

Vulnerable Warriors: The Atmospheric Marketing of Military and Policing Equipment before and after 9/11

*Anna Feigenbaum, Bournemouth University**

Daniel Weissmann, Bournemouth University

Dr. Anna Feigenbaum is a Senior Lecturer in Digital Storytelling at Bournemouth University. Her book on the history of tear gas in policing is out with Verso in 2016.

Daniel Weissmann is a Senior Research Assistant at Bournemouth University currently studying for an MA in International Political Communications.

***Corresponding Author**

Dr. Anna Feigenbaum

Bournemouth University

Faculty of Media and Communication

Weymouth House

Bournemouth University, Talbot Campus

Poole, Dorset BH12 5BB

United Kingdom

+441202961238

afeigenbaum@bournemouth.ac.uk

Abstract

In this paper we analyse changes in the circulation of advertisements of policing products at security expos between 1995 and 2013. While the initial aim of the research was to evidence shifts in terrorist frames in the marketing of policing equipment before and after 9/11, our findings instead suggested that what we are seeing is the rise of marketing to police as 'vulnerable warriors', law enforcement officers in need of military weapons both for their offensive capabilities, as well as for the protection they can offer to a police force that is always under threat.

Keywords

Police; Police Militarization; Security Industry; Counter-Terrorism; Riot Control

Introduction

The aim of this paper is to better understand the cultural and material processes involved in the atmospheric marketing of police militarization and its relationship to discourses of counter-terrorism. In the paper we investigate changes in the marketing of policing and policing products between the mid-1990s and 2013, looking at how the fusion between the police and the military manifests in the commercial market for military and policing equipment. In this industry the police and the military are increasingly treated as two slices of the same pie. For example, the 2014 Homeland Security Research market report states that in response to asymmetric warfare, street riots, insurgency, and mass demonstrations, “many governments have entered into non-lethal weapons R&D and procurement dedicated to the full spectrum of public safety, law enforcement, crowd control and asymmetric warfare” (PR Newswire 2014).

We begin this paper with an overview of the technological convergence between military and policing equipment in the pre- and post-9/11 period, followed by a description of our multi-method approach for studying the atmospheric marketing and advertisement of military and policing equipment. We then discuss our findings, focusing on (i) images of terrorism, (ii) military and police cross-marketing, and what we term (iii) ‘the rise of the vulnerable warrior.’ We end the paper with a brief reflection of the role that police vulnerability currently plays in marketing military and police equipment, drawing attention to the inter-dependent relationship between police violence and police vulnerability.

We originally designed this project around the hypothesis that empirical evidence would demonstrate a clear shift in the rise of terrorist frames, and that these frames

would serve as justificatory discourses for the increased militarisation of police post 9/11. However, our findings did not adhere to this expectation. Rather, our most significant finding related to the increased emphasis on ‘the cop’ as not only a warrior (Balko 2013), but also a warrior under threat. The vulnerability of police officers dominated marketing discourse and iconography throughout the materials we studied. This finding suggests that more attention must be paid to how vulnerability is manufactured and marketed in ways that legitimise violence and the acquisition of evermore ‘use-of-force’ equipment and practices.

The Technological Convergence of Military and Police Equipment

While the ‘newness’ of the fusion between police and military is debatable (Gregory 2014), the term ‘police militarisation’ is now widely adopted to describe the transfer of military mind-sets, training, equipment, and personnel to local law enforcement (Weber 1999; Graham 2010; Kappeler and Kraska 2013). For our purposes, the term ‘police militarisation’ is usefully defined by Kraska (2007) as, "a set of beliefs, values, and assumptions that stress the use of force and threat of violence as the most appropriate and efficacious means to solve problems. It emphasizes the exercise of military power, hardware, organization, operations, and technology as its primary problem-solving tools" (Kraska 2007, 3). Kraska (2007) argues that the transition to an ideology of police militarisation can be empirically evidenced as it involves “tangible indicators” of changes. For Kraska, these changes are: material (weaponry, equipment, technology); cultural (language, style and values); organizational (elite squads, COMSPTAT programmes); and operational (handling of crisis, emergency response). Using Kraska’s categories as guidance, we examine the cultural

values, ideologies, and imagery that accompany the weaponry, equipment, and technology as 'tangible indicators' of police militarisation before and after 9/11.

Our analysis of the atmospheric marketing of military and policing equipment is framed against the backdrop of existing research on the 'Rise of the Warrior Cop' (Balko 2013) and the shift in the post-Cold War period from a security focus on the threat of the nation-state, to the threat of insurgency and non-state actors (Andrea and Price 2001). This period was characterized by national and transnational changes to policing (intelligence gathering and information sharing), as well as to equipment supply and transfer, training and operations (Weber 1999; Balko 2006; Cordner and Scarborough 2010; Graham 2010). Post 9/11 this transition intensified, as the so-called ongoing 'War on Terror' came to dominate policy and ideology. As defense department budgets rose (Harvey 2008), this also manifested in the growth of 'counter-terrorism' as a distinct market segment. As training and special operations teams were embedded into police units, police forces were exposed to new military technologies (Balko 2006; Cordner and Scarborough 2010; Graham 2010).

Yet, while these pre- and post-9/11 changes are significant, technological transfers from the military to the police can be traced back much farther than the 1980s. Military to police technology transfers can be found uses of barbed wire as an offensive weapon (Razac 2002) in the early 1900s and in the use of tear gas in the 1920s. This World War I weapon made its way from the trenches to police arsenals around the world (Feigenbaum 2014). After the 1968 uprisings, new doctrines of riot control emerged in France and the US, drawing inspiration from riot control technologies and tactics used in Japan and India (Applegate 1969). Then in the 1970s, the influence of

internal security practices and new equipment (like rubber bullets) used in Northern Ireland set the international agenda for internal policing – long before 9/11 (Ellison and O'Reilly 2008; Wright 1998). In 1995, Michael Dewar, editor of the catalogue *Weapons and Equipment of Counter-Terrorism*, called on governments and private security providers to follow the lead of the United Kingdom, highlighting the demand for more localized military and paramilitary tactics and weaponry (Dewar 1995).

