

1 **Assessing the effect of copper on growth, copper accumulation and physiological**  
2 **responses of grazing species *Atriplex halimus*: ecotoxicological implications.**

3

4 E. Mateos-Naranjo <sup>a</sup>, L. Andrades-Moreno <sup>a</sup>, J. Cambrollé<sup>b</sup> and A. Perez-Martin<sup>b</sup>

5

6

7 <sup>a</sup>Departamento de Biología Vegetal y Ecología, Facultad de Biología, Universidad de  
8 Sevilla, 1095, 41080, Sevilla, Spain

9 <sup>b</sup>Instituto de Recursos Naturales y Agrobiología de Sevilla (IRNAS), CSIC, Reina  
10 Mercedes 10, 41012, Sevilla, Spain

11

12

13

14

15

16 \*Corresponding author:

17 Enrique Mateos-Naranjo

18 Dpto. Biología Vegetal y Ecología, Facultad de Biología, Universidad de Sevilla, Av

19 Reina Mercedes s/n, 41012 Sevilla, Spain.

20 E-mail: [emana@us.es](mailto:emana@us.es)

21 Tel.: +34-95-4557495; fax: +34-95-4615780

22

23

24

25 ABSTRACT

26

27 Tolerance of plants to elevated concentrations of heavy metals in growth media and in  
28 its tissues leads to high degrees of metal bioaccumulation, which may pose a risk for  
29 humans and animals alike. Therefore, bio-accumulating plants need thorough evaluation  
30 from an environmental health point of view. A glasshouse experiment concerning the  
31 xerohalophyte *Atriplex halimus* was carried out to determine its tolerance and capacity  
32 to accumulate copper. We investigated the effect of Cu from 0 to 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> on the  
33 growth, photosynthetic apparatus and nutrient uptake of *A. halimus* by measuring gas  
34 exchange, chlorophyll fluorescence and photoinhibition. We also determined total Cu,  
35 sodium, potassium, magnesium, phosphorous, and nitrogen content in the plant. Our  
36 results indicated that *A. halimus* presented a high tolerance to Cu-induced stress, since  
37 the plants were able to survive at concentrations higher than 15 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu. However,  
38 this tolerance was not reflected in its ability to accumulate and tolerate greater amounts  
39 of Cu in its tissues, since clear phytotoxicity symptoms were detected at tissue  
40 concentrations greater than 38 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> Cu. Thus, Cu increment caused a reduction in *A.*  
41 *halimus* growth, which was related to a decrease in net photosynthetic rate. This  
42 reduction was associated with the adverse effect of Cu on the photochemical apparatus  
43 and the reduction in the absorption of essential nutrients. The high tolerance of *A.*  
44 *halimus* was largely related with the capacity of this species to avoid the absorption of  
45 great amounts of Cu. For all the above reasons, *A. halimus* could have the  
46 characteristics of a Cu-exclusion plant.

47

48

49 **Keywords:** Cu-exclusion plant; Fluorescence; Growth; Photoinhibition; Photosynthesis

50

51 **1. Introduction**

52

53 Heavy metal pollution is a major ecological concern due to its impact on human  
54 health through the food chain and its high persistence in the environment (Sharma and  
55 Dubey, 2005). In this context, copper (Cu) is one of the main heavy metal contaminants,  
56 resulting from mining, metal processing, fertilizers, fungicides, agricultural, municipal  
57 wastes, etc (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias, 2001). Although Cu is an essential  
58 micronutrient for plant growth, participating in important biological reactions, namely  
59 as an enzymatic cofactor and electron carrier in the photosynthetic and respiratory  
60 processes (Andrade et al., 2004), it has been reported to be among the most toxic of  
61 heavy metals (Dewez et al., 2005). Excess Cu inhibits plant growth, as well as  
62 photosynthetic and respiratory activities (Nalewajko and Olaveson, 1995). Studies have  
63 shown that plants grown in Cu-contaminated soil usually accumulate an elevated Cu  
64 content in their tissues (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias, 2001). As a result, a series of  
65 physiological and toxicological responses take place in plants depending on the Cu  
66 concentration in its tissues and the capacity of these plants to tolerate elevated levels of  
67 this element.

68 *Atriplex halimus* (chenopodiaceae) is a xerohalophyte which is perennial and native  
69 to arid and semi-arid Mediterranean regions. This species tolerates harsh conditions  
70 such as salinity (Bajji et al., 1998), light stress (Streb et al., 1997) and drought  
71 (Martínez et al., 2005). In the joint estuary of the Tinto and Odiel rivers (which is one of  
72 the most heavy metal-polluted areas in the world; Sáinz et al., 2002) *A. halimus* grows  
73 in anthropized grasslands running parallel to the coastline. These areas contain high  
74 levels of trace metal contamination (especially Cu), derived from phosphate-based  
75 fertilisers, pyrite roasting and copper smelting plants located near the coast (Elbaz-

76 Poulichet et al., 1999). Several studies have demonstrated the ability of *A. halimus* to  
77 tolerate and accumulate high amounts of cadmium, zinc and lead in its tissues (Lutts et  
78 al., 2004; Manousaki and Kalogerakis, 2009; Nedjimi and Daoud, 2009). However, few  
79 data are available concerning the effect of copper on the growth and photosynthesis  
80 responses of *A. halimus*. Hence, the purpose of this study was to examine the effects of  
81 Cu on growth, photosynthetic apparatus and nutrient uptake in *A. halimus* under  
82 hydroponic conditions. The specific objectives were to: (1) accomplish a simplified  
83 approach to the determination of Cu phytotoxicity thresholds of this species, by  
84 analyzing the growth of *A. halimus* in experimental copper treatments ranging between  
85 0 to 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu; (2) ascertain the extent to which the effects on the photosynthetic  
86 apparatus (PSII chemistry) and gas exchange characteristics determine plant  
87 performance with increasing copper; and (3) examine the response of accumulated  
88 copper, sodium, potassium, magnesium, phosphorus and nitrogen to increasing external  
89 Cu and how this response affects growth.

