

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 88
Number 4 *Vol 88, No 4 (Fall 2013)*

Article 5

10-1-2013

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 88, 4 (2013). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol88/iss4/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

The Essential West: Collected Essays. By Elliott West, foreword by Richard White. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012. xiii + 328 pp. Half-tones, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4296-8.)

In the foreword to this terrific anthology, Richard White asserts that “Elliott West is the best historian of the American West writing today” (p. xi). This is high praise indeed, given that, as West himself points out several pages later in the introduction, of the nine monographs awarded the Bancroft Prize (presented annually by Columbia University to the best works of U.S. history, regardless of field) from 2008–2010, five went to scholars of the American West. And of course the so-called New Western historians who revived the study of the region in the 1980s—Richard White among them—continue to publish pathbreaking books of their own.

With that said, this collection of new and previously published material proves that Elliott West belongs in any such conversation. Take, for example, the sheer breadth of his interests, neatly grouped under three subheadings: conquest, families, and myth. Throughout the first section, West examines the complex processes by which the trans-Mississippi West was absorbed by the United States during the nineteenth century. In the best of these pieces, he notes that disease (or, rather, its absence) had much to do with not only the success of Lewis and Clark but also the failure of a contemporaneous expedition to the African interior, with which West very profitably compares the voyage of the Corps of Discovery. For the second group of essays, West pivots back to some of the terrain he explored earliest in his career, contemplating

the march of conquest through the eyes (and ears) of children, Natives, non-Anglo Europeans, and Mormons. In the last set of writings, West unpacks the paradoxical but enduring ways in which the frontier has served as a cultural touchstone for the entire nation, from bison to Jesse James to the fictional (but unforgettable) characters of Larry McMurtry's *Lonesome Dove*.

As always with West, perhaps even more impressive than his capacious range is his unrivaled skill with a pen. Surely no one in the field writes better, captured by his uncanny ability to find just the right metaphor or simile to fix his meaning in the mind of the reader. Take, for example, West's summation of the intricate sequence by which yellow fever appeared in the western hemisphere in 1647: "Like tumblers in a lock, the factors fell into place and the New World opened to one of history's most lethal organisms" (pp. 26–27). Or consider this unforgettable description of the quickening slaughter of buffalo by white hide hunters operating on the Great Plains during the 1870s: "This was death metronomic, less like a hunt than like a forge stamping out rivets" (p. 225).

West, then, is that rarest of breeds: the academic historian who educates and entertains, who simplifies but never condescends. This anthology is thus at once a terrific teaching tool as well as a satisfying introduction to the region for the casual lay reader. Richard White might be on to something.

Andrew R. Graybill
Southern Methodist University

The Peyote Road: Religious Freedom and the Native American Church. By Thomas C. Maroukis. The Civilization of the American Indian Series, no. 265. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012. xii + 281 pp. 11 halftones, line drawings, map, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-4323-1.)

The Peyote Road discusses the history and cultures of the Native American Church in North America and provides updates on historic and legal issues originally published by well-known scholars such as Vincenzo Petruccio, Weston La Barre, Omer Stewart, James Slotkin, and David Aberle.

The book broadly focuses on the origins and development of Peyotism, including the assault by federal and state legislators and white clerics against a prejudiced, misunderstood church that admittedly prays to Jesus Christ and ingests an hallucinogen (*Lophophora williamsii*) in the context of Native ceremonialism. Peyotism has existed in Mexico for thousands of years, but since the turn of the twentieth century, has added a Christian element.

Despite the threat of legal challenges, peyote religion has endured with little change since its introduction to the United States. By meticulously combing the literature and consulting leading Peyotists from several tribes, the author comprehensively treats these complex issues.

In his chapter “Religious Beliefs, Ceremony and Ritual,” Maroukis seeks to provide new insights as to why peyote survives into the twenty-first century. The author believes that part of peyotism’s endurance is its ability to integrate Christianity with older tribal beliefs and rituals. He compares peyote use with other tribal religious practices, which he calls “sacred commonalities” (p. 67). Such practices include, for example, the “sacred circle,” “sacred numbers,” “sacred plants,” “the vision experience,” and others such as the use of eagle feathers, eagle bone whistles, fire and fireplaces, singing and drumming, and tobacco, which he argues is a connective thread to peyotism (pp. 72, 74, 77, 80). He concludes “Peyotism had so many commonalities with prereservation spiritual beliefs that it could provide a meaningful spiritual life” (p. 87). In fact, the only reasonable comparison is between different tribes whose peyote rituals are relatively similar but whose tribal rituals are contextually distinct. Other scholars claim that it is peyote itself and its hallucinogenic effects that allow for its ecumenical success.

Curiously, most comparisons are with the Lakota, who have the least number of peyotists in the country. Circles, numbers, and plants carry different meanings for people throughout the world. For example, among the Lakota who follow the Red Road, four and seven are sacred numbers but they are frequently symbolized differentially even among spiritual leaders of the same reservation. The question is why did relatively few elect to follow the Peyote Road while the majority of Native Americans remained faithful to their Native beliefs or other religions? And, if Native traditions fulfill a people’s religious needs, why should they have to change at all? These questions aside, this is a well-written and well-illustrated book that should be read by all who follow the Peyote Road.

William K. Powers

Editor and Publisher, Lakota Books

Revolt: An Archaeological History of Pueblo Resistance and Revitalization in 17th Century New Mexico. By Matthew Liebmann. The Archaeology of Colonialism in Native North America Series. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, Published in cooperation with the William P. Clements Center for Southwest Studies, Southern Methodist University, 2012. xvii + 287 pp. 13 halftones, 13 line drawings, 10 maps, tables, graphs, notes, bibliography, index. \$50.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-2865-3, \$30.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-3086-1.)

In *Revolt*, Liebmann brings the theorizations and methodologies of Historical Anthropology to bear on the crucial period between 1680 and 1696, traditionally referred to as the Pueblo Revolt(s) and more recently as the Pueblo-Spanish War. These decades witnessed unprecedented transformation of Pueblo society and augured the beginnings of an eighteenth-century Spanish colony that would redefine the cultural landscapes of New Mexico for centuries to come. Building on the wealth of historical and archaeological scholarship on this subject during the past twenty years, Liebmann provides a valuable contribution to the literature of this period and a compelling case study for the interweaving of textual, oral, and material evidence in historical research.

While the introduction clearly lays out the study's goals, theoretical framework, and methodological underpinnings, it is the dramatic narrative of *Astialakwa* that commands the reader's attention from the very first page. Liebmann's principal goal is to explore the production and negotiation of Pueblo society and identity in the context of European colonialism. To accomplish this task, he draws on an eclectic mix of social theory from more traditional themes such as revitalization movements and ethnogenesis, to recent postcolonial concerns such as social memory and subaltern subjectivity. Somewhat remarkably, Spivak, Guha, Gramsci, Foucault, Bhabha, Todorov, Sahlins, and many other divergent theorists make cameo appearances in support of this intellectual project. Nowhere, however, does this wide-ranging theoretical exploration overwhelm the basic goals and narrative force of the study. Liebmann's focus remains on creative tensions between nativism and revivalism in the creation of tradition during the foundational period between 1680 and 1696. Through this focus, he is able to show how continuity and tradition are cultural productions, even in moments of tremendous change and social rupture.

