

INDUSTRIAL WELFARISM IN AUSTRALIA

1890 – 1965

Nikola Robyn Balnave

A thesis submitted for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Discipline of Work and Organisational Studies
Faculty of Economics and Business
University of Sydney
August 2002

Declaration

I hereby declare that this thesis in whole or in part has not been submitted in any previous application for a degree, nor is it currently being submitted for a degree elsewhere. This thesis is the result of my own independent research and all sources that have been consulted are acknowledged in the references.

Nikola Robyn Balnave

August 2002

Acknowledgements

This thesis was produced with the assistance of many people. My supervisor, Greg Patmore, was especially generous with his time and efforts, and words cannot express my appreciation for his continued guidance, support and friendship. I would like to thank the staffs of the Noel Butlin Archives, Australian Archives, and Bank of NSW Archives, all of who were of great assistance during the research phase of this thesis. I particularly extend my appreciation to Greg Patmore and Chris Wright for access to their privately held company records. In addition, I would like to thank the University of Sydney for an Australian Postgraduate Research Award Scholarship.

On a personal note, this thesis would not have been possible without the enormous support of my parents, Maureen and Derick. I wish to thank them for their constant encouragement and assistance, and for their loving role in caring for my son, Michael, as I worked on this thesis. My final thank you is extended to Michael, who has demonstrated wisdom and understanding beyond his four years. The completion of this thesis owes much to his love and patience.

Abstract

This thesis examines industrial welfarism in Australia from 1890 to 1965. This period witnessed the gradual spread of the welfarism movement throughout Australian industry as employers sought ways to increase productivity and control in the face of external challenges. Once reaching its peak in the immediate post-War period, the welfarism movement was gradually subsumed as part of the increasing formalisation of personnel management.

Waves of interest in welfare provision coincided with periods of labour shortage and/or labour militancy in Australia, indicating its dual role in the management of labour. Firstly, by offering benefits and services beyond that made necessary by the law or industrial awards, welfarism was designed to create a pool of good quality workers for management to draw from. Secondly, managers sought to enhance their control over these workers and their productive effort, using welfarism as a technique to build worker consent to managerial authority. This could be achieved through subtle methods aimed at boosting loyalty and morale, or through more direct programs designed to increase worker dependency on the company. In both ways, individual and collective worker resistance could be minimised, thereby reinforcing managerial prerogative.

Despite its adoption by a variety of companies, a number of economic, political and institutional factors limited the extent of industrial welfarism in Australia. These include the small-scale of most enterprises prior to the Second World War, state involvement in the area of industrial relations and welfare provision, and the strength of organised labour. While the welfarism movement did not reach the heights experienced overseas, it nonetheless provided an important contribution to the development of formal labour management in Australia.

Table of Contents

	Page
Declaration	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Abstract	iii
Table of Contents	iv
List of Tables	viii
List of Abbreviations	ix
Chapter One	
Introduction	1
Definition	3
Methodology	4
Structure	5
Chapter Two	
Literature Review	10
The Research Gap	10
Labour Management Strategy – An Overview of the Debate	14
Labour Management Strategy and The Control Relationship	15
The Australian Context	20
Welfarism	24
Definition	24
Goals and Strategy	29
Success	36
Conclusion	41

Chapter Three	Overview of Welfarism in Australia	47
	Australia before 1890	47
	Context	47
	Foundations of Welfarism	49
	1890-1914	51
	Context	51
	Welfarism	53
	1914-1939	56
	Context	56
	Welfarism	57
	1939-1965	69
	Context	69
	Welfarism	72
	Conclusion	83
Chapter Four	Pensions: Provident and Superannuation Schemes	89
	Overview	90
	Labour Supply	95
	Managerial Prerogative	97
	Characteristics of Schemes	102
	Gender	102
	Administration	103
	Adequacy	107
	Labour Response	112
	Conclusion	115
Chapter Five	Recreation: Social and Sporting Activities	120
	Overview	121
	Labour Supply	124
	Managerial Prerogative	128