It was not until the late 1990s that the US came to dominate the police militarization marketplace. Amid the War on Drugs and the rise of SWAT units (Special Weapons and Tactics) the US Defense department and Justice department signed a formal memorandum of understanding, acknowledging the decades-long relationship between police and military in the United States. The memo formalised joint technology development practices between the military and police, seeking to create common solutions for what officials considered common problems (National Institute of Justice 1997). The initiative produced cost effectiveness, greater potential for long-term research, and an easier process for technology transfer between the military and police (National Institute of Justice 1997). In the same year as the joint agreement, the 1997 National Defense Authorization Security Act – known as the 1033 program – also made it easier to “transfer... military equipment to civilian police departments” (Balko 2006, 8).

In the United States, and more globally, such formal technological convergences between military and police departments, as well as between government and commercial manufacturers, meant that private, university, and government facilities could work with both the police and the military to develop defensive and use-of-force technologies. In other words, equipment was not simply transferred from the military to

the police. Increasingly, it was researched and designed to simultaneously counter protest crowds, drugs cartels and combat forces. For example, Penn State University's Institute for Non-Lethal Defense Technologies contributed to advancements in Tasers (electro-shock guns) and Long-range Acoustic Devices (sound-based weapons commonly known as LRAD). Police and military forces around the world use both devices. This technological convergence means that a military 'use-of-force' mindset and military-police collaboration runs throughout the entire process of creating, evaluating and deploying policing products.

The Milipol Expo and Atmospheric Marketing

Security expos serve as significant site for the study of the communicative and atmospheric dynamics of militarized policing in a security culture dominated by discourses of counter-terrorism. Companies selling police and military equipment and weaponry congregate at international security expos where, between swigs of champagne, new product lines are unveiled to government and commercial buyers. Security expos are major sites of both government-to-business and business-to-business communication. They are often where new products lines are first launched and displayed. Carefully-arranged stalls are decorated in corporate banners and logos. Free giveaways, from branded breath mints to stuffed toys, sit carefully arranged on countertops. Unloaded guns are left out for interactive experiences, while ammunition is delicately displayed beneath glass cabinets. Manikins wear body armour, while armoured cars occupy exhibition hall floors, ready for demonstration. The same coffee kiosks and hot dog stands used for all kinds of commercial exhibitions are in operation,

only the advertisements in the bathroom stalls have been replaced with images of scope rifles and surveillance technologies.

Like any home show or automobile expo, these security expos are selling more than just products. This plethora of sights, sounds and experiences is part of the atmospherics. In recent years such an attention to atmospheres has gained traction, drawing on work across a range of fields, including geography (Adey et al 2013), architecture and art (Wigley 1998; Böhme 2000). This literature places significance on the ways in which infrastructures, people and events come together in the production of particular affective environments and states (Feigenbaum and Kanngieser 2015). Directly speaking of consumer space, Kotler (1973) defines atmospheric marketing as “the effort to design buying environments to produce specific emotional effects in the buyer that enhance his purchase probability” (p. 50). In this foundational text for retail sales, Kotler describes the attention-creating (colour and noise), message-creating (targeting audiences for vendor-choice) and affect-creating (attempts to stimulate the senses to increase purchase probability). It is through these atmospherics that values are captured and expressed.

The security expo, as a large-scale retail site in which companies compete side-by-side for differential advantage, can be seen as a space in which the values of police militarisation manifest. Rather than simply an aggregation of existing marketing and advertising materials, the atmospherics of the security expo involves “conscious planning to contribute to the buyer’s purchasing propensity” (Kotler 1973). In stark contrast to the realities of violent force that this offensive and defensive equipment is

ostensibly produced for, the atmosphere of the expo is convivial and bright, a carefree place to play around with the latest grenade launcher.

The largest of these global security expos focused specifically on internal security is Milipol. Held bi-annually in Paris, the Milipol expo alternates yearly with events in Qatar and South East Asia. Milipol's exhibitors specialise in major events security, protest policing, terrorism, border control, and, increasingly, cyber security and digital surveillance. The most recent Milipol event, the 2015 Paris expo, took place just three days after the November 13-14th Paris attacks. The event drew 24,056 visitors from 143 countries, with exhibitors from 55 countries (Milipol 2015).

Milipol shapes the symbolic production of internal security as a distinct industry and facilitates the exchange of both contacts and contracts, networking a transnational marketplace for police techniques and technologies (Feigenbaum 2011). The convergence of the military and police, along with the blurring of terrorism and civilian dissent, is all part of Milipol's atmospherics. As a place of expertise and insider exchange, the expo is where the "everyday language of the professional field" circulates through marketing materials (Salter 2013, 106). This occurs physically (through the joint participation of actors), discursively (through the circulation of ideological texts and the branding of equipment), and materially (through the exchange of goods and the maintenance of the expo's infrastructures). As such, the expo is not only where catalogues and brochures are displayed and circulated, but where the interactions between industry insiders give shape and life to the circulation of these advertising and marketing materials. This is why our sample of materials was gathered from an archive of expo materials. We argue that these printed materials cannot be examined without

this consideration for atmospheric marketing and the broader dynamics of image construction and mediation in the internal security industry.

