

**NATIVE ENGLISH TEACHER EXAMINING BILINGUAL ESSAYS WRITTEN BY STUDENTS OF
INDONESIAN-ENGLISH TRANSLATION CLASS: THE CASE OF ENGLISH EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT OF PURWOREJO MUHAMMADIYAH UNIVERSITY**

Junaedi Setiyono

Abstract: Nowadays the number of non-native English speakers exceeds the number of native English ones, so English is used to communicate among the non-native English speakers. As a consequence, English teachers should consider the phenomena of world Englishes. In this research the main problems is what corrections the native English speaker examining the bilingual essays written by students are. The native speaker is the English lecturer of ESL composition at the Ohio State University, and the subjects are the students of English Education Department at Purworejo Muhammadiyah University in the academic year of 2012/2013. The data is in the form of a number of bilingual essays written by students in accomplishing the task of Indonesian-English translation class. The analysis and interpretation employed is mainly the mixed method emphasizing on descriptive-qualitative research method. After examining, the native English teacher states that he is able to comprehend most of the essays. However, he finds that there are quite many sentences which are considered idiomatically unnatural for native speaker's point of view. Such weaknesses occur especially due to the use of inappropriate words and idiomatic expressions.

Keywords: *bilingual essay, Indonesian-English translation, native English teacher, task*

English Education Department of Teacher Training and Pedagogy Faculty is supposed to produce professional English teachers. They are going to be English teachers at either lower or upper secondary schools. And, in this globalization era, they have a greater opportunity to work together with native English teachers (NETs). The problems which arise, among others, is the assumption coming from the students and student's parents that NETs can teach English better than non-native English teachers (NNETs). However, there are quite many studies whose topic is the roles of NNETs and NETs in their English class. From such studies the researcher knows that the weakness of NNETs is especially dealing with their cultural awareness.

As a matter of fact, the number of non-native English speakers exceeds significantly the number of native English ones, apparently English is used to communicate among the non-native English speakers rather than that of the native English ones. This phenomenon can clearly be seen right now. As a result, the world Englishes with the translanguaging and codemeshing concepts (Canagarajah, 2012) are an unavoidable subject of consideration for English teachers. It means that English teachers should not only realize the linguistic and cultural influence coming from student's mother tongue but also accommodate such influences appropriately. As a result, it is important to know the differences between native English teachers (NETs) and non-native English teachers (NNETs).

Based on the research done by Florence (2012), the non-native English teachers (NNETs) or Local English Teachers (LETs) have both the advantages and disadvantages. The advantages include their proficiency in students' L1, their knowledge of students' learning difficulties, the ease students experience in understanding their teaching, and in communication. The disadvantages appear to be the reverse of what the native English teachers (NETs) have, i.e. NETs have good English proficiency and have ability to facilitate student learning.

In addition, the non-native English teachers (NNETs) in Indonesia should realize that English teaching has a significant effect on Bahasa Indonesia teaching. As a matter of fact, there are some anxieties dealing with the domination of English as an international language that can threaten the position of Bahasa Indonesia as a national language, and it becomes one the considerations in holding this research too. Gunawan's review in Djiwandono (2002) states that the current sociolinguistic situation in Indonesia implies that Indonesian is facing a threat from English language in its status as a symbol of national pride, particularly among the young generations.

Implementing code-switching, i.e. using Bahasa Indonesia during English learning-teaching activity, is not ill-advised. Sampson (2012) writes that code-switching may not necessarily be connected to ability level and serves multiple communicative and learning purposes. This indicates not only that total proscription of L1 is ill-advised, but that the mother tongue can be usefully exploited for learning, for example when performing contrastive analysis.

The anxiety has already been responded by some experts on English teaching in Indonesia such as Mulkhan (1996) and Ramelan (1994). They argue that such an anxiety can be overcome. Even they state that English does not threaten the superiority of Bahasa Indonesia, but, on the contrary, English teaching in Indonesia can help the development of Bahasa Indonesia.

