

THE CONSTRAINTS OF USING DESIGN AND BUILD FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS IN SOUTH AFRICA

NDONWI GERALD MFONGEH

**A research report submitted to the Faculty of Engineering and
the Built Environment, University of the Witwatersrand, in
partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master
of Science in Building.**

Johannesburg, 2010

DECLARATION

I declare that this research report is my own unaided work. It has been submitted for the Degree of Master of Science in Building in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

Ndonwi Gerald Mfongeh

_____ Day of _____ (year) _____

Dedication:

This work is dedicated to my parents Mr. and Mrs. Mfongeh for their love, encouragement and total commitment toward the betterment of my life. They have compromised their well being continuously to make sure that I achieve whatever success that I have accomplished up to this moment, and still continue to guide me morally, financially and otherwise.

Acknowledgment:

My sincere gratitude goes to my supervisor, Professor Alfred Talukhaba for his guidance, advice and continuous encouragement throughout this project. I thank you very much Sir. Special thanks also go to my boss Mr. Seeraj Mohamed who created the space for me to be able to complete this work despite the tight schedules that the job usually entailed.

I thank sincerely my friends and family for all the love, support, encouragement which gave me the courage to bring this study to completion. I am thinking of my siblings, Barbara, Elvis, Vera, Ngwa and Noel, my good friend Charles Nyuykonge who edited and proofread this work, , Fon Mbakwa Emmanuel, WA Mpama, Olivier Pamen Meneukeu and Mpolokeng Manoto. I thank you all whole heartedly.

Abstract

Despite the numerous advantages that design and build has as a procurement method for construction projects, which have made it the procurement method of choice for construction projects in Europe and North America, not many South African construction companies are making use of it. This study investigates the constraints which are associated with design and build in South Africa. It also seeks to find out how certain performance indicators in construction fare when design and build is used. It then proposes recommendations on how the method can be improved in order to increase its use in South Africa.

Data for the study was collected from six major professions in the construction industry including contractors, engineers, quantity surveyors, project owners, project managers and architects in order to give a more balanced view of the problems. Questionnaires, emails and telephonic conversations were methods used to collect the data. Sample t-tests were then conducted on the data using the statistical package, Statistical Analysis Systems (SAS).

The results obtained show that there are numerous problems faced in all phases of construction projects when design and build is used as the procurement method of choice in South Africa. Most of the problems are around the issues of inadequate knowledge by project owners in construction, and also the unavailability of manpower to help owners with technical issues. Of the performance indicators investigated, time management and project quality are found to perform poorly. Project owners should deploy their own project managers in the construction process.

Table of Contents

| Contents... | Page |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| Declaration..... | vi |
| Dedication..... | vi |
| Acknowledgement..... | vi |
| Abstract..... | vi |
| List of figures..... | vi |
| List of Tables..... | vi |
| Appendices..... | vi |
| | |
| 1 Chapter one: Introduction..... | 1 |
| 1.1 Background..... | 1 |
| 1.2 Problem statement..... | 3 |
| 1.3 Objectives..... | 4 |
| 1.4 Hypotheses..... | 5 |
| 1.5 Significance of the study..... | 5 |
| 1.6 Delimitations..... | 5 |
| 1.7 Scope of the study..... | 6 |
| 1.8 Assumptions..... | 6 |
| 1.9 Structure of the research report..... | 6 |
| | |
| 2 Chapter Two: Procurement Systems..... | 8 |
| 2.1 Introduction to Procurement systems..... | 8 |
| 2.2 Definition of procurement in the construction context..... | 8 |

| | | |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 2.3 | Major trends in procurement systems..... | 9 |
| 2.3.1 | Separated and co-operative procurement systems..... | 10 |
| 2.3.2 | Integrated procurement system | 11 |
| 2.3.3 | Management-Oriented Procurement System..... | 12 |
| 2.4 | Factors to consider when selecting a procurement method | 13 |
| 2.4.1 | The time line facing the owner..... | 13 |
| 2.4.2 | Financing issues | 13 |
| 2.4.3 | Size and complexity of the project | 13 |
| 2.4.4 | Owner’s knowledge of the construction industry..... | 14 |
| 2.4.5 | Legal issues | 14 |
| 2.5 | Conclusion | 14 |
| 3 | Chapter Three: Design and Build Procurement | 15 |
| 3.1 | Definition..... | 15 |
| 3.2 | Project types suited to design and build systems | 16 |
| 3.3 | Sectors that make use of design and build..... | 17 |
| 3.4 | Use of design and build in South Africa..... | 18 |
| 3.5 | Comparison of use of the design and build in South Africa and other regions..... | 19 |
| 3.6 | Characteristics of the design and build system..... | 20 |
| 3.6.1 | Early knowledge of contract sum and project time | 21 |
| 3.6.2 | More accurate estimation of cost and time | 21 |
| 3.6.3 | Well defined scope/brief..... | 21 |
| 3.6.4 | Contractors must have both design and build capabilities | 22 |
| 3.7 | Hybrids of design and build | 22 |
| 3.7.1 | Pure design and build | 24 |
| 3.7.2 | Integrated design and build..... | 25 |

