk 2005). These studies illustrate the significance of conceptualising the link between space, place and identity through the lens of young people's identity performances. They also raise questions regarding to what extent young people either resist or accommodate the roles which are inscribed on them through particular spaces.

Highlighting young people's agency might imply that they can 'resist' dominant norms, however more nuanced analysis, to which I also aim to contribute to in this paper, suggests that young people are capable of both resisting and accommodating societal and cultural influences simultaneously (Hammett 2009). Others have shown that whilst young people may choose to transgress social norms, they rarely offer outright resistance to them (Dyson 2008; Jeffrey et al. 2004), and may at times reinforce societal norms or use identity performances as a means to control others (Dyson 2010).

1.3 Structuring young identities

Despite moves to stress young people's agency, there is still need for a nuanced understanding of how the social and material worlds in which young people live structure their identities. This is in part because the focus on autonomous agency risks endorsing the significance of the independent human subject at the expense of distinguishing the importance of structural and relational processes, as well as social interdependencies (Konstantoni 2012), in effect, how identities are influenced from without, as well as from within (Parr & Philo 1995). Equally, young people remain a socially marginalised group in terms of their agency and participation in public life. As Porter et al. (2012: 131) suggest,

"Despite the widespread promotion of children's voices by activists and policy makers in recent years, the potential for young people's knowledge to impact on adult agendas and policy arenas remains less than certain."

Thus despite considerable scholarly efforts to emphasise young people's agency in forming their own identities, young people remain somewhat marginalised by the social and material structures of society.

Societal culture, labelling and stereotyping can have an important influence on young people's identities. Sutton (2009) discusses how societal labelling of children as 'rich' or 'poor' may profoundly influence how they perceive their own identities and those of others. Daily personal interactions with adults may contribute to how young people build their own subjectivities. Hyams (2000) illustrates that normative gendered sexual identities may be reproduced in forms of media, school regulations and curricula, which act on how young people understand and perform their own identities. It is important then to consider how young people's identities are constructed relationally and intergenerationally, not only simply conforming to or resisting norms, but also through interdependent relationships. Young people may move in and out of relative positions of dependency and autonomy in relation to adults and other young people, highlighting how diverse forms of relationships are inherently complex (Konstantoni 2012), and may have ambiguous impacts on identities. How identities are performed relationally is not done free of power. As Thomas (2000) suggests, it is important to recognise that young people's spaces and relationships are structured by adults, and that as such they have limited authority over the conditions in which they live.

In the Majority World, the scope for education to influence young identities may be governed by parents' attitudes to formal education. Local inequalities between adults can pervade youth culture (Dyson 2008), such that young people may actively appropriate adult

roles, and seek to meet adult expectations (Dyson 2010). Global changes have acted on young people throughout the Majority World, including economic restructuring which has implications for their work (Aitken 2007; Katz 2004). Local and regional structural forces may also be significant, for example, Punch (2004) suggests that local seasonal patterns of work can limit young people's access to schooling. Yet the significant contribution of young people to family and adult livelihoods in the Majority World highlights their interdependencies (Konstantoni 2012), rather than simply reifying their agency or subsuming their identity performances under the overbearing weight of structural forces.

Space intersects with and structures young people's identity performances, and it is not uncommon in young people's lives for these spaces to be both designed, and controlled by adults (Thompson & Philo 2004). Space itself can frame the formation of human subjects and the construction of childhood identities (Parr & Philo 1995; Philo 2003), as Van Blerk (2005) illustrates in reference to street children in Uganda, who adapt their identities to specific norms associated with particular places, or as Sutton (2009) describes with reference to young people in the UK, whose experience of space is partly structured by family income and the school they attend. Young people may also perform identities quite differently in spaces beyond adult control (Dyson 2008; Dyson 2010), countering perhaps the marginalisation they experience in adult spaces.

1.4 Education, institutions and identity

Geographers have shown a renewed interest in institutions and how they shape both wider geographies and individual identities since the late 1990s (Holloway et al. 2000). One of the most significant institutional spaces which many young people experience is the school. Institutions and the practices within them not only contain particular subjects, but also actively create them (Pile & Thrift 1995), and the school can therefore institutionalise and

control spatial practices and identity performances, often reinforcing societal norms on the identities and bodily performances of young people (Hyams 2000). If "schools are places ultimately designed to make children lose their childhood" (Philo 2003, 12), then schooling can structure how young people develop their own identities, where they 'learn' to become adults. Just as mental institutions are sites where individuals learn to perform and be 'mad' (Parr and Philo 1995), so might the school be a space in which young people learn to fit the norms of the student and youth. Although schools might be understood as distinct, somewhat removed spaces, with their own distinctive sets of norms and practices, they are also embedded within, and porous to, the context of everyday life (Ansell 2002; Holloway et al. 2000). In order to critically assess the renewed interest in young people's agency, I will seek to illustrate in this paper how schools may provide their own spatiality with their own norms, yet these variably intersect with spaces, and adult norm-setting, outwith the school.

Young people have limited control over the institution of the school, just as they have limited control over other spaces which shape their identities (Thomas 2000). As Ansell (2002) discusses, critical pedagogy approaches have recognised that formal education tends to reinforce dominant ideologies through reproducing dominant knowledge. During the day-to-day life of the school, young people are subjected to normalising practices (Hyams 2000), through school codes of conduct, through curriculum and textbooks, and through informal interactions between teachers and pupils (Jeffrey et al. 2004). School can discipline forms of identity expression and performance, and may foster social reproduction rather than or alongside social change (Müller 2006).

School is therefore an arena where identities are shaped, however critical pedagogy approaches tend to be unhelpful in positing young people as either reproducing or resisting hegemonic norms. Discourses produced in schools may be appropriated by young people in production of their own identities (Ansell 2002). Young people can create their own spaces

within institutions (Thomas 2000), using spaces within the school to experiment with identities which would be difficult to express amongst familiar adults (Hyams 2000). Young people also deploy their education as a form of cultural capital (Müller 2006), and in the context of the Majority World young people have appropriated educated identities as sources of individual dignity, which may empower underprivileged groups (Jeffrey et al. 2004).

