

Carlos Reglero de la Fuente, «Cluny and its priories in fifteenth-century Castile»

Carlos REGLERO DE LA FUENTE, «[Cluny and its priories in fifteenth-century Castile](#)», *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies*, vol. 9/2, 2017, pp. 261–279.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/17546559.2017.1311416>.

*Carlos M. Reglero* ([creglero@fyl.uva.es](mailto:creglero@fyl.uva.es)) is Professor of Medieval History at the Department of Ancient and Medieval History at the University of Valladolid in Spain. He is currently Principal Investigator of the four-year project “Powers, Spaces and Writings in the Western Kingdoms of Spain”, funded by the Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad of Spain. His research focuses on social and monastic History of medieval Spain, mainly in Cluniac and Benedictine houses and its relation with society. Recent publications include *Amigos exigentes, servidores infieles. La crisis de la Orden de Cluny en España (1270–1379)* (Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2014); *Cluny en España. Los prioratos de la provincia y sus redes sociales (1073– ca. 1270)* (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, 2008); *El monasterio de San Isidro de Dueñas en la Edad Media. Un priorato cluniacense hispano (911–1478). Estudio y colección documental* (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, 2005); “El abad Domingo y la Primera Crónica Anónima de Sahagún: una relectura”, *e-Spania. Revue interdisciplinaire d'études hispaniques médiévales*, no. 19 (2014); “Los reyes hispanos y la reforma monástica benedictina”, in *Monasterios y monarcas: fundación, presencia y memoria regia en monasterios hispanos medievales*, 125–158 (Aguilar de Campoo: Centro de Estudios del Románico, 2012); “Cluny en el contexto político y cultural de la Península Ibérica, siglos XII y XIII”, in M. Tischler y A. Fidora, *Christlicher Norden – Muslimischer Süden: Ansprüche und Wirklichkeiten von Christen, Juden und Muslimen auf der Iberischen Halbinsel im Hoch- und Spätmittelalter*, 403–432 (Münster: Aschendorff, 2011); and with Franz Neiske, “Das neu entdeckte Necrolog von San Zoilo de Carrión de los Condes. Ein Beitrag zum Totengedenken der Abt Cluny”, *Frühmittelalterliche Studien* no. 41 (2007): 141–184. <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-3361-1815>

[261]

**Abstract:** Cluny's control over its Hispanic priories was weakened in the fifteenth century by the popes' interference in the naming of priors and in confirming alienations. The attempts made by the abbots Robert de Chaudesolles and Jean de Bourbon to reaffirm their authority were effective only for a time. Even so, the monks continued to consider themselves as Cluniacs, enjoying the privileges of the order, having recourse to their conservators and, especially, celebrating their own liturgy. Between 1470 and 1513, the papal appointment of commendatory abbots and the monarchs' support for the reform of San Benito de Valladolid led to the Cluniac priories becoming exempt from Cluny's jurisdiction. This was possible due to the disappearance, or inaction, of those agents who traditionally exercised control over the priories: priors, chamberlains and visitors.

**Keywords:** Cluny, Castile, Monasticism, Fifteenth century, Priory.

The last time Cluny's General Chapter appointed visitors for the province of Hispania was in 1514.\* Beginning in 1515 a joint appointment was made for Vasconia and Hispania,<sup>1</sup> indicating that Cluny recognized the *de facto* disappearance of its network in Spain. This was the result of a long process lasting more than a century. The creation of the Congregation of San Benito de Valladolid and its absorption of the Cluniac monasteries have already been studied,<sup>2</sup> while analyses of the long period that elapsed between the last visitation from Cluny in the fourteenth century (1392) and the incorporation of the priories by San Benito de Valladolid have focused either on the monastic domains or their relationship to the Congregation.<sup>3</sup> The present study centers, therefore, on two heretofore unaddressed issues: firstly, the relationship between the Abbey of Cluny and its Castilian priories throughout the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries; and secondly, what it meant to be Cluniac for Hispanic monasteries and monks in the context of a progressive distancing from the mother abbey.

[262]

### Hispania, a far-flung province

Castilian monasteries connected to Cluny<sup>4</sup> were rarely visited by the abbots of the abbey, due to the long distances. Control over the houses was exercised by naming a prior for each and sending a chamberlain to the Hispanic kingdoms to defend Cluny's interests

---

\* This article was produced as part of the research projects "Poderes, espacios y escrituras en los reinos occidentales hispánicos" (Reference HAR 2013-42925-P) and "Espacio, letra e imagen: el factor cluniacense en la Edad Media hispana desde sus inicios a su decadencia (ca. 1000-1500)" (Reference HAR2013-46921-P), financed by the Spanish government's Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad.

Abbreviations used: AESI-A, FC: Archivo España Compañía de Jesús, Alcalá de Henares, Fondo Carrión. AHN Clero: Archivo Histórico Nacional de Madrid, Sección Clero Regular y Secular. AHN Cod.: Archivo Histórico Nacional de Madrid, Sección Códices y Cartularios. AHN Osuna: Archivo Histórico Nacional, Sección Nobleza (Toledo), Osuna. AGS RGS: Archivo General de Simancas, Registro General del Sello. AMS: Archivo Municipal de Salamanca. AUPSA CSV: Archivo de la Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, Colegio de San Vicente. BNF FL: Bibliothèque Nationale de France (Paris), Fonds Latin. carp.: carpeta; leg.: legajo; lib.: libro.

<sup>1</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, VI, 27, 32.

<sup>2</sup> Zaragoza Pascual, *Generales*, I. Id., *Generales*, II. García Oro, *Reforma de los religiosos*.

<sup>3</sup> Cantera, "Incorporación de Nájera." Id., "Dominio navarro;" Id., "Alberguería;" Id., "Oficio de la limosnería." Pérez Celada, *Monasterio de San Zoilo*. Id., "Conflictos jurisdiccionales." García Catalán, "Monasterio de San Vicente." Colombás, "Orígenes y primer desarrollo." Reglero, *San Isidro de Dueñas*. There is no comprehensive study of the relationship between the Abbey of Cluny and its Hispanic priories in the fifteenth century. Segl (*Königtum*) recorded the end of each priory's connection to Cluny, and Robert ("État des monastères," 327) briefly commented on the *definitions* of 1460, the only ones from the fifteenth century.

<sup>4</sup> Segl, *Königtum*, 50–176. Reglero, *Cluny en España*, 152–64, 232–6.

at court and to supervise the work of the priors. In the mid-twelfth century, Cluny adopted a policy whereby the abbot's representative became the prior of one of the kingdom's two large Cluniac monasteries (Nájera or Carrión). The office was temporarily divided, with a chamberlain for Hispania and another for Galicia, but the two areas were soon reunified. Besides controlling the work of the priors and the conditions at the monasteries, the chamberlains also collected the annual *census* and other rents owed to Cluny.<sup>5</sup>

A third layer of control was created when Hugh V (1199–1207) regulated the annual celebration of the General Chapter and visitations to the priories. The situation of each priory was examined in the General Chapter, and instructions were given for improving and correcting discipline and administration, the so-called *definitiones* (resolutions). This system was in place throughout the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries—with some interruptions—allowing Cluny to supervise its Hispanic monasteries.<sup>6</sup> Another factor that served to strengthen the bonds with Cluny was the presence of French monks, often occupying prominent positions as officials or priors, up until the fourteenth century.<sup>7</sup>

These bonds gradually fell apart from the mid-fourteenth century onwards. To begin with, the abbots of Cluny could no longer appoint the priors, as the popes had extended their policy of reserving the benefices corresponding to these monasteries; at the time of the Schism, the papacy had already intervened in at least half a dozen priories, including the most important ones. This at first favored the appointment of French monks, but following the protests of the Castilian clergy during the reign of Enrique II, it was local monks who took control of the priories through papal expectative grace, that is, a mandate from the pope that conferred their expectation of succession as priors. In addition, the practice of dispatching French Cluniac monks to Castile was drastically curtailed as a result of the Black Death, when the French monasteries were decimated by the epidemic, leaving too few monks for any to be sent to other provinces.<sup>8</sup>

The office of chamberlain was, until 1369, occupied by the prior of one of the two great Cluniac monasteries in Castile: Carrión or Nájera. This provided the economic means for carrying out the duties of chamberlain, as well as an important reserve of monks to send to the less important priories when necessary.<sup>9</sup> When the abbot lost the ability to choose these priors, his capacity to act through the chamberlains was greatly reduced.

Despite all the above, the system of visitations was maintained in the last quarter of the fourteenth century. The reports from the 1377, 1387, 1392 and 1396 visitations, which are some of the most complete and detailed of the entire series, denounce the poor economic and disciplinary state of most of the priories, as well as the fact that some of the smaller [263] ones were abandoned.<sup>10</sup> The 1396 *definitiones* bring to a close a century and a half of reports containing detailed information about the state of the Hispanic monasteries. For the entire fifteenth century, the only *definitiones* that have survived are from 1460.

