

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/85163> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Akgül Kovankay, B.

Title: Negotiating nature : ecology, politics, and nomadism in the forests of Mediterranean Anatolia, 1870-1920

Issue Date: 2019-12-19

NEGOTIATING NATURE:
ECOLOGY, POLITICS, AND NOMADISM IN THE FORESTS OF
MEDITERRANEAN ANATOLIA, 1870-1920

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus Prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 19 december 2019
klokke 10:00 uur

door

Başak Akgül Kovankaya

geboren te Istanbul 1982

Promotores: Prof. Dr. Leo Lucassen
Prof. Dr. Nadir Özbek (Bogaziçi University, Istanbul)

Promotiecommissie: Prof. Dr. Catia Antunes
Prof. Dr. Erik-Jan Zürcher
Prof. Dr. Ulbe Bosma (Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam)
Dr. Pepijn Brandon (Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam)

Abstract

Negotiating Nature: Ecology, Politics, and Nomadism
in the Forests of Mediterranean Anatolia, 1870-1920

Başak Akgül Kovankaya, Doctoral Candidate
at the Atatürk Institute for Modern Turkish History at Boğaziçi University
and the Institute for History at Leiden University, 2019

Professors Nadir Özbek and Leo Lucassen, Dissertation Advisors

This dissertation examines the politics of forestry in the context of late Ottoman Mediterranean Anatolia. Exploring the power struggles among forest officials, timber traders, and Tahtacı communities, this study discusses how modern forestry practices were negotiated at the local level. In the nineteenth century, in order to gain more effective control over forests, the Ottoman government introduced a series of reforms in the name of “scientific forestry.” In the implementation of these reforms not only did opposing interests clash at the central level but local interest groups involved in regional trade networks also appeared as influential actors. On the one hand, negotiations between officials and traders undermined “scientific forestry” as a high modernist ideal. On the other hand, this complex network constituted an integral part of Ottoman modern forestry practices and prevailing power struggles. Despite fragmented interests within the administration as well as various obstacles officials encountered in monitoring forests, the new forestry practices brought about a dramatic transformation of the countryside. Most importantly, increasing pressure on forests and forest-dependent communities due to intensified commercialization caused an overexploitation of nature and labor. Focusing on the changing subsistence strategies of Tahtacı communities in the Taurus Mountains, this study investigates the impact of these changes on the hill societies of Mediterranean Anatolia.

To my daughter Ayşe

Table of Contents

List of Tables	<i>xvii</i>
List of Figures	<i>vxii</i>
List of Maps	<i>xvii</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>xviii</i>
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Narratives on the Tahtacı Communities	7
1.2 An Alternative Tool: Subsistence Strategies	15
1.3 Context: Ecology, Economy, and Politics	22
1.4 Central Questions and Main Arguments	33
1.5 Sources	36
1.6 Structure of the Dissertation	38
2 A LONG-TERM HISTORY OF THE SUBSISTENCE STRATEGIES IN THE TAURUS MOUNTAINS	41
2.1 From Nomadism to Permanent Settlement	43
2.2 The Ecological Niche and the Population Distribution of Tahtacı Communities	51
2.3 Concluding Remarks	54
3 STRUGGLES OVER FOREST LANDS AND PRODUCTS BEFORE THE BUREAUCRATIZATION OF FOREST MANAGEMENT	57
3.1 Utilization of Forests	58
3.2 Intensification of Commercial Forestry in the Eastern Mediterranean Region	68
3.3 Concluding Remarks	80

4	SCIENTIFICATION OF FORESTRY: LAWS, INSTITUTIONS, & DISCOURSE	83
4.1	Initial Attempts Toward a “Rational” Forestry: Bureaucratization of Forest Management	85
4.2	Codification of Forest Laws: New Forms of Taxation, Crime and Punishment	93
4.3	Forestry Reforms in the Context of a Nationalizing Economy	101
4.4	Deforestation as a Founding Narrative of the Struggle Against “Zones of Anomaly”	104
4.5	Concluding Remarks	112
5	THE AMBIVALENCE OF “PUBLIC ORDER”: THE OTTOMAN FORESTRY REGIME IN PRACTICE, 1870-1918	115
5.1	Limited Technical Capacity of the Government	119
5.2	Relations Between the Timber Merchants and the Forest Officials	132
5.3	The Teke Forests Case: An Example of Struggle for Natural Resources at the Local Level	142
5.4	Concluding Remarks	155
6	BEING A FOREST LABORER IN LATE OTTOMAN MEDITERRANEAN ANATOLIA	157
6.1	Lumbering as a Labor-Intensive Work	159
6.2	Impact of the New Forestry on Forest-Dependent Communities	162
6.3	Beyond Resistance and Compliance: New Adaptation Strategies of the Tahtacıs	174
6.4	Concluding Remarks	195
7	CONCLUSION	197
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	203
	CURRICULUM VITAE	225
	SAMMENSVATTING	226