Methodology

Jane's Product Catalogues - Discursive Analysis

To offer an overview of the context and key changes in the policing and military equipment market place, we began by analysing the content of Jane's catalogue directories for police equipment between 1989 to 2010 with a five year stratified sample, looking at the catalogues for: 1989-1990, 1995-1996, 1999-2000, 2005-2006, 2009-2010. In the post Cold War period, a burgeoning defence publication industry accompanied the broader market privatization that characterised this time period in the security industry (Feigenbaum 2011). The now industry-leading publishing house and analysis business began as a hobby project of military enthusiast and illustrator Fred T. Jane in 1898. Nearly one hundred years later, IHS Jane's launched its first modern magazine in 1984 with the title *Jane's Defence Weekly*. The magazine provided the first major international trade forum for defence advertising. Gordon E. Hogg explains in 'The house that Jane's built':

Every issue includes an interview with an influential member of the international politico-military establishment be it a Russian general, an American admiral, a Turkish or Thai air force chief, or an Afghan defense minister. A wide variety of viewpoints is therefore presented to the reader, who also has the opportunity to

browse through a panoply of compelling advertisements for everything from manufacturers of lightweight machine guns, to aircraft consortia to tank and artillery gunsmiths. (1994, 6)

The success of Jane's Defence Weekly was followed by the release of a number of related titles, as well as market surveys, client-tailored business analyses, and integrated data feeds in 1997 (IHS Jane's). By the start of the 2000s, Jane's provided multiple channels for business-to-business and business-to-government communication, dominating the marketing scene of the burgeoning counter-terrorism industry (Feigenbaum 2011). The first title to target counter-terrorism and police operations, came out in 1988-1989 under the title *Jane's Security and CO-IN [Counter-Insurgency] Equipment*.

Our analysis of Jane's catalogues provides an overview of key changes in the marketplace for police weaponry over the pre- to post-9/11 period. In addition, it offers insight into which countries and companies were the major manufacturers over this time period. These printed catalogues were also analysed on site at Omega Research Foundation's archives. For each issue in the sample, we recorded how many pages of the catalogue was devoted to riot control, as well as the page allocation for each country represented. Using discourse analysis, the opening editorials were analysed, looking at the framing of issues covered, particularly in relation to any connections between policing and counter-terrorism.

Advertisements at Milipol - Content Analysis

For our analysis of advertisements we gathered a sample of product catalogues and magazines distributed at Milipol security expos in Paris between 1995 and 2013. We generated a stratified sample that followed the bi-annual schedule of the Milipol expo in Paris, taking materials from every two years. We did not gather materials from the Milipol Qatar expo or from the more recently launched Milipol Asia events. We chose to focus on Paris primarily because it offers the broadest range of materials from the largest number of countries; the Paris event is regarded as the international event, while Qatar and Asia are seen as regional events. We also had to omit materials from the year 2007 due to the unavailability of brochures from this expo in the archive. This omission creates a gap in the stratified sample between 2005 and 2009.

All of the materials analysed were obtained and archived by the Omega Research Foundation, an independent organisation “dedicated to providing rigorous, objective, evidence-based research on the manufacture, trade in, and use of, military, security and police (MSP) technologies” (Omega Research Foundation 2016). The materials were accessed on site at Omega’s archives in the UK. While some of these product catalogues are available to freely download online, the majority remain out of public reach, circulated only within the industry or upon private request.

In total we coded 145 print advertisements using a standard coding frame for content analysis of visual images. This included basic codes to record year, product type and country of manufacturer, as well as visual codes noting the perceived gender, race, scene location (i.e. a street; in combat), and the role of the primary figure (i.e. riot police, military) found in the advertisement’s image. A more sophisticated set of codes were employed to analyse the ideological frames of the advertisements. For these

codes, the text copy was examined alongside imagery, noting the presence or absence of a terrorism frame (explicit references to terrorism or terrorists), a vulnerability frame (language invoking harm, the need for protection, dangers facing police), a warrior frame (language relating to strength, toughness, bravery), an economic frame (references to austerity or the financial crisis) and an environmental frame (references to ecological products, climate change, CO2 emissions).

The number of materials in each year of the Milipol sample varied. This was due in part to the increase in products and their marketing over the examined time period. It was also a result of how often a company updates its sales materials; some companies do not update their catalogues on a biannual schedule. Exact duplicates of brochures were removed from the sample. While imperfect, this content analysis provided us with a twenty-year range of materials that circulate within the industry, providing insight into key changes and transitions over the pre- to post-9/11 period we were interested in.

Product catalogues came from twenty-two different countries, with the majority in the United States, France, China, Israel, Germany and the UK. The United States, Israel, Germany, and the UK have long been leaders in the research and development of policing equipment and riot control, with China's market expanding, as they often provide lower cost options to countries with more lenient trade and quality regulations. France has also been a key player in the production of policing equipment since the start of the 20th century, although the large number of French product advertisements is also due to it being the host nation of the Milipol expo.

Participant-Observation - Attending Milipol

In addition to the archival research, content analysis, and discursive methods we employed for this research, one of the authors attended the Counter Terror Expo in the United Kingdom in 2008, 2009, and 2012, and the Milipol Security Expo in Paris in 2013 and 2015. Participant observation at these expos offers first-hand insight into how promotional materials are distributed and circulated inside the convention space. It provides the opportunity to witness the relationship between print materials and face-to-face marketing interactions. For example, while some companies openly distribute their product catalogues on display racks for passers-by, other companies only proffer their materials in exchange for your business contact and details. Participant observation also allowed us to take note of how printed materials form part of larger advertising displays that often include banners, corporate logos, and promotional items ranging from branded breath mints to pens to giant, blue, stuffed dinosaurs bearing the Taser brand name.

In his research into the Aviation Security industry, Mark Salter (2013) found expos to be sites where frank dialogue about the industry was possible. They enabled conversations that in the setting of an academic interview would otherwise be difficult to have. Salter (*ibid.*) notes that none of the representatives he spoke to in these expos ever agreed to a follow-up interview. Yet, in the promotional space of the expo industry representatives would speak relatively openly about “the state of their technology, the political state of play, and their commercial interests” (Salter 2013, 106).

