



## Argumentation and Poetry:

# A Pragmatic Literary Study of the Dīwān Group's Poetic Discourse

Submitted By

**Abdullah Abdurahman Aloraini**

(<sup>°</sup>Abd Allāh Al-<sup>°</sup>Uraynī)

To the University of Exeter

As a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Arab and Islamic Studies

June 2015

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other university.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Abdullah".

(Signature)

# Abstract

This study seeks to consider argumentative discourse in poetry, and to attempt to detect the arguments in the poetic discourse of the Dīwān group in the light of their principles, trying to present a different insight into the examination of modern Arabic poetry by exploring its ability to persuade and influence. The study applies the argumentation theory to the Dīwān Group's poetic output by attempting to answer the question of how the three members of the Dīwān group imbued their poems through the process of argumentation.

The study aims to reveal the effectiveness of argumentation in the structure of the group's poetic discourse considering the presuppositions. This means that the concept of poetry and critical works of the three members of the Dīwān group could be presupposed to be 'ideal' and any poetic analysis is made in the light of this concept. In other words, the study highlights the argumentative process in order to illustrate how the Dīwān group's trend towards the romantic rebelled against the Classical school.

By applying the theory of argumentation to the poetic output, it would essentially mean that the poem seeks to create a special meaning through language in the communicative process between the poet and the reader. This process is the essence of the theory of argumentation: to persuade the reader of the argument and to reach the desired result through justification and evidence.

As the meaning of each of the selected poems is significant and considerable, this study relies on the pragmatics method, where argumentation itself is an essential branch of pragmatics. The pragmatic approach examines how the purposes of the writer (or speaker) are detected by the receiver. It considers literary works as essential verbal works that have been expanded to encourage the addressee to full persuasion. It can be seen that pragmatics is based on the study of the meaning that the speaker or writer wants to communicate and the listener or reader explains. It is worth noting that both the pragmatic approach and the theory of argumentation endeavour to throw light on the characteristics and implications of literary discourse in different genres, based on communication between two parties.

As the title suggests, this study is designed coherently in three parts: The **Foundation, the Structure of Argumentation and the Structure of Poetry** respectively. Part I includes two chapters; the introductory chapter and the background of both the Group and Theory which considers the dialectic

of Argumentation and Poetry. Chapter Three, the first in part II, discusses **the Constituents of Argumentation** by studying three aspects; the bonds of convergence between Argumentation and Romanticism, repetition and finally, poetic dialogue. Chapter Four covers **the Patterns of Argumentation**, which are: Syllogism, Fallacy, and thirdly, Argumentation by Example. Chapter Five, the first in part III, conducts a deeper analysis into the common-places where arguments are found, which are Love, Meditation and Nature. Each poetic theme is divided into related arguments. Chapter Six examines **Argumentative Images** through a theoretical preface concerning the link between imaginary and argumentation, following by the Sources of Argumentative images through Human being, Nature, Religion and Philosophy. Finally, the Functions of images of Wisdom and comparison are examined. Chapter Seven presents the **Conclusion**, which summarises the most important points deduced from the study and the recommendations made.

Finally, as I have studied the group's poetic material, I have found that one of them can simultaneously be regarded as a poet, writer and critic; and that argumentation was the ideal way for the poets to disseminate their ideas and principles. Moreover, it can be concluded that the poetic discourse of the Dīwān Group's focus concerns two aspects: the critical and the poetic. The critical element relies on the poets' critique (especially that of the revival poets), that clarifies the nature of poetry, and the impact of emotion on it, as well as portraying both Life and Self in various aspects. The poetic discourse that was formed in the first fruits of the 'new poetry' was an attempt to replace Classical poems with another focus that was related to emotion and Romanticism.

