

1 RESEARCH PAPER

2 *LL de Carvalho et al.*

3 Xylazine–opioid combinations in sheep

4 **Sedative and cardiopulmonary effects of xylazine alone or in combination with methadone,**  
5 **morphine or tramadol in sheep**

6 Leonardo L Carvalho\*, Lilian T Nishimura\*, Luisa P B Borges\*, Sofia A Cerejo†, Isadora O J

7 Villela\*, Adam Auckburally‡ & Ewaldo de Mattos-Junior\*

8 \*School of Veterinary Medicine, University of Franca, Franca, SP, Brazil

9 †School of Veterinary Medicine and Animal Science, São Paulo State University (Universidade  
10 Estadual Paulista, UNESP) Botucatu, Botucatu, SP, Brazil

11 ‡Department of Small Animal Clinical Sciences, School of Veterinary Medicine, College of  
12 Medical, Veterinary and Life Sciences, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, UK

13

14 **Correspondence:** Ewaldo de Mattos-Junior, Faculdade de Medicina Veterinária, Universidade

15 de Franca, Avenida Dr Armando Salles de Oliveira, 201, Parque Universitário, Franca, SP

16 14404-600, Brazil. E-mail: ewaldomattos@hotmail.com

17

18 **Abstract**

19 **Objective** To evaluate the cardiopulmonary and sedative effects of xylazine alone or in

20 combination with methadone, morphine or tramadol in sheep.

21 **Study design** Experimental, prospective, crossover, randomized, blinded study.

22 **Animals** Six Santa Inês breed sheep (females) aged  $12 \pm 8$  months and weighing  $39.5 \pm 7.4$  kg.

23 **Methods** Sheep were sedated with each of four treatments in a randomized, crossover design,  
24 with a minimum washout period of 7 days between treatments. Treatments were: X [xylazine  
25 (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>); XM [xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and methadone (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>); XMO [xylazine  
26 (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and morphine (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>), and XT [xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and tramadol  
27 (5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>)]. Each drug combination was mixed in the syringe and injected intravenously.  
28 Sedation, heart rate (HR), mean arterial blood pressure (MAP), rectal temperature (RT °C),  
29 respiratory rate ( $f_R$ ), arterial blood gases and electrolytes were measured before drug  
30 administration (T0) and then at 15 minute intervals for 120 minutes (T15–T120).

31 **Results** Heart rate significantly decreased in all treatments compared with T0. PaCO<sub>2</sub> values in  
32 XM and XMO were higher at all time points compared with T0. In treatments X and XM, pH,  
33 bicarbonate (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) and base excess were increased at all time points compared with T0. PaO<sub>2</sub>  
34 was significantly decreased at T15–T75 in XM, at all time points in XMO, and at T15 and T30 in  
35 XT. Sedation at T15 and T30 in XM and XMO was greater than in the other treatments.

36 **Conclusions and clinical relevance** The combinations of methadone, morphine or tramadol  
37 with xylazine resulted in cardiopulmonary changes similar to those induced by xylazine alone in  
38 sheep. The combinations provided better sedation, principally at 15 minutes and 30 minutes  
39 following administration.

40

41 *Keywords*  $\alpha_2$ -agonists, opioids, ovine, sedation.

42

## 43 **Introduction**

44 Xylazine is 10–20 times more potent in ruminants than in other species (Kästner 2006).

45 Cardiopulmonary effects include bradycardia, changes in arterial blood pressure, tachypnea

46 accompanied by pulmonary edema and arterial hypoxemia (Bacon et al. 1998; Kästner 2006).  
47 Death resulting from the development of pulmonary edema after administration of xylazine has  
48 also been reported (Uggla & Lindqvist 1983). Despite these profound cardiopulmonary effects,  
49 sedation may not be as pronounced as expected, and recumbency may not be induced when  
50 xylazine is administered to sheep intravenously (IV) or intramuscularly (IM) (Kästner 2006).  
51 Therefore, combining xylazine with other drugs may be useful to enhance sedation.  
52 Morphine and methadone are classified as full  $\mu$ -agonists and are widely used in veterinary  
53 practice, alone or in combination with other drugs for premedication and analgesia. However, the  
54 reported use of these drugs in ruminants is rare. Studies on drug residues are lacking, which may  
55 limit the clinical usefulness of opioids in food animal practice (KuKanich & Papich 2009).  
56 Tramadol may be classified as an atypical opioid drug because much of its analgesic action is  
57 attributable to a central effect in inhibiting the reuptake of serotonin and noradrenaline, and it  
58 also shows relatively weak action at opioid  $\mu$ -receptors (KuKanich & Papich 2009). Adverse  
59 effects following its administration include sedation, although there are few data on its  
60 administration as part of a premedication or sedation protocol in sheep. Guedes et al. (2005)  
61 demonstrated that tramadol alone administered IM to dogs prior to general anesthesia did not  
62 produce any visible sedation. Excitatory effects on the central nervous system (CNS), such as  
63 agitation and nystagmus, following the administration of opioids to ruminants have been  
64 described (Waterman et al. 1990, 1991; Lin & Riddell 2003; Edmondson et al. 2012), and may  
65 counteract the level of sedation observed.  
66 Combinations of sedatives and opioid drugs are commonly used in veterinary anesthesia because  
67 they have useful synergistic effects. This synergism enhances sedation and analgesia and may  
68 facilitate a significant reduction in the doses of both drugs, thereby reducing the adverse

69 cardiopulmonary effects associated with each drug when it is administered alone. Numerous  
70 studies in dogs and cats have demonstrated that sedation is better when an  $\alpha_2$ -agonist is  
71 administered in combination with an opioid than when the  $\alpha_2$ -agonist is administered alone  
72 (Selmi et al. 2003; Leppänen et al. 2006; Monteiro et al. 2008; Cardoso et al. 2014).

73 The aim of this study was to examine the cardiopulmonary and sedative effects of xylazine in  
74 combination with different opioids when administered IV in sheep. The study hypothesis was  
75 that sedation would be superior following the administration of these combinations compared  
76 with the administration of xylazine alone.

## 77 **Materials and methods**

78 This research was conducted with the approval and supervision of the Ethics Committee on  
79 Animal Use of the University of Franca, Brazil (protocol no. 038/12). All procedures were  
80 conducted in compliance with the ethical principles of good practice in animal experimentation.