We begin the next section with our findings from the analysis of Jane’s catalogues to set the scene for a more detailed look at changes in advertisements of

policing equipment found in our study of company brochures and magazines circulated at the Milipol security expo. Our participant observation at these expos helps contextualize our analysis and provides insight into how the material objects we examine play important roles as active participants -- or “actants” in Latour’s (2005) terminology -- in the operations and translations of the security sector.

Findings & Analysis

Jane’s Catalogues 1989-2010

In 1989, the Jane’s catalogue that markets riot control and police equipment was called *Jane’s Security and CO-IN [Counter-Insurgency] Equipment*. The catalogue’s opening editorial focused on perimeter security and the rise of sensors. Product pages were dominated by the United Kingdom, with the United States, Germany, and France close behind, and Brazil also topping the list of countries offering riot control. In total, there were eight countries advertising riot control products, with China, South Africa, and Israel also offering equipment.

Five years later, the focus of the catalogue had shifted. In 1995, the publication adopted the name *Jane’s Police and Security Equipment* and expanded production from England to the United States. Some new countries were featured on the product pages, including Yugoslavia and Singapore, with a decline in offerings from the UK. In the opening editorial, terrorism featured heavily. The discussion focused on concerns about hostage-taking. There was a separate editorial section on Riot Control that discussed new technologies, including an anaesthetic gun. Drawing attention to the civil liberties

concerns that surround the use of less lethal weapons in civilian policing, the editor wrote:

What, one wonders, would the reaction of the civil liberties industry to the anaesthetic gun offered on page 306 be? This device, on the face of it, offers a useful method of deactivating rioters and others of a violent disposition. On the other hand, one also wonders what the result would be if the firer inadvertently hit the wrong target.

While this 1995 edition brought counter-terrorism and riot control policing closer together than in the 1989 volume, discussions of terrorism and of civilian policing remain separate, but related concerns. This parallels discussions occurring in the US policy sector, for example, the 1994 agreement signed between the Department of Justice and the Department of Defence that acknowledged the long-time relationship between military and law enforcement.

The agreement focused on existing practices of sharing technological innovations in equipment, as well as the possibilities for further investing in joint Research and Development and in sharing knowledge and feedback on the use of these technologies in the field. Joint technologies included surveillance systems, communication infrastructure, and body armour. Among the equipment discussed in the second annual report of the Joint Technology agreement was the new Kevlar Titanium insert for the Ranger Body Armor line being developed for the US Special Operations

Command. Taking hostage situations as a connection point between military and law enforcement work, the report explained:

Concealable armor is of great interest to law enforcement. The U.S. Secret Service has placed an order, and the FBI is evaluating prototypes. Eleven prototypes were ordered by the U.S. Army for use in Bosnia. The helmets and outer garment body armor may be found useful for hostage rescue work and SWAT teams in general” (National Institute of Justice 1997, 13)

Benefits of cross-developing and cross-promoting police and military equipment included opening access to new technologies for law enforcement officers, helping the defence sector better understand law enforcement needs, generating new avenues to move products through private industry for both military and law enforcement, and identifying new areas for technological development that can benefit both industries (National Institute of Justice 1997).

As private industry and state agencies are deeply entangled in the security sector, a shared language and outlook can be found across both the for-profit catalogue produced by Jane’s, and the public report produced by the Defence Advanced Research Projects Agency of the U.S. government. This discursive similarity reflects what Mark Salter” (2013, 106) refers to as the “everyday language of the professional field.” Away from the official jargon and opacity of policy, these kinds of public reports and marketing materials are written with consumers and end users in mind. In this way,

the language mirrors conventional advertising, while taking on the specificity of the trade (in this case, the security sector).

By 2000, a focus on counter-terrorism became central in *Jane's Police and Security Equipment* catalogue. The 1999-2000 editorial bears the headline 'The Terrorist Threat', explaining that:

The terrorists are still out there and this low-intensity war will go on. We would hope that this publication will play a small part at the technical level in assisting law enforcement agencies in their operations. On almost every page there is a product whose use will assist in the war against terrorism. Terrorism and crime are related, terrorists need money and crime is generally where they find it (17).

Published just prior to the events of September 11 2001, the increasing role of law enforcement in counter-terrorism is already addressed by the editorial, both as a marketing discourse and a broader representative voice in the internal security sector. Here, the editor links the sale of equipment and new technologies to combating the 'war against terrorism' – adopting and deploying this frame before its proliferation via the mainstream press in the United States and its allied countries.

By 2005-2006, the editorial scope of the *Jane's* was fully embedded in the language of counter-terrorism, urban warfare and constant states of security. In a piece titled *360° Frontline*, editor Mike McBride (himself a soldier in the territorial army who moved into police work, beginning as editor at *Jane's* in 2001), wrote:

Threats can come from any direction. Therefore law enforcement officers who stand in harm's way to protect the public must remain vigilant and ready to respond to the challenges of the post 9/11 era (Jane's 2006, 11).

The article went on, warning that “no police jurisdiction can be complacent about the threat posed to homeland security from insurgent groups” (ibid., 11). Exhibiting the geospatial and architectural dimensions of security rhetoric post 9/11 (Graham 2010), McBride continues, “The frontline against terror is not some distant battlefield, it is the city centre; the suburbs; the countryside; the shopping mall; the business district; the airport; the docks; basically, anywhere and everywhere. Attacks may come at any time, by whatever means to cause the maximum effect” (Jane's 2006, 11). The transitions in Jane's editorials, as crystallized examples of industry marketing discourses more broadly, support the well-documented transitions of the security sector from counter-insurgency to militarised policing, to a post-9/11 militarization of the entire security and safety sector. In the final catalogue we analysed, from 2009-2010, the police, military forces, first responders, and weapons inspectors were simultaneously targeted in both editorial and advertising content.