90 The results of this investigation have implications for heavy metal ecotoxicology  
91 involved in the vegetable supply for food, since this species has been considered as an  
92 important component of the diet of grazing animals in semi-arid regions (Otal et al.,  
93 2010). Moreover, the tolerance of plants to elevated concentrations of heavy metals in  
94 growth media and in their tissues may pose a risk to grazing livestock because of the  
95 bioaccumulation of high metal concentrations in plants (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias,  
96 2001).

97

## 98 **2. Materials and methods**

99

100 2.1. *Plant material*

101

102 Seeds of *A. halimux* were collected in December 2010 from Odiel Marshes and  
103 stored in darkness at 4°C for three months. After the storing period, seeds were placed  
104 in a germinator (ASL Aparatos Científicos M-92004, Madrid, Spain) and subjected to  
105 an alternating diurnal regime of 16 hours of light (photon flux rate, 400-700 nm, 35  
106  $\mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ) at 25°C and 8 hours of darkness at 12°C for a month. Then, seedlings were  
107 planted in individual plastic pots (11 cm of diameter) filled with perlite and placed in a  
108 glasshouse with controlled temperature of 21-25°C, 40-60% relative humidity and  
109 natural daylight (minimum and maximum light flux: 250 and 1000  $\mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ ,  
110 respectively). Immediately afterwards, the pots were allocated in shallow trays with 86  
111 mM NaCl solution created by combining 20% Hoagland's solution with the appropriate  
112 amount of NaCl (Hoagland and Arnon 1938). Thus, 3 l of the solution were placed in  
113 each of the trays (to a depth of 1 cm). The levels in the trays were monitored and they  
114 were topped up to the marked level with 20% Hoagland's solution (without NaCl)  
115 whenever necessary to maintain the salt concentration.

116

117 2.2. *Stress treatments*

118

119 In June 2011, after three months of seedling cultures, the pots were allocated to five  
120 Cu treatments in shallow trays (six pots per tray, with one tray per Cu treatment): 0, 2,  
121 9, 15 and 30  $\text{mmol l}^{-1}$  Cu, in the same glasshouse. Copper treatments were established  
122 by combining 20% Hoagland's solution and  $\text{CuSO}_4 \cdot 7\text{H}_2\text{O}$  of the appropriate  
123 concentration. The control, 0  $\text{mm l}^{-1}$  Cu treatment, had exactly 0.0005  $\text{mmol l}^{-1}$  of Cu,  
124 since Hoagland's solution contains a small amount of Cu as an essential trade nutrient.

125 Cu concentrations were chosen to cover variations recorded by Sáinz et al. (2002) in the  
126 salt marshes of the joined estuary of Tinto and Odiel rivers.

127 At the beginning of the experiment, 2 l of the appropriate solution were placed in  
128 each of the trays to a depth of 1 cm. During the experiment, the levels in the trays were  
129 monitored and they were topped up to the marked level with 20% Hoagland's solution  
130 (without additional  $\text{CuSO}_4 \cdot 7\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ) as a way to limit the change of Cu concentration due  
131 to water evaporation of the nutritive solution. In addition, the entire solution (including  
132  $\text{CuSO}_4 \cdot 7\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ) was changed weekly.

133

### 134 2.3. Growth and survival analysis

135

136 At the beginning and at the end of the experiment (after 20 days of treatment), three  
137 and six entire plants (roots, stems and leaves), from each treatment, respectively, were  
138 dried at 80°C for 48 h and weighed. Also, the number of all fully expanded leaves and  
139 total and individual leaf area of *Atriplex halimus* were recorded on the same dates.

140 The relative growth rate (RGR) in ash-free dry mass of whole plants was  
141 calculated using the formula:

142

$$143 \text{RGR} = (\ln \text{Bf} - \ln \text{Bi}) \cdot \text{D}^{-1} \quad (\text{g g}^{-1}\text{day}^{-1})$$

144

145 where Bf = final dry mass, Bi = initial dry mass (average of the three plants from each  
146 treatment dried at the beginning of the experiment) and D = duration of experiment  
147 (days).

148 Finally, plant survival was recorded. A plant was considered dead when no  
149 green leaves remained at the end of the experiment.

150 2.4. *Gas exchange measurements*

151

152 Gas exchange measurements were carried out on random, healthy, fully expanded  
153 leaves (n = 10, a measurement per plant and four extra taken randomly) using an  
154 infrared gas analyzer in an open system (Li-Cor Inc., Lincoln, NE, USA) after 20 days  
155 of treatments. Net photosynthetic rate (AN), intercellular CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (C<sub>i</sub>),  
156 stomatal conductance (gs) and transpiration rate were determined at ambient CO<sub>2</sub>  
157 concentration of 380 μmol mol<sup>-1</sup>, temperature between 20 and 25°C, 50 ± 5% relative  
158 humidity and a photon flux density of (1000 μmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). AN, C<sub>i</sub> and gs were  
159 calculated using standard formulae of Von Caemmerer and Farquhar (1981). Water use  
160 efficiency (WUE) was calculated as the ratio between AN and transpiration rate [mmol  
161 (CO<sub>2</sub> assimilated) mol<sup>-1</sup> (H<sub>2</sub>O transpired)].