As such, education may be valued highly in many Majority World contexts, partly because formal education is seen to offer social mobility (Jeffrey 2010a). However, postcolonial education systems have been critiqued for how they (re)produce forms of identity. Minority World conceptualisations of childhood and youth, and of what constitutes valuable knowledge and skills, have come to dominate Majority World educational standards (Punch & Tisdall 2012), such that education systems, media, and development institutions have projected images of individual progress through formal education and into white-collar, skilled work (Jeffrey 2010a). I have previously suggested (Smith 2013), along with others (Punch 2004; Jeffrey 2010a), that post-colonial education systems can privilege subjects, skills, and forms of teaching which have little relation to many students' likely future employment. Recently, education in the Majority World has undergone a period of 'neoliberalisation' where state retreat has left space for Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), including those with political and religious agendas, to fill the gap in provision, and these organisations may import particular forms of education (Jeffrey 2010b). This evidence points to the need to consider the global influences on educational institutions, and therefore young people's identities, and the need for more research on the impact of schools on young people in the Majority World.

1.5 Temporal displacement of young identities

A significant theme which has emerged from research is how young people's identities are constructed over time and in relation to time. This concern has been described using diverse terminology. However, in this paper I seek to illustrate, using empirical evidence in the later sections, that all point to how young people's identities can be subject to forms of temporal displacement. Young people's agency and their development as individual subjects is often shifted away from the present to some point in the future.

Jeffrey (2010a) traces this temporal displacement of young people's identities to Western enlightenment thought; through how ideas of evolutionary progress and biological 'development' were re-interpreted by Euro-American societies into distinct life stages (childhood, youth, adulthood and old age), modelling how lives should be mapped out over time. These were formalised through societal institutions and laws, with childhood typically being understood as a period of innocence and dependence (Jeffrey 2010b). Although Jeffrey (2010b) argues that these formalisations have been exported to and imposed on the Majority World, in part through formal schooling regimes which follow Minority World formats, I will later partially contest this notion in the context of my own research in Tanzania. With this in mind, the temporal arrangement of these stages still has important implications. Adults in both Majority and Minority World contexts often conceive of young people as 'adults in waiting', as an investment for the future, rather than as contemporary politicised actors (Horton et al 2013). Gagen (2000) illustrates how adults in the United States identify 'proper' identity formation, which they found upon ideas of future gendered roles, such as young women becoming mothers. Sutton (2009) reveals how policy in the UK focuses on the detrimental consequences of poverty for young people in their future adulthood, rather than as children per se. Similar findings have emerged from Majority World contexts. Dyson (2008) indicates that gendered constructions of proper roles in childhood in India are closely

linked to parent's perceptions of young people's roles in the future. In these cases, adults position young people's developing identities in the future or in relation to the future.

Formal education can also position young people's identities in the future. Hyams (2000) and Thomas (2000) discuss how schools socialise young people into normative identities which are linked to being 'proper adults'. To draw on Philo (2003) again, schools are places to *lose* childhood, where children are socialised towards becoming adults. This institutionalisation of temporal identity displacement takes on a notable form in the Majority World, which Katz (2004) refers to as 'temporal disorientation', or Jeffrey (2010a) variably describes as 'temporal anxiety' or 'ruptured futures'. In diverse contexts including Eritrea (Müller 2006), Bolivia (Punch 2004), Lesotho and Zimbabwe (Ansell 2002), and India (Jeffrey et al. 2004), formal education has prepared young people for futures which may not exist, displacing their identities into temporal moments which may never come to pass.

In these cases, what is taught in schools may not necessarily prepare young people for likely futures. Schools may provide relatively equal education to men and women, yet young women's possibilities for a future in professional employment, or further education, may be very limited (Ansell 2002; Müller 2006). This can create a 'crisis of unfulfilled ambition' (Jeffrey et al. 2004), an identity which is projected into the future but never realised, and a disjuncture between future identities which are aspired to and the likely outcomes of present realities. This temporal disjuncture is partly conditioned by schooling. Learning in schools can produce knowledge which relates to places and times which exist in the imagination at the time of inception, relating to imagined futures; spaces of identity performance which are temporally displaced from their space of production (Ansell 2002). Temporal identity displacement can also be partly structured by social and economic processes at a range of scales. Global and regional economic change has, in India, reduced the amount of salaried employment available to young people, generating 'temporal anxiety' for young educated

people over their futures (Jeffrey et al. 2004; Jeffrey 2010a). Conversely, social and economic change may mean that future identities developed through informal, local learning may too be disrupted, such that certain skills are no longer deemed useful for future identity positions (Katz 2004). Young people may also exercise their agency in reproducing identities which are displaced into future locations. For example, Dyson (2010) discusses how young women experiment with different identities which they might adopt as adults. Young people have aspirations for their future identities which may never be fully fulfilled (Ansell 2002; Hammett 2009), thus also reproducing 'ruptured futures' through the act of temporal identity displacement.

Uprichard (2008), drawing on Prigogine (1980), offers a useful conceptualisation of young people's agency in Minority World contexts which explicitly attempts to reconcile its temporal dimensions. Through understanding young people's agency as always both 'being' (social actor in their own right) *and* 'becoming' (adults in the making) it is possible to bring together these two temporally distinct constructs. Whilst I will argue here that this conceptualisation is useful in terms of imagining a reconciliation of the temporal displacement of identities, I highlight that the ongoing discursive practices of temporal displacement of young people's identities in Tanzania demonstrates how engrained the notion of childhood agency as 'becoming' may be across cultural contexts, particularly in relation to roles in contemporary and future environmental management.

I will argue here that the temporal aspect of identity performance and reproduction is of great significance for young people. In both Majority and Minority World contexts young people's identities are commonly imagined in the future. Although some current work makes links between global economic change, education, and temporal displacement of young identities in the Majority World, there is perhaps less evidence of how other forms of globalised or globalising knowledges contribute to this process. Whilst there is some

discussion of how education can broadly act to temporally displace identity, there is perhaps need for more analysis of how, in the Majority World, educational curricula, teachers, and the spaces of the school itself inform this temporal displacement. Questions remain about the specific processes of intersection between formal education and young people's identity performances, and it is these intersections which I address later here through exploring how young people's active participation in reproducing identity displacement interrelates with other displacements accomplished by and through institutions.

