

#### **Abstract**

 The origins, design, fabrication and performance of an Atlantic salmon microarray is described. The microarray comprises 16,950 Atlantic salmon derived cDNA features, printed in duplicate and mostly sourced from pre-existing EST collections (SALGENE and SGP) but also supplemented with cDNAs from suppression-subtractive hybridisation (SSH) libraries and candidate genes involved in immune response, protein catabolism, lipid metabolism and the parr-smolt transformation. A preliminary analysis of a dietary lipid experiment identified a number of genes known to be involved in lipid metabolism. Significant fold-change differences (as low as 1.5×) were apparent from the microarray analysis and were confirmed by qRT-PCR. The study also highlighted the potential for obtaining artifactual expression patterns as a result of cross-hybridisation of similar transcripts. Examination of the robustness and sensitivity of the experimental design employed, demonstrated the importance of biological replicates over technical (dye flip) replicates for the studied system. The TRAITS / SGP microarray has been proven, in a number of studies, to be a powerful tool for the study of key traits of Atlantic salmon biology. It is now available for use by researchers in the wider scientific community.

- 
- 
- 

 Key Words: Atlantic salmon; DNA microarray; gene expression; lipid metabolism; immune response; smoltification.

#### **INTRODUCTION**

 The Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar* L.) is an important farmed fish species throughout its native range (western Europe and east coast North America). Over the past 10 years a substantial Atlantic salmon mariculture industry has also been established in Chile. In indigenous areas the wild species also underpins valuable sectors of the rural economy founded on sport and ecotourism. Its biology is unusual in that, as an anadromous species, it adapts to very different environments in terms of temperature and salinity at different stages in its life-cycle. Atlantic salmon is a high value food source providing quality protein and oils, and together with other oily fish it is the most important source of essential "omega 3" fatty acids in the human diet. Data compiled from FAO UN database (Fishstat Plus) indicates that farmed Atlantic salmon production in the world exceeds 1.2 million tonnes per annum.

 Currently, the four most important constraints on commercial production of this species are a) supply of dioxin-free highly unsaturated oils for the salmon diet, b) protein growth efficiency, c) infectious disease, and d) a long and complex lifecycle. In 2002, research groups from three UK universities (Aberdeen, Cardiff and Stirling), specialising in different aspects of Atlantic salmon biology, formed a partnership to develop and exploit transcriptomics resources to explore the molecular basis of the biology underlying these constraints. The goal of TRAITS (TRanscriptome Analysis of Important Traits of Salmon, www.abdn.sfirc/salmon) was to bolster the sustainability of Atlantic salmon farming through identification of genes and metabolic pathways influencing traits that are important in terms of a) efficiency and sustainability of farm production, b) welfare of farmed stocks and c) quality and nutritional value of salmon products for the consumer. This goal was to be achieved through selection of a set of key "indicator" genes associated with the traits of interest, in order to form the basis of a prototype DNA chip for monitoring salmon health and performance. The underlying strategy (Fig 1.) was to design a primary cDNA microarray based on extant EST collections together with novel ESTs derived from genes shown to respond, in expression terms, to relevant laboratory / field "challenges".

 RNA samples derived from these and other challenges would be interrogated by the cDNA array to identify candidate responder genes. A second more focused oligonucleotide array, comprising mainly responder genes, would then be fabricated and initially validated by interrogation of the same samples that were hybridised to the cDNA array.

 The development of the TRAITS cDNA microarray was initially reliant upon a *c.* 11K EST collection from the EC funded SALGENE project ("Construction of a genetic body map for Atlantic salmon"; FAIR CT98 4314), in which Stirling had been a partner. However, prior to project start-up a formal collaboration with the Norwegian Salmon Genome Project (SGP, www.salmongenome.no) was developed that allowed access to a more extensive physical EST resource (Hagen-Larsen *et al*., 2005; Adzhubei *et al*., 2007).

