

# **CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA:**

## **A REPORT TO SCHOOLS**

Daniel Hammett  
University of Witwatersrand

and

Lynn A. Staeheli  
University of Edinburgh

2009



### *Acknowledgements:*

This research was funded through an award from the Economic and Social Research Council in the United Kingdom, and was supplemented by a post-doctoral fellowship from the University of Witwatersrand.

We are indebted to all of those who participated in the research. In particular, we would like to thank the schools and staff who generously gave of their time and hospitality. Without their support, this project could not have been completed.

Thanks are also due to the Centre for African Studies, University of Cape Town for their provision of office space and resources during the fieldwork period in Cape Town.

## CONTENTS

### PAGE

Executive Summary	2
The Project	3
General Remarks	4
Summary of Findings	
<i>Is citizenship education important? Competing Views</i>	4
<i>Defining and teaching citizenship</i>	5
<i>Key challenges in citizenship education</i>	6
<i>Making citizenship relevant</i>	9
Where Next?	10
Your Thoughts	10
Appendix 1: Methodology and Ethics	11
Appendix 2: Descriptions of schools	13
Appendix 3: Meanings of citizenship	22
Appendix 4: Examples of citizenship education practices	24
Appendix 5: Resources and additional teaching materials	28

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report addresses findings from the research project ‘Education, Citizenship Formation and Democratisation in South Africa’. This research asked:

- ◆ How are citizens imagined by government institutions?
- ◆ What educational practices are used in citizenship education? and
- ◆ What tensions emerge between education policy, practice and learning?

These questions are addressed through analysis of policy documents, academic literature, school textbooks as well as interviews with 62 school principals and educators from 12 schools and 7 other informants.

### Key findings

Definitions of Citizenship. Policy documents discuss citizenship in abstract terms including ideals of the healthy citizen, the active citizen, the productive citizen and the responsible citizen. Curriculum materials try to build upon those values to talk about the ‘development of self-in-society’ and engage learners with core, everyday social concerns. Educators add another layer of meaning, as they seek to adapt curriculum materials to make them accessible and relevant to their learners. Key values and ideals imparted by educators included the recognition and celebration of unity in diversity; fostering self-respect and a culture of respect; taking responsibility for addressing contemporary problems; promoting critical thinking; developing a sense of pride and national belonging; and preparing learners for life after school.

Challenges to Teaching Citizenship Education. The social and environmental context of the schools and communities present barriers in terms of transport, nutrition, health, safety, and other social problems. Learners often did not see the relevance of citizenship education to their lives, felt disenfranchised from the political system and disillusioned with continued inequalities and disparities. Material and resource constraints in all schools – experienced in different ways – undermined the ability of educators to deliver the curriculum and hindered the development of a safe and positive learning environment. Failures in communication between Provincial education departments and schools exacerbated concerns with training and resources, and educators felt they lacked the tools and language to talk about critical issues. Some respondents even questioned the value of this subject, arguing that it distracted from ‘core’ learning areas. Other educators were more supportive, noting that citizenship education was a cross-curriculum subject that aided learners’ academic and social development. Almost all respondents were concerned that the ideas presented in the citizenship education curriculum were too abstract and did not match well with learners’ experiences in everyday life.

Innovations in Teaching Citizenship Education. Despite these challenges, educators demonstrated a range of imaginative approaches to citizenship education in efforts to engage their learners. Ideas to involve learners in the practices of citizenship – from drawing up a class pledge through the fostering of the school as a space of citizenship to involvement in outreach activities – were noted.

## THE PROJECT

This report is one element of the research project “Education, Citizenship Formation and Democratisation in South Africa.” The project was designed to examine the role of citizenship education in post-apartheid South Africa. The transition to a more democratic government and society presents an exciting opportunity to understand how a new kind of citizen is imagined and the efforts to actually shape those citizens in the education system. Our particular interest is in the ways the ideals of citizenship are implemented – and sometimes transformed – in policy, textbooks, and the daily practices of teaching and learning.

Of course, there are challenges in this process of making new citizens. Building an equitable, multicultural democracy with human rights at the core is a daunting task; no country has achieved it. South Africa, however, faces particular challenges in creating this new kind of society and citizen. The sheer numbers of students, the different languages in which education is delivered, the extreme income inequality and poverty, the diversity of learners, the lack of resources for schools, and the historical legacies of apartheid may seem almost insurmountable barriers. Yet educators and learners labour on. The ideals may not be achieved, but new citizens are being taught everyday. Our questions sought to understand the kinds of citizen that are emerging from South Africa’s schools and, by extension, what kind of democracy is forged.

To this end, our research asked a number of questions:

1. How is the citizen imagined in government institutions and agencies?
2. What are the educational strategies and practices used in citizenship education?
3. What tensions and contradictions emerge between education policy, practice and learning?

To address these questions, background work included analysis of government policy documents, academic and professional literature, school textbooks and curriculum materials. This analysis informed the development of the second stage of research, involving interviews with education-related NGOs (Non-Governmental Organisations), Department of Education officials, and school principals and educators.

Twelve schools were involved in the research project: 11 were state funded and one was an independent school. These schools were located in Cape Town (four state funded and one independent), Pietermaritzburg (four schools), and King William’s Town (three schools). Within each urban area, schools were selected across the socio-economic spectrum as a proxy for the historic racial segregation of education. Thus, ex-Model C, former House of Delegates, former House of Representatives, and township schools were included. Descriptions of each school can be found in Appendix 2. The school principal and the life orientation and history teaching staff at each school were invited to participate. In total, 62 interviews with school staff were conducted.

## GENERAL REMARKS

For all that schools are guided by national education priorities and policies, their day-to-day operation is affected by the regional and local contexts in which they are situated. Each school faces a different set of opportunities and challenges depending upon the historic and contemporary conditions of the school and the communities it serves. Varying levels of poverty, unemployment, continued inequalities, differential access to safe learning spaces beyond the school, and broader social issues frame the delivery and reception of education. These contexts make it difficult to generalise from our interviews or to suggest anything like a “best practice”. Our approach, instead, is to draw out key themes that emerged from the interviews. We will summarise the ways in which citizenship was defined in policy, textbooks, and by educators, and then will highlight the ways educators taught about citizenship and the challenges faced. More examples of each are included in the appendices: Appendix 2 includes a description of each school; Appendix 3 describes more fully the definitions of citizenship; Appendix 4 presents some examples of teaching practice that were successful in engaging student interest; and Appendix 5 includes a list of resources and additional teaching materials. Each of these was mentioned by educators as something they would appreciate having.

The school day is already very busy, with educators’ teaching, pastoral and administrative obligations increasing. We were struck by a pervasive weariness and feeling of isolation that ranged across the schools. We therefore want to stress that this report is not intended to add to that increasing burden. Instead, we hope that by sharing information about other schools, the practices used at other schools, and providing links to existing resources, we can offer something to educators that will be interesting, be helpful, and contribute to a sense of common purpose.

Citizenship education is important on many levels, and the challenge remains to make it accessible, engaging and meaningful to learners. Citizenship education is part of the foundation upon which learners’ values, behaviours and dispositions will be built in later life. Given the imperative of the nation-building project to create citizens who are aware of the past but who have moved beyond histories of division and inequality, this is particularly important. In other words, citizenship education is a long-term project, the goals of which will most often be realised after the learner has left school. These long-term aims and apparently intangible outcomes may not seem immediately important or relevant to either the learner or the educator, both of whom confront the short-term demands of examinations.

## SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

### *Is citizenship education important? Competing views*

A number of staff at different schools and representatives from some NGOs questioned the value of the life orientation subject area, and of citizenship education in particular. In these discussions, a number of concerns were raised:

- ◆ the subject matter distracted time and funding from ‘core’ subjects that were necessary for national and individual development,

- ◆ learners did not take this part of the curriculum seriously, and
- ◆ the issues covered should be the responsibility of parents/guardians.

In contrast with those concerns, government officials, policy documents, and other educators and NGOs argued that citizenship education is an integrative subject that promotes important skills, values and knowledge:

- ◆ the subject crosses the curriculum to develop skills in critical thinking, communication, and reasoning,
- ◆ educators can influence the socialisation of learners into particular norms of behaviour and social actions, and
- ◆ citizenship education helps learners understand what democracy is, how international issues affect their communities, how to exercise their democratic rights, how to hold leaders accountable, and to overcome a sense of powerlessness in the face of global and local inequalities.

In many respects, the different perspectives reflect the difficulties of balancing immediate needs with long-term goals and ideals in the context of constrained resources. Rather than being an abstract debate, however, many educators feel that some aspects of the curriculum restrict their abilities to meet the needs of the learners in their schools. There was a level of frustration that this message did not seem to be reaching officials in the Department of Education.

### *Defining and teaching citizenship*

Citizenship is defined in multiple ways in government policy, curriculum materials and by educators. Not surprisingly, the definitions of citizenship and ideas about how it should be taught seem to reflect the different positions and roles of policy and curriculum developers as compared to principals and educators.

Policy and government documents: Citizenship is defined in abstract terms in policy documents, and is generally focused on the qualities of a good citizen. South African citizens are expected to take on the core values of the Constitution, with emphasis placed upon: ideals of tolerance, respect, and diversity; the promotion of human rights; and active citizens who work to address community problems, to overcome inequalities, and to promote anti-racism.

Curriculum materials: Textbooks and other curriculum materials build on the values expressed in national policy. They talk of citizenship education as the ‘development of self-in-society’ through which the learner understands his or her position within society and the ways in which actions affect other people. Specific concerns surrounding discrimination, xenophobia, race, HIV/AIDS and diversity are highlighted, as is the importance of encouraging an ethic of volunteerism and service. Learners are expected to understand their rights and duties as citizens, specifically to develop an understanding of the political structures of the country and how to participate in elections. In other words, citizenship involves responsibility to self, family, and society and incorporates the values of the Constitution.

Educators: Educators play a vital role in translating these ideals into concepts that are relevant and accessible to their learners. It is through their attempts to relate the

syllabus to the realities facing their learners that these key ideas are given new meanings.

Educators in general spoke of a set of values, actions and ideals that overlapped strongly with government documents. Key aspects of their definitions that did so included:

- ◆ the responsibility of citizens to address contemporary problems that are rooted in the country's history,
- ◆ the importance of recognising – and celebrating – the diversity of the country,
- ◆ developing a sense of social interaction and social service,
- ◆ fostering self-esteem and self-respect, as well as a culture of respect (for others, for property, for the environment),
- ◆ understanding the structures and functioning of the country and the ways in which one can participate in these (not only in terms of voting and elections, but how to make claims upon the government and how to hold leaders accountable), and
- ◆ developing knowledge and understanding of people and places beyond one's own community.

As educators worked directly with learners, we observed additional elements of citizenship that we explored in interviews. Specifically, we observed educators attempting to:

- ◆ promote critical thinking, debate, and engagement regarding social, political and environmental issues; much of this focused on local issues, although educators also attempted to draw connections with broader issues,
- ◆ instil a sense of pride in being a citizen of South Africa; this included recognising how far the country had come since the transition from apartheid,
- ◆ develop a sense of nationhood and belonging,
- ◆ convey the importance of obeying laws, and
- ◆ prepare learners' for life beyond school.

Educators talked about these issues as making it possible for learners to act as citizens and to identify themselves as citizens of South Africa. In this sense, citizenship seemed almost a way of being-in-the-world as much as it is a specific legal standing or a set of qualities. Many teachers underscored the importance of faith and religion in compelling learners to act as citizens. Virtually all of the educators talked of how far the country had to go in terms of achieving the ideals of citizenship.

### *Key challenges in teaching citizenship education*

For all that some people believed citizenship education was important, almost everyone talked about the challenges to teaching about citizenship. As noted, some of our respondents questioned the utility of devoting time to citizenship education in light of the other challenges facing schools and communities and the limited resources available to address them. The challenges ranged from the attitudes of learners, to the resources available for teaching, to broad questions of how to address continued, structural inequality in the country. As many educators commented, these challenges are not unique to citizenship education. Instead, these are challenges confronted in every subject as educators work with learners.

Learners. Learners in South African schools face all of the challenges that teenagers everywhere face, but some face additional barriers. Some learners struggle to get to school every day. Most of the schools had feeding programmes of some sort, but the poorest schools did not; this meant learners came to school without having eaten breakfast. In some of the integrated schools, learners from informal settlements had to travel long distances to school. In some schools, the majority of learners are believed to be HIV positive, and many other learners are already involved in the legal system. In short, many learners face obstacles that limit their ability to come to school prepared for learning.

Once at school, learners struggled to see the relevance of citizenship to their lives at this age. They often were not engaged with politics and the political process, due to a disinterest in politics, a sense that there was no direct accountability between their community and local and national leaders, and a sense that direct participation in politics made no difference. Furthermore, lessons about equality in environments where inequality is written into the fabric of the school and the community presents a gap between ideal and reality that learners are quick to pick up on.<sup>1</sup> As might be expected, learners in some of the wealthier schools did not seem to notice the gap in the same way as learners in schools that drew from informal settlements and townships. After observing several schools, we began to wonder how learners from the settlements who were able to attend former Model C schools thought about this issue, but were not able to examine this issue in this research.

Resource and training constraints in the schools. Material and resource constraints hindered all forms of teaching, particularly the outcomes based education approach. In many schools, this was evident in overcrowding of classrooms, shortages of teaching staff, the costs of maintenance and upkeep of school property, lack of access to additional learning resources (computer facilities, school libraries, community libraries, media resources, safe study spaces outside of school hours), and shortages of textbooks and teaching materials within schools. This was of greatest significance in schools that drew from poor areas, as families of learners could not pay the high fees required to supplement inadequate levels of government support. We noted the poor condition of many schools, including exposed wires, broken windows, and effluent from sewers spilling into school grounds. In some schools, passing periods involved the movement of tables and chairs, not just learners. We noted improvement in some schools between our first and second set of visits, but conditions in a number of schools remained woefully inadequate.

Almost all educators felt they lacked training and support in delivering citizenship education lessons. While district and provincial officials often provided resources and training, educators typically were not able to get access to those resources. They heard about training workshops *after* the workshops were held or were unable to attend because of staff shortages in their schools.<sup>2</sup> Some resources and training materials are available on-line, but educators in about half of the school did not have access to computers or fax machines. Department officials often seemed to believe that

---

<sup>1</sup> We wondered what learners thought about this gap, and attempted to survey them. However, a pilot survey was unsuccessful due to low return rates and time pressures on educators and learners.

<sup>2</sup> Almost all of the schools had shortages of teachers, with one school needing 8 additional educators out of a faculty of 49.



teaching materials had been distributed, but schools had not received them. In a small effort to address the lack of supporting and training materials, we have included a list of resources for citizenship education in Appendix 5, but we note that many of them are only available on-line. The broader issue is that there needs to be better training and support for educators, and that improvements in communication are needed.

