



Calhoun: The NPS Institutional Archive

Theses and Dissertations

Thesis Collection

1989-06

An intelligent computer-aided instruction system for Naval ship recognition

Bernier, Denise R.

Monterey, California. Naval Postgraduate School

http://hdl.handle.net/10945/27102



Calhoun is a project of the Dudley Knox Library at NPS, furthering the precepts and goals of open government and government transparency. All information contained herein has been approved for release by the NPS Public Affairs Officer.

> Dudley Knox Library / Naval Postgraduate School 411 Dyer Road / 1 University Circle Monterey, California USA 93943

http://www.nps.edu/library



.



NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL Monterey, California





AN INTELLIGENT COMPUTER-AIDED INSTRUCTION SYSTEM FOR NAVAL SHIP RECOGNITION

by

Denise R. Bernier

June 1989

Thesis Advisor:

Neil C. Rowe

Approved for public release; distribution unlimited

THOOL A. UK (12, C5945 500**2** Inclassified

Secu	rity Classificati	on of this j	page							
REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE										
la I	a Report Security Classification UNCLASSIFIED				1b Restrictive Markings					
la S	Security Classifi	ication Au	thority		3 Distribution Availability of Report					
b Declassification/Downgrading Schedule					Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.					
Performing Organization Report Number(s)					5 Monitoring Organization Report Number(s)					
a Name of Performing Organization			nization	6b Office Symbol (If Applicable)	7a Name of Monitoring Organization					
Naval Postgraduate School 52 c Address (city, state, and ZIP code)					7b Address (city, state, and ZIP code) Monterey CA 93943-5000					
a Name of Funding/Sponsoring Organization 8b Office Symbol (If Applicable)					9 Procurement Instrument Identification Number					
c A	Address (city, sta	ite, and ZIF	^o code)		10 Source of Funding Numbers					
					Program Element Number	Project No	Task No	Work Unit Accession No		
1 1 NI	Fitle (Include Se NTELLIGENT	curity Cla COMPUT	ssification) TER-AIDED II	STRUCTION SYSTEM FO	R NAVAL SHIP RECOGN	NITION				
2 Personal Author(s) Bernier, Denise R.										
3a Type of Report13b Time CoveredMaster's ThesisFromTo					14 Date of Report (year, month,day) June 1989			15 Page Count 97		
⁶ Supplementary Notation The views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not reflect the official policy or position of the Department of Defense or the U.S. Government.										
7 (Cosati Codes		18 Su	bject Terms (continue on reve	erse if necessary and identif	y by block nu	umber)			
ield	eld Group Subgroup		Arti	ficial Intelligence, I	ntelligent Computer-Aided Instruction,					
			Shir	Recognition, Prolo	g					
⁹ Abstract (continue on reverse if necessary and identify by block number This thesis discusses the design and implementation of an intelligent computer-aided instruction system for Vaval ship recognition. The system uses artificial-intelligence techniques to provide an interactive tutoring invironment. The student's abilities for ship recognition are tested using randomly selected side-view photos. The student's response is compared to the correct ship in an expert module. If the response is incorrect the eatures of the correct ship are compared with those of the incorrect ship to formulate a hypothesis concerning the tudent's misconceptions. Tutoring strategies are chosen based on this comparison. The system provides a ecognition test, a summary review, and an individual photo review. A review of recognition features for each hip is supplied during the recognition test. A final summary is generated at the end of testing.										
Distribution/Availability of Abstract					21 Abstract Security Classification					
X unclassified/unlimited same as report DTIC users					UNCLASSIFIED					
^{2a} Name of Responsible Individual Prof. Neil C. Rowe					22b Telephone (Include A (408) 646-2462	Area code)		22c Office Symbol Code 52Rp		
D FORM 1473, 84 MAR 83 APR edition may be u					e used until exhausted		security	classification of this page		

All other editions are obsolete

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.

An Intelligent Computer-Aided Instruction System for Naval Ship Recognition

by

Denise R. Bernier Lieutenant, United States Navy B.S., Medical College of Virginia, 1981

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE IN COMPUTER SCIENCE

from the

NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL June 1989

ABSTRACT

This thesis discusses the design and implementation of an intelligent computer-aided instruction system for Naval ship recognition. The system uses artificial-intelligence techniques to provide an interactive tutoring environment. The student's abilities for ship recognition are tested using randomly selected side-view photos. The student's response is compared to the correct ship in an expert module. If the response is incorrect the features of the correct ship are compared with those of the incorrect ship to formulate a hypothesis concerning the student's misconceptions. Tutoring strategies are chosen based on this comparison. The system provides a recognition test, a summary review and an individual photo review. A review of recognition features for each ship is supplied during the recognition test. A final summary is generated at the end of testing.

iii



TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INT	RODUCTION1
	Α.	SHIP RECOGNITION2
	в.	METHODOLOGY
	С.	PREVIEW
II.	OVE	RVIEW OF COMPUTER-AIDED INSTRUCTION5
	A.	BACKGROUND
	в.	COMPUTER-AIDED INSTRUCTION
	с.	ICAI SYSTEMS6
		1. STRUCTURE
		a. Expert Module7
		b. Tutor Module7
		c. Student Model9
		2. Applications10
III.	OVEI	RVIEW OF SHIP RECOGNITION
	Α.	PURPOSE
	в.	PROCEDURES14
	С.	TRAINING PROGRAMS14
	D.	ASSUMPTIONS16
IV.	SHI	PRECOGNITION: AN ICAI APPROACH
	Α.	SYSTEM ORGANIZATION17
	в.	EXPERT MODULE19
		1. Knowledge Base19
		2. Inference Engine

C. KNOWLEDGE ACQUISITION21	
D. TUTOR MODULE	
E. STUDENT MODEL26	
F. USER INTERFACE	
1. Input	
2. Error Checking	
V. RESULTS	
VI. CONCLUSION	
A. ACHIEVEMENTS	
B. LIMITATIONS	
C. RECOMMENDED SYSTEM ENHANCEMENTS	
APPENDIX A - DEMONSTRATION	
APPENDIX B - USER'S MANUAL	
APPENDIX C - SOURCE CODE	
LIST OF REFERENCES	
INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST	



I. INTRODUCTION

Computer-assisted instruction systems in use today can provide a sophisticated learning experience for students, in some cases rivaling the instruction provided by human instructors. One advantage of computer-based training is the one-on-one teaching available for students. In the majority of today's classrooms there is little opportunity for students to receive the direct attention that is possible with computer-based instruction.

Although computerized instruction has been available to one degree or another for many years, it has not been utilized as extensively as it could have been. One reason for this is the cost of computer hardware and software. Systems in use in the past used expensive machines to provide tutoring services that could be provided through books and other types of less expensive media. Computer tutoring systems needed to develop further in order for the benefits to justify the cost.

In recent years a great deal of research has been done in achieving "thinking" systems. These new "thinking" systems provide a mechanism for computer-based instruction that is much closer to the teaching possible from human instructors. This thesis will investigate the possible use

of a "thinking" computer system for training military personnel in ship recognition.

A. SHIP RECOGNITION

Ship recognition is the ability to differentiate between different classes of ships. Weapons systems, which are easily recognizable, can be used to visually determine the general mission of an observed ship from a side view. Once a ship is identified by class, intelligence information can provide further data concerning the armament and capabilities of the contact. Positive identification of unfriendly ships, before they come within attack range of our own ships, provide a strong incentive for up-to-date intelligence [Ref. 1].

Currently ship recognition is taught using drill methods. Intelligence officers with knowledge of each ship class drill officers and crewmen using slides of both ship photos, line drawings and silhouettes. There are also flash cards and books available for individual study. Recently, computer programs for use on microcomputers have been introduced into military commands. These programs provide another method of drilling the student on ship features, while not requiring an instructor on hand.

B. METHODOLOGY

We have programmed a computer-based ship recognition tutor from information provided by military recognition

guides and other recognition books [Refs. 2,3,4]. A ship feature description and a menu of ship names are provided to the user. The user is required to select the name of the correct ship or ask for help. Help is provided in the form of the correct answer along with a list of the identifying features of the ship in question. If the user selects a ship name the ship recognition tutor will compare the user's answer with that of an expert ship-identification module. Based on this comparison the user receives immediate results in the form of a positive response, with a review of key features, or a negative response, with a feature-by-feature review of the differences between the correct response and the user's response.

Artificial intelligence (AI) techniques implemented in the Prolog programming language were utilized in the design of the ship recognition tutor. This type of computer program is referred to as an intelligent computer-aided instruction (ICAI) system or an intelligent tutoring system (ITS).

C. PREVIEW

Chapter II provides an overview of the use of computers in instruction, with a review of computer-aided instruction (CAI) and intelligent computer-aided instruction (ICAI). Chapter III provides an overview of ship recognition and current training techniques. Chapter IV discusses the

design and implementation of our ship recognition tutor. Chapter V discusses the performance of the ship recognition tutor. Chapter VI is the conclusion and discusses the benefits and limitations of the ship recognition tutor. Appendix A provides a representative user session. Appendix B contains a User manual for the program, with information for use and modifications. Appendix C contains the Prolog source code for the ship recognition tutor.

II. OVERVIEW OF COMPUTER-AIDED INSTRUCTION

A. BACKGROUND

Computers were first used for teaching in the late 1950's. Computers have gone on to be used in all levels of education. Medical students use computers to practice diagnosis and prescription on patients simulated by computer programs. Engineering students use computers to assist in problem solving. Computers are also used for educational purposes outside schools. Children learn spelling and arithmetic and high school students practice for college entrance examinations using educational software available to the general public [Ref. 5].

Computer-aided instruction (CAI) is the name given the use of computers in education. Intelligent computer-aided instruction (ICAI) refers to instructional systems utilizing artificial intelligence technology. The acronym CAI will be used to refer to the more traditional approaches to computerized instruction.

B. COMPUTER-AIDED INSTRUCTION

Traditional CAI programs tend to be statically organized structures that contain both the domain and pedagogical knowledge of the expert. This is similar to the idea that books contain the knowledge of their authors.

There is no expectation that a book can dynamically access the knowledge it contains to answer unexpected questions, or that the book can add new knowledge to its current contents [Ref. 6]. CAI programs translate the teacher's decisions into a program, all the possible circumstances that might require a decision are considered, and code to deal with each of these possibilities is included in the program.

Early research into CAI tried to build systems which contained course material in sequential lessons. These early programs were either electronic "page-turners", which printed prepared text, or drill-and-practice monitors, which asked students to answer questions and then responded using prestored answers and comments. Educational uses of computers have expanded to include free-style use of the machine, where the student learns problem solving by programming, as well as the use of games and simulations as instructional tools.

C. ICAI SYSTEMS

The idea of research into instructional systems utilizing artificial intelligence is to capture the knowledge that experts use to compose an instructional interaction. The goal is to produce a system that is capable of autonomous reasoning on the basis of only primitive principles. Reasoning from the expertise of experts rather than looking

up their decisions, creates the possibility of new decisions that may not have been anticipated by the experts [Ref. 6].

1. Structure

ICAI systems consist of three main components: the problem-solving expertise, which is the knowledge to be imparted; the tutoring strategies, which indicate how the system will teach the student; and the student model, which indicates what the student knows or does not know [Ref. 7]. These components are respectively referred to as the expert module, the tutor module and the student model. An interface module is also needed to provide a smooth, clear presentation to the user. Figure 2.1 shows the components of an ICAI system.

a. Expert Module

The expert module serves two functions. It acts as a source of the knowledge to be tested and a means of evaluating the student's responses [Ref. 6]. The expert module for tutors of technical skills should be drawn from the knowledge of several experts in the field to be taught, in order to prevent blind spots in the knowledge base [Ref. 8].

b. Tutor Module

The tutor module selects problems to be solved, monitors performance and provides assistance. This module



Figure 2.1 ICAI System Components

requires knowledge in addition to knowledge of the subject being taught: knowledge of teaching skills.

