



Understanding the sorption and biotransformation of organic micropollutants in innovative biological wastewater treatment technologies

T. Alvarino, S. Suarez, J. Lema, F. Omil

Accepted Manuscript

How to cite:

Science of The Total Environment, 615 (2018), 297-306
doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.09.278

Copyright information:

© 2017 Elsevier B.V. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>)

1 **Understanding the sorption and biotransformation of organic micropollutants**
2 **in innovative biological wastewater treatment technologies**

3 T. Alvarino^{1*}, S. Suarez¹, J. Lema¹, F. Omil¹

4 ¹Department of Chemical Engineering, Institute of Technology, Universidade de
5 Santiago de Compostela, 15782 Santiago de Compostela, Galicia, Spain
6 (ter.alva@gmail.com)

7 *Corresponding author. Tel.: +34-881816739; Fax: +34-881816702

8

9

10

11 **Abstract**

12 New technologies for wastewater treatment have been developed in the last years
13 based on the combination of biological reactors operating under different redox
14 conditions. Their efficiency in the removal of organic micropollutants (OMPs) has not
15 been clearly assessed yet. This review paper is focussed on understanding the sorption
16 and biotransformation of a selected group of 17 OMPs, including pharmaceuticals,
17 hormones and personal care products, during biological wastewater treatment processes.
18 Apart from considering the role of “classical” operational parameters, new factors such
19 as biomass conformation and particle size, upward velocity applied or the addition of
20 adsorbents have been considered.

21 It has been found that the OMP removal by sorption not only depends on their
22 physico-chemical characteristics **and** other parameters, such as the biomass
23 conformation and particle size, **or** some operational conditions also relevant. Membrane
24 biological reactors (MBR), have shown to enhance sorption and biotransformation of
25 some OMPs. The same applies to technologies bases on direct addition of activated
26 carbon in bioreactors.

27 The OMP biotransformation degree and pathway is mainly driven by the redox
28 potential and the primary substrate activity. The combination of different redox
29 potentials in hybrid reactor systems can significantly enhance the overall OMP removal
30 efficiency. Sorption and biotransformation can be synergistically promoted in biological
31 reactors by the addition of activated carbon. The deeper knowledge of the main
32 parameters influencing OMP removal provided by this review will allow optimizing the
33 biological processes in the future.

34

35 *Keywords:* pharmaceuticals, removal mechanism, biotransformation, sorption,
36 **activated carbon**

37

38

39 **1. INTRODUCTION**

40 The conception of wastewater treatment is moving towards a circular economy
41 approach in the last years, in which the process economy should be balanced with the
42 protection of natural resources and environmental sustainability (WWAP, 2017). Even
43 though, nowadays still most wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs) are based on
44 conventional biological treatment processes designed for the removal of organic matter

45 and nutrients through the combination of anaerobic, anoxic and aerobic bioreactors, as
46 well as complementary physico-chemical separation units. These classical approaches
47 have achieved convincing results in terms of organic matter and nutrients removal.
48 However, these installations are facing a number of challenges mostly derived from the
49 need of reducing their footprint both physically (less land area required) and, especially,
50 from an environmental point of view (less energy consumption, less sludge production,
51 fewer pollutants and green house gases emissions, etc.). The need to advance in
52 resource recovery such as nutrients or reclaimed water completes this challenging
53 scenario.

54 In this context, the problem derived from the presence of chemicals of emerging
55 concern, such as organic micropollutants (OMPs) including pharmaceuticals, hormones,
56 and personal care products, has been widely assessed in different environmental water
57 compartments (sewage, surface, ground and drinking waters) all around the world along
58 the last decades. The effluent discharges from WWTPs constitute the main source of
59 OMPs into the environment (Carmona et al., 2014; Luo et al., 2014; Clara et al., 2011;
60 Monteiro et al., 2010). It has been shown that even conventional technologies are able
61 to remove efficiently some OMPs (Belhaj et al., 2015; Nakada et al., 2006; Carballa et
62 al., 2004), although there is still a significant group of compounds with a recalcitrant
63 behaviour (Clara et al., 2011; Kim et al., 2007; Carballa et al., 2004).

64 Some innovative biological treatment technologies have demonstrated important
65 benefits in terms of operational costs and removal efficiencies for conventional
66 pollutants (organic matter, nutrients or solids). Studies about anammox-based processes,
67 hybrid systems combining different redox conditions, moving bed biofilm and packed
68 bed reactors and anaerobic treatments applied to the water line have been recently n
69 published (Bilal et al., 2017; Luo et al., 2014; Vázquez-Padín et al., 2014; Kartal et al.,
70 2013; Ettwig, 2008). However, there is still a lack of knowledge about their capacity for
71 removing OMPs.

72 There are already legal initiatives that support the importance of broadening the
73 number of pollutants when assessing the quality of water. The European Union has
74 specifically included 12 OMPs in the watch list for emerging water pollutants under the
75 2015's Water Framework Directive (WFD). These micropollutants should be monitored
76 during three years in order to consider their future inclusion in the list of priority
77 substances and to determine their respective discharge limits in function of their
78 possible toxic, estrogenic and mutagenic effects. This should be considered as an
79 indicator of the need to include the removal of OMPs as a parameter for WWTPs
80 optimization, besides other variables normally considered (e.g. efficiency of
81 macropollutant removal, reduction of the operational costs, etc.).

82 The first approach to consider the removal of micropollutants in new WWTP
83 projects is to more deeply understand their removal mechanisms, including the
84 influence of the operating conditions, as well as the role of the microbial community on

85 their sorption and biotransformation. The authors have a long-term experience of more
86 than 15 years in research on the removal of OMPs in different biological processes,
87 including from more conventional to advanced technologies. The results have shown
88 that the combination of anoxic and aerobic conditions commonly applied in
89 conventional denitrification processes leads to the removal of several OMPs, such as
90 ibuprofen (IBP), naproxen (NPX), celestolide (ADBI) or roxithromycin (ROX) (Suárez
91 et al., 2010). The application of an anaerobic pretreatment step has shown to broaden
92 the number of OMPs that are partially biotransformed (Alvarino et al., 2014). The use
93 of membrane bioreactors (MBR) allows operation at higher biomass concentrations and
94 sludge retention time (SRT), which implies a higher microbial diversity. According to
95 Reif et al. (2011), this explains the improved removal of the pharmaceuticals IBP and
96 NPX in an MBR compared to a conventional activated sludge (CAS) unit. These results
97 suggest that treatment strategies based on the combination of different redox potentials
98 and on the application of high SRT (by the use of membranes, supports or granular
99 biomass) allow reaching higher OMP removal efficiencies for most of the OMPs
100 studied.

101 This paper is a review of the behaviour of OMPs during biological wastewater
102 treatment processes, focussing on the factors influencing sorption and biotransformation
103 as the main OMP removal mechanisms. It is based on previous experiments on OMP
104 removal with different technological configurations, moving from more conventional
105 processes, such as: i) an aerobic conventional activated sludge (CAS) unit of 2 L
106 (Alvarino et al., 2014) and ii) an upflow anaerobic sludge blanket (UASB) of 4.5 L
107 (Alvarino et al., 2014); to more advanced integrated systems: iii) an autotrophic
108 nitrogen removal process (ELAN®) of 200 L (Alvarino et al., 2015), iv) a hybrid
109 anaerobic-aerobic membrane process (AnHMBR) of 176 L (Alvarino et al., 2016a) and
110 v) a sequential batch reactor coupled to an MBR conceived for operation with direct
111 addition of powdered activated carbon (PAC) (SeMPAC®) of 48 L (Alvarino et al.,
112 2016b). The main characteristics of these five systems are summarized in Table 1 and in
113 more detail described in supplementary information. In all the previous studies, a
114 complete OMP mass balance was developed under steady-state conditions by
115 considering the measured OMP concentrations in both the liquid and the solid phases.
116 OMPs biotransformation was considered taking into account a pseudo-first order kinetic
117 model (Alvarino et al., 2015; Ec.1).

$$118 \quad k_{biol} = \frac{C_{inf} - C_{eff} - C_{sor}}{VSS \cdot HRT} \quad (Eq.1)$$

119 where C_{inf} , C_{eff} and C_{sor} are the concentrations in the influent, the effluent and
120 sorbed onto solids ($\mu\text{g/L}$); VSS is the volatile suspended solids inside the reactor
121 (g_{vss}/L) and HRT is the hydraulic retention time (d).

