

2

3

4

5 **The role of the motivational climate in female engagement in secondary school**

6 **Physical Education: A dual study investigation**

7

8

9

10

11 Grace Tidmarsh^{a*}, Florence E Kinnafick^b and Julie Johnston^c

12 *^aSchool of Sport, Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences, University of Birmingham,*

13 *Birmingham, UK; ^bNational Centre for Sport and Exercise Medicine, School of Sport,*

14 *Exercise and Health Sciences, University of Loughborough, Loughborough, UK;*

15 *^cDepartment of Sport Science, School of Science and Technology, Nottingham Trent*

16 *University, Nottingham, UK*

17 *corresponding author: G. Tidmarsh (email: gxt774@student.bham.ac.uk)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 Date of Submission: 07.12.2020

25

26

27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50

Abstract

This qualitative dual study paper explores girls’ engagement in secondary school physical education (PE). Girls’ engagement in PE has been at the forefront of changes to the PE curriculum in the UK, after global statistics show only 15% of teenage girls meet the guideline of 60 minutes of daily physical activity. Focus groups with 73 students (N=30 girls and 43 boys) were conducted across four schools in the UK. Data were thematically analysed. Results suggest girls perceive teacher and peer-created performance motivational climates within their lessons. Students specifically indicated a dislike of being watched by those of better ability (boys and girls), gender stereotypes, and enjoyment as factors influencing their motivation to engage in PE. As a result, we suggest schools engage in an intervention to enable peers and teachers to create a mastery focused motivational climate and classes be set by ability for non-contact sport.

Keywords: physical education; gender stereotypes; learning environment; motivational climate; adolescent females

51 **The role of the motivational climate in female engagement in secondary school**

52 **Physical Education: A dual study investigation**

53 The benefits of being physically active are well documented; regular physical
54 activity can improve psychological and physical well-being and reduce the risk of non-
55 communicable diseases such as heart disease, diabetes and obesity (Janssen & LeBlanc,
56 2010; Warburton & Bredin 2017). Despite this, decline in participation in sport and
57 physical activity (PA) has been stated, especially in girls who reportedly engage in less
58 PA than boys (Whitehead & Biddle, 2008). The World Health Organisation (WHO;
59 2011, 2016) recommend that children aged 8-18 years participate in 60 minutes of
60 vigorous intensity activity each day. However, globally only 15% of girls aged 11-15
61 years meet recommended levels (WHO, 2011) and only 8% of girls aged 13-15 years in
62 the United Kingdom (Townsend, Wickramasinghe, & Williams, 2015). The low levels
63 of reported PA in girls combined with the disparity seen when compared to boys, has
64 seen girls identified as a high priority group for PA promotion (Camacho-Minano,
65 LaVoi, & Barr-Anderson, 2011).

66 A variety of settings have been used to encourage PA in young people, however,
67 school-based interventions have been found to be most effective (Edwardson et al.
68 2015). Physical Education (PE) will often be the first exposure to PA for most children
69 (Somerset & Hoare,2018) and is considered fundamental within effective physical
70 activity promotion, providing young people with the skills, confidence and attitude to be
71 active in their own time (AFPE 2015, 2020). Whilst the decline in PA happens in both
72 girls and boys, it is more pronounced in girls and continues to increase with age (AFPE
73 2015; Sherar et al. 2007). Furthermore, most recent research from global physical
74 activity report cards appear to suggest that physical education provision in a number of

75 countries is high, yet overall PA levels remain low (Hughes et al. 2018; Edwards et al.
76 2018; Zembura, Goldys, and Nalecz 2016; Standage et al. 2018; Schranz et al. 2018).
77 This suggests a disconnect between the simple provision of PE and the successful
78 delivery and internalisation of the learning outcomes of the subject to motivate and
79 generate knowledge and skills that can impact lifelong behavioural change. For
80 example, intervention research in this area has been equivocal, yet when changes have
81 been noted, the consideration of the impact of peer relationships have been important,
82 with those that has addressed the specific needs of girls being most successful
83 (Camacho-Minano et al., 2011; Edwardson et al., 2015). This research appears to
84 support the directive of the AFPE within the UK which emphasises the importance of
85 taking the pupil voice into consideration when planning, delivering and evaluating
86 physical education initiatives (2015).

87 Biddle, Mutrie, and Gorley (2015), stated that “girls feel more comfortable
88 where comparisons with boys are eliminated, body image and self-presentational
89 concerns are reduced” (p.172-173). Similarly, Cooky et al. (2016) explored key
90 facilitators and barriers to female sports participation, female athletes in the study stated
91 that low body image leads to insecurities in physical education classes which may serve
92 as a barrier to participation. A recent review stated negative experiences in PE, peer
93 disapproval and stereotypes as barriers to girls engagement in sport (Somerset and
94 Hoare 2018). These findings support those by Wetton, Radley, Jones, and Pearce (2013)
95 who reported that girls aged 15-16 years faced four main barriers to participation: (a)
96 internal factors (e.g., self-esteem); (b) existing stereotypes (c) other hobbies; and (d)
97 teachers. Given the low rates of PA, barriers to participation, and the importance of
98 early learning experiences, especially specialist teaching of PE (Kirk, 2005), the PE

99 experience must be enhanced for girls to improve the likelihood in engagement in PA
100 outside of the PE setting. The environment in PE is vital in shaping students'
101 perceptions of both PE and PA and consequently can influence life-long motivations to
102 engage. Whilst increasing engagement in PE lessons has yet to show a clear and
103 sustained impact on subsequent impact on PA, there remains a dearth of research on
104 understanding pupil experiences.

105 **Motivational Climate**

106 The motivational climate (MC) is the social environment that coaches, teachers,
107 and peers create and perceive. Specifically, the MC refers to an individual's perceptions
108 of the goal structure and is a function of the group's goals, underlying reward system,
109 interactions among group members and individual interpretation of the specific social
110 structure (Ames & Archer, 1988). A mastery based climate reflects an individualistic
111 reward structure (personal improvement through effort and promote task-orientation
112 over time) and is characterised by effort-based goals and rewards as well as learning
113 and improvement. A performance based climate is said to reflect competitive reward
114 structures (comparison of performance to others and fosters ego-orientation over time),
115 emphasise social comparison, and reward people for out-performing others. Where
116 coaches and teachers create a mastery climate, intrinsic and self-determined forms of
117 motivation are more likely. Standage, Duda, and Ntoumanis (2003), conducted a study
118 looking at students' contextual motivation in PE, using constructs from self-
119 determination theory (SDT; Deci & Ryan, 1985) and achievement goal theories (Ames,
120 1992) to predict PA intentions. Results suggest that a mastery climate positively
121 impacted on mediating variables (autonomy, competence, and relatedness) to foster
122 self-determination, and that self-determined motivation positively predicted leisure time

123 PA intentions, whereas amotivation was a negative predictor. Similar positive
124 associations between a perceived mastery climate and self-determined forms of
125 motivation have been reported (Standage, Duda & Ntoumanis, 2006; Standage et al.,
126 2007; Zahariadis et al., 2002). Within education and PE, it has long been proposed that
127 the implementation of TARGET principles will aid teachers in creating a mastery
128 climate (Ames, 1992; Epstein, 1987; Treasure; 2001) and, in turn, enhance the
129 development of more self-determined forms of motivation towards PE.

130 The importance of significant others (e.g., PE teacher) is clear for children when
131 they rely on competence and relatedness information from those individuals. However,
132 during later childhood/adolescence, individuals rely primarily on their peers for this
133 information (Horn, 2004). Arguably, this brings into question the sole focus on teacher
134 created mastery climates. Students of secondary school age (11-16 years) typically
135 gather a greater quantity of competence and relatedness information from their peers
136 which influences motivation to engage. Motivation is a vital component of an
137 individual's choice to engage (or not) in PE and for PA to become part of a healthy and
138 active lifestyle throughout the life course. Exploring peer-created MCs is key to enable
139 a greater understanding of student motivation within PE.

