

Spiritual Direction as a Spiritual Practice for Reconciliation

Ministry: A Personal Reconciliation Perspective

by

Kyung Eun Kim

Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Edinburgh

2012

DECLARATION

I composed this thesis, the work is my own. No part of this thesis has been submitted for any other degree or qualification.

DEDICATED

To

My beloved friends,

Elder Brian Seung Koo Chang and his wife Elder Young Shil Chang

for their support and encouragement

and above all

for their love

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Above all, I thank God with my whole heart, because He prompted my PhD. journey and enabled me to complete it.

In the first instance, I would like to thank Dr. Cecelia Clegg, my supervisor. She helped me with her continuous wisdom and warm heart. She never failed to support me throughout my doctoral journey, giving me academic guidance and encouragement. In addition, I would like to thank my second supervisor, Jolyon Mitchell. I would like to thank Dr. Janet Ruffing for her inspirational support and without whom I would never have begun this PhD, studying spirituality and spiritual direction. Her help was invaluable. Lisa Cataldo also encouraged me to begin this journey. In addition, I would like to acknowledge the invaluable guidance and encouragement I have received from Professor Hae Yong Yoo, Professor Bang Sik Oh, Professor Seung Gi Choi and Professor Kang Hack Lee. I am indebted to my interviewees from Scotland and South Korea. Without their participation, I would never have been able to complete my thesis. In addition, I must mention how much I am indebted to Rev. Professor Sou Young Lee, Rev. Professor Jong Yun Lee, Professor Yo Han Hyun, and Professor Jung Joo Kim for their academic and pastoral support. I am also very grateful to Professor David Fergusson, Professor Bernadette Flanagan, Professor Oliver O'Donovan, and Dr. Susan Hardman Moore. To all of those mentioned above, I owe my sincere gratitude.

For their unceasing, gracious support, I would most of all like to thank Elder Brian Seung Koo Change and his wife, Elder Young Shil Chang. I could not have completed this thesis without them, thus would like to dedicate this thesis to them and their family. I also greatly appreciate the support of Chung Hee Shin and I must not forget how my brother in law, Jae Won Song, supported me throughout my academic journey. May God bless them and their families. In addition, for their current spiritual support and care, I am deeply grateful to Saemoonan Presbyterian Church, in Seoul, where I now attend.

I would also like to show my appreciation to Jo Swingler and Caroline Blyth, my British friends, for their gracious friendship, and my American friends, Douglas Kramer and his family, for their devotional support. Although it is impossible to mention every

friend's name, their prayers and love are always with me and have been greatly appreciated.

I wish lastly to thank my parents and family, without whom none of this would have been possible. For their steadfast support, patience and love, I would like to express my deepest thankfulness to my beloved husband, Yong Won Song, and my treasured son, Ye Chan. With their continuous, unceasing love and support, I have been able to complete my thesis.

Above all, all these people are gifts of grace from God, so Praise the Lord!

ABSTRACT

Contemporary Christians who are living in a ruptured and strife-ridden world have a desire to live in a peaceful environment and state of being. This desire is related to the development of their relationships with God, self, and others. This can be referred to as personal reconciliation, the foundation of which is the transformation of their relationship with God. Personal reconciliation, the restoration of the relational image of God, can contribute to the work of reconciliation at a broader level in that individuals' spirituality of reconciliation enables social reconciliation to be nurtured and sustained. This work of reconciliation, from a human perspective, is a process in the journey towards ultimate reconciliation, which is God's work. As social reconciliation is developed by the awareness and actions of individuals living in that society, and is sustained by a spirituality of reconciliation, this thesis focuses on how Christians can develop personal reconciliation and so enhance their spirituality of reconciliation. In particular, this study argues that spiritual direction is a spiritual practice that can aid the development of personal reconciliation and examines the possibility of it being implemented as a ministry of reconciliation for Reformed Christians.

The research includes a discussion of the theoretical background of reconciliation, focusing in particular on its theological aspects, and developing an empirical study. The empirical research is a qualitative study using a narrative inquiry method carried out through interviews with Presbyterians who have experienced spiritual direction in Scotland and South Korea; the focus of this research is Ignatian spiritual direction because it is the major form of spiritual direction in these two countries.

The study demonstrates that Ignatian spiritual direction brings about the transformation of Christians' image of God, enabling them to have a strengthened Christian identity and a sense of compassion towards others. It also encourages social responsibility as well as individual growth through a deep encounter with Jesus. In this way, Ignatian spiritual direction produces an experience of personal reconciliation, healing and the development of relationships, with which the dynamics of reconciliation – forgiveness, repentance, justice, truth, peace, mercy – interact. Furthermore, this study argues that, by leading Christians to find their vocation, the Ignatian way can encourage Christians to choose to commit themselves to the life of a reconciler, as one who participates in the work of healing and transforming what is broken in the world.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration	i
Dedication	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Abstract	v
<u>Chapter One: Introduction</u>	1
1.1. The background and aim of this study	1
1.2. This study as practical theology	7
1.3. The structure of this thesis	9
<u>Part I: Theoretical Background and Theological Research</u>	12
<u>Chapter Two: Contemporary Theories of Reconciliation</u>	13
Introduction	13
2.1. The notion of reconciliation	13
2.1.1. Original and contemporary meanings of the term ‘reconciliation’ in theology	13
2.1.2. Two faces of reconciliation: social and spiritual	24
2.1.3. Contemporary theological understandings of reconciliation	27
2.2. The dynamics of reconciliation	35
2.2.1. The dynamics of reconciliation in Lederach	35
2.2.2. The dynamics of reconciliation in Liechty	37

2.2.3. Comparison of these two ‘webs’	39
2.3. The spirituality of reconciliation	41
2.3.1. Forgiveness	43
2.3.2. Healing of memory	54
2.4. How to facilitate a spirituality of reconciliation	59
2.4.1. Retelling the story: retelling one’s life story as a redemptive story of God through Jesus Christ	59
2.4.2. Compassion: acceptance of others	62
Conclusion	66
<u>Chapter Three: Spiritual direction as a Spiritual Practice for Personal Reconciliation</u>	67
Introduction	67
3.1. What is spiritual direction?	67
3.1.1. Understanding spiritual direction	67
3.1.2. Spiritual direction: its aims and processes	72
3.1.2.1. The aim of spiritual direction	72
3.1.2.2. Process of spiritual direction	75
3.1.2.3. Group spiritual direction	76
3.1.3. The origins and current situation of spiritual direction	77
3.2. Why spiritual direction is needed in the Reformed tradition	81
3.2.1. The understanding of personhood as grounds for spiritual direction	81

3.2.1.1. The person as the image of God	82
3.2.1.2. The understanding of the person in the grace of the reconciliation of Christ	86
3.2.1.3. The understanding of the person within the grace of sanctification: humanity in the leading of the Spirit	88
3.2.2. Spiritual Direction as part of pastoral care	92
3.2.2.1. Spiritual care as a core for pastoral care	92
3.2.2.2. The necessity for spiritual direction as part of pastoral care in the Reformed tradition	95
3.3. How spiritual direction functions for personal reconciliation	97
3.3.1. God-awareness and self-awareness through prayer	97
3.3.2. Rediscovery of identity through spiritual direction as story-telling	98
3.3.3. Admission of sin and healing in spiritual direction	100
3.3.4. Finding one's vocation	101
3.3.5. Social justice in spiritual direction	102
Conclusion	104
<u>Chapter Four: Ignatian Spiritual Direction</u>	105
Introduction	105
4.1. What are Spiritual Exercises?	105
4.1.1. An overview: Ignatius of Loyola and <i>Spiritual Exercises</i>	105
4.1.2. The purpose and meaning of making the Exercises	107

4.1.3. The structure of <i>Spiritual Exercises</i>	110
4.1.3.1. The First Week	112
4.1.3.2. The Second Week	113
4.1.3.3. The Third Week	114
4.1.3.4. The Fourth Week	115
4.2. The Reformed tradition and Ignatian Spiritual Exercises	117
4.2.1. Ignatian Spiritual Exercises in current Protestantism	117
4.2.2. Comparing the theology of Calvin and Ignatius	121
4.3. How do the Exercises relate to personal reconciliation?	125
4.3.1. Spiritual freedom	125
4.3.1.1. Features of spiritual freedom	125
4.3.1.2. Desire and freedom	126
4.3.1.3. Understanding suffering	128
4.3.2. Conversion	130
4.3.3. Discernment: finding God's will	132
4.3.3.1. The meaning and purpose of discernment	133
4.3.3.2. The Rules for discernment: consolation and desolation	135
4.3.4. Apostolic spirituality: life as a disciple of Christ	139
Conclusion	141
<u>Part II: Interview Findings and Analysis</u>	142

Research questions	142
<u>Chapter Five: Methodology</u>	145
5. 1.Method	145
5.1.1. Data collection method: in-depth interviews	145
5.1.2. Choosing the sample	146
5.1.3. Collecting data	147
5.1.4. Analysis	148
5.2. Background of interviewees	148
5.2.1. Scottish subjects	148
5.2.2. Korean subjects	152
<u>Chapter Six: Scottish Interview Findings</u>	155
6.1. The discussion of responses to the questions	155
6.2. The findings of directors' interviews	156
6.2.1. Understanding personal reconciliation	156
6.2.2. Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction	157
6.2.3. Directee's reasons for and expectations of spiritual direction	158
6.2.4. The changes to directees' prayer	160
6.2.5. The changes in directees' image of God and self, and acceptance of themselves and others	162
6.2.6. Healing and forgiveness	163

6.2.7. Sin	166
6.2.8. Directee's life as an agent for reconciliation	167
6.2.9. Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church	169
6.3. The findings of directees' interviews	170
6.3.1. Understanding personal reconciliation	171
6.3.2. Directees' understanding of personal reconciliation and spiritual direction	174
6.3.3. Directees' reasons for spiritual direction	176
6.3.4. Directees' expectations of and satisfaction with spiritual direction	179
6.3.5. The changes in directees' image of God and love and trust of God	182
6.3.6. Changes in the directees' image of themselves and perspective on their lives	185
6.3.7. Sin	187
6.3.8. Healing: the change to directees' interpretation of affliction in their lives and of directees' life stories	188
6.3.9. Forgiveness	191
6.3.10. Directees' contemplation of Jesus' life in connection with their understanding of relationships	192
6.3.11. Reconciliation with others and life as an agent of reconciliation	194
6.3.12. Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church	197
Conclusion	197
<u>Chapter Seven: South Korean Interview Findings</u>	200

Introduction	200
7.1. The responses to questions	200
7.2. Korean directors' interview findings	200
7.2.1. Understanding personal reconciliation	200
7.2.2. Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction	202
7.2.3. The reason why directees decided to come for spiritual direction and their expectations of spiritual direction	202
7.2.4. Changes to directees' prayer	203
7.2.5. Changes in God-awareness, self-awareness, and understanding of others in spiritual direction	204
7.2.5.1. Changes in God-awareness	204
7.2.5.2. Changes in self-awareness	205
7.2.5.3. Changes in understanding others	206
7.2.6. Healing: healing of memory, reinterpretation of life-story, and psychological and physical recovery	207
7.2.7. Sin	209
7.2.8. Forgiving others and reconciliation with others	210
7.2.9. Social action as an agent of reconciliation: apostolic spirituality	211
7.2.10. Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church	214
7.3. Korean directees' interview findings	215
7.3.1. Understanding personal reconciliation	215

7.3.2. Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction	217
7.3.3. The reason why directees decided to come for spiritual direction and their expectations of spiritual direction	218
7.3.4. Healing	220
7.3.5. The changes in directees' God-awareness, self-awareness, and life perspectives	223
7.3.5.1. The changes in directees' God-awareness	223
7.3.5.2. The changes in directees' self-awareness	224
7.3.6. Sin	227
7.3.7. Forgivingness and reconciliation	228
7.3.8. Directee's contemplation of Jesus' life in connection with their understanding of their relationships	230
7.3.9. Life as an agent of reconciliation	233
Conclusion	234
<u>Chapter Eight: Theological Reflection</u>	236
Introduction	236
8.1. The meaning of personal reconciliation	236
8.1.1. Restoration of the relational image of God	237
8.1.2. A holistic viewpoint of personal reconciliation	240
8.1.3. The place of sin in personal reconciliation	242

8.1.3.1. The understanding of personal sin	242
8.1.3.2. The understanding of social sin	245
8.1.4. The role of healing in personal reconciliation	246
8.2. Ignatian spiritual direction as a practice for personal reconciliation	248
8.2.1. A space for considering the issues of personal reconciliation	248
8.2.2. The First Week	249
8.2.2.1. Forgiveness	250
8.2.2.2. The change in directees' image of God and themselves	253
8.2.3. The Second Week	255
8.2.3.1. Reinterpretation of one's life story through Jesus' story	255
8.2.3.2. Discernment: finding God's will	258
8.2.4. The Third Week	260
8.2.4.1. Reinterpretation of one's suffering through Jesus' Cross	260
8.2.4.2. Compassion	261
8.2.5. The Fourth Week	263
8.2.5.1. Establishing new life direction through Resurrection	263
8.2.5.2. Hospitality as the out-flowing of compassion and the building of peaceful relationships	264
8.2.5.3. Choosing the life of a reconciler	265
8.3. Implications of Ignatian spiritual direction for Presbyterian Christians	268
8.3.1. The positive implications of Ignatian spiritual direction	268

8.3.2. The possible limitations of Ignatian spiritual direction	271
Conclusion	273
<u>Chapter Nine: Conclusions</u>	275
9.1. Recommendations for Church ministry and further study	276
<u>Appendix 1</u>	280
<u>Appendix 2</u>	283
<u>Appendix 3</u>	287
<u>Appendix 4</u>	295
<u>Bibliography</u>	297

The List of Tables

Table 1	The aim of spiritual direction	73
Table 2	Process of spiritual direction	76
Table 3	The interconnection and overlap between personal reconciliation Ignatian spiritual direction	143
Table 4	Scottish Subjects	150
Table 5	Korean subjects	153

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1. The background and aim of this study

The contemporary world is the locus of many conflicts at a range of levels from individual to international. There are voices calling for economic justice from global capitalism, such as those campaigning for a fairer economic system with greater parity, and those seeking freedom from repressive Governments or dictators, as seen in the uprisings during what has become known as the Arab Spring. These are examples of conflict at international and national levels. There are also inter-denominational problems such as ‘The Troubles’, the conflict between Protestant and Catholic in Northern Ireland, as well as the more recent religiously motivated attacks on Western Christians by Muslim groups as witnessed during the 9/11 attacks on New York and the 7/7 attacks on London. Social conflicts have also been seen in recent years with the summer riots in England, 2011, which had a variety of possible causes such as social exclusion, family breakdown, poverty, unemployment, government cuts, and ‘Broken Britain’, etc.¹ Conflict also exists at the individual level, either inter-personal, such as between family members, individuals and local communities, or intra-personal, within individuals themselves. An example of such intra-personal conflict can be seen in the case of Korean-French senator Jean-Vincent Placé, who was adopted by a French family at the age of seven. In a recent interview with KBS news, the 43-year old Placé stated that he felt as though he had always existed as two halves, French and Korean, and now wanted to reconcile both those parts, and his whole life, within himself.²

According to John Paul Lederach, the causes of all conflicts involve ‘issues of identity’³ and ‘desire for safety’.⁴ Moreover, these conflicts can stem from a vast and diverse number of different causes, and therefore raise the question of how such complex

¹ The Guardian/London School of Economics, “Reading the Riots: Investigating England’s Summer of Disorder”, (5/12/2011)

² Jean-Vincent Placé, KBS news, the Korean Broadcasting Service, (9/3/2011)

³ John Paul Lederach, *Building Peace: Sustainable Reconciliation in Divided Societies*, (Washington D.C.: United States Institutes of Peace Press, 1997), p.8

⁴ *Ibid.*, p.13

and entrenched differences can be resolved, thus enabling human beings to live in a more peaceful environment. This issue therefore draws our attention to the discussion of reconciliation, the final aim of conflict resolution, which is often addressed in the political, legal, and social arenas, without there being a unified or precise understanding of what it means or how it can be achieved.⁵

The term *reconciliation* is used in a theological sense as well as a secular one. Theologically, according to John De Gruchy, *reconciliation* refers to God's redemption and can be a metaphor for contemporary soteriology for those going through brokenness and hurt within the various relationships as outlined above.⁶ Reconciliation, in terms of healing the broken world, is, as Karl Barth describes it, the fulfilment, or *telos*, of God's redemptive work.⁷ Reconciliation as the completion of God's redemptive work is also a process that human beings, as those living with conflict, suffering and hurt, should strive for in this present life. Reconciliation therefore consists of two facets; *telos* and process. Reconciliation as *telos* is the ultimate and most complete expression of God's reconciliation. Reconciliation as process can only be incomplete and something that is to be constantly strived for in order to create a more hopeful human community. Consequently, the most important component of reconciliation, from a human perspective, is the development of this process in order to heal brokenness and to facilitate a move towards a better future.

In order to contribute to this process, Christians first need to discover the purpose of their creation, in other words, they need to find their vocation and realise in what ways they have been chosen as disciples of Christ in the journey towards ultimate reconciliation. They then need to find a specific way to serve this process; a way to commit themselves to reconciling work as a process, such as working for the healing of the ruptured community and those wounded within it. This thesis therefore arose from an interest in the ways in which Christians can discover the vocation that will shape their lives, allowing them to become people who work for reconciliation as a process in this world. In other words, how they can reflect on God's offer of reconciliation to them as a way of developing their

⁵ Geiko Müller-Fahrenholz, *The Art of Forgiveness: Theological Reflections on Healing and Reconciliation*, (Geneva: WCC Publications, 1997), p.1

⁶ John De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2002), p.24

⁷ Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV. Part 1, G. W. Bromiley and T. F. Torrance, ed., (London & New York: T & T Clark International, 1956), p.67

personal reconciliation, and thus, their capacity to be reconcilers actualising this vocation on a daily basis. In turn, this aroused a wider interest in the role that the Church, as the community of Jesus' disciples, should play in accordance with people's increased interest in reconciliation, caused by the rise in levels of conflict at social, national, and international levels. With these interests, I was naturally drawn to study the role that the individual can play within reconciliation at wider levels and how this can be facilitated by individual's awareness of and participation in this work. In order to help individual Christians to achieve this level of awareness and participation, there needs to be a ministry which nurtures this and enables them to make decisions regarding the shaping of their lives.

With this understanding of the role individual Christians can play in reconciliation ministry, and before moving on to outline the research questions and the methodology, the meanings of personal and social reconciliation need to be briefly clarified. According to Robert Schreiter, reconciliation as process can be divided into two categories: social and spiritual. He states that social reconciliation 'has to do with providing structures and process whereby a fractured society can be reconstructed as truthful and just'.⁸ Society here could mean both local communities and the global, international community. Spiritual reconciliation, for him, is the power of 'rebuilding shattered lives' and 'the healing of memories'.⁹ Thus, social reconciliation has to do with providing the means to reconstruct the social structure and spiritual reconciliation has to do with individual healing and occurs on a personal level. For spiritual reconciliation, Schreiter focuses on the restoration of victims' damaged humanity and states that reconciliation should begin from the victim's perspective.¹⁰ For me, however, individual reconciliation needs to be more clearly classified, because a person has two dimensions, intra- and interpersonal; within themselves and with others.

Therefore, I turn to the term *personal reconciliation* proposed by theologian Cecelia Clegg, because it seems to offer a more precise way to describe reconciliation, as I understand it, at this level. She puts forward the idea that personal reconciliation includes 'personal psychological growth and development of spiritual awareness', and here,

⁸ Robert J. Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation: spirituality & Strategies*, (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1998), p.4

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid., p.111

‘compassion and forgiveness are paramount’.¹¹ For me, personal reconciliation is a more inclusive concept than that, because it incorporates both the intrapersonal, that is, one’s spiritual and psychological healing, and the interpersonal, which is one’s relationship with others. The foundation of this notion of reconciliation is one’s spiritual aspect, and so the transformation of one’s relationship with God is vital. Therefore, because everyone can potentially have a relationship with God, personal reconciliation needs to include the transformation of both victim and wrongdoer, although the victim’s healing has priority in the work of reconciliation.

I therefore suggest, in line with Schreiter, that those who experience personal reconciliation can contribute to social reconciliation in terms of creating and supporting the atmosphere and environment needed to promote and sustain social reconciliation. To achieve this, the Church can offer a ministry encouraging Christians to experience personal reconciliation and then to serve the reconciliation process within their society. Such a ministry requires a spiritual practice, as Schreiter suggests, enhancing Christians’ spirituality of reconciliation;¹² in other words, to augment their awareness of reconciliation and to lead them to choose a vocation that privileges reconciliation. This thesis therefore proposes spiritual direction, especially Ignatian spiritual direction, as a space for this. I argue that Ignatian spiritual direction can develop Christians’ personal reconciliation and further encourage them to commit themselves to the ministry of reconciliation, because it is a space where they can explore their life and faith, with the guidance of a spiritual director, in order to deepen their relationship with God. In so doing, they are able to discover themselves and their vocation.

This theme, regarding the need for a space for personal reconciliation, has also appeared in contemporary Christian literature, most notably in the novel *The Shack* that tells the story of a father in great sadness after the murder of his daughter.¹³ After his daughter’s death, he loses all hope and faith and abandons his family and his previous life. Several years later, he receives a message, apparently from God, inviting him to a shack

¹¹ Cecelia Clegg, “Embracing a Threatening Other: Identity and Reconciliation in Northern Ireland”, Sebastian Kim, Pauline Kollontail and Greg Hoyland (ed.), *Peace and Reconciliation: In Search of Shared Identity*, (York: York St. John University, 2008), p.83

¹² Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.4

¹³ William. Paul Young, *The Shack: Where Tragedy Confronts Eternity*, Newbury Park, CA: Windblown Media, 2007

near the place where his daughter was killed. There he meets God and after lengthy conversations with the people he encounters there about God's creation and love,¹⁴ he is healed and discovers his hunger for reconciliation with God and forgiveness towards others. He rediscovers, with love, his responsibility to his family. The shack therefore acts as a metaphor for the space where one can experience Jesus' ministry and then develop personal reconciliation.¹⁵ I suggest that spiritual direction is the space represented by the shack.

In particular, Ignatian spiritual direction, a major form of spiritual direction, offers an effective way of finding one's vocation because it consists of a well-organised and systematic process that focuses on the contemplation of Jesus' story and how this relates to our own lives. In the course of developing this argument, I will formulate a more precise meaning of personal reconciliation and the possible role of Ignatian spiritual direction in enhancing this for directees. Moreover, I will argue for the possibility of Ignatian spiritual direction as a reconciliation ministry for the Presbyterian Church.

This issue is particularly relevant to me as a practicing Presbyterian minister in South Korea, because there, due to our recent history and the many divisions that exist (for example, between North and South Korea, between social classes, between rural and urban areas, and generational divisions), the issue of reconciliation has become increasingly important. However, this issue is not being addressed in as much detail as it needs to be in Korea, particularly in the theological arena. Therefore, it will be helpful for there to be a discussion focusing on the understanding of reconciliation in South Korea, particularly among Church members, something to which this thesis aims to contribute. Moreover, spiritual direction is attractive to Korean Presbyterians in terms of spiritual formation and growth. It is a practice which is spreading, and this provides a particular opportunity to widen the conversation around personal responsibility for reconciliation. In addition, I wanted to examine this issue in relation to the Church of Scotland because it is one of the roots of the Korean Presbyterian Church. In both Scotland and South Korea, the major

¹⁴ Three individuals who apparently represent the Trinity, see Roger E. Olson, *Finding God in the Shack: Seeking truth in a story of evil and redemption*, Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 2009, p.12

¹⁵ Many questions were raised by this novel, *The Shack*, so Dr. Roger E. Olson, a professor of theology, responded with *Finding God in the Shack*, I do not discuss these questions because they

form of spiritual direction is Ignatian, but, because it began as a Roman Catholic ministry, it means that there is often resistance to it from people in the Reformed tradition. So, in Scotland and South Korea, Ignatian spiritual direction is used in a slightly modified form in which the most overt Catholic elements and symbols have been removed, making it acceptable to Presbyterians.¹⁶

Despite this apparent resistance, in my experience as a minister in Korea and as one also undergoing spiritual direction in Scotland, I have observed that, amongst individual church members in both countries, interest in personal spiritual guidance and care is growing and the numbers participating in spiritual direction are increasing. It appears that people seeking spiritual direction want to find reasons and answers for their experience of suffering and the problems they have with others; something they felt able to attain only through developing a deeper relationship with God. Therefore, I am interested in Ignatian spiritual direction, in its modified form, in relation to personal reconciliation because it seems to enable individuals (directees) to satisfy their desire for a greater understanding of their own problematic situation and, therefore, to undergo a transformative experience.

Consequently, my research question asks whether Ignatian spiritual direction can be a space for developing personal reconciliation, that is, the work of reconciliation at the personal level. Moreover, I also want to explore whether Ignatian spiritual direction can be a ministry of reconciliation through encouraging directees to serve for social reconciliation, and whether it can be implemented, in its modified form, by the Presbyterian Church as a reconciliation ministry.

To investigate these research questions, I carried out semi-structured, face-to-face interviews with Scottish and Korean Presbyterians who had experienced Ignatian spiritual direction. My field research began in December, 2009 and lasted until March, 2010. I interviewed both directors and directees from each country. The ten Scottish interviewees came from the Central Belt of Scotland and the eight Korean interviewees came from Seoul, except one who is a director in Kwang-Ju.¹⁷ Through this qualitative research, I aimed to investigate the meaning that personal reconciliation had for those participating in

are beyond the scope of this thesis, instead I am interested in the metaphor of the shack as a space to encounter God.

¹⁶ See Chapter eight for a more in-depth discussion regarding these modifications.

¹⁷ See Chapter five for more detailed Research Methodology.

the *in-depth interview* and the role that their relationship with God had in personal reconciliation. I also looked at the ways in which Ignatian spiritual direction can facilitate personal reconciliation and, once developed, how the individual can serve as a reconciler in the wider community. Finally, I explored how effectively Ignatian spiritual direction functions for Presbyterians in terms of facilitating personal reconciliation and serving as a reconciliation ministry.

1.2. This study as practical theology

This thesis is a work of practical theology. According to John Swinton and Harriet Mowat, practical theology is a discipline that begins with human experience and is a theological reflection on that experience.¹⁸ To gain insights and meaning from human experience, practical theology involves empirical research. There are a variety of ways for empirical research to be carried out, such as sampling with questionnaires, observational study, reflecting on critical incidents verbatim, and ethnography. For this study, I carried out in-depth interviews because I wanted to elicit participants' lived experiences of spiritual direction and engage more directly with them in a conversational way that echoed the spiritual direction process.

In order for this empirical study to be placed within the field of practical theology, it requires more components than just human experience. According to theologians in this area, practical theology requires four aspects. First, it functions as an area for 'faithful practices' to be enabled,¹⁹ which then encourages and enables 'the faithful participation' in the continuing Gospel story²⁰ and takes seriously 'the complex dynamics of the human encounter with God'.²¹ Secondly, human experience takes a significant position as a starting point for practical theology because it considers human experience to be 'a place where the gospel is grounded, embodied, interpreted and lived out'.²² Therefore, practical theology aims to enable Christians to live a more faithful life as Jesus' disciples in the world on which their experience is based. Thirdly, although practical theology is based on

¹⁸ John Swinton and Harriet Mowat, *Practical Theology and Qualitative Research*, (London: SCM Press, 2006), p.v

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p.9

²⁰ *Ibid.*, p.10

²¹ *Ibid.*, p.4

²² *Ibid.*, p.5

human experience, it must also contain a ‘theological reflection’²³ on the ‘meaning and truth’²⁴ of that experience from a theological position and is therefore grounded in theological knowledge.²⁵ Finally, practical theology should be ‘critical’²⁶ in that it has to respond to issues raised within society and is not separate from them.²⁷ Therefore, it becomes a place where existing theological presuppositions can be challenged and questioned.²⁸ In this way, human experience becomes not a place for new revelations but a space for raising new questions and challenging traditions, offering new insights which can enable an individual to live a more faithful life.²⁹

These notions of practical theology coincide with the focus and methodology of this thesis, which reflects on the restoration of the image of God in humanity, in particular, the relational aspect. Furthermore, this thesis aims to develop an understanding of spiritual direction as a tool for reconciliation by enabling Christians to find God’s will and be transformed into Jesus’ disciples, aided by the Spirit which works within the human community. Therefore, the foundation of this study is the exploration of the building of a deepening relationship with God and relates to the growth of Christians’ faith. In addition, this thesis emerges from the examination of Christians’ lived experience in contemporary society and thereby provides a practical and academic challenge to the traditional assumptions of the Church. It also proposes the possible role of spiritual direction in the work for reconciliation and provides contemporary Christians with an insight into how they can find their vocation and actualise it within their lives. This insight leads to the practice of the Gospel and the embodiment of discipleship in Christians’ everyday lives. This thesis therefore contributes to an understanding of the expansion of the Gospel in lived experience, by demonstrating the relationship between Church ministry and reconciliation in the contemporary era. In this regard, this thesis can be positioned within practical theology.

²³ Ibid., p.7

²⁴ Paul Ballard and John Pritchard, *Practical Theology in Action: Christian Thinking in the Service of Church and Society*, 2nd ed., (London: SPCK, 1996), p.6

²⁵ Swinton and Mowat, *Practical Theology and Qualitative Research*, p.7

²⁶ Ibid., p.6

²⁷ Ballard and Pritchard, *Practical Theology in Action*, p.6

²⁸ Swinton and Mowat, *Practical Theology and Qualitative Research*, p.7

²⁹ Ibid.

In addition, the empirical study includes a comparison between two cultures: Scotland, where Christianity and Christian ethics are historically deeply rooted and have informed societal values, and South Korea, where Christianity is a relatively new ‘import’, overlaid on top of a pre-existing mindset which is very different. Therefore, it is interesting to note the ways in which personal reconciliation is perceived by individual Christians from these two different cultures, yet within the same denomination. In South Korea, Presbyterianism is very active, with at least 20% of the whole population practicing Protestants, more than two-thirds of which are Presbyterian. So, while I worked with both populations, my primary concern is with reconciliation ministry in the country to which I will return to minister: Korea. Therefore, the results gained from this empirical research could provide insights into the South Korean Presbyterian ministry and contribute to practical theology therein.

1.3. The structure of this thesis

The study of the interrelation between the work of reconciliation and spiritual direction needs to include both a theoretical framework and an empirical approach. Therefore, Part I of this thesis consists of the theoretical background and theological research into the areas of reconciliation, spiritual direction and the Ignatian way. Part II consists of the findings and discussion of the empirical fieldwork carried out in Scotland and Korea. This fieldwork was undertaken through in-depth interviews with Presbyterians who have experienced Ignatian spiritual direction in Scotland and South Korea; the major form in each country being the Ignatian way, which all participants had experienced.

In order to propose a theological framework, Part I examines the theories and features of contemporary reconciliation, spiritual direction, and Ignatian spiritual direction. Part II outlines the Methodology of this project and the interview findings of Scottish and Korean subjects; it also contains a theological reflection on the themes that emerged out of these findings.

Chapter two briefly explores contemporary theories of reconciliation and examines in more depth the theological understanding of them. It will examine the social and spiritual aspects of reconciliation and its dynamics, and finally, the spirituality of reconciliation.

Chapter three looks at spiritual direction as a form of pastoral care and the need for this in the Reformed Church. In order to do this, there is a description of the aim, purpose and

characteristics of spiritual direction and recent developments such as story-telling, healing, admission of sin and justice. This chapter also presents the ways in which spiritual direction can lead to personal reconciliation for Protestants and members of the Reformed tradition, despite resistance to it from the Reformed Church.

Chapter four explores Ignatian spiritual direction in more depth, describing the features and process of Ignatian Spiritual Exercises, including spiritual freedom, conversion, the understanding of suffering, finding God's will, discernment and apostolic spirituality. The form of Ignatian spiritual direction used by all Presbyterian directors interviewed is a slightly modified version of the Ignatian way, which, because of its Catholic origins, they are reluctant to accept as a whole. However, increasing numbers of individuals within this tradition are becoming interested in spiritual direction and have chosen to participate in the Ignatian way. This chapter will therefore examine the reasons for this increasing interest and the theological similarities and differences between Calvin and Ignatius.

Chapter five describes the methodology of the empirical fieldwork of this study. Here, the reason for using interviews, the sample selection process and the procedures and analysis of these interviews will be explained; a brief introduction to the participants is also given.

Chapters six and seven describe the Scottish and South Korean interview findings respectively, outlining the meaning reconciliation had for the participants and their personal reconciliation experience while undergoing spiritual direction. Also, these chapters discuss directees' changed images of God, their strengthened Christian identity and their sense of compassion and hospitality towards others. Moreover, it describes their experience of healing and forgiveness, as well as the possibility of becoming a reconciler and how the Ignatian way can be used in the Presbyterian Church.

In Chapter eight, I reflect on the findings of the interviews from a theological and practical viewpoint. This will include a discussion of the similarities and differences in participants' experiences and understanding of personal reconciliation and the reasons for this. Insights will be offered into the ways in which spiritual direction can lead to personal reconciliation, the impact of this on the spirituality of reconciliation and how this encourages Christians to work as reconcilers in the community. The implications of the Ignatian way for the Presbyterian Church will also be considered.

Chapter nine, the conclusion, is a summary of the study which includes recommendations for Church ministry of reconciliation. Suggestions for areas of further study are also advanced.

PART I

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND AND THEOLOGICAL RESEARCH

In order to propose a theological framework for the possible achievement of personal reconciliation through the experience of spiritual direction, Part I investigates the theories and theologies of contemporary reconciliation, and also the qualities and efficacy of spiritual direction in general, with a particular focus on Ignatian spiritual direction. Throughout these chapters, I will argue that personal reconciliation exists in a holistic way within individuals, encompassing the physical, psychological, spiritual and relational, but that the spiritual aspect is the foundation for the pursuit of Christian personal reconciliation. Personal reconciliation is also not separate from social reconciliation, because humanity is created in the image of God and therefore has social responsibility. Thus, I will also argue that spiritual direction as a form of spiritual care can contribute to the individual Christian's personal reconciliation by nurturing the relationship with God. This also raises awareness of the purpose for God's creation of the individual and the world and that God has chosen humanity as His partner for His work of reconciliation. The experience of personal reconciliation through spiritual direction can be a space for directees to decide the shape of their life as a reconciling agent, as a way of practicing Christian discipleship. Furthermore, Ignatian spiritual direction as the main form of spiritual direction in Scotland and South Korea offers a way to do this through its distinct attributes, such as imaginative prayer and discernment.

CHAPTER TWO

CONTEMPORARY THEORIES OF RECONCILIATION

This chapter will consider what reconciliation means in the contemporary world and how Christians contribute to reconciliation. In order to do this, the chapter will explore the contemporary and theological understanding of reconciliation, the dynamics of reconciliation, spirituality of reconciliation, and how reconciliation can be facilitated, based on the theories of practitioners and theologians who work for reconciliation. In particular, this chapter will look into the meaning of personal reconciliation, the spirituality of reconciliation in Christian understandings and how it can be nurtured in Christian life.

2.1. The notion of reconciliation

2.1.1. Original and contemporary meanings of the term ‘reconciliation’ in theology

Today, the term ‘reconciliation’ is difficult to define because it is used in a wide variety of contexts where there are conflicts between social groups and nations as well as between individuals. Geiko Müller-Fahrenholz argues that ‘reconciliation’ is often used by politicians without their giving any clear indication of what they mean by reconciliation and how they might achieve it; thus, ‘it has even become part of public rhetoric’.¹ Moreover, it is sometimes employed to suggest a compromise for a variety of purposes. With regard to the use of the term ‘reconciliation’ today, South African theologian John De Gruchy notes that it is applied to every circumstance where the healing and restoration of relationships is needed, such as within politics, religion, and the family.² Therefore, to delineate the notion of reconciliation, it is necessary to explore the history of this term and why it is used so widely today.

Historically, reconciliation is a strictly theological concept defining God’s saving work in Christ and is a term used to describe soteriology as salvation, redemption, and atonement.³ According to De Gruchy, the term entered Christian dialogue through the

¹ Müller-Fahrenholz, *The Art of Forgiveness*, p.1

² De Gruchy, *Reconciliation*, p.46

³ *Ibid.*, pp.44-47; Müller-Fahrenholz, *The Art of Forgiveness*, p.4

Vulgate's use of the Latin word *reconciliatio* to translate Paul's word *καταλλαγή*, which was used to depict God's redeeming work and new creation in Jesus Christ.⁴ De Gruchy explains that *reconciliation* is used to describe God's accomplishment of salvation at both personal and cosmic levels in the Pauline letters; for Paul, reconciliation represents God befriending us, 'making peace, and restoring relationships' with humanity.⁵ De Gruchy notes that this word had not developed by the Middle Ages in the Church⁶ but appeared in English print in the late fourteenth century, where it was used 'in the sense of reconciling estranged persons'.⁷ At about the same time, it began to be used in the Church within the King James Version of the Bible to denote a 'sense of peace with God and one another';⁸ those meanings still remain in English usage.⁹

The term reconciliation is often used interchangeably with salvation, redemption, and atonement, but has more of an emphasis on relationality; that is, reconciliation can be said to be a term specifying humanity's relationship with God. Likewise, as Donald Shriver argues, as the twenty-first century is becoming one in which 'peace among nations is a practical necessity'¹⁰ and the ultimate purpose in conflict resolution in the contemporary era is considered to be relational transformation as in 'rebuilding relationships' between conflicting parties,¹¹ any metaphor to illustrate God's redeeming work needs to reflect these current concerns. In this sense, reconciliation seems to be the most relevant word to depict soteriology in this era. Therefore, as De Gruchy explains, quoting the idea of Rowan Williams, Christians today who seriously consider the concept of reconciliation begin 'from the experience of being reconciled, being accepted, being held in the grace of

⁴ De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p.24

⁵ De Gruchy noted that Paul's understandings of reconciliation can be differentiated in three contexts. In 2 Corinthians, Paul uses reconciliation in a deeply personal way; he connects the gospel of reconciliation to the new creation in Christ, the righteousness of God and the mission of the Church. In Colossians, his concept of reconciliation is far less personal compared with 2 Corinthians. It includes the whole cosmos in God's act of reconciliation in Christ. In Romans, he links reconciliation to being justified by faith, thus, reconciliation is new humanity because of justification. *Ibid.*, pp.53-54

⁶ *Ibid.*, p.48

⁷ *Ibid.*, p.24

⁸ *Ibid.*

⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰ Donald W. Shriver Jr., *An Ethic for Enemies: Forgiveness in Politics*, (New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), p.5

¹¹ John Paul Lederach, *Building Peace: Sustainable Reconciliation in Divided Societies*, (Washington D.C.: United States Institutes of Peace Press, 1997), pp.150-151

God'.¹² This means that reconciliation as restoration of relationships is connected with one's relationship with God and humanity, and is a work carried out by God's initiative.¹³

With regard to this initiative, Karl Barth defines reconciliation as the 'fulfilment of the covenant between God and man'¹⁴ and asserts that God accomplished reconciliation through the cross of Christ acting as mediator.¹⁵ According to Barth, 'covenant' was originally the Old Testament term for the basic relationship between God and Israel, but has been extended for use in a broader context to indicate the relationship between God and all humanity.¹⁶ This covenant was broken by humans; therefore, Barth argues that the fulfilment of the broken covenant cannot help but have the character of reconciliation and this reconciliation, which takes place in Christ, is God's initiative with Christ as the content and fulfilment of the new covenant.¹⁷ The centre of Barth's doctrine of reconciliation is the Cross, but the resurrection of Christ is as important as the Cross because the resurrection is 'the fulfilment and proclamation of God's decision concerning the event of the Cross'.¹⁸ While asserting that the initiative to work for reconciliation rested with God, Barth also describes the calling of human beings to participate in God's reconciliation as His partners.¹⁹ He declares that Jesus is 'the One who justifies, sanctifies and calls'²⁰ and that humankind 'is called and becomes a Christian as he is illuminated'.²¹

Illumination is, according to Barth, to become aware of a Christian's vocation, which involves 'communication, witness, and service in and to the world'.²² Regarding Christian vocation, John Webster argues that Barth suggests the two most important roles of the human agent for reconciliation are 'prayer and the active life'.²³ In a similar vein, De Gruchy comments that the Church, as the Christian community, is also given the vocation

¹² Rowan Williams, *The Wound of Knowledge*, (London: Darton, Longman & Tood, 1990), cited in De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p.50

¹³ According to Schreiter, God's initiative is foundational to understanding reconciliation ministry in Pauline theology, Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, pp.14-15

¹⁴ Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV. Part 1, pp.22-35

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, pp.79-92

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, pp.22-35

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, pp.67-68

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p.309

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, pp.146-147 Also see John Webster, *Barth's Ethics of Reconciliation*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp.70-80

²⁰ *Ibid.*, p.147

²¹ Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV, part 3, pp.508-509

²² *Ibid.*, p.494

to participate in God's work for reconciliation: 'to tell the story of God's reconciliation to others and invite them to participate in what God has done and what God is doing in reconciling the world'.²⁴ According to De Gruchy, the foundation of this vocation given to the Church is that humanity is created 'in the image of God' and is included in 'God's love and purpose', within which humanity was 'created to be in a covenantal relationship of companionship with God'.²⁵ Therefore, one may suggest that all of humanity is in a relationship with God and the nature of all human relationships is grounded in the nature of the triune God.

This explanation of relational attributes in humanity can be found in the description of Calvin's theological anthropology. For Calvin, the image of God in humanity can be found to have a threefold substance; relational, substantial, and communal. Susan Schreiner classifies Calvin's understanding of the image of God in humanity as the relational character, supported by Karl Barth and his followers, and the substantial character, supported by Emil Brunner and his followers.²⁶ Here, the relational character refers to humanity's right spiritual relationship with God for eternal life, and the substantial character refers to the divine image implanted and remaining in the human's soul and his or her talent for this present life and its continuation.²⁷ In addition, Ronald Wallace and André Biéler suggest that Calvin's image of God has a communal character. According to Wallace, Calvin implies that the communal quality of God's image is universal, that is, 'one common nature',²⁸ as a form of common identity based upon the image of God in all people; thus, 'to love another is to act with humanity in recognition of our common nature'.²⁹ Therefore, according to Biéler, Calvin's idea of the communal character finds a new direction within Christian life because 'the Christian life becomes fundamentally communal'³⁰ on account of communion with Jesus Christ; this life 'is

²³ Webster, *Barth's Ethics of Reconciliation*, Ibid., p.76

²⁴ De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p.50

²⁵ Ibid., p.48

²⁶ Susan E. Schreiner, *The Theater of His Glory*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Academics, 1991), p.55

²⁷ Ibid., pp.60-72

²⁸ Ronald S. Wallace, *Calvin's Doctrine of the Christian Life*, (Edinburgh & London: Oliver and Boyd, 1959), p.149

²⁹ Ibid., p.151

³⁰ André Biéler, *Calvin's Economic and Social Thought*, Edward Dommen ed., James Greig, trans., (Geneva: WCC Publications, 2005), p.181

upheld and strengthened in the fellowship or community of the church'.³¹ Hence, Christians' recognition of the restored image of God in their lives enables them to live as a reconciled being and to initiate a new reconciled community, by participating in their genuine mutual fellowship based upon a common life with Christ.³² As a result, reconciliation can be said to be the restoration of the image of God within human beings; that is, the restoration of the relationship of humanity and God, and the restoration of human community.

In this way, humankind created in the image of God is able to recover their broken relationship with God, live in union with God through Christ, enjoy friendship with others, and pursue wholeness within themselves. However, according to Hiltner, such relationships are disrupted by sin. He uses the metaphor of 'alienation' to describe sin because he considers this to be the most instructive, along with the metaphor of a 'net' or 'web',³³ which, in a contemporary context, identifies human relationships in terms of 'a human network'. In accordance with this definition of sin, reconciliation as its opposing principle can be identified with the reconnection of relationships; furthermore, it implies the formation of new relationships.

Like Hiltner, John Paul Lederach, a practitioner working for reconciliation, has looked closely at humanity's desire, as relational beings, for reconciliation in this world. Lederach believes that God calls Christians to 'a ministry of reconciliation'.³⁴ He identifies reconciliation with 'restoring and healing the torn-apart web of relationships'³⁵ by 'changing human relationships'³⁶ within conflicts and estrangement, and seeking 'to restore truth and love in ourselves'.³⁷ For Lederach, reconciliation requires humans living in disrupted societies to do something enormously risky; it involves turning 'towards what

³¹ Ibid.

³² John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, (1559), John T. McNeill, ed., Ford Lewis Battles, trans., (Louisville & London: Westminster John Knox Press, 1993), Book 4. Ch.1.2 and 3, pp.1012-1016. Hereafter abbreviated into *Institutes* (Book. Chapter. Section).

³³ Seward Hiltner, "Salvation's Message about Health", in H.Newton Malony, ed., *Wholeness and Holiness: Readings in the Psychology/Theology of Mental Health*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Book House, 1983), p.159

³⁴ John Paul Lederach, *The Journey Toward Reconciliation*, (Scottsdale, PA: Herald Press, 1999), p.16

³⁵ Ibid., p.52

³⁶ Ibid., p.10

³⁷ Ibid., p.10, p.14

most frightens them in the depths of their souls' and confronting their enemy.³⁸ Thus, reconciliation is a journey from conflict to a painful rebalancing and, therefore, conflict is a pathway towards reconciliation.³⁹ Lederach's conceptual framework for reconciliation is that it must happen within all dimensions of human relationships and must embrace the whole person.⁴⁰

Because Lederach's idea has been employed by reconciliation theorists and practitioners, his key thoughts need to be examined in relation to this. Lederach explains the concept of reconciliation in relation to 'peace-building' in the 'local and global community'.⁴¹ For him, reconciliation is the ultimate aim of peace-building as well as a 'focus and locus' functioning at every stage of peace-building'.⁴² Lederach expressed reconciliation for these stages as being 'platforms', which are places for 'transformative encounters' between conflicting parties where the past can be dealt with and the future can be envisaged in the creative present time.⁴³ Lederach's interest in reconciliation and peace-building began with his concerns for conflict resolution; he identifies the characteristic of contemporary conflicts with 'identity conflicts'.⁴⁴ He explains that conflicts after the Cold War tend to be focused on 'ethnicity, religion, or geographic/regional affiliation',⁴⁵ and people have increasingly sought their security 'in smaller and narrower identity groups' over the past twenty-five years.⁴⁶ Therefore, identifying the essence of conflict resolution as the construction of identity to achieve security,⁴⁷ he suggests that the crucial point for transformation of conflicts between old opponents is related to how they can create a broader identity with a global viewpoint.⁴⁸ In this way, Lederach's notion of reconciliation includes two aspects of reconciliation: structural construction of global peace-building and

³⁸ Ibid., p.24

³⁹ Ibid., pp.14, p.23

⁴⁰ Ibid., p.10

⁴¹ Lederach identifies peace-building with finding a way toward 'nonviolent resolution of conflict, respect, dignity, fairness, cooperation' in the local and global human community. See John Paul Lederach, *The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), p.24

⁴² Lederach, *Building Peace*, p.151

⁴³ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, pp.47-49

⁴⁴ Lederach, *Building Peace*, p.8

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Ibid., p.13

⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁸ Ibid., pp.17-18

the spiritual and ‘psychological dimensions of human relationships’.⁴⁹ His focus, however, appears to be on the global community, so perhaps lacks an explanation as to how reconciliation within individual spheres, such as at personal, interpersonal, and small group levels, can be worked towards. His idea of reconciliation seems to have the strength to describe the vision required at an international level, but is limited in its ability to encompass individual levels, even though he states, as mentioned above, that reconciliation must embrace the whole person.

In terms of identity change as described above, reconciliation can be defined as ‘going beyond conflict resolution and restoring friendship and harmony between the rival sides... or transforming relations of hostility and resentment to friendly and harmonious ones’.⁵⁰ So, the term reconciliation implies the creation of new relationships and is related to a change of identity, which connotes the move from the old identity by embracing the other. In a similar vein, Herbert Kelman also defines reconciliation from a social-psychological perspective in terms of identity change.⁵¹ He sees reconciliation as ‘a consequence of successful conflict resolution’, and argues that the process toward ultimate reconciliation requires significant steps such as ‘mutual acceptance’ and ‘negotiating of identity’.⁵² Thus, attempts ‘to appreciate each other’s narrative and to engage in a process of negotiating identity’ are necessary for participants engaging in the work of reconciliation.⁵³ Kelman explains that ‘negotiating identity’ is necessary in the sense that ‘what is essential to reconciliation is that each party revises its own identity enough to accommodate the identity of the other’.⁵⁴ However, ‘negotiating identity’ can arouse challenges for each conflicting party, because it involves changing their image and preconceptions of the other party as a threatening opponent. Thus, each party needs assurance that the other is not a threat to their identity;⁵⁵ therefore, each group perceiving themselves as the ‘victim’ should abandon some elements of their old identity, such as their consideration of the

⁴⁹ Ibid., p.150, I will explore these two aspects of reconciliation more deeply in section 2.1.2.

⁵⁰ Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, “Introduction: Why Reconciliation?” in Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, ed., *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*, (Oxford: Oxford University, 2004), p.4

⁵¹ Herbert C. Kelman, “Reconciliation as Identity Change: A Social-Psychological Perspective”, in Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, ed., *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*, p.120

⁵² Ibid., pp.112-113

⁵³ Ibid., p.112

⁵⁴ Ibid., p.119

⁵⁵ Ibid.

other as ‘demonized and dehumanized’.⁵⁶ According to Kelman, as the new identity becomes integrated into the group’s own identity, old attitudes are gradually replaced with newer, more positive ones and ‘working trust can gradually turn into personal trust’.⁵⁷

As mentioned previously, reconciliation must occur within all dimensions of human relationships and must encompass the whole person; furthermore, human beings seem to have an inherent desire for harmony within relationships. Thus, it can be said that humanity’s role in relation to reconciliation is to transform identity and restore relationships. This role has three aspects; harmony with God, with oneself, and with others. In order to illustrate these aspects more clearly, Cecelia Clegg’s explanation is useful. Clegg, a practical theologian, describes reconciliation using a typology that has four elements: political, societal, interpersonal, and personal.⁵⁸ Clegg describes the characteristics of these reconciliations:

Political reconciliation is dealing with the macro level of society such as issues of re-establishing order, governance and justice and peace agreements are created and ratified at this level... Societal reconciliation is managing group to group level of society, and its interest is more focused on people, relationships, and a will to co-existence than justice per se. Reconciliation at the societal level is to re-establish the possibility of people co-existing without violence in a shared space. Interpersonal reconciliation is about an individual to individual or small group to small group (such as family to family) level of relating. Here forgiveness and repentance are paramount. This is directly about personal hurt and healing...Personal reconciliation is related to an individual, it concerns a whole human including personal psychological growth and development of spiritual awareness. In this...compassion and forgiveness are paramount.⁵⁹

Even though it can be difficult to separate the complex web of human relationships into four such clear-cut divisions, this typology can be useful as a means to explain what each category of reconciliation involves. Regarding the focus of this dissertation, however, personal reconciliation needs to be examined in more detail. Clegg understands it as being related to personal wholeness, which is ‘an ongoing process of integrating aspects of the

⁵⁶ Ibid., p.121

⁵⁷ Ibid., p.120

⁵⁸ Cecelia Clegg, “Embracing a Threatening Other: Identity and Reconciliation in Northern Ireland”, p.82

⁵⁹ Ibid., pp.82-83

self'.⁶⁰ While referring to reconciliation as the *Telos* of creation and as the process of salvation, she refers to wholeness as a process of self-integration 'to open to oneself, to others, to the created order, and to God'.⁶¹ Therefore, whilst Clegg argues that humanity has a fundamental desire for integration, 'reconciliation in a full relationship with self, others, the earth and God can be considered wholeness'.⁶² Here, she seems to describe the notion of personal reconciliation from a personal growth perspective, without differentiating the psychological and spiritual, rather than emphasising the healing from brokenness and the development of relationships prompted by one's restored relationship with God. For me, however, personal reconciliation involves one's healing and the transformation of one's relationships at every level; its foundation being one's relationship with God. Consequently, it is more appropriate that personal reconciliation for Christians is explained in spiritual terms, having priority over the psychological, because Christian identity can be defined in relation to God.⁶³

Theologian David F. Ford defines reconciliation as 'the exchange of enmity for friendship'.⁶⁴ He explains this as being 'freed to spend ourselves in new ways for God and others' by having the Spirit.⁶⁵ While highlighting the human reality of 'abuse, humiliation, torture, bereavement, depression, and failure',⁶⁶ he explains that human suffering is 'the greatest teacher' for one's maturity and expansion.⁶⁷ However, he also emphasises that this cannot be romanticized because it is so often connected to 'malice, selfishness, indifference, injustice, and other forms of evil'.⁶⁸ Ford's thoughts here coincide with Calvin's conception of sin, which Calvin defines as 'estrangement from his Maker that is the death of his soul, and humans losing communication with God'.⁶⁹ Thus, according to Calvin, due to estrangement from God, a human being's identity is that of a sinner. In

⁶⁰ Cecelia Clegg, "Between Embrace and Exclusion", David Tombs and Joseph Liechty, ed., *Explorations in Reconciliation: New Directions in Theology*, (Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing, 2006), p.128

⁶¹ *Ibid.*

⁶² *Ibid.*, p.129

⁶³ The place of Christian identity in the discussion of reconciliation will be explored in section 2.3.2.

⁶⁴ David F. Ford, *The Shape of Living: Spiritual Directions for Everyday Life*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1997), p.144

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, p.145

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p.159

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*

⁶⁹ Calvin, *Institutes*, 2.1.5.

addition, Calvin identifies reconciliation as a process ‘to reconcile us to God by Jesus Christ’s holiness’,⁷⁰ while Christ’s redemptive work was ‘practiced through His obedience throughout his life’.⁷¹ Through the writings of both Calvin and Ford, personal reconciliation can be seen to be connected with both a person’s own sin and external affliction and a change to their personal identity; from sinner to one who has the grace to be reconciled with God. This grace can bring about one’s healing which allows a new understanding and acceptance of oneself to develop, and fosters understanding, forgiveness, and love of others.

Thus, I identify personal reconciliation as the restoration of one’s relationship with God, a new Christian identity, compassion, and the reformation of new relationships with others. This personal reconciliation includes psychological well-being, but the catalyst for Christians is the restoration of their relationship with God. Since personal reconciliation incorporates forgiveness and acceptance of others who have caused hurt, it also incorporates interpersonal reconciliation. Thus, the four categories of reconciliation presented above could also be classified into individual and social reconciliation, as suggested by Robert Schreiter.⁷² However, I will employ Clegg’s terms because I feel they describe more clearly the essence of personal experience: personal and interpersonal. Although the focus of this dissertation is on the personal level, because a person is a social being and cannot be a completely isolated, the themes of personal reconciliation are also thus associated with social circumstances. In this sense, personal reconciliation is related to the other levels of reconciliation, and, as a result, through the experience of personal reconciliation, the person is enabled to serve as a reconciling agent in their community. In this regard, personal reconciliation can be expressed as ‘a personal transformation’. Such a shift in the view of oneself and others through personal reconciliation reshapes one’s old relationship with others and opens one’s heart to the larger community.

Before drawing this section to a close, it will be helpful to compare reconciliation and healing, for both reconciliation and healing are identified in terms of the restoration of brokenness. According to *The Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, healing is defined as:

⁷⁰ Ibid., 2.15. 6.

⁷¹ Ibid., 2.16. 5.

⁷² Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.111

The process of being restored to bodily wholeness, emotional well-being, mental functioning, and spiritual aliveness. Christian modes of healing have always distinguished themselves by achieving a spiritual advance in connection with the healing process. Healing may also refer to the process of reconciling broken human relationships and to the development of a just social and political order among races and nations. In recent times, healing and wholeness have become metaphors for religious views of salvation.⁷³

In terms of ‘being restored’, healing has many similarities with reconciliation. However, the connotation of the term ‘reconciliation’ as humanity’s restoration of the image of God, as previously stated, has a different focal point. Robert Schreiter, who clarifies the notion based on Paul’s teaching, suggests that reconciliation indicates the restoration of our humanity, bringing about its new creation by reshaping the humanity and relationships of both victim and wrongdoer.⁷⁴ He notes that reconciliation is designated in the eschatological sense because it will be fulfilled ‘only with the complete consummation of the world by God in Christ’.⁷⁵ Instead, healing appears to be more centred upon the recovery of the original state – although perfect healing cannot be achieved without hope for the future – while reconciliation focuses more on the shaping of the new relationship for the future rather than restoring the original state. Furthermore, reconciliation needs to be approached from the viewpoint of both victim and perpetrator, while the focal point of healing is only on the side of the victim. Thus, reconciliation and healing intersect, but, simultaneously, have different parts. Reconciliation appears to incorporate the two aspects of healing and creating a new relationship; for that reason, healing plays a pivotal role in the pursuit of reconciliation.

As described above, reconciliation has two aspects: reconciliation as the ultimate aim of God and reconciliation as process in this world. Reconciliation, as the restoration and healing of all broken relationships in humanity and the formation of new relationships, raises questions regarding humanity’s position in this reconciling work as process. Reconciliation in human relationships is ‘not a naturally occurring process, but one that requires active efforts to overcome obstacles’.⁷⁶ Concerning the question of humanity’s role, De Gruchy suggests that Barth takes Abraham’s faithful obedience to God’s call as

⁷³ L.K.Graham, “Healing, in Rodney J. Hunter, ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990, 2005), p.497

⁷⁴ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, pp.16-19

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p.19

an example of ‘the prototype and the beginning of this journey towards reconciliation’.⁷⁷ Therefore, humanity has a responsibility to respond to God’s reconciling work in this life, through their relationship with God and others and also at both personal and communal levels. In the following section, two aspects of humanity’s responsibility for reconciliation will be considered.

2.1.2. Two faces of reconciliation: social and spiritual

In the work of reconciliation, one aspect that is traditionally focused on in the peace-making process is the social, structural restoration of relations between former rivals; this focuses on shifts in the social structure between conflicting groups and political areas.⁷⁸ More recently, however, the issue of psychological resolution has been identified as crucial in the work for reconciliation because maintenance of reconciliation as the shift in the social system involves the change of ‘a value system that individuals [in that social system] internalize.’⁷⁹ In this regard, psychological studies have focused on changes to the ‘psychological repertoire’⁸⁰ that take place between rival groups.⁸¹ These social and psychological aspects are in an interactional relationship; for socio-structural changes require changes to individuals’ mind-set in order to reach genuine reconciliation, while psychological changes enable these structural changes to remain stable and lasting.⁸² Therefore, for this reason, the psychological aspect of reconciliation is increasingly emphasized.

Making changes to one’s ‘psychological repertoire’ involves ‘abolishing the old repertoire such as fear, mistrust, hatred, and de-legitimization to demonization of the enemy’⁸³ and creating a new repertoire of ‘mutual respect, trust, positive attitudes, and sensitivity to the other group’s needs, fostering friendly and cooperative relations marked by equality and justice.’⁸⁴ Thus, Bar-Tal and Bennink argue that these changes require

⁷⁶ Daniel Bar-Tal and Gemma H. Bennink, “The Nature of Reconciliation as an Outcome and as a Process”, in Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, ed., *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*., p.13

⁷⁷ John W. De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p. 49

⁷⁸ Bar-Tal and Bennink, “The Nature of Reconciliation as an Outcome and as a Process”, p.15

⁷⁹ Kelman, “Reconciliation as Identity Change”, p.116

⁸⁰ Bar-Tal and Bennink, “The Nature of Reconciliation as an Outcome and as a Process”, p.37

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p.15

⁸² *Ibid.*

⁸³ *Ibid.*, p.37

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*

modifications in ‘beliefs, attitude, motivations, goals, and emotion’ and also in old feelings formed in the course of long-term conflict, which are spread to society members, maintained by societal institutions, and supported by collective memory.⁸⁵ Thus, for them, psychological changes consist of ‘relations based on equality and justice, mutual recognition and acceptance, mutual trust, positive attitudes, and sensitivity for the other party’s needs and interests’.⁸⁶

Within the Christian ministry of reconciliation, these changes to the psychological repertoire of an individual or group are often located within the spiritual dimension of reconciliation, with no clear differentiation between the two areas. Robert J. Schreiter offers a crucial framework for contemporary Christian reconciliation theory, classifying it as having a social dimension and a spiritual dimension, which constitute the ‘two faces of reconciliation’.⁸⁷ He explains the social face of reconciliation:

It has to do with providing structures and processes whereby a fractured society can be reconstructed as truthful and just. It has to do with coming to terms with the past, punishing wrongdoers, and providing some measure of reparation to victims. It must create a secure space and an atmosphere of trust that makes civil society possible.⁸⁸

Schreiter then explains the spiritual face of reconciliation:

It has to do with rebuilding shattered lives so that social reconciliation becomes a reality. The state can set up commissions to examine the wrongdoing of the past, but it cannot legislate the healing of memories. The state can offer amnesty or mete out punishment to wrongdoers, but it cannot guarantee forgiveness. Social reconciliation sets up conditions that make reconciliation more likely, but those conditions cannot of themselves affect it.⁸⁹

With reference to the spiritual dimension of reconciliation from a Christian perspective, Schreiter notes that this dimension needs people to seek healing from their own suffering and for those who accompany the suffering in a ministry of reconciliation; that is, the spiritual dimension of reconciliation needs spiritual practice.⁹⁰ He provides the example of Jesus as a Christian means of spiritual practice; for, suffering ‘can gain meaning by being

⁸⁵ Ibid.

⁸⁶ Ibid., p.15

⁸⁷ Robert J. Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation: spirituality & Strategies*, (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1998), p.4

⁸⁸ Ibid.

⁸⁹ Ibid.

united with Christ's suffering'⁹¹ and those who suffer can identify with Jesus in their actions.⁹² Like Schreiter, Lederach also notes the importance of the spiritual dimension of reconciliation, referring to it as a spiritual journey,⁹³ and similarly, Bar-Tal and Bennink identify the spiritual dimension of reconciliation:

[It] signifies the importance of healing and forgiveness. Reconciliation, in this view, consists of restoration and healing. It allows the emergence of a common frame of reference that permits and encourages societies to acknowledge the past, confess former wrongs, relive the experiences under safe conditions, mourn the losses, validate the experienced pain and grief, receive empathy and support, and restore a broken relationship. It creates a space where forgiveness can be offered and accepted.⁹⁴

The meaning of 'Christian spirituality', according to the *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, is used to imply the 'subjective practice which individuals or groups have with regard to their personal relationship with God'.⁹⁵ In this sense, as Schreiter suggests, the foundation of Christian spirituality is seeing our lives in the story of Jesus Christ, the mediator of reconciliation between God and us, and embodying His life in our lives as His disciples, for Jesus' suffering 'was redeeming for a sinful and conflicted world'⁹⁶ and Jesus' resurrection story is a 'powerful means for shaping our identities'.⁹⁷ Thus, Christian spirituality is crucial for both the Christian community and members of the wider community in terms of reconciliation ministry.

In a similar vein, Philip Sheldrake, identifying reconciliation as 'a complex balance between structural change and spiritual harmony',⁹⁸ signifies that Christians 'share in God's work of reconciliation by struggling to live the Christian communal life', as expressed in the Trinity.⁹⁹ Thus, he suggests that Christians are given the 'vocation of

⁹⁰ Ibid., pp.4-5

⁹¹ Ibid., p.5

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ John Paul Lederach, "Beyond Violence: Building Sustainable Peace", E. Weiner, ed., *The Handbook of Interethnic Coexistence*, p.244 quoted in Bar-Tal and Bennink, "The Nature of Reconciliation as an Outcome and as a Process", p.19

⁹⁴ Bar-Tal and Bennink, "The Nature of Reconciliation as an Outcome and as a Process", p.19

⁹⁵ F.L. Cross and E.A. Livingstone, *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), p.1532

⁹⁶ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.5

⁹⁷ Ibid., p.19

⁹⁸ Philip F. Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality: History, Theology, and Social Practice*, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2010), p.141

⁹⁹ Ibid., p.150

reconciliation'.¹⁰⁰ He also advocates that 'the commitment to reconciliation is not only central to the inner life of Christians but is also vital for an authentic Christian engagement with the wider world at the start of the twenty-first century'.¹⁰¹ His views are very close to Schreiter's regarding the interrelation between the dimensions of social and spiritual reconciliation. Sheldrake also argues that 'no change of emotional climate can take place without structural change, yet structural change alone cannot guarantee reconciliation'.¹⁰² Furthermore, he emphasizes that one cannot be deeply concerned about individual reconciliation, 'without a growing commitment to social reconciliation more broadly'.¹⁰³ In comparison to Sheldrake, Schreiter focuses more on the significance and priority of spiritual reconciliation over social reconciliation, although both emphasize the interrelation of the two.

Given the focus of this thesis, Schreiter's idea is appropriate in the sense that this thesis treats the reshaping of the relationship with God as the priority for all types of reconciliation. Based on the studies discussed above, it is possible that the Christian spiritual dimension of reconciliation can facilitate and support the social dimension of reconciliation because Christians, who have knowledge and experience of the spiritual dimension, are able to participate in the world with a broader perspective. Therefore, the way in which the ministry of the Church can facilitate Christians' individual reconciliation and engagement with social reconciliation, especially by enhancing the spiritual dimension of reconciliation, needs to be discussed in more detail. Hence, the following section will deal with the understanding of reconciliation provided by contemporary theologians, in order to explore the connotations of reconciliation from spiritual and theological viewpoints.

2.1.3. Contemporary theological understandings of reconciliation

As described above, the social and the spiritual dimensions of reconciliation are not separate; the spiritual dimension sustains the reconciliation process and helps to find a way to heal past memories and to interpret the suffering of the present through the redeeming story of Jesus Christ. Contemporary theologians who have discussed the theme

¹⁰⁰ Ibid.

¹⁰¹ Ibid., pp.138-139

¹⁰² Ibid., p.141

¹⁰³ Ibid., p.138

of reconciliation contribute to both social and spiritual dimensions through their theological interpretation of and suggestions about the reconciliation process in the contemporary era.

De Gruchy, reflecting the work of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) of South Africa, defines reconciliation as ‘action, praxis, movement’ in the process of ‘the struggle for God’s justice and peace in the world’.¹⁰⁴ He sees the goal of justice as the healing of relationships and building of community, while the nature of justice is love;¹⁰⁵ accordingly, restoration of justice signifies the transformation of the relationship between the wrongdoer and the wronged.¹⁰⁶ For that reason, De Gruchy believes that God’s justice is ‘not the sound of fury but the word of forgiveness’,¹⁰⁷ and reconciliation is the restoration of God’s merciful justice.¹⁰⁸ Consequently, the reconciliation process for De Gruchy is a paradoxical pathway and dynamic between justice and forgiveness because ‘the single-minded pursuit of justice can lead to destructive vengeance, just as the pursuit of reconciliation without justice perpetuates evil’.¹⁰⁹

De Gruchy also emphasizes the importance of ‘telling the truth’ in the reconciliation process, a form of national reconstruction, within the work of the TRC in South Africa.¹¹⁰ This was necessary in South Africa because ‘the past could not simply be pushed under the carpet as though nothing had happened, nor could the consensus reached through negotiation be adequate in healing the nation’.¹¹¹ There were two ways to achieve this task of revealing the truth; declaring ‘a general amnesty’ through the courts and ‘uncovering the truth outside of the courts’.¹¹² The purpose of such an uncovering of the truth is ‘to begin to put the past behind and move with hope into a peaceful future’.¹¹³ De Gruchy therefore suggests that truth-telling provided ‘the basis for granting amnesty to individual

¹⁰⁴ De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p.21

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, p.201

¹⁰⁶ *Ibid.*, p.25

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, p.170

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, p.169

¹¹⁰ *Ibid.*, p.42

¹¹¹ *Ibid.*, p.39

¹¹² *Ibid.*

¹¹³ *Ibid.*

perpetrators'¹¹⁴ and gave victims 'an opportunity to tell their stories and hear the truth as told by the perpetrators so that provided the basis for some measure of reparation'.¹¹⁵

Whilst identifying the theology of reconciliation within 'the grand narrative of redemption',¹¹⁶ De Gruchy explains three presuppositions underlying the Christian understanding of reconciliation.¹¹⁷ First, humanity is created to cooperate with God as 'a partner in managing the world'.¹¹⁸ Secondly, humanity's original sin that brought about alienation from God and estrangement from other human beings and nature is the cause of humanity's 'longing for healing and wholeness'.¹¹⁹ Thirdly, God freely chooses to free humanity from this alienation and 'the bondage to sin and its consequences', therefore allowing people to reconnect with God and other people; this is God's love and grace for humanity.¹²⁰ Thus, De Gruchy emphasizes the initiative of God and humanity's solidarity with the other in the reconciliation process.¹²¹

The emphasis on justice for the process of reconciliation also appears in Gerry O'Hanlon's idea of the relationship between the two. O'Hanlon explains that there may be a contradiction between justice and love in the Christian understanding of reconciliation, because contrary to 'the contractual ethos of the Old Testament'¹²² that presents 'retribution in face of injustice in the covenantal community with God',¹²³ the New Testament shows that we are reconciled based on God's unconditional forgiving love.¹²⁴ He identifies forgiveness with 'God's extension to us and [how] we are asked to extend to one another',¹²⁵ which is 'a wondrous gift and an expression of love which can remake the past that has gone wrong and create an even stronger relationship for the future'.¹²⁶ Nevertheless, he states that, without conversion, 'forgiveness is one-sided and since

¹¹⁴ Ibid.

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

¹¹⁶ Ibid., p.47

¹¹⁷ Ibid., p.48

¹¹⁸ Ibid.

¹¹⁹ Ibid.

¹²⁰ Ibid., p.49

¹²¹ Ibid., p.51

¹²² Gerry O'Hanlon, "Justice and Reconciliation", Michael Hurley, ed., *Reconciliation in Religion and Society*, (Belfast: Institute of Irish Studies, 1994), p.48

¹²³ Ibid.

¹²⁴ Ibid.

¹²⁵ Ibid., p.51

¹²⁶ Ibid.

reconciliation involves a relationship there is no real reconciliation'.¹²⁷ Therefore, for O'Hanlon, justice is needed for real reconciliation because 'reconciliation involves the restoration of ruptured relationships and this cannot happen on the basis of unjust inequality'.¹²⁸ He puts forward the idea that the practice of justice involves 'naming and protesting injustice'¹²⁹ and it is a response 'to the kingdom of God which is based on unconditional love'.¹³⁰ Nonetheless, he insists that 'justice is ordered towards love because its cost is paid for by the suffering love of God'.¹³¹ O'Hanlon's idea of justice demonstrates that it is an essential part for reaching reconciliation and seems to suggest that love is not merely Christian idealism but an important element for reforming broken relationships in practice.

In contrast to O'Hanlon, David Stevens, leader of the Corrymeela Community of Reconciliation in Northern Ireland, emphasizes 'letting go' as a way of dealing with the past. Stevens defines reconciliation as 'a way of living together in difference' and 'the restoration of broken relationships'.¹³² He signifies that when we recognize difference, 'the quest of commonality can only succeed'.¹³³ Thus, he identifies 'letting go' of both the past and the desire for vengeance as key to the reconciliation process.¹³⁴ Stevens insists on reconciling agents putting the past behind them in order to take a new step towards the future, because by doing so, 'the past cannot possess them'.¹³⁵ Although he emphasizes forgiveness as releasing the past and abandoning the desire for vengeance,¹³⁶ he argues that this does not mean that claims to justice and truth are abandoned on the grounds that people cannot fully forgive if they do not know who the perpetrator is.¹³⁷ However, truth learning does not automatically bring about reconciliation; what is important is what is done with the uncovered truth. Stevens signifies truth learning and truth telling as being

¹²⁷ Ibid.

¹²⁸ Ibid., p.56

¹²⁹ Ibid., p.58

¹³⁰ Ibid.

¹³¹ Ibid., p.65

¹³² David Stevens, *The Land of Unlikeness: Explorations into Reconciliation*, (Dublin: The Columba Press, 2004), p.42

¹³³ Ibid., p.39

¹³⁴ Ibid., p.29

¹³⁵ Ibid., p.107

¹³⁶ Ibid., p.29

¹³⁷ Ibid., p.30

‘key aspects of repentance’, which is an element of reconciliation.¹³⁸ He identifies repentance with ‘acknowledgement of wrongdoing, accepting responsibility, expressing remorse, seeking forgiveness, and seeking to repair the harm done’.¹³⁹ Therefore, he argues that reconciliation takes place within the dynamics of forgiveness, repentance, truth, and justice.¹⁴⁰

In this interrelated dynamics of reconciliation, Stevens refers to healing as a metaphor of reconciliation, particularly after a violent situation;¹⁴¹ however, he suggests that, although societal recovery from the consequences of violence is distinguishable from the personal healing process,¹⁴² ‘individual acts of forgiveness can encourage and empower other people to forgive, so that communities and nations may change’.¹⁴³ Thus, he sees reconciliation as ‘a social transformation’ that ‘requires a conversion of mind and heart’¹⁴⁴ and as a process that ‘deals with the past, seeks to find a way of relating to the other in the present, and looks to the future’.¹⁴⁵ Stevens focuses on forgiveness as ‘letting-go’ in the reconciliation process because, if people fail to forgive, their bitterness will be handed on to the next generation.¹⁴⁶ Therefore, for Stevens, reconciliation can be understood as societal transformation supported by the spiritual transformation of members in society who are drawn to forgiveness and healing through truth-telling and justice. Stevens’ idea of forgiveness as ‘letting go’ seems to be positive in the sense that perfect truth and justice cannot be found in this imperfect world; his idea opens the door for progression into the future for the next generation, rather than focusing on the legacy of past conflict.

In order to articulate the spiritual aspect of reconciliation, Schreiter locates the groundwork for a reconciliation ministry in Paul’s teaching on reconciliation. First of all, he suggests that reconciliation is the work that God ‘initiates and completes’ in humanity ‘through Jesus’.¹⁴⁷ Secondly, reconciliation is ‘more a spirituality than a strategy’, creating

¹³⁸ Ibid.

¹³⁹ Ibid., p.29

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., p.28

¹⁴¹ Ibid., p.41

¹⁴² Ibid.

¹⁴³ Ibid., p.49

¹⁴⁴ Ibid., p.43

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., p.115

¹⁴⁷ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.14

‘space for truth, justice, healing, and new possibility’.¹⁴⁸ Thirdly, the experience of reconciliation is ‘the restoration of our humanity’ because it brings about the new creation of ‘both victim and wrongdoer’.¹⁴⁹ Fourthly, reconciliation as the new creation of humanity is ‘to be found in the story’ of Jesus Christ’s redeeming work for humanity, through his ‘passion, death, and resurrection’.¹⁵⁰ Thus, Christ’s story helps people to reorganize their painful experiences into a grand narrative of redemption; consequently, reconciliation involves not an obliteration of memory but a *transformation* of memory.¹⁵¹ Finally, ‘the process of reconciliation will be fulfilled only with the complete consummation of the world by God in Christ’.¹⁵² Thus, for Schreiter, reconciliation is the redeeming work done by God’s initiative and with human cooperation. He argues that the story of Jesus’ resurrection is a powerful means for shaping our identity; moreover, as we cannot experience the power of resurrection without the Cross, the Paschal Mystery of Jesus’ suffering, death, and resurrection stands at the centre of reconciliation.¹⁵³

As described above, Schreiter stresses the spiritual dimension of reconciliation and then spiritual practices for the reconciliation ministry in the Church.¹⁵⁴ He regards reconciliation as ‘struggling with evil’ because evil’s power works in the brokenness of relationships; thus, he concentrates on the remaking of relationships as a key part of reconciliation.¹⁵⁵ In order to overcome this evil power, Schreiter puts emphasis on the spirituality of reconciliation that transcends the past, releasing its grip on our lives.¹⁵⁶ He describes the process of leaving behind the painful memories of the past and proceeding towards the future as ‘telling and retelling the story’,¹⁵⁷ which brings about the ‘shift in perspective’, finding a way to interpret our story, creating a new story, and healing our memories.¹⁵⁸ Thus, Schreiter refers to these experiences in the telling and retelling of the

¹⁴⁸ Ibid., p.16

¹⁴⁹ Ibid., p.17

¹⁵⁰ Ibid., p.18

¹⁵¹ Ibid.

