What global perspective does our university foster in our students?

Kerry Shephard, Michael Bourk, Miranda Mirosa & Pete Dulgar

Published online: 08 Jan 2016.

Submit your article to this journal ↗

Article views: 410

View related articles ↗

View Crossmark data ↗

Citing articles: 3 View citing articles ↗

What global perspective does our university foster in our students?

Kerry Shephard[a]*, Michael Bourk[b], Miranda Mirosa[c] and Pete Dulgar[a]

[a]*Higher Education Development Centre, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand;*
[b]*Department of Media Film and Communication, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand;* [c]*Department of Food Science, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand*

We used a modified circuit of culture enquiry to explore processes of production, representation and consumption of global perspective at our university, in the context of fostering this perspective as a graduate attribute. We identified four frame packages by which this perspective is understood and communicated. Global perspective is framed within our institution simultaneously as essentially cooperative and as competitive. We express concern about how such complexity is fostered in our students. We ask our colleagues and university teachers internationally to critically reflect upon the diversity of global perspectives extant within higher education and potentially to clarify their intentions as university teachers.

Keywords: global perspective; global citizenship; circuit of culture; framing analysis

Introduction

This article explores the origins and nature of the University of Otago (New Zealand) graduate attribute 'global perspective'. Graduate attributes are to be fostered within Otago's degree programmes, but they are not necessarily formally 'taught'. They may not appear as intended learning outcomes or as text in lecture handouts. They may not be 'assessed' or 'evaluated'. They may not appear explicitly in papers or in programmes at all. Although each attribute is briefly described within institutional documentation, much about them remains open to interpretation. Exploring how they are understood or communicated is not an easy process. In some respects we need to 'read between the lines' to understand the nature of the communication that is intended and that perhaps occurs.

Although identified as a graduate attribute within the University's learning and teaching plan, 'global perspective' is not defined here (University of Otago 2013, 2). That text, however, does make reference to the broader concept of 'global citizenship' (University of Otago 2013). Much has been written about 'global perspective' and 'global citizenship' and related expectations of graduates in the context of university education (reviewed for example by Jorgenson and Shultz 2012 and emphasising educational efforts towards social justice and world peace). Concepts such as global perspective, co-situated with higher education, also relate to the

---

*Corresponding author. Email: kerry.shephard@otago.ac.nz

extensive literature on educational internationalisation (reviewed for example by Kreber 2009; exploring underlying meanings of and motivations for internationalization; and by Streitwieser 2014, analysing trends and their implications for higher education), education for sustainability, and environmental education. Cognisant of the complex issues and interrelationships within this literature, and of our personal struggles to situate 'global perspective' within our own teaching, our concerns focussed around two competing ideas that had been developing in this extensive literature for more than a decade. Nussbaum (2002), for example, identified a range of needs for future citizens, in the context of both social justice and increased internationalisation, in the hope of finding effective solutions to pressing human problems.

> Today's universities are shaping future citizens in an age of cultural diversity and increasing internationalisation. All modern democracies are inescapably plural. As citizens within each nation we are frequently called upon to make decisions that require some understanding of racial and ethnic and religious groups in that nation, and of the situation of its women and its sexual minorities. As citizens we are also increasingly called upon to understand how issues such as agriculture, human rights, ecology, even business and industry, are generating discussions that bring people together from many different nations. This must happen more and more, if effective solutions to pressing human problems are to be found. (291)

These sentiments emphasise hopes of people coming together and cooperating. Brennan and Naidoo (2008) moved us away from planning for what must happen towards concerns about what is happening. These authors examined the theoretical and empirical literature on higher education's role in relation to social equity and related notions of citizenship, social justice, social cohesion and meritocracy; and they explored the extent to which higher education 'imports' and 'exports' equity and social justice agendas. They ask in particular;

> Questions of what is learned in higher education-especially in terms of values and identity. Notions of social responsibility and environmental awareness have implications for all. Are graduates likely to be more concerned than others about them? Have such notions now been lost to higher education's agenda, swamped by the pressures of competitive individualism? (229)

Emphasising this dichotomy of aspiration between cooperation and competition, and with a focus on the roles and responsibilities of higher education, Kreber (2009), in reviewing different rationales for and perspectives on internationalisation in higher education, suggested that; 'While the political, cultural, and academic rationales are based on an ethos of cooperation, the economic one is based on an ethos of competition' (4). Kreber expressed concern that curricula will increasingly relate to economic imperatives and fail to serve a more profound educational purpose in, as examples, fostering international understanding and action towards those most in need.

    The University of Otago is, in an international context, a mid-sized, research-led university with a publically-stated commitment to social responsibility (http://www.otago.ac.nz/about/social-responsibility/). We wondered if our university colleagues understood 'global perspective' primarily in the spirit of Nussbaum's 'cooperation' or in that of Brennan and Naidoo's 'competitive individualism', and in what sense or senses they fostered this attribute in our students.

    The research described here interprets this 'fostering of global perspective' as a form of communication and makes use of interpretive devices more widely used in the disciplines of Cultural Studies and Communication Studies than in Education to understand the nature of this communication; namely a circuit of culture enquiry

(du Gay et al. 1997) incorporating framing analysis (Gamson and Lasch 1981). In three phases we set out to: identify how 'global perspective' was described in text at the University of Otago and how this changed over the years; reveal and analyse the dominant and recurring communication frames employed to foster a global perspective; and explore how colleagues and students at our university interpreted and understood the global perspective frames employed in our institution. We end with some thoughts on the future prospects of fostering one or more 'global perspectives' at our institution and more widely in higher education internationally.