Key Words: Argumentation, Dīwān Group, Pragmatics, Poetry, Romanticism,

# Table of Contents

Abstract.....	II
Table of Contents.....	IV
Acknowledgments.....	VIII
Transliteration.....	IX
Abbreviations.....	X
Quotations.....	XI

## Part One

### Foundation

#### **Chapter One** (Pages 3-40)

##### **Introduction**

1.1. Preface.....	4
1.2. The Importance of Studying the Topic.....	7
1.3. Reasons for Choosing the Topic.....	9
1.4. Methodology.....	11
1.5. Theory.....	18
1.6. Research Question.....	19
1.7. The Structure of the Thesis.....	20
1.8. Literature Review.....	23

#### **Chapter Two** (Pages 41-99)

##### **The Dīwān Group and Argumentation Theory**

2.1. Preface.....	42
2.2. The Dīwān Group.	
2.2.1. The Group's Emergence.....	44
2.2.2. The Poets' Biographies.....	48
2.2.3. The Concept of Poetry.....	54
2.2.4. The Dīwān Group's Poetic Output.....	58
2.2.5. The Critical Issues by The Dīwān Group.....	61
2.2.6. The Critical Works by the Dīwān Group.....	64
2.2.7. A compared Vision of the Critical Works.....	70

2.2.8.	Influence.....	72
2.3.	The Term Argumentation ‘al-Hijāj’.	
2.3.1.	Definition.....	75
2.3.2.	Theoretical Background of the Term.....	77
2.3.3.	The Strategy of Argumentative Text-building.....	90
2.3.4.	Argumentation and Poetry.....	93
2.4.	Conclusion.....	98

## Part Two

### The Structure of Argumentation

#### Chapter Three (Pages 101-160)

##### The Constituents of Argumentation

3.1.	Preface.....	102
3.2.	Argumentation and Romanticism, Bonds of Convergences.....	104
3.2.1.	Argumentation in Titles.....	107
3.2.2.	Poetic Symbols.....	115
3.2.3.	Self-expressions.....	118
3.3.	Recurrence and insistence on the meanings.....	124
3.3.1.	Repetition in Meaning.....	128
3.3.2.	Verbal Repetition. (Diaphora).....	134
3.4.	Poetic Dialogue.....	139
3.4.1.	External Dialogue.....	141
3.4.2.	Interior Dialogue (Monologue).....	151
3.5.	Contrast and Comparison.....	157
3.6.	Conclusion.....	159

#### Chapter Four (Pages 161-213)

##### The Patterns of Argumentation

4.1.	Preface.....	162
4.2.	Syllogism.....	165

4.2.1. Explicit Syllogism.....	166
4.2.2. Implicit Syllogism (Enthymeme).....	175
4.3. Argumentation by Example.....	180
4.3.1. The Argument of Places.....	181
4.3.2. The Argument of Characters.....	187
4.4. Fallacy (Paralogism).....	195
4.4.1. The Argument of Irony.....	197
4.4.2. The Illogical Argument.....	204
4.5. Contrast and Comparison.....	209
4.6. Conclusion.....	212

### Part Three

## The Structure of Poetry

### Chapter Five

(Pages 215-265)

#### Loci (or Poetic Themes) of Arguments

5.1. Preface.....	216
5.2. Argumentation in Love.....	219
5.2.1. The Argument of Beauty.....	219
5.2.2. The Argument of Despair .....	225
5.2.3. The Philosophy of Love .....	227
5.3. Argumentation in Meditation.....	241
5.3.1. The Argument of Life.....	241
5.3.2. The Argument of Self.....	244
5.3.3. The Argument of Time. ....	248
5.4. Argumentation in Nature.....	250
5.4.1. The Philosophy of Nature .....	250
5.4.2. The Argument of Night.....	255
5.4.3. The Argument of Sun.....	258
5.5. Contrast and Comparison.....	261
5.6. Conclusion .....	265

### Chapter Six

(Pages 266-355)