Home languages and language of instruction. Educators in many schools faced the difficulty of teaching about complex ideas in learners' second language; this was a particular issue for English-medium schools in poor areas. In these situations, many staff would switch between English and the majority home language in order to try and overcome this constraint.<sup>3</sup> This was an issue in teaching every subject.

Confronting race and inequality. Citizenship in South Africa is not dependent on race, yet many of the challenges facing South African citizens are rooted in the country's history of racial inequality. Educators were expected to talk about inequality and to deal with questions around history, race and diversity, but were not provided with the language or tools to do this. A major dilemma for staff was how to talk about these topics without entrenching racial thinking in their learners. They struggled with how they should talk about class and economic issues without alienating learners, and with how they should talk about diversity in classrooms that may have little diversity as compared to those with a very diverse learner body. These particular challenges are framed by the wider failings of government to provide a coherent framework through which to move to non-racialism and to talk about inequality in ways that does not alienate and divide the nation. This is a particular concern in a subject area called "citizenship education" that is intended to unify the nation and to train new citizens.

Staff morale. There was a feeling of tiredness across all the schools, and a sense of resignation to the overwhelming challenges facing educators. One of the most common requests we received from educators and principals was to try to make Department of Education officials aware of the circumstances educators faced every day. Isolation compounds these feelings that no one was listening to their concerns.

The need for better communication. During our initial feedback to schools many staff noted how easily they became bound up in the life of their school and were unaware of what the conditions were like and what teaching practices were being used elsewhere. The suggestion was made that Provincial Departments provide a structure that improved inter-school interaction and facilitated greater co-operation between staff and schools. This co-operation was envisaged on a number of levels – peer-reviewing of teaching, being able to observe lessons at different schools, the sharing of curriculum materials and teaching ideas. Such interaction, however, is dependent on the Department providing funds for transportation and enough educators to cover their attendance at meetings. As it stands, educators are disenchanted with the expectations and burdens placed upon them, and feel that Department officials have limited understanding of the daily realities of education practice and the classroom experience.

---

<sup>3</sup> This strategy was generally effective in the schools we observed, because there was generally only one home language to contend with (e.g., Dune High (isiXhosa), Hillside High (isiZulu), and Coppice High (isiXhosa)). We note this difficulty is undoubtedly worse in schools where there are many different home languages.

### *Making citizenship relevant*

Despite the challenges and tiredness noted above, we were impressed by the imagination and dedication with which educators sought to try and make citizenship education relevant and engaging for their learners. In this section of the report, we discuss some of these efforts, as well as other suggestions that have been offered as a way of engaging citizen-learners. In discussing these issues, we have deliberately avoided making ‘recommendations’ or suggesting ways that citizenship education ‘should’ be taught. Educators felt that such recommendations would not be helpful, given the diverse circumstances and contexts in which the schools operated. They were interested in hearing what other schools were doing and what other educators thought about different proposals. We discuss a few of these issues here; in Appendix 4 we provide additional examples of activities used in the schools we observed.

School pledge. The proposal for a school pledge coming from the Minister for Education, Naledi Pandor, in 2008 elicited a range of responses from staff: some were in favour of it, others opposed the very idea of a pledge, and some opposed either the content of the pledge or the lack of consultation of the pledge as presented by the Department. One activity suggested by an educator could be to ask learners to work together to draw up their own school or class pledge, outlining their commitments to the school and the type of learning environment they want to help develop.

Outreach activities. The life orientation syllabus includes a requirement that learners undertake voluntary work, but several schools struggled with this requirement. It appears that these schools interpret the outreach as needing to involve communities beyond the school or immediate vicinity of the school. Schools often lacked the resources to expose learners to other communities, but they also worried that parental concerns and safety issues prevented them from working in different areas. While we do not wish to undermine this commitment to outreach work, there is evidence that for high school learners it is the practice of working for others that is most important. This practice instils the idea of outreach and altruism, even if the activities involve members of the same school or local community. Schools should not be worried if the social/outreach work they encourage their learners to participate in is based within the school or local community.

Activities for future development as citizens. Citizenship education is concerned with a longer-term development project in which new citizens will lead the country forward. Many schools took advantage of travelling career fairs to help learners explore different careers and opportunities for further study. Some schools have also drawn on former learners to help in these efforts. A number of schools – and even schools in very poor areas – developed alumni networks. They also asked former learners or parents to come back to the school and assist in lessons or act as motivational speakers. It was expected/hoped that current learners would be inspired by examples from people “just like themselves” and that this may help them develop hope and aspirations for the future, in turn encouraging greater academic application.

Making the school a space of citizenship. Citizenship is as much about practice as it is about knowledge. Ensuring the school is a space in which the ideals of citizenship are realised helps learners internalise the ideas of the citizenship education component of the curriculum. In addition to the procedural activities such as the Learner

Representative Council and School Governing Body, other activities and behaviours can encourage a deeper engagement with citizenship. Some of these efforts include ensuring that staff (as well as learners) arrive at class on time and that staff demonstrate the value of respect in their treatment of the school environment and learners. Young people are good at spotting moments in which they are told ‘do as we say, not as we do’. This is particularly true of learners’ interactions with educators and experiences of education. It is vital, therefore, that the values and behaviours encouraged through the citizenship education curriculum are embodied within the ethos of a school and the behaviour of its staff.

## **WHERE NEXT?**

For strategic reasons, the project to date focussed upon the perceptions and thoughts of educators. Our plan is to develop a second stage to the research considering how learners’ conceive of ideas of citizenship, view the role of citizenship education, and understand citizenship in relation to their daily lives.

## **YOUR THOUGHTS**

We would welcome any further inputs, comments or thoughts that you have on this work and our report. Please feel free to contact either of us should you wish to:

Daniel Hammett   Email: [D.Hammett@ed.ac.uk](mailto:D.Hammett@ed.ac.uk)      Phone: 011 7176521

Lynn Staeheli      Email: [lynn.staeheli@ed.ac.uk](mailto:lynn.staeheli@ed.ac.uk)      Phone: 0044 131 650 4315

## APPENDIX 1: METHODOLOGY AND ETHICS

### Methodology:

In order to address the multiple levels of policy and practice relating to citizenship education several methods were used.

Existing literature on citizenship and citizenship education in South Africa and internationally was consulted to provide background detail and a theoretical frame to the research.

Government policy documents relating to state institutions' conceptions of citizenship were identified and analysed. This provided a summary of state understandings of the meanings of South African citizenship and the values and behaviours expected of citizens.

School textbooks and curriculum materials in the life orientation and history subject areas, sourced through schools as well as libraries at the University of Cape Town and the University of Witwatersrand, were analysed for content relating to citizenship. This allowed us to identify the translation of policy ideals into education materials and to explore common trends and gaps between the two areas. Specific ideas of citizenship were identified in textbooks relating to knowledge, practice and values.

Invitations to participate in research interviews were sent to teachers' unions, education related non-governmental organisations, major political parties and representatives of National and Provincial education departments. Interviews were then conducted with one representative of the National Department of Education, one political party official, one teachers' union and four non-governmental organisations. These interviews provided further detail as to the government's conceptualisation of citizenship and citizenship education as well as the interpretations and imaginations of the ideals of citizenship by a range of bodies working in related fields.

Twelve schools (11 state and 1 independent) were then invited to participate in the research across three locations, Cape Town (Western Cape), King William's Town (Eastern Cape) and Pietermaritzburg (KwaZulu Natal). The case study sites were selected to address variations in the racialised population of South Africa and experiences under apartheid and the anti-apartheid struggle, as well as continued disparities in economic standing.