1.6 Environmental education

The empirical research I will discuss in this paper was conducted as part of a research project which examined the impacts of environmental education projects in three communities in Tanzania. Environmental Education has been within the lexicon global educational agendas for some time (Bourdillon 2004; Hoza 2009; Mbuta 2009), and has found its way into national curricula in the Majority and Minority World (Bonnett and Williams 1998). Although environmental education can encompass a multitude of goals and may be packaged in a range of forms, programmes typically seek to instil positive attitudes and values towards the natural world (Emmons 1997). According to UNESCO's International Environmental Education Conference in Tbilisi (1997), the objective of environmental education is to promote an individual's active involvement in working towards the resolution of environmental problems (Chawla & Cushing 2007). As such, environmental education efforts, including curricula and various NGO-led projects, may inform individual choices, attitudes, values, lifestyles and actions in the environment, all of which seek to direct identities, but also may highlight how identity is linked to broader concerns at local, regional and global scales. However, studies in environmental education research do not tend to address its impacts on young people's identity production, other than to suggest that often attitudes can be changed successfully (Emmons 1997).

Studies in environmental education do, however, identify some critical issues which may impact on how young people's identities in the Majority World are reproduced. As environmental education has become institutionalised through formal education, there is concern that a process of disembedding practice and knowledge from local contexts may take place (Lotz-Sisitka 2004). This apprehension is linked to suggestions that formal programmes in the Majority World are influenced by the environmental concerns of the Minority World, and that this transfer of knowledges is problematic because of quite different environmental, economic and social realities (Emmons 1997). Projects in the Majority World have typically followed modernist and instrumentalist assumptions of education; if knowledge is imparted on students, responsible actions and social progress will follow (Chawla & Cushing 2007; Müller 2006). Yet the impacts on individual young people, their identities as environmental actors, and the communities in which they live, are poorly understood.

2. Methods

The environmental education project which was the focus of this research was run by the Jane Goodall Institute (JGI), an international organisation based in the USA with a significant presence in Tanzania, and with a primary concern for wildlife conservation. The project trained an estimated 1500 teachers and involved 103,000 young people, and ran between 2006 and 2011. The Tanzanian state has also introduced environmental education into the national curriculum for primary and secondary schools (NEMC Tanzania 2004). Just as education in many Majority World contexts has been marked by state retreat since the late 1980s, with formal education often being provided by non-state actors (Jeffrey et al. 2004; Punch 2004), the Tanzanian state has typically relied on NGOs to deliver much of the national environmental education programme, of which the JGI project was one of over 100 (NEMC Tanzania 2004).

A range of qualitative and ethnographic methods were carried out with young people who were exposed to environmental education in schools, as well as with adults in the surrounding communities. The field research took place over 5 months in 2008-2010 in three communities in Tanzania, selected to broadly represent different environmental contexts. These were Kawe Ward in Dar-es-Salaam, an urban area in the principle city; Bagamoyo, a coastal town; and three villages in a rural area of Rukwa in the far west of the country (Figure 1).



Figure 1: Tanzanian administrative areas and case study locations. Source: Mike Shand, School of Geographical and Earth Sciences, The University of Glasgow.

Workshops lasting 1 hour were carried out with young people in primary and secondary schools (Table 1), in which a series of activities took place to encourage participants to express ideas about environmental issues. These included card sorting and ranking in which participants were asked to define 'parts' of the environment and then sort these, for example by ranking those which caused problems locally. There were group discussions about activities young people took part in, and whether they felt these were environmentally sustainable. Kinaesthetic exercises required participants to move around to express ideas about their roles in the environment, for example, participants were asked to illustrate how much responsibility they have towards the environment compared to others. The workshops were conducted in Swahili (some chose to speak English) with a research assistant who translated. Alongside this, participant observation took place of day-to-day school activities and of environmentally-themed events. Young people were recruited through schools in which the NGO worked, and were asked to participate by their teachers. Although students were asked to volunteer, recruitment through teachers was partially problematic as students may have felt an element of compulsion. Workshops took place within school classrooms, which could have had implications for young people's responses, which I discuss in more detail elsewhere (Smith 2013).

Table 1: Details of focus group participants.

| Area and School | Groups | | |
|------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Kawe | | | |
| Kawe B Primary School | Group 1: 3 female, 4 male, age 13-14 | | |
| | Group 2: 3 female, 4 male, age 13-14 | | |
| | Group 3: 7 female, 1 male, age 13-14 | | |
| Kawe B Secondary School | Group 1: 2 female, 4 male, age 14-18 | | |
| | Group 2: 5 female, 2 male, age 14-18 | | |
| Bagamoyo | | | |
| Kizuiani Primary School | Group 1: 3 female, 3 male, age 13-14 | | |
| | Group 2: 3 female, 3 male, age 13-14 | | |
| | 20 AND 20 | | |
| Bagamoyo Secondary School for Boys | Group 1: 8 male, age 18-20 | | |
| | Group 2: 3 male, age 18-20 | | |
| Rukwa | | | |
| Ilemba Primary School | Group 1: 4 female, 4 male, age 13-14 | | |
| | Group 2: 3 female, 5 male, age 13-14 | | |
| Sakalilo Primary School | Group 1: 4 female, 4 male, age 13-14 | | |
| Ilemba Secondary School | Group 1: 3 female, 3 male, age 18-21 | | |
| | Group 2: 3 female, 3 male, age 18-21 | | |

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with school headteachers and teachers (14 individuals) and with key informants including state actors, NGO employees, and local leadership (12 individuals). Participants were asked to consider the effectiveness of environmental education projects, their impacts on young people, the surrounding communities and their environmental management practices. Adults from communities around each school were interviewed (288 individuals, Table 2) about their knowledge of and attitudes towards local environmental education projects, and the education of young people about environmental issues. These interviews were conducted in Swahili and lasted between 30 minutes and 2 hours. Recruitment was through informal snowballing.

Table 2: The total sample of participants who participated in individual and group interviews.

| | Kawe | | Bagamoyo | | Rukwa | |
|---------|------|--------|----------|--------|-------|--------|
| Age | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| 13 – 17 | 0 | 2 | 8 | 4 | 1 | 0 |
| 18-19 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 0 |
| 20-29 | 7 | 11 | 12 | 7 | 26 | 13 |
| 30-39 | 9 | 6 | 9 | 7 | 37 | 8 |
| 40 – 49 | 5 | 7 | 8 | 4 | 23 | 9 |
| 50 – 59 | 6 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 13 | 8 |
| 60+ | 8 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 1 |
| Total | 37 | 36 | 44 | 25 | 107 | 39 |

Ethnographic observations included participating in environmentally themed activities in schools, informal tours of each area with locals to discuss environmental problems, and spending some time in family homes to 'help out' with tasks. Observations varied in their formality. At schools myself and the research assistant were typically introduced by JGI staff, such that our relationship with and to the NGO was ambiguous. Whilst I attempted to distance our work from theirs to assure respondents of our independence, associations between our research and the work of the NGO still took place. I collaborated with the organisation, sharing results and accompanied staff to project sites, which whilst fostering an attitude of cooperation, did somewhat compromise my perceived distance from the organisation in the eyes of respondents. This is likely to have influenced responses, although informants did use my position as an avenue to feed back criticisms to the NGO. Finally, textual and discursive analysis was conducted of textbooks, curricula and other educational materials produced by JGI, the Tanzanian state and other NGOs engaged in environmental education. Discursive analysis of the material presented in this paper, namely that of the texts and images in educational materials and syllabi, was selectively coded after workshops and

interviews had taken place in order to identify concerns which had been recognised as significant for the participants.