The book is composed of an introduction and three chronologically ordered sections. Section one provides a brief background to the seventeenth-century colony that prefigures and includes the events of 1680. The second section—the book's most substantial—traces the shifts in settlement and community in the Jemez province between 1680 and 1692. It is here that the

archaeological evidence makes its strongest appearance. Liebmann uses architectural and ceramic data to explore the reconfigurations of settlement and symbol that characterize this time period. He ably extends this analysis into the final section treating the period between 1692 and 1696. Throughout, the study demonstrates the value of material and oral evidence in understanding this period. Even those quite familiar with the documentary record of the Pueblo-Spanish War will find this study valuable for the new evidence and perspectives it provides on older source materials. While Liebmann successfully negotiates his central theoretical goal, this study can quite comfortably be read for its substantive contribution and narrative power even by those with little interest in postcolonial theory.

Mark T. Lycett

University of Chicago

We Will Secure Our Future: Empowering the Navajo Nation. By Peterson Zah and Peter Iverson. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2012. xvii + 196 pp. 40 halftones, maps, appendix, notes, for further reading, illustration credits, index, about the authors. \$40.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-0246-2, \$17.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-0247-9.)

The Navajo Nation has witnessed rapid, significant change during the last forty years with dramatic shifts in the trading-post culture, advancements in education, changes in the legal system, reorganization of government, loss and addition of lands, disputes with neighbors, and the accession of twenty-first century technology. Peterson Zah was present for all of it and often involved, playing a prominent role as executive director of DNA (Navajo Legal Services), president of the Navajo Nation, and facilitator of Indian education at Arizona State University. Historian Peter Iverson, author of the best comprehensive Diné history, *Diné: A History of the Navajos* (2002), and associate of Zah (both worked at ASU and retired around the same time), seized the opportunity to conduct a number of interviews with Zah. The result: an inside view of a prominent Native leader's perspective.

Based on a series of discussions, the material for this book is shaped by two voices: Iverson's, who asks the questions and provides a framework; and that of Zah, who shares his insight. It is not a scholarly book in the sense of being heavily endnoted (there are only thirty-seven notes, which primarily reference other works by Iverson). It is not a narrow treatise of a particular topic (the book ranges from general Navajo history to a wide variety of contemporary events). And it is not polemical (although Zah had his fair share of battles as both an

advocate for change and Navajo Nation president). But it does provide rich insight into one man's life spent on behalf of his people. The material should be viewed as an internal dialogue reporting tough issues and decisions made during a time of flux.

Some readers may not agree. Those who faced Zah in the days of sometimes-hostile DNA legal confrontations, the traders who saw their world shift after nearly one hundred years of stasis, or Native and non-Native leaders who disagreed with his approach to problem solving, may dispute some of his points. But if there was one polestar that guided him through the surrounding tumult, it was the traditional teachings and background that laid the foundation for his approach. Zah candidly admits that his early years were not ones he wished to return to, but they were seminal in establishing the strength of character that carried him through the business of his later life. Indeed, if there is one message he wants to share it is that today there is a desperate need for the younger generation to get back to their cultural roots to understand and practice who they are—not as a return to the past, but as a pathway to a winning character for the future.

This book is recommended for students of Southwest and Navajo history and those interested in leadership. Iverson and Zah provide a source for young people to contemplate as they take the reins of ownership in the twenty-first century.

Robert S. McPherson
Utah State University, Blanding Campus

Where the Earth and Sky Are Sewn Together: Sobaipuri-O'odham Contexts of Contact and Colonialism. By Deni J. Seymour. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2011. xv + 321 pp. 63 halftones, line drawings, 44 maps, charts, tables, references cited, index. \$60.00 cloth, ISBN 978-1-60871-067-4.)

Since the beginning of the Age of Discovery, it is remarkable how often missionaries and explorers got things wrong. Or, did they? This is particularly salient for archaeologists and historians, who upon interpreting the accounts and maps of early colonizers, find that identifying the routes they travelled and the locations they visited is more than a little challenging. Yet, we still do it, and not just for the thrill of rediscovery. Ground-truthing the historical record engages these accounts and makes them all the more relevant. For all the indigenous places and peoples the European invaders encountered, there were many more never identified but influential nonetheless. For these places and peoples, we have only archaeology.

Deni J. Seymour's restless monograph, *Where the Earth and Sky Are Sewn Together*, draws on this tension, providing an unprecedented summation of archaeological and historical data regarding the Sobaipuri-O'odham of southern Arizona. Based on twenty-five years of archaeological work in and around the San Pedro River valley, Seymour provides, in thirteen chapters, a detailed historical and archaeological context of the Sobaipuri and their relationship to contemporaneous expressions of O'odham culture and the ancestral Hohokam culture. In addition to discussions of material culture, house construction, domestic space, dating, and land use, Seymour provides data-rich descriptions of key archaeological sites, such as Guevavi, San Cayetano de Tumacácori, Quiburi, Santa Cruz de Gaybanipitea, among others. Chronologically, the study centers on the protohistoric to historic divide encompassing the Cayetano Complex spanning roughly the late thirteenth to late seventeenth centuries. Her exhaustive compilation of information is the book's core contribution, which will appeal to an eager audience of archaeologists, historians, and O'odhams.

Seymour's work has teeth. She attacks Kino-centrism and the numerous factual errors that have tarnished public and academic fascination for Father Eusebio Kino, Arizona's mission history, and academic awareness of the Sobaipuri. Seymour updates and revises previous archaeological interpretations of such luminaries as Emil Haury and Charles Di Peso as a means of developing her own "Archaeologically Based History" (p. 14). Theoretically and methodologically, her work is consistent with current approaches in historical archaeology, many of which seek to emancipate undocumented peoples from the tyranny of European accounts. Seymour acknowledges that, however transformed by time, the descendants of the Sobaipuri persist to this day, as do those of the Kohatk, Hia-ced, Akimel, Tohono, and other regional and historical expressions of shared O'odham tradition, history, and culture.

Some readers may find this book controversial, and as the author's dedication and the heading to Chapter 12, "Contrarian Perspectives on Sobaipuri Transformation," implies, Seymour expects it. Perhaps, as one of Haury's last students, the author has difficulty assaulting old doctrines, but for this reviewer her observations seemed less heretical and more like critical reevaluation. Clearly there is still much to learn about the Sobaipuri-O'odham culture. For all readers, *Where the Earth and Sky Are Sewn Together* will enlighten. For some, it will provoke — and for that, Dr. Seymour might agree, "Heretics welcome."

J. Andrew Darling

Southwest Heritage Research, LLC/Southern Methodist University

The Daring Flight of My Pen: Cultural Politics and Gaspar Pérez De Villagrà's Historia De La Nueva Mexico, 1610. By Genaro M. Padilla. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2010. xiv + 153 pp. Line drawings, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4970-5.)

Gaspar de Villagrà's *Historia de la Nueva Mexico* (1610) has endured centuries of negative criticism. Since the 1990s, however, renewed critical interest has yielded more positive studies, including five new editions and two monographs: this reviewer's *Gaspar de Villagrà: Legista, soldado y poeta* (2009), and now Genaro Padilla's book. Like Villagrà's *Historia*, Padilla's is a hybrid text that combines literary analysis with cultural and family history. From that perspective, Padilla offers a compelling analysis of the *Historia*, and he is able to supplement critical rigor with conjecture in ways that a different approach would not have permitted. This makes for a lively text that effectively brings the past to the present.

