

February 2021

## Women's Cultural Attendance in Istanbul: Why So Low?

Sacit H. Akdede

*Izmir Bakircay University*

Victoria Ateca-Amestoy

*University of the Basque Country*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws>



Part of the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

Cover Page Footnote:

Akdede acknowledges the support of the Turkish Scientific and Technological Research Institution-TÜBİTAK. Ateca-Amestoy has received support from the Ministry of Science and Technology "ECO2009-10818", the Basque Government "IT241-07", and the "Assessing effective tools to enhance cultural participation" CULTURE 3.2. EACEA project. We are grateful to participants in a seminar in University of Granada for their comments. All errors are solely ours.

### Recommended Citation

Akdede, Sacit H. and Ateca-Amestoy, Victoria (2021). Women's Cultural Attendance in Istanbul: Why So Low?. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 22(1), 181-200.

Available at: <https://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws/vol22/iss1/11>

---

## Women's Cultural Attendance in Istanbul: Why So Low?

### Cover Page Footnote

Akdede acknowledges the support of the Turkish Scientific and Technological Research Institution-TÜBİTAK. Ateca-Amestoy has received support from the Ministry of Science and Technology "ECO2009-10818", the Basque Government "IT241-07", and the "Assessing effective tools to enhance cultural participation" CULTURE 3.2. EACEA project. We are grateful to participants in a seminar in University of Granada for their comments. All errors are solely ours.

## Women's Cultural Attendance in Istanbul: Why So Low?

By Sacit Hadi Akdede<sup>1</sup>, Victoria Ateca-Amestoy<sup>2</sup>

### Abstract

This paper investigates the possible determinants of attendance at cultural and artistic events in Istanbul, Turkey, which was designated one of Europe's cultural capitals in 2010. The unique data set used in this study was drawn from a representative sample of households in Istanbul by selecting one individual over the age of 18 from each household for interview. A professional research company in Istanbul used clustered random sampling to collect information from 100 main and 100 substitute clusters from the Istanbul area. Zero-inflated negative binomial methodology was used to analyze the determinants of attendance at different cultural events in Istanbul. In the regression analysis, we grouped all cultural activities into two categories for the dependent variables: "cultural heritage" and "performing arts and cinema". The performing arts and cinema category comprised six activities (theatre, cinema, opera-ballet-modern dance, classical music concerts, rock-pop-jazz concerts, classical Turkish folk arabesque concerts) while other activities were included in the cultural heritage category. We found very similar results to previous studies regarding many determinants of cultural attendance. Contrary to most previous results, however, which are derived from representative samples from Western countries, we found strong negative gender effects and differences in female cultural participation depending on the type of activity. Gender determinants of cultural participation have been addressed in two main ways: as one more variable in the "mixed factors" category or as a manifestation of gender roles and social norms. Other things being equal, being a woman increases the probability of never having participated in more social cultural events (the going-out dimension of cultural attendance). We therefore recommend policies to empower women's participation in and sharing of cultural activities.

*Keywords:* Cultural participation, Gender differences, Live attendance, Istanbul, Count models.

### Introduction

This paper investigates the determinants of attendance at different cultural events in Istanbul, Turkey, which was designated one of Europe's cultural capitals for 2010. It investigates who participates in cultural events and how much they participate. This information is valuable for policy makers in planning urban cultural development. We also investigate whether women's participation or attendance (we use both terms interchangeably) in Istanbul differs from that of

---

<sup>1</sup> Sacit Hadi Akdede is a professor of economics at Izmir Bakircay University in Izmir, Turkey. His work centers around cultural economics, political economy, and public economics. He has published in journals like Journal of Cultural Economics, Empirical Studies of the Arts, The Social Science Journal, Applied Economics Letters, Economics letters. Recently he is working on the economics of Broadway.

<sup>2</sup> Victoria Ateca-Amestoy is an associate professor of economics at Economic Analysis II. University of the Basque Country, Bilbao, Spain. Her work centers around cultural economics, welfare economics, subjective well-being, econometrics, and microeconomics. Her recent publication appeared in journals like journal of cultural economics, Journal of happiness studies, Social Indicators Research, European Journal of Operational Research

men. This point is important since a majority of women in Turkey work inside the home and raise children whereas men are considered and expected to be the bread winners working outside. We should note that this is only an observed fact rather a social norm that we desire. If women attend cultural activities and become more culturally educated, their children are also much more likely to be exposed to cultural goods and activities.

Research has consistently shown that gender is an important factor determining cultural consumption. More specifically, women are more likely than men to attend classical music concerts, opera, live theatre, dance performances, read fiction, and visit art museums (Lizardo, 2012: 23). This paper investigates whether this pattern of behavior is also observable for Turkish women. The range of cultural events investigated in this paper varies from the Western highbrow cultural activities like classical music concerts, opera, live theatre, dance performances, and art museums visits to traditional and religious cultural events like visits to mosques, dervish lodge (tekke and dergah), madrasah (medrese), and tomb (turbe), etc.. This classification of broad range of cultural events seems to be necessary to avoid some possible biases in defining culture and cultural attendance. It is also necessary not to mislead the reader in the meaning of culture and cultural activities.

Gender and other factors affecting cultural attendance have been studied intensively for different countries and contexts (Van Hek and Kraaykamp, 2013: 324). This paper joins several recent studies investigating the determinants of cultural attendance in Istanbul using a survey data.

Internationally, knowledge of who participates and why among the general population is hampered by a lack of cultural statistics for various countries (Bihagen and Katz-Gerro, 2000: 328). Most evidence and most published academic research have relied on data collected in the USA and Europe. Some exceptions include Israel (Katz-Gerro et al., 2005) and South Africa (Snowball et al., 2010).