162

163 2.5. *Measurement of chlorophyll fluorescence*

164

165 Chlorophyll fluorescence was measured in random, fully developed leaves (n = 12,  
166 two measurements per plant) using a portable modulated fluorimeter (Mini-PAM, Heinz  
167 Walz, Germany) after 20 days of treatments. Light- and dark-adapted fluorescence  
168 parameters were measured at dawn (stable, 50 μmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> ambient light) and at midday  
169 (1600 μmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) to investigate whether Cu concentration affected the sensitivity of  
170 plants to photoinhibition.

171 Plants were dark-adapted for 30 minutes, using leaf-clips designed for this  
172 purpose. The minimal fluorescence level in the dark-adapted state (F<sub>0</sub>) was measured  
173 using a modulated pulse (<0.05 μmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> for 1.8 μs) too small to induce significant  
174 physiological changes in the plant. The data stored were an average taken over a 1.6

175 seconds period. Maximal fluorescence level in this state ( $F_m$ ) was measured after  
 176 applying a saturating actinic light pulse of  $10000 \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$  for 0.8s. The value of  $F_m$   
 177 was recorded as the highest average of two consecutive points. Values of the variable  
 178 fluorescence ( $F_v = F_m - F_0$ ) and maximum quantum efficiency of PSII photochemistry  
 179 ( $F_v/F_m$ ) were calculated from  $F_0$  and  $F_m$ . This ratio of variable to maximal fluorescence  
 180 correlates with the number of functional PSII reaction centres and dark adapted values  
 181 of  $F_v/F_m$  can be used to quantify photoinhibition (Maxwell and Johnson, 2000).

182 The same leaf section of each plant was used to measure light-adapted parameters.  
 183 Steady state fluorescence yield ( $F_s$ ) was recorded after adapting plants to ambient light  
 184 conditions for 30 min. A saturating actinic light pulse of  $10000 \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$  for 0.8 s  
 185 was then used to produce the maximum fluorescence yield ( $F_m'$ ) by temporarily  
 186 inhibiting PSII photochemistry. The quantum efficiency of PSII was calculated using  
 187 light-adapted parameters ( $\Phi_{\text{PSII}} = (F_m' - F_s) / F_m'$ ) according to Mateos-Naranjo et al.  
 188 (2008a). This parameter measures the proportion of light absorbed by chlorophylls  
 189 associated to PSII that is used in photochemistry.

190 Fluorescence parameters determined in both light- and dark-adapted states were  
 191 used to calculate non-photochemical quenching ( $\text{NPQ} = (F_m - F_m') / F_m'$ ), which is a  
 192 parameter that describes mainly the thermal dissipation of energy in the PSII (Maxwell  
 193 and Johnson, 2000).

194 Chronic ( $\text{PI}_{\text{chr}}$ ) and dynamic ( $\text{PI}_{\text{dyn}}$ ) photoinhibition were calculated according to  
 195 Werner et al. (2002) as:

196

197 
$$\text{PI}_{\text{chr}} = \frac{(F_v/F_m)_{\text{max}} - (F_v/F_m)_d}{(F_v/F_m)_{\text{max}}} \times 100$$

198 
$$\text{PI}_{\text{dyn}} = \frac{(F_v/F_m)_d - (F_v/F_m)_{\text{mid}}}{(F_v/F_m)_{\text{max}}} \times 100$$



199

200 where  $(F_v/F_m)_d$  and  $(F_v/F_m)_{mid}$  are dawn and midday  $F_v/F_m$  values, respectively.

201  $(F_v/F_m)_{max}$  is the maximum  $F_v/F_m$  value, which was calculated as the average of dawn

202 measurements of the control 1 day after imposing Cu treatments.

203

## 204 *2.6. Chemical analysis of plant samples*

205

206 In accordance with protocols of Mateos-Naranjo et al. (2008a), at the end of the  
207 experiment, leaf and root samples were dried at 80°C for 48 h and ground. Leaves and  
208 roots were carefully washed with distilled water before any further analysis. Then, 0.5 g  
209 samples, taken from a mixture of the leaves or the roots belonging to the six plants used  
210 for each treatment were digested in triplicate with 6 ml HNO<sub>3</sub>, 0.5 ml HF and 1 ml  
211 H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. Cu, Na, K, Mg and P were measured by inductively coupled plasma (ICP)  
212 spectroscopy (ARL-Fison 3410, USA). Total N concentrations were determined for  
213 undigested dry samples with an elemental analyzer (Leco CHNS-932, Spain).

214

## 215 *2.7. Statistical analysis*

216

217 Statistical analysis was carried out using Statistica v. 6.0 (Statsoft Inc.). Pearson  
218 coefficients ( $r$ ) were calculated to assess correlation between different variables. Data  
219 were analysed by means of a one-way analysis of variance ( $F$ -test). Data were first  
220 tested for normality with the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test and for homogeneity of  
221 variance with the Brown-Forsythe test. Significant test results were followed by Tukey  
222 tests for identification of important contrasts. Differences between measurements of  
223 fluorescence at dawn and midday were compared by the Student test ( $t$ -test).