Building on previous scholarship, Padilla perceives a tripartite structure in the *Historia*, and he organizes his analysis around those parts. In Chapter 1, the author considers the first third of the poem, in which he recognizes "an embryonic mestizo subjectivity" (p. 35). Padilla reflects on the reclamation of the poem in our own days, astutely noting how it challenges a heroic colonial fantasy common in New Mexico. In his opinion, the massacre of Acoma and Villagrà's presentation of Oñate as a weak leader preclude a celebratory appropriation. Chapter 2 centers on the establishment of a Spanish settlement. Padilla continues his criticism of "historical amnesia" by contrasting contemporary representations of that event to Villagrà's epic (p. 46). He reads the *Historia* as exposing "a foundation of deceit and fracture within the Spanish camp that troubles any facile reading of the epic as a panegyric," not unlike Virgil's double-edged encomium of Augustus (p. 46). Elaborating on my study of Villagrà's interpolation of legal texts, Padilla also discusses an "indirect poetics of ambivalence and derision" that Villagrà employs to criticize the Spanish camp while expressing admiration for the Native world (p. 58). The final chapter focuses on the battle of Acoma, which Padilla analyzes as an instance of butchery by a superior military machine. For Padilla, this ending offers Villagrà a space for representing culpability, suggesting that the *Historia* was its author's way of coping with guilt for his participation in a campaign he saw with critical eyes. This original thesis is supplemented in the "Epilogue" by an emotional turn that offers the responses to the poem of Padilla's mother and of Acoma poet Simon J. Ortiz.

The Daring Flight of My Pen presents a cohesive interpretation of Villagrà's *Historia*, but some of its insights may need further elaboration. For example,

Padilla strongly suggests a personal falling-out between Villagr  and O ate that the historical record does not support: after leaving New Mexico in 1600, Villagr  continued working for O ate's army from New Spain, and later, in Spain, he represented O ate's interests for five years. Padilla also asserts that Villagr  wrote his poem in Spain but, as I have documented elsewhere, the *Historia* was penned in New Spain, which, incidentally, strengthens any analysis of Villagr 's *criollismo*.

Overall, this book is a substantial contribution to the study of Villagr  and his poem. To his solid critical apparatus, Padilla adds the cultural authority of a Nuevomexicano for whom the *Historia* is an ambivalent foundational text. As a result, the book is also a must for scholars interested in the recovery of the U.S. Hispanic literary heritage.

Manuel M. Mart n-Rodr guez

University of California, Merced

The Writings of Eusebio Chac n. Reintroduced, translated, and edited by A. Gabriel Mel ndez and Francisco A. Lomel . Pas  por Aqu  Series. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2012. xiii + 273 pp. 15 halftones, appendixes. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5100-5.)

A triumph of archival research, *The Writings of Eusebio Chac n* provides historical context and translation of Chac n's previously published and lesser-known work. Mel ndez and Lomel  have produced a useful collection, accessible to students and scholars alike. The book's logical organization, rhetorical focus, and regional situation are a welcome addition to the field of early studies of Mexican American writers and thinkers.

Because he was writing in Spanish at the turn of the twentieth century, scholars have occasionally overlooked Chac n's contribution to the Latino literary canon. Work on other early writers from California, Texas, or New Mexico, has overshadowed Chac n's oeuvre. This valuable collection rectifies that omission by providing a coherent, useful presentation of Chac n's variety of textual production. The book's most worthwhile contribution in this regard is the authors' archival work to collect and situate Chac n's student writing in relation to his later essays. The student essays reveal Chac n's defense of a Mexican literary tradition despite Mexico's distance from Spain and his own distance from his home. The first move Mel ndez and Lomel  make then is to not only assert Chac n's importance to Mexican American literary history but also to show how he was invested in the long trajectory of Latin American literature and culture.

The organization of the text indicates several points that Meléndez and Lomelí want to make. Chacón's essays that appear in the third part of the book are his best-known writings. The editors made a good choice to de-center these essays in the collection; in this way, readers can draw their own conclusions as they progress through the text. Meléndez argues that the compilation shores up the intellectual currents between northern New Mexico and southern Colorado, thereby expanding the regional interest and focus of the book. He persuasively declares, "Here was a generation not simply concerned with announcing grievances but one committed to a program of social and cultural empowerment" (p. 5). Additionally, Lomelí seeks to establish Chacón as the originator of the New Mexican novel. The novels included support this argument, but the essays, poems, and early student work show Chacón's wide literary ambitions and talents. The letters included in an appendix show Chacón's sense of humor: "I don't particularly relish the role of playing wet-nurse to a litter of cats, but my cup of chagrin has to be kept filled" (p. 250). Overall, the collection rounds out Chacón's body of work to include much more than his famous speech.

Meléndez and Lomelí have made an important contribution to the study of Mexican American literary production with this book. The work is more than regionally valuable to New Mexico—it has the potential to open new avenues of scholarly inquiry into the broader Southwest intellectual history.

Leigh Johnson
Marymount University

Religious Lessons: Catholic Sisters and the Captured Schools Crisis in New Mexico. By Kathleen Holscher. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. xii + 260 pp. 13 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN-978-0-19-978173-7.)

The recently closed traveling exhibit "Women and Spirit: Catholic Sisters in America" provided many individuals, including Catholics, a more sophisticated understanding of the agency of nuns in American life. This acclaimed display built on the efforts of historians who for nearly a generation have chronicled the activities and challenges of religious sisters in the United States who extended the reach and influence of the Catholic Church into every corner of the nation. Vowed women not only served their co-religionists, but were sometimes among the first to provide critical social services—often health care and orphanages—before public agencies could do so. In a number of places, Catholic sisters also functioned as public school teachers, often in

impoverished or rural areas where civil leaders were unable or unwilling to assume the responsibility. Most of the stories of these women were positive and accentuated, as did the museum display, the extent to which they served critical human needs and were not bound by strict denominational loyalties. Likewise, the agency of these women underscored their ability to make critical decisions that were often reserved to men, especially in a patriarchal American society and the Catholic Church.

Kathleen Holscher's book provides another viewpoint on the agency of sisters—one not-so-celebratory—by chronicling the escalating dispute over their presence in some of New Mexico's public schools. Opposition to sisters developed among a determined body of citizens who objected not only on the basis of the separation of church and state, but also for rather blatantly anti-Catholic reasons. Controversy and litigation over the habited nuns in one public school, a Catholic building in the tiny community of Dixon (but in other places in New Mexico as well), culminated in the case of *Zellers v. Huff* (1948). The lower state courts eventually ruled against these arrangements. This judgment was upheld by the New Mexico Supreme Court in 1951.

Holscher provides a very good backdrop to all phases of the case, which is especially helpful to those unfamiliar with the formation and practices of nuns and the organizational structure of the Catholic Church. She also probes the motivations of the Catholic actors and their Protestant antagonists as well as the various legal arguments of the case, situating them in the context of church-state litigation argued before the U.S. Supreme Court after World War II.

She argues correctly that this particular case was but one phase of the very active legal and rhetorical war that took place between Protestants and Catholics in the post-war period. Opponents of these nun-directed public schools reached back to the anti-Catholic invective of the nineteenth century and tagged them “captured schools”—a term often deployed in the hateful literature and public discourse of “former” nuns who claimed that convents and Catholic institutions were like penitentiaries where children and young women were held against their will and brainwashed to accept Catholic dogma.

Holscher is remarkably even-handed. The sisters left behind many good memories of their years in the schools (wonderfully captured by the author's deft oral history work), but also violated the delicate boundary between church and state and proselytized their young charges. Holscher's depiction of Lydia Zeller or her allies in the Protestants and Other Americans United for Separation of Church and State (POAU) is hardly sympathetic. These were not faithful guardians of the separation of church and state, but rather small-minded people who trafficked in the worst stereotypes and caricatures

of Catholicism and religious sisters to achieve their ends. The sisters made their mistakes and in the end it was a good thing that they left the schools. However, the verbal barbs and obloquy both sides hurled at the other were not symmetrical—the sisters received far more than they gave. Church-state separation never needed the admixture of religious bigotry to make its case.

