Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection

SIT Study Abroad

Spring 2020

NGOs as Learning Organizations: Evaluating Female Sports Development in Jordan Through the Lens of Women's Soccer

Saede Eifrig
SIT Study Abroad

NGOs as Learning Organizations: Evaluating Female Sports Development in Jordan Through the Lens of Women's Soccer

Saede Eifrig

Haverford College: Anthropology, Middle East and Islamic Studies

School for International Training (SIT)

Jordan: Geopolitics, International Relations, and the Future of the Middle East

Academic Director: Dr. Raed Al Tabini, PhD

Project Advisor: Rania Harfoushi

April 27, 2020

Acknowledgements

I would like to give special thanks to my project advisor, Rania Harfoushi, who encouraged me to pursue this research interest and helped me find research participants, assisting in translation and outreach.

I would also like to thank my program director Dr. Raed Al Tabini and professor Dr. Ashraf Alqudah for their guidance, advice, time and effort in making this research possible.

In addition, I thank all of the organizations and research participants for their time and trust. They offered invaluable mentorship and experiences to me as a researcher, teammate, and peer. Lastly, I would also like to thank my classmates and all of the program staff for their consistent support and important conversations throughout the semester.

Saede Eifrig
April 2020

Table of Contents

Abstract

This Independent Study Project (ISP) explores how NGO programs measure the success of their impact on female sports development in Jordan and the impact thereof on improving women's opportunities in sport. This research relies on several theories, including Sport for Development theory (Lyras and Welty Peachey, 2011), organizational learning and learning organizations (Roper and Pettit, 2002), and monitoring and evaluation (Peters, 2016) to discover the effect of NGO programs on women's sport development in Jordan. It centers on the intersection of gender, social expectations, and non-governmental work for development. This paper aims to answer the following questions: Roper and Pettit suggest that organizations should strive towards bottom-up learning to allow constituents to define NGO practices. How might bottom-up learning redefine how female sports empowerment NGOs in Jordan assess their program's success? How do female sports empowerment programs (NGOs) in Jordan understand the lives and aspirations of their constituents and how might they collaborate with them to increase women's sport access? What social and cultural factors influence challenges to visibility and access for women's sports in Jordan?

The research includes five interviews with program providers and local experts on women's sport in Jordan. It postulates that in order for women's sport to expand and be sustained on a national platform, the efforts and emphasis on sport for development as implemented in refugee-specific initiatives may serve as a foundation for shared learning and collaboration among women's sports activists, but should ultimately be tailored to the needs of the Jordanian society as a whole.

Key Words: Physical Education, Developmental Studies, Gender Studies, Regional Studies: Middle East, Public Administration: Non-Governmental Organization, Sport for Development

Introduction

  This ISP explores how NGO programs measure the success of their impact on female sports development in Jordan and the impact thereof on improving women's opportunities in sport. Interested in practicing with a soccer team during her study abroad in Jordan, the researcher struggled to find resources on women's soccer and women's sports infrastructure generally. In fact, she found little-to-no information online about the women's professional league, professional players, or club team seasons. However, through the geopolitics thematic seminar lectures at School of International Training (SIT): Jordan Geopolitics and personal contacts, the author quickly learned about the prominent nonprofit community in Jordan, which promotes development through sport. In the unique context of Jordan's recent development of the women's soccer industry, ongoing programs supporting girls in sport, and prevalent international advocacy campaigns, this research studies the narrative of women's sports development NGOs and their constituents.

  Future research interests include a closer study of sustainable and collaborative program design for sports for development programs, or the broader effect of monitoring and evaluation practices on international NGOs. The first inquiry stems from a personal interest in discovering and implementing ways to form community through collaborative program design, especially when working with refugees and immigrants.

  Jordan is host to a wide variety of NGOs with peace-building initiatives, many of which revolve around the Israeli occupation and Palestinian refugee population in Jordan, as well as, more recently, supporting Iraqi and Syrian refugee populations in Jordan. The foundation of development infrastructure in Jordan focuses on refugees and supporting their intersectional identities, which includes campaigns specific to gender equity. However, while this study acknowledges and references the impact of refugee-specific campaigns and will illustrate the intricate overlap between refugee-specific campaigns and sport access for women and girls on a national level, it focuses primarily on how women's empowerment through sport opportunities expands beyond the refugee demographic. It postulates that in order for women's sport to expand and be sustained on a national platform, the efforts and emphasis on sport for development as implemented in refugee-specific initiatives may serve as a foundation for shared learning and collaboration among women's sports activists, but should ultimately be tailored to the needs of

the Jordanian society as a whole. By extension, looking closely at the differences between sport-for-development agendas, it is critical to consider how organizations evaluate the success of their programs depending on the demographic that they serve. It is necessary to ask both those who set the program agendas—NGO administrators—and those who experience the effects of them—female athletes—what their primary goals and standards of success look like.

In order to test this hypothesis, the study relies on literature and five total interviews with female Jordanian soccer players, NGO administrators, and a professor of Physical Education. Their experiences encompass a range of perspectives from within Jordan on the dynamic relationship between primary actors on the issue of women's empowerment through sport. Primary actors include, but are not limited to, female athletes, NGO programs and administrators, and the Jordan Football Association (JFA). The scope of the analysis will be specific to women's soccer development in Jordan and focus on a demographic within Amman, Jordan. But, the research itself is not confined to women's soccer. In fact, most of the experts interviewed for this research have experience with respect to sport in general. However, women's soccer in Jordan, specifically, is a useful framework to illustrate and compare collaborative development efforts through NGO programs, JFA, and FIFA initiatives. In addition, studying a team sport, like soccer, raises important questions about community acceptance and visibility.

Soccer, or football, is the national sport in Jordan. The women's game has shown significant growth since 2005, with the inception of the national team. More recently, the FIFA U-17 Women's World Cup Jordan 2016 set off a new chapter for women's soccer in Jordan. In its wake, the JFA launched its inaugural Women's Pro League in 2019. Paired with Prince Ali Bin Al-Hussein's continued public support for women's soccer in Jordan and the campaign to lift the FIFA ban on headscarves ("Jordan Builds on World Cup Legacy", 2019), women's soccer development in Jordan has received both national and international attention, and we can expect to see continued growth.

The theoretical framework of the research will rely on several basic theories often implemented in non-governmental work. "Monitoring and evaluation" is a tracking and analysis process that produces evidence of NGO efficiency for policy and funding purposes. These practices are criticized for their role in reinforcing social boundaries when the effect among its practitioners is not examined (Peters, 2016), so an evaluation thereof is in order. This theoretical

framework is useful to compare how organizations structure self-evaluation. The author also draws on "organisational learning," which unpacks how organizations use knowledge and their environment to attain their goals, as well as: "learning organisation," in which "individuals as well as the organisation are engaged in an ongoing quest for knowledge… [where] change is a constant" (Roper and Pettit, 2002, p. 259). In this theory, organizations transcend from "single-loop" to "double-loop learning"—fundamental restructuring of strategy. The focus will be on how NGOs organize themselves according to these theories. Finally, sport-for-development theory (SFDT), sport as a vehicle for social change, underlies the case for analyzing efficiency in women's sports development (Lyras and Welty Peachey, 2011).

Literature Review

Theoretical Framework

Lyras's sport-for-development theory (SFDT) is a useful framework for developing programs applying sport as a tool for furthering gender equity by building life skills and social cohesion. In summary, the theory states how sport can most effectively be applied to promote positive social change. The foundation of the theory is built upon principles of human development and inter-group acceptance provided by Allport (1954), [SE1] stating that "contact between diverse groups… is the most effective 'medicine' against racism, prejudice, and discrimination" (Lyras and Welty Peachey, 2011, p. 313). Fundamental to the application of Allport's theory to their own, Lyras and Welty Peachey highlight Allport's conditions for positive cross-group contact: "(a) equal status among members of the groups, (b) common goals for the purpose and the framework of the contact, (c) intergroup cooperation that helps all groups reach their goals, and (d) support from the authorities, structures, and institutions of a society" (p. 313). Sport-for-development (SFD) programs reflect Allport's conditions by "fostering collective social responsibility" and values like: "cooperation, cohesiveness, respect, and awareness of others that can be transferred to the social world, beyond the team sport structure" (p. 312). Lyras suggests applying the above and other psycho-social theories embedded in SFD towards developing sport for development and peace (SDP) programs (2007)—as applied by the UN Department for Sport for Development and Peace, established in 2002.

