

# New Mexico Historical Review

---

Volume 21 | Number 1

Article 3

---

1-1-1946

## The Indian Rights Association and the Navajo, 1890–1895

Alban W. Hoopes

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Hoopes, Alban W.. "The Indian Rights Association and the Navajo, 1890–1895." *New Mexico Historical Review* 21, 1 (1946). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol21/iss1/3>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

THE INDIAN RIGHTS ASSOCIATION  
AND THE NAVAJO, 1890-1895\*

By ALBAN W. HOOPES

By the year 1890 the Indian wars, to all intents and purposes, were memories of the past. With the defeat of the Sioux in the north and of the Apache in the south, it might be said that Indian resistance to white encroachment collapsed utterly. The cessation of strife did not imply a solution of the Indian problem. Far from it. The red man was yet present; the problems of food, land, and education demanded rather more attention—now that peace permitted attention—than before.

The Indian Rights Association was one of a number of philanthropic organizations concerned with Indian affairs. Founded in 1882 by Herbert Welsh, a Philadelphia philanthropist and man of affairs, its membership included men of many shades of opinion drawn from many walks of life. A Philadelphia organization, it drew about one-third of its membership from that city, the remaining two-thirds deriving from every part of the United States. During the period covered by this paper the office was located at 1305 Arch Street, Philadelphia. From that center Mr. Welsh and his associates kept in constant touch with Indian affairs in the field and with congressional and departmental activities in Washington.

Wholly independent of the government, the Indian Rights Association cooperated with the latter, or opposed it, according to its approval or disapproval of governmental policy. An active and capably managed agency was maintained in Washington for the purpose of watching all developments of Indian policy, reporting thereon, and influencing legislation if necessary. During the eighteenthies this strategic post was held by Charles C. Painter<sup>1</sup>

\* Research work in connection with this paper was done under a grant on the Penrose fund of the American Philosophical Society, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

1. Charles C. Painter died, January 13, 1895. William H. Seaman to Herbert Welsh, January 13, 1895, Indian Rights Association correspondence, Historical Society of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. Hereinafter cited as I.R.A. corr. Leupp to Welsh, January 14, 1895, *ibid.*; E. Whittlesey to Welsh, January 14, 1895, *ibid.*

and Francis E. Leupp. The latter in particular proved to be a valuable man. Washington correspondent of the *New York Evening Post*, he had been recommended to Welsh by Theodore Roosevelt,<sup>2</sup> but accepted the Washington agency only after considerable negotiation.<sup>3</sup> His knowledge of Indian affairs was most extensive, being broadened by a number of field trips. He was possessed of more than a little political acumen. The long series of monthly reports made by Painter and Leupp constitute a chapter of unique importance to the student of Indian history.

In summing up, it may be said that the personnel of the Indian Rights Association and its great activity combined to give a weight to its opinions that has not received a just evaluation in historical studies. It is hoped that a review of one phase of its work may lead to further investigation along a line that seems most promising.

## II

Commenting upon conditions among the Navajo during the early months of 1894, Lieutenant Edward H. Plummer, the acting agent, wrote:

The poverty of these Indians at present is pitiable. They have been considered self-supporting, but their means of support has decreased until many of them are in a condition bordering on starvation.<sup>4</sup>

Nearly a year later—January 22, 1895—Senator Joseph R. Hawley wrote to Herbert Welsh, "I am a good deal put out, not to say distressed about the Navajo matter."<sup>5</sup> In order to understand the "Navajo matter" that so distressed Senator Hawley—and many others—it will be necessary to review a few years of their history.

2. Theodore Roosevelt to Welsh, January 23, 1895, *ibid.*

3. Leupp to Welsh, January 16, 1895, *ibid.*; Welsh to Leupp, February 2, 1895, I.R.A., Letter Book no. 11, p. 810. Hereinafter cited as I.R.A., LB. Leupp to Welsh February 6, 1895, I.R.A., corr.; Welsh to Leupp, February 16, 1895, I.R.A., LB. no. 11, p. 814; same to same, April 4, 1895, I.R.A. corr.; Leupp to Welsh, April 9, 1895, *ibid.*

4. Plummer to Welsh, February 23, 1894, I.R.A., pamphlet No. 13, 2d. Series 5.

5. Welsh Collection, Historical Society of Pennsylvania. Hereinafter cited as Welsh Collection. Cf. same to same, February 27, 1895, I.R.A., corr.

Returning from the Bosque Redondo in 1868, the Navajo established themselves upon a reservation in their old homeland in northwestern New Mexico and north-eastern Arizona. This region, some 11,500 square miles in extent,<sup>6</sup> was, and is, a dry, high plateau crossed by irregular mountain ridges and cut by deep canyons. Summer heat and winter cold frequently are extreme. Covered with a scant herbage, it is better adapted to the requirements of grazing than of agriculture.<sup>7</sup> Since the dependent upon their sheep and goats for their livelihood. They appear to have enjoyed reasonable prosperity during the eighties. "Many of the Navajos are wealthy, and can count their herds by hundreds," wrote Captain F. T. Bennett, their agent, in his annual report for 1880.<sup>9</sup> Five years later another agent, John H. Bowman, could say

The year has been a prosperous and eventful one to this tribe. They have been as a rule healthy; they have been wholly exempt from any epidemic diseases. Their flocks and herds have increased as much as could have been expected. They gathered a fair crop of corn last fall, and have nothing in particular to complain of.<sup>10</sup>

In 1890 Agent C. E. Vandever estimated the resources of the Navajo, crediting them with 700,000 sheep and 200,000 goats. The former figure shows no change from that of 1880; the latter shows a decrease of 100,000 during the decade. In 1880 approximately 900,000 pounds of wool were produced, of which 800,000 were marketed; ten years later 2,070,000 pounds were produced, of which 1,370,000 were sold.<sup>11</sup> Some question is raised by these figures.

6. C. E. Vandever in annual report of Navajo agency, August 22, 1890, *House Executive Documents*, 51 Cong., 2 Sess., vol. 12, no. 1, p. 161.

7. Dane Coolidge and Mary Robert Coolidge. *The Navajo Indians*, (Boston and New York, 1930), 252-253.

8. In the sixteenth century<sup>8</sup> the Navajo have been a pastoral people,

8. Ezra Carman, H. A. Heath, and John Minto. *Special Report on the History and Present Condition of the Sheep Industry of the United States*, (Washington, D. C., 1892), 929.