Apart from some minor editorial issues (the surnames of religious sisters are not always provided but just their religious or baptismal names), Holscher's book adds a richer understanding of church-state issues after World War II, the history of women religious in the American West, and the history of New Mexico.

Steven M. Avella
Marquette University

Frontier Naturalist: Jean Louis Berlandier and the Exploration of Northern Mexico and Texas. By Russell M. Lawson (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2012. xxi + 262 pp. Half-tones, 10 maps, appendixes, notes, sources consulted, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5217-0.)

Russell M. Lawson has performed a tour-de-force integration of subjective travel notes and scientific information gathered by Jean Louis Berlandier during his journeys of exploration across Mexico and Texas between 1827 and 1851. Following Napoleon's defeat at Waterloo and Mexico's independence from Spain, national boundaries in Europe and North America repeatedly came into question. Territorial ambition and intellectual curiosity led to the formation of the Mexican Boundary Commission under Manuel Mier y Terán in 1826. The Minister of Foreign Affairs, Lucas Alamán, requested that [his former] professor Alphonse de Candolle in Geneva, suggest a qualified "life scientist" to join the expedition. Berlandier, a Frenchman, had demonstrated exceptional competence in botany to Condolle. Accepting commissions from both Condolle and Alamán to gather botanical specimens in Mexico, Berlandier joined Terán's commission as a civilian scientist. The healthy young bachelor arrived in Mexico in December 1826. Curious and pragmatic, he observed and noted, collected and sorted, and often interviewed subjects throughout his lifetime. He never returned to Europe. Berlandier's collected observations comprise history's initial scientific descriptions of northern Mexico.

Berlandier's work has heretofore appeared in English in two magna opera of illustrated reference publications and a handful of scholarly articles. Lawson's narrative selectively exploits earlier publications, but he eschews

the traditional arrangement of an erudite biographical introduction followed by Berlandier's copiously annotated scientific observations. Instead, Lawson launches into an integrated narrative that flows chronologically while obeying the physical itinerary of Berlandier's journeys. Lawson comments and explains en route. Significantly, Lawson introduces Darius Nash Couch even before presenting Berlandier. He thus pays tribute to the unsung hero who helped ensure the survival of the Berlandier collections and their arrival to the United States. Lawson's accessible and scholarly text fills a lacuna in Berlandier studies between erudite specialists narrowly focused on a pet branch of scientific investigation on the one hand, and children's literature on the other hand, where authors such as Betsy Warren place Berlandier among other naturalists exploring Texas (*Wilderness Walkers: Naturalists in Early Texas*, 1987). Unfortunately, among his sources Lawson fails to include local historians such as Terán's biographer, Jack Jackson, whose in-depth knowledge of Mexican and Texas politics as well as Berlandier's papers, would have added authenticity to *Frontier Naturalist*. Occasionally the author uses vague language. His reference to the Trinity River — "like most Western rivers during springtime" — leaves the reader asking west of what, in a book about Mexico and Texas (p. 76). He mentions "lupines" several times before pointing out that they are bluebonnets, flowers sacred to Texans.

Berlandier's objective descriptions of various tribes create distinctions seldom perceived by observers who saw only "savages." His positive attention to oft-ignored Kickapoo peoples piqued my curiosity. Lawson selects memorable details from Berlandier's encyclopedic notations blending botany, medicine, and native wisdom. Mastodon bones are unearthed while anecdotes about perpetual horse thievery lace through the chapters. The reader learns to use pulverized mountain laurel seed to kill head lice, but freedom from mosquito bites remains impossible. Lawson respects the Romantic generation's mentalité of seeking extensive enlightenment and recording subjective interaction with observed natural phenomena without attempting to bleach out such notions as "the sublime." Objective notations and calculations capture irretrievable details about Texas weather, augmented by descriptions of the rain's impact on travel through mud and across rivers. One easily envisions Terán's ridiculous carriage, often stuck in the mud. Omnipresent flies and mosquitoes play the role of villains that harass and take down the heroes with their natural weapons: all commissioners contract malaria, Berlandier worst of all because he was European. In 1851 Berlandier drowned in a swollen river, leaving his work unfinished. Thanks to Couch, however, the physical collection documenting people and places Berlandier explored provides scientists and historians irreplaceable information. Lawson has integrated the

disparate components into a readable exposition of an individual's remarkable journey.

Betje B. Klier

Latin Gulf South Research, Austin, Texas

The Brothers Robidoux and the Opening of the American West. By Robert J. Willoughby. (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2012. xiii + 252 pp. 15 halftones, maps, chart, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8262-1991-6.)

The adventurous Robidoux brothers “epitomize the spirit of the American West,” glowingly concludes Robert Willoughby (p. 212). The brothers were given to gambling and excessive drinking; some were polygamous and engaged in other less than honorable activities. Nonetheless, their contributions to the opening of the American West far outweigh their failings, according to the author. They were explorers, guides, public servants, and town builders. As polyglots, they skillfully wielded multilingual skills and marriages to Indian and Mexican women to their advantage. As risktakers, they were engaged in various kinds of entrepreneurial activities besides fur trading. Self-described as a “merchant and a trader,” Joseph Robidoux III was a veteran of the lower Missouri fur trade and founder of St. Joseph, jumping-off point for the overland trail (p. 21). He was the family patriarch, directing the far-flung activities of his five younger brothers: Francois, Isadore, Antoine, Louis, and Michel. In the mid-1820s Louis and Antoine expanded trade operations on the Santa Fe Trail, became naturalized Mexican citizens, and established fur-trading posts in the intermountain West. Louis ultimately moved to Southern California and became a major landowner. The other brothers centered their energies on a trading post in the vicinity of Scott's Bluff at mid-century. In 1971 overland trails expert Merrell Mattes aptly identified the continental wanderings of the Robidoux brothers as a family affair.

This collective biography corrects the historical record. According to Mattes, Joseph Robidoux III's biographer, the Robidoux family's contributions to fur trade history have long been underappreciated. The most original part of the book is Willoughby's insightful chapter on their father, Joseph Robidoux II. An early resident of St. Louis, he was a powerful role model: he adeptly straddled the law and national allegiances—as well as relations with multiple women—and was a tenacious and resourceful competitor in the late eighteenth-century fur trade. *The Brothers Robidoux* adds weight to Jay Gitlin's recent argument in *The Bourgeois Frontier* (2010) about the

significance of St. Louis's entrepreneurial middling class to the history of the Trans-Mississippi West. Like the Chouteaus, the Robidouxes were venture capitalists. Unfortunately, Willoughby is the victim of his sparse sources. Though the book is reasonably well-researched, Willoughby is unable to elaborate on the brothers' individual personalities, changing fortunes, or family lives. This is frustrating for those who might expect more from the book's title. Other biographers are more precise and discriminating in sifting through the historical record and clearer in their interpretations. *The Brothers Robidoux* includes no new biographical information.

Willoughby's inclusion of many lengthy direct quotations from primary sources provides some compensation for his dearth of sources. Setting the brothers' activities against the well-known events of the Missouri fur trade as it expanded into the Rocky Mountains, the book is as much a synthesis of the fur trade as it is a collective biography. As such, it has a dated quality, reprising the actions of the era's reckless breed of men. The book also suffers from multiple typographic errors, inconsistencies in spelling, conjectures, and occasional misdirection.

Tanis C. Thorne

University of California, Irvine

Short Nights of the Shadow Catcher: The Epic Life and Immortal Photographs of Edward Curtis. By Timothy Egan. (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2012. 370 pp. 38 halftones, acknowledgments, sources, photo credits, index. \$28.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-618-96902-9, \$15.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-544-10276-7.)

