

Teaching music, learning culture:

The challenge of culturally responsive music
education

Tracy Rohan

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Music) at the
University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand.

April 2011

Abstract

This research investigates experiences of music teaching and learning within culturally diverse school communities and examines the ways cultural diversity informs pedagogical practices in music education. The following key questions were investigated: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity? What barriers to culturally responsive and inclusive music education are identified? What do students and teachers believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme? The project used a collective case study methodology and sought perspectives from teachers and students within high schools in New Zealand, Australia and the United States, each selected for participation based on its reputation for offering successful music education practice within a culturally diverse school community. The principal conclusions are that while most of the teacher participants articulated positive views regarding cultural diversity, as well as a belief that pedagogical decisions should not privilege Western musics or musicianship, student perceptions reflected a limited understanding of the global diversity of musical expression and experience. Most students expressed interest in participating in more inclusive, culturally diverse music education programmes. Key barriers identified by students and teachers to a more inclusive and informed educational response to cultural diversity were: assessment requirements, the limiting nature of school choral and instrumental ensembles, performance schedules, festivals and competitions, the conservative nature of teacher education experience for some teachers, lack of resources and professional development. The implications of the research findings are that music educators need to foster a more critical approach that includes some explicit teaching of culturally inclusive values, operationalised through culturally informed and responsive pedagogical practices.

Acknowledgements

Grateful thanks go to the following people who have contributed to the successful completion of this project.

Bruce and Chloe Cull
Professor John Drummond
Professor Henry Johnson
Professor Patricia Campbell
Associate Professor Rita Klinger
Associate Professor Peter Dunbar-Hall
The University of Otago Research Committee.

Most particularly, my gratitude goes to the teacher and student participants in New Zealand, Australia and America who shared their views with such interest, enthusiasm and generosity. I wish them all the best for future music teaching, making and sharing.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	iii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
Research Questions.....	1
Terms and Definitions	5
Chapter 2 Literature Review.....	9
Introduction.....	9
Culturally Responsive Music Education	11
Pedagogical Issues	24
Authenticity of Music Examples, Setting, and Transmission Methods.....	39
Student Perspectives	49
Teacher Perspectives	56
Chapter 3 Methodology.....	69
Introduction.....	69
Theoretical Framework.....	69
Research Methods and Procedures	73
Validity and Generalisability	81
Ethical Considerations	83
Chapter 4 New Zealand Case Study	84
Auckland, New Zealand	84
Overview of the Context of High School Music Education in New Zealand	84
About the Schools.....	94
Student Biographies.....	95
Teacher Biographies	102
Results of Interviews with New Zealand Students.....	107
Results of Interviews with New Zealand Teachers	127
Key Themes	144
Discussion.....	150
Implications	156
Chapter 5 Australian Case Study.....	159
Sydney, New South Wales	159
Overview of the Context of High School Music Education in Sydney, Australia	159
About the Schools.....	164
Student Biographies.....	165

Teacher Biographies	172
Results of Interviews with Sydney Teachers.....	191
Key Themes	207
Discussion.....	211
Implications	216
Chapter 6 American Case Study	223
Seattle and Cleveland, USA	223
Overview of the Context of High School Music Education in North America.....	223
About the Schools.....	230
Student Biographies.....	231
Teacher Biographies	240
Results of Interviews with American Students.....	244
Results of Interviews with American Teachers	261
Key Themes	275
Discussion.....	280
Implications	286
Chapter 7 Conclusion	289
Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?	291
Question 2: What barriers to culturally responsive and inclusive music education are identified?	293
Question 3: What do students and teachers believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?	296
Reflection and Recommendations	299
Bibliography	308
Appendix A: Method and Ethics.....	320
i) Data Analysis	321
ii) Consent Form.....	322
iii) Sample Letter to School Principal	323
iv) Information Sheet for Participants	325
v) Interview Guide for Student Participants.....	327
vi) Interview Guidelines for Teacher Participants.....	328
Appendix B: Interview Analyses	329
i) Analysis of Interview-Elizabeth (Teacher New Zealand School B).....	330
ii) Analysis of Interview- Anna (Teacher Sydney School A).....	356

iv) Analysis of Interview- Caroline (Teacher Seattle School B).....	412
v) Analysis of Interview: Silesi (Student New Zealand School A).....	439
v) Analysis of Interview- Christos (Student Sydney School C).....	454
vi) Analysis of Interview: Mathew (Student Seattle School B)	478