When studying the determinants of cultural attendance, scholars mainly investigate income, age, education, gender, occupation, cultural capital, employment status, and class position. Briefly, our estimates indicate the relevance of cultural capital variables, consistent with the predictions of learning-by-consuming models for the consumption of cultural goods. That is, both the individual's education level and their father's education level determine both the probability of being a cultural patron and the intensity of participation in entertainment heritage activities. Material resources, measured by household income, act as both a barrier and a moderator for intensity in both dimensions. Contrary to most previous studies, we find that female cultural participation is lower than that of males, even after controlling for variables that may determine time, money, and cultural cognitive skills. We discuss these gender effects in the Turkish context and comment on the relevance of cultural participation for women's empowerment. Studying women's participation of cultural events is significantly important since men in Turkey are mostly considered to be bread earners working outside late hours whereas women spend more time with children. Therefore, cultural capital of women would affect the children's behavior in terms of cultural participation. This paper contributes to the literature in terms of providing more empirical evidence on women's attendance to culture. In addition, this paper is, to the best of our knowledge, the first paper in terms of cultural attendance of women in Istanbul.

The paper is organized as follows. The next section briefly summarizes the literature on cultural attendance while paying special attention to the Turkish case. Section three gives information about the data and estimation method. Section four presents the results while section five discusses the results and suggests some policy implications.

## Literature Review

We briefly review three aspects of the literature related to the current paper: Determinants of cultural attendance in general, gender differences in cultural attendance and determinants of cultural attendance in Turkey, including gender differences. This review helps the reader to understand where the Turkish experience in terms of cultural attendance differs from or converges with the experience of the rest of the world. The implication of this knowledge of Turkish experience is to understand whether people in a country with non-western origins show similar or different behavior of cultural attendance. In addition, any kind of policy recommendations based on our analysis to increase cultural attendance is one of the goals of this paper since increased cultural attendance itself in any form can be considered good for a society.

Starting with the literature related to cultural attendance in Turkey, we now briefly review the literature. Some studies investigate the cultural domain as part of the boundaries of the middle-class, including diverse characteristics such as how to choose friends, in which restaurant to eat dinner, what music to listen to (traditional Turkish or Western), and who to spend time with (Karademir-Hazır, 2014). These studies investigate how Turkey's middle class draws its boundaries culturally to sustain status inequalities.

Rankin et al. (2014) examines the relationship between social stratification and cultural consumption patterns in Turkey in terms of a cultural map. They report three broad clusters in Turkey's cultural space. One is the "engaged cosmopolitans", who have embraced a more urban, globalized aesthetic culture, particularly in music, literature, and cuisine, but also in participation preferences. This group attends more cultural activities, especially highbrow ones. The second cluster, the "engaged provincialists", takes a more critical stance toward this globalized culture, particularly through a general dislike of its literary forms, but also regarding certain cuisines while preferring more established (i.e. traditional) ones. This cluster may loosely apply to 30-40 percent of Turkey's population and is closest to older, middle-income, educated adults who are also more likely to support an active role for religion in public life. The third, low participation cluster, is more culturally disengaged, expressing neutrality towards, disinterest in, or lack of knowledge of a broad array of literary, cuisine, and musical genres.

Richer (2015) investigated the dynamics of sustainable social status inequality by surveying people in a high-status shopping mall (İstinye Park) in Istanbul. He concludes that Turkey's embrace of consumer culture mirrors global trends whereby shopping practices constitute increasingly important social relations linked to the production and maintenance of status inequalities.

Although these three papers investigate the relationships between the different aspects of cultural domain and class status, they do not really investigate in detail the disaggregated frequency or even existence of cultural attendance at different cultural activities like theatre, opera, modern dance, ballet, or classical music concerts.

Another study related to social stratification and leisure in Turkey is Aydın (2009). He investigated the variations and social bases of leisure and cultural consumption patterns during the last decade in Turkey. More specifically, he explores the social basis of the reading habits for daily newspapers, magazines, and journals, attending to cinemas and theatres (not disaggregated), and spending patterns on these and other cultural activities. His research, based on data derived from household expenditure surveys (aggregated across cities and provinces), addresses how culture and leisure consumption are stratified in contemporary Turkish society and the changes between 1994 and 2004. He concludes that leisure and cultural consumption tend to be stratified by

education and income level and, to some extent, occupation. In addition, households with female heads tended to engage more in highbrow consumption than households with male heads.

Üstüner and Holt (2010) used a qualitative analysis to explore the existence and determinants of status consumption in Turkey and revises Bourdieu's traditional concepts, specifically the attitudes and behaviors of upper-middle class, middle-aged women (35-45) who self-define as secular. Although their research did not specifically focus on leisure habits, they discuss how cultural capital is shaped in contemporary Turkey for several types of status consumption. They argue that, while cultural capital has traditionally been formed by accumulating tastes and practices, without necessarily learning them, this has changed in Turkey due to proactive Western-focused education practices. They also discuss how Islamic identity is becoming an important element of consumer identity in less industrialized countries.

Apart from the literature related cultural attendance in Turkey, the literature shows that cultural attendance is generally affected by socio-economic factors (Bourdieu, 1984). Economically, the price of cultural goods and consumers' incomes are the main determinants of demand for cultural goods. However, we should also recognize that the demand for cultural goods is a somewhat intensive commodity in terms of time and cognitive resources such as the ability, education level, and experience to appreciate the abstract artistic and mental processes, concepts, and products. Thus, education level and time availability crucially determine the choice set of cultural consumers and consumer demand. Women are impacted, especially in the traditional and patriarchal communities, in more than one way. Women have lower rates of secondary and post-secondary school attendance as was the Turkish case before mandatory schooling raised to 12 years, not long time ago. Women's lower rates of education can be considered as a "class" phenomenon, looking at women as a "class". Their opportunities are lower, especially in the societies with patriarchal cultural values. Secondly, when women do work outside to earn money, their domestic duties remain high. Women are expected to do all those domestic productive duties after work, subject to exploitation of women labor, more so in the traditional and patriarchal societies or systems. This also reduces the time to improve the ability (like reading books, attending theatre, etc.) to appreciate artistic concepts.

