

LEARNING TO COMMUNICATE CLINICAL REASONING IN PHYSIOTHERAPY PRACTICE

ROLA AJJAWI

BAppSc(Physiotherapy)Hons

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Sydney

2006

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	ii
PUBLICATIONS ARISING FROM THIS RESEARCH	vi
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
LIST OF TABLES	ix
ABSTRACT.....	x
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 THE RESEARCH TOPIC.....	1
1.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS	3
1.3 CONTEXT AND BOUNDARIES OF THIS RESEARCH.....	3
1.4 KEY DIMENSIONS OF THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....	5
1.5 OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH APPROACH	7
1.6 SIGNIFICANCE AND LIMITATION OF THIS RESEARCH	8
1.7 CONTRIBUTION OF THIS THESIS	10
1.8 STRUCTURE OF THIS THESIS	11
CHAPTER 2: CLINICAL REASONING AND COMMUNICATION.....	12
2.1 THE NATURE AND CONTEXT OF CLINICAL REASONING.....	12
2.1.1 The nature of clinical reasoning.....	12
2.1.2 The context of clinical reasoning.....	14
2.1.3 Clinical reasoning and evidence-based practice	20
2.1.4 Clinical reasoning and communication.....	22
2.2 METHODS OF INVESTIGATING CLINICAL REASONING.....	24
2.3 MODELS OF CLINICAL REASONING IN PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE.....	28
2.3.1 Hypothetico-deductive reasoning	28
2.3.2 Pattern recognition	31
2.3.3 The integrated client-centred model	32
2.3.4 Clinical reasoning as an interpretive process.....	35
2.3.5 Shared decision-making.....	38
2.3.6 Clinical reasoning as judgement making.....	39
2.3.7 Clinical reasoning as a dialogical process and a languaged phenomenon	41
2.3.8 Clinical reasoning in physiotherapy.....	42
2.4 KNOWLEDGE, CLINICAL REASONING AND EXPERTISE.....	48
2.4.1 Expertise in professional practice	48
2.4.2 Forms of knowledge used in clinical reasoning and professional practice	52
2.4.3 The place of knowledge in the development of expertise.....	55
2.5 COMMUNICATION IN PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE	60
2.5.1 The nature of communication	60
2.5.2 Communicating clinical reasoning	62
2.6 SUMMARY	65
CHAPTER 3: APPROACHES TO LEARNING AND TEACHING OF CLINICAL REASONING	66
3.1 HEALTH PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION	69
3.1.1 Context of health professional education.....	69
3.1.2 Goals of health professional education	73

3.1.3	Curriculum design: Strategies to develop clinical reasoning skills	82
3.2	LEARNING AND TEACHING OF CLINICAL REASONING.....	91
3.2.1	Learning	92
3.2.2	Contextualised, participation-focused approaches to learning	101
3.2.3	Summary	113
3.3	STRATEGIES FOR LEARNING AND TEACHING CLINICAL REASONING AND FOR COMMUNICATION OF REASONING.....	114
3.3.1	Strategies used for learning and teaching of clinical reasoning.....	115
3.3.2	Learning to communicate clinical reasoning	121
3.4	SUMMARY	128
CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH APPROACH.....		129
4.1	RESEARCH PURPOSE AND QUESTIONS.....	129
4.2	RESEARCH PARADIGMS.....	131
4.2.1	Description of the interpretive paradigm	132
4.2.2	Rationale for choosing the interpretive paradigm for this research	133
4.3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	135
4.3.1	Description of Hermeneutic Phenomenology	135
4.3.2	Rationale for choosing hermeneutic phenomenology in this research ...	144
4.4	PARTICIPANTS.....	145
4.4.1	Selection.....	145
4.4.2	Recruitment strategies.....	146
4.4.3	Introducing the participants: Experienced physiotherapists	147
4.5	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	151
4.5.1	Informed consent	151
4.5.2	Confidentiality	153
4.6	METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION	153
4.6.1	Details of data collection	154
4.6.2	Data management strategies	163
4.7	METHODS OF DATA ANALYSIS	164
4.7.1	Phenomenological strategies.....	165
4.7.2	Hermeneutic strategies.....	165
4.7.3	Stages of data analysis	165
4.8	ENSURING QUALITY IN INTERPRETIVE RESEARCH.....	169
4.8.1	Rigour	169
4.8.2	Credibility	170
4.9	SUMMARY	172