224

### 225 **3. Results**

226

#### 227 *3.1. Growth and survival analysis*

228

229 Total dry mass decreased with increasing Cu concentration (above:  $r = -0.75$  and  
230 belowground biomass:  $r = -0.79$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig. 1A) and was directly correlated with the  
231 reduction in relative growth rate (RGR; Fig. 1B). Moreover, total leaf area decreased  
232 with Cu concentration ( $r = -0.80$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig. 1C), which was associated with the  
233 reduction in the number of leaves (with values of  $128 \pm 18$ ,  $119 \pm 8$ ,  $97 \pm 8$ ,  $86 \pm 12$  and  
234  $50 \pm 8$  leaves per plant for 0, 2, 9, 15 and 30  $\text{mmol l}^{-1}$  Cu, respectively) and individual  
235 leaf area (Fig. 1D).

236 In addition, all plants exposed to the 30  $\text{mmol l}^{-1}$  Cu concentration treatment were  
237 unable to survive for the full 20 days of the experiment.

238

#### 239 *3.2. Gas exchange*

240

241 AN decreased with increasing Cu concentration after 20 days of treatment ( $r = -$   
242  $0.84$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig. 2A) and AN values recorded at 0 and 2  $\text{mmol l}^{-1}$  Cu were  
243 significantly higher than at the other Cu concentrations (Anova,  $p < 0.001$ ). There was  
244 also a strong correlation between AN and RGR ( $r = 0.97$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ).

245 Gs showed the same pattern as AN, decreasing with increasing Cu concentration ( $r$   
246  $= -0.87$ ;  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig. 2B). Contrarily, Ci increased with Cu concentration ( $r = 0.89$ ,  $p$   
247  $< 0.01$ ; Fig. 2C), but no statistical differences were recorded between 0, 2 and 9  $\text{mmol l}^{-1}$   
248 Cu treatments (Anova,  $p > 0.05$ ).

249 Finally, WUE decreased with increasing Cu concentration ( $r = -0.84$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig.  
250 2D), but no differences were recorded between 0, 2 and 9 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu treatments  
251 (Anova,  $p > 0.05$ ).

252

### 253 3.3 .Chlorophyll fluorescence

254

255 Values of  $F_v/F_m$  at dawn and midday decreased with external Cu concentration  
256 (dawn:  $r = -0.88$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; midday:  $r = -0.94$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig. 3A). Also,  $F_v/F_m$  values  
257 were significantly higher for the control and 2 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu than for the other Cu  
258 treatments at dawn and midday after 20 days of treatment. Furthermore,  $F_v/F_m$  was  
259 always lower at midday, the reductions resulting mainly from a lower  $F_m$  at midday  
260 than at dawn (data not presented).  $F_v/F_m$  values at dawn were lower than control in all  
261 treatment except for 2 and 9 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu (Fig. 3A).

262 Similarly, Quantum efficiency of PSII ( $\Phi_{PSII}$ ) at dawn and midday followed a  
263 similar pattern that  $F_v/F_m$  (dawn:  $r = -0.86$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; midday:  $r = -0.75$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig.  
264 3B). In addition,  $\Phi_{PSII}$  at midday was lower than at dawn (t-test,  $p < 0.05$ ; Fig. 3B) and  
265 was directly associated with a lower photochemical quenching at midday than at dawn  
266 (qP, data not presented).

267 Non-photochemical quenching (NPQ) did not show a relationship with Cu  
268 concentration at dawn, whereas this parameter increased with copper concentration at  
269 midday ( $r = 0.66$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig. 3C), ranging between  $0.8 \pm 0.1$  and  $2.7 \pm 0.3$  for 0 and  
270 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu solution, respectively.

271 The percentage of chronic and dynamic photoinhibition increased with the addition  
272 of Cu to nutrient solution (chronic:  $r = 0.98$ ,  $p < 0.01$  and dynamic  $r = 0.99$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ;  
273 Fig. 4). However, if compared with the control, the greater values of dynamic and

274 chronic photoinhibition were recorded at 15 and 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu (Fig. 4).

275

### 276 3.4. Chemical analysis of plant samples

277

278 Our mineral analysis data show that Cu tissue concentrations were greater in the  
279 roots than in the leaves (two-way Anova,  $p < 0.05$ ; Fig. 5A), and increased with  
280 external Cu concentration (roots:  $r = 0.94$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ; leaves:  $r = 0.96$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Fig 5A).  
281 In contrast, leaf Na, P and N decreased with increasing Cu concentration (Fig. 5B, 5D  
282 and 5F), whereas in root tissues P and N concentrations were lower in the presence of  
283 Cu (ca. 5.4 mg/g and 2.1 % for all Cu treatment of P and N respectively) respect to the  
284 control (Fig. 5D and 5F). A similar trend was recorded for K and Mg concentrations in  
285 roots, whereas their concentration in the leaf showed few differences respect to the  
286 control (Fig. 5C and 5E).