Another critical determinant is cultural capital, in terms of the ability to interpret and enjoy the symbolic characteristics of cultural goods. Cultural capital can be acquired in various ways: through the formal educational system, transmitted from previous generations, or accumulated by informal education and practices.

Most cultural goods in Turkey, especially Western "highbrow" cultural products like opera, ballet, classical music concerts, entry to museums and historic sites, are heavily subsidized by the government. Therefore, factors other than price and income may be important determinants of cultural attendance. These factors might include education level, age, gender, religiousness, cultural capital, and occupation (Borgonovi, 2004; Akdede and King, 2006).

In general, previous research on social inequality in cultural participation shows that people with higher education and high family incomes in particular are more likely to participate in highbrow cultural activities (Van Hek and Kraaykamp, 2013: 326). Age, gender, cultural capital measured by parents' education level, and occupation type (blue collar versus white collar worker) are included in the statistical analysis to investigate their effects on cultural attendance. In general, previous research also shows that age increases cultural attendance, especially for highbrow cultural products like classical music, opera, ballet, and theatre. Cultural capital increases cultural attendance in that individuals with highly educated families and high social status attend cultural activities more frequently. White collar professionals are more likely than blue collar workers to

attend cultural activities, especially highbrow ones (Di Magio and Toqir, 2004).

Religion also influences cultural attendance. Katz-Gerro (2002), for instance, finds that, in Italy, West Germany, and Israel, the more religious one is, the less one participates in highbrow cultural activities, after controlling for other influences. In the U.S. and Sweden, however, he finds the reverse: Churchgoers are more inclined to highbrow culture and apparently show a different behavior from their counterparts in the other countries. Katz-Gerro (2002) does not give any in depth explanation about the causes of his finding of relationship between religiousness and attendance to highbrow cultural attendance in five countries cited above. However, he mentions the small differences about both the content of highbrow cultural activities and definitions of being religious in five countries. In Italy and Israel, he mentions, "...there is a more visible cultural distinction between religious and secular individuals" (Katz-Gerro, 2002: 222). Our survey does not have an explicit question to measure the respondent's level of religiosity in Turkey, so future research could usefully analyze its effect on cultural attendance and cultural activity type.

Many researchers have analyzed the effects of gender on cultural attendance (Christen, 2002). The literature emphasizes three channels that link the gender to cultural attendance: early socialization in the arts in relation to socioeconomic status, the structure of employment and workplace culture, and marital status and spousal influence.

According to the literature, highbrow culture is widely seen as a feminine realm, such that middle and upper-middle class parents particularly encourage daughters to participate in cultural activities. Dumais (2002), for instance, reports that girls outnumber boys in art, music, and dance lessons, library and art museum visits, and attending concerts.

In terms of employment status and workplace culture, three channels emerge: the "time constraint" argument, the "cultural occupation" argument and the "workplace culture" argument (Christen, 2002).

The "time constraint" argument suggests that the gender gap occurs because women are more likely to work part-time or be unemployed than men, giving them more time and opportunities to attend cultural activities (Tepper, 2000). However, Tepper also rightly notes that "one should be careful when relying on the part-time/full-time distinction: the decision for a woman to work part-time (or not to work) might reflect a traditional ideology ('women's work is in the home')" (Tepper, 2000: 260). This point may be particularly relevant for the Turkish case since more traditional women are more likely to not work outside of the home. Such women may also be less likely to attend Western cultural activities, like modern dance, theatre, or opera and more likely to attend traditional or religious cultural heritage sides as the regression results show in the following sections. The similar pattern of behavior is observable for traditional Turkish men for Western highbrow cultural activities since such men mostly spend their leisure time in traditional neighborhood "tea houses".

According to the "cultural occupation" and "workplace culture" arguments, women are more likely to work in the cultural and educational sectors because of the gendered division of labor. Occupational specialization therefore contributes to explaining the gender gap in highbrow cultural activities in the Western countries (Collins, 1988). This does not seem to be happening in Turkey. Other than Istanbul, highbrow cultural sectors are not developed very much. And, in especially traditional cities, women are expected to raise children, not to work outside.

Marital status also affects the difference between men's and women's highbrow cultural participation. Upright (2004), for example, shows that arts participation is influenced by the spouse's artistic and social background. When one's spouse has high levels of arts socialization and educational attainment, one is more likely to attend arts events with or without the spouse,

even after controlling for other individual variables. Upright also reports that these processes are gendered: men whose wives have higher arts socialization and education are more likely than men whose wives are not interested in cultural events to attend art events, even after controlling for the husband's personal attributes. Thus, the gender gap in highbrow arts activities should be smaller for married people than single men and women because wives increase the husbands' arts participation. In addition, women (single, divorced, or widowed) are even more likely to participate than men in highbrow arts activities when they are not married than married. Montgomery and Robinson (2010) finds that single males prefer sports whereas single females prefer the arts. They propose a "battle of the sexes" model to predict that men are more likely and women less likely to attend art events after marriage.

After reviewing the literature briefly, we proceed to the next section that presents our data and estimation method.