The significances of this study are that it constitutes the attempt to utilize the advantages of being non-native English teachers and it also constitutes the attempt to utilize native speaker's point of view in revising the output's written products in order the native speaker of English can easily comprehend what the students write.

Research Methods

Basically, the method which the researcher employs in conducting this research is mixed methods focusing on a descriptive-qualitative analysis. However, because he relies heavily on examining students' essays, his research method can be categorized as a narrative analysis. Mitchell and Eguido (2003) state that narrative is inherently multidisciplinary, and is an extension of the interpretive approaches in social sciences. They say that narrative analysis then takes the story itself as the object of study. Furthermore, this study employs error analysis as proposed by Dulay, Burt, and Krashen (1982) to some extent. And, it can also be categorized a case study.

Dealing with what process research is intended to achieve, this research can be categorized as having a pedagogical orientation. It means that the research aim will concentrate on the practical aspects of training translators and thus on working with trainers or trainees as subjects of experimentation (Hatim, 2001).

Determining students to be the respondents is the first step that the researcher does. The respondents are the students of English Education Departments of Purworejo Muhammadiyah University in the academic year of 2012/2013. They are the fifth semester students who take the subject of Indonesian-English Translation. Such a subject, which is offered at the fifth semester, was held in September, 2012 to February, 2013. The second step is to ask the students to do the task, i.e. writing an essay in Bahasa Indonesia and then translating it into English before attending the final examination. There are thirteen students whom the researcher asked them accomplishing and submitting the task given.

After asking the native speaker to revise the student's tasks, however, the error made by students in translating their Indonesian essay into English ones need further categorizations, more than what are already proposed by Dulay et al. It is because the problems are not only dealt with linguistic aspects but also translational ones.

Research Findings

After examining thirteen student's tasks and after asking a native speaker to revise them, the researcher can find that the students have problem in translating their Bahasa Indonesia essay into English one especially dealing with inappropriate words and idiomatic expressions which can be specified by the problems related to diction, omission, addition, misformation, sentence logic, verb agreement, pronoun, punctuation, run-on sentence, and parallelism. However, some mistakes cannot be said as neither purely translational nor purely linguistic mistakes. Sometimes students wrote their Bahasa Indonesia sentence ungrammatically. And, of course, their English sentence was influenced by their ungrammatical Bahasa Indonesia sentence.

Although the mistakes are possibly caused by the Bahasa Indonesia sentence they write, they should have realized that their English sentence are ungrammatical. In this case, the researcher does not discuss the cause of mistakes. He does discuss how to keep the sentence or paragraph meaning without neglecting both the syntax and lexis.

Discussion Of The Findings

There are two main discussions related to the research findings, i.e. discussing about translation teaching at English Education Department of Teacher Training Pedagogy Faculty and discussing about student's tasks in the form of bilingual essays to answer of what corrections native English speaker made are. In the second discussion, the researcher provide the reader with a part of student's essay with revisions made by a native speaker.

Translation Teaching at English Education Department

Indonesian-English Translation subject at English Education Department of Teacher Training and Pedagogy Faculty of Purworejo Muhammadiyah University is offered to the fifth semester students. In this department the translation teaching has some different characteristics comparing with the translation teaching held by other department or faculty. In it, the translation teaching belongs to what so-called pedagogic translation.

Basically, translation teaching is at least divided into two categories, i.e. real translation and pedagogic translation. Real translation teaching emphasizes on preparing the students to be translator. Meanwhile, pedagogic translation emphasizes on preparing the students to be a teacher of English as a foreign language who are aware of their students' L1. Klaudy in Vermees (2003) explains what pedagogic translation is. According to him pedagogic and real translation differ from each other on three counts: the function, the object, and the addressee of the translation. As regards function, pedagogic translation is an instrumental kind of translation, in which the translated text serves as a tool of improving the language learner's foreign language proficiency.

