

University of Dayton  
**eCommons**

---

Marian Forum

Conferences and Symposia

---

4-8-2016

## Mary's Place in Today's Church

Thomas Buffer

Dennis M. Doyle

Follow this and additional works at: [https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian\\_forum](https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_forum)



Part of the [Catholic Studies Commons](#), and the [Christianity Commons](#)

---

ROUGH TRANSCRIPT

“Mary's Place in Today's Church”

Marian Forum, University of Dayton

April 8, 2016

Father Thomas Buffer, Lecturer, International Marian Research Institute

Dennis Doyle, Professor, University of Dayton

[7:10] - Welcome to the second online session

[7:13] of the Marian Forum

[7:16] hosted by the international Marian Research Institute

[7:19] here at the University of Dayton

[7:22] in Dayton, Ohio,

[7:24] of the United States of America.

[7:28] My name is Dr. Gloria Falcão Dodd.

[7:32] I'm a faculty member

[7:33] at the International Marian Research Institute.

[7:37] I will be your host today.

[7:39] Father Johann Roten,

[7:42] the organizer of the forum

[7:43] is recovering well,

[7:45] but is not able to be with us today.

[7:49] I thank the Marian Library

[7:51] for providing their reading room here

[7:55] as an appropriate location

[7:57] for this forum.

[7:59] Let us begin with a prayer

[8:02] that I offered for Father Roten's complete recovery,

[8:05] as well as for all of your intentions.

[8:10] And I invite you

[8:12] to join in praying the Hail Mary.

[8:16] In the name of the Father,

[8:17] of of the Son,

[8:18] and of the Holy Spirit,

[8:20] Amen.

[8:22] Hail Mary, full of grace,

[8:24] the Lord is with thee.

[8:26] Blessed art thou among women,

[8:29] and blessed is the fruit of thy womb, Jesus.

[8:32] Holy Mary, mother of God,

[8:34] pray for us sinners

[8:37] now and at the hour of our death,

[8:39] Amen.

[8:41] In the name of the Father,

[8:42] and of the son,

[8:43] and of the Holy Spirit.  
[8:45] Amen.  
[8:47] The goal of the Marian Forum  
[8:50] is to provide a free  
[8:52] (audio cuts out)  
[8:54] format,  
[8:55] for it to bring people  
[8:57] together  
[8:58] from around the world  
[8:59] in an online format  
[9:01] to foster fresh  
[9:03] and creative approaches  
[9:05] to Mariology  
[9:06] and Marian devotion.  
[9:08] We are delighted  
[9:11] that this second session of the Marian Forum  
[9:14] includes 67 participants  
[9:18] representing eight countries.  
[9:20] The United States,  
[9:22] Canada,  
[9:23] Trinidad Tobago,  
[9:26] Vietnam,  
[9:27] Indonesia,  
[9:29] Australia,  
[9:30] Nicaragua,  
[9:32] and Costa Rica,  
[9:34] reflecting the international aspect  
[9:37] of the International Marian Research Institute.  
[9:42] Most of our audience is participating online today,  
[9:46] but a few are with us,  
[9:48] present here,  
[9:50] in the Marian Library.  
[9:53] Now today's forum is taking stock  
[9:56] of Mary's place in the church.  
[10:00] Do we need a reappraisal  
[10:03] of Mary's place in the church?  
[10:06] Is there still a minimalist approach  
[10:09] towards Mary  
[10:10] in theology  
[10:12] and ecclesiology?  
[10:15] What about the idea of a Marian church?  
[10:17] Mary's relationship with the church  
[10:22] has many aspects.  
[10:23] On May 12, 2014,

[10:27] Pope Francis  
[10:29] recommended to seminarians  
[10:32] that they should always remember  
[10:34] our lady,  
[10:35] and to have a good relationship with her  
[10:37] as our mother.  
[10:41] Quote, to forget the mother  
[10:44] is something awful.  
[10:46] And to say it another way,  
[10:49] if you don't go to our lady as mother,  
[10:52] you will certainly have her  
[10:54] as a mother-in-law,  
[10:56] and this isn't good.  
[10:58] (laughter)  
[11:00] So in the first hour,  
[11:02] our two speakers will present their thoughts  
[11:05] in answering the questions  
[11:07] of the forum.  
[11:09] Their written contributions  
[11:10] were emailed in advance  
[11:13] to all those who had registered.  
[11:15] This allowed the participants  
[11:18] an opportunity  
[11:19] to read them  
[11:21] and to send in questions in advance.  
[11:24] The speakers will presume  
[11:26] that the audience has read  
[11:28] their contributions.  
[11:30] They will perhaps highlight  
[11:32] some of the main ideas,  
[11:34] and if they wish,  
[11:36] they could begin addressing  
[11:38] some of the questions  
[11:39] that have been emailed already.  
[11:43] The second hour  
[11:45] will allow our audience  
[11:46] to share more questions.  
[11:49] To allow as many as possible to participate,  
[11:53] we will rotate  
[11:55] the source of our comments  
[11:57] and questions  
[11:59] starting with the chat box,  
[12:00] then taking one of the emails  
[12:02] sent in advance,

[12:03] and then a question or comment  
[12:06] from our live audience,  
[12:08] rotating through these three groups.  
[12:11] Any chat box,  
[12:13] or emailed comments  
[12:15] that we might not get to  
[12:17] during the live session  
[12:18] will be given to the speakers.  
[12:22] And Paul Dagnall,  
[12:24] a faculty member of the School of Education,  
[12:27] as well as an E-learning specialist  
[12:30] of the Learning, Teaching Center  
[12:33] of the University of Dayton  
[12:35] is here today  
[12:37] to explain to our online audience  
[12:41] how they will participate  
[12:43] in the discussion.  
[12:50] - Hi, this time when you watch the video on YouTube,  
[12:52] it should be very simple for you  
[12:54] just to watch it.  
[12:56] If you would like to participate,  
[12:58] there's two ways you can do it.  
[12:59] One, is if you sign into YouTube  
[13:00] using the sign in the chat  
[13:03] that you'll see to the right side of your screen,  
[13:04] or you can  
[13:08] sign in using the button at the top.  
[13:11] Either way, it'll do the same thing.  
[13:12] That will allow you to chat right into the box  
[13:14] to the right of the screen that you're watching right now.  
[13:16] And if you're not comfortable doing that,  
[13:19] or you don't have a google  
[13:21] account,  
[13:22] you could also  
[13:23] email me  
[13:24] who you'll find my  
[13:26] email address on the message that  
[13:29] Gloria emailed to you earlier,  
[13:32] but that's pdagnaw1@Udayton.edu  
[13:35] and we'll relay your questions  
[13:39] that you submit electronically  
[13:40] to our speakers.  
[13:41] And they will answer any questions you have  
[13:45] as long as we have time to get to them.

[13:47] - Very good.  
[13:52] Thank you Paul.  
[13:54] And we certainly also want to thank  
[13:56] John LeComte  
[13:57] for technical support  
[13:58] in getting this forum put together today.  
[14:01] It is now my pleasure  
[14:05] to introduce our first speaker  
[14:07] that is Father Thomas Buffer.  
[14:10] He has a license in sacred theology  
[14:14] from our institution,  
[14:16] the International Marian Research Institute.  
[14:19] His doctorate is from the Gregorian University in Rome.  
[14:23] He has been a professor of theology  
[14:27] at the Josephinum Seminary in Columbus, Ohio.  
[14:31] As well as remaining as one of our professors here  
[14:35] at the International Research,  
[14:37] the International Marian Research Institute  
[14:40] where he currently  
[14:42] teaches church in the patristic period.  
[14:46] He is also the pastor  
[14:47] of a providentially named parish  
[14:51] and town,  
[14:52] St. Mary's Church  
[14:54] in Marian, Ohio.  
[14:57] So, with that,  
[14:59] it is my pleasure to  
[15:00] present Father Thomas Buffer.  
[15:02] (applause)  
[15:07] - So thank you Dr. Dodd.  
[15:09] Just to give a brief recap  
[15:12] of the paper which I hope at least most of you  
[15:15] have had the chance to read.  
[15:17] It's been my experience  
[15:19] that even though in the creed,  
[15:22] we profess a belief in the church  
[15:24] or in some older formulations  
[15:26] of the Nicene creed,  
[15:28] I believe the church,  
[15:30] that we don't always look at the church  
[15:33] as something that's necessary  
[15:36] at all  
[15:37] for someone to be a Christian  
[15:38] and participate in the Christian life.

[15:41] And you might think I'm speaking only of  
[15:42] the thought and experience of  
[15:45] non-Catholic Christians,  
[15:47] but there's also a bit of an element of this  
[15:50] in the minds of at least some Catholics as well.  
[15:54] When we talk to people  
[15:56] who we presume we are evangelizing  
[15:58] for the first time,  
[16:00] how do we speak to them about what they need to do  
[16:03] to become a Christian,  
[16:05] to come into the relationship with God  
[16:07] that characterizes  
[16:08] a follower of Jesus Christ?  
[16:10] Because there are people who will talk about  
[16:13] these same things,  
[16:15] and they might talk about  
[16:16] how to be saved.  
[16:17] They might talk about  
[16:20] how to become a Christian,  
[16:21] or they might just talk about  
[16:22] to people who are already Christians  
[16:23] and talk to them about how to be a good Christian  
[16:26] or how to be a better Christian.  
[16:28] And they can do all of this  
[16:30] without mentioning  
[16:31] the church,  
[16:32] or in some people's language,  
[16:34] a church.  
[16:36] This is very common in the United States,  
[16:38] and I know in some other countries as well.  
[16:41] There are people who are very earnest,  
[16:43] believing Christians  
[16:44] and they're out there evangelizing  
[16:46] and they're trying to win other people to Christ,  
[16:48] and they lead them through a process  
[16:50] where they get them to accept  
[16:52] some basic beliefs about who Jesus is.  
[16:55] And then they have to accept Christ as  
[16:57] their savior and ask him for forgiveness  
[17:00] and that sort of thing,  
[17:02] and be born again.  
[17:03] And that might even include  
[17:05] some kind of baptism.  
[17:07] But then,

[17:08] they say now what you need to do is  
[17:11] you need to join a church,  
[17:13] where that faith is going to be supported  
[17:17] by other individuals  
[17:18] who have the same faith.  
[17:21] Very interesting approach  
[17:23] and it's absolutely not what we find  
[17:26] in the days where the church  
[17:29] was coming into existence.  
[17:31] It's not what we find in the very earliest days  
[17:34] of Christianity.  
[17:36] And the question arises then  
[17:38] is the church even necessary?  
[17:42] And if it is necessary,  
[17:44] why?  
[17:46] Is it just something that's a support structure  
[17:48] for the spiritual activity  
[17:51] of individuals?  
[17:52] Or is it actually got part of  
[17:54] God's plan?  
[17:56] Is it part of  
[17:57] the way that  
[17:59] things were arranged  
[18:00] in the history of salvation?  
[18:03] A word we find for that a lot  
[18:05] in early Christian writing is  
[18:06] what they called  
[18:07] the arrangement,  
[18:09] or based on a Greek word,  
[18:11] economy.  
[18:12] And this is not, thank God,  
[18:13] about economics,  
[18:14] but it's the way,  
[18:16] it's God's plan  
[18:17] for saving the world  
[18:19] that He created.  
[18:21] Is the church a necessary  
[18:23] part of that?  
[18:26] Or is it just something that's added on?  
[18:27] And I like to say  
[18:28] that  
[18:30] one place where a lot of Christians  
[18:32] and a lot of atheists agree  
[18:34] is they both see the church



[18:37] as something evil.  
[18:38] But a lot of Christians see the church as  
[18:40] a necessary evil,  
[18:42] and a secularist,  
[18:44] or an atheist would say that church  
[18:46] is both evil and unnecessary.  
[18:48] And I'd like to think that there's a third option.  
[18:51] And certainly when we look at the work  
[18:53] of these first Christian teachers  
[18:55] and pastors,  
[18:57] we find them looking at the church  
[18:59] in a much more positive way.  
[19:01] And one of the ways they do that is  
[19:02] by making comparisons  
[19:04] between the church and Mary.  
[19:08] And I gave you just a few  
[19:09] and a very few examples of this  
[19:12] where people are speaking of the church as a woman,  
[19:15] as a mother,  
[19:17] as a virgin,  
[19:19] or sometimes as a virgin mother,  
[19:21] and sometimes all these things  
[19:22] mixed up together.  
[19:23] And what they're all assuming is  
[19:26] that the church is  
[19:28] part of God's plan.  
[19:30] And I want to jump to  
[19:32] a Clement of Alexandria,  
[19:35] and you want to think about what Clement was doing.  
[19:38] If you asked Clement  
[19:39] what are you doing,  
[19:41] what is your job?  
[19:43] He would say that he was a teacher.  
[19:45] He wouldn't say that I'm a professor of theology  
[19:48] because they didn't have those then.  
[19:50] But they had what they called  
[19:52] catechetical schools.  
[19:53] And he was,  
[19:55] his students,  
[19:57] were kind of an upper slice.  
[20:01] They were the more educated people  
[20:02] who wanted to learn about Christianity  
[20:05] and perhaps learn more about Christianity.  
[20:07] So some of the things Clement is saying

[20:09] are very dense.  
[20:11] And so, we just take one little quotation from Clement  
[20:15] and he's saying  
[20:17] why does the New Testament call Christians children?  
[20:21] Now here we are in the Easter season.  
[20:24] We're hearing a lot  
[20:25] in the liturgy from,  
[20:26] we're gonna hear a lot in the liturgy from  
[20:28] the letters of John,  
[20:29] the three letters of John.  
[20:31] And he's always calling them children,  
[20:33] little children.  
[20:34] And St. Paul sometimes writes to his people  
[20:37] and he calls them children.  
[20:39] Why is that?  
[20:41] And Clement says  
[20:43] it makes sense to call Christians children  
[20:46] and he talks about why,  
[20:48] but if there are children,  
[20:50] then who is their mother?  
[20:52] Who gives birth to these children?  
[20:54] And who nurses these children?  
[20:57] Okay, because of course,  
[20:59] in his society,  
[21:00] and in many societies still today,  
[21:01] giving birth to children  
[21:04] and nursing them  
[21:05] is something that's always done by the same person.  
[21:08] So he says  
[21:10] Christ was given the opportunity  
[21:13] to affirm that the breasts of women  
[21:16] were blessed,  
[21:17] but he didn't do that.  
[21:19] But when the kind and loving father  
[21:20] reined down the word,  
[21:22] Christ himself became  
[21:24] spiritual  
[21:26] nourishment.  
[21:28] And so, this is what the church does.  
[21:30] The universal Father is one,  
[21:32] and one the universal word,  
[21:34] and the Holy Spirit is one and the same everywhere.  
[21:37] And one is the only virgin mother.  
[21:40] I love to call her

[21:43] the church.  
[21:45] Isn't that a bit of a surprise?  
[21:47] If you say there's one virgin mother,  
[21:49] you expect him to say  
[21:50] I love to call her Mary,  
[21:52] or the mother of Jesus,  
[21:54] or something like that.  
[21:55] But clearly he's doing something we didn't expect.  
[21:59] Why does he say that there's one virgin mother?  
[22:02] Why is it appropriate to call the church  
[22:04] a virgin mother?  
[22:06] And remember, this is part of explaining why Christians  
[22:08] are called children.  
[22:09] This mother, the church,  
[22:11] when she was alone,  
[22:13] she did not have milk,  
[22:15] because alone she was not a woman.  
[22:17] And what he means is  
[22:19] a human female is not properly called a woman  
[22:22] until she becomes pregnant.  
[22:26] But the church he says,  
[22:28] is both virgin and mother.  
[22:30] She is pure, the way a virgin is.  
[22:32] But she is loving the way a mother is,  
[22:35] and specifically, loving by feeding.  
[22:37] And she calls her children to her self  
[22:40] and she nurses them with holy milk,  
[22:43] namely, the word for childhood,  
[22:45] the food their children need  
[22:47] to grow into adults.  
[22:50] She's feeding and who's that?  
[22:51] That's Christ himself.  
[22:53] Okay.  
[22:54] So, she,  
[22:56] the church, did not have milk  
[22:58] before  
[22:59] for the milk was this child,  
[23:02] Christ.  
[23:04] But then the child becomes  
[23:06] the body of Christ,  
[23:07] which nourishes by the word,  
[23:10] the young brood,  
[23:11] which the Lord himself brought forth  
[23:13] in throws of the flesh.