### 81 **Animals**

82 Six female, non-pregnant Santa Inês sheep, with a mean  $\pm$  standard deviation (SD) age of  
83  $12 \pm 8$  months and mean  $\pm$  SD weight of  $39.5 \pm 7.4$  kg were used. The animals were kept  
84 collectively in  $6 \times 6$  m plots and were given hay, pelleted feed and mineral supplements on a  
85 daily basis, and water *ad libitum*. Prior to the study, the health of the animals was evaluated  
86 using a complete blood count, liver and renal biochemical profile, and fecal parasitologic  
87 examination. For at least 20 days prior to the initiation of the study, the animals were monitored  
88 for individual behavior and were conditioned to physical restraint. Before the study, food and  
89 water were withheld for 24 hours and the hair over the right jugular vein and auricular arteries  
90 was clipped.

91 Once the animals were moved to the experimental area, the skin sites for vessel catheterization  
92 were aseptically prepared. A catheter (18 gauge, 2.5 cm Safelet; Nipro Medical Ltda, SP, Brazil)  
93 was introduced into the right jugular vein, and a second catheter (20 gauge, 2.5 cm) introduced  
94 into an auricular artery with the sheep restrained in a standing position. The ambient temperature  
95 was 22 °C. Fifteen minutes were allowed to elapse following instrumentation before any  
96 measurements were recorded.

#### 97 Experimental design

98 The sheep were randomized (by drawing of lots) to four treatments in a crossover study, with a  
99 minimum interval of 7 days between treatments. The four treatments were: X, xylazine  
100 (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>; Rompun 2%; Bayer AG, SP, Brazil); XM, xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and methadone  
101 (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>; Mytadon, 10 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>; Cristália Produtos Químicos e Farmacêuticos Ltda, SP,  
102 Brazil); XMO, xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and morphine (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>; Dimorf, 10 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>; Cristália  
103 Produtos Químicos e Farmacêuticos Ltda), and XT, xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and tramadol  
104 (5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>; Tramadon, 50 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>; Cristália Produtos Químicos e Farmacêuticos Ltda). Each  
105 drug combination was mixed in the syringe. The final volume was adjusted to 5 mL with 0.9%  
106 sodium chloride to facilitate blinding and administered IV into the jugular catheter over  
107 30 seconds. The catheter was then flushed with 0.9% sodium chloride. Animals were then left to  
108 wander freely in the experiment area. Data for all variables were collected by the same  
109 investigator for all animals at all evaluation times. Variables were measured before drug  
110 administration (baseline, T0) and every 15 minutes after drug administration for 120 minutes  
111 (T15–T120).

#### 112 Degree of sedation

113 Three evaluators who were unaware of the treatment assessed the degree of sedation. Sedation  
114 was scored using a numerical rating scale of 0–10, on which a score of 0 indicates no sedation  
115 and a score of 10 indicates recumbency with no movement (Kästner et al. 2003) (Appendix 1).  
116 Assessments of sedation were always performed prior to the measurement of other variables and  
117 evaluators' scores were averaged.

#### 118 Cardiopulmonary variables

119 Cardiopulmonary data were collected in the following order. Heart rate (HR) was measured  
120 using transthoracic auscultation with a stethoscope in the region of the fourth left intercostal  
121 space for 1 minute. Mean arterial blood pressure (MAP) was evaluated using the arterial catheter  
122 connected to a system filled with 0.1% heparin solution (50 IU mL<sup>-1</sup>). Pressure was measured  
123 intermittently using an aneroid manometer (Indústria Bic de Aparelhos Médicos Ltda, SP,  
124 Brazil) which was calibrated against a mercury column before use. Prior to measurement, the  
125 system was zeroed using the air–saline junction at the point of the shoulder in standing and  
126 sternally recumbent animals and the xiphoid process in laterally recumbent animals as reference  
127 points. Respiratory rate ( $f_R$ ) was assessed by observing the movements of the thorax for  
128 1 minute. Rectal temperature (RT °C) was measured with a clinical mercury-in-glass  
129 thermometer (Thermometer BD; Becton Dickinson Indústrias Cirúrgicas SA, MG, Brazil)  
130 inserted into the rectum. Arterial blood samples were taken from the arterial catheter for  
131 determination of pH, arterial partial pressure of carbon dioxide (PaCO<sub>2</sub>), arterial partial pressure  
132 of oxygen (PaO<sub>2</sub>), base excess (BE), arterial hemoglobin oxygen saturation (SaO<sub>2</sub>), sodium  
133 (Na<sup>+</sup>), potassium (K<sup>+</sup>), ionized calcium (iCa<sup>2+</sup>) and chloride (Cl<sup>-</sup>) concentrations. Each blood  
134 sample amounted to 0.5 mL and was withdrawn into a disposable syringe containing heparin and

135 sealed with a rubber stopper. Samples were analyzed immediately using a blood gas analyzer  
136 [Cobas b 121; Roche Diagnostics (Schweiz) AG, Switzerland].

137 Statistical analysis

138 Data were analyzed using GraphPad Prism Version 5.0 (GraphPad Software, Inc., CA, USA).

139 Data were tested for normality prior to analysis using the Shapiro–Wilk test. Normally

140 distributed data were analyzed using analysis of variance (ANOVA) for repeated measures;

141 Dunnett’s test was used to compare data within the same treatment group. ANOVAs and a *post*

142 *hoc* Tukey test were used to compare data between treatments. Non-parametric data were

143 analyzed using the Kruskal–Wallis test with a *post hoc* Dunn’s test. For all analyses, a *p*-value of

144  $< 0.05$  was considered to indicate statistical significance.

## 145 **Results**

146 All animals were included in the study and all completed the 120 minute evaluation period,

147 recovering without complications. Behavioral effects other than sedation included drooling,

148 bruxism, vocalization and facial or generalized tremors (Table 1).

149 Sedative effects

150 Sedation scores were significantly higher compared with baseline at T15–T105 in X ( $p < 0.01$ )

151 and at T15–T90 in XM ( $p < 0.001$ ) and at all time points in XMO ( $p < 0.01$ ) and XT ( $p < 0.001$ )

152 (Fig. 1). In XM, sedation was significantly greater at T15 in comparison with T90, T105 and

153 T120 ( $p < 0.01$ ). In XMO, sedation scores were significantly greater at T15, T30 and T60 in

154 comparison with T105 and T120. In XT, sedation at T30 was significantly greater than at T120.