CHAPTER 5: RESEARCH FINDINGS I: EXPLORING EMBEDDED PHENOMENA	173
5.1 OVERVIEW OF FINDINGS	174
5.1.1 Process of generating findings	174
5.1.2 Defining clinical reasoning	175
5.1.3 Defining communication of clinical reasoning.....	178
5.2 THE CONTEXT OF CLINICAL REASONING AND COMMUNICATION OF REASONING	178
5.3 INTERPRETING THE PHENOMENON OF CLINICAL REASONING.....	201
5.3.1 Dimensions and components of clinical reasoning.....	201
5.3.2 An interpretation of clinical reasoning	219
5.4 INTERPRETING THE PHENOMENON OF COMMUNICATION OF CLINICAL REASONING.....	223
5.4.1 Dimensions and components of communication of clinical reasoning ..	224
5.4.2 An interpretation of communication of clinical reasoning	243
5.5 PARTICIPANTS' INTERPRETATION OF THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN EXPERIENCED AND NOVICE REASONING AND COMMUNICATION OF REASONING	246
5.6 DIFFERENCES IN REASONING AND COMMUNICATION OF REASONING BETWEEN SUB-DISCIPLINES	261
5.7 SUMMARY	263
CHAPTER 6: RESEARCH FINDINGS II: LEARNING TO REASON AND TO COMMUNICATE REASONING.....	264
6.1 DETAILED DESCRIPTIONS OF PARTICIPANTS' JOURNEYS OF LEARNING TO REASON AND TO COMMUNICATE REASONING	265
6.1.1 Chloe's story	266
6.1.2 Melinda's story	267
6.1.3 Nicola's story	268
6.1.4 Key findings from learning journey stories	269
6.2 HOW DID THE PARTICIPANTS LEARN TO PERFORM CLINICAL REASONING AND TO COMMUNICATE THEIR REASONING?.....	276
Theme 1: Learning to reason and to communicate reasoning are situated, embedded and enriched in practice.	279
Theme 2: Professional attributes and responsibilities are drivers of learning to reason and to communicate reasoning.....	283
Theme 3: Communities of practice support, foster and frame the development of clinical reasoning and its communication.....	288
Theme 4: The workplace culture is a major influence on learning to reason and to communicate reasoning.	295
Theme 5: Experiential learning strategies are powerful tools for enhancing clinical reasoning and its communication	300
Theme 6: Self-evaluation and reflection on practice are important strategies to monitor and critique reasoning and communication of reasoning.....	306
Theme 7: Incidents or episodes that promote reflexivity stimulate and deepen learning of clinical reasoning and its communication....	310
6.3 DISCUSSION AND MODEL OF LEARNING TO REASON AND COMMUNICATE REASONING	317
6.4 SUMMARY	322

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS	323
7.1 KEY FINDINGS	323
7.2 LIMITATIONS AND DIRECTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH.....	326
7.3 IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION, PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND PRACTICE	328
7.3.1 Implications for professional entry education.....	328
7.3.2 Implications for professional development for new graduates	331
7.3.3 Implications for professional development for clinical educators and mentors.....	333
7.3.4 Implications for practice and practice management	337
7.4 CONCLUSION	339
REFERENCE LIST.....	340
APPENDICES	364

PUBLICATIONS ARISING FROM THIS RESEARCH

Peer reviewed journal articles

Ajjawi R & Higgs J (2007). Learning clinical reasoning: A journey of professional socialisation. *Advances in Health Sciences Education* pp.1-18 DOI 10.1007/s10459-006-9032-4.

Ajjawi R & Higgs J, Using hermeneutic phenomenology to investigate how experienced practitioners learn to communicate clinical reasoning. *The Qualitative Report* (*accepted*)

Edited book chapters

Ajjawi R & Higgs J (2007) Learning to communicate clinical reasoning. In J Higgs, M Jones, S Loftus and N Christensen (Eds.), *Clinical Reasoning in the Health Professions*, (3rd Ed.). Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Higgs, J., Trede, F., Ajjawi, R., Loftus, S., Smith, M. & Paterson M. Journeys from philosophy and theory to action and back again: Being critical and creative in research design and action. In Higgs, J., Titchen, A., Byrne Armstrong, H. & Horsfall, D. (Eds) *Being Critical and Creative in Qualitative Research* Hampden Press, Sydney (*in press*).

Occasional paper

Higgs J, Trede F, Loftus S, Ajjawi R, Smith M, & Paterson M (2006). *Advancing clinical reasoning: Interpretive research perspectives grounded in professional practice*, CPEA, Occasional paper 4. Collaborations in Practice and Education Advancement, the University of Sydney, Sydney, Australia.