¹⁵² Ibid., p.19

¹⁵³ Ibid., pp.19-20

¹⁵⁴ Ibid., p.4

¹⁵⁵ Ibid., p.35

¹⁵⁶ Ibid., pp.40-46

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., p.44

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., pp.43-44

story as ‘moments of grace’;¹⁵⁹ for, as ‘our identity is tied up with our memories’, the healing of memory can transform our identity.¹⁶⁰

Whilst also considering reconciliation in terms of the narrative of God’s redemptive action, Miroslav Volf, a systematic theologian, identifies the ultimate aim of reconciliation as creating a community of love through ‘joyful embrace’¹⁶¹ and suggests the need to redress social reconciliation beyond the personal reconciliation that the Church has historically focused on.¹⁶² Volf’s contribution to the delineation of reconciliation is that he employs the metaphors of ‘exclusion’ and ‘embrace’.¹⁶³ Building on the ‘logic of purity’, as shown in ‘ethnic cleansing’,¹⁶⁴ exclusion, for Volf, takes three forms: exclusion by expulsion, exclusion by domination (assimilation or subjugation), and exclusion by abandonment.¹⁶⁵ In order to overcome these and proceed towards the notion of embrace, he suggests a need for the renewal of the covenant on the Cross of Jesus.¹⁶⁶ Volf explains the meaning of the new covenant as having three aspects. First, it is an expression of God’s will that He ‘did not want to be a God without humanity’.¹⁶⁷ Volf therefore explains that the new covenant develops into a ‘moral commitment’ which invites us ‘to renegotiate our own identity’ through interaction with others.¹⁶⁸ Secondly, the new covenant is modelled on the ‘self-giving’ and ‘self-sacrifice’ of Jesus for reconciliation with humanity.¹⁶⁹ Thirdly, ‘the new covenant is eternal’.¹⁷⁰ According to Volf, the new covenant as God’s embrace for humanity should be emulated by humans; therefore we should embrace ‘one another, even our enemies’.¹⁷¹

¹⁵⁹ Ibid., p.46

¹⁶⁰ Ibid., p.44

¹⁶¹ Miroslav Volf, “A Theology of Embrace for a World of Exclusion”, in David Tombs and Joseph Liechty, ed., *Explorations in Reconciliation*, p.33 Volf employs ‘embrace’ as a metaphor to refer to ‘peace’. See Miroslav Volf, “Forgiveness, Reconciliation, & Justice: A Christian Contribution to a More Peaceful Social Environment”, in Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, (PA: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001), p.42

¹⁶² Volf, “Forgiveness, Reconciliation, & Justice”, p.48

¹⁶³ See, Miroslav Volf, *Exclusion & Embrace: A Theological Exploration of Identity, Otherness, and Reconciliation*, (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996)

¹⁶⁴ Volf, “A Theology of Embrace for a World of Exclusion”, p.24

¹⁶⁵ Ibid., pp. 24-25 and Volf, *Exclusion & Embrace*, p.67

¹⁶⁶ Volf, “A Theology of Embrace for a World of Exclusion”, pp.27-30

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., p.28

¹⁶⁸ Ibid., p.28

¹⁶⁹ Ibid., p.29

¹⁷⁰ Ibid.

¹⁷¹ Ibid., p.30

Regarding Volf's understanding of reconciliation as an embrace, De Gruchy points out that, for Volf, justice is 'subordinate to reconciliation' because Volf's focus is on the creation of a community of love.¹⁷² Concerning this critique, Volf argues that justice is an element of reconciliation because the pursuit of embrace includes 'the will to rectify the wrongs that have been done and the will to reshape the relationships to correspond to justice'.¹⁷³ Volf also insists that the establishment of strict justice in an imperfect world is 'impossible to carry out' because the idea of what is 'just' is 'to some extent relative to a particular person or group',¹⁷⁴ therefore, because of this, he suggests forgiveness as being an element of reconciliation.¹⁷⁵ He puts forward the notion that forgiveness involves 'self-denial and risk'¹⁷⁶ and that repentance can be brought about because of forgiveness.¹⁷⁷ In this sense, Volf describes the search for peace as 'an endeavour to transform the world in which justice and injustice, innocent and guilt crisscross and intersect';¹⁷⁸ reconciliation, meanwhile, is 'a way of living in a world of strife – a world of conflict'.¹⁷⁹ Volf considers the goal of this reconciliation to be a loving community and prioritises love and forgiveness, rather than justice, as the means for building this community. While I share his view that love and forgiveness are values of the Gospel, justice is also a value of the Gospel and one of the dynamics of reconciliation;¹⁸⁰ therefore should not be disregarded. Although Volf does not disregard justice, I place a greater priority on justice than Volf does.

As mentioned above, reconciliation embodies a process as well as the ultimate completion of God's redemptive work that humanity should search for in this world. This is depicted well by Lederach for whom reconciliation is 'both a place we are trying to reach and a journey we take to get there'.¹⁸¹ In the work of reconciliation as process, Clegg suggests that the key role of the Church is to help people enhance their ability to

¹⁷² De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p.199

¹⁷³ Volf, "Forgiveness, Reconciliation, & Justice", p.43

¹⁷⁴ *Ibid.*, p.38

¹⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p.47

¹⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p.46

¹⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, p.47

¹⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.42-43

¹⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p.45

¹⁸⁰ This will be discussed below in 2.2. The dynamics of reconciliation.

¹⁸¹ Lederach, *The Journey Toward Reconciliation*, p.25

enter into that process.¹⁸² In other words, the Church needs to respond to how it can reshape relationships between conflicting people, groups, and nations, how people who experience torn relationships can be healed, and how it can help people who suffer inner conflict. For these reasons, as discussed above, reconciliation ministry should incorporate ‘healing’ and ‘the creation of new relationships’. Healing encompasses all human relationships which have experienced past hurt, so I argue that healing involves the process of bringing about the restoration of relationality. This healing deals with the past while envisioning the future, because conflicts and hurts in the present are often the result of disruption in the past; moreover, the future also lies in the continuity of the results. Thus, we need to let go of the past to proceed towards a better and more hopeful future; for this, we need to reshape our identity, accept other conflicting parties, and envision a shared future.

In this sense, personal reconciliation, which is the primary interest of this thesis, can be defined as the healing and reshaping of relationships at a personal level. The contents of personal reconciliation can be the restoration of the relationship with God, forming a new identity in Christ, forgiving others, and accepting others as created in the image of God. Personal reconciliation focuses on the spiritual dimension of reconciliation in a person and considers how a person contributes to other levels of reconciliation through practicing the spirituality of reconciliation. Consequently, to understand personal reconciliation within the structure of wider reconciliation we need to explore what the components and dynamics of reconciliation are.

2.2. The dynamics of reconciliation

There are different theories about the components and dynamics of reconciliation. Here, I will consider the work of John Paul Lederach and Joseph Liechty, two scholars who have different ideas as to the components of this web of reconciliation.

2.2.1. The dynamics of reconciliation in Lederach

Lederach, delineating reconciliation from the perspective of peace-building, describes reconciliation as a transformative place, where conflicting parties encounter each other

¹⁸² Clegg, “Embracing a Threatening Other: Identity and Reconciliation in Northern Ireland”, p.91

and conflicted reality and transformed future come together.¹⁸³ Thus, in order to understand Lederach's concept of reconciliation, one must first understand the meaning of 'peace-building' for him. He articulated that the purpose and direction of peace-building is 'becoming local and global human communities characterized by respect, dignity, fairness, cooperation, and the nonviolent resolution of conflict'.¹⁸⁴ These directions require the transformation of conflicts because conflicts are characterized by 'deep-rooted, intense animosity, fear, and severe stereotyping'.¹⁸⁵ Therefore, Lederach explains that peace-building involves constructive social change through a shift in the relationship from fear to love, from mutual recrimination to mutual respect; that is, peace-building needs to rebuild relationships.¹⁸⁶ He suggests that we need imagination and creative action for a new world to achieve 'constructive social change'.¹⁸⁷ This imagination and creative action can be made possible by finding and following a 'vocation', which means identifying 'who I am and [what] sense of purpose I have on earth'.¹⁸⁸ Thus, he implies that the search for peace-building as a form of constructive social change will be carried out by those who find their vocation for creating a new relationship.¹⁸⁹

Lederach explains the connection between reconciliation and authentic relationships as being a web consisting of 'truth, mercy, justice, and peace'.¹⁹⁰ The foundation of his web of reconciliation is Psalm 85:10: 'Truth and mercy have met together; peace and justice have kissed'.¹⁹¹ Lederach explains these four components in detail: 'Truth signifies acknowledgment, transparency, revelation, and clarity. Mercy indicates acceptance, forgiveness, support, compassion, and healing. Justice stands for equality, right relationships, making things right, and restitution. Peace implies harmony, unity, well-being, security, and respect'.¹⁹² Lederach believes that, in the dynamics of reconciliation, these four components are interrelated. If any component is missing, the conflict will

¹⁸³ Lederach, *Building Peace*, p.30

¹⁸⁴ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, p.24

¹⁸⁵ Lederach, *Building Peace*, p.23

¹⁸⁶ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, p.42

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, pp.22-27

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, p.24

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁰ Lederach, *Building Peace*, p.30

¹⁹¹ *Ibid.*, p.28

¹⁹² *Ibid.*, p.30

never be successfully resolved, while if they appear individually, the result will be superficial, working for just a few people, and the unhealthy relationship will continue.¹⁹³

For Lederach, the focus of reconciliation is the reorientation and creation of new relationships; therefore, the ‘web’ of reconciliation is an encounter between conflicting parties and between painful past and hopeful future.¹⁹⁴ For that reason, the web of these four components of reconciliation provides a space to mourn the past, but at the same time creates new common lenses for dealing with the past to allow reorientation towards the future.¹⁹⁵ According to Lederach, these four dynamics of reconciliation stand in creative tension, cooperating in an interdependent relationship.¹⁹⁶ In other words, when truth and justice deal with the past and meet mercy within a heart of compassion and acceptance of others, people can embrace the painful and shaded past with the forgiving present and can move to the enlightened future of peace. In this way, the paradigm of reconciliation for Lederach is a movement towards hope for the future as well as a present place in which praxis can occur.

2.2.2. The dynamics of reconciliation in Liechty

In contrast to Lederach, Liechty, who researched sectarianism in Northern Ireland, defines reconciliation as the ‘healing of relationships’¹⁹⁷ by ‘the complementary dynamics of repenting and forgiving’.¹⁹⁸ He explains that repentance is a way of coping with ‘having done wrong’ and forgiveness is a way of dealing with ‘having suffered wrong’;¹⁹⁹ moral maturity and reconciliation thus require both, whether personal or political.²⁰⁰ Whilst Liechty criticizes the Western tradition that is captivated by forgiveness without repentance,²⁰¹ he believes that the process of repentance can be expressed as ‘apology’ and

¹⁹³ Ibid., p.28

¹⁹⁴ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, p.81. To illustrate the process of peace-building, Lederach employs the metaphor of the web-making of a spider.

¹⁹⁵ Lederach, *Building Peace*, p.31

¹⁹⁶ Ibid., p.30

¹⁹⁷ Joseph Liechty, “Putting Forgiveness in its Place: The Dynamics of Reconciliation”, in David Tombs and Joseph Liechty, ed., *Explorations in Reconciliation: New Directions in Theology*, (Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Co, 2006), p.61

¹⁹⁸ Ibid., p.60

¹⁹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰⁰ Ibid., p.61

²⁰¹ Ibid., p.60

‘restitution’.²⁰² In particular, he argues that restitution is a culmination of repentance, but apology is ‘as decisive as restitution’; because apology as ‘verbal expression of regret’ may become ‘part of symbolic restitution’.²⁰³ However, he suggests that apology is not always ‘strictly necessary’, because ‘effective change’ sometimes ‘may function as a non-verbal but powerful expression of remorse’.²⁰⁴

Considering forgiveness as an ‘initiating and risk-taking’ strategy ‘for change’,²⁰⁵ Liechty gives a description of the twofold nature of forgiveness; the first strand of forgiveness is ‘letting-go’ and the second is ‘love-given-before’.²⁰⁶ By ‘letting-go’, he means ‘letting go of vengeance’, ‘punishment of the wrongdoer’ and ‘those feeling such as hatred’;²⁰⁷ ‘love-given-before’ means ‘seeking and extending oneself for the good of another’.²⁰⁸ He explains that forgiveness as letting-go is ‘a continuum’ because it runs ‘from a minimalist end that might be described as forbearance of vengeance to a full and final letting-go that can be called absolution’.²⁰⁹ Thus, he considers ‘forgiveness as absolution’ is a passive response to a reconciled situation.²¹⁰ Liechty states that there is no order in repentance and forgiveness, and forgiveness as absolution is also part of forgiveness.²¹¹ However, he cautions that if absolution precedes repentance too easily, one might confront it with the criticism made by Dietrich Bonhoeffer, that reconciliation is ‘cheap grace’.²¹² Liechty asserts the need for justice-seeking and truth-seeking to integrate repentance and forgiveness; for, without justice and truth, forgiveness and repentance will be partial; on the other hand, justice-seeking for its own sake is a euphemism for retribution.²¹³ For that reason, he contends that justice, truth, repentance, and forgiveness should be pursued in the larger context of reconciliation.²¹⁴ For Liechty, therefore, reconciliation is the healing of relationships at both personal and political levels and can be conceived of as a web comprised of forgiveness, repentance, justice, and truth.

²⁰² Ibid.

²⁰³ Ibid.

²⁰⁴ Ibid., p.61

²⁰⁵ Ibid., p.63

²⁰⁶ Ibid., p.64

²⁰⁷ Ibid., p.62

²⁰⁸ Ibid.

²⁰⁹ Ibid., p.63

²¹⁰ Ibid.

²¹¹ Ibid., p.65

²¹² Ibid., p.64

²¹³ Ibid., p.66

2.2.3. Comparison of these two 'webs'

When comparing the two webs of reconciliation described above, one can argue that the framework of Lederach's web (mercy, truth, justice, and peace) is designed for global peace building; envisioning a better future in the global community. Meanwhile, by focusing on the resolution of the past, Liechty's web of forgiveness, repentance, justice, and truth initially seems to be more applicable within national groups. For Liechty, the relationship of repentance and forgiveness is a cause of 'real existential pain'; in order to explain the interrelationship of the two, he uses an example expressed by the wounded parties in Northern Ireland: 'I would like to forgive him, but I can't because he hasn't repented'.²¹⁵ Therefore, Liechty's web also seems to be applicable to the personal and interpersonal reconciliation and conflict transformation of small groups, since it is more relevant for the resolution of hatred and complex emotions surrounding opposing parties. However, repentance is very difficult in conflicts because differentiating between the wrongdoer and victim is not always easy, as both may regard themselves as the victim. Thus, in some cases, mutual repentance and mutual forgiveness need to be encouraged in order for the discussion of reconciliation to take place; this process can be fostered by compassion towards the other and the provision of hospitality for the other.²¹⁶ In this way, Lederach's idea, including mercy and peace within the web of reconciliation, needs to be combined with that of Liechty.

In addition, the framework of Lederach's notion of reconciliation seems to be larger, envisioning an evolution towards a better future for the global human community; for Lederach, mercy and peace are essential dynamics for reconciliation. According to Stanley Grenz, mercy is a characteristic of God's love, which is 'beyond the fair and righteous judgment of God';²¹⁷ he also notes that 'Mercy triumphs over judgment!' (James 2:13),²¹⁸ and that 'God saved us, not because of righteous things we had done, but because of his mercy' (Titus 3:5).²¹⁹ Therefore, for Grenz, the human response to God's merciful love

²¹⁴ Ibid.

²¹⁵ Ibid., p.64

²¹⁶ I will deal with the notion of empathy towards the other and the provision of hospitality for the other in the following section on spirituality of reconciliation.

²¹⁷ Stanley J. Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, (Grand Rapids, MI/Cambridge, UK, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1994), p.94

²¹⁸ Ibid., p.94

²¹⁹ Ibid., p.95

should be expressed in humanity's 'attitude toward others as we pray and act'.²²⁰ Peace alongside mercy seems more appropriate for the much broader perspective envisioning a better future and widening people's understanding of community. Thus, Lederach's web would seem to have more potential in long-term and wider reconciliation.

Nonetheless, mercy and peace are also values needed for reconciliation at an individual level, because God's love is merciful love for sinful human beings and peace is God's hope for human community; thus, each person is called to respond to God's actions with a life of generosity and hospitality. Therefore, the ideas of both Liechty and Lederach need to be merged to create a better understanding of reconciliation. Furthermore, despite their differing viewpoints, both Lederach and Liechty concur that reconciliation is an eschatological aim and, at the same time, a stage in the journey towards ultimate reconciliation. Hence, considering the complexity of the process of reconciliation, the two webs need to be applied flexibly in accordance with specific cases of conflict. That is, forgiveness, repentance, truth, justice, mercy, and peace need to be employed according to the type and process of the conflict in question.

In relation to the primary interest of this thesis – that is, identifying personal reconciliation with healing and the reshaping of relationships – it is important at this point to recall David Stevens' suggestion that there is a connection between personal forgiveness and the possibility of change in communities and nations.²²¹ Thus, he suggests that people living in conflict situations need places where they can experience and learn reconciliation; for example, through 'family, friendships, organizations, faith communities, centres of reconciliation, and schools'.²²² In addition, he puts forward the idea that the rituals of a faith community could practise letting go of the past in order to advance into the future.²²³ He outlines this practice:

We may need to lament and grieve for what has been lost and done, and acknowledge anger, injustice, bitterness, pain, resentment, disorientation, loss of identity and uncertainty. For this we need a language; feelings need to be released into words. The resources available in the biblical language of lament – which found expression in the corporate grieving connected with the destruction of

²²⁰ Ibid., p.96

²²¹ Stevens, *The Land of Unlikeness*, p.49

²²² Ibid., p.37

²²³ Ibid., pp.107-108

Jerusalem and exile in Babylon – and the ritual actions of the faith community could be of help in this.²²⁴

Therefore, in the next section, I will discuss the spirituality of reconciliation in order to delineate how the dynamics of reconciliation are understood in Christian reconciliation ministry. In addition, I will ask how Christians can learn these dynamics in the Church, and what they can do to achieve healing, the reshaping of their relationship with God, themselves and others, and a sense of reconciliation within their families and communities.

2.3. The spirituality of reconciliation

Schreiter advocates the ministry of reconciliation of the Church and spiritual practices for reconciliation ministry because he believes that the spiritual dimension of reconciliation makes the social dimension a reality.²²⁵ He identifies reconciliation as healing and the regaining of humanity,²²⁶ and defines the most important part of reconciliation as ‘the remaking of relationships’.²²⁷ Moreover, he equates the spirituality of reconciliation with the struggle against evil and its consequences because evil’s power brings about the brokenness of relationships and works within such brokenness.²²⁸ Therefore, to overcome this destructive power, Schreiter suggests that the spirituality of reconciliation is needed to heal past memories and to view them from a different, more reconciling perspective.²²⁹ In this regard, Schreiter suggests that the spirituality of reconciliation involves the struggle against the evil power that creates ruptured relations, while also endeavouring to collaborate for God’s new creation.

In order to achieve the spirituality of reconciliation, Schreiter suggests that the Church needs to offer its members the opportunity to learn spiritual practice.²³⁰ By doing so, the Church can work for the ministry of reconciliation.²³¹ According to Schreiter, this spiritual practice involves practitioners uniting their suffering with the suffering of Christ and

²²⁴ Ibid.

²²⁵ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.4

²²⁶ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.4, p.15 and also see Robert J. Schreiter, *Reconciliation: Mission & Ministry in A Changing Social Order*, (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, Cambridge, MA: Boston Theological Institute, 1992), p.82

²²⁷ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.35

²²⁸ Ibid., p.35

²²⁹ Ibid., pp.43-46

²³⁰ Ibid., pp.4-5

²³¹ Ibid., p.94

uniting their hope for a new life with His resurrection.²³² Consequently, for Schreier, spiritual practice has two aspects; first, the spiritual practice of inner, spiritual union in suffering with Jesus, and secondly, the spiritual practice of identifying Jesus' life in action in the grace of his resurrection. With regard to this second aspect, Ray Anderson suggests that the true ministry of the Church involves the 'upholding, healing and transformation of the humanity of others as already grasped and reconciled to God through the humanity and ministry of Jesus Christ'.²³³ Such an identification of Jesus' life in action signifies that the ministry of reconciliation needs to extend towards others' lives as well as one's own; therefore, spiritual practice for reconciliation has personal and communal aspects.

As to the spirituality of reconciliation, Sheldrake emphasizes the Christian vocation of reconciliation and takes hospitality into account as being the essence of Christian reconciliation.²³⁴ He identifies 'otherness' as designating people 'in contrast to those who are "like us"',²³⁵ and so regards reconciliation as 'harmony and concord',²³⁶ overcoming the boundaries of fear, prejudice, and injustice against the other;²³⁷ for reconciliation demands one party to be equal with the other.²³⁸ Thus, he views reconciliation as offering a new way to view the history of the exclusion of the other, previously seen as demonising or trivializing, and to reinterpret old memories of 'belittlement, rejection, and denial'; in other words, reconciliation requires both parties to create the space for renewing history and memory.²³⁹

Sheldrake suggests three sources of spiritual practice for possible reconciliation, as carried out within the history of Christianity from a Catholic viewpoint: listening to the other, the Eucharist, and discernment.²⁴⁰ Listening to the other involves hearing the voice and words of the other in silence, and speaking in modest and reasonable ways.²⁴¹ Sheldrake argues that Christian discipleship demands that Christians offer hospitality and

²³² Ibid., p.5

²³³ Ray S. Anderson, "Christopraxis: the Ministry and the Humanity of Christ for the World", Trevor Hart and Daniel Thimell, ed., *Christ in our Place*, (Exeter: The Paternoster Press, & Allison Park, N.Y.: Pickwick Publications, 1989), pp.19-20

²³⁴ Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, p.149

²³⁵ Ibid., p.152

²³⁶ Ibid., p.140

²³⁷ Ibid., p.153

²³⁸ Ibid., p.142

²³⁹ Ibid., pp.144-145

²⁴⁰ Ibid., pp.150-156

that hospitality has a deeper meaning than merely giving food and board to the stranger.²⁴² Whilst suggesting the whole life of Jesus as the model of Christian discipleship, in relation to hospitality, he specifically offers the life of Jesus as representative of the stranger who wants to be taken within us.²⁴³ Thus, hospitality, as Christian discipleship, also involves welcoming and embracing the stranger into the community. Sheldrake highlights that the Eucharist is a means for reconciliation, in the sense that, by reaffirming Christian identity brought about in Baptism, the Eucharist encourages solidarity with others through the practice of being together.²⁴⁴

By describing reconciliation in terms of hospitality towards the stranger, Sheldrake widens the horizon of reconciliation beyond that of conflicting parties. For, within this increasingly diverse contemporary era, the emphasis on difference can be a potential site for conflict. Thus, the understanding that others are created in the image of God and the necessity of offering them hospitality needs to be incorporated into the spirituality of reconciliation; for these qualities involve the values of Christian discipleship and can also contribute to the prevention of likely conflicts. Therefore, the spirituality of reconciliation can be considered to be the restoration of the image of God; for this to take place, healing, the reshaping of one's relationships, and finding the image of God within others are needed. As a consequence, the provision of hospitality to the other also becomes an element of the spirituality of reconciliation.

Given this understanding of spiritual reconciliation and the need for spiritual practices, the following sections will look at issues relating to the spirituality of reconciliation, such as forgiveness, healing of memory, and truthfully remembering.

2.3.1. Forgiveness

According to Schreier, forgiveness is the most painful part in the process of reconciliation, because 'to ignore or forget the past is to demean the victim and to trivialize the suffering that the victim has undergone'.²⁴⁵ Schreier states that this demeaning activity cannot be part of the restoration of humanity; rather, it is an 'attack on

²⁴¹ Ibid., p.151

²⁴² Ibid., p.152

²⁴³ Ibid.

²⁴⁴ Ibid., p.154

the victim's humanity',²⁴⁶ thus, forgiving has to involve remembering in a different way, *not* simply forgetting.²⁴⁷ Schreiter considers the meaning of human forgiveness as a process of 'coming free from the power of the past'²⁴⁸ and 'the conscious decision to forgive'.²⁴⁹ One implication of deciding to forgive is that one is no longer tied up with the power of the past and may experience the healing of past damage.²⁵⁰ In addition, Schreiter argues that the decision to forgive signifies that the victim 'chooses the direction of the future' and dedicates his or her life to working towards a *different* future.²⁵¹

Today, there is no consensus as to what exactly forgiveness means.²⁵² Everett Worthington, a Christian psychologist leading a campaign for forgiveness research, explains forgiveness as the process of positive emotions (such as 'empathy for the perpetrator, compassion, agape love, or even romantic love') replacing the symptoms of unforgiveness,²⁵³ which he describes as 'a cold, emotional complex consisting of resentment, bitterness, hatred, hostility, residual anger, and fear'.²⁵⁴ Meanwhile, Nicholas Wolterstorff, who studies forgiveness in politics, explains it:

Forgiveness becomes relevant when someone or something has been treated unjustly – when they have been wronged, when their rights have been violated, when they have been deprived of what is due them, of what they are entitled to...The wronged party may be a person, obviously; but it may also be a group or institution...And not only persons but also groups and institutions may do the wronging...[The] wronged has a right to retributive justice...The only way to acquire such a right is to be wronged by someone.²⁵⁵

²⁴⁵ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.58

²⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p.58

²⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p.66

²⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p.58

²⁴⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁵⁰ *Ibid.*

²⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p.59

²⁵² Everett L. Worthington, Jr., "Empirical Research in Forgiveness: Looking Backward, looking Forward", in Everett L. Worthington, Jr., ed., *Dimensions of Forgiveness: Psychological Research & Theological Perspectives*, (Philadelphia & London: Templeton Foundation Press, 1998), p.323

²⁵³ Everett L. Worthington Jr. "Unforgiveness, Forgiveness, and Reconciliation and Their Implications for Societal Interventions", in Raymond G.Helmick and Rodney L. Peterson, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.163

²⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p.162

²⁵⁵ Nicholas Wolterstorff, "The Place of Forgiveness in the Actions of the State", in Daniel Philpott, ed., *The Politics of Past Evil: Religion, Reconciliation, and the Dilemmas of Transitional Justice*, (Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame, 2006), pp.90-91

In his discussion of the theology of forgiveness, Rodney Petersen suggests that the practice of forgiveness in the history of the Church was ‘often privatized as a part of individual religious practice’; because, since the medieval era, penitence was something kept at a distance from everyday life.²⁵⁶ However, he notes that current trends in conversations about forgiveness are changing:

A division in theological thinking and practice has been evident between those who join forgiveness to justification, with a personal and vertical view of salvation, and those who connect it with justice and the search for reconciliation but in language that often moves from transcendence to a prevailing political rhetoric, a spiritual division lamented by those seeking a more integrated spirituality.²⁵⁷

Petersen suggests that forgiveness as a theological topic has extended into ‘public policy discourse and psychological analysis’,²⁵⁸ suggesting that Nelson Mandela raised the issue of public forgiveness as ‘the only way to a constructive future in South Africa’.²⁵⁹ However, Donald Shriver, who discusses the issue of forgiveness in politics, argues that western political ethics considered justice to be a burden and did not think of forgiveness as ‘an essential servant of justice’.²⁶⁰ Yet, according to Shriver, Hannah Arendt is one modern exception to this tradition. He states that, for Arendt, forgiveness is one of two capacities that can lead to genuine social change,²⁶¹ the other being the capacity to make ‘new promises or covenants’.²⁶² Shriver, standing in continuity with the political philosophy of Arendt, suggests that forgiveness can help towards ‘the construction of new political relationships’.²⁶³ He claims that, in a political context, it is a combination of moral truth, forbearance from revenge, empathy for the enemy’s humanity, and commitment to repair fractured human relationships.²⁶⁴ Shriver identifies the aim of genuine forgiveness as ‘the renewal of human relationships’²⁶⁵ and believes that ‘forgivers are prepared to begin living with the enemy again on some level of positive mutual

²⁵⁶ Rodney L. Petersen, “A Theology of Forgiveness: Terminology, Rhetoric, & the Dialectic of Interfaith Relationships”, in Raymond G. Helmick, and Rodney L. Petersen, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.4

²⁵⁷ Ibid., p.5, p.8

²⁵⁸ Ibid., p.6

²⁵⁹ Petersen, “A Theology of Forgiveness”, p.6

²⁶⁰ Shriver Jr., *An Ethic for Enemies*, p.6

²⁶¹ Ibid.

²⁶² Ibid.

²⁶³ Ibid., p.8

²⁶⁴ Ibid., pp.8-9

²⁶⁵ Ibid., p.8

affirmation’;²⁶⁶ that is, living a life of ‘co-existence’.²⁶⁷ For Shriver, justice does not destroy the political community but restores it.²⁶⁸

Like Petersen, I believe that forgiveness is a term that has commonly been restricted to personal territory in theological discussion. Yet, today, the usage of forgiveness is expanding to include the spheres of ethnic and national relationships. However, although political rhetoric is increasing and the implication of forgiveness need not be restricted to personal territory, I believe that forgiveness is more applicable to personal, interpersonal, or small group relationships because it concerns changes at an individual spiritual and psychological level and is not necessarily achieved purely by political negotiation. Thus, forgiveness in human relationships is a decision and a process to overcome hurt caused by the experience of injustice, as stated by Schreier and Wolterstorff. For that reason, forgiveness is a grace given by the Holy Spirit.²⁶⁹

Regarding the correlation between healthcare and forgiveness, Petersen suggests that forgiveness positively affects ‘cognitive, emotional, and spiritual levels in the process of healing’.²⁷⁰ He also states that ‘particular studies in interpersonal relations, marriage and the family, and private and social behaviour are pointing to the deep connection between personal psychological health, social bonding, and healthy civic life and forgiveness’.²⁷¹ Therefore, he argues that ‘learning to forgive one’s self, or self-acceptance, and addiction and personal depression, or violent and abusive behaviour are seen to be increasingly connected and with social and even public policy consequence’.²⁷² Thus, from the above discussion, it is clear that the issue of forgiveness has extended beyond theology into the field of politics, public policy, and health care; this can inspire us to consider forgiveness in Christian *practice* as well as on a theoretical level within theology.²⁷³

²⁶⁶ Ibid.

²⁶⁷ Ibid.

²⁶⁸ Ibid., p.9

²⁶⁹ I will discuss more about L. Gregory Jones’s theological understanding of forgiveness and the role of Holy Spirit in practicing forgiveness below.

²⁷⁰ Rodney L. Peterson, “A Theology of Forgiveness”, p.8. Peterson cites Richard Fitzgibbons, “Anger and the Healing Power of Forgiveness: A Psychiatrist’s View,” in Robert D. Enright and Joanna North, ed., *Exploring Forgiveness*, (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998), pp.63-74.

²⁷¹ Rodney L. Peterson, “A Theology of Forgiveness”, p.8

²⁷² Ibid., pp.8-9

²⁷³ Ibid., p.9

In relation to the extended use of the term forgiveness, psychologist Robert Massey indicates that an integrative perspective suggests that ‘self, relationships, groups and social structures are interconnected in systems of care and violence’.²⁷⁴ He describes this perspective as a systemic framework for forgiveness, reconciliation, and peace, which demonstrates ‘the interconnection of psychological and social processes intertwining self, relationships, groups, and social structures in cooperation, social harm, violations of justice, forgiveness, reconciliation, and peace’.²⁷⁵ Massey claims that ‘both personal experiencing and the social contexts and structures affect the likelihood and continuation of interpersonal harm and forgiveness, social conflicts and peace’.²⁷⁶ As Wolterstorff describes above, if being wronged is defined as being treated unjustly, the issue of personal forgiveness should be interpreted not only in terms of personal or interpersonal relationships but also within a social framework; for, the issue of personal forgiveness is connected both to the act of wounding and being wounded by the experience of injustice. In other words, personal suffering is connected with social injustice and its resolution is therefore also connected with pursuing social justice. However, at the same time, since the unhealed hurt of members of a society can bring about harm or rupture, personal healing and recovery from one’s past hurt will contribute positively to societal well-being. In this sense, personal forgiveness becomes a key part of interpersonal and communal reconciliation; in addition, personal healing can also be facilitated through changes to the social structure.

In relation to the integrated perspective described above, theologian Harold Wells underlines the importance of recognizing structural and systemic sin,²⁷⁷ cautioning that the doctrine of justification by faith ‘reinforces the idea of sin as a purely individual thing, ignoring the reality of structural sin’.²⁷⁸ He also notes that ‘the concept of the universality

²⁷⁴ Robert F. Massy and Khawla Abu-Baker, “A Systemic Framework for Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Peace: Interconnecting Psychological and Social Process”, in Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Psychological Pathways to Conflict Transformation and Peace Building*, (New York: Springer, 2010), p.27

²⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p.11

²⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p.27

²⁷⁷ Harold Wells, “Theology for Reconciliation”, in Gregory Baum and Harold Wells, ed., *The Reconciliation of Peoples: Challenge to the Churches*, (Geneva: WCC Publications & Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1997), p.8

²⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, p.12

of sin can be misused to gloss over the real differences between victim and perpetrator'.²⁷⁹ Nevertheless, he finds the basis of human forgiveness in Jesus' cross and his 'radical teaching about forgiveness and love of enemies'.²⁸⁰ Thus, Wells suggests that the doctrine of justification is 'a reconciling doctrine if both victims and perpetrators cease to claim a righteousness of their own and acknowledge their own need for forgiveness and grace'.²⁸¹ Moreover, Rodney Petersen also argues that humanity is, individually and corporately, in need of forgiveness and restoration to recover from their distorted personality, which is created in the image of God.²⁸² He identifies forgiveness as the free and sovereign gift of a loving God as revealed in a covenantal relationship; we can extend forgiveness to others because 'we have been forgiven'.²⁸³ Therefore, forgiveness is a gift given to humanity through the cross of Christ.

Adding to the debate surrounding forgiveness, theologian Gregory Jones suggests that spiritual practices, such as baptism, Eucharist, confession, prayer, healing, and forgiveness, can help to achieve reconciliation.²⁸⁴ He considers forgiveness to be the most important practice because he identifies the Church with 'the body of Christ forged through the dynamic interrelations of repentance and forgiveness'.²⁸⁵ His understanding of forgiveness is based on 'God who lives in trinitarian relations of peaceful, self-giving communion'²⁸⁶ and the Cross, given by God 'to restore humanity to that communion in God's eschatological Kingdom'.²⁸⁷ According to Jones, the aim of the creation of humanity is communion with God and others by restoring the brokenness caused by humanity between God and itself; for this reason, God gave us the Cross.²⁸⁸ Thus, Jesus' Cross is a powerful foundation for forgiveness and a well of grace and hope for restoring humanity. For that reason, Jones emphasizes the need for the practice of forgiveness: learning both to be forgiven by God and to forgive others. For him, learning to be forgiven by God involves becoming a holy people of God and forgiving others is possible not by forgetting the past

²⁷⁹ Ibid., p.8

²⁸⁰ Ibid., p.6

²⁸¹ Ibid., p.13

²⁸² Petersen, "A Theology of Forgiveness", p.14

²⁸³ Ibid.

²⁸⁴ L. Gregory Jones, *Embodying Forgiveness: A Theological Analysis*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan: B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1995), p.178

²⁸⁵ Ibid., p.16

²⁸⁶ Ibid., xii

²⁸⁷ Ibid.

but by remembering it and envisioning a different future.²⁸⁹ Although he focuses on the need for the practice of forgiveness, his emphasis is on the power of the Spirit to embody forgiveness to lead Christians to the holy life.²⁹⁰

Jones explains that a Christian concept of forgiveness is not simply absolution of guilt and 'it ought to be focused on the reconciliation of brokenness, the restoration of communion with God, with one another, and with the whole Creation';²⁹¹ that is, forgiveness is 'God's love toward reconciliation'.²⁹² For Jones, the aim of God's forgiveness is humanity's transformation that 'calls for repentance'²⁹³ from recipients of forgiveness; the aim of repentance is 'the mutual love of communion in God's Kingdom'.²⁹⁴ Thus, Jones suggests that repentance 'leads people into the Christian community' because people can find God's grace through repentance.²⁹⁵ For that reason, he notes that human beings are called to respond to God's forgiveness through 'seeking to remember the past truthfully, repairing the brokenness, healing division, and reconciling and renewing relationships'.^{296 297}

Jones clarifies that his idea of forgiveness is established in the theology of Bonhoeffer.²⁹⁸ According to Jones, Bonhoeffer underlines the central significance of Christian forgiveness in the Christian community and the world. Bonhoeffer's theological concern is for authentic community, because Jesus' word comes to the community, not to isolated individuals.²⁹⁹ Bonhoeffer cautions against the danger of 'cheap grace',³⁰⁰ which is 'the preaching of forgiveness without requiring repentance, baptism without church

²⁸⁸ Ibid., p.6

²⁸⁹ Ibid., p.149

²⁹⁰ Ibid.

²⁹¹ Ibid., xii

²⁹² Ibid.

²⁹³ Ibid., p.136

²⁹⁴ Ibid.

²⁹⁵ Ibid., p.16

²⁹⁶ Ibid., xii

²⁹⁷ See Volf, "Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Justice", pp.46-47; Volf suggests that forgiveness is a path that makes it possible for wrongdoers to recognize their own injustices and invites them to self-knowledge and release through their admission of guilt and repentance. He identifies repentance with the result of forgiveness.

²⁹⁸ L. Gregory Jones, *Embodying Forgiveness*, p.11

²⁹⁹ Ibid. See Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Life Together*, John W. Doberstein trans., (New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1954), pp.17-39

³⁰⁰ Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *The Cost of Discipleship*, (New York: Touchstone, 1959), p.44

discipline, communion without confession, absolution without personal confession'.³⁰¹ Instead, he affirms that Christians should practice discipleship as powerful witnesses to the free gift of forgiveness of Jesus as 'costly grace'.³⁰²

According to Jones, Bonhoeffer identifies the notion of sin in relation to 'brokenness and the rupture of communion';³⁰³ the grace of mutual confession among Church members is therefore central to the Christian community because it is a remedy for self-deception.³⁰⁴ For Bonhoeffer, confession helps Christians 'to unlearn our sinful possession of ourselves through communion with God and one another'.³⁰⁵ Bonhoeffer therefore affirms that mutual confession to a brother or sister in the name of God is a gift assuring divine forgiveness; therefore, he criticizes the loss of confession in Protestantism and encourages mutual confession among Church members within Protestant communities.³⁰⁶

Like Jones, Robert Browning and Roy Reed also see forgiveness as a more comprehensive term than justice, although justice should not be forsaken for forgiveness. Browning and Reed describe forgiveness as 'going beyond the rules into a new creation'³⁰⁷ and 'the ministry of forgiveness and reconciliation as sharing in the mind of God'.³⁰⁸ They consider the basis of God's forgiveness as mercy and compassion in God that are deeper than justice; therefore, they declare that mercy is a vocation³⁰⁹ and that forgiving compassion is needed for forgiveness.³¹⁰ They view the function of forgiveness as removing 'the interior barriers in victims of injustice and as opening the door for reconciliation'.³¹¹ Thus, they declare that forgiveness is not given because of the apologies of the offender, but rather because the offender is a human being.³¹²

³⁰¹ Ibid., pp.44-45

³⁰² Bonhoeffer, *Life Together*, pp.110-112, Also see Bonhoeffer, *The Cost of Discipleship*, p.45

³⁰³ Jones, *Embodying Forgiveness*, p.18

³⁰⁴ Ibid., See Bonhoeffer, *Life Together*, pp.116-117

³⁰⁵ Jones, *Embodying Forgiveness*, p.17

³⁰⁶ Bonhoeffer, *Life Together*, pp.112-113, p.117

³⁰⁷ Robert L. Browning and Roy A. Reed, *Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Moral Courage: Motives and Designs for Ministry in a Troubled World*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2004), p.96

³⁰⁸ Ibid.

³⁰⁹ Ibid., p.98

³¹⁰ Ibid., p.81

³¹¹ Ibid., p.64

³¹² Ibid.

In a similar vein, the psychologist, Robert Enright, suggests the need for compassion towards the offender for the practice of forgiveness. Enright defines forgiveness as ‘the overcoming of negative affect and judgement toward the offenders not by denying ourselves the right to such affect and judgement, but by endeavouring to view the offender with compassion, benevolence, and love’.³¹³ He defines forgiveness in the philosophical and psychological sense arising from a theological understanding; thus, he suggests that the offender is forgiven not by their apology but by their humanity according to God’s mercy.³¹⁴ In other words, forgiveness needs to be offered because the offender, as a human being, deserves forgiveness. He considers forgiveness to be a matter for interpersonal relationships and reconciliation for ‘a behavioural coming together again’;³¹⁵ thus, he suggests that to forgive another does not necessarily mean that the other is prepared for reconciliation and wants it, but that forgiveness removes the interior barriers within the victim, enabling reconciliation to happen.³¹⁶

According to Arendt, forgiveness can be described as an ability ‘to serve to undo the deeds of the past’,³¹⁷ and forgiveness alongside ‘binding oneself through promises – the faculty to make and keep promises’³¹⁸ is ‘the remedy for unpredictability, for the chaotic uncertainty of the future’.³¹⁹ For Arendt, these two faculties involve the establishment of a secure future.³²⁰ She suggests the faculty of forgiving as ‘the possible redemption from the predicament of irreversibility’.³²¹ She also signifies that ‘trespassing needs forgiving, dismissing, in order to make it possible for life to go on by constantly releasing men from what they have done unknowingly’³²² because ‘it is an everyday occurrence which is in the very nature of action’s constant establishment of new relationships within a web of

³¹³ Robert D. Enright and the Human Development Study Group, “Moral Development of Forgiveness,” *Handbook of Moral Behavior and Development*, vol.1, William M. Kurtines and Jacob L. J. Gewirtz ed., (Hillsdale, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1991), p.126

³¹⁴ *Ibid.*, pp.123, 126

³¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p.129

³¹⁶ *Ibid.*

³¹⁷ Hannah Arendt, *The Human Condition*, (Chicago/London: The University of Chicago Press, 1958, (reprinted, 1988), p.237

³¹⁸ *Ibid.*

³¹⁹ *Ibid.*

³²⁰ *Ibid.*

³²¹ Hannah Arendt explains the term *the predicament of irreversibility* as ‘the predicament of being unable to undo what one has done through one did not, and could not, have known what he was doing’ (*The Human Condition*, p.237).

³²² *Ibid.*, p.240

relations.’³²³ Therefore, Arendt’s notion of forgiveness involves the perception of human beings having a capacity to find a way to make and keep the future safe; in other words, human beings have a capacity to forgive, which breaks the chains of past guilt and hurt and leads towards liberation. Arendt suggests that Christian love imitating Christ’s love is the grounds for the potentiality of the human power of forgiveness in Christianity, but in the larger domain of human affairs, ‘respect’ can be a foundation for forgiveness.³²⁴

Regarding the discussion of forgiveness, the latest peace psychology³²⁵ can support the Christian perspective, which emphasizes the importance of forgiveness. Peace psychology proposes that two interrelated processes of reconciliation and forgiveness aid ‘to restore trust, reinstate integrity, and foster security within the individual, dyad, family, community, and larger interpersonal and social systems’.³²⁶ According to Sharon Massey, security represents ‘attentive, constant, continuing support’³²⁷ and ‘one’s capacity to calm, reconcile, and heal from trauma is dependent on it’.³²⁸ She insists that ‘love and acceptance produce security, while prejudice, hatred, and physical harm stimulate insecurity, fear, anger, and retaliation’.³²⁹ In connection with the importance of creating security, Massey cautions that insecurity in traumatized adults who have lost their sense of trust often passes to their offspring.³³⁰ Thus, she raises the need to produce security in traumatized people as a factor in achieving forgiveness and reconciliation because, ‘without positive intervention, negative patterns tend to endure and can be amplified’.³³¹

Moreover, Massey maintains that basic trust in self and others and authentic dialogue among all parties involved play ‘key roles in desire and capacity to reconcile with or to

³²³ Ibid.

³²⁴ Ibid., pp.242-243

³²⁵ See Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Psychological Pathways to conflict Transformation and Peace Building*, p.vii, In the preface of this book, the editors express the idea that ‘peace psychology fosters peace and encourages those who are tired of war, hatred, and similar dilemmas that continue to plague all peoples’. In order to do this, they explore forgiveness, reconciliation, and related topics at multiple levels, from individual and group, to intergroup relations.

³²⁶ Sharon Davis Massey, “Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Essential to Sustaining Human Development,” in Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.83

³²⁷ Ibid., p.91

³²⁸ Ibid.

³²⁹ Ibid., p.90

³³⁰ Ibid.

³³¹ Ibid.

forgive oneself and others'.³³² She also adds that 'greater fusion with one another based on identity with the trauma can increase emotionality at the expense of rationality...and trigger emotional cut-off between in-group and out-group and between conflicted members of the same group'.³³³ Therefore, she suggests that forgiveness is a positive intervention that can change negative patterns and identity with the trauma: 'the offer and receipt of forgiveness consolidate, deepen, and help to finalize reconciliation'.³³⁴ Massey also insists that 'forgiveness and reconciliation heal people, communities, and the social fabric',³³⁵ while, at the same time, social support, such as acceptance by a community, can facilitate a person's rehabilitation.³³⁶ Thus, the offer and receipt of forgiveness is a virtue needed for people to learn about a healthy community.

With regard to the practice of forgiveness, Ansley LaMar maintains that individuals who have 'a broad definition of their in-group' may be 'more willing to forgive'.³³⁷ Thus, LaMar suggests that forgiveness needs to be 'part of a comprehensive social movement whose ultimate aim is to create a community that embraces every one';³³⁸ forgiveness is thereby needed 'to create social harmony'³³⁹ and so implies that if individuals can learn forgiveness in a community that supports forgiveness, the practice of forgiveness will be more effective.³⁴⁰ Moreover, he argues that for forgiveness to be lasting and effective, the relationships between conflicting groups must be transformed; the personal benefits gained through forgiving, however, will not be continuous if injustices at a social level persist.³⁴¹

In relation to the necessity of the practice of forgiveness, Raymond Paloutzian and Ani Kalyjian classify forgiveness as: intrapersonal forgiveness and interpersonal forgiveness. They explain intrapersonal forgiveness as:

³³² Ibid.

³³³ Ibid.

³³⁴ Ibid., p.87; see also p.90

³³⁵ Ibid., p.93

³³⁶ Ibid.

³³⁷ Ansley W. LaMar, "A Black Social Psychologist's Perspective on racial Forgiveness", in Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.161

³³⁸ Ibid., p.162

³³⁹ Ibid.

³⁴⁰ Ibid., p.163

³⁴¹ Ibid., p.164

When an individual gives up feelings of hatred and revenge toward his or her perpetrator. Instead, the individual feels more positive emotions, even though he or she may never come to “like” the perpetrator. However, forgiveness at the intrapersonal level may leave the door open to self-deception.³⁴²

This point suggests that intrapersonal forgiveness as a letting go of painful feelings needs to be expressed to the other in the form of interpersonal forgiveness, and such forgiveness should be extended to the communal level because this can be a sign of authentic forgiveness, without being trapped in feelings of self-deception. Therefore, as discussed above, forgiveness is key to reconciliation and Christians need to develop their ability to forgive in order to create and support a reconciling community.

2.3.2. Healing of memory

As described above, reconciliation means the restoration of relationships; the defining quality of which is ‘the building of trust’.³⁴³ Lederach expresses reconciliation as restoring the fabric of community; this indicates that reconciliation as the healing of ruptured relationships can be understood at communal as well as personal and interpersonal levels; thus, healing is required at all these levels of human relationships.³⁴⁴ Ervin Staub and Anne Pearlman explain that healing and reconciliation help to ‘break cycles of violence and enhance the capacity of traumatized people for psychological well-being’;³⁴⁵ thus, forgiveness and reconciliation ‘arise from and contribute to healing’.³⁴⁶ Moreover, they define reconciliation as accepting each other and enhancing mutual trust;³⁴⁷ it is more than ‘co-existence’, ‘interacting’, and ‘working together’.³⁴⁸ Therefore, reconciliation requires forgiveness and an acceptance of the past by both victims and perpetrators.³⁴⁹ That is, reconciliation requires victims and perpetrators not to see the future as a simple continuation of the past but to accept one another as fellow human beings, while exploring

³⁴² Raymond F. Paloutzian and Ani Kalayjian, “Introduction: Issues and Themes in Forgiveness and Reconciliation”, in Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.7

³⁴³ John Paul Lederach, “Five Qualities of Practice in Support of Reconciliation Processes”, in Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.185

³⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p.190

³⁴⁵ Ervin Staub and Laurie Anne Pearlman, “Healing, Reconciliation, and Forgiving after Genocide and Other Collective Violence”, in Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.195

³⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p.195

³⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p.197

³⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p.196

the possibility of a constructive relationship.³⁵⁰ According to Staub and Pearlman, healing opens a doorway for perpetrators, as well as victims, to enter reconciliation; for this, victims need security in order to enter healing and perpetrators need to face the truth beyond justifying their past deeds.

In relation to facing the truth in order to enter healing, Baum and Wells maintain that truth cannot be reached too easily because there is both remembered memory and forgotten memory; the unremembered past remains.³⁵¹ Thus, with regard to discerning truth and reconciliation, they quote African poet Antjie Krog, who writes that ‘truth is the widest possible compilation of people’s perceptions, stories, myths and experiences, then it has chosen the road of healing, of restoring memory and humanity’.³⁵² In this sense, truthful remembering is a key for the healing of memory. This truthful remembering does not need ‘selective remembering’³⁵³ but ‘deep remembering’.³⁵⁴ According to Müller-Fahrenholz, selective remembering can be identified as ‘a way of rereading history without counting the damage done to the other and without contemplating the guilt involved’.³⁵⁵ In other words, selective remembering involves suppressing the truth, while blaming and demonizing the other in order to preserve one’s own innocence.³⁵⁶ In this sense, the restoration of justice is a key part of the healing of memory because through ‘deep remembering’, one is helped to remember the names and lives of those who did not seem important before.³⁵⁷ Thus, it helps to find the truth, not to ignore or suppress guilt.³⁵⁸

Regarding the healing of memory, Volf suggests the need for remembering the past rightly, that is, ‘remembering the past truthfully’.³⁵⁹ In addition, he considers discovering the meaning of the past from the perspective of salvation as the basis for personal and

³⁴⁹ Ibid., p.197

³⁵⁰ Ibid.

³⁵¹ Baum and Wells, *The Reconciliation of Peoples: Challenge to the Churches*, p.36

³⁵² Antjie Krog, “Untold Damage of Anglo-Boer War”, *Democracy in Action*, vol.8, no.5 (31 August 1994), p.19 quoted in Gregory Baum and Harold Wells, *The Reconciliation of Peoples: Challenge to the Churches*, p.35

³⁵³ Müller-Fahrenholz, *The Art of Forgiveness*, p.47

³⁵⁴ Ibid., p.48

³⁵⁵ Ibid., p.47

³⁵⁶ Ibid.

³⁵⁷ Ibid., p.48

³⁵⁸ Ibid.

³⁵⁹ Miroslav Volf, *The End of Memory: Remembering Rightly in a Violent World*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2006), p.44

societal healing.³⁶⁰ For Volf, truthful remembering provides justice to both victims and perpetrators; it is a precondition for reconciliation.³⁶¹ To describe the meaning of healing, he employs the term ‘redeeming the past’,³⁶² in the sense that memory serves as a means of salvation.³⁶³ He believes that memory serves as a means of salvation in four ways: personal healing,³⁶⁴ acknowledgement as public remembering of wrongs,³⁶⁵ solidarity with victims,³⁶⁶ and protection of victims from further violence.³⁶⁷ Because healing of memory involves salvation, Volf argues, without the redemption of the past, the present and future cannot then be redeemed; therefore, without redeeming the past, redemption is not perfect.³⁶⁸ Whilst defining reconciliation as personal and societal healing, Volf explains that ‘the means of healing is the interpretive work a person does with memory’.³⁶⁹ He emphasizes healing of memory because memories are central to shaping human identity.³⁷⁰ Painful memories form an unhealthy identity because ‘if suffering has been part of our past, pain will be part of our identity’.³⁷¹ Volf’s ideas about the importance of memory in relation to forming identity are based on the perception that ‘memory shapes us, but ourselves shape the memories that shape us’.³⁷²

The background of Volf’s understanding of memory appears to be shaped by the writings of Augustine. Augustine explains memory in two ways; first, it is the storehouse for ‘the treasures of innumerable images of all kinds of objects brought in by sense-perception’.³⁷³ Secondly, it is ‘an action of recollection’³⁷⁴ to recall and reconsider past images, bringing them out from the memory’s store.³⁷⁵ Augustine’s contribution to the discussion is that he understands memory as inward action, and explains it from a present

³⁶⁰ Ibid., pp.27-29

³⁶¹ Ibid., p.56

³⁶² Ibid., p.41

³⁶³ Ibid., p.28

³⁶⁴ Ibid., p.27

³⁶⁵ Ibid., pp.28-29

³⁶⁶ Ibid., p.30

³⁶⁷ Ibid., p.32

³⁶⁸ Ibid., p.42

³⁶⁹ Ibid., p.28

³⁷⁰ Ibid., p.24

³⁷¹ Ibid.

³⁷² Ibid., p.25

³⁷³ Augustine, Henry Chadwick, trans., *Saint Augustine Confessions*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), X. viii. (12)

³⁷⁴ Ibid., X. ix. (16)

³⁷⁵ Ibid., X. xiii. (22)

perspective, not simply a past perspective. In other words, we reinterpret our past from the present. With regard to this, Volf insists that recollection allows us to dignify the reconstructive work of our memory and this serves as a powerful tool for justice and reconciliation.³⁷⁶ Given this sense of memory reconstruction, Volf maintains that we lose our true identity if we sever ourselves from our painful past memories, because ‘memory prevents us from distorting ourselves and living a lie’ in the present.³⁷⁷ Thus, as discussed above, we need to reconstruct our memory from the light of the future in the hope of the possibility of redemption. However, although personal healing is connected to remembering, mere remembering does not automatically bring about personal healing; healing is only possible when the remembered experiences are seen in a new light.³⁷⁸ In other words, when our remembered wrongdoings and painful memories are integrated into our life-story, personal inner healing can be achieved because we can draw on positive meaning within our life-story.³⁷⁹

Regarding this, Schreiter suggests three stages for the healing of memories: (1) acknowledging loss; (2) making connections; and (3) taking new action.³⁸⁰ According to Schreiter, acknowledging loss involves admitting that the past no longer possesses us. Making connections means ‘the emergence of new meaning and of new bonds of sociality that do not consign past relations to erasure’.³⁸¹ Making new meaning in our lives is possible through the reshaping of our relations with God, others, the world, and ourselves.³⁸² Taking new action indicates the attempt to achieve a new identity while remembering the past in a different way.³⁸³

With regard to the relationship between the healing of memories and faith in Christ, Volf notes David Kelsey’s idea that Jesus Christ gives new identity and opens new

³⁷⁶ Volf, *The End of Memory*, p.61

³⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, p.24

³⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, p.28

³⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p.76

³⁸⁰ Robert Schreiter, “Establishing a Shared Identity: The Role of the Healing of Memories and of Narrative”, in Sebastian Kim, Pauline Kollontail, and Greg Hoyland, ed., *Peace and Reconciliation: In Search of Shared Identity*, (York: York St. John University, 2008), pp.13-14

³⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p.13

³⁸² *Ibid.*, p.14

³⁸³ *Ibid.*

possibilities for humanity.³⁸⁴ Being open to the new possibilities provided by Christ signifies that God has promised all humanity the possibility of a new creation; thus, for Kelsey, to be a Christian implies being defined by God's eschatological promise, 'not by any past experience',³⁸⁵ and Christian identity can be defined as 'how God relates to us' in Jesus.³⁸⁶ Therefore, when wrongdoing is identified within us, we are gripped by 'distorted identity and frozen in time and closed to growth'.³⁸⁷ However, in our discovery of God's love, we can reshape our identity because our painful memories can be newly understood and integrated meaningfully into our life story in the encounter with God's presence and love. Even though God's love and presence do not eliminate the memory of the wrong, this memory can finally be relocated to the periphery of one's life.³⁸⁸

To form this new identity and to be open to this new possibility, Volf indicates that one needs to put the memories of wrongdoings into a bigger moral framework;³⁸⁹ he suggests that the Christian moral framework is shaped by the Exodus and the Passion as sacred memories. The Exodus is the exemplary memory for justice as the Passion is for love.³⁹⁰ Regarding sacred memory as a moral framework, Schreiter finds it in the Pascal story of the suffering, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ.³⁹¹ In particular, since Schreiter defines reconciliation as the creation of a new humanity, he describes the resurrection story as the verification of God's power over evil, the story of God's healing and forgiving power in the world, and a powerful means for forming our identities.³⁹² In other words, Jesus' suffering as an experience of injustice and violence becomes part of the completion of salvation in combination with the resurrection story; thus, our suffering experiences can be transformed in the story of what God has done in Christ.³⁹³

In addition to the Pascal story as a reconciliation story, I argue that the reconciliation ministry that started in Jesus Christ was entrusted to us and Jesus' whole life can be a

³⁸⁴ David H. Kelsey, *Imagining Redemption*, (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2005), p.60 quoted in Volf's *The End of Memory*, p.79

³⁸⁵ Volf, *The End of Memory*, p.82 He paraphrased Kelsey's understanding from *Imagining Redemption*, pp.38-41

³⁸⁶ Volf, *The End of Memory*, p.79

³⁸⁷ Kelsey, *Imagining Redemption*, p.60

³⁸⁸ Volf, *Ibid.*, p.80

³⁸⁹ Volf, *The End of Memory*, p.93

³⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, p.95

³⁹¹ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.18

³⁹² *Ibid.*, pp.18-19

reflection of the reconciliation story because, as Sheldrake suggests, the ‘whole story of Jesus Christ’ as the example for Christian discipleship, ‘is to be embodied in the particularities of our lives’.³⁹⁴ For that reason, in the journey toward reconciliation, Jesus’ whole life in this world, including his birth, childhood, his family’s flight to Egypt, his life in Nazareth, his ministry, suffering, death, and resurrection, should be the framework we use to interpret our past and our hope for our future, rather than only focusing on the Cross and Resurrection. Through that framework, when we recast our identity and hope, we can experience the sense that past events are integrated into our life story and are transformed as a healed memory. In other words, through mirroring our lives in Jesus’ story, we can have a new perspective from which to rewrite our life experiences. The ways in which reconciliation ministry can facilitate the spirituality of reconciliation for Church members will now be discussed.

2.4. How to facilitate a spirituality of reconciliation

2.4.1. Retelling the story: retelling one’s life story as a redemptive story of God through Jesus Christ

Whilst emphasizing the spirituality of reconciliation in the reconciliation process, Schreiter maintains that since reconciliation between victim and perpetrator is not possible without the victim’s forgiveness of the perpetrator, reconciliation begins from the victim.³⁹⁵ For that reason, the spirituality of reconciliation needs to create a safe space in which the victim can revisit his or her experience of trauma.³⁹⁶ According to Schreiter, therefore, a spirituality of reconciliation should first deal with ‘loss’,³⁹⁷ because remaking relations as an important part of reconciliation can be set up after the process in which ‘the skein of emotions that surrounds the loss such as anger, fear, uncertainty, and betrayal are untangled’.³⁹⁸ Schreiter insists that retelling the story, which enables us to then reinterpret our story, can help set up new relations.³⁹⁹ Schreiter understands that our identity is based

³⁹³ Ibid., p.18

³⁹⁴ Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, p.147

³⁹⁵ Schreiter, *Reconciliation*, p.59

³⁹⁶ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.36

³⁹⁷ Ibid., p.37

³⁹⁸ Ibid., p.38

³⁹⁹ Ibid., pp.19-22

on 'the stories we tell about ourselves, our families, our friends, our communities, our countries'.⁴⁰⁰ Thus, the transformation of our stories is crucial for shaping our identity.

Schreiter insists that we experience three moments of grace through retelling the story of our lives: (1) the shift of perspective; (2) creation of the new story; and (3) the healing of memory.⁴⁰¹ Retelling the story of our lives can cause these graced moments because such retelling changes the frame of interpretation; that is, the lens through which we see our lives. Schreiter notes that for Christians, 'the stories of Jesus are a special window into God's activity in this world and they give us clues as to who God is and what God is trying to communicate to us'.⁴⁰² For that reason, Christians need a process of connection to interpret their life stories within Jesus' redemptive story, which is the grand narrative for all humanity; this is a process of reconstruction that enables us to speak about our lives through our faith.

Concerning this issue, Jones states that within the Christian community, Christians are learning to re-narrate their lives truthfully through baptism and the Eucharist; the Christian community is sustained through articulation of their particular stories in the larger context of God's story.⁴⁰³ He maintains that through baptism, we learn *the priority of being forgiven by God rather than forgiving others*⁴⁰⁴ and through the Eucharist, we learn 'to appropriate our forgiveness by remembering the past in hope rather than in despair'.⁴⁰⁵ Thus, baptism involves a process of entering into a new relationship with God, while the Eucharist involves a moment of recognizing our new identity in relationship with God and other human beings with hope for the future; therefore Christians should be participating in the Eucharist with an expectation of 'the messianic banquet in God's Kingdom'.⁴⁰⁶

To explain such changes to our stories and the recovery of our spirituality by reinterpreting our lives, Schreiter uses as an example the story of disciples on the road to Emmaus in Luke 24.⁴⁰⁷ He points out that the disciples lacked faith and hope, but when

⁴⁰⁰ Ibid., p.19

⁴⁰¹ Ibid., pp.44-46

⁴⁰² Ibid., p.20

⁴⁰³ Jones, *Embodying Forgiveness: A Theological Analysis*, p.168

⁴⁰⁴ Ibid., p.174

⁴⁰⁵ Ibid., p.175

⁴⁰⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁰⁷ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.43

they heard Jesus' story and the story of God's action in this world from a stranger, they had the strength to return to the place of trauma.⁴⁰⁸ Those who are struggling in the reconciliation process have lost things such as hope, trust, and love. Thus, they need a process, which will enable them to regain these lost things through the reinterpretation of their painful memories and the creation of a new story. To do this, I argue that we need spiritual practice to encounter our own and Jesus' story; this is a retelling or the 're-story' of one's life. Identifying 're-story' with a way of reimagining the future by connecting the past and the future, reconnecting memory and potentiality,⁴⁰⁹ Lederach suggests that this is grounded in the capacity to remember the past but that we have no capacity to change it, as Arendt also maintained.⁴¹⁰ In other words, to imagine and live in a different future we need to have a different interpretation of the past, because the past is not simply past but still has a hold on the present. The present, therefore, should become a creative space for the creation of the future.⁴¹¹

This possibility of reconciliation through re-story is open not only at a personal level but also at interpersonal and societal levels. According to Lederach, re-story is an important tool for reconciliation at the societal level, because when a people's story is marginalized or destroyed, it can be lost in the history of the dominant culture.⁴¹² He refers to the deepest history as 'narrative',⁴¹³ which is 'creating the formative story of who we are as a people and a place'.⁴¹⁴ Thus, Lederach suggests that the task for reconciliation in a conflict-filled society involves re-storying the narrative.⁴¹⁵ At the societal level, he defines re-storying as the search for 'the deeper social story and meaning, not just of what happened, but how stories are connected to a far more profound journey of discovering

⁴⁰⁸ Ibid., pp.43-44

⁴⁰⁹ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, p.147

⁴¹⁰ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, p.148

⁴¹¹ Charles Villa-Vicencio suggests the importance of truth claims for re-story. He points out that the possibility of genuine healing rests on the uncovering of truth and our lived experience, stories, understanding of reality, and truths can raise fundamental differences that have the potential to destroy the future. Therefore he suggests that 'true stories, historic myths, epic poems, and national memories point to the things of the spirit by which a people lives'; therefore, this is where that reconciliation should begin. Charles Villa-Vicencio, "Telling One Another Stories: Towards a Theology of Reconciliation", in Baum and Wells, ed., *The Reconciliation of Peoples*, pp. 34-36

⁴¹² Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, p.146

⁴¹³ Ibid., p.142

⁴¹⁴ Ibid.

⁴¹⁵ Ibid., p.146

what these events mean for who we are as both local and global community'.⁴¹⁶ Hence, he refers to this re-story of the social narrative as 'the womb of constructive change and the continuous birthplace of the past'.⁴¹⁷

As the Church has a role not only in the lives of individuals, but also within society, it therefore must have a role in this journey towards reconciliation. Regarding this, Schreiter insists that the Church should therefore become a community to create spaces of safety, to heal memory, and to bring new hope that enables reconciliation.⁴¹⁸ For this, he suggests that Scripture and ritual give us the resources to heal memories and reshape narratives.⁴¹⁹ Consequently, new identity gained due to faith in a deep relationship with God enables Christians to reinterpret their own and society's past in the grand frame of Christ's reconciliation ministry and to refuse to let their lives be controlled by that past. From this perspective, Christian psychologist Ansley LaMar insists that this reformulated identity is vital for reconciliation; he suggests that 'sharing stories promotes empathy and empathy expands one's social identity'.⁴²⁰ Empathy is 'the ability to identify with and experience another person's experiences', leading to greater openness towards others.⁴²¹ Therefore, in the next section, I will deal with the idea that signifies this generous attitude and how this contributes to the journey for reconciliation.

2.4.2. Compassion: acceptance of others

The understanding of others is as important as self-acceptance and positive identity in the journey toward reconciliation, because reconciliation involves relationships with others. Whilst the re-storying of one's life is related to the focus on one's own restoration of the image of God, the understanding of others is connected to finding the image of God in others. Shriver insists that it is essential for former enemies to find a way of living together in the world of the twenty-first century because it is 'shaping up as a world in which peace among nations is a practical necessity, not merely an elusive, optional ideal'.⁴²² In his discussion of forgiveness in political ethics, Shriver states that forgiveness

⁴¹⁶ Ibid., p.147

⁴¹⁷ Ibid.

⁴¹⁸ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, p.128

⁴¹⁹ Schreiter, *Reconciliation*, p.77

⁴²⁰ LaMar, "A Black Social Psychologist's Perspective on Racial Forgiveness", p.163

⁴²¹ D.E.Massey, "Empathy", Hunter, ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, p.354

⁴²² Shriver Jr., *An Ethic for Enemies*, p.5

in human affairs has a purpose that is ‘not only healing wounds internal to the person but also wounds in social relations’.⁴²³ For, the acids of vengeance erode ‘the internal personal peace’⁴²⁴ and cause ‘the undoubted inter-human alienation that is the lasting result of traumatic wrong’.⁴²⁵ Hence, whilst suggesting forgiveness as an ‘indispensable dynamic in genuine social change’,⁴²⁶ he points out that something more than moral judgment and the refusal of vengeance are required for the public actuality of forgiveness, he therefore proposes empathy in order to actualize forgiveness,⁴²⁷ defining it as the acceptance of the enemy’s humanity.⁴²⁸

In relation to the necessity for such awareness of the other’s common humanity, Shriver affirms that those in the cycle of vengeance learn to dehumanize the other; for that reason, they have barriers which prevent them from understanding the other and which make them unwilling to listen to the stories of others’ suffering.⁴²⁹ However, according to Volf, in many situations, the distinction between victim and perpetrator is not so clear, particularly in the case of interpersonal conflict and prolonged conflict.⁴³⁰ As he states, ‘the more the histories of individuals and peoples are intertwined and the longer they engage in conflict, the more the lines between victim and victimizer blur’.⁴³¹ For that reason, sensitivity and understanding of the other is necessary for the journey towards reconciliation, while the process of reconciliation is related to meeting and listening to the stories of the other side.

With reference to such mutual meeting and listening, De Gruchy describes this process of reconciliation in three steps. First, there is an opening up of the space between the two parties, making them see each other; to recall and remember ‘the destruction, alienation, and dehumanization’⁴³² that lies between them, and ‘to explore the possibilities of

⁴²³ Donald W. Shriver Jr., “What is Forgiveness in a Secular Political Form?”, in Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.153

⁴²⁴ Ibid.

⁴²⁵ Ibid.

⁴²⁶ Ibid., p.153

⁴²⁷ Ibid., p.155

⁴²⁸ Shriver Jr., *An Ethic for Enemies*, p.8

⁴²⁹ Ibid., p.155, Shriver Jr., *An Ethic for Enemies*, p.9

⁴³⁰ Volf, *The End of Memory*, p.90

⁴³¹ Ibid.

⁴³² De Gruchy, *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, p.149

overcoming and transforming the past'.⁴³³ Secondly, both sides have to have a 'willingness to listen to the story of the other side' and 'to continue the conversation'.⁴³⁴ Lastly, there has to be the development of solidarity with the other, by trying to put oneself in the other's place, rather than standing against the other.⁴³⁵ Consequently, understanding and empathy of others means opening up to the other and accepting them as human beings created in the image of God and endeavouring to find the possibility for a better future within them.

Shriver explains two radically different reasons for remembering the past, revealed through the activity of the TRC in South Africa; the first is 'to get long-delayed revenge'⁴³⁶ and the second, 'to achieve hoped-for reconciliation'.⁴³⁷ Thus, he suggests that it is necessary 'to put the past in the past' and not to repeat it, but this is not the same as forgetting the past.⁴³⁸ Shriver associates the aim of forgiveness with the 'renewal of a human relationship';⁴³⁹ therefore, he considers forgiveness to include being prepared 'to begin living with the enemy again'.⁴⁴⁰ Moreover, understanding the humanity of the enemy is a significant step towards living together with the enemy.⁴⁴¹ According to Shriver, understanding one's enemy is not synonymous with forgiveness, nor is it equated with forgiveness; empathy for the enemy's humanity, however, is the entrance to forgiveness, along with forbearance.⁴⁴² Therefore, empathy is also an element for personal reconciliation, because it is based on the understanding of humanity as created in the image of God. Such an idea involves the acceptance of the other as one's neighbour and as a fellow human. Thus, the understanding of others and having empathy towards them is connected with the mercy of God, because God has accepted us as His children, and in that way, empathy is an expression of Christian love according to God's mercy.

⁴³³ Ibid.

⁴³⁴ Ibid., p.152

⁴³⁵ Ibid., p.153

⁴³⁶ Shriver Jr., "What is Forgiveness in a Secular Political Form?", p.155

⁴³⁷ Ibid.

⁴³⁸ Ibid.

⁴³⁹ Shriver Jr., *An Ethic for Enemies*, p.8

⁴⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁴¹ Ibid.

⁴⁴² Ibid.

Regarding the term empathy, Janet Ruffing identifies it with ‘the psychological capacity’ to respond with ‘a spontaneous and deeply appropriated compassion’.⁴⁴³ She defines compassion as ‘to suffer with’, describing it as a more spiritual term to express God’s love.⁴⁴⁴ For me, compassion seems to be more inclusive than empathy in that it is connected with God’s merciful love for humanity and His acceptance of us as His children. Therefore, we need to cultivate our capacity for compassion in order to accept others as human fellows.

This idea of acceptance of others from the perspective of God’s compassion is explained in more practical terms by Christian psychologist Joseph Sebarenzi. He affirms that forgiveness can occur when we admit that despite their wrongdoings, ‘offenders still have some humanity and can be redeemed’.⁴⁴⁵ He argues that the offender might suffer shame and remorse about their behaviour, so that they seek self-protection through denial.⁴⁴⁶ For him, this may be a reason why the victim should take the first steps towards forgiveness and show their willingness to reconcile.⁴⁴⁷ He suggests that this is a way to encourage offenders to apologize, and to bring about healing for both victim and offender.⁴⁴⁸ Therefore, compassion involves humanity’s expression of God’s mercy towards others with whom they have been in conflict. It includes the discovery of the image of God in the other and acceptance of them as a fellow human; therefore, it can contribute to reconciliation, leading to a peaceful human community.

In sum, the possibility of forgiveness and reconciliation is not because of inherent goodness in the other but because their humanity is given by the image of God. Thus, we should admit that God also created the other and that they, like us, share the hope of God’s redemption. With this, hope for reconciliation can be envisioned and the possibility of reconciliation can begin. When this occurs, the formation of solidarity to work together with the other for reconciliation can commence.

⁴⁴³ Janet K. Ruffing, “Cultivating Compassion: An Interview with Janet Ruffing”, *Presence: An International Journal of Spiritual Direction*, vol.17, no.1 (March, 2011), p.9

⁴⁴⁴ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴⁵ Joseph Sebarenzi, Foreword, in Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation* *ibid.*, p.vi

⁴⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴⁷ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴⁸ *Ibid.*

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have explored the theological definitions and contemporary uses of the term reconciliation, the contemporary theological understanding of reconciliation, and the dynamics of reconciliation, while focusing on reconciliation at the personal level. I have also discussed the social and spiritual dimensions of reconciliation, the contribution of the spiritual dimension to social reconciliation, and the ways in which the Church can facilitate its members to achieve the spirituality of reconciliation. This study demonstrates that reconciliation exists as a process towards God's redeeming work in this world and that Christians are then called to a vocation in reconciliation ministry. For Christians, the meaning of personal reconciliation involves the reshaping of relationships at all levels by living with the spirituality of reconciliation, that is, the restoration of the relational image of God within themselves and the development of their relationships at all levels. This can be achieved by the healing and creation of new relationships through the re-storying of one's life story from the perspective of Christ's life, by practicing forgiveness, having compassion and offering hospitality. Reconciliation is work initiated by God, and human beings participate in that work as Christ's friends and collaborators; for humanity has a responsibility to respond to God's calling in this life. This is strived for through their relationships with God and others and at both a personal and communal level. Thus, a person who is achieving personal reconciliation can act as an agent for reconciliation in his or her community and wider society.

This chapter suggests that personal reconciliation focuses on the spiritual dimension of reconciliation in a person and considers how that person connects to other levels of reconciliation through the practice of spirituality of reconciliation. Thus, the next chapter will explore spiritual direction as a space for spiritual practice, which can augment Christians' spirituality of reconciliation.

CHAPTER THREE

SPIRITUAL DIRECTION AS A SPIRITUAL PRACTICE

FOR PERSONAL RECONCILIATION

This chapter will discuss spiritual direction as a space for spiritual practice to facilitate personal reconciliation through gaining knowledge about God and oneself and to develop a deepened and enriched relationship with God. Spiritual direction is now understood as a means of spiritual growth and can also be considered to be a ministry helping the process of sanctification, which constitutes the double grace of salvation along with justification. It can also be a place to experience forgiveness, healing, reforming one's relationships, and to learn the truth and justice of the kingdom of God as a sphere of pastoral care that helps to embody in a person's life God's creation and Christ's reconciliation through the work of the Holy Spirit. Thus, with the purpose of suggesting spiritual direction as a ministry for personal reconciliation in the Reformed tradition, this chapter will explore the definition, goal, and process of spiritual direction, theological anthropology as the grounds necessary for spiritual direction, and the differentiation of spiritual direction from other ministries of pastoral care.¹

3.1. What is spiritual direction?

3.1.1. Understanding spiritual direction

According to William Barry and William Connolly,² spiritual direction is a process in which one Christian helps another's 'ongoing personal relationship with God', fostering his or her union with God.³ For Barry and Connolly, the primary focus of spiritual direction is the directee's religious experience, particularly that occurring in his or her

¹ The research related to this topic on spiritual direction is underway in the UK and South Korea but is not yet flourishing, in contrast to its deeper development in the US.

² The majority of work on spiritual direction comes from the Roman Catholic tradition, thus, many writers in this chapter are members of that tradition. Protestant approaches to spiritual direction include the work of Elizabeth Liebert, Susan Phillips, Marjorie Thompson, Norvene Vest, Kenneth Leech, Tilden Edwards and Urban T. Holmes III.