◆ Cape Town: Concentration of the 'coloured' population and a range of white communities; historic exclusion of the black population and high levels of recent internal migration by black South Africans to this area; second richest province in South Africa.

◆ Pietermaritzburg: Concentration of the Indian population in South Africa; key site of tension between two main black linguistic groups (Xhosa and Zulu) and ethno-political tensions between the African National Congress and the Inkhata Freedom Party.

- ◆ King William's Town: Was part of the former homeland for Xhosa speakers (Ciskei) and closely linked to the anti-apartheid struggle; one of the poorest provinces in South Africa, with drastic out-migration.

A range of schools in each location were involved in the research, selected across the socio-economic spectrum as a proxy for the historic racial segregation of education. Thus, ex-Model C, former House of Delegates, former House of Representatives, and township schools were included. Permission to conduct research was obtained from the relevant Provincial Department of Education and school principal. An average of 4 days was spent at each school during which time a number of life orientation and history lessons would be observed and interviews conducted with the school principal and history and life orientation educators. These observations and interviews provided insights into the ways in which educators thought about citizenship, identified the meanings of citizenship presented in curriculum materials, and went about the practice of teaching citizenship education.

### Ethics:

Consideration of ethical issues related to this project was made from the start. The research was designed to ensure both integrity and quality. All participants were fully informed about the purpose, methods and intended uses of this research, as well as what their participation would entail.

The confidentiality of information supplied by research subjects is respected. While the research does not engage with a particularly sensitive topic, we were aware that such information may emerge and steps were taken to ensure the confidentiality of this.

There were no conflicts of interests or partiality to the research. Participants were invited to participate voluntarily, free from any form of coercion. Safeguards were put in place to reduce the risks posed to informants, including:

- ◆ use of pseudonyms for all schools and educators,
- ◆ participants able to stop interviews at any time and to ask for recordings to be erased,
- ◆ participants received transcripts of their interview(s) and offered the opportunity to review them to ensure they do not feel misrepresented.

The research project was assessed by the ethics committee of the Institute of Geography, University of Edinburgh and was deemed to meet ethical standards. Permission from Provincial Departments of Education was obtained prior to conducting research in the schools.

## **APPENDIX 2: SCHOOL DESCRIPTIONS**

### General comments

The histories of location, segregation and inequitable spending remain evident in the contemporary fabric, ethos and practices of schools. These legacies are visible in the material wealth and facilities of schools, the range of extra-curricula activities offered, and the support provided to learners with regards further study and career choices.

Staff across all schools demonstrated exhaustion due to workloads. This tiredness was noted particularly in relation to administrative burdens and shortcomings in Departmental support. Failures of support were noted particularly in communication from Department regarding training and other workshops (often received on the day of or after the event) and equipping and supporting staff to deal with issues of discipline. Staff frequently commented that they were poorly trained in this regard, particularly after the abolishment of corporal punishment. Limited support from parents in implementing alternative disciplinary measures was also noted. Staff often felt they were in a no-win situation and corporal punishment was, on occasion, resorted to at some schools.

Many staff also noted the lack of counsellors available for students. All schools identified that significant numbers of learners faced personal, family, academic and other challenges that contributed to disciplinary problems. Educators are overburdened and few are trained to provide counselling. The re-introduction of school-based counsellors was viewed as essential to assist learners and improve discipline and educational performance.

The removal of physical education activities from the curriculum (with the exception of sections of the life orientation syllabus) was also noted as contributing to discipline issues. Several teachers conceived of physical education as an important alternative outlet for energy, stress and anger amongst learners. The desire to see compulsory physical education lessons returned to the curriculum was expressed.

### **Schools in Cape Town**

#### Sun Valley High<sup>4</sup>

Sun Valley High has a learner population of 1,200 and 41 teaching staff (39 state funded, 2 school governing body funded). It is an Afrikaans medium school charging fees of R700 per annum with a payment rate of around 65%.

Sun Valley was built in the 1980s to serve a coloured group area. The predominantly coloured staff and student body reflect these demographics, although an increasing number of black learners are attending the school (some from the new local informal settlement, others travelling a few kilometres from Khayelitsha). The buildings are typical of government works for the period. Classrooms designed and built for home

---

<sup>4</sup> Schools have been given pseudonyms in accordance with our ethics protocol.

economics and technology teaching are now used for other subjects. In recent years, the school has raised funds to build a school hall used for assemblies, functions, examinations and sport. While the school buildings are in a reasonable state of repair the sports pitches and basketball court are unusable for fixtures. A local sports club's grounds are used for rugby, football and athletics meetings. There is no library at the school, but students do have access to two computer rooms for IT and computing lessons.

The local community is predominantly working class, and there are problems with poverty, unemployment, gangsterism, and drug and alcohol abuse. A school feeding programme is funded by the Department of Education. These issues affect the school in terms of learner application and discipline. Discipline in general at the school is good, although social problems are visible at times. Teacher discipline and punctuality is generally good, with low levels of absenteeism. Problems with staff shortages and classroom overcrowding remain. Resources at the school are limited and the school engages in a continual programme of fundraising activities, including fun days, discos, fashion shows and talent shows.

Attempts to encourage students to think about further study or career development are constrained by many learners' resignation to a low/unskilled occupation and lack of social mobility. The school does support students in making applications for bursaries and scholarships to university, and a growing number of students continue to further education.

### Moonglow High

Moonglow High has a learner population of just over 1,000 and 37 educators (32 state funded, 5 school governing body funded). It is an English language medium school and charges school fees of R2,300 per annum.

Moonglow High was built in the 1970s to serve an Indian group area. Since the desegregation of education in the 1990s, Moonglow has welcomed an increasing proportion of coloured and black learners (and the occasional white learner) and staff to the school. The infrastructure of the school has been well maintained. Vocational training classrooms (e.g. woodwork and metalwork labs) have been closed. A school hall for assemblies, examinations, theatrical productions and indoor sports has been added to the original buildings. There are no school sports fields, with an adjoining area of empty land used for sports practices. There is no library at the school (learners are encouraged to use the local community library), but there are two computer rooms used for teaching purposes. After school hours, the premises are used for Islamic and Arabic lessons.

The school has a good examinations record and discipline is strong. Social issues and common misdemeanours – smoking, answering back to teachers – remain, but unlike nearby schools there is not a serious problem with gangsterism within the school. Teachers are generally punctual and respectful towards their learners, and the learners reciprocate this. The school celebrates the achievements (academic, cultural and sporting) of its learners and attempts to provide guidance and information to those learners wishing to study further.

### Mountview High

Mountview High has a learner population of 500 and 41 educators (17 state funded, 24 school governing body funded). It is an English language medium school and charges fees of R16,350 per annum.

Mountview High is a former Model-C school situated in one of the wealthiest suburbs of Cape Town. The school draws a multi-racial student body from across the city, including a number of students from impoverished backgrounds whose studies are funded by philanthropic organisations. There are positive signs of racial integration within the school and an ethos of community and equality is promoted.

The privileged history of the school is evident in the resources and facilities, including an extensive library, swimming pool, tennis courts, indoor sports hall, assembly hall, outdoor sports pitches, and computer facilities. Classrooms are well resourced in terms of furniture, textbooks, overhead projectors, and basic equipment. The school offers a wide range of extra-curricula activities for its learners, including chess, debating, surfing, and outreach projects. The school has a strong alumni network and the corridors are lined with photos of successful alumni and school sports teams and cultural societies.

