Accepted refereed manuscript of:

Sprague M, Walton J, Campbell P, Strachan F, Dick JR & Bell JG (2015) Replacement of fish oil with a DHA-rich algal meal derived from Schizochytrium sp. on the fatty acid and persistent organic pollutant levels in diets and flesh of Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar, L.) post-smolts, *Food Chemistry*, 185, pp. 413-421.

DOI: <u>10.1016/j.foodchem.2015.03.150</u>

© 2015, Elsevier. Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International <u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/</u>

1	Replacement of Fish Oil with a DHA-rich Algal Meal Derived from
2	Schizochytrium sp. on the Fatty Acid and Persistent Organic
3	Pollutant Levels in Diets and Flesh of Atlantic Salmon (Salmo salar,
4	L.) Post-Smolts
5	
6	Sprague, M. <sup>1*</sup> , Walton, J. <sup>2</sup> , Campbell, P. <sup>2</sup> , Strachan, F. <sup>1</sup> , Dick, J.R. <sup>1</sup> and
7	Bell, J.G. <sup>1</sup>
8	
9	<sup>1</sup> Institute of Aquaculture, University of Stirling, Stirling FK9 4LA, Scotland, UK
10	<sup>2</sup> BioMar Ltd., North Shore Road, Grangemouth Docks, Grangemouth FK3 8UL,
11	Scotland, UK
12	*Corresponding author. Tel.: +44 1786 467989
13	E-mail address: matthew.sprague@stir.ac.uk
14	

#### 15 Abstract

16 The replacement of fish oil (FO) with a DHA-rich Schizochytrium sp. algal meal 17 (AM) at two inclusion levels (11% and 5.5% of diet) was tested in Atlantic salmon 18 post-smolts compared to fish fed a FO diet of northern (NFO) or southern hemisphere 19 (SFO) origin. Fish were preconditioned prior to the 19-week experimental feeding 20 period to reduce long-chain polyunsaturated fatty acid (LC-PUFA) and persistent 21 organic pollutant levels (POPs). Dietary POP levels differed significantly between 22 treatments in the order of NFO>SFO>11AM/5.5AM and were subsequently reflected in the flesh. Fish fed the 11AM diet contained similar DHA levels (g.100g<sup>-1</sup> flesh) to 23 24 FO-fed fish, despite percentage differences. However, the low levels of EPA in the 25 diets and flesh of algal-fed fish compromised the overall nutritional value to the final 26 consumer. Nevertheless, further developments in microalgae culture offer a 27 promising alternative lipid source of LC-PUFA to FO in salmon feeds that warrants 28 further investigation.

29

Key words: Atlantic salmon, *Salmo salar, Schizochytrium* sp. algal-meal, fish oil
replacement, fatty acids, persistent organic pollutants (POPs), PCDD/Fs, DL-PCBs,
PBDEs.

33

34 Chemical compounds studied in this article

35 Docosahexaenoic acid (PubChem CID: 445580); Eicosapentaenoic acid (PubChem
36 CID: 446284)

## 37 **1. Introduction**

38 It is widely accepted that fish consumption is an excellent source of the 39 beneficial omega-3 long-chain polyunsaturated fatty acids (n-3 LC-PUFA), 40 eicosapentaenoic acid (EPA; 20:5n-3) and docosahexaenoic acid (DHA; 22:6n-3), 41 which have important roles in protecting against cardiovascular disease as well as 42 neurological and inflammatory conditions among other health benefits (Calder & 43 Yaqoob, 2009). Nevertheless, fish consumption, particularly oily fish, is also a major 44 dietary exposure route for humans to persistent organic pollutants (POPs), including 45 dioxins [polychlorinated] dibenzo-*p*-dioxins (PCDDs) and polychlorinated 46 dibenzofurans (PCDFs)], dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls (DL-PCBs) and 47 polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs). These lipophilic compounds are easily 48 absorbed and rapidly distributed to lipid-rich organs and tissues which can result in 49 their bioaccumulation. Consequently, the beneficial effects may be offset by the 50 negative risks associated with fish intake.

51 In farmed fish, such as Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar), the traditional marine-52 derived components of fish feed, fish oil and fish meal, are considered to be the major 53 sources of POPs (Berntssen, Julshamn & Lundebye, 2010a; Jacobs, Covaci & 54 Schepens, 2002). Reducing the POP levels in fish oils, and ultimately the feeds and 55 flesh of fish, without affecting the LC-PUFA content, has been achieved using 56 decontamination techniques (Berntssen et al., 2010b; Sprague et al., 2010) or by 57 utilising less polluted fish oils from the southern hemisphere (Sprague et al., 2010). 58 However, the increased competition from the pharmaceutical and nutraceutical 59 industries for n-3 LC-PUFA coupled with the stagnated global supply of wild catch 60 fisheries has led to increased prices and supply pressures resulting in the aquafeed 61 sector investigating alternative lipid sources.

62 The partial and complete replacement of marine ingredients with agricultural 63 plant products, mainly of oilseed origin, has been performed in salmon without any 64 detrimental effects on growth performance or fish health (e.g. Bell, Henderson, 65 Tocher & Sargent, 2004; Bell, McGhee, Dick & Tocher, 2005). Such substitution 66 reduces the levels of undesirable POPs (Bell et al., 2005; Bell, Dick, Strachan, Guy, 67 Berntssen & Sprague, 2012; Berntssen et al., 2010a). Conversely, since the fatty acid 68 composition of fish tissue reflects that of the diet (Sargent, Tocher and Bell, 2002), 69 increasing the vegetable content in aquafeeds reduces the favourable LC-PUFA levels 70 abundant in fish oils, thereby compromising the overall nutritional quality of the final 71 product. Finishing diets can be employed to restore flesh n-3 LC-PUFA levels in 72 vegetable fed fish, although this still relies upon the inclusion of fish oils (Bell et al., 73 2004; 2012), albeit at the risk of increasing POP levels in a previously low 74 contaminated product (Bell et al., 2005, 2012). Since marine fish lack the conversion 75 pathways to efficiently produce EPA and DHA at appreciable levels, these essential 76 fatty acids must be obtained through the diet (Sargent et al., 2002).

77 Marine microalgae are primary producers of n-3 LC-PUFA, and are therefore a 78 promising alternative to the traditional marine derived ingredients of fish feed. 79 Several species have been identified as potential sources, among which the 80 thraustochytrids have been preferred due to their ease for large-scale heterotrophic 81 cultivation under controlled conditions to produce a high lipid product rich in n-3 LC-82 PUFA (Lewis, Nichols & McMeekin, 1999; Ratledge, 2005). Furthermore, unlike crude oils and oilseeds, algal biomass produced by fermentation is generally free 83 84 from environmental contaminants and heavy metals (Ratledge, 2005). Schizochytrium 85 sp. is a fast growing thraustochytrid microalgae, rich in DHA, with a relatively simple 86 culture process compared to other single-cell microalgae (Ganuza, Benítez-Santana, 87 Atalah, Vega-Orellana, Ganga & Izquierdo, 2008; Lewis et al. 1999). Subsequently, 88 the aquaculture industry has investigated the potential of thraustochytrids, particularly 89 Schizochytrium sp. in either dried biomass or oil extracted form, as an alternative 90 lipid source in enriching zooplankton for feeding to finfish larvae (Barclay & Zeller, 91 1996), supplementing channel catfish diets, Ictalurus punctatus, (Li, Robinson, 92 Tucker, Manning & Khoo, 2009), or as replacement for fish oils in diets for sea 93 bream, Sparus aurata (Ganuza et al., 2008), and Atlantic salmon (Carter, Bransden, 94 Lewis & Nichols, 2003; Miller, Nichols & Carter, 2007). However, to date no such 95 studies have been performed in post-smolt salmon to assess Schizochytrium sp. 96 inclusion as a potential replacement for fish oil in grow-out feeds and its effects on 97 the nutritional quality of the final product.

The present study therefore evaluated the replacement of fish oil with a DHArich algal meal, derived from *Schizochytrium* sp., at two different inclusion levels (11 and 5.5% of diet) on the fatty acid and POP compositions of Atlantic salmon diets and flesh compared to fish fed a fish oil diet of either northern or southern hemisphere origin.

103

104 **2. Materials and Methods** 

# 105 2.1. Experimental set-up and diets

The trial was performed at Marine Harvest's (Scotland) Feed Trial Unit (Ardnish, Inverness-shire, Scotland) using a commercial strain of 1,700 1+ Atlantic salmon post-smolts. Fish ( $850 \pm 100$  g, mean  $\pm$  SD) were initially stocked into four 125 m<sup>3</sup> sea pens and acclimatized for 10 weeks during which they were fed a high rapeseed/fish oil (6:1, w/w) preconditioning diet in order to reduce flesh POPs and LC-PUFA levels. Fish (1534  $\pm$  400 g) were then split between twelve pens (130 fish 112 per pen) and acclimated for one-week prior to the enrichment phase. Triplicate pens 113 were fed one of four diets for 19 weeks consisting of either (a) northern hemisphere 114 fish oil (NFO) as control, (b) southern hemisphere fish oil (SFO), or (c/d) a DHA-rich drum dried Schizochytrium sp. algal meal (AquaGrow Gold<sup>®</sup>; Advanced 115 116 BioNutrition, Columbia, MD, USA) at two dietary inclusion levels, 5.5% (5.5AM) or 117 11% (11AM) with 25% and 21% added rapeseed oil respectively. All diets were 118 formulated (Table 1) and produced by BioMar UK (Grangemouth, Scotland). Fish 119 were fed twice daily using automatic feeders with uneaten food collected via waste 120 uplift systems to monitor feed intake. Feed fed, waste feed and the resulting net feed 121 intake were registered daily, as were any mortalities. Fish were reared under natural 122 photoperiod and temperature (range 6.5-13.8°C) for the duration of the trial. At the 123 start and end of the enrichment phase, all fish in each pen were bulk weighed. The was calculated as: SGR (%bw.day<sup>-1</sup>) = 124 specific growth rate (SGR) 125  $100 \times [\ln(W_F/W_I)/d]$ , where  $W_F$  and  $W_I$  are the final and initial weights (g) respectively, and d is the number of days. Thermal growth coefficient (TGC) was 126 calculated as TGC =  $(W_F^{1/3}-W_I^{1/3}) \times (1000/DD)$ , where  $W_F$  and  $W_I$  are as previously 127 128 addressed for SGR, and DD is the cumulative daily water temperature (°C) in SW.