[23:14] Which the lord himself swathed  
[23:16] in his precious blood.  
[23:17] That's all very dense, isn't it?  
[23:19] But here's what,  
[23:21] we know that the scripture calls the church  
[23:23] the body of Christ.  
[23:26] But he says this church  
[23:28] which is also the body of Christ,  
[23:30] is also the virgin mother,  
[23:33] who gives birth to Christians,  
[23:35] and who feeds them with  
[23:37] the word  
[23:38] and with the Eucharist.  
[23:41] So that's a lot, isn't it?  
[23:43] So what's the connection between Mary  
[23:45] and the church there?  
[23:47] He doesn't, he never says Mary.  
[23:49] He never says the mother of Jesus.  
[23:52] But, he's talking to people  
[23:55] who already know  
[23:57] the scriptural message  
[23:58] that Jesus Christ was born of a woman  
[24:01] who was both virgin  
[24:03] and mother.  
[24:06] So they all have that in their minds already.  
[24:08] The idea that Mary really was  
[24:11] both virgin and mother  
[24:13] and she gave birth to Christ.  
[24:15] And they already have in their heads  
[24:17] the idea that  
[24:18] a woman who's a mother  
[24:19] feeds her children.  
[24:21] So he's able to connect  
[24:23] Mary and the church.  
[24:25] He's able to use a scriptural message  
[24:28] that is about Mary  
[24:30] to talk about the church.  
[24:33] Why?  
[24:34] Because everyone he's talking to  
[24:37] already understands  
[24:39] that Mary is a central and essential part  
[24:44] of telling people who Jesus is  
[24:47] and telling people the mystery of Christianity.  
[24:51] He's assuming that

[24:53] everyone he's talking to  
[24:54] already knows  
[24:55] and believes that Mary,  
[24:58] the mother of Jesus  
[24:59] was both virgin and mother.  
[25:01] And why is this important?  
[25:03] Because there are people who say  
[25:05] that's not really  
[25:07] central.  
[25:08] And they're saying that's not an indispensable part  
[25:11] of Christian belief.  
[25:12] There are people who say that today.  
[25:14] Once you do that,  
[25:16] then you can't  
[25:17] metaphorically,  
[25:19] call the church virgin  
[25:21] and mother.  
[25:23] Because you've,  
[25:25] in a way, you're separating the church from Christ.  
[25:30] Flannery O'Connor,  
[25:32] who was an American novelist  
[25:34] and short story writer  
[25:36] and not at all incidentally  
[25:37] a Catholic,  
[25:39] in one of her books,  
[25:40] she has a non-Catholic church  
[25:43] and the name of the church is,  
[25:45] it's something like  
[25:48] the church without Christ.  
[25:49] The church without Christ.  
[25:52] Well, we don't have a lot of people  
[25:54] who would put up a sign outside their church building  
[25:56] and call it the church without Christ.  
[25:58] No one would come.  
[25:59] But, there are people who believe in  
[26:03] Christ without the church.  
[26:06] But how do we open a dialogue  
[26:09] with people who think that way?  
[26:11] They say well did Christ have a mother?  
[26:14] She did.  
[26:16] And don't we actually know something  
[26:18] very striking about her  
[26:21] from the message of scripture?  
[26:23] We do.

[26:24] We know that she was both virgin  
[26:26] and mother.  
[26:28] The New Testament went to a certain amount of trouble  
[26:30] to tell us  
[26:32] some very important details  
[26:34] about what made the mother of Jesus  
[26:36] unique.  
[26:38] Does this tell us something about  
[26:39] God's plan?  
[26:40] Yes it does.  
[26:42] Is that story over?  
[26:48] Wednesday,  
[26:49] a couple days ago,  
[26:50] if you pray the office of readings,  
[26:53] the second reading  
[26:56] in the office of readings,  
[26:57] Wednesday,  
[26:58] was from St. Leo, the Great.  
[27:00] And he says  
[27:02] the things that happened in the life of Christ,  
[27:06] they're not just historical events  
[27:09] that happened to people  
[27:10] who lived at that same time.  
[27:12] But the effects are still happening to us  
[27:15] today.  
[27:17] And that's why talking about Mary can help us  
[27:20] understand what the church is today.  
[27:25] We just jumped to Ambrose.  
[27:27] Ambrose talks a lot  
[27:29] about Mary and the church.  
[27:32] And,  
[27:34] he's speaking more about the church  
[27:39] than he is about Mary.  
[27:42] And he looks at David,  
[27:45] and David is a type of Christ.  
[27:49] That means what happens to David  
[27:51] is going to tell us something about  
[27:53] what is going to happen  
[27:55] later in time to Christ.  
[27:58] David was called Christ  
[27:59] and to him,  
[28:01] Jesus Christ,  
[28:02] the church was wedded.  
[28:05] She who, being filled with the seed of the word,

[28:08] and the spirit of God,  
[28:09] gave birth to the body of Christ,  
[28:11] that is to the Christian people.  
[28:14] And this is all symbolized  
[28:17] in the story of  
[28:18] David and Bathsheba.  
[28:21] What does this tell us about the church?  
[28:23] Because he's talking more about the church  
[28:26] as the bride of Christ  
[28:27] than about Mary.  
[28:30] Bathsheba became pregnant  
[28:33] through a physical union  
[28:36] with David.  
[28:37] This is a type.  
[28:39] This is prefiguring something that's going to happen  
[28:42] later in history.  
[28:43] What?  
[28:44] The church is going to become pregnant.  
[28:47] How?  
[28:48] The church will be filled  
[28:50] with the word,  
[28:51] and with the Holy Spirit.  
[28:54] She's going to become pregnant  
[28:56] and she's going to give birth.  
[28:58] And to whom does the church give birth?  
[29:00] The Christian people.  
[29:02] What's another name for the Christian people?  
[29:04] The church.  
[29:06] The body of Christ.  
[29:09] Mary gave birth, physically,  
[29:12] to Christ.  
[29:14] She gave birth to the body of Jesus.  
[29:15] The church is giving birth to  
[29:17] the body of Christ,  
[29:19] which is the church.  
[29:22] Now, if Ambrose believed that the church was not  
[29:25] part of God's plan and salvation,  
[29:27] he would not have spoken that way.  
[29:30] I don't think he could have.  
[29:32] You can't talk about  
[29:34] the church as being God's people  
[29:39] if the church doesn't,  
[29:41] you can't talk about God's people  
[29:44] if there's not a church to give

[29:45] birth to  
[29:46] God's people.  
[29:48] And here's where I make my observation  
[29:51] about Christmas.  
[29:53] For a lot of non-Catholic Christians,  
[29:55] the virgin Mary only appears at Christmas time.  
[29:59] Right.  
[30:01] Right, starting around the end of November,  
[30:04] the beginning of December,  
[30:06] and disappearing at about 2:00 p.m.  
[30:09] On December 25.  
[30:10] (laughter)  
[30:11] And, you say well, why do they suddenly have  
[30:16] a picture of the Virgin Mary in their house?  
[30:19] Okay, I visited a Baptist college  
[30:22] in North Carolina.  
[30:24] North Carolina people,  
[30:26] is not a very Catholic place.  
[30:27] And in the cafeteria where the students eat  
[30:31] they had a nativity scene  
[30:33] set up.  
[30:35] It was November.  
[30:37] And it was a very,  
[30:38] I don't think there's such a thing  
[30:41] as a nativity scene  
[30:42] that doesn't look Catholic.  
[30:43] It looked just like a Catholic nativity scene, okay.  
[30:46] And that makes sense.  
[30:49] You can't have baby Jesus  
[30:51] unless you have  
[30:53] a mother, okay.  
[30:57] But, if you said, why don't you put up a picture like that  
[31:00] in your church and leave it there all year?  
[31:05] You would have a fight on your hands.  
[31:07] And isn't that strange?  
[31:09] Isn't that strange?  
[31:12] Okay.  
[31:13] They understand there's a necessity there  
[31:18] to talk about the birth of Jesus.  
[31:21] His mother at least has to be  
[31:23] literally in the picture,  
[31:25] or in the nativity scene.  
[31:27] But how can we speak about the birth  
[31:30] of Christians?



[31:33] The church can be  
[31:34] put aside,  
[31:36] except when it seems to be  
[31:37] necessary.  
[31:39] And this again,  
[31:40] this is something Catholics can also do.  
[31:44] When Catholics use,  
[31:45] let's talk about the church.  
[31:48] Or they say, you know,  
[31:49] the church is making us do this.  
[31:51] What they really mean is  
[31:52] somebody who works in some office  
[31:55] in the diocese  
[31:57] is making us do this.  
[31:59] Or when they say the church teaches.  
[32:02] What does that really mean?  
[32:05] Does that mean this is the constant teaching of the church  
[32:08] who is filled with the word and the Holy Spirit  
[32:11] and so brings us to a new birth  
[32:13] and produces new members of the body of Christ.  
[32:15] Or does it mean  
[32:17] something that got printed  
[32:19] in losservatore romano last week  
[32:21] because the undersecretary  
[32:23] of the pontifical council for the stuff  
[32:26] that we don't have other pontifical councils for,  
[32:29] (laughter)  
[32:30] had an idea  
[32:32] and it got printed.  
[32:34] I'm just saying.  
[32:35] Okay.  
[32:38] Baptism of course is a big part of this.  
[32:41] And this is the obvious place  
[32:43] where the church  
[32:44] looks like Mary, the mother of Jesus.  
[32:47] Most people will tell you  
[32:50] to study these things.  
[32:51] The first theological reflection  
[32:54] about the virgin Mary  
[32:57] that adds anything to what the New Testament  
[33:00] says about her  
[33:01] is the idea of Mary as  
[33:02] the new Eve.  
[33:04] We're comparing Mary to Eve.

[33:07] Justin Martyr,  
[33:09] Eranus,  
[33:10] Tertullian,  
[33:11] and one of the things they'll tell you is  
[33:15] Eve in the scripture  
[33:17] was called the mother of all the living.  
[33:18] But this is kind of strange  
[33:20] because she's also involved in the responsibility  
[33:23] for original sin,  
[33:24] and that leads to people dying.  
[33:26] And Tertullian ends up saying  
[33:29] you know who the real mother of all the living is.  
[33:31] It's the church.  
[33:33] The true mother of all the living, says Tertullian,  
[33:36] is the church.  
[33:38] And here is how he does it.  
[33:40] It's again through this idea of typology  
[33:43] or prefigurement.  
[33:44] If Adam  
[33:47] prefigured Christ,  
[33:50] and St. Paul says he does,  
[33:52] then Adam falls asleep, right,  
[33:56] and God does the surgery and takes  
[33:59] his rib out that he builds up into a woman.  
[34:02] The sleep of Adam prefigures  
[34:04] the death of Christ.  
[34:07] Christ falling asleep in death on the cross.  
[34:10] And then,  
[34:12] you have this rib being taken out of Adam's side,  
[34:15] and then you have the side of Christ being pierced  
[34:18] on the cross.  
[34:19] And from the wound on his side,  
[34:21] what comes out?  
[34:23] Blood and water.  
[34:26] And if you've ever been involved  
[34:28] with babies being born,  
[34:30] then he says,  
[34:32] what is this?  
[34:33] This is a prefigurement  
[34:34] of the true mother of living,  
[34:36] which is the church.  
[34:37] Or you might say blood and water perhaps  
[34:40] are, he's taking a sign of the sacrament.  
[34:43] Sacraments of baptism and Eucharist,

[34:45] it's not quite clear.  
[34:47] The church conceives,  
[34:50] becomes pregnant,  
[34:52] become fruitful,  
[34:54] how?  
[34:56] As Mary did in the enunciation  
[34:58] by hearing and believing the word.  
[35:02] Mary conceived by believing.  
[35:05] In fact, Elizabeth praised her specifically for  
[35:07] her faith.  
[35:09] Blessed is she who believed.  
[35:10] St. Ambrose again picks up on this  
[35:13] in his commentary on Luke.  
[35:16] On Luke, excuse me.  
[35:18] Okay.  
[35:19] And he say, it wasn't union with the man,  
[35:21] that opened the secrets  
[35:23] of the virginal woman, Mary.  
[35:26] But it was the Holy Spirit  
[35:27] that poured in an immaculate seed  
[35:29] into her inviolable womb.  
[35:32] But that holy one,  
[35:33] Jesus,  
[35:35] by whom the faithful directions  
[35:37] of the divine law,  
[35:38] ascribe the figure of the mystery to come  
[35:40] and that he alone would open the secret birthplace  
[35:43] of the holy virgin church  
[35:45] to give birth to the peoples of God.  
[35:48] This is a little dense, isn't it?  
[35:49] Okay.  
[35:52] What is he saying?  
[35:53] Jesus opened the secret birthplace  
[35:56] of the holy virgin church.  
[35:58] He's saying Christ is the first born of many brothers.  
[36:06] He's saying if we can't understand what it means  
[36:08] to be born again  
[36:10] until we look at the mystery  
[36:12] of the birth of Christ himself.  
[36:16] And so,  
[36:17] the church is part of  
[36:20] this plan.  
[36:22] People say are you born again?  
[36:23] How can you be born again

[36:25] if you do not have, to paraphrase,  
[36:28] the church as your mother?  
[36:32] Little bit about virginity.  
[36:34] Virginity has meant different things  
[36:38] in different cultures.  
[36:39] Even today,  
[36:41] if you go to different countries,  
[36:43] the word virginity  
[36:45] will have different meanings for people.  
[36:47] It'll have a different role  
[36:48] in the way societies are structured.  
[36:50] Right now, in the United States,  
[36:52] and in the awful, awful popular culture  
[36:55] that we are marketing to the rest of the world,  
[36:58] and I apologize,  
[36:59] virginity is not seen as a positive.  
[37:03] It's a failure.  
[37:05] It's a neurosis.  
[37:07] And in the United States,  
[37:09] we have this very large man  
[37:11] who plays American football,  
[37:12] and his name is Tim Tebow.  
[37:14] And people make fun of him  
[37:16] because he's made it clear  
[37:18] that he's going to remain a virgin  
[37:19] until he's married.  
[37:22] And they only make fun of him  
[37:23] when he's not close to them,  
[37:24] because he could snap their neck like a twig.  
[37:26] But,  
[37:27] but people don't see much value in virginity.  
[37:29] There are two main things  
[37:32] that it's going to mean  
[37:34] in this writing from  
[37:36] the patristic period.  
[37:39] And one I remembered to write down  
[37:41] and the other I didn't.  
[37:42] The first one is fidelity,  
[37:44] and St. Paul talks this way too.  
[37:47] If you are a virgin,  
[37:48] you are faithful to someone.  
[37:50] So a virgin church is faithful to Christ  
[37:52] and faithful to Christ's teaching.  
[37:56] Were in the works of some writers,

