

# Free subgroups in certain generalized triangle groups of type $(2, m, 2)$

James Howie and Gerald Williams

March 21, 2006

## Abstract

A generalized triangle group is a group that can be presented in the form  $G = \langle x, y \mid x^p = y^q = w(x, y)^r = 1 \rangle$  where  $p, q, r \geq 2$  and  $w(x, y)$  is a cyclically reduced word of length at least 2 in the free product  $\mathbb{Z}_p * \mathbb{Z}_q = \langle x, y \mid x^p = y^q = 1 \rangle$ . Rosenberger has conjectured that every generalized triangle group  $G$  satisfies the Tits alternative. It is known that the conjecture holds except possibly when the triple  $(p, q, r)$  is one of  $(3, 3, 2)$ ,  $(3, 4, 2)$ ,  $(3, 5, 2)$ , or  $(2, m, 2)$  where  $m = 3, 4, 5, 6, 10, 12, 15, 20, 30, 60$ . In this paper we show that the Tits alternative holds in the cases  $(p, q, r) = (2, m, 2)$  where  $m = 6, 10, 12, 15, 20, 30, 60$ .

## 1 Introduction

A *generalized triangle group* is a group that can be presented in the form

$$G = \langle x, y \mid x^p = y^q = w(x, y)^r = 1 \rangle$$

where  $p, q, r \geq 2$  and  $w(x, y)$  is a cyclically reduced word of length at least 2 in the free product  $\mathbb{Z}_p * \mathbb{Z}_q = \langle x, y \mid x^p = y^q = 1 \rangle$  that is not a proper power. It was conjectured by Rosenberger [15] that every generalized triangle group  $G$  satisfies the Tits alternative. That is,  $G$  either contains a non-abelian free subgroup or has a soluble subgroup of finite index.

It is now known that the Tits alternative holds for a generalized triangle group  $G$  except possibly when the triple  $(p, q, r)$  is one of  $(3, 3, 2)$ ,  $(3, 4, 2)$ ,  $(3, 5, 2)$ , or  $(2, m, 2)$  where  $m \geq 3$ . (See [9] for a survey of these results.) In recent work Benyash-Krivets [3, 4] considers the case  $(2, m, 2)$ . He has shown that if  $m \geq 7$ ,  $m \neq 10, 12, 15, 20, 30, 60$  then the Tits alternative holds for  $G$ . In this paper we augment that result to prove the following:

**Main Theorem.** *Let  $G = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^m = w(x, y)^2 = 1 \rangle$  where  $w(x, y) = xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k}$ ,  $1 \leq \alpha_i < m$ ,  $m \geq 6$ . Then the Tits alternative holds for  $G$ .*

If  $k = 1$  then the Tits alternative holds for  $G$  by [8]. If  $m = 6$  and  $k = 2$  or  $3$  then the Tits alternative holds for  $G$  by [15, 14] respectively. The Main Theorem then follows from Theorems 1, 2 and 3:

**Theorem 1** *Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem. If  $m = 6$  and  $k > 3$ , then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

**Theorem 2** *Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem. If  $m = 5p$  where  $p \neq 5$  is prime and  $k > 1$ , then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

**Theorem 3** *Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem. If  $k > 1$  and  $m = 12, 20, 30$ , or  $60$  then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

Theorem 1 has independently been obtained by Barkovich and Benyash-Krivets [1, 5], and for this reason we do not give a complete proof. However, we require Theorem 1 in an essential way in the proofs of the other results, so in order to make our paper self-contained we have included a sketch proof in an Appendix.

## 2 Preliminaries

We first recall some definitions and well-known facts concerning generalized triangle groups; further details are available in (for example) [9]. Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem, but with  $m \geq 3$ . A homomorphism  $\rho : G \rightarrow H$  (for some group  $H$ ) is said to be *essential* if  $\rho(x), \rho(y), \rho(w)$  are of orders  $2, m, 2$  respectively. By [2]  $G$  admits an essential representation into  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$ .

A projective matrix  $A \in PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  is of order  $n$  if and only if  $\text{tr}(A) = 2 \cos(q\pi/n)$  for some  $(q, n) = 1$ . Note that in  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  traces are only defined up to sign. A subgroup of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  is said to be *elementary* if it has a soluble subgroup of finite index, and is said to be *non-elementary* otherwise.

Let  $\rho : \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^m = 1 \rangle \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  be given by  $x \mapsto X, y \mapsto Y$  where  $X, Y$  have orders  $2, m$ , respectively. Then  $w(x, y) \mapsto w(X, Y)$ . By Horowitz [12]  $\text{tr}w(X, Y)$  is a polynomial with rational coefficients in  $\text{tr}X, \text{tr}Y, \lambda := \text{tr}XY$ , of degree  $k$  in  $\lambda$ . Since  $X, Y$  have orders  $2, m$ , respectively, we may assume (by composing  $\rho$  with an automorphism of  $\langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^m = 1 \rangle$  if necessary), that  $\text{tr}X = 0, \text{tr}Y = 2 \cos(\pi/m)$ . Moreover (again by [12])  $X$  and  $Y$  can be any elements of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  with these traces. Suppressing  $\text{tr}X, \text{tr}Y$  in the notation we define the *trace polynomial* of  $G$  to be  $\tau(\lambda) := \text{tr}w(X, Y)$ .

The representation  $\rho$  induces an essential representation  $G \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  if and only if  $\text{tr}\rho(w) = 0$ ; that is, if and only if  $\lambda$  is a root of  $\tau$ . Note that  $\tau(\lambda) = \pm\tau(-\lambda)$  so the roots  $\lambda, -\lambda$  occur with equal multiplicity.

By [12] the leading coefficient of  $\tau$  is given by

$$c = \frac{1}{(\sin(\pi/m))^k} \prod_{i=1}^k \sin\left(\frac{\pi\alpha_i}{m}\right).$$

(This expression can also be obtained from Lemma 12 in the Appendix, where we obtain a formula for each of the coefficients of  $\tau$ .) For each  $1 \leq j \leq m/2$  we shall let  $t_j = \sin(j\pi/m)$  and let  $k_j$  denote the number of times  $\alpha_i = j$  or  $\alpha_i = (m - j)$  in

the word  $w(x, y)$  (so that  $k = k_1 + \dots + k_{\lfloor m/2 \rfloor}$ ). The above formula then becomes  $c = (t_1^{k_1} \dots t_{\lfloor m/2 \rfloor}^{k_{\lfloor m/2 \rfloor}}) / (\sin(\pi/m)^k)$ .

Now if  $X, Y$  generate a non-elementary subgroup of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  then  $\rho(G)$  (and hence  $G$ ) contains a non-abelian free subgroup. Thus in proving that  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup we may assume that  $X, Y$  generate an elementary subgroup of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$ . By Corollary 2.4 of [15] there are then three possibilities: (i)  $X, Y$  generate a finite subgroup of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$ ; (ii)  $\text{tr}[X, Y] = 2$ ; or (iii)  $\text{tr}XY = 0$ .

The finite subgroups of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  are the alternating groups  $A_4$  and  $A_5$ , the symmetric group  $S_4$ , cyclic and dihedral groups (see for example [7]). Manipulation using trace identities shows that (ii) is equivalent to  $\text{tr}XY = \pm \sin(\pi/m)$ . These values occur as roots of  $\tau$  if and only if  $G$  admits an essential cyclic representation. Such a representation can be realized as  $x \mapsto A, y \mapsto B$  where

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/2} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/2} \end{pmatrix}, \quad B = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/m} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/m} \end{pmatrix}.$$

In case (iii)  $X$  and  $Y$  generate the finite dihedral group  $D_{2m}$ . We summarize the above as

**Lemma 4** *Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem, with  $m \geq 3$ . Suppose  $G \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  is an essential representation given by  $x \mapsto X, y \mapsto Y$ , where  $\text{tr}X = 0$ ,  $\text{tr}Y = 2 \cos(\pi/m)$ . If  $G$  does not contain a non-abelian free subgroup then one of the following occurs:*

1.  $X, Y$  generate  $A_4, S_4$ , or  $A_5$ ;
2.  $\text{tr}XY = \pm 2 \sin(\pi/m)$ ;
3.  $\text{tr}XY = 0$  and  $\langle X, Y \rangle \cong D_{2m}$ .

*Case (2) occurs if and only if  $G$  admits an essential cyclic representation.*

**Remark 5** If  $X, Y$  generate  $A_4$  then  $m = 3$  and  $XY$  has order 3, so  $\text{tr}XY = \pm 1$ . If  $X, Y$  generate  $S_4$  then either (a)  $m = 3$  and  $XY$  has order 4, so  $\text{tr}XY = \pm\sqrt{2}$ ; or (b)  $m = 4$  and  $XY$  has order 3, so  $\text{tr}XY = \pm 1$ . If  $X, Y$  generate  $A_5$  then either (a)  $m = 3$  and  $XY$  has order 5; or (b)  $m = 5$  and  $XY$  has order 3, so  $\text{tr}XY = \pm 1$ ; or (c)  $m = 5$  and  $XY$  has order 5, in which case  $XY$  is conjugate to  $Y^2$  so  $\text{tr}XY = \pm \text{tr}Y^2 = \pm((\text{tr}Y)^2 - 2)$ .