Whilst the workshops with young people were tailored to allow them to express their ideas in a range of ways, I acknowledge that any interpretation here is necessarily an adult reading of children's worlds. Like Philo (2003), I do not believe that divisions between ways of knowing which accompany relative states of adulthood and childhood are entirely 'unbridgeable', yet it is important to recognise that my interpretation of the data is one of an adult from the Minority World considering the lives and identities of young people from the Majority World. Whilst informal observations complimented more formal research, discussions in research contexts with young people do not necessarily anticipate their behaviours outside of these contexts, and identities performed within the context of the research situation may not directly translate into the performance of identities in other places. Whilst I discuss this point in more detail below, I acknowledge here the limitations of the methods used.

3. Temporal displacement and the reproduction of young people's identities in Tanzania

In this section I will examine the multiple structures and agents which are implicated in the (re)production of young people's identities as environmental actors. These include teachers and adults, educational material produced by JGI and schooling about the environment more broadly, and young people themselves. As I choose here to reflect in some depth on the agents who act on young people's lives, particularly local adults and educational materials, there is admittedly limited reflection on young people's own voices. However, I have considered young people's responses in much more detail elsewhere (Smith 2013).

3.1 Local reproductions of identity displacement

Teachers and adults were asked to reflect on why young people should receive environmental education, and consider the implications this education might have both for young people and for local environmental management. The majority of teachers across the three research sites believed that environmental education would be valuable for young people and the local environment, and central to their arguments were a set of discourses which positioned young people as the 'future' of society. This example from a school teacher is illustrative of how teachers positioned young people:

"[Environmental education] will help to address these problems because the children will be educated about them... Children will be the leaders of tomorrow, and they will practice what they have learnt in the future."

Male teacher, Kizuiani (Bagamoyo) Primary School.

In these discussions, 60% of teachers interviewed similarly made reference to young people as environmental actors in the 'future'. In the quote above, there is no mention of young people being able to effect change in the present, nor reference to their actions in the present time. Their agency and therefore their identities as empowered actors in the environment are instead prescribed to 'the future', which discursively removes young people from the destructive present. Some teachers also counterposed this description of young people's agency with how they understood the environmental agency of local adults.

"Adult's are somehow reluctant to adhere to what they are told. Many have been here a long time and don't think there will be a problem. Their forefathers were here doing the same thing, therefore we need to educate their children."

Male teadteacher, Kizuiani (Bagamoyo) Primary School.

This headteacher prescribes adults a historically situated yet presently static attitude towards environmental issues, rooted in the past. The emphasis of the quote suggests that it is unlikely that adults will change their current attitudes or behaviour; their environmental management practices have remained as they are for 'a long time'. For this respondent, adult identities appear to embody the environmental knowledges and practices of the past, as well as being actors of the present and therefore associated with destructive, unsustainable behaviour.

Adults were blamed, in some cases, for destructive environmental practices around schools, as the following quote describes.

"We are growing grasses around the school, but the parents come to the school and cut grasses to give to the animals."

Male teacher, Kawe B Primary School.

Some local adults in the communities surrounding the schools in Kawe (26%) and Bagamoyo (28%) also echoed this discourse, whilst in Rukwa, the rural case study, this same sentiment was not expressed by local adults, despite teachers in Rukwa making similar statements to teachers in other areas. The adults in Kawe and Bagamoyo replicated this discourse of young people as agents in the 'future' in a variety of ways, as illustrated in the quotes below.

"They [young people] are the source of the community for the future. So when they grow up they will be aware of the environment and have a good foundation of how to conserve it."

Male, age 40-49, Kawe.

"They will eventually be responsible citizens of the nation."

Female, age 20-29, Bagamoyo.

"In a generation they will be able to save the environment."

Male, age 50-59, Bagamoyo.

Echoing the sentiments of teachers in all three regions, adults in Kawe and Bagamoyo also discursively separated, and assembled a dichotomy between, the identities of young people and adults as environmental actors into domains of the future and the present/past respectively, thereby restricting either group's imagined agency to these domains of time. To some degree this positions young people as relatively innocent of environmentally destructive actions in the present, whilst restricting their identity as positive environmental actors and decision-makers to the future.

The projection of the identities of young people and adults to domains of time suggests, as others have also implied (Dyson 2008; Gagen 2000; Jeffrey 2010a; Sutton 2009), that those in the adult world may temporally displace the identities of young people. In this case, temporal displacement is institutionalised through its expression by teachers, but is also reinforced in young people's lives outside of the school by local adults. As such, the identity performances of young people as empowered environmental actors are displaced by adults to a temporal moment away from their space of production, in the school. Although other studies have highlighted the negative consequences of this temporal displacement (Jeffrey 2010a; Sutton 2009), the quotes from both teachers and other adults above carry an explicitly positive message about young people's future identities, that young people "will be able to save the environment", and that they will be "the leaders of tomorrow". These sentiments suggest that adults place great faith in young people to assume identities which will be environmentally responsible, and also makes positive assumptions about the abilities of educational institutions to produce particular positive identities.

What is concerning about this temporal displacement of identity is that both young people's agency as environmental actors, and the potential for better practices of

environmental management, are both displaced to the future through the same discursive act. Although adults may be highly positive about young people's future identities as environmental actors, their discursive work to displace young identities nullifies their active social and decision-making agency in the present. In the quotes above, adults are prescribed destructive identities, but they are also identities which have present agency. The hope that young people will fulfil their future identities may potentially produce a form of temporal anxiety (Jeffrey 2010a), or 'crisis of unfulfilled ambition' (Jeffrey et al. 2004) by putting the weight of managing current and future environmental problems on the shoulders of young people's future selves.

