

2009

## The impact of claim diagnosticity on consumer scepticism to corporate social responsibility advertising claims

Alan Pomeroy

*University of Wollongong*, alanp@uow.edu.au

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

### University of Wollongong

#### Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

### Recommended Citation

Pomeroy, Alan, The impact of claim diagnosticity on consumer scepticism to corporate social responsibility advertising claims, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, School of Management & Marketing - Faculty of Commerce, University of Wollongong, 2009. <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/3023>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: [research-pubs@uow.edu.au](mailto:research-pubs@uow.edu.au)

## **NOTE**

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

## **UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

### **COPYRIGHT WARNING**

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

THE IMPACT OF CLAIM DIAGNOSTICITY ON  
CONSUMER SCEPTICISM TO  
CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY  
ADVERTISING CLAIMS

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the  
requirements for the award of the degree**

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

THE UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

Alan Anthony POMERING, B.Ec, Dip. Ed., MBA

School of Management and Marketing  
2009

## **CERTIFICATION**

I, Alan Anthony Pomeroy, declare that this thesis, submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in School of Management and Marketing, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Alan Anthony Pomeroy

11 May 2009.

## Abstract

A considerable body of literature on consumers' responses to information about firms' corporate social responsibility (CSR) initiatives has been published over the past decade. To date, however, little if any of this research has looked at consumer reaction to such information communicated via the medium of advertising, despite the increasing use of such corporate societal advertising appeals. While scepticism is a common cognitive response toward advertising, how scepticism toward non-economic corporate image claims might be promoted or inhibited through message elements has not been the focus of research attention. This thesis seeks to address this knowledge gap by investigating the impact of two diagnostic message elements on scepticism toward specific CSR claims.

This study examines whether consumer scepticism toward the advertising of CSR claims can be influenced by altering the diagnosticity of social topic information and CSR commitment message dimensions. Two key research questions are addressed: does the provision of more social topic information encourage consumers toward less CSR advertising claim scepticism?, and does more specific information about a firm's CSR commitment, expressing both its history and actual achievements, and their impacts, inhibit CSR advertising claim scepticism?

In order to investigate these two research questions, an experimental approach was used to allow the manipulation of message elements and the testing of cause and effect. Data received via an online panel of a cross-section of 417 Australian consumers were analysed, and the hypotheses specified in study were tested using analysis of variance and covariance techniques.

Results from this research suggest that increased information about the social topic related to the domain of the firm's CSR initiatives does not significantly influence the level of scepticism toward CSR advertising claims, but information specificity about the firm's CSR commitment does. These results are impacted by the consumer's level of scepticism toward advertising in general, attitude toward the notion of corporate social responsibility, and attitude toward the social topic. The findings of this thesis provide evidence that consumers have the ability to deal with larger cognitive loads, created by information about specific impacts of firms' CSR programs, and that such diagnostic information is useful in reducing scepticism responses to CSR messages. These responses are important, as they form the foundation of subsequent attitudinal and belief structures so critical for influencing consumer behaviour.

The theoretical contributions of this study include: (1) situating the role of social topic information, considered a critical element of advertising campaigns in social marketing, in CSR advertising situations; (2) implicating an organisation's CSR history and CSR and impacts as important diagnostic elements in CSR message claims; and (3) defending the ability of consumers to adequately discriminate between cognitively demanding informational inputs when evaluating CSR advertising claims. Given increasing demand from consumers to learn about firms' CSR efforts, and firms' increasing willingness to respond to these information demands with CSR-based advertising campaigns, this study also offers guidance for marketing communication managers charged with developing corporate image based on CSR-based brand claims. Limitations and directions for future research are also discussed.

## Acknowledgements

In setting out on this research path and during the conduct of this study, I have benefited from the guidance, patience, and encouragement of a number of people.

My sincere thanks must first be given to those who provided supervisory guidance during the early stages of my PhD journey, including Paul Couchman, Lars Bergkvist, and Sara Dolnicar. I particularly thank Gary Noble for his collegial support throughout the journey and his ultimate guidance and supervision at the journey's end. Special thanks are offered to Les Johnson for stepping forward at a critical time to provide unflinching generosity with his professional time and enthusiasm for the topic. Professor Johnson's support has made the completion of this thesis a particularly edifying and enjoyable experience. I am grateful to each of these colleagues for their support, knowledge, and candour.

My thanks go to the numerous colleagues who provided constructive criticism and assistance at various doctoral colloquia along the way. In particular, I would like to thank Professors Mike Ewing and Mike Rothschild, for their recognition and valuable suggestions at ANZMAC, 2006. My warm thanks must also go to Kieren Diement for assisting in the development of my statistical fluency, and to Celeste Rossetto and Trevor Spedding for their time and help in proof reading of the final thesis.