Chapter 1 Introduction

This research investigates experiences of music teaching and learning within culturally diverse school communities. Central to this is an examination of the ways cultural diversity informs teacher practice in music education. Research evidence suggests that quality music education taught by culturally informed and responsive teachers is a key ingredient in enhancing the well-being, motivation, sense of belonging, and overall achievement of students (Bishop and Berryman, 2006; Gay, 2000; Green, 2001; Ladson-Billings, 1994; Campbell, 1993; Stalhammer, 2000; Villegas and Lucas, 2002)

Research Questions

The project investigates the following key questions in relation to culturally diverse school communities:

- 1. In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?**
- 2. What barriers to culturally responsive and inclusive music education are identified?**
- 3. What do students and teachers believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?**

Schools have been selected for participation in this study based on reputations for successful music education practice within a culturally diverse school community. A critical theory orientation to the study provides a lens through which to examine participant perspectives. While perceptions of successful practice will be shared, possible gaps and biases within curriculum content and pedagogy will also be identified and described. The

project uses a collective case study methodology and seeks perspectives from teachers and students within secondary¹ schools in New Zealand, Australia and the United States.

It is hoped that the conclusions of the study may be used to enhance the quality and responsiveness of music education programmes, creating stronger links between music programme content, pedagogy, the cultural knowledge and multiple musical identities of students in schools, and the rich musical diversity of the wider world. This project fits with a broad programme of research being carried out currently by researchers responding to goals and strategies set by the International Music Council in 2001, and further developed in a report conducted by the Council, and commissioned by UNESCO (Letts, 2006). These goals and strategies are aimed at sustaining and enhancing musical diversity at local and global levels. Goals relevant to this study include:

- To empower and assist music educators in all cultures to celebrate the musics of their own cultures as well as musical diversity;
- To influence, inspire and assist governments to promote musical diversity in designing and implementing their cultural and educational policies.

Strategies for the achievement of the goals, relevant to this study, include:

- Through the production and dissemination of examples of ideal conditions and best practices regarding issues related to musical diversity.

¹ High school

- Through active and targeted participation at conferences, meetings and other gatherings where cultural and educational policies are on the agenda.

Motivation for the project has come from the ongoing concerns of my professional work over the past fifteen years within teacher education; as a lecturer in Music Education, Education Studies, as a music advisor to schools, and developer of resources to support generalist music teachers. More recently, motivation has come from participation in CDIME (Cultural Diversity in Music Education) conferences. These conferences have provided an opportunity to establish networks with other interested researchers and teachers and to participate in conversations on this and other related topics. Expert advisors for the present project were identified at these conferences. Their generosity, approachability and interest in the project were greatly appreciated.

This project adds to research which aims to share examples of effective practice in music education. It also adds to our understandings of the needs, interests and aspirations of diverse students as well as aspects of music education practice that would benefit from a fresh pedagogical vision in response to the reality of cultural diversity. Added to this is the increasing realization among researchers and educators that music education cannot continue to tell only one story in a world of many musics, by the ongoing privileging of Western ways of knowing about and making music.

The voices of students are viewed in this study as a rich source of insight into the rewards and challenges of music education practice as it is experienced by the learner. For this study the student participants are all of an age to have chosen music as an elective subject.