List of Tables

- Table 5.1 Forest area, amount of timber obtained from the forests, forest revenues, and expenditures on provincial basis in 1897 134
- Table 6.1 List of felling licenses obtained by a group of Tahtacı in Mut on 30 May 1909 173
- Table 6.2 *Temettuat* registers of the Tahtacı community settled in Yarangüme village in Tavas, Menteşe in the province of Aydın, 1845 188

List of Figures

- Figure 1.1 Illustration of a “typical” Tahtacı skull made by Felix von Luschan, 1891 7
- Figure 1.2 A Tahtacı man in Luschan’s study published in 1884 9
- Figure 3.1 Illustration of Antalya Pier, 1808 74

List of Maps

- Map 1.1 Major Mountains in the Mediterranean Anatolia 6
- Map 5.1 Major Administrative Units in the Taurus Region 121

Acknowledgements

This dissertation would not have been possible without the support of many people and institutions. First, I would like to express my gratitude to my advisors Nadir Özbek and Leo Lucassen for their guidance and encouragement throughout my efforts in writing this dissertation. I greatly benefited from their critical input and theoretical insights. I am equally thankful to Egemen Yılgür for his illuminating feedback on an early draft of this study. I also appreciate Fatmagül Demirel, my master's thesis advisor, for her constant support, both academically and morally.

I would like to thank TÜBİTAK (the Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey) and AKMED (the Suna & İnan Kıraç Research Center for Mediterranean Civilizations at Koç University) for their generous financial support that made this study possible. I also thank the staffs of the Prime Ministry Ottoman Archives, the National Archives of the United Kingdom, Leiden University Library, Boğaziçi University Library, Atatürk Library, and the Center for Islamic Studies Library for their help during my research. I am also indebted to Kadriye Tamtekin, Dilek Tecirli, Leyla Kılıç, and the late Necla Turunç, the administrative staff of the Atatürk Institute, for always being kind and helpful to me.

I am also grateful to countless people who welcomed me during my field research in Mersin, Antalya, and Aydın. I especially thank the Akgün, Çelen, Özcan, Çatal, Ergül, Göz, Kaçar, and Kırmızıgül families. Without their contributions, this study could not have been completed. I would also like to thank Ali Özkan for hosting me in Aydın and Ali Aksüt for his help during my fieldwork in Antalya and his generosity in sharing his vast knowledge.

A number of friends deserve special thanks. I owe Seda Fidanboy, Saadet Ersungur, Burcu Kasapoğlu, Emrah Çınar, Filiz Demircan, Ayşe Alnıaçık, Saim Eroğlu, Alpkan Birelma, Vesile Çetin, Özlem Yılmaz, Zeynep Bursa, Özkan Akpınar, Fatma Damak, Esra Derya Dilek, Gülseren Duman, Ali Sipahi, Özlem Dilber, Yener Koç, Ceren Deniz, Zehra Ayman, Seda Özdemir, Önder Uçar, Ozan Gürlek, Çiğdem Oğuz, Uğur Bayraktar, Selda Şen, and Tuğçe Tezer a debt of gratitude for their moral support in different phases of this research.

Lastly, I especially thank my parents Münevver and Samaddin Akgül and my grandmother Sultan Gökteş for their support not only throughout the challenging stages of this study but whenever I need it. I express my deepest gratitude to my partner, Emre, who always gave me unconditional support. I am thankful for his love, encouragement, understanding, and humor. And I owe special thanks to my daughter Ayşe for the meaning, hope, and joy she has brought to my life. I am dedicating this dissertation to her.