129

# 130 2.2. Sample collection

Samples of the precondition and experimental feeds were collected, wrapped in aluminium foil, before placing into sealable polythene bags and stored at  $-70^{\circ}$ C until analysis. Diets were analysed using standard methods to determine crude lipid (acid hydrolysis of soxhlet samples, Teactor Soxtec method); moisture (AOAC, 2000); crude protein (Kjeldahl, calculated as N×6.25); Ash (AOAC, 2000) and energy (bomb calorimeter: Gallenkamp Autobomb, calibrated with benzoic acid).

137 At the end of the preconditioning phase (initial), 4 fish were removed from the 138 cages, anaesthetized and killed by a single blow to the head. Flesh from the 139 Norwegian Quality Cut (NQC) region was removed, wrapped in aluminium foil and 140 stored in sealable polythene bags at -70°C until analysis. Following termination of the 141 enrichment phase, 6 fish per dietary treatment were anaesthetized and killed by a 142 single blow to the head and NQC flesh removed and stored as per initial fish. Fatty 143 acid analysis was performed for individual fish, whereas flesh was pooled from each 144 pen (2 initial, 3 per enrichment treatment) for POPs analysis. The experiment was 145 subjected to ethical approval by the University of Stirling Ethics Committee and 146 carried out in accordance with the UK Animals (Scientific Procedures) Act 1986.

147

## 148 2.3. Lipid content and total lipid fatty acid composition

Total lipid content was determined gravimetrically after extraction of ~1 g tissue or diet by homogenizing in 20 or 36 volumes of ice-cold chloroform/methanol (2:1 v/v) respectively, using an Ultra-Turrax tissue disrupter (Fisher Scientific, Loughborough, UK) according to Folch, Lees and Stanley (1957). Non-lipid impurities were isolated by washing with 0.88% (w/v) KCl and the upper aqueous layer removed by aspiration and the lower solvent layer containing the lipid extract dried under oxygen-free nitrogen.

Fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) from total lipid were prepared by acidcatalyzed transmethylation at 50°C for 16h (Christie, 1993). FAME were extracted and purified as described previously (Tocher & Harvie, 1988) and separated and quantified by GC using a Fisons GC-8160 (Thermo Scientific, Milan, Italy) equipped with a 30 m x 0.32 mm i.d. x 0.25  $\mu$ m ZB-wax column (Phenomenex, Cheshire, UK), 'on column' injection and flame ionization detection. Hydrogen was used as carrier

gas with initial oven thermal gradient from 50 to 150°C at 40°C.min<sup>-1</sup> to a final
temperature of 230°C at 2°C.min<sup>-1</sup>. Individual FAME were identified by comparison
to known standards (Supelco<sup>TM</sup> 37-FAME mix; Sigma-Aldrich Ltd., Poole, UK) and
published data (Tocher & Harvie, 1988). Data were collected and processed using
Chromcard for Windows (Version 1.19; Thermoquest Italia S.p.A., Milan, Italy).
Fatty acid content per g of tissue was calculated using heptadecanoic acid (17:0) as
internal standard.

169

# 170 2.4. Persistent organic pollution (POP) extraction and clean-up

171 The 29 PCDD/F and DL-PCB congeners with WHO-TEF values (Van den Berg 172 et al., 2006) and nine PBDE congeners (IUPAC numbers 28, 47, 49, 66, 99, 100, 153, 173 154, 183) were targeted in samples as previously described (Sprague, Dick, Medina, 174 Tocher, Bell & Mourente, 2012). Briefly, lipid was extracted from 25 g of diet or 175 freeze-dried tissue (ca. 65 g wet weight) by accelerated solvent extraction (ASE<sup>™</sup>100; Dionex, Camberley, UK) following addition of 5 ng.ml<sup>-1</sup> PBDE119 and 176 2 ng.ml<sup>-1</sup><sup>13</sup>C-labelled PCDD/F and PCB internal standards (Wellington Laboratories, 177 178 Guelph, Ontario, Canada). Sample extracts were loaded for further clean-up and 179 fractionation of analytes using the automated Power-Prep<sup>TM</sup> system (Fluid 180 Management Systems Inc., Watertown, MA, USA) followed by conditioning of the 181 disposable column series, consisting of multi-layered silica (4 g acid, 2 g base, 1.5 g 182 neutral), basic alumina (8 g) and carbon (2 g). Total run time was 150 min followed 183 by a 40 min decontamination programme. The mono-ortho PCB and PBDE fraction 184 (F1) was eluted in 120 ml isohexane/dichloromethane (1:1, v/v) and the PCDD/F and 185 non-ortho PCB fraction (F2) in 120 ml toluene. Fractions underwent further clean up 186 with F1 transferred to silanized vials containing 150 µl nonane as keeper and

187 evaporated to 500 or 100  $\mu$ l prior to analysis for PBDE and mono-*ortho* PCBs, 188 respectively, and F2 transferred to conical GC autosampler vials containing 10  $\mu$ l of 189 nonane as keeper and evaporated to 50 or 10  $\mu$ l prior to analysis for non-*ortho* PCB 190 and PCDD/F, respectively.

191

192 2.5. Instrumental analysis

193 Mono-, non-ortho PCBs and PCDD/Fs extracts were analysed using a PolarisQ<sup>TM</sup> ion trap MS/MS coupled to a Trace GC 2000 (Thermo Finnigan, Bremen, Germany) 194 equipped with a 30 m x 0.25 mm i.d. x 0.25 µm Rxi<sup>®</sup>-5ms (5% diphenyl, 95% 195 196 dimethyl polysiloxane) fused-silica capillary column (Thames Restek Ltd., 197 Saunderton, UK). Samples and standards (2 µl) were injected in splitless mode. The 198 GC oven temperature programmes were as reported by Sprague et al. (2012). Helium 199 was used as carrier gas at constant flow (0.8 ml.min<sup>-1</sup>). Injector, transfer line and ion 200 source temperatures were maintained at 250, 305 and 250°C, respectively. The MS 201 operated in positive electron ionisation (EI+) mode using automatic gain control with 202 electron energy of 70 eV and emission current of 250 µA. Quantification was based 203 on US Environmental Protection Agency isotopic dilution methods (EPA, 1994, 204 1999). Relative response factors (RRFs) for individual 2,3,7,8-chlorosubstituted 205 PCDD/F and DL-PCB congeners were determined using calibration standards. 206 Xcalibar<sup>™</sup> version 1.3 was used for data acquisition and results processing.

207 PBDEs (1µl) were injected in splitless mode (225°C, 1.5 min) with surge (240 208 kPa) on a Trace GC Ultra<sup>TM</sup> equipped with a 30 m x 0.25 mm i.d. x 0.25 µm ZB5-MS 209 column (Phenomenex, Cheshire, UK) coupled to a Trace DSQ<sup>TM</sup> MS (Thermo 210 Finnigan, Bremen, Germany) operating in negative chemical ion mode (CI<sup>-</sup>). The GC 211 temperature programme was as previously reported (Sprague et al., 2012). Helium

was used as carrier gas at constant flow (1.2 ml.min<sup>-1</sup>) and methane as reagent gas (2.0 ml.min<sup>-1</sup>). The MS operated in selective ion monitoring (SIM) mode by monitoring bromide isotope ions (m/z 81 and 79) with dwell time of 80 ms. Quantification of PBDE congeners was performed by congener-specific linear calibration curves ( $r^2 > 0.99$ ). Xcalibar<sup>TM</sup> version 1.4 was used for data acquisition and results processing.