### **Data and Estimation Method**

The data are drawn from a representative sample of households in Istanbul, Turkey. A single individual over the age of 18 from each household was randomly selected to be interviewed. A professional research company in Istanbul used clustered random sampling to collect information from 100 main and 100 substitute clusters of 20 families each, randomly selected from the Istanbul area. After randomly selecting the first address for each cluster from the Turkish Statistical Institute, every third residence was surveyed. Each residence was visited up to three times to find an eligible person to participate in the survey. Two thousand households representing Istanbul were surveyed during the months of July and August 2011. The response rate for survey questions was 70 percent (70 percent of questions were answered). The survey was sponsored by the Turkish Scientific and Technological Research Institution (TÜBİTAK in Turkish).

The survey included a question about the frequency of attendance at different cultural activities in 2010, when Istanbul was one of the designated Cultural Capitals of Europe, along with other demographic questions like age, gender, household income, education, and parents' education. It is safe to assume that the supply of cultural events was not the limiting factor in 2010 as there were many cultural events scattered around the city, most of which were free or very cheap to attend. The following categories of cultural activities were included in the survey: theatre; cinema; opera-ballet-modern dance; classical music concerts; rock-pop-jazz concerts; Turkish folk-Turkish classical-arabesque concerts; painting exhibitions; sculpture-ceramics exhibitions; visits to sacred Islamic sites like dervish lodges (tekke and dergah), madrasahs (medrese), or tombs (turbe); museum visits; historic buildings-cultural heritage visits; ancient cultural heritage visits; Ottoman places, mosques, stone bridges, public fountains, historic buildings, bazaars visits; church, monastery, synagogue visits; public library visits. There was also an open-ended option for participants to list any activities that they attended that the survey omitted.

For the regression analysis, all the cultural activities were grouped into two categories to use as the dependent variables: "performing arts and cinema" (theatre, cinema, opera-ballet-modern dance, classical music concerts, rock-pop-jazz concerts, classical Turkish folk-arabesque concerts) and "cultural heritage" (all other activities). Sample descriptive statistics are shown in Table 1 below.

The two categories distinguished between activities that were subject to programming or not. Performing arts, music and cinema are either on-off performances (e.g. opera or ballet) or subject to fixed timings (cinema, theatre, opera, or ballet). In contrast, the heritage category



included visits and activities that are not so subject to programming in that venues remain open for longer so individuals can freely decide when to visit. From the overall sample, we only included individuals that attended at most 50 events (there were 28 people who either did not respond to this question or reported around 100 attendances), yielding a final sample of 1,972 observations, meaning completed surveys.

**Table 1a. Descriptive Statistics for Attendance at Different Events and Activities During 2010**

	ALL	MALE		FEMALE	
		% of zeros	average number of times for male visitors (s.e.)	% of zeros	average number of times for female visitors (s.e.)

**Table 1b. Heritage Categories**

Painting exhibitions	92.75	90.65	2.94 (0.76)	93.73	3.38 (0.76)
Sculpture and ceramic exhibitions	96.50	95.33	3.90 (1.48)	97.02	5.10 (1.68)
Dervish lodge (tekke and dergah), madrasah (medrese), tomb (turbe)	70.44	69.23	3.22 (0.33)	70.81	5.01 (1.32)
Museums	78.30	79.16	2.57 (0.24)	76.16	2.14 (0.17)
Historic building-cultural heritage visits	83.11	85.20	2.49 (0.41)	79.55	4.35 (1.83)
Ancient cultural heritage visits	93.46	92.70	2.21 (0.42)	93.53	1.90 (0.19)
Ottoman Empire palaces, mosques, stone	64.05	63.19	3.12	64.23	4.49

bridges, public fountains, historic buildings, bazaar visits			(0.27)		(1.08)
Church, monastery, synagogue visits	89.86	88.70	2.02 (0.23)	90.24	1.81 (0.25)
Use of public libraries	94.18	94.16	10.08 (2.84)	94.24	7.30 (1.68)

**Table 1c. Performing Arts and Cinema Categories**

Theatre attendance	82.45	80.43	3.53 (0.44)	83.35	3.40 (0.31)
Opera-ballet-modern dance	98.78	98.34	5.65 (3.42)	98.77	1.25 (0.13)
Classical music concerts	97.21	96.98	2.35 (0.94)	97.02	2.00 (0.20)
Rock-pop-jazz concerts	88.08	88.41	2.53 (0.39)	87.15	2.80 (0.31)
Turkish folk music, Turkish classical music, and arabesque	88.54	89.29	3.53 (0.96)	86.84	2.90 (0.44)
Cinema	54.82	58.52	5.52 (0.29)	49.85	6.20 (0.37)

s.e. = standard error

As can be seen from Table 1, the least attended events were sculpture or ceramic sculpture exhibitions (96.5% of respondents declared that they never attended), public libraries (94.68%), antique cultural heritage sites (93.46%), and painting exhibitions (92.75%) while 64.05% had not visited Ottoman Empire palaces, mosques, etc. These percentages are not surprising as they parallel those findings regarding monuments and heritage sites in other countries, such as data from Eurobarometer 2007 and the 2008 Survey of Public Participation (Ateca-Amestoy, 2013). For the performing arts and cinema, the least popular events were opera-ballet-modern dance (98.78% of respondents declared that they never attended) and classical music concerts (97.21%) whereas only about half had not gone to the cinema (54.82%), which was the best attended event type. Finally, 17.55% of participants reported going to the theatre at least once.