Thanks are also due to the many colleagues and fellow doctoral students who provided encouragement and shared their experiences over the years, and in particular those colleagues at the University of Wollongong that provided moral support amidst the darkest hours, in particular Elias Kyriazis. I am grateful for all the support and thoughts shared along the way.

I must also acknowledge the sacrifice of my family; my wife Antonia, and my children Romana, Anneliese, and Lowen. They have shared the ups and downs that must come with such a study, and they have often had to accommodate my absence over the past few years. I thank them for their love and support, and appreciate their sacrifice.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge my late mother, Mavis, and father, Ernest, for the value they placed on my pursuit of learning. This work is dedicated to them both.



# Table of Contents

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Certification   | ii  |
| <b>ABSTRACT</b>   | iii |
| Acknowledgements  | v   |
| Table of Contents   | vii |
| <br>  |     |
| <b>1. INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW</b>   | 1   |
| 1.1 Introduction  | 1   |
| 1.2 Overview and Key Concepts   | 4   |
| 1.3 Plan of Thesis  | 7   |
| <br>  |     |
| <b>2. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE: CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY (CSR) AND THE CSR-CONSUMER RELATIONSHIP</b> | 9   |
| 2.1 Conceptualising CSR   | 9   |
| 2.2 The CSR-consumer Relationship   | 18  |
| 2.3 Consumer Responses to Cause-related Marketing Campaigns   | 26  |
| 2.4 Conclusion  | 31  |
| <br>  |     |
| <b>3. USING ADVERTISING TO COMMUNICATE CSR</b>  | 33  |
| 3.1 Scepticism as a Cognitive Response  | 34  |
| 3.2 CSR Advertising Claims  | 39  |
| 3.3 The Susceptibility of CSR Advertising Claims to Scepticism Responses                                    | 41  |
| 3.3.1 <i>CSR as Corporate ‘Product’</i>   | 41  |
| 3.3.2 <i>The Mixed-motive CSR Processing Task</i>   | 43  |
| 3.3.3 <i>The CSR Positioning Paradox</i>  | 43  |
| 3.3.4 <i>CSR and Persuasion Theory</i>  | 45  |

|                                     |   |    |
|-------------------------------------|---|----|
| 3.3.5                               | <i>Biased Processing of CSR Claims</i>  | 48 |
| 3.3.6                               | <i>CSR from a Resource Matching Perspective</i>   | 50 |
| 3.3.7                               | <i>Inhibiting Scepticism through Informational Claims</i>   | 52 |
| 3.4                                 | Conclusion  | 53 |
| <b>4. DEVELOPMENT OF HYPOTHESES</b> |   | 54 |
| 4.1                                 | Advertising Claim Diagnosticity   | 55 |
| 4.2                                 | CSR Advertising Claim Diagnosticity   | 56 |
| 4.2.1                               | <i>Social Topic Information for CSR</i>   | 58 |
| 4.2.2                               | <i>CSR Commitment</i>   | 62 |
| 4.2.3                               | <i>Diagnostic CSR-Positioning Congruity</i>   | 65 |
| 4.3                                 | The Roles of Consumer CSR Attitude, Brand/Product Category Attitude,<br>and Scepticism toward Advertising as Covariates | 69 |
| 4.3.1                               | <i>CSR Attitude</i>   | 69 |
| 4.3.2                               | <i>Ad Skepticism</i>  | 70 |
| 4.3.3                               | <i>Product Category Attitude: Retail Banks</i>  | 72 |
| 4.3.4                               | <i>Product Category Attitude: The Arms Trade</i>  | 74 |
| 4.4                                 | Conclusion  | 75 |
| <b>5. METHOD</b>                    |   | 76 |
| 5.1                                 | Approach  | 77 |
| 5.2                                 | Stimuli Development and Pretesting  | 79 |
| 5.2.1                               | <i>Pre-test for Social Issue</i>  | 80 |
| 5.2.2                               | <i>Pre-test for Brand Name</i>  | 81 |
| 5.2.3                               | <i>Scenario Pre-test of Independent Variables for Advertising Copy</i>  | 82 |
| 5.2.4                               | <i>Development of Advertisements / Stimuli</i>  | 84 |
| 5.2.5                               | <i>Pre-test of Advertisements (Online)</i>  | 86 |

