



Shelf Mark Theses Section 2

BREITENBACH Ph.D. 2005



**Empire, religion and national identity:
Scottish Christian imperialism in the 19th and
early 20th centuries**

Esther Breitenbach

**Ph.D
The University of Edinburgh
2005**

Declaration

This thesis has been composed by me, and it is my own work. The thesis has not been submitted for any other degree or qualification.

Edna Breitfuß

Abstract

This thesis examines the connection between participation in the British empire and constructions of Scottish national identity, through investigating the activities of civil society organisations in Scotland, in particular missionary societies and the Presbyterian churches in the 19th and early 20th centuries. Though empire is commonly thought to have had a significant impact on Scots' adoption of a British identity, the process of how representations of empire were transmitted and understood at home has been little explored. Similarly, religion is thought to have played an important role in supporting a sense of Scottish identity, but this theme has also been little explored. This thesis, then, examines evidence of civil society activity related to empire, including philanthropic and religious, learned and scientific, and imperial propagandist activities, in order to elucidate how empire was understood at home through the engagement with empire by civil society organisations. Of these forms of organisation, missionary societies and the churches were the most important in mediating an understanding of empire. The pattern of the growth and development of the movement in support of foreign missions is described and analysed, indicating its longevity, its typical functions and membership, and demonstrating both its middle class leadership and the active participation of women. Analysis of missionary literature of a variety of types shows that dominant discourses of religion, race, gender and class produced iconic representations of the missionary experience which reflected the values of middle class Scots. The analysis also demonstrates both that representations of Scottish national identity were privileged over those of a British identity, but that these were complementary rather than being seen as in opposition to each other. Through examining the public profile of the missionary enterprise in the secular press it is shown that these representations were appropriated in the secular sphere to represent a specific Scottish contribution to empire. The thesis concludes that the missionary experience of empire, embedded as it was in the institutional life of the Presbyterian churches, had the capacity to generate representations and symbols of Scottish national identity which were widely endorsed in both religious and secular spheres in the age of high imperialism.

Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Note on place names</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>iv</i>
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Chapter 2: Empire, religion and national identity	16
Chapter 3: Empire and civil society organisations	47
Chapter 4: Enlightening the heathen in religious truth: the Scottish missionary movement	76
Chapter 5: ‘Missionary intelligence’ and the construction of identities: religion, race, gender and class	114
Chapter 6: Remembering and reproducing Scotland: the construction of national identity	154
Chapter 7: From ‘maniacs’ to the ‘best of its manhood’: the appropriation of the missionary as Scottish empire-builder	191
Chapter 8: Conclusion	224
Appendix 1: Edinburgh-based missionary societies, 1796-1914	255
Appendix 2: Membership of Edinburgh missionary societies and Church foreign mission committees	256
Appendix 3: Missionary periodicals	260
Appendix 4: Missionaries’ biographical details	261
Bibliography	264

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the assistance of the ever helpful staff of the following libraries: National Library of Scotland, British Library, School of Oriental and African Studies, Edinburgh University Main Library and New College Library, and the Edinburgh Room of the Edinburgh Public Library.

Friends and family have expressed a continuing interest in my research and have offered their support in various ways, and I would like to express my gratitude for this. I would particularly like to thank Jane McDermid, Fiona Mackay, and Georgie Young for their encouragement, support, and good advice. Finally, I would also like to thank my supervisors, Professor David McCrone and Professor Graeme Morton, for all their useful advice and comments, and for their patience.

Note on place names

In this thesis I have used throughout contemporary place names, rather than replaced these with their modern forms. For example, I have used ‘Bombay’ rather than ‘Mumbai’, and ‘Calcutta’ rather than ‘Kolkhata’. In particular I have used ‘Nyasaland’ and ‘Lake Nyasa’ rather than ‘Malawi’ and ‘Lake Malawi’. This is, given the frequent quotations in which such places are named, for the sake of consistency and ease in reading the text. It is recognised, however, that such names were Europeanised forms that have since the period of de-colonisation justifiably been changed or replaced.

Abbreviations

C of S	Church of Scotland
EMMS	Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society
EUMA	Edinburgh University Missionary Association
FC of S	Free Church of Scotland
LMS	London Missionary Society
NLS	National Library of Scotland
RSGS	Royal Scottish Geographical Society
SLA	Scottish Ladies’ Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India
SMS	Scottish Missionary Society
UFC of S	United Free Church of Scotland
UPC	United Presbyterian Church

Chapter 1: Introduction

The idea that a British identity came to have a wide currency among Scots from the second half of the 18th century has been supported by a number of historians. In particular the Union of 1707, participation in the British empire, the unifying effects of a common Protestantism, and the threat of war from Europe are seen as having consolidated this British identity.¹ Since Scots are seen to have derived much benefit from the empire, both in terms of career opportunities abroad and economic development at home, this experience has been understood as consolidating support for the Union, loyalty to the British state, and the adoption of a British identity. ‘British’ and ‘Scottish’ identities are often seen as complementary rather than competing in the period of empire, though the extent to which a Scottish identity was under threat or to which it was strengthened during this period has been debated. Indeed, in itself the meaning of British and Scottish identities has been and remains very much a matter for debate, as does the nature of the relationship between them, particularly where these are understood as being socially constructed, and being advanced as identity ‘claims’ that represent the interests of different groups. Furthermore, it has been argued that identities are not static or simple, and are subject to a constant process of negotiation and are differently expressed in different contexts. This thesis seeks to elucidate how the context of the experience of empire might have influenced or shaped the construction of Scottish national identity. It takes as its main focus the ways in which missionaries, missionary societies and the Presbyterian churches mediated an understanding of empire, and how identity was expressed in this context.

The idea of empire itself can mean different things to different people. Debates continue, as indicated below, about when the British empire can be said to have originated, for example. Given the duration of the British empire, and the range of territories encompassed by it, and the varied reasons for emigration, permanent or

¹ Linda Colley is a major proponent of this view, which has also been supported by others, and these views are discussed in Chapter Two. See Linda Colley, *Britons: forging the nation 1707-1837*, London, Pimlico, 2003, first published 1992.

temporary, it was experienced in different ways by different groups of people, and was also understood differently at home. Emigration from Scotland, and the distribution of the Scottish diaspora has meant that empire for many Scots was most associated with white settler territories, later the Dominions. For others the connection may have been to the colonial civil service in which India was the destination for the majority of administrators. Or, in relation to foreign missions, as will be seen in this research, India and Africa constituted the primary representations of empire. The nature of Scottish involvement in empire has also shaped the perspectives of historians, for whom the Scottish diaspora in North America has often been a focus. More recently Scottish involvement in India and other parts of Asia and in Africa has attracted the attention of historians.² The brief outline of the chronology of empire below provides the context for the selection of a particular aspect of imperial experience as the focus for this research.

The British empire lasted for a period of approximately 300 years, spanned many territories, and was governed through a varied range of political arrangements. It does not therefore admit of a simple definition. John MacKenzie has argued that it can be defined as 'four separate entities': the territories of settlement; India, with the romantic aura created for it by Disraeli in the 1870s; a string of islands and staging posts, from Caribbean sugar colonies to China; and the 'dependent' territories acquired largely in the late 19th century.³ The timing of its origin is also debatable. Cain and Hopkins take as their starting point the Glorious Revolution of 1688, since by that date 'overseas explorations, migrations and settlement had already taken place, if only on a relatively small scale'.⁴ A case can also be made for the foundation of the English East India Company in 1600 as providing the formal institutional origins of the empire.⁵

² See, for example, Michael Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, East Lothian, Tuckwell Press, and Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2001, and T M Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, Allen Lane, 2003.

³ John M MacKenzie, *Propaganda and Empire*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1986, p 1.

⁴ P J Cain and A G Hopkins, *British Imperialism: 1688-2000*, London, Pearson, 2002, 2nd edition, First published 1993, p 18.

⁵ *Ibid.*, p 19.

Scots had begun to participate in the empire by the late 17th century, for example, in settlements in South Carolina and New Jersey in the 1680s, with varying degrees of success.⁶ Most significantly, the Scots attempt to establish a colony at Darien on the Panama isthmus in 1698 had ended in failure by April 1700, having swallowed up around half of Scotland's capital. This disaster was a major factor persuading Scots to agree to Union with England in 1707, and thus Union can be construed as 'the consequence of Scotland's failure to establish an empire'.⁷ Thereafter Scots were to share in shaping the British Empire and in its benefits, though at the time of the Union as such this opportunity was not perceived to compensate for loss of sovereignty.⁸ It was only subsequently that this was seen to be a gain.

At the time of the Union Britain had established colonies in North America, Canada, and the Caribbean, and had a number of trading posts in Africa.⁹ The East India Company had bases in Bombay, Calcutta and Madras. The American colonists threw off British rule following the revolution of 1776, but in Canada, the Caribbean and India, the British empire expanded as a consequence of its wars against France and Spain, and in 1788 Australia was 'discovered'. With the victory over France in 1815, Britain became Europe's most powerful imperial state, and was poised for expansion in India, south-east Asia, and Africa in the course of the 19th century. British rule in India was further consolidated by the ending of the rule of the East India Company following the Indian Mutiny of 1857, to be replaced by administration by a British imperial state. In the same period exploration in Africa was whetting the appetite of European powers for further colonial expansion beyond the long established coastal trading posts or the colonial territory of South Africa. This imperial competition reached its height in the late 19th century 'scramble for Africa', which was part of a process of the partitioning of the world among a handful of states. This 'Age of Empire', which, it is argued, witnessed a new kind of imperialism, with the development of a global economy driven by a search for markets, lasted from 1875

⁶ See T M Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 39.

⁷ Charles W J Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001, p 104.

⁸ Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 62.

⁹ See Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, 'Introduction', pp xxiii-xxviii.

to 1914.¹⁰ After 1918, Britain experienced economic decline, with Scotland's heavy industries being particularly hard hit, and no longer enjoying the profits which had accrued from empire. Empire continued until the mid 1960s, with the inter-war period witnessing a change in the nature of relationships with Dominions and dependent territories, and the post-Second World War period witnessing a rapid crumbling of the whole edifice of empire.

As participants in the empire Scots have also been part of its various manifestations, or the 'separate entities' as defined by MacKenzie. As the destinations for the largest numerical share of the Scots diaspora, the territories of settlement have been the most significant. However, for others India and Africa came to represent the empire. Kiernan has commented that the British empire has the most important place in the history of modern empires, and within this India was most important. On the one hand the main patterns of British colonial administration were developed there. On the other 'to the public, empire with all its romantic associations meant chiefly India'.¹¹ From the mid 19th century onwards, Africa was to become an increasing focus of attention, firstly as a field of exploration, and secondly as a field for colonial acquisition and settlement. For missionaries and their supporters at home, empire was most importantly India and Africa, since the vast majority of Scots missionaries were sent there, though the South Seas and China were also the object of missionary endeavours.

The role of missionary societies and the churches has often been alluded to in the literature on Scots' participation in the empire, but has been less studied, as will be discussed in Chapter Two. Indeed, such literature has focussed primarily on the economic and the military dimensions of empire, with a persistent theme being that the empire created opportunities for Scots. A similarly persistent theme has been that Scots made a disproportionate contribution to empire, especially to the Indian civil service and to the army, though statistical evidence of this is patchy, and in some instances the numbers concerned are small. In positing the assumption that the role

¹⁰ Eric Hobsbawm, *The Age of Empire: 1875-1914*, London, Phoenix, 2000, First published 1987, pp 60-62.

¹¹ Victor Kiernan, *The Lords of Human Kind*, London, Serif, 1995, First published 1969, p 33.

of missionaries and the churches was important, an explicit link is often made to the kirk or to Presbyterianism as symbolizing or carrying Scottish national identity, though it has also been questioned whether the divided kirk of the 19th century could do so.

That religion and the churches played a significant role in 19th century Scotland is not to be doubted. Though the conflict between Moderate and Evangelical parties over the question of patronage led to the Disruption of 1843, the secession of a substantial proportion of ministers and members and the establishment of the Free Church, this split released an evangelical energy reflected in the growth of the foreign mission movement, as well as in the rapid expansion of the Free Church at home. Church membership grew in the second half of the 19th century, if not necessarily steadily, and reached its height around the turn of the century, peaking at 50.5 per cent of the population in 1905.¹² This growth was also accompanied by a variety of manifestations of religious life, such as the revivalism inspired by the visiting American evangelists Moody and Sankey, the temperance movement, Sunday schools, and youth organisations such as the Boys' Brigade. As well as the formal organisational structures for support of foreign missions, many of these other forms of activity provided a vehicle for missionary propaganda. The Catholic Church also grew significantly in the 19th century, largely as a result of Irish immigration, especially in the industrial cities of Glasgow and Dundee, but in this period did not support foreign missions from Scotland as such.

Though religious life and institutions were central to 19th century Scottish society, the divisions between the churches have led to a questioning of their capacity to underpin a sense of Scottish national identity. The Disruption has been seen as undermining 'Presbyterian nationalism'.¹³ Or, the lack of a single church, together with the lack of a national political forum, have been seen to have resulted in a shift of focus for Scottish identity to 'new, local institutions' such as the Town Hall.¹⁴

¹² Callum G Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1997, p 64.

¹³ Brown quoting S J Brown, in *Religion and Society in Scotland*, p 185.

¹⁴ Michael Lynch, *Scotland: A New History*, London, Pimlico, 1997, First published 1991, p 438.

Together, the fragmentation of the church and the perceived threat to the education system from anglicisation have been interpreted by some as constituting a crisis of national identity. Whether, in the context of empire, Presbyterianism could provide a basis for the projection of a Scottish national identity is a question that this thesis addresses.

It has been argued generally that civil society institutions and organisations, which in Scotland remained relatively autonomous from the British state, were crucial to the construction and reproduction of national identity, with church, education and law being seen as the three pillars supporting this autonomy and identity. That a focus on civil society organisations and institutions is important arises not only from the role it is claimed they may have played in projecting and sustaining national identity, but also because of the role that they may have played in mediating and projecting images and understandings of empire, whether explicitly imperialist or not. This is a process of much complexity, involving various types of organisational forms, as well as a variety of discourses, representations, and sites of reproduction. The understanding and the appropriation of the experience of empire occurred in a variety of ways. If the empire might be understood as fundamentally an economic and political phenomenon, its impact was by no means confined to these spheres. Its influence on intellectual developments encompassed history, geography, sociology, anthropology, philology, medicine, botany, zoology, and so on. Both ‘imperial actors’ and those at home contributed to this process. Such theorising, data collection and classifying can be described as forms of narration and of control, which embodied the power relations of empire.¹⁵

In general much work remains to be done in researching the impact of empire on intellectual debates and academic disciplines within Scottish society. From the Enlightenment onwards, however, Scots contributed to intellectual debates stimulated by the experience of empire, and to the development of academic knowledge. Scots ‘Orientalists’ such as the colonial administrators, Malcolm, Munro and Elphinstone, and the Anglicist ‘armchair’ historian of India, James Mill, were

influential in their views of the nature of Indian society, its history, and how it should be governed.¹⁶ Enlightenment figures such as Kames and Monboddo were part of the early development of anthropology, with the former arguing that different cultures could be regarded as separate species, and the latter maintaining that the essence of humanity was language, though he seemed prepared to stretch the definition of the human species to include the 'Orang Outang'.¹⁷ In the mid 19th century, Edinburgh anatomist Robert Knox, notorious for his connection with Burke and Hare, was a leading proponent of 'polygenesis', the view that different races had different origins.¹⁸ According to Rice, Knox's 'pseudoscientific lectures were greatly admired by Darwin' and were popularised to an extent that makes him 'the real founder of British racism'.¹⁹ Thomas Carlyle also contributed to racist discourses, with his views on the lack of the capacity of the 'negro' for hard work, a view Rice attributes to the influence of 'Calvinist concepts of duty and calling'.²⁰

An area that as yet has been particularly neglected is that of science and engineering. Scots were engineers and builders of infrastructures and railways, and they 'largely carried all the new disciplines of tropical medicine, microbiology, entomology and veterinary science to a global state from the late nineteenth century'.²¹ Missionaries actively applied their scientific knowledge in the field, and also contributed through this to the expansion of knowledge of botany, medicine, zoology, and geology.²² Geography, too, was greatly affected by the experience of empire, not just in the extension of geographical knowledge, but in the reshaping of its practice. Indeed, in the period of high imperialism applications of geography in survey and epistemological practices were simultaneously about questions of national and

¹⁵ See, for example, Edward Said, *Culture and Imperialism*, London, Vintage, 1994, First published 1993; and Thomas Richards, *The Imperial Archive*, London, Verso, 1993.

¹⁶ See, for example, Martha McLaren, *British India and British Scotland, 1780-1830*, Akron, University of Akron Press, 2001.

¹⁷ Alan Barnard, *History and Theory in Anthropology*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2000, pp 19-20.

¹⁸ See Barnard, *History and Theory in Anthropology*, pp 24-25.

¹⁹ C Duncan Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, Louisiana, Louisiana State University Press, 1981, p 175.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, p 175.

²¹ John MacKenzie, 'Hearts in the Highlands', *Times Literary Supplement*, January 25, 2002.

²² See, for example, John M MacKenzie, 'Missionaries, Science and the Environment in Nineteenth-Century Africa' in Andrew Porter (ed) *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Grand Rapids and Cambridge, Wm Erdmans Publishing Co, 2003, pp 106-130.

imperial identity.²³ Withers has demonstrated that knowledge production took place in a variety of ‘analytic spaces’: literature of various kinds, including newspapers; public addresses and lectures; and instruction in the field.²⁴ This provides a useful model for understanding how other forms of knowledge of empire were produced, including those arising as a result of the missionary enterprise.

It was not only through the spheres of intellectual, academic, or learned forms of knowledge, that empire was understood, but also through a variety of forms of propagandist images, and popular forms, whether advertising, or forms of popular entertainment. In some cases such representations were propagated by organisations which intentionally promoted an imperialist vision, in other cases they reflected the salience of particular events or stereotypes of empire. One manifestation of such popular imperialism in the Scottish context (and also in the British context) which has been explored is the construction of the myth of Livingstone.²⁵ MacKenzie has argued that Livingstone was seen to embody ‘self-help’ and came to function as a ‘Protestant saint’. A key point here is not just that Livingstone provided the kind of material that could be turned into a heroic myth, since such figures cannot be created ‘out of men of straw’, but that he could be appropriated by a range of groups, such as the different denominations of the divided churches, and that his myth could be renewed to fit with changing circumstances. Thus the significant factors for myth creation are its repetition, its capacity for reinterpretation and renewal. In Livingstone’s case, MacKenzie has argued that Scots over time reappropriated him increasingly as their own, a process culminating in the 1920s with the period of revival of nationalist consciousness. This illustrates the importance of repetition in the process of creating symbolic representations that have a popular resonance, and suggests the necessity from time to time for the creation of iconic figures and representations of national identity, which also draw on older figures and symbols, reinterpreting and renewing them. Important questions in the investigation of such

²³ Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, p 197.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, p 251.

²⁵ See John M MacKenzie, ‘David Livingstone: the construction of the myth’ in Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds), *Sermons and Battle Hymns: Protestant Culture in Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990; ‘Heroic Myths of Empire’ in J M MacKenzie (ed), *Popular Imperialism and the Military*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1992.

phenomena are who repeats, who appropriates, who reinterprets, and in which contexts this occurs. Such questions are addressed here in the analysis of literature by and about missionaries, and of the shaping and currency of representations arising from this.

A further dimension of the interpretation of the impact of empire and how this was understood is the variation this might have at a local level, an area that is as yet poorly understood. Though the emphasis has often been on economic benefits of empire, there have been few studies that have addressed this in any depth, with Glasgow and Dundee being best served.²⁶ The status of Glasgow as an imperial city, and how this identity was projected has been analysed by MacKenzie, while Stewart has illustrated the interlinking of Dundee's economy with the jute industry in Calcutta.²⁷ Graduates from Aberdeen University found professional careers in the empire, as will also have been the case for other Scottish universities, and in particular Edinburgh, though this requires further research.²⁸ Furthermore, it might be supposed that financial benefits to small investors in imperial enterprises are likely to have been significant for the middle class professionals of Scottish cities, and not just to industrialists and merchants. That the middle classes of 19th century Scotland were activated by empire, its meaning, and its development, is evident in debates in periodicals and newspapers, and in university, church, and civic life. Such local studies would illustrate not just the economic links, but also how and where the knowledge of empire was produced, and by whom this was directed. This thesis aims to contribute to the latter area, through a focus on the activities of Edinburgh societies and organisations, which is suggestive of the level of interest in empire, though the economic dimension is beyond the scope of this research.

²⁶ For example, see the discussion of repatriation of profits from the West Indies and purchase of land in the West of Scotland in Devine, *Scotland's Empire*; and Gordon T Stewart, *Jute and Empire*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1998.

²⁷ See John M MacKenzie, "'The Second City of Empire': Glasgow – imperial municipality", in Felix Driver and David Gilbert (eds), *Imperial Cities*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1999; and Stewart, *Jute and Empire*.

²⁸ For the links to Aberdeen, see John D Hargreaves, *Aberdeenshire to Africa*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1981.

The general claim has often been made that empire had a significant impact on Scotland, politically and economically, and on how Scots saw themselves and on their identity. While such general claims do not lack plausibility, they often lack much in the way of content, and tend to present an oversimplified view of what this experience meant and how it was understood. As has been indicated in this introduction, there remain significant gaps in our knowledge of the experience and meaning of empire for Scots. Given the duration of empire, the complexity and variety of experiences and impacts that this entailed, and its inter-relationship with social and political change at home, it will require a considerable expansion in the number of focused studies to provide an adequate grounding for an understanding of this experience.

The research focus and sources used

This study aims to elucidate the process of transmission of representations of empire to people at home and the influence of these on Scottish national identity, and in furtherance of this aim the research brings together the themes of the role of religion, the role of the missionary movement and of civil society organisations at home in mediating a vision of empire and the role of Scots within it. It also seeks to demonstrate how a particular discourse of national identity was constructed in the course of the missionary enterprise, and how this was reflected in wider debates in Scotland in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. The focus on missionary societies and the churches entails a focus, as indicated above, on a particular aspect or definition of empire, in this case India, and the dependent territories in Africa. It also provides a definition of the time frame. This takes as its starting point the initiation of organised activity in Scotland in support of foreign missions at the end of the 18th century. It takes as its end point the First World War. Both empire and missionary activity of course continued after this point, and would merit research. It can be argued, however, that the First World War marked the end of the era of high imperialism, and that the period that followed was markedly different, with economic decline at home, rising nationalism in the Dominions, India, Africa and elsewhere, and a reappraisal of the role of missionaries in this changed context.

Much writing on Scotland and empire has concentrated on economic links, on the Scottish military presence, and on prominent individuals, whether colonial administrators, governors, entrepreneurs, or a few prominent missionaries. While claims of how this was understood at home are often made, they have tended to be based on a limited range of sources, sometimes doing little more than repeating the claims of 19th century imperialist enthusiasts. This research aims to use a range of sources, which have been little used to investigate links to empire, and also aims to use such sources to map civil society organisational activity connected with empire, its phases of development, and its membership. It further aims to analyse sources which produce representations of identity in the context of empire, in order to investigate the question of how Scottish and British identities were articulated in this context. To map organisations the primary sources used are: the *New Edinburgh Almanac*, effectively a handbook describing Scotland and Edinburgh's political institutions and civil society organisations, and their leadership; annual reports of organisations and church reports; periodical literature on foreign missions; and contemporary histories of societies and missions. Primary sources used for the purposes of analysing representations of identity include also annual reports and periodical literature, but also pamphlets, contemporary biographies of missionaries, and contemporary newspaper and journal articles. In using the periodical literature on foreign missions and the biographies of missionaries in this way in particular, a new source of information is exploited. Where previous researchers have drawn on this literature to some extent to provide factual accounts, this research uses this literature, not just to provide a fact-based narrative, but also to contribute to the construction of a picture of the patterns of organisational activity and membership of civil society organisations, and most importantly as the basis for an analysis of discourses of identity. In a similar way contemporary newspaper and journal articles are used for the analysis of discourses of identity. By bringing together this combination of sources, and using them in this way, it is possible to define the extent to which civil society organisational activity in this period connected with empire; to analyse the processes through which this activity produced and supported conceptions of identity, national or otherwise; and to analyse these conceptions

themselves in relation to the different interests they represented and how they changed over time.

Outline of chapters

Recent debates on the connection between Scottish national identity and empire are outlined in Chapter Two. While the economic and military aspects of participation in the empire have been most salient in the literature, religion is commonly thought to have played a significant role in empire and in the construction of Scottish national identity. Similarly, empire is assumed to have had a major impact on conceptions of national identity, but there has been relatively little exploration of how this actually occurred in terms of the propagation of representations or images of empire, how these were disseminated, and how they were received at home. It might then be supposed that claims that participation in the British empire had a significant impact on people in Scotland would be strengthened by identifying the extent to which people in Scotland demonstrated an active interest in empire, whether in specific aspects of this experience, or in promoting a specific vision of empire. Chapter Three explores the evidence of civil society associational activity linked to empire in 19th and early 20th century Scotland. This identifies a range of forms of associational activity in which an engagement with empire or imperialism was manifested: philanthropic organisations; learned societies; imperialist propaganda organisations; missionary societies and church organisations. Such organisations were motivated by different, though sometimes inter-related factors, such as the religious and moral concerns of anti-slavery and missionary societies. They were led by similar, and sometimes inter-related, groups of people, across the religious, philanthropic and secular spheres. Religious and moral concerns focussed both on the welfare of colonial peoples and the administration of empire, and persisted in various forms throughout the period. Enthusiasm for imperialism as such, which manifested itself also in various forms of civil society activity, was a more short-lived phenomenon of the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

Of civil society organisations and institutions missionary societies and the churches were the most significant, in terms of their longevity and membership. They also

differed in their institutional basis, being embedded following the Disruption of 1843 within the organisational structures of the main Presbyterian churches. In charting the growth of the missionary movement in Chapter Four, it is argued that the basis of its support derived from the opportunities it presented for middle class philanthropy, which reflected the class and professional status of its supporters. The involvement of women was a particularly important dimension of this, as over time they used this opportunity to extend their role in public and professional life. Discussions of Scottish participation in the British empire have had little to say about gender, either through analysing the place of women within this experience, or through analysing the masculine bias of its characteristic representations, or what these indicate about constructions of masculinity. Through the investigation of civil society, it is possible both to add women into the picture as agents, and to ask what place conceptualisations of gender roles and relations played in Scots women's and men's understanding of their role in empire and at home, and changes in that role are illustrated. Also illustrated are the processes through which understanding of empire was mediated, the forms of organisation and social base of their support. The pattern of associational activity, illustrated with reference to Edinburgh, is likely to have been reproduced in other Scottish cities, since Scottish wide networks for missionary support existed in all the main churches. Directed by the elites who governed urban Scotland, they were in a unique position to disseminate a vision of empire. The constant communication between missionaries abroad and supporters at home, and the continuous reaffirmation of the importance of the role of Scots within empire, demonstrates the iterative nature of this process.

Of the means by which ideas of empire were communicated, literature was the major form. Chapters Five and Six examine the dominant representations of identity in literature by and about missionaries, firstly representations of themselves and 'others', and secondly, representations of Scottish national identity. It is argued that identity is relational, always requiring 'others' against which to position itself, and that within the context of empire a range of markers of identity were at play, wider than the range of markers to be found within a British context. Thus the focus of otherness and difference became colonial peoples, against whom were contrasted

Christian, European and civilised Scots. Within the dominant discourses of religion, race, gender and class which are clearly discernible in this literature, there were also competing discourses, and thus a degree of ambiguity is present. However, the most stereotyped, or iconic, representations emerging in this literature were reflective of the values of middle-class Scots.

Analysis of expressions of national identity poses the question as to whether 'Scottish', 'British' and 'English' had the same meaning, and also the question of the relationship between them. The connotation of such terms, as articulated in this context, were not the same, and the richer and more varied usages of 'Scottish' identifiers underlines how this identity was privileged. Nonetheless, in the context of empire, where 'otherness' was located in colonial peoples and cultures, British and English identities were often seen as complementary to a Scottish identity and not in opposition to it. This context then is an important determinant of the negotiation of identity, and of the way in which shifts take place between similarity and difference.

The circulation and consumption of literature about the missionary experience was a key part of the activity of missionary societies and church organisations which supported foreign missions. In addition a biographical literature of leading missionaries was designed for a wider audience than church and missionary society members. Chapter 7 tracks the movement of representations of the missionary enterprise and its achievements evident in this literature into the secular sphere. In this process of transmission, the mediation of others was required, just as it was in the case of the construction of the heroic myth of Livingstone. Missionaries themselves were not so much self-promoters, as promoters of a cause, as were their supporters at home. The ideas they transmitted of their experience of empire followed a pathway to the secular sphere, in which others refashioned this experience to make claims on behalf of the Scottish nation. That missionaries could be appropriated as representing a specific Scottish contribution to empire was based on their Scottish Presbyterian faith, on their secular achievements in exploration and science, and on the capacity for this to be presented as a morally superior vision of imperialism. This transmission of representations of identity from the religious to the

secular sphere is indicative of the way in which links between such sites of production of identity are consolidated through social and institutional networks. The strength of the institutional base in which such representations were embedded was a crucial factor in their popularity, but their wider recognition beyond the religious sphere was conditioned by both class and political interests.

The thesis concludes by confirming the importance of religion for Scots in shaping an involvement in and understanding of the experience of empire. In illustrating processes through which empire had an impact on people in Scotland, it highlights the crucial role of institutional life and of civil society organisations, and within this the significance of the part played by women. It argues that the missionary enterprise provided the basis for the articulation of complex constructions of identity, amongst which a Scottish identity was strongly present. In turn these representations were appropriated within the secular sphere to embody claims of a specific Scottish contribution to empire. Such processes of identity construction are manifested through a range of discourses articulated simultaneously, to a greater or lesser degree in competition or complementing one another, and the negotiation of identity also constantly shifts between claims of similarity and difference. For these reasons, it is not possible to identify a unitary, universally shared idea of Scottish national identity, but at particular times and in particular contexts dominant or hegemonic discourses of identity may exist. Such dominant discourses require the underpinning of institutional and organisational life through which identity is constructed, reproduced, and reaffirmed. Where they are also underpinned by class and political interests, representations of identity generated in this context are likely to have both potency and a wide currency. It is argued that the Scottish missionary experience of empire provides an example of such a dominant discourse of Scottish national identity, which, embedded as it was in the institutional life of the Presbyterian churches, had the capacity to generate representations and symbols of Scottish national identity which were widely endorsed in both religious and secular spheres in the age of high imperialism.

Chapter 2: Empire, religion, and national identity

Introduction

Tom Nairn's *The Break-up of Britain* was a key text setting in motion a wide ranging and dynamic debate about nationalism and national identity in Scotland, and about the nature of the British state.¹ A similarly influential text, Benedict Anderson's *Imagined Communities*, has stimulated much debate on the process of construction of national identity.² Anderson argued that what ties people together in the shared identity of a 'nation' is neither territoriality, ethnicity, nor language, since there are always counter-examples which do not fit this model. Hence nations are 'imagined communities', created collectively by social groups, and 'imagined' in the sense of being created, not in the sense of being 'invented' which suggests fabrication. It follows from this imagined character of nations that national identities are produced by groups of people in given places at given times in history, and that these ideas can change over time.

This conception of identity creation as a dynamic and collective process has been applied to the understanding of identities in Britain, and its constituent nations of England, Scotland, Ireland and Wales, and the concept of 'Britishness' itself has been subject to scrutiny. Colley's view of the timing of the creation of 'Britishness' and its driving factors of war, Protestantism and empire, have gained a wide currency, and have informed debates on the nature of Scottish national identity.³ Within the growing literature in this field, it is common to find references to the role of empire in promoting the adoption by Scots of a 'British' identity, together with the view that the opportunities offered to Scots by empire secured adherence to the Union and the British state. In particular the view that Scots benefited greatly from their partnership with England in the Union, both through seizing opportunities in the metropolis and in the empire, is commonplace. The influence of Scots on the development of white settler societies, in particular in North America, has been a frequent focus of attention, with recent studies on emigration indicating the

¹ Tom Nairn, *The Break-up of Britain*, London, Verso, 1981, first published 1977.

² Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, London, Verso, 1983.

³ Linda Colley, *Britons: forging the nation 1707-1837*, London, Pimlico, 2003, first published 1992.

significance of these societies as a destination for Scots.⁴ With regard to colonial societies emphasis has been placed on careers to which Scots had access in the Indian civil service, to Scots' military contribution, and to economic opportunities, with the role of missionaries occasionally being mentioned. Much of the discussion of Scottish participation in empire, or references to this experience, takes place in the context of the debate about the place of Scotland within the British state, and about expressions of nationalism, political and otherwise, and indeed interest in the imperial experience has been stimulated by this debate. Detailed accounts of this experience are however relatively few, and therefore much comment on the impact of empire on Scottish society and identity still remains at a relatively general level.⁵ This chapter reviews selected literature on this theme, in particular works in which an explicit connection between empire and Scottish national identity is made.

The British Empire as a provider of opportunities for Scots

The theme of the empire as providing opportunities for Scots is a frequently recurring one, articulated by Nairn in the view that 'the Scottish ruling order found that it had given up statehood for a hugely profitable junior partnership in the new Rome'.⁶ Opportunities for careers in the empire began to grow in the mid 18th century, with Scots having access to careers in the colonial civil service, the army, in commerce, and later, as missionaries. Two aspects of this experience which are dominant in the literature are that Scots made a disproportionate contribution in terms of numbers, and that they had access to power and influence through imperial careers, though research on patterns of emigration has indicated that Scots from a range of social backgrounds emigrated for a range of reasons, and that not all were willing emigrants and not all were successful.⁷ Just as the view of the empire as offering opportunities is often generally stated, the canvas of empire is wide, encompassing white settler and colonial territories.

⁴ See Marjory Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles: the Great Scottish Exodus*, London, Profile Books, 2003; and T M Devine, *Scotland's Empire: 1600-1815*, London, Allen Lane, 2003.

⁵ For recent accounts of Scots' participation in the British Empire, see Michael Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, East Lothian, Tuckwell Press, and Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2001, and Devine, *Scotland's Empire*.

⁶ Nairn, *Break-up of Britain*, London, p 129.

⁷ See Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles*; and Devine, *Scotland's Empire*.

Writing about 18th century developments, Calder emphasises both the extent of the opportunities and the enthusiasm of the Scottish response: ‘Scots swarmed eagerly into the wide-open world’.⁸ In the West Indies Scots turned their attention to plantations, and by the late 18th century had acquired ‘around a quarter of all the taxable land on Jamaica’. India too ‘had its influx of Scots after the Union’, with political patronage being used to reward Scottish supporters, a phenomenon that is frequently commented upon.⁹ India became, as Scott described it, the ‘corn chest for Scotland’, and ‘It was primarily jobs and jobbery which lured Scots into the wider patriotism of an imperial mission’.¹⁰ Similarly, Colley emphasises the opportunities for Scots provided by the British empire, noting the ‘disproportionate number’ of Scots, particularly in the Indian civil service, attributing this to a number of factors. Well-born and well educated Scots had less access to the top jobs and careers at home than did similar Englishmen, and their relative poverty also provided a motivation.¹¹ Indeed, in eighteenth century Bengal, ‘where a majority of legal and financial agents were Scots’, they could become rich very fast.¹²

Though subsequently, in the mid-nineteenth century competitive examinations for the civil service might have restricted the flow of Scots into such jobs, by 1850 the empire had ‘produced a mass of desk and army jobs for the younger sons of Scots’.¹³ Indeed there was a range of possibilities open to Scots as businessmen, colonial governors, imperial civil servants, and missionaries.¹⁴ As a consequence of the Union imperial openings were created for Scots in ‘the armed forces, colonial administration, trade and the professions’, and thus ‘career openings were now much more abundant than before and the Scots were very keen to exploit them’.¹⁵

⁸ Angus Calder, *Revolutionary Empire*, London, Pimlico, 1998, first published 1981, p 285.

⁹ *Ibid.*, p 300.

¹⁰ Michael Lynch, *Scotland: a new history*, London, Century, 1991, p 388.

¹¹ Colley, *Britons*, p 128.

¹² Murray Pittock, *Scottish Nationality*, Basingstoke, Palgrave, 2001, p 83.

¹³ Michael Lynch, (ed), *Scotland, 1850-1979: Society, Politics and the Union*, London, 1993, p 5.

¹⁴ See Richard Finlay, *A Partnership for Good? Scottish Politics and the Union since 1880*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1997; ‘The rise and fall of popular imperialism in Scotland, 1850-1950’, in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1, March, 1997, pp 13-21.

¹⁵ Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 68.

Similarly, Morris and Morton note that ‘the growth of British imperial power provided major opportunities for many Scottish people and had a major influence on the direction which Scottish national consciousness was to take’.¹⁶ Morton also stresses the ‘jobs for the boys’ that were provided for Scots by Dundas and Islay in the 18th century, but notes that though the Scottish bourgeoisie and aristocracy found themselves in positions of power within England and the empire, opportunities were more available to Scots in the empire in comparison to the English who had greater access to opportunities in Britain.¹⁷ The empire continued to exercise its appeal for Scots in the 19th century, in particular for the middle class, ‘lured by Empire’.¹⁸ Scotland’s capitalists and business elite also benefited from both Union and empire and ‘Scots took the full opportunities which England and the Empire provided and were in no way confined to the subaltern tasks’.¹⁹ The theme of opportunities for Scots is also well represented in Michael Fry’s *The Scottish Empire*, given the numerous accounts of individual careers presented in its pages, and taking these up demonstrated ‘the usual Scottish quest for self-advancement’.²⁰

It has been noted that in the late 19th century claims of a Scottish contribution to empire became increasingly common. These often took the form of the claim of a disproportionate contribution from Scotland in relation to the size of the population. This theme has been repeated also in recent discussions of Scottish participation in the empire. Yet numbers can be hard to come by, and even where a ‘disproportionate’ contribution has been made by Scots, actual numbers may be small. For example, in the days of the East India Company, in the period 1776-1785 of 249 writers appointed to serve in Bengal, 119 were Scots (47 per cent). Between 1788 and 1800 of 298 writers appointed 107 were Scots (34 per cent). Also in the period between 1776-1885 of 254 assistant surgeon recruits 132 were Scots.²¹ More

¹⁶ R J Morris and G Morton, ‘The Re-making of Scotland: a Nation within a Nation, 1850-1920’, in M Lynch (ed), *Scotland, 1850-1979*, p 14.

¹⁷ Morton, *Unionist Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press, 1999, p 17.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p 9.

¹⁹ David McCrone, ‘Unmasking Britannia: the rise and fall of British national identity’, in *Nations and Nationalism*, 3 (4), 1997, pp 579-596, p 584.

²⁰ Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, p 73.

²¹ John Riddy, ‘Warren Hastings: Scotland’s Benefactor?’ in Geoffrey Carnall and Colin Nicholson, *The Impeachment of Warren Hastings*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1989, p 42.

generally within colonial administration, between 1850-1939 almost a third of colonial governor generals were Scots.²² Between 1758 and 1947, there were 33 Governors-General and Viceroy appointed. Two-thirds of these were English, and six (18 per cent) each were Scots and Irish.²³ According to Kirk-Greene, 'Above all the Scots stood out: Scotland and empire have long been as integrally associated as haggis and whisky'.²⁴ Figures he gives for the Indian civil service for the period 1914-1939, show that of entrants prior to 1914 those educated at Scottish universities accounted for 13 per cent of the total, while for the period between 1914 and 1939 they accounted for 8 per cent of the total, with actual numbers being 68 and 40 respectively. Compared to the numbers of emigrants leaving Scotland in the 19th century, these numbers are very small indeed. According to Harper, 1,841, 534 people left Scotland between 1825 and 1914 to emigrate to non-European destinations. An unknown proportion of these were Irish. Of these emigrants 44 per cent went to the USA, 28 per cent to Canada, and 25 per cent to Australia. The Scots diaspora of the 19th century went overwhelmingly to white settler territories, rather than those of the colonial empire.

Of more numerical significance than the Indian civil service was the military contribution that Scots made to the empire, and this is a major theme in the literature. Numbers however are patchy and suggest considerable variation over time. Devine cites the following figures, for example: between 1754 and 1784, of 14 royal regiments that served in India, seven had been raised in Scotland i.e. between 4000 to 5000 men;²⁵ in 1757 around a third of commissioned officers serving in North America were Scots,²⁶ while in 1797, Scotland provided 36 per cent of the volunteers for the British Army.²⁷ In 1782, of 116 cadets recruited for the officer cadres of the East India Company Bengal Army 56 were Scots (49 per cent).²⁸ Subsequently in the

²² Finlay, *A Partnership for Good?*, p 29.

²³ Anthony Kirk-Greene, *Britain's Imperial Administrators, 1858-1966*, London, Macmillan, 2000, p 206.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, p 17.

²⁵ Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 261.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, p 296.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p 297.

²⁸ Riddy, 'Warren Hastings: Scotland's Benefactor?', p 42.

period from 1788-1800, of 538 military cadets, 224 were Scots (41 per cent).²⁹ In the 19th century, there appears to have been a decline in the proportion of Scots serving in the British army. In 1830, with 10 per cent of Britain's population, Scotland contributed 13.5 per cent of the army.³⁰ Between 1830 and 1886 the Scots share of the army had dropped from 13.6 per cent to 8.1 per cent.³¹ Wood has commented that in the first half of the 19th century, Ireland became the major recruiting ground for the British army. Scots regiments found it more difficult to recruit, and in the 1830s and 1840s had started recruiting outside Scotland.³² In 1878, there were '19 "nominally Scottish" regiments, with only 3, all of these Highland, drawing as much as three-fifths of their officers and men from within Scotland'.³³ Though the share of the army being contributed by Scots declined in the 19th century, Scots nonetheless continued to exhibit enthusiasm for militarism, as evidenced by their participation in the volunteer movement. Following the launch of this movement in 1859, Scotland as a whole produced twice as many volunteers per head of the male population than any other part of the United Kingdom.³⁴ In Edinburgh this included separate Rifle Volunteer Companies of advocates, solicitors, bankers, merchants, and university staff, and in Glasgow, accountants, and journalists also formed separate companies. In Edinburgh the tradition of volunteer companies from the banks was to grow in strength until after 1914.³⁵ In general, such numerical data about Scots' participation in the empire remain limited, and this is an area which would benefit from more research. While sometimes Scots' share was 'disproportionate' this did not necessarily mean large numbers, and it is a pertinent question as to what this might have meant in terms of power and influence, though it must also be acknowledged that influence was not dependent on numbers alone, but rather political and social position, amongst other things.

²⁹ Ibid., p 42

³⁰ Stephen Wood, *The Scottish Soldier*, Archive Publications Limited in association with the National Museums of Scotland, 1987, p 55.

³¹ Victor Kiernan, 'Scottish Soldiers and the Conquest of India' in Grant G Simpson, (ed) *The Scottish Soldier Abroad, 1247-1967*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1992, pp 97-110, p 97.

³² Wood, *The Scottish Soldier*, p. 55.

³³ Kiernan, 'Scottish Soldiers and the Conquest of India', p 104.

³⁴ Wood, *The Scottish Soldier*, p 65.

³⁵ S G Checkland, *Scottish Banking: A History, 1695-1973*, Glasgow and London, Collins, 1975, p 492.

It is also a commonplace that benefits of empire extended beyond the careers of those abroad, since the empire was also the basis for the accumulation of wealth at home, with the economics of imperial expansion driving Scottish industrial development in the 19th century, and providing markets for the goods produced. Finlay refers to the designation of Scotland as the ‘workshop of the Empire’,³⁶ and others refer to Glasgow’s designation as the ‘second city of the empire’.³⁷ While it is clearly the case that empire was crucial to such industries as engineering and shipbuilding, and to textile towns such as Paisley in the west and Dundee in the east, it is harder to establish the extent to which other aspects of economic development were tied up with empire. Fry, though covering the range of types of careers that Scots pursued in the empire, argues that the Scots contribution was in essence a commercial one: ‘It beckoned Scots to exotic climes, where they did their business and left, content that they had achieved what they could, for they knew commerce to be the vehicle of progress’.³⁸ Merchants and commercial agents were amongst the beneficiaries, as examples discussed by Fry indicate, such as Jardine Matheson.³⁹ Riddy has also noted that of the 371 merchants being given residents’ permits by the East India company between 1776 and 1785, 211 (almost 60 per cent) were Scots.⁴⁰ In the early 19th century Scottish managing agents were involved in a number of commercial operations, the most important of which were jute, tea, shipping and railways, and banking.⁴¹ In the later part of the 19th century Scots investors put their money into a range of ventures in imperial territories, including India, Ceylon and Burma, though Australia, New Zealand, and above all, America, were more significant areas of overseas investment.⁴² Glasgow businessmen had commercial interests in Africa also in this period, such as the Miller Brothers trade in palm oil, and the financing of the African Lakes Company by industrialists such as Sir

³⁶ Finlay, ‘The rise and fall of popular imperialism’, p 16.

³⁷ Lynch, *Scotland, 1850-1979*; John M MacKenzie, ‘“The Second City of Empire”: Glasgow – imperial municipality’, in Felix Driver and David Gilbert (eds), *Imperial Cities*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1999.

³⁸ Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, p 494.

³⁹ See Fry, *The Scottish Empire*.

⁴⁰ Riddy, ‘Warren Hastings: Scotland’s Benefactor?’, p 42.

⁴¹ See James G Parker, ‘Scottish Enterprise in India, 1750-1914’ in R A Cage (ed) *The Scots Abroad*, London, Croom Helm, 1985, pp 191-219.

⁴² Bruce Lenman, *An Economic History of Modern Scotland*, London, Batsford, 1977, p 192.

William Mackinnon, though neither of these ventures were of much economic significance.⁴³

Though the theme of opportunities is most usually expressed at a general level, there has been some recognition that while this occurred across Scotland, it meant different things for different communities. For example, students from Aberdeen ‘contributed much to missionary work in India, and then began to see Africa as a field where sound Christian learning could be fruitfully applied to the skills of physicians, engineers and agriculturalists’.⁴⁴ Hargreaves argues, contrary to Lynch, that new careers opened ‘in the government of the British Empire’ after academic reforms enhanced the position of Scots students in competing in the civil service exams.⁴⁵ If the export of educated professionals was Aberdeen’s primary contribution, Dundee ‘lived in symbiosis with tropical empire’ through the jute industry that linked it to Bengal.⁴⁶ Indeed, ‘Scotland’s middle classes on balance did very well out of empire and its labouring classes were largely sustained by industries exporting from the empire or importing from it’.⁴⁷

The military contribution of Scots is also a prominent theme, and the creation of the image of Highlanders as the crack troops of the empire has been the subject of considerable comment, as has the fact that Scots soldiers made up a disproportionate share of the British army. Scots were central to imperial expansion, since ‘it was the military, and the Scottish soldier more than many, who was the agent of imperial expansion’.⁴⁸ The fact that ‘Scottish regiments were recruiting sergeants for British imperial and world wars’ led to a strong strand of militarism running through Scottish society in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.⁴⁹ ‘The hardy climate of the Highlands and centuries of perpetual clan warfare had acted as an imperial kindergarten and produced the finest troops in the British Empire’, according to

⁴³ See Thompson, W, *Glasgow and Africa, connexions and attitudes*, Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Strathclyde, 1970; also Tony Dickson (ed), *Scottish Capitalism*, London, Lawrence and Wishart, 1980, p 250.

⁴⁴ John D Hargreaves, *Aberdeenshire to Africa*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1981, p 2.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p 2.

⁴⁶ Angus Calder, *Scotlands of the Mind*, Edinburgh, Luath Press, 2002, p 181.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p 181.

⁴⁸ Pittock, *Scottish Nationality*, p 77.

Finlay, who argues that this military contribution was the most important factor in the propagation of a distinctive Scottish input to the Empire.⁵⁰ Similarly, Devine comments on the over-representation of Scots in a range of areas of professional employment, in particular in the senior military ranks. Furthermore,

The visibility of the Scots in the imperial project was further confirmed by their own attention to profile. As one of the most literate nations in Europe they publicized their achievements widely in the press and in books.⁵¹

The opportunities offered to Scots to demonstrate their military prowess within the context of empire has been interpreted as a major reason for the failure of Scottish nationalism to emerge as a major force in the 19th century. Scots were able 'to re-invent their national identity in ways which accommodated themselves to the British state and Empire'. In particular British imperialism was a

stage upon which they could vindicate and assert the romantic notions associated with mid and late nineteenth century European nationalism. Scottish military prowess and other examples of Scottish national virility were given ample opportunity for expression throughout the British Empire.⁵²

A corollary of this emphasis on the military contribution of Scots to imperial expansion is an emphasis on 'Highlandism' and 'the cult of tartanry' as a dominant form of the imagery of Scottishness. As Cameron has commented, 'It is a paradox of recent Scottish national identity that many of its most potent symbols have come from the Scottish Highlands'.⁵³ An important part of this process was the transformation of the image of Highlanders from a rebel army to 'staunch and heroic defender of the British Empire' which had occurred by 1815.⁵⁴ The Highlander was portrayed as a 'natural' soldier, with his warlike qualities which were once 'despised' coming to seem 'virtuous'. Indeed:

By 1881, the association between militarism and Highlandism was so strong that the War Office ordered all Lowland regiments, even those

⁴⁹ McCrone, 'Unmasking Britannia', p 591.

⁵⁰ Finlay, *A Partnership for Good?*, p 22.

⁵¹ Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p xxvii.

⁵² Richard Finlay, 'The rise and fall of popular imperialism', p 15.

⁵³ Ewen A Cameron, 'Embracing the Past: the Highlands in nineteenth century Scotland' in Dauvit Broun, R J Finlay, and Michael Lynch (eds), *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the ages*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1998, pp 195-219, p 195.

⁵⁴ Cameron, 'Embracing the Past', p 196.

whose past battle honours were gained in opposition to Highlanders, to wear tartan “trews” and Highland-style doublets.⁵⁵

Similarly, Devine has argued that a major part of the reassertion of Scottish identity in the late 18th century was the ‘cult of tartanry’, associated with the role of Highlanders as imperial troops.⁵⁶ Developing in the late 18th century, the association ‘between militarism, Scottishness and Britishness’ became an enduring one.⁵⁷ This Highlandism

was founded on changes of Scottish identity which had been shaped by the new world of union and empire. That context powerfully influenced the sense of Scottishness which evolved in the nineteenth century.⁵⁸

Given the scale of emigration from Scotland in the 19th century, which has been outlined by Harper,⁵⁹ it is hardly surprising that the image of the Scot seeking a fortune abroad is a common one. Factors which drove emigration were mixed, from poverty to enforced removal for some, while others were well enough ‘furnished with funds’, and possessed of skill and enterprise. Overseas economies were often more attractive than the low wage economy at home,⁶⁰ and emigration was actively supported at home by societies and agents.⁶¹ Amongst emigrants were a group that Harper has designated as ‘sojourners’, those whose period of residence abroad was temporary. For some this arose from the desire to make a fortune quickly, though others:

such as soldiers and missionaries, sojourned overseas out of duty or vocation, while a professional elite of doctors, teachers, clerics and administrators capitalized on an international demand for their expertise as they pursued careers around the globe.⁶²

⁵⁵ Charles Withers, ‘The Historical Creation of the Scottish Highlands’ in Ian Donnachie and Christopher Whatley (eds), *The Manufacture of Scottish History*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 1992, pp 143-156, p 150.

⁵⁶ Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*, p 353.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, p 356.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, p 360.

⁵⁹ Harper has indicated that almost two million people were sent from Scotland to non-European destinations between 1825 and 1914, amongst whom a significant proportion would have been Irish. Of these 97 per cent went to three destinations: the USA, Canada, and Australasia. See Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles*, p 3.

⁶⁰ See Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles*, p 71.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, p 274.

⁶² *Ibid.*, p 282.

This experience has led to the notion of a ‘tradition of emigration’. According to Colley there was a Scots tradition of emigration and seeking fortunes abroad. Thus there is evidence of ‘comparative Scottish poverty spurring on aggressive interest in British imperial expansion’.⁶³ Or ‘the dearth of domestic opportunities’ had led to ‘a national tradition [...] to seek them out abroad and come back the richer for having exploited them’.⁶⁴ Ascherson too emphasises a tradition of emigration underpinning the role Scots played in the growth of the British empire, since ‘partnership in the expanding British Empire’ offered ‘a luscious opportunity for Scotland’s established trading methods and for its already ancient tradition of emigration’.⁶⁵

That this experience has been productive of stereotypes has also elicited comment. For example, Donnachie acknowledges certain stereotypes came to dominate, and argues that the ‘traditional characteristics of the Scot on the make – ability, ruthlessness, determination, pride and clannishness’, could be found in other ethnic groups.⁶⁶ But the myth may have been generated by the fact that Scots ‘furth of their native land – stood out from the crowd by virtue of their numerical minority and socio-cultural cohesiveness’. Devine describes the representations of Scottish contributions, and of seizing of opportunities as feeding ‘the collective ego of a small nation’ which he sees as still lacking in confidence.⁶⁷ In particular views of the Scottish contribution to the USA and Canada are examples of ‘Scottish hype’, fuelled by ‘literate and noisy’ Scots.⁶⁸

The experience of empire was more mixed than is often suggested. According to Donnachie, the reality was that ‘enterprising Scots’ of the imperial era were a ‘mixed bunch’ and that for every successful enterprising Scot, whether at home or abroad, ‘there were certainly hundreds of failures’.⁶⁹ Fry’s account illustrates the variety of careers and experiences of Scots in the empire, and also the complexity and

⁶³ Colley, *Britons*, p 129.

⁶⁴ Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, p 73.

⁶⁵ Neal Ascherson, *Stone Voices: The Search for Scotland*, London, Granta Books, 2003, Revised edition, first published 2002, p 237.

⁶⁶ Ian Donnachie, ‘The Enterprising Scot’ in Donnachie and Whatley (eds), *The Manufacture of Scottish History*, pp 90-105, p 104.

⁶⁷ Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*, p 171.

⁶⁸ Quote from John MacKenzie in Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*, p 175.

ambiguity of this engagement, recognising that every Scot who represented the progressive Christian civilizer bringing education, ‘can be matched by an exemplar of different principles’.⁷⁰

Viewed as a provider of opportunity, however, the impact of empire has often been judged to have been very significant. For Fry, participation in empire has transformed Scotland ‘beyond recognition’.⁷¹ Devine also argues that the impact of empire on Scotland has been both profound and pervasive. Indeed:

So intense was the Scottish engagement with empire that it affected almost every nook and cranny of Scottish life: industrialization, intellectual activity, politics, identity, education, popular culture, consumerism, labour markets, demographic trends, Highland social development and much else. In a word, empire was fundamental to the moulding of the Scottish nation’.⁷²

There is then a consensus that the empire provided opportunities for Scots, who, seizing these, made a sizeable contribution to imperial expansion, though it is interesting to note differences of emphases, and the focus on different groups. Between them the writers referred to above mention most of the roles in which Scots contributed to empire – military, missionary, commercial, entrepreneurial, administrative. The tendency of these accounts of the opportunities made available to Scots through empire is to emphasise power, money, and physical force. It is argued that many Scots gained access to the former two, and proved adept at exercising the latter. Given that the context for most of such accounts is the place of Scotland within the British state and debates about the emergence and character of nationalism, the emphasis on access to power, influence and success is perhaps inevitable since this is offered as an explanation for adherence to the Union. Other dimensions of imperial experience remain more marginal. Missionaries are mentioned, occasionally, as a group for whom opportunities existed, but little else is said about this, despite the fact that religion is often seen as central to national identity, as indicated below. This could be explained by the fact that they are not

⁶⁹ Donnachie, ‘The Enterprising Scot’, p 105.

⁷⁰ John MacKenzie, ‘Hearts in the Highlands’, review of *The Scottish Empire*, in *Times Literary Supplement*, January 25, 2002.

⁷¹ Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, p 498.

⁷² Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*, p xxvii.

particularly numerous compared to other groups. Yet their influence could be significant. Where the impact of empire on Scottish society is discussed this refers largely to the economic consequences, which were of course important. As yet, however, how this experience was understood at home has been little explored, nor the influence it had on the development of intellectual contributions to, for example, medicine, science and engineering.⁷³

The development of a 'British' identity

There is a common view that following the Union Scots adopted a 'British' identity in addition to a 'Scottish' identity. The existence of opportunities within the empire is seen as an important contributory factor in this, along with a common Protestantism and the unifying force of the external threat of war.⁷⁴ The extent to which such a 'British' identity was adopted and the relationship of 'British' and 'Scottish' identities are, however, contested.

The terms 'Britain', and 'British' began to be used in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, and as early as the sixteenth century, Scots 'were quite largely responsible for promoting the concept of "Great Britain", and [...] were later instrumental in translating it into the lexicon of monarchical and state polity'.⁷⁵ Furthermore, when the term 'Great Britain' was first canvassed as a 'unifying title' for the kingdoms of Scotland and England it had 'already acquired an imperial connotation'.⁷⁶ The question of developing an idea of 'Britain' or 'Britishness' was not just one of people describing themselves, but also posed intellectual and cultural challenges, since this had to be created from disparate intellectual traditions. Indeed 'early seventeenth century contemporaries considering theories of empire were faced with the problem

⁷³ MacKenzie, *Times Literary Supplement*, January 25, 2002.

⁷⁴ See Colley, *Britons*.

⁷⁵ Raphael Samuel, *Island Stories: Unravelling Britain. Theatres of Memory, Volume II*, London, Verso, 1998, p 41.

⁷⁶ Samuel notes that the term 'British Empire' as such was an 'Elizabethan neologism' popularized enthusiastically and influentially by the Welshman, John Dee. See Samuel, *Island Stories*, p 48. Calder cites the example of Samuel Vetch, who surveyed Canada, making frequent use in his 1708 report of terms such as 'Great Britain', 'British trade' and 'British Empire'. See Calder, *Revolutionary Empire*, p 284.

of forging a new, *British*, identity', which entailed reconciling the different historiographical traditions of Scotland and England.⁷⁷

The more widespread use of the term 'British' to ascribe national identity is however regarded as having taken place in the 18th century: 'By 1750 most thinking Scots were [.....] prepared to consider themselves as both British and Scots'.⁷⁸ However this did not result in an incorporation of 'Scottishness' by 'Britishness'. Rather two new identities were being offered – a renewed sense of Scottishness and the more complete absorption of Scotland into a British state. By the 19th century the possible range of identities had become greater, 'a melting-pot of different, overlapping identities' forming themselves into 'the concentric loyalties of Victorian Scotland'.⁷⁹ These were 'a new Scottishness, a new Britishness and a revised sense of local pride' and 'were held together by a phenomenon bigger than all of them – a Greater Britain whose prosperity and stability rested on the Empire'.⁸⁰

Colley's thesis of the creation of a 'British' identity has been influential, and is frequently cited. She argues that it was in the century following the 1707 Union that 'a sense of British national identity was forged, and that the manner in which it was forged has shaped the quality of this particular sense of nationhood and belonging ever since'.⁸¹ In the 18th century a 'British nationalism' developed, and following Anderson's notion of an 'imagined community', it is possible to 'plausibly regard Great Britain as an invented nation superimposed, if only for a while, on to much older alignments and loyalties'.⁸² This superimposition existed 'over an array of internal differences in response to contact with the Other'. It did not come about 'because of an integration and homogenisation of disparate cultures'.⁸³ The newly forged Britain defined itself against the Other of a pre-dominantly Catholic Europe

⁷⁷ Charles W J Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity, Scotland since 1520*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001, p 37.

⁷⁸ Lynch, *Scotland: a new history*, p 343

⁷⁹ This idea of 'concentric loyalty' or 'concentric identity' is used by Smout, and originally derived from Anthony Smith. See for example, T C Smout, 'Perspectives on the Scottish identity' in *Scottish Affairs*, No 6, Winter, 1994, pp 101-113.

⁸⁰ Lynch, *Scotland: a new history*, p 359

⁸¹ Colley, *Britons*, p 1.

⁸² *Ibid.*, p 5.

⁸³ *Ibid.*, p 6.

and of France in particular. Thus Protestantism and wars were the defining factors in the creation of 'Britishness'. In addition to this, 'an exotic overseas empire' also helped 'Britons' to feel that they had an identity in common.⁸⁴

That these were the primary factors in contributing to the formation of a 'British' identity and its adoption by Scots appears to be widely accepted. Such an identity is seen to co-exist with a Scottish identity, usually in a way that is complementary, though sometimes causing tension. Support for the Union and for the empire, which was particularly strong among the business elite who benefited from both, was manifested, among other things, in an endorsement of a 'British' identity, though within the constituent nations of the UK there were quite distinct self-governing 'civil societies'.⁸⁵ McCrone agrees that this 'British national identity is a supranational identity deriving from an imperial past', and was created by warfare in the 18th Century, as Colley argues. This sense of Britishness worked with rather than against the grain of older national identities which were to persist, and which in the late 20th century have outlasted the later British one. The militarism of Scottish society in the late 19th and early 20th centuries helped to make Scottish and British national identities complementary, rather than as they later became, competing.

The relationship of 'British' and 'Scottish' identities

The nature of the relationship between 'Scottish' and 'British' identities has been conceptualised in a variety of ways, such as a 'superimposition' of the latter on the former, or as 'concentric identities', as indicated above. A dual nationality view is commonly subscribed to, even if there is a difference of opinion as to the balance between 'Scottish' and 'British' within this duality. By 1837, 'Scotland still retained many of the characteristics of a distinct nation, but it was comfortably contained within a bigger nation'.⁸⁶ As a result it was 'common to think in terms of dual nationalities, not a single national identity'.⁸⁷ The contrast with Europeans as a way of reaffirming a British identity remained important at this point.

⁸⁴ Ibid., p 7.

⁸⁵ David McCrone, 'The Unstable Union: Scotland since the 1920s' in Lynch (ed), *Scotland, 1850-1979*, p 45.

⁸⁶ Colley, *Britons*, p 373.

⁸⁷ Ibid., p 373.

Crick distinguishes these identities in terms of function and meaning. It may be 'sensible' to speak of 'a sense of dual nationality', but only if this difference in function and meaning is understood, since "Scottish" implies a comprehensive culture whereas 'British' implies an important but a far narrower set of relationships'.⁸⁸ He argues further that "Britishness" has a much more limited connotation than other concepts like Scottish, Welsh, Irish; or even English. "Britishness" connotes common political institutions, crown and parliament originally' and subsequently empire, which was attractive to 'ambitious Scots'.⁸⁹ Britishness therefore did not become a 'super-nationalism' as 'Scottish and English identities were still firm. Britishness was patriotic loyalty to the Crown and the Protestant succession and obedience to the laws; no more, no less' . He disputes that the term 'Britons' was ever popularly used except in contexts such as theatrical popular songs.⁹⁰

For Morton a dual identity was created by Scottish civil society, and 'sat astride notions of multiple identity (from family, to kin, to supranational organisations for example)'.⁹¹ The reproduction of Scottish imagery and symbols within civil society can be argued to constitute Scottishness, 'because they were the statements addressed primarily to Scots about the Scottish nation'.⁹² In Scotland there exists 'a multiplicity of personal identities', but 'also one national identity maintained through the institutions and civic culture of civil society, and another in the unthinking patriotism of the British state'.⁹³ Furthermore, 'There was no alternative for Scots than to regale themselves in Britishness when focusing their identity through Empire', though 'a Scottish accent to this symbolism was appropriate and indeed uplifting' as personified by Livingstone.⁹⁴ That Scots took advantage of economic opportunities, and that they supported imperialism, are acknowledged as ways in

⁸⁸ Bernard Crick, 'Essay on Britishness' in *Scottish Affairs*, No 2 Winter, 1993, pp 71-83, p 71.

⁸⁹ Ibid., p 80

⁹⁰ Ibid., p 81.

⁹¹ Graeme Morton, 'What if? : the significance of Scotland's missing nationalism in the nineteenth century, in Broun, Finlay, and Lynch (eds), *Image and Identity*, pp 157-176, p 160-161.

⁹² Ibid., p 167.

⁹³ Ibid., p 169.

⁹⁴ Ibid., p 162.

which Scottishness might have been manifested, but empire was ‘an identity of the British state and the British monarchy’.⁹⁵ In advancing this conceptualisation of a ‘dual identity’ Morton also offers a critique of Colley, whose view of ‘British’ identity is premised on the assumption of a British civil society and an overarching ‘British’ identity binding the dual identities together.

Another way of describing this duality is as a ‘bifurcation’. Indeed, the Earl of Rosebery was ‘a perfect personification of this bifurcation of the Scottish identity, where patriotic and national pride, comfortably sat beside the most virulent form of British imperialism’.⁹⁶ The patriotism being expressed by Rosebery was, however, a ‘Scottish’ rather than a ‘British’ patriotism, though it contained a guarantee of ‘loyalty to the centre’. However, this ‘dual national and imperial identity was not understood furth of Scotland’.⁹⁷ Commenting that changing interpretations of Scotland’s past have suited changing political imperatives, Pittock advances the idea of ‘imperial localism’, which he argues served as a counterbalance to British centralisation and standardisation. Through this Scots could express loyalty to both Scottish nationhood and empire.⁹⁸ This ‘imperial localism’ was shared by the four nations of the UK and settler colonies such as Canada and Australia as part of a ‘worldwide Britishness’. He further argues that Scottish imperial localism was a major and important part of Scottish identity.

The view of the complementarity of British and Scottish identities is not universally shared. One view is that Scottish identity was under threat from a British one. It has been argued that a Scottish identity was established many centuries ago: ‘The idea of a self-sustaining Scottish identity is first apparent by the later thirteenth century, and a self-conception by Scots as separate and different was clearer still from the early 1300s’.⁹⁹ Though a Scottish consciousness has had a ‘long and complex’ evolution

⁹⁵ Ibid., p 162.

⁹⁶ David S Forsyth, ‘Empire and Union: imperial and national identity in nineteenth century Scotland’ in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1, March, 1997, pp 6-12, p 9.

⁹⁷ Ibid., p 10.

⁹⁸ Pittock, *Scottish Nationality*, p 81.