9. *House Executive Documents*, 46 Cong., 3 Sess., vol. 9, no. 1, p. 253.

10. *Ibid.*, 49 Cong., 1 Sess., vol. 12, no. 1, p. 380.

11. *Ibid.*, 46 Cong., 3 Sess., vol. 9, no. 1, p. 253; *ibid.*, 51 Cong., 2 Sess., vol. 12, no. 1, p. 162.

Although the number of sheep apparently did not increase during the decade, the wool output more than doubled. This might have been due to an improvement in the breed of sheep—a fairly heavy influx of Merino stock occurred during this period<sup>12</sup>—or to improved methods of handling the clip, although the significance of these factors is open to doubt.<sup>13</sup> It would seem probable that Vandever underestimated the number of sheep in 1890. The next year David L. Shipley gave the figure as 1,583,754 with a wool clip of 3,000,000 pounds<sup>14</sup>—an increase in excess of 800,000 sheep in one year. Whatever may be said of the statistics—and that they are not too accurate is quite obvious—the fact remains that government agents, prior to 1893,<sup>15</sup> consistently maintained that the Navajo were prosperous. How much of this was a sound prosperity, based upon sound economic conditions, might well be questioned. The period was one of steadily declining wool prices. Ohio fine and medium wools brought an average of \$.47 per pound in 1880; dropped to \$.32 in 1885, and rose slightly, to \$.35, in 1890.<sup>16</sup> Navajo wool—which was coarse<sup>17</sup>—averaged much less, falling to \$.03 per pound by 1895.<sup>18</sup>

Like any group dependent upon a single product, the Navajo were affected quickly by conditions in the world market. Increased importations of wool from Australasia, South Africa, and South America<sup>19</sup> caused repercussions on the banks of the San Juan and the Colorado. The legend of Navajo prosperity had just sufficient basis in fact effec-

12. L. G. Connor, "A Brief History of the Sheep Industry in the United States," in American Historical Association, *Annual Report . . . 1918*, (Washington, D. C., 1921), 140, 153.

13. Carman, *op. cit.*, 930, 945.

14. Agent Shipley claimed that his figures were based upon "a careful census just completed by the Census Bureau . . ." *House Executive Documents*, 52 Cong., 1 Sess., vol. 15, no. 1, p. 309.

15. Lieutenant Plummer opened his report for 1893 with the statement that "The condition of the Navajo Indians is worse than it has been for a number of years." *House Executive Documents*, 53 Cong., 2 Sess., vol. 14, no. 1, p. 109.

16. Carman, *op. cit.*, 570.

17. *Ibid.*

18. W. N. Wallace to Alfred Hardy, April 11, 1895, Welsh Collection.

19. Connor, *op. cit.*, 143. It is stated that wool exports from Australasia increased 337 per cent between 1870 and 1899. During the same period exports from South Africa increased over 100 per cent; from South America about 150 per cent.

tually to estop them from the benefit of adequate congressional appropriations, without entirely keeping the proverbial wolf from the door. In his report for 1894, Lieutenant Plummer remarked:

It has been considered for years that the Navajoes were self-supporting. This theory has been erroneous for the past few years and has been a misfortune to the Navajoes, for it has led to their being neglected and allowed to become pitiably poor and driven to thieving and starvation. When the size of the tribe and the extent of country over which it is scattered are considered, the appropriation of \$7,500 annually for "support and civilization" appears, as it is, entirely inadequate and unjust.<sup>20</sup>

The success of general farming among the Navajo was even more dubious than was the case with stock raising. Sheep and goats could walk to water holes—if not too distant—corn and melons could not. Droughts were an irregular but recurrent and increasingly serious threat to the food supply. "This country . . . has been suffering from extreme drouth now for two years; it is literally burnt up and nothing left to support man or beast."<sup>21</sup> Thus reported E. B. Townsend to R. E. Trowbridge, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, June 15, 1880. It is almost superfluous to add that the crop of 1880 was a failure, as was that of 1881.<sup>22</sup> As conditions did not show signs of material improvement by the end of the decade, one Arthur M. Tinker was appointed special Indian inspector for the Navajo, July 1, 1889.<sup>23</sup> His instructions were not forthcoming until December 2; his final report was dated March 26, 1890.<sup>24</sup> This document stated a number of platitudes, already quite well known to anyone at all familiar with

20. *House Executive Documents*, 53 Cong., 3 Sess., vol. 15, no. 1, p. 99.

21. National Archives, Office of Indian Affairs, Letters received, New Mexico, 1880/T-741. Hereinafter cited as O.I.A., LR.

22. General discussion in Frank D. Reeve, "The Government and the Navaho, 1878-1883," in *NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW*, XVI, (1941), 275-312.

23. National Archives, Office of the Secretary of the Interior, Appointment Division, 3. Hereinafter cited as S.I., A. D.

24. O.I.A., LR., 13837/1890.

the Navajo, and indirectly—perhaps with some justice—blamed the Indians for their lack of food.

Upon this large reservation very little farming is done. Most of the Indians cultivate small pieces of land usually as a garden, seldom more. The Agent and the farmer have tried hard to induce them to do more. Last year some few worked more land than in former years: quite a number have promised the Agent to plow more this season than ever before, but should they do as much as promised not a very large amount of land will be under cultivation.

Tinker then pointed out the absolute necessity of irrigation:

To make a crop here the land must be irrigated, and at this time there is not a single irrigation ditch in condition to use, and cannot be used until quite an amount of money has been expended.

In short, "These people are not, and never have been a farming people." At best, individual gardens could not be expected to support the tribe; good farms were in the dim and distant future.

By 1892 the situation had become "one of the most critical and difficult . . . connected with the administration of Indian affairs."<sup>25</sup> Unable adequately to support themselves upon their reservation, many Navajos grazed their flocks on non-reservation land.<sup>26</sup> This led to conflict and threats of conflict between Indian sheep herders and white cattlemen, of whom there were not a few in the surrounding country. The murder of Lot Smith by a Navajo Indian in June, 1892, may be cited as a case in point.<sup>27</sup> In October

25. T. J. Morgan to Alexander McD., McCook, July 16, 1892, O.I.A., Correspondence Land Division, Letter Book no. 241, p. 88a. Hereinafter cited as O.I.A., Corr. Land Div., LB.

