

Factors influencing Grade 7 teachers' implementation of outcomes-based approaches in the National Curriculum when teaching 'Human Reproduction'

Megan Caroline Doidge

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Science, University of the Witwatersrand,
Johannesburg in fulfilment of the requirements of
the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Johannesburg 2014

Abstract

Outcomes-based education was introduced into South Africa almost 20 years ago amidst much controversy. During the period of my study, a modified version of the outcomes-based curriculum was in use, i.e. the Revised National Curriculum Statement Grades R-9. In this curriculum, critical and learning outcomes were described and a learner-centred approach advocated which would enable learners to achieve the outcomes. Human reproduction was introduced as one of the content areas in the senior phase of the Natural Sciences. Human reproduction is a sensitive but very relevant topic in South Africa where HIV/AIDS, teenage pregnancy and child abuse are prevalent and so was selected as a Grade 7 topic in one educational district of Gauteng.

In my study, I was interested in finding out what factors influenced Grade 7 teachers' implementation of outcomes-based approaches when teaching Human Reproduction. I explored the use of learner-centred approaches and the extent to which the critical and Natural Sciences learning outcomes could be achieved through these approaches. Firstly I wanted to know to what extent Grade 7 teachers used outcomes-based and learner-centred approaches when teaching human reproduction. Secondly I was interested in the factors that influenced the teaching of human reproduction. Thirdly I set out to find which factors affected the use of outcomes-based and learner-centred approaches during the teaching of human reproduction. Lastly the influence of teachers' behavioural, normative and control beliefs on their teaching of human reproduction in outcomes-based and learner-centred ways were of interest. My theoretical framework took into account the above-mentioned factors and beliefs about the influence of these factors and their possible impact on teaching human reproduction in outcomes-based and learner-centred ways.

My research involved a workshop for Natural Sciences teachers on the teaching of human reproduction to Grade 7's, followed by a survey. Forty teachers completed the survey questionnaire in which they recorded their perceptions of the expected influence of the learners, the learning environment and support structures, as well as teachers' beliefs, on the teaching of human reproduction. Ten of these teachers participated as the case studies in my multiple case study, forming a convenience sample.

I used a mixed methods approach in my investigation, starting with the survey questionnaire and then narrowing my focus to the ten case study teachers and becoming a participant observer in their classes. I recorded my data in field notes and as digital recordings of class discussions and when teachers had completed teaching human reproduction, I interviewed them. The data from the questionnaires, interview and lesson transcripts and field notes were analysed and conclusions drawn.

I used profiles to assess the achievement of the critical and learning outcomes by each teacher and to assess the extent to which each teacher used learner-centred approaches when teaching human reproduction. A cross case analysis enabled me to compare the teachers with regard to each outcome and learner-centred feature. Some quantitative data from my surveys and mostly qualitative data from my observations and interviews were used to explore the influence of factors internal to the teacher, i.e. personal and professional factors, and those external to the teacher such as the learners, the

learning environment and support structures. I also used the qualitative data to identify the influence of behavioural, normative and control beliefs about teaching human reproduction in outcomes-based ways on practice.

My findings were that all teachers taught towards some outcomes and used some learner-centred approaches and these differed amongst teachers. The profiles enabled me to identify overall strengths of each teacher as an outcomes-based and learner-centred teacher, and the cross-case analysis indicated which outcomes were being met by learners through the teaching and learning approaches used. I found that the learning environment, and in particular the provision of or lack of learning support materials and other resources, impacted on the achievement of the outcomes. The school principals, colleagues, parents and friends proved to be mostly very supportive of the teaching of human reproduction and the need for strong communities of practice became evident. The choice of language was seen as a dilemma but my findings pointed to the use of home language or preferably code-switching to promote conceptual development and the development of English language skills. Cultural beliefs of learners contributed to their prior knowledge, and religious beliefs influenced some teachers who promoted more conservative values amongst their learners regarding sexuality. The need for clear boundaries on what could be discussed in class became evident, to protect both the teacher and learner from intrusion into their personal lives. Group work was seen as an important approach for this sensitive topic, and the need for workshops to strengthen teacher's subject content knowledge and thus their self efficacy when teaching human reproduction and to build strong communities of practice in which ideas and experiences could be shared amongst teachers, was a finding of this study.