Most ICAI research into tutor modules has explored diagnostic modeling. The program evaluates the student's understanding of the topic by interpreting his response. Feedback is then provided, to allow the student to learn skills he has used incorrectly or not at all. Recently there has been an attempt to decide just the right thing to say that will allow the student to realize his error and to use this knowledge to switch to a better method. This classical method, the Socratic method, requires repetitive questions that guide the student along a specific line of reasoning [Ref. 7].

A second teaching strategy is called *coaching*. This method does not follow a strict lesson plan, but encourages learning through activities such as computer games. The primary aim of the student is enjoyment of the game, with learning as a by-product. The computer "coach" observes the progress of the game and offers suggestions or new information as required. The coaching method requires little interruption and allows the student to proceed relatively on his own. [Ref. 7]

c. Student Model

The student model provides a representation of what the student does and does not know. This information is generally obtained by comparing the student's response

to that of the expert. Once a comparison has been made, the information is used to determine possible misconceptions and to decide the best tutoring strategy to correct the misconception.

2. Applications

SCHOLAR is a mixed-initiative computer-based tutoring system that tutors about facts concerning South American geography. Both the student and the system can initiate conversations by asking questions. This program was a pioneering effort in the development of programs that could handle unanticipated student questions and react appropriately [Ref. 7].

WHY, which tutors students in the causes of rainfall, was developed in response to a need for systems that could deal with subject matter that is not purely factual. Student errors could involve not only forgotten facts but also misunderstandings as to why processes work the way they do [Ref. 7].

The SOPHIE tutoring system allows the student to learn by trying out his ideas rather than by direct instruction. A model of problem-solving techniques is contained in the system domain along with heuristics for answering student questions and handling misconceptions. These features allow a one-to-one interaction between the student and a computer "expert", who helps the student come

up with his own ideas. The problem-solving skills taught in SOPHIE are taught in the context of an electronics laboratory [Ref. 7].

WEST was the first ICAI system to utilize a coaching strategy. This method involves a computer game that the student plays, while a "coach" observes in the background, occasionally offering suggestions. A coaching strategy does not interrupt the student so often that it becomes intrusive. This would destroy the fun of playing the game. The idea of the WEST system is to provide drilland-practice in arithmetic to elementary school children. WUMPUS is another coaching system which requires knowledge of logic, probability, decision theory and geometry to track down and destroy the Wumpus while avoiding various traps [Ref. 7].

GUIDON is a system that teaches diagnostic problemsolving in the medical field. The system utilizes the MYCIN consultation system as the expert domain. GUIDON's teaching knowledge is totally separate from the MYCIN subject domain. MYCIN provides infectious-disease rules that constitute the topic to be discussed and a basis for evaluating student responses. The system provides a mixedinitiative dialogue that goes beyond merely responding to the student's last response or repetitive questioning [Ref. 7].

GUIDON'S case method of presentation closely resembles the presentation method we used in the ship recognition tutor. The student is required to concentrate on specific cases or, in our system, specific ships. GUIDON allows the student to ask questions to gather information, whereas our ship recognition tutor provides information through a menu-based dialogue. In both systems the tutorial system only intervenes when the student asks for help or when his responses are suboptimal [Ref. 6].

STEAMER is a system used to train engineers who will operate large ships. The training is designed to help the student form a mental model of the steam propulsion plant and understand related engineering principles. STEAMER is important in the research into ICAI systems since it stimulated interest in the development of objectoriented graphic simulations in training [Ref. 7].

III. OVERVIEW OF SHIP RECOGNITION

Numerous changes have occurred in naval weaponry in the past decade, resulting in warships that are hard to distinguish. Knowledge of identifiable features and weapon systems is required to differentiate between different classes of warships and to determine a ship's general mission. Positive identification of unfriendly ships or aircraft before they reach attack range can mean the difference between life and death in a wartime situation.

A. PURPOSE

Training of a ship's crewmen, intelligence personnel and pilots in the identification of ship classes and weapons systems is required to provide up-to-date intelligence information. Air reconnaissance, both visual and photographic, plays an important role in the intelligencegathering mission. Aircraft personnel must not only be able to recognize unfriendly ships, but must also be able to identify weapons systems on board. Information acquired through air reconnaissance is rapidly passed to analysts on the ground or on board ship. Once the ship is identified by class, the operational intelligence personnel can brief the commander on the capabilities of the contact. [Ref. 1,10]

B. PROCEDURES

Naval ship recognition, as taught to Naval personnel, follows two basic ideas. A fast, overall impression of the ship provides operational identification. Then there is a feature-by-feature analysis, requiring prolonged observation. This observation can be either direct or through study of reconnaissance photos. Information that can help in the identification of ships includes the geographical location of the ship, knowledge of which ships are known to cruise in the region and intelligence information gathered prior to the sighting. Features of interest to intelligence personnel are: (1) armament such as missile launchers, guns and ASW weapons; (2) armor on sides decks, turrets, towers and superstructures; (3) electronic equipment; and (4) navigational equipment. [Ref 1,10]

C. TRAINING PROGRAMS

There are several aids for training military personnel in ship recognition. Generally ship recognition is included in training given by intelligence personnel. Sessions, utilizing slides of ship photos along with either line drawings or silhouettes, are provided to allow personnel to become familiar with various ships. During these sessions the instructor points out key identifying features and suggests memory aids to help the student remember the ship along with its features. The intelligence officer will

also provide classes to review ships that may be encountered in specific areas of deployment.

Supplemental resources available for learning ship recognition include flash cards, with line drawings or silhouettes, and books such as <u>Jane's Fighting Ships</u>. There are CAI programs as well. The programs provide a silhouette of the ship, allowing the student to answer a multiple-choice question regarding the identity of the ship. The student is provided with a positive or negative response and a review of the features of the ship, similar to the flash cards mentioned earlier.

Classroom training in ship recognition provides a knowledgeable instructor to supply the student with comparison feedback for incorrect answers. For example the instructor can point out features that are present on the student's answer and show that they are not present on the ship in question. He can also show slides of an incorrect ship the student selected for an immediate visual comparison. But this is not often done due to the limited number of instructors available and the time required for individual instruction. An ICAI program can provide this direct comparison capability and provide one-on-one instruction for everyone.

D. ASSUMPTIONS

In writing the ship recognition tutor we assume that the student has some knowledge of ship features and weapon systems. The system requires that photos, line drawings or silhouettes be provided for the training syllabus. Appendix B provides information that will allow modifications to the system to include additional ships. The ships currently included in the system are listed along with the source code in Appendix C.

IV. SHIP RECOGNITION: AN ICAI APPROACH

A. SYSTEM ORGANIZATION

The ship recognition tutor was designed and implemented on an IBM-compatible microcomputer using the Arity Prolog programming language. It requires 512K of RAM memory. The following files are needed: tdriver.ari, tmenu.ari, comparer.ari¹, ships.ari, tdescrip.ari, utilities.ari, summary.exe and getstime.exe. Figure 4.1 illustrates the relationships between the program files. When the tutor is operated on a hard-drive system, the time to identify each ship is approximately one minute. The operating time is greatly dependent on the expertise of the student, since more time is required when incorrect responses are given. The operating time may increase slightly when using a floppy-drive system.

1. This program was started as a class project in CS4311 at the Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, California.



Figure 4.1 Ship Recognition Tutor Structural Model

B. EXPERT MODULE

1. Knowledge Base

The rules which identify ships are contained in the file ships1.ari. The information is contained in a series of predicates, that include a list of the identifying features of each ship. The format of this predicate is:

rule(ship id(<'ship-name'>), [<feature-fact-list>])

The items in **<feature-fact-list>** have arguments that are brief descriptions of the features. This descriptive information is included to differentiate two features in the same general category with different overall appearances. Some examples of ship identification rules are displayed in Figure 4.2.

```
rule(ship id('Kresta II CG'),
    [mast 2('two masts'),
    foremast('large obelisk type foremast'),
    aftermast ('smaller pyramid aftermast'),
    radar('radar atop mack'),
    top sail ('TOP SAIL radar'),
    helo('raised helo pad aft'),
    ssm('canted launchers below bridge wings')]).
rule(ship id('Kiev CVHG'),
    [fight deck('angled flight deck'),
    superstructure('tiered superstructure'),
    other features ('looks like cruiser in profile')]).
rule(ship id('Kirov CGN'),
    [mast 1 ('large mack amidship'),
    radar('atop mack'),
    top sail (TOP SAIL radar'),
    superstructure ('superstructure amidship with
     large mack'),
    forecastle('long, slightly stepped, sharply
     raked bow')]).
```

Figure 4.2 Sample Ship Identification Rules

2. Inference Engine

The ship recognition system uses comparison techniques as its inference engine. The student's response is compared with the known correct response obtained using the following predicate:

ship_photo_comb(<photo-number>, <ship-name>)

If the student's response is correct, the student is notified appropriately; if not, the system goes on to compare the correct response rule with the incorrect response rule.

This comparison is done in the file *comparer.ari* utilizing the predicate **compare**. The format for the comparison is as follows:

compare(<correct_answer>, <student_answer>, <Features_not_present>, <Features_missed>, <Features_details_diff>).ls2

<Features_not_present> is bound to a list of features that were present in the incorrect answer, but not in the correct answer. <Features_missed>, is bound to a list of the features contained in the correct ship's description but not in the description of the ship that the student chose. Finally, the predicate <Features_details_diff> contains a list of the features in the student's answer that differ only in the detailed descriptions (arguments) of the recognition features.

C. KNOWLEDGE ACQUISITION

The domain expertise for the ship recognition tutor was obtained from Department of Defense Recognition guides and from other recognition books [Refs. 2,3,4]. Although there was no direct consultation with experts, the knowledge obtained from published sources was deemed adequate for the development of this prototype tutor. An operational ship recognition tutor should be modified as applicable by the

instructors involved in the teaching syllabus. Information concerning modifications to this system is contained in Appendix B.

In reference guides for ship recognition, the features are listed along with a photo and a silhouette or a line drawing of the ship in question. In this tutoring system however, the features are listed for the student only in a final review of the ship. For incorrect answers the tutor addresses ship features individually and requires acknowledgement from the student.

D. TUTOR MODULE

Our tutor module is implemented in *tdriver.ari*. Tutor modules differentiate ICAI systems from CAI systems in that ICAI systems separate the tutoring strategies from the expert module. The tutor module is responsible for overseeing the student's progress and selecting the appropriate information to best instruct the student. The tutoring rules used in the ship recognition tutor are handled initially by the predicate **check_answer**. The student is asked to choose the correct ship from a menu of choices. The possible responses are:

- help. The tutor will give the correct answer and a review of the ship's features.
- quit. The tutor will quit, giving a summary of the session.

- correct response. The tutor will give an affirmative response along with a review of the ship's name and features.
- incorrect response. The tutor will give a negative response and will begin tutoring the student.

A major issue in deciding tutor strategies for this sort of system lies in the attempt to determine where the student went wrong. The ship recognition system tries to determine the student's misconceptions using the **compare** predicate to compare the student's ship to the correct ship. Once the features that appear to have caused the student difficulty are found, the next issue is which category of misconceptions is most important, or more likely to have caused the incorrect response.

We decided that the student was more likely to have problems with features in the same general category, features that were common to both the correct response and the incorrect response, but possessed different descriptive arguments. An example is shown in Figures 4.3 and 4.4. The ships are the Kresta I CG and the Kresta II CG, which are very similar. For example, both ships have SSM launchers under the bridge wings, but on the Kresta I the launchers are horizontal and on the Kresta II the launchers are canted. The compare predicate would return this information in the Feature_details_diff argument. Since a misconception of this type is very likely to occur, the student is first directed to these features.


Figure 4.3 Kresta I CG



Figure 4.4 Kresta II CG

After any such student errors have been tutored, the student is next instructed on any features that are present in the correct ship, but not on the ship that he chose as the answer. These features are contained in Featuresmissed. Finally, the student is tutored on any Features_not_present, features that are present in the ship he chose but not in the correct ship.

The student is given three chances to choose the correct ship, his initial choice and two more. The second chance occurs following the entire tutoring sequence described above, and the third chance after another pass through the sequence. Each time he makes an incorrect choice the tutoring strategy involves the latest choice. After three chances, the system tells the student the correct answer and provides him with the identifying features of the correct ship.