 Several cDNA microarray platforms have been established for salmonid fish with varying numbers of features; Koskinen *et al*., 2004, (1380 features), Rise *et al*., 2004 (3700 features), Ewart *et al*., 2005 (4104 features), Jordal *et al.*, 2005 (79 features) von Schalburg *et al*., 2005 (16008 features). A number of different biological processes have been examined by microarray in salmonid fish including immune responses to bacterial infections (Ewart *et al*., 2005; MacKenzie *et al*., 2006; Martin *et al*., 2006; Rise et al., 2004; von Schalburg *et al*., 2005), viral infections (Purcell *et al*., 2006), fungal infections (Roberge *et al*., 2007), and to physiological states such as nutrition (Jordal *et al.,* 2005), mobilisation of energy reserves (Salem *et al*., 2006) and stress (Cairns *et al*., 2007). In the above studies varying complexities of experimental design were employed, using different numbers of replicates and often only genes showing two-fold or higher differences in expression were selected for further scrutiny / characterisation.

 It is widely accepted that the supply of fish meal and oils for the diets of farmed fish is not sustainable (Sargent & Tacon, 1999). One consequence of this has been an increased emphasis on the

 development of diets based on vegetable oil, which are suitable for aquaculture. A key aspect of 100 salmonid lipid metabolism that is being extensively investigated is this regard is the conversion of  $C_{18}$ 101 polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFAs), found in vegetable oils to the  $C_{20}$  and  $C_{22}$  highly unsaturated fatty acids (HUFAs), eicosapentaenoate (EPA) and docosahexaenoate (DHA), that are the specific omega-3 fatty acids responsible for the health-promoting properties of fish and fish oil. These components are critical to the maintainance of nutritional quality of farmed fish. Two key enzymes involved in this pathway, Δ5 and Δ6 fatty acyl desaturase (FAD), have been characterised in depth (Hastings *et al.*, 2004; Zheng *et al.*, 2005*a*). Both these genes have been shown, by quantitative real-time PCR analysis (qRT-PCR), to exhibit diet-dependent differential gene expression (Zheng *et al.*, 2004, 2005*a, b*), 108 though detected fold-change differences are minimal  $(1.3 - 2.0)$ .

 In this paper, design and fabrication details relating to the TRAITS / SGP cDNA microarray are reported. Results of a preliminary transcriptomic analysis from a dietary lipid feeding trial are used to explore both the robustness and the sensitivity of analysis that may be achieved by the use of this microarray.

#### **MATERIALS & METHODS**

- 
- CDNA RESOURCES
- 
- *Archived ESTs*

 Two main EST collections (SALGENE *c.* 11K clones and SGP *c.* 30K clones) were available to the TRAITS consortium in 2004. In all cases, fish were sourced from farm stocks of European origin and library construction began with mRNAs from tissues being used as template for oligo(dT)-primed

 reverse transcription. The SALGENE resource comprised ESTs from seven tissue-specific non- normalised libraries and two tissue-specific normalised libraries, with all cDNAs being directionally cloned into vectors. Details of tissues used, life-history stage (juvenile *i.e.* freshwater phase or adult *i.e.* marine phase) and cloning systems employed are given in Table I. Non-normalised library construction has been detailed elsewhere (Martin *et al*., 2002; Hagen-Larsen *et al*., 2005; Adzhubei *et al*., 2007). Insert size varied among libraries but ranged from 300 bp – 4 kbp. Single pass sequence data (5' end) were available for all clones. Normalised libraries were made in M.B. Soares' laboratory, University of Columbia, USA, following their standard methodology (Bonaldo *et al*., 1996). Single pass sequence data available for these clones was a mixture of both 5' and 3' end reads. SGP clones were derived from 14 tissue-specific non-normalised libraries; brain, eye, gill, head-kidney, heart, intestine, kidney, liver, white muscle, ovary, skin, spleen, swim-bladder and testis. All tissues were sampled from parr (freshwater phase). The cDNAs were directionally cloned into pBlueScript II SK(+) XR phagemid vector and transformed into XL10–Gold host cells (Hagen-Larsen et al., 2005; Adzhubei *et al*., 2007). EST data comprised single pass 5'-end sequences.

# *Trait-specific enriched libraries*

 All enrichments used a standard approach – suppression subtractive hybridisation (SSH; PCR-select cDNA subtraction kit, Clontech). Non-directional cloning was subsequently used to insert subtracted cDNA fragments into the pGEM T-Easy vector (Promega). Resultant cDNA fragments generally ranged in size between 150-700 bp.

