玉 际 投 资 条 约 中 公 正 与 公 平 待 遇 标 准 的 新

黄 玉 梅

发展

指导教师:陈辉萍副

学校编码: 10384

学号: 200308110

分类号_____密级____ UDC

度の大了

硕 士 学 位 论 文

国际投资条约中公正与公平 待遇标准的新发展

New Developments of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in International Investment Agreements

黄玉梅

指导教师姓名: 陈辉萍 副教授

专业名称: 国际法学

论文提交日期: 2006 年 4 月

论文答辩时间: 2006 年 月

学位授予日期: 2006 年 月

答辩委员会主席:_____

评 阅 人:_____

厦门大学学位论文原创性声明

兹呈交的学位论文,是本人在导师指导下独立完成的研究成果。本人在论文 写作中参考的其他个人或集体的研究成果,均在文中以明确方式标明。本人依法 享有和承担由此论文产生的权利和责任。

声明人(签名):

年 月 日

厦门大学学位论文著作权使用声明

本人完全了解厦门大学有关保留、使用学位论文的规定。厦门大学有权保留并向国家主管部门或其指定机构送交论文的纸质版和电子版,有权将学位论文用于非赢利目的的少量复制并允许论文进入学校图书馆被查阅,有权将学位论文的内容编入有关数据库进行检索,有权将学位论文的标题和摘要汇编出版。保密的学位论文在解密后适用本规定。

本学位论文属于

- 1、保密(),在年解密后适用本授权书。
- 2、不保密()

(请在以上相应括号内打"√")

作者签名: 日期: 年 月 日

导师签名: 日期: 年 月 日

内容摘要

公正与公平待遇标准是国际投资条约中普遍采纳的一项投资待遇标准,但是不同的国家和学者对该标准的含义一直存在观点分歧。从北美自由贸易协定 (North American Free Trade Agreement,以下简称 NAFTA)生效后依据 NAFTA 第 11 章提起的仲裁案例开始,该标准成为国际投资条约中最具争议的问题之一。上述仲裁案例直接促使公正与公平待遇标准在晚近有了重大的发展。研究该标准有助于更好地利用国际投资法制为我国的经济发展服务。

本文除引言及结论外共分为四章。

第一章回顾公正与公平待遇标准的历史发展脉络,即该标准的起源及其随后向多边领域及双边领域逐渐推广适用的情况,然后分析不同国家和学者对该标准 含义的理论分歧及该标准在国际投资条约中的作用。

第二章研究公正与公平待遇标准在仲裁实践中的适用情形,包括依据 NAFTA 第 11 章规定提起的仲裁案例以及依双边投资条约产生的案例。通过分析 若干典型的仲裁案例,归纳出公正与公平待遇标准的核心问题。

第三章分析公正与公平待遇标准晚近的新发展。美国与加拿大吸取 NAFTA 第 11 章仲裁的经验和教训对各自的双边投资条约范本中的相关条款作出重大修改,本文详细分析导致这些修改的更深层次的原因,总结了上述修改的特点,并探讨这些新规定仍然存在的问题。

第四章概述公正与公平待遇在中国签订的投资协定中所处的地位,分析相关规定所存在的问题及中国将面临的潜在风险,探讨中国应采取的应对措施。本文认为,美国和加拿大对条约范本的若干修改以及仲裁实践中的某些策略值得我国借鉴与学习。

关键词:公正与公平待遇:国际投资条约

ABSTRACT

The concept of "fair and equitable treatment" now occupies a position of prominence in International Investment Agreements (IIAs). However, there are always academic differences as to the precise meaning of the term "fair and equitable treatment". Moreover, after NAFTA became effective, and particularly when many disputes were raised for arbitration according to NAFTA Chapter 11, fair and equitable treatment standard has become one of the most conflicting parts in IIAs. Learning lessons from relevant cases in the arbitral practice, U.S. and Canada has greatly changed the provisions as to fair and equitable treatment standard in their new Modal BIT and FIPA respectively. In the interest of China, it is necessary to study on fair and equitable treatment standard.

This dissertation consists of 4 chapters in addition to Preface and Conclusion.

Chapter 1 reviews the genesis of fair and equitable treatment standard, that is, the origins of the standard and its current use in IIAs. Then the chapter analyses the academic differences on the meaning of the standard, and the role of the standard in IIAs.

Chapter 2 deals with the use of fair and equitable treatment standard in arbitral practice, including its use in both NAFTA Chapter 11 arbitration and BITs arbitration. After analyzing several typical cases, the chapter sums up the issues in application of fair and equitable treatment standard.