155 When sedation scores were compared between treatments, those at T15 and T30 were

156 significantly higher in XM and XMO than in X and XT. At T30, the sedation score in XT was

157 significantly higher than in X ( $p < 0.05$ ).

158 Sternal or lateral recumbency (scores 6–10) occurred in variable numbers of animals in XM at  
159 three time points (T15, T30, T45), in XMO at six time points (T15–T90) and in XT at three time  
160 points (T15, T60, T90). Recumbency was not observed in any animal administered xylazine  
161 alone.

162 Cardiopulmonary variables and body temperature

163 Heart rate decreased in all treatments at all time points in comparison with baseline ( $p < 0.001$ )  
164 (Table 2). There was no significant difference in HR among treatments. MAP was significantly  
165 decreased from baseline in X at T45 and T90 ( $p < 0.05$ ) and in XMO at T15 ( $p < 0.0001$ ), T45  
166 and T75 ( $p < 0.001$ ) and T60 ( $p < 0.05$ ). In XT, MAP was significantly higher at T15 and T75  
167 than in the other treatments.

168 Rectal temperatures were unchanged, except at T60 in X ( $p < 0.05$ ), and did not differ among  
169 treatments.

170 In comparison with baseline values,  $f_R$  was significantly lower at T60–T120 in X ( $p < 0.05$ ) and  
171 T45–T90 in XMO ( $p < 0.001$ ) (Table 2). There were no significant differences among  
172 treatments.

173 Blood gas and electrolyte variables

174 Significant increases in pH compared with baseline were measured at all time points in X and  
175 XM, and at T45–T120 in XMO ( $p < 0.001$ ) (Table 3). In a comparison among treatments, pH  
176 values in X and XM were significantly higher at T45 and T120. PaCO<sub>2</sub> values were higher at all  
177 time points than at baseline ( $p < 0.001$ ) in XM and XMO. In the comparative analysis among the  
178 treatments, no significant difference was observed. Analysis of BE revealed a significant  
179 increase (values became more positive) at all time points compared with T0 in X and XM



180 ( $p < 0.0001$ ), and at T30–T120 in XMO and XT ( $p < 0.05$ ). There were no statistically  
181 significant differences among treatments.

182 In comparison with baseline values, PaO<sub>2</sub> was significantly lower at T15–T75 in XM ( $p < 0.01$ ),  
183 at all time points in XMO ( $p < 0.001$ ), and at T15 and T30 in XT ( $p < 0.001$ ). In comparison with  
184 values in treatment X, PaO<sub>2</sub> values were significantly lower at T30–T60 in XM ( $p < 0.01$ ), T15  
185 in XMO ( $p < 0.01$ ) and T30 in XT ( $p < 0.05$ ).

186 There were no statistically significant differences in values of SaO<sub>2</sub>, Na<sup>+</sup>, K<sup>+</sup>, iCa<sup>2+</sup> and Cl<sup>-</sup> in  
187 either comparisons with baseline values or among treatments, and values remained within the  
188 physiologic ranges for this species.

## 189 **Discussion**

190 The combination of a sedative (such as an  $\alpha_2$ -agonist) with an opioid is used very commonly in  
191 veterinary anesthetic practice. Recommended doses of xylazine for IV administration to sheep  
192 vary markedly. Grant & Upton (2001) found that 0.05 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> of xylazine IM resulted in poor  
193 sedation, whereas administration of 0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> xylazine IM resulted in obvious signs of  
194 sedation, but the animals remained standing (Shokry et al. 1976). Marked sedative effects were  
195 observed at doses of  $> 0.3$  mg kg<sup>-1</sup> IV (Hsu et al. 1987, 1989). A dose of 0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> xylazine  
196 was chosen for this study in order to achieve sedation sufficient for comparison with the effects  
197 of xylazine–opioid combinations.

198 Equipotent doses of morphine, methadone and tramadol for sheep are not reported in the  
199 literature. Consequently, the dose rates used in this study were based on those in studies that  
200 compared the use of morphine with tramadol or methadone in dogs (Mastrocinque & Fantoni  
201 2003; Maiante et al. 2009).

202 The time course of 120 minutes chosen for this study was based on what is known about the  
203 pharmacokinetic characteristics of xylazine in sheep (Garcia-Villar et al. 1981) and the sedative  
204 effects of morphine, methadone and tramadol in combination with dexmedetomidine in dogs  
205 (Cardoso et al. 2014).

206 Adverse side effects such as tremors, bruxism, nystagmus and vocalization were prevalent in all  
207 the xylazine–opioid treatments. Waterman et al. (1990, 1991) demonstrated that butorphanol and  
208 fentanyl administration in sheep leads to agitation and distressed behavior. Lin & Riddell (2003)  
209 observed slow horizontal nystagmus following IV administration of detomidine and butorphanol  
210 in dairy cattle. In the same species, sedation after the administration of xylazine and butorphanol  
211 was no greater than that after xylazine alone (Levine et al. 1992). Alpacas exhibited neurologic  
212 signs of hyperexcitability, hyperesthesia, tremors and ataxia after administration of tramadol IV  
213 (Edmondson et al. 2012). The adverse effects observed in the present study were similar, further  
214 supporting the excitatory effects of opioids on the CNS in ruminant species.

215 Following the IV administration of  $\alpha_2$ -agonists, there is a biphasic blood pressure response.  
216 Initially, hypertension caused by peripheral vasoconstriction occurs, after which a reflex  
217 bradycardia is mediated by baroreceptors. In humans, a prolonged, centrally mediated  
218 hypotensive period then ensues, but hypotension after the administration of  $\alpha_2$ -agonists has not  
219 been reported in dogs (Murrell & Hellebrekers 2005). In sheep, the administration of xylazine  
220 ( $0.05 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$  IM or  $0.2 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$  IV) did not induce significant changes in HR (Bacon et al.  
221 1998; Grant & Upton 2001). Opioids can cause cardiovascular depression by inducing negative  
222 chronotropy and decreased cardiac output (Stanley et al. 1980). However, in goats,  $0.6 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$   
223 methadone IV did not cause alterations in HR for up to 240 minutes (Olsén et al. 2013).

