

# **DISEASE EXPLICATED**

**and**

# ***DISEASE DEFINED***

*Thesis presented to the University of Sydney*

for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

by

**Charles Raymond Pax George**

2005

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I gratefully acknowledge the original stimulus that the late Dr David Perry gave me to think about the idea of defining disease, the assistance that Dr John Ledingham gave me as I started to work on the project, and the consistently helpful criticisms and encouragement that Professor Stephen Gaukroger has provided as I have brought it towards completion.

## **PREFACE**

The work presented in this thesis is original and solely my own. Sources of information derived from published literature relating to previous scientific and philosophical ideas are all indicated in the footnotes and bibliography. The project involved no experimentation nor questionnaires so it required no human or ethical approvals.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction 4

1. Previous scientific ideas about disease 24
    - §1.1 Ancient ideas 25
    - §1.2 Early modern ideas: alchemy, physics and vitalism 47
    - §1.3 The 19<sup>th</sup> Century: structure and causation 62
    - §1.4 The 20<sup>th</sup> Century: pathogenetic mechanisms 72
    - §1.5 Conclusions 89
  2. 20<sup>th</sup> Century philosophical ideas about disease 94
    - §2.1 Some proposals 94
    - §2.2 Some conclusions 125
  3. The roles of explication and definition 130
    - §3.1 The nature of explication 130
    - §3.2 The nature of definition 131
    - §3.3 Anticipations from the explication and definition of disease 137
  4. A new definition of *disease* 140
  5. An explication of disease 152
    - §5.1 Causation 153
    - §5.2 Pathogenesis 178
    - §5.3 Manifestations 190
    - §5.4 Mental disease 200
    - §5.5 Asymptomatic disease 207
    - §5.6 Disadvantage 212
    - §5.7 Observers 220
    - §5.8 Diagnosis 226
    - §5.9 Amalgamating diseases 232
    - §5.10 Genetic diseases 244
    - §5.11 Borderline conditions 253
    - §5.12 Disease by any other name 259
  6. General conclusion 261
- Bibliography 266