### 3 The case $m = 4$

**Lemma 6** *Let  $G = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^4 = (xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k})^2 = 1 \rangle$  and let  $k_2$  denote the number of values of  $i$  for which  $\alpha_i = 2$ . Then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup unless one of the following holds:*

1.  $k$  is odd and one of the following holds:

- (a)  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0 \pmod{4}$ ;
- (b)  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 2 \pmod{4}$  and  $k_2 = 1$ ;
- (c)  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 1, 3 \pmod{4}$  and  $k_2 = 0$ ;

2.  $k$  is even and one of the following holds:

- (a)  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 2 \pmod{4}$ ;
- (b)  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0 \pmod{4}$  and either
  - (i).  $k_2 = 0$  and  $k = 2 \pmod{4}$ ; or
  - (ii).  $k_2 = 2$ ;
- (c)  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 1, 3 \pmod{4}$  and  $k_2 = 1$ .

### Proof

By Lemma 4 and Remark 5 we may assume that the roots of the trace polynomial  $\tau$  are among  $\pm\sqrt{2}, 0, \pm 1$ . Thus

$$\tau(\lambda) = c\lambda^s(\lambda^2 - 1)^t(\lambda^2 - 2)^u$$

where  $s + 2t + 2u = k$  and

$$c = \frac{1}{(\sin(\pi/4))^k} (\sin(\pi/4))^{k_1} (\sin(2\pi/4))^{k_2} = \sqrt{2}^{k_2},$$

where  $k_1, k_2$  denote the number of times  $\alpha_i$  takes the values  $\pm 1, 2$  respectively. (Note that  $k$  and  $s$  are of the same parity.)

Let

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} i & 0 \\ 1 & -i \end{pmatrix}, \quad B = \begin{pmatrix} (1+i)/\sqrt{2} & z \\ 0 & (1-i)/\sqrt{2} \end{pmatrix}$$

be elements of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  so that  $\text{tr}A = 0$ ,  $\text{tr}B = \sqrt{2}$ ,  $\text{tr}AB = z - \sqrt{2}$ . Consider the representation  $\rho : \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^4 = 1 \rangle \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  given by  $x \mapsto A$ ,  $y \mapsto B$  then

$$\begin{aligned} \text{tr}\rho(xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k}) &= \tau(z - \sqrt{2}) \\ &= \pm(\sqrt{2})^{k_2} (z - \sqrt{2})^s (z^2 - 2\sqrt{2}z + 1)^t (z - 2\sqrt{2})^u z^u \end{aligned}$$

whose constant term is 0 if  $u > 0$ , and  $\pm(\sqrt{2})^{k_2+s}$  if  $u = 0$ . Now the constant term in  $\text{tr}(AB^{\alpha_1} \dots AB^{\alpha_k})$  is given by  $2 \cos((2k + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i)\pi/4) \in \{\pm 2, \pm\sqrt{2}\}$ . If  $u > 0$  we have that  $2k + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 2 \pmod{4}$ , and one of the conclusions 1(a) or 2(a) holds. Thus we may assume  $u = 0$ , and therefore  $k_2 + s = 1$  or 2.

Suppose  $k$  is odd. Then  $s$  is odd. Since  $2k + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i \not\equiv 2 \pmod{4}$  we have  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 1, 2$ , or  $3 \pmod{4}$ . If  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 2 \pmod{4}$  then  $k_2$  is odd so  $k_2 = 1$ ,  $s = 1$  and we are in case 1(b). If  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 1, 3 \pmod{4}$  then  $k_2$  is even so  $k_2 = 0$ ,  $s = 1$  and we are in case 1(c).

Suppose  $k$  is even. Then  $s$  is even. Since  $2k + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i \not\equiv 2 \pmod{4}$  we have  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0, 1$ , or  $3 \pmod{4}$ . If  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 1$  or  $3 \pmod{4}$  then  $k_2$  is odd so  $k_2 = 1$ ,  $s = 0$

and we are in case 2(c). If  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0 \pmod{4}$  then  $k_2$  is even so either  $k_2 = 0, s = 2$  or  $k_2 = 2, s = 0$ . In the latter option we are in case 2(b)(ii). In the former 0 is a root of  $\tau(\lambda)$  so  $G$  admits an essential dihedral representation. Thus  $\sum_{i=1}^k (-1)^i \alpha_i = 2 \pmod{4}$ . Combining this with  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0 \pmod{4}$  and the fact that each  $\alpha_i$  is odd, we obtain  $k = 2 \pmod{4}$  and we are in case 2(b)(i).  $\square$

## 4 The cases $m = 10, 15$

In this section we consider the following situation. Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem where  $m = 5p$  for some prime  $p$ . We first consider the case where  $k$  is even.

**Lemma 7** *Let  $G$  be as defined in the Main Theorem, where  $m = 5p$  for some prime  $p$  and where  $k$  is even. Then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

### Proof

If  $p = 2$  then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup by [16, Theorem A]. Suppose then that  $p$  is odd.

Consider a homomorphism  $\theta : G \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}_{10p} \cong \mathbb{Z}_2 \times \mathbb{Z}_{5p}$  such that  $\theta(x), \theta(y)$  have orders  $2, 5p$  respectively. Then, up to an automorphism of  $\mathbb{Z}_{10p}$  we may assume that  $\theta(x) = 5p, \theta(y) = 2$ . Then  $\theta(w) = 5pk + 2 \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i$ , which is not of order 2, since  $k$  is even and  $p$  is odd. Hence we must have  $\theta(w) = 0$ , so  $\theta$  is not essential.

In a similar way, consider a homomorphism  $\theta : G \rightarrow \langle a, b \mid a^2 = b^{5p} = (ab)^2 = 1 \rangle \cong D_{10p}$  such that  $\theta(x), \theta(y)$  have orders  $2, 5p$  respectively. Then, up to an automorphism of  $D_{10p}$  we may assume that  $\theta(x) = a, \theta(y) = b$ . Then  $\theta(w) = b^{\sum_{i=1}^k (-1)^i \alpha_i}$ , which is not of order 2, since  $p$  is odd. Hence we must have  $\theta(w) = 1$ , so  $\theta$  is not essential.

Thus  $G$  admits no essential cyclic or dihedral representation, so (since we also have  $m > 5$ ) Lemma 4 implies that  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.  $\square$

By Lemma 7 we may restrict attention to the case where  $k$  is odd. We do so throughout the remainder of this section without further comment.

Now  $G$  maps homomorphically onto the group

$$\overline{G} = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^5 = \overline{w}(x, y)^2 = 1 \rangle \quad (1)$$

where  $\overline{w} \in \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^5 = 1 \rangle$  is given by  $\overline{w} = xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k}$  where  $\beta_i = \alpha_i \pmod{5}$  ( $1 \leq i \leq k$ ). Now  $\overline{w} \neq y^\beta$  for any  $\beta$ , since  $k$  is odd. If  $\overline{w} = x$  then  $\overline{G} \cong \mathbb{Z}_2 * \mathbb{Z}_5$  and so  $\overline{G}$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup. If  $\overline{w}$  is a proper power then  $\overline{G}$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup by [2].

Thus we will assume that  $\overline{w}$  can be freely reduced to a word of the form  $\overline{w} = xy^{\gamma_1} \dots xy^{\gamma_\ell}$  that is not a proper power, where  $1 \leq \gamma_i \leq 4$  ( $1 \leq i \leq \ell$ ),  $\ell \geq 1$ . Hence the corresponding presentation (1) is a presentation of  $\overline{G}$  as a generalized triangle group. We let  $\tau(\lambda), \sigma(\mu)$  denote the trace polynomials of  $G$  and  $\overline{G}$  respectively.

**Lemma 8** *If 1 is a repeated root of  $\sigma(\mu)$  then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

**Proof**

Let  $q : G \rightarrow \bar{G}$  denote the canonical epimorphism. By hypothesis, there is an essential representation  $\rho : \bar{G} \rightarrow PSL_2(\mathbb{C}[\mu]/(\mu - 1)^2)$ . Indeed, we can construct  $\rho$  explicitly via:

$$\rho(x) = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \rho(y) = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/5} & \mu \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/5} \end{pmatrix}.$$

Composing this with the canonical epimorphism

$$\psi : PSL_2(\mathbb{C}[\mu]/(\mu - 1)^2) \rightarrow PSL_2(\mathbb{C}[\mu]/(\mu - 1)) \cong PSL_2(\mathbb{C})$$

gives an essential representation  $\tilde{\rho} = \psi \circ \rho : \bar{G} \rightarrow PSL_2(\mathbb{C})$  with image  $A_5$ , corresponding to the root 1 of the trace polynomial.