224 Similarly, in dogs, the administration of morphine at  $3 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$  IV did not induce significant

225 changes in HR during 30 minutes of evaluation (Priano & Vatner 1981). IV tramadol at doses of  
226 1.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> and 2.6 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> followed by a continuous infusion caused no change in HR in dogs  
227 over 45 minutes (Seddighi et al. 2009). The effects of combinations of an  $\alpha_2$ -agonist with an  
228 opioid on MAP have not been described in sheep. In dogs administered xylazine and methadone,  
229 systolic arterial blood pressure fell but hypotension did not occur over the 60 minute study  
230 period (Monteiro et al. 2008). In the present study, although MAP was significantly decreased at  
231 some time points, hypotension (MAP < 60 mmHg) was not observed. HR decreased during all  
232 treatments, but at no time was clinically significant bradycardia noted.

233 The administration of  $\alpha_2$ -agonists may result in a decrease in body temperature caused by  
234 depression of the thermoregulatory centre (Pypendop & Versteegen 1998) and reduced muscular  
235 activity (Virtanen 1989). In the present study, the significant decrease in the RT of sheep  
236 identified at one time point after xylazine administration was not clinically significant, and no  
237 significant decreases in RT occurred in the other treatments. Administration of methadone  
238 (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> and 1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> IV) and morphine (1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> IV) to dogs resulted in a progressive  
239 reduction of body temperature for up to 90 minutes (Maiante et al. 2009). Monteiro et al. (2009)  
240 reported that body temperature decreased in dogs administered tramadol 2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> IV and  
241 acepromazine, although the vasodilatory effects of acepromazine are likely to be responsible for  
242 this change.

243 Dexmedetomidine and medetomidine administered to sheep do not change  $f_R$  (Kästner et al.  
244 2001). PaCO<sub>2</sub> was not significantly changed after IV administration of 0.15 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> and  
245 0.2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> xylazine to sheep (Celly et al. 1997; Bacon et al. 1998), despite the occurrence of  
246 apnea for 30 seconds followed by tachypnea for up to 60 minutes (Celly et al. 1997). Opioids  
247 may cause respiratory depression by decreasing the ventilatory response to hypercapnia (Steffey

248 et al. 1993); however, hypercapnia did not occur after the administration of morphine or  
249 methadone ( $0.5 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$ ) IV to conscious dogs (Maiante et al. 2009). There is evidence that  
250 tramadol has little effect on ventilation in some species when administered at doses lower than  
251 those used in this study (Mastrocinque & Fantoni 2003). In the present study,  $f_R$  decreased  
252 significantly at 60–120 minutes in X and 45–120 minutes in XMO, and mild but statistically  
253 significant increases in  $\text{PaCO}_2$  were observed in the XM and XMO treatments for the duration of  
254 monitoring. Sedation with treatment XM resulted initially in lateral recumbency and with XMO  
255 in sternal recumbency, which may have limited lung expansion and resulted in decreased  
256 ventilation.

257 Determination of pH can be used as an indicator of homeostasis (Sobiech et al. 2005). The pH  
258 and BE values in all treatments showed a progressive increase with time. Elevations of pH,  
259 bicarbonate ( $\text{HCO}_3^-$ ) and BE have been reported following epidural xylazine in sheep (Aminkov  
260 & Hubenov 1995) and IV xylazine in goats (Mogoa et al. 2000), although none of these authors  
261 suggested why these changes occurred. Ringer et al. (2013) analyzed the acid-base and  
262 electrolyte effects of a continuous 3 hour infusion of romifidine or xylazine in horses and noted  
263 increasing pH,  $\text{HCO}_3^-$  and BE. The authors hypothesized that this change was attributable to  
264 hypochloremia resulting from urinary loss. No significant electrolyte abnormalities were  
265 identified in the present study and therefore the mechanism by which such changes occur in  
266 sheep remains uncertain.

267 Hypoxemia [ $\text{PaO}_2 < 60 \text{ mmHg (7.9 kPa)}$ ] in sheep after administration of an  $\alpha_2$ -agonist is  
268 common, especially when the drug is administered IV (Kästner 2006). The proposed mechanism  
269 of action is intense venous spasm mediated via adrenoreceptor agonism, intense pulmonary  
270 congestion, increased microvascular pressure and alveolar capillary rupture, resulting in an

271 inflammatory response (Celly et al. 1997; Bacon et al. 1998; Kästner et al. 2007). As previously  
272 discussed, opioids may cause respiratory depression (Steffey et al. 1993), leading to hypoxemia,  
273 particularly when the animal is breathing atmospheric air. However, in dogs, the administration  
274 of methadone or morphine at the same doses used in this study did not induce changes in PaO<sub>2</sub>  
275 (Maiante et al. 2009). Likewise, tramadol 2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> did not cause alterations in PaO<sub>2</sub> in dogs  
276 (Mastrocinque & Fantoni 2003). In this study, PaO<sub>2</sub> was decreased, particularly when  
277 combinations of xylazine and an opioid were administered, and these changes were statistically  
278 significant. This decrease may reflect the level of sedation as sheep administered a xylazine–  
279 opioid combination were more likely to become recumbent, which may have adverse effects on  
280 ventilation perfusion matching. Mitchell & Williams (1976) measured arterial oxygen  
281 concentrations in healthy, conscious sheep and found them to be significantly lower in laterally  
282 recumbent than in standing animals. However, in the present study, at no point did the decrease  
283 in PaO<sub>2</sub> translate to a clinically significant decrease in SaO<sub>2</sub>. It must be emphasized that oxygen  
284 should be provided to sedated sheep if possible, particularly when the animal is at greater risk for  
285 hypoxemia from lateral or dorsal positioning, is unfasted or has systemic disease.

286 In conclusion, opioids used in combination with xylazine in sheep potentiate the sedative effect  
287 of xylazine in a similar way to that described in other species; methadone and morphine appear  
288 to promote better sedation. As the number of animals included in this study was small, and the  
289 doses of drugs were restricted, further work is necessary to ascertain the most suitable  
290 combination for clinical use. The combinations depressed HR in a manner similar to that induced  
291 by xylazine alone, but MAP was maintained. Although PaO<sub>2</sub> was reduced in all treatments, SaO<sub>2</sub>  
292 values did not indicate the need for oxygen therapy.