Immune response genes

 A bacterial challenge was undertaken using *Aeromonas salmonicida,* the bacterial pathogen responsible for furunculosis of salmon. Three tissue-specific enriched libraries (head kidney, gill, and liver) were constructed (Martin *et al*., 2006). Fish were anaesthetised with benzocaine (Sigma 20 mg  $\text{L}^{-1}$ ) and injected intraperitoneally with 100 μL (10<sup>9</sup> CFU mL<sup>-1</sup>) of a genetically attenuated strain (aroA<sup>−</sup> ) of *A*. *salmonicida* (Brivax II, Marsden *et al*., 1996). in phosphate buffered saline (PBS) or 100 µL of PBS as control. Brivax II is a non virulent strain, but acts in a similar manner to the intact virulent pathogen, however, after several rounds of replication the fish clears the bacteria. Intraperitoneal injection of Brivax II induces a protective immune response, with fish resistant to a later challenge with virulent strains. The two groups of fish were kept separately and RNA was pooled from 10 'challenged' fish and 10 control fish at 24 h and 48 h post injection. In each case the challenged RNA was "tester" and the control "driver". Approximately 500 clones from each library were sequenced, a mean redundancy of *c.* 33% being observed. Following BLASTx sequence homology matching, 20%, 23% and 50 % of genes had sequences homologous to immune-associated genes for head-kidney, gill and liver respectively (Martin *et al*., 2006).

## Protein catabolism genes

 Two tissue-specific enriched libraries (white muscle and liver) were constructed following a starvation trial. RNA was pooled from 10 fish starved for 14 days and from 10 fish fed *ad libitum*. RNA from the starved pool was used as "tester" and RNA from fed fish as "driver". For genes enriched following short term starvation, a highly heterogeneous group of genes was found, as many different biological processes were altered by this treatment including those related to protein turnover. For the library generated from liver, 92% of the sequences were found to have homologies following BLASTx searches. Key groups of genes represented in the library encoded metabolic enzymes, serum proteins and immune response genes, with other minor groupings being iron-binding proteins, globins and factors involved in transcription and translation. For the genes enriched in

 muscle following starvation, 77% had BLASTx homologies, with key groups of sequences encoding metabolic enzymes, structural proteins and transcription and translation factors (10%) and minor groups including heat shock proteins.

# 178 Diet responsive genes

 Atlantic salmon were fed from first-feeding on diets containing either fish oil (FO; capelin oil) or a 25% FO : 75% blended vegetable oil (VO) diet (detailed in 'feed trial' section below). Four subtracted liver cDNA libraries (two timepoints – 52 weeks (pre-smolt / freshwater) and 55 weeks (post-smolt / seawater) and two directions, FO driver and VO driver) were made. Pooled RNA from 12 (pre-smolt) and 4 (post-smolt) female fish on each diet were used. A total of 768 clones were sequenced. All four libraries were found to be highly redundant; Ten fragments comprised *c.* 40% of 186 all sequences. BLASTx analyses gave significant hits (e-value  $\le e^{-20}$ ) for 79 (54%) of the 145 different sequences, though only one of these (catfish fatty-acid binding protein) appeared to be directly related to lipid metabolism.

# Smoltification responsive genes

 Four tissue-specific SSH libraries enriched in genes up-regulated in brain, pituitary, kidney and gill of smolts (seawater phase) in comparison to parr (freshwater phase) were made. Tissues were dissected from parr and smolt in November / December 2002 and April / May 2003. A total of 380 clones from each of the four libraries was sequenced. Between 32% and 50% of the sequenced clones were identified by BLASTx sequence homology searches. All libraries had considerable redundancy (28% brain, 56% gill, 56% kidney, 86% pituitary). Significantly, the single most 198 abundant sequence in the gill subtractive library corresponded to  $Na^+/K^+$  ATPase whose levels of activity are a key indicator of smoltification status.

# *Candidate and other genes*

 A third, minor source of cDNAs for the array, was a small collection of full length genes or gene fragments in plasmid constructs that were already possessed by the partners. These included both candidate genes and also other genes with no known relevance to the specific traits of interest (Table II). Being better characterised than the EST clones these constructs were potentially useful as reference genes on the microarray. Of note, with regard to the research reported in this paper, is the inclusion of three cDNA fragments (the ORF and two 3' UTR fragments) from both (Δ5 FAD and Δ6 FAD) Atlantic salmon fatty acyl desaturase genes.