Let  $\bar{K}$  denote the kernel of  $\tilde{\rho}$ ,  $V$  the kernel of  $\psi$ , and  $K$  the kernel of the composite map  $\tilde{\rho} \circ q : G \rightarrow PSL_2(\mathbb{C})$ . Then  $V$  is a complex vector space, since its elements have the form  $\pm(I + (\mu - 1)A)$  for various  $2 \times 2$  matrices  $A$ , with multiplication

$$[\pm(I + (\mu - 1)A)][\pm(I + (\mu - 1)B)] = \pm(I + (\mu - 1)(A + B)).$$

Our strategy is to apply the techniques of [13] to  $K$  to obtain the existence of a non-abelian free subgroup. To this end we will first analyse the structure of  $V \supset \rho(\bar{K}) = \rho(q(K))$  to obtain a large free abelian quotient  $K/N$  of  $K$  with suitable properties. We will then exhibit  $K$  as the fundamental group of a certain CW-complex  $X$ , and show that the second homology group of the covering complex of  $X$  corresponding to  $N$  has a free  $\mathbb{Z}(K/N)$ -submodule of large rank.

Now  $\bar{K}$  is generated by conjugates of  $(xy)^3$ . Consider four such conjugates:  $c_1 = (xy)^3$ ,  $c_2 = x(xy)^3x$ ,  $c_3 = yxy^3(xy)^3y^2xy^4$ , and  $c_4 = yxy^4(xy)^3yxy^4$ . A calculation shows that  $\rho(c_i) = \pm(I + (\mu - 1)M_i)$  where

$$M_1 = \begin{pmatrix} -1 & z_1 \\ -\bar{z}_1 & 1 \end{pmatrix}, \quad M_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \bar{z}_1 \\ -z_1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}, \quad M_3 = \begin{pmatrix} z_2 & -z_3 \\ -z_3 & -z_2 \end{pmatrix}, \quad M_4 = \begin{pmatrix} \bar{z}_2 & \bar{z}_3 \\ \bar{z}_3 & -\bar{z}_2 \end{pmatrix},$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} z_1 &= \frac{-(1 + \sqrt{5})}{2} + i \frac{\sqrt{10 - 2\sqrt{5}}}{2}, \\ z_2 &= \frac{3 + \sqrt{5}}{2} + i \frac{\sqrt{10 - 2\sqrt{5}}}{2}, \\ z_3 &= -1 + i \frac{(3 + \sqrt{5})\sqrt{10 - 2\sqrt{5}}}{4}. \end{aligned}$$

By considering (for example) the upper right hand entries, it is easy to verify that  $M_1, M_2, M_3, M_4$  are linearly independent over  $\mathbb{Q}$ . The group  $A_5$  acts on  $V$  via conjugation and since  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$  is of order 2, the action of  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$  on  $V$  is diagonalizable. Moreover, the only possible eigenvalues are  $\pm 1$ . Thus  $V$  splits as a  $\mathbb{Q}$ -direct sum  $V_+ \oplus V_-$ , where  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$  acts as the identity on  $V_+$  and as the antipodal map  $v \mapsto -v$  on  $V_-$ . The canonical projection  $V \rightarrow V_-$  with kernel  $V_+$  is  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$ -equivariant.

For  $j = 3, 4$ , the off-diagonal entries of  $M_j$  are equal. It follows easily that  $\rho(xc_j)$  has trace 0, so is of order 2, and hence  $\rho(xc_jx) = \rho(c_j^{-1})$ . Note also that  $xc_1x = c_2$  and  $xc_2x = c_1$ . Thus  $\rho(c_1c_2^{-1}), \rho(c_3), \rho(c_4) \in V_-$  and  $\rho(c_1c_2) \in V_+$ . Let  $N$  be the pre-image of  $V_+$  in  $K$ . Then  $N$  is normal in  $K$  and is invariant under conjugation by  $x$ . It follows that  $K/N$  is free abelian of rank at least 3 and that  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$  acts on  $K/N$  as the antipodal map.

Note that  $K$  is the fundamental group of a 2-dimensional CW-complex  $X$  arising from the given presentation of  $G$ . This complex  $X$  has 60 cells of dimension 0, 120 cells of dimension 1, and  $60(\frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{5} + \frac{1}{2}) = 72$  cells of dimension 2. Here,  $60/5 = 12$  of the 2-cells (call them  $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_{12}$ , say) arise from the relator  $y^{5p}$ ,  $60/2 = 30$  ( $\alpha_{13}, \dots, \alpha_{42}$ , say) arise from the relator  $x^2$ , and  $60/2 = 30$  ( $\alpha_{43}, \dots, \alpha_{72}$ , say) arise from the relator  $w(x, y)^2$ . Moreover,  $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_{12}$  are attached by maps which are  $p$ th powers. Let  $\widehat{X}$  be the regular covering complex of  $X$  corresponding to the normal subgroup  $N$  of  $K$  and let  $\widehat{\alpha}_i$  denote a lift of the 2-cell  $\alpha_i$ . Then each of  $\widehat{\alpha}_1, \dots, \widehat{\alpha}_{12}$  is a 2-cell attached by a map which is a  $p$ th power.

Let  $GF_p$  denote the field with  $p$  elements. Now  $H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  is a subgroup of the 2-chain group  $C_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  and since  $K/N$  freely permutes the cells of  $\widehat{X}$ ,  $C_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  is a free  $GF_p(K/N)$ -module on the basis  $\widehat{\alpha}_1, \dots, \widehat{\alpha}_{72}$ . Let  $Q$  be the free  $GF_p(K/N)$ -submodule of  $C_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  of rank 12 generated by  $\widehat{\alpha}_1, \dots, \widehat{\alpha}_{12}$ . Since these 2-cells are attached by maps which are  $p$ th powers, their boundaries in the 1-chain group  $C_1(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  are zero. Thus  $Q$  is a subgroup of  $H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$ .

Suppose  $Q \neq H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$ , and let  $\widehat{\beta} \in H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p) \setminus Q$ . Then  $\widehat{\beta} = \sum_{i=1}^{72} \mu_i \widehat{\alpha}_i$  where  $\mu_i \in GF_p(K/N)$  ( $1 \leq i \leq 72$ ) and  $\mu_q \neq 0$  for some  $q > 12$ . Let  $L$  be the submodule of  $H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  generated by  $\widehat{\alpha}_1, \dots, \widehat{\alpha}_{12}, \widehat{\beta}$ . Let  $\pi_q : C_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p) \rightarrow GF_p(K/N)$  denote the projection map on the basis element  $\widehat{\alpha}_q$  and suppose  $\lambda, \lambda_1, \dots, \lambda_{12} \in GF_p(K/N)$  satisfy

$$v := \lambda \widehat{\beta} + \lambda_1 \widehat{\alpha}_1 + \dots + \lambda_{12} \widehat{\alpha}_{12} = 0$$

in  $C_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$ . Then  $0 = \pi_q(v) = \lambda \mu_q$ , and since  $GF_p(K/N)$  is an integral domain we have that  $\lambda = 0$  so  $\lambda_1 \widehat{\alpha}_1 + \dots + \lambda_{12} \widehat{\alpha}_{12} = 0$  in  $Q$ . But  $\widehat{\alpha}_1, \dots, \widehat{\alpha}_{12}$  form a  $GF_p(K/N)$ -basis for  $Q$  so  $\lambda_1 = \dots = \lambda_{12} = 0$  and hence  $L$  is free on  $\{\widehat{\alpha}_1, \dots, \widehat{\alpha}_{12}, \widehat{\beta}\}$ . Thus  $H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  contains a free  $GF_p(K/N)$ -submodule of rank  $13 = 1 + \chi(X)$  so by [13, Proposition 2.1 and Theorem 2.2],  $K = \pi_1(X)$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.

Suppose then that  $H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p) = Q$ . We argue as in the proof of [13, Corollary 3.2]. The element  $c_1c_2 \in N$  is mapped to the element  $\pm(I + (\mu - 1)(M_1 + M_2))$  of infinite order in  $V_+$  so  $N^{ab}$  has torsion-free rank at least 1. Thus  $H_1(\widehat{X}, GF_p) \cong N^{ab}/pN^{ab} \neq 0$ . We also have that  $H_2(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  is a free  $GF_p(K/N)$ -module and  $K/N$  is a free abelian group of rank at least 3, so by [13, Theorem D] there is a subgroup  $J/N$  of  $K/N$  such that  $(K/N)/(J/N) \cong K/J \cong \mathbb{Z}^2$  and  $H_1(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  contains a non-zero free  $GF_p(J/N)$ -submodule. Moreover,  $J/N$  is infinite so this module is of infinite  $GF_p$ -dimension.