### 293 **Acknowledgements**

294 The authors would like to thank Fundação de Amparo a Pesquisa do Estado de São Paulo  
295 (FAPESP: 2013/00831-0) for the provision of financial support, and Ana Márcia Zago and the  
296 Design Department of the University of Franca for drafting the figure.

297

## 298 **References**

299 Aminkov BY, Hubenov HD (1995) The effect of xylazine epidural anaesthesia on blood gas and  
300 acid-base parameters in rams. *Br Vet J* 151, 579–585.

301 Bacon PJ, Jones JG, Taylor P et al. (1998) Impairment of gas exchange due to alveolar oedema  
302 during xylazine sedation in sheep; absence of a free radical mediated inflammatory mechanism.  
303 *Res Vet Sci* 65, 71–75.

304 Cardoso CG, Marques DR, da Silva TH et al. (2014) Cardiorespiratory, sedative and  
305 antinociceptive effects of dexmedetomidine alone or in combination with methadone, morphine  
306 or tramadol in dogs. *Vet Anaesth Analg* 41, 636–643.

307 Celly CS, McDonnell WN, Young SS et al. (1997) The comparative hypoxaemic effect of four  $\alpha_2$ -  
308 adrenoceptor agonists (xylazine, romifidine, detomidine and medetomidine) in sheep. *J Vet*  
309 *Pharmacol Ther* 20, 464–471.

310 Edmondson MA, Duran SH, Boothe DM et al. (2012) Pharmacokinetics of tramadol and its  
311 major metabolites in alpacas following intravenous and oral administration. *J Vet Pharmacol*  
312 *Ther* 35, 389–396.

313 Garcia-Villar R, Toutain PL, Alvinerie M et al. (1981) The pharmacokinetics of xylazine  
314 hydrochloride: an interspecific study. *J Vet Pharmacol Ther* 4, 87–92.

315 Grant C, Upton RN (2001) Cardiovascular and haemodynamic effects of intramuscular doses of  
316 xylazine in conscious sheep. *Aust Vet J* 79, 58–60.

317 Guedes AGP, Natalini CC, Rude EP et al. (2005) Comparison of tramadol and morphine for pre-  
318 medication of dogs undergoing general anaesthesia for orthopedic surgery. [Abstract.] *Vet*  
319 *Anaesth Analg* 32, 236.

320 Hsu WH, Schaffer DD, Hanson CE (1987) Effects of tolazoline and yohimbine on xylazine-  
321 induced central nervous system depression, bradycardia, and tachypnea in sheep. *J Am Vet Med*  
322 *Assoc* 190, 423–426.

323 Hsu WH, Hanson CE, Hembrough FB et al. (1989) Effects of idazoxan, tolazoline, and  
324 yohimbine on xylazine-induced respiratory changes and central nervous system depression in  
325 ewes. *Am J Vet Res* 50, 1570–1573.

326 Kästner SBR (2006)  $\alpha_2$ -agonists in sheep: a review. *Vet Anaesth Analg* 33, 79–96.

327 Kästner SBR, Boller M, Kutter A et al. (2001) Clinical comparison of preanaesthetic  
328 intramuscular medetomidine and dexmedetomidine in domestic sheep. *Dtsch Tierärztl*  
329 *Wochenschr* 108, 409–413.

330 Kästner SBR, Wapf P, Feige K et al. (2003) Pharmacokinetics and sedative effects of  
331 intramuscular medetomidine in domestic sheep. *J Vet Pharmacol Ther* 26, 271–276.

332 Kästner SBR, Ohlerth S, Pospischil A et al. (2007) Dexmedetomidine-induced pulmonary  
333 alterations in sheep. *Res Vet Sc* 83, 217–226.

334 KuKanich B, Papich MG (2009) Opioid analgesic drugs. In: *Veterinary Pharmacology and*  
335 *Therapeutics* (9th edn). Riviere JE, Papich MG (eds). Wiley-Blackwell, USA. pp. 301–336.

336 Leppänen MK, McKusick BC, Granholm MM et al. (2006) Clinical efficacy and safety of  
337 dexmedetomidine and buprenorphine, butorphanol or diazepam for canine hip radiography. *J*  
338 *Small Anim Pract* 47, 663–669.

339 Levine HD, Dodman NH, Hustead D (1992) Evaluation of a xylazine–butorphanol combination  
340 for use during standing laparotomy in dairy cattle. *Agri Pract* 13, 19–23.

341 Lin HC, Riddell MG (2003) Preliminary study of the effects of xylazine or detomidine with or  
342 without butorphanol for standing sedation in dairy cattle. *Vet Ther* 4, 285–291.

343 Maiante AA, Teixeira Neto FJ, Beier SL et al. (2009) Comparison of the cardio-respiratory  
344 effects of methadone and morphine in conscious dogs. *J Vet Pharmacol Ther* 32, 317–328.

345 Mastrocinque S, Fantoni DT (2003) A comparison of preoperative tramadol and morphine for  
346 the control of early postoperative pain in canine ovariohysterectomy. *Vet Anaesth Analg* 30,  
347 220–228.

348 Mitchell B, Williams JT (1976) Respiratory function changes in sheep associated with lying in  
349 lateral recumbency and with sedation by xylazine. *Vet Anaesth Analg* 6, 30–36.

350 Mogoia EG, Stegmann GF, Guthrie AJ (2000) Effects of xylazine on acid-base balance and  
351 arterial blood-gas tensions in goats under different environmental temperature and humidity  
352 conditions. *J S Afr Vet Assoc* 71, 229–231.

353 Monteiro ER, Figueroa CDN, Choma JC et al. (2008) Effects of methadone, alone or in  
354 combination with acepromazine or xylazine, on sedation and physiologic values in dogs. *Vet*  
355 *Anaesth Analg* 35, 519–527.

356 Monteiro ER, Junior AR, Assis HM et al. (2009) Comparative study on the sedative effects of  
357 morphine, methadone, butorphanol or tramadol, in combination with acepromazine, in dogs. *Vet*  
358 *Anaesth Analg* 36, 25–33.