#### CLUSTER ANALYSIS AND PROBE SELECTION

 All sequence data derived from the above resources, together with 57K Atlantic salmon sequences available *in silico* from Genbank in July 2004, were clustered using the TGI clustering tools (Pertea *et al*., 2003). The process of clone selection for the cDNA microarray is summarised in Fig. 2. Approximately equal numbers (*c.* 9 K) of contigs and singletons were identified as having accessible clones. Since the overall number (*c.* 18 K clones) was comfortably within the printing capacity of the microarray spotter no further clone selection / refinement was undertaken. A single representative clone from each contig was selected for inclusion on the microarray. Where possible a SALGENE clone was selected in preference to an SGP clone, since the entire SALGENE resource was archived at the printing site (ARK Genomics, Roslin Institute). Also, clones were selected from non- normalised or normalised libraries in preference to SSH derived cDNAs in order to take advantage of longer transcripts.

 Bacterial cultures were grown from archived samples and cDNA inserts amplified directly from these using vector-specific primers. Initially various primer sets were used, dependent on the specific vector employed. However, a generic set (BSKS-F: CGATTAAGTTGGGTAACGC; BSKS-R: CAATTTCACACAGGAAACAG) was found to work with all but one vector. For pBK-CMV constructs, T3 (AATTAACCCTCACTAAAGGGA) and T7 (TAATACGACTCACTATAGGG) primers were employed. PCR reactions (50 µL) were purified by passing them through a 384-well multiscreen filter plate (Millipore). Amplicons were electrophoresed through a 1% agarose gel, and ethidium bromide stained. Only PCR products producing a clear singlet band were considered for spotting. Amplicons were quantified using PicoGreen assay (Invitrogen). Features were printed onto amino-silane coated glass slides (Corning GAPS II) using a MicroGrid II printer (Genomic Solutions). DNA was resuspended in printing buffer (150 mM sodium phosphate buffer, 0.1% SDS, 238 pH8.0) to a concentration of *c*. 150 ng mL<sup>-1</sup> and spotted with a 48 pin tool (Biorobotics 10K pins). Mean spot diameter was 110 microns. The slide format comprised 48 sub-arrays, each consisting of 27 columns and 28 rows. Each cDNA was printed in duplicate, with duplicate features being printed non-adjacently within the same sub-array. A number of control features were printed across the microarray; sonicated Atlantic salmon genomic DNA (96 features); sheared salmon sperm DNA (*Oncorhynchus* derived – Sigma; 96 features); four different SpotReport® (Stratagene) controls – namely PCR product 1-3 (Cab, RCA, rbcL genes from *Arabidopsis thaliana*), and human β-actin PCR fragment (20 features each) and spotting buffer (192 features). In addition each sub-array had two Cy3 spots (landing lights) located at the upper left corner to aid orientation of the slide during grid placement and spot finding procedures. The remaining 1826 locations on the 36,288 spot grid 248 were left blank. Following printing DNA spots were fixed by baking at  $80^{\circ}$ C for 2 h. Prior to hybridisation microarray slides were treated using succinic anhydride and 1-methyl-2-pyrrolidinone (Sigma) to block unbound amino groups (slide manufacturer's recommended protocol) and



or a VO blend, containing rapeseed, palm and linseed oils in a 3.7 : 2 : 1 ratio, replacing 75% of the

 FO. This VO blend was formulated to mimic fish oil in saturated and monounsaturated fatty acid content *but* with C18 PUFA replacing n-3 HUFA. Fish were fed the diets described above for one year 279 until seawater transfer, at which point fish (mean weight  $\sim$  50g) were transferred into 5m  $\times$  5m net pens at 700 fish / pen. The fish were fed the same diet in seawater as in freshwater although the dietary oil levels were increased to 25% (3mm pellet) rising to 32% (9mm pellets) through the year- long seawater phase. The diets aimed to be practical, and were formulated and manufactured by Skretting ARC, Stavanger, Norway according to current practices in the salmon feed industry. All diets were formulated to satisfy the nutritional requirements of salmonid fish (NRC, 1993)

# *Sample preparation*

 Fish fed on each diet were sampled at two timepoints during freshwater rearing (at 36 & 52 weeks post-hatch, the latter just one week before transfer to sea) and at a further two time-points in seawater (at 55 and 86 weeks post-hatch). Twenty four liver samples per dietary treatment and timepoint were collected. Total RNA was isolated by organic solvent extraction (TriReagent, Sigma) following the manufacturer's protocol. Spectrophotometry (Nanodrop) and electrophoresis (Bioanalyser 2100, Agilent Technologies) were used to quantify and assess quality of the RNAs respectively. For the transcriptomics analysis, equal amounts of RNA from four individuals (2 males + 2 females) were pooled to produce six biological replicates per diet per time-point. Each pooled RNA sample was further cleaned by mini spin-column purification (RNeasy, Qiagen) and was re-quantified and quality assessed as above.