[37:57] it's being faithful to the true Christian teaching  
[38:00] that was handed down from the beginning  
[38:01] and staying away from heresy  
[38:03] or gnostic tricks  
[38:05] and that sort of thing.  
[38:07] What I forgot to write is  
[38:09] virginity, and this is more important,  
[38:12] is also a sign that what really matters  
[38:14] in the life of the church  
[38:17] is not what we the members of the church do,  
[38:20] but something God does,  
[38:23] something only God can do,  
[38:24] something he does in and through us.  
[38:27] And to understand this,  
[38:29] we have to go back to the virgin Mary.  
[38:32] How can she, how does she become pregnant?  
[38:35] It's through God's initiative.  
[38:38] That's the whole,  
[38:40] what's behind the scene in Luke  
[38:42] would be enunciation.  
[38:44] The angel comes to her and says  
[38:46] you are going to conceive and bear a son.  
[38:48] And she says  
[38:49] how can this be?  
[38:50] It was not her idea.  
[38:52] God is taking the initiative.  
[38:54] God is going to do something in and through her  
[38:57] that she couldn't do  
[38:58] without God being involved.  
[39:02] And that's the important meaning  
[39:04] of the word virginity  
[39:05] of the church.  
[39:07] A virgin can't be fruitful.  
[39:08] A virgin cannot be the mother  
[39:10] unless God is at work in her.  
[39:13] A virgin cannot give milk,  
[39:15] going back to Clement,  
[39:16] unless God is at work in her.  
[39:19] And the church  
[39:20] is not going to conceive  
[39:22] and bear fruit  
[39:25] until the church understands  
[39:28] that it's the activity of God  
[39:30] in and through us,

[39:32] all of us,  
[39:34] all the members of the church,  
[39:35] lay ordained, consecrated.  
[39:37] That's going to make the church truly fruitful.  
[39:41] That's going to make the church a faithful virgin.  
[39:44] That's going to make the church a mother  
[39:46] who not only gives birth to her children,  
[39:48] but loves them and feeds them  
[39:50] and takes care of them.  
[39:52] Thank you.  
[39:53] (applause)  
[40:01] - Thank you very much Father Buffer.  
[40:05] Your presentation, rich in church fathers,  
[40:08] has already prompted some email responses  
[40:11] that will be presented in the second hour.  
[40:16] Next, we have Dr. Dennis Doyle.  
[40:19] He received his doctorate  
[40:22] in religious studies  
[40:23] from the Catholic University of America  
[40:26] in Washington D.C.  
[40:28] He has taught at the University of Dayton  
[40:30] for 18 years.  
[40:33] His recent involvements  
[40:35] include being director of publications  
[40:37] for the College Theology Society,  
[40:40] a planner and speaker  
[40:43] of the Catholic Common Ground,  
[40:46] a participant in the U.S. Methodist Catholic Dialogue,  
[40:51] and a collaborator  
[40:54] in at least one of our Marian Forums of the past  
[41:00] here at the University of Dayton.  
[41:03] And I am delighted to present  
[41:05] Dr. Dennis Doyle.  
[41:07] (applause)  
[41:17] - Thank you.  
[41:19] Thank you Dr. Dodd.  
[41:20] I realize I have to update my  
[41:23] webpage,  
[41:25] cause after 31 years of teaching at the university,  
[41:29] my webpage still says I've been teaching here 18 years.  
[41:33] (laughter)  
[41:34] I think maybe they're just counting  
[41:35] the years that I was really  
[41:37] teaching well.

[41:38] (laughter)  
[41:40] 18 out of 31's not too bad, huh?  
[41:43] I get a lot of great opportunities in life,  
[41:48] and,  
[41:50] I feel very privileged.  
[41:52] This is one of those opportunities I,  
[41:57] I get busy with things,  
[41:58] I've got projects,  
[41:59] I kind of just  
[42:01] started to turn it down and then,  
[42:03] I thought about the topic.  
[42:05] And I thought about  
[42:08] where do I teach,  
[42:10] and what are the important things, and so,  
[42:16] so I did say yes.  
[42:18] I mean isn't that what Mary says is yes?  
[42:22] And I told my wife about it,  
[42:23] normally, might give me a hard time  
[42:26] for taking on something else.  
[42:27] And she immediately said,  
[42:28] well you have to do that.  
[42:30] You have to do that.  
[42:31] (laughter)  
[42:34] And I had filled out a survey  
[42:36] where I said well perhaps a good topic for a talk would be  
[42:39] how can you talk about the church  
[42:41] without talking about Mary?  
[42:43] And then,  
[42:45] I got the  
[42:46] particular topic when  
[42:48] Father Rhoten and Dr. Dodd  
[42:51] wrote to me  
[42:52] and offered me a few possible titles and  
[42:55] one of them was  
[42:56] a more Marian church,  
[42:58] what would that look like?  
[42:59] And so, that's what I took on.  
[43:01] And my,  
[43:05] a lot of my ideas come from  
[43:08] a study I've done over the past few years  
[43:10] of the work of Otto Semmelroth  
[43:13] without was a Jesuit  
[43:14] at the council  
[43:16] and he died in 79.

[43:19] But he was very involved  
[43:21] in the drafting of several of the Vatican Two documents.  
[43:24] And then he wrote a lot about  
[43:26] his experience and what went on.  
[43:28] And he had written in particular a book  
[43:31] about Mary in 1950,  
[43:33] Mary Archetype of the Church,  
[43:35] and then another book,  
[43:37] The Church of Sacrament,  
[43:38] in 1953.  
[43:40] And the book, The Church of Sacrament,  
[43:43] was a direction setting book  
[43:45] for Lumen Gentium.  
[43:48] And,  
[43:50] Semmelroth actually was  
[43:52] connected somewhat with Rohner.  
[43:54] Rohner was eight years his senior.  
[43:59] But he roomed with Rohner at the council.  
[44:02] You know, Rohner was kind of a leading figure  
[44:05] and somebody who  
[44:08] though I understand a very gracious man always,  
[44:12] was somebody who could push the envelope on things,  
[44:15] where Semmelroth was  
[44:16] always remembered for  
[44:17] just being balanced.  
[44:19] Semmelroth  
[44:20] wanted to listen seriously to the various voices  
[44:23] and he wanted to get it right  
[44:25] in a way that was balanced,  
[44:27] and not as well known as Rohner.  
[44:29] But I think somebody really,  
[44:32] really worth studying.  
[44:33] And,  
[44:36] so,  
[44:38] I did a bit of reading  
[44:39] in some classic authors.  
[44:43] I was reading a little  
[44:44] other (inaudible) and so on.  
[44:46] But what struck me  
[44:48] was just in some web research  
[44:50] finding that there are various  
[44:52] web postings about what more Marian church would look like.  
[44:55] And although in my footnotes,  
[44:57] I only mention the one by Anthony Garacia,



[45:02] if I'm saying that right.  
[45:03] I read several of these,  
[45:06] and I thought that well gee,  
[45:07] there's a lot of people out there  
[45:08] who have these ideas about what  
[45:11] a more Marian church would look like.  
[45:12] And these are people  
[45:13] who participate in Marianas communities.  
[45:15] In a sense, I do,  
[45:17] because I teach it at the University of Dayton,  
[45:19] you know, Marianist University.  
[45:21] But not in the same sense that these people do.  
[45:24] And so I think that their testimony  
[45:26] is very valuable,  
[45:28] and so I thought well,  
[45:32] let me reflect on,  
[45:35] on something I know a bit about,  
[45:37] Lumen Gentium and his composition  
[45:39] and in particular drawing upon  
[45:40] Otto Semmelroth.  
[45:42] And I was also joined upon by materials  
[45:45] that I was developing for a class  
[45:46] that I was teaching this semester.  
[45:47] I teach a course called the Church,  
[45:49] and I always redo it,  
[45:50] so I can get another good year  
[45:53] that I can list on my resume  
[45:55] in teaching.  
[45:57] And,  
[45:59] the,  
[46:01] one of the things that I had my students thinking about  
[46:03] was how you can read Lumen Gentium  
[46:05] with the main theme being  
[46:08] universal call to holiness.  
[46:09] And at this,  
[46:10] this theme runs throughout the document.  
[46:12] But another thing I did,  
[46:15] was I had them consider  
[46:16] the famous critique  
[46:18] of an earlier draft  
[46:20] of the document on the church,  
[46:22] the critique by Bishop Emile Deschmidt,  
[46:24] where said well this draft is,  
[46:27] is clericalistic

[46:30] and triumphalistic  
[46:31] and juridical.  
[46:33] And that really became a rallying cry.  
[46:36] And,  
[46:37] as to how would this be revised.  
[46:41] And I think that the revisions  
[46:43] by Vatican Two,  
[46:44] some people are  
[46:46] inclined to think that well,  
[46:48] there was a minority position  
[46:50] which was traditionalist  
[46:52] and there was a majority position  
[46:53] which was progressive and wanted changes.  
[46:56] And the majority won out.  
[46:58] But in retrospect,  
[47:00] and I mean that's true,  
[47:02] may be true to the experience of the time,  
[47:04] but in retrospect,  
[47:05] some of the biggest points of tension today  
[47:09] were already starting to develop  
[47:12] among people who represented  
[47:14] what you would call majority view.  
[47:16] And those who were progressives  
[47:18] included people  
[47:20] who would go on to  
[47:22] be the ones who would write for the journal,  
[47:26] Conchilian,  
[47:27] and be the progressives  
[47:28] that pushed the envelope.  
[47:30] But also the people who would go on to found  
[47:32] the journal, Communio,  
[47:33] which is much more conservative  
[47:35] and stands as kind of a counterpoint  
[47:38] to Conchilian.  
[47:40] They too,  
[47:41] they were not traditionalists.  
[47:42] They were part of the majority.  
[47:43] They wanted changes at Vatican Two,  
[47:44] and after the council,  
[47:47] when,  
[47:49] when some of these polarities developed,  
[47:51] it was among people who really were  
[47:54] on the same committees  
[47:56] and had a lot of agreement at the time.

[47:58] And so that's one of the things I like  
[48:00] about the work  
[48:01] of Otto Semmelroth,  
[48:02] because he's somebody  
[48:04] who takes our range of concerns very seriously.  
[48:08] And he's somebody who maybe,  
[48:09] he was associated with the majority position,  
[48:13] not the minority.  
[48:15] But in so far as that  
[48:17] majority would have splits in it develop,  
[48:19] I think Semmelroth is recently a figure  
[48:20] who  
[48:23] spans a broad range of concerns.  
[48:26] And,  
[48:29] and that's how I see  
[48:31] the incorporation of the chapter on Mary  
[48:33] in Lumen Gentium.  
[48:37] Originally, there was an appendix to  
[48:39] the early document on the church  
[48:43] that then got separated  
[48:45] and it was voted on whether they would  
[48:48] release this as it's own document.  
[48:51] And that proposal lost.  
[48:54] It lost fairly narrowly.  
[48:56] And it really wasn't until 1963,  
[48:59] so you're at the  
[49:02] next to the last draft,  
[49:04] that the decision is made to incorporate this chapter  
[49:07] into Lumen Gentium.  
[49:09] And in my view,  
[49:11] I think that they did a very balanced way.  
[49:13] I think they really were aware of this,  
[49:16] the maximalist versus the minimalist  
[49:18] and they tried to do it  
[49:20] in a way that,  
[49:22] that people could read  
[49:25] recently, attention to their own  
[49:28] positions and concerns in it.  
[49:30] Now, of course,  
[49:32] after the council,  
[49:33] there's a big change in catholic culture.  
[49:36] How much did it have to do with Lumen Gentium?  
[49:39] I'm inclined to think that  
[49:41] it had to do with a lot of factors.

[49:44] And maybe Lumen Gentium's one,  
[49:46] one causal thing.  
[49:49] But really, I think maybe more Lumen Gentium reflects  
[49:51] a certain point in time  
[49:54] and a certain point in the history of the church.  
[49:57] And that,  
[49:59] many of the things that happened at the council  
[50:02] I think were going to happen  
[50:04] with or without Lumen Gentium.  
[50:05] Really the biggest thing being,  
[50:08] the collapse of the Catholic subculture  
[50:11] and that  
[50:14] Lumen Gentium  
[50:15] has positions that I think are very balanced,  
[50:18] but that  
[50:19] they're also capable of being  
[50:21] co opted by  
[50:23] one side or another side  
[50:25] and so on.  
[50:27] So,  
[50:31] in my paper,  
[50:33] I thought well,  
[50:37] let me try to rely on the work of Semmelroth  
[50:40] and let me use these categories from  
[50:43] Emile Deschmidt  
[50:45] and think about how did that chapter on Mary  
[50:48] get incorporated  
[50:50] into Lumen Gentium  
[50:52] and what was going on in the overall document  
[50:55] a the time?  
[50:57] And so, for that,  
[50:59] I highlighted three themes  
[51:01] which you all know, I think,  
[51:04] and you could almost make a little grid  
[51:07] out of my paper.  
[51:09] And I guess that has advantages and disadvantages.  
[51:12] I love Cardinal Avery Dulles  
[51:15] and his work was very influential to me.  
[51:17] And most things that he wrote,  
[51:20] if you got to the end,  
[51:21] you could make a little grid  
[51:23] and you could fill in what he had.  
[51:25] And you can do that with mine.  
[51:26] So you got the clericalism

[51:28] and the triumphalism  
[51:29] and the juridicism  
[51:30] named by Bishop Deschmidt.  
[51:32] But then you have these three themes,  
[51:34] the universal call to holiness,  
[51:36] which as I say,  
[51:38] really you could read that as,  
[51:40] as the key theme  
[51:42] in the final draft of Lumen Gentium.  
[51:45] What's it all about?  
[51:48] Well it's all about Christian discipleship  
[51:51] and how do you follow Christ?  
[51:54] Well, you follow Christ by being a loving person.  
[51:59] And how do you love?  
[52:01] Well, you love by following Christ  
[52:04] in seeking out the world Father,  
[52:06] and listening to the promptings of the Spirit.  
[52:10] And the universal call to holiness,  
[52:11] something very characteristic of it  
[52:13] is that it's inclusive,  
[52:15] that it's everybody in the church  
[52:17] experiences this.  
[52:19] It's called holiness.  
[52:21] And then you think about Mary  
[52:23] and a church that's more Marian.  
[52:26] Mary is the one who says yes to God.  
[52:29] And that she's both a model for us  
[52:33] and one who is like us.  
[52:39] And in the second theme that I tried to play out  
[52:42] was this notion that church  
[52:43] as eschatological.  
[52:47] The church is on a journey.  
[52:48] It's not finished yet.  
[52:50] That we in the earthly church need to be humble.  
[52:54] And,  
[52:56] that,  
[53:00] we're on this side of the,  
[53:04] of the,  
[53:05] of the line that would divide the earthly church  
[53:08] and the heavenly church.  
[53:09] But these two go together  
[53:10] to make up the communion of saints.  
[53:12] And, the question of these chapters in Lumen Gentium  
[53:16] was all very deliberate,

[53:17] that the call to holiness is the fifth chapter.  
[53:20] I think it's a very central,  
[53:22] and it sets up this dynamic  
[53:25] that then looks at  
[53:27] those who take religious vows as  
[53:29] answering an exceptional call  
[53:32] to holiness,  
[53:34] which is then as it were somewhat  
[53:37] distinct from the universal call.  
[53:39] They have an exceptional call,  
[53:41] take vows of poverty, chastity and obedience.  
[53:43] But then looking at the saints,  
[53:44] you know, chapter seven,  
[53:46] eschatological chapter is about the saints,  
[53:48] and then Mary.  
[53:50] And so Mary being linked with this chapter on the saints,  
[53:55] and so, you know,  
[53:57] there are those who want to  
[53:58] emphasize Mary's privileges  
[54:00] and how she is distinct,  
[54:02] and those who wanted to emphasize Mary  
[54:05] as a Saint who is  
[54:07] like us,  
[54:09] and  
[54:10] Lumen Gentium,  
[54:12] I think made an honest attempt  
[54:14] to do both of those things.  
[54:15] That those things are not contradictory.  
[54:17] And it's not contradictory to say that  
[54:19] the church itself  
[54:20] has it's pilgrim dimension  
[54:22] and it's heavenly church dimension.  
[54:23] And it's not contradictory  
[54:25] to see in Mary one  
[54:26] who lived as a pilgrim without sin,  
[54:28] lived as a pilgrim among us,  
[54:30] and who is part of this heavenly church.  
[54:40] And then, finally, the theme of the church as a sacrament,  
[54:41] which as I said,  
[54:43] one of Semmelroth's big book is called  
[54:46] (speaking foreign language)  
[54:49] The Church as the Original Sacrament.  
[54:52] And there's a lot of debate about this in the council,  
[54:56] but not only does it become a key theme

[54:58] of Lumen Gentium by stating it  
[55:00] in the first paragraph,  
[55:01] but it's a theme that carries through  
[55:04] Lumen Gentium in many, many ways.  
[55:06] There are all kinds of relationships  
[55:08] within the document  
[55:09] that one could recognize as sacramental.  
[55:11] And one of those is  
[55:13] in chapter seven  
[55:15] that the relationship between the heavenly church  
[55:18] and the pilgrim church  
[55:19] is the sacramental one.  
[55:20] And I love that line  
[55:22] from Semmelroth,  
[55:24] I hope I get it right where he says that,  
[55:26] that the heavenly church is present in the pilgrim church,  
[55:30] not in the way,  
[55:31] simply in the way that we call  
[55:34] the train from Hamburg to Munich.  
[55:37] We would call it the Munich train,  
[55:39] but it doesn't have anything of Munich in it,  
[55:41] unless they got a lot of pretzels and beer maybe.  
[55:43] (laughter)  
[55:46] But in a much more integral sense,  
[55:48] the,  
[55:52] the pilgrim church carries within it already  
[55:54] the heavenly church.  
[55:57] And the heavenly church is there  
[55:59] as a shaping factor,  
[56:00] as part of it,  
[56:02] and so that we are able to  
[56:04] celebrate the liturgy  
[56:06] in the presence of the full communion of saints  
[56:09] and that,  
[56:11] in the presence of heavenly hosts.  
[56:12] And so,  
[56:16] whereas with the first theme I came out with,  
[56:18] well the church has to be inclusive.  
[56:20] It's the universal call to holiness.  
[56:22] But the second theme,  
[56:24] the church needs to be humble.  
[56:25] And with this third theme of sacrament,  
[56:29] the church is relational.  
[56:32] The church is more than just an institution.

