

Integrating Manufacturing Issues into Structural Optimization

Andrew Charles Barton, B.E. (Aero) Hons.

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy



School of Aerospace, Mechanical and Mechatronic Engineering
The University of Sydney

February 2002

Abstract

This dissertation aims to advance the field of structural optimization by creating and demonstrating new methodologies for the explicit inclusion of manufacturing issues. The case of composite aerospace structures was a main focus of this work as that field provides some of the greatest complexities in manufacturing yet also provides the greatest incentives to optimize structural performance.

Firstly, the possibilities for modifying existing FEA based structural optimization methods to better capture manufacturing constraints are investigated. Examples of brick-based topology optimization, shell-based topology optimization, parametric sizing optimization and manufacturing process optimization are given. From these examples, a number of fundamental limitations to these methods were observed and are discussed. The key limitation that was uncovered related to a dichotomy between analytical methods (such as FEA) and CAD-type methods.

Based on these observations, a new Knowledge-Based framework for structural optimization was suggested whereby manufacturing issues are integrally linked to the more conventional structural issues. A prototype system to implement this new framework was developed and is discussed. Finally, the validity of the framework was demonstrated by application to a generic composite rib design problem.

Acknowledgements

Firstly I wish to thank my supervisor Professor Grant Steven for his guidance, motivation and for providing a role model of a successful engineering researcher. I would also like to thank John Raju, Don Kelly, Rob Ness, Andrew Lindsay and Stuart Dutton of the CRC-ACS for their support during my research.

Finally, I thank my family for their support, both direct and indirect over the 3 years of this Ph.D and earlier. In particular, I owe my parents a great deal for shaping and fine-tuning my intellectual abilities and encouraging both creativity and rigor in my work.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1	Introduction	1
1.1	Structural Optimization	1
1.1.1	Applications	1
1.1.2	Methods	3
1.2	The Cooperative Research Centre for Advanced Composite Structures (CRC-ACS)	4
1.3	Manufacturing Issues in Engineering Design	4
1.3.1	Common Issues in Manufacturing	5
1.3.2	Concurrent Engineering	6
1.4	Composites and Other Thin Panel Structures	6
1.4.1	Mechanical Behaviour	7
1.4.2	Manufacturing	7
1.5	Research Scope	8
1.6	Thesis Layout	9
Chapter 2	3D Topology Optimization with Bricks	12
2.1	Spoiler Interior Structure Optimization	12
2.1.1	Spoiler Design Problem	13
2.1.2	Efficient Computations	14
2.1.3	The Density Method	15
2.2	Methodology	17
2.2.1	Finite Element Models	17
2.2.2	Visualization of Results	18
2.2.3	The Checkerboard Fill-In Algorithm	19
2.3	Investigations	20
2.3.1	Variation of Mesh Dimensions and Volume Constraint	20
2.3.2	Surface Coverage	22

2.3.3	Specific Stiffness	23
2.3.4	Recognizable Internal Members	24
2.4	Conclusion	26
2.4.1	Selection of a Best Design	26
2.4.2	Discussion on the Methodology	29
Chapter 3	3D Topology Optimization with Shells	32
3.1	Introduction	32
3.1.1	Reasons to Minimize Material Usage	32
3.1.2	Evolutionary Structural Optimization	33
3.1.3	The Milk Crate Design Problem	35
3.2	Optimization Approach	36
3.2.1	The Initial Design Model	36
3.2.2	Loads and Boundary Conditions for the FEA Modeling	36
3.3	Results	38
3.3.1	The Theoretical Optimal Design	38
3.3.2	Interpreting the Results into a Real Design	39
3.3.3	Comparison with Existing Design	40
3.4	Conclusion	42
Chapter 4	Parametric Sizing Optimization	44
4.1	Introduction	44
4.1.1	Spoiler Design Assumptions	44
4.1.2	Sizing Optimization	45
4.1.3	Group ESO	45
4.2	Methodology	47
4.2.1	Problem Formulation	47
4.2.2	Optimization Approach	48
4.3	Computations	50