### **A long century of tensions: Attempts to maintain the province** ***The consequences of the Schism and Abbot Robert de Chaudesolles***

---

<sup>5</sup> Bishko, "Cluniac priories." Reglero, *Cluny en España*, 596–7, 604–22.

<sup>6</sup> Reglero, *Cluny en España*, 622–31. Id., *Amigos exigentes*, 278–95.

<sup>7</sup> Reglero, *Cluny en España*, 534–537. Id., *Amigos exigentes*, 181–4.

<sup>8</sup> Reglero, *Amigos exigentes*, 141–46, 183–84. Cantera, "Comunidad monástica," 248–51.

<sup>9</sup> Reglero, *Amigos exigentes*, 263–69.

<sup>10</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, IV, 115–16, 239–41, 306–11, 382–83. These desertions were only temporary, as all these priories were mentioned again in the fifteenth century, which demonstrates the efficacy of the measures taken.

The Western or Papal Schism affected the relationship between Cluny and its priories in England, which supported the pope in Rome.<sup>11</sup> France and Castile sided with Avignon, so their relations with Cluny were not affected. However, in 1398, both kingdoms withdrew their recognition of Benedict XIII in order to force his resignation, but the strategy failed and they recognized him once more in mid-1403.<sup>12</sup> The Ordinance promulgated in Castile in 1399 stated that the monks would choose their abbots and that the latter would be confirmed by their superiors, a measure that did not contradict the authority of the abbot of Cluny.<sup>13</sup> It is not known if this contributed in any way to the fact that no visitors were appointed for Spain between 1402 and 1408. In 1409, the standard two visitors were designated for the province of Spain as a whole, but it is important to note that between 1410 and 1414 separate visitors were designated for the two provinces of Hispania (i.e., Castile) and Aragon.<sup>14</sup>

The abbot resumed appointing priors and the province was divided at a time when the obedience of the Hispanic priories was compromised by the Schism. France once more withdrew obedience to Benedict XIII in January 1407 and supported the Council of Pisa, which elected a new pope in 1409. Cluny participated in this council and was punished by Benedict with the withdrawal, in 1407, of the obedience of its priories in Savoy, which continued to be loyal to Benedict.<sup>15</sup> Castile and Aragon also remained loyal to this Hispanic pope up to the very last moment: Aragon withdrew its obedience at the end of 1415; Castile on June 18, 1417.<sup>16</sup>

After the election of the pope in Pisa, Benedict XIII chose to put the Hispanic priories of Cluny under his authority. On December 28, 1411, he named Rodrigo prior of Santa María de Nájera, visitor and reformer of the Cluniac monasteries in Spain.<sup>17</sup> He claimed that the abbot of Cluny, who usually made this appointment, had chosen to disobey him and support the Schism, thus it fell to the pope to make the appointment to ensure the spiritual and temporal reform of the Hispanic monasteries.

Rodrigo had become Nájera's prior in 1399<sup>18</sup> and vicar and chamberlain to the abbot of Cluny in Spain in 1400.<sup>19</sup> He was, therefore, an important figure within the order in Spain, [264] who chose to be loyal to his king and pope. This is not surprising, since the Castilian bishops and abbots owed their offices more to the pope than to any other superior. The appointment was not a mere formality, however, since Rodrigo acted as chamberlain in matters for the priory of Carrión through one of his procurator monks, the bachelor Domingo Fernández.<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> Guilloreau, "Prieurés anglais," 360–72. Dobson, "English Cluniac Houses," 568–70.

<sup>12</sup> Suárez Fernández, *Castilla, el Cisma*, 39–40, 47. Cluny defended Benedict XIII (Riche, "Cluny et le débat," 308–14).

<sup>13</sup> González Dávila, *Historia de la vida*, 138. Although the lists of priors are incomplete, we know a new prior was named in Pombeiro between August 1398 and May 1401. However, we do not know how he was chosen (Lucas and Lucas, *Pombeiro*, 125–27).

<sup>14</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, V, 9, 39, 41, 48.

<sup>15</sup> Riche, "Cluny et le débat," 317–28. Leclercq, "Cluny pendant le Grand Schisme."

<sup>16</sup> Stump, "Council of Constance," 416–24. Suárez Fernández, *Castilla, el Cisma*, 88–89, 95. In May 1417, Benedict XIII still gave a papal bull of protection for its estate to the priory of Jubia: AHN Cód 63B, núm. 107.

<sup>17</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1709, núm. 14.

<sup>18</sup> Cantera, *Santa María la Real de Nájera*, III, 1625–30.

<sup>19</sup> AHN Clero leg 8349 (22 September 1400). AHN Clero carp 1035, núm. 13, 14, 15, 16. A situation recognized by the abbot himself.

<sup>20</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1709, núm. 14.

Rodrigo continued to be prior of Nájera until his promotion to the Sahagún Abbey (1418).<sup>21</sup> He was succeeded by Rodrigo López, who was chosen in January 1419 by the abbot Robert de Chaudesolles (1416–23) as his vicar general, chamberlain, *receptor* (collector of rents), commissary and procurator in the kingdoms of Spain, Portugal, Leon, Castile, Navarre and Aragon. In particular, he was given the special power to collect the rents owed to the abbot in the province. In addition, he was given ecclesiastical jurisdiction over the members of the order and the power to transfer them from one monastery to another.<sup>22</sup>

Robert de Chaudesolles wanted to regain control over Cluny's far-flung provinces. In December 1417, he sent two prominent Cluniac monks to visit the province of Germany, with the backing of the emperor, Sigismund, and Pope Martin V. The visitation lasted until March 1418 and included numerous monasteries of Black Monks who were not Cluniac but who received the visitors with the utmost honor and reverence.<sup>23</sup>

What he did in Castile is known through his record book. Between May 1418, after his return from the Council of Constance, and April 1421, fourteen rulings concerning this province were copied: collations of monastic offices which allege a prior's negligence and ineptness, a license to study outside the monastery, an absolution from excommunication, a subpoena for a prior to appear before the General Chapter, instructions to the chamberlain to investigate certain crimes reported to abbots, and more.<sup>24</sup>

Robert was also worried about the collection of the *census* and other rents owed by Spanish priors and monks, something that was necessary to balance the accounts of the Abbey of Cluny, which was deeply in debt.<sup>25</sup> The person responsible for collecting them was Rodrigo López, as vicar, chamberlain and general *receptor*. He received significant quantities of gold and silver, in the abbot's name, in payment of the *census*, *vicesimas* (special subsidies) and other debts from previous years. It is known that Rodrigo was held accountable to the abbot's treasurer, paying a part and promising his own and the priory's goods and rents as collateral for the rest. The 1422 General Chapter refers to the litigation between the prior and the abbot's procurator over this and other matters.<sup>26</sup> When Rodrigo resigned his Nájera office, he told the new prior that he still owed 50 gold francs and 32 florins. The new prior, Pedro Martínez de Santa Coloma, had to negotiate an agreement with the abbot regarding the payment of this sum, which was distributed over two years, so that Nájera would not be obliged to hand over its properties because of the promise made by Rodrigo (1423).<sup>27</sup> In fact, Pedro had previously received authorization from the abbot [265] of Cluny (December 1420) to collect the entire *census*, subsidies and other rents due to Cluny.<sup>28</sup>

In April 1422, a new chamberlain appears in Spain, Pedro Pérez de Belorado, whom the abbot had named as prior of Carrión in 1421.<sup>29</sup> Pedro de Belorado was also the abbot's visitor and *receptor*, and as such he continued to collect the *census*. A letter has survived

---

<sup>21</sup> The last mention of him in Nájera is on November 10, 1417 (AHN Clero carp. 1036, núm. 19); he is cited as abbot of Sahagún on July 19, 1419 (AHN Cód 107B, fol. 159r–v).

<sup>22</sup> BNF FL 9879, fols. 127r–v.

<sup>23</sup> Riche, "Cluny et le débat," 33435. Duckett, *Visitations and chapters-general*, 118–85.

<sup>24</sup> BNF FL 9879, fols. 89v–91r, 127r–128v, 154r–157r, 188r–v.

<sup>25</sup> Riche, *L'Ordre de Cluny*, 608–17.

<sup>26</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, V, 79.

<sup>27</sup> AHN Clero, carp 1037, núm. 9.

<sup>28</sup> AHN Clero, carp 1037, núm. 5.