26. Arthur M. Tinker estimated that from 15 to 20 per cent of the Navajos lived away from the reservation. Tinker to the Secretary of the Interior, June 16, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 24020/1892 enc. 3. Agent David L. Shipley placed the number of non-resident Indians at upward of 9,000, or 50 per cent of the entire tribe. McCook to Morgan, July 18, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 27125/1892 enc. 7.

27. Thomas W. Brookbank to J. N. Irwin, June 21, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 27125/1892 enc. 4; Shipley to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, July 1, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 24514/1892; Marcus A. Smith to the Commissioner, July 7, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 24411/1892.

one J. H. Dorsett requested the Office of Indian Affairs to "take some action to stop" the Indians from killing and stealing his cattle.<sup>28</sup> Two months later a number of the citizens of Fruitland, San Juan county, New Mexico, complained "that the Navajo Indians are trespassing upon their lands and committing depredations by killing and running off their stock, and they add that if this is not prevented soon, it will lead to grave consequences."<sup>29</sup> By the spring of 1893 an Indian war had become a definite possibility—if not a probability.<sup>30</sup>

That no war occurred, then or later, may be attributed to several factors. The older Indians could remember Kit Carson's campaign and the hardships of their exile at the Bosque Redondo. Perhaps more potent than memories of the past were certain facts of the present. At the moment the civil and military authorities were cooperating more cordially than usually was the case. General Alexander McD. McCook, in command of the department of Arizona, was a friend of Thomas J. Morgan, the commissioner of Indian Affairs. A meeting of these two men in Washington, followed by an exchange of letters,<sup>31</sup> had much to do with the formulation of a policy on the one hand calculated to meet the needs of the Navajos by the construction of an adequate irrigation system, on the other prepared to meet possible intransigence with the actuality of military force. Thus in the autumn of 1892, Lieutenants W. C. Brown, E. M. Suplee and Odon Gurovits made a careful survey of the reservation and prepared contour maps thereof, as an essential preliminary to work upon an irrigation system.<sup>32</sup> \$64,500 was asked for the purpose;<sup>33</sup> eventually it was appropriated and, in large part, wasted. More of that later.

28. R. V. Belt to Shipley, November 5, 1892, O.I.A., Corr., Land Div., LB. no. 247, p. 300.

29. L. Bradford Prince to Morgan, December 24, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 45986/1892.

30. D. M. Browning to the Secretary of the Interior, April 28, 1893, O.I.A., Corr. Land Div., LB. no. 257, pp. 283-285; same to same, April 29, 1893, *ibid.*, pp. 352-353.

31. Morgan to McCook, July 16, 1892, O.I.A., Corr. Land. Div., LB. no. 241, pp. 88-88b; McCook to Morgan, July 16, 1892, O.I.A., LR., 27125/1892 enc. 7.

32. See report in *Senate Executive Documents*, 52 Cong., 2 Sess., vol. 2, no. 68.

33. Morgan to the Secretary of the Interior, February 10, 1893, O.I.A., Corr. Land. Div., LB. no. 252, pp. 99-100.



In the meantime the Indians waited. By 1894-1895 many of them appear to have been facing the threat of actual starvation. Why? That is what the Indian Rights Association wanted to know, and in the story of its efforts lies the crux of this paper.

### III

The appointment of Lieutenant Edward H. Plummer to the Navajo agency<sup>34</sup> was followed by a period of close cooperation between the governmental authorities and the Indian Rights Association. After studying the situation for two months, Plummer concluded that it would be a good idea

to have a carload of Navajo Indians visit Washington and two or three larger cities in the early autumn, for the purpose of seeing something of the educational methods of Americans and the power, extent and advantages of civilization.<sup>35</sup>

To this proposal Commissioner Daniel M. Browning—Morgan's successor—replied that

such an arrangement . . . would no doubt result in great good to these Indians . . . but a trip of that character necessarily involves considerable expense, and there is no money at the disposal of this office which it could use in carrying out the plan suggested. This being the case, I do not see that this office can take favorable action in the matter.<sup>36</sup>

What the Office of Indian Affairs could not see its way clear to doing, was done by the aid of the Indian Rights Association. Having obtained the necessary permission for the Indians to make the trip—contingent upon governmental exemption from all expenses<sup>37</sup>—the Indian Rights

34. February 21, 1893. O.I.A., LR., 7067/1893.

35. Plummer to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, June 5, 1893, O.I.A., LR., 21159/1893.

36. Browning to Plummer, June 15, 1893, O.I.A., Corr. Land Div., LB., no. 260, p. 269.

37. Frank C. Armstrong [Assistant Commissioner of Indian Affairs] to Welsh, June 16, 1893, I.R.A. corr.

Association solicited funds, obtaining nearly \$700 by the end of July.<sup>38</sup> Good as was this showing, the sum collected was insufficient to meet the costs of an extended visit to several eastern cities and colleges.<sup>39</sup> Plummer accepted the limitations imposed by lack of money, and proposed that the Indians visit the Columbian Exposition at Chicago. Writing to Welsh, June 29, 1893, he remarked, "I think if nothing better can be done it would do all that we desire to run them [the Navajos] through to Chicago and have them see the Fair and the schools of that place."<sup>40</sup> This was resolved upon and carried into execution in October. The whole plan threatened to collapse at the last moment, as the Indian Office wanted Plummer to remain at his post at Fort Defiance, and the Indians refused to go east without him.<sup>41</sup> Finally matters were arranged, and a party of eleven men, one school girl, and two school boys left Gallup, New Mexico, for Chicago on October 13.<sup>42</sup>

Of their stay in that city little need be said. Professor F. W. Putnam acted as their mentor and guide. For a week the party examined the wonders of a world unknown to them, leaving for home on October 21. Plummer expressed himself as "more than satisfied with the results" of the trip.<sup>43</sup> Three months later he wrote, "The influence of the Chicago trip seems to have awakened the whole tribe to a strong desire to emulate the whites in every good way."<sup>44</sup> This statement, like several others, fails to carry convic-

38. "The sum total of the Navajo Fund up to date is: \$648.50." Matthew K. Sniffen to Welsh, July 27, 1893, *ibid.*

39. "It was my desire, to have them [the Navajos] visit West Point and Vassar College.

They have such an aversion to having their girls go away from home to school I wanted to have them see a large girls' boarding school.