The staff body are assisted in disciplinary issues and promotion of the school ethos by a strong prefect system. Discipline is strong at the school, and previous problems with drug abuse have been eradicated. The school does employ staff members who combine teaching with student and guidance counselling, a service that is called upon frequently by learners. There is an expectation that many of the students will continue with further studies, and resources are provided to assist learners in making applications for university/college places and funding.

### Dune High

Dune High is a no-fee school with a learner population of almost 1,400 and 49 educators (all are state funded). It is an English language medium school, although this is the second language of the majority of learners and educators. Classes are often delivered in a mix of isiXhosa and English.

Dune High is situated in an informal settlement and serves a deeply impoverished community. The social and economic history of the area is reflected in the composition of staff and student body drawn entirely from the surrounding townships. The school buildings are relatively new and a new arts centre was added to the school in 2009.

The school is drastically under-resourced and overcrowded, has a shortage of teaching staff and lacks basic teaching resources (textbooks, stationery, etc). Passing periods between lessons are characterised by the movement not only of pupils but also of chairs and tables as attempts are made to offset the worst of the overcrowding. There is a computer room, although this is underutilised, but no library or communal study space. Problems with theft continually plague the school and demoralise teaching and



management staff. Recent interventions from the Provincial Department of Education have improved the conditions of the school, but serious challenges remain.

A school feeding programme is funded by the Department of Education and is viewed as vital for many of the students who come from impoverished backgrounds and child-headed households.

### Starburst High

Starburst High is an Islamic independent school with 524 learners and 43 educators between the boys high school and girls high school. It is an English language medium school and charges fees in the region of R15,000 per annum.

Starburst High has a long pedigree, originally established in the Athlone area but moving to new premises, funded by international Islamic benefactors, in the southern suburbs of Cape Town in recent years. The school buildings and attached mosque are in an excellent state of repair and are well maintained. The school lacks extensive grounds or sports fields, and focuses instead upon the academic and spiritual development of its learners. The functioning of the school is framed by Islamic teachings and associated ethos (the school does not exclude non-Muslim students but does expect that they will respect the ethos and religion of the school). The school is involved in a number of outreach projects, with those staff members involved grounding these activities in Islamic teachings.

Discipline at the school, from both staff and students, is good. There are a number of staff who combine teaching duties with student and guidance counselling. Students are strongly encouraged to continue their studies or to pursue skilled or professional careers.

## **Schools in Pietermaritzburg**

### Glen High

Glen High has a student population in the region of 1,500 and 48 educators (37 state funded, 11 school governing body funded). It is an English language medium school and charges fees of R1,500 per annum, with 30-40% learners exempted from these.

The school is situated in the middle of a coloured group area and has a majority coloured learner population with a growing intake of black learners. The buildings are typical of the 1980s government projects in education and remain in a decent state of repair. Vocational training classrooms (e.g. woodwork and metalwork labs) have been closed. The school retains a number of boarding houses, although only a small fraction of the available rooms are currently used to house learners.

The school grounds are reasonably spacious but in poor repair and lack basic facilities. The fields included space for one pitch (soccer/rugby/hockey), one tarmac netball and one grass netball court. For athletics practices, these spaces were used for

shot-put, high-jump and javelin practice (with one item of equipment for each discipline owned by the school). A temporary long-jump pit was created by digging up a corner of the netball pitch, which remained during a netball game later in the week. Staff willingly oversaw these practices but lacked physical education training.

Learner discipline was in general good, although common problems remain with punctuality, graffiti and other misdemeanours. Educator discipline was good, reflected in well-prepared lessons and punctuality to lessons. The staffroom was spacious and adequately equipped, tea and coffee were available to staff and a support staff member would ensure visitors were catered for in this regard.

Attempts were made to encourage students' to think about their futures, with a number of posters advertising careers and study options displayed around the school. The head of life orientation had also recruited a former pupil, with experience in business and life coaching, to assist with sections of the life orientation syllabus in an effort to assist learners in identifying and developing career interests.

### Valley High

Valley High has a learner population of 1,100 and 43 educators (36 state funded, 7 school governing body funded). It is an English language medium school, charging fees of R1,300 per annum with a collection rate of 50-60%.

Serving a former Indian group area, this school's staff and student body remains predominantly Indian and is reflected in aspects of the school's ethos and culture. The infrastructure of the school is typical for the government department and period in which it was built, and is in generally good repair. There are no hostel or boarding facilities at the school. Home economics, woodwork, metalwork and other practical laboratories are used as teaching spaces for other subjects. The school library no longer functions, with the space used as a classroom due to overcrowding.

The school has a good sized playing field although this is under-utilised, particularly after this space was placed 'out-of-bounds' to students during break times due to unruly behaviour and learners smoking during intervals. Learners are now confined to two smaller areas, resulting in increased tensions and fights between learners. Discipline is a major challenge, with gang-related issues spilling into the school environment. A problem with muggers targeting learners on their way to/from school was resolved with co-operation from the local police station and the school is building a collaborative relationship with the station to ensure the speedy resolution of any future issues. A number of current students remain in school while involved with the legal system. Staff were uncertain and/or reluctant to deal with certain of the students in disciplinary situations due to threats made against their person and/or damage done to their property.

The school faces a staff shortage. However, the staff body did ensure that learners were able to participate in a range of extra-curricula activities, locally and provincially. The staff tended to divide by gender at break times, with the official staff room occupied by female staff and the occasional male member of staff. The majority of males used a neighbouring room as this had been accepted as the smoking

room – no female staff utilised the room for this purpose and often non-smoking male staff would use the room in order to converse with male colleagues. Tea and coffee making facilities were available in the main staffroom.

### Ridge High

Ridge High hosts a learner population of 900 and 67 educators (35 state funded, 32 school governing body funded). It is an English language medium school charging fees of R11,200 per annum.

A former model-C school, Ridge High is set on a hillside on the edge of town with facilities including computer rooms, library, several sports pitches, swimming pool, outdoor climbing wall, and indoor sports hall. The school retains a majority white learner and staff population, but with a growing proportion of Indian, coloured, black staff and learners. The buildings and grounds are in a good state of repair.

Discipline at the school is good, aided by a staff body who arrive for lessons on time and well prepared, and by a strong prefect body who assist with entrance and interval duties amongst other responsibilities. The one staff member who also acts as school counsellor has a busy schedule. A strong school spirit exists, reinforced on a daily basis through the actions and ethos of the prefects and others. The school has an active alumni organisation. The school's Fun Day reflected the diversity of the school body, in terms of ethnic/cultural backgrounds and income brackets. The racial desegregation of the school is noted, with racial integration amongst learners most notable within the prefect body.

The school is active in promoting careers and further study to their students through the hosting of careers roadshows and facilitation of visits to the local university for senior students.

### Hillside High

Hillside High has 963 learners and 30 educators (all state funded). It is an English language medium school, although this is the second language of the majority of learners and educators. Classes are often delivered in a mix of isiZulu and English. An annual school fee of R150 is levied (although as of 2010 the school will be a no-fee school), with 30% of learners exempt.

Hillside High is located in a sprawling township on the periphery of Pietemaritzburg. Reflecting the surrounding area, the entire staff and student population are black, with the white researcher a novelty not only in the school but also in the local community. Access to the school is via a dirt track. Electricity, running water, and sanitation are present at the school. The school buildings are overcrowded and in a state of terrible disrepair. The majority of classrooms are missing doors and windows. Ceiling boards, electrical fittings, chalkboards and other items have been stolen from many of the classrooms. No classrooms contained working lights. The school has one computer, in the Principal's office. The school phone is a Telkom payphone in the corridor by the

school office. There are no school fields – an area of empty ground adjoining the school was used for the physical education component of the life orientation curriculum.