Coalter's (2007) *sport plus* category in SDP combines sport with non-sport education (Blom et al., 2015)—a strategy frequently and primarily found in this research. With the rapid

rise of NGOs and high UN praise of SFD within them, Coalter, however, also warns that certain elements of NGO structure could perpetuate forces of neo-colonialism (2007, 2010). For example, Western-driven SFD agendas might generate new forms of dependency. Coalter's concern highlights the need for effective monitoring and evaluation programs and especially close consideration of practical implementation in SFD programs. A proposed antidote to perpetuating neo-colonialism is to "strive to understand the relationship between forms of sport, forms of organisation, types of social capital and forms of development, and 'the extent to which these relationships can exist'" (Lyras, 2011, p. 312). This particular concern with "relationship" is at the root of this research. The literature discussed lays the foundation for SFD, but lacks specific gender studies within the field. This research studies gender differentiated considerations for practical SFD implementation in NGOs.

Gender, Sport, and Development

In 1978, the UNESCO Charter for Physical Education and Sport declared sport as a human right, but specific measures for women in sport weren't developed until over 15 years later (in 1994) with the Brighton Declaration at the First World Conference for Women in Sport. In it were outlined five main objectives for women in sport. Most relevant to this study are the following two: ensure opportunity to pursue sport in a safe and supportive environment, and "validate the knowledge, experiences, and values of women and their contribution to the development of sport" (Hancock. Lyras & Ha, 2013, 2). Over time, the objectives developed; the 1998 Windhoek Call for Action specifies measures to further women's empowerment and collaboration with non-sport entities (2013). As these objectives expand, analyzing intersectional issues and relationships may become more complex, but nevertheless remains crucial.

Studying women in sport and development is absolutely essential. This research aims to answer why there are still patterns, prejudices, and agendas specific to women and girls in organizations concerned with sport and reveals other broader, but relevant social and cultural questions. Despite rapid progress, "female participation in sport still raises a series of reactions, issues and questions that are theoretically challenging, culturally revealing and programmatically pressing" (Saavedra, 2005, p. 1). Issues with sport and gender, though rooted in conceptions of differentiated physical ability between sexes, also reflect sensitive social and cultural positions (2005). Behind many observed barriers to sport, one might actually find less obvious, but incredibly important details that expose underlying tensions within a society. Discovering where

these gendered tensions exist and how they unfold (impacting participation, access, and success etc.), allows for more precise and specific solutions.

The way in which sport and development is studied and evaluated should reflect the objectives taught in SFD and engage in a learning process. Saavedra (2005) calls researchers to complicate questions asked of women in sport to include not only barriers and opportunities, but also "the presumed benefits and costs, the variations over time and place, and the impact on women and girls of existing sporting ventures" (p.1). She means that in order to grow in our understanding, we must learn from the past and present contributions of women in sport and understand each step that was taken to push participation forward. The study of women in sport and development is not linear, but progresses as a learning cycle.

Alexis Lyras and Mary A. Hums (2009) outline a number of recommendations for equal representation of girls in sport, but argue that there are certain challenges to applying these recommendations across cultures. This research explores this concern in the Jordanian context, asking how varied family, cultural, and social expectations as well as NGO program agendas influence women and girls' sports participation. Lyras and Hums also acknowledge the "need to develop new lines of inquiry" in sports research in accordance with United Nations recommendations for documentation and monitoring and evaluation methods (p.7). There is a need for research to understand success in women-and-sport development. However, Roper and Pettit (2002) suggest that it is actually hard to track success, since development organizations only have control over "a small range of things" and learning cannot be traced to the "One Best Way" of operating; it is important to focus instead on the structure of learning (p. 263). Roper and Pettit contribute to the literature on "learning organizations," which focuses on how organizations "successfully acquire, share, and use knowledge to achieve organizational goals" (p. 259). In other words, when analyzing an organization's success, not only are the content and methods of implementation key, but also how organizations apply, rework, and integrate what they learn from and for their work to contribute to development in context—in this case, SFD.

Taking into account how SFD organizations situate themselves in society, relationships, and structures of power within which they operate complicates measurements of success. So, not only is measuring success difficult, but also quantifying how and what organizations learn. Change, regardless of measured success, is always contingent upon the complex system within which the change is being operated. Thus, it is critical to include social, cultural, and political

context in this study. This makes learning for 'learning organizations' very difficult, because it means that they must determine *exactly what* to learn from the change (Roper and Pettit 2005) (Argyris & Schon 1974). And yet, the self-reflection and reflexivity embedded in the 'learning organization' concept leads to shared learning and collaboration. In observing change, learning inherently takes place in people and organizations, so rather, it is valuable to become more aware of how that learning takes place: to learn from learning (Solomon & Chowdhury 2002) (Taylor 1998). How do organizations reflect on their own learning and make this process an asset to then apply to develop future goals and programs?

Through narratives, this research will investigate cultural and structurally uncontrollable factors and intentionally question how organizations' evaluation frameworks incorporate and learn from these. It builds on existing literature by acknowledging the non-linear complexity of development and applying it to women's sport for development in Jordan. In linking organization practices with constituent interests, the research exposes a path of communication and relationship between organizations and constituents and explores opportunities of shared learning.

Aid and Geopolitics of Jordan

In this study on NGO work in Jordan, it is critical to contextualize Jordan's geopolitical position and, in particular, its desire and need to resort to measures of soft power and international diplomacy to maintain regional relevance. In "The Regional Policy and Power Capabilities of Jordan As a Small State" (2013), Martina Ponížilová critiques existing small state concepts and highlights often overlooked strengths of the small state by reconceptualizing the nature of their behavior. Even though Jordan is a small state, it still has regional influence and qualitative strength. The small state's ""smallness" can be judged only in comparison with other states and in relation with particular issues" and measured relative to its national interests, through qualitative measures. Ponížilová (2013) argues:

> The concept of power and power relations shifts the definition of small state from solely
> capabilities-based concept to another dimension – understanding state's size as an
> (in)ability (power, capacity) of a state *to achieve intended goals*, fulfil national interests,
> secure its demands and/or resist the demands of other states. (emphasis added) (p. 6)

She suggests that size and power might best be defined by a state's ability to set and measure national goals. The implications of this conceptual framework on this research are twofold.

First, Jordan relies on international support through foreign aid; Jordan's regional power depends on its ability to apply this aid to also serve national interests, so it is constantly negotiating national vs. international interests. Second, it is in its national interest to develop clear and effective systems to monitor and evaluate NGO programs, to efficiently apply foreign aid. It can be said that the evaluation processes mirror, or replicate, a system of organizational learning (with the goal of producing self-regulating learning systems).

A closer look at the effects of foreign aid to Jordan provides important insight into NGO agendas. International interests invest in refugee projects. As an example, following the invasion of Iraq (2003), Jordan experienced an influx of Iraqi refugees. Viewed as a 'refugee crisis,' international attention and aid soon followed to help relieve Jordan of resulting "financial and infrastructural ['burden']" (Stevens, 2013, p.33). While aid is beneficial to both Jordan and its refugees, the distribution and estimation of aid needs is highly controversial. Stevens notes discrepancies between cost estimates by the Jordanian Government and economists. Namely, in 2007 following the Iraqi crisis, economist Yusuf Mansur argued that, "We cannot look at this as a one-sided problem and not attribute the benefits we have seen from the surging population," referring to Iraqi refugees' investment in the economy and especially real estate (qtd. p. 33). Although the fluidity of an economy makes it nearly impossible to attain an accurate cost estimate, Jordan has benefited from higher cost estimates, because this amounts in more total foreign aid—aid which is applied to infrastructure (p. 34). Internationally funded programs are required to serve a quota of Jordanian beneficiaries in addition to the initial refugee beneficiaries. In the case of Iraqi refugees, the policy was to "identify equal numbers of poor and vulnerable Jordanians as Iraqis" (p. 34). Seeley, in "The Politics of Aid to Iraqi Refugees in Jordan" (2010) presents the complexity of this distribution of aid requirements. While some argue that supporting Jordanian infrastructure (long-term) is perhaps the only effective way to support target audiences, others believe this approach leads to significant shortcomings in serving the specific needs of the target audience.

Investing in long-term programs and infrastructure for sport and development in general is beneficial. However, it is also important to recognize and deliver on the unique needs of girls and women in sport, which might require short-term projects.