359 Murrell JC, Hellebrekers LJ (2005) Medetomidine and dexmedetomidine: a review of  
360 cardiovascular effects and antinociceptive properties in the dog. *Vet Anaesth Analg* 32, 117–127.



361 Olsén L, Olsson K, Hydbring-Sandberg E et al. (2013) Methadone in healthy goats –  
362 pharmacokinetics, behaviour and blood pressure. *Res Vet Sci* 95, 231–237.

363 Priano LL, Vatner SF (1981) Morphine effects on cardiac output and regional blood flow  
364 distribution in conscious dogs. *Anesthesiology* 55, 236–243.

365 Pypendop BH, Verstegen JP (1998) Hemodynamic effects of medetomidine in the dog: a dose  
366 titration study. *Vet Surg* 27, 612–622.

367 Ringer SK, Schwarzwald CC, Portier K et al. (2013) Blood glucose, acid-base and electrolyte  
368 changes during loading doses of  $\alpha_2$ -adrenergic agonists followed by constant rate infusions in  
369 horses. *Vet J* 198, 684–689.

370 Seddighi MR, Egger CM, Rohrbach BW et al. (2009) Effects of tramadol on the minimum  
371 alveolar concentration of sevoflurane in dogs. *Vet Anaesth Analg* 36, 334–340.

372 Selmi AL, Mendes GM, Lins BT et al. (2003) Evaluation of the sedative and cardiorespiratory  
373 effects of dexmedetomidine, dexmedetomidine–butorphanol, and dexmedetomidine–ketamine in  
374 cats. *J Am Vet Med Assoc* 222, 37–41.

375 Shokry M, Morad HM, Khalil IA (1976) Studies on the effect of Rompun in sheep. *Vet Med Rev*  
376 2, 237–243.

377 Sobiech O, Lew M, Lew S et al. (2005) The effect of propofol on acid-base balance and ionic  
378 composition of venous and arterial blood in goats. *Pol J Vet Sci* 8, 295–300.

379 Stanley TH, Liu WS, Webster LR et al. (1980) Haemodynamic effects of intravenous methadone  
380 anaesthesia in dogs. *Can Anaesth Soc J* 27, 52–57.

381 Steffey EP, Eisele JH, Baggot JD et al. (1993) Influence of inhaled anesthetics on the  
382 pharmacokinetics and pharmacodynamics of morphine. *Anesth Analg* 77, 346–351.

- 383 Uggla A, Lindqvist A (1983) Acute pulmonary oedema as an adverse reaction to the use of  
384 xylazine in sheep. *Vet Rec* 113, 42.
- 385 Virtanen R (1989) Pharmacological profiles of medetomidine and its antagonist, atipamezole.  
386 *Acta Vet Scand* 85 (Suppl), 29–37.
- 387 Waterman AE, Livingston A, Amin A (1990) The antinociceptive activity and respiratory effects  
388 of fentanyl in sheep. *J Assoc Vet Anaesth* 17, 20–23.
- 389 Waterman AE, Livingston A, Amin A (1991) Analgesic activity and respiratory effects of  
390 butorphanol in sheep. *Res Vet Sci* 51, 19–23.
- 391

392 **Appendix 1** Numerical rating scale for assessment of sedation in sheep (Kästner et al. 2003)

<b>Score</b>	<b>Behavior</b>
0	Standing, alert, normal behavior
1	Standing, alert, reduced head and ear movements
2	Standing, slight head drop
3	Standing, moderate head drop
4	Standing, severe head drop and ataxia
5	Standing, severe head drop and severe ataxia
6	Sternal recumbency, head up
7	Sternal recumbency, unable to support head
8	Lateral recumbency, occasional attempts to attain sternal recumbency
9	Lateral recumbency, uncoordinated head and leg movements
10	Lateral recumbency, no movements

394 **Figure 1** Sedation scores in six sheep after intravenous administration of (a) xylazine  
395 (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (X), (b) xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and methadone (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (XM), (c) xylazine  
396 (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and morphine (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (XMO) or (d) or xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and tramadol  
397 (5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (XT). Sedation scores of  $\geq 6$  indicate sternal recumbency and scores of  $\geq 8$  indicate  
398 lateral recumbency. Lines indicate median scores, boxes indicate interquartile ranges and  
399 whiskers indicate ranges. \*Significantly different from baseline within the same treatment (X  
400 and XMO:  $p < 0.01$ ; XM and XT:  $p < 0.001$ ). †Significantly different from X and XT at the  
401 same time point ( $p < 0.05$ ). ‡Significantly different from X at the same time point ( $p < 0.05$ ).  
402

403 **Table 1** Adverse effects observed in six sheep over 120 minutes in four treatment conditions:  
 404 intravenous (IV) xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (treatment X); IV xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and methadone  
 405 (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (treatment XM); IV xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and morphine (0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (treatment  
 406 XMO), and IV xylazine (0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and tramadol (5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) (treatment XT)  
 407 NB, normal behavior.

408

Treatment	Time points (minutes)						
	T15	T30	T45	T60	T75	T90	T120
X	Drooling	Drooling	Drooling	Drooling Urination	Drooling Urination	Drooling Urination	NB
XM	Drooling Bruxism Mydriasis Nystagmus Facial tremors	Drooling Bruxism Mydriasis Generalized tremors	Drooling Bruxism	Drooling Bruxism Vocalization	Drooling Vocalization	Vocalization	NB
XMO	Drooling Bruxism Facial tremors	Drooling Bruxism	Vocalization Bruxism Mydriasis Drooling	Bruxism Mydriasis Vocalization Drooling	Vocalization Drooling	Vocalization Bruxism	Vocalization
XT	Bruxism Vocalization Drooling Facial tremors	Drooling Bruxism Increased response to touch	Drooling Urination	Drooling Urination Vocalization	Vocalization	NB	NB

409 **Table 2** Mean  $\pm$  standard deviation heart rate (HR), mean arterial pressure (MAP), rectal  
410 temperature (RT °C) and respiratory rate ( $f_R$ ) in sheep before (T0) and after intravenous  
411 administration of xylazine (X), xylazine and methadone (XM), xylazine and morphine (XMO) or  
412 xylazine and tramadol (XT)