[56:38] And you know, today we experience many polarities  
[56:41] and I think if we look to Semmelroth,  
[56:44] I think we could have  
[56:48] a view of the Vatican Two documents  
[56:50] that  
[56:52] can see that in it's origins  
[56:54] it really  
[56:56] didn't mean to cause a split.  
[56:58] It really meant to be a place where  
[57:01] okay, different points of view are represented,  
[57:04] but,  
[57:05] that something that would hold us together.  
[57:06] And I just,  
[57:09] let me see how we're doing with time here.  
[57:10] I'm still fine, yeah.  
[57:14] My children are kind of like the health police.  
[57:19] I have to wear this Fit Bit everywhere.  
[57:21] It's like an ankle brace or something.  
[57:23] And so anytime I want to see what time it is,  
[57:25] I have to either  
[57:27] move my arm in a certain way,  
[57:28] or I have to press a button.  
[57:30] So,  
[57:31] the,  
[57:35] but I did want to say that  
[57:37] I think with Father Buffer's paper,  
[57:39] that there are a couple points of overlap  
[57:41] with what we're doing.  
[57:43] One being to see the church as relational,  
[57:48] not just as an institution,  
[57:49] but something that has to do with personal relationships.  
[57:52] And Father Buffer spelling it out very clearly  
[57:56] in terms of  
[57:58] motherhood  
[57:59] and the way one relates to  
[58:02] their mother.  
[58:03] And a second theme I think where we had some overlap  
[58:06] was in that  
[58:09] Mary, our devotion to Mary  
[58:11] doesn't just have to do with  
[58:13] privileges.  
[58:14] But her privileges, it does have to do with that,  
[58:16] but it doesn't just have to do with that.  
[58:17] It also has to do



[58:19] with  
[58:21] what does that mean about us?  
[58:22] What does that mean for everyone  
[58:24] who is Christian,  
[58:25] about how do we answer the universal call to holiness?  
[58:28] And,  
[58:35] so,  
[58:37] I do have some questions lined up here.  
[58:39] And I don't know if I should dive into them,  
[58:41] or if,  
[58:42] okay.  
[58:45] So thank you.  
[58:50] From Australia,  
[58:53] where it is the middle of the night, I'm told.  
[58:56] We have a question from  
[59:00] Debra Newbery,  
[59:02] having read professor Doyle's presentation,  
[59:06] the idea being transfigured by grace  
[59:08] into the immaculate one,  
[59:09] the spouse of the Holy Spirit,  
[59:12] through Mary and consecration,  
[59:14] what seemed to be a way for those in the church  
[59:16] to reach this level of love,  
[59:18] rather like St. Theresa  
[59:19] (inaudible) elevator.  
[59:21] Would professor Doyle care to comment on this?  
[59:25] And so, this idea that well,  
[59:27] how do we get to be this more Marian church?  
[59:30] So, I would say that my paper was  
[59:32] really kind of speculative  
[59:34] in a way,  
[59:37] not so practical.  
[59:38] It was about  
[59:39] well what would this more Marian church look like?  
[59:44] This is a question really about  
[59:46] well how do we get there?  
[59:48] And so, what role  
[59:50] would Marian consecration plan this?  
[59:57] Let me say first of all,  
[59:58] hopefully, this conversation goes on.  
[1:00:00] People will have things to say about this  
[1:00:03] beyond what I can testify to personally.  
[1:00:05] But, yeah, as someone who has worked  
[1:00:12] for all these years at a Marian university,

[1:00:14] among all these Marianists,  
[1:00:16] that I think this is a very important thing.  
[1:00:20] And I see the love for Mary  
[1:00:22] in the Marianists,  
[1:00:23] and I see it played out in very,  
[1:00:25] very concrete and specific ways.  
[1:00:28] And so,  
[1:00:31] I say from the bottom of my heart,  
[1:00:33] yes, of course Marian concentration  
[1:00:34] would play an important role  
[1:00:36] in getting us there.  
[1:00:39] Though also, I think if I were to say no to this question,  
[1:00:41] I probably would be carried out of here in handcuffs  
[1:00:44] considering where I am.  
[1:00:45] (laughter)  
[1:00:47] And,  
[1:00:49] the,  
[1:00:51] but I would say too,  
[1:00:52] that I think that  
[1:00:55] the concerns of Vatican Two,  
[1:00:57] and some of the concerns expressed by Pope Francis say  
[1:00:59] on the one hand, yeah,  
[1:01:02] popular devotion is so important  
[1:01:03] and none of us should somehow stand above that.  
[1:01:12] At the same time,  
[1:01:13] popular devotion is capable of,  
[1:01:14] of being in need of correction at times.  
[1:01:18] And so, you know, if there are Marian groups  
[1:01:23] that are,  
[1:01:26] and of course, you can be consecrated as an individual,  
[1:01:28] you can belong to a group,  
[1:01:29] you can have it as a religious order.  
[1:01:31] There are various paths to Marian consecration.  
[1:01:34] Let's say you're with a Marian group  
[1:01:36] and maybe that group is triumphalistic,  
[1:01:40] or maybe that group is,  
[1:01:47] well not so humble or something.  
[1:01:49] Or maybe that group is into  
[1:01:51] the weirdest prophecies you ever saw in your life.  
[1:01:54] I think Marian consecration is a very wonderful thing,  
[1:01:58] and I don't know that  
[1:02:00] by itself,  
[1:02:02] you know, it needs other kind of factors too.  
[1:02:04] It would still need to be humble and relational

[1:02:07] and inclusive.  
[1:02:13] So yes, yes, I think that is a way.  
[1:02:14] And I think that  
[1:02:16] the call to holiness is universal.  
[1:02:17] I think the call to belong to a religious order  
[1:02:20] is exceptional.  
[1:02:22] And  
[1:02:24] we used to be in a church where  
[1:02:26] the call to a special relationship with Mary  
[1:02:28] was virtually universal  
[1:02:30] and that culture changed from the church.  
[1:02:32] I think today,  
[1:02:35] we experience it as exceptional.  
[1:02:37] Sure, I'd like to see  
[1:02:39] a lot more of it.  
[1:02:41] There's a lot of Catholics who  
[1:02:42] I think would need a lot of pre-evangelization  
[1:02:44] before you got them to that point.  
[1:02:51] I have another question.  
[1:02:52] Some colleagues of mine  
[1:02:58] says Robert  
[1:02:58] S-T-G,  
[1:03:00] some colleagues of mine maintain  
[1:03:01] that Vatican Two's decision  
[1:03:02] to integrate the Marian schema  
[1:03:04] into the constitution of the church  
[1:03:05] represents a dramatic change in Catholic Mariology.  
[1:03:07] What are your thoughts on this matter?  
[1:03:10] Well,  
[1:03:12] I think, you know,  
[1:03:14] from a certain point of view,  
[1:03:15] that's undeniable.  
[1:03:16] And particularly, if one  
[1:03:17] were  
[1:03:19] a maximalist before the council,  
[1:03:20] one would see this is a dramatic change.  
[1:03:22] Some I think are inclined to read the change  
[1:03:26] as being from maximalism  
[1:03:28] to minimalism,  
[1:03:30] and I don't think you can find that  
[1:03:31] in the council itself or in the documents.  
[1:03:33] I think what you find is an honest attempt at balance.  
[1:03:35] But what happens in Catholic culture  
[1:03:37] may represent

[1:03:39] that kind of shift  
[1:03:41] from maximalism to minimalism,  
[1:03:43] particularly in the decade  
[1:03:45] following the council.  
[1:03:49] But yeah, yeah,  
[1:03:50] there is a dramatic change represented  
[1:03:52] what was intension,  
[1:03:53] what was intended was a balance.  
[1:03:55] And what happened may have been something else.  
[1:03:58] And,  
[1:04:01] Brother Bernard Hein from Vietnam,  
[1:04:04] I apologize if I don't get your name pronounced correctly,  
[1:04:08] says according to Dr. Dennis,  
[1:04:10] in Lumen Gentium,  
[1:04:12] we can know what the church is.  
[1:04:14] In my opinion, to understand what the church is,  
[1:04:17] we should pay attention  
[1:04:18] to Gaudium et spes.  
[1:04:20] And I would say,  
[1:04:21] oh no, forget about Gaudium et spes.  
[1:04:22] I'm just kidding, just kidding.  
[1:04:25] (laughter)  
[1:04:26] Yeah, I couldn't agree more.  
[1:04:27] I mean I wrote a book  
[1:04:29] about Vatican Two,  
[1:04:30] and it's based on two documents.  
[1:04:32] It's based on Lumen Gentium,  
[1:04:33] and Gaudium et spes,  
[1:04:34] and I am really of the opinion  
[1:04:35] that if you want to know what Lumen Gentium  
[1:04:38] says about the church, well,  
[1:04:39] really there's 16 documents  
[1:04:41] you need to pay attention to,  
[1:04:42] but above all,  
[1:04:43] regarding the church,  
[1:04:44] it's those two together.  
[1:04:45] And so I was only thinking in terms of  
[1:04:47] the study I've done of Lumen Gentium  
[1:04:49] of late,  
[1:04:50] and I don't know if Father Semmelroth  
[1:04:53] and,  
[1:04:55] and how in class, it's a starting point for me.  
[1:04:58] But I can't teach that course without  
[1:05:00] also talking about the church in relation to the world

[1:05:02] and the church in relation to its social teaching,  
[1:05:05] and yeah, Gaudium et spes,  
[1:05:08] I think,  
[1:05:09] I think you're dead on.  
[1:05:11] I mean I wouldn't want Gaudium et spes  
[1:05:12] without Lumen Gentium.  
[1:05:13] But I wouldn't want Lumen Gentium without Gaudium et spes.  
[1:05:16] And I really appreciate the question.  
[1:05:22] And there's a question also from,  
[1:05:24] from bother Wang.  
[1:05:33] Whether the mission of the church  
[1:05:34] will be shown and done better  
[1:05:35] if the role of our blessed mother  
[1:05:37] is clarified better,  
[1:05:39] even to a confirmation,  
[1:05:40] the title, co-Redemptrix.  
[1:05:42] Well you know,  
[1:05:45] to me it's interesting that  
[1:05:50] Otto Semmelroth in his book on Mary  
[1:05:52] was one of the early proposals  
[1:05:55] of the title,  
[1:05:57] Co-Redemptrix.  
[1:05:59] By the time he wrote the book,  
[1:06:00] the Church of Sacrament,  
[1:06:02] he didn't want that title  
[1:06:03] for Mary at that time.  
[1:06:08] And,  
[1:06:10] he,  
[1:06:11] he himself read it as an affirmation  
[1:06:13] of Mary's role  
[1:06:15] in the,  
[1:06:17] in the whole story of salvation.  
[1:06:19] And that I think there's a way of reading  
[1:06:23] Co-Redemptrix  
[1:06:24] where it's,  
[1:06:27] it's a very appropriate title  
[1:06:28] and has a lot of implications  
[1:06:29] for all Christians.  
[1:06:31] But Co-Redemptrix  
[1:06:34] is read by  
[1:06:36] those who oppose it  
[1:06:39] as being part of this,  
[1:06:41] of this world in which  
[1:06:44] Marian devotionists perceived as,

[1:06:46] as putting himself in the,  
[1:06:48] being put in a place of  
[1:06:50] devotion to Christ and so on.  
[1:06:52] I mean for me,  
[1:06:53] I just think like,  
[1:06:55] in terms of the ecclesial culture,  
[1:06:57] to make that declaration right now,  
[1:07:00] I don't think would be good idea,  
[1:07:02] in my opinion.  
[1:07:07] And then, I have a question here  
[1:07:09] about, from Dr. Gloria Dodd,  
[1:07:10] that some people think that a more Marian church  
[1:07:13] would have women priests,  
[1:07:15] however since Mary's a laywoman  
[1:07:16] who is not ordained,  
[1:07:17] wouldn't a more Marian church  
[1:07:19] be more lay than clerical?  
[1:07:21] I always like to avoid this question.  
[1:07:23] (laughter)  
[1:07:25] And so,  
[1:07:26] I will say that  
[1:07:27] hopefully we'll have a nice  
[1:07:28] conversation for an hour,  
[1:07:29] when I'm done and people can say what they think.  
[1:07:32] And then, also perhaps the decrease in numbers  
[1:07:34] of ordained clergy since  
[1:07:36] the second Vatican council  
[1:07:37] is perhaps a providential reshaping  
[1:07:38] of the church  
[1:07:40] in a more Marian, than its lay form.  
[1:07:42] But many of the lady  
[1:07:44] have not been formed in Mariology,  
[1:07:45] nor have been Marian devotion.  
[1:07:47] What difference do you think  
[1:07:49] good Mariology and or Marian devotion makes  
[1:07:50] in the lady  
[1:07:52] who are being called to fulfill their role  
[1:07:54] of permeating the civil society with Christianity?  
[1:07:56] Well,  
[1:08:01] as I said about  
[1:08:02] is Marian consecration  
[1:08:04] something that would lead to this more Marian church?  
[1:08:07] I think  
[1:08:09] that

