View metadata, citation and similar papers at core.ac.uk

brought to you by CORE

provided by Research Online

University of Wollongong

Research Online

University of Wollongong Thesis Collection 1954-2016

University of Wollongong Thesis Collections

1996

# Organizational change and the participation of accounting information systems: a critical reflexive ethnography of the South Australian Housing Trust

Mary Aristidis Kaidonis

*University of Wollongong*

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.**

## Recommended Citation

Kaidonis, Mary Aristidis, Organizational change and the participation of accounting information systems: a critical reflexive ethnography of the South Australian Housing Trust, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, Department of Accounting and Finance, University of Wollongong, 1996. https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/1023

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

**NOTE**

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

**UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

**COPYRIGHT WARNING**

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

# ORGANIZATIONAL CHANGE AND THE PARTICIPATION OF ACCOUNTING INFORMATION SYSTEMS: A CRITICAL REFLEXIVE ETHNOGRAPHY OF THE SOUTH AUSTRALIAN HOUSING TRUST

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

from

**UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

by

**MARY ARISTIDIS KAIDONIS**

Bachelor of Science,(University of Adelaide), Diploma in Accounting, (Flinders University), Graduate Diploma of Accountancy, Graduate Diploma of Educational Counselling, (South Australian Institute of Technology), Master of Commerce (Hons) (University of Wollongong).

Department of Accounting and Finance
1996

## CERTIFICATE

I, Mary Aristidis Kaidonis, certify that this thesis has not been submitted previously as part of the requirements of another degree and that it is the product of my own independent research.

Signed:_____

M A Kaidonis

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

To my supervisor, Professor Michael J R Gaffikin, I wish to thank you for allowing me the intellectual freedom to explore and enjoy this journey and for the privedge of being part of your vision. To Jane Broadbent, Richard Laughlin, Norman Macintosh, Leslie Oakes, Alistair Preston and Hugh Stretton, thank you for your constructive feedback on earlier drafts of parts of this thesis. I am also grateful to my colleagues for their encouragement and consideration. I wish to acknowledge the cooperation of all the interviewees of the South Australian Housing Trust (past and present) and Department of Housing and Urban Development, who were generous with their time and made this thesis possible and worthwhile.

# DEDICATION

Εις τους γονεις μου
Αριστιδης και Ξενουλα Καϊδωνης
για την αγαπη σας, το Θαρος σας, και την ευκαιρια
με πολυ αγαπη
η κορη σας
Μαιρη Α Καϊδωνη

To my parents
Aristidis and Xenoula Kaidonis
for your love, courage and opportunity
with much love
your daughter
Mary A Kaidonis

# ABSTRACT

This is a critical reflexive ethnography of the South Australian Housing Trust (SAHT) between 1991-1994. The SAHT was established as a statutory authority with dual roles, which were to provide affordable housing to low income earners and to do so in a manner which contributed to the state's overall social and economic welfare. These dual roles influenced the culture of the organization and act as a context in which to analyse and understand a number of events. The SAHT's internal predisposition to change helped it to respond to reduced government funding and a change in general managers by undergoing structural changes. Laughlin's (1991) organizational change model is used to identify and classify these changes as first order, re-orientation. LOCM accommodated the use of reflexivity to expose and understand the processes by which accounting information systems influenced the changes to the SAHT's structure and culture. By contrast the changes resulting from the implementation of the public sector reforms were externally imposed and split the organization into two separate entities, thus decoupling the SAHT's humanitarian and business roles. The rhetoric of managerialism to procure change claimed objectivity and used accounting information systems to achieve the imperatives of accountability and transparency. The ideological impact of economic rationalism was disguised as merely offering functional clarity in order to understate the significance of these changes. LOCM was used to demonstrate the significance of this colonization as it had the consequence of disempowering the organization.

