

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES' HOUSING PROVISION IN LAGOS STATE, NIGERIA

By

**OLAYINKA CLEMENT OLOKE
(Matric. No CUGP100232)**

**A Ph.D THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE DEPARTMENT OF ESTATE
MANAGEMENT, COLLEGE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY IN
PARTIAL FUFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (Ph.D)
IN ESTATE MANAGEMENT, COVENANT UNIVERSITY
OTA, NIGERIA**

NOVEMBER, 2015

DEDICATION

This work is dedicated

To God Almighty

CERTIFICATION

This is to certify that Mr. OLOKE Clement Olayinka (Matric. No CUGP100232), carried out this research work in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) in Estate Management of Covenant University, Ota under my supervision.

Dr. Daniel Olufemi Durodola
Supervisor

Date

Dr. Mayowa Olusola Ajibola
Co- Supervisor

Date

Dr. Mayowa Olusola Ajibola
Ag. HOD, Estate Management

Date

Prof. Adebakin Simeon Asaju

External Examiner

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is noteworthy to recognize the contribution of people that made this study a reality.

Foremost amongst these has been my Supervisor, Dr. O.D. Durodola for his support and brilliant contributions to the success of this study. I find it difficult to believe that a man of his caliber could be so humble, dedicated, caring and loving in this savaged world. May the Good Lord reward you adequately and keep you for the professions of the built-environment. Next is Dr. M.O. Ajibola, my Co-Supervisor whose thought provoking inclination seems un-rivaled, for his brilliant contributions, comments and suggestions during the course of this study. At the proposal stage of this research, Dr. C.A. Ayedun did a wonderful work in guidance as well as review of drafts and journal materials until the work took shape and became presentable. I cannot but pay a glowing tribute to my immediate past Co-Supervisor and Ag. Head of Department, Dr. A.O. Oni whose encouragement and contributions then significantly enhance the quality of the work. I also appreciate Dr. A. Enoch, Mr. A.A. Odetumbi, and Dr. M.O. Akanbi for their assistance in data analysis and training on the use of SPSS.

Most importantly I must thank the Chancellor of Covenant University, Dr. David Oyedepo for translating his vision into reality by establishing Covenant University and giving me and my colleagues the opportunity to serve in our small ways and thus the opportunity to carry out this research. One cannot but remember the instruments which God used along the line who are so wonderful to me. They are Professor C.K. Ayo, the Vice Chancellor of Covenant University, Professor Chinedu Shalom, Dean of Post Graduate School, immediate Past Dean of Post Graduate School, Professor Charles Ogbulogoh, Professor Nichols Omoregbe, Dean, College of Science and Technology, immediate past Vice Chancellor Prof Aize Obayan and the pioneer Registrar, Pastor Yemi Nathaniel as well as the succeeding ones namely Dr. Rotimi Daniel, Dr. J.N. Taiwo, Dr. Ntia Ubong, and Dr. O. Oludayo. May the Lord continue to strengthen you all to take the institution to greater heights.

I cannot but specially acknowledge Prof. S.A. Oloyede, Deputy Dean, School of Postgraduate Study for his untiring support and commitment in ensuring that this thesis sees the light of day. He proof read the thesis many times and offered invaluable

suggestions all the time. His warm and fatherly affection along with his wife (Mama) can never be forgotten. Showers of blessing will continue to be yours always.

I must also appreciate Professor E.A. Adeyemi, Professor Timothy. O. Mosaku and Prof. A. Adeboye. Others are Prof. O. I. Fagbenle; former HOD, Building Technology and Dr. E.O. Ibem, HOD, Architecture for their invaluable contributions preparatory to and during the proposal and post-field presentation.

I am very grateful to Dr. C.O. Iroham and Dr. (Mrs) A.O. Oluwunmi, A.O. Akinjare, A.O. Oluwatobi, A.S. Oni, N.J. Peter, I.J. Emeghe for their companionship, encouragement and prodding all the way. To all the students of Estate Managements, particularly the graduating set of 2015/2016 academic session, I am grateful for your prayers and encouragement, I love you all, God bless you all.