When the student responds with an incorrect answer, the program first checks the length of time it took him to respond. The tutor utilizes the information the student entered concerning his experience level to determine a minimum length of time the student should view a photo prior to making a ship name selection. This is only relevant when the student's response is incorrect. It was arbitrarily determined that a Beginner should review an unfamiliar ship at least 30 seconds before attempting to make an identification, an Intermediate user ten seconds,

and no minimum time for an Expert user. Incorrect responses given prior to these times were considered "guesses".

Another important issue is that student misconceptions, or errors, fall into two major categories, perceptual and conceptual. When a student appears to see features that are not on the ship or miss features which are there, the error is perceptual; conceptual errors are knowledge misconceptions. When the student misidentifies a ship, our system first checks for perceptual errors by asking the student if the features identified by the comparison between the two ships are present or not. If the student still does not see a feature that is present on the ship, the system will ask him to look more closely and tell him that the feature is there. If the student thinks a feature is present that is not actually there, the system will tell the student that the feature is present on the incorrect ship but not on the correct ship.

E. STUDENT MODEL

The student model represents the student's knowledge of the problem, as perceived by the tutoring system. This representation is based on the student's responses to the questions asked by the system. The student model is only used at the conclusion of each user session, when the

system provides the student with a summary of his responses (Figure 4.5). This summary includes:

- names and number of ships identified on the first look
- names and number of ships identified on the second look
- names and number of ships identified on the third look
- names of ships that the student did not identify
- number of ships when the student appeared to guess the answer

There is no "grade" given; the information is provided to encourage the student to review areas of difficulty.

You identified 8 ship(s) on the first try. The ships(s) were: Jiangdong FF Jiang Hu I FF Kresta I CG Kresta II CG Grisha I/II/III FFL Kaman PTG Kara CG Kiev CVHG You identified 0 ship(s) on the second try. The ships(s) were: You identified 0 ship(s) on the third try. The ships(s) were: You did not identify the following ship(s): Jiang Hu II FF You appeared to guess on the first look at 0 ship(s).

Figure 4.5 Sample Summary Screen

F. USER INTERFACE

1. Input

A menu-based approach was used for user input to the tutor. The information contained in the menus is contained primarily in the file *tdescrip.ari*. The menu formats are contained in the file *tmenu.ari*.² Determination of the choice of menus to be used is made as part of the tutoring strategy in *tdriver.ari*.

The ship recognition tutor initially displays information concerning the tutoring system, the options available and reminders specific to the Prolog programming language. The user is next prompted for his experience level. The choices are Beginner, Intermediate and Expert; the system will use this information to determine if the user has responded to a query for the ship name with a guess. Following this information, the first menu appears (Figure 4.6) allowing the user to make one of four choices.

2. Menus are modifications of menu formats used in Ref. 12.

Ship Recognition Main Menu 1.Ship Recognition Test 2.Review a specific photo 3.View a summary 4.Quit Enter 1.,2.,3. or 4.

Figure 4.6 Main Menu

If the user chooses the first option the test begins. The user is presented with a menu of ships from which to choose (Figure 4.7) and is provided with a book of photos or line drawings to identify. The system asks the student to look at randomly chosen photos. Following each incorrect answer the user is presented with a review of the significant features. The questions are in either a yes/no format (Figure 4.8) or a list of feature descriptions (Figure 4.9). Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 3.Jiangdong FF 5.Jiang Hu II FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 9.Kara CG 11.Kirov CGN 13.Krivak II FFG 2.Kresta II CG 4.Jiang Hu I FF 6.Godavari FF 8.Kaman PTG 10.Kiev CVHG 12.Krivak I FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF

Select the name that matches the photo or "q" to quit.

Figure 4.7 Sample List of Ships

Is the foremast with the following description: large obelisk type foremast present on photo number 3.

Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no.

Figure 4.8 Sample Yes/No Question

Select the best description of the onboard helo structures. 1.hangar and pad aft 2.helo pad aft 3.raised helo pad aft

Make your selection.

Figure 4.9 Sample List of Feature Descriptions

If the user selects the second system option, in the tutor main menu, to review specific photos, he is asked

the number of the photo he wishes to review. The user then sees the key features for the ship he selected.

The third system option shows the user a summary of his latest ship recognition test. Section E of this chapter describes the user summary.

2. Error Checking

The system will check for input that does not conform to acceptable standards. For example, if there are fifteen ship choices in the menu, the system will not allow the user to select "16" as the answer. The user will be asked to select an answer within the correct range of choices.

V. Results

Our ship recognition tutor was tested on a database of 20 Soviet ships, with the capability to add more ships as required. Test runs were completed by five different intermediate and beginning students, for a total of 25 runs. The system requires 50K of disk space and 368K of RAM memory not counting the Prolog interpreter. The system response time to incorrect student answers is one to three seconds. Tutoring time ranges from five seconds for correct answers to four minutes for incorrect responses. Tutoring times vary based on the individual user.

Demonstrations of the ship recognition tutor are in Appendix A. Instructions as to how to add more ship data to the knowledge base is in Appendix B.

VI. CONCLUSION

A. ACHIEVEMENTS

We have shown that an ICAI system for tutoring ship recognition is possible. This fully computerized system provides many of the benefits of an instructor. It is a portable program that will run on any IBM-compatible microcomputer. The source code is easily adaptable to teach most ships. Portability is the main weakness of the GUIDON tutor discussed in Chapter II. An ICAI system allows the instructor more flexibility than flash card methods in providing the student a useful learning environment. The combination of these two features makes it a worthwhile addition to any fleet training program.

B. LIMITATIONS

The ship-recognition tutor uses visual features such as weaponry and structural characteristics referenced in several ship recognition texts. These features, while important to the overall identification of ships, may not be the features required for quick recognition. Most experts in this field recognize ships based on one or two main features. The inclusion of "extra" features may only add to the new student's confusion.

A second possible limitation concerns the program's level of instruction. This level may be most applicable to intermediate students. More experienced students may find the method of tutoring too basic and therefore irritating. Beginning students will not know how to proceed when shown a ship. Nonetheless, the recognition test can still provide a good idea of any student's level of knowledge.

C. RECOMMENDED SYSTEM ENHANCEMENTS

There are several areas that can be enhanced to improve the ship-recognition tutor. The first is to provide more detail on the features used to identify the ships, as well as memory mnemonics to help the student remember key features. A means of specifying the locations of these features, perhaps using screen graphics, would also be helpful.

Background information is another area for improvement. The ease of identifying ships in the real world can be greatly improved when information is included concerning (1) geographical location of the sighting, (2) previous ship sightings in the area and (3) intelligence data obtained concerning political activities at the time of sighting.

A third addition to the system might be to provide the ship silhouettes as graphics on the computer screen. A drawback to this addition would be to make the overall

system less portable. Not all microcomputers are capable of producing graphics that are clear enough to allow the user to discern fine details.

Another addition would be to increase the knowledge base. This system was developed as a prototype, and therefore contains a limited number of ships. The knowledge base is limited to Soviet warships. Additional ships from other countries along with merchant ships would provide a better balance for the student.

There are some improvements that can be made to the instructional strategies. The menus could be presented in a hidden multiple choice method, where the student is given a multiple choice menu one item at a time. Another improvement would be to consider previous sessions when preparing the tutoring session. This would provide the student with more practice on the ships which cause him the most difficulty.

Some interface considerations might be to provide more flexible entry methods. The use of a mouse would be easier than keyboard entry for menu selections. Creating natural language input capability would also be helpful.

APPENDIX A - DEMONSTRATION

	SSSSS		HH HH		ΙI	PPPPPPP	
	SS	SS	HH	HH	ΙI	PP	PP
	SS		HH	HH	ΙI	PP	PP
	SS		HH	HH	ΙI	PP	PP
	SSSSS		НННННННН		ΙI	PPPPPPP	
		SS	HH	HH	ΙI	PP	
		SS	HH	HH	ΙI	PP	
	SS	SS	HH	HH	ΙI	PP	
	SSSSS		HH	HH	ΙI	PP	
מכ				CCCC	0	CCCCC	000

RRRRRR		EEEEEEEE	CCCCCC		CCCCCC		000000	
RR	RR	EE	CC	CC	СС	CC	00	00
RR	RR	EE	CC	CC	CC	CC	00	00
RR	RR	EE	CC		CC		00	00
RRRRRR		EEEEEEE	CC		CC		00	00
RR	RR	EE	CC		CC		00	00
RR	RR	EE	CC	CC	СС	CC	00	00
RR	RR	EE	CC	CC	CC	CC	00	00
RR	RR EEEEEEEE		CCCCCC		CCCCCC		000000	

Strike a key when ready . . .

Ship recognition training is required for many Naval personnel. It is taught by Intelligence personnel using slides, flash cards and other drill methods.

This ship recognition tutor is designed to help you improve your proficiency in ship recognition. You will be provided with a list of ships from which to identify the photo specified. The method of tutoring is based on your level of experience. The system also provides you with a means of viewing a summary of your last session. You may also review specific photos.

PROLOG REMINDER:

ALL ENTRIES MUST BE FOLLOWED BY A PERIOD (".")

Level of experience

- 1. Beginner
- 2. Intermediate
- 3. Expert

4. Quit

Enter 1.,2.,3. or 4.1.

Please look at photo number 11 Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4.Jiang Hu I FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 8.Kaman PTG 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 10.Kiev CVHG 9.Kara CG 12.Krivak I FFG 11.Kirov CGN 14.Krivak III WPGF 13.Krivak II FFG 16.Kashin DDG 15.Slava 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 13. That answer is incorrect. The Krivak II FFG is not the correct ship. Select the best description of the gun mounts. 1.single mount 2.forward of superstructure, aft of deckhouse 3.gunmounts flat and square 4.gunmounts rounded with fence between 5.enclosed gunmount on bow 6.two enclosed gun mounts, fore and aft 7.two enclosed gun mounts forward 8.spheroid enclosed gun mount forward and aft Make your selection: 5. The gun description you chose: enclosed gunmount on bow is not present on a Krivak II FFG, but it is present on the correct ship. Type any letter to continue. c. Is the helo with the following description: hangar and pad aft present on photo number 11. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y.

Is the ssm with the following description: 4 SSM launchers on bow present on photo number 11. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. n. The ssm is present on the Krivak II FFG, but not on the correct ship. Type any letter to continue. c. You have identified the following features: fact(qun('enclosed gunmount on bow')). fact (helo ('hangar and pad aft')). Try again to identify photo number 11 Remember, it is not the Krivak II FFG Your ship choices are: 2.Kresta II CG 1.Kresta I CG 4. Jiang Hu I FF 3. Jiangdong FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 9.Kara CG 10.Kiev CVHG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 13.Krivak II FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 16.Kashin DDG 15.Slava 18.Yurka MSF 17.Sovremennyy DDG 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 14. Very good! You have chosen the correct ship. Photo number 11 is the Krivak III WPGF Here is a reminder of the key identifying features. mast 2 (two masts) masts (latticed) superstructure(superstructure with masts) stack(short, wide with lip on trailing edge) gun (enclosed gunmount on bow) helo(hangar and pad aft)

Type any letter to continue. c. Please look at photo number 20 Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 4. Jiang Hu I FF 3. Jiangdong FF 5.Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 10.Kiev CVHG 9.Kara CG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 13.Krivak II FFG 16.Kashin DDG 15.Slava 18.Yurka MSF 17.Sovremennyy DDG 20.Udaloy DDG 19.Kynda CG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 15. Very good! You have chosen the correct ship. Photo number 20 is the Slava Here is a reminder of the key identifying features. mast 2 (two masts) foremast(large pyramid mast structure) aftermast (smaller radar mast) stack(twin stacks amidship) radar (Top Dome on after deckhouse) helo(hangar and pad aft) missiles (16 SS-N-12 Sandbox missiles paired forward) Type any letter to continue. c.