Thus, by definition, the Bieri-Strebel invariant ([6])  $\Sigma$  of the  $GF_p(K/N)$ -module  $H_1(\widehat{X}, GF_p)$  is a proper subset of the sphere  $S^{d-1}$  (where  $d$  is the rank of the free

abelian group  $K/N$ ). But  $\Sigma = -\Sigma$ , since  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$  acts as the antipodal map on  $K/N$ . Hence  $\Sigma \cup -\Sigma \neq S^{d-1}$ , and so  $N$  has a non-abelian free subgroup by [6, Theorem 4.1].  $\square$

**Lemma 9** *If  $\overline{G}$  has an essential cyclic representation then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

**Proof**

Let  $q : G \rightarrow \overline{G}$  denote the canonical epimorphism. Since  $\overline{G}$  admits an essential cyclic representation,  $\pm 2 \sin(\pi/5)$  are roots of its trace polynomial, so there also exists an essential representation  $\rho : \overline{G} \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  given by  $x \mapsto X$ ,  $y \mapsto Y$ , where

$$X = \begin{pmatrix} i & 1 \\ 0 & -i \end{pmatrix}, \quad Y = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/5} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/5} \end{pmatrix}.$$

Let  $\psi : \rho(\overline{G}) \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  be given by

$$X \mapsto \begin{pmatrix} i & 0 \\ 0 & -i \end{pmatrix}, \quad Y \mapsto Y$$

then  $\tilde{\rho} := \psi \circ \rho : \overline{G} \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  is an essential representation with image  $\mathbb{Z}_{10}$ . Let  $K, \overline{K}, \overline{N}$  denote the kernels of the maps  $\tilde{\rho} \circ q, \tilde{\rho}, \rho$ , respectively. Then  $\overline{K}$  is generated by  $c_t := y^t x y^{-t} x$  ( $t = 1, 2, 3, 4$ ). Now for each  $t$

$$\rho(c_t) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & i(e^{2\pi t i/5} + 1) \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

so  $\rho(c_1), \rho(c_2), \rho(c_3), \rho(c_4)$  are linearly independent over  $\mathbb{Q}$  and hence  $\rho(\overline{K}) \cong \mathbb{Z}^4$ . Thus  $\overline{G}/\overline{K} \cong \mathbb{Z}_{10}$  and  $\overline{K}/\overline{N} \cong \mathbb{Z}^4$ , so if  $N$  denotes the preimage of  $\overline{N}$  in  $G$  then  $N \triangleleft K \triangleleft G$  and  $G/K \cong \mathbb{Z}_{10}$ ,  $K/N \cong \mathbb{Z}^4$ . Moreover,  $x c_t x = c_t^{-1}$  for each  $t$  so  $\tilde{\rho}(x)$  acts as the antipodal map on  $K/N$ .

Now  $K$  is the fundamental group of a 2-dimensional CW-complex with 10 0-cells, 20 1-cells and 12 2-cells, 2 of which correspond to the relator  $y^{5p}$ , and so are attached by  $p$ th powers. The argument given in the proof of Lemma 8 then shows that  $K$  has a non-abelian free subgroup.  $\square$

For the following lemma, recall that  $2\ell$  is the (free product) length of  $\overline{w}(x, y)$  and that  $\sigma(\mu)$  denotes the trace polynomial of  $\overline{G}$ .

**Lemma 10** *Suppose that  $\ell$  is odd and that  $\overline{G}$  admits no essential cyclic representation. If 0 is a repeated root of  $\sigma(\mu)$  then  $\overline{G}$  (and hence  $G$ ) contains a non-abelian free subgroup.*

**Proof**

Let  $\eta = 2 \cos(\pi/5) = (1 + \sqrt{5})/2$  and note that  $\eta^4 - 3\eta^2 + 1 = 0$ . By Lemma 4 and



Remark 5 we may assume that the roots of  $\sigma$  are among  $\pm(\eta^2 - 2) = \pm\eta^{\pm 1}, \pm 1, \pm 2 \sin(\pi/5) = \pm\sqrt{4 - \eta^2}, 0$ . The leading coefficient of  $\sigma(\mu)$  is given by  $c = \eta^{k_2}$ . Thus  $\sigma(\mu)$  takes the form

$$\sigma(\mu) = \eta^{k_2} \mu^s (\mu^2 - 1)^t (\mu^2 - \eta^{-2})^u (\mu^2 - (4 - \eta^2))^v$$

where  $s + 2t + 2u + 2v = \ell$ . Let  $A, B \in PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  be defined as follows:

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} i & 0 \\ 1 & -i \end{pmatrix}, \quad B = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/5} & z \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/5} \end{pmatrix}.$$

Then  $\text{tr}A = 0$ ,  $\text{tr}B = \eta$ ,  $\text{tr}AB = z - \sqrt{4 - \eta^2}$ .

Consider the representation  $\rho : \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^5 = 1 \rangle \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  given by  $x \mapsto A, y \mapsto B$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} \text{tr}\rho(xy^{\gamma_1} \dots xy^{\gamma_\ell}) &= \sigma(z - \sqrt{4 - \eta^2}) \\ &= \eta^{k_2} (z - \sqrt{4 - \eta^2})^s (z^2 - 2z\sqrt{4 - \eta^2} + \eta^{-2})^t \\ &\quad \cdot (z^2 - 2z\sqrt{4 - \eta^2} + 1)^u (z - 2\sqrt{4 - \eta^2})^v z^v \end{aligned}$$

whose constant term is 0 if  $v > 0$  and is  $\eta^{k_2 - 2t} (\sqrt{4 - \eta^2})^s$  if  $v = 0$ . Now the constant term in  $\text{tr}(AB^{\gamma_1} \dots AB^{\gamma_\ell})$  is  $2 \cos((5\ell + 2 \sum_{i=1}^{\ell} \gamma_i)\pi/10)$ . Since  $\ell$  is odd and  $\overline{G}$  admits no essential cyclic representation, this constant term is either  $\pm 2 \cos(\pi/10) = \pm \eta \sqrt{4 - \eta^2}$  or  $\pm 2 \cos(3\pi/10) = \pm \sqrt{4 - \eta^2}$ . Thus we can conclude that  $v = 0$ , that

$$\eta^{k_2 - 2t} (\sqrt{4 - \eta^2})^s = \eta \sqrt{4 - \eta^2} \quad \text{or} \quad \sqrt{4 - \eta^2},$$

and therefore that  $s = 1$  and  $t = k_2/2$  or  $t = (k_2 - 1)/2$ . Hence 0 is not a repeated root of  $\sigma(\mu)$ , contrary to hypothesis.  $\square$

For the proof of Theorem 2 we shall require the following proposition.

**Proposition 11** *Let  $p \neq q$  be prime numbers, and let  $1 \leq t \leq pq - 1$ . Then*

$$\prod_{\psi \in \text{Aut}(\mathbb{Z}_{pq})} 2 \sin\left(\frac{\psi(t)\pi}{pq}\right) = \begin{cases} q^{p-1} & \text{if } p|t \\ p^{q-1} & \text{if } q|t \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

**Proof**

By identity 1.392(1) of [11] we have that for all real numbers  $x$  and  $n \geq 2$

$$\sin(x) \prod_{1 \leq r < n} 2 \sin(x + r\pi/n) = \sin(nx).$$

Differentiating and substituting  $x = 0$  we obtain

$$\prod_{1 \leq r < n} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{n}\right) = n. \quad (2)$$

We now claim that the identity

$$\prod_{\substack{1 \leq r < n \\ (r,n)=1}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{n}\right) = \begin{cases} u & \text{if } n \text{ is a power of a prime } u \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (3)$$

holds for all  $n \geq 2$ . This clearly holds when  $n = 2$ . Let  $N \geq 3$  and suppose inductively that it holds for all  $n < N$ . Now

$$\prod_{1 \leq r < N} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{N}\right) = \prod_{\substack{1 \leq r < N \\ (r,N)=1}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{N}\right) \cdot \prod_{\substack{d|N \\ d>1}} \prod_{\substack{1 \leq r < N \\ (r,N)=d}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{N}\right). \quad (4)$$

Now

$$\prod_{\substack{d|N \\ d>1}} \prod_{\substack{1 \leq r < N \\ (r,N)=d}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{N}\right) = \prod_{\substack{d|N \\ d>1}} \prod_{\substack{1 \leq s < N/d \\ (s,N/d)=1}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{s\pi}{N/d}\right). \quad (5)$$

Applying the inductive hypothesis, the right hand side of (5) is equal to the product of all primes  $u$  such that  $N/d$  is a power of  $u$ , where  $d > 1$  ranges over all divisors of  $N$ . Thus

$$\prod_{\substack{d|N \\ d>1}} \prod_{\substack{1 \leq r < N \\ (r,N)=d}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{r\pi}{N}\right) = \begin{cases} u^{\alpha-1} & \text{if } N = u^\alpha, \text{ where } \alpha \geq 1 \text{ and } u \text{ is prime} \\ N & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Substituting this into (4) and applying (2) to the left hand side we get that the identity (3) holds for  $n = N$  and hence for all  $n \geq 2$ . Finally,

$$\begin{aligned} \prod_{\psi \in \text{Aut}(\mathbb{Z}_{pq})} 2 \sin\left(\frac{\psi(t)\pi}{pq}\right) &= \prod_{\substack{1 \leq \alpha < pq \\ (\alpha,pq)=1}} 2 \sin\left(\frac{\alpha t \pi}{pq}\right) \\ &= \begin{cases} \prod_{\substack{1 \leq \alpha < pq \\ (\alpha,pq)=1}} 2 \sin(\alpha\pi/q) = \left(\prod_{\substack{1 \leq \alpha < q \\ (\alpha,q)=1}} 2 \sin(\alpha\pi/q)\right)^{p-1} & \text{if } p|t \\ \prod_{\substack{1 \leq \alpha < pq \\ (\alpha,pq)=1}} 2 \sin(\alpha\pi/p) = \left(\prod_{\substack{1 \leq \alpha < p \\ (\alpha,p)=1}} 2 \sin(\alpha\pi/p)\right)^{q-1} & \text{if } q|t \\ \prod_{\substack{1 \leq \alpha < pq \\ (\alpha,pq)=1}} 2 \sin(\alpha\pi/pq) & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

and an application of (3) completes the proof.  $\square$

## Proof of Theorem 2

We will consider the homomorphic image  $\overline{G}$  of  $G$  defined by the presentation (1). As explained at the start of this section we will assume that  $\overline{w}(x, y)$  is not a proper power and can be freely reduced to the form  $\overline{w}(x, y) = xy^{\gamma_1} \dots xy^{\gamma_\ell}$  where  $1 \leq \gamma_i \leq 4$  ( $1 \leq i \leq \ell - 1$ ),  $\ell \geq 1$ .