218

# 219 2.6. Quality assurance (QA) and quality control (QC)

220 Samples were ran with a procedural blank, a duplicate sample and an 'in-house' 221 reference material, consisting of pooled salmon flesh, cross referenced with an 222 external laboratory. Limits of detection (LOD) were determined using a software 223 option for estimating signal-to-noise (S/N) ratio, where limit of quantification (LOQ) 224 was three times LOD (nine times S/N ratio). LOQs were in the range of 0.01-0.03 pg.g<sup>-1</sup> wet weight (ww) for PCDD/Fs, 0.1-0.5 pg.g<sup>-1</sup> ww for non-ortho PCBs, 2.1-3.9 225 pg.g<sup>-1</sup> ww for mono-*ortho* PCBs and 6-48 pg.g<sup>-1</sup> ww for PBDEs. Recovery values for 226 PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs, based on congener-specific response factors of <sup>13</sup>C internal 227 surrogate standard relative to <sup>13</sup>C performance standards (EPA, 1994), were in the 228 229 range of 76-114%. Percentage recoveries for PBDEs, based on spiked sample matrix 230 with internal standards for all congeners, were in the range of 78-118%. Method 231 performance was further assessed through satisfactory participation of 232 'Interlaboratory Comparison on Dioxins in Food' tests organized by the Norwegian 233 Institute for Public Health. Results for PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs are presented on a 234 WHO-TEQ basis using 2006 TEFs (Van den Berg et al., 2006), although total 235 PCDD/Fs and DL-PCB values are also expressed on 1998 TEFs (Van den Berg et al., 236 1998) for comparative purposes.

237

# 238 2.7. Statistical analysis

239 Results are presented as mean and relative standard deviation (%RSD), unless otherwise specified. Statistical analyses were performed using Minitab<sup>®</sup> v.16.1.0 240 241 statistical software (Minitab Inc.). Data were assessed for normality with 242 Kolmogorov-Smirnov test and for homogeneity of variances by Bartlett's test and 243 examination of residual plots and, where necessary, transformed using the natural 244 logarithm or arcsine transformation. Data were compared by a one-way analysis of 245 variance (ANOVA), with replicate cages nested within their dietary treatment groups. 246 Post hoc comparisons were made using Tukey's test (Zar, 1999). A significance of 247 P<0.05 was applied to all statistical tests performed.

248

## 249 **3. Results and Discussion**

## 250 3.1. Dietary fatty acid and POP compositions

251 The fatty acid compositions of the precondition and enrichment diets are 252 presented in Table 1. Since the aim of the present study was to investigate the effects 253 of the algal-feeds on LC-PUFA levels, fish were first fed a preconditioning feed 254 consisting mainly of rapeseed oil to decrease n-3 LC-PUFA levels. Previous studies 255 using vegetable-based diets have shown a decrease in the levels of flesh EPA and 256 DHA due to the absence of these particular fatty acids in plant-based ingredients 257 (Bell et al., 2004, 2005, 2012; Berntssen et al., 2010a). Thus, the precondition diet 258 was largely comprised of oleic (18:1n-9), linoleic (18:2n-6), palmitic (16:0) and  $\alpha$ -259 linolenic (18:3n-3) acids accounting for 46, 18, 8 and 7% of total fatty acids, 260 respectively, with relatively low levels of EPA (3.6%) and DHA (2.3%) derived from 261 the minor inclusion of fish oil and meal to maintain basic fish requirements.

262 Fatty acid compositions for both algal feeds were similar to the precondition diet 263 due to the high inclusion of rapeseed oil. Commercial aquafeeds often incorporate 264 blends of vegetable and fish or other oils to meet the nutritional requirements of the 265 fish being farmed. Furthermore, the extraction of oil from the single cell biomass 266 greatly increases the overall production costs (Miller et al., 2007; Ratledge, 2005), 267 subsequently limiting its use as a sole oil source replacement for fish oil in feeds. 268 Therefore, the present study combined the dried algal biomass with rapeseed oil to 269 increase the essential n-3 LC-PUFA content resulting in a DHA content of 8.1% 270 (11AM) and 5.3% (5.5AM). Additionally, the algal inclusion resulted in higher levels 271 of the n-6 docosapentaenoic acid isomer (DPA; 22:5n-6) than the other feeds. This is 272 a common feature of Schizochytrium sp. production, where approximately 20% of the 273 DHA produced is DPA, a metabolically neutral fatty acid that has no overall effect on 274 DHA uptake (Ratledge, 2005). Dietary lipid of the fish oil treatments, NFO and SFO, 275 on the other hand contained 3-7 times lower levels of 18:1n-9, 18:2n-6 and 18:3n-3 276 than the precon and algal diets. Both diets resembled the nutritional composition of 277 their natural diets being largely characterized by 16:0, 18:1n-9, cetoleic (22:1n-11) 278 and gondoic (20:1n-9) acids. The major PUFA were DHA and EPA with the NFO 279 diet containing a lower EPA (8.0%) and a higher DHA (10.2%) level than the SFO 280 diet (12.3 and 8.4%, respectively), as is commonly observed between oils sourced 281 from the northern and southern hemispheres (Sargent et al., 2002).

In addition to decreasing LC-PUFA levels, vegetable feeds have also been shown to contain lower POP levels than their fish oil counterparts (Bell et al., 2005, 2012; Berntssen et al., 2010a). Consequently, the vegetable-based precon diet contained lower POP levels (0.267 pgWHO-TEQ.g<sup>-1</sup> ΣPCDD/Fs + DL-PCBs, 0.273 ng.g<sup>-1</sup> ww ΣPBDEs) than both fish oil based feeds, irrespective of origin (Table 2). Furthermore, 287 the SFO diet contained approximately half the level of POPs than the NFO diet (0.973 against 1.824 pgWHO-TEQ.g<sup>-1</sup> ww  $\Sigma$ PCDD/Fs + DL-PCBs and 1.086 against 288 2.395 ng.g<sup>-1</sup> ww  $\Sigma$ PBDEs, respectively). Southern hemisphere fish oils typically 289 290 contain lower POP levels than those from the northern hemisphere (Brevik et al., 291 1990), reflecting the differences in pollution levels of marine waters between 292 hemispheres (Fowler, 1990). The NFO control feed however, is in the range reported 293 by Berntssen et al. (2010b) for a fish oil control diet, 2.31 against 2.18 pgWHO- $TEQ_{1998}.g^{-1}$  ww  $\Sigma PCDD/Fs + DL-PCBs$  reported in this study, and is lower than 294 295 levels reported by Bell et al. (2005) for both a high- and low-fish oil diet (4.1 and 2.3 pgWHO-TEQ<sub>1998</sub>.g<sup>-1</sup> ww  $\Sigma$ PCDD/Fs + DL-PCBs respectively). This highlights the 296 297 awareness and efforts taken by the aquafeed industry in recent years in reducing 298 dietary POP levels. Nevertheless, the lowest POP levels were measured in the two algal feeds (0.080 and 0.120 pgWHO-TEQ.g<sup>-1</sup> ww  $\Sigma$ PCDD/Fs + DL-PCBs and 0.154 299 and 0.059 ng.g<sup>-1</sup> ww  $\Sigma$ PBDEs, 11AM and 5.5AM respectively) yielding a reduction 300 301 of >94% compared to the NFO diet and >85% relative to SFO, similar to reductions 302 seen where fish oil based feeds have been decontaminated (Berntssen et al., 2010b; 303 Sprague et al., 2010). Since the algal biomass is produced under controlled conditions 304 the potential for contamination from environmental pollutants and heavy metals is greatly reduced (Ratledge, 2005). The residual amounts of POPs measured in the 305 306 algal feeds from the present study are therefore most likely contributable to other feed 307 ingredients, most notably fish meal, since this along with fish oil is known to be a 308 major POP contributor in fish feeds (Berntssen et al., 2010a; Jacobs et al., 2002). 309 Equally, the utilization of rapeseed oil in both the precon and algal-based feeds may 310 have resulted in the increase of another lipophilic POP not measured in this study. 311 Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) were found to increase in fish flesh when

vegetable oils replaced fish oils, although organochlorine pesticides along with
PCDD/Fs, PCBs and PBDEs decreased (Berntssen et al., 2010a).

314

## 315 *3.2. Growth and feed intake*

316 The replacement of fish oil with the algal biomass had no significant effect on 317 the overall weight gain of fish (Table 3). However, fish fed the 11AM diet exhibited a 318 minor but significantly lower growth rate than both fish oil treatments but not 5.5AM 319 fed fish. This is in contrast to Carter et al. (2003) and Miller et al. (2007) who found 320 no growth detriment when algal biomass or oil replaced fish oil in the diets of 321 Atlantic salmon parr-smolts. In addition, the food conversion ratio (FCR) for both 322 algal-fed treatments was significantly higher than NFO fed fish but similar to SFO. 323 One possible explanation, particularly at the higher inclusion of algal meal, may be 324 related to digestibility. In a similar study, Reitan, Erikson, Galloway, Berge and 325 Kjørsvik (2012) replaced fish oil with other microalgae species (Nannochloropsis sp., 326 Phaeodactylum tricornutum and Isochrysis galbana) in the diets of salmon and 327 Atlantic cod, Gadus morhua. They found that inclusion levels up to 6% gave good 328 digestibility whereas 12% microalgae inclusion resulted in a reduced digestibility, 329 although appetite remained unchanged.

No differences in the health status and/or immune function were recorded (data not presented), consistent with the results of several previous trials where partial or full replacement of fish oils were employed when using fish meal based diets (Bell et al., 2004; Bell et al., 2005).