*Experimental design*

 Each biological replicate was co-hybridised in a two dye experiment with a single pooled reference sample. This design permits valid statistical comparisons across both diets and time-points to be

 made. The pooled reference sample comprised equal amounts of RNA from each of the 24 biological replicate samples. A dye-swap procedure was incorporated to mitigate selective binding and 305 scanning artifacts. Thus the entire experiment comprised 96 separate hybridisations (2 diets  $\times$  4 time-306 points  $\times$  6 biological replicates  $\times$  2 dye-swaps).

*Labelling and hybridisation protocols*

 Due to the large number of hybridisations, not all hybridisations could be completed at the same time. Samples were therefore randomised and processed in two batches one week apart. RNA was reverse transcribed and labelled with either Cy3 or Cy5 fluors using the FAIRPLAY II cDNA indirect labelling kit (Stratagene) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Briefly 20µg total RNA was reverse transcribed after being primed with oligo dT, which incorporated aminoallyl-dUTP into the synthesised cDNA strand. The RNA template was then hydrolysed using 1M NaOH for 15 min and neutralised with 1M HCl. The cDNA was NaAce / ethanol precipitated overnight. cDNA pellets were washed in 80% ethanol and air dried before being resuspended in 5 µL 2X coupling buffer. Once the cDNA had fully dissolved (after at least 30 min) 5 µL of either Cy3 or Cy5 dye was added and the samples incubated in the dark for 30 min. The Cy3 and Cy5 dyes (Amersham- Pharmacia) were dissolved in 45µL DMSO prior to being added to the coupling buffer. To remove unincorporated dye, the labelled cDNA (total volume 10µL) was passed through a SpinEX column (Qiagen). Dye incorporation was assessed by separating 1µL of the sample on a mini agarose gel and visualising fluorescent products on a microarray scanner (Perkin Elmer ScanArray 5000XL). No pre- hybridisation step was required. For hybridisation the remainder of each labelled cDNA (7-9 µL; 16- 325 30 pmol each dye) was added to 85 µL hybridisation buffer (UltraHyb, Ambion), 10 µL poly(A) $_{80}$ 326 (10 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>; Sigma) and 5 µL ultrapure BSA (10 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>; Ambion). The hybridisation mixture was 327 heated to  $95^{\circ}$ C for 3 min, then cooled to  $60^{\circ}$ C before being applied to the microarray. Hybridisations (48 slides per day) were performed on a Gene TAC Hyb Station (Genomic Solutions) for 16 h at

 45°C. Slides were then automatically washed with  $2\times$ SSC, 0.5% SDS for 10 min at 60°C; 0.2×SSC, 330 0.5% SDS for 10 min at  $42^{\circ}$ C; and finally 0.2 X SSC 10 min at  $42^{\circ}$ C. Slides were then manually rinsed in isopropanol and dried by centrifugation before being scanned.

*Data acquisition and analysis*

 Hybridised slides were scanned at 10 µm resolution using a Perkin Elmer ScanArray Express HT scanner. BlueFuse software (BlueGnome) was then used to visualise and identify features. Following a manual spot removal procedure and fusion of duplicate spot data (BlueFuse proprietary algorithm) the resulting intensity values and quality annotations were exported into the GeneSpring GX version 7.3.1 (Agilent Technologies) analysis platform. Data transformation, normalisation and quality filtering were as follows: 1) all intensity values less than 0.01 were set to 0.01; 2) a 'per spot per chip' intensity dependent (Lowess) normalisation was undertaken using software defaults (20% 342 smoothing / cutoff 10); 3) data were filtered using a BlueFuse spot confidence value  $> 0.1$  in  $> 24$ 343 slides and BlueFuse spot quality of  $\geq 0.5$  in  $\geq 24$  slides. This gave a final list of 11,800 genes which were eligible for statistical analysis. Experimental annotations complied fully with MIAME guidelines (Brazma et al., 2001).

 qRT-PCR was performed as described by Villeneuve *et al.* (2005). Primer details are given in Table III. Relative expression ratios were statistically compared between diet samples following normalisation against three housekeeping genes, using REST software (Pfaffl, 2001; Pfaffl *et al.* 2002). Five thousand random allocations were performed and differences were considered to be significant at P<0.05.

