Journal of the MARINE BIOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION of the United Kingdom



Identifying key habitat and seasonal patterns of a critically endangered population of killer whales

Journal:	Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom		
Manuscript ID:	JMBA-12-12-SI-0444.R1		
Manuscript Type:	Special Issue Article		
Date Submitted by the Author:	13-Jun-2013		
Complete List of Authors:	Esteban, Ruth; CIRCE, Conservation Information and Research on Cetaceans Verborgh, Philippe; CIRCE, Conservation Information and Research on Cetaceans Gauffier, Pauline; CIRCE, Conservation Information and Research on Cetaceans Giménez, Joan; GEMA, Grupo de Ecología Marina Aplicada, Estación Biológica de Doñana, CSIC Afan, Isabel; LAR, Laboratorio de SIG y Teledetección, Estación Biológica de Doñana, CSIC García, Pedro; ANSE, Asociación de Naturalistas del Sureste Murcia, Jose Luis; ANSE, Asociación de Naturalistas del Sureste Magalhães, Sara; Mar Ilimitado, Andreu, Ezequiel; TURMARES, Turísmo Maritimo del Estrecho de Stephanis, Renaud; GEMA, Grupo de Ecología Marina Aplicada, Estación Biológica de Doñana, CSIC		
Keywords:	Killer whale, Orcinus orca, distribution, spatial modelling, GAM, cetacean, Strait of Gibraltar, Southern Iberian Peninsula		
Abstract:	Killer whales have been described in the Gulf of Cadiz, southern Spain, in spring and in the Strait of Gibraltar in summer. A total of 11,276 cetaceans sightings coming from different sources (dedicated research surveys, whale watching companies and opportunistic observations) were used to create two presence-"pseudo-absence" predictive generalised additive models (GAM), where presence data were defined as sightings of killer whales and "pseudo-absence" data as sightings of other cetacean species. One model was created using spring data when killer whales' main prey, Atlantic bluefin tuna, enters the Mediterranean Sea and the other model used summer data when Atlantic bluefin tuna returns to the Atlantic Ocean. Both model predictions show that killer whales are highly associated with a probable distribution of bluefin tuna during their migration throughout the		

study area, constraining their distribution to the Gulf of Cadiz in spring and the Strait of Gibraltar in spring and summer. Knowledge of the distribution of killer whales in the study area is essential to establish conservation measures for this population. Abstract.doc

SCHOLARONE[™]

- 1 Running Head: Habitat of killer whales in the southern Iberian Peninsula
- Identifying key habitat and seasonal patterns of a critically 2
- endangered population of killer whales 3
- 4
- Ruth Esteban¹, Philippe Verborgh¹, Pauline Gauffier¹, Joan Giménez², Isabel Afán³, 5
- Ana Cañadas⁴, Pedro García⁵, Jose Luis Murcia⁵, Sara Magalhães⁶, Ezequiel Andreu⁷, 6 Renaud de Stephanis² 7
- 8
- ¹CIRCE, Conservation Information and Research on Cetaceans, C/ Cabeza de 9 Manzaneda 3, Algeciras-Pelayo, 11390 Cadiz, Spain. 10
- ²GEMA, Grupo de Ecología Marina Aplicada, Estación Biológica de Doñana, CSIC. C/ 11
- 12 Americo Vespucio, s/n, 41092, Isla de la Cartuja, Sevilla, Spain.
- ³LAST, Laboratorio de SIG y Teledetección, Estación Biológica de Doñana, CSIC. C/ 13 Americo Vespucio, s/n, 41092, Isla de la Cartuja, Sevilla, Spain 14
- ⁴Alnilam Research and Conservation, Cándamo 15 116. 28240 Hoyo de 16 Manzanares, Madrid, Spain.
- ⁵ANSE Asociación de Naturalistas del Sureste Plaza Pintor José María Párraga, 11. 17
- 18 Bajo, 30002, Murcia.
- 19 ⁶MAR ILIMITADO Porto da Baleeira de Sagres, 8650-368 Sagres, Portugal
- ⁷TURMARES (Turísmo Maritimo del Estrecho), Avd/ Alcalde Juan Nuñez 3, 11380 20
- Tarifa, Cadiz. Spain 21
- 22
- Corresponding author: R. Esteban 23
- 24 E-mail: ruth@circe.info
- 25

26 ABSTRACT

27 Killer whales have been described in the Gulf of Cadiz, southern Spain, in spring and in the Strait of Gibraltar in summer. A total of 11,276 cetaceans sightings coming from 28 29 different sources (dedicated research surveys, whale watching companies and 30 opportunistic observations) were used to create two presence-"pseudo-absence" 31 predictive generalised additive models (GAM), where presence data were defined as 32 sightings of killer whales and "pseudo-absence" data as sightings of other cetacean 33 species. One model was created using spring data when killer whales' main prey, 34 Atlantic bluefin tuna, enters the Mediterranean Sea and the other model used summer 35 data when Atlantic bluefin tuna returns to the Atlantic Ocean. Both model predictions 36 show that killer whales are highly associated with a probable distribution of bluefin 37 tuna during their migration throughout the study area, constraining their distribution to 38 the Gulf of Cadiz in spring and the Strait of Gibraltar in spring and summer. 39 Knowledge of the distribution of killer whales in the study area is essential to establish 40 conservation measures for this population.

41

42 Keywords: killer whale, Orcinus orca, distribution, spatial modelling, GAM, cetacean, Strait of

- 43 Gibraltar, Southern Iberian Peninsula
- 44

45 INTRODUCTION

46

47 Modelling species distribution is a valuable tool of biological conservation efforts, 48 especially predictive models of marine predators due to the logistical difficulties of 49 monitoring their distributions at sea. For instance, managers of whale and dolphin 50 populations can benefit from accurate model-derived predictions of cetacean habitat to 51 mitigate anthropogenic effects, such as fisheries by-catch (Torres et al., 2003) the 52 impacts of habitat alterations on ecosystem function (Baumgartner & Mullin, 2001; 53 D'Amico et al., 2003), in order to protect critical habitat (Hooker et al. 1999; Cañadas 54 et al. 2005; Gregr & Trites 2011) and understand the ecology of these animals 55 (Hamazaki, 2002). By assuming that the distribution of cetaceans is non-random 56 relative to environmental variability, predictive models of cetacean distribution typically 57 identify the ecological relationships between the environment and species habitat 58 selection.