Please look at photo number 9 Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4. Jiang Hu I FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 9.Kara CG 10.Kiev CVHG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 13.Krivak II FFG 15.Slava 16.Kashin DDG 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 7. Very good! You have chosen the correct ship. Photo number 9 is the Grisha I/II/III FFL Here is a reminder of the key identifying features. mast 1 (heavy pylon mast with latticed extensions) mast 1 loc(on top of the bridge) stack(located aft) rocket launcher (RBU launcher on a raised mid section) Type any letter to continue. c. Please look at photo number 6 Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4. Jiang Hu I FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 9.Kara CG 10.Kiev CVHG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 13.Krivak II FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 15.Slava 16.Kashin DDG 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG

Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 4. That answer is incorrect. The Jiang Hu I FF is not the correct ship. Is the mast 1 with the following description: latticed tripod mast present on photo number 6. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y. Is the stack with the following description: large, square present on photo number 6. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y. Is the ssm with the following description: twin launchers forward and aft of stack present on photo number 6. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y. Is the ssm 2 with the following description: a SSM 1 launcher forward present on photo number 6. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y. Is the bridge with the following description: forward placed present on photo number 6.

Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y.

Is the helo with the following description: helo pad aft present on photo number 6. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y. You have identified the following features: fact(mast 1('latticed tripod mast')). fact(stack('large, square')). fact (ssm ('twin launchers forward and aft of stack')). fact(ssm 2('a SSM 1 launcher forward')). fact (bridge ('forward placed')). fact (helo ('helo pad aft')). Try again to identify photo number 6 Remember, it is not the Jiang Hu I FF Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4. Jiang Hu I FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 10.Kiev CVHG 9.Kara CG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 13.Krivak II FFG 15.Slava 16.Kashin DDG 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 5. Very good! You have chosen the correct ship. Photo number 6 is the Jiang Hu II FF Here is a reminder of the key identifying features. mast 1 (latticed tripod mast) stack(large, square) ssm(twin launchers forward and aft of stack) ssm 2(a SSM 1 launcher forward) bridge(forward placed) helo(helo pad aft) Type any letter to continue. c.

Please look at photo number 7 Your ship choices are: 2.Kresta II CG 1.Kresta I CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4. Jiang Hu I FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 10.Kiev CVHG 9.Kara CG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 13.Krivak II FFG 16.Kashin DDG 15.Slava 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. 9. That answer is incorrect. The Kara CG is not the correct ship. Select the best description of the mast. 1.heavy pylon mast with latticed extensions 2.latticed tripod mast 3.large radome atop mast 4.large pyramid mast, supports TOP SAIL radar 5.large mack amidship with TOP SAIL radar 6.single oil derrick mast 7.latticed Make your selection: 3. The mast 1 description you chose: large radome atop mast is not present on a Kara CG, but it is present on the correct ship. Type any letter to continue. c.

Select the best description of the SSM launchers(s). 1.4 SSM launchers forward of the superstructure 2.twin launchers forward and aft of stack 3.located between superstructure and deckhouse 4.4 SSM launchers located on bow 5.canted launchers below bridge wings 6.horizontal launchers under bridge wings 7.two (HOT DOG PACKS), 1 forward, 1 aft Make your selection: 3. The ssm description you chose: located between superstructure and deckhouse is not present on a Kara CG, but it is present on the correct ship. Type any letter to continue. c. Is the gun with the following description: forward of superstructure present on photo number 7. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. n. The gun is present in the photo. Look carefully to identify it. This feature is not present on a Kara CG Type any letter to continue. c. Is the gun 2 with the following description: aft of deckhouse present on photo number 7. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y. Is the superstructure with the following description: enclosed, streamlined with separated deckhouse present on photo number 7. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. y.

Is the stack with the following description: large, square present on photo number 7. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. n. The stack is present on the Kara CG, but not on the correct ship. Type any letter to continue. c. Is the helo with the following description: helo pad aft present on photo number 7. Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. n. The helo is present on the Kara CG, but not on the correct ship. Type any letter to continue. c. You have identified the following features: fact(mast_1('large radome atop mast')). fact (ssm(') cated between superstructure and deckhouse')). fact(gun('forward of superstructure')). fact(gun 2('aft of deckhouse')). fact (superstructure ('enclosed, streamlined with separated deckhouse')). Try again to identify photo number 7 Remember, it is not the Kara CG Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4. Jiang Hu I FF 5.Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 9.Kara CG 10.Kiev CVHG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 13.Krivak II FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 16.Kashin DDG 15.Slava 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG

Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to guit or "h" for help. 8. Very good! You have chosen the correct ship. Photo number 7 is the Kaman PTG Here is a reminder of the key identifying features. mast 1 (large radome atop mast) qun (forward of superstructure) gun 2(aft of deckhouse) ssm (located between superstructure and deckhouse) superstructure (enclosed, streamlined with separated deckhouse) Type any letter to continue. c. Please look at photo number 8 Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 3. Jiangdong FF 4. Jiang Hu I FF 5. Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 9.Kara CG 10.Kiev CVHG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 13.Krivak II FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 15.Slava 16.Kashin DDG 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. h. The name of the correct ship is Kara CG This is a list of the descriptive features of a Kara CG: mast 1(large pyramid mast, supports TOP SAIL radar) stack(large, square) helo(helo pad aft) ssm(canted launchers below bridge wings)

Identify each feature in the photo. Remember the name of the ship is Kara CG Type any letter key to continue. c. Please look at photo number 1 Your ship choices are: 1.Kresta I CG 2.Kresta II CG 4.Jiang Hu I FF 3.Jiangdong FF 5.Jiang Hu II FF 6.Godavari FF 7.Grisha I/II/III FFL 8.Kaman PTG 9.Kara CG 10.Kiev CVHG 11.Kirov CGN 12.Krivak I FFG 14.Krivak III WPGF 13.Krivak II FFG 15.Slava 16.Kashin DDG 17.Sovremennyy DDG 18.Yurka MSF 19.Kynda CG 20.Udaloy DDG Select the name that matches the photo, "q" to quit or "h" for help. q. You identified 2 ship(s) on the first try. The ship(s) were: Slava Grisha I/II/III FFL You identified 3 ship(s) on the second try. The ship(s) were: Krivak III WPGF Jiang Hu II FF Kaman PTG You identified 0 ship(s) on the third try. The ship(s) were: You did not identify the following ship(s): Kara CG You appeared to guess on the first look at 1 ship(s). Type any letter key to continue. c. Please enter an 8 character filename for your summary. The filename must begin with a letter and contain only letters and numbers. Remember this filename to retrieve your summary at your next user session. mysum.

Your filename is mysum Your summary has been saved to the file mysum. Remember this filename to review this summary. Type any letter key to continue. c. Ship Recognition Main Menu 1. Ship recognition test 2. Review a specific photo 3. View a summary 4. Ouit Enter 1.,2.,3. or 4.2. Enter the number of the photo you wish to review followed by a period. 15. The name of the ship in photo number 15 is Sovremennyy DDG This is a list of the descriptive features of a Sovremennyy DDG: bridge(radome atop bridge) gun (spheroid enclosed gun mount foward and aft) ssm(canted launchers under bridge wings) stack(single stack amidship) helo (pad and telescoping hangar aft of stack) radar(air surveillance radar atop mack) Identify each feature in the photo.

Remember the name of the ship is Sovremennyy DDG

Type any letter key to continue. c.

Ship Recognition Main Menu 1. Ship recognition test 2. Review a specific photo 3. View a summary 4. Ouit Enter 1.,2.,3. or 4.3. What is the name of your summary file? mysum. You identified 2 ship(s) on the first try. The ship(s) were: Grisha I/II/III FFL Slava You identified 3 ship(s) on the second try. The ship(s) were: Krivak III WPGF Jiang Hu II FF Kaman PTG You identified 0 ship(s) on the third try. The ship(s) were: You did not identify the following ship(s): Kara CG You appeared to guess on the first look at 1 ship(s). Type any letter key to continue. c. Ship Recognition Main Menu 1. Ship recognition test 2. Review a specific photo 3. View a summary 4. Quit Enter 1.,2.,3. or 4.4.

APPENDIX B - USER'S MANUAL

A. USING THE PROGRAM

The ship recognition tutor is implemented in the Arity Prolog programming language. It requires approximately 50K of disk space and 512K of RAM memory. Once you have loaded Arity Prolog, and started the interpreter, you will be presented with a prompt:

2-

Type "[loadfile]." to begin. REMEMBER: PROLOG REQUIRES A PERIOD (".") FOLLOWING ALL INPUT.

?-[loadfile].

The tutoring system will take several minutes to load, please be patient. When the system responds with:

yes

?-

type "gotutor."

?-gotutor.

You will be presented with menus from this point. To quit the system you may type "q." at the ship choice menu or "4." at the main menu.

1. Prolog Reminders

- 1. All input must be followed by a period (".").
- Letter entries, such as "q" or "h", must be made in lower case.
- 3. Typing extra characters after the period and before the carriage return will cause the system to fail. No summary will be made and the program will halt. You may type "gotutor." at the ?prompt to restart the program.

B. MODIFICATIONS AND ADDITIONS

The expert module of the ship recognition tutor is easily modifiable, in order to add or delete ships, or to change identifying features of the ships already in the system. When modifying the system several things need to be kept in mind:

- 1. Before making any changes be sure to make backup copies of all files.
- Whenever a change is made to the ships.ari file, changes must also be made to the tdescrip.ari file and vice versa.
- 3. Descriptive features, ship names, and predicate names must match <u>exactly</u> whenever they are used.

The following is an example of the changes that need to

be made when adding a ship to the system:

1. Add a rule predicate:

rule(ship_id('Grisha I/II/III FFL'),
 [mast_1('heavy pylon mast with latticed
 extensions'),
 mast_1_loc('on top of the bridge'),
 stack('located aft'),
 rocket_launcher('RBU launcher on a raised mid
 section')]).

Use predicate names such as *stack*, which are already defined when possible. The same goes for feature descriptions such as, 'located aft'. Remember they should be character-for-character the same as they appear anywhere else in the program.

2. Add a ship photo comb predicate:

ship photo comb(9,'Grisha I/II/III FFL').

Be sure the photo number you assign is not already assigned and that the ship name is typed exactly as it appears in the *rule* predicate and the *ship_names* predicate. The numbers must be sequential.

 Add the name of the ship to the ship_names predicate. The ship name should be character-for-character the same as it appears elsewhere.

ship_names('Your ship choices are: ',
 ['Kresta I CG','Kresta II CG','Jiangdong FF',
 'Jiang Hu I FF','Jiang Hu II FF','Godavari FF',
 'Grisha I/II/III FFL','Kaman PTG','Kara CG',
 'Kiev CVHG','Kirov CGN','Krivak I FFG',
 'Krivak II FFG','Krivak III WPGF','Slava',
 'Kashin DDG','Sovremennyy DDG','Yurka MSF',
 'Kynda CG','Udaloy DDG']).

The order of the ship names, as they appear in this predicate, is the order of ship names in the choices menu.

 Increase the number of total photos in the predicate total_photos.

total_photos(20).

5. Modify or add a *descriptors* predicate for every

feature which is added in the rule predicate.

descriptors(stack, 'Select the best description of the stack structure.', ['located aft', 'large, square', 'short, wide with lip on trailing edge', '4 in symmetry to the mast, canted out', '4 stacks in pairs amidships', 'oval shaped stack (YURKED TO THE SIDE)', 'twin stacks amidship', 'single stack amidship']).

For example, the predicate *stack* was added in the *rule* predicate above and the description was *'located aft'*. The exact same descriptive phrase is added to the *descriptors* predicate for stack. If there is already a *descriptors* predicate which contains the correct phrase, no change needs to be made.

Steps 1-4 concern changes made to the file *ships.ari*, step 5 concerns changes made to the file *tdescrip.ari*.

APPENDIX C - SOURCE CODE

```
/* tdriver.ari */
```

This file contains the tutoring portion of the ship recognition tutor. It uses the files tmenu.ari, tdescrip.ari, ships.ari, utilities.ari and intro.ari. The file is loaded by loadfile.ari. Two executable files, summary.exe and getstime.exe, are also needed. They were created using Turbo Pascal.

