

Material Expressions of Legitimacy among Nomadic Regimes in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties: Focusing on Roof Tiles Unearthed from Royal Buddhist Temples

著者	呂 夢
著者別表示	Lyu Meng
journal or publication title	博士論文要旨Abstract および要約Outline
学位授与番号	13301甲第5105号
学位名	博士（文学）
学位授与年月日	2020-03-22
URL	http://hdl.handle.net/2297/00058758

学 位 論 文 要 旨

Dissertation Abstract

学位請求論文題名 Dissertation Title

Material Expressions of Legitimacy among Nomadic Regimes in the Northern and Sui-Tang
Dynasties: Focusing on Roof Tiles Unearthed from Royal Buddhist Temples

(和訳または英訳) Japanese or English Translation

中国北朝隋唐時代における正統性—皇室寺院の瓦を中心に—

人間社会環境学 専攻 (Division)

氏 名 (Name) 呂 夢 (LYU MENG)

主任指導教員氏名 (Primary Supervisor) 中村 慎一

(注) 学位論文要旨の表紙

Note: This is the cover page of the dissertation abstract.

This study focused on roof tiles unearthed from royal Buddhist temples in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties and analyzed the production and utilization of these roof tiles, as well as the related construction processes. In this way, this research shed light on how the material culture was created and controlled by the rulers of the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties to express their political concepts.

There have been many achievements in the archaeological excavation of royal Buddhist temples, but most of the researches have focused on the static analysis of temples' layout or architectural style, which were based on historical records or excavation results. Meanwhile, previous studies on roof tiles of the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties have four features as follows: (1) Typological studies have mostly focused on tile-ends, and studies on imbrices and tegulae are comparatively rare. (2) Studies on specific subjects, such as production techniques or management, are insufficient. (3) The relations between roof tiles and buildings have been neglected. (4) Most of the studies are on roof tiles unearthed from only one city. These studies are still in the material collection and classification stages. While the essential information about roof tiles is already known, the researches about the relations between roof tiles and buildings, roof tiles and makers are rare.

In fact, roof tiles are the most frequently unearthed remains from the sites of traditional buildings in ancient China, and as they were laid on the roof of buildings, roof tiles can illustrate the landscape of traditional buildings. Moreover, the lifecycle of the roof tiles, from production to usage can indicate the construction processes involved in the preparation of the building materials and the construction methods of the buildings, to a certain degree. The construction of the royal Buddhist temples in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties was deeply influenced by the concept of legitimacy. During the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties, the society, including the ethnic groups, political setting, and culture, changed substantially. The nomadic rulers who established regimes in the original habitat of the Han people created new system and objects to show their legitimacy. The magnificent royal Buddhist temples with exquisite roof tiles built in huge medieval cities must be one of the symbols. Therefore,

this study analyzed the roof tiles unearthed from royal Buddhist temples of the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties and tried to explore the establishment of legitimacy during medieval China, which is usually discussed in historical studies by narrative records, from the viewpoint of archaeological objects and material culture.

The research objects of this study include first-hand archaeological objects and historical records. The first-hand archaeological objects were unearthed from five sites of royal Buddhist temples, including the Yungang Buddhist Temple in the West Zone in Pingcheng, the Yongning Buddhist Temple in Luoyang, the Dazhuangyan Buddhist Temple in Yecheng, the Ximing Buddhist Temple, and the Qinglong Buddhist Temple in Chang'an. The data from the first-hand archaeological objects of the five sites are the main research materials for this study, while information about roof tiles from other sites recorded in archaeological reports are used as supplementing materials. The historical records on Buddhist temples, handicraft industry, and objects are also important research materials. Historical literature from the Northern Dynasties is limited, but the amount of literature increased during the Sui-Tang Dynasties. In addition to official historical books, chorography, Buddhist literature, and books on the social system and political policies can also provide important information.

This study needs systematic methods and they can be simply explained from three points: arrangement methods, analysis methods, and explanation methods. Samples with at least one measurable item, or with special features, were observed and measured carefully. Meanwhile, the fragments of the roof tiles were gathered or randomly selected for statistical analysis. The concrete arrangement methods were borrowed from the studies of roof tiles in Japan, which indicate how to observe the features or production traces of roof tiles, how to measure roof tiles and how to do statistical analysis.