By [13, Theorem E] we may assume that  $G$  admits no essential cyclic representation, and since  $m > 5$  Lemma 4 implies that the trace polynomial for  $G$  has the form  $\tau(\lambda) = c\lambda^k$ , where

$$c = \frac{1}{(\sin(\pi/5p))^k} \prod_{i=1}^k \sin\left(\frac{\pi\alpha_i}{5p}\right).$$

Let  $X, Y \in PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  be elements of orders  $2, 5p$  that generate a cyclic subgroup of  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$ . We may assume that

$$X = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/2} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/2} \end{pmatrix}, \quad Y = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/5p} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/5p} \end{pmatrix}$$

so that  $\text{tr}XY = 2 \sin(\pi/5p)$ . Let  $\rho : \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^{5p} = 1 \rangle \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  be given by  $x \mapsto X, y \mapsto Y$ . Then  $\text{tr}\rho(w) = \text{tr}(X^k Y^a) = \pm 2 \sin(a\pi/5p)$ , where  $a = \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i$ . On the other hand  $\text{tr}\rho(w) = \tau(2 \sin(\pi/5p)) = \prod_{i=1}^k 2 \sin(\alpha_i \pi/5p)$ . Thus

$$2 \sin(a\pi/5p) = \pm \prod_{i=1}^k 2 \sin(\alpha_i \pi/5p)$$

and hence

$$\prod_{\psi \in \text{Aut}(\mathbb{Z}_{5p})} 2 \sin(\psi(a)\pi/5p) = \pm \prod_{i=1}^k \prod_{\psi \in \text{Aut}(\mathbb{Z}_{5p})} 2 \sin(\psi(\alpha_i)\pi/5p). \quad (6)$$

Suppose  $5 \mid \alpha_i$  for some  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . Then by Proposition 11  $p^4$  divides the right hand side of (6). If  $5 \mid a$  then  $\overline{G}$  admits an essential cyclic representation and so  $\overline{G}$  (and hence  $G$ ) contains a non-abelian free subgroup, by Lemma 9. Thus we may assume  $5 \nmid a$ . Proposition 11 then implies that the left hand side of (6) is either equal to 1 or  $5^{p-1}$  and we have a contradiction. Thus  $5 \nmid \alpha_i$  for any  $1 \leq i \leq k$  so the (free product) length of  $w(x, y)$  is equal to the (free product) length of  $\overline{w}(x, y)$ . Hence  $\ell = k$ , and thus the trace polynomial  $\sigma(\mu)$  of  $\overline{G}$  is of degree  $k \geq 3$ .

As explained in the proof of Lemma 10 we may assume that  $\sigma(\mu)$  is of the form  $\sigma(\mu) = c' \mu^s (\mu^2 - 1)^t (\mu^2 - \eta^{-2})^u$  where  $\eta = 2 \cos(\pi/5)$  and  $s$  is odd. By Lemma 10 we may assume  $s = 1$ , and by Lemma 8 we may assume  $t \leq 1$ . The automorphism  $\theta$  of  $\mathbb{Z}_5$  generated by the map  $1 \mapsto 2$  yields the alternative presentation  $\overline{G} = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^5 = (xy^{\theta(\beta_1)} \dots xy^{\theta(\beta_k)})^2 = 1 \rangle$ . The potential roots  $\pm 1$  and  $\pm \eta^{-1}$  for  $\sigma$  correspond to essential representations  $\overline{G} \rightarrow A_5$  that map  $xy$  to elements of order 3 or 5 respectively (cf. Remark 5). The automorphism  $\theta$  has the effect of interchanging these two possibilities. Thus the trace polynomial corresponding to this new presentation has the form  $\sigma'(\mu) = c'' \mu^s (\mu^2 - \eta^{-2})^t (\mu^2 - 1)^u$ , for some  $c''$ . By another application of Lemma 8 we may assume  $u \leq 1$ . Since  $k = s + 2t + 2u > 1$  we are reduced to the cases  $k = 3, 5$ .

If  $k = 3$  then  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup by [14, Theorem 1]. If  $k = 5$  then  $s = t = 1$  so  $\sigma(\mu) = c' \mu (\mu^2 - 1) (\mu^2 - \eta^{-2})$ . A computer search reveals that the only words  $w(x, y)$  (up to cyclic permutation, inversion, and automorphisms of  $\langle y \mid y^5 = 1 \rangle$ ) with trace polynomial of that form are  $xyxy^3xy^2xy^4xy^t$  with  $t \in \{1, 2\}$ . In each case, a GAP [10] calculation shows that  $\overline{G}$  has a subgroup of index 11 admitting the free group of rank 2 as a homomorphic image, and hence  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup.  $\square$

## 5 The cases $m = 12, 20, 30, 60$

### Proof of Theorem 3

We shall consider alternative presentations for  $G$ :

$$G = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^m = (xy^{\psi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\psi(\alpha_k)})^2 = 1 \rangle$$

where  $\psi$  is an automorphism of  $\mathbb{Z}_m$ . By [14, Theorem 5] we may assume that  $k$  is odd. By [13, Theorem E] we may assume that  $G$  admits no essential cyclic representation. Since  $m > 5$ , Lemma 4 implies that the trace polynomial for  $G$  takes the form  $\tau(\lambda) = c\lambda^k$  where  $c = (t_1^{k_1} \dots t_{m/2}^{k_{m/2}})/(\sin(\pi/m))^k$ . Let  $X, Y \in PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  have orders 2 and  $m$  respectively that generate a cyclic group of order  $m$ . We may assume  $\text{tr}(XY) = 2\sin(\pi/m)$ . Fix  $\rho$  to be the representation  $\rho : \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^m = 1 \rangle \rightarrow PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  given by  $x \mapsto X, y \mapsto Y$ . Then

$$\text{tr}\rho(xy^{\psi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\psi(\alpha_k)}) = \pm 2\cos(q\pi/m) \quad \text{for some } 1 \leq q < m/2. \quad (7)$$

(Note that if  $q = m/2$  then  $\rho$  induces an essential cyclic representation of  $G$ , contrary to our earlier assumption.) In particular,

$$-1 \leq \prod_{\psi \in A} \frac{\text{tr}\rho(xy^{\psi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\psi(\alpha_k)})}{2} \leq 1 \quad (8)$$

for any group  $A$  of automorphisms of  $\mathbb{Z}_m$ .

Now

$$\begin{aligned} \text{tr}\rho(xy^{\psi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\psi(\alpha_k)}) &= \tau(2\sin(\pi/m)) \\ &= 2^k \prod_{i=1}^k \sin\left(\frac{\pi\psi(\alpha_i)}{m}\right) \end{aligned}$$

so

$$\frac{\text{tr}\rho(xy^{\psi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\psi(\alpha_k)})}{2} = 2^{k-1} \cdot t_1^{k_{\psi(1)}} \dots t_{m/2}^{k_{\psi(m/2)}}. \quad (9)$$

We now consider each value of  $m$  separately.

#### The case $m = 12$ .

Let  $\psi$  be the automorphism of  $\mathbb{Z}_{12}$  generated by the map  $1 \mapsto 5$  and let  $A = \langle \psi \rangle$ . Then using (8) and (9) we obtain

$$2^{2(k-1)}(t_1 t_5)^{k_1+k_5} \cdot (t_2)^{2k_2} \cdot (t_3)^{2k_3} \cdot (t_4)^{2k_4} \cdot (t_6)^{2k_6} \leq 1$$

which (using (3)) simplifies to

$$2^{k_3+2k_6-2} \cdot 3^{k_4} \leq 1.$$

We shall consider the following homomorphic images of  $G$ :

$$\begin{aligned} H &= \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^6 = (xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k})^2 = 1 \rangle, \\ L &= \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^4 = (xy^{\gamma_1} \dots xy^{\gamma_k})^2 = 1 \rangle, \end{aligned}$$

where  $\beta_i = \alpha_i \bmod 6$  and  $\gamma_i = \alpha_i \bmod 4$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . Suppose  $k_6 = 0$ . Then each  $\beta_i$  is non-zero. If  $k > 3$  then by Theorem 1  $H$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup. If  $k = 3$  then by [14, Theorem 1]  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup. Thus we may assume  $k_6 \geq 1$  and hence  $k_6 = 1, k_3 = k_4 = 0$ . Moreover we may assume

$$\text{tr} \rho(xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k}) = \pm 2 \quad (10)$$

for otherwise one of  $\rho(xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k})$  or  $\rho(xy^{\psi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\psi(\alpha_k)})$  provides a contradiction to (7). Using (9) equation (10) simplifies to

$$\begin{aligned} 2 &= 2^{k_1+k_2+k_5+1} \cdot t_1^{k_1} t_2^{k_2} t_5^{k_5} t_6^1 \\ &= 2 \left( \frac{\sqrt{6} - \sqrt{2}}{2} \right)^{k_1-k_5} \end{aligned}$$

so  $k_1 = k_5$ . Since the image of  $\rho$  is isomorphic to  $\mathbb{Z}_{12}$  and by equation (10)  $\rho(w)$  is the zero of this group we have that  $6k + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0 \bmod 12$ , and  $k$  is odd so

$$\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 6 \bmod 12, \quad (11)$$

which implies  $\sum_{i=1}^k \gamma_i = 2 \bmod 4$ . By Lemma 6  $L$  (and hence  $G$ ) contains a non-abelian free subgroup unless precisely one  $\gamma_i = 2$ . This implies that  $k_2 + k_6 = 1$ , but  $k_6 = 1$  so  $k_2 = 0$ .