<sup>29</sup> AHN Clero, carp. 1711, núm. 11, 12. Pedro was the precentor of Nájera (BNF FL 9879, fols. 188r–v).

in which the prior of Villaverde recognizes that he owes 30 florins or 1,500 *maravedies* corresponding to the years 1422, 1423, and 1424.<sup>30</sup>

***Early rebellions against Cluny and the first priories to break away: Jean de Bourbon's attempted reform***

During the long tenure of the elderly Abbot Odon de la Perrière (1423–56),<sup>31</sup> Cluny suffered its first definitive loss of a Hispanic priory (Budiño), as well as the rebellion of Carrión, which for centuries had been the seat of the chamberlain for the Iberian Peninsula. It was the start of the dissolution of the Cluniac province of Hispania, even though the chamberlains of Cluny continued to perform their duties during this period and maintained contact with the abbey.

Budiño had been involved in a long dispute with the bishop of Tuy concerning exemption. This led to the priory's economic ruin and to its coming under the power of various cardinals.<sup>32</sup> In 1392 it was ruled by an incapable monk from another order and was destroyed by wars and inept management.<sup>33</sup> In the end, the cathedral of Tuy prevailed, and on June 1, 1435, Pope Eugene IV merged Budiño with the chapter of Tuy in order to increase the rents.<sup>34</sup>

Much more serious was the rebellion of Pedro de Belorado, the prior of Carrión. In 1421, he acted as the Abbey of Cluny's visitor during the General Chapter, a role that demonstrates his prestige.<sup>35</sup> He was Cluny's chamberlain in Spain at least between 1422 and 1424. This later caused a dispute with the abbot over the quantities collected in his name and that were owed to him. In 1431, Pedro de Belorado's successor as chamberlain claimed that the sum of 370 Aragonese florins was still owed to Cluny; the dispute had by that point been going on for over two years, during which time Gómez de Benavides, an important lord in the region and the monastery's advocate, had prevented payment.<sup>36</sup>

Pedro de Belorado was also chaplain to King John II of Navarre,<sup>37</sup> the head of one of the factions that disputed control over the kingdom of Castile at this time.<sup>38</sup> In February 1427, this king acted as judge in the dispute between the priors of Carrión and the lords of Frómista concerning jurisdiction over the district of San Martín in Frómista.<sup>39</sup> The [266] compromise reached had to be ratified by the pope, and for even greater security, the envoy had to pass through Cluny on his way to Rome in order to get the abbot's consent.<sup>40</sup> This demonstrates that Carrión still acknowledged Cluny's authority, although it was considered secondary to that of Rome.

In 1428, Pedro de Belorado was excommunicated by the abbot of Cluny for failing to attend the General Chapter and to provide any excuse for his absence. He was similarly punished at all subsequent Chapters until his death.<sup>41</sup> However, the pope named Pedro abbot of Carrión in the final years of his life, and he figures as such in the monastery's necrology.<sup>42</sup> Gonzalo Martínez de Cervatos, the new prior, was excommunicated for the

<sup>30</sup> AHN Clero, leg 5351 (6 April 1424).

<sup>31</sup> Valous, "*Cluny* (Abbaye et Ordre de)," 104–5.

<sup>32</sup> Reglero, *Amigos exigentes*, 123, 127–28.

<sup>33</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, IV, 309–10.

<sup>34</sup> Galindo Romeo, *Tuy en la baja Edad Media*, 83.

<sup>35</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, V, 70.

<sup>36</sup> AHN Clero, leg. 5344 (June 9–10, 1431). The prior of Carrión had sent his accounts to the abbot, who determined that he was owed the above-mentioned number of florins.

<sup>37</sup> AHN Clero leg. 5328 (July 1422) and AHN Clero, leg 5342 (February 21, 1427).

<sup>38</sup> Benito Ruano, *Los infantes*.

<sup>39</sup> Pérez Celada, "Conflictos jurisdiccionales," 174–85.

<sup>40</sup> AHN Clero leg. 5342 (February 21, 1427).

<sup>41</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, V, 95, 109, 117, 138, 152.

<sup>42</sup> AHN Clero, carp. 1713, núm. 13 (August 6, 1437). *Necrologio*, fol. 7v.

same reason, in addition to the fact that he claimed to be an abbot (1443), as did his successor, Pedro de Tosantos.<sup>43</sup> Gonzalo had been named abbot of Carrión in a papal bull issued by Eugene IV (June 4, 1438).<sup>44</sup>

Carrión's rebellion also affected the priory of San Román de Entrepeñas. In 1442, a dispute over this monastery between three monks was heard by the apostolic judges,<sup>45</sup> at which time Gonzalo took the opportunity to press for a union with Carrión. On November 10, 1446, Eugene IV proceeded with San Román's definitive annexation, ordering that two priests be kept there to serve the church and pay the *census* to Cluny.<sup>46</sup> San Román did not lose its status as a Cluniac priory, but it did fall under the authority of an abbot who did not obey Cluny.

The problems continued after the death of Abbot Odon and under his successor, Jean de Bourbon (1456–80). In 1458, the monastery of San Miguel de Zamora, which was a priory of Marcigny, was made dependent on San Benito de Valladolid. This was arranged by the prior of San Benito and Pedro de Lagartos, the last Cluniac prior of Zamora (February 4, 1457), and ratified by Nicholas V (June 13, 1458).<sup>47</sup>

Several of Odon's documents that relate to Castile have survived. Most importantly, there is one showing that he intervened in the annexation of the monastery of Santa Ágata in Ciudad Rodrigo to that of San Vicente in Salamanca, at the petition of the latter's prior, who claimed that the rents his monastery collected were meager and that this could be remedied by receiving those of the monastery in Ciudad Rodrigo, which in any case was vacant and in poor condition (May 23, 1450).<sup>48</sup>

Odon's early years had coincided with the activity of the last-known chamberlain for the Hispanic kingdoms. This was Alfonso, prior of San Boal del Pinar, a small monastery inhabited by only the prior and one other monk, and only part of the time. Like his predecessors, Alfonso was in addition to chamberlain also a visitor, *receptor* of the rents owed to Cluny, and Vicar General of the order in Spain. He was chamberlain from at least 1429, having succeeded Pedro de Belorado. It was Alfonso who in June 1431 demanded the amounts owed to Cluny from the prior of Carrión, which the latter had collected in his name.<sup>49</sup> In July 1433, [267] he examined and authorized, in his role as the abbot's vicar and chamberlain, an important exchange of ecclesiastical properties arranged by the prior of Salamanca, which was ratified by Abbot Odon in November that same year.<sup>50</sup> Finally, in December 1433, he authorized another exchange by the prior of Jubia.<sup>51</sup> The prior of San Boal was appointed visitor for Spain by the General Chapter between 1430 and 1439, and again in 1445, 1446 and 1449, although it is not certain that it was the same individual who was appointed for all of these years (i.e., leadership of this priory may have changed hands). Regardless, the fact of being named visitor did not prevent the prior's excommunication in 1445, 1446 and 1449, as a result of not attending the Chapter. This is evidence that those who appointed the visitors often simply repeated the choice of the previous year and that the collection of rents for Cluny in Spain was a thankless job

---

<sup>43</sup> Ibid., V, 196, 206, 215, 238, 254, 260, 283, 293, 300, 310, 312, 322.

<sup>44</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1713, núm. 17

<sup>45</sup> AHN Clero leg. 5344 (November 16, 1442).

<sup>46</sup> Ruiz Asencio, Ruiz Albi and Herrero Jiménez, *Colección Entrepeñas*, 199–203.

<sup>47</sup> Zaragoza Pascual, *Generales*, I, 136–37. AHN Clero leg. 8349 (September 16, 1458).

<sup>48</sup> AUPSA CSV carp. pergamino, núm. 10

<sup>49</sup> AHN Clero, leg. 5344 (June 9–10, 1431).

<sup>50</sup> He hands over two villages to the city council of Salamanca in exchange for an annual rent of 80, plus 200 florins for repairs to the monastery (AUPSA CSV, caja 144, núm. 24).

<sup>51</sup> AHN Cód 63B, núm. 55.

that, from the perspective of the abbey, rarely produced satisfactory results due to the difficulties involved.<sup>52</sup>

The bachelor Juan Sánchez de Hortigosa, prior of Salamanca (from at least 1456 to 1465), was another monk whose problems stemmed from similar causes. The letter he wrote in April 1458 to the new abbot of Cluny, Jean de Bourbon, has survived. In it, he recounts that he had sent a smaller amount than required because of his inability to collect more. This had resulted in his excommunication and recall to Cluny. The prior alleges that he cannot make the journey due to the harshness of the winter and writes that he is sending his fellow monk with a bill of exchange worth 50 écus. He also explains the poor state of his priory and refers to a lawsuit with a Cistercian abbot who had a bull to annex the monastery to his own. The prior of Salamanca thus requested a new appointment letter, since the one given him by Abbot Odon was not valid for reasons now unknown. Finally, he explains the lamentable state of the order in the Crown of Castile, stressing that if visitors and reformers were not sent, Cluny's priories there would soon be lost and the order would disappear in Spain.<sup>53</sup>

Jean de Bourbon tried to re-establish the authority of the order in the provinces of England and Spain, for which task he appointed special procurators and visitors in 1458. In England, these efforts came to nothing, due to a lack of support from the king. In Spain, however, a visitation did take place in 1459, perhaps with the support of the Castilian monarch, whom Abbot Jean had addressed through the prior of Salamanca (even though by April 1458 he had still not managed to speak directly with him).