Our modified circuit of culture analysis

Although there are considerable overlaps between the methods inherent to circuit of culture analysis and critical discourse analysis, the latter most widely used in educational research, the circuit of culture provides an additional distinctive approach to meaning making by exploring many facets of existence of a cultural phenomenon. Within cultural studies, culture 'is best understood as the process of meaning making' (Lewis 2003, 3) and cultural studies itself is an attempt to make sense of social processes as meaning develops. Interpreting 'global perspective' within this framework emphasises the developing nature of the phenomenon, and of our academic understanding of it. In this context the principal goal of our analysis is to capture a sense of the social processes that produce and represent meaning. The circuit of culture approach as described by du Gay et al. (1997) emphasises that human social experience may be imagined in terms of five coexisting processes; representation, identity, production, consumption, and regulation. Our project was structured on a modified circuit of culture model emphasising: production (how, and by whom, 'things', such as global perspective(s), are created; representation (the ways that language, as words, symbols and metaphors, influences meaningful experience); and consumption (what people do with the things that are produced and represented). Similar cultural analyses of environmental phenomena have been provided by Carvalho and Burgess (2005) and by Champ and Brooks (2010).

A key element of the circuit of culture approach is framing analysis. One of the better-known examples of framing, and of frame analysis, relates to the 'war on terror' adopted by the USA's Whitehouse staff in 2001. The terrorist attacks of 9/11 could have been framed as crimes, but the 'war' frame evokes a different set of meanings with different implications to citizens (Lakoff 2006). Lakoff describes frames as; '… the mental structures that allow human beings to understand reality – and sometimes to create what we take to be reality.' (Lakoff 2006, 25) and emphasises the inevitability, and possible consequences to meaning making, of framing in human communication. An example of framing analysis in the context of environmental education is provided by Shephard and Dulgar (2015). For the research described in this article, we used the 'frame matrix' concept of Gamson and Lasch (1981) as our analytical rationale in this analysis. A frame matrix comprises eight condensational symbols – metaphors, exemplars, catchphrases, depictions, visual images, roots, consequences, and appeals to principle.

Methods

Phase 1 identified how 'global perspective' was described in text at the University of Otago and explored how various factors have shaped the production of this text.

Understanding the context in which this language was produced involved examining objectives and statements in key institutional documents and interviewing people who have been involved in promoting or interpreting a global perspective at the university. We analysed official documents that guide the direction of development, investment, research, learning and teaching at the University. These included institutional learning and teaching plans or strategies (since 2002, including our most recent, University of Otago 2013), annual reports (since 2001), international management plans (since 1998), the most recent investment plan (University of Otago 2012) and Guidelines for Teaching at Otago (University of Otago 2011). All sources were available at some stage in the public domain, although some older documents survive only as paper copies. These documents were initially analysed for their use of 'global', 'international', and related terms and the resulting text samples were analysed and thematically grouped by identifiable shaping factors, informed by our interviews. Interviews were conducted with three senior academic managers with direct experience of developing, interpreting and promoting graduate attributes such as the global perspective attribute. We conducted semi-structured interviews that used a set of questions, provided in advance, which addressed the definition of global perspective and interviewees' opinions on its adoption, promotion, and evolution. The research was conducted under a University of Otago Ethical Approval that stressed participant anonymity. Written notes and a digital recording were made of each interview. A written summary of each interview was made, incorporating quotations, and the research team analysed them and identified key themes within them using Thomas's inductive approach (Thomas 2006). Key themes from the interviews were integrated with the themes derived from text analysis.

Phase 2 used framing analysis to discover the dominant and recurring frames employed to foster a global perspective at Otago. The project team adopted the Gamson and Lasch (1981) concept of a frame matrix of eight condensational symbols to analyse language gathered from hundreds of source texts such as university web pages, programme specifications, course descriptions, and strategic documents, all accessed from the public domain, online. After an extended and iterative analysis and grouping of similar language, the team collaboratively developed some exploratory frame packages. An example of this stage of the analysis is provided in Table 1.

After extensive consideration of the nature of each exploratory frame package, we collaboratively condensed the data into four interpretive frame packages by rigorously assessing if it were possible for each exploratory frame to subsume another. Each of the four final frame packages incorporates a spatial or place orientation as implied by the context and function in which an occupant's perspective as a concept is made meaningful. The exploratory frame package illustrated in Table 1 therefore became 'Home: a place to live in harmony; the perspective of a harmonious habitant'.

Phase 3 of our research focussed on staff and student interpretation and understanding of global perspective frames employed on campus (or in a circuit of culture context, consumption). We invited university teachers, support staff, and postgraduate students to three group interviews. Members of these stakeholder groups – a group of seven postgraduate students, another of seven lecturers from various departments, and a third of eight support staff from several academic and administrative divisions – were invited by email from lists of possible participants (and so formed a purposeful sample) and participated in group interview sessions in which they were initially, and individually, asked to read 20 text examples, identified by

Table 1. Text from various university documents has been extracted and related thematically, and iteratively, in categories of metaphors, exemplars, catchphrases, depictions, visual images, roots, consequences, and appeals to principle, in this case, one prospective interpretative frame package. At this stage of the analysis, researchers are asking themselves if the text samples included could collectively represent the idea of global perspective relating in some way to a harmonious, peaceful, home.