*qRT-PCR validation*

#### **RESULTS**

#### MICROARRAY FEATURE OVERVIEW

 cDNAs derived from fifteen different tissue sources are represented among the 16,950 Atlantic salmon gene features printed on the TRAITS / SGP cDNA microarray (Table I). Of these, approximately 9% are from SSH libraries. Brain cDNAs predominate (15% of total). This reflects the large number of ESTs generated for this tissue, due to 1) brain libraries being included in all three of the EST resources available, 2) increased sequencing effort being focused on these libraries due to perceived diversity of gene expression within brain tissue, 3) availability of a normalised brain EST library. BLASTx homology searches of contig and singleton sequences (Table IV) revealed close to 366 40% of features having a weak hit (e-value  $\geq e^{-10}$ ) or no hit at all to the NCBI non-redundant protein 367 database. Among the 10,399 features with a significant BLASTx hit (e-value  $\lt e^{-10}$ ), 6762 (65%) nominally different genes were identified. GO annotations were obtained for 7749 features and can be accessed from the TRAITS website.

# DIETARY LIPID EXPERIMENT

 The main findings of this microarray-based investigation will be reported in detail elsewhere. Here, data from preliminary analyses are presented to illustrate the degree of robustness and sensitivity that the microarray / experimental design achieved.

 Hybridisation data were analysed by two-way ANOVA, which examined the explanatory power of the variables 'time-point' and 'diet' and the interaction between the two and incorporated a 379 Benjamini-Hochberg (1995) multiple test correction ( $P \le 0.05$ ). This analysis identified 4,142 features showing significant differential expression over the year long experimental time course,

 demonstrating considerable temporal changes which may be related to a large number of biological factors. In contrast only 15 significant diet-responsive features were detected (and a further 10 383 features with significant time-point  $\times$  diet interactions) Of the 15 significant diet-associated genes, 10 with BLASTx or other known sequence homologies had functions associated with either HUFA or cholesterol biosynthetic pathways (Table V). The differential expression of these genes in these samples was confirmed by qRT-PCR. The identity of the remaining five of the 15 probes remains to be established.

 To explore the consequences of analysing smaller numbers of microarrays, the significance of 390 expression of the nine  $\Delta$ 5 /  $\Delta$ 6 fatty acyl desaturase (FAD) probes present on the microarray was used as a proxy indicator for the performance of a given experimental design. Two strategies were employed to reduce microarray number, 1) omission of dye swap, 2) reduction of biological replicates. Two-way ANOVAs were undertaken (without multiple test correction) and gene lists ordered by ascending (diet) P-value. The position of the nine probes in each of the lists is shown in Table VI. In a full analysis incorporating all six biological replicates and a dye swap (12 replicate microarrays per condition) the nine desaturase probes were all present in the top 25 of this list. Reducing microarray numbers, whilst retaining a dye swap, decreased apparent sensitivity, but only markedly when the number of biological replicates was reduced to three. At this replication level the results of the analyses appeared to be sensitive to the particular biological replicates selected, as demonstrated by the duplicate analyses (biological replicates 1-3 vs 4-6). Omission of a dye swap gave mixed results depending upon the dye selected for the pooled reference sample. With a Cy5 pooled reference the results (all nine desaturase probes in top 27 of list) closely matched those of the full 12 microarray design. However, with a Cy3 pooled reference only three probes were in the top 25 of the list. One probe was not in the list at all and others had dropped as low as position 284.



 Enriching the microarray for potential trait-specific genes has proven to be a worthwhile strategy. In a number of studies (Martin *et al*., 2007; and in preparation), SSH derived probes have been

 identified as significant responders in immune, protein catabolism, and smoltification studies. However, in lipid metabolism studies to date, no probes from SSH clones (or contigs containing SSH clones) have been identified as responding differentially between diets. One possible explanation for the apparent failure of the SSH procedure in this case follows from the subsequent microarray analysis of the dietary lipid experiment reported here. Overall fold changes in diet-responsive genes were found to be quite low, with the greatest changes being only 3-fold, and there were no data to 439 support differential expression of these genes at the two time-points (50 & 53 weeks) used for SSH library construction.