287

## 288 4. Discussion

289

290 The upper critical level of an element is the lowest concentration in tissues at which  
291 it has toxic effects (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias, 2001). Unlike some Cu tolerant plant  
292 species (metalophytes), in which Cu content in leaves can be as high as 1000 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup>  
293 (Marschner, 1999), the critical toxicity level of copper in leaves of *A. halimus* is 20 mg  
294 Kg<sup>-1</sup> to 30 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> dry matter (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias, 2001). In the present study,  
295 the Cu concentration in *A. halimus* tissues increased significantly with metal addition,  
296 the Cu concentration reaching values between 21 and 120 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> and between 114 and  
297 273 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> for shoots and roots, respectively, for plants treated with a range of Cu  
298 concentration from 2 to 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu. These values are much higher than those

299 suggested as normal in tissues and thus could be toxic for plants of *A. halimus*.

300 Copper toxicity thresholds of *A. halimus* were analysed in relation of its survival,  
301 growth, photosynthetic responses and Cu concentration pattern in tissues. Thus, on the  
302 basis of *A. halimus* survival, our results indicate that lethal concentration of copper  
303 (LC50, the metal concentration that kills 50% of plants) was between 15 and 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup>  
304 <sup>1</sup> Cu because no individuals were able to survive when subject to an Cu concentration of  
305 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> for the full 20 days. Paschke and Redente (2002) determined LC50 of  
306 copper for six grass species used in restoration activities in concentrations close to 5  
307 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu. On the other hand, in relation to biomass responses analyses, the effective  
308 concentration of Cu (EC50, substrate Cu concentration resulting in 50% biomass  
309 reduction) was more than 15 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu. At this concentration, *A. halimus* showed a  
310 37% of biomass reduction after 20 days of treatment. As for LC50, the value of EC50 of  
311 *A. halimux* is considerably higher than those reported by several authors for many  
312 different species (Paschke and Redente, 2002), which indicates that *A. halimus* has a  
313 great capacity to grown in a copper contaminated medium. On the other hand, the  
314 analysis of Cu tissue concentration indicated that the phytotoxicity thresholds (PT50,  
315 tissue concentration of a plant resulting in 50% biomass reduction) were between 38-  
316 120 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> and between 200-270 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> for shoots and roots of *A. halimus*,  
317 respectively. Contrarily to the recorded for LC50 and EC50, this PT50 value is  
318 considerably lower than those reported for other species. Paschke and Redente (2002)  
319 indicated PT50-shoots as high as 737 mg Kg<sup>-1</sup> for slender wheatgrass and 10,792 mg  
320 Kg<sup>-1</sup> for redtop. Hence, the wide tolerance of *A. halimus* on the range of Cu  
321 concentration tested in this experiment is not reflected in its ability to accumulate and  
322 tolerate greater amounts of Cu in its tissues. This response was different to the reported  
323 previously by Lutts et al. (2004), who found that *A. halimus* is also tolerant to both Cd

324 and Zn, but contrarily to the Cu accumulation response; it may accumulate these  
325 elements in high amount in the aboveground tissues. These specific metal discrepancies  
326 could be attributed to different tolerance mechanisms. Several mechanisms have been  
327 suggested to account for metal tolerance in plants, such as metal sequestering in tissues  
328 or cellular compartments that are insensitive to metals. Restriction of upward movement  
329 into shoots (an avoidance mechanism) and translocation of excessive metals into old  
330 leaves shortly before their shedding can also be considered as tolerance mechanisms, as  
331 can the increase in metal-binding capacity of the cell wall (Verkleij and Schat, 1990).  
332 The analysis of Cu toxicity thresholds of *A. halimus* indicates that this species could be  
333 considered as a Cu-excluding plant, since, as had already been underlined by Wei et al.  
334 2005, it was able to survive and growth in high copper polluted medium, denoting a  
335 high Cu tolerance. However, Cu concentration in its aboveground was low, in spite of  
336 the elevated concentration in roots.

337         Despite the high Cu resistance demonstrated by *A. halimus*, the increase in Cu  
338 concentration in the medium affected the growth of this species. Compared to the  
339 control, the reduction in RGR with 2, 9, 15, 30 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu were 8, 21, 37 and 98%,  
340 respectively, and this response was apparent in total leaf area, which was associated  
341 with the reduction in the number of leaves and individual leaf area. Inhibition of growth  
342 and biomass reduction are general responses of higher plants to Cu excess (Kabata-  
343 Pendias and Pendias, 2001) and these effects are often the result of limitation in  
344 photosynthesis, mineral nutrition and water balance.

345         The photosynthetic apparatus is particularly susceptible to copper, resulting in a  
346 decrease in the activity of photosystem II and electron transfer rates (Mallick and Mohn,  
347 2003). The effects of Cu on AN and gs were very clear across the whole range of Cu  
348 concentrations, except in 2 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu, where AN values were similar to the control