I want to put on record the immeasurable support received from the Director and Area Officers in the Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives, Lagos State. I also appreciate the efforts of the six assistants who co-ordinated the distribution and retrieval of various questionnaires at various locations in the study area. I cannot but appreciate all the principal officers and members of the co-operative societies as well as key officers of parent institutions too numerous to name individually, who responded to the questionnaires and granted audience on relevant areas of the research works that need personal opinion. I remain ever grateful and pray that all of you will also receive favour from God and men.

Finally, I am grateful to all members of my nuclear and extended family for their love, support and prayers. Thank you and God bless you all.

AUTHORIZATION TO COPY

COVENANT UNIVERSITY, OTA, NIGERIA

CENTRE FOR LEARNING RESOURCES

POSTGRADUATE THESIS

AUTHORIZATION TO COPY

AUTHOR: OLOKE Olayinka Clement

TITLE: Performance Evaluation of Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision
in Lagos State, Nigeria

DEGREE: Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) in Estate Management

Year: 2015

I, OLOKE, Olayinka Clement hereby authorize Centre for Learning Resources to copy my thesis in part or whole in response to request from individuals and/or organizations for the purpose of private study or research.

Signature

Date

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Title Page	i
Dedication	ii
Certification of Supervisor	iii
Acknowledgement	iv
Authorization to copy	vi
Table of Content	vii
List of Tables	xiii
List of Figures	xvi
Appendix	xvii
Abstract	xviii
Chapter One: Introduction	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Research Problem	5
1.3 Aim and Objectives of the Study	7
1.4 Justification for the Study	7
1.5 Scope of the Study	9
1.6 Limitations of the Study	10
1.7 Definition of Operational Terms	11
1.8 Theoretical Framework	16
1.9 Conceptual Framework	21
1.10 The Structure of the Thesis	32
1.11 Chapter Summary	33

Chapter Two: Literature Review	34
2.1 Introduction	34
2.2 Global Housing Shortfall	34
2.2.1 The Housing Problems Worldwide	34
2.2.2 Global Actions on Housing Shortfall	37
2.2.3 Specific Efforts of Industrialized World in Tackling Housing Shortfall	38
2.2.4 The Nigeria Housing Challenges	49
2.3 Overview of the Nigerian Government Interventions in Housing	50
2.3.1 National Development Plans	50
2.3.2 Housing Policies and Programmes over the Years	52
2.3.2.1 Lagos Executive Development Board	52
2.3.2.2 The Federal Housing Authority	52
2.3.2.3 The National Housing Programmes	53
2.3.2.4 The National Housing Policy	54
2.3.2.5 The National Housing Fund	55
2.3.2.6 The Nigeria Building Society and the Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria	56
2.4 Strategies of Meeting the Housing Shortfall in Nigeria	58
2.5 Public and Private Sector Housing	62
2.5.1 Public Sector Housing	62
2.5.2 Private Sector Housing	63
2.6 The Co-operative Societies' Approach	65
2.6.1 Origin of Co-operative Movement	67
2.6.2 Schools of Thought on Co-operative Societies	69
2.6.3 The International Co-operative Alliance (ICA)	69
2.6.4 Principles and Values of Co-operative Societies	70
2.6.5 Institutional Control of Co-operative Societies in Africa	71
2.6.6 Types of Co-operative Societies	73
2.6.7 Types of Housing Co-operative Societies	76
2.6.8 The Development of Modern Co-operative Societies in Nigeria	77
2.6.9 Co-operative Movement in Lagos State	79
2.7 Empirical Studies	81