Regarding gender, almost no men or women attended sculpture or ceramic sculpture exhibitions (95.33% of males and 97.02% of females surveyed declared that they never attended)

while 63.19% of men and 64.23% of women said they never attended any Ottoman Empire cultural heritage sites. For the performing arts and cinema, more than 90% of both males and females never attended any opera-ballet-modern dance and classical music concerts whereas both were more likely to go to the theatre or cinema than other activities. Women reported going to the cinema more times (6.20) than men (5.52). This may be because many cinemas have daytime screenings whereas most theatres only perform in the evenings. In Turkey, it is easier for women to go out during the day than the evening.

Overall, Table 1 indicates that activities and events that are considered mainly as Western cultural products, like opera-ballet-modern dance, classical music, sculpture, and painting exhibitions, have a higher percentage for zero attendance. In addition, for most activities and events, women have a higher percentage of zero attendance, which makes it important to analyze gender differences in cultural activity attendance in Istanbul.

Table 2 below provides descriptive statistics for the explanatory variables. It shows that a high proportion of respondents were not in the labor force.

**Table 2. Descriptive statistics for the explanatory variables**

	Proportion	s.e.
Female	48,53	0,011
18-25 years	25,76	0,010
25-45 years	52,38	0,011
45-65 years	23,58	0,010
65+ years	3,04	0,004
Less than secondary education completed	50,20	0,011
Secondary education	33,62	0,011
High school and above	16,18	0,008
Household monthly income less than	37,93	0,011

1,000TL		
Household monthly income 1,000-1,500TL	22,16	0,009
Household monthly income 1,500-2,000TL	17,34	0,009
Household monthly income 2,000+TL	38,18	0,011
Mother completed less than high school	91,97	0,010
Mother completed high school or above	8,03	0,006
Father completed less than high school	87,36	0,009
Father completed high school or above	12,64	0,008
Self-declaring as conservative	14,91	0,008
Not in the labor force (housewife, retired, student, neither working nor looking for job)	48,42	0,011
Unemployed	2,99	0,004
White-collar worker (civil servant, medium-level government administrator; businessman in private sector or professional who work for himself or herself - architect, lawyer, doctor, etc.)	8,47	0,006
Blue-collar worker (private sector, service	39,86	0,011

sector - waitress, waiter, etc., small shopkeeper, artisan, driver, farmer)		
	Mean	Se
Number of household members	4,12	1,666

In the following section, we test how income, cultural capital (own-and parents' education level), and other factors consistently reported in the literature (age and gender) affect cultural participation in Istanbul.

### *Estimation Method*

Typically, there is a large proportion of zero responses to cultural attendance items in data from representative samples of the general population. This clearly raises the issue of heavy unobserved heterogeneity that may induce different behavioral patterns in the observed choice of the general population. When modelling the individual behavior of a sample of individuals from different subpopulations that may follow very different behavioral patterns, cultural economists have found it useful to estimate latent class models. These behavioral models not only assess the correlates of participation but also explain the determinants of observed choices based on individual decision-making models. The models recognize that the number of classes is finite, so there is a finite number of processes that generate the mixing of data observable for the representative sample of the overall population.

For count models as in our survey (i.e. when the dependent variable measures the number of times that the individual attended a given cultural activity), Poisson regression models tend to be avoided for violating the equidispersion assumption. This rejection implies unobserved heterogeneity, so negative binomial models can be estimated. However, when there are so many individuals with zero values, zero-inflated or hurdle models may better explain the large unobserved heterogeneity (Willekens and Lievens, 2016). For count models and cultural participation, zero-inflated negative binomial models can explain the behavior of the general population as the mixing of two processes. The probability of being a never-goer with respect to being a potential goer (including some of the zeros induced by corner solutions) is ruled by a logit process; the counts follow a negative binomial distribution that explains the probability of the positive counts as well as some of the zeros that come from corner solutions in the choice process.

As reported above, the survey responses were aggregated to create two dependent count variables varying between zero and fifty.

Table 3 presents the model estimations for visits to artistic and heritage sites and attending performances and cinema. We ran regressions for different count models before selecting for both models a zero-inflated negative binomial. The specification tests and the statistics supporting the model selection are reported beneath the table.

As outlined above, using a zero-inflated negative binomial regression allows us to identify the behavior of two different subpopulations. Observed zeros can be generated in both subpopulations, though they may reflect a different decision-making process. On the one hand, a fraction of the zeros can be attributed to the behavior of never-goers; on the other hand, another

fraction comes from a part of the population that has a positive probability of going but that, probably, during the observed period faced some restrictions that prevented them from participating (inducing a corner solution). People in this second category could also have a positive count. The estimation procedure allows us to jointly estimate the process that divides the population into those subgroups. In what follows, we interpret our results in terms of the variables that determine a higher likelihood of being a never-goer (the inflation part of the model) and in terms of the variables that determine a higher probability of having gone more times to that type of activity (the count part, which represents the higher intensity of participation for the second subpopulation).

### *Estimation Results*

We first present and discuss our findings for the cultural heritage category, heritage visits, and attendance at arts exhibitions and libraries. As explained before, the same set of explanatory variables are used as predictors for positive counts (intensity) and inflation (never-goers). Among the determinants of not participating at all, we find that being a woman decreases the probability of being a never-goer by 32% (since the odds-ratio for that variable is 0.677).

For occupation, being a white-collar worker reduces the probability of being a never-goer relative to being out of the labor force, with an estimated odds-ratio of 0.412.

The effect of income is nearly monotonic (higher household income reduces the probability of being a never-goer). Holding other predictors constant, household monthly incomes of 1,000-1,500TL, 1,500-2,000TL, and 2,000TL or more decrease the odds of not participating by 39%, 63%, and 62%, respectively, relative to having monthly income below 1,000TL.