Although other research has highlighted that childhood in the Majority World is not the protected stage in life that it is in the Minority World (Dyson 2008; Katz 2004), it is interesting that young people's identities as environmental actors in these Tanzanian communities are positioned as relatively innocent in the present compared to local adults. Jeffrey (2010b) suggests that the positioning of young people as 'innocent' has its basis in Western enlightenment thought and later conceptions of child development, however it appears here that this same discourse is reproduced amongst these adults through the discursive work of temporal displacement. To what end adults do this is difficult to discern. Others have illustrated that it can be hard, indeed impossible, for young people to impact on adult agendas (Porter et al. 2012), and that adults may seek to limit young people's material authority (Thomas 2000). As I have described elsewhere (Smith 2013), young people's agency in these three communities was limited in part by age hierarchies, hierarchies which are reproduced across societies in the Majority and Minority World. It may be that the discursive act of temporal displacement contributes to a broader societal labelling of young people which seeks to build their subjectivities as much in the present as it does in the future. If young people are not positioned as having identities with responsibility, agency and power in the present, then they are less likely to act out empowered identities in the present, thus perhaps reinforcing the authority of adults.

It is interesting to note again that such sentiments were not universal to these three communities. Local adults in Rukwa did not replicate the sentiment of adults elsewhere. This could perhaps be attributed to their greater awareness of the role of young people in environmental management and rural labour than adults in the urban areas of Kawe and Bagamoyo, although there is no evidence other than loose observations to suggest this. It perhaps remains an important direction for future work to consider the urban and rural geographies of this temporal displacement of identity.

3.2 The student is not the fisherman

JGI produced resources for schools to support their teaching of environmental issues, and these resources contained indicators that the NGO also displaced the identities of young people, although in somewhat different ways to the discursive displacements adopted by adults and teachers. In one of these books, titled 'Environmental Education: Coastal and Marine Ecosystems' (JGI 2009) young people, described in the book as 'students', are often cast as being different from adults in terms of their identities and their actions. For example, below is one of the 'suggested activities' for teachers to conduct with students on the topic of Fishing Methods.

- "1. Possible questions for class discussion:
- b. How can students reach out to fishermen and communities to explain the harmful effects of fishing? What could students say to convince a fisherman to stop unsustainable practices?"

(JGI 2009: 18)

"3. Interview local fishermen. What types of fishing practices do they use? What are the pros and cons of each method? How do their methods affect fish, the environment and people? Have a debate in the classroom between students playing fishermen and local conservationists."

(JGI 2009: 21)

Here the 'student' is positioned as 'not-the-fisherman', with the fisherman positioned as an adult identity which has active agency within the community. The identity of the student is assumed to be one who knows about 'conservation', evident in both questions in the extract above. By referring to the fisherman as 'they', it is made explicit that this is not the identity of the student. There is no ambiguity between the role of the student and the fisherman, and there are assumptions about both, including that the student is inherently interested in conservation, the fisherman must be convinced that his practices are unsustainable, and that the fishing protagonist is male when in reality women also partake in fishing practices.

The illustrations throughout the textbook also carefully position young people and adults by assumed identity roles assigned to them by adult writers. On page 14 (JGI 2009) we see a man digging up mangrove roots to find worms to use as bait in fishing (Figure 2). These practices are described in the caption as 'destruction of the mangroves', as digging for worms can degrade the mangrove roots. Positioned against this is the role of the young person, the student, who on page 25 of the textbook is seen cleaning the beach (Figure 3).



Figure 2: Destruction of the mangroves. Source: JGI 2009:14.



Figure 3: Young people cleaning the beach. Source: JGI 2009: 25.

Interestingly, the illustration in Figure 3 does prescribe some limited agency to young people as environmental actors in the present. They are seen 'cleaning the beach', thus suggesting, somewhat counter to the discourses of local adults and teachers, that young people do have a role as environmental actors. However, this positioning of young people as conservationists

denies their agency in terms of what they may practice in their day-to-day lives. Figure 4 shows three young men in Bagamoyo performing the same practice as the adult in Figure 2. Young people in Bagamoyo and Kawe were observed on three occasions digging for worms in the Mangroves. Throughout the three study areas, young people were observed fishing, felling and cutting trees, taking part in charcoal production, and other practices which might be labelled as having a detrimental effect on the environment if practiced unsustainably, but also all practices which are carried out by adults. In all three areas, young people were also observed taking part in household agricultural and pastoral practices, providing labour which was integral to their own and their family's livelihoods. Of course these activities are not environmentally unsustainable per se, but many are implicated in local environmental sustainability.



Figure 4: Young men digging for worms in mangrove tree roots on Bagamoyo beach.

Whilst the practices of adults are positioned as 'bad' and 'unsustainable' for the environment by the JGI textbook, and are not associated with young people, young people are equally engaged in these livelihood practices. Young people can also be 'the fisherman'; their identities blur the lines between the assumed identity of the 'student', or child, and that of the adult, 'the fisherman'. Although here a present 'being' agency is given to young people, this is not agency as the fisherman. The suggested activities from the JGI textbook take place in the school classroom, not in the space or present time outside of the school. The student's agency in questioning the fisherman's practices is only a spatially and temporally imaginary scenario, not one that exists in the present. Whilst therefore this piece of teaching material from the NGO does not explicitly describe young people's identities as having agency in the future, temporal displacement of young identities does occur in more subtle ways. The fisherman is an adult, performing an adult identity, whilst student can only 'play' at being the fisherman or a local conservationist in the imaginary context of classroom environmental education. In order to assume this identity in reality, young people must progress to adulthood at some time in the future.

For adults, positioning young people as only possessing active agency in the future may seek to maintain the hegemony of age over youth, which may in turn avoid having to take young people's 'being' agency seriously in the present, part of a wider production of local power relations. For the NGO, it is perhaps more difficult to discern why young people's identities are displaced in this way. One possibility is that by framing young people as 'the student', an agent in the future, confronting their actual (potentially destructive and unsustainable) agency in the present is avoided. It may be considerably easier for the NGO, and far less confrontational within current community hierarchies, to provide education in the hope that it will be translated onto young people's future identities, rather than tackle the more complex issue of the exclusion of agency and identity in the adult-dominated present.

Just as Van Blerk (2005) identifies ways in which adults construct 'street child' identities which can act to exclude young people from particular spaces, so the process of temporal

displacement at work in these Tanzanian communities may act as a form of temporal exclusion of particular forms of active identity from the present. If the NGO and adults avoid challenging young people's present destructive agency, and in turn discursively exclude their potential identities as active (destructive, unsustainable) agents, young people may also avoid changing or challenging their own practices in the present, and may only perceive it necessary to make changes to unsustainable environmental practices in the future.