59 Killer whales, Orcinus orca (Linnaeus, 1758) have a widespread distribution throughout 60 the world's oceans and seas, from polar waters to the equator (Leatherwood & Dalheim, 61 1978; Heyning & Dahlheim, 1988; Forney & Wade, 2007). They are known to be 62 common in many coastal areas, particularly at high latitudes, probably due to higher 63 ocean productivity (Forney & Wade, 2007), but they also occur in offshore and tropical 64 waters (Leatherwood & Dalheim, 1978; Forney & Wade, 2007). Killer whales are 65 known to present seasonal movement patterns, often associated with increased prey 66 availability in the Northeast Pacific (Braham & Dahlheim, 1982; Baird & Dill, 1995), 67 North Atlantic (Sigurjónsson & Leatherwood, 1988) and South Atlantic (Iñiguez, 2001). 68 In the Atlantic, they are common around the northern part of the British Isles, along the 69 Norwegian coast and throughout the eastern North Atlantic. They occasionally enter the North Sea and Skagerrak Strait (Reid *et al.*, 2003). Killer whales are regularly seen in
the Strait of Gibraltar and adjacent Atlantic waters (Horozco, 1598; Aloncle, 1964a;
Casinos & Vericad, 1976; Bayed & Beaubrun, 1987; Guinet *et al.*, 2007; de Stephanis *et al.*, 2008; Esteban, 2008; Foote *et al.*, 2011). Conversely, killer whales are considered
as a rare species in the Mediterranean Sea (Casinos & Vericad, 1976; Raga *et al.*, 1985;
Bayed & Beaubrun, 1987; Notarbartolo di Sciara, 1987; Notarbartolo di Sciara &
Birkun, 2010).

77 In Southern Spain, killer whales are observed in spring in the Gulf of Cadiz (Guinet et 78 al., 2007; García-Tiscar, 2009), when their main prey, Atlantic bluefin tuna (hereafter 79 ABFT) (Thunnus thynnus), enters the Mediterranean Sea (Cetti, 1777; Sella, 1929; 80 Rodríguez-Roda, 1964) and in summer associated with the ABFT long-line fishery of the Strait of Gibraltar, (Srour, 1994; de la Serna et al., 2004) when ABFT return from 81 82 their spawning areas on their way back to the Atlantic Ocean (Lozano, 1958; 83 Rodríguez-Roda, 1964; Aloncle, 1964b; de Stephan et al., 2008). These killer whales 84 belong to the same population as killer whales sampled in the Canary islands, and are 85 significantly different from other populations in the northeast Atlantic (North Sea, 86 Iceland and Norway) (Foote et al., 2011). Additionally, differences in carbon and 87 nitrogen stable isotopes ratios (García-Tiscar, 2009) and parasite load (Mackenzie, 88 1999; Dwyer & Visser, 2011) among pods from the "Strait of Gibraltar-Canary Island 89 population" suggest that it is a non-cohesive population that may not follows the same 90 resource all year round.

Due to their small population size, the killer whales of the Strait of Gibraltar and
contiguous waters have been recommended to be included in the "Critically
Endangered" category by ACCOBAMS-IUCN (Cañadas & de Stephanis, 2006).
Likewise, the International Whaling Commission has recommended to implement a

Cambridge University Press

95 conservation plan for this subpopulation as soon as possible (IWC 2007) and since 96 2011, the Spanish Ministry of Environment considers the killer whales of the Strait of 97 Gibraltar and the Gulf of Cadiz as "Vulnerable" in the Spanish Catalogue of 98 Endangered Species. Both local (Andalusia) and Spanish authorities have recommended 99 studying the spatial distribution of the species in southern Spain, to delineate it, and the 90 boundaries to be managed for a correct implementation of the conservation plan.

101 A great effort has been done to describe the distribution of marine mammals in the 102 Alboran Sea and Strait of Gibraltar (Cañadas et al., 2005; Cañadas & de Stephanis, 103 2006; Cañadas & Hammond, 2006; Guinet et al., 2007; de Stephanis, et al., 2008a, b; 104 Verborgh et al., 2009; Foote et al., 2011), but little is known about the distribution of 105 killer whales in the whole study area, as only one publication describes the summer 106 distribution in the central area of the Strait of Gibraltar (de Stephanis et al 2008a), and 107 no information is available for the rest of the Alboran Sea or the Gulf of Cadiz. This 108 study aims to understand the spatial distribution of killer whales in the southern Iberian 109 Peninsula in relation to different environmental variables, both in spring and summer, 110 from data series compiled from research, whale watching vessels and opportunistic data. 111

112 MATERIALS AND METHODS

113

114 *Study Area*115

116 The present study was carried out in the Gulf of Cadiz, Strait of Gibraltar and the 117 Alboran Sea (Figure 1). It is comprised between 0°30' East and 9°30' West and between 118 37°30' and 35° North, and is bounded to the North by the Iberian Peninsula and to the 119 south by Africa. These areas display different bathymetric features. The Gulf of Cadiz 120 has a wide, smooth shelf and slope. In contrast, the northern shelf of the Alboran Sea is very narrow, but has a very steep shelf and slope gradient. The Gulf of Cadiz, located in 121 122 the eastern sector of the central North Atlantic, is concave in shape, with a NW-SE orientation (Malod, 1982; Roberts, 1970). The physiographic profile of the margin 123 124 includes a wide shelf (30-40 km) with a sea-floor slope of 0.2-0.32°, a shelf-break 125 located at a water depth of between 140 and 120 m, and a smooth continental slope, 126 with sea-floor gradients of 1.5° in the upper part and $0.5-1^{\circ}$ in the middle and lower 127 parts (Baraza *et al.*, 1999). The Strait of Gibraltar has a length of 60 km (on an east-west 128 axis), and a mean width of 20 km. The shallowest depth, less than 300 m, is found in the 129 main sill of Camarinal and its minimum width of around 14 km coincides with the 130 contraction of Tarifa narrow. The bathymetry of the Strait is characterised by a west to east canyon, with shallower waters (200 to 300 m) found on the Atlantic side and 131 132 deeper waters (800 to 1000 m) on the Mediterranean side. On the eastern side of the Strait of Gibraltar lies the Alboran Sea basin, at the western edge of the Mediterranean 133 134 Sea. It is arc-shaped, and characterised generally by a complex physiography related to 135 its tectonic history. The Spanish margin has a very narrow, steep shelf (5-10 km) up to 136 the shelf-break at 110–120 m water depth, which establishes the boundary, with a shelf gradient of 0.5–0.7° and a slope of 2.3° (Ercilla *et al*, 1992; Hernández-Molina, 1993;