|                                       |   |     |
|---------------------------------------|---|-----|
| 5.2.6                                 | <i>Pre-test of New Advertisements (Offline)</i>                         | 87  |
| 5.2.7                                 | <i>Pilot Study</i>  | 89  |
| 5.3                                   | Main Study Procedure  | 89  |
| 5.4                                   | Data Collection   | 92  |
| 5.4.1                                 | <i>Covariates</i>   | 92  |
| 5.4.2                                 | <i>The Dependent variable- Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims</i> | 93  |
| 5.4.3                                 | <i>Manipulation Checks</i>  | 95  |
| 5.5                                   | Data Analysis   | 96  |
| <b>6. PRE-TESTS AND PILOT STUDIES</b> |   | 97  |
| 6.1                                   | Results of Scenario Pre-test of Diagnostic Advertising Copy             | 97  |
| 6.2                                   | Results of Online Pre-test of Advertisements                            | 99  |
| 6.3                                   | Offline Pre-test  | 105 |
| 6.4                                   | Conclusion  | 108 |
| <b>7. MAIN STUDY RESULTS</b>          |   | 110 |
| 7.1                                   | Study Overview  | 110 |
| 7.2                                   | Results   | 114 |
| 7.2.1                                 | <i>Manipulation Check of Independent Variables</i>                      | 114 |
| 7.2.1.1                               | Social Topic Information Diagnosticity                                  | 114 |
| 7.2.1.2                               | CSR Commitment Diagnosticity  | 115 |
| 7.2.2                                 | <i>Analysis of Covariates</i>   | 116 |
| 7.2.2.1                               | Covariate: CSR Attitude   | 117 |
| 7.2.2.2                               | Covariate: Product Category Attitude                                    | 119 |
| 7.2.2.3                               | Covariate: Attitude to the Arms Trade                                   | 119 |
| 7.2.2.4                               | Covariate: Ad Skepticism  | 120 |
| 7.2.3                                 | <i>Dependent Variable: Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims</i>     | 120 |

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
| 7.3       | Hypothesis Testing  | 121 |
| 7.3.1     | <i>H<sub>1</sub> Impact of STI on Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims</i>            | 121 |
| 7.3.2     | <i>H<sub>2</sub> Impact of CSR Commitment on Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims</i> | 123 |
| 7.3.3     | <i>Hypothesis Testing Summary</i>   | 124 |
| 7.4       | Stepwise Regression   | 125 |
| 7.5       | Discussion of Main Study Results  | 126 |
| 7.6       | Conclusion  | 128 |
| <b>8.</b> | <b>DISCUSSION</b>   | 129 |
| 8.1       | Conclusions   | 130 |
| 8.1.1     | <i>The Role of Social Topic Information and Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims</i>  | 130 |
| 8.1.2     | <i>The Role of CSR Commitment and Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims</i>            | 139 |
| 8.2       | Manipulation of Independent Variables   | 140 |
| 8.2.1     | <i>Social Topic Information</i>   | 140 |
| 8.2.2     | <i>CSR Commitment</i>   | 141 |
| 8.2.2     | <i>The Effects of Covariates</i>  | 142 |
| 8.3       | Dependent Variable: Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims                              | 143 |
| 8.4       | Conclusion  | 143 |
| <b>9.</b> | <b>CONCLUSIONS</b>  | 145 |
| 9.1       | Theoretical Contribution  | 145 |
| 9.2       | Managerial Implications   | 147 |
| 9.3       | Limitations   | 149 |

|            |  |     |
|------------|--|-----|
| 9.4        | Future Research                                      | 150 |
| 9.4.1      | <i>Alternative and More Applicable Social Topics</i> | 151 |
| 9.4.2      | <i>Familiar Brands</i>                               | 152 |
| 9.5        | Conclusion   | 153 |
|            | <b>REFERENCES</b>                                    | 154 |
|            | <b>APPENDICES</b>                                    |     |
| Appendix A | Experimental Stimulus                                | 184 |
| Appendix B | Study Question Protocol                              | 187 |
| Appendix C | Output for the Overall Model                         | 190 |

## **LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES**

### **FIGURES**

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| Figure 4.1 | Claim Diagnosticity Effects on Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims | 69  |
| Figure 7.1 | Oneway Analysis of Dependent Variable by CSR                            | 123 |

### **TABLES**

|              |  |     |
|--------------|--|-----|
| Table 5.2    | Online Pre-test Questions of Draft Advertisements                                | 86  |
| Table 6.1    | Pre-test Manipulation Check, ANOVA   | 98  |
| Table 6.2    | Manipulation Check: Mean Scores for Social Topic Information                     | 102 |
| Table 6.3(a) | Manipulation Check: Mean Scores for CSR Outcome                                  | 102 |
| Table 6.3(b) | Manipulation Check: Mean Scores for CSR Positioning Congruity                    | 102 |
| Table 7.1    | Social Topic Information Manipulation Check, ANOVA                               | 115 |
| Table 7.2    | CSR Commitment Manipulation check, ANOVA   | 116 |
| Table 7.3    | CSR Attitude, Principal Components Analysis (Four Items)                         | 117 |
| Table 7.4    | CSR Attitude, Principal Components Analysis (Three Items)                        | 119 |
| Table 7.5    | Overall Model Effect Tests   | 122 |
| Table 7.6    | One-way ANOVA of Scepticism toward CSR Advertising Claims against CSR Commitment | 124 |
| Table 7.7    | Stepwise Regression: Step History for Covariates                                 | 125 |