No modifications to this file are necessary, in order to update or add to the database.

/* Initializing variables */

```
first_try(0,[]).
second_try(0,[]).
third_try(0,[]).
misses(0,[]).
num_guesses(0).
number_seen(0).
```

```
gotutor :-
    abolish(stop_marker,0),
    abolish(quit_system,0),
    intro_screen,
    shell(cls),
    experience_level,
    choose_option.
```

choose_option :- quit_system, !.
choose_option :- main_menu, start_tutor, choose_option.

```
/* Direct the system to the user chosen option. */
```

```
start tutor :- system option (photo review),
        shell(cls), blines(10),
        write ('Enter the number of the photo you wish to
            review '),
        write ('followed by a period. '),
        read(Number),
        ship photo comb (Number, Correct answer),
        rule(ship id(Correct answer), Correct answer list),
        shell(cls), blines(4),
        nl, write ('The name of the ship in photo number '),
        write(Number), write(' is '),
        write (Correct answer), nl, nl,
        write ('This is a list of the descriptive features
            of a '),
        write(Correct answer), write(':'), nl, nl,
        prettyprint1(Correct answer list), nl, nl,
        write ('Identify each feature in the photo.'), nl,
        nl, write ('Remember the name of the ship is '),
        write (Correct answer), nl, nl,
        write ('Type any letter key to continue. '),
        read(Anykey), nl, !.
start tutor :- system option(view summary),
        shell(summary), nl, nl, nl,
        write ('Type any letter key to continue. '),
        read(Anykey), nl, !.
start tutor :- system option(quit),
        assert (quit system).
/* Begin the ship recognition test. */
start test :- stop marker, conclusion, !.
start test :- number seen(Number),
        total photos(X),
        Number >= X, conclusion, !.
start test :-
        clear vars,
        shell(cls), blines(5),
        get photo num,
        photo num (Number),
        write ('Please look at photo number '),
        write(Number), nl,
        ship names (Header, Names),
        write(Header), nl,
        shipmenu(Names),nl, nl,
        write ('Select the name that matches the photo,'),
        write('"q" to quit or "h" for help. '),
        shell (getsthetime), consult (timefile), time (A, B),
        retract(time(A, B)),
```

```
ship ask which (Names), nl,
        shell(getsthetime), consult(timefile), time(C,D),
        retract(time(C,D)),
        timecomp(A, B, C, D, Total),
        assert(time to look(Total)),
        ship fact (Student answer),
        abolish(ship fact, 1),
        check answer (Student answer, Number),
        retract (number seen (N)),
        N1 is N + 1,
        assert (number seen (N1)),
        start test.
/* Randomly select the photos to be presented. */
initialize seed :- shell(getsthetime),
        consult (timefile), retract (time (A, B)),
        assert(seed(B)).
get photo num :-
        total photos(R),
        check number (R, N), !.
check number (R, N) :-
        not(viewed photo(N)),
        assert (viewed photo (N)),
        assert (photo num (N)), !.
check number(R,N) :-
        random(R,N1),
        check number(R,N1), !.
random(R,N) :-
        retract(seed(S)),
        N is (S \mod R) + 1,
        NewSeed is (25 * S + 1) \mod 1096,
        asserta(seed(NewSeed)), !.
/* Check the student's first answer and respond appropri-
ately. */
check answer('quit',Photo num) :- assert(stop marker), !.
check answer ('help', Photo num) :-
        ship photo comb (Photo num, Correct answer),
        rule(ship_id(Correct_answer), Correct_answer_list),
        shell(cls), blines(4),
        nl, write ('The name of the correct ship is '),
        write(Correct answer), nl, nl,
```

```
write ('This is a list of the descriptive features
            of a '),
        write(Correct answer), write(':'), nl, nl,
        prettyprint1(Correct answer list), nl, nl,
        write ('Identify each feature in the photo.'), nl,
        nl, write ('Remember the name of the ship is '),
        write (Correct answer), nl, nl,
        maintain score(4, Correct answer),
        write ('Type any letter key to continue. '),
        read(Anykey), nl, !.
check answer(Student answer, Photo num) :-
        ship photo comb (Photo num, Student answer),
        shell(cls), blines(4),
        write ('Very good! You have chosen the correct
            ship.'), nl, nl,
        write('Photo number '), write(Photo num),
        write(' is the '),
        write (Student answer), nl, nl,
        write ('Here is a reminder of the key identifying
            features.'), nl,
        nl, rule(ship id(Student answer),R),
        prettyprint1(\overline{R}), nl,
        numtries(X),
        maintain score(X,Student answer),
        write ('Type any letter to continue. '),
        read(Anykey), nl, nl, !.
/* Beginner guess */
check answer(Student answer, Photo num) :-
        user_level(beginner), time_to_look(X),
        X < \overline{3}0,
        ship photo comb (Photo num, Correct answer),
        maintain quesses,
        write ('That answer is incorrect.'), nl,
        write ('The '), write (Student answer),
        write (' is not the correct ship.'), nl, nl,
        rule(ship id(Correct answer), Correct answer list),
        compare (Correct answer list, [], Features not present,
                Features missed, Feature details diff), nl,
        nl,
        review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
           Student answer, Feature details diff,
           Features missed, Features not present), !.
```

/* Intermediate user guess */

```
check answer (Student answer, Photo num) :-
        user level (intermediate), time to look (X),
        X < \overline{10}
        ship photo comb (Photo num, Correct answer),
        maintain quesses,
        write('That answer is incorrect.'), nl,
        write('The '), write(Student answer),
        write (' is not the correct ship.'), nl, nl,
        rule(ship id(Correct answer), Correct answer list),
        compare (Correct answer list, [], Features not present,
                Features missed, Feature details diff), nl,
        nl,
        review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
           Student answer, Feature details diff,
           Features missed, Features not present), !.
/* Non-guess */
check answer(Student answer, Photo num) :-
        ship photo comb (Photo num, Correct answer),
        write ('That answer is incorrect.'), nl,
        write ('The '), write (Student answer),
        write(' is not the correct ship.'), nl, nl,
        rule(ship id(Student answer), Student answer list),
        rule(ship_id(Correct_answer),Correct_answer_list),
        compare (Correct answer list, Student answer list,
                Features not present, Features missed,
                Feature details diff),
        nl,nl,
        review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
           Student answer, Feature details diff,
           Features missed, Features not present), !.
/* Begin review of features after incorrect response */
review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
    Student answer, Feature details diff, Features missed,
    Features not present) :- stop review, !.
review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
    Student_answer, Feature_details_diff, Features missed,
    Features not present) :- stop marker, !.
review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
    Student_answer, Feature details diff, Features missed,
    Features not present) :-
        numtries(X), X<3,</pre>
        review diffs (Feature details diff, Student answer,
                Correct answer list), nl,
        review misses (Features missed, Student answer), nl,
```
```
review not present (Features not present,
            Student answer),
        ask ship (Correct answer, Student answer, New answer),
        rule(ship id(New answer), New answer list),
        compare (Correct answer list, New answer list,
            Features not present2, Features missed2,
            Feature details diff2),
        review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
            New answer, Feature details diff2,
            Features missed2, Features not present2), !.
review features (Correct answer, Correct answer list,
    Student answer, Feature details diff, Features missed,
    Features not present) :-
        still no answer (Correct answer, Correct answer list),
        nl, !.
review diffs([], Student answer, Correct answer list) :- !.
review diffs([Detail|Features], Student answer,
    Correct answer list) :-
        Detail =.. [Detail feature, Detail descrip],
        Check detail = .. [Detail feature, Other descrip],
        fact (Check detail),
        review diffs (Features, Student answer,
            Correct answer list), !.
review diffs([Detail|Features], Student answer,
    Correct_answer_list) :-
        Detail = .. [Detail feature, Detail descrip],
        Check detail = .. [Detail feature, Other descrip],
        incorrect fact (Check detail),
        review diffs (Features, Student answer,
            Correct answer list), !.
review diffs([Detail|Features], Student answer,
    Correct answer list) :-
        Detail = .. [Detail feature, Detail descrip],
        descriptors (Detail feature, Listheader, Descrip list),
        shell(cls), blines(5),
        write(Listheader), nl,
        writemenu (Descrip list), nl,
        write ('Make your selection: '),
        descrip_ask_which (Descrip list, Item),
        Selected item = .. [Detail feature, Item],
        member (Selected item, Correct answer list),
        assertz(fact(Selected item)),
        nl, write('The '), write(Detail feature),
        write (' description you chose: '), nl,
        write(Item), nl, write('is not present on a '),
        write(Student answer), write(', '), nl,
        write ('but it is present on the correct ship.'),
```

```
nl,
        nl, write ('Type any letter to continue. '),
        read(Anyletter),
        review diffs (Features, Student answer,
            Correct answer list), nl, !.
review diffs([Detail|Features], Student answer,
    Correct answer list) :-
        nl, write ('That is not the best description'), nl,
        review diffs([Detail|Features],Student answer,
                Correct answer list), nl, !.
review misses([],Student answer) :- !.
review misses([Detail|Features], Student answer) :-
        Detail =.. [Detail feature, Detail descrip],
        Check detail = .. [Detail feature, Other descrip],
        fact (Check detail),
        review misses (Features, Student answer), !.
review misses([Detail|Features],Student answer) :-
        Detail = .. [Detail feature, Detail descrip],
        Check detail = .. [Detail feature, Other descrip],
        incorrect fact (Check detail),
        review misses (Features, Student answer), !.
review misses([Detail|Features],Student answer) :-
        Detail =.. [Detail feature,Detail descrip],
        photo_num(Number), shell(cls), blines(5),
        write ('Is the '), write (Detail feature),
        write (' with the following description:'), nl,
        write (Detail descrip), nl,
        write ('present on photo number '), write (Number),
        write('.'), nl,
        nl, write('Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. '),
        read(Answer),
        interp miss answer (Answer, Detail feature,
           Student answer),
        assertz(fact(Detail)),
        review misses (Features, Student answer), nl, !.
interp miss answer (Answer, Detail feature, Student answer) :-
        name (Answer, [121]), nl, .
interp miss answer (Answer, Detail feature, Student answer) :-
        name (Answer, [110]),
        nl, nl, write('The '), write(Detail feature),
        write (' is present in the photo. Look carefully to
            identify it.'),
        nl, write ('This feature is not present on a '),
        write (Student answer),
```

nl, nl, write ('Type any letter to continue. '), read(Anyletter), nl, !. interp miss answer (Answer, Detail feature, Student answer) :nl, write ('Your input is not a "y" or a "n". Please reenter: '), read(New entry), interp miss answer (New entry, Detail feature, Student answer), !. review not present([], Student answer) :- !. review not present([Detail|Features], Student answer) :-Detail = .. [Detail feature, Detail descrip], Check detail = .. [Detail feature, Other descrip], fact (Check detail), review not present (Features, Student answer), !. review not present([Detail|Features], Student answer) :-Detail = .. [Detail feature, Detail descrip], Check detail = .. [Detail feature, Other descrip], incorrect fact (Check detail), review not present (Features, Student answer), !. review not present([Detail|Features], Student answer) :-Detail = .. [Detail feature, Detail descrip], photo num (Number), shell(cls), blines(5), write ('Is the '), write (Detail feature), write (' with the following description:'), nl, write(Detail descrip), nl, write ('present on photo number '), write (Number), write('.'), nl, nl, write ('Enter "y." for yes or "n." for no. '), read(Answer), interp not present answer (Answer, Detail feature, Student answer), assertz(incorrect fact(Detail)), review not present (Features, Student answer), nl, !. interp not present answer (Answer, Detail feature, Student answer) :name (Answer, [121]), nl, write('The '), write(Detail feature), write (' is not present in the photo. Please look more carefully.'), nl, nl, write('It is present on the '), write (Student answer), write('.'), nl, nl,

```
write ('Type any letter to continue. '),
        read(Anyletter), nl, !.
interp not present answer (Answer, Detail feature,
    Student answer) :-
        name (Answer, [110]),
        nl, write('The '), write(Detail feature),
        write(' is present on the '),
        write(Student answer),
        write(', but not on the correct ship.'),
        nl, nl, write ('Type any letter to continue. '),
        read(Anyletter), nl, !.
interp not present answer (Answer, Detail feature,
    Student answer) :-
        nl, write ('Your input is not a "y" or a "n".
                Please reenter: '),
        read(New entry),
        interp not present answer (New entry, Detail feature,
            Student answer), !.
/* Request user to try again to identify the correct
   ship. */
ask ship(Correct answer, Student answer, New answer) :-
        shell(cls), blines(5),
        write ('You have identified the following
            features:'), nl, nl,
        listing(fact), nl,
        photo num (Number),
        write ('Try again to identify photo number '),
        write(Number), nl,
        write ('Remember, it is not the '),
        write (Student answer), nl,
        ship names (Header, Names),
        write(Header), nl,
        shipmenu(Names),nl,
        write ('Select the name that matches the photo,'),
        write ('"q" to quit or "h" for help. '),
        ship ask which (Names), nl,
        ship fact (New answer),
        abolish(ship fact, 1),
        numtries(X),
        abolish (numtries, 1),
        X1 is X + 1,
        assert (numtries (X1)),
        check answer2 (New answer, Number), !.
```