Finally, an increase in the number of people living in the household is associated with a higher probability of participation. This last finding may capture the familiar dimension of this type of participation, where visits with children or other family members are quite popular. There were no statistically significant results for the other explanatory variables in the inflation part of the model.

Our zero-inflated negative binomial regression results show the effects of the same set of regressors on participation intensity. Here, gender had the opposite effect: being female reduced the probability of being a never-goer but also reduced participation intensity, with women participating in about 19% fewer activities than men (the estimated coefficient was -0.204, so the incidence ratio, i.e. the factor change in expected count for a change in the explanatory variable, was 0.815).

Income had a positive effect on participation intensity (increasing the probability by 32.9%, 30.9% and 37.8% across the three rising income brackets).

While education had no significant effects in the inflation part of the model, it was the most relevant factor in the count process determining frequency of participation. That is, having completed secondary education increases the probability of higher participation by 82.35% while having completed high school or university increases it by even more: 90.81%.

While the mother's education has no significant effect, the father's education level increases the respondent's intensity of attendance. Specifically, if the father completed high school or above, the respondent's participation intensity increases by 36.01%. Thus, although transmitted cultural capital plays a role, it is smaller than that of the individual's own education level. This is consistent with the hypotheses that we presented in describing our individual decision-making model.

Household size reduced participation, probably because available free time for each

member decreases as the number of people in the household grows.

Our second area of focus is the “going-out” dimension of cultural participation as this is probably more relevant in the entertainment and leisure dimension of engagement in cultural activities. The behavioral patterns considering the total number of times that individuals attended performing arts, music, and cinema events during 2010 vary.

Specifically, we found a substantial gender effect in that women are 46% more likely than men to be never-goers.

Age has a significant monotonic effect, with the probability of being a never-goer increasing with age.

For occupation, being a worker reduces the probability of being a non-participant. More specifically, the effect of being a white-collar worker reduces the odds of non-participation by about 81% relative to being out of the labor force and by about 54% for blue-collar workers.

Household income decreases the probability of being a zero in the inflation part of the model almost monotonically, likewise for own education and father’s education levels. Having completed secondary education decreases the probability of being a never-goer by nearly 82% compared to not having completed secondary education while having completed high school or above decreases it by 60%.

Parental education may be a proxy for cultural capital transmitted within the household. Whereas the father’s education level has a statistically significant effect (reducing the probability of never being attendant by 59% if the father completed high school), the mother’s educational attainment has no statistically significant effect.

Finally, the number of members in the household significantly increases the probability of never participating in a cultural event, with an odds ratio of 1.19.

Relative to the age reference category (25-45 years), being younger increases the probability of higher attendance by 19% whereas being 45-65 decreases it by 29%. Thus, all other things equal, age has a monotonic negative effect on participation intensity for most age groups.

Income variables operated similarly in this part of the model. Higher income correlates almost monotonically with higher participation in this subset of activities (38%, 31%, and 65%, respectively). There is only a statistically significant effect for being unemployed relative to being out of the labor force in determining the intensity of attendance, with an estimated incidence ratio of 0.63.

Regarding cultural capital, both own and father’s education level significantly increased intensity of attendance whereas mother’s education level had no statistically significant effect. The incidence ratios for the respondent having completed secondary and high school are 1.28 and 1.72, respectively, and 1.40 if the father completed high school.

The number of people in the household reduced participation frequency. For these types of activities and for the count part of the model, identifying oneself as conservative (with respect to other political self-ascriptions) reduced participation intensity, with an incidence ratio of 0.74. This was the only process in either event categories that had a statistically significant political effect.

**Table 3. Regression Results: Zero-Inflated Negative Binomial Model**

			Heritage attendance				Performing arts and cinema					
			Inflate		count		Inflate			count		
	Coef.	s.e.	OR	Coef.	s.e.	IR	Coef.	s.e.	OR	Coef.	s.e.	IR

Female	-0,390*	0,206	0,677	-0,204**	0,091	0,816	0,379*	0,228	1,461	-0,030	0,082	0,970
18-25 years	0,240	0,221	1,271	0,060	0,110	1,062	-0,901***	0,249	0,406	0,181**	0,089	1,198
45-65 years	-0,132	0,235	0,877	-0,009	0,108	0,991	0,864***	0,207	2,372	-0,338***	0,122	0,713
65+	-0,464	0,530	0,629	0,281	0,256	1,324	1,902***	0,582	6,699	-0,533	0,468	0,587
Household monthly income 1,000-1,500 TL	-0,490**	0,239	0,612	0,284**	0,137	1,329	-0,642***	0,234	0,526	0,326**	0,147	1,385
Household monthly income 1,500-2,000 TL	-0,987***	0,284	0,373	0,270*	0,142	1,309	-1,245***	0,285	0,288	0,273*	0,145	1,314
Household monthly income 2,000+ TL	-0,957***	0,245	0,384	0,320**	0,126	1,378	-1,212***	0,231	0,298	0,504***	0,134	1,655
White-collar worker	-0,886*	0,491	0,412	-0,215	0,149	0,807	-1,631**	0,656	0,196	0,040	0,126	1,041
Blue-collar worker	-0,046	0,216	0,955	0,022	0,101	1,022	-0,784***	0,223	0,457	-0,114	0,093	0,893
Unemployed	0,260	0,442	1,297	-0,038	0,251	0,962	-0,784	0,656	0,457	-0,461**	0,214	0,631
Secondary education	0,094	0,206	1,098	0,601***	0,098	1,824	-1,699***	0,271	0,183	0,243**	0,094	1,275
High school or above	-0,127	0,275	0,881	0,646***	0,127	1,908	-0,906***	0,260	0,404	0,544***	0,126	1,724
Mother	0,317	0,367	1,373	-0,135	0,177	0,874	-0,739	0,774	0,478	0,104	0,125	1,109



completed high school or above												
Father completed high school and above	-0,483	0,330	0,617	0,308**	0,143	1,360	-0,888**	0,432	0,412	0,334***	0,107	1,396
Number of household members	-0,172***	0,067	0,842	-0,082***	0,025	0,921	0,180***	0,053	1,198	-0,067**	0,027	0,936
Conservative	-0,296	0,256	0,744	0,037	0,112	1,038	-0,098	0,243	0,907	-0,296***	0,108	0,744
_cons	0,674*	0,399	1,962	1,370***	0,189		0,306	0,394		1,498***	0,195	
lnalpha				0,383***	0,100					0,228***	0,070	