The information gathered from the arrangement stage was analyzed from three viewpoints: style of roof tiles, production trace, and excavation setting. The style of roof tiles includes the features that were

made intentionally and would be shown to users as the exposed surface, size, and pattern. The classification of the roof tiles is based on these features, and typological studies are the foundation for the analysis of the production and usage of the roof tiles below. Production traces are the traces left on the surface of the roof tiles unintentionally and would not be shown to users. These can be separated into two groups: tool traces and trimming traces. The tool traces are the first-time traces left when the tiles were shaped by tools, such as fabric impressions on the concave surface or the traces made by pottery paddles on the convex surface. Trimming traces are the traces left when the first-time traces were erased, such as the scraping traces. The characters on the roof tiles were left intentionally, but they were used for production management. Moreover, most of these characters were curved or stamped on the convex surfaces of the tegulae, the tile lips of the imbrices, or the back surfaces of the tile-ends. This means that they are not obvious features for users, so the characters should be treated as production traces. The analysis of the production of the roof tiles, such as the technique, artisans involved, and supervision, are based on these traces. The excavation setting is the relation between the roof tiles and architectural sites, including the location of the unearthed roof tiles and the proportion of different types of roof tiles. If the deposit of the site was not disturbed heavily, the location of the remains could reflect the position of the buildings before they were destroyed. The proportion of the roof tiles can provide evidence to separate the main materials from the repair materials. Therefore, information on the excavation setting can demonstrate the usage of the roof tiles among different buildings or different parts of one building. These three viewpoints describe the lifecycle of the roof tiles, from production to usage, which was also the lifecycle of buildings, from the preparation of building materials to construction and destruction.

In the explanation stage, the regularities summarized in the last stage became the basis for explaining the roof tiles, construction of temples, and historical background. The classification of the roof tiles is used to answer the question “What types of the roof tiles were used on buildings?” It formed the basis for the examination of the roof tiles and provided information on the production and usage of the roof

tiles. The analysis of the production and usage of the roof tiles is used to answer the question “How were the temples built?” This is related to several research subjects such as the production techniques, management methods, construction sequence and so on. Moreover, important historical events would influence not only social systems, but tangible objects, such as roof tiles and temples. The analysis of the related historical background is used to answer the question “Why were the temples built in this specific way?” For example, why were the roof tiles used for high-rank buildings changed from untrimmed/simply-trimmed style to polished-black style at the end of the Pingcheng Period of the Northern Wei Dynasty? Why could Buddhist temples use the same rank of building materials as palaces and ritual buildings? The analysis of the contemporaneous policies and social settings can answer these questions. In this way, material culture can be used to observe a society and how it changes historically.

This dissertation can be divided into five parts. The first part is the research background of this study. After explaining the research perspective, previous studies, methods, origins of materials, structure, and significance of this study, the historical background of the establishment of legitimacy and handicraft industry was briefly introduced. The second, third, and fourth parts are the main body of this dissertation and discussed the roof tiles and relevant construction processes of the temples in detail. The three sections were arranged in the following order: Northern Wei, Eastern Wei-Northern Qi, and Sui-Tang. In each part, the first chapter gives a brief introduction of Buddhism and the Buddhist temples of that period, and then, the next chapters include a case study of the roof tiles unearthed from specific temples. The chapter after the case study is a summary of the roof tiles unearthed from other contemporaneous sites that have not been excavated completely or that provide limited information about the roof tiles. In the last chapter, by considering the analysis of the roof tiles and historical records, the construction process of the temples from a specific period can be reconstructed to a certain extent. The fifth part is conclusion. The features and changes of the roof tiles mentioned in last parts were summarized to reconstruct the lifecycle of the roof tiles, including their production techniques, management methods, and usage. The social factors that influenced the roof tiles and related

construction processes of royal Buddhist temples in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties were also analyzed to explain the establishment of legitimacy from the viewpoint of material culture. The expectations and expansion of this study were also discussed in the last section.

This study indicates that during the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties, there were three main turning points for roof tiles: the period of Emperor Xiaowen in the Northern Wei Dynasty, the period of the Northern Qi Dynasty, and the later period of the Tang Dynasty. In the first period, the styles of the roof tiles changed substantially. The polished-black type roof tiles and tile-ends with lotus patterns appeared, and the new technique of double-level mold was created in the production of the tile-ends. The basic style and technique of the roof tiles were formed in this period. In the second period, the status of the artisans changed from vassals to ordinary citizens and working in official roof tiles workshops extended to ordinary citizens. As a result, the labor in workshops increased, and the supervision method was simplified, and the production management of the roof tiles changed in this period. In the third period, the supervision based on the responsibility of individual artisans changed into management based on the workshop, and the system of official workshops declined, as they were replaced by commercial production. These three turning points can be explained by two viewpoints of medieval history: the changes of political settings and the changes of economic settings.

During the Northern Dynasties and the Sui-Tang Dynasties, different groups of nomadic people from the northern steppe of China occupied the original habitat of the Han people and established their regimes. To control the Han people, most of the nomadic rulers accepted the systems and culture of the Han people, and the nomadic people were assimilated gradually. In this process, legitimacy was the most important concept for nomadic rulers, who needed to prove the legitimacy of their rule. Previous studies on the legitimacy of the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties have been conducted by many researchers, but most have focused on the relevant political system recorded in the historical literature. In the traditional society of ancient China, however, rules controlled how everything was designed and

used to verify the legality of the users. This dissertation chose roof tiles unearthed from the royal Buddhist temples as research objects and attempted to determine the rules that controlled the production and usage of the roof tiles in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties.

