1	Covid-19 Rapid Report: Contact tracing for SARS-CoV-2: what can be						
2	learned from other conditions?						
3							
4	James Brown, <sup>1</sup> Kyle Ring, <sup>2</sup> Jacqui White, <sup>3</sup> Nicola E Mackie, <sup>2</sup> Ibrahim Abubakar, <sup>4</sup> Marc						
5	Lipman <sup>1,5</sup>						
6							
7	1. Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, London						
8	2. Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust, London						
9	3. Whittington Health, London						
10	4. Institute of Global Health, University College London						
11	5. UCL Respiratory, Division of Medicine, University College London						
12							
13	Correspondence to:						
14	Professor Marc Lipman						
15							
16	Respiratory Medicine, Royal Free Hospital, Pond Street, London NW3 2QG						
17	Email: marclipman@nhs.net						
18							
19							
20	Word count: 2253 words						
21							
22	References: 26						
23							
24 25	Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflicts of interest exist	_					
25 26	Contributions: All authors contributed to the drafting and final submission of this opinior	1					
26 27	article.						
27							
28							

### 29 Contact tracing for SARS-CoV-2: what can be learned from other

30 conditions?

31

#### 32 Abstract

33

Contact tracing is central to the public health response to COVID-19, but the approach taken has received criticism for failing to make enough of an impact on disease transmission. We discuss what can be learned from contact tracing in other infections, and how the natural history of COVID-19 should shape the strategies used.

38

#### 39 Introduction

40

41 Effective contact tracing is now central to the strategy to enable the UK to continue economic and social activities in the face of SARS-CoV-2 transmission and COVID-19 42 43 disease. The development and approval in the UK of effective vaccines that use different 44 approaches to generate protective immune responses raises hope for control of the 45 pandemic. However, until these vaccines are rolled-out to the country as a whole, contact 46 tracing and prompt isolation of potentially infectious individuals may be the best way to avoid 47 stringent curbs on normal life - particularly as the economic consequences of restrictions 48 bite, and if public and political support wanes. Although the development of effective 49 vaccines for SARS-CoV-2 raises hope that the pandemic can be controlled, it is unlikely that 50 immunisation will lead to disease eradication in the short-medium term and contact tracing 51 will remain a key component of infection control. Furthermore, the rapid spread of a new 52 B1.1.7 SARS CoV-2 variant in the UK, which from first detection in September 2020 has circulated widely three months' later,<sup>1</sup> and has driven a second-wave of infection starting in 53 54 the South of England, demonstrates the importance of maintaining robust public health 55 systems to control viral transmission. 56

57 Contact tracing is routinely used in the management of some infections transmitted from 58 person to person where mechanisms exist to identify infected contacts and there are 59 interventions to reduce onward transmission. This has been a successful control strategy in 60 conditions as diverse as hepatitis C and tuberculosis (TB).<sup>2,3</sup> Can lessons learnt from these 61 diseases apply to COVID-19? Here, using the examples of the approaches used in sexually 62 transmitted infections (STIs) and TB we highlight what may help control COVID-19. 63

#### 64 Sexual Health Services

65

66 Sexual Health services utilise the skills of doctors, specialist nurses and health advisors to 67 ensure that contact tracing is undertaken for all common STIs, and HIV infection. Depending 68 on patient preference, it can be anonymous and use physical contact slips, or texting/e-mail 69 via systems such as SXT.org.uk. Clinicians have been creative with how this is provided. 70 employing social media and geo-locational dating apps as a means of contact. Given the 71 stigma around sexual infections and HIV, health care professionals ensure that clear 72 information and careful explanation are provided to the potentially infected contact to stop 73 further onward transmission with minimal distress. 74

Whilst Sexual Health services have had considerable success in reducing STIs generally, there remain higher rates of infection in specific populations, such as Black Caribbeans, which underlines the challenges in reaching those who may be at greatest risk.<sup>4</sup> Conversely, Hepatitis C infection has been reduced through an effective micro-elimination strategy in HIV positive men who have sex with men, and in those with less access to care such as the homeless and people with substance dependence problems.<sup>2</sup>