Milipol Advertisements

We analysed our sample of advertisements obtained by Omega at Milipol expos between 1995 and 2013 looking for patterns and anomalies across our descriptive and thematic codes. We paid particular attention to shifts over time. Because of the market expansion that took place in the early 2000s, and the growth of expos as spaces for the

circulation of these materials over our time period, the number of materials is much greater in recent years than in the late 1990s. Likewise, as there were more materials from both the host country France, and other industry leaders, companies from these locations dominate the sample. We take these two issues into consideration in our discussion of findings, which is grouped into three sets: (i) the unanticipated absence of terrorist figures in marketing materials; (ii) the rise in cross-marketing of police and military products; and (iii) the construction of police officers as vulnerable warriors in product advertisements. We discuss each of these findings in turn.

(i) The Absence of Terrorist Figures

We went into the study expecting for it to be easy to detect a transition between pre- and post-9/11 advertisements. The stratified sampling method we used was explicitly chosen to be able to reveal transitions over time and background literature supported our expectation that a difference in marketing materials would be visible before and after the rise of the 'War on Terror'. However, our findings did not support this assumption. Of the full sample of advertisements we analysed, 12% of advertisements made explicit reference to terrorism. The only notable change in the visual depiction of terrorism within advertisements was found in relation to the depiction of protesters as or in conjunction with terrorist threats, in post-2011 marketing materials. Of the 145 total advertisements, only 28 featured a visible figure. As in the broader sphere of advertising, the target or object of one's gaze is often left out of frame for the viewer to conjure and imagine.

In all of the years prior to 2011 there were 5 advertisements showing a figure of protesters, in 2011 there were 2 more, and in 2013 there were 7 advertisements conflating protesters and terrorists including an advertisement from Condor Nonlethal Technologies, one of the world's largest riot control exporters based in Brazil. The advert shows a figure wearing an Anonymous (Guy Fawkes) mask at front of crowd. The copy reads, "for every situation and target an effective solution." The image shows target signs around protesters wearing gas masks and bandanas over their faces. Condor has come under humanitarian pressure in the last five years, with its law enforcement equipment being used as a weapon of violence in Bahrain, Egypt and Turkey (Feigenbaum 2015). While the increase in depictions of protesters still made up only a small percentage of the total number of advertisements, they comprise part of the post-2011 blurring of insurgency and internal dissent that was often explicitly referenced in broader industry communications.

(ii) Police and Military Cross-Marketing

While we did not find evidence for a major change in marketing comparing the pre-9/11 with the post-9/11 years as anticipated, we did find clear evidence of an increase in marketing military grade weapons and armour directly to the police, as cross-marketed police and military products.

[TABLE MILITARY AND POLICE]

Many police products have not only been advertised together with military products or in combination with those, but explicitly as the identical product for the use by military and police forces such as the Smith & Wesson M&P line, M&P meaning Military and Police.

[IMAGE M&P ADVERT]

One could argue that the production of identical weapons for police and military use is a result of policies like the original National Institute of Justice (1997) memorandum emphasising cost effectiveness in the development and the production of shared equipment for the military and law enforcement. However, the shared development of police and military equipment does not necessarily require cross-marketing of the same product, meaning that the development and production of shared equipment may make sense from a cost effectiveness perspective, but the cross marketization does not follow directly from that process. In fact, there is very good reason – duty to civilians, community policing models – not to market police equipment using military images and metaphors. Yet, in the majority of advertisements in this sample the only element that allows one to differentiate between military and police weapons, vehicles, and protection gear, is often the colour. Even the distinction by colour can be an ominous one as special forces military units do not always wear camouflage, but often black, as do police forces. This is not only the case with how specific equipment looks, but also with the general theme in the advertisements; in many ‘action shot’ images, police and military are indistinguishable.

[IMAGES – AMMUNITIONS AND ARMPPOINT ADVERT]

The increase in advertisements cross-marketing police and military products could also be an indicator of equipment replacement rates within law enforcement institutions, in combination with an expansion of the use of military equipment post 9/11. A consequence of military transfer programmes is not only that police forces obtain military equipment, but also that this new-to-them equipment requires training and maintenance. This can create more demand and lead to police officers' reliance on such equipment. This spike in demand for military-grade technology then incentivizes the manufacture and marketization of militarized police equipment, expanding the market for manufacturers of military lines of policing products. Such products include high-capacity protection vests, high-capacity assault rifles, and armoured vehicles. In addition, this creates a cycle of production whereby equipment and weaponry can be constantly marketed as 'new', 'improved' or 'advanced', for example, the Extreme Shock ammunition marketed as "The World's Most Advanced Ammunition; Made in America, tested on Terrorists around the Globe". While this example is extreme, more subtle military 'stamps of approval' and 'quality-testing' logos were prevalent in our sample.

[IMAGE – SHOCK AMMUNITION ADVERT]

This rise in the cross-marketing of police and military equipment, and in particular, the mobilization of military-grade and military-tested labels in the sale of police products, both signifies and reinforces the broader thesis about increased police militarization. For example, journalist and author Radley Balko (2006) popularly refers to

the process of police militarization as 'The Rise of the Warrior Cop'. Describing the police as a warrior-class in 1982 McNeill wrote:

The police constitute a quasi-military warrior class. In common with warriors generally, they exhibit bonds of solidarity [that] are fierce and strong indeed, [their] human propensities find fullest expression in having an enemy to hate, fear, and destroy and fellow fighters with whom to share the risks and triumphs of violent action (1982, viii).

Many researchers and campaigners have offered detailed critiques of the cultivation of police as warriors, drawing attention not only to technology transfer and weaponry (as we have previously discussed), but also to dress, language, training programmes and popular culture representations. Drawing on the work of psychologists of colour and conceptions of symbolic power, Paul and Birzer (2008) discuss the increasing use of black clothing and combat styles of uniform for police officers. They argue "the militarization of police uniforms function to maintain an internal legitimacy within the department by enhancing their role as enforcers of public violence, and serve to symbolically construct a hierarchy between the police and the public." (Paul and Birzer 2008, 25). In his ethnographic research on police training, Conti (2010) describes "an idealized conception of masculinity, which is at the center of the occupational subculture" (Conti 2010, 7). Balko (2013) argues that with the expansion of cable television, police shows in the 1990s and 2000s proliferated, suggesting that "in empathising the more aggressive, confrontational aspect of police work over community

service – hurting people instead of helping people – they may be shifting the profile of the typical young person attracted to police work” (Balko 2013, 306).