The three turning points were deeply influenced by their periods. When Emperor Xiaowen moved the capital city of Northern Wei to Luoyang and introduced Sinicization policies, it was very important for the rulers to create a new set of roof tiles and relevant techniques to confirm the legitimacy of the Northern Wei. Therefore, the polished-black roof tiles that were related to the Wuxing Theory of Confucianism and the tile-ends with lotus pattern that borrowed the motif of lotus from Buddhism were created. After the destruction of the Northern Wei, to emphasize the legitimacy inherited from the Northern Wei, the rulers of the Eastern Wei and Northern Qi Dynasties built the large city of Ye Cheng, which was a copy of Luoyang City. The construction process of the new city required a large number of building materials, and subsequently, the production management changed to satisfy the demands. The new system of official workshops lasted for a long time, but in the later period of the Tang Dynasty, roof tile production in the official workshops decreased at the same time as the fall of the dynasty.

The changes of roof tiles in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties show the alteration of political settings that occurred during this period. Legitimacy was always the main political object for the rulers at the time. It is worth noting that the demolition of legitimacy in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties was influenced by both Confucianism and Buddhism. This meant that the rulers did not copy the methods from the Han people, but created a new system to establish the legitimacy of their dynasties, which was expressed in both political policies and everyday objects.

The demand for a large number of roof tiles promoted the management of roof tile production in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties. On the other hand, there were also several changes of economic settings that made the development in roof tiles production possible. It includes the improvement of

artisans' status and the decline of official handicraft industry.

In the early period of the Northern Wei Dynasty, artisans were mostly captured Han people and their status was lower than ordinary people. In fact, the society of this regime consisted of several groups of members, such as aristocrats, farmers, who were ordinary people, as well as artisans, soldiers and other vassal groups. Artisans cannot change their occupation or get married with ordinary people. In the later period of the Northern Dynasties, however, many vassals were exempted from the feudal service and allowed to change their occupation. They needed to pay land rent and work in official workshop in limited period like farmers. According to previous analysis, the improvement of artisans' status influenced the management of roof tile production. For example, in the Northern Qi Dynasty, the way to make characters on roof tiles and the content of characters completely changed, indicating the alteration of the supervision methods in roof tile production.

Moreover, the decline of official handicraft industry was an inevitable trend in the later period of the Tang Dynasty. The national strength of the Tang Dynasty decreased after the An-Shi Rebellion. Following the fall of the regime, the government gradually lost control of the official workshops. Previous analysis indicates that the roof tiles made in the later period of the Tang Dynasty are comparatively rough, and the unified, standard artisan group seems to be replaced by several groups with different tools according to the production traces on the roof tiles from one site. The official handicraft industry declined, but the commercial production increased at the same time.

The changes of roof tiles in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties indicate the alteration of economic settings that occurred during this period. The strict feudal vassalage declined in the later period of the Northern Dynasties, and the number of owner-peasants increased. These changes improved the labor in agriculture or other industries and promoted the economy of the medieval society. It also promoted the development of commercial production, which boomed in the later period of the Tang Dynasty and

increased constantly. The production of roof tiles can be representative of the handicraft industry in medieval China, showing a complete economic process of the society.

This study carefully arranged archaeological remains and analyzed the establishment of legitimacy of the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties from the information of these first-hand research materials. It provided a vivid viewpoint to observe the social alteration in medieval China. By analyzing the lifecycle of the roof tiles, from production to usage, the details of the construction process, as well as the political settings and economic settings of the society that influenced the construction of the temples, can be reconstructed to a certain extent.

学位論文審査報告書

令和 2 年 2 月 13 日

1 論文提出者

金沢大学大学院人間社会環境研究科

専攻 人間社会環境学

氏名 呂 夢 (LYU, Meng)

2 学位論文題目 (外国語の場合は、和訳を付記すること。)

Material Expressions of Legitimacy among Nomadic Regimes in the Northern and Sui-Tang Dynasties : Focusing on Roof Tiles Unearthed from Royal Buddhist Temples.