## Argumentative images

6.1. Preface.....	267
6.2. Imagination and Argumentation.....	270
6.2.1. The Concept of Imagery.....	270
6.2.2. The Importance of Imagery in the Group's Poetry.....	273
6.2.3. The Argumentative Impact in the Poetic Image.....	278
6.3. The Sources of Argumentative Images.....	282
6.3.1. The Human World.....	282
6.3.2. The Natural World.....	292
6.3.3. Religion.....	306
6.3.4. Philosophy.....	316
6.4. The Functions of Argumentative Images.....	329
6.4.1. Wisdom.....	330
6.4.2. Comparison.....	340
6.5. Contrast and Comparison.....	352
6.6. Conclusion.....	355

## Chapter Seven

(Pages 357-370)

## Conclusion

## Bibliography

(Pages 372-390)

1. Primary Sources.....	372
2. Other Sources.....	373
2.1. Arabic.....	373
2.2. English.....	382
3. Unpublished Academic Theses.....	387
4. Journals .....	388
5. Electronic Sites.....	389

## Appendix

Glossary

(Pages 391-396)

# Transliteration

The library of Congress (LC) system of transliteration has been followed throughout the thesis.

## 1. Consonants:

Arabic	LC	Arabic	LC
ء	ʾ	ض	ḍ
ب	b	ط	ṭ
ت	t	ظ	ẓ
ث	th	ع	ʿ
ج	j	غ	gh
ح	ḥ	ف	f
خ	kh	ق	q
د	d	ك	k
ذ	dh	ل	l
ر	r	م	m
ز	z	ن	n
س	s	هـ	h
ش	sh	و	w
ص	ṣ	ي	y

## 2. Diphthongs:

اِي (ay)	اَو (aw)
----------	----------

## 3. Vowels:

Arabic (short vowels)	LC	Arabic (long vowels)	LC
اَ	a	اَ	ā
اُ	u	او	ū
اِ	i	اي	ī

## 4. Others:

ال	al- (for article)
أ	an
ؤ	un
ئ	in
ة	at-a
ّ	Doubling the letter



# Abbreviations

b.	(ibn) son of
d.	Died
edn.	Edition
Ed.	Editor
nd.	No date
np.	No place
Trans.	Translated
AH	(Anno Hegirae) Islamic Calendar
AD	(Anno Domini) Christian Calendar
Ch.	Chapter
p.	Page Number
vol.	Volume
ibid.	(Ibidem) in the same reference
No.	Number
et. al	...and Others

# Quotations

“...it is absurd to hold that a man ought to be ashamed of being unable to defend himself with his limbs, but not of being unable to defend himself with speech and reason, when the use of rational speech is more distinctive of a human being than the use of his limbs”.

Aristotle, *Rhetoric*



”كيف يظن إنسان أن صناعة البلاغة يتأتى تحصيلها في الزمن القريب، وهي البحر الذي لم يصل أحد إلى نهايته مع استفاد الأعمار“.

“How can a man think that the making of rhetoric can come to be accessible in the near future. It is rather the bottom of the sea that no one has yet reached in spite of the passing of years”.

Ḥāzim al-Qarṭājannī, *Minhāj al-Bulaghā° wa Sirāj al-Udabā°*



”مدار البلاغة كلها على استدراج الخصم إلى الإذعان والتسليم، لأنه لا انتفاع بإيراد الألفاظ المليحة الرائقة ولا المعاني اللطيفة الدقيقة دون أن تكون مستجابة لبلوغ غرض المخاطب بها“.

“The pivot of rhetoric is totally based on the attraction of the opponent to obedience and submission, because there is no benefit in presenting (or picking) polished words, nor nice meanings without being aimed to achieve the purpose of the addressee”.

Ibn al-Athīr, *al-Mathal al-Sā°ir*



والشعرُ حصنٌ عزيزٌ ليس تقهره هذي الليلي، وغيرُ الشعرِ وهنأُ

Al-Māzinī, *Dīwān al-Māzinī*

Poetry is an impervious fortress, invincible by these [unwelcome] nights, while other than poetry is lacking.