The visitors' reception ceremony is described in detail in the *definitiones* of 1460, whereas the spiritual state and temporal administration of the monasteries (alienation, debts) is hardly dealt with at all. This is because there was a desire to leave a record of the fact that these priories obeyed the letters of the abbot of Cluny and recognized his authority, including the right of visitation. Other areas of concern for the visitors were respect for Cluny's dress code, the proper celebration of liturgy and correct behavior in the dormitory, refectory and cloister, as this was what differentiated Cluniac monks from those of other orders.<sup>54</sup>

**[268]** Despite its limitations, the visitation provided temporary assurance of the recognition of the abbot's authority and of his right to collect the annual *census* and other rents. A list has survived with the amounts claimed by Cluny from its Hispanic priories according to the three *vicesimas* and three increases approved by the General Chapter (1459) and authorized by the pope (October 6, 1459).<sup>55</sup> The list includes all the priors and some of the officials of Nájera, Carrión, Dueñas, Villafranca, Jubia and Villaverde. The amount demanded totaled 335 florins and 121.5 francs, including some rents from priories such as Zamora and Budiño, which no longer belonged to Cluny.

### ***From commendatory abbots to the Congregation of San Benito de Valladolid***

Jean de Bourbon's reforms were hampered by the wars that broke out in France and Castile in the following decades. The Hispanic priors hoped to evade the authority of the abbot and the General Chapter, looking to the pope for protection. However, between 1488 and 1490, Abbot Jacques d'Amboise (1481–1510) still ratified two agreements

---

<sup>52</sup> Designations of visitor: Charvin, *Statuts*, V, 110, 112, 119, 139, 153, 185, 191, 216, 241, 256. Excommunications: *Ibid.*, 215, 238, 254.

<sup>53</sup> BNF FL 5461, fol. 67.

<sup>54</sup> A detailed analysis of this visit: Reglero, "Cum reverentia."

<sup>55</sup> Caillet, "Décadence de l'Ordre de Cluny," 203, 221. Riche, *L'Ordre de Cluny*, 614–15. The amounts solicited: Sáez, *Demostración histórica*, 358–59.

between the priory and the city council of Salamanca.<sup>56</sup> All this coincided with the growing tendency for monasteries to be conceded to cardinals and other ecclesiastics in *commendam*. Most Castilian priories were incorporated into the Congregation of San Benito de Valladolid or annexed to one of its monasteries, although Villaverde and Villafranca were handed over to foundations sponsored by local lords (see the following table). This process was backed by the Catholic Monarchs, who wanted to reform the monasteries and wrest control over them from foreign powers or commendatory abbots (cardinals, etc.).<sup>57</sup> In the case of the Cluniac priories, the French wars undoubtedly played a part, since the Abbey Cluny was in the kingdom of France. The cases of the two most important monasteries will be explained below in greater detail.

When Carrión was recognized as an exempt abbey, Eugene IV reserved the papal right to its provision. Nevertheless, when Carrion's first abbot, Pedro de Belorado, died, its monks elected Gonzalo, until then prior of San Román de Entrepeñas. He managed to get the pope's confirmation by paying 200 gold florins as common service.<sup>58</sup> This situation was repeated in July 1461, two years after the reception of the Cluniac visitors. In this instance, the one elected was Pedro, the prior and almoner, who was confirmed by Pius II.<sup>59</sup> However, in 1470, Paul II opted to give the abbotship to Pedro de Mendoza, the bishop of Sigüenza and the future cardinal, as perpetual administrator (1470–84);<sup>60</sup> Mendoza, in turn, left the office to a relative, Luis Hurtado de Mendoza (1484–1507).<sup>61</sup>

Carrión continued to be considered a Cluniac monastery during all this time, though not subject to the abbot or the General Chapter. When it was necessary to ratify an alienation or the transfer of goods between the abbot's and the convent's estates, the license was [269] solicited from the pope, not from Cluny.<sup>62</sup> This did not prevent the prior (not the abbot) of Carrión from being commissioned by the abbot of Cluny to validate an exchange of properties in 1488.<sup>63</sup> In 1507 another Mendoza, Martín, son of the Duke of the Infantado, alleged that Carrión was a Cluniac priory in order to invalidate the incorporation of the monastery into the Congregation of San Benito de Valladolid, but he was unsuccessful. [270] Although there were still commendatory abbots until 1524–27, the monastery's community was made up of reformed monks from Valladolid from 1507–9 onwards.<sup>64</sup>

The separation of Nájera, the other great Cluniac priory in Castile, from Cluny was a long process. In May 1486, the prior, Gonzalo de Cabredo (or de Vergara), who had been promoted by Callixtus III thirty years before, died. The monks chose to replace him with Pablo Martínez de Uruñuela, their infirmarer and treasurer; the abbot of Cluny named Diego de Garnica; and Pope Innocent VIII handed the priory over to his vice-chancellor, Rodrigo Borgia. Pablo and Rodrigo negotiated an agreement whereby Pablo would pay Rodrigo an annual pension of 350 ducats in exchange for Rodrigo's renouncing his claim to the priory. This allowed the pope to confirm Pablo.<sup>65</sup>

---

<sup>56</sup> AUPSA CSV, caja 144, núm. 14; caja 157, núm. 37.

<sup>57</sup> García Oro, *Reforma de los religiosos*, 31–33.

<sup>58</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1713, núm. 16, 17. Hoberg, *Taxae*, 338.

<sup>59</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1714, núm. 17, 18.

<sup>60</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1715, núm. 2.

<sup>61</sup> AHN Clero leg 5339 (12 March 1484). Ruiz Asencio, Ruiz Albi and Herrero Jiménez, *Colección Entrepeñas*, 204–6.

<sup>62</sup> The properties of Toro: AHN Clero leg. 5345 (25 January 1444; 7 August 1449). Paul II ratified the transfer of the rents of the abbot's estate to that of the convent in 1468 (AHN Clero carp. 1714, núm. 21).

<sup>63</sup> AUPSA CSV, caja 144, núm. 14.

<sup>64</sup> García Oro and Portela, *Los monasterios*, 293–94, 298–303, 303–6.

<sup>65</sup> Cantera, "Viaje a Roma," 325–27. The designation: AHN Cód 108B, fol. 200r–203r. The pension: AHN Cód 108B, fol. 242r–v. The quantity was considerable, since the priory did not bring in more than 900 florins annually.

The relationship of the prior with the powerful Rodrigo Borgia led to Pope Innocent VIII removing Nájera from the jurisdiction of Cluny and elevating it to the level of an abbey (1490). He cited the importance of the town of Nájera, the large number of monks (between 20 and 25), its status as a royal pantheon, but especially the multiple inconveniences of its belonging to Cluny, a monastery 20 or more days away, in a different kingdom with another language. The monks were obliged to profess in Cluny, which was difficult because of the distance and the wars; it was dangerous to attend their General Chapter; and what was more, some monks who were sent there abandoned monastic life. The visitations, far from improving life in the monastery, had become an intrusion that disturbed the peace of the priors and the monks, because the monks who made the visitations were not “discreet”. All of this was done at great expense, which could have been better employed for divine worship. Even so, the measure was temporary, to last only for as long as Rodrigo and Pablo should live, and Nájera maintained the right to claim the privileges of the Order of Cluny.<sup>66</sup>

Separation from Cluny offered the Catholic Monarchs the opportunity to reform the monastery and include it in the Observance of Valladolid. In 1496, some chapters were promulgated concerning the administration, the liturgy and the monks’ way of life. This entailed breaking with the customs of Cluny and adopting those of San Benito de Valladolid. Thus, the division of the monastery’s income between the abbot, the convent and the offices was abolished, and the divine office was notably reduced.<sup>67</sup> Pedro de Nájera, abbot of Valladolid, ex-Cluniac monk of Nájera, Salamanca and San Boal,<sup>68</sup> forced an agreement on Nájera’s inclusion in the Congregation (1502–3). The permanent exemption from Cluny would be negotiated, but Pablo and the monks who so wished would be allowed to leave the monastery and live under obedience to the pope and the abbot of Cluny. The astute abbot of Nájera relented with the monarchs in Castile, but in Rome, he negotiated the ceding of the abbotship to his nephew, Fernando Marín. Julius II handed the abbey over to the latter (1505) and exempted Nájera from the jurisdiction of San Benito de Valladolid, claiming that it was subject to the jurisdiction of Cluny. After much dispute, the Catholic King, Fernando, managed to get Julius II and Leo X to put a definitive end to the Cluniac Order in Nájera and unite the monastery [271] to Valladolid (1513). The Cluniac monks of Nájera retired to San Jorge de Azuelo, where they could continue their Cluniac way of life, but they were not allowed to admit new monks.<sup>69</sup>

### **Being Cluniac in fifteenth-century Castile**

At the start of the fifteenth century, the province of Hispania had 21 monasteries directly dependent on Cluny, Marcigny or La Charité-sur-Loire, of which 15 were in Castile. In addition, Carrión had at least one dependent priory, San Lorenzo de Villalpando.<sup>70</sup> There were approximately 58 monks in the Castilian priories.<sup>71</sup> For these monasteries and these monks, what did being Cluniac mean?