2.7.1 Operational Methodologies for Housing Provision by the Co-operative Societies	81
2.7.2 Institutional Controls for Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	86
2.7.3 Success Rate of Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	93
2.7.3.1 Significance of Performance Evaluation	94
2.7.3.2 Purpose of Performance Evaluation	95
2.7.3.3 The Concept of Organization Performance	96
2.7.3.4 Performance Criteria	97
2.7.3.5 Categories of Performance Evaluation Criteria	98
2.7.3.6 Performance Evaluation Criteria for Co-operative Societies	99
2.7.4 Stakeholders' Impressions about Co-operative Societies Housing Provision	111
2.7.5 Challenges Confronting Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	114
2.8 Gaps Identified in Literature	130
2.9 Chapter Summary and Concluding Remarks	131
Chapter Three: Research Methods	132
3.1 Introduction	132
3.2 Setting of the Study	132
3.3 Research Design	134
3.4 Population of the Study	134
3.5 Sample Frame	135
3.6 Sample Size	137
3.6.1 Sample Size of Target Population	137
3.6.2 Sample Size of Survey Population	139
3.7 Sample Design and Selection Process	143
3.8 Data Requirements	144
3.8.1 Data Collection Instruments	144
3.9 Improving the Quality of the Thesis	146
3.9.1 Pilot Study	146

3.9.2 Validity of the Research Instrument	147
3.9.3 Reliability of the Research Instrument	147
3.10 Operationalization of Research Variables	148
3.11 Statistical Tools for Data Analysis	149
3.12 Performance Evaluation Tool: The Balance Scorecard	153
3.13 Chapter Summary	156
Chapter Four: Presentation, Analysis and Interpretation of Data	157
4.1 Introduction	157
4.2 Questionnaire Distribution and Analysis	157
4.2.1 General Characteristics of the Co-operative Societies	158
4.2.2 Socio-economic Characteristics of Members of Co-operative Societies	164
4.3 Housing Provision Intervention Methods by Co-operative Societies	167
4.3.1 Success Rate of the Methods of Housing Intervention (Members' Perspective)	169
4.4 Impact of Oversight Functions on Co-operative Societies	171
4.4.1 Impact of Oversight Functions of Parent Institutions on Co-operative Societies (Executive Perspective)	171
4.4.2 Impact of Oversight Functions of Parent Institutions on Co-operative Societies (Members' Perspective)	173
4.4.3 Independent Sample T-Test of Respondents' Opinion on the Impact of Parent Institutions on Co-operative Housing Provision	174
4.5. Impact of Government Institutions on Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	175
4.5.1 Impact of Government Institutions on Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision (Executives' Perspectives)	176
4.5.2 Impact of Government Institutions on Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision (Members' Perspective)	177
4.5.3 Independent-Sample T-test of Respondents' Opinion	178
4.6 Success Rate of Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	179

4.6.1 Success Rate of Housing Provision Methods	179
4.6.1.1 Success Rate of Housing Development Loan	180
4.6.1.2 Success Rate of Land Acquisition, Documentation, Layout and Allocation	181
4.6.1.3 Success Rate of Housing Development Projects	181
4.6.1.4 Adequacy of Complete Housing Purchase Option	182
4.6.1.5 Success rate of Building Materials Procurement and Distribution	183
4.6.1.6 Stakeholders Impression about Co-operative Societies’ Housing Intervention	184
4.6.2 Independent Sample T-test of Opinion of Stakeholders on Success Rate of Housing Provision by the Co-operative Societies	185
4.7 Report on Land Acquisition and Housing Project Execution	189
4.8 Conceptual Model Validation	190
4.9 Identification of Challenges Confronting Co-operative Societies’ Housing Provision Efforts	198
4.10 Chapter Summary and Concluding Remarks	199
Chapter Five: Results and Discussion	200
5.1 Introduction	200
5.2 Matters Arising from the Socio-economic Characteristics of Members	200
5.3 Housing Provision Intervention Methods by Co-operative Societies	201
5.4 Impact of Oversight Functions on Co-operative Societies’ Efforts in Housing Provision	202
5.5 Success Rate of Co-operative Societies’ Efforts in Housing Provision	203
5.6 Challenges Confronting Co-operative Societies’ Housing Provision Efforts	204
5.7 Chapter Summary and Concluding Remarks	205