Interpretive frame package	Metaphor	Exemplar	Depiction	Condensational symbols		Roots	Consequences	Appeals to principle
				Slogans, taglines, catchy phrases	Visual images			
Home (a place to live in harmony)	Students will have an appreciation of global citizenship. Students in Peace and Conflict Studies seek to understand violence and war in order to create a more peaceful and harmonious world	I chose an MBA for personal development. I wanted to do it in a nice country, and NZ was the obvious choice. U of Otago and the Otago MBA have a great reputation	Our graduates make vital contributions to New Zealand's economy both domestically and internationally	A degree in International Business opens up a world of opportunities Conducting business in the global village Your place in the world The international community	(This text replaces a photograph of a signpost with signs to both local and international destinations)	… Organisations, both in New Zealand and throughout the world, need individuals who can work across the traditional functional boundaries as well as across national borders New Zealand has a very export-driven competitive economy	How does the movement of people throughout a globalized world impact on the meaning and experience of culture?	Individually we are one drop, together we are an ocean

letters A–T, and assign each to one of four named frame packages (identified in Phase 2) or to an additional 'other' unspecified frame package, provided in case participants were unable to allocate text to our four named frame packages. The text samples were identified by the researchers as potentially exemplifying particular frame packages. These text samples are provided in Table 2 along with an indication of which frame package researchers collectively thought they best fitted. Researchers accepted that some text was more readily allocated to frame packages than others. This stage of the group interview was primarily designed to encourage participants to think about framing in the context of global perspective(s). One of the researchers introduced each session with a brief introduction to the nature of framing in communication.

Following the text sorting exercise, each group participated in a semi-structured group interview with the research team. Each member of the team introduced a prompt about the text exercise or participants' opinions of/experiences with the fostering of the global perspective attribute: What are the implications of our four frame packages? Are some frame packages more appropriate than others? What's missing from our analysis of global perspective? What's useful going forward in fostering global perspective(s)? Participants were encouraged to consider these questions broadly and voice opinions on other aspects of global perspective(s) on campus. Written notes were taken and the group interviews were digitally recorded, from which summarised transcripts were produced and thematic analysis undertaken.

Results

Production

It seems likely that at least some elements of production stem from institutional descriptions of graduate attributes that have occurred over the years in our institution's learning and teaching plans. The earliest identification that global perspective was a graduate attribute of the University of Otago that we encountered was in our 2002 Teaching and Learning Plan (23). Here it was described as 'an appreciation of the global perspective in their chosen discipline(s), and an informed sense of the impact of the international environment on New Zealand and New Zealand's contribution to the international environment'. This definition was repeated in the 2005–2010 Teaching and Learning Plan (17). The explanation of 'global perspective' was revised in 2011, to 'appreciation of global perspectives in the chosen discipline(s) and the nature of global citizenship', which appears in both Guidelines for Teaching at Otago (University of Otago 2011; 3) and the 2011–2012 Teaching and Learning Plan (University of Otago 2013, 2). We were, of course, struck by the dramatic change in this definition, in the words and phrases incorporated within them, and also in the change from a global perspective to global perspectives.

Our thematic analysis in the production phase of this research, based on text and interviews, identified four themes that consistently arose in our data and that go some way to clarifying what has shaped production of text about global perspective(s) at the University of Otago.

Learning-centred

Our data suggests that a primary rationale for the development of global perspective is centred on learning and the student learning experience. This includes the

Table 2. Twenty text samples from University of Otago documentation used in Group Interviews to encourage participants to engage with framing in the context of global perspective(s). Participants were asked to allocate each to one of the four frame packages described in Table 3 (column 1). An additional 'other' option was provided. How the researchers, collectively, allocate the text is shown in column 2. One item was repeated for internal-consistency checking.

Statement	Frame package
Students in Peace and Conflict Studies seek to understand violence and war in order to create a more peaceful and harmonious world	Home
We need to understand our ancient and dynamic Earth because it provides all the ingredients that sustain our existence … The Otago Geology course explores … the effects of global change arising from our activities on the planet	Garden
The Spanish language and culture courses at Otago provide a useful tool to support our international relationships	Home
From global warming and deforestation to soil erosion and species losses, the world seems to be plagued by a catalogue of disasters that no-one can stop. The good news is that more and more people are on the case	Garden
I chose an MBA for personal development. I wanted to do it in a nice country, and NZ was the obvious choice. Otago and the Otago MBA have a great reputation	Home
Students in Peace and Conflict Studies seek to understand violence and war in order to create a more peaceful and harmonious world	Home
Our graduates make vital contributions to New Zealand's economy both domestically and internationally	Home
How do we build sustainable peace at interpersonal, intergroup, community, national and global levels of analysis?	Garden
Since studying at Otago, Danielle's passion and the skills acquired through the course have taken her around the world, allowing her to contribute to conservation in many countries	Garden
Your place in the world	Home
Food Science is a portable degree. You can find Food Science jobs all over the world	Arena
To conduct world-class fundamental and applied research that achieves international recognition and enhances Otago's reputation as a pre-eminent science research centre	Arena
It's a world of ideas	Agora
There are jobs for geologists all over the world, and as long as you are willing to chase it, there is plenty of money out there too	Arena
Philosophers seek to build a well-grounded picture of the world and of human life	Agora
We also offer a mix of international, national and local perspectives	Agora
It is important to appreciate the different cultures and religions and sustain dialogue across these differences. The national centre for Islamic Studies will have a national and regional focus on which to base our understanding of the wider Muslim world	Agora
Language specialists are constantly in demand in the modern world of global travel and communication	Arena
World-class graduates – Otago Accountancy and Finance graduates are highly sought after, finding roles in organisations that include global professional services firms	Arena
The hands-on experience and chance to work with students from a totally different culture and business understanding was incredible, and it's all come from the grounding I got at Otago	Agora