349 treatment. The decreased in AN caused an overall decline in WUE, especially in the  
350 highest Cu concentration treatment. The decline of A may be ascribed to stomatal  
351 and/or non-stomatal limitations (Flexas and Medrano, 2002; Perez-Martin et al., 2009);  
352 thus, Cu stress can affect photosynthesis in terms of CO<sub>2</sub> fixation, electron transport,  
353 photophosphorylation and enzyme activities. Therefore, if the limitation of AN in *A.*  
354 *halimus* were due to gs, there should be a reduction in Ci. However, Ci increased with  
355 increasing Cu concentration. This increase of Ci may be explained by modifications of  
356 Rubisco activities of *A. halimus*, as has been previously described for *Spartina*  
357 *densiflora* in response to Cu stress (Mateos-Naranjo et al., 2008b). The inhibition in  
358 enzyme activity in the presence of heavy metals could be due to substitution of Mg in  
359 the active site of RuBisCO subunits by metal ions (Siedlecka and Krupa, 2004). Thus,  
360 we recorded an overall decline in tissue Mg concentration with the increase in Cu in the  
361 growth medium, especially in root tissues. The reduction in the absorption of essential  
362 mineral elements has been described as one of the effects of heavy metals on plants  
363 (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias, 2001). In this regard, we also reported that the presence  
364 of Cu affected the concentration of the macroelements, Na, K, Mg, this leading to  
365 dysfunctions and structural changes arising from the lack of these and other essential  
366 elements (P and N). For example, an excess of Cu inhibits the activity of phosphatase,  
367 thereby diminishing the availability of P (Tyler, 1976), and P concentration in *A.*  
368 *halimus* tissues. Lin and Wu (1994) found that in *Lotus purshianus*, an excess of Cu  
369 reduced the concentration of P in both root and leaf tissues. Our results likewise  
370 demonstrate adverse effects of Cu on N metabolism. In this respect, we observed a  
371 reduction in N concentration in leaves with the increase of Cu in nutrient solutions,  
372 which could be linked with a decrease in chlorophyll content. Brahin and Mohamed  
373 (2011) described a clear reduction of chlorophyll a and b content of *A. halimus* exposed

374 to medium copper concentration of 2 mM. The reduction in chlorophyll content of *A.*  
375 *halimus* could as well entail a decline in the photosynthetic function.

376 On the other hand, the decrease in AN could be due to the different effects of Cu  
377 on the integrity or function of the photochemical apparatus of *A. halimus*. Plants  
378 undergo light stress when they absorb more light than they can use in photosynthesis.  
379 This situation appears when light intensity rises excessively or when photosynthesis  
380 rates diminish due to adverse situations like drought, salinity, extreme temperatures or  
381 toxicity. Light stress leads to photoinhibition, thereby causing a reduction in the normal  
382 photosynthesis rate and damage in the photosynthetic apparatus. The reduction in  
383 Fv/Fm values at midday indicated that *A. halimus* experienced photoinhibition (dynamic  
384 photoinhibition) at the higher light flux. This photoinhibition was assumably triggered  
385 by a lower proportion of open reaction centres (lower values of Fm) resulting from a  
386 saturation of photosynthesis by light. Also,  $\Phi$ PSII decreased as a consequence of the  
387 decrease in qP and the increase in NPQ (up to 2.5 mmol l<sup>-1</sup>), which indicates that the  
388 plants dissipated light as heat. Increased thermal energy dissipation is considered a  
389 photoprotective mechanism that preserves photosynthetic reaction centers from light-  
390 induced damage (Maxwell and Johnson, 2000).

391 Furthermore, Fv/Fm and  $\Phi$ PSII were clearly affected by Cu stress in the three  
392 highest Cu concentration treatments at midday, this suggesting that Cu excess enhances  
393 photoinhibition induced by light stress. Our data showed that Fv/Fm values at dawn  
394 remained lower than control parameters for unstressed plants in all treatments except for  
395 2 and 9 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> Cu (Björkman and Demming, 1987), a consequence of the high  
396 chronic photoinhibition recorded in the treatments with the highest Cu concentrations.  
397 Photoinhibition is an important event that affects photosynthetic productivity and,  
398 therefore, plant growth (Melis, 1999).



399

## 400 **5. Conclusion**

401

402 Our data suggest that *A. halimus* is Cu-resistant plant, since all plants were able to  
403 survive at concentrations greater than  $15 \text{ mmol l}^{-1}$ , but metal concentration achieved in  
404 plant tissues were generally kept at low levels. Thus, there were clear phytotoxicity  
405 symptoms at Cu tissue concentration greater than  $38 \text{ mg Kg}^{-1}$ . In this sense, the addition  
406 of Cu to the nutrient solution affected the growth of *A. halimus*. Differences in growth  
407 rates over the range of Cu studied can be largely accounted for by effects on net  
408 photosynthesis; Cu has a marked effect on the photochemical (PSII) apparatus, as well  
409 as on water balance and on the absorption of essential mineral nutrients. Therefore, the  
410 high resistance of *A. halimus* was largely related with the capacity of this species to  
411 avoid the absorption of great amounts of Cu in its tissues. This capacity renders *A.*  
412 *halimus* a species with the basic characteristics of a Cu-exclusion plant. This Cu-  
413 exclusion condition should reduce health risks, for Cu concentration in plant  
414 aboveground tissues that did not affect yield ( $< 38 \text{ ppm}$ ) was lower than the maximum  
415 tolerable level of 40 ppm of copper (MTL; the maximum dietary level of a specific  
416 mineral that will not cause any adverse effects when fed for a specific period of time on  
417 a animal) stabilised for NRC (2005). On the other hand, our results have great interest  
418 for Cu remediation purposes, since if Cu-excluding mechanisms of *A. halimus* could be  
419 discovered and metal-excluding genes could be transplanted to crops, it would be highly  
420 useful for the safety of agricultural products in copper contaminated areas.

421

422

423 **Acknowledgements**

424 We are grateful to Antonio J. Ruiz Rico for revision of the English text of this  
425 manuscript, Antonio Diaz-Espejo for facilitating the Li-Cor 6400 and the fluorimeter  
426 and to Seville University Glasshouse General Services for their collaboration. We also  
427 thank the Camara foundation of Seville (PhD formation, programme), and the Spanish  
428 Environmental and Science and Technology Ministries for their support (project  
429 042/2007 Organismo Autónomo Parques Nacionales and project CTM2008-04453).