I had also a desire to take them to my mother's place, in the country near Baltimore, for a rest and a little breath of fresh country air." Plummer to Welsh, June 29, 1893, *ibid.*

40. *Ibid.*

41. Plummer to the Secretary of the Indian Rights Association, October 12, 1893, *ibid.*, [telegram]; Plummer to Welsh, October 15, 1893, *ibid.*, [telegram].

42. Plummer to the Secretary of the Indian Rights Association, October 26, 1893, *ibid.*

43. *Ibid.*

44. Plummer to Welsh, January 22, 1894, *ibid.*

tion, leaving one with a feeling that the agent was looking at things through rose-colored glasses.

Hoping to build upon the foundation supposedly laid, Plummer asked the Office of Indian Affairs for a special appropriation of \$5,000 for the purchase of agricultural implements and seeds.

There is plenty of water on the Reservation and plenty of land capable, with and without irrigation, of supporting many more Indians than this tribe numbers, but it is necessary for the work of constructing ditches, reservoirs, &c to be done by Government aid, also the purchase of implements, seeds and fencing, to enable the Indians to make proper use of the water after developed.<sup>45</sup>

As spring came on and no transformation of the Navajo tribe became manifest, Plummer must have felt increasing disappointment. Turning to Welsh for a sympathetic understanding that seemed utterly lacking in other quarters, he wrote, May 11, 1894, that assistance was needed in farming operations. One farmer "has covered the country north for about seventy miles . . . and his reports are very encouraging as to the anxiety of the Indians for assistance but very discouraging when he tells how much might have been done if they could have had the assistance we are trying so hard to get . . ." <sup>46</sup> This was a reference to the special appropriation of \$5,000 mentioned above, supported by Welsh in a pamphlet of the Indian Rights Association,<sup>47</sup> but frowned upon by the Department of the Interior.<sup>48</sup> Plummer concluded his letter with the charge that

It certainly is the fault of the authorities if these Indians are allowed to suffer another year, and it is the fault of such negligence and want of true knowledge of their needs, and persistent refusal to listen to those who know, that has kept these Indians where they are.

45. *Ibid.*

46. Welsh Collection.

47. March 1, 1894, I.R.A., pamphlet No. 13, 2d. Series, 1-2.

48. Welsh to Hardy, April 3, 1894, I.R.A., LB. no. 10, p. 941.

That the policy pursued by Hoke Smith, the secretary of the Interior, and his departmental colleagues was deliberate—far too deliberate for an emergency—may be frankly admitted. The world-wide depression, the insecurity of national finances, and the silver question<sup>49</sup> forced the Democratic party to be interested in economy,<sup>50</sup> so Smith moved with marked caution while Plummer stormed. A special inspector was sent to the Navajo reservation—exactly what Plummer did not want—as the agent believed that the presence of the inspector “means of course another year’s delay.”<sup>51</sup> More and more Plummer felt that his position was becoming untenable.<sup>52</sup> By September he had determined to resign. In a letter to A. B. Weimer, the recording secretary of the Indian Rights Association, he remarked, “. . . it is with regret that I have to say that I find it impossible to continue the work longer, under the circumstances. I am sure that if the difficulties and trials of the position were fully known no gentleman would be expected to work here.”<sup>53</sup>

A little over two months later Plummer wrote to Welsh what was, in actuality, his valedictory:

This is my last day in charge of this Agency. My experience here has been a hard and in many respects a very bitter one. I am almost ready to say that I forgive the Indian for every outrage ever committed against the whites and that I am in entire sympathy with them in all their resistance to the interference of the whites in their affairs. I do not believe that in their hearts they believe white men to be their friends and I am very sure that I would not if in their place.<sup>54</sup>

49. Henry Cabot Lodge gives “the present condition of the silver question” as a reason for senatorial lack of interest in the Navajo and their affairs. Lodge to Welsh, October 17, 1893, I.R.A., corr.

50. John G. Bourke to Welsh, January 19, 1895, *ibid.*

51. Plummer to Welsh, May 11, 1894, Welsh Collection.

52. “In view of the correspondence had with your office I have considered it useless to make any recommendations, but I must once more protest against the treatment of this Agency. . . .” Plummer to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, April 4, 1894, I.R.A. corr.

53. Plummer to Weimer, September 5, 1894, *ibid.*

54. Plummer to Welsh, November 14, 1894, *ibid.*

Meanwhile Clinton C. Duncan—the inspector—was conducting an investigation the results of which were opposed alike to the findings of Plummer and of his successor in the agency, Captain Constant Williams.<sup>55</sup> Duncan submitted his report December 24, 1894. Far from sympathetic with the Navajo, the bulk of this document was devoted to an argument in favor of reducing greatly the area of their reservation.

. . . I do not think that it will ever be possible to control and civilize them, until the reservation is reduced down to about one-fourth of its present size; and this in my opinion will leave them sufficient ground for all agricultural and grazing purposes . . .

The object of making this reservation so large, was that they might have abundant pasturage for their horses, cattle and sheep; they now have but few cattle, their ponies are without value; and the number of their sheep has largely decreased; and many of them now have their flocks off the reservation; and I can see no reason why they should have so large an area of land. It is a positive injury to them, in that they will not settle down upon any fixed habitation; but roam about from place to place.<sup>56</sup>

One is inclined to doubt whether Duncan had studied the situation with sufficient care to warrant certain of his conclusions. From the earliest times sheep herders of necessity have led a semi-nomadic life, following their flocks from place to place as they grazed over the land. Duncan stated that sixty per cent of the reservation<sup>57</sup>—about 4,800,000 acres—was suitable for grazing. However, had his recommendations been followed the total area would have been reduced from nearly 8,000,000 acres<sup>58</sup> to slightly under 2,000,000. As the number of sheep was variously estimated anywhere between 700,000 and 2,000,000, and

55. Williams was appointed October 19, 1894. S.I., A.D., 121; O.I.A., L.R., 41065/1894.

56. O.I.A., L.R., 1044/1895.

57. *Ibid.*

58. David L. Shipley gave the figure as 7,942,400. Cf. report of Navajo agency, August 31, 1891, *House Executive Documents*, 52 Cong., 1 Sess., vol. 15, no. 1, p. 309.

as goats and horses also required a portion of the land, the adequacy of 2,000,000 acres certainly was open to doubt. Then too, it must be remembered that water is quite as essential to grazing as it is to many other types of agriculture. Any drastic reduction in the area of the reservation must have placed control of the headwaters of various streams in the hands of white ranchmen and farmers—with little prospect of benefit to the Indians. As Duncan makes no reference to this aspect of the matter, one may question whether he gave to it any thought whatever. In summing up Duncan's views, the conclusion is inescapable that his knowledge of Navajo affairs was limited while his prejudice was considerable.

