



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**AN EVALUATION OF TRAINING DELIVERY EFFECTIVENESS OF A
PROGRAM CONDUCTED BY A PRIVATE TRAINING COMPANY**

THANGARAJ N. MOHANASUNDRAM

FPP 1998 44

**AN EVALUATION OF TRAINING DELIVERY EFFECTIVENESS OF A
PROGRAM CONDUCTED BY A PRIVATE TRAINING COMPANY**

By

THANGARAJ N. MOHANASUNDRAM

**Thesis Submitted in Fulfillment of the Requirement for the
Degree of Master of Science in the Institute
for Distance Education and Learning
Universiti Putra Malaysia
December 1998**



Adalah disahkan bahawa saya telah membaca dan menyemak kertas projek ini bertajuk "An Evaluation of Training Delivery Effectiveness of a Program Conducted by a Private Training Company" oleh Thangaraj N. Mohanasundram Dengan ini diperakui, bahawa kertas projek ini memenuhi syarat dan kelayakan bagi keperluan Ijazah Master Sains (Pembangunan Sumber Manusia).



DR. BAHAMAN ABU SAMAH
Jabatan Pendidikan Pengembangan
Fakulti Pengajian Pendidikan
Universiti Putra Malaysia.
(Penyelia)

Tarikh: 15 - 3 - 99



Profesor Madya DR. HJH AMINAH AHMAD
Jabatan Pendidikan Pengembangan
Fakulti Pengajian Pendidikan
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Pemeriksa)

Tarikh: 16/3/99

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I wish to express my gratitude to Universiti Putra Malaysia for having granted me the extension of time to complete my project. The extension came just when I was about to succumb my quest for the MSc degree - to the physical and mental exhaustion of my involvement at the Kuala Lumpur International Airport and the Bukit Jalil Sports Complex Projects.

I am profoundly grateful to my Project Supervisor, Dr. Bahaman Abu Samah for his support and guidance on the project. I have gained profoundly from his knowledge of statistical methods as evidenced in my study.

I am greatly indebted to my colleague, Mr. Sathivalu Annamalai , who has been throughout my source of inspiration to complete this program. He was of great assistance in the review of my literature and instrumental in helping me obtain the secondary data for the study.

I wish to express my sincere appreciation to Associate Professor, Dr. K. Kuperan of the Faculty of Economics and Management, Universiti Putra Malaysia for his invaluable comments on my methodology and findings.

I am very thankful to Miss Sri Yogamalar and Miss Tanusha Sharon for their assistance in proof-reading the scripts, and to many others who have contributed in one way or the other.

Last, but not least, I am eternally indebted to my beloved wife and children who endured with patience and understanding the sacrifice of my time between my work and my study.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENT	iv
LIST OF TABLES	vii
ABSTRACT	ix
ABSTRAK	xi
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	
Background and Setting of the Study	1
The Need for Training Evaluation	3
Evaluation of Training	5
Statement of the Problem	8
Objectives of the Study	10
Significance of the Study	11
Assumptions	12
Limitations of the Study	14
Definition of Terms	15
CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	
Definition and Purpose of Evaluation	17
Current Evaluation Practice - Models and Techniques	22
The Role of the Trainer	32
Summary	34



CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY

Introduction	37
Design of the Study	37
Population and Sample	38
Instrumentation	42
Data Gathering	46
Level of Measurement	46
Method of Analysis	47

CHAPTER 4 FINDINGS

Introduction	49
Analysis of the Perceived Level of Achievement of Training Objectives	50
Evaluation of Training Delivery Effectiveness in Terms of Course Contents	51
Assessment of Program Application	53
Assessment of Discussion	53
Assessment of Usefulness and Adequacy of Examples	54
Assessment of Expectations	54
Assessment of Layout and Sequence	55
Assessment of Relevance	55
Assessment of Subject Matter	55
Assessment of Substantiality	56
Assessment of Ease of Understanding	56
Evaluation of Training Delivery Effectiveness in Terms of Trainer Factors	57
Assessment of Trainer's Ability to Generate Participation	58
Assessment of Trainer's Knowledge of Subject Matter	58
Assessment of Trainer's Preparedness	58