430

431 **References**

- 432 Andrade, L.R., Farina, M., Filho, A.M.G., 2004. Effects of copper on *Enteromorpha*  
433 *flexuosa* (Chlorophyta) in vitro. *Ecotox. Environ. Saf.* 58,117-125.
- 434 Bajji, M., Kinet, J.M., Lutts, S., 1998. Salt stress effects on roots and leaves of *Atriplex*  
435 *halimus* L., and their corresponding callus cultures. *Plant Sci.* 137,131-142.
- 436 Brahin, L., Mohamed, M., 2011. Effects of copper stress on antioxidative enzymes,  
437 chlorophyll and protein content in *Atriplex halimus*. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* 10,10143-  
438 10148.
- 439 Björkman, O., Demming, B., 1987. Photon yield of O<sub>2</sub> evolution and chlorophyll  
440 fluorescence characteristics at 77K among vascular plants of diverse origins. *Planta*  
441 170,489-504.
- 442 Dewez, D., Geoffroy, L., Vernet, G., Popovic, R., 2005. Determination of photosynthetic  
443 and enzymatic biomarkers sensitivity used to evaluate toxic effects of copper and  
444 fludioxonil in alga *Scenedesmus obliquus*. *Aquat. Toxicol.* 74,150-159.
- 445 Elbaz-Poulichet, F., Morley, N.H., Cruzado, A., Velasquez, Z., Achterberg, E.P.,  
446 Braungardt, C.B., 1999. Trace metal and nutrient distribution in an extremely low  
447 pH (2.5) river-estuarine system, the Ria of Huelva (South-West Spain). *Sci. Total*  
448 *Environ.* 227, 73-83.
- 449 Flexas, J., Medrano, H., 2002. Drought-inhibition of photosynthesis in C-3 plants:  
450 Stomatal and non-stomatal limitations revisited. *Ann Bot-London* 89,183-189.
- 451 Hoagland, D., Arnon, D.I., 1938. The water culture method for growing plants without  
452 soil. *California Agric. Exp. Station Bull.* 347,1-39.
- 453 Kabata-Pendias, A., Pendias, H. 2001. Trace elements in soils and plants. CRC Press,  
454 Boca Ratón, Florida.

455 Lin, S.L., Wu, L., 1994. Effect of copper concentration on mineral nutrient uptake and  
456 copper accumulation in protein of copper-tolerant and non-tolerant *Lotus*  
457 *purshianus* L. *Ecotox. Environ. Saf.* 29, 214-228.

458 Lutts, S., Lefèvre, I., Délerée, C., Kivits, S., Dechamps, C., Robledo, A., Correal, E.,  
459 2004. Heavy metals accumulation by the halophyte species Mediterranean  
460 Saltbush. *J. Environ. Qual.* 33, 1271-1279.

461 Mallick, N., Mohn, F.H., 2003. Use of chlorophyll fluorescence in metal-stress  
462 research: a case of study with the green microalga *Scenedesmus*. *Ecotox. Environ.*  
463 *Saf.* 55, 64-69.

464 Manousaki, E., Kalogerakis, N., 2009. Phytoextraction of Pb and Cd by the  
465 Mediterranean saltbush (*Atriplex halimus* L.): metal uptake in relation to salinity.  
466 *Environ. Sci. Pollut. R.* 16, 844-854.

467 Marschner, H., 1999. *Mineral Nutrition in Higher Plants*. Academic Press, Harcourt B,  
468 Company Publishers, London.

469 Martínez, J.P., Kinet, J.M., Bajji, M., Lutts, S., 2005. NaCl alleviates polyethylene  
470 glycol-induced water stress in the halophyte species *Atriplex halimus* L. *J. Exp.*  
471 *Bot.* 56, 2421-2431.

472 Mateos-Naranjo, E., Redono-Gómez, S., Cambrollé, J., Luque, T., Figueroa, M.E.,  
473 2008a. Growth and photosynthetic responses to zinc stress of an invasive  
474 cordgrass, *Spartina densiflora*. *Plant Biol.* 10, 754-762.

475 Mateos-Naranjo, E., Redondo-Gómez, S., Cambrollé, J., Figueroa, M.E., 2008b.  
476 Growth and photosynthetic responses to copper stress of an invasive cordgrass,  
477 *Spartina densiflora*. *Mar. Environ. Res.* 66, 459- 465.

478 Maxwell, K., Johnson, G.N., 2000. Chlorophyll fluorescence- a practical guide. *J. Exp.*  
479 *Bot.* 51, 659-668.

480 Melis, A., 1999. Photosystem-II damage and repair cycle in chloroplasts: what  
481 modulates the rate of photodamage in vivo?. Trends Plant Sci. 4, 130-135.

482 Nalewajko, C., Olaveson, M.M., 1995. Differential responses of growth, photosynthetic,  
483 respiration and phosphate uptake to copper in copper-tolerant and copper-intolerant  
484 strains of *Scenedesmus acutus* (Chlorophyceae). Can. J. Bot. 73, 1295-1303.

485 Nedjimi, B., Youcef, D., 2009. Cadmium accumulation in *Atriplex halimus* subsp.  
486 *schweinfurthii* and its influence on growth, proline, root hydraulic conductivity and  
487 nutrient uptake. Flora 204, 316-324.