Timothy Egan's *Short Nights of the Shadow Catcher* describes the career of Edward Curtis, the most renowned and infamous photographer of Native Americans in the twentieth century. The book begins with the story of the production of Curtis' first photograph of a Native American — "Princess Angeline" of the Duwamish and Suquamish people, whom he photographed in 1896. Egan's book then proceeds to chronologically track the events and interactions that led to the production of *The North American Indian*, a multivolume compendium of what Curtis and others (including Theodore Roosevelt and J. P. Morgan) thought of as a late-hour attempt to capture photographically what was left of Native Americans across the American West before their cultures were lost forever. Egan described this multi-year, million-dollar effort (by today's standards) with rapturous admiration. Indeed, the thesis of this book is that Curtis created "the largest, most comprehensive and ambitious photographic odyssey in American history," that his life was "epic," and his photographs "immortal" (p. 20).

Egan's notion that Curtis should be considered a heroic figure who sought to save the old ways of a dying people was certainly the photographer's own perception of himself and his career, and it has been the received wisdom from early scholarship on the photographer to highlight his noblesse oblige in contrast to the increasing degradation of Native peoples in the early twentieth century. While such early takes on Curtis have historiographical significance, more nuanced approaches to understanding his work have been undertaken since—essays from the surviving relatives of those pictured in Curtis's work, and from scholars specializing in western Americana who have questioned Curtis's methods of data collection and examined the power relationship inherent in this type of photography. For example, Egan gives a nod to the contentious theory of the vanishing Indian, but neither wholly embraces it, redefines it, nor strives to discredit it. Egan also paints Curtis as singular, failing to acknowledge the downright craze for photographing Indians in that era. Egan neither wades into the complex discourse of Curtis studies nor demonstrates an appropriate criticality—perhaps not to detract from the “great man” thesis. Additionally, *Short Nights of the Shadow Catcher* is woefully underillustrated. Not only is this frustrating for the reader, but demonstrates a lack of understanding of the historical relevance of photographs as primary documents in and of themselves.

Short Nights of the Shadow Catcher is written for a lay audience. While Egan sensationalizes Curtis's history to appeal to a broad readership he does so with a plethora of primary sources which he weaves together to create a solid narrative. Egan presents a good story, but for those in the fields of Western history, art history, American studies, anthropology, and ethnic studies, it is not a new one.

Rachel M. Sailor
University of Wyoming

Deliverance from the Little Big Horn: Doctor Henry Porter and Custer's Seventh Cavalry. By Joan Nabseth Stevenson. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012. xv + 213 pp. 20 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, acknowledgments, index. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4266-1.)

More than 130 years after Lakota and Cheyenne warriors defeated Lt. Col. George Armstrong Custer and the Seventh Cavalry, the Battle of the Little Big Horn continues to be a subject of great interest to the reading public. *Deliverance from the Little Big Horn: Doctor Henry Porter and Custer's Seventh Cavalry*, by Joan Nabseth Stevenson, is a volume that will undoubtedly add

to the battle's enduring allure. Stevenson, who holds a doctorate in Slavic Languages and Literature from Stanford, has crafted a concise and compelling biography that showcases the extraordinary heroism of contract surgeon Dr. Henry Porter during and after the epic battle. As the only member of the Seventh Cavalry's medical staff to survive the opening phases of the battle, the responsibility for rendering medical care to Maj. Marcus Reno's command fell entirely to Dr. Porter. During the two days of fighting, with "as many as 2,000 Indian warriors menacing them from all sides," Stevenson details the extraordinary circumstances the doctor confronted as he treated the injuries of sixty-eight wounded troopers and two Indian scouts (p. xiii). Lacking adequate medical supplies and equipment, suffering from water shortages and extreme heat, and exposed to constant gunfire from Indian rifles, Porter performed a number of surgeries under the crudest conditions with little regard for his own safety.

Displaying a thorough knowledge of nineteenth-century medical procedures, the author provides an insightful examination of the methods employed by Porter to treat the injured, as well as explaining the limitations and inherent dangers of those treatments given the state of medicine in 1876. It is a testament to Stevenson's strength as a writer that she ably weaves her knowledge of these procedures into the narrative without sacrificing the pace or drama of the larger story. Furthermore, Stevenson's mastery of sources allows her to offer a fresh interpretation of the fighting that took place away from Custer and his doomed command. While her conclusions are hardly novel, her efforts to characterize the Seventh Cavalry as a factious unit are convincing. Specifically, Stevenson suggests that the memory of Maj. Joel Elliott, killed at the Washita in 1868, crowded the minds of Reno and Capt. Frederick Benteen with fears that they too had been abandoned by the glory-hunting Custer. As a result, neither officer made any serious attempt to move beyond the hilltop where they would make their defensive stand.

Stevenson's biography illustrates the service and dedication provided to the U.S. Army by contract surgeons during the late nineteenth century. Denied the rank and respect of commissioned officers, the possibility of promotion or pension, and forced to endure the hardships of military service, the author argues that these committed professionals performed an essential duty for the Army with little hope of recognition or reward. As noted by the author, in 1898, Porter was nominated for the Medal of Honor for his heroic work during the Battle of the Little Big Horn, but "nothing came of the proposal" (p. xv).

Jeffrey V. Pearson
Arkansas Tech University

Desert Visions and the Making of Phoenix, 1860–2009. By Philip R. VanderMeer. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2010. xvii + 459 pp. 21 halftones, line drawings, 12 maps, 18 tables, graphs, notes, index. \$39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4891-3, \$34.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-4892-0.)

VanderMeer's *Desert Visions and the Making of Phoenix* is a lengthy survey of the role of leadership in Phoenix's transformation from a small farming community to the nation's fifth largest city. In a three-part narrative—"The First Desert Vision: An American Eden"; "Creating and Pursuing a New Vision, 1940–1960"; "Elaborating and Modifying the High-Tech Suburban Vision"—VanderMeer examines three developmental visions that shaped the desert metropolis. These temporally defined meta-visions were the tools of elites who sought to grow the city's economy and to determine its physical form, politics, and culture.

In each era, VanderMeer describes how leaders reckoned with environmental constraints as they adopted various models of economic development and experimented with new urban forms. Phoenix's early Anglo settlers imported a pastoral dream of "An American Eden" in which hardworking ingenious people would turn the desert into profitable farms. Through intensive irrigation, they created new ecosystems, establishing the basis of an agricultural empire while providing the town site with greenery and shade. Early boosters also "redefined harsh as healthy," touting the benefits of the region's punishing "dry heat" and marketing Phoenix as an "Oasis City" for health seekers (p. 9).

VanderMeer builds on the work of urban historians Gerald Nash and Carl Abbott, who established the centrality of federal spending and the role of public-private partnerships in the development of western cities after 1941. "World War II," he acknowledges, "provided lessons in development," but the primary reason for the city's growth after 1940 was the adoption of a "high tech suburban vision" (p. 105). Emphasizing the intentional, comprehensive nature of planning from 1940–1960, VanderMeer argues that a "holistic" style of city management by a "cohesive leadership group" of department store owners, builders, bankers, and lawyers explains Phoenix's rapid growth (pp. 116, 181). To promote an economy based on aviation, computers, and semiconductors, and to encourage suburban development, leaders advocated for "citywide governance, an emphasis on administrative autonomy and inexpensive city services, aggressive annexation, community development and affordable housing, and the development of cultural institutions" (p. 6).