	Treatment	Time points (minutes)							
		T0	T15	T30	T45	T60	T75	T90	T105
e <sup>-1</sup> )	X	101 $\pm$ 14	85 $\pm$ 11*	73 $\pm$ 14*	71 $\pm$ 17*	70 $\pm$ 16*	74 $\pm$ 14*	75 $\pm$ 16*	77 $\pm$ 9*
	XM	124 $\pm$ 14	70 $\pm$ 11*	77 $\pm$ 14*	78 $\pm$ 15*	86 $\pm$ 16*	83 $\pm$ 14*	88 $\pm$ 9*	92 $\pm$ 9*
	XMO	112 $\pm$ 12	77 $\pm$ 15*	78 $\pm$ 13*	73 $\pm$ 7*	71 $\pm$ 9*	72 $\pm$ 7*	79 $\pm$ 9*	90 $\pm$ 14*
	XT	105 $\pm$ 13	70 $\pm$ 9*	71 $\pm$ 9*	69 $\pm$ 12*	71 $\pm$ 12*	77 $\pm$ 15*	76 $\pm$ 16*	84 $\pm$ 19
	X	110 $\pm$ 11	99 $\pm$ 11	99 $\pm$ 7	97 $\pm$ 14*	98 $\pm$ 8	103 $\pm$ 9	95 $\pm$ 12*	99 $\pm$ 10
	XM	103 $\pm$ 10	93 $\pm$ 9	92 $\pm$ 8	94 $\pm$ 14	99 $\pm$ 12	97 $\pm$ 9	99 $\pm$ 7	99 $\pm$ 12
	XMO	111 $\pm$ 14	89 $\pm$ 11*	99 $\pm$ 8	94 $\pm$ 12*	97 $\pm$ 13*	93 $\pm$ 12*	104 $\pm$ 6	104 $\pm$ 10
	XT	109 $\pm$ 8	107 $\pm$ 9†	106 $\pm$ 6	110 $\pm$ 15	114 $\pm$ 12	115 $\pm$ 12†	106 $\pm$ 17	111 $\pm$ 13
	X	39.1 $\pm$ 0.5	39.2 $\pm$ 0.4	39.0 $\pm$ 0.4	38.9 $\pm$ 0.5	38.8 $\pm$ 0.6	38.9 $\pm$ 0.5	38.9 $\pm$ 0.6	39.1 $\pm$ 0.7
	XM	39.3 $\pm$ 0.4	39.1 $\pm$ 0.5	38.9 $\pm$ 0.6	38.9 $\pm$ 0.7	39.0 $\pm$ 0.8	39.2 $\pm$ 0.8	39.3 $\pm$ 0.7	39.5 $\pm$ 0.7
	XMO	39.7 $\pm$ 0.6	39.6 $\pm$ 0.7	39.4 $\pm$ 0.6	39.2 $\pm$ 0.6	39.2 $\pm$ 0.5	39.3 $\pm$ 0.4	39.4 $\pm$ 0.4	39.4 $\pm$ 0.4
	XT	39.3 $\pm$ 0.3	39.4 $\pm$ 0.8	39.1 $\pm$ 0.6	39.0 $\pm$ 0.6	39.0 $\pm$ 0.7	38.8 $\pm$ 0.7	38.9 $\pm$ 1.0	39.2 $\pm$ 0.8
ute <sup>-1</sup> )	X	28 $\pm$ 7	27 $\pm$ 11	25 $\pm$ 10	24 $\pm$ 11	21 $\pm$ 6*	20 $\pm$ 5*	21 $\pm$ 6*	19 $\pm$ 7*
	XM	23 $\pm$ 10	21 $\pm$ 5	18 $\pm$ 4	23 $\pm$ 7	19 $\pm$ 5	18 $\pm$ 4	19 $\pm$ 4	19 $\pm$ 2
	XMO	28 $\pm$ 6	24 $\pm$ 5	24 $\pm$ 8	20 $\pm$ 4*	21 $\pm$ 2*	19 $\pm$ 4*	21 $\pm$ 3*	22 $\pm$ 8
	XT	26 $\pm$ 4	29 $\pm$ 9	25 $\pm$ 12	21 $\pm$ 7	21 $\pm$ 8	24 $\pm$ 10	20 $\pm$ 7	20 $\pm$ 4

413 \*Significantly different from T0 within the same treatment ( $p < 0.05$ ). †Significantly different  
414 from other treatments at the same time point ( $p < 0.05$ ).

415

416 **Table 3** Mean  $\pm$  standard deviation arterial pH (pH), arterial partial pressure of carbon dioxide  
417 (PaCO<sub>2</sub>), arterial partial pressure of oxygen (PaO<sub>2</sub>), bicarbonate (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) and base excess (BE)  
418 in sheep sedated with xylazine (X), xylazine and methadone (XM), xylazine and morphine  
419 (XMO) or xylazine and tramadol (XT)