122 Previous studies have focused on the removal of OMPs under a specific redox potential
123 (Ghattas et al., 2017). Although some recent reviews have evaluated the OMP removal

124 during biological wastewater treatment processes in hybrid plants (Grandclément et al.,
125 2017; Tiwari et al., 2017), they are mainly focused on the occurrence of OMPs and the
126 evaluation of the effect of some conventional parameters, such as hydraulic or sludge
127 retention time. In general, the information about the combination of different redox
128 potentials in hybrid systems is still scarce. This research supposes a step forward
129 including new parameters affecting OMP removal, especially the relationship between
130 different factors (table S.1). Among others, the influence of biomass conformation on
131 OMP sorption, the role of the OMP chemical structure on their cometabolic removal
132 under different redox potentials, or the effect of adsorbents in OMP sorption and
133 biotransformation has been analysed.

134 2. SORPTION OF OMPs

135 Sorption onto particulate matter is especially relevant when the tendency of OMPs
136 to be retained onto sludges (primary and secondary) is high. The term sorption
137 comprises two mechanisms: absorption (micropollutants move from the aqueous phase
138 and enter into the lipophilic cell membrane of biomass or into the lipid fraction of the
139 sludge due to their hydrophobicity) and adsorption (micropollutants are retained onto
140 solids surface due to electrostatic interactions between positively charged compounds
141 and the negatively charged surface of biomass cells) (Sipma et al., 2010).

142 Sorption of OMPs is a function of their physico-chemical properties, as well as of
143 the characteristics of the sorbent agent. In the case of sludges, the octanol-water
144 coefficient (K_{ow}) and the acid dissociation constant of OMPs (K_a) determine their
145 sorption trend (Suárez et al., 2008; Ternes et al., 2004). Reported results indicate that
146 those compounds with a medium or high lipophilic behaviour (high K_{ow}), such as musk
147 fragrances or hormones, are preferentially removed by absorption onto the sludge
148 (Suárez et al., 2008; Joss et al., 2005), independently of the biomass conformation
149 (granular or flocculent biomass) (Alvarino et al., 2014). On the other hand, OMPs
150 which are ionized or dissociated in the aqueous phase can be removed by electrostatic
151 interactions with the negatively charged surfaces of the biomass, as in the case of the
152 cationic species of the antibiotic trimethoprim (Suárez et al., 2008). The use of the
153 solid-water distribution coefficient (K_d , in $L\ kg^{-1}$), defined as the ratio between the
154 concentrations in the solid and liquid phases at equilibrium conditions, is commonly
155 used to determine the fraction sorbed onto sludge (Hörsing et al., 2011).

156 The amount of OMP present in the solid phase can be divided into different
157 fractions according to the strength of the binding. The first fraction relates to the amount
158 of substance more weakly sorbed (extractable fraction), while the second is referred to
159 that portion more strongly retained (non-extractable fraction) (Bouju et al., 2016; Barret
160 et al., 2012; Bouju et al., 2011). The ultrasonic solvent extraction (USE) methodology is
161 the most common technology used for measuring the OMPs extractable fraction (Ternes
162 et al., 2004), whereas the non-extractable fraction can only be measured by using more
163 advanced techniques such as radiolabelled isotope based methods (Bouju et al., 2011).

164 These advanced methods can be used to assess the changes over time in the distribution
165 of the radioactivity of the radiolabelled parent compound both in the liquid and solid
166 phases, as well as in the gasses produced. The ^{14}C technique was used by Alvarino et
167 al., (2016c) to determine the sorption of the antibiotic sulfamethoxazole (SMX) in
168 bioreactors using different biomass conformations (granular and flocculent biomass)
169 and applying different redox conditions (anaerobic, anoxic and aerobic). Except in the
170 case of the anaerobic granules, the contribution of the non-extractable fraction to the
171 total sorption was always above 50%, with an increasing trend along the duration of the
172 assays, and the overall removal by sorption $< 6\%$ of the total radioactivity.

173 Among the different factors which exert a significant role on sorption of OMPs
174 onto sludges, the following have been especially highlighted in WWTPs:

175 *Biomass conformation*

176 The structure of biomass (type and particle size distribution) is expected to have an
177 impact on the removal of micropollutants, as it affects mass transfer between the target
178 compound and the microorganisms. Among suspended biomass, granular conformation
179 is typical of anaerobic reactors (upflow anaerobic sludge blanket (UASB), expanded
180 granular sludge bed (EGSB)), whereas flocculent agglomerations are usually present in
181 activated sludge based processes. Many innovative hybrid configurations consider the
182 use of supports for biofilm development. When flocculent and granular biomasses are
183 compared in terms of the relative amount of OMPs sorbed onto sludge (i.e. referred to
184 the concentration in the liquid phase, as determined by the K_d coefficient, table S.2),
185 higher values are obtained for flocculent biomass, which might be attributed to the
186 higher specific surface area of the flocs compared to the granules (Alvarino et al.,
187 2016a; Alvarino et al., 2014). The same effect is observed when comparing granules
188 with different particle sizes, being sorption enhanced as the granular size decreases
189 (Alvarino et al., 2015). In spite of the lower relative amount of OMPs sorbed onto
190 granular sludge compared to flocculent biomass, the contribution of sorption to the
191 OMPs removal in reactors working with this type of biomass (such as UASB units) is
192 higher since usual biomass concentrations are very high compared to CAS units (7-30
193 vs. 1-2 $\text{g}_{\text{VSS}} \text{L}^{-1}$, respectively) (Alvarino et al., 2016a; Alvarino et al., 2014).

194 In the case of the granular biomass, sorption behaviour has been described by an
195 intraparticle diffusion model comprising a two-stage diffusion process: starting with a
196 quick sorption of OMPs onto the surface of the granules followed by a slower
197 intramolecular diffusion step towards deeper layers (Alvarino et al., 2015; Shi et al.,
198 2011). Consequently, the sorbed concentration of the lipophilic OMPs (e.g. musk
199 fragrances) on granular biomass can increase with time, as reported by Alvarino et al.
200 (2016b; 2014). In such cases, the mass balances in granular systems cannot be based on
201 one unique sorption coefficient (K_d) for each OMP, whereas with flocculent biomass the
202 equilibrium is normally reached quickly being the K_d approach appropriate. In order to
203 predict sorption onto biofilms, the two-stage diffusion model was successfully used as

204 in the case of granules (Wicke et al., 2007; Headley et al., 1998). A biofilm is usually
205 considered as a matrix constituted by extracellular polymeric substances (EPS) in which
206 biomass cells are embedded (Wunder et al., 2011). These EPS may determine different
207 behavior towards OMP removal mechanisms, since their structure shows lower
208 interaction with lipophilic OMPs than the biomass, reducing significantly their sorption
209 onto the biofilm (Wang et al., 2002). EPS can also influence the sorption of hydrophilic
210 OMPs, since cationic and anionic functional groups are available in EPS chemical
211 structure, making possible the establishment of electrostatic interactions (Wunder et al.,
212 2011; Flemming et al., 1996). On the other hand, the apolar functional groups of EPS
213 proteins may sorb apolar organic compounds (Flemming et al., 1996).

214 *Hydrodynamic parameters*

215 Hydraulic retention time (HRT) is directly related to the contact time between the
216 wastewater and the sludge inside the reactor, which is usually in the range of hours for
217 biological reactors. This is enough to reach the sorption equilibrium among both phases
218 in flocculent biomass processes (Alvarino et al., 2014; Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2012).
219 However, as stated in the previous section, the sorption equilibrium is not achieved
220 under these conditions when operating with granular biomass (e.g. in UASB or EGSB
221 reactors). Experiments carried out in UASB reactors at different HRT showed that
222 higher HRT applied in those granular systems led to an enhanced removal of musk
223 fragrances by sorption (the most lipophilic OMPs considered), with negligible effect on
224 the other OMPs (Alvarino et al., 2016a; Alvarino et al., 2014), due to the increase in the
225 contact time. In upflow reactors (such as the UASB concept), the upward velocity
226 applied affects the hydrodynamics and degree of turbulence existing in the sludge bed.
227 It was shown that the increase of the upward velocity enhances the removal of the
228 lipophilic OMPs, due to the direct impact on the liquid-solid OMP mass transfer
229 (Alvarino et al., 2014). Therefore, the application of an internal recirculation to
230 decouple the HRT and the upward velocity would be an alternative to enhance the
231 removal by sorption in granules (Alvarino et al., 2014).