140 **Peer-created Motivational Climate**

141 The peer-created MC is evidenced as a key environmental factor that relates to
142 intrinsic motivation, goal orientations, and competence perceptions (Hein & Joessar,
143 2015). Work by Vazou, Ntoumanis, and Duda (2006) examined the potential
144 behavioural interactions between coach and peer-created MCs in youth sport. The
145 researchers found that enjoyment was positively predicted by mastery focussed MCs.
146 Whilst there is evidence which strongly links mastery MCs to intrinsic motivation and

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

171 researchers (Archer 2007; Ryba et al. 2020; Wiltshire 2018). As such in the context of
172 these studies there is a lack of girl's engagement within PE; this does not change
173 depending on how this phenomenon is viewed. Critical realism accepts that there are
174 different valid perspectives on reality, rather than multiple realities (Maxwell 2012,
175 p.9). Through the use of thematic analysis of focus groups from both girls and boys, this
176 study aimed to explore boys' and girls' perspectives on girl's participation in PE
177 offering explanations as to why experiences may or may not occur (Ronkainen and
178 Wiltshire 2019). The study used thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006, 2012, 2013),
179 a widely used approach in qualitative sport and exercise research, as a guide for analysis
180 and interpretation of the findings. Thematic analysis is a method not aligned with a
181 particular philosophical approach and as such it enables data analysis through a critical
182 realist lens; acknowledging the ways individuals make meaning of their experience,
183 and, in turn, the ways the broader social context impinges on those meanings, while
184 retaining focus on the material and other limits of 'reality' (Braun and Clarke 2006).
185 Specifically, we adopted information from Braun and Clarke's (2019) most recent
186 reflexive commentary to guide our thematic analysis approach. Reflexivity is key to
187 enabling critical reflection of the knowledge produced and our role in producing it
188 (Braun and Clarke 2013). Further details are included in the data analysis section. This
189 multi-study research explored participant's beliefs and experiences surrounding girl's
190 participation in PE and PA. Study one took place in one secondary school academy (see
191 Table 1) and focused on female student perspective (N=30). Study two took place in
192 four secondary schools (see Table 1) and explored male student perspectives (N=43).
193 All PE lessons in the schools were single sex with the exception of inter-form
194 competitions and some after-school clubs. Class sizes ranged from 20-32 students and,

195 with the exception of athletics, male teachers tended to teach male students and female
196 teachers would teach female students. After obtaining ethical approval from the
197 University board of ethics and permission from school Principals and Heads of PE,
198 recruitment began. Study one recruitment took place in the autumn term and study two
199 recruitment took place during the spring term.

200 **Participants**

201 Participants were provided with information sheets and consent/assent forms.
202 All participants were recruited during their PE lessons. Cluster sampling was used in all
203 schools with the assistance of the Head of PE to ensure students ranged in their
204 physical/skill ability in accordance to their set (higher, middle, and lower) as well as
205 their year group.

206 **Study One.** Study one included girls recruited from years 7, 8, 9, 10, and 11
207 from one school. Inclusion criteria were that all students were female and under the age
208 of 16 and to have attended the school since the beginning of year 7 to ensure the same
209 length of exposure to their PE environment. All levels of physical activity were
210 welcomed e.g. those who only engaged in PE lessons to those engaging in regular
211 exercise or sport outside of school. In total 30 students (M age = 13.4 ± 1.6 years)
212 participated in this study. Of the 30 students, seven did not engage in any additional PA
213 outside of school. The remaining 23 students engaged in a range of activities such as
214 going to the gym, swimming, gymnastics, dance, and football.

215 **Study Two.** Study two recruited boys from years 7 and 10 across four different
216 schools (one school was the same as the school in study one). Students in Year 7 had a
217 mean age of 12.3 ± 0.53 years and those in Year 10 had a mean age of 15.2 ± 0.49
218 years. Only one participant did not take part in any additional PA outside of PE and the

219 remaining participants engaged in a variety of sports including, football, cricket,
220 basketball, and rugby. Inclusion criteria were that participants must have attended the
221 school since the beginning of Year 7 to ensure the same length of exposure to their PE
222 environments. Using students from Years 7 and 10 provided opinions and information
223 from two distinct age groups; year 7 students were at entry level within secondary
224 schools and year 10 students had been at the school for four years thus, having greater
225 experiences in their current environment. Year 11 students were not recruited due to
226 GCSE exams.

227 **Data Source – Focus Groups**

228 In total five focus groups were conducted in study one which entailed one per
229 year group with a range of three to seven participants per focus group. A focus group is a
230 way of removing the emphasis of the adult-child relationship where a child may respond in a
231 way they believe the researcher desires (Heary and Hennessy 2002). This format can allow the
232 researcher to discover the child's view of their world as they discuss the phenomena with their
233 peers. In these studies, focus group were conducted using flexible interview guides. Topics and
234 questions were carefully designed to encourage participants to talk with each other and draw out
235 common group understandings (Ennis & Chen, p.220, 2012 – RM in PE and Youth Sport) The
236 use of focus groups to collect data enabled more in-depth data to be collected through probing
237 questions and participants discussing and debating various points of view (Jones & Gratton,
238 2014).

239 Focus groups in study one lasted between 22 minutes and 30 minutes (Mean
240 duration: 26.3±3.6 minutes). Eight focus groups were conducted in study two which
241 included two per school and one for each year group at the school with either five or six
242 participants per focus group. Focus groups in study two lasted between 35 minutes and
243 48 minutes (Mean duration: 41.5±4.5 minutes). Focus groups were conducted by the

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

244 lead author, took place during the students' normal timetabled slot for PE and located
245 within the PE department to provide participants with familiar surroundings. Focus
246 groups have been successfully used in the PE setting (Fisette, 2013; Slater &
247 Tiggerman, 2010) to understand motivation and barriers towards PE and PA in girls.
248 Focus groups enabled more in-depth data to be collected through probing questions and
249 participants discussing and debating various points of view (Jones & Gratton, 2014).

250 Questions were formatted into two sections. The first section in both studies
251 aimed to gain contextual knowledge on engagement and feelings towards PE/PA and
252 provide an opportunity to build rapport and create a comfortable atmosphere. This was
253 especially key in study two; As a female researcher exploring male perceptions of
254 female participation in PE it was key to build a good rapport with the participants to
255 overcome any barriers regarding openness and honesty of answers given (Jones &
256 Gratton, 2014), and thus improving rigor. This was achieved with the addition of a card
257 game naming 10 male and female elite athletes. Within study one, the second section
258 facilitated discussions that explored girls' experiences of engaging in PE. Questions
259 encouraged discussions about working as individuals and as part of a team/group work,
260 as well as feelings about the types of sports offered and opportunity for choice. Within
261 study two, the second section encouraged participants to discuss girls' engagement in
262 PE. Questions stimulated conversations and debates about how the boys felt about girl's
263 engagement in PE/PA, how they felt about taking part in PE with the girls and visa-
264 versa and finally influences surrounding gender stereotypes (full interview guides
265 available on request). Probing questions and cues were used to encourage participants to
266 expand further if necessary. All focus groups were audio recorded and field notes were

267 taken throughout to describe aspects of the focus groups which would not be captured
268 through audio recording such as body language and, movement and tone of voice.