In conclusion, some teachers were more outcomes-based and learner-centred than others. Subject content knowledge, choice of an appropriate language or language mix for teaching and learning, suitable learning environments with adequate learning support materials, school, district and parental support for the teaching of human reproduction all promoted a teachers sense of self-efficacy and made a difference to their teaching of human reproduction using outcomes-based approaches.

Keywords

outcomes-based, learner-centred, Grade 7 Natural Sciences teachers, human reproduction, teachers, learners, support structures, learning environments

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university.

.....

Megan Caroline Doidge

..... day of, 2014.

Acknowledgements

My grateful thanks go to the following:

- My supervisor, Prof. Tony Lelliott, for his support, encouragement, patience and thoughtful supervision.
- Prof. Martie Sanders who helped me develop my research proposal and started me on the PhD road.
- The teachers who willingly participated in the multiple case study and allowed me to observe and record their lessons and to interview them.
- Their learners who took part in the lessons on human reproduction and allowed me to listen to class interactions.
- The Principals who allowed me to conduct research in their schools.
- The survey teachers who completed the survey questionnaire and those who allowed me to interview them.
- The Gauteng Department of Education and the District head who allowed me to conduct my research in their schools, and the Natural Science subject advisor for this District for her support, encouragement and interest in the research.
- Ms Cane Lake for transcriptions of the interviews; Ms Jane Lawther for converting my handwritten field notes to an electronic version, and Mrs Gill Hannant for transcriptions of half the lessons and for editing my thesis.
- Mr Xolani Sithenjwa for transcription of a lesson conducted in Xhosa and its translation to English, and Ms Devoted Tanyane for transcription and translation of a lesson excerpt in Sepedi.
- My family and friends who supported me throughout this thesis, fed me and kept me sane.
- My two very special parents, Tiny and Ellen, who supported me in every venture I have undertaken throughout my life including this thesis and sadly passed away during the final years of my thesis. This thesis is dedicated to them.
- To my God and Father for His presence always!

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Keywords	iii
Declaration	iv
Acknowledgements	v
Table of Contents	vi
List of Figures	xii
List of Tables	xiii
List of Appendices	xiv
List of Tables in Appendices	xv
List of Abbreviations & Acronyms	xvi
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Background to the study	1
1.1.1 A new national curriculum for South African schools	1
1.1.1.1 Outcomes-based education in the national school curriculum	2
1.1.1.2 New approaches to teaching and learning	3
1.1.1.3 A National Qualifications Framework	3
1.1.1.4 The Natural Sciences learning area	3
1.1.2 A rationale for teaching human reproduction within the framework of the Natural Sciences	4
1.1.3 The role of Natural Sciences teachers in teaching human reproduction	6
1.2 Statement of the problem	6
1.3 Purpose of the study and research questions	7
1.4 An outline of the study	8
1.5 Theoretical framework	9
1.6 Limitations of the study and positionality of the researcher	10
1.7 Importance of the study	12
1.8 Structure of thesis	13
Chapter 2: Socio-cultural influences, sexuality education and human reproduction in the Natural Sciences	16
2.1 A brief history of Gauteng	16
2.2 Socio-cultural influences	17
2.2.1 A multicultural society	18
2.2.2 Cultural taboos and biological terminology	19
2.2.3 Religious diversity	20