232 *pH and temperature*

233 Sorption is also affected by wastewater characteristics such as its temperature or
234 pH, although the narrow variation range of these variables during a conventional
235 WWTP operation makes these parameters not very relevant. Sorption has been
236 correlated inversely with temperature in the case of the hormone 17 α -ethinylestradiol
237 (EE2), with a reduction of K_d values of 20-25% when the temperature was increased
238 from 10 to 30°C (Zeng et al., 2009). On the other hand, the role of pH on sorption has
239 been related with the dissociation of certain OMPs (through the acid dissociation
240 constant pKa), which can result in the generation of positively charged compounds
241 (prone to interact with the negatively charged surface of sludges) or anions (low
242 interaction). Thus, the cationic species would be adsorbed by Van der Waals-type
243 interactions (Suárez et al., 2008; Golet et al., 2003).

244 *Membrane-based reactors*

245 Membrane biological reactors are currently widely used for urban and industrial
246 wastewaters. These systems are based on the combination of a suspended biomass
247 biological reactor and a membrane filtration step in the microfiltration or ultrafiltration
248 range (0.1-1 and 0.01-0.1 μm , respectively). In spite of these low pore sizes, OMPs are
249 not retained by means of size exclusion. Only nanofiltration or reverse osmosis
250 membranes are able to remove OMPs by physical means (Schäfer et al, 2011).
251 Membranes used in MBRs can be classified according to their hydrophilic or
252 hydrophobic nature depending on the properties of the construction material. In the case
253 of the hydrophobic membranes (e.g. polyethersulfone membranes), lipophilic OMPs
254 such as musk fragrances could be retained by sorption onto the membrane (Jermann et
255 al, 2009). Sorption of OMPs by membranes may be influenced by the establishment of
256 electrostatic interactions among the pollutant and the membrane surface (Ghaemi et al.,
257 2011). Nghiem et al. (2002) reported that OMPs can be retained by adsorption onto
258 membranes by the formation of hydrogen bonds, dropping the retention when the
259 membrane is saturated. No significant retention of OMPs within the membrane material
260 is expected for hydrophilic and neutrally charged membranes, such as the well-known
261 Kubota or Zenon modules (flat sheet and hollow fibre, respectively). The interaction
262 among OMPs and the cake layer formed on the membrane surface is another issue
263 which deserves attention, as retention by this layer through sorption and/or size
264 exclusion is possible (Wu et al., 2013; Terzic et al., 2005). This effect was reported for
265 musk fragrances in an MBR using a hydrophilic non-charged microfiltration membrane,
266 where an increase in the solid phase concentrations of these compounds was observed
267 with time due to their retention in the cake layer (Alvarino et al., 2016a). Higher
268 removal for diclofenac (DCF) and ROX was observed in an ultrafiltration MBR
269 compared to a microfiltration MBR, and these differences were also attributed to the
270 retention by the cake layer (Alvarino et al., 2017).

271 *Use of adsorbents*

272 The use of commercially available activated carbon (AC) in different
273 conformations (granular, powdered, pellets, etc.) is a well-established alternative for the
274 removal of a wide number of xenobiotics such as pesticides, taste and odor compounds,
275 and OMPs. This alternative is especially interesting for OMPs which exhibit a low
276 affinity to be retained onto sludge but, on the contrary, with a high affinity to interact
277 with other sorbent agents such as activated carbons (Table 2) (Paredes et al., 2016;
278 Kovalova et al., 2013). The sorption efficiency reached with activated carbon is a
279 function of the characteristics of the OMP considered, such as its electrical charge, and
280 its distribution coefficient ($\log D$). This coefficient depends on the octanol-water
281 distribution coefficient (K_{ow}) and the acid dissociation constant (pK_a) (Kovalova et al.,
282 2013; Nguyen et al., 2012). Compounds with high $\log D$ values, such as carbamazepine
283 (CBZ) or DCF, are readily sorbed onto PAC. Consequently, removal efficiencies above

284 99% were achieved in an MBR operated with a direct AC addition of 1 g/L (Alvarino et
285 al., 2017). No influence of the use of PAC was observed in this reactor in the case of
286 IBP, NPX or SMX, that are compounds with $\log D < 1$. A gradual saturation of the PAC
287 with time was observed in this system (Alvarino et al., 2017, 2016b). The propensity to
288 breakthrough is related to the charge of the compounds that were retained. The
289 saturation was first observed for negatively charged compounds (such as DCF),
290 afterwards for the neutral substances (such as CBZ), and finally for the positively
291 charged OMPs such as trimethoprim (TMP) (Nguyen et al., 2012, Alvarino et al., 2017,
292 2016b). The efficiency of sorption onto the AC is very much influenced by the quality
293 of the wastewater treated due to the competition of the matrix with OMPs, as reported
294 by Paredes et al. (2016).

295 *Table 2. OMPs sorption on the biomass and the activated carbon*

296

297 **3. BIOTRANSFORMATION OF OMPs DURING BIOLOGICAL** 298 **WASTEWATER TREATMENT**

299 Biotransformation of OMPs in WWTPs is related to the chemical reactions induced
300 by the presence of microorganisms in water, such as bacteria, which assimilate the
301 pollutants as growth or maintenance substrates leading to their elimination (Tran et al.,
302 2013; Yang et al., 2013). Although in biological processes complete biomineralization
303 of some OMPs is possible, for most of them the removal is only partial, being some
304 compounds completely recalcitrant (Collado et al., 2014; Clara et al., 2004). Apart from
305 the operational conditions imposed in a given WWTP (HRT, SRT, temperature, process
306 technology, etc.), the biotransformation of OMPs is also a function of the chemical
307 structure of each compound and the concentrations at which they are present. The OMP
308 concentrations determine the type of metabolism (primary or cometabolism), while the
309 type and activity of biomass (which depends on the redox conditions imposed)
310 determine the degree of biotransformation.

311 *Influence of biomass activity: metabolism and cometabolism*

312 The OMPs are present at much lower concentrations than the macropollutants
313 ($\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ to ng L^{-1} vs. mg L^{-1} , respectively). Thus, it is expected that the energy generated
314 by the OMP biotransformation is not enough to promote the growth of biomass, which
315 implies that the presence of a primary substrate is necessary for inducing the enzymes
316 for the OMP biotransformation by means of cometabolism. During this process, the
317 persistent compounds are converted into more biotransformable intermediate products
318 within the global metabolic pathways (Yi and Harper, 2007).

319 Cometabolism has been widely studied in the case of nitrification. The
320 simultaneous elimination of ammonium and different OMPs has been reported for EE2,

321 IBP, NPX, trichloroethylene or isoproturon, as a consequence of the cometabolic
322 biotransformations induced by autotrophic aerobic bacteria (Figure 1) (Fernandez-
323 Fontaina et al., 2012, Helbling et al., 2012; Yi and Harper et al., 2007; Yi et al., 2006).
324 The enzyme ammonium monooxygenase (AMO) is suggested to be the catalyst
325 responsible for the OMP/NH₃ cometabolism (Yi et al., 2006). Park et al., (2017) studied
326 the cometabolic removal of OMP by AMO and classified the OMPs in three categories
327 in function of the cometabolic biotransformation rates: i) OMPs with a biological
328 kinetic constant ($k_{\text{biol}} > 1 \text{ L g}_{\text{VSS}}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$, such as atenolol, thiamphenicol, and fenoprofen;
329 ii) OMPs with a k_{biol} between $0.1- 1 \text{ L g}_{\text{VSS}}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$, such as ketoprofen, propranolol,
330 metoprolol, diltiazem, or bezafibrate and iii) OMPs with a $k_{\text{biol}} < 0.1 \text{ L g}_{\text{VSS}}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$, such
331 as TMP and indomethacin. A correlation between the removal rate of three OMPs (IBP,
332 bisphenol-A, and triclosan TCS) and the nitrification activity in a nitrification-anammox
333 process was previously observed, evidencing the role of the AMO bacteria in the
334 biotransformation of these particular compounds (Alvarino et al., 2015). In fact, the
335 metabolites 1-hydroxyibuprofen and 2-hydroxyibuprofen were detected in biological
336 processes under aerobic conditions (CAS, aerobic MBRs, and nitrifying activated
337 sludge) as intermediates of IBP biotransformation (Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2016;
338 Alvarino et al., 2014; Zwiener et al., 2002). The formation of both metabolites might be
339 related to the enzymatic reactions catalyzed by AMO bacteria that utilize elemental
340 oxygen to incorporate the hydroxyl function into the chemical structure of the persistent
341 compounds (Figure 1a), increasing their biodegradability (Chang et al., 1997). The
342 removal of OMPs has been correlated to the specific nitrification rate in enriched
343 nitrifying cultures (Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2012; Helbling et al., 2012; Yi and
344 Harper et al., 2007). Tran et al. (2009) suggested that the OMP removals depend on the
345 concentration of both substrates: OMPs and ammonium.