*Reference categories: male, 25-45, household monthly income less than 1,000 TL, not in the labor force, less than secondary education completed, mother less than high school completed, father less than high school completed, non-conservative.*

n	1,913	
AIC	8,282E+03	8,062E+03
BIC	8,476E+03	8,257E+03
LR test of ZINB vs. standard Poisson	LRX2= TBD, Pr>z = 0.000	LRX2= TBD, Pr>z = 0.000
Vuong test of ZIP vs. standard Poisson	z= TBD, Pr>z = 0.000	z= TBD, Pr>z = 0.00
Vuong test of ZINB vs. NB	z= TBD Pr>z = 0.000	z= TBD, Pr>z = 0.000
LR test of ZINB vs ZIP	LRX2= TBD, Pr>z = 0.000	LRX2= TBD, Pr>z = 0.000

note: *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

## Conclusion

In this study, we investigated the determinants of cultural participation in Turkey, using survey data collected in Istanbul during the summer of 2011. We specifically analyzed gender differences in participation patterns in various activities by estimating two participation equations. These drew on theoretical models of cultural goods consumption based on the formation of personal cultural capital, and relied on regularities and estimation methods used in the empirical literature on cultural participation.

Previous research has addressed gender effects in cultural participation in two main ways: as one more variable in the “mixed factors” category (Seaman, 2005) or as a manifestation of gender roles and social norms (Upright, 2004). According to the literature, other things being equal, women are less likely than men to participate in more social or public cultural events (the going-out dimension of cultural attendance).

We also found strong gender effects on participation. However, our results contradict previous findings about female participation in the arts (Upright, 2004), including previous results for Turkey (Aydın, 2009). We should note here that Aydın’s results were based on household consumption decisions, so our results do not necessarily contradict his. It could be that while households headed by a woman tend to be more engaged in cultural activities, women themselves are less likely than men to attend public events in the performing arts and cinema or frequently visit heritage sites. We can call this the “direct gender effect”.

However, we also found an “indirect gender effect” that reduces female cultural participation due to potentially different mechanisms to transmit cultural capital inside the family in Turkey. More specifically, in our sample, only the father’s level of education affected the current behavior of cultural consumers. Future research can provide more evidence to explain this result.

This gender effect is in line with recent findings that Turkish women do not participate in the labor force (İlkkaracan, 2012). In our study, after controlling for occupation, there was still a statistically significant gender effect for both categories of activities, particularly for the going-out dimension of cultural participation.

Finally, political stance only had a statistically significant effect on the going-out dimension of cultural participation, which mostly includes Western cultural forms (apart from Turkish traditional music, all sub-categories are either Western highbrow or pop culture).

## Discussion and Policy Implications

After controlling for occupation, we found a statistically significant gender effect on both categories of cultural activities, more so for the going-out dimension of cultural participation. One possible explanation for this would be the following: due to the unequal division of household labor in most families in Turkey, women tend to spend a considerable portion of their “leisure” time on household chores and child and/or elderly care, in line with Tepper (2000). As a result,

women may face greater constraints on attending cultural activities with fixed schedules, like plays and concerts. Time constraints may also decrease the intensity of women's participation in cultural activities that have somewhat inflexible schedules, although without necessarily preventing their participation entirely. This may explain the exceptional status of cinema in the performing arts category, as movies generally play throughout the day in multiple movie theatres scattered throughout the city.

Another possible explanation for the significant gender effect in our regression results is that women, on average, have less control over the family budget. They therefore refrain from more expensive forms of cultural consumption like concerts, plays, and other performing arts compared to visiting historic sites. Aydın (2009) finds that households with female heads engaged more in "highbrow" consumption than households headed by males. In addition, he finds that females tended to participate and spent more than males on cultural goods like books, magazines, cinema, and theatre. Although we find that females attend less than men in the performing arts and cinema category, this may not contradict his results because his study used data from 1994 and 2003 whereas our data was collected in 2011. In addition, our study was specific to Istanbul whereas Aydın's concerned Turkey as a whole. Finally, Aydın classified events as highbrow or not whereas we classified them as "performing arts and cinema" and "cultural heritage".

Regarding policy recommendations, there is a great need for empowerment of women in cultural life. However, increasing female participation in artistic and cultural goods consumption (attendance) is not easy in Turkey. In a metropolitan city like Istanbul it may be easier for women to ignore the social pressure they face when going out alone. In many other parts of Turkey, however, especially in rural areas and traditional cities, it is very difficult for women to go out and attend a play or a movie, especially after dark, unless escorted by a male relative. Therefore, low participation of women, even in Istanbul, is clearly a result of traditional and patriarchal perception of society. It is not easy to break the patriarchal and traditional behavior of those families with traditional and conservative background. As a policy recommendation to empower the women in the long run, cultural and educational activities should be accessible for neighborhood families in the periphery of the city, not only in the center. Local governments can subsidize the cultural activities in the neighborhoods, giving incentives for women not only participate but also actively take part in the cultural activities.