⁹⁹ Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, p 240.

over time, it ‘was rooted in a deep sense of national identity’.¹⁰⁰ Despite this lineage, Ferguson sees Scottish identity as having been challenged in the nineteenth century by the ‘North British bandwagon’. This attitude, best exemplified by Thomas Carlyle in Ferguson’s view, ‘became dominant in Scotland in the second half of the nineteenth century’, and was a vision of ‘a predestined journey towards union with England and annihilation’.¹⁰¹ However, even at ‘the high noon of North Britishness’, it was still possible to find the affirmation of a distinctive Scottish identity, for example in the words of Robert Louis Stevenson, who claimed that Scots had an affinity for one another.¹⁰²

That a process of Anglicisation occurred in later 19th century Scotland has been debated particularly in relation to education and culture. Nairn has argued that the incorporation of Scotland into a British state produced a problem of cultural deformation, exemplified by the ‘kailyard’ school of literature, which he saw as particularly depending on the Scots diaspora within the empire. This process was also seen as being accompanied by a flight of the intellectuals to London.¹⁰³ This view has been contested by Beveridge and Turnbull, who have argued that Nairn, and others, have too readily accepted an ‘inferiorist’ view of Scottish history and culture that was prevalent in the late 19th century, though this was also contested at the time.¹⁰⁴ Such ‘inferiorist’ readings arose from a neglect of Scottish philosophical traditions, the defence of which is most associated with George Davie’s *The Democratic Intellect*. Davie’s view of the resistance to educational reform in the second half of the 19th century as a defence of a Scottish democratic tradition has in turn been contested, as has his view of the centrality of philosophy in what was a ‘long and complex process’ of educational reform as universities adapted to social change.¹⁰⁵ While Nairn and Beveridge and Turnbull may be seen as occupying different ends of the spectrum in terms of their evaluation of the health of Scottish

¹⁰⁰ Ferguson, *The Identity of the Scottish Nation*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1998, p 314.

¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*, p 314.

¹⁰² *Ibid.*, p 316.

¹⁰³ See Nairn, *The Break-up of Britain*.

¹⁰⁴ Craig Beveridge and Ronald Turnbull, *The Eclipse of Scottish Culture*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 1989.

¹⁰⁵ R D Anderson, *Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1983, p 361.

culture in this period, they share an understanding of Scottish and British, or English, identities as antagonistic.

The role attributed by Nairn to empire in sustaining this deformed culture is however a partial one in its reliance on the Scottish diaspora in white settler communities. Similarly, the idea of the flight of intellectuals to the metropolitan centre of empire in London, with its focus on art and literature, also takes too narrow a view. His position both ignores the experience of the somewhat different emigration patterns of colonial commercial, missionary, and administrative activity in India and Africa, for example, and the impact this experience had on other facets of intellectual activity, such as the development of the physical, medical and social sciences which took place in the 19th century. The ways in which Scots participated in the production of these forms of knowledge has been a relatively neglected area, but as a significant area of cultural production it deserves further attention.¹⁰⁶

By contrast with the view of a ‘Scottish’ identity being under threat from a ‘British’ one, Finlay, though acknowledging the co-existence of ‘British’ and ‘Scottish’ identities tends to emphasise the strength of the latter. Support for the Union and the empire ‘diverted Scotland away from internal division’ and characteristics such as loyalty, being principled, and heroic ‘could now be put to good use in the service of the British state and the Empire’.¹⁰⁷ A ‘concentric loyalty’ allowed Scots to compartmentalise their patriotism into Scottish and British components, neither of which was mutually exclusive:

Scottish nationalism was not only able to exist within the British state and Empire, it was actually extenuated and promoted by the British imperial ethos. The Scots were proud of their achievements as ‘Empire Builders’ and believed that the British Empire brought out the best of their national characteristics.¹⁰⁸

Devine also supports the view that a strong Scottish identity was asserted through a commitment to imperialism, and that:

¹⁰⁶ See John M MacKenzie, ‘Missionaries, Science and the Environment in Nineteenth-Century Africa’ in Andrew Porter (ed) *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Grand Rapids and Cambridge, Wm Erdmans Publishing Co, 2003, pp 106-130.

¹⁰⁷ Finlay, *A Partnership for Good?*, p 22.

It was in this arena that Scottish nationhood was reasserted and embellished. In the event, empire did not prove a threat to Scottish identity. Instead, the imperial project in the long run massively increased the nation's sense of self-esteem.¹⁰⁹

Change and variation in national identity

The construction of identity is acknowledged as a dynamic process. Lynch suggests that in the 18th century new identities were offered.¹¹⁰ Morton, too, is concerned to show the formation of national identity as a dynamic process, and that the creation of the nation out of ethnic symbols is a recurrent task demanding periodic review. For example, he notes that Scotland's view of herself as junior partner was accepted until the 1820s, but thereafter nationalist rhetoric began to argue that Scotland was emphatically an equal partner with England.¹¹¹ The use of Wallace and Bruce as symbols, and differences between the use of these symbols in the 18th and 19th centuries illustrates the change in self-perception from 'junior partner' status to equality with England.

Devine comments on the concern about Scottish identity apparent in the early 19th century, when urbanization was seen to 'undermine two of the major foundations of Scottish identity, the Presbyterian church and Scots education.'¹¹² The Disruption added to this sense of crisis, and 'Scottishness' had also been attacked by Enlightenment intellectuals. At a time when major institutions such as the law, church and education were all experiencing difficulties in adapting to a modern urban society, imperialism 'provided an alternative focus for Scottish national identity which helped to unify an increasingly divided nation'.¹¹³ In the late 19th century within the context of the crisis of Liberalism in Scottish politics, the debate on dis-establishment of the Church of Scotland, and the home rule debate, a 'new emphasis would be placed on Scotland's position within the "unity of empire"'.¹¹⁴ Arguments for greater efficiency in the administration of Scotland, put forward in

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p 9.

¹⁰⁹ Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 353.

¹¹⁰ Lynch, *Scotland: a new history*, p 359.

¹¹¹ Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*, p 17.

¹¹² Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 347.

¹¹³ Finlay, 'Popular imperialism in Scotland', p 13.

¹¹⁴ Forsyth, 'Empire and union', p 10.

favour of the creation of the Scottish Office, were tied into Scotland's role in the empire. Historians and politicians, such as Balfour of Burleigh, the Duke of Argyll, and Rosebery, 'emphasised that the Union enabled the Scots to make a distinctive *national* contribution to the history of Britain and the Empire'.¹¹⁵ Thus the changing political context at home was reflected in changing ideas of national identity.

Class could also be a factor influencing the adoption of identities. Thus elites, who benefited from empire and who inter-married with the English nobility, 'were attracted to the idea of Britishness', and developed 'a dual identity in which Scottishness and Britishness combined and interacted'.¹¹⁶ Less is known, however, about the extent to which 'Britishness' or British patriotism was adopted in other social classes. As Devine notes, 'no satisfactory study has yet been published on the extent of plebeian Britishness in Scotland'.¹¹⁷ Finlay, too, argues that conceptions of identity could vary with class and social position, and that the 'minimal impact of the British state on the lives of most Scots' meant that there was 'an alternative vision of Scottish and more importantly regional identity'.¹¹⁸ Within a military context regional or local identity was strongly reinforced by the organisation and recruitment of regiments from a local base. Local identity and imperialism might also come together in the conceptualisation of 'imperial cities'. MacKenzie comments that in pursuing the shibboleth of 'Second City' the Glasgow elite was

negotiating a distinct municipal identity, a means whereby a complex and potentially explosive ethnic mix could manufacture [...] an imagined community which defined itself in relation to Scotland, England, the UK and the empire.¹¹⁹

Much of the debate on the process of identity construction has focussed on distinguishing Scotland from England, or a Scottish identity from a British one. This has resulted in a situation where, according to Kidd, it has been made more difficult 'for historians to understand the processes underpinning British integration, not least

¹¹⁵ Richard Finlay, 'Controlling the Past: Scottish Historiography and Scottish Identity in the 19th and 20th Centuries', in *Scottish Affairs*, No 9, Autumn, 1994, pp 127-142, p 133.

¹¹⁶ Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 352.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p 352.

¹¹⁸ Finlay, 'Caledonia or North Britain?', *Scottish Identity in the Eighteenth Century*, in Dauvit Broun, R J Finlay, and Michael Lynch (eds), *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the ages*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1998, pp 143-156, p 151.

the role played by enthusiastic Scottish identification with the idea of Britain'.¹²⁰ Kidd illustrates how late 19th century debates on Celtic and Germanic 'races' constructed Lowland Scots as Teutonic and therefore closer to the Anglo-Saxon English than to the Celts, a position that posed problems for traditional interpretations of the Wars of Independence. The concern with Scottish 'racial' identity also reflected a wider debate on 'race' stimulated by the experience of empire.

The process of reconstruction of identities can also be seen at work in changes in and debates over usages in terminology. For example, the Scottish position in relation to imperial careers was often consolidated by inter-marriage between English and Scots elites, since for Scots 'this improved access to influence and power',¹²¹ and for some this led to the adoption of the terminology of 'English' to describe themselves, and 'England' to describe Britain. Fry notes that Livingstone often referred to 'England' rather than Scotland when referring to the 'nation', commenting that 'Doubtless he never meant the term literally, since England was already, at home and abroad, among Scots too, common shorthand for the British Empire'.¹²² Finlay outlines the controversy over the use of 'national' names towards the end of the 19th century, noting that more populist usages of 'England' and 'English' in England in the late 19th century, resulting from a redefinition of Englishness, provoked resentment among Scots. Balfour of Burleigh, for example, as Scottish Secretary made appeals to his fellow government ministers to use 'British' to refer to the state.¹²³

The range of factors influencing identity formation outlined above illustrate the challenges of attempting to analyse national identity, whether British or Scottish. Expressions of collective identities are influenced by political and social changes, and by the position in which individuals and groups are located, their allegiances and perceptions of where their interests lie. Different groups at different times play an

¹¹⁹ MacKenzie, "The Second City of Empire", p 232.

¹²⁰ Colin Kidd, 'Race, Empire, and the limits of nineteenth-century Scottish nationhood', in *The Historical Journal*, 46, 4, 2003, pp 873-892, p 874.

¹²¹ Colley, *Britons*, p 159.

¹²² Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, p 160.

¹²³ Finlay, 'Controlling the Past', p 131.

active role in promoting visions of national identity, whether through language, visual imagery, or other symbols. Different discourses of identity exist simultaneously, and may complement or compete with each other. Though a number of prominent discourses of national identity have been a focus of debate, as outlined above, others, such as religious discourses, also had a part to play.

Religion and national identity

Religion is seen as one of the key forces in shaping national identity in Britain and in Scotland, on the one hand providing the glue of common Protestantism for a British identity, and on the other as providing the basis of a distinctive Scottish Presbyterian identity. Colley has argued that in general religion was a unifying force in nations, in and outside Europe, and stresses the unifying role of Protestantism in Britain. For others the empire was important in providing Scottish Presbyterians with the opportunity to export their form of religion.

The missionary movement has been seen as having a number of functions. Scottish missionaries promoted education as the particular Scottish contribution to ‘the “civilising” effect of imperialism’.¹²⁴ Through the empire Scots could express their belief ‘that the special destiny that had given Scotland the lead in British Protestantism was now being extended throughout the globe’.¹²⁵ Scots ‘distinctive religious identity’ influenced their role in empire, and expressed a competitiveness with the English, ‘since the dynamic of the Presbyterian democratic ethos was seen to lie behind the more egalitarian and anti-privilege orientations of the educational and legal systems’.¹²⁶ Furthermore, Scots resisted the subordination of their religious institutions within empire, even though loyal to both Union and empire. ‘Religion [...] was a key dynamic in this for imperially minded Scots’, as is evidenced by disputes over the position of the established church of Scotland in relation to the established church of England in an imperial context.¹²⁷ The missionary movement

¹²⁴ Forsyth, ‘Empire and union’, p 7.

¹²⁵ Paterson, *Autonomy of Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1994, p 50.

¹²⁶ Graham Walker, ‘Empire, Religion and Nationality in Scotland and Ulster before the First World War’ in Ian S Wood (ed), *Scotland and Ulster*, Edinburgh, Mercat Press, 1994, pp 97-115, p 100.

¹²⁷ Forsyth, ‘Empire and union’, p 8.

has also been seen as useful in ‘focusing attention away from the religious divisions at home and the large areas of heathenism within the Scottish cities’.¹²⁸

Disagreements exist about whether or not religious divisions at home undermined the capacity of Presbyterianism to promote a sense of Scottish national identity. Brown comments that the religious divisiveness of Scotland is a problem for those in search of national identity, and he downplays differences between forms of religious adherence and experience in Scotland and England in favour of a class analysis, viewing Protestantism as fostering support for the Union.¹²⁹ Finlay notes that religion could be both central to a ‘common sense of British identity’, yet in Scotland a source of division.¹³⁰ Kidd suggests, however, that ‘Presbyterianism – its denominational divisions notwithstanding’ played an important role ‘in articulating Scotland’s sense of self’.¹³¹

These views on the role of religion tend to be stated in general terms. The role of missionaries is acknowledged, though research in this area remains limited. Surprisingly, Brown pays little attention to missionary activity abroad, despite his comment that the Highlands served as a dry run for the foreign missions in Africa and Asia.¹³² Fry includes brief accounts of the careers of leading Scots missionaries such as Robert Moffat, Alexander Duff, and David Livingstone. Macdonald discusses women’s role within the missionary movement, but her concern is with changing gender roles within the Presbyterian churches rather than with empire as such.¹³³ MacKenzie has explored the development of the myth of Livingstone in the context of rising imperialist and nationalist consciousness in the late 19th and early 20th centuries,¹³⁴ and has also pointed out that much work remains to be done on the

¹²⁸ Finlay, ‘Popular imperialism in Scotland’, p 16.

¹²⁹ Callum Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1997, p 184-5.

¹³⁰ R J Finlay, ‘Caledonia or North Britain?’, p 151.

¹³¹ Kidd, ‘Race, Empire and Scottish nationhood’, p 877.

¹³² Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland*, p 91.

¹³³ See Lesley Orr Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 2000.

¹³⁴ See John M MacKenzie, ‘David Livingstone: the construction of the myth’ in Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds), *Sermons and Battle Hymns: Protestant Culture in Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990; ‘Heroic Myths of Empire’ in J M MacKenzie (ed), *Popular Imperialism and the Military*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1992.

role of missionaries and the churches.¹³⁵ Thus, despite being seen as central to identity formation both at home and in the context of the empire, the role of religion has been little researched.

That religion has played a crucial role in the construction of national identity, of nations, and of nationalism has been advanced in different ways by both Anthony Smith and Adrian Hastings. Smith has argued that 'For the greater part of human history the twin circles of religious and ethnic identity have been very close, if not identical',¹³⁶ and that even within world religions, such as Christianity, there are links between forms of religious identity and 'ethnic cleavages and communities'.¹³⁷ In stressing 'pre-modern antecedents' of modern nations, which have helped to shape nationalism in the modern world, he has pointed to religious traditions as one of the key components of such antecedents. Religion can perform a number of functions. Religious identities derive 'from spheres of communication and socialization', involving culture, custom and rituals, which create communities across class boundaries.¹³⁸ Not only is organised religion important for ethnic survival potential, but religious reform movements can also stimulate ethnic 'self-renewal', with the Scots being cited as an example of this.¹³⁹ Like Smith, Hastings also regards religion as central to the understanding of nations and nationality, but goes further in arguing against the idea that these are modern phenomena. Rather he argues that the process of construction of nations took place much earlier, and that religion was integral to this process, 'perhaps even determinative'.¹⁴⁰ In particular, he argues that Christianity, through sanctioning the use of vernacular languages in the reading and interpretation of the Bible, provided through this text the 'original model of the nation'. For Hastings, 'nation, ethnicity, nationalism and religion are four distinct and determinative elements within European and world history', but, he argues, religion has been neglected in recent studies of nationalism. And though religion is

¹³⁵ J M MacKenzie, 'Empire and National Identities: the case of Scotland', in *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, Sixth Series, VIII, Cambridge University Press, 1998, p 224.

¹³⁶ Anthony Smith, *National Identity*, London, Penguin, 1991, p 7.

¹³⁷ *Ibid.*, p 7.

¹³⁸ *Ibid.*, p 6.

¹³⁹ *Ibid.*, p 37.

¹⁴⁰ Adrian Hastings, *The Construction of Nationhood: Ethnicity, Religion and Nationalism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1997, p 2.

not ‘single-faceted’ in relation to the construction of nations, it has been integral, and the history of religion demonstrates how religion, politics and culture interact.¹⁴¹ While the place of religion in Scottish history is recognised as having been central both in ‘common sense’ understandings of this history and in the work of historians, its contribution to the construction of identity has been taken more for granted than subjected to detailed scrutiny. Yet, if Smith and Hastings are correct, this subject must be a crucial area for investigation.

Summary of key themes

Anderson’s case for the process of construction of national identity as one of ‘imagining’ has been widely accepted, and can be seen to inform much of the literature discussed in this chapter. The role of empire in contributing to the formation of British identity is also widely seen as important. Indeed, participation in the British empire is said to have shaped both British and Scottish national identities. There is a consensus that empire created opportunities for Scots, though some aspects of this experience remain relatively unexplored. These accounts have tended to emphasise money, power, and military force. They have also often emphasised that Scots’ contribution was ‘disproportionate’. This may be one reason why the role of missionaries has been relatively neglected, since numerically this group was comparatively small, though evidence with regard to the numbers involved in other groups of imperial actors is patchy. The relationship between numbers and impact is not straightforward, however, since the class position of different groups and means through which they communicated ideas were likely to have been important determinants of their influence. Implicit in the focus on elites, power and success, is the view that it was the experiences of these groups that were particularly influential in constructing ideas about the Scottish contribution to empire. However, the wider experience of emigration was more mixed, whether permanent or temporary, in terms of the factors driving emigration, such as poverty or on occasion coercion, and in terms of the class origins of emigrants, and in terms of outcomes.

¹⁴¹ Ibid., p 2.

In general, the benefits to Scots of empire are regarded as having consolidated both support for the Union and a British identity, which co-existed with a Scottish identity. Colley's argument that Protestantism, war and empire were the key factors in 'forging' a British identity has gained wide acceptance, and Scots are understood to have held a dual national identity, though the balance between these can change as the construction of identity is a dynamic process. Though Scottish and British identities are usually seen as complementary, the balance between them is contested, with for example, the late 19th century being seen as on the one hand the 'high noon of North Britishness' and on the other as a period in which Scottish national identity was more assertively expressed through Scots' contribution to the empire. The relationship between British and Scottish identities has been characterised in different ways, if most commonly expressed as a 'dual identity'. Some formulations, such as 'concentric identities' imply a fixed and hierarchical relationship, albeit one which is capable of change over time, whereas others have argued for a much more fluid concept of national identity, which like other facets of identity, is both processual and relational, and which varies with context as different positions are negotiated. Distinctions have also been made between national identity and patriotism, and the question has been posed as to whether an expression of loyalty to the British state is the same thing as the expression of a British national identity. Much of the apparent tension between different characterisations of Scottish national identity and the different factors shaping it, might be explained by the different origins and timing of these expressions of identity. It can be argued that the tendency to present generalised accounts pays insufficient attention to the complexity of such constructions and to the co-existence of different discourses. Though a single unified conception of Scottish national identity may never have existed, some discourses are likely to have had a hegemonic power over others.

Despite a common recognition of the dynamic and differentiated character of identity formation, many statements about the nature of Scottish national identity in this period are still made at a general level, with the view that participation in empire allowed for a stronger assertion of Scottish national identity being prominent. Militarism and religion are regarded as the most important elements in this process,

though the religious dimension has been little explored. On occasion it is noted that gender is a facet of multiple identities, but discussion of national identity has seldom been accompanied by any gender analysis, despite the fact that much imagery of empire, especially military imagery, has a pronounced masculine character.

Religion, in particular, is said to have played a number of roles in relation to the formation of national identity, both contributing to a British identity through a common Protestantism, and to a Scottish identity through a distinctive Presbyterianism. There are differences of opinion on how much divisions within the kirk in 19th century Scotland undermined this sense of Scottish national identity, and to what extent religion was a source of competition between Scots and English within the empire. The export of Presbyterianism to the empire, carried out enthusiastically, not to say aggressively, is regarded as having reinforced a sense of Scottish national identity.

Civil society, empire and national identity

If a general thematic framework for the understanding of the contribution of the experience of empire to the formation of national identity has been established by the debates outlined above, it is apparent that many aspects of this long lasting and complex experience remain to be investigated. Though commonly asserted to be significant, there is a lack of definition of the impact of empire, with statistical data and numbers of Scots participants in empire in certain categories remaining limited, for example. With respect to claims of impact on people's thinking at home, there has been little that goes beyond identifying late 19th century claims of a disproportionate Scots' contribution, although exploration of representations such as the mythologisation of Livingstone and the imperial dimension of Glasgow's identity show the potential richness of sources for analysing this impact. Nonetheless much remains to be done in researching this aspect of Scottish experience, through investigation of the sources in which such representations might be found, whether written records, publications, visual representations, architecture and so on, and through investigation of the conditions of their production and consumption. It can be argued that for ideas of national identity to find support or common expression,

they require to be endorsed by groups of people in an iterative way, and to be grounded in collective action and communication. Such discourses of empire were produced in the political sphere, but also, and arguably equally importantly, within civil society.

It has been argued persuasively that civil society in Scotland has played a crucial role as a carrier of Scottish national identity.¹⁴² This was a consequence of the institutional autonomy retained by Scotland following the Union. A form of Scottish sovereignty was effectively embodied in the legal system and governing bodies of the Presbyterian churches, amounting in practice to a power ‘over these aspects of civil society that were felt to be essentially Scottish – education or Calvinist morality, for example’.¹⁴³ This separate civil society was thus underpinned by ‘The Scottish “holy trinity” of kirk, law and education’.¹⁴⁴ Within the organisations of civil society, religious and class concerns came together in supporting independent Scottish action, through which the governance of Scotland took place, and which encapsulated Scottishness.¹⁴⁵ At the same time this relative autonomy co-existed with support for the Union and with enthusiasm for the empire.

It might then be supposed that the ways in which civil society organisations engaged with empire or imperial concerns would provide evidence of how Scots understood their role in empire, and how they expressed their national identity in the context of empire. Such civil society activity might take a variety of forms, both secular and religious, from imperialist propaganda organisations, to intellectual and scientific societies, and to missionary societies and the churches. There has been a common emphasis on the role of religion and the churches in underpinning and energising voluntary associational activity, and in shaping a sense of Scottish identity. The Kirk, as the key institution within Scotland’s institutional nexus, ‘bridging divisions of class, profession, and regional and local affiliations’, was in a position to produce

¹⁴² See, for example, Paterson, *Autonomy of Modern Scotland*; McCrone, *Sociology of Nationalism*; Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*; Jonathan Hearn, *Claiming Scotland: National Identity and Liberal Culture*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 2000.

¹⁴³ Paterson, *Autonomy of Modern Scotland*, p 14.

¹⁴⁴ Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*, p 6.

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p 132.

dominant ideas and discourses,¹⁴⁶ and has been ‘probably the major influence in shaping a sense of national identity’.¹⁴⁷ And, it has been argued that it was through the ‘association with ‘Protestantism, the Empire penetrated to everyday life’.¹⁴⁸ That missionaries and the involvement of the churches in empire should remain neglected is surprising given the common assumption of the importance of religion in Scottish history and society, and in the light of historical work which has shown the centrality of religion to 19th century Scotland. The theoretical case for the importance of religion in the construction of national identity makes an investigation of this area all the more imperative.

If empire did indeed have a significant impact at home, it was not solely through economic benefits or consumption of commodities, but through how it was represented and understood. For these representations to have had an influence across Scottish society must have required the existence of forms of social organisation capable of transmitting such knowledge and representations. This gives every reason for supposing that missionaries and the churches at home did indeed play a crucial role in shaping an understanding of the experience of empire, even if they did not uniquely produce this understanding. This study of civil society organisations, in which missionary societies and churches take pride of place, illuminates the means through which empire was appropriated and understood by people at home by investigating how empire became a focus of associational activity. In particular it investigates how the missionary movement publicised and represented itself. The literature of this movement provides for analysis a repertoire of representations of identity which were continuously produced and negotiated by missionaries and their supporters throughout the 19th and early 20th centuries. It thus provides simultaneously the capacity for an exploration of the relationship between Scottish and British identities shaped by the experience of empire, and the capacity to assess the importance of religion in carrying these identities. This adds to our understanding of what it meant, at least for particular influential social groups, to be

¹⁴⁶ Hearn, *Claiming Scotland*, p 118

¹⁴⁷ Duncan B Forrester, ‘The church’ in Jim Crowther, Ian Martin, and Mae Shaw, *Renewing Democracy in Scotland*, Leicester, NIACE, 2003, p 58.

¹⁴⁸ Paterson, *Autonomy of Modern Scotland*, p 51.

Scottish in the 19th century, and allows common assumptions about the empire as a ‘forger’ of ‘Britishness’ to be tested.

Chapter Three: Empire And Civil Society Organisations

Introduction

A central aim of this research is to investigate ways in which Scots' experience of empire was transmitted to people in Scotland, and how such accounts and representations in turn affected conceptions of Scottish identity. In particular, the research has sought to identify civil society organisations in 19th and early 20th century Scotland which had an explicit engagement with empire or imperialism. In general, civil society may be defined as the 'zone of public life and interaction, between the family and the state',¹ though different definitions have been offered for this concept, or different emphases placed on different facets of civil society. Civil society has been seen as being in opposition to the state, or alternatively as a counter-balance to the state, or as a diverse set of organisations which might function to give the state legitimacy and which may themselves aim to influence the state.²

It has been argued that civil society organisations not only played a key role in the governance of 19th century Scotland, but also provided a locus for the construction of Scottish national identity.³ Given this, it seems pertinent to ask to what extent civil society organisations either focussed their activities on aspects of imperial experience or on imperialism as an idea, or to what extent they mediated ideas about empire. Evidence of any such activities and representations of the experience and meaning of empire should provide some means of gauging how concerned people at home were with the imperial experience and of what it meant to them. For my purpose here, the essential point about civil society organisations is that they afforded 'possibilities of concerted action and social self-organisation',⁴ and that, as such, they might be indicative of the active commitment of particular groups of Scots to particular visions of empire.

¹ Jonathan Hearn, *Claiming Scotland: National Identity and Liberal Culture*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 2000, p 20.

² See for example, Hearn, *Claiming Scotland*, 2000, p 19-21; and Graeme Morton, *Unionist Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press, 1999, Ch 3, pp 49-63.

³ Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*, 1999, p 8.

⁴ Bryant, quoted in Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*, 1999, p 8.

Previous research on how the experience of empire was understood in Scotland has indicated that Scots exhibited an active interest in empire through missionary societies and churches, and through their support for imperialist propaganda in a variety of forms, such as propagandist organisations, participation in the volunteer movement, and patriotic celebrations of military victories.⁵ An interest in or connection with empire was also manifested in the activities of learned societies such as the Royal Scottish Geographical Society (RSGS), and in exhibitions.⁶ As yet, however, much remains to be done in researching this field, and it has been acknowledged that missionary societies and the churches in particular have been neglected.⁷ Furthermore, much research on this topic has focussed on the period of high imperialism from the 1880s to the 1910s.

This research then set out to identify the range of ways in which civil society demonstrated a direct interest in empire throughout the 19th century and into the early 20th century. It also set out to identify who were the leaders and active supporters of organisations, the lifespan of organisations, and their activities. In doing so, the purpose was to establish the extent to which through these organisations and activities the empire became part of everyday life in Scottish society, and to ask how this influenced representations of national identity.

Relevant societies and organisations were identified through drawing on secondary literature, such as that referred to above, through Oliver and Boyd's *New Edinburgh Almanac*, and through key word searches of library catalogues. The *New Edinburgh Almanac* was first published in 1837 and throughout the period studied. As Morton has indicated it provides 'the most systematic and detailed guide to the institutions,

⁵ See, for example, John M MacKenzie, 'Empire and National Identities: the case of Scotland', in *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, Sixth Series, VIII, Cambridge University Press, 1998; Richard Finlay, *A Partnership for Good? Scottish Politics and the Union since 1880*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1997; 'The rise and fall of popular imperialism in Scotland, 1850-1950', in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1, March, 1997, pp 13-21; David S Forsyth, 'Empire and Union: imperial and national identity in nineteenth century Scotland' in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1, March, 1997, pp 6-12.

⁶ See John M MacKenzie, 'The provincial geography societies in Britain, 1884-1914' in Morag Bell, Robin Butlin, and Michael Heffernan, (eds), *Geography and Imperialism, 1820-1940*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1995, pp 93-124; and Charles W J Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001, pp 93-124.

⁷ See MacKenzie, 'Empire and National Identities'.

organisations and associations which existed in Scotland's capital' in this period.⁸ It also provided a catalogue of British and Scottish political and civil society organisations, as well as those local to Edinburgh. Information on missionary societies, church foreign mission committees or boards, including members and listings of missionaries, was regularly published in these; and listings of other societies, such as scientific and literary societies were used to identify empire related organisations such as the Edinburgh Unity of Empire Association. Of learned societies only the RSGS is discussed below, though it is evident that others, such as the Royal Botanical Society had imperial connections and interests. As throughout this thesis there is a focus on Edinburgh societies and Edinburgh based activities, though not an exclusive one, since almost all the organisations discussed below were part of Scottish wide networks, and sometimes of British ones.

Listings in the *New Edinburgh Almanac* provide only an approximate indication of the lifespans of organisations, and in some cases there appears to be no other evidence of a society's existence, as is the case with some of the Edinburgh based missionary societies (see the next chapter for a further discussion of these). Societies were not always listed from the date of their inception. For example, the Scottish Ladies Association for Female Education in India (SLA), and the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society (EMMS), were not listed till a few years after their foundation. Conversely some societies appear to have continued being listed, when their existence may have been only nominal, or only sustained by a handful of individuals holding formal directorships. This appears to have been the case, for example, with the Scottish Missionary Society in the decades following the Disruption, and with the Edinburgh Society in Aid to Moravian Missions.

Some organisations, such as the Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, and events such as the Edinburgh exhibitions, have left few records and therefore all sources identified were consulted. In the case of the anti-slavery movement, some primary sources were consulted, but the account here is based largely on C Duncan

⁸ Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*, p 65.

Rice's *The Scots Abolitionists*.⁹ Similarly in the case of the RSGS, some primary sources were consulted, but the account here has been substantially informed by the work of MacKenzie and Withers.¹⁰ A far greater range of primary sources has been used as the basis for the account of the missionary societies and church foreign mission activities, and for the analysis of the literature produced by these organisations, as will be outlined in succeeding chapters.

Given that, as this thesis will argue, missionary societies and church foreign mission activities were the most significant vehicle through which an understanding of empire was mediated for Scots at home, these will be discussed separately in the following chapter. In this chapter the forms of civil society activity which demonstrated a direct interest in empire fall into two broad categories: philanthropic activities motivated by religious and moral concerns; and secular organisations which were either inspired by enthusiasm for imperialism or manifested an interest in it.

Religious and moral concerns: philanthropy and empire

By the end of the 18th century the experience of empire had already made itself felt in the debates taking place in the intellectual circles and clubs of the Enlightenment. The nature of civilisation and the rights and wrongs of slavery were among the topics debated, and the influence of Enlightenment views can be seen in the formation both of the first Scottish missionary societies in the 1790s and of the anti-slavery societies of the 1820s and 1830s. Indeed the desire to ameliorate the condition of slaves was one of the motivating impulses of the missionary societies, whose early efforts involved sending missionaries to Jamaica and to Sierra Leone, and when anti-slavery societies were formed in Scotland their membership overlapped with that of the missionary societies.

In general Enlightenment thinkers have been judged to have played an important role in the elaboration of anti-slavery views, though ideas that formed the basis of

⁹ C Duncan Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, Louisiana, Louisiana State University Press, 1981.

¹⁰ MacKenzie, 'The provincial geography societies in Britain'; Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*.

scientific racism also emerged from their debates. Rice has argued that Scottish Enlightenment thinkers had arrived at a complete ‘consensus that ‘forced labour was both immoral and socially undesirable’, and that ‘their writings made a real contribution to Atlantic antislavery ideology’.¹¹ Devine, similarly takes the view that Scottish intellectuals contributed to the end of the slave trade in 1807, and the emancipation of slaves throughout the British empire in 1833.¹² According to Fry, however, the origins of scientific racism can plausibly be sought in the Scottish Enlightenment, even in the works of Hume.¹³ A reassessment of the Enlightenment’s antagonism to slavery has been argued for by Blackburn, who takes the view that ‘the pseudo-science of racial anthropology’ was encouraged as a replacement for the religious justifications of slavery that were no longer convincing, and ‘such enlightened dabblers as the Scottish lords Kames and Monboddo’ contributed to this, with Hume, too, casually employing ‘racial stereotypes derogatory to Africans’.¹⁴

Among Scots in the Caribbean there were both critics of and apologists for slavery.¹⁵ A number published denunciations of slavery, among them Zachary Macaulay, who became a leading abolitionist and subsequently governor of the colony of liberated slaves founded in Sierra Leone.¹⁶ Though attitudes both at home and abroad to slavery were then both mixed and contested, by 1830 ‘disapproval of slavery could be assumed in all respectable and literate Scots homes’.¹⁷ Rice has commented, however, on the paradox of the strength of the intellectual case against slavery in Scotland, and the lack of active campaigning on the issue at a time when Scots might themselves be benefiting from this economically. The role of Scots in the Caribbean slave economy, according to Devine, remains controversial, though he argues that there was greater involvement in this than previously assumed is beyond doubt. Thus, he shares Rice’s view that there was a paradox between anti-slavery theory at

¹¹ Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, p 19.

¹² T M Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*, Allen Lane, 2003, p 248.

¹³ Michael Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, East Lothian, Tuckwell Press, and Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2001, p 76.

¹⁴ Robin Blackburn, *The Making of New World Slavery*, London, Verso, 1997, p 590.

¹⁵ See Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, and Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*.

¹⁶ See Devine, *Scotland’s Empire*, p 248.

¹⁷ Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, p 23.

home and practice abroad.¹⁸ Indeed, it was not until emancipation in 1833 that the anti-slavery movement in Scotland really took off. Furthermore, when it did its major focus was the campaign to abolish slavery in America.

In its early days however, it was the practice in the British colonies in the West Indies that was the focus of concern. Anti-slavery committees were founded in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen in 1823, to lobby the government for reform, and to publicise abuses.¹⁹ Their publications included attacks on West Indian planters for their treatment of slaves, and complaints about the resistance of planters to the Christianisation of slaves.²⁰ Thomas Chalmers, who advocated a gradualist approach to abolition, noted that the predicted effects of the abolition of the slave trade had not come about: 'Both Liverpool and Glasgow have survived an event which, in the belief of many, was to annihilate them'.²¹ His proposal for slaves to gradually buy their freedom was, however, displaced by the enthusiastic response to the 'immediatist position' first enunciated by Edinburgh minister, Andrew Thomson in 1830, who also denounced the sale in Edinburgh of West Indian estates. This sale included 'negroes' listed amongst the stock, like cattle, and to add insult to injury was to take place 'in the metropolis of the land of Bibles, of enlightened and Christian Scotland'.²²

These societies were transformed into Emancipation societies in the early 1830s, and were part of a British network. Though it had been the situation in the West Indies that first generated the anti-slavery movement, the major focus of anti-slavery activity very quickly became slavery in America, and it was this issue that attracted the greatest support in Scotland. Abolitionists, however, 'remained concerned over the West African slave trade', and as late as the 1880s, 'they were still prepared to

¹⁸ See Devine, *Scotland's Empire*, p 247; Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, p 19.

¹⁹ See Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*; see also Edinburgh Anti-slavery Society, *First Annual Report*, 1824; Edinburgh Anti-slavery Society, *Address to the Public by the Committee of the Edinburgh Anti-slavery Society*, 1826.

²⁰ Edinburgh Anti-slavery Society, *Address to the Public*; Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Negro Slavery, *The Abolitionist*, No 1, Jan 2, 1832.

²¹ Thomas Chalmers, *A Few Thoughts on the Abolition of Colonial Slavery*, Glasgow, Chalmers and Collins, 1826, p 4.

²² Andrew Thomson, *Speech delivered at a meeting of the Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Slavery*, Edinburgh, William Whyte and Co, 1830, p 22.

campaign vigorously against the East African traffic'.²³ Despite such attention to empire, however, the dominant concern was with America, and despite the signs of activity in the 1880s, Rice argues that the movement was effectively over by the 1860s, after the final phase of enthusiasm prompted by the American civil war and its consequences. Furthermore, by the sixties 'The Scottish reform public, stimulated by the discoveries of David Livingstone, had meanwhile returned to its original interest in the African slave trade'.²⁴ This anti-slavery stance remained an important strand in support for foreign missions.

As noted there were overlaps in membership between missionary societies and anti-slavery societies, and as the anti-slavery movement became embroiled in bitter factional disputes it is possible that some members preferred to pursue their philanthropic objectives through support for foreign missions. The history of the anti-slavery movement in the decades between the 1830s and the 1860s both in Britain in general, and in Scotland in particular, is one of convoluted disputes and splits, over the more radical and religiously unorthodox views of some of its leading activists, including a nascent feminism and ideology of women's rights drawing on anti-slavery discourses. In Scotland the anti-slavery movement became a vehicle also for the expression of differences between different Presbyterian denominations and sects, which gave rise to some heated controversies, most notably the 'Send Back the Money' campaign, which arose in the 1840s in response to the acceptance of money from Presbyterians in the slave-owning South by the newly formed Free Church. Indeed, 'For most evangelical Scots, the controversy was a means of acting out the bitter tensions of their own church history'.²⁵

A later dispute, in 1854, over the acceptance into communion by United Presbyterian missionaries at Old Calabar of African slave-holders did not arouse nearly so much controversy, perhaps because 'the missionary problem was too touchy for the churches to become heavily involved in'. While few churches had, like the Free Church, been able to raise money from the American South, 'all relied on sending

²³ Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, p 17.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, p 194.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, p 146.

out some of their young ministers as missionaries'.²⁶ To have applied anti-slavery principles rigorously in such circumstances would have reduced drastically the native congregations, and in the event the United Presbyterian Mission at Old Calabar did not change its practices.

A further source of tension was the views espoused on women's rights. The concerns expressed about the position of women linked the anti-slavery movement with 'the powerful evangelical missionary movement to which women gave so much support',²⁷ and the type of depictions of the 'degraded condition of women in heathen countries' common to missionary literature were also adopted by the anti-slavery movement.²⁸ Evangelical Christian women, however, preferred to separate themselves from some of the more radical elements in the movement, with a split occurring in Edinburgh in 1853, and a new organization, 'largely composed of evangelical women from the United Presbyterian and Free Churches' being formed.²⁹ A motivation for this may have been that such women found themselves more comfortable as supporters of missionary activity within their churches, rather than in a divided movement which also might have posed challenges to their religious and political views.³⁰

Though many towns in Scotland supported anti-slavery societies at some time, it was only the societies in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen that 'had a continuous working existence'.³¹ The leaders of these societies were members of the urban middle class, and often prosperous. In Edinburgh they were primarily members of the professions, whereas in Glasgow they were more likely to have commercial or business interests. Committees were peopled with 'city reformers prominent in other good causes', the majority of whom were evangelicals and dissenters from outside

²⁶ Ibid., p 149.

²⁷ Louis Billington and Rosamund Billington, 'Women in the British Anti-Slavery Movement', in Jane Rendall (ed.), *Equal or Different: Women's Politics, 1800-1914*, Oxford, Blackwell, 1987, pp 82-111, p 88.

²⁸ Ibid., p 83.

²⁹ Ibid., p 105.

³⁰ Ibid., p 105.

³¹ Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, p 35.

the Church of Scotland.³² This is evident, for example, in the membership of the Edinburgh society of the 1820s, among whose members were leading evangelicals, advocates and doctors, several of whom were to become key supporters of foreign missions, such as the Rev Robert Gordon, later convenor of the board of Foreign Missions in the Free Church, and founder members of the EMMS, Dr John Abercrombie, and Dr William Beilby.³³

The anti-slavery movement in Scotland experienced its phase of effective action from the 1830s to the 1860s. It was not of course a purely Scottish movement, but part of a British movement that was closely linked to North American campaigns. Rice has commented on how this movement was shaped by distinctively Scottish concerns and characteristics. It provided a vehicle for the Scottish religious disputes that produced the Disruption, with some activists linking patronage and slaveholding as distorted forms of property ownership.³⁴ It can be interpreted also in religious terms, as a concern over moral autonomy, the loss of which was represented by slavery. And it can be interpreted as a response to social change and the anxiety produced by urbanisation and the growing numbers of the 'unchurched poor'. Rice has also argued that the concentration on America was a response to Scotland's position in British society, since campaigning did not have to be mediated through Westminster as it had in the campaign for abolition of slavery in the colonies.³⁵ This suggests on the one hand, that the movement had a distinct Scottish identity, though this may have been implicit rather than explicitly articulated or claimed as such, and on the other that this sense of Scottish identity led away from an imperial focus. Arguably, however, the ending of slavery in the British empire in 1833 meant inevitably that the focus of campaigning shifted towards other societies and peoples who continued to practise it. Scots remained concerned with slavery in West Africa, as missionaries' accounts show, and in the latter decades of the 19th century the aim of abolishing the Arab slave-trade in central and east Africa became a motor of both missionary and imperialist expansion. What is apparent is that anti-slavery views

³² Ibid., p 41.

³³ See Edinburgh Anti-slavery Society, *First Annual Report*, 1824

³⁴ Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, p 39.

³⁵ Ibid., p 197.

remained an important part of the vision of supporters of foreign missions, and that abolitionist energy continued to be channelled through these. To what extent campaigners changed their organisational allegiance because of the disputatiousness of the anti-slavery movement would be hard to say, though that organisation on denominational lines became the norm suggests that this was an easier form of organisation to negotiate. That the initial engagement with empire by civil society was based on religious and moral concerns is however demonstrated by the emergence of both missionary societies and anti-slavery movements within the same period, and by their inter-related concerns and overlapping membership.

Religious and moral concerns about the opium trade in China were also displayed in the much more fleeting existence of locally based anti-opium campaigns, though this issue, like slavery, continued to surface in the pages of the missionary periodicals. Britain ‘yearly sent vast amounts of the drug from India to China and used the revenues from the trade to finance the government of India’, and was prepared to use force of arms to continue this lucrative trade.³⁶ Anti-opium campaigning first emerged in Britain around the time of the Second Opium War (1856-1860), was relaunched in the 1870s and continued in some form or another until the opium trade was officially abolished in 1917.³⁷ Campaigners exposed the effects on Chinese people of the use of opium, and protested against the government’s extracting revenues from the export of opium from India to China.

Scots who had lived in China played a part in publicising the consequences of the trade, most notably Donald Matheson, ‘a nephew of the cofounder of the great trading house of Jardine Matheson’,³⁸ who became ‘a leader in the anti-opium movement’.³⁹ According to Fry, the ‘devout Donald kept company with missionaries, who filled him with guilt about opium’, and consequently he resigned

³⁶ Kathleen Lodwick, *Crusaders Against Opium: Protestant Missionaries in China, 1874-1917*, Kentucky, University Press of Kentucky, 1996, p 3.

³⁷ See Hunt Janin, *The India-China Opium Trade in the Nineteenth Century*, Jefferson, North Carolina and London, McFarland and Company, 1999.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, p 1.

³⁹ Lodwick, *Crusaders Against Opium*, 1996, p 55. According to Lodwick, another Matheson, Hugh, had in 1834 ‘refused to join the firm because of its involvement in the opium trade’, see p 193, fn 69.

his partnership in the company in 1848.⁴⁰ Not only did he condemn opium as a scourge, he argued that as such it ‘has proved one of the greatest obstacles to the reception of Christianity by the Chinese’.⁴¹ While calling on the ‘British public’ to help remove the ‘evil’ of the trade, he did not oppose ‘opening up China by force of arms to the benign influences of Christianity, civilisation, and legal commerce’. He also defended British merchants against the charge of being ‘a set of lawless buccaneers’. They were rather ‘as respectable a class of merchants as can be found in any part of the world’, and were ‘driven to acquiesce’ in the trade.⁴² The Rev James Johnston, who had served as a Free Church of Scotland missionary in China also contributed to this debate with his eyewitness account of the trade. Like Matheson he described the effects of opium on its users, and noted the wealth of the opium merchants in Hong Kong, though was less inclined to excuse them.⁴³ Matheson appears to have remained active in the anti-opium lobby for several decades, and gave evidence before the Royal Commission in 1893.⁴⁴

To judge by the paucity of records, this activity had a relatively low profile in Scotland, though there was an Edinburgh committee, which came into existence in the mid to late 1850s.⁴⁵ Amongst the Edinburgh activists was the Rev G D Cullen, also a board member of the EMMS, which collected signatures for a petition against the trade, presented to Parliament in 1857,⁴⁶ and Scots missionaries continued to contribute information about the effects of opium, such as the papers for circulation on the opium traffic brought to the notice of readers of *The Helpmeet* in 1891 or the description of the hospital in Ichang with its ward for ‘repentant opium smokers’ in *News of Female Missions* in 1903.⁴⁷

⁴⁰ Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, p 311.

⁴¹ Donald Matheson, *What is the Opium Trade?*, Edinburgh, Thomas Constable and Co, 1857, Second Edition, p 20.

⁴² *Ibid.*, p 23.

⁴³ A series of letters by Rev James Johnston, appeared as *The Opium Trade in China*, by an Eyewitness, London, Heaton and Sons, 1858.

⁴⁴ See Lodwick, *Crusaders Against Opium*.

⁴⁵ The East of Scotland committee appears to have been founded in 1855. See John Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, Edinburgh, EMMS, 1991.

⁴⁶ The text of the petition is contained in Matheson’s pamphlet. For the EMMS petition, see Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, 1991, p 27.

⁴⁷ See *The Helpmeet*, No III, July, 1891, and *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 65, May, 1903. Lodwick also notes the involvement of Scots missionaries. See Lodwick, *Crusaders Against Opium*, 1996.

In the first half of the 19th century religious and moral concerns respecting the empire and its administration formed a focus for associational activity in Scotland, through missionary societies, and later the main Presbyterian churches, through the anti-slavery movement, and through short-lived organisations such as the Edinburgh Anti-Opium committee. With respect to the anti-slavery movement, after its first decade, there was limited interest in empire, with attention being concentrated on America. There were overlapping interests and membership between these organisations, which were driven largely by middle-class evangelicals. In Edinburgh, in particular, the leadership of such organisations was made up of professionals such as ministers, doctors and lawyers. Women were also active in the anti-slavery movement, forming separate female emancipation societies, and that they were interested in the anti-opium campaign is evidenced by the reporting of this in women's missionary periodicals. The evidence suggests that up until around the 1860s, while such civil society organisations at home mediated the experience of empire in various ways, they did not seem to explicitly articulate a Scottish identity, either in specifically attacking Scottish perpetrators of abuses or exploitation, or as organisations. As will be seen in the following chapter on missionary societies and church support for foreign missions, religious and moral concerns continued to be a major determinant of interest in empire throughout the 19th century and into the 20th century. Continuing concern over these issues was thus expressed through the foreign missions movement as the century advanced, and increasingly concern also found expression in the political sphere, for example, with the aim of abolition of the slave trade in Africa providing an argument for imperial expansion.

Imperialist enthusiasm and civil society

In the latter part of the century interest in empire was expressed in the secular as well as in the religious sphere, in particular in enthusiasm for imperialism as such from the 1880s onwards. As I will argue in Chapter Seven the foreign mission enterprise was also important to this, both making its presence felt in secular activities, and in fuelling the assertion of Scottish identity within an imperial context, and in this sense provides a link between religious and moral concerns and secular support for

imperialism. Evidence of support for imperialism within civil society was manifested both in organisations and events such as exhibitions. Discussed below are the activities of the RSGS, imperialist propaganda organisations, and international exhibitions.

The Royal Scottish Geographical Society

The impact of the experience of empire on scientific knowledge of various kinds – zoology, botany, medicine, geology, geography – means that it is likely that this would have been reflected in several learned societies’ deliberations and proceedings. The Edinburgh-based Botanical Society⁴⁸ for example had members in imperial territories, collected specimens from abroad, and furnished the African Lakes Company with the coffee plants from which cultivation of coffee in Nyasaland originated.⁴⁹ However, only the Royal Scottish Geographical Society (RSGS) is discussed here, as it appears to be distinctive in having been formed at least partly under the influence of imperialist sentiment. Certainly, in the period between its foundation in 1884 and the First World War, the RSGS provided a forum for debates on imperial expansion and policies, albeit within the context of exploration, the increase of geographical knowledge, and application of scientific techniques to the investigation and classification of natural phenomena.

Given its origins and membership at its foundation, the salience of imperial themes is hardly surprising. David Livingstone’s daughter, Agnes, and her husband, A L Bruce, were founder members of the society, having been first approached by John George Bartholomew, of the Edinburgh map-making firm, with plans for a geographical society in July 1884.⁵⁰ It first met in October of the same year, and amongst its founder members were represented commercial and industrial interests,

⁴⁸ The Botanical Society, instituted in 1836, was listed as having local secretaries in Madras, the Cape of Good Hope, and Jamaica, in the *New Edinburgh Almanac*, Edinburgh, Oliver and Boyd, 1841. James Africanus Beale Horton, of Sierra Leone, who graduated from Edinburgh University in 1859, was a Foreign Fellow of Edinburgh’s Botanical Society. See George Shepperson, ‘An Early African Graduate’ in Gordon Donaldson (ed) *Four Centuries: Edinburgh University Life, 1583-1983*, Edinburgh, University of Edinburgh, 1983, pp 92-98, p 94.

⁴⁹ See W Robertson, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, London, James Nisbet, 1892, p 43.

⁵⁰ See J J V Kuitenbrouwer, ‘“The Crowning Chapter of Geography”: The Royal Scottish Geographical Society and the Scramble for Africa, 1884-1893’, Doctoral thesis, University of Amsterdam, 2002.

church and missionary interests, colonial administrators, cartographers and geographers, academics, the town council, and landed gentry and politicians.⁵¹ This is indicative of how the society brought together leading players in the major institutions of the time, political, secular, and religious, and also of the overlapping networks in which such individuals participated, a ‘coalition of social, political and civic forces’ similar to those which established geographical societies in Manchester, Liverpool, Tyneside, Southampton and Hull at around the same time.⁵² The RSGS had four branches, in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Aberdeen, and rapidly built up a substantial membership, which was successfully maintained between its foundation in 1884 and the First World War.⁵³ Of the four branches Edinburgh was by far the largest and most prominent.

The Royal Geographical Society of London had been founded in 1830, and this group of later ‘provincial’ geographical societies that sprang up in the 1880s, were according to MacKenzie ‘founded in a mood of defensive reaction’, produced by the anxiety associated with recession, and by the place of Britain in the competition for the world’s resources.⁵⁴ The explicit aims of the Scottish Geographical Society, at its foundation in 1884 (it was to become ‘Royal’ in 1887), were to demonstrate ‘the utility of geography’, to support exploration, publish explorers’ accounts and other material of a scientific nature, to develop Scottish topography and to develop ‘the discipline of geography within higher and other branches of education’.⁵⁵ Developments in Africa were a prominent concern of the RSGS in its early years, both those of exploration and science, and of the wider question of imperial

⁵¹ This included shipowners Sir William Mackinnon and Sir Donald Currie of the British India Line and Castle Line respectively; James Stevenson, the businessman who funded the building of the ‘Stevenson’ road between Lake Nyasa and Lake Tanganyika; church and missionary interests – Dr George Smith, Convener of the Free Church Foreign Mission Committee, and author of biographies of missionaries, histories of missions, and a geography of India; Rev Prof. Blaikie, author of the biography of Livingstone, and later of Dr Laws of Livingstonia; and John Lowe, long-standing member of the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society; former colonial administrators – Sir Charles Aitchison, and Sir William Muir (who had also become Principal of Edinburgh University that year); cartographers and geographers, T B Johnston and John Bartholomew, and Professor Geikie of Edinburgh University; Lord Provost Clark of Edinburgh; landed gentry and politicians, such as Lord Balfour Burleigh and the Earl of Rosebery, who was President. See *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 1, 1885; and see also MacKenzie, ‘The provincial geography societies in Britain’.

⁵² MacKenzie, ‘The provincial geographical societies’, p 101.

⁵³ For details of membership figures see MacKenzie, ‘The provincial geographical societies’, p 108.

⁵⁴ MacKenzie, ‘The provincial geographical societies in Britain’, p 95.

strategies and the extension of British power. H M Stanley, in his inaugural address, emphasised that a geography society was not just ‘an ornamental addition to a great city’, but it should be ‘from a utilitarian point of view’ something of ‘real use and interest’.⁵⁶ Urging the ‘capitalists of Scotland’ to take up the commercial opportunities presented by Africa, Stanley concluded by enjoining his listeners to ‘gather yourselves together into Geographical Societies to impart the knowledge of the science more widely, that it may quicken energy and inspire enterprise’.⁵⁷ Though imperial policy was a live concern which could give rise to impassioned debate, such debates also provided a vehicle for making claims about the significance of the role of Scots in African exploration and development. Among other interests a strong concern was shown with ‘Scottish concerns such as the missions and philanthropic companies in the Nyasaland region’, which the society described ‘with some justification’ as a ‘Scottish colony’.⁵⁸ It was the fate of this region of Africa that was a particular, though not exclusive, focus of debate. Many of the leading members shared this ‘fashionable fascination’ with Africa, and also ‘pressed for government protection for British missionary, commercial and settler interests on the continent’.⁵⁹

MacKenzie has described the ‘provincial’ geographical societies as a manifestation of ‘municipal imperialism’, which combined imperial and commercial objectives. They stimulated public enthusiasm by bringing ‘celebrated travellers and propagandists to their localities’, awarded civic honours, and honorary degrees.⁶⁰ In the Scottish case they helped to fund expeditions. Most of these societies were, he argues, the product of a specific moment, in particular that moment at which the future of Africa was controversial, and did not survive this period. However, the character of the Scottish society as an ‘intellectual and learned body’, benefiting ‘from the status of Edinburgh as a centre of great scientific endeavour’, explains the

⁵⁵ Ibid., p 96.

⁵⁶ H M Stanley, ‘Central Africa and the Congo Basin: Inaugural address delivered before the Scottish Geographical Society at Edinburgh, 3rd December, 1884’ in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 1, 1885, p 3.

⁵⁷ Ibid., p 17.

⁵⁸ MacKenzie, ‘The provincial geographical societies’, p 101.

⁵⁹ Ibid., p 101.

⁶⁰ Ibid., p 122.

survival of the RSGS (which is still in existence), though it was ‘founded for essentially national and imperial reasons’.⁶¹

Arguably the ‘national’ dimension was equally important from the start. Withers has cautioned that ‘much current work offers too simple and, even, too celebratory a reading of the connections between national identity and geographical knowledge in “imperial Scotland”’, and he stresses how some of the developing geographical practices, such as botanical surveys and geological mapping, and mapping of racial and linguistic characteristics, while also bound up with empire or applied in imperial territories, were applied in Scotland to questions of national identity.⁶² The latter had parallels with ‘that racialised knowledge then informing geography’s “imperial mission” and the development of ethnography and anthropology as particular disciplines’.⁶³ However, scientific knowledge in the field was also put into practice in Scots’ exploration of their own country. This interest in mapping, classifying, and defining Scotland and its relationship to the wider world can be linked to the promotion through geography of ideas of ‘global citizenship’, as exemplified in the work of Patrick Geddes. For example, Geddes’ plans for the Outlook Tower in Edinburgh in the 1890s sought to organise the related spaces of Edinburgh, Scotland, the empire and English speaking countries, Europe, and The World, on successive floors.⁶⁴

The RSGS then provides a significant example of a civil society organisation in which support for imperialism was part of its formative impulse, and in which concerns with imperialism and its development, and the role of Scots within this, were both explicit and prominent, as will be discussed in a later chapter. Such concerns also informed ideas of Scottish national identity, which were

⁶¹ Ibid., p 111.

⁶² Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, p 197. For a discussion of the prevalence of theories of race in a late 19th century Scottish context, and their application to Scotland, see Colin Kidd, ‘Race, Empire, and the limits of nineteenth-century Scottish nationhood’, in *The Historical Journal*, 46, 4, 2003, pp 873-892.

⁶³ Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, p 197.

⁶⁴ See Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity* ; also Helen Meller, *Patrick Geddes: social evolutionist and city planner*, London, Routledge, 1990. Geddes was to later spend some ten years in India from 1914, further developing his ideas on the links between culture and ‘organic’ design and architecture.

simultaneously being developed by the application of geographical practices at home. A network of branches existed in the Scottish cities, with Edinburgh occupying a prominent position, and the Society functioned as a nexus of civil society interests, represented by leading members of the respective interest groups. Though a secular society, church leaders and missionaries played an active role, both in the governance of the organisation, and as contributors to scientific knowledge and to debates on imperial policy. As with other societies discussed here, women were involved in the RSGS. Agnes Livingstone was, as noted, instrumental in its foundation, and it was to admit women as Fellows before the Royal Geographical Society did so.⁶⁵ As teachers of geography, many women also took up associate membership of the society.⁶⁶ Indeed, as Withers has pointed out there was a long tradition of women being taught geography, from the 18th century onwards, though it is not known whether they came together in any informal or institutional fora before the late 19th century.⁶⁷

Imperialist propaganda organisations

The growth in imperialist sentiment from the 1880s to the early 1900s was demonstrated not just by the prominence of imperial affairs in politics and parliament, but also in the related activities of imperialist propaganda organisations. In this period, and particularly in the 1890s, enthusiasm in Scotland for imperialism was strong, as a consequence of its economic benefits, the churches support for the “civilising” mission of Imperialism’, and Scots participation in the administration of the empire.⁶⁸ Within the political sphere, the question of support for imperialism was to assume particular significance within the dominant Liberal party in Scotland, with differences of opinion being dramatically brought to a head during the course of the South African War (1899-1902). In the earlier stages of the South African War, such

⁶⁵ For example, Isabella Bird Bishop. Born in Yorkshire, Bishop had a longstanding connection with Scotland, married an Edinburgh doctor, and through him became an active supporter of the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society. See Evelyn Kaye, *Amazing Traveller, Isabella Bird: The biography of a Victorian adventurer*, Colorado, Blue Penguin Publications, 1994.

⁶⁶ See, for example, *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 1910, where it is noted that Teacher Associate Membership was created in 1906, with the aim of promoting the teaching of geography in schools, and that such Associates included ‘Lady Teachers’.

⁶⁷ See Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, p 253.

⁶⁸ Stewart J Brown, “‘Echoes of Midlothian’: Scottish Liberalism and the South African War, 1899-1902’ in *Scottish Historical Review*, lxxi, 1992, pp 156-183, p 158.

imperialist enthusiasm was demonstrated by jingoist demonstrations in several Scottish cities, but by the end of the war there had been a change in public mood, as a consequence of its costs in terms of lives and money, and unease about the treatment of Boer women and children in crowded and insanitary camps, which had resulted in a high death toll. This also led to political realignments, with the Scottish Liberals in particular turning away from imperialism and directing their efforts to reform at home.⁶⁹

A number of such imperialist organisations existed in Scotland, though none was specifically Scottish, but rather branches of British organisations, and overall there appear to have been fewer than in England.⁷⁰ In Scotland, though records are few, there is evidence of an Edinburgh and East of Scotland branch of the Imperial Federation League,⁷¹ an Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association,⁷² and of some involvement in Edinburgh in the United Empire Trade League.⁷³ The Primrose League and the Victoria League, which were women's organisations, both operated in Scotland.⁷⁴ That so few records exist may suggest that some of these Scottish branches were relatively short-lived, though further research is needed to establish this with any certainty. It is notable however that those organisations led by politicians and professional men were the smallest and most short-lived, while the women's organisations lasted longer and attracted larger memberships.

The Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, formed in 1895, appears to have been linked to the Unity of the Empire League, and to have regarded itself as a

⁶⁹ See Brown, "Echoes of Midlothian".

⁷⁰ MacKenzie cites around 12 imperialist organisations existing at this time. See John M MacKenzie, *Propaganda and Empire*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1986, Chapter 6, pp 147-172.

⁷¹ A speech by Rosebery was published by the Imperial Federation League. This had been given at a public meeting in Edinburgh, 'under the auspices of the Edinburgh and East of Scotland branch of the Imperial Federation League', on 31 October, 1888.

⁷² See Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, *Report of Fourth Session, 1898-1899*, and *Report of the Executive Committee for the year ending March 1898*.

⁷³ See United Trade League leaflet with map of British empire and trade routes, Edinburgh, 1902. This was published by the Edinburgh map-making company of W and A K Johnston.

⁷⁴ For a brief account of the Primrose League in Scotland, see Catriona Burness, 'The Long Slow March: Scottish Women MPs, 1918-1945' in Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon (eds) *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society, 1800-1945*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1992, pp 151-173. For the Victoria League see *The Victoria League in Scotland, 1907-1957*, Edinburgh, 1957;

successor to the Imperial Federation League, which had existed from 1884-1893. With the Earl of Rosebery as its President, the committee was comprised of politicians, and senior representatives of the leading professions in Edinburgh, including medical, legal, academic, and the ministry.⁷⁵ The aim of the Association was to provide free lectures ‘to bring home to all minds the importance of the British Empire’, and ‘to impress upon the public conscience the greatness of the responsibility now confronting the British race in its Imperial inheritance’.⁷⁶ Its key propagandists were University professors and lecturers, though several advocates also were speakers for the Association. Lectures were given to a range of clubs and societies, predominantly party organisations.⁷⁷

That empire and imperialism were of interest not just to male political activists and professionals is demonstrated by the existence of organisations such as the Primrose League and the Victoria League. The Primrose League ‘did more perhaps than any other society to generate an emotional and uncritical enthusiasm for Empire’.⁷⁸ Founded in 1883, and named after what was declared to be Disraeli’s favourite flower, it organised celebrations, pageants and popular entertainments on imperial themes. Though it claimed to be non-party, it had been founded by leading Tories, and ‘re-embraced the party in 1913’.⁷⁹ The League attracted both female members and working-class ‘associate’ members. Indeed, ‘the League had brought socialising into politics, and in its wake, a mainly female membership of over one million’.⁸⁰ In 1885 a Scottish branch was formed, making a considerable contribution to League membership. In 1908 the League claimed a Scottish membership of 100,476, a figure

and Eliza Riedi, ‘Women, Gender, and the Promotion of Empire: the Victoria League, 1901-1914, in *The Historical Journal*, 45, 3, 2002, pp 569-599.

⁷⁵ For example, among the committee members of this Association were several Lords and MPs, Mitchell Thomson, the Lord Provost of Edinburgh, and Sir William Muir, Principal of Edinburgh University. See Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, *Report of Fourth Session, 1898-99*, Edinburgh, 1899.

⁷⁶ Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, *Report of Fourth Session, 1898-99*, Edinburgh, 1899, p 2.

⁷⁷ For example, Unionist Clubs, Conservative Associations, Liberal and Liberal-Unionist Clubs, and literary and kindred associations, including the St Cuthbert’s Working Men’s Guild and the Young Men’s Christian Association. See Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, *Report of Fourth Session, 1898-99*, Edinburgh, 1899.

⁷⁸ MacKenzie, *Propaganda and Empire*, p 149.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p 150.

⁸⁰ Burness, ‘The Long Slow March: Scottish Women MPs, 1918-1945’, p 154.

treated with scepticism by Burness, as there was evidence of difficulty in sustaining its membership and activities. Women's Unionist Associations were proving more attractive and by 1918 these had overtaken the League's role, with the League in Scotland being wound up about this time.⁸¹

The Victoria League, was more clearly 'non-political' than the Primrose League, and was led by both Tory and Liberal 'ladies'. Founded in 1901, its main activities were philanthropy to war victims, hospitality to colonial visitors, and empire education.⁸² It formed links with women's organisations in Dominion territories, and was dedicated to 'spreading accurate information about the history and general conditions of the Dominions "to all parts of the kingdom and all classes of society"', and also promoted settler schemes.⁸³ The Victoria League also had a Scottish organisation, which continued to be active at least until the late 1950s, though little is known about it. One of the first branches established outside London was in Nairn in 1902,⁸⁴ and there were subsequently branches in Edinburgh and St Andrews.⁸⁵ The founders of the Edinburgh branch (founded in 1906) were, like the original organisers in London, titled ladies for the most part.⁸⁶ This group sought the endorsement of leading male public figures, securing as their Chairman Sir William Turner, Principal of Edinburgh University. In its early years the Edinburgh branch's main energies appear to have been directed towards imperialist education in schools. In 1908 the branch was put 'fairly and squarely on its feet' with the presentation of Union Jacks to the 50 Edinburgh Board Schools. A ceremony, in the McEwan Hall on 22 February, 1908, was 'unforgettable in all its stages', with Rosebery making the presentations before an audience of 1500 school children.⁸⁷ The League continued to lobby for

⁸¹ Ibid, p 154.

⁸² Riedi, 'Women, Gender, and the Promotion of Empire', p 569.

⁸³ MacKenzie, *Propaganda and Empire*, p 152.

⁸⁴ Riedi, 'Women, Gender, and the Promotion of Empire', p 576.

⁸⁵ A brief account of the Victoria League in Scotland was published in 1957, indicating the longevity of this organisation in Edinburgh. This account focuses mainly on the work of the League in providing facilities and hospitality for service men in both World Wars, and for returning Prisoners of War at the end of the Second World War. See *The Victoria League in Scotland, 1907-1957*, Edinburgh, 1957.

⁸⁶ For example, Lady Wallace; Anna, Countess of Moray; Lady Helen Munro Ferguson; Lady Susan Gordon Gilmour; Lady Grainger Stuart; and her daughter Alice. See *The Victoria League in Scotland*, 1957.

⁸⁷ *The Victoria League in Scotland*, p 5.

imperialist input to schools, persuading the Edinburgh School Board to celebrate Empire Day in all their schools some years later. Having supplied speakers for such Empire Day events, the League judged that ‘the whole undertaking was highly successful’.⁸⁸ Recently such interventions in the school curriculum have been judged to have been part of a process of the suppression of Scottish history in Scottish schools, and its replacement by ‘imperial re-education’ designed to socialise working-class children as Empire flagwavers.⁸⁹

It is not clear to what extent such activity may have been supported throughout Scotland, though clearly support for some of these organisations, such as the Victoria League, was concentrated in Edinburgh. There is no indication in the records consulted that a Scottish identity was claimed or promoted in the activities of such organisations, though further research is required to establish whether or not this was the case. Brown has claimed that ‘The Liberal Imperialist vision had called for the subordination of Scottish national identity to the mission of the British imperial state’, and it is clear that Liberal Imperialists were among the key activists in these organisations.⁹⁰ Conservative support was also prominent in the women’s organisations, in particular, and this was likely to have been strongly Unionist as well as imperialist. Yet Rosebery, the leading Liberal Imperialist, did stress the Scottish contribution to empire and Scottish identity in his speeches. In a rectorial address to Edinburgh University, for example, he declared that there was no difficulty in reconciling Scottish nationality with loyalty to the centre, and indeed that Scottish patriotism guaranteed this.⁹¹ Scotland was one “‘one of many nations” that constituted the imperial family of the British empire’.⁹² Morris has illustrated how Empire Day displays could simultaneously invoke Scottish and British symbols, with a photograph of the 1902 celebrations in Aberdour in which the Scottish Lion rampant was ‘central to the celebration of the British Empire’.⁹³ Furthermore, claims

⁸⁸ Ibid., p 6.