As a matter of fact, to utilize students' mother tongue or L1 in foreign language teaching occurs not only in Indonesia but also in European countries. In this case Dilkova (2010) writes that one significant activity is worth mentioning, namely translating from and into the mother tongue. ...using mother tongue is becoming more popular nowadays exactly due to its help in foreign language learning. One reason for that is the positive result in the learners' motivation and the sense of achievement.

After examining thirteen student's tasks and after asking a native speaker to correct or revise them, the researcher can find that the students have problem in translating their Bahasa Indonesia essay into English one especially dealing with using inappropriate words and idiomatic expressions which can be specified further by the problems related to diction, omission, addition, misformation, sentence logic, verb agreement, pronoun, punctuation, run-on sentence, and parallelism. It is in accordance with what is stated by Hatim (2001). He states that students or language learners are consistently reported as ideal subjects for the kind of introspective data ... on the specifics of translation such as lexical choice, grammatical restructuring, or the use of idiomatic expressions. Before sending the student's essays to be examined by a native speaker the essay, just the English version, is placed in the table in order to be easily analyzed sentence by sentence.

Table 1: Examining English Text

My Struggle to Earn Money By Dimas Taufik Akbar (10.212.0188)	My Struggle to Earn Money By Dimas Taufik Akbar (10.212.0188)
Student's Problems: no problem	
When I went to college at the first time, I did not think that my tuition fee was so expensive. However, after being a student of semester 2, I thought that my tuition fee and the cost of my transportation were so expensive. ...	When I first went to college, I did not think that my tuition fee was so high. However, after my second semester, I realized that my tuition fee and the cost of my transportation were quite high. ...
Student's Problems: addition//and diction///	

From the table above, the student's problems are especially dealt with using inappropriate words and idiomatic expression. In this case, they are represented by the problem of diction (three times found namely *so expensive* should be changed into *so high*, *thought* should be changed into *realized*, and *so expensive* should be changed into *quite high*), and addition (two times found namely *at the first time* should be *first*, *being a student of semester 2* should be *my second semester*).

After examining thirteen student's tasks, the researcher manages to find out that the students have problem in translating their Indonesian essay into English one especially dealing with using inappropriate words and idiomatic expressions which can be specified further into: diction, omission, addition, misformation, sentence logic, verb agreement, pronoun, punctuation, run-on sentence, and parallelism. However, some mistakes cannot be said as purely translational mistakes nor purely linguistic ones. It is due to the fact that sometimes students write their Indonesian sentence ungrammatically. As a consequence, their English sentence is influenced by their ungrammatical Indonesian sentence.

Students' Task in the Form of Bilingual Essay

The following table is one of thirteen essays that the researcher manages to collect as the data. It covers both the student's bilingual essay and native's speaker revision. However, what is presented here is only some parts of it. It is due to the limited space this article has. In the table, the changes are presented sentence by sentence in order that the analysis can be done more easily.

Table 2: Student's Bilingual Essay and Native Speaker's Revision*

Student's Bilingual Essay		Native Speaker's Revision
Usahaku Untuk Mendapatkan Uang Oleh Dimas Taufik Akbar (10.212.0188)	My Struggle to Earn Money By Dimas Taufik Akbar (10.212.0188)	My Struggle to Earn Money By Dimas Taufik Akbar (10.212.0188)
<i>Paragraph 1</i>		
Nama saya Dimas Taufik Akbar.	My name is Dimas Taufik Akbar.	My name is Dimas Taufik Akbar.
Saya mahasiswa semester lima di Universitas Muhammadiyah Purworejo.	I am a student of the fifth semester at Muhammadiyah University of Purworejo.	I am a fifth semester student at Muhammadiyah University of Purworejo.
Saya sering dipanggil Mas alias Dimas di keluarga saya.	The members of my family often call me Mas or Dimas.	My family members often call me Mas or Dimas.