³ William A. Barry and William J. Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction*, (New York: Harper San Francisco, 1982, 2009), p.8

prayer experience.⁴ Therefore, by their understanding of spiritual direction, the interest of spiritual direction is the directee's interior life, especially the growth of their relationship with God through personal communication with Him.⁵ According to Sandra Schneiders, Barry and Connolly define spiritual direction accurately as the facilitation of a person's relationship with God; however, in so doing, they restrict the spiritual direction conversation to 'religious experience coterminous with prayer',⁶ thereby offering a less comprehensive treatment of spiritual direction.⁷ In other words, she suggests that the dialogue between the director and directee in spiritual direction consists of the directee's life of faith as well as his or her prayer.⁸ For Schneiders, the life of faith is a holistic life encompassing the directee's everyday life and prayer because, for Christians, both life and prayer are connected with God. For that reason, she notes that the spiritual direction conversation suggested by Barry and Connolly is appropriate in Ignatian spiritual direction but a broader level of discussion is necessary to be included in modern spiritual direction.⁹ In this regard, she identifies spiritual direction thus:

A process, carried out in a one-to-one interpersonal context, of establishing and maintaining a growth-orientation in one's faith life. This process has two moments which are in a constant dialectical relationship with each other, namely, listening to and articulating God's call in one's life, and progressively elaborating an integrated and adequate response to that call.¹⁰

Schneiders appears to suggest that all areas of one's life can be material for the conversation of spiritual direction because one's whole life is, in terms of spiritual growth, a response to God's call. Thus, one's life is referred to as the life of faith. The meaning of this becomes clearer through the explanation offered by Janet Ruffing, who describes spiritual direction as telling the sacred tale of a person. In other words, by facilitating the directee's telling of his or her life story and experience of God, spiritual direction assists the person to create 'a unique oral narrative of his/her salvation history' in the Christian

⁴ Ibid., pp.8-9

⁵ Ibid., p.8

⁶ Sandra M. Schneiders, "Horizons on Spiritual Direction," *Horizons*, 11/1 (1984), p.104

⁷ Ibid., pp.103-14

⁸ Sandra M. Schneiders, "The Contemporary Ministry of Spiritual Direction", in Kevin G. Culligan, ed., *Spiritual Direction: Contemporary Readings*, (New York: Living Flame Press, 1983), p.45

⁹ Schneiders, "Horizons on Spiritual Direction", p.104

¹⁰ Schneiders, "The Contemporary Ministry of Spiritual Direction", p.45

salvation tradition.¹¹ Therefore, according to Ruffing, the focus of the spiritual direction conversion is ‘the experienced interaction of God and the person seeking direction both with prayer and in daily life’ and the person’s unique religious experience generally observed as interior movements.¹² For Ruffing, since the aim of spiritual direction is the spiritual growth of the person seeking direction, the person should consciously relate to God.¹³ This means that the person’s sense of seeking God should be awoken both within prayer and in everyday life. This process of articulating the person’s life as a faith story allows the person to construct his or her own spiritual identity and refine the meaning of his or her life in God.¹⁴ Thus, as Ruffing notes, spiritual direction can be considered as a space to nurture the individual’s personal relationship with God through encouraging communication with God within both his or her prayer and daily life. However, since the person’s present life is in continuum with the past and future, spiritual direction aids the interpretation of the past and anticipates the future within the prism of the present. In this sense, I believe that spiritual direction can be referred to as a process to aid the shaping of the person’s life in faith through communication with God; this idea is related to sanctification, which I will deal with in the following section.

With regard to the relationship between communication with God and spiritual direction, Henri Nouwen’s description of spiritual direction is notable. He suggests the necessity of spiritual direction in order to live a spiritually mature life that listens and responds to the voice of God’s Spirit at every moment of our lives; thus, Christians need to form and practice their intimate conversations with God.¹⁵ Nouwen explains the rapid increase of interest in spiritual direction as being caused by the breakdown of many traditional ways of living and the necessity for developing our own personal resources; he therefore defines spiritual direction as a discipline that enables one to enter into the active presence of God and to discern God’s call.¹⁶

This trend of emphasizing the role of the Holy Spirit has developed over the past two decades; Shaun McCarthy describes spiritual direction as ‘ministry as a form of pastoral

¹¹ Janet K. Ruffing, *To Tell the Sacred Tale: Spiritual Direction and Narrative*, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1989, 2011), pp.44, 50

¹² *Ibid.*, p.20, p.151

¹³ *Ibid.*, pp.19-20

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, pp.135-136

¹⁵ Henri, J. Nouwen, “Spiritual Direction”, *Worship* 55 no. 5 (1981), pp.399-400

care’,¹⁷ which helps an individual ‘to become, more open to the prompting of the Spirit in ordinary events of life’.¹⁸ Furthermore, he identifies spiritual direction as a practice ‘situated in the larger process of spiritual formation in Christian tradition’,¹⁹ and which allows people to discern better ‘the presence and power of the Spirit of God’.²⁰ In addition, during this period, along with an emerging necessity for the contextualization of spiritual direction, many writers have suggested that matters like social injustice, which are related to the directee’s life, should be brought to prayer and should be discussed in spiritual direction. In particular, spiritual directors need to have a balanced consciousness about the person’s interior life and outward life.²¹ These ideas seem to be appropriate in the sense that directees’ lives cannot be separated from their social context.

In relation to the understanding of spiritual direction discussed above, scholars writing about spiritual direction in the Reformed tradition seem to share a similar perspective, as will be seen below. They see spiritual direction as a pastoral ministry that helps directees experience a deeper and more personal relationship with God through meetings within their prayer and faith life. Moreover, they attempt to specify more clearly the comprehension of God the Trinity as the foundation of spirituality and spiritual direction, taking spiritual direction into account as a practice for spiritual formation. According to Ben Johnson, citing the definition of Urban Holmes, spirituality is ‘the human capacity for a relationship with God as revealed in Jesus Christ through the Spirit’²² and ‘the faithful human response to divine providence’.²³ He takes spiritual formation as being a kindred

¹⁶ Ibid., p.400, p.403

¹⁷ Shaun McCarthy, “Basics in Spiritual Direction”, in Robert J. Wicks, ed., *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers*, vol.1, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1995), p.60

¹⁸ Ibid., p.58

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Carolyn Gratton, “Spiritual Guidance in Today’s World” in Robert J. Wicks, ed., *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers*, vol.1; David Lonsdale, “Spiritual Direction as Prophetic Ministry”; William Reiser, “The Interior Life of Jesus as the Life of the People of God”; Janet K. Ruffing, “Socially Engaged Contemplation: Living Contemplatively in Chaotic Times”; Ernest E. Larkin, “Contemplative Prayer as the Soul of the Apostolate”; all in Robert J. Wicks, ed., *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers: Perspectives for the 21st Century*, vol.2, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2000)

²² Urban T. Holmes III, *Spirituality for Ministry*, San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1982), cited in Ben Johnson, “Spiritual Direction in the Reformed Tradition”, in Gary Moon and David Benner ed., *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices*, (Trowbridge, Wiltshire: Eagle Publication, 2004), p.134

²³ Ibid.

term to spirituality and identifies it as ‘the interaction of God and human, and the formation of the dynamic life of the Spirit that leads toward maturity in Christ’.²⁴ Thus, he suggests encompassing the practices of prayer, Bible study, meditation, and contemplation as spiritual practices for spiritual formation.²⁵ Of those practices, Johnson suggests that spiritual direction is ‘one person’s serving another to be a great aid for spiritual formation through prayer, listening, discerning and responding to the presence of God in that person’s life, aiming for the growth in conformity to Christ’.²⁶

Furthermore, Howard Rice defines spiritual direction as a covenant friendship based on complete trust between two Christians to assist the directee’s discernment of God’s presence and his or her contemplative living out of God’s call.²⁷ According to his explanation, *covenant friendship* is a term that implies ‘the importance of relationship as the core of the Christian life’²⁸ and signifies the presence of a spiritual friend to share our basic faith. Thus, the relationship of the two persons (director and directee) is not an authoritarian relationship but one of mutual trust. Nevertheless, spiritual direction is a relationship between a party who seeks out help and a party who offers that help; here, Rice specifies that the Holy Spirit is the *third* party who is the real helper.²⁹ From this viewpoint, he clarifies the purpose of spiritual direction as aiding the process of the directee’s discernment of God’s presence in his or her life; the aim of this can be defined as the shape and the pace of life responding to God’s call.³⁰

According to writers on spiritual direction, the terms of spiritual direction, such as ‘director’, ‘directee’, and ‘direction’, may lead to the misunderstanding that spiritual direction is an authoritarian process and that causes the person to relinquish his or her responsibility through required obedience.³¹ Regarding this, Ben Johnson indicates that such an image of spiritual direction has been the greatest barrier to its employment in the Reformed tradition because the Reformed tradition is based on ‘the priesthood of believers

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ Ibid., p.135

²⁷ Howard Rice, *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide*, (Nashville, TN: Upper Room Books, 1998), p.63

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Ibid., p.64, p.68

³⁰ Ibid., p.62, p.65

³¹ See Barry and Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction*, p.10; Schneiders, “The Contemporary Ministry of Spiritual Direction”, pp.44-45

and their freedom in Christ to interpret the Scriptures and respond faithfully to God'.³² Therefore, it is certain that, because of this, there is resistance to spiritual direction in the Reformed tradition. However, alternative terms³³ have not yet widely replaced those traditional terms, and because of the emphasis on the guidance of the Holy Spirit in spiritual direction and the reinterpretation of the role of director as spiritual friend, soul friend, and facilitator, existing terms like director, directee, and direction are generally used in a variety of settings in the Reformed tradition.³⁴ For this reason, I will employ the terms direction, director, and directee. As discussed above, there is a consensus among writers and practitioners that spiritual direction is a spiritual practice to help the person's growth in God, dealing with his or her life of faith and focusing on his or her interior life. However, writers illustrate its goals and processes in a variety of ways. It will be helpful to examine these illustrations in more detail to get a clearer picture of how spiritual direction is actually perceived.

3.1.2. Spiritual Direction: its aims and processes

3.1.2.1. The aim of spiritual direction

With regard to the primary aim of spiritual direction in modern writers' depictions, Steve Wigall classified spiritual direction in five ways: (a) seeking God; (b) helping the directee to grow in prayer; (c) discerning the will of God; (d) finding the person's true self and vocation; and (e) growing in relationship to God, the self, and the world.³⁵ However, I think more classifications are needed because of the increased interest in sanctification and wholeness in Christian life and also spiritual freedom, with its significance as a basis for discernment in the Ignatian way. I have therefore added (f) and (g) to Wigall's classification. (Table 1)

³² Johnson, "Spiritual Direction in the Reformed Tradition", p.144

³³ Such as religious counselling, spiritual counselling, spiritual advice. See Barry and Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction*, p.11

³⁴ *Ibid.*, p.137 For example, they have been employed in the American Presbyterian Church (PCUSA) since 1980.

³⁵ Steve R. Wigall, "A Sacramental Paradigm Employing The Lord's Supper in Calvin as a Theological Rationale for Spiritual Direction", unpublished Th.D diss., (Boston University School of Divinity, 1998), p.41

***Table 1: The aim of spiritual direction**

The primary aim of spiritual direction	Description
(a) Seeking God.	The goal of spiritual direction is most commonly expressed as the seeking after an intimate relationship with God, a deeper experience of God, and the development of awareness of God in faith and life. ³⁶
(b) Helping the directee to grow in prayer.	Spiritual direction helps one's growth in prayer through the dialogue focusing on the directee's prayer experience. ³⁷
(c) Discerning the will of God.	In much of the literature, especially in the Ignatian way, discernment is one of the primary activities within spiritual direction. Henri Nouwen specifies the goal of spiritual direction as a discipline for discernment of God's call and a deeper communication with God. ³⁸
(d) Growing in relationship to God, self, and others.	Pempel views spiritual direction as an aid to help one's growth in relationship with God, find a deepest self, and learn to love one another through the loving relationship with director. ³⁹
(e) Finding the person's true self and vocation.	Thomas Merton sees spiritual direction as a continuous process of formation and guidance, in which Christians are led to their special vocation and union with God. ⁴⁰
(f) Spiritual Freedom.	John English explains that the right discernment of God's will is possible only through achievement of spiritual freedom; therefore, he takes spiritual freedom as the aim of spiritual direction. ⁴¹
(g) Striving for sanctification, wholeness through holiness.	Kenneth Leech sees the aim of spiritual direction as 'the achievement of wholeness of life, an integrated personality, in which the inner and the outer humanity are united'. ⁴² Moreover, Elizabeth Liebert refers to this goal as spiritual growth, and implies that the term spiritual growth is coterminous with discipleship, sanctification, deepening one's relationship with God, and striving for holiness. ⁴³

³⁶ Barry and Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction*, p.8

³⁷ Jeannette A. Bakke, *Holy Invitations*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Bakers Books, 2000), pp.39-40

³⁸ Nouwen, "Spiritual Direction" (1981), p.400, p.403

³⁹ Alice McDowell Pempel, "The Three Dimensions of Direction", *Review for Religious*, 40 (1981), pp.391-402

⁴⁰ Thomas Merton, *Spiritual Direction and Meditation*, (Collegeville, Minnesota: Order of Saint Benedict, 1960, 1987), p.13

⁴¹ John J. English, *Spiritual Freedom: From an Experience of the Ignatian Exercises to the Art of Spiritual Guidance*, (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 1995), p.15

⁴² Kenneth Leech, *Soul Friend, Spiritual Direction in the Modern World*, (Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 2001), p.104

⁴³ Ibid.

In terms of spiritual growth, holiness, and wholeness as goals of spiritual direction, as mentioned in (d) and (g), Tilden Edward suggests that, traditionally, spiritual direction is connected with a Christian's pursuit of holiness/wholeness.⁴⁴ However, there is no consensus with regard to the meaning of these concepts. Josef Goldbrunner defines holiness as becoming God-like and being holy, and wholeness as becoming healthy in body and soul; however, for him, becoming God-like involves becoming a real human, so that the more we seek after holiness the more we experience wholeness.⁴⁵ However, holiness and wholeness are employed in ways that suggest they cannot be achieved in this life; rather, only in death can human beings be transformed into the likeness of God.⁴⁷ In view of this, Adrian van Kaam suggests that the purpose of spiritual direction is holiness, which is 'a growth of spirituality through living at homeness with the living God'.⁴⁸ He comments that the guidelines for our lives should be the direction God gives to our deepest selves; therefore, the primary aim of spiritual direction is holiness, not wholeness and health.⁴⁹ With reference to the relationship between holiness and wholeness, I would suggest that holiness means experience of union with God nurturing one's interior life, while wholeness means the completion of the whole person, including body, spirit, and human relations. Consequently, holiness is the primary and vital principle in pursuing wholeness within Christians' lives and is the crucial purpose through which wholeness can be sought. Through this process of nurturing the interior life and the life of faith, spiritual direction assists persons who seek to live a fulfilling life and who strive for wholeness as Christians in this world.

⁴⁴ Tilden Edwards, *Spiritual Friend: Reclaiming the Gift of Spiritual Direction*, (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1980), p.64

⁴⁵ Josef Goldbrunner, *Holiness is Wholeness and Other Essays*, (Notre Dame, Indiana: The University of Notre Dame Press, 1964), p.1

⁴⁶ With regard to the term 'holy', Rudolff Otto's idea is notable because he explored the human experience of God using the term 'numinous'. He coined this term in order to define holiness as an expression of religious experience of 'wholly other' that is entirely different from ordinary experiences in human life. The numinous evokes in the person silence, a feeling of awe and a sense of pulsation with supernatural power. See, Rudolf Otto, *The Idea of the Holy*, J. W. Harvey (trans), (London, Oxford, & New York: Oxford University Press, 1923, (reprinted, 1958), cited in William M. Greathouse, *Wholeness in Christ: Toward a Biblical Theology of Holiness*, (Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press, 1998), p.15

⁴⁷ Goldbrunner, *Holiness is Wholeness and Other Essays*, p.1

⁴⁸ Adrian van Kaam, *The Dynamics of Spiritual Self Direction*, (Denville, NJ: Dimension Books, 1976), pp.373-374

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, p.373

As discussed above, the primary aim of spiritual direction can be described in a variety of ways. However, as Liebert notes, spiritual growth, as a coterminous term with sanctification, seems to be comprehensive in the Reformed tradition because it also encompasses discipleship, a deepened relationship with God, and a striving for holiness. Thus, I identify the aim of spiritual direction as facilitating one's spiritual growth and sanctification, deepening one's relationship with God, and pursuing wholeness.

3.1.2.2. *Process of spiritual direction*

Spiritual direction has also been described in terms of a process and a space involving various activities (Table 2) and can be illustrated as six processes, focusing on communication with God through one's storytelling and learning how to respond to God with trust in daily life.⁵⁰ Among these ideas, trust needs to be examined more closely, because the restoration and reshaping of broken relationships with others is related to the recovery of trust. Jeannette Bakke explains that trust needed in spiritual direction includes three components: trusting God, trusting ourselves, and trusting others.⁵¹ According to Bakke, in everyday lives that are fraught with difficulties, people participate in spiritual direction as a way to continue nourishing the development of their trust in God; namely, they find a way to trust and depend more on God by grace and to follow God more easily and more completely through spiritual direction.⁵² They also need to trust themselves in terms of 'trusting their willingness and capacity to hear and respond to God'.⁵³

Furthermore, as Bakke states, during the spiritual direction process, people carry 'their trust development one step further, showing their willingness to trust another person, the director'.⁵⁴ According to Bakke, to open our story to another person always carries some risk with it; thus, trusting another person, finally, means to trust the Holy

⁵⁰ Regarding spiritual direction as a process, Steve Wigall classified it in five ways: a) the process of responding to God; b) the process of learning prayer techniques; c) the process of group spiritual direction; d) the process of sharing one's spiritual story; and e) the process as a whole described by key images, e.g., doctor, physician, midwife, athletic coach, etc. See Wigall, "A Sacramental Paradigm Employing The Lord's Supper in Calvin as a Theological Rationale for Spiritual Direction", pp.47-52

⁵¹ Bakke, *Holy Invitation*, pp.62-75

⁵² *Ibid.*, pp.63-64

⁵³ *Ibid.*, p.70

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p.73

Spirit at work in and through another person.⁵⁵ For that reason, spiritual direction as a process of learning trust will help the person extend their trust to others in their communities at a level that goes beyond personal social networks. Such illustrations regarding the process of spiritual direction show that spiritual direction facilitates both better human relationships and closer relationship with God through the development of communication with God.

*** Table 2: Process of spiritual direction**

Process of spiritual direction	Descriptions
The process to learn one's communication and response to God.	A process to help one's personal communication to respond to this personal communication of God'. ⁵⁶
The process to learn prayer .	A process to learn prayer and contemplation through facilitating attention to God and awareness of God, moment by moment. ⁵⁷
The process to focus on the interior life.	A place for one's spiritualization, interiorization, and sanctification. ⁵⁸
The process to experience union with God.	A process to begin by the power of God's love to draw a person to God the Trinity and to end in entering a union with God the Trinity. ⁵⁹
A process of sharing one's sacred story.	A story-telling process, in which the directee shares the story of his or her life experiences with the director. ⁶⁰
The process of learning trust.	A space within which to recognize our history of trusting that affects all present relationships and in which to learn trust. ⁶¹

3.1.2.3. Group spiritual direction

Although spiritual direction is commonly described as a one-to-one helping relationship, some writers suggest the need for and effectiveness of spiritual direction in groups. As discussed previously, spiritual direction is comprised of a variety of activities that happen in the direction process, such as listening, clarification, affirmation,

⁵⁵ Ibid., pp.72-73

⁵⁶ Barry and Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction*, p.8

⁵⁷ Gerald G. May, *Care of Mind, Care of Spirit*, (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1982), pp.115-116

⁵⁸ Francis Kelly Nemeck and Marie Theresa Coombs, *The Way of Spiritual Direction*, (Collegeville, Minnesota; A Michael Glazier Book, 1985), p.16

⁵⁹ David L. Fleming, "Beginning Spiritual Direction", *Review for Religious* 33 (1974), p.546

⁶⁰ Ruffing, *To Tell the Sacred Tale*, p.70

confrontation, discernment, accountability, integration, and prayer.⁶² The person who helps the directee with this process is the director. Ruffing explains that the director participates in this process by focusing on the particular themes and issues that the directee selects through their presence, questions, and interpretive comments.⁶³

However, some writers suggest there are benefits to group spiritual direction. Rose Mary Dougherty comments that group spiritual direction can be a space for participants to share religious experiences and to nurture each other's discernment.⁶⁴ Kathleen Fisher also suggests the effectiveness of group spiritual direction, noting that members of women's groups offer each other companionship for their spiritual journey; she indicates that the spiritual direction experience can be liberating for women.⁶⁵ McCarthy signifies that the benefits of group spiritual direction are 'a greater richness through diversity and the possibility of being affected by other people's prayer, communal experience, less danger of dependency developing, and the impetus of group accountability'.⁶⁶ Nevertheless, this thesis will focus on one-to-one spiritual direction as a triad relationship in its authentic meaning, consisting of the director, the directee, and the Holy Spirit. For I believe that such a one-to-one relationship provides a space to explore more deeply one's faith experience and inner movement, and to discern God's voice more clearly.

3.1.3. The origins and current situation of spiritual direction

In the Christian tradition, spiritual direction has a long history. The guidance and care of the individual's spiritual life was certainly a major theme in early Christian literature, sermons, and letters.⁶⁷ However, the spiritual direction tradition as a one-to-one relationship can be traced back to the desert fathers (called *abba/amma*) in Egypt,

⁶¹ Bakke, *Holy Invitation*, pp.61-62

⁶² McCarthy, "Basics in Spiritual Direction", pp.65-68; Shaun McCarthy, "On Entering Spiritual Direction", in Kevin G. Culligan, ed., *Spiritual Direction: Contemporary Readings*, pp.105-110

⁶³ Ruffing, *ibid.*, p.140

⁶⁴ Rose Mary Dougherty, *Group Spiritual Direction: Community For Discernment*, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1995), p.35

⁶⁵ Kathleen Fischer, *Women at the Well: Feminist Perspectives on Spiritual Direction*, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1988), p.21, p.19

⁶⁶ McCarthy, "On Entering Spiritual Direction", p.112

⁶⁷ Donald Corcoran, "Spiritual Guidance", in Bernard McGinn, John Meyendorff, and Jean Leclercq, ed., *Christian Spirituality 1: Origins to the Twelfth Century*, (New York: Crossroad, 1985), p.444

Palestine, and Syria from the fourth to the sixth centuries.⁶⁸ People moved out into the deserts yearning for spiritual perfection, living alone or in monastic groups after the ‘establishment’ of the Church under the Emperor Constantine.⁶⁹ The *abba/amma* imparted God’s authoritative ‘word’ of spiritual guidance when the seeker asked of it in his or her life in order to reveal and heal a particular weakness or deficiency.⁷⁰ *Abba/amma* taught the seekers through their whole way of being as well as with their words; their teachings were followed by spiritual children and disciples in order to ensure obedience to God’s will.⁷¹ This tradition of spiritual direction has continued throughout Christian history in a variety of forms.

The *Rule* of St Benedict, written by Benedict (CE. 480-547), provided the practical application of the gospel for the monks’ celibate lifestyle within the community; the fundamental attitudes in Benedictine life were humility, silence, and unreserved obedience to God and work, whether manual or intellectual.⁷² *Lectio Divina*, a prayerful reading, was a powerful formative practice for the monks’ habitual attention to the Word of God.⁷³ The Celtic tradition had the presence of a ‘soul friend’, who was a voluntary counsellor and guide, and mutuality was essential in that relationship.⁷⁴ Later this tradition affected the Anglican style of direction, which is akin to a mutual relationship, rather than being authoritarian.⁷⁵

In the twelfth to fifteenth centuries, a new movement, which can be referred to as the Medieval Non-Monastic tradition, emerged in the Dominican and Franciscan Orders.⁷⁶ A ‘third order’ group also developed for lay members in the Dominican Order and a lay group in the Franciscans.⁷⁷ Their concerns were poverty of life and preaching the gospel and these new forms of evangelical life enabled people to have spiritual direction outside

⁶⁸ Ibid., p.446

⁶⁹ Edwards, *Spiritual Friend*, p.50

⁷⁰ Andre Louf, “Spiritual Fatherhood in the Literature of the Desert”, in John. Sommerfeldt, ed., *Abba: Guides to Wholeness and Holiness: Ease and West*, (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1982), pp.37-63

⁷¹ Ibid., p.50

⁷² Gordon S. Wakefield, *The SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, (London, SCM Press, 1983), pp.40-42

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ Leech, *Soul Friend*, pp.45-46

⁷⁵ Ibid., p.79

⁷⁶ Ruffing, *To Tell the Sacred Tale*, p.8

⁷⁷ Ibid.

the monastery.⁷⁸ Also in this period, a number of charismatically gifted women known as spiritual directors emerged, who helped with the spiritual formation of their companions through writing letters, documenting their mystical experiences, and giving advice: these women included Hadewijch of Antwerp who was the leader of the Beguine Community, Catherine of Siena, Julian of Norwich, and Catherine of Genoa.⁷⁹

In the Reformation era, within the Catholic tradition, the Ignatian way was inaugurated as the new form of spiritual direction; it focused on directees' personal experience of encountering God and directors' active role in the directees' discerning process.⁸⁰ During the period from the Reformation era to World War II, in the Catholic Church spiritual direction became largely an institutionalized practice linked with sacramental confession; as a result, spiritual direction became the official work and responsibility of cleric-confessors, and came to have an authoritarian character.⁸¹ However, as the concern for spiritual life and the need for personal assistance grew, spiritual direction resurged after World War II and a contemporary type of non-institutional spiritual direction arose, in which many laity were able to participate.⁸² Thus, according to Bill Creed, while there were only five programmes to train spiritual directors in North America in the 1970s, today there are hundreds of such programmes and thousands of people practice the art and ministry of spiritual direction.⁸³

As seen above, the tradition of spiritual direction has been preserved mostly in the Roman Catholic and Anglican Churches, but has not received much attention in the Reformed Church because of the Reformed emphasis on the doctrine of justification.⁸⁴ Furthermore, the Reformed tradition does not allow any mediator other than Jesus Christ.⁸⁵ For that reason, as Daniël Louw notes, in the Reformed tradition, counselling has been considered and carried out as Protestant pastoral care. However, as a result of

⁷⁸ Ibid., pp.8-9

⁷⁹ Ibid., pp.9-10

⁸⁰ Ibid., pp.10-11

⁸¹ Ibid., pp.12-15

⁸² Ibid., pp.15-18

⁸³ Bill Creed, "From Compassionate Listening to Compassionate Justice: A Call for New Standards", in Suzanne M. Buckley, ed., *Sacred is the Call*, (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 2005), p.156

⁸⁴ Leech, *Soul Friend*, p.80

⁸⁵ Johnson, "Spiritual Direction and Reformed tradition", p.132. The doctrine of justification is the core of the soteriology of Luther, in which human beings are saved only by 'faith alone' in Christ.

attention to the doctrine of sanctification and a concern for spirituality, spiritual direction emerged in the 1970s in Protestant circles, including Presbyterian and other Reformed traditions, and many Protestants have since been increasingly seeking spiritual direction and adapting it to their community.⁸⁶ Furthermore, throughout the Reformation period, reformers such as Luther, Calvin, and Zwingli stressed the need for personal spiritual guidance and were involved in a ministry of spiritual direction in various ways, including giving advice by word of mouth and by letter, writing spiritual literature, and offering personal guidance through counselling.⁸⁷

Thereafter, Pietism and Puritanism also showed that the Reformation had developed a significant interest in personal spiritual guidance for believers. Benner clarifies that Philipp Jakob Spencer, known as the father of Pietism, was called ‘the spiritual counsellor of Germany’,⁸⁸ while William Perkins, Immanuel Bourne, and Richard Baxter ‘all clearly illustrated the important place that spiritual guidance had within Puritanism’.⁸⁹ Kenneth Leech explains that ‘some Protestants like Dietrich Bonhoeffer placed a high emphasis on confession and personal guidance even though such ministry has not continued to play a central role in most modern Reformed tradition’.⁹⁰

Since the 1970s, people in the Reformed tradition have tried to recapture spiritual direction. In particular, it has been introduced and practiced in a variety of settings in the American Presbyterian Church (PCUSA) since the 1980s, on account of a growing interest in *spirituality* and *spiritual formation*.⁹¹ According to Johnson, numerous pastors sought spiritual direction ‘because of inner hunger and a quest for spirituality’; they went to a variety of places for spiritual direction, most of which belonged to the Roman Catholic Church.⁹² Likewise, church laity, as well as pastors, has been increasingly interested in spiritual direction due to their search for the purpose and meaning of life and their desire to experience God and spiritual growth. Recently, therefore, the PCUSA has developed

⁸⁶ Hunter, ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, p.1213; Ruffing, *To Tell the Sacred Tale*, p.17; Johnson, ‘Spiritual Direction and Reformed tradition’, p.137

⁸⁷ David Benner, *Care of Souls: Revisioning Christian Nurture and Counsel*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan, Baker Books, 1998), pp.30-31; Leech, *Soul Friend*, p.80

⁸⁸ Benner, *Care of Souls*, pp.30-31

⁸⁹ *Ibid.*

⁹⁰ Leech, *Soul Friend*, p.83

⁹¹ Johnson, ‘Spiritual Direction and Reformed tradition’, p.135

⁹² *Ibid.*, p.137

work involving spiritual direction in terms of discipleship.⁹³ For that reason, I believe that the Reformed Church should meet the spiritual needs of pastors and laity through pastoral care including spiritual direction as well as pastoral counselling.

Throughout the discussions above, some questions have been raised about why people feel an inner hunger and personal spiritual desire, and why the Church needs to provide the ministry with a form of spiritual direction for believers' spiritual formation and pastoral care. The answers to these questions involve issues of anthropology and the role of Church. Thus, the next section will deal with anthropology in the context of Reformed theology as the grounds for the ministry of spiritual direction. Furthermore, it will also discuss what spiritual direction might contribute to believers' sanctification and in what way it can enrich pastoral care.

3.2. Why spiritual direction is needed in the Reformed tradition

3.2.1. The understanding of personhood as grounds for spiritual direction

David Ford has written about people who have difficulties within their personal relationship with God. He explains the symptoms of such difficulties, taking a Roman Catholic priest's experience of hearing confession as an example: 'people cannot believe that God values them, delights in them, suffers for them, is interested in the details of their lives, has a way through their particular sins and difficulties, and has a calling for them'.⁹⁴ However, Ford clarifies that 'one of the Christian truths is that God desires us'.⁹⁵ Drawing on Berkouwer's ideas, pastoral theologian Daniël Louw states that the anthropology of Scripture is to describe people in relation to God.⁹⁶ In other words, from a Christian perspective, relationship with God is the core of humanity; human beings are created and saved by God. Louw explains that theological anthropology, in terms of pastoral theology, 'focuses on the scriptural perspectives which instil meaning in order to help to discover a

⁹³ Ibid., p.136

⁹⁴ Ford, *The Shape of Living*, p.55

⁹⁵ Ibid.

⁹⁶ G.C. Berkouwer, *De Mens het Gods: Dogmatische Studien* (Kampen: Kok,1957), p.27, cited in Daniël J. Louw, *A Mature Faith: Spiritual Direction and Anthropology in a Theology of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, (Louvain, Belgium: Peeters Press, 1999), p.55

person's true humanity before God and to cope with painful life-issues'.⁹⁷ Thus, he refers to the use of theological anthropology within pastoral care as pastoral anthropology.

Regarding the purpose of pastoral anthropology, Louw adds that it tries 'to interpret the human quest for meaning in terms of the grace and love of God'.⁹⁸ This question of life's meaning, as Louw notes, is linked to the notion of humankind created in the image of God.⁹⁹ Therefore, this raises questions about God the creator as well as about the identity of a person as the image of God. Louw also includes the doctrine of Christology and pneumatology as key parts of his theological anthropology for pastoral theology, in the sense that the Cross and Resurrection of Jesus lead to understanding the person as a new being, while the person as '*pneuma*' (spirit) brings about the perception that human beings can be healed and transformed only through the power of the Holy Spirit.¹⁰⁰ Such discussion of theological anthropology within pastoral theology considers both God the Trinity in relation to the human person and also the nature of human spiritual identity in relation to the Trinity. In other words, who I am in God the Creator, in reconciliation through Christ, and in the Holy Spirit, who renews and transforms all things. Thus, the following section will explore how God the Trinity relates to a person in spiritual direction.

3.2.1.1. *The person as the image of God*

In the discussion of humankind created in the image of God, instead of using the term 'image of God',¹⁰¹ David Kelsey refers to a person in terms of a 'living body' and 'personal body', in the sense that the person is created as a biological being and a social being.¹⁰² For me, Kelsey's view is holistic and coincides with Stanley Grenz, who sees the person as 'one indivisible reality';¹⁰³ in other words, the person has a 'soul', which constitutes 'the basis of the individuality of each person, in that God bestows the gift of

⁹⁷ Louw, *ibid.*, p.56

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, p.57

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, p.95, p.104

¹⁰¹ Kelsey states clearly that he prefers to reserve his use of 'image of God' to explain his ideas concerning theological anthropology. In David H. Kelsey, "Personal Bodies", in Richard Lints, Michael S. Horton, and Mark R. Talbot, ed., *Personal Identity in Theological Perspective*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2006), p.156

¹⁰² David H. Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence: A Theological Anthropology*, (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2009), vol.1, p. 248, p.291

¹⁰³ Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p.163

life on us individually'.¹⁰⁴ This idea can be regarded as 'an alternative to the dispute between trichotomist and dichotomist viewpoints of human being'.¹⁰⁵

In a similar vein, David Benner regards the person as a wholeness of personality because the person's inner self and body intertwine; the spiritual parts and psychological parts cannot be separated.¹⁰⁶ Nevertheless, he maintains the idea that persons are embodied spirits and that this term is appropriate to explain their characteristics before God.¹⁰⁷ In this regard, his description is noteworthy: 'It is the whole person that breathes, experiences, and worships God'.¹⁰⁸ Therefore, before discussing the meaning of the person's being created in the image of God, it is necessary to understand the term *person*.

David Kelsey's argument about theological anthropology is notable for describing the term *person* from a theological viewpoint. Kelsey argues that *person* is employed 'as a way to classify certain of the beings we encounter'¹⁰⁹ and the most important standard of *person* in modern Western culture is psychological; namely, a being has and is able to develop 'sensibility and emotional life'.¹¹⁰ The second standard is moral, and the third standard is intellectual.¹¹¹ However, he notes that such standards 'are coincident with the distinction between human being and non-human being'¹¹² and under these standards, certain people cannot be classified as persons.¹¹³ Therefore, he explains the concept of *person* in terms of theological anthropology; that is, in the sense that 'human creatures are constituted as personal beings by God relating to them'.¹¹⁴ He suggests that the claims about God relating to us make Christian theological anthropology *theology*.¹¹⁵ Thus, for Kelsey, *person* is a personal living human body created by God and *personal* signifies that

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., p.167

¹⁰⁵ According to Stanley Grenz, the Trichotomist viewpoint postulates that the human person consists of three substantial entities, 'spirit', 'soul', and 'body' and the Dichotomist viewpoint postulates that the human person consists of two substantial entities, immaterial (inner) self and material (body). The immaterial self includes 'spirit' as the capacity of the self to relate to God and 'soul' as capacity to relate to self and other selves. Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, pp.156-157

¹⁰⁶ Benner, *Care of Souls*, pp.50-54

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., p.54

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p.60

¹⁰⁹ Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence*, vol.1, p.288

¹¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹¹ Ibid., p.289

¹¹² Ibid.

¹¹³ Ibid.

¹¹⁴ Ibid., p.291

‘God relates to them in a distinctive way’.¹¹⁶ The meaning of personal implies ‘the status of a person before God’.¹¹⁷ Thus, Kelsey stresses that God created *persons* concretely and creatively in an immediate way, and persons have a personal relation with God as Creator.¹¹⁸ Meanwhile, he argues that God relates to such personal human bodies indirectly through language as a medium, and also that God constructs society through the practice of language among human creatures. Thus, the social use of language among human creatures lets persons be a public reality.¹¹⁹ This means that each human creature is a social being living in relationship with other human creatures.

In his discussion of persons as social beings, Alistair McFadyen emphasises the importance of social relations for forming the person’s identity because persons live within relationships, not in a social vacuum.¹²⁰ Thus, he argues that focusing on the view that the person’s identity is the product of his or her relationships may underestimate the sense of responsibility and autonomy, which are essential to personal being. Nonetheless, social relationships are crucial in forming a person’s identity; for persons shape their identity through their significant and interpersonal relationships taking place within a given social context.¹²¹ McFadyen identifies social structures with ‘the larger environment of both persons and the smaller-scale of personal relations’,¹²² whilst also noting, in a similar way to Kelsey, that interpersonal exchanges happen through a communication code, namely, social language.¹²³ Thus, as Kelsey and McFadyen argue, the person is a being *before* God and in relationship *with* God through creation and is within the human community designed by God. Thus, persons have a responsibility to respond to God and live in the human community as a being created in the image of God.¹²⁴ For that reason,

¹¹⁵ Kelsey, “Personal Bodies”, p.143

¹¹⁶ Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence*, vol.1, p.291

¹¹⁷ Kelsey, “Personal Bodies”, p.156

¹¹⁸ Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence*, vol.1, p.297

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p.296

¹²⁰ Alistair I. McFadyen, *The Call to Personhood: A Christian Theory of the Individual in Social Relationships*, (Cambridge/New York/Port Chester/Melbourne/Sydney: Cambridge University Press, 1990), p.4, p.73

¹²¹ *Ibid.*, pp.72-73

¹²² *Ibid.*, p.73

¹²³ *Ibid.*

¹²⁴ I discussed the meaning of image of God through Calvin’s theology in Chapter Two.

Kelsey often uses the term ‘persons’, which implies the plurality of humankind, to designate human creatures, emphasizing ‘their status as members of this community’.¹²⁵

With regard to the discussion on personal responsibility, Grenz stresses that ‘humans created with a special status’ (that is, having the image of God) have ‘a special accountability’ before God;¹²⁶ for humans have ‘a prerogative to choose to honour God’s intention for us or to disobey God’.¹²⁷ Grenz makes four observations regarding people’s accountability in relation to the theological meaning of the image of God. First, persons, whose image of God bestows upon them a special status before God, are given responsibility to serve creation as the mirror of the divine character.¹²⁸ Secondly, ‘a special fellowship’ with God is also a form of accountability given to persons as the image of God.¹²⁹ Thirdly, persons are given the potentiality to actualize the goal God intends for them; namely, they are a potential participant in the divine image as an eschatological reality.¹³⁰ That is, they can be transformed in full conformity with the image of God through participating in union with Christ. Thus, although persons have the potential to carry the image of God, this term, ‘image of God’, has eschatological connotations. By participating in the process of uniting with Christ, who is the perfect image of God, persons can transform into the image of God at the end of the world. Such a process can be said to be part of the process of sanctification.

Lastly, a person’s responsibility standing before God is related to the building of the community of love that reflects God’s love; this is a fellowship of those who seek to reflect in the present ‘the eternal relationship enjoyed by the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit’.¹³¹ This involves participating in the community of those who follow Jesus, where persons are given a responsibility to be transformed into partners of God through the Holy Spirit.¹³² Such responsibility can also be interpreted as the vocation for each person’s life in this world. Such understanding of the person’s accountability and vocation can be grounds for the necessity of spiritual direction. In other words, persons are created to be

¹²⁵ Kelsey, “Personal Bodies”, p.157

¹²⁶ Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p.174

¹²⁷ Ibid.

¹²⁸ Ibid., pp.177-178

¹²⁹ Ibid., p.178

¹³⁰ Ibid.

¹³¹ Ibid., p.179

¹³² Ibid.

persons given a vocation by God. The vocation is to have a personal fellowship with God, to strive for sanctification, manage God's creation, and build God's community. I therefore believe that spiritual direction can facilitate persons to find their vocation, as discussed above.

However, this discussion of the activation of vocation in persons created in the image of God needs to be supplemented by an explanation of the work of reconciliation of Christ within the context of human sinfulness, because humanity's sins are a barrier to their finding authentic identity and vocation. Thus, the next section will explore the understanding of the persons in the grace of reconciliation of Christ.

3.2.1.2. *The understanding of the person in the grace of the reconciliation of Christ*

According to Louw, there are two streams within the discussion of Christ's salvation in relation to pastoral theology: one that focuses on Jesus' incarnation and another that focuses on soteriology based on the Cross of Jesus.¹³³ The focus on the incarnation of Jesus shows the inner potential of the person and the focus on the Cross emphasizes the person's redemption from sin and their restoration to a new being in Christ.¹³⁴ With regard to the incarnation of Jesus, Kelsey defines salvation as 'a reuniting of creatures with God from who they have been alienated';¹³⁵ he explains the incarnation of Jesus as 'God's coming among us to share our fallen life so that we may come to participate in God's life'.¹³⁶ In this context, he argues that *incarnation* is the concrete way to name a persons' identity because through incarnation, 'the triune God goes about actively relating to estranged humankind to reconcile them to God'.¹³⁷ On the significance of incarnation in theological anthropology, Kelsey explains that it shows a person's 'relatedness-to-God',¹³⁸ who can be described as 'mystery'.¹³⁹ Kelsey employs this term in reference to 'God's essential incomprehensibility',¹⁴⁰ quoting the meaning of mystery from Karl Rahner.¹⁴¹ Kelsey explains the characteristics of God's mystery as transcendence and holiness.¹⁴²

¹³³ Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.28

¹³⁴ *Ibid.*, pp.28-29

¹³⁵ Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence*, vol.1, p.54

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*

¹³⁷ *Ibid.*, vol.2, p.702

¹³⁸ *Ibid.*, p.75

¹³⁹ *Ibid.*, pp.75-77

¹⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p.75

Therefore, the connection between a person's 'relatedness-to-God' with the idea of God as mystery suggests two points. That is, persons as transcendental beings can enter a relationship with God as mystery, and they can learn about the direction of their lives through reflecting on the holiness of God's life.¹⁴³ Hence, as Kelsey notes, a person's response to this reconciliation as the incarnation of Jesus leads to their reflection on God's agape love in 'an indirect imitation toward God and fellow creatures'.¹⁴⁴ He refers to a person's appropriate response as 'faith',¹⁴⁵ that is, an attitude toward God. In terms of faith, persons can be perfect before God.¹⁴⁶ According to Kelsey, *perfect* is an interchangeable term with *good*, and God's judgment on creation was 'very good'.¹⁴⁷ For this reason, Kelsey argues that *perfection* is 'the appropriateness of personal bodies' response to God's relating to them'.¹⁴⁸ As a result, persons as personal bodies can be perfect before God through faith. Thus, such an understanding can be a sound basis for a theological anthropology of spiritual direction because it encourages the desire of those making a relationship with God and shaping their lives as lives of faith.

In my opinion, Kelsey's thoughts on faith and perfection can be interpreted in connection with believers' sanctification; for the process Kelsey discusses is similar to the process of transformation into the image of God as a new being within an eschatological framework. With regard to this, there are many terms coterminous with sanctification: perfection, growth in relationship with God, holiness, and deepening of faith.¹⁴⁹ Kelsey's focus on incarnation becomes a key for pastoral care, as described above. However, the understanding of human beings from the perspective of a theological anthropology cannot be restricted to incarnation because Christ's life and suffering are also crucial from the perspective of the role of Christ as Mediator between God and humankind, which is an important aspect for understanding theological anthropology.

¹⁴¹ Ibid.

¹⁴² Ibid., pp.75-77

¹⁴³ Ibid.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid., p.704. On the reason that he writes 'indirect imitation', he comments that 'reflection may not be conceived as direct imitation. It can, at best, only in an indirect fashion'.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid., p.310

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., p.303

¹⁴⁷ Ibid., p.298

¹⁴⁸ Ibid., p.303

¹⁴⁹ Joseph Driskill, *Protestant Spiritual Exercises: Theology, History, and Practice*, (New York/Harrisburg/Denver: Morehouse Publishing, 1999), pp.21-22

According to Louw, the Reformed view in pastoral theology traditionally focused on the understanding of human beings as sinners who can only be restored by the redemption of Christ.¹⁵⁰ However, due to interest in and discussion of wholeness in pastoral theology, he suggests a new approach encompassing creation, salvation, and wholeness. Louw uses the term ‘wholeness’ in the sense that it is ‘life, peace (reconciliation) with God, salvation as a gift of God’s grace’.¹⁵¹ Emphasizing the aim of pastoral care as ‘wholeness’, a gift qualified by God and the Resurrection of Christ, he notes that there should be a renewed consideration of spirituality and human experiences in pastoral theology. To explain being ‘whole’, he suggests the significance of the Resurrection as well as the Cross. Focusing on the relationship with God among human experiences, he notes that pastoral care involves faith care ‘aiming at embodiment of life and an enfleshment of the presence of God within all life relationships and structure’.¹⁵² For Louw, the spiritual dimension is of the utmost importance in pastoral care.¹⁵³ Here, I feel it is necessary to include sanctification in the approach to pastoral care, because the grace of sanctification constitutes one aspect of the double grace of salvation, along with justification. The grace of sanctification will be dealt with in the following section, where I will suggest that it presupposes a positive perspective on human beings even though this grace is also given by the Holy Spirit.

3.2.1.3. The understanding of the person within the grace of sanctification: humanity in the leading of the Spirit

For Calvin, according to Charles Partee, the doctrine of sanctification is ‘the result of God’s grace irresistibly effected by the work of the Holy Spirit’ through believers’ ‘unity with Christ’.¹⁵⁴ Partee states that, for Calvin, sanctification is a calling for Christians, therefore, their ‘whole life...ought to be a sort of practice of godliness’.¹⁵⁵ For that reason, Christians’ sanctification is a ‘continuing process’ attained through faith, which unites them to God, thereby becoming ‘more and more holy’.¹⁵⁶ Explaining sanctification as one

¹⁵⁰ Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.28

¹⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p.96

¹⁵² *Ibid.*, p.97

¹⁵³ *Ibid.*

¹⁵⁴ Charles Partee, *The Theology of John Calvin*, (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2008), pp.208-210

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 210

¹⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

of the twofold fruits of faith, alongside justification,¹⁵⁷ Ronald Wallace argues that in Calvin's view, the model that Christians follow is Jesus Christ and therefore, sanctification is 'to conform to Christ', through union rather than mere imitation, which then leads to the finding of vocation.¹⁵⁸ John Leith describes how Calvin identifies faith as the personal knowledge of Christ and the essence of faith is yielding to God's gracious approach, so 'the dominant motivation of the Christian life is gratitude' to God.¹⁵⁹ Consequently, for Calvin, the doctrine of sanctification is the work of the Holy Spirit within Christian life through union with Christ; a process led by faith.

Regarding this Christian life of faith, Grenz argues that Calvin elaborated his doctrine of salvation by stating that the image of God in humanity is restored progressively through 'emphasizing sanctification as the growth of the believer into an advancing conformity to Christ'.¹⁶⁰ In a discussion of Calvin's thoughts on sanctification, Jonathan Rainbow argues that Calvin's understanding of salvation through Jesus Christ is rooted in humanity's double plight – guilt, which is in the forensic-legal sphere, and corruption, which is in the personal-ethical sphere – as the result of the Fall.¹⁶¹ Therefore, for Rainbow, justification means the change to humanity's status through the imputed righteousness from God, while sanctification involves transforming grace,¹⁶² which is 'not only an outgrowth of justification, but a work of divine grace in its own right'.¹⁶³ Rainbow argues that, for Calvin, salvation consists of 'the double grace of justification, forgiveness and repentance, pardon and renewal'.¹⁶⁴ In particular, he stresses that sanctification does not come from justification but rather directly from the Cross; thus, both justification and sanctification come from Christ's redeeming work.¹⁶⁵

Rainbow's argument regarding sanctification seems to support the significance of sanctification as transforming grace for humanity's salvation, as with justification. With

¹⁵⁷ Wallace, *Calvin's Doctrine of the Christian Life*, p.23

¹⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.41-48

¹⁵⁹ John H. Leith, *John Calvin's Doctrine of the Christian Life*, (Louisville, Kentucky: John Knox Press, 1989), p.92, p.100

¹⁶⁰ Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p.172

¹⁶¹ Jonathan H. Rainbow, "Double Grace: John Calvin's view of the relationship of justification and sanctification", *Ex Auditu*, 5 (1989), p.100

¹⁶² *Ibid.*, pp.101-102

¹⁶³ *Ibid.*, p.102

¹⁶⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, p.103

regard to the discussion on Calvin's views of sanctification, Driskill argues that Calvin affirms 'the centrality of the mystical union between the believer and Christ, the indwelling of Christ in the hearts of believers makes it possible for the believers to grow into the "likeness" of Christ'.¹⁶⁶ In light of this, he suggests that this process of spiritual growth into becoming Christ-like can be an identifiable term for sanctification in the Reformed tradition.¹⁶⁷

In discussing sanctification, it is necessary to examine the work of the Holy Spirit; for, as Grenz notes, salvation is 'the work of the Spirit in bringing us into full conformity with the likeness of Christ'.¹⁶⁸ Grenz emphasises that 'the focus of God's salvation is fallen humankind although it encompasses all creation';¹⁶⁹ he notes that the Spirit is 'the facilitator of new life and completes the saving activities of the triune God'.¹⁷⁰ Moreover, a central aspect of this Spirit's endeavour for the work for salvation is to apply Christ's work to individual humans, leading them to share the eternal relationship of the triune God in a new humanity.¹⁷¹ Grenz explains that the experience of individual salvation is classified into conversion, sanctification, and glorification. He suggests that, whilst conversion is the beginning of our personal salvation, sanctification is 'a lifelong process' for transformation in conformity with Jesus; moreover, glorification as 'the completion of the Spirit's work of renewal' is an eschatological expectation within us.¹⁷² As a result, sanctification can be said to be God's work through the Holy Spirit, enabling humanity to grow in holiness and in conformity to Christ, and to become partners of God in this world. Thus, in short, sanctification involves the work of the Holy Spirit; the role of the Spirit in terms of personal salvation is to embody a new life in Christ in our daily lives.

In order to make clear the role of the Spirit for personal salvation, one needs to explain *pneuma*, a person as a spiritual being. *Pneuma*, as employed by Paul, refers to 'spirit' and

¹⁶⁶ Driskill, *Protestant Spiritual Exercises*, p.98

¹⁶⁷ Ibid.

¹⁶⁸ Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p.433

¹⁶⁹ Ibid., p.432

¹⁷⁰ Ibid.

¹⁷¹ Ibid. and Grenz, "The Social God and the Relational Self", in Richard Lints, Michael S. Horton, and Mark R. Talbot, ed., *Personal Identity in Theological Perspective*, p.91

¹⁷² Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p.433

is 'often used to speak of the whole person'.¹⁷³ This means that *pneuma* is linked to the new being and the resurrected life in Christ as a whole being. Understanding *pneuma* as the new being in Christ, Louw states that *pneuma* designates 'a spiritual person who can judge life from the teachings of the Holy Spirit'.¹⁷⁴ Thus, the understanding of a person as *pneuma*, a spiritual person, indicates the transcendental dimension of his or her Christian life that is healed and transformed, and finds a meaningful purpose for his or her life through the Holy Spirit.¹⁷⁵ In his understanding of *pneuma*, Louw argues that the spiritual dimension is the most pivotal part in pastoral care, although a person is a unity as a personal body.¹⁷⁶ The focus on the transcendental dimension of Christian life does not mean that spirituality, the growth of the relationship with God, involves simply personal inner feelings.¹⁷⁷ Christian spirituality is connected with all spheres of Christian life: both interior and exterior experiences. Nevertheless, I believe, as noted above, that inner growth in the faithful opens up the possibility for outward piety; thus, spiritual growth is the primary factor for the faithful Christian life.

In recent discussion on spirituality and spiritual growth in the Reformed tradition, the term *spiritual formation* is widely used. According to Gerald May, *spiritual formation* is defined as 'referring to all attempts, means, instructions, and disciplines interned towards deepening of faith and furtherance of spiritual growth. It includes educational endeavours as well as the more intimate and in-depth processes of spiritual direction'.¹⁷⁸ May's definition seems to take into account spiritual formation as the means for striving for spiritual growth. I would suggest, however, that spiritual formation cannot be possible only through human endeavour; rather, it is also a process to be drawn by the Spirit, as by sanctification, because the Spirit is working for our sanctification and spiritual growth within us, as described above.

Moreover, according to Joann Conn, the meaning of spiritual formation seems to overlap that of spiritual growth because both describe the shaping and development of our

¹⁷³ Anthony Hoekema, *Created in God's Image*, (Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1986), p.214, cited in Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p. 162

¹⁷⁴ Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.93

¹⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p.104

¹⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p.96

¹⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, p.134

¹⁷⁸ May, *Care of Mind Care of Spirit*, p.7

spiritual life and Christian life. She depicts spiritual formation as ‘our cooperation with the Spirit’s action over our lifetime, the action of transforming our desire, our deepest self, into the relationship Christ has with God, and toward all humanity and the cosmos’.¹⁷⁹ Conn regards the true sign of spiritual formation as fidelity in loving relationships, spiritual freedom, and fruitfulness in ministry.¹⁸⁰ In my opinion, fruitfulness in ministry can be expanded to incorporate fruitfulness in Christian lives. Conn also argues that the spiritual development of individuals and the Christian community are related to each other; communal ministry cannot be done properly without consideration of individuals’ spiritual enhancement.¹⁸¹ Thus, she focuses on personal spiritual formation in the Christian community.

Given this, I believe that, although there are a variety of spiritual practices to aid Christian spirituality, spiritual direction can be a useful space for augmenting personal spiritual formation and growth because it focuses on a person’s inner state and growth in a one-to-one relationship.¹⁸² In other words, spiritual direction can be a facilitator for Christians to live a life striving for sanctification by encouraging them to abide by the indicators for mature faith: faith, hope, love (1 Cor 13:13), and the nine fruits of the Holy Spirit (Gal 5:22).

3.2.2. Spiritual direction as part of pastoral care

3.2.2.1. Spiritual care as a core for pastoral care

In the section above, I dealt with the double grace of salvation, which consists of justification and sanctification. With regard to grace, Thomas Oden notes that the task of pastoral care is to mediate grace interpersonally.¹⁸³ He defines grace as ‘God’s way of empowering the bound will and healing the suffering spirit’.¹⁸⁴ For Oden, this grace is not

¹⁷⁹ Joann Wolski Conn, “Spiritual Formation”, *Theology Today* 56 no.1 (1999), p.88

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, p.92

¹⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p.88

¹⁸² According to the *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, ‘spiritual formation is the process in which a person becomes mature in matters of personal religion, faith or sense of purpose’. It also implies ‘imitation of Christ and an effort to obey Christ’s twofold command: love of God and love of neighbor as self’. J. Carmody, “Spiritual Formation”, in Hunter, ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, p.1217

¹⁸³ Thomas C. Oden, *The Transforming Power of Grace*, Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1993), p.23

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, p.15

merely feeling,¹⁸⁵ but is ‘the favour shown by God to sinners, and the divine disposition to work in our hearts, wills, and actions, so as to communicate effectively God’s self-giving love for humanity’.¹⁸⁶ He therefore suggests that this grace is presupposed in every element of Christian life, such as ‘repentance, faith, new birth, and holy living’; this, for him, is the secret of pastoral care.¹⁸⁷ In my view, grace can be regarded as the grace of salvation and the grace of embodying salvation within every Christian life. Namely, there is the work of the Holy Spirit in the foundation of Christian life; Christians should be aware of this grace of God and pastoral care can help to develop such awareness. Thus, the correlation between grace, Christian spirituality, and pastoral care needs to be delineated.

Oden states that ‘Christian spirituality quietly thrives on grace’.¹⁸⁸ Thus, his idea seems to coincide with the notion of Christian spiritual formation drawn and enhanced through the power of the Spirit. In other words, Christian spirituality nurtured by the grace of God for the Christian life can be fostered through pastoral care. Consequently, there is a need for pastoral care focusing on spiritual formation. Oden emphasizes that grace is necessary ‘to enable the recovery of the fallen will, which cannot long persevere in good deeds without grace’.¹⁸⁹ For that reason, in order to maintain Christians’ holy lives and transformation, the significance of pastoral care for spiritual formation is emphasized.

According to Louw, pastoral care as part of practical theology deals with ‘God’s involvement with our being human and our spiritual journey through life’.¹⁹⁰ Therefore, pastoral care is related to the search for meaning in life, care, help, and comfort from the perspective of the Christian faith; it then manages the person’s experience of God through the Gospel.¹⁹¹ According to *DPCC*, pastoral care can be referred to as a narrower, more intensive dimension of the larger context of Christian ministry; ‘conversation with persons or groups who seek interpersonal, moral, or spiritual guidance’.¹⁹² *DPCC* shows the meaning of pastoral care as incorporating ‘the pastoral functions of healing, sustaining,

¹⁸⁵ Ibid., p.22

¹⁸⁶ Ibid., p.206

¹⁸⁷ Ibid., p.24

¹⁸⁸ Ibid., pp.15-16

¹⁸⁹ Ibid., p.206

¹⁹⁰ Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.5

¹⁹¹ Ibid.

¹⁹² L.O. Mills, “Pastoral Care”, in Hunter, ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, p.836

guiding, and reconciling, and specify a precise content to the care';¹⁹³ it is provided primarily by pastors, although occasionally may be led by acknowledged laypersons. In addition, pastoral care 'must include matters of "ultimate concern", i.e. the troubles must be meaningful in relation to Christian faith in that they foster a deeper faith and relation to God'.¹⁹⁴ Thus, for me, the primary focus of pastoral care for those who are in a redemptive relationship with God involves the spiritual care of Christians. Spiritual care therefore constitutes the core of pastoral care.

Regarding the importance of spiritual care as part of pastoral care, Oden identifies *care of souls* as the care of the whole person, with concentrated attention to their inner lives, and with God as 'the chief carer'.¹⁹⁵ Thus, nurturing Christians' interior lives seems to be at the heart of pastoral care, with its interest in the person as a whole. Whilst identifying the care of souls as 'the support and restoration of the well-being of persons in their depth and totality, with particular concern for their inner life',¹⁹⁶ Benner notes that the resolution of sin and supporting spiritual growth has always been central to soul care in Christianity.¹⁹⁷ Therefore, he argues that confession, repentance, and the individual's spiritual development involve the central task of the care of souls.¹⁹⁸ Benner states that pastoral counselling enriched by modern therapeutic psychology in the early twentieth century has substituted the care of soul in pastoral ministry, with a focus on therapeutic care.¹⁹⁹ Within his criticism of such a tendency, Oden points out that 'a massive loss of Christian identity' has occurred 'through narrowing and privatistic psychologising'.²⁰⁰ Similarly, Benner notes that 'if the message and methods of the Church are essentially psychological, then the church has lost its reason for existence'.²⁰¹ Thus, spiritual formation that aims to foster the person to recover their Christian identity should be the essence of pastoral care. Furthermore, spiritual direction, functioning in the role of spiritual formation and sanctification, needs to be included in pastoral ministry within the Reformed Church.

¹⁹³ Ibid., pp.836-837

¹⁹⁴ Ibid., p.837

¹⁹⁵ Thomas C. Oden, *Pastoral Theology*, (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1983), p.187

¹⁹⁶ Benner, *Care of Souls*, p.23

¹⁹⁷ Ibid., p.28

¹⁹⁸ Ibid., pp.28-29

¹⁹⁹ Ibid., pp.43-51

²⁰⁰ Oden, *The Transforming Power of Grace*, p.18

²⁰¹ Benner, *Care of Souls*, p.40

3.2.2.2. *The necessity for spiritual direction as part of pastoral care in the Reformed tradition*

As noted above, the primary type of pastoral ministry in the Reformed tradition has been pastoral counselling, based on therapeutic psychology.²⁰² This section will therefore explore the characteristics of pastoral care practiced in the church and will consider why the Reformed tradition needs to incorporate spiritual direction as part of pastoral care.

Due to the influence of psychology and the concern for inner healing, interest in counselling within the Christian community has increased. Counselling is a vast area that can range from problem solving in a temporal crisis to psychiatric treatment. Here I will comment on psychotherapy broadly, focusing on the similarities and differences between pastoral counselling and spiritual direction. According to Johnson, psychotherapy deals with emotional illness, while its goal is to cure disease; the psychotherapist is the doctor who diagnoses, treats and heals the client of their symptoms.²⁰³ Pastoral counselling can be defined as ‘a specialized type of pastoral care offered in response to individuals, couples, or families who are experiencing and are able to articulate the pain in their lives and are willing to seek pastoral help in order to deal with it’.²⁰⁴

Recently, however, pastoral counselling has been identified more narrowly because of the rising tendency to differentiate spiritual care from pastoral counselling. Thus, Johnson describes pastoral counselling as a means of personal problem solving, while its goal is to enable the recipient to resolve conflict or adjust to problems.²⁰⁵ He sees the aim of the pastoral counsellor as helping the client find a way to resolve the issue at hand in the context of their Christian faith.²⁰⁶ Within this understanding of pastoral counselling, he notes that the goal of spiritual direction is to find God’s will or conformity to Christ through a desire for God.²⁰⁷

For me, Johnson’s definition of pastoral counselling seems to overlap with the description of spiritual direction, as facilitating spiritual formation in the journey towards

²⁰² Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.102

²⁰³ Johnson, “Spiritual Direction and Reformed Tradition”, pp.152-153

²⁰⁴ Hunter, ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, p.849

²⁰⁵ Johnson, “Spiritual Direction and Reformed Tradition”, p.153

²⁰⁶ *Ibid.*, p.151

²⁰⁷ *Ibid.*

sanctification. According to Andrew De Smet, the contents of dialogue in both spiritual direction and pastoral counselling do overlap considerably: ‘sometimes counselling clients can talk about God and spiritual directees can bring their problems’.²⁰⁸ Moreover, he states that both pastoral counselling and spiritual direction ‘face issues of meaning and purpose in life and spirituality’.²⁰⁹

In connection to this issue of overlap, Paul Jones argues that ‘therapy deals with coping, counselling with deciding, spiritual direction deals with lived meaning’.²¹⁰ However, helping directees’ decision-making through discernment is one of the events in spiritual direction, just as a discussion of the meaning of life and of God can occur in counselling. I would suggest that the reason for such an overlap is that pastoral care focuses on care, support, and comfort for those who come for help; such assistance can be expected and is carried out in both spiritual direction and counselling. Consequently, I admit that there are intersections in both areas in the context of pastoral care; nevertheless, the uniqueness of each area needs to be maintained because the starting point and the primary concerns in each are different. In other words, I argue that pastoral counselling works for the enrichment of Christians’ lives by helping those who have relational difficulties or are in conflict situations. My understanding is that its main purpose is to assist people’s personal psychological growth within the context of their faith and so to advance their human and spiritual maturity. Meanwhile, spiritual direction is focused primarily on assisting directees to develop a deeper experience of God, to learn how to discern God’s presence and call in their everyday lives and to choose their path in the light of such discernment. The broader understanding of humanity gained by knowledge of psychology and other social sciences plays a role but the emphasis on advancing faith and spiritual growth. For that reason, I argue that spiritual direction needs to be considered and embraced as a useful means of pastoral care in the Reformed tradition in order to nourish believers’ faith in God and to expand their generosity towards their neighbours. The following section will examine how spiritual direction can facilitate personal reconciliation for Christians.

²⁰⁸ Andrew De Smet, “Counselling, Spiritual Accompanying & Pastoral Care”, *Contact* 143 (2004), p.29

²⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, p.34

²¹⁰ W. Paul Jones, *The Art of Spiritual Direction: Giving and Receiving Spiritual Guidance*, (Nashville: TN: Upper Room Books, 2002), p.21

3.3. How spiritual direction functions for personal reconciliation

3.3.1. God-awareness and self-awareness through prayer

Kelsey explains the meaning of the prayer in Calvin as:

Prayer to God is used much more broadly in reference to a wide variety of individual as well as communal practices...As expressions of human personal bodies' passionate desire for communion with the triune God, practices of love for God are focused on the sheer reality of the communion of giving and receiving in love, the love that constitutes the life of the triune God...Calvin characterized practices of prayer in all their variety as practices of "pure contemplation of God" (*Institutes*, 3.20.4.)...Here "contemplation" is not to be understood as a merely passive aesthetic experience of the sheer givenness of the object of contemplation. Rather, practices of prayer are contemplative practices focused in awed, celebratory, and active adoration of the triune God's life. Such contemplation is an active giving of oneself to, and not merely a passive taking in of God's life in love.²¹¹

As seen above, Calvin regarded the practice of prayer as useful within both individual and communal contexts. Although prayer is practiced in a communal context, it enables both personal *and* communal experience of God. Therefore, in terms of personal spiritual formation, the practice of prayer is essential because prayer expresses a passionate desire for communion with the triune God and is a passage for communication with God. Thus, we can gain knowledge of God through prayer, while at the same time, gaining knowledge of ourselves through prayer; for, as Calvin notes, there is a mutual connection between knowledge of God and self-knowledge.²¹²

With regard to this awareness of God, Calvin explains that 'there is within the human mind, and indeed by natural instinct, an awareness of divinity'.²¹³ However, although 'some seed of religion' remains in humanity even after the Fall, our ability for God-awareness is totally damaged and distorted on account of the Fall.²¹⁴ Thus, our 'sense of divinity' needs to be restored in us through union with Christ by the work of the Spirit.²¹⁵ As a result, persons can gain understanding of both God and themselves by participating in communication through prayer. Moreover, they can experience the history of salvation

²¹¹ Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence*, vol.2, pp.748-749

²¹² Calvin, *Institutes*, 1.1.3.

²¹³ *Ibid.*, 1.3.1

²¹⁴ *Ibid.*

²¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 1.3.3.

on a personal level through communion with the triune God. In this vein, Conn notes that humanity's honest self-knowledge is essential for developing their relationship with God in the sense that they gain the spiritual freedom to follow wherever the Spirit leads them through self-knowledge.²¹⁶ In this context, self-knowledge can be regarded as the root for discernment and authentic prayer because without it, persons 'cannot develop the love for God and neighbour that is the central gospel imperative'.²¹⁷

Thus, it has been shown that persons can gain God-awareness and self-awareness through prayer, and self-awareness leads them to deeper prayer. How, then, ought we to pray? Kelsey suggests that persons are to pray in Christ, 'the triune God actively relating to them to reconcile them when they are estranged from God'.²¹⁸ Consequently, prayer can be seen as a practice *for* God *by* God; nevertheless, it is also *for us*. Furthermore, John H. Wright suggests that, in relation to this, growth in prayers involves 'growth in the knowledge, love, and following of Jesus'²¹⁹ and our being God's children.²²⁰ According to Ann and Barry Ulanov, one of the main by-products of prayer is 'an enlargement of the self God has given us'; thus, 'we come to hold in open awareness what before we had lived unknowingly'.²²¹ They also explain the desire for prayer as 'the desire for a meeting with truth'.²²² This can be understood as a quest for meaning in life and an encounter with God. Thus, prayer can be described as a space to experience God and to rediscover one's spiritual identity and vocation by learning God-knowledge and self-knowledge.

3.3.2. *Rediscovery of identity through spiritual direction as story-telling*

Margaret Guenther states that spiritual direction is always constituted by the directee's storytelling to his or her director.²²³ The formation of Christian identity through spiritual direction is explained well by Ruffing. The *identity* in theological anthropology means that

²¹⁶ Conn, "Spiritual Formation", p.91

²¹⁷ Ibid., p.91

²¹⁸ Kelsey, *Eccentric Existence*, p.751

²¹⁹ John H. Wright, *A Theology of Christian Prayer*, (New York: Pueblo Publishing Company, 1974), p.95

²²⁰ Ibid., p.94

²²¹ Ann Ulanov and Barry Ulanov, *Primary Speech: A Psychology of Prayer*, (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1982), p.17

²²² Ibid., p.18

²²³ Margaret Guenther, *Holy Listening: The Art of Spiritual Direction*, (London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd, p.1992), p.31

persons discover that God calls them to respond to their responsibility.²²⁴ For this reason, it is important for persons to find this identity because it affects the purpose and direction of their lives. According to Ruffing, telling the story of one's life is organized by one's experience; moreover, one's identity involves the interpretation of one's life.²²⁵ Therefore, storytelling and the construction of one's identity coincide at this point in the interpretation of one's life history. Identifying *narrative* as the storytelling of one's life history and experience, Ruffing notes that narrative is telling one's past in the present situation that lies between the past and the anticipated future.²²⁶ However, Christians are asked to reshape their identity in a new narrative of their lives through their Christian faith. Ruffing refers to this process as a 'transformative experience', which is enabled through the new experience of integrating the past and the future.²²⁷ She suggests that spiritual direction contributes to directees' transformative experience through their reinterpretation of their lives and their making meaning of their lives in relationship with God. In this regard, spiritual direction encourages directees to create their personal salvation history.²²⁸ Thus, spiritual direction can be said to enable directees to form a new consciousness of their being before God. This is an experience of the transformation of identity, and a reconstruction of and healing of past memory. Moreover, this reshaping of one's spiritual identity as a being created in the image of God and accepted by Christ' agape love enables one 'to expand to reverence the spiritual identity of others'.²²⁹ Therefore, according to Ruffing, spiritual direction has a social dimension at this point.²³⁰

With regard to the reformation of a new life story, Guenther notes that the director's task is 'to help connect the directee's personal story to the redeeming story of Christ and to aid the directee to realize his or her identity in Christ'.²³¹ She states that directees' wounds do not necessarily disable them; rather, she believes that they can transform their wounds into a source of strength.²³² In particular, Guenther believes that the director can

²²⁴ Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.164

²²⁵ Ruffing, *To Tell the Sacred Tale*, p.74, p.97

²²⁶ *Ibid.*, pp.69-73

²²⁷ *Ibid.*, p.72

²²⁸ *Ibid.*, p.51

²²⁹ *Ibid.*, p.102

²³⁰ *Ibid.*

²³¹ Guenther, *Holy Listening*, p.31

²³² *Ibid.*, p.32

help the female directee 'find her place in the communal Christian story'.²³³ She explains that women's patterns of sin are different from men's; in terms of sin as failure of God's intention, men fail by pride and women fail by self-contempt.²³⁴ Guenther describes the details of women's self-contempt as an unwillingness to grow, tentativeness, denial and relinquishing of woman's own authority, and discounting herself as part of Creation.²³⁵ Thus, helping both male and female directees confront their sins is a task of the director in terms of the reconstruction of directees' spiritual identity. This reshaping of identity enables healing to happen in the directee, which in turn is related to the confession of sin.

3.3.3. Admission of sin and healing in spiritual direction

The directee's self-knowledge and reshaped identity may lead towards his or her self-acceptance.²³⁶ According to Nemeck and Coomb, fear or lack of self-acceptance is a barrier to true feeling and self-hatred is an obstacle to satisfactory relations.²³⁷ Nemeck and Coomb identify self-acceptance as 'the ability to listen attentively to self, others and God in any situation';²³⁸ moreover, the love of ourselves and of others are related in the Christian faith.²³⁹ In this sense, self-acceptance can be said to connote healing, because self-acceptance allows persons to be open to their experience of God, to realize their true self, and to love others. Healing is related to self-acceptance in the sense that self-acceptance enables persons to see themselves in the triune God and open themselves to understand and accept others as other persons created in the image of God.²⁴⁰

Healing is also connected to the confession of sin. With regard to this, Howard Rice notes that, at times, some Protestants carry a sense of unforgiven sin around with them, despite their participation in the corporate confession of the congregation.²⁴¹ In relation to the importance of confession in the Christian faith, Rice explains as follows:

Nearly every Protestant denomination has rediscovered the renewal of the ancient practice of hearing confession of sin and pronouncing words of God's

²³³ Ibid., p.132

²³⁴ Ibid., pp.134-135 Also see, Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God*, p.285

²³⁵ Ibid., pp.135-136

²³⁶ Nemeck and Coombs, *The Way of Spiritual Direction*, p.57

²³⁷ Ibid., pp.57-58

²³⁸ Ibid., p.58

²³⁹ Ibid., p.56

²⁴⁰ See Ch.2. and Ch.8 where I have developed the idea of healing.

²⁴¹ Rice, *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide*, p.90

forgiveness. Services of reconciliation have been introduced into the new liturgical materials for pastoral care. This shift reflects the revolutionary character of contemporary liturgical renewal. Both forms of confession and reconciliation are necessary.²⁴²

As seen from Rice's description, healing, confession, and God's forgiveness are closely related. Guenther argues that confession happens in spiritual direction, though not in the narrow sense of the liturgy or sacramental confession.²⁴³ Thus, expressing spiritual direction as 'closer to the confessional than to the physician's office',²⁴⁴ she notes that she is 'struck by the overlap of spiritual direction and sacramental confession'.²⁴⁵ In the view of the Reformed Church, confession that occurs in spiritual direction is to be regarded as an 'admission of sin', because not all spiritual directors are pastors who can pronounce the words of God's forgiveness. Nonetheless, the director as a Christian is enabled to affirm God's forgiveness and love through sharing the word of God with the directee.²⁴⁶ On healing related to the admission of sin, Guenther suggests that 'healing is promoted by cleansing, then by exposure to light and air'.²⁴⁷ Here, the point to be noted is that healing promoted in spiritual direction comes from the power of the Spirit because 'the source of healing is attributed to the action of God'.²⁴⁸

To summarize, spiritual direction can facilitate healing within directees when they admit their sin through the affirmation of God's forgiveness and through prayer and dialogue with the director. In spiritual direction, the admission of sin can often occur because spiritual direction is a space where the directees tell the story of their lives. Thus, spiritual direction can be said to be a healing place through the Spirit, though its primary goal is not healing.

3.3.4. Finding one's vocation

²⁴² Ibid., pp.89-90

²⁴³ Guenther, *Holy Listening*, p.31

²⁴⁴ Ibid., p.10

²⁴⁵ Ibid., p.27

²⁴⁶ Ibid., p. 31

²⁴⁷ Ibid.

²⁴⁸ Elizabeth Liebert, "The Process of Change in Spiritual Direction: A Structural-Developmental Perspective", unpublished Ph.D. diss., (Nashville: Vanderbilt University, 1986), p.47

According to Ford, the question that each person should ask is, ‘what about my vocation?’²⁴⁹ Ford explains vocation as ‘life shaping’ and believes that people have a desire to find their vocation;²⁵⁰ therefore, Christians discover ‘the long-term shaping’ of their lives in God according to their desires.²⁵¹ In this regard, the question of vocation is involved with the question of identity. Louw correlates the vocation in Christian life and the fruits of the Spirit, which are gifts of grace (Gal 5:25).²⁵² He describes these gifts as empowered by the Spirit; their purpose is to design a new pattern of behaviour in order to live differently in this world.²⁵³ These gifts shape Christians’ lives in a new way; in this sense, these gifts are in correlation with Christian vocation. Thus, Louw states that Christians are endowed with a new vocation to become peacemakers.²⁵⁴

Meanwhile, Guenther argues that men and women of all ages may sense a vocation through spiritual direction because they can become aware that God expects them to do something with their lives.²⁵⁵ Thus, it can be said that spiritual direction provides the space to find a vocation; this vocation involves practicing life as reconciled in Christ and expanding this life to neighbours through the gospel life.

3.3.5. Social justice in spiritual direction

This section will consider the issues of justice in spiritual direction, as discussed in recent scholarship. David Lonsdale suggests that spiritual direction needs to relate to prophetic ministry. He identifies prophetic ministry as involving ‘action for social justice’,²⁵⁶ and relating to the prophets in Scripture who criticized the dominant consciousness and culture and evoked an alternative social vision.²⁵⁷ Lonsdale describes the Cross using Brueggemann’s expression, ‘the ultimate metaphor of prophetic criticism’, in the sense that Christ brought healing, fellowship, hope, and new life where there was

²⁴⁹ Ford, *The Shaping of Living*, p.72

²⁵⁰ Ibid., p.51

²⁵¹ Ibid., p.72

²⁵² Louw, *A Mature Faith*, p.114

²⁵³ Ibid., p.114

²⁵⁴ Ibid.

²⁵⁵ Guenther, *Holy Listening*, p.93

²⁵⁶ Lonsdale, “Spiritual Direction as Prophetic Ministry”, p.333

²⁵⁷ Ibid.

sickness, alienation, despairs, and death.²⁵⁸ Moreover, while referring to a deepened spirituality that does not incorporate a sense of social justice as a domesticated spirituality,²⁵⁹ he criticizes the fact that spiritual direction ‘tends to move out of the Christian community into the private consulting room’.²⁶⁰ Christian spirituality cannot exist as separate from the social context because the person is a relational being, who, as discussed previously, is set in a social structure.

On this issue of spirituality and social justice, William Reiser notes that persons ‘may work for justice and peace at the local level, just as Jesus did’; moreover, ‘Jesus’ imagination eventually came to embrace the whole world’.²⁶¹ Thus, he suggests the need for solidarity in the work of following Jesus.²⁶² Meanwhile, Ruffing proposes a correlation between prayer and social justice by giving the example of a woman who was drawn to intercessory prayer on behalf of a nuclear weapons plant from the perspective of peacemaking.²⁶³ Through this example, Ruffing suggests the possibility of participation in prophetic ministry through socially engaged prayer. However, she also emphasizes that interest and participation in justice is related to God’s compassion; namely, justice is connected with a compassionate heart towards others.²⁶⁴ Benner also notes that the quest for justice and truth is an aspect of the care of the soul.²⁶⁵ As seen above, in spiritual direction for the development of Christian spirituality, the issue of social justice can be dealt with because the stories directees bring to direction may be related to their own experiences of injustice. However, directors should avoid the temptation to lead and manipulate their dialogues with directees towards the issue of social justice. In other words, the dialogue in spiritual direction is not controlled or guided by the director; rather, it is led by the directee’s prayer and life experience. For that reason, although it is important for the director to have a broad comprehension of social justice, he or she

²⁵⁸ Walter Brueggemann, *Prophetic Imagination*, (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 2001), p 90, cited in Lonsdale, “Spiritual Direction as Prophetic Ministry”, p.332

²⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, p.329

²⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p.327

²⁶¹ Reiser, “The Interior Life of Jesus as the Life of the People of God”, p.407

²⁶² *Ibid.*

²⁶³ Janet K. Ruffing, “Socially Engaged Contemplation: Living Contemplatively in Chaotic Times”, in Robert J. Wicks, ed., *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers*, vol.2, pp.432-433

²⁶⁴ Ruffing, “Cultivating Compassion: An Interview with Janet Ruffing”, pp.6-12

²⁶⁵ Benner, *Care of Souls*, p.119

should deal with the issue of social justice through questions, comments, and suggestions only in response to the issues raised by directee.