334

#### 335 3.3. Flesh fatty acid and POP compositions

336 Flesh lipid levels of Atlantic salmon fed the enrichment diets significantly 337 increased from initial levels of 6.7 to 10.1-11.2%, with no significant differences 338 observed between the four dietary treatments (Table 4). Fatty acid compositions of 339 the flesh accurately reflected that of the diet fed, in accordance with results normally 340 found for salmon and other fish species (Sargent et al., 2002). The algal dietary 341 treatments shared similar fatty acid profiles with elevated fillet flesh levels of 18:2n-6 342 and 18:1n-9 compared to both fish oil treatments consistent with results where 343 salmon have been fed diets based on plant oils due to the use of rapeseed oil in the 344 diet (Bell et al., 2012; Miller et al., 2007). The major difference between the algal-fed 345 treatments was a significantly higher level of DHA in the flesh of 11AM fish (8.9%) 346 compared to 5.5AM fish (7.4%), arising from the difference in algal biomass inclusion. However, there was no overall increase in DHA in fish fed 5.5AM relative 347 348 to initial levels (7.6%). Furthermore, percentage levels of DHA in the 11AM-fed fish 349 were still significantly lower than for fish fed a fish oil based diet (10.4% SFO, 11.7% NFO). This would suggest that an algal inclusion level greater than 11% is 350 351 required to increase flesh DHA above basal levels and to establish similar levels to 352 those found in fish oil based diets. In previous studies, Miller et al. (2007) and Carter 353 et al. (2003) observed greater flesh DHA levels in salmon parr-smolts when 354 Schizochytrium sp. replaced fish oil. However, caution should be applied when 355 comparing results since the former authors utilised the richer oil extract as the sole oil 356 source compared to a fish oil control whereas the latter authors elected to use 10% 357 algal biomass and rapeseed, as in the present study, with a control diet consisting of a 358 blend of vegetable and fish oils. While the latter control diet is more consistent with 359 the formulation of commercial diets currently used by the industry, the present study 360 sought to evaluate the dried algal biomass against a fish oil only diet to assess DHA

levels and is, to our knowledge, the first to trial *Schizochytrium* sp. as a potential fishoil replacement in grow-out feeds for Atlantic salmon.

363 The most significant, but not unexpected, difference in flesh fatty acid content 364 between dietary treatments is the lack of EPA in fish fed the algal diets (2.6 and 365 2.9%, 11AM and 5.5AM respectively) compared to NFO (5.9%) and SFO (8.1%). 366 This corresponds with results reported in earlier studies where a DHA-rich microalgal 367 sp. replaced fish oil (Carter et al. 2003; Eryalçin et al., 2013; Ganuza et al., 2012; 368 Miller et al., 2007). Moreover, EPA levels in the flesh of both algal treatments 369 significantly decreased as compared to initial levels (4.9%), possibly a result of a 370 dilution effect as flesh lipid increased or a depletion of this essential fatty acid. In 371 general, n-3 LC-PUFA are important for the somatic growth of marine fish with DHA 372 the most highly retained PUFA in a variety of species (Sargent et al., 2002). Ganuza 373 et al. (2012) noted that growth, survival and disease resistance of sea bream larvae 374 was unaffected when fish oil was substituted with *Schizochytrium* sp. but was altered 375 when all dietary lipid (i.e. fish oil and fish meal) was replaced by algal biomass, a 376 result of a dietary imbalance of fatty acids which was rectified by EPA 377 supplementation. However, the dietary requirements of EPA and DHA in fish are 378 more essential at early life stages (Sargent et al., 2002) and the inclusion of fish meal 379 in the algal feeds would most likely have contained sufficient quantities of EPA for 380 basic metabolic processes. Fish oil is still the main source of EPA, as the complex 381 characteristics of EPA-producing algal species involve high-energy, high-costs and 382 are time consuming (Ratledge, 2005). Nevertheless, since the trial was performed a 383 Schizochytrium sp. algae with a minimum EPA and DHA content of no less than 10 384 and 22%, respectively, has come on to the market (Gray, 2010), primarily targeting 385 the feed/infant formulation sectors. More recently, Ruiz-Lopez, Haslam, Napier and Sayanova (2014) have successfully produced an alternative transgenic plant source of
n-3 LC-PUFA using an oilseed crop *Camelina sativa* to achieve levels of 12% EPA
and 14% DHA, similar to levels found in fish oils which may have potential in
aquafeeds (Betancor et al., 2015).

390 The POP concentrations from the flesh of fish fed the experimental diets for 19-391 weeks are presented in Table 5. Berntssen et al. (2010b) stress that feeding trials of 392 short duration (e.g. 1-3 months) yield relatively lower levels of POPs compared to the 393 typical time taken to farm salmon to harvest size, due to flesh POP accumulation over 394 time. At the end of the present study significant differences in flesh POP levels 395 between treatments were observed being in the order of NFO>SFO>11AM/5.5AM (0.803, 0.532, 0.247 and 0.263 pg.WHO-TEQ<sub>2005</sub>.g<sup>-1</sup> ww ΣPCDD/F + DL-PCBs 396 respectively, and 1.233, 0.702, 0.268 and 0.267 ng.g<sup>-1</sup> ww **SPBDEs** respectively), 397 398 reflecting the differences in dietary POP levels. Over the course of a full production 399 cycle the fillet POP levels would further increase, although differences between 400 dietary treatments would be expected to be maintained. Furthermore, the current costs 401 for the algal biomass are similar to or even higher than those for fish meal and fish oil 402 meaning that, at present, it is not practicable to feed the algal-based feeds over a full 403 production cycle. Instead, it may be more economical to include algal diets as a 404 finishing feed by first feeding a vegetable-based feed followed by a short-period of 405 feeding the algal feeds, as performed in the present study. This would help alleviate 406 costs as well as further reduce the POP levels, in contrast to fish oil finishing feeds 407 (Bell et al., 2005; 2012).

408 The lower levels of POPs, specifically PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs, in the flesh of 409 initial fish (0.156 pg.WHO-TEQ<sub>2005</sub>.g<sup>-1</sup> ww) compared to algal-fed fish, despite the 410 preconditioning diet containing higher POPs levels (0.267, 0.069 and 0.098 pgWHO-

TEQ<sub>2005</sub>.g<sup>-1</sup> ww, Precon, 11AM and 5.5AM, respectively), is most likely a result of
differences in flesh lipid levels between initial (6.7%) and algal-fed fish (10.9 and
11.2%, 11AM and 5.5AM, respectively) affecting the uptake of these lipophilic
compounds. Thus, lipid normalized values were 2.33 (initial), 7.95 (NFO), 5.27
(SFO), 2.27 (11AM) and 2.35 (5.5AM) pgWHO-TEQ<sub>2005</sub>.g<sup>-1</sup> lw.

416

#### 417 3.4. Nutritional value from salmon consumption: risk-benefit

418 One of the major selling points cited for consuming oily fish, such as salmon, is 419 their unique source of n-3 LC PUFA, EPA and DHA, known to benefit human health 420 (Calder & Yaqoob, 2009). Replacing fish oil with Schizochytrium sp. results in a 130 421 g portion, as advised by the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA, 2005), 422 providing 1.4 and 1.3 g of EPA+DHA, 11AM and 5.5AM respectively (Figure 1), 423 equivalent to 40% (11AM) or 36% (5.5AM) of the suggested 3.5 g weekly intake of 424 EPA+DHA recommended by the International Society for the Study of Fatty Acids 425 and Lipids for optimal cardiac health in adults (ISSFAL, 2004). Nevertheless, this is 426 still significantly less than for fish oil fed salmon, supplying 2.0 g (NFO) and 1.9 g 427 (SFO) EPA+DHA or 57 and 53% of the recommended weekly intake respectively. 428 This difference is attributable to differences in EPA levels, since the Schizochytrium 429 sp. used was a DHA-rich only microalgae product and, as previously discussed, fish 430 oil is still the main source of EPA. Despite this, algal-fed fish still remain a rich 431 source of DHA when fed at the higher inclusion level, with no significant differences between absolute amounts of DHA in 11AM fish  $(1.1 \pm 0.1 \text{ g}.100\text{g}^{-1})$  compared to 432 both NFO (1.2  $\pm$  0.2 ) and SFO (1.1  $\pm$  0.1 g.100g^-1), despite differences in percentage 433 434 terms.

435 Fish consumption also represents a major dietary exposure risk to humans 436 through the accumulation of POPs. Accordingly, the European Scientific Committee 437 on Food (SCF) has set a tolerable weekly intake (TWI) level of 14 pg.WHO-TEQ.kg 438 <sup>1</sup> body wt for PCDD/Fs + DL-PCBs (SCF, 2001), equivalent to 980 pg.WHO-TEQ 439 for an adult of 70 kg. Based on the same 130 g servings, NFO-fed fish contribute 440  $104.3 \pm 8.1$  pg.WHO-TEQ, significantly higher than SFO-fed fish (69.1  $\pm$  3.0 441 pg.WHO-TEQ) both of which are significantly higher than algal-fed fish  $(32.1 \pm 2.4)$ 442 and  $34.4 \pm 3.1$  pg.WHO-TEQ, 11AM and 5.5AM respectively). This represents just 443 10.6% (NFO), 7.1% (SFO), 3.3% (11AM) and 3.5% (5.5AM) of the TWI for an adult 444 of 70 kg. Food health authorities typically recommend consuming two portions of 445 fish per week, one of which is oily (EFSA, 2005). From the present study, consuming 446 two portions of either fish oil- or algal-fed fish would contribute 120-130 or 80-90% 447 of the recommended EPA+DHA weekly intake and only 15-20 or 7% of the TWI for 448 PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs, respectively. These results indicate that previously 449 identified high-risk groups such as young girls, women of child bearing age, and 450 those pregnant and/or breast-feeding can safely consume more than two portions per 451 week without exceeding their TWI, although this does not take into consideration 452 POP intake from other dietary sources.