(iii) Vulnerable Warriors

While visions of strength, heroism, and machismo were recurrent in the cross-marketing of military products for police, even more common were images and text referring to vulnerability. As researchers have shown, weakness is seen as the antithesis of what a cop should be (Conti 2010; Wozniak and Uggen 2009). Associated with weakness are showing emotions, lacking physical strength, and displaying vulnerability (Conti 2010). These traits are what need to be suppressed, covered, or transformed for one to become a warrior. At the same time, police often see themselves as victims or potential victims of perpetrator violence. In 2005 the National Fraternal Order of Police union asked the US Congress to classify assaults against police as hate crimes, citing their targeted persecution (Reilly 2015). This victimization becomes the justification for more and more deadly equipment, for higher-quality protective gear, and greater leniency around excessive force violations, which all arise from the idea that police need protection. They are the protectors, but who will protect them?

In our analysis of advertisements, 70% of all ads appealed to the vulnerability of the officer – the need for protection from harm – in their marketing copy or imagery. Across the twenty-year timespan of our sample, this remained a common frame, far more prevalent than any of the other frames we looked for, including terrorism. Examples of marketing vulnerability, or what we here term ‘vulnerable warriors’, involves marketing products through a justificatory discourse that constructs the officer

as always at risk and in need of protection to be able to fulfil one's duties. For example, a 2001 advertisement for USA-based Simunition, SNC riot control equipment reads:

Like it or not, we live in an increasingly violent world where a uniform can often be as much a dare as a deterrent, and wrongdoers are almost always armed. To be effective, training must prepare law enforcement officers, emergency response teams, and military personnel to react almost intuitively to a wide spectrum of situations, each more dangerous, complex and unpredictable than the last.

Interestingly, while the vulnerability of female officers has been harnessed for the promotion of new police equipment, such as aerosol pepper and CS sprays (Feigenbaum forthcoming), the vulnerable warrior is almost exclusively represented with the image of a man. In the 116 coded advertisements that included a full human figure, 101 of them were only of men and 15 were mixed men and women. There were no advertisements or catalogue images in our sample that depicted only women. Militarization and the making of warriors, as many researchers have pointed out, are primarily about masculinity and the male body (Arkin and Dobrofsky 1978; Sasson-Levy 2003).

The Rise of the Vulnerable Warrior

Through our analysis, we found that it is in an ideological space between being vulnerable and becoming a warrior that the marketing of police militarization

fundamentally takes place. The image of the cop as a warrior meets the notion of the cop as a vulnerable body. The body needs more and more armour and weapons to become a better warrior. In the post 9/11 age, populated with discourses of constant security and '360-degree threats', law enforcement officers become imagined simultaneously as perpetual victims of civilian violence and strong warriors who should be feared. This is further layered with a sense that the work of police officers is unrecognized or underappreciated. Such constructions both harden and soften the image of the officer at once. They seek to mobilize sympathy and invoke vulnerability, while projecting the image of a modern day warrior saving lives – even when the ungrateful or confused public do not see it that way.

This mythology of the vulnerable warrior rests on an understanding that police officers are at a high enough risk of death that they must be heavily armed and allowed to cause violence to protect themselves. However, fatalities among police officers have been on a steady decline since the 1970s (National Law Enforcement Officers Memorial Fund 2015; FBI Uniform Crime Report in Wang 2016). Furthermore, police officers (13th) fall below taxi drivers (12th), construction workers (11th) and agricultural workers (10th) in terms of most fatalities on the job, with a majority of fatalities among police officers occurring due to transportation incidents/traffic accidents (Bloomberg Business 2015).

But the construction of victimization is less about numbers and more about fear and empathy. Cases in which officers faced violence are repeatedly shared, circulated and held up as prime examples of the vulnerability of law enforcement in the media, training materials, as well as in the advertisements and trade magazines (Chermak

1995, Conti 2010). These stories become central justificatory texts for why police officers need an ever-expanding arsenal of equipment, as well as for greater sympathy from the public. Living under the constant threat of perceived violence, police officers are then in a constant state of vulnerability, their bodies always in need of better protective and defensive gear. This production of an atmosphere of being under threat arises in the juxtaposition of vulnerable bodies, dangerous cities (Graham 2010), and technologies. As more on more products promising more and more protection emerge, this atmosphere is cultivated as it is circulated through the distribution of marketing materials.

Most dangerously for civilians, this notion of the police officer as a vulnerable warrior is able to reimagine police killings not as excessive force, but instead as acts of pre-emptive self defence. In fact, an entire organisation exists solely to train and promote this view of the police as vulnerable victims that make the best choice a warrior can in the moment. Established in 2004 by Dr Bill Lewinski and headquartered in Mankato, Missouri, USA, the Force Science Institute's mission "is dedicated to scientifically determining and fully understanding the true physical and psychological dynamics of force encounters by conducting ground-breaking research into officer and suspect behaviours during rapidly unfolding, high-stress confrontations." At the training classes on offer, officers learn:

Critical hidden truths about the physical and mental dynamics of life-threatening events, particularly officer-involved shootings. Its startling findings profoundly impact officer training and safety, and the public's naive perceptions. In fact, the Institute's findings have been directly credited with saving officer lives on the

street and with preventing some officers from going to prison after being wrongly accused of criminally using deadly force (<http://www.forcescience.org/programs.html>).