# VOLUME I
# TABLE OF CONTENTS


| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | **Certificate** | ii |
| | | **Acknowledgments** | iii |
| | | **Dedication** | iv |
| | | **Abstract** | v |
| **Chapter 1** | | **Introduction** | 1 |
| | 1 | About this ethnography | 1 |
| | 2 | Setting the scene | 2 |
| | 3 | Accounting information systems in a broader context | 3 |
| | 4 | Reflexivity | 10 |
| | 5 | Myth of objectivity | 13 |
| | 6 | Organization of this thesis | 15 |
| | 7 | The organization: the South Australian Housing Trust (SAHT) | 19 |
| | 7.1 | Key factors in this ethnography | 20 |
| | 7.1.1 | The people | 20 |
| | 7.1.2 | The events | 22 |
| | 7.1.3 | The environment | 23 |
| | 7.2 | Integrating the people, events and environment | 24 |
| **Chapter 2** | | **Methodology: a critical reflexive ethnography** | 29 |
| | 1 | Introduction | 29 |
| | 2 | Middle-range thinking | 29 |
| | 2.1 | Theoretical characteristics | 31 |
| | 2.1.1 | Ontological belief | 31 |
| | 2.1.2 | Role of theory | 33 |
| | 2.2 | Methodological characteristics | 34 |
| | 2.2.1 | Role of observer | 34 |
| | 2.2.2 | Reflexivity | 34 |
| | 2.2.3 | Nature of method | 39 |
| | 2.2.4 | Conclusions derived | 39 |
| | 3 | Reflexive Ethnography | 40 |
| | 3.2 | Confessions of a closet positivist | 46 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | 3.2.1 | The transition from training consultant to researcher | 47 |
| | 3.2.2 | Eureka - systematic chaos | 48 |
| | 3.2.3 | Distinction between training consultant, researcher, author and self | 51 |
| | 3.2.4 | The interviews | 53 |
| | 4 | The reflexive process and understanding organizational change | 57 |
| **Chapter 3** | | **An organizational change model** | 59 |
| | 1 | Introduction | 59 |
| | 2 | Laughlin's (1991) Organizational Change Model (LOCM) | 59 |
| | 2.1 | Elements of LOCM | 60 |
| | 2.2 | Types of Changes | 62 |
| | 3 | Metaphors and LOCM | 63 |
| | 3.1 | Different ways of seeing | 64 |
| | 3.1.1 | Machine metaphor | 64 |
| | 3.1.2 | Organic metaphor | 66 |
| | 3.1.2.1 | Autopoiesis | 67 |
| | 3.1.3 | Culture metaphor | 68 |
| | 3.1.3.1 | Definitions of culture | 69 |
| | 3.1.3.2 | Culture of an organization | 70 |
| | 3.1.3.3 | Culture and leadership | 70 |
| | 3.1.4 | Political metaphor | 72 |
| | 3.2 | Obscuring and coexisting metaphors | 73 |
| | 3.2.1 | Laughlin's model and the machine metaphor | 75 |
| | 3.2.2 | Laughlin's model and the culture metaphor | 76 |
| | 3.2.3 | Laughlin's model and the political metaphor | 76 |
| | 4 | Concepts and assumptions of change | 77 |
| | 4.1 | Significance of change | 77 |
| | 4.2 | Identifying change | 79 |
| | 4.2.1 | Mapping | 80 |
| | 4.2.2 | Organizational change, ethnography and reflexivity | 80 |
| **Chapter 4** | | **The South Australian Housing Trust: an historical perspective of its AIS** | 82 |
| | 1 | Introduction | 82 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | 2 | Background of the South Australian Housing Trust (SAHT) | 83 |
| | 3 | Historical perspective of the case study - establishing a culture | 85 |
| | 4 | Leadership changes - signal of a cultural shift | 89 |
| | 5 | The AIS initiative - unwedging a culture | 92 |
| | 6 | Funding uncertainty and growth of the information systems - fuel for cultural change | 95 |
| | 6.1 | Policy changes | 97 |
| | 6.2 | Computerization welcomed by some | 98 |
| | 7 | Non-financial operations computerized - the last bastian of cultural change | 99 |
| | 8 | Facilitating a cultural shift | 104 |
| | 9 | Significance of the organizational changes | 111 |
| | 10 | Conclusions so far | 113 |
| **Chapter 5** | | **Predisposition to internal changes** | 116 |
| | 1 | Introduction | 116 |
| | 2 | New general manager | 117 |
| | 2.1 | Another outsider | 117 |
| | 2.1.1 | Access and reciprocity | 119 |
| | 2.2 | Shift in the balance of dual roles | 121 |
| | 2.2.1 | Manager of change | 121 |
| | 2.2.2 | Perceptions of change in dual roles | 122 |
| | 2.3 | Goal incongruence | 123 |
| | 2.4 | Communication | 124 |
| | 2.4.1 | New physical environment | 125 |
| | 3 | Regional and community services (RACS) review | 126 |
| | 3.1 | Impact on the leadership of divisions | 127 |
| | 3.2 | Impact on regions | 128 |
| | 3.2.1 | Changes in the RACS division | 128 |
| | 3.2.1.1 | Budgets | 129 |
| | 3.2.1.2 | Bad debts | 129 |
| | 3.2.1.3 | Benefits | 131 |
| | 3.2.1.4 | Community service obligations (CSO) | 132 |
| | 3.2.2 | Changes to the regions | 134 |
| | 3.3 | Impact on the information systems | 136 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | 3.4 | Impact on corporate finance and corporate services | 139 |
| | 4 | Qualified audit report | 140 |
| | 4.1 | Explanations for the qualified audit | 141 |
| | 4.1.1 | A non-traditional structure of finance | 141 |
| | 4.1.2 | User-friendliness vs controls | 143 |
| | 4.2 | Responses to the qualified audit | 144 |
| | 4.2.1 | Policy changes to systems development | 144 |
| | 4.2.2 | Management accounting reports for the board | 145 |
| | 4.2.3 | A temporary replacement | 147 |
| | 4.2.4 | Corporate finance becomes part of corporate services | 148 |
| | 5 | Continuing government funding cuts | 149 |
| | 5.1 | Downsizing the development division | 150 |
| | 5.2 | Asset management | 151 |
| | 5.3 | Triennial review | 153 |
| | 5.4 | Review of RACS' structural changes | 155 |
| | 6 | Significance of organizational changes | 156 |
| | 6.1 | Design archetypes and sub-systems | 156 |
| | 6.2 | Interpretive schemes | 157 |
| | 6.3 | First order change - reorientation | 159 |
| | 7 | Conclusions - so far | 162 |
| **Chapter 6** | | **External stimulus for organizational change** | 165 |
| | 1 | Introduction | 165 |
| | 2 | Context of public sector reforms | 167 |
| | 2.1 | Public sector reforms in Australia and Western countries | 167 |
| | 2.2 | Economic and political factors in South Australia | 168 |
| | 2.3 | SAHT and Public sector reforms | 170 |
| | 3 | The split of SAHT | 171 |
| | 3.1 | Justifications for the split | 171 |
| | 3.2 | Accountability, efficiency and effectiveness - a paradox | 172 |
| | 3.3 | Changes to the interpretive schemes | 175 |
| | 3.3.1 | Changes in the annual reports | 176 |
| | 3.3.2 | Implications for the citizens | 179 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | 3.4 | Design archetypes dictating interpretive schemes | 181 |
| | 4 | Accountability and managerialism: the Trojan horses of public sector reform | 184 |
| | 4.1 | Myth of objectivity | 185 |
| | 4.2 | Objectivity and independence | 188 |
| | 4.3 | Managerialism and ideology | 190 |
| | 5 | Social policy and public sector reforms | 194 |
| | 5.1 | Social policy as an afterthought | 194 |
| | 5.2 | Citizens out of focus | 196 |
| | 5.3 | Social policy and managerialism | 198 |
| **Chapter 7** | | **The interface between internal responses and external stimuli** | 201 |
| | 1 | Introduction | 201 |
| | 2 | Leadership | 201 |
| | 2.1 | The chairperson of the board | 202 |
| | 2.2 | The general manager of the SAHT | 207 |
| | 2.3 | The directors of strategy, policy and budget of DHUD | 212 |
| | 3 | SAHT Act 1995: new legislation | 217 |
| | 4 | The significance of externally imposed changes | 223 |
| | 4.1 | Second order changes - colonization | 224 |
| **Chapter 8** | | **Conclusions: endings and beginnings** | 227 |
| | 1 | Approaching an ending | 227 |
| | 2 | Findings from the ethnography and implications for AIS | 229 |
| | 2.1 | Historical context of the SAHT's mission and culture | 229 |
| | 2.2 | AIS and organizational structure | 230 |
| | 2.3 | PSR split the SAHT | 231 |
| | 2.4 | The role of leadership, culture and mission | 233 |
| | 3 | LOCM and the evaluation of change | 236 |
| | 4 | Imperative to vocalise social policy | 239 |
| | 5 | Broader implications | 241 |
| | 6 | More changes - surprise, surprise! | 243 |
| | 7 | Reflexivity and organizational change | 245 |