At present, PBDE levels in foods are not limited by legislation although EFSA have issued an advisory TWI of 0.7  $\mu$ g.kg<sup>-1</sup> body wt.week<sup>-1</sup>, equivalent to 49.0  $\mu$ g PBDE.week<sup>-1</sup> for a 70 kg adult (EFSA, 2005). From the present study, a 130 g portion corresponds to 0.16 or 0.09  $\mu$ g PBDEs for the NFO and SFO treatments respectively and 0.03  $\mu$ g PBDEs for both algal treatments, all of which are less than 1% of the advisory TWI for PBDEs.

#### 460 **4. Conclusion**

461 The replacement of fish oil with a DHA-rich Schizochytrium sp. microalgae 462 significantly decreases both dietary and flesh fillet POP levels compared to fish oil 463 based treatments. Moreover, flesh fillet DHA levels can be tailored to similar levels 464 in fish oil fed fish when algal biomass is included at 11% of the diet. However, the 465 absence of EPA in algal-based diets significantly impairs the overall nutritional value, 466 in terms of g EPA+DHA per serving, to the final human consumer. Current and 467 future developments in algal culture technology may provide a final affordable 468 product of nutritional quality in terms of LC-PUFA content as an alternative to fish 469 oil in aquafeeds.

470

#### 471 Conflict of Interest Statement

472 None of the authors have a conflict of interest.

473

#### 474 **References**

475 AOAC, 2000. Official methods of analysis of AOAC International. 17<sup>th</sup> ed. AOAC

476 International, Gaithersburg, Maryland, USA.

Barclay, W., Zeller, S. 1996. Nutritional enhancement of n-3 and n-6 fatty acid in
rotifers and Artemia nauplii by feeding spray-dried *Schizochytrium* sp. *Journal of the World Aquaculture Society*, 314-322.

480 Bell, J.G., Dick, J.R., Strachan, F., Guy, D.R., Berntssen, M.H.G., Sprague, M. 2012.

481 Complete replacement of fish oil with a blend of vegetable oils affects dioxin,

482 dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) and polybrominated diphenyl

483 ethers (PBDEs) in 3 Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar) families differing in flesh

484 adiposity. *Aquaculture*, 324-325, 118-126.

485	Bell, J.G., Henderson, R.J., Tocher, D.R., Sargent, J.R. 2004. Replacement of dietary
486	fish oil with increasing levels of linseed oil: modification of flesh fatty acid
487	compositions in Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar) using a fish oil finishing diet.
488	<i>Lipids</i> , 39, 223-232.

- Bell, J.G., McGhee, F., Dick, J.R., Tocher, D.R. 2005. Dioxin and dioxin-like
  polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) in Scottish farmed salmon (*Salmo salar*):
  effects of replacement of dietary marine fish oil with vegetable oils. *Aquaculture*,
  243, 308-314.
- Berntssen, M.H.G., Julshamn, K., Lundebye, A.-K., 2010a. Chemical contaminants in
  aquafeeds and Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) following the use of traditionalversus alternative feed ingredients. *Chemosphere*, 78, 637-646.
- Berntssen, M.H.G., Olsvik, P.A., Torstensen, B.E., Julshamn, K., Midtun, T.,
  Goksøyr, A., Johansen, J., Sigholt, T., Joerum, N., Jakobsen, J.-K., Lundebye,
  A.-K., Lock, E.-J. 2010b. Reducing persistent organic pollutants while
  maintaining long chain omega-3 fatty acid in farmed Atlantic salmon using
  decontaminated fish oils for an entire production cycle. *Chemosphere*, 81, 242252.
- Tocher, D.R. 2015. A nutritionally-enhanced oil from transgenic *Camelina sativa*effectively replaces fish oil as a source of eicosapentaenoic acid for fish. *Scientific Reports*, 5, 8104.

Betancor, M.B., Sprague, M., Usher, S., Sayanova, O., Campbell, P.J., Napier, J.A.,

502

Brevik, E.M., Biseth, A., Oehme, M. 1990. Levels of polychlorinated dibenzofurans
and dibenzo-p-dioxins in crude and processed fish oils in relation to origin and
cleaning method. *Organohalogen Compounds*, 1, 467-470.

- 509 Calder, P.C., Yaqoob, P. 2009. Omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids and human
  510 health outcomes. *Biofactors*, 35, 266-272.
- 511 Carter, C.G., Bransden, M.P., Lewis, T.E., Nichols, P.D. 2003. Potential of
  512 Thraustochytrids to partially replace fish oil in Atlantic salmon feeds. *Marine*513 *Biotechnology*, 5, 480-492.
- 514 Christie, W.W., 1993. Preparation of derivatives of fatty acids for chromatographic
- analysis, in: Christie, W.W. (Ed.), Advances in Lipid Methodology Two, The
  Oily Press, Dundee, pp. 69-111.
- EFSA, 2005. Opinion of the scientific panel on contaminants in the food chain on a
  request from the European Parliament related to the safety assessment of wild
  and farmed fish. EFSA J., 236, 1-118.
- 520 EPA, 1994. Method 1613: Tetra-through octa-chlorinated dioxins and furans by
  521 isotope dilution HRGC/HRMS, EPA no. 821B94005, October 1994. Washington
  522 DC: Environmental Protection Agency.
- 523 EPA, 1999. Method 1668: Chlorinated biphenyl congeners in water, soil, sediment,
  524 biosolids and tissue by HRGC/HRMS, EPA no. 821R00002, December 1999.
- 525 Washington DC: Environmental Protection Agency.
- 526 Eryalçin, K.M., Roo, J., Saleh, R., Atalah, E., Benítez, T., Betancor, M., Hernandez-
- 527 Cruz, M.C., Izquierdo, M. 2013. Fish oil replacement by different microalgal
- 528 products in microdiets for early weaning of gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*,
- 529 L.). Aquaculture Research, 44, 819-828.
- 530 Folch, J., Lees, M., Sloane Stanley, G.H. 1957. A simple method for the isolation and
- 531 purification of total lipids from animal tissues. J. Biol. Chem., 226, 497-509.

- Fowler, S.W., 1990. Critical review of selected heavy metal and chlorinated
  hydrocarbon concentrations in the marine environment. *Mar. Environ. Res.*, 29,
  1-64.
- Ganuza, E., Benítez-Santana, T., Atalah, E., Vega-Orellana, O., Ganga, R., Izquierdo,
  M.S. 2008. *Cryptocodinium cohnii* and *Schizochytrium* sp. as potential
  substitutes to fisheries-derived oils from seabream (*Sparus aurata*) microdiets. *Aquaculture*, 277, 109-116.
- 539 Gray, R.J.H. 2010. Application for the authorization of DHA and EPA-rich algal oil

Schizochytrium

- 541 <u>http://multimedia.food.gov.uk/multimedia/pdfs/dhaoapplicdossier.pdf</u>

540

from

- ISSFAL (2004). International Society for the Study of Fatty Acids and Lipids
  (ISSFAL) report of the sub-committee on: Recommendations for intake of
  polyunsaturated fatty acids in healthy adults. <u>http://www.issfal.org/news-</u>
  <u>links/resources/publications/PUFAIntakeReccomdFinalReport.pdf</u>
- 546 Jacobs, M.N., Covaci, A., Schepens, P. 2002. Investigation of selected persistent
- 547 organic pollutants in farmed Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*), salmon aquaculture
- feed, and fish oil components of the feed. *Environmental Science and Technology*, 36, 2797-2805.
- Lewis, T.E., Nichols, P.D., McMeekin, T.A. 1999. The biotechnological potential of
  Thraustochytrids. *Marine Biotechnology*, 1, 580-587.
- Li, M.H., Robinson, E.H., Tucker, C.S., Manning, B.B., Khoo, L.2009. Effects of dried algae *Schizochytrium* sp., a rich source of docosahexaenoic acid, on growth, fatty acid composition, and sensory quality of channel catfish *Ictalurus*
- 555 *punctatus. Aquaculture*, 292, 232-236.

sp.

- 556 Miller, M.R., Nichols, P.D., Carter, C.G. 2007. Replacement of fish oil with
- 557 thraustochytrid *Schizochytrium* sp. L oil in Atlantic salmon parr (*Salmo salar* L)

diets. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A*, 148, 382-392.