⁸⁹ R D Anderson quoted in W W Knox, *Industrial Nation*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1999, p 139.

⁹⁰ Brown, “‘Echoes of Midlothian”, p 182.

⁹¹ Forsyth, ‘Empire and Union: imperial and national identity in nineteenth century Scotland’, p 9.

⁹² Ibid., p 10.

⁹³ R J Morris, ‘Victorian Values in Scotland and England’ in T C Smout, (ed), *Victorian Values*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, pp 31-48, p 38, and p 40 (photograph).

of Scottish contributions to empire and of Scottish leadership were made at this time in various fora, in some of which leading members of imperialist organisations, such as Rosebery and Sir William Muir, also played a role. Muir, in his inaugural address as Principal of Edinburgh University, pointed out to his audience the ‘numbers of our countrymen holding high and distinguished place in the administration of India’, proceeding to name Grant Duff, Fergusson, Aitchison and Hunter. Alexander Duff, too, was eulogised as ‘the first to light the torch of learning amongst the people of India’.⁹⁴ This litany of prominent Scots in India was offered as inspiration to Edinburgh students. Such evidence suggests that recognition of the Scottish contribution to empire was commonly expressed and was not a matter of dispute, though views on political strategies and structures which would most effectively reward Scotland for this contribution were not unanimous.

All of these imperial propagandist organisations came into existence in the period when ‘popular imperialism’ was at its height. This was also a period in which debates raged about home rule for Ireland and Scotland, and about the place that such administrations might have within the empire, for example, as part of an imperial federation together with the white Dominions. The majority were short-lived, with only the Victoria League surviving well into the 20th century. Most of these organisations were political, if some were non-party, and even the Victoria League appears to have provided a route into public life for some women, though it is not known whether this was the case in Scotland.⁹⁵ That leading members of such organisations were church members can be taken for granted, and that some were prominent in their churches is likely. Given in particular women’s enthusiasm for missionary work at this time, it is likely that there was an overlap between active supporters of foreign missions and the imperialist women of the Primrose and Victoria Leagues. Some leading members of imperialist propaganda organisations were also leading lights in the RSGS, which suggests that the Scottish contribution to empire would have been afforded recognition, even in the context of the promotion of the British empire.

⁹⁴ Sir William Muir, *Inaugural Address*, 27 October, 1885, p 15-16.

International exhibitions

Further evidence to support the contention that a Scottish national identity was frequently emphasised in relation to empire at this time is afforded by the representation of Scotland in the series of international exhibitions that took place in the same period. The fashion for such exhibitions in general was initiated by the Great Exhibition of 1851, held in London, the theme of which was international industrial development. From the 1880s such exhibitions ‘came to have a predominantly imperial flavour’, as befitted ‘the decade of the new aggressive imperialism’.⁹⁶

In the major Glasgow exhibitions of 1888, 1901 and 1911 (and also in the 1938 exhibition) ‘empire and Scottishness’ predominated.⁹⁷ For example, in 1888, empire was represented by exhibits such as an Indian Bazaar, Canadian, Ceylonese, and Burmese courts, while Scottishness was represented by industrial products, models of ships and engines, and historical exhibits, and Scotland was also promoted as a tourist destination. The 1901 exhibition similarly included colonial exhibits, while the 1911 exhibition was ‘specifically designed to promote the Scottish cultural renaissance’.⁹⁸ These exhibitions can be seen then, as ‘principally concerned with negotiating the identities of Glasgow, Scotland and the empire’.⁹⁹

It was Edinburgh, however, that hosted the first exhibition ‘on a large scale, which has been held in Scotland,’¹⁰⁰ and the traditional rivalry between Glasgow and Edinburgh seems to have been at work in driving the ambition of the Glasgow exhibition of 1888, which sought to surpass the Edinburgh exhibition of 1886 in both scale and numbers of admissions.¹⁰¹ The imperial dimension to the Edinburgh exhibition appears to have been less prominent, however. An idea originally

⁹⁵ See Riedi, ‘Women, Gender, and the Promotion of Empire’.

⁹⁶ MacKenzie, *Propaganda and Empire*, p 97.

⁹⁷ John M MacKenzie, ‘“The Second City of Empire”: Glasgow – imperial municipality’ in Felix Driver and David Gilbert, (eds) *Imperial Cities*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1999, p 227

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, p 228.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, p 227.

¹⁰⁰ *Cameron’s Guide through the International Exhibition of Industry, Science and Art, (and Old Edinburgh)*, Edinburgh, 1886.

¹⁰¹ MacKenzie, ‘“The Second City of Empire”’, p 227.

broached at the Edinburgh Merchants' Association two years previously, it had succeeded in attracting the support of the Lord Provosts of both Edinburgh and Glasgow, the Duke of Roxburghe, the Earl of Aberdeen, and the Earl of Rosebery, among others, with a Ladies Section being organised under the guidance of the Duchess of Buccleuch.¹⁰² 'Foreign exhibits' were mostly of European origin and few in number, and the exhibition served primarily to demonstrate the achievements of industrial manufacture at home, to illustrate scientific and technological developments such as the generation of electric light, and to display domestic arts and crafts. It was, however, 'used as a display site by many Scottish geographical companies – Bartholomew the map-makers, the Morison firm of globe makers from Glasgow', as well as by the RSGS itself.¹⁰³ A further imperial connection was demonstrated in the 'stationery and printing' section, an exhibit that included the contents of 'a couple of cases sent by the Free Church of Scotland, containing articles sent home by their missionaries from Livingstonia, in Central Africa'.¹⁰⁴ In addition to African artefacts, 'the emblems of peace are present in the shape of portions of Scripture and several class-books, printed by the missionaries in the Chinyanja language',¹⁰⁵ hence no doubt the reason for inclusion of these articles in the stationery and printing section.

A subsequent exhibition in Edinburgh in 1890 had as its main attractions a programme of concerts, scientific demonstrations, locomotives and machines, a fun fair and firework displays, with, apart from a Japanese village, the international exhibits being largely European in character.¹⁰⁶ A third international exhibition held in Edinburgh was the Scottish National Exhibition of 1908. An important part of the national identity that was projected at this exhibition was the military contribution of Scottish regiments, which reaffirmed both Scottishness and imperial power. This included historical items, such as Jacobite relics, and exhibits from colonial battles

¹⁰² See *Cameron's Guide through the International Exhibition of Industry*.

¹⁰³ Withers, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, p, 226.

¹⁰⁴ *Cameron's Guide through the International Exhibition of Industry*, p 41.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, p 41.

¹⁰⁶ *International Exhibition, 1890, Official Daily Programme*, Edinburgh, 1890.

and campaigns.¹⁰⁷ The popular militarism of the time was also reflected in the participation of regimental bands in the concerts that were part of all the exhibitions, and in 1908 a volunteer company of Edinburgh bankers provided the guard of honour at the opening of the exhibition.¹⁰⁸ The Prospectus for the 1908 Exhibition had proclaimed its aim to be wider in its nature ‘than merely Scottish’, and that it aimed to exemplify all that is best in art, science, literature and industry ‘from His Majesty’s dominions all over the world, *and that therefore it will be a National Exhibition in the widest sense of the term*’.¹⁰⁹ Apart from the military exhibits, however, imperialism as such was most obviously represented by the ‘Senegalese Village’, from the French colonial empire rather than the British, an exhibit which attracted considerable attention.¹¹⁰

Such exhibitions provided the opportunity for the status of Edinburgh as a capital city to be emphasised, and also for claims for Edinburgh’s role within the empire to be made. A souvenir edition of *Edinburgh Today* in 1908 declared that ‘Edinburgh is one of the few ideal capitals in the world’, occupying a ‘position as an integral part to the whole nation’.¹¹¹ The city of ‘Books, Brains, and Beer’ exported many of these products to imperial territories and elsewhere. While the publishing trade had shown a ‘tendency to drift to London’, it was the case that ‘much of the book literature in the world (with a fair share of the Bibles!) is printed in Edinburgh’.¹¹² Of beer exported from the UK, Edinburgh produced one-third, with, for example, Youngers’ Pale Ales ‘now very largely exported to the colonies’.¹¹³ Most important, however, appeared to be the export of brains, with Rosebery, the ‘uncrowned king of Scotland’, being quoted as saying that it would be bad for Edinburgh, Scotland, and the British Empire for students to remain in Edinburgh: ‘We in Scotland wish to continue to mould the Empire as we have in the past – we have not moulded it by

¹⁰⁷ *Descriptive List of Loan Collection illustrative of the Highlands and Islands of Scotland and the Scottish Regiments, Scottish National Exhibition*, Edinburgh, 1908.

¹⁰⁸ S G Checkland, *Scottish Banking, A History, 1695-1973*, Glasgow and London, Collins, 1975, p 511.

¹⁰⁹ *Prospectus, Scottish National Exhibition*, 1908.

¹¹⁰ This is attested to by the collection of press cuttings in the Edinburgh Room of the Edinburgh Public Library, which includes cuttings from the 1930s and the 1950s recalling the ‘Senegalese Village’.

¹¹¹ *Souvenir of the Scottish National Exhibition, Edinburgh Today*, July 1908, p 3.

¹¹² *Ibid.*, p 7.

stopping at home'.¹¹⁴ Indeed, Edinburgh was 'the assiduous mother and foster-mother of the builders of the Empire, whose sons are dispersed all over the globe as potential Empire builders, or, at least, Empire maintainers', and for this reason, for the 'generations of men that it has given to the Empire', Edinburgh was 'in the truest, the largest, and the highest sense, an Imperial City'.¹¹⁵ This theme was echoed in J B Forbes Watson's claim that Edinburgh was 'the true nursery of Empire' and that Edinburgh University was the 'Colonial University *par excellence*' since the King had once been a student there.¹¹⁶

The Edinburgh exhibitions have been less documented than the Glasgow events, and it is therefore hard to judge the extent to which the focus was different. A Scottish identity was promoted by all these exhibitions, in 1886 for example, with the exhibit reconstructing the streets of the historic Old Town of Edinburgh, and in 1908 with the promotion of Edinburgh's sites and history and of other places in Scotland to visit. Thus Scottishness was projected through an emphasis on the city's history and status as a capital, and through the promotion of Scotland as a tourist destination. Though expressions of Scottish identity were integral to both Edinburgh and Glasgow exhibitions, empire seems to have been less dominant a theme in the Edinburgh exhibitions, though nonetheless apparent, particularly in the military exhibits and participation of regimental bands and volunteers. Glasgow's imperial identity continued to be important to its citizens well into the 20th century, as MacKenzie has shown in his account of the 1938 exhibition, where, to mark Scotland's contribution to empire, David Livingstone was given pride of place.¹¹⁷ While Glasgow may have had the greater claim to imperial status, Edinburgh was not to be left out, but could score over its rival with its status as a capital, and its claim to be at centre of the nation's life. The emphasis on Edinburgh's status as a capital city and as an imperial city may thus be seen, like the Glasgow events, as negotiating the identities of the city, Scotland, and empire.

¹¹³ Ibid, p 84.

¹¹⁴ Ibid., p 56.

¹¹⁵ Ibid., p 56.

¹¹⁶ Ibid., p 48.

¹¹⁷ MacKenzie, "The Second City of Empire", p 230.

The phenomenon of international exhibitions coincided with the period of heightened interest in imperialism, and reflected this in their exhibits and publicity. Though such exhibitions did not give rise to long lasting organisations, they required the existence of organising committees, which typically brought a range of civil society interests together, including commercial and industrial, civic, academic, and political, reflecting the dominant interests in Scottish urban life, their perspectives and values. The churches also played their part and the role of the missionary enterprise in the empire was one aspect of the representation of Scottish identity within such exhibitions. That these events secured the ‘public approval of the elite’ is demonstrated by the membership of their organising committees, the openings by members of the royal family, and civic honours such as the knighthood subsequently awarded to James Gowans, chair of the 1886 exhibition executive committee. As with the other forms of civil society organisation discussed here women played their part in the organisation of the events, and their interests were reflected in the exhibits. The exhibitions ran for months, for example the exhibition in 1886 ran from May to November, and appeared to be very popular. In general in projecting through such exhibitions a vision of Scottish national identity, the Scottish contribution to empire was deemed an integral part.

Conclusion

This chapter has shown that there was a direct engagement with empire through civil society ‘associational activity’ in Scotland throughout the 19th and into the early 20th century. This engagement took a variety of forms: philanthropic activity, the activities of learned societies, and imperialist propaganda organisations; and was also expressed in features of civic and cultural life such as public exhibitions. The organisations and activities of the later 19th century often demonstrated a parallel interest in a Scottish national identity and an imperial identity, constructing and articulating such identities simultaneously. Such explicit assertion of Scottish national identity was in contrast to the earlier phase of philanthropic activity, exemplified by the anti-slavery movement. This was, however, distinctly stamped with the character of Scottish society, especially its religious divisions, which no doubt reinforced its distinctive Scottishness both in the eyes of its members and of

others, though there does not seem to have been an explicit concern with the expression of a Scottish identity as such.

In the earlier phase of philanthropic activity, membership of such organisations was typically constituted of middle class elites, professionals, businessmen, and civic leaders, who were evangelicals. Such organisations were relatively radical and remained a minority interest, even if the anti-slavery movement had from time to time a high public profile. The societies and organisations of the 1880s to the 1910s typically brought together coalitions of leaders from the churches, universities, business community and town councils, and thus were broadly representative of the views and interests of the Scottish middle classes. Some of the imperialist propaganda organisations remained small in membership and were short-lived, but in general the involvement of all sections of the middle classes in these organisations and activities is indicative of the extent to which empire had become part of the everyday life of Scots by the late 19th century. This point is further reinforced by the involvement of women in all these activities, whether in auxiliaries, as associates or in separate organisations. Thus empire was not just a matter for the political sphere, or for debate in exclusively male circles or clubs. It was the focus of associational activity that involved both men and women, linked together through family, social, and professional networks.

This evidence then shows that from the earliest part of the 19th century Scottish civil society was actively involved in understanding and appropriating empire, through the mechanism of the new forms of voluntary organisations that were to arise in this period. Religious and moral concerns were the original motivation for such action, and were to continue to be present in the foreign mission movement, while over time secular learned societies also responded to the impact of empire, and by the end of the 19th century imperialism itself had become the focus of associational activity. Empire was therefore present in the everyday lives of members of such organisations, and was understood in ways that were not political, or that went beyond the political. Crucial to the early phase of such associational activity was the influence of Enlightenment ideas on race and slavery, which were to have an

ambiguous legacy as the century developed, and which continued to structure perceptions of colonial peoples. The impact of empire was also assimilated through expanding geographical knowledge, which there was a demonstrable enthusiasm to acquire, along with the parallel geographical construction of Scotland itself. In these spheres of activity, the information transmitted by missionaries played an important role, not just as factual or scientific knowledge, but as representations of empire, of colonial 'others' and of Scots' role in empire, the reception of which was already informed by discourses of 'race' and the 'civilising mission'. As a consequence of these forms of associational activity, which provided a structure for receiving such representations of Scottish identity, by the late 19th century celebrations of Scotland and Scottish identity, such as the exhibitions on the one hand embodied representations of empire, and on the other imperialist propagandists stressed Scotland's claims to empire-building. Such understandings of Scotland's place in the empire had then become part of Scots' habitual way of thinking about themselves, not just for the active members of voluntary associations, but in popular representations and debates.

Chapter 4: Enlightening the heathen in religious truth – the Scottish missionary movement

Introduction

It has been shown that Scottish civil society demonstrated a continuous active engagement with empire throughout the 19th and early 20th centuries, through a variety of organisational forms, often showing interrelated interests and memberships. Through these organisational structures representations of empire were transmitted to people at home, and these in turn influenced representations of Scottish identity. Of these forms of civil society activity missionary societies and the churches were the most important, as this chapter seeks to establish. In outlining the growth and development of the missionary movement in Scotland this chapter sets the scene for the analysis in succeeding chapters of dominant discourses and representations of identity in the literature produced by these organisations for consumption at home. Firstly, an overview of the development of the movement is provided, followed by an analysis of its key functions and the composition of its leadership and active support. This movement operated through both local and national forms of organisation, and the characteristics of these organisations are illustrated with reference to Edinburgh based societies in particular.

As Andrew Walls has pointed out ‘as an object of study, the missionary movement is by no means a well-worked field’, a comment that applies to Scottish experience as well as to other countries supporting Protestant missions in the 19th and early 20th centuries.¹ Much of this account has therefore been constructed from primary sources and contemporary histories of missions.² Sources used include 19th century histories of missions and missionary societies, letter books of missionary societies, reports and

¹ Andrew F Walls, ‘The Eighteenth-Century Protestant Missionary Awakening in its European Context, in Brian Stanley (ed) *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge, William B Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001 pp 22-44, p 23.

² Key secondary sources were: Annie S Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest*, Edinburgh, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1937; Elizabeth Hewat, *Vision and Achievement, 1796-1956: A History of the Foreign Missions of the Churches United in the Church of Scotland*, London, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1960; Stuart Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries 1789-1858: The Social Background, Motives and Training of British Protestant Missionaries to India*, Sutton Courtney Press, 1984; Lesley Orr Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland, 1830-1930*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 2000.

speeches to General Assemblies, annual reports of societies, pamphlets, and the periodical literature of missionary societies and the main denominations (more details of this literature are given in the following chapter). As noted in the previous chapter, the *New Edinburgh Almanac* was used to identify the range of missionary societies which existed in Edinburgh in the 19th and early 20th centuries (See Appendix I for a list of these). For several of these there appear to be no records other than the listings in the *New Edinburgh Almanac*. Societies for which records such as annual reports exist (though by no means complete runs, and sometimes very sparse) include the Edinburgh Missionary Society, the Scottish Missionary Society, Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, Scottish Ladies' Association, Edinburgh University Missionary Association, and the New College Missionary Society, and these have been used to inform the account provided here.

This account of the development of Scottish supported foreign missions is concerned exclusively with Protestant churches and organisations, since the Catholic Church in Scotland was not actively involved in supporting foreign mission work until the 1930s. In particular it focuses on the main Presbyterian churches. The Episcopal Church also supported missionary activity, with a Scottish Episcopalian missionary society being formed in 1846, but did not support missions directly until the 1870s.³ In the nineteenth century, the Catholic church in Scotland was a poor church, requiring to be built up, and hence was regarded as it itself the subject of a mission.⁴ It was not until 1933 that the Catholic missionary organisation, the White Fathers, established a foundation in Scotland,⁵ though some Scots may have trained at the training school in England established in 1912.⁶ Effectively, then, in the period under

³ The Missionary Association of Scottish Episcopalians, instituted in 1846, is listed in the *New Edinburgh Almanac*, 1848. Direct support of missions began in 1871, but is only given a passing mention in both the following: Frederick Goldie, *A Short History of the Episcopal Church in Scotland*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1976; Rowan Strong, *Episcopalianism in Nineteenth-Century Scotland*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2002.

⁴ See, for example, David McRoberts (ed), *Modern Scottish Catholicism, 1878-1978*, Glasgow, Burns, 1979.

⁵ *White Fathers: 100 Years in Africa*, No 160, June/July 1968. This organisation, founded in 1879 by Cardinal Lavignerie, Archbishop of Algiers, who was said to have been 'an avid reader of David Livingstone's accounts of his travels in the heart of Africa', supported missionary priests and brothers in a number of African countries. See *The White Fathers in Scotland, 1934-1984, Golden Jubilee*, 1984.

⁶ J Bouniol, *The White Fathers and their Missions*, London, Sands and Co, 1929.

study Scottish Catholics were neither participants in or supporters of foreign mission work, a development which was to occur later in the 20th century.

Development of support for foreign missions

An idea originating in Scotland, the ‘Concert of Prayer’, was apparently influential in the development of support for missionary work. This arose out of the Scottish Revival which began in Cambuslang in 1742, and was an ongoing commitment by some Scottish ministers to unite for prayer ‘to revive true religion in all parts of Christendom and fill the whole earth with His glory’.⁷ In turn this influenced American revivalism and the founders of the Baptist Missionary Society in 1792 and of the London Missionary Society in 1795.⁸ Early in 1796, the Glasgow Missionary Society was established, followed in the same month by the SMS, based in Edinburgh.⁹ The movement in Britain, which began at the end of the 18th century, was following in the footsteps of European missions such as the Moravians.¹⁰ What differentiated this movement from the earlier state-sponsored Catholic missions of Spain and Portugal was its voluntary character. Indeed, as Walls has argued voluntary organisation was central to the movement, and it was the 18th century development of the voluntary society that provided a form of organisation for Protestants to pursue missionary activity in a focussed and flexible way.¹¹

Following the establishment in 1796 of the Scottish and Glasgow Missionary Societies, a proposal that the Church of Scotland should support missions abroad was put to the General Assembly. The rejection of this by the Moderates arose partly from their anxiety about supporting independent missionary societies, which, like the anti-slavery organisations might be ‘connected with politics’, and which might disturb ‘the peace and tranquillity [sic] of the country’.¹² Also central to the debate

⁷ Stuart Piggin and John Roxborough, *The Saint Andrews’ Seven: the finest flowering of missionary zeal in Scottish history*, Edinburgh, Banner of Truth Press, 1985, p 43.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p 43.

⁹ This was first named the Edinburgh Missionary Society, though appears to have changed its name very quickly to the Scottish Missionary Society. Some early reports however appear in the name of the Edinburgh Missionary Society.

¹⁰ See Walls, ‘The Eighteenth-Century Protestant Missionary Awakening’.

¹¹ Walls, ‘The Eighteenth-Century Protestant Missionary Awakening’, p 35.

¹² *Account of the Proceedings and Debate in the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, 27th May, 1796*, Edinburgh, 1796, p 54.

was the concept of ‘civilisation’. The Rev George Hamilton argued that ‘To spread abroad the knowledge of the Gospel among barbarous and heathen nations’ was ‘preposterous’, since ‘it anticipates, nay as it even reverses, the order of nature’.¹³ To be ‘properly enlightened in religious truths’, it was necessary that ‘men must be polished and refined in their manners’. Furthermore, ‘utmost vigilance’ and ‘unbroken strength’ were required at home.¹⁴ Such arguments carried the day, and it took evangelical supporters of foreign missions, such as Robert and James Haldane and Thomas Chalmers, almost thirty years to persuade the Church of Scotland to change its mind.

Having at length given its approval for missionary work abroad in 1824, the Church of Scotland sent its first missionary, Alexander Duff, to Calcutta in 1829, and in 1832 the SMS missionaries in Bombay were transferred to the Church of Scotland. Support for foreign missions increased, partly inspired by Duff himself, through active campaigning throughout Scotland for locally based associations to take on the task of providing regular financial support. His address to the General Assembly of 1835 was ‘an oration so moving that many wept, 20,000 copies of it were printed, and Marischal College, Aberdeen, awarded him the degree of Doctor of Divinity’.¹⁵ Crucial to this debate was Duff’s emphasis on ‘the formative influence of Western knowledge’ and the need for this form of rationality for the ‘evidence’ of Christianity to be grasped.¹⁶ Thus in adopting Duff’s strategy the Church of Scotland both enshrined the importance of education and the need for the prior civilisation of others if they were to be receptive to Christianity, and this was to set the framework for much of what was to follow for the rest of the century, especially the emphasis on education. By the 1830s then both the formal endorsement of foreign missions and of a missionary strategy had been given by the established church. At the same time the growing interest in foreign missions resulted in the establishment of the Edinburgh Ladies Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India in 1837, of the Glasgow Ladies Association for promoting Female Education in Kaffraria [South

¹³ Ibid., p 17-18.

¹⁴ Ibid., p 23.

¹⁵ Piggin and Roxborough, *The St Andrews Seven*, p 114.

¹⁶ Ian Douglas Maxwell, ‘Civilization or Christianity? The Scottish Debate on Mission Methods, 1750-1835’ in Brian Stanley (ed) *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, pp 123-140, p 140.

Africa] in 1839, and of the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society (EMMS) in 1841.¹⁷

With the Disruption missionary activity became largely channelled along denominational lines, and the missionary movement in general seems to have been energised by this split in the longer term. Following the Disruption, the remaining SMS and Glasgow Missionary Society missionaries were transferred to the Free Church and to the United Presbyterian Church. Indeed, being an ‘undenominational’ society outside the churches was later perceived to have been a ‘source of weakness’ leading to declining income, and lacking ‘true adjustment to the conditions of Church life in Scotland’.¹⁸ The zeal of the new Free Church was reflected in expansion of missionary numbers, as well as its remarkable growth at home, with foreign missions receiving ‘more than twice as much in 1848-9 from the Free Church than they had done in 1842 from the undivided Church of Scotland’.¹⁹ The Church of Scotland suffered from the loss of all but one of its missionaries, but ‘almost at once new men were recruited’, even if their efforts were less publicised than those of the Free Church, and financial support for missions was increasing by the mid-1850s.²⁰ The newly created Ladies Associations also divided on denominational lines, while the EMMS maintained its autonomy as a non-denominational organisation. Scots also continued to serve with the LMS, making up 16% of all the society’s missionaries from 1794 to 1944 (284 out of 1800),²¹ and there were locally based auxiliaries to this such as the one in Edinburgh.²² In addition the Reformed Presbyterian Church supported a small number of missionaries in the New Hebrides, which were to be taken into the Free Church in the union of the two churches in

¹⁷ For accounts of the establishment of the Ladies Associations see Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest*; and Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*. For the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, see John Lowe, *Jubilee Memorial: Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society*, Edinburgh, Scott and Ferguson and Burness and Company, 1892; H F Lechmere Taylor, *A Century of Service, 1841-1941*, Edinburgh, EMMS, 1941; and John Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, Edinburgh, EMMS, 1991.

¹⁸ *Missions of the United Presbyterian Church*, 1896, p 32.

¹⁹ John McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi 1875-1940: the impact of the Livingstonia Mission in the Northern Province*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1977, p 21.

²⁰ Andrew L Drummond and James Bulloch, *The Church in Victorian Scotland, 1843-1874*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1975, p 174.

²¹ James Calder, *Scotland's March Past: the Share of Scottish Churches in the London Missionary Society*, London, Livingstone Press, 1945.

²² An Edinburgh Auxiliary to the LMS, for example, is listed continuously in throughout this period in the New Edinburgh Almanacs.

1876.²³ The Episcopal Church had a committee which supported missionary work, but did not fund missionaries itself till the 1870s, rather directing its support through its sister church in England.²⁴

External factors and events were to provide a further stimulus to growth in later decades. In India there had initially been resistance to missionary activity by the East India Company.²⁵ However, the change in the administration of India which followed the 1857 Mutiny facilitated the expansion of missionary work, to which the ‘quasi-sovereign’ East India Company had been resistant.²⁶ The response in Scotland to the Mutiny was ‘a call for volunteers – which was abundantly met’,²⁷ and this was to lead to expansion of missionary work in India, such as the new United Presbyterian mission in Rajputana founded in 1860.²⁸ Such resistance to missionary activity, or unease about the challenge to other religions did not arise with respect to Africa, since it was considered to be uncivilised, while India was deemed to have a civilisation, albeit a ‘degraded’ one. The desire to end slavery in Africa also gave a moral urgency to interventions. The strategy of commerce, Christianity and civilisation had already been enunciated before Livingstone made it famous in 1857 at his lecture in Cambridge, where he announced his intention to go back to Africa, ‘to try to make an open path for commerce and Christianity’.²⁹ This is evident, for example, in Baikie’s account of his voyage up the Niger, accompanied by Church Missionary Society representative Samuel Crowther, where he was concerned to assess the prospects for both Christianity and commerce.³⁰ Though the publication,

²³ See George Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, Edinburgh, John Maclaren, 1880, p19.

²⁴ The Episcopal Church in Scotland began to support directly its own missions in 1871, and in 1914 was supporting missionaries in Kaffraria, in South Africa, and in Nagpur, in India. It was however continuing to send subscriptions to the Church of England’s foreign missions. See *Foreign Mission Chronicle of the Episcopal Church of Scotland*, New Series, Vol XV, No 2, April, 1914.

²⁵ For an account of the relationship between British missionaries and the East India Company in the early decades of the 19th century, see Penny Carson, ‘The British Raj and the Awakening of the Evangelical Conscience: the Ambiguities of Religious Establishment and Toleration, 1698-1833’, in Stanley (ed), *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, pp. 45-70.

²⁶ Stephen Neill, *History of Christian Missions*, London, Penguin, 1964, p 274.

²⁷ Drummond and Bulloch, *The Church in Victorian Scotland*, 1975, p 176.

²⁸ *Missions of the United Presbyterian Church described in a Series of Stories*, Edinburgh, Offices of the United Presbyterian Church, 1896, p v.

²⁹ Quoted in W P Livingstone, *Laws of Livingstonia*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1921, p 4.

³⁰ See William Balfour Baikie, *Narrative of an Exploring Voyage up the rivers Kwo’ra and Bi’nue (commonly known as the Niger and the Tsadda)*, London, John Murray, 1856. Baikie, originally from Kirkwall, subsequently went back to the area of the Niger after his expedition, holding the post of

also in 1857, of Livingstone's *Travels and Missionary Researches in South Africa* had attracted public interest in Scotland, it did not arouse an immediate missionary response, and enthusiasm in Scotland for African missions 'had to wait on the reaction to Livingstone's death and the campaign of Moody and Sankey'.³¹ After Livingstone's death however the Scottish churches were able to respond through the launch of the Livingstonia expedition, though this arose from fortuitous circumstances, rather than through a conscious policy to work in the territories that Livingstone had explored.³² As Livingstone's posthumous fame increased, this initiative was recast as the fulfilment of his vision. Developments in Nyasaland continued to arouse wide public interest in Scotland, especially in the late 1880s when many Scots church leaders and members took part in the campaign to persuade the government to proclaim Protectorate status for the territory.³³ Subsequently evangelical enthusiasm coincided with the upsurge of popular imperialism in Britain in the 1880s and 1890s and the 'association between Christian mission and imperial expansion' might be expressed 'unabashedly'.³⁴ Participants in the British movement commonly expressed a 'faith in the beneficence of the British Empire',³⁵ such as Scottish missionary, Donald Fraser, proud of 'the high imperial destiny of our nation', and Britain's role in 'the healing of Africa's open sore', the East African slave-trade.³⁶

consul. Among other things he translated portions of the Bible into Hausa, but 'went native' to the embarrassment of the government. See Michael Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, East Lothian, Tuckwell Press and Birlinn, 2001, p 175-6.

³¹ Drummond and Bulloch, *The Church in Victorian Scotland*, 1975, p 167.

³² The Free Church and others had ignored Livingstone's appeal for ten years, and were considering undertaking a mission with Somalis, when James Stewart, then head of the Lovedale mission in South Africa, persuaded the Foreign Mission committee to establish a mission on the borders of Lake Nyasa, thus the connection with Livingstone was established fortuitously. See McCracken for a detailed account of this, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi*, 1977, pp 26-28.

³³ See McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi*, 1977, p 158.

³⁴ Phillips cites as an example the international missionary conference in London in 1888. The English editor of the official report commented, 'It is to the race which is sending the blessings of Christianity to the heathen to which God is giving success as the colonisers and conquerors of the world'. See Clifton J Phillips, 'Changing Attitudes in the Student Volunteer Movement of Great Britain and North America, 1886-1928' in Torben Christensen and William R Hutchison, (eds) *Missionary Ideologies in the Imperialist Era: 1880-1920*, Arhus, Aros Publishers, 1982, pp 159-166.

³⁵ Phillips, 'The Student Volunteer Movement', 1982, p 136.

³⁶ *Ibid*, p 136.

The period between 1880 and 1920 was both the ‘high imperial era’ and the ‘high missionary era’.³⁷ Certainly, by this time the missionary movement in Scotland had grown in terms of the numbers of missionaries it was capable of supporting. Estimated figures compiled from a range of sources suggest that the numbers of missionaries supported by Scots from the earliest days until the early 1830s totalled around 20, and that the cumulative total had grown to around 100 by 1850. Thus at any one time there were only very small numbers in the field. By the early 1870s, the three main Presbyterian churches were fielding over 120 missionaries between them.³⁸ By 1882, this was approaching 200, and by 1899 was around 400. By 1904, following the union of the Free Church of Scotland and the United Presbyterian Church in 1900, the two main denominations were supporting around 430 missionaries overseas. Numbers were to increase further in the post-war period, with the reunified Church of Scotland in 1929 supporting approximately 500 missionaries.³⁹ In 1904 the majority of Scots missionaries were in India and Africa – 82 per cent of those supported by the two main Presbyterian churches - and this reflected a consistent pattern over time, with India retaining the bigger share. A notable feature of the expansion of missionary numbers was the increasing proportion of women. Missionaries’ wives had participated in missionary work from the earliest days, and after the foundation of the Ladies’ Associations single women were employed as missionary ‘agents’. However, ‘Christian women’s work for native women did not begin in an organized form till about 1854’, and numbers continued to be small over a period of several decades.⁴⁰ Of Church of Scotland missionaries women were in the majority by 1904 – 54 out of 104 (52%), and 43 out of 71 (61%) of their missionaries in India were women.⁴¹ In the same year, of United Free Church of Scotland

³⁷ Andrew F Walls, ‘British Missions’ in Christensen and Hutchison (eds), *Missionary Ideologies in the Imperialist Era*, p 159.

³⁸ The figures quoted in this paragraph were compiled from the lists published in the New Edinburgh Almanacs of 1873, 1882, 1899, and 1904.

³⁹ See Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, p 116.

⁴⁰ George Smith, *Short History of Christian Missions*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1904, p 187. For example, in 1878, the Free Church of Scotland Ladies’ Society was supporting 14 women missionaries in India, and three in Africa. See Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, p 75-6. By 1899, this had risen to 66, with 42 in India and 24 in Africa. See *New Edinburgh Almanac*, 1899.

⁴¹ Figures derived from *New Edinburgh Almanac*, 1904.

missionaries, 106 out of 323 (33%) were women, and 65 out of 141 (46%) of their missionaries in India were women.⁴²

There had also been a growth in the numbers of supporters at home, and the movement's public profile was higher, becoming the occasion of celebratory accounts of Scottish achievements by the 1910s, as exemplified in speeches at the World Missionary Conference in 1910, and the Livingstone Centenary in 1913. The First World War, however, disrupted the growth of support, and led to a reconsideration of missionary approaches and their role in relation to colonial peoples. The growth of nationalism in countries such as India, China, and Japan meant that the position of missionaries became more questioned, and on occasion they became the object of hostility against the encroachments of western imperialism.⁴³

Organisational structures and networks

Following the establishment of the Glasgow and Edinburgh (Scottish) Missionary Societies in 1796, a number of other local societies quickly sprang into existence, and in addition to these congregations also contributed funds. Associations were quickly formed in a number of other places in Scotland. For example, in 1797, the Edinburgh Missionary Society noted that it maintained 'frequent epistolary intercourse' with societies in Glasgow, Ayr, Aberdeen, Perth and London, having entered into 'a fixed plan of co-operation' with the latter,⁴⁴ and by 1803, further societies in Dumfries, Dunse [sic], Kilmarnock, Paisley, and Stirling had been established.⁴⁵ By the 1820s there were also a number of Ladies and Female Missionary Societies, such as the Lanark Ladies' Scottish Missionary Society,⁴⁶ and

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ See Neill, *History of Christian Missions*.

⁴⁴ Edinburgh Missionary Society, *Abstract of the Proceedings and state of the funds of the Edinburgh Missionary Society*, 1797.

⁴⁵ Edinburgh Missionary Society, *Report of the Directors of the Edinburgh Missionary Society, to the General Meeting, 5th April, 1803*.

⁴⁶ See *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, 1826; see also Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, p 11.

the Dunfermline Ladies Association, reported in 1826 as sending £5 yearly to support a native teacher in South Africa.⁴⁷

Within the Church of Scotland, moves to organise support more systematically occurred in the mid 1830s, fostered by Duff, who visited Presbyteries across Scotland, encouraging them to create local committees, an exercise he was to subsequently repeat for the Free Church in the early 1850s. Since public meetings succeeded only in ‘securing ephemeral collections’,⁴⁸ it was argued that it was necessary to form organisations throughout the congregations of the church. The assumption of the major responsibility for foreign missions by the three main Presbyterian denominations in the Disruption period was to give it a national character, insofar as this was directed by foreign mission committees or boards that formed part of the committee structure of church government, and by formal reporting of their work and progress in foreign missions at the annual General Assemblies, or Synods, in the case of the United Presbyterian Church, and through drawing support from congregations and presbyteries across Scotland, even if this was not uniform.

As indicated above women had supported the development of foreign missions since the early years of the 19th century through ladies’ associations and auxiliaries, with the ladies’ associations employing their own women missionary ‘agents’ from the late 1830s.⁴⁹ At the time of the post-Disruption split the two Edinburgh associations subsequently formed took on the title ‘Scottish’, though continued to have Edinburgh based committees.⁵⁰ The Church of Scotland SLA, for example, received

⁴⁷ *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, 1826, p 125.

⁴⁸ Alexander Duff, *Home Organization for Foreign Missions, being the substance of and address delivered before the Commission of the General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland, on Wednesday, November 20, 1850*, Edinburgh, Johnstone and Hunter, 1850, p 7.

⁴⁹ See *First Report of the Scottish Ladies’ Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India*, 1839; ‘Historical Sketch of the Women’s Foreign Missionary Society of the Free Church of Scotland’ in *The Helpmeet*, Vol III, No 36, October, 1899. Accounts of these societies foundations and activities are given in Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest*, Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, and Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*. According to Macdonald the Glasgow Association was not connected to the Church of Scotland and remained autonomous until it entered into a partial union in 1865 with Edinburgh Ladies Society in connection with the Free Church. See Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, p 113.

⁵⁰ These were respectively, to give them their full formal titles, the Scottish Ladies’ Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India, Auxiliary to the General Assembly’s Committee on

contributions from auxiliaries and parishes throughout Scotland, and beyond, with in 1846 around 100 in Scotland, and others in Calcutta, Liverpool, and Canada.⁵¹ The relationship of these associations to the churches became more formalised in the 1880s. The Free Church society obtained permission from the General Assembly in 1883 to form auxiliaries at presbytery level, bringing together ‘informal district associations’, leading to increased funds and enhanced organisation.⁵² A similar structure was evolved by the Ladies’ Association of the Church of Scotland, linking associations at different levels, and this came more directly under the control of the Foreign Mission Committee in the mid 1880s, as the result of a dispute over the behaviour and disciplining of one of the society’s agents in Calcutta, a Miss Pigot.⁵³ With the creation of the Church of Scotland Woman’s Guild in 1887, women’s interest in and support for missionary activity came to have an ever higher profile, and with active supporters of missionary activity being integrated into it.⁵⁴ Separate organisation for work with women was a later development for the United Presbyterian Church, with a Zenana Mission Committee only being formed in 1881, by the Foreign Mission Board.⁵⁵ Organisational changes within the churches thus helped to maximise the benefits from women’s growing enthusiasm for missionary work. These organisational changes coincided with the opening up of higher education and the professions to women, and were also accompanied by a substantial increase in the numbers of women seeking to take up a missionary vocation.

Student societies also provide an example of a Scottish wide phenomenon, though again dividing on denominational lines at the Disruption. The earliest student missionary association was founded in Aberdeen in 1816, though its fortunes

Foreign Missions, and the Female Society of the Free Church of Scotland for Promoting Christian Education Among the Females of India. Both these societies were first listed in the *New Edinburgh Almanac* in 1845.

⁵¹ *Scottish Ladies’ Association, 8th Annual Report*, 1846.

⁵² Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, p 147.

⁵³ Pigot was accused by William Hastie of the Educational Institution in Calcutta of malpractice and immorality, setting in train a libel action and subsequent appeal, in which Pigot was vindicated, though lost her employment in the course of these events. See Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, pp 136-140 for a detailed account of this dispute and its consequences.

⁵⁴ See Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest*; Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*; Mamie Magnusson, *Out of Silence: the Woman’s Guild, 1887-1987*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1987.

⁵⁵ See Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*.

fluctuated, as did those of the Glasgow University society founded in 1821. In St Andrews and Edinburgh, however, ‘the student missionary societies flourished’, from their foundation in 1824 and 1825 respectively.⁵⁶ In Edinburgh at the Disruption there was a split in the student society, and thereafter there were two associations, with the Edinburgh University Missionary Association continuing as a Church of Scotland body, and a New College Missionary Association being formed. The United Presbyterian and Reformed Presbyterians also had their student societies, which exchanged delegates with the New College association. However, it was not until 1869 that delegates were exchanged with the Church of Scotland association. By the 1870s the New College association was hosting an annual event, to which other student societies were invited, and these were reported as being well attended.⁵⁷

The changes in women’s organisations in the 1880s were paralleled by the development of new organisations such as the Student Volunteer Movement, and the Young Men’s Christian Association, which arose in response to the evangelical fervour inspired by Moody and Sankey in the 1870s, with branches of these organisations springing up in universities in England and Scotland.⁵⁸ In 1892, a meeting in Edinburgh resulted in the formation of the Student Volunteer Missionary Union of Great Britain and Ireland.⁵⁹ The Church of Scotland had also capitalised on this enthusiasm, creating a Young Men’s Guild in 1880, which provided ‘Sunday school teachers, elders, community leaders, missionaries and recruits for the ministry’, and it also raised funds for missions.⁶⁰ All of these organisational developments took place at a time when imperialist sentiment was reaching its height, which helped bring the missionary movement with its ‘civilising mission’ to more prominence.

The Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society is an exception to the rule of participation in a Scottish network, though efforts were made to encourage the development of such societies elsewhere. Founded in 1841, the model of the EMMS

⁵⁶ Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries*, p 230.

⁵⁷ See, for example, *New College Missionary Society Reports*, 1876, 1879.

⁵⁸ Phillips, ‘The Student Volunteer Movement’, p 132.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, p 133.

⁶⁰ Magnusson, *Out of Silence*, p 47.

encouraged the setting up of other medical missionary societies, such as the societies in Aberdeen, Perth, Kirkcaldy and Dumfries announced in the society's 1848 report. Later mention is made of auxiliaries in Belfast (1856) and Liverpool (1863), and in 1878 a medical missionary society was formed in London, influenced by the EMMS.⁶¹ A Glasgow Medical Missionary Society was also established, which seems to have existed for a number of decades.⁶² The Glasgow society, still functioning in 1890s ran local dispensaries in Glasgow, but does not seem to have supported missionaries abroad. However, all but the Edinburgh society were 'short-lived'.⁶³ Though local, the EMMS' interdenominational character, and its practice of placing its trained missionaries with other missionary societies and the churches, meant that it operated effectively as part of wider Scottish, and indeed, British, missionary networks.

A key characteristic of the pattern of organisation of support at home for foreign missions abroad was then its operation largely through Scottish wide networks, which over the course of the 19th century became progressively formalised and more extensive. Furthermore, where organisations had local autonomy they also frequently interacted with organisations and networks at a national level. At a general level all of these forms of organisational support for foreign missions aimed to do the same things, namely to raise funds to support missionaries abroad, to recruit and manage missionary agents, and to disseminate information about the activities and success of missionaries, though the capacity to do so and the balance between these different activities varied.

Fund-raising

The activities of missionary supporters were typical of those of 19th century civil society organisations, and these not only furthered directly the aims of organisations, but also through the regular presentation of annual reports and accounts, and through

⁶¹ See Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, p 21-22.

⁶² Olive Checkland, *Philanthropy in Victorian Scotland: Social Welfare and Voluntary Principle*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1980, p 82. According to Checkland this was established in 1868. However, the society's 1853 annual report notes the receipt of a donation of £50 from the Glasgow Medical Missionary Society to continue the services of Dr Wallace at Parsonstown in Ireland. See EMMS, *Annual Report*, 1853, p 6.

⁶³ See Checkland, *Philanthropy in Victorian Scotland*, p 81.

holding fund-raising events, both engaged with a public audience, and asserted the social position associated with such visible philanthropy. Fund-raising was of course fundamental to the movement's success, and fund-raising efforts, and accounts were a staple feature of annual reports and of periodical literature. The process of building up sufficient support and funding was a slow one. Though the SMS claimed early success with 'liberal collections' from people of high and low rank in which 'the widow's mite' was not absent, it was apparent in subsequent years that both funds and missionary recruits were hard to come by.⁶⁴ In 1831 the society, failing to find a missionary for its station in Jamaica, lamented that 'Cold hearted Scotland' was 'Warm and energetic, only where silk and gold are to be found'.⁶⁵ Indeed, in the first fifty years of its existence, the SMS had only succeeded in supporting temporarily a small number of missionaries in Russia, West Africa, Jamaica and Bombay. The society did however make a last attempt to revive its fortunes in 1846 with a 'Jubilee Collections' leaflet, stressing that it was established on the broad principle of 'Christian Union' 'among all holding Evangelical views of Divine truth' and was entirely 'unsectarian' (emphasis in the original).⁶⁶ Clearly these appeals did not have their intended effect, as it was in 1847 that the SMS ceased to support 'agents' abroad, though the society as such continued to exist.⁶⁷

As noted the form of organisation used by the churches to raise money was to have missionary committees at congregational or Presbyterial level. The system of Associations established in the Free Church, for example, furnished a major source of income for missionary work. Between the mid 1850s and the late 1870s the Associations provided over half of such funds, with donations and legacies forming the second biggest share. By contrast church door collections ranged from 5% to 10% of funds contributed in this period.⁶⁸ Within the women's missionary periodicals, and in annual reports, fund-raising activities were prominent. Bazaars

⁶⁴ *Report of the Directors of the Edinburgh Missionary Society, to General Meeting 5th April, 1803*, Edinburgh, 1803.

⁶⁵ *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, 1831, p 291.

⁶⁶ Scottish Missionary Society, Jubilee appeal letter from William Brown, Secretary, 1846. A similar letter was produced in 1847: NLS MS 8014.

⁶⁷ The Scottish Missionary Society continued to be listed in the New Edinburgh Almanac until at least the mid 1880s, but did not support any further missionary activity.

⁶⁸ Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, p 22.

and sales of work were typical fund-raising activities, and to these were added the sponsorship of orphans, a practice introduced in 1845, when an individual woman in Scotland undertook to provide for the education and maintenance of a specific orphan in the Orphan Institute of Calcutta.⁶⁹ Committees at home negotiated the sponsorship of ‘unappropriated’ girls with individuals, local associations, Sunday schools and so on, and girls were sponsored in Scottish orphanages in Calcutta, Madras, Bombay, Sealkote[Sialkot], and Colombo.⁷⁰ Local associations also organised ‘work parties’ to produce articles for sales of work and for bazaars, and to make clothes to send to India and Africa, patterns for which were ‘in constant request’.⁷¹ Church of Scotland women were advised to hold ‘work-parties’ weekly and that members should ‘go at it vigorously’.⁷² The work party’s missionary character was stressed, and as well as being ‘opened with prayer’, it should include the reading out of ‘missionary letters and books’.⁷³

The emphasis on fund-raising activities may have been a sign of the struggle to raise sufficient money, but also an expression of pride in women’s capacity to raise funds, and to find innovative methods of doing so. These methods often used typically feminine skills, and might therefore be deemed appropriate and respectable. Though women did not serve as treasurers, or indeed as other office-bearers, they were frequently praised for their fund-raising efforts. The missionary schemes of the Free Church were under an obligation to the ‘honourable Christian women’ who were the ‘busy bees [...] providing the materials essential to the maintenance of the outward fabric of the Church and her various Schemes’.⁷⁴ Similarly, the moderator of the Church of Scotland, the Rev Dr Gillan was ‘struck with the extent and perfection’ of

⁶⁹ Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest*, p 78.

⁷⁰ *News of Female Missions*, No 3, 1863, p 90.

⁷¹ *News of Female Missions*, New Series No 10, October, 1898, p 80.

⁷² Report of 23rd Annual Conference of the Women’s Association for Foreign Missions, in *News of Female Missions*, New Series No 7, July 1898.

⁷³ *Ibid.*, p 51.

⁷⁴ Alexander Duff, *Home Organization for Foreign Missions, being the substance of an address delivered before the Commission of the General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland, Wednesday 20 November, 1850*, Edinburgh, Johnstone and Hunter, 1850, p 46.

women's organisation, whose 'collectors are found everywhere from Maidenkirk to John o' Groats'.⁷⁵

The EMMS, too, relied on women's support to raise funds, and the society had the typical structure of lady collectors raising money, as well as male subscribers. The 'Lady Collectors' raised a 'large proportion of the income of the Society', with the visiting of homes in Edinburgh to collect contributions being organised on the basis of twelve districts 'each with its own Lady Supervisor'.⁷⁶ Public bazaars sponsored by royalty were also used successfully to raise money for the Livingstone training institution.⁷⁷ With the exception of EMMS all these organisations functioned on a Scottish wide basis. Not only were such fund-raising efforts or events highly visible, so were the amounts being donated, whether by individuals, congregations, local associations and so on. Overall, however, the process of building up organisations capable of funding substantial numbers of missionaries was a slow one, which became more systematised through fund-raising campaigns, innovations in methods of fund-raising and through organisational change. Women's role in this process was of considerable significance, both in terms of the income raised and in how this helped to change their conception of their role.

Employment of missionary agents, training, and home mission work

The central aim of missionary societies and church mission boards was to employ missionary agents, and it is clear that this was directed by committees and boards at home, often with a locally based corresponding society.⁷⁸ This involved lengthy correspondence on issues such as the precedence of preaching over teaching, where particular missionaries should be located, allowances, or what information missionaries should send home.⁷⁹ Recruitment and management of missionaries was a task reserved to the directors and committee members of societies and to the

⁷⁵ Report of the 35th Annual Meeting of the Scottish Ladies' Association, in *News of Female Missions*, No 43, July, 1873, p 82.

⁷⁶ Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, p 68.

⁷⁷ See Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*.

⁷⁸ Such local corresponding committees were set up by the SMS in Calcutta and Bombay. See, for example, SMS letter books of the Bombay Corresponding Committee, NLS: MS 8988-8989.

⁷⁹ See, for example, letter from William Brown to the missionaries, on November 18, 1827, on the subject of their keeping journals, and subsequent correspondence. NLS: MS 8986.

foreign mission committees of the churches. For ladies' associations this meant that they had to ultimately submit to the authority of their male office bearers, or to the authority of exclusively male foreign mission committees of the main Presbyterian churches. Nonetheless, women committee members were actively involved in the process of recruitment and management. The loss of agents through marriage was an issue which prompted early revision to the Edinburgh Ladies' Association regulations, when it was decided that if women married their salary would be discontinued, though they might continue to work unpaid. Furthermore, in order to protect their funds, the SLA, for example, stipulated that the cost of passage should be repaid, proportionate to the length of time served, and also asked that agents should give them six months' notice of marriage or other proposed change, in order that they might make arrangements for 'supplying a successor'.⁸⁰ While generally agents recruited at home and sent out from Scotland were all single women, and were required to give up paid employment on marriage, it was not unknown for married women to be employed.⁸¹ Committee members met candidates, commending them to their missionaries abroad, as with Miss McGillewie, whom committee members thought 'very ladylike in appearance and manner' and 'very sensible'.⁸²

Student associations, too, might play some part in supporting missionaries, though their capacity to do so seems to have fluctuated. In the earlier years of the Edinburgh University student association's existence it had resolved to support a missionary in India, and to raise £300 a year for that purpose,⁸³ and initially John Braidwood 'was supported in India entirely out of EUMA funds.'⁸⁴ However, the association was already reporting difficulty in raising the required funds by 1843.⁸⁵ Though home mission work became the major focus of student missionary associations' attentions,

⁸⁰ See regulations on marriage and repayments etc, *Scottish Ladies Association of the Advancement of Female Education in India, 8th Annual Report, 1846*.

⁸¹ In 1844, a married teacher, Mrs McLeish, was appointed along with her husband to the mission in Bombay. See *Annual Meeting of the Ladies' Association for Female Education in India, 1844*, p 7.

⁸² Letter from Ella Williamson to Miss Emily [Bernard], October 1885, in Women's Association, Church of Scotland, Letter Book, 1885-1915: NLS MS 7624.

⁸³ *Missionary Association of the University of Edinburgh Report 1838-9*.

⁸⁴ Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries*, p 232.

⁸⁵ *Missionary Association of the University of Edinburgh Report 1842-3*.

support for foreign missions remained a part of their remit, and still in the 1880s at meetings ‘The Foreign Mission element [...] somewhat preponderated’.⁸⁶

Although founded in 1841, it was not until 1853 that the EMMS appointed its first missionary, Dr John Owens, sent to India in conjunction with the LMS. What was to become the key function of the society, the training of medical students for missionary service began the same year, with the establishment by Dr Peter Handyside of a Dispensary in the Cowgate, which thus initiated ‘that special type of combined philanthropic and religious service which is perhaps not the least of Edinburgh’s claims to distinction’.⁸⁷ An expansion of training premises took place in 1858, and in 1876 new premises were found for the Livingstone Memorial Medical Missionary Training Institution, ‘a most fitting National expression of admiration of the character, and sympathy with the life-work, of the great African explorer’, who was himself ‘a medical missionary’.⁸⁸ Training occasionally included that of students from overseas, with the society having the distinction of providing for the training of the first Chinese person to graduate from a European university, Dr Wong Fun, in 1855.⁸⁹ The society also supported missionaries, but frequently these were sent out by other societies or church Foreign Mission committees.⁹⁰

Though a central function of missionary societies was to support missionaries abroad, in the case of the student societies and the EMMS, home mission work was also a central to their operation. By the early 1850s groups were working in the Infirmary and the Cowgate, with the involvement of around 130 students.⁹¹ In the 1860s home missions were extended to the Canongate and Hunter Square, where open-air evening services were regularly held. And in the wake of the evangelical revival of 1874 when this work was ‘at the height of its success’, work began on the

⁸⁶ *New College Missionary Society, 50th Year*, 1876.

⁸⁷ Taylor, *A Century of Service*, p 5.

⁸⁸ Lowe, *Jubilee Memorial*, p 20.

⁸⁹ See EMMS, *Annual Report*, 1855, p 7.

⁹⁰ Wilkinson provides information on the total numbers of students trained by the EMMS between 1841 and 1991 – 324, but no information is given of the distribution over time. Of all those trained by the society, a minority served with Scottish churches or societies, 120, with the biggest single group, 76, being employed by the Church of Scotland.

⁹¹ Hugh Watt, *New College Edinburgh: A Centenary History*, Edinburgh, Oliver and Boyd, 1946, p 116.

Pleasance Mission. By the 1870s Home Mission work appears to have been much more important in terms of the resources devoted to it. For students who did aspire to a missionary career ‘the slums of Edinburgh were thought of as a most valuable training ground’ since the task of the missionary abroad could not be more difficult than ‘taming “the savages of the Canongate”’, or confronting the ‘deepening depravity and ungodliness’ which were part of the ‘fearful realities of life’ in Edinburgh.⁹² In general, however, it appears to be the case that student missionary associations both in Edinburgh and elsewhere increasingly devoted their attention to home mission work and subsequently university settlement schemes.

The EMMS, through its training institution and dispensary, was able to fulfil a dual role of administering to the poor at home, while preparing trainees for service abroad. Taylor comments that such training in Edinburgh’s poorer quarters would stand the future missionary in good stead: ‘one who has learned to be a good friend to an old “body” in the Cowgate is well on the way to being a good missionary in a foreign land’.⁹³ It also allowed the society to respond to critics of missionary work abroad, when they had ‘made a practical response to needs at home in the “grey metropolis of the North” as well as those of distant lands’.⁹⁴ Evangelistic and social work carried out in the Cowgate by EMMS in the 1890s included a ‘Sunday evening “Arabs” school’ with average attendance of 250.⁹⁵

All of the Edinburgh based societies discussed here, the SMS, the SLAs, New College Missionary Society, and the EMMS, supported and managed missionary agents, though in some cases the numbers supported were very small, particularly up until the 1870s. As indicated earlier the churches had become the main vehicle for missionary activity with the Disruption, and were funding the majority of Scottish missionaries throughout this period. Between them the church foreign mission committees and the missionary societies and ladies’ associations managed and

⁹² These quotes are from missionary John Braidwood, and from a letter from Robert Blyth to the New College Missionary Association, and quoted in Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries*, p 103.

⁹³ Taylor, *Century of Service*, p 17.

⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, p 6.

⁹⁵ Lowe, *Jubilee Memorial*, p 32. The designation ‘Arab’ or ‘street Arab’ was the conventional terminology of the time used to describe homeless street children.

directed the Scottish missionary enterprise abroad, laborious and difficult as this may have been when letters took months to arrive, and when visits from home based committee members might be rare. But manage it they did, with in the process women acquiring experience and skills in this too, though not full autonomy.

Dissemination of information

The third central function of societies was the dissemination of information. From the early years it was an obligation of missionaries to send information to the SMS Directors for wider dissemination throughout Scotland, with a vehicle being created for this in 1820 with the launch of the *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*. SMS regulations stated that each missionary ‘shall keep a journal of his proceedings from the time of leaving England’ – and transmit a copy of this to the Directors twice a year if possible.⁹⁶ After a lengthy correspondence about missionaries’ journals, the Directors sent a letter in 1833 reminding the missionaries to keep journals and informing them that the Directors had passed a resolution because ‘journals were extremely meagre’. The Directors also suggested a series of themes ‘worthy of their observations’. These included ‘the moral condition of the natives’, religious and moral customs, mythology ‘especially on points much opposed to missionary exertion’, slavery and white opinions on this, customs and laws which were ‘inconsistent with Christianity’ or interfered with its spread, ‘the system and nature of education’, any statistical information relating to the moral or religious state of the people, and ‘striking examples of piety’ or ‘of depravity and insensibility’.⁹⁷ The missionaries were also exhorted not to embellish anything – the Directors wanted the ‘simple, unvarnished, unadorned truth’.⁹⁸ Thus regular communication between missionaries abroad and supporters at home, and through them the wider Scottish church-going public, was an essential part of the contract.

Similarly the SLA, both before and after the Disruption aimed to circulate information, ‘with a view to excite the attention of their Christian friends to the

⁹⁶ Regulations sent with letter from Rev Dr William Brown, Edinburgh, 28 November, 1822 to Rev W Clow, Secretary of the Bombay Corresponding Committee: NLS MS 8988.

⁹⁷ Letter from Directors to missionaries, 4 January, 1833: NLS MS 8986.

⁹⁸ Ibid.

wants and claims of the females of India'.⁹⁹ Information was disseminated through annual reports, and appeals and tracts were also widely circulated, such as the 'many thousands of Tracts, setting forth the wretched condition and degraded character of the Hindu Female, and the means of improving them'.¹⁰⁰ Speeches by prominent male supporters, such as Alexander Duff, were also published.¹⁰¹ Following the Disruption the Free Church began publication of women's periodicals in the 1840s, and the Church of Scotland around 1860. The United Presbyterian Church's *Zenana Quarterly* was a considerably later development. Ladies' Association agents were 'expected to keep up a regular correspondence with the Committee, and to furnish them with periodical accounts of their proceedings',¹⁰² and the copying of letters to be sent out to auxiliaries and local associations was common. For example, in 1858 'a corps of volunteers to prepare copies' of long 'epistles' from India was organised,¹⁰³ and in 1891 in Edinburgh alone the Free Church women's organisation had 'more than 100 ladies who make copies for circulation'.¹⁰⁴

Contributions to women's periodicals included letters and extracts from journals of women missionaries, and letters and articles from women at home. Editorial responsibilities also eventually became the province of women. Katie Anderson Charteris became editor of the Woman's Guild section of *Life and Work* in 1891,¹⁰⁵ while the *Women's Missionary Magazine of the Free Church of Scotland* was jointly edited by Christina Rainy and Mrs Duncan McLaren at its inception in 1901,¹⁰⁶ passing into the 'sole charge' of Miss Ethel Mackenzie in 1914.¹⁰⁷ Inevitably in the earlier years of publication the contributions of men played a significant role, whether as editors, or making contributions through letters, articles, or speeches to

⁹⁹ Scottish Ladies Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India, *8th Annual Report*, 1846.

¹⁰⁰ *Scottish Ladies' Association, First Report*, 1839, p 7.

¹⁰¹ For example, Alexander Duff, *Female Education in India, being the substance of an address delivered at the first annual meeting of the Scottish Ladies' Association, in connection with the Church of Scotland, for the promotion of female education in India*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, 1839.

¹⁰² *Scottish Ladies Association, Annual Report*, 1846.

¹⁰³ *The Eastern Female's Friend*, No V, January, 1858.

¹⁰⁴ *The Helpmeet*, No 1, January, 1891, p 8.

¹⁰⁵ Magnusson, *Out of Silence*, p 70.

¹⁰⁶ *Women's Missionary Magazine of the Free Church of Scotland*, No 19, July 1902.

¹⁰⁷ *Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland*, No 157, January, 1914, p 25.

meetings later reported in periodicals. Over time, however, women came more and more to take on these activities and roles.

Public meetings were also an important part of the distribution of 'missionary intelligence', with these being organised across Scotland. Foreign Missions committee members encouraged ministers to become Corresponding Members of Presbyteries, and to organise meetings to be addressed by missionaries on furlough.¹⁰⁸ For women, too, annual meetings of the associations, and other public meetings, provided a vehicle for publicity. Notably, in the early days of the ladies' associations, it was only their male supporters who addressed public meetings, as this was deemed inappropriate for women. However, from around the 1860s, women's role at meetings developed gradually from women addressing small gatherings of other women to large mixed audiences. Women started to speak 'First to little gatherings of their own sex, then to mixed meetings; finally to congregations and presbyteries!' This could shock audiences, and though 'The speakers did not like it' they persisted, since 'necessity was laid upon them!'¹⁰⁹ Indeed, by the 1870s, women were conducting speaking tours. In 1875, Miss Pigot, later to be at the centre of the 'Calcutta scandal',¹¹⁰ accompanied the Rev William Ferguson on a speaking tour in Scotland, and addressed forty-two meetings.¹¹¹ In the following year, Mrs Ferguson became the main speaker for the SLA in her husband's place, and in the same year the women's conference was instituted.¹¹² By the end of the century it was common for women to address public meetings, as well as addressing the annual women's conferences. In 1898, for example, Miss Emily Bernard had 'addressed appreciative audiences' in sixteen places, including the north of Scotland, Alloa, Melrose, seven meetings in Edinburgh and one in Leith,¹¹³ and Miss Plumb, a missionary on leave

¹⁰⁸ See for example letters from Rev Robert Young in the letter book of the Free Church Foreign Missions Committee, 1856-62, MS 7745:NLS.

¹⁰⁹ 'Historical Sketch of the Women's Foreign Missionary Society of the Free Church of Scotland', in *The Helpmeet*, Vol III, No 36, October 1899, p 287.

¹¹⁰ See footnote 53 above for a brief summary of this.

¹¹¹ Magnusson, *Out of Silence*, p 23.

¹¹² *Ibid.*, p 23.

¹¹³ *News of Female Missions*, New Series No 1, January, 1898.

from India, was reported as being at a missionary conference in Aberdeen, 'to tell of her mission at Sialkot'.¹¹⁴

The Edinburgh University Missionary Association, too, played a role in the provision of missionary propaganda. Regular publication of 'missionary intelligence' was initiated by the Edinburgh University Missionary Association, with the *Home and Foreign Missionary Record for the Church of Scotland* being the brainchild of association president John Braidwood, subsequently to become a missionary in Madras.¹¹⁵ By 1842 this publication had a monthly circulation of 10,000, resulting in a 'zealous atmosphere' in Scottish universities.¹¹⁶ Like the other missionary societies, the EMMS also expected its missionaries to send home information that could be used to attract further support for the cause. The missionary agent was 'recommended to keep a journal of all his proceedings' and to send selections from this 'home, for the inspection of the Committee, from time to time'.¹¹⁷ This included observations of cases in his practice, and 'accounts of whatever remarkable objects or phenomena of nature he may happen to see'.¹¹⁸ The society published occasional papers, and later produced a quarterly paper.¹¹⁹ Board members and other supporters also gave lectures to students on the theme of medical missionary work, spoke at public meetings, wrote for journals, and otherwise publicised the society's work.¹²⁰ In 1857, Livingstone spoke at a public breakfast meeting in Edinburgh, under the auspices of the society, with about 200 people coming to hear him.¹²¹

Thus it can be seen that the provision of 'missionary intelligence' to a wider public at home was a central part of the activities of missionary supporters at home, and the provision of information for this purpose was an obligation for the missionary. The type of information sought was also determined by those at home, who specified the subject matter that readers at home would be interested in, made requests for specific

¹¹⁴ *News of Female Missions*, New Series No 10, October, 1898, p 76.

¹¹⁵ See Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries*, p 232, and p 236, fn 131.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, p 232.

¹¹⁷ Coldstream, 'Historical Sketch', p 231.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p 231.

¹¹⁹ See Taylor, *Century of Service*, p 3.

¹²⁰ For example, the 1850 annual report of the society notes that 300 copies of a volume of lectures had been sold. EMMS, *Annual Report*, 1850.

information, data and statistics, and who reminded missionaries of their duties in this regard. Whether this information always reached readers as ‘simple, unvarnished, unadorned truth’ will be explored in the next chapter.

It has been shown above that from the start missionary societies functioned through networks across Scotland, at first informally as autonomous locally based organisations or as auxiliaries to other societies such as the SMS, GMS or LMS. Regular correspondence and circulation of literature took place between these associations, and the *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register* covered the range of activities throughout Scotland. The formal support of the main churches also entailed a formalisation of organisation for raising funds and disseminating information and was extensive, even if it did not function effectively everywhere. The ladies’ associations continued to organise in a more informal manner until the 1880s, though the Edinburgh associations had adopted the title ‘Scottish’ in the immediate aftermath of the Disruption, and also functioned through Scottish networks, albeit less extensive before the 1880s than those of the churches. Edinburgh and Glasgow were at the centre of these networks, especially Edinburgh. In addition there were locally and institutionally based organisations such as the EMMS and student associations, which had a primarily local identity, though had links to similar organisations in other cities and towns, and with the church networks.

As indicated above these activities were typical of 19th century civil society organisations, which sought to engage the public in supporting their causes. While all of these activities fulfilled the aims of sustaining missionary activity abroad, they also entailed a constant dialogue with people at home, carried on in a number of fora, formal and informal. Presentation of accounts and other publications provided evidence both of the success of the efforts of the respective churches, and of the beneficence of individuals, associations, or congregations, and thus reaffirmed their status. Circulation of literature, public meetings, lectures and exhibitions, provided a means of projecting the missionary experience of empire in a range of settings, both formal and didactic, and informal and social. Such activities sought to structure and

¹²¹ *The Scotsman*, Thursday, 24 September, 1857; see also Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, p 19.

regulate forms of social interaction at home, while also demonstrating the capacity of missionary societies and churches to similarly intervene in the structuring and regulation of life abroad.