In promotional materials and press releases for the Force Science Institute, this discursive construction of the vulnerable warrior is often explicitly made. For example, in an article on rescue and risk perception, Sztajnkrycer, Lewinski, and Buhmaster (2010) write:

Members of the law enforcement profession openly acknowledge the dangers inherent in the performance of their sworn duties. As with soldiers on the battlefield, they have come to expect that should they find themselves in life-threatening circumstances, their fellow officers will respond with maximum effort to rescue them.

Declaring itself scientifically objective and dedicated to breaking myths with facts, the Force Science Institute takes on a clear advocacy position that relies on the twin conceptualisation of the police officer as both vulnerable and warrior. This is directly articulated in the #285 edition of the Force Science Institute's newsletter, which argues against further regulation on officer's use of force. Dr Lewinski argues officers must be reassured "about their legitimate use of force" and that agencies must "educate civilians about the realities of dealing with uncertain, rapidly unfolding conflicts that may have controversial outcomes."

Lewinski has a long track record of lobbying against use of force restrictions and has testified for police in more than 75 cases in the United States and several in Canada and Great Britain. The Police Firearms Officers Association in Britain honoured

him in 2009 with its first life-member award for his "commitment to firearms officers in the U.K" (Police Firearms Officers Association 2009). In 2012 the CBC reported that Lewinski had been barred from testifying on the grounds that he was not unbiased and that he lacked the necessary credentials. Yet these investigations have not hindered Lewinski's business, with six training programs currently advertised on the Force Institute's website between the end of January 2016 and May 2016. Lewinski and Force Science are emblematic – and symptomatic – of the victimized and valorised cop as vulnerable warrior.

Conclusion

While we went into this study expecting to see distinct and significant changes in marketing strategies pre and post 9/11, variance in this area was far less pronounced than expected. In fact, there was very little visual evidence in our sample of the blurring between civilian and combatant. Likewise, while the atmosphere of fear and the need for protection was pervasive, direct references to terrorism were far less frequent than anticipated. The gendered nature of these advertisements, along with increases in the market generally and cross-marketing of police and military equipment specifically, ran in line with broader literature as well as our own expectations when devising the coding frame.

The unexpected findings surrounding the marketing of vulnerability were most significant both quantitatively, as well as conceptually. While we spent some time in our discussion working through some empirical justifications for this finding, more research is needed to confirm, contextual and reflect on this phenomenon. In particular, further

research could explore a wider breadth of materials – policies, training manuals, press releases – that construct, reproduce and circulate police identities. Ethnographic work and interviews could also investigate this phenomenon, asking not only what makes the cop a warrior, but what makes the cop vulnerable. Likewise, more research into the relationship between police militarization and corporeality, biopolitics, and masculinity would enhance understandings of the role the vulnerability plays in law enforcement. While scholarship on trauma and vulnerability of military veterans is now well established (Paulson and Krippner 2007, Tick 2012, Gossman 2015), it is still seen as largely taboo to discuss vulnerability and trauma in relation to policing (Rees and Smith 2008, Rufo 2016), particularly for young white men who see sharing their feelings as ego-threatening (Paskiac and Kelley 2013).

Our analysis of marketing materials and convention expos revealed that the reproduction of the image of police officers as vulnerable warriors takes place across a broad set of people and places with a vested, for-profit interest in maintaining and reproducing this imaginary. The major growth of counter-terrorism initiatives in the early 2000s, and with them, the expansion of police arsenals, rested on the notion that both civilians and law enforcement agents were, in all places and at all times, potential targets of violence. For those in the business of selling weapons and armour, an on-going state of security is an excellent revenue stream. Fusing the everywhere war (Gregory 2011) with the mediated desires of marketing to warrior cops (Hennion et al 1989), police equipment advertisements communicate a manufactured need for never-ending protection in an atmosphere of constantly evolving threats. In this market, both violence and vulnerability are for sale.

References

Adey P, Brayer L, Masson D, Murphy P, Simpson P and Tixier, N (2013) Pour votre tranquillité': ambiance, atmosphere, and surveillance *Geoforum* 49 299-309.

Andreas, Peter, and Richard Price. 2001. "From War Fighting to Crime Fighting: Transforming the American National Security State." *International Studies Review* 3 (3), pp.: 31-52.

Arkin, William, and Lynne R. Dobrofsky. 1978. "Military Socialization and Masculinity." *Social Issues* 34 (1), pp.: 151-168.

Balko, Radley. 2006. *Overkill: The Rise of Paramilitary Police Raids in America*. Washington, D.C.: Cato Institute.

Balko, R. 2013. *Rise of the warrior cop: The militarization of America's police forces*. New York (NY): PublicAffairs.

Bloomberg Business. 2015. *The Deadliest Jobs in America*. May 13. Accessed January 10, 2016. <http://www.bloomberg.com/graphics/2015-dangerous-jobs/>.

Böhme G. 2000. Acoustic atmospheres: a contribution to the study of ecological aesthetics. *Soundscape: The Journal of Acoustic Ecology* 1 1 14- 18

Chermak, S. 1995. "Image control: How police affect the presentation of crime news." *American journal of police* 14 (2), pp.: 21-43.

Conti, N. 2010. *An idealized conception of masculinity, which is at the center of the occupational subculture*. Working Paper, Geneva: Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces.

Cordner, G., and K. Scarborough. 2010. "Information Sharing: Exploring the Intersection of Policing with National and Military Intelligence." *Homeland Security Affairs* 6 (1): 1-19.

Dewar, M. 1995. *Weapons and Equipment of Counter-Terrorism*. London: Weidenfeld Military.

Ellison, G., and C. O'Reilly. 2008. "'Ulster's policing goes global': The police reform process in Northern Ireland and the creation of a global brand." *Crime, Law and Social Change* 50 (4), pp.: 331-351.

Feigenbaum, Anna. 2011. "Security for sale! The visual rhetoric of marketing counter-terrorism technologies." *The Poster* 2 (1), pp.: 75-92.