138 Hernández-Molina et al., 1994).

139

140 Data Collection

141

Sightings from cetaceans collected between 2002 and 2012 in waters of the southern 142 143 Iberian Peninsula were compiled. The datasets were separated in two data sets as killer 144 whales have been described in different areas during different seasons: shallow waters 145 in the Gulf of Cadiz in spring (April-June) (Guinet et al., 2007), and in the central 146 waters of the Strait of Gibraltar in summer (July-September) (de Stephanis et al., 147 2008a). We have also based this separation on the migration pattern of their main prey, bluefin tuna (Cetti, 1777; Sella, 1929; Rodríguez-Roda, 1964). Insufficient data were 148 149 available to make robust spatial models for the rest of the year. A total of 11,276 150 records of cetaceans were available for this analysis coming from: (1) random transect 151 sightings from a research boat performed by the NGO ANSE (Asociación de Naturalistas del Sureste) in the Murcia region; (2) sightings collected by Alnitak since 152 153 2002, a research NGO which performed random transect throughout the Alboran Sea 154 (Cañadas et al., 2005); (3) sightings collected by Alnilam since 2010, a research 155 company which performed random transect throughout the Alboran Sea; (4) sightings of 156 CIRCE (Conservation, Information and Research on Cetaceans) since 2002, a research 157 NGO that made random and line transect throughout the Strait of Gibraltar and Gulf of 158 Cadiz (de Stephanis et al., 2008); (5) sightings of TURMARES (Turismo Marítimo del Estrecho) since 2003, a whale watching company based in the Strait of Gibraltar; (6) 159 160 sightings from Mar Ilimitado (Tourism and Research) since 2005, a whale watching and 161 research company and based in southern Portugal; (7) sightings from Consejería de Medio Ambiente de la Junta de Andalucía, a governmental institution of the local 162

163 council of Andalucía since 2005, that performs random and line transect by boat and
164 airplane throughout the entire Andalusian region, (8) sightings collected by the EBD165 CSIC (Estación Biológica de Doñana - Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas)
166 since 2011, from a small research boat doing line transects in the Gulf of Cádiz and (9)
167 opportunistic data.

168

170

169 Environmental explicative models

171 Habitat preferences of killer whales within the study area were investigated. The 172 relationships between the spatial occurrence of the whales, and environmental variables 173 were assessed using generalised additive modelling (GAM) techniques (Hastie & 174 Tibshirani, 1990). The open-source statistical programming language R version 2.6.2 175 (http://cran.r-project.org/), and the MGCV library within R were used (Wood, 2001). 176 Given that data were coming from different sources, types of effort are difficult to 177 compare, and therefore a model based on presence and "pseudo-absence" was used. A 178 GAM with a tweedie distribution and logit link function was used. The parameter p 179 chosen for the Tweedie distribution, through inspection of GCV (Generalised Cross Validation score, an approximation to AIC, Wood 2000), was 1.1, very close to a 180 181 Poisson distribution but with some over-dispersion. The model used a gamma=1.4, as 182 recommended by Wood (2006), to prevent overfitting.

All the cetaceans' sightings were used as "sampling stations". The presence dataset included sightings of killer whales obtained by the different platforms. We used all the other cetacean species in the study area as "pseudo-absences". In these locations, we assumed that an observer was effectively searching whales as other species were sighted, however killer whales were not detected. The general structure of the model was:

189
$$E(p_i) = \exp\left[\theta_0 + \sum_k f_k(z_{ik})\right].$$

Where p_i is the probability to find killer whales, in the ith sampling station, θ_0 is the 190 intercept, f_k are smoothed functions of the explanatory covariates, and z_{ik} is the value of 191 the k^{th} explanatory covariate in the i^{th} sampling station. The environmental variables 192 193 used in this study were depth, obtained from ETOPO2 (Amante & Eakins, 2009), its 194 derivate slope and aspect (obtained with the R library SDMtools (VanDerWal et al., 195 2010), sea surface temperature (SST) and chlorophyll a concentration (Chla) obtained 196 from satellite images of MODIS (Carder et al., 2003). Spatial (geographic) covariates, 197 i.e. latitude and longitude, were also used as potential proxies for other unavailable or 198 unknown features affecting whales' distribution. Model selection was done using three 199 diagnostic indicators: (a) the GCV (Generalised Cross Validation score, an 200 approximation to AIC); (b) the percentage of deviance explained; and (c) the probability 201 that each variable was included in the model by chance. The decision to include/drop a 202 term from the model was adopted following the criteria proposed by Wood (2001).

203

205

204 Environmental predictive models

The best GAM models were used to generate predicted probability values of presence and pseudo-absence on a grid of 2x2km in the study area, which were plotted using ArcMap 10.0. In order to obtain the 95% confidence interval of the predictions, 1000 bootstraps with replacement were run for each model, and a prediction was obtained for each bootstrap iteration. The 95% confidence intervals were obtained from the bootstrap process of the models predictions of killer whales in the study area and were also plotted in to assess the precision of the predictions in every point of the study area.

213

215

²¹⁴ RESULTS

216 Between 2002 and 2012, 322 sightings of killer whales and 10,952 sightings of other 217 cetaceans were recorded in the study area. We created two models for the presence of killer whales in the area (spring and summer). A total of 44 sightings of killer whales 218 219 and 3746 of other cetaceans were recorded in spring. During this season the best model 220 included two covariates (see Table 1): depth and longitude, both highly significant, and 221 explaining 50.4% of the deviance. Killer whales presence was expected between 0 and 222 950 meters depth showing a linear increasing pattern towards shallower waters and 223 between 8.5° and 4° longitude West (see Figure 2) with an equally higher presence for 224 this longitude range and a decrease for the rest of the area, with a higher coefficient of variation (see Figure 4). 225

In summer 278 sightings of killer whales and 7206 of other cetaceans were recorded.
The best model included three covariates: depth, longitude and sea surface temperature,
all of them significant and explaining in total 49.60% of the deviance. Presence
probability was higher at 0-950 meters depth, between 8.5° and 4° longitude West and at
19-24°C sea surface temperature (see Figure 3).