488 NRC (National Research Council) 2005. Mineral tolerance of animals. National  
489 Academies Press, Washington DC.

490 Otal, J., Orengo, J., Quiles, A., Hevia, M.L., Fuentes, F., 2010. Characterization of  
491 edible biomass of *Atriplex halimus* L. and its effect on feed and water intakes, and  
492 on blood mineral profile in non-pregnant Manchega-breed sheep. Small Ruminant  
493 Res. 91, 208-214.

494 Paschke, M.W., Redente, E.F., 2002. Copper toxicity thresholds for important  
495 restoration grass species of the western United States. Environ. Toxicol. and Chem.  
496 21, 2692-2697.

497 Perez-Martin, A., Flexas, J., Ribas-Carbó, M., Bota, J., Tomás, M., Infante, J.M., Diaz-  
498 Espejo, A., 2009. Interactive effects of soil water deficit and air vapour pressure  
499 deficit on mesophyll conductance to CO<sub>2</sub> in *Vitis vinifera* and *Olea europaea*. J.  
500 Exp. Bot. 60, 2391-2405.

501 Sáinz, A., Grande, J.A., De la Torre, M.L., Sánchez-Rodas, D., 2002. Characterization  
502 of sequential leachate discharge of mining waste rock dumps in the Tinto and  
503 Odiel rivers. J. Environ. Manage. 64, 345-353.

504 Sharma, P., Dubey, R.S., 2005. Lead toxicity in plants. Braz. J. Plant Physiol. 17, 35-52,

505 Siedlecka, A., Krupa, Z., 2004. Rubisco activity maintenance in environmental stress  
506 conditions-how many strategies. *Cell Mol. Biol. Lett.* 9, 56-57.

507 Streb, P., Tel-Or, E., Feierabend, J., 1997. Light stress effects and antioxidative  
508 protection in two desert plants. *Ecological Soc. Functional Ecol.* 11, 416-424.

509 Tyler, G., 1976. Heavy metals pollution, phosphatase activity and mineralization of  
510 organic phosphorus in forest soil. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 8, 327-332.

511 Verkleij, J.A., Schat, H., 1990. Mechanism of metal tolerance in higher plants. In:  
512 Shaw, A.J., (Ed.), *Heavy metal tolerance in plants: evolutionary aspects.* CRC  
513 Press, Boca Raton, Florida, pp, 179-194.

514 Von Caemmerer, S., Farquhar, G.D., 1981. Some relationships between the  
515 biochemistry of photosynthesis and the gas exchange of leaves. *Planta* 153, 377-  
516 387.

517 Wei, S., Zhou, Q., Wang, X., 2005. Identification of weed plants excluding the uptake  
518 of heavy metals. *Environ. Int.* 31, 829-834.

519 Werner, C., Correia, O., Beyschlag, W., 2002. Characteristic patterns of chronic and  
520 dynamic photoinhibition of different functional groups in a Mediterranean  
521 ecosystem. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 29, 999-1011.

522

523

524 **Fig. 1.** Growth analysis of *Atriplex halimus* in response to treatment with a range of Cu  
525 concentrations over 20 d. Total dry mass (above- and belowground biomass) (A),  
526 relative growth rate, RGR (B), total leaf area (C) and individual leaf area. Values  
527 represent mean  $\pm$ SE, n = 6. Different letters indicate means that are significantly  
528 different from each other (Tukey test,  $p < 0.05$ ).

529

530 **Fig. 2.** Net photosynthetic rate, AN (A), stomatal conductance,  $g_s$  (B), intercellular CO<sub>2</sub>  
531 concentration,  $C_i$  (C) and water use efficiency, WUE (D) in randomly selected, fully  
532 expanded leaves of *Atriplex halimus* in response to treatment with a range of Cu  
533 concentrations over 20 d. Values represent mean  $\pm$ SE, n = 12. Different letters indicate  
534 means that are significantly different from each other (Tukey test,  $p < 0.05$ ).

535

536 **Fig. 3.** Maximum quantum efficiency of PSII photochemistry,  $F_v/F_m$  (A), quantum  
537 efficiency of PSII,  $\Phi_{PSII}$  (B) and non-photochemical quenching (C) at midday (●) and at  
538 dawn (○) in randomly selected, fully expanded leaves of *Atriplex halimus* in response to  
539 treatment with a range of Cu concentrations over 20 d. Values represent mean  $\pm$ SE, n =  
540 10. Different letters indicate means that are significantly different from each other  
541 (Tukey test,  $p < 0.05$ ).

542

543 **Fig. 4.** Total, chronic and dynamic photoinhibition in randomly selected, fully expanded  
544 leaves of *Atriplex halimus* in response to treatment with a range of Cu concentration  
545 over 20 d. Values represent mean  $\pm$ SE, n = 10. Different letters indicate means that are  
546 significantly different from each other (Tukey test,  $p < 0.05$ ).

547

548 **Fig. 5.** Total copper, Cu (A), total sodium, Na (B), total potassium, K (C), total  
549 phosphorous, P (D), total magnesium, (E) and total nitrogen (F) concentrations for  
550 above- (○), and belowground biomass (●) of *Atriplex halimus* in response to treatment  
551 with a range of Cu concentrations over 20 d. Values represent mean, n = 6. Different  
552 letters indicate means that are significantly different from each other (Tukey test,  $p <$   
553 0.05).