Treatment	Time points (minutes)							
	T0	T15	T30	T45	T60	T75	T90	T105
	7.46 $\pm$ 0.02	7.50 $\pm$ 0.02*	7.52 $\pm$ 0.01*	7.53 $\pm$ 0.02*†	7.52 $\pm$ 0.04*†	7.54 $\pm$ 0.03*†	7.52 $\pm$ 0.02*†	7.53 $\pm$ 0.02*
	7.45 $\pm$ 0.06	7.48 $\pm$ 0.03*	7.50 $\pm$ 0.03*	7.51 $\pm$ 0.02*†	7.52 $\pm$ 0.02*†	7.53 $\pm$ 0.03*†	7.52 $\pm$ 0.04*†	7.53 $\pm$ 0.03*
D	7.41 $\pm$ 0.08	7.44 $\pm$ 0.06	7.46 $\pm$ 0.04	7.49 $\pm$ 0.03*	7.50 $\pm$ 0.03*	7.52 $\pm$ 0.02*	7.51 $\pm$ 0.02*	7.51 $\pm$ 0.02*
	7.47 $\pm$ 0.07	7.48 $\pm$ 0.06	7.50 $\pm$ 0.04	7.51 $\pm$ 0.03	7.51 $\pm$ 0.04	7.52 $\pm$ 0.03	7.51 $\pm$ 0.04	7.51 $\pm$ 0.03*
	32 $\pm$ 3	33 $\pm$ 3	34 $\pm$ 2	35 $\pm$ 3	33 $\pm$ 3	32 $\pm$ 2	34 $\pm$ 3	33 $\pm$ 3
	29 $\pm$ 3	35 $\pm$ 1*	36 $\pm$ 3*	37 $\pm$ 1*	36 $\pm$ 3*	34 $\pm$ 2*	34 $\pm$ 1*	34 $\pm$ 3*
D	28 $\pm$ 3	32 $\pm$ 2*	33 $\pm$ 3*	33 $\pm$ 2*	33 $\pm$ 3*	32 $\pm$ 3*	34 $\pm$ 3*	33 $\pm$ 2*
	31 $\pm$ 3	34 $\pm$ 4	34 $\pm$ 4	34 $\pm$ 3	35 $\pm$ 3	34 $\pm$ 2	35 $\pm$ 4	32 $\pm$ 5
	4.2 $\pm$ 0.4	4.3 $\pm$ 0.4	4.5 $\pm$ 0.2	4.6 $\pm$ 0.4	4.3 $\pm$ 0.4	4.2 $\pm$ 0.2	4.5 $\pm$ 0.4	4.3 $\pm$ 0.4
	3.8 $\pm$ 0.4	4.6 $\pm$ 0.1*	4.7 $\pm$ 0.4*	4.9 $\pm$ 4.9*	4.7 $\pm$ 0.4*	4.5 $\pm$ 0.2*	4.5 $\pm$ 0.1*	4.5 $\pm$ 0.4*
D	3.7 $\pm$ 0.4	4.2 $\pm$ 0.2*	4.3 $\pm$ 0.4*	4.3 $\pm$ 0.2*	4.3 $\pm$ 0.4*	4.2 $\pm$ 0.4*	4.5 $\pm$ 0.4*	4.3 $\pm$ 0.2*
	4.1 $\pm$ 0.4	4.5 $\pm$ 0.5	4.5 $\pm$ 0.5	4.5 $\pm$ 0.4	4.6 $\pm$ 0.4	4.5 $\pm$ 0.2	4.6 $\pm$ 0.5	4.3 $\pm$ 0.6
	80 $\pm$ 3	71 $\pm$ 10	73 $\pm$ 6	75 $\pm$ 5	77 $\pm$ 10	75 $\pm$ 9	77 $\pm$ 3	73 $\pm$ 3
	81 $\pm$ 4	65 $\pm$ 8*†	65 $\pm$ 8*†	65 $\pm$ 8*†	69 $\pm$ 6*	71 $\pm$ 7*	76 $\pm$ 6	75 $\pm$ 5
D	84 $\pm$ 3	63 $\pm$ 6*†	70 $\pm$ 5*	73 $\pm$ 7*	67 $\pm$ 5*	73 $\pm$ 3*	73 $\pm$ 5*	75 $\pm$ 8*
	81 $\pm$ 1	64 $\pm$ 10*	64 $\pm$ 6*†	74 $\pm$ 5	75 $\pm$ 4	76 $\pm$ 5	74 $\pm$ 5	73 $\pm$ 6
	10.6 $\pm$ 0.4	9.4 $\pm$ 1.3	9.7 $\pm$ 0.7	9.9 $\pm$ 0.6	10.2 $\pm$ 1.3	9.9 $\pm$ 1.1	10.2 $\pm$ 0.3	9.7 $\pm$ 0.3



	$10.7 \pm 0.5$	$8.6 \pm 1.0^{*\dagger}$	$8.6 \pm 1.0^{*\dagger}$	$8.6 \pm 1.0^{*\dagger}$	$9.1 \pm 0.7^*$	$9.4 \pm 0.9^*$	$10.1 \pm 0.7$	$9.9 \pm 0.6$
D	$11.1 \pm 0.4$	$8.3 \pm 0.7^{*\dagger}$	$9.3 \pm 0.6^*$	$9.7 \pm 0.9^*$	$8.9 \pm 0.6^*$	$9.7 \pm 0.3^*$	$9.7 \pm 0.6^*$	$9.9 \pm 1.0^*$
	$10.6 \pm 0.1$	$8.5 \pm 1.3^*$	$8.5 \pm 0.7^{*\dagger}$	$9.8 \pm 0.6^*$	$9.9 \pm 0.5$	$10.1 \pm 0.6$	$9.8 \pm 0.6$	$9.7 \pm 0.7$
	$21 \pm 2$	$25 \pm 2^*$	$27 \pm 3^*$	$28 \pm 2^*$	$28 \pm 4^*$	$27 \pm 3^*$	$27 \pm 3^*$	$27 \pm 3^*$
	$20 \pm 3$	$26 \pm 2^*$	$27 \pm 2^*$	$29 \pm 1^*$	$29 \pm 2^*$	$28 \pm 2^*$	$27 \pm 2^*$	$27 \pm 2^*$
D	$23 \pm 2$	$22 \pm 4$	$23 \pm 4$	$25 \pm 3$	$25 \pm 2$	$26 \pm 2$	$26 \pm 3^*$	$26 \pm 1$
	$22 \pm 5$	$25 \pm 4^*$	$26 \pm 4^*$	$27 \pm 3^*$	$27 \pm 4^*$	$27 \pm 3^*$	$27 \pm 4^*$	$25 \pm 4$
	$-2 \pm 2$	$2 \pm 1^*$	$4 \pm 2^*$	$5 \pm 2^*$	$5 \pm 4^*$	$5 \pm 3^*$	$4 \pm 2^*$	$4 \pm 2^*$
	$-3 \pm 4$	$2 \pm 2^*$	$4 \pm 2^*$	$6 \pm 1^*$	$6 \pm 2^*$	$5 \pm 2^*$	$4 \pm 3^*$	$4 \pm 2^*$
D	$-5 \pm 4$	$-2 \pm 5$	$0 \pm 4^*$	$2 \pm 3^*$	$2 \pm 3^*$	$3 \pm 2^*$	$3 \pm 2^*$	$3 \pm 1^*$
	$-1 \pm 6$	$2 \pm 4$	$4 \pm 4^*$	$4 \pm 3^*$	$5 \pm 3^*$	$4 \pm 3^*$	$4 \pm 4^*$	$3 \pm 3^*$

420 \*Statistically different from T0 within the same treatment ( $p < 0.05$ ). †Statistically different from

421 all other treatments at the same time point ( $p < 0.05$ ).