There are further implications here for understanding the temporal aspect of young people's agency. To draw again on Uprichard's (2008) conceptualisation of young people's agency as 'being and becoming', whilst it is clear in these case studies that discourses of 'becoming' adult appear to dominate, as they do throughout the Minority World (Horton et al 2013), agency is not necessarily understood by local adults and the NGO as exclusively either 'being' or 'becoming', instead 'being' and 'becoming' are assigned to separate identity roles which allow for particular forms of agency. 'Being' the student confers a specific kind of agency, whereas assumptions are made about what it might mean to 'become' an environmentally responsible adult. Therefore whilst 'being' and 'becoming' are both part of the local and national constellation of what constitutes young people's agency, they remain somewhat separate. This separation of agency, linked to the temporal displacement of identity, appears to be equally intertwined with the solution to environmental issues being temporally displaced, such that it is the 'becoming' agency of young people which is responsible for future environmental management, rather than their current 'being', or the current 'being' agency of local adults.

These examples of adult discourses and NGO teaching materials serve to highlight the ways in which both educational institutions and wider communities can seek to structure young people's identities. Those aspects of identity which are involved in day-to-day environmental management, and choices about the use of the environment, are partly

produced for young people. Identification of the self (the student) and the other (the fisherman) is also done somewhat for young people. However, these structural influences extend beyond the local community and the national NGO. As I have highlighted elsewhere (Smith 2013), and other's have drawn attention to (Emmons 1997; Leach and Fairhead 2000), notions of the 'environment' and environmental problems communicated through conservation efforts in the African context are often informed by Minority World conceptions of conservation of natural resources and wildlife. That the material from the JGI textbook ignores young people's destructive agency and positions them as 'conservationists' is suggestive of how these discourses not only take on Western notions of sustainable environmental conservation, but also reproduce patterns of childhood identity and childhood agency (Uprichard 2008) which are separate from the daily material reproduction of the adult world, synonymous with childhood in the Minority World, but not in the context of many experiences of youth in Tanzania. Arguably ideas of wildlife conservation and environmental sustainability are globalising knowledges with their origins in the Minority World. Just as Hammett (2009) demonstrates how globalising cultural influences may impact on young people's identity performances, it seems likely in the Tanzanian context that globalising knowledges of correct environmental practices, and the identity of young people as agents in these practices, will also influence how young people see themselves as environmental actors.

This evidence suggests that the celebration of young people's agency which has emerged from childhood studies (Tisdall & Punch 2012) must be tempered by a critical consideration of how educational institutions and adults can act to inform the (re)production of identities through temporal displacement of agency and identity. Formal schooling and education not only reinforces dominant ideologies (Ansell 2002; Punch & Tisdall 2012), in this case of conservation and sustainability, but also reinforces the temporal displacement of

young people's identities in the processes of disciplining their identity performances around particular identity roles.

3.3 Young people's identity work: Spatial configurations of temporal identity displacement

In both Majority and Minority World contexts, young people have agency in constituting their own identities which may both subvert and/or reproduce those influences which exist beyond their own selves (Dyson 2008; Konstantoni 2012; Porter et al. 2012). In this study, young people were equally effective in producing identities which were linked to active subjectivities in environmental management. Within the spaces of the school, young people who took part in workshops were able to articulate opinions about environmental issues eloquently and confidently, and were keen to express their knowledge of environmental management (see also Smith 2013). In each area between a quarter and a third of students who participated in the workshops said that they had taken part in some kind of practical action in their school which they believed would help conserve the environment (in Kawe 27%, Bagamoyo 26%, and Rukwa 36%). These young people were often keen to demonstrate their accomplishments. In Rukwa, one student described how she was proud of the tree she had helped plant and maintain in the school grounds, and took us to see the tree (Figure 5). In Kizuiani Primary School (Bagamoyo) a group of students took us from a classroom to witness them making fencing around areas of plants which they had previously planted (Figure 6). A significant number of young people were thus keen to demonstrate their commitment to environmental conservation, not only in their discussions but also by demonstrating their actions within the school grounds.



Figure 5: A student in Rukwa shows us the tree she has helped plant and raise.



Figure 6: Students in Bagamoyo demonstrate their fence-building skills.

However, in other public and private spaces, young people were more restrained in asserting this element of their identity. Focus groups with adults in communities which took place in homes, public places of work, and public spaces, often involved young people who would 'sit in' on these conversations. However, in these spaces observations suggested that young people were less likely to express their knowledges, conforming to age hierarchies of allowing adults to speak first. Whilst young people confidently expressed knowledges of environmental issues within the context of a workshop held at a school, they were less able to assert this identity of being knowledgeable of environmental issues in the home. Young people across all three study areas made reference to this in expressing their frustration at not being able to assert their knowledges on adults.

"The environment is the duty of everyone. . . but because of my age now though I cannot just talk to elders, so I cannot tell them what to do in the environment."

Male, age 18–19, Rukwa (rural)

"Parents don't want to be taught by their kids! We need to provide education to the parents as they are very reluctant to be taught by their children."

Male, age 13-16, Bagamoyo (town)

"My parents at home are not caring for the environment. I told them to sort out the rubbish but they never sorted out this problem."

Female, age 13–16, Kawe (Dar es Salaam, urban)

The three quotes above all point to young people's frustration at being unable to affirm their identities as knowledgeable environmental actors in the home, acknowledging their identities as 'not adults' and therefore not socially influential or responsible. The final quote above suggests how young people's identities in the arena of their family homes are ones which lack active agency, relying instead on adults to make environmental management decisions in

the present, and perhaps also acting to displace the agency of young people away from the present. Yet despite the sentiments expressed here by young people, which largely paint them as adopting identities which advocate for environmentally sustainable practices, in spaces outside of the school young people were as equally active in practices which might be deemed unsustainable, as Figure 4 illustrates, and other observational evidence of young people taking part in daily tasks, such as fishing, charcoal burning and wood collection confirmed.