The spring model prediction map shows two important areas for the presence of killer whales, one in the eastern part of the Gulf of Cadiz in shallow Spanish and Moroccan waters and another one in the South of Portugal (Figure 4). While the variance is very low for the Gulf of Cadiz, it is high in South of Portugal (Figure 4).

The summer model prediction map shows a high presence only in the western-central

part of the Strait of Gibraltar (Figure 5), with little variance in the prediction (Figure 5).

237

238 DISCUSSION

239

This study highlights the importance of collaborative datasets to understand the 240 241 distribution of animals with low encounter rates. The kind of datasets we have used are 242 statistically difficult to deal with, due to the differences in surveying conditions, but 243 these data are of great importance to understand which environmental variables are 244 responsible for the spatial distribution of this species. Here we have solved the 245 heterogeneity of effort from different datasets, by using other cetacean species presence 246 as a proxy for killer whales absence. Recent studies have highlighted several methods 247 for selection of pseudo-absence including: random (Stockwell, 1999); random with geographic-weighted exclusion (Hirzel, Helfer, & Metral, 2001), random with 248 249 environmentally weighted exclusion (Zaniewski et al., 2002) and locations that have 250 been visited (i.e., occurrences for other species, like in our case) but where the target 251 species was not recorded (Elith & Leathwick, 2007). The benefits of each technique 252 have been discussed previously (Lütolf et al., 2006; Phillips & Dudík, 2008), and are 253 out of the scope of this study. Although the chosen approach is not ideal, in our opinion 254 it is suitable due to the high amount of sightings of other cetacean species in the study area, and the non-availability of homogenous effort. 255

We have demonstrated clear and predictable influences of environmental and geographical factors on the distribution of killer whales in this region. The results support previous studies showing that killer whales are encountered in shallow waters of the south-western part of the Strait of Gibraltar in summer (de Stephanis *et al.*, 2008). The distribution pattern of the species seems to be closely linked to the bathymetric structure within the area. Previous studies have shown that water depth can be a significant factor in determining the distribution of marine top predators e.g. (Selzer & Payne, 1988; de Stephanis *et al.*, 2008; Schneider, 2008). These authors suggested that
the importance of water depth was related to prey availability.

265 ABFT live in pelagic ecosystems of the entire North Atlantic and its adjacent seas, 266 primarily the Mediterranean Sea (Fromentin & Powers, 2005). Some tuna born in the 267 Mediterranean Sea, leave and undertake trophic migrations within the eastern Atlantic 268 Ocean up to age 4 or 5, at which point they reach sexual maturity and return to the 269 Mediterranean Sea to spawn in spring (Aloncle, 1964b; Cort, 1990; Dicenta & 270 Piccinetti, 1978; Mather, Mason, & Jones, 1995). Then, ABFT return to the Atlantic 271 Ocean in summer crossing the Strait of Gibraltar in a trophic migration (Sella, 1929; 272 Rodríguez-Roda, 1964). The different predicted spatial distributions of killer whales in 273 spring and summer match the spawning and trophic migrations of ABFT through the 274 study area.

The spring model predicts killer whales presence in shallow waters close to the west coast of the study area, where they would be capable of hunting schools of ABFT entering the Mediterranean, using the endurance-exhaustion hunting technique described in the Gulf of Cadiz (<100 m depth) by Guinet *et al.* (2007). Killer whales are known to dive to depths no more than 300 m (Bowers & Henderson, 1972). Hunting in shallow waters can prevent ABFT from taking refuge at depths (Guinet *et al.* 2007).

In addition to depth and longitude, temperature had a significant influence on the presence probability of killer whales during summer, restricting their distribution area to the Strait of Gibraltar. Quílez-Badia *et al.* (2012) showed that ABFT were crossing the Strait between 19 and 24°C while swimming to the Atlantic Ocean, which matches the temperature range predicting the presence of killer whales in the Strait of Gibraltar in summer in this study. Deep dives have been reported through the use of tags on ABFT while they are crossing the Strait of Gibraltar (Wilson & Block, 2009), suggesting that 288 (a) they may forage on squid and fish inhabiting deep Mediterranean outflow waters, or 289 (b) maybe these dives were related to predator avoidance by the killer whales, or (c) 290 thermoregulation and energetic saving associated with avoiding ocean currents. Since 291 1995, Spanish and Moroccan fisheries have been established and developed near sea 292 mounts in the Strait of Gibraltar during the western tuna migration (Srour, 1994; de la 293 Serna et al., 2004). Killer whales have been observed among fishing boats at least since 294 1999 in the central part of the Strait (de Stephanis et al., 2008), (a) depredating tuna 295 from the long-lines or (b) actively chasing tuna in the area, in these shallower waters 296 where ABFT are not able to avoid them by performing deep dives. The presence of 297 ABFT long-line fisheries, the shallow waters of the Strait, as well as the bottleneck that 298 represents the Strait of Gibraltar for the migration of the ABFT would explain the high 299 predictability of the species in the area both in summer and spring.

300 In the Alboran Sea a large effort has been made for the study of cetaceans, but only four 301 sightings of killer whales have been recorded in the area in 10 years (Figure 1), and 302 none of the selected models have identified any important area for killer whales in that 303 area in this study (Figures 4 and 5). The Alboran Sea is characterised by a narrow, steep 304 shelf (5–10 km) (Ercilla et al., 1992; Hernández-Molina, 1993; Hernández-Molina et 305 al., 1994) compared to the wide shelf (30-40 km) of the Gulf of Cadiz (Baraza et al., 306 1999). This difference could be crucial for the presence of killer whales in the area, as 307 they seem to prefer hunting in shallow areas (Guinet et al., 2007). Therefore, it seems 308 better for the killer whales to wait for ABFT near the shallow sea mounts of the Strait of 309 Gibraltar and adjacent waters. In southern Portugal (Algarve), there are few sightings of 310 killer whales (Figure 1), but the spring model predicts an important area near Faro 311 (Figure 4). This area used to be one of the main places for Portuguese tuna trap nets (Ravier & Fromentin, 2001), therefore it could be a suitable area for killer whales 312

endurance-exhaustion hunting (Guinet et al., 2007). Little effort was available in 313 314 Algarve, and the model prediction shows a great variance in the area (Figure 4), that could be due to the low availability to "pseudo-absences" in the models (Figure 1). 315 316 Therefore, this area should be further surveyed to improve the spring model prediction. 317 No cetacean survey has been made in Moroccan waters; however the spring model has 318 identified the north Atlantic coast of Morocco as an important area. Further studies 319 should focus on refining habitat predictions and examining relationships between killer 320 whale distributions and environmental correlates over the years and in areas not so well 321 studied as Moroccan and Portuguese coasts and offshore waters of the Southern Iberian 322 Peninsula. Scarce sightings (both of killer whales and other species) were recorded in 323 autumn and winter, which did not allow modelling their presence during these periods 324 of the year.