346 Although less studied than the autotrophic nitrifying metabolism, the effect of the
347 heterotrophic activity on the removal of OMPs under aerobic conditions was also
348 reported (Alvarino et al., 2016a; Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2016; Tran et al., 2013; Tran
349 et al., 2009). An aerobic activated sludge reactor used as a post-treatment of a previous
350 anaerobic step, operated at a low heterotrophic activity, was spiked with pulses of
351 methanol (primary organic substrate) and a mixture of OMPs (Alvarino et al., 2016a).
352 During this experiment, a correlation between the reactor heterotrophic activity and the
353 removal rates of most OMPs was observed. The exceptions were those OMPs whose
354 cometabolisms had previously shown to depend on the nitrifying activity. The removal
355 of the antibiotic SMX by aerobic autotrophic and heterotrophic cometabolism has also
356 been studied (Alvarino et al., 2016c; Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2016; Müller et al.,
357 2013). A positive influence of the presence of organic matter as primary substrate was
358 observed in the removal rate of this antibiotic, whereas no influence was found related
359 to the ammonium content in the feeding. This confirmed that SMX removal is only
360 influenced by the activity of aerobic heterotrophs, while the role of nitrifying bacteria
361 are not relevant (Alvarino et al., 2016c; Muller et al., 2013). Although the removal of

362 IBP by cometabolism in the presence of nitrifiers is well documented, the use of
363 nitrification inhibitors showed that heterotrophs also contribute positively to its
364 biotransformation in CAS systems (Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2016; Tran et al., 2009).
365 Therefore, the effect of both types of microorganisms has to be taken into account when
366 studying the removal of IBP by cometabolism.

367 Less information is available in the case of biomass grown under anoxic or
368 anaerobic conditions. Pomiès et al., (2015) assessed the removal of atenolol under
369 anoxic and aerobic conditions and determined that cometabolism using organic carbon
370 as primary substrate was the main removal mechanism under both redox conditions.
371 The same behavior was observed for the antibiotic SMX by Alvarino et al. (2016c).
372 Recent studies reported a correlation between the methanogenic primary metabolism
373 and OMPs removal in the case of the pharmaceuticals NPX, SMX, and TMP, during
374 urban wastewater treatment in UASB reactors (Alvarino et al., 2016a; Alvarino et al.,
375 2014).

376 *Influence of the redox potential*

377 The redox conditions applied to the biological process (aerobic, anoxic, anaerobic)
378 are crucial to determine the microbial populations developed in the reactor and,
379 therefore, the biotransformation pathway of a given pollutant. The degree of
380 biotransformation is very much influenced by the OMP chemical structure. Table 3
381 shows a summary of removal efficiencies measured for a selection of OMPs under the
382 most common redox potentials applied in WWTPs: aerobic (CAS unit, Table 1),
383 anaerobic (UASB reactor, Table 1) and anoxic conditions (during denitrification in the
384 SeMPAC[®] process, Table 1) (Alvarino et al., 2016b, 2014). Among the micropollutants
385 considered in Table 3, most of them were readily biotransformed under aerobic
386 conditions, such as the pharmaceuticals IBP, NPX and ROX, hormones, musk
387 fragrances, fluoxetine (FLX) and TCS. In general, it can be seen that aerobic systems
388 are more efficient for the widest group of compounds, although anaerobic units can
389 improve the biotransformation of some substances (e.g. SMX, TMP). Nitrification
390 usually enhances biotransformation, whereas the anoxic conditions imposed in
391 denitrification units are not especially relevant for the biotransformation of OMPs. The
392 use of synthetic supports enhances the removal of OMPs due to the improvement of the
393 nitrification (Alvarino et al., 2016a; di Trapani et al., 2014). Finally, there is a group of
394 pharmaceutical recalcitrant compounds (CBZ, diazepam (DZP), DCF) which are not
395 affected by the redox conditions applied. Under positive redox conditions, the dissolved
396 oxygen concentration influences the removal of several OMPs (Stadler et al., 2015):
397 atenolol is readily removed under pure aerobic conditions, whereas the removal of SMX
398 increases in microaerobic conditions.

399 *Table 3. OMPs biotransformation in function of the redox potential*

400 NPX, SMX, and TMP are readily biotransformed compounds under anaerobic
401 conditions (Table 3), which is associated with their chemical structure. The presence of
402 an amide group in the structure of SMX makes its biotransformation under aerobic
403 conditions difficult, but it can be biotransformed by reductive reactions due to the
404 presence of a strong electron-withdrawing group such as the sulfonyl (Field, 2002).
405 Alvarino et al. (2016a) studied the intermediate products produced during the
406 cometabolic biotransformation of SMX under anaerobic conditions. One of the
407 metabolites of SMX detected under anaerobic conditions was more polar than the parent
408 compound, which suggests a pathway through the breakage of SMX at the sulfonyl
409 group (Alvarino et al., 2016c) (Figure 2). Besides, a second metabolite observed during
410 the biological biotransformation of SMX under anaerobic conditions was proposed to be
411 formed by the attack at the N-O bond of the 3-amino-5-methyl-isoxazole ring (Alvarino
412 et al., 2016c; Hayase et al., 1982). In the case of the antibiotic TMP, the substituted
413 pyrimidine is a functional group readily biotransformed under anaerobic conditions
414 (Figure 2) (Adrian and Suflita, 1994), whereas the carboxylic group of NPX promotes
415 its biotransformation by hydroxylation (Musson et al., 2010). Other evidences of
416 biotransformation under anaerobic conditions are those reported by Falås et al., (2016),
417 who observed the O-demethylation of the aromatic methoxy group of the antidepressant
418 venlafaxine; Veetil et al. (2012) showed the anaerobic biotransformation of TCS under
419 methanogenic conditions; or the works of Ghattas et al. (2017), who determined that the
420 antimicrobial agent TCS is transformed into chlorocatechol and 2,4-dichlorophenol by a
421 cleavage of the diphenyl ether.

422 The pharmaceutical NPX is readily biotransformed under both, anaerobic and
423 aerobic redox potentials (Figure 1b). Nitrification has been demonstrated to affect
424 positively its biotransformation (Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2012), which suggests that
425 the pathway for NPX removal is based on the cometabolic removal of the aromatic ether
426 through O-dealkylation induced by AMO bacteria (Quintana et al., 2005). In this way,
427 the hormones estrone (E1), β -estradiol (E2) and EE2 are easily biotransformed under
428 aerobic conditions due to the presence of aromatic rings substituted by hydroxyl groups
429 that can be cometabolised by AMO bacteria (Figure 1c, Chang et al., 1997).

430 In general, lower OMP removals were obtained under anoxic conditions when
431 compared with similar systems in the presence of oxygen. For example, Dorival-Garcia
432 et al. (2013) reported a medium biotransformation of quinolone (14-40%) under aerobic
433 conditions, whereas under anoxic conditions was observed a recalcitrant behaviour.
434 Alvarino et al. (2016b) has followed the removal of some OMPs during one complete
435 cycle in the sequential batch reactor (SBR) used in the SeMPAC[®] process prior to the
436 addition of PAC. During the anoxic stage, a recalcitrant behavior was observed for most
437 of the micropollutants except in the case of musk fragrances (ADBI, tonalide (AHTN),
438 galaxolide (HHCB)), sulfamethoxazole and fluoxetine. The minor biotransformations
439 during denitrification might be related to the lower oxidation potential of the nitrate
440 compared to oxygen. In the case of the lipophilic compounds, the removal occurred

441 mainly during the denitrification stage in the SeMPAC[®] process, but it was principally
442 attributed to sorption onto the sludge since this was the first stage of the SBR cycle
443 (Alvarino et al., 2016b).