269 **Data Analysis**

270 The focus groups were transcribed verbatim and, in conjunction with the field
271 notes, analysed using reflexive thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2013; Braun and
272 Clarke, 2019). Specifically, Braun and Clarke's six phases of thematic analysis were
273 used as a guide to reflexively analyse data throughout in line with a critical realist
274 approach focussing on reporting the assumed reality evident in the data. (a)
275 Familiarisation: Through re-reading transcriptions and listening to original recordings
276 multiple times the lead author "immersed" themselves within the data. An iterative
277 approach was also used whereby the researcher studied field notes between each focus
278 group to ensure any new themes were addressed in future focus groups to aid social
279 agreement (Smith, 1984) and aided familiarisation of data. (b) Generating initial codes:
280 The lead author generated initial codes across the data set using QSR NVIVO (Version
281 11, 2017) to collate data relevant to each code. To ensure data analysis was in-line with
282 critical realism, the lead author checked/or re-analysed these themes by hand to ensure
283 the focus on participants' perspective of reality (Ronkainen and Wiltshire, 2019). The
284 following three phases (searching for themes, collating codes into potential themes and
285 reviewing themes) were conducted on two further occasions where all authors went
286 through a cyclical process to review, reflect, and critically discuss codes assigned to the
287 data to draw out the nuances of the girls' and boys' perspectives of girls' engagement in
288 PE. For instance, there was much critical discussion around participants' experiences of
289 being watched within PE and the extent to which this influenced their engagement as
290 the pupils discussed a variety of experiences and the authors wanted to ensure they

291 represented the participant experiences accurately. (c) Searching for themes: Codes
292 were collated into potential themes by the lead author whereby codes were written out
293 on post-it notes and gathered into potential themes. This enabled an active engagement
294 in the process by allowing codes to be easily moved around thereby enabling an overall
295 view of the phenomena and the themes (e.g. in study one the following was moved from
296 interest in personal growth to the individual in their social context “P126: Maybe the
297 more confident ones don’t see the ones that aren’t confident because they are just
298 focussed on what they are doing. Maybe they should include everyone else more and
299 make others feel more confident”. It was moved to the individual in their social context
300 as it seemed more relevant to peer relationships within this theme than ability when able
301 to look at the themes holistically in the manner described above). (d) reviewing and
302 defining themes: The approach taken during the previous phase combined with the role
303 of critical friends facilitated the reviewing and defining themes. By referring back to the
304 original transcriptions and notes, revisions and theme names were developed to ensure
305 they represented the perceived reality of the participants and their experiences within
306 secondary PE. For example, the theme named ‘the individual in their social context to
307 showcase participants’ was redefined and renamed from motivational environment to
308 present the experiences of girls more effectively within PE. (f) Producing the report.
309 Seen as the final stage of Bruan and Clarkes (2006 & 2019) thematic analysis,
310 producing the written report allowed further reflexive engagement with the data. This
311 resulted in the changing in two of the theme names to represent the codes (and
312 participants perceptions) more explicitly and that extracts included were vivid examples
313 to that showcase the reality experienced by participants of engaging in physical
314 education. Rigour was established throughout the analysis process through a critical

315 appraisal of themes to broaden the interpretation of the data beyond the first author.
316 The remaining authors acted as critical friends who challenged themes and example
317 quotes, encouraged reflection on, and construction of a richer more nuanced reading of
318 the data (Smith & McGannon, 2018; Braun & Clarke, 2019). Overall, six higher order
319 themes were developed through the thematic analysis of both data sets, three for each
320 study (see Table 2).

321 **Results and Discussion**

322 **Study One**

323 **Results.** During the thematic analysis three higher order themes with a number
324 of lower order themes were developed to address the primary aim of the study, which
325 was to explore girls' engagement and experiences in secondary school PE. The three
326 higher order themes were: (a) the individual in their social context, (b) interest in
327 personal growth, and (c) What's on offer? Participants discussed how various factors
328 influenced their motivation to engage fully in their PE lessons within each theme.

329 *The individual in their social context.* This first theme included lower order
330 themes: being watched, the role of teachers, relationships with peers, and the role of
331 gender. Participants discussed feeling a reduced sense of confidence when they felt they
332 were being watched by peers who they perceived to be of a higher ability. Even being
333 just with the girls did not completely alleviate one individual's feelings of low
334 confidence:

335 I don't think I'm very confident and I think not so much now, because it's just
336 with the girls this year, but sometimes I don't put in as much effort as I should
337 do because I am always thinking about what I look like and stuff like that. I'm
338 really self-conscious. (Participant 30, study 1)

339 Additionally, participants discussed how teachers affected their motivation to
340 engage. Students disliked being separated from their friends by teachers and for students
341 in years 10 and 11 they felt that teachers did not plan the lesson or let them do what they
342 wanted which they found boring. One student stated:

343 I think that I used to enjoy it more because the lessons were more planned and
344 structured but now the teachers just tell us to do what we want, and we don't
345 really do a lot in lessons and it gets quite boring. (Participant 20, study 1)

346 Finally, participants consistently discussed how their relationships with peers
347 influenced their motivation to engage in PE. The majority liked to be with their friends;
348 “I look forward to it as you're able to mix with all your friends” (participant 26, study
349 1). Similarly, a small number of participants (and less than anticipated) discussed a
350 dislike of participating with boys; one participant discussed how her feelings for
351 basketball changed when she realised it was just girls playing: “I thought it was in front
352 of the boys and I was like 'ahh no, no, not in front of the boys', then I found out it was
353 all girls and I just like basketball” (Participant 37, study 1).

354 ***Interest in personal growth.*** Participants discussed two main topics within
355 interest in personal growth and its influence on their levels of engagement in PE. They
356 discussed how their knowledge and desire to learn was important to engagement.
357 Learning more about netball in the lunchtime club helped one participant engage more
358 in her netball PE lessons due to a better understanding of how to play: “It helped me
359 loads with my actual performance in lessons because we learn tactics and skills that I
360 can use in games” (participant 22, study 1).

361 Participants also reported how comparisons against peers of a better ability
362 decreased their feelings of confidence. Participants discussed this in the context of
363 whole-year cross-country and group work.

364 It depends on the other people's ability in the group because if they really care
365 about the sport and winning and stuff like that and are all really good at it they
366 expect you to be as good as them and it's harder to keep up. (Participant 36,
367 study 1).

368 ***What's on offer?*** Participants discussed numerous factors relating to what was
369 on offer in terms of physical activities which affected their enjoyment. Having a variety
370 of sports to do over the course of their PE lessons was important. Participants had
371 conflicting views on the extent to which this occurred. Key stage 4 (KS4; years 7, 8, and
372 9) students felt they had sufficient variety. One participant said “there is lots of variety
373 in our lessons” (participant 3, study 1). However, many key stage 5 (KS5; years 10 and
374 11) students discussed how they found PE lessons repetitive and boring: “I agree with
375 everything being a lot more boring, because it's really repetitive and we're just doing
376 the same thing every single week, there is nothing new to look forward” (participant 16,
377 study 1).

378 Additionally, participants discussed the importance of choice to improve
379 enjoyment and ultimately engagement levels. Some students felt that they did not have
380 much choice over the type of sports/activities and who they worked with. Others felt
381 they were provided with a choice when they asked for example: “at the moment we're
382 doing the fitness suite, and me and a few of my friends said we didn't want to do that so
383 we're doing Zumba which is a lot more fun than weights and things like that.”
384 (Participant 32, study 1).

385 **Discussion.** These results provide an insight into the importance of key
386 socialising influences within the PE context and about how these influences then
387 affected aspects related to competence and enjoyment. These findings appear to support
388 an emerging body of work that emphasises the importance of peer support within an
389 optimal environment (Coen et al. 2019; Elliott, Bevan, and Litchfield 2019). The lens of
390 the motivational climate has traditionally been adopted when investigating the PE
391 environment (e.g. Ames, 1992; Epstein, 1987; Treasure; 2001). However, the focus has
392 been primarily on the adult influences, specifically, on what teachers should and should
393 not do to better engage young people in PE. Yet, these results suggest that participants
394 perceived a peer created performance climate and that this was more influential than the
395 teacher created climate which was rarely discussed by the pupils. This is perhaps
396 unsurprising given that as children progress into adolescence they are more influenced
397 by peers than significant adult figures (Horn, 2004).