[1:08:10] an increase in Marian devotion  
[1:08:11] it is,  
[1:08:13] it is a very positive thing.  
[1:08:15] You know,  
[1:08:16] I don't want to see it to be some kind of like  
[1:08:19] restorationist  
[1:08:21] attempt of oh, the church was so much better before  
[1:08:23] and now we've ruined it.  
[1:08:25] I don't buy that perspective.  
[1:08:27] But in so far as  
[1:08:28] a healthy Marian devotionist cultivated,  
[1:08:30] I think,  
[1:08:32] and this is something I see in the Marianists here  
[1:08:33] at the University of Dayton,  
[1:08:35] many Marianists who would testify that  
[1:08:37] Vatican Two, the event was a liberating experience for them,  
[1:08:41] and they were devoted to Mary before,  
[1:08:44] and they're devoted to Mary now.  
[1:08:45] And I think in that spirit,  
[1:08:47] I'm certainly all for it,  
[1:08:51] and I hope I can say that  
[1:08:52] truthfully and humbly from my heart.  
[1:08:56] So thank you, thank you very much.  
[1:08:58] (applause)  
[1:09:04] (group chatter)  
[1:09:09] - I just wanted to  
[1:09:10] address two questions that seem to be  
[1:09:13] a little bit more connected  
[1:09:14] to some of the ideas  
[1:09:15] that were in my presentation.  
[1:09:18] And the first one is also from  
[1:09:20] Debra Newbery, OFS,  
[1:09:22] so a member of the Franciscan family.  
[1:09:24] And I hope you're still awake,  
[1:09:28] had a second cup of tea or something.  
[1:09:30] And she writes after reading Father Buffer's presentation,  
[1:09:35] the term *virgo facta ecclesia*,  
[1:09:38] virgin made church,  
[1:09:40] from the salute to the virgin  
[1:09:42] by St. Francis of Assisi comes to mind.  
[1:09:46] The book (speaking foreign language)  
[1:09:49] refers to the church becoming  
[1:09:51] an extension of  
[1:09:52] the Immaculate,

[1:09:54] without spot or wrinkle.  
[1:09:56] The reference is to Ephesians five, 27.  
[1:09:58] Thus verifying St. Francis' title  
[1:10:02] of the virgin made church,  
[1:10:04] I wonder would Father Thomas care to comment  
[1:10:07] on this view of Mary and the church?  
[1:10:09] Yes I would.  
[1:10:10] Well, what's,  
[1:10:13] you can't help but notice  
[1:10:15] the correspondence,  
[1:10:18] coincidence  
[1:10:19] between St. Francis calling Mary herself,  
[1:10:22] greeting her as the virgin made church,  
[1:10:25] and the many, many, many  
[1:10:27] patristic references  
[1:10:29] where Mary is compared to the church,  
[1:10:32] or they're referred to by the same title.  
[1:10:35] They're both called virgin and mother,  
[1:10:37] or something like that.  
[1:10:39] But, there are about,  
[1:10:41] in the world, there are about  
[1:10:43] 19,000 people who know more about  
[1:10:44] St. Francis' Mariology  
[1:10:46] than I do,  
[1:10:48] but I don't know all of them,  
[1:10:50] but I consulted just a few of their books,  
[1:10:51] because this is a really good question,  
[1:10:53] and it made me do a little more research.  
[1:10:55] And it looks like  
[1:10:58] St. Francis, when he came up with this title,  
[1:11:00] the virgin made church,  
[1:11:02] that that did not come from  
[1:11:04] St. Francis being exposed to  
[1:11:06] or studying patristic writings  
[1:11:09] about the church or about Mary and the church.  
[1:11:12] But it came specifically  
[1:11:15] from his experience  
[1:11:16] praying in front of the crucifix  
[1:11:19] and the Church of San Damiano.  
[1:11:22] And I'd imagine lots of you  
[1:11:23] have seen pictures  
[1:11:24] of this crucifix  
[1:11:26] which is still preserved in Assisi to this day.  
[1:11:29] And you know he was praying in front of that crucifix



[1:11:33] when he heard the Lord telling him  
[1:11:34] Francis,  
[1:11:35] rebuild my church.  
[1:11:36] Which as you can see,  
[1:11:38] is falling down.  
[1:11:39] And that changed his life.  
[1:11:41] But, Francis did not formally  
[1:11:45] study theology,  
[1:11:46] but he's a saint.  
[1:11:48] And so he gets to be a theologian  
[1:11:50] anyway, you see.  
[1:11:52] (laughter)  
[1:11:53] Well, it's true,  
[1:11:55] because all the saints have something to teach us.  
[1:11:57] So he's a doctor,  
[1:11:58] isn't he?  
[1:12:04] And the  
[1:12:05] crucifix in San Damiano  
[1:12:07] was really kind of an icon,  
[1:12:10] and it's based on the scene of the crucifixion  
[1:12:13] and the gospel  
[1:12:14] of John.  
[1:12:17] And so he's not just praying in front of any crucifix,  
[1:12:20] he's meditating on the scene of the crucifixion  
[1:12:23] specifically as it is described in the gospel of John.  
[1:12:28] And we probably know,  
[1:12:30] in the gospel of John,  
[1:12:31] Mary is never called Mary.  
[1:12:33] She is given a title,  
[1:12:36] two titles,  
[1:12:37] she's called the mother of Jesus,  
[1:12:39] and she is called woman.  
[1:12:43] When Jesus speaks to her at the wedding feast,  
[1:12:45] he calls her a woman.  
[1:12:47] And looking down at her and the beloved disciple  
[1:12:50] from the cross he calls her again woman.  
[1:12:54] And it looks like according to people  
[1:12:57] who have specifically studied St. Francis  
[1:13:00] and his Marian statements,  
[1:13:01] that's where the idea came from.  
[1:13:04] So he came up with pretty much the same idea  
[1:13:07] that you find in some of these patristic writers I mentioned  
[1:13:11] but he came up with it  
[1:13:12] by reflecting on

[1:13:14] the Saint John's gospel,  
[1:13:17] and specifically the crucifixion.  
[1:13:19] Now Debra,  
[1:13:21] you are quoting from this book,  
[1:13:22] (speaking foreign language)  
[1:13:25] and that book is,  
[1:13:26] it's written by  
[1:13:28] various authors,  
[1:13:30] and it's about the life of St. Maximilian Mary Kolbe  
[1:13:33] and it's also about his theological thinking  
[1:13:36] and his pastoral activity.  
[1:13:38] And there are a couple chapters in it  
[1:13:40] specifically about his Mariology.  
[1:13:43] And you are pretty much quoting  
[1:13:45] from the part of the book  
[1:13:46] that was written by Father Peter Damien Felner.  
[1:13:49] Okay,  
[1:13:51] and I just think it's important to point out  
[1:13:53] very quickly that  
[1:13:56] Kolbe's idea,  
[1:13:59] Kolbe's Mariology  
[1:14:02] is not the kind of Mariology that really would have happened  
[1:14:05] or indeed been possible in the patristic era,  
[1:14:09] and that's not any kind of critique of it.  
[1:14:12] It's just a very different kind of theological approach.  
[1:14:16] It's a kind of theology that could not have happened  
[1:14:19] before what we call  
[1:14:21] the scholastic period.  
[1:14:24] And Felner has a very nice commentary though  
[1:14:27] on this.  
[1:14:28] He says, Francis understood that the church needed to be  
[1:14:31] rebuilt, but how?  
[1:14:33] And first, he thought maybe it's just  
[1:14:36] the specific, physical building,  
[1:14:38] and I need to clean it up  
[1:14:39] and put some new mortar in the walls.  
[1:14:41] And then very quickly,  
[1:14:43] he understood the spiritual aspects  
[1:14:45] of the life the church needed to be rebuilt,  
[1:14:47] to become more and more  
[1:14:49] what St. Paul says  
[1:14:51] the church is going to be in her perfection,  
[1:14:54] the bride of Christ,  
[1:14:56] without spot or wrinkle, okay.

[1:14:57] But, in the patristic era,  
[1:15:01] for what it's worth,  
[1:15:02] when you have,  
[1:15:04] when they talk about the church as  
[1:15:06] bride,  
[1:15:07] or when they talk about the bride of Christ,  
[1:15:09] that's speaking about  
[1:15:11] the church.  
[1:15:12] And it's very different from what you find  
[1:15:14] in some Franciscan theology,  
[1:15:17] the idea of Mary as spouse  
[1:15:19] of the Holy Spirit.  
[1:15:21] So it's interesting,  
[1:15:23] they're very, very different Mariologies,  
[1:15:25] very different approaches,  
[1:15:26] but you have this nice  
[1:15:27] coming together  
[1:15:29] and Francis' title,  
[1:15:30] (speaking foreign language)  
[1:15:33] the virgin made the church.  
[1:15:34] And then response to Dr. Dodd's question,  
[1:15:37] if Mary is not ordained,  
[1:15:41] then wouldn't the Marian,  
[1:15:42] a more Marian church  
[1:15:44] have quantitatively  
[1:15:46] fewer priests in it?  
[1:15:48] Well, Dr. Dodd,  
[1:15:49] if that's the goal,  
[1:15:50] we're well on the way.  
[1:15:52] (chuckles)  
[1:15:53] At least locally,  
[1:15:55] but I would just turn it around, okay.  
[1:15:59] Because I think we have to be careful,  
[1:16:01] because what if I ask this question.  
[1:16:02] What if I said, well,  
[1:16:04] Jesus of Nazareth  
[1:16:06] was  
[1:16:08] a male,  
[1:16:11] and we should all be more Christian to each other,  
[1:16:14] so the church should have fewer women in it.  
[1:16:16] Isn't that right?  
[1:16:18] Everyone should say no.  
[1:16:19] That's not right.  
[1:16:21] And,

[1:16:23] by the same token,  
[1:16:25] Mary was not ordained.  
[1:16:29] She didn't have the same  
[1:16:30] mission in the church  
[1:16:32] that say the apostles did  
[1:16:34] that they received on the day of Pentecost,  
[1:16:36] even though it appears she was in the same room.  
[1:16:38] But she had a very different mission.  
[1:16:41] So does that mean for the church to be more Marian,  
[1:16:44] we should have more lay,  
[1:16:48] and fewer priests?  
[1:16:49] No, for the same reason  
[1:16:50] that for the church to be more Christian,  
[1:16:52] we shouldn't have a higher number of males than females,  
[1:16:56] or vice versa.  
[1:16:58] Okay.  
[1:16:59] But what makes us Marian  
[1:17:02] is not whether we are lay or ordained,  
[1:17:05] or either whether we are male or female,  
[1:17:08] but whether we are receptive  
[1:17:10] to the word.  
[1:17:12] Whether we are obedient.  
[1:17:14] Whether we cooperate  
[1:17:16] with God's plan of salvation.  
[1:17:19] And whether our lives bear fruit.  
[1:17:21] So I'd put it that way.  
[1:17:24] (group chatter)  
[1:17:38] - Okay,  
[1:17:39] thank you very much,  
[1:17:41] both of you.  
[1:17:42] We are also going to take some of the questions by chat,  
[1:17:45] and we're been happy to be  
[1:17:48] getting those in.  
[1:17:49] Paul has been compiling them.  
[1:17:51] So if Paul could read for us  
[1:17:53] the first  
[1:17:55] question.  
[1:17:56] Did you want to come to the mic.  
[1:17:58] - [Paul] I'll just shout.  
[1:17:59] Okay, so the first question is from Danielle Peters  
[1:18:03] and she asks,  
[1:18:06] Clement can connect Mary and the church  
[1:18:08] because he understands our rebirth and baptism  
[1:18:11] in parallel to the birth of Christ from Mary.

[1:18:14] What can be done in catechesis  
[1:18:18] to bring Mary to the baptismal font?  
[1:18:20] I think this is for you.  
[1:18:24] (laughter)  
[1:18:26] - Hi sister Danielle.  
[1:18:27] What can be done in catechesis  
[1:18:29] to bring Mary to the baptismal font?  
[1:18:32] Boy.  
[1:18:33] You know, I'm thinking back,  
[1:18:38] just thinking about,  
[1:18:39] I celebrate baptisms, right.  
[1:18:42] And if you look at  
[1:18:46] the rite of baptism for children,  
[1:18:49] let's just take a look at that.  
[1:18:50] That was extensively revised,  
[1:18:52] totally rewritten after the council.  
[1:18:54] One of the things they wanted to do  
[1:18:56] was they wanted to put more scripture into it.  
[1:18:59] They wanted script,  
[1:19:00] they wanted the word of God  
[1:19:02] to be apart of the celebration of the sacrament.  
[1:19:05] That was something that was called for  
[1:19:07] by the fathers of the second Vatican council.  
[1:19:09] But they tend to  
[1:19:11] repeat certain scriptural ideas  
[1:19:14] again and again and again.  
[1:19:17] And if you--  
[1:19:19] And you notice this when you do a lot of baptisms  
[1:19:23] and they keep talking about being born again  
[1:19:26] by water and the Spirit.  
[1:19:28] But if you look at the prayer for the blessing  
[1:19:30] of water,  
[1:19:31] it just talks about all the places where water occurs  
[1:19:33] and salvation history,  
[1:19:36] you know, from the very dawn of creation  
[1:19:38] to the crossing of the Red Sea,  
[1:19:39] and Christ being baptized in the Jordan.  
[1:19:41] But, and then they give you  
[1:19:44] scripture passages that you could read  
[1:19:46] during the celebration of baptism  
[1:19:48] outside of mass.  
[1:19:49] And none of those had any Marian  
[1:19:52] profiles.  
[1:19:54] It was very interesting.

[1:19:56] And also, in the rite of baptism itself,  
[1:19:58] there's not a lot of overt language.  
[1:20:01] Now someone's looking it up right now,  
[1:20:04] someone in Indonesia.  
[1:20:06] There's not a lot of overt language about  
[1:20:08] how we understand the church.  
[1:20:11] So, having ruled that part out,  
[1:20:13] let me come up with an idea.  
[1:20:17] Most, if not all of the ancient baptismal creeds  
[1:20:20] mention the church toward the end.  
[1:20:23] And this is something that we're familiar with  
[1:20:25] in both the apostles creed  
[1:20:27] and in the longer Nicene Constantinople creed  
[1:20:32] that we say at mass most Sundays.  
[1:20:36] And the interesting thing is  
[1:20:37] the conjunction of the mention of  
[1:20:40] the leaf in the Holy Spirit  
[1:20:42] with belief in the church.  
[1:20:44] And what are you really saying there?  
[1:20:47] You say I believe that  
[1:20:48] the Holy Spirit is sanctifying the church.  
[1:20:51] Or I believe that the Holy Spirit is sanctifying  
[1:20:54] the world through  
[1:20:56] what the church does.  
[1:20:58] So there could be your jumping off point  
[1:21:01] to connect baptism  
[1:21:04] and Mary.  
[1:21:06] Okay, because  
[1:21:07] the Holy Spirit overshadowing  
[1:21:09] the womb of Mary  
[1:21:11] and making it fruitful.  
[1:21:13] The invocation of  
[1:21:15] the Holy Spirit  
[1:21:16] over the waters of baptism.  
[1:21:17] The Spirit hovering over the waters  
[1:21:19] at the dawn of creation,  
[1:21:21] and so forth.  
[1:21:22] That might be one possible avenue of approach,  
[1:21:25] but you've got me thinking,  
[1:21:27] and on while I'm driving home,  
[1:21:30] I'll come up with a really good answer.  
[1:21:32] (laughter)  
[1:21:35] - [Dr. Dodd] And our live audience  
[1:21:36] would you have a question?

[1:21:38] If someone would like to ask at this point?  
[1:21:43] Okay, Gwen.  
[1:21:44] - [Gwen] Okay, I have a question for Dr. Doyle.  
[1:21:46] - [Dr. Dodd] If you could come up.  
[1:21:47] Go ahead.  
[1:21:50] - [Gwen] One of the things,  
[1:21:52] one of the really great strengths that you bring  
[1:21:53] to  
[1:21:55] the community  
[1:21:56] is you work in ecumenism.  
[1:21:57] - Yes.  
[1:21:58] - [Gwen] And,  
[1:22:00] I'm wondering  
[1:22:01] how you see  
[1:22:03] a Marian aspect  
[1:22:06] is that,  
[1:22:07] a more Marian,  
[1:22:09] what a more Marian aspect  
[1:22:11] of ecumenism look like?  
[1:22:14] - Yes.  
[1:22:16] Well, I think that  
[1:22:17] there were ecumenical dimensions to,  
[1:22:22] to Lumen Gentium  
[1:22:24] and I think  
[1:22:26] the whole idea of putting the universal call to  
[1:22:30] holiness at the center of the document  
[1:22:33] and saying okay, conversion  
[1:22:35] is at the center.  
[1:22:38] And discipleship is at the center.  
[1:22:42] I think that's one of many ways  
[1:22:45] that there was a reaching out  
[1:22:48] to other Christians.  
[1:22:54] There was a,  
[1:22:55] a relative of mine, an in-law,  
[1:22:57] who's a protestant  
[1:22:59] who many years ago, he said to me,  
[1:23:00] oh Vatican Two,  
[1:23:02] he said, that was just the Catholics  
[1:23:04] catching up to the Protestant's after 400 years.  
[1:23:06] (laughter)  
[1:23:09] And I think that there's,  
[1:23:10] I think that's a half truth, you know,  
[1:23:13] because there's something in it.  
[1:23:15] There's actually quite a bit in it.