2.2.4	Multilingual schools and the language of teaching and learning	21
2.3	Sources of information about human reproduction	24
2.3.1	Initiation schools	24
2.3.2	Parents and relatives	25
2.3.3	Peers	27
2.3.4	Media	27
2.4	Sociocultural influences on sexual knowledge, beliefs and behaviour	28
2.5	Sexuality education	30
2.5.1	Sexuality education in Life Orientation and the Natural Sciences	31
2.5.2	Human reproduction and sexuality education in primary schools	31
2.5.3	Meeting the personal needs of learners	32
2.6	Concluding remarks	33
Chapter 3: Implementing a new curriculum: historical developments and factors affecting the implementation of the NCS in Grade 7		34
3.1	A new curriculum for South Africa	34
3.1.1	Early influences in education	35
3.1.2	Outcomes-based education and Curriculum 2005	35
3.1.3	Outcomes-based education and the Revised National Curriculum Statement	39
3.1.4	Learner-centred education and the Revised National Curriculum Statement	43
	3.1.4.1 Learning environment	45
	3.1.4.2 Needs and interests of learners	45
	3.1.4.3 Constructivist approaches	46
	3.1.4.4 Learning styles	52
	3.1.4.5 Personal differences in learners	53
	3.1.4.6 Assessment and Integration	55
3.2	Educational change	56
3.3	Theoretical framework	59
3.3.1	A model for curriculum implementation in developing countries	59
	3.3.1.1 Professional development	61
	3.3.1.2 School ethos and management	62
	3.3.1.3 Resources	62
	3.3.1.4 Learner factors	64
	3.3.1.5 Teacher factors	66
3.3.2	Theory of Planned Behaviour	71
3.4	Theoretical framework for this study	73
3.5	Concluding remarks	74
Chapter 4: Interventions and events leading to the study		76
4.1	Developing materials for C2005	76
4.2	Exploratory case study	76
4.3	Changes in the Natural Sciences curriculum and local responses	80

4.4	Preparing for an intervention	81
4.4.1	Preparing for the workshop – revising the module	81
4.4.2	Situational analysis	82
4.5	An intervention: the workshop	86
4.5.1	Inviting teachers to the workshop	86
4.5.2	The workshop	86
4.5.3	Feedback on the workshop and learning materials	87
4.5.4	Distribution of materials	89
4.6	Disruptions to schooling	89
4.7	Concluding remarks	89
Chapter 5: Research Methods		90
5.1	Personal philosophy and research paradigms	90
5.2	Research methodology - the mixed methods approach	93
5.2.1	Survey	94
5.2.1.1	Questionnaires	94
5.2.1.2	Piloting the questionnaires	97
5.2.1.3	The sample	98
5.2.1.4	Collecting the data	98
5.2.1.5	Analysing the data	99
5.2.2	Case studies	99
5.2.2.1	The sample	100
5.2.2.2	Observation - Participant observation and field notes	104
5.2.2.3	Interviews	108
5.3	Rigour in the research	114
5.3.1	Consistency	114
5.3.2	Credibility (and internal validity)	115
5.3.3	Transferability (and external validity)	118
5.4	Ethics	118
5.5	Conclusion	120
Chapter 6: Outcomes-based and learner-centred approaches		121
6.1	Constructing a framework for analysis	121
6.2	Teaching and learning materials: Module on human reproduction	122
6.3	Outcomes-based approaches and levels of achievement	123
6.3.1	Critical Outcomes	124
6.3.2	Natural Sciences Learning Outcomes	132
6.3.3	Teachers' understanding of outcomes-based approaches	144
6.4	Learner-centred approaches	145
6.4.1	Teacher facilitates learning using constructivist approaches	145
6.4.1.1	The teacher provides challenging and appropriate new experiences/activities	148