Assessment of Trainer's Presentation Skills	59
Assessment of Understanding Real Life Situations	59
Evaluation of Training Delivery Effectiveness in Terms of External Factors	59
Assessment of Administration and Other Support Services	60
Assessment of Course Fees Reasonability	61
Assessment of Food and Refreshments	61
Assessment of Seating Arrangement	61
Assessment of Suitability of Training Centre	62

CHAPTER 5 SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary	63
Conclusions	64
Recommendations	66
Suggestions for Future Study	70

BIBLIOGRAPHY	72
---------------------	----

APPENDIX 1	79
-------------------	----

APPENDIX 2	80
-------------------	----



LIST OF TABLES

TABLE		Page
1	A Breakdown of the Number of Participants According to Training Program Dates	39
2	Summary of Participants' Reactions to Achievement of Training Objectives	51
3	Summary of Participants' Reactions to Course Contents	52
4	Summary of Participants' Reactions to Trainer Factors	57
5	Summary of Participants' Reactions to External Factors	60



Abstract of the research project submitted to the Jabatan Pendidikan Pengembangan, Universiti Putra Malaysia in partial fulfillment for the of Master of Science.

**AN EVALUATION OF TRAINING DELIVERY EFFECTIVENESS OF A
PROGRAM CONDUCTED BY A PRIVATE TRAINING COMPANY**

By

Thangaraj N. Mohanasundram

September 1998

Supervisor : Dr. Bahaman Abu Samah
Faculty : Jabatan Pendidikan Pengembangan
Fakulti Pengajian Pendidikan
Universiti Putra Malaysia

The aim of this study was to evaluate a series of a training programs called Effective Supervisor organized by a private training provider who is registered with the Human Resource Development Fund (HRDF) of the Ministry of Labour, Malaysia.

The evaluation was undertaken by analysing perceived achievement of stated training objectives as measurement of training delivery effectiveness *vis a vis* course contents, trainer and external factors.



The study was done by using secondary data, that is the questionnaires that have been filled by the participants of the programs 'Effective Supervisor' provided by Consembition Jaya Sdn Bhd. for the period between May 1996 and June 1998. The data collated for all the 151 participants over the seven sessions of the program between May 1996 and June 1998 were used in this study. This evaluation was basically a Kirkpatrick's Level One measurement carried out to assess the participants' reaction towards the training program.

The SPSS package using frequency tabulation was used to analyze the data in this study. The SPSS package using frequency tabulation was used to analyze the data in this study. Foremost, the finding of the study was that the respondents had generally perceived that the training delivery had achieved its stated objectives, the mean score for this measurement variable being 3.87 with a standard deviation of 0.73. This finding ascertains that the delivery of training has had a positive impact on this sample of respondents.

Secondly, the mean response ranging from 3.75 to 4.05 for the measurement criteria of course contents indicate that respondents in this sample were more than satisfied with every aspect of course contents. The mean scores less than 3.80 were course expectations, layout and sequence and subject matter of the course.

Thirdly, the effectiveness of training delivery in respect of trainers' factors was also favourable. The mean responses for the trainer performance criteria were ranging from 4.10 to 4.25. The scores show that respondents in this sample were more than satisfied with every aspect of trainer factors. There were no mean scores less than 4.00. The findings indicated that trainers for this program were very good.

Finally, the mean response for the measurement criteria of external factors ranged from 3.73 to 3.92, an indication that respondents in this sample were also satisfied with every aspect of external factors that were evaluated.

Recommendations and suggestions for improving the current evaluation study and possible areas of future research in training evaluation were put forward.



Abstrak projek kajian yang diserahkan kepada Jabatan Pendidikan Pengembangan, Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai pemenuhan separa bagi Ijazah Sarjana Sains.

**SATU PENILAIAN KEEFEKTIFAN PENYAMPAIAN LATIHAN BAGI SATU
PROGRAM YANG DIANJURKAN OLEH SEBUAH SYARIKAT LATIHAN
PERSENDIRIAN**

Oleh

Thangaraj N. Mohanasundram

September 1998

Penyelia : Dr. Bahaman Abu Samah
Fakulti : Jabatan Pendidikan Pengembangan
Fakulti Pengajian Pendidikan
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Tujuan kajian ini adalah untuk menilai siri program latihan yang disebut ‘Penyelia Efektif’ yang dianjurkan oleh sebuah pembekal latihan persendirian yang berdaftar dengan Tabung Pembangunan Sumber Manusia yang berada di bawah Kementerian Buruh, Malaysia.