objective of graduating students who are not just knowledgeable but have acquired the ability to consider this knowledge from positions other than their own. To some extent this objective, enacted through the term global perspective, is seen as a constituent of scholarship. As expressed by one interviewee;

> … scholarship is an international concern … that we ought to have a bigger perspective than our own … Simply a New Zealand perspective on anything … is of no value, it's questionable. You have to have international perspectives on … it's the other, isn't it … the objectivity that you require.

Our analysis of institutional texts and interviews suggests that some use terms related to 'global' interchangeably; but others use the same terms with precision, in some contexts. 'International' (including derivative adverb and noun forms such as 'internationally' and 'internationalisation') is, by far, the most frequently used alternative term relating to the idea of 'global'. [In all of the analysed texts, 'international' appears 1, 913 times and global only 105]. When terms such as 'international' related to 'global perspective' feature in the Teaching and Learning Plans, they generally describe the improvement of curriculum or the enrichment of the educational experience of all students. The 2002 Teaching and Learning Plan, for example, states that 'Internationalisation of the teaching and learning environment … seeks to encourage students to incorporate into their learning a variety of perspectives which transcend the boundaries of a single nation, society or culture' (21).

Although in some cases a focus on the needs of 'domestic students' as beneficiaries of co-location with 'international students' could be interpreted, generally the needs of all Otago students in this respect were understood. This was particularly apparent in aspects of interviews that focussed on staff and student mobility in the context of internationalisation. One academic manager interviewee suggested:

> I think internationalisation is often more around mobility of staff and students … to different parts of the world … and so I think as a university, we have a large number of staff, like you and me, who don't come from New Zealand originally, and so we bring in that international perspective. And similarly, we have methods in place to allow our staff to move, to go on sabbatical to other places, and then we have – obviously – a lot of international students coming in … and we support exchange students, some of our students being outwardly mobile too.

Finance-centred

Another factor that our data suggests might influence the meaning of global perspective and related terms in the documents and in interviews is the reality of higher education as an economic activity. Importantly, financial aspects are most prevalent in documentation that has direct financial relevance and in interview segments that have moved away from learning and teaching to address interacting factors. Finance as a factor clearly interacts with other factors and the extent to which it may or may not be a driver (of the meaning of global perspective) is not clear from our research.

In the University of Otago Tertiary Education (TEC) Council Investment Plan 2013–2015, for example, of 10 uses of 'global', eight are directly related to income for the University – and terms like 'international competitiveness' (5) and 'international ranking' (4) are used to directly reference the international tertiary education industry. Where, in this document, these terms do reference teaching and learning, the context is still, often, financial; as features that will attract students and staff and

contribute to the government's financial plans and goals for higher education to fund itself and fuel the economy. For example, the TEC Investment Plan (University of Otago 2012, 5) uses 'international perspectives' and 'international interchange' to mean features that students (as 'stakeholders' or 'customers') will demand and which universities need to have in place if they want to stay competitive. With reference to international students as fee-paying and skill-rich assets, in the context of global perspective(s), one interviewee suggested;

> International education is expected to contribute through international fee paying students, but also through recruiting and retaining skilled students, particularly postgraduates, who can contribute to the NZ economy.

Reputation-centred

There is also a factor at work here that is centred on research, publication and institutional reputation but that interacts with both the learning and finance themes. This factor is about rankings and others' perceptions of the University nationally and internationally. The primary sense of the use of terms associated with global perspective in these situations seems to be related to esteem, and position in relation to other universities based on faculty performance, somewhat separate from teaching. The University's TEC Investment Plan, in establishing the context of the document, says, 'Internationally, Otago is rated as one of the world's top universities in the major independent rankings' (University of Otago 2012, 3). A recent caption on the home page of the University's website states that Otago is 'ranked within the top 3% of universities in the world' (University of Otago 2015).

One interviewee identified the link between international reputation and institutional global perspective, or attitude;

> … world university rankings are a motivation to invest in a global and international attitude. Since these rankings are determined largely from perception and knowledge of a university by peers in the academic community internationally, it is valuable to make the connections that 'get your name out there' and bring international scholars and research here.