(中国北朝隋唐時代における正統性—皇室寺院の瓦を中心に—)

3 審査結果

判定 (いずれかに○印) ○合格 ・ 不合格

授与学位 (いずれかに○印) 博士 (社会環境学・○文学・法学・経済学・学術)

4 学位論文審査委員

委員長 中村 慎一 (印)

委員 古畑 徹

委員 中村 誠一

委員 足立 拓朗

委員 菅原 裕文

委員

(学位論文審査委員全員の審査により判定した。)

5 論文審査の結果の要旨

本論文は中国の北朝諸王朝から隋・唐時代にかけての皇室寺院（勅願寺）から出土した瓦を対象として網羅的な分析を実施し、詳細な分類・編年案を提示すると同時に、瓦という物質文化が体現する政治的意味について考察を加えるものである。論文全体の構成と各部の内容は以下のとおりである。

第1部「背景」では、研究の目的、対象、方法に加え、北朝から隋・唐期にかけての「正統性」についてこれまでの中国史研究における議論の概要が述べられる。

第2部「北魏時代の平城と洛陽における瓦と皇室寺院造営」では、北魏の二つの都城、平城と洛陽における仏教寺院の概要が述べられ、続いて、前者に関しては雲崗石窟窟頂西区寺院、後者に関しては永寧寺の瓦と寺院造営工程について詳細な記載と分析が展開される。

第3部「東魏・北齊時代の鄴城における瓦と皇室寺院造営」では、まず両王朝の都城であった鄴城の仏教寺院の概要が紹介され、次に大規模な発掘調査が行われている大莊嚴寺出土瓦を取り上げ、その分類と分析の結果が詳しく記述される。

第4部「隋・唐時代の長安における瓦と皇室寺院造営」では、舞台を隋・唐時代の長安に移し、前2部と同様の作業が展開される。対象となったのは西明寺と青竜寺の両寺院である。特に瓦当文様の分類と、范傷の進行などをも援用した編年に関する議論に多くの紙数が費やされている。

第5部「瓦と皇室寺院：物質文化における正統性の確立」は本論文の結論部分である。これまでの議論を受け、瓦の様式と技術、造瓦工人集団の管理方式などについて通時的な変化が総括される。そして最後に、北魏平城における黒色磨研瓦の出現が五行説に基づく

正統性の物質的表現であるとの自説が展開される。

本論文に対する評価を先に述べるとすれば、全体的に見て博士号学位請求論文として十分なレベルに達していると判断される。特に、平城雲崗石窟、洛陽永寧寺、鄴城大莊嚴寺、そして長安の西明寺、青竜寺という、日本でもよく知られた著名寺院址の出土瓦について膨大な時間を費やして現地調査を実施し、詳細なデータ収集と綿密な観察に基づいて瓦に関する記載を行ったことは特筆に値する。瓦の形態、色調、製作痕跡、使用痕跡、刻印・銘刻、出土位置、共伴関係、歴史文献との対比、図像資料との比較等々、およそ瓦研究に必要な検討事項をすべて網羅し、最大限の努力を惜しまずそれを実行に移していった姿勢は高く評価することができる。中国においてはこれまでにこれほど広範かつ緻密な研究事例がほぼ皆無であるだけに、その先進性・独創性は際立っている。今後の中国における同類研究の一つのモデルとなるものと言えよう。

また、日本に6年間滞在し、瓦当文様の分類、製作痕跡からの製作法復元、范傷の観察に基づく時期関係の把握など、日本における出土瓦研究の成果に多くを学び、それを中国の瓦研究に応用した点も出色の成果であると言える。日本の研究者も瓦の起源地としての中国の研究状況に多大な関心を寄せてきたが、自らの研究成果との対比に耐えうる研究事例が思うように得られないことに隔靴搔痒の感を抱いていた。本論文は初めてその要求を満たす研究事例となったと言える。すでに筆者は日本語でも数篇の論文を公にし、また学会発表も活発に行っているが、本論文の内容についても日本語による論文発表が待たれる。

もとより、本論文が解決すべき問題を抱えていないわけではない。なかでも、表題に掲げられる「正統性 Legitimacy」は本論文の核心概念であるが、瓦という物質文化を正統性の表現手段とみるその立論はいまだ即座には首肯しがたい問題を含んでいる。筆者は北

魏王朝が土徳から水徳に転じたことにより黒色を尊ぶようになったことと黒色瓦の出現が関連ありとするが、これだけでは根拠薄弱と言わざるをえない。それを補強すべく筆者は、北魏の孝文帝が儀式の際に黒色の冠帽を着用したことや犠牲とする動物の色を黄色のものから黒色のものに改めたことなどを挙げているが、五行説に対応する他の色、すなわち青、赤、黄、白については物質文化的表現の実例を挙げえていない点は大きな課題として残される。

その他、考古学的研究の手続き、論文作成の方法、英語への翻訳などにおいて改善すべき点は散見されるものの、いずれも論文全体の学術的価値を大きく損なうものではない。今後この分野で中国の第一人者になるであろうとの予感を抱かせるに足る力作であり、博士号授与に十分に値する研究成果であると審査員一同判断した。