. . . And while as a matter of fact these Indians are in want, I think it very much due to their own indolence and not by reason of any loss of crops as I can see where but a small acreage has been planted and their loss comparatively small. . . .<sup>59</sup>

Like Tinker before him, Duncan found it easier to blame the Indians for their own troubles than to study the facts.

The drought of the summer of 1894 not only ruined the crops, but also emphasized the need for irrigation.<sup>60</sup> There was an average of one dependable water-place to every hundred square miles.<sup>61</sup> The San Juan and the Little Colorado were not too dependable, like all rivers in the region being subject to periods of devastating flood and equally devastating drought. All told, the Navajo did well to keep some 10,000 acres under cultivation.<sup>62</sup> Even the cultivated land was of so poor a quality that an eastern farmer would have scorned it. As far back as 1883, Agent Riordan described the Navajo reservation as consisting "of ten

59. O.I.A., LR., 1289/1895.

60. "The great need is irrigation . . ." wrote Darwin R. James to Merrill S. Gates, August 23, 1894. *House Executive Documents*, 53 Cong., 3 Sess., vol. 15, no. 1, p. 1035.

61. C. E. Vandever in annual report of Navajo agency, August 22, 1890, *ibid.*, 51 Cong., 2 Sess., vol. 12, no. 1, p. 161.

62. *Ibid.*, p. 163. Like other statistics *in re* the Navajo during this period, the accuracy of this figure is open to question.

thousand [square] miles of the most worthless land that ever lay out of doors."<sup>63</sup>

Such was the condition to be met by Edward C. Vincent, a civil engineer from Staunton, Virginia, who appeared upon the scene about April 1, 1894.<sup>64</sup> Vincent's experience among the Navajo was not a happy one. Judging him as charitably as possible, it remains painfully evident that he combined great inefficiency with a considerable ability to make bitter enemies. Darwin R. James, of the United States Board of Indian Commissioners, put his finger on one source of friction when he pointed out that "The [Navajo] reservation was carefully surveyed and plans drawn by army engineers, to one of whom might have been intrusted the development of the work and the expenditure of the money rather than to a civilian at increased expense."<sup>65</sup> This was but an echo of a recommendation made a year previously by former Commissioner Morgan.<sup>66</sup> Both Edward H. Plummer and his successor in the agency, Constant Williams were army officers with creditable service records. The old question as to whether the Indians should be under civil or military control, which had been quiescent for a time, was revived by Vincent when he let it be known "that 'no shoulder straps' should rank above him" and showed himself "to be anything but a gentleman."<sup>67</sup> This unfortunate contretemps between the civil and military authorities might have blown over had not Vincent so conducted himself as to bring about attacks upon his integrity by both government agents and Alfred Hardy of the Indian Rights Association. Small wonder that storm clouds hung heavy over Navajo land, and that reiterated recriminations flashed forth like lightning over the scene.

63. Dane Coolidge and Mary Roberts Coolidge, *op. cit.*, 252.

64. J. T. Holbert to Welsh, February 8, 1896, I.R.A. corr. Vincent's appointment as superintendent of irrigation on the Navajo reservation was dated March 10, 1894; his instructions were issued March 21. O.I.A., L.R., 9771/1894; O.I.A., Corr. Land Div., L.B., no. 276, pp. 476-483.

65. James to Gates, August 23, 1894, *House Executive Documents*, 53 Cong., 3 Sess., vol. 15, no. 1, p. 1035.

66. Morgan to the Secretary of the Interior, February 10, 1893, O.I.A., Corr. Land Div., L.B. on. 252, p. 101.

67. C. C. Manning to William L. Wilson, October 1, 1895, I.R.A., corr.

Vincent's particular task was the development of an adequate system of irrigation for the Navajo. It will be recalled that detailed plans for such a system had been prepared by Lieutenants Brown, Suplee and Gurovits in 1892, and had subsequently been approved by the Office of Indian Affairs and Congress.<sup>68</sup> Vincent discarded these plans, substituting and acting upon ideas of his own. He made progress slowly; so slowly that the season of 1894 passed with no "expectation of benefit for this year's crops."<sup>69</sup> It was his hope to construct the entire irrigation system by hand labor—using few or no ditching machines<sup>70</sup>—thereby giving employment to the Indians. He forgot that the time involved in the construction of ditches by hand labor inevitably would force the Indians to be absent from their farms when their crops needed careful attention. Likewise he appeared unaware of the fact that untrained Indian labor was incapable of building gates, flumes, and laterals, all of which required a certain degree of skill.<sup>71</sup> Thus the season of 1894 was wasted, along with most of the money appropriated for work which was not done.

#### IV

Captain Constant Williams, who succeeded to the Navajo agency late in 1894, found that conditions were critical indeed. "The destitute are living on the charity of those who have something, but the resources of these latter will soon be exhausted, being very limited. All of them will then have to face starvation unless some speedy provision be made for their relief. . . ." Williams sensed increasing danger of conflict. "I already hear of the killing of white men's cattle by them, [the Indians] but that is done, not through malice but to keep body and soul together." So wrote Captain Williams to Herbert Welsh, December 3, 1894.<sup>72</sup>

68. *Supra.*, p. 8.

69. James to Gates, August 23, 1894, *House Executive Documents*, 53 Cong., 3 Sess., vol. 15, no. 1, p. 1085.

70. Hardy to the I.R.A., February 12, 1895, Welsh Collection; same to same, February 14, 1895, *ibid.*

71. Same to same, April 22, 1895, *ibid.*

72. I.R.A. corr.



Recognizing the importance of this communication, Welsh got in touch with Charles C. Painter, at the time Washington agent of the Indian Rights Association. " . . . Please inform me at the earliest possible moment what you think can be accomplished, and what is the best line of procedure . . . " <sup>73</sup> Painter forthwith obtained an interview with the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, D. M. Browning, which left him somewhat less enthusiastic in his support of Williams. Among other things he was informed that "The new agent [Williams] . . . has asked the Department for \$20,000<sup>74</sup> for . . . relief" of the Navajo. This Browning was "very unwilling" to ask of Congress, as he did not approve of "gratuitous gifts" and had to think of other Indians than the Navajo. Moreover, he considered that Vincent was "doing good work." The latter statement was supported by photographs taken by one Mr. Mindeliff of the Bureau of Ethnology, and was, Painter believed, "entitled to large credence."<sup>75</sup> So much for Painter's opinion.