--- 2015. "Riot Control Agents: The Case for Regulation" *Sur: International Journal on Human Rights*. 22.

--- forthcoming. *Tear Gas: From the battlefields of WWI to the Streets of Today*. London and New York: Verso.

Grossman, D. and Books, B.B., 2015. *On killing: The psychological cost of learning to kill in war and society*. Dave Grossman.

Graham, Stephen. 2010. *Cities under siege: The new military urbanism*. London: Verso Books.

Gregory, D., 2011. The everywhere war. *The Geographical Journal*, 177(3), pp.238-250.

--- 2014. 'War Comes Home.' *Geographical Imaginations* August 20. Accessed 26 February 2014. <http://geographicalimagination.com/2014/08/20/war-comes-home/>

Harvey, F. P. 2008. *The Homeland Security Dilemma*. London: Routledge.

Hennion, A., Meadel, C., and G, Bowker. 1989. The artisans of desire: the mediation of advertising between product and consumer. *Sociological Theory*, 7 (2), pp.:191-209.

Home Office. 2015. *Who Should Attend?* Accessed January 10, 2016.

Comment [Marijn1]: Incomplete?

Homeland Security Research. 2014. *Non-Lethal Weapons (NLW): Industry, Technologies & Global Market – 2014-2020*. Accessed January 10 2016.

<http://homelandsecurityresearch.com/2014/04/non-lethal-weapons-nlw-industry-technologies-global-market-2014-2020/>.

Institute for Non-Lethal Defence Technologies. 2013. *INLDT Research Area*. Accessed January 10 2016. <http://www.arl.psu.edu/INLDT/research.php>

Kotler, P. 1973. "Atmospherics as a marketing tool." *Journal of retailing* 49, (4), pp.: 48-64.

Kraska, P. B. 2007. "Militarization and Policing—Its Relevance to 21st Century Police." *Policing* 1 (4), pp.: 501-513.

Latour, B., 2005. *Reassembling the Social-An Introduction to Actor-Network-Theory*. Oxford University Press.

Markusen, A., S. DiGiovanna, and M. C. Leary. 2003. *From Defense to Development?: International Perspectives on Realizing the Peace Dividend*. London: Routledge.

McNeill, W. H. 1982. *The Pursuit of Power: Technology, Armed Force, and Society since A.D. 1000*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

National Institute of Justice. 1997. *Department of Justice and Department of Defense Joint Technology Program: Second Anniversary Report*. Research Report, Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of Justice.

National Law Enforcement Officers Memorial Fund. 2015. *Officer Deaths by Year*. April 9. Accessed January 10 2016. <http://www.nleomf.org/facts/officer-fatalities-data/year.html>.

Milipol. 2015. *19th Worldwide Exhibition of Internal State Security* . Accessed January 10, 2016. <http://info.milipolparis.com/a/?F=zln9rv85fqft96ezfvjascr39x2j96smmesp2w723d6w73vmjwl5xe2-6641497>.

Omega Research Foundation. 2016. *Home*. Accessed January 10, 2016. <http://www.omegaresearchfoundation.org>

Pasciak, A.R., and T. M. Kelley. 2013. Conformity to traditional gender norms by male police officers exposed to trauma: Implications for critical incident stress debriefing. *Applied Psychology in Criminal Justice*, 9 (2), pp.:137-156.

Paul, J., and M. L. Birzer. 2008. "The Militarization of the American Police Force: A Critical Assessment ." *Critical Issues in Justice and Politics* 1 (1), pp.: 15-30.

Paulson, D.S., and S. Krippner. 2007. *Haunted by combat: Understanding PTSD in war veterans including women, reservists, and those coming back from Iraq*. Greenwood Publishing Group.

Rees, B. and J. Smith. 2008. Breaking the silence: the traumatic circle of policing. *Int'l J. Police Sci. & Mgmt.*, 10, p.267.

Reilly, R. J. 2015. "Fraternal Order Of Police Wants Attacks On Cops Treated As Hate Crimes." Huffington Post. Accessed 10 January 2016
http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/01/05/police-hate-crimes_n_6418762.html

Rosecrance, R. 1986. *The Rise of the Trading State: Commerce and Conquest in the Modern World*. New York: Basic Books.

Salter, M. B. 2013. "Expertise in the Aviation Security Field." In *Research Methods in Critical Security Studies: An Introduction*, by Mark B. Salter and Can E. Mutlu, 105-108. London: Routledge.

Sasson-Levy, O. 2003. "Military, Masculinity, and Citizenship: Tensions and Contradictions in the Experience of Blue-Collar Soldiers." *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 10 (3), pp.: 319-327.

Sztajnkrycer, M. D., B. Lewinski, and S. Buhrmaster. 2010. "Leave No One Behind."

Accessed 2 March 2016

<https://www2.fbi.gov/publications/leb/2010/may2010/research.htm>.

Tick, E., 2012. *War and the Soul: Healing Our Nation's Veterans from Post-traumatic Stress Disorder*. Quest Books.

Wang, D. 2015. *Data On Police Officers Killed Since 1961*. June 16. Accessed January 10 2016. <http://danwang.co/statistics-on-police-fatalities/>.

Weber, D.C. 1999. *Warrior Cops: The Ominous Growth of Paramilitarism in American Police Departments*. Briefing Paper, Washington, D.C.: Cato Institute.

Wigley M (1998) The architecture of atmosphere *Daidalos* 68 18-27

Wozniak, J., and C. Uggen. 2009. "Real Men Use Nonlethal: Appeals to Masculinity in Marketing Police Weaponry." *Feminist Criminology* 4 (3), pp.: 275-293.

Wright, S. 1998. *An appraisal of technologies for political control*. Report, Luxembourg: European Parliament.

Zervos, V., and P. G. M. Swann. 2009. "The impact of defence integrators and standards on vertical and horizontal innovation in the defence industry." *Defence and Peace Economics* 20 (1), pp.: 27-42.