Conclusion

The aim of this chapter was to show the grounds for practicing spiritual direction as a means of reconciliation ministry in the Reformed tradition. For this purpose, I dealt with the definition of spiritual direction by exploring it in terms of meaning and process, whilst also offering a *précis* of its history and current situation. Moreover, I considered theological anthropology from the perspective of the Reformed tradition in three ways: the person as the image of God, the person in the grace of reconciliation through Christ, and the person as led by the Spirit. In order to explain the necessity of spiritual direction as the facilitation of sanctification, I described understanding the person in the double grace of justification and salvation. Furthermore, while illustrating that spiritual direction can be a part of pastoral care, I examined spiritual care as a core of pastoral care and the significance of incorporating spiritual direction in pastoral care in the Reformed tradition. Finally, I explored how spiritual direction functions for personal reconciliation. In this chapter, I suggested that spiritual direction could be a means of striving for personal reconciliation through fostering God-awareness and self-awareness through prayer, rediscovery of identity and vocation through storytelling, finding of vocation, admission of sin and healing, and awareness of social justice. However, there is a need to explore the more powerful practice of Ignatian spiritual direction in order to explain the ways in which it can further develop personal reconciliation and the spirituality of reconciliation for Reformed Christians. In the following chapter, I will explore the more specific practice of Ignatian spiritual direction as a refined instrument for personal reconciliation.

CHAPTER FOUR

IGNATIAN SPIRITUAL DIRECTION

This Chapter will explore whether Ignatian spiritual direction is applicable as a means of fostering personal reconciliation among directees who belong to the Reformed tradition. It will focus on the ways in which Ignatian spiritual direction contributes to directees' personal reconciliation through a study of *Spiritual Exercises*, which are the foundation of the Ignatian way. Current Ignatian spiritual direction adapts *Spiritual Exercises* to meet the needs of contemporary life-styles, although the underlying fundamental principles have not changed. This chapter will therefore investigate the characteristics and structure of *Spiritual Exercises* and the elements that promote personal reconciliation through participation in the Exercises. Furthermore, because the fieldwork of this dissertation deals with the experiences of Presbyterians, this chapter will examine the usefulness and limitations of the Ignatian way for Reformed believers. For that reason, the chapter will discuss the ways in which the Ignatian way is attractive to Protestants and also why some Protestants are cautious about it. Moreover, there will be a brief consideration of the theological similarities and differences between John Calvin and Ignatius of Loyola in order to investigate whether such discussions can be applicable to Reformed believers.

4.1. What are Spiritual Exercises?

4.1.1. An overview: Ignatius of Loyola and Spiritual Exercises

Spiritual Exercises was written by Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556), the founder of the Society of Jesus (Jesuits). It has been described as 'a manual to guide exercises which were to be carried out by an exercitant, ordinarily with counsel from a director'.¹ It was formed from notes that Ignatius wrote to aid himself in his spiritual conversations with others, which were then published as a book in 1548.² It encompasses the spiritual enlightenment he experienced during his spiritual development from Manresa in 1522 to his becoming general of the Society of Jesus in 1541.³ *Spiritual Exercises* has directions

¹ George E. Ganss, ed., *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1999), p.50

² Ibid.

³ Ibid., pp.50-54

for both the retreatant and director during a thirty-day retreat, which is divided into four “Weeks” of varying length.⁴ Performing these directions is referred to as ‘the Spiritual Exercises (the Exercises)’ or ‘making the Exercises’.

However, today, various adaptations of the Exercises have arisen because of increasing interest in integrating spirituality and daily life, the purpose of learning and deepening prayer, and changes to contemporary life-style. These adaptations include five- and eight-day guided retreats (individually guided by a director), weekend retreats, weekly meetings, and parish-based directed prayer sessions; for example, weekend retreats can include weekend preached retreats, life-shaping decision making, and discernment through the Exercises, while weekly meetings include weekly sessions and a weekend retreat.⁵ In relation to these adaptations, Joseph Tetlow states that there is tremendous interest in making the Exercises according to the Nineteenth Annotation;⁶ this is important, given the fact that today, many women and men who are unable to commit to a month-long retreat are nevertheless open to experience the Exercises.⁷ Tetlow explains the Nineteenth Annotation as follows: ‘it was common enough in Ignatius’s time for serious people to pray daily in their homes, as it is in ours, so such people would just take up the Exercises and Simon Rodrigues, one of the first Jesuit Companions, is a prime instance.’⁸ Thus, the Nineteenth Annotation is also called making ‘Exercises at home’.⁹ Tetlow describes one distinguishing benefit of the Nineteenth annotation as ‘the permeation of the prayer dynamic with the dynamic of everyday life’.¹⁰ Today, spiritual direction in the Ignatian way is used in a broad sense to refer to the variety of helping relationships carried out between a director and a directee, including such forms as weekly or monthly meetings

⁴ G. Simon Harak, *Virtuous Passion: The Formation of Christian Character*, (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 1993), p.101

⁵ Joseph A. Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World: Directing the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius Loyola According to Annotations Eighteen and Nineteen*, (Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1989), pp.189-190

⁶ Spiritual Exercises begins with an introductory explanation referred to as annotations, of which there are 20. The Nineteenth annotation is for those who cannot fully participate in a thirty-day retreat, described as: A person who is involved in public affairs or pressing occupations but educated or intelligent may take an hour and a half each day to perform the Exercises. See Ganss, ed., *Ignatius of Loyola*, pp.121-128

⁷ *Ibid.*, p.189, and Joseph A. Tetlow, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola: With Commentary*, (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1992), p.32

⁸ Tetlow, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola*, p.32

⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰ Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.58

with a director, individually guided retreats, and retreats in daily life (a one-to-one retreat based on the Exercises).¹¹ By Ignatian spiritual direction, I mean the two-person relationship (director and directee), with conversation being raised out of the directee's prayer and his or her life to embrace faith and everyday life. Although Ignatian spiritual direction adapts the Exercises and practices them in various ways, the core of the Exercises remains unchanged; this will be explored in the section below.

4.1.2. The purpose and meaning of making the Exercises

With regard to the aim of 'making the Exercises', there are two predominant views. First, it is proposed that the Exercises help a person who is striving for union with God; secondly, the Exercises help a person's decision-making in terms of their discernment of God's call and their response.¹² However, John English states that these two ideas can be regarded as the same, because 'a reliable decision demands closer union with God and the closer union with God demands decisions in response to God'.¹³ For that reason, English considers the aim of the Exercises to be spiritual freedom: 'to lead a person to the ability of union with God and to make a personal life decision'.¹⁴ He suggests that this spiritual freedom, which is inner freedom bestowed through one's relation with God, orientation to Christ, and the work of the Spirit, is a fundamental grace of the Exercises.¹⁵ In a similar vein, David Lonsdale actively identifies the purpose of the Exercises with spiritual freedom. He clarifies that, today, the Exercises can be understood as contributing to a discovery and growth of spiritual freedom. Nevertheless, other opinions regarding the purpose of the Exercises have been proposed, including 'mystical union with God, putting order into a disordered life, decision-making, and pedagogy of life in the Spirit'.¹⁶ Lonsdale suggests that spiritual freedom enables a person to rely on God's love, to give shape to his or her life, and to commit him or herself to the path to which God invites him

¹¹ This form of the Exercises and it is conducted over a number of days or weeks (with more than thirty meetings with a director modifying the thirty days), and this name 'retreat in daily life' is used by the Ignatian Spirituality Centre in Glasgow, Scotland.

¹² John J. English, *Spiritual Freedom: From an Experience of Ignatian Exercises to the Art of Spiritual Guidance*, (Chicago, Illinois: Loyola Press, 1995), p.18

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Ibid., p.21

¹⁵ Ibid., p.20

¹⁶ David Lonsdale, *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear: An Introduction to Ignatian Spirituality*, (London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd, 2000), p.135

or her.¹⁷ In this sense, spiritual freedom is connected with a person finding God's will and following Jesus. That is, spiritual freedom can be understood as an inner state for shaping a person's life in accordance with God's will. Michael Ivens explains that this spiritual progression results from 'redirection of heart that is the work of the Spirit, in which a personal action is a graced collaboration'.¹⁸

Spiritual Exercises is focused around praying with the life of Jesus; through making the Exercises, a retreatant is led to imitate Jesus' life by the work of the Spirit. Hence, Parmananda Divarkar states that the most important way to be Christ-like is to encounter Christ in the Gospels; the Exercises offer a way to encounter Christ in the Gospels, to imbibe the Spirit, and progress in interior knowledge of the Lord.¹⁹ In this sense, as discussed above, the Exercises can be said to offer a path for achieving spiritual freedom; they involve redirection towards God through a personal encounter with Jesus Christ and bring about changes in one's knowledge of Christ and one's life as a Christian. Such spiritual freedom also draws a person to discover to what life he or she is called. Wilkie Au suggests that these Exercises are intended 'to discern how this call is to take particular form in the concrete reality of our life'.²⁰ Thus, spiritual freedom is closely linked to union with God and discernment of God's will; it enables more 'life-giving decisions' to be made in deeper relationship with God.²¹ With this in mind, Graham Chadwick suggests that the purpose of the Exercises is 'to give freedom to choose God's will'.²² In this context, spiritual direction and the Exercises can be said to be the prime methodology of leading spiritual freedom. The connotation of spiritual freedom intended by Ignatius is apparent from the term 'indifference' described in the Principle and Foundation in *Spiritual Exercises*; 'indifference' is a primary dynamic of the Exercises:

The human person is created to praise, reverence and serve God our Lord, and by so doing save his or her soul; and it is for the human person that the other things on

¹⁷ Ibid., pp.135-136

¹⁸ Michael Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, (Herefordshire: Grace Wing & New Malden: Indigo Enterprises, 1998), pp.1-2

¹⁹ Parmananda Divarkar, *The Path of Interior Knowledge: Reflections on the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, (India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash & Rome, Italy: Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis, 1982), p.66

²⁰ Wilkie Au, "An Ignatian Path to Gratitude", *The Way* 49/3, (July 2010), p.74

²¹ A life giving decision means a decision which God oriented in order to lead one to life.

²² Graham Chadwick, "What Sort of People Do the Exercises Foster?", in *Person and Society in the Ignatian Exercises (The Way Supplement 76, 1993)*, p.111

the face of the earth are created, as helps to the pursuit of this end. It follows from this that the person has to use these things on the face of the earth are created, as helps to the pursuit of this end, and to be free of them in so far as they stand in the way of it. To attain this, we need to make ourselves indifferent towards all created things, provided the matter is subject to our free choice and there is no prohibition. Thus for our part we should not want health more than sickness, wealth more than poverty, fame more than disgrace, a long life more than a short one – and so with everything else; desiring and choosing only what conduces more to the end for which we are created.²³

According to David Fleming, the notion of indifference described above by Ignatius is that ‘the ability to respond freely to God, and all other loves for people, places, and things are held in proper perspective by the light and strength of God’s grace’.²⁴ Meanwhile, English explains that indifference does not mean to be ‘unfeeling, detached, and unresponsive’,²⁵ but rather to become free ‘from everything that is not God’.²⁶ Michael Ivens expresses the essence of indifference as ‘freedom to choose in accord with the praise, reverence and service of God’.²⁷ In this regard, the indifference suggested in *Spiritual Exercises* indicates that human persons should maintain their inner state to be free from their self-centredness and their attachment to the *world*, and to give the priority of their love and lives to God so that they are able to save their soul, live an ordered life, and choose their life in accordance with God’s will. In other words, indifference can be described as the heart of spiritual freedom and as a dynamic which allows spiritual freedom to flourish. Ignatius clarifies the notion that we should be free from any hindrance that prohibits inner freedom, in order to maintain indifference. For that reason, English states that the director should help the directee identify the cause of their lack of freedom; for example, ‘is it a distorted image of God? A secret sin? A disordered attachment to some object, position, or person?’²⁸

In search of the purpose and meaning of the Exercises, Fleming adds that the Exercises aid ‘openness to the movement of the Spirit, helping to bring to light the darkneses of

²³ Michael Ivens, trans., Gerard W. Hughes, intro., *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola*, (Herefordshire: Gracewing, 2004), [#23]

²⁴ David L. Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship: A Literal Translation an A Contemporary Reading of The Spiritual Exercises*, (Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996), p.15

²⁵ English, *Spiritual Freedom*, p.20

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, (Leominster/New Malden, UK: Gracewing, 1998), p.32

²⁸ English, *Spiritual Freedom*, p.22

sinfulness and sinful tendencies within ourselves, and for strengthening and supporting us in the effort to respond ever more faithfully to the love of God'.²⁹ Thus, for Fleming, the purpose of the Exercises is to attain a true spiritual freedom and this spiritual freedom is the core of the dynamics of the Exercises.³⁰ He puts emphasis on the retreatant's personal experience with God, which is based on the dynamics created by the Exercises.³¹ These Exercises, which encourage one's union with God, finding God's will in one's life, and making life-giving decisions with spiritual freedom, are composed of a relatively simple structure, which will now be discussed in more detail.

4.1.3. *The structure of Spiritual Exercises*

Spiritual Exercises is divided into four parts, called 'Weeks', of differing lengths.³² These four weeks contain prayers to help achieve inner freedom. As described above, the original form of the Exercises consists of a thirty-day retreat. This section will describe the basic framework of the Exercises. A thirty-day retreat flows as follows:

The retreatant for a thirty day retreat spends four to five hours in meditation each day, and sees his or her director usually once each day. In addition, the retreatant is instructed, after each meditation, to reflect upon the movements which occurred during the meditation and to examine his or her conscience twice each day.³³

In this process, the contents of the Exercises focussing on Jesus' life enable the retreatant to reflect on his or her life in light of Jesus' life. Regarding this, the *New SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality* explains that the book 'offers a pattern of prayer, meditation, contemplation and reflection, arranged so as to lead people into an increasingly profound experience and understanding of the mystery of God manifest in Jesus, to reflect on their lives in the light of that, and from there to move to making discerning Christian choices'.³⁴ Finally, the Exercises foster movement and change in the retreatant's awareness and life through an encounter with Jesus Christ.

²⁹ Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship*, p.5

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p.23

³¹ *Ibid.*, p.5

³² *Spiritual Exercises(SE)*, [#4]

³³ Harak, *Virtuous Passions*, p.101

³⁴ David Lonsdale, "Ignatian Spirituality", Philip F. Sheldrake, ed., *The New SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, (London: SCM Press, 2005), p.355

For this purpose, the Exercises are composed as follows: The First Week includes Principle and Foundation as the basis of the Exercises, and presents the purpose of human beings' creation and how to live in accordance with this purpose. This Week also concentrates on the consideration and contemplation of sin; the Second Week is absorbed in the life of Christ from incarnation up to Palm Sunday; the Third Week is dedicated to the passion of Christ; the Fourth Week deals with the Resurrection and Ascension.³⁵

Imaginative prayer, which is one of the hallmarks of *Spiritual Exercises*, makes the retreatant see things from God's perspective and take on God's qualities of love, compassion, and understanding through placing oneself fully within a story from the Gospels.³⁶ This imaginative prayer enables the retreatant to form a unique and personal relationship with Jesus through vividly meeting Jesus in the Gospels. The component that makes imaginative prayer powerful and real is the application of 'bodily and imaginative senses' in the imaginative contemplation.³⁷ *Spiritual Exercises* encourages retreatants to apply their five senses in the imaginative contemplation; to see, hear, smell, taste, and touch.³⁸ With regard to this form of prayer, which is referred to as Application of Senses, English states that it is 'a method of contemplating with our whole being',³⁹ as 'the sensuous way of approaching the reality of God',⁴⁰ and the Application of Senses develops into the 'spiritual sense'.⁴¹ Regarding the necessity of imagination in prayer, Tetlow suggests that we have separated our knowledge from our experiences and separated our affectivity from our reason, but we can harmonize them through imaginative prayer.⁴² Therefore, imaginative prayer can be a way to see and feel things as they are, and to illuminate them in a new way.

The features of each week of *Spiritual Exercises* will be examined in the rest of this section below.

³⁵ SE, [#4]

³⁶ David L Fleming, *What is Ignatian Spirituality?* (Chicago: Loyola Press, 2008), p.57

³⁷ Ivens, *Understanding of the Spiritual Exercises*, p.97

³⁸ SE, [#121]-[#125]

³⁹ English, *Spiritual Freedom*, p.143

⁴⁰ Ibid., English quotes this expression from Hugo Rahner, *Ignatius the Theologian*, (New York: Herder and Herder, 1968)

⁴¹ English, *ibid.*

4.1.3.1. *The First Week*

This part is dedicated to Purpose and Presupposition (Principle and Foundation), Examination of Conscience (*examen*), and five meditations on sin and God's mercy. The Purpose and Presupposition, as described in section 4.1.2., allows the retreatant to be aware of his or her 'creaturehood',⁴³ that is, 'a sense of dependence on God', the Creator.⁴⁴ It asks the person to love him- or herself and everything in the world in the purpose and order of creation and to live an ordered life. The Examination of Conscience is a process of reflection by retreatants on their personal lives, which helps open up their past and keeps them open to the action of the Spirit.⁴⁵ Fleming explains that the Examination of Conscience is 'to prepare the retreatant to become reflective about God's presence or absence in the event of one's daily life and it is a way to learn a daily practice which today is identified as a consciousness examen or an awareness examen'.⁴⁶ Tetlow describes examen of conscience as 'looking at what I am doing in the light of faith and reflecting on how things stand between me and the Lord'.⁴⁷ In a similar way, Ivens indicates that the examen 'aids a person to work the graces of the Exercises into the events and relationships and personal growth-situations of daily life'.⁴⁸ Therefore, he explains that 'Ignatius held the examen in the highest esteem'.⁴⁹ For that reason, examen is a significant prayer alongside imaginative prayer.

The five meditations involve the meditations on three sins, personal sin, and hell.⁵⁰ The first meditation is on three sins including the sin of the angels, the sin of Adam and Eve, and the particular sin of any individual, and the second meditation is on one's personal sin. Thus, the meditations on sin enable a person to feel the sorrow of sin and to see him- or herself as a sinner. As to the prayer of the First Week, Fleming explains that the First Week is set 'in the context of God's creative love, its rejection by each of us

⁴² Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.198

⁴³ English, *Ibid*, p.24

⁴⁴ *Ibid*.

⁴⁵ Ivens, *Understanding of the Spiritual Exercises*, p.33

⁴⁶ Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship*, p.29

⁴⁷ Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.210

⁴⁸ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.33

⁴⁹ *Ibid*.

⁵⁰ *SE*, [#45]-[#71]

through sin, and God's reconciling mercy in Jesus'.⁵¹ For that reason, the grace that a person should ask for in the First Week is one based on personal shame and confusion about his or her sins, and intense sorrow and fear about personal sins.⁵² As a result, the purpose of the colloquy to Christ at this point is to lead one to ask: 'What have I done for Christ? What am I doing for Christ? What ought I to do for Christ?'⁵³ Such questions are related to the meditation on Jesus' life of the Second Week, which allows a person to experience Jesus more intimately and to decide to live as a disciple of Jesus.

4.1.3.2. *The Second Week*

The Second Week concentrates on the life of Jesus from the perspective of his incarnation and public ministry; it allows one's love for Christ to be deepened and intensified and one's centre to become re-oriented 'toward the true life in Christ'.⁵⁴ The Second Week begins with 'the Kingdom Exercises',⁵⁵ which invite retreatants to respond to the call of Christ to the service of the Kingdom, and which encourage learning the self-giving love of Jesus through 'the three kinds of humility'.⁵⁶ These modes can be classified by how deeply one desires to commit oneself to God: the first has a desire 'to obey the law of God in everything',⁵⁷ but it is '[a] fidelity to obligation' not a positive attitude for doing 'better for God'.⁵⁸ The second has 'the total readiness to carry out the perceived desires of God',⁵⁹ according to Ignatius, 'It is more perfect than the first...I find myself at a point where I neither desire nor prefer to be rich rather than poor, to seek fame rather than disgrace, to desire a long rather than a short life, provided it is all the same for the service of God and the good of my soul'.⁶⁰ The third, according to Ignatius, is 'the most perfect humility';⁶¹ he states, 'in order to imitate Christ and to be actually more like him, I want and choose poverty with Christ poor rather than wealth, and humiliations with Christ

⁵¹ Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship*, p.7

⁵² *SE*, [#48], [#55]

⁵³ *SE*, [#53]

⁵⁴ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.33

⁵⁵ *SE*, [#91]

⁵⁶ *SE*, [#165]-[#168]

⁵⁷ *SE*, [#165]

⁵⁸ Ivens, *ibid.*, p.124

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, p.125

⁶⁰ *SE*, [#166]

⁶¹ *SE*, [#167]

humiliated rather than fame'.⁶² With regards this point, the focus of humility is related to how being 'deeply in love with Christ' and imitating him enables one to become Christ's true disciple in the world.⁶³ For that reason, the Second Week ends with retreatants learning how they can achieve a sound election for their lives through the meditation on 'election'.⁶⁴ Therefore, the grace which a person should ask for during the Second Week is the grace that 'I may not be deaf to his call (Christ's call), but ready and diligent to accomplish his most holy will'.⁶⁵ Consequently, through the response to Christ's call in this prayer, a person comes to respond to the question of the First Week: 'what ought I to do for Christ?' The response is accompanied by a change of life. Tetlow presents the change of Zacchaeus' life as an example of this response, stating that 'Zacchaeus responds to Jesus' love and courtesy by generously reforming his life' (Luke 19:1-10).⁶⁶ Thus, the grace of the Second Week is 'inner knowledge of the Lord who became human for me so that I might the better love and follow him'.⁶⁷ This grace to love Jesus more deeply draws a person to imitate Jesus.

4.1.3.3. *The Third Week*

The Third Week involves participation in Jesus' suffering through focusing upon 'the very special time in Jesus' life – his passion, crucifixion, and death'.⁶⁸ For that reason, the proper prayer of the Passion is 'grief with Christ in grief, to be broken with Christ broken, for tears and interior suffering on account of the great suffering that Christ endured for me'.⁶⁹ For Ivens, this prayer is asking for 'the grace to experience oneself as "dead" with Christ dead'.⁷⁰ Meanwhile, Tetlow points out that there might be cases for retreatants 'to try to control their prayer earlier on because of strong expectations about their experience of praying the Passion'.⁷¹ Therefore, he suggests that retreatants need 'to let Jesus invite them into his own experience in the way the Spirit wishes',⁷² instead of trying to control

⁶² SE, [#167]

⁶³ Ivens, *ibid.*, p.126

⁶⁴ SE, [#169]-[#189]

⁶⁵ SE, [#146]

⁶⁶ Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.65

⁶⁷ SE, [#104]

⁶⁸ Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship*, p.7

⁶⁹ SE, [#203]

⁷⁰ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.158

⁷¹ Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.86

⁷² *Ibid.*

their feelings and wanting to experience extreme emotions, because such desires might make them become more selfish, rather than drawing their attention to the suffering of Christ.⁷³ As to the graces of the Third Week, Tetlow suggests that retreatants are able to see and interpret their life anew through deeper and more mature wisdom about pain and suffering.⁷⁴ This new awareness of pain and suffering allows them to have compassion towards others. In the Third Week, retreatants also have a sense of dying themselves through their experience of dying with Christ; through this, they are able to drop their resentments.⁷⁵ This enables them to reconcile with others towards whom they have felt enmity or resentment.⁷⁶ In a similar vein, Harak explains that the retreatant comes ‘to feel the liberating and healing power of his own suffering as he struggles and suffers with Jesus’.⁷⁷ Thus, the Third Week challenges retreatants to deliberate on some essential elements of the Christian’s life according to the Gospels, such as self-giving love.

4.1.3.4. *The Fourth Week*

This is aimed towards sharing the joy of Resurrection with the Risen Christ and considering the world, which has been renewed in Jesus’ Resurrection.⁷⁸ Consequently, the grace sought in this week is ‘the grace to feel gladness and to rejoice intensely over the great glory and joy of Christ our Lord’.⁷⁹ According to Harak, the Fourth Week is the time ‘to labour in love with Jesus for the coming of the reign of God’⁸⁰ as ‘a new quality of friendship with Jesus’.⁸¹ Thus, Harak emphasizes that ‘though retreatants do not yet have the fullness of the Resurrection, in that way, they walk in the newness of life, finding their joy in God within, and in all things’.⁸² The awareness of the newness of life is expressed by Ivens as ‘the spirituality of finding and loving God in all things’; such spirituality is presented in the ‘Contemplation to Attain Love’, which is a contemplation of the Fourth

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ Ibid., p.96

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁷⁷ Harak, *Virtuous Passions*, p.119

⁷⁸ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.162; Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship*, p.7

⁷⁹ SE, [#221]

⁸⁰ Harak, p.121

⁸¹ Ibid., p.119

⁸² Ibid., p.121

Week.⁸³ This contemplation declares that ‘God dwells in creatures’ and ‘God works and labours on my behalf in all created things on the face of the earth’.⁸⁴ Moreover, this contemplation proposes that ‘love ought to find its expression in deeds rather than in words and love consists in mutual communion’.⁸⁵ Eventually, the ‘Contemplation to Attain Love’ encourages retreatants to maintain the grace of the Exercises in their daily lives toward God and neighbours. This grace enables a person, as a disciple of Jesus Christ in the world, to practice apostolic spirituality.

According to David Hassel, apostolic spirituality – or apostolic contemplation, as he calls it – can be identified with ‘a person’s awareness of God present within him and working out through him into the lives of others’.⁸⁶ He differentiates apostolic contemplation from monastic contemplation, elucidating that apostolic contemplation concentrates ‘more on outer wholeness of self and world, whereas monastic contemplation concentrates on the inner wholeness’.⁸⁷ He therefore suggests that apostolic spirituality cannot be achieved by ‘spiritual gymnastics’⁸⁸ such as prayer, reading, or using diaries, but ‘arise[s] within the disciplined service of others out of love’.⁸⁹ He presents eleven modes of apostolic spirituality, including ‘patience, passive alertness to others, a sense of an intimate providence, a sense of belonging to God, constant hunger to serve others, finding God in others’.⁹⁰ As a result, Hassel sees apostolic spirituality as an expression of one’s extension of God’s love towards God’s people; ‘it appears to be an availability to others which is adaptive to their needs, hopes, joys and sorrows’.⁹¹

Hassel’s idea of apostolic spirituality coincides with hospitality and compassion, which are forms of Christian acceptance of others, as discussed in chapter two. However, regarding the differentiation between interiority and exterior living, Philip Sheldrake argues that inner and outer ways of seeking God cannot be polarised because they are

⁸³ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.169, SE, [#230]-[#237]

⁸⁴ SE, [#235], [#236]

⁸⁵ SE, [#230], [#231]

⁸⁶ David J. Hassel, “The Feel of Apostolic Contemplation-in-Action”, *Review for Religious*, vol.40, (1981/3), pp.330-331

⁸⁷ Ibid., pp.326-327

⁸⁸ Ibid., p.331

⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁹⁰ Ibid., pp.331-333

⁹¹ Ibid.

‘complementary dimensions of human life’⁹² and ‘exterior living is resourced by interiority’.⁹³ Thus, spirituality needs to be identified as integrating inner and outer life and apostolic spirituality can also be gained through contemplation of Christ’s life and living with that spirituality. In this sense, apostolic spirituality seems to be an active way to love God and love one’s neighbours which is the direction of Christian life living within the Gospel values of faith, hope, and love.

To sum up, the Exercises are offered as a spiritual practice to enrich Christian life in service to God, through the achievement of spiritual freedom in God and through imitating Jesus’ life. The Exercises are a major part of Ignatian spiritual direction and have invited growing interest and participation from among contemporary Protestants. Accordingly, the following section will examine why this might be so.

4.2. The Reformed tradition and Ignatian Spiritual Exercises

4.2.1. Ignatian Spiritual Exercises in current Protestantism

Lonsdale gives three reasons to explain why Ignatian spiritual direction appeals to Protestants: a) it guides the individual to reflect on his or her personal life through contemplation of Christ’s life; b) it encourages the use of Scripture for discernment; and c) it acts as a source from which the individual may draw personal conversion and commitment.⁹⁴ Lonsdale also explains that, like the Protestant tradition, Ignatian spiritual direction puts an emphasis on personal trust in God and in Christ.⁹⁵ In light of Lonsdale’s explanation, it is interesting to note that the number of the Protestants in the UK and US who are attracted to the Exercises and who participate in the various types of Ignatian spiritual direction has been growing. Joyce Huggett describes this phenomenon by noting that ‘Ignatian spirituality hooks Protestants’.⁹⁶ She suggests that this demonstrates that the

⁹² Philip F Sheldrake, “Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly: A Dialectic of the Mystical and Prophetic”, *Spiritus* 3 (2003), p.23

⁹³ *Ibid.*, p.22

⁹⁴ David Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit: The Art of Discernment*, (Notre Dame, Indiana: Ave Maria Press, 1992), pp.164-165

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

⁹⁶ Joyce Huggett, “Why Ignatian Spirituality Hooks Protestants”, *The Way Supplement* 68 (Summer 1990), pp.22-34

Holy Spirit draws people not only by the treasures of their own background but by new-found treasures: stillness, contemplative prayer, and the use of the imagination.⁹⁷

There is limited research about Protestant experiences of the Exercises, although Huggett is an exception. She believes that interest in the Exercises within Protestant circles emerged from the charismatic movement of the 1960s and 70s.⁹⁸ In other words, since that movement, there has been a hunger for walking with God and for prayer that fosters this. Furthermore, there is a deeper understanding between Catholics and Protestants, as both seek to learn from one another's traditions; as Huggett notes, 'Protestants have been finding answers to their deeper quest for God in Catholic prayer and spirituality and Catholics have learned the Protestant passion for the Bible'.⁹⁹

Huggett identifies four reasons why the Exercises are attractive to Protestants.¹⁰⁰ First, the Exercises are so biblically based that they can be re-named 'Biblical Exercises'.¹⁰¹ This shows Protestants how knowledge of the 'head' can have an impact on one's innermost being (or 'heart'); in particular, the prayer with imagination shows individuals how to encounter Christ in the Gospel.¹⁰² Secondly, evangelical Protestants can relate to and recognize as familiar the language that the Exercises use.¹⁰³ For instance, 'conversion' is a popular word amongst evangelicals, so they are fascinated by the 'continuous conversion', which the Exercises suggest.¹⁰⁴ Thirdly, charismatic Protestants desire to satisfy their thirst for God and to search for the living water of the Spirit; in addition, they emphasise the spiritual battle and spiritual discernment.¹⁰⁵ In this sense, they feel a connection with the Exercises. Fourthly, contemplative Protestants yearn and seek a personal relationship with God and they feel at home with the Application of the Senses in the Exercises that invite them to stop thinking and to sense and gaze instead.¹⁰⁶

⁹⁷ Ibid., p.22

⁹⁸ Ibid., p.22

⁹⁹ Ibid., p.23

¹⁰⁰ Ibid. pp.25-28

¹⁰¹ Ibid., p.25

¹⁰² Ibid., p.33

¹⁰³ Ibid., p.26

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., p.27

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid., p.28

These four explanations as to why Protestants are fascinated by the Exercises seem to coincide with the spirituality that modern Christians look for. Thus, the Exercises, which aim to allow Christians to encounter Christ deep in their hearts and to satiate hunger for a personal relationship with God, can be a means for modern Christians in the Protestant tradition to grow in their relationship with God and their holy lives.

Alongside the four reasons explained above, Huggett also describes the insights that the Spiritual Exercises offer to Protestants. First, listening to God through ‘feeling’ enables them to open up to God’s healing touch and to see themselves from an integrative perspective: that is, an integration of body, mind and spirit.¹⁰⁷ Secondly, the contemplation of the Exercises arouses awareness and deep sorrow for human sins since they invite a person to reflect on their past sins and human sins within the perspective of God’s merciful love.¹⁰⁸ However, Huggett stresses that contemplation encourages realizing more deeply God’s mercy and love for humanity, rather than focusing on human sins. Thirdly, the balanced decision-making, which the Exercises teach, is welcomed by Protestants.¹⁰⁹ Fourthly, the ‘daily examen’¹¹⁰ allows their everyday lives to become populated with life-changing experiences because the examen aids them to find the work of the Holy Spirit in their daily lives and life events.¹¹¹ Besides the Protestants’ positive experiences of the Exercises, Huggett describes the qualms raised by some Protestants about the prayers of the Exercises: for example, the colloquy (conversation) to Mary can cause disquiet for Protestants.¹¹² Thus, she suggests that they pray to God the Trinity, rather than praying to the Father, the Son, and Mary.¹¹³ She also states that those misgivings need to be treated with sensitivity and so spiritual directors ought to have adequate training to address this issue.¹¹⁴

Huggett clearly summarizes Protestant responses to the Exercises. However, her account does not seem to explain in depth some elements of the Exercises relating to

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., p.29

¹⁰⁸ Ibid.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid., p.31

¹¹⁰ This is the daily practice of reviewing actions and events of the day. Through this, a person can look at what he or she was doing, what the intention was, in the light of faith and reflect on ‘how things stand between me and the Lord’. In Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.210

¹¹¹ Ibid., p.32

¹¹² Ibid., p.33

¹¹³ Ibid.

Protestant theology: sin and apostolic spirituality. Modern Christians are thought to feel uncomfortable with guilt, which is aroused by an emphasis on sin. For that reason, the psychological term *hurt* is used more than the theological term *sin*. However, Bible traditions about human beings as sinful beings stimulate us to contemplate our original position as creatures. In connection with this, the Exercises enable us to see our creaturehood and sinfulness from the viewpoint of Jesus Christ; that is, we are able to discover Christ who has loved us in spite of our sins, and thereby come to trust more in God.

In addition, the Exercises allow us to consider the social structure and human relations in which we are placed, for the Exercises propose that we reflect on ourselves in light of the history and all dimensions of our lives, mirroring the life of Christ. Such practice enables us to see ourselves in communities and societies. This awareness fosters our participation in the service of God in the world; this is ‘apostolic spirituality’, which coincides with the social responsibility of Christians. Social responsibility is a role for Christians being made in the image of God; for, as discussed in the previous chapter, human beings, as the image of God, have a social aspect, and through participating in activities for society, Christians can collaborate as a partner with God in this world.¹¹⁵

In her discussion of the significance of the Exercises for Protestants, Huggett does not mention Reformed believers; instead, she uses the term ‘Protestants’ in its general sense. Thus, it will be helpful to consider whether the positive responses to the Exercises among Protestants are mirrored among Reformed believers.¹¹⁶ The next section, therefore, will explore the usefulness and prudence of the Exercises for Reformed believers. The practical research of this dissertation is conducted using interviews with Presbyterians; but before moving on to this, some aspects of John Calvin’s theological understanding in relation to the Exercises need to be explored. Thus, the next section will begin by examining the similarities and differences between the theology of John Calvin and Ignatius in relation to the Exercises.

¹¹⁴ Ibid.

¹¹⁵ See, 3.2.1.1.

¹¹⁶ It is also applicable to the UK and South Korea.

4.2.2. Comparing the theology of Calvin and Ignatius

There has been a common understanding that Calvin and Ignatius were in opposition and had nothing in common with each other, because they were representative of the Reformation and Counter Reformation respectively. However, both studied at the same college during the age of the Reformation, and there seem to be some theological and spiritual similarities between the two. The following discussion will focus on seven points of similarity between the two theologians, although it is possible that more similarities may exist.

First, both men studied in the College of Montaigu during the same historical period.¹¹⁷ It is not certain what they shared in terms of their learning at that College,¹¹⁸ however, it can be assumed that both participated in the contemporary academic atmosphere. Secondly, both Calvin and Ignatius put emphasis on *service for God's glory* within their work. Calvin clarifies in his *Catechism* that human beings were created 'in order to acknowledge our Creator's majesty and to receive it and esteem it, once acknowledged, with all fear, love, and reverence',¹¹⁹ as a result, 'we will serve to advance his glory'.¹²⁰ Ignatius also declares in *Spiritual Exercises* that 'human beings are created to praise, reverence, and serve God our Lord',¹²¹ and 'the motive of desiring or keeping this thing or that be solely the service, honour and glory of the Divine Majesty'.¹²² One can suggest that such expressions may be read as a confession of their faith; therefore, it can be said that their faith and lives also are summarized as *service for glory of God*, as described in their work.

Thirdly, both Ignatius and Calvin underline the main characteristic of Christ's life as humility. For each of them, Jesus' suffering on the Cross is the summit of Christ's humility. Calvin clearly states that Christ 'had no need to undertake the bearing of the

¹¹⁷ Herman J. Selderhuis, Albert Gootjes, trans., *John Calvin: A Pilgrim's Life* (Nottingham, England: Inter-Varsity Press, 2009), p.13

¹¹⁸ Brendan McConvery, "Remembering John Calvin and Ignatius Loyola at Maynooth", in Brendan McConvery, ed., *The Witness of John Calvin and Ignatius Loyola* (Dublin: Veritas, 2011) p. 8

¹¹⁹ I. John Hesselink, *Calvin's First Catechism: A Commentary*, (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997), p.7

¹²⁰ Calvin, *Institutes*. 3.7.2.

¹²¹ SE, [#23]

¹²² SE, [#16]

cross except to attest and prove his obedience to the Father'¹²³ and also 'help much in promoting our salvation'.¹²⁴ Similarly, the focus on Jesus in the Second Week of the Exercises is spiritual poverty, which proposes 'humility, generosity and spiritual poverty as the call made to every Christian to serve the Kingdom'.¹²⁵

Fourthly, *self-denial* for Calvin and *indifference* for Ignatius appear to be the most significant values of spiritual freedom. The idea of indifference that Ignatius presents as forming the core of Christian's spiritual life in Principle and Foundation in *Spiritual Exercises* seems to overlap with Calvin's concept of self-denial. Calvin elucidates 'the sum of the Christian life' as 'the denial of ourselves'.¹²⁶ Calvin's foundation of *self-denial* is that 'we are not our own master, but belong to God',¹²⁷ and he defines such awareness of our self-denial as the duty of believers;¹²⁸ therefore, self-denial involves our devotion to God.¹²⁹ Calvin describes the meaning of *self-denial* as:

For him who has learned to look to God in all things that he must do, at the same time avoids all vain thoughts. When it has once taken possession of their hearts, it leaves no place at all first either to pride, or arrogance, or ostentation; then either to avarice, or desire, or lasciviousness, or effeminacy, or to other evils that our self-love spawns'.¹³⁰

Thus, Calvin clearly states that 'the sole haven of salvation is to be wise in nothing and to will nothing through ourselves but to follow the leading of the Lord alone'.¹³¹ Calvin stresses that Christians need 'to remove the two obstacles that chiefly hinder: namely, ungodliness, to which by nature we are too much inclined; and second, worldly desires, which extend more widely'.¹³² Calvin also explains that self-denial involves 'the right attitude toward our fellow men'.¹³³ In other words, he emphasizes the need to tear out from our inward parts 'love of strife and love of self'¹³⁴ and love neighbours without being

¹²³ *Institutes*, 3.8.2.

¹²⁴ *Institutes*, 3.8.1.

¹²⁵ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.76

¹²⁶ *Institutes*, 3.7.1-10.

¹²⁷ *Institutes*, 3.7.1.

¹²⁸ *Institutes*, 3.7.1.

¹²⁹ *Institutes*, 3.7.2.

¹³⁰ *Institutes*, 3.7.2.

¹³¹ *Institutes*, 3.7.1.

¹³² *Institutes*, 3.7.3.

¹³³ *Institutes*, 3.7.4.

¹³⁴ *Institutes*, 3.7.4.

‘dependent upon manner of men but looks to God’¹³⁵ That is, he suggests that ‘we remember not to consider men’s evil intention but to look upon the image of God in them’.¹³⁶ The meaning of *self-denial* for Calvin seems to coincide with Ignatius’s understanding of *indifference*, which has detachment of one’s desire at its core; both are linked with spiritual freedom to direct oneself only to Christ and God.

Fifthly, both Calvin and Ignatius emphasize the significance of repentance to God in the Christian life as the response to God’s forgiving love. Calvin explains that repentance is a ‘fruit of faith’,¹³⁷ and a ‘turning of life to God’¹³⁸ that ‘requires a transformation not only in outward works, but in the soul itself’.¹³⁹ In a similar way, a purpose of *Spiritual Exercises* is ‘a conversion of heart resulting in a new quality or a new direction of life’.¹⁴⁰ Thus, for both Calvin and Ignatius, repentance involves ‘mortification of the flesh and vivification of the spirit’; in this way, repentance comes to be related with self-denial.¹⁴¹

Sixthly, both men highlight *union with God*. However, while the quality of Calvin’s understanding is mystical union with God *in Christ*, Ignatius’s distinctiveness is rooted in his own mystical experiences, such as Christ appearing to him. Calvin, in terms of *our union with God*, stresses that ‘we ought first to cleave unto him so that, infused with his holiness, we may follow whither he calls’¹⁴², while Ignatius’s focus is on ‘loving service in union with God’.¹⁴³ The hope for *union with God* for both Calvin and Ignatius is to dedicate oneself to service for the Kingdom of God.

Finally, Calvin and Ignatius both share a similar theological understanding of God’s reconciliation with humanity through Christ. Calvin explains that Christ was ‘the Mediator’¹⁴⁴ and ‘his task was to restore us to God’;¹⁴⁵ in other words, Christ became man ‘to restore the fallen world and to succour lost men’.¹⁴⁶ Thus, Calvin identifies the office

¹³⁵ *Institutes*, 3.7.6.

¹³⁶ *Institutes*, 3.7.6.

¹³⁷ *Institutes*, 3.3.1.

¹³⁸ *Institutes*, 3.3.6.

¹³⁹ *Institutes*, 3.3.6.

¹⁴⁰ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.1

¹⁴¹ *Institutes*, 3.3.8.

¹⁴² *Institutes*, 3.6.2.

¹⁴³ Au, “An Ignatian Path to Gratitude”, p.76

¹⁴⁴ *Institutes*, 2.12.1.

¹⁴⁵ *Institutes*, 2.12.1.

¹⁴⁶ *Institutes*, 2.12.4.

of Christ the Mediator with Christ the reconciler by describing that ‘the prophets in preaching about him promised that he would be the reconciler of God and man’.¹⁴⁷ Ignatius also asks us to meditate on Christ nailed to the Cross in the form of imaginative prayer and to ask Christ ‘how it came about that the Creator made himself a human being and from eternal life came to temporal death, and thus to die for my sins’ during the prayer on sins in the First Week of the Exercises.¹⁴⁸ Although Ignatius does not use the terms ‘Mediator’ or ‘reconciler’, his idea implies Christ’s reconciliation ministry because he presents Christ’s incarnation and the Cross as God’s redeeming work for fallen humanity. In this way, both seem to share a similar notion of Christ’s reconciling work for humanity.

Besides the similarities described above, there are also differences between the two theologians, the most prominent being that they belonged to different denominations: Reformation and Catholic. Secondly, Calvin places emphasis on the knowledge of God in his work *Institutes of the Christian Religion*,¹⁴⁹ while Ignatius stresses the experience of God in *Spiritual Exercises*. Calvin’s intellectual approach towards knowledge of God distinguishes him from the affective approach of Ignatius. This is because *Institutes* takes the form of a sequence of lectures to present the right faith, whereas *Spiritual Exercises* is a handbook for spiritual practice. With regard to this difference, Tetlow suggests that *Institutes* is ‘a full exploration of all Christian doctrine and Ignatius adduced theology only when he wanted to clarify or to emphasize some practical directive’.¹⁵⁰ He explains the reason as being because ‘Ignatius finished the substance of the book while still a layman and uninstructed in theology’.¹⁵¹ However, both *Institutes* and *Spiritual Exercises* are intended to help advance the Christian spiritual life.

As discussed above, Calvin and Ignatius have a similar perspective of the Christian pursuit of God and Christian life in the world. Moreover, they share the ideas of God the Creator, Christ the Reconciler, and the Holy Spirit working in our daily life. Consequently, it can be said that while differences can be found in the details of their writings, they in fact share similarities in their broad sense of Christian spiritual formation, the true faith, and service for God. In this way, I believe that the suggestions made by Huggett with

¹⁴⁷ *Institutes*, 2.12.4.

¹⁴⁸ *SE*, [#53]

¹⁴⁹ *Institutes*, 1.1.1-6.

¹⁵⁰ Tetlow, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola*, p.25

¹⁵¹ *Ibid.*

regard to Protestants can be also applicable to believers in the Reformed tradition. Hence, the next section will consider which elements of the Exercises are useful as a means for personal reconciliation within the Reformed tradition. However, such elements of personal reconciliation also might be applicable to Protestants and Christians in other traditions.

4.3. How do the Exercises relate to personal reconciliation?

The key themes of the Exercises described in the previous section seem to facilitate one's personal reconciliation because they involve a person's rediscovery of his or her creation by God, a person's deep encounter with Christ, and the experience of finding the Spirit dwelling in his or her life. This section will explore these themes in relation to the experience of personal reconciliation.

4.3.1. Spiritual freedom

4.3.1.1. Features of spiritual freedom

Spiritual freedom is the key purpose of the Exercises, as seen in section 4.1.2. The Exercises underline the process of human development and discipline for moving beyond the attachment of desire, but this does not seem to be achieved by human effort. Furthermore, according to Calvin, spiritual freedom is accompanied by justification and the purpose of this freedom is to promote, for Christians, the practice of godliness for sanctification.¹⁵² Thus, inner freedom – ‘enjoyment in God’¹⁵³ – is caused by the justifying grace of Christ and the sanctifying grace of the Holy Spirit. Spiritual freedom involves ‘dependency on God’ and direction, disposition, and submissive attitude toward God.¹⁵⁴ English points out that, in the course of achieving spiritual freedom, a person is able ‘to become aware of the dimensions of *unfreedom* in themselves’.¹⁵⁵ Such awareness, according to English, leads to the ability to feel regret about the past and to have great hope for the future.¹⁵⁶ Nevertheless, he highlights the work of the Holy Spirit in the exercises for freedom, and declares that this point distinguishes the Exercises from

¹⁵² *Institutes*, 3.19.1-2.

¹⁵³ I have used Volf's expression from *The End of Memory*, p.16

¹⁵⁴ English, *Spiritual Freedom*, p.24

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, p.30

¹⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

Pelagianism.¹⁵⁷ English's idea of spiritual freedom shows that it can advance one's personal reconciliation in the sense of divine forgiveness for the past and hope for the future.

In the Principle and Foundation, which presents the fundamental characteristics of spiritual freedom through its description of indifference, the work of Christ and the Holy Spirit are not mentioned. Nevertheless, throughout the Exercises, a retreatant is able to discover spiritual freedom through Jesus' life and his reconciling work and can also learn discernment to find God's will in his or her life. In this regard, it can be said that the Exercises encourage a retreatant to seek spiritual freedom in their relationship with the Trinity. Moreover, the way to achieve spiritual freedom is through having a personal encounter with Christ and finding God's hope through prayer. This suggests that the Exercises facilitate one's personal reconciliation, as they allow one to see the past afresh and to envision the future through an awareness of *unfreedom* in oneself. This grace to view one's past with new sight and to reinterpret it is referred to as 'life experienced as graced history'.¹⁵⁸ According to English, understanding a person's life as a graced history is connected to a change of identity because the person is able to see his or her whole life in relation to God.¹⁵⁹ Such grace can stem from the freedom given by the Holy Spirit; with this grace, one develops a new or much clearer identity of the self as a child of God and a co-operator with Christ and one gains the ability to love other creations more in the Spirit.

4.3.1.2. *Desire and freedom*

Spiritual freedom as 'power of choice and ability to say yes to the movement of the Spirit'¹⁶⁰ needs to be considered in relation to human desire; for, as explained by Ivens, *indifference*, fundamental to spiritual freedom, is related to a deeper desire given by God; namely, how to follow Christ and live by the values of Gospels.¹⁶¹ Sheldrake states that the whole point of human spiritual activity is to move away from disordered affection; this movement progresses towards indifference. He describes *indifference* as 'not a cold absence of feeling or a dispassionate detachment, rather it involves reaching out towards

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., p.30, p.21

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., p.261

¹⁵⁹ Ibid., pp. 241-246

¹⁶⁰ Roger Haight, "Grace and the Exercises", *Person and Society in the Ignatian Exercises (The Way Supplement*, 76, Spring 1993), p.48

the human deepest desire'.¹⁶² In search of the deepest desire, Sheldrake explains that the person has 'a multitude of desires, wants and needs';¹⁶³ he or she can move through the initial desires towards the deeper level of desire in prayer. He refers to this journey as *discernment*,¹⁶⁴ suggesting that the deeper desire involves 'what is the truest within the human being'¹⁶⁵ and having 'a harmonious relationship with self as the genuine human'.¹⁶⁶ Thus, he argues that other levels of desire are not appropriate; rather, they are 'the staging post on that journey',¹⁶⁷ and discernment is a way to find the genuine self, with the deeper desire forming the core dynamic of the journey towards discernment.¹⁶⁸ The deeper desire discussed by Sheldrake coincides with Ivens' notion of underlining life with the values of Gospels; for Sheldrake's concept of the deepest desire for Christians involves the desire to live life as Jesus' disciple, with faith, hope, and love in God. Thus, the journey from initial desires to deeper desire can be said to be the work of the Spirit; such movement is connected with spiritual freedom and enables one to find oneself and advance one's personal reconciliation.

Finding deeper desire can also be considered in the context of the 'Formation of Christian Character', suggested by Simon Harak.¹⁶⁹ The journey of becoming aware of deeper desire involves a change of human consciousness into that of a faithful Christian and follower of Jesus. For Harak, the transformation of desire can be explained in the term *passion* that, alongside emotion, is part of affection and the 'ground for the human moral life'.¹⁷⁰ In order to depict the formation process of passion, he uses an explanation from psychology. According to Harak, passion is formed from an interaction with the caregiver in babyhood,¹⁷¹ and 'is moved by the meaningful interaction', because one 'becomes disposed toward certain kinds of interactions with an other'.¹⁷² Thus, he elaborates on the

¹⁶¹ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.32

¹⁶² Philip F. Sheldrake, *Befriending Our Desires*, (London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd, 2001), p.113

¹⁶³ *Ibid.*, p.106

¹⁶⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, p.107

¹⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p.103

¹⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, p.107

¹⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.103-104 I will discuss discernment in detail in section 4.3.3.

¹⁶⁹ Harak offers this term in the title of his book *Virtuous Passions: the Formation of Christian Character*.

¹⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, p.3

¹⁷¹ *Ibid.*, p.23

¹⁷² *Ibid.*, p.25

formation process of passion using the example of battered spouses growing up in abusive families; they learn these patterns and tolerate them in their marriage.¹⁷³ He signifies, therefore, that the patterns acquired throughout one's life will remain unless they are intentionally changed.¹⁷⁴ In explanation of passion in relation to the formation of Christian character, he highlights the need to be given, as a gift, the power of Jesus to become a true Christian; that is, Christians are able to receive Christian virtue and passion through participating in a relationship with God by means of prayer with Jesus.¹⁷⁵ In this sense, the Exercises are a practical way of fostering an encounter with Christ, which transforms and trains the wrong passions into the right passions.¹⁷⁶ As a result, the transformation of passion within Christians can be identified with redirection towards God and freedom in Christ; both forming key parts of personal reconciliation, with the Exercises functioning to serve this transformative journey.

4.3.1.3. *Understanding suffering*

Harak suggests that, for Ignatius, the person begins a retreat or a transformative journey to know personal desire because his or her passion will be caught up in Jesus' self-giving love.¹⁷⁷ He explains, therefore, that the suffering and self-giving love of Jesus will bring about the power of liberation and healing in the person so that he or she can be more closely bonded with Jesus and have the passion of justice and compassion.¹⁷⁸ In this regard, Harak's ideas coincide with some of the themes of reconciliation. To reinterpret suffering in personal life in light of the suffering of Jesus produces a sense of liberation and healing, and allows one to have an interest in matters of justice beyond oneself. Harak indicates that justice is related to restoring the dignity of the wronged.¹⁷⁹ In other words, as seen in chapter two, since suffering involves experiences of injustice, passion for justice opens one's eyes not only to individual justice but also to social justice. Consequently, Harak suggests that the passion for justice is moved by the *forgiving love* of Christ

¹⁷³ Ibid.

¹⁷⁴ Ibid.

¹⁷⁵ Ibid., p.46

¹⁷⁶ Ibid., p.101

¹⁷⁷ Ibid., p.103

¹⁷⁸ Ibid., p.119

¹⁷⁹ Ibid., p.135

because Christ transformed the violence of political and religious structures on the Cross and at his Resurrection.¹⁸⁰ In this way, forgiveness is a priority for the pursuit of justice.

As to the explanation of suffering above, Kenneth Overberg argues that ‘God wills that suffering be overcome wherever it occurs’.¹⁸¹ In other words, God wants Christians to respond to suffering with faith and to come to victory in the Resurrection of Jesus. Thus, Overberg suggests that the pain and horror produced by suffering should not be avoided and denied but admitted, whatever the cause.¹⁸² He clearly states that ‘suffering can lead one to deeper maturity and wisdom, but never glorify suffering’.¹⁸³ In light of this, he shows the necessity of grieving and the healing of suffering, using the Psalms as an example for directees.¹⁸⁴ In addition, he stresses the necessity of reaching out to suffering people with an awareness of suffering in relation to God, because certain kinds of suffering stem from ‘evil choices such as war, injustice, and oppression’.¹⁸⁵ In this understanding, suffering and justice are congruent because the awareness of these evil choices ‘inspires human action like the change of heart and repentance’.¹⁸⁶ Furthermore, Overberg explains the mystery of suffering, that is, developing a personal trust in God can change a person’s question from ‘Why’ to ‘How can I respond? What can we do now?’¹⁸⁷ In other words, the mystery of suffering is a transformed ability, which can lead to decision and action for Christ. Jesus’ suffering and Resurrection transforms one’s own suffering into a life with a broader and more generous mind and with a passion for justice.

In the understanding of suffering from the Christian perspective, the spiritual freedom which can be gained in union with the suffering and resurrected Christ, plays a pivotal role for personal reconciliation. This is because one’s view of Christ and the attitude to imitate Jesus’ life in one’s personal life leads a person to see his or her suffering in Christ’s suffering and to respond ‘yes’ to Christ’s calling. Such a response is not easy, but that is why the response should come from the Spirit. Therefore, the only thing required of a person is opening up to the work of the Spirit so that suffering in his or her life becomes a

¹⁸⁰ Ibid., p.138

¹⁸¹ Kenneth Overberg, ‘The Mystery of God and Suffering’, *The Way* 50/3 (July 2011), p.85

¹⁸² Ibid., p.87

¹⁸³ Ibid.

¹⁸⁴ Ibid.

¹⁸⁵ Ibid.

¹⁸⁶ Ibid.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid., p.88

resource for spiritual growth and sanctification and enables him or her to respond to others' suffering with generosity. One element of un-freedom in a person's freedom is sin. Nonetheless, a person experiences conversion when he or she meets God's forgiveness; therefore, conversion is a path leading to experience in the journey towards spiritual freedom. In the next section, conversion will be considered.

4.3.2. Conversion

Lonsdale expresses conversion of heart as 'a crucial change, the beginning of a new way of seeing and behaving' that takes place during the making of the Exercises.¹⁸⁸ Thus, conversion can be described as having the consciousness and viewpoint of a Christian. Lonsdale explains that this conversion is caused by an awareness of the unconditional love of God towards us and it can happen in the course of the Exercises, as we are drawn freely 'to surrender and commit ourselves in love to Jesus and the Kingdom of God'.¹⁸⁹ For that reason, this conversion brings about the change of one's image of God and it involves being liberated from fear, sin, anxiety, and other destructive factors.¹⁹⁰ With regard to conversion, Katherine Cassidy believes that the Exercises are designed to further complete commitment of ourselves to Christ; retreatants are drawn to be aware of themselves as sinners, to encounter Jesus on the Cross, and to look to themselves for conversion in the First Week.¹⁹¹ Therefore, she suggests that retreatants come to look for forgiveness and accept it, and are invited to the gift of freedom.¹⁹² She presents the signs of conversion as 'the sense of God's active love and experience of themselves as a loved sinner and as born anew'.¹⁹³ The prayer of the First Week focuses on the sins and conversion resulting from the encounter with God's mercy; the experience of God's mercy rather than conversion is the main purpose of the First Week, but conversion can occur in the First Week and it is a grace given throughout the Exercises.

In relation to prayer for one's sins, Ivens highlights conversion of heart as a purpose of the Exercises, viewing the Exercises as a process enabling freedom from disordered drives

¹⁸⁸ Lonsdale, *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear*, p.137

¹⁸⁹ Ibid.

¹⁹⁰ Ibid.

¹⁹¹ Katherine Cassidy, "Conversion Dynamics of the Spiritual Exercises", *Review for Religious* (November-December, 1986), p.927

¹⁹² Ibid., p.926

¹⁹³ Ibid.

through conversion of heart.¹⁹⁴ He identifies sin as a negative power that is destructive of our relationships with God, ourselves, and the world.¹⁹⁵ However, he underlines that the Exercises make us see our sins from God's viewpoint and in God's merciful love.¹⁹⁶ In other words, God wants to reconcile with us through the reconciling death of Christ and the work of the Spirit. Thus, Ivens argues that, in the First Week, retreatants are able to experience 'the grace of conversion arising out of the heart-breaking experience of being loved and forgiven'.¹⁹⁷

In search of the conversion experience, Gerard Hughes presents repentance as a grace of the Exercises. Hughes expresses repentance as 'turning away from self-idolatry and letting God be God in us, the God of compassion, who so loves all that he has created that he came to us in Jesus and gave his life for the life of all of us'.¹⁹⁸ While explaining repentance as an acceptance of that invitation and sin as rejecting it, he suggests some characteristics of true conversion: 'Being free from self-preoccupation, bringing joy and inner freedom, welcoming criticism and learning from it, bringing understanding, tolerance and hope, bringing compassion and sensitivity to injustice, and feeling drawn to God'.¹⁹⁹

As discussed above, the conversion experience is caused by the experience of forgiveness from and reconciliation with God, which are themes of personal reconciliation. The conversion experience produces healing, reconciliation with God, a sense of being free from guilt, compassion for others, and hope for life through a unique and personal experience of the salvific grace of Christ; this is also the experience of personal reconciliation. Furthermore, the deeper understanding of sins in the First Week incorporates personal moral sins and ontological sin as rejection of God's love. Thus, Ivens clarifies that, for the awareness of sins, retreatants need 'a moral education adequate for their time'.²⁰⁰ Moreover, he indicates that retreatants are able to learn social structural sins as well as personal sins because the nature of sins corrupts and exerts a bad influence

¹⁹⁴ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, pp.1-2

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p.44

¹⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁸ Gerard W. Hughes, *God of Surprises*, 2nd ed., (London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd., 1996), p.70

¹⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, pp.75-76

²⁰⁰ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.44

upon human relations and social structures beyond individuals,²⁰¹ accordingly he implies that retreatants need ‘a contemporary understanding of the person in relation to society’.²⁰² Thus, it can be said that the meditation of sins enlarges the personal perception of sins to include the individual and social; such an expanded understanding of sins allows the person to consider the hope of God in his or her life within the world. This deeper and broader awareness of sin and God’s will is related to the change of personal identity and of the image of God, self, and the world; for, the person becomes a Christian dressed in Christ and the person is a being who is living in the world.

Regarding these changes to the retreatant’s images of God, self, and the world, English suggests that Christian transformation involves ‘a person’s relations with the communities’ since ‘the change of the self-identity involves a person’s whole being’.²⁰³ Thus, he indicates that the change of the retreatant’s identity as a Christian happens throughout the Exercises, so there is a change of his or her image, ‘not only of God, but also of the human person and all creation’.²⁰⁴ Such an extended consciousness eventually leads the retreatant to find God being present in all things and to act as a social being in the community, as discussed in chapter three. Thus, the conversion experience involves repentance, being forgiven, forming a new identity, and changing one’s images of God, self, and the world. These themes constituting the conversion experience form the kernel of personal reconciliation. This experience can be a basis for apostolic spirituality, which can lead to a collaboration in God’s reconciling work for the world, because the expanded awareness as a social being (as one aspect of the image of God) draws the directee to find his or her vocation in the community and society.

4.3.3. Discernment: finding God’s will

As described above, spiritual freedom is the ability to make life-giving decisions from God’s viewpoint. For this reason, spiritual freedom has a great deal to do with discernment in the Exercises. Discernment as a pivotal part in the Ignatian way allows the person to find God’s will and to be shaped and led by the word of God; for it is a means ‘to read the

²⁰¹ Ibid., p.52

²⁰² Ibid., p.44

²⁰³ Ibid., p.242

²⁰⁴ Ibid., p.246

circumstances of everyday life through the lens of God's word'.²⁰⁵ Consequently, discernment is necessary for both decision-making in special circumstances and living as a disciple of Christ in one's ordinary life. In other words, discernment has to do with finding one's vocation and the orientation of one's everyday life. In this regard, discernment can function as a means of personal reconciliation in finding a way to live in accordance with God's intentions. Regarding the relationship between reconciliation and discernment, Sheldrake, positioning the 'Christian vocation of reconciliation at the heart of discipleship',²⁰⁶ suggests that 'reconciliation demands sound discernment' and therefore 'the long Christian tradition of discernment teaches a process of prayerful and critical reflection on human experience as the basis for right choice and action'.²⁰⁷ Lavinia Byrne indicates that the person who has learnt how to discern God's will through the Exercises is able to search for and find God's will in all people, places, and events within his or her life.²⁰⁸ With regard to the significance of discernment in the Exercises, Frank Houdek identifies the purpose of the dialogue of spiritual direction as discernment.²⁰⁹ Thus, this section will deal with the meaning and purpose of discernment, and the rule of discernment.

4.3.3.1. *The meaning and purpose of discernment*

In his discussion of the meaning of discernment, Au identifies it in terms of knowing a person's calling given by God.²¹⁰ He indicates that Christians 'are called to be participants in God's project on earth' and 'a central purpose of the Exercises is to help each of us to discern how this call is to take particular form in the concrete reality of our life'.²¹¹ According to Lonsdale, Christians' process of discernment relating to finding God's will in their lives is difficult to understand because they try to know God's fixed *blueprint* for their lives.²¹² He clarifies that the effort to find this fixed blueprint can limit their freedom; therefore, he suggests that *God's hope or expectation* is better than God's will to refer to

²⁰⁵ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, p.51

²⁰⁶ Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, p.155

²⁰⁷ Ibid.

²⁰⁸ Lavinia Byrne, "Taking the Same...", *The Way Supplement 61* (1988), p.118

²⁰⁹ Frank J. Houdek, *Guided by the Spirit: A Jesuit Perspective on Spiritual Direction*, (Chicago: Loyola Press, 1996), p.7

²¹⁰ Au, "An Ignatian Path to Gratitude", p.74

²¹¹ Ibid.

²¹² Lonsdale, *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear*, p.91

God's purpose for us.²¹³ Whilst identifying discernment as 'a capacity to exercise their freedom to live fullness of life in the love of God',²¹⁴ he indicates that Christians need to deepen their senses to see where their Christian life is and wherein the Spirit leads.²¹⁵ Thus, Lonsdale contends that discernment involves the need 'to choose life between two paths, the one leading to fullness of life in the love of God, the other leading a direction that is ultimately dehumanizing and destructive'.²¹⁶ Regarding the meaning of discernment, Elizabeth Liebert also defines discernment as choosing life direction; she suggests that discernment is a continuous process revealed through personal growth, prayer, relationships, and choices within all aspects of one's life, and provides 'the data for the next discernment'.²¹⁷ This means that discernment involves the patterns of life; thus, Christians need to practice and train for right discernment.

In terms of the definitions above, discernment is referred to in the Exercises as *discernment of spirits*. Jules Toner identifies *discernment of spirits* as 'discernment among the inner movements of our minds and hearts to find and to interpret those that arise under the prompting of the Holy Spirit or the prompting of some spirit in opposition to the Holy Spirit or without the prompting of either of these'.²¹⁸ Thus, he suggests that we need to be cautiously concerned about evil spirits since it is the good spirits that will influence us in accordance with what the Holy Spirit wants; in these terms, most of the rules of the Exercises speak about how to defeat evil spirits when they act upon a person.²¹⁹ Toner sees evil spirits from a broad viewpoint: 'evil spirits include not only the created personal immaterial beings but also the dispositions of evil within ourselves, the evil structures of society, all that can be a source of inner movements contrary to what the Holy Spirit wishes to work in our lives through faith, love, and hope'.²²⁰ His conception of evil spirits seems to be in line with the notion of both personal sins and structural sins in the Exercises. Thus, such a comprehensive perception of evil spirits is helpful for seeing the work of the Holy Spirit as well as the work of evil spirits in a broader framework.

²¹³ Ibid.

²¹⁴ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, p.51

²¹⁵ Lonsdale, *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear*, p.95

²¹⁶ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, p.51

²¹⁷ Liebert, "The Process of Change in Spiritual Direction", pp.20-22

²¹⁸ Jules J. Toner, *Spirit of Light or Darkness?: A Casebook for Studying Discernment of Spirits*, (Saint Louis, MO: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1995), p.11

²¹⁹ Ibid.

²²⁰ Ibid., p.12

Concerning the process of discernment, Lonsdale states that ‘trust in God and sufficient freedom is necessary for good discernment’ and the components of the process of discernment are ‘assiduous prayer, adequate information, reflection on affective responses in relation to God, weighing the reasons, and confirmation’.²²¹ He highlights that discernment is not a matter of simple feelings, but a process of sifting through our thoughts and feelings; therefore, the harmonious balance of head and heart is required for this process.²²² Furthermore, Lonsdale presents the most significant factor of discernment as deeper feelings of relating to God.²²³ The feelings that are important for discernment, referred to as *mood, inner feeling, affective movement, or interior movement*, have two directions: consolation and desolation. These two interior movements will be explored below in detail.

4.3.3.2. *The Rules for discernment: consolation and desolation*

Spiritual Exercises shows the rules for discernment, according to the *New SCM Dictionary*; the purpose of this is:

To ensure that, within a context of a living relationship with God, religious experience, subjected to critical reflection, may be a basis for right choice and action and the need for discernment is rooted in fundamental ambiguities inherent in human moral and religious experience as such.²²⁴

Thus, such ambiguities should be reflected upon in order to identify God’s will and the source of interior movement. *Spiritual Exercises* explains that there are two kinds of interior movement: works of ‘good spirits’ and works of ‘evil spirits’.²²⁵ In relation to the purpose of discernment of these spirits, Liebert clarifies that this finally serves to find God’s will.²²⁶ With regard to the history of the practice of discernment, the discernment of spirits taught by Paul in the New Testament (Corinthians 2:6-16) was exercised by the desert fathers, who sought spiritual nurturance, and throughout the history of Christianity.²²⁷ Ignatius moved this process into a new stage. He named movement in

²²¹ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, p.63

²²² *Ibid.*, p.63, p.68

²²³ *Ibid.*, p.70

²²⁴ Sheldrake, ed., *The New SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, p.247

²²⁵ *SE*, [#314], [#315]

²²⁶ Liebert, “The Process of Change in Spiritual Direction”, p.122

²²⁷ John H. Wright, “Discernment of Spirits in the New Testament”, Kevin G. Culligan, ed., *Spiritual Direction*, p.172

accordance with the Spirit ‘spiritual consolation’ and against the Spirit ‘spiritual desolation’.²²⁸ Thus, the key feature of discernment is to discern God’s will and decide one’s choices and actions through judging which direction the interior movement leans towards.

According to Toner, *Spiritual Exercises* speaks of two kinds of Christians: *maturing Christians* and *regressing Christians*. As he states, ‘The maturing Christians are in accord with the Holy Spirit and the regressing Christians in discord’.²²⁹ Hence, the intention of the Holy Spirit in the regressing person ‘goes against the direction of the person’s life, cause[ing] a conversion; therefore there is a clash’.²³⁰ Toner clarifies that the significant factor of discernment is ‘the direction of a person’s life’,²³¹ not ‘a person’s measure of holiness’²³² nor ‘the gravity of the sins’.²³³ With regard to the two kinds of Christian, Lonsdale distinguishes ‘those who give little time or attention to God (the first group of people)’ from ‘those who give the fulfilment of the two great commandments to love God and one’s neighbour (the second group of people)’.²³⁴ These two different groups respond differently to the works of the Spirit and evil spirits.²³⁵ The movements prompted by evil spirits do not cause clashes in the regressing person. However, in the maturing person, the movement provoked by evil spirits ‘clashes with the direction of this person’s life and causes feelings of pain, sadness, confusion, and so forth’.²³⁶ On the other hand, the work of the Spirit mingles with ‘the disposition and direction of the person’s life and causes positive movements such as courage and energy to continue striving, peace and joy in doing so’.²³⁷ In relation to the norms of discernment in the two groups of Christians, Tetlow clearly states that ‘those seriously growing in the interior life will be tempted away from the good by something that seems on its face good’.²³⁸ Thus, their sense of

²²⁸ SE, [#316], [#317]

²²⁹ Jules J. Toner, *A Commentary on St. Ignatius’s Rules for the Discernment of Spirits: A Guide to the Principles and Practice*, (Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1982), pp.51-52

²³⁰ Toner, *Spirit of Light or Darkness?*, p.15

²³¹ *Ibid.*, p.14

²³² *Ibid.*, p.15

²³³ *Ibid.*, p.14

²³⁴ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, p.78

²³⁵ Toner, *Spirit of Light or Darkness?*, p.15

²³⁶ *Ibid.*

²³⁷ *Ibid.*

²³⁸ Tetlow, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola*, p.95

discernment should be more cautious because, for them, the work of evil spirits is more subtle.

Concerning the key features of the two interior movements, Fleming distinguishes spiritual consolation from spiritual desolation by illustrating the state of a person's inner life. Fleming's description of the features of spiritual consolation can be summarised as:

(a) We find ourselves on fire with the love of God so that we can freely give ourselves over to God; there is no competition with any human person or any created thing. In this mood, we begin to see everything and everyone in the context of God, the Creator and Giver of all good gifts; (b) We feel sorrow coming from a deep realization of ourselves as sinners before a compassionate God, or in the face of Jesus' Passion. Such awareness advances us better to praise, thank, and serve God; (c) We find our life of faith, hope, and love so strengthened and emboldened that the joy of serving God is foremost in our lives. In this movement, a deep peace arises by our living life as *being in our Father's house*.²³⁹

Fleming's explanation of the features of our interior state when we are in spiritual desolation can be summarised as:

(a) We find ourselves enmeshed in a certain turmoil of spirit or feel ourselves weighed down by a heavy darkness; (b) We experience a lack of faith or hope in the distaste for prayer or for any spiritual activity and we know a certain restlessness or tepidity in our carrying on in the service of God; (c) We experience the opposite of what has been described as spiritual consolation, including thoughts of rebelliousness, despair, or selfishness.²⁴⁰

Fleming notes that the mood of desolation is a clear indication of the influences of evil spirits upon a person's interior.²⁴¹ Nonetheless, Hughes highlights that 'desolation will only be experienced by those whose lives are essentially directed to the praise, reverence and service of God'; for, 'a person turned away from God in the core of their being does not feel any pain by the felt absence of God, although they may experience the occasional sting of remorse'.²⁴² This means that Christians who are striving to live holy lives can also be influenced by evil spirits, so they should be carefully aware of their inner lives. Moreover, a person in desolation should be aware of and seek to overwhelm their desolation; he or she will be able to do so with the help of the Spirit. Thus, it is important

²³⁹ Fleming, *Draw Me into Your Friendship*, pp.249-251

²⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p.251

²⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p.263

²⁴² Hughes, *God of Surprises*, p.97

to know the sources of desolation and how to treat them; for, as Lonsdale points out, the effect of desolation is corrosive for oneself and one's relationships with others.²⁴³

Regarding the sources of desolation, *Spiritual Exercises* presents three causes that create the mood of desolation: (a) a lukewarm, lazy or careless attitude to the practice of the spiritual life; (b) to test our worthiness; (c) to give us true knowledge and understanding that we cannot arouse or sustain spiritual consolation.²⁴⁴

With regard to the causes of desolation as (b) a test and (c) learning, Toner explains the thoughts of Ignatius: 'God allows desolation because sometimes it is better for us than giving us consolation in the sense that desolation serves as an occasion for our faith, hope, and charity to mature or to escape harm'.²⁴⁵ However, the key point of discernment is to overcome and defeat that movement so that one may be free of it and return to a state of spiritual consolation. Thus, Lonsdale's description of some tactics presented by *Spiritual Exercises* to deal with desolation can be summarised as:

(a) Believe that this experience can produce good; (b) Recognize that the workings of desolation are often subtle; (c) Know that the experience is temporary and consolation will return; (d) Do not make changes regarding any previous decisions; (e) Have confidence in the love and power of God, rather than focusing on the subtleties of desolation, because desolation tends to be a pattern that repeats in the life of individuals.²⁴⁶

Thus, according to Lonsdale, those in desolation need to remember their previous experiences of consolation in order to move from this current desolation. Remembering past experiences of consolation will give them motivation to pray to the Spirit and will enable their reorientation towards God.²⁴⁷ The process of discernment plays a pivotal role in one's daily life as well as in cases of important decision-making; for discernment involves the capability to see everything in life with the eyes of faith. Discernment facilitates personal reconciliation in the way that discernment involves finding God's purpose, expectation, and hope for a person's life and deciding how the person's life is to be shaped and formed. When Christians see their lives from the viewpoint of God's purpose and expectation, conversion of heart may occur and they are able to live in hope

²⁴³ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, p.90

²⁴⁴ *SE*, [#322]

²⁴⁵ Toner, *Spirit of Light or Darkness?*, p.25

²⁴⁶ Lonsdale, *Listening to the Music of the Spirit*, pp.90-92

and may be reconciled to others. Such ability for discernment allows them to carry the gift for finding God in everything at both a personal and community level.

4.3.4. Apostolic spirituality: life as a disciple of Christ

Spiritual Exercises is composed of contents to nurture a person's inner life and to deepen a personal experience of God; thus, there are no detailed descriptions of a person's relationship with others or of his or her life in the community. However, the experience of the Exercises seems to bring about an enlargement of a person's awareness through the encouragement of reflections on personal life history and relationships. Thus, life as a disciple of Christ – as a Christian – in the world involves apostolic spirituality as described by Ignatian Spirituality. English suggests that 'we are made human by a love affair. We are humble when we are overtaken by love'.²⁴⁸ When encountering this love, 'a person's ordinary veil of vanity and pride is torn away'²⁴⁹ in order to see his or her disordered life and sinfulness. The person may thus wonder at the realization that he or she is called to work with Christ. For that reason, a person is then drawn to respond as a co-worker with responsibility for the world.

This awareness of a personal identity as co-worker of Christ is related to the process of healing; for each person can find the importance, dignity, and value of self. English also suggests that 'the healing process includes an integration of individual with others, so that individuals gradually come to a greater appreciation of themselves through a free, responsible interchange with community'.²⁵⁰ English's explanation overlaps with the description in chapter three of the person as a relational being, when a person's life is posited in the social structure. Furthermore, as discussed in chapter two, the experience of injustice and hurt by others involves an experience that is not appropriate for human dignity. For that reason, healing and reconciliation in relationship with others are part of personal reconciliation. Thus, the experience of generosity and love towards one another can be a factor in searching for the wholeness of individuals. As indicated by Lonsdale, the individual Christian, who is carrying out the discipleship of Christ, has a social

²⁴⁷ Ibid., p.92

²⁴⁸ English, *Spiritual Freedom*, p.29

²⁴⁹ Ibid., p.97

²⁵⁰ Ibid., p.276

structural dimension, not a purely individual and personal dimension.²⁵¹ In the same vein, Ivens declares that ‘humility, generosity and spiritual poverty are often sought in relation to an individualistic concept of perfection, but in the Exercises, they are sought in relation to the call made to every Christian to the service of the Kingdom’.²⁵² Thus, healing as part of reconciliation comes through one’s new identity in Christ and is expanded to include both others and society; moreover, one’s healing deepens in generous and loving relationships within the community.