Penilaian ini dibuat dengan menentukan pencapaian objektif latihan tersebut dari segi kandungan kursus, pelatih dan faktor luaran.

Kajian ini telah dibuat dengan menggunakan data sekunder, iaitu borang soal-selidik yang telah diisi oleh peserta program 'Penyelia Efektif' yang disediakan oleh Consembition Sdn Bhd bagi tempoh masa di antara Mei 1996 dan Jun 1998. Data yang dikumpul bagi semua 151 peserta sepanjang tujuh sesi program di antara Mei 1996 dan Jun 1998 telah digunakan bagi kajian ini. Penilaian ini pada asasnya adalah ukuran Tahap Satu Kirkpatrick yang dijalankan untuk menilai reaksi peserta terhadap program latihan.

Pakej SPSS dengan menggunakan frekuensi tabulasi telah digunakan untuk menganalisa data dalam kajian ini. Pertamanya, penemuan kajian ini adalah secara amnya, responden menganggap latihan telah mencapai objektifnya, skor min bagi pembolehubah ukuran adalah 3.87 dengan deviasi standard 0.73. Penemuan ini menunjukkan dengan jelas penyampaian latihan mempunyai kesan yang positif ke atas responden sample ini.

Keduanya, min respon yang menjangkau dari 3.75 kepada 4.05 bagi kriteria pengukuran kandungan kursus menunjukkan responden dalam sample ini puas terhadap setiap aspek kandungan kursus. Skor min kurang daripada 3.80 adalah jangkaan kursus, taburan dan urutan dan juga tajuk bincangan dalam kursus ini.

Ketiga, keberkesanan penyampaian latihan dari segi faktor pelatih juga adalah memuaskan. Min respon bagi kriteria penyampaian pelatih menjangkau

dari 4.10 ke 4.25. Skor menunjukkan responden dalam contoh ini puas dengan setiap aspek faktor pelatih. Tidak ada skor min kurang daripada 4.00. Penemuan menunjukkan pelatih bagi program ini adalah bagus.

Akhirnya, min respon bagi kriteria pengukuran faktor luaran menjangkau dari 3.73 ke 3.92, menunjukkan responden dalam contoh ini juga puas dengan setiap aspek luaran yang dikaji.

Pendapat dan cadangan bagi meningkatkan kajian sekarang dan juga kajian pada masa depan dalam bidang kajian latihan telah diketengahkan.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Background and Setting of the Study

The Government formed the Human Resources Development Council under the Human Resources Development Act 1992 to provide an impetus to the employers in the private sector to actively provide training to upgrade the skills of their employees. The Human Resources Development Act 1992 requires companies in the manufacturing and service sectors with more than ten employees to contribute one percent of each employee's wages each to the fund operated by the Human Resources Development Council. There are about 6,000 employers contributing to the fund and a total of RM 502 million has been contributed towards the *fund* since its inception in 1993.

In line with the objective to increase training capacity in new areas as well as higher level skills, the coverage of the Human Resources Development Fund was expanded in 1995. The fund now includes the service industry, namely the hotel industry, telecommunications, tour and travel agencies, shipping, courier services, advertising and information technology services are now allowed access to the Fund. Some 533,330 employees have benefited from training funded by the HRDF as at end of 1996. The government's emphasis on training and development is further

enunciated in the Seventh Malaysia Plan (1996-2000), where an allocation of RM 292 million has been made. The focus of this five-year plan has been directed at improving the quality of education to help develop a competent labour force that will harness the competitiveness of the Malaysian economy.

From the foregoing, an enormous quantum has provided for training and development, remarkable by any standards for a developing country with a populace of only 20 million people. It underlines the government's seriousness and realisation of the significant role played by the human resource development in the nation's growth. In the quest for a developed nation status, competent and skilled workforce becomes the basis for the nation's engine of growth.

Training always has played an important and integral part in furthering various kind of human learning and development. A comprehensive, useful and effective training programme needs to be designed to cater for individuals' advancement and organisation development. Training can bring out the best of each employee and enhances the profitability prospects of any organisation.