4.3.1	Modeling Approximations	51
4.3.2	ANSYS Optimizer Settings	51
4.4	Trial Configurations	52
4.5	Results	54
4.6	Conclusion	56
Chapter 5	Cost Modeling for Composite Manufacturing	59
5.1	Important Issues in Composite Manufacturing	59
5.1.1	Complexity	60
5.1.2	Constraints	60
5.1.3	Company Specific Approaches	62
5.1.4	Cost	62
5.2	Review of the PCAD Database	64
5.2.1	Methodology	64
5.2.2	CRC-ACS Utilization of PCAD	66
5.3	Advanced Cost Modeling	66
5.3.1	Computer Aided Process Planning	66
5.3.2	Non-Discrete Methods	68
5.3.3	Feature-Based Methods	69
5.3.4	Highly Integrated Production Modeling Applications	70
5.4	The Process Link Program	71
5.4.1	Methodology	71
5.4.2	CRC-ACS Response to Process Link	74
5.5	Conclusion	76
Chapter 6	Integration Issues	79
6.1	Interfacing of CAE Software	79
6.1.1	Effectively Linking CAE Software for Composites	80
6.1.2	Current Limitations	80

6.1.3	Dichotomy Between Analysis and Manufacturing Models	82
6.2	STAndards for the Exchange of Product Data (STEP)	83
6.2.1	The EXPRESS Language	84
6.2.2	STEP Application Protocols	84
6.3	New Approaches	85
6.3.1	Feature-Based Methods	85
6.3.2	Feature Recognition	86
6.3.3	Knowledge-Based Methods	87
6.4	An Integrated Concurrent Optimization Environment	90
6.4.1	Geometric Modeling	90
6.4.2	Mathematics Libraries	91
6.4.3	Customization in CAE Software	91
6.4.4	Customization through Programming	93
6.4.5	Knowledge Flow	95
6.5	Conclusion	96
Chapter 7	Concurrent Composite Structural Optimization	99
7.1	Methodology	99
7.1.1	System Architecture	100
7.1.2	Use of EXPRESS-2	101
7.1.3	The In-Built Geometric Modeler	102
7.1.4	Knowledge Library	103
7.1.5	Functions	103
7.2	Demonstration: Customized Geometric Features	104
7.2.1	The Rib Entity	104
7.2.2	Building the Rib: Initial Stages	106
7.2.3	Building the Rib: Constructing Mouse Holes	108
7.2.4	Building the Rib: Swages and Gang Cleats	110
7.3	Knowledge-Based Process Modeling	111
7.3.1	The Process Model Entity	111
7.3.2	Decision Graph Algorithm	113

7.3.3	Process Selection Algorithm	115
7.3.4	Process Cost Modeling	116
7.4	Highly Automated Finite Element Analysis	117
7.4.1	The ANSYS FEA Model Entity	118
7.4.2	Finite Element Analysis	119
7.5	Conclusion	120
7.5.1	Improved Rib Models	121
7.5.2	Improvements to the System	122
Chapter 8	Conclusion	124
8.1	Extensions to Existing Methods	124
8.1.1	Topology Optimization	124
8.1.2	Sizing Optimization	125
8.1.3	Metrics for Comparing Structural Optimization Results	126
8.1.4	Manufacturing Optimization	127
8.2	Research into Advanced Methodologies	128
8.2.1	Feature-Based and Knowledge-Based Methods	128
8.2.2	Better Integration	129
8.2.3	Flexible Knowledge-Based CAE	130
8.3	Future Directions	131
8.3.1	Top-Down vs Bottom-Up	131
8.3.2	Roles of Humans and Computers	133
8.3.3	High Volume Knowledge-Based Systems	133
8.3.4	Integration of Mixed Models	134
8.4	Recommendations	135
8.4.1	General Recommendations	135
8.4.2	CRC-ACS Recommendations	136

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A	Review of the GENESIS Software	138
A.1	Introduction	138
A.2	Capabilities	138
A.3	Limitations	139
A.4	Conclusion	140
APPENDIX B	Topology Optimization Control Strategies	142
B.1	Existing Methods	142
B.2	Possible Novel Methods	144
APPENDIX C	Review of the CATIA V5 Software	151
C.1	Methodology of Knowledge Capturing	151
C.2	Other Features	153
C.3	A Test of Flexibility	154
C.4	Conclusion	159
APPENDIX D	In-Built Geometric Entities Used in Chapter 7	159
D.1	POINT	159
D.2	POLY_LOOP	159
D.3	FACE_BOUND	160
D.4	FACE	160
APPENDIX E	EXPRESS-2 Rib Entities	161
APPENDIX F	EXPRESS-2 Rib Functions	166
F.1	Mouse Hole Build Function	166
F.2	Decision Graph Solver	168
F.3	Process Model Builder	170