Joseph J. Janney of Baltimore had a conversation with Commissioner Browning on December 18, 1894. He was told that "conditions [at the Navajo agency] are not nearly so desperate as they are made to appear by Capt. Williams' letter. From other and very reliable sources of information he [Browning] learns that the Indians are not likely to suffer for food, any more than is the case generally throughout the west when crops have failed. . . ." <sup>76</sup>

Somehow these reassuring statements failed to convince Welsh or the Philadelphia members of the Indian Rights Association. Unwilling to wait for the passage of the \$25,000 appropriation asked for by Williams, the Association appealed for relief "to the charitably-disposed public,"

73. Welsh to Painter, December 10, 1894, I.R.A., LB., no. 11, p. 626.

74. Williams asked for \$25,000. Williams to Welsh, December 3, 1894, I.R.A. corr.

75. Painter to Welsh, December 14, 1894, *ibid.* A very different opinion was held by former Agent Plummer, who wrote that " . . . Mr. Mindeliff [*sic*] is looked upon by every one who has come in contact with him here as a contemptible dead beat and loafer, squandering, likewise, Government money. . . ." Plummer to Welsh, November 28, 1894, *ibid.*

76. Janney to Welsh, December 18, 1894, *ibid.*

feeling certain that "immediate independent action" was necessary, apart from any possible governmental aid.<sup>77</sup> A number of contributions were given,<sup>78</sup> and a deluge of letters were sent to members of Congress and to the Department of the Interior.<sup>79</sup> In the final analysis such action proved to be wholly right, although it profoundly irritated Hoke Smith and Browning.<sup>80</sup> Nor was this the end of the matter. By appealing over the heads of his superior officers to an outsider Williams had exceeded his authority—more particularly as that outsider was the active head of the Indian Rights Association. Accordingly he was "admonished" by the Secretary of War, as he thought, upon the request of the Secretary of the Interior, to "hold no correspondence with outside parties on official business which is to receive action by Congress."<sup>81</sup>

To Welsh and to the Indian Rights Association this was the straw that broke the camel's back. In a letter to Hoke Smith dated January 4, 1895, but not mailed until the ninth of the month,<sup>82</sup> Welsh inquired whether the admonition conveyed to Captain Williams "upon your complaint"

is intended to restrict him in conveying to this Association information relating to the condition of his Indians? I can hardly believe that this is your intention, in view of the cordial and pleasant relations which have existed between this Society and yourself, and the full recognition which we have constantly sought to give your many acts designed to promote the welfare of the Indians. In my long experience with Indian affairs I have always enjoyed the fullest liberty in corresponding with Agents and other employes of the Government relating to the condition of the Indians, and it seems to me as an essential condition to wise efforts for their improvement that such liberty should be permitted, in view of the representative character

77. Welsh to \_\_\_\_\_, January 9, 1895, Welsh Collection.

78. Sniffen to Williams, January 31, 1895, I.R.A., LB., no. 11, p. 786.

79. Painter to Welsh, January 8, 1895, I.R.A. corr.

80. Same to same, December 19, 1894, *ibid.*

81. Williams to Welsh, December 28, 1894, *ibid.*

82. Welsh to Hardy, January 9, 1895, I.R.A., LB. no. 11, p. 677.

of this Association, and of its standing in the country.<sup>83</sup>

Thinly veiling his irritation with the forms of politeness, Smith replied on January 12, denying that his department was in any way responsible for the admonition, which, however, had his cordial approval.<sup>84</sup> Few others gave to it any approval, cordial or otherwise. "I was very much surprised to learn that the agent had been practically muzzled," wrote Charles F. Meserve. "I had . . . supposed that all work carried on by the United States government was open to the inspection and judgment of the people from whom the authority of the governing class is derived."<sup>85</sup> John G. Bourke, veteran of many Indian campaigns and a writer of no mean talent, commented bitterly:

Those people [in the War Department] don't care for the Indian. They would let him starve, could they make a showing of economy in appropriations. The country is so nearly bankrupt that every dollar counts, and the Administration must do something to regain prestige.<sup>86</sup>

Be that as it may, the Senate Committee on Appropriations added an amendment to the Indian appropriation bill, voting the \$25,000 requested by Williams.<sup>87</sup> In due time this measure was approved by a conference committee of the two houses, and became law March 2, 1895.<sup>88</sup> There is little reason to doubt that the lobbying conducted by the Indian Rights Association was not without its effect.

At this distance of time one cannot but see that the muzzling of Williams was a serious tactical error. Why silence a man if, as was maintained officially, conditions on the Navajo reservation were satisfactory?<sup>89</sup> If satisfactory,

83. Welsh to Smith, January 4, 1895, *ibid.*, p. 675.

84. Smith to Welsh, January 12, 1895, I.R.A. corr.

85. Meserve to Welsh, January 19, 1895, *ibid.*

86. Bourke to Welsh, January 19, 1895, *ibid.*

87. *Congressional Record*, 53 Cong., 3 Sess., pp. 2438-2439.

88. *Ibid.*, p. 3250.

89. Welsh to Mrs. Sarah T. Kinney, January 17, 1895, I.R.A., LB., no. 11, p. 767; Welsh to J. S. Murrow, January 18, 1895, *ibid.*, p. 712; Welsh to Leupp, January 19, 1895, *ibid.*, p. 719.

why did Williams find it necessary to pledge his own funds against the purchase of ten thousand pounds of flour to be distributed among the needy members of the tribe?<sup>90</sup> Why was Williams, conscientious as he undoubtedly was, made to feel that a knife's edge stood between his position and dismissal from the agency?<sup>91</sup>

The Washington agency of the Indian Rights Association—in the competent hands of Francis E. Leupp after Painter's sudden death<sup>92</sup>—was able to answer some questions; more particularly those regarding appointments and the voting of appropriations. But this was not the whole problem. More and more Welsh felt that the final answers lay in the field. Therefore it was determined to send Alfred Hardy, of Farmington, Connecticut, to the Navajo country as representative of the Indian Rights Association.