444 One of the trends in the water industry the development of innovative WWTP
445 configurations is the combination of different redox potentials (spatially distributed in
446 different tanks or using a time distribution in one single tank) to enhance the microbial
447 diversity able to biotransform a wider range of complex pollutants, while maintaining a
448 high degree in the organic matter and nutrient removal processes (Luo et al., 2014).
449 Table 4 shows the results obtained in terms of OMPs biotransformation efficiencies for
450 several wastewater treatments which combine different redox potentials: 1) Anaerobic-
451 aerobic MBR (AnHMBR), comprising an UASB reactor followed by an aerobic MBR
452 operated with carriers (to promote nitrification); 2) One-stage granular autotrophic
453 nitrogen removal sidestream system (the ELAN[®] process based on Anammox) in which
454 anoxic and aerobic conditions occur (Vázquez-Padín et al., 2014); 3) Sequential batch
455 reactor, which combines nitrifying and denitrifying conditions, coupled to a MBR
456 (SeMPAC[®] system before the addition of PAC to evaluate only the biological process).
457 As expected, CBZ, DZP, and DCF were not biotransformed in any of these processes,
458 according to their recalcitrant behavior. The removal of IBP, NPX, and hormones was
459 clearly higher in the autotrophic N removal process than in the conventional
460 nitrification-denitrification system, very likely as a result of the higher nitritation
461 activity developed in autotrophic N removal processes (98 and 85% of removal for IBP
462 and NPX and 80 and 65% for NPX, respectively). The opposite behavior was found for
463 the antibiotic SMX, which was readily biotransformed in the conventional nitrification-
464 denitrification process, whereas a removal below 60% was found in the autotrophic N
465 removal reactor (Table 4). This difference can be explained based on the evidence that
466 SMX is cometabolically degraded during primary heterotrophic processes (Müller et al.,
467 2013; Alvarino et al., 2016c). The same applies to FLX that was also preferentially
468 removed during a heterotrophic conventional nitrification-denitrification process
469 compared to the autotrophic N removal process (Table 4), independently from the
470 nitrification activity. In general, the removal efficiencies obtained for OMPs in the
471 autotrophic N removal reactor were similar to those obtained in enriched nitrifying
472 processes (Fernandez-Fontaina et al., 2012). Since both processes have in common the
473 nitritation step, the cometabolism by the ammonia monooxygenase (AMO) bacteria
474 appears to be the key factor in their removal, as evidenced by a wide number of OMPs,
475 such as IBP or TCS.

476 *Table 4. OMPs removal in the systems with combination of redox potential*

477 The design of innovative systems is frequently driven by the valorisation of the
478 organic matter present in sewage through its conversion into methane, which is possible
479 in anaerobic processes. So, low temperature anaerobic pre-treatment processes are being

480 installed before the aerobic biological units, allowing the exposure of OMPs to different
481 redox conditions. In general, the contribution of the anaerobic treatment to the overall
482 OMP removal has shown to be low (Falås et al., 2016; Xue et al., 2010). Even though,
483 this combination has demonstrated to enhance the removal of some aerobically
484 persistent OMPs such as venlafaxine, diatrizoate, and tramadol (Falås et al., 2016). In
485 order to further elucidate the OMPs removal mechanisms occurring in the anaerobic-
486 aerobic integrated systems, a separate analysis of the individual processes was carried
487 out by comparing the performances of individual UASB and CAS reactors with the
488 integrated AnHMBR concept (Table 1). The removal efficiencies of the OMPs readily
489 biotransformed under anaerobic conditions were similar in the first stage of the
490 AnHMBR and in the UASB reactor (Alvarino et al., 2016a; Alvarino et al., 2014). On
491 the contrary, in the case of the OMPs readily biotransformed under aerobic conditions,
492 the removal was much lower in the AnHMBR compared to the CAS unit. This was
493 attributed to the low COD level entering the aerobic stage of the AnHMR (in spite of
494 operating at an ambient temperature of around 20°C), which confirms the cometabolism
495 role in the removal of OMPs. Also, lower nitrification was achieved in the aerobic stage
496 of the AnHMBR (below 60%) compared to the CAS unit (around 90%) due to the
497 washout of these slow-growing bacteria during reactor purges. This hampered the
498 removal of several OMPs, whose removal had been previously shown to depend on the
499 nitrification activity. The further improvement of the nitrifying activity in the AnHMBR
500 system, as a consequence of the introduction of Kaldnes rings as a support for the
501 growth of the slowly growing nitrifying bacteria, led to the restoration of the removal
502 efficiencies of OMPs such as IBP or hormones (Alvarino et al., 2016a).

503 *Parameters influencing k_{biol} values*

504 Biological kinetic constants (k_{biol} , in $L\ gvss^{-1}\ d^{-1}$) are usually obtained in kinetic
505 batch tests considering pseudo-first order kinetics (Joss et al., 2006). These k_{biol} values
506 correspond to the maximum biological activity and are not affected by other operational
507 conditions (Alvarino et al., 2014). Even though, biotransformation of OMPs depends on
508 their chemical structure and the redox conditions applied, which should be taken into
509 account when using previously published data. These experiments are performed
510 without limitation of the primary substrate to follow the OMP biotransformation by
511 cometabolism.

512 If the k_{biol} values are obtained under the steady-state operation of a biological
513 reactor, they are influenced by the operational conditions, such as biomass
514 concentration or hydraulic retention time, and therefore are specific to the process
515 studied. These specific k_{biol} values are determined by a mass balance applied to each
516 OMP, as shown in equation 1 in the case of a continuous stirred tank reactor (CSTR)
517 model and considering pseudo-first order kinetics for OMP biotransformation.

518 Figure 3 shows a summary of k_{biol} values obtained for a representative group of
519 OMPs by Alvarino et al. (2016a; 2014) (Table S1 gives the detailed data for all OMPs)

520 under different selected operational reactor conditions (Table 1). Accordingly, OMP
521 biotransformation degree could be classified as low, medium and high for $k_{biol} < 0,1$ 0.1-
522 1 and $>1 \text{ L gvss}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$, respectively, in these particular studies. Figure 3 shows that, in
523 general, the highest k_{biol} were achieved under aerobic conditions with full nitrification
524 (CAS unit). The influence of the nitrification rate on the removal of some OMPs was
525 evidenced by the lower k_{biol} obtained in the aerobic post-treatment step of the AnHMBR
526 compared to the CAS unit (Figure 3, Table S.3). The decrease in k_{biol} when nitrification
527 was lower was especially important in the case of NPX, whereas no influence on the
528 behaviour of the hormone E2 was evidenced.

529 Under anaerobic conditions, only three OMPs achieve the medium-high ranges:
530 SMX and NPX, whose k_{biol} values are close to the limit between the medium and high
531 ranges, and TMP, with the highest value located in the high range. It is worth to
532 remember that the k_{biol} calculations are strongly affected by biomass concentration (Eq.
533 1). Thus, the one order of magnitude higher sludge concentrations used in the UASB
534 compared to the CAS unit (30-40 vs. 1-2 gvss L^{-1} , respectively) implied that even in the
535 case of the readily biotransformable OMPs, such as TMP, SMX or NPX, moderate k_{biol}
536 values were obtained (Alvarino et al., 2016a, 2014).

537 Although HRT is a factor included in k_{biol} calculations (Eq. 1), its influence under
538 normal operation conditions was not so pronounced (Figure 3). A decrease in HRT in
539 the CAS unit from 24 to 12 h, implied a general increase in the k_{biol} values, except for
540 the persistent compounds (Table S.3). This was due to the fact that the OMPs removal
541 efficiencies achieved were not influenced by the applied HRT, indicating that the
542 capacity of the reactor for OMP removal was oversized.

543 *Figure 3. OMPs k_{biol} values constants determined in the reactors operated*
544 *under aerobic (at different nitrifying activities) and anaerobic conditions*
545 *(Alvarino et al., 2016a, 2014)*

546 *Influence of the simultaneous addition of sorbent agents*

547 The direct addition of activated carbon in bioreactors has been reported as positive to
548 improve the removal of carbon and nitrogen, as well as to reduce potential toxic effects
549 caused by inhibitors (Cecen and Atkas, 2011; Widjaja et al., 2004). In this kind of
550 systems both biotransformation and sorption are enhanced: the first through the
551 potential growth of a biofilm onto the AC and the latter due to the high sorption
552 capacity of this agent. This explains that, although the main removal mechanism related
553 to the AC addition into biological treatment processes is related to its high sorption
554 capacity, other factors are influencing the biological process (Alvarino et al., 2016b;
555 Rattier et al., 2012; Cecen and Aktas, 2011; Sun et al., 2008; Ying and Ping, 2006):

- 556 • The AC fosters longer retention of the sorbed OMP inside the biological reactors
557 that might promote an enhancement in their biotransformation, especially for
558 those compounds with medium biodegradability;
- 559 • The presence of AC promotes the growth of a biofilm, which can provide
560 additional redox environments (e.g. presence of anoxic/anaerobic inner biofilm
561 layers even in aerated tanks) and thus, a wider microbial diversity.
- 562 • The addition of AC promotes the nitrification that is related to the removal of
563 several OMPs, such as hormones or the pharmaceutical IBP;
- 564 • AC bioregeneration can improve the OMP removal by sorption onto the PAC
565 and is based on:
 - 566 a. Once the OMP solid-liquid equilibrium is achieved, adsorbed OMPs can
567 desorb out and be removed by biotransformation.
 - 568 b. Adsorbed OMPs can be removed by a extracellular biotransformation
569 carried out by the microbial enzymes secreted by the attached biomass
570 inside the carbon pores;
- 571 • The sorption capacity of the solid matrix is enhanced (e.g. CBZ is highly
572 retained by AC whereas HHCB is sorbed preferentially by the sludge);
- 573 • Wastewaters with inhibitory substances can be biologically treated since their
574 concentration in the liquid phase can be reduced below their IC_{50} due to sorption
575 onto the AC. The AC addition in the biological treatment reduce the effluente
576 toxicity;
- 577 • The presence of AC in bioreactors has shown benefits in their operation (e.g.
578 better biomass settling properties), especially in MBRs (less fouling, better
579 management of trans membrane pressure, etc.).