---

<sup>66</sup> AHN Cód 108B, fol. 304r–309r. Cantera, “Viaje a Roma.”

<sup>67</sup> Pacheco, *Política española*, 26–40. Cantera, “Incorporación de Nájera,” 514–15.

<sup>68</sup> Zaragoza Pascual, *Generales*, II, 38–39. Velasco Bayón and others, *Colección Cuéllar*, II, 1482.

<sup>69</sup> Cantera, “Incorporación,” 516–28.

<sup>70</sup> AESI-A, FC, C-11 (49-2), núm. 43. AHN Clero carp. 1714, núm. 8. AHN Clero, carp. 1714, núm.

<sup>71</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, IV, 306–11.

### *The disappearance of the instruments of control*

The appointment of priors had been a key prerogative of the abbot of Cluny, which, over the course of the fourteenth century, was gradually assumed by the pope. This continued into the fifteenth century, though not without pushback, until the pope was interfering in all the monasteries. It is therefore not surprising that the priors of Nájera and Carrión should say that their positions were “by the grace of God”<sup>72</sup> and “by the Holy Church of Rome.”<sup>73</sup>

Pombeiro was handed over by Benedict XIII to Gonzalo de Ponte, presbyter of the Order of Saint Benedict (1406),<sup>74</sup> and by Callixtus III to Velasco de Sarrea (1457), who, after professing at the Augustine monastery of Sarrea, had moved to the Benedictine monastery of Samos.<sup>75</sup> Pombeiro had become vacant after Callixtus III transferred its prior to Villafranca (1456), which was also a Cluniac monastery.<sup>76</sup> This pope gave Nájera first to Martín Sánchez de Arenzana, Nájera’s claustral prior, and later to Gonzalo de Cabredo, a monk from San Millán de la Cogolla (1456), which led to a dispute.<sup>77</sup> Paul II gave the priory of Burgos to Juan Rodríguez, a monk from Dueñas (1467).<sup>78</sup> Sixtus IV confirmed Juan de la Serna, a monk from Carrión, as prior of Salamanca, without him having to leave the San Pedro de Montes Abbey (1480).<sup>79</sup>

In some cases, the abbot of Cluny or the prior of Marcigny exercised their right of provision, but their appointee was replaced if a papal candidate was named. Perhaps they limited themselves to complying with a letter of expectations awarded by the pope. Thus, in 1447, Sancho González de Samaniego, a professed monk of the Order of Cluny, took possession of the priory of Zamora by virtue of a letter from the prior of [272] Marcigny. However, four years later, this did not prevent the priory from being handed over four years later to Pedro de Lagartos, a monk from Sahagún, by the apostolic executor judge.<sup>80</sup>

In 1421, Abbot Robert declared that he had promoted Pedro Pérez de Belorado to the position of prior of Carrión. It must have been only a formality, as Pedro had to pay the papal sub-collector for his benefice (1424), despite claiming that he had not been appointed by the pope but by the abbot of Cluny (1422). In fact, in 1419, Pedro Pérez de Belorado and Pedro Martínez de Santa Coloma, monks of Nájera, had pleaded with the pope to transfer them to another Benedictine monastery, complaining that many pilgrims passed through Nájera on their way to Santiago.<sup>81</sup> However, this did not prevent Pedro de Belorado from accepting the priorship of another priory along the Way of Saint James or Pedro de Santa Coloma from doing the same in Nájera in 1422.<sup>82</sup>

Although the abbot of Cluny could not choose priors, he did name several officials at the monasteries of Carrión and Nájera during the first half of the fifteenth century. Several of Robert de Chaudesolles’s registration letters refer to the appointment,

---

<sup>72</sup> In Nájera from 1402 (AHN Clero carp 1035, núm. 5). In Carrión from 1415 (AHN Clero carp. 1709, núm. 18)

<sup>73</sup> Nájera en 1431: AHN Cód 107B, fol.217r–226v. Carrión: AHN Clero leg 5341 (January 23, 1443).

<sup>74</sup> Beltrán de Heredia, *Bulario Salamanca*, I, 603.

<sup>75</sup> Rius, *Regesto Calixto III*, II, 480–81.

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid.*, II, 202.

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, II, 222, 236.

<sup>78</sup> Beolchini, Pavón and García de Cortázar, *Documentación medieval*, 261.

<sup>79</sup> AUPSA CSV carp. pergaminos, núm. 12. This system of providing benefices was accepted because it benefited the monks of the kingdom, even though they belonged to another Order. The last Cluniac prior in Castile of French origin was Mosen Beltrán de Sant Bassyl, doctor in decrees (Carrión, 1403): Palacio, *Colección San Zoil*, II, 37. AHN Clero leg. 5342 (July 25–27, 1403).

<sup>80</sup> AHN Clero leg. 8349 (November 18, 1447) and AHN Clero carp. 3581, núm. 1 (May 7, 1451).

<sup>81</sup> BNF, FL 9879, fols. 188r–v. AHN Clero leg. 5328 (July 1422). AHN Clero leg 5345 (April 28, 1424). Ruiz de Loizaga, *Documentación Calahorra-Logroño*, 135–36.

<sup>82</sup> AHN Cód 107B, fols.193r–194v.

confirmation or removal of these officials between 1418 and 1421: the almoner of Carrión, the cantor of Carrión, the almoner of Nájera, the precentor of Nájera,<sup>83</sup> even the sacristan of Frómista, a secular cleric who served this ancient priory.<sup>84</sup> There are records of a conflict between the abbot of Cluny and the prior of Nájera as a result of this (1444–48), which the General Chapter was asked to resolve; additional registers refer the abbot's appointment of the infirmarer in Nájera (1448), after he promoted the previous one to the position of prior of Salamanca.<sup>85</sup>

A second means of controlling the priories had been the chamberlains. We only know the names of four of them from the fifteenth century: Rodrigo (1400–18) and Rodrigo López (1419–21), both priors of Nájera; Pedro Pérez de Belorado, prior of Carrión (1422–24), and Alfonso, prior of San Boal del Pinar (1431–33). Their powers, detailed in a letter from Abbot Robert (1419), were broad: to administer vacant priories and deaneries; to collect the *census* and other rents or economic rights belonging to the abbey; to absolve from excommunications due to non-payment; to move the monks from one house to another within the province or send them to Cluny, depending on their offences; to exercise ecclesiastical jurisdiction over the members of the order; and to act as the abbot's vicar.<sup>86</sup> However, most of their activity that we know of from the extant documents related to the collection of the abbey's rents and *census*. The office is not mentioned again after 1433, although in 1458 the prior of Salamanca was exercising the same functions.<sup>87</sup> The office lost importance as its duties were reduced to those of the abbot's procurator, a rent collector.

A third element of control was the visitors. The General Chapter stopped appointing them between 1402 and 1408, for reasons unknown. They began to be named again in 1409, when Castile and Aragon recognized a pope to whom Cluny had refused obedience. [273] In 1411, Benedict XIII designated the prior of Nájera as visitor of the order in Spain.<sup>88</sup> There was no conflict, since Cluny also designated the same prior, in addition to the prior of Carrión, as visitors for the same period. The General Chapter continued appointing visitors until 1514, except for odd years here and there (1434, 1436, 1462). There was a growing tendency to name the same priors or monks year after year, such as the priors of Nájera and Dueñas between 1464 and 1481. This does not mean that they did not act as visitors, at least in the first half of the century: the priors of San Boal and Zamora, visitors between 1431 and 1433, examined the validity of an exchange of properties arranged by the prior of Salamanca.<sup>89</sup> The prior of San Boal, chamberlain from 1431 to 1433, was designated visitor almost every year between 1430 and 1449, while the chamberlain of Salamanca, who wrote the letter to the abbot of Cluny in 1458, was visitor between 1456 and 1461.<sup>90</sup> Juan de Serna, prior of Salamanca, who was the recipient of letters from Jacques II, was visitor in 1488–95 and 1503–5. Everything would seem to indicate that the appointees were in closer contact with Cluny during this period, although not constantly (Juan de Serna died in 1505 but was still named visitor once more).

Only the 1460 General Chapter took measures concerning the province of Hispania.<sup>91</sup> A letter from Abbot Odon dated June 9, 1438, orders cluniacs in Spain to obey the

---

<sup>83</sup> BNF FL 9879, fols. 89v–90v, 127v–128r, 154r, 188r–v.