398 Students expressed a fear both of being watched and of not being as good as
399 individuals they perceived to have a higher ability than them. This suggests a perceived
400 performance climate as described by Ames (1992), where social comparison is a key
401 component. Within this context, the participants compared themselves against those of
402 higher ability regardless of gender. Interestingly, this goes against previous research
403 which has suggested that social comparison regarding ability within the PE context is
404 most commonly perceived within gender dimensions (Biddle et al., 2015). Participants
405 did discuss social comparison against boys, however, this explicitly related to low body
406 confidence and the roughness of boys in team sports rather than a difference in ability.

407 Our results suggest that, whilst teachers are encouraged to create mastery-
408 climates, participants had mixed perceptions of the extent to which this was done. These

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

409 mixed perceptions were consistently split between KS4 and KS5. Participants in KS4
410 described more teacher behaviour (than those in KS5) which suggested a perceived
411 teacher created mastery climate with components pertaining to some, but not all, of
412 Epstein's (1987) TARGET framework. KS4 participants discussed feeling like they
413 had a choice and variety of tasks provided by teachers in which they enjoyed and
414 wanted to engage. However, KS5 participants felt this was not provided and resulted in
415 a poorer quality of motivation to engage during the PE lesson. This is similar to other
416 findings within the PE setting whereby those who perceived a mastery climate
417 displayed more intrinsic forms of motivation to engage and those perceiving a
418 performance climate displayed either amotivation or extrinsic forms (Harwood et al.,
419 2015; Standage et al., 2003; Standage et al., 2006).

420 Additionally, results suggest that participants experienced autonomy need
421 dissatisfaction. Need dissatisfaction occurs when an individual perceives an activity as
422 unrelated or disconnected from their psychological needs (Cheon et al., 2018). Students
423 felt that teachers did not allocate them to work with their friends suggesting that their
424 relatedness needs were not being met consequently leading to boredom, disengagement,
425 and a poorer quality of motivation to engage in PE. More specifically to KS5
426 participants, results suggest that students perceived their competence needs were
427 dissatisfied, when teachers did not plan or provide structure to the lesson leaving
428 students feeling bored and unchallenged. This corroborates with research from Cheon et
429 al. (2018) which states need dissatisfaction can result in boredom and amotivation.
430 Research has suggested students require positive vicarious experiences within PE in
431 order to facilitate future engagement in exercise outside of school (Kirk, 2005). Results
432 would suggest that for these participants their vicarious experience was not wholly

433 positive due to a perceived peer created performance climate and teacher behaviour that
434 did not support the development of basic psychological needs which contributed to
435 participants' lack of motivation to engage in their PE lessons.

436 **Study Two**

437 Based on the results of study one which highlighted the importance of the peer-
438 created MC and girls dislike of participating in PE with boys', study two aimed to
439 investigate boys' perceptions of girl's participation in secondary school PE.

440 **Results.** The three key themes were: (a) perceived self-efficacy, (b) awareness
441 of and level of conformity to gender stereotypes, and (c) the structure of the PE
442 environment. Within these themes and corresponding sub-themes, participants
443 discussed how they felt participating in PE with girls, how they perceived girls felt
444 participating in PE with boys, influences on their awareness of gender stereotypes
445 (particularly the media), how their behaviours conformed to the stereotypes, and finally
446 boys discussed with differing views how the structure of their PE lessons could be
447 changed to overcome some of the barriers to participation they raised.

448 ***Perceived self-efficacy.*** Participants discussed a variety of topics including
449 effort levels, ability and perceived self-efficacy, boys' perceptions of how girls' feelings
450 influenced their (girls) participation in PE, and the importance of enjoyment. Effort was
451 perceived to be more important than ability. The latter of which was not: "the main
452 point of PE" (Participant 4, study 2) and that girls were doing themselves an injustice by
453 not trying evidenced by one participant: "It's like they're putting themselves down,
454 they're not showing their true potential of themselves" (Participant 5, study 2).

455 Participants also spoke about their perceptions of how girls' feelings towards PE
456 could influence participation. A small number of participants were unsure as to why

457 girls didn't engage in PE lessons. However, the majority of participants spoke about
458 how they thought girls felt self-conscious, nervous, and embarrassed to participate in
459 front of people. In the context of running, one boy explained: "Some of them don't
460 actually run, they just jog... I think it might be because they might be embarrassed to
461 run in front of everyone" (Participant 54, study 2).

462 Enjoyment and fun was perceived as important to their own engagement in PE.
463 Interestingly, the boys compared the differences between single and mixed gender PE
464 lessons and how the different dynamic could contribute to an enjoyable lesson:

465 I feel like also when you're doing sport with the girls it's a bit more relaxed and
466 less competitive, and the guys are sort of like they get very aggressive and
467 competitive with each other whereas the girls are just kind of doing it because
468 they enjoy it. (Participant 40, study 2)

469 *Awareness of and level of conformity to gender stereotypes.* Participants
470 discussed gender stereotypes in sport including influences of family and friends,
471 however, the main focus was the influence of the media. Participants were acutely
472 aware of how gender was portrayed in the media and discussed how this portrayal may
473 influence girls' participation:

474 you rarely see women's teams on TV as much as men's teams and I think part of
475 that is you grow up with that and then your sport is sort of thought as a man's
476 thing and girls then think of sport subconsciously as something they shouldn't be
477 getting involved in. (Participant 42, study 2)

478 Boys were aware of how their own behaviours could reinforce gender
479 stereotypes. They provided examples of where they had commented or joked about girls

480 performing a skill incorrectly or telling a boy they performed a task like a girl if they
481 had not shown much skill:

482 when guys say something negative towards another guy, they might refer to it as
483 something girly, like you hit or you throw like a girl and that could affect both
484 ways of how a girl might react. She might be motivated to prove them wrong or
485 it might be quite demoralising to suggest that because they're male when they're
486 bad they're closer to being female. (Participant 40, study 2)

487 Boys also discussed how this behaviour was bi-directional as girls also made “negative”
488 or “mean” comments to boys. However, it was evident that the participants in the focus
489 group saw how the examples they provided of boys’ behaviour could reinforce gender
490 stereotypes and the negative impact it could have on girls’ participation.

491 *Structure of PE environment.* Lastly, participants provided differing views on
492 how they could overcome some of the barriers they perceived the girls to face in PE,
493 and the frustrations girls had during current mixed gender PE. A number of participants
494 thought it would be best to be separated by gender especially for sports they described
495 as “typically boys’ sports” (e.g. rugby and football). In contrast, a number of
496 participants suggested that, excluding contact sports, it would be best for all PE lessons
497 to be mixed by gender but split by ability, similarly to how other subjects are commonly
498 taught (e.g., English and Maths):

499 like I said earlier a lot of boys in my PE group they literally all do athletics
500 outside of school, they all do another sport outside of school ... so, I feel like
501 they (girls) might be a bit embarrassed. I know I feel embarrassed when I see X
502 do 1.75 on the high jump and I can hardly, I'm tiny I can hardly get past the third

503 one, you know what I mean. It makes you go I'm a bit crap at this sport so
504 maybe it makes them feel a bit unwanted. (Participant 41, study 2)

505 Overall, participants provided an overview of how they perceived girls felt
506 doing PE with boys, boys' behaviour towards girls, how the media influenced their own
507 and girls' perceptions of sport, and what could be done to overcome the barriers such as
508 embarrassment and self-consciousness.