It is absolutely critical to ensure that aid fulfills the needs of the target population. Often, the discrepancy and shortcomings in implementation are really a question of time; many aid and

development programs are limited to short-term projects, though sometimes granted renewals. When investing aid more directly to target audiences, the scope of investment is often limited to segregated and short-term projects. In the example Seeley (2010) gives of a USAID school construction, an important component of the political story is that since 2007, Iraqi children are allowed to attend government schools. This allows for the allotted school to serve both Jordanians and Iraqis; this funding provides Jordanians with updated schools and additionally provides Iraqis with an opportunity to integrate and establish themselves in the country through education. The investment is long-term and integrated. When possible, integrated, cross-group facilitation is encouraged and benefits social cohesion (Allport 1954) (Lyras & Peachey 2011).

Alternately, separate education facilities for Iraqis (in this example), might ensure more direct aid allocation, but could further marginalize and isolate displaced persons from the rest of Jordanian society—both potentially socially and economically unsustainable. While the existing aid allocation, which heavily supports Jordanians (infrastructure-based) might be seen as negative for its potential shortcomings in supporting target audiences, it is significantly more effective in supporting Jordanian society (as a whole: including refugees) in the long term. Still, the process for aid allocation must be carefully monitored and creatively implemented to appropriately serve its constituents. This brief analysis of aid allocation in Jordan serves as a foundation for analyzing non-governmental organizations' target constituents and their motivation behind program designs.

Methodology

Research Experience and Positionality

In the following section, the researcher reflects on her research experience. I wanted to spend as much time with interviewees and gain field experience in the women's sport sector. Whenever I had the chance, I asked people about their experiences with sport to acquire a network of contacts and experiences. I had previously done some research on the women's professional soccer league in Jordan and only discovered limited online resources detailing the league and its teams. This emboldened my curiosity on the topic. Immediately after arriving in Jordan, I continued researching women's soccer teams and running groups, to find a community of female athletes to exercise and practice Arabic with, but also to build friendships with locals and learn about Jordan through our conversations. It was somewhat challenging to find access to

those communities. However, once I did, the voices of participants directed and enhanced the depth of this research. The community of women in this research was welcoming, determined, and very supportive and excited to share their experiences.

In conducting this research, interviews, and analyses I take into account my identity as a relatively privileged German-American female college athlete. I grew up with privileged access and support to pursue sport. I was aware that there were certain premises to take into consideration with this research. While I am familiar with Western sports infrastructure, I must stay open-minded to the local cultural context from which I am researching sport. For me, sport has always been an entry point into social interactions and from which I derive and practice important life skills, like confidence, teamwork, and determination. As a female athlete, I relate to participants in this research who share a similar appreciation and gratitude for the impact of sports in their lives. While I might refer to my own experiences to relate to participants, I must not immediately resort to cross-cultural comparison, but situate their stories within the Jordanian context—studying how intersectionality functions within those experiences. My social identity as a college researcher may manifest itself when I approach organizations, because participants may be careful in their language when sharing insights pertaining to their program evaluations.

Inspiration for this research comes from the concern for NGO's perpetuation of new neo-colonialist tendencies (Coalter, 2010) and engagement in a process of learning and unlearning how colonialism and racism function in developmental work. Being cognizant of colonial history is especially relevant to Jordan, which was under the British mandate until 1946, described as "late colonialism" (Eilon, 2007, p. 4). So, in addition to observing participant behavior throughout this research process, I constantly observe and reflect on how my positionality as a white, western researcher impacts my relationships and analyses in a field backdropped by neo-colonialism. How can NGOs not perpetuate dependency? How can they learn to be participatory? The goal of this research is to expose positive narratives of Jordanian women in sport and to learn from their experiences: their frustrations, successes, and aspirations, in the hope that this research contributes to an ongoing learning process that empowers local, grassroots leadership in sport.

In Jordan, I volunteered weekly in the after-school program practices at an NGO that provides sports practices and leadership training for girls and coach training clinics for women in Amman and Zarqa (Organization C). I had been in communication with them for several months.

I was inspired by their program, participants, and coaches to learn how they work with the community to implement their goals. Communicating my research interests with an administrator throughout my volunteering, I continued to build trust and adapt my research prospects to their feedback.

The interviewee search focused on organizations and experts on sports for development (SFD), seeking female leaders in this field. Via email and phone I reached out to interview contacts. My advisor also connected me with several contacts along these lines. About half of the contacts have primary experience with soccer and applying soccer as a tool for SFD, which is a result of my own participation on a soccer team in Jordan through which I gathered contacts.

Obtaining the data

Careful measures were taken to protect the identity and integrity of the participants. The names of participants are not revealed, nor are their direct titles or information that discloses their identity. At the start of every interview, participants were made aware of the consent form and statement, to which they gave verbal, written, or signed consent. Data was conducted through semi-structured interviews, with additional questions catering to the interviewee's specific area of expertise. As the interviewer, I built trust in these interviews by being very open about my research, intent, and own goals and experiences to participants. I found that sharing about myself actually prompted interesting overlaps and easy conversation. Participants had the space to clarify their answers when I asked follow-up questions. I took notes on paper during each interview. Directly after conducting each interview, I wrote detailed reflections of our conversations. This practice was in an effort to avoid misunderstanding or misinterpretation in my analyses, as information was recorded while it was still fresh in my mind. I revisited these reflections in addition to the original notes during my analyses.

Obstacles

Communication became difficult after our program was moved online and students returned to the United States due to the global COVID-19 outbreak. All participants were contacted via email or WhatsApp across a seven-hour time zone difference, making communication less frequent and more complicated. Possible contact opportunities were lost with offices closed and operating remotely. Several people whom I reached out to in higher level positions at soccer bodies in Jordan did not respond to my interview requests. Instead, the contact pool narrowed to my previous connections and those made through the program. While

in person, face-to-face introductions would have been preferred, this was not possible given the circumstance. One-hour Skype or Zoom video calls took their place. Remote interviews complicated consent. Although one participant returned a digital signed consent form, others responded to a written email consent statement, while one gave verbal consent and was not reachable for a written follow-up. Not requiring signed consent (which demands more time and effort from participants) was a compromise carefully calculated to reduce participant stress. Participant data is discussed with extra caution. Lastly, due to COVID-19, valuable field experience was cut short, limiting contact and conversation with Jordanians and local input on this research topic.

Another obstacle in this research, mentioned briefly above, involved limited access to resources and information on women's sports in Jordan. Preliminary and literature research, conducted online, showed few resources on the topic of women's sport in Jordan. Few of the following existed in Arabic, if at all, but even fewer in English: club team websites; updated team, federation, and organization Facebook pages on women's sports; newspaper articles covering female sports; public information on current female athletes… etc. One possible reason for this information gap is that some of this information is published in Arabic and was therefore less accessible to an American student researcher. While an Arabic record of women's sport history in Jordan exists, it is unclear if this also refers to current sports updates. Secondly, much of the sports scene in Jordan operates through a person-to-person network, like closed WhatsApp groups and word of mouth—female sports even more so as they often take place in closed spaces. Finally, media coverage, such as Facebook pages and websites, require a certain level of internal organization and administrative capacity from groups and teams, but also a sturdy sports infrastructure that facilitates such organization and interest.

Information regarding an organization's monitoring and evaluation processes was to some degree accessible through promotional literature, but primarily collected through anecdotal indicators of success from insider perspectives. As a result, participants may provide unique insight, but could have spoken on this topic with caution or bias.

Cause and Effect

The aforementioned challenge with access caused an increased reliance on narrative breadth to fill literature gaps describing sports opportunities, networks, and atmosphere. Deep analysis of a single organization was not feasible due to possible privacy, language, constituent

consent barriers and changes due to COVID-19. While maintaining research quality and depth, the scope of the data shifted to a wider interview sample of female athletes and leaders in sport programming in Jordan. The interview questions address inquiry into organizational and horizontal learning approaches through self-reflection. Questions focus on participant's own goals for women and girls in sport, as well as specific frustrations, successes, or challenges that they may have faced in their personal and career development as leaders.