Classrooms are overcrowded and lack an adequate number of desks for learners. Schoolbooks are also in short supply, forcing students to share materials or teachers resorting to dispensary learning approaches. A lack of other basic materials means teachers are often unable to adopt participatory teaching/learning approaches.

The teaching staff are overburdened (the researcher was asked to assist with teaching on occasion due to staff shortages) and the school has significant levels of absenteeism: on one afternoon, a single teacher was attempting to control 5 classrooms. Student discipline was a major challenge, specifically in terms of attendance, punctuality and application to learning. Students frequently skipped class or appeared late for school – the Principal was at a loss as to how to counteract this and was disheartened by a lack of support from parents – and on one afternoon learners set fire to the school grounds in order to avoid lessons.

The staffroom is too small for the teaching body, leading to a gender division – with the male staff removing themselves to the book storeroom and making this into a de-facto second staff room. The women in the main staffroom begin each day with a prayer; the men with discussions about football or other news.

The school is horrendously under-resourced, with a demoralised teaching body and is an example of many of the problems facing the South African education system at present. There was no sense of ‘future’ for the students at the school, few had dreams to study further or develop a career, and most appeared resigned to poverty and hardship as their lot in life. The staff were open and friendly to the researcher and a number of them were very committed to making the best of an exceptionally challenging situation, but were lacking support, training and resources.

### **Schools in King William’s Town**

#### **Parkside High**

Parkside High hosts a learner population of just over 500 and 27 educators (15 state funded, 12 school governing body funded). It is an English language medium school and charges fees of R10,250 per annum with almost full fee collection.

Parkside High is an old and prestigious boys-only school. Historically, the school attracted white learners and boarders from across Southern Africa. In the transition from apartheid it became a ‘model C’ school and began to admit non-white learners in 1992. It now has a majority black learner population. In recent years they have kept their fees relatively low. While white learner numbers have dropped significantly in recent years, the school has emerged as the preferred school for middle-class/elite black families in the Eastern Cape and beyond. The teaching body remains predominantly white, although the number of black educators is rising.

The school is set in large grounds, with facilities including swimming, astro turf hockey pitches, rugby and cricket fields, a new football pitch (reflecting the changing learner population), gymnasium, computer room, lecture theatre, library. Sports are a key strength for the school, and their alumni include several current and former international sportsmen.

The school's history and alumni networks are important to the ethos of the school, with a monument to fallen (ex)learners in various conflicts in the main quad, plus photos of former pupils who died in conflict or gained reputations in other fields (including medicine, science, education, sports) lining the front corridors around the reception area. Other corridors are lined with photos of school teams from multiple disciplines over the past 20 years. The school has an alumni officer and school museum capturing this history. Amongst the student population there remain 'traditional' hierarchical values between the junior and senior students. As with other former-Model-C schools visited, the school promotes an ethos of the school-as-extended-family, with great emphasis on respect (for self, others and property) and community spirit and pride in the school, and from this the local community and nation. Discipline amongst students and staff was very good, reflecting the school's ethos.

The school tuckshop sells soup, sandwiches, pies - a wider and healthier range than many other schools and the staff are able to place orders for food before the interval period. Tea and coffee were available to staff throughout the day – make-your-own outside of intervals, but prepared by a member of support staff at intervals.

### Riverview High

Riverview High has a learner population of 1,200 and 41 educators (36 state funded, 5 school governing body funded). It is an Afrikaans medium school, and charges fees of R600 per annum with a collection rate of 70%.

Riverview High serves a former coloured group area established in the early 1980s approximately 10 kilometres outside of King William's Town. The community has very limited business or industry, jobs are mainly held in King William's Town. Unemployment is a major problem, and there are concerns over the levels of crime, drunkenness and drug dealing in the community. The school had a number of hostels for boarding students, but following vandalism to these in recent years they have been temporarily closed. The architecture of the school is typical of the Department of Coloured Affairs educational institutions of the 1980s, and these buildings are maintained at a basic level. Classrooms originally constructed for the teaching of technology and home economics are now used to teach other subjects, meaning they are not always fit for purpose. A number of temporary classrooms have been provided over the years, but these are now disused as they are unsafe due to structural weaknesses and exposed wiring.

The school does have space for sporting activities, although these spaces are in varying states of disrepair. There is a volleyball court lacking in posts/nets and with grass growing through the tarmac surface; the netball courts and cricket nets are in a similar condition. The sports fields themselves are in poor repair. One corner of the

fields is marshland and is used as a site for dumping building materials and general rubbish (which appears to then be burnt). An overflowing sewer runs down one side of the grounds. The rugby pitch is also littered with broken glass and other debris, the rugby posts, crumbling with age and neglect, lean at a drunken angle, overseeing a rusting and dilapidated scrummaging machine abandoned in the middle of the pitch. The school runs a feeding scheme for the poorest students, funded by donations from staff members.

The school was short of teachers, exacerbated by one long-term absentee and another member of staff on a series of training workshops. Discipline amongst learners was generally acceptable, although common challenges and social issues remain.

### Coppice High

Coppice High has 1,071 learners and 40 educators (all state funded). The school charges R250 per annum fees. It is an English language medium school, although this is the second language of the majority of learners and educators. Classes are often delivered in a mix of isiXhosa and English.

Coppice High is situated in a major township, approximately 10 kilometres outside of King William's Town. This location was developed during the 1970s as a formalised 'black' settlement to provide labour to King William's Town and other local towns. Reflecting this history, the student body of the school is entirely black, while the staff body includes 2 Indian teachers.

The school buildings are dated and maintained at a basic level. Most classrooms have intact doors and windows, and the school does host a small computer room. In winter the school is very cold as there is no heating – staff offices may be heated by portable electric fires but no such heating is available in classrooms. There are no official school playing fields, but the school uses vacant land next to the school for sports.

Compared to similar schools elsewhere, the school is well connected to the local community. The Principal is keen to raise funds to redevelop the school library (currently a stack of boxes containing out-of-date books) and to turn this into a community resource. The school participates in a range of competitions and events organised at the local and provincial level, and is active in seeking to support (financially and otherwise) students who wish to continue their studies or take part in extra-curricula activities.

The township is fairly typical – high levels of under- and un-employment, problems with drink and drugs, and with violence after dark. During the day the township is relatively safe. Large parts of the location are serviced by tarred-roads, and most properties are formal structures with basic services.

### **APPENDIX 3: MEANINGS OF CITIZENSHIP**

A key component of this research was to consider the differences, gaps and tensions between conceptions of citizenship in education policy, curriculum materials and the everyday experiences of teaching and learning. A number of common themes do exist between the abstract ideals presented in policy documents and the content delivered in the classroom. However, gaps and tensions do exist in the processes of translation between policy and practice.

#### *Government Documents*

The ideals of citizenship presented in government documents are diverse. The central components of 'good' South African citizenship are derived from the values of the country's Constitution and emphasise values such as tolerance, respect, diversity, selflessness, and equality. Citizens are also expected to adopt behaviours that promote human rights and anti-racism, and to work to overcome social inequalities. The citizen is anticipated as acquiring the knowledge required to practise behaviours that will contribute to the development of the self and society. They are expected to be responsible (making informed decisions about their lives), healthy (protecting themselves and others through decisions about diet, exercise, sexual practices and lifestyle choices), productive (to gain the skills needed to participate in the economy and contribute to the economic development of the nation), and active (participating in the political life of the county as well as contributing through outreach/community works).