## Figures


| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1.1 | Chronology of events | 248 |
| 2.1 | Dimensions on the choice process for empirical research | 249 |
| 2.2 | Interviewees for this ethnography | 250 |
| 2.3 | Levels of people interviewed | 254 |
| 3.1 | Some related concepts in the organizational change literature | 255 |
| 3.2 | A model of organizations | 256 |
| 3.3 | Explanations of Laughlin's model of organizations | 257 |
| 3.4 | Significance of organizational changes | 258 |
| 3.5 | Laughlin's (1991) organic model and other metaphors | 259 |
| 4.1 | SAHT's employee facts and figures in 1988 | 260 |
| 4.2 | SAHT's financial figures for the year ended 30 June 1988 | 261 |
| 4.3 | Mapping SAHT's organizational changes from 1978 to 1989 | 262 |
| 5.1 | Presentation to Parker | 263 |
| 5.2 | Summary of changes and events for the year ended 30/6/1989 to 1990, at the end of Edward's leadership | 264 |
| 5.3 | Summary of changes and key events for the year ended 30/6/1991 to 1994, during Parker's leadership | 265 |
| 5.4 | New structure of corporate finance division | 266 |
| 5.5 | Financial reports to the board during early 1989 to mid 1991 | 267 |
| 5.6 | Financial reports to the board in April 1993 | 268 |
| 5.7 | Financial reports to the board, July 1993 | 269 |
| 5.8 | Map of the internal changes of the SAHT | 270 |
| 6.1 | Change in organizational relationship between the SAHT and the minister of housing | 271 |
| 6.2 | Mapping of externally imposed changes on the SAHT | 272 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 7.1 | An adaptation of Parker's presentation referring to 'change drivers', housing services seminar | 273 |
| 7.2 | Comparing changes of the SAHT between chapters 4,5,6 & 7 | 274 |
| | **Appendix 1** | 275 |
| | **Bibliography** | 276 |