509 **Discussion.** Similar themes emerged from the discussions with boys, albeit
510 expressed in different ways. Although boys can potentially be more competitive than
511 girls in PE, boys still perceived and strived for a mastery-climate. Additionally,
512 components of individual task-orientation were highlighted, for example, boys
513 discussed the importance they place on effort and trying one's best over ability (task-
514 orientation). Interestingly, they discussed that boys also displayed lack of effort during
515 PE sometimes and in both cases (boys and girls) was something that they found equally
516 frustrating. Although debated, the majority of participants thought that PE should be
517 about learning skills and trying your best, key components of Ames' (1992) mastery
518 climate.

519 In participant discussions surrounding their (boys) perceptions of girls' feelings
520 when engaging in PE with boys, results suggest that boys were aware of feelings
521 described in study one (e.g., low body confidence, self-consciousness, and
522 embarrassment). Boys also expressed feeling self-conscious, nervous, and embarrassed
523 when competing in some sports due to not being as good as the most talented
524 individuals, along with a fear of being watched. This aligns with research by who
525 discussed the notion of 'peer policing' within PE environments in which "gendered
526 identities are heavily policed and judged" (p. 690). Metcalfe further described how this

527 was not a uniquely female phenomenon, further supporting the findings of the current
528 study.

529 Boys presented some thoughts on how to overcome common barriers
530 (embarrassment and social-comparison, which are components of a performance MC;
531 Ames, 1992). Some participants suggested that grouping by ability instead of gender
532 might overcome the fear of being watched by others, especially where fear is
533 predominantly when participating with those of a perceived higher ability. Splitting by
534 ability was portrayed as a way to overcome the disparity between boys' and girls'
535 participation, highlighting that all their other subjects at school are organised by ability
536 not gender. It is possible that splitting participants by gender can exacerbate the divide
537 in male and female sports. This is an interesting suggestion as it contradicts the
538 dominant approach within pedagogical research that advocates the development of "girl
539 friendly" curricula (Enright & O'Sullivan, 2010) and the TARGET framework (Epstein,
540 1987) which suggests that student groups should be heterogeneous rather than
541 homogenous. Participants also suggested that students could and should be more
542 supportive towards each other. Contrary to (as they perceived) the popular discourse of
543 only boys being mean to girls in PE boys suggested this was a bi-directional behaviour.
544 Boys also experienced "mean" comments from girls which also discouraged boys'
545 participation.

546 It is evident that boys have a reasonable understanding of how girls feel
547 participating in PE with boys and expressed that the current narrative is perhaps not
548 truly inclusive and reflective of the whole picture within the PE environment. Boys
549 expressed a desire to improve the PE environment for both genders, through the
550 improvement of grouping by ability and also improved peer-interaction. Thus,

551 suggesting that the progression of the perceived peer-created MC from a performance
552 climate to a mastery climate is key to increasing self-determined motivation for boys as
553 well as girls during PE.

554 **General Discussion and Conclusion**

555 The results from both studies corroborates the recent work in this area that
556 emphasises the importance of peer interactions (e.g. Coen et al., 2019; Elliot et al.,
557 2020; Metcalf, 2018). Furthermore, the results of these studies also emphasise a drive
558 for a focus on promotion of high levels of effort, enjoyment and self-improvement over
559 a focus on ability and social comparison which clearly align with the underpinning
560 characteristics of Achievement Goal Theory (Ames, 1992; Nicholls, 1989). Whilst
561 adopting a motivational climate perspective is not new within research in this area, the
562 focus to date has predominantly been on influencing and enhancing the teacher-created
563 motivational climate, most commonly through Epstein's (1987) TARGET framework.
564 The combined results of these studies suggest that the focus now needs to turn to
565 understanding how to enhance the peer-created MC to better contribute towards
566 engagement in PE. The importance of high levels of enjoyment and competence
567 emphasised within this study also align with current policymakers who recognise the
568 importance of these core concepts in shaping an individual's attitude to PA throughout
569 the life span(Sport England 2016). Results suggest that girls perceived a performance
570 climate during their PE lessons. Boys also acknowledged that their behaviour did not
571 always support and encourage girls' engagement, but that girls also behaved in this
572 manner towards boys. Boys suggested PE classes be set by ability rather than gender for
573 non-contact sports and that students need to be more supportive of each other during
574 PE, which could improve the motivational climate. However, having PE set by ability,

575 as in other secondary school subjects, does not conform with present guidelines for PE
576 teachers in light of the TARGET framework (Epstein, 1987) which endorses
577 heterogeneous groups. However, considering more recent research which suggests that
578 peer-influence holds a higher value compared to a significant adult as children progress
579 into adolescence (Horn, 2004), it is important to consider this alternative structure to PE
580 lessons. It is clear that a change in perceptions of the peer-created MC is needed to
581 encourage girls' participation and positive experiences in PE which may lead to an
582 increased likelihood of engagement post-16.

583 **Strengths and Limitations**

584 This study has presented unique findings in the field of girls' engagement in PE.
585 However, it is important that these are considered within the parameters of the strengths
586 and limitations of the present study. Firstly, the in-depth approach taken in exploring
587 girls' participation in PE through focus groups and the inclusion of both girls and boys,
588 makes the study not only unique in the field but provides a more holistic insight into the
589 phenomena (Jones & Gratton, 2014). Secondly, we used cluster sampling
590 (collaboratively with the Heads of PE departments) along with the inclusion criteria to
591 enhance the validity of the research accounts. This ensured empirical adequacy through
592 the inclusion of the most suitable participants (Ronkainen and Wiltshire 2019). Thus,
593 increasing confidence that adequate data had been collected to support the
594 interpretations and explanations offered in these studies and enabling various opinions
595 to be voiced.(Ronkainen and Wiltshire 2019). Thirdly, the remaining authors acted as
596 critical friends and challenged themes and example quotes to provide more insight into
597 the phenomena, offering complex and alternative perspectives (Smith and Sparkes
598 2014). Additionally, in order to minimise the risk of students answering with social

599 desirability, extra lengths were taken by the main author to ensure that rapport was built
600 through informal conversation and an initial card game where participants had to name
601 male and female elite athletes. This served to create a comfortable and open
602 environment where participants felt at ease to answer questions honestly and ensured
603 the sincerity of the researcher (Tracey, 2010).

604 A limitation of the study was that the population characteristics were narrow
605 (e.g. predominantly White British ethnicity) and the extent to which these findings
606 relate to other cultures is unknown. Additionally, all recruited schools had either good
607 or outstanding Ofsted results at the time the studies were conducted, and all had a
608 relatively low percentage of students on free school meals ($\leq 10.5\%$; see Table 1). A
609 further limitation of the study was that taking the perspective of one or two theories may
610 limit the interpretation, even with the use of critical appraisal during thematic analysis.
611 The use of a colleague not on the research project in the capacity of a critical friend
612 would be recommended for future studies (Smith & McGannon, 2018). Finally, the
613 order in which the two studies were conducted may lead the boy's voice to appear
614 stronger than the girls as due to time it was not viable to go back to the girls to discuss
615 the boy's suggestions regarding mixed ability PE. Whilst the strength of the boys' voice
616 may appear as a limitation in overpowering the girls voice, the boy's presented
617 solutions to problems they perceived which is a unique finding within the study.

618 **Future Research and Applied Implications**

619 Although, teachers are equipped to engage with inclusive pedagogies, results
620 from this study suggest this does not necessarily filter down to engagement levels and
621 that further exploration into peer relationships is a key point for future research. The
622 results suggest PE lessons be grouped by ability rather than gender where the sport is

623 non-contact to create an improved mastery MC. However, more research is needed to
624 see if this is a viable idea relating to practical considerations, teachers' opinions, and
625 also girls' opinions. Furthermore, it is recommended that an increased focus is placed
626 on improving student awareness of the motivational climate they create and equipping
627 them with the appropriate tools e.g., behaviours to create a mastery climate. Although
628 we propose this is done through a co-produced intervention incorporated into PE
629 lessons, further exploration is required to inform and contribute to intervention design.
630 Specifically, more research is required to understand how this is best delivered i.e. by or
631 through pupils themselves and furthermore to understand the teacher role within
632 facilitating this and how this may influence the training and development of PE
633 teachers.