#### *Curriculum Materials*

Citizenship education curriculum materials reflect the ideals and values promoted in government documents and attempt to make these accessible and engaging for learners. It would be more accurate to observe that the range of ideals of citizenship is better reflected in the life orientation curriculum materials as a whole, rather than just through the citizenship education learning area.

The citizenship education learning outcomes specifically address discrimination, Constitutional values, social relationships, political literacy, democracy, volunteerism, the prevention of social ills (including criminality and HIV/AIDS), and diversity. However, the life orientation materials as a whole speak to the broader development of productive citizens (career development, employment, job applications and CV writing) and healthy citizens (lifestyle choices, substance abuse, alcohol, smoking, exercise, diet and nutrition, sexuality and HIV/AIDS). Integral to this content is an attempt to develop learners as informed, responsible citizens. Further sections of the curriculum address topics such as diversity, discrimination, inter-personal relations, being proudly South African, and being part of the global community. Multiple parts of the curriculum therefore address aspects of good citizenship as presented in government documents, even if these materials are not explicitly presented as such.

Learners are thus envisaged as developing skills through case studies, group work and other activities that address questions of race and non-racialism, health and personal

well-being, personal development and preparation for employment, obeying the laws of the country, respecting oneself, respecting and valuing others, being concerned about inequalities, the environment and social issues. On a procedural level, learners are expected to understand their rights and duties as citizens, specifically to develop an understanding of the political structures of the country and how to participate in elections. In other words, learners are expected to become responsible, healthy, active and informed members of society who embody the values of the Constitution.

### *Educators' Practices*

Educators demonstrated a wide range of approaches to thinking about citizenship and citizenship education. Common understandings of good South African citizenship included: an awareness of the past and a vision of the future; adherence to the laws of the land; moral behaviour (often informed by religious teachings); pride in the diversity of the country; an acceptance and meetings of the responsibilities of citizenship (as determined by the government and its institutions); realisation of the rights of citizenship, but without exploiting others; contributing to the development of the nation; participation in the procedural aspects of democracy; a willingness to help others; behaving in a respectful manner; and embodying the values of the Constitution. The ways in which an educator understands the meanings of citizenship is reflected in their interpretation of citizenship education and the prioritising of aspects of curriculum content. For instance, educators with a keen interest in sport emphasised the ways in which sport and physical activity related to various of the ideals of citizenship; those educators who had strong political interests would prioritise political literacy and active citizenship.

In general, educators' understandings of, and practices in teaching, citizenship education overlapped – intentionally or unknowingly – with the ideals presented in government documents. Differences arose as educators sought to negotiate and translate ideals and values to be meaningful in their local communities. Discussions of active citizenship at some schools would include the making of demands upon the state as well as the procedural aspects of democracy. Debates about discrimination would pick up on different forms of discrimination, such as race, xenophobia, class or gender, depending upon the social context, educators' interests and class dynamics.

In other words, the context in which the curriculum was delivered would influence the ways in which educators presented the values and ideals of citizenship discussed in curriculum materials. Key values and themes can be seen to flow through policy documents, curriculum materials and classroom practice, although the exact meanings and approaches to these change in the transition from policy to practice.



## APPENDIX 4: EXAMPLES OF CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION PRACTICE

Educators at all schools engaged with citizenship education in ways that sought to make it accessible and understandable for their learners. A selection of approaches we witnessed during our fieldwork are detailed below. We do not expect all of them to be relevant to each school, but educators may find some of these useful and interesting to learn about how these issues are being approached by other educators in South Africa.

### *Example 1: Teaching about active citizenship at a township school (Dune High)*

Addressing a life orientation class, the educator was tasked with teaching about active citizenship to a class with a severe shortage of desks and chairs and one textbook. Due to resource constraints, the educator had to use a more dispensary and less participatory teaching style.

The textbook discussion of active citizenship was positioned in terms of environmental issues and the relations between citizens and their environment. The book drew examples from the international context as well as national issues (in this book, problems with pollution in a Cape Town township). The primary message of this section of the book was that citizens have a responsibility to protect and care for their local environment. Learners were expected to develop understanding of how to take individual action and responsibility to care for their local area. This lesson followed from a previous session in which learners were taught about the importance of voting and the South African electoral system, and encouraged (if eligible) to vote in the upcoming national elections.

The educator recognised that the learners were not engaging with the ideals being presented in the textbook. Talk of abstract ideals of environmental justice was not easily accessible to learners at a school and from a community where basic service delivery remained a key issue and local environmental conditions were poor. In addition, the textbook implied that cooking fuel was a major pollutant, but did not recognise why low-income families used it. In this situation, the educator turned the discussion towards how the learners (as citizens) could make demands upon the government to ensure the provision of basic services. The lesson developed as the educator asked learners to describe their living conditions, and the state of their local community, identifying key social and environmental issues in the process. Learners were then asked how these conditions could be changed and improved. The emphasis at this point was not on the responsibilities of the learners themselves, but rather on the responsibilities of government to provide basic services. Through a discussion of who was responsible for issues such as sanitation, water, street lighting, the learners gained knowledge of local government structures and the mechanisms through which they could make demands upon the government to improve the conditions of their community.

The educator in the lesson thus found a way to make issues of environmental citizenship and active citizenship accessible to the learners. By stepping away from the content of the textbook and encouraging learners to talk about their experiences, the relevance of these topics was more apparent. Knowledge about local political structures and processes was also incorporated.

*Example 2: Addressing questions of xenophobia and discrimination (Dune High)*

The morning staff briefing at the school had included the announcement that a new member of staff would be starting at the school the following week. This staff member, appointed to teach science, was Zimbabwean. While the school had not directly experienced xenophobic attacks during the 2008 violence, staff were aware of tensions within the local community and sections of the learner population.

In response to this news, the life orientation educator decided to abandon the planned lesson and to deliver a session from a different part of the subject area – discrimination, diversity and tolerance. Her rationale in so doing was to pre-empt potential learner hostility towards a foreign educator at the school.

The educator explored the issue of xenophobia and discrimination and then asked learners what they thought about immigrants in South Africa and the xenophobic violence of 2008. In responding to their observations, the educator was critical of those who expressed hostility and resentment to immigrants. The educator's aim was to encourage tolerance and remind the learners of the universality of Constitutional values.

The educator's adaptation of their lesson plan at very short notice to move to a different part of the curriculum reflected an awareness of the opportunity to engage learners with aspects of the syllabus through current events and affairs. In so doing, the educator believed they were not only contributing to debates around diversity and transformation, but finding ways of engaging learners' with their studies that were relevant and meaningful. Such actions are dependent upon events and news coverage that afford such opportunities. It is clear, however, that this is a means by which educators can engage their learners and use the curriculum alongside current affairs to talk about key issues and concerns of citizenship.

*Example 3: Facilitating participation in outreach work/volunteerism (Mountview High/Starburst High)*

We noted educators at several schools encouraging students to engage in a range of outreach work, as mentioned in the main body of the report. Two instances are presented here.

At Mountview High a number of staff and students, partly through an outreach/service society operating at the school and also through the promotion of a pro-community ethos ran a series of community projects. Involvement in media-based social development initiatives was common, such as radio drives for book donations for township libraries. While such projects do not expose learners directly to disadvantaged communities, such actions can help to instil an ethos of outreach and selflessness. Later in the year, staff and students had organised the involvement of volunteers from the school in a township building project as part of 'Do It Day' – a national drive to encourage people to do voluntary and community service work.