[1:23:17] And,  
[1:23:20] and I think in the particular,  
[1:23:22] just the eschatological nature of the church,  
[1:23:24] all the themes that I mentioned,  
[1:23:26] have,  
[1:23:28] have ecumenical  
[1:23:30] value to them.  
[1:23:31] And,  
[1:23:34] and the way that Mary is treated,  
[1:23:36] there's great attention  
[1:23:38] to,  
[1:23:41] to talk about Mary  
[1:23:42] in scripture  
[1:23:44] and Mary in the story of salvation  
[1:23:46] as we find it in scripture.  
[1:23:48] Now there are some things that maybe  
[1:23:50] are then said  
[1:23:52] that one would have a hard time immediately  
[1:23:54] connecting to scripture,  
[1:23:56] but those things are at least said within the context  
[1:24:00] of the story  
[1:24:01] that has its grounding  
[1:24:02] in scripture.  
[1:24:04] And the whole idea then of an approach  
[1:24:06] that sees in Mary  
[1:24:08] not only  
[1:24:10] a privileged one  
[1:24:13] who  
[1:24:15] is on say the divine side of any  
[1:24:17] divine human  
[1:24:19] divides.  
[1:24:21] But to see in her  
[1:24:23] a fellow pilgrim.  
[1:24:26] I think there's a lot of ecumenical weight to that.  
[1:24:30] And it seems that,  
[1:24:31] you know,  
[1:24:32] the ecumenical movement  
[1:24:33] really seems so promising until  
[1:24:35] you know,  
[1:24:37] the last couple of decades, maybe.  
[1:24:40] But yeah, I think there are definitely  
[1:24:43] ecumenical dimensions to this.  
[1:24:44] I mean there was  
[1:24:46] a Lutheran Catholic study on Marian scripture.



[1:24:48] (chatter)  
[1:24:49] Yeah.  
[1:24:50] Yeah, or maybe I'm getting confused.  
[1:24:52] Maybe it was the Anglo one I'm thinking of.  
[1:24:54] Yeah.  
[1:24:56] But, yeah,  
[1:24:57] I think there are ecumenical  
[1:24:59] possibilities here.  
[1:25:00] And there really were for a few decades  
[1:25:03] and it seems like we're now in the so called  
[1:25:05] ecumenical winter again.  
[1:25:07] Yeah.  
[1:25:09] Yes?  
[1:25:11] - [Man] You went to the (inaudible)  
[1:25:14] I do well with the evangelical Protestants,  
[1:25:16] - Yeah.  
[1:25:17] - [Man] Mary is the one issue  
[1:25:18] that is just too Catholic. - Right.  
[1:25:22] - [Man] And there are other issues for sure,  
[1:25:24] but Mary is the hot button.  
[1:25:26] And I've just been thinking about  
[1:25:28] how do we communicate the (inaudible) truth  
[1:25:31] that we have in the Catholic church  
[1:25:32] in Mary's faith,  
[1:25:34] (inaudible)  
[1:25:36] without trying to (inaudible).  
[1:25:38] - [Paul] Dr. Doyle,  
[1:25:40] can you paraphrase that a little bit.  
[1:25:41] - Yeah, yeah.  
[1:25:42] That,  
[1:25:44] that, the person asked a question,  
[1:25:48] does a lot of work with,  
[1:25:50] with evangelicals  
[1:25:51] and Mary is a hot button issue.  
[1:25:53] Of all the things,  
[1:25:55] this is seen as like  
[1:25:56] a Catholic thing,  
[1:25:57] that is not easily translatable  
[1:25:59] into the ecumenical world.  
[1:26:02] And, surely that is true.  
[1:26:05] And there is a long history to that.  
[1:26:06] And in particular,  
[1:26:09] I mean that  
[1:26:11] Mar devotionism is something that,

[1:26:13] that evangelicals would  
[1:26:17] associate with idolatry  
[1:26:19] and old use of the statues,  
[1:26:22] and the superstitions,  
[1:26:24] and let's get heavenly favors,  
[1:26:26] and so on.  
[1:26:29] And their critiques I think,  
[1:26:32] I think fundamentally they're misunderstandings,  
[1:26:35] but there was some evidence in some places, you know,  
[1:26:38] that,  
[1:26:40] and,  
[1:26:42] so I think that,  
[1:26:45] I think the evangelicals are concerned  
[1:26:46] that  
[1:26:49] there are people who consider themselves Christians  
[1:26:51] who really are not converted.  
[1:26:53] And the conversion to Christ  
[1:26:56] and to have that experience  
[1:26:58] of being converted to Christ.  
[1:27:00] And of course there's that long history  
[1:27:01] in Catholicism that  
[1:27:04] we've always been more about formation  
[1:27:06] than transformation.  
[1:27:08] There was that book by Rosemary Hotton  
[1:27:10] called the Catholic Thing,  
[1:27:12] four or so decades ago.  
[1:27:18] I think with the collapse of the subculture,  
[1:27:19] the need for  
[1:27:23] a more evident  
[1:27:24] conversion  
[1:27:26] it is much more part of the catholic world today.  
[1:27:30] And I think that  
[1:27:32] it says in the Decree on ecumenism  
[1:27:34] there's a heirachry of truths,  
[1:27:36] you know,  
[1:27:37] and if something's low on the hierarchy of truths,  
[1:27:38] that doesn't make it less true,  
[1:27:40] but it may be something that we don't want to go there  
[1:27:42] at first,  
[1:27:43] because why start out by fighting.  
[1:27:46] And so,  
[1:27:48] I like what John Lesley thought.  
[1:27:52] John Lesley who was an Anglican priest  
[1:27:55] who said mass

[1:27:57] an average of every five days,  
[1:27:59] and at the same time,  
[1:28:00] he was somebody who inspires the holiness movement,  
[1:28:02] not only the Methodists,  
[1:28:04] but the holiness movement  
[1:28:05] and Pentecostalism today.  
[1:28:07] He thought that  
[1:28:08] if all Christians  
[1:28:11] could be more converted,  
[1:28:14] if more Christians would really live the Christian life,  
[1:28:16] that that would be the most ecumenical thing  
[1:28:20] that could happen.  
[1:28:21] And we see this in  
[1:28:22] the Vatican Two decree on ecumenism  
[1:28:25] where it talks about spiritual ecumenism.  
[1:28:27] And the best thing we could do  
[1:28:29] is ourselves have a conversion of heart  
[1:28:32] and really live out the gospel  
[1:28:34] and so yeah,  
[1:28:35] I mean good question.  
[1:28:36] You don't want to start  
[1:28:38] the conversation out  
[1:28:40] by giving them  
[1:28:41] a miraculous (inaudible).  
[1:28:44] (laughter)  
[1:28:46] So.  
[1:28:47] - [Dr. Dodd] Very good.  
[1:28:48] Thank you Dr. Doyle.  
[1:28:49] We actually have some questions  
[1:28:50] for Father Buffer as well.  
[1:28:52] Thank you.  
[1:28:53] We'll rotate you back and forth,  
[1:28:55] maybe two questions each.  
[1:28:56] - [Paul] Alright this question is from  
[1:28:59] Godfrey Yoddam,  
[1:29:00] could Father Buffer throw,  
[1:29:02] throw more light  
[1:29:04] on the blessed mother  
[1:29:05] as the bride of Christ  
[1:29:07] and St. Ambrose's analogy.  
[1:29:15] - He's really looking more at the church as,  
[1:29:16] as the bride of Christ.  
[1:29:19] And St. Ambrose's analogy,  
[1:29:22] and I think he's referring to the one,

[1:29:25] I had a couple texts in there by Ambrose,  
[1:29:27] but the one I spent time on in my  
[1:29:29] oral presentation  
[1:29:30] was where he says  
[1:29:33] David is to Bathsheba  
[1:29:36] as Christ is to the church.  
[1:29:40] So he's not comparing Bathsheba to the virgin Mary,  
[1:29:44] or vice versa so much.  
[1:29:46] But,  
[1:29:51] it's really more about when,  
[1:29:53] when the patristic writers talk about  
[1:29:57] the bride.  
[1:29:59] They are talking about the church.  
[1:30:02] Okay,  
[1:30:05] and,  
[1:30:08] I think the reason for that is obvious.  
[1:30:10] And that would be that Mary is the virgin  
[1:30:16] more than she is the bride.  
[1:30:18] Okay.  
[1:30:20] They didn't get into the kind of  
[1:30:23] speculative thought that you would find,  
[1:30:25] for example,  
[1:30:26] and well,  
[1:30:27] St. Maximilian Mary Kolbe,  
[1:30:30] where he talks about Mary as the bride or spouse  
[1:30:35] of the Holy Spirit.  
[1:30:36] They didn't get into that kind of speculative thought  
[1:30:39] when they spoke about  
[1:30:40] the virgin Mary.  
[1:30:42] They want to stay closer to the data  
[1:30:44] of scripture  
[1:30:46] as far as that goes.  
[1:30:48] So,  
[1:30:50] I hope I understand your question.  
[1:30:52] If I understand it correctly,  
[1:30:54] then St. Ambrose, when he talks about  
[1:30:56] the bride of Christ,  
[1:30:57] he's really talking about the church.  
[1:30:59] - [Paul] So there's a followup  
[1:31:01] from Dorthy Mensagra,  
[1:31:04] she says how can David's forceful impregnation  
[1:31:07] of Bathsheba,  
[1:31:09] adultery,  
[1:31:10] be a typology for Mary and the church?

[1:31:12] - Yes, how can,  
[1:31:15] how can David be a type of Christ?  
[1:31:19] Okay.  
[1:31:21] Well David can be a type of Christ  
[1:31:23] even though he's a sinner  
[1:31:25] for the same reason that Adam  
[1:31:27] is a type of Christ,  
[1:31:29] and Adam is a sinner, okay.  
[1:31:36] How can any physical conception,  
[1:31:40] whether it involves force or violence  
[1:31:43] or whether it does not involve force or violence,  
[1:31:46] how can any physical conception of a child  
[1:31:49] that is the result of the union  
[1:31:51] of the most pure romantic love  
[1:31:53] be a type of  
[1:31:56] the conception of  
[1:31:58] children of God  
[1:32:00] who are born again through faith and baptism?  
[1:32:02] Okay, and so,  
[1:32:05] when we,  
[1:32:08] we are not,  
[1:32:10] we don't find perhaps typology  
[1:32:12] as natural  
[1:32:14] as some of our Christian ancestors did.  
[1:32:17] But in their defense,  
[1:32:19] I would point out  
[1:32:21] that St. Paul thought it was a perfectly normal way  
[1:32:23] of interpreting the scripture.  
[1:32:30] Anything else?  
[1:32:33] - [Dr. Dodd] Maybe we'll take one live,  
[1:32:35] very good.  
[1:32:36] - [Man] I'd like to ask of Father Buffer,  
[1:32:38] (inaudible) I read your article.  
[1:32:39] I'm trying to understand,  
[1:32:41] what is the culture that is in the patristic period  
[1:32:44] that's so different from our culture?  
[1:32:46] Is there some kind of a  
[1:32:48] example that you could give  
[1:32:51] that shows the difference?  
[1:32:53] Like I read in the newspaper the other day that  
[1:32:57] some writers are writing that  
[1:32:59] European attitude toward  
[1:33:05] - Donald Trump.  
[1:33:06] - [Man] To enjoy the militaries (inaudible)

[1:33:08] And the other people have an attitude  
[1:33:11] toward bars, you know.  
[1:33:13] Very sort of (inaudible),  
[1:33:15] the other one military.  
[1:33:17] Anyway, is there some kind of model  
[1:33:20] where we can understand the patristic period better.  
[1:33:22] - Just throw out any.  
[1:33:26] Look, the question is how,  
[1:33:27] the patristic authors  
[1:33:30] often show that they just think about a lot of things  
[1:33:33] very differently  
[1:33:35] that we do today.  
[1:33:37] Is there some kind of model that can help us understand  
[1:33:40] how their thinking is different from ours?  
[1:33:43] And that's very interesting right,  
[1:33:44] because if their thinking is  
[1:33:47] really different from ours,  
[1:33:49] then does it have any validity for us?  
[1:33:52] Does it have anything to teach us,  
[1:33:54] or is it all totally obsolete?  
[1:33:56] And that's another interesting question in there.  
[1:34:03] These people are just as smart as we are.  
[1:34:09] But they, their intellectual training  
[1:34:11] was very different from ours.  
[1:34:13] As an example,  
[1:34:14] today, our framework for,  
[1:34:17] how does an educated person,  
[1:34:19] how does a modern educated person  
[1:34:21] understand the world  
[1:34:23] and their own experience  
[1:34:24] of their lives and the lives of others.  
[1:34:26] Science, right.  
[1:34:28] Science.  
[1:34:30] If,  
[1:34:32] let's say,  
[1:34:33] let's take the people  
[1:34:34] who were paying good money  
[1:34:36] to get lessons from Clement of Alexandria.  
[1:34:39] They were educated people.  
[1:34:40] What made them people who looked at the world  
[1:34:42] as educated persons?  
[1:34:44] Plato.  
[1:34:46] Or more specifically,  
[1:34:48] middle Platonism.