The generous love and humility involved in the Exercises culminates in the two prayers: *three kinds of humility*²⁵³ and the *contemplation to attain love*.²⁵⁴ On the meaning of the third kind of humility as the true humility, Tetlow expresses true humility as ‘accepting the gift of loving Jesus and the further gift of having that love at the centre of self’;²⁵⁵ therefore, it denotes ‘the way of imitating Jesus of Nazareth, of trying to live as obscure and powerless a life as he did’.²⁵⁶ Thomas Clarke explains the connotation of the *contemplation to attain love* as Christian life serving the world with ‘love, gift, and freedom’.²⁵⁷ These two prayers enable Christians to live in the true love and humility learned from Jesus’ life in their daily lives. Therefore, Divarkar implies that the two prayers express the belief that ‘we can attend to everyday duties whilst being wholly absorbed in God’.²⁵⁸ In his explanation of Christian life in the world as the imitation of the love of Christ, Andrew Dufner states that ‘there is no loving God apart from loving one’s neighbour in Ignatian spirituality, and one’s neighbour includes the whole of creation’.²⁵⁹ He suggests that the meaning of this connection is that ‘humans are created to live in harmony with all that is’.²⁶⁰ In other words, humanity’s responsibility is to become ‘the instrument of God’s human love, justice and peace’, and to use God’s gift for this work.²⁶¹ Such a notion of human responsibility seems to be involved with the role of humans as

²⁵¹ Lonsdale, *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear*, p.141

²⁵² Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.76

²⁵³ *SE*, [#165]-[#168]

²⁵⁴ *SE*, [#230]-[#237]

²⁵⁵ Tetlow, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola*, p.65

²⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁵⁷ Thomas E. Clarke, “Person and Society in the Exercises”, *Way Supplement 76* (1993/76), p.59

²⁵⁸ Divarkar, *The Path of Interior Knowledge*, p.53

²⁵⁹ Andrew J. Dufner, “The Ignatian Spiritual Exercises and the New World-View”, *Way Supplement 76* (1993/76), p.7

²⁶⁰ *Ibid.*

²⁶¹ *Ibid.*, p.9

shepherd in God's creation. This understanding of human beings as social beings having social responsibility is in line with Reformed theology, as discussed in chapter three. Thus, the emphasis on the Christian life as a disciple of Christ in love and humility shows that the matter of reconciliation should be discussed in a personal dimension as well as a social dimension; personal reconciliation is intertwined with social reconciliation, not separated from it.

Conclusion

This chapter looked at the Exercises, in order to explore how the Ignatian way of spiritual direction may be useful for believers in the Reformed tradition in achieving personal reconciliation. In addition, it explored the responses to the Exercises from the Reformed circle and the theological similarities and differences of Calvin and Ignatius in relation to the Exercises. It was suggested that there are increasing numbers of Reformed believers attracted by and participating in the Ignatian way. Furthermore, it was also proposed that both Calvin and Ignatius share a similar stance in terms of helping Christian progress in faith and life. In this regard, it can be assumed that the Exercises can have a positive effect upon believers in the Reformed tradition. Therefore, Part II will survey the relationship between Reformed Christians' experiences of Ignatian spiritual direction and their experience of personal reconciliation through an analysis of interviews carried out with Presbyterians in Scotland and South Korea.

PART II

EMPIRICAL RESEARCH: INTERVIEW FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

Throughout Part I, I have explored the theories of reconciliation, spiritual direction and Ignatian spiritual direction. I argue that reconciliation ministry as a process needs Christians' participation, and, for this, Christians need to practice reconciliation at the personal level. Through this practice, individual Christians can develop personal reconciliation and augment their spirituality of reconciliation. Therefore, before I move to a presentation of the empirical findings, it will be helpful to explore the apparent interconnection and overlap between the dynamics of personal reconciliation and those of Ignatian spiritual direction. There are three areas of overlap, as can be seen in the table below. The first is healing of memory and spiritual freedom. Both are related to the reshaping of Christian identity, in that healing of memory is enabled when Christians reconstruct their memory within the redeeming story of Jesus and God's love, while spiritual freedom is also connected with the change of identity by the Holy Spirit into that of a faithful Christian, leading to a harmonious relationship with oneself.¹ Secondly, forgiveness is God's extension of love to all humanity and humanity should respond to this by undergoing a conversion of heart. This conversion experience enables Christians to forgive others with compassion in conformity to Christ.² Finally, discernment as a way of finding one's vocation, which is the shaping of one's life, enables Christians to live as a disciple of Christ in ordinary life.³ Sheldrake positions the vocation of reconciliation at the heart of Christian discipleship, so the reshaping of relationships, the core of reconciliation, can be seen to be brought about principally by discernment.⁴

¹ See sections 2.3.2 and 4.3.1.

² See sections 2.1.3, 2.3.1. and 4.3.2.

³ See sections 3.3.4. and 4.3.3.

⁴ See section 4.3.3.

*** Table 3: The interconnection and overlap between personal reconciliation and Ignatian spiritual direction**

The dynamics of personal reconciliation	The dynamics of Ignatian spiritual direction
Healing of memory	Spiritual freedom
Forgiveness	Conversion
Reshaping of relationships	Discernment

I am arguing that it is in this experience of the interaction of the dynamics of personal reconciliation and spiritual direction that Christians can discover their responsibility to serve social reconciliation and commit themselves to the reconciliation ministry. Therefore, if the Church seeks to offer practices for developing reconciliation ministry, I am contending that spiritual direction, especially the Ignatian way,⁵ can function as one particularly powerful space for that work. In order to examine this hypothesis, I carried out empirical research in the form of in-depth interviews, a method of narrative inquiry, in Scotland and South Korea. As a Presbyterian minister, I propose that reconciliation ministry is needed within the Reformed Church; therefore, all subjects of the two cohorts are Presbyterians who have experienced Ignatian spiritual direction.⁶ The research questions for empirical research stem from the idea that God calls human beings as agents of reconciliation work, to serve the community and the world.⁷

Research questions

In order to propose spiritual direction as a ministry for reconciliation, this thesis begins by examining the meaning of personal reconciliation and the role that a deeper relationship with God has within this. It then looks at the ways in which spiritual direction can facilitate personal reconciliation and, once achieved, how the individual can serve as a

⁵ This was the only form of spiritual direction in Scotland; therefore I could only collect data from this cohort.

⁶ The amount of the interviewees for this research is limited; therefore, the results cannot be definitive, but they can show the possible implications for the wider application at the societal level.

⁷ 2 Cor 5: 19ff

reconciler in the wider community. Finally, it will explore how effectively Ignatian spiritual direction functions for Presbyterians in terms of facilitating personal reconciliation.

CHAPTER FIVE

METHODOLOGY

5.1. Method

5.1.1. Data collection method: in-depth interviews

This study consists of qualitative research, using interviews with spiritual directors and directees in order to discover their experiences of spiritual direction. According to Swinton and Mowat, ‘qualitative research seeks to create deep and rich insights into the meanings that people place on particular forms of experience’.¹ In order to achieve this task, qualitative research involves a range of data collection methods of empirical materials; for example, ‘case studies, personal experience, introspection, life stories, interviews, artefacts, cultural texts and productions, observational, historical, interactional, and visual texts’.² Amongst these methods, I have utilized the *narrative inquiry method*, specifically *in-depth interviews*, as the data collection method, because I wanted to hear the lived experience of spiritual direction through my encounter with interview participants. The narrative inquiry method is a way of studying people’s lives and capturing lived experience, and the story form is, as Punch states, ‘a feasible way of collecting data just because it is such a common device in everyday interaction’.³ There were 18 interview subjects in total and all were Presbyterians; 3 directors and 7 directees came from the Central Belt of Scotland and 3 directors and 5 directees were from South Korea. The Scottish subjects were involved in facilities that offer courses on spiritual direction and training for spiritual directors based upon Ignatian spirituality. The Korean director interviewees were professors in Presbyterian seminaries and the Korean directees were all seminary students and trainee ministers; all Korean subjects had received training in Ignatian spirituality in a seminary setting. The cohorts from Scotland and South Korea will be described in more detail in the following chapters.

¹ John Swinton and Harriet Mowat, *Practical Theology and Qualitative Research*, p.63

² N.K.Denzin and Y.S.Lincoln, *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 2nded., (CA, Sage: Thousand Oaks, 2000) p.4

³ Keith F. Punch, *Introduction to Social research: Quantitative & Qualitative Approaches*, (London / Thousand Oaks / New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1998), pp.222-223

It is interesting to note that all 3 Scottish directors were female and 2 of the 3 were laity; only one director was a minister. On the other hand, all 3 Korean directors were male ministers. While the subject groups in this study are too small to form any firm conclusions, these figures suggest that the current tendency of spiritual direction in Scotland may be a ministry developing under lay leadership, whereas in South Korea there may be a tendency for it to be a ministry led by clergy.⁴ In the case of Scottish directees, 4 ministers and 3 lay people (including 2 ministers' wives) took part in this research; one lay person had studied at a Divinity School. Meanwhile, in South Korea, many laity search for spiritual direction and come to short-term retreats and experience regular spiritual direction for short periods, but their needs for on-going spiritual direction are not met because of a lack of directors. Given these tendencies in Scotland and South Korea, it can be said that interest in spiritual direction is to be found amongst both ministers and laity.

A notable finding within the participants' experiences in Scotland and South Korea is that the Exercises were applied flexibly in accordance with their denomination as described in chapter four.

5.1.2. Choosing the sample

In order to constitute the cohort of interviewees, I liaised with the coordinator of a facility for spiritual direction in Scotland and the director of the department of spiritual theology in a Presbyterian seminary in Seoul. The Scottish coordinator gave me the names of spiritual directors in Scotland, whom I then contacted with details about my research. These directors then passed on to me the names of 2 or 3 of their directees. In total, I emailed 7 directees, all of whom responded to say that they would participate as interviewees. With regard to South Korea, the department director I initially contacted furnished me with the names of both spiritual directors and directees, whom I then emailed to inform them about the nature of this research.⁵ All replied to say that they would take part in this research as interviewees.

Amongst the Scottish subjects, all 3 directors had finished the Exercises; 5 out of 7 directees had also finished the Exercises either before or during their participation in

⁴ In the Epiphany Group, one of the major facilities offering Ignatian spiritual direction in Scotland, the leaders are all laity and 30% of all directees are Protestant pastors.

⁵ See Appendix 1

monthly spiritual direction based on Ignatian spirituality. The other 2 directees had only undergone monthly Ignatian spiritual direction. Amongst the South Korean subjects, all the directors and directees had finished the Exercises. The 5 directees then experienced on-going spiritual direction (for example, monthly direction) after completing the Exercises in the form of weekly sessions throughout the semester. Thus, among all the directees, participation in the Exercises and on-going spiritual direction had continuity in time; that is, they had experienced the Exercises either in the course of on-going spiritual direction or before they began that. The research range of this dissertation therefore encompasses this whole process of Ignatian spiritual direction including the Exercises. I will refer to this experience as ‘spiritual direction’ or ‘spiritual direction process’. Unless specifically stated otherwise, when referring to spiritual direction in relation to the empirical research, I mean Ignatian spiritual direction.

5.1.3. Collecting data

Interviews lasted from 1 hour and 20 minutes to 2 hours. Before their interview, each participant was given the consent form which outlined the purpose and nature of the research, the anonymity with which the findings would be used, and the participants’ right to discontinue the interview at any time. All participants read and signed this form before commencing their interview.⁶ In addition, interviews always ended with the question, ‘Do you have any questions for me?’ to allow participants the opportunity to ask further questions which might have arisen during the interview. The interviews were recorded with an MP 3 recorder. The interviews with Koreans took place in Korean while the Scottish interviews were held in English. This meant that I was better able to understand the nuances of the Korean interviews and was able to paraphrase them more effectively; however, because I was sometimes uncertain as to the precise nuance of what the Scottish interviewees were saying, I kept the full quotations in the original form. Moreover, the Scottish cohort consisted of two more directees. For these reasons, the chapter dealing with the Scottish interview findings (chapter six) is slightly longer than the Korean equivalent. In the interviews, 21 questions were given to directors and 30 questions were given to directees.⁷ The questionnaire to directees is longer because I wanted to hear their immediate voices more vividly and deeply. Although the directors had suggested the

⁶ See Appendix 2

directees included here, they did not only discuss these directees, but also referred to others they had worked with outside these interviews.

In the course of transcribing the interviews, I became aware of a need to explore more fully the correlation between participants' interpretations of their life stories and suffering and their contemplation of Jesus' suffering and resurrection. I therefore emailed directees with two further questions to clarify this issue.⁸ In all, six out of 7 Scottish subjects answered by email; one participant did not reply, however she had already explored this theme in detail in the course of her interview. Among the 5 Korean directees, 3 subjects answered by email; 2 participants did not reply, but, again, they had both already discussed this topic during the course of their interviews.

5.1.4. Analysis

As the data was collected and transcribed, a number of themes emerged with regard to understanding and identifying the interviewees' experience of spiritual direction in terms of achieving personal reconciliation. These themes are common to the data from both Scotland and South Korea, but the emphasis within these two groups of participants was slightly different. The reasons for this can reasonably be assumed to be because of differences in culture and Church, age range, and the subjects' status in the Church.

5.2. Background of interviewees

5.2.1. Scottish subjects

In Scotland, the main form of spiritual direction and the only training courses in spiritual direction are based upon the Ignatian way. There are two facilities that offer programmes based on Ignatian spirituality, which are the Ignatian Spirituality Centre in Glasgow and the Epiphany Group in Edinburgh and Aberdeen; the main Epiphany Group is based in Edinburgh. The Ignatian Spirituality Centre and the Epiphany Group work closely together; both also adopt an inter-denominational approach, with Catholics and Protestants working together in Spiritual Direction. Recently, the ministry office of the Church of Scotland has encouraged ministerial candidates to make use of spiritual

⁷ See Appendix 3

⁸ See Appendix 4

direction as a means of helping their formation as a minister. If a candidate wishes to take it up, the Church of Scotland pays for spiritual direction for two years.⁹

The Scottish cohort included 3 directors who worked in the Ignatian Spirituality Centre in Glasgow and 7 directees who were participating in spiritual direction under the 3 directors mentioned above; all 10 subjects were members of the Church of Scotland.¹⁰ All 3 directors were female; one was a minister and 2 were laity. Among these directors interviewed, 25% of their directees were male and 75% were female, while around one third were ministers and two thirds laity. Amongst the 7 Scottish directees who took part in this research, 4 were ministers and 3 were laity (including 2 ministers' wives); however, one lay person had studied at a Divinity School. All three directors completed the Exercises in the 19th annotation and one amongst them made the Exercises in the thirty-day retreat as well as the 19th annotation. Five out of 7 directees finished the Exercises in the 19th annotation and 2 of the 7 directees were undergoing monthly spiritual direction. Five directees who finished the 19th annotation of the Exercises clarified that their experience of the Exercises was very powerful in improving their intimate relationship with God and their communication with God. After finishing the Exercises, they continued to participate in monthly spiritual direction and short-term retreats, as they felt they needed a companion for their on-going spiritual journey. Two directees who had not completed the Exercises had only been taking part in monthly based spiritual direction, one for 9 years and the other for 2 years. The directee who had been attending spiritual direction for 9 years indicated that she would make the 19th annotation because she felt the need for this while participating in the monthly spiritual direction and several short-term retreats.

As explained in chapter four, there are two ways of making the Exercises; one involves a thirty-day retreat and the other is through the 19th annotation. In Scotland, the 19th annotation involves weekly spiritual direction, where directees meet with their spiritual director, and are asked to commit at least an hour a day to prayer and to keep a journal, noting their experiences during their prayer. The whole experience of the 19th annotation consists of about 30 weeks and lasts between 7 and 12 months.

⁹ Kyle, p.23 He is an ordained minister of the Church of Scotland and he said that it is very proactively encouraging the ministerial candidates to get a director in the Church of Scotland.

¹⁰ See, Table 3

While the material of conversation in the Exercises is the directees' experience of prayer, the material of monthly spiritual direction is the daily life of the directee and their prayer. For directees coming to monthly direction, the length of prayer time is left to their own discretion. In Scotland, monthly spiritual direction is also called 'spiritual accompaniment' because people think that 'direction' has too strong a nuance; thus, 'monthly spiritual direction' and 'spiritual accompaniment' are used interchangeably.

Despite these differences, Scottish directors clarified that they use the same tools for both the 19th annotation of Exercises and spiritual accompaniment; for example, discernment, imaginative prayer, and *Lectio Divina*. However, directors also explained that, since directees meet their director once a week in the 19th annotation of the Exercises, it is a much more powerful experience. In addition, during the thirty-day retreats, directees meet their directors once a day; directees therefore believed that this is a more intense experience. The reason why I have chosen directees who experienced the 19th annotation and monthly spiritual direction is that I wanted to research how effective the Exercises and direction could be in ordinary life without leaving home for the thirty-day retreat; a thirty-day retreat is not easy to manage given the financial and temporal constraints so common within modern life and it was actually difficult to find anyone who had completed one in Scotland, even amongst directors.

Directors reported that directees who take the 19th annotation and monthly spiritual direction take part in short-term retreats, such as the 8-day and 3-day retreat, during which they meet with their directors on a daily basis. They also said that over 50% of the directees who have finished the Exercises continue to participate in monthly spiritual direction. The tables below outline details about the 10 Scottish subjects; 3 directors and 7 directees. I have given the subjects pseudonyms to preserve their anonymity.

***Table 4**

- S.D. – Spiritual Direction
- S.E. – Spiritual Exercises
- 19th Annotation – 19th Annotation in Spiritual Exercises

(1) Directors

Name	Gender	Age	Minister or Laity?	Duration of time acting as a Director	Experience of S.D.
Kate	Female	46-55	Minister	10 years	19 th Annotation Retreats(3 and 8-day) Monthly S.D.
Shona		56-65	Laity	8 years	30-day S.E. 19 th Annotation Retreats(6 and 8-day) Monthly S.D.
Nancy		65+	Laity	6 years	19 th Annotation Retreats(3 and 8-day) Monthly S.D.

(2) Directees

Name	Gender	Age	Minister or Laity?	Duration of S.D.	Experience of S.D.
Jamie	Male	36-45	Laity	6 years	19 th Annotation Monthly S.D.
Kyle	Male	46-55	Minister	10 years	19 th Annotation Retreats(3 and 10-day) Monthly S.D.
Martin	Male	65+	Minister	5 years	19 th Annotation Short term retreat Monthly S.D.
Flora	Female	36-45	Minister	9 years	Retreats (a daily retreat during Lent) Monthly S.D.
Amy	Female	36-45	Minister	2 years	Monthly S.D.
Jenny	Female	46-55	Minister's wife	12 years	19 th Annotation Retreats (10-day, a daily retreat during Lent) Monthly S.D.
Clara	Female	56-65	Minister's wife	13 years	19 th Annotation Retreats (3 and 8-day, a daily retreat during Lent) Monthly S.D.

5.2.2. Korean subjects

The South Korean cohort included 3 directors who were ministers and professors in Presbyterian seminaries and 5 directees who had finished the M.Div. course and were studying spiritual theology on a Master's programme. Since 1998, the Presbyterian seminary to which the 2 directors and 5 directees belong has been offering a programme for spiritual discipline in which all students in the first year of the M.Div. course are mandatorily required to live in a dormitory for one 6-month semester and attend a 3-day retreat. Some students were critical of this programme, but generally, it was felt that it has contributed to the promotion of piety and spirituality among M.Div. students; for, in South Korea, all M.Div. students entered the seminary with the expectation that they would go on to ministerial work. Moreover, the department of spiritual theology offers the subject 'The theory and practice of spiritual direction' (a 2 semester-long programme, the 2nd semester focusing on the theory of the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises) and 'The practice of the Spiritual Exercises' (one semester). Those who want to take 'The practice of the Spiritual Exercises' are expected to participate in an 8-day retreat, which is an adaptation of 19th annotation. Those who finish all three semesters can join in the director's workshop and work as a soul friend for students in the class of the first semester, also taking part in weekly supervision with a professor. All Korean directee interviewees completed the spiritual discipline programme in the M.Div. course and all three semesters in the Masters' degree course. The relationship between directors and directees was that of professor and student, which could lead to potential problems for the directees to express openly their feelings about their experiences during the interviews.

The directee interviewees had experienced on-going spiritual direction for a short period, but have not been able to continue due to a lack of directors. Therefore, while they have continued to have a hunger for ongoing spiritual direction, their desire has not yet been met. Nevertheless, they are applying their knowledge and practice of spiritual direction in their Church ministry.

There were 3 Korean director interviewees, all of whom were male. Among these directors, 70-80% of their seminarian directees were male and 20-30% were female. This

is representative of the male/female division amongst student seminarians.¹¹ However, it is not representative of the wider population, as can be seen by the numbers of laity directees, 70% of whom were female and 30% male. Participants' background, such as gender, age, status in the Church, and experience of spiritual direction can be seen in the chart below. Again, I have given the subjects pseudonyms to preserve their anonymity.

***Table 5**

(1) Directors

Name	Gender	Age	Minister or Laity?	Duration of time acting as a Director	Experience of S.D.
Junsu	Male	55-65	Minister	17 years	40-day S.E.(several times) 19 th Annotation Retreat (numerous 3 and 8-day)
Yoojin	Male	46-55	Minister	11 years	40-day S.E. 19 th Annotation 8-day retreat 13-day discernment workshop Monthly S.D.
Hamin	Male	46-55	Minister	10 years	40-day S.E. 30-day S.E. 19 th Annotation 8-day retreat Monthly S.D. Director's workshop

¹¹ In South Korea, in this denomination, women's ordination began in 1994 and ministerial work is still considered to be a male domain. Therefore, there is a greater proportion of male seminarians, with a ratio of c.70:30.

(2) Directees

Name	Gender	Age	Minister or Laity?	Duration of S.D.	Experience of S.D.
Bora	Female	26-35	Seminarian	4 years	19 th Annotation Retreat (3 and 8-day) Regular S.D. for a short period
Heidi	Female	26-35	Seminarian	5 years	19 th Annotation Retreat (3 and 8-day) Regular S.D. for a short period
Sue	Female	26-35	Seminarian	3 years	19 th Annotation Retreat (3 and 8-day) Regular S.D. for a short period
Jisu	Female	36-45	Seminarian	5 years	19 th Annotation Retreat (3 and 8-day) Regular S.D. for a short period
Kihoon	Male	36-45	Seminarian	7 years	19 th Annotation Retreat (3 and 8-day) Regular S.D. for a short period

CHAPTER SIX

SCOTTISH INTERVIEW FINDINGS

6.1. The discussion of responses to the questions

The 3 directors and 5 directees were given a different numbers of questions, 21 for directors and 32 for directees; therefore, within some themes, the responses of directors was less detailed, as they were asked fewer questions than directees. From the analysis of Scottish interview data a number of key themes emerged.

Understanding personal reconciliation

Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction

Directees' reasons for and expectations of spiritual direction

The changes to directees' prayer

The changes in directees' image of God and self, and acceptance of themselves and others

Healing

Sin

Forgiveness and reconciliation with others

Directees' contemplation of Jesus' life in connection with their understanding of relationships

Directees' lives as reconcilers: apostolic spirituality

Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church

6.2. The findings of directors' interviews

6.2.1. Understanding personal reconciliation

In order to describe the notion of personal reconciliation, directors used the following terms: 'integration',¹ 'a sense of wholeness',² 'a sense of harmony',³ 'alignment to the territory of God within their lives',⁴ 'not splitting off parts of themselves',⁵ 'being a friend and partner of God',⁶ 'a transformative experience',⁷ 'discovering the possibility of feeling deeply at peace',⁸ 'God's love and Christ's forgiveness',⁹ 'healing',¹⁰ and 'a person's own forgiveness of others'.¹¹ Director Kate depicted her idea of personal reconciliation as follows:

Personal reconciliation would be about [directees] managing to integrate different parts of themselves, because one of the problems sometimes with our theology, as I see it, is that people split off a 'God bit' from another bit, and there's not a harmony within themselves. So I would be always looking to see how the person [experiences] the sense of wholeness, the sense of harmony, the sense of integration.¹²

Directors differed in terms of their perceptions of the range of personal reconciliation. For example, Nancy viewed personal reconciliation as a process involving both herself and the wider world and described it as a transformative experience:

Reconciliation is not a word that I use, so I struggled with it...And then I looked up the translation of reconciliation and in the Good News Bible, the translation of it in the 2 Corinthians, be reconciled to God is, 'God through Christ has changed us from being enemies into his friends, he's given us the task of making the whole human race into friends. And I thought, 'yes, that's what spiritual direction is about', ...personal reconciliation is experience which is transformative for oneself and for one's life in the world...it is discovering the possibility of feeling deeply

¹ Kate, p.1

² Kate, p.1

³ Kate, p.1

⁴ Kate, p.1

⁵ Kate, p.1

⁶ Nancy, p.3

⁷ Nancy, p.3

⁸ Nancy, p.4

⁹ Shona, p.3

¹⁰ Shona, p.3, Kate, p.7, Kate also said that personal reconciliation is an experience of transformation; she defined personal transformation as the deepening of the experience of God's love.

¹¹ Shona, p.3

¹² Kate, p.2

at peace... That's not achievement, that's an aspiration. It would be a hope and a hope for possibility.¹³

In contrast, Shona focused more upon the implications of personal reconciliation for her own healing and personal forgiveness; she defined personal reconciliation as:

Shona: Finding God's love and Christ's forgiveness and healing, as well as a person's own forgiveness of others. I think that's really finding that depth of love and forgiveness.

Researcher: For you, personal reconciliation is defined as the relationship with God and healing is given to you by God...

Shona: There can be healing in all sorts of different ways and different levels, but I think a lot of people who come here are looking for a depth of emotional healing and perhaps healing in their relationship with God... to have a real sense of God's love, it can enable [emotional healing] more deeply.¹⁴

According to Scottish directors, personal reconciliation could be defined as a transformative experience that is primarily found in the restoration of the relationship with God; it caused directees' healing brought about by encountering God's love and forgiveness. Such transformative experiences enabled directees to come to forgive others and to become God's friend and partner, serving God's Kingdom. For the directors, reconciliation, even at a personal level, would not be achieved in this present life but was an aspiration, a hoped-for possibility. However, personal reconciliation could be experienced to some extent as integration, healing, and transformation, moving towards being friends of God through one's life in the world.

6.2.2. Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction

The directors described spiritual direction as being a 'container'¹⁵ or 'part of directees' commitment to their own spiritual journey'¹⁶ that fosters directees' personal reconciliation. They explained that spiritual direction facilitated directees to feel God's love, know God's plan for them and all humanity, and to see God with them in their daily lives; this then leads them to 'grow into the fullness of life'.¹⁷ Kate commented on the relationship

¹³ Nancy, pp.2-4

¹⁴ Shona, p.3

¹⁵ Kate, p.11

¹⁶ Nancy, p.10

¹⁷ Nancy, p.4 She used this phrase in the sense that directees felt the life, energy, hopefulness, the light, and love, which were signs of God for her.

between personal reconciliation and spiritual direction in terms of opening directees' guilt to Jesus and being led to personal transformation by the love of Jesus. She also noted that in spiritual direction, directees were aware of themselves as a creation of God, and believed that all humanity, being created in the image of God, was interconnected:

People carry baggage around sin, which is heavy guilt, and often shame becomes like a box that people find difficult to open up to God or to another person like a director ...How do we accept the shadow side of ourselves so that we can bring it out into the open and work with it, so that we see that God works in these areas in our lives and this leads to personal transformation. There has to be a sense that it's all allowed to be brought into the direction time...We're in a whole new place. There is an interconnectedness of the whole human race...every single human person on this planet is made in the image of God.¹⁸

Nancy believed that spiritual direction helped directees learn both reconciliation with God and their identity in God; they learn they are part of God's plan for all humanity. For Nancy, the relationship with God also needs to be nurtured like human relationships; thus, the spiritual direction process offers a conversation process as well as prayer.¹⁹ Shona gave emphasis to the initiative of the Holy Spirit in spiritual direction and directees' prayer:

We always say that it's the Holy Spirit that directs, so I'm here as a listener and to get a sense of where God is, where God is giving that person life, what's life-giving in that person's prayer life, within their lives and...that can enable a deepening relationship with God.²⁰

For directors, spiritual direction was a path in which directees encountered the love of Jesus for themselves and all humanity, and were aware of themselves as a creature made in the image of God and part of God's plan for all humanity. Through such awareness, directees were able to restore a deeper loving relationship with God and experience healing and personal transformation. This was a key point of personal reconciliation; eventually spiritual direction functioned as a space for directees' personal reconciliation and a process to help directees continue their on-going spiritual journey.

6.2.3. Directee's reasons for and expectations of spiritual direction

¹⁸ Kate, p.2, p.4

¹⁹ Nancy, pp.3-4

²⁰ Shona, p.4

According to directors, the range of directees' reasons for and expectations of spiritual direction are extremely wide; however, they can be summarized as 'meeting the love of God and a growth in God',²¹ 'a desire of deepened and better understanding of God',²² 'knowing themselves',²³ 'a yearning to find God's direction in their decisions',²⁴ 'a longing for journeying with Jesus in their lives',²⁵ and 'healing'.²⁶ Thus, according to Kate:

Generally, there's[sic] two things; that they want to meet God, and they want to grow in love through that meeting, they want to grow in love as individuals. And also, they want to meet themselves – who am I? What is my deepest identity? Because as I get to know God, I will get to know myself.²⁷

Shona described spiritual direction, in particular the experience of the Exercises, as a life changing experience; directees found it very valuable in the sense that they produced changes in their lives through a real depth of spiritual experience such as deep prayer and journeying with Jesus.²⁸

While stressing the priority of the Spirit in the spiritual direction process, directors still recognized that there is a role for the director to help directees' experiences become more valuable. Kate felt that the role of director is to support directees in their journey and to help them learn how to respond:

They go through fruitful patches and barren patches, so it's a bit like life...and part of the role as a director is to keep and hold people in the journey, support people in the journey. It's like weather...you have times when you're going through mist...sun ...fog, and you're just journeying along. And God's time.²⁹

Directors expressed the opinion that directees came to spiritual direction because they expected to learn to journey with Jesus in their lives, to grow in the way of walking alongside God, and to make decisions in their lives following God's direction. These reasons could be summed up as spiritual desire; that is, a desire for a deepened

²¹ Kate, p.5, Nancy, p.5

²² Kate, p.6

²³ Kate, p.5

²⁴ Nancy, p.5, Shona, p.4

²⁵ Kate, p.6

²⁶ Shona, p.4

²⁷ Kate, p.5

²⁸ Shona, pp.4-5

²⁹ Kate, p.6

relationship with God. Directees continued to come for spiritual direction because, according to directors, they considered spiritual direction to be a life-changing and valuable experience. Therefore, to help directees gain valuable experience in spiritual direction, directors need to sustain directees' experiences during both fruitful times and barren times.

6.2.4. The changes to directees' prayer

As described in the Methodology chapter, the 19th annotation focuses on directees' prayer; directees make a commitment to pray for around one hour a day with Scripture and to meet with a director once a week. Directors noticed that changes to directees' prayer occurred in the spiritual direction process, both during the 19th annotation (in Scotland, a weekly meeting with a director) and the monthly based spiritual direction. According to the directors, the principal changes were in relation to their image of God, their acceptance of themselves,³⁰ and their ability to look at the world as God sees it, which can be a guiding light as to how they approach their community, wider society, and the world.³¹ With regard to the reasons for these changes, directors suggested that it was due to 'the impact of God's love on them',³² their having 'a loving relationship with their spiritual director',³³ their developing awareness through constant prayer, and new prayer methods expanding their horizon of prayer.³⁴ Directors believed that the primary reason for the changes was the nature of imaginative prayer in the Ignatian way. This form of prayer leads directees to feel the story of Scripture emotionally, not only intellectually, and encourages them to encounter their personal life experiences and their own life stories in the stories of Scripture. For example, directees reflect their life experiences in Jesus' story of living, suffering, and resurrection; Jesus' story becomes a mirror for directees to look at their own life experiences.

Kate suggested the effectiveness of imaginative prayer:

Where you're doing this real journey through Christ's life-death, resurrection, there's a very strong dynamic there. Scripture would be a way of walking

³⁰ Kate, p.10

³¹ Shona, p.5, Nancy, p.7

³² Kate, p.10

³³ Kate, p.11, Nancy, p.11

³⁴ Kate, pp.10-11, Nancy, pp.13-14, Shona, p.8

alongside Jesus and his way of love...I think the Psalms are also very helpful. ...In spiritual direction, often people's experience is that they have a lot of different emotional feeling tones to how they are responding.³⁵

Similarly, Nancy made reference to the nature of imaginative prayer, stating that there was much more to directees' relationships with God than a theoretical knowledge and it is 'the inner feeling and relish of things that fills and satisfies the soul, so that's what makes the difference'.³⁶

In addition, directors believed that directees' prayer became more personalized but also extended beyond themselves. According to Nancy:

People's prayer becomes much more personal, much more real; they're speaking to Jesus as an intimate friend. Another interesting thing is prayer can become much huger and much more expansive; nature, people who are much more in touch with what's happening in modern science, stuff that's happening around the whole understanding of the universe now.³⁷

She commented further upon the expanded territory of the directee's prayer:

I think [in Scripture] there can often be a much wider growing sense of the society we presently live in, the kind of communities that we create or don't create, the 'Godness' of that or the 'anti-Godness' of that...their commitment to making whatever their contribution is in the world out of our looking at the world as God sees it, looking together with God ...whether it's the community or the wider society or what's happening in the world across the Globe.³⁸

Another reason directors attributed to the changes in directees' prayer was their learning new forms of prayer; for example, they practiced *Lectio Divina*, prayer in silence, listening to God, and centring prayer. Directees experience God in these various forms of prayer and are invited to learn discernment in order to recognize this experience correctly. Kate spoke about the need for directees to use alternative forms of prayer that allowed them to 'open up to God – listening to God, to what God might be saying to them, rather than telling God'.³⁹ She believed that this would provide directees with 'a new experience and they would listen to what are their deep desires and where they're feeling really drawn by God and what it is their experience of God is inviting them to be part of – discernment

³⁵ Kate, pp.6-7

³⁶ Nancy, p.13

³⁷ Nancy, p.12

³⁸ Nancy, pp.6-7

³⁹ Kate, p.10

becomes the issue there'.⁴⁰ Kate also suggested that retreat and spiritual experience in a group setting can be good tools for directees' transformative experience.⁴¹ She described these as 'containers for a transformation to happen' and believed that directees 'experience God's love through one another'.⁴²

According to directors, directees experienced Jesus' life and the love of God with their heart through imaginative contemplation of the Scripture led by the Exercises and other prayer forms. This experience could be summarized as allowing the knowledge in their head to be realized with their heart. Through such experiences, the territory of directees' prayer expanded into the world beyond themselves. The changes to directees' prayer will be described in detail in the section below.

6.2.5. The changes in directees' image of God and self, and acceptance of themselves and others

As described above, the principal changes in directees' prayer noted by directors are related to their image of God, the acceptance of themselves, and their looking at the world as God sees it. Directors suggested that directees' deeper image of God and themselves was enabled by knowing the unconditional love of God.⁴³ The directees' new image of God as noted by directors was 'from a negative image of God to a positive image of God by directees' eye-opening experiences';⁴⁴ God was experienced as 'warmer, more feeling, less judgmental',⁴⁵ and they saw God as being 'bigger' in His involvement within the world and for justice.⁴⁶

Kate emphasized the heartfelt experience in spiritual direction with regard to these changes to the image of God:

Very often we have a theology of a very judgmental God... So, it's very related in spiritual direction. The images of God [in the passages from Scripture] that will help them begin to trust that their God is a loving God...it's not as easy to let go of as you think...I would have directees that would come to me who would say

⁴⁰ Kate, p.10

⁴¹ Kate, p.11

⁴² Kate, p.11

⁴³ Shona, p.8

⁴⁴ Shona, p.8

⁴⁵ Kate, p.11

⁴⁶ Nancy, p.14

‘I’ve let go of that image of God’, but they will have haunted places within them that return...so you’re never just dealing with head stuff, that’s why the experiential side of the spiritual accompaniment is so important. They’re working with the unconscious.⁴⁷

Directors also suggested that the self-image of the directees shifts through the spiritual direction process; they discover themselves as loveable and beloved and so become freer within themselves.⁴⁸ According to directors, directees often used terms such as ‘should’, ‘ought’, ‘strict’, ‘hard’, ‘lack of kindness’, and ‘selfishness’ when referring to themselves. They felt compelled to be a perfect person. Spiritual direction offered them a space where they could open up and feel loved and accepted. This new image of themselves helped directees to feel freer.⁴⁹ Regarding this, Shona commented that the change to directees’ image of God was the trigger to the change in the image of themselves; ‘to find God’s love, acceptance, and forgiveness can be a real healing and enable them to find more for themselves, a more positive image of themselves’.⁵⁰ Nancy also explained that the image of God became bigger and more generous, more compassionate, with more passion for justice.⁵¹ According to directors, directees came to have a deeper image of God that offered them unconditional love and forgiveness; such an image of God caused them to have a changed image of themselves and enabled them to accept themselves.

6.2.6. Healing and forgiveness

Directors clarified that directees experienced healing through the spiritual direction process. The key words used by directors to describe ‘healing’ were ‘acceptance’,⁵² ‘freedom or liberation’,⁵³ ‘forgiveness’,⁵⁴ ‘integration’,⁵⁵ ‘creativity’,⁵⁶ ‘trust’,⁵⁷ ‘wholeness’,⁵⁸ ‘restoration’,⁵⁹ and ‘presence’.⁶⁰ Directees’ experiences of healing

⁴⁷ Kate, pp.8-9

⁴⁸ Shona, p.9, Nancy, p.14, Kate, pp.11-12

⁴⁹ Kate, pp.11-12, Nancy, p.14, Shona, p.9

⁵⁰ Shona, p.9

⁵¹ Nancy, pp.13-14

⁵² Kate, p.13

⁵³ Shona, p.10, Kate, p.13, Nancy, p.15

⁵⁴ Kate, p.13

⁵⁵ Kate, p.13

⁵⁶ Kate, p.13

⁵⁷ Nancy, p.15

⁵⁸ Nancy, p.15

⁵⁹ Nancy, p.15

⁶⁰ Nancy, p.15

happened through their prayer, because directees encountered the presence of Jesus as a healer through imaginative prayer using Gospel stories. Directors explained that whenever directees felt that nobody was there with them, Jesus was there and went through the difficult times with them. Their prayer allowed their knowledge to be transformed into *realization*. Directors reported that directees initially often felt hurt, misunderstood, bitter, resentful, angry, and enraged, but have now been strengthened, experienced less anxiety, regained joyfulness, felt forgiveness and freedom, and have noticed the gifts of the Spirit in their lives.⁶¹ Through the spiritual direction process, directees learn how to let these negative feelings go in deep prayer. Accordingly, directors were convinced that spiritual direction led to liberation, renewal, and deepening faith in directees' lives.⁶²

Shona identified healing with forgiveness 'through God' and the forgiveness of others:

[Forgiveness] is a big part of the Exercises. The First Week...If you really pray in the Exercises thoroughly and feel that...[the experience of spiritual direction] is liberating and renewing and deepens faith... if you really feel that forgiveness, it can be very liberating.⁶³

With regard to the relationship between directees' healing and their forgiveness towards others, Kate clarified that directees' forgiveness of others definitely happened in spiritual direction, going on to explain thus:

This is because direction is always about the experiential...It comes from the experience of coming more deeply in touch with God's forgiveness of them, then they're able to let that flow to who they're needing to forgive ...So, the job as the director is to help them come into touch with where they've experienced it and their need for it, and that then allows them to be part of God's flow to the other person.⁶⁴

Two directors explained that healing was brought about by God's forgiveness and love, and that produces forgiveness of others, which is a big part of reconciliation.⁶⁵ However, Nancy argued that spiritual direction focuses more on the relationship with God, or reconciliation with God, than on forgiveness of others in the directees' lives, believing that this was the more important task in spiritual direction. As a counselling psychologist, she

⁶¹ Nancy, p.15

⁶² Shona, p.10

⁶³ Shona, p.10

⁶⁴ Kate, pp.13-14

⁶⁵ Shona, p.9

identified healing as a psychological term; for her, healing is not separate from spiritual growth, which is a process of becoming Christ-like. She believed that spiritual direction is a space in which to practice reconciliation with God rather than the forgiveness of others. Forgiveness is not an aim of spiritual direction, but a sense of freedom *does* appear as a crucial fruit within directees through their letting go of things bound by injustice.⁶⁶ Nancy also stated that healing has to do with experience of ‘injustice’ and painful situations in the past; therefore healing is peacefulness and gentle strength in these situations, and an experience of Jesus as healer.⁶⁷ She concluded that, although spiritual growth and psychological growth are intertwined processes, in terms of healing, spiritual growth itself is a much more transformative process.⁶⁸

Scottish directors identified healing as recovering from the hurt and scars of the past that had affected the relationship with God, oneself and others. This healing can eventually be developed into forgiveness of others. According to directors, the experience of unconditional love and forgiveness from God encountered especially through the 19th annotation becomes a power to heal their hurt; such healing experiences also flow to those who have hurt them. While one director believed that the 19th annotation was not a space in which to explore the forgiveness of others because it focused on reconciliation with God, the two other directors explained that the healing experience, including forgiveness from God, allowed directees to expand their experience to those who hurt them; forgiveness was therefore depicted as a large part of the 19th annotation. For directors, healing was sometimes used in a psychological sense in that it was a resolution of feelings such as bitterness; however, they clarified that spiritual growth was a transformative experience that had meaning far beyond the psychological. There was a slight difference between directors’ expectations and directees’ experience regarding the issue of forgiveness. Directors assumed that directees could develop a willingness to forgive others, but directees expressed how difficult forgiving others was; in particular, the rebuilding of the relationship with the other who had hurt them. This will be described in more detail in 6.3.

⁶⁶ Nancy, p.16

⁶⁷ Nancy, p.14

⁶⁸ Nancy, p.15, p.18

6.2.7. *Sin*

According to directors, directees brought issues concerning guilt related to their sins to spiritual direction.⁶⁹ The signs of guilt are a sense of heaviness, fear about God's judgment, and fear of alienation from God. These feelings are tied to negative images of God; thus, in the Exercises (19th annotation) and direction, directees are invited to bring these feelings to the presence of God and to the Cross.⁷⁰ Directors suggested that directees explore their sins and feelings, particularly as the prayer of the First Week invites them to look at themselves and areas of their lives. There, directees could begin to deal with their wrongdoing and guilt. However, directors stated that the conversation about sin and guilt is not the same as the ritual or liturgy of confession.⁷¹ Yet, the First Week is an invitation to become aware of oneself as a sinner surrounded by God's love. One director expressed this experience as being aware of life as a journey shared with God and experiencing God's love, forgiveness, and acceptance:⁷²

Kate stated that she is careful about using the term 'sin' because it interrupts directees' ability to open up this area within them; instead, she used the terms 'brokenness', 'shadow', 'foibles', and 'weakness'.⁷³ She suggested that these terms indicate to directees that they are human because these feelings are caused by primitive emotions, such as greed, envy, and selfishness.⁷⁴ According to Nancy and Kate, guilt is tied up with a negative image of God and is caused by childhood experiences.⁷⁵ It is not easy to change the image of God in people, so the directors emphasized the importance of the experiential aspect of spiritual direction.⁷⁶ Kate also noted that directees need to learn understanding of sinfulness within social structures, or social sin, as well as individual sin in spiritual direction because all human beings in this world share common humanity created in the image of God:⁷⁷

⁶⁹ Kate, p.2, p.8, Nancy, p.11, p.12, Shona, p.6

⁷⁰ Nancy, p.12

⁷¹ Nancy, p.11, Shona, p.6

⁷² Shona, p.6

⁷³ Kate, p.2

⁷⁴ Kate, p.3

⁷⁵ Nancy, p.12, Kate, p.8, p.9

⁷⁶ See Section 6.2.5.

⁷⁷ Kate, p.3, p.4

People coming to do the Exercises with me are often caught in a narrow understanding of sin; they see it about sex, misdemeanours, or smoking too much ...often they don't see the structural sin...We're one world, one humanity, so what are the sinful structures that are stopping us caring for our planet, care for one another, care for the poor?...The Exercises can be very good at helping people see that bigger sense as well as the individual...I think it would be very much like looking at the Gospel...Jesus was very concerned about the big picture and about the poor.⁷⁸

Kate suggested that directees' awareness of both individual and social sin becomes sharper but that they also experience more deeply God's love for them, and are then 'ready to move into the Second Week where they are walking alongside [Jesus], sharing the journey and there may be inspired and challenged'.⁷⁹ She said that the Third Week is when directees realise that Jesus has become powerless. She explains that this becomes important as directees are walking alongside Jesus. They see that Jesus was still able to give himself totally, which in turn enables them to 'move to a place where they can be in their helpless places or their powerless places, and know Jesus is with them'.⁸⁰ She argues that this can 'open out into something mysterious and deep and new' and that Jesus is always showing us how we can be most deeply human to each other.⁸¹

Directors stated that during the First Week, directees talked about their sense of guilt, which sometimes led to the admission of their sins and wrongdoings; this process enabled them to feel less fearful about becoming estranged from God and to feel a sense of liberation. However, directors also emphasized that directees' experiences of God's compassion and forgiveness continued in the Second and Third Week; for, Jesus' life was dedicated to completely giving himself to and for humanity. For that reason, directors believed that this contemplation of Jesus' life would allow directees to feel able to emulate such a life and would encourage them to decide what direction they could take to practice their loving heart towards others for Christ. This will be the subject of the next section.

6.2.8. Directee's life as an agent for reconciliation

⁷⁸ Kate, p.3

⁷⁹ Kate, p.7

⁸⁰ Kate, p.7

⁸¹ Kate, p.7

Directors defined an agent of reconciliation as a person who is living the love of God through his or her actions in his or her ordinary life and serving society.⁸² Even regarding personal relationships, directors talked about how directees can bring a more acute sense of Gospel values such as forgiveness, justice, peace, and harmony into their everyday lives.⁸³ Therefore, for directors, the life of an agent for reconciliation involves serving God in the world and having a global responsibility for humanity.⁸⁴ According to directors, the crucial themes in the concept of reconciliation for community and society are truth, justice, peace, and harmony.⁸⁵

Directors clarified that the crucial advantage of the Ignatian way is that it offers *discernment* about how to experience God in the world, and that through this discernment, directees can find a vocation. Directors spoke of directees who have changed their job according to the vocation that they discovered through spiritual direction and have started to work voluntarily for the service of the community; these directees made that decision through the ‘consideration of choice of life status’ and ‘discernment’ during the Exercises.⁸⁶

Shona noted that:

I think part of the Exercises is a global awareness, where we fit into that global responsibility, so I think that can help people to look outwards and ask how I should be using my life...in small ways or in big ways...even if it’s something like recycling or using fair-trade goods or that kind of global responsibility, but also if people can change their lifestyle or even their career, it can bring up a question mark; ‘what should I be doing with the rest of my life? Discernment is a big part of the Exercises.⁸⁷

Kate also noted:

There’s quite a lot about reconciliation and I’ve focused a bit on the forgiveness, but there’s also naming the truth in love. Serving society is how could I serve God in the world... naming...the ills of society, or naming things that aren’t right is often a part towards reconciliation...For instance in our ecological thing... We’ve

⁸² Nancy, pp.18-19, Shona, p.12, Kate, p.14

⁸³ Nancy, pp.18-19, Shona, p.12, Kate, p.14

⁸⁴ Shona, p.12

⁸⁵ Kate, p.14, Nancy, p.19

⁸⁶ Jamie, a directee of Kate, and Kyle, a directee of Shona, had changed jobs through their experience of the Spiritual Exercises. These cases will be explored in the section of this chapter that deals with directees.

⁸⁷ Shona, pp.12-13

got it wrong here, how can you move towards being reconciling about how we share the resources of the planet.⁸⁸

Ignatian spiritual direction helps directees discern how to serve the community and society for God and how to act God's love in the world; in particular, the Exercises draw directees to journey towards this aim. According to directors, directees who restored their identity in God became aware that everybody is made in His image and that the world is also a creation of God, so everyone needs to be taken care of and loved; therefore, the directees begin to commit themselves to God's plan for the world and humanity.

6.2.9. Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church

Directors clarified that, while the Ignatian way places a traditional emphasis on listening to individuals' experiences of prayer and their internal impressions of the Holy Spirit, the Presbyterian Church attributes special importance to paying attention to God's word delivered through preachers' sermons and to the acquisition of knowledge, such as through Bible study. Thus, this difference poses major difficulties for the Presbyterian Church in its approach to the Ignatian way. However, directors believed that the Ignatian tradition can be an appropriate means to enhance people's spiritual journey in that discernment is a tool that enables directees to have an interior experience of God. Moreover, the Ignatian way is heavily based on Scripture. Meanwhile, directors believed that the Exercises can be adapted according to people and situations, so can be used as part of the ministry in the Church of Scotland.⁸⁹

For example, Nancy contended that:

The Church of Scotland, certainly, is very 'heady'; its Bible study is about understanding, it's not about experiencing, so people struggle...Ignatian spirituality is hugely Scripture based, it's wholly Scripture based and it's about the life of Jesus and the difference that makes to people's lives, so it's very Protestant.⁹⁰

Kate made a similar point:

I think the main problem is the emphasis on experience, because in the Church of Scotland, there's been a tradition of authority being given from the minister. [But]

⁸⁸ Kate, pp.14-15

⁸⁹ Kate, pp.19-20, Nancy, p.20

⁹⁰ Nancy, pp.19-20

in the Ignatian tradition we're listening for the inner authority of the Spirit. There might be some difficulty with that...so I use discernment tools from the Ignatian tradition, different ways of praying...what it is to come into a sense of your true self before God and what it means to trust your own inner experience of God.

When asked if she thought the Ignatian way could be part of the Presbyterian ministry, Kate responded as follows:

I don't think there's a problem, and in the Church of Scotland in our ministry department, they're now asking that there be people involved in spiritual direction and, because the main form in Scotland is Ignatian, they're very open to it being Ignatian...[ministry department] asked for the probationer ministers for two years to have spiritual direction as part of their growing, as part of their experience...One of the things Ignatius said was that you accommodate the Exercises to the person that you're giving them to... [There is] a great suppleness with the Exercises.⁹¹

For directors, although the Ignatian spiritual direction is somewhat different from the Church of Scotland, the emphasis on Scripture, the discernment of God's will, and Ignatius's focus on flexibility for application all mean that it can be applicable to the Church of Scotland. Moreover, as one director noted, the Church of Scotland now encourages ministerial candidates to experience spiritual growth.

6.3. The findings of directees' interviews

In their answers to the questions posed by this research, Scottish directees noted that it was difficult to differentiate the learning they achieved through their experience of the Exercises from the learning they achieved through their experience of monthly spiritual direction. Six out of 7 directees had been taking part in monthly direction for a long period; from 5 years to 13 years. Moreover, all 5 directees who had finished the Exercises experienced them either in the course of monthly direction or after they finished other training in the Ignatian Spirituality Centre, and some joined monthly direction as soon as they had finished the Exercises. Therefore, they contended that their spiritual journey had progressed with all of these experiences of spiritual direction, which they felt were not easy to distinguish from one another. For that reason, spiritual direction was used by directees as a term to encompass both the Exercises and on-going monthly spiritual direction. However, they sometimes gave specific examples of their prayer during their Exercises. One of the 2 directees who had not made the Exercises had been taking part in

⁹¹ Kate, pp.18-20

monthly direction for 9 years and she shared a similar experience to the 5 directees who had finished the Exercises. Another directee had been attending only monthly direction for 2 years without making the Exercises and, while she had a similar level of understanding to the other directees, sometimes revealed a lack of actual experience of the fruits of spiritual direction compared to the others. This will be discussed further throughout the following sections.

6.3.1. Understanding personal reconciliation

Directees had a number of different understandings of personal reconciliation. These included: a deeper relationship with God,⁹² ‘a connectedness with God: discovering that God’s desire and one’s desire are connecting’,⁹³ ‘fully living in God’,⁹⁴ ‘oneness with God’,⁹⁵ ‘oneness with oneself’,⁹⁶ ‘a deepened awareness of God’,⁹⁷ ‘inner peace’,⁹⁸ ‘the ordered life’,⁹⁹ ‘healing’,¹⁰⁰ ‘transformation from internal negativity to positivity’,¹⁰¹ ‘freedom’,¹⁰² ‘self-awareness or self-acceptance’,¹⁰³ ‘restoration of relationships with others’,¹⁰⁴ and ‘living as a Christian in relation to others in the world’.¹⁰⁵ First, all directees described a deeper relationship with God and a deepened awareness of God and oneself as the key component of personal reconciliation. Amongst the 7 directees, 4 defined personal reconciliation as a connection, oneness, and deeper reconciliation with God, and having a sense of inner peace through a deepened understanding of God’s compassion.

Jamie described personal reconciliation in terms of his connection with God at the deepest core of his being and fully living in God:

⁹² Amy, p.3

⁹³ Jamie, p.3

⁹⁴ Jamie, p.3, Flora, p.2

⁹⁵ Flora, p.2

⁹⁶ Flora, p.2, Jenny, p.3, Clara, p.3, Kyle, p.3

⁹⁷ Jenny, p.3

⁹⁸ Jenny, p.3

⁹⁹ Jenny, p.3

¹⁰⁰ Amy, p.3, Jenny, p.3

¹⁰¹ Clara, p.3, Kyle, p.3

¹⁰² Clara, p.3, Kyle, p.3

¹⁰³ Jamie, p.3, Kyle, p.3, Clara, p.3, Martin, p.3

¹⁰⁴ Martin, p.3

¹⁰⁵ Amy, p.3

In Ignatian terms, your deepest desires are not completely at conflict with what God's desire for your life is. Before [spiritual direction] it might have been that God's will was separate from my will and that God had a separate desire from my desire and that I had to bend to His will. Whereas through this process, I understand that personal reconciliation is, at my deepest core, what God longs for me...and that you are powerfully alive and functioning when you have this sense of discovering God's will and your will connecting.¹⁰⁶

Flora used the term 'one's oneness with God' to explain her concept of personal reconciliation:

An individual feeling at one with God and with oneself, and that God wants us to have full lives, and part of that is needing to be at one with ourselves in the light of God's love. And so, obviously in the Christian faith we talk about that as happening through Jesus.¹⁰⁷

Amy depicted the notion of personal reconciliation as working out the meaning of spiritual and psychological salvation for a person; she understood reconciliation as the recovery of a spiritual relationship with God and recognized healing as a psychological process. In addition, she believed that such personal reconciliation also encompasses living as a Christian in relation to others in the world.¹⁰⁸

Jenny illustrated the concept of personal reconciliation as peacefulness within oneself and the ordered life caused by a deep encounter with God's compassion.¹⁰⁹ Two other directees, Clara and Kyle, identified it as inner freedom caused by the transformation of negativity within them. These terms, 'inner freedom' and 'transformation', seem to be understood as self-awareness or self-acceptance in the sense that they can embrace negativity as a part of themselves, which can then help them to accept themselves as they are. Clara defined personal reconciliation in terms of inner freedom brought about by understanding the shadow within her:¹¹⁰

¹⁰⁶ Jamie, p.3 Jamie identified God as the 'life-giving force' and 'life-giving love'. He commented that '[God is] within me as well as beyond me. We're all connected in different ways with this life-giving force, this life-giving love. So, deeply within me but also deeply within other people and in the life of the world.' Also, the other Scottish directees and directors often used the term 'life-giving' to describe their experience in spiritual direction: for example, 'life-giving energy', 'life-giving force', 'life-giving love', and 'life-giving experience'.

¹⁰⁷ Flora, p.2

¹⁰⁸ Amy, p.3

¹⁰⁹ Jenny, p.3

¹¹⁰ Clara, p.3, Kyle, p.3

Understanding that I am both good and bad, and light and dark, and that my freedom will come by embracing my 'shadow side',¹¹¹ so that I'm...set off to be who I am. Not saying I will get rid of it, but acknowledging it and recognizing that I will grow ... What I have experienced is freedom internally.¹¹²

Kyle also commented on personal reconciliation in terms of transformation of negativity within a person:

I am very aware of the part of me that responds to situations sometimes with generosity and patience...but I am also aware of part of me that responds with not patience, with selfishness, pride, ego, and so on. For me, personal reconciliation is moving in the direction of goodness, of coming to terms with the fact that there is a bad, selfish part of me... allowing it to be transformed.¹¹³

In order to understand further, I asked Kyle what he thought was the cause of such a transformation:

I understand that as cooperation between God and me. The image of God I have is a potter and I am clay. I have an image that God loves me and...accepts me as I am. He loves me so much and he wants me to be better than I am, and is in the process of transforming me, and I am trusting God and responding to God and inviting Him to change me.¹¹⁴

One directee defined personal reconciliation as self-awareness and self-acceptance, and restoration in relationships with others. He had participated in counselling for twelve years before he began spiritual direction and believed that self-awareness developed into awareness of God:

Personal reconciliation is a restoration of the relationship between one or more people ... a renewing of the relationship ... I have become more aware of myself, learning to love myself and accept myself; that certainly helped the process of accepting that God loves me with a perfect love that is unconditional.¹¹⁵

¹¹¹ Some directees used the term 'shadow', which in Jungian psychology is a part of the unconscious mind consisting of repressed weaknesses, shortcomings, and instincts. Jung's term 'shadow' and 'the inferior part of the psyche' contains more than something merely negative. He explains that through self-knowledge and by exploring our own soul, we come upon the light and shadow inside us. However, directees understood 'shadow' as only the negative such as past hurt and sinfulness. See C.G.Jung, *The Undiscovered Self*, R.F.C. Hull, trans., (New York: Signet, 1957), p.107.

¹¹² Clara, p.3

¹¹³ Kyle, p.3

¹¹⁴ Kyle, pp.3-4

¹¹⁵ Martin, p.3

Personal reconciliation defined by directees was a feeling of oneness with God and with themselves brought about by a deepened and closer relationship with God. It could be expressed as freedom, transformation, healing, self-acceptance, and an awareness of being loved by God; moreover, it should also be practiced for the renewal of relationships with others. In the following section, I will look at the ways in which directees experienced personal reconciliation in the spiritual direction process.

6.3.2. Directees' understanding of personal reconciliation and spiritual direction

For all directees, spiritual direction was a space to support and encourage personal reconciliation because it enabled them to be more aware of who God was and how God had directed their lives; 'not getting in the way of God's plan for me', as one directee put it.¹¹⁶ They also clarified that spiritual direction increased their awareness of who they were and how they responded to God. For these reasons, they could be healed and could see themselves objectively. Moreover, directees suggested that these processes were led by God and they could cooperate in personal reconciliation through responding to God's lead. For example, Jamie described spiritual direction as a process to foster directees to reconcile their wills and God's will in their deepest core:

I suppose the process of spiritual direction is about helping each person to reconcile these bits of themselves [one's desire and God's desire], to become more connected, for God and self to blend more. This process is the more objective, detached process of somebody sitting down with somebody else and helping them to discover or work towards personal reconciliation.¹¹⁷

Martin saw spiritual direction as a 'launching pad' for his spiritual journey, 'a foundation, a base for journeying into a new world of exploration'.¹¹⁸ For Jenny, spiritual direction was a space to experience immense healing and inner peace. She spoke about her experience of the vast healing of the wound caused by her mother and the pain she felt after the suicide of her husband:

Spiritual direction has wakened me up, has really made me much more aware of hidden causes of unhappiness and ill-health and disordered states of mind. And also it has enabled me to then make peace with certain people that I know who I had to make amends with...and it seems important to me to make sure that I have

¹¹⁶ Clara, p.3

¹¹⁷ Jamie, p. 3

¹¹⁸ Martin, p. 3

not got any un-dealt with people in my circle, people in my family and particularly in my close family. My first husband died when I was 29 and my children were 6 and 4. I've always known they would go through some pain in their adult life. I've carried it with me all my life and in the last two years they have both gone through a very, very painful time in both their lives. I've had to do an incredible amount of revisiting the past with them, and a lot of crying and a lot of talking about things, and it's been amazingly healing and God has been in that.¹¹⁹

Moreover, Amy, along with Jenny, suggested that spiritual direction enabled her to gain self-awareness in relationships with others, functioning as a safe place to explore what had happened and to work out how responsible you and others were for the conflict. This had, she felt, a positive impact on her relationships.¹²⁰ Directees believed there was a connection between their spiritual well-being and their psychological state. They reported that they felt 'more relaxed',¹²¹ 'free',¹²² 'less prickly',¹²³ and 'much happier, more alive, lighter, more flexible and energetic, humour, and more laughter',¹²⁴ 'strength',¹²⁵ 'security in God'.¹²⁶ They also believed that their lives were now 'more holistic'¹²⁷ and 'balanced',¹²⁸; they enjoyed 'greater freedom from guilt',¹²⁹ 'greater freedom',¹³⁰ they felt 'much more space and lighter',¹³¹ and 'less anxiety'.¹³² Only 3 out of 7 directees were aware at the time of their interview that there was a connection between their spiritual and physical states. The directee who had lost her husband and another who had a seriously ill sister did, however, emphasized a pivotal connection between spiritual well-being and physical health.¹³³ Jenny illustrated her concept of this correlation:

If you rest inwardly it feeds into your immune system... your nervous system and your sense of well-being... Spiritual health is...part of the whole cycle of saying yes to life...I think our body stores memories and your body tells you things that

¹¹⁹ Jenny, p. 5

¹²⁰ Amy, p. 3

¹²¹ Clara, p.14

¹²² Martin, p.13, Kyle, p.13

¹²³ Kyle, p.14

¹²⁴ Jamie, p.10

¹²⁵ Martin, p.12 Martin used this term in the sense that 'I am able to do that'.

¹²⁶ Clara, p.8

¹²⁷ Jenny, p.16, Amy, p.12

¹²⁸ Jenny, p.16

¹²⁹ Martin, p.13

¹³⁰ Kyle, p.13

¹³¹ Kyle, p.15

¹³² Flora, p.10

¹³³ Jenny, p.16, Flora, p.14

your mind doesn't want to hear. I've heard God in my body but my mind has refused to listen.¹³⁴

In contrast, 3 directees reported that they had not seriously considered the correlation between their spiritual state and physical health; however, in the course of the interview, they became aware of this correlation and reported that they did experience 'heaviness'¹³⁵ 'tension',¹³⁶ and 'stomach-ache'¹³⁷ when in a spiritually unhealthy state. Only one directee who had not been aware of any connection between his spiritual health and physical health continued to express the view that such a connection was not important to him.¹³⁸

As seen above, spiritual direction experienced by directees is an effective means of facilitating personal reconciliation; it is based on the directees' experience of God's life-giving love, endless forgiveness, acceptance for humanity, and their own objective self-awareness. In addition, personal reconciliation triggered through a deep encounter with God affected their psychological well-being, physical health, and developed relationship with others. In some of the following sections, I will consider what directees mean by their experience of personal reconciliation through spiritual direction more deeply.

6.3.3. Directees' reasons for spiritual direction

There were various reasons for directees beginning spiritual direction. However, the primary reason concerned their relationship with God; they wanted to feel spiritually nurtured, to care for their faith, and desired to seek solutions for their personal problems within this relationship. Five directees described these desires and this is highlighted in Kyle's comment:

[The reason I came for spiritual direction was] for help deepening my walk with God. I wanted to deepen my experience of my prayer life and of God in my heart and wanted help to deepen that kind of experience.¹³⁹

Directees' desire for spiritual growth was connected with their desire for an additional way of enhancing their own spiritual care, besides worship and programmes in their

¹³⁴ Jenny, p.16

¹³⁵ Jamie, p.10

¹³⁶ Kyle, p.15

¹³⁷ Clara, p.15

¹³⁸ Martin, p.14

¹³⁹ Kyle, p.2

churches. For example, Amy and Flora, who were ministers, stated the need for support and for taking care of their own faith.¹⁴⁰

The three other directees noted that they started spiritual direction in order to seek solutions within their relationship with God for the problems in their lives and in their families, churches, and workplaces. For example, Jenny noted that she felt a need to seek answers as to why there was affliction in her past life:

I was at a very difficult stage in my life and I had to face a lot of pain. The Exercises was a wonderful way of allowing God to accompany me through that pain and make some very difficult decisions. I'm almost sure that I wouldn't have been able to make certain decisions in the time that I did if I hadn't been doing the Ignatian Exercises.¹⁴¹

Clara, who came to spiritual direction in order to learn how to cope with relational problems in her church, described her experience as follows:

My husband is a minister, and we had come to a church that had very, very difficult relational problems. We had been there fifteen years. It had a lot of money, but it didn't have personnel who were comfortable. Money was power. I realized I had always known it was affecting me personally. I began to think if I didn't somehow deal with it, I was going to end up bitter and twisted and actually not much use to the church. So that was when I went to the first spiritual director because I wanted...help... to try to come to terms with what was happening there. I would be able to continue my life.¹⁴²

Martin also noted that his reason for seeking spiritual direction was 'growth' but he realized that this desire was caused by difficult situations in his church.¹⁴³ One directee stated that he began spiritual direction in order to overcome the disconnected feelings within him caused by his sense of a disconnection between the Church and the world, and a sense of questioning as to how the rest of his life might develop, because his life in the Church 'was feeling too restrictive and it was more about the Church than the world'.¹⁴⁴ Most of the directees stated that the Church of Scotland does not deal specifically with individual growth at a personal level but rather deals with strategies and plans for

¹⁴⁰ Amy, p.1, Flora, p.1

¹⁴¹ Jenny, p.1

¹⁴² Clara, p.1

¹⁴³ Martin, p.2

¹⁴⁴ Jamie, p.2

changing the Church at a congregational level.¹⁴⁵ In particular, 3 out of 7 interviewees argued that, for most Church members, the purpose of attending the Church had been social, in the sense that congregants were seeking social instead of spiritual needs.¹⁴⁶ They expressed the view that the Church was becoming like a social club:

I think many of them [members of her church] would worship the church rather than God. Most of that congregation [in my church] did not see...what Church was for. Much more social, it was a funny kind of social.¹⁴⁷

Nevertheless, Martin contended that, despite this, there were some people who kept the Church from becoming merely a social club:

Within every congregation there are a good number of people – I call them nuggets of gold – lovely people who are interested in spirituality, who are interested in growing in faith, who are interested in wanting to know more and do more. They're not interested in the social aspects, and these are the people who are keeping the Church – in the spiritual sense – alive.¹⁴⁸

Thus, the reasons why directee interviewees began spiritual direction can be summed up as follows: a desire to be more connected with God, a desire for a deepened relationship with God, a longing for the healing of wounds caused by afflictions in their lives, and a yearning to cope with the difficulties in their relationships with others. Overall, these reasons can be summarized as a craving for the restoration and growth in their relationship with God, themselves, and others. Their reasons for beginning spiritual direction correspond with their understanding of personal reconciliation. That is, directees started spiritual direction to seek the things that defined personal reconciliation for them. This diverges slightly from directors' understanding of directees' motivation for coming to spiritual direction. As suggested by directors, directees' had desire for an intimate and a deeper relationship with God, whereas directees expressed the idea that their initial motivation was much more related to the resolution of personal matters: healing, difficulty in relationship with others, and questions relating to afflictions in their past.

The question regarding their decision to come for spiritual direction was given to directees at the start of the interviews. As these interviews progressed, much deeper

¹⁴⁵ Martin, p.9

¹⁴⁶ Martin, p.10, Clara, p.2, Kyle, p.21

¹⁴⁷ Clara, p.2

¹⁴⁸ Martin, p.10

wounds, brokenness, and suffering in their personal life histories, family, and church communities were revealed. One interviewee talked about being left with two young children after her husband's death; another spoke about her story of struggling with her difficult relationship with her father. Also, there were ministers and ministers' wives who had felt stressed for a long time about their relationships with church members. Directees' need for growth in their relationship with God can be understood as a yearning for wholeness, as one created in the image of God, for inner healing, and for offering forgiveness to others. In the remainder of this chapter, directees' understanding of the interrelationship between spiritual direction and personal reconciliation will be considered.

6.3.4. Directees' expectations of and satisfaction with spiritual direction

As seen above, directees' expectations of spiritual direction were related to their reasons for coming to spiritual direction and their primary expectations can be summarized as a desire to articulate their 'journey with God',¹⁴⁹ to care for their faith and to feel connected and grounded in God.¹⁵⁰ Besides hoping to experience this kind of growth, directees also expressed other expectations. One emphasized that she expected healing within herself and her family.¹⁵¹ Another, who came for spiritual direction having experienced relational problems with her church members, expected to be able to name her fears and take some responsibility. She felt that her expectations were being met and it was an on-going process.¹⁵²

Two other directees also described their experience of release from fear and anxiety through the spiritual direction process.

My sister has bi-polar disorder, manic depression, and that happened before I started spiritual direction; she had a massive break down, so my awareness of my need to take care of myself grew deeply in that time. I would say spiritual direction has been vital to my psychological state in terms of well-being, definitely.¹⁵³

¹⁴⁹ Clara, p.2

¹⁵⁰ Flora, p.2, Jamie, p.2

¹⁵¹ Jenny, p.3

¹⁵² Clara, p.2

¹⁵³ Flora, p.11

[I could] become more trusting of God and less anxious about the future. I think that would be learning to live in the present more.¹⁵⁴

Kyle and Amy suggested that they expected to get directive and instructional answers from their spiritual directors; however, during the process, they became more aware of the non-directive nature of Ignatian spiritual direction and have been increasingly satisfied with the process. They understood the role of the director as helping directees reflect on their experience of God in their prayer and lives, and discerning God within their prayer and lives, both of which are significant elements in Ignatian spiritual direction.¹⁵⁵ Through this understanding, their expectations of and satisfaction with spiritual direction were changed. For example, Kyle noted his increased contentment with the process, how it had been, 'a growth for me, there's been a journey and I am grateful for the journey that I've been on'.¹⁵⁶ The response of Amy, who had been attending only monthly direction for 2 years without making the Exercises, needs to be reflected upon in terms of her satisfaction with spiritual direction:

I thought it would be more directive in terms of spiritual framework and prayer, and actually in practice it has been more about discerning God in the midst of the things that have happened during the month. And that has been good and constructive.¹⁵⁷

Amy admitted that she had been disappointed at first when she felt that her hopes for spiritual direction had not been met, but discovered that monthly spiritual direction dealt with discerning God in her life during each month.¹⁵⁸ So, as she progressed, her expectations changed and she became satisfied with the process; 'It's not been exactly what I expected but it has still fulfilled an important purpose. That's been good'.¹⁵⁹ Comparing Amy's experiences with those of the other directees, it seems that her initial expectations of forming a spiritual framework and learning prayer through spiritual direction could have been met if she had completed the Exercises, because directees who did so suggested that they were a very powerful tool in enabling them to become much more intimate with God through their practice of praying with Scripture.

¹⁵⁴ Jamie, p.4

¹⁵⁵ Kyle, p.2, Amy, p.2

¹⁵⁶ Kyle, p.3

¹⁵⁷ Amy, p.2

¹⁵⁸ Amy, p.2

¹⁵⁹ Amy, p.3

In terms of their satisfaction with spiritual direction, the other 5 directees responded in very positive ways. For example, according to Jamie, 'It's been hugely helpful. It's helped me discover a whole new way of praying related to Scripture, so it's exceeded expectations'.¹⁶⁰ Martin stated that he, 'enjoyed discovering the reflective contemplation, imaginative journeys, discovering the colloquy, the conversation with God, the richness, how God sees me, and within the whole package a tremendous alleviation and freedom'.¹⁶¹ Similarly, Jenny described her experience thus:

Jesus' words about taking up our Cross now have a whole new meaning for me. Our lives are almost a mirror of the journey of Jesus and if we are with Jesus then we are going to have to die. We face what would be unbearable for us and somehow God makes us more human. I've always been trying to be spiritual and pious and God only wanted me to be human ... The whole Ignatian thing about finding God in everything really opened up for me paying attention to all of myself because God was trying to speak to me, so it was an extremely profound experience.¹⁶²

Clara, who expected to learn how to cope with relationship problems in her church, noted that she was satisfied with spiritual direction. However, she also clarified in the latter part of her interview that, despite feeling less stressed about these problematic relationships, the process of their restoration was not easy:

I think the relationship between myself and them was certainly improved. I don't honestly think that it was until I left that I was able to really work it through. At that time all it really did for me was allow me to continue to cope.¹⁶³

Clara also noted that spiritual direction challenged her to learn to let go, gain a sense of detachment, and work alongside God; this allowed her to forget her negative experience:

I might have walked away from it, and somehow not been able to repair the relationship totally ... So it is not only just forgiven, but forgotten ... When we left the church I made a decision that the retreat in daily life would be to forgive these people. I took them and brought them to God one by one. Didn't really experience anything but just kept doing. But when I had completed that retreat and I was reflecting a month later, I realized that it wasn't affecting me anymore.

¹⁶⁰ Jamie, p.2

¹⁶¹ Martin, p.3

¹⁶² Jenny, pp.1-2

¹⁶³ Clara, p.2

When I can think about them...I don't think angry thoughts. So I think spiritual direction has helped me to do that.¹⁶⁴

Along with Clara, 5 other directees also suggested that they had struggled with wounds and painful memories caused by problematic relationships with their parents and conflicts and broken trust between church members and close friends.¹⁶⁵ They began to understand more about those they were in conflict with and to have an open heart toward others; however, these relationships were not yet completely restored. Therefore, it is important to consider the meaning of the reshaping of relationships in personal reconciliation for directees and the ways in which this can be actualized within their interpersonal relationships.

6.3.5. The changes in directees' image of God and love and trust of God

Directees' images of God were strengthened and their feelings towards God became much closer and more intimate because spiritual direction reminded them of a caring and loving God.¹⁶⁶ For example, Flora commented:

It's very much a deepening image of God as a companion throughout your whole life, and a close companion, not a distant God...it's not that it's changed dramatically, but it's just come into clearer focus...it's a bit like going from ordinary, old-fashioned black and white TV, to High Definition. Really clear!¹⁶⁷

Kyle similarly noted the following:

I have always thought of God being both transcendent and immanent...as being out there and in here, but the shift has been the balance. I have a much greater sense of God in me, God in you, and God in each person I meet. I have much greater sense that God is present in the whole world...Before, God was in the distance, now God is much closer.¹⁶⁸

For some directees, their image of God before starting spiritual direction was that of a God who was distant from them, who was judgmental, who drove them, and had an

¹⁶⁴ Clara, pp.12-13

¹⁶⁵ Wounds from the relationship with parents ; Jenny, p.3, Amy, p.9
Conflicts and broken trust with church members; Martin, p.5, Kyle, p.27, Clara, p.1

Broken trust with close friends; Flora, p.4

¹⁶⁶ Flora, p.4, Clara, p.4, Kyle, p.5, Martin, p.4

¹⁶⁷ Flora, p.4

¹⁶⁸ Kyle, p.5

unbending will in His decisions and choices even though they had called God a father.¹⁶⁹ Now, however, they experience God as a God who is full of compassion and eternally loves and forgives and longs for everybody to live in their fullness in God.¹⁷⁰ Jamie commented on these changes:

I've never not had a concept of a loving God. I've never had an image of a relentless or punishing God. But it's maybe changed more from a God who drives perhaps and who has an unbending will, to one who beckons and calls and offers choice. And certainly a strengthening of the concept of a God who endlessly loves and forgives and longs for everybody to flourish as human beings.¹⁷¹

In addition, Jenny was aware of God as wounded and weeping for those suffering and for the world.¹⁷² She clarified that she realized that God was there in people's painful past. Her experience was much more intense than the other directees in terms of the changes to the image of God

My image of God has been totally deconstructed and reconstructed. It's a much kinder of image of God, and I now can think of God as mother as well as father and it's an image that now is full of compassion and is able to bring renewal and transformation out of what seems completely broken fences in our lives and our job is to help each other mend the broken fences and let God's love help repair all the brokenness in our lives.... I think if I can break my heart over someone's pain then my pain is just a tiny reflection of God's pain, so it's very much more gentle, compassionate.¹⁷³

Clara argued that the crucial change to her image of God was in the image of Jesus. Before the process, Jesus was a model she had to emulate and an example that she kept trying to follow. However, during contemplation of the life of Jesus, she realized with her heart, not with her head, that Jesus was a human being, having vulnerability and powerlessness, and that he had come to Earth with endless love and suffered on the Cross for humanity.¹⁷⁴ She describes the change to her image of Jesus thus:

Clara: I realized that I had a very strong relationship with God as father, Abba, Shepherd, but my relationship with Jesus was more in terms of, he was this model I had to attain to...Now the shift there would have been that Jesus became friend as well as saviour. I laughingly describe it as being I had a great fear of men in

¹⁶⁹ Kyle, p.5, Clara, p.7, Jamie, p.4

¹⁷⁰ Jamie, p.4, Jenny, p.8, Flora, p.4

¹⁷¹ Jamie, p.4

¹⁷² Jenny, p.8

¹⁷³ Jenny, p.8

¹⁷⁴ Clara, p.12

grey suits, and in a funny way I had made Jesus a man in a grey suit, somebody with power, even though I knew he had vulnerability and powerlessness. In fact, in my mind, he was out there. So that would be a significant shift for me.