Results and Discussion

Interviews

The purpose of the interviews was to conduct a grassroots assessment of female sports empowerment NGOs in Jordan and to determine what key factors should be considered in their assessment. Four main themes emerged from these conversations. Reflecting on their experiences in Jordan, participants emphasized empowerment, access and acceptance, growth opportunities, and positive narratives, as key focus points for supporting women's sports development. The thematic analysis of participant experiences refers back to the main research questions. It will discuss bottom-up (grassroots) learning, constituent collaboration, and cultural cognizance in program design.

Research Participants

Participant A: (Director, Organization A)

She is a former elite, extreme athlete, female sport trailblazer, and a director at an internationally acclaimed NGO. Organization A works in the *plus sport* to *no sport range* for peace and development. Her top goal for women's sports development is to recognize that there are influential women in sport and build off of their momentum. This includes highlighting elite athletes' success and impact, but especially women who are champions in their own right, like local leaders, role models, and change-makers.

Participant B: (Program Administrator, Organization B)

She is a program administrator for the SFD program at an international NGO (Organization B), a young activist and volunteer raising awareness for and challenging gender equality in sport, a former Jordanian national team and current professional player, as well as my teammate. Her top goal for women's sports development is to change the mindset of coaches beyond purely wanting to win, to encompass more of what sport has to offer, centered on a growth mindset.

Participant C: (Program Administrator, Organization C)

An American, she was first a volunteer and is now a program administrator at Organization C (where I volunteered), which provides after-school sports programming and teen leadership workshops for refugee and local girls. While the local coaches design programs and practices, program administrators bear much of the bureaucratic and interagency work. In the past, administrators of the program have had term limits, however this is being lifted. Her top goal for women's sports development is to empower diverse women and girls to become leaders in their communities.

Participant D: (Professor)

Former national-level athlete, she is a professor of Physical Education at a Jordanian University, whose research is in sports psychology and life skills in relation to sports, with a focus on gender. Her top goal as a professor, relating to women and girls in sport is for students to understand the history of women and sport and to experience sport for themselves. She hopes that as a hijab-wearing, female, athlete, professor, and leader, she is a role model and inspiration to her students.

Participant E: (Fitness Entrepreneur)

As a pioneering fitness entrepreneur, she is changing the scope of professionalism around fitness in Jordan. She was a member of the women's soccer and volleyball teams and competed in many other sports, before quitting these to transition to her current career. As a fitness coach, her top goal in developing women's sport is to increase awareness on the importance of fitness and health and to provide professional tools for coaches.

Empowerment

The interview guide questions do not specifically mention empowerment, however, participants frequently cycle back to this concept. Defined using interview responses, empowerment means to develop personal responsibility and capacity to invoke change; it is measurable when participants become leaders.

Several interview participants explain how their program design empowers program participants. As a current director at an NGO, Participant A describes their programs as participatory in planning, implementation, and evaluation (Participant A, personal communication, April 17, 2020). This NGO focuses on peacebuilding activities. Their sport-specific program applies the *plus sport* SFD framework. In this approach, sport is a tool for

peacebuilding and development objectives. For example, the NGO trains teachers—front line activists—in capacity-building techniques, with the objective that teachers then develop their own *theory of change* for a curriculum to implement in their own classrooms. This grassroots model supports multiple levels of empowerment through limited intervention; it empowers teachers and coaches, who in turn use sport to empower their students.

Participant B administers a similar teacher-based SFD program. She used the word "exchange" to describe the environment of their workshops with physical education teachers in Jordan (Participant B, personal communication, April 10, 2020). Though she did not use the phrase "participatory approach," as did Participant A, they both chose similar language to illustrate the emphasis of shared learning between program administrators and participants. The word "exchange" insinuates a give and take of equal value. Therefore, rather than instructional, Participant B views the workshops as a sharing of ideas, which accounts for flexibility, feedback, and ultimately, teacher ownership.

Teachers and coaches are the field experts who best understand the personal and relational, structural, and cultural dimensions that face their students and communities (Participant A, personal communication). Both Participant A and B stressed that the fusion of SFD theory and practice must function as a shared learning process and be adaptable. Teachers are empowered to design objectives specific to their needs, which encourages creative and adaptive approaches to address their unique challenges. As a result of this individuality, a participatory methodology lends itself to expanding the program scale to increase overall program participation and access to NGO programs. Participant A proudly explained that their SFD peacebuilding program expanded from just four to about 1,000 Jordanian schools. The program had to be adapted slightly to fit a much larger scale, but the participatory framework eased the transition. The benefits of increased participation and access will be discussed in depth later. The success of participatory programs depends more on the participant than NGO-based program facilitators. Empowering local leaders through shared learning environments fosters independence rather than dependence. Such attention to "forms of organization" and relationship (Lyras, 2011, p. 312) in grassroots, bottom-up models can be seen to address concern that NGOs foster dependency to neo-colonial institutions (Coalter, 2010).

Target groups have specific community values and needs. When designing SFD programs, one must carefully engage with these values and needs in order to trigger the

constituent's motivation to increase access and participation. In two separate studies, Participant D, a university professor, studied if and how two NGO SFD programs teach life skills, which she explained in the interview (Participant D, personal communication, April 8, 2020). One program was developed for a poor, rural community in the south of Jordan, while the other operated at community centers in a refugee camp. As the researcher, I was curious to understand how these programs compared in their outreach to women and girls.

I was surprised to find that the research participant had not considered my comparative inquiry between two NGO sport-for-development programs. She paused at my raised comparison. She had never compared her research of the two programs, because she conducted them independently and at different times. Nevertheless, she was also intrigued to unpack the comparison. I want to be sure to mention that she stressed how well-planned and encompassing both programs were. It didn't seem like she wanted to say that one was more effective than the other, but instead highlighted how outside circumstances (poor, rural south vs. crowded refugee camp) impact program results. She found refugees in the camp to have more interest and trust in the SFD program than rural villagers in the south had in theirs, accordingly. In this comparison, rural participants may already feel safe and settled in their communities, with little time or interest to engage with activity outside of chores and work, for example. On the other hand, refugees in refugee camps tend to trust NGOs and their peers who work with them, since they provide opportunities to enrich and open their lives to the outside world. Because NGOs often have established relationships with refugees at camps, it is possible that this kind of trust may be harder to earn outside of refugee communities.

The professor shared that when it comes down to it, successful implementation is more about matching the motivations of participants with programming, than the structure of the program itself, because even the best planned and structured program will fail (in reaching participants) if participants do not have the time, motivation, or interest in participating in it.

Access and Acceptance

What strategies have research participants applied to improve equal access for women and girls in sports programs? At least one of the following was brought up in conversation with all participants: providing safe transportation and offering segregated, all-female spaces for female participants. Access is defined as entry points and exposure to women's sports and SFD

programs, while acceptance often follows and describes an openness and enthusiasm towards (female) SFD initiatives. Transitioning from access to acceptance requires cultural awareness.

Why provide safe transportation? If Participant D had to give one suggestion for improving gender equity in sport in Jordan, it would be to combat the challenge of transportation for women and girls. Public transportation in Jordan is a challenge in its own right. There are no trains, scarce sidewalks, and only a nascent urban bus system. For women, transportation can be more challenging, due to a culture that is protective of its women and children. And so, while transportation for education or work is a must, women and children may be taught to err on the side of caution with transportation outside of those priorities. Access to safe and accessible transportation gives a sense of freedom and confidence, but without this access and when sport is not considered a priority, rationalizing an additional commute is much more difficult. Safe transportation mediates this challenge.

Organizations incorporate and honor constituents' value of protection. By addressing this concern, organizations build community trust to encourage awareness of sport as a priority. Reflecting on her growth as an administrator, Participant C realized that the more she understood about the "undercurrents of society" in Jordan, the more she became aware of specific challenges (Participant C, personal communication, April 3, 2020). One of which is how important it is for her organization to build a relationship of trust with families and communities, so that they feel that their daughters are safe. Small buses pick up and drop off participants in their neighborhoods before and after every practice. The female coach from their neighborhood rides with them, so the only male they interact with during the entire program is the bus driver. Rarely, a father may initially refuse to let his daughter participate, but then the local coaches are often able to negotiate in favor of participation. On one occasion, a player had recruited twenty neighbor girls to join her at practice, but the bus, unfortunately, could not safely fit all of them. This turnout shows how accessible their program is, but highlights the need for continued investment. Transportation ensures safety of participants and transparency for parents, while making it easier for participants to get to practices. Families value this commitment. Private and closed, all-female spaces also contribute to this trust.