[1:34:50] That was the equivalent of  
[1:34:52] forming your mind to understand the world,  
[1:34:54] or experience yourself  
[1:34:56] the way we did today.  
[1:34:58] Okay.  
[1:35:00] Another thing is,  
[1:35:01] the way we understand history.  
[1:35:04] If you look, for example, at  
[1:35:07] the works of history  
[1:35:09] by some of the ancient historians,  
[1:35:12] Tacitus, Lucidies,  
[1:35:14] okay,  
[1:35:16] if I'm writing a book of history today,  
[1:35:18] and this is a gross oversimplification,  
[1:35:22] I'm going to tell you what happened.  
[1:35:24] And I'm going to do a lot of research  
[1:35:27] to go back to  
[1:35:28] original sources and archives  
[1:35:31] to help you understand  
[1:35:33] everything that happened,  
[1:35:34] how all these facts interconnected.  
[1:35:36] And they were doing that.  
[1:35:38] But really what they wanted to do  
[1:35:39] was to teach you something.  
[1:35:43] Look, another example that would be  
[1:35:46] the acts of the Apostles.  
[1:35:48] The inspired authors of scripture  
[1:35:51] had a very different way  
[1:35:53] of thinking and writing  
[1:35:55] than theologians do today,  
[1:35:57] thank God.  
[1:35:58] (laughter)  
[1:35:59] And yet we still read the Bible  
[1:36:01] and we find that it's teaching us something  
[1:36:03] that's very much,  
[1:36:05] that's something we need to hear  
[1:36:07] right now.  
[1:36:08] Yes?  
[1:36:10] Okay.  
[1:36:11] And so when we're reading  
[1:36:12] either the Bible  
[1:36:14] or some of these early Christian writers,  
[1:36:16] it's helpful to spend a little time  
[1:36:19] getting into their mental framework,

[1:36:21] I would say.  
[1:36:23] People make a lot of mistakes  
[1:36:26] by reading the Bible as their own kind of literature,  
[1:36:29] don't they?  
[1:36:32] Do we read the Bible to find out  
[1:36:35] how the heavens go,  
[1:36:37] or how to go to heaven?  
[1:36:40] One, you know,  
[1:36:41] take your pick.  
[1:36:47] - [Dr. Dodd] Alright, thank you.  
[1:36:49] Sure.  
[1:36:52] This is a question in from  
[1:36:55] the chat box  
[1:36:57] from Jim Tibbets  
[1:36:58] for Dr. Doyle.  
[1:37:00] He says another way the church becomes more Marian  
[1:37:02] starts when the church began  
[1:37:05] in Acts one,  
[1:37:07] when the Holy Spirit came down  
[1:37:09] and they all, including Mary,  
[1:37:12] praised God and prayed in tongues.  
[1:37:15] The first 400 years,  
[1:37:17] of the church,  
[1:37:18] they prayed in tongues  
[1:37:21] as they praised God.  
[1:37:23] Then it disappeared in the literature.  
[1:37:25] It appeared again after Vatican Two  
[1:37:29] in 1968 at a retreat  
[1:37:31] at Notre Dame.  
[1:37:33] Over the next 10 years,  
[1:37:34] it spread around the world,  
[1:37:36] influenced over 50 million people,  
[1:37:38] formed communities,  
[1:37:40] and rejuvenated churches.  
[1:37:42] A more Marian church  
[1:37:44] will be a more charismatic church,  
[1:37:47] which praises the Lord,  
[1:37:49] and praise in tongues.  
[1:37:52] So that was a thought from Jim Tibbets.  
[1:37:54] - Yes.  
[1:37:55] Yes, I think  
[1:37:56] before Notre Dame we have  
[1:37:58] beginnings of the modern Pentecostal movement  
[1:38:02] in San Francisco,



[1:38:04] the early 20th century.  
[1:38:06] And before that we have some of these medical stations  
[1:38:09] in the holiness movement  
[1:38:11] and that today,  
[1:38:14] there are approximately  
[1:38:17] 600 million  
[1:38:19] Christians worldwide  
[1:38:22] who  
[1:38:25] are part of these  
[1:38:26] spirit filled movements.  
[1:38:28] About 200 million of them  
[1:38:31] are Catholic charismatics.  
[1:38:35] This movement has grown so rapidly,  
[1:38:37] that we could predict that by  
[1:38:40] 2020, we'll all be Pentecostals.  
[1:38:47] But this is a serious thing.  
[1:38:49] And it's big  
[1:38:51] in the northern hemisphere.  
[1:38:53] It's even bigger  
[1:38:54] throughout Latin America and Africa.  
[1:39:00] And these movements that  
[1:39:02] are  
[1:39:04] tended to spontaneity  
[1:39:06] and the immediate presence of the Spirit  
[1:39:09] and the gifts and to healing.  
[1:39:13] I think that  
[1:39:16] like anything else  
[1:39:18] that I would talk about from my own perspective,  
[1:39:20] if I'm going to speak about it theologically,  
[1:39:22] I'm gonna see  
[1:39:24] wonderful things about it,  
[1:39:26] and I'm going to see  
[1:39:27] that there are some critical problems with these things.  
[1:39:29] One thing about the Pentecostals  
[1:39:34] is that  
[1:39:37] they tend often to split off from each other.  
[1:39:40] And this is something that I think the Catholic church has  
[1:39:43] as a particular gift  
[1:39:45] is this gift of unity  
[1:39:47] that there are people who leave,  
[1:39:52] but unity,  
[1:39:53] relative to other denominations  
[1:39:54] and other styles of being Christian,  
[1:39:56] that is a great gift of Catholic Christianity.

[1:39:58] I think that,  
[1:40:00] I think we have much to learn  
[1:40:03] from these people,  
[1:40:06] and I think that  
[1:40:09] you know, in so far as you could  
[1:40:11] look to Christian history  
[1:40:13] and talk about  
[1:40:14] tensions always between  
[1:40:15] the charismatic movements  
[1:40:17] and movements to have  
[1:40:21] some kind of hierarchal  
[1:40:23] input that will  
[1:40:25] let the unity hang together  
[1:40:27] and that will keep things from getting  
[1:40:28] so enthusiastic that  
[1:40:30] you're not sure whether this is Christianity anymore.  
[1:40:38] But, I mean I  
[1:40:39] really like to think of it this way,  
[1:40:41] I think that  
[1:40:43] there are a few places in history  
[1:40:45] where I think you can see the whole spirit.  
[1:40:47] And I think you can see it  
[1:40:49] in the Reformation.  
[1:40:51] And I think you can see  
[1:40:52] the Holy Spirit  
[1:40:53] in the ecumenical movement of the 20th century  
[1:40:56] until recently.  
[1:40:58] And I don't mean to be so pessimistic,  
[1:40:59] I said ecumenical winter.  
[1:41:01] Well, we can always hope that  
[1:41:03] we're just, spring is about to start, right.  
[1:41:05] And I think that the Holy Spirit is present  
[1:41:09] in the movements leading up to  
[1:41:11] enduring the second Vatican Council.  
[1:41:14] And I do believe that the Spirit is present  
[1:41:17] in these Pentecostal and chiasmatic movements.  
[1:41:20] In some places in the world,  
[1:41:23] the Catholic church is  
[1:41:25] in great competition with these,  
[1:41:27] with these movements.  
[1:41:29] Here somewhat, perhaps, but,  
[1:41:33] I think we all need to humbly listen to  
[1:41:36] and learn from each other.  
[1:41:38] And I think that

[1:41:39] there are just things about acknowledging the presence  
[1:41:43] of the spirit  
[1:41:44] in a charismatic way  
[1:41:45] in Christians  
[1:41:47] is an extremely important thing  
[1:41:49] that maybe Catholics haven't historically  
[1:41:51] been very good at.  
[1:41:54] - [Paul] Okay, this question is directed to  
[1:41:55] both of you,  
[1:41:56] but you're at the podium.  
[1:41:58] So, are there,  
[1:42:00] this is from Johnathan Lee.  
[1:42:02] Are there any implications from Marian reflection  
[1:42:04] that the fathers in the Lumen Gentium  
[1:42:06] for a theological  
[1:42:08] and pastoral approach  
[1:42:09] to the environmental concerns?  
[1:42:15] - Well,  
[1:42:17] I'm hoping Father Buffer  
[1:42:18] will have more to say  
[1:42:19] than I do  
[1:42:20] about the patristic authors, but,  
[1:42:22] I think that  
[1:42:23] if we read,  
[1:42:25] (laughter)  
[1:42:26] if we read Pope Francis' encyclical,  
[1:42:28] Laudato si,  
[1:42:30] he's drawing  
[1:42:32] upon a wide range  
[1:42:34] of scripture and tradition  
[1:42:37] to address this issue.  
[1:42:40] And so, specifically,  
[1:42:44] this was not addressed.  
[1:42:46] I wrote in  
[1:42:50] in 1992,  
[1:42:51] I wrote well Vatican Two were to happen today,  
[1:42:53] there would have been a chapter  
[1:42:55] in Gaudium et spes  
[1:42:56] on the ecological crisis.  
[1:42:58] So now we have an encyclical on it,  
[1:43:01] a very important and hard hitting encyclical.  
[1:43:04] And that encyclical draws on many resources  
[1:43:07] including  
[1:43:08] the second Vatican Council.

[1:43:10] So in a certain sense,  
[1:43:12] in the most direct way,  
[1:43:13] maybe not in Vatican Two,  
[1:43:16] but get beyond that, yeah.  
[1:43:18] Yeah, sure.  
[1:43:19] Gaudium et spes,  
[1:43:21] we have to engage the issues of the modern world.  
[1:43:23] We have to read the signs of the times.  
[1:43:25] We have to come up with a synthesis between  
[1:43:26] what science tells us,  
[1:43:27] and how we draw upon our traditions, sure.  
[1:43:32] (group chatter)  
[1:43:34] - [Dr. Dodd] We have a lot of questions.  
[1:43:36] - Actually, I just wanted to speak to the question  
[1:43:38] about care for the environment.  
[1:43:40] There is a connection,  
[1:43:42] but it's a little indirect.  
[1:43:43] And when the Pope came out with Laudato si,  
[1:43:47] a lot of people,  
[1:43:48] and some of them Catholic,  
[1:43:49] said why does the church even get involved  
[1:43:51] in this sort of thing?  
[1:43:53] Why does the church make pronouncements?  
[1:43:55] The church should stick to things like  
[1:43:56] religion,  
[1:43:57] right?  
[1:43:59] And, but it's a very good question,  
[1:44:00] why does the church make pronouncements  
[1:44:02] about care for the environment?  
[1:44:04] Why does the church make pronouncements about  
[1:44:06] labor unions,  
[1:44:08] and do you have a right to be,  
[1:44:09] for workers to organize and that sort of thing?  
[1:44:12] And I would go back to a phrase like  
[1:44:15] the mother of us all.  
[1:44:18] If the church is part of God's plan of salvation,  
[1:44:22] then the church is doing Christ's work  
[1:44:24] of gathering into one  
[1:44:25] the scattered children of God.  
[1:44:28] That means that the church  
[1:44:30] has to be concerned for every member  
[1:44:32] of the human race,  
[1:44:34] because when Jesus became incarnate  
[1:44:35] in the womb of the virgin Mary,

[1:44:37] and he joined himself  
[1:44:39] to the entire human race  
[1:44:42] as a whole.  
[1:44:44] So not everybody is explicitly  
[1:44:47] a member of the church.  
[1:44:50] Some people emphatically don't want  
[1:44:52] to be members of the church.  
[1:44:53] But the church as to care about  
[1:44:54] all human beings anyway.  
[1:44:57] And if going back to Laudato si,  
[1:44:59] the Pope's angle of approach  
[1:45:03] to care for the environment  
[1:45:06] begins with anthropology  
[1:45:08] and not with just the Earth.  
[1:45:11] So that would be the connection,  
[1:45:12] and that the church is  
[1:45:14] the universal sacrament of salvation.  
[1:45:16] The church is supposed to  
[1:45:18] give second birth to all people  
[1:45:20] so the church has to be concerned with all human beings,  
[1:45:22] their dignity and also the home that they live in.  
[1:45:30] - [Dr. Dodd] Alright, actually,  
[1:45:31] I'm gonna have you stay up there.  
[1:45:32] - [Father Buffer] You're gonna have me stay up there.  
[1:45:35] - [Dr. Dodd] You have a question for Father Buffer,  
[1:45:37] if not, we have a lot of chat questions coming in.  
[1:45:39] So, okay,  
[1:45:41] let's go ahead and take  
[1:45:43] the chat question here.  
[1:45:44] This actually somewhat follows on  
[1:45:46] what you just said Father Buffer.  
[1:45:48] This is from  
[1:45:51] Seal Dorger  
[1:45:53] and the question is,  
[1:45:55] is it fair to say  
[1:45:57] that images of the nursing virgin  
[1:46:00] can be read  
[1:46:02] as symbolic of the church?  
[1:46:05] - Well why can't they be?  
[1:46:08] Okay.  
[1:46:09] And yeah, I don't know if you  
[1:46:12] or if anyone who's listening to this talk  
[1:46:15] has ever seen  
[1:46:16] images of Mary nursing

[1:46:18] the child Jesus,  
[1:46:20] but there are lots of them.  
[1:46:22] And there's one in this room.  
[1:46:24] Okay.  
[1:46:27] (laughter)  
[1:46:29] Yeah,  
[1:46:30] if, and probably,  
[1:46:32] when we look at any image of the virgin Mary,  
[1:46:34] do we think about the church?  
[1:46:37] Okay.  
[1:46:40] And I would say that a lot of people probably don't,  
[1:46:42] including a lot of Catholics  
[1:46:45] because we've got,  
[1:46:46] we're not bad people.  
[1:46:47] We're wonderful people.  
[1:46:49] We've just gotten out of that way of thinking.  
[1:46:53] But I will say this.  
[1:46:56] When you have an image of Mary  
[1:46:58] where she's all by herself,  
[1:47:03] then what kind of image of the church  
[1:47:06] can you derive  
[1:47:07] from that kind of iconography?  
[1:47:10] If you have Mary holding Jesus,  
[1:47:13] what image of the church do you derive from that?  
[1:47:16] If you have Mary feeding Jesus,  
[1:47:19] what image of the church do you derive from that?  
[1:47:22] Anything else?  
[1:47:26] - [Dr. Dodd] Great, thank you Father.  
[1:47:29] If Dr. Doyle could come.  
[1:47:36] This is for,  
[1:47:40] asking for a comment.  
[1:47:42] This is from Alvaro Pastora  
[1:47:45] in St. Louis De Monfort  
[1:47:48] probably shares the same perspective  
[1:47:50] of the early fathers  
[1:47:52] when he states in his work  
[1:47:54] true devotion number 18.  
[1:47:56] It is she, who has suckled him,  
[1:48:00] nourished him,  
[1:48:01] supported him,  
[1:48:02] brought him up  
[1:48:03] and then sacrificed him for us.  
[1:48:05] By feeding and supporting the head,  
[1:48:08] it can be concluded she did it

[1:48:11] with the body.  
[1:48:13] So, that would be...  
[1:48:17] - That's a comment.  
[1:48:21] - [Dr. Dodd] It's asked us a question.  
[1:48:22] So you think that it's yes?  
[1:48:26] - Okay.  
[1:48:33] Yeah, I think I need to use one of my lifelines.  
[1:48:36] - [Dr. Dodd] Alright.  
[1:48:37] - I'm sorry, could you just say briefly  
[1:48:38] what the question was again.  
[1:48:40] - [Dr. Dodd] So if Mary  
[1:48:41] suckled Christ,  
[1:48:43] nourished him,  
[1:48:44] supported him,  
[1:48:45] brought him up,  
[1:48:46] sacrificed him for us,  
[1:48:48] when it says by feeding  
[1:48:50] and supporting the head,  
[1:48:52] that is Christ,  
[1:48:53] can it be concluded that Mary did that  
[1:48:55] with also the body of Christ?  
[1:48:58] That would be the church?  
[1:49:00] - Yes, yes.  
[1:49:01] And I think,  
[1:49:03] I think in my own paper,  
[1:49:05] I think  
[1:49:06] it's clear that I would agree with that.  
[1:49:09] And I think that actually speaks even more directly  
[1:49:11] to Father Buffer's paper  
[1:49:13] where he really makes that point clear.  
[1:49:14] Sure, yes.  
[1:49:17] - [Dr. Dodd] Okay.  
[1:49:19] And, also,  
[1:49:22] let's see,  
[1:49:24] this one from Raquel Seku.  
[1:49:28] Is the higher number of women  
[1:49:31] in congregations  
[1:49:33] possibly linked Mary  
[1:49:36] as like us and as a model to us  
[1:49:39] and the church as female?  
[1:49:44] - Yes.  
[1:49:46] Well,  
[1:49:47] I,  
[1:49:49] those things speak to me.