<sup>84</sup> BNF FL 9879, fols. 90v–91r.

<sup>85</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1038, núm. 3, 4.

<sup>86</sup> BNF FL 9879, fols. 127r–v.

<sup>87</sup> BNF FL 5461, fol. 67.

<sup>88</sup> AHN Clero carp. 1709, núm. 14.

<sup>89</sup> AUPSA CSV, caja 144, núm. 24.

<sup>90</sup> Charvin, *Statuts*, V, 313, 315, 337, 348, 354.

<sup>91</sup> *Ibid.*, V, 339–44.

appointed visitors and the priors to attend the 1439 General Chapter.<sup>92</sup> However, by 1490, the prior of Nájera considered the visitors, who from time to time passed through his monastery, to be more of a nuisance than an efficient instrument of correction and reform.<sup>93</sup>

### *Continuity*

Being a member of the Cluniac Order meant paying the annual *census* and extraordinary taxes. News of delays and non-payment are frequent up until the *definitiones* of 1460. This was a cause for concern for Cluny, given its high level of debt, which explains why the first consequence of the reforms of Robert de Chaudesolles or Jean de Bourbon was the collection of the *census*.<sup>94</sup> The variety of tributes—among them the *census*, pensions, *vicesimas*, subsidies, and *spolia*—and the extent of the powers given by the abbot to the *receptor* were considerable. To force payment, they could bring the debtors before the abbot or excommunicate them, lifting the excommunication when payment was made.<sup>95</sup> If the priors had problems paying the *census* on time,<sup>96</sup> the *receptor* likewise had difficulties paying the abbot the amount due, since he had been unable to collect it.<sup>97</sup> The annexation of [274] monasteries or their liberation from Cluny were initially carried out without affecting the obligation to pay the annual *census*,<sup>98</sup> although what was especially burdensome was the frequent extraordinary taxes.<sup>99</sup>

Another practice associated with being a Cluniac monastery that was maintained was the prohibition against alienating properties without a license from the abbot or his chamberlain. To do so was to risk incurring the annulment of the sale or exchange; so, when the transaction was important, some buyers asked for it to be authorized by the abbot of Cluny. Several such licenses or ratifications from the abbot or his chamberlain in the fifteenth century have survived.<sup>100</sup> Even so, other monasteries chose to get the pope's confirmation, who was considered to outrank the abbot.<sup>101</sup> While Abbot Odon ratified the annexation of Ciudad Rodrigo to Salamanca in 1450, it was Pope Eugene IV who approved San Román's annexation to Carrión in 1446. The abbot's or pope's

---

<sup>92</sup> AHN Clero carp 1037, núm. 20.

<sup>93</sup> AHN Cód 108B, fol. 304r–309r.

<sup>94</sup> Reglero, “*Cum reverentia*.”

<sup>95</sup> BNF, FL 9879, fols. 127r–v. AHN Clero carp 1037, núm. 5.

<sup>96</sup> In 1424, the Villaverde's prior promised to pay the *census* of the previous three years in ten days, suffering excommunication if he did not: AHN Clero leg 5351 (6 April 1424). In 1458, the prior of Burgos handed over a ring as payment of 20 francs that were overdue (BNF FL 5461, fol. 67).

<sup>97</sup> Rodrigo López had not paid his debts owed to the abbot after leaving the chamberlainship in Spain, around 1421–23 (AHN Clero carp 1037, núm. 9). Carrión's prior was required to pay 370 florins of the taxes he had collected (AHN Clero, leg. 5344: 9 June 1431). In 1458, the prior of Salamanca apologized for not sending the required amount and for being late (BNF FL 5461, fol. 67).

<sup>98</sup> Entrepeñas (Ruiz Asencio, Ruiz Albi and Herrero Jiménez, *Colección Entrepeñas*, 201–2). Ciudad Rodrigo (AUPSA CSV carp. pergaminos, núm. 10). Dueñas (Reglero, *San Isidro de Dueñas*, 568).

<sup>99</sup> Riche, *L'Ordre de Cluny*, 609–15.

<sup>100</sup> By petition of the monastery of Carrión for the agreement concerning the quarter of San Martín in Frómista: AHN Clero leg. 5342 (21 February 1427). The monastery of Nájera promises to get the licence from the abbot to ratify a sale: AHN Clero leg. 2973 (11 June 1461). In 1433, the chamberlain of Spain approves an exchange of the monastery of Jubia (AHN Cód 63B, núm. 55). In 1433, the abbot approves the exchange between the priory and the council of Salamanca (AUPSA CSV, caja 144, núm. 24). In 1444, the prior of Zamora, as the abbot's commissary, ratifies the exchange of some mills in Salamanca (AUPSA CSV caja 140, núm. 57). In 1490, the abbot approves another exchange of Salamanca (AUPSA CSV, caja 157, núm. 37).

<sup>101</sup> Carrión obtained it in 1431 for the agreement concerning the quarter of San Martín in Frómista (AESI-A, FC, C-11 (49-2), núm. 43) and requested it in 1444–49 for an exchange in Toro: AHN Clero leg. 5345 (January 25, 1444; August 7, 1449).

confirmation was also sought when property was transferred from the prior's estate to that of the convent.<sup>102</sup>

These economic burdens and the restrictions the priories faced in the management of their endowments were offset by certain benefits. The principal one was to be able to enjoy the privileges of the Order of Cluny, in particular the exemption from episcopal jurisdiction. When, in 1490, the monastery of Nájera was freed from its ties to Cluny, it managed to continue to enjoy the freedoms and privileges of the order, including the spiritual indulgences;<sup>103</sup> the monastery's new abbot even took time to review the papal archives looking for any Cluniac privilege he could take advantage of.<sup>104</sup>

The privileges of the Order of Cluny were appealed to in legal disputes challenging the validity of a bishop's interdictions within the monastery, the obligation to pay for procurements, or even episcopal jurisdiction in a village.<sup>105</sup> The priors also appealed to the conservators (a special type of ecclesiastical judge) given to the Order of Cluny by Clement VI in 1344 in their conflicts with clerics, councils, nobles, or peasants.<sup>106</sup> In some contracts, it was stipulated that the monastery could appeal to the conservators of the Order of Cluny [275] in case of non-compliance.<sup>107</sup> The abbots of Sahagún and Oña acted as conservators with greater frequency than did others, but they could sub-delegate to other ecclesiastics when the disputed issue was either far afield or of lesser importance, such as the occupation of the monastery's lands by the peasants of a village.

One final issue to be addressed concerning the Cluniac monasteries—perhaps the most important one of all—is the liturgy, the observance of customs, the Cluniac way of life. Unfortunately, this aspect is also the least documented. The scarce records in the 1460 General Chapter concerning behavior in the cloister, life in common or the need to sing the hours *cum nota*, prove the importance that was still given to these questions in Cluny. In 1508, the monks of Nájera recorded the scandal surrounding the changes imposed by the reformers to their customs concerning food, dress, and especially praying the hours as they did in the Cluniac Order, reciting the psalms prostrate, and other similar practices, which demonstrates how much this way of life had been internalized.<sup>108</sup>

## Conclusion

The relationship between Cluny and its Castilian priories continued after the 1459 visitation arranged by Jean de Bourbon. And these monasteries would not languish for long before they were rescued by the Congregation of Valladolid. During the first two-thirds of the fifteenth century, the abbots and the General Chapter—although they had

---

<sup>102</sup> In 1407, the abbot ratifies a concession of the prior to the convent of Nájera (AHN Clero carp 1035, núm. 15). In 1468, Pablo II confirms the transfer of rents from the abbot's estate to that of the convent of Carrión (AHN Clero carp. 1714, núm. 21).

<sup>103</sup> AHN Cód 108B, fols. 304r–309r.

<sup>104</sup> AHN Clero leg. 2952 (extracto del Libro 2º de Censos, fol. 221).

<sup>105</sup> Carrión: AHN Clero leg. 5342 (27 July 1403), AHN Clero leg 5331 (3 July 1415). San Pelayo de Toro: AHN Clero leg 5345 (1427). Nájera in 1409 (AHN Cód 107B, fol. 67r–74v), 1412 (AHN Cód 107B, fols. 77r–93v). Salamanca confronts the bishop of Ciudad Rodrigo concerning the ecclesiastical jurisdiction of a village in 1488 (AUPSA CSV, caja 132, núm. 23; caja 137, núm. 14).