Why provide segregated spaces for women in sport? It is important to clarify that providing access to separate, all-female facilities or spaces does not mean that they should always be separate. What participants advocate for are more options for women to participate in

sport. Some women may feel more comfortable in all-female spaces; others, like Participant E, train in mixed-gender spaces, but still wish to have the option to train in a closed, all-female setting (for example, to complete certain exercises without her hijab (personal communication, April 16, 2020)); or, women might prefer mixed-gender training. In SFD, some programs segregate by gender as a starting point to increase participation and, as acceptance of women in sport improves, proceeds to integrate, while others only work with women and girls. Increasing diverse opportunities reflects women's diverse values and interests and thus provides access to sport for more women.

Especially for families of young participants in SFD programs, the guarantee of closed spaces is comforting. Providing these options for outdoor team sports, like soccer, compared to individual sports, can pose more difficulty, because field spaces are limited. This is a resource issue—external to the programs—that NGOs adapt to. Participants D and E argue that in general, Jordan's few parks and safe public spaces or "focal sport points" limit sport access. Still, discrimination works on a structural level. When public fields are in high demand, participants shared that male practices are prioritized. Allport's condition for positive intergroup contact includes "support from the authorities, structures, and institutions of a society," which is not the case when male sports programming is considered more important (Lyras and Welty Peachey, 2011, p. 313). Although, in general, Organization C receives very little pushback on their all-girls sports programming, it did adjust its policy to exclusively hold practices at private locations after field time was taken away and boys sometimes disrupted their practices. Adjusting to private, closed locations means that practice times and settings are reliable; the girls can focus on practice.

Segregating instruction is sensitive to cultural and religious circumstances. Women's gyms, for example, might offer women similar freedom, because they can feel included and focus on themselves (Participant E). At Organization B, workshops are conducted with male and female coaches together. This means that the theory and practice for boys and girls is the same. However, the practical component of the workshop is split into two groups, male and female. This is because some coaches, especially in more conservative areas, might not feel comfortable coming into contact with the opposite sex for religious reasons. In order to ensure that all coaches feel included and can focus on the most important part of the program—the content— the practical component is conducted simultaneously, but on opposite sides of the field. Since

these coaches are public school physical education teachers, this method is also a reflection of the fact that public schools classrooms in Jordan are segregated by gender after third grade and taught by teachers of the same gender (according to a Queen Rania Foundation Fact Sheet, 2018). With constituent and families' trust and respect, more women and girls are able to participate.

Who is the target audience of SFD programs? Every program in this study is rooted in refugee outreach, but is committed to inter-group implementation. In addition to working directly through the Ministry of Education in public schools, Participants A and B also implement their programs in refugee camps and community centers. According to their websites, these programs emphasize teaching inter-group tolerance, trust, and cooperation (GIZ, 2019; "Peacebuilding Tools," 2020). Organization C runs its own after-school programs, specifically for refugee and local girls. A special rule requires that refugee services in Jordan allocate about 30% of their services to Jordanians (Participant C, personal communication). At Organization C, this ratio is intentionally increased to an almost 50:50 ratio of Jordanian and refugee participants and coaches. Participant C emphasizes that in order to achieve one of their main goals, social cohesion, equal and diverse representation is absolutely necessary. This, again, references Allport's (1954) theory on inter-group acceptance. To Participant C, the following friendship equals program success. She highlights best friends who met at practice, one Somali and the other Syrian. When they arrive at practice, they run into each other's arms and exchange about their days and struggles, with nothing but love for one another. She describes them as role models for each other. Their friendship embodies the organization's theory of change, which reads: "Diverse communities, led by women and girls, work together to advance collective well-being" (Participant C, personal communication, April 7, 2020). These two girls were brought together from different backgrounds as equals and as teammates, who work towards a common goal. They empower, learn from, and love one another.

Growth Opportunities

How has women's sports participation changed over time? Participants gave different answers on whether opportunities for women in sport have progressed over the last few years. Participant E voiced some frustration with professionalism, in team sports especially, while Participant A described increased participation and visibility with optimism. Growth

opportunities reference opportunities for women to pursue leadership positions and careers in sport, which support and inspire goals and motivations for girls pursuing sport.

Participant E is a fitness entrepreneur, but was formerly a national team player on the women's soccer and volleyball teams. There is a lot of room from improvement to support women in sport at the elite level. She feels as though pursuing professional sport in Jordan as a woman would have been a waste of her time and sees little progress in professionalism in women's sport infrastructure. As an athlete, her concern was that resources, like facilities, specialized trainers, rehabilitation, etc. were not adequately supported to sustain a healthy career. She attended university on a sports scholarship, but after graduating with her degree she quit competitive sport completely. At university there were few female competitive athletes, so, as an elite athlete, she found herself competing in many sports, at the request of the coaches. In a sense, her talent was spread thin. She realized that Jordan does not support an environment that builds champions. This mindset is general and not exclusive to women's sports. According to her, many families do not view professional athletics as legitimate careers for men either, because the work is "not worth it" (Participant A and D voiced similar observations). Even some professional male soccer players need to work a second job in order to survive financially.

Many athletes in Jordan abandon their sport just as they reach their peak performance in order to pursue a university degree and a career, because they do not see sustainable growth opportunities in sport. (While Participant D observes no difference in motives to participate in sport across genders, she *has* focused her research on understanding the gender specific barriers that lead athletes to suspend participation.) Participant E voiced frustration, not with regret, but with confidence and determination to bring change. She knew her potential would not go to waste. Now, as an established fitness entrepreneur providing professional development and certificates, she hopes to establish and legitimize sports careers in Jordan. She feels frustrated with a lack of clear organization and marketing of competitive and recreational women's sport, but believes in women's potential and so invests in female leaders: educating mothers, coaches, and trainers. Had she been offered some of the specialized health and fitness guidance that she now offers her clients, Participant E suggests that she might have known how to focus her energy on a specific sport and pursue it professionally. But even then, she wonders who would watch.

Positive Narratives

Development is hard to measure. So, in order to determine progress, we must decide how to narrate indicators of success. Instead of emphasizing barriers, giving voice to positive narratives for the need for gender equality in sport lays the foundation for breaking stereotypes and empowering women. Through this approach, organizations tune into the benefits of women's-sports-development.

Participant A reflected on the last ten to fifteen years with optimism. Female participation in sport is much higher than when she entered her sport career, and with access and participation comes acceptance. The U17 FIFA World Cup in Jordan brought a FIFA women's competition to the Middle East for the first time (U.S. Soccer, 2016). This means that it brought competitive international women's soccer to the attention of Jordanians: "a big success" in spreading acceptance of women in sport in general (Participant A, personal communication). Hosting elite tournaments like this provides a platform for women's sport to be taken seriously and the impact visibility has on its viewers, she believes, is evident.

Development, specifically for women's soccer, was central to the Jordan Football Association (JFA) agenda for the U17 FIFA Women's World Cup Jordan 2016. The Local Organizing Committee (LOC) was 75 percent female and coordinated the construction of stadiums and 14 training pitches with special attention to accessibility issues ("Jordanian legacy bodes well", 2017). Because this push for soccer development was spearheaded by a Women's World Cup with female leadership, the tournament's popularity not only increased awareness of the women's game, but also acceptance. It is interesting to note that the development campaign highlighted that it also specifically targeted refugee children, hundreds of whom were invited to matches and were recipients of soccer ball donations (2017; "Football donation campaign," 2017). Then LOC CEO, Samar Nassar, (an elite athlete who swam for Jordan in the Olympics) is now the first female secretary general at the JFA. Multiple participants and friends of the researcher mentioned her name as a nod to the growing recognition of women in leadership. It is through highlighting the trailblazers, lifting local leaders, and representing female sports and athletes in the media that participants hope to build momentum and support for women in sports.

As Roper and Pettit (2002) suggest, it is hard to track success in development because the influence of external, uncontrollable factors is tightly intertwined in the outcome. But positive narratives about local leaders and growth connect to individual and organizational learning

processes. The transition from participant to leader demonstrates program commitment and reflects positively on institutional memory. Participant C proudly shared a story of two sisters who have been with the program for many years. She celebrated their success and their ambition. Their positive resilience story is passed on through the program and continues to inspire others throughout their sustained program participation.