Most importantly, the patriarchal and traditional structure of the society should be broken. This is easier to say than to do. Turkey is a political country: politics is in every area of the society. Therefore, one way to break the patriarchal structure, although not easy, would be that Turkish women's movement combined with progressive men associations which are allied with women's associations in women liberation must work together to break down the domestic/folk culture/public/authoritative culture divide.

## **Acknowledgements**

Akdede acknowledges the support of the Turkish Scientific and Technological Research Institution-TÜBİTAK. Ateca-Amestoy has received support from the Ministry of Science and Technology “ECO2009-10818”, the Basque Government “IT241-07”, and the “Assessing effective tools to enhance cultural participation” CULTURE 3.2. EACEA project. We are grateful to participants in a seminar in University of Granada for their comments. All errors are solely ours.

## References

- Akdede, S.H. and King, J.T. (2006) "Demand for and Productivity Analysis of Turkish Public Theatre." *Journal of Cultural Economics*, 30(3):219-231.
- Aydın, K. (2009). "Social stratification of culture and leisure in Turkey." *Cultural Trends* 18(4), 295-311.
- Ateca-Amestoy, V. (2013). "Demand for cultural heritage" in *Handbook on Economics of Cultural Heritage*, (edited) by Ilde Rizzo and Anna Mignosa, 89-111. Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.
- Bihagen, E. and Katz-Gerro, T. (2000). "Culture Consumption in Sweden, The Stability of Gender Differences." *Poetics* 27 (5): 327-349.
- Borgonovi, F. (2004). "Performing arts attendance: An economic approach". *Applied Economics* 36(17):1871-1885.
- Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Routledge Kegan & Paul, London.
- Christen, A. (2012). "Gender and highbrow cultural participation in the United States." *Poetics* 40 (5): 423-443.
- Collins, R. (1988). "Women and men in the class structure." *Journal of Family Issues* 9 (1): 27-50.
- DiMaggio, P. and Toqir, M. (2004). "Arts Participation as Cultural Capital in the United States, 1982-2002: Signs of Decline?" *Poetics*, 32 (2): 169-194.
- Dumais, A. S. (2002). "Cultural capital, gender, and school success: the role of habitus." *Sociology of Education* 75 (1) :44-68.
- Falk, M. and Katz-Gerro, T. (2016). "Cultural Participation in Europe: Can we identify common determinants," *Journal of Cultural Economics*, 40 (2) :127-162.
- İlkkaracan, İ. (2012). "Why so Few Women in the Labor Market in Turkey?" *Feminist Economics* 18(1) : 1-37.
- Karademir-Hazır, I. (2014). "Boundaries of middle-class identities in Turkey." *The Sociological Review*, 62(4): 675-697.
- Katz-Gerro, T. (2002). "Highbrow cultural consumption and class distinction in Italy, Israel, West Germany, Sweden, and the United States." *Social Forces*, 81(1): 207-229.
- Katz-Gerro, T. (2011). "Cross-National Cultural Consumption Research: Inspirations and Disillusions." *Kölner Zeitschrift für Soziologie und Sozialpsychologie* 51: 339-360.
- Katz-Gerro, T., Raz, S. and Meir, Y. (2009). "How do class, status, ethnicity, and religiosity shape cultural omnivorousness in Israel?" *Journal of Cultural Economics* 33 (1):1-17.
- Lizardo, O. (2006). "The puzzle of women's 'highbrow' culture consumption: integrating gender and work into Bourdieu's class theory of taste." *Poetics* 34 (1): 2006:1-23.
- Morrone, A. (2006). *Guidelines to Measure Cultural Participation*. Montreal:UNESCO, Institute for Statistics.
- Montgomery, S. S. and Robinson, D. M. (2010). "Empirical Evidence of the Effects of Marriage on Male and Female Attendance at Sports and Arts", *Social Science Quarterly*, 91 (1): 99-116.
- Rankin, B., Ergin, M., and Gökşen, F. (2014). "A Cultural Map of Turkey." *Cultural Sociology*, 8 (2): 159-179.
- Richer, Z. (2015). "Toward a social topography: Status as a spatial practice." *Sociological Theory*, 33(4): 347-368.
- Seaman, A. B. (2005). *Attendance and Public Participation in the Performing Arts: A Review of*

- the Empirical Literature*. Nonprofit Studies Program W.P 05-03, Georgia State University, 2005.
- Snowball, D. J., Jamal, M. and Kenneth.G. W. (2010). "Cultural Consumption Patterns in South Africa: An Investigation of the Theory of Cultural Omnivores." *Social Indicators Research* 97 (3):467-483.
- Tepper,J. S. (2000). "Fiction reading in America: explaining the gender gap." *Poetics* 27 (4): 255–275.
- Upright, B. C. (2004). "Social capital and spousal participation: spousal influences on attendance at arts event." *Poetics* 32(2), 129-143.
- Üstüner, T. and Douglas.B. H. (2010). "Toward a Theory of status Consumption in Less Industrialized Countries." *Journal of Consumer Research* 37(1): 37-56.
- Van Hek, M. and Kraaykamp, G. (2013). "Cultural consumption across countries: A multi-level analysis of social inequality in highbrow culture in Europe." *Poetics*, 41 (4): 323-341.
- Willekens, M. and Lievens, J. (2016). "Who participates and how much? Explaining non-attendance and frequency of attending arts and heritage activities." *Poetics*, 56: 50-63.
- Yaish, M. and T Katz-Gerro.T. (2012). "Disentangling 'Cultural Capital': The Consequences of Cultural and Economic Resources for Taste and Participation." *European Sociological Review* 28(2): 169-185.