The composition of committee membership

If active membership of committees was relatively small, the social composition of committees suggests that members often occupied positions of power and influence. Drawing on sources of information about membership of Edinburgh based societies and committees, it can be seen that the committee membership exhibited a number of typical characteristics. These were overlaps and links in membership of different societies and committees held by individuals, the tendency for family members and neighbours to be engaged together in the same form of associational activity, and the dominance of middle-class professionals.

In the early phase of missionary society activity the leading members were evangelicals, who frequently held membership of a range of philanthropic societies, including other missionary societies, home missions, and benevolent institutions. This has been demonstrated to be the case for committee members of the Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Negro Slavery in 1835, for example.¹²² Using Rice's data (see Appendix II), it can be seen that several also held membership of missionary societies: the Edinburgh Society in Aid of Moravian Missions; the Church of England Missionary Association; the SMS; and the Church of Scotland Committee for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts. In turn it is apparent that members of the SMS were instrumental in founding the EMMS in 1841, for example, Dr John Abercrombie and Dr William Beilby.

Information on members of the EMMS' committees for selected years throughout the 19th century (see Appendix II) indicates links with ladies' associations, and with the foreign mission committees of all three main Presbyterian denominations, through, for example, Rev Hamilton Macgill, Convener of the United Presbyterian

¹²² C Duncan Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, Louisiana, Louisiana State University Press, 1981. Appendix B, pp 203-205.

Foreign Mission Committee,¹²³ and the Rev John McMurtrie of the Church of Scotland Foreign Mission Committee, who was also editor of *Life and Work*.¹²⁴ Links with the Free Church's Foreign Mission Committee appear to have been particularly strong with several EMMS' committee members serving on this simultaneously in the late 1870s, for example. Similarly there was an overlap in membership with the Free Church ladies' association. A number of missionaries who had retired to Scotland were also active as committee members, for example, Alexander Duff, John Braidwood, and Kenneth Macqueen.

The available information on the place of residence of EMMS' committee members (see Appendix II) indicates that they were concentrated in Edinburgh's New Town, and that family links connected EMMS and Ladies' Auxiliary members. The SLA of the Church of Scotland, with a general committee of fifty members, were mostly New Town residents, and the listings of male presidents of the Association suggest that family links were also common there.

In the earlier period of missionary society activity it was standard practice to have prominent patrons or presidents, whether leading church figures, titled or landed gentry or civic leaders. For example, Thomas Chalmers was President of the Edinburgh Association in Aid of Moravian Missions in 1846; the Lord Provost served on the committee of the Edinburgh Auxiliary of the LMS in 1846; and in 1841 the Marquess of Breadalbane was President of the SMS, while Sir George Sinclair Bart, MP was Vice-President.¹²⁵ With support of foreign missions being largely taken over by the churches after the Disruption this pattern was to change, since this was directed by foreign mission committees made up of ministers and elders. Patronage by the upper classes was still apparent, however, in the post-Disruption SLA, which had twelve titled or landed ladies as patronesses in 1846-7. Titled ladies were not absent from the Free Church ladies' association committee, though were fewer in number.

¹²³ See Lowe, *Jubilee Memorial*.

¹²⁴ Magnusson, *Out of Silence*, p 54.

¹²⁵ See *New Edinburgh Almanac*, 1841, 1846.

The EMMS' was initiated in 1841 at a meeting, chaired by Lord Provost Sir James Spital, and at which 'the University, the clergy, the medical profession, the merchants and bankers of the city were well represented'.¹²⁶ The society's first President, Dr John Abercrombie, was 'the acknowledged leader of the medical profession in Scotland' and the Vice-Presidents were Professors Thomas Chalmers and Dr W P Alison.¹²⁷ Subsequently all the EMMS' presidents were doctors or professors of medicine, many of them eminent.¹²⁸ For example, of eleven founder members, five were Fellows of the Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh, and several were Fellows of the Royal College of Physicians. A number also served as Presidents of their professional bodies, the Royal College of Surgeons, and the Royal College of Physicians, were recipients of honorary degrees and other honours, or held royal appointments.¹²⁹ Student societies, made up largely of divinity students and medical students, also liked to have prominent figures gracing their committees. The Edinburgh University Student Association had as its President in 1886, leading Church of Scotland figure, the Rev Prof. Charteris, (amongst other things founder of the Woman's Guild), while in 1899, Sir William Muir, the Principal of the University, was Honorary President of Edinburgh University Missionary Association, and the Vice President was Lord Balfour of Burleigh.

This evidence suggests then that the committee members who directed foreign missions and organised support at home were frequently active in a range of societies, and were likely to be linked to other members through religious, family, neighbourhood, professional, and social networks. The key players in the Edinburgh committees were members of the local elite, many with addresses in Edinburgh's New Town. The endorsement of other members of the local elite, such as landed gentry, civic leaders, university professors and principals, was frequently sought for such societies, and thus these patterns of committee membership were similar to those described by Morton in his study of Edinburgh's civil society organisations,

¹²⁶ Taylor, *A Century of Service*, p 3.

¹²⁷ W P Alison played an important role in debates on public health in mid-19th century Edinburgh. See, for example, Richard Rodger, *The Transformation of Edinburgh*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001.

¹²⁸ Wilkinson, *The Coogate Doctors*, p 78.

¹²⁹ See Lowe, *Jubilee Memorial*.

both in terms of the dominance of middle class professionals and in having prominent supporters to demonstrate the 'public approval of the elite'.¹³⁰ While in the earlier part of the century the patronage of landed gentry was common, in the second half of the 19th century, the leadership of such organisations came to be even more dominated by middle-class professionals themselves, and in particular by ministers, doctors, university professors, and their female relatives. No doubt the struggle around patronage in the Church of Scotland which led to the Disruption played its part in this shift, but it was also the case that the institutional support given to foreign missions by the churches obviated the necessity for it, since committee membership was regulated by the norms of church government.

The basis of support for the missionary movement

The growth of support in Scotland for the missionary movement has been outlined above, as have its aims and operations. Through an examination of Edinburgh based activity, it has been shown how this movement was directed by the middle classes, through networks of religious and philanthropic, professional, social, and family connections. It has also been indicated that there was a continuous interaction between the national and the local in the course of this activity. This dominance of the leadership of the foreign mission movement by the middle classes is consistent with the pattern of leadership of domestic voluntary societies and institutions by 'the better-off members of the urban middle class' described by Morgan and Trainor,¹³¹ and it is likely that the patterns in other Scottish cities were relatively similar to that in Edinburgh.

That Glasgow was also a centre of active support for the missionary movement is evidenced by the early establishment of the Glasgow Missionary Society, the formation of the Glasgow Female Association and its continued existence, and the support of leading Glasgow industrialists for the Livingstonia mission, for example. In Aberdeen, active interest is indicated by accounts of missionary meetings in the

¹³⁰ Graeme Morton, *Unionist Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press, 1999, p 70.

¹³¹ N Morgan and R Trainor, 'The Dominant Classes' in W Hamish Fraser and R J Morris, *People and Society in Scotland, Volume II, 1830-1914*, Edinburgh, John Donald, first published 1990, 1995, pp 103-137, p 129.

missionary periodicals and biographies of missionaries, and by the contribution of Aberdeen graduates to the mission field.¹³² Aberdeen also had its ladies' association, which supported independently missionary work in Sialkot for a period, though was unable to sustain this in the longer term.¹³³ Less evidence is available about missionary society activity in Dundee, though this was clearly in existence at an early stage as Thomas Chalmers' sermon to the Dundee Missionary Society in 1812 indicates,¹³⁴ and that there was continued interest is indicated by the contribution made to the Livingstonia mission at its launch,¹³⁵ and by accounts of Mary Slessor's attendance at missionary meetings of the UPC.¹³⁶ It seems likely that the absence of a university in Dundee until the establishment of University College in 1881 might provide an explanation for the lower profile of missionary associations, though in general further local studies are needed to establish the extent of activity and similarities and variations in patterns of support. Since this research has been focussed on the leadership of the movement, it has inevitably focussed on elites, though there is some evidence of working class support for foreign missions, which suggests that this too would merit further study.

Though there were likely to have been similarities in patterns of support, differences in class composition between cities could influence the balance of leadership between different sectors of the middle classes, as is illustrated, for example, by the prominence of Glasgow industrialists in supporting the Livingstonia mission.¹³⁷ Examples of support from the business community in Edinburgh are much harder to find, though one prominent business supporter of foreign missions was A L Bruce, a director of Wm Younger's brewery.¹³⁸ Married to Livingstone's daughter, Agnes, he was a co-founder of the RSGS, director of the African Lakes Company, and

¹³² See, for example, James Johnston, *Dr Laws of Livingstonia*, London, Partridge and Co, 1909; and John D Hargreaves, *Aberdeenshire to Africa*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1981.

¹³³ See Rhonda Anne Semple, *Missionary Women: Gender, Professionalism and the Victorian Idea of Christian Mission*, Woodbridge and Rochester, The Boydell Press, 2003.

¹³⁴ Maxwell, 'Civilization or Christianity?', p 127.

¹³⁵ Free Church of Scotland, *Eastern Central Africa: Livingstonia; the mission of the Free Church of Scotland to Lake Nyassa*, Edinburgh, John Greig and Sons, 2nd edition, 1876.

¹³⁶ See W P Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar, Pioneer Missionary*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, Fifth Edition, 1916.

¹³⁷ For details of this, see McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi*, p 29-30.

¹³⁸ H W Macmillan, *The Origins and Development of the African Lakes Company, 1878-1908*, unpublished PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1970, p 105.

supporter of the Livingstonia expedition. Sir John Cowan, who owned paper mills at Penicuik also contributed funds to this expedition,¹³⁹ but there was, however, no Edinburgh equivalent of the Glasgow industrialists who provided much of the finance. Yet Edinburgh's middle classes were likely to have been substantial contributors as a whole, through donations, legacies and other forms of support.

Given Edinburgh's class composition it is not surprising how dominant professional groups were in this movement. By 1830 the middle classes represented just over 20 per cent of the population of Edinburgh,¹⁴⁰ and at the turn of the century Edinburgh still 'contained an unusually large professional and administrative class', with eleven per cent of males being in administration and the professions in 1881, and nine per cent in 1901.¹⁴¹ The fact that Edinburgh sat at 'the apex' of Scotland's 'legal and religious systems', and that its University enjoyed a prestigious 'international reputation' in medical science had helped to shape its social composition,¹⁴² and ministers and doctors were particularly prominent amongst leading supporters of foreign missions. Given that these were in essence a religious enterprise the clergy naturally took the lead role in this sphere, as in other spheres of voluntary action 'both organising such activities and endorsing them as respectable'.¹⁴³ The medical profession, too, had established itself as an influential group in the early 19th century,¹⁴⁴ and those medical men who were active supporters of missionary work, whether through the EMMS or through the churches' Foreign Mission committees, were, in Allan McLaren's words, 'firmly embedded in the bourgeois class'.¹⁴⁵ Though middle class growth was not unique to Edinburgh, and indeed was substantial in all major Scottish cities in the second half of the 19th century,

¹³⁹ McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi*, p 30

¹⁴⁰ Rodger, *The Transformation of Edinburgh*, p 18.

¹⁴¹ Robert Q Gray, *The Labour Aristocracy in Victorian Edinburgh*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1976, p 19.

¹⁴² Rodger, *The Transformation of Edinburgh*, p 13.

¹⁴³ Graeme Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*, p 130

¹⁴⁴ Robert D Anderson, Michael Lynch and Nicholas Phillipson, *The University of Edinburgh: An Illustrated History*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2003, p 106.

¹⁴⁵ Allan McLaren, 'The Liberal Professions within the Scottish Class Structure 1760-1860: A Comparative Study of Aberdeen Clergymen, Doctors and Lawyers' in T M Devine, (ed), *Scottish Elites*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1994.

Edinburgh remained in the lead followed by Aberdeen, and then by industrial Glasgow and Dundee.¹⁴⁶

Thus, though it seems likely that other cities would exhibit a similar pattern of support for foreign missions, with short-lived organisations as well as sustained support for national networks of the churches and of ladies' associations, Edinburgh also had some distinctive characteristics which may have contributed to higher levels of support. Edinburgh was the seat of church government, which favoured the dominance of Edinburgh ministers and elders on Foreign Mission committees, and of Edinburgh women in the ladies' associations. This peak position was underscored not just by its being the site of the annual General Assemblies, and the annual women's conferences initiated in the 1880s, but also by its hosting of the World Missionary Conference of 1910 and of the six-month Livingstone Centenary exhibition at the Royal Scottish Museum in 1913. A further distinctive characteristic of Edinburgh was the capacity of its medical profession to sustain the EMMS, whereas medical missionary associations elsewhere did not survive.

The growth of the middle classes in the Scottish cities in general seems to have been an important factor in the growth of support for foreign missions. The tendency for Scotland's graduates and professionally skilled to seek employment opportunities outside Scotland was commented on by contemporaries such as Rosebery, and has been noted by historians.¹⁴⁷ It seems likely that this contributed to the rising numbers of missionaries, though religious motives should not be underestimated.¹⁴⁸ Indeed, such motives appeared particularly important for women, and the appeal to these facilitated women's access to medical education, as a case could be made for women doctors in India to treat women to whom men were refused access, as Alexander has shown. Indeed, she argues that her study of early Glasgow women medical graduates

¹⁴⁶ In 1911, they had respectively middle-class occupations as percentage of the occupied population: 37%, 30.4%, 27.6%, and 17.8%. Morgan and Trainor, 'The Dominant Classes', p 106.

¹⁴⁷ Anderson, for example, notes the numbers of Scots graduates joining the Indian Civil Service between 1855 and 1874. See, R D Anderson, *Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1983, p 325; and Checkland has commented on the tradition of the banks exporting banking staff. See S G Checkland, *Scottish Banking. A History, 1695-1973*, Glasgow, Collins, 1975, p 492-3.

‘dispels the oft-quoted myth’ that women went abroad for lack of opportunity at home.¹⁴⁹ However, it appears that women’s choices may have been constrained by what was deemed acceptable for them, and religious motives, however genuine they may have been, may have been regarded as the only admissible ones for admission to professional status.¹⁵⁰

In general, a mixture of motives appears to have been behind both the taking up of a missionary vocation and of support for it at home. It has been suggested that domestic philanthropy was based on such a mixture, including ‘religious, humanitarian, social anxiety, and zeal for personal distinction’, and this can be similarly be applied to foreign missions.¹⁵¹ Even the Glasgow industrialists who supported the Livingstonia mission seem to have been largely motivated by philanthropic and humanitarian rather than economic concerns, since they did not derive much, if any, economic benefit from the associated project of the African Lakes Company, which was not a commercial success.¹⁵² Philanthropic activity, however, was also important in terms of social standing, since membership of committees and the size of financial donations given were a matter of public record.¹⁵³ The support for foreign missions, illustrated by the forms of associational activity of the Edinburgh middle classes outlined above, was then typical of the evangelicalism through which the new middle classes defined their social identity. Edinburgh, like other Scottish cities, was ‘a vibrant focus of aggressive Christianity with endless and very successful appeals for money for building churches, manses

¹⁴⁸ Both Piggin and Macdonald stress this point. See Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries*; Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*.

¹⁴⁹ Wendy Alexander, ‘Early Glasgow Women Medical Graduates’ in Eleanor Gordon and Esther Breitenbach, (eds) *The World is Ill-Divided: Women’s Work in Scotland in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990, pp 70-94, p 88.

¹⁵⁰ The view that women entering the medical profession were restricted to acting out of such motives is expressed by Frances Storrs Johnston, ‘In the Path of the Pioneer Medical Women’ in *Atalanta’s Garland: being the book of the Edinburgh University Women’s Union*, Edinburgh, University Press, 1926, which was published to celebrate the 21st anniversary of the Women’s Union.

¹⁵¹ Morgan and Trainor, ‘The Dominant Classes’, p 129.

¹⁵² See W Thompson, *Glasgow and Africa, connexions and attitudes*, Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Strathclyde, 1970; see also McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi*.

¹⁵³ See Checkland, *Philanthropy in Victorian Scotland*.

and mission stations, for mounting foreign missions, and for the publication of tracts'.¹⁵⁴

An integral part of this definition of social identity by the middle classes was the significant role played by women in its construction, and this is illustrated well by their participation in the missionary movement. The strength of support for women's associations in Edinburgh reflected its class character, in that this was a movement led by upper class and middle class women, though with a wider basis of support. What is particularly striking, however, is that in the course of the 19th century, women negotiated changes in their role in public life through religiously based associational activity. Not only did they consistently play an important 'auxiliary' role in raising funds for the missionary enterprise, they organised their own women's organisations to support missionaries, learned the skills of management, public speaking, writing for and editing publications, and made their way into the formal structures of the churches. Like other forms of philanthropic activity in which middle class women engaged, such activities provided 'a training in organisational and administrative skills'.¹⁵⁵ Women created for themselves opportunities for work outside the home, whether paid or unpaid, both as organisers at home and as missionaries abroad. In facilitating this move from the private to the public sphere, women's membership of missionary societies and ladies' associations can be said to be 'proto-feminist'.¹⁵⁶ That religion was a major vehicle for women to enter public campaigning, and forms of social activity outside the home, was in general part of 19th century experience, as Brown has shown. The foreign mission movement provides an instance of this, while other movements, focussed on problems at home, also provided such a vehicle, for working class as well as middle class women, as for example in the case of the temperance movement.

There were limits to the scope of women's action, however, in that the ultimate authority continued to be with male committees or male office bearers in ladies'

¹⁵⁴ Callum Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1997, p 102.

¹⁵⁵ Eleanor Gordon, 'Women's Spheres', in Fraser and Morris (eds) *People and Society in Scotland, Vol II*, pp 206-235, p 226.

¹⁵⁶ See Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland*, p 201.

associations. Women remained excluded from the ministry (until 1968 in the Church of Scotland), and from eldership, though the creation of deaconesses in the Church of Scotland in 1888 was a move towards providing them with a formal position in church structures. Macdonald has shown that conflicts and tensions sometimes arose between women and men in this process of renegotiation of gender roles.¹⁵⁷ However, it is clear that women's involvement in these activities and the extension of their role took place with men's support. This is evident both in the frequent family connections between members of missionary societies and foreign mission committees, ladies' auxiliaries, and ladies' associations, and in the stated views of male missionary supporters. Thus, as will be argued in later chapters, there was a sharing of values between women and men about the importance of the missionary movement, and also about the respective roles of women and men within this. The existence of male allies in this enterprise was arguably a crucial factor in women's successful exploitation of the opportunities it offered.

This expansion of women's role in public life, both paid and unpaid, within the foreign mission movement was part of a wider process of social change in which women used philanthropy 'as a means of extending and redefining their role', and in which they campaigned for access to professions, especially teaching, nursing and medicine.¹⁵⁸ Philanthropic activity and the concept of 'women's mission' legitimated women's public role, while over time charity and philanthropic work became increasingly professionalised, whether at home or abroad.¹⁵⁹ At the same time such philanthropy could function as a means for the imposition of middle-class values on working class women at home, and within the imperial context for exercising control over other's lives. As Gordon and Nair have argued, religious discourses, which women drew upon in enlarging their public role, were diverse, contested, and open to interpretation, and middle-class women drew on both these and on imperial discourses to 'sanction a public and political role for women'.¹⁶⁰ In doing so they were also actively constructing their identity as Scottish women.

¹⁵⁷ See Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*.

¹⁵⁸ Gordon, 'Women's Spheres', p 224.

¹⁵⁹ Eleanor Gordon and Gwyneth Nair, *Public Lives: Women, Family and Society in Victorian Britain*, New Haven and London, Yale University Press, 2003, see p 4, and p 225.

¹⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p 4.

Conclusion

This chapter has outlined the pattern of growth in support in Scotland for foreign missions from the late 18th century to the early 20th century. While civil society organisations created to further this first came into existence outside the institutional framework of the established church it was led by evangelicals in the established church and in dissenting churches, who were also often supporters of other religiously motivated bodies, such as the anti-slavery movement. By the 1820s this activity had come to be formally supported by the Church of Scotland, and following the Disruption, was largely channelled through the three main Presbyterian churches, and was energised by the evangelical fervour that accompanied the Disruption. The movement was sustained by a network of locally based committees, and governed by a central committee within each church. Parallel to this was the development of women's organisations, which maintained informal links with the churches from the 1840s until the 1880s when they became formalised as part of church structures. A range of local associations existed in Edinburgh though some were small and some short-lived. Of these local associations student associations and medical missionary work sustained activity from their foundation in the 1820s and 1840s respectively. These long-lived local associations were also connected to the national networks of the churches through overlapping memberships, or regular forms of contact. Similar patterns of associational activity were likely to have existed in other Scottish cities and towns, and while such groups will have had a local identity, they will also have been conscious of themselves as part of a national network.

Developments in imperial territories provided a stimulus to growth, as people responded to the appeal to aid the 'civilising mission' that the churches were supporting in India, Africa, and elsewhere. At the same time the growth of middle class professions, and the opening up of these to women, produced a supply of educated and well qualified personnel, who might be attracted by a missionary career, both for religious motives and by the opportunities offered to apply professional skills in a new and challenging environment. At home, it was the same middle classes who supported and directed the movement. Their involvement in this

activity was typical of the religiously motivated and highly visible philanthropy of 19th century Scotland, which as well as functioning as a public statement of respectability and status, also served to project models of behaviour for others to adopt both at home and abroad. This desire to control and regulate the lives of others can be interpreted as a manifestation of middle class anxiety about the potential for social disorder arising from rapid urbanisation and industrialisation, and the growth of the working classes and the urban poor.¹⁶¹ Similar anxiety about loss of control in empire may have contributed to the increased enthusiasm for missionary work in reaction to the Indian Mutiny of 1857. That home and foreign mission work was carried out in parallel, and sometimes by the same people, is suggestive of the inter-relationships of such concerns, as is the similarity in the use of language to describe the urban poor and native peoples in colonial territories. It also seems plausible that the growing difficulty of imposing middle class control through philanthropy on the working classes at home in the later part of the 19th century led to a displacement of their energy towards the foreign mission movement which reached its height in the decades leading up to the First World War.¹⁶²

The foreign mission movement represents the most significant form of civil society engagement with empire in Scotland in this period. It was closely linked to other manifestations of moral and religious concerns respecting the administration of empire, through overlapping memberships, aims and ethos of such organisations. It was also linked to later manifestations of enthusiasm for imperialism, through similar associational and social networks, and through its profile within debates about empire or at events in which empire was celebrated. Indeed, as the movement expanded from the 1870s onwards, the perception of its success may have helped to feed imperialist sentiment. What makes it distinctive, however, are a number of features which were lacking in other forms of empire related civil society organisations. These are its longevity and continued existence throughout the period, its pattern of growth, its scale of membership, its institutional base which supported

¹⁶¹ See, for example, Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland*, and Morton, *Unionist Nationalism*.

¹⁶² For accounts of this change in attitude towards middle-class philanthropy from the working classes in the late 19th century, see Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland*; and S J Brown, 'Thomas Chalmers and the Communal Ideal in Victorian Scotland' in T C Smout (ed), *Victorian Values*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1992, pp 61-80.

systems of organisational networks throughout Scotland, and its direction from the centres of church governance. Furthermore, as a mode of engagement with empire, it controlled and directed personnel, financed directly by Scots, and it controlled and directed the acquisition and dissemination of knowledge of the empire and of colonial peoples. It did this autonomously from the state, and therefore represented a direct intervention in the governance of empire from Scottish institutions. It did not involve large numbers of missionaries abroad, but the impact of their work and vision of empire was amplified through Scottish wide networks of civil society organisations. Through such means the experience of empire ‘dramatized the triumph’ of the Scottish middle classes and their capacity to shape the new world that was emerging under the impact of imperialism.¹⁶³

Foreign missions were established as a focus of associational activity from the earliest stage of development of such new forms of voluntary activity, which moved away from the political clubs of the 18th century, and this illustrates the importance of religious and moral concerns in driving the formation of such organisations. Such concerns were also manifested in the range of philanthropic work at home and in moral campaigns such as the temperance movement. As was also the case with this, missionary societies included women as active participants from the start, albeit in separate auxiliaries and organisations, and indeed these were among the earliest forms of women’s involvement in public life. The missionary movement conducted its business in a manner typical of 19th century civil society organisations, ensuring public engagement through regular publicity, fund-raising and social events, as well as managing its agents and controlling the acquisition and dissemination of information. Much of this activity was designed to give the movement a public profile, and to popularise it through both formal and informal means. Though, within the literature produced by the movement itself, little mention was made of denominational rivalries, this activity was pursued particularly energetically by the Free Church and the United Presbyterian Church, who were more effective publicists

¹⁶³ Hobsbawm has argued that imperialism dramatized for the middle classes their success as nothing else could have done, pointing out that the number of people directly involved in empire was relatively small. See Eric Hobsbawm, *The Age of Empire, 1875-1914*, London, Phoenix Press, 1987, p 81-2.

as well as recruiters of missionaries than the Church of Scotland. Thus the energy with which this enterprise was promoted expressed the inter-denominational rivalries which surfaced in disputes at home. All the active supporters of the movement, however, whatever their denomination, were engaged in the active construction of representations of empire, which they mediated for people at home, at the same time reconstructing their own identity in the process.

Chapter 5: 'Missionary intelligence' and the construction of identities: religion, race, gender and class

Introduction

As Chapter Four has shown, the provision of 'missionary intelligence' was an integral part of the contract between the missionary agent and the sponsoring society or church, and it was a central aim of the home-based organisations to ensure that such information was disseminated as widely as possible throughout Scotland. As a consequence there was throughout the period being studied an expansion of literature about the work of missionaries both in terms of volume and of range of types of literature. This chapter outlines the growth of this literature, and provides an analysis of the dominant discourses which are present in it, with the exception of discourses of national identity, which are separately discussed in Chapter Six.

This literature will be referred to in general as 'missionary literature', and is defined as literature by and about missionaries in foreign missions, primarily in India and Africa, where the majority of Scots missionaries were sent. This literature encompassed a range of genres: pamphlets containing sermons, speeches, and addresses; annual reports; periodical literature; collections of occasional papers; histories of missions; biographies, and the occasional memoir or autobiography. From the time of the establishment of the first missionary societies at the end of the 18th century letters from missionaries were copied and circulated, and pamphlets of sermons and addresses were published, with these remaining perennial throughout the 19th century. In the 1820s the first missionary periodical was published, and from the 1840s, following the Disruption, such literature was published on denominational lines. Between the 1830s and 1870s there were a handful of memoirs and biographies of missionaries, with this taking off as a genre from the 1880s onwards. Histories, too, began to be published more frequently from this period.

These forms of literature, with the exception of some biographies or memoirs, might be defined as being 'official' literature, in the sense of being generated, published, or sanctioned by the missionary societies and churches. The literature examined here is

that aimed at an adult audience. Juvenile literature on missionaries, with its heavy handed moralising and sentimentality, is markedly different from adult literature, suggesting that any adequate analysis of this genre requires to be grounded in an understanding of the construction of childhood in the late Victorian and Edwardian eras, and would merit separate research, along with other representations of empire aimed at children such as school text books. This research is also restricted to analysis of literature and verbal representations. These have the advantage of accessibility, continuity throughout the period, and of range and volume, and therefore provide a rich source of data. Analysis of visual representations, monuments, architecture and so on, would add depth and complexity to the analysis, but also demand different analytical techniques to understand the language of different forms of visual representation, and for this reason there has been no attempt to include such analysis here. The analysis of representations of the missionary enterprise in this thesis is confined to those which were part of public discourses. This is because a central concern of the thesis is the collective process of identity construction of national identity, which is necessarily public. This is not to say that national identity is neither articulated nor constructed in private contexts, such as in the home or in family life, but rather that it is above all in the public sphere that such representations are affirmed, endorsed, or contested.

Forms of literature and their popularity

The earliest forms of Scottish missionary literature were sermons and addresses published in pamphlet form, and missionary society annual reports. The first Scottish missionary periodical, the *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, was published in 1820, and subsequently there was continuous production of missionary periodicals in some form throughout the period. Periodicals were published by both missionary societies and churches. The Church of Scotland launched its first periodical in 1838. The *Home and Foreign Missionary Record*, with a monthly circulation of ten thousand, helped to fulfil the ambition of “saturating” the religious public with missionary intelligence’.¹ After the Disruption of 1843, most periodicals

¹ This was instigated by John Braidwood of the Edinburgh University Missionary Association. He subsequently became a missionary in India, supported by the Association. See Stuart Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries 1789-1858: the Social Background, Motives and Training of British*

were published by the main Presbyterian churches, who produced separate periodicals on women's missionary work with women, as well as their general records of home and foreign missions. The latter could be described as 'gender-blind', giving general accounts of missionary work which would have included men and women, but little visibility to women's work as such. The consequence of this is that women's role in the missionary enterprise would have been visible to women readers, but less so to men. The Episcopalian Church also published a missionary periodical, commencing at a much later date, probably around 1900.² The EMMS produced occasional papers, annual reports, and a quarterly paper, though very few of these appear to have survived.³ Over 20 missionary periodicals have been identified as having been published in the period studied (see Appendix III for a list of these, their dates of foundation, and period for which they were produced).

Protestant Missionaries to India, Sutton Courtenay Press, 1984, p 232. See also J Murray Mitchell, *In Western India: recollections of my early missionary life*, Edinburgh, 1899, p 8.

² There are three issues of this periodical held in the National Library of Scotland. The volume numbers suggest that it had been started c 1900.

³ The EMMS, however, has the benefit of having had several histories written about its work, and a book of memoirs from one of its leading members, William Burns Thomson.

Table 1: Selected missionary periodicals: circulation figures for selected years⁴

Denomination	Title	Circulation – selected years		
		1874	1887	
C of S				
	Home and Foreign Missionary Record	18,000 ⁵	25,000	
	Life and Work		100,000	
FC of S*		1860	1891	1893
	Monthly and Missionary Record	23,000		82,000
	The Helpmeet		11,000 ⁶	
UPC*		1860	1899	
	Missionary Record	40,000	73,000	
	Zenana Quarterly		20,000 ⁷	
UFC of S*		1903		
	Missionary Record	145,000		

* The Free Church was founded in 1843; the United Presbyterian Church in 1847; and the United Free Church through the union of the two in 1900.

Table 2: Proportions of church memberships receiving selected periodicals⁸

Denomination	Title	Year	Proportion of members receiving
C of S	Home and Foreign Missionary Record	1875	1 in 20
	Life and Work	1903	1 in 5.8
FC of S	Monthly and Missionary Record	1875	1 in 7
		1900	1 in 3.5
UPC	Missionary Record	1875	2 in 7
		1900	1 in 2.7
UFC	Missionary Record	1903	1 in 3.4

As the above tables indicate, the periodicals of the major churches all appear to have achieved a wide circulation amongst their memberships, though not saturation by any means. There is also evidence of the active encouragement of church members by

⁴ Except where otherwise indicated, all circulation figures quoted in this paragraph are from Dow. See Derek Alexander Dow, *Domestic response and reaction to the Foreign Missionary enterprises of the principal Scottish Presbyterian churches, 1873-1929*, Unpublished Ph.D thesis, Edinburgh University, 1977, pp 396-402.

⁵ *Home and Foreign Missionary Record*, Church of Scotland, May 1, 1874, p 25.

⁶ *The Helpmeet*, No III, July, 1891.

⁷ This is referred to in the report of the UPC Synod's Women's Meetings, though I have not been able to track down any copies of this publication. See *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, 54th year, No 6, June, 1899, p 207.

⁸ Table compiled from figures given in Dow, *Domestic reaction and response*.

ministers to read and subscribe to periodicals, including free distribution of these to all members of the congregation. Indeed, Dow has argued that by the 1860s it was generally accepted that ministers should make pulpit readings of extracts from missionary periodicals, and that local presbyteries frequently encouraged this.⁹ Typically the missionary society and church periodicals covered missions both at home and abroad.¹⁰ As well as work with the poor at home, this included efforts to convert Jews and Catholics in Britain and Ireland. Missionary work abroad similarly involved efforts at conversion of Jews and Catholics in European countries, the middle east and Russia, as well as the better known efforts in the Indian sub-continent, Africa and the West Indies. In addition to descriptions of missionary work, the periodicals contained records of the activities of missionary supporters, appeals for funds and other forms of assistance, and details of money raised. They therefore provide a detailed record both of the type of work carried out in the mission field, of personnel, and of activities and organisational arrangements at home. Such publications also included information about the work of colonial and sister churches, which had grown up as a result of the Presbyterian diaspora, as well as about mission fields.¹¹ Furthermore, as the Presbyterian churches in British colonies and (later) dominions developed they too began to support missionary activities and to send missionaries to various fields.¹² In addition to the journals there is a large volume of ephemeral literature, such as sermons and addresses, often published by popular demand. Histories of missions emerged later in the 19th century, with a jubilee year often being the prompt for such a volume. Histories of particular mission stations are best exemplified by the series of volumes produced by the United Free Church of Scotland following the unification of the Free Church of Scotland and the

⁹ Dow, *Domestic Reaction and Response*, p 426.

¹⁰ *Kikuyu News* was an exception to this, covering only the mission in Kenya. This was sent only to those who had committed themselves to support particular fields, and had a small circulation in Scotland itself. See Dow, *Domestic Response and Reaction*, p 402.

¹¹ For example, the *Home and Foreign Missionary Record of the Church of Scotland* lists missionary and church news items about the following places: Africa, North America, Austria, China, the Chinese in California, Greece, India, Ireland, London, Persia, Polynesia, Sandwich Islands, Siam, Syria, Turkey, and West Africa. See *Home and Foreign Missionary Record of the Church of Scotland*, Vol XV, Jan, 1860.

¹² See, for example, references to donations from Canada in *Church of Scotland News of Female Missions*, No 3, July, 1863, p 76, and New Series No 1, January 1898, p 2; and to 3 women missionaries from New Zealand working for a mission in China, partly supported from Scotland and partly from New Zealand, *News of Female Missions*, New Series No 1, January 1898, p 2.

United Presbyterian Church in 1900.¹³ To some extent these were periodicals writ large, providing dry and detailed accounts of expansion in numbers of school pupils and in conversions and so on, and statistical information, though also provided a narrative account identifying key individuals and events.

Missionary biographies emerged as a popular genre around the late 1870s, with the period of most prolific production spanning the 1890s to around 1920, though memoirs and biographies of missionaries were produced both before and after this period. The earliest such publication on the life of a Scottish missionary is John Wilson's memoir of his wife Margaret, published in 1838, and largely based on letters written by Margaret Wilson to her family and friends.¹⁴ Between 1838 and the late 1870s, works by or about the following missionaries were published: Robert Moffat, John Philip, Robert Nesbit, and Hope Waddell (See Appendix IV, for brief biographical details of missionaries referred to in chapters Five and Six, and who were the subjects of biographies in the period studied). After the late 1870s, with the publication of works on Robert Moffat and Alexander Duff, there was a steady flow of biographies. Some of these were published in popular editions, and special editions for children might also be produced, for example *The White Queen of Okoyong*, on Mary Slessor.¹⁵ Biographies might go through several editions, and some missionaries were the subject of multiple biographies, with Robert Moffat, Mary Slessor, and Alexander Duff coming into this category.¹⁶ Livingstone is in a league of his own, with over 100 books written about him between the 1870s and the 1950s.¹⁷ Some missionary biographies continued to be reprinted until at least the

¹³ These include publications on missions in Lovedale, South Africa; Maratha missions, and missions in Madras, Bengal, and Rajputana in India; and the Livingstonia mission in Nyasaland.

¹⁴ John Wilson, *Memoir of Mrs Margaret Wilson*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, and London, Whittaker and Co and J Nisbet and Co, 1838.

¹⁵ W P Livingstone, *The White Queen of Okoyong*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1919.

¹⁶ Robert Moffat was the subject of at least 15 biographies between 1884 and 1961, with 5 of these being in the period examined here, and a number of them being reprinted. At least 10 biographies of Mary Slessor were published between 1915 and 2001. Alexander Duff was the subject of at least 6 biographies between 1879 and 1992.

¹⁷ Only one biography is considered here, that by W G Blaikie. The influence of the 'heroic myth' of Livingstone is acknowledged and considered in chapter 7. In this chapter I have attempted to set accounts of Livingstone's life in the context of those of other missionaries in order to examine the themes that are common to them, rather than those which might be specific to Livingstone.

1960s, and they remained popular as Sunday School prizes with Livingstone and Slessor being the most likely to feature here.¹⁸

A number of factors appear to have determined the selection of subjects for biography. One factor was length of service, and generally speaking, biographies became more numerous after the first generation of missionaries had sufficient length of service to merit accounts of their careers. Another factor was the institutional interest in their production. The Free Church had two prolific writers in George Smith and William Pringle Livingstone, both of whom served as editors of Free Church publications.¹⁹ Furthermore, several leading Free Church, and subsequently United Free Church, missionaries served as Moderators, and this was 'frequently the prelude to a full-length biography'.²⁰ By contrast Church of Scotland publications were edited by 'a series of distinguished ministers' rather than professional writers, and they seldom wrote on foreign mission topics. Church of Scotland missionaries were 'constitutionally debarred' from the Moderatorship until 1931, when this was remedied to allow John Graham to become Moderator.²¹ Thus in this period there was only one biographical work on Church of Scotland missionaries, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, covering the lives of Henry Henderson, John Bowie, and Robert Cleland. The United Presbyterian Church was, like the Free Church, an effective publicist of missionary work, and additionally a number of Scots achieved fame as London Missionary Society agents, for example, Robert Moffat, David Livingstone, and James Chalmers.

Gender was another determinant in selection. Women were excluded from leadership positions, and their marital status also seems to have been an impediment to wider public recognition of their work, though there are some exceptions. There is evidence of women with similar periods of lengthy service to leading male missionaries, and

¹⁸ See John M MacKenzie, 'David Livingstone: the construction of the myth' in Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds), *Sermons and battle hymns: Protestant culture in modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990, p 40.

¹⁹ Dow, *Domestic Response and Reaction*, p 377.

²⁰ Dow, *Domestic Response and Reaction*. He cites as examples the following: citing as examples John Wilson (1870), Alexander Duff (1873), James Stewart (1899), Robert Laws (1908), and Donald Fraser (1922). Dates in brackets are the years of Moderatorship.

²¹ *Ibid.*, p 375-6.

Mrs Sutherland and Mary Slessor both fall into this category. Some of these were married women, mentioned in the passing alongside their husbands, though the periodical literature indicates the active role some played both in missionary work and publicising it at home. Of the few women afforded biographies in the 19th and 20th centuries, however, most were single. For women, who were less likely to benefit from institutional support, Dow has also suggested that ‘sponsors’ were important, and that the existence of a biography might depend on social connections.²² Another factor might be the suitability of the life and work of individuals as the raw material for a morally inspiring missionary ideal, which demanded some outstanding achievements or personality, though even these were moulded to fit the stereotype. The necessary requirements were, however, more likely to be fulfilled by a male career, though there were some exceptions to this, most notably Mary Slessor.

An indication of the popularity of missionary periodicals is suggested by the circulation figures quoted above. The periodicals were of course denominational in character, and therefore aimed at the members of the respective churches. Histories and biographies might aim at a wider public, and this was particularly evident in the case of the latter. Given Livingstone’s celebrity, publishers of works on his life might expect a sizeable readership. John Murray, the publisher of an early biography on Livingstone, had initially approached the popular writer Samuel Smiles to undertake this work, though this proposal did not come to fruition. William Garden Blaikie who authored the biography was, however, judged to have produced ‘a masterly account’.²³ Many of the subsequent ‘extraordinary numbers of popular biographies’ were reworkings of Blaikie’s biography, or summaries of each other, but they were still able to find a market. Such biographies were undoubtedly popular, selling well in Scotland, and becoming a ‘basic staple of the prize and present market’ in schools, Sunday schools, and organisations such as the Boys’ Brigade.²⁴ In some cases biographies had an international readership, as would have been the case with biographies of Livingstone, and as in the case of George Smith’s biography

²² Ibid., p 363.

²³ Ibid., p 310.

²⁴ MacKenzie, ‘David Livingstone: the Construction of the Myth’, p 38.

of Alexander Duff, which went through several editions in both the United States and Canada.²⁵

Selection of sources for analysis

In order to investigate how the missionary enterprise and missionaries were represented, examples of the various kinds of literature outlined here were examined; pamphlets, annual reports, periodicals, histories, and biographies. Periodicals and biographies provided the major source of material. With respect to the former, the selection was made on the basis of the following criteria: coverage of the range of societies and denominations; a selection of sources from each decade from the 1830s to 1910s; the selection was weighted towards women's periodicals, since this is the major source of information on women's involvement both at home and abroad. As noted women's issues and work had little profile in the 'general' missionary periodicals and very few women were the subject of biographies. With respect to biographies, around half of the two dozen or so biographies published in this period were consulted, again with a view to covering denominations and societies, different periods, and women as well as men. As a means of establishing what were the dominant discourses of the missionary enterprise as represented in its literature, this has provided a representative selection of sources across denomination, time, and gender, and different genres of literature.

The analysis of missionary literature in this and in the next chapter has been undertaken on the assumption that a sense of identity, albeit multi-dimensional, will be clearly articulated in this literature. It is often claimed that participation in the British empire strengthened a sense of British identity for Scots, though this co-existed with a Scottish identity. In setting out to identify the key markers of identity in missionary literature, a central question is how national identity was manifested, and how Scottish and British identities were expressed in relation to one another. However, given that identities are relational and require 'others' against which they may be defined, the context of empire allows examination of how 'otherness' is defined beyond the focus of tensions or opposition between Scottish, British, or

²⁵ George Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1899 p vii.

English identities, to which discussions of Scottish national identity have often been restricted. This chapter examines the dominant discourses in missionary literature which establish key markers of identity, apart from national identity, which is discussed separately in Chapter Six. In the texts of missionary literature as such different discourses of identity are of course not discrete, and can be hard to disentangle, since single statements often carry multiple meanings. A consequence of this is that examples used to illustrate one type of discourse could often serve to illustrate others. However, for analytic purposes the discourses relevant to key markers of identity have been separated into the categories of religion, race, gender, and class, with different examples being used to illustrate each type of discourse.

Religious discourses: the superiority of Christianity, and missionary practice and ideals

Given that the missionary enterprise was in essence a religious endeavour, it is to be expected that religious discourses would permeate this literature. The superiority of Christianity is repeatedly affirmed throughout this literature, often articulated through moral horror and revulsion against the beliefs and practices of other peoples. For example, the ‘horrid delusions’ and ‘multifarious idolatries’ encountered in India required ‘moral courage’ in order to attack the systems of ‘Parsis, Mahommedans, and Brahmans’, who cherished a ‘deep-rooted aversion’ to ‘Europeans and their religion’.²⁶ Some missionaries wrote at length refuting such ‘false beliefs’,²⁷ but within the periodicals the terms ‘superstition’ and ‘idolatry’ frequently served as a shorthand for the characterisation of other religions as inferior to Christianity. Sometimes descriptions of religious festivals were used to underline the argument. The Rev. Yule, having attended one such festival, declared ‘I have learned more of the awful idolatry and deep depravity of Hinduism than I had any previous conception of’.²⁸ This depravity, in his view, was exhibited by ‘crowds of females’ prostrating themselves before their idol, and rolling about ‘in the most indecent

²⁶ Wilson, *Memoir of Mrs Margaret Wilson*, p 340.

²⁷ See, for example, Alexander Duff, *The Church of Scotland's India Mission, or a brief exposition of the principles on which that mission has been conducted in Calcutta*, Edinburgh, Waugh and Innes, 1835.

²⁸ *Home and Foreign Missionary Record of the Church of Scotland*, Vol IX, May, 1854, p 98.

manner'.²⁹ To make matters worse this took place 'in the presence of as vile a set of naked Sunnyasis as one could imagine'.³⁰ Such 'heathenism' amounted to 'Darkness that can be felt – diabolical customs of centuries to overcome'.³¹ However, the incorporation of Christian religious instruction in education in India, for example, could challenge the power of such beliefs over people, since 'their own faith, being largely founded on fable, cannot stand before the light of science'.³² The 'terrible power' of Indian religions, as Murray Mitchell argued in similar vein, 'cannot stand the fierce light of European thought'. Higher schools and colleges would destroy such beliefs by putting European thought in their place.³³

If in India it was such irrational 'superstition' and 'idolatry' that was constantly denounced, in Africa it was the 'savagery' of 'heathenism' that attracted comment. This included a variety of practices perceived as cruel by missionaries, such as punishments for practising witchcraft, the sacrifice of widows or concubines, exposure of twins, and female circumcision. Even Livingstone, praised for his fellow feeling for Africans and his 'sympathy with even the most barbarous and unenlightened' was, according to his biographer, Blaikie, disgusted by 'heathenism'.

In the Barotse country:

Livingstone saw heathenism in its most unadulterated form. It was a painful, loathsome, and horrible spectacle. His view of the Fall and of the corruption of human nature were certainly not lightened by the sight.³⁴

In the early 20th century in Kenya, the practice of female circumcision became a source of tension and confrontation between Church of Scotland missionaries and Kikuyu people in Kenya, though is only alluded to in periodicals rather than being

²⁹ Ibid., p 98.

³⁰ Ibid., p 98.

³¹ E W H Sturrock, 'Kind Hints for the Women of our Church who long to be Useful' in *Church of Scotland News of Female Missions*, New Series No 9, September, 1898, p 66.

³² 'From our Heathen Mission-fields' in *Church of Scotland News of Female Missions*, New Series No 12, December, 1898, p 94.

³³ Mitchell, *In Western India*, p 120.

³⁴ W G Blaikie, *The Life of David Livingstone*, London, John Murray, Eleventh Impression, 1906 (first published 1880), p 121.

explicitly named.³⁵ The mission in Kikuyu had provided a ‘place of refuge’ for girls who were ‘refusing to be bought by polygamists’, and desiring to escape ‘the indescribable vileness of certain of the customs’.³⁶

Such condemnations of the values of other peoples’ religious systems were often integral to descriptions of the professional practices of missionaries, as scholars, educators or as doctors. John Wilson, in Bombay, reported that he was able to preach in ‘Hindoosthanee’, and to dispute in their own languages with Hindus and Muslims over such issues as the practice of polygamy.³⁷ Linguistic abilities could also be used to translate the literature of other cultures, such as Murray Mitchell’s translations of Marathi poems, which provided an indication of the spiritual themes present in Indian poetry. The moral, however, was that such ‘keenly-felt needs’ could be supplied by the gospel alone.³⁸

While missionary work might often be thought of as involving first and foremost preaching and evangelism, for Scots missionaries education and medicine came to play an increasingly important role as the 19th century progressed. Both were seen as an effective route to Christianisation, and were presented in the literature as such, whether the institutions of higher education established by Alexander Duff and others, or the teaching of literacy to orphan girls, such as those in Madras, praised for their ‘proficiency in reading and their knowledge of Scripture, inculcated so kindly and zealously by their teacher’.³⁹ The education of girls in orphanages meant that they were ‘carefully protected from the countless corrupting and degrading influences of heathenism’ and that ‘by close intercourse with earnest and experienced Christians, their hearts are impressed, their dispositions modified, and their whole character moulded’.⁴⁰ Medical missionary work at its inception was promoted as much, if not more, on the basis of its potential religious benefits. As

³⁵ This issue was taken up in parliament by the Duchess of Atholl, after she attended a Church of Scotland meeting around 1929 or 1930. See Katharine, Duchess of Atholl, *Working Partnership*, London, Arthur Barker, 1958.

³⁶ *Kikuyu News*, Church of Scotland Mission, British East Africa, No 17, March, 1910, p 12.

³⁷ *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, 1832, p 409-410.

³⁸ *Free Church Monthly and Missionary Record*, No 9, New Series, September, 1882, p 257.

³⁹ Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, No 3, July, 1863, p 66.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p 75.

EMMS founding member, Benjamin Bell, argued, ‘the practice of the healing art may become a powerful auxiliary to the preaching of the Gospel’. This was because ‘Christian medical men [.....] by gaining the confidence and goodwill of their patients, may open and smooth a pathway to their hearts for the saving truths of religion’.⁴¹

Another purpose of such representations was to provide evidence of missionaries’ fitness for their religious vocation. Within the periodical literature missionaries’ descriptions of their task of Christianisation and of their daily work suggest their devotion to Christian principles and their piety, on the one hand without this necessarily being paraded, but on the other without allusion to doubt or troubled conscience. In this sense these representations can be described as idealisations. The process of idealisation is however much more clearly in evidence in biographical literature, where there are a number of recurrent themes concerning the religious influences on and in the lives of missionaries.

Future missionaries were shaped by piety and religious observance in the home, by their churches, and by the inspiration of teachers, visiting evangelicals and missionaries. The figure of Livingstone became a major source of inspiration, and after his death references to his influence appeared to be obligatory. Family influences were given a prominent place in the lives of Margaret Wilson, Alexander Duff, David Livingstone, James Stewart, Mary Slessor, and Robert Laws, for example, where the religious disposition of parents, especially mothers, is frequently remarked upon. Margaret Wilson whose zeal was ‘fervent and aspiring’, was a daughter of the manse, supported by her family in going to India with her missionary husband, John.⁴² Livingstone’s grandfather, father and mother were all seen to be important moral and religious influences on the young David, who followed his father’s example in reading books ‘of missionary enterprise’.⁴³ Robert Laws, ‘To the great joy of his mother’ told ‘the patriarchal missionary’, Robert Moffat, ‘that he

⁴¹ Benjamin Bell, in *Addresses to Medical Students, 1855-56*, Edinburgh, EMMS, p 149-150.

⁴² Wilson, *Memoir of Mrs Margaret Wilson*, p 113.

⁴³ Blaikie, *Life of Livingstone*, p 10.

was resolved to go to the mission field, “to the heart of Africa”.⁴⁴ Other family connections might also be important, as was the case with missionaries in Blantyre, Nyasaland, who were connected by both kinship and marriage. One of these Jack Bowie, was influenced by his missionary sister-in-law and her husband to give up a successful medical practice in London to become a missionary.⁴⁵ The influence of teachers such as Thomas Chalmers and David Welch, leading figures in the Disruption, were cited as influences on Alexander Duff and Murray Mitchell. John Philip, too, was influenced in his choice of vocation while at Edinburgh University, where he had heard ‘some of the ablest men in the Medical Profession at Edinburgh’ speak favourably of Dr Vanderkemp, the pioneer medical missionary from South Africa.⁴⁶

Religious observance, a grounding in Scottish religious traditions, and reflection on religious belief, might also play their part. The religious milieu of John Philip’s life was such that his Aberdeenshire friends were credited with having ‘prayed’ him into being a missionary in Africa.⁴⁷ The catalyst for Livingstone’s feeling of vocation appears to have come from reading the *Philosophy of a Future State*, by Thomas Dick, which argued that ‘religion and science were not necessarily hostile, but rather friendly to each other’.⁴⁸ Mrs Sutherland, through the support of the United Secession Church, was able to realise her dream of being a missionary, which might have been perceived by many as ‘going quite out of her sphere’.⁴⁹ Mary Slessor was an active UP church member and Sunday School teacher, and regular attender of missionary meetings. Thus it can be seen that the representations of missionaries’ religious life and inspiration presented an idealised view of an upbringing in which religion was ever present, inculcated by devoted parents, with some exceptions, and reinforced through church membership and the visits of evangelists and missionaries. The life of the church and the teachings of leading divines within educational institutions for some also played a major formative role.

⁴⁴ James Johnston, *Dr Laws of Livingstonia*, London, Partridge and Co, 1909, p 46-7.

⁴⁵ W Robertson, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, London, James Nisbet, 1892, p 55.

⁴⁶ Robert Philip, *The Elijah of South Africa, or the Character and Spirit of the late Rev John Philip, DD*, London, John Snow, 1851, p 35.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p 35

⁴⁸ Blaikie, *Life of David Livingstone*, p 11.

The achievements of missionaries were not always represented in purely religious terms, but sometimes in more generally moral terms such as their contribution to the abolition of the slave trade, and secular achievements were also stressed, as will be discussed below. In some cases however missionaries were represented as martyrs to their cause. For example, John Wilson's emphasis on his wife's religious zeal, and their readiness to sacrifice their lives 'or to devote them to the service of the heathen, as our heavenly Father may see meet' presents religious motives as primary, and her early death as Christian sacrifice.⁵⁰ Three Church of Scotland missionaries to Nyasaland in the late 19th century were explicitly described as martyrs, though all succumbed to disease rather than meeting with a violent death. Two of the three 'martyrs' worked as missionaries for only a few years before dying of disease, while the other had seen around sixteen years in missionary service. The author, in deploying the rhetoric of martyrdom, believed that this example would inspire others to hear the call of 'self-consecration'.⁵¹

If the primary messages here were that Christianity was superior to other religions, and that missionaries were fit people to undertake the task of offering it to others, by virtue of their piety, devotion, and probity, it was the existence of empire that had called the missionary enterprise into being. Of necessity then missionaries and their supporters were obliged on occasion to make comment on the existence and administration of empire, even though in general missionaries represented themselves as being outside the sphere of the political. Religion, however, was the prism through which political comment was projected. For example, the outbreak of the Indian Mutiny provoked public discussion about the role of missionaries and the dangers of offending the religious beliefs of others. Missionaries and their supporters took the view that this event was the manifestation of God's anger, in response to which Christians should re-double their missionary efforts. God did not make 'this little island' the mistress of India simply 'that India should become a mine of wealth to the sons of Britain, or the means of her national aggrandisement,' but rather for

⁴⁹ Agnes Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland of Old Calabar*, Paisley, J and R Parlane, 1883, p 19.

⁵⁰ Wilson, *Memoir of Mrs Margaret Wilson*, p 109.

⁵¹ Robertson, *Martyrs of Blantyre*, p 144.

the higher end of Christianising India.⁵² Such an attitude towards empire was described with reference to Alexander Duff as viewing public events from ‘the higher level of Christian imperialism’, and looking at affairs as they affected ‘the welfare of the great peoples of East and West’.⁵³

By the end of the century, not giving access to missionaries was being denounced as violation of the principle of British rule, as was said of Kitchener’s refusal to allow missionaries into Sudan, judged as too sensitive to Islamic feeling.⁵⁴ In contrast to the Indian Mutiny, there was no religious critique here of the excesses of imperial power. In a similar way it was conventional to express abhorrence of war from a religious standpoint, but this did not necessarily mean that governments were not supported. Though the South African War was a ‘horror’, especially since it was between states which ‘equally profess a Christian religion’,⁵⁵ fighting must go on till full sovereignty was acknowledged, ‘a view taken with virtual unanimity by the Christians of England and Scotland’.⁵⁶ At the outbreak of war in 1914, revulsion and regret was expressed, with the war being described as ‘a great human disaster’, ‘a dreary tragedy’, and indeed ‘madness’, but despite the general dismay it was also deemed necessary to preserve higher civilization and the Christian religion.⁵⁷

The religious discourses outlined above performed a number of functions: the establishment of the superiority of Christianity to other religions as the moral justification for the missionary enterprise, thereby sanctioning imperialism; the representation of missionaries as fit to perform their Christian task by virtue of their religious upbringing and convictions; and the establishment of writers and readers as members of a Christian community. The superiority of Christianity was established through its greater rationality, its morality, and its humaneness. The sense of membership of a community was established with reference to the practices and beliefs of everyday life, and the presentation of ideals of a religiously motivated life,

⁵² *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, Vol XII, November, 1857, p 186.

⁵³ Smith, *Life of Duff*, p 366.

⁵⁴ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, No 12, December, 1899, p 351.

⁵⁵ *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, No 11, November 1, 1899, p 317.

⁵⁶ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 10, 1901, p 475.

which might also inspire readers to prayer or to active support, or even to take up a missionary vocation themselves.

Discourses of race and the civilising mission

In describing the lives of missionaries, their aims, their work and their achievements, the character of other peoples and societies was naturally emphasised. Characterisations of the customs, beliefs and practices of Indian and African peoples also served to justify the aim of Christian moral regulation, which was directed against cruelty, immorality, and the degradation of women. In India systems of thought, in particular, came under attack for their superstitious nature and incapacity to assimilate European science. Though the superiority of Christianity was taken for granted, most writers supposed that other peoples could approach this state of civilisation. The extent to which differences in levels of civilisation were emphasised, however, sat uneasily with expressions of belief in the equality of all, though some missionaries were depicted as passionate advocates of the rights of others, especially of African peoples.

As indicated above it was believed that there was a need for European systems of thought to challenge the more feeble systems of thought in India. To do this effectively a system of education in the English language was deemed to be necessary, and Scots missionaries, led by Alexander Duff were active ‘Anglicists’ in the controversy over whether education should be in English or in vernacular languages.⁵⁸ Smith credits Duff with a major role in influencing these developments, but he is also defended against the charge of outright hostility to vernacular languages. Indeed Duff believed that ‘in a generation or two, the Bengali, by improvement, might become the fitting medium of European knowledge’, a point illustrated by a telling analogy with Gaelic, which:

⁵⁷ *Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland*, No 165, September, 1914, p 387.

⁵⁸ See Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*. The process of Anglicisation of education in India, in which Duff played an active part, is generally seen to have been decisively furthered by the 1835 minute on this subject by T B Macaulay, which usually elicits the description ‘infamous’ or ‘notorious’ nowadays. See for example, Maya Jaggi, ‘Oh, Kolkata’, *Guardian*, 8 May 2004; J L Brockington, ‘Warren Hastings and Orientalism’ in Geoffrey Carnall and Colin Nicholson (eds) *The Impeachment of Warren Hastings*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1989.

though powerful for lyric and other poetry and also for popular address, contained no works that could possibly meet the objects of a higher and comprehensive education.⁵⁹

A further common theme with respect to India was that of the ‘degradation’ of women, as discussed further below. Leading missionaries such as Alexander Duff were active promoters of female education, and denunciations of Indian systems of thought and of the ‘degradation’ of women were to be found in his writings.⁶⁰ Murray Mitchell, too, thought that there was a need to raise the ‘condition and character of Indian women’, and that it was desirable to educate girls.⁶¹ Living conditions were held up to scrutiny and found wanting, with descriptions of dirt and squalor being prominent. ‘Angel-like’ women missionaries were exhorted to visit the ‘dwellings – we cannot call them homes – of Hindoo wives and mothers’, and ‘There they ascertain for themselves social, domestic, and personal habits, which alas! are repulsive and low’.⁶² Though such conditions no doubt existed, even in the pages of *News of Female Missions* there was evidence of the difference in living standards of different social classes, such as the account given by Miss Pigot of her ‘zenana’ work, conducted sometimes in palatial surroundings.⁶³ However, even a quarter of a century later ‘Zenana’ quarters were still being described as, ‘a bare mud floor with a mat or two on it’ in which women spent nearly all their lives.⁶⁴

The images of ‘savagery’ so common in representations of Africa were seldom present in an Indian context, with the Indian Mutiny providing an exception. In this context Indians were characterised as ‘murderous ruffians’, and ‘bloodthirsty mutineers’, displaying ‘diabolical fury’ and ‘Asiatic treachery’. Contrasted with this was the bravery of the British, holding positions with ‘undaunted courage’, exemplifying the spirit of the Greeks at Thermopylae.⁶⁵ Images of ‘savagery’ were so prevalent in writings about Africa, however, that even those missionaries judged

⁵⁹ Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, p 96.

⁶⁰ See for example, Address to the Scottish Ladies Association, *Annual Report*, 1839.

⁶¹ Mitchell, *In Western India*, p 120.

⁶² Address by Dr Gillan, Moderator of the Church of Scotland, quoted in *News of Female Missions*, No 43, July, 1873.

⁶³ See *Church of Scotland News of Female Missions*, 1873.

⁶⁴ Jenny Elder Cumming, in *Church of Scotland News of Female Missions*, New Series No 1, January 1898.

to be most sympathetic to Africans and most active as advocates of their rights, might on occasion make use of such terminology. John Philip, for example, whose ‘heart was with the Hottentots’, remarked that ‘Savages are always pleased when they are trusted’.⁶⁶ ‘Even amongst savages’, however, there could be ‘exceptionally great men’ such as King Eyo, but in general ‘As amongst all barbarous nations, human life was held of little value of Calabar’.⁶⁷ In Nyasaland, Dr Laws confronted ‘All the miseries and horrors of African savagery [which] were rampant around them – slavery, murder, poison ordeals, warfare and superstitious practices’.⁶⁸

The notion that African peoples were at a lower level of civilisation was not always the occasion for hostile comment, but even those who expressed positive attitudes could betray condescension. As Mrs Sutherland’s biographer noted, ‘Gratitude seems pretty readily to find a place in the heart of the negro, and a certain dog-like fidelity to the white man, especially if he has been kind to him’.⁶⁹ Livingstone complained of having to endure ‘the dancing, roaring, and singing, the jesting, anecdotes, grumbling, quarrelling, and murdering of these children of nature’, in one episode of his travels, an experience which he recounted led to ‘a more intense disgust at heathenism than I had before’.⁷⁰ The absence of systems of caste such as those in India led James Stewart to be sanguine of the prospects for Africa as ‘a simple, untutored savage, who needed plain, practical teaching, and who was likely to turn to God far sooner than India would do’.⁷¹ Or to present this in the language of Social Darwinism ‘Physically the native of British Central Africa is a fine animal’ and ‘there is no reason wherefore the African [.....] should not attain the level at some future day, which the white and yellow races of mankind enjoy’.⁷²

⁶⁵ See Smith, who quotes from Duff’s ‘chronicles’ in *Life of Duff*.

⁶⁶ Philip, *The Elijah of South Africa*, p 49.

⁶⁷ Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland*, p 27.

⁶⁸ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 55.

⁶⁹ Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland*, p 51.

⁷⁰ Livingstone, *Travels and Researches in South Africa*, Philadelphia, J W Bradley, 1858, (first published 1857), p 128.

⁷¹ James Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale: the Life of James Stewart*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1908, p 12.

⁷² Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 88.

Also in Africa nakedness and clothing were enduring matters of concern, with supporters at home regularly sending cast-off or specially made clothing to the various missions they supported, from the early days of missionary activity. In Old Calabar the matter of clothing ‘greatly exercised the minds of the missionary sisterhood’.⁷³ In Kenya, Dr Arthur’s plan of action was to get the ‘native’ to wear clothes as ‘the first step to self-respect’, then to keep himself and his clothes clean. Then followed education, ‘with strict discipline as to cleanliness and respect for you’ as this ‘will teach him to respect himself’.⁷⁴ By such means the missionaries, who had confronted ‘wild beasts and wilder men’, were judged to have ‘won the day for the Gospel over the field’.⁷⁵

Not surprisingly, given the consistent depiction of India and Africa as less civilised, claims of success were couched in terms of the civilising impact of missions. In India, Alexander Duff’s major achievements were to have shown ‘genius in instinctively seizing the position in 1830’ in putting into practice his educational scheme, and in subsequently ‘influencing the Indian Government and the British public by his heaven-born enthusiasm and fiery eloquence’ to support education in the English language.⁷⁶ As well as education and the English language, the abolition of customs such as sati were advanced as evidence of the civilising character of missionary interventions and British rule.

Africa, being more ‘savage’ was inevitably a greater focus for claims of civilising influences. Missionaries such as Robert and Mary Moffat had succeeded in making the country safe for Europeans, through their Christian influence on the ‘heathen Bechwanas’.⁷⁷ Similarly, it was claimed that Dr Laws in his ‘missionary enterprise’ achieved the ‘civilizing of the Ngoni’ a people described as imposing, warlike and brave.⁷⁸ Such an achievement was particularly to be applauded, since ‘Half a century

⁷³ Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland*, p 42.

⁷⁴ *Kikuyu News*, Church of Scotland Mission, British East Africa, No 1, March 1908, p 6.

⁷⁵ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 44.

⁷⁶ Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, p 99.

⁷⁷ John S Moffat, *The Lives of Robert and Mary Moffat*, London, T Fisher Unwin, Third Edition, 1885, p 248.

⁷⁸ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 16.

ago a thick darkness, both moral and spiritual, lay over the regions of the Nyasa'.⁷⁹ The missionaries at Blantyre, in the sixteen years they had been there, 'have changed the very soul of the place – the habits, the character, the life of the people'.⁸⁰ The main evidence of this change was the progress made in education, with 'some twenty native teachers' having been trained, whereas before 'these young men and women were playing around the mud-huts of an African village', where life, until the advent of the missionaries, had been

a curious kind of existence – a sort of lazy, indifferent, amused, contentment. The native has few wants, and is naturally of an indolent, peaceable disposition, having little to compel him to work.⁸¹

Livingstone was credited with having entirely 'changed the prospects of Africa', since steps had been taken to suppress the slave trade, though readers of Blaikie's biography were urged to make efforts to secure its final abolition 'throughout the whole of Africa'.⁸² Commercial undertakings, exploration and new missionary enterprises were being successfully prosecuted, though there were regrettably, 'travellers who have led immoral lives and sought their own amusement only, and traders who by trafficking in rum and such things have demoralised the natives'.⁸³ There had also been a 'marvellous expansion of missionary enterprise'.⁸⁴ Dr Laws' achievements meant that he could 'be claimed as a moral Empire builder'.⁸⁵ Indeed 'philanthropy and Christian Missions' were seen as having the capacity to restore 'the trend of the negro' from its backward movement, to a forward evolutionary path.⁸⁶

If such characterisations of other peoples' religions, beliefs, customs, living conditions, and mode of dress, consistently emphasised their inferiority and the superiority of European Christian civilisation, they were nonetheless often accompanied by expressions of belief in the equality of all. For example, concern

⁷⁹ Ibid., p 21.

⁸⁰ W Robertson, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, London, James Nisbet, 1892, p 38

⁸¹ Ibid., p 40.

⁸² Blaikie, *Life of David Livingstone*, p 389.

⁸³ Ibid., p 392.

⁸⁴ Ibid., p 395.

⁸⁵ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 153.

⁸⁶ Ibid, p 88.

about the status of African peoples in South Africa was voiced by John Philip, who was an active advocate of the rights of 'Hottentots', and his role as such was discussed in the pages of the *Missionary Register*, following the publication of his *Researches in South Africa* in 1828.⁸⁷ A universalistic belief in human equality was most clearly expressed in writings concerned with slavery. In 1839, on the first anniversary of emancipation in the West Indies, for example, white missionaries celebrated together with black people, and rejoiced at the downfall of slavery.⁸⁸ Despite the early celebrations, the consequences of emancipation continued to be a matter for debate, and missionaries felt it necessary to mount a defence of this. Mr Robb, of Jamaica, accused Thomas Carlyle of misrepresenting black people in his *Occasional Discourse on Negro Slavery*. To picture 'the black man' as a 'lazy animal', content with the small amount of labour to keep him in pumpkin, was a 'coarse caricature'.⁸⁹ Such charges were false, and a whole people should not be condemned for the 'delinquencies of a portion'. What rights 'to torture and task the African,' Robb asked, had the 'self-styled wiser white man'.⁹⁰

Subsequent to emancipation, Scottish missionaries in Jamaica went to West Africa, together with freed slaves to set up the United Presbyterian mission at Old Calabar.⁹¹ The impact of slavery in West Africa was kept in the public view both by the work of such missionaries, and by accounts of explorers in the area. By the middle of the century attempts were being made to create an organizational base at home for the exploration and evangelization of Central Africa, with the objects of furthering commerce, advancing the interests of geographical and other sciences, and 'especially to abolish the horrid traffic in slaves'.⁹² Livingstone's expeditions into central Africa brought this issue into even greater prominence, and it continued to be at the forefront in arguments for and accounts of the development of missions,

⁸⁷ See *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, 1831.