<sup>106</sup> Carrión called on the abbot of Sahagún in lawsuits against the lord of Frómista: AHN Clero leg. 5342 (1426), AESI-A, FC, C-11 (49-2), núm. 43; or the clerics of Becerril: AHN Clero leg. 5337 (27 October 1433); and likewise on the abbot of Oña against a scribe in Carrión: AHN Clero leg. 5349 (1435). The conservator can delegate to other ecclesiastics: AHN Clero leg 5331 (October 13, 1486), AHN Clero leg. 5342 (December 10, 1492). The abbot of Sahagún also intervened in favour of Dueñas in 1419 (Reglero, *San Isidro de Dueñas*, 1419). In Salamanca, the intervention of conservators in 1465, 1488 and 1489: (AUPSA CSV, caja 144, núm. 13; caja 132, núm. 23; caja 137, núm. 25).

<sup>107</sup> AHN Clero leg 2986 (March 18, 1468).

<sup>108</sup> Pacheco, *Política española*, 98–102.

more-limited powers than in previous centuries—were in frequent, and sometimes intense, contact with these monasteries. The preoccupation with securing economic resources for Cluny was accompanied by the desire for administrative and spiritual reform. However, in the last third of the century, all this gradually disappeared. Finally, the Catholic Monarchs' insistence on controlling and reforming the monasteries in their kingdoms, together with the interference of San Benito de Valladolid's abbot, the former Cluniac Pedro of Nájera, put an end to this relationship at the start of the sixteenth century. Thus, the old priories were integrated into a new hierarchical structure.

This separation from Cluny was the last stage in a gradual distancing of the Hispanic priories from the mother house. The pope's interference in the naming of the priors beginning in the mid fourteenth century, a prerogative that formerly belonged to the abbot of Cluny, was a decisive turning point, but it did not prevent the monasteries and the monks from continuing to follow Cluny in their liturgy, their dress, their privileges vis-à-vis the bishops, their conservators/judges, their "formal" dependence on the abbot of Cluny, and more. However, in uniting with the Congregation of Valladolid, they broke definitively with those traditions and adopted new Benedictine customs and a new identity.

Cluniac priories of Castile and Navarre: New affiliations			
Priory	Name	Year	New affiliation
Budiño	San Salvador	1435	Cathedral of Tuy <sup>a</sup>
Zamora	San Miguel	1458	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>b</sup>
Burgos	Santa Coloma	1476	San Pedro de Cardeña (in turn incorporated into the Congregation of Valladolid in 1502) <sup>c</sup>
Dueñas	San Isidro	1478	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>d</sup>
Jubia	San Martín	1491	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>e</sup>
Valverde	San Pedro	before 1499	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>f</sup>
Salamanca	San Vicente	1504	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>g</sup>
Ciudad Rodrigo	Santa Ágata (merged with San Vicente de Salamanca in 1450)	1504	San Benito de Valladolid
Carrión	San Zoilo	1507–09	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>h</sup>
Entrepeñas	San Román (merged with San Zoilo de Carrión in 1446)	1507–09	San Benito de Valladolid
Villalpando	San Lorenzo (dependent on San Zoilo de Carrión)	1507–09	San Benito de Valladolid
Carraciello o Pinar	San Boal (already merged with the Congregation of Valladolid)	1512	San Isidro de Dueñas <sup>i</sup>
Nájera	Santa María	1513	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>j</sup>
Vadoluengo	San Adrián (dependent on Santa María de Nájera)	1513	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>k</sup>
Azuelo	San Jorge (dependent on Santa María de Nájera)	1513	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>l</sup>
Villaverde	San Salvador	1525	Hospital de la Piedad of Benavente <sup>m</sup>
Pombeiro	San Vicente	before 1526	San Benito de Valladolid <sup>n</sup>
Villafranca	Santa María	1529	Converted into a collegiate church <sup>o</sup>

<sup>a</sup> See note 34.

<sup>b</sup> See note 47.

<sup>c</sup> Segl, *Königtum*, 63. Berganza, *Antigüedades de España*, II, 233.

<sup>d</sup> Reglero, *San Isidro de Dueñas*, 261–65, 565–68.

<sup>e</sup> In 1491, the prior, Antonio López (1465–1505) (AHN Cód 63B, núm. 78, 106), had to cover the cost of construction of the choir and other works in order to comply with what was stipulated by the bishop of Catania, reformer of the Benedictine monasteries in the kingdom (Ibid. núm. 93).

<sup>f</sup> The prior of Valverde, who had held this office since 1476, declared in 1499 that he held the office from the reformer of the Order of Saint Benedict (Rodríguez Fernández, *San Vicente del Pino*, 1005, 1179).

<sup>g</sup> Julius II extinguished the Cluniac order and joined it to Valladolid so that it could be converted into the Congregation's university college (Colombás, "Orígenes," 320–22).

<sup>h</sup> Zaragoza Pascual, *Generales*, II, 103–5.

<sup>i</sup> After several disputes with commendatories (Yáñez Neira, *San Isidro de Dueñas*, 418–20).

<sup>j</sup> Cantera, "Incorporación."

<sup>k</sup> Cantera, "Dominio navarro", 350–51.

<sup>l</sup> Ibid., 345.

<sup>m</sup> Alexander VI ordered, in 1503, that no one should impede the Count of Benavente from enjoying the rents of this priory of the Order of Cluny (AHN Osuna, c. 418, d.4). In 1525, Clement VII joined it to the hospital founded by the counts (Beceiro, *El condado de Benavente*, 120).

<sup>n</sup> Lucas and Lucas, *Pombeiro*, 355.

<sup>o</sup> By Clement VII at the request of the lords of the town; held by Fernando de Mudarra, archdeacon of el Bierzo, as commendator (Franco, "El señorío de Villafranca," 124–25).

**[276] References:**

**Archival Sources**

- Cartulario de Santa María la Real de Nájera*, siglo XVIII: Archivo Histórico Nacional (Madrid), Códices y Cartularios, 105B-109B.
- Colección de diplomas de San Martín de Juvia* (La Coruña), 1793: Archivo Histórico Nacional (Madrid), Códices y Cartularios, 63B.
- Collectio chartarum et variorum instrumentorum pertinentium ad ordinem Cluniacensem, quae confecta sunt ab anno 1221 ad annum 1455*: Bibliothèque Nationale de France (Paris), Fonds Latin 5461.
- Necrologio de San Zoilo de Carrión*, Archivo España Compañía de Jesús, Alcalá de Henares, Fondo Carrión. caja C 11, doc. 26.
- Registre de Raimond et de Robert, abbés de Cluny*: Bibliothèque Nationale de France (Paris), Fonds Latin 9879.
- Tumbo del Archivo Municipal de Salamanca*, AMS 6905/1230.

**[277] Printed Sources**

- Beceiro Pita, Isabel. *El condado de Benavente en el siglo XV*. Benavente: Centro de Estudios Benaventanos, 1998.
- Beltrán de Heredia, Vicente. *Bulario de la Universidad de Salamanca (1219-1549)*. 3 vols. Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1966.
- Benito Ruano, Eloy. *Los infantes de Aragón*, Pamplona: CSIC, 1952.
- Beolchini, Valeria, Marta Pavón and José Ángel García de Cortázar. *Documentación medieval referente a Cantabria en el Archivo Secreto Vaticano, 1209-1484*, Santander: Fundación Marcelino Botín, 2011.
- Berganza, Francisco de. *Antigüedades de España propugnadas en las noticias de sus reyes, en la coronica del real monasterio de San Pedro de Cardena, en historias, cronicones y otros instrumentos manuscritos, que hasta aora no han visto la luz publica. Parte segunda*. Madrid: Francisco del Hierro, 1721.
- Bishko, Charles Julian. "The Cluniac Priors of Galicia and Portugal: their Acquisition and Administration, 1075-c. 1230." *Studia Monastica* 7 (1965): 305–56.
- Caillet, P. "La décadence de l'Ordre de Cluny au XV<sup>e</sup> siècle et la tentative de réforme de l'abbé Jean de Bourbon (1456-1485)." *Bibliothèque de l'École de Chartes* 89 (1928): 183–234.
- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. "La alberguería de Santa María la Real de Nájera (siglos XI-XV)." *Anuario de Estudios Medievales* 13 (1983): 367–80.
- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. "La comunidad monástica de Santa María de Nájera durante la Edad Media." *En la España Medieval* 36 (2013): 225–62.
- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. "El dominio navarro de Santa María de Nájera durante la Edad Media (1052-1513)." In *Príncipe de Viana, Anejo 8, Primer Congreso General de Historia de Navarra*, vol. 3 341–52. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1988.
- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. "La incorporación de Nájera a la congregación de San Benito de Valladolid." In *Homenatge a la memòria del prof. Dr. Emilio Sáez*, 513–29. Barcelona: Universitat de Barcelona, 1989.
- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. "El oficio de la limosnería de Santa María la Real de Nájera (siglos XI-XV)." *En la España Medieval. Estudios dedicados al profesor D. Ángel Ferrari Núñez II*. 4 (1984): 175–82.
- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. *Santa María la Real de Nájera, siglos XI-XIV*. 3 vols. Madrid: Universidad Complutense, 1987.