581 One of the innovative configurations testing this concept is the SeMPAC[®] process
582 (Table 1), a technology patented by the authors (patent ES 2 362 298 B2), which is now
583 in process of extension at international level (European Patent application
584 EP12777603.7). This process is based on the direct addition of PAC (1 g L^{-1}) in a SBR
585 which is coupled with an external ultrafiltration membrane chamber. It has been shown
586 that OMP removal in the SeMPAC[®] process occurs synergistically through
587 biotransformation, sorption onto the sludge ($5\text{-}8 \text{ g}_{\text{vss}} \text{ L}^{-1}$) and sorption onto the PAC
588 (Alvarino et al., 2016b). For example, an increase in the removal by biotransformation
589 and sorption for moderate biotransformable compounds, such as the antibiotics TMP,
590 SMX, erythromycin (ERY) and ROX and the antidepressant FLX, has been reported in
591 the presence of PAC. The k_{biol} values obtained for SMX and FLX increased from 1.3-
592 $1.5 \text{ L g}_{\text{vss}}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$ in the absence of PAC, to values higher than $4 \text{ L g}_{\text{vss}}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$ with PAC
593 (Alvarino et al., 2016b), which can be considered as an evidence of an enhanced
594 biotransformation.

595

596

CONCLUSIONS

597

598

599

600

601

A comparative analysis of different technologies used for biological wastewater treatment was carried out to further understand which operational parameters influence the two main OMP removal mechanisms, namely sorption and biotransformation. Several parameters that were usually not considered in previous works were included in the analysis, leading to the following main conclusions:

602

603

604

605

- Sorption onto the sludge is affected by the particle size. Only in the case of the flocculent biomass, the sorption equilibrium is quickly achieved, while sorption on the granules is affected by several parameters, such as the hydraulic and the sludge retention time.

606

607

608

609

- When using MBR systems, the physico-chemical characteristic of the membrane determines its sorption capacity. Hydrophobic membranes are able to retain lipophilic OMPs, whereas charged membranes can retain OMPs by electrostatic interactions.

610

611

612

613

- The simultaneous addition of activated carbon in bioreactors enhances the removal of recalcitrant OMPs by sorption. The tendency for each OMP to be retained by sorption is a function of the distribution coefficient and its electrical charge.

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

- The degree of OMP biotransformation strongly depends on the applied redox potential. The chemical structure of the OMPs determines if the compound is prone to go through oxidative or reductive pathways. The integration of different redox potentials in hybrid advanced biological configurations constitutes a good alternative to enhance the removal efficiencies of OMPs. The cometabolic removal of OMPs depends on several parameters, such as the biomass primary metabolic activity, hydraulic retention time or biomass concentration.

621

622

623

- The direct addition of PAC in biological reactors enhances the removal of OMPs not only by sorption but also synergistically by biotransformation, in the case of OMPs with a medium biodegradability.

624

625

Acknowledgments

626

627

628

629

630

This research was supported by the Spanish Government (AEI) through the Projects COMETT (CTQ2016-80847-R) and HOLSIA (CTM2013-46750-R). The authors belong to the Galician Competitive Research Group GRC2013-032 and to the CRETUS Strategic Partnership (AGRUP2015/02). All these programs and project are co-funded by FEDER (UE).

631

632 **REFERENCES**

633 Adrian, N.R., Suflita, Ü.M., 1994. Anaerobic biodegradation of halogenated and
634 nonhalogenated N-, S-, and O-heterocyclic compounds in aquifer slurries.
635 Environ.Toxicol. Chem. 13, 1551-1557.

636 Alvarino, T., Torregrosa, N., Suarez, S., Lema, J.M., Omil, F., 2017. Assessing the
637 feasibility of two hybrid MBR systems using PAC for removing macro and
638 micropollutants. J. Environ. Manage. 203, 831-837.

639 Alvarino, T., Suarez, S., Garrido, J.M., Lema, J.M., Omil, 2016a. A UASB reactor
640 coupled to a hybrid aerobic MBR as innovative plant configuration to enhance the
641 removal of organic micropollutants. Chemosphere 144, 452-458.

642 Alvarino, T., Komesli, O., Suarez, S., Lema, J.M., Omil, F., 2016b. The potential
643 of the innovative SeMPAC process for enhancing the removal of recalcitrant organic
644 micropollutants. J. Hazard. Mater. 308, 29-36.

645 Alvarino, T., Naslod, P., Suarez, S., Omil, F., Corvini, P.F.X., Bouju, H., 2016c.
646 Role of biotransformation, sorption and mineralization of 14C-labelled
647 sulfamethoxazole under different redox conditions. Sci. Total Environ. 542, 706-715.

648 Alvarino, T., Suarez, S., Katsou, E., Vazquez-Padin, J., Lema, J.M., Omil, F., 2015.
649 Removal of PPCPs from the sludge supernatant in a one stage nitrification/anammox
650 process. Water Res. 68, 701-709.

651 Alvarino, T., Suarez, S., Lema, J.M., Omil, F., 2014. Understanding the removal
652 mechanisms of PPCPs and the influence of main technological parameters in anaerobic
653 UASB and aerobic CAS reactors. J. Hazard. Mater. 278, 506-513.

654 Barret, M., Delgadillo-Mirquez, L., Trably, E., Delgenes, N., Braun, F., Cea-Barcia,
655 G., Steyer, J-P., Patureau, D., 2012. Anaerobic Removal of Trace Organic
656 Contaminants in Sewage Sludge: 15 Years of Experience. Pedosphere 22(4), 508-517.

657 Belhaj, D., Baccar, R., Jaabiri, I., Bouzid, J., Kallel, M., Ayadi, H., Zhou, J.L.,
658 2015. Fate of selected estrogenic hormones in an urban sewage treatment plant in
659 Tunisia (North Africa). Sci. Total Environ. 505, 154-160.

660 Bilal, M., Iqbal, H., Hu, H., Wang, W., Zhang, X., 2017. Enhanced bio-catalytic
661 performance and dye degradation potential of chitosan-encapsulated horseradish
662 peroxidase in a packed bed reactor system. Sci. Total Environ. 505, 1352-1360.

663 Bouju, H., Nastold, P., Beck, B., Hollender, J., Corvini, P.F., Wintgens, T., 2016.
664 Elucidation of biotransformation of diclofenac and 4-hydroxydiclofenac during
665 biological wastewater treatment. J. Hazard. Mater. 301, 443-452.

666 Bouju, H., Hommes, G., Wintgens, T., Malpei, F., Corvini, P.F.X., 2011. The fate
667 of ¹⁴C-radiolabelled diclofenac and 4'-hydroxydiclofenac in membrane bioreactor
668 treatment of wastewater. *Water Sci. Technol.* 63(12), 2878-2885.

669 Carballa, M., Omil, F., Lema, J.M., Llompарт, M., García-Jares, C., Rodríguez, I.,
670 Gómez, M., Ternes, T., 2004. Behavior of pharmaceuticals, cosmetics and hormones in
671 a sewage treatment plant. *Water Res.* 38(12), 2918-2926.

672 Carmona, E., Andreu, V., Picó, Y., 2014. Occurrence of acidic pharmaceuticals and
673 personal care products in Turia River Basin: from waste to drinking water. *Sci. Total*
674 *Environ.* 484, 53-63.

675 Cecen, F., Aktas, O., 2011. *Integration of Activated Carbon Adsorption and*
676 *Biological Processes in Wastewater Treatment. First Edition. WILEY-VCH Verlag*
677 *GmbH & Co. KGaA, Weinheim.*

678 Chang, S.W., 1997. Cometabolic degradation of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons
679 (PAHs) and aromatic ethers by phenol- and ammonia-oxidizing bacteria, PhD thesis,
680 University of Oregon State.