⁸⁸ See *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, December 1840, p 181-183.

⁸⁹ *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, Vol XII, November, 1857, p 189.

⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, p 190.

⁹¹ See *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, Vol I, Issue No 8, 1846, p 114 ff.

⁹² Advert for the Society for Exploring and Evangelizing Central Africa, by Means of Native Agency, a London based organisation, with a Scottish branch, in *Home and Foreign Missionary Record of the Church of Scotland*, Vol IX, November 1854, p282. Rev David Livingston (sic) is listed as an Honorary member.

particularly in Nyasaland, where, for example, the attempt was made to establish a mission at Kota Kota, ‘the very centre or “hub” of African slave-traffic.’⁹³

In such representations of other peoples, dominant themes were their ‘superstitious’ systems of belief and sometimes cruel customs, sexual laxity or immorality in contrast to Christian monogamy and modesty, the lack of civilisation particularly exemplified by the lack of literacy or a literate culture, and the lack of a work ethic. Even where missionaries were presented as advocates of rights or champions of abolition, and as treating other peoples as ‘brothers’, their language was not always free from condescension. Furthermore, the generalisations offered as characterisations of other societies lacked complexity and, often, accuracy, and inevitably played their part in the formulation of ideologies of racial hierarchy, even if missionaries themselves seldom articulated Social Darwinist views. John MacKenzie has commented that ‘The full panoply of social Darwinian notions, involving fundamental genetic difference and the inevitability of competition and extinction induced if necessary by war, never appears in missionary writings,’ since such ideas would have run counter to the idea of redemption.⁹⁴ This claim is consistent with the sample of literature examined here, yet there are echoes of Social Darwinism in biographies of missionaries. As MacKenzie also points out such views are very clearly advanced in Henry Drummond’s account of his travels in central Africa, and while Drummond himself was not a missionary he was a very active supporter, and also a populariser of Social Darwinist views.⁹⁵ Thus it would be surprising if these views did not have currency at the time. Even so it has been argued that such ‘unpalatable theories’ of ‘evolutionary racism’ could lead to different approaches to colonial policies.⁹⁶ Though categories of racial hierarchy

⁹³ *Foreign Mission Chronicle of the Episcopal Church of Scotland, together with the Kaffrarian Diocesan Quarterly*, New Series, Vol XV, No 3, July, 1914, p 78.

⁹⁴ John M MacKenzie, ‘Missionaries, Science, and the Environment in Nineteenth-Century Africa’, in Andrew Porter, (ed), *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Grand Rapids, Wm B Eerdmans Publishing Co, 2003, pp 106-130, p 124.

⁹⁵ In William Ferguson’s view, Drummond’s best-selling *Natural Law in the Spiritual World*, was a credit to neither science nor religion, being ‘stuffed’ with ‘gnomic riddles’. See William Ferguson, ‘Christian Faith and Unbelief in Modern Scotland’ in Stewart J Brown and George Newlands (eds), *Scottish Christianity in the Modern World*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 2000, pp 53-89, p 80.

⁹⁶ See Brian Stanley, ‘Church, State, and the Hierarchy of “Civilization”’: The Making of the “Missions and Government” Report at the World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh, 1910, in Porter (ed), *Imperial Horizons*, pp 58-84, p 82.

seemed to be generally accepted among missionaries, as Stanley has argued in his study of the making of the 'Missions and Government' report for the World Missionary Conference of 1910, the need to assist the development of civilisation was used by missionaries to argue for the fulfilment of 'trusteeship' by colonial governments.⁹⁷ Paternalistic this may have been, but it also encompassed the defence of interests of native peoples, especially in Africa. What would now be judged a contradiction between racist and egalitarian views seems not to have been perceived as such by missionaries.

Discourses of gender: the 'degraded' woman abroad, and the woman missionary

Discourses of gender are present in this literature in a variety of forms, but primarily in the focus on the position of women, and work with women. While general comments on 'degradation' and 'savagery' were commonly made, it was almost invariably with regard to the position of women that these were elaborated. This theme of the 'degradation' of women recurs from the early days of the missionary societies right through to the 20th century. In his address to the inaugural meeting of the Scottish Ladies' Association in 1839, Alexander Duff argued that India, more than any other country, involved 'the greater degradation of women and her subjection to the man'.⁹⁸ Married women in India were seen to be slaves and drudges, to be 'brutalized' and 'ranged in the category with the beasts which perish'.⁹⁹ Twenty years later, Mrs Colvin, writing from Bombay, acknowledged that 'there is a sad amount of vice and degradation among our own population', but at home it is hidden while it is flaunted in India, where the 'wretched natives *glory* in their shame, and whose sacred temples are dedicated to infamies the most flagrant and appalling'.¹⁰⁰

Though seldom said explicitly it was often hinted that part of this degradation was of a sexual nature, implied by the idea of woman being man's slave. Some more

⁹⁷ Ibid., p 81-82.

⁹⁸ Address by Alexander Duff, in Scottish Ladies' Association, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1839.

⁹⁹ Scottish Ladies' Association, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1844, p 22.

¹⁰⁰ Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, No 3, July, 1863.

explicit references were made to the existence of prostitution, on the one hand of the educated 'hetaera' and on the other of the temple prostitute, though the word 'prostitute' itself was not used. As work with women developed, however, this element of moral horror associated with sexual practices alien to Christian monogamy, appears to have been replaced by a more sympathetic, if pitying, approach to the restrictions placed on the lives of Indian women, at least in the writings of women missionaries themselves. Many women in India had a miserable life, 'bound in infancy by indissoluble ties, often to men who might be their fathers and grandfathers, who despise and ill-treat them'.¹⁰¹ At the end of the century still the term 'degradation' remained a common shorthand to describe the situation of women in India. *Our Indian Sisters*, a book recommended in particular to those in charge of mission work-parties or meetings, 'shows the state of degradation in which the women of India are held without the light of the Gospel.'¹⁰²

While the theme of degradation was emphasised most in relation to Indian women, it was also present in writings about African women, but was less prominent. Some of the accounts given of the work of the United Presbyterian mission at Old Calabar referred to instances in which women, as wives or concubines of chiefs, were put to death on his death in rites that echoed sati, or were vulnerable to violence, including murder, judicial or otherwise, because of accusations of witchcraft.¹⁰³ But generally speaking the position of women in Africa was less emphasised as a reason for missionary interventions, since in Africa it was not only women who could work with women, though there was perceived to be an advantage in this. That gender roles were different in Africa, however, excited comment: 'According to native ideas the woman supports the family and the husband'.¹⁰⁴ But, 'European notions are different, and the missionaries have had to work in training native ideas into more civilised ways'.¹⁰⁵ Thus, much in the manner that middle-class philanthropists at

¹⁰¹ Report from Eliza Ross in Poona, Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, No 43, July, 1873.

¹⁰² Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 11, November, 1898, p 88.

¹⁰³ See Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland; Missions of the United Presbyterian Church described in a Series of Stories*, Edinburgh, Offices of the United Presbyterian Church, 1896; W P Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar: Pioneer Missionary*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1916.

¹⁰⁴ Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 1, January, 1898, p 2.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, p 2.

home imposed their view of domestic ideology on working class girls, women missionaries trained their African pupils for domestic labour and service.

A further prominent theme in writings on work with women was that of women's influence, especially as mothers. Thus they were important as objects of missionary efforts and evangelisation not just because they suffered, but because they were a 'powerful instrument' in the evangelisation of men.¹⁰⁶ To work with women and girls was, for example, to sap 'Hinduism at its foundations, for the *women* are now the great upholders of the old idolatry'.¹⁰⁷ Or in the words of George Smith, 'Secure the mother and you have the next and future generations'.¹⁰⁸ Furthermore, educated and Christianised men required educated and Christianised wives. Girls educated in missionary schools might 'become the respected wives' of respected 'native' missionaries, and might labour 'for the moral and spiritual good of their fellow-countrymen'.¹⁰⁹

As a counterpoint to the theme of the 'degradation' of women in other countries, the freedom and equality of women in Scotland was stressed. Duff assured the Scottish Ladies' Association AGM in 1839 that Christianity had ensured 'as one of its inseparable fruits, the reinstatement of woman in all her privileges of original equality with man'.¹¹⁰ Marriage, for women in Scotland, placed them in the position of 'helpmate', sharer of joys, comforter of sorrows, and companion in pilgrimage, compared to the position of slavery that was the fate of married women in India.¹¹¹ The women writing for their periodicals were less inclined to stress their equality in marriage, but commented on the difference between themselves and Indian women, for example, in ways that indicated their own belief in the superior position they occupied. This was often expressed in more ordinary ways, such as the freedom of not being confined to the zenana, in contrast to the 'narrow lives' of the 'thousands

¹⁰⁶ Scottish Ladies' Association, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1846.

¹⁰⁷ Edward Craig Stuart, Sermon preached at St Thomas's English Episcopal Chapel, Edinburgh, 29 October, 1865.

¹⁰⁸ Address by George Smith to Free Church Ladies Society, 1864.

¹⁰⁹ Speech by Rev Dr Stevenson of Bombay, Scottish Ladies Association, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1844.

¹¹⁰ Speech by Alexander Duff, Scottish Ladies Association, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1839.

shut up’,¹¹² and the capacity to take exercise, rather than in the more rhetorical appeal to abstract ideas of equality and freedom found in the addresses of male missionaries and ministers.

Women were, however, well aware of their changed position at home and of the opportunities that had opened up to them, even if they did not discuss these in terms of aspirations for equality with men. Indeed such opportunities for influence and usefulness were justified with reference to biblical predictions. In effect though, ‘The women of this age are, in a sense, in a new position. It is long past time to apologise for women’s work, or to argue whether she should be permitted or not’.¹¹³ Women can be thankful that they no longer have to spend time sewing tapestries and spinning. Instead ‘Women can find secular occupation in countless spheres [....] There are open to her all the branches of our Guild work, Mission work, Medicine, Nursing, and much more besides’.

Representations of women as missionaries were of course an integral part of women’s periodical literature, which, as indicated above, presented them as fit persons to undertake the missionary task, stressing religious faith, professional competence, and their capacity to care for others. With respect to such representations the most idealised versions were presented through biographies, though very few women were the subject of these in this period, only Margaret Wilson, Mrs Sutherland, and Mary Slessor. Mary Moffat and Louisa Anderson were included in biographies jointly with their husbands, and there are some references to wives in biographies of male missionaries, though these tend to be few. Margaret Wilson was eulogised for her educational work with girls, and for looking after destitute children, but also for her intellectual accomplishments. As a woman who had moved ‘in the most pious and intellectual circles in her native country’, she was ‘treated, on account of her gifts and graces, with a respect and veneration seldom

¹¹¹ Speech by Rev J R Macduff, Scottish Ladies Association, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1844, p 22.

¹¹² Miss Read, Chamba Mission in India, in Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 10, 1898.

¹¹³ Address by Mrs Smith, St Michael’s Guild, on ‘The Rise of Women’s Work in the Victorian Era’ in Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 11, 1898.

exhibited to one of her sex and years'.¹¹⁴ Mrs Sutherland looked after orphan girls, and her successor, Mary Slessor, was designated 'Mother of all the Peoples', and praised for her work of rescuing twins.

Such women could, however, also be praised for their bravery or pioneering spirit. Like Mary Slessor after her, Mrs Sutherland went on exploratory trips to reach spots 'where foot of white man or woman had never trod'.¹¹⁵ She visited women in their houses, was 'welcomed into the harems of the chiefs', and intervened to save people from severe punishments, sometimes successfully. She could not have been called 'masculine', but "in courage 'Mammy Sutherland' *was a man*".¹¹⁶ Slessor is described by her biographer W P Livingstone as having had a 'wonderful career', and as standing out, 'a woman of unique and inspiring personality, and one of the most heroic figures of the age'.¹¹⁷ She was 'essentially a pioneer' who helped to open up the country to trade, and 'She was of the order of spirits to which Dr Livingstone belonged. Like him she said, "I am ready to go anywhere, provided it be forward"'.¹¹⁸ Despite this pioneering image, her biographer attempts to present her as a model of 'womanhood'. Slessor, he avers, will be remembered for generations as the 'Great White Mother', since she gave 'a new conception of womanhood' to West Africans to whom 'a woman is simply a chattel to be used for pleasure and gain'.¹¹⁹

The following comments on missionaries' wives by their biographers are typical. Mrs Philip was described as having been a woman of 'superior talents and holy vivacity', on whose memorial was inscribed the legend: 'The devoted Wife of Dr Philip, and the faithful and willing helper of his unremitting efforts on behalf of the Native Tribes of Southern Africa'.¹²⁰ In a short memorial to Mary Moffat at the end of *Scenes and Services*, it is declared that 'The wife was as essential to the husband's

¹¹⁴ Wilson, *Memorial of Margaret Wilson*, p 630.

¹¹⁵ Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland*, p 60.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, p 136.

¹¹⁷ Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar*, p v.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p 55.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p 344.

¹²⁰ Philip, *The Elijah of South Africa*, p 26-7.

usefulness as the husband was to the wife's safety'.¹²¹ Smith says of Duff that his dedication to his work left him little time for family life, but that the support of his wife, Anne Scott Drysdale, was crucially important to him : 'Sinking herself in her husband from the very first, she gave him a new strength, and left the whole fulness of his nature and his time free for the one work of his life'.¹²² Miss Margaret Gray, who married Dr Laws, is described as 'calm and fearless in times of danger, faithful and self-forgetful in days of toil', sharing 'to the utmost her husband's untiring task in savage lands.'¹²³ James Stewart's wife, Miss Stephen of the 'great shipbuilding family'¹²⁴ is likewise mentioned in the passing as a devoted supporter of her husband and dedicated worker in the mission.

Such representations of missionaries reflected the gender division of labour, and the dependent status of married women, though there was not a completely rigid division between the work that men and women did, apart from the ministry, albeit a significant exception, nor between the characteristics or virtues they might personify. Gender was then central to the representation of missionaries and their work in that a specific form of organisation of gender relations was a mark of European Christian civilisation in contrast to the 'uncivilised' and 'degraded' treatment of women elsewhere, and therefore to transform this was a key part of the missionary task. At the same time this work provided a pathway for women to respectable work or to voluntary activity outside the home.

Discourses of class: professional status and achievements

Reporting on missionary progress had both the function of letting people at home know what was being achieved with their financial contributions, and of requesting and encouraging further support for expansion of missionary work. In such reporting there were numerous references to the work being carried out and the professional skills being employed. In periodicals this was reflected in quotidian descriptions of

¹²¹ Robert Moffat, *Scenes and Services in South Africa: Moffat's Missionary Labours*, London, John Snow and Co, 1876, p 254.

¹²² Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, p 33.

¹²³ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 61.

¹²⁴ *Ibid.*, p 36. For a brief reference to Mrs Stewart's role in missionary life see Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, pp 339-344.

work, or the recounting of anecdotes. Within biographies more prominence was given to the presentation of missionaries' achievements, amongst which were often those of their professions, of scholarship and contributions to science. The dominant professions were those of the ministry, teaching, and medicine, though engineers and artisans were also employed as missionaries in some of the African missions.

A task to which a considerable number of missionaries dedicated themselves was the learning of languages and the translation of the Bible. Mr Bennie, of the Glasgow Missionary Society, reported that after ten years he had succeeded in composing a vocabulary of the 'Caffer' language.¹²⁵ Robert Moffat was praised for his achievement in having left after fifty-two years' labour a people 'with a written language of their own, in which we may now read the Holy Book of God' instead of 'a race of illiterate savages'.¹²⁶ Learning and intellectual accomplishments were not the sole preserve of men, though seldom referred to in women. John Wilson, however, was proud of his wife's achievements, and informs readers of her translations from Marathi, and authorship of articles (published anonymously) for the paper he edited, the *Oriental Christian Spectator*.¹²⁷

While the majority of male missionaries were ordained ministers, and while conversion to Christianity was the primary aim of missionary activity, their work was not restricted to the purely religious. Thus from the earliest days education played an important part. The numbers of pupils attending schools, details of the curriculum, and reports of prize givings were frequent. Wider debates about the need for particular types of education were also referred to. In India the need for education to be in English and to include religious instruction were core beliefs for Alexander Duff and other Free Church missionaries, and these views were explained in the pages of periodicals and pamphlets at the same time as lobbying of the government took place. For example, the exclusion of pupils educated in Christian colleges from civil promotion is denounced by Duff, an exclusion effected by basing the examination system on the narrow curriculum of government colleges. Missionary

¹²⁵ *Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register*, 1832, p 78.

¹²⁶ Moffat, *Scenes and Services*, p 241.

¹²⁷ Wilson, *Memorial of Margaret Wilson*, p 630.

colleges, by contrast, provided a different kind of education, in which ‘a *fair* and *reasonable* attention is paid to every really useful department of knowledge; but always in daily and kindly conjunction with some portion of sacred truth’.¹²⁸ In South Africa, James Stewart, ‘a born leader’, was deemed to have had a profound influence on the development of education, in particular in encouraging schooling with a practical bias.¹²⁹

As indicated medical missionary work was seen as a route to Christianisation, but was also approached with a scientific attitude. The EMMS urged that practitioners should demonstrate a ‘sympathetic understanding of the traditions and customs of the people’ and that they should conduct ‘diligent research’ into diseases of the country, and ‘careful inquiry as to indigenous drugs and systems of treatment’.¹³⁰ By the turn of the century, the United Free Church of Scotland was noting the importance of its contribution to this work. With 58 medical missionaries in the field, it had made an equal contribution in terms of numbers to the Church Missionary Society, whereas the Church of Scotland had only 16.¹³¹ The view of the superiority of European medical science was in evidence in the practice of this work, where the woman medical missionary ‘in her skill and wisdom is to the native little less than a demigod’.¹³² However, her work was not always appreciated with such enthusiasm, as Dr Elizabeth Selkirk complained. People only came to European doctors when they had tried all other remedies, did not necessarily keep attending till they were fully recovered, and expected cures to take effect quickly.¹³³

European science was generally seen of as great benefit by missionaries and was introduced into other aspects of mission life, including the development of facilities, and technical training. Artisans, engineers and other technicians became a normal part of the missionary scene in Africa, as the attempt to develop commerce and economic opportunities as an alternative to the slave trade advanced. Dr Laws of

¹²⁸ Letter from Alexander Duff in *Missionary Record of the Free Church of Scotland*, Vol III, No 10, October, 1847, p 235.

¹²⁹ Elizabeth Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, London, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1960, p 223.

¹³⁰ H F Lechmere Taylor, *A Century of Service, 1841-1941*, Edinburgh, EMMS, 1941, p 2.

¹³¹ *Missionary Record of the Free Church of Scotland*, Issue no 2, 1901.

¹³² *News of Female Missions*, Church of Scotland, New Series No 1, January 1898, p 2.

Livingstonia, for example, was enthusiastic in his application of new technological developments, organising a water supply and the generation of electricity to the Livingstonia station in northern Nyasaland. An account of this venture indicated the interest taken by staff at Heriot Watt college and scientific advice given, as well as emphasising the economic efficiency of local provision of fuel, ending predictably with the declaration, 'Let there be light'.¹³⁴

Missionaries achieved recognition for such scientific contributions. The obituary of Robert Moffat in *The Times* commented that, 'Apart from their special service as preachers', missionaries have done 'important work as pioneers of civilization, as geographers, as contributors to philological research'.¹³⁵ Though the most important of Livingstone's legacies was 'the spotless name and bright Christian character which have become associated everywhere with the great missionary explorer',¹³⁶ he also inspired respect 'in the scientific world,' since '[I]n science he was neither amateur nor dilettante'.¹³⁷ James Stewart's interests included chemistry, botany and agriculture, and he was author of the occasional scientific paper.¹³⁸ In India, too, missionaries contributed to the natural sciences, as well as to languages, Indology, and folk-lore. Duff, for example, helped to found both the Asiatic Society of Bengal, and the learned journal, the *Calcutta Review*.¹³⁹

As noted women were not excluded from intellectual accomplishments or learning. Nor were they excluded from evangelising, as their work in the 'zenanas' demonstrates, or accounts such as that of Euphemia Edie from Domasi [Nyasaland] of her conversion and Christian education of two boys.¹⁴⁰ They could also make their contribution to science through medicine. Evidence that women were taking up professional opportunities is furnished by the periodicals, where reporting of new missionary appointments was a regular feature, with a summary of the background

¹³³ *News of Female Missions*, Church of Scotland, New Series No 62, February 1903.

¹³⁴ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 11, 1901, p 517.

¹³⁵ Moffat, *Lives of Robert and Mary Moffat*, p 432-3.

¹³⁶ Blaikie, *Life of David Livingstone*, p 396.

¹³⁷ *Ibid.*, p 393.

¹³⁸ Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, p 12.

¹³⁹ See Taro Gangaran Gehani, *A Critical Review of the Work of Scottish Presbyterian Missions in India, 1878-1914*, Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Strathclyde, 1966, p 220.

and qualifications of new missionaries being typically provided. For example, Agnes Lambert was appointed to be in charge of the girls' department in the Livingstonia Institution in 1901. She was a 'fully trained and certificated teacher', her father had been a missionary with the United Presbyterian Church for 17 years, and her uncle was Lord Provost of Glasgow.¹⁴¹ The Episcopalian mission in South Africa had with them a Miss Oakshott, who had taken 'a mathematical tripos at Cambridge', and had been a mistress in St Matthew's Training College for 11 years.¹⁴² The frequent mention of women doctors in the pages of the women's periodicals also provides further evidence of professionally qualified women taking up missionary work. And in response to the increasing numbers of women aspiring to work in mission fields, the Free Church had set up a Women's Missionary Training Institute in 1894. In advertising its courses, the Institute appealed to 'earnest and educated young women', assuring them that the Institute was 'fitted to discover to them their true calling, as well as to equip them for it'.¹⁴³

In writing about their work and achievements missionaries represented themselves as dedicated, hard working, educated, and professionally competent, with individuals of exceptional ability among their numbers. These representations reinforced the value of education, and of European science and knowledge. The belief in the value of particular forms of knowledge is reflected in the frequently produced statistical information, which was also demanded by the missionary societies and churches back home, though accounts of the lives and character of individual converts or of incidents of conversion were also frequently provided to add colour to these. That the application of science and contributions to scientific knowledge were regarded as an important dimension of professional practice and accomplishment is evident in references in periodicals, but particularly in claims of achievement in biographies. Though professional status was something that could be achieved by both women and men, it was men's achievements as professionals that were privileged in terms of public recognition.

¹⁴⁰ Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, New Series no 7, July 1898, 56.

¹⁴¹ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 4, 1901, p 170.

¹⁴² *The Foreign Mission Chronicle of the Episcopal Church in Scotland*, New Series, Vol XV, No 2, April, 1914, p 59.

¹⁴³ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 1, 1901, p 37.

Conclusion

The importance of an analysis of civil society organisations, and of missionary societies and churches in particular, is that it illustrates a means by which collective identities were produced, reaffirmed, and reconstituted over time, through forms of social organisation which repeatedly and regularly consolidated a sense of community through people gathering together, and through the reproduction of symbols of their identity in religious rituals, and in spoken, written and visual forms of communication. The literature analysed here formed part of such a process, with different styles and genres fulfilling the different functions of addresses to meetings, regularly produced literature used for propaganda and educational purposes, and occasional didactic or inspirational literature.

These sources indicate that the literature by and about missionaries, which was a feature of 19th and early 20th religious life in Scotland, expanded in volume over time, reaching a substantial proportion of church members, though by no means all. In the latter part of the 19th century a genre of popular biographies of missionaries also developed, which appeared to have a wide readership in Scotland, and on occasion internationally. This literature, in particular the periodicals, was directed and managed from home, with missionaries being reminded when necessary of their duty to provide information. Supporters at home also actively contributed to writing and to dissemination. This included ministers reading such material from the pulpit and encouraging congregations to subscribe, and the use of literature at meetings for discussion and study purposes. By the 1870s this literature was already extensive, and increased substantially between the mid 1870s and the 1900s. Within the UFC, and its predecessors the FC and the UPC, where circulation reached the highest level, around one-third of all members were taking copies around the turn of the century. Since this coincided with the highest levels of church membership, this meant that such representations of empire and the missionary enterprise were reaching a sizeable proportion of the Scottish population.

This literature had a number of functions: education and propaganda to stimulate support for the missionary movement, whether in terms of financial support or recruits; accountability to supporters at home; and the creation of idealised models for moral inspiration. Different forms of literature varied in tone and character, from the moralising religious rhetoric of sermons and addresses, through the reporting and enumerating of periodicals and histories, to the representation of heroic missionaries or Christian martyrs of the biographies. Within this literature there were a number of dominant discourses, which can be characterised in general as those of religion, race, gender, and class, and which were inextricably linked together. These discourses served to present and reaffirm the identities of missionaries and their supporters at home, at the same time as providing a contrast with the peoples they sought to convert.

Religious discourses provided a justification for missionary interventions, with a repeated emphasis on the superiority of Christianity over other systems of belief. Through references to their own faith and Christian aims, missionaries presented themselves as fit to carry out their task, while biographies painted an idealised picture of the religious life in Scotland from which the great missionary emerged. The exercise of temporal power by the imperial British state that enabled their religious enterprise to develop was interpreted as the intervention of divine providence. Though Christian critiques of imperial policy and of military adventures were not absent from such discourses, missionaries and their churches remained loyal to the state.

In asserting the Christian identity of Scottish missionaries, the 'others' with whom they were contrasted were the peoples of India and Africa, and other colonial territories. These discourses of 'otherness' can in general be characterised as racist, though there were also competing discourses of egalitarianism and human rights. The persistently pejorative comments about other peoples' beliefs and customs were for the most part embedded in the everyday descriptions of missionary work, and rarely elaborated into theories of 'scientific' racism, though there are echoes of this, especially in biographies. At the same time the 'civilising mission' that missionaries

were engaged in was persistently emphasised, with, as time went on, claims for success in this being advanced. There were some differences in the representation of India and Africa, with India on the one hand being represented as a 'degraded' civilisation, which could be improved through education, European science, and changes in the status of women, whereas Africa was invariably represented as savage and cruel. Education and European science could also be applied there, but clothing and the work ethic were also necessary habits that Africans should acquire. Egalitarian discourses and accounts of advocacy of the rights of slaves or native peoples were also present in this literature, especially in attacks on slavery. Livingstone's campaign to end the slave trade in Central Africa became a major part of his heroic myth, and led to subsequent claims of missionaries' success in bringing this about. Nonetheless, such views were often undercut by more ambiguous or explicitly racist attitudes.

Discourses of gender were central to missionary literature, since a key part of Christianisation was the replacement of polygamy, concubinage, child marriage, and other such customs, by Christian monogamy and sexual modesty. This entailed a focus on the position of women, seen as the victims of such practices. In turn this emphasised the role of women missionaries, and an idealised version of marriage as a partnership as the model of gender roles at home. The literature and representations of women reflected the gender division of labour among missionaries and in Scottish society, and though women's expanding role in public and professional life was made apparent, men's achievements and leadership remained privileged over that of women, especially married women.

In the representations of missionary work and achievements, professional skills and competence and contributions to scholarship and science were persistent themes. It was not only Livingstone who was persuaded that religion and science complemented each other, but this view was widely shared by missionaries. Ferguson has commented that 'in Scotland the conflict between science and religion did not rage as bitterly as it did elsewhere', a situation he attributes partly to the divisions in the church and in provision of education, which allowed a diversity of

opinion and courses.¹⁴⁴ Certainly, the enthusiasm for science as part of the educational curriculum, in its application to the study of their surroundings, and in the application of new technologies, is a striking feature of missionary literature. This 'relationship between missionaries, science, and the environment has been very little studied', according to MacKenzie.¹⁴⁵ Yet, as this literature makes clear, 'conceptualizations of science and the environment are everywhere in the missionary record'.¹⁴⁶ The application of science presented a self-image of missionaries as 'people who controlled their natural and human environments with the help of technology, science and Western medicine'.¹⁴⁷ And it emphasised the difference between European and Indian and African societies.

Such discourses of professionalism and science can be described in general as those of class, since they reflected the middle class status which missionaries had attained, and which was shared by their supporters. That this status was particularly important to those who had most recently acquired it is suggested by the biographies of missionaries of relatively humble origins, and by the importance attached to women's professional qualifications in the women's missionary periodicals. It was also held up as an aspiration for all, no matter how humble their origins, as the iconisation of David Livingstone and Mary Slessor testifies. It remained the case, however, that men could be expected to reach greater heights of success and fame than women.

The overall effect of the dominance of these inter-related discourses of religion, race, gender and class in missionary literature was to reflect back to the Scottish church-going middle classes the values in which they believed, through the representation of missionaries as typifying these, and through the contrast with peoples designated as less civilised or uncivilised. That representations of missionaries and their work were idealised and representations of 'others' reduced to negative stereotypes is evident. That such distortions were calculated or deliberate is less evident, though this

¹⁴⁴ Ferguson, 'Christian Faith and Unbelief in Modern Scotland', p 81.

¹⁴⁵ MacKenzie, 'Missionaries, Science, and the Environment in Nineteenth-Century Africa', p 107.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., p 107.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid., p 128.

certainly occurred to some extent. There is evidence that material sent by missionaries was edited by those at home, in ways that missionaries themselves were uncomfortable with. The Directors of the SMS discussed in the 1820s the problem of the 'mischief' that might arise from 'partial and exaggerated accounts of missionary operations' where 'falacious views' were given of their success.¹⁴⁸ Such interference from editors at home is suggested by the fact that missionary material was 'carefully scrutinised and edited' before printing.¹⁴⁹ Correspondence in *The Scotman* in 1910 criticised editing by home based supporters and its emphasis on the sensational.¹⁵⁰ Missionaries were also occasionally critical of each other, as in the case of William Miller, who criticised his colleagues for painting 'one-sided pictures' of Hinduism, which was 'too often maligned'. This resulted in a counter-attack for his 'tolerant approach'.¹⁵¹ There is also evidence that missionaries might have a more complex view of the societies they encountered, for example, in Clement Scott's attitude to African culture, or the kind of anthropological approach exemplified in the work of Cullen Young.¹⁵²

Such criticisms of distortion, or evidence of a tolerance towards and appreciation of other cultures, was however rare, whatever the private views and interests of missionaries might have been. Consequently, the persistently negative, sensationalised and simplified accounts presented in this literature dominated over more nuanced and complex accounts, and can justifiably be described as racist. This does not mean that cruelty was not encountered, nor that practices which disadvantaged particular groups of people, and especially women, did not occur, and indeed, practices such as female circumcision remain controversial today. What it does mean, however, is that in general there was a failure to present a sympathetic understanding of the values of other systems of belief, or the place of particular cultural and social practices in the creation of identity or solidarity in particular

¹⁴⁸ Letter from W Brown to Mr Crawford, 22nd September, 1828: NLS MS 8986.

¹⁴⁹ See Gehani, *Scottish Presbyterian Missions in India*, p 7.

¹⁵⁰ *The Scotsman*, 1st June and 3rd June, 1910. See also chapter 7.

¹⁵¹ See Gehani, *Scottish Presbyterian Missions in India*, p 190.

¹⁵² See Harvey J Sindima, *The Legacy of Scottish Missionaries in Malawi*, Lewiston/Lampeter/Queenston, Edwin Mellen Press, 1992; and Peter G Forster, *T Cullen Young: Missionary and Anthropologist*, Hull, Hull University Press, 1989.

communities. There appeared to be an unwavering faith in the idealised vision of Scottish society as the height of civilisation, and as the best form for others.

It was not only for the ‘uncivilised’ abroad that this vision was being presented. Anxiety about the ‘savages’ at home sometimes surfaced in this literature, and it is important to remember that as far as the periodicals were concerned, both home and foreign missions were covered in the same publications, and thus no doubt the parallels were obvious. The projection of idealised images of the success of self-help can also be interpreted as an attempt at social control of the lower classes. The genre of missionary biographies of the late 19th and early 20th century was typical of this Victorian approach of promoting heroic figures and self-help. As McLaren has noted of nineteenth century biographies, they were ‘used as agents of socialization, part of the process by which the middle ranks reinforced the moral, ethical and religious attitudes of their own generation and attempted to pass them on to the next’.¹⁵³ Carlyle’s idea of ‘hero worship’ as the basis for religious and social good was enthusiastically taken up, with missionaries such as Dr Laws being described as ‘emphatically’ belonging to the class of ‘great men’ whose biographies, according to Carlyle, were the material of history.¹⁵⁴ Livingstone provided the classic example of self-help promoted by Samuel Smiles, who ‘advocated self reliance, struggle and self creation as the only way to respect and independence’, a message which by the mid 19th century had a wide appeal to both middle and working class people in both Scotland and England.¹⁵⁵ Biographies of missionaries were thus shaped by the twin influences of Carlyle and Smiles, and reinforced the message of self-improvement, as well as the view that humble origins were no impediment to success.

There are a number of changes over time observable in missionary literature. Different genres developed, such as the biographies which became more numerous after the 1870s, and style and tone also changed. The periodicals became more journalistic, with articles accompanied by photographs becoming more common

¹⁵³ Martha McLaren, *British India and British Scotland, 1780-1830*, Akron, University of Akron Press, 2001, p 241.

¹⁵⁴ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 45.

¹⁵⁵ R J Morris, ‘Victorian Values in Scotland and England’ in T C Smout, (ed), *Victorian Values*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1992, p 35.

compared to the letters and extracts from journals of earlier decades. There was less religiosity in tone and content, though religious discourses were always present, and more emphasis on the achievements and successes of missionaries in the secular sphere as well as those in the sphere of religion. The changing role of women was also reflected in the literature, both in their activities as supporters at home, and as workers in the mission fields. Thus social changes at home were reflected in the pages of missionary periodicals and biographies.

By contrast, it was harder to discern what changes might be occurring in Indian or African societies. Indeed the continuity in the representation of others is striking, notwithstanding the claims of missionaries' success. The changes that missionaries effected were represented largely in terms of numbers of converts and school pupils, and in comments on the growing interest in western education. Otherwise the overall impression of these societies is one of little change. Whether this was the result of a failure to perceive what social changes were occurring in response to western interventions, or of the need to continually make a case for foreign missions is hard to judge. The reality was that relatively few people were within reach of missionary programmes, and despite the successes claimed, missionaries' perception was of a need for greater efforts to further the aim of global Christianisation. Such 'Christian imperialism' then implied a vision of empire in which others would come to appreciate the values of education, hard work, and clean living, that were the ideals of Scotland's church-going middle classes, a form of civilisation to which others abroad and the lower classes at home could aspire. The dominant discourses within missionary literature presented a clear vision of the superiority of European Christian civilisation, which the Scottish missionary movement could both exemplify and export. To what extent a Scottish national identity was manifested within the context of membership of such wider collectivities is the subject of the next chapter.

Chapter 6: Remembering and reproducing Scotland: the construction of national identity

Introduction

From an examination of a range of types of missionary literature - pamphlets, annual reports, periodicals, histories and biographies - a number of interlinked dominant discourses emerged, those of religion, race, gender and class. These discourses were articulated in ways which constructed both the identities of missionaries and those of the 'others' encountered in the missionary enterprise. In the same way a discourse of national identity was articulated, integrally linked to these other dominant discourses. The same sources outlined at the beginning of chapter five have formed the basis for the analysis of how a Scottish identity in particular was manifested, and the relationship of these different markers of identity will be discussed in the concluding chapter.

The ways in which missionaries represented themselves, their work, and their values reflected back to people at home the dominant values of the church-going middle classes in Scotland. Nonetheless these values were shared with other European countries, and with other missionary societies, though not all worked in the same way or placed the same emphasis on education, for example. To what extent then did missionary literature reflect back to people at home characteristics or phenomena that were identified specifically as Scottish? To attempt to answer this question, representations of Scottish identity will be examined.

There is a general question to be asked about how we might expect a Scottish identity to have been manifested in such writings. Explicit references to writers themselves as Scottish, use of Scotland or aspects of Scottish experience as a reference point, claims relevant to ideas of Scottish tradition or character, were perhaps the most obvious forms of expression of Scottish identity. However, identity might be referred to in more implicit ways, for example, by stressing particular values or dimensions of missionary work that were seen as consonant with Scottish

values, such as literacy and education, the form of church organisation, and so on. A Scottish identity might also be contrasted with ideas of a British or English identity, whether explicitly or implicitly, though claims of similarity might also be made. With respect to the terminology of nationality the question is posed of the relationship of a Scottish identity to a British, or even an English identity. Was, for example, a Scottish identity subsumed in a British identity, or was it privileged over it? This chapter attempts to answer these questions through illustrating how Scottish identity was manifested in missionary literature, and through analysing the varied ways in which this occurred and the functions that such expressions of Scottish identity performed.

Recalling the homeland

There are a number of ways in which Scotland or Scottishness served as reference points, which may be described as recalling the homeland, though the functions of such references varied. They might express an emotional attachment to the homeland, through references to memories, landscape, and climate, or being reminded of home in other ways. The emotional intensity of such expressions might vary, from a routine mention to a more explicit expression of nostalgia or longing, for example, for the company of absent friends or family back home in Scotland. Scotland, or aspects of Scottish life and society, might also serve as a point of comparison or as an analogy to convey information about the society in which the missionary writer was living. This functioned both as a means of making something readily comprehensible to readers and of expressing what was held in common by writers and readers. Again such comparisons and analogies might be characterised as a routine process of affirming mutuality and shared membership of a group of people. References to connections to and contact with Scots at home and abroad also reinforced shared membership of a community, as well as commenting on social position, and the role that missionaries might play in the religious life of Scots abroad.

References to landscape, scenery or climate, might be tinged with nostalgia and affection. En route to India, Margaret Wilson favourably compared the ‘splendid

city of Edinburgh' to 'the huge and smoky city of London', where the busy scenes on the Thames were 'not to be compared with the romance excited by our Scottish scenery'.¹ Or, a description of climate might evoke nostalgia:

The rains are "on" now in real earnest, and the gray skies and muddy roads give one a delightful home feel! I never thought that I would look on muddy roads with such affection....²

Margaret Wilson's intense attachment to Scotland encompassed its landscape, its people and its religion:

Scotland can never be forgotten by us. Its summer scenery and its winter storms, are alike present to our thoughts. It is emphatically the land of friendship and pure affection; it is the land upon which the light of the blessed Gospel pours its brightest rays.³

The cultural life of the homeland was also recalled with nostalgia, for example, in Mrs Colvin's yearning for the 'holy, peaceful calm of a Scottish Sabbath, with its sweet church-bell and its absence from labour, and its multitudes thronging to the house of God', contrasted with the busy bazaars of Bombay.⁴ Scotland might be also be brought to mind by encounters, such as that of Mrs Sutherland, who had previously worked in Paisley, with black children in Old Calabar, where she 'noticed with some emotion, some of the Paisley prints [.....] worn by the black children who came to meet the mission party'.⁵

Comparisons with Scotland were used to evoke scenes for the reader. Of a 'Hottentot' village at a Moravian mission, Margaret Wilson wrote, 'you might have fancied yourself in a Highland village' apart from 'the sable countenances of the people'.⁶ Similarly, a Mr Thomson visiting the Caffraria mission in South Africa remarked: 'except for the black faces, a stranger would almost think that he had dropt into a little Scottish village'.⁷ In evoking familiar scenes, the unfamiliar was

¹ John Wilson, *Memoir of Mrs Margaret Wilson*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, and London, Whittaker and Co and J Nisbet and Co, 1838, p 119.

² Miss Mary Dodds, writing from Poona, in *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 10, October, 1898, p 76.

³ Wilson, *Margaret Wilson*, 1838, p 503.

⁴ *News of Female Missions*, No 3, July, 1863, p 85.

⁵ Agnes Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland of Old Calabar*, Paisley, J and R Parlane, 1883, p 24.

⁶ Wilson, *Margaret Wilson*, p 119.

⁷ *Scottish Missionary Register*, 1827, p 33.

also stressed. Such a contrast was more pointed in Alexander Duff's description of Bombay, where he observed:

the Gothic-looking tower of the English cathedral, and the small extinguisher-like spire of the Scotch church; pleasant chiefly as reminding the traveller, before he lands, that he is not to enter a city of unmixed heathenism.⁸

The behaviour of people in other countries might recall the behaviour of people at home, sometimes to make a point. Alexander Duff commented on Scottish landowners' reluctance to grant sites for churches by his use of a South African analogy, where the example of chiefs giving up land 'needs to be proclaimed [...] in the ears of some of the landed gentry of this Christian Scotland'.⁹ Mrs Sutherland was reminded by African women, putting on their dresses to enter the church, 'of the Scotch lassies of fifty years ago' who, having walked barefoot to church, put on stockings and shoes before entering, perhaps in this description anticipating similar social change.¹⁰

Historical analogies might be used for descriptive purposes. Robert Moffat outlined the tactics of an African chief:

The little force [...] not unlike that of Bruce at Bannockburn, seized their opportunity, and, when all the enemy were slumbering in perfect security, aroused them by a volley of stones falling on their fragile huts.¹¹

Or a significant date for missionary work, such as the development in education for girls in Madras, might be recalled with reference to significant dates in Scotland's recent past:

[the] year, 1843, will become a date to be remembered in the annals of Southern India with gratitude as devout, and satisfaction more unmixed than belong to it in our Scottish story.¹²

⁸ Alexander Duff, *Bombay in April 1840; with special reference to the Church of Scotland's Mission There*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, n.d.

⁹ Alexander Duff, *Foreign Missions, being the substance of an address delivered before the General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland*, 1866, p 12.

¹⁰ Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland*, 1883, p 90.

¹¹ *Scenes and Services in South Africa: Moffat's Missionary Labours*, London, John Snow and Co, 1876, p 36.

¹² Lecture by William Miller to Ladies' Society of the Free Church of Scotland, 1878, p 12.

Analogy might also be used to characterise local attitudes. A major obstacle to female education was that Hindus regarded it as a sin:

in some such way perhaps, but probably with decidedly greater horror than Protestants would feel for the idea of their relatives becoming nuns, or than the mothers of Scotland would entertain for the proposal that they should train all their daughters for the stage.¹³

Another way in which Scottish or local connections within Scotland were reinforced in periodical literature, or in memoirs and biographies, was through references to the backgrounds of individuals or to their connections with Scots at home and abroad. Duff, for example, was sent to India with letters of introduction, among others 'to our countryman the Earl of Dalhousie',¹⁴ Governor-General of India. Elsewhere the support or endorsement of fellow Scots in prominent positions was emphasised. The early Scottish Missionary Society missions received support from Mountstuart Elphinstone, 'one of the very greatest names in Indian history'.¹⁵ His successor, Sir John Malcolm 'was equally favourable to the Mission, and subscribed liberally towards its support'. Other generous donors to the missionary cause, such as Sir William Mackinnon, A L Bruce, or Lord Overtoun, were praised in missionary publications.¹⁶ Not only did such comments emphasise the endorsement of missionary activity by prominent Scots at home and abroad, they also underlined the social standing of missionaries and their supporters.

In a similar vein, information on the background of missionaries often emphasised their social position, as well as their qualifications. For example, Dr Jack Bowie of Blantyre, was the son of 'a much-respected citizen of Edinburgh', Henry Bowie, secretary of the Philosophical Institution.¹⁷ Miss Cumming, appointed to assist in the hospital in Poona, was a niece of the late Dr Maxwell Nicholson of St Stephen's in Edinburgh.¹⁸ Miss Lambert, appointed to Livingstonia, was the niece of Lord Provost

¹³ Ibid., p 11.

¹⁴ George Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1899, p 33.

¹⁵ J Murray Mitchell, *In Western India: recollections of my early missionary life*, Edinburgh, David Douglas, 1899, p 45.

¹⁶ See, for example, *Kikuyu News*, No 1 March, 1908; George Smith, *Short History of Christian Missions from Abraham and Paul to Carey, Livingstone and Duff*, Sixth Edition, 1904.

¹⁷ W Robertson, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, London, James Nisbet, 1892, p 77.

¹⁸ *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 11, November 1898, p 85.

Chisholm of Glasgow.¹⁹ Miss Stevenson, a missionary in Kenya, was described as the sister of Professor Stevenson, of Glasgow University, and had as her colleague a Nurse Motherwell, trained at the Glasgow Western Infirmary.²⁰

In addition to missionary work with ‘native’ peoples, Scots missionaries often had contact with the Scottish population resident in colonial territories, and such links with co-religionists from the homeland were referred to in a number of contexts. Recognising that Scottish missionaries in Jamaica had been more favourably viewed by planters in Jamaica than had Baptist and Methodist missionaries, it was pointed out that many of the Jamaicans were Scotsmen and also Presbyterians, thus the missionaries were supported in their work with slaves by such planters.²¹ Women missionaries at Sialkot in India reported that at Christmas in 1903 they had organised a tree: ‘we have just been round to the barracks asking the women and children of the Gordon Highlanders to come to it.’²² In Kenya, missionaries were ‘surprised to find how many **Scotch settlers** have their homes on the choice pieces of land round about Kikuyu Mission’, and they had ‘recently visited quite a colony of our own folks’ where they had ‘found representatives from Rothesay, Glasgow, Montrose and elsewhere’.²³

These references to connections with other Scots at home and abroad might fulfil a number of purposes. At a general level they emphasised membership of a community where it was expected that people from this community would take an interest in each other, and offer forms of support to each other. More specifically such references underlined the social standing of missionaries and their supporters, and the worthiness of their cause. In general these references, recalling the homeland, worked by establishing a sense of shared experience and community between writer and reader, assuming a shared knowledge of places, people, and events, and mutual appreciation of their significance, whether these were personal memories, attachments and connections, or geographical, historical or cultural analogies. Such

¹⁹ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 4, 1901.

²⁰ *Kikuyu News*, No 1, March, 1908.

²¹ *Scottish Missionary Society Chronicle*, September, 1833, p 74.

²² *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 63, March, 1903, p 23.

²³ *Kikuyu News*, No 2, April, 1908, p 10.

expressions of national identity can be described as effectively a reflex in communication between members of this 'imagined community', representing a routine expression of national identity in everyday life, in contrast to more elaborate processes of claiming of identity or of national myth making. It is difficult to judge how conscious and deliberate expressions of this kind may have been, since references to climate, places, and friends may seem 'natural' to such communications. Whether conscious and deliberate constructions or not, nonetheless, such expressions made claims of national identity, even though they may be characterised, like the 'banal nationalism' which characterises modern political discourses described by Michael Billig, as 'prosaic, routine words, which take nations for granted, and which, in so doing, inhabit them'.²⁴ These 'reminders of the homeland' ensured that the national identity of speaker and listener would not be forgotten. They reinforced the Scottish identity of the missionaries, separated from the land of their birth, though furthering its ambitions, and tied to it by the umbilical cord of their religious faith and institutions. Though such routine expressions of identity are found throughout the period, in the earlier period of missionary activity, they served as a way of assimilating the new and the strange and making them comprehensible to readers, and later accounts of first encounters, such as that of Mrs Sutherland with West African women and children, also had this character. In the later decades of the 19th century and the early 20th century, the more frequent references to Scots at home and abroad is suggestive both of the growing missionary and white settler communities and their inter-relationships as a group with a shared identity.

Symbolic reproduction of the homeland: naming and other cultural practices

A more deliberate process of affirming Scottish identity for missionaries and missionary communities, like other Scots abroad, whether permanent emigrants or sojourners, was the naming of places and people after historical Scots figures, Scots people or Scottish places. For example, in Jamaica a station where emancipated slaves settled was called Brownsville, 'after Dr William Brown, son of Dr John Brown of Haddington, and for many years the Secretary of the Scottish Missionary

²⁴ Michael Billig, *Banal Nationalism*, London, Sage, 1995, p 93.

Society'.²⁵ In 1835, the Original Secession Congregation of Broughton Place, Edinburgh, adopted the Rev James Paterson, and his place of work in Jamaica was named 'New Broughton'.²⁶ And, according to Hewat, in Jamaica 'Whole villages carry to this day the name of some well-known missionary, or a slave-owner who treated his slaves decently'.²⁷

Mission stations might be named after their founders, leading church worthies, the congregations at home supporting them, or by some association with famous missionaries, as the stations of Blantyre and Livingstonia in Nyasaland both illustrate. The early organisers of the Glasgow Missionary Society were commemorated in the naming of mission stations in South Africa:

Lovedale, the seat of the central institution, evangelising and industrial, recalls the name of the Rev Dr Love of Glasgow; Burnshill, of Dr Burns of the Barony; Macfarlan, of Dr Macfarlan of Renfrew; and Pirie, of another Glasgow minister. Across the Kei river, but now in British territory, there are the stations of Cunningham, Duffbank (Idutywa), and Blythswood.²⁸

The naming of institutions after benefactors or founders was, as at home, a common practice, as in the case of Elphinstone and Wilson colleges in Bombay, named after Mountstuart Elphinstone and John Wilson respectively. Duff noted of the Elphinstone College, that this designation is 'in honour of the late and highly popular governor of that name' though not referring explicitly to Elphinstone's Scots origins, presumably well known to his readers.²⁹ Or tribute might be paid to prominent supporters of the missionary cause, like the Madras hospital named after Christina Rainy, a niece of Principal Rainy of New College.³⁰ Another way in which such naming occurred was the practice of adopting hospital wards or beds in mission hospitals. For example, the Woman's Guild financed the medical work at the Kalimpong mission, including the hospital, named after Charteris, founder of the

²⁵ George Robson, *Missions of the United Presbyterian Church described in a Series of Stories*, Edinburgh, Offices of the United Presbyterian Church, 1896, p 46.

²⁶ Elizabeth Hewat, *Vision and Achievement, 1796-1956: A History of the Foreign Missions of the Churches United in the Church of Scotland*, London, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1960, p 20.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p17.

²⁸ George Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, Edinburgh, John Maclaren and Sons, Fourteenth Edition, 1880, p 15.

²⁹ Duff, *Bombay in April 1840*.

Woman's Guild. Guild branches 'adopted' hospital beds, and these were named after the branches or districts paying for them.³¹ Many Presbyterian churches abroad whether for Scots emigrants or for native converts were named after St Andrew, such as the Presbyterian church for the 'Scotch people of Nairobi', to whom a site had been granted by Lord Elgin.³² St Margaret, too, was a common choice, such as the Poona hospital, which grew from Dr Letitia Bernard's dispensary.³³

Native converts in Africa were frequently given 'Christian' names, many of them taken from the missionaries, or named by missionaries. In India, this practice does not appear to have been applied to adult converts, though sponsorship of children in orphanages was accompanied by the naming of children by sponsors, though this latter practice did not necessarily have a specifically Scottish dimension. As indicated in chapter four, this practice was initiated around the mid-1840s, and was taken up by Sunday Schools and individuals.³⁴ Sponsors were 'entitled to suggest European names for their charges', and even to change them again if there was a new subscriber.³⁵ Names such as Lucy, Emily, and Louise are cited, no doubt popular names in both Scotland and England at the time, but not of course specifically Scottish, though an example of an Indian Christian girl named 'Mary Ramsay' is cited in *The Eastern Female's Friend*.³⁶

In a rare discussion of such naming practices, the Rev John Pourie wrote that he did not think this practice should be encouraged. He understood how interesting it must be to 'a lady in Scotland' to have an Indian girl called after her or someone dear to her, and that this helped raise funds. But there was an '*Anglifying*' tendency which led to problems in getting Christian girls to keep up an adequate knowledge of their own native tongue: 'they are inclined to look upon it as *vulgar* to talk in it (just as it would be thought vulgar by some Scotch ladies to talk in broad Scotch)', and this

³⁰ Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, p 97.

³¹ Mamie Magnusson, *Out of Silence: The Woman's Guild 1887-1987*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1987, p 77.

³² See *Kikuyu News*, No 4, June, 1908, and No 5, July, 1908.

³³ Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, p 56.

³⁴ Annie S Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest: the story of the hundred years' work of the Women's Foreign Mission of the Church of Scotland*, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1937, p 78.

³⁵ *Ibid.* p 78.

meant they became less useful in relation to the ‘heathen masses of their native countrywomen’.³⁷ The practice, however, persisted, as subsequent reports in women’s periodicals and in correspondence on the allocation of ‘unappropriated’ orphans indicates.³⁸ Pourie’s linguistic analogy offers an interesting insight into the social division or social distancing that missionary intervention might produce, though his criticisms did not suggest any sense that such naming practices might violate an individual’s sense of identity, only that they might inhibit the process of Christianisation.

A further way in which a Scottish identity might be affirmed was the maintenance abroad of the cultural practices of home, and native peoples were also frequently inducted into these, including social and recreational activities. For example, Mr Gunn, of Livingstonia, recounted the singing of ‘Auld Lang Syne’ at events such as prizegivings, and, at New Year:

Our dusky companions entered with becoming grace into the feelings of the moment and joined us heartily in singing “Auld Lang Syne” which was translated into Chi-nyanja a year ago.³⁹

Furthermore, native peoples were expected to renounce not only their religious beliefs on conversion to Christianity but cultural practices such as dancing, singing and chanting, many of which had great symbolic significance in the rituals and cultural life of native peoples, particularly in Africa.⁴⁰ Mrs Laws, for example, reported baptisms and admission of people into the ‘hearers’ class, ‘after a public renunciation of all the evil customs of their tribes’.⁴¹

³⁶ *The Eastern Female’s Friend*, No V, January, 1858, p 13.

³⁷ John Pourie, ‘Orphan Homes – New Names’, *The Eastern Female’s Friend*, No VIII, October, 1858.

³⁸ See, for example, Church of Scotland, *News of Female Missions*, Issue No 3, 1863, p 90, and NLS MS 7624, Church of Scotland Women’s Association Letter Book, 1885-1915: letter from I Allan to Emily Bernard, 3 June, 1885; letter from I Allan to Emily Bernard, 25 November, 1885; letter from I Allan to Emily Bernard, 21 January, 1886.

³⁹ Extracts from Mr Gunn’s diary, published from 1877-1879 in the *Wick Gazette*, included in newspaper cuttings in MS 7906, NLS.

⁴⁰ For an account of missionary prohibitions of and attitudes towards African cultural practices, see Harvey J Sindima, *The Legacy of Scottish Missionaries in Malawi*, Lewiston/ Lampeter/Queenston, The Edwin Mellen Press, 1992.

⁴¹ *Women’s Missionary Magazine of the Free Church of Scotland*, No 19, July, 1902, p 146.

The practices of naming of places and people outlined above can be described as the symbolic reproduction of the topography and genealogy of Scotland. Such symbolic recreation of the homeland appears to be typical both of emigrant communities and of colonisers. Like others Scots put their stamp on the places they occupied, and on the people they subordinated whether by physical force, economic or cultural means. This stamp naturally reflected their Scottish origins and identity and its local variations. Missionaries were no different from other imperial actors in this respect. Indeed, given the nature of the missionary enterprise their interventions might often be more intrusive than those of the state, or economic actors, with their insistence on a particular form of morality and culture, and the abandonment of native social and cultural practices as a condition of admission to Christian churches. The underlying assumption of the right to appropriate both physical and cultural spaces and to exercise authority through such actions do not seem to have been questioned, though such acts of naming places, institutions and people, all entailed deliberate and conscious choices as did teaching songs or other forms of cultural activity to other peoples. Though missionaries might not have exercised temporal power as such (though usually backed by this or the threat of it) such practices provided evidence of their cultural power, establishing a sense of security in their own position through an explicit assertion of their own identity, and securing the acquiescence of others in a reshaping of their identity. The evidence from the literature examined here suggests that such practices were typical and continuous throughout this period, and that missionaries who were respectful of indigenous cultures, beliefs, or religions were relatively rare.

The homeland as a model: institutional forms and practices

If the general aim of missionary work was to Christianise other peoples, this was achieved by engaging in a specific set of practices, and building specific institutions – churches, schools and colleges, dispensaries and hospitals – modelled on those of the homeland. Many references were made in periodicals, histories, and annual reports, for example, to the establishment and existence of Presbyterian churches in other countries, for example, the development of native churches on Presbyterian lines, links with ‘Colonial’ Presbyterian churches for white settlers or white resident

populations, and links with Presbyterian churches in the dominions who also supported Scottish missionary endeavours. It goes without saying that the form of religion introduced was a Presbyterian one. New colonial and 'native' churches functioned on the lines of the Presbyterian churches as they had developed in Scotland, and therefore reproduced these forms, both in matters of organisation and governance, as well as in the form of religious worship and observance. Thus little was said about church organisation as such, apart from reporting of new churches being built, numbers of congregations, training of 'native' pastors and missionaries and so on. Nor was there any need to emphasise the Scottish character of the institutional model, since this was taken for granted in a periodical literature produced separately for its members by each major denomination.

Within such literature, it was in references to relationships between Scottish churches and with other churches that a Scottish identity was most apparent, rather than in accounts of establishing churches within mission fields. In general, however, support for co-operation between the presbyterian churches was frequently expressed, as was support for co-operation with Protestant missions from England and other countries, and references hinting at rivalry or hostility were very few. The Church of Scotland's loss of all but one of their missionaries at the Disruption,⁴² led to the defence of its 'missionary zeal', and emphasis on its status as both an 'Established' and a 'National' church. The task of the christianisation of 'savage' nations must be taken up by the 'National' church: 'whatever other Churches in the country may do, the National Churches are bound to accept the task'.⁴³ Equality of status of the Church of Scotland with the Church of England as Established, Scotland's separate identity as a nation, and the Church of Scotland's status as the 'national' church, were thus emphasised simultaneously.

⁴² The Church of Scotland lost all its missionaries, apart from a Miss Savile, to the seceding church. For an account of the pledge to stay with the Church of Scotland in the event of a split extracted from Miss Savile (who is not named specifically in the article) see 'Historical Sketch of the Women's Foreign Missionary Society of the Free Church of Scotland' in *The Helpmeet*, Vol III, No 36, October, 1899, p 286 ff.

⁴³ *Scottish Ladies' Association, AGM, 1844*, p 15.

In their turn Free Church missionaries felt that the Church of Scotland had caused them some difficulty by their decisions over where to establish missions post-Disruption and over property and resources.⁴⁴ The frequently expressed desire for co-operation between missions appears, however, genuine, and may also have been influenced by the need to present a common Christian (or at least Protestant) front: ‘Mere divisions among Christians do not affect the heathen as they are often said to do; but quarrels among Christians are an unmitigated and immeasurable evil’.⁴⁵ The good relations of the ‘Scottish churches in Bombay’ were consequently a ‘great cause of thankfulness’.⁴⁶

As might be expected, perspectives on relationships between the churches changed over time. Most notably the joint venture of carrying the missionary enterprise to Central Africa in fulfilment of ‘Livingstone’s prayer’, provided an opportunity to stress mutual support and co-operation, and it would appear to be the case that supporters of missionary activity from the three main Presbyterian Churches came to effectively use this to develop a more united front. If in reality this process was not without its difficulties and tensions, there was little indication of this in missionary literature with the enterprise often being represented in a very positive light: ‘almost simultaneously there arose in all the Presbyterian Churches of Scotland a movement in favour of organising a missionary invasion of East Central Africa’.⁴⁷

Though the separate denominations at home were exported to the mission fields, the quarrels and disputes were not for the most part, though they might have been reproduced among the colonial churches of Scots settlers.⁴⁸ The common presbyterian identity of Scottish missionaries was also reinforced by occasional references to other churches. Catholicism was the object of profound antipathy, but this was so much taken for granted that it was seldom mentioned in the context of

⁴⁴ See, for example, George Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*.

⁴⁵ Murray Mitchell, *In Western India*, p 104.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p 104.

⁴⁷ Robertson, *Martyrs of Blantyre*, p 25-6.

⁴⁸ Marjory Harper, for example, writes of settlers that ‘There was no common religious identity, for Scots exported their sectarianism’. Marjory Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles*, London, Profile Books, 2003, p 337.

missionary work in India and Africa.⁴⁹ The Anglican ‘High Church’ movement which began to affect India in 1838, led to a tendency to ‘draw off from all who are not of their own way of thinking’.⁵⁰ Or more generally, as Principal Rainy declared: ‘the Scot was not attracted to Anglicanism’.⁵¹ Anglican missionaries in Kenya did not respond to the inspiration to ‘friendly co-operation’ of the 1910 World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh.⁵² Anglicans and Presbyterians might work jointly together, though Scottish autonomy was a sensitive subject. Lady Victoria Campbell, in promoting the British Women’s Protected Emigration Society,⁵³ emphasised that the society was inter-denominational, though ‘its pioneers and organisers are English, and naturally belong to the Church of England’.⁵⁴ A Scottish branch had however been developed, and the issue of further Scottish autonomy was being addressed.

Kinship with other Presbyterian churches was sometimes stressed. At a meeting of delegates recently returned from South Africa, the ‘position, needs and claims’ of the ‘Scottish Presbyterians in the Cape’ were outlined, and the speaker, Professor Rankine, ‘with forensic clearness, pointed out the strong link between Boer and Scot from their common Presbyterianism’.⁵⁵ Such Presbyterianism, though not unique to Scotland, was worthy of emphasis as a strong marker of Scottish identity, just as the distance or discomfort apparent in relations with Anglicans was an indicator of difference between Scotland and England. Within the context of missionary enterprise throughout the empire, then, a common presbyterianism would appear to have been more important than differences of opinion over doctrine or the

⁴⁹ There are some instances of specific attacks on the Catholic church. For example, Alexander Duff wrote a pamphlet attacking Jesuits, *The Jesuits: their Origin and Order, Morality and Practices, Suppression and Restoration*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, 1868; and John Wilson’s views on the Catholic Church in India are referred to in his Memorial to his wife, *Memoir of Margaret Wilson*.

⁵⁰ Murray Mitchell, *In Western India*, p 95.

⁵¹ *Life and Work*, No 2, Vol XXV, February, 1903, p 31.

⁵² *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland*, No 158, February, 1914, p 55.

⁵³ This Society aimed to encourage ‘right subjects to go to those daughter-lands, where greater space and fresh opportunities for developing character and talents exist’, and in particular South Africa.

⁵⁴ *Life and Work*, No 3, Vol XXV, March, 1903, p 65.

⁵⁵ *Life and Work*, No 2, Vol XXV, February, 1903, p 31. A Scottish connection with the Dutch Reformed Church in South Africa had been established many decades earlier, with the recruitment of Scots ministers in the 1820s. For an account of this see Michael Fry, *The Scottish Empire*, East Lothian, Tuckwell Press, 2001, chapter 11.

relationship between church and state, and thus could function clearly as a marker of national identity in a way that was perhaps more difficult at home, where denominational divisions might provoke rival claims as to which was the true national church. This is not to say that such rivalry was never present in the literature reviewed here, but it was either very muted or implied rather than explicit.

It appears to have been only when a particular institutional model was contested, that more emphasis was given to both its virtues and its Scottish heritage or character. This was most evident in advocacy of Duff's model for the development of education in India. To advance this case the analogy of the Scottish Highlands was used:

it may with truth be said that, in respect to general ignorance and superstition, the Highlanders of Scotland, about 60 or 80 years ago, somewhat approximated to the present condition of the people of India.⁵⁶

The 'sagacious' 'Scotch' proceeded to educate the Highlanders through making translations 'into the native dialects' at the same time as 'facilities were very widely afforded for the acquisition of the English language'.⁵⁷ This provided a pathway from the 'parochial schools' to 'Academies or High Schools in the county towns' and 'thence many found their way to Universities'.⁵⁸ At that time for young Highlanders, 'English was just as much a *foreign* language as it can be to the native youth of Bengal'.⁵⁹ Thus the Scottish model was explicitly advanced, and identified as having formed the basis of Duff's plans. His purpose was to establish 'free schools for the benefit of native boys, to be conducted upon the plan of the sessional schools in Scotland' which 'have succeeded to a remarkable degree in that country'.⁶⁰

⁵⁶ *Statement respecting a central institution or college in order to the improvement and increased efficiency of School Operations conducted by missionaries of various denominations in Calcutta*, 1831, p 44. This pamphlet seems to have been a collective effort, and authorship is not attributed, though George Gogerly and Alexander Duff are named in different parts of the pamphlet. Duff, however, made this analogy elsewhere.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, p 44.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, p 44.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, p 44.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p 44.

The obverse of such advocacy for a Scottish model was criticism of other approaches, such as that offered by Government colleges in India. Though not explicitly couched in terms of differences between English and Scottish approaches, this would appear to be what was at issue. Duff complained that Indian pupils from Christian schools were excluded from civil promotion, since the examination system was based on the government colleges, which were mostly based on English literature and history, and as a consequence pupils, 'could, for instance, answer the most mincing little questions connected with the pettiest little details in Grecian [sic] or Roman history, or in the poems of Chaucer, Shakespeare, and Byron'.⁶¹ By contrast Scottish missionary institutions provided a different kind of education:

*a fair and reasonable attention is paid to every really useful department of knowledge; but always in daily and kindly conjunction with some portion of sacred truth, adapted to the capacities and progress of the pupils.*⁶²

Notwithstanding such explicit advocacy of a Scottish model of education, Scottish missionaries, including Duff, made reference to an 'English' education: 'There is a demand now in India for female education wherever English education has awakened the native mind from the sleepy drench and lethargy of ages'.⁶³ Similarly Murray Mitchell referred to the 'English education' promoted by the early Scottish missionaries, though stresses also that they understood the importance of vernacular primary schools.⁶⁴ Education in the English language, rather than an 'English' system, was clearly intended by such remarks.

Elsewhere, more routine references to education tended to emphasise the belief in the high standards of Scottish education and pride in the attainment of high standards in mission schools. A Mrs Scott, running a school in Sialkot, was trained 'in the best methods of Scottish education', and appears to have looked somewhat askance at the conditions under which she had to work.⁶⁵ More common were comments such as the following from Blantyre in Nyasaland, suggesting that the transplantation of

⁶¹ *Missionary Record of the Free Church of Scotland*, Vol III, No 10, October, 1847, p 235.

⁶² *Ibid*, p 235.

⁶³ Alexander Duff, *Foreign Missions, being the substance of an address delivered before the General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland*, 1866, p 9.

⁶⁴ Murray Mitchell, *In Western India*, p 58.

Scottish educational methods was deemed to be successful, since ‘we can see for ourselves, as we look at their copy-books, writing and figures that few Scottish schools could beat’.⁶⁶

In general it is clear that pride in the educational traditions of Scotland, and the relative openness of the educational system, was expressed in missionary literature, both through accounts of individuals’ backgrounds and achievements, and through the emphasis placed on education in missionary work. While it might have seldom been explicitly claimed as Scottish, both its importance and the manner in which it should be delivered seem to have been taken for granted from the outset. Scottish missionaries, in general, appear to have established educational institutions with great self-confidence, to have made innovations in educational practice both in India and Africa and to have assertively promoted these. If this process of educational institution building was an outgrowth of educational developments at home, it in turn reflected back to those at home shared values and a sense of achievement in this field.