- Cantera Montenegro, Margarita. "Viaje a Roma de un prior de Santa María de Nájera (siglo XV)." *Berceo* 164 (2013): 325–41.
- Charvin, Gaston. *Statuts, chapitres généraux et visites de l'Ordre de Cluny*. 6 vols. Paris: Boccard, 1965–72.
- Colombás, García M. "Orígenes y primer desarrollo del Colegio de San Vicente de Salamanca." *Salmanticensis* 7 (1960): 257–323.
- Dobson, Richard B. "English Cluniac Houses towards the End of Their Story." In *Die Cluniazenser in ihrem politisch-sozialen Umfeld* edited by Giles Constable, Gert Melville, Jörg Oberste, 559–73. Münster: Lit, 1998.
- Duckett, G. F. *Visitations and chapters-general of the Order of Cluni, in respect of Alsace, Lorraine, Transjurane Burgundy (Switzerland) and other parts of the Province of Germany, from 1269-1529*. London, 1893.
- Franco Silva, Alfonso. "El señorío de Villafranca de El Bierzo (siglos XIV-XV)." *Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia* 179, no. 1 (1982): 35–160.
- Galindo Romeo, Pascual. *Tuy en la baja Edad Media, siglos XII-XV (suplemento al tomo XXII de la España Sagrada del P. Flórez)*. Zaragoza: El Noticiero, 1923.
- García Catalán, Enrique. *El monasterio de San Vicente de Salamanca*. Salamanca: Centro de Estudios Salmantinos, 2005.
- García Oro, José. *La reforma de los religiosos españoles en tiempos de los Reyes Católicos*. Valladolid: Instituto Isabel la Católica de Historia Eclesiástica, 1969.
- [278] García Oro, José and María José Portela Silva, *Los monasterios de la Corona de Castilla en el Reinado de los Reyes Católicos (1475-1517): La congregación de Observancia*. Santiago de Compostela: El Eco Franciscano, 2004.
- González Dávila, Gil. *Historia de la vida y hechos del rey don Henrique Tercero de Castilla*. Madrid: Francisco Martínez, 1638.
- Guilloureaux, Léon. "Les prieurés anglais de l'ordre de Cluny." In *Millénaire de Cluny. Congrès d'Histoire et d'Archéologie tenu a Cluny I*, 291–373. Macon: Protat frères, 1910.
- Hoberg, Hermannus. *Taxae pro communibus servitiis ex libris obligationum ab anno 1295 usque ad annum 1455 confectis*. Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1944.
- Leclercq, Jean. "Cluny pendant le Grand Schisme d'Occident." *Revue Mabillon*, 3rd. ser., 32, nos. 126–28 (1942): 119–32.
- Lucas Álvarez, Manuel and Pedro Pablo Lucas Domínguez. *El priorato benedictino de San Vincenzo de Pombeiro y su colección diplomática en la Edad Media*. A Coruña: Castro, 1996.
- Pacheco y de Leyva, Enrique. *La política española en Italia: Correspondencia de don Fernando Marín, abad de Nájera, con Carlos I; Tomo I (1521-1524)*. Madrid: Junta para la ampliación de estudios e investigaciones científicas, 1919.
- Palacio Sánchez-Izquierdo, María Luisa. *Colección diplomática del monasterio de San Zoilo de Carrión (siglos XI al XV)*. 2 vols. Madrid: Universidad Complutense, 1988.
- Pérez Celada, Julio A. "Los conflictos jurisdiccionales en el barrio de San Martín de Frómista en los siglos XIV y XV." *Cuadernos Burgaleses de Historia Medieval* 3 (1995): 155–85.
- Pérez Celada, Julio A. *El monasterio de San Zoilo de Carrión. Formación, estructura y decurso histórico de un señorío castellano-leonés (siglos XI al XVI)*, Burgos: Universidad de Burgos, 1997.
- Racinet, Philippe. *Crises et renouveaux : Les monastères clunisiens à la fin du moyen âge : De la Flandre au Berry et comparaisons méridionales*. Arras: Artois Presses Université, 1997.

- Reglero de la Fuente, Carlos Manuel. *Amigos exigentes, Servidores infieles: La crisis de la Orden de Cluny en España (1270-1379)*. Madrid: CSIC, 2014.
- Reglero de la Fuente, Carlos Manuel. *Cluny en España: Los prioratos de la provincia y sus redes sociales (1073–ca. 1270)*. León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, 2008.
- Reglero de la Fuente, Carlos Manuel. “Cum reverentia et ceremoniis et honore: Cluny, sus monasterios hispanos y el Capítulo General de 1460.” *Hispania Sacra* (forthcoming).
- Reglero de la Fuente, Carlos Manuel. *El monasterio de San Isidro de Dueñas en la Edad Media: Un priorato cluniacense hispano (911-1478); Estudio y colección documental*. León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, 2005.
- Riche, Denyse. “Cluny et le débat sur la réforme de l’église à l’époque du Grand Schisme.” *Annales de Bourgogne* 74 (2002): 299–336.
- Riche, Denyse. *L’Ordre de Cluny à la fin du Moyen Âge, ‘Le vieux pays clunisien’ XIII<sup>e</sup>-XV<sup>e</sup> siècles*. Saint-Étienne (France): Publications de l’Université de Saint-Étienne, 2000.
- Riche, Denyse. “Tentativas de réforme à Cluny aux XIV<sup>e</sup> et XV<sup>e</sup> siècles.” In *Maisons de Dieu et Hommes d’Église*, 43–59. St-Étienne: Publications de l’Université de Saint-Étienne, 1992.
- Rius Serra, José. *Regesto Ibérico de Calixto III*. 2 vols. Barcelona: Escuela de Estudios Medievales, 1948.
- Robert, Ulysse. “État des monastères espagnols de l’Ordre de Cluny aux XIII<sup>e</sup>-XV<sup>e</sup> siècles, d’après les actes de visites et des chapitres généraux.” *Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia* 20 (1892): 321–431.
- Rodríguez Fernández, Carlos. *La colección diplomática de San Vicente del Pino*. Granada: Universidad de Granada, 1990 (microfiche).
- Ruiz Asencio, José Manuel, Irene Ruiz Albi and Mauricio Herrero Jiménez. *Colección documental del monasterio de San Román de Entrepeñas (940-1608)*. León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, 2000.
- Ruiz de Loizaga, Saturnino. *Documentación medieval de la diócesis de Calahorra-Logroño en el Archivo Vaticano (siglos XIV-XV)*. Rome: Rotastampa, 2004.
- [279] Sáez, Luciano. *Demostación histórica del verdadero valor de todas las monedas que corrían en Castilla durante el reinado del señor don Enrique III y de su correspondencia con las del señor don Carlos IV*. Madrid: Imprenta de don Benito Cano, 1796.
- Segl, Peter. *Königtum und Klosterreform in Spanien: Untersuchungen über die Cluniacenserklöster in Kastilien-León vom Beginn des 11. bis zur Mitte der 12. Jahrhunderts*. Kallmünz: Michael Lassleben, 1974.
- Stump, Phillip. H. “The Council of Constance (1414-1418) and the End of the Schism.” In *A Companion to the Great Western Schism (1378-1417)*, edited by Joëlle Rollo-Koster and Thomas M. Izbicki, 395-442. Leiden: Brill, 2009.
- Suárez Fernández, Luis. *Castilla, el Cisma y la crisis conciliar (1378-1440)*. Madrid: CSIC, 1960.
- Valous, Guy de. “Cluny (Abbaye et Ordre de).” In *Dictionnaire d’histoire et de géographie ecclésiastiques*, vol. 13, col. 35–174. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1956.
- Valous, Guy de. *Jean de Bourbon, évêque de Puy, Lieutenant-Général de Languedoc et de Forez, Abbé de Cluny, serviteur et adversaire de Louis XI (1413-1485)*. Abbaye S. Wandrille: Fontenelle, 1949.

- Velasco Bayón, Balbino, Mauricio Herrero Jiménez, Segismundo Pecharromán Cebrián and Julia Montalvillo García. *Colección documental de Cuéllar (934-1492)*. 2 vols. Cuéllar: Ayuntamiento, 2010.
- Yáñez Neira, María Damián. “Historia del Real Monasterio de San Isidro de Dueñas”, *Publicaciones de la Institución Tello Téllez de Meneses* 29 (1969): 1–743.
- Zaragoza Pascual, Ernesto. *Los generales de la congregación de San Benito de Valladolid*. Vol. 1, *Los priores (1390-1499)*. Silos (Burgos): Monasterio de Santo Domingo de Silos, 1973.
- Zaragoza Pascual, Ernesto. *Los generales de la congregación de San Benito de Valladolid*. Vol. 2, *Los abades trienales (1499-1568)*. Silos (Burgos): Monasterio de Santo Domingo de Silos, 1976.