81

#### 82 Tuberculosis

83

84 In TB services, contact tracing utilises a network of highly experienced specialist nurses and 85 support workers. Household contacts of cases of pulmonary or laryngeal TB are contacted, asked about symptoms of TB disease, and offered testing for latent TB infection. Extended 86 87 testing and tracing (for instance in schools or workplaces) may be undertaken where there is concern about possible transmission. This is achieved by a multidisciplinary team including 88 89 specialist nurses, doctors, public health officials and community support workers. The 90 identification and testing of contacts relies on the personal relationship and trust that TB 91 service users have in these individuals - an essential requirement where people may feel 92 that their medical details could be disclosed to others to benefit public health. Case 93 management and contact tracing is overseen by a system of "cohort review" (involving 94 Public Health and TB services) of all cases of TB disease and their possibly-infected 95 contacts. This allows regular, open evaluation of its effectiveness, and opportunities for 96 national improvement and uptake. Experienced health professionals work closely with a 97 specialist laboratory network to utilise mycobacterial whole-genome sequencing (WGS) to 98 help identify chains of transmission (identified by closely related TB isolates) using detailed molecular epidemiology.<sup>5</sup> Similar approaches have yielded important information on 99 100 outbreak clusters and routes of transmission for SARS-CoV-2.6,7

101

## How does SARS-CoV-2 differ from other infections where contact tracing is used, and why does this matter?

104

105 Similarities and differences exist between SARS-CoV-2 and other infections (Table). 106 Disease natural history determines the speed of the response required to prevent on-going 107 transmission. For TB and some sexually transmitted infections including syphilis and blood-108 borne viruses such as Hepatitis C, there is a relatively long timeframe (often weeks to 109 months) between infection acquisition and risk of transmission to others through disease onset. This provides greater opportunity for contact tracing and intervention.<sup>8</sup> However, as 110 individuals can transmit SARS-CoV-2 when asymptomatic,<sup>9</sup> effective contact tracing must be 111 112 performed promptly to avoid a much larger network of potentially secondarily-infected contacts at risk of COVID-19 needing identification and assessment. The increased 113 114 transmissibility of the B1.1.7 SARS CoV-2 variant in the UK has raised the bar further for 115 contact tracing services who now encounter large numbers of individuals infected from a 116 single source – all of whom need their own management and assessment for secondary 117 cases. 118

- It is also worth considering what constitutes a "contact"? Sexual contact is usually easily defined, but a century or more of research is still trying to determine how much exposure to TB disease is required to make contact tracing of value.<sup>10</sup> For SARS-CoV-2 the length and type of contact necessary for transmission is even less certain, although evidence from other airborne viruses such as influenza may be informative.<sup>11</sup> What is clear is that exposure can be brief, such that a general definition of a contact is someone who has spent more than 15 minutes at a distance of less than 2 metres from a case of COVID-19.<sup>12</sup>
- 126

#### 127 Contact tracing for SARS-CoV-2

128

The aim of contact tracing is to identify social and household contacts exposed to, and
possibly infected with, SARS-CoV-2, and get them to self-isolate. The success of systematic
contact tracing as part of the response to SARS in 2003 encouraged its use in managing
COVID-19.<sup>13</sup> It has been incorporated within several countries' national public health
strategies who achieved prompt SARS-CoV-2 outbreak control, including Singapore, Taiwan
and Vietnam. <sup>14-16</sup>

135

136 What about the UK? After a 10 week pause when the country was in the first national

- 137 lockdown, contact tracing re-commenced on the 28<sup>th</sup> May 2020 to be delivered by a large,
- 138 new workforce, with considerable private sector input, in particular in England. This was

initially set up to operate separately from existing NHS and Local Authority systems.<sup>17</sup> The
procedure is as follows: if someone tests positive for SARS-CoV-2, they are asked to share
details of their close contacts, who are then instructed to self-isolate. This is performed
mainly by telephone and conducted by staff not necessarily clinically-trained.

143

144 The challenges facing the NHS Test and Trace Service are significant: firstly, most cases of 145 COVID-19 are not coming to the attention of the healthcare system at all, as highlighted by 146 the discrepancy between the estimated number of cases from the population-based ONS 147 survey and reported numbers of cases from Test and Trace, for instance for the week between 15-21<sup>st</sup> November.<sup>18</sup> ONS estimated that there were 633.000 cases in England. 148 whereas only 152,660 cases were reported by Test and Trace for the similar period of 12-149 150 18<sup>th</sup> November 2020.<sup>19</sup> Once cases of COVID-19 are identified and details transferred for 151 contact tracing there are also significant losses – in the week of 12-18<sup>th</sup> November only 85% 152 of individuals with COVID-19 referred to Test and Trace were contacted, and of the contacts 153 identified 60% were then reached and instructed to self-isolate.<sup>15</sup> This compares poorly with, 154 for instance, contact tracing for TB, where 91% assessed for contact tracing in London at 155 least one contact, 86% of whom were then evaluated for active or latent TB.<sup>3</sup> Evidence 156 provided to the government's SAGE committee in September described the impact of 157 contact tracing on the transmission of COVID-19 as "marginal".<sup>21</sup>