In a refugee camp during the first year of this program, the younger sister heard girls playing at a field near her house. Eager to join the fun, she ran to the field from her house and asked to participate. After being introduced to the sport, she quickly fell in love and excelled at soccer. Her dream is to become a professional soccer player.

This particular organization is *sport plus* oriented, so the focus is on using sport as a tool for development and not necessarily training a specific sport. But, by working closely with other SFD programs, this organization referred her to a skill development program, bringing her closer to her dream. Complications with citizenship may stand in the way of that dream, but nevertheless she trains. Her story is told, because she shows younger girls what is possible; she is a local role model. Representation, like hers, is key for this NGO, because visibility of diverse participants and the all-female coaching staff builds a unique trust with parents and the community. Coaches and girls organically recruit other participants by word of mouth in their own neighborhoods and communities.

The soccer standout was followed to the program by her older sister who showed less interest in pursuing sport, but still continued with the curriculum. She excelled in their teen leadership program and found community in the program team and participants. They supported her, especially in her academic pursuits. After two failed attempts, she passed the difficult Tawjihi exam (required for University). She was motivated and resilient, lessons learned from her years with the program. Now she has returned to the program as a coach—a testament to her empowerment and her trust and belief in the program. She provides first-hand institutional memory and marks an indication of program growth. Over the time period of their involvement, these sisters have observed change within themselves and the program. As empowered women, they now empower others. In development, "it is not always clear what it [the organization] should be learning," but by reintegrating participants as coaches, the organization taps into the program's core, beneficiary interests (Roper and Pettit, 2002, p. 263). At the end of the day, the

program is driven by and for its constituents. In supporting participant leadership, organizations open themselves to be challenged in program design, implementation, and evaluation.

Horizontal, peer-to-peer learning and reflection are central to successful SFD program design. Horizontal learning is learning in partnership and rooted in community, as it requires "self-evaluation and reflexivity" among equal partners (Horváth et al., 2015, para. 8). In other words, horizontal learning is characterized by reflective exchange of lessons learned by doing. In the example of the older sister, she is an expert, as she has experienced the program firsthand. In an SFD context, those who learn in practice are primarily the players and coaches or facilitators. Peer-to-peer learning (horizontal learning) and reflection is integrated into SFD program design.

Reflection is incorporated in the curriculum. For the last fifteen minutes of each practice at Organization C, the girls sit together in the center circle and coaches ask reflective questions. Girls share how they liked the practice and point out a particular moment. Then coaches offer a brief lesson, followed by questions about the theme of the day. The girls, ranging from roughly five to thirteen years old, offer powerful insights. On the theme of women's empowerment, one girl raised her hand and remarked (in rough translation): "Just because a woman is too kind and nice doesn't mean you can take advantage of her" (personal observation, March 8, 2020). The coaches were impressed and asked her to repeat herself loudly and clearly. The girls learn from their coaches, but are also given the space to contribute back into the conversation, so that their peers and coaches might also learn from them. According to Roper and Pettit (2002), "learning organization" illustrates this shared commitment to learning. Reflection caters to dynamic and consistent exchange of knowledge.

As learning organizations, exchange of knowledge is useful in determining what has been learned. The NGOs implement frequent and sustained reflection and communication in order to evaluate and learn from programming. Participant A said that at Organization A they "love learning and reflection". Because development and peacebuilding is so hard to measure, the debriefings offer opportunities to grow and learn from the process. Through their intense participatory monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system, which includes surveys, baseline studies, objectives, and observation, Organization A determines that program implementation should take place for a minimum of forty hours of interaction.

Time-span of program implementation impacts program success. Organization B conducts a five-month partnership with teachers including field visits, which inform content for

multiple follow-up workshops. It concludes with a sports festival, which celebrates how coaches and students have grown and learned over this period. Ample time allows teacher experience to inform improvements. A peculiar challenge frustrates Participant B, which is that the Ministry of Education (which assigns teachers to this program) tends to choose older teachers. This often results in a turnover of PE coaches to retirement shortly after an intense 5-month cooperation, making the implementation period quite temporary. This is frustrating because teachers and the NGO have both invested time and energy into the relationship. Since retirement results in short-term implementation, it makes it slightly more difficult to establish institutional memory of sport for development coaching methods and practices at these schools. This specific program is also limited to a renewable three-year implementation plan.

The programs in this study were founded in 2007 and later, with the latest being 2016. This means that these programs are all fairly new, so it is hard to evaluate their long-term success. Especially for the programs working with children, it is important to offer sustained programming that grows with them. The full effect of programs on constituents and their communities might only present themselves over several years. It will be important to continue this research to be able to evaluate changes in monitoring success.

Field Experience

In this section, the researcher briefly reflects on her experience and observations when training with a Jordanian women's team.

In my practices with this team, I engaged in informative conversations with recreational and professional female soccer players and got to experience and observe one example of women's soccer infrastructure and practical implementation.

I found the women's soccer team through the club at the gym I attended. It took asking several employees where I might find the women's soccer coach, all in Arabic, to finally be directed to an office where I was given the coach's phone number. Over the phone, he described where and when I would be able to find the bus that drives to the practice fields. I started practicing with this team for several days a week during the semester.

On the first evening of practice, I boarded a bus in the club's back parking lot—a large white van filled with shy, younger players, the middle-aged driver, and an equipment boy who packed our balls, cones, and bottled waters. Upon arrival I found out that the older team, which I was hoping to join, was scrimmaging the U14 counterpart—my bus buddies. We were practicing

in a stadium in the King Hussein Sports City: a fenced-in turf field under lights and large stands. It was almost easy to forget that we were still in the heart of Amman, since we were surrounded by other turf fields, trees, and sports buildings, but the adthan (the call to prayer) of a nearby mosque and distant car horns brought me back. It felt like after over two weeks of searching for any sign of a women's soccer practice since I had arrived in Jordan, I had stumbled upon what seemed like a hidden soccer community.

On any given evening in downtown Amman, it is very common to find men and women watching men's soccer games in almost every cafe and restaurant while many smoke shisha and converse with friends and family. Soccer is part of social life. While the topic of men's soccer was almost unavoidable in conversations among my peers, professors, and in public social spaces, like cafes, when I brought up the topic of women's soccer in Jordan in casual conversation, few could offer concrete details. So, while I knew of the professional league from my own research, I was still a bit surprised to find all of these players and another women's team practicing on the fields next to us—where a professional men's team practiced afterward.

Introducing myself as we passed a ball, I soon found myself among talented athletes. One of my older teammates showed me pictures of herself on the first-place podium of a Jordanian marathon, while pointing to another who summited Mt. Kilimanjaro. I joked with her that I was a nobody among celebrities. She laughed and shook her head and assured me that I was welcome there. While running was her main sport, soccer was also her passion.

After a brief warm-up as one big team and an introduction to the coach, we were assigned positions and on the coach's whistle started the scrimmage. Although most teammates spoke some English, the coach was directing players in Arabic, especially from the U14 team. He stopped play here and there to instruct a proper throw in, correct positioning, and encourage them to be *strong* [قوة] in their tackles. Some older players played on the U14 squad, instructing and supporting their young teammates, while the U14's bench overflowed with girls in their gear and cleats, watching intently. But, there were few substitutions. As far as I could tell, a single coach and his assistant goalie coach were coaching this practice of at least 30 women and girls. A few older players (ranging from about 15-30 years old) gave occasional instructions and praise to the girls.

After practice, the group of us boarded the van again and it drove to the outskirts of the city, where the bus driver stopped at each girl's specific dropoff point close to home, before

heading back to the club. We called out our neighborhoods as the bus driver wound through the sundown streets of Amman, in the most efficient order possible. Especially for the younger players and their families, this bus provides peace of mind and makes attending practices possible. Even for me, a college student studying abroad, the bus provided comfort, consistency, and even though it sometimes took longer, it saved me money otherwise spent on a taxi.

It took me about three practices before I was added to the team's WhatsApp group, where I could catch on to the upcoming practice times, locations, and cancellations. Practice times were mostly consistent, but the fields alternated between two locations on what seemed like a day-by-day basis. I was proud to have tapped into a small network of the women's soccer community that I had been seeking.