Chapter Six: Summary of Findings, Conclusion, Recommendations and Implication for Theory, Practice and Research	206
6.1 Introduction	206
6.2 Summary of Findings	206
6.3 Conclusion	208
6.4 Recommendation	209
6.5 Implication for Theory, Practice and Research	210
6.6 Direction for Future Research	211
6.7 Concluding Remarks	211
References	212

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Title	Page
2.1	Cities, Population and Required Housing Development per annum	35
2.2	Housing Completions by Tenure, England 1990/91 to 2011/12	40
2.3	Population and Social Housing as a Percentage of Total Dwellings in Selected Countries	42
2.4	Development Promotion and Social Housing Provision in Selected Countries	44
2.5	Financing Arrangements Underpinning Social Housing Provision in Selected Countries	46
2.6	Business Model of Social Housing Provision in selected Countries	48
2.7	Performance of Public Housing in Nigeria (1962-2010)	64
2.8	Modes of Housing Provision	66
2.9	Impression of Writers about Success Rate of Co-operative Societies in Housing Provision	110
2.10	Summary of Challenges as Identified by Literature	118
2.10	Tabulated Summary of Empirical Studies	119
3.1	Distribution and Classification of Co-operative Societies in Lagos Metropolis	135
3.2	Distribution of Co-operative Societies Selected for the Study	136
3.3	Model for Sample Size Determination	138
3.4	Spread of Sample Size for the Target Population	139
3.5	Sample Size of the Survey Population	140
3.6	Sample Size Distribution among Housing Co-operative Societies	142
3.7	Sample Size of members of Multi-purpose Co-operative Societies	143
3.8	Operationalization of Research Variables	149

4.1	Administered and Retrieved Questionnaires	158
4.2	General Characteristics of Co-operative Societies	159
4.3	Trend of Operating Fund of Co-operative Society	162
4.4	Residential House Prices & Land Prices by (Private and Public Developers) in Metropolitan Lagos	164
4.5	Socio-economic Characteristics of Members of Co-operative Societies	165
4.6	Housing Provision Intervention Methods by Co-operative Societies	168
4.7	Testing Statistical Significant Difference in the Opinion of Principal Officers and Members on Co-operative Housing Intervention Mechanisms.	169
4.8	Success of Co-operative Housing Provision Methods (Member's Perspective)	170
4.9	Impact of Oversight Functions of Parent Institutions on Co-operative Societies (Executive Perspectives)	172
4.10	Impact of Oversight Functions of Parent Institutions on Co-operative Societies (Members' Perspectives)	173
4.11	Independent-Sample t-test over the Opinions (Executives and Members) on the Impact of Parent Institutions on Co-operative Societies' Housing Intervention	174
4.12	Impact of Government Institutions on Co-operative Society ability to engage in Housing Provision (Executive Perspective)	176
4.13	Impact of Government Institutions on Co-operative Societies' Ability in Housing Provision for Members (Members Perspectives)	178
4.14	Independent-Sample t-test on Respondents' Opinion on the Impact of Government Institution on Co-operative Housing Intervention	179
4.15	Stakeholders' Impression of the Success Rate of Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	180
4.16	Independent Sample T test of Stakeholders' Opinion on Housing Intervention	181
4.17	Table Showing Balance Scorecard Assessment	181

4.18	Status of Land Acquisition by the Co-operative Societies	182
4.19	Regression Analysis of Hypotheses Variables	183
4.20	Success of Building Material Procurement and Distribution	183
4.21	Summary of Success of the Methods	184
4.22	Stakeholders' Impression of the Success Rate of Co-operative Societies' Housing Provision	185
4.23	Independent Sample t-test of Stakeholders' opinion on Housing Intervention Main Hypotheses Trajectory	186
4.24	Table Showing Balance Scorecard Score Assessment	188
4.25	Status of Land Acquisition by the Co-operative Societies	189
4.26	Summary of Categorical Regression (SPSS) Analysis	194
4.27	Main Trajectory of Hypothesis	196
4.28	Challenges Militating against High Performance of Co-operative Societies in Housing Provision	198