Organisations in Malaysia are beginning to appreciate the value of such training and are prepared to put in a long-term investment in training and development schemes. These organisations such as Telekom

Malaysia, Petronas, Malayan Banking Berhad, Motorola, IBM consider human resource as the most dynamic and most important of their resources. As such, training and development is given adequate attention from the organisations' senior management.

The Need for Training Evaluation

The basic objectives of training, which is to bring about change with regards to attitude, knowledge and skills. In other words, there should be in impact, and the impact should be to bring about an observable change with regards to knowledge, aspirations, skills and attitude. This calls for measuring the impact of training evaluation.

The most significant development in the field of human resource development can be said the current emphasis towards high professional accountability (Philips, 1990). Human resource development managers and other professionals involved in the training profession, must now commit in the face of ever increasing pressure to implement programmes with favourable cost-benefit ratio, meaning to say the training must be results-oriented. Organisers have little choice but to ensure and maintain a reasonably acceptable level of efficiency and effectiveness to produce programs that would produce immediate and tangible results.

An organization would depend upon the effectiveness of its training program *vis a vis* its costs. The effectiveness can be examined by



studying three critical issues. They are (Gavin 1993): 1) meaning, 2) management and 3) measurement. This means that a strong purposive foundation for the training and development programs should be understood by the participants i.e. the training purchaser, training provider, trainer and trainee. Moreover, it must be easily applicable besides being able to be carried out. Secondly, there must be vivid, cogent guidelines for motivational action, and thirdly, there must be a better system of measuring the effectiveness of such training and development so as to ascertain that gains have been achieved. In fact, the new concept on training and development stresses on the underlying results.

Essentially, productive-cum-effective training programs require systematic planning and instructional design and a properly controlled implementation method with enough resource back up for obtaining the required program targets. But the non-availability of a suitable evaluation program would spell difficulty in ascertaining the productiveness of any training program and later, to rationally continue carrying out such a program.

The aim of training and development is to stimulate behavioural change in the working environment. Because of the training process, individuals would undertake to do things differently now as compared to the time prior to the training and development being provided to them.

Such behavioural changes as a result of training and development ought to be measured by virtue of the organisation's needs; some ways to determine the worthiness of such training.

Evaluation of Training

Apparent failure in contributing to the overall corporate development has led to criticisms of training and development recently. Those criticisms which have become a hotbed of issues are: 1) programs are not specifically connected to strategies, challenges or problems in the workplace, 2) programs are created to instill a sense of awareness and understanding, but not competence, 3) programs center on individuals as compared to operating units, 4) participants having a vague purpose for attending programs, and 5) failure of programs in helping participants face reality [Philips, 1991].

Part of the control process entails training evaluation. This is part and parcel of program development. Evaluation is utilised as a way of analysing the credit-worthiness of ongoing programs and the efficacy of modifying the programs, studying the usage of new programs, improving program management and fulfilling accountability needs (Rossi and Freeman, 1993).

Further, evaluation triggers and completes the program planning cycle by giving worthwhile feedback to evaluation stakeholders (Boone,

1986). Moreover, a properly-patterned evaluation will document achievements, account for resources and policy compliance, detect future requirements and targets, ensure co-operation and co-ordination with other agencies and discover program weakness (Grotelueschen, 1980).

Evaluation methods are for the purpose of getting feedback regarding the results of training output and to utilise this information to analyse training effectiveness, if required. Training evaluation is to do with setting apt training standards, like other control methods. These may be in the form of policies, objectives, compliance with external standards and the trainer's standards --- training and qualification. Obviously, the more accurate the standards, the easier it is to assess training success. It is to be noted that it is vital to carry out an evaluation of the program being conducted and its end result in the commencement stage of a program itself. This will be a yardstick of the quantity-cum-quality of the program objectives that have been achieved.

Researchers have given evaluation various meanings, indicating how profound information gathering is in evaluation. Evaluation is looked at as a means of collecting information which makes it possible for one to decide whether to accept, change or reject an entity, irrespective of whether it is an activity or program. But researchers generally are at '*consensus ad idem*' that is central to program evaluation is decision-making.



Program evaluation can be carried out formally or informally. When questions and issues become invariably complicated, formal evaluation overrides personal and informal evaluation, as it is an organised and disciplined method of assessing the aim of evaluation and criteria application in objective decision-making. The following are some of the commonly employed criteria in training delivery evaluation:

- a) Extent of the targeted program's achievements (effectiveness of the program).
- b) Cost of the program in comparison with what it has accomplished (efficiency of the program).
- c) Thoroughness and coherence of the program.
- d) Reception and acceptability of the program.