- 559 Ratledge, C. 2005. Single cell oils for the 21<sup>st</sup> century In: Cohen, Z. and Ratledge, C.
- 560 (Eds), Single Cell Oils, AOCS Press, Illinois, pp. 1-20.
- 561 Reitan, K.I., Erikson, T., Galloway, T., Berge, G. and Kjørsvik, E. (2012). Can fish
- 562 meal and fish oil be replaced by microalgae in feed for Atlantic salmon and563 Atlantic cod? Aqua 2012, European Aquaculture Society p.91.
- Ruiz-Lopez, N., Haslam, R.P., Napier, J.A., Sayanova, O. 2014. Successful highlevel accumulation of fish oil omega-3 long-chain polyunsaturated fatty acids in
  a transgenic oilseed crop. *The Plant Journal*, 77, 198-208.
- 567 Sargent, J.R., Tocher, D.R., Bell, J.G., 2002. The lipids In: Halver, J.E., Hardy, R.W.
  568 (Eds), Fish Nutrition, Academic Press, San Diego, pp. 182-246.
- 569 SACN/COT, 2004. Scientific Advisory Committee on Nutrition (SACN) and
- 570 Committee on Toxicity (COT). Advice on Fish Consumption: Benefits and571 Risks. The Stationary Office, Norwich, UK.
- 572 SCF, 2001. European Scientific Committee on Food (SCF), Opinion of the Scientific
- 573 Committee on Food on the risk assessment of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in 574 food. http://ec.europa.eu/food/fs/sc/scf/out90 en.pdf
- 575 Sprague, M., Bendiksen, E.Å., Dick, J.R., Strachan, F., Pratoomyot, J., Berntssen,
- 576 M.H.G., Tocher, D.R., Bell, J.G. 2010. Effects of decontaminated fish oil or a
- 577 fish and vegetable oil blend on persistent organic pollutant and fatty acid
- 578 compositions in diet and flesh of Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar). British Journal
- *of Nutrition*, 103, 1442-1451.

- 580 Sprague, M., Dick, J.R., Medina, A., Tocher, D.R., Bell, J.G., Mourente, G. 2012.
- 581 Lipid and fatty acid composition, and persistent organic pollutant levels in tissues
  582 of migrating Atlantic bluefin tuna (*Thunnus thynnus*, L.) broodstock.
  583 *Environmental Pollution*, 171, 61-71.
- Tocher, D.R., Harvie, D.G., 1988. Fatty acid compositions of the major
  phosphoglycerides from fish neural tissues: (*n*-3) and (*n*-6) polyunsaturated fatty
  acids in rainbow trout (*Salmo gairdneri* L.) and cod (*Gadus morhua*) brains and
  retinas. *Fish Physiol. Biochem.*, 5, 229-239.
- 588 Van den Berg, M., Birnbaum, L., Bosveld, A.T., Brunström, B., Cook, P., Freeley,
- 589 M., Giesy, J.P., Hanberg, A., Hasegawa, R., Kennedy, S.W., Kubiak, T., Larsen,
- 590 J.C., van Leeuwen, F.X., Liem, A.K., Nolt, C., Peterson, R.E., Poellinger, L.,
- Safe, S., Schrenk, D., Tillitt, D., Tysklind, M., Younes, M., Waern, F.,
  Zacharewski, T., 1998. Toxic equivalency factors (TEFs) for PCBs, PCDDs,
  PCDFs for humans and wildlife. 1998. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 106,
  775-792.
- 595 Van den Berg, M., Birnbaum, L.S., Denison, M., De Vito, M., Farland, W., Feeley,
- 596 M., Fiedler, H., Hakansson, H., Hanberg, A., Haws, L., Rose, M., Safe, S.,
- 597 Schrenk, D., Tohyama, C., Tritscher, A., Tuomisto, J., Tysklind, M., Walker, N.,
- Peterson, R.E. 2006. The 2005 World Health Organisation reevaluation of human
  and mammalian toxic equivalency factors for dioxins and dioxin-like
  compounds. *Toxicological Sciences*, 93, 223-241.
- Zar, J.H. 1999. *Biostatistical Analysis*, 663 pp. Prentice-Hall International, New
  Jersey.
- 603
- 604

605 Legend to Figure

606 **Figure 1.** 

Risk-benefit association, in terms of PCDD/F+DL-PCBs<sub>WHO-TEQ2005</sub> and EPA+DHA
intake (mean ± SD), from 130 g consumption of Atlantic salmon fed one of four
experimental diets. Dotted line represents the 980 pgWHO-TEQ TWI for an
adult of 70 kg and the recommended 3.5 g EPA+DHA weekly intake for optimal
cardiac health. Stacked bars represent contribution of DL-PCB and PCDD/Fs and
EPA + DHA to respective total values. Initial data are presented for comparative
purposes.





# **Table 1.** Ingredients, proximate composition (g.kg<sup>-1</sup>), energy (MJ.kg<sup>-1</sup>) and fatty acid content (% of total fatty acids) of the precondition and four experimental diets. 618

619

620

	D	Experimental			
	Precon	NFO	SFO	11%AM	5.5%AM
Component (g.kg <sup>-1</sup> )					
Fish meal	350	270	270	260	260
Vegetable protein concentrates	110	110	110	90	100
Oil seed meals	129	230	230	210	226
DDGS	40	-	-	-	-
Starch sources	151	130	130	120	120
Premixes / micronutrients	7	5	5	5	5
Northern fish oil	32	270	-	-	-
Southern fish oil	-	-	270	-	-
Rapeseed oil	185	-	-	213	246
ABN AquaGrow <sup>®</sup> Gold	-	-	-	110	55
Analysed Composition (as is)					
Lipid	252	300	303	318	313
Protein	393	342	349	336	347
Moisture	75	71	68	59	62
Ash	74	64	64	71	68
Gross energy (MJ.kg <sup>-1</sup> )	20.6	21.1	21.3	21.4	21.4
Fatty acid (% of total)					
14:0	1.7	5.3	6.4	2.6	1.7
16:0	8.4	14.1	16.0	10.3	8.2
18:0	2.2	2.6	2.8	2.0	1.9
Total saturates <sup>1</sup>	13.2	22.7	25.9	15.9	12.7
16:1n-7	2.1	4.8	6.8	0.7	1.1
18:1n-9	45.5	13.2	11.6	43.4	45.8
18:1n-7	3.5	2.6	2.8	2.5	3.1
20:1n-9	1.4	7.6	5.4	1.2	1.5
22:1n-11	0.5	12.1	8.2	0.1	0.5
Total monoenes <sup>2</sup>	53.5	43.3	36.8	48.6	52.9
18:2n-6	17.9	5.8	5.2	16.2	17.5
20:2n-6	0.1	0.3	0.2	0.1	0.1
20:4n-6	0.2	0.6	0.7	0.4	0.3
22:5n-6	0.1	0.2	0.2	2.5	1.3
Total n-6 PUFA <sup>3</sup>	18.2	7.2	6.6	19.2	19.1
18:3n-3	7.0	1.3	1.0	6.1	6.9
18:4n-3	0.5	3.1	2.9	0.2	0.3
20:5n-3	3.6	8.0	12.3	1.2	2.0
22:5n-3	0.4	1.7	1.6	0.2	0.3
22:6n-3	2.3	10.2	8.4	8.1	5.3
Total n-3 PUFA <sup>4</sup>	13.9	25.4	27.0	16.0	14.8
Total PUFA <sup>5</sup>	33.3	34.0	37.3	35.5	34.4
n-3:n-6	0.8	3.5	4.1	0.8	0.8

Values are presented as means based upon duplicate analyses

<sup>1</sup>includes 15:0, 20:0, 22:0, 24:0

<sup>2</sup>includes 16:1n-9, 20:1n-11, 20:1n-7, 22:1n-9, 24:1

<sup>3</sup>includes 18:3n-6, 20:2n-6, 20:3n-6, 22:4n-6 <sup>4</sup>includes 20:3n-3, 20:4n-3 <sup>5</sup>includes 16:2, 16:3, 16:4

621 622 623 624 625 626

**Table 2**. Concentrations of PCDD/Fs, DL-PCBs  $(pg.g^{-1} ww, upperbound WHO-TEQ_{2005})$  and PBDEs  $(ng.g^{-1} ww)$  in the precondition and four experimental diets fed 

to Atlantic salmon.  $\Sigma$ WHO-TEQ<sub>1998</sub> are presented for comparative purposes. 