6.4.1.2	The teacher scaffolds the learning	149
6.4.1.3	The teacher encourages learners, during activities, to talk about and work together to solve problems and complete tasks	153
6.4.2	Teacher provides a suitable learning environment	156
6.4.2.1	Physical environment	157
6.4.2.2	Intellectual environment	157
6.4.2.3	Social environment	157
6.4.2.4	Emotional environment	159
6.4.3	Teacher responsive to needs and interest of learners	163
6.4.4	Different intelligences and learning styles accommodated	167
6.4.5	Personal differences in learners accommodated	169
6.5	Conclusion	170
Chapter 7: Internal factors: The Teacher		171
7.1	Survey	172
7.1.1	Professional background	172
7.1.1.1	Teachers' qualifications and possible subject content knowledge	173
7.1.1.2	Professional experience	176
7.1.2	Personal factors	177
7.1.2.1	Religious and cultural values	177
7.1.2.2	Personal attributes	178
7.2	Multiple Case Study	180
7.2.1	Sipho	181
7.2.2	Jackie	187
7.2.3	Gogodi	190
7.2.4	Samkele	193
7.2.5	Mphety	196
7.2.6	Zama	198
7.2.7	Thobz	201
7.2.8	Nsuku	204
7.2.9	Rennie	208
7.2.10	Riana	210
7.3	A special case: Yaseen	213
7.4	Personal and professional factors affecting the case study teachers	216
7.4.1	Professional background	216
7.4.1.1	Teachers' qualifications, content knowledge, and levels of confidence and competence	216
7.4.1.2	Professional experience	219
7.4.2	Personal factors	220
7.4.2.1	Behavioural beliefs	220
7.4.2.2	Personal attributes	222
7.4.2.3	Value systems: Religious and cultural values and personal values	224

7.5	Conclusions	226
Chapter 8: External factors: the learning environment and support structures		227
8.1	Learning environment	227
8.1.1	Physical environment	228
8.1.2	Size of class (number of learners)	232
8.1.3	Resources	235
8.2	Educational support structures	240
8.2.1	School Principal	241
8.2.2	School organisation	244
8.2.3	Colleagues – other teachers	246
	8.2.3.1 Natural Sciences colleagues	246
	8.2.3.2 Colleagues from other learning areas in their school	251
8.2.4	Natural Sciences colleagues from other schools	253
8.2.5	Friends and past colleagues	254
8.2.6	District support and professional development	255
8.3	Community support structures	257
8.3.1	Parents	257
8.3.2	Religious leaders	259
8.4	Conclusions	259
Chapter 9: External factors: Learners		261
9.1	Prior knowledge	262
9.1.1	Source of prior knowledge	262
	9.1.1.1 School programmes	263
	9.1.1.2 Media	264
	9.1.1.3 Peers: friends and family members	265
	9.1.1.4 Parents	266
	9.1.1.5 Personal knowledge	268
	9.1.1.6 Community	269
9.1.2	Extent and type of prior knowledge	270
9.1.3	Teachers' prediction of their use of learners' prior knowledge to address misconceptions and explore values	272
9.1.4	Eliciting prior knowledge: a step towards achieving NS learning outcome 2 using a learner-centred approach	272
9.2	Culture and religion	273
9.2.1.	Religious influences	275
9.2.2	Using the biological terms	276
9.2.3	Menstruation	277
9.2.4	Initiation and circumcision	278
9.3	Language	280
9.3.1	Learning biological terminology	284

9.3.2	Understanding the worksheets	284
9.3.3	Code-switching and teaching in learners' home languages	285
9.3.4	Using learner-centred approaches and achieving outcomes with regard to language	287
9.4	Personal factors	289
9.4.1	Personal needs and interests of learners	289
9.4.2	Rates of learning	289
9.4.3	Developmental levels	290
9.4.4	Children who have been molested	291
9.5.3	Girls and boys – embarrassing moments	292
9.7	Conclusions	293
Chapter 10: Discussion and Implications		295
10.1	The use of outcomes-based and learner-centred approaches to teach human reproduction (RQ 1)	295
10.2	Factors affecting the teaching of human reproduction (RQ 1)	297
10.2.1	Personal and professional factors (teachers)	297
10.2.2	Exploring prior school and everyday knowledge	300
10.2.3	Language (teachers and learners)	301
10.3	Factors affecting the teaching of human reproduction in outcomes-based and learner-centred ways and associated control beliefs (RQ3 & 4)	303
10.3.1	Learning environment	303
10.3.2	Safe environments and boundaries	306
10.3.3	Group work and other approaches	308
10.3.4	Accommodating personal differences amongst learners	309
10.3.5	Support structures	310
10.4	The influence of beliefs (RQ 4)	311
10.5	Implications for education	313
10.6	Methodological findings	314
10.7	Critical reflection of the research process	317
10.8	Final statement	318
References		319