634 To conclude, this qualitative research suggests that peer-created motivational
635 climate is more relevant in this context for both boys and girls and that steps are needed
636 to ensure students create and perceive a mastery-climate. The research suggests that
637 where girls perceive a peer-created performance climate they may be less motivated to
638 engage in their PE lesson. In order to achieve this, we propose that future research
639 should investigate further the design and implementation of an educational based
640 intervention to equip students with the skills needed to create a mastery MC. Results
641 also suggest the benefits of PE being set by ability rather than gender where sports are
642 non-contact in nature. We would advocate this approach based on further research
643 surrounding teacher and girls' perceptions, and on the feasibility of its introduction.
644

645

References

- 646 Association for Physical Education. Health Position Paper. 2015. Available
 647 from [http://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-](http://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-content/uploads/afPE_Health_Position_Paper_Web_Version2015.pdf)
 648 [content/uploads/afPE_Health_Position_Paper_Web_Version2015.pdf](http://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-content/uploads/afPE_Health_Position_Paper_Web_Version2015.pdf). Accessed 20th
 649 July 2020
- 650 Association for Physical Education. Health Position Paper. 2020. Available from
 651 [https://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-content/uploads/Health-Position-Paper-](https://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-content/uploads/Health-Position-Paper-2020-Web.pdf)
 652 [2020-Web.pdf](https://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-content/uploads/Health-Position-Paper-2020-Web.pdf). Accessed 20th July 2020
- 653 Allender, S., Cowburn, G., and Foster, C. 2006. Understanding participation in sport
 654 and physical activity among children and adults: A review of qualitative
 655 studies. *Health Education Research*, 21, 826-835. doi:10.1093/her/cyl063
- 656 Ames, C. 1992. Achievement goals, motivational climate and motivational processes. In
 657 G. Roberts (Ed.), *Motivation in sport and exercise* (pp. 161-176). Champaign,
 658 IL: Human Kinetics.
- 659 Ames, C., and Archer, J. 1988. Achievement goals in the classroom: Students' learning
 660 strategies and motivation processes. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 80,
 661 260-267. doi:10.1037/0022-0663.80.3.260
- 662 Archer, M. 2007. "The ontological status of subjectivity: The missing link between
 663 structure and agency." In *Contributions to social ontology*, edited by C.
 664 Lawson, J Latsis and N Martins, 17-31. Routledge.
- 665 Barkoukis, V., Koidou, E., and Tsorbatzoudis, H. 2010. Effects of a motivational
 666 climate intervention on state anxiety, self-efficacy, and skill development in
 667 physical education. *European Journal of Sport Science*, 10, 167-177.
 668 doi:10.1080/17461390903426634

- 669 Bartholomew, K., Ntoumanis, N., Ryan, R., Bosch, J., and Thøgersen-Ntoumani, C.
 670 2011. Self-determination theory and diminished functioning. *Personality and*
 671 *Social Psychology Bulletin*, 37, 1459-1473. doi:10.1177/0146167211413125
- 672 Biddle, S., Mutrie, N., and Gorely, T. 2015. *Psychology of Physical Activity* (3rd ed.).
 673 London, UK: Routledge. ISBN: 9780415518185
- 674 Braun, V., and Clarke, V. 2006. "Using thematic analysis in psychology." *Qualitative*
 675 *Research in Psychology* 3 (2):77-101. doi: 10.1191/1478088706qp063oa.
- 676 Braun, V., & Clarke, V. 2013. *Successful qualitative research: A practical guide for*
 677 *beginners*. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- 678 Braun, V., and Clarke V. 2019. Reflecting on reflexive thematic analysis. *Qualitative*
 679 *Research in Sport, Exercise and Health*. 11(4), 589-597
 680 doi:10.1080/2159676X.2019.1628806
- 681 Camacho-Minano, M., LaVoi, N., and Barr-Anderson, D. 2011. Interventions to
 682 promote physical activity among young and adolescent girls: A systematic
 683 review. *Health Education Research*, 26, 1025-1049. doi:10.1093/her/cyr040
- 684 Cecchini, J., Fernandez-Rio, J., Mendez-Gimenez, A., Cecchini, C., and Martins, L.
 685 2014. Epstein's TARGET framework and motivational climate in sport: Effects
 686 of a field-based, long-term intervention program. *International Journal of Sports*
 687 *Science & Coaching*, 9, 1325-1340. doi:10.1260/1747-9541.9.6.1325
- 688 Cheon, S., Reeve, J., Lee, Y., Ntoumanis, N., Gillet, N., Kim, B., and Song, Y. 2018.
 689 Expanding autonomy psychological need states from two (satisfaction,
 690 frustration) to three (dissatisfaction): A classroom-based intervention
 691 study. *Journal of Educational Psychology*. 111, 4, 685–702
 692 doi:10.1037/edu0000306

- 693 Coen, S. E., Mitchell, C. A., Tillmann, S., and Gilliland, J.A. 2019. "I like the
 694 "outernet" stuff:' girls' perspectives on physical activity and their
 695 environments." *Qualitative Research in Sport, Exercise and Health* 11 (5):599-
 696 617. doi: 10.1080/2159676X.2018.1561500.
- 697 Cooky, C., Begovic, M., Sabo, D., Oglesby, C. A., and Snyder, M. 2016. "Gender and
 698 sport participation in Montenegro." *International Review for the Sociology of*
 699 *Sport* 51 (8):917-39. doi: 10.1177/1012690214559109.
- 700 Edwards, L. C., Tyler, R., Blain, D., Bryant, A., Canham, N., Carter-Davies, L., Clark,
 701 C., et al. 2018. "Results From Wales' 2018 Report Card on Physical Activity for
 702 Children and Youth." 15 (s2):S430. doi: 10.1123/jpah.2018-0544.
- 703 Edwardson, C. L., D. M. Harrington, T. Yates, D. H. Bodicoat, K. Khunti, T. Gorely, L.
 704 B. Sherar, et al. 2015. "A cluster randomised controlled trial to investigate the
 705 effectiveness and cost effectiveness of the 'Girls Active' intervention: a study
 706 protocol." *BMC Public Health* 15 (1):526. doi: 10.1186/s12889-015-1886-z.
- 707 Elliott, S., Bevan, N., and Litchfield, C. 2019. "Parents, girls' and Australian football: a
 708 constructivist grounded theory for attracting and retaining participation."
 709 *Qualitative Research in Sport, Exercise and Health*:1-22. doi:
 710 10.1080/2159676X.2019.1602560.
- 711 Enright, E., and O'Sullivan, M.2010. 'Can I do it in my pyjamas?' negotiating a
 712 physical education curriculum with teenage girls. *European Physical Education*
 713 *Review* 16, 3, 203-222. doi:10.1177/1356336X10382967
- 714 Epstein, J. 1987. *TARGET: An Examination of Parallel School and Family Structures*
 715 *that Promote Student Motivation and Achievement*. Center for Research on