Researcher: Now, Jesus is your friend in intimate relationship...

Clara: Yes, a much more intimate...encouraging relationship. I had lived by the phrase, 'come to me, abide in me, live in me, go for me'. And that 'go' was a very 'do it yourself' and the transformation would have been in John, in the end of John's gospel, when Jesus says to Peter, 'follow me'. And that suddenly was transformative for me. That wasn't something I had to do on my own. I was just walking in his footsteps. He was no longer distant.¹⁷⁵

This changed image of Jesus enabled Clara to allow God to work through her. It was a formative experience for her and she was able to call Jesus her friend. For the other directees, God became 'an intimate father',¹⁷⁶ 'a friend',¹⁷⁷ 'a mother',¹⁷⁸ and 'a companion'.¹⁷⁹ They still preferred to call God 'God and the Great Spirit as the Power beyond the Universe',¹⁸⁰ or 'Lord',¹⁸¹ but the image of God in these terms now felt much closer to them.

When asked how their love and trust for God had changed, directees suggested two keywords: they said that both had 'deepened' and become 'clearer'. They had love and trust for God before spiritual direction, but that process had strengthened these and they realized that God would be there for them in difficult situations.¹⁸² One directee presented his experience of contemplating the paralyzed man being carried by his friends to the roof of the house and then being lowered to Jesus' feet:

I pictured myself as the person being carried on the stretcher. But not in any way being afraid. I was completely trusting, so there's always been a deep trust there, all I can say is it's been strengthened and affirmed in this process; even if life is difficult and life throw knocks at you.¹⁸³

Directees suggested that their encounter with God and Jesus in the process of spiritual direction brought about the change to their image of God and Jesus. They were able to

¹⁷⁵ Clara, p.4

¹⁷⁶ Jamie, p.5, Clara, p.11, Kyle, p.11, Amy, p.9, Jenny, p.8

¹⁷⁷ Jamie, p.5, Clara, p.4

¹⁷⁸ Jenny, p.8

¹⁷⁹ Jamie, p.5, Flora, p.16

¹⁸⁰ Kyle, p.11

¹⁸¹ Kyle, p.11, Flora, p.8

¹⁸² Clara, p.4, Jenny, p. 8, Jamie, p.5

¹⁸³ Jamie, p.5

have a deeper sense of a loving, caring God and a God who was with them very intimately; therefore, they became more willing to serve God and follow Jesus. Along with such changes, directees also experienced a shift in their self-image and their perspectives on their lives, as will be discussed in the next section.

6.3.6. Changes in the directees' image of themselves and perspective on their lives

The language used by directees to describe the changes in their self-image and perspectives on their lives, was 'freedom or liberation',¹⁸⁴ 'it's ok to make mistakes and not to be super',¹⁸⁵ 'letting go and a sense of detachment',¹⁸⁶ and 'self-acceptance'.¹⁸⁷ They clarified that they became free from presuppositions such as the need for perfectionism within themselves. For example, Flora said:

There's [sic] been some specific things I've worked on with my director which are a kind of 'good girl' script... I can break free from that in my relationship with God... that God doesn't love me because I am a good girl, that God loves me full-stop.¹⁸⁸

Before attending spiritual direction, directees felt a lot of responsibility for what they were doing in their lives: the process of making decisions and the results of their actions. However, after commencing spiritual direction, they have had a much greater sense that God is at work in the world; their responsibility is to follow where God is leading them and to allow and assist God to do His work. Thus, they are content to wait and learn what it is they are supposed to do.¹⁸⁹ In fact, 3 of the directees stated explicitly that before spiritual direction, they led active, busy lives, but now, prefer to wait to hear God's will. Before, they did not say 'no' to people's requests and followed a lifestyle based upon the modern Western work ethic, without reflecting upon their internal lives.¹⁹⁰ Clara describes this change: 'I still have the same passions but I won't say 'yes' so readily, it's not for my needs in the same way'.¹⁹¹ Flora also mentioned the protestant work ethic: 'I come from a culture where hard work is good, you work hard and that's good. Spiritual direction has

¹⁸⁴ Martin, p.12, Amy, p.11

¹⁸⁵ Jamie, p.9

¹⁸⁶ Clara, p.13

¹⁸⁷ Flora, p.9

¹⁸⁸ Flora, p.9

¹⁸⁹ Clara, p. 3, Kyle, p. 4

¹⁹⁰ Flora, p.9, Jamie, p.9, Clara, p.3

¹⁹¹ Clara, pp. 3-4

helped me understand my attitude to myself, my attitude to others'.¹⁹² Concerning these changes of attitude, directees suggested the importance of discernment in making their decisions. Their willingness to wait while listening for God and attempting to discern God's will might seem to be a form of passivism, but they preferred to view it as a means of positioning themselves in the bigger picture of God. Kyle felt that he had 'a much better sense that God is the bigger player than I am. He is the leader and I am just a follower',¹⁹³ while Clara suggested that this involved three stages:

Firstly that I worked for God, not out of fear but out of a sense of duty that I had a task to do and He was trusting me with it. Secondly that I had a stage where I felt that I worked with God, that I tried to turn to Him deliberately to do His will. And latterly through spiritual direction, I would try to allow God to work through, where I would try not to block the work of God and be open to His nudging and call.¹⁹⁴

Most directees spoke about living a life that focuses on the present time rather than leading a past-oriented, future-oriented, or goal-oriented life; for, spiritual direction helps directees become more aware of what God is doing *now* in their lives.¹⁹⁵ Thus Jamie, for example, referred to a poem by R. S. Thomas to explain the importance of focusing on the present:

Life is not hurrying on to a receding future, nor hankering after an imagined past. It is the turning aside like Moses to the miracle of the lit bush, to a brightness that seemed as transitory as your youth once, but is the eternity that awaits you...So, the turning aside to the miracle of the present and being much more thankful for the present moment...¹⁹⁶

Jamie said that he was thankful for the present life, discovering the present miracle in everyday life that God had given him. His thankfulness for the present moment enabled him to overcome a sense of disconnection from his core purposes and to feel connection with God, himself, and others.¹⁹⁷ The directees felt that this decision to live life waiting to discern God's will enabled them to slow down and have inner peace, even during

¹⁹² Flora, p. 9

¹⁹³ Kyle, p. 5

¹⁹⁴ Clara, p.23

¹⁹⁵ Jamie, p. 4, Kyle, p. 4

¹⁹⁶ Jamie, p.4

¹⁹⁷ Jamie, p. 4

difficulties and periods of transition.¹⁹⁸ These changes to their life perspectives were caused by changes to their image of God and their own self-image.

6.3.7. *Sin*

The directees had all experienced a huge shift in their awareness of their sins. They preferred to refer to sinfulness as the ‘shadow side’,¹⁹⁹ ‘negativity’,²⁰⁰ and ‘selfishness’,²⁰¹ rather than ‘sin’ because they identified sin as a separation from God and feeling torn asunder due to alienation from God. Directees declared that before spiritual direction, they worked hard to resolve the guilt caused by their sins; after the process, they felt free of that feeling because they became aware of themselves as a graced sinner. They understood that, because God had forgiven all their sins and accepted them as they were, they received both mercy and compassion from God and they had learned to let go of guilt because guilt lets God, themselves, and others down.²⁰² Kyle described his experience:

In doing the 19th annotation...looking at my sinfulness and guilt, I felt a renewed sense of my guilt. But, I came to a deeper understanding that I was a continuing sinner. One who is loved and forgiven by God. So I had a greater reality of the bad things I had done, but at the same time...a greater awareness that God loved me. And then God was changing me, God was not rejecting me, but was working on me, and...changing me...that was the relief from getting that off my chest...²⁰³

Some of the directees declared that the Church of Scotland placed an emphasis on original sin, with the result that their sense of guilt grew within them; in contrast, the Exercises focus on human beings as graced and forgiven sinners, thus allowing them to experience feelings of freedom and liberation.²⁰⁴ For example, after depicting what she had done to resolve her guilt in spiritual direction, the researcher asked Clara why, before spiritual direction, she had felt guilt:

We have a church that has focused on original sin rather than original blessing and so grow up knowing you are a sinner...a very fearing place to be. And my tradition would have been liberal, so I didn’t experience a conversion, in the sense of that kind of sudden liberation, I just grew into the church, this was a

¹⁹⁸ Amy, p. 4, Clara, p. 3

¹⁹⁹ Clara, p.6

²⁰⁰ Clara, p.6

²⁰¹ Kyle, p.7

²⁰² Jamie, p.6, Flora, p.6, , Amy, p.7, Jenny, p.11, Jamie, p.6

²⁰³ Kyle, p.8

²⁰⁴ Clara, p.6, Martin, p.9

community that I wanted to join because I thought they made society better. We would go as far as to say that inward journey was selfish...²⁰⁵

Another shift in the directees' awareness of sin was that they had become aware of sin in the social system, as Martin described:

In the early stages of the Exercises, I redefined sin as a failure to love, in the context of love being God's love which we're called to do. [But] another phrase talked about sin in the system and it happened around the time of the economic problems. So I found that movement a tremendous step forward because I had often grappled with these big industrial issues, commercial issues, the multinational companies who abused countries from Central and South America, South East Asia and beyond out of sheer raw greed. My awareness of sin and wrongdoing has dramatically been changed, not only in terms of the observation as to how we contribute to it, but also as to how we can work towards solutions.²⁰⁶

Directees thus illustrated their shift in understanding sin as the self-awareness of themselves as graced sinners and as an expanded awareness of sin in the social system. Their new realization of sin occurred in the early stages of the Exercises, during the First and Second Week. Directees declared that they preferred to refer to sinfulness as a shadow side and negativity, as the Scottish directors suggested. The resolution of this theme was also related to healing, which is dealt with in the section below.

6.3.8. Healing: the change to directees' interpretation of affliction in their lives and of directees' life stories

Healing experienced by directees in spiritual direction is described as a liberating process.²⁰⁷ Amy defined spiritual direction as a healing process in terms of forgiving oneself, being at peace in oneself and one's identity, being more patient and seeing other people through Christ's eyes rather than one's own; it is, therefore, a transformative process.²⁰⁸ Healing was caused by directees' new interpretation of their life story and of their suffering, through seeing their lives from a new angle; God's perspective. In

²⁰⁵ Clara, p.6 Clara depicted her practical means for resolving negativity within her spiritual direction. 'I would be like the Psalms, I would shout and rant and rave, first. I would quite often write a letters to God about that as a way of kind of articulating for me, but also as a way of, in that articulation, hearing God's word as the way forward...And the other would be the imaginative contemplation in terms of practice for resolving...I felt free from guilt and I would recognize that...in that pain or wound...was where I will grow'.

²⁰⁶ Martin, p.7

²⁰⁷ Martin, p.22, Amy, p.10

²⁰⁸ Amy, pp.9-10

contemplating the Easter story, directees began to understand their life stories within the framework of a loving God; Jesus' story of the Cross and Resurrection was the key for this new framework. Firstly, directees described that there were changes in the ways that they interpreted their afflictions after commencing the spiritual direction. Prior to this, they felt only negative feelings, such as anger and loneliness; however, now they could accept suffering as a part of their lives rather than something fearful that should not be happening to them.²⁰⁹ For example, Kyle said:

Before I would have very much resented [suffering] and fought against it. Now, I have a much deeper sense of the suffering God who is with me in it and who can transform darkness into light; suffering into blessing and sin into that which is redeemed.²¹⁰

Martin commented about his reinterpretation of his life story:

Through the Exercises... 'My Blessed History' was instrumental in helping me become aware of the many people who played an important, positive part in my life, which could dominate the reflection on the life process. My life story appears more and more to have been lived in partnership with God.²¹¹

Jamie similarly commented:

I think the process simply helped me to affirm myself, my present, my future... that I am a unique person loved and precious for who I am. It helped me to be thankful for the many gifts that have been given and it reminded me that these can be put to use in many different ways.²¹²

Directees affirmed that they had learned that Jesus was with them in their suffering and had not abandoned them; and that, through their affliction, God changed them into a better person.²¹³

The second framework for reinterpreting their life stories was Jesus' story of Resurrection. Martin stated:

For many years, I recognized the Resurrection with my head, but not emotionally or even spiritually. During the Exercises, I experienced Easter emotionally and spiritually. Travelling with Jesus' experiences, and those of the disciples, I

²⁰⁹ Jamie, p.17, Kyle, p.24

²¹⁰ Kyle, p.24

²¹¹ Martin, p.21

²¹² Jamie, p.17

²¹³ Kyle, p.24, p.7, Jenny, p.14, Clara, p.23, Amy, p.18

touched the awfulness of Holy Week and it was really a time of feeling despair. On Easter Sunday, I experienced a sense of great lightness and joy. This was repeated during the next three days. Then, on the 4th day after the Resurrection, my prayer sailed into a colloquy with God the Father, reflecting on my life and experience. It was so liberating, almost producing elation. For the first time in my life, I had really experienced Easter.²¹⁴

Jamie noted that imagining himself present at the Resurrection gave him freshness and a new sense of life.²¹⁵ Jenny illustrated her experience of spiritual direction as a healing process. First, she said that her healing came from Mary's suffering with Jesus. She felt a motherly care from Mary, particularly as she had not felt that connection with her own mother, and this was extremely healing for her.²¹⁶ However, she did not want to talk about her healing experience from Mary too much because she thought it was not receptive to the Protestant tradition. Also, she felt that God had led her to spiritual poverty:

I have found it more and more unbearable to think of Mary's suffering as she walked the Cross. I have two sons and that was the visceral, physical, emotional pain that she went through watching him on the way to the Cross, watching him die...I feel God is drawing me to spiritual poverty. Spiritual poverty is being poor but also being empty. I think God chose Mary because she was empty, therefore God could fill her, so that she allows God to work through her...there's a lot to learn from Mary.²¹⁷

Clara, too, stated that Mary was a very good example of what it means to be a woman.²¹⁸ Both directees seem to consider Mary as being a role model of surrendering to God; yet, the two other female directees, who had not finished the Exercises and who are both ministers, did not talk about Mary, so perceptions about Mary cannot be generalized. Nevertheless, Jenny's interview shows that there is a desire for experiencing a motherly caring love as well as a fatherly guiding love from God.

As seen above, directees experienced healing primarily through Jesus' story and other Scriptural passages. Their healing can be summarized as the reinterpretation of their suffering and life story and is a liberating process.

²¹⁴ Martin, p.22

²¹⁵ Jamie, p.17

²¹⁶ Jenny, p.5

²¹⁷ Jenny, p.7

²¹⁸ Clara, p.10

6.3.9. *Forgiveness*

Directees' responses to the question of their experience of forgiving others showed how difficult the issue of forgiveness was for people to embody in their lives. Five out of 7 directees explained that they dealt with the issue of forgiveness of others in spiritual direction.²¹⁹ They found the grounds for their forgiveness of others in God's forgiveness of them. Most of the directees explained that God forgives and forgets their sins, so for them, God's forgiveness means God has forgotten their sins.²²⁰ However, they described that, in contrast, human beings keep remembering the sins of others, so they have to keep forgiving and re-forgiving. Therefore, for the directees, forgiving was learning to forget and let go of their hurt and disappointment caused by others.²²¹ Directees believed that spiritual direction helped them with this, and, although they could not yet forgive others perfectly, their bitterness and hurt had been resolved through the process.²²² They did not think that their broken relationships could ever return to their original, unbroken form; however, they tried to accept people as being loved and accepted by God.

Clara described her experience:

I would be more inclined to find a way to say what I was feeling than I was in the past...I might have walked away from it, and somehow not been able to repair the relationship totally. I am not saying I do that readily or easily, but I will try to keep working at it till I realize I don't even think about it when I'm with that person anymore. So it is not only just forgiven, but forgotten.²²³

Martin expressed his experience of forgiveness and difficulty in rebuilding broken relationships with those who hurt him:

It has lessened any feelings of resentment that can be very unhelpful and very festering, poisonous, so spiritual direction certainly helps, I can forgive them but ...a restoration in the relationship would...it takes two people to bring about reconciliation...Certainly forgiveness of them has lifted a burden from me.²²⁴

²¹⁹ Two directees had not dealt with forgiveness in their spiritual direction because one had no specific conflict with anyone, and the other, who had a short experience of spiritual direction without the Exercises, seemed not to have had the chance to cope with this issue; however, she had knowledge of forgiveness as a liberating process. Jamie, p.11, Amy, p.13

²²⁰ Clara, p.12, Jenny, p.17, Flora, p.8, Kyle, p.15, Amy, p.13

²²¹ Flora, p.12, Jenny, p.17

²²² Martin, p.15

²²³ Clara, p.12

²²⁴ Martin, p.15

On the other hand, spiritual direction offered a means by which directees could develop a positive perspective towards others. They believed that God never gives up on them; therefore, they need likewise to try not to give up on others and to discover God in others.²²⁵ As discussed above, such directees' attitudes towards others were caused by a deepened trust in God.²²⁶ However, some directees preferred to use the terms 'acceptance' and 'understanding', rather than 'trust' with regard to others because they believed that all human beings are created in the image of God and God will treat others in the same way that He treats them. However, they also acknowledged that all human beings have weaknesses and bad things within them.²²⁷ Hence, they had a mind to open up their hearts, listen to others, be patient with them, and embrace others as they are.

As described above, spiritual direction was not a space to learn forgiveness directly; rather, through encountering God's forgiving and accepting them, directees learned understanding and acceptance of others and learned to let go of bitterness and to forget what had happened in the past. However, directees found that forgiveness was difficult and could take a long time, so, although their resentment disappeared, the rebuilding of their original relationship was not easy. The rebuilding of the relationship was defined as interpersonal reconciliation by directees and will be discussed in section 6.3.11.

6.3.10. Directees' contemplation of Jesus' life in connection with their understanding of relationships

When asked to comment on their understanding of Jesus' life, directees used a number of key words which included 'healing',²²⁸ 'compassion',²²⁹ 'inclusion',²³⁰ and 'peace'.²³¹ Clara believed that healing was the key part of Jesus' ministry; in particular, His relationship with women could be seen as a process of healing.²³² She also gave an example of the healing ministry of Jesus:

²²⁵ Flora, p.8, Clara, p.5, Kyle, p.5

²²⁶ Clara, p.5, Flora, p.4

²²⁷ Amy, p.5, Martin, p.5, Clara, p.5

²²⁸ Clara, p.8

²²⁹ Amy, p.7, Kyle, p.10

²³⁰ Jamie, p.7

²³¹ Flora, p.7

²³² Clara, p.8

The man who stretched out the withered hand I can remember being very significant for me. I really don't have a withered hand, but I have a withered part of me. And what Jesus did in bringing him out, and...how he managed to have a conversation with him.²³³

For Flora, 'peace' was a key word in her contemplation of Jesus' relationships with others. She gave an example:

I went on a retreat in daily life and it coincided with this time when a person close to me had broken trust, and the passage we were focusing on was Jesus in the upper room with the disciples, appearing to them and saying 'peace be with you', and what struck me was the room where the disciples were. They were hiding away, they were fearful, they had messed up. Peter had denied Christ. And yet Jesus comes to the space and says 'don't be afraid. Peace be with you'...God wanted me to feel that peace...I had done some imaginative contemplation with that passage... that myself and this other person and some other people were all in the room with the disciples ...we were going to spend as long as it took to get back to that peaceful place before we left that room.²³⁴

Kyle, who described compassion as a key theme of Jesus' relationship to others, suggested that the tradition of Jesus in Gethsemane drew him to focus on the agony experienced by Jesus and eventually led him to begin a new ministry with others who are also experiencing agony.²³⁵ He gave an explanation of the motivations for changing his ministry:

I prayed with Jesus in the Garden of Gethsemane where he is lying on the ground in agony and I was simply being there beside him, with him in his agony. I was feeling a real pull to be with him and to be with others in their moments of agony. And I think that has a great deal to do with my new direction to work as a Chaplain in the hospital to be with people at times of great pain...And in other situations, other Gospel stories that I have prayed with [such as] the story of the Annunciation to Mary...When I was praying, it was not Mary that came up for me, it was not a typical Mary, it was an actual unmarried mother that I had visited in hospital who had a drug problem and other people like that and it was about being with them, so a huge theme has been about compassion.²³⁶

As shown above, directees' contemplation of Jesus' life in relationship with others showed that through imaginative contemplation, directees had a shift from understanding Jesus with their heads to experiencing him with their hearts. Such a shift affected directees' understanding of reconciliation on various levels.

²³³ Clara, p.8

²³⁴ Flora, p.7

²³⁵ Kyle, p.9

²³⁶ Kyle, p.10

6.3.11. *Reconciliation with others and life as an agent of reconciliation*

For directees, reconciliation involved accepting and acknowledging as a friend those who appear to be your enemy, transforming conflicts into peace, and expanding this to the wider community.²³⁷ Thus, they suggested two dimensions of reconciliation with others; interpersonal and communal. On the interpersonal level, directees believed that reconciliation was slightly different from forgiveness because reconciliation was the process of rebuilding and restoring relationships.²³⁸ One of the directees declared that reconciliation came when she was relieved of her fears about how people would react.²³⁹ Another stated that one of the greatest traps when conflicts arise involved starting to see only the bad in the other parties; he called this phenomenon ‘dehumanizing people and demonizing them’.²⁴⁰

Jenny illustrated why reconciliation with others was crucial:

The image I have is a blade of grass which grows up through concrete, and the concrete is really, really tough and the blade of grass is really, really delicate and it always amazes me that grass can grow up through stone, but it does. And no matter how hard you try to not deal with things that are going to disturb you, they find a way up to disturb you and make a crack in your foundations...²⁴¹

Kyle portrayed the relationship between reconciliation and spiritual direction:

Everyone is a mixture of good and bad but when conflict arises I start to only see the bad in them...Spiritual direction helps us, helps me to see the good and bad, and it gave me...strength to see others in that kind of human way...Spiritual direction has helped me to know that’s how God sees them as well as how God sees me. He knows that I’m selfish and He doesn’t reject me and He’s not rejecting them either. He’s wanting to save them, to work with them, and to bring about change.²⁴²

Kyle also suggested that reconciliation was a way to achieve peace; this involved reconciliation in a group, a community, and the whole world.²⁴³ Directees described the opposite of reconciliation as alienation, which included the alienation of people from God

²³⁷ Kyle, p.17, Flora, p.12, Clara, p.20

²³⁸ Clara, p.16, Neil, p.15, Jenny, p.17

²³⁹ Clara, p.16, p.20

²⁴⁰ Kyle, p.16

²⁴¹ Jenny, p.17

²⁴² Kyle, pp.16-17

²⁴³ Kyle, p.16

and from each other. In this regard, reconciliation meant to expand one's hospitality to a wider community. Directees noted that spiritual direction was a space for them to learn how to listen to God and discern God's will in conflict situations; therefore, it had a beneficial effect within their relationships with others because it is always connected with spiritual growth, self-awareness, generosity and openness to others, and hospitality towards strangers. Two of the directees also described alienation from the planet and from the environment. Thus, reconciliation involves the process of becoming one with all those things again.²⁴⁴

Jenny explained her idea on the relationship between reconciliation in the community and spiritual direction:

[Spiritual direction] has helped me to see how important it is to give and receive love with people around you, and in order to do that you have to be honest with yourself and honest with other people...I guess you find God in people unexpectedly when you start to see that... [When achieving societal reconciliation] individuals in their anonymous and innocuous encounters with the other and with the stranger are absolutely crucial. I think how we treat the stranger is a really important signal as to what kind of society we are. Our God is always welcoming the stranger and including...taking people in and not shutting people out.²⁴⁵

Kyle similarly commented on this theme:

Spiritual direction can help you to listen the voice of God, can help you to listen to the voice that calls you towards reconciliation...Through spiritual direction we are praying a story and we discover that the leper in that story is that person we met yesterday; and we can be enlarged and if we can be enlarged for one person, we can be enlarged for a group.²⁴⁶

Throughout their discussions of reconciliation, the theme of *Jesus including everybody* without excluding was key for directees. Within the correlation of reconciliation and spiritual direction, Flora suggested that the concept of reconciliation on a personal, interpersonal, and community level can be transformative through grounding in God and

²⁴⁴ Kyle, p.16, Clara, p.19

²⁴⁵ Jenny, p.18

²⁴⁶ Kyle, p.21

in the tools of discernment and prayer.²⁴⁷ Thus, for directees, communal or societal reconciliation was a process that started with changes to oneself.²⁴⁸

Flora also described the correlation of reconciliation on different levels, stating that she believed we should give each other second chances as God never gives up on anyone. This was particularly relevant for her as she grew up in Northern Ireland:

I have that background of seeing how badly things disintegrate when we don't tolerate and love one another, and so I'm very committed to taking the learning from our personal relationships about love, forgiveness, acceptance and tolerance, onto the bigger scale of community relationships and I think, how individuals relate to each other is like the tip of an iceberg and ...every relationship we enter into is the kind of bedrock of what violence is built on the top, if we don't get on with each other ...people will end up actually physically hurting each other, because if people can't relate to each other in other ways, somehow it ends up coming out in violence...So that kind of oneness with ourselves and with God can be the bedrock for transforming community relationships because we do have to pause and give each other that second chance; really listen to each other and try and see the others' perspective.²⁴⁹

Flora also emphasized the importance of deep faith for becoming an effective mediator, with the most effective being:

People who were very grounded in their own faith and genuinely desired to find God's will in a situation and who were also non-judgmental, accepting and desiring peace.²⁵⁰

Another directee, who decided through the Exercises to work in an anti-poverty organization rather than become an ordinary minister, suggested that spiritual direction and the Exercises could be a helping tool for those in situations of poverty:²⁵¹

I find, supporting anti-poverty work, you actually come across some amazingly generous people, who have so little themselves and are therefore deeply in touch with God...in their daily struggle, God is their friend who struggles with them...now spirituality and spiritual direction will be a huge help in people's daily struggle. I worked with a group in a poor part of Glasgow and we did some Ignatian Exercises and it certainly helped them physically be calm, because poverty is stressful, so the simple act of taking five minutes to prepare yourself for praying

²⁴⁷ Flora, p.12

²⁴⁸ Jamie, p.15, Jenny, p.18, Kyle, p.16

²⁴⁹ Flora, pp.8-9

²⁵⁰ Flora, pp.12-13

²⁵¹ Jamie, p.16 Jamie responded that the reason for changing direction in his life was that he found it more life-giving.

and to breathe slowly and taking ten minutes to meditate on a passage from the Gospels, and I do remember it helping them, strengthening them in their ability to cope with struggle...Jesus spends his life with people on the margins and God has a priority to the poor. So, the people that I journey with have a sense of God being with them...in their struggle...it's not easier but you're more able to cope...they journey with God in a very difficult place but it's a place where there's complete trust.²⁵²

Directees' responses ranged from rebuilding interpersonal broken relationships to reconciliation in the community and the restoration of God's Kingdom. They believed that personal reconciliation was key to reconciliation at interpersonal, communal, and societal levels because individual wrath and anger could explode into violence. Directees explained that an expanded understanding of humanity and the resolution of their bitterness through being embraced by God in spiritual direction strengthened them to walk together with others.

6.3.12. Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church

All directees expressed the view that spiritual direction could be part of the ministry of the Church of Scotland. They clarified that they learned the various forms of prayer distinctive to Ignatian spiritual direction.²⁵³ In particular, they believed that imaginative contemplation and *Lectio Divina* can be used for spiritual growth and healing because both of these prayer practices help people to personalize the stories of the Bible. Directees explained that ministers need to nurture themselves, so spiritual direction is more useful for ministers. However, they suggested that there are language issues with the Exercises; *Spiritual Exercises* has words that are unfamiliar to modern people and Presbyterians. One directee commented that 'direction' is perhaps too strong a word and 'accompaniment' seems more appropriate. She also felt that, in Scotland, there needed to be more than just Ignatian spiritual direction available; this would encourage more people to seek spiritual direction in the Church of Scotland.²⁵⁴

Conclusion

This chapter has explored in detail the 3 Scottish directors' and 7 Scottish directees' understanding and experience of personal reconciliation through Ignatian spiritual

²⁵² Jamie, pp.12-13

²⁵³ Clara, pp.20-21, Kyle, pp.22-23, Neil, p.18

²⁵⁴ Amy, p.6

direction. It has also explored how directees who developed personal reconciliation can act as an agent for reconciliation in individual relationships and in the wider community. For Scottish participants, personal reconciliation was identified as a transformative experience that was primarily found in the restoration of the relationship with God and a feeling of oneness with God, leading to healing and integration. Both directors and directees thought that personal reconciliation also included the development of relationship with others, enabled by the acceptance of others, as a creature of God the same as themselves. Furthermore, justice and peace, dynamics of reconciliation, were included in personal reconciliation by directors and directees. In the understanding of sin, both directors and directees described the expansion of their awareness of social structural sin through spiritual direction. They used the term strongly when referring to social sin, but in the discussion of individual sin, preferred the terms 'shadow' and 'negativity'.

Regarding the reason that directees come for direction, the explanation of directors and directees demonstrated there was a slight difference in expectation. Directors focused on directees' spiritual desire, but directees emphasised that they had hoped to resolve personal issues they had with their faith. In other words, directees had a deeper desire for healing and resolution of their past hurt than directors supposed.

Scottish participants explained that Ignatian spiritual direction was a powerful means of experiencing God's forgiveness and unconditional love through their encounter with the love of Jesus. In particular, it was very useful for experiencing healing because the contemplation of Jesus' life allowed them to create a new interpretation of both their suffering and life story, which led to a healing experience. They suggested that this also involved psychological and physical well-being. Such experiences enabled them to accept themselves as a forgiven sinner and others as creatures made in the image of God, the same as themselves. The imaginative prayer and discernment of the Ignatian way were crucial for directees to experience a sense of personal reconciliation; imaginative prayer allowed them to change their images of God, themselves and others, and discernment helped with their decision-making for their present and future lives. However, regarding the offering of forgiveness towards others, directees expressed how difficult it was to rebuild their broken relationships with those who had hurt them, although they let go of their bitterness and accepted others as a creature of God. This is a different viewpoint to that of the directors, who suggested that directees' healing experiences would flow to the

other and could be referred to as forgiveness. Thus, for directees, letting go of painful memories and feelings needs to be differentiated from the rebuilding of their old relationship. Nevertheless, they believed that God's hope for us is to build peaceful relationships with one another.

The Scottish participants suggested that reconciliation at a personal level was key for reconciliation at all levels because individual wrath and anger could explode into violence in individual relationships, communities, or societies. They explained that those who have experienced personal reconciliation can work as a reconciler; moreover, the spiritual direction process can help directees learn how to realize God's love in the broken world through discernment. They also suggested that Ignatian spiritual direction is applicable to the Church of Scotland, despite differences between the two traditions, but there is a need to modify some elements and unfamiliar language.

I will now move on to explore the Korean participants' understanding of personal reconciliation and in what ways they experienced personal reconciliation through the spiritual direction process.

CHAPTER SEVEN

SOUTH KOREAN INTERVIEW FINDINGS

The cohort of South Korean interviewee participants included 3 directors and 5 directees. All 3 directors were male ministers and professors in Presbyterian seminaries and the 5 directees had finished the M.Div. course and were studying spiritual theology in the Masters programme in a Presbyterian seminary. Four of the directee subjects were female and one was male.¹

7.1. The responses to questions

From the analysis of Korean interview data a number of key themes emerged, largely coinciding with those of the Scottish interview data.² Directors and directees were given a different number of questions, 21 for directors and 32 for directees; therefore, within some themes, the responses of directors were less detailed, as they were asked fewer questions than directees.

7.2. Korean directors' interview findings

7.2.1. Understanding personal reconciliation

For directors, personal reconciliation was not a term that was familiar to them, so they explained it in relation to wholeness. While identifying personal reconciliation as the restoration of brokenness in humanity, the directors showed a slightly different view with regard to the relation of personal reconciliation and wholeness. One director considered personal reconciliation to be part of the process which one goes through in the course of achieving wholeness. He equated personal reconciliation with healing, as a process in the journey towards wholeness:

¹ In the department of spirituality, there were more female students than male when this research was carried out. Many male and female seminarians are interested in the study of spirituality and spiritual direction, but the number of places is limited and more female students apply and are accepted due to their qualifications.

² There is an exception to this in the theme of 'Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church'. This is because the Korean directees were not yet ordained, so were unwilling to explain their opinions regarding this theme. However, they all agreed, when asked, that it could be useful.

I think that reconciliation is to repair the crack in the course of achieving wholeness. So, I see reconciliation as the same as healing. The peculiarity of spiritual direction from counselling and psychotherapy is that the crack is naturally repaired in the course of spiritual pursuit. Healing is not the aim of spiritual direction, in contrast to counselling and psychotherapy, but healing accompanies spiritual direction.³

The other two directors felt these two terms overlapped significantly. Hamin understood personal reconciliation as accepting oneself in the foundation of God's acceptance of a person. He included a person's stable inner feeling and improved physical health as parts of personal reconciliation:

Reconciliation is to accept yourself as you are, and the foundation or precondition of this is to accept God's acceptance of you. Wholeness as the ultimate aim of humanity is to become oneself... to be born as a whole person. Therefore, these two terms are similar to some extent... Moreover, from a modern viewpoint, many people think that body is also to take part in unity with God, so the understanding of the body in relation to spirituality will be healthier than before.⁴

Yoojin depicted the notion of personal reconciliation as recovery of a person's relationships at various levels:

It is the restoration of our relationship with God, intimacy, and oneness. A deepened relationship with God means to become transparent to oneself and to be reconciled with oneself. It also includes relationships with others; closeness with God naturally draws a healthy relationship with others... As a result, people can go forward in the service of love toward others.⁵

Although the directors had slightly different viewpoints, they all identified personal reconciliation in terms of the restoration of relationships; two important components of this were acceptance of oneself and healing. The directors regarded a restored relationship with God as the foundation of both healing and self-acceptance. Thus, they considered the restoration of the relationship with God to be of a higher priority than the restoration of other relationships. With regard to the concepts of personal reconciliation and wholeness, directors believed that the ultimate goal of reconciliation was recovery from brokenness and wholeness was the ultimate completion of human beings. These two concepts seem to overlap in many respects; both include the ideas of a right and loving relationship with God, self-acceptance as a being created in the image of God, a transparent self-awareness,

³ Junsu, p.5

⁴ Hamin, p.2

⁵ Yoojin, p.1

psychological and physical health, compassion and love for others, and voluntary service for others. A more detailed understanding of personal reconciliation expressed by directors will be presented in the following sections. Directees had a similar notion, but focused more on personal healing than directors expected. This will be presented in section 7.3.2.

7.2.2. Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction

With regard to the relationship between personal reconciliation and spiritual direction, all directors clarified that spiritual direction facilitates personal reconciliation, as seen in Hamin's description:

[It] helps people to be aware of God's communication and respond to God, to live in harmony with God's will, and to be aware of God and themselves. Therefore, spiritual direction helps people accept themselves as they are. In that sense, spiritual direction and reconciliation are connected in a positive way.⁶

Yoojin also stated that the contribution of spiritual direction to achieving personal reconciliation was absolute because it enabled people to grow in their relationship with God and to be healthier in their relationships with others.⁷ Junsu similarly contended that spiritual direction helped people to be aware of how they were shameful sinners before God and how they were forgiven in God's grace.⁸ This awareness of God and themselves through spiritual direction is for them an intrinsic factor to achieving personal reconciliation.

7.2.3. The reason why directees decided to come for spiritual direction and their expectations of spiritual direction

All three directors suggested that the directees' primary reason for commencing spiritual direction was their longing for a deeper encounter with God: a desire for an intended fellowship with God, a united life with God, and a continuous spiritual life.⁹ The directors recognized that directees lived with personal problems but felt that if people came for spiritual direction to resolve concerns in their faith and problems in their lives without genuine interest in forming a relationship with God, they would eventually stop

⁶ Hamin, p.2

⁷ Yoojin, p.1

⁸ Junsu, pp.1-2

⁹ Junsu, p.2, Yoojin, p.2, Hamin, p.3

coming.¹⁰ According to Junsu, a director for 17 years, directees' motives can be classified into three categories; 'First, God's forgiveness from their sins. This is related to the issue of identity. Secondly, formation of an inner relationship with God. Lastly, confirmation of vocation'.¹¹ The interview with Junsu revealed that directees' expectations of spiritual direction involved the themes of personal reconciliation discussed in chapter two.

As described above, directors understood that directees brought their personal concerns of guilt, hurt, suffering, and unresolved difficulties to spiritual direction. However, what was revealed through the interviews with directees was that they had suffered from much heavier inner conflicts than the directors assumed.¹² Directees longed to be free from these inner conflicts by experiencing God's embrace and to live as the beloved of God, responding appropriately to God's love. All three directors stated that spiritual direction aided directees to resolve their problems indirectly since it enabled them to see themselves and their problems by helping them spend time with God and listen to God's word.¹³

7.2.4. Changes to directees' prayer

Directors stated that directees' prayers had changed during spiritual direction. First, their vocal prayer became silent prayer and contemplation.¹⁴ In addition, self-centred prayer changed into Christ-centred prayer.¹⁵ Thirdly, their prayer began to involve a deeper communication with God.¹⁶ Directees focused more on listening to God, so their acceptance and love of God grew within their increasingly intimate relationship with God.¹⁷ As Hamin explained:

As the Exercises focus on directees' encounter with Jesus in Jesus' gospel life, directees' prayer become quite different. Through this prayer, they...experience a calling from Jesus. Thus, they still pray what they desire but the centre changes from a self-centred perspective to a Christ-centred perspective.¹⁸

¹⁰ Yoojin, p.2, Junsu, p.2 Hamin, p.3

¹¹ Junsu, p.3

¹² See, Korean directees' interview findings, 7.3.

¹³ Yoojin, p.4, Junsu, p.5

¹⁴ Yoojin, p.6, Junsu, pp.7-8, Hamin, p.4

¹⁵ Hamin, p.4

¹⁶ Yoojin, p.6

¹⁷ Yoojin, p.6

¹⁸ Hamin, p.4

Hamin said that the catalyst for these changes was ‘being together with Jesus’, for this enabled directees to resemble Jesus just like a married couple came to resemble each other.¹⁹ Yoojin stated that their meeting with directors is another important factor in the change of directees’ prayer as directors helped them to come into contact with God:

The conversation with their directors seems to them like opening themselves up to God and talking to God. Directees tell their story to their directors and directors ask questions to directees from God’s perspective. So, directees are challenged and shaken, and awakened...they come to realize what life is right.²⁰

According to directors, directees’ prayer had changed during spiritual direction. Directors suggested that the directees’ encounter with Jesus led them to open themselves to God; an action expressed by directees as telling their story to their directors and being aware of what a right life involves. Directors noted that directees showed changes in their image of God, their image of themselves and their standpoint, and their understanding of others. These themes will be dealt with in detail in the next section.

7.2.5. Changes in God-awareness, self-awareness, and understanding of others in spiritual direction

7.2.5.1. Changes in God-awareness

An important change in God-awareness in the directees was their image of God. One director suggested that our image cannot be changed easily as this would mean a change of awareness, a change of the interior, and a change of being.²¹ Nevertheless, all three directors stated that directees experienced changes to their image of God despite this.²² According to the directors, the major change was that directees began to perceive God as a God who was in a very close relationship with them, who could communicate with them with His heart, so they began to feel more like God’s children and were therefore able to be more Jesus-like.²³ Yoojin illustrated how the changes were able to happen through spiritual direction:

¹⁹ Hamin, p.4

²⁰ Yoojin, p.6

²¹ Yoojin, p.7

²² Junsu, p.9, Yoojin, p.7, Hamin, p.4

²³ Yoojin, p.7, Junsu, p.9, Hamin, p.4

Unless we are not struggling so much, the change of our image can't happen. Although we experience such a great love, we come back to the image of the past. We have a fear of losing ourselves. However, our image of God is changed through our prayer because we struggle with essence. Although we have the same image as before, the contents...are different; for example, from a cold [strict] father to a loving father.²⁴

The two other directors also described the content of the changes to the directees' image of God. Junsu stated that the directees' image of God had shifted from formal God to personal God, for they experienced an individual encounter with God.²⁵ Similarly Hamin spoke about these changes, saying that directees felt that 'God [is] with them at every moment. Sometimes, God doesn't solve all their problems and they feel God is powerless, but He knows their heart and weeps with them. So they feel God is worthy of being together'.²⁶ However, Hamin also presented an example of one directee whose image of God as a God who deprived her of precious things had changed to that of a God who offered her greater security:

Her family was in financial difficulty, so she expected that her older brother would help them to recover from this difficulty after graduating from university. But he entered a seminary and became a missionary to work in a very poor country. Even though she believed in Jesus she considered that God took her older brother away from her family. At the early stages of spiritual direction, her resistance was very strong. Nonetheless, later, she gained a new understanding of God and her older brother's decision that he put their family into God's hands. She came to identify God as a much bigger security than her older brother.²⁷

7.2.5.2. *Changes in self-awareness*

Junsu noted that 'being affiliated with God' caused the following outcomes for the directees: higher self-esteem, a sense of safety and stability, confrontation with the shadow within them, being asked by God to change, and being asked to dedicate their lives to a vocation. For that reason, directees sometimes experienced confusion and personal crisis in the spiritual direction process.²⁸ Hence, Junsu put forward the importance of

²⁴ Yoojin, p.7

²⁵ Junsu, p.9

²⁶ Hamin, p.4

²⁷ Hamin, pp.4-5

²⁸ Junsu, p.7 With regard to directees' confusion and personal crisis in spiritual direction, the directee participants expressed their frustration at not being able to respond fully to God's love (see 7.3.5.2. in this chapter).

discernment for directees, which he stated was ‘crucial’ in their ‘times of confusion and directors should help them gain discernment during this time of confusion and decision-making’.²⁹ Directors explained that many directees developed a higher self-esteem and more positive perspective during spiritual direction, because, as Hamin explained:

They came to accept Jesus as their friend. They have trust and an expectation that Christ will form them into a good vessel. They do not take their weakness as self-destructive; rather, they have confidence that they can regain their footing taking Jesus’ hands. This is an element of self-giving in their lives and a healthier image of themselves.³⁰

Yoojin noted that directees seemed to take a cheerful view of life, as they came to love, trust, respect, hope for, and accept themselves. He explained the meaning of having a deeper faith as ‘to choose God and life in any situation; thus, they gained a positive mindset’.³¹

7.2.5.3. *Changes in understanding others*

All directors clarified that a deepened relationship with God enhanced through spiritual direction helped with directees’ development of relationships with others.³² Hamin indicated clearly that directees came to treat others with ease and intimacy, as they were aware of God being trustworthy in their lives; for, opening themselves to God led them to open themselves to other levels of relationships.³³ Yoojin cautioned that sometimes the pursuit of spirituality can be misunderstood as *quietism*,³⁴ and implied that quietism is self-centeredness and an inclination to be overcome; thus, although quietism can happen in the process of pursuing spirituality, love for God should be extended

²⁹ Junsu, p.7

³⁰ Hamin, p.5

³¹ Yoojin, p.7

³² Junsu, p.7, Yoojin, p.8, Hamin, p.3, p.6

³³ Hamin, p.6

³⁴ According to *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, quietism is ‘often used loosely of any system of spirituality minimizing human activity and responsibility and usually restricted to the preaching of certain 17th century writers, esp. that of M. de Molinos, and to a lesser degree, Mme Guyon and Abp. Fenelon. The fundamental principle of Quietism is its condemnation of all human effort. Its exponents seem to have exaggerated earlier teaching, such as that of St. Teresa of Avila, on the “prayer of quiet”... From F.L. Cross and E.A. Livingstone ed., *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, p.1357

towards other humans.³⁵ Therefore, he identified restoration of relationship with God as restoration of relationship with others and ‘living for God means living for others’.³⁶

According to directors, directees experienced changes to their image of God and themselves, were able to have a more positive viewpoint, and to open themselves more to others. The driving force behind this was the change in their image of God, attained through prayer with Scripture. Directees’ acceptance of themselves as Jesus’ friends led them to have higher self-esteem and a more positive perspective of themselves. Directors suggested that directees’ meetings with their spiritual director are also important because communication with their director allows directees to open themselves up and tell their story. Directors wished to confront directees with a *heart of God* – that is, with God’s desires for them and for all humanity.

7.2.6. Healing: healing of memory, reinterpretation of life-story, and psychological and physical recovery

Directors described healing as a key fruit of spiritual direction, resulting from a new understanding of God and self. They explained that healing occurred when directees had accepted their past as a graced history from God, which meant they could accept their present lives and have hope for their future.³⁷ Directees’ healing was defined as a ‘reinterpretation of their life story as a history of grace given by God’,³⁸ ‘the healing of memory’,³⁹ and ‘the restoration of relationships’.⁴⁰ Directors clarified that spiritual direction was a process that helped directees stand face to face before God; thus, healing happened through God. As Junsu stated:

Healing of memory occurs in spiritual direction. It’s about the past life. The great part of that is people: parents, people in the workplace...so healing is restoration of relationships...[However] when we look back at the past [in direction], we don’t reflect on relationships with other people. We see that God allowed those circumstances. That realization, which is accepting God’s allowance, is

³⁵ Yoojin, pp.1-2

³⁶ Yoojin, p.8

³⁷ Junsu, pp.10-11, Hamin, p.5

³⁸ Hamin, p.5

³⁹ Junsu, p.10, Bora, p.9

⁴⁰ Yoojin, p.7, p.10

healing...So, we accept that the hurt in our past made us mature; and then acceptance of our past lets us accept our present.⁴¹

As shown above, the directors argued that healing occurred when directees accepted that their past lives were granted to them by God; this caused directees to look at their life stories from another angle by reinterpreting past memories. According to Hamin, by realizing their lives as those graced by God, directees could be healed from hurt in their past relationships; it enabled them to forgive others. He commented that healing was enabled by recollecting how delicately God had treated them throughout their whole lives; there was an awareness that Christ was with them through those processes, enabling them to get to where they are now. Thus, they were now able to see their difficult lives as graced lives.⁴² Yoojin also noted that healing facilitated their opening up towards understanding and forgiving others.⁴³

Hamin explained that healing included physical healing as well as inner healing of past hurt:

The purpose of spiritual direction is not healing, but in the process, it did bring about healing. I have a directee whose periods stopped for ten years. She was in a bad relationship with her husband. She resolved her issues of anger, guilt, and sin by accepting God's acceptance of her and, on the last day of a retreat, her periods began again.⁴⁴

Yoojin noted the outcomes accompanied by healing, with directees gaining:

A holistic perspective, an ability to see through God's eyes, the rebuilding of relationships, and courage...Actually, rebuilding of the broken relationship is a real challenge; so salvation and healing are connected to each other. We see self-acceptance happens in spiritual direction. The grace of God and self-acceptance and self-love through prayer will be a healing.⁴⁵

According to directors, directees' awareness of Jesus' being with them throughout their lives and their contemplation of the life of Jesus enabled them to have a new understanding of their afflictions and difficulties. This contemplation allowed them to bring about the healing of past memories and to reinterpret their life stories from God's perspective. This shift in awareness is brought about by the realization that God was there

⁴¹ Junsu, pp.10-11

⁴² Hamin, p.5

⁴³ Yoojin, p.8

⁴⁴ Hamin, p.3

⁴⁵ Yoojin, pp.7-8

with them throughout their suffering, which then enables the process of healing. When they identified their life as a history of grace led by God's acceptance and guidance, physical and inner healing also occurred.

7.2.7. *Sin*

According to directors, sin is a critical component that obstructs directees' intimacy with God; moreover, sin in the spiritual direction process is not merely moral sin, such as wrongful actions and thoughts, but also ontological sin, such as distortion of the image of God, lack of fulfilment, and self-centredness brought about by having broken off communication with God. They called this ontological sin 'ingratitude sin', in that human beings do not appropriately respond to God's love.⁴⁶ The issue of directees' sins is dealt with in the First Week of the Exercises. The core of this First Week is a process in which directees become aware of themselves as graced and saved sinners and through prayer, see the roots, sources, and disposition of sin in their lives.⁴⁷ Directors suggested that directees' admission of sin as well as their awareness of sin happens during the meeting with their directors during the First Week.⁴⁸ However, the purpose of the First Week is not leading directees to 'self-absorbing remorsefulness of sins';⁴⁹ instead, it allows them to realize God's forgiveness and grace given to them. With regard to directees' awareness and admission of sins, Junsu noted:

Protestants have two different minds regarding the issue of their sins. They suffer from an obsession that they should be forgiven by God; nonetheless, they feel uncomfortable when they are asked for repentance. So, they are distressed about three concerns: 'Why I am not confident about being forgiven', 'Why I repeatedly commit the same sins', and their sense of guilt. However, a forgiven sinner also has guilt. In order to diminish directees' guilt, directors should lead directees to respond appropriately to God's forgiveness and love for them. In order to do that, directors lead directees to move on to the Second Week...to enable them to understand Jesus more deeply. Then, Jesus doesn't judge us and loves us and invites us to his ministry. Directees' right response to God's forgiveness and love is the means of the resolution of the issue of directees' sin and guilt in the Ignatian way.⁵⁰

⁴⁶ Junsu, pp.1-2, Hamin, p.3

⁴⁷ Yoojin, p.4

⁴⁸ Yoojin, p.3

⁴⁹ Shaun McCarthy, "Pilgrim and Penitent: Direction and Sacramental Reconciliation", in *Review for Religious*, November-December, (1986), p.826.

⁵⁰ Junsu, p.7

Yoojin also spoke about the strength of directees' admission of their sins during the First Week:

The experience of self-innovation through prayer is the starting point for change. Spiritual direction is criticized by my acquaintances in psychotherapy who say that spiritual direction is weak in terms of self-analysis and self-awareness. However, self-awareness is very crucial in spiritual direction. Self-awareness results from awareness of God; therefore, directees need to confront the area that obstructs intimacy with God.⁵¹

Hamin discussed the admission of sin in the spiritual direction process in relation to healing. He describes that through admission of their sins, 'directees experienced touching, embracing, and healing with God's hands and then feel free from guilt'; directees were then able to speak to their directors about what they should do in order to respond to God's love.⁵²

The directors' description of the issue of sin raises the point that through prayer during the First Week, directees are able to realize their sinfulness and sinful past lives; through this realization, they begin to be aware of being forgiven and loved by God. Moreover, in their meeting with directors, directees' admission of their sins, including moral sins, occurs even though directees are not obliged to reveal everything about their moral sins. Directors explained that directees' awareness of themselves as a graced sinner became a foundation for their moving on to the Second Week, in which they thought about how they would respond to God's love.

7.2.8. Forgiving others and reconciliation with others

Directors described directees' experience of forgiving others in relation to their acceptance of their past lives as being given by God. All directors believed that whilst realizing that their life is a life graced by God, directees could also accept those who had hurt them.⁵³ Hamin considered directees' healing experiences as the cause of a forgiving heart. Junsu identified acceptance of the other who had wounded them with forgiving the

⁵¹ Yoojin, pp.4-5

⁵² Hamin, p.3

⁵³ Hamin, p.5, Junsu, p.11, Yoojin, p.8

other.⁵⁴ He noted that directees' acceptance of the other was made possible by the restoration of trust in God and their spiritual growth:

They could accept that God had intervened in their relationship with the other, so accepting God means accepting the other too. This is the principal difference between spiritual direction and counselling. Thus, directees can accept that the hurt in the past was a factor for growth. Since they accept their past, they can accept their present time and their future.⁵⁵

Directors explained that directees' experience of forgivingness of and reconciliation with the other was correlated with healing.⁵⁶ They believed that directees' experience of healing facilitated their forgiving hearts towards those who had wounded them; for, directees' healing experiences were based upon accepting their past as the means for their growth given by God. Therefore, directees also identified their experience of forgiveness through spiritual growth as the cause of their restoration of trust in God and accepting their past life as one that God had allowed them.

7.2.9. Social action as an agent of reconciliation: apostolic spirituality

In order to establish how directees who experienced personal reconciliation in the spiritual direction process contribute to their family, community, and society as a reconciler, two questions were asked of directors: 'In what ways do changes such as healing brought about in the spiritual direction process get expressed in relationships in the directee's lives?' and, 'How far might these changes be described as the directees becoming reconcilers in family, community and society?' In response, directors identified that the original purpose of the full Exercises was to enable directees to have 'apostolic spirituality'.⁵⁷

Directors expressed the view that apostolic spirituality was related to the role of a reconciling agent in society because the foundation of apostolic spirituality was 'finding

⁵⁴ Junsu, p.11

⁵⁵ Junsu, p.11.

⁵⁶ The term 'forgivingness' was coined by philosopher and theologian Robert Roberts; it refers to the ability to forgive others. See Solomon Schimmel, *Wounds not Healed by Time: The Power of Repentance and Forgiveness* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), p.53.

⁵⁷ Directors used this term in the sense that one dedicates oneself for God's glory and pursues union with Christ in the midst of the world (Junsu, p.11, Hamin, p.7). See Ch.4.3.4.

God in everything'.⁵⁸ Thus, for them, living one's life as a partner of God and achieving His 'plan in this world' is the core of apostolic spirituality.⁵⁹ Directors explained that there was an argument concerning 'elitism' surrounding others' understanding of apostolic spirituality and implied that some Ignatian scholars and directors have suggested that it might be appropriate only for the likes of missionaries or social practitioners.⁶⁰ On the other hand, directors stated that since reconciliation and salvation were correlated, anyone who had a vocation to serve God could act as an agent of reconciliation. They stated that while there was no emphasis placed on the role of peacemaker among Christians in the Korean Church and not all people can be social practitioners, everybody *can* be a peacemaker in their ordinary lives.⁶¹ They clarified that a reconciler was a mediator, and so directees who experienced God's love and acceptance could work towards peace for family, community, and society because they came to open themselves to others and were aware of a wider picture of the world through God's eyes. One director revealed his thoughts with regard to this issue:

So, in terms of the Ignatian way, life as a reconciler is to reach out to social action, for instance...missionary work...But, in the sense of 'finding God in everything', there could be numerous social actions in the Ignatian way. Because of 'finding God in everything', living as a partner of God is emphasized a lot.⁶²

Hamin discussed this issue further in particular relation to Korean Christianity, pointing out that there seemed to be a lack of awareness of the peacemaker being a role for Christians, which he felt needed to be stressed, so:

In order to grant power and influence to the helping ministry, which includes helping others such as foreign labourers and the disabled, we need to find God in them. But previously, we thought that such ministries should be done only by some special people... As a result...the ministerial system and structure don't emphasize the role of peacemaker. Thus, I can't say that through spiritual direction, directees are able to become such people; but, it is definitely possible

⁵⁸ Korean directors used this term in the sense that people are able to encounter and find God's will in everything in the world (Junsu, p.12).

⁵⁹ Directors did not think that apostolic spirituality was an aim of spiritual direction based on the Ignatian way. Instead, they referred to this as an 'individually directed' process, the aim of which was dependent upon the issues carried by directees; Junsu, pp.11-13

⁶⁰ This term seems to be employed by the directees to mean those who work in social movements such as charity or aid organizations.

⁶¹ Hamin, p.6

⁶² Junsu, p.12

that directees are able to function as peacemakers and reconcilers in their ordinary lives.⁶³

With regard to the actualization of directees' apostolic spirituality, Hamin explained the gap between having apostolic spirituality and living with that spirituality, by giving the example of the gap that exists between mystical and prophetic ministry.⁶⁴ He suggested that there needs to be a bridging between them:

It is certain that through the spiritual direction process, directees have a heart, attitude, and foundation that direct them towards such lives even though they don't commit themselves to prophetic work. Ignatian spirituality searches for apostolic spirituality and apostolic spirituality pursues union with Christ in the midst of the world, so that people have a heart to serve the world. But, it was true that our faith climate considered mystic ministry as separate from prophetic ministry.⁶⁵

Yoojin expressed more strongly than the other two directors the possibility of directees' working as reconcilers in their community and society:

A reconciler is eventually a mediator. When one is interested in a service for connecting people to God and for the welfare of others, one can be a good reconciler. Spiritual direction continually challenges directees to stand before God. Jesus' ministry was not for himself but for the people... These days, lay people's interest in and understanding of society is very high, and the discussion about the role of the Church in society is very much alive. Moreover, the word in Korean society nowadays is 'service.' I believe that ministers of the Church should propose understanding and directivity of this issue.⁶⁶

As discussed above, in the ministerial system of the Korean Church, the prophetic service which serves the oppressed and marginalized in society was thought of as a special ministry that was organized by a few people engaged in a specific social movement. Meanwhile, the ministerial construction of the Korean Church has placed emphasis on pastors' initiatives and leadership but not those in which lay people are actively able to take part. For that reason, pastors were able to dedicate themselves to their ministry for disadvantaged people but lay people had limited opportunities to participate in serving

⁶³ Hamin, p.7

⁶⁴ Regarding mystic ministry and prophetic ministry, Sheldrake used 'interiority and exterior living' respectively to define them, and he suggests that inner and outer ways of seeking God cannot be polarised because they are 'complementary dimensions of human life' and 'exterior living is resourced by interiority'. Sheldrake, "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly", p.22

⁶⁵ Hamin, p.7

⁶⁶ Yoojin, p.9

society. Moreover, lay people sought spiritual direction for their own personal needs. Directors clarified therefore that, so far, directees' lives as reconcilers were limited to their ordinary lives, that is, in their family and close communities.⁶⁷ However, there is a change in people's perceptions within Korean society and the Church, with increasing expectations that the Korean Church ought to serve within society. Therefore, the anticipation that lay directees as well as minister directees will serve within the bigger community is growing.

7.2.10. Utilization of the Ignatian way in the Presbyterian Church

Directors clarified that the Exercises are now used with some modification in the Korean Presbyterian Church; for example, in the Exercises, there is the colloquy to Mary but no colloquy to the Holy Spirit, so Korean Presbyterian directors led directees to have a colloquy to God the Trinity. Nowadays, there is great interest in prayer with Scripture as a means of spiritual formation and directors discussed how they utilize the Exercises in the Presbyterian Church:

I don't bring the spirituality of Jesuits but the Exercises to the Presbyterian Church. In order to give directees an individually directed direction, we use extracts from Scriptural phrases suggested in the Exercises, helping them using a wider framework than the Ignatian way... I modified the Exercises deleting elements I thought were inappropriate to us. We use the term 'gospel contemplation' or 'contemplation with the Scripture'. There is no reason to be against this.⁶⁸

Similarly, Hamin explains thus:

The characteristic of Ignatian spirituality is flexibility. Ignatius systemized the gospel contemplation that already existed in Church history. There are numerous similarities between the Ignatian way and Protestant spirituality; Protestant spirituality coincides with 'apostolic spirituality' and both pray with Scripture... With regard to the workings of the Spirit, we can understand it in terms of life-giving or life-destroying. These days, many Presbyterian churches are interested in the Ignatian way in terms of spiritual formation.⁶⁹

According to directors, there was criticism when the Exercises were initially introduced to the Korean Presbyterian Church, and a reluctance to accept them; however, the modification of elements that Presbyterians felt were 'inappropriate' (praying to the

⁶⁷ Junsu, p.12, Hamin, p.7

⁶⁸ Junsu, p.14

⁶⁹ Hamin, pp.8-9

Trinity instead of Mary) and an interest in the contemplation of Jesus have drawn people's attention to this ministry. Moreover, in the Korean Presbyterian Church, interest in Ignatian spiritual direction has been steadily increasing in relation to Church members' spiritual formation and growth.

7.3. Korean directees' interview findings

7.3.1. Understanding personal reconciliation

The key concepts within the directees' understanding of personal reconciliation were having a right relationship with God and integrating the 'shadow' within them, which included past hurt and negative feelings.⁷⁰ To describe the term 'personal reconciliation' directees used: 'confrontation and healing of hurt in the past',⁷¹ 'self-awareness and self-acceptance',⁷² 'relationality',⁷³ and 'awareness of God and union with God'.⁷⁴ Like the director interviewees, they also identified the notion of personal reconciliation as a person's right relationship with God and acceptance of oneself as a being created in the image of God. However, for directees, although the primary theme of personal reconciliation was focused upon the internal life of the individual, some expanded the scope of personal reconciliation to include the dimension of their relationships with other people, the community, and the society that they belonged to; for, they believed that reconciliation at a personal level affected their relationships at wider levels.⁷⁵ They thought that a person could not exist alone without any relationships or influence from others.⁷⁶ Eventually, hurt comes from those with whom a person relates; thus, they believed that the range of personal reconciliation may well include all human relationships.

Both Sue and Jisu noted that personal reconciliation was akin to integration based on Jung's theory; to achieve this, they had to come to know themselves through the integration of the shadow and negativity within themselves. Moreover, they suggested that personal reconciliation came from the experience of union with God. Thus, Sue states:

⁷⁰ Sue, p.2, Bora, p.1; See footnote at 6.3.1.

⁷¹ Heidi, p.1, Jisu, p.2

⁷² Jisu, p.1, Heidi, p.2, Sue, p.2, Bora, p.1

⁷³ Kihoon, p.1

⁷⁴ Bora, p.1, Jisu, p. 2, Kihoon, pp.1-2, p.2 Heidi, p.2, Sue, p.2

⁷⁵ Kihoon, p.1, Heidi, pp.1-2, Bora, p.7

⁷⁶ Kihoon, p.1, Heidi, pp.1-2, Bora, p.7

I wanted to be shown to be a good Christian, so I didn't see some negative feelings within me and I concealed them. But when I spoke to God what I thought honestly, I felt freedom. I felt that God came to me and touched me at that time. After that experience, I came to accept myself as I was and to have a broader heart and not judge others.⁷⁷

Heidi clarified personal reconciliation in terms of recovery from hurt in the past:

I think that [it] is about whether a person has overcome hurt or experiences in his or her past. At some point, if not overcoming, confronting those things can be reconciliation, as can considering how these changes influence his or her relationship with God and others.⁷⁸

Bora explained personal reconciliation in terms of healing of memory:

Everything is in our memory. Our memory let me remember the fact that God was there with me from my childhood. I came to see my memory in a new way through spiritual direction.⁷⁹

Kihoon portrayed personal reconciliation in terms of relationships:

Kihoon: When I saw the term 'reconciliation', the term 'relationship' popped up in my mind. It was not strange to me because even in everyday lives we swing between misunderstandings and understandings...between damaged relationships and good relationships. Even in marital relationship there are quarrels between a husband and a wife, and then reconciliation comes, so that term was not new for me and I understood that in terms of relationality.

Researcher: What do you think the scope of the personal is?

Kihoon: I can say that everything related with me is personal...I don't think that community is separated from me. Personal relationships cannot be limited only to a person to person relationship. It is definitely connected with certain relationships and community.⁸⁰

According to the directees, the major theme of personal reconciliation was recovery from their recognition of their false selves and from hurt in their past. Those aspects can be healed by the restoration of the relationship with God because this helps them see their life story afresh through the right understanding of themselves, the recovery from their painful past, and the healing of their memories; it involves a way to find the true self. Furthermore, this positively influenced their right awareness of themselves and helped

⁷⁷ Sue, p.2

⁷⁸ Heidi, p.1

⁷⁹ Bora, p.9

⁸⁰ Kihoon, p.1

them open up towards others. Some directees also described that the scope of personal reconciliation encompassed all levels of their relationships, including communities and societies with which they were affiliated.

One interesting point to note here is that, unlike directors who focused on the restoration of the relationship with God and being oneself, directees placed more emphasis on their healing from past painful memories and hurt through a deepened relationship with God. What directees meant by personal reconciliation will be explored more deeply throughout the following sections.

7.3.2. Personal reconciliation and spiritual direction

All directees were confident that spiritual direction had facilitated personal reconciliation within them. The positive relationship between personal reconciliation and spiritual direction can be found in what Kihoon spoke about. He commented that ‘spiritual direction can be defined as an aid to one’s relationship with God; moreover, personal reconciliation is also related to one’s relationship with oneself and others. I think therefore both are in a very close correlation’.⁸¹ Two other directees clarified that their image of God and themselves had changed through their growing confidence in the belief that they were beloved beings of God. They identified the changed image of God and themselves as crucial parts of personal reconciliation.⁸² In addition, Sue commented that spiritual direction enabled her to see herself objectively and to be aware of herself as God wanted.⁸³ She clarified that these changes came from contemplating Jesus’ life in the Exercises and through the experience of direction, was able to integrate her experience with her knowledge to understand herself; through ‘prayer I met Jesus not with knowledge but with my experiences’.⁸⁴ Heidi noted that spiritual direction enabled her to have tranquillity by learning how to attune herself to God. She also commented that she had confidence in the Spirit’s work in her life; therefore, she could maintain order within her life, taking God as her priority and lessened her fear of confronting herself.⁸⁵

⁸¹ Kihoon, pp.1-2

⁸² Jisu, p.3

⁸³ Sue, p.2

⁸⁴ Sue, p.1

⁸⁵ Heidi, p.2

Meanwhile, Bora noted the importance of a director for gaining self-awareness in spiritual direction. She noted that ‘spiritual direction should be understood as a triad, which consists of a director, a directee, and the Holy Spirit. I as a directee had more help to understand myself in the course of conversation with my director because my director saw what I couldn’t see myself’.⁸⁶

For directees, personal reconciliation was awareness of oneself, the healing of hurt, ‘reconstruction of one’s life story’, the restoration of relationships with others and forming good relationships based on a right relationship with God. Spiritual direction allowed the directees to move forward to personal reconciliation because it enabled them to take God as their priority, while facilitating them to live in security and stability within themselves and in harmony with others.

7.3.3. The reason why directees decided to come for spiritual direction and their expectations of spiritual direction

A key reason for the directees coming for spiritual direction was their need for a deeper sense of walking with God in their lives. All 5 directees had an expectation of spiritual growth, the hope of following Christ’s life and becoming Christ-like, living with a sense of stability and being attuned to God, and living an ordered life.⁸⁷ For them, spiritual direction was like a compass which had helped them to navigate their lives; they explained that they gained security and were led to a path through spiritual direction. Thus, for example, Kihoon noted that ‘if I identify my thirst for God as energy, I will identify spiritual direction as a path. I’ve not arrived yet at the aim. But, through spiritual direction I realized which direction my desire was to go’.⁸⁸ Heidi also stated that ‘I have confidence that the Holy Spirit works. This confidence became very clear’.⁸⁹

Moreover, the pursuit of a new way of prayer was another significant reason why directees began the spiritual direction process. Three of the 5 commented that they wanted to learn other ways of prayer and expand their scope of prayer; they were attracted to the

⁸⁶ Bora, pp.1-2

⁸⁷ Sue, p.1, Heidi, p.1

⁸⁸ Kihoon, p.2

⁸⁹ Heidi, p.2

idea of silent prayer and prayer using Scripture.⁹⁰ Simultaneously, they also wanted to seek answers that explained the suffering and negative events they had experienced in their lives. Three of the 5 presented their reason for coming to spiritual direction as related to the interpretation of their life story, particularly their suffering, and the healing of their hurt.⁹¹ With regard to this theme, Kihoon stated that ‘I wanted to know the reason why I had suffering and difficulties in my life and take comfort from God. I had not been satisfied with the answers and the comfort from other people, so I looked for resolution from God and became unknowingly drawn to the spiritual life’.⁹² Jisu also spoke about the issue of suffering:

Jisu: When I prayed with the phrases in the Bible, I felt that God touched me little by little. It could be an area of pain or what I didn’t want to confront ...

Researcher: What did you feel when you saw those areas?

Jisu: I felt uncomfortable at the beginning. But, I was surprised when God led me to remember things that I have never thought about...I felt free.⁹³

Directees initially took part in spiritual direction hoping to have a deeper spirituality, but they also had a hope for healing that seems to be closely connected to personal reconciliation as described in the sections above. Two other directees also clarified that, through prayer, and their growing confidence in the belief that they were beloved beings of God, they felt a lack of fear about confronting painful memories such as sickness and financial difficulties, hurt caused by others’ wrongdoings, and human weakness and sinfulness.⁹⁴ Describing their expectations, the directees responded that they were largely satisfied within the spiritual direction process. Most crucially, they explained their fascination with spiritual direction by describing it as providing a real encounter with God through contemplating Jesus’ life.

It is interesting to note that directees expressed their initial desire for healing of hurt and reinterpreting of their past lives in spiritual direction in a much stronger way than directors had expected.

⁹⁰ Jisu, p.1, Bora, p.1, Heidi, p.1

⁹¹ Kihoon, p.1, Jisu, p.2, Sue, p.2

⁹² Kihoon, p.1

⁹³ Jisu, p.2

⁹⁴ Bora, p.4, Heidi, p.2

7.3.4. *Healing*

As seen above, directees' expectations of spiritual direction were related to healing. Their reason for coming to spiritual direction involves the understanding of their life story, particularly their suffering, and the healing of their wounds.⁹⁵ Jisu and Sue noted that they had found it difficult to understand why some painful events had happened to them and had felt victimized by the behaviour of others.⁹⁶ Through their prayer centring on phrases in the Bible, they felt that God touched them and enabled them to see the painful events of their lives from a different angle; this allowed them to feel free. Sue also presented her experience of healing through prayer:

I suppressed the feelings that I couldn't understand and felt were unfair. In my prayer, I could honestly reveal my feeling to God. I gained freedom with that prayer. Jesus came to me and touched me with words that I never anticipated. Jesus waited for me to see and accept myself. I am a human. The things that I thought of as sins before were recognized as the natural result of human weakness. I judged myself too much with such a perfect standard. However, I became aware of the difference between sinfulness and human nature.⁹⁷

As seen above, directees explained that the occurrences of healing in spiritual direction were enabled by a process that helped them stand face to face before God; thus, healing happened through God. Bora described her healing experience in relation to the reconstruction of her memory:

In prayer...everything was recovered in my memory. I began to see my memory from a different viewpoint. Even the memories that had no meaning were changed into meaningful memories because I realized God was there with me within these memories.⁹⁸

With regard to the process of healing, the directees suggested that their interpretation of their lives changed when they felt Jesus' suffering as a person. Through their contemplation of the Cross, they understood the meaning of Christ's humility as love for themselves and they considered how to emulate his indignity within their own lives.⁹⁹ They therefore came to accept that as well as giving blessings to humanity, God also

⁹⁵ Kihoon, p.1, Jisu, p.2, Sue, p.2

⁹⁶ Jisu, p.2, Sue, p.2

⁹⁷ Sue, p.2

⁹⁸ Bora, p.9

⁹⁹ Bora, p.11, Kihoon, p.3

allowed suffering.¹⁰⁰ One directee gave an example of this issue, describing how he discovered a fear within himself during spiritual direction, which was a fear of becoming a minister and acting as a servant of God and therefore being poor.¹⁰¹ Nonetheless, he learned the reason why he should become a minister during spiritual direction; namely, he received a calling from God:

While I was praying using Psalm 23, I heard God's voice telling me, 'I make you...' within the scripture phrase 'He makes me...' I certainly realized that I could not go any way other than the way to which God had called me. Also, through the prayer using the Easter story, I identified my calling as bearing Jesus' suffering together with Jesus, because Jesus is still bearing people's suffering in this world.¹⁰²

Heidi likewise discussed the issue of Christ's suffering:

Even though I do not perfectly feel free from negative feelings in my past, I am able to turn my eyes to see hope inside them. This hope is that I am not frustrated and desperate in any circumstances...The suffering and the cross of Jesus cause me to feel fearful, lonely, and sad, but without them the resurrection of Jesus would not happen. For me, resurrection seems to promise that God's thoughts about us are hope, joy, and happiness.¹⁰³

As the above quotes show, the directees expressed the idea that their experience of Jesus' suffering through their prayer with the Gospel stories allowed them to interpret their life stories from a different viewpoint; they considered their life stories were within God's plan and God's hands. Through prayer, they recollected good memories of what God had done in their lives and realized how delicately God had treated them; the memories that had no meaning thus became meaningful because, within these memories, God was there with them.¹⁰⁴ Thus, they tried to look at positive things rather than focusing on negative feelings from their past.¹⁰⁵

In relation to their experience of healing, the directees suggested that their psychological state and physical health were related to their spiritual state. With regard to the relation between spiritual direction and psychological state, directees clarified that they

¹⁰⁰ Heidi, p.10

¹⁰¹ Kihoon, p.3

¹⁰² Kihoon, p.3

¹⁰³ Heidi, p.10

¹⁰⁴ Bora, p.9

¹⁰⁵ Heidi, p.10

felt psychological well-being; they used phrases such as ‘freedom’,¹⁰⁶ ‘flexibility’,¹⁰⁷ ‘having less inappropriate attachment to people’,¹⁰⁸ ‘feeling less fear about trying something’,¹⁰⁹ ‘stability’,¹¹⁰ ‘the ability for abundant expression’,¹¹¹ ‘feeling at ease’,¹¹² ‘a much broader scope of communication with God’,¹¹³ ‘expansion of social territory in one’s life’,¹¹⁴ ‘an ability to see myself in an objective viewpoint’,¹¹⁵ ‘safety’,¹¹⁶ ‘a passion for God’,¹¹⁷ ‘a desire to know more about God’,¹¹⁸ and ‘strength’.¹¹⁹ The terms that they used for describing their spiritual state during and after undergoing spiritual direction overlap with those they used to depict spiritual growth. The directees expressed these psychological feelings as inner healing.

Directees also believed that in addition to psychological well-being, spiritual health was closely connected to physical health. Some directees experienced physical healing as well as spiritual well-being after spiritual direction. They stated that they did not know whether their physical recovery from serious illness was directly caused by spiritual direction, but the two coincided; so, they expressed this as ‘an organic association’.¹²⁰ To explain the belief in this association, Heidi commented that she became extremely depressed and lost five to seven kilograms during her contemplation of the suffering and Cross of Jesus. She felt as though she was sharing in the suffering of Jesus.¹²¹ Later, after that contemplation, she did experience physical, psychological and spiritual recovery. Kihoon also noted that he could carry out his work in a more lively and active manner when he was in a close relationship with God.¹²²

¹⁰⁶ Kihoon, p.7

¹⁰⁷ Kihoon, p.7

¹⁰⁸ Heidi, p.7

¹⁰⁹ Jisu, p.8

¹¹⁰ Jisu, p.8

¹¹¹ Sue, p.7

¹¹² Kihoon, p.7

¹¹³ Sue, p.7

¹¹⁴ Sue, p.7

¹¹⁵ Sue, p.8

¹¹⁶ Bora, p.7

¹¹⁷ Bora, p.7

¹¹⁸ Bora, p.7

¹¹⁹ Heidi, p.7

¹²⁰ Jisu, p.8, Sue, p.24, Kihoon, p.8

¹²¹ Heidi, p.8

¹²² Kihoon, p.8

Contemplation of the life of Jesus enables directees to have a new understanding of their afflictions and difficulties. This contemplation allows them to bring about the healing of past memories and to reinterpret their life stories from God's perspective. This shift in awareness was brought about by the realization that God was there with them throughout their suffering, which then resulted in the process of healing. When they identify their life as a history of grace led by God's acceptance and guidance, some physical healing as well as inner healing occurs.

7.3.5. The changes in directees' God-awareness, self-awareness, and life perspectives

7.3.5.1. The changes in directees' God-awareness

All 5 directees noted that, as the directors had observed, they experienced a change in their image of God. Directees had the image of God as a God who kept His distance and was fearsome; a being who was qualitatively different from them; thus, they felt that they could not get closer to Him. They said that this old image of God was formed by knowledge of God learned from sermons and Bible studies in their churches.¹²³ However, through their spiritual direction experiences, they felt God's intimacy and so their trust in God grew a great deal. For example, Jisu explained that before, she had an unhealthy image of God as a punishing God but now, she feels that God is endlessly embracing her.¹²⁴ Heidi described that she came to feel God as a friend through the shift in image of a punishing God to a righteous and loving God, and therefore God's righteousness and justice were considered as another display of God's love.¹²⁵

Two other directees suggested their trust in God had deepened. Kihoon depicted God as 'the mystery', in the sense that human beings cannot perfectly explain God, but God is also 'the future that we can expect' in the sense that God will do good things for humanity.¹²⁶ Meanwhile, Bora said that she realized that God wanted her to become more aware of Him as He was aware of her.¹²⁷ Sue explained that the kernel of the change to her image of God was the change to her image of Jesus:

¹²³ Kihoon, p.5, Sue, p.3

¹²⁴ Jisu, p.3

¹²⁵ Heidi, p.3

¹²⁶ Kihoon, p.2

¹²⁷ Bora, p.2

This new image of Jesus was sensational for me. ‘Did Jesus become the same human as me?’ I learned the reason why Jesus came to Earth as a baby. When I contemplated Jesus’ childhood, Jesus was the same as me. I don’t talk about it in terms of sin. I came to know the fact that Jesus accepted my human attributes. He accepted me and I was accepted by Him.¹²⁸

The directees’ experience of the presence of God became more specific in the sense that they felt God was with them in daily life. The names directees used for God included ‘Immanuel: a being that is always with me’,¹²⁹ ‘abba or father’,¹³⁰ ‘all’,¹³¹ ‘a lover or a husband’,¹³² ‘a friend’,¹³³ ‘a mystery and the future that we could hope for’,¹³⁴ and ‘a being that is preparing for me’.¹³⁵ Two of the 5 directees described their relationship with God as akin to that between lovers or between husband and wife. Sue explained that ‘before spiritual direction, I was just a servant for God. But, I now feel myself as a wife for God. I am not married yet, so Jesus is like a bridegroom. It is a relationship that has one destiny’.¹³⁶ Bora also spoke about her relationship with God using the analogy of lovers, stating that ‘I know that my life is meaningless without God. I now understand why lovers falling in love with each other say that. I no longer live without God and my life will be destroyed without God’.¹³⁷ One interviewee described God as ‘all’ in her, for she felt that God had treated her as if she was His all.¹³⁸ These experiences stirred up directees’ confidence, trust and restoration in their relationship with God.