158

159 The National Audit Office report that reviewed the English NHS Test and Trace Service up to 160 October 2020 concluded that the Government had achieved an admirable scale-up of tracing 161 capacity over a short time, though it had not reached its stated aim of providing results within 162 24 hours for tests carried out in person in the community (Pillar 2 tests). There was a lack of 163 a clear strategy to enable local and national tracing teams to work together effectively; and 164 the basis for its delivery model was unclear, with a risk of limited accountability and poor value for money.<sup>21</sup> The report is the first of two, with the second one (due in spring 2021) 165 166 providing a more detailed economic assessment of the service.

167

168 As, unlike TB or some Sexually Transmitted infections, there is no current treatment that can 169 prevent COVID-19 disease after exposure, effective self-isolation is essential to avoid the 170 risk of onward transmission. How likely are people to adhere to instructions to do this? 171 Particularly if they do not perceive themselves to be at risk (even when they have 172 symptoms), or feel well, or face threats to their employment if made to stop work? The 173 answer seems to be not much - a recent study by King's College London suggests that less 174 than 11% of people asked to guarantine following being alerted as a contact of a confirmed 175 COVID-19 case complied with the request.<sup>22</sup> Much of this is believed to result from many

- 176 feeling that they cannot afford to stay at home and not work. To mitigate the financial impact
- 177 the Government has introduced a payment scheme for people who need to self-isolate and
- 178 can't work from home.<sup>23</sup> Apart from the instruction to self-isolate, contact tracing for SARS-
- 179 CoV-2 does not provide practical assistance, such as ensuring that essentials such as food
- 180 are considered and supported.
- 181

## 182 Issues with SARS-CoV-2 contact tracing in the UK

183

184 To be successful the UK strategy requires both public trust and widespread acceptance. 185 This will be more easily achieved if built on existing experience. An important, early issue 186 with the Test and Trace strategy in England was the poor linkage of laboratories testing for 187 SARS-CoV-2 to local NHS services and Local Authorities. During an outbreak of cases in 188 Leicester in June 2020 it became clear that "Pillar 2" data – from commercial laboratories 189 processing drive-through tests and home testing of the general public - was not being 190 released to Local Authorities. The upsurge in numbers was only apparent some time later 191 once these data were reviewed. Earlier identification of a local increase in cases could have 192 avoided the "return to lockdown" that was then put in place. Once recognised, attempts 193 have been made to improve the communication between the Test and Trace service and 194 local health protection teams.<sup>24</sup> How this will work when mass population testing using rapid 195 antigen assays is rolled out nationally remains to be seen.<sup>25</sup>

196

#### 197 Is technology the answer?

198 The work involved in running a national contact tracing service is considerable. Technology, 199 seen as crucial to the success of a co-ordinated strategy, is being actively pursued by many 200 countries. In the UK a smartphone app has been introduced. This is less ambitious that that 201 originally proposed; and has been reported to have been downloaded 19 million times (although this is estimated to equate to only 40% of smartphone users).<sup>26</sup> For new 202 203 technology to be effective high population uptake is needed – yet many individuals might 204 prefer human interaction to impersonal instructions from a computer app when it comes to 205 their healthcare decisions.

The reliance on technology could be problematic also as people most at risk of COVID-19 –
elders, those with comorbidities, ethnic minorities, and economically disadvantaged
communities – may be least able to access the technology. Such groups can also have
concerns about information held in a national database, with significant private-sector input.
Data protection issues that arise from contact tracing have already been raised by the

- 211 Information Commissioners Office. This has been a problem in other countries such as
- 212 Korea, where privacy concerns were highlighted, particularly for the LGBT community, by
- tracing and testing of attendees of night clubs in Seoul following a cluster of cases.
- Given that Black and ethnic minority populations are at greater risk from COVID-19 disease,
- 215 it is imperative that contact tracing also involves culturally-sensitive strategies to ensure that
- 216 it does not become a further barrier to care, and so exacerbate existing health inequalities.
- 217