	Duccon	Experimental					
	Frecon	NFO	SFO	11%AM	5.5%AM		
PCDD							
2378-TCDD	0.012	0.052	0.016	0.010	0.010		
12378-PeCDD	0.059	0.113	0.051	0.010	0.010		
123478-HxCDD	0.0015	0.0019	0.0010	0.0010	0.0010		
123678-HxCDD	0.002	0.013	0.002	0.003	0.003		
123789-HxCDD	0.0010	0.0011	0.0010	0.0010	0.0010		
1234678-HpCDD	0.0003	0.0015	0.0004	0.0007	0.0007		
OCDD	< 0.0001	< 0.0001	< 0.0001	< 0.0001	< 0.0001		
<b>SPCDD</b>	0.076	0.183	0.071	0.026	0.026		
PCDF							
2378-TCDF	0.0053	0.1463	0.0470	0.0042	0.0071		
12378-PeCDF	0.0005	0.0052	0.0040	0.0003	0.0003		
23478-PeCDF	0.012	0.174	0.110	0.006	0.016		
123478-HxCDF	0.001	0.001	0.002	0.001	0.001		
123678-HxCDF	0.0010	0.0046	0.0032	0.0010	0.0010		
234678-HxCDF	0.0024	0.0046	0.0013	0.0010	0.0010		
123789-HxCDF	0.001	0.001	0.0015	0.001	0.001		
1234678-HpCDF	0.0008	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.0006		
1234789-HpCDF	<0.0000	0.0020	0.0001	0.0004	0.0000		
OCDE	<0.0001	<0.0003	<0.0001	<0.0004	<0.0002		
	0.0001	0.339	0.169	0.0001	0.0001		
	0.024	0.557	0.107	0.015	0.020		
DL-PCBs							
Non-ortho PCBs	0.0010	0.0010	0.0040	0.0004	0.0005		
PCB 7/	0.0013	0.0048	0.0040	0.0004	0.0005		
PCB 81	0.0001	0.0006	0.0007	0.0001	< 0.0001		
PCB 126	0.132	1.156	0.643	0.024	0.038		
PCB 169	0.026	0.058	0.038	0.001	0.002		
Σnon-ortho PCBs	0.159	1.219	0.686	0.026	0.041		
Mono-ortho PCBs							
PCB 105	0.0022	0.0208	0.0111	0.0005	0.0009		
PCB 114	< 0.0001	0.0009	0.0006	< 0.0001	< 0.0001		
PCB 118	0.005	0.051	0.030	0.001	0.002		
PCB 123	0.0003	0.0010	0.0007	< 0.0001	< 0.0001		
PCB 156	0.0003	0.0041	0.0020	< 0.0001	0.0001		
PCB 157	< 0.0001	0.0017	0.0008	< 0.0001	< 0.0001		
PCB 167	0.0002	0.0023	0.0011	< 0.0001	< 0.0001		
PCB 189	< 0.0001	0.0007	0.0003	< 0.0001	< 0.0001		
<b>E</b> mono-ortho PCBs	0.008	0.083	0.047	0.002	0.003		
SPCDD/Fs2005	0.100	0.522	0.240	0.041	0.054		
$\Sigma D L - P C R_{Same}$	0.167	1.302	0.733	0.028	0.044		
$\Sigma PCDD/Fs+DL-PCBs_{2005}^{1}$	0.267	1.824	0.973	0.069	0.098		
$\Sigma PCDD/Fs+DL-PCBs_{1998}^{2}$	0.285	2.180	1.170	0.080	0.120		
<i>Folybrominated diphenyl ether</i> BDE28	s 0.009	0.053	0.028	0.008	0.008		
BDE47	0.141	1.126	0.526	0.006	0.006		
BDE49	0.037	0.396	0.183	0.006	0,006		
BDE66	nd	0.052	0.022	0.006	0.006		
BDE99	0.040	0.002	0.022	0.000	0.015		
BDF100	0.032	0.214	0.165	0.012	0.015		
BDF 153	0.052	0.304	0.105	0.012	0.000		
BDE 155 BDE 154	0.000	0.055	0.012	0.011	0.000		
BDE 134 BDE 183	0.000 nd	0.157 nd	0.004 nd	0.012 nd	0.000 nd		
	0 272	2 205	1 002	A 154	0.050		
L'Y L'EDLES	0.4/3	2.373	1.000	0.154	0.039		

Values are presented as means based upon duplicate analyses

- 633 634 635 nd – not detected <sup>1</sup>TEF<sub>2005</sub>, Van den Berg et al. (2006) <sup>2</sup>TEF<sub>1998</sub>, Van den Berg et al. (1998)

**Table 3.** Growth performance of Atlantic salmon fed experimental diets for 19

637 weeks. Means (%RSD) bearing identical superscripts are not significantly different

638 (*P*>0.05).

(P>0.05).				
	NFO	SFO	11%AM	5.5%AM
Initial mass (g)	1544 (1.0)	1527 (1.1)	1543 (1.2)	1522 (2.9)
Final mass (g)	3245 (2.0)	3220 (2.7)	3030 (4.9)	3170 (3.7)
Weight gain (g)	1701 (3.4)	1692 (4.2)	1487 (8.9)	1648 (4.7)
SGR (% bw.day <sup>-1</sup> )	$0.59 (2.0)^{a}$	$0.59(2.6)^{a}$	$0.53(5.7)^{b}$	$0.58(1.7)^{ab}$
Total feed consumption (kg)	251.2 (2.1)	258.7 (2.5)	254.5 (1.3)	248.9 (0.8)
FCR	$1.28(3.9)^{a}$	1.35 (1.9) <sup>ab</sup>	$1.42(1.9)^{b}$	$1.40(2.5)^{b}$

Table 4. Lipid (%) and fatty acid composition (% of total lipid) from flesh of initial 641

642 and Atlantic salmon fed one of four experimental enrichment diets. Means bearing

643 identical superscripts within same row are not significantly different (P>0.05).

	T., *4* - 1	Experimental				
	Initial	NFO	SFO	11%AM	5.5%AM	
	<b>n</b> 4	6	6	6	6	
Lipid (%)	6.7 (9.9) <sup>a</sup>	10.1 (9.3) <sup>b</sup>	10.1 (11.7) <sup>b</sup>	10.9 (15.5) <sup>b</sup>	11.2 (7.1) <sup>b</sup>	
Fatty acid						
14:0	$3.0(4.7)^{a}$	$3.8(6.6)^{b}$	$4.3(6.8)^{c}$	$2.3(7.8)^{d}$	$2.3(3.7)^{d}$	
16:0	$13.2(3.1)^{a}$	$13.5(1.2)^{a}$	$14.6(3.8)^{b}$	$10.7 (4.4)^{c}$	$10.8(3.5)^{c}$	
18:0	$3.4(3.1)^{a}$	$3.1(1.1)^{b}$	$3.3(3.5)^{a}$	$2.7(4.3)^{c}$	$2.8(4.5)^{\circ}$	
20:0	$0.3(9.4)^{a}$	$0.2(6.8)^{a}$	$0.2(9.8)^{a}$	$0.3(1.9)^{a}$	$0.3(4.4)^{a}$	
Total saturates <sup>1</sup>	$20.2(3.2)^{a}$	20.9 (2.0) <sup>a</sup>	22.7 (4.1) <sup>b</sup>	16.4 (5.2) <sup>c</sup>	16.5 (3.2) <sup>c</sup>	
16:1n-7	$4.0(3.2)^{a}$	$4.3(2.9)^{b}$	$5.6(2.5)^{c}$	$2.0(7.1)^{d}$	$2.4(3.2)^{e}$	
18:1n-9	$32.8(1.9)^{a}$	$20.9(2.7)^{b}$	19.7 (3.2) <sup>c</sup>	$38.0(1.0)^{d}$	$38.1(1.3)^d$	
18:1n-7	$3.4(4.2)^{a}$	$3.1(3.0)^{bc}$	$3.2(1.5)^{abc}$	$3.0(1.2)^{c}$	$3.3(6.2)^{ab}$	
20:1n-9	$2.7(4.8)^{a}$	$6.2(2.8)^{b}$	$4.8(1.9)^{c}$	$2.6(4.1)^{a}$	$3.1(4.5)^{d}$	
22:1n-11	$0.9(7.6)^{a}$	$6.3(5.3)^{b}$	$4.5(4.2)^{c}$	$0.6(18.8)^{a}$	$1.0(12.3)^{d}$	
22:1n-9	$0.4(11.1)^{ad}$	$0.7(8.9)^{b}$	$0.5(4.8)^{c}$	$0.4(7.1)^{d}$	$0.4(9.3)^{d}$	
24:1n-9	$0.4(3.4)^{ad}$	$0.9(6.5)^{b}$	$0.7(13.6)^{c}$	$0.4(11.8)^{a}$	$0.5(9.8)^{d}$	
Total monoenes <sup>2</sup>	45.0 (2.0) <sup>a</sup>	42.9 (1.3) <sup>b</sup>	<b>39.7</b> (0.9) <sup>c</sup>	$47.3(1.0)^d$	49.1 (1.1) <sup>e</sup>	
18:2n-6	11.4 (2.0) <sup>a</sup>	7.7 (2.8) <sup>b</sup>	7.2 (4.1) <sup>c</sup>	13.4 (2.5) <sup>d</sup>	13.3 (1.8) <sup>d</sup>	
20:2n-6	$0.8(2.1)^{a}$	$0.6(3.8)^{b}$	$0.5(3.7)^{c}$	$1.0(4.1)^{d}$	$1.0(4.0)^{d}$	
20:4n-6	$0.5(5.9)^{ad}$	$0.6(3.1)^{ac}$	$0.6 (6.2)^{c}$	$0.6 (4.6)^{ac}$	$0.5 (4.5)^{d}$	
22:5n-6	$0.1(18.2)^{a}$	$0.2 (6.5)^{b}$	$0.2(5.6)^{b}$	$1.5(5.5)^{c}$	$0.9(1.4)^{d}$	
Total n-6 PUFA <sup>3</sup>	$13.2 (1.6)^{a}$	<b>9.6</b> (2.6) <sup>b</sup>	<b>9.1</b> (3.8) <sup>b</sup>	<b>16.7</b> (2.6) <sup>c</sup>	$16.0 (1.5)^d$	
18:3n-3	$3.8 (4.0)^{a}$	$2.1(5.3)^{b}$	$1.8(7.7)^{c}$	$4.6(3.8)^{d}$	$4.5(2.1)^{d}$	
18:4n-3	$0.8(3.4)^{a}$	$1.6(3.1)^{b}$	$1.6(2.3)^{b}$	$0.5(5.0)^{\rm c}$	$0.5(7.0)^{c}$	
20:4n-3	$0.8 (6.7)^{a}$	$1.5(2.2)^{b}$	$1.3(1.0)^{c}$	$0.6(3.2)^{d}$	$0.6 (4.8)^{d}$	
20:5n-3	$4.9(6.7)^{a}$	$5.9(3.3)^{b}$	$8.1(3.1)^{c}$	$2.6(6.6)^{d}$	$2.9(6.7)^{d}$	
22:5n-3	$2.1(4.4)^{a}$	$2.8(1.8)^{b}$	$3.3(1.9)^{c}$	$1.3 (4.5)^{d}$	$1.4(6.5)^{d}$	
22:6n-3	$7.6(8.5)^{a}$	$11.7 (2.7)^{b}$	$10.4(3.1)^{c}$	$8.9(6.0)^{d}$	$7.4(3.8)^{a}$	
Total n-3 PUFA <sup>4</sup>	$20.4 (6.0)^{a}$	25.7 (1.9) <sup>b</sup>	26.7 (2.4) <sup>b</sup>	<b>18.9</b> ( <b>4.4</b> ) <sup>c</sup>	17.7 (3.4) <sup>c</sup>	
Total PUFA <sup>5</sup>	<b>34.8</b> ( <b>3.8</b> ) <sup>ab</sup>	36.2 (1.4) <sup>ac</sup>	<b>37.6</b> (2.5) <sup>c</sup>	<b>36.2</b> ( <b>3.4</b> ) <sup>ac</sup>	<b>34.4</b> (2.4) <sup>b</sup>	
n-3:n-6	1.5 (5.7) <sup>a</sup>	<b>2.7</b> (0.1) <sup>b</sup>	<b>2.9</b> (2.8) <sup>c</sup>	$1.1 (0.0)^d$	$1.1 (0.0)^d$	