325 Conservation of the eastern Atlantic stock of killer whales' prey is essential for the future of both endangered predator and prey in the area, as ABFT has been overfished 326 327 (Collette et al., 2012) and Iberian killer whales have a highly specialised diet (García-328 Tiscar, 2009). The fecundity of another population of killer whales in the eastern Pacific 329 Ocean has been strongly related to the abundance of their prey, the Chinook salmon, 330 where a decrease in salmon populations caused senescence in the whales and affected 331 their fecundity rates (Ward *et al.*, 2009). For that reason, any decrease in the abundance 332 of ABFT could set the Iberian population of killer whales at greater risk. Therefore, 333 important areas for southern Iberian killer whales require adequate protection, such as 334 the creation of an exclusion zone where activities that may disrupt their hunting 335 technique would be prohibited in spring in the eastern areas of the Gulf of Cadiz (both 336 in Spain and Morocco), such as whale watching, military exercises or sport fishing. The conservation of this killer whale population distributed across national borders will only 337

be achieved through collaboration and coordination between the neighbouring countries
Spain, Portugal and Morocco and the implementation of a joint action plan to protect
their habitat.

341

342 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

343

344 We would like to specially thank Alnitak for supplying their sighting data-base. Thanks 345 are due to the Consejería de Agricultura, Pesca y Medio Ambiente of the Junta de 346 Andalucía and the Agencia de Medio Ambiente y Agua of the Junta de Andalucía, 347 especially to Manuel Fernández Casado, Diego Moreno, Agustin Barrajón, Maria del 348 Carmen Arroyo, Julio de la Rosa y Jose Miguel Remón, Eduardo Fernández Tabales and María Soledad Vivas. Thanks to Rebecca Bringley, Teo Todorov, Javier Elorriaga, 349 350 Rafael García, José María Carceles and Clive Finlayson for supplying killer whale 351 sightings. João Nuno Gonçalves, Bruno Claro, CIRCE volunteers and research 352 assistants helped in the field work of CIRCE and the EBD-CSIC. This work was funded 353 by the Loro Parque Foundation, CEPSA, Ministerio de Medio Ambiente, Fundación Biodiversidad, Life Indemares (LIFE 07 NAT.E.000732) and LIFE "Conservación de 354 355 Cetáceos y tortugas de Murcia y Andalucía" (LIFE02NAT/E/8610), the "Plan Nacional I+D+I" of the Spanish "Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad". De Stephanis was 356 357 supported by the "Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad" through the 358 "Subprograma Juan de la Cierva". Thanks are also due to the IFAW for providing the software Logger 2000. 359

360

361 REFERENCES

362

- Aloncle H. (1964a) Premières observations sur les petits cétacés des côtes marocaines. Bulletin
 d l'Institut des Pêches Maritimes du Maroc, 12, 21–42.
- Aloncle H. (1964b) Note sur le thon rouge de la Baie Ibéro-Marocaine. Bulletin de l'Institut des pêches maritimes du Maroc, 12, 43–59.

367 Amante C. and Eakins B. (2009) ETOPO1 1 Arc-minute global relief model: procedures, data
368 sources and analysis, *Data Sources and Analysis. NOAA Technical Memorandum NESDIS*369 NGDC-24, 19 pp, March 2009.

Báez J., Camiñas J. and Torreblanca D. (2007) Análisis de la distribución espacial de aves y
mamíferos marinos en el Golfo de Cádiz (Sudoeste de la Península Ibérica) durante el periodo
de primavera. *Boletín de la Real Sociedad Española de Historia Natural. Seccion Biológica*,
102, (1-4) 93–97.

Baird R. W. and Dill L. M. (1995) Occurrence and behaviour of transient killer whales:
seasonal and pod-specific variability, foraging behaviour, and prey handling. *Canadian Journal*of Zoology Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences, 73, (7) 1300–1311.

- Baraza J., Ercilla G. and H. Nelson C. (1999) Potential geologic hazards on the eastern Gulf
 of Cadiz slope (SW Spain). *Marine Geology*, 155, (1-2) 191–215.
- Baumgartner M. and Mullin K. (2001) Cetacean habitats in the northern Gulf of Mexico. *Fisheries Bulletin*, 99, 219–239.
- Bayed A. and Beaubrun P. (1987) Les mammifères marins du Maroc: inventaire préliminaire.
 Mammalia, 51, (3) 437–446.
- Bowers C. A. and Henderson R. S. (1972) *Project Deep Ops: Deep Object Recovery with Pilot and Killer Whales.* San Diego, CA.
- Braham H. W. and Dahlheim M. E. (1982) Killer whales in Alaska documented in the
 Platforms of Opportunity Program. *Report of the International Whaling Commission*.
- Carder K., Chen F., Lee Z., Hawes S. and Cannizzaro J. (2003) MODIS Ocean Science
 Team Algorithm Theoretical Basis Document, *ATBD-MOD-19, Ver. 5.0.*
- 389 Casinos A. and Vericad J. R. (1976) The cetaceans of the Spanish coasts: a survey.
 390 Mammalia, 40, (2) 267–290.
- 391 Cañadas A. and de Stephanis R. (2006) Killer whale, or Orca Orcinus orca (Strait of Gibraltar
 392 subpopulation). In: *The status and distribution of cetaceans in the Black Sea and Mediterranean*393 Sea, (Ed. by R. R. Reeves & G. Notarbartolo di Sciara), pp. 34–38. IUCN, Centre for
 394 Mediterranean Cooperation, Malaga,Spain.
- Cañadas A. and Hammond P. (2006) Model-based abundance estimates for bottlenose
 dolphins off southern Spain: implications for conservation and management. *Journal of Cetacean Research and Management*, 8, (1) 13–27.

Cañadas A. and Hammond P. (2008) Abundance and habitat preferences of the short-beaked
 common dolphin Delphinus delphis in the southwestern Mediterranean: implications for
 conservation. *Endangered Species Research*, 4, 309–331.