VanderMeer's most important contribution is his analysis of the post-1960 transformation in urban governance and the simultaneous evolution of Phoenix's multimodal urban form. He argues that residents influenced by

social movements demanded greater participation in local government. In the late 1970s voters eschewed the charter system in favor of a district system of representation, and city government “moved beyond its initial, limited definition of city services to include actions relevant to social issues and problems” (p. 185). While he explains that Phoenix adopted a more splintered, yet more democratic, approach to city planning, VanderMeer focuses almost solely on elected officials, rarely identifying the social activists who pressed for more participatory government.

VanderMeer’s claim that developers played a major role in addressing social and environmental critiques about sprawl moves the scholarship on urban sustainability in new directions. The affordability of land and sustained population growth in Phoenix allowed developers to evolve from building houses in subdivisions to more comprehensive projects of community building. As they experimented with retirement communities, New Towns, planned communities, and super suburbs, developers reconceptualized suburban designs and reevaluated the “structure of neighborhoods” in the city (p. 210). Government also played a role in crafting a contemporary vision for a “centripetal urban model” after 1980 by promoting downtown, the biotech industry, and professional sports teams (p. 324). The city adopted development impact fees, revised building standards, and decreased lot sizes to increase population density; it also took steps to decrease pollution, reduce the urban heat island effect, and manage water consumption.

Desert Visions is an urban biography, but it warrants a broad audience as VanderMeer situates Phoenix’s history within the context of region and makes clear the influence of both the regional environment and other western cities on Phoenix’s growth and development. Western historians and urban studies scholars who seek to understand the politics of growth will appreciate *Desert Visions*. Urban planners and city officials will find VanderMeer’s ideas about Phoenix’s path to a more democratic and sustainable future provocative and useful.

Amy Scott

Bradley University

Politics, Labor, and the War on Big Business: The Path of Reform in Arizona, 1890–1920. By David R. Berman. (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2012, xiii + 330 pp. 17 halftones, maps. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-1-6073-2181-1.)

The title of political scientist David R. Berman’s book succinctly describes its subject. From 1890 to 1917, politics in the territory of Arizona and later the

state (post-1912) featured persistent conflict between a majority of its residents, especially those who toiled in its mines and on its railroads and who joined militant trade unions, notably the Western Federation of Miners (WFM and, after 1911, the International Union of Mine, Mill, and Smelter Workers), and the large corporations that controlled the most productive copper mines and managed the Southern Pacific and Atchison, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railroads. In Arizona Territory, as in other western hard-rock mining states, Populism developed as a labor and union-based movement rather than as an agrarian revolt. Its adherents sought to regulate railroads and mining companies and also to open politics to popular influence through the referendum, initiative, and recall of public officials, including judges. The territory's radical political tendencies and its citizens' aversion to Republican Party interests forestalled Arizona statehood in Republican-dominated Washington. Such resistance grew when the territory's delegates to a constitutional convention drafted a document that included the referendum, the initiative, and recall as well as other radical features that benefitted workers.

As explained by Berman, Arizona's Republican Party favored the railroad and mining corporations while the Democratic Party split between a conservative minority that supported business interests and a "radical" majority influenced by Populism, socialism, and trade unionism. Between 1912 and 1916 radical Democrats dominated state politics as personified by Gov. George W. Hunt, who castigated the railroads and the mining corporations. By 1912 Arizona's politics had grown so radicalized that William Howard Taft, the Republican candidate for president, received fewer popular votes than his Democratic, Progressive, and Socialist opponents. After the United States declared war in April 1917, Arizona Republicans and their corporate allies used the crisis to delegitimize their trade union and Democratic adversaries, attack Hunt, smash the mining unions, deport nearly 1,500 unionists, and fasten a "copper collar" on the state's citizens. Such is the tale told by Berman.

The book reminds readers that a century ago Arizonans elected a Democratic governor who railed against the one percent, defended the ninety-nine percent, and condemned the influence of corporate money on state politics. Unfortunately, Berman leaves much unexplained. He suggests that Arizona's Mexican American citizens leaned Republican, perhaps because the territory's Democrats and Anglo trade unionists were racist. After statehood, however, the Hunt Democrats and the WFM sought Hispanic support. Berman fails to explain why Hispanics joined the unions but rejected Democratic courtiers. He provides little detailed and longitudinal voting data; the book is bereft of quantitative election analysis by precinct, ethnicity, race, class, or gender. It lacks concrete information about common workers, instead using

union publications and policy statements as proxies for miners and union members. Berman's leaden prose, moreover, will discourage many readers from discovering the real value in his narrative.

Melvyn Dubofsky, Emeritus
Binghamton University, SUNY

Last Water on the Devil's Highway: A Cultural and Natural History of Tinajas Altas. By Bill Broyles, Gayle Harrison Hartmann, Thomas E. Sheridan, Gary Paul Nabhan, and Mary Charlotte Thurtle. The Southwest Center Series. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2012. xiii + 275 pp. Color plates, 144 halftones, line drawings, 26 maps, tables, appendixes, references, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-2964-3, \$26.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-3083-0.)

Last Water on the Devil's Highway is the story of "a series of waterholes in the hottest and most arid part of North America" (p. xiii). The Tinajas Altas are a grouping of natural rock basins that loom large in Borderland history. The Tinajas are not just waterholes; for millennia they have been a unique natural and cultural site supporting "a rich diversity of life" (p. 184). The authors expertly collaborate in documenting this strangely beautiful but inhospitable area of the Sonoran Desert, a place unlike any in the world.

Last Water includes five chapters and five appendixes. In "Desert Water," Broyles, Hartmann, and Sheridan describe the physical environment of the Tinajas as part of a network of waterholes along El Camino del Diablo. Ciphering firsthand accounts, readers "feel like pioneers" following in the footsteps of the hardy, adventurous, and inquisitive indigenous, European, and American sojourners (p. 9). In "Native People," Hartmann, Thurtle, and Nabhan examine the indigenous presence in the Tinajas. The Hia C'ed O'odham and Quechan histories are replete with cultural references to the Tinajas and remind us that the "perennial water (of the desert) . . . is of profound importance" (p. 69).

In "The First Europeans," Sheridan and Broyles chronicle Spanish and American forays to and near the Tinajas. The authors painstakingly examine scores of diaries and, using GPS and triangulation mapping, conclude that not all sojourners imbibed the waters of the Tinajas Altas, contrary to their diaries. In "Surveyors to Campers," Broyles and Hartmann bring the narrative to the present. Once described as "forbidding" and "harsh," travelers in later years saw the "beauty [and] adventure" of the Tinajas Altas (p. 115). Geologists, botanists, surveyors, and cartographers invaded the region, later joined by federal agents, archeologists, campers, hunters, and journalists. By

weaving their reports and studies into the story, the authors enable the reader to experience the Tinajas Altas vicariously. In “Natural History,” Broyles elaborates on the natural history of the area, with five appendixes providing the reader with a wealth of scientific data on the plants, mammals, birds, and reptiles of the Tinajas Altas.

Last Water is necessary reading on “a signature waterhole on a heritage trail that covers millennia of Southwest history” (p. 191). The authors meticulously analyze the contradictions and amazements of the Tinajas Altas, always underscoring the fragility of life in the desert. They make a convincing case that the Tinajas Altas “should be a National Register nomination . . . as a Traditional Cultural Property” (p. 191). The Tinajas Altas is a place of great value, reminding us of the importance of physical, cultural, and spiritual places.

David H. DeJong

Director, Pima-Maricopa Irrigation Project, Gila River Indian Community

Pregnancy, Motherhood, and Choice in Twentieth-Century Arizona. By Mary S. Melcher. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2012. x + 248 pp. 10 half-tones, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$50.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-2846-2.)