681 Clara, M., Gans, O., Windhofer, G., Krenn, U., Hartl, W., Braun, K., Scharf, S.,
682 Scheffknecht, C., 2011. Occurrence of polycyclic musks in wastewater and receiving
683 water bodies and fate during wastewater treatment. *Chemosphere* 82(8), 1116-1123.

684 Clara, M., Strenn, B., Kreuzinger, N., 2004. Carbamazepine as a possible
685 anthropogenic marker in the aquatic environment: investigations on the behaviour of
686 Carbamazepine in wastewater treatment and during groundwater infiltration. *Water Res.*
687 38, 947-954.

688 Collado, N., Rodriguez-Mozaz, S., Gros, M., Rubirola, A., Barceló, D., Comas, J.,
689 Rodriguez-Roda, I., Buttiglieri, G., 2014. Pharmaceuticals occurrence in a WWTP with
690 significant industrial contribution and its input into the river system. *Environ Pollut.*
691 185, 202-212.

692 di Trapani, D., Di Bella, G., Mannina, G., Torregrossa, M., Viviani, G., 2014.
693 Comparison between moving bed-membrane bioreactor (MB-MBR) and membrane
694 bioreactor (MBR) systems: influence of wastewater salinity variation. *Bioresour*
695 *Technol.* 162, 60-9.

696 Dorival-García, N., Zafra-Gómez, A., Navalón, A., González-López, J., Hontoria,
697 E., Vílchez, J.L., 2013. Removal and degradation characteristics of quinolone
698 antibiotics in laboratoryscale activated sludge reactors under aerobic, nitrifying and
699 anoxic conditions. *J. Environ. Manage.* 120, 75-83.

700 Ettwig, K.F., Shima, S., van de Pas-Schoonen, K.T., Kahnt, J., Medema, M.H., Op
701 den Camp, H.J., Jetten, M.S., Strous, M., 2008. Denitrifying bacteria anaerobically
702 oxidize methane in the absence of Archaea. *Environ. Microbiol.* 10(11), 3164-3173.

703 Falås, P., Wick, A., Castronovo, S., Habermacher, J., Ternes, T.A., Joss, A., 2017.
704 Tracing the limits of organic micropollutant removal in biological wastewater treatment.
705 *Water Res.* 95, 240-249.

706 Fernandez-Fontaina, E., Gomes, I.B., Aga, D.S., Omil, F., Lema, J.M., Carballa,
707 M., 2016. Biotransformation of pharmaceuticals under nitrification, nitrataion and
708 heterotrophic conditions. *Sci. Total Environ.* 541, 1439-1447.

709 Fernandez-Fontaina, E., Omil, F., Lema, J.M., Carballa, M., 2012. Influence of
710 nitrifying conditions on the biodegradation and sorption of emerging micropollutants.
711 *Water Res.* 46(16), 5434-5444.

712 Flemming, H.-C., Schmitt, J., Marshall, K.C., 1996. In: Calmano, W., Foerstner, U.
713 (Eds.), *Sorption Properties of Biofilms. Sediments Toxicology Substances.* Springer,
714 Berlin, Germany, pp. 115e157.

715 Field, J.A., 2002. Anaerobic degradation of xenobiotic compounds. VII Latin
716 America Workshop and Symposium on Anaerobic Digestion.

717 Ghaemi, N., Madaeni, S.S., Alizadeh, A., Rajabi, H., Daraei, P., 2011. Preparation,
718 characterization and performance of polyethersulfone/organically modified
719 montmorillonite nanocomposite membranes in removal of pesticides. *J. Membrane Sci.*
720 382(1-2), 135-147.

721 Ghattas, A-K., Fischer, F., Wick, A., Ternes, T.A., 2017. Anaerobic biodegradation
722 of (emerging) organic contaminants in the aquatic environment. *Water Res.* 116, 268-
723 295.

724 Golet, E., Xifra, I., Siegrist, H., Alder, A., Giger., W., 2003. Environmental
725 exposure assessment of fluoroquinolone antibacterial agents from sewage to soil.
726 *Environ. Sci. Tech.* 37, 3243–3249.

727 Grandclément, C., Seyssiecq, I., Piram, A., Wong-Wah-Chung, P., Vanot, G.,
728 Tiliacos, N., Roche, N., Doumenq, P., 2017. From the conventional biological
729 wastewater treatment to hybrid processes, the evaluation of organic micropollutant
730 removal: A review. *Water Res.* 111, 297-317.

731 Hayase, Y., Ozaki, M., Kobayashi, S., Takeuchi, Y., 1982. Reductive cleavage of
732 the isoxazole ring under soil percolation. *J. Pest. Sci.* 7, 401-402.

733 Headley, J.V., Gandrass, J., Kuballa, J., 1998. Rates of sorption and partitioning of
734 contaminants in river biofilm. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 32, 3968–3973.

735 Helbling, D.E., Johnson, D.R., Honti, M., Fenner, K., 2012. Micropollutant
736 Biotransformation Kinetics Associate with WWTP Process Parameters and Microbial
737 Community Characteristics. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 46(19), 10579–10588.

738 Hörsing, M., Ledin, A., Grabic, R., Fick, J., Tysklind, M., la Cour Jansen, J.,
739 Andersen, H.R., 2011. Determination of sorption of seventy-five pharmaceuticals in
740 sewage sludge. *Water Res.* 45(15), 4470-4482.

741 Jermann, D., Pronk, W., Boller, M., Schäfer, A.I., 2009. The role of NOM fouling
742 for the retention of estradiol and ibuprofen during ultrafiltration. *J. Membr. Sci.* 329(1-
743 2), 75–84.

744 Joss, A., Zabczynski, S., Gobel, A., Hoffmann, B., Löffler, D., McArdell, C.S.,
745 Ternes, T.A., Thomsen, A., Siegrist, H., 2006. Biological degradation of
746 pharmaceuticals in municipal wastewater treatment: proposing a classification scheme.
747 *Water Res.* 40(8), 1686–1696.

748 Joss, A., Keller, E., Alder, A.C., Göbel, A., McArdell, C.S., Ternes, T., Siegrist, H.,
749 2005. Removal of pharmaceuticals and fragrances in biological wastewater treatment.
750 *Water Res.* 39(14), 3139–3152.

751 Kartal, B., de Almeida, N.M., Maalcke, W.J., Op den Camp, H.J., Jetten, M.S.,
752 Keltjens, J.T., 2013. How to make a living from anaerobic ammonium oxidation. *FEMS*
753 *Microbiol. Rev.* 37(3), 428-461.

754 Kim, S.D., Cho, J., Kim, I.S., Vanderford, B.J., Snyder, S.A., 2007. Occurrence and
755 removal of pharmaceuticals and endocrine disruptors in South Korean surface, drinking
756 and waste waters. *Water Res.* 41, 1013-1021.

757 Kovalova, L., Siegrist, H., von Gunten, U., Eugster, J., Hagenbuch, M., Wittmer,
758 A., Moser, R., McArdell, C.S., 2013. Elimination of micropollutants during post-
759 treatment of hospital wastewater with powdered activated carbon, ozone, and UV.
760 *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 47(14), 7899-7908.

761 Luo, Y., Guo, W., Ngo, H.H., Nghiem, L.D., Hai, F.I., Zhang, J., Liang, S., Wang,
762 X.C., 2014. A review on the occurrence of micropollutants in the aquatic environment
763 and their fate and removal during wastewater treatment. *Sci. Total Environ.* 473-474,
764 619-641.

765 Monteiro, S. Boxall, A., 2010. Occurrence and fate of human pharmaceuticals in
766 the environment. *Rev. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 202, 53-154.

767 Müller, E., Schüssler, W., Horn, H., Lemmer, H., 2013. Aerobic biodegradation of
768 the sulfonamide antibiotic sulfamethoxazole by activated sludge applied as co-substrate
769 and sole carbon and nitrogen source. *Chemosphere* 92 (8), 969–978.

770 Musson, S.E., Campo, P., Tolaymat, T., Suidan, M., Townsend, T.G., 2010.
771 Assessment of the anaerobic degradation of six active pharmaceutical ingredients. *Sci.*
772 *Total Environ.* 408(9), 2068-2074.

773 Nakada, N., Tanishima, T., Shinohara, H., Kiri, K., Takada, H., 2006.
774 Pharmaceutical chemicals and endocrine disrupters in municipal wastewater in Tokyo
775 and their removal during activated sludge treatment. *Water Res.* 40, 3297-3303.