List of Figures

3.1	Rogan and Grayson's Theoretical Framework for Curriculum Implementation in developing countries	60
3.2	Ajzen's Theory of Planned Behaviour	72
3.3	Theoretical framework	75
5.1	Research design	92
6.1	Framework for analysis of learner-centred approaches	146
7.1	Teacher factors and my theoretical framework	172
7.2	Number of teachers with professional undergraduate qualifications, and number specialising in General/Natural Sciences or Biology/Life Sciences Subjects	173
7.3	Number of teachers with academic qualifications and number specialising in Life Sciences subjects in tertiary training	174
7.4	Number of teachers with further qualifications and specialising in Natural Sciences or Life Sciences	174
7.5	Confidence levels of teachers linked to Biology/Natural Sciences studied at a tertiary level	175
7.6	Teaching experience of survey teachers	176
7.7	Teaching experience of case study teachers	220
8.1	Learning Environment and Support Structures and my theoretical framework	228
8.2	Zama's classroom	229
8.3	Samkele's classroom	229
8.4	Nsuku's classroom	230
8.5	Gogodi's classroom	230
8.6	Rennie and Riana's laboratory	231
8.7	Number of teachers with Grade 7 Natural Sciences class sizes in the range indicated	232
8.8	Teaching and learning resources available to Grade 7 Natural Sciences teachers	235
8.9	Forms of support provided by Principals; as reported by survey teachers	241
8.10	Forms of support provided by Natural Sciences colleagues of survey teachers	247
9.1	Learner factors and my theoretical framework	261
9.2	Number of survey teachers identifying each source of information about human reproduction	262
9.3	Number of survey teachers with English as a home or additional language and who had learners with English as a home or additional language	281
9.4	Languages used by survey teachers, in addition to English, when teaching Natural Sciences concepts	283
10.1	Theoretical framework	316

List of Tables

4	Survey teachers' views about the workshop activities	88
5.1	Questions in the survey questionnaire and rationale for these questions	96
5.2	Background information on the ten case studies – the teachers, their schools and their learners	103
6.1	Cross-case analysis of the extent to which the case study teachers used approaches that enabled critical outcomes to be achieved	125
6.2	Cross-case analysis of the extent to which learning outcomes were addressed in class and thus could be achieved by learners during the teaching of human reproduction	132
6.3	Facilitation of learning	147
6.4	Learning environment	157
6.5	Needs and interests of learners	164
6.6	Multiple intelligences and learning styles	168
6.7	Personal differences in learners accommodated	169
9.1	Population and ethnic groups, and languages spoken in case studies	275

List of Appendices

1. Questionnaire for situational analysis	328
2. Workshop	332
2.1 Invitation to workshop	332
2.2 Invitation to participate in research, offer of materials, research findings	334
3. Module on Human Reproduction	335
3.1 Learners' module	335
3.2 Teacher's guide	355
3.3 Card game on male responses	373
4. Survey	376
4.1 Survey questionnaire	376
4.2 Survey results – External factors	384
4.3 Survey results – Internal factors: Teacher factors	396
5. Case studies – Interview guide	402
6. Case studies - teacher's profiles – outcomes-based and learner-centred approaches	408
6.1 Siphon	408
6.2 Jackie	410
6.3 Gogodi	412
6.4 Samkele	414
6.5 Mphety	416
6.6 Zama	418
6.7 Thobz	420
6.8 Nsuku	422
6.9 Rennie	424
6.10 Riana	426
7. Ethics – request for permission	428
7.1 Letters to district director	428
7.2 Subject information sheet for teachers - Situational analysis	431
7.3 Informed consent for teachers - Situational analysis	432
7.4 Informed consent for Natural Sciences teachers – Survey questionnaire	433
7.5 Informed consent for Natural Sciences teachers – Survey	434
7.6 Letter to Principal – Multiple Case Study	435
7.7 Subject information sheet for Principals – Case Studies	436
7.8 Informed consent for Principals – Case Studies; Observations	437
7.9 Subject information sheets for Principals – Interviews (additional cases)	438
7.10 Informed consent for Principals – Interviews (Case studies & additional cases)	439
7.11 Letter to Natural Sciences teachers – Interviews (Additional cases)	440
7.12 Letter to Grade 7 Natural Sciences teachers – Case studies	441
7.13 Information Sheet for Grade 7 Natural Sciences teachers (Case Studies)	442
7.14 Information Sheet for Gr. 7 Natural Sciences teachers (Interviews only)	443
7.15 Informed consent - Observations (Case study teachers)	444
7.16 Informed consent - Interviews (Additional cases)	445