 There are no plans to radically improve upon the probe set in the TRAITS / SGP microarray. In its existing format there is still spare capacity for feature printing, and additional candidate gene probes have, and will, be added on an *ad hoc* basis. For example, probes for 12 genes associated with lipid metabolism and 10 immune-related genes, not known to be on the microarray, have recently been included to facilitate two specific experimental studies. Over the past few years printing technology has advanced significantly. Currently the TRAITS / SGP microarray is being printed using non- contact inkjet based technology (ArrayJet Ltd), which delivers more consistent spot and slide uniformity than contact pin printing, and which should improve the reliability of generated microarray data and increase the sensitivity of detection.

#### DIETARY LIPID EXPERIMENT

 By identifying candidate genes, the results of this experiment provide reassurance of the clone- tracking accuracy of the microarray. They also confirm that the selected microarray design and fabrication technology, together with the experimental methodology employed, provide the capacity for sensitive detection of differential expression. The fold change differences in expression of Δ5

 FAD and Δ6 FAD between fish fed VO *vs* fish fed FO based diets closely match those obtained by qRT PCR analysis in a previous study (Zheng *et al.*, 2005*b*).

 Microarray analyses are expensive and time consuming to perform and there is often financial pressure to minimise the number of microarrays used in an experiment. Here, reducing the slide number from 12 to 8 (while retaining the dye swap) had little apparent effect on the ability to detect significant differential expression in FAD genes known to show a variable response according to diet. Using just six slides per condition (one per biological replicate and no dye swap) gave different outcomes according to the dye / target combination used. When the experimental sample was labelled with Cy3 and the pooled reference with Cy5, the results were comparable with the full 12 slide (including dye swap) analysis. However, there was much less agreement when the experimental sample was Cy5 labelled and the pooled reference was Cy3 labelled. The reason for this marked dye- dependent disparity remains to be established. However, it has been noted in this and other related studies conducted by TRAITS partners that 1) pooled reference samples produce higher background intensities and 2) the Cy3 channel consistently displays higher background values compared to the Cy5 channel. The combination of these factors may, at least in part, account for this phenomenon. The relevance of these observations to other studies is difficult to assess. The results are largely dependent on the homogeneity of the system under study and the absolute and relative expression levels of any differentially responding genes. For similar reasons, it is also difficult to critically assess published studies more generally. It is likely that the use of sex-balanced pools for experimental biological replication in this study, rather than individual samples, contributed to the discriminatory capabilities of this microarray experiment. Where cost considerations are an important factor, interrogation of reduced numbers of microarrays may be the only viable option available. If background fluorescence can confidently be controlled, omitting a dye swap, as opposed to reducing biological replication, may be a preferable route to follow in such cases.

 The FAD expression profiles demonstrated the potential for obtaining artifactual results due to cross- hybridisation of similar transcripts. Expression profiles derived from two Δ5 FAD probes (the ORF PCR fragment and full length EST) closely matched those obtained from all Δ6 FAD probes. While 487 the 3' UTRs are very distinct ( $\Delta$ 5 FAD 3' UTR = 1072 bp;  $\Delta$ 6 FAD 3' UTR = 457 bp; sequence similarity *c.* 30%), the two ORFs are very similar to their Δ6 counterparts (both 1365 bp; *c.* 95% sequence similarity). It has also been reported from qRT-PCR analysis, that Δ6 FAD gene expression is approximately four-fold higher than Δ5 FAD expression, in liver tissue of farmed salmon fed on fish oil (Zheng *et al*,*.* 2005*b*). Thus it would appear that cross-hybridisation of the more abundant Δ6 FAD transcript targets is masking the true expression profiles derived from these two Δ5 FAD probes. The failure of the microarray analysis to correctly distinguish between Δ5 FAD and Δ6 FAD expression profiles in all cases clearly illustrates one of the inherent weaknesses of cDNA microarray-based studies *i.e.* the inability to distinguish between highly similar message transcripts. This is of particular relevance in interpreting transcriptomic data from salmonid species, since fish of the family Salmonidae have undergone a relatively recent whole-genome duplication *c.* 25-100 million years ago (Allendorf & Thorgaard, 1984), such that simultaneous expression of duplicate genes is a commonly observed phenomenon.