644 645 <sup>1</sup>includes 15:0, 22:0, 24:0 <sup>2</sup>includes 16:1n-9, 20:1n-11, 20:1n-7

<sup>3</sup>includes 18:3n-6, 20:3n-6, 22:4n-6

<sup>4</sup>includes 20:3n-3

646 647 648

<sup>5</sup>includes 16:2, 16:3, 16:4

**Table 5.** Concentrations of PCDD/Fs, DL-PCBs (pg.g<sup>-1</sup> ww, upperbound WHO-TEQ<sub>2005</sub>) and PBDEs (ng.g<sup>-1</sup> ww) in fillet flesh of initial and experimental fed Atlantic salmon.  $\Sigma$ mean values (%RSD) bearing identical superscript lettering within same row are not statistically different (*P*>0.05).  $\Sigma$ WHO-TEQ<sub>1998</sub> are presented for comparative purposes.

	Initial	Experimental			
	Initial	NFO	SFO	11%AM	5.5%AM
n	2	3	3	3	3
PCDD					
2378-TCDD	0.010(0)	0.017 (19)	0.015 (26)	0.010(0)	0.010(0)
12378-PeCDD	0.010(0)	0.032 (27)	0.029 (36)	0.011 (16)	0.012 (29)
123478-HxCDD	0.0015 (44)	0.0010(0)	0.0010(0)	0.0010(0)	0.0010(0)
123678-HxCDD	0.001 (0)	0.0013 (28)	0.001 (0)	0.0011 (16)	0.0013 (4)
123789-HxCDD	0.0010 (0)	0.0010 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)
1234678-HpCDD	0.0005(24)	0.0001 (17)	0.0001 (23)	0.0002 (54)	0.0001 (17)
OCDD	< 0.0001	< 0.0001	<0.0001	<0.0001	< 0.0001
ΣΡΟΟ	$0.024(3)^{a}$	$0.052(22)^{b}$	$0.047(28)^{b}$	$0.024(8)^{a}$	$0.025(13)^{a}$
PCDF					
2378-TCDF	0.0015 (15)	0.049 (29)	0.025 (44)	0.015 (3)	0.018 (3)
12378-PeCDF	0.0011 (63)	0.0017(14)	0.0009(11)	0.0004 (44)	0.0006 (14)
23478-PeCDF	0.026 (29)	0.054 (10)	0.034 (21)	0.012 (22)	0.016 (12)
123478-HxCDF	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)
123678-HxCDF	0.0012 (24)	0.0010 (0)	0.0010 (0)	0.0010 (0)	0.0011 (20)
234678-HxCDF	0.0010	0.0011 (16)	0.0011 (9)	0.0010 (0)	0.0010(11)
123789-HxCDF	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.001 (0)	0.0012 (29)
1234678-HpCDF	0.0001	0.0002(33)	0.0003(13)	0.0007 (68)	0.0001(9)
1234789-HpCDF	0.0002(42)	0,0001 (0)	0.0001 (0)	0.0001 (0)	0.0001 (0)
OCDE	<0.0002 (12)	<0.0001 (0)	<0.0001 (0)	<0.0001 (0)	<0.0001
SPCDE	$0.033(25)^{a}$	0 109 (8) <sup>b</sup>	0.064 (28) <sup>c</sup>	$0.032.(7)^{a}$	$(0.0001)^{ac}$
	0.055 (15)	0.109 (0)	0.004 (20)	0.052 (7)	0.055 (1)
DL-PCBs					
Non-ortho PCBs					
PCB 77	0.0007(17)	0.0020(4)	0.0017 (9)	0.0022 (76)	0.0008(10)
PCB 81	< 0.0001	0.0002(12)	0.0003 (24)	0.0003 (46)	< 0.0001
PCB 126	0.080 (37)	0.576 (9)	0.379 (5)	0.169 (7)	0.181 (9)
PCB 169	0.003 (25)	0.023 (3)	0.013 (27)	0.005 (31)	0.006 (18)
$\Sigma$ non-ortho PCBs	$0.084(36)^{a}$	0.601 (8) <sup>b</sup>	$0.394(5)^{c}$	$0.177(8)^{d}$	$0.188(9)^d$
	· · · ·			· · · · ·	
Mono-ortho PCBs					
PCB 105	0.0034 (6)	0.0101(4)	0.0065 (11)	0.0035 (32)	0.0027 (13)
PCB 114	0.0002 (25)	0.0005 (3)	0.0003 (11)	0.0002 (47)	0.0001 (17)
PCB 118	0.0086 (10)	0.025 (3)	0.017 (7)	0.009 (28)	0.007 (12)
PCB 123	0.0004 (15)	0.0003 (14)	0.0002 (40)	0.0002 (76)	< 0.0001
PCB 156	0.0011 (6)	0.0022 (9)	0.0015 (13)	0.0008 (8)	0.0007 (10)
PCB 157	0.0003 (7)	0.0009 (13)	0.0005 (8)	0.0003 (1)	0.0003 (20)
PCB 167	0.0005(12)	0.0013 (10)	0.0008 (8)	0.0004 (9)	0.0004 (11)
PCB 189	0.0001 (2)	0.0004 (4)	0.0002 (9)	< 0.0001	< 0.0001
<b>Smono-ortho PCBs</b>	$0.015(8)^{a}$	$0.041(4)^{b}$	$0.027(8)^{c}$	$0.014(28)^{a}$	0.011 (11) <sup>a</sup>
				. ,	
$\Sigma PCDD/Fs_{2005}$	0.057 (16) <sup>a</sup>	<b>0.161(8)</b> <sup>b</sup>	<b>0.111</b> (13) <sup>c</sup>	0.056 (4) <sup>ad</sup>	<b>0.064</b> (8) <sup>d</sup>
$\Sigma DL-PCB_{2005}$	$0.099(32)^{a}$	$0.642(8)^{b}$	$0.421(5)^{c}$	$0.191(10)^{a}$	$0.199(9)^{a}$
$\Sigma PCDD/Fs+DL-PCBs_{2005}^{1}$	$0.156(14)^{a}$	<b>0.803(8)</b> <sup>b</sup>	$0.532(4)^{c}$	$0.247(8)^{d}$	$0.263(9)^{d}$
$\Sigma PCDD/Fs+DL-PCBs_{1998}^2$	<b>0.227</b> (9) <sup>a</sup>	<b>0.963</b> (7) <sup>b</sup>	<b>0.638</b> (4) <sup>c</sup>	<b>0.301</b> (9) <sup>d</sup>	<b>0.312</b> (9) <sup>d</sup>
Polybrominated dinhenyl eth	ers				
BDE28	0.016 (14)	0.036 (5)	0.023(5)	0.009 (11)	0.007 (8)
BDF47	0.250 (8)	0.610 (6)	0.365(7)	0.141(3)	0.144(6)
BDF49	0.059(10)	0.173(5)	0.100 (9)	0.034(5)	0.033(3)
BDE66	0.009(10)	0.030(5)	0.015(12)	0.004(0)	0.006(0)
BDE99	0.041(14)	0.113(5)	0.057(11)	0.029(7)	0.027(4)
BDF100	0.047(8)	0.115(3) 0.176(4)	0.097(11)	0.027(7)	0.027(-7)
BDF 153	0.047(0)	0.017(7)	0.009 (6)	0.027(0)	0.020(7)
DDL 133	0.000 (20)	0.017(7)	0.007(0)	0.000 (0)	0.007 (0)

 1 . 1 1					
Σ9 PBDEs	<b>0.456</b> (10) <sup>a</sup>	$1.233(5)^{b}$	<b>0.702</b> (8) <sup>c</sup>	$0.268(3)^{d}$	$0.267 (4)^{d}$
BDE 183	nd	nd	nd	nd	nd
BDE 154	0.025 (14)	0.078 (2)	0.043 (7)	0.015 (4)	0.015 (4)

656 657

nd - not detected  ${}^{1}\text{TEF}_{2005}$ , Van den Berg et al. (2006)  ${}^{2}\text{TEF}_{1998}$ , Van den Berg et al. (1998)