I wish that I had the opportunity to stay and compete with the professional team during its summer league. After my first practice, the coach approached me and offered me a contract to play with them during the professional season. I was shocked and honored, to say the least. He insisted that I should stay. Everything would be paid for: my flight, housing, and food. A teammate translated and affirmed that the league is competitive and that there is a lot of money budgeted specifically for international players to ensure this. In the end, not much came of this opportunity, when I explained that I had to return to my university. And when I asked about following through with this opportunity the following summer, the coach smiled and said: Who knows what will happen then? I might be dead! I guess that means that he doesn't plan that far ahead. But, I was still confused that I could get no further information on this opportunity in the future.

Conclusion

In a small state like Jordan, maintaining a strong relationship with international bodies is part of its political identity. NGOs, especially those that work with refugees, are an important part of this political positioning and construct a critical social link between the people in Jordan. Studying the role of women's empowerment through sport in the social, cultural, and political context further complicates the nature of relationships between actors and beneficiaries. The scope of SFD work with women in Jordan has exhibited significant growth over the last several years. But, in part because of its relatively recent introduction to Jordan, tracking the impact of

its young growth is an important step in supporting sustainable programs and infrastructure, and to expose areas of improvement.

The guiding research questions seem to suggest room for growth in the areas of grassroots assessment and collaboration. SFD NGOs in Jordan already support bottom-up learning through participatory program design, implementation, and assessment. In order to better understand and represent the lives and aspirations of their constituents, NGOs employ and collaborate with local professionals and program graduates. The research shows that while there is always room for learning, reflection, and improvement, the women's-sport SFD movement in Jordan is at the forefront of reflexive program design and implementation, while still grappling with the criticisms directed toward the field of development, in general. In Jordan, female leaders, especially, continue to challenge social expectations and build on each other's experiences as athletes, leaders, and learners.

While they may face certain hurdles, like resources, access, career growth opportunities, and public support, their contribution to sport and women's development is innovative and impactful. Jordanians share some cultural and religious values with countries in the region that have been viewed to limit women's freedom by some Western and conservative opinions. As public acceptance of women's sports grows, the landscape of cultural influence shifts and adapts. Campaigns to empower women and improve accessibility and acceptance bring to light important nuance and details that might be interpreted as barriers. Instead of focusing on the barriers, what if we ask how we can listen to and learn from the stories that exhibit growth and learning? As a researcher, athlete, and teammate, how can I hear these stories and leverage the positivity of their present, exciting narratives to continue their momentum?

Study Limitations

This research aims to offer insight into local perspectives on NGO implementation of women's sports development. But, just as there is not one best way to understand success in development, this research could answer the same questions from several different angles. A similar analysis, for instance, focused on individual sports, could illustrate a very different landscape. In addition, the limited research period prevents the researcher from conducting a more comprehensive analysis. This could include field visits to multiple organizations and offer additional reflection on the intersectional complexity in women's development. This research

was based on five interviews, which represent important insight into their own experiences and field of work, but they represent similar perspectives and do not represent all stakeholders, such as students or program participants, parents, and athletic governing bodies (like the JFA). Given the small sample size, the statistical significance of the study should be taken into consideration. It is important to acknowledge the geographic limitations of the research. Research was conducted primarily in an urban center of the country, Amman. While some research participants spoke to changes in Jordan on a national level, this research does not seek to generalize the perspectives represented to all of Jordan. It primarily reflects observations from urban and administrative sources. Finally, the theoretical framework serves as a guide, but does not include an extensive comparative list. As such, this research contributes to the ongoing definitions and analyses on the topic of development and learning.

Recommendations for Future Studies

Expanding on the study limitations, potential for future studies is expansive. First, because of the nature of development as a dynamic field of study, a longitudinal study could continue to probe similar questions and produce very different results. The programs in this study were founded in 2007 and later, with the latest being 2016. This means that these programs are all fairly new, so it is hard to evaluate their long-term success at this moment. It will be important to continue this research to be able to evaluate changes in evaluating success.

Further, to better understand how community support for women in sports in Jordan varies across communities, demographics, and geography, a study might include a larger interview base, to include family members (parents, siblings, extended family), community leaders, and participants. Within this scope, collecting an age range of research participants could also provide an opportunity to analyze generational perspectives.

Finally, it is worth conducting a comparative analysis of women's sport development between Jordan and neighbors in the Middle East. Diverse in more than just geopolitical capital and deeply interconnected, it is worthy to compare experts' evaluations of successful development amongst regional actors.

References

Allport, G. W., Clark, K., & Pettigrew, T. (1954). The Nature of Prejudice.

Argyris, C., & Schon, D. A. (1974). *Theory in Practice: Increasing Professional Effectiveness*. Jossey-bass.

Blom, L. C., Gerstein, L., Stedman, K., Judge, L., Sink, A., & Pierce, D. (2015). Soccer for Peace: Evaluation of In-country Workshops with Jordanian Coaches. *Journal of Sport for Development*, *3*(4), 1-12.

Coalter, F. (2007). Sports Clubs, Social Capital and Social Regeneration: 'Ill-defined interventions with hard to follow outcomes'?. *Sport in society*, *10*(4), 537-559.

Coalter, F. (2010). Sport-for-development: going beyond the boundary?. *Sport in society*, *13*(9), 1374-1391.

Eilon, J. B., & Alon, Y. (2007). *The making of Jordan: Tribes, colonialism and the modern state* (Vol. 61). IB Tauris.

FIFA U-17 Women's World Cup 2016 - News - Football donation campaign benefiting refugees & children in Jordan. (2017, May 21). Retrieved April 26, 2020, from https://www.fifa.com/u17womensworldcup/news/football-donation-campaign-benefiting-refugees-children-in-jordan-2884606

FIFA U-17 Women's World Cup 2016 - News - Jordanian legacy bodes well for future of women's football. (2016, October 24). Retrieved April 26, 2020, from https://www.fifa.com/u17womensworldcup/news/jordanian-legacy-bodes-well-for-future-of-women-s-football-2845723

GIZ. (2020, March 30). Sport for Development. Retrieved April 24, 2020, from https://www.giz.de/en/worldwide/43770.html

Hancock, M., Lyras, A., & Ha, J. P. (2013). Sport for development programs for girls and women: A global assessment. *Journal of Sport for Development*, *1*(1), 15-24.

Horváth, L., Simon, T., & Kovács, A. (2015). Development and Embedding of the Horizontal Learning System into the Hungarian Institutional System of Pedagogical Service. In *ATEE Annual Conference* (pp. 24-26).

Jordan builds on World Cup legacy with inaugural Women's Pro-League. (2019, November 5). FIFA. Retrieved April 23, 2020, from https://www.fifa.com/womens-football/news/jordan-builds-on-world-cup-legacy-with-womens-league#action-from-the-the-1st-jordanian-professional-women-s-season-2019-x3889

Lyras, A. (2007). *Characteristics and psycho-social impacts of an inter-ethnic educational sport initiative on Greek and Turkish Cypriot youth*. Storrs, CT: University of Connecticut.

Lyras, A., & Hums, M. A. (2009). Sport and social change: The case for gender equality. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance,* 80(1), 7-8,21. Retrieved from https://ezproxy.haverford.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.haverford.edu/docview/215755394?accountid=11321

Lyras, A., & Welty Peachey, J. (2011). Integrating sport-for-development theory and praxis. *Sport Management Review*, 14(4), 311-326. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.smr.2011.05.006.

Peacebuilding Tools. (2020). Retrieved April 24, 2020, from https://www.generationsforpeace.org/en/how-we-work/peace-building-tools/

Peters, Rebecca Warne. (2016). Participation denied: The professional boundaries of monitoring and evaluation in international development. *Human Organization,* 75, (4) (Winter): 315-325.

Ponížilová, M. (2013). The Regional Policy and Power Capabilities of Jordan as a Small State. *Central European Journal of International and Security Studies*, *7*(1), 1-22.

Queen Rania Foundation. (2018). *Qrf Fact Sheet Gender And Education In Jordan*. Retrieved from https://www.qrf.org/sites/default/files/2019-07/gender_and_education_in_jordan_en_condensed.pdf

Roper, L., & Pettit, J. (2002). Development and the Learning Organisation: An introduction. *Development in Practice*, 12(3-4), 258–271. https://doi.org/10.1080/0961450220149654

Saavedra, M. (2005). Women, Sport and Development. *International Platform on Sport and Development*.

Seeley, N. (2010). The politics of aid to Iraqi refugees in Jordan. *Middle East Report*, *256*, 37-42. Solomon, M. J., & Chowdhury, A. M. R. (2002). Knowledge to action: Evaluation for learning in a multi-organisational global partnership. *Development in Practice*, *12*(3-4), 346-354.