## OTHER STUDIES.

 As part of the original funded project, the TRAITS partners have already used the cDNA array to explore transcriptomic responses in experiments targeting the four key traits identified as being important for sustained salmon aquaculture *i.e.* a) supply of dioxin-free highly unsaturated oils for the salmon diet, b) protein growth efficiency, c) infectious disease, and d) a long and complex lifecycle. In addition to the diet work outlined in this paper, other research at Stirling University, funded by the European Commission, is comparing gene expression both within and between families of fish fed on fish oil or vegetable oil-based diets. Other studies, investigating the

 transcriptomic response of Atlantic salmon to infection by infectious pancreatic necrosis virus (IPNV) in both seawater and freshwater environments are similarly in progress. Researchers at Aberdeen University are using the cDNA microarray to study the immune response in Atlantic salmon *in vivo* following infection by *A.salmonicida* and *in vitro* to examine the response to recombinant fish cytokines. Additionally, short-term starvation trials have been used to explore protein catabolism pathways. Finally the Cardiff partner has identified genes and gene pathways from three tissues (brain, gill and kidney) that are involved in the parr-smolt transformation. The TRAITS / SGP microarray has also been supplied to an Australian research group to examine gene expression responses to amoebic gill disease. To date its performance has not been critically assessed for use with other closely related species. Cross-species hybridisation between salmonids has been shown to be extremely high (Rise *et al*., 2004; von Schalburg *et al*., 2005), suggesting that microarrays could be used with similar confidence for both Atlantic salmon and rainbow trout due to the high level of sequence homology between the two species.

#### FUTURE DIRECTIONS

 The final stage of the TRAITS project, *i.e.* development and validation of a focused oligonucleotide array is currently in progress. Approximately 1000 differentially responding genes have been identified from cDNA microarray interrogations by the TRAITS partners and unique 70mer oligonucleotides designed and synthesised for these and appropriate control genes. These form the basis of the TRAITS / SGP secondary oligochip, the performance of which is currently being evaluated. Irrespective of the outcome, the TRAITS / SGP cDNA microarray will continue to be a valuable tool and be available for use to the wider scientific community. Enquiries regarding purchase / use of this microarray should be directed to ARK Genomics (www.ark-genomics.org) in the first instance.

Acknowledgments



 The TRAITS / SGP microarray was constructed by ARK Genomics and funded by Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BBSRC) grants 98/EGA17674 (University of Stirling, UK), 98/EGA17675 (University of Aberdeen, UK), 72/EGA17676 (Cardiff University, UK), and with grant 139617/140 "Salmon Genome Project" by the Research Council of Norway. The dietary trial was funded by the EU FP5 Project Q5RS-2000-30058 (RAFOA). We thank Prof. A. Brass and Dr. Y. Fang (Manchester University) for key discussions relating to experimental design and analysis.



 Adzhubei, A. A., Vlasova, A. V., Hagen-Larsen, H., Ruden, T. A., Laerdahl, J. K., Høyheim, B. (2007). Annotated expressed sequence tags (ESTs) from pre-smolt Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) in a searchable data resource. *BMC Genomics* **8,** 209. doi:10.1186/1471-2164-8-209

- Allendorf, F. W. & Thorgaard, G.W. (1984). Tetraploidy and the evolution of salmonid fishes. In *Evolutionary Genetics of Fishes* (Turner, B.J., ed.), pp. 1–46. New York: Plenum Press.
- 

 Altschul, S.F., Gish, W., Miller, W., Myers, E.W. & Lipman, D.J. (1990). Basic local alignment search tool. *Journal of Molecular Biology* **215**, 403-410.

- 
- Benjamini, Y. & Hochberg, Y. (1995). Controlling the false discovery rate: a practical and powerfulapproach to multiple testing. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society* **B57**, 289-300.









Purcell, M. K., Nichols, K. M., Winton, J. R., Kurath, G., Thorgaard, G. H., Wheeler, P., Hansen, J. D.,

Herwig, R. P. & Park, L. K. (2006). Comprehensive gene expression profiling following DNA



# **FIGURE LEGENDS**





# 701 Fig.2.

# **Clustering (July 04)**



# **GRAND TOTAL:**

16,950

736

Fig.3.





740 Table I. Details of the EST libraries used to construct the TRAITS / SGP cDNA microarray.



742