| | | |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 3.7.3 | Fragmented design and build | 26 |
| 3.7.4 | Novation design and build..... | 27 |
| 3.8 | Benefits of using design and build in construction projects | 28 |
| 3.8.1 | Single point of reference | 28 |
| 3.8.2 | Shorter project time | 29 |
| 3.8.3 | Savings in cost..... | 29 |
| 3.8.4 | Possible increases in the quality of projects | 30 |
| 3.8.5 | Room for innovation and improvement..... | 30 |
| 3.9 | Summary..... | 30 |
| 4 | Chapter Four: Constraints and Management Issues Associated with the use of Design and Build in Construction | 32 |
| 4.1 | The general mechanism of design and build systems..... | 32 |
| 4.2 | Tender preparation and evaluation issues in Design and Build | 34 |
| 4.2.1 | Tender preparation constraints..... | 34 |
| 4.2.2 | Tender evaluation constraints..... | 35 |
| 4.3 | Contract management issues in design and build systems..... | 36 |
| 4.3.1 | Contract between the owner and the main contractor | 36 |
| 4.3.2 | Design and build Contract Liability..... | 38 |
| 4.4 | Management issues at project implementation (design and construction phases) level in design and build | 39 |
| 4.4.1 | Planning and scheduling issues | 39 |
| 4.4.2 | Communication and information dissemination constraints..... | 41 |
| 4.4.3 | Coordination issues among various teams..... | 42 |
| 4.5 | Summary of constraints associated with design and build systems | 42 |
| 4.5.1 | The tender process in design and build contracts..... | 42 |
| 4.5.2 | The design phase | 43 |

| | | |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 4.5.3 | Construction phase..... | 43 |
| 4.6 | Changes to the design and build environment that could increase its use in South Africa. | 43 |
| 4.6.1 | Including knowledgeable owners in the design and build process..... | 44 |
| 4.6.2 | Including the owner’s project manager in the design and build process | 45 |
| 4.7 | Summary of findings from Literature | 46 |
| 5 | Chapter Five: Methodology | 47 |
| 5.1 | Introduction..... | 47 |
| 5.2 | Objectives..... | 47 |
| 5.3 | Research Approach..... | 47 |
| 5.4 | Information collection models | 49 |
| 5.4.1 | Secondary data source: Literature Review..... | 49 |
| 5.4.2 | Primary data collection..... | 50 |
| 5.4.3 | Questionnaire design..... | 50 |
| 5.4.4 | Likert’s Scale | 53 |
| 5.5 | Test for data reliability: Cronbach’s Alpha Test | 54 |
| 5.6 | Data analysis..... | 55 |
| 5.7 | Hypotheses testing..... | 55 |
| 6 | Chapter Six: Results and analyses | 57 |
| 6.1 | Characteristics of the sample obtained..... | 57 |
| 6.2 | Reliability of the data: Cronbach’s Alpha test | 58 |
| 6.3 | Results obtained..... | 58 |
| 6.4 | Analyses..... | 61 |
| 6.4.1 | Tender preparation and evaluation | 61 |
| 6.4.2 | Design phase..... | 63 |
| 6.4.3 | Construction phase..... | 64 |

| | | |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 6.4.4 | Performance indicators | 64 |
| 6.4.5 | Effect of including a project manager by the project owner | 65 |
| 7 | Chapter Seven: Summary, Conclusions and recommendations | 67 |
| 7.1 | Summary of findings..... | 67 |
| 7.2 | Research findings..... | 68 |
| 7.3 | Conclusions..... | 68 |
| 7.4 | Recommendations..... | 69 |
| 7.4.1 | Project owners should include their project managers in design and build projects | 69 |
| 7.4.2 | Clear communication lines between all parties | 70 |
| 7.4.3 | Proper planning | 70 |
| 7.4.4 | Well prepared brief or Request for Proposal | 70 |
| 7.4.5 | Engage the right teams/companies..... | 70 |
| 7.5 | Areas for further study | 71 |
| | References..... | 72 |

Table of figures

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| Figure 1: Separated procurement systems (Wadani, 2004)..... | 10 |
| Figure 2: Integrated procurement methods (Mohamed, 2005) | 11 |
| Figure 3: Management procurement systems (Mosley, 1990) | 12 |
| Figure 4: Pure design and build systems (Mosley, 1990) | 24 |
| Figure 5: Integrated design and build system (Mohamed, 2005) | 25 |
| Figure 6: Fragmented design and build systems (Mohamed, 2005)..... | 26 |
| Figure 7: Novation design and build system (Wadani, 2004)..... | 27 |

List of Tables

| | |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| Table 1: Issues faced in various stages of design and build projects | 51 |
| Table 2: Results of tests obtained for various potential problems in design and build | 58 |
| Table 3: Tender preparation and evaluation..... | 61 |
| Table 4: Design phase results | 63 |
| Table 5: Performance indicators results..... | 64 |
| Table 6: Effects of including a project manager in design and build processes..... | 65 |

Appendices

Appendix 1 Survey questionnaire.....76

Appendix 2 Collated data.....86

Appendix 3 Recommendations to constraints.....87

Appendix 4 T-test outputs.....90

Appendix5 Del Siegel output for computing Cronbach’s Alpha.....95