Young people can appear to perform and (re)produce multiple identities as environmental actors, which are to some degree bounded by structures which operate both spatially and temporally. Just as Konstantoni (2012) and Sutton (2009) suggest that young people may perform multiple, fluid social identities, it is evident in these three communities that young people may discursively and materially perform identities within the school grounds which harness discourses of environmental sustainability and conservation, yet in the spaces of the community, the home and the family they are unable to discursively assert these identity performances, and may materially perform quite different identities as fishermen, as farmers and pastoralists, as wood collectors and charcoal makers. Young people may be strategically claiming identities to meet the expectations and norms placed on them in different spaces and times. Just as young people may use conspicuous consumption (Hammett 2009), or use particular artefacts such as computers (Holloway et al. 2000) to claim identities in other contexts, Figures 5 and 6 illustrate how in this context young people harness the materiality of the school grounds to claim identities as 'good' environmentalists. It is this identity which is expected of them within the institutional time-space of the school, exemplified by the educational material from JGI and the expectations of adults and teachers. In this context, young people's identities as environmental actors are spatially, but also perhaps temporally, malleable. In the space of the school young people were able to

discursively distance themselves from the present destructive actions of their parents, reproducing the temporal displacement of their own agency in these spaces outside of the school. Within the institutional environment of the school, however, they were able to perform, or perhaps 'try on' (Hyams 2000) these particular identities and to assert their agency in 'becoming' adults (Uprichard 2008), thus suggesting that temporal displacement of identity is spatially mediated.

4. Conclusions

Whilst young people may be recognised as social actors in their own right in scholarly writing (Punch & Tisdall 2012), the discursive constructions which reproduce young people's identities as environmental actors in the future suggest that, in educational practice, their agency is being displaced away from, and thus denied from, the present. This has implications for environmental education practice and perhaps pedagogy more generally. Environmental education might serve young people and the local environment better if young people's identities as contemporary and potentially environmentally damaging actors were recognised explicitly, whilst also tackling their marginality in asserting their own ideas on the adult world of the present. I am not arguing here for a complete shift in attention towards young people's present 'being' agency. Instead, such a move might explicitly utilise notions of young people's agency as both 'being and becomings' (Uprichard 2008), in order to reconcile present agency with that of their future adult selves. Indeed, Malone (2013) illustrates, in the context of the Minority World, that young people can play an active role in urban planning and environmental change in participation with adult institutions, demonstrating that it is practical and possible for young people to be engaged in present development and future planning. Kesby et al. (2006) suggest that it is dangerous to ignore young people's agency, and in this case the danger is that by not acknowledging young people as potentially destructive environmental actors in the present, and temporally

displacing their active identities to the future, a situation is created where young people may see no need to act now, or to make changes to their behaviour in the present. Although young people have a marginal status in decision-making in the adult world, displacing their identities and abilities to employ their agency to the future is unlikely to inspire them to take action in the present. This is not to suggest that young people categorically do not exercise their (limited) agency in the local environment, however it reflects the potential for adults to discursively construct a world in which young people may not see their present agency as meaningful.

Temporal displacement of young people's identities as environmental actors through educational institutions, local adults and parents, and through the identity work of young people themselves may, in this case, foster unrealistic hopes and aspirations for young people. However, perhaps contrary to other work which recognises similar forms of temporal displacement (Jeffrey et al. 2004; Jeffrey 2010a; Sutton 2009) here I suggest that it may represent optimistic hopes for the future and a positive investment in young identities, envisaging them as powerful future actors towards environmental sustainability. What motivation lies behind the active temporal displacement of young identities employed by adults' remains an unanswered question here. It may represent a disciplining of young identities in the present, actively producing contemporary identities which only look to the future for their eventual agency, thus reinforcing adult hegemony of environmental decision making in the present. It may perhaps also reflect an adult imagining, or re-imagining, of childhood innocence (Philo 2003), in this case innocence of present destructive environmental practices, despite the obvious material reality. If the temporal displacement of young people's identities and the resultant generation of unfulfilled potentials is common across cultural contexts in both the Majority and Minority Worlds (Hammett 2009; Jeffrey et al. 2004; Katz 2004; Müller 2006; Sutton 2009), then this suggests that there may be certain

cross-cultural aspects of positioning youth identities which might generate important dialogue between quite differing contexts. Indeed, recent movements such as Occupy and Anonymous, which have involved considerable numbers of young people from both Minority and Majority world contexts, have demonstrated that young people do mobilise in the present to challenge the temporal displacement of their agency. Worryingly though, the evidence also suggests that unrealistic futures, informed by education, may lead to unfulfilled subjecthood becoming part of the identity of a whole generation of youth in the Majority World.

What I have discussed above perhaps gives some insight into the multiple axes of structures which reproduce this temporal displacement of young identities. External actors, in this case the NGO, the associated environmental education program and the global knowledges of sustainable environmental conservation which it represents, all work alongside local adults and young people themselves to structure young identities across space and time. Recognising these structures which operate across different scales gives some weight to a critical approach to young people's agency, rather than outright celebrating their abilities as social actors (Punch & Tisdall 2012). It should also draw attention to the importance of the institutional space of the school as a distinct, but porous, time-space in which the multiple axes of structures meet to inform young identities. In the case of these Tanzanian communities, the institutional space of the school might be a positive site for the reworking of particular subjectivities (Hyams 2000), as young people act out identities as empowered environmental actors, embodying different environmental values and actions to those open to them in the adult world. Temporal displacement of identity within schools might therefore have ambiguous consequences for young people's identities. Young people may be appropriating and reworking the displacement of their environmental agency by acting out roles as environmentally responsible actors within the school. Yet at the same time this acting out, and its institutionalisation to a discrete geographic space perhaps reproduces

their deficient agency outside of the school. This simultaneous resistance to temporally displaced agency and identity, and the reproduction of the norms expected of the 'good environmentalist' at school, illustrates how young people can concurrently resist and accommodate the work that society does on their identity. However, what is unclear is how these performances work on young people's identities over time, and what contribution institutions might make to young people's identities in their youth and later adulthood. As Dyson (2008) suggests, transgression does not imply emancipation, and whether performances of identity in school lead to empowered actions in later life needs further exploration.

References

- Aitken, S. C. (2007) Desarrollo Integral y Froteras/Integral Development and Borderspaces, *Children's Geographies* 5(1-2): 113-129.
- Ansell, N. (2002) Of course we must be equal, but...' imagining gendered futures in two rural southern African secondary schools, *Geoforum* 33: 179-194.
- Bonnett, M. and Williams, J. (1998) Environmental education and primary children's attitudes towards nature and the environment, *Cambridge Journal of Education* 28(2): 159-173.
- Bourdillon, M.F.C. (2004) Children in development, *Progress in Development Studies* 4(2): 99-113.
- Chawla, L. and Cushing, D. F. (2007) Education for strategic environmental behaviour, *Environmental Education Research* 13(4): 437-452.
- Dyson, J. (2008) Harvesting identities: youth, work and gender in the Indian Himalayas, Annals of the Association of American Geographers 98(1): 160-179.