/* Check users response for second and third tries at iden tification. */ check answer2('quit', Photo num) :- assert(stop marker), !. check answer2('help', Photo num) :ship photo comb (Photo num, Correct answer), rule(ship id(Correct answer), Correct answer list), shell(cls), blines(5), nl, write ('The name of the correct ship is '), write (Correct answer), nl, nl, write ('This is a list of the descriptive features of a'), write(Correct answer), write(':'), nl, nl, prettyprint1(Correct answer list), nl, nl, write('Identify each feature in the photo.'), nl, nl, write ('Remember the name of the ship is '), write (Correct answer), nl, nl, maintain score(4, Correct answer), write ('Type any letter key to continue. '), read(Anykey), assert(stop review), nl, !. check answer2 (New answer, Photo num) :ship photo comb (Photo num, New answer), shell(cls), blines(5), write ('Very good! You have chosen the correct ship.'), nl, nl, write ('Photo number '), write (Photo num), write(' is the '), write (New answer), nl, write ('Here is a reminder of the key identifying features.'), nl, nl, rule(ship id(New answer),R), prettyprint1(R), nl, numtries (\overline{X}) , maintain score(X,New answer), write ('Type any letter to continue. '), read(Anykey), nl, nl, assert(stop review), !. check answer2 (New answer, Photo num) :ship photo comb (Photo num, Correct answer), write ('That answer is incorrect.'), write(' The '), write(New_answer), write (' is not the correct ship.'), nl, !.

```
/* After third incorrect response. */
still no answer(Correct answer, Correct answer list) :-
         stop marker, !.
still no answer(Correct answer,Correct answer list) :-
         stop review, !.
still no answer(Correct answer,Correct answer list) :-
         shell(cls), blines(5),
         write ('The name of the correct ship is '),
         write(Correct answer), nl, nl,
         write ('This is a list of the descriptive features
             of a '),
        write(Correct answer), write(':'), nl, nl,
        prettyprint1(Correct answer list), nl, nl,
        write ('Identify each feature in the photo.'), nl,
        nl, write ('Remember the name of the ship is the '),
        write (Correct answer), nl, nl,
        maintain score(4, Correct answer),
        write ('Type "c." to continue. '),
        read(Anykey), nl, !.
/* Keep summary of student's responses. */
maintain score(X,Student answer) :-
        \overline{X} == 1,
        first try(N, Tries),
        N1 is N + 1,
        abolish(first try,2),
        append(Tries, [Student answer], Tries2),
        assert(first try(N1, Tries2)), !.
maintain score(X,Student answer) :-
        \overline{X} == 2,
        second try (N, Tries),
        N1 is \overline{N} + 1,
        abolish(second try,2),
        append(Tries, [Student answer], Tries2),
        assert (second try (N1, Tries2)), !.
maintain score(X,Student answer) :-
        \overline{X} == 3,
        third try(N, Tries),
        N1 is N + 1,
        abolish(third try,2),
        append (Tries, [Student answer], Tries2),
        assert (third try (N1, Tries2)), !.
```

```
maintain score(X,Student answer) :-
        misses(N, Tries),
        N1 is N + 1,
        abolish(misses,2),
        append (Tries, [Student answer], Tries2),
        assert (misses (N1, Tries2)), !.
maintain guesses :- num guesses(X),
        \overline{X}1 is X + 1,
        abolish (num guesses, 1),
        assert (num guesses (X1)), !.
maintain guesses :- !.
/* Final summary of student's responses. */
conclusion :- shell(cls), blines(4),
        first try(A, First tries), nl,
        write ('You identified '), write (A),
        write(' ship(s) on the first try.'),
write(' The ship(s) were:'), nl,
        print 3(First tries), nl,
        second try (B, Second tries),
        write('You identified '), write(B),
        write(' ship(s) on the second try.'),
        write(' The ship(s) were:'), nl,
        print 3 (Second tries), nl,
        third try (C, Third tries),
        write('You identified '), write(C),
        write (' ship(s) on the third try.'),
        write(' The ship(s) were:'), nl,
        print 3(Third tries), nl,
        misses(D, Missed ships),
        write ('You did not identify the following
             ship(s): '), nl,
        print 3 (Missed ships), nl,
        num guesses(G),
        write ('You appeared to guess on the first look
             at '),
        write(G), write(' ship(s).'), nl, nl,
        write ('Type any letter key to continue. '),
        read(Anykey), nl, nl,
        write to file, !.
/* Write student's summary to file. */
write to file :-
        shell(cls), blines(10),
        write ('Please enter an 8 character filename
             for your summary. '), nl,
```

```
write ('The filename must begin with a letter
    and contain only '), nl,
write ('letters and numbers. Remember this
    filename to '), nl,
write ('retrieve your summary at your next user
    session. '),
read(Filename),
nl, nl, write('Your filename is '),
write (Filename),
tell(Filename),
first try(A, First tries), nl,
write ('You identified '), write (A),
write(' ship(s) on the first try.'),
write(' The ship(s) were:'), nl,
print 3(First tries), nl,
second try (B, Second tries),
write ('You identified '), write (B),
write(' ship(s) on the second try.'),
write(' The ship(s) were:'), nl,
print 3(Second tries), nl,
third try (C, Third tries),
write('You identified '), write(C),
write (' ship(s) on the third try.'),
write(' The ship(s) were:'), nl,
print 3(Third tries), nl,
misses(D, Missed ships),
write ('You did not identify the following
    ship(s): '), nl,
print 3 (Missed ships), nl,
num guesses(G),
write ('You appeared to guess on the first
    look at '),
write(G), write(' ship(s).'), nl, nl, nl,
told, nl, nl, nl,
write ('Your summary has been saved to the file '),
write(Filename), write('.'), nl,
write ('Remember this filename to review this
    summary.'), nl, nl,
write ('Type any letter key to continue. '),
read(Anykey), nl, nl, !.
```

```
/* Clear memory for the next photo. */
```

```
clear_vars :-
    abolish(photo_num,1),
    abolish(ship_fact,1),
    abolish(fact,1),
    abolish(incorrect_fact,1),
    abolish(time_to_look,1),
    abolish(stop_review,0),
    abolish(fact,1),
    abolish(incorrect_fact,1),
    abolish(incorrect_fact,1),
    abolish(numtries,1),
    assert(numtries(1)), !.
```

/* Comparer.ari */

/* This program does the comparison between the two lists.
Three lists are generated consisting of features in the
first list which are not in the second, features in the
second list which are not in the first, and features whose
predicates are the same in both lists, but whose arguments
are different. */

/*Any duplicate items in the two lists are deleted from both prior to further comparisons.*/

compare (Answer, Student, Features_not_present, Features_missed, Feature_details_diff) :- delete_duplicates (Answer, Student, Answer2, Student2), compare2 (Answer2, Student2, Features_not_present, Features_missed, Feature_details_diff).

```
/* Delete_duplicates deletes duplicate terms from Answer
and Student. */
```

delete duplicates([],Student,[],Student).

delete_duplicates([A|Answer],Student,Answer3,Student3) : member(A,Student),
 delete(A,Student,Student2),
 delete_duplicates(Answer,Student2,Answer3,
 Student3),!.

delete_duplicates([A|Answer],Student,[A|Answer3],
 Student3) : delete_duplicates(Answer,Student,Answer3,
 Student3).

/* Base condition */

```
compare2([],[],[],[],[]).
```

/* Answer has more terms than the Student model. */

```
compare2([A|Answer],[],Features_not_present,
    [A|Features_missed],Feature_details_diff) :-
        compare2(Answer,[],Features_not_present,
        Features_missed,Feature_details_diff),!.
```