Confluence of circumstances

Our data suggests that personal influence (of who in particular occupies relevant roles in the university, at particular periods of time), has significantly contributed to Otago's global perspective. In response to a question about the precision of our current definition of global perspective, one interviewee suggested; 'I mean, I think it's deliberately vague, but what our intention behind these attributes was that actually each discipline or programme takes these and actually customises them for their discipline'.

In response to a question in another interview about how effectively the current definition serves its purpose, another interviewee suggested that;

> I think it covers all the bases on what global perspective can mean … but I think it would be helpful if it were a little snappier … because I'm not sure that … people always engage with it … so I think in terms of whether it creates the best possible image … it does bring in the sense that NZ needs to be informed by international research environments, and also we need to inform … it reflects the two-way process of 'global'.

It seems inevitable that individuals will bring their own particular influences to their roles so that the institutional culture of global perspective, particularly as defined in key institutional strategic documentation, is a product at least in part of individual action. Our data suggests that university documentation may also have been influenced by international trends. Detailed examination of University annual reports (between 2001 and 2014) illustrate substantial changes in the frequency and use of terms such as international/internationalisation (becoming nowadays relatively more frequent) and global/globalisation (becoming relatively less frequent) that are likely themselves reflections of interactions between international trends in meaning, and individuals involved in writing them.

Representation

Our framing analysis identified four relatively distinct interpretative frame packages, each incorporating a place and the social role of someone who exists there. Table 3 describes the packages and provides text that exemplifies each. It is particularly notable to researchers that one essentially competitive frame package (Arena) coexists with three essentially cooperative frame packages (Agora, Home and Garden).

Consumption

Participants in all three group-interviews found it relatively straightforward to allocate our 20 text samples from webpages to our four frame packages, very few

Table 3. Four interpretive frame packages of the concept of global perspective, with examples of text from University of Otago webpages.

Frame package	Description	Exemplar text and source
Agora	A place to gather, learn, and discuss; the perspective of an orator and eternal student	To advance the understanding and knowledge of conflict resolution processes by conducting state-of-the-art training in negotiation, mediation, and cross-cultural conflict resolution www. otago.ac.nz/ncpacs
Arena	A place to compete; the perspective of a fighter	There are jobs for geologists all over the world, and as long as you are willing to chase it, there is plenty of money out there too www.otago.ac.nz/courses/otago032696.pdf
Home	A place to live in harmony; the perspective of a harmonious habitant	Our graduates make vital contributions to New Zealand's economy both domestically and internationally http://infosci.otago.ac.nz/about-us/
Garden	A place to manage and sustain; the perspective of a gardener who aims to manage, tame, control, and sustain	From global warming and deforestation to soil erosion and species losses, the world seems to be plagued by a catalogue of disasters that no-one can stop. The good news is that more and more people are on the case www.otago.ac.nz/study/otago032685.pdf

needed to use the 'other' category, and groups' choices were strikingly similar to each other and to those of the researchers in this project. We deduce from this some reassurance that our frame packages are recognisable to other university people and in some respects helpful in enabling them to understand diverse meaning in university texts.

Analysis of the discussions in the group interviews reveals several themes of interest; two relating to direct lines of questioning, but two others arising from the open-ended nature of the line of questioning.

Global perspective, or perspectives

On the issue of the implications of having more than one frame for global perspective, and the related issue of whether some frames are more appropriate than others in a university setting, groups were unequivocal in endorsing the inevitability of the coexistence of multiple frames. Discussion generally focused on the coexistence of a competitive Arena frame with the more harmonious, cooperative frames of Agora, Home and Garden, and led to general consensus, amongst participants, that Arena in particular should be situated within our institution's global perspective. Quotations from each group interview to illustrate this acceptance include:

> We're trying to train people in critical thinking – agora – in a way in which they are useful to people, useful in employment, so that they can compete in the arena.

> Maybe this is temporally based, with the agora, home, and garden frames preparing students for arena aspects of later life where they have to compete.

> If we don't educate graduates to compete for jobs with graduates of other universities then we are failing in an aspect of our jobs. The university has to compete every day for funding, media attention, research recognition, rankings, etc. It would be naïve and detrimental to pretend that competition didn't exist in academia.

> A global perspective involves multiple perspectives and there is no way to avoid involving those perspectives in the examination and acquisition of global perspective.

Missing frames

On the issue of missing frames or missing global perspectives, no group seemed particularly surprised or concerned that the 'environment' in the 'global environment' that formed part of the 2002 definition of 'global perspective', was interpreted entirely anthropocentrically in all four frames. The student group did suggest that perhaps a separation between humans and the natural world was more likely in western discourse, than in the philosophies of non-western societies, but nevertheless, agreed with other groups that the natural world should not necessarily be an identifiable constituent concern in a global perspective. One student remarked; 'Non-human issues are embedded in all four frames'.

Not widespread enough within discussion to be regarded as an overall theme, but notable comments in two interviews related to personal responsibility;

> Personal responsibility is a factor in global perspective and contributes to becoming a global citizen. This [definition of global perspective] seems to be missing a personal element of allowing students to learn who they are and develop into a mature person.

Two other themes arose in discussions that were reiterated in some form in all three group-interviews.

Divergent interests

There was general agreement that students and university staff (teachers and support staff) may have diverging interests that manifest themselves in different conceptualisations of global perspective. 'What the university wants and what individual students want might be very different things. Some things the university wants are for its own reputation and competitiveness and not necessarily for the benefit of students.'