401 Cañadas A., Sagarminaga R., de Stephanis R., Urquiola E. and Hammond P. S. (2005)
402 Habitat preference modelling as a conservation tool: proposals for marine protected areas for
403 cetaceans in southern Spanish waters. Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater
404 Ecosystems, 15, (5) 495–521.

405 Cetti F. (1777) Storia naturale della Sardegna. Sassari, Piattoli.

Collette B., Amotin A. F., Boustanu A., Carpenter K. E., De Oliveira Leite Jr. N., Di
Natale A., Die D., Fox W., Fredou F. L., Graves J., Viera Hazin F. H., Hinton M., Juan
Jorda M., Schratwieser J., Texeira Lessa R. P., Pires Ferreira Travassos P. E. and Uozumi
V. (2012) Thumpus thereas In: IIICN Pad List of Theorem Spacing Varsion 2012 2

409 Y. (2012) *Thunnus thynnus*. In: *IUCN Red List of Theatened Species. Version 2012.2*,

410 Cort J. (1990) Biología y pesca del atún rojo," Thunnus thynnus"(L.), del mar Cantábrico
411 (Tesis doctoral). *Publicaciones Especiales. Instituto Español de Ocenografia*, 4, 272.

412 D'Amico A., Bergamasco A., Zanasca P., Carniel S., Nacini E., Portunato N., Teloni V.,

413 Mori C. and Barbanti R. (2003) Qualitative correlation of marine mammals with physical and

biological parameters in the ligurian sea. *IEEE Journal of Oceanic Engineering*, 28, (1) 29–43.

de la Serna J. D. la, Alot E., Majuelos E. and Rioja P. (2004) La migración trófica post
reproductiva del atún rojo (*Thunnus thynnus*) a través del estrecho de Gibraltar. *Collect. Vol. Sci. Pap. ICCAT*, 56, (3) 1196–1209.

de Stephanis R., Cornulier T., Verborgh P., Salazar Sierra J., Pérez Gimeno N. and
Guinet C. (2008a) Summer spatial distribution of cetaceans in the Strait of Gibraltar in relation
to the oceanographic context. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 353, 275–288.

de Stephanis R., García-Tiscar S., Verborgh P., Esteban Pavo R., Pérez S., MinvielleSebastia L. and Guinet C. (2008b) Diet of the social groups of long-finned pilot whales
(*Globicephala melas*) in the Strait of Gibraltar. *Marine Biology*, 154, 603–612.

de Stephanis R., Verborgh P., Pérez S., Esteban R., Minvielle-Sebastia L. and Guinet C.
(2008c) Long-term social structure of long-finned pilot whales (*Globicephala melas*) in the
Strait of Gibraltar. *Acta ethologica*, 11, 81–94.

427 De Stephanis R., Giménez J., Carpinelli E., Guitierrez-Expósito C. and Cañadas A. (in
428 press). As main meal for Sperm whales: plastic deris.Marine Pollution Bulletin. Marine
429 Pollution Bulletin,

430 Dicenta A. and Piccinetti C. (1978) Desove del atun (*Thunnus thynnus*) en el Mediterráneo
431 occidental y evaluacion directa del stock de reproductores, basado en la abundancia de sus
432 larvas. *Col. Vol. Sci. Pap. ICCAT*, 7, (2) 389–395.

Dwyer S. and Visser I. (2011) Cookie cutter shark (Isistius sp.) bites on cetaceans, with particular reference to killer whales (orca)(*Orcinus orca*). *Aquatic Mammals*, 37, (2) 11–138.

- 435 Elith J. and Leathwick J. (2007) Predicting species distributions from museum and herbarium
- 436 records using multiresponse models fitted with multivariate adaptive regression splines.
- **437** *Diversity and Distributions*, 13, (3) 265–275.

- 438 Ercilla G., Alonso B. and Baraza J. (1992) Sedimentary evolution of the northwestern
 439 Alboran Sea during the Quaternary. *Geo-Marine Letters*, 12, (2-3) 144–149.
- 440 Esteban R. (2008) Abundancia, Estructura social y Parámetros demográficos de la orca
 441 (Orcinus orca) en el Estrecho de Gibraltar. Master Thesis. Universidad de Cádiz, Spain.

Foote A. D., Newton J., Piertney S. B., Willerslev E. and Gilbert M. T. P. (2009) Ecological,
morphological and genetic divergence of sympatric North Atlantic killer whale populations. *Molecular Ecology*, 18, 5207–5217.

- Foote A., Vilstrup J., de Stephanis R., Verborgh P., Nielsen S. C. A., Deaville R., Kleivane
 L., Martín V., Miller P. J. O., Øien N., Pérez-Gil M., Pasmussen M., Reid R. J., Robertson
 K. M., Rogan E., Similä T., Tejedor M. L., Vester H., Víkingsson G. A., Willerslev E.,
 Gilbert M. T. P. and Piertney S. B. (2011) Genetic differentiation among North Atlantic killer
 whale populations. *Molecular Ecology*, 20, 629–641.
- 450 Forney K. A. and Wade P. (2007) Worldwide distribution and abundance of killer whales. In:
 451 *Whales, whaling and ocean ecosystems*, pp. 145–162.
- 452 Fromentin J.M. and Powers J. E. (2005) Atlantic bluefin tuna: population dynamics, ecology,
 453 fisheries and management. *Fish and Fisheries*, 6, (4) 281–306.
- 454 García-Tiscar S. (2009) Interacciones entre delfines mulares y orcas con pesqeuerías en el
 455 Mar de Alborán y Estrecho de Gibraltar. PhD Thesis. Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Spain.
- 456 Guinet C., Domenici P., de Stephanis R., Barrett-Lennard L., Ford J. K. B. and Verborgh
 457 P. (2007) Killer whale predation on bluefin tuna: exploring the hypothesis of the endurance-
- 458 exhaustion. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 347, 111–119.
- 459 Hamazaki T. (2002) Spatiotemporal prediction models of cetacean habitats in the mid-western
- 460 North Atlantic ocean (from Cape Hatteras, North Carolina, USA to Nova Scotia, Canada).
- 461 Marine Mammal Science, 18, 920–939.
- Hastie T. and Tibshirani R. (1990) Generalized additive models. *Monographs on Statistics and Applied Probability*, 43,
- 464 Hernández-Molina F. J. (1993) Dinámica sedimentaria y evolución durante el Pleistoceno
 465 Terminal–Holoceno del margen noroccidental del Mar de Alboran. Modelo de estratigrafia
 466 secuencial de muy alta resolución en plataformas continentales. Master Thesis. Universidad de
 467 Granada, Spain.
- Hernández-Molina F., Somoza L., Rey J. and Pomar L. (1994) Late Pleistocene-Holocene
 sediments on the Spanish continental shelves: Model for very high resolution sequence
 stratigraphy. *Marine Geology*, 120, (3-4) 129–174.
- 471 Heyning J. E. and Dahlheim M. E. (1988) Orcinus orca. Mammalian Species, 304, 1–9.
- 472 Hirzel A. H., Helfer V. and Metral F. (2001) Assessing habitat-suitability models with a virtual species. *Ecological Modelling*, 145, (2-3) 111–121.
- 474 Hooker S. K., Whitehead H. and Gowans S. (1999) Marine Protected Area Design and the