By contrast with religious and educational institutions, medical work tended to be referred to in terms of the superiority of European, not Scottish, medicine over native systems, though some medical missionaries were keen students of local medical practices and remedies. Despite Scotland’s well-developed capacity for producing doctors in the 19th century, and in particular Edinburgh’s pre-eminence in this field, this was seldom emphasised. In general, however, it was taken for granted that new institutions should be developed on the same lines as institutions at home, and staffed by qualified personnel who would be representative of the best products of the Scottish education system. Such institution building on a Scottish model again reaffirmed a sense of national identity, embodied both in the symbolic reproduction of the homeland through a variety of religious, educational, and medical practices and institutional forms, and in the construction of real institutions through which other peoples might learn to imitate life at home.

⁶⁵ *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 7, July 1898, p 59.

Creation of a Scottish missionary tradition, and claims of leadership

Within the range of missionary literature examined, it was in the biographies of missionaries that Scottish identity was most explicitly foregrounded, and in which claims of Scottish or national achievements were most likely to be made. As noted in chapter five, this genre was a later development than the pamphlet and periodical literature, since it was dependent among other things on a long enough duration for individuals with careers of sufficient note to emerge. Biographies of leading missionaries often both romanticised their lives and claimed the establishment of their missions as a great national achievement. This was done in a number of ways: by situating individuals in the context of a Scottish family background, upbringing and education; by situating them within Scottish religious traditions and history; and by designating certain characteristics as typically Scottish. A pioneering or leadership role was frequently claimed for or credited to Scots, and their achievements were seen to add to the 'fair name of Scotland'.⁶⁷

Accounts of childhood and youth often emphasised the Scottish context, whether through mention of family antecedents, church history, or landscape and environment. The spirit of John Philip 'was soon entranced with triumph in their memory' on reaching 'a Hill Grave of a Covenanter, or a Glen where the Covenanters had worshipped and communed at midnight'.⁶⁸ Livingstone himself gave an account of his Highland background, his pious upbringing, and dedication to educating himself, replete with references to his ancestry, the Scottish kirk, Scott, Burns, and the virtues of the 'Scottish poor'.⁶⁹ Robert Moffat's birthplace in East Lothian was close by 'the Hall, with its great yew-tree, one of the finest in Scotland, so closely bound up with the memory of John Knox and of Wishart'.⁷⁰ Duff is quoted describing the Perthshire landscape of his childhood, and its historical associations of Killiecrankie and Claverhouse, the scourge of 'Scotland's true worthies, the heroes

⁶⁶ Robertson, *Martyrs of Blantyre*, p 48.

⁶⁷ James Johnston, *Dr Laws of Livingstonia*, London, Partridge and Co, 1909, p 149.

⁶⁸ Robert Philip, *The Elijah of South Africa, or the Character and Spirit of the late Rev John Philip, DD*, London, John Snow, 1851, p 41.

⁶⁹ David Livingstone, *Travels and Researches in South Africa*, Philadelphia, J W Bradley, 1858, (first published 1857).

⁷⁰ John S Moffat, *The Lives of Robert and Mary Moffat*, London, T Fisher Unwin, Third Edition, 1885, p vi.

of the Covenant'.⁷¹ James Stewart was born near Edinburgh Castle and Princes Street 'one of the fairest spots on earth'. Such surroundings 'fostered both his piety and his patriotism, and also helped to develop that keen sense of natural beauty which distinguished him through life'.⁷² Mary Slessor and her family were members of the Wishart Church in Dundee, near the place where George Wishart preached during the plague of 1544.⁷³

Missionaries or their families might be described as 'true' or typical Scots. The early missionaries in India, such as Stevenson, Nesbit and Wilson, distinguished for their scholarship and linguistic skills, were 'Scotsmen' who 'were men of mark'.⁷⁴ Mrs Sutherland's husband's father was 'a true Scotchman, of vigorous intellect, delighted to exercise his mind on matters of theological or church interest', and for many years a church elder.⁷⁵ The so-called 'Martyrs of Blantyre', Henry Henderson, John Bowie and Robert Cleland 'were all Scotchmen. They were all sons of the University of Edinburgh', and 'men of the Livingstone type'.⁷⁶ Dr Laws, 'the personal embodiment of the characteristic qualities of the natives of the Granite City', was described as 'a canny Scot, keen in perception, shrewd in judgment, free from demonstrative enthusiasm, but with immense powers of perseverance'.⁷⁷ Slessor was also held to typify a Scottish nature:

a type of nature peculiarly characteristic of Scotland, the result of its godly motherhood, the severe discipline of its social conditions, its stern toil, its warm church life, its missionary enthusiasm.⁷⁸

Her friend Charles Ovens, 'was an experienced tradesman of the fine old type, a Scot of Scots, with the happy knack of looking on the bright side of things',⁷⁹ and fond of singing 'auld Scots sangs'.⁸⁰

⁷¹ George Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, p 5.

⁷² James Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale: the Life of James Stewart*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1908, p 3.

⁷³ W P Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar, Pioneer Missionary*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, Fifth Edition, 1916.

⁷⁴ Murray Mitchell, *In Western India*, p 50.

⁷⁵ Waddel, *Memorial of Mrs Sutherland*, p 46.

⁷⁶ Robertson, *Martyrs of Blantyre*, p 15.

⁷⁷ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 52.

⁷⁸ Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar*, p 20.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p 90.

⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, p 91.

In such accounts people were located, both by their own writings and by others, within a Scottish context, particularly that of the history of Presbyterianism, though a sense of attachment to places was also often present. Some biographers conferred a heroic stature on their subjects, allying them with the historical martyrs of the Reformation or explicitly describing them as martyrs. Some writers emphasised historical antecedents more than others, but the sense of missionaries fulfilling the aims of the reformed church was often present. Smith stated this most explicitly, casting the development of Scottish missions as an inheritance of the tradition of Knox: ‘in 1560, John Knox had pledged the Reformed Kirk to “preche the glaid tydingis of the Kyngdome through the haill world”’.⁸¹ To this was added the authority of Thomas Chalmers, who in 1812 and 1814 preached and published sermons advocating ‘the duty and the principles of the propagation of the Gospel by Bible and Missionary agencies’.⁸² The missionary work of the Scottish churches represented the flourishing of Knox’s seed:

The little seed sown by John Knox in our Lord’s words[...] which the Scottish Parliament of 1560 adopted as the motto of the first Confession, germinated in the preaching of Chalmers, sprouted in the scheme of Inglis, and shot up into vigorous life in the work of Duff.⁸³

At home, the work of the EMMS was similarly grounded in Scottish religious traditions. Ultimately the cause of medical missions could trace its genealogy back to St Columba, ‘the laborious and much honoured apostle of the ancient Scots and Picts’, who was ‘resorted to for aid and advice, as a physician of both soul and body’.⁸⁴ The society’s religious aims were further dignified by its use of the Magdalen Chapel, owned by the Protestant Institute of Scotland, in which John Knox was said to have preached,⁸⁵ and in which ‘the light of Divine truth radiated when

⁸¹ Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, p 5.

⁸² Ibid. p 5

⁸³ Ibid. p 6.

⁸⁴ John Coldstream, ‘Historical Sketch of the Employment of the Art of Healing in Connection with the Spread of the Gospel’ in *Addresses to Medical Students, 1855-56*, p171.

⁸⁵ H F Lechmere Taylor, ‘A Century of Service 1841-1941’, *Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, EMMS, 1941*, p 7.

Scotland separated from Rome; and here, in 1578, the first General Assembly of the Church of Scotland was held'.⁸⁶

Not only were missionaries situated within Scottish religious traditions, over time as missionary activity expanded they were situated within the missionary heritage itself. After his death, Livingstone became the touchstone for missionary inspiration and comparison. For example, Mrs Sutherland, though she 'would have deprecated such a comparison' is spoken of as "the servant girl who became a missionary" as 'Dr Livingstone is sometimes spoken of as "the weaver boy who became a missionary"'.⁸⁷ James Stewart, too, was inspired by Livingstone, whose 'many-sidedness had amazed him'.⁸⁸ And though missionaries were inspired by others that went before them, Livingstone occupied a special place: 'No doubt it was Moffat rather than Livingstone who first infused the interest and fascination of Africa into the youthful mind of Robert Laws', but Livingstone must have deepened it.⁸⁹ For Robert Cleland, Church of Scotland missionary in Blantyre, Livingstone was his 'great ideal'.⁹⁰ Slessor was both compared to Livingstone and said to have been motivated to take up the call by his death. 'She carried a book with her to the mill, and, like David Livingstone at Blantyre, laid it on the loom and glanced at it in her free moments'.⁹¹ The news of Livingstone's death 'stirred the land' and 'thrilled Mary Slessor into action'.⁹² Livingstone's death was an inspiration to work at home as well as abroad, providing a 'psychological moment' seized upon by the EMMS to raise funds to extend their premises, and to raise a memorial 'to the great Scotsman who stood forth as the very embodiment of the medical missionary spirit'.⁹³ Moffat, Livingstone's father-in-law, laid the foundation stone of the new institute, to be named after Livingstone, hence consolidating the connection to a tradition of the missionary achievements of Scots.

⁸⁶ John Lowe, *Jubilee Memorial: Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society*, 1892, p 21.

⁸⁷ Waddel, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland*, p 11.

⁸⁸ Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, p 21.

⁸⁹ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*.

⁹⁰ Robertson, *Martyrs of Blantyre*, p 110.

⁹¹ Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar*, p 4.

⁹² *Ibid.*, p 17.

⁹³ Lechmere Taylor, *'A Century of Service 1841-1941'*.

The inspiration to missionary activity in Central Africa was to lead in particular to claims of great achievements, though work elsewhere also led to claims of Scots leadership and achievements. For example, Duff was said to have had extensive influence, through stirring up ‘other Churches in England and Ireland’ and through his influence spreading to America:

He created such a missionary spirit that many of the ablest students, probationers, and even ministers, in Scotland and other countries, went out to several of the foreign fields, as well as to India.⁹⁴

Claims of Scottish leadership were also made by William Miller, who exhorted women in Scotland not to let this slip from their grasp, and to increase their support for female education in India. Free Church of Scotland missions had the ‘foremost place’ and were the ‘formative influence [.....] in all female education in Southern India’.⁹⁵ Similarly, the work of Scottish women missionaries was held up as an example which had inspired others. An ‘eminent American preacher’ was inspired by ‘the “Scotch lasses”’, with ‘Their manifest happiness in their work, their energy, their well-developed powers, and their great usefulness’.⁹⁶ Though 18th century Danish missions had included girls in their schools, early initiatives such as the work of Margaret Wilson in Bombay in 1829 were ‘in every sense pioneer work’.⁹⁷ A second phase of development of missionary work with women, that of zenana visiting (first mooted by a Church of Scotland missionary, Dr Thomas Smith in 1840),⁹⁸ was also pioneered by Scots, being ‘inaugurated in Calcutta by the Scottish Mission’.⁹⁹ This ‘new opening for women’s work’ was reported back to the Church of Scotland General Assembly at home in 1868 as ‘like the discovery of a new continent’.¹⁰⁰ The development of teacher training also owed much to Scots missionaries, as a United Free Church missionary, Miss Whyte, ‘may be rightly considered the pioneer of efficient training for teachers in Bengal’.¹⁰¹

⁹⁴ Smith, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, p 7.

⁹⁵ Lecture by William Miller to Ladies Society of the Free Church of Scotland, 1878, p 24.

⁹⁶ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 6, 1901, p 250.

⁹⁷ Minna G Cowan, *The Education of the Women of India*, Edinburgh and London, Oliphant, Anderson and Ferrier, 1912, p 35.

⁹⁸ Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, p 75.

⁹⁹ Cowan, *Education of Women in India*, p 37.

¹⁰⁰ Hewat, *Vision and Achievement*, p 75.

Though such claims of Scottish leadership are made in a number of contexts, as indicated above, the development of Scottish missions in Central Africa fostered the most explicit claims for national achievement, sometimes situated in the context of Scotland's history of colonial enterprise. It was thus seen to redeem the failure of Darien:

In 1874 Dr Duff and James Stevenson [...] launched the Livingstonia Mission, the greatest national enterprise, it has been truly said, since Scotland sent forth the very different Darien expedition.¹⁰²

This claim was both repeated and elaborated upon in a later biography of Laws. Scots had taken part 'with patriotic pride and high hopes' in the 'Darien Expedition', which aimed to 'set up a colonial empire', and 'the bitter ignominy and shame of its failure still haunted the national memory'. The Livingstonia expedition was, however, 'a more noble undertaking, [...] more in line with the higher genius of the people', since it was 'an effort, not to secure dividends, but to realize the life-aims of Livingstone', namely opening up Africa and freeing people from bondage, and to this enterprise 'all Christian Scotland rallied', with subscriptions coming in 'from every class and quarter, from city merchant prince and Highland crofter'.¹⁰³ Redemption was thus to be achieved not simply through the success of the enterprise, but through its morally superior motivation. Importantly it also served to unite the nation.

Missionaries, such as Laws, were said to have made 'heathenism' give 'place to Christianity' and 'barbarism to civilisation' in Central Africa, thus adding 'fresh obligations to the fair name of Scotland, - a land which justly wears the crown in missionary enterprise'.¹⁰⁴ Furthermore, the Livingstonia mission was a 'torchbearer' and was 'the leader of three kindred missions - Scottish, English and German', whose 'united efforts have made possible the huge British Central African Protectorate and Rhodesia'.¹⁰⁵ Though missionaries had no thought of empire

¹⁰¹ Cowan, *Education of Women in India*, p 119.

¹⁰² Smith, *Life of Duff*, p 337.

¹⁰³ W P Livingstone, *Laws of Livingstonia: A Narrative of Missionary Adventure and Achievement*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1921, p 9.

¹⁰⁴ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 149.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, p 44.

building, their work led to the annexing of Nyasaland to the British dominions ‘without one drop of native blood being shed’. Despite the emphasis on moral objectives, and denial of interest in imperial ambition, arch-imperialist Cecil Rhodes was quoted as acknowledging ‘We owe all that land to you Scotchmen’.¹⁰⁶

Another context in which a Scottish leadership or pioneering role was claimed was that of the establishment of the London Missionary Society. Scotland had provided not only the most famous of its missionaries, Moffat and Livingstone, but Scots had helped to found it. Thus, the Presbyterian minister, Dr Love, founder and one of the LMS’s first secretaries, ‘sought the concurrence of Scotland especially, because he looked to it for missionaries of “more regular education” and “more solid and durable piety” than had yet been found in England’, (though at the same time Carey is acknowledged as ‘the greatest missionary since Paul’).¹⁰⁷ And LMS missionaries, Moffat and Livingstone, were honoured in their homeland, where Livingstone’s statue ‘stands in Edinburgh, as Moffat’s memorial obelisk is in Ormiston’. As elsewhere Livingstone’s influence was judged to have been profound and to have had an international impact. Livingstone’s death:

gave an impulse to Christendom which [.....] has resulted in the opening up of inner Africa to the gospel and to science, by the Scottish, English and American Churches, by the Geographical Societies of Europe, and the philanthropic zeal of Henry Stanley.¹⁰⁸

Thus, both the claims made for Livingstone and the positioning of ‘Scottish’ reinforced the assertion of Scottish leadership within an international context.

As noted, Scottish identity was much more explicitly foregrounded in biographical accounts of missionaries’ lives than in missionary periodicals, and the process of the creation of a tradition, of iconic figures, and of myths, is much more evident. Typically the subjects of missionary biographies were situated within the historical traditions of the Scottish kirk, whether through the associations of birthplace or family background, or through their fidelity to the spirit of the Reformation in their

¹⁰⁶ Ibid., p 157.

¹⁰⁷ George Smith, *Short History of Christian Missions*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1904, p 170.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p 173.

life's work and achievements. They were sometimes designated as typical or true Scots, which might mean a variety of things, not always clearly articulated, but which often suggested discipline, perseverance, and strong religious faith. The creation of a Scottish missionary tradition was also evident in these writings, with individuals being inspired by the generation of missionary pioneers, and with Livingstone subsequently being invariably named as an influence and inspiration. While there were a few biographies or memoirs published prior to the 1870s, it was after Livingstone's death and the publication of his biography that this genre really began to develop, and many subsequent lives of missionaries were cast in a mould that reflected Livingstone's inspiration. By the turn of the century claims of Scottish leadership in missionary enterprise were being advanced in a number of contexts, whether educational institution building in India, work with women, or in civilising and christianising Central Africa. This latter sphere of action in particular was deemed to be a national cause and a national success, as well as contributing to the expansion of the empire, though missionaries themselves were absolved of imperial or colonial ambitions. While biographies of missionaries often presented an idealised picture of their subjects' characters and lives, the achievements attributed to them legitimated the activity and aims of missionaries, and situated these centrally within a Scottish national tradition.

The assertive claiming of Scottish national identity that is evident in many of the late 19th and early 20th century biographies seems to have been conditioned by a number of factors. As noted above the publicity machine of biographical writing required the life experience and careers of sufficient numbers of missionaries to provide material for it. The movement had developed to a point where it could furnish such subjects, but at the same time churches and missionary supporters required mechanisms for the stimulation of interest and finance to facilitate further growth. The creation of the idealised missionary figure helped both with recruitment and fund-raising. It seems likely, too, that it is here that evidence of inter-denominational rivalry can be seen to be at work. As has been indicated above, explicit references to such rivalry are rare in the context of missionary writings, where the desire for co-operation is usually explicitly expressed. Yet it is apparent that both the Free Church and the United

Presbyterian Church prosecuted missionary activity more effectively than the Church of Scotland and publicised it much more effectively.¹⁰⁹ In particular biographies of Free Church missionaries projected a Scottish identity, and this can be interpreted as a projection of its claim to be the true Scottish church. In this context Livingstone could be appropriated as inspiration by all the main denominations, because he belonged to none,¹¹⁰ but denominations could still assert rival claims as to who were the true heirs. In particular, this was effected in the Free Church through an institutional publishing strategy employing professional writers. The construction of missionaries as heirs to a religious tradition and as nationally representative figures thus moved beyond how missionaries represented themselves, though it used the discourses they employed and the accounts they provided of their lives and work as a basis for this. Furthermore, it seems likely that a desire to project the idea of Scottish leadership in the missionary enterprise, also apparent in some of the biographies, was aimed at an audience outside Scotland as well as inside it, since such biographies had a wider audience in Britain and other English speaking countries. This would also have been consistent with the growth of nationalist demands at home in the same period.

‘National’ names and national identity

As indicated in a previous chapter, within the context of empire claims of kinship or community with other Europeans were frequently made, when contrasts were being made with indigenous peoples, and such claims of ‘Europeanness’ appear to have been at least as frequent within missionary literature as references to ‘national’ names. Such ‘national’ names did appear, however, in a variety of forms. So far instances in which Scottish identity was explicitly foregrounded, or in which there was implicit evidence of this, have been discussed. However, such representations of Scottishness, prominent though they sometimes were, occurred alongside other markers of identity, both those discussed in previous chapters, and those terms which

¹⁰⁹ For a discussion of this, see Dow, *Domestic Response and Reaction to the Foreign Missionary enterprises of the principal Scottish Presbyterian Churches, 1873-1929*, Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1977.

¹¹⁰ John M MacKenzie, ‘David Livingstone: the construction of the myth’ in Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds), *Sermons and battle hymns: Protestant culture in modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990, p 31.

might be regarded as ‘national’ names. Usages of such ‘national’ names were indicative of how Scots saw themselves within the context of the British state and empire, and how they saw themselves in relation to England and to English people, though these usages do not always admit of a straightforward interpretation.

The use of the terminology of ‘national’ names was dominated by three sets of terms, as might be expected: Scotland, Scotch, Scotchmen, Scots, Scottish; England, English, Englishman; Britain, British. In the previous sections of this chapter, representations of Scotland have been the focus, and therefore the first set of terms have predominated, though there have been occasional usages of ‘English’ and ‘British’ in the literature quoted. This section will ask how these and related terms were used, and how prominent they were. It is also important to point out that a number of other related terms were used as markers of national identity, but as they occurred very rarely in the literature examined they will be noted only rather than discussed. These terms are: Indo-Britons, Anglo-Indians, Anglo-Saxon, Celt, Sassenach, Briton, and United Kingdom. A further term employed on a number of occasions is ‘country-man’, which sometimes appeared clearly to function as ‘Scottish’, sometimes as ‘British’ and sometimes was ambiguous.

Just as Scotland or Scots were occasionally directly named in appeals and exhortations, other ‘national’ groups might be similarly addressed. For example, ‘British Christians’ should acknowledge the field marked out for them by the power of ‘Christian and Protestant Britain’.¹¹¹ ‘British females owe their blood-bought liberties, their social happiness, their peaceful homes’ to ‘the elevating spirit of the Gospel’, while ‘the powerful arm of British interference’ rescued widows from immolation on the funeral pyre.¹¹² ‘British Christians are only half-informed of the condition of India’s daughters, and less than half-awake to the urgency of their claims’.¹¹³ ‘[E]very Christian English lady in India’ was asked to devote ‘only one hour-a-week to the establishment and superintendence of a female school in her

¹¹¹ Scottish Ladies’ Association AGM, 1844, p 14.

¹¹² Ibid., p 24.

¹¹³ *The Eastern Female’s Friend*, No 1, January, 1857.

vicinity, whether in the city Zenana or in the village hut'.¹¹⁴ Furthermore, 'the action of English ladies might be made more aggressively benevolent' by petitioning parliament on questions of marriage reform in India.¹¹⁵ Help would be more forthcoming 'If our British sisters could realise their highly privileged position in this Christian land',¹¹⁶ as they would be more generous in their contributions. They may also be inspired to find fit work from God, by the example of Queen Victoria, made fit by God 'for her work as sovereign of the British Empire'.¹¹⁷ 'British Christians' were, however, sometimes separately named: 'the view taken with virtual unanimity by the Christians of England and Scotland' on the South African war was that the fighting must go on till sovereignty was acknowledged.¹¹⁸

If 'British' was used relatively frequently in conjunction with 'Christians' it was more likely to be applied to the sphere of British imperial administration, as the following examples illustrate. Alexander Duff pronounced that '*not a single seminary for females existed in all India*, till British benevolence interposed to rescue that fair region from so foul a reproach',¹¹⁹ although non-state actors such as 'British philanthropists' had played a prominent role in the suppression of the 'revolting practice' of female infanticide.¹²⁰ The 'British government' was praised for 'wiping away the law' on inheritance, that had posed an obstacle to conversion to Christianity, 'a great triumph in connection with the conquest of British India'.¹²¹ With respect to the position of emancipated slaves in Jamaica, it was asked what were 'Britain's rights' to compel the service of Africans.¹²² Representatives of the imperial state were also likely to be designated as 'British': Sir Henry Havelock, the 'saviour' of Lucknow, and 'missionary soldier', performed 'the noblest deed that ever God put into the power of a British soldier to do'.¹²³

¹¹⁴ Address by George Smith to the Free Church Ladies' Society, 1864, p 23.

¹¹⁵ Ibid., p 25.

¹¹⁶ *News of Female Missions*, New Series No 9, September, 1898, p 66.

¹¹⁷ *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 11, November, 1898, p 82.

¹¹⁸ *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 10, 1901, p 475.

¹¹⁹ Address by Alexander Duff to Scottish Ladies' Association AGM, 1839, p 10.

¹²⁰ Ibid., p 17.

¹²¹ Alexander Duff, *Home Organization for Foreign Missions*, 1850, p 43.

¹²² *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, Vol XII, November 1857, p 190.

¹²³ *Free Church of Scotland Quarterly Missionary Paper*, No XVIII, June, 1862, p 2-3.

In response to the Indian Mutiny of 1857, a religious, political and ‘national’ terminology was employed. The Mutiny was a reproach from God: ‘in the righteous judgment of God for our national guilt, our own mothers and daughters exiled there have become the victims, and Britain’s heart has been deeply moved’.¹²⁴ It was ‘Britain’ that had brought benefits to India through ending social evils, but the Mutiny was also a sign that ‘Britain’ has shown ‘sinful pride in colonial wealth’.¹²⁵ Miss Bruce, of Newcastle, called for renewed efforts ‘As a *holy revenge* for the horrid barbarities perpetrated on our British ladies.’¹²⁶ The reassertion of British power represented ‘God’s wonderful providence’, seen to have been at work in ‘committing the destinies of India to Christian England’.¹²⁷

At the turn of the century, repeating the claim of the ‘pioneering’ role of Scots in Nyasaland made in biographies, Smith averred that the Livingstonia mission ‘made the British Protectorate or colony at once desirable and possible’, and as a consequence ‘for the first time, in 1896, [...] not a slave can be made in British Central Africa any more than in other British territories’.¹²⁸ It was a matter for celebration that:

Nyasaland has become British Central Africa, and now from the Zambezi to Tanganyika the flag of Britain waves over the land in the midst of which the heart of Livingstone is buried’.¹²⁹

Though this government protection was welcome, missionaries went with the intention of ‘founding and building up in the territory of a native chief a Christian Church, not a British colony’.¹³⁰ Though careful to distance themselves from temporal power and imperial ambition, missionaries criticised Lord Kitchener for violating the principles of ‘British rule’ by prohibiting them from Khartoum.¹³¹ Recounting an instance of missionary intervention on behalf of Africans, resulting in a legal ruling against white settlers, Rev Donald Fraser of Livingstonia commented

¹²⁴ *Fly Leaves*, No III, January 1858, p 2.

¹²⁵ *Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, Vol XII, November 1857, p 188.

¹²⁶ *The Eastern Female’s Friend*, No V, January 1858, p 21.

¹²⁷ Rev Edward Craig Stuart, *A Plea for Zenana Missions, a sermon preached at St Thomas’s English Episcopal Chapel, Edinburgh*, October, 1865, p 21.

¹²⁸ George Smith, *Short History of Missions*, p 200.

¹²⁹ Robertson, *Martyrs of Blantyre*, p 34.

¹³⁰ *Ibid.*, p 45.

that the trial reassured ‘the natives that the British Government is there for their protection, and that the whiteness of a criminal’s skin will not save him from punishment’.¹³² Slessor, in her turn, described the government officials with whom she had contact as ‘the strength and glory of Britain’.¹³³

In general, uses of ‘England’ and ‘English’ can be distinguished from uses of ‘Britain’ or ‘British’. Duff’s proposals on education were advanced at a propitious time, ‘with English society prepared, with English education and Western thought arousing the sleepy Asiatic’.¹³⁴ Though Smith consistently emphasised Duff’s Scottish background, and the Scottish traditions on which he drew he on occasion bracketed Duff together with English people or people of English origin: ‘Like most Anglo-Indians and Englishmen who have lived very much abroad, he looked at affairs as they affected not the domestic politics of Great Britain [...] but the welfare of the great peoples of East and West’.¹³⁵ When Duff died, however, ‘It was felt that not only Scotland had lost its noblest son, but the Reformation lands had seen taken from them the greatest missionary in Christ’.¹³⁶ And in his memory in his birthplace of Moulin, a ‘national’ monument was erected.¹³⁷ It was noted that Livingstone’s appeal to take up the work of ‘commerce and Christianity’, though made at ‘an English university’ was to his ‘fellow-countrymen generally’, the implication here being that this included both Scots and English.¹³⁸

The term ‘English’ was also applied to culture in the broad sense, implying a particular mode of thinking or civilisation. Missionary work with women in India required the ‘vigour of the English mind’.¹³⁹ As well as cultural or mental qualities, ‘English’ is also used of civilisation. Describing missionary work with emancipated slaves in Jamaica, George Robson wrote:

¹³¹ *The Missionary Record of the United Presbyterian Church*, No 12, December, 1899, p 351.

¹³² *Missionary Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, Issue No 4, 1901, p 158.

¹³³ Livingstone, *Mary Slessor of Calabar*, p 290.

¹³⁴ George Smith, *Christianity in India: its progress considered with reference to the Scotch system of missionary operations and to female education*, Edinburgh, John Maclaren, 1864, p 14.

¹³⁵ Smith, *Life of Duff*, p 365.

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*, p 375.

¹³⁷ *Ibid.*, p 378.

¹³⁸ Johnston, *Laws of Livingstonia*, p 23.

¹³⁹ Stuart, *Plea for Zenana Missions*, p 15.

Taking them in the mass, they were simply a pagan people, whose contact with English civilisation had been of a kind which taught them nothing but its vices and its hypocrisies.¹⁴⁰

Similarly, cultural practice might be designated ‘English’, such as ‘English manners and customs’, contact with which might stimulate changes in attitudes in India to the education of women and girls.¹⁴¹ Or a mode of dress, as in Miss Drummond’s description of girls in Calcutta wearing ‘crimson and dark-blue blouses, with lace at the sleeves and neck, English fashion’.¹⁴²

References to ‘English’ society, culture, or cultural practices, were not exclusive of Scots as participants in this society and culture, while making distinctions signified the respective contributions in a joint enterprise. Thus, generally speaking, there was little sense of tension between ‘English’ and ‘Scottish’ in these discourses. Sometimes, however, a sense of national rivalry was utilised to urge a particular course of action. Duff argued that ‘Scotch’ regiments in India should be furnished with chaplains to the same extent as English regiments, as ‘The proportion of English to Scotch chaplains is already *more than ten to one!*’, a position judged to be neither fair nor reasonable: ‘In *rigid justice* the numbers of Scotch chaplains ought at once to be *doubled or trebled*’.¹⁴³ One instance within a missionary periodical which explicitly discussed the use of ‘national’ names was an article on the South African ‘Scotch’ cart, occasioned by the need of a missionary for this type of cart.¹⁴⁴ This was declared to have no resemblance to anything found in Scotland, but if it had to be referred to it should be as either ‘Scottish’ or ‘British’. This echoed contemporary secular debates on the use of ‘Scotch’, and the sensitivity to differences between the terms ‘Scotch’, ‘Scots’, ‘English’ and ‘British’.¹⁴⁵

¹⁴⁰ Robson, *Missions of the United Presbyterian Church*, p 44.

¹⁴¹ Stuart, *Plea for Zenana Missions*, p 9.

¹⁴² *News of Female Missions*, New Series, No 62, February, 1903, p 14.

¹⁴³ Duff, *Bombay in April 1840*.

¹⁴⁴ *The Foreign Mission Chronicle of the Episcopal Church in Scotland*, New Series, Vol XV, No 4, October, 1914.

¹⁴⁵ See, for example, speeches by Lord Rosebery, in *The Policy of the Liberal League as expressed in Lord Rosebery’s speeches*, London, Liberal League Publications, 1904; *Annual Report of St Andrew’s Society*, Glasgow, 1915.

As shown above a variety of terms were used in designating collectivities within a British and imperial context, but by far the most common in addition to 'Scotland', 'Scots' and related terms, were 'British' and 'English', and closely related terms. Like 'Scots' and related terms, these were used for rhetorical purposes to address or appeal to groups of people, and varied with context, though all might occur in the same text or speech. In this literature Scots are *always* being addressed, but they are not always named, and they are not always addressed exclusively. Appeals made to a wider 'British' collectivity imply a common cause and common interest, and, in the specific context in which they are made, a shared identity. 'British' was more commonly used than 'English' as a designation of collectivities, while the term 'Britons' was hardly ever used.

The previous sections in this chapter indicate the variety of ways in which Scottish identity was expressed. Not only was the terminology of 'Scotland', 'Scottish', etc, much more frequently used than either that of 'British' and 'English', such markers of identity were also applied to a much wider range of phenomena, than either 'British' and 'English' and related terms either separately or taken together. As illustrated in the foregoing sections, the set of terms and expressions relating to Scotland were variously used to designate the following: landscape, place, the homeland (both with a connotation of emotional attachment and as physical location); as a physical description e.g. 'Scotch church'; as a description of social and cultural phenomena, and institutions e.g. church, education, language, history, tradition; groups of people, or individuals; a people, nation, or nationality. 'British' was used to refer to or appeal to groups of people or individuals; and it was used to refer to the empire, government and other descriptions or concepts related to political or state power, such as 'rule' or 'colony', or power symbolised by the 'flag of Britain'. 'English' was similarly used to refer or appeal to groups of people or individuals; sometimes to location, such as an 'English University'; and to language, mind and manners, which may be described in general as cultural phenomena. The use of English to describe 'civilisation' quoted above was unique in the literature examined, but is consistent with the connotation of culture. In fact, 'European' was commonly used to describe civilisation.

The frequency and range of expressions of markers of Scottish identity suggests that this identity had primacy over others in these discourses, but at the same time depending on audiences, British and English identities were also expressed, on the one hand to express a shared purpose, especially as Christians, or on the other to express their location as participants in an imperial state, or a shared culture exemplified particularly by the English language. Although a Scottish identity was privileged in these discourses, identity was constantly being negotiated between nation, state, and culture, in different contexts. Over time, there was a shifting balance in these negotiations. Rhetorical appeals to British or English Christians were more characteristic of the earlier period of the 1840s and 1850s, and these terms seem to have been used interchangeably. While the Indian Mutiny of 1857 provoked a discussion of the nature of British imperial rule, it is subsequent to this that references to the British empire and aspects of its administration, denoted as ‘British’, became much more common, especially by the 1890s. Uses of ‘English’ were more common in relation to education, because of the relationship of this to the English language, especially in the debate about education in India. These differences in patterns of usage over time suggest a growing recognition of Britain as an imperial power, as well as representing the place of missionaries within this. At the same time the expression of a Scottish identity not only retained its privileged position, but became more pronounced. This evidence does not then suggest that for the groups of people producing and consuming this literature their Scottish identity was subsumed under a ‘British’ one. On the contrary, it suggests that a Scottish identity was a strong presence in representations of missionary work and of its organisational support at home.

Conclusion

A Scottish national identity was manifested in these writings in a variety of ways and contexts. It might be manifested in comments made by individuals indicating their links and attachment to Scotland; in comparisons and analogies used to communicate information to readers; in descriptions of missionary work and of the process of building institutions such as schools and churches; in comments made about

denominational affiliations and relations between the churches; in making claims about the nature and achievements of Scottish missionaries; and in positioning individuals or groups in the context of the British people/s, the British state or the British empire. Such representations could also function in different ways. For example, they might form part of a more or less routine descriptive reporting, illustrating personal positioning and attachments, at the same time as establishing a link with readers at home. Such usages were likely to be habitual and routine. A rather different process in which Scottish national identity was manifested was in the naming of places and people with Scottish names or names associated with Scottish history, tradition, and identity, with St Andrew being the classic example. This may be described as the symbolic reproduction of the homeland. It was deliberate, in that it involved conscious acts of naming, and at the same time taken for granted as a normal practice. Institutions built by missionaries replicated those at home, and therefore similarly symbolically reproduced the homeland as well as creating in reality new institutional forms in colonial territories. Though in the creation of educational institutions much emphasis was placed on the English language and educational systems were therefore on occasion described as English, at times an explicitly Scottish system was promoted and defended. As part of this process of institution building there was an expectation that native peoples within these institutions, whether schools, churches, or hospitals, would adopt Scottish cultural practices in place of their own, and to some extent such cultural practices might also encroach on their social life. Again, this was both deliberate, but taken for granted as the purpose of missionary activity.

A somewhat different context in which Scottish national identity was also expressed was that of denominational affiliation. The dominant discourse here was one of co-operation between Protestant denominations in general, and between the Scottish presbyterian churches in particular. At the same time there was an assertion of Scottish identity, or claiming of being grounded in the traditions of the Reformation, which can be interpreted as a sign of rivalry and competition between denominations. The disputes that raged at home, however, seldom surfaced in the pages of missionary periodicals and other missionary literature, and the repeated

references to co-operation, and indeed the evidence of joint work, suggests that in the context of the missionary enterprise a shared presbyterian identity was frequently articulated and that this could in itself be taken as a central aspect of Scottish national identity.

In expressing their Scottish identity in this literature, writers were performing a number of functions: establishing common ground and shared experience and knowledge with the readership; illustrating the projection of Scottishness into imperial territories through missionary activity; claiming a position with respect to Scottish traditions and institutions in order to legitimate their work and actions; and also enlisting support for the missionary cause through such claims. Such expressions of Scottish identity varied in the extent to which they were routine or deliberate and conscious. If references to Scottish identity of a more mundane type were present throughout the period, the more deliberate construction of a Scottish missionary tradition and heroic figures developed along with the missionary enterprise itself, and with imperial expansion. Though missionaries distanced themselves from imperial ambitions, the perceived success of their enterprise provided a vehicle for a strong assertion of Scottish identity and for claims of a specifically Scottish contribution to the empire.

That such a distinctive Scottish contribution might be emphasised was not inconsistent with the expression of similarity or common interest with others, whether European, British, or English. Indeed the usages of 'Britain', 'England', 'Scotland', and related terms, suggest that in a number of contexts similarity to or membership of a wider British collectivity was the primary focus, whereas in others distinctions were drawn to suggest respective contributions of separate English and Scottish collectivities. These varying usages did not suggest in general that these terms were regarded as being in tension, oppositional, or contested, as they became in some secular discourses around the turn of the century. Though markers of Scottish national identity were present among other markers of identity, and were not always strongly emphasised, their persistent presence in a variety of forms indicated the priority of a Scottish national identity for the authors of these texts and by

implication their audience. In essence this literature constituted a dialogue between groups of Scots at home and abroad, in which Scots were always being addressed, sometimes as locally situated or denominationally affiliated, sometimes as a people in general, and sometimes as part of a wider collectivity. Though a 'British', and sometimes 'English', identity was brought into play in specific contexts, this was not privileged over a Scottish identity.

That this literature functioned as a dialogue between particular groups of Scots at particular times meant that it could fulfil different functions for different groups on different occasions. Speeches and pamphlets, for example, frequently aimed to stimulate listeners and readers to action and to drum up immediate support. The periodical literature aimed to stimulate support on a more regular basis through its wide dissemination to members of each of the main denominations. Authorship of this literature was by both missionaries and supporters at home, though editorial control was exercised at home. Biographies were authored at home with the aim of projecting the success and significance of the missionary enterprise, and to inspire support and provide models to which others could aspire, with the promise being offered that such opportunities were potentially open to all. They thus performed a function of moralising and enforcing norms of respectable living, but also claimed to provide models of a true Scottish identity. Such claims might suggest rivalry for claims as to which church was the true Scottish church, but might also function to contest power relations within the British state and empire. While missionaries strove to represent themselves as worthy carriers of a Scottish Christian identity, the editorial control exercised at home over periodicals, and institutional support for the production of biographies, indicate that the messages sent from abroad were appropriated for the purpose of rallying support at home, and for staking claims to the right to represent 'Scottishness'. The making of such claims should be understood in the context of divisions between the churches and social divisions of class, and in the context of the renegotiation of Scotland's role in the British state that characterised Scottish society in the second half of the 19th century. The discourses of national identity discussed above suggest a continuous process of negotiation and construction of identity in this period in which representations of

missionary experience were appropriated by different groups to reinforce particular versions of Scottishness, underpinned by religious, class and political interests. Not only were such representations appropriated by missionary supporters at home, but they were also utilised within the secular sphere to claim a specific Scottish contribution to empire.

Chapter 7: From ‘maniacs’ to the ‘best of its manhood’: the appropriation of the missionary as Scottish empire-builder

Introduction

The previous chapter discussed how Scottish identity was manifested in missionary literature, and argued that this was strongly present in missionary literature, if not always foregrounded. It also argued that this was not seen in general as being in tension or conflict with a British identity, which was on occasion appealed to, but neither was it subsumed under such a British identity. Indeed, in certain representations of Scottish national identity, not only is this identity clearly privileged over others, but also claims of national achievement and leadership are also made within the context of missionary enterprise within the British empire.

Though this chapter aims to look at debates that took place beyond church and missionary circles themselves, it is important to emphasise that in 19th and early 20th century Scotland, levels of church membership were very high. The religious census of 1851 indicated that 25.6 per cent of the Scottish population were church attenders. Levels of church membership continued to increase reaching at peak in 1905 at 50.5 per cent of the population.¹ Circulation figures of missionary periodicals, as discussed in chapter five, suggest a fairly extensive readership, as do the size and number of editions of biographies of missionaries. Thus views of missionary experience and achievement and of colonial peoples were widely disseminated by this means. Furthermore, while periodicals were produced for church members within the different denominations, biographies of missionaries would have had a wider reading public than active supporters of missionary work or subscribers to the periodicals. Since biographies contained narratives of adventure, and accounts of achievements of a scientific or technical kind, as well as religious content, they clearly aimed at a wide reading public, not just in Scotland, but in other English speaking countries. Though some missionaries wrote memoirs, and some biographies were written by friends or family members, most of the biographies of leading missionaries were written by others who were not missionaries themselves, though

¹ Figures quoted by Callum Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1997, p 59 and p 64.

they might be ministers or other leading church figures, such as George Smith and W P Livingstone, who both served as editors of Free Church publications and were professional writers. Thus the biographies of missionaries can themselves be seen as appropriating ideas from the missionary experience and transmitting them to a wider public, both church-going and otherwise. Furthermore, leading figures within secular spheres were likely to themselves be active church members and to be acquainted with church leaders. While newspapers took different attitudes towards the churches and church disputes, with some having clear religious affiliations, such as *The Witness*, even those with a more secular approach might have a positive attitude towards missionary enterprise, which may have been more marked under particular editorial regimes. For example, *The Scotsman* was supportive towards missionaries under the editorship of Alexander Russel, and later maintained a sympathetic position, if biased towards the established church.²

A central argument of this thesis is that the church-based missionary enterprise which developed in 19th century Scotland came to be seen as representing a Scottish contribution to empire in the wider secular sphere, as well as in church circles. In order to provide evidence for this, examples of the profile and representation of missionaries in the secular press were identified. This was done on a highly selective basis in order to underline the argument, and does not represent the whole range and types of coverage of missionary activity. Routine reporting of General Assemblies, of annual general meetings, and of public missionary meetings seems to have occurred from the 1830s, and also in this period debates took place in which missionaries participated, such as those on emancipation of slaves and education in the English language in India. However, a case can be made that wider public debate in the press on the role of the missionary movement itself did not occur until the Indian Mutiny of 1857, and that subsequently coverage demonstrated approval of the missionary enterprise in general, and from the 1870s an active interest in its progress, and ultimately a celebration of its success, with the Blantyre ‘atrocities’ episode, discussed below, being an exception to this positive coverage. The examples of

² Derek Alexander Dow, *Domestic response and reaction to the foreign missionary enterprises of the principal Scottish Presbyterian churches, 1873-1929*, unpublished PhD thesis, Edinburgh University, 1977, p 409. Russel was editor of *The Scotsman* from 1849-1876.

coverage considered here relate to specific episodes and events, and coverage of this nature was not continuous, though meetings and General Assembly debates continued to be routinely reported. That public interest was higher at particular points, beginning with the Indian Mutiny, and subsequently focussing on Livingstone and the mission to Nyasaland, is suggested also by secondary sources, though assessment of the wider range of coverage of the missionary movement would require further research.

The starting point taken here of 1857 is, then, much later than that for previous chapters, which take as their starting point the beginning of the missionary movement in the early decades of the 19th century. That 'missionary intelligence' had already been circulating for some decades and was increasing in volume by this time has been shown in the description of missionary literature. While support for the missionary movement was also growing, it had not yet captured the public imagination. That it did so in the decades subsequent to the 1850s was due to a combination of events abroad and growth of the movement at home. The evidence here is consistent with Neill's view of the importance of 1857 as the beginning of more rapid growth for the Protestant missionary movement as a whole, due, among other things, to the impact of the Indian Mutiny and the publication of Livingstone's *Travels*.³ Drummond and Bulloch take the view that there was little public interest in Scotland in foreign missions before 1870, and indeed the apparent absence of any major public debate between 1857 and the early 1870s is also consistent with this view.⁴ It can be argued that the earlier decades in which information on the missionary enterprise was circulated through missionary societies and the churches provided a knowledge base from which a wider interest could arise in the right circumstances. These circumstances were provided by the strengthening of imperial rule in India following the Mutiny, by imperial expansion and competition in Africa, and by the emergence of a famous and 'heroic' figure whose exploits set in train a new phase of missionary expansion from Scotland.

³ Stephen Neill, *A History of Christian Missions*, Penguin, 1986, p 274-276.

⁴ See Andrew L Drummond and James Bulloch, *The Church in Victorian Scotland, 1843-1874*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1975.

The selection of examples of coverage and debate in the secular press has concentrated on prominent individuals, episodes abroad which excited public interest, and high profile events at home such as public meetings, the World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910, and the Livingstone Centenary of 1913. In keeping with the focus of this thesis on Edinburgh, newspaper coverage focussed on *The Scotsman*, and also drew on a collection of newspaper cuttings that forms part of the Church of Scotland Archive held at the National Library of Scotland.⁵ Though evidence of events in Edinburgh is a primary focus here, in general the kind of missionary meetings that took place in Edinburgh were also likely to take place in Glasgow and other cities, with the same people travelling from place to place to give speeches. Similarly, Livingstone was honoured both by Glasgow and Edinburgh by being awarded the freedom of the city. The major event which celebrated the centenary of Livingstone's birth in 1913 took place in Edinburgh, an exhibition at the Royal Scottish Museum, though Livingstone had already featured prominently in the Scottish Exhibition of National History, Art and Industry in Glasgow in 1911.⁶

Articles in the *Scottish Geographical Magazine* which made specific references to missionaries in the period 1885-1914 were identified, and indexes of the *Edinburgh Review* and *Blackwoods Magazine* were also consulted. In the latter cases, while imperial themes were occasionally in evidence, a focus on missionary experience as such was not common. In order to identify specific dates, or sufficiently limited ranges of dates, to conduct searches for newspaper articles, a list was compiled of dates of death of leading missionaries, who were likely to have been the subject of obituaries, and also dates of meetings and events were identified through missionary periodicals and biographies. Of coverage of the activities of missionaries abroad, episodes that attracted a wider public debate in this period were: the Indian Mutiny of 1857 and the question of the position of missionaries in India; Livingstone's explorations in Africa and his views on the role of missionaries, also in 1857, and his

⁵ NLS: MS 7906.

⁶ See John M MacKenzie, 'David Livingstone: the construction of the myth' in Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds), *Sermons and battle hymns: Protestant culture in modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990, p 36.

subsequent travels; Livingstone's death and funeral in Westminster Abbey in 1874, and the subsequent launch of the Livingstonia expedition to establish missions in Nyasaland in 1875; the 'Blantyre atrocities' episode at the Church of Scotland mission in Nyasaland; and the lobby for Nyasaland to become a British Protectorate in 1889. Some of these issues, such as public interest in the 'Blantyre atrocities' and the lobby for Protectorate status in Nyasaland were already well documented in secondary sources and these have been drawn on.

Key episodes of public interest in the missionary enterprise

As has been noted elsewhere, 1857 was in many respects a turning point in attitudes towards the missionary enterprise, support for which in Scotland had been growing slowly in the previous twenty years or so. The questions asked at this time in public debates in Scotland, as elsewhere in Britain, about the role of missionaries in helping to provoke the Mutiny, were resolved in favour of support for further missionary expansion. In the same year Livingstone made his dramatic appeal for missionaries to aid Africa along the path of Christianity and commerce, meeting an enthusiastic reception in Scotland, if not immediate action to set up new missions. This period then witnessed the beginning of a wider public debate on and enthusiasm for foreign missions, and it is for this reason that it is taken as a starting point for the examination of coverage in the secular press discussed in this chapter, though as noted routine reporting of General Assemblies and meetings took place prior to this.

While the evidence from missionary literature indicates that interest in missionary work continued to increase in Scotland in the decade subsequent to this, it was not until after Livingstone's death in 1873 that there was a further surge of public interest in the missionary cause. The launch in 1875 of the Livingstonia expedition, jointly supported by the three main Presbyterian churches, and its subsequent progress maintained a high level of public interest. Though the choice of Nyasaland as a site for Scottish missions was in fact fortuitous, as other sites, including Somalia

had been under consideration by the Free Church at this time,⁷ it clearly chimed with the desire to pay homage to Livingstone as a great Scot, and to emulate his example.

This expedition received a great deal of attention in the press. Letters and reports appeared regularly in Scottish newspapers, indicating the progress being made on the journey to Lake Nyasa, and incidents and encounters on the way. As well as appearing in *The Scotsman*, articles appeared in papers such as the *Dundee Courier*, *Glasgow Herald*, *Daily Review*, *Edinburgh Courant*, *Aberdeen Weekly Herald* and *Free Press*, *Wick Gazette*, and also in Christian papers and missionary periodicals.⁸ The general impression conveyed by such newspaper articles is that across Scotland there was an interested readership following these developments, and no doubt wishing for the expedition's success.

Further episodes in the development of the Scottish missions in Nyasaland also excited public interest. The first of these, the so-called 'Blantyre atrocities', came to public attention in 1880.⁹ In 1879 punishments administered by lay missionaries at the Church of Scotland mission at Blantyre in Nyasaland had included the execution of an 'alleged murderer', the flogging of a man for a crime he had not committed, and for a minor offence the flogging of another so severe it resulted in his death. The church authorities were divided over their reaction to this, though the majority view was that the missionaries had acted beyond their jurisdiction. The publication of a pamphlet by Andrew Chirnside, a traveller who had spent some time in the area, brought the matter to public attention. The Church set up a Commission of Inquiry, and the missionary in charge and the two artisans involved were withdrawn, and the mission had to be built up again by Clement Scott, who took charge in 1881. The publicity, with the issue being covered in the *Edinburgh Courant*, seemed to have had the effect of persuading the Church of Scotland to take firm action, but did not seem to have had a lasting negative impact on perceptions of missionaries. As might

⁷ For a detailed account of how the expedition came about, see John McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi 1875-1940: the impact of the Livingstonia Mission in the Northern Province*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1977.

⁸ See MS 7906, NLS, which contains a collection of newspaper cuttings on the Livingstonia mission expedition to Nyasaland.

⁹ For a detailed account of these events see McCracken, *Politics and Christianity*, pp 65-69.

be expected the Church's own promotion of its mission played down this episode, and these difficulties were glossed over, or merely alluded to in passing, as for example, in *The Martyrs of Blantyre*.¹⁰ Certainly, the later claims of Scots leadership and achievement made no reference to these actions.

The growing concern for the position of the Scots missionaries and traders in Nyasaland in the 1880s perhaps helped to obliterate memories of this episode. At any event by the late 1880s an organised lobby was urging the government to intervene to protect its sphere of influence in the light of attacks by Arab slave-traders and encroachments by the Portuguese, who as participants in 'the scramble for Africa' were laying claims to territories in the area surrounding Lake Nyasa. There was a vigorous campaign by missionaries in 1887 and 1888, and by 'their powerful supporters in Britain' for action against the Arabs and Portuguese in the north of Nyasaland. This included a series of public meetings in Aberdeen, Glasgow, Edinburgh and Dundee, and culminated in 'a monster petition signed by over 11,000 ministers and elders of the Scottish churches'.¹¹ Furthermore, this campaign involved joint action between members of the 'Free and Auld Kirks' in a way that had not happened since the Disruption. A number of the meetings were chaired by Balfour of Burleigh, a prominent member of the Church of Scotland, then in Lord Salisbury's cabinet, and he also led the delegation which presented the petition.¹² The subsequent declaration of a Protectorate over part of Nyasaland in 1889 was followed by the establishment of British rule over the whole of Nyasaland in 1891.¹³ The popular evangelical writer, Henry Drummond, was also credited with having contributed to this outcome with the publication of his *Tropical Africa*, and its 'stirring chapters' that could lead him to subsequently claim that in saving Central Africa to Britain, 'England has done her duty'.¹⁴ Indeed such use of the terms 'England' and the 'English government' by Drummond in this context seem likely to

¹⁰ See W Robertson, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, London, James Nisbet, 1892.

¹¹ McCracken, *Politics and Christianity*, p 158; see also Andrew C Ross, 'Scotland and Malawi, 1859-1964' in Stewart J Brown and George Newlands, (eds) *Scottish Christianity in the Modern World*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, pp 283-309.

¹² Ross, 'Scotland and Malawi, 1859-1964' p 289. Lord Balfour of Burleigh was Conservative politician who served as Scottish Secretary from 1895-1903, and was a prominent Church of Scotland member and promoter of presbyterian reunion.

¹³ McCracken, *Politics and Christianity*, p 157

have been deliberately designed to arouse support furth of Scotland, since Drummond was well aware that it was the position of Scottish missionaries that was at stake.¹⁵ Developments in Nyasaland in particular, and in Central Africa in general, remained a focal point for public debates in Scotland, and on occasion for ‘genuinely popular agitations’,¹⁶ involving not only those who supported the missionary enterprise, but also those who were interested in exploration and scientific achievements. The latter, however, also put forward their views on imperial development and the role of government, as is testified by articles in the *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, and other periodicals.

In this period public interest in Africa predominated, and by contrast the continuing expansion of missionary work in India appeared to have a limited public profile, though the work of missionaries in India did, however, receive some public recognition. That the work and achievements of missionaries remained of wide public interest in the early 20th century is testified to by the press coverage of the World Missionary Conference, held in Edinburgh in 1910, and by the Livingstone Centenary celebrations of 1913. As claimed by *The Scotsman* this did indeed represent a change in attitude towards missionaries and the missionary enterprise, and perhaps represented the high point of public enthusiasm.

It is not my intention here to provide a detailed account of the changes in types of coverage of missionaries and their activities, or even to examine coverage of all the episodes alluded to above. The detailed and complex account of missionaries’ impact and influence in Malawi offered by McCracken draws on mission journals, and private papers, as well as public sources, and thus is able to provide insights not available to the public at the time, and it is with public discourses I am concerned here. What such accounts indicate, however, is how a complex and contradictory reality became progressively simplified in the telling, smoothing over dissonances and private criticisms, to present a positive and often self-congratulatory image of

¹⁴ James Young Simpson, *Henry Drummond*, Famous Scots Series, 1901.

¹⁵ See Henry Drummond, *Tropical Africa*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, Fourth edition, completing Twenty-Fifth Thousand, 1891. The popularity of this work is also indicative of the extent of public interest.

¹⁶ See MacKenzie, ‘David Livingstone: the construction of the myth’, p 38.

moral and humane interventions, and one for which there was a ready audience at home.

Changing attitudes and levels of public interest

Popular interest and enthusiasm for the missionary enterprise increased in the late 19th and early 20th centuries and this may be contrasted with the more ambivalent attitudes towards evangelisation of India in the first half of the 19th century. This found expression in debates that took place at the time of the Indian Mutiny, though as Neill has indicated, the Indian Mutiny of 1857 ultimately provoked a reaction of greater enthusiasm for missionary work.¹⁷

In his discussion of the reaction to the Indian Mutiny of the Scottish press in general, Cowan notes that Disraeli's view of the causes of the Mutiny was that 'Hindus did not resent independent missionary enterprise' but they "dreaded the union of missionary enterprise with the political powers of the Government"¹⁸ Though the charge was not made against evangelism as such, the Church press 'responded most briskly', and 'repudiated it as a slander, quoting reports from missionaries and showing small respect for the native susceptibilities which were supposed to have been outraged'.¹⁹ Though some papers, such as *The Scotsman*, urged respect for Indian institutions, they joined in the call for a day of 'national humiliation and prayer' and supported the view that the calamity arose from neglect of the duty to Christianise. Extensive coverage in *The Scotsman* of the 'Day of Solemn Fast, Humiliation and Prayer', (7 October, 1857), and of sermons preached, indicated a degree of agonising about the interpretation of events from a religious perspective, namely whether or not the Mutiny was a punishment for the sins of people in Britain. On the one hand it was averred that 'this attempt to force religion down the throats of the Hindoo and Mussulman inimical to their tastes and prejudices' might have 'taught those in authority that forced prayers are no devotion',²⁰ while, on the other, amongst the evidence of the 'beneficence of our rule' was 'the establishment of

¹⁷ Neill, *A History of Christian Missions*.

¹⁸ R M W Cowan, *The Newspaper in Scotland*, Glasgow, Outram, 1946, p 406.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p 406.

²⁰ Letter to the editor, 'A Tax on the Poor' from 'A Working Man', in *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 6 October, 1857.

schools, and the labours of missionaries’, which showed ‘that Britain is an instrument for good to India in the hand of God’.²¹ Thus, in these views are echoed the evangelical position that Mutiny was a sign of God’s wrath and that errors of the colonial administration had played their part in events, and the criticism that insensitivity to Indian religions and beliefs had been a contributory factor. While views were mixed, it was the demand for enhanced efforts at Christianisation that was to garner more support, since ‘public reaction to the horrors of the struggle was predominantly against the view that India had a culture worthy of being preserved, or that its people had substantial grievances against our commercial, administrative, and religious purposes’.²²

Though Scots missionaries participated in this debate, and contributed accounts of the Mutiny, for example, Alexander Duff’s regular letters to the *Edinburgh Witness*,²³ a specifically Scottish perspective on events in India was not generally apparent. Rather this debate was conducted in terms of ‘British power’, ‘British administration’, the ‘British authorities’, ‘Great Britain’ and the ‘British people’. This was in marked contrast to the discourse of Scottish national identity and achievements that was later prominent in relation to Africa. Subsequently, such ambivalence about Christian evangelisation was not expressed, though from time to time concerns about the low numbers of conversions in India surfaced in church debates. In Africa, it never seems to have been questioned that Christianisation was the right approach. With the launch of the Livingstonia expedition in the mid 1870s Scots’ attempts to put this into practice attracted increasing attention at home. As noted, not all aspects of this experience reflected well on missionaries, but in general these efforts were seen as the special contribution that Scots could make to the mission of civilising others, becoming by the turn of the century a matter of wide public interest.

²¹ Sermon by Rev R W Fraser, St John’s, reported in *The Scotsman*, Saturday, October 10, 1857.

²² Cowan, *The Newspaper in Scotland*, p 407.

²³ See George Smith, *Life of Alexander Duff*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1899. Duff wrote 25 letters published fortnightly in *The Witness*, which were later published as a volume entitled *The Indian Rebellion: its causes and results*.

Coverage in the secular press of missionary meetings and events, and other aspects of missionary experience is indicative of the level of public interest, with accounts of public meetings frequently making reference to the crowded attendance at these. For example, Livingstone's talk at a public breakfast in September 1857, took place at the Royal Hotel, Edinburgh, where 'The large room was uncomfortably crowded'.²⁴ In Queen Street Hall, the same evening, at a further talk by Livingstone, 'Not only the hall but the passages and lobbies were completely crowded'.²⁵ E D Young, leader of the 1875 Livingstonia expedition to Lake Nyasa, addressed a public meeting in Glasgow in 1877, 'crowded by a large and fashionable audience', eager to hear his account of how the missionaries had successfully established themselves by the shores of Lake Nyasa.²⁶ Dr Laws, of the Livingstonia mission, similarly spoke in Glasgow in 1886 at a 'great missionary meeting'.²⁷ This was in the period leading up to the lobby for Protectorate status for Nyasaland.

Livingstone's death and the dramatic story of how his body was brought from the interior of Africa by his African companions, Susi and Chuma, was a matter of great publicity, with the subsequent arrival of Livingstone's body in Southampton, and his funeral in Westminster Abbey in April 1874 also attracting much coverage. *The Scotsman* commented that it had been many years since any service within the Abbey had 'drawn together so vast a concourse'.²⁸ The Lord Provost of Edinburgh and Edinburgh MPs, Duncan McLaren and James Cowan, were in attendance, as were the Provosts of Hamilton and Glasgow. The detailed account of the funeral service concluded, 'David Livingstone now lies among the great and good of his native empire'.²⁹

In Edinburgh in 1878, the funeral of Alexander Duff attracted a large crowd of mourners. As the best known of missionaries in India, and having also spent many years in Scotland, teaching, preaching, and sitting on numerous committees, Duff

²⁴ *The Scotsman*, Thursday, 24 September, 1857.

²⁵ *Ibid.*

²⁶ Cutting dated 5 March, 1877, no title given: MS 7906, NLS.

²⁷ *North Britain*, 1886, cutting in MS 7906, NLS.

²⁸ 'Funeral of Dr Livingstone', *The Scotsman*, Monday, 20 April, 1874.

²⁹ *Ibid.*

was a very well-known figure. A great number of people turned up to witness his funeral procession from the Barclay Church to the Grange Cemetery. 'An immense crowd of respectably-dressed persons assembled in Glengyle Terrace and on Bruntsfield Links to witness the passage of the funeral', and 'the thoroughfare from Argyll Place to the graveyard was lined with an orderly crowd, which respectfully saluted the hearse as it passed'.³⁰

It was not only missionaries and ministers who attended and spoke at missionary meetings and events, but university professors and local dignitaries such as the Lord Provost were also frequently present. Colonial administrators, such as Sir Bartle Frere, addressed meetings in Edinburgh and Glasgow, for example, in early 1874 where Frere spoke on Livingstone's work and travels in Africa.³¹ Similarly, Sir Harry Johnston, the first Commissioner and Consul in Nyasaland, spoke on the occasion of Livingstone's Centenary in 1913.³² Lord Balfour of Burleigh brought a message from the King to the 1910 conference, and he also addressed the 'National' Livingstone Centenary event in London in 1913.

As well as matters directly concerned with the work of missionaries, and imperial developments which affected the position of missionaries, public meetings took place to plan the commemoration or celebration of their achievements, such as the public meeting called in 1874 to discuss the proposed statue of Livingstone in Edinburgh, an occasion which provided opportunities to claim him as a Scottish national hero.³³ The contribution of missionaries was also reflected in the exhibits of the International Exhibition of 1886,³⁴ which was organised by a committee whose membership included the Lord Provosts of Edinburgh and Glasgow, other local dignitaries and leading business men and merchants.³⁵

³⁰ *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 18 February, 1878.

³¹ *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 6 January, 1874, and Friday, 9 January, 1874.

³² *The Scotsman*, Monday, 17 March, 1913; Sir Harry Johnston, 'Introductory remarks, David Livingstone and his work in Africa', in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol XXIX, No V, May, 1913.

³³ 'Proposed statue to Dr Livingstone' in *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 15 April, 1874.

³⁴ Cameron's Guide through the International Exhibition of Industry, Science and Art, Edinburgh, 1886.

The best examples of events demonstrating public interest in the missionary cause are afforded by the World Missionary Conference of 1910, and the Livingstone Centenary of 1913, both attracting much press coverage, and accompanied by large public receptions. The World Missionary Conference, attended by 1200 delegates, 'representing 160 Churches and Evangelical Societies all over the world', was accompanied by a reception hosted by the Lord Provost, the conferring of 14 honorary degrees by the University of Edinburgh, breakfast meetings, exhibitions, women's meetings, and also parallel meetings in Glasgow. The *Scotsman* declared that it was 'a signal honour for Scotland that Edinburgh should have been chosen' as the meeting place for 'the greatest Missionary Conference which has ever been held'.³⁶

Not only did extensive coverage of the conference and its proceedings over a period of approximately three weeks indicate that this event was of wide public interest, but reports of specific conference events demonstrated this also. For example, a reception, hosted by the Lord Provost, magistrates and Town Council at the Royal Scottish Museum, was attended by 5000 people. A 'wonderfully cosmopolitan' gathering, including in its midst a 'few Orientals – Chinese and Indians more particularly' in native dress, was entertained by the playing of 'Scottish national music', including pipes.³⁷ Guests could also enjoy the fine ethnographical collection in the museum, second only to 'the great collection in the British Museum', and which many missionaries, including David Livingstone, had helped to build up. Overall the conference was deemed to have been organised in a manner 'worthy of the best traditions of the Scottish nation', owing to the welcome extended by the Provost, the Church and the University.³⁸

An event of similar public prominence, but which had a wider impact throughout Scotland, was the Livingstone Centenary of 1913. The most significant part of this celebration was the Livingstone Centenary Exhibition held at the Royal Scottish

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 14 June, 1910.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 15 June, 1910.

Museum in Edinburgh, which ran for six months from March 1913. However, church services and other events took place throughout Scotland. For example, a memorial was unveiled at Blantyre; a children's 'demonstration' took place in Glasgow, with a choir of 500 children singing several of Livingstone's favourite hymns; in Aberdeen 2200 members of the Boys' Brigade were addressed by George Adam Smith, Principal of Aberdeen University and the Rev Donald Fraser of Livingstonia; in Glasgow too there was a Boys' Brigade parade; special sermons and 'pulpit references' from a number of churches in Edinburgh were reported; Sunday school children in Cambuslang raised money to fund a 'motor bicycle' for a mission in Nyasaland; there were missionary meetings in Glasgow; Professor Gregory delivered a lecture at Glasgow University (published in the *Scottish Geographical Magazine*); over 1000 children took part in a 'demonstration' in Inverness; further meetings and celebrations were held in Selkirk, Falkirk, Perth, Cupar and Leslie.³⁹ Flags were flown, with the St Andrew's Cross being 'displayed over the main entrance' of Glasgow City Chambers, and the statues of Livingstone in Glasgow and Edinburgh were decorated, with the latter being 'entwined with garlands' and having affixed to it a 'beautiful laurel wreath with a corona of white Easter lilies and asparagus spray, and carrying large bows of purple ribbons'.⁴⁰ A 'National' celebration also took place in London.⁴¹

Lengthy tributes and reports of key events were published. Livingstone's heroic stature was reaffirmed, and his Scots antecedents and character emphasised, and his civilising mission, his humanity, and his ability to 'enter into the lives of the people' were stressed.⁴² A detailed description of the Royal Scottish Museum exhibition appeared in *The Scotsman*, and an account of the civic reception, hosted by the Lord Provost, and attended by 'about 2000 ladies and gentlemen', who were 'representative of mission workers at home and abroad, members of various Presbyteries and Kirk-sessions in Edinburgh, the Edinburgh School Board, and legal and other professional bodies in the city'.⁴³

³⁹ *The Scotsman*, 17 March, 19 March, 20 March, 1913.

⁴⁰ *The Scotsman*, 20 March, 1913.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*

⁴² *The Scotsman*, Saturday, 15 March, 1913.

⁴³ *The Scotsman*, 18 March, 1913.