The need to clarify an institutional vision

There was also broad agreement within and amongst the groups that the University needs to better define its vision of global perspective and needs to better translate the position of global perspective within the learning environment.

> A lot of global perspective language is advertising-speak and not necessarily meaningful. Vagueness in global perspective is hard to interpret and apply.

> The university is talking the talk but not walking the walk, to some degree. What is the goal that the university wants to achieve with this attribute?

> The university needs to make it more clear how written graduate attributes translate to activities and actions in the learning environment and the world.

Discussion

In preparing for this research project we became aware that it was likely that our efforts would uncover complexity in the nature of the concept of global perspective, and in the way that the concept is understood and used by colleagues within our university. Our early concerns were supported by Bourn and Shiel's assertion that (in the UK) government encouragement for higher education to engage with global perspectives may appear incoherent and contradictory and that more empirical studies were needed to evaluate how academic staff respond to global perspectives and sustainable development (Bourn and Shiel 2009). Complexity in approaches and underlying ethos for global citizenship education has also been stressed by Shultz and co-researchers (see e.g. Shultz, Abdi, and Richardson 2011). The data that we generated confirm this complexity but also support our approach of using a modified circuit of culture analysis to create an integrated understanding of how this complexity is structured.

On how global perspective is represented at the University of Otago, it is clear that there is not one global perspective extant within the University of Otago's documentation, or in the minds and expressed experiences of colleagues and students at the University, as represented within our three group interviews. Whatever the objective of the original 2002 Otago global perspective in the mind of its creator, and whatever the original culture of global perspective at that time, by 2014 at least four conceptions of global perspective, or four frame packages, exist. We are not dealing here with a simple phenomenon.

One frame package that appears to us to be dominant, in the sense that it was most frequently encountered within our research, was described by us as 'Arena' and recognised in a similar way by our colleagues. This global perspective emphasises competitiveness. The frame package can be applied to individual students, to an institution like the University of Otago and to an extent to a country like New Zealand. In the latter context, it may have been the frame within which Otago's original global perspective was produced and understood and, to an extent, may emphasise the perspective of an 'underdog' (based on both size and location), facing significant challenges in the world and expected to punch above its weight (http://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/british/punch-above-your-weight) and perhaps to win its share, or more, of the world's resources. As applied to individual graduates in the context of global perspective, the University of Otago clearly endorses competitive individualism; and in the context of institutional competitiveness, we do need to compete with other institutions to, for example, attract overseas students.

Other frame packages clearly do exist at our university, and these have more similarity to the pedagogy of global perspectives sought by Nussbaum (2002) and by Bourn and Shiel (2009) and, in contrast to competitiveness, express the;

> … belief that 'internationalising' the experience of UK students is as important as attracting overseas students, and that the curriculum must include learning about global issues, global processes and sustainable development, in a context where cultural diversity enriches the learning experience. (672)

On how the global perspective has been produced at the University of Otago, we identify a complex situation. The University's description of global perspective has been recently changed, to endorse multiple perspectives, and to embrace vagueness so as to be open to interpretation by individual departments and divisions. Its origins and development have been forged by the international circumstances in which the university finds itself and likely by the intervention of individuals willing and able to make change. Rather than emphasising surprise at the dominance of a competitive frame package, perhaps we should express disappointment that in 2014/15, global perspectives that emphasise dialogue, caring and sharing are not more dominant than they are, and that the 'environment' inherent to this discourse is so anthropocentrically focussed. Internationally higher education is becoming increasingly integrated within the sustainable development movement and many higher education institutions have signed compacts such as the Talloires Declaration (University Leaders for a Sustainable Future 2015) emphasising higher education's contribution to an anti-consumerism, pro-society and pro-environment future. And the University of Otago does emphasise its commitment to social responsibility (http://www.otago.ac.nz/about/social-responsibility/). Our circuit of culture analysis of the production of global perspective(s) at the University of Otago does emphasise a particular nature of leadership and vision, focussing on: opening possibilities for individualism including individual-academic and individual-department freedom to frame the concept themselves; and perhaps a style of academic planning that enables the university to respond to external events. As a university teacher in one of our group interviews said; 'globalisation is abstract and varied … And it is up to the University to decide which elements they want to emphasise'. The description of higher education progress as a product of happenstance rather than of planned progress has been made before (Shephard 2006) and future change may relate strongly to the particular mind-sets of future academic managers who acquire relevant roles.

On how global perspective is consumed at the University of Otago, we emphasise interplay between production, representation and how university people consume, or make use of, that which producers have attempted to represent. Ideas about global perspective were extraordinarily easy to find on University webpages, often mixed in with text that referenced internationalisation and global citizenship. Whether by design, in for example understanding that the University wishes to foster global perspective(s), or through need, in attempting to communicate intuitively the nature of Otago's higher education, university people make use of language associated with being part of the wider world. As Hall (1980) suggests, individuals and social groups may simply accept a meaning explicit within the design of a producer, or may challenge and negotiate this meaning. The situation in academia may be more complex than it is in other cultural settings. As we have seen, the meaning of the current description of global perspective is far from clear, encouraging consumers, or users, to negotiate its meaning. Add to that, in higher education's 'flat hierarchy' (Mann 2008), most consumers are also producers; responsible for reinterpreting vague strategic guidelines in their own context. We should add complexity that is the consequence of the nature of higher education's graduate attributes. Ideas around whether and how they should be taught, or fostered, are contested in higher education (Barrie 2007).