List of Tables in Appendices

4.2.1	Learning environment	385
4.2.2:	Support structures	387
4.2.3:	Learner factors	393
4.3.1:	Professional and academic qualifications of teachers and the subjects they specialised in	397
4.3.2:	Biographical data for case study teachers based on survey information and interviews	398
4.3.3:	Confidence levels of teachers and Biology or Natural Sciences in their diploma or degree	398
4.3.4:	Length of teaching experience for survey teachers	398
4.3.5:	Influence of religion and culture on teaching	399
4.3.6:	Flexibility and confidence of teachers	400
4.3.7:	Teachers' preferred teaching styles	401
6.1a:	Sipho's profile Outcomes-based approaches	408
6.1b:	Sipho's profile: Learner-centred approaches	408
6.2a:	Jackie's profile Outcomes-based approaches	410
6.2b:	Jackie's profile: Learner-centred approaches	410
6.3a:	Gogodi's profile Outcomes-based approaches	412
6.3b:	Gogodi's profile: Learner-centred approaches	412
6.4a:	Samkele's profile Outcomes-based approaches	414
6.4b:	Samkele's profile: Learner-centred approaches	414
6.5a:	Mphety's profile Outcomes-based approaches	416
6.5b:	Mphety's profile: Learner-centred approaches	416
6.6a:	Zama's profile Outcomes-based approaches	418
6.6b:	Zama's profile: Learner-centred approaches	418
6.7a:	Thobz's profile Outcomes-based approaches	420
6.7b:	Thobz's profile: Learner-centred approaches	420
6.8a:	Nsuku's profile Outcomes-based approaches	422
6.8b:	Nsuku's profile: Learner-centred approaches	422
6.9a:	Rennie's profile Outcomes-based approaches	424
6.9b:	Rennie's profile: Learner-centred approaches	424
6.10a:	Riana's profile Outcomes-based approaches	426
6.10b:	Riana's profile: Learner-centred approaches	426

List of Abbreviations & Acronyms

AS	Assessment Standard
C2005	Curriculum 2005
CAPS	Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement
CO	Critical Outcome
DO	Developmental Outcome
DOE	Department of Education
DBE	Department of Basic Education
EMS	Economic and Management Sciences
F	Field Notes
FAMSA	Family and Marriage Society of South Africa
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
GET	General Education and Training
GICD	Gauteng Institute of Curriculum Development
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus / Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
HOD	Head of Department
I	Interview
INSET	In-service Education and Training
LO	Learning Outcome
LT	Lesson Transcript
LOLT	Language of Learning and Teaching
LSM	Learning Support Material
LSEN	Learners with Special Educational Needs
NCS	National Curriculum Statement
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
NS	Natural Sciences
OBE	Outcomes-based Education
PEI	President's Education Initiative
PTD	Primary Teacher's Diploma
PRESET	Pre-service Education and Training
RNCS	Revised National Curriculum Statement
RQ	Research Question
S	Survey
T	Teacher in Survey
STDs	Sexually Transmitted Diseases
STIs	Sexually Transmitted Infections
STS	Science and Technology in Society
ZFI	Zone of Feasible Implementation
ZPD	Zone of Proximal Development