Mary S. Melcher’s history has four great strengths. First, by integrating birth control with maternal and infant health, she offers a holistic treatment of reproductive matters, in contrast to other studies that treat birth control as an exclusively anti-natal policy. Second, she joins a few other historians in examining reproductive health clinics in practice, as opposed to earlier studies that surveyed the national history. Third, Melcher pays particular attention to racial, ethnic, and religious minorities. And fourth, her extensive research not only illuminates much about Arizona but could also be usefully compared with other locations.

Starting before Arizona became a state, Melcher sets the context: a desert territory, thinly populated, with undeveloped transportation and isolated settlements. Female friends and midwives typically delivered babies. As late as the 1930s, infant mortality in Arizona was the highest in the nation. Meanwhile, birth rates among American Indians and Mexican Americans remained high. State and federal attempts to reduce infant mortality in the 1920s largely bypassed these groups.

After Margaret Sanger moved to Tucson in 1934, elite white women created the first birth control clinics. In Phoenix, the key founders and funders were Peggy Goldwater, wife of Barry Goldwater, and the wives of the owners of the

city's largest bank and newspaper (a reminder of the difference between the Republican Party then and now). This stratum of rich women deserves our respect. Unfortunately, Melcher fails to note the class politics of reproductive health as she does its racial politics. While elite women sought to introduce birth control to women of color, they did not—at least not in Melcher's evidence—devote comparable effort to more broadly improve the health and welfare of minority people. Thus the clinic strategy provides some basis for minority suspicions of birth control as an effort to reduce their numbers in relation to whites. Melcher provides useful evidence confirming that many women of color were eager to gain access to contraception, but fails to discuss how African American, American Indian, and Chicana/o civil rights movements, especially in their nationalist form, intensified that suspicion. She also inadequately discusses the coercive sterilization of Indians. Many of these themes might have become clearer had the book been organized differently, bringing all the material on a topic together in one place. The book ends with abortion politics, and in this respect Arizona was not unique.

Melcher's narrative introduces several notable individuals. Annie Wauneka, the daughter of a Navajo chief and first woman on the Navajo Nation Council, led a struggle against tuberculosis among Indians from the 1940s through the 1970s. Dr. Pearl Tang, a Chinese American immigrant, devoted her skills to public doctoring, including devising a system of sterilizing bottles for mothers who could not breastfeed because they had to work in the cotton fields. Francisca Montoya, a farmworkers' union organizer, brought birth control into her work. Father Emmett McLoughlin defied his bishop and church by supporting birth control and campaigning for health care for the mainly African American and Mexican American mothers and children in his South Phoenix parish. Perhaps Melcher's book will lead to greater recognition for these champions of women's and children's health.

Linda Gordon
New York University

WD Farr: Cowboy in the Boardroom. By Daniel Tyler, foreword by Sen. Hank Brown. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012. xx + 292 pp. 31 halftones, maps, bibliography, index. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-4328-6.)

There is no guarantee that the details of what is essentially part biography and part corporate history will offer a great read, but this account of the ninety-seven-year-long life of Colorado's WD Farr (1910–2007), a rancher who was “first and foremost a businessman,” packs into its pages enough momentous

events that the telling is, as Wallace Stegner once wrote of John Wesley Powell, not so much the biography of an individual as of a career (p. 124).

Biographer Daniel Tyler, a professor emeritus of history at Colorado State University in Fort Collins, offers up an effective and tempered survey of Farr's life and times. The beginning, with the usual family history and background, is straightforward and unsurprising. As Farr's story builds, however, so does our amazement, gradually giving way to astonishment at the sheer scope of his accomplishments. Farr was hardly the manner born; he started in a farm family, and benefited from runs of good luck and skill in bad times, including pioneering sugar beet farming near Greeley, Colorado's famed Union Colony. His rise is tied to that of Weld County, with its pivotal location where the Great Plains meet the Rocky Mountains.

During the Depression, the Farr family's role with Home Gas and Electric proved a cash cow, and Tyler characterizes Farr's ability as that of a "connector," borrowing the phrase from *New Yorker* author Malcolm Gladwell. Sugar beet growing and processing made the Great Western Sugar enterprise a financial buffer through hard times, and Farr fared well. Farr would move on to partner with Warren Monfort and Bert Avery in feed lot development—turning what we now speak of as Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFOs) into an epic undertaking that in Farr's lifetime eventually broadened in Colorado from cattle to pigs and poultry and boosted Weld County to its current perennial status as one of the top ten agricultural producers in the United States.

Farr began with ranching sheep and cattle—although the photograph of the newlyweds on page 57 shows a strapping young man in a business suit and not a rural rustic rancher. He would go on to the presidency of the National Cattlemen's Association. The details of his ranching life are fairly nominal in this telling. As Tyler argues, Farr was not the loner so often portrayed as a builder of the American West. Instead, he had a "genuine interest in others," and believed that building community always required "cooperation" (pp. 53–54). He started at home, courting "Judy" (Gladwell M. Judy) and building a new house with her in 1937—in the middle of the Depression—and a family followed. A thoroughly modern westerner, he particularly cherished one of his ranches where farming, raising livestock, feeding cattle, hosting guided hunts, and developing housing coexisted on the property, making for one great serendipitous mix. He matched that with business undertakings that included packers, feedlot creation, ranching on Colorado's western slope, and serious investment in water procurement that eventually led to the state's crucial interbasin water transfers.

At age seventy, in 1980, Farr was operating two ranches, two feedlots, and seven farms, while advising Pres. Richard Nixon on water quality and other

environmental issues. He traveled to China, Japan, Mongolia, Tibet, and the USSR, yet was obliged to sell two ranches when financial straits hit in 1984. Farr remained a linchpin in Colorado water policy, holding a seat on the omnipotent Denver Water Board. He knew its significance: before his death in 2007 he said, "Tell them I knew water" (p. 107). The allusion to John Wesley Powell at the start of this review was no accident; like Powell, Farr "was convinced that each basin should be operated by a set of rules unique to its own history and circumstances" (p. 165). Farr saw natural and human-made environments as an "integrated unit" (p. 122).

His friends, his neighbors, his offspring, and many a westerner interested in resource and environmental questions have good reason to mull the role played by Farr. He was as visionary as any western water pioneer could be. Tyler, whose family acquired one of Farr's early ranches and therefore has a personal interest, has delivered Farr's story with aplomb.

Paul F. Starrs

University of Nevada, Reno

Women and the Texas Revolution. Edited by Mary L. Scheer. (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2012. x + 244 pp. 15 halftones, contributors, index. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-469-1.)

The Texas Revolution has a long, distinguished, and overwhelmingly masculine historiography, recounting battles and political machinations. The eight essays in *Women in the Texas Revolution* aim to redress the absence of women in the overall narrative. With relatively little evidence to rely on, the essays are masterpieces of recovery work. They create a counter narrative by examining ordinary people coping with daily life and the changing rules and mores brought about by shifting national governments. In their complexity, the essays also demonstrate that Texas in the 1830s had a multiethnic culture that would quickly be dominated by Anglo Americans.

Three essays place women at pivotal events of the Revolution, proving that even these military actions had participants who were not white males. Dora Elizondo Guerra points out that at least seven Tejanas and their children were present during the siege of the Alamo, despite previous historians' focus only on the American Susanna Dickinson. Light Cummins poignantly describes thousands of women and children fleeing from Antonio Lopez de Santa Anna's rumored approach in the Runaway Scrape, suffering losses of life, property, and security. Jeffrey Dunn probes the experiences of the women living near the San Jacinto battleground and the *soldaderas* accompanying the Mexican army. He

weighs the evidence for two controversial stories—that a Texian soldier killed a Mexican woman during the battle and that Emily Morgan was with Santa Anna beforehand—but concludes that neither can be proven nor disproven.