Chapter 3 analyses the recent developments of fair and equitable treatment standard. U.S. and Canada have learned lessons from their practice in NAFTA, and made great changes of the provisions as to fair and equitable treatment standard in their new Model BIT and FIPA respectively. The chapter focuses on the underlying reasons for the developments of fair and equitable treatment standard, and then sums up the characteristics of those new provisions. Lastly, the chapter probes into the potential problems of the new provisions as to the standard.

Chapter 4 gives an overview of the provisions as to fair and equitable treatment standard in China's IIAs. Then the chapter analyses the defects of those provisions and the risks China may be confronted with. Lastly, the chapter sums up revelations to China, which are drawn from the use of the standard in arbitral practice and the new

provisions in U.S. new Model BIT and Canada FIPA.

Key Word: Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard; International Investment Agreements.



缩略语表 Abbreviations

BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty 双边投资条约
FCN	Friendship, Commerce and Navigation 友好通商航海条约
FIPA	Foreign Investment Protection and Promotion Agreement 投资保护与促进协定
FTC	Free Trade Committee 自由贸易委员会
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce 国际商会
IIA	International Investment Agreement 国际投资条约
MIGA	Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency 多边投资担保机构
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement 北美自由贸易协定
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development 经济合作与发展组织
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development 联合国贸易与发展会议
UNCTC	United Nations Code of Conduct on Transnational Corporations 联合国跨国公司行动守则

案例表 Table of Cases

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
Azinian Case	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/97/2.Robert Azinian and
Azinian Case	others v. United Mexican States, November 1, 1999.
Matalalad Casa	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/97/1.Metalclad Corporation
Metalclad Case	v. United Mexican States, August 30, 2000.
C.D.M.vara Casa	ICSID Case. S.D.Myers, Inc. v. Canada, November 12,
S.D.Myers Case	2000.
Pana & Talbat Casa	ICSID Case. Pope & Talbot v. Canada, April 10, 2001,
Pope & Talbot Case	May 31, 2002.
Mondev Case	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/99/2. Mondev International
Wiondev Case	Ltd. v. U.S.A., October 11, 2002.
ADF Case	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/00/1. ADF Group Inc. v.
ADI Casc	U.S.A., January 9, 2003.
Lowen Case	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/98/3. Lowen Group Inc. v.
Lowen Case	U.S.A., June 25, 2003.
Waste Management Case	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/00/3. Waste Management,
waste Management Case	Inc. v. United Mexican States, April 30, 2004.
GAMI Case	ICSID Case. GAMI Investments Inc. v. United Mexican
Gravit Guse	States, 15 November, 2004.
Maffezini Case	ICSID Case No. ARB/97/7. Emilio Agustín Maffezini V.
Truirezini cuse	The Kingdom of Spain, November 13, 2000.
	ICSID Case No. ARB/99/2. Alex Genin, Eastern Credit
Genin Case	Limited, Inc. And A.S. Baltoil V. The Republic of
	Estonia, June 25, 2001.
Middle East Cement	ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6. Middle East Cement
Case	Shipping and Handling Co. S.A. v. Arab Republic of
	Egypt, April 12, 2002.
	ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/00/2. Tecnicas
Tecmed Case	Medioambientales Tecmed S.A. V. The United Mexican
	States, May 29, 2003.
MTD Case	ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7. MTD Equity Sdn. Bhd. and
1.112 3400	MTD Chile S.A. v. Republic of Chile, May 25, 2004.

目 录

引	言		1
第-	一章	公正与公平待遇标准的缘起与评析	2
第一	一节	公正与公平待遇标准的缘起	2
	一、	公正与公平待遇标准的起源	2
	二、	公正与公平待遇标准的推广适用	4
第二		公正与公平待遇标准评析	9
		公正与公平待遇标准含义的理论分歧	
	二、	公正与公平待遇标准的作用	11
第-	二章	公正与公平待遇标准在仲裁实践中的适用	13
第一	一节	NAFTA 第 11 章仲裁案例涉及公正与公平待遇标准的问题	13
	一、	NAFTA 对公正与公平待遇标准的规定	13
	二、	NAFTA 第 11 章仲裁案例对公正与公平待遇标准含义的探索 15	
第二	二节	公正与公平待遇标准在双边投资条约仲裁案例中的适用······	21
	一、	透明度义务与保护投资者合法预期的义务	22
	二、	程序公正原则	23
	三人	善意原则	24
第三	三节	公正与公平待遇标准适用中的焦点问题	25
	一、	公正与公平待遇标准的独立性问题	25
V	二、	"国际法"的解释问题	26
第三	三章	公正与公平待遇标准的新发展	29
第一	一节	美国、加拿大双边投资条约中公正与公平待遇的新规定	29
	— ,	美国、加拿大新双边投资条约范本中公正与公平待遇标准的新发展::2	29
	Ξ,	美国新双边投资条约范本中的独特创新	32
第二	二节	公正与公平待遇标准新发展评析	35
	—,	公正与公平待遇标准新发展的原因	35