/* Student model has more terms than the Answer. */ compare2([],[S|Student],[S|Features not present], Features missed, Feature details diff) :compare2([], Student, Features not present, Features missed, Feature details diff), !. /* The Answer has terms with different arguments than the Student model. */ compare2 (Answer, Student, Features not present, Features missed, [S|Feature details diff]) :match terms (Answer, Student, A, S), delete (A, Answer, Answer2), delete(S,Student,Student2), compare2 (Answer2, Student2, Features not present, Features missed, Feature details diff), !. /* The Answer has terms not in the Student model, but the Student model is not empty. */ compare2 (Answer, Student, Features not present, [Term|Features missed], Feature details diff) :find a term (Answer, Student, Term), delete (Term, Answer, Answer2), compare2 (Answer2, Student, Features not present, Features missed, Feature details diff), !. /* The Student model has terms not in the Answer, but the Answer is not empty. */ compare2 (Answer, Student, [Term | Features not present], Features missed, Feature details diff) :find s term (Answer, Student, Term), delete (Term, Student, Student2), compare2 (Answer, Student2, Features not present, Features missed, Feature details diff), !. /* Match terms finds the terms in The Answer which match the terms in the Student model except that the arguments are different. It returns the terms that match. */ match_terms([A|Answer],Student,A,S) :- $A = \dots$ [Pred, TA], S = ... [Pred, TS],member(S, Student).

```
/* Find a term finds terms in Answer which are not in the
Student model. Used when Student model is not empty. Will
not find terms with mismatched arguments. */
/* Example: a predicate with no arguments */
find a term([Term|Answer],Student,Term) :-
            Term =.. [Pred],
S =.. [Pred],
            not(member(S,Student)).
/* Example: any one argument predicate */
find a term([Term|Answer],Student,Term) :-
            Term =.. [Pred, TA],
            S = ... [Pred, TS],
            not(member(S,Student)).
/* Find s term finds terms in the Student model which are
not in the Answer. Used when the Answer is not empty.
Will not find terms with mismatched arguments. */
find s term(Answer, [Term|Student], Term) :-
            Term =.. [Pred],
            A = \dots [Pred],
            not(member(A, Answer)).
find s term(Answer, [Term|Student], Term) :-
            Term =.. [Pred, TS],
            A = \dots [Pred, TA],
            not (member (A, Answer)).
```

```
/* tmenu.ari */
/* This file contains the menus for the tutor program */
writemenu([]) :- !.
writemenu (Descrip list) :- length (Descrip list, N),
        writemenu2 (Descrip list, N), !.
writemenu2([],N) :- !.
writemenu2([I|Descrip list2],N) :-
        length(Descrip list2,N2),
        N3 is N - N2,
        tab(3), bspace(N3),
        write(N3), write('.'),
        write(I), nl,
        writemenu2 (Descrip list2, N).
shipmenu([]) :- !.
shipmenu(Descrip list) :- length(Descrip list, N),
        shipmenu2(Descrip list,N), !.
shipmenu2([],N) :- !.
shipmenu2([I1|[]],N) :-
        length(Descrip list2,N2),
        N3 is N - N2,
        tab(3), bspace(N3),
        write(N3), write('.'),
        write(I1), nl,
        shipmenu2(Descrip_list2,N), !.
shipmenu2([I1,I2|Descrip list2],N) :-
        length(Descrip list2,N2),
        N4 is N - N2,
        N3 is N4 - 1,
        tab(3), bspace(N3),
        write(N3), write('.'),
        write(I1),
        name(I1,L), length(L,L1),
        Spaces is 25 - L1,
        tab(Spaces), bspace(N4),
        write(N4), write('.'),
        write(I2), nl,
        shipmenu2 (Descrip list2, N).
ship ask which (Names) :-
        read (Shipname), create ship fact (Shipname, Names),
        nl,nl.
```

```
create ship fact (Shipname, Names) :-
        name(Shipname, [113]), assert(ship fact('quit')), !.
create ship fact (Shipname, Names) :-
        name(Shipname, [104]), assert(ship fact('help')), !.
create ship fact (Shipname, Names) :-
        total photos(X),
        integer (Shipname),
        Shipname > 0,
        Shipname =< X_{i}
        item (Shipname, Names, I),
        assertz(ship fact(I)), !.
create ship fact (Shipname, Names) :- nl, nl,
        total photos(X),
        write ('Your input is not within the range of
            1 to '),
        write(X), write('.'), write(' Please reenter: '),
        read(New entry),
        create ship fact (New entry, Names), !.
descrip ask which (Descrip list, I) :-
        read (Description),
find description (Description, Descrip list, I).
find description(Description,Descrip list,I) :-
        length(Descrip list,N),
        integer (Description),
        Description > 0,
        Description = < N,
        item (Description, Descrip list, I), !.
find description (Description, Descrip list, I) :- nl, nl,
        length(Descrip list,N),
        write ('Your input is not within the range of
            1 to '),
        write(N), write('.'), write(' Please reenter: '),
        read (New entry), find description (New entry, De-
scrip list, I), !.
item(1, [X|L], X).
item(N, [X|L], I) := N > 1, N2 is N = 1, item(N2, L, I).
```

```
main menu :- abolish(system option,1),
         shell(cls),
         blines(10), tab(17),
         write ('Ship Recognition Main Menu'), nl, nl,
         tab(17), write(' 1. Ship recognition test'), nl,
tab(17), write(' 2. Review a specific photo'), nl,
         tab(17), write(' 3. View a summary'), nl,
         tab(17), write(' 4. Quit'), blines(3),
write('Enter 1.,2.,3. or 4.'),
         read (Choice), check entry (Choice, 4, main menu),
         assert option(Choice), blines(3).
assert option(1) :- assert(system option(test)).
assert option(2) :- assert(system option(photo review)).
assert option (3) :- assert (system option (view summary)).
assert option(4) :- assert(system option(quit)).
assert option().
experience level :- abolish(user level, 1),
         shell(cls),
         blines(10), tab(25),
         write('Level of experience'), nl, tab(25),
         write('-----'),
         nl, tab(25), write(' 1. Beginner'), nl,
         tab(25), write(' 2. Intermediate'), nl,
tab(25), write(' 3. Expert'), blines(3),
         write('Enter 1.,2., or 3.: '),
         read(Choice),
check entry (Choice, 3, experience level),
         assert level (Choice), blines (3).
assert level(1) :- assert(user level(beginner)).
assert level(2) :- assert(user level(intermediate)).
assert level (3) :- assert (user level (expert)).
assert level().
check entry (Choice, Num entries, Pred) :-
         Choice > 0,
         Choice =< Num entries, !.
check entry (Choice, Num entries, Pred) :- Pred, !.
```

/* ships.ari */ This file contains the database for the ship recognition tutor. All ships in the database are contained in the rule predicates. The ship names predicate is used by when creating the ship choices menu. When adding ships to the database tdescrip.ari must also be updated. Be sure to update the total photos, ship names and ship photo comb predicates also. /* Number of photos in the data base. */ total photos(20). /* Information for tmenu.ari, should exactly match the names in the predicate rule and ship phot comb. */ ship names ('Your ship choices are: ', ['Kresta I CG', 'Kresta II CG', 'Jiangdong FF', 'Jiang Hu I FF', 'Jiang Hu II FF', 'Godavari FF', 'Grisha I/II/III FFL','Kaman PTG','Kara CG', 'Kiev CVHG','Kirov CGN','Krivak I FFG', 'Krivak II FFG', 'Krivak III WPGF', 'Slava', 'Kashin DDG', 'Sovremennyy DDG', 'Yurka MSF', 'Kynda CG', 'Udaloy DDG']). /* Assigns photo numbers to ship names. Be sure to number photos correctly. */ ship photo comb(1,'Jiang Hu I FF'). ship_photo_comb(2,'Jiangdong FF').
ship_photo_comb(3,'Kresta I CG').
ship_photo_comb(4,'Kresta II CG'). ship photo comb(6, 'Jiang Hu II FF'). ship photo comb (5,'Godavari FF'). ship photo comb(9,'Grisha I/II/III FFL'). ship photo comb (7, 'Kaman PTG').

```
ship_photo_comb(8,'Kara CG').
ship_photo_comb(14,'Kiev CVHG').
ship_photo_comb(12,'Kirov CGN').
ship_photo_comb(13,'Krivak I FFG').
ship_photo_comb(10,'Krivak II FFG').
ship_photo_comb(11,'Krivak III WPGF').
ship_photo_comb(15,'Sovremennyy DDG').
ship_photo_comb(16,'Udaloy DDG').
ship_photo_comb(17,'Yurka MSF').
ship_photo_comb(18,'Kynda CG').
```

```
ship photo comb(19,'Kashin DDG').
ship photo comb(20,'Slava').
/* ships expert system */
rule(ship id('Godavari FF'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        foremast ('solid tower foremast'),
        mainmast('smaller pylon mainmast'),
        ssm('4 SSM launchers forward of the
            superstructure'),
        sam('single launcher'),
        helo('hanger and pad aft')]).
rule(ship id('Grisha I/II/III FFL'),
        [mast 1('heavy pylon mast with latticed
            extensions'),
        mast 1 loc('on top of the bridge'),
        stack('located aft'),
rocket launcher('RBU launcher on a raised mid
            section')]).
rule(ship id('Jiangdong FF'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        foremast('latticed tripod foremast'),
        foremast loc('abut the superstructure'),
        aftermast ('quadruped mast'),
        aftermast loc('atop the aft deckhouse'),
        sam('launcher forward of bridge'),
        sam 2 ('an identical pair of SAM launchers aft'),
        gun('single mount'),
        bridge ('globular fire control on top')]).
rule(ship_id('Jiang Hu I FF'),
        [mast 1('latticed tripod mast'),
        stack('large, square'),
        ssm('twin launchers forward and aft of stack'),
        bridge('forward placed')]).
rule(ship id('Jiang Hu II FF'),
        [mast 1('latticed tripod mast'),
        stack('large, square'),
        ssm('twin launchers forward and aft of stack'),
        ssm 2('a SSM 1 launcher forward'),
        bridge('forward placed'),
        helo('helo pad aft')]).
rule(ship id('Kaman PTG'),
        [mast 1('large radome atop mast'),
        gun ('forward of superstructure'),
        gun 2('aft of deckhouse'),
        ssm('located between superstructure and
            deckhouse'),
        superstructure ('enclosed, streamlined with separated
            deckhouse')]).
```

```
rule(ship id('Kara CG'),
        [mast 1('large pyramid mast, supports TOP SAIL
            radar'),
        stack('large, square'),
        helo('helo pad aft'),
        ssm('canted launchers below bridge wings')]).
rule(ship id('Kresta I CG'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        foremast('large obelisk type foremast'),
        aftermast ('smaller pyramid aftermast'),
        radar('air surveillance radar atop mack'),
        helo('hangar and pad aft'),
        ssm('horizontal launchers under bridge wings')]).
rule(ship id('Kresta II CG'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        foremast ('large obelisk type foremast'),
        aftermast ('smaller pyramid aftermast'),
        radar ('air surveillance radar atop mack'),
        top sail ('TOP SAIL radar'),
        helo('raised helo pad aft'),
        ssm('canted launchers below bridge wings')]).
rule(ship id('Kiev CVHG'),
        [fight deck('angled flight deck'),
        superstructure('tiered superstructure'),
        other features ('looks like cruiser in profile')]).
rule(ship id('Kirov CGN'),
        [mast 1('large mack amidship'),
        radar ('atop mack'),
        top sail ('TOP SAIL radar'),
        superstructure ('superstructure amidship with large
            mack'),
        forecastle ('long, slightly stepped, sharply raked
            bow')]).
rule(ship id('Krivak I FFG'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        masts('latticed'),
        superstructure ('superstructure with masts'),
        ssm('4 SSM launchers on bow'),
        stack('short, wide with lip on trailing edge'),
        gun('gunmounts flat and square')]).
rule(ship id('Krivak II FFG'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        masts('latticed'),
        superstructure ('superstructure with masts'),
        ssm('4 SSM launchers on bow'),
        stack ('short, wide with lip on trailing edge'),
        gun('gunmounts rounded with fence between')]).
rule(ship_id('Krivak III WPGF'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        masts('latticed'),
        superstructure ('superstructure with masts'),
```

```
stack('short, wide with lip on trailing edge'),
        qun ('enclosed gunmount on bow'),
        helo('hangar and pad aft')]).
rule(ship_id('Kashin DDG'),
        [mast 1('single oil derrick mast'),
        stack('4 in symmetry to the mast, canted out'),
        sam('2 SAM launchers, fore and aft'),
        qun('2 enclosed gun mounts, fore and aft')]).
rule(ship id('Kynda CG'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        masts ('pyramid masts'),
        ssm('two (HOT DOG PACKS), 1 forward, 1 aft'),
        other features ('mast-stack-mast-stack')]).
rule(ship id('Udaloy DDG'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        masts ('tripod mast preceeds each set of stacks'),
        stack('four stacks in pairs amidship'),
        helo('twin helo hangar and raised helo pad aft'),
        ssm('canted launchers below bridge wings'),
        qun('2 enclosed qun mounts forward')]).
rule(ship id('Yurka MSF'),
        [stack('oval shaped stack (YURKED TO THE SIDE)'),
        mast 1('latticed'),
        radar('fire control radar atop mack'),
        gun('gun mount forward and aft')]).
rule(ship id('Slava'),
        [mast 2('two masts'),
        foremast ('large pyramid mast structure'),
        aftermast ('smaller radar mast'),
        stack('twin stacks amidship'),
        radar ('Top Dome on after deckhouse'),
        helo('hangar and pad aft'),
missiles('16 SS-N-12 Sandbox missiles paired
            forward')]).
rule(ship id('Sovremennyy DDG'),
        [bridge('radome atop bridge'),
        gun ('spheroid enclosed gun mount foward and aft'),
        ssm('canted launchers under bridge wings'),
        stack('single stack amidship'),
        helo('pad and telescoping hangar aft of stack'),
        radar('air surveillance radar atop mack')]).
```