Stevens, D. (2013). Legal status, labelling, and protection: The case of Iraqi 'refugees' in Jordan. *International Journal of Refugee Law*, *25*(1), 1-38.

Taylor, J. (1998). NGOs as learning organisations. *Community Development Resource Association*.

U.S. Soccer. (2016, September 30). 5 Things to Know: The U-17 WNT and 2016 FIFA U-17 Women's World Cup. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from https://www.ussoccer.com/stories/2016/09/5-things-to-know-the-u17-wnt-and-2016-fifa-u17-womens-world-cup

Appendices

Copy of Interview Questions

Briefly explain what your job consists of on a typical daily basis. What do you enjoy most about it? What frustrates or challenges you?

    I.   **Means of sport access for women in Jordan**:

1. Reflecting back on when you first wanted to enter into sport, what, or who, inspired you to pursue sport? A specific moment?

2. Women are increasingly breaking glass ceilings and entering historically male dominated professions, but not without challenge. Can you give a specific example of a challenge you encountered when finding and pursuing sports programs or opportunities? How did you tackle this challenge?

    II.   **Perception of women in sport in Jordan**:

3. Was there ever a moment that you/your program experienced direct pushback from carrying out your services because of gender? If so, could you explain what you felt in that moment? How did that experience impact future decisions?

4. With your valuable experience in this field of work, what is your top goal in your job, relating to women and girls pursuing sports?

5. What is a project or campaign in promoting public acceptance of women in sports that you find effective and noteworthy in Jordan? Can you describe a scenario to which you can pinpoint that it "worked"? In your opinion, what made it effective?

    III.   **NGO leadership hierarchy and scope of work**:

6. From the previous question: Describe the design process of this program? For example, who is the target demographic of women/girls?; How do you measure program goals?; What details are most important to the program?

7. Learning from effective programming, how do you record and share these experiences to build institutional memory and/or support organizational learning?

8. If you could give one suggestion for improving gender equity in sport in Jordan, what would it be?

Informed Consent Form

Informed Consent Form

SIT Study Abroad
a program of World Learning

Title: NGOs as Learning Organizations: Evaluating Female Sports Development in Jordan Through the Lens of Women's Soccer

Your Name/Homeschool: Saede Eifrig/Haverford College

School for International Training—Jordan: Geopolitics, International Relations, and the Future of the Middle East

1. The purpose of this study is to understand the how NGO initiatives for women and girls' sports development in Jordan evaluate their success in comparison to existing infrastructure for women and girls' access to sport in Jordan.

2. **Rights Notice**
If at any time, you feel that you are at risk or exposed to unreasonable harm, you may terminate and stop the interview. Please take some time to carefully read the statements provided below.
   a. *Privacy* - all information you present in this interview may be recorded and safeguarded. If you do not want the information recorded, you need to let the interviewer know.

   b. *Anonymity* - all names in this study will be kept anonymous unless the participant chooses otherwise.

   c. *Confidentiality* - all names will remain completely confidential and fully protected by the interviewer. By signing below, you give the interviewer full responsibility to uphold this contract and its contents. The interviewer will also sign a copy of this contract and give it to the participant.

3. **Instructions:**
Please read the following statements carefully and mark your preferences where indicated. Signing below indicates your agreement with all statements and your voluntary participation in the study. Signing below while failing to mark a preference where indicated will be interpreted as an affirmative preference. Please ask the researcher if you have any questions regarding this consent form.

I am aware that this interview is conducted by an independent undergraduate researcher with the goal of producing a descriptive case study on how NGO initiatives for women and girls' sports development in Jordan evaluate their success in comparison to existing infrastructure for women and girls' access to sport in Jordan.

I am aware that the information I provide is for research purposes only. I understand that my responses will be confidential and that my name will not be associated with any results of this study.

I am aware that I have the right to full anonymity upon request, and that upon request the researcher will omit all identifying information from both notes and drafts.

I am aware that I have the right to refuse to answer any question and to terminate my participation at any time, and that the researcher will answer any questions I have about the study.

I am aware of and take full responsibility for any risk, physical, psychological, legal, or social, associated with participation in this study.

I am aware that I will not receive monetary compensation for participation in this study, but a copy of the final study will be made available to me upon request.

I [do   /   do not   ] give the researcher permission to use my name and position in the final study.

I [do   /   do not   ] give the researcher permission to use my organizational affiliation in the final study.

I [do   /   do not   ] give the researcher permission to use data collected in this interview in a later study.

Date:
————————————————————

Participant's Signature:
————————————————————

Participant's Printed Name:
————————————————————

Researcher's Signature:
————————————————————

Thank you for participating!
Questions, comments, complaints, and requests for the final written study can be directed to:
Dr. RaedAltabini, SIT Jordan Academic Director
Email: raed.altabini@sit.edu

Email Written Consent

Please reply with YES or NO to the following consent:

"The ISP explores how NGO programs measure the success of their impact on female sports development in Jordan and the impact thereof on improving women's opportunities in sport. You have the right to withdraw from this research at any time. There will be no compensation for participating in this study. There is no known harm out of participating. By replying YES to this email, you agree to taking part in this study."

Consent to use ISP Form

SIT Study Abroad
School for International Training

Access, Use, and Publication of ISP/Internship

Student Name: Saede Eifrig

Email Address: seifrig@haverford.edu
Title of ISP/FSP/Internship: NGOs as Learning Organizations: Evaluating Female Sports Development in Jordan Through the Lens of Women's Soccer

Program and Term/Year: Jordan: Geopolitics, International Relations, and the Future of the Middle East (JOR), Spring 2020.

Student research (Independent Study Project, Internship) is a product of field work and as such students have an obligation to assess both the positive and negative consequences of their field study. Ethical field work, as stipulated in the SIT Policy on Ethics, results in products that are shared with local and academic communities; therefore copies of Internship paper/ISP are returned to the sponsoring institutions and the host communities, at the discretion of the institution(s) and/or community involved.
By signing this form, I certify my understanding that:

1. I retain ALL ownership rights of my ISP/Internship project and that I retain the right to use all, or part, of my project in future works.

2. World Learning/SIT Study Abroad may publish the ISP/Internship in the SIT Digital Collections, housed on World Learning's public website.

3. World Learning/SIT Study Abroad may archive, copy, or convert the ISP/Internship for non-commercial use, for preservation purposes, and to ensure future accessibility.

- World Learning/SIT Study Abroad archives my ISP/Internship in the permanent collection at the SIT Study Abroad local country program office and/or at any World Learning office.
- In some cases, partner institutions, organizations, or libraries in the host country house a copy of the ISP/Internship in their own national, regional, or local collections for enrichment and use of host country nationals.

4. World Learning/SIT Study Abroad has a non-exclusive, perpetual right to store and make available, including electronic online open access, to the ISP/Internship.

5. World Learning/SIT Study Abroad websites and SIT Digital Collections are publicly available via the Internet.

6. World Learning/SIT Study Abroad is not responsible for any unauthorized use of the ISP/Internship by any third party who might access it on the Internet or otherwise.

7. I have sought copyright permission for previously copyrighted content that is included in this ISP/Internship allowing distribution as specified above.

Saede Eifrig		4/27/20
Student Signature		Date

Withdrawal of Access, Use, and Publication of ISP/Internship

Given your agreement to abide by the SIT Policy on Ethics, withdrawing permission for publication may constitute an infringement; the Academic Director will review to ensure ethical compliance.

☐ I hereby withdraw permission for World Learning/SIT Study Abroad to include my ISP/Internship in the Program's office permanent collection.

Reason:

☐ I hereby withdraw permission for World Learning/SIT Study Abroad to release my ISP/Internship in any format to individuals, organizations, or libraries in the host country for educational purposes as determined by World Learning/SIT Study Abroad.

Reason:

☐ I hereby withdraw permission for World Learning/SIT Study Abroad to publish my ISP/Internship on its websites and in any of its digital/electronic collections, or to reproduce and transmit my ISP/Internship electronically.

Reason:

Student Signature	Date

Academic Director has reviewed student reason(s) for withdrawing permission to use and agrees it does not violate the SIT Study Abroad Policy on Ethics.

Academic Director Signature   Date

Note: This form is to be included with the electronic version of the paper and in the file of any World Learning/SIT Study Abroad archive.