国际投资条约中公正与公平待遇标准的新发展

_,	公正与公平待遇标准新发展的特点 37	
第三节	公正与公平待遇标准新规定的潜在问题 38	
一,	公正与公平待遇标准的具体内容39	
二、	公正与公平待遇标准新规定与最惠国待遇之间的矛盾39	
第四章	公正与公平待遇标准的新发展对中国的启示40	
第一节	中国签订的双边投资条约中公正与公平待遇标准的规定存在的	
	问题40	
一,	中国签订的双边投资条约中关于公正与公平待遇的规定不统一41	
<u> </u>	投资者—国家仲裁条款的适用范围大为扩展42	
第二节	中国面临的潜在风险43	
第三节	中国应采取的应对措施44	
一,	明确公正与公平待遇标准的适用原则44	
二、	明确公正与公平待遇标准的适用范围45	
结语	47	
参考文献		

CONTENTS

Preface		··· 1
Chapter 1	The Genesis and Comments on Fair and	,
	Equitable Treatment Standard	2
Subchapter 1	The Genesis of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	··· 2
Section 1	Origins of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	2
Section 2	Spread of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	4
Subchapter 2	Comments on Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	9
Section 1	Academic Differences on the Meaning of Fair and Equitable	
	Treatment Standard	9
Section 2	The Role of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	
Chapter 2	Use of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in	
	Arbitral Practice	13
Subchapter 1	Use of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in NAFTA	
	Chapter 11 Arbitration	13
Section 1	Provisions as to Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in	
	NAFTA ·····	13
Section 2	Quest for the Meaning of Fair and Equitable Treatment	
	Standard in NAFTA Chapter 11 Arbitration	15
Subchapter 2	Use of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in BITs	
	Arbitral Practice	··· 21
Section 1	Transparency and Protection of the Investor's Legitimate	
1-	Expectations	22
Section 2	Due Process	23
Section 3	Good Faith ····	24
Subchapter 3	The Issues in Application of Fair and Equitable Treatment	
	Standard	25
Section 1	Whether Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard Is A Distinct	
	Concept?	25

Section 2	Interpretation of "International Law"
Chapter 3	New Developments of Fair and Equitable Treatment
	Standard
Subchapter 1	New Provisions as to Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard
	in U.S. Model BIT and Canada New FIPA29
Section 1	Changes of the Provisions as to Fair and Equitable Treatment
	Standard in U.S. Model BIT and Canada New FIPA29
Section 2	Unique Changes of the Provisions as to Fair and
	Equitable Treatment Standard in U.S. Model BIT32
Subchapter 2	Comments on Developments of Fair and Equitable Treatment
	Standard
Section 1	Reasons for the Developments of Fair and Equitable
	Treatment Standard35
Section 2	Characteristics of the Developments of Fair and Equitable
	Treatment Standard
Subchapter 3	Potential Problems of New Provisions as to Fair and Equitable
	Treatment Standard
Section 1	The Content of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard 39
Section 2	The Interaction between the New Provisions of Fair and Equitable
	Treatment Standard and the "Most-Favored-Nation" Clause39
Chapter 4	Inspirations of the Developments of Fair and
	Equitable Treatment Standard for China 40
Subchapter 1	Defects of Provisions as to Fair and Equitable Treatment
	Standard in China's BITs
Section 1	Provisions as to Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in China's
BITs are Confli	icted41
Section 2	Enlargement of the scope of application of Investor- State
	Arbitration in China's BITs42
Subchapter 2	The Risks of Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard in
	China's BITs
Subchapter 3	Inspirations of the Developments of Fair and Equitable
	Treatment Standard for China

Degree papers are in the "Xiamen University Electronic Theses and Dissertations Database". Full texts are available in the following ways:

- 1. If your library is a CALIS member libraries, please log on http://etd.calis.edu.cn/ and submit requests online, or consult the interlibrary loan department in your library.
- 2. For users of non-CALIS member libraries, please mail to etd@xmu.edu.cn for delivery details.