PUBLISHED ABSTRACTS AND CONFERENCE PRESENTATIONS

Higgs J & Ajjawi R (2006), *Advances in Clinical Reasoning*, Paper presented at the APA NSW State Branch Conference: Paving the Way with Evidence, 14th October, Sydney, Australia, p. 14.

Ajjawi R, & Higgs J (2006), Teaching and learning clinical reasoning in physiotherapy practice. *In ANZAME Conference Proceedings: Fill the Gaps*. ANZAME: The Association for Health Professional Education, June 29-July 2, Gold Coast, Australia, p. 141.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2005), Learning to communicate clinical reasoning in Physiotherapy practice. *Higher Degree Research Students Colloquium, Faculty of Health Sciences, The University of Sydney*, Dec 1-2, p.19.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2005), Facilitating learning to reason within communities of practice. *College of Health Sciences EdHealth Conference: Innovation to Practice, The University of Sydney*, 16-17 November, Terrigal, NSW, p.57.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2005), Understanding and learning to reason in cardiothoracic physiotherapy. Australian Physiotherapy Association 9th National Cardiothoracic Conference, October 13-15, Melbourne, VIC, p.61.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2005), Communicating clinical reasoning: a learning challenge. *In ANZAME Conference Proceedings: Mind the Gaps*, ANZAME: The Association for Health Professional Education, June 29-July 2, Auckland, New Zealand, p.18.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, 2005, The challenge of learning to communicate clinical reasoning. *In Dean's Research Seminars: Delivering Better Health Care*, Faculty of Health Sciences, The University of Sydney, May 11, p. 68.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2004), How do experienced physiotherapists learn to communicate clinical reasoning. *In College of Health Sciences Research Conference Proceedings: From Cell to Society Conference*, The University of Sydney, 3-4 November, Leura, Blue Mountains, NSW, p.30-7.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2004), Learning to communicate clinical reasoning within communities of practice – the influence of Vygotsky and Wenger. *In ANZAME Conference Proceedings: Maintaining Momentum: Anticipating, Innovating, Facilitating, Participating, Evaluating*, ANZAME: The Association for Health Professional Education, June 24-27, Flinders Press, Bedford Park, SA, p.18.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2004), Learning to understand and communicate clinical reasoning – a journey of professional socialisation. *In ANZAME Conference Proceedings: Maintaining Momentum: Anticipating, Innovating, Facilitating, Participating, Evaluating*, ANZAME: The Association for Health Professional Education, June 24-27, Flinders Press, Bedford Park, SA, p.17.

Ajjawi R, Higgs J & Hunt A, (2003), Choosing a research method to examine learning to communicate clinical reasoning. *In Australian Qualitative Research Conference Proceedings: Qualitative Research: Creating Spaces for Understanding*, July 16-19, Sydney, Australia, p.30.

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	Context of health professionals' communication of clinical reasoning....	23
Figure 2.2	The revised integrated client-centred model of clinical reasoning, demonstrating six core dimensions of reasoning	34
Figure 2.3	The revised integrated client-centred model of clinical reasoning, demonstrating the cyclical and evolving nature of clinical reasoning	35
Figure 2.4	Revised hypothetico-deductive model of clinical reasoning	45
Figure 2.5	The transactional model of communication which presents communication as a dynamic, context-dependent process	63
Figure 3.1	Proposed theoretical framework for learning to reason and to communicate clinical reasoning	68
Figure 3.2	The characteristics and dimensions of the interactional professional.....	77
Figure 3.3	Generic graduate attributes for the University of Sydney	78
Figure 3.4	Kolb's experiential learning theory of growth and development	100
Figure 3.5	Cognitive apprenticeship: Students' progress from embedded activity to generality	107
Figure 4.1	Flowchart of the research approach adopted in this research	130
Figure 4.2	The basic form of the hermeneutic circle	138
Figure 5.1	Context dimensions influencing clinical reasoning and communication of clinical reasoning	180
Figure 5.2	Diagrammatic representation of clinical reasoning derived from my research findings	221
Figure 5.3	Diagrammatic representation of communication of clinical reasoning derived from my research findings.....	245
Figure 6.1	Chloe's timelines for learning to reason and to communicate reasoning	266*
Figure 6.2	Melinda's timelines for learning to reason and to communicate reasoning	267*
Figure 6.3	Nicole's timelines for learning to reason and to communicate reasoning	268*
Figure 6.4	Themes related to learning to reason and to communicate clinical reasoning	277
Figure 6.5	Cross-sectional view of model of learning to reason and to communicate reasoning showing the themes and meta-themes	320

*These figures are located on the page facing the page number indicated here.