#### 218 Conclusion

- 219
- 220 The rapid creation of a national contact tracing system for SARS-CoV-2 is to be applauded.
- In the UK, its performance can be expected to improve further as experience grows and
- 222 capacity increases. Useful lessons can be drawn from other infectious diseases: a contact
- tracing system that is better integrated with other services, including health and social care
- (particularly primary care), and effectively utilises established public health services and
- Local Authorities would be more responsive to the needs of local populations. It would also
- be able to offer the user more value from being contact traced than just being instructed to
- self-isolate. This could include providing relevant local information, messaging and support
- 228 (things that appear to improve adherence to self-isolation for COVID-19). The data collected
- needs to be rapidly available to local teams, and the capacity must exist to ensure that
- 230 people most at risk of COVID-19 are both suitably informed and adequately protected.

231

232

## 233 KEY POINTS

234	•	Tracing contacts of cases of COVID-19 is key to on-going control
235	•	Significant experience exists within healthcare services of contact tracing for
236		infectious diseases
237	•	The natural history of COVID-19 requires specific approaches to contact
238		tracing
239	٠	The sheer scale of the problem suggests that without effective technology-
240		support the UK approach may not succeed
241		
242		
243		
244		

# Table: COVID-19, Sexually Transmitted Infections and Tuberculosis, and the approach toUK contact tracing

	Covid-19	Sexually Transmitted	Tuberculosis
	C0VId-19	Infections	TUDEICUIOSIS
	Short incubation, rapid	Varied biology with	Most exposed
Biology of disease	spread, little latency	different infections.	individuals are not
Dibiogy of disease	between infection and	Most transmission by	infected; most
	disease. Most infected	•	infected individuals do
		symptomatic	
	individuals get symptomatic	individuals, but high	not get symptomatic
	disease, asymptomatic individuals can be infectious.	infectivity may be	disease.
		early in disease with	
		minimal symptoms	
		(e.g. primary HIV	
		infection and	
Knowledge of	Noval pathogen renidly	seroconversion)	Long bistory of
Knowledge of disease and	Novel pathogen, rapidly	Conditions well	Long history of
	evolving understanding of	understood, multiple	research into disease,
control measures	pathology and treatment	methods of prevention	transmission and
	options	and treatment	treatments
March and and of		generally available	Daine anile a successful
Mechanism of	Short exposure for infection	Sexual contact	Primarily aerosol.
spread	(minutes). Believed to be		Prolonged (>8 hours)
	primarily droplet spread,		contact required for
	although role of airborne		transmission.
	transmission and		
	contaminated surfaces		
Interventions to	unclear	Identification of cases	Contract tracing
Interventions to	Contact tracing with isolation reduces onward		Contact tracing
prevent		can allow preventative	detects incident
transmission	transmission. No specific	measures (e.g.	disease, & latent
	treatment available to	condoms)	(asymptomatic) infection
	prevent onward	Treatment of	mection
	transmission		Treatment of TD
		conditions prevents	Treatment of TB
		onward transmission	disease and latent TB
		(e.g. use of	cures or prevents
		antiretroviral therapy	disease, and reduces further transmission
Contact tracing	Contact tracing by large	for HIV)	
Contact tracing	Contact tracing by large	Anonymous tracing often used, national	Person-to-person, networks of skilled
approach	workforce (but mostly with less specialist skill-set)		
	. ,	electronic system within NHS	professionals within NHS
	largely independent of NHS public health services		бли
	Public riealur services		

Infrastructure	Newly created structure with significant private sector input	Sexual health services part of health system, although with sensitive data not shared with other health systems	Built within NHS networks
		health systems	

- 247 <u>References</u>
- 248

1.https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_
 data/file/948152/Technical\_Briefing\_VOC202012-2\_Briefing\_2\_FINAL.pdf

251

2. Katzman C, Mateu-Gelabert P, Kapadia SN, et al. Contact tracing for hepatitis C: The
case for novel screening strategies as we strive for viral elimination. The International journal
on drug policy 2019;72:33-39.