Let  $\bar{w}(x, y) = xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k}$ . Using the relations  $x^2 = 1, y^6 = 1$  of  $H$  we can cyclically reduce  $\bar{w}(x, y)$  to  $x$  (in which case  $H \cong \mathbb{Z}_2 * \mathbb{Z}_6$ , so  $G$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup) or to the form  $\bar{w}(x, y) = xy^{\delta_1} \dots xy^{\delta_\ell}$  where  $\ell$  is odd and  $1 \leq \delta_i \leq 5$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq \ell$ . If  $\ell > 3$  then by Theorem 1  $H$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup. Thus we may assume  $\ell = 1$  or  $3$ . The words  $w, \bar{w}$  then take the following forms:

$$\begin{aligned} \ell = 1: \quad w &= xy^{\xi_1} xy^{\xi_2} u(x, y) xy^6 v(x, y) & \bar{w} &= xy^{\xi_1 + \xi_2}, \\ \ell = 3: \quad w &= xy^{\xi_1} xy^{\xi_2} xy^{\xi_3} xy^{\xi_4} u(x, y) xy^6 v(x, y) & \bar{w} &= xy^{\xi_1 + \xi_4} xy^{\xi_2} xy^{\xi_3}, \end{aligned}$$

where  $\xi_1, \xi_2, \xi_3, \xi_4 \in \{1, 5\}$  and

$$\begin{aligned} u(x, y) &= xy^{a_1} \dots xy^{a_n}, \\ v(x, y) &= xy^{b_n} \dots xy^{b_1}, \end{aligned}$$

with  $a_i + b_i = 0 \bmod 6$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq n$ .

In the case  $\ell = 1$  equation (11) implies  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 0 \pmod{6}$  so

$$\xi_1 + \xi_2 + (a_1 + \cdots + a_n) + 6 + (b_n + \cdots + b_1) = 0 \pmod{6}$$

which implies  $\xi_1 + \xi_2 = 0 \pmod{6}$  contradicting our assumption that the exponents of  $y$  in  $\bar{w}$  are non-zero. In the case  $\ell = 3$ , since  $\xi_1 + \xi_2 + \xi_3 + \xi_4$  is even, Theorem 1 of [14] implies that  $H$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup.

**The case  $m = 20$ .**

We shall consider the following homomorphic image of  $G$ :

$$H = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^{10} = (xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k})^2 = 1 \rangle$$

where  $\beta_i = \alpha_i \pmod{10}$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$ .

Let  $\psi$  be the automorphism of  $\mathbb{Z}_{20}$  generated by the map  $1 \mapsto 3$  and let  $A = \langle \psi \rangle$ . Then using (8) and (9) we obtain

$$2^{4(k-1)} (t_1 t_3 t_7 t_9)^{k_1+k_3+k_7+k_9} (t_2 t_6)^{2(k_2+k_6)} (t_4 t_8)^{2(k_4+k_8)} t_5^{4k_5} t_{10}^{4k_{10}} \leq 1$$

which (using (3)) simplifies to

$$2^{2k_5+4k_{10}-4} \cdot 5^{k_4+k_8} \leq 1.$$

If  $k_{10} = 0$  then each  $\beta_i$  is non-zero so  $H$  contains a non-abelian free subgroup by Theorem 2. Thus we may assume that  $k_{10} \geq 1$  and hence  $k_{10} = 1$ ,  $k_5 = k_4 = k_8 = 0$ . Moreover we may assume

$$\text{tr} \rho(xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k}) = \pm 2 \tag{12}$$

for otherwise for some  $\phi \in A$  the element  $\rho(xy^{\phi(\alpha_1)} \dots xy^{\phi(\alpha_k)})$  provides a contradiction to (7). The image of  $\rho$  is isomorphic to  $\mathbb{Z}_{20}$  and by equation (12)  $\rho(w)$  is the zero of this group so we have that  $\sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_i = 10 \pmod{20}$  (since  $k$  is odd). Thus  $\sum_{i=1}^k \beta_i = 0 \pmod{10}$  so  $H$  admits an essential cyclic representation, and the result follows from [13, Theorem E].

**The case  $m = 30$ .**

We shall consider the following homomorphic images of  $G$ :

$$\begin{aligned} H &= \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^{10} = (xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k})^2 = 1 \rangle, \\ L &= \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^{15} = (xy^{\gamma_1} \dots xy^{\gamma_k})^2 = 1 \rangle, \end{aligned}$$

where  $\beta_i = \alpha_i \pmod{10}$ ,  $\gamma_i = \alpha_i \pmod{15}$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$ .

Let  $\psi$  be the automorphism of  $\mathbb{Z}_{30}$  generated by the map  $1 \mapsto 7$  and let  $A = \langle \psi \rangle$ . Then using (8) and (9) we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} &2^{4(k-1)} (t_1 t_7 t_{11} t_{13})^{k_1+k_7+k_{11}+k_{13}} (t_2 t_{14} t_8 t_4)^{k_2+k_{14}+k_8+k_4} \\ &\quad \cdot (t_3 t_9)^{2(k_3+k_9)} (t_5)^{4k_5} (t_6 t_{12})^{2(k_6+k_{12})} t_{10}^{4k_{10}} t_{15}^{4k_{15}} \\ &\leq 1 \end{aligned}$$

which (using (3)) simplifies to

$$2^{4k_{15}-4} \cdot 5^{k_6+k_{12}} \cdot 9^{k_{10}} \leq 1.$$

If  $k_{15} = 0$  then each  $\gamma_i$  is non-zero which implies that  $L$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup by Theorem 2. If  $k_{15} > 0$  then  $k_{10} = 0$ , so  $H$ , and hence  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup by Theorem 2.

**The case  $m = 60$ .**

We shall consider the following homomorphic images of  $G$ :

$$\begin{aligned} H &= \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^{20} = (xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k})^2 = 1 \rangle, \\ L &= \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^{30} = (xy^{\gamma_1} \dots xy^{\gamma_k})^2 = 1 \rangle, \end{aligned}$$

where  $\beta_i = \alpha_i \pmod{20}$ ,  $\gamma_i = \alpha_i \pmod{30}$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$ .

Consider the group  $A \cong \mathbb{Z}_4 \times \mathbb{Z}_2$  of automorphisms of  $\mathbb{Z}_{60}$  generated by  $\psi : 1 \mapsto 7$  and  $\phi : 1 \mapsto 29$ . Using (8) and (9) we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} 1 &\geq 2^{8(k-1)} \\ &\cdot (t_1 t_7 t_{11} t_{13} t_{17} t_{19} t_{23} t_{29})^{k_1+k_7+k_{11}+k_{13}+k_{17}+k_{19}+k_{23}+k_{29}} \\ &\cdot (t_2 t_{14} t_{22} t_{26})^{2(k_2+k_{14}+k_{22}+k_{26})} \cdot (t_3 t_{21} t_{27} t_9)^{2(k_3+k_{21}+k_{27}+k_9)} \\ &\cdot (t_4 t_{28} t_{16} t_8)^{2(k_4+k_{28}+k_{16}+k_8)} \cdot (t_5 t_{25})^{4(k_5+k_{25})} \cdot (t_6 t_{18})^{4(k_6+k_{18})} \cdot (t_{12} t_{24})^{4(k_{12}+k_{24})} \\ &\cdot (t_{10})^{8k_{10}} \cdot (t_{15})^{8k_{15}} \cdot (t_{20})^{8k_{20}} \cdot (t_{30})^{8k_{30}} \end{aligned}$$

which (using (3)) simplifies to

$$1 \geq 2^{4k_{15}+8k_{30}-8} \cdot 5^{2(k_{12}+k_{24})} \cdot 3^{4k_{20}}$$

In particular one of  $k_{20}, k_{30}$  is zero so either all  $\beta_i$ 's are non-zero or all  $\gamma_i$ 's are non-zero. Hence, by the above, one of  $H$  or  $L$  (and hence  $G$ ) contains a non-abelian free subgroup.  $\square$

## A Appendix: The case $m = 6$

This appendix gives a sketch proof of Theorem 1. We begin by giving a complete calculation of *all* the coefficients of the trace polynomial.