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

- 716 Elementary and Middle Schools, Baltimore, MD. Retrieved from
717 <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED291504>
- 718 Fissette, J. L. 2013. 'Are you listening?': Adolescent girls voice how they negotiate self-
719 identified barriers to their success and survival in physical education. *Physical*
720 *Education and Sport Pedagogy*, 18(2), 184-203.
721 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17408989.2011.649724>
- 722 Fletcher, A. J. 2017. "Applying critical realism in qualitative research: methodology
723 meets method." *International journal of social research methodology* 20
724 (2):181-94. doi: 10.1080/13645579.2016.1144401.
- 725 Gill, D. L., Williams, L., and Reifsteck, E. J. 2017. *Psychological dynamics of sport and*
726 *exercise*. (4th ed.). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics Publishers.
727 ISBN:9781450484664
- 728 Harwood, C., Keegan, R., Smith, J., and Raine, A. 2015. A systematic review of the
729 intrapersonal correlates of motivational climate perceptions in sport and physical
730 activity. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 18, 9-25.
731 doi:10.1016/j.psychsport.2014.11.005
- 732 Heary, C.M., and Hennessy, E. 2002. "The Use of Focus Group Interviews in Pediatric
733 Health Care Research." *Journal of Pediatric Psychology* 27 (1):47-57. doi:
734 10.1093/jpepsy/27.1.47.
- 735 Hughes, A.R., Johnstone, A., Bardid, F., and Reilly, J.J. 2018. "Results from Scotland's
736 2018 Report Card on Physical Activity for Children and Youth." 15 (s2):S402.
737 doi: 10.1123/jpah.2018-0516.
- 738 Jago, R., Brockman, R., Fox, K R., Cartwright, K., Paige, A S., and Thompson J L.
739 2009. Friendship groups and physical activity: Qualitative findings on how

- 740 physical activity is initiated and maintained among 10–11 year old
 741 children. *International Journal of Behavioral Nutrition and Physical Activity*, 6,
 742 1, 4. doi:10.1186/1479-5868-6-4
- 743 Janssen, I., and LeBlanc, A. 2010. Systematic review of the health benefits of physical
 744 activity and fitness in school-aged children and youth. *International Journal of*
 745 *Behavioral Nutrition and Physical Activity*, 7, 40. doi:10.1186/1479-5868-7-40
- 746 Jõesaar, H., and Hein, V. 2014. How perceived autonomy support from adults and peer
 747 motivational climate are related with self-determined motivation among young
 748 athletes. *International Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology*, 13, 193-204.
 749 doi:10.1080/1612197x.2014.947304
- 750 Jõesaar, H., Hein, V., and Hagger, M. 2012. Youth athletes' perception of autonomy
 751 support from the coach, peer motivational climate and intrinsic motivation in
 752 sport setting: One-year effects. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 13, 257-262.
 753 doi:10.1016/j.psychsport.2011.12.001
- 754 Liukkonen, J., Barkoukis, V., Watt, A., and Jaakkola, T. 2010. Motivational climate and
 755 students' emotional experiences and effort in physical education. *The Journal of*
 756 *Educational Research*, 103, 295-308. doi:10.1080/00220670903383044
- 757 Maxwell, J.A. . 2012. *A Realist Approach for Qualitative Research*. London: Sage
- 758 Maxwell, J.A. 2017. "The validity and reliability of research: A realist perspective." In
 759 *The BERA/SAGE Handbook of Educational Research*, edited by D. Wyse, L.E.
 760 Suter, E. Smith and N. Selwyn, pp.116-40. London: Sage.
- 761 Metcalfe, S. 2018. "Adolescent constructions of gendered identities: the role of sport
 762 and (physical) education." *Sport, Education and Society* 23 (7):681-93. doi:
 763 10.1080/13573322.2018.1493574.

764

765 Mitchell, F., Gray, S., and Inchley, J. 2015. "This choice thing really works?...?"

766 changes in experiences and engagement of adolescent girls in physical education

767 classes, during a school-based physical activity programme. *Physical Education*

768 *and Sport Pedagogy*, 20:6, 593-611. doi:10.1080/17408989.2013.837433

769 Morgan, K. 2017. Reconceptualizing motivational climate in physical education and

770 sport coaching: An interdisciplinary perspective. *Quest*, 69, 95-112.

771 doi:10.1080/00336297.2016.1152984

772 Ntoumanis, N., Taylor, I., and Thøgersen-Ntoumani, C. 2012. A longitudinal

773 examination of coach and peer motivational climates in youth sport:

774 Implications for moral attitudes, well-being, and behavioral

775 investment. *Developmental Psychology*, 48, 213-223. doi:10.1037/a0024934

776 Ronkainen, Noora J., and Gareth Wiltshire. 2019. "Rethinking validity in qualitative

777 sport and exercise psychology research: a realist perspective." *International*

778 *Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology*:1-16. doi:

779 10.1080/1612197X.2019.1637363.

780 Ryba, Tatiana V., Gareth Wiltshire, Julian North, and Noora J. Ronkainen. 2020.

781 "Developing mixed methods research in sport and exercise psychology:

782 potential contributions of a critical realist perspective." *International Journal of*

783 *Sport and Exercise Psychology*:1-21. doi: 10.1080/1612197X.2020.1827002.

784 Schranz, N., Glennon, V., Evans, J., Gomersall, S., Hardy, L., Hesketh, K.D., Lubans,

785 D., et al. 2018. "Results from Australia's 2018 Report Card on Physical Activity

786 for Children and Youth." 15 (s2):S315. doi: 10.1123/jpah.2018-0418.

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

- 787 Sherar, L.B., Elisger, D.W., Baxter-Jones, A.D.G., & Tremblay, M.S. 2007. "Age and
788 Gender Differences in Youth Physical Activity: Does Physical Maturity
789 Matter?" *Medicine & Science in Sports & Exercise* 39 (5):830-5. doi:
790 10.1249/mss.0b013e3180335c3c.
- 791 Slater, A., and Tiggemann, M. 2010. Gender differences in adolescent sport
792 participation, teasing, self-objectification and body image concerns. *Journal of*
793 *Adolescence*, 34(3), 455-463. doi:10.1016/j.adolescence.2010.06.007
- 794 Smith, J. K. 1984. The problem of criteria for judging interpretative inquiry. *Education*
795 *Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 6, 379–391.
- 796 Smith, B., and Sparkes. A.C. 2014. *Qualitative Research Methods in Sport, Exercise*
797 *and Health : From Process to Product*. London, UNITED KINGDOM: Taylor
798 & Francis Group.
- 799 Smith, B., and McGannon, K. 2018. Developing rigor in qualitative research: Problems
800 and opportunities within sport and exercise psychology. *International Review of*
801 *Sport and Exercise Psychology*, 11, 101-121.
802 doi:10.1080/1750984x.2017.1317357
- 803 Somerset, Sarah, and Derek J. Hoare. 2018. "Barriers to voluntary participation in sport
804 for children: a systematic review." *BMC Pediatrics* 18 (1):47. doi:
805 10.1186/s12887-018-1014-1.
- 806 Sport England. 2016. "Sport England: Towards an Active Nation Strategy 2016-2021."
807 In. London: Sport England. Available
808 from [https://www.sportengland.org/media/10629/sport-england-towards-an-](https://www.sportengland.org/media/10629/sport-england-towards-an-active-nation.pdf)
809 [active-nation.pdf](https://www.sportengland.org/media/10629/sport-england-towards-an-active-nation.pdf). Accessed 28th July 2020.