7.3.5.2. *The changes in directees’ self-awareness*

Besides the shift in their image of God, the directees experienced a reframing of their identity and of their perspective on their lives. Directees identified themselves as ‘a daughter of the Father’,¹³⁹ ‘a son as well as a servant’,¹⁴⁰ ‘a partner of God’,¹⁴¹ ‘a

¹²⁸ Sue, p.3

¹²⁹ Heidi, p.5

¹³⁰ Bora, p.5, Jisu, p.6

¹³¹ Jisu, p.6

¹³² Sue, p.6, Bora, p.6

¹³³ Jisu, p.6, Bora, p.6

¹³⁴ Kihoon, p.5

¹³⁵ Kihoon, p.5

¹³⁶ Sue, p.6

¹³⁷ Bora, p.5

¹³⁸ Jisu, p.6

¹³⁹ Jisu, p.8

¹⁴⁰ Kihoon, p.6

¹⁴¹ Heidi, p.6

friend',¹⁴² 'an old friend',¹⁴³ 'a wife of the Lord',¹⁴⁴ and 'being in a relationship that has one destiny'.¹⁴⁵ All directees explained that their self-esteem increased and they became healthier internally compared to the time before spiritual direction; for, they were aware of God taking care of them.¹⁴⁶

The directees suggested that their changed image of God and self-identity drew them to make decisions about the direction in which their lives were moving.¹⁴⁷ Therefore, for directees, spiritual direction was like a navigator for their lives. Most of the directees had previously had a negative perspective, but now this had become positive because they became aware that God wants human beings to live a wonderful life. Thus, they felt that although their lives were hard in the past, they were now much easier.¹⁴⁸ Some of the directees noted that they definitely knew the 'meaninglessness of life without God' through their experiential perception, not merely through superficial knowledge.¹⁴⁹ They explained that even though they could not say that their lives had completely changed, their perceptions *have* changed.¹⁵⁰ Before spiritual direction, the directees intended to design and purpose their lives for themselves, but now they sought to surrender to the life to which they have been led by the Holy Spirit.¹⁵¹ For that reason, they noted that they learned how to enjoy their present lives in security in God rather than worrying about their future too much.¹⁵²

According to directees, the main characteristic of the change to their self-image was an 'acceptance of themselves as a friend of Christ and a beloved of God'.¹⁵³ These shifts were triggered by trust in God. This trust also helped them to be generous to other people and they all suggested that their hearts became more open toward others. For example, Kihoon and Sue expressed their experience:

¹⁴² Heidi, p.7

¹⁴³ Bora, p.6

¹⁴⁴ Sue, p.6

¹⁴⁵ Sue, p.7

¹⁴⁶ Jisu, pp.7-8

¹⁴⁷ Kihoon, p. 2

¹⁴⁸ Jisu, p. 3

¹⁴⁹ Bora, p.5

¹⁵⁰ Bora, p.2

¹⁵¹ Sumin, pp.2-3

¹⁵² Heidi, p.8, Sue, p.9, Jisu, p.10

¹⁵³ Heidi, p.3, Jisu, p.3, Lihoon, p.7, Bora, p.2, Sue, p.2

As Calvin said, knowledge of God and knowledge of humanity are closely connected; the love of God and the love of neighbour are like both sides of the same coin. I came to be aware of God in others. When I have a meeting with a person or people, I am conscious of the present moment that God is watching. I came to have a heart that allowed me to see others through God's eyes.¹⁵⁴

Before spiritual direction, I considered 'recognition and praise from others' as a standard for living, and so I was judgmental of others. However, I found that they were the same as those whom they judge; they saw part of themselves in others and parts of others in themselves. And so, a shift in my cognition happened.¹⁵⁵

Directees' experiences led them to accept others as beings made in the image of God and to be accepted by God; in addition, they came to believe that the Holy Spirit would work for them and through them.¹⁵⁶

As described above, directees' changes in their identity and viewpoint occurred. Nonetheless, they expressed that they were still struggling with the application and actualization of their renewed awareness of how they should live as children of God. Thus, they stated that they were still on the journey towards being a better person. Kihoon commented that he has a complex identity as 'a servant and son' and this identity caused him confusion:

When I identify myself as a servant, I feel God is distant from me but when I identify myself as a son, I feel God is intimate. When I am ministering in the field, I feel more like a servant. Although, spiritual direction helped me to improve my identity as a son of God.¹⁵⁷

Meanwhile, Bora expressed her frustration at not being able to respond fully to God's love:

I feel I'm still an ingrate. I am still so proud of myself. When people experience the love of God, there should be a change in their lives. But, even though I am aware of how I have been graced by God, I don't take action to love Jesus in my life, so I am judging myself.¹⁵⁸

In response to such examples of directees' confusion and frustration at not being able to respond fully to God's love, director Junsu explained that when this confusion arose they experienced a shift in their identity. This change coincided with God asking them to

¹⁵⁴ Kihoon, pp.2-3

¹⁵⁵ Sue, p.4

¹⁵⁶ Sue, p.4, Heidi, pp.3-4

¹⁵⁷ Kihoon, pp.6-7

¹⁵⁸ Bora, p.4

change, challenging their lives and their vocation. Junsu therefore spoke about directees' need to learn and practice discernment, suggesting that directors should help directees gain discernment throughout this time of uncertainty and decision-making.¹⁵⁹

Directees experienced a deepened God-awareness, a greater sense of self-awareness and self-identity, and a changed perspective of their lives through spiritual direction. They were able to feel God as their personal father rather than one who was fearsome and judgmental, and some felt their relationship with God as being akin to that between lovers or husband and wife. Directees' new image of God had an effect on their self-image. Therefore, they now saw themselves as a friend of Jesus and were convinced that the Spirit was working in and through them. This new self-image has enabled them to strengthen their lives; they are more able to love, accept, respect, trust and hope for themselves. This new image of God has also enabled them to be more generous to others because they can see others as beings also accepted and loved by God. In these processes, experience of the presence of God through prayer and discernment were crucial. However, there is a gap between directees' changed awareness and its embodiment in their lives.

7.3.6. Sin

The directees defined sin as alienation and separation from God, and the cutting off of communication with God. They described that their new understanding of sin helped them to lessen their fear of guilt and punishment by God.¹⁶⁰ Sue classified the issues regarding sin into three categories: a cutting off of communication with God, guilt, and sinful actions resulting from alienation from God:

My awareness of sin has been changed. Sin is not thinking wrong thoughts and doing wrong things, but a cutting off of the relationship with God. I came to know that sin, sinful actions which are the results of sin, and guilt are different. The identification of sinful actions is easy, but the distinction of sin and guilt needs discernment...Everybody has committed sins in their past and I recognize that even now if I don't direct myself towards authenticity, I can produce different types of sinful action.¹⁶¹

With regard to directees' realization of their sins and experience of being free of their sins, all directees suggested that during their prayer of the First Week, their increased

¹⁵⁹ Junsu, pp.9-10
¹⁶⁰ Kihoon, p.3, Heidi, p.4
¹⁶¹ Sue, pp.4-5

awareness of their sins allowed them to feel lighter within themselves. Kihoon expressed this awareness as shamefulness, which led him to become more sensitive to sin:

The sin that made me feel shameful in the First Week was laziness and neglect. But, I felt much less fear of judgment. Before, my sins tied me up, but now, I realize more that my sins affect my relation to God; and I seem to recognize much faster and easier that I should stop doing that.¹⁶²

Jisu also expressed how she was becoming more sensitive to sin:

I feel that the things that I didn't consider as sin before are areas of sin. I think that my sensitivity to sin came from illumination of the Holy Spirit. Meanwhile, when I bring these issues to God, I feel much lighter than before. My feeling of freedom also became more sensitive. This also came from illumination of the Holy Spirit.¹⁶³

As shown above, directees' experience of the First Week can be related to being sensitive to sins and returning from them to God. After this, they were led to the Second Week, which focuses on the call to respond rightly to God's love. This brought about the issue of how they would dedicate themselves to God. This issue was related to their vocation and self-denial, which means the type of ministry they would take part in.

The First Week is a stage that enables directees to become aware of the nature of sin, which is a cutting off of their relationship with God. Through prayer in the First Week, directees come to sense their sinful thoughts and actions and convert to God. Meanwhile, they come to thank God for His forgiveness and love for them; therefore, they are led into the Second Week, in which they learn how to respond to God's love. Directees feel that they are called on to act in accordance with their changed perception brought about by God and confront the issues regarding how to live like Jesus; as a result, they address the issues of *choice of life* and *self-denial* in the Second Week. A fuller description of choice of life and self-denial will be dealt with in sections below (7.3.7 and 7.3.8)

7.3.7. Forgiveness and reconciliation

All 5 directees suggested that through prayer, they found the heart to forgive others who had caused them hurt in their past. In particular, one directee's experience was a

¹⁶² Kihoon, p.3

¹⁶³ Jisu, pp.4-5

powerful means of understanding 'forgiveness of others' through prayer that focused on Jesus' life during the Third Week:

I was praying with a heart scarred by hurt which led to my failure to forgive others. During my prayer, Jesus came to me as a person bearing numerous scars. I first felt unpleasant because I felt that Jesus demanded that I live like Him... I finally realized that the scars were the scars of Jesus' love for me; they were scars of glorification caused by His love for humanity. Afterwards, I hoped that my scars could be used for others. At the same time, I could overcome the feeling that only I was a victim... This prayer experience brought about a shift in my perspective on forgiveness; at the same time my repentance happened. I had a mind to live a life filled with apology and modesty.¹⁶⁴

For Sue, forgiveness seemed to involve being like Jesus in terms of self-denial; for that reason, she had unpleasant feelings, as though Jesus was demanding too much from her. However, her encounter with Jesus as a human being enabled her to experience repentance caused by her awareness of herself, allowing her to become more objective, that is, less self-centred and more outward looking. This experience enabled her to then have willingness to forgive others and therefore become able to overcome the feeling that only she was a victim. In this sense, forgiveness can be said to be accompanied by self-knowledge and to bring about modesty and an extended understanding of others.

Jisu also discussed her experience of forgiveness through prayer:

That was a very difficult case to resolve. I revealed what I had in my mind before God. I buried the hatchet of that unresolved bitterness while I was exposing my heart to God. I felt that forgiveness was not a personal pledge but the work of the Holy Spirit. Meanwhile, God told me my shortcomings that I should correct. It was helpful for my self-knowledge.¹⁶⁵

Heidi explained that her imaginative prayer helped her forgive and understand the other:

In my imaginative prayer, I could understand the other. I came to confront my shortcomings. Thus, forgivingness and understanding of the other were enabled. After my forgivingness, the relationship with that person was slowly changed.¹⁶⁶

According to directees, although forgiveness was not an easy process, they could forgive others who hurt them or reconcile with those who caused them to have

¹⁶⁴ Sue, pp.8-9

¹⁶⁵ Jisu, pp.8-9

¹⁶⁶ Heidi, p.8

uncomfortable feelings. Through their transparent knowledge of themselves and others, they could experience reconciliation even at an interpersonal level. Amongst the 5 directees, 3 presented their experiences of being reconciled with others. Two stated that they apologized to the others and achieved reconciliation with them.¹⁶⁷ Bora noted that ‘during my prayer, I had a heart to forgive a person so I took action; I apologized to that person’.¹⁶⁸ Kihoon also gave his own example of reconciliation with the other:

I had an experience of one person treating me so badly in a meeting. He made me feel humiliated. Through prayer, I saw that circumstance and I could understand the person. I had not managed the meeting well. After, I met him again. I said to him, “I understand why you did that.” He was really surprised at me and sent me a Christmas card saying, “Let’s have a good relationship.” That was a wonderful experience.¹⁶⁹

Forgiveness was difficult for directees; however, the work of the Spirit helped them to bring forgiveness into their hearts. The directees encountered the spirit of forgiveness working within them through their experience of imaginative prayer and through encountering in their prayers a Jesus who was hurt. Their experience of forgiveness was one of self-denial which occurred during their prayers in the Third Week using Scriptural accounts of Jesus’ suffering. They identified this experience as the power of the Spirit. It affected their relationships with the people who had hurt them. Directees’ relationships with the other did not return to the original state – which to their mind would mean reconciliation – but instead they could better understand those who had hurt them and tried to communicate with them. The directees identified interpersonal reconciliation as the expanded understanding of others; spiritual direction helped them gain an objective view of themselves and others. Hence, spiritual direction helped with their forgiveness and eventually their reconciliation with others. This will now be discussed in more detail.

7.3.8. Directee’s contemplation of Jesus’ life in connection with their understanding of their relationships

In response to the question, ‘How did your reflection on Jesus’ way of relating to people affect your understanding of relationships?’, directees revealed their thoughts about what they thought ‘living like Christ’ meant; in particular, what the significance was of

¹⁶⁷ Sue, p.9, Bora, p.8

¹⁶⁸ Bora, p.8

¹⁶⁹ Kihoon, p.5

Christ's self-giving and self-denial. All 5 responded that they felt uncomfortable at first with their contemplation of Jesus' affliction in the Third Week, because the Jesus whom directees encountered in Scripture was a being of self-sacrifice and self-denial. At the beginning of their prayers, they could not welcome Jesus because they had a fear of being invited into that life. However, eventually, their prayers drew the directees to perceive anew that Jesus came to Earth to achieve God's purpose for all humanity. Through contemplating Jesus' life, directees learned the necessity of having a broader understanding of and love for humanity.¹⁷⁰ All 5 directees clarified that these changes to their perception did not lead to prompt and complete changes in their actions; rather, they noticed a slow change. Directees described their experiences of encountering Jesus in Scripture and the shift in their perceptions of their relationships with others. As Sue describes:

I saw that Jesus was a friend of sinners and didn't create any boundaries, either between Himself and others or amongst others. I think it was possible because Jesus had a perfect understanding of humanity. I think he saw the Spirit within us and wanted us to direct ourselves towards an authenticity of the Spirit.¹⁷¹

Bora also spoke about her experience of meeting Jesus as a self-giver:

Through those prayers, Jesus' weakness was revealed. He was so like a human. I disliked his powerlessness, vulnerability, and self-giving. I think that I refused to accept such a life for Jesus because that seemed to invite me to the same life as Him...Even though I had a hard time with that prayer, it affected my perception. I could open my eyes to the disadvantaged people and the environment. When we come to give up ourselves, those relationships will be restored...Due to Jesus' self-giving action such as the Cross, the Universe could be reconciled with God.¹⁷²

Similarly, Heidi described her eye-opening experiences with people through encountering Jesus' endurance, trust, love, and affection for everyone and how this led her to becoming more patient with others.¹⁷³ Meanwhile, Jisu explained how she realized that

¹⁷⁰ Sue, p.5, Bora, p.5, Heidi, pp.4-5, Jisu, pp.5-6

¹⁷¹ Sue, p.5

¹⁷² Bora, pp.4-5. In her response to God's love, she showed that not only her perceptions but her actions had changed concretely after the spiritual direction process. She was interested in human rights, and environmental issues, so began volunteering with different relevant organisations. (pp.7-8).

¹⁷³ Heidi, pp.4-5

she was afraid of resembling Jesus' life in terms of his humility, his being brought low, and his suffering on the Cross:

My relationship with God came to be much better, but the life of Jesus is still heavy to me. I sometimes feel that the life of Jesus is far from me. These days, I am struggling with this issue. I came to see that I wanted to follow the teaching and ministries of Jesus but I excluded the life of being low and the suffering of the Cross from [this]. I accepted Jesus' teaching and healing ministries as my role model, but I didn't want to accept his humility and being low yet. I gained knowledge of the fact that I had ignored this part of Jesus.¹⁷⁴

The changes to directees' perceptions of their relationship with God and others are illustrated in the following answer given by Kihoon:

Peter didn't run away when Jesus was arrested. He followed Jesus, but...at a distance at which he believed he could be safe. I felt that Peter seemed to be me. Although I dedicated myself to God and served Him, I hated to suffer loss. I could see myself following Jesus at a distance. The thing that I have learned in spiritual direction is that problem solving is not the aim of spiritual direction, but awareness of myself becomes new and deeper, and accompanies changes to myself.¹⁷⁵

The directees' new awareness of how Jesus related to people and the growth in their relationship with God brought about the development of their understanding of personal relationships; they explained that they gained a broader understanding of others. Directees' approach to the resolution of relational matters appeared to be less active; they said that they waited for God to intervene in the situation. For example, Sue described this as:

When I need to be reconciled with others, I believe that God's hand will help and I am not rushing to solve the conflict. Before, I wanted to be a problem solver, but now I am convinced God is the problem solver; so I wait for God's working. I think that conflict is a motivation of growth. I experienced that when I was less active in relational problem solving and was waiting instead, the relationship became better. I believe that everything flows in accordance with God's will.¹⁷⁶

Bora also spoke about why they wait for God's intervention:

¹⁷⁴ Jisu, pp. 5-6

¹⁷⁵ Kihoon, p.4

¹⁷⁶ Sue, p.6

I have confidence in God so that I wait with patience even though I feel anxious about the Church and society. I believe that God has a plan for our Church and society so I can wait until I know God's heart.¹⁷⁷

As described above, the directees' encounter with Jesus in their contemplation of Jesus' life and the Cross in the Second and Third Weeks challenged them to think about how to live like Jesus. During their prayers, they experienced uncomfortable feelings at first because they felt that they were being invited to lead a self-giving life. However, their continuous prayer enabled them to gain a new and deeper perception of being like Christ. When they learned that the source of Jesus' suffering was his love for humanity, they had a heart to forgive others and had a broader understanding of them. However, in spite of their changed perceptions, the interpersonal actions they took to challenge their relational conflicts may have been prudent but were not prompt; they took a more passive role, expecting God to change the situation.

7.3.9. Life as an agent of reconciliation

In response to the question, 'How has the experience of reconciliation with God through spiritual direction influenced the role that you give to reconciliation in your daily life, relationships, and society?', directees noted that by finding their vocation, the direction and content of their ministry has changed; now, they are able to live as reconcilers, in terms of being one with God. Two of the 5 directees have already decided how to live and to which type of ministries they will dedicate themselves; the remaining 3 did not know their exact path yet but suggested that their vocation was to achieve God's will in their ministry in union with God. All 5 stated that the core of their lives and ministries is to be closer to God and to unite more with God; the issue of which type of ministry in which they would participate was not essential because all types of ministry are a means of coming to God. Two directees found their vocation through prayer; Bora decided that her life would be involved with environmental protection or disadvantaged people in society, but the primary concern for her life through her ministry related to these services was a united life with God:

Through the spiritual direction process, I could experience reconciliation with God. Then, I began to think about environmental issues, human rights, and social problems, and the heart-breaking issues within the Church. I sense that I have a

¹⁷⁷ Bora, p.6 See also Heidi, p.5 for similar comments.

passion for those matters and I also have a responsibility that I should act upon them...But I think that participating in certain activities is of secondary importance. The true issue is how to be closer to God...I realized the importance of discernment. Without becoming closer to God, the environment is no use for me. The environment is a medium to come to God...Eventually my deep desire is to unite with the Lord.¹⁷⁸

Kihoon described how he found his vocation as a spiritual director and how people contributed to the family, workplace and society through their spiritual direction experience:

I want to become a spiritual director and a minister caring for souls. Now I believe that God wants me to dedicate myself to a ministry, which helps each person to be blessed with an abundant relationship with God. I am sure that family is a foundation to maintaining society, but nowadays there are a lot of cases of families being broken and such a situation becomes an object of public concern. Moreover, as I see that the foundation of societal problems is based on personal problems, the restoration of personal relationships through spiritual direction is connected with a resolution of societal problems. I had an experience of group spiritual direction; then, a united spirituality penetrated the group. In that sense, I think that group spiritual direction can function as a means of resolving societal problems and can contribute to societal reconciliation.¹⁷⁹

Directees who believed that they had achieved personal reconciliation, to some extent at least, through the spiritual direction process were able to have a more open heart towards finding God in everything in their ordinary lives. It appears that this open heart became a foundation for their lives as reconcilers in their communities and societies. However, not all directees who encountered personal reconciliation through the spiritual direction process dedicated themselves to such ministries for the benefit of wider society. Nevertheless, they believed that personal faith should not be separated from social participation and had the expectation that the Church should participate in societal issues. For that reason, all directees suggested that they needed to consider what role they would choose for living as an agent of reconciliation in their families, communities, and societies in the course of their spiritual direction.

Conclusion

This chapter has looked in detail at the 3 Korean directors' and 5 Korean directees' understanding of personal reconciliation, their experience of personal reconciliation

¹⁷⁸ Bora, pp.8-9

¹⁷⁹ Kihoon, p.9

through the spiritual direction process, and their understanding of how people who experience personal reconciliation can serve as reconciling beings in personal relationships and in the wider community. For Korean participants, the term personal reconciliation was simply defined as healing, the restoration of one's relationship with God and oneself, and the improvement of human relationships. The elements of personal reconciliation for directees included changes to their image of God, their deepened trust in God, their deepened identity of themselves as forgiven sinners loved by God, a renewed interpretation of their past life, healing, a reframing of their perspectives on their future life, and their better understanding of and open attitude towards others. For Korean directors, personal reconciliation was explained in correlation with wholeness/holiness, therefore, it was thought of as the kernel of the journey towards wholeness and focused on the recovery of one's relationship with God and self-acceptance. However, directees put more emphasis than directors on the healing of their past hurt, describing it as the main reason for coming to spiritual direction. Both directors and directees explained that healing came from a deepened awareness of God and themselves; therefore, directees' healing experiences seemed to coincide with their renewed Christian identities.

Ignatian spiritual direction enabled directees to look at themselves in a different way: Their experience of God's merciful love and grace led them to have conversion and healing experiences, which positively influenced their psychological and physical health and helped them accept others. Through this awareness they were able to experience intrapersonal and interpersonal forgiveness, thus enabling them to initiate the process of reconciliation. Directees clearly described their intrapersonal forgiveness, and their interpersonal forgiveness was also manifested by actions such as verbal expression, although the outward expression of interpersonal forgiveness sometimes appeared to be less active than their intrapersonal feeling. Their new awareness of God and themselves enabled them to think about their vocation and how they could work as reconcilers in their personal relationships and in the wider community. I will now move on to reflect on the findings from the Scottish and Korean interviews.

CHAPTER EIGHT

THEOLOGICAL REFLECTION

The previous chapters have outlined different theories of reconciliation, focusing on the theological perspective, spiritual direction as a practice for personal reconciliation, and finally the Ignatian way. I have included the interview findings of those who have experienced spiritual direction, in order to investigate how they perceived personal reconciliation, in what ways they felt they had achieved personal reconciliation through the spiritual direction process, and how they connected their sense of personal reconciliation with their lives.

The aim of this chapter is to discuss the ways in which personal reconciliation can be facilitated through the spiritual direction process; I will do this through closely analyzing the interviews. I will include the proposal that personal reconciliation has a holistic perspective, which integrates spiritual, psychological, physical and relational dimensions; however, the spiritual dimension, namely the relationship between the individual and God, is the foundation for Christians. Included will be a discussion focusing on the ways in which individuals can discover their vocation to become agents of reconciliation and how they act on this, either by acknowledging this vocation in a passive sense or by taking an active role in society, such as living as a mediator within their community.

Moreover, there will also be an examination of the effectiveness of the Ignatian way for Presbyterians, in particular, the way in which the individual's reflection on Jesus' life in relation to their own, through imaginative prayer, can lead to a greater focus on the individual's personal experience of God. The interviewees come from two cohorts; Scotland and South Korea. All participants belong to the Presbyterian denomination, but obviously, the groups differed in terms of geography and culture. These differences had an impact on the tone and feelings interviewees expressed when answering the interview questions; this will be examined in depth later in the chapter.

8.1. The meaning of personal reconciliation

Having examined the different theories of reconciliation, I formed the hypothesis that personal reconciliation could be defined as the healing of brokenness and the reshaping of

relationships at all levels: with God, self, and others. This was explored through in-depth interviews, the findings of which confirmed this definition. Personal reconciliation can be developed by healing initiated by God and the creation of a new relationship with Him, both of which result from the experience of God's forgiveness and love, which also enables the reshaping of Christian identity. This sense of healing can affect one's psychological and physical well-being, it enables one to have compassion for others, and leads to a willingness to offer them hospitality; these are some of the tangible expressions of personal reconciliation. Thus, personal reconciliation can lead to the achievement of a spirituality of reconciliation, defined as a way of living where one becomes an agent of reconciliation, working for the healing of brokenness.

This sense of personal reconciliation is essentially a holistic perspective because it incorporates spiritual, psychological, physical, and relational dimensions; this was discussed in chapter three, where a person created in the image of God was described as a holistic being, comprised of spirit, mind and body, and as having a social responsibility as a relational being. However, because of human sin, the image of God within humanity has been damaged, which has led to a sense of alienation from God and the rupture of relationships with others. This has created a yearning within humanity for the restoration of the relationship with God and the development of a more peaceful relationship with others. Thus, one can suggest that personal reconciliation is interrelated with social reconciliation, because an individual is a relational being and the injustice experienced is often related to problems in human relations, such as racism, gender bias, conflict between different social classes and religious difference. For that reason, in order to achieve personal reconciliation, humanity needs to experience the resolution of their sins and healing, both personal and social. However, because I argue that the spiritual dimension of reconciliation is a prime factor for creating and sustaining the social dimension, I consider the transformation of the individual as vital for all forms of reconciliation. Furthermore, in pursuing personal reconciliation, I believe that the restoration of the relationship with God should be the foundation. With this understanding, the elements of personal reconciliation, changes in the image of God, sin and healing within the holistic viewpoint will be dealt with in the sections below, drawing on and interpreting my findings from the interviews.

8.1.1. Restoration of the relational image of God

As described in chapter two, Calvin argues that the human relational attribute is a substance of the image of God. In this way, the general meaning of reconciliation can be regarded as the restoration of the image of God in all humanity and finding peace with God and others. In relation to this, Schreiter suggests that the work for reconciliation implies the restoration of humanity in the form of the new creation of humanity, as Paul's theology of reconciliation declares.¹ Therefore, I believe that the restoration of the image of God in personal reconciliation focuses on the transformation of the relational character of the image of God in humanity. Regarding this, Michael Downey notes, 'it is our capacity for relationship which is the very image of God in us'.² Thus, personal reconciliation can be identified as occurring when the image of God as a relational being is restored on an individual level. Therefore, personal reconciliation, which primarily focuses on the restoration of the relational image of God, relates to the augmentation of the sense of self in connection with God and the perception of the world from God's perspective.

In this way, the viewpoint of the wrongdoer needs to be considered in personal reconciliation, because reconciliation involves the relationship between victim and wrongdoer. In studies on reconciliation, the position of the victim has generally been given more weight because reconciliation needs to begin with their healing and forgiveness. However, when reconciliation occurs in the personal arena, the transformation of wrongdoers also becomes significant, because they too are human beings created in the image of God; they too need the image of God restored in them and can also be changed by the love of God.

With regard to this, personal reconciliation involves freedom from the guilt and shame which result from one's sinful thoughts and actions. It also incorporates healing from one's hurt, fear, and anxiety caused both by others and by difficult situations beyond one's understanding, and the building of a peaceful relationship with others. In this sense, personal reconciliation can be seen to include two territories within a person: the self as both victim *and* wrongdoer. Thus, because the work of reconciliation began with God's merciful love through Christ's ministry, and because reconciliation also involves the

¹ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, pp.14-20. Schreiter puts forward the notion that Paul teaches reconciliation as the work that God initiates, spirituality, the restoration of our humanity, the new creation of humanity, and the eschatological perspective.

² Michael Downey, *Understanding Christian Spirituality*, (New York/Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1997), p.95

transformation of humanity, personal reconciliation involves the dynamics of forgiveness, repentance, mercy, truth, justice and peace which appear as values of the Gospel.³ As discussed in chapter two, reconciliation can be identified as a process as well as an ultimate goal; for, reconciliation exists in an incomplete form within us in that God's redeeming work exists as the form of 'already but not yet' within us. For that reason, reconciliation comprises of two aspects: a process moving towards the future and the subsequent completed, reconciled future. Thus, I suggest that the achievement of personal reconciliation can involve a person's transformation into an agent of reconciliation (reconciler) working towards the process of reconciliation. In doing so, the person encounters the present moment as 'a creative space'⁴ in which healing of the past and hopefulness for new creation interact with each other. In this way, the present moment is a place where the memory of the past can be re-interpreted, creating a future as the potential for hope. In other words, the process of reconciliation takes place here and now, with a view that complete reconciliation will occur in the future.

In terms of the interviewees' understanding of personal reconciliation, it would appear that there was a difference between the focus of Scottish and Korean participants. Scottish participants seemed to have a wider understanding of personal reconciliation, which included a social dimension as well as their relationship with God and themselves. Korean participants, on the other hand, seemed to focus more on their relationship with God rather than their relationships with others. They seemed to prioritise the intrapersonal aspect (inward focus) over the interpersonal (outward focus), in their understanding of personal reconciliation and spiritual growth. This seems to be caused by their current understanding of spirituality; that it should be more inward rather than outwardly focused. The idea of personal reconciliation, as I have come to understand it, corresponds with that of two Scottish directors, who saw it as a personal experience in which reconciliation between God and all humanity is embodied and lived in a person's life. One identified the notion of reconciliation with the idea of all humanity being friends of God who 'brings peace and hopefulness'; she believed that each individual's life should form part of His plan for the whole human race.⁵ The other director also explained that, although every

³ See 2.2. and 2.2.3.

⁴ John Paul Lederach focuses on living in a creative space that is between memory and potentiality. See *The Moral Imagination*, p.149

⁵ Nancy, p.4

single human being is made in the image of God, they make mistakes and have brokenness and weakness, but when God works in these areas, this leads to personal transformation and therefore personal reconciliation.⁶

Nevertheless, personal reconciliation does not exist only as the restoration of one's relationship with God, but must also include one's relationship with oneself and others; for, as Downey states, 'Our relationship with God ineluctably involves others and, for the person of faith, human self-identity and relationships with others always bear upon our relationship with God'.⁷ The relationship with oneself involves true awareness of the self, including one's role as both potential victim and wrongdoer. Most theories of reconciliation see it primarily from the side of victims, but this study suggests that reconciliation should encompass the perspective of wrongdoers, because humanity can both commit sin as well as experience hurt. As one Korean directee put it, 'Through my prayer the shift in my awareness happened that I pretended not to commit any sins and I thought only I was a victim, not a wrongdoer. So I can repent to God and have a mind to be forgiven from the person who I wronged'.⁸ Thus, the matter of sin as well as healing in a person has to be addressed in order for personal reconciliation to take place.

Therefore, personal reconciliation as restoration of a relational being includes relationships with others. One Scottish directee noted that she experienced reconciliation when she was relieved of her fears about how others would react to her.⁹ Moreover, another Scottish directee explained that one of the greatest traps when conflicts arose involved seeing only the bad in other parties; he refers to this as 'dehumanizing people and demonizing them'.¹⁰ Thus, the ability to accept others' needs is crucial when working towards personal reconciliation.

8.1.2. A holistic viewpoint of personal reconciliation

In chapter three, the individual was described from a holistic viewpoint as a whole being consisting of spirit, mind, and body under the lead of the Holy Spirit.¹¹ In his examination

⁶ Kate, p.2, p.4

⁷ Downey, *Understanding Christian Spirituality*, p.100

⁸ Sue, p.9

⁹ Clara, p.16, p.20

¹⁰ Kyle, p.16

¹¹ See 3.2.2.1.

of spirituality and healthcare, Sheldrake describes a person as a holistic being searching for healing and wholeness and he argues that the 'spiritual is the integrating factor in life'.¹² For Sheldrake, spirituality is 'existential meaning-making or the human quest for ultimate meaning or the dimension of a person that seeks meaning in life';¹³ it 'concerns what is holistic, that is an integrated rather than fragmented approach to life'.¹⁴ This means that spiritual health is connected to psychological and physical well-being. The idea that spiritual health can have an effect on one's psychological and physical health is borne out in the interviewees' descriptions of their own experiences. Both Scottish and Korean participants explained spiritual health as feeling 'oneness with God' and being 'grounded in God', and included the reaffirmation of themselves as a being loved by God.¹⁵ This awareness led them to feel greater psychological health. For instance, they described how they became free from presuppositions such as the need for perfectionism or the fear of their future and how others perceived them. Regarding this, a Scottish directee's explanation is noteworthy in that she felt able to break free within her relationship with God from her self-imposed 'good girl script'.¹⁶ The participants' psychological well-being was caused by the healing experience they felt when being forgiven and loved by God. The terms that Scottish and Korean participants used to describe this process are similar and can be related to feelings of liberation and safety; for example, 'freedom', 'forgiveness', 'integration', 'trust', 'creativity', 'flexibility', 'feeling less fear about trying something', 'stability', 'the ability for abundant expression', 'feeling at ease', 'expansion of social territory in one's life', 'ability to see myself in an objective viewpoint', and 'strength'.¹⁷ Thus, both Scottish and Korean participants reported that their feeling of a deep connection with God brought about a sense of psychological ease.

Moreover, participants' experiences of healing also led to a sense of physical well-being. Most participants described the positive relationship between the healing of memory and physical health. For example, a Scottish directee commented that, 'I think spiritual health is part of the whole of cycle of life. Our body stores memories and your body tells you things...When you're not dealing with painful memories it definitely

¹² Philip F. Sheldrake, "Spirituality and Healthcare", *Practical Theology*, (2010), vol. 3 no.3, p.376

¹³ *Ibid.*, p.372

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p.369

¹⁵ See 5.3.1.

¹⁶ Flora, p.9

¹⁷ See 6.2.6. and 7.3.4.

affects your body'.¹⁸ Moreover, one Korean director's description of his directee's experience demonstrates the close relationship between spiritual, psychological and physical health. The directee, after experiencing God's acceptance, was able to restore the relationship with her husband and her periods resumed after ten years of absence.¹⁹

However, this close connection between spirituality and physical health was not always a positive one, with one Korean directee describing her experience of depression and weight loss during her prayerful contemplation of Jesus' suffering.²⁰ Yet, because her health improved on completion of this stage of the Exercises, it can be suggested that this period of ill-health was temporary and part of the process of her healing.

This holistic connection between spirituality and physical health was not recognised by everyone before the interview, because some directees mentioned that they had never considered the correlation between the spiritual and physical before seeing the interview question. Therefore, as seen above, although most participants shared an understanding of the positive relationship between spiritual and psychological well-being, the relationship between spiritual and physical health is not necessarily part of conscious awareness until it is prompted.

8.1.3. The place of sin in personal reconciliation

8.1.3.1. The understanding of personal sin

As discussed above, personal reconciliation includes two territories located within the self: victim and wrongdoer. The recognition of oneself as victim requires the experience of the resolution of one's painful past and can be characterised as healing. However, healing is also a necessary issue for the wrongdoer, in that the experience of forgiveness by God, or one's repentance, can lead to a sense of healing. Therefore, it is necessary to deal with the issue of sin before turning more directly to healing. In this thesis, I argue that personal reconciliation draws Christians towards a true awareness of themselves as forgiven sinners in God, because sin – alienation from God – causes a person's sinful thoughts, actions, sense of inner isolation, and broken relationships with others, as well as a ruptured

¹⁸ Jenny, p.16

¹⁹ See 7.2.6.

²⁰ Heidi, p.8

community. In this sense, brokenness of the relationship with God results in brokenness in relationships at other levels. Therefore, the issue of sin needs to be resolved in order to achieve personal reconciliation; repentance as well as forgiveness are elements of the dynamics of reconciliation. The personal experience of forgiveness by God can then be expanded towards others who have caused hurt, and the experience of repentance to God can bring about repentance for sinful thoughts and actions towards others. All participants described the positive relationship between their experience of God's forgiveness and their forgiving heart towards others. One Scottish director talked about the flow of forgiveness from God to other people that spiritual direction can facilitate if they experience a deeper touch by God's forgiveness of them.²¹ Moreover, one of the Korean directees described a sense of repentance towards others during spiritual direction. She was able to overcome the feeling that only she was a victim, and, once she had experienced repentance, felt able to live 'a life filled with apology and modesty'.²²

However, the understanding of the specifics of sin itself differed between the two nationalities; this was demonstrated by their choice of language to refer to sin and the emphasis they placed on certain terms, which in turn illustrated their feelings towards sin as a concept and experience. In order to describe sin, Scottish directors and directees used the terms 'fear of God's judgement', 'fear of alienation from God', 'selfishness', 'brokenness', 'weakness', 'foibles', 'negativity' and 'shadow'.²³ Scottish directors suggested that the term 'sin' could cause feelings of guilt, which became a barrier to experiencing a healthy image of God. Thus, they preferred to use more psychological terms, such as 'shadow' and 'negativity', instead of more theological terms. On the other hand, Korean directors used the term 'ingratitude sin' to describe ontological sin, the distortion of the image of God, and self-centredness caused by cutting off communication with God.²⁴

Korean directees also used the terms 'alienation and separation from God' and 'cutting off communication with God'.²⁵ Although some Korean directees used the term 'negativity and shadow', they focused more on the theological meaning of sin defined in

²¹ Kate, pp.13-14

²² Sue, pp.8-9

²³ See 6.2.7. and 6.3.7.

²⁴ See 7.2.7 .

²⁵ See 7.3.6.

terms of their relationship with God and on theological practice related to sin; that is, the restoration of their relationship with God and repentance. Thus, they used the term 'sin' more actively concerning their experience of spiritual direction: it caused an 'enhancement of sensitivity of sin' and increased their 'self-awareness as a sinner'. Scottish directees, however, appeared to feel more uncomfortable with the word 'sin'; they therefore tended to use psychological terms to explain their experience of spiritual direction concerning the issues of sin, focusing on inner healing and liberation: 'healing from brokenness', 'positive perspective of myself', 'connection' and 'integration'.

Thus, spiritual direction appears to have a slightly different emphasis for Korean participants and Scottish participants; Korean participants put more emphasis on the right awareness of themselves as a forgiven sinner while Scottish participants focus more on healing and liberation. While both aspects are contained within the main purpose of spiritual direction, they focus on different areas. These differences can perhaps be explained by the conservatism of the Korean directors in their approach to spiritual direction, where they want to keep its distinctive theological character rather than fusing it with psychology; cautious, perhaps, that spirituality might become psychologised. The preference of Scottish directees for psychological terms to explain sin can perhaps be explained by the prevailing therapy culture in Western society.

In my opinion, the Korean approach to sin seems to be more closely related to that focusing on a theological understanding of humanity and sin, while the Scottish approach focuses more on combining spirituality and psychology, highlighting human freedom and inner healing. As I mentioned above, this may suggest that the Korean approach seeks to maintain the uniqueness of spiritual direction and the Ignatian way in relation to theology. Nonetheless, as seen in the directees' responses,²⁶ Korean as well as Scottish directees came for spiritual direction with issues related to inner healing, not only the issue of their relationship with God. Therefore, I would suggest that the Korean approach needs to be more open to the contemporary mood of the Ignatian way, which emphasises 'freedom' rather than sin, because, as discussed in chapter four, freedom is the ultimate goal of the Ignatian way. By doing so, the Korean spiritual direction could become a more helpful

²⁶ See 6.3.3. and 7.3.3.

tool for directees' spiritual growth. Nevertheless, there also needs to be an awareness of the dangers of *replacing* spirituality with psychology.

8.1.3.2. *The understanding of social sin*

The social responsibilities of humanity as the image of God and the issues of personal reconciliation involving social problems were discussed in an earlier chapter.²⁷ This theme is related to an understanding of sin as structural sin and personal sin. Self-awareness as a forgiven sinner is connected with the alteration of one's perception of and attitudes towards others and the world, because sin has a social as well as an individual dimension. Therefore, personal reconciliation can be a space within which these dimensions can be reflected; for, as Ivens argues, 'sin is never only personal and private, but contaminates the world itself, especially the quality of other people's lives and the realm of relationships and structures'.²⁸ Such comprehension of sin was given voice by the participants, in particular by the Scottish participants, who referred to 'personal sin' and 'social structural sin'. Two Scottish directors connected personal and social sin in terms of breaking values of the Gospels, such as harmony, peace, justice,²⁹ and also identified sin as 'selfishness, greed and envy'.³⁰ One Scottish directee also explained how he came to understand social sin as well as individual sin in the Exercises. Defining sin as a failure to love, he noted that, on an individual level, we failed to practice God's love in the context in which we are called. He also commented that sin existed on a social level, where multinational companies took advantage of those who did not have as much power, simply because of greed.³¹

Social structural sin can also be identified with the misuse and destruction of the environment, carelessness towards the poor and disadvantaged, and unfair trade between nations. This understanding was found among both Scottish and Korean participants. However, while Scottish participants expressed more actively their interest in structural sin compared to Korean participants, the latter talked more about personal sin. This can be related to the atmosphere of Korean Christianity regarding the discussion of spirituality,

²⁷ See 3.2.1.1.

²⁸ Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, p.57

²⁹ Kate, p.5, Nancy, p.9

³⁰ Kate, p.2

³¹ Martin, p.7

which, it could be suggested, is less interested in the resolution of social structural issues and more focused on the growth of faith in personal life. Sheldrake points out that the study of spirituality in Christianity has generally been more focused on personal faith, but now needs to be expanded towards spirituality for social transformation.³² Thus, it would be helpful for Korean spirituality to be shaped by this voice because, as shown in the interview of a Korean director, lay people's interest in society is very developed in Korea.³³

Regarding this issue, while the Korean Church is more focused on personal sin and growth, Scottish directees felt that the Church of Scotland is more focused on social sin and Christians' societal responsibility; they therefore felt a spiritual desire for personal growth and a deepened relationship with God.³⁴ With this in mind, it seems that there needs to be a greater sense of balance and integration between the individual, spiritual and social, structural dimensions than exists at the moment in the two countries discussed here. I think that this points to the foundation of the Christian vocation for reconciliation; in other words, the participants' awareness of social sin and, to a lesser extent, individual healing highlights the need for individuals to work as agents of reconciliation in the local or wider community as a partner of God.

8.1.4. The role of healing in personal reconciliation

In chapter two, I identified healing as an aspect of personal reconciliation, along with the shaping of new relationships. Healing can be defined as the curing of wounds; the foundation for this experience is being loved by God because, for Christians, God's love enables one to see one's past from a new perspective. Therefore, healing involves the resolution of the past through the healing of memory and the resolution of negative feelings towards the other. Without this, genuine reconciliation cannot be achieved because a new and creative relationship cannot be shaped if the area of brokenness within a relationship is not first properly identified. Healing enables one to recognize how the relationship had previously been damaged and it opens individuals' hearts to others. Once healed, those involved in the relationship can work together to rebuild and sustain it;

³² See Philip F. Sheldrake, "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly: A Dialectic of the Mystical and Prophetic", *Spiritus* 3 (2003)

³³ Yoojin, p.9

³⁴ See 6.3.4.

however, without healing, any new relationship is weakened and has the potential to be destroyed.

Regarding the notion and experience of healing, participants' experiences seemed to draw a parallel with the ideas outlined above, as they defined healing as the recovery of brokenness, the mending of the past, and being free from fear and anxiety about the present and future due to negative past experiences. They explained that this comes from feeling God intimately and being grounded in God and therefore goes beyond the psychological sense. In other words, they expressed the idea that, although healing is very much centred on the resolution of psychological feelings of anger and bitterness, it moves beyond this to include the reinterpretation of their lived experiences. Therefore, healing leads to an enhanced sense of self-esteem and the ability to forgive and understand others. In this way, healing can thus play a pivotal role in personal reconciliation for the creation of peaceful relationships in the future. Directees experienced healing in a tangible way during Ignatian spiritual direction, through their prayer on Jesus' life, because Jesus' whole life is an expression of God's merciful love for humanity. The story of Jesus' suffering and resurrection, in particular, provides a way for them to give their suffering meaning, which can then lead them in a new direction for living, extending themselves towards others.³⁵

To conclude, personal reconciliation can be identified as the reshaping of relationships with God, self and others; the foundation for this is the restoration of one's relationship with God. This can help one develop a spirituality of reconciliation which enables one to work as God's partner as a reconciler for healing brokenness. Personal reconciliation incorporates the two territories of victim and wrongdoer in the self, so the components of forgiveness, repentance, justice, compassion, and peace all need to be considered in order for personal reconciliation to take place. Personal reconciliation is a holistic perspective which includes the spiritual, psychological and physical elements within the person and also an awareness of the personal and social dimensions of an

³⁵ I will discuss this correlation between healing and Ignatian spiritual direction in detail in section 8.2.3.

individual life. This awareness incorporates healing, repentance from individual sin, and social responsibility for social sin.

8.2. Ignatian spiritual direction as a practice for personal reconciliation

Throughout the previous chapters, I have argued that spiritual direction can be a practice for personal reconciliation because spiritual direction facilitates the unification of directees' faith and ordinary life through prayer and conversation with directors, which enables them to gain a new perspective of God, themselves, and others. To explain this further, I will focus on the use of Ignatian spiritual direction as a space for directees' personal reconciliation. I will also discuss the experience of directees in accordance with the order of the four Weeks of the Exercises. For, although their experiences do not always follow the specific features outlined in each Week of the Exercises sequentially, most elements are present.

8.2.1. A space for considering the issues of personal reconciliation

Throughout this thesis, I have illustrated that spiritual direction can be a space like the *shack* described in chapter one. It can enhance directees' sense of all levels of relationality, because by trying to find a more intimate relationship with God, other levels of relationships can be developed. This space is therefore unique in that it acts as a place for integrating these different levels of relationship, based on the deeper encounter with God experienced by directees. In this way, it can be regarded as a gift from God, enabling directors and directees to work with the Holy Spirit.

Regarding the expectation of spiritual direction, directors and directees placed a slightly different emphasis on certain aspects. All directors described the search for a more intimate relationship with God as being the directees' main focus for spiritual direction but directees demonstrated they had other personal issues they needed to address. The desire for a deeper relationship with God was indeed the reason directees initially gave as to why they came for spiritual direction, but as their interviews progressed, they revealed that their 'desire for deep faith' had many other implications, such as the need for inner healing and the resolution of their relational problems. They wanted to seek answers that explained the afflictions they had experienced in their lives and to take comfort from God.

The interesting thing to note here is that, in contrast to directors' expectations, many directees struggled with relational problems in their churches and family and suffered from fear and anxiety due to those problems; they therefore had a desire to find a way to cope with these problems. These longings are related to their desire for the restoration and reshaping of their relationships with God, themselves, and others, which, as mentioned above, form the kernel of personal reconciliation. The relationship between one's spirituality and relationality is best described by Downey:

In the vocabulary of spirituality today, it is important to note that relationality and relationship are key...The attention given to the relational matrix is not limited to interpersonal relationships with others and God. It pertains to the essential relatedness of everything that exists... Since God, the Trinity, is a communion of persons in loving relationship, it is important to see human relationality as a privileged locus for the encounter with God...It is our capacity for relationship which is the very image of God in us.³⁶

In relation to the point above, it is clear from my fieldwork that spiritual direction can act as a space both to renew one's relationship with God and oneself and to nurture understanding of and compassion towards others. Throughout the whole process of Ignatian spiritual direction, directees achieved personal reconciliation through their experiences of healing, liberation from guilt, and acceptance of others by encountering God's love and Jesus' ministry; the Holy Spirit led them towards these experiences. They occurred at specific points during the process, with each Week having a particular function. However, the process of personal reconciliation is integrated throughout.

In conclusion, directees come for spiritual direction because of various issues they connected with reconciliation; spiritual direction is therefore a space for them to learn and practice a peaceful relationship with God, themselves, and others. Spiritual direction takes the directees' desire for relationality into account through their intimate relationship with God and their loving and trusting relationship with their director; for, it seems that people who come for spiritual direction today are yearning for genuine relationships.

8.2.2. *The First Week*

The First Week focuses on a meditation on the purpose of creation, as seen in the prayer of Principle and Foundation, and on personal sin and humanity's sin, while

³⁶ Downey, *Understanding Christian Spirituality*, p.95

experiencing God's mercy; this then enables directees to experience forgiveness and grace. The directees' prayers in this First Week therefore initiate the process of personal reconciliation because they can become aware of their own and humanity's sinfulness and the common humanity they share, being created in the image of God. One Korean director explained this shift as follows: 'To pray means to break self-love and self-centeredness and to yield oneself to God, and give oneself to others voluntarily. As a result, people can go forward in the service of love toward others'.³⁷ This process is initiated in the First Week but is continued and developed throughout the Exercises. In relation to this change in their relationality, directees reported that they achieved this awareness through Ignatian spiritual direction; in particular, some made practical relational amendments with others with whom they had uneasy relationships.

8.2.2.1. *Forgiveness*

I have argued throughout this thesis that spiritual direction can foster a sense of directees' forgiveness and repentance through their encounter with being forgiven by God and their repentance to God. In addition, although forgiveness and repentance in spiritual direction is about directees' relationship with God, such experiences can be naturally expanded to include directees' human relationships. Furthermore, forgiveness of others includes both 'letting go' of painful feelings and memories and interpersonal forgiveness. In order to describe their experience of forgiveness, most participants used the terms 'forgetting', 'understanding', and 'remembering in a different way'. For Scottish directees, the notion of forgiveness meant learning to forget and letting go of their hurt and disappointment caused by others; for them, God's forgiveness, as experienced in the First Week when praying about their own sins and God's forgiving love, denotes that God had forgotten their sins.³⁸ One directee describes this well:

It is not only just forgiven, but forgotten. When I had completed the retreat and I was reflecting a month later, I realized that I had; it wasn't affecting me anymore. It was no longer making me emotionally tight or screwed up.³⁹

Korean directees also depicted forgiveness as 'understanding' and one Korean director defined forgiveness as 'remembering in a different way':

³⁷ Yoojin, p.2

³⁸ Flora, p.12, Jenny, p.17 Clara, p.12, Jisu, p.9

³⁹ Clara, p.12, p.15

That process is to help directees see what God had done for them. Thus, directees are enabled to understand that the event was allowed by God. So, it is not about forgiving others, but about understanding and accepting that events were allowed by God. Therefore, they can accept that the difficult events caused by the other person were necessary [for my own growth], and then accept the other.⁴⁰

These explanations of forgiveness are a little different from those offered by many theorists of reconciliation, who argue that forgetting is not the same as forgiveness. However, from the perspective of personal reconciliation, it appears that forgiveness includes the endeavour to forget, understood as letting go of the power of negativity associated with painful memories. For, in doing so, directees are able to achieve a degree of psychological and spiritual wellbeing. In relation to the discussion of intrapersonal and interpersonal forgiveness mentioned above, Ani Kalayian and Raymond F. Paloutzian define intrapersonal forgiveness as letting go of negative feelings towards perpetrators.⁴¹ Thus, letting go can be seen as a form of forgiveness; however, they caution that ‘it is possible for a victim to believe that he or she has forgiven, even though he or she has not’.⁴² Therefore, Kalayian and Paloutzian suggest the need for interpersonal forgiveness, noting that it ‘could be by initiating some kind of meaningful contact, whether direct or indirect, with the perpetrator, if the offender is not available’.⁴³

Although some of the directees thought they understood the reasons for their wrongdoer’s actions, they did not take steps to restore the relationship. It could be that the participants no longer belonged to the same community as those who had hurt them so had little chance of contact with them. However, there are other cases where the participants belonged to the same community as those who had caused them pain and the motivation for their lack of action is unclear. This suggests that some participants understood forgiveness as intrapersonal forgiveness rather than interpersonal forgiveness.

According to Schimmel, a secular understanding of forgiveness does not necessarily consider the ultimate aim of forgiveness to be reconciliation; on the other hand, the

⁴⁰ Junsu, p.10; He stated this idea in connection to the prayer ‘My Blessed History’.

⁴¹ From Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, “Introduction: Issues and Themes in Forgiveness and Reconciliation”, in Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, p.7

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Ibid.

forgiveness of God works towards reconciliation with humanity.⁴⁴ Thus, for Christians, forgiveness should be extended to include interpersonal and communal levels; it cannot remain solely intrapersonal, for these extensions are signs of authentic forgiveness. In this sense, Christians need to learn to express their forgiveness and repentance because reconciliation is the purpose of Jesus' coming to Earth. This appears to be a more proactive approach towards forgiveness than that found in intrapersonal forgiveness, because intrapersonal forgiveness becomes interpersonal when it is expressed. I suggest that it is therefore necessary to differentiate between intrapersonal and interpersonal forgiveness when considering participants' descriptions of their own forgiving actions towards others. In addition, in order for intrapersonal forgiveness to be true forgiveness and a means of forming new relationships, it needs to be expressed, whether verbally or nonverbally. Thus, reconciliation ministry requires a place for Church members to learn how to express their forgiveness and to show repentance to others in a direct or indirect way. However, this process needs to be handled carefully because it is often difficult to identify who is the victim and who is the perpetrator.

With regard to the importance of expressing forgiveness, two Korean directees gave a good example of the positive relationship between such expression and reconciliation. They confirmed that they experienced a sense of moving forward in a new relationship with others when they expressed their weakness and apologized; they also had the courage to admit their mistakes and faults when they saw their failure, weakness, and past wrongdoing through prayer.⁴⁵ One described his experience thus:

I had an experience of one person treating me so badly in a meeting. Through prayer, I saw that circumstance and I could understand the person. I had not managed the meeting well. After, I met him again. I said to him, "I understand why you did that." He was really surprised at me and sent me a Christmas card saying, "Let's have a good relationship". That was a wonderful experience.⁴⁶

This is an example of forgiveness being understood as acceptance and of repentance contributing to reconciliation. The most notable point is that the participant expressed his acceptance and apology in the relationship, but did not forgive the other directly. It can be suggested that Christians take forgiveness of others into account in the sense of Christian

⁴⁴ Schimmel, *Wounds of Healed by Time: The Power of Repentance and Forgiveness*, p.52

⁴⁵ Kihoon, p.5, Bora, p.8

⁴⁶ Kihoon, p.5

morality or ethics, which they see as a duty; in other words, they believe that Christians should forgive others in accordance with the teaching of Christ. This ethic is grounded in Matthew 18:21-22, where Jesus told Peter, who had asked how many times others would sin against him, that he would have to forgive them 'seventy times seven', or, in other words, unconditionally. Therefore, directees can forgive others within themselves, but are fearful of returning to the old relationship as it was before the brokenness; they need to move on. As discussed above, reconciliation does not mean a return to the old relationship; instead, it involves the creation of a new relationship.

8.2.2.2. The change in directees' image of God and themselves

The change in directees' image of God and themselves are crucial components in personal reconciliation, because they signify a development in their relationship with God and themselves. It is recognised that spiritual direction can bring about the modification of one's image of God, one's self-awareness, and subsequently one's view of the world because these changes of image mean changes within one's perceptions and attitudes. This was demonstrated by participants' experiences. The directees' changes to their image of God and self-identity is connected to their experience of forgiveness by God in the First Week, whereas their feelings of compassion and hospitality toward others are expressed more in relation to their experience of Jesus in the Second and Third Week, despite their becoming aware of these feelings in the First Week. Therefore, directees' compassion and hospitality toward others will be discussed in relation to the Second and Third Week.

The First Week has a fundamental role in this change to the image of God, because it leads directees to be powerfully touched by God as a God of mercy, enabling their conversion and a new perception of themselves as a being loved by God. Their transformed image of God therefore becomes the foundation of their personal reconciliation. All directees' image of God had changed enormously through Ignatian spiritual direction, beginning in the First Week. The image of God that most participants had before starting spiritual direction was a God who was judgmental and distant; now, however, for them, God is a God who can communicate with them with a warm heart, having compassion and love, and longing for everybody to live in all their fullness. One Scottish directee gave an example of his experience in the First Week:

[My image of God has] changed more from a God who drives, perhaps who has an unbending will, to one who beckons and calls and offers choices. And

certainly there's a strengthening of the concept of a God who endlessly loves and forgives and longs for everybody to flourish as human beings.⁴⁷

One Korean directee also expressed the same feeling, in that, previously she had the image of a punishing God, but now feels that God is endlessly accepting and loving her.⁴⁸ The directees' image of God therefore became more personal. One interesting point noted in some female directees' interviews is the fact that they used more intimate terms to designate a greater closeness with God. One Scottish female directee described God as a mother and two Korean female directees spoke of God as being analogous to a husband or lover.⁴⁹ The others used more traditional terms to describe their changed image of God, such as father, friend, and partner, but the nuance highlighted their greater closeness and ease with God.

Throughout this thesis, I have argued that the encounter with God's love will affect the formation of Christian identity. The interviews demonstrated this. Such changes to directees' awareness of God leads to a renewed self-awareness and a variation in self-identity because they became aware of themselves as beings who have been loved and graced by God, and who are friends of Jesus and partners of God through whom the Holy Spirit works. The liberation grounded in this strengthened and affirmed trust of God leads to changes in self-awareness and identity. All the directees felt they could begin to accept themselves as they were, including their weaknesses and shortcomings, and some felt more like a son or daughter of the Father than a servant of God. Furthermore, the directees felt more positive about themselves and more appreciative of the present moment. Such a change of self-identity pertained to the healing of their memories and reinterpretation of their life stories. In other words, healing of memories began with their awareness that God had been with them throughout their lives; it also helped them reinterpret their lives from the perspective of God. Thus, directees' growth in self-awareness started in the First Week, developing further and becoming stronger in relation to Jesus' life as a reflection of their lives in the Second Week.

As articulated above, because of its place in the directees' changed image of God and themselves, their change in identity, their sense of forgiveness, and their conversion

⁴⁷ Jamie, p.4

⁴⁸ Jisu, p.3

⁴⁹ Jenny, p.8, Bora, p.5, Sue, p.6

experience, the First Week can be regarded as the foundation to the creation of the personal reconciliation process.

8.2.3. The Second Week

Throughout the whole process of the Second Week, directees are led to follow Jesus intimately and participate in service for Jesus in the world. This focus of the Second Week on the contemplation of Jesus' life enables directees to respond to Christ's calling. This Week therefore strengthens directees' Christian identity with the reinterpretation of their life story through the medium of Jesus' life and with their decision to become a true disciple of Jesus. In other words, this Week serves as a particular stage on the journey to achieving personal reconciliation.

8.2.3.1. Reinterpretation of one's life story through Jesus' story

Throughout this thesis, I have suggested that Jesus' story can be a framework for reinterpreting directees' lives; this reinterpretation of their life story can bring about healing through their renewed self-identity. In the process towards personal reconciliation, the Second Week functions as a place where directees can have a strengthened Christian identity brought about by their changed image of Jesus. Regarding this, directees reported that their previous image was of someone who was distant, someone they had a duty to follow; however, through their imaginative prayer of Jesus' life, Jesus became closer to them, giving comfort, and wanting to heal them. They therefore had a willingness to follow Christ very closely and dedicate themselves to serving him.

The framework of Jesus' life thus becomes a new window through which directees can see their lives from the perspective of God, as revealed in the Bible stories. Their new identity arises from their confidence that God has been with them throughout their lives. Of the Bible stories, the most useful for interpreting their suffering is the story of the Cross and Resurrection in the Third and Fourth Weeks. However, although Jesus' Cross and Resurrection was the most crucial element in moving towards a new identity, Jesus' other life stories, as contemplated in the Second Week, can also become a mirror for directees' understanding of their own stories. For, although tremendous tragedies occur across the world and many victims need healing due to these tragedies, it appears that there is also a necessity for healing and reconciliation for those who have not been caught up in extraordinary tragedies but whose lives are nonetheless marred by more 'everyday'

conflicts, such as family conflict, misunderstandings with church members, and disappointment with and distrust of colleagues. In this way, Ignatian spiritual direction enabled directees to glimpse their lives from God's perspective rather than from their own, and to heal their memories of painful stories by experiencing God there with them.

With regard to this, one Korean directee's experience is noteworthy because it demonstrated that she experienced the healing of memory and the creation of a new meaning for her memories:

God led me to remember everything from my childhood to now. Everything was recovered in my memory. I began to see my memory from a different viewpoint. Even the memories that had no meaning were changed into meaningful memories because I realized God was there with me within these memories.⁵⁰

Other participants also realized, through prayer, that their lives were led by God and they became aware of how delicately God had intervened in their lives. Such realization, which deepened during the Second Week, had been initiated through prayer during the preparation days of the Exercises; for instance, 'Prayer on My Dossier', 'The Way Things Are', and prayers with the scripture relating to God's creation and constant love.⁵¹ These prayers were reported by many participants as being a good instrument for reinterpreting both their life stories as God's gifts and their responses to God. These prayers helped them to see their life stories as a history of grace given by God's blessing and to see themselves from a more positive angle.⁵² Thus, the healing of memory signifies that the moment of suffering and meaninglessness in life is altered into meaningful memory. The time of affliction changes into a moment in which God intervened and was there with them. These experiences were developed further and strengthened in the Second Week, during the prayers on Jesus' life.

However, as articulated above, the contemplation of Jesus' whole life story in the Second Week can also be a means of spiritual practice for personal reconciliation, because

⁵⁰ Bora, p.9

⁵¹ 'Prayer on My Dossier' is a prayer that encourages one to see one's whole life history as a gift from God: 'In the notebook, I jot down all the vital statistics of my life. As I note each piece of date, I raise my mind to God my Maker, and praise and thank the Creator for this detail in my life history and in myself.' See Joseph Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.119. 'The Way Things Are' is a prayer that teaches how God created a person 'out of love' in the concrete, not in general, and calls the person to live his or her special qualities and characteristics. See Tetlow, *Choosing Christ in the World*, p.121

⁵² Hammin, p.5

the whole life of Jesus is a window through which people may see their lives and experiences and therefore becomes an instrument by which healing and new insights happen. The Jesus encountered in the prayers of this Week is a child, a stranger in Egypt and Nazareth, a healer and a reconciler, who weeps for the suffering. Consequently, the Second Week can facilitate directees to reflect on Jesus' whole life and consider how they should live in this world. Directees gave many examples of this. For example, one Korean directee noted the following:

The best fruit out of the prayer process was that I could see Jesus as the same human as me. Before, for me, Jesus was only an example to follow. However, I relished the life and journey of Jesus through the prayer processes.⁵³

A Scottish directee enhanced his trust in God through imaginative prayer to picture himself as the person being carried on the stretcher (Luke 5:17-26):

[I was] not in any way being afraid. I was completely trusting, so there's always been a deep trust there, all I can say is it's been strengthened and affirmed in this process; even if life is difficult and life throws knocks at you.⁵⁴

The idea that Jesus' whole life story can become a mirror reflecting directees' own stories coincides with Sheldrake's explanation that 'living within the *whole story* of Jesus Christ also implies coming to grips with the full story of our human existence'.⁵⁵ The directees' full story is not just filled with trust in God and positive feelings towards God, but is also 'a narrative of human incompleteness, failure, false aspirations – the ambiguity of lives that are both graced and sinful'.⁵⁶ Nonetheless, Sheldrake notes that 'the freedom to acknowledge a whole life in which our imperfections... become a foundation for receptive learning'⁵⁷ and enables the process of 'healing what is broken,'⁵⁸ and 'reconciling what is alienated' to occur.⁵⁹

In addition, it is interesting to note that the crucial element of the directee participants' change to the image of God the Trinity was their image of Jesus. Before spiritual direction, Jesus was a model they had to imitate and an example that they felt

⁵³ Sue, p.1

⁵⁴ Jamie, p.5

⁵⁵ Philip F. Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, p.147

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

compelled to follow. However, during the contemplation of the life of Jesus, they became aware that Jesus was a real human being, having vulnerability and powerlessness, who came to Earth to love; therefore, it became more possible for them to look to Jesus as an example for serving God. One Scottish directee described her experience in relation to this issue:

[The relationship with Jesus is] a much encouraging relationship. I had lived by the phrase, 'come to me, abide in me, live in me, go for me'. And that 'go' was a very 'do it yourself' and the transformation would have been in John in the end of John's Gospel, when Jesus says to Peter, 'follow me'. That suddenly was transformative for me. I was just walking in his footsteps. He was no longer distant.⁶⁰

As seen above, as in the other Weeks, the contemplation of Jesus' whole life in the Second Week enables directees to experience healing and reconciliation throughout Jesus' life as a human and the compassionate manner in which Jesus treated people. These experiences are part of personal reconciliation, bringing about healing. Reinterpreting their life story from this new perspective plays a pivotal role in directees' personal reconciliation because they are able to trust that their lives had always been planned for them by God. This idea, however, does not mean finding God's fixed plan for them, which could be regarded as 'pre-destination'. As discussed in relation to Lonsdale's suggestion in chapter four, if finding God's will is identified with God's fixed blueprint for our lives, it will limit our growth in freedom and hope. Instead, spiritual direction helps directees to discover God's hope for them with a feeling of freedom, forming their lives as Christians. Recognition of God's expectation for them strengthened their identity as a child or friend of God and a close friend of Jesus. This renewed identity enables them to choose to commit themselves willingly to Christ, which means deciding that the direction of their lives is the way of Christ. This will now be explored in more detail.

8.2.3.2. *Discernment: finding God's will*

Throughout this thesis, I have argued that spiritual direction can be a space for directees to discover God's will. Furthermore, through the process of discerning God's will, the Ignatian way can help them to decide what role they should have as a follower of Jesus in this world. Discernment occurs particularly in the Second Week, through

⁶⁰ Clara, p.4

contemplation of the Kingdom and Three kinds of humility, and signifies the decision to choose to serve and commit to the work of Christ. Thus, in the Second Week, directees' consideration of their vocation begins with learning how to respond to Christ's calling and how to make a good election; this process develops further in the subsequent two Weeks.

In relation to finding God's will, Sheldrake's proposal that participation in public life as a practice of Christian discipleship needs to be considered. He states that for many people, the term *spirituality* is thought to mean the interior quest for 'personal spiritual experience away from everyday life';⁶¹ however, he highlights that personal spiritual life should include public life because the public is an aspect of a person and a person's identity. To support this idea, Sheldrake quotes Rowan Williams, who suggests that 'the real self is found or made from the very beginning in human communication and interaction'.⁶² Therefore, according to Sheldrake, to live publically means embracing diversity, overcoming 'the fear of mixing and disintegration of social boundaries', and providing hospitality for different and unfamiliar people; it excludes 'existing passively in the midst of the world'.⁶³ This idea of living publicly therefore seems to correspond with the interpersonal aspect of personal reconciliation, as compared to the intrapersonal aspect focused on in the First Week. In this sense, the discernment process encourages directees to nurture the public life of Christian discipleship in this world; in other words, it inspires them to live the love of God and to embody Christ's mission, creating a peaceful relationship with their neighbours. After finding this general vocation to become Christ's disciple, directees may progress to a deeper form of spirituality and find their specific vocation in the subsequent Weeks.

To summarize, the exercises in the Second Week serve as a significant phase in directees' personal reconciliation by enabling them to reinterpret their lives through the window of Jesus' life and to choose a life dedicated to Christ. Through the discernment process, directees are led towards interpersonal reconciliation by their decision to live a public life as the practice of Christian discipleship.

⁶¹ Sheldrake defines spirituality as 'a way of life, or life in the Spirit'. In Philip F. Sheldrake, "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly: A Dialectic of the Mystical and Prophetic", p.19

⁶² Ibid., He explains this idea paraphrasing Rowan Williams, *On Christian Theology* (Oxford & Malden Mass: Blackwell, 2000), p. 259

⁶³ Ibid., p.27

8.2.4. *The Third Week*

The focus of the Third Week is to draw directees to participate in Jesus' suffering and experience the culmination of Christ's love towards humanity. Throughout the exercises during this Week, directees begin to consider the cost of discipleship and to reinterpret their suffering in relation to Jesus' suffering and his redeeming work. This process leads them to have compassion towards others through their encounter with Jesus' self-giving love. Therefore, this Week provides a crucial space for directees to achieve personal reconciliation; for, by gaining a deeper wisdom of suffering, they can experience healing and liberation and are able to see others from Jesus' viewpoint.

8.2.4.1. *Reinterpretation of one's suffering through Jesus' Cross*

As mentioned above, the most powerful framework for bringing about such a shift in directees' interpretations of their lives is the story of Jesus' suffering and Resurrection. Thus, Schreiter suggests that although our stories about ourselves, our family, friends, and countries are a powerful means for shaping our identities, for Christians, the stories of Jesus have a powerful influence on Christian identity; moreover, Jesus' Cross and Resurrection can be used as the framework for retelling our stories.⁶⁴ According to participants, the story of Jesus' suffering enabled them to accept their suffering as a part of their lives rather than as something fearful that should not be happening to them.⁶⁵ Through the contemplation of Jesus, they realized that Jesus' suffering was the result of his self-giving and self-renunciation, which was an expression of his love for them. They came to this realization when they encountered stories of Jesus as a human in this world. Thus, they were aware that God had never abandoned them and could accept that throughout their affliction, God was there with them; this enabled them to overcome their problems.⁶⁶

However, the contemplation of the Crucifixion is demanding and difficult because discipleship comes at a heavy price. Directees reported that they felt that they were required to sacrifice their previous life of ease through the contemplation of Jesus' suffering. This aroused feelings of heaviness in them as well as a reluctance to continue.

⁶⁴ Schreiter, *The Ministry of Reconciliation*, pp.19-20

⁶⁵ Jamie, p.17, Kyle, p.24

⁶⁶ Kyle, p.24, Jenny, p.14, Clara, p.23, Amy, p.18

One Korean directee said that at the beginning of the experience, she had felt that Jesus was demanding that she live like him.⁶⁷ However, when she saw the scars on Jesus' body in her imaginative prayer, she realized that those scars were the signs of his love for her.

Thus, directees could understand Jesus' suffering as a fellow human, not simply as their Saviour, and were able to share Jesus' pain and brokenness. This enabled them to be with him in his death and weep for him. Feeling oneness with Jesus was a powerful experience for some participants; one Korean directee reported that she had lost weight during this contemplation. Overall, directees found it an eye-opening experience, which brought about healing and liberation through their new awareness that Jesus' suffering was for them. Consequently, they began to see their difficulties as grace and gained comfort from Jesus' self-giving love. Prior to this, they could not understand why they had such painful events in their lives; however, through Jesus' suffering, they were able to integrate these painful experiences into their graced lives because they realised that this pain was the site of Jesus' and the Holy Spirit's presence. This transformative experience brought about a change in their attitude towards and understanding of others. They could see others from Jesus' loving perspective and achieve an open heart towards them. The experience also became a trigger for the directees to consider and choose a life that worked for the broken and damaged as a way to embody Jesus' life. Thus, one Korean directee said that he found his vocation in the bearing of Jesus' suffering, because Jesus is still bearing people's suffering in this world.⁶⁸

8.2.4.2. *Compassion*

It is clear that the directees' awareness that Jesus died for others arouses in them a sense of compassion towards others. This awareness is also connected with changes in directees' image of God, because they realise that others are also created in the image of God and loved by Christ. Such compassion for others is an element of personal reconciliation; furthermore, it can contribute to the creation of a peaceful atmosphere in society, as compassion means having God's mercy within us. In this regard, personal reconciliation can be a significant component in the production and maintenance of social reconciliation. In addition, directees' compassion inspires them to dedicate themselves to

⁶⁷ Sue, pp.8-9

⁶⁸ Kihoon, p.3

those suffering and broken in society. This willingness to dedicate themselves in this way can be referred to as the enhancement of the spirituality of reconciliation. Therefore, this awakening can open a way for individuals to contribute to reconciliation at social levels. Regarding the idea of augmenting the spirituality of reconciliation through the prayer of Jesus' Crucifixion, directees in both cohorts also suggested that such awareness was powerfully enabled by directees' encounter with Jesus as a self-giver and the experience of Jesus' compassion for all people in the Third Week.⁶⁹

As discussed in chapter two, acceptance of and compassion towards others as fellow human beings is a crucial component in reconciliation, as conflict arises from the notion that others are different from oneself and may pose a potential threat. As one directee mentioned above, one of the main obstacles to the process of conflict resolution was seeing only the bad in other parties. Thus, the ability to accept others needs to be nurtured in order to develop a spirituality of reconciliation. Both Scottish and Korean directors noted that directees became more open after experiencing Jesus' self-giving love for all humanity and began to find intimacy with others easier.⁷⁰ However, the directors conveyed a more optimistic opinion of the directees' recovery of relationships and trust with those whom they were in conflict,⁷¹ than some of the directees themselves, who still found it difficult to trust others. In particular, some directees expressed their difficulty with returning to a former trusting relationship after conflict, because broken trust could not be easily recovered. Because of this difficulty, they preferred to use the terms 'understanding', 'acceptance', and 'compassion' rather than 'recovering trust'. This issue was more pronounced for the Scottish directees, possibly because they were older than the Korean directees, so have had more experience of a range of human relationships; it may also be related to cultural differences relating to the extent to which individuals felt able to discuss their feelings openly. In Korea, particularly in Christian culture, there is a reticence about discussing negative feelings too freely, because such reticence is seen as a sign of modesty and maturity. It appears that Korean Christians perhaps need to cultivate their skills of self-expression rather than repressing their feelings; as such repression could become an obstacle preventing them from experiencing real freedom in their relationships with others or even with God.

⁶⁹ Bora, pp.4-5, Kyle, p.10

⁷⁰ Hamin, p.6, Yoojin, p.8

⁷¹ Kate, pp.13-14, Nancy, p.15, Hamin, pp.5-6

This focus on compassion in the Third Week seems to affect the directees' attempts to find their vocation. Two Scottish directees have taken their careers in a new direction, where they can work for people affected by poverty and ill health.⁷² This will be examined in more detail in the discussion on the Fourth Week, but I will provide one example here of a directee who discovered his vocation through the prayer of Jesus at Gethsemane and has since dedicated himself to a new direction:

[During the prayer of Jesus in the Garden of Gethsemane] I was feeling a real pull to be with him and to be with others in their moments of agony. And I think that has a great deal to do with my new direction to work as a Chaplain in the hospital to be with people at times of great pain... When I pray with the story of Annunciation to Mary, it was not a typical Mary that came up for me, it was an actual unmarried mother that I had visited in hospital who had a drug problem.⁷³

Thus, the Third Week helps directees to consider seriously their vocation as a specific means of becoming Jesus' disciple. Through the experience of healing and by gaining a sense of compassion contemplating Jesus' suffering, directees can become more able to participate in interpersonal reconciliation and choose to become a reconciler within society.

8.2.5. The Fourth Week

The Fourth Week focuses on the joy of the Resurrection, which overcomes the sadness of the Cross. The grace of this Week for directees is establishing the new direction their lives will take and recognising God's love in all things by participating in the joy and glory of the Resurrection. Furthermore, this Week encourages directees to realise the power of the Holy Spirit in their lives and enables the outflow of their love to others. In this sense, the Fourth Week, signifying the completion of the Exercises, empowers directees to live as a reconciling agent and inspires them to practice continually the power of God's love by spreading it to others.

8.2.5.1. Establishing new life direction through Resurrection

The reinterpretation of one's life story developed throughout the previous Weeks is fulfilled in the Fourth Week. As a framework, the Resurrection is as significant as the Cross, because it offers the experience of renewed life as a collaborator of Christ for

⁷² Jamie, pp.12-13, Kyle, p.10

⁷³ Kyle, p.10

God's Kingdom. The feelings of all directees were summed up by one Scottish directee who said that the gift of this Week was the sense of liberation and elation that he gained.⁷⁴ One Korean directee also described the Resurrection as liberation, for, to her, the Resurrection seems to promise that 'God's thoughts about us are hope, joy, and happiness'.⁷⁵ Directees therefore were able to gain courage, strength, and a readiness to work for Christ.