Future prospects for 'global perspective' at the University of Otago, and elsewhere

We end by considering a common conundrum in higher education research. It is enough to simply better understand the nature of the phenomenon being researched? Or do we research to move us along in a particular direction?

We feel that this circuit of culture approach has added greatly to our personal understanding of the nature of global perspective amongst our colleagues at the University of Otago. We think it possible, considering the extensive international literature on global citizenship and internationalisation, that many universities internationally have similarly complex views on graduates' global perspectives. By disseminating this research, through publication and conference presentations (Mirosa et al. 2015), others may also better understand higher education culture with respect to global perspective, within our institution and elsewhere. An equivalent situation has been described in the context of citizenship education. Enslin, for example, in addressing citizenship education in post-apartheid South Africa, considered multiple ways that citizenship had been interpreted and the possible consequences of formalising an official interpretation, as a set of rights and duties, which ignored popular interpretations incorporating access to socio-economic rights (Enslin 2003). That analysis described the values inherent to each interpretation and the tensions that exist, but did not explicitly suggest how to improve the nature of citizenship education. Interpreted in this way, the research described here leads us to celebrate the diversity of global perspectives extent in our institution and to accept that in promulgating our research outcomes what is most important is that our colleagues in Otago and elsewhere become aware that different interpretations of global perspective are inevitable and do need to be factored into educational deliberations. Our work will be significant if it achieves this. It is also the case that each of the four frame packages, similar to any conceptual model, may fail to represent the complexity of reality. Frames, by their very nature, accentuate some views and marginalise

others. An overemphasis on any frame at the expense of ignoring others risks reifying just part of the situation. For example, the garden frame package's focus on control may overemphasise managerial capacity. Similarly, the agora model may give undue legitimacy to rational deliberation ignoring the relational complexity of 'realpolitik' and the 'everyday'. The home frame package may give excessive agency to emotional commitment. Perhaps of greatest concern is a highlighting of individual accomplishment in the arena as separate from the social world of collective responsibilities and collaboration. There clearly are some advantages in maintaining diverse frames within a generalised global perspective.

Alternatively, the true value of educational research may be in contributing to change for the better. In this context our results do support earlier assertions by other researchers who focus on global citizenship education (GCE) and who do emphasise possible changes for the better. Jorgenson and Shultz (2012), for example, explore a range of research-based typologies of GCE to critique a perceived emphasis on competition and economic capacity as the major motivation for GCE. They identify in various forms of GCE a lack of analysis of global issues, uncritical approaches to education and political structures, and failure to critically reflect on one's position relative to the rest of the world. And these authors express concern that without such critical engagement global social inequality will not be addressed, but rather be seen as a necessity of economic advancement and advantage. Furthermore, they express concern that while GCE programs may 'claim to be working for justice and inclusion, these claims mask more competitive projects of internationalisation and marketization at the foundation of the programme' (16). It would be difficult to interpret these analyses as something other than a call for change, and change with a particular focus.

Our research leads us to reflect on the roles of higher education institutions in the twenty-first century particularly in the contexts of competitive individualism, higher-education internationalisation and of global perspective, and is, by publication, directed toward encouraging others to similarly reflect. As suggested by Kreber (2009) 'reflecting on what internationalisation means cannot be separated from critically engaging with the question of what the purposes and goals of higher education should be …' (9). In the spirit of promoting such critical engagement amongst higher education teachers, and in meeting our obligations as critic and conscience of society, we do suggest that although governments, and students, may expect us to foster competitive individualism at the national and individual level; we do not have to comply uncritically. As academics with freedom we may, if we wish, promote alternative perspectives. And if we do wish to promote competitiveness in a global context, we have the freedom, and perhaps the responsibility, to call it what it is, rather than incorporating it uncritically along with other perspectives in a global context.

Concluding remarks

This study used a modified circuit of culture enquiry to identify four frame packages by which the graduate attribute 'global perspective' is understood and communicated in one university. Findings suggest that global perspective is framed within this institution in multiple ways but simultaneously as both cooperative and as competitive in nature. Authors express concern that such complexity may be promoted and promulgated by uncritical engagement by teachers with global perspective, in

the context of the roles and responsibilities of higher education. Authors suggest that university teachers could reflect upon the diversity of global perspective extant within their own teaching, to clarify their intentions as university teachers and if they wish, to reframe some aspects of the global perspective that they may currently foster in their students.

Acknowledgements

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Funding

Notes on contributors

Kerry Shephard is professor of higher education development at the Higher Education Development Centre, University of Otago, New Zealand. Kerry researches teaching and learning in the affective domain in higher education with a focus on 'higher education for sustainability'. He has recently published 'Higher education for sustainable development' (Palgrave Macmillan, 2015).

Michael Bourk is assistant professor in the Department of Mass Communication and Media, Gulf University of Science and Technology, Kuwait. He has previously researched and taught at the University of Otago, New Zealand and at the University of Canberra, Australia where he received his BA, MA and PhD. in communication. He has a primary research interest in institutional narratives and frames, with particular interest in those associated with policies, strategies and media technologies that may impact active participation in society. Recently, Michael has published research on the New Zealand broadcast media's representation of climate change and how key institutional actors frame the issue.