	Characteristics of Schemes	137
	Range and Frequency of Activities	137
	Composition of Workforce	141
	Eligibility, Contributions and Subsidies	144
	Administration	145
	Labour Response	147
	Conclusion	150
Chapter Six	Education: Education Classes, Libraries and House Journals	154
	Overview	155
	Labour Supply	161
	Managerial Prerogative	164
	Characteristics of Schemes	172
	Gender Variations in Educational Classes	172
	Library Holdings	172
	House Journal Content	173
	Labour Response	180
	Conclusion	183
Chapter Seven	Health and Accident Schemes: Company Funds, Safety First and In-house Medical Care	187
	Overview	187
	Labour Supply	197
	Managerial Prerogative	200
	Characteristics of Schemes	206
	Contributions to and Administration of Funds	206
	Formality of Safety Schemes	209
	Type and Formality of In-house Medical Care	210
	Labour Response	213
	Conclusion	218

Chapter Eight	Housing and Stores	223
	Overview	224
	Labour Supply	235
	Managerial Prerogative	239
	Labour Response	243
	Conclusion	246
Chapter Nine	Superior Amenities	251
	Overview	252
	Labour Supply	261
	Managerial Prerogative	263
	Characteristics of Schemes	265
	Type of Amenities	265
	Administration of Food Services	266
	Labour Response	268
	Conclusion	270
Chapter Ten	Conclusion	274
	Trends	274
	Incidence	276
	Impact	277
	Implications for Contemporary Debates	279
Bibliography		282

List of Tables

		Page
Table 3.1	Classification by Industries of 76 Private Enterprise Establishments with Organised Welfare Plans	62
Table 3.2	Classification by Type of Welfare in 76 Private Enterprise Establishments with Organised Welfare Plans	63
Table 4.1	Percentage of Business Operating Superannuation, Pension or Retiring Allowance Schemes - 1955-56	93
Table 4.2	Percentage of Businesses Operating Superannuation, Pension or Retiring Allowance Schemes - 1960-61	93
Table 5.1	Social Activities Organised or Sponsored by Social Clubs (NSW) – 1959	137
Table 5.2	Social Activities Organised or Sponsored by Social Clubs (Victoria) – 1964	138
Table 5.3	Sporting and Recreational Activities Organised or Sponsored by Social Clubs (NSW) – 1959	139
Table 5.4	Sporting and Recreational Activities Organised or Sponsored by Social Clubs (Victoria) – 1964	140
Table 6.1	Analysis of Topics in Eighty-three House Journals - 1948	175
Table 6.2	Analysis of James Hardie & Co.'s House Magazine <i>Trimmings</i>	176
Table 6.3	Location of House Journals Editors – 1954 and 1963	178
Table 7.1	Safety Organisations in 117 Factories	209
Table 7.2	Personnel Engaged in Industrial Health Services –1959	212

List of Abbreviations

AACo.	Australian Agricultural Company
ACSI	Commonwealth Advisory Council of Science and Industry
ACTU	Australian Council of Trade Unions
AM	The Australian Manufacturer
AMP	Australian Mutual Provident Society
ANU	Australian National University
APM	Australian Paper Mills
APPM	Associated Pulp and Paper Mills
ARTSA	Amalgamated Railway and Tramway Service Association
ARU	Australian Railways Union
AWU	Australian Workers' Union
BHAS	Broken Hill Associated Smelters
BHP	Broken Hill Proprietary
BIPPP	Bulletin of Industrial Psychology and Personnel Practice
CSR	Colonial Sugar Refining Company
DLNS	Department of Labour and National Service
ER&S	Electrolytic Refining and Smelting Company of Australia
FEDFA	Federated Engine Drivers' and Firemen's Association
HRM	Human Resource Management
ICIANZ	Imperial Chemical Industries of Australia and New Zealand
ISD	Industrial Services Division
IWD	Industrial Welfare Division
KKM	T. Kochan, H. Katz and R. McKersie
LEDFCA	Locomotive Engine Drivers', Firemen's and Cleaners' Association
M&M	Manufacturing and Management
NBAC	Noel Butlin Archives Centre
NSW	New South Wales
PPB	Personnel Practice Bulletin
PPS	Personnel Practice Section, DLNS
RAC	New South Wales Government Railways Ambulance Corps.

US	United States of America
WWF	Waterside Workers' Federation
YMCA	Young Mens' Christian Association
YWCA	Young Womens' Christian Association