The method of measuring is actually the method of ascertaining to what extent the training objectives are being realised by the program (Tyler, 1993). However, since educational objectives are actually changes in learners, namely the objectives are intended to produce certain desirable changes in the behaviour patterns of the participants, then evaluation or assessment is the method of identifying the rate at which these behavioural changes are actually occurring. This is essential to identify as most of us take evaluation as being synonymous to a paper and pencil test or a 'smiling sheet' at the close of a training program.

It cannot be denied that a 'smiling sheet' does provide a practical tool in obtaining evidence about various kinds of participants' behaviour. However, there are several cases, for example where an objective such as "application on job" cannot be accurately assessed immediately at the close of a training program. Instead, it is much easier and validly appraised through long term observation. Observations are also useful devices to get at habits and certain kinds of operational skills that can be effectively made in the working arena.

In fact, the close-of-program evaluation utilising questionnaires actually assesses trainee reactions to the delivery of a training program. In view of Kirkpatrick's training evaluation model, this is called Level I Evaluation. Having said that, theories and models that are context-free and emphasise the usage of formal, systematic and comprehensive approaches to program evaluation are designed merely as a guide for general situations. Before they can be of any meaningful use, they have to be adapted to the contextual situation.

Statement of the Problem

The current atmosphere of austere training budgets and decreasing labour dictates the effectiveness in manpower training. With increasing technical areas and lesser training resources, efficient training management takes much greater priority. Effective training management

often includes scrutiny of both trainee selection procedures and training delivery effectiveness.

Numerous theories and models have proved that evaluation is an essential part of the systematic training process. It is part and parcel of the control process of training. The generic goal of most evaluations is to provide a useful feedback to a variety of audiences including sponsors, donors, clients, administrators, staff and others. Most often, feedback is perceived as useful if it aids in decision-making. The relationship between an evaluation and its impact is not a simple one. Studies that seem critical sometimes fail to influence short-term decisions, and studies that initially seem to have no influence can have a delayed impact when more congenial conditions arise. Despite this, the broad consensus that the major goal of evaluation should be to influence decision –making or policy formulation through the provision of effective evaluation processes and empirically driven feedback on the results or output of training, with a view for improvement if need be.

A large part of training and development programs have an in-built course evaluation completed and handed in by the participants at the end of the course. Such evaluation is commonly known as the “smile sheet” evaluation. Data collected by this sort of an evaluation tool would be handy as the program’s immediate feedback. It should be noted that the advantage of such type of feedback is limited. It is usually a questionnaire

that assesses the participants' perceptions towards a program and does not evaluate the learning that has taken place. Despite its clear drawbacks, investigations show that such practice is the norm and there seems to be no intention to divert to more sophisticated methods.

Training delivery is monitored in many instructional settings to assess content accuracy, adequacy of training materials, and trainer or instructor performance. Often, training delivery assessments include, besides the use of trainee evaluation or reaction forms, instructor critiques, and periodic measurement of instructor performance by qualified personnel.

Objectives of the Study

The general objective of the evaluation study was to assess the training delivery of a program conducted by a private company registered with the Ministry of Labour, Malaysia.

The specific objectives of the were as follows:

1. To determine the perceived level of achievement of training objectives.
2. To determine the effectiveness of training delivery in terms of course content.
3. To determine the effectiveness of training delivery in terms of trainer factors.

4. To determine the effectiveness of training delivery in terms of external factors.

Significance of the Study

This study attempts to assess the effectiveness of training delivery of a training program rendered by a private training company as a case study.

This evaluation study focuses on the importance of conducting an effective evaluation approach on training delivery using appropriate techniques especially for those involved in the provision of training programs. Ascertaining the response of training with a greater level of accuracy would permit us to understand the perceptions of trainees to a certain training program.

The findings would help program designers and implementers in the formulation of a more comprehensive syllabus in order to optimise the benefits of such training programs. It would also provide trainers as well as training institutions with information on the course content, required trainer qualities and approaches when designing and managing training programs.

It is hoped that it will generate more interest in the training evaluation field to attempt with more robust statistical analyses in the