Miranda Mirosa is senior lecturer in the Department of Food Science, University of Otago. Miranda has a BA (French), BCom(Hons, marketing communication) and a PhD (University of Otago, New Zealand). Miranda's research aims to understand why people eat what they do; why they don'teat what they don't; and how we might best impact upon these choices. Pete Dulgar maintains a portfolio of research roles. Pete gained a MFA in creative writing from the University of Alaska Fairbanks, USA, and a PhD from the University of Otago, New Zealand on aspects of the adaptation of five short stories into film.

References

Barrie, S. C. 2007. "A Conceptual Framework for the Teaching and Learning of Generic Graduate Attributes." *Studies in Higher Education* 32 (4): 439–458.
Bourn, D., and C. Shiel. 2009. "Global Perspectives: Aligning Agendas?" *Environmental Education Research* 15 (6): 661–677.
Brennan, J., and R. Naidoo. 2008. "Higher Education and the Achievement (and/or Prevention) of Equity and Social Justice." *Higher Education* 56 (3): 287–302.
Carvalho, A., and J. Burgess. 2005. "Cultural Circuits of Climate Change in UK Broadsheet Newspapers, 1985–2003." *Risk Analysis* 25 (6): 1457–1469.

Champ, J. G., and J. J. Brooks. 2010. "The Circuit of Culture: A Strategy for Understanding the Evolving Human Dimensions of Wildland Fire." *Society & Natural Resources: An International Journal* 23 (6): 573–582.

du Gay, P., Hall, S., Janes, L., Mackay, H., & Negus, K. 1997. *Doing cultural studies: The story of the Sony Walkman*. London: Sage.

Enslin, P. 2003. "Citizenship Education in Post-apartheid South Africa." *Cambridge Journal of Education* 33 (1): 73–83.

Gamson, W. A., and K. E. Lasch. 1981. *'The Political Culture of Social Welfare Policy', Center for Research on Social Organization, No. 242*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan.

Hall, S. 1980. "Encoding/Decoding." In *Culture, Media, Language*, edited by S. Hall, D. Hobson, A. Lowe, and P. Willis, 128–138. London: Hutchinson.

Jorgenson, S., and L. Shultz. 2012. "Global Citizenship Education (GCE) in Post-secondary Institutions: What is Protected and What is Hidden under the Umbrella of GCE?" *Journal of Global Citizenship & Equity Education* 2 (1): 1–22.

Kreber, C. 2009. "Different Perspectives on Internationalization in Higher Education." *New Directions for Teaching and Learning* 2009: 1–14.

Lakoff, G. 2006. *Thinking Points: Communicating Our American Values and Vision*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Lewis, J. 2003. *Cultural Studies. The Basics*. London: Sage.

Mann, S. J. 2008. *Study, Power and the University*. Maidenhead: SRHE and OUP.

Mirosa, M., M. Bourk, P. Dulgar, and K. Shephard. 2015. "How Do University Teachers 'Teach', 'Foster' or Otherwise 'Influence the Development of' the Otago Graduate Attribute 'Global Perspective'?" Oral presentation at the Australian and New Zealand Communication Association Conference, Queenstown, New Zealand, July 8–10.

Nussbaum, M. 2002. "Education for Citizenship in an Era of Global Connection." *Studies in Philosophy and Education* 21 (4/5): 289–303.

Shephard, K., and P. Dulgar. 2015. "Why it Matters How We Frame 'Education' in Education for Sustainable Development." *Applied Environmental Education & Communication* 14 (3): 137–148.

Shephard, K. L. 2006. "Learning and Teaching." In *Rethinking Subject Support in Academic Libraries*, edited by M. Holland, P. Dale, and M. Matthews. Aldershot: Ashgate. 49–63.

Shultz, L., A. Abdi, and G. Richardson, eds. 2011. *Global Citizenship Education in Postsecondary Institutions: Theories, Practices, Policies*. New York: Peter Lang.

Streitwieser, B., ed. 2014. *Internationalisation of Higher Education and Global Mobility. Oxford Studies in Comparative Education*. Oxford: Symposium Books.

Thomas, D. 2006. "A General Inductive Approach for Analyzing Qualitative Evaluation Data." *American Journal of Evaluation* 27 (2): 237–246.

University Leaders for a Sustainable Future. 2015. "Talloires Declaration Institutional Signatories List." Accessed April 8, 2015. http://www.ulsf.org/programs_talloires_signatories.html

University of Otago. 2011. "Guidelines for Teaching at Otago." Accessed April 8, 2015. http://www.otago.ac.nz/staff/otago027122.pdf

University of Otago. 2012. "TEC Investment Plan 2013–2015." Accessed April 8, 2015. http://www.otago.ac.nz/about/official_documents.html

University of Otago. 2013. "University of Otago Teaching and Learning Plan 2013–2020." Accessed April 8, 2015. http://www.otago.ac.nz/staff/otago027123.pdf

University of Otago. 2015. "Home Page." Accessed Feburary 27, 2015. http://www.otago.ac.nz/