475 Spatial and Temporal Distribution of Cetaceans in a Submarine Canyon. *Conservation Biology*,

476 13, (3) 592–602.

- 477 Horozco A. (1598) *Historia de la ciudad de Cádiz*. 2nd edition. El Excmo. Ayuntamiento de esta M.N.. M. L. y M. H. Ciudad.
- 479 Iñiguez M. A. (2001) Seasonal distribution of killer whales (*Orcinus orca*) in Northern
 480 Patagonia, Argentina. *Aquatic Mammals*, 27, (2) 154–161.
- 481 Leatherwood J. S. and Dalheim M. E. (1978) Worldwide Distribution of Pilot Whales and
 482 Killer Whales. *Naval Ocean Systems Center Technical Report 443*, 1–39.
- 483 Lozano F. (1958) Los escómbridos de las aguas españolas y marroquíes y su pesca. *Trab. Inst.*484 *Esp. Ocean*, 25, 254.
- 485 Lütolf M., Kienast F. and Guisan A. (2006) The ghost of past species occurrence: improving
 486 species distribution models for presence-only data. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 43, (4) 802–
 487 815.
- 488 Mackenzie K. (1999) Parasites as biological tags in population studies of marine organisms.
 489 *Parasitology*, 124, S153–S163.
- 490 Malod J.A. (1982) Comparaison de l'évolution des marges continentales au Nord et au Sud de
 491 la Péninsule Ibérique. PhD Thesis. Université Curie, Paris, France.
- 492 Mather F., Mason J. and Jones A. (1995) Historical document: life history and fisheries of
 493 Atlantic bluefin tuna. *NOAA Technical Memorandum* NMFS-SEFSC-370, 163pp.
- 494 Notarbartolo di Sciara G. (1987) Killer whale, Orcinus orca, in the Mediterranean Sea.
 495 Marine Mammal Science, 3, (4) 356–360.
- 496 Notarbartolo di Sciara G. and Birkun A. J. (2010) Conserving whales, dolphins and
 497 porpoises in the Mediterranean and Black Seas. *ACCOBAMS status report*
- 498 Phillips S. J. and Dudík M. (2008) Modeling of species distributions with Maxent: new
 499 extensions and a comprehensive evaluation. *Ecography*, 31, (2) 161–175.
- Quílez-Badia G., Cermeño P. and Tudela S. (2012) Movements of Bluefin tuna revealed by
 electronic tagging in the Mediterranean sea and in Atlantic waters of morocco in 2011. *ICCAT* SCRS/2012/123.
- Raga J. A., Raduán A. and Blanco C. (1985) Contribución al estudio de la distribución de cetàceos en el Mediterráneo y Atlantico Ibérico. *Miscelánia Zoológica*, 9, 361–366.
- Ravier C. and Fromentin J.-M. (2001) Long-term fluctuations in the eastern Atlantic and
 Mediterranean bluefin tuna population. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*, 58, (6) 1299–1317.
- 507 Reid J., Evans P. G. H. and Northridge S. P. (2003) Atlas of cetacean distribution in north508 west European waters. *Joint Nature Conservation Committee (JNCC)*, Peterborough, 82 pp.
- **Roberts D. G.** (1970) The Rif-Betic orogen in the Gulf of Cadiz. *Marine Geology*, 9, (5) M31–
 M37.
- **Rodríguez-Roda J.** (1964) Talla, peso y edad de los atunes, *Thunnus thynnus* (L.), capturados
 por la almadraba de Barbate (costa sudatlántica de España) en 1963 y comparación. *Inv. Pesq*,
 26, 3–48.

- 514 Schneider D. C. (2008) Habitat selection by marine birds in relation to water depth. *Ibis*, 139, (1) 175–178.
- 516 Sella M. (1929) Migrazioni e habitat del tonno (*Thunnus thynnus* L) studiati col metodo degli
 517 ami, con osservazioni su l'accrescimento, sul regime delle tonnare ecc.
- 518 Selzer L. A. and Payne P. M. (1988) The dsitribution of White-sided (*Lagenorhynchus acutus*)
 519 and common dolphins (*Delphinus delphis*) VS. environmental features of the continental shelf
 520 of the Norheastern United States. *Marine Mammal Science*, 4, (2) 141–153.
- 521 Sigurjónsson J. and Leatherwood S. (1988) The Icelandic live-capture fishery for killer
 522 whales, 1976-1988. *Rit. Fiskideildar*, 11, (307-316).
- 523 Srour A. (1994) Développment de la nouvelle pêcherie artisanale au thon rouge dans la région
 524 de Ksar sghir. *Note d'information ISPM*, 26, 10–11.
- 525 Stockwell D. (1999) The GARP modelling system: problems and solutions to automated spatial
 526 prediction. *International Journal of Geographical Information Science*, 13, (2) 143–158.
- Torres L. G., Rosel P. E., D'Agrosa C., and Read A. J. (2003) Improving management of
 overlapping bottlenose dolphin ecotypes through spatial analysis and genetics. *Marine Mammal Science*, 19, (3) 502–514.
- 530 VanDerWal J., Shoo L. and Januchowski S. (2010) SDMTools: Species Distribution
 531 Modelling Tools: tools for processing data associated with species distribution modelling
 532 exercises. *R package version 1*,
- Verborgh P., de Stephanis R., Pérez S., Yaget Y., Barbraud C. and Guinet C. (2009)
 Survival rate, abundance, and residency of long-finned pilot whales in the Strait of Gibraltar. *Marine Mammal Science*, 25, (3) 523–536.
- Ward E. J., Holmes E. E. and Balcomb K. C. (2009) Quantifying the effects of prey abundance on killer whale reproduction. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 46, (3) 632–640.
- Wilson S. and Block B. (2009) Habitat use in Atlantic bluefin tuna *Thunnus thynnus* inferred from diving behavior. *Endangered Species Research*, 10, 355–367.
- 540 Wood S. (2000) Modelling and smoothing parameter estimation with multiple quadratic 541 penalties. *Statistical Society: Series B*, 62 (2): 413-428.
- **542** Wood S. (2001) mgcv: GAMs and generalized ridge regression for R. *R news*, 1, (2) 20–25.
- 543 Wood S. (2006) On confidence intervals for generalized additive models based on penalized 544 regression splines. *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Statistics*, 48(4):445-464.
- 545 Zaniewski A. E., Lehmann A., and Overton J. M. (2002) Predicting species spatial
- distributions using presence-only data: a case study of native New Zealand ferns. *Ecological Modelling*, 157, (2-3) 261–280.
- 548
- 549 FIGURES LEGENDS
- 550