The size of these events and celebrations is indicative of the growth in support for the missionary enterprise. Indeed this view was stated by *The Scotsman* on the occasion of the World Missionary Conference:

The day is past when men deemed it the right thing to sneer at missions, and designated missionaries in the words of Sidney Smith, as “little detachments of maniacs”. The interest which the World Missionary Conference has aroused is proof of the different atmosphere in which the enterprise of missions now presents itself to thoughtful minds.⁴⁴

This view was shared by church leaders. In the words of the Convener of the United Free Church Foreign Mission Committee: ‘the missionary temperature was rising at home. People were now receiving missionaries with a measure of intelligent welcome and friendly confidence, and with a desire to help’.⁴⁵

This does not mean that there were no dissenting voices or criticisms, muted though these may have been. For example, those at home were criticised for ‘interfering’ with missionary reports ‘to present heathen customs in “lurid colours”’,⁴⁶ a view supported by a former missionary in Singapore, Archibald Lamont, who agreed that ‘references to reports garbled and edited for home consumption are cogent’.⁴⁷ Furthermore, missionaries were seen as having provoked the Boxer Rebellion in China, and secular rather than religious change was seen as the route to civilisation: ‘Trade and commerce and secular education will civilise the beliefs and peoples of the East, as they have civilised the Churches and peoples of the West’.⁴⁸ The voicing of such views was, however, very much the exception, not the rule.

⁴⁴ *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 14 June, 1910. The Rev Sidney Smith (1771-1845) was a regular contributor to the *Edinburgh Review*, and wrote three articles on home and foreign mission work 1808, one of which attacked evangelical missionaries in India, and it is from this article that the quote is taken. The article on ‘Indian Missions’ is reproduced in part as an appendix in Stuart Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries 1789-1858*, The Sutton Courtney Press, 1984.

⁴⁵ *The Scotsman*, Friday, 3 June, 1910.

⁴⁶ *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 1 June, 1910

⁴⁷ *The Scotsman*, Friday, 3 June, 1910.

⁴⁸ *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 1 June, 1910

The civilising mission

It has been argued that public interest in the missionary enterprise increased in the later decades of the 19th century and at the beginning of the 20th century. How then was this enterprise represented in the secular press? The conception of a civilising mission to Africa was the dominant image here, of which Livingstone was both the embodiment and inspiration to action, though the work of missionaries in India and elsewhere was not entirely absent from public discussion.

In the debates at the time of the Mutiny, the achievements of British rule were to have suppressed practices ‘inconsistent with the rights of individuals’⁴⁹ and to abolish ‘crimes against humanity’ such as the ‘immolation of the Hindoo widow on the funeral pile with the dead body of her husband’, and ‘the bloody sacrifices of Juggernaut’.⁵⁰ The role of missionaries and philanthropists in pressing for such changes was well represented in missionary literature, as was the role of Scots missionaries in developing educational institutions, and this was afforded recognition in obituaries of men such as John Wilson and Alexander Duff.⁵¹

That in the latter half of the 19th and the early 20th centuries many links between Scotland and India continued to exist, as did interest in Indian affairs, was attested to by debates in contemporary journals and periodicals, though the profile of missionary endeavours in India outside missionary literature as such tended to be much lower than that of those in Africa. Since in India missionaries followed the establishment of imperial power in the shape of the East India Company, their role was not so much as empire builders as that of civilisers of an empire already acquired, but where reference was made to missionaries and their work in India, it could also be construed as part of the civilising mission, jointly wrought by government, philanthropists and missionaries.

⁴⁹ Sermon by Rev Dr Robert Lee, Greyfriars Church, reported in *The Scotsman*, Thursday, 8 October, 1857.

⁵⁰ Sermon by Rev R W Fraser, St John’s, reported in *The Scotsman*, Saturday, October 10, 1857.

⁵¹ For John Wilson, see *The Scotsman*, Monday, 6 December, 1875, and for Alexander Duff, see *The Scotsman*, February, 1878.

In Africa, however, missionaries sometimes played a different role, moving into areas as yet unoccupied by European powers. For example, Robert Moffat in South Africa settled in territory beyond those previously occupied by white people, Livingstone ‘discovered’ new territories with the potential for settlement, the Scottish missionaries in Nyasaland established themselves there before any claim had been made by the government and later were instrumental in securing this, and Mary Slessor also extended the reach of colonial administration through the establishment of new stations and administering justice on the government’s behalf at the ‘Native’ court.⁵² Although missionaries had already been at work for several decades in West Africa and South Africa, it was Livingstone’s explorations that excited the greatest interest, not least because of his claims that some of the territories he had travelled in had a climate healthy enough for white settlers, unlike, for example, the coastal areas of West Africa. Consequently, it is with respect to Africa that the vision of a civilising mission is most explicitly and persistently enunciated within the secular press. Livingstone’s call to pursue the approach of ‘commerce and Christianity’ reflected a wider interest in such an approach at the time, though it is to his name that the slogan became attached.⁵³ And though the initial response to this call, the Universities Mission of the early 1860s, was a failure,⁵⁴ after his death this became the motive force of further missionary enterprise in Central Africa. Livingstone became the touchstone for those that followed, with the result that repeated references are made to Livingstone’s vision, and many developments in Central Africa were construed as a fulfilment of this vision.

It is perhaps salutary to remember that at the time of the publication of his *Missionary Travels and Researches* in 1857, Livingstone’s views on slavery and the slave-trade were not universally shared, and that shifts in opinion on this matter did owe much to him and to his followers. Livingstone used the opportunity of public

⁵² See, for example, J H Proctor, ‘Serving God and the Empire: Mary Slessor in South-Eastern Nigeria, 1876-1915, in *Journal of Religion in Africa*, Vol XXX, No 1, 2000, pp 45-61.

⁵³ For a similar interest in the prospects for both commerce and Christianity at this time, see William Balfour Baikie, *Narrative of an Exploring Voyage*, London, John Murray, 1856.

⁵⁴ This was the mission established by the Universities of Cambridge, Oxford, Durham, and Trinity College, Dublin, in response to Livingstone’s lectures Cambridge in 1857. For an account of this mission, see Andrew Ross, *David Livingstone: Mission and Empire*, London, Hambledon and London, 2002.

meetings, such as that in Edinburgh in September 1857, to put forward his views on slavery, commenting that he did not think any ‘such thing as American slavery could be introduced into Africa’, and criticising the Boers for attacking and enslaving Africans.⁵⁵ One response to such views was that the manufacture of products such as cotton could not be developed in Africa without slave labour, since ‘slavery is a fixed institution of Negro Africa’, and ‘no African tribe has ever yet been found without it’.⁵⁶ Supporters of Livingstone such as Sir Bartle Frere, however, held the view that Africans could become civilised, a ‘burden of empire’ that should be shouldered bravely, ‘as Englishmen are wont to undertake a task which they believe to be one of duty’. To his Scottish audience he emphasised that he believed his views to be ‘in accordance with the views which Dr Livingstone has himself embraced of his own responsibilities and his own duties’.⁵⁷

The statue of Livingstone which it was proposed should be erected in Edinburgh, would provide recognition of ‘the heroic services rendered to science and civilisation by the late Dr Livingstone’, and would be ‘a national statue to his memory’ fitting for ‘the capital of his native country’.⁵⁸ Thus science and civilisation were integrally linked, and Livingstone claimed as a Scottish hero. In the same issue of *The Scotsman* further tribute was paid. ‘Livingstone’s great object was the abolition of slavery’ opined the writer, and ‘he believed, that that object would be best attained by explorations which might result in opening up Africa to British civilisation’.⁵⁹ Honour was to him ‘if not an empty name, wholly unattractive’, and he preferred a ‘lonely, toilsome, dangerous life in Africa’ working ‘for the cause of humanity’.⁶⁰ Several days later a proposal was made that ‘the Churches in Scotland should unite in order to found a *Great African Mission* in commemoration of [Livingstone’s] labours’.⁶¹ This would be a fit memorial since, ‘Livingstone, above most men, had broad Christian sympathies, untrammelled by the peculiar views of

⁵⁵ *The Scotsman*, Thursday, 24 September, 1857.

⁵⁶ Article from *The Examiner*, reprinted in *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 29 September, 1857.

⁵⁷ *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 6 January, 1874.

⁵⁸ ‘Proposed statue to Dr Livingstone’ in *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 15 April, 1874.

⁵⁹ Editorial, *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 15 April, 1874.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*

⁶¹ ‘The Livingstone Memorial’ in *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 28 April, 1874.

any special Church', a dig at the divided Scottish churches.⁶² Such a mission would 'do honour to the memory of Livingstone, and, above all, most effectually promote the great work for which he lived and died.'⁶³ Christianisation was also, implicitly, civilisation.

Similarly, public discussion of the Livingstonia expedition to establish missions in Nyasaland, stressed the aim to civilise, and the capacity for Africans to become so. Thus those who said the 'negro race' was incapable of being civilised were wrong. Rather, 'the pioneers of the Livingstonia mission' recognised 'that commerce and Christianity, civilisation and humanity, must work hand in hand, in order to ensure success for either'.⁶⁴ Livingstone, after whom the mission was named, was 'the Scotch apostle of humanity'.⁶⁵ The 'colonists' were congratulated on their success, 'these brave Scotchmen who have set themselves down in Africa to spread Christianity and civilisation among its people'.⁶⁶ Colonial administrators, too, such as Henry O'Neill, British Consul in Mozambique, applauded Livingstone for his civilising mission.⁶⁷ As imperial power expanded in South and Eastern Central Africa, responsibility needed to be exercised to 'honestly guard the interests of those native races for whom the greatest of Scottish heroes – David Livingstone – laid down his life'.⁶⁸ Newspaper coverage of the Livingstone Centenary celebrations in 1913 carried numerous tributes, which emphasised, as had previous tributes, his contribution to Christianisation, to civilisation and to humanity:

What St Paul did in the first century for Europe, what St Columba did for Scotland, David Livingstone did for Africa – he opened up the way by which Christianity entered in to possess a continent.⁶⁹

At the Royal Scottish Museum in Edinburgh, the Livingstone Centenary Exhibition was a representation of how the 'Dark Continent' had changed since he arrived there in 1841, with the exhibits imprinting on the mind 'the representations of primitive

⁶² Ibid.

⁶³ Cutting dated 6 March, 1877, no title given: MS 7906, NLS.

⁶⁴ Ibid.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁶⁶ Ibid.

⁶⁷ Henry O'Neill, 'East Africa, between the Zambezi and the Rovuma Rivers: its People, Riches and Development' in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol I, No VIII, August, 1885.

⁶⁸ Ibid. p 351.

tribal culture, the fruits of Christian mission work, the proofs of native education, of growing industrial efficiency and reliance upon civil order'. The most striking contrast presented is that showing 'the transformation of the moral wilderness made by the witch doctor and the slave raider into a region of peace, freedom, and advancing enlightenment'.⁷⁰ What Livingstone had begun, others had taken up, and 'the Exhibition as a whole is a demonstration of missionary and industrial progress in Central Africa and the elevation of the native'.⁷¹ Professor Gregory, of Glasgow University, concentrated on Livingstone's achievements as an explorer, but emphasised too Livingstone's humble background and his career as a missionary: 'The master idea of all the later part of his life was the suppression of the slave trade by the introduction of European commerce and colonization'.⁷² Though he may have died thinking of himself as a failure, it was possible forty years on to conclude 'the beneficent revolution that has taken place in Africa' was due to Livingstone's influence 'on the men who established civilization where he entered as the heroic pioneer'.⁷³

Others, too, contributed to the civilising mission, like Wilson and Duff and their colleagues in India, or predecessors in Africa such as Moffat, or Livingstone's successors in Nyasaland. His father-in-law, Robert Moffat, through his vast knowledge bearing on 'dialects, traditions and folklore of South Africa', had helped to 'gradually wean the tribes from wars and pagan practices'.⁷⁴ The fruits of his labours were to have converted the Bechuanas from 'a predatory and savage into a peaceful and industrious nation'.⁷⁵ Thus Moffat, like Livingstone, was seen as having had the capacity to build relations of trust and friendship with African peoples, and to be the bringer of a civilising mission. His Scottish missionary successors were representative of 'Western civilisation', holding back the advance of the Arabs, who represented 'the advanced guard of what we must call Oriental

⁶⁹ 'David Livingstone' in *The Scotsman*, Saturday, 15 March, 1913.

⁷⁰ *A Guide to the Livingstone Centenary Exhibition*, Edinburgh, Scotch Education Department/Royal Scottish Museum, 1913, p 3.

⁷¹ *Ibid*, p 4.

⁷² J W Gregory, *Livingstone as an Explorer: an Appreciation*, delivered in the University of Glasgow on the occasion of the Centenary of David Livingstone, 18 March, 1913, p 19.

⁷³ *Ibid*. p 38.

⁷⁴ *The Scotsman*, Saturday, 11 August, 1883.

civilisation in Africa'. The missionaries in turn represented 'the advanced guard of Western civilisation'.⁷⁶

Mary Slessor, too, could be fitted into the framework of the civilising mission, with her contribution appearing as an adjunct to imperial power. Her 'heroic pioneer work' was undertaken with 'dauntless courage' as she single-handedly set about 'putting down the cruel and barbarous superstitions and customs that were everywhere rampant'.⁷⁷ With her 'infinite knowledge' of the language, 'and by her shrewdness and adaptability in understanding the native character' she was able to dispense justice over a wide area, gaining recognition to do so from the British authorities. As a representative of the Native Court, 'her work as a missionary was linked up with the systematic pacification of the country which the Government had entered after she began her labours'.⁷⁸

Missionaries and imperial expansion

Over time this civilising mission was more explicitly connected to imperial expansion in accounts of missionary enterprise in Africa, and in debates on the best ways to promote economic development, in particular with respect to Central Africa. On the one hand this reflected the reality of the missionaries' situation, with the missionaries campaigning for some form of state protection. On the other hand secular debates on imperial development encompassed missionary activities and the related role of the African Lakes Company in commercial development. Though the civilising mission was essentially an imperial enterprise, this did not mean that missionaries and their secular counterparts necessarily shared the same view of imperial development. What is apparent is that their efforts were sometimes construed as colonisation, though not usually by missionaries themselves.

The idea of a 'Scotch colony' was already being advanced in the early years of the Livingstonia expedition. E D Young,⁷⁹ leader of the expedition, at a public meeting

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁷⁶ *The Manchester Guardian*, Tuesday, 8 October, 1889.

⁷⁷ *The Scotsman*, 18 January, 1915.

⁷⁸ Ibid.

⁷⁹ Young had accompanied Livingstone on an earlier expedition.

in Glasgow in 1877, declared that Lake Nyassa ‘might now be claimed as a Scotch lake, as they were all Scotchmen there’.⁸⁰ A newspaper report the following day described the substance of Young’s address as being ‘On the present and future prospects of the Scotch Colony established on Lake Nyassa’, and the ‘colonists’ were congratulated on their success.⁸¹

However, this idea of a ‘Scotch colony’ was more evident from the mid 1880s onwards. At its inception in 1885 the Scottish Geographical Society (to become ‘Royal’ in 1887) laid out the justification for its existence in terms of the Scottish contribution to geography from the fifteenth century onwards. These included the ‘record of successful Scottish colonisation’ in various parts of Canada, while ‘it was not the fault of the Scotsmen’ who took part in the ‘ill-starred Darien scheme’ that it ‘resulted in abject failure’. It was, however, in Africa that the record of ‘Scotsmen’ stood out, having ‘borne the greatest and foremost share in letting in light on “the dark continent”’.⁸² Among other things, Scots had developed ‘the flourishing colony of Livingstonia’ on Lake Nyasa, a ‘distinctly Scottish colony’, and Blantyre, ‘another missionary colony in the same region’ which was ‘also a Scottish settlement’.⁸³

Support for the efforts of Scots found expression in a variety of places, often with implied or explicit criticism of government action. H M Stanley, in his inaugural address to the Scottish Geographical Society, urged, in the face of the government’s tendency to ‘cast cold water on such projects’ that commercial possibilities and ‘railway enterprises’ be developed, such as ‘any half-a-dozen rich capitalists of Scotland could cause to be made’.⁸⁴ The efforts of the Scots, such as Mr Stevenson, ‘in inaugurating a commercial development, now prosecuted successfully’, by the African Lakes Trading Company of Glasgow, were applauded.⁸⁵ Frederick Moir, of the African Lakes Company itself, as a prelude to the description of his explorations,

⁸⁰ Cutting dated 5th March 1877, no title given: MS 7906, NLS.

⁸¹ Cutting dated 6 March, 1877, no title given: MS 7906, NLS.

⁸² ‘Scotland and Geographical Work’ in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 1, 1885, p 19-20.

⁸³ *Ibid.* p 22.

⁸⁴ H M Stanley, ‘Central Africa and the Congo Basin’, Inaugural address delivered before the Scottish Geographical Society, *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 1, 1885, p 9.

described the company's origins with 'some gentlemen in Glasgow and Edinburgh' who aimed to check the slave-trade, develop commerce and encourage the growth of ordinary agricultural products.⁸⁶ Moir emphasised the scientific opportunities presented by an East African base, rather than the commercial ones, perhaps with an eye to his audience, or perhaps to his own commercial interests.

Another promoter of Scots interests and advocate of British government intervention in Central Africa was Arthur Silva White, secretary of the Scottish Geographical Society. Though he did not use the term 'colony' as such, he noted 'the settlement of the whole region by Scottish missionaries and traders'.⁸⁷ Providing a brief account of the founding of the Scottish churches mission stations, White commented that 'Of the hundred European settlers, chiefly Scotsmen, who on average make Nyassa-land their home, many have contributed largely to our knowledge of the country of their temporary adoption'.⁸⁸ And in *Blackwood's Magazine*, he described how, in the face of obstacles presented by the Portuguese, the 'African Lakes Company, of Glasgow, have established a trade-route', and though the 'missionaries on the Lakes give constant work to the Company' its trade 'could be immeasurably increased if only the country were under a settled and active government'.⁸⁹ The 'missionaries of the Free Church of Scotland, and agents and officers of the African Lakes Company' were commended for their brave stand against Arab attackers.⁹⁰

Fundamentally, these sources make clear that the Scots missionaries in Nyasaland were laying claim to influence in certain territories, and that they would defend this vigorously, on occasion by force of arms in repelling attacks by slave-traders, and by recourse to political pressure when necessary. Such episodes lent themselves to dramatic and heroic representations, which might 'vie with the imaginary sieges and

⁸⁵ Ibid. p 10.

⁸⁶ Frederick L Maitland Moir, 'Eastern Route to Central Africa' in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol I, No IV, April 1885, p 96.

⁸⁷ Arthur Silva White, *On the achievements of Scotsmen during the nineteenth century in the fields of geographical exploration and research*, A report to the Paris Geographical International Congress, Edinburgh, T and A Constable, 1889, p14.

⁸⁸ Ibid. p 14-15.

⁸⁹ Arthur Silva White, 'The Central African Question' in *Blackwood's Magazine*, Vol 143, 1888.

⁹⁰ Ibid.

battles in the Dark Continent described by the author of “King Solomon’s Mines””.⁹¹ They also lent themselves to claims of a specific contribution to imperial expansion. While the history of developments in Nyasaland were particularly salient in this respect, the part played by other Scots missionaries, such as John Mackenzie (of the LMS) in Bechuanaland and Mary Slessor in West Africa, were similarly construed in these terms.

The view that missionaries were the bringers of civilisation to ‘superstitious’ and ‘barbarous’ and ‘heathen’ peoples was continuously repeated in missionary literature, and was also apparent in wider press reporting. As a result of Livingstone’s celebrity this claim received an even wider currency than it had previously done, and was repeatedly made in the secular press of Livingstone himself and of other Scots missionaries in the decades following his death. The idea of this civilising mission was used to justify imperial expansion, with Britain deemed to be superior to other European countries as a civilising power, and with Livingstone’s legacy being co-opted for imperial ambitions that he would not necessarily have shared.⁹²

Scots’ achievements

As the previous section has shown, Livingstone and those who came after him were deemed to have opened up Africa, brought an end to the slave-trade, and commenced the process of ‘civilising’ African peoples. Specific successes in Christianising, educating and providing medical facilities, as recounted in missionary literature, were less likely to be referred to in the secular press. Obituaries of leading missionaries of course made reference to their specific achievements, but in newspaper coverage, such as that in *The Scotsman*, it was the more general claims of contributions to civilisation and humanity that were more frequently made. Missionaries were also recognised to have made a contribution to geography and other forms of knowledge, to exploration, and to science. This was often stressed in

⁹¹ Newspaper cutting (no title, no date, though probably 1887) on the attack by slave traders around Lake Nyasa and the defence by Free Church missionaries: MS 7906, NLS. The reference is to Rider Haggard’s popular novel.

⁹² See, for example, Chapter 15, ‘Livingstone and Imperialism’ in Ross, *David Livingstone: Mission and Empire*, 2002, pp 239-244.

biographies of leading missionaries, and is also evident in a range of articles and papers published by the Royal Scottish Geographical Society, for example, where missionaries took their place among the lists of Scots explorers and geographers.

With respect to India it was primarily achievements in the sphere of education that were emphasised, and sometimes also achievements in scholarship. For example, John Wilson, on his death in 1875, was described as ‘the ablest and most influential missionary resident in the [Bombay] presidency’.⁹³ His diligent scholarship in ‘vernacular languages’ meant that ‘before long his proficiency was generally recognised as remarkable’.⁹⁴ Characterised as more ‘a litterateur than a divine’ his contribution to the development of education in India was highlighted, as was his appointment to the vice-chancellorship of Bombay University, ‘the first time that office was held by a missionary’.⁹⁵ His capacity to bring people together also excited comment, with the Governor of the Presidency being quoted: ‘as a missionary he had been the first to bring Europeans and natives together, and promote between them friendly intercourse’.⁹⁶ Similar accolades were showered on Wilson’s successor, Dr Mackichan, who was being advanced as a candidate for the Moderatorship of the Free Church in the early 1900s. He had been three times Vice-Chancellor of the University of Bombay, a member of a select committee responsible for ‘the new University Acts of India’, and stood out as ‘the foremost educationist in India’, as well as being a ‘great Sanskrit and Marathi scholar’.⁹⁷ In the event it was the other candidate named in the article, Dr Robert Laws, who was elevated to the Moderatorship, which is perhaps indicative of the greater public interest in Africa as a field of missionary action at this time.

Within a lengthy obituary, in February 1878, the major points of Alexander Duff’s career were seen to be his ‘founding of an institution for the promotion of higher education among the Hindoos’; his work in promoting support for missions at home;

⁹³ *The Scotsman*, Monday, 6 December, 1875.

⁹⁴ *Ibid.*

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

⁹⁷ ‘The United Free Church’ in newspaper cutting, probably the *Glasgow Herald*, 1907: MS 8022, NLS.

his giving evidence on education in India to the House of Lords; his holding twice, unusually, the position of Moderator; being 'a voluminous writer on missionary and other subjects'; and being a supporter of the Livingstonia mission in central Africa and of the Gordon memorial mission in South Africa.⁹⁸ In sum, Duff was seen as being effective in carrying out the task entrusted to him of building educational institutions in India, as an effective advocate of legal change and changes in government policy, and an effective organiser at home for the cause of missions. In general, then, the development of education in India was seen to be the missionaries' major contribution, and while this may have reflected the value put on education at home, in this context it was not claimed as specifically Scottish.

In 1874, however, following Livingstone's death the claim of Scotland's special and disproportionate contribution to the discovery of Africa was already being advanced: 'Scotland had even beyond proportion contributed men willing to engage in the enterprise of ascertaining more about Africa, and of relating Africa to the rest of the world.' Remembering 'Bruce and Mungo Park of old,' it could be seen that 'African enterprise was partly a transmitted Scotch work'.⁹⁹ Such claims of Scottish leadership and of a disproportionate contribution were also echoed in those made later with respect to Scots as explorers and geographers, again, especially in Africa. Within the addresses to the Scottish Geographical Society and in the pages of its magazine, such litanies are recorded on a number of occasions, and the achievements of Scots are paid homage by others as well as by Scots themselves. A number of missionaries take their place here, though Livingstone is, as elsewhere, the dominant figure.

In its prospectus in 1885, the Scottish Geographical Society proclaimed that 'Scottish energy and enterprise have sent Scotsmen to all countries of the world as pioneers of discovery' where they had been 'founders of thriving colonies', 'successful merchants and traders', and 'useful missionaries and philanthropists'. Furthermore, 'Scotland has produced many world-famed scientific men, travellers, geographers,

⁹⁸ *The Scotsman*, 13 February, 1878.

⁹⁹ 'Proposed statue to Dr Livingstone' in *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 15 April, 1874.

and cartographers'.¹⁰⁰ In Africa Scotsmen had taken 'the foremost share'. Explorers from James Bruce onwards were given their due, with Livingstone, as might be expected, occupying the most prominent place: 'Livingstone's title to be considered the greatest of African travellers rests on the wonderful extent of the ground he covered, and on the practical value of his discoveries'.¹⁰¹ The contribution of other missionaries to exploration before Livingstone was acknowledged. Hope Waddell, who 'spent nearly the whole of a long and useful life at Old Calabar' near the Cameroon Mountains, 'made valuable additions to our knowledge of the country and the people in that little-known region'.¹⁰² The Rev John Campbell, of Edinburgh, a missionary with the LMS, was responsible for 'our earliest knowledge of the interior of the country north of the Orange River' in South Africa.¹⁰³ Robert Moffat, 'the hero of the desert', wrote of his labours in South Africa, and it was with Moffat that Livingstone, 'the prince of African travellers, served his apprenticeship as a missionary and explorer'.¹⁰⁴ The mission of the English Universities was led by Bishop Mackenzie, 'and Bishop Mackenzie was a Scotsman'. Similarly, in South Africa the Free Church has 'a missionary settlement at Lovedale in Kaffirland, which was organised and is carried out by Scotsmen'.¹⁰⁵ Scots who undertook or published accounts of travels in the Indian sub-continent and surrounding regions included John Wilson, and his son, Andrew.¹⁰⁶ The former, described as 'the famous missionary, the friend of Livingstone', wrote about Indian religious monuments and temples, while the latter published an account of his 'long and perilous journeys through the Upper Himalayas', *The Abode of Snow*.¹⁰⁷

A more detailed account of *The Achievements of Scotsmen during the Nineteenth Century in the Fields of Geographical Exploration and Research* indicated the volume and scope of such activities in the 19th century, with soldiers, colonial administrators, travellers and explorers, missionaries, and various professionals such

¹⁰⁰ 'Scotland and Geographical Work' in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol I, 1885, p 17.

¹⁰¹ Ibid. p 22.

¹⁰² Ibid. p 21.

¹⁰³ Ibid, p 21.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid. p 22.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid. p 22.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid. p 23-4.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid. p 24. *Abode of Snow* was serialised in *Blackwood's Magazine* in 1874 and 1875.

as doctors, surveyors, botanists, astronomers, and architects, all playing their part in the production of such knowledge.¹⁰⁸ It was also noted that RSGS founder member, and author of missionary biographies and histories of missions, Dr George Smith ‘merits the distinction of having given in his *Geography of British India* (1882) the first systematic, scientific account of these countries’.¹⁰⁹ As elsewhere, Africa took pride of place. ‘No other continent has benefited by the labours of so many eminent Scottish explorers, the record of whose achievements is an almost continuous narrative of the modern history of African exploration’.¹¹⁰ To Livingstone is owed the opening up of Central Africa, while commercial funders, James Stevenson and John Stephen are acknowledged, and the Moir brothers, and the civil engineer, James Stewart, are afforded recognition for their surveys and explorations, all associated with the Livingstonia expedition and the African Lakes Company. The efforts of other lesser known missionaries in exploration were also applauded.

While Scots might have been expected to emphasise their own claims to eminence, visiting speakers also offered encomiums. For example, in Sir Harry Johnston’s address on the occasion of the Livingstone centenary in 1913, there is a litany of names of Scots’ explorers, including several missionaries. This included not only Livingstone as ‘one of the greatest amongst the amazing explorers of Scotland sent out to make known the unknown’, but also the ‘the heroes of Darien’, Robert Moffat, and associated with south and central Africa the following: John and Frederick Moir, Dr Stewart of Lovedale, Dr Robert Laws of Nyasaland, Henry Henderson, John Buchanan, David Ruffele-Scott, Duncan Fraser, and Alexander Hetherwick.¹¹¹ Finally Johnston applauded ‘a Scotsman, John Mackenzie’ as ‘the real creator, in succession to Livingstone, of British Bechuanaland’.¹¹²

This claim of Scottish leadership perhaps reached its most celebratory tone at the time of the 1910 World Missionary Conference, where Scotland was claimed to have

¹⁰⁸ White, *Achievements of Scotsmen*, 1889. This also contained a bibliography of works by Scottish authors.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid. p 7.

¹¹⁰ Ibid. p 11.

¹¹¹ Sir Harry Johnston, ‘Introductory remarks, David Livingstone and his work in Africa’, in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol XXIX, No V, May, 1913, p 253.

led the way in Africa, India and the South Seas. Indeed, the choice of Edinburgh as the location for the missionary conference might reflect the fact that ‘in that great enterprise Scotland has always led the way’. Not only the names of missionaries of Scottish churches were used to reinforce this claim, but, among others, the explorer Mungo Park, Mackay of Uganda who was a missionary with the Anglican Church Missionary Society, and Robert Louis Stevenson, who formed a positive opinion of James Chalmers, on whom he was quoted, but was otherwise sceptical about the benefits of missionaries’ interventions. And, to conclude the roll-call of leading Scots, it was asserted that:

In proportion to its population Scotland has done more for missions than any country in the world. It has sent some of the best of its manhood to establish and to man the outposts of Christianity’.¹¹³

Such litanies served to endorse the claims of Scots leadership and achievement in a variety of spheres, as missionaries, scientists, and servants of empire, and they gained potency from their repetition and increasing prevalence in the period between the mid 1880s and 1914. As such they were part of ‘a very considerable tradition’ of celebrating Scots achievement within the empire.¹¹⁴

Conclusion

This chapter has examined evidence of changing public attitudes towards the missionary enterprise in Scotland, and of how this came to be represented in the secular press as a Scottish contribution to empire. This evidence suggests that though information about foreign missions may have been regularly disseminated through the main Presbyterian churches from the post-Disruption period onward, it was not until 1857 that missionary activity stimulated much in the way of public debate in the press, nor until after Livingstone’s death that there was a wider public interest. This growth of interest was demonstrated by reporting of the Livingstonia expedition in the mid 1870s, and by coverage of other events in Nyasaland in the 1880s. It was also demonstrated by the prominence of the missionary contribution in the RSGS and its debates on exploration and imperial development in Africa, and by the highly

¹¹² Ibid., p 253.

¹¹³ *The Scotsman*, Tuesday, 14 June, 1910.

publicised events of the 1910 World Missionary Conference and 1913 Livingstone Centenary. From the mid 1880s onwards this came to be increasingly represented by claims of a disproportionate contribution and of leadership by Scots, on the one hand of exploration and scientific discoveries in Africa, and on the other of leadership of the civilising mission of the missionary enterprise. The idea of Scotland's special contribution to Africa was, however, present at the time of Livingstone's death, and was increasing amplified as he was mythologised.

The debate at the time of the Indian Mutiny in 1857 was shaped by an understanding of religious duty and divine providence, which at the same time was accompanied by criticisms of British administration, much in the same way as it was discussed in the pages of the missionary periodicals. In coverage of the developing missions in Nyasaland, while religious discourses remained in evidence even in the secular press, the 'civilising mission' became more closely allied with imperialism, and the capacity to effectively control territory, which some secular commentators did not hesitate to designate a Scottish 'colony'. The idea of the civilising mission was of course persistently present in missionary literature, and thus the representations in the secular press resonate with this. There is however a shift towards an emphasis on the secular aspects of this mission, and the achievements of exploration and science.

Thus the missionary enterprise was acclaimed as a manifestation of Scottish leadership and achievement both in religious and secular spheres. It was understood as showing that Scots had played a role in imperial expansion, demonstrating not only courage and determination, but a moral vision that enabled them to offer the benefits of their civilisation to others. This active self-promotion of the role of Scots reached its height in relation to Africa, and just as representations of Livingstone progressively amplified his typical Scottishness over this period, the perceived achievements of missionaries in general were appropriated as a distinctively Scottish contribution to empire. And just as the Livingstone myth was not 'self-generating', but required the mediation of others,¹¹⁵ the generation of the image of missionaries as

¹¹⁴ John M MacKenzie, 'Empire and National Identities: the case of Scotland' in *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, VIII, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1998, p 223.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p 122.

‘empire-builders’ or ‘colonists’ required intervention by secular supporters of imperialism. The characterisation of Scottish missionaries, both by Scots and others, as ‘brave’ and ‘gallant’, the advocacy of the case for government protection to consolidate claims to spheres of influence, and the pride taken in Scottish contributions, combined to produce a more ‘nationalist’ discourse than was present in missionary literature as such, though many of the same themes and claims were also present there. In their transposition into the secular sphere such themes and claims became more sharply focussed and more insistent on a distinctive Scottish contribution to empire.

It is the iconisation of Livingstone as the typical Scot that above all symbolises this representation of the missionary enterprise as a Scottish contribution to empire, though Slessor is to a lesser extent also cast in this mould. Livingstone’s Scottishness came to be increasingly emphasised, an emphasis that grew more pronounced in the early decades of the 20th century.¹¹⁶ Such references to Livingstone as a ‘typical Scot’ were apparent from the time of his death, when he was hailed as ‘a typical Scotchman in his character, his perseverance, and in his success’,¹¹⁷ and as ‘a man in whose physiognomy and character there was written the enterprise of the hard, determined Scot’.¹¹⁸ By 1913 such claims were being made more vigorously, with Livingstone being ‘bone of our bone and flesh of our flesh; Scottish in ancestry, Scottish in blood, Scottish in the staunchness of his convictions, Scottish in the probity of his character’.¹¹⁹ Others whose achievements were routinely praised, and whose Scottish character and background might be emphasised in various ways were not said to represent the ‘typical Scot’ in the way that Livingstone was. Perhaps it was because Livingstone could also be appropriated as a ‘British’ hero that Scots felt the need to emphasise his Scottishness. Certainly the evidence of such frequently repeated accolades at the time of Livingstone’s centenary is consonant with MacKenzie’s argument of the reappropriation of Livingstone as part of the ‘Scottish cultural revival’ of the 1920s, and the ‘repatriation’ of the legend with the

¹¹⁶ MacKenzie, ‘David Livingstone: the construction of the myth’, p 32.

¹¹⁷ ‘Proposed Statue to Dr Livingstone’ in *The Scotsman*, Wednesday, 15 April, 1874.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁹ ‘The Livingstone Centenary’ in *The Scotsman*, Thursday, 20 March, 1913.

establishment of the Livingstone memorial at Blantyre.¹²⁰ Indeed, it indicates that this process was well under way in the first decade of the 20th century.

Though Slessor is also visible as an icon of missionary achievement in the secular press, in general a more masculine version of the missionary enterprise is presented than appears in the missionary periodicals, though this is largely a function of the existence of a separate literature for women about women's missionary work. Slessor was presented as a hand-maiden of empire, facilitating the expansion of British jurisdiction and helping in its administration. Her recognition by government in this role and the official approval afforded by government honours may have been crucial to her selection as material for idealisation, despite here somewhat 'maverick' character as a missionary.¹²¹ Certainly, this would be consistent with the greater emphasis on the professional and the scientific in accounts of missionaries' achievements in the secular sphere. Arguably all the missionaries who became well-known to the Scottish public in this period made their mark beyond the purely religious sphere, and it was as much in demonstrating their abilities as educators, scientists, linguists, or explorers, that they reflected the values and aspirations of Scots as in upholding the Presbyterian faith. And notwithstanding the extent of active church membership and commitment to religious beliefs of the time, it was surely this combination of the religious and the secular that contributed to the public prominence of missionaries and to their acceptance as inspirational figures, who could be appropriated to shape ideas of Scottishness itself.

The paradox of course is that both male and female missionary icons were working class in origin, and were not typical representatives of the missionary body as a whole. Missionaries were for the most part educated and middle class, like their leading supporters at home. That they could come to be represented by working class people, and in Livingstone's case someone whose Highland origins came to be increasingly emphasised, suggests that this iconisation represented the successful assimilation by civilised middle class Scotland of the those elements which threatened it, whether the uncivilised Highlands of the past, or the working classes of

¹²⁰ MacKenzie, 'David Livingstone: the construction of the myth', p 34-35.

the present. Thus enthusiasm for the missionary movement reflected concerns at home as well as symbolising the capacity to civilise and control uncivilised others abroad. It is notable too that such nationalist claims of a Scottish contribution to empire were made at the same historical moment that nationalist demands were being articulated in relation to the political administration of Scotland. The missionary movement then provided the Scottish middle-classes with an image of themselves as having the capacity to assimilate, civilise, control and rule others, at time when they were renegotiating the way they governed their society at home, and in doing so it both reinforced their self-confidence and their national identity.

¹²¹ See J H Proctor, 'Serving God and the Empire'.

Chapter 8: Conclusion

This research has aimed to explore how civil society in Scotland, in particular missionary societies and the churches, responded to the experience of empire. In so doing it has sought to describe and analyse the forms of associational activity that evolved, their membership, and the processes through which ideas and representations of the nature of this experience were produced and disseminated, from the late 18th century to the early 20th century. In particular it has asked how identity was constructed in the discourses of literature by and about missionaries, and how such representations were received at home. This research concludes that civil society organisations played a key role in mediating an understanding of empire, through a variety of organisational forms, in which missionary societies and the churches played a leading role. It also concludes that the representations of empire and of Scots' role within these discourses over time came to inform the construction of Scottish national identity and claims of a specific Scottish contribution to empire.

Civil society and empire

The pattern of civil society organisational activity concerned with empire or aspects of imperial experience indicates that religious and moral concerns about the nature of this experience and about the conditions of the lives of colonial peoples were present throughout this period, expressed primarily through the missionary movement, but also from time to time in focused philanthropic campaigning. That such religious and moral concerns were the primary factor motivating an interest in empire is demonstrated by the continuity and the longevity of forms of organisation which supported foreign missions. Overlaps in interest in these issues and membership of societies are apparent from the records of organisations and their literature in the earlier part of the century, though organised support for foreign missions was later divided on denominational lines. It was through the Protestant churches in general, however, that a continuous link with empire was maintained and through which this experience was understood. While the imperialist enthusiasm of the late 19th century also generated organisational activity promoting imperialism itself, these forms were short-lived. At this time, however, an interest in the missionary enterprise and in

imperialism often came together, as is demonstrated by both the membership and the debates in the RSGS, and as the programmes of the international exhibitions show.

The mapping and tracking of the life-cycles of civil society organisations that the existence of the *New Edinburgh Almanacs*, annual reports, periodicals and ephemeral literature permits, emphasises how significant these were in 19th century Scottish society, and illustrates a pattern of organisation and activity that might be found across Scotland. Records of committee membership indicate the dominance of middle class elites, with their particular strength in Edinburgh, for example, being illustrated by the capacity of the Edinburgh medical profession to sustain its own missionary organisation. Most significantly, these sources make clear that women were involved in all these forms of activity, whether through auxiliaries or through their own separate organisations. The periodical literature on home and foreign missions is most revealing here, since it renders visible in a way that no other sources have done, the extent of women's involvement, the tasks they carried out and the skills they acquired, and their views of the role they were playing and of women in other countries. As typically this literature also carried material on home missions, it represents a seam that can be further mined to explore women's philanthropic work at home and the extent to which the same individuals may have engaged in both. A further significant characteristic of the missionary enterprise, which is demonstrated particularly by the letter books of missionary societies and church foreign committees, is the extent to which it was directed and controlled from home. This direction applied not only to the work of missionaries abroad, but to the acquisition, editing and dissemination of information about their activities.

As a core social institution in national life the kirk inevitably reacted to the challenge of empire, firstly in administering to the religious needs of its own diaspora, and only later conceiving it as appropriate to carry its religion to those ruled by members of that, and the wider British, diaspora. It follows from the place of religion and the churches in national life, that the Christian engagement with empire would be continuous, if changing in character over time. The churches occupied a position in society that was powerful and influential, not solely because of the levels of religious

adherence at this time, but because of their social composition. In particular the rising middle classes of the 19th century dominated churches and philanthropic organisations, which promoted the values to which they subscribed. Though this research has focussed on the activities and beliefs of elites, that the values they subscribed too also had currency with sections of the working class is demonstrated by working class religious adherence, and by the popularity of ideals of self-help and success through merit and educational attainment, exemplified by individuals such as Livingstone.¹ Middle-class involvement in philanthropic activity was highly visible, and a mark of social status, as well as providing a mechanism for influencing the opinions and behaviour of others. This activity exhibited a parallel interest in the promotion of a civilising mission in the urban slums that arose from rapid industrialisation and urban expansion and in the newly 'civilised' highlands, and in missions abroad, and the view that there was a need to tame both urban 'savages' and those abroad was not uncommon. This was particularly clearly expressed in the activities of societies which supported both activities, for example, in the provision of training in home missions as a prelude to foreign mission work, and was also manifested in the presentation of information and propaganda on home and foreign missions within the pages of the same publications.

It has been argued that such activities represented the exertion of social control by the middle classes, and that it was through such civil society action that the governance of 19th century urban Scotland was conducted.² In this way civil society could carry a Scottish national identity, that made political nationalism unnecessary. With the changes in the governance of Scotland occurring in the 1880s, nationalist demands began to emerge, in the shape of support for Home Rule, and a nationalist consciousness was more apparent, even if support for nationalism as a political movement was not widespread. Arguments for Home Rule were presented in the context of imperial governance, with various models of imperial federation being promoted, thus it was not a question of seceding from the British imperial state, but

¹ See John M MacKenzie, 'Empire and National Identities: the Case of Scotland', in *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, VIII, Cambridge, 1998, pp 215-231, p 226.

² See Graeme Morton, *Unionist Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press, 1999.

rather one of renegotiating the relationship of its constituent parts and the place of Scotland within this.³ This suggests a simultaneous interest in the governance of empire together with that in the governance of Scotland. Such an interest was not exclusively expressed in the sphere of ‘high politics’, since the conduct of empire might affect Scottish society in a variety of ways, whether in terms of economic impacts, or of the Scots military contribution. The celebration of victories of Scots regiments, the popularity of the volunteer movement, and the creation of militaristic youth organisations such as the Boys’ Brigade, were all evidence of a popular militarism, expressing interest in how empire was expanded and maintained, and in this sense can be said to have represented an interest in the governance of empire.

Such a concern with the governance of empire was also demonstrated by the activities of the civil society organisations referred to above. They lobbied government for reforms, and policy changes, and, as at home, the churches occupied a place in colonial societies that allowed them to make a contribution to the governance of empire, whether in providing for the religious needs of emigrants and expatriates, or in missionary ventures. This they could do through autonomous religious and educational institutions, welfare provision such as orphanages, famine relief, schemes to provide employment, and the provision of medical facilities, modelled on the churches and philanthropic institutions at home. Furthermore they could also comment on the need for legislative change to eradicate practices that they deemed to be harmful, whether indigenous customs and laws that appeared abhorrent to Europeans or the actions of government itself, such as its support for the opium trade, or put forward ideas about economic and social development within newly established colonial territories. In this sense then the churches provided a basis for participating in and commenting on the governance of empire, and their distinctively Scottish character allowed for this to be claimed as a specifically Scottish contribution to empire.

These forms of associational activity might reinforce a sense of Scottish identity in a number of ways: through claiming to be or labelling themselves as ‘Scottish’;

³ See, for example, Richard Finlay, *A Partnership for Good? Scottish Politics and the Union since*

through having an intrinsically Scottish character because of location, history, religious tradition, and so on, and through the constant reaffirmation of this through associational activity; through being actualised in functioning Scottish networks which similarly reaffirmed a sense of a Scottish community; through the focus of their interest, for example, in fellow Scots taking their distinctive form of religion to imperial territories; through the discourses used, spoken, written, and visual, which expressed Scottish identity. This did not exclude, as part of this process, reaffirmation of the local, of British, or of international connections, but suggests at the very least a pervasive sense of Scottishness, if not a privileged place for this.

Opportunities in empire: missionary careers

The development and growth of the missionary movement throughout the 19th century was relatively slow, with numbers and support increasing noticeably from the 1870s onwards. Missionaries can be described as having taken up opportunities created by empire, but not necessarily in pursuit of wealth, or the kind of success and fame usually stressed in accounts of Scots' participation in empire. Religious motivations were afforded a paramount place in missionaries' accounts of their own lives and in those of contemporary biographers. If this might be expected as a conventional representation, it does not mean that such motivations should not be taken seriously. It is, however, also clear from such accounts that professional skills and status, achievements in languages, scholarship and science, were also valued by missionaries, and thus it can be argued that an important motivating factor was the possibility of the status and achievements that might accompany such a professional career. The prospects of travel, and for some of adventure and risk, also appeared to have exercised an appeal. It has also been suggested that distaste for the divisions between the churches at home acted to channel some towards a missionary career. Family traditions also played their part, with, as the 19th century progressed, an increasing proportion of missionaries coming from the families of missionaries and of ministers. In taking up the 'opportunities' offered by empire, missionaries then

1880, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1997.

were likely to have been motivated by a complex combination of factors, from religious and moral aspirations to ‘career building’ strategies.⁴

A distinctive characteristic of missionaries as a group was their relationship to their homeland. Harper has characterised some emigrants as ‘sojourners’, including missionaries among these, defined as those who remained tied to their native land with the hope of returning, in contrast to those emigrating permanently.⁵ Her definition, however, has tended to emphasise those seeking to make a fortune and to better their social position on return home. The tie to the homeland was inherent in the missionary experience, though many seem to have entered on their careers with a view that it would be a life-time’s work, returning home finally only when health or advancing age rendered this necessary. Some preferred to remain in their adopted homes abroad, and many died while still in harness. For missionaries the link to the homeland was an institutional one, and might be deemed to tie them more closely to their native land than the fortune hunter, or other ‘sojourners’, both through its iterative nature and through the identification of the essential purpose of their work with the church at home. This institutional grounding also amplified the impact of missionaries’ accounts and representations of empire, since it provided a ready apparatus through which to broadcast them.

It might also be argued that, though an impact could be made with comparatively small numbers of missionaries, it was necessary for numbers to reach a certain density or ‘critical mass’ for the movement to gain a wider audience than active committee members and supporters, and that it was only at such a time as this kind of recognition developed that idealised representations of missionary heroes or heroines could begin to be formed. That numbers grew very slowly over a period of several decades, and their faster rate of growth thereafter, was indicated by the information published, including names and numbers, in a variety of sources, from the *New Edinburgh Almanac*, through church reports and histories, to the periodicals.

⁴ McLaren uses this idea of ‘career building’ strategies in relation to the careers of Scots administrators in India. See Martha McLaren, *British India and British Scotland, 1780-1830*, Akron, University of Akron Press, 2001.

⁵ Marjory Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles: the Great Scottish Exodus*, London, Profile Books, 2003, p 283.

Though only used in this thesis to illustrate the trends in growth, such data could potentially be used to build up a much more detailed analysis of missionary numbers, length of service, origins and backgrounds, and family connections, for example. The significance of attempting to quantify numbers of missionaries is that, on the one hand, it demonstrates that this experience went well beyond the few individuals who became well-known, and, on the other that, since, in the context of the imperial experience as a whole, their numbers were small, it was precisely the institutional link with the churches at home that made possible the effective transmission and amplification of their experience. That Livingstone could be appropriated as a missionary hero was then not just a function of any individual characteristics or achievements that might be perceived as remarkable or admirable, but rather of the fact that a missionary career had achieved a respectable status within religious and professional life, and that the churches were actively engaged in promoting this.

It has not been the purpose of this research to provide an assessment of the impact of the work of missionaries on colonial territories and peoples. Rather the concern has been with the impact of the representations of their experience on people at home. Nonetheless, it must be recognised that there could be considerable divergence between how missionaries understood and represented their work, and any 'objective' assessment of what actually occurred. In general, missionaries occupied a position that might be described as both morally and politically ambiguous. Within the missionary community a range of opinion and actions were found, with the majority avoiding controversies over rights or political questions.⁶ Despite attempts at defence of missionaries' attitudes there can be no question that they were cultural imperialists, who sought to change the religious beliefs and way of life of the peoples they encountered.⁷ They opposed customs and practices that they perceived as cruel, and in doing so did much to protect individuals' rights and lives. Nonetheless such customs and practices were often seen as central to a society's identity, and such

⁶ For a discussion of missionaries' attitudes towards imperialism, and anti-colonialism, see, for example J H Proctor, 'Scottish Missionaries in India: an Inquiry into Motivation' in *South Asia*, Vol. XIII, no 1, 1990, pp 43-61; and 'The Church of Scotland and British Colonialism in Africa', in *Journal of Church and State*, Vol 29, Autumn, 1987, pp 475-493.

interventions could be very divisive. It is also true that missionaries to some degree identified with the interests and needs of the peoples with whom they worked, and some were prominent advocates of human and political rights, and ultimately of political independence. Taking missionaries as a whole, however, such attitudes were relatively slow to develop, and support for imperialism as such was widespread, though specific aspects of imperial policy might be criticised. Thus unnecessary use of force and military adventurism was likely to meet with condemnation, but not war in all circumstances. Competing attitudes and discourses then characterised the missionary experience. What was presented as a morally pure and altruistic project, was in fact fraught with ambiguity and contradiction. Despite the conventional denial of any engagement with politics, which recurs in both periodicals and biographies, the missionary enterprise helped to sustain and expand empire, unintentionally helped to provide others with the tools with which to dismantle it, and finally joined in the effort to do so.

Dominant themes in missionary discourses

As noted, it was intrinsic to the missionary enterprise that there should be regular communication with supporters at home. The main way in which this was done was through literature, and through public meetings, sermons, addresses and so on. Other media were also used, visual images such as drawings, photographs, or lantern slides, though it is only literature aimed at adults that has been examined in this research. This missionary literature was produced in a number of forms: pamphlets, periodicals, histories, and biographies. The regular production of such literature in Scotland was initiated in the 1820s and grew and diversified throughout the period being studied. By the latter two decades of the 19th century a genre of biographies of missionaries had emerged, and periodicals were reaching a considerable proportion of the members of the three main Presbyterian churches. Authorship of such literature was by missionaries, by active supporters at home, and by leading figures in the churches, and it was by both men and women, though there is a gender difference in both volume and type of literature produced. The production of such

⁷ See, for example, Stuart Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries 1789-1858: the Social Background, Motives and Training of British Protestant Missionaries in India*, Sutton Courtney Press, 1984.

literature was governed by conventions of subject matter and style, in which in general idealised representations of missionaries and their work had as their counterpoint an exaggeratedly negative representation of the beliefs and lives of colonial peoples, though differences in tone, complexity, sentiment and opinion are also observable.

Stylistic conventions and dominant discourses could vary in different types of text. Though religious discourses were dominant in all types, expression and function differed. Pamphlets containing sermons and addresses were heavily imbued with religious rhetoric, with frequent quoting of biblical texts and religious and moral exhortations, which might typically denounce the cruelties and barbarities of superstitious idolaters, and at the same time the lack of Christian feeling and charity at home. Such heightened language, designed to move audiences to action, or at least to put their hands in their pockets, lent itself to exaggeration and to extremes, and tended to suggest that the encounter with other societies and their customs and beliefs engendered moral horror. Within the periodicals a religious discourse was also present, but less prominently so. One might argue that the religious discourses here functioned both to underline the writer's own commitment to their religious beliefs and their moral authority, and to appeal to the religious and moral beliefs of the reader in a way that might both encourage people to active support, and give them a sense of their self-worth in doing so. Histories provided a narrative of institution building, church expansion, and the numbers being Christianised, a description and quantification reflecting the cumulative effect of the more personal accounts of the periodicals. The biographies sought to create a missionary tradition honouring the principles of the reformed kirk, and demonstrating the value of a pious family life and upbringing, as well as personal faith. The idealisation of the religious life of missionaries in biographies occurs in a more pointed and extreme manner than in the periodicals. And yet it might be argued that the persistent focus on religious faith and dedication within the periodicals provided the groundwork for the creation of the stereotyped heroic missionary figure of the popular biography. Such a heroic figure could be inspirational for the reader, while the more mundane representation of the periodicals could provide a point of identification. Taken

together these modes of religious discourse appealed to the religious beliefs and feelings of hearers or readers, stimulated to action or to prayer, reaffirmed the solidarity of the religious community to which they belonged and in which all had a part to play, and provided a moral vision which might guide individual behaviour.

Religious discourses were of course inevitably central to a religious enterprise. Accompanying these, however, were other dominant discourses, such as those of race, gender and class, the latter exemplified by an emphasis on professionalism. Though the function of the periodicals might be described primarily as propaganda, designed to encourage support at home, much of the reporting on missionary work consisted of the description of mundane routines, and the recording of numbers of pupils, baptisms and conversions, and so on. This type of recording might be described as part of a professional discourse, which was also manifested in the emphasis on education and medicine and their benefits. A two-fold function was being performed here, one of accountability, and one of the assertion of professional status. That these dimensions were seen as important at home as well as by missionaries is evidenced by requests for specific types of information and statistics, as the letter books of the SMS and SLA, for example show, and by the stressing in periodicals of the experience and qualifications of missionaries about to embark on their careers. The value of professional qualifications and practice was a persistent theme in the journals and in biographies, both for male and female missionaries, though in the latter case this occurred later in the 19th century when such opportunities were opened up to women. These representations then served to endorse the social status that came with being an educated professional, and suggests that for many a missionary vocation provided a pathway to this. Furthermore, this type of recording and reporting represented not only the construction of professional discourses, but of forms of accountability to the supporters and the churches at home.

In the same way as the emphasis on professional status became more apparent, over time changes in gender roles did so. The presence of women missionaries became more visible, initially more or less restricted to women's periodicals, though later becoming more widely visible with the publicity given to Mary Slessor. This is true

both in terms of there being more women in the mission field taking on a wider range of tasks, and women having a higher profile in public life at home, with there sometimes being discussion or reflection on this changing role. Again these changes become particularly apparent in the later decades of the 19th century, as the evidence of the initiation of women's speaking tours in the 1870s shows. It is less apparent that major changes might be taking place in the lives of women in India or Africa, since the presentation of the task of women missionaries and what they hoped to achieve continued to be the same, the only difference appearing to be that the numbers of girls and women with whom they worked increased, and that Indians and Africans generally became less resistant to the idea of western education.

Conventions in the representation of missionaries stressed their religious faith and their professional skills and competence. There were, of course, also conventions about the representation of others, and if the conventions of the representation of missionaries was to make them out to be rather better than on average they were, whether morally or professionally, then the conventional representation of others was to make them out to be rather worse. This raises a number of questions: the extent to which more complex and nuanced accounts were simplified in the process of being prepared for publication, to what extent what they may have wished to communicate was poorly understood at home, and to what extent there was deliberate distortion and sensationalising. There is evidence to suggest that all of these things happened on occasion, as correspondence in the letter books of the SMS and as comments to the press in the 1900s indicated, with it appearing more likely that distortion and sensationalism was the work of supporters at home. But there is no doubt that missionaries shared a world-view that led them to judgements of other peoples' customs and behaviour that could be partial, harsh and narrow-minded. Even in the less sensational and more quotidian accounts in periodical literature, the description of others as benighted, degraded, brutalised, and, clearly, different, is relentless. Though this is accompanied by a discourse of Christian benevolence towards fellow humans, the effect is to stress difference and inferiority, rather than sameness and equivalence of status as human. This effect is amplified in the biographies, which recount incidents and events which emphasise the exotic, the vicious, or the cruel in

other societies, and which highlight the missionary's heroism or bravery, and provide 'colour' and interest for the reader.

Such discourses can be characterised as 'racist', though there were differences in tone in different types of literature, and over time. Pamphlets might denounce with horror and moral disapprobation the customs and practices of other societies, while the periodicals repeated the terminology of 'superstition', 'idolatry' and 'degradation' endlessly, if less virulently, though theories of racial hierarchy as such did not seem to find a place in their pages. These are however in evidence in some biographies of missionaries and in popular accounts of travels in Africa, such as Henry Drummond's, indicative of a shift from a more moral or religious expression of views of the nature of other societies and their level of civilisation to a more 'scientific' expression, typified by a Social Darwinist position. The periodicals occupied a position somewhere in between moral horror and scientific racism, with there being a sense over time of differences being less shocking because more familiar, but still being persistently described in negative terms. Thus the terminology of 'degradation' that was applied in particular, if not exclusively, to the position of women both in India and in Africa, was present already in the early decades of the 19th century and was still being used as a convenient shorthand at the turn of the century. With respect to Africa there was also evident in the latter decades of the 19th century a questioning of the capacity for Africans to be educated and civilised so as to become like Europeans, and even missionaries, who were supportive of efforts to achieve this transformation, might have their doubts on this question. At the same time it was amongst missionaries that such views were most likely to find opposition.

This is illustrative of the interaction between representations of others produced by missionaries and representations produced in the secular sphere of science and other forms of secular writing. On the one hand representations of the experience of empire and of colonial peoples by missionaries had fed into public consciousness at home over a period of decades, and on the other the transformation of these representations into a so-called 'scientific' theory of racial hierarchy fed back into

missionaries' perceptions and representations of the peoples they encountered. Despite their philanthropy, humanitarianism, and good intentions, missionaries were not immune from explicitly racist views, and it can be argued that they helped to shape them by a persistent representation of European civilisation as superior and of other forms of civilisation as inferior.

If these discourses of religion, professionalism, gender, and of the inferiority of others, were present throughout this period, there were also changes over time. The literature of the earlier decades of the 19th century suggested that deep religious impulses provided an important motivation for foreign missions, whether this was conceived of as atonement for sin, or fulfilling the workings of divine providence, or a personal quest to live up to Christian principles. Later comment on events in the empire or imperial administration seem more based on judgements about what favoured expansion of the missionary enterprise, or judgements about the political wisdom of policies informed by missionaries' views on specific situations, rather than on a purely religious interpretation. Religion always remained present in these discourses, inevitably since it was in essence a religious enterprise, but over time this was counterbalanced by the rise of more secular discourses, of professionalism and science, of changing gender roles, and of racist discourses characterising non-European others as inferior, though it can be hard to disentangle these from the religious and the moral. The view that the position of women needed to change in India and Africa was premised on a view of marriage practices, cultural phenomena such as song and dance, and modes of dress, as immoral, and degrading women. Similarly characterisations of other peoples as superstitious, barbarous, or savage usually entailed attacks on their religious beliefs and associated rituals and customs. In the same way it might be argued that the work ethic which missionaries tried hard to impose on their native converts was in their minds integrally connected to their Christian beliefs.

The representation of themselves as educated professionals became increasingly important in missionary literature, both with reference to descriptions of individuals, their work and the ways in which information on progress was reported back home.

Furthermore recognition was given to contributions to scholarship in languages, linguistics and translation, to the expansion of scientific knowledge in geography, geology, zoology, botany and medicine, and to the application of science and technology to exploration and to missionary work. This was particularly apparent in the speeches to RSGS meetings quoted in the *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, and in the biographies of the late 19th and early 20th century, and in press reporting of events such as the World Missionary Conference in 1910 and the Livingstone Centenary of 1913. This changing mood can be seen as reflective of social change: industrialisation, urbanisation, the rise of the middle classes, and, also the expansion of the role of Scots within the empire.

There were apparent in missionary literature, then, as well as religious discourses, those of race, gender and class. All of these may be said to project markers of identity that were particularly significant to this group of people. Such markers of identity can consist of descriptive labels, or of beliefs and values to which people subscribe; they can be expressed explicitly or implicitly; they can be claimed as distinctive of the group to which the speaker or writer belongs, or they can be implied through contrast with 'others'. The kinds of collectivities of which membership is claimed through such markers of identity can include the territorially based, ethnic, national, supranational, religious, and cultural, as well as those of class and gender. Within the literature by and about missionaries, a particular set of terms or descriptions frequently recurred: European; British, English, or Scottish; Christian; and civilised. Similarly, the values that are said to be characteristic of this group were frequently referred to: a belief in the importance of literacy and education; the work ethic; and a particular conception of gender relations and sexual morality. The key elements of this latter may be described as sexual modesty, monogamy, a gender division of labour which privileged domesticity for women and a bread-winner role for men, but which also construed marriage as a form of 'partnership'. Again, it is the periodical literature which plays a significant role in establishing the prevalence of such discourses. Though they are also present in pamphlets, in speeches at annual meetings and general assemblies, and in biographies, it is their presence in the periodical literature that indicates the

pervasiveness of particular representations of self and other, since this illustrates the extent to which they were regularly repeated over a long period of time. It illustrates too that while such representations were reflective of social and political change at home, whether through the increased salience of their presentation of missionaries as representative of the educated professional middle classes in the later decades of the 19th century, or through reflecting the growing enthusiasm for imperialism in the same period, there was an asymmetry in their failure to reflect social change abroad. The frequency and regularity that characterises periodical literature is at the same time evidence of how ideas of empire could permeate everyday life.

Scotland as an exemplar of Christian European civilisation

Missionaries frequently represented themselves as Christian, European and civilised, terms that implied the beliefs and behaviour outlined above. The use of these terms then placed Scots as members of supranational collectivities, or suggested Scotland as a representative member of such collectivities, which were being defined in contrast with the peoples of India and Africa, and believers in other religions. In doing so, differences within these groups were submerged, though were likely to have been understood as implicit. That Protestantism was the form of Christianity alluded to could be taken for granted, just as Presbyterianism as the model being exported could be taken for granted. Since periodical literature, following the Disruption, was produced on denominational lines, denomination was also often taken for granted. Thus, though the general terms of Christianity and Christian were commonly used they usually had a more particular meaning, pertaining to that form of Christianity practised in Scotland, and to a particular denomination. Nonetheless, the use of the general terms also indicated a sense of belonging to a wider international grouping, with similarity to other members of this group being claimed together with an expressed desire for co-operation.

Similarly, 'European' was used as a common term to distinguish missionaries and the collectivity to which they belonged, in contrast to the peoples of India, Africa, and other colonial territories, and often appeared to function as a collective term for white people. As a description of people, it was therefore inclusive of those of

European origin, whether from south or north. As a description of culture or civilisation, it is however implicit that a particular version of Europeanness was being referred to. References to European co-religionists indicated Scots links to and identification with Protestant northern Europeans, in other parts of Britain, and in Denmark, Holland, Germany, and Switzerland, for example. Thus the European identity expressed may be seen to privilege Protestant northern Europe over Catholic southern Europe. The term 'European' was frequently linked to the term 'civilisation', though the latter was often used simply by itself. This implied, in addition to the values outlined above, particular forms of knowledge and culture, in which 'European' science was prominent. Where 'civilisation' was used on its own, the Europeanness is implicit. This is made evident where other countries and continents were deemed to also have 'civilisations', such as India and China, albeit civilisations regarded as being decayed or arrested in their development.

Scottish missionaries then frequently positioned themselves as representatives of Christian European civilisation. This located Scotland both as a member of a group and as an exemplar of a type of civilisation, regarded as the highest form. This claim was asserted with great self-confidence, reflecting the view that, with the pacification and 'civilisation' of the Highlands, Scotland had become a fully civilised country, and also perhaps reflecting the anxiety of Scots to put a troubled past behind them, as the use by Alexander Duff and others of the analogy of the civilisation and education of the Highlands as a model for Bengal suggests. That Scots missionaries needed to reassure themselves on this point might help to account for their cultural aggression.⁸

If these discourses presented Scotland as an exemplar of European civilisation, they also emphasised defining characteristics of Scottish society. Those characteristics that might be regarded as most clearly and distinctively Scottish were the form of Christianity that was practised and that was being exported, that is not just Protestantism but Presbyterianism. Presbyterianism was not unique to Scotland, and

⁸ Piggin describes Scottish missionaries as 'among the most confident and dogmatic of British missionaries', a characteristic which he ascribes to the system of education in Scotland, and which led them to 'equate cultural aggression with missionary activity'. See Piggin, *Making Evangelical Missionaries*, p 220.

indeed there were English Presbyterians, but Presbyterianism in other countries was largely a product of the Scots diaspora. Education too was seen as having a distinctively Scottish character, in terms of the value placed upon it, the level achieved, and the system practised. Again, while neither the attitude to education nor its success were unique to Scotland, they were a matter of national pride, and thus can be described as having ‘become a marker of Scottish identity, associated with various qualities of the Scottish character such as individualism, social ambition, respect for talent above birth’.⁹ Such definitions of the nature of civilised society and behaviour, however, were not only exclusive of the ‘heathen’ others abroad, but also of many members of Scottish society, whether the ‘savages’ of the Canongate or the ‘street Arabs’ of the Cowgate. Furthermore, they excluded other Christian believers in Scotland, in particular the growing Catholic population.

Scottish identity and the divided Presbyterian churches

It is argued, then, that in the context of empire Presbyterianism was indissolubly linked with a Scottish national identity, and functioned as a marker of this in the discourses of missionary literature. Is this consistent with the divided nature of the church at home, and the organisation of missionary activity on denominational lines? The experience of the missionary movement reflected the divisions in the kirk at home, in the first instance the division between moderates and evangelicals in the late 18th and early 19th centuries, in which the former resisted the missionary ardour of the latter. This pattern of support carried through into the post-Disruption period, where the more evangelical churches sustained missionary endeavour on a larger scale. The divisions between the churches were sometimes a matter for comment or of tension in the context of missionary activity, but it is notable that in missionary literature of various kinds more commonly a desire for co-operation was expressed, particularly since evidence of conflict between Christian churches abroad was deemed to undermine missionary efforts at conversion. Furthermore, in a context where the task of Christianising posed a severe challenge and where like minded individuals engaged in a similar enterprise might be thin on the ground, denominational differences and the niceties of theological disputes had less

⁹ R D Anderson, *Scottish Education since the Reformation*, Economic and Social History Society of

importance than they might at home. Such an attitude was even more encouraged by the waves of revivalist enthusiasm that occurred in the late 19th century, with their emphasis on emotional approaches to religion, and which in turn made their impact felt in missionary practice. This attitude towards co-operative relationships abroad also influenced attitudes at home, since leading missionaries and their supporters favoured the reunion of the churches and promoted ecumenicalism.

The growth in such attitudes was however a slow process, and between the Disruption and the 1870s, there was little in the way of formal co-operation by missionary supporters at home, even if missionaries in the field worked together. Despite the frequently expressed approval for co-operation, it is possible to detect evidence of the contested claims between the Church of Scotland and the Free Church as to which was the 'true' national church. This was most apparent in the presentation in biographies of leading Free Church missionaries as the heirs of John Knox and the reformed kirk. Paradoxically, then the divisions between the Presbyterian churches might lead to a greater emphasis on their Scottish character for a domestic audience because of this rivalry, while at the same time, within the context of empire co-operation between Scottish missionaries might serve to emphasise their common Presbyterian tradition and antecedents in the Reformation, the Covenanting tradition and so on. Forms of worship and of church government, the emphasis on literacy and education, and the values governing family and personal life, were also shared. Divided though the churches were, their desire to identify themselves as Scottish and as heirs to the Reformation, together with their common Presbyterianism, served to generate a common Scottish identity grounded in this Presbyterianism, and thus Presbyterianism could serve as a guarantor of Scottish national identity. The evidence of representations of Scottish national identity within the context of the missionary enterprise in empire thus supports the contention that Presbyterianism played an important role 'in articulating Scotland's sense of self',¹⁰ and that in this context such an identity was not undermined by the divisions at home.