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Title	Page
1.1	Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs	18
1.2	Conceptual model of Co-operative Society's Performance in Housing Provision	28
2.1	Balance Scorecard Model (Kaplan and Norton 1992)	109
3.1	Map of Nigeria Showing the Thirty-Six States and FCT	133
3.2	Map of Lagos showing the local government areas in the Metropolis	133
4.1	Membership size of the Co-operative Societies	160
4.2	Operating Fund of the Co-operative Societies	161
4.3	Sources and Trend of Operating Fund	163
4.4	A Balance Scorecard Model for Success determination Adapted from (Kaplan and Norton 1992)	187
4.5	Conceptual Model of Co-operative Societies' Performance in Housing Provision	191
4.6	Validated Conceptual Model of Co-operative Societies' Performance in Housing Provision	197

APPENDIX

Appendix I: List of Co-operative Societies Surveyed in Lagos State	233
Appendix II: Questionnaire for Principal Officers of Co-operative Societies	239
Appendix III: Questionnaire for Members of Co-operative Societies	244
Appendix IV: Questionnaire for Key Officers of Parent Institutions	249
Appendix V: Questionnaire for Area Officers of the Co-operative Societies	251
Appendix VI: Result of the Categorical Regression Analysis of the Hypothesis	253
Appendix VII: Sales Brochure of Lagos State Development and Property Corporation..	256

ABSTRACT

The study evaluated the success rate of co-operative societies in housing provision in Lagos State, Nigeria. The aim of the study was to investigate how well or badly, co-operative societies have fared in meeting the housing needs of their members. The population of the study comprised of the 1,415 registered co-operative societies as contained in the Directory of co-operative societies in Lagos State (2011). The sample frame consisted of staff co-operative societies that are organized on the platform of formal organizations. Four set of questionnaires were administered namely CPEPQ to Principal Officers of 211 co-operative societies; CPEPIQ to 200 Parent Institutions and; CPEMQ to 3,826 members of the co-operative society as well as CPEAQ to the 12 Area Officers in the study area. The 359 institutional based co-operative societies and 11 housing co-operative societies were randomly selected from the twelve area offices culminating into 370 co-operative societies that constituted the sample frame. Based on an online model for determining sample size, the appropriate sample sizes of the institutional based co-operative society were determined at 95% level of confidence and 0.05 margin of probable error, resulting in the total number that constituted the sample size. Data collection instruments comprised four questionnaires designed by the researcher and directed to principal officers and members of the co-operative societies, key officers of parent institutions as well as the Area Officers. Eight Hypotheses were also set to establish the predictive capacity of the independent variables identified. Data generated were measured by means of descriptive statistics including frequency, percentages, likert scale and then analyzed by relative importance index as well as inferential statistics such spearman correlation and categorical regression analysis with the aid of Statistical package for Social Sciences (SPSS version 20). The overall performance was evaluated using balance scorecard technique. Findings showed that co-operative society's performance is below expectation in the study area with only 27.2% of the total number of members that set out to procure complete housing units at the onset achieving their objective at the end of the day while the strategy that was commonly adopted by the society was the grant of housing loan followed by land acquisition through the co-operative societies. The overall performance of co-operative societies in housing provision was strongly affected by government oversight functions, housing provision strategies, operating environment, executive traits, socio-economic characteristics of members, capital base and age of the co-operative societies. The research revealed that insufficient capital base, lack of external finance, high cost of urban land, lack of supportive policy for land acquisition in urban centres and off-site infrastructure critically hindered co-operative societies' ability in housing provision. One of the critical recommendations was that there is need for paradigm shift from generalist co-operative societies to specialist housing co-operative societies in view of the complexities and huge finance associated with housing development. The most significant contribution of this work is the construction of a hedonic model that predicts overall performance of a co-operative society in housing provision.

Keywords: Co-operative Societies, Housing Provision, Performance Evaluation,