Let  $\mathcal{A}(k)$  denote the set of subsets  $S \subset \{1, \dots, k\}$  such that  $s_1 - s_2 \not\equiv 1 \pmod{k}$  for  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ . The maximum cardinality of  $S \in \mathcal{A}(k)$  is the integer part  $\lfloor k/2 \rfloor$  of  $k/2$ . For  $0 \leq j \leq \lfloor k/2 \rfloor$ , let  $\mathcal{A}(k, j)$  denote the set of sets  $S \in \mathcal{A}(k)$  of cardinality  $j$ .

**Lemma 12** *Let  $X, Y \in SL(2, \mathbb{C})$  be matrices with  $\text{tr}(X) = 0$ ,  $\text{tr}(Y) = 2 \cos(\pi/m)$ ,  $\text{tr}(XY) = \lambda$ , for some integer  $m \geq 2$ . Let  $W = XY^{\alpha_1} \dots XY^{\alpha_k}$ , where  $1 \leq \alpha_i < m$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . Then the trace of  $W$  is given by the polynomial*

$$\text{tr}(W) = c \sum_{j=0}^{\lfloor k/2 \rfloor} (-1)^j B_j \lambda^{k-2j},$$

where

$$c = \prod_{j=1}^k \frac{\sin(\alpha_j \pi / m)}{\sin(\pi / m)},$$

$$B_j = \sum_{\{t_1, \dots, t_j\} \in \mathcal{A}(k, j)} \left( \prod_{s=1}^j b(t_s) \right),$$

$$b(j) = \frac{\sin^2(\pi / m) e^{i\pi(\alpha_{j+1} - \alpha_j) / m}}{\sin(\alpha_j \pi / m) \sin(\alpha_{j+1} \pi / m)}.$$

**Proof**

By [12] the trace of  $W(X, Y)$  is determined by the traces of  $X$ ,  $Y$  and  $XY$ , so it is sufficient to work with fixed matrices with the given traces. We define

$$X = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad Y = \begin{pmatrix} e^{i\pi/m} & \lambda \\ 0 & e^{-i\pi/m} \end{pmatrix},$$

Then, for  $1 \leq \alpha \leq m - 1$ ,

$$XY^\alpha = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -e^{-i\alpha\pi/m} \\ e^{i\alpha\pi/m} & p(\alpha)\lambda \end{pmatrix}$$

with  $p(\alpha) = \sin(\alpha\pi/m)/\sin(\pi/m)$ . Now each entry in  $W(X, Y)$  is a sum of terms, each of which is a product of an entry from each of  $XY^{\alpha_j}$  ( $1 \leq j \leq k$ ). The leading monomial of  $\text{tr}(W(X, Y))$  necessarily consists of the product of the lower right entries of the  $XY^{\alpha_j}$ , so is  $c\lambda^k = \prod_{j=1}^k p(\alpha_j)\lambda^k$ , as claimed. Each term contributing to the  $\lambda^{k-2j}$  monomial can be obtained from  $c$  by replacing each of  $j$  (non-overlapping) pairs of (cyclically) consecutive lower right entries by the upper right entry of the first member of the pair, followed by the lower left entry of the second member. Such a term is thus equal to  $cb(s_1) \cdots b(s_j)$  for some  $\{s_1, \dots, s_j\} \in \mathcal{A}(k, j)$ , and the result follows.  $\square$

**Sketch proof of Theorem 1**

Let

$$G = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^6 = w(x, y)^2 = 1 \rangle,$$

$$\overline{G} = \langle x, y \mid x^2 = y^3 = \overline{w}(x, y)^2 = 1 \rangle,$$

where  $w(x, y) = xy^{\alpha_1} \dots xy^{\alpha_k}$ ,  $\overline{w}(x, y) = xy^{\beta_1} \dots xy^{\beta_k}$  where for  $1 \leq i \leq k$ ,  $\beta_i = \alpha_i \bmod 3$ , and  $k > 3$ . Let  $\tau(\lambda), \sigma(\mu)$  denote the trace polynomials of  $G, \overline{G}$  respectively. By Lemma 4 if  $G$  contains no non-abelian free subgroup then the roots of  $\tau$  are among 0, corresponding to an essential representation onto the dihedral group  $D_{12}$ , or  $\pm 1$ , which occur if and only if  $G$  admits an essential cyclic representation.

Suppose first that  $G$  admits an essential cyclic representation, with kernel  $K$ . Then  $\pm 1$  are roots of  $\tau(\lambda)$ . By [13, Theorem 4.8] if 1 or  $-1$  is a repeated root of



$\tau(\lambda)$  then  $G$  has a non-abelian free subgroup. Thus we may assume that  $\tau(\lambda) = c\lambda^{k-2}(\lambda^2 - 1)$  and in particular that  $G$  has an essential representation  $\rho$  onto  $D_{12}$ . Now  $K$  has a deficiency 0 presentation, its abelianization  $K/K'$  is free abelian of rank 3, and conjugation by  $x$  induces the antipodal automorphism on  $K/K'$ . Moreover, a calculation shows that  $\rho(K')$  is a non-trivial abelian subgroup of  $D_{12}$ , so  $K'/K''$  is non-trivial. By [13, Corollary 3.2],  $K'$  (and hence  $G$ ) contains a non-abelian free subgroup.

Hence we may assume that  $G$  has no essential cyclic representations, and thus  $\tau(\lambda) = c\lambda^k$ . Then as in the proof of Theorem 3 equations (8), (9) yield  $(k_2, k_3) = (0, 0), (1, 0), (0, 1)$  and thus  $c = 1, \sqrt{3}, 2$ , respectively. When  $k$  is even the existence of an essential dihedral representation implies that the alternating sum  $\sum_{i=1}^k (-1)^i \alpha_i$  is congruent to 3 modulo 6 and thus  $k_2 = 1, c = \sqrt{3}$ .

We proceed by calculating the coefficients in  $\tau(\lambda), \sigma(\mu)$  and split the proof into three cases, depending on the value of  $c$ . Consider first the form of  $\sigma(\mu)$  in the cases  $c = 1, \sqrt{3}$ . By Lemma 4 and Remark 5 we may assume that the roots of  $\sigma$  are among  $\pm 1, \pm\sqrt{2}, (\pm 1 \pm \sqrt{5})/2, \pm\sqrt{3}, 0$ . If  $\pm 1$  or  $\pm\sqrt{3}$  occurs as a root of  $\sigma$  then  $\overline{G}$  admits an essential representation to  $A_4$  or  $\mathbb{Z}_6$ . In either case  $\sum_{i=1}^k \beta_i = 0 \pmod{3}$ , and we can define a representation  $\rho : G \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}_6$  by  $\rho(x) = 3 \pmod{6}$  and  $\rho(y) = 1 \pmod{6}$ . By assumption,  $\rho$  is not essential, so  $\rho(w) = 0 \pmod{6}$  and  $c = \tau(1) = \pm 2$ , a contradiction. Since  $\sigma$  has rational coefficients we thus have

$$\sigma(\mu) = \mu^r (\mu^2 - 2)^s (\mu^4 - 3\mu^2 + 1)^t \quad (13)$$

where  $r, s, t \geq 0$  satisfy  $r + 2s + 4t = k$ . Since  $\sigma(\sqrt{3}) \in \{\pm 1, \pm\sqrt{3}, \pm 2\}$  we have  $r = 0, 1$ . If  $k$  is even then  $r = 0$ , and (since  $\sum_{i=1}^k (-1)^i \alpha_i$  is congruent to 0 modulo 3) we also have  $\sigma(0) = \pm 2$  so  $s = 1$ .

**Case 1:**  $c = 1$ .

In this case  $k$  is odd and  $\alpha_i \in \{1, 5\}$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . By Lemma 12, the coefficient  $-B_1$  of  $\lambda^{k-2}$  in  $\tau(\lambda)$  is given by  $B_1 = \sum_{i=1}^k b(i)$ , where for each  $1 \leq i \leq k$

$$b(i) := \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } \alpha_i = \alpha_{i+1} \\ \frac{-1+\sqrt{-3}}{2} & \text{if } \alpha_i = 1, \alpha_{i+1} = 5 \\ \frac{-1-\sqrt{-3}}{2} & \text{if } \alpha_i = 5, \alpha_{i+1} = 1 \end{cases}$$

(where  $\alpha_{k+1}$  is defined equal to  $\alpha_1$ ). A similar analysis for  $\sigma(\mu)$  shows that the coefficient  $-B'_1$  of  $\mu^{k-2}$  is given by  $B'_1 = \sum_{i=1}^k b'(i)$  where

$$b'(i) := \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } \beta_i = \beta_{i+1} \\ \frac{1+\sqrt{-3}}{2} & \text{if } \beta_i = 1, \beta_{i+1} = 2 \\ \frac{1-\sqrt{-3}}{2} & \text{if } \beta_i = 2, \beta_{i+1} = 1 \end{cases}$$

Since the coefficient of  $\lambda^{k-2}$  in  $\tau(\lambda)$  is zero, we have that  $k$  is a multiple of 3 – say  $k = 3\ell$  where  $\ell > 1$  – and each possible value of  $b(i)$  occurs precisely  $\ell$  times. It follows that  $B'_1 = 2\ell$ . On the other hand we can compute the coefficient of  $\mu^{k-2}$

in  $\sigma(\mu) = \mu(\mu^2 - 2)^s(\mu^4 - 3\mu^2 + 1)^t$  as  $-2s - 3t$ . We thus obtain the simultaneous diophantine equations

$$1 + 2s + 4t = 3\ell, \quad 2s + 3t = 2\ell, \quad s, t, \geq 0, \ell > 1$$

with the unique solution  $s = 0, t = 2, \ell = 3$ , and so  $k = 9$ .