8.2.5.2. Hospitality as the out-flowing of compassion and the building of peaceful relationships

My fieldwork findings have shown that spiritual direction can be a place to augment a spirituality of reconciliation for society and can encourage directees to work for reconciliation in their local and global community. The perception and actualization of the spirituality of reconciliation means the practice of hospitality – the out-flowing of directees' compassion – towards others in their lives. This compassionate hospitality can be achieved in the Fourth Week because the contemplation of the Resurrection brings about joy for both one's new life and one's happiness for others, through the encouragement to find God's love in all things. The sense of hospitality gained during this Week was well demonstrated by one Scottish directee, who said that it had helped her to see how important it was to give love to and receive love from people, and that the way in which we treat strangers is an important indication as to what kind of society we live in; she emphasised that welcoming and including the stranger was therefore crucial.⁷⁶ Another directee's encounter with the risen Christ clearly showed how the prayer of the Fourth Week can augment directees' spirituality of reconciliation for their relationships and society. While struggling with broken trust in a close friendship, and during the prayer of Jesus in the upper room with the disciples, she felt that she clearly heard Jesus saying 'peace be with you' (John 20:19-23). She realized then that a peaceful relationship with other people was Jesus' hope for her and all humanity.⁷⁷ This realization was, for her, a powerful and important experience; it also coincides with an aim of reconciliation; that is, to build a peaceful community.

⁷⁴ Martin, p.22

⁷⁵ Heidi, p.10

⁷⁶ Jenny, p.18

⁷⁷ Flora, p.7

The Fourth Week therefore becomes a useful space where directees can experience personal reconciliation, because it enables them to learn about Jesus' hospitality and his expectations for a peaceful human community. By learning about Jesus' relationality with humanity and his expectations for them, directees can enhance their own capacity for hospitality and peace-making. One Korean directee described this by saying that Jesus did not create any boundaries amongst people;⁷⁸ Scottish directees also voiced their belief that 'Jesus wants people to live in peace'⁷⁹ and that 'Jesus wants to heal with compassion'.⁸⁰ These experiences led most directees to have an expectation that others would be changed by God's grace, as they themselves were changed. Thus, the Fourth Week is a powerful place to begin to achieve personal reconciliation.

8.2.5.3. Choosing the life of a reconciler

The connotations of being a reconciler are different to those of Christian discipleship, which involves living according to Christian ethics. Although both roles involve serving society with God's love, reconcilers specifically commit themselves to the challenge of working with and for the broken, suffering, and hurt in society. On a wider level, they can dedicate themselves to conflict resolution and peace-making between larger groups nationally or internationally. This is a more active and intentional way to practice Christian discipleship in that reconcilers dedicate themselves to the pursuit of justice, forgiveness, repentance, peace and truth; reconciling work is thus perceived as a process in the journey towards reconciliation. This is a path towards the cultivation of a life-giving environment within ruptured and strife-ridden situations, bringing about healing, liberation and renewed or new relationships.

In this context, participants showed that the Fourth Week can be a place for directees to broaden their thinking and consider in what way they will live as a reconciler; for, as discussed above, the practice of compassionate hospitality as a way to follow Christ enables directees to see those who are marginalized and suffering in society and allows them to have an eagerness to heal what has been broken in Creation. In discussions regarding the discovery of their vocation as a reconciling being, the Scottish directors

⁷⁸ Sue, p.5

⁷⁹ Flora, p.7

⁸⁰ Clara, p.8, Kyle, p.10

identified a reconciling agent as someone who serves society with God's love, while also having a global responsibility for humanity.⁸¹ According to one director, a reconciler practices Gospel values such as justice, peace, and harmony,⁸² and, as a result, serves both local and global communities with those values and with God's will founded in their lives. In this process, discernment functions as a significant instrument, in that it enables directees to choose the direction their life should take.

Likewise, two participants defined the role of reconciler as a mediator; one Korean director described the reconciler as a person who connects people to God and serves others' welfare, while one of the Scottish directees stated that deep faith is needed to become an effective mediator.⁸³ Through her early life in Northern Ireland, she learned that those grounded in their faith play a pivotal role in making reconciliation in violent conflicts.⁸⁴ Another Scottish directee described the life of a reconciler in terms of providing hospitality in the wider community; for example, showing hospitality to the stranger and helping others be healed from their inner and outer hurt.⁸⁵ In this respect, participants revealed that acting as a reconciler was empowered by Jesus' example of living for others.

In relation to the decision to become a reconciler, several directees gave practical examples from their own experiences of spiritual direction. One Scottish directee experienced his calling and decided to work for an anti-poverty organization. He suggested that, following his own experiences of spiritual direction and the Exercises, these experiences of spiritual direction could also be helpful tools for those in situations of poverty: 'poverty is stressful, but praying and meditating on a passage from the Gospel helps and strengthens them [those in poverty] in their ability to cope with struggle. In their daily struggle, God is their friend who struggles with them'.⁸⁶

Moreover, two Korean directees decided the direction of their lives according to their vocation. One found that her vocation was to dedicate herself to environmental issues and clarified the importance of discernment in deciding her way:

⁸¹ Shona, p.12, Kate, pp.14-15

⁸² Nancy, pp.18-19

⁸³ Yoojin, p.9, Flora, pp.12-13

⁸⁴ Flora, pp.8-9

⁸⁵ Kyle, p.16

⁸⁶ Jamie, p.12

I have a passion for saving the Earth, farming, and living in a community. So, I worked as a volunteer in an organization that dealt with environmental issues and finished some programs for educating those in agricultural work. And I also taught disadvantaged children English. But, I think that participating in certain activities is of secondary importance. The true issue is how to be closer to God through those works. So, I realized the importance of discernment.⁸⁷

Another Korean directee believed that his vocation was to help people to be blessed with an abundant relationship with God. Thus, he decided to dedicate his life to the ministry of spiritual direction because he believed an individual can affect their family, workplace, and society. He explained how he found his vocation:

I am sure that family is a foundation to maintain society, but nowadays there are a lot of cases of families being broken and such a situation becomes an object of public concern. Moreover, as I see that the foundation of societal problems is based on personal problems, the restoration of personal relationships through spiritual direction is connected with a resolution of societal problems.⁸⁸

As seen above, the Fourth Week can help people enhance their awareness of their lives as followers of Christ by being a reconciler, because Jesus was a mediator between God and people and a healer of people. In addition, he gave humanity the mission to make peace. Through the essential tools of prayer and discernment, directees can decide how to serve their community using Jesus' compassion and hospitality as models for their lives. In other words, humanity's reconciliation to achieve peace with God is bestowed by God's hospitality; therefore, directees are willing to expand their hospitality to the wider community in order to achieve peace.

To conclude, Ignatian spiritual direction can be a site for directees to move towards achieving personal reconciliation, which brings about the reshaping of relationships with God, self and others. This leads to feelings of freedom, healing, and a developed spirituality of reconciliation. Each Week of the Exercises can serve a specific purpose, but it is by completing the whole process that directees can gain and strengthen their experience of personal reconciliation. Through this experience, they can become a collaborator with God, carrying out the reconciling work that transforms the brokenness which exists in the world into a new creation.

⁸⁷ Bora, pp.8-9

⁸⁸ Kihoon, p.9

8.3. Implications of Ignatian spiritual direction for Presbyterian Christians

8.3.1. *The positive implications of Ignatian spiritual direction*

In this study, contemporary Christians have shown a hunger for a deep relationship with God and, through this, the resolution of personal matters and a desire to live as true disciples of Christ. There was a strong eagerness to experience union with God and to become Christ-like. Thus, I suggest that the Church needs to offer effective spiritual practices to help satisfy this spiritual yearning and to support the lives of Christians. This is a common need for both the Korean and Scottish Presbyterian Church. Of course, there are already a variety of resources for spiritual practice available to members of both Churches, for example worship, sermons, Bible study, Eucharist, small group meetings, pastoral counselling, and healing ministry. Individually, these resources provide the development of the separate components of spirituality, but they do not provide a space integrating the affective and intellectual aspects of spirituality. Therefore, contemporary Christians have a longing for a much more powerful and congruent personal spiritual touch and experience, so that they can discover how to live as Christians.

In relation to the need for that integrating space, Calvin proposed that we should unite with God so that we become filled with His holiness and are then able to hear His call.⁸⁹ I therefore argue that this can be provided by spiritual direction because it is a space where Christians can be strongly connected to God and therefore enabled to find the vocation that God has for them. Particularly when searching for one's vocation, Ignatian spiritual direction provides the strength for the individual to discover God's will in their lives and enables them to choose their way of life. This happens through the process of discernment. So, although Ignatian spiritual direction is a form of spiritual practice from the Roman Catholic tradition, it is based on Scripture, and can both enrich the affective aspect of spirituality through imaginative prayer and offer a clear way of discernment. Moreover, the history of spiritual direction, as seen in chapter three, can be traced back to the desert fathers of early Christianity, and, as described in chapter four, many of the features of the Ignatian way stemmed from that tradition. Therefore, I also argue that Ignatian spiritual direction can have positive implications for Reformed Christians.

⁸⁹ *Institutes*, 3.6.2.

Expressing their desire to experience a deeper encounter with God in the Bible, two Scottish directors explained that, because the Presbyterian Church attributes special importance to the ‘acquisition of knowledge’ of God’s word, it lacks affective experience; for example, within traditional Bible study.⁹⁰ As one director stated:

The Church of Scotland is very “heady”, its Bible study is about understanding, it’s not about experiencing, so people struggle with that. The Ignatian way is hugely Scripture based and it’s about the life of Jesus and the difference that makes to people’s lives, so it’s very Protestant’.⁹¹

It is therefore evident that Presbyterians can benefit through Ignatian prayer because imaginative prayer enables directees’ prayer to become more alive and heart-felt through leading directees to personally participate within and interact with the Bible stories through their imagination. Therefore, Ignatian spiritual direction can help Presbyterians have a spirituality in which reason and emotion are more balanced; while they are familiar with the Bible stories, Ignatian prayer helps them have a more personal experience of these stories.

In connection with this positive implication of the Ignatian way for the Presbyterian Church, one Korean director explains thus:

Ignatius systemized the gospel contemplation that already existed in Church history. There are numerous similarities between the Ignatian way and Protestant Spirituality; Protestant spirituality coincides with ‘apostolic spirituality’ and both pray with Scripture. With regard to the workings of the Spirit, we can understand it in terms of life giving or life destroying.⁹²

Thus, Ignatian prayer allows Presbyterians’ knowledge of the Scripture to be transformed into ‘realization’, in that it draws directees to choose the form their life will take and commit themselves to action. This is possible because imaginative prayer enlivens their experience of God and their encounter with Jesus; therefore, they can achieve a deeper faith and a more balanced spirituality.

In addition, the Ignatian way offers the principle of discernment as a tool to help one’s discretion and facilitates a deep encounter with Jesus through imaginative prayer. The directees in the case studies expressed how important discernment was for finding their

⁹⁰ Kate, pp.19-20, Nancy, p.20

⁹¹ Nancy, pp.19-20

⁹² Hamin, pp.8-9

vocation and their decision making. Discernment in the Ignatian way helped people perceive their desires and feelings in a more refined way and make decisions concerning their lives from the perspective of God.

Furthermore, I would suggest that Ignatian spiritual direction helps directees gain a sense of freedom and security through the transformation of their image of God, because it focuses on original grace rather than original sin; as one Scottish directee stated, ‘We have a church that has focused on original sin rather than original blessing and so you kind of grow up, knowing you are a sinner, which is an actually a very fearing place to be’.⁹³ Before participating in spiritual direction, this directee included a lot of ‘shoulds’ in her reflection of Jesus,⁹⁴ so felt burdened to make society better⁹⁵ and had fears about not being ‘perfect’.⁹⁶ She explained that, because the Ignatian way was much more focused on original grace, it enabled her to have a greater feeling of liberation and security and to encounter Jesus as a healer and a liberating force.⁹⁷

The way in which these experiences of freedom were prompted by Ignatian spiritual direction was evident throughout the case studies. The directors reported that, although spiritual direction is not a sacrament of reconciliation, directees bring to spiritual direction issues pertaining to their sin and guilt. One Korean director’s description demonstrates how deeply Protestants desire the resolution of their guilt: ‘They are distressed about three concerns: “Why I am not confident for forgiveness”, “Why I repeatedly commit the same sins”, and their sense of guilt’.⁹⁸ As to these concerns, one Scottish director described the efficacy of Ignatian spiritual direction for resolving these issues as follows:

It’s not like a confessional...the First Week is looking at oneself and areas of one’s life that you might feel some guilt about or that you might want to change, so inevitably that comes up. The First Week of Spiritual Exercises is all about God’s love and forgiveness.⁹⁹

Thus, directees can see the roots, sources, and disposition of sin in their lives through the prayer of the First Week and this knowledge is grounded in the merciful and

⁹³ Clara, p.7

⁹⁴ Clara, p.8

⁹⁵ Clara, p.7

⁹⁶ Clara, p.17

⁹⁷ Clara, pp.8-9

⁹⁸ Junsu, p.7

⁹⁹ Shona, p.6

unconditional love of God.¹⁰⁰ Directees corroborated these observations, stating that they dealt with issues relating to their sins in conversation with their directors, and they experienced forgiveness, acceptance, and love from God. Such an experience enabled them to accept themselves as ‘graced sinners’; this represents a conversion experience and a reconnection with God. It is also related to their sense of healing and freedom; as a Korean director suggested, ‘In spiritual direction, admission of sins happens a lot. Directees’ admission of sin is a dimension of their healing; directees experienced touching, embracing, and healing with God’s hands. With admission of their sins, directees feel free from guilt’.¹⁰¹ This feeling of freedom can help directees respond to God’s love by following Jesus’ life in accordance with their vocation.

In conclusion, Ignatian spiritual direction can be a space for directees to experience personal reconciliation in that it confirms the transformation of their image of God through prayer based on Scripture. Through this, directees’ freedom and Christian identity can be intensified. This also supports the balanced spirituality of the Reformed Christians by revitalizing the affective aspect of spirituality through imaginative prayer and discernment. Therefore, spiritual direction is a gift to enhance their Christian spirituality and lives. For this reason, I argue that spiritual direction can be employed within spiritual care as it can offer an additional place for those seeking personal reconciliation within the Presbyterian Church.

8.3.2. The possible limitations of Ignatian spiritual direction

Although I have argued that there are many benefits of spiritual direction and the Ignatian way, I recognise that there are also a number of limitations to this form of spiritual guidance. Perhaps the first issue is the language of spiritual direction, which can often be problematic to contemporary Christians in that the terms involved, such as ‘direction’, ‘directee’ and ‘director’, carry certain authoritarian connotations. While other terms, such as ‘spiritual accompaniment’ and ‘spiritual counselling’, have been suggested, the traditional terms nevertheless still hold sway. As discussed in chapter three, Protestants who participate in spiritual direction understand the nature of those terms and use them because they understand that the ‘real’ director in spiritual direction is, in fact, the Holy

¹⁰⁰ Yoojin, p.4

¹⁰¹ Hamin, p.3

Spirit. The role of the director is to listen to directees' stories, interpret them, and provide support for discernment. The Scottish directees described the nature of spiritual direction as non-directive, so they are aware that the role of the director is not an authoritarian one, but is more of a facilitator.

Another issue related to language is that the vocabulary of the Ignatian way is imbued with Catholic symbolism, such as the Colloquy to Mary and the saints. As described in chapters six and seven, although Scottish and Korean Presbyterian directors have modified those terms into God the Trinity, the original Catholic vocabulary and symbolism could still be a barrier to those coming from other denominations.

Another important issue is that the Ignatian Exercises are very structured and have a clear pre-existing framework. This could present a problem to some directees who feel that it is too prescribed, as they are seeking a more flexible, individualised approach. While this may be truer of the 30-day retreat, in more recent adaptations, such as individually guided retreats or monthly spiritual direction, there has been a move towards tailoring the structure of spiritual direction to meet the individual needs of directees, thereby creating a more personalised approach. However, directees who desire a deeper experience become involved with the Exercises, as this provides the most rigorous and comprehensive experience of spiritual direction, due, perhaps in part, to its fixed structure. However, because the major form of spiritual direction in both Scotland and Korea is the Ignatian way, in order to encourage a greater participation, more alternatives do need to be provided, allowing for a greater range of choice and greater freedom for those wishing to undergo spiritual growth. Thus, traditional Ignatian spiritual direction can exist alongside its more recently adapted and flexible forms.

Finally, there is an issue regarding who leads spiritual direction. In Western countries, predominantly the US and UK, there is a trend for lay directors rather than ordained pastors to take the lead in the provision of spiritual direction. Lay directors do experience training within this field to work with individual directees; however, if they have only limited theological knowledge, this could raise problems for those directees who have already undergone some form of theological education, such as ministers and pastors, and who have very specialised or complex theological questions that a lay director without in depth knowledge might not be able to address. Spiritual direction is not a place for theological debate, nor a simple spiritual conversation, nor a place purely for counselling

or advice. It is instead a place for the exploration of directees' congruent faith and life experiences. Therefore, along with a vocation, spiritual directors are required to have adequate theological and psychological knowledge and experience in relation to spiritual direction, in order to provide as integrative a service as possible. That will help spiritual direction to become a more qualified ministry.

To conclude, I have suggested there are some limitations in spiritual direction and the Ignatian way that could hinder Presbyterian Christians from experiencing a deeper and more comprehensive spiritual practice. Thus, spiritual direction needs to be adapted carefully to become a more proficient ministry.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have reflected on the notion of personal reconciliation, the efficacy of spiritual direction and the Ignatian way for achieving personal reconciliation, and the implications of Ignatian spiritual direction for Presbyterian Christians. Personal reconciliation can be identified with the restoration of the image of God, in particular the relational image of God, and, once this new identity is established, Christians can become agents of God's reconciling work. In this way, personal reconciliation can be understood to have a theological sense, as it includes the restoration of a relationship with God, leading to a sense of 'oneness' with God. This spiritual sense involves intimacy with and trust in God, freedom and security within life, which then leads to a feeling of groundedness in God. This in turn strengthens one's Christian identity and nurtures one's compassion towards others. This awareness can subsequently enhance one's psychological and physical ease and one's peaceful relationships with others; therefore, personal reconciliation can also be said to have a holistic viewpoint of humanity. Moreover, personal reconciliation involves becoming aware of two aspects within each person – that is, victim and wrongdoer – as well as the intrapersonal and interpersonal dimensions. This relationship suggests that a person needs to experience healing both at an individual and social level, which is then related to the wider sense of reconciliation and the vocation discovered through the spiritual direction process that can lead an individual to work as a reconciling agent within the community.

Ignatian spiritual direction can contribute to achieving personal reconciliation in that it can facilitate directees' renewed or deepened relationship with God, which is then

developed within relationships with others as the result of the changes in their image of God, themselves, and others. This is achieved as the result of the exercises during the Four Weeks: the encounter with a loving God in the First Week, finding Jesus' life in this world in the Second Week, experiencing Jesus' self-giving love for all humanity in the Third Week, and the experience of a renewed life and the power of the Holy Spirit through the Resurrection in the Fourth Week. However, although the awareness of directees definitely changes, the actualization of their awareness is not always immediate; for example, the expression of forgiveness and repentance can sometimes be lacking, as can a commitment to their vocation. Thus, there can at times be a gap between perception and actualization. It seems that an understanding and practice of reconciliation beyond the Christian ethic of forgiveness is needed in order to learn how to make a better future.

Despite its limitations, Ignatian spiritual direction can have many positive implications for Presbyterian Christians, functioning as a means to improve their freedom, experience a more intimate relationship with God, and achieve personal reconciliation. It also enables them to develop a new awareness of Jesus through imaginative prayer and the contemplation of Jesus' whole life, and to find their vocation through discernment. Therefore, Ignatian spiritual direction can help Presbyterian Christians have a more balanced experience of their faith, combining both intellectual and emotional aspects, as well as personal spirituality and social participation.

This chapter also drew attention to some of the differences between Korean and Scottish experiences of personal reconciliation, demonstrating that the Scottish participants focused more on psychological and social dimensions, while the Koreans concentrated on individual and theological dimensions. Scottish participants felt that the Scottish Church concentrated on providing support at a social, congregational level, which they felt led to a lack in the provision of a more person-centred care. This was demonstrated by their hunger for individual spiritual growth. Korean participants, on the other hand, felt that the Church provided the notion of personal salvation but needed to augment greater freedom and a wider sense of social responsibility

CHAPTER NINE

CONCLUSIONS

This thesis has demonstrated that, in both Scotland and South Korea, Ignatian spiritual direction can be a space where directees can develop personal reconciliation and, further, that it encourages them to serve in a reconciliation ministry. Ignatian spiritual direction is a practice that can enable directees to experience personal reconciliation and develop the capability to become a reconciler; it can also encourage a sense of social responsibility. In addition, it augments the directees' spirituality of reconciliation through helping them to find their specific vocation to serve this ruptured and broken world as a disciple of Christ. The spirituality of reconciliation refers to living as a reconciler, participating in the reconciliation ministry to heal the suffering and hurt in society, to resolve conflict and rebuild broken societies.

This thesis has therefore formulated a precise meaning of personal reconciliation, containing intra- and interpersonal aspects, which can be defined as the healing and transformation of one's relationship with God, self and others. This means that personal reconciliation is the restoration of the relational and communal image of God, and so incorporates one's transformed image of God, strengthened Christian identity, and compassion towards others. Personal reconciliation exists, therefore, in a holistic way, integrating the spiritual, psychological, physical and relational aspects within a person. Moreover, because personal reconciliation does not exist separately from social reconciliation, the experience of personal reconciliation enables a person to become aware of social reconciliation and thus move beyond the territory of the individual into the wider sphere. By focusing on these wider responsibilities, a person can make the decision to commit to the service of healing and transforming the brokenness in the world.

In this context, I have argued that Ignatian spiritual direction can be employed as part of the ministry of the Reformed Church, in that it can promote believers' sanctification and offer them more opportunities to develop their spirituality because the Ignatian way is helpful for nurturing directees' balanced spirituality: affective and intellectual. This is particularly useful for Reformed believers because they already have a strong intellectual knowledge of the Gospel and can therefore use the Ignatian way as a means to personalize the Bible story by providing a more affective approach to spirituality.

9.1. Recommendations for Church ministry and further study

People in contemporary society encounter many different forms of conflict, violence, and tension. This leads them to feel fearful about their safety and arouses in them the desire for a more peaceful environment and for greater security. These desires raise the need for the resolution of conflict and reconciliation; however the Reformed Church, particularly in South Korea, does not yet offer an effective reconciliation ministry corresponding to individual and social needs. This leads me to think that increasing individuals' awareness of the necessity and responsibility of reconciliation is important in order to create and sustain a more peaceful environment and develop social reconciliation. I therefore feel that there is a need for Church ministry to offer a practice enabling Christians to learn reconciliation at a personal level and to augment their interest in reconciliation ministry. This thesis has therefore proposed spiritual direction as such a space for developing personal reconciliation and the spirituality of reconciliation.

Spiritual direction, although not yet popular in the Reformed Church, can help directees interpret their own history within the grand story of God's redemption by facilitating their changed image of God and their deepened relationship with Him. It also offers them a new window through which to reinterpret their lives. Ignatian spiritual direction, in particular, helps directees experience the life of Jesus Christ in a more vivid, concrete way through the imaginative prayer focusing on the Gospel stories. This enables directees to see Jesus' life as a mirror for their own faith and life and therefore helps them to experience a strengthened sense of their own Christian identity. Through this, they can begin to experience the healing of painful memories and past hurts, while gaining compassion for others, having gained a more truthful awareness of themselves and others. Consequently, by developing personal reconciliation through spiritual direction, they can experience the dynamics of reconciliation – forgiveness, repentance, truth, justice, mercy, peace – and therefore gain a greater awareness of the need for and practical ways to participate in social reconciliation. For this reason, this thesis has proposed that Ignatian spiritual direction offers Christians the possibility to experience personal reconciliation, and can be a practice facilitating reconciliation ministry for Reformed Christians.

Through the interviews, it was found that all the interview participants described their desire for freedom and their feelings that the Presbyterian Church focuses more on human original sin than God's original grace. Their image of God was a God who was distant

from them and demanded that they follow Jesus' way. Their experience of spiritual direction brought about the transformation of this image, to a God who is personal, intimate and caring. This changed image enabled them to find their vocation willingly rather than as a duty. Therefore, the process of discernment helped them to decide their way of life with freedom, which was a foundation allowing them to choose the shape of their lives. Yet the Korean directees, in particular, expressed the idea that there were still a little fearful of choosing to live their lives according to their vocation, although their awareness was certainly changed. This can perhaps be explained by the ministerial atmosphere of the Korean Church which is conservative, having a hierarchical system, and is thus slightly repressive. Young pastors and lay people in Korea, therefore, find it difficult to create or participate in the ministry they would like; instead young pastors find it easier to become a member of an existing Church system and lay people passively serve the ministry as a subordinate. Moreover, to commit themselves to a prophetic ministry for the disadvantaged means they will have more difficulty than those in the established churches. Thus, the ministry of the Korean Church needs to offer more options and flexibility for young ministers and lay people in order for the Church to serve contemporary society more effectively. For this reason, I am arguing that the Korean Church needs to consider the options it provides for developing Christians' freedom in order to create a more expanded and committed ministry for reconciliation. In this way, Ignatian spiritual direction functions to enhance Christians' freedom and their willingness to choose the life of a reconciler.

In the interviews, directees described how deeply they wanted to experience inner healing and a more peaceful relationship with others. This desire was caused by their experience of suffering and conflict in their lives and is related to the experience of injustice, therefore raising the issues of forgiveness, repentance, truth, mercy, and peace, which are the dynamics of reconciliation. This highlights how contemporary Christians, represented by those participating in this case-centred study, have issues related to the need for reconciliation. A place is required where they can deal with these issues more deeply and so, this thesis proposes that spiritual direction can provide that space. It further proposes that spiritual direction needs to be implemented within the Reformed Church, especially the Korean Church, in order to allow Church members to develop their experience of the dynamics of reconciliation. Moreover, as discussed in chapter eight,

interpersonal reconciliation is developed further when people express forgiveness and repentance.

This study demonstrated that, despite geographical and cultural variations among the interview participants, there were a number of similarities in terms of their understanding of personal reconciliation, their possible formation of the spirituality of reconciliation as the fruit of personal reconciliation, and their actualization of that spirituality. This suggests that spiritual direction for personal reconciliation can be possible in Asia as well as the West; it also gives an insight into the commonality of human experience. However, the differences between the two cohorts revealed through the interview findings highlight the implications for each Church. In Korea, the study of reconciliation is relatively new in comparison to Scotland, so Korean participants focused on individual spiritual growth, rather than the integration of personal and social reconciliation. For this reason, I suggest that reconciliation should be more actively discussed in South Korea because there are a variety of issues here related to reconciliation, such as the conflict between South and North Korea, and the conflict between regions and generations. Thus, there is a need to create a more open and free environment within the Church in order to revitalize the ministry there. In contrast to Korea, Presbyterians in Scotland had a greater desire for individual care, because they felt that the Church had more interest in the transformation of members as a whole and providing a service for society. Thus, they expressed a need for a ministry that specifically provided personal and spiritual care within the Church.

In the interview findings, I presented the argument that personal reconciliation exists in a holistic way, incorporating spiritual, psychological, physical and relational aspects which cannot be separated. However, some directees had never considered the correlation between Christians' healthy spirituality and physical ease. Therefore, there is a need for the wellbeing of Christians, as holistic entities, to be encouraged by the Church. As a consequence of this, there is a need amongst directees to learn how to express their forgiveness and repentance – important components of the development of personal reconciliation – because their expression is an effective way to embody interpersonal reconciliation. Thus, Christians need to be more proactive in this.

An issue which is beyond the scope of my thesis, but is important in terms of women's experience and role in reconciliation ministry, is the role of Mary. Some interview participants raised the issue of the discovery of Mary through Ignatian spiritual direction.

Two Scottish female directee participants presented their experiences of Mary as a model of motherly care and yielding to God's will.¹⁰² They suggested that the life of Mary as a woman was attractive to them as an example for women's lives, although her role was not a focus of the Protestant tradition. Therefore, further research is needed to discover what women, in particular, can do for reconciliation, within both the family and wider community. And perhaps whether there is a role for some modified use of Mary, The Mother of Jesus, in the exercises which are shaped for Reformed Christians.

Finally, as discussed in this study, the Reformed Church has some resistance to the Ignatian way, so Presbyterian directors use a modified form of this. Therefore, I suggest that more options for spiritual direction alongside the Ignatian way need to be offered, and, furthermore, a form of spiritual direction based on Reformed theology needs to be created, in order to encourage more Church members to experience personal reconciliation, thereby nurturing a more faithful Christian life. For example, a form of spiritual direction grounded in Calvin's *Institutes* and the Bible verses related to the issues of personal reconciliation, including both Old Testament and New Testament, could be created. Moreover, to be a more effective spiritual practice for reconciliation ministry, Ignatian spiritual direction could encourage directees to use such Bible verses. Furthermore, group spiritual direction could be considered as a way to develop interpersonal reconciliation within specific groups in conflict, rather than just individuals, if they have Christian faith.

¹⁰² Jenny, p.5, Clara, p.10

APPENDIX 1

Interview about the experience of Spiritual Direction

Hello.

I am Kyung Eun Kim and I am studying Practical Theology in the Doctoral programme at the School of Divinity at the University of Edinburgh. **** has suggested that you might be willing to be interviewed about your experience of giving/receiving spiritual direction, so I am writing to explain a little more about what is entailed. First, I'll give some information about me and the project.

I am an ordained Presbyterian pastor from South Korea. I hold qualifications in theology and pastoral counseling from Yonsei University and a Master of Divinity from the Presbyterian College & Theological Seminary in South Korea. I have also studied Spirituality and Spiritual Direction at Fordham University in the U.S (M.A.) and I am a member of Spiritual Directors International in the U.S. Currently, I am writing a dissertation for my Ph.D entitled "Spiritual Direction as a Practice of Reconciliation Ministry: A Personal Reconciliation Perspective."

My research is focusing on how Ignatian Spiritual Direction functions for spiritual growth, psychological growth, and physical health. I am also looking at how Christians who have experienced or are experiencing Ignatian Spiritual Direction contribute to their community and society in terms of reconciliation.

I am interviewing spiritual directors and directees in both South Korea and Scotland in order to investigate what changes have occurred in the lives of people who have undergone or are undergoing Ignatian Spiritual Direction, and what effects these changes have caused to their psychological growth, physical health, and communal life. My dissertation, based on these interviews will highlight the role of Spiritual Direction for reconciliation ministry in the Church.

The interview will last not more than one and half hours. I would like to record it, provided that you feel happy about that. The anonymity of all participants in the research will be maintained throughout the process, with only me and my supervisor, Dr Cecelia Clegg, having access to raw data. I will keep the data for ten years and it may be used in books or articles following the study. If I quote you directly in my thesis I will let you see that quote before it is included in the final draft. You can, of course, if you wish receive either a summary of the research outcomes or the full thesis text when it is completed.

Thank you for being willing to consider participation. If you need further information please do not hesitate to contact me.

Many thanks.

Kyung Eun Kim

E-mail

Phone number

영성지도 경험에 대한 Interview

안녕하세요?

저는 영국 에딘버러 대학 신학대학의 박사과정에서 실천신학을 공부하고 있는 김경은 목사입니다. 유해룡 교수님의 추천으로 귀하의 영성지도의 경험 (영성지도자 / 피지도자)을 인터뷰할 수 있는지 부탁을 드리기 위해 편지를 드립니다. 먼저, 저에 대하여 그리고 제가 진행하고 있는 박사논문의 내용에 대해 간단히 말씀드리겠습니다.

저는 연세대학교 신학과와 연세대학교 연합신학대학원(목회상담학, Th.M), 장로회신학대학원(M.Div) 을 졸업한 장로교 목사로서 미국 Fordham 대학교에서 '영성과 영성지도' 전공으로 MA 를 취득했으며, Spiritual Directors International 의 회원입니다. 현재는 '화해목회의 한 tool 으로서의 영성지도: 개인 화해적 관점에서'라는 주제로 박사논문을 쓰고 있습니다. 이 논문은 이나시오 영성지도가 영성지도를 받고있는 사람들의 영적 성장. 심리적 성장. 신체적 건강을 위해 실제로 어떻게 작용하고 있는가와, 이런 성장을 이룬 사람들이 공동체와 사회의 화해를 위해 어떻게 기여하는가를 연구하는 것입니다.

저는 영성지도를 경험한 사람들이 영적 삶에서 어떤 변화를 경험했고, 이 변화가 개인의 심리적. 신체적 건강과 공동체에서의 삶에서 어떤 영향을 미쳤는가를 조사하기 위해 몇 분의 영적 지도자들과 영성지도를 경험한 분들을 한국과 영국의 스코틀랜드에서 인터뷰하려고 합니다. 이 인터뷰를 토대로 작성된 논문은 교회의 화해사역을 위한 영성지도의 역할을 부각시킬 것입니다. 이 인터뷰는 1 시간 30 분 이상을 초과하지 않을 것이며, 인터뷰에 참여하시는 분의 허락아래 녹음될 것입니다. 이 인터뷰는 익명으로 사용 될 것이며, 그 인터뷰 자료는 저와 저의 지도교수인 Dr. Cecelia Clegg 만이 볼 수 있을 것입니다. 이 자료는 5 년간 보관될 것이고 논문의 후속 연구를 위해 사용될 수 있습니다. 만약 인터뷰 내용이 직접적으로 인용된다면 논문에 포함되기 전에 귀하께 그 내용을 보여드릴 것입니다. 또한 만약 귀하께서 원하신다면 이 논문이 완성되면 이 연구의 요약 혹은 논문 전체를 받아보실 수 있습니다. 귀하께서 이 인터뷰에 참여해 주실 것을 기대하며, 만약 더 정보가 필요하시다면 언제든지 연락주십시오.

김경은 목사 드림

E-mail Phone number

APPENDIX 2

ETHICS IN RESEARCH

Consent Form for personal data to be used for research

Thank you for agreeing to participate in the Research project, the details of which are below.

Research Project name:	Spiritual Direction as a Practice (or tool) of Reconciliation Ministry: A Personal Reconciliation Perspective
Name of researcher:	Kyung Eun Kim
Researcher's Contact details:	<input type="text"/>
Scope of the project:	Three Ignatian spiritual directors and five directees in South Korea and three Ignatian spiritual directors and five directees in the Central Belt of Scotland. Data will be kept securely for 10 years after which it will be destroyed
Confidentiality and Anonymity <i>(The researcher will indicate how confidentiality and anonymity will be preserved)</i>	The anonymity of all participants in the research will be maintained throughout the process, with only me and my supervisor, Dr. Cecelia Clegg, having access to raw data. Material from the completed project may appear in books or articles but at all times the anonymity of participants will be maintained.

Please complete the following:

I consent to my personal data, as outlined below, being used for the research project detailed above. Description of personal data to be used for research:

-Name

-Contact details (Email or Phone number)

-Gender: Male Female (please circle as appropriate)

-Age range 19-25 26-35 36-45 46-55 56-65 65+ (please circle as appropriate)

-Denomination

I understand that I can refuse to answer any question

I understand that I can stop the interview at any point

I consent to the interview being audio recorded

Signature:	
Date:	

ETHICS IN RESEARCH (Korean version)

Consent Form for personal data to be used for research (개인 정보 사용에 동의서)

Thank you for agreeing to participate in the Research project, the details of which are below.

Research Project name:	Spiritual Direction as a Spiritual Practice for Reconciliation Ministry: A Personal Reconciliation Perspective 화해사역을 위한 한 영적 실천으로서의 영적지도: 개인적 화해의 관점에서
Name of researcher: 연구자의 이름	Kyung Eun Kim 김경은
Researcher's Contact details: (연구자의 연락처)	
Scope of the project: 연구의 범위	Three Ignatian spiritual directors and five directees in South Korea and three Ignatian spiritual directors and five directees in the Central Belt of Scotland. Data will be kept securely for 10 years after which it will be destroyed. 한국과 영국의 스코틀랜드에서 각각 3 명의 영적 지도자와 5 명의 피지도자를 인터뷰할 것입니다. 데이터는 10 년간 보관될 것입니다.
Confidentiality and Anonymity (The researcher will indicate how confidentiality and anonymity will be preserved) 익명성 보장	The anonymity of all participants in the research will be maintained throughout the process, with only me and my supervisor, Dr. Cecelia Clegg, having access to raw data. Material from the completed project may appear in books or articles but at all times the anonymity of participants will be maintained. 이 연구의 모든 참여자는 전 과정을 통해 익명성이 유지될 것이고, 오직 연구자와 연구자의 지도교수님인 Dr. Cecelia Clegg 만이 원자료에 접근할 수 있습니다. 논문에 사용된 자료들은 연구자의 책이나 article 에 사용될 수 있지만 항상 참여자의 익명성은 유지될 것입니다.

Please complete the following: 아래를 완성해 주세요

I consent to my personal data, as outlined below, being used for the research project detailed above. Description of personal data to be used for research:

나는 위의 언급된 연구를 위해 나의 개인 자료가 사용되는데 동의합니다.

연구를 위해 사용될 개인 자료에 대한 인적 사항:

-이름

-연락처 (이메일 혹은 전화번호)

-Gender (성별): Male (남) Female (여) (please circle as appropriate)

-Age range (연령) 19-25 26-35 36-45 46-55 56-65 65+ (please circle as appropriate)

-Denomination (교단)

I understand that I can refuse to answer any question 나는 어떤 질문에 답하기를 거부할 수
있습니다. □

I understand that I can stop the interview at any point 나는 어느 시점에 인터뷰를 중단할 수
있습니다. □

I consent to the interview being audio recorded 나는 인터뷰가 녹음된다는 것에 동의합니다.
□

Signature:	
Date:	

APPENDIX 3

Interview Questionnaire

Interview Questions for Directors

- General Questions
 1. Age range?
19-25 26-35 36-45 46-55 56-65 65+
 2. What is your denomination?
 3. How long have you been a spiritual director?
 4. What percentage of your directees are (1) male and (2) female?

- Questions concerning the understanding of personal reconciliation and spiritual direction
 5. How do you view personal reconciliation?
 6. How does personal reconciliation relate to spiritual direction?
 7. What expectations do directees bring with them into the spiritual direction process, and are they fulfilled? If yes, why? If no, why not?
 8. How do passages of Scripture help people to transform relationships (with God, oneself, community and society)?

- Questions concerning the directee's spiritual growth
 9. How far is confession of sin part of the spiritual direction process?
 10. What type of changes was there in the frequency and nature of directee's prayer?
How do you interpret these changes?
 11. What triggered these changes (Question 10)?
 12. In what way has the directee's image of God been changed during the spiritual direction process?
 13. In what way did the feeling and thought towards God change as directees underwent spiritual direction?
 14. In what way was the self-image of the directee transformed through the spiritual direction process?

- Questions concerning psychological growth

15. In what ways do directees experience healing? How can the experiences of the directees be summarized?

16. What key words would you use to describe the healing experiences?

17. Do you think that the directees can experience more deeply forgiveness and understanding of others through the spiritual direction process?

- Questions about changes in directee's life as a reconciler

18. In what ways do the changes, such as healing, brought about by the spiritual direction process get expressed in relationships in the directee's lives?

19. How far might these changes be described as the directees being reconcilers in family, community and society?

20. What difficulties do you think Presbyterians may have with Ignatian spiritual direction?

21. Do you think that Ignatian spiritual direction can be part of the ministry in Presbyterian Church? If so, do you think any modification would be needed?

Interview Questions for Directees

- General Questions

1. Age range?

19-25 26-35 36-45 46-55 56-65 65+

2. What is your denomination?

3. How long have you been attending spiritual direction?

4. What type of spiritual direction have you attended?

5. Why did you decide to come for spiritual direction?

6. What expectations did you have of the process? How far has it met your expectations?

- Questions concerning the nature of personal reconciliation and spiritual direction

7. What do you understand by personal reconciliation?

8. How does it relate to spiritual direction?

- Questions concerning the directee's spiritual growth

9. In what way did spiritual direction change your perspective on your life?
10. In what way has your image of God been changed in the spiritual direction process?
11. In what way has your trust and love for God been changed?
12. In what way does your trust in God affect your trust in other people?
13. How far do you feel trust in your spiritual director? Does your trust in your spiritual direction affect your trust in God and others?
14. In what way has your awareness of your sins and wrongdoings been changed?
15. By what means did you resolve the issues of guilt that are associated with your new understanding of your own sins or wrongdoings? Was spiritual direction helpful for these issues?
16. How did your reflection on Jesus' way of relating to people affect your understanding of relationships? Were there any incidences from Jesus' life that were instrumental in this?
17. In what ways did you form a new relationship with God?
18. What is your predominant name of God?
19. How did the experience of coming into the close relationship with God and understanding God's love and forgiveness for you affect your relationships (with yourself, others, community, and society) when you came across difficulties in your life?

- Questions concerning psychological growth

20. In what ways do you understand yourself differently since beginning spiritual direction?
21. How would you describe your identity in your relationship with God now?
22. How is it different to your identity before the spiritual direction process?
23. What changes did your new relationship with God bring about in your psychological state? (freedom, peace, stability, safety, love, etc.)
24. In what way did the spiritual and psychological changes through spiritual direction affect your life?

- Questions concerning physical health

25. What effect, if any, did the process of spiritual direction have on your physical health?

- Questions about relationships with others

26. Did the spiritual direction process help you to forgive people who have hurt you?
If so, in what ways?

27. Do you think that spiritual direction is helpful in reconciling with other people?
If so, in what ways? Do you have an actual experience of that?

- Questions about changes in directees as a reconciler

28. What is the most significant change that spiritual direction has made in your life?

29. In what ways have your expectations for your life been changed?

30. How has the experience of reconciliation with God through spiritual direction influenced the role that you give to reconciliation in your daily life and relationships?

인터뷰 질문

지도자를 위한 질문 (Interview questions for directors)

● 일반적 질문들

1. 연령대는 어떻게 되십니까?
19-25 26-35 36-45 46-55 56-65 65+
2. 어느 교단에 소속되어 계십니까?
3. 얼마나 오랫동안 영적지도자로서 활동하셨습니다?
4. 당신의 피지도자들의 몇 퍼센트가 (1)남성 (2)여성 입니까?

● 개인적 화해와 영성지도의 이해에 관한 질문들

5. 당신은 ‘개인적 화해’ 라는 용어에 대해 어떻게 생각하십니까?
6. 개인적 화해가 영성지도와 어떻게 관계된다고 생각하십니까?
7. 피지도자들은 영성지도 과정에 어떤 기대를 가지고 오며, 그 기대가 충족된다고 생각하십니까? 만약 ‘예’ 라면, 이유는 무엇입니까? ‘아니오’ 라면, 이유는 무엇입니까?
8. 성경말씀이 사람들의 관계성(하나님, 자기자신, 공동체, 사회와의 관계성)을 변화 (transform) 시키는데 어떻게 도움이 됩니까?

● 피지도자의 영적성장에 관한 질문들

9. 영성지도 과정에서 피지도자의 죄의 고백이 일어납니까? 그렇다면 어느정도로 일어납니까?
10. 영성지도 과정을 통해 피지도자의 기도의 횟수나 기도의 특질 (nature)에 어떤 변화가 일어납니까? 이런 변화들을 어떻게 해석하십니까?
11. 무엇이 10번의 변화를 일으킨다고 생각하십니까?
12. 영성지도 과정에서 피지도자의 하나님의 image가 어떻게 변화됩니까?
13. 영성지도 과정에서 어떤 점에서 피지도자의 자신에 대한 image의 변화가 일어납니까?
14. 하나님에 대한 감정과 생각의 변화가 피지도자의 영성지도 경험중에 어떻게 일어납니까?

(변화의 내용이 무엇입니까?)

● 심리적 성장에 관한 질문들

15. 어떤 점에서 피지도자들이 healing을 경험한다고 생각하십니까? (피지도자들의 healing경험은 어떤 것입니까?) 혹은 피지도자들의 경험을 무엇이라고 요약할 수 있습니까?
16. 15번의 경험을 묘사하기 위해 사용하는 key word는 무엇입니까?
17. 피지도자가 영성지도 과정을 통해 타인에 대한 용서나 이해를 더 깊게 하게 된다고 느끼십니까? 이 경험은 healing의 경험과 관계됩니까?

● 화해자로서의 피지도자의 삶에서의 변화에 관한 질문들

18. 영성지도 과정에서 일어난 healing등의 변화들이 어떻게 피지도자의 삶에서의 관계성에서 표현됩니까? (healing을 경험한 피지도자들의 삶이 타인과의 관계나 사회에서의 관계에서 어떻게 표현됩니까? 타인에 대한 용서의 경험이 피지도자의 삶에서 나타납니까? 등..)
19. 17번에서 일어난 변화들을 ‘피지도자들이 가족, 교회, 공동체, 사회에서 화해자로서 역할’을 한다고 묘사할 수 있습니까?
20. 장로교에서 영성지도 (특히 이냐시오 영성지도)에 대한 현재의 입장은 무엇입니까?
21. 개교회 안에서 영성지도가 목회상담처럼 목회의 한 사역으로 정착될 수 있다고 보십니까? 영성지도가 (특히 이냐시오 영성지도의 경우) 장로교 목회의 한 사역으로 수용되기 위해서는 어떤 변형이 필요하다고 생각하십니까?

피지도자를 위한 질문 (Interview questions for directees)

● 일반적 질문들

1. 연령대는 어떻게 되십니까?

19-25 26-35 36-45 46-55 56-65 65+

2. 어느 교단에 속하게 됩니까?
3. 얼마나 오랫동안 영성지도 과정에 참여하고 계십니까?
4. 어떤 식으로 영적지도에 참여해 왔습니까?
5. 영성지도 과정에 참여하게 된 이유는 무엇입니까?
6. 영성지도 과정에 가졌던 기대는 무엇입니까? 그 기대가 얼마나 충족되었습니까?

● 개인적 화해와 영성지도의 본질에 관한 질문들

7. ‘개인적 화해’라는 용어를 어떻게 이해하십니까?
8. ‘개인적 화해’와 영성지도가 어떻게 연관된다고 생각하십니까?

● 피지도자의 영적 성장에 관한 질문들

9. 어떤 점에서 영성지도가 삶에 대한 관점을 변화시켰습니까?
10. 어떤 점에서 영성지도가 하나님에 대한 image를 변화시켰습니까?
11. 어떤 점에서 하나님에 대한 사랑과 신뢰가 변화되었습니까?
12. 어떤 점에서 하나님에 대한 신뢰가 타인에 대한 신뢰에 영향을 미쳤습니까?
13. 당신의 영적 지도자를 얼마나 신뢰한다고 느끼십니까? 영적 지도자에 대한 신뢰가 하나님과 타인에 대한 당신의 신뢰에 영향을 주었습니까?
14. 어떤 점에서 당신의 죄나 잘못에 대한 당신의 인식이 바뀌었습니까?
15. 어떤 방법으로 당신의 죄나 잘못과 연관된 죄책감의 문제를 해결했습니까? 영성지도가 이런 문제 해결에 도우며 되었습니까?
16. 예수님이 사람들에게 관계하는 방법에 대한 목상이 어떻게 당신의 관계성 (자기자신, 타인, 공동체, 사회와의 관계성)에 영향을 미쳤습니까? 이것에 유용했던 예수님의 삶에서의 사건들이 있었습니까?
17. 어떤 점에서 하나님과의 새로운 관계를 형성했습니까?
18. 당신에게 있어 하나님의 이름은 무엇입니까?
19. 하나님과의 친밀한 관계로 들어가는 경험과 당신에 대한 하나님의 사랑과 용서에 대한

이해가 어떻게 당신의 삶의 어려움에 처했을 때 당신의 관계성(자기자신, 타인, 공동체, 사회와의 관계성)에 영향을 주었습니까?

● 심리적 성장에 관한 질문들

20. 영성지도를 시작한 이후 어떤 점에서 당신 자신을 다르게 이해합니까?
21. 하나님과 당신의 관계에서 당신의 identity를 어떻게 묘사합니까?
22. 20번의 묘사는 영성지도 과정 전의 당신의 identity와 어떻게 다른니까?
23. 하나님과의 새로운 관계가 당신의 심리적 상태에 어떤 변화들을 가져왔습니까?
24. 어떤 점에서 영성지도를 통한 영적 심리적 변화들이 당신의 삶에 영향을 주었습니까?

● 신체적 건강에 대한 질문

25. 만약 있다면, 영성지도 과정이 당신의 신체적 건강에 어떤 효과를 주었습니까?

● 타인과의 관계에 대한 질문

26. 영성지도 과정이 당신에게 상처를 주었던 사람들을 용서하는데 도움이 되었습니까? 만약 있다면, 어떤 점에서 영성지도 과정이 당신에게 상처를 주었던 사람들을 용서하도록 도왔다고 생각하십니까?
27. 영성지도가 다른 사람과의 화해에 도움이 된다고 생각하십니까? 어떤 점에서 그렇습니까? 실제적 경험이 있습니까?

● 화해자로서의 피지도자의 삶에서의 변화에 대한 질문들

28. 영성지도가 당신의 삶에 미친 가장 중요한 변화는 무엇입니까?
29. 어떤 점에서 당신 삶에 대한 기대가 변화되었습니까?
30. 영성지도 과정을 통한 하나님과의 화해의 경험이 어떻게 당신의 매일의 삶과 관계성안에서의 ‘화해’에 영향을 끼칩니까? (영성지도를 통한 하나님과 자신과의 화해경험이 교회에서나 사회에서의 화해문제 이해나 참여에 어떤 영향을 미칩니까?)

APPENDIX 4

Later questions (by email)

Question 1.

How have you interpreted the suffering in your life during the spiritual direction process? In what ways have these interpretations changed compared to before the spiritual direction? Has prayer been helpful for this? Has the prayer on the suffering and the cross of Jesus been helpful for you to understand and interpret the suffering? If so, in what ways were these prayers helpful?

Question 2.

Have you experienced any changes in the way you have interpreted your life story through the spiritual direction process? Have you understood your life story more deeply or differently? If so, in what ways?

후속 질문 (이메일)

질문 1: 전도사님의 삶 가운데 있었던 고통과 고난이 영적지도 과정중에 어떤 식으로 해석되게 되었는지요? 영적지도 이전과 비교하여 어떤 점에서 이전의 해석이 달라졌는지요? 이것을 위해 기도가 도움이 되었는지요? 예수님의 고난과 십자가에 대한 묵상이 자신의 삶의 고난을 이해하고 해석하는데 도움이 되었는지요? 만약 그렇다면, 어떤 점에서 도움이 되었는지요?

질문 2: 영적지도를 통해 전도사님의 삶의 이야기에 (고난에 대한 것 뿐 아니라) 대한 해석에 변화가 있었는지요? 다르게 혹은 더 깊게 혹은 해석된 부분이 있는지요? 만약 그렇다면 어떤 점에 그런지요?

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Au, Wilkie. "An Ignatian Path to Gratitude", *The Way* 49.3 (2010): 65-79.
- Anderson, Ray S. "Christopraxis: the Ministry and the humanity of Christ for the World" in *Christ in our Place*, ed. Trevor Hart and Daniel Thimell, 11-31. Exeter: The Paternoster Press & Allison Park, New York: Pickwick Publications, 1989.
- Arendt, Hannah. *The Human Condition*, Chicago/London: The University of Chicago Press, 1958, 1988.
- Augustine, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991.
- Bakke, Jeannette A. *Holy Invitations*, Grand Rapids, Michigan: Bakers Books, 2000.
- Ballard, Paul and Pritchard, John. *Practical Theology in Action: Christian Thinking in the Service of Church and Society*, 2nd ed. London: SPCK, 1996.
- Barry, William A. and Connolly, William J. *The Practice of Spiritual Direction*, New York: Harper San Francisco, 1982.
- Bar-Siman-Tov, Yaacov. "Introduction: Why Reconciliation?" in *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*, ed. Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, 3-9. Oxford: Oxford University, 2004.
- Bar-Tal, Daniel and Bennink, Gemma H. "The Nature of Reconciliation as an Outcome and as a Process" in *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*, ed. Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, 11-38. Oxford: Oxford University, 2004.
- Barth, Karl. *Church Dogmatics*, IV. Part 1, ed. G. W. Bromiley and T. F. Torrance. London & New York: T & T Clark International, 1956.
- Baum, Gregory and Wells, Harold. *The Reconciliation of Peoples: Challenge to the Churches*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Benner, David. *Care of Souls: Revisioning Christian Nurture and Counsel*, Grand Rapids, Michigan, Baker Books, 1998.

- Berkouwer, Gerrit Cornelis. *De Mens het Gods: Dogmatische Studien*, Kampen: Kok, 1957.
- Biéler, André. *Calvin's Economic and Social Thought*, ed. Edward Dommen. trans. James Greig. Geneva: WCC Publications, 2005.
- Bonhoeffer, Dietrich. *Life Together*, trans. John W. Doberstein, New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1954.
- _____. *The Cost of Discipleship*, New York: Touchstone, 1959.
- Browning, Robert L. and Reed, Roy A. *Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Moral Courage: Motives and Designs for Ministry in a Troubled World*, Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2004.
- Brueggemann, Walter. *Prophetic Imagination*, Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 2001.
- Buckley, Suzanne M. ed., *Sacred is the Call*, New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 2005.
- Byrne, Lavinia. "Taking the Same...", *The Way Supplement 61* (1988): 112-120.
- Calvin, John. *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeil. trans. Ford Lewis Battles and others. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1960.
- Carmody, John. "Spiritual Formation" in *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, ed. Hunter. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990, (reprinted, 2005). 1217.
- Cassidy, Katherine. "Conversion Dynamics of the Spiritual Exercises", *Review for Religious* (November-December, 1986): 922-929.
- Chadwick, Graham. "What Sort of People Do the Exercises Foster?" in *Person and Society in the Ignatian Exercises*, *The Way Supplement 76* (1993): 109-116.
- Clarke, Thomas E. "Person and Society in the Exercises", *Way Supplement 76* (1993/76): 53-60.

- Clegg, Cecelia. "Between Embrace and Exclusion" in *Explorations in Reconciliation: New Directions in Theology*, ed. David Tombs and Joseph Liechty, 123-136. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing, 2006.
- _____. "Embracing a Threatening Other: Identity and Reconciliation in Northern Ireland" in *Peace and Reconciliation: In Search of Shared Identity*, ed. Sebastian Kim, Pauline Kollontail and Greg Hoyland. York: York St. John University, 2008: 81-93.
- Conn, Joann Wolski. "Spiritual Formation", *Theology Today* 56.1 (1999): 86-97.
- Corcoran, Donald. "Spiritual Guidance", in *Christian Spirituality 1: Origins to the Twelfth Century*, ed. Bernard McGinn, John Meyendorff, and Jean Leclercq, 444-452. New York: Crossroad, 1985.
- Creed, Bill. "From Compassionate Listening to Compassionate Justice: A Call for New Standards" in *Sacred is the Call*, ed. Suzanne M. Buckley, 152-157. New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 2005.
- Cross, F.L. and Livingstone, Elizabeth A. *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Culligan, Kevin G., ed., *Spiritual Direction: Contemporary Readings*, New York: Living Flame Press, 1983.
- De Smet, Andrew. "Counselling, Spiritual Accompanying & Pastoral Care", *Contact* 143 (2004): 28-36.
- De Gruchy, John W. *Reconciliation: Restoring Justice*, Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2002.
- Denzin, Norman K. and Lincoln, Yvonna S. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, California, Sage: Thousand Oaks, 2000.
- Divarkar, Parmananda. *The Path of Interior Knowledge: Reflections on the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash & Rome, Italy: Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis, 1982.

- Dougherty, Rose Mary. *Group Spiritual Direction: Community For Discernment*, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1995.
- Downey, Michael. *Understanding Christian Spirituality*, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1997.
- Driskill, Joseph. *Protestant Spiritual Exercises: Theology, History, and Practice*, New York/Harrisburg/Denver: Morehouse Publishing, 1999.
- Dufner, Andrew J. "The Ignatian Spiritual Exercises and the New World-View", *Way Supplement* 76 (1993/76): 3-12.
- Edwards, Tilden. *Spiritual Friend: Reclaiming the Gift of Spiritual Direction*, Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1980.
- English, John J. *Spiritual Freedom: From an Experience of the Ignatian Exercises to the Art of Spiritual Guidance*, Chicago, Illinois: Loyola Press, 1995.
- Enright, Robert D. and the Human Development Study Group, "Moral Development of forgiveness" in *Handbook of Moral Behavior and Development*, vol.1, ed. William M. Kurtines and Jacob L. J. Gewirtz. Hillsdale, 123-152. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1991.
- Enright, Robert D. and North, Joanna. ed. *Exploring Forgiveness*, Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998.
- Fischer, Kathleen. *Women at the Well: Feminist Perspectives on Spiritual Direction*, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1988.
- Fitzgibbons, Richard. "Anger and the Healing Power of Forgiveness: A Psychiatrist's View" in *Exploring Forgiveness*, ed. Robert D. Enright and Joanna North, 63-74. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998.
- Fleming, David L. "Beginning Spiritual Direction", *Review for Religious* 33 (1974): 546-550.

- _____. *Draw Me into Your Friendship: A Literal Translation an A Contemporary Reading of The Spiritual Exercises*, Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996.
- _____. *What is Ignatian Spirituality?* Chicago: Loyola Press, 2008.
- Ford, David F. *The Shape of Living: Spiritual Directions for Everyday Life*, Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Books, 1997.
- Ganss, George E. ed., *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1999.
- Goldbrunner, Josef. *Holiness is Wholeness and Other Essays*, Notre Dame, Indiana: The University of Notre Dame Press, 1964.
- Graham, L.K., "Healing", in *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, ed. Rodney J. Hunter: 497-501. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990, 2005.
- Gratton, Carolyn. "Spiritual Guidance in Today's World" in *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers*, vol.1, ed. Robert J. Wicks, 43-55. New York/Mahwah: Paulist Press, 1995.
- Greathouse, William M. *Wholeness in Christ: Toward a Biblical Theology of Holiness*, Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press, 1998.
- Grenz, Stanley J. *Theology for the Community of God*, Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1994.
- _____. "The Social God and the Relational Self", in *Personal Identity in Theological Perspective*, ed. Richard Lints, Michael S. Horton, and Mark R. Talbot, 70-92. Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge, U.K.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2006.
- Guenther, Margaret. *Holy Listening: The Art of Spiritual Direction*, London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd, 1992.
- Haight, Roger. "Grace and the Exercises", *Person and Society in the Ignatian Exercises*, *The Way Supplement* 76 (Spring 1993).

- Harak, G. Simon. *Virtuous Passion: The Formation of Christian Character*, Eugene, Oregon : Wipf and Stock Publishers, 1993.
- Hart, Trevor and Thimell, Daniel. ed., *Christ in our Place*, Exeter: The Paternoster Press, & Allison Park, New York: Pickwick Publications, 1989.
- Hassel, David J. "The Feel of Apostolic Contemplation-in-Action", *Review for Religious*, vol.40 (1981/3): 330-331.
- Helmick, Raymond G. and Petersen, Rodney L., ed., *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, Pennsylvania: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.
- Hesselink, I. John. *Calvin's First Catechism: A Commentary*, Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997.
- Hiltner, Seward. "Salvation's Message about Health" in *Wholeness and Holiness: Readings in the Psychology/Theology of Mental Health*, ed. H. Newton Malony, 155-171. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Book House, 1983.
- Hoekema, Anthony. *Created in God's Image*, Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1986.
- Holmes III, Urban T. *Spirituality for Ministry*, San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1982.
- Houdek, Frank J. *Guided by the Spirit: A Jesuit Perspective on Spiritual Direction*, Chicago: Loyola Press, 1996.
- Huggett, Joyce. "Why Ignatian Spirituality Hooks Protestants", *The Way Supplement* 68 (Summer 1990): 22-34.
- Hughes, Gerard W. *God of Surprises*, London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd., 1996.
- Hurley, Michael. ed., *Reconciliation in Religion and Society*, Belfast: Institute of Irish Studies, 1994.
- Hunter, Rodney J. ed., *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990, (reprinted, 2005).

- Ivens, Michael. *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, Herefordshire: Grace Wing & New Malden: Indigo Enterprises, 1998.
- _____. *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola*, trans. Gerard W. Hughes. Herefordshire: Gracewing, 2004.
- Johnson, Ben. "Spiritual Direction in the Reformed Tradition" in *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices*, ed. Gary Moon and David Benner, 132-156. Trowbridge, Wiltshire: Eagle Publication, 2004.
- Jones, L. Gregory. *Embodying Forgiveness: A Theological Analysis*, Grand Rapids, Michigan: B.Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1995.
- Jones, W. Paul. *The Art of Spiritual Direction: Giving and Receiving Spiritual Guidance*, Nashville: Tennessee: Upper Room Books, 2002.
- Jung, Carl G. *The Undiscovered Self*, trans. R.F.C. Hull. New York: Signet, 1957.
- Kalayjian, Ani and Paloutzian, Raymond F. ed. *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Psychological Pathways to conflict Transformation and Peace Building*, London/New York: Springer, 2009.
- Kelman, Herbert C. "Reconciliation as Identity Change: A Social-Psychological Perspective" in *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*, ed. Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, 111-124. Oxford: Oxford University, 2004.
- Kelsey, David H. *Imagining Redemption*, Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2005.
- _____. "Personal Bodies" in *Personal Identity in Theological Perspective*, ed. Richard Lints, Michael S. Horton, and Mark R. Talbot, 139-158. Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2006.
- _____. *Eccentric Existence: A Theological Anthropology*, vol.1 and 2, Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2009.
- Krog, Antjie. "Untold Damage of Anglo-Boer War", *Democracy in Action* 8.5 (1994).
- Kurtines, William M. and Gewirtz, Jacob L. J. ed., *Handbook of Moral Behavior and Development*, vol.1, Hillsdale, New Jersey.: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1991.

- LaMar, Ansley W. "A Black Social Psychologist's Perspective on racial Forgiveness" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, ed. Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, 155-170. London/New York: Springer, 2009.
- Larkin, Ernest E. "Contemplative Prayer as the Soul of the Apostolate" in *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers, Perspectives for the 21st Century*, vol.2, ed. Robert J. Wicks, 458-468. New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 2000.
- Lederach, John Paul. *Building Peace: Sustainable Reconciliation in Divided Societies*, Washington D.C.: United States Institutes of Peace Press, 1997.
- _____. *The Journey Toward Reconciliation*, Scottsdale, Pennsylvania: Herald Press, 1999.
- _____. *The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- _____. "Five Qualities of Practice in Support of Reconciliation Processes" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*, ed. Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen: 183-193. Philadelphia/London: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.
- Leech, Kenneth. *Soul Friend: Spiritual Direction in the Modern World*, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania: Morehouse Publishing, 2001.
- Leith, John H. *John Calvin's Doctrine of the Christian Life*, Louisville, Kentucky: John Knox Press, 1989.
- Liebert, Elizabeth. "The Process of Change in Spiritual Direction: A Structural-Developmental Perspective", unpublished Ph.D. diss., Nashville: Vanderbilt University, 1986.
- _____. *Changing Life Patterns: Adult Development in Spiritual Direction*, St. Kiyusem Nussouri: Chalice Press, 2000.
- _____. *The Way of Discernment: Spiritual Practices for Decision Making*, Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2008.

- Liechty, Joseph. "Putting Forgiveness in its Place: The Dynamics of Reconciliation" in *Explorations in Reconciliation: New Directions in Theology*, ed. David Tombs and Joseph Liechty, 59-68. Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Co, 2006.
- Lonsdale, David. *Listening to the Music of the Spirit: The Art of Discernment*, Notre Dame, Indiana: Ave Maria Press, 1992.
- _____. "Spiritual Direction as Prophetic Ministry" in *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers: Perspectives for the 21st Century*, vol.2, ed. Robert J. Wicks, 327-342. New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 2000.
- _____. *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear: An Introduction to Ignatian Spirituality*, London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd, 2000.
- _____. "Ignatian Spirituality" in *The New SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Philip Sheldrake, 354-356. London: SCM Press, 2005.
- Louf, Andre. "Spiritual Fatherhood in the Literature of the Desert" in *Abba: Guides to Wholeness and Holiness: Ease and West*, ed. John. Sommerfeldt. Kalamazoo: 37-63. Michigan: Cistercian Publications, 1982.
- Louw, Daniël J. *A Mature Faith: Spiritual Direction and Anthropology in a Theology of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, Louvain, Belgium: Peeters Press, 1999.
- Massey, D.E. "Empathy", in *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, ed. Rodney J. Hunter, 354. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990, 2005.
- Massey, Sharon Davis. "Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Essential to Sustaining Human Development," in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, ed. Any Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, 83-96. London / New York: Springer, 2009.
- Massy, Robert F and Abu-Baker, Khawla. "A Systemic Framework for Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Peace: Interconnecting Psychological and Social Process" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Psychological Pathways to Conflict Transformation and Peace Building*, ed. Any Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, 11-32. London / New York: Springer, 2009.
- May, Gerald G. *Care of Mind, Care of Spirit*, San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1982, 1992.

- McCarthy, Shaun. "Pilgrim and Penitent: Direction and Sacramental Reconciliation", *Review for Religious*, November-December (1986): 819-830.
- _____. "Basics in Spiritual Direction" in *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers* vol.1, ed. Robert J. Wicks, 56-76. New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1995.
- _____. "On Entering Spiritual Direction", in *Spiritual Direction: Contemporary Readings*, ed. Kevin G. Culligan, 99-115. New York: Living Flame Press, 1983.
- McConvery, Brendan. "Remembering John Calvin and Ignatius Loyola at Maynooth" in *The Witness of John Calvin and Ignatius Loyola*, ed. Brendan McConvery, 7-10. Dublin: Veritas, 2011.
- McConvery, Brendan. ed., *The Witness of John Calvin and Ignatius Loyola*, Dublin: Veritas, 2011
- McFadyen, Alistair I. *The Call to Personhood: A Christian Theory of the Individual in Social Relationships*, Cambridge/New York/Port Chester/Melbourne/Sydney: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- McGinn, Bernard., Meyendorff, John. and Leclercq, Jean. ed., *Christian Spirituality 1: Origins to the Twelfth Century*, New York: Crossroad, 1985.
- Merton, Thomas. *Spiritual Direction and Medication*, Collegeville, Minnesota: Order of Saint Benedict, 1960, (reprinted, 1987).
- Mills, L.O. "Pastoral Care" in *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*, ed. Rodney J. Hunter, 836-844. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990. (reprinted, 2005).
- Moon, Gary and Benner, David. ed., *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices*, Trowbridge, Wiltshire: Eagle Publication, 2004.
- Müller-Fahrenheit, Geiko. *The Art of Forgiveness: Theological Reflections on Healing and Reconciliation*, Geneva: WCC Publications, 1997.

- Nemeck, Francis Kelly and Coombs, Marie Theresa. *The Way of Spiritual Direction*, Collegeville, Minnesota, A Michael Glazier Book, 1985.
- Nouwen, Henri, J. "Spiritual Direction", *Worship* 55.5 (1981): 399-404.
- Oden, Thomas C. *Pastoral Theology*, San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1983.
- _____. *The Transforming Power of Grace*, Nashville, Tennessee: Abingdon Press, 1993.
- O'Hanlon, Gerry. "Justice and Reconciliation", *Reconciliation in Religion and Society*, ed. Michael Hurley, 48-67. Belfast: Institute of Irish Studies, 1994.
- Olson, Roger E. *Finding God in the Shack: Seeking Truth in a Story of Evil and Redemption*, Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 2009
- Otto, Rudolf. *The Idea of the Holy*, trans. J. W. Harvey. London, Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press, 1923, (reprinted, 1958).
- Overberg, Kenneth. "The Mystery of God and Suffering", *The Way* 50/3 (July 2011): 79-89.
- Paloutzian, Raymond F. and Kalayjian, Ani. "Introduction: Issues and Themes in Forgiveness and Reconciliation" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, ed. Any Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, 3-10. London / New York: Springer, 2009.
- Partee, Charles. *The Theology of John Calvin*, Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2008.
- Pempel, Alice McDowell. "The Three Dimensions of Direction", *Review for Religious* 40 (1981): 391-402.
- Petersen, Rodney L. "A Theology of Forgiveness: Terminology, Rhetoric, & the Dialectic of Interfaith Relationships" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*, ed. Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, 3-25. Philadelphia / London: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.
- Phillips, Susan S. *Candlelight: Illuminating the Art of Spiritual Direction*, Harrisburg, New York: Morehouse Publishing, 2008.

- Punch, Keith F. *Introduction to Social research: Quantitative & Qualitative Approaches*, London / Thousand Oaks / New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1998.
- Rahner, Hugo. *Ignatius the Theologian*, New York: Herder and Herder, 1968.
- Rainbow, Jonathan H. "Double Grace: John Calvin's view of the relationship of justification and sanctification", *Ex Auditu*, 5 (1989): 99-105.
- Reiser, William. "The Interior Life of Jesus as the Life of the People of God" in *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers, : Perspectives for the 21st Century*, vol.2, ed. Robert J. Wicks, 396-417. New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 2000.
- Rice, Howard. *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide*, Nashville, Tennessee: Upper Room Books, 1998.
- Ruffing, Janet K. "Socially Engaged Contemplation: Living Contemplatively in Chaotic Times" in *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers, : Perspectives for the 21st Century*, vol.2, ed. Robert J. Wicks, 418-441. New York / Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 2000.
- _____. *To Tell the Sacred Tale: Spiritual Direction and Narrative*, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1989, (reprinted, 2011).
- _____. "Cultivating Compassion: An Interview with Janet Ruffing", *Presence: An International Journal of Spiritual Direction* 17.1 (March, 2011): 6-12.
- Schimmel, Solommon. *Wounds of Healed by Time: The Power of Repentance and Forgiveness*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Schneiders, Sandra M. "Horizons on Spiritual Direction", *Horizons* 11/1 (1984):100-112.
- _____. "The Contemporary Ministry of Spiritual Direction" in *Spiritual Direction: Contemporary Readings*, ed. Kevin G. Culligan, 41-56. New York: Living Flame Press, 1983.
- Schreiner, Susan E. *The Theater of His Glory*, Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Academics, 1991.

- Schreier, Robert J. *Reconciliation: Mission & Ministry in A Changing Social Order*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books & Cambridge, Massachusetts: Boston Theological Institute, 1992.
- _____. *The Ministry of Reconciliation: Spirituality & Strategies*, Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1998.
- _____. "Establishing a Shared Identity: The Role of the Healing of Memories and of Narrative", in *Peace and Reconciliation: In Search of Shared Identity*, ed. Sebastian Kim, Pauline Kollontail, and Greg Hoyland, 7-20. York: York St. John University, 2008.
- Sebareni, Joseph, Foreword in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, ed. Ani Kalayjian and Raymond F. Paloutzian, v-vi. London / New York: Springer, 2009.
- Selderhuis, Herman J. *John Calvin: A Pilgrim's Life*, trans. Albert Gootjes. Nottingham, England: Inter-Varsity Press, 2009.
- Sheldrake, Philip. F. *Befriending Our Desires*, London: Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd, 2001.
- _____. "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly: A Dialectic of the Mystical and Prophetic", *Spiritus* 3 (2003): 11-37.
- _____. ed., *The New SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, London: SCM Press, 2005.
- _____. *Explorations in Spirituality: History, Theology, and Social Practice*, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 2010.
- _____. "Spirituality and Healthcare", *Practical Theology* 3.3 (2010): 367-379.
- _____. "St Ignatius of Loyola and Spiritual Direction", *Traditions of Spiritual Guidance*, ed. Lavinia Byrne, 99-116. Eugene, Oregon : Wipt and Stock Publishers, 1990.

Shriver Jr., Donald. W. *An Ethic for Enemies: Forgiveness in Politics*. New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.

_____. "What is Forgiveness in a Secular Political Form?" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*, ed. Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, 151-157. Philadelphia/London: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.

Sommerfeldt, John. ed., *Abba: Guides to Wholeness and Holiness: Ease and West*, Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications, 1982.

Staub, Ervin and Pearlman, Laurie Anne. "Healing, Reconciliation, and Forgiving after Genocide and Other Collective Violence" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*, ed. Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, 195-217. Philadelphia/London: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.

Stevens, David. *The Land of Unlikeness: Explorations into Reconciliation*. Dublin: The Columba Press, 2004.

Swinton, John and Mowat, Harriet. *Practical Theology and Qualitative Research*, London: SCM press, 2006.

Tetlow, Joseph A. *Choosing Christ in the World: Directing the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius Loyola According to Annotations Eighteen and Nineteen*, Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1989.

_____. *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola: With Commentary*, New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1992.

Thompson, Marjorie. *Soul Feast: An Invitation to Christian Spiritual Life*, Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1995.

Tombs, David and Liechty, Joseph. ed. *Explorations in Reconciliation: New Directions in Theology*, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Co, 2006.

- Toner, Jules J. *A Commentary on St. Ignatius's Rules for the Discernment of Spirits: A Guide to the Principles and Practice*, Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1982.
- _____. *Spirit of Light or Darkness?: A Casebook for Studying Discernment of Spirits*, Saint Louis, MO: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1995.
- Ulanov, Ann and Ulanov, Barry. *Primary Speech: A Psychology of Prayer*, Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1982.
- Van Kaam, Adrian. *The Dynamics of Spiritual Self Direction*, Denville, New Jersey: Dimension Books, 1976.
- Vest, Norvene. *No Moment Too Small: Rhythms of Silence, Prayer and Holy Reading*, Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications/Cambridge: Cowley Publications, 1994.
- Villa-Vicencio, Charles. "Telling One Another Stories: Towards a Theology of Reconciliation" in *The Reconciliation of Peoples*, ed. Baum and Wells, 30-42. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Volf, Miroslav. *Exclusion & Embrace: A Theological Exploration of Identity, Otherness, and Reconciliation*, Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996.
- _____. "Forgiveness, Reconciliation, & Justice: A Christian Contribution to a More Peaceful Social Environment" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation*, ed. Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, 27-49. Pennsylvania: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.
- _____. "A Theology of Embrace for a World of Exclusion" in *Explorations in Reconciliation*, ed. David Tombs and Joseph Liechty, 22-33. Aldershot, UK/Burlington, US, 2006.
- _____. *The End of Memory: Remembering Rightly in a Violent World*, Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2006.
- Wakefield, Gordon S. *The SCM Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, London, SCM Press, 1983.

- Wallace, Ronald S. *Calvin's Doctrine of the Christian Life*, Edinburgh & London: Oliver and Boyd, 1959.
- Webster, John. *Barth's Ethics of Reconciliation*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Wells, Harold. "Theology for Reconciliation" in *The Reconciliation of Peoples: Challenge to the Churches*, ed. Gregory Baum and Harold Wells, 1-15. Geneva: WCC Publications & Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Wicks, Robert J. ed., *Handbook of Spirituality for Ministers*, vol.1, New York/Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1995.
- Wigall, Steve R. "A Sacramental Paradigm Employing The Lord's Supper in Calvin as a Theological Rationale for Spiritual Direction", unpublished Th.D diss., Boston University School of Divinity, 1998.
- Williams, Rowan. *The Wound of Knowledge*, London: Darton, Longman & Tood, 1990.
- _____. *On Christian Theology*, Oxford & Malden Mass: Blackwell, 2000.
- Wolterstorff, Nicholas. "The Place of Forgiveness in the Actions of the State" in *The Politics of Past Evil: Religion, Reconciliation, and the Dilemmas of Transitional Justice*, ed. Daniel Philpott, 87-111. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 2006.
- Worthington, Jr., Everett L. "Empirical Research in Forgiveness: Looking Backward, looking Forward" in *Dimensions of Forgiveness: Psychological Research & Theological Perspectives*, ed. Everett L. Worthington, Jr., 321-339. Philadelphia & London: Templeton Foundation Press, 1998.
- _____. "Unforgiveness, Forgiveness, and Reconciliation and Their Implications for Societal Interventions" in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*, ed. Raymond G. Helmick and Rodney L. Petersen, 161-182. Philadelphia / London: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.
- Wright, John H. *A Theology of Christian Prayer*, New York: Pueblo Publishing Company, 1974.

_____. "Discernment of Spirits in the New Testament", in *Spiritual Direction: Contemporary Readings*, ed. Kevin G. Culligan, 168-179. New York: Living Flame Press, 1983.

Young, William Paul. *The Shack: Where Tragedy Confronts Eternity*, Newbury Park, California: Windblown Media, 2007.

The Guardian / London School of Economics, "Reading the Riots: Investigating England's Summer of Disorder", (5/12/2011), <http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/series/reading-the-riots> Accessed 08/12/11

Jean-Vincent Placé, Korean Broadcasting Service, (9/3/2011), interview with KBS 9 News