Scotland, 1997, p 2.

¹⁰ Colin Kidd, 'Race, Empire, and the limits of nineteenth-century Scottish nationhood', in *The Historical Journal*, 46, 4, 2003, pp 873-892, p 877.

Gender and national identity

It has been argued in this thesis that gender relations were a central preoccupation of missionary work, and that representations of these, and in particular the position of women, were present throughout the period. The question to be addressed here is how did these representations of gender relations, and of women's role in particular, articulate with representations of national identity. This is a question that can be posed in a number of ways: was there an explicit characterisation as Scottish of an idealised view of womanhood, gender roles, or sexual morality, for example; were there gender differences in the way in which national identity was articulated; how were women and men located within a Scottish missionary tradition?

However distorted or unrepresentative we might judge it to be, it is clear that a view of women and men as free and equal, if different, was counterposed by missionaries and their supporters at home to a view of women abroad as enslaved and kept in an inferior position for the benefit of men. These conceptualisations of women's role and gender relations were not explicitly characterised as Scottish. Rather they were seen to be characteristic of European civilisation. It can of course be argued that such a construction is implicitly Scottish in that it is inflected and influenced by Presbyterianism, both in terms of religious belief and practice, and in terms of personal morality, sexual or otherwise. Similarly the high value placed on education was nourished by the Scottish kirk and society, and was shared by women, notwithstanding inequalities in access throughout the period. This is particularly apparent in the periodicals in women's work where women missionaries give accounts of their daily routine, usually as teachers of girls, and sometimes as doctors, and where women themselves demonstrate pride in their qualifications and skills. In the few biographies of women in this period their commitment to educating themselves is also stressed, though in the early case of Margaret Wilson in the 1830s her accomplishment as a middle class woman resulted from attendance at classes given at Aberdeen University, whereas the later examples of both Mrs Sutherland and Mary Slessor were of women of humble origins for whom the acquisition of education was a much greater challenge. These latter examples are of course

consonant with the tradition of the openness to merit of the Scottish education system even if what was offered to girls and women was not the same as what was offered to boys and men. Despite the expression of such values being in line with a 'Scottish' tradition the contrast made with the lives of women in India and Africa is not described in terms of contrasts with Scottish women and society specifically, though they may indeed be using their own experience as the point of contrast, but rather with reference to ideas of European in contrast to Indian or African, or to civilised in contrast to superstitious, barbarous or savage. This suggests that the form of gender relations to which people subscribed was, at least in its essential characteristics, perceived to be common to a number of societies, which might be described as civilised Christian countries, primarily European, but also North America and so on. On the basis of this evidence, then, there is no explicit claim made of Scottish womanhood or a specific Scottish form of gender relations or 'gender contract'.

Women articulated a Scottish identity in ways largely similar to men. Thus in the periodical literature women expressed their attachment to Scotland through recalling the homeland, were engaged in reproducing it symbolically abroad, subscribed to the values of Presbyterianism and of education, utilised the term 'Scotland' and related terms, as well as other 'national' names, and made reference to a Scottish missionary tradition, though female icons are largely absent from this in the period being studied. These women, whether writing about themselves, or being written about, made clear that they had a Scottish identity, even though they laid claim to membership of other types of collectivities. They believed in the values of Scottish society, supported its institutions, and tried to impose these on women in other countries, as in a parallel way at home middle class women imposed their values on working class girls and women through their philanthropic activity.

In the process of creating a missionary tradition, in which missionary heroes were located in the traditions of the Scottish kirk, such locating was consistently done in the case of men, so that their Scottishness was defined by their being heirs to this tradition as much as by characteristics and values deemed to be typically Scottish.

Women were not located in this tradition in the same way, being located in a specific missionary tradition, rather than in the wider tradition of the reformed church. There were some differences both in how male and female missionaries represented themselves, and in how they were represented by others, in particular in the stress on caring for others and on professionalism. This reflected the gender division of labour, but this also changed over time, as women gained more access to professional jobs. The location of men and women as representatives of missionary dedication and achievement can thus be conceived of as a spectrum on which there was considerable overlap, rather than as a binary division. What differentiated men and women most in biographical writing were achievements in the field of professional expertise, science and exploration, though it is apparent in the periodical literature that professional status mattered to women. This evidence confirms a masculine bias in icons of Scottishness, even if women were not excluded from being inspired by male icons, or from aspiring to similar virtues as men, or to professional status. This bias reflected the reality of gender relations and gendered access to education, employment and the professions.

Scottish and British identities

A major purpose of this research was to investigate how in the context of empire Scots articulated their identity, national or otherwise. Above, key markers of identity which were salient in writings by and about missionaries have been discussed. These indicated that missionaries perceived themselves and were perceived by others to be members of several collectivities, and also indicated how a Scottish identity might be expressed, implicitly or explicitly in relation to these. Empire has been commonly regarded as having helped to create and to consolidate a British identity, though a Scottish identity is regarded as having continued to co-exist with this. The character of their relationship has been the subject of debate, and it is this theme I wish to explore in this section.

The evidence of the missionary literature analysed in preceding chapters suggests that the usages and interplay of terms such as 'Scottish', 'British' and 'English' was in general differentiated, with 'Scottish' and related terms having a wider range of

functions. A Scottish identity was more strongly present in these texts than a British identity, and there is no doubt that through the utilisation of these means of expression this group shared a collective identity as 'Scottish', nor any doubt that this was shared by their readership and understood as an 'imagined community' of which they were all members. Nonetheless, terms such as 'British' and 'English' do not appear to be competing terms, but are used in complementary ways, to address particular audiences in an inclusive way on the one hand, or to designate specific types of phenomena on the other e.g. the state, government, etc, in the case of 'British', and culture, society, manners, etc, in the case of 'English'. Attachments to homeland, kin, landscape, places and people, and symbols of nationality, such as historical figures or traditions, especially religious ones, were all 'Scottish'.

This evidence is consistent with Crick's view that there is a difference of function and meaning in the uses of 'British', and 'Scottish', and indeed 'English', and also that 'Britishness' had a more limited connotation, referring largely to the state and its manifestations, symbols, apparatus, and so on.¹¹ Similarly it is consistent with Morton's view of a Scottish national identity 'maintained through the institutions and civic culture of civil society', alongside an identity of British patriotism.¹² The question is whether both can be described as 'national' identities. On the one hand the difference in function and meaning suggests these are largely different conceptualisations. On the other hand the fact that the terms 'British' and, on occasion, 'English' are used to describe collectivities to which Scots see themselves as belonging suggests that they do sometimes function in the same way. Given that there does not appear to be a complete separation in function and meaning between 'Scottish' and 'British', it is difficult to find a substitute for the idea of 'dual nationality' or 'dual national identity', even though it can be argued that these concepts should be handled with care. Similarly the idea of 'superimposition' of one identity on another requires careful use, though if 'superimposition' is understood as 'lightly lying on top of' a much more substantial and grounded identity, rather than

¹¹ See Bernard Crick, 'Essay on Britishness' in *Scottish Affairs*, No 2 Winter, 1993, pp 71-83.

¹² Graeme Morton, 'What if?: the significance of Scotland's missing nationalism in the nineteenth century, in Dauvit Broun, R J Finlay, and Michael Lynch (eds), *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the ages*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1998, p 169.

something that covers and suppresses, then this may be a justifiable description of the relationship of British to Scottish identities.¹³

Is this evidence consistent with Colley's view of Protestantism and empire 'forging' a British identity? Colley is of course writing about the 18th and early 19th centuries, whereas the evidence considered here pertains to 19th and early 20th century discourses of identity. This evidence indicates that both Protestantism and a British identity were present in the discourses of missionaries and of missionary enterprise. But it also suggests that both the specific Scottish form of Protestantism and a Scottish national identity were given a greater emphasis in these discourses. Thus if a British identity was sustained by empire, a Scottish identity nonetheless remained more important to this group of people both at home and in an imperial context. As MacKenzie has commented, empire may have not so much forged a British identity, through 'welding together a common imperial tradition', as preserved 'a plurality of British identities',¹⁴ and thus in fact preserved and strengthened 'the distinctive identities of the Scots and the other ethnicities of Greater Britain'.¹⁵ The evidence examined in this thesis is consistent with this view, and gives the lie to any notion of an 'overarching' British identity binding Scottish and British identities together. It is important to emphasise, however, that 'national' identity was only one marker of identity among a repertoire of key markers consistently deployed in these discourses, of which the most salient were of religion, race, gender and class. The pattern of shifting positions between such markers, or facets, of identity, invalidates any notions of layers of identity, or concentric identities, or loyalties, which suggest both a fixed and a hierarchical relationship.

The benefit of exploring expressions of national identity within the context of empire, rather than in an exclusively British context, is that it illustrates the ways in which shifts between claiming difference and similarity occur. Such discourses involve a complex process of negotiation of different positions, that move between

¹³ See David McCrone, 'Unmasking Britannia: the rise and fall of British national identity' in *Nations and Nationalism*, 3 (4), pp 579-596.

¹⁴ MacKenzie, 'Empire and National Identities', p 230.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p 231.

claims of similarity and difference, as a way of affirming membership of several 'imagined communities' while seeking recognition for distinctive group identities. These shifting positions throw up different sets of complementary and contrasting expressions of identity. Thus in the context of empire, where the 'others' in relation to whom identity was often being expressed were Indian or African, for example, the terms 'British', 'English' and 'Scottish' were linked together within the wider framework of Christian European civilisation. At the same time within Britain or the British state, even in the context of a common cause, difference could be expressed, as could difference within Scottish society.

The missionary enterprise in secular representations of Scottish national identity

As representations of the missionary enterprise passed into the secular sphere, they became particularly focussed on the aspect of Scottish leadership, the contribution to exploration and to science, the contribution to the expansion of imperial territories, and on the abolition of the slave-trade in central Africa. This is apparent from debates within the RSGS, press coverage, and the exhibits of missionaries and their work in international exhibitions. While a religious discourse was not absent from these representations, what was particularly emphasised was the Scottish contribution to empire, its benefits to education and learning, and its moral nature. This might be interpreted as suggesting that religion and education together made a morally superior contribution to empire than those of military or political power.

A common theme in the literature on Scots' participation in the empire is that Scots were proud of their contribution to empire, a claim made most often in relation to the military contribution, but also put forward in relation to Livingstone and other missionaries.¹⁶ The work of missionaries, their 'civilising' mission, and scientific achievements, can be seen as having been appropriated for such expressions of national pride, though this required the mediation of others, whether supporters at home, or leading figures in the churches and civil society. Missionaries themselves might feel more ambivalent about their achievements, especially judged in the light

of their ambitions for Christianisation, more ambivalent about the character of imperial administration, and more critical of those at home for the lukewarmness of their support. However, the mythologisation of Livingstone, and the claims of Scottish leadership of the missionary enterprise, indicate how this appropriation occurred. In particular this process is made apparent through tracking how Livingstone was represented over time in the press, and how he became the touchstone of missionary inspiration in the genre of biographies that arose after his death. Both press coverage and the biographies mutually reinforced the Livingstone myth, and the tendency to represent others as men mostly, and women sometimes, of the same stamp, even if paler imitations. Similarly the currency such representations had is in evidence in the pages of the *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, interpreted of course with an appropriately scientific emphasis.

It also seems plausible to suggest that the relationship of missionary activity to territorial expansion in Africa was crucial in this process. Central to the concept of empire is the acquisition of and rule over territories beyond the bounds of the original 'imagined community', whether this is designated a nation, a state, or both. In Africa missionaries, notably Livingstone, helped to discover territories that could become the object of imperial ambition, and missionaries subsequently helped intentionally to open the way to white settlement in these territories, even if white settlers did not always behave in ways of which missionaries approved. Thus the fact that there were identifiable territories being acquired by the empire as a result of the actions of Scots, came together with the role of distinctively Scottish institutions to crystallise in a notion of a specific Scottish contribution to empire.

Given that the latter part of the 19th century was a period in which nationalism was more in evidence in politics and civil society, in which the governance of Scotland was changing with the creation of the Scottish Office, and in which home rule was being debated, it can be argued that the capacity to appropriate such representations for the assertion of national pride was particularly welcome in this context. The missionary enterprise lent itself to this, embedded as it was in distinctively Scottish

¹⁶ See, for example, Richard Finlay, 'The rise and fall of popular imperialism in Scotland, 1850-1950'

institutions, and reflecting values widely supported in Scottish society, such as the value of education, self-help, and respectability. Furthermore it entailed achievements of a secular as well as of a religious nature, which in turn could be seen to exemplify the levels of education and scientific progress achieved by Scottish society. That the experience of the missionary movement could be utilised to assert a Scottish national identity in the imperial context resulted then from the coming together of a number of factors: the distinctively Scottish Presbyterian form of religion and institutional framework, which in this context could be perceived as unifying, notwithstanding divisions at home; the maturation of a movement in terms size, the creation of a tradition, and visible emblems of its success; the secular and political, as well as religious, impact of this movement; the power and influence of its leadership; and the desire to assert a Scottish national identity in the face of the changes taking place in the machinery of government in Scotland. It can also be argued that it was appropriated by both nationalists and imperialists for different reasons: nationalists to emphasise the Scottish contribution to empire as a matter of 'national pride', and imperialists as a way of demonstrating to Scots that their interests lay with empire. That these formulations of Scottish identity were claims being advanced by particular groups in Scottish society, and that they excluded many members of that society, is evident from both the religious and the class identity which informed them. However, they served well enough for powerful interest groups to make use of them in projecting their vision of the nation.

Conclusion

From the earliest days of Scottish foreign mission efforts a Scottish identity was expressed in literature about the missionary experience, intended for an audience of supporters at home in Scotland. This identity was expressed alongside a British identity, but in general was privileged over it. The expression of such a Scottish identity was manifested in a range of ways, within the routine and banal accounts of everyday experience of missionaries lives in correspondence or periodical literature, and within mythologising and idealising texts such as biographies. The salience of explicit representations of Scottish identity became more pronounced in later

in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1, March, 1997, pp 13-21.

literature, especially in biographies of leading missionaries. Representations of the Scottish missionary experience and achievements were simplified in the process of transmission into the secular sphere, emphasised the Scottish contribution to empire, and were more biased towards the masculine. Such representations of the missionary experience illustrated the role of middle class professionals in contributing to intellectual, scientific, and medical advances. The way in which these representations were reproduced and appropriated at home suggests that the church-going middle classes had a strong attachment to their Scottish identity, and were keen to assert this. It also suggests that the experience of empire contributed to Scots' self-confidence and self-esteem, and to a stronger emphasis on their Scottish identity in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

The evidence examined in this thesis confirms the assumption that religion and the churches played an important role both in carrying a sense of Scottish national identity and in mediating an understanding of empire, indeed, within civil society the key role in doing so. This research demonstrates the importance of religious and moral concerns as a motive for individuals in taking an active role in engaging with empire, and that it was such motives which initiated collective forms of action and sustained them throughout the 19th and into the 20th century. This should not be understood simply as a Christian desire to do good, but rather as a way of viewing the world that asserted the superiority of a particular form of civilisation, and encouraged people to think that they had been accorded through divine intervention the duty to imprint this civilisation across the globe. That religion should play such a powerful role in shaping people's world view and motivating them would necessarily have been the case, insofar as religion, as Hastings has argued, is constitutive of the nation.¹⁷ Thus it was inevitably religious life and organisations that would interpret and seek to control the changes brought about in the nation's life through its imperial partnership with England.

¹⁷ See Adrian Hastings, *The Construction of Nationhood: Ethnicity, Religion and Nationalism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1997.

The evangelical energy that characterised 19th century Scotland can be interpreted as an example of religion's power to stimulate self-renewal,¹⁸ notwithstanding the divisions between the churches at home. In the context of empire, in particular, a common Presbyterianism could project a renewed vision of Scottish national identity. Missionary societies and the churches were uniquely placed within civil society to continuously support a form of imperial intervention and the dissemination of information and propaganda about it, thereby ensuring that 'the Empire penetrated to everyday life'.¹⁹ They thus provided a key means by which the impact of empire was felt at home, and which shaped Scots' ideas of themselves and their place in the world. This was effected through the centrality of religious beliefs in the nation's life, the organisational forms of the churches and the reach of their membership, the power and status of their leadership in Scottish society, and through the location of the missionary enterprise in the historical traditions of the reformed kirk.

This research supports the view that alongside the military contribution of Scots to the empire, the missionary enterprise also came to be seen as a cause for national pride. However, if these discourses might be seen as congruent or complementary on the whole in this period, particularly when imperialist enthusiasm was at its height, they were also quite different in certain respects. Though the stereotype of the heroic missionary, showing bravery in the face of danger, could be, like that of the soldier, a virile image, the primary emphasis in such discourses was on peace, education, and civilisation. In this sense they could be seen to be in contradiction to a discourse of martial prowess and military victory. And if the image most associated with the military was that of the Highlander, the missionary was a member of the urban middle classes, or aspiring to be such, in education, manners, and dress. The discourses and symbols of militarism and of the missionary enterprise reflected a different class and social base, and were grounded in different historical traditions.

A key difference between these discourses was their gendered character, and the extent to which women were included in or excluded from them. Many accounts of

¹⁸ See Anthony Smith, *National Identity*, London, Penguin, 1991, p 35.

¹⁹ Lindsay Paterson, *The Autonomy of Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1994, p 51.

empire tend to have a masculine bias, sometimes necessarily so, but this is also partly a function of the tendency to concentrate on the careers of administrators, soldiers, governors, entrepreneurs, and so on. Empire was not, however, a wholly masculine enterprise, but one in which women also played an active part in shaping and imagining. This research has highlighted the importance of gender relations within the Scottish experience of empire, both as a focus of missionary and philanthropic endeavours, and as a sphere of action for women as missionaries abroad and activists in public life at home. Given women's restricted access to political and public life in this period, it is not surprising that it is the investigation of civil society that particularly reveals their active role. This in turn serves to emphasise the importance of civil society in the organisation and regulation of social relations including gender relations. Furthermore, the inclusion of the experience of women also serves to indicate how wide an impact empire had on Scottish life.

This research also supports the view that in this period Scottish and British identities appeared to be complementary rather than competing, though it has been argued that these terms differed considerably in function and meaning, and thus that these expressions might be best understood as expressing a 'national' identity on the one hand, and loyalty to a state, or patriotism, on the other. It has also been argued that identities are relational and require difference, whether implied or made explicit, to establish a definition of any particular identity, and that the major focus of difference in the imperial context was the 'others' of empire, rather than the 'others' contained by the metropolitan state. Nonetheless a Scottish identity was not just present in these discourses, but privileged. It can be argued that a Scottish identity is so clearly present in missionary discourses precisely because the movement was grounded in distinctively Scottish institutions, and that this sense of belonging was continually reaffirmed through the associational activity of the members of these institutions. For this reason also the missionary enterprise furnished an identifiably Scottish contribution to empire. In turn this facilitated its appropriation within the secular sphere as part of a 'nationalist' consciousness.

This thesis has aimed to explore the general question of the impact of Scottish participation in the British empire on conceptions of Scottish national identity. In doing so it has addressed a particular mode of participation in the empire and the mechanisms through which this was understood at home. At best then it can claim to have analysed the process by which specific discourses relating to the experience of missionaries were produced and consumed, and how these informed a view of a Scottish contribution to empire. What might be described as a missionary discourse overall was one of a number of co-existing discourses contributing to the formation of Scottish identity, and even within this overall discourse there were co-existing, and to some extent, competing discourses. This illustrates the complexity of the process of constructing and claiming identity, and underlines the need to take care in making general statements about the character of Scottish national identity at any given time. Such an identity is not a unified or unitary conception, universally shared by all members of the 'imagined community' of the Scottish nation, though it can be argued that some constructions of national identity have a wider currency than others, and can evoke a powerful response across social groups, gender, and time. It is argued here that the missionary experience of empire, embedded as it was in the institutional and organisational frameworks of the main Scottish Presbyterian churches, over time produced symbols and representations of Scottish identity and of a Scottish contribution to empire that received a wide endorsement both in the religious and the secular sphere, from the late 19th century into the early decades of the 20th century.

That such a formulation of Scottish national identity was both fashioned and seized upon by others in the later decades of the 19th century can be explained by a combination of factors. In general the 19th century was a period of rapid and extensive social change which witnessed urbanisation, industrialisation and the growth of the working classes, thus creating anxiety about the urban poor and social disorder. Gender roles were also changing in both middle and working classes, and the greater visibility of women in the public sphere could generate anxiety, whether fear of professional competition or of unruly women factory workers. The Presbyterian churches were confronted in the later decades of the 19th century both

with the loss of power that came from the state's assumption of responsibility for education, and of the threat of an expanding Catholic population. In the same period, the administrative machinery for governing Scotland was being renegotiated with the creation of the Scottish Office in 1885, and debates on further change and possible models of Home Rule were ongoing. All of these factors might lead various groups in Scottish society to look for ways of renegotiating and reasserting their position and power. On the one hand the projection of the idealised images of self-help, of which Livingstone was the supreme example, could serve the purpose of social control for the lower orders, while on the other the projection of the success of the civilising mission of the Scottish churches could demonstrate the power of the churches and the middle classes to control and civilise colonial peoples. The missionary movement also provided a sphere of action to compensate for the loss of control over education at home, and provided a mechanism for containing the tensions potentially arising from changing gender roles, through promoting for middle class women a role in forms of social control at home and abroad. The appropriation of the missionary enterprise as a representation of a Scottish contribution to empire then functioned to reassert the power and authority of the middle classes and the Presbyterian churches at a time of social and political change.

Appendix I

Edinburgh-based missionary societies, 1796-1914*

Date of foundation	Society or committee	Date ended if before 1914
1796	Scottish Missionary Society	c.1890
c.1800	Edinburgh Auxiliary, London Missionary Society	
c.1800	Edinburgh Association in Aid of Moravian Missions	
1825	Edinburgh University Missionary Association	
c.1830	Edinburgh Church of England Missionary Association	c.1880
1837	Edinburgh Ladies' Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India	Split in 1843
1841	Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society	
1843	Scottish Ladies' Association for the Advancement of Female Education in India, C of S	Incorporated into Woman's Guild
1843	Female Society of the Free Church of Scotland for Promoting Christian Education Among the Females of India	Incorporated into Women's Foreign Mission Committee of Free Church
1843	New College Missionary Society	
1846	Missionary Association of Scottish Episcopalians	
c.1850	United Presbyterian Students' Missionary Society in the University of Edinburgh	Listed only in 1850s
c.1860	Wesleyan Association Home and Foreign Missionary Society	Listed only in 1860s
c.1870	South American Missionary Society	Listed only in 1870s
c.1880	Edinburgh Diocesan Association for Promotion of Foreign Missions	
c.1890	Anglo-Indian Evangelisation Society, (later British in India Mission)	
c.1890	Scottish Auxiliary, China Mission, Presbyterian Church of England	
c.1890	Edinburgh Auxiliary to the Church Missionary Society	
c.1900	Edinburgh Free Church Juvenile Missionary Association	Listed only in 1900s

* These are listed in chronological order of dates of foundation. This list has been compiled from listings in the New Edinburgh Almanac.

Appendix II

Membership of Edinburgh missionary societies and church foreign mission committees

Note on sources

The examples below serve to illustrate some characteristics of the patterns of membership of missionary supporters in Edinburgh. The data have been drawn from a range of sources, and provide ‘snapshots’ at particular points in time. To map such patterns of membership, or track them over time, would present considerable challenges, for a number of reasons. Data are not given in a consistent form in sources such as the *New Edinburgh Almanac* over time, for example, details of Ladies’ Auxiliary memberships are not always given, and addresses are often not listed. Sources which provide both names and addresses of at least some members, such as the Scottish Ladies’ Association annual reports are few, and while listings of men and women in their respective committees and associations often contain people with the same surname, to establish with certainty the nature of the relationships between them might often prove difficult. For these reasons, only illustrative examples have been drawn together here, though there would be scope for a mapping exercise using such data.

Members of the Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Negro Slavery with membership of missionary societies

The following data, drawn from C Duncan Rice, *The Scots Abolitionists*, (see Appendix B, Philanthropic Activities of Edinburgh Abolitionists, 1835, pp 203-205) indicate overlapping membership of the Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Negro Slavery in 1835 with various missionary associations. Of thirty members of the committee, Rice was able to obtain details of memberships of societies of twenty of these. Of these seven were also members of missionary societies. These are shown in the table below.

Name	Denominational affiliation – if known	Missionary society membership
Rev Robert Gordon	Church of Scotland	Edinburgh Society in Aid of Moravian Missions; Church of Scotland Committee for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts
Rev E Craig	Episcopalian	Edinburgh Society in Aid of Moravian Missions; Church of England Missionary Association
R K Greville, LLD	Episcopalian	Church of England Missionary Association; Scottish Missionary Society
A Macaulay, MD	Episcopalian	Scottish Missionary Society
R Huie, MD		Edinburgh Society in Aid of Moravian Missions
Captain Rose (Governor of Prison)	Church of Scotland	Scottish Missionary Society
P Tennent, WS	Church of Scotland	Scottish Missionary Society

Members of the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society and membership of other missionary committees

Information on the membership of the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Societies derived from histories (Lowe, Lechmere Taylor, Wilkinson) and listings in selected years in the *New Edinburgh Almanac* indicates overlaps with missionary societies and church committees. Several of these members were long serving members of EMMS, and some were likely to have also been long serving members of the other committees listed, though only a ‘snapshot’ picture is given here.

Society/committee	Name	Date of listing
Scottish Missionary Society	Dr John Abercrombie	1837
Scottish Missionary Society	Dr William Beilby	1837
Edinburgh Society in Aid of Moravian Missions	Rev G D Cullen	1841
Edinburgh Auxiliary LMS	Rev G D Cullen	1841
Scottish Ladies' Association (Church of Scotland)	Mrs Handyside	1847
Scottish Ladies' Association (Church of Scotland)	Hon. Mrs Mackenzie	1847
Free Church Female Society	Kenneth Macqueen	1860
Free Church Female Society	Dr John Pringle	1886
Free Church of Scotland Foreign Missions Committee	Dr John Moir	1878
Free Church of Scotland Foreign Missions Committee	Benjamin Bell	1878
Free Church of Scotland Foreign Missions Committee	Dr John Pringle	1878
Free Church of Scotland Foreign Missions Committee	Professor Sir Thomas Grainger Stewart	1878
Church of Scotland Foreign Missions Committees	Rev John McMurtrie	1899
Edinburgh University Missionary Association	Sir William Muir	1899

Place of residence and family links

Addresses were listed on occasion for EMMS' members and for the Ladies' Auxiliary in the annual reports of the society. These are indicative of the concentration of membership in the New Town. EMMS' also had members in Leith, with two of its leading members being based in Leith, Dr John Coldstream and the Rev G D Cullen. Addresses listed for members in 1848 included Charlotte Square, Northumberland Street, George Street, and York Place. For example, Dr Omond and Miss Pringle both lived in Charlotte Square; Dr and Mrs Beilby, and Dr Ransford lived in Northumberland Street; and Dr and Mrs Handyside, and Dr and Miss Abercrombie in York Place. The EMMS listings are also indicative of family links, such as spouses, parents and daughters, all holding membership.

Membership of the committee of the Church of Scotland Scottish Ladies' Association for Female Education in India, 1846-7.

Scottish Ladies' Association for Female Education in India, 8th Annual Report, 1846

Patronesses	
The Most Noble the Marchioness of Bute	Lady Maxwell of Calderwood
The Most Noble the Marchioness of Lorne	Lady Anstruther of Balcaskie
The Right Hon the Lady Christian Douglas	Lady Dalrymple Fergusson of Kilkerran
The Right Hon Lady Belhaven	Mrs Pringle of Whytbank
The Right Hon Lady Ruthven	Mrs Murray of Aytoun
The Hon Mrs Mackenzie	Mrs Anstruther of Tillicoultry
Presidents	
The Rev Dr Brunton, Convener	Rev Dr Arnot
Rev Dr Muir	Rev Mr Stevenson
Rev Mr Hunter	Rev Mr Nisbet
Rev Mr Paul	Rev Dr Robertson
Rev Mr Glover	Rev Dr Crawford
Rev Mr Veitch	Rev N McLeod
Rev Mr Cochrane	
General Committee	
Mrs Aitken, 22 Broughton Place	Mrs John Paul, 13 George Square
Mrs Anstruther, 42 Moray Place	Mrs Robertson, 2 Maitland Street
Mrs B Bell, 22 Forth Street	Mrs Stevenson, 26 Clarence Street
Mrs Major Brown, 6 Rutland Square	Mrs Stewart, 34 Great King Street
Mrs Bryce, 12 Manor Place	Mrs Tait, 6 Bellevue Crescent
Mrs Campbell of Carbrook, 21 Union Street	Mrs Taylor, 22 Abercromby Place
Mrs Eckford, 4 Darnaway Street	Mrs Tytler, 37 Dublin Street
Mrs Forrester, 8 Drummond Place	Mrs Virtue, 23 Forth Street
Mrs Greig, 29 Albany Street	Miss Van Agnew, Lauriston House
Mrs Handyside, 45 York Place	Miss Aitchison, 16 Windsor Street
Mrs Horne, Portobello	Miss G Bell, 120 George Street

Mrs Hunter, 9 Regent Terrace	Miss Borthwick, 30 George Square
Mrs Inglis, 4 Coates Crescent	Miss Davidson, 11 Forres Street
Mrs Lee, 51 Lauriston Place	Miss Dirom, 6 Royal Circus
Mrs McAllan, 26 Rutland Square	Miss Fergusson, 12 Hill Street
Mrs Macduff, 12 Forth Street	Miss Hardy, 4 Coates Crescent
Mrs Macfarlan, 45 Charlotte Square	Miss Hope, 12 Moray Place
Mrs Macfie, 27 Regent Terrace	Miss Mackenzie, 9 Doune Terrace
Mrs McKinnon, 20 Inverleith Row	Miss Money Penny, 7 Moray Place
Mrs Dr J A Maxwell	Miss A Robertson, 28 Stafford Street
Mrs Allan Menzies, 32 Queen Street	Miss Ross, Woodburn
Mrs Mercer, 20 India Street	Miss Smith, 15 Danube Street
Mrs Geo Moir, 41 Charlotte Square	Miss Stevenson, College
Mrs Shank More, 19 Great King Street	Miss Tower, 21 Alva Street
Mrs Muir, 14 Saxe Coburg Place	Miss Whytt, 17 Hope Crescent
Sub-committee	
Mrs Bell, 22 Forth Street	Mrs Taylor, 22 Abercromby Place
Mrs Macfarlan, 45 Charlotte Square	Miss Davidson, 11 Forres Street
Mrs Menzies, 32 Queen Street	Miss Hardy, 4 Coates Crescent
Mrs Moir, 41 Charlotte Square	Miss Stevenson, College
Mrs Muir, 14 Saxe Coburg Place	
Treasurer	
Allan Menzies, Esq. WS, 32 Queen Street	
Bankers	
The Union Bank of Scotland	
Honorary Secretary	
Rev Dr Robertson, 9 Maitland Street	
Acting Secretary	
Mr W L Neilson, Offices of the Schemes of the Church of Scotland, 46 North Hanover Street	

Appendix III

Missionary periodicals

	Dates published
Scottish Missionary Society	
Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register	1820-1848
Scottish Missionary Society Chronicle	c. 1830
Congregational Church	
Scottish Congregational Magazine	1835-1848
Church of Scotland	
Edinburgh Christian Instructor and Colonial Religious Register	1838-1840
Home and Foreign Missionary Record	1838-1900
Life and Work	1879-present
News of Female Missions	1862-1903
News of Women's Missions	1904-1928
Kikuyu News	1908-1958
Free Church of Scotland	
Home and Foreign Missionary Record	1846-1881
Quarterly Missionary Paper	c. 1860-1900
Monthly and Missionary Record	1882-1900
The Eastern Female's Friend	1857-c. 1862
Women's Work in Heathen Lands	c. 1880s
The Helpmeet	1891-1900
Children's Missionary Record	c. 1840s
United Presbyterian Church	
Missionary Record	1846-1899
Zenana Quarterly	c. 1890s
United Free Church of Scotland	
Missionary Record	1901-1913
Record of Home and Foreign Mission Work	1914-1928
Women's Missionary Magazine	1901-c. 1921
Episcopal Church of Scotland	
Foreign Mission Chronicle	c. 1914
Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society	
Occasional papers	c. 1850s
The Healing Hand	1871-present

Appendix IV

Missionaries' biographical details

William Anderson (1812-1895)

Born in Galashiels. Went to Jamaica in 1840, and to Calabar in 1848, with SMS. Supported by his wife, Louisa, he opened many schools, and was a social reformer, campaigning against customs such as sacrificial death.

John Arthur (1881-1952)

Educated at Glasgow university. Went to C of S Kikuyu mission in Kenya in 1907, and was head of mission for 25 years from 1912. He was made an OBE in 1920.

Alexander Duff (1806-1878)

Born in Moulin, Perthshire, and was student of Thomas Chalmers at St Andrews University. The first C of S missionary, he went to India in 1829. Went over to the Free Church at the Disruption. Campaigned for the introduction of education in the English language in India. Founded college in Calcutta. After returning to Scotland, was Professor of New College, and convener of the Foreign Missions Committee, and helped launch the Livingstonia mission. He served twice as Moderator of the FC. Married Anne Scott Drysdale in 1829.

Robert Laws (1851-1934)

Born Aberdeen, and educated at Aberdeen, Edinburgh, and Glasgow universities, and was a UPC member. Was sent with the Livingstonia expedition in 1875 and took part in setting up the Livingstonia mission in Nyasaland, and worked there for 52 years. He served as Moderator of the UFC in 1908.

David Livingstone (1813-1873)

Born in Blantyre, Lanarkshire. Worked in cotton mill from age 10 to 24. Went to South Africa with the LMS in 1840. Conducted journeys of exploration from 1852-6, and published his *Travels* in 1857. Carried out further expeditions throughout the 1860s. Died in 1873 in Africa. His body was brought to the coast by his African companions and he was buried in Westminster Abbey in 1874. He married Mary Moffat in 1844. She died in Africa in 1862.

William Miller (1838-1923)

Born in Thurso, and educated at Aberdeen University. In 1862 began work at Madras College as missionary with FC, and was Principal from 1877 to 1907. He was also Vice Chancellor of the University of Madras, and an influential educationist in India.

Mary Moffat (1795-1871)

Daughter of Rev John Smith, of Madras. Married Robert Moffat in South Africa in 1819. Mother of Mary, who married Livingstone.

Robert Moffat (1795-1883)

Born near Haddington. Worked as a gardener before becoming a missionary with the LMS. Established a mission at Kuruman in South Africa. Translated the bible into Sechuana. Spent 52 years in Africa before retiring to England in 1870.

Robert Nesbit (1803-55)

Born near Berwick-upon-Tweed. Educated at St Andrews. Went with SMS to Bombay in 1827, subsequently working in Huree and Poona. In 1835 became a C of S missionary, and then FC at the Disruption. He was a Marathi scholar.

John Philip (1775-1861)

Born in Kirkcaldy, son of a handloom weaver. Worked as a weaver and mill manager in Dundee before training for the ministry at Edinburgh University. Was a minister in Aberdeenshire, before going to South Africa with the LMS in 1819. Published his *Researches in South Africa* in 1828. Was an active advocate of the rights of African peoples. Married Jane Ross, from an Aberdeen evangelical family, in 1809.

David Clement Scott (1853-1907)

Born Edinburgh. Educated at Edinburgh University. Was head of the C of S mission at Blantyre in Nyasaland. Was an able linguist, and interested in African culture. Resigned in 1898 from Blantyre, and subsequently worked in Kikuyu in Kenya from 1901-1907.

Mary Slessor (1848-1915)

Born in Aberdeen, and moved with her family to Dundee, where she worked in Baxter's jute mill from the age of 11, working 14 years in the mill. Trained as a

missionary in 1875, and went with UPC to Old Calabar in West Africa. Established a mission in areas not previously visited by missionaries. She advised government officials and presided at a native court on the government's behalf.

James Stewart (1831-1905)

Born in Edinburgh and brought up near Scone. Educated at Edinburgh and St Andrews universities, and New College. Travelled with Livingstone on his expedition of 1861-1863. Became missionary with FC at Lovedale in South Africa in 1867. He was the originator in 1874 of the Livingstonia expedition which was launched in 1875. He instituted a system of technical education at Lovedale. He served as Moderator of the FC in 1899.

Euphemia Sutherland (c.1820-1881)

Born Euphemia Miller in Culross. Was in domestic service in Glasgow. With the support of the United Secession Church, she trained at the Normal Seminary of the FC, and taught in Stow School at Paisley. Went to Old Calabar in West Africa with the UPC in 1849. Married Alexander Sutherland, a teacher, in November 1855. He died in 1856. She died in Calabar.

Hope Waddell (1804-1895)

Born in Dublin. Was 20 years in Jamaica with the SMS. Went with the UPC to Nigeria in the 1840s, to establish the mission at Old Calabar, accompanied by freed slaves.

John Wilson (1804-1875)

Born in Lauder, Berwickshire. Educated at Edinburgh University. Went with SMS to Bombay in 1829, and subsequently became C of S missionary, and then FC of S at the Disruption. Founded the *Oriental Christian Spectator* in 1830. Was Vice-Chancellor of Bombay University. Served as Moderator of the FC in 1870. Married to Margaret Bayne.

Margaret Wilson (1795-1835)

Born in Greenock, daughter of Rev Kenneth Bayne. Attended classes at Aberdeen University. Went to India with her husband John in 1829. She had four children, one of whom died in infancy. She ran schools for girls in Bombay, one of the first women to do so. Two of her sisters went to India as missionaries after her death.

Bibliography

Primary sources

Manuscript: Edinburgh, National Library of Scotland (NLS)

Letter from Rev Dr William Brown, Edinburgh, 28 November, 1822 to Rev W Clow, Secretary of the Bombay Corresponding Committee, MS 8988.

Letter from W Brown to Mr Crawford, 22nd September, 1828, MS 8986.

Letter from Directors to missionaries, 4 January, 1833, MS 8986.

Scottish Missionary Society, Jubilee appeal letter from William Brown, Secretary, 1846, MS 8014.

Letters from Rev Robert Young, letter book of the Free Church Foreign Missions Committee, 1856-62, MS 7745.

Newspaper cutting, 6 March, 1877, MS 7906.

Newspaper cutting dated 5 March, 1877, MS 7906.

Extracts from Mr Gunn's diary, published from 1877-1879 in the *Wick Gazette*, MS 7906.

Church of Scotland Women's Association Letter Book, 1885-1915: letter from I Allan to Emily Bernard, 3 June, 1885; Letter from Ella Williamson to Miss Emily [Bernard], October 1885; letter from I Allan to Emily Bernard, 25 November, 1885; letter from I Allan to Emily Bernard, 21 January, 1886, MS 7624.

Newspaper cutting (probably 1887) on the attack by slave traders around Lake Nyasa on Free Church missionaries, MS 7906.

Newspaper cutting (probably 1888), reporting British Association meeting at Bath, MS 8022.

North Britain, 1886, cutting in MS 7906.

'The United Free Church' in newspaper cutting, probably the *Glasgow Herald*, 1907, MS 8022.

Contemporary Periodicals

Missionary periodicals

Fly Leaves, Free Church of Scotland

Foreign Mission Chronicle, Episcopal Church of Scotland

Home and Foreign Missionary Record, Church of Scotland

Kikuyu News, Church of Scotland

Life and Work, Church of Scotland

Missionary Record, Free Church of Scotland

Missionary Record, United Free Church of Scotland

Missionary Record, United Presbyterian Church

Monthly and Missionary Record, Free Church of Scotland

News of Female Missions, Church of Scotland

Quarterly Missionary Paper, Free Church of Scotland

Record of Home and Foreign Mission Work, United Free Church of Scotland

Scottish Missionary and Philanthropic Register

The Eastern Female's Friend, Free Church of Scotland

The Helpmeet, Free Church of Scotland

Women's Missionary Magazine, Free Church of Scotland

Other periodicals

Blackwood's Magazine

New Edinburgh Almanac

Scottish Geographical Magazine

Annual reports

Edinburgh Anti-Slavery Society, *First Annual Report of Edinburgh Anti-Slavery Society*, 1824 .

Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, *Annual Report*, 1850.

Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, *Annual Report*, 1851.

Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, *Annual Report*, 1853.

Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, *Annual Report*, 1855.

Edinburgh Missionary Society, *Abstract of the Proceedings and state of the funds of the Edinburgh Missionary Society*, 1797.

Edinburgh Missionary Society, *Report of the Directors of the Edinburgh Missionary Society, to the General Meeting, 5th April*, 1803.

Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, *Report of Fourth Session, 1898-1899*.

Edinburgh Unity of the Empire Association, *Report of the Executive Committee for the year ending March 1898*.

Missionary Association of the University of Edinburgh, *Report 1842-3*.

Missionary Association of the University of Edinburgh, *Report, 1838-9*.

New College Missionary Society, *50th Year*, 1876.

New College Missionary Society, *53rd Year*, 1878-9.

Scottish Ladies' Association, *First Report*, 1839.

Scottish Ladies' Association, *Report of Annual General Meeting*, 1844.

Scottish Ladies' Association, *Report of Annual General Meeting*, 1846.

Pamphlets

A Guide to the Livingstone Centenary Exhibition, Edinburgh, Scotch Education Department/Royal Scottish Museum, 1913,.

Addresses to Medical Students, 1855-56, Edinburgh, Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society.

Anglo-Oriental Society for the Suppression of the Opium Trade, *Sir William Muir's minute and other papers*, 1875.

Anon., *Statement respecting a central institution or college in order to the improvement and increased efficiency of School Operations conducted by missionaries of various denominations in Calcutta*, 1831.

Bell, Benjamin in *Addresses to Medical Students, 1855-56*, Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, 1856.

Cameron's Guide through the International Exhibition of Industry, Science and Art, (and Old Edinburgh), Edinburgh, 1886.

Chalmers, Thomas, *A Few Thoughts on the Abolition of Colonial Slavery*, Glasgow, Chalmers and Collins, 1826.

Coldstream, John, 'Historical Sketch of the Employment of the Art of Healing in Connection with the Spread of the Gospel' in *Addresses to Medical Students, 1855-56*.

Descriptive List of Loan Collection illustrative of the Highlands and Islands of Scotland and the Scottish Regiments, Scottish National Exhibition, Edinburgh, 1908.

Duff, Alexander, *Bombay in April 1840; with special reference to the Church of Scotland's Mission There*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, n.d.

Duff, Alexander, *Explanatory Statement addressed to the Friends of the India Mission of the Church of Scotland, as it existed previous to the Disruption in May 1843*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, 1844.

Duff, Alexander, *Female Education in India, being the substance of an address delivered at the first annual meeting of the Scottish Ladies' Association, in connection with the Church of Scotland, for the promotion of female education in India*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, 1839.

Duff, Alexander, *Foreign Missions, being the substance of an address delivered before the General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland*, Edinburgh, Andrew Elliot, 1866.

Duff, Alexander, *Home Organization for Foreign Missions, being the substance of and address delivered before the Commission of the General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland, on Wednesday, November 20, 1850*, Edinburgh, Johnstone and Hunter, 1850.

Duff, Alexander, *The Church of Scotland's India Mission, or a brief exposition of the principles on which that mission has been conducted in Calcutta*, Edinburgh, Waugh and Innes, 1835.

Duff, Alexander, *The Jesuits: their Origin and Order, Morality and Practices, Suppression and Restoration*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, 1868.

Edinburgh Anti-Slavery Society, *Address to the the Public by the Committee of the Edinburgh Anti-slavery Society*, 1826.

Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Negro Slavery, *The Abolitionist*, No 1, Jan 2, 1832.

Gregory, J W, *Livingstone as an Explorer: an Appreciation*, delivered in the University of Glasgow on the occasion of the Centenary of David Livingstone, 18 March, 1913.

International Exhibition, Official Daily Programme, Edinburgh, 1890.

Macduff, Rev J R, *Speech to Scottish Ladies' Association*, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1844.

Matheson, Donald, *What is the Opium Trade?*, Edinburgh, Thomas Constable and Co, 1857, Second Edition.

Miller, William, *Lecture to Ladies Society of the Free Church of Scotland*, 1878.

Prospectus, Scottish National Exhibition, 1908.

Smith, George, *Address to Free Church Ladies' Society*, 1864.

Smith, George, *Christianity in India: its progress considered with reference to the Scotch system of missionary operations and to female education*, Edinburgh, John Maclaren, 1864.

Souvenir of the Scottish National Exhibition, Edinburgh Today, July 1908

Stevenson, Rev Dr, *Speech to Scottish Ladies' Association*, Report of Annual General Meeting, 1844.

Stuart, Edward Craig, *A Plea for Zenana Missions, a sermon preached at St Thomas's English Episcopal Chapel, Edinburgh*, October, 1865.

The Opium Trade in China, by an Eyewitness, London, Heaton and Sons, 1858.

The Victoria League in Scotland, 1907-1957, Edinburgh, 1957.

Thomson, Andrew, *Speech delivered at a meeting of the Edinburgh Society for the Abolition of Slavery*, Edinburgh, William Whyte and Co, 1830.

United Trade League, leaflet with map of British empire and trade routes, Edinburgh, 1902.

White, Arthur Silva, *On the achievements of Scotsmen during the nineteenth century in the fields of geographical exploration and research*, A report to the Paris Geographical International Congress, Edinburgh, T and A Constable, 1889.

Histories of missions and missionary societies

Gairdner, W H T, *'Edinburgh 1910': An Account and Interpretation of the World Missionary Conference*, Edinburgh and London, Oliphant, Anderson, and Ferrier, 1910.

Lowe, John, *Jubilee Memorial: Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society*, Edinburgh, Scott and Ferguson and Burness and Company, 1892.

Robson, George, *Missions of the United Presbyterian Church described in a Series of Stories*, Edinburgh, Offices of the United Presbyterian Church, 1896.

Smith, George, *Fifty Years of Foreign Missions*, Edinburgh, John Maclaren, 1880.

Smith, George, *Short History of Christian Missions*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1904.

Contemporary biographies and memoirs of missionaries

Blaikie, W G, *The Life of David Livingstone*, London, John Murray, Eleventh Impression, 1906 (first published 1880).

Johnston, James, *Dr Laws of Livingstonia*, London, Partridge and Co, 1909.

Livingstone, David, *Travels and Researches in South Africa*, Philadelphia, J W Bradley, 1858, (first published 1857).

Livingstone, W P, *Laws of Livingstonia: A Narrative of Missionary Adventure and Achievement*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1921.

Livingstone, W P, *Mary Slessor of Calabar, Pioneer Missionary*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, Fifth Edition, 1916.

Livingstone, W P, *The White Queen of Okoyong*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, c. 1919.

Mitchell, J Murray, *In Western India: recollections of my early missionary life*, Edinburgh, David Douglas, 1899.

Moffat, John S, *The Lives of Robert and Mary Moffat*, London, T Fisher Unwin, Third Edition, 1885.

Moffat, Robert, *Scenes and Services in South Africa: Moffat's Missionary Labours*, London, John Snow and Co, 1876.

Philip, Robert, *The Elijah of South Africa, or the Character and Spirit of the late Rev John Philip, DD*, London, John Snow, 1851.

Robertson, W, *The Martyrs of Blantyre*, London, James Nisbet, 1892.

Smith, George, *Life of Alexander Duff*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1899.

Waddel, Agnes, *Memorials of Mrs Sutherland of Old Calabar*, Paisley, J and R Parlane, 1883.

Wells, James, *Stewart of Lovedale: the Life of James Stewart*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1908.

Wilson, John, *Memoir of Mrs Margaret Wilson*, Edinburgh, John Johnstone, and London, Whittaker and Co and J Nisbet and Co, 1838.

Other contemporary books

Baikie, William Balfour, *Narrative of an Exploring Voyage up the rivers Kwo'ra and Bi'nue (commonly known as the Niger and the Tsadda)*, London, John Murray, 1856.

Cowan, Minna G, *The Education of the Women of India*, Edinburgh and London, Oliphant, Anderson and Ferrier, 1912.

Drummond, Henry, *Tropical Africa*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1891.

Grant, James Augustus, *A Walk Across Africa, or Domestic Scenes from my Nile Journal*, Edinburgh, Blackwood and Sons, 1864

Simpson, James Young, *Henry Drummond*, Famous Scots Series, Edinburgh, 1901

Newspapers

The Scotsman

The Manchester Guardian

The Witness

Secondary sources

Books

- Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities*, London, Verso, 1983.
- Anderson, R D, *Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1983.
- Anderson, R D, *Scottish Education since the Reformation*, Economic and Social History Society of Scotland, 1997.
- Anderson, Robert D, Lynch, Michael and Phillipson, Nicholas, *The University of Edinburgh: An Illustrated History*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2003.
- Ascherson, Neal, *Stone Voices: The Search for Scotland*, London, Granta Books, 2003, Revised edition, first published 2002.
- Barnard, Alan, *History and Theory in Anthropology*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Beveridge, Craig and Turnbull, Ronald, *The Eclipse of Scottish Culture*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 1989.
- Billig, Michael, *Banal Nationalism*, London, Sage, 1995.
- Blackburn, Robin, *The Making of New World Slavery*, London, Verso, 1997
- Bouniol, J, *The White Fathers and their Missions*, London, Sands and Co, 1929.
- Brown, Callum G, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1997.
- Cain, P J, and Hopkins, A G, *British Imperialism: 1688-2000*, London, Pearson, 2002, 2nd edition, First published 1993.
- Calder, Angus, *Revolutionary Empire*, London, Pimlico, 1998, first published 1981.
- Calder, Angus, *Scotlands of the Mind*, Edinburgh, Luath Press, 2002.
- Calder, James, *Scotland's March Past: the Share of Scottish Churches in the London Missionary Society*, London, Livingstone Press, 1945.
- Checkland, Olive, *Philanthropy in Victorian Scotland: Social Welfare and the Voluntary Principle*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1980.
- Checkland, S G, *Scottish Banking, A History, 1695-1973*, Glasgow and London, Collins, 1975.

Colley, Linda, *Britons: forging the nation 1707-1837*, London, Pimlico, 2003, first published 1992.

Cowan, R M W, *The Newspaper in Scotland*, Glasgow, Outram, 1946.

Devine, T M, *Scotland's Empire*, Allen Lane, 2003.

Dickson, Tony (ed), *Scottish Capitalism*, London, Lawrence and Wishart, 1980

Drummond, Andrew L and Bulloch, James, *The Church in Victorian Scotland, 1843-1874*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1975.

Ferguson, W, *The Identity of the Scottish Nation*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1998.

Finlay, Richard, *A Partnership for Good? Scottish Politics and the Union since 1880*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1997.

Forster, Peter G, *T Cullen Young: Missionary and Anthropologist*, Hull, Hull University Press, 1989.

Fry, Michael, *The Scottish Empire*, East Lothian, Tuckwell Press, and Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2001.

Goldie, Frederick, *A Short History of the Episcopal Church in Scotland*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1976.

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth, *Public Lives: Women, Family and Society in Victorian Britain*, New Haven and London, Yale University Press, 2003.

Gray, Robert Q, *The Labour Aristocracy in Victorian Edinburgh*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1976.

Hargreaves, John D, *Aberdeenshire to Africa*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1981.

Harper, Marjory, *Adventurers and Exiles: the Great Scottish Exodus*, London, Profile Books, 2003.

Hastings, Adrian, *The Construction of Nationhood: Ethnicity, Religion and Nationalism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1997.

Hearn, Jonathan, *Claiming Scotland: National Identity and Liberal Culture*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 2000.

Hewat, Elizabeth, *Vision and Achievement, 1796-1956: A History of the Foreign Missions of the Churches United in the Church of Scotland*, London, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1960.

Hobsbawm, Eric, *The Age of Empire: 1875-1914*, London, Phoenix, 2000, First published 1980.

Janin, Hunt, *The India-China Opium Trade in the Nineteenth Century*, Jefferson, North Carolina and London, McFarland and Company, 1999.

Katharine, Duchess of Atholl, *Working Partnership*, London, Arthur Barker, 1958.

Kaye, Evelyn, *Amazing Traveller, Isabella Bird: The biography of a Victorian adventurer*, Colorado, Blue Penguin Publications, 1994

Kiernan, Victor, *The Lords of Human Kind*, London, Serif, 1995, First published 1969.

Kirk-Greene, Anthony, *Britain's Imperial Administrators, 1858-1966*, London, Macmillan, 2000.

Knox, W W, *Industrial Nation*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1999.

Kuitenbrouwer, J J V, '“*The Cronwing Chapter of Geography*”: *The Royal Scottish Geographical Society and the Scramble for Africa, 1884-1893*', Doctoral thesis, University of Amsterdam, 2002.

Lenman, Bruce, *An Economic History of Modern Scotland*, London, Batsford, 1977

Lodwick, Kathleen, *Crusaders Against Opium: Protestant Missionaries in China, 1874-1917*, Kentucky, University Press of Kentucky, 1996.

Lynch, Michael (ed), *Scotland, 1850-1979: Society, Politics and the Union*, London, Historical Association Committee for Scotland and the Historical Association, 1993.

Lynch, Michael, *Scotland: A New History*, London, Pimlico, 1997, First published 1991.

Macdonald, Lesley Orr, *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 2000.

MacKenzie, John M, *Propaganda and Empire*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1986.

Magnusson, Mamie, *Out of Silence: the Woman's Guild, 1887-1987*, Edinburgh, The Saint Andrew Press, 1987.

McCracken, John, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi 1875-1940: the impact of the Livingstonia Mission in the Northern Province*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1977.

McCrone, David, *The Sociology of Nationalism*, London, Routledge, 1998

- McLaren, Martha, *British India and British Scotland, 1780-1830*, Akron, University of Akron Press, 2001.
- McRoberts, David, (ed), *Modern Scottish Catholicism, 1878-1978*, Glasgow, Burns, 1979.
- Meller, Helen, *Patrick Geddes: social evolutionist and city planner*, London, Routledge, 1990.
- Millar, A A, *Alexander Duff of India*, Edinburgh, Canongate Press, 1992.
- Morton, Graeme, *Unionist Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press, 1999.
- Nairn, Tom, *The Break-up of Britain*, London, Verso, 1981, first published 1977.
- Neill, Stephen, *A History of Christian Missions*, London, Penguin Books, 1986, 2nd edition.
- Paterson, Lindsay, *The Autonomy of Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1994.
- Piggin, Stuart and Roxborough, John, *The Saint Andrews' Seven: the finest flowering of missionary zeal in Scottish history*, Edinburgh, Banner of Truth Press, 1985.
- Piggin, Stuart, *Making Evangelical Missionaries 1789-1858: The Social Background, Motives and Training of British Protestant Missionaries to India*, Sutton Courtney Press, 1984.
- Pittock, Murray, *Scottish Nationality*, Basingstoke, Palgrave, 2001.
- Rice, C Duncan, *The Scots Abolitionists*, Louisiana, Louisiana State University Press, 1981.
- Richards, Thomas, *The Imperial Archive*, London, Verso, 1993.
- Robertson, Elizabeth, *Mary Slessor*, Edinburgh, National Museums of Scotland, 2001.
- Rodger, Richard, *The Transformation of Edinburgh*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Ross, Andrew, *David Livingstone: Mission and Empire*, London, Hambledon and London, 2002.
- Ross, Andrew, *John Philip, 1775-1851: Missions, Race and Politics in South Africa*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1986.

Said, Edward, *Culture and Imperialism*, London, Vintage, 1994, First published 1993.

Samuel, Raphael, *Island Stories: Unravelling Britain. Theatres of Memory, Volume II*, London, Verso, 1998.

Semple, Rhonda Anne, *Missionary Women: Gender, Professionalism and the Victorian Idea of Christian Mission*, Woodbridge and Rochester, The Boydell Press, 2003.

Sindima, Harvey J, *The Legacy of Scottish Missionaries in Malawi*, Lewiston/Lampeter/Queenston, The Edwin Mellen Press, 1992.

Smith, Anthony, *National Identity*, London, Penguin, 1991.

Stanley, Brian, (ed), *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge, William B Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001.

Stewart, Gordon T, *Jute and Empire*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1998.

Strong, Rowan, *Episcopalianism in Nineteenth-Century Scotland*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2002

Swan, Annie S, *Seed Time and Harvest*, Edinburgh, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1937

Taylor, H F Lechmere, *A Century of Service, 1841-1941*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, 1941.

Watt, Hugh, *New College Edinburgh: A Centenary History*, Edinburgh, Oliver and Boyd, 1946.

Wilkinson, John, *The Coogate Doctors*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, 1991.

Withers, Charles W J, *Geography, Science and National Identity*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Wood, Stephen, *The Scottish Soldier*, Archive Publications Limited in association with the National Museums of Scotland, 1987.

Chapters in books

Alexander, Wendy 'Early Glasgow Women Medical Graduates' in Eleanor Gordon and Esther Breitenbach, (eds) *The World is Ill-Divided: Women's Work in Scotland*

in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990, pp 70-94.

Billington, Louis and Billington, Rosamund, 'Women in the British Anti-Slavery Movement', in Jane Rendall (ed.), *Equal or Different: Women's Politics, 1800-1914*, Oxford, Blackwell, 1987, pp 82-111.

Brockington, J L, 'Warren Hastings and Orientalism' in Geoffrey Carnall and Colin Nicholson (eds) *The Impeachment of Warren Hastings*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1989, pp 91-108.

Brown, S J, 'Thomas Chalmers and the Communal Ideal in Victorian Scotland' in T C Smout (ed), *Victorian Values*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1992, pp 61-80.

Burness, Catriona, 'The Long Slow March: Scottish Women MPs, 1918-1945' in Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon (eds) *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society, 1800-1945*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1992, pp 151-173.

Cameron, Ewen A, 'Embracing the Past: the Highlands in nineteenth century Scotland' in Dauvit Broun, R J Finlay, and Michael Lynch (eds), *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the ages*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1998, pp 195-219.

Carson, Penny, 'The British Raj and the Awakening of the Evangelical Conscience: the Ambiguities of Religious Establishment and Toleration, 1698-1833, in Stanley (ed), *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge, William B Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001, pp. 45-70.

Donnachie, Ian 'The Enterprising Scot' in Donnachie and Whatley (eds), *The Manufacture of Scottish History*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 1992, pp 90-105.

Ferguson, William, 'Christian Faith and Unbelief in Modern Scotland' in Stewart J Brown and George Newlands (eds), *Scottish Christianity in the Modern World*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 2000, pp 53-89.

Finlay, R J, 'Caledonia or North Britain? Scottish Identity in the Eighteenth Century', in Broun, Dauvit, Finlay, R J, and Lynch, Michael (eds), *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the ages*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1998, pp 143-156.

Forrester, Duncan B, 'The church' in Jim Crowther, Ian Martin, and Mae Shaw, *Renewing Democracy in Scotland*, Leicester, NIACE, 2003, pp 56- 59.

- Gordon, Eleanor, 'Women's Spheres', in Fraser and Morris (eds) *People and Society in Scotland, Vol II*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1990, pp 206-235.
- Kiernan, Victor, 'Scottish Soldiers and the Conquest of India' in Grant G Simpson, (ed) *The Scottish Soldier Abroad, 1247-1967*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1992, pp 97-110.
- MacKenzie, John M, 'Missionaries, Science and the Environment in Nineteenth-Century Africa' in Andrew Porter (ed) *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Grand Rapids and Cambridge, Wm Erdmans Publishing Co, 2003, pp 106-130.
- MacKenzie, John M, "'The Second City of Empire": Glasgow – imperial municipality', in Driver, Felix and Gilbert, David, (eds), *Imperial Cities*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1999, pp 215-237.
- MacKenzie, John M, 'David Livingstone: the construction of the myth' in Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds), *Sermons and Battle Hymns: Protestant Culture in Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990, pp 24-42.
- MacKenzie, John M, 'Heroic Myths of Empire' in J M MacKenzie (ed), *Popular Imperialism and the Military*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1992, pp 109-137.
- MacKenzie, John M, 'The provincial geography societies in Britain, 1884-1914' in Morag Bell, Robin Butlin, and Michael Heffernan, (eds), *Geography and Imperialism, 1820-1940*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1995, pp 93-124.
- Maxwell, Ian Douglas, 'Civilization or Christianity? The Scottish Debate on Mission Methods, 1750-1835,' in Stanley (ed), *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge, William B Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001, pp. 123-140.
- McCrone, David, 'The Unstable Union: Scotland since the 1920s' in Lynch (ed), *Scotland, 1850-1979: Society, Politics and the Union*, London, Historical Association Committee for Scotland and the Historical Association, 1993, pp. 43-49.
- McLaren, Allan, 'The Liberal Professions within the Scottish Class Structure 1760-1860: A Comparative Study of Aberdeen Clergymen, Doctors and Lawyers' in T M Devine, (ed), *Scottish Elites*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1994, pp 77-97.

- Morgan N and Trainor R, 'The Dominant Classes' in W Hamish Fraser and R J Morris, *People and Society in Scotland, Volume II, 1830-1914*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1990, pp. 103-137.
- Morris R J, and Morton, G, 'The Re-making of Scotland: a Nation within a Nation, 1850-1920, in M Lynch (ed), *Scotland, 1850-1979: Society, Politics and the Union*, London, Historical Association Committee for Scotland and the Historical Association, 1993.
- Morris, R J, 'Victorian Values in Scotland and England' in T C Smout, (ed), *Victorian Values*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1992, pp 31-48.
- Morton, Graeme, 'What if? : the significance of Scotland's missing nationalism in the nineteenth century, in Broun, Finlay, and Lynch (eds), *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the ages*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1998, pp 157-176.
- Parker, James G, 'Scottish Enterprise in India, 1750-1914' in R A Cage (ed) *The Scots Abroad*, London, Croom Helm, 1985, pp 191-219.
- Phillips, Clifton, J, 'Changing Attitudes in the Student Volunteer Movement of Great Britain and North America, 1886-1928' in Torben Christensen and William R Hutchison, (eds) *Missionary Ideologies in the Imperialist Era: 1880-1920*, Aarhus, Aros Publishers, 1982.
- Riddy, John, 'Warren Hastings: Scotland's Benefactor?' in Geoffrey Carnall and Colin Nicholson (eds), *The Impeachment of Warren Hastings*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1989, pp 30-57.
- Ross, Andrew C 'Scotland and Malawi, 1859-1964' in Stewart J Brown and George Newlands, (eds) *Scottish Christianity in the Modern World*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, pp 283-309.
- Ross, Andrew, 'Student Kaleidoscope' in Daivd F Wright and Gary D Badcock (eds) *Disruption to Diversity: Edinburgh Divinity, 1846-1996*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1996.
- Shepperson, George 'An Early African Graduate' in Gordon Donaldson (ed) *Four Centuries: Edinburgh University Life, 1583-1983*, Edinburgh, University of Edinburgh, 1983, pp 92-98.

Stanley, Brian, 'Church, State, and the Hierarchy of "Civilization": The Making of the "Missions and Government" Report at the World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh, 1910, in Porter (ed), *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge, William B Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2003, pp 58-84.

Walker, Graham, 'Empire, Religion and Nationality in Scotland and Ulster before the First World War' in Ian S Wood (ed), *Scotland and Ulster*, Edinburgh, Mercat Press, 1994, pp 97-115.

Walls, Andrew F, 'British Missions' in Christensen and Hutchison (eds), *Missionary Ideologies in the Imperialist Era*, Arhus, Aros Publishers, 1982, pp 159-166.

Walls, Andrew F, 'The Eighteenth-Century Protestant Missionary Awakening in its European Context, in Brian Stanley (ed) *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge, William B Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001 pp 22-44.

Withers, Charles, 'The Historical Creation of the Scottish Highlands' in Donnachie and Whatley (eds), *The Manufacture of Scottish History*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 1992, pp. 143-156.

Articles in journals

Brown, Stewart J, "'Echoes of Midlothian": Scottish Liberalism and the South African War, 1899-1902' in *Scottish Historical Review*, lxxi, 1992, pp 156-206.

Crick, Bernard, 'Essay on Britishness' in *Scottish Affairs*, No 2. Winter, 1993, pp 71-83.

Finlay, Richard, 'Controlling the Past: Scottish Historiography and Scottish Identity in the 19th and 20th Centuries', in *Scottish Affairs*, No 9, Autumn, 1994, pp 127-142.

Finlay, Richard, 'The rise and fall of popular imperialism in Scotland, 1850-1950', in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1, March, 1997, pp 13-21.

Forsyth, David S, 'Empire and Union: imperial and national identity in nineteenth century Scotland' in *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, Vol 113, No 1. March, 1997, pp 6-12.

Kidd, Colin, 'Race, Empire, and the limits of nineteenth-century Scottish nationhood', in *The Historical Journal*, 46, 4, 2003, pp 873-892.

MacKenzie, John M, 'Empire and National Identities: the case of Scotland', in *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, Sixth Series, VIII, Cambridge University Press, 1998, pp 215-231.

MacKenzie, John M, 'Hearts in the Highlands', *Times Literary Supplement*, January 25, 2002.

McCrone, David, 'Unmasking Britannia: the rise and fall of British national identity', in *Nations and Nationalism*, 3 (4), 1997, pp. 579-596.

Proctor, J H 'Serving God and the Empire: Mary Slessor in South-Eastern Nigeria, 1876-1915, in *Journal of Religion in Africa*, Vol XXX, No 1, 2000, pp 45-61.

Proctor, J H, 'Scottish Missionaries in India: an Inquiry into Motivation' in *South Asia*, Vol. XIII, no 1, 1990, pp 43-61.

Proctor, J H, 'The Church of Scotland and British Colonialism in Africa', in *Journal of Church and State*, Vol 29, Autumn, 1987, pp. 475-493.

Riedi, Eliza, 'Women, Gender, and the Promotion of Empire: the Victoria League, 1901-1914, in *The Historical Journal*, 45, 3, 2002, pp 569-599.

Smout, T C, 'Perspectives on the Scottish identity' in *Scottish Affairs*, No 6. Winter, 1994, pp 101-113.

White Fathers, *The White Fathers in Scotland, 1934-1984*, Golden Jubilee, 1984.

White Fathers, *White Fathers: 100 Years in Africa*, No 160, June/July 1968.

Unpublished theses

Dow, Derek Alexander, *Domestic response and reaction to the Foreign Missionary enterprises of the principal Scottish Presbyterian Churches, 1873-1929*, PhD, Edinburgh University, 1977.

Gehani, Taro Gangaran, *A Critical Review of the Work of Scottish Presbyterian Missions in India, 1878-1914*, PhD, University of Strathclyde, 1966.

Macmillan, H W, *The Origins and Development of the African Lakes Company, 1878-1908*, PhD, University of Edinburgh, 1970.

Thompson, W, *Glasgow and Africa, connexions and attitudes*, PhD, University of Strathclyde, 1970.