Now consider the coefficient  $B_2$  of  $\lambda^5$  in  $\tau(\lambda)$  and the coefficient  $B'_2$  of  $\mu^5$  in  $\sigma(\mu)$ . Using Lemma 12 we can deduce

$$2B_2 = B_1^2 - \sum_{i=1}^9 b(i)^2 - 2 \sum_{i=1}^9 b(i)b(i+1)$$

where  $b(10)$  is defined equal to  $b(1)$ . Since  $B_1 = B_2 = 0$  and the  $b(i)$ 's are equally distributed amongst the three possible values it follows that  $\sum_{i=1}^9 b(i)b(i+1) = 0$ .

A similar analysis shows that  $\sum_{i=1}^9 b'(i)^2 = 0$ ,  $\sum_{i=1}^9 b'(i)b'(i+1) = 6$ , from which we can deduce  $B'_2 = 12$ . But the coefficient of  $\mu^5$  in  $\sigma(\mu) = \mu(\mu^4 - 3\mu^2 + 1)^2$  is 11. This contradiction completes Case 1.

**Case 2:**  $c = \sqrt{3}$ .

Then  $\alpha_i \in \{1, 5\}$  for all but one value of  $i$ , for which  $\alpha_i \in \{2, 4\}$ . Without loss of generality we may assume that  $\alpha_k = 2$  and  $\alpha_i \in \{1, 5\}$  for  $1 \leq i < k$ . As in Case 1, consideration of the coefficient of  $\lambda^{k-2}$  in  $\tau(\lambda)$  and of  $\mu^{k-2}$  in  $\sigma(\mu)$  yield diophantine equations in  $s, t, k$ . We find that the only solutions with  $k > 3$  are (i)  $s = 2, t = 0, k = 5$ ; (ii)  $s = 0, t = 2, k = 9$ ; (iii)  $s = 1, t = 2, k = 11$ ; (iv)  $s = 0, t = 4, k = 17$ ; (v)  $s = 0, t = 2, k = 8$ . We can rule out solution (v) since  $k$  is even and  $s \neq 1$ .

For the remaining solutions, consideration of the coefficient of  $\lambda^{k-4}$  in  $\tau(\lambda)$  and the coefficient of  $\mu^{k-4}$  in  $\sigma(\mu)$  yield additional diophantine equations which reduce us to solution (i). A computer search reveals that the only word  $w(x, y)$  (up to cyclic permutation, inversion, and automorphisms of  $\langle y \mid y^6 = 1 \rangle$ ) such that  $\tau(\lambda), \sigma(\mu)$  are of the required form is  $w(x, y) = xy^5xyxy^5xy^2$ . A calculation in GAP [10] shows that in this case  $G$  has a subgroup of index 6 admitting a free homomorphic image of rank 2.

**Case 3:**  $c = 2$ .

In this case  $k$  is odd, the  $\alpha_i$  are all odd, and  $\alpha_i = 3$  for precisely one value of  $i$ . Without loss of generality we may assume that  $\alpha_k = 3$  and  $\alpha_i \in \{1, 5\}$  for  $1 \leq i < k$ . Again, the coefficient  $-B_1$  of  $\lambda^{k-2}$  is given by  $B_1 = \sum_{i=1}^k b(i)$  where  $b(i)$  is as in Case 1 for  $i < k - 1$ ,

$$b(k-1) := \begin{cases} \frac{1+\sqrt{-3}}{4} & \text{if } \alpha_{k-1} = 1 \\ \frac{1-\sqrt{-3}}{4} & \text{if } \alpha_{k-1} = 5 \end{cases}$$

and

$$b(k) := \begin{cases} \frac{1-\sqrt{-3}}{4} & \text{if } \alpha_1 = 1 \\ \frac{1+\sqrt{-3}}{4} & \text{if } \alpha_1 = 5 \end{cases}$$

Note that  $b(1), \dots, b(k-2)$  are algebraic integers. From the equation  $B_1 = 0$  it follows that  $b(k-1) + b(k)$  is also an algebraic integer, and this can only happen if  $\alpha_1 + \alpha_{k-1} = 6$ . Assume inductively that  $\alpha_t + \alpha_{k-t} = 6$  (and hence  $b(k-t) = b(t-1)$ , where  $b(0)$  is defined equal to  $b(k)$ ) for  $1 \leq t < u$ , for some  $u \leq (k-1)/2$ . Then from the equation  $B_u = 0$  it turns out that  $b(k-u) + b(u-1)$  is an algebraic integer, and this can only happen if  $\alpha_u + \alpha_{k-u} = 6$ .

Thus  $\alpha_t + \alpha_{k-t} = 6$  for all  $1 \leq t \leq (k-1)/2$ , so the third relator of  $G$  has the form  $(U(x, y)xU(x, y)^{-1}y^3)^2$  for some word  $U$ . In passing to  $\overline{G}$ , we kill  $y^3$ , so the relator collapses to  $x^2$ , and  $\overline{G} \cong \mathbb{Z}_2 * \mathbb{Z}_3$ . Hence  $\overline{G}$ , and so also  $G$ , contains a non-abelian free subgroup, as claimed.  $\square$

## References

- [1] O.A. Barkovich and V.V. Benyash-Krivets. On Tits alternative for generalized triangular groups of (2,6,2) type (Russian). *Dokl. Nat. Akad. Nauk. Belarusi*, 48(3):28–33, 2003.
- [2] Gilbert Baumslag, John W. Morgan, and Peter B. Shalen. Generalized triangle groups. *Math. Proc. Cambridge Philos. Soc.*, 102(1):25–31, 1987.
- [3] V.V. Benyash-Krivets. On free subgroups of certain generalised triangle groups (Russian). *Dokl. Nat. Akad. Nauk. Belarusi*, 47(3):14–17, 2003.
- [4] V.V. Benyash-Krivets. On Rosenberger’s conjecture for generalized triangle groups of types (2, 10, 2) and (2, 20, 2). In Shyam L. Kalla et al., editor, *Proceedings of the international conference on mathematics and its applications*, pages 59–74. Kuwait Foundation for the Advancement of Sciences, 2005.
- [5] V.V. Benyash-Krivets and O.A. Barkovich. On the Tits alternative for some generalized triangle groups. *Algebra Discrete Math.*, 2004(2):23–43, 2004.
- [6] Robert Bieri and Ralph Strebel. Valuations and finitely presented metabelian groups. *Proc. London Math. Soc. (3)*, 41(3):439–464, 1980.
- [7] H.S.M. Coxeter and W.O.J. Moser. *Generators and relations for discrete groups*. Ergeb. Math. Grenzgebiete. Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg-New York, 1972.
- [8] Benjamin Fine, Frank Levin, and Gerhard Rosenberger. Free subgroups and decompositions of one-relator products of cyclics. I. The Tits alternative. *Arch. Math. (Basel)*, 50(2):97–109, 1988.
- [9] Benjamin Fine, Frank Roehl, and Gerhard Rosenberger. The Tits alternative for generalized triangle groups. In Young Gheol et al. Baik, editor, *Groups - Korea '98. Proceedings of the 4th international conference, Pusan, Korea, August 10-16, 1998.*, pages 95–131. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter., 2000.

- [10] The GAP Group. *GAP – Groups, Algorithms, and Programming, Version 4.4*, 2004. (<http://www.gap-system.org>).
- [11] I. S. Gradshteyn and I. M. Ryzhik. *Table of integrals, series, and products*. Academic Press Inc., Boston, MA, fifth edition, 1994. Translation edited and with a preface by Alan Jeffrey.
- [12] Robert D. Horowitz. Characters of free groups represented in the two-dimensional special linear group. *Comm. Pure Appl. Math.*, 25:635–649, 1972.
- [13] James Howie. Free subgroups in groups of small deficiency. *J. Group Theory*, 1(1):95–112, 1998.
- [14] Frank Levin and Gerhard Rosenberger. On free subgroups of generalized triangle groups. II. In *Group theory (Granville, OH, 1992)*, pages 206–228. World Sci. Publishing, River Edge, NJ, 1993.
- [15] Gerhard Rosenberger. On free subgroups of generalized triangle groups. *Algebra i Logika*, 28(2):227–240, 245, 1989.
- [16] Alun G.T. Williams. Generalised triangle groups of type  $(2, m, 2)$ . In M. Atkinson et al, editor, *Computational and Geometric Aspects of Modern Algebra, LMS Lecture Note Series 275*, pages 265–279. Cambridge University Press, 2000.

**Author addresses:**

James Howie  
 School of Mathematical and Computer Sciences  
 Heriot-Watt University  
 Edinburgh EH14 4AS  
 J.Howie@hw.ac.uk

Gerald Williams  
 Institute of Mathematics, Statistics and Actuarial Science  
 University of Kent  
 Canterbury  
 Kent CT2 7NF  
 g.williams@kent.ac.uk