[1:49:51] I mean these things have a lot of dimensions.  
[1:49:52] They're very complex.  
[1:49:53] A few years ago,  
[1:49:55] I was giving a paper  
[1:49:57] at the American Academy of Religion,  
[1:49:58] and I was responding actually to a Pentecostal author  
[1:50:00] who was talking about playfulness  
[1:50:03] and spontaneity and tradition.  
[1:50:05] And I say well,  
[1:50:06] you know, it sounds to me like you're asking me  
[1:50:07] to come out and play.  
[1:50:08] (laughter)  
[1:50:09] And I said, but,  
[1:50:10] before I come out and play,  
[1:50:12] I'm going have to ask my mother.  
[1:50:14] And I said after all,  
[1:50:15] the church is our mother.  
[1:50:17] And this is a,  
[1:50:19] there are a lot of  
[1:50:20] people from different denominations.  
[1:50:21] There were a lot of women theologians there,  
[1:50:23] and this groan went throughout the room  
[1:50:25] like I had hit them in the stomach.  
[1:50:27] Because,  
[1:50:28] and in some circles,  
[1:50:30] the church is our mother  
[1:50:31] is considered to be sexist, right.  
[1:50:33] And but,  
[1:50:36] that is language that speaks to me.  
[1:50:38] I mean I want to be  
[1:50:41] concerned about okay,  
[1:50:42] where is that coming from?  
[1:50:44] I don't want to just dismiss  
[1:50:45] that kind of reaction.  
[1:50:46] But, it's so,  
[1:50:47] it's so grounded  
[1:50:48] in the tradition  
[1:50:50] for so many centuries.  
[1:50:53] And this is a book that Dalebock wrote  
[1:50:55] actually after the Council  
[1:50:57] because he was upset about  
[1:50:59] this aspect not being explored.  
[1:51:00] So he writes a whole book on the motherhood of the church.  
[1:51:03] And Joe Camachunk who was



[1:51:06] a teacher of mine at Catholic University  
[1:51:07] and one of the great ecclesiologists.  
[1:51:09] He also has written an article about  
[1:51:12] the church as our mother.  
[1:51:15] And you know, this is such a part of tradition  
[1:51:16] that  
[1:51:19] and then, but yeah,  
[1:51:20] the presence of women  
[1:51:22] in the congregations  
[1:51:23] and does that speak to--  
[1:51:25] Well yes, yes of course it does.  
[1:51:26] Now I mean,  
[1:51:28] like I say,  
[1:51:29] gender issues  
[1:51:30] their complex.  
[1:51:31] There's so many things to be said.  
[1:51:32] But sure, let's start out with yes.  
[1:51:34] Yes.  
[1:51:43] - [Dr. Dodd] Okay.  
[1:51:44] Maybe we'll give Father Buffer a turn.  
[1:51:51] - Sure.  
[1:51:53] - [Paul] This next question is from Theresa Monigan.  
[1:51:55] She asks the role of motherhood  
[1:51:58] is changing men with men,  
[1:52:00] women with women,  
[1:52:02] et cetera.  
[1:52:03] Are there signs of this in Mariology today too?  
[1:52:07] - So, if I understand the question is,  
[1:52:09] the roles,  
[1:52:12] the way we understand the role of mothers  
[1:52:14] is changing today  
[1:52:15] the way we understand the role of fathers  
[1:52:17] is changing today.  
[1:52:18] Is this also changing Mariology today?  
[1:52:21] You know, you start asking me about Mariology  
[1:52:24] after the year 800, and,  
[1:52:26] (laughter)  
[1:52:29] and I'm not sure I'm the right guy.  
[1:52:31] I, you know,  
[1:52:32] I think it's,  
[1:52:35] you heard Professor Doyle's  
[1:52:38] anecdote,  
[1:52:41] and just saying something like  
[1:52:42] comparing asking my mom

[1:52:45] can I go out to play  
[1:52:46] with asking the church  
[1:52:48] what should I do,  
[1:52:50] how should I behave?  
[1:52:51] And just that alone  
[1:52:53] some people found that  
[1:52:55] offensive.  
[1:52:56] It triggered them somehow.  
[1:52:58] But, I think,  
[1:53:01] I think the way that we talk about Mary  
[1:53:06] and the church at least in  
[1:53:08] the United States  
[1:53:10] and other Western cultures  
[1:53:14] has changed a lot  
[1:53:15] just in the last 50 years.  
[1:53:20] A Catholic priest  
[1:53:22] preaching about the virgin Mary  
[1:53:24] in 1955 in Chicago  
[1:53:27] could use expressions  
[1:53:28] that  
[1:53:30] his successor today just simply could not use.  
[1:53:35] You have in modern Mariology,  
[1:53:38] there has been a certain amount of writing  
[1:53:41] where people say  
[1:53:42] to what extent  
[1:53:44] has our theology about Mary  
[1:53:46] and some of our homiletic statements about Mary,  
[1:53:50] and also Marian devotion.  
[1:53:52] To what extent has that been shaped  
[1:53:55] by  
[1:53:56] just the expectations  
[1:53:58] of what women could and could not do  
[1:54:02] in a certain society.  
[1:54:05] And I certainly think that's true,  
[1:54:06] that's going to shape our Mariology.  
[1:54:09] That's going to shape the way that we speak about Mary  
[1:54:12] as a mother.  
[1:54:13] That's going to influence the way we speak  
[1:54:15] about the church as a mother.  
[1:54:17] Just look at our friend  
[1:54:18] Clement of Alexandria.  
[1:54:20] For him, you're not really,  
[1:54:23] a woman is not called a woman  
[1:54:25] until she has become pregnant.

[1:54:28] And he's not the only patristic author  
[1:54:31] who has ideas like that.  
[1:54:33] We don't talk that way today.  
[1:54:34] (laughter)  
[1:54:36] okay.  
[1:54:38] And, so yeah.  
[1:54:40] That's going to change.  
[1:54:42] Also what you've seen,  
[1:54:43] what you've seen in Mariology  
[1:54:46] in the last  
[1:54:49] maybe 40 years  
[1:54:51] is,  
[1:54:52] what some authors idea  
[1:54:53] of presenting Mary as  
[1:54:56] a person.  
[1:54:59] Mary is our example of  
[1:55:02] the ideal person,  
[1:55:05] or the ideal Christian person.  
[1:55:09] And not just looking at her function,  
[1:55:11] and the plan of salvation,  
[1:55:14] but what does it mean to be  
[1:55:16] a person?  
[1:55:18] And by the way,  
[1:55:19] she's not just a person,  
[1:55:20] she's also a person who's a woman  
[1:55:22] and who is a mother.  
[1:55:24] So yeah, I think these changes  
[1:55:25] have in the way we understand being a mother  
[1:55:29] and the way we understand being a woman  
[1:55:32] in relation to others,  
[1:55:33] I think that's already had  
[1:55:35] some measurable effects  
[1:55:37] on Mariology  
[1:55:40] and on theology.  
[1:55:41] Sure.  
[1:55:44] - [Dr. Dodd] Okay.  
[1:55:45] - [Woman] I have a question.  
[1:55:47] It's sort of a followup comment I think.  
[1:55:50] When my son was born,  
[1:55:52] which was in fact 40 years ago,  
[1:55:53] my mother's aunt  
[1:55:57] gave me an icon  
[1:55:59] of the nursing Madonna.  
[1:56:01] And the reason she gave it to me,

[1:56:03] she said,  
[1:56:04] was that motherhood's really scary  
[1:56:06] and this is to remind you  
[1:56:08] you don't have to do it entirely on your own.  
[1:56:11] - That's yeah, there you go.  
[1:56:12] - [Woman] It's still in my (inaudible)  
[1:56:15] because  
[1:56:16] it continues to be scary.  
[1:56:17] - And then,  
[1:56:19] and then,  
[1:56:20] you reacted,  
[1:56:21] yeah.  
[1:56:23] But that meant something comforting and positive to you.  
[1:56:26] - [Woman] Oh yes,  
[1:56:27] it's deeply effected me  
[1:56:28] and probably, actually now that I think of it,  
[1:56:31] has effected my (inaudible) work.  
[1:56:33] - Okay.  
[1:56:35] - [Woman] So yeah.  
[1:56:36] - And we're Anglicans.  
[1:56:37] So, I think it can be universal.  
[1:56:39] A mom is a mom,  
[1:56:42] to some extent.  
[1:56:44] It's all very complicated,  
[1:56:46] it's all very,  
[1:56:47] it has many, many  
[1:56:48] ramifications.  
[1:56:51] But also helpful, is to remember that  
[1:56:52] motherhood is scary,  
[1:56:54] and parenthood is scary,  
[1:56:57] and sometimes living is scary,  
[1:56:59] and not to have to do it on your own.  
[1:57:01] - Yeah, I mean I can share that  
[1:57:03] I was complaining,  
[1:57:04] a friend of mine who has six children,  
[1:57:07] maybe five,  
[1:57:08] they keep moving.  
[1:57:09] (laughter)  
[1:57:13] And I was complaining that  
[1:57:14] my whole day was,  
[1:57:16] had been made up of interruptions.  
[1:57:18] And she said oh, it's like being a mom.  
[1:57:22] Mom.  
[1:57:23] Mom.

[1:57:24] Mom.  
[1:57:25] Right.  
[1:57:27] - [Woman] Oh yeah.  
[1:57:28] - Yeah.  
[1:57:29] So that, you know,  
[1:57:30] the church could learn something from that I suppose, huh?  
[1:57:37] - [Paul] Okay, and,  
[1:57:38] this one's for you.  
[1:57:39] This is from Jim Tibbets.  
[1:57:41] - Oh yes.  
[1:57:42] - [Paul] It says, Father Buffer,  
[1:57:43] your emphasis on Mary  
[1:57:45] as the new Eve  
[1:57:46] and mother of the living  
[1:57:48] is unique and modern,  
[1:57:49] yet there is a different biblical understanding.  
[1:57:52] In a Marian studies article on purification,  
[1:57:54] and it explains how the biblical emphasis  
[1:57:58] on human life  
[1:57:59] is related to purification  
[1:58:00] and involved three alters of purification  
[1:58:03] of the Lord,  
[1:58:04] the alter of sacrifice,  
[1:58:06] the alter of marriage,  
[1:58:07] of the marriage bed,  
[1:58:09] and alter of the kitchen table.  
[1:58:12] Whereas the alter of sacrifice was  
[1:58:13] spiritual,  
[1:58:15] the alter of the kitchen table  
[1:58:17] involved a kosher diet,  
[1:58:18] even a kosher vegetarian diet.  
[1:58:20] Yes some foods bring life  
[1:58:22] and others do not.  
[1:58:24] This was the concrete understanding  
[1:58:25] of life  
[1:58:26] in biblical terms.  
[1:58:28] Sorry, in biblical times.  
[1:58:31] Do you agree?  
[1:58:33] - Hi Jim.  
[1:58:34] (laughter)  
[1:58:36] Let me say,  
[1:58:41] my emphasis on Mary  
[1:58:43] as the new Eve,  
[1:58:45] not it's not modern.

[1:58:49] It's the oldest,  
[1:58:50] it's the oldest theological reflection  
[1:58:54] that we have about the virgin Mary  
[1:58:56] after the New Testament writings.  
[1:58:59] Okay.  
[1:59:01] So,  
[1:59:04] and I would just say  
[1:59:05] what does it mean  
[1:59:07] that we just went through  
[1:59:09] Holy week  
[1:59:10] where the scriptures  
[1:59:12] worked very hard  
[1:59:13] to help us understand the parallel between Jesus  
[1:59:17] and  
[1:59:19] people being commanded to eat a lamb.  
[1:59:24] That's all I got.  
[1:59:26] - [Dr. Dodd] Very good.  
[1:59:30] And Dr. Doyle.  
[1:59:35] This question is from  
[1:59:38] Sister Danielle Peters  
[1:59:41] for Dr. Doyle.  
[1:59:43] Says in his paper he said  
[1:59:45] some minimalists thought,  
[1:59:47] mainly for ecumenical reasons,  
[1:59:49] that Mary should be kept out of the document on the church,  
[1:59:54] and that perhaps the Council should not say anything  
[1:59:57] about her at all.  
[2:00:00] I've read with interest  
[2:00:02] all the text he suggested  
[2:00:04] in his footnotes,  
[2:00:06] but could not find  
[2:00:07] an indication  
[2:00:08] that there was a group  
[2:00:10] wishing not to say anything about her at all,  
[2:00:15] nor have I heard of this  
[2:00:17] in any Emory class  
[2:00:18] or in my personal research  
[2:00:20] so I would be interested in knowing  
[2:00:23] who belonged to that group.  
[2:00:27] - I could be wrong.  
[2:00:29] And it maybe that I have my facts wrong  
[2:00:32] in this strip.  
[2:00:34] But where I thought I was getting at  
[2:00:37] is from Semmelroth's commentary on

[2:00:41] the chapter on Mary  
[2:00:44] that was in the Lexicon,  
[2:00:48] the LCHF Lexicon in German  
[2:00:51] and it's in that.  
[2:00:53] They have three editions of that.  
[2:00:54] It was in the second edition.  
[2:00:56] But, it could be that  
[2:00:58] I was misremembering that.  
[2:01:00] So.  
[2:01:05] - Okay, very good Dr. Doyle.  
[2:01:08] And I think that  
[2:01:09] we will have to,  
[2:01:14] I have to be conscious of time  
[2:01:16] in that we have many questions  
[2:01:19] but we have only so much time  
[2:01:21] for today.  
[2:01:23] And so I want to say that  
[2:01:26] there are still questions on the chat box  
[2:01:29] that we have not gotten to,  
[2:01:31] but we will give those  
[2:01:33] to the speakers  
[2:01:34] so that they can  
[2:01:36] then respond to them  
[2:01:39] in their papers  
[2:01:40] as they will continue working.  
[2:01:42] And we will have those papers published  
[2:01:45] in the future  
[2:01:46] and we will let everyone know  
[2:01:48] when those are available.  
[2:01:51] And so,  
[2:01:52] we certainly are glad  
[2:01:54] that  
[2:01:56] we could have such fine presentations  
[2:01:58] with Dr. Doyle  
[2:02:00] and Father Buffer's presentations today  
[2:02:03] on the question of Mary  
[2:02:05] in today's church,  
[2:02:07] and  
[2:02:08] their thought provoking  
[2:02:11] presentations  
[2:02:12] generated more questions  
[2:02:14] than we could even get to,  
[2:02:15] so that's a good thing.  
[2:02:17] And, I want to thank our technical assistants,

[2:02:21] especially Paul Dagnall,  
[2:02:23] as he worked very hard.  
[2:02:25] And John LeComte also  
[2:02:28] for being able to  
[2:02:30] provide this to you electronically.  
[2:02:32] And I want to thank everyone  
[2:02:36] for participating.  
[2:02:37] Our live audience here  
[2:02:39] in the Marian Library,  
[2:02:40] and the many people  
[2:02:42] watching online.  
[2:02:44] It is indeed a blessing  
[2:02:46] to have such a global representation  
[2:02:49] of the church  
[2:02:50] to bring together  
[2:02:51] on this topic.  
[2:02:53] And we invite you all  
[2:02:56] to the third online Marian Forum  
[2:02:59] that will be held the afternoon  
[2:03:01] of Friday,  
[2:03:04] October 14th,  
[2:03:06] 2016.  
[2:03:08] The topic will be  
[2:03:09] on the Papal teachings  
[2:03:12] of Mary's place in the church.  
[2:03:15] We will have Father Thomas Thompson  
[2:03:17] to present Blessed Pope Paul the sixth.  
[2:03:21] Sister Danielle Peters  
[2:03:23] will talk about  
[2:03:25] St. John Paul the second.  
[2:03:27] And Father Alexandra  
[2:03:30] Mellow  
[2:03:31] will discuss  
[2:03:32] Pope Francis.  
[2:03:34] So registration  
[2:03:35] is already open  
[2:03:37] for our upcoming forum.  
[2:03:39] You can find the link on our website,  
[2:03:42] the website of the  
[2:03:44] International Marian Research Institute.  
[2:03:47] And I will send this link to all those  
[2:03:50] who are registered for this forum today.  
[2:03:54] And in thanksgiving for such  
[2:03:57] a wonderful gathering,



[2:03:58] I think it would be appropriate for us  
[2:04:00] to close  
[2:04:03] with the doxology  
[2:04:04] praising our Holy Trinity  
[2:04:07] for this blessing of Mary as our mother  
[2:04:10] and also for our time here together.  
[2:04:15] And so let us pray  
[2:04:16] in the name of the Father,  
[2:04:18] and of the Son,  
[2:04:19] and of the Holy Spirit,  
[2:04:21] Amen.  
[2:04:22] Glory be  
[2:04:23] to the Father  
[2:04:25] and to the Son  
[2:04:26] and to the Holy Spirit,  
[2:04:28] as it was in the beginning,  
[2:04:30] it is now and every shall be  
[2:04:33] world without end.  
[2:04:35] Amen.  
[2:04:36] In the name of the Father,  
[2:04:37] and of the Son,  
[2:04:38] and of the Holy Spirit,  
[2:04:40] Amen.  
[2:04:41] Thank you.