This decision was not reached without due thought. It was suggested by Welsh to Hardy on January 9, 1895.<sup>93</sup> Hardy, who had been an industrial teacher on the Navajo reservation, jumped at the suggestion.<sup>94</sup> Various members of the Indian Rights Association approved of the idea.<sup>95</sup> Welsh appears to have entertained some doubts in the matter, and at one time thought of going west himself.<sup>96</sup> Curiously enough, Williams wired that a representative was not needed.<sup>97</sup> This delayed action for two weeks but Welsh was still "particularly anxious to get the exact facts about the irrigating ditch work, and the competency of Mr. Vincent in regard to the same. . . ." <sup>98</sup> Finally, on January 29, Welsh wired Hardy, "Please prepare for Navajo journey

90. See the resolution adopted at a special meeting of the executive committee of the Indian Rights Association, February 27, 1895, Welsh Collection.

91. Leupp to Welsh, January 28, [1895], I.R.A. corr.; Browning to Welsh, January 29, 1895, *ibid.*; Welsh to Browning, January 30, 1895, I.R.A., LB. no. 11, p. 775; Leupp to Welsh, February 5, 1895, I.R.A.; corr.

92. *Supra.*, p. 1.

93. Welsh to Hardy, January 9, 1895, I.R.A.; LB. no. 11, pp. 677-678.

94. Hardy to the I.R.A., January 10, 1895, I.R.A. corr.

95. H. L. Wayland to Welsh, January 14, 1895, *ibid.*

96. Welsh to Leupp, January 21, 1895, I.R.A.; LB. no. 11, p. 727.

97. Williams to Welsh, January 15, 1895, I.R.A. corr., [telegram].

98. Welsh to Hardy, January 17, 1895, I.R.A., LB. no. 11, p. 701.

immediately. We [the Indian Rights Association] meet necessary expenses."<sup>99</sup>

It was in February, 1895, that Hardy arrived at the Navajo agency at Fort Defiance, Arizona. Things were at their worst; the country was blanketed with several inches of snow; the thermometer went to twenty degrees below zero,<sup>100</sup> the Indians froze or starved.

In a series of graphic reports that constitute a classic of their kind, Hardy pictured the desperate plight of the Navajo during his sojourn among them. No more vivid picture of conditions has come under consideration by the author. As the Indian Rights Association had notified Captain Williams of Hardy's mission, he was expected and welcomed by that officer upon his arrival at the agency. While there he met Colonel S. R. Murphy, third in the list of special inspectors sent out by the government. Promptly the two men prejudged each other. Colonel Murphy, wrote Hardy, "is a man over Sixty—tall and heavy set, and one (as I think) little disposed to rough it in such a country or to make any special exertion."<sup>101</sup> Williams thought him kindly disposed toward the Indians,<sup>102</sup> but few remarks upon his factual comprehension or understanding of character—which proved infinitesimal—were committed to paper. Condemned to the drudgery of submitting a weekly report to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Murphy took the opportunity to damn Hardy by faint praise: "one Hardy, who was formerly Industrial Teacher at the Navajo Boarding school at Ft. Defiance, but [is] now out on the reservation in the interest of the Indian Rights Association . . ." He goes on to say that Hardy was searching for evidence of distress "for sensational purposes."<sup>103</sup> It was unfortunate for Hardy's case that whatever the actual purpose of his investigations may have been—at this distance of years the accumulated evidence is very largely in his favor—he

99. Same to same, January 29, 1895, *ibid.*, p. 774, [telegram].

100. Hardy to the I.R.A., February 14, 1895, Welsh Collection.

101. Same to same, February 12, 1895, *ibid.*

102. *Ibid.*

103. Murphy to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, March 23, 1895, O.I.A., LR., 13557/1895.

wrote and received letters and at times conducted himself in a manner that lent credence to the statements of his enemies. Thus he spent considerable time and effort in an abortive attempt to prove that death from starvation actually had occurred during the winter of 1894-1895.<sup>104</sup> He photographed the remains of a horse's head hanging in a hogan as evidence of the absolute destitution of its owner. As a matter of fact, while certainly not regular eaters of horse meat, the Navajo did eat it on occasion, and the Indian in question said that he ate it because it was sweet.<sup>105</sup> Except as proof of unseemly bickering between Murphy and Hardy this kind of evidence must be regarded as almost worthless.

Whatever the inspector may have said, the facts would seem to sustain the contention of Williams and Hardy that the Navajo were facing a critical shortage of food. In part this was due to the unprecedented severity of the winter, with resultant decimation of the herds of sheep so important in Navajo economy.<sup>106</sup> Almost equally, it was due to Vincent's needless delay in the execution of any irrigation project. It was upon the latter point that Hardy's reports placed the greatest emphasis. As early as April, 1894, Vincent went "to Albuquerque to see about buying needful tools, implements, wagons &c. but . . . it was August before these articles were bought & on hand & work on the Ditches begun. . . ." <sup>107</sup> Having made it abundantly clear that he wished to employ Indians rather than machines, Vincent hired about seventy-five men, most of whom were promptly dismissed, keeping a working force of fifteen or twenty.<sup>108</sup> Little wonder that the work was not done. This procedure, as exasperating to the Indians as it was disingenuous, was continued through the spring of 1895.

On the afternoon of February 14, 1895, Hardy had an interview with Vincent. "I asked him several questions

---

104. Hardy to the I.R.A., February 18, 1895, Welsh Collection.

105. Murphy to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, *loc. cit.*

106. Wallace to Hardy, April 11, 1895, Welsh Collection.

107. Hardy to the I.R.A., February 14, 1895, *ibid.*

108. *Ibid.*

about his work, to all of which his replies were very evasive."<sup>109</sup> The two were feeling each other out.

I asked him if the Dept gave him directions where to commence work? "No, that was left to his discretion." Did it stipulate what wages should be paid? "No, that was left to me."

About what wages do you pay or have you paid? "About \$1. a day." And they paid their own board? "Yes."

Has the Commissioner given you any instructions to hire as many Navajos as should offer to work employment at the rate of from \$1. to \$1.50 a day? "No, he has not." Has he at any time stated, or limited you to any amount to be spent in any one year? "No."<sup>110</sup>

Thus the cross-examination continues through several pages of Hardy's report.