Alongside these more visible projects, the school ethos promoted a ‘Pride in...’ campaign which encouraged learners to take pride in themselves, their school and the community surrounding the school. Within this project, the school facilitated activities such as clean-up drives in the local community, where students would (under adequate supervision) clear up litter from the area surrounding the school. Such activities may not expose learners to ‘other’ communities, but does help to develop a degree of altruism that is part of the citizenship ideals presented through education.

At Starburst High, one life orientation educator utilised the section of the life orientation curriculum on healthy lifestyles to bring in a service learning aspect. Learners in these classes were asked to bring in healthy food-stuffs suitable for making sandwiches/lunch packs. During class, they were tasked with making and packaging healthy sandwiches to be distributed to a local orphanage. The learners were not involved in distributing the lunches to the orphanage, but this activity again provides the basis of a culture of altruism and awareness of others. The costs to the parents/families of learners at the school of providing the ingredients for these lunches is noted and would make such a project problematic at many schools. However, it is the way in which this activity, as with those at Mountview High, can develop an awareness of others that is important to recognise and encourage.

*Example 4: Using former pupils to support lessons and provide ‘the voice of experience’ (Glen High)*

The Grade 12 life orientation class was focussed upon careers and career development. The syllabus called for lessons containing information and advice about applying for tertiary study, bursaries and employment. Specific content was expected to address background research on university course/employment opportunities, writing a covering letter and CV, and interview practice.

The life orientation teacher took a supporting role in these lessons, having invited a former pupil of the school to deliver this section of the course. After leaving school, the former pupil had worked in various positions in the business and corporate sectors before becoming a self-employed life-skills coach. The educator believed that the delivery of sections of the curriculum by outside ‘experts’ would help the learners through their exposure to this expertise and motivate them through seeing what previous learners at the school had achieved.

The former pupil provided a series of lessons throughout the week, working through how to identify employment/further study opportunities, how to research these, how to write applications and CVs, and how to prepare and behave during an interview. While examples of job adverts and other handouts were provided, learners were expected to complete tasks as homework (and for continuous assessment requirements) such as writing their own CV and writing application letters for example jobs. Other activities included role-plays (involving the educator, former pupil, the researchers and volunteer learners) of interview situations that intentionally highlighted good and bad practices.

This example demonstrates the possibility for schools and educators to draw upon networks of former pupils to assist with teaching and learning. Not only can former pupils bring their experience and expertise back into the classroom, but the presence of an additional adult can open up possibilities for classroom practices (such as the staged role plays about interviews) that can assist learning. The potential areas of contribution for such practices could include, but are not limited to: careers and career development; knowing and understanding the law of the country; physical development/education; role models; health and fitness; discrimination; and environmental issues.

## **APPENDIX 5: RESOURCES AND ADDITIONAL TEACHING RESOURCES**

Teachers from all research sites commented that resources to help in the preparation of lessons and delivery of the curriculum would be beneficial. Below are links to a number of websites and resource databases that may be of use when compiling materials for lessons dealing with citizenship. We recognise the limitations of relying on web-based materials for schools without access to computer facilities.

### Department of Education

The Department of Education's on-line portal provides exemplars, examination questions and other resources by subject:

<http://www.thutong.doe.gov.za/>

### South African Human Rights Commission:

The South African Human Rights Commission is charged with monitoring and improving human rights in South Africa. They have a specific on-line learning resource section focussed upon teaching with and about human rights.

SAHRC e-learning portal (Requires registration, but this is free):

<http://pet.lr.co.za/hrc/>

National Centre for Human Rights Education and Training:

[http://www.sahrc.org.za/sahrc\\_cms/publish/cat\\_index\\_31.shtml](http://www.sahrc.org.za/sahrc_cms/publish/cat_index_31.shtml)

My Rights, My Responsibilities Training Booklet (available in English and Afrikaans):

[http://www.sahrc.org.za/sahrc\\_cms/publish/cat\\_index\\_42.shtml](http://www.sahrc.org.za/sahrc_cms/publish/cat_index_42.shtml)

### Isandla Institute:

The Isandla Institute is a South African think-tank focussing on equality and democracy in urban spaces. Various of their publications may be of interest in lesson planning or the development of case studies.

Isandla publications:

<http://www.isandla.org.za/publications/>

In particular, three papers from their 'Monograph' series may be of use:

Monograph 4: The unspoken factor: Race and racism

Monograph 7: The post-Soweto generation: Being young in South Africa today

Monograph 12: Being South African: What is a South African identity?

These are available through:

[http://www.isandla.org.za/home/development\\_dialogues.asp](http://www.isandla.org.za/home/development_dialogues.asp)

### South African Institute of Race Relations:

The South African Institute of Race Relations conducts and commissions work regarding race and race relations in South Africa. While they do not have teaching materials on their website, they do provide a wealth of information and media comment that may be of use in developing case studies and discussion groups.

South African Institute of Race Relations:

<http://www.sairr.org.za/>

### Institute for Justice and Reconciliation:

The Institute for Justice and Reconciliation are a central organisation to research and promoting reconciliation in South Africa. Part for their work has been the production of teaching resources.

Teaching resources relating to history and apartheid, social justice, housing, health, community:

[http://www.ijr.org.za/publications/copy\\_of\\_teach](http://www.ijr.org.za/publications/copy_of_teach)

A series of 12 teaching modules based upon their ‘Turning Points in History’ series that addresses historical moments and relates them to teaching about reconciliation (available in English and Afrikaans):

[http://www.ijr.org.za/publications/copy\\_of\\_teach/turning-points-in-history-series-1](http://www.ijr.org.za/publications/copy_of_teach/turning-points-in-history-series-1)

### Teacher Education in Sub-Saharan Africa (TESSA):

TESSA is a pan-African organisation that seeks to link together teachers across the continent and to provide open-access educational resources for teachers. They have materials relating to several learning areas. The resources available here are designed for teachers’ to adapt to their specific needs. Modules on social networks, community, self-esteem, taking responsibility, conflict management, gender, good citizenship, sensitively relating to HIV/AIDS, the environment, and personal development and well-being are available.

Teaching resources for the life skills subject area:

[http://www.tessafrica.net/index.php?option=com\\_resources&view=resources&Itemid=183](http://www.tessafrica.net/index.php?option=com_resources&view=resources&Itemid=183)

### The United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights:

The United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights is the UN’s central body promoting and protecting human rights around the globe. They produce materials relating to human rights education.

UNOHCR website: <http://www.ohchr.org/>

They recently published 'Human rights education in the school systems of Europe, Central Asia and North America: A compendium of good practice'. Although based upon studies from other parts of the world, you may find some of the ideas and examples useful:

<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/HRsEducationBook.aspx>

Further materials relating to human rights education can be accessed through:  
<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/PublicationsResources/Pages/TrainingEducation.aspx>

### UNESCO:

The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation's remit is ambitious – 'to build peace in the minds of men'. They have limited teaching materials on their website, although their materials on education and HIV/AIDS may be useful:

[http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL\\_ID=36422&URL\\_DO=DO\\_TOPIC&URL\\_SECTION=201.html](http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=36422&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html)

### Reaching a Generation:

Reaching a Generation is a Christian charity, funded by international donors including PEPFAR. They provide some materials relating to the life orientation subject area:

<http://www.rag.org.za/Programmes-LifeOrientation.html>

### Further links:

Links to additional on-line teaching resources can be found here:

<http://www.southafrica.info/services/education/eduonline.htm>

The following UCT-based blog also provides links to US-based student orientated websites that provide interactive games about money management, energy conservation:

[http://blogs.uct.ac.za/blog/educblog/teaching\\_resources](http://blogs.uct.ac.za/blog/educblog/teaching_resources)