776 Nghiem, L.D., Schäfer, A.I., Waite, T.D., 2002. Adsorptive interactions between
777 membranes and trace contaminants. *Desalination* 147(1-3), 269-274.

778 Nguyen, L.N., Hai, F.I., Kang, J., Price, W.E., Nghiem, L.D., 2012. Removal of
779 trace organic contaminants by a membrane bioreactor-granular activated carbon (MBR-
780 GAC) system. *Bioresour. Technol.* 113, 169-173.

781 Paredes, L., Fernandez-Fontaina, E., Lema, J.M., Omil, F., Carballa. M., 2016.
782 Understanding the fate of organic micropollutants in sand and granular activated carbon
783 biofiltration systems. *Sci. Total Environ.* 551-552, 640-648.

784 Park, J., Yamashita, N., Wu, G., Tanaka, H. 2017. Removal of pharmaceuticals and
785 personal care products by ammonia oxidizing bacteria acclimated in a membrane
786 bioreactor: Contributions of cometabolism and endogenous respiration. *Sci Total*
787 *Environ.* 605-606, 18-25.

788 Pomiès, M., Choubert, J.M., Wisniewski, C., Miège, C., Budzinski, H., Coquery,
789 M., 2015. Lab-scale experimental strategy for determining micropollutant partition
790 coefficient and biodegradation constants in activated sludge. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.*
791 *Int.* 22(6), 4383-4395.

792 Quintana, J.B., Weiss, S., Reemtsma, T., 2005. Pathways and metabolites of
793 microbial degradation of selected acidic pharmaceutical and their occurrence in
794 municipal wastewater treated by a membrane bioreactor, *Water Res.* 39, 2654-2664.

795 Rattier, M., Reungoat, J., Gernjak, W., Keller, J., 2012. Organic micropollutant
796 removal by biological activated carbon filtration. *Urban Water Security Research*
797 *Alliance Technical Report No. 53.*

798 Reif, R., Besancon, A., Corre, K.L., Jefferson, B., Lema, J.M., Omil, F., 2011.
799 Comparison of PPCPs removal on a parallel-operated MBR and AS system and
800 evaluation of effluent post-treatment on vertical flow reed beds. *Water Sci. Technol.*
801 63(10), 2411-2417.

802 Schäfer, A.I., Akanyeti, I., Semião, A.J., 2011. Micropollutant sorption to
803 membrane polymers: a review of mechanisms for estrogens. *Adv. Colloid Interface Sci.*
804 164(1-2), 100-117.

805 Shi, Y.J., Wang, X.H., Qi, Z., Diao, M.H., Gao, M.M., Xing, S.F., Wang, S.G.,
806 Zhao, X.C., 2011. Sorption and biodegradation of tetracycline by nitrifying granules
807 and the toxicity of tetracycline on granules. *J Hazard. Mater.* 191(1-3), 103–109.

808 Sipma, J., Osuna, B., Collado, N., Monclús, H., Ferrero, G., Comas, J., Rodriguez-
809 Roda, I., 2010. Comparison of removal of pharmaceuticals in MBR and activated
810 sludge systems. *Desalination* 205(2), 653–659.

811 **Stadler, L.B., Su, L., Moline, C.J., Ernstoff, A.S., Aga, D.S., Love, N.G., 2015.**
812 **Effect of redox conditions on pharmaceutical loss during biological wastewater**
813 **treatment using sequencing batch reactors. *J Hazard Mater.* 282, 106-15.**

814 Suárez, S., Carballa, M., Omil, F., Lema, J.M., 2008. How are pharmaceutical and
815 personal care products (PPCPs) removed from urban wastewaters? *Rev. Environ. Sci.*
816 *Biotechnol.* 7, 125-138.

817 Ternes, T.A., Herrmann, N., Bonerz, M., Knacker, T., Siegrist, H., Joss, A., 2004.
818 A rapid method to measure the solid-water distribution coefficient (K_d) for
819 pharmaceuticals and musk fragrances in sewage sludge. *Water Res.* 38(19), 4075-4084.

820 Terzic, S., Matosic, M., Ahel, M., Mijatovic, I., 2005. Elimination of aromatic
821 surfactants from municipal wastewaters: Comparison of conventional activated sludge
822 treatment and membrane biological reactor. *Water Sci. Technol.* 51(6-7), 447-453.

823 Tiwari, B., Sellamuthu, B., Ouarda, Y., Drogui, P., Tyagi, R.D., Buelna, G., 2017.
824 Review on fate and mechanism of removal of pharmaceutical pollutants from
825 wastewater using biological approach. *Bioresour. Technol.* 224, 1-12.

826 Tran, N.H., Urase, T., Ngo, H.H., Hu, J., Ong, S.L., 2013. Insight into metabolic
827 and cometabolic activities of autotrophic and heterotrophic microorganisms in the
828 biodegradation of emerging trace organic contaminants. *Bioresour. Technol.* 146, 721-
829 731.

830 Tran, H.T., Urase, T., Kusakabe, O., 2009. The characteristics of enriched nitrifier
831 culture in the degradation of selected pharmaceutically active compounds. *J. Hazard.*
832 *Mater.* 171(1-3), 1051-1057.

833 Vázquez-Padín, J.R., Morales, N., Gutiérrez, R., Fernández, R., Rogalla, F., Barrio,
834 J.P., Campos, J.L., Mosquera-Corral, A., Méndez, R., 2014. Implications of full scale
835 implementation of an anammox based process as post-treatment of a municipal
836 anaerobic sludge digester operated with co-digestion. *Water Sci. Technol.* 69(6), 1151-
837 1158.

838 Wang, W.J., Wang, W.H., Zhang, X.L., Wang, D.H., 2002. Adsorption of p-
839 chlorophenol by biofilm components. *Water Res.* 36, 551–560.

840 Wicke, D., Böckelmann, U., Reemtsma, T., 2007. Experimental and modeling
841 approach to study sorption of dissolved hydrophobic organic contaminants to microbial
842 biofilms. *Water Res.* 41(10), 2202–2210.

843 Widjaja, T., Miyata, T., Nakano, Y., Nishijima, W., Okada, M., 2004. Adsorption
844 capacity of powdered activated carbon for 3,5-dichlorophenol in activated sludge.
845 *Chemosphere* 57(9), 1219-1224.

846 Wu, J., He, C., DC., Bi, D., Zhang, Y., 2013. A bio-cake model for the soluble
847 COD removal by the back-transport, adsorption and biodegradation processes in the
848 submerged membrane bioreactor. *Desalination* 322, 1-12.

849 Wunder, D.B., Bosscher, V.A., Cok, R.C., Hozalski, R.M., 2011. Sorption of
850 antibiotics to biofilm. *Water Res.* 45(6), 2270–2280.

851 Xue, W., Wu, C., Xiao, K., Huang, X., Zhou, H., Tsuno, H., Tanaka, H., 2010.
852 Elimination and fate of selected micro-organic pollutants in a full-scale
853 anaerobic/anoxic/aerobic process combined with membrane bioreactor for municipal
854 wastewater reclamation. *Water Res.* 44, 5999-6010.

855 Yang, G.F., Zhang, Q.Q., Jin, R.C., 2013. Changes in the nitrogen removal
856 performance and the properties of granular sludge in an Anammox system under
857 oxytetracycline (OTC) stress. *Bioresour. Technol.* 129, 65-71.

858 Yi, T. and Harper, W. F., 2007. The Link between nitrification and
859 biotransformation of 17 α -ethinylestradiol. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 41(12), 4311-4316.

860 Yi, T.W., Harper, W.F., Holbrook, R.D., Love, N.G., 2006. Role of particle size
861 and ammonium oxidation in removal of 17 alpha-ethinyl estradiol in bioreactors. *J. Env.*
862 *Eng.* 132(11), 1527-1529.

863 Ying, Z, Ping, G. 2006. Effect of powdered activated carbon dosage on retarding
864 membrane fouling in MBR. *Sep. Purif. Technol.* 52, 154-160

865 Zeng, Q., Li, Y., Gu, G., 2009. Effect of temperature on the sorption of 17 α -
866 ethinylestradiol to aerobic and anaerobic sludge. *International Conference on Energy*
867 *and Environmental Technology.*

868 Zwiener, C., Seeger, S., Glauner, T., Frimmel, F.H., 2002. Metabolites from
869 biodegradation of pharmaceutical residues of ibuprofen in biofilm reactors and batch
870 experiments. *Anal. Bioanal. Chem.* 372, 569-575.