/* tdescrip.ari */ /* This file contains the descriptive information for each feature. The information exactly matches the features descriptions used in the rule(ship id) predicates. This file is used by to create the feature description menus.*/ /* When adding ships to the database be sure to update this file also. */ descriptors (mast 2, 'Does the ship have: ', ['two masts']). descriptors (masts, 'Select the best description of the masts. ', ['latticed', 'pyramid masts', 'tripod mast preceeds each set of stacks']). descriptors (foremast, 'Select the best description of the foremast.', ['solid tower foremast', 'latticed tripod foremast abuts superstructure', 'large obelisk type foremast', 'large pyramid mast structure']). descriptors (foremast loc, 'Does the foremast: ', ['abut the superstructure?']). descriptors (aftermast, 'Select the best description of the aftermast.', ['quadruped mast', 'smaller pyramid aftermast', 'smaller radar aftermast']). descriptors (aftermast loc, 'Is the aftermast located: ', ['atop the aft deckhouse']). descriptors (mainmast, 'Does the ship have a: ', ['smaller pylon mainmast']).

```
descriptors (mast 1,
        'Select the best description of the mast.',
        ['heavy pylon mast with latticed extensions',
        'latticed tripod mast',
        'large radome atop mast',
        'large pyramid mast, supports TOP SAIL radar',
        'large mack amidship with TOP SAIL radar',
        'single oil derrick mast',
        'latticed']).
descriptors (mast 1 loc,
        'Is the mast: ',
        ['on top of the bridge']).
descriptors (ssm,
        'Select the best description of the SSM
             launchers(s).',
        ['4 SSM launchers forward of the superstructure',
        'twin launchers forward and aft of stack',
        'located between superstructure and deckhouse',
        '4 SSM launchers located on bow',
        'canted launchers below bridge wings',
        'horizontal launchers under bridge wings',
        'two (HOT DOG PACKS), 1 forward, 1 aft']).
descriptors (ssm 2,
        'Is there: ',
        ['a SSM launcher forward']).
descriptors (sam,
        'Select the best description of the SAM
             launcher(s).',
        ['single launcher',
        'launcher forward of bridge, identical pair aft',
        'two SAM launchers, fore and aft']).
descriptors (sam 2,
        'Is there an: ',
        ['identical pair of SAM launchers aft']).
descriptors (rocket launcher,
        'Does the ship have a:',
        ['RBU launcher on a raised mid section']).
descriptors (missiles,
        'Does the ship have:',
        ['16 SS-N-12 Sandbox missiles paired forward']).
```

```
descriptors (gun,
        'Select the best description of the gun mounts.',
        ['single mount',
        'forward of superstructure, aft of deckhouse',
        'gunmounts flat and square',
        'gunmounts rounded with fence between',
        'enclosed gunmount on bow',
        'two enclosed gun mounts, fore and aft',
        'two enclosed gun mounts forward',
        'spheroid enclosed gun mount forward and aft']).
descriptors (qun 2,
        'Is there a second gun :',
        ['aft of deckhouse']).
descriptors (radar,
        'Select the best description of the radar
             features. ',
        ['air surveillance radar atop mack',
        'Top Dome on after deckhouse',
        'fire control radar atop mack']).
descriptors (top sail,
        'Does the ship have: ',
        ['TOP SAIL radar']).
descriptors (stack,
        'Select the best description of the stack
             structure.',
        ['located aft',
        'large, square',
        'short, wide with lip on trailing edge',
        '4 in symmetry to the mast, canted out',
        '4 stacks in pairs amidships',
        'oval shaped stack (YURKED TO THE SIDE)',
        'twin stacks amidship',
        'single stack amidship']).
descriptors (bridge,
        'Select the best description of the bridge
             structure.',
        ['qlobular fire control on top',
        'forward placed',
        'radome atop bridge']).
```

```
descriptors (superstructure,
        'Select the best description of the
             superstructure.',
        ['enclosed, streamlined with separated deckhouse',
        'tiered superstructure',
        'superstructure amidship with large mack',
        'superstructure with masts']).
descriptors (flight deck,
        'Does the ship have a:',
        ['angeled flight deck']).
descriptors (helo,
        'Select the best description of the onboard helo
             structures.',
        ['hangar and pad aft',
        'helo pad aft',
        'raised helo pad aft',
        'twin helo hangar and raised helo pad aft',
        'pad and telescoping hangar aft of stack']).
descriptors (forecastle,
        'Does the ship have a:',
        ['long, slightly stepped, sharply raked bow']).
descriptors (other features,
        'Some other features are:',
        ['looks like a cruiser in profile',
        'mast-stack-mast-stack']).
```

/* tintro.ari */

<pre>intro_screen :- shel write('</pre>	l(cls) SSSSS	, b] ;	lines(2) HH	, ta HH	ab(17 II), PPPPPP	P'),	nl,	
tab(17), write(' S	S	SS	нн	HH	II	PP	PP')	,	
nl, tab(17), write(' S	S		нн	HH	II	PP	PP′)	,	
nl, tab(17), write(' S	S		нн	нн	II	PP	PP')	,	
nl, tab(17), write('	SSSSS	5	нннннн	IHH	II	PPPPPP	P'),	nl,	
tab(17), write('		SS	нн	нн	тт	PP'),	nl.		
tab(17),		22	нн	нн			nl		
tab(17),	<u> </u>	22			<u> </u>		~1, ~1		
tab(17),	5	22	нн	нн	11	PP'),	11⊥,		
write(' blines(2), t	SSSSS ab(12)	5	НН	НН	II	PP'),	nl,		
write('RRRRR 000000(), pl, tab(12	RR	EEEE	EEEEE	CCC	CCCC	CCC	CCC		
write('RR	RR	ΕE		СС	СС	c cc	СС	00	
00'), MI, Cab(12), write('RR	RR	ΕE		СС	СС	c cc	СС	00	
00'), n1, tab(12), write('RR	RR	EE		СС		СС		00	
00'), nl, tab(12), write('RRRRR	RR	EEEE	EEEE	СС		СС		00	
00'), nl, tab(12), write('RR RR		EE		CC		CC		00	
00'), nl, tab(12),	ס			сс СС	00		~~~	00	
00'), nl, tab(12),	ĸ	<u> </u>		CC			CC	00	
write('RR 00'), nl, tab(12),	RR	EE		CC	CC	C CC	CC	00	
write('RR 000000'), nl,	RR	EEEE	EEEEE	CCC	CCC	CCC	CCC		
blines(2), s	hell(p	ause	2),						
write ('Ship recognition training is required for									
<pre>many Naval '), write('personnel. '), nl,</pre>									
<pre>write('It is taught by Intelligence personnel using</pre>									
<pre>write('flash cards '), nl, write('and other drill methods ')</pre>									
blines (3),									

```
write ('This ship recognition tutor is designed to
    help you '),
write('improve your '), nl,
write ('proficiency in ship recognition. You will
    be provided '),
write('with a '), nl,
write ('list of ships from which to identify the
    photo specified.'),
write(' The method'), nl,
write ('of tutoring is based on your level of
    experience. The '),
write('system also '), nl,
write ('provides you with a means of viewing a
    summary of your '),
write('last session. '), nl,
write ('You may also review specific photos.'),
blines(3),
write('PROLOG REMINDER: '), nl, nl,
write ('ALL ENTRIES MUST BE FOLLOWED BY A
    PERIOD (".")'),
blines(2), shell(pause).
```

```
/* loadfile.ari */
:- write('Please wait.'), nl.
:- nl.
:- [tdriver].
:- write('Still loading').
:- nl.
:- [tintro,tmenu].
:- write('Still loading').
:- nl.
:- [ships,tdescrip].
:- write('Still loading').
:- [utilities,comparer].
```

```
/* Arity utility predicates. */
abolish(F,A) :- functor(T,F,A), retractall(T).
retractall(X) :- retract(X), fail.
retractall(X) :- retract((X :- Y)), fail.
retractall().
length([],0).
length([X], 1).
length([X|L],N) := length(L,N1), N is N1 + 1.
append([],L,L).
append([X|L],L2,[X|L3]) :- append(L,L2,L3).
concatenate(S1,S2,S) := name(S1,AS1), name(S2,AS2),
        append(AS1,AS2,AS), name(S,AS).
blines(0) :- !.
blines(N) :- nl, N1 is N - 1, blines(N1).
bspace(X) := X < 10, write('').
bspace(X).
timecomp(A,B,C,D,Total) :-
       Min is C-A,
       Sec is D-B,
       Total is Min * 60 + Sec.
member (X, [X|L]).
member(X, [Y|L]) := member(X, L).
delete(X,[],[]).
delete (X, [X|L], M) := !, delete (X, L, M).
delete(X,[Y|L],[Y|M]) :- not X=Y, delete(X,L,M).
prettyprint([]).
prettyprint([Y|L]) :- prettyprint1(Y), prettyprint(L).
prettyprint1([]).
prettyprint1([X|L]) :- write(X), nl, prettyprint1(L).
```

```
print_3([]).
print_3([X,Y,Z|L]) :-
    write(X), name(X,X1), length(X1,A),
    A1 is 25 - A, tab(A1),
    write(Y), name(Y,Y1), length(Y1,B),
    B1 is 25 - B, tab(B1),
    write(Z), n1, print_3(L).
print_3([X,Y|[]]) :-
    write(X), name(X,X1), length(X1,A),
    A1 is 25 - A, tab(A1),
    write(Y), n1, print_3(L).
print_3([X|[]]) :-
    write(X), n1, print_3(L).
```

```
/* Pascal executable files */
Program Summary(input,output);
(* This program reads in the user session summary and
prints it to the screen. *)
type
   String80 = string[80];
   String25 = string[25];
var
   Line : String80;
   Filename : String25;
   Data : text;
begin
     Writeln('What is the name of your summary file?');
     Readln(Filename);
     Assign (Data, Filename);
     Reset (Data);
     While not EOF (Data) do
           begin
                 Readln (Data, Line);
                 Writeln(Line);
            end;
     Close (Data);
end.
program getstime(input,output);
uses dos;
var
   Hour, Min, Sec, Hun:word;
   data:text;
begin
     GetTime (Hour, Min, Sec, Hun);
     assign(data,'timefile.ari');
     reset(data);
     write(data,'time(');
     write(data,Min);
     write (data, ', ');
     write (data, Sec);
     write(data,')');
     close(data);
end.
```

LIST OF REFERENCES

- 1. Fundamentals of Naval Intelligence, pp.196-197, Naval Education and Training Command, 1975.
- COMPATWINGSPAC Recco Guide, Commander Patrol Wings Pacific, 1988.
- 3. Jane's Fighting Ships, Janes's Publishing Company, Limited, 1988.
- Polmar, Norman, Guide to the Soviet Navy, 4th ed., Naval Institute Press, 1986.
- 5. Zinn, K. L., "Computer-Assisted Learning and Teaching" in Encyclopedia of Computer Science and Engineering, 2nd ed., A. Ralston, pp.294-302, Van Nostrand Reinhold Co, 1983.
- 6. Wenger, E., Artificial Intelligence and Tutoring Systems, Morgan Kaufmann Publishers, 1987.
- 7. Barr, A. and Feigenbaum, E. A., *The Handbook of Artificial Intelligence*, v.2, William Kaufmann, 1982.
- Woolf, B. and Cunningham, P. A., "Multiple Knowledge Sources in Intelligent Teaching Systems," *IEEE Expert*, pp. 41-54, Summer 1987.
- Kearsley, G. P., Artificial Intelligence & Instruction: Applications and Methods, Addison-Wesley, 1987.
- Kennedy, William V., and others, Intelligence Warfare, Crescent Books, 1983.
- Campbell, D. F., An Intelligent Computer-Assisted Instruction System For Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation, Master's Thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, California, June 1988.

INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST

		No.	Copies
1.	Defense Technical Information Center Cameron Station Alexandria, Virginia 22304-6145		2
2.	Library, Code 0142 Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California 93943-5002		2
3.	Chief of Naval Operations Director, Information Systems (OP-945) Navy Department Washington, DC 20350-2000		1
4.	Department Chairman, Code 52 Department of Computer Science Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California 93943-5000		2
5.	Curriculum Officer, Code 37 Computer Technology Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California 93943-5000		1
6.	Associate Professor Neil C. Rowe Code 52Rp Computer Science Department Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California 93943-5000		1
7.	Professor Timothy J. Shimeall, Code 52Sm Computer Science Department Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California 93943-5000		1
8.	Commanding Officer Naval Research Laboratory Washington, DC 20375		1
9.	Chief of Naval Education and Training Naval Air Station Pensacola Pensacola, Florida 32508		1

- 10. Dr. Hank Smith Education Coordinator Patrol Squadron THIRTY-ONE Naval Air Station Moffett Field, California 94035
- 11. Tactical Training Team Patrol Squadron THIRTY-ONE Naval Air Station Moffett Field, California 94035
- 12. CPT Michael J. Bizer 1204 Catskill Circle Huntsville, Alabama 35802

1

1

1

13. LT Denise R. Bernier 2 1908 Azalea Street Denton, Texas 76205

DURLY KHOX LIERARY NAVAL FOSTIMADUATE SCHOOL MONTEREY, CALIFORNIA 93945-6002

6





L			
P		77	
6		,	
		4	