Fig. 1. Cetacean sighting distribution in the study area. In red killer whales sightings and in grey other cetacean sightings. (A) sightings in spring in the southern Iberian Peninsula; (B) sighting in spring in the

553 Strait of Gibraltar; (C) sightings in summer in the southern Iberian Peninsula and (D) sightings in summer

in the Strait of Gibraltar.

555 Fig.2. Smoothed functions for the selected predictive covariates in the model of probability of presence of

killer whales in the study area in spring. Continuous line represents the point estimate and grey areas represent ± 1 se. The small ticks on the X axis represent the samples. (A) Bathymetry and (B) Longitude.

For the second term ± 1 second term {exit} term {exit} term {exit} term {exit} term {exit} term {ex

Fig. 3. Smoothed functions for the selected predictive covariates in the model of probability of presence of killer whales in the study area in summer. Continuous line represents the point estimate and grey areas represent ± 1 se. The small ticks on the X axis represent the samples. (A) Bathymetry; (B) Longitude and

561 (C) Sea Surface Temperature.

Fig. 4. Predicted density surface map of killer whales in the area from spatial modelling in spring by
bootstraps. (A) the inferior 95% C.I. of the predicted model at southern Iberian Peninsula; (B) the inferior
95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (C) best predicted model at southern Iberian
Peninsula, (D) best predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted
model at southern Iberian Peninsula and (F) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of
Gibraltar.

Fig. 5. Predicted density surface map of killer whales in the area from spatial modelling in summer by
bootstraps. (A) the inferior 95% C.I. of the predicted model at southern Iberian Peninsula; (B) the inferior
95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (C) best predicted model at southern Iberian
Peninsula, (D) best predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted
model at southern Iberian Peninsula and (F) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of

573 Gibraltar.

574

575

576 TABLE LEGENDS

- 577 Table 1: Detection-function model fits with GCV(Generalised Cross Validation score) ΔGCV between
 578 models, AIC (Akaike Information Criterion) and ΔAIC between models, during the spring
 579 period. Only covariates showing significant relationship are shown
- Table 2: Detection-function model fits with GCV(Generalised Cross Validation score) ΔGCV between models, AIC (Akaike Information Criterion) and ΔAIC between models and the deviation explained for each model, during the summer period. Only covariates showing significant relationship are shown

584

585

586

587

588	
589	
590	FIGURES and TABLES
591	
592	FIGURES:



Fig. 1. Cetacean sighting distribution in the study area. In red killer whales sightings and in grey other cetacean sightings. (A) sightings in spring in the southern Iberian Peninsula; (B) sighting in spring in the Strait of Gibraltar; (C) sightings in summer in the southern Iberian Peninsula and (D) sightings in summer in the Strait of Gibraltar.



Fig.2. Smoothed functions for the selected predictive covariates in the model of probability of presence of killer whales in the study area in spring. Continuous line represents the point estimate and grey areas represent ±1 se. The small ticks on the X axis represent the samples. (A) Bathymetry and (B) Longitude.



Fig. 3. Smoothed functions for the selected predictive covariates in the model of probability of presence of killer whales in the study area in summer. Continuous line represents the point estimate and grey areas represent ±1 se. The small ticks on the X axis represent the samples. (A) Bathymetry; (B) Longitude and (C) Sea Surface Temperature.



Fig. 4. Predicted density surface map of killer whales in the area from spatial modelling in spring by bootstraps. (A) the inferior 95% C.I. of the predicted model at southern Iberian Peninsula; (B) the inferior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (C) best predicted model at southern Iberian Peninsula, (D) best predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar.





Fig. 5. Predicted density surface map of killer whales in the area from spatial modelling in summer by bootstraps. (A) the inferior 95% C.I. of the predicted model at southern Iberian Peninsula; (B) the inferior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (C) best predicted model at southern Iberian Peninsula, (D) best predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (C) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar; (E) the superior 95% C.I. of the predicted model in the Strait of Gibraltar.



					Dev
Covariates	GCV	ΔGCV	AIC	ΔΑΙC	Explained
s(BAT)+s(lon)	0.058853		4102.552		50.40%
s(BAT)+s(lon)+s(ASPECT)	0.061775	0.002922	4100.523	-2.029	47.90%
s(lon)+s(ASPECT)	0.064006	0.005153	4098.398	-4.154	45.90%
s(lon)	0.064558	0.005705	4104.756	2.204	45.30%
s(BAT)+s(ASPECT)	0.093139	0.034286	4117.656	15.104	21.50%
s(BAT)	0.094014	0.035161	4111.666	9.114	20.60%
s(ASPECT)	0.10867	0.049817	4123.602	21.05	8.42%

ъ

					Dev
Covariates	GCV	ΔGCV	AIC	ΔΑΙC	Explained
s(BAT)+s(lon)+s(SST)	0.14259		9384.136		49.60%
s(BAT)+s(lon)	0.14326	0.00067	9389.616	5.48	49.30%
s(lon)	0.17302	0.03043	9451.718	67.582	38.70%
s(BAT)+s(SST)	0.18114	0.03855	9444.685	60.549	35.90%
s(BAT)	0.18902	0.04643	9459.7	75.564	33%
s(SST)	0.26926	0.12667	9567.393	183.257	4.69%