- 255
- 3. Cavany SM, Sumner T, Vynnycky E, et al. An evaluation of tuberculosis contact
  investigations against national standards. Thorax 2017;72(8):736-45.
- 4. Mohammed H, Blomquist P, Ogaz D, et al. 100 years of STIs in the UK: a review of national surveillance data. Sexually transmitted infections 2018;94(8):553-58
- 260 5. Lalor MK, Casali N, Walker TM, et al. The use of whole-genome sequencing in cluster
- 261 investigation of a multidrug-resistant tuberculosis outbreak. Eur Respir J 2018;51(6)
- 6. Oude Munnink BB, Nieuwenhuijse DF, Stein M, et al. Rapid SARS-CoV-2 whole-genome
  sequencing and analysis for informed public health decision-making in the Netherlands. Nat
  Med 2020;26(9):1405-10.
- 7. Rockett RJ, Arnott A, Lam C, et al. Revealing COVID-19 transmission in Australia by
  SARS-CoV-2 genome sequencing and agent-based modeling. Nat Med 2020;26(9):1398404
- 8. Behr MA, Edelstein PH, Ramakrishnan L. Revisiting the timetable of tuberculosis. Bmj2018;362:k2738.
- 9. He X, Lau EH, Wu P, et al. Temporal dynamics in viral shedding and transmissibility ofCOVID-19. Nature medicine 2020;26(5):672-75.
- 272 10. Reichler MR, Khan A, Yuan Y, et al. Duration of Exposure Among Close Contacts of
- Patients With Infectious Tuberculosis and Risk of Latent Tuberculosis Infection. ClinicalInfectious Diseases 2020
- 275 11. Hayward AC, Fragaszy EB, Bermingham A, et al. Comparative community burden and
- severity of seasonal and pandemic influenza: results of the Flu Watch cohort study. LancetRespir Med 2014;2(6):445-54.
- 278 12. <u>https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/guidance-for-contacts-of-people-with-</u>
- 279 possible-or-confirmed-coronavirus-covid-19-infection-who-do-not-live-with-the-
- 280 person/guidance-for-contacts-of-people-with-possible-or-confirmed-coronavirus-covid-19 281 infection-who-do-not-live-with-the-person accessed 14 December 2020
- 282 13. Riley S, Fraser C, Donnelly CA, et al. Transmission dynamics of the etiological agent of
- SARS in Hong Kong: impact of public health interventions. Science 2003;300(5627):1961-6.
- 14. Pham TQ, Rabaa M, Duong LH, et al. The first 100 days of SARS-CoV-2 control in
- 285 Vietnam. medRxiv 2020:2020.05.12.20099242.
- 286 15. Pung R, Chiew CJ, Young BE, et al. Investigation of three clusters of COVID-19 in
- 287 Singapore: implications for surveillance and response measures. Lancet
- 288 2020;395(10229):1039-46.
- 289 16. Cheng HY, Jian SW, Liu DP, et al. Contact Tracing Assessment of COVID-19
- 290 Transmission Dynamics in Taiwan and Risk at Different Exposure Periods Before and After
- 291 Symptom Onset. JAMA internal medicine 2020
- 292 17. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/nhs-test-and-trace-statistics-england-28-
- 293 may-to-10-june-2020/experimental-statistics-weekly-nhs-test-and-trace-bulletin-england-28-
- 294 <u>may-to-10-june-2020</u> accessed 14 December 2020

- 295 18.https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/healthandsocialcare/conditionsa 296 nddiseases/bulletins/coronaviruscovid19infectionsurveypilot/26november2020 accessed 14 297 December 2020 298 19.https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/939110/Test\_and\_Trace\_Week25.pdf accessed 14 December 2020 299 300 20. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/summary-of-the-effectiveness-and-harms-301 of-different-non-pharmaceutical-interventions-16-september-2020 accessed 14 December 302 2020 303 21. https://www.nao.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/The-governments-approach-to-testand-trace-in-England-interim-report.pdf accessed 14 December 2020 304 305 22. https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.09.15.20191957v1 accessed 14 306 December 2020 307 23. https://www.citizensadvice.org.uk/benefits/coronavirus-getting-benefits-if-youre-self-308 isolating/ accessed 14 December 2020 309 24. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/nhs-test-and-trace-service-to-strengthen-regional-310 contact-tracing accessed 14 December 2020 311 25. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/community-testing-to-help-lift-restrictions-in-312 highest-tiers accessed 14 Dec 2020 26. https://www.politicshome.com/news/article/nhs-covid19-app-users-downloads-313 314 coronavirus-pandemic-40-80 accessed 14 December 2020
- 315
- 316