- Dyson, J. (2010) Friendship in practice: girls' work in the Indian Himalayas, *American Ethnologist* 37(3): 482-498.
- Emmons, K. M. (1997) Perceptions of the environment while exploring the outdoors: a case study in Belize, *Environmental Education Research* 3(3): 327-344.
- Gagen, E. A. (2000) An example to us all: child development and identity construction in early 20th-century playgrounds, *Environment and Planning A* 32(4): 599-616.
- Hammet, D. (2009) Local beats to global rhythms: coloured student identity and negotiations of global cultural imports in Cape Town, South Africa, *Social and Cultural Geography* 10(4): 403-419.
- Holloway, S. J., Valentine, G., and Bingham, N. (2000) Institutionalising technologies: masculinities, femininities, and the heterosexual economy of the IT classroom, *Environment and Planning A* 32: 617-633.
- Horton, J., Hadfield-Hill, S., Christensen, P., and Kraftl, P. (2013) Children, young people and sustainability: introduction to special issue, *Local Environment: The International Journal of Justice and Sustainability* 18(3): 249-254.
- Hoza, J.T. (2009) Capacity building for environmental education and ESD: Status and opportunities in Tanzania, *Paper presented to the National Environmental Education Forum* 18th-19th June, Morogoro, Tanzania.
- Hyams, M. S. (2000) "Pay attention in class... [and] don't get pregnant": a discourse of academic success among adolescent Latinas, *Environment and Planning A* 32: 635-654.
- Jane Goodall Institute (2009) Environmental Education: Coastal and Marine Ecosystem

 Volume 1, Dar es Salaam: Inter Press of Tanzania.

- Jeffrey, C., Jeffrey, R., and Jeffrey, P. (2004) Degrees without freedom: the impact of formal education on Dalit young men in North India, *Development and Change* 35(5): 963-986.
- Jeffrey, C. (2010a) Timepass: Youth, class, and time among unemployed young men in India, American Ethnologist 37(3): 465-481.
- Jeffrey, C. (2010b) Geographies of children and youth 1: eroding maps of life, *Progress in Human Geography* 34(4): 496-505.
- Katz, C. (1991) Sow what you know: the struggle for social reproduction in rural Sudan, Annals of the Association of American Geographers 81(3): 488-514.
- Katz, C. (2004) *Growing up Global: Economic Restructuring and Children's Everyday Lives*.

 Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Kesby, M., Gwanzura-Ottemoller, F. and Chizororo, M. (2006) Theorising other, 'other childhoods': Issues emerging from work on HIV in urban and rural Zimbabwe, *Children's Geographies* 4(2): 185-202.
- Konstantoni, K. (2012) Children's peer relationships and social identities: exploring cases of young children's agency and complex interdependencies from the Minority World, *Children's Geographies* 10(3): 337-346.
- Leach, M. and Fairhead, J. (2000) Fashioned forest pasts, occluded histories? International environmental analysis in West African locales, *Development and Change* 31: 35-59.
- Lotz-Sisitka, H. (2004) Environmental education research and social change: southern African perspectives, *Environmental Education Research* 10(3): 291-293.

- Malone, K. (2013) "The future lies in our hands": children as researchers and environmental change agents in designing a child-friendly neighbourhood, *Local Environment: The International Journal of Justice and Sustainability* 18(3): 372-395.
- Mbuta, M. C. (2009) The future of environmental education for sustainable development in Tanzania, *Paper presented to the National Environmental Education Forum* 18th-19th June, Morogoro, Tanzania.
- Müller, T. R. (2006) Education for social change: Girls' secondary schooling in Eritrea, *Development and Change* 37(2): 353-373.
- National Environmental Management Council (NEMC), United Republic of Tanzania (2004), National Environmental Education and Communication Strategy 2005-2009.
- Parr, H. and Philo, C. (1995) Mapping 'mad' identities, in Pile, S. and Thrift, N. *Mapping the Subject: Geographies of Cultural Transformation*. London: Routledge, pp. 199-225.
- Philo, C. (2003) "To go back up the side hill": Memories, imaginations and reveries of childhood, *Children's Geographies* 1(1): 7-23.
- Pile, S. and Thrift, N. (1995) *Mapping the Subject: Geographies of Cultural Transformation*.

 London: Routledge.
- Porter, G. Townsend, J., and Hampshire, K. (2012) Children and young people as producers of knowledges, *Children's Geographies* 10(2): 131-134.
- Prigogine I. (1980) From Being to Becoming: Time and Complexity in the Physical Sciences.

 W.H. Freeman: San Francisco, CA.
- Punch, S. (2004) The impact of primary education on school-to-work transitions for young people in rural Bolivia, *Youth and Society* 36(2): 163-182.

- Punch, S., and Tisdall, E. K. M. (2012) Exploring children and young people's relationships across Majority and Minority Worlds, *Children's Geographies* 10(3): 241-248.
- Smith, T. A. (2013) The dominant/marginal lives of young Tanzanians: spaces of knowing at the intersection of Children's Geographies and Development Geographies, *Geoforum* 48: 10-23.
- Sutton, L. (2009) 'They'd only call you a scaly if you are poor': the impact of socioeconomic status on children's identities, *Children's Geographies* 7(3): 277-290.
- Thomas, M. (2000) From crib to campus: kids' sexual/gender identities and institutional space, *Environment and Planning A* 32: 577-580.
- Thompson, J. L., and Philo, C. (2004) Playful spaces? A social Geography of children's play in Livingston, Scotland, *Children's Geographies* 2(1): 111-130.
- Tisdall, E. K. M., and Punch, S. (2012) Not so 'new'? Looking critically at childhood studies, *Children's Geographies* 10(3): 249-264.
- Uprichard, E. (2008) Children as 'Being and Becomings': Children, childhood and temporality, *Children & Society* 22: 303-313.
- Van Blerk, L. (2005) Negotiating spatial identities: mobile perspectives on street life in Uganda, *Children's Geographies* 3(1): 5-21.

Acknowledgements

This research would not have been possible without the assistance of all those who participated in Tanzania. I would like to thank John Briggs and Jo Sharp, and in Tanzania Alex Ngowi, Opportuna Kweka, Daud Buyagu and Gabriel Gibson.