Four essays examine women from different ethnic groups, all concluding that the Revolution and its aftermath undermined women's status in the region. For Native women, the Texan victory proved devastating as new policies dictated their eventual removal from the region, according to Lindy Eakin. Jean Stuntz discusses how Hispanic women lost much of the legal standing that they enjoyed under Spanish and Mexican law, and they also suffered as Anglo culture swamped their own. Angela Boswell documents the changes in slave life as Americans brought increasing numbers of slaves into Texas. The new Republic of Texas constitution ensured that the bondswomen would remain chattel for the rest of their lives. The status of Anglo-American women remained largely unchanged by the Revolution, writes Mary Scheer. Many manifested support for the war, but they also suffered the loss of their men and their possessions. As English common law supplanted the more egalitarian rules of Spain and Mexico, even Anglo women “realized little positive political, legal, or social benefit from the Texas Revolution” (p. 89).

Laura Lyons McLemore concludes the volume with the work of three women in memorializing the Texas Revolution. Adina de Zavala, the daughter of a Tejano who fought for Texas, had a markedly more inclusive version of Texas history than did her Anglo counterparts. The romantic Anglo-centric version of Texas history has long held sway, but this volume owes much more to the multicultural, clear-eyed perspective of de Zavala. The essays in *Women and the Texas Revolution* abundantly support the “old woman” whom early author Noah Smithwick quoted: early Texas was “a heaven for men and dogs, but a hell for women and oxen.”

Rebecca Sharpless

Texas Christian University

A Rough Ride to Redemption: The Ben Daniels Story. By Robert K. DeArment and Jack DeMattos, foreword by William B. Secrest. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2010. xvi + 246 pp. 20 halftones, line drawing, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4112-1.)

Civil War military biographies, once almost exclusively about generals, seem increasingly reliant on the life stories of colonels or company commanders. It would now seem that lesser figures are all that remain of nineteenth-century law officers and gunmen as well.

A Rough Ride to Redemption is a well-told saga of a western outlaw turned peace officer and Spanish American War fighter, written by two veteran western writers. From the beginning, however, the story does not seem very extraordinary nor is Daniels' life very unique. Having read DeArment's extraordinarily insightful and fascinating biography of Frank Canton—Texas convict, Wyoming stock detective, and Oklahoma National Guard adjutant general—I expected Daniels to be equally larger than life. After reading DeMattos' work on Bat Masterson and Teddy Roosevelt, I anticipated a similar match up of legendary figures in this book. Unfortunately, the facts of Daniels' life are relatively scarce, his career seems opportunistic, and his adventures are little more than peripheral to more important characters as he shifts among a number of personas.

While a lawman in Dodge City, Daniels also operated a combination saloon and gambling house, eventually murdering a rival saloon owner. He turns up as a prisoner in Wyoming at the territorial penitentiary in Laramie and travels around the Southern Plains alternately as a law officer in such places as Cripple Creek, Colorado, and as an outlaw in Oklahoma. In his mid-forties, he appears with Theodore Roosevelt's Rough Riders in Cuba and then tries to turn the acquaintance into an appointment as U.S. Marshal for Arizona and a stint as warden at Yuma, Arizona. Throughout the first few chapters, the authors promise a remarkable story and keep reminding the reader that Daniels was where all of the action was taking place. Yes, he was present, yet, in the end, one gains little sense of the man—what made him change locations and occupations, what drove him between one side of the law and the other, and what made his life seem so fascinating to his biographers.

Certainly, the authors have done yeoman's work to uncover documentary evidence of Daniels' life. They are handicapped, however, by a lack of introspective sources—no diaries, few letters, and precious little direct quotation even in contemporary local newspapers. The reader is left with the impression that while Daniels may seem relatively typical of men looking for their best chance in those times, the authors protest that his story is truly unique. As a western law officer, Daniels' experiences and his actions while wearing the badge seem no different than a few hundred others from his era. As a mostly small-town gambler and saloonkeeper, his type was legion in the West in the late nineteenth century. Even his relatively casual and brief acquaintance with Theodore Roosevelt takes on the whiff of opportunism rather than genuine friendship. This is not the story of a particularly insightful individual nor one with whom the reader can have much sympathy.

Readers of stories about Old West characters will enjoy the book, not so much because Daniels' biography is all that unusual, but because the two

authors are engaging writers who tell a good story. In the end, DeArment and DeMattos have done admirable research, but this is the story of a peripheral figure that chanced upon events and met people who lived more interesting lives.

Phil Roberts

University of Wyoming

The McLaurys in Tombstone, Arizona: An O.K. Corral Obituary. By Paul Lee Johnson. A. C. Greene Series, no. 12. (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2012. xv + 380 pp. 24 halftones, line drawing, map, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-5744-1450-9.)

The gunfight at the O.K. Corral is one of the most famous events in western history. On 26 October 1881, in Tombstone, Arizona, the Earp brothers—Wyatt, Virgil, and Morgan—and Doc Holliday had a shootout with two sets of brothers, Ike and Billy Clanton and Frank and Tom McLaury. When the gunsmoke cleared, there was little doubt about the outcome. Wyatt Earp emerged unscathed from the thirty-second gunfight. Virgil and Morgan were wounded, and Holliday was grazed by a bullet. Their opponents were not as fortunate. Although Ike Clanton escaped without serious injury, Frank McLaury lay dead on the ground. Nearby were Tom McLaury and Billy Clanton, both of whom died shortly thereafter.

Several days later, Frank and Tom's older brother, Fort Worth attorney Will McLaury, arrived in Tombstone to settle his brothers' affairs and redeem the family name. He even joined an unsuccessful attempt to bring murder charges against the Earps and Holliday. Despite Will's efforts, Wyatt Earp and company went down in history as fast-on-the-draw, good guys who upheld the law against criminals. While the Earps' reputation has been tarnished a bit in recent years, most books and popular histories continue to treat Wyatt Earp and Doc Holliday as western heroes, while the Clantons and McLaurys are dismissed as villainous outlaws.

Paul Lee Johnson's more nuanced approach to the O.K. Corral drama presents a far more complicated picture of the McLaury brothers. The author has painstakingly pieced together the McLaurys' backstory through secondary works and primary sources that include newspaper articles, private letters, unpublished manuscripts, public records, and interviews with McLaury descendants. Johnson shows that Frank and Tom were not the black-hearted desperados that history has made them out to be. In many ways, they were just like other settlers who headed West hoping for a better life. The McLaurys

came from a good family, worked hard, saved money, and even had their own ranch. Unfortunately, as Johnson notes, sometimes good people do bad things. The brothers chose the wrong friends and became involved with rustlers, stole property, and performed other illegal activities. Despite those indiscretions, the author believes that Tom and Frank might have become upstanding ranchers or farmers had they not been killed at the O.K. Corral. "What makes this story both human and contemporary," suggests Johnson, "is this paradox" (p. 301).

Johnson's book is a welcome addition to the literature about the Gunfight at the O.K. Corral. But the narrative is confusing at times. All too often, the author veers off into a cul-de-sac of names while serving up details about the McLaurys' extended family or various individuals involved with the McLaurys, Clantons, and Earps. Better editing or at least a glossary of names would have made the story line easier to follow. Despite this flaw, Johnson's book should appeal to anyone interested in western history. Not only does it shed light on the McLaury brothers, but it offers fascinating information about local politics and daily life on the Arizona frontier.

Richard Aquila

Pennsylvania State University, Erie