Walaupun mereka orangtua saya dan orang yang lebih tua dari saya, mereka memanggil saya dengan sebutan <i>Mas</i> .	Although they are my parents and people who are older than me, they call me <i>Mas</i> .	Although they are my parents and they are older than me, they call me <i>Mas</i> .
Saya punya empat saudara.	I have four siblings.	I have four siblings.
Kebetulan saya yang tertua dan terganteng, karena semua saudara saya perempuan.	Coincidentally, I am the oldest and the most handsome, because all my siblings are female.	Coincidentally, I am the oldest and the most handsome because all my siblings are female.
Walaupun saya anak laki-laki satu-satunya, saya tidak ingin menjadi anak emas.	Although I am the only boy in my family, I do not want to be a spoiled child.	Although I am the only boy in my family, I do not want to be a spoiled child.
Saya selalu berusaha hidup mandiri dan bekerja keras membantu kedua orangtua, khususnya untuk membiayai kuliah saya sendiri.	I always try to live independently and to work hard to help both of my parents, especially to pay my tuition fee by myself.	I always try to live independently and to work hard to help my parents, especially to pay my tuition fee by myself.

* revised by Jack H. Rouzer, Ph.D., the lecturer of ESL Composition & Spoken English Program at Ohio State University at the Ohio State University

From the table above, it is clear that the main problems that the students encounter are the problems which deals with the use of inappropriate words and idiomatic expressions. The problems can be specified further namely the problems dealing with diction, omission, addition, misformation, sentence logic, verb agreement, pronoun, punctuation, run-on sentence, and parallelism.

Conclusions and Suggestions

1. Because the number of non-native English speakers exceeds that of native ones, there are at least two anxiety namely the domination of native English teachers (NETs) and, on the other side, the lack of nativelikeness of English teaching outputs.
2. The first anxiety can be overcome by autonomous learning utilizing the non-native English teachers (NNETs) being bilinguals, whereas the second anxiety can be overcome by collaborating proportionally with native English teachers (NETs).
3. In teaching Indonesian-English Translation for students of English Education Department, the lecturer can make use of his bilingual optimally without violating the Communicative Approach principles. Applying Task-Based Language Teaching can be of the promising attempt to realize the communicative translation teaching.

References

- Canagarajah, S. (2012). Toward a Rhetoric of Translingual Writing. In the working papers series on *Negotiating Differences in Language & Literacy*. University of Louisville
- Dilkova, Ts. 2012. Learning Strategies in Foreign Language Teaching: Using Translation in Foreign Language Teaching. *Jurnal of the University of Chemical Technology and Metallurgy*, 45, 4, 2010, 449-4522
- Dulay, Heidi, Marina Burt, and Stephen Krashen. 1982. *Language Two*. Oxford. Oxford University Press.
- Florence, Lai Ping. 2012. Advantages and Disadvantages of Native- and Nonnative English-Speaking Teachers: Student Perspectives in Hongkong. *Tesol Quarterly*. June, 2012.
- Hatim, Basil. 2001. *Teaching and Researching Translation*. Harlow, England. Pearson Education Limited
- Mitchell, M and M. Aguido. 2003. *A Review of Narrative Methodology*. Edinburgh South Australia. DSTO System of Library.
- Mulkan, M.R. 1996. *Kita dan Bahasa Inggris*. Jakarta. Balai Pustaka
- Nurkamto, Joko. 2003. "Problema Pengajaran Bahasa Inggris di Indonesia." *Linguistik Indonesia*. Agustus 2003. tahun ke-21, nomor 2.
- Ramelan. 1994. *Introduction to Linguistics*. Semarang. IKIP Semarang Press.
- Sampson, Andrew. 2012. Learner Code-Switching Versus English Only. *ELT Journal*. July, 2012.
- Vermes, Albert. 2010. Translation in Foreign Language Teaching: A Brief Overview of Pros and Cons. *Eger Journal of English Studies X* (2010) 83-93.