Captain Williams and Hardy agreed that the San Juan valley stood most in need of irrigation. Suffering had been acute throughout the northern part of the reservation.<sup>111</sup> Apart from that, the San Juan valley was sufficiently free from snow to permit ditching operations early in the season.<sup>112</sup> Such was not the case at Red Lake, where Vincent established his camp in a region covered with snow and unsuited, in any event, to the cultivation of corn. Asked if he intended to do any work on the San Juan this spring [1895], Vincent replied "that he did not know."<sup>113</sup> His excuse for doing none "was on account of the whites up there [on the San Juan] being interested to have the work done, so they could get the Indians' money away from them"<sup>114</sup>—a poor argument that would have applied with equal force to any part of the reservation.

On February 22, Constant Williams, S. R. Murphy, and Alfred Hardy set out on an extended trip to the San Juan region.

109. *Ibid.*

110. *Ibid.*

111. Mary L. Eldridge to S. E. Snider, February 11, 1895, *ibid.*

112. Hardy to the I.R.A., February 12, 1895, *ibid.*

113. Same to same, February 19, 1895, *ibid.*

114. Same to same, February 14, 1895, *ibid.*

... I believe also that if Col. Murphy sees what I do, that there can be but one report given. Also if the Major [Williams] accompanys us, the result of our investigations must be more satisfactory all around, as there will be so many witnesses that our word cannot be disputed.<sup>115</sup>

A two months' trip failed to iron out differences. If anything, it served to confirm each member of the party in the views he held already. Murphy still believed that such want as existed—he did not deny its existence—in good measure was owing to laziness on the part of the Indians. He felt "almost sure" that the carcasses of ten or fifteen sheep lying along the road "belonged to Mexicans."<sup>116</sup> Such men can never be convinced, and no real inspection could be expected of him. Knowingly or unknowingly, at every step he played into Vincent's hands.

Hardy's final judgment upon Vincent is contained in a letter written upon his return from the San Juan to Fort Defiance, April 22, 1895:

There is no question but Mr. Vincent is criminally negligent in not having been working upon the ditches on the San Juan from *last* fall, at *least*, considering the amount and quality of the land that could have been under that system and cultivated *this* Season, and the vast number of people who could have been fed this coming fall, winter and spring from Crops which could have been grown there, and the diversity of crops which could have been gathered—the rich bottom lands adapted to most any vegetable, or grain, and the mesa land for grain and alfalfa—to say nothing about himself and men and teams lying idle for weeks or months here . . .<sup>117</sup>

During the following months Hardy visited Fort Wingate<sup>118</sup> and the northern part of the reservation, returning to Fort Defiance by June.<sup>119</sup> His opinion of the Navajo

115. Same to same, February 19, 1895, *ibid.*

116. Murphy to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, March 2, 1895, O.I.A., LR., 10469/1895.

117. Hardy to the I.R.A., April 22, 1895, Welsh Collection. *Italics Hardy's.*

118. Same to same, April 26, 1895, *ibid.*

119. Same to same, June 2, 1895, *ibid.*



improved. On their own initiative they were doing much that Vincent should have done.

I found several dams made, which were a great credit to them. One was in the bed of an old wash, which was seventy feet long and six feet high. Water was backed up by this dam for fully half a mile. In order to irrigate their crops, as you know they have to throw up an embankment to hold the water, so the land will be well soaked. By actual measurement, I found the embankments around the fields under this dam to be about 4000 feet. Another dam I found to measure 310 feet with a long ditch connected therewith. I found everywhere signs of activity, and I am thoroughly satisfied the people are doing all they can to help themselves. . . . .<sup>120</sup>

Such was Hardy's view of the situation. "I am ready to stand by what I have observed and reported, and what I herewith report,"<sup>121</sup> he wrote to the Indian Rights Association.

## VI

Having reported upon the activities of Vincent and Murphy, Hardy's most important work was completed. His stay upon the Navajo reservation was longer by far than had been expected. Doubtless this contributed to the meticulous detail of his observations, but it became too great a strain upon the funds of the Indian Rights Association.<sup>122</sup> Accordingly, he was instructed to conclude his work "at the earliest possible moment,"<sup>123</sup> but, upon the suggestion of Welsh, was directed to visit the Hualapai, and stop off in Colorado to discuss matters with Francis E. Leupp who had gone there to investigate the southern Utes.<sup>124</sup>

Not a trained anthropologist, Hardy's knowledge of the Navajo was of a practical kind, born of deep sympathy

120. *Ibid.*

121. *Ibid.*

122. Welsh to Hardy, April 27, 1895, I.R.A., LB. no. 12, p. 125.

123. Sniffen to Hardy, June 5, 1895, *ibid.*, p. 190.

124. Welsh to Hardy, June 11, 1895, *ibid.*, pp. 208-209; Mary C. Hardy to Sniffen, July 16, 1895, I.R.A. corr.

and rather limited experience with them. His reports carry the conviction that he told the truth,<sup>125</sup> subject to the limitations of his knowledge and the accuracy of his observations.

. . . I think him a most conscientious man, [wrote Francis E. Leupp] very useful in his proper sphere, which is the description of things he *has actually* seen; but if you could compare, as I have, his statements with those of people he has endeavored to quote, you would see that as a *hearsay* witness his testimony must be very carefully weighed before acceptance. His intellectual scope is narrow, and he is so full of prejudices that his opinions are warped without his being conscious of it. He has told me the same story twice, on more than one occasion, and the details have differed; and when I came to pin him down as to his evidence, I found that the variance was not due to any new information; but to brooding over the subject. He belongs to a type of men very valuable as agitators, but not for constructive work. I am therefore cautious in accepting his summary of anyone's character; and often when I believe him *headed* right, I find him out of line with the strict facts as he goes along.<sup>126</sup>

Indeed, there can be little doubt that he was anxious to prove the correctness of the stand taken by the Indian Rights Association. To do this he was under the necessity of proving his case against government inspectors like Clinton C. Duncan and S. R. Murphy. His great advantage lay in the fact that the inspectors—models of official ineptitude—do not appear to have been sufficiently interested to make a thorough study of affairs. Hardy did. Between February and July, 1895, he travelled more than eighteen hundred miles on the Navajo reservation. His long series of letters and reports furnished the Indian Rights Association with the information it required in order to agitate for assistance for the Navajo. The success of the Association in this respect is one measure of Hardy's service.

125. Welsh to Leupp, April 27, 1895, I.R.A., LB. no. 12, p. 128; Welsh to W. W. Lockwood, April 27, 1895, *ibid.*, p. 127.

126. Leupp to Welsh, December 31, 1895, I.R.A. corr. *Italics* Leupp's.