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	Types of professional judgement	41
Table 2.2	Clinical reasoning hypothesis categories	43
Table 2.3	Clinical reasoning strategies identified in physiotherapy practice	47
Table 2.4	Levels of evidence	54
Table 3.1	Definitions of professional socialisation.....	105
Table 4.1	Participants' relevant background information at the commencement of data collection in order of participant recruitment ...	149
Table 4.2	Summary of relevant background of participants at the commencement of data collection according to sub-discipline	150
Table 4.3	Stages of data analysis developed for this research.....	166
Table 5.1	Participants' initial interpretations of clinical reasoning	177
Table 5.2	Dimensions and components of context that influence and impact on clinical reasoning and communication of reasoning.....	179
Table 5.3	Participants' understanding and performance of clinical reasoning in terms of core dimensions and components	202
Table 5.4	Core dimensions and components of participants' communication of clinical reasoning.....	225
Table 5.5	Participants' interpretation of the differences between experienced and novice reasoning based on the core dimensions of reasoning and context dimensions identified above.....	247
Table 5.6	Stages of development of key areas of professional practice: Knowledge and clinical reasoning performance, learning and communication	259
Table 6.1	Themes and sub-themes for how experienced physiotherapists learn to reason and to communicate reasoning	278
Table 7.1	Themes for how experienced physiotherapists learn to reason and to communicate reasoning	323
Table 7.2	Guidelines for effective communication of clinical reasoning with patients (and caregivers)	332
Table 7.3	Guidelines for effective communication of clinical reasoning with novice physiotherapists	335

ABSTRACT

Effective clinical reasoning and its communication are essential to health professional practice, especially in the current health care climate. Increasing litigation leading to legal requirements for comprehensive, relevant and appropriate information exchange between health professionals and patients (including their caregivers) and the drive for active consumer involvement are two key factors that underline the importance of clear communication and collaborative decision making. Health professionals are accountable for their decisions and service provision to various stakeholders, including patients, health sector managers, policy-makers and colleagues. An important aspect of this accountability is the ability to clearly articulate and justify management decisions.

Considerable research across the health disciplines has investigated the nature of clinical reasoning and its relationship with knowledge and expertise. However, physiotherapy research literature to date has not specifically addressed the interaction between communication and clinical reasoning in practice, neither has it explored modes and patterns of learning that facilitate the acquisition of this complex skill. The purpose of this research was to contribute to the profession's knowledge base a greater understanding of how experienced physiotherapists having learned to reason, then learn to communicate their clinical reasoning with patients and with novice physiotherapists.

Informed by the interpretive paradigm, a hermeneutic phenomenological research study was conducted using multiple methods of data collection including observation, written reflective exercises and repeated semi-structured interviews. Data were analysed using phenomenological and hermeneutic strategies involving in-depth, iterative reading and interpretation to identify themes in the data. Twelve physiotherapists with clinical and supervisory experience were recruited from the areas of cardiopulmonary, musculoskeletal and neurological physiotherapy to participate in this study.

Participants' learning journeys were diverse, although certain factors and episodes of learning were common or similar. Participation with colleagues, peers and students, where the participants felt supported and guided in their learning, was a powerful way to learn to reason and to communicate reasoning. Experiential learning strategies, such as

guidance, observation, discussion and feedback were found to be effective in enhancing learning of clinical reasoning and its communication. The cultural and environmental context created and supported by the practice community (which includes health professionals, patients and caregivers) was found to influence the participants' learning of clinical reasoning and its communication. Participants reported various incidents that raised their awareness of their reasoning and communication abilities, such as teaching students on clinical placements, and informal discussions with peers about patients; these were linked with periods of steep learning of both abilities.

Findings from this research present learning to reason and to communicate reasoning as journeys of professional socialisation that evolve through higher education and in the workplace. A key finding that supports this view is that clinical reasoning and its communication are embedded in the context of professional practice and therefore are best learned in this context of becoming, and developing as, a member of the profession. Communication of clinical reasoning was found to be both an inherent part of reasoning and an essential and complementary skill necessary for sound reasoning, that was embedded in the contextual demands of the task and situation. In this way clinical reasoning and its communication are intertwined and should be learned concurrently. The learning and teaching of clinical reasoning and its communication should be synergistic and integrated; contextual, meaningful and reflexive.