- 810 Standage, M., Duda, J., and Ntoumanis, N. 2003. A model of contextual motivation in
 811 physical education: Using constructs from self-determination and achievement goal
 812 theories to predict physical activity intentions. *Journal of Educational Psychology*,
 813 95(1), 97-110. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0022-0663.95.1.97>
- 814 Standage, M., Duda, J., and Ntoumanis, N. 2006. Students' Motivational Processes and
 815 Their Relationship to Teacher Ratings in School Physical Education: A Self-
 816 Determination Theory Approach. *Research quarterly for exercise and sport*. 77.
 817 100-110 doi:10.1080/02701367.2006.10599336
- 818 Standage, M., Treasure, D., Hooper, K., and Kuczka, K. 2007. Self-handicapping in
 819 school physical education: The influence of the motivational climate. *British*
 820 *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 77, 81-99. doi:10.1348/000709906x103636
- 821 Standage, M., Sherar, L., Curran, T., Wilkie, H.J., Jago, R., Davis, A., and Foster, C.
 822 2018. "Results From England's 2018 Report Card on Physical Activity for
 823 Children and Youth." 15 (s2):S347. doi: 10.1123/jpah.2018-0537.
- 824 Telama, R., Yang, X. L., Hirvensalo, M., and Raitakari, O. 2006. Participation in
 825 organized youth sport as a predictor of adult physical activity: A 21-year
 826 longitudinal study. *Pediatric Exercise Science*, 18(1), 76-88.
 827 doi:10.1123/pes.18.1.76
- 828 Townsend, N., Wickramasinghe, K., and Williams, J. 2015. *Physical Activity Statistics*
 829 2015. British Heart Foundation, UK. Retrieved 02/03/2018 from
 830 [https://www.bhf.org.uk/-/media/files/.../bhf_physical-activity-statistics-](https://www.bhf.org.uk/-/media/files/.../bhf_physical-activity-statistics-2015feb.pdf)
 831 [2015feb.pdf](https://www.bhf.org.uk/-/media/files/.../bhf_physical-activity-statistics-2015feb.pdf)
- 832 Tracy, S. 2010. Qualitative quality: Eight "Big-Tent" criteria for excellent qualitative
 833 research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16, 837-851. doi:10.1177/1077800410383121

- 834 van Bree, R.J.H., van Stralen, M.M., Bolman, C., Mudde, A.N., de Vries, H., and
 835 Lechner, L. Habit as moderator of the intention–physical activity relationship in
 836 older adults: A longitudinal study. 2013. *Psychology & Health*, 28(5), 514-533.
 837 doi:10.1080/08870446.2012.749476
- 838 Vazou, S., Ntoumanis, N., and Duda, J. 2006. Predicting young athletes' motivational
 839 indices as a function of their perceptions of the coach- and peer-created
 840 climate. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 7, 215-233.
 841 doi:10.1016/j.psychsport.2005.08.007
- 842 Vazou, S., Ntoumanis, N., and Duda, J. 2005. Peer motivational climate in youth sport:
 843 A qualitative inquiry. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 6, 497-516.
 844 doi:10.1016/j.psychsport.2004.03.005
- 845 Voelker, D., Reel, J., and Greenleaf, C. 2015. Weight status and body image
 846 perceptions in adolescents: Current perspectives. *Adolescent Health, Medicine
 847 and Therapeutics*, 6, 149-158. doi:10.2147/ahmt.s68344
- 848 Wang, C., Chatzisarantis, N., Spray, C., and Biddle, S. 2002. Achievement goal profiles
 849 in school physical education: Differences in self-determination, sport ability
 850 beliefs, and physical activity. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 72,
 851 433-445. doi:10.1348/000709902320634401
- 852 Warburton, D., and Bredin, S. 2017. Health benefits of physical activity. *Current
 853 Opinion in Cardiology*, 32, 541-556. doi:10.1097/hco.0000000000000437
- 854 Warburton, V. 2017. Peer and teacher influences on the motivational climate in physical
 855 education: A longitudinal perspective on achievement goal
 856 adoption. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 51, 303-314.
 857 doi:10.1016/j.cedpsych.2017.08.001

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

- 858 Wetton, A., Radley, R., Jones, A., and Pearce, M. 2013. What are the barriers which
859 discourage 15-16 year-old girls from participating in team sports and how can
860 we overcome them?. *BioMed Research International*, 2013, 1-8.
861 doi:10.1155/2013/738705
- 862 Whitehead, S., and Biddle, S. 2008. Adolescent girls' perceptions of physical activity: A
863 focus group study. *European Physical Education Review*, 14, 243-262.
864 doi:10.1177/1356336x08090708
- 865 Wiltshire, Gareth. 2018. "A case for critical realism in the pursuit of interdisciplinarity
866 and impact." *Qualitative Research in Sport, Exercise and Health* 10 (5):525-42.
867 doi: 10.1080/2159676X.2018.1467482.
- 868 World Health Organisation. 2016. Physical activity guidelines. Retrieved from
869 <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/physical-activity>
- 870 World Health Organisation. 2011. | New physical activity guidance can help reduce risk
871 of breast, colon cancers. Retrieved from
872 http://www.who.int/mediacentre/news/notes/2011/world_cancer_day_20110204
873 [/en/](#)
- 874 Zembura, P., Goldys, A., and Nalecz. H. 2016. "Results From Poland's 2016 Report
875 Card on Physical Activity for Children and Youth." 13 (s2):S237. doi:
876 10.1123/jpah.2016-0386.
- 877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

887 Table 1
888 Summary of school characteristics

School	Type*	Age Range	Pupils in School	Eligible FSM (%)**	National Inspection (Ofsted) Effectiveness Grading***
1 (Study one and Study two)	Academy Converter	11-18	1488	8.1	Outstanding
2	Foundation School	11-18	1209	10.5	Good
3	Academy Converter	11-18	1963	4.2	Outstanding
4	Foundation School	11-18	759	10.5	Good

889

890 *For further information on school type see

891 <http://www.education.gov.uk/edubase/glossary.xhtml>.

892 **FSM=Percentage of pupils in school eligible for and claiming free school meals, also
893 see edubase glossary

894 ***Ofsted is a non-ministerial department of the UK government that inspects and
895 regulates schools' effectiveness, see

896 <https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/ofsted>

897

898

899

900

901

902

903

904

905

906

907

908

909

910

911

912

913

914

915

916

917

918

919

920

ENGAGING GIRLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

921 Table 2
922 Themes from study 1 and study 2

Study	Higher order theme	Description	Lower order theme
Study One	The individual in their social context	Participants’ discussed how a number of aspects of their PE social environment influenced their engagement in PE lessons; where participants felt they were being watched and observed they would engage less especially where they felt less confident in the sport. They also discussed the influence of the type of environment that teachers create which effects their engagement levels in PE lessons for example, not putting people with their friends and having a lack of structure to the lesson.	Being watched The role of teachers Relationships with peers The role of gender
	Interest in personal growth	Participants discussed how their knowledge and opportunity to increase their knowledge effected their engagement levels within PE; where participants had good knowledge of rules or tactics for example, they would engage more. Participants also discussed how the variety of ability in a group decreased the amount they engaged in their PE lessons.	Learning and knowledge Ability
	What’s on offer?	Participants discussed how what was on offer in terms of activities effected the extent to which they enjoyed taking part in PE lessons. They discussed how they enjoyed having a variety of sports/activities and that when they had some choice over what they could do they enjoyed it more and those without choice perceived its provision would make PE enjoyable for them. Participants also discussed that the amount of effort they put it would depend on how much they enjoyed a certain sport/activity.	Variety Effort Choice
Study Two	Perceived self-efficacy	Participants discussed feeling frustrated at people’s lack of effort rather than a lack of ability and that they would feel more enjoyment if everyone just tried their best. This was not restricted to girl’s behaviours but also to boys who did not try hard in PE. They also showed a mixed awareness of how their behaviour might affect how girls feel taking part in PE with boys and what they could do better to help girls overcome	Effort levels Ability Boys perceptions of how girls’ feelings influence participation Importance of enjoyment

<p>Awareness of and level of conformity to gender stereotypes</p>	<p>negative feelings towards taking part in PE with girls. Participants showed a high level of awareness of gender stereotypes and discussed several sports that they described as either girls or boys, or gender-neutral sports. They also discussed throughout the focus groups the influence of the media on beliefs surrounding boys and girl's participation in sport.</p>	<p>Media influence Boys' behaviour conforming to stereotypes Boys' behaviour supporting girls in PE Type of sport Family influence PE class organised by gender PE class organised by ability.</p>
<p>Structure of the PE environment</p>	<p>Participants discussed the positives, negatives, enablers and barriers in terms of the structure of PE lessons. They discussed having separate PE lessons for boys and girls and having mixed gender PE lessons.</p>	

923
924