They are young musicians with diverse family backgrounds, personal music-making histories, and identification with aspects of youth culture that have influenced their choice to study music. Teachers' views highlight issues related to personal biography, teacher education, community expectations, pedagogical processes and requirements that shape music teaching practice and policy. Teachers have views about student engagement, expectations and abilities, and perceive students to be benefiting from music education in particular ways. Students appraise teachers' abilities to understand and respond to their particular needs and interests. As Jorgensen states, both groups share a love of music and learn from each other in the music classroom.

Students come with already formed musical perspectives, and these need to be taken seriously, listened to, challenged, and validated because the musical beliefs and practices constitute a part of self. The teacher is anxious to enlarge learners' horizons, to show them what is not readily accessible to them and how to approach disparate musics beyond those with which they have already identified. On the other hand, the student has much to contribute to the teacher's understanding. Both are conversation partners, fellow travelers on the path to wisdom (Jorgensen, 2003, p. 122).

School-based research such as this project relies on the goodwill and trust of teachers and students. Researchers need to work to build reciprocal, collegial relationships with practitioners based on shared goals and vision. Trust is vital if teachers are to have open doors and open minds when researchers seek participants within the world of the classroom. Research that exposes teacher inadequacies may be viewed as exploitative and lacking in a sense of educational 'team spirit'. This research will highlight gaps and biases in teacher practice, but with a sense of optimism and a shared will to improve aspects of practice for the benefit of all, by building on the good practice and excellent intentions that are clearly in evidence in the selected schools. The project will describe, interpret, and suggest, but not expose and criticize. The findings are underpinned by a strong admiration

for the work of the teacher participants, all of whom express a love of their work, of their students and of music making and sharing. The findings are also underpinned by delight in the directness and thoughtfulness of the student participants. It has been a pleasure to talk with young people about their music related passions and aspirations.

Folkestad (2005) describes the importance of ongoing discussion between researchers and practitioners.

... the role of the latter (researchers) is not to 'produce' teaching methods, but to deliver research results to the praxis field, results by means of which the professional teachers may plan, conduct and evaluate their music teaching. An important strand in this relationship between researchers and practitioners, and with the rest of the surrounding society, is the mutually shared need of a continuous dialogue... (p. 24).

This is a challenge for those researching in the field of education, to be useful to practitioners without being constrained by requirements for the results to be acceptable, immediately accessible, and practically applicable to the classroom practitioner and the demands of the school setting. For researchers working within a critical theoretical framework, usefulness has to be compatible with the sharing of a broader vision of transforming possibilities, and the need to challenge hegemonic assumptions that may be limiting the scope of music education experience or serving to marginalize some groups within the student community.

Terms and Definitions

Multicultural, world, global, non-Western, cross-, inter-, or trans-cultural music education are all names for music education programmes that attempt to value, include and be informed by diverse cultures and musics. Each title communicates its own baggage of

social and educational policy and politics. For example, with regard to the term 'multicultural' Dunbar-Hall argues that while the intention of multicultural policy is the acknowledgement in theory of the equality of all cultures in society, the application of such thinking has been limited and superficial (2005, p. 34).

The debate over terminology has a lengthy history to it. In 1995 Bor debated the use of the term 'world music' and developed a definition that takes into account world-wide access to music and cross-cultural participation in music making practices.

However meaningless, trendy and ambiguous the term "world music" may seem, it describes the phenomenon whereby today musicians from all over the world can be heard all over the world. And what is perhaps more important, they have begun to exchange ideas and have created a number of highly intriguing and successful musical fusions (p. 62).

Ethnomusicologist Philip Bohlman describes efforts to define 'world' music in the 21st century as impossible without "slipping down a tautological slope" (2002, p. xi).

World music can be folk music, art music, or popular music; its practitioners may be amateur or professional. World music may be sacred, secular, or commercial... The old definitions and distinctions don't hold anymore; world music can be Western or non-Western, acoustic, or electronically mixed. The world of world music has no boundaries, therefore access to world music is open to all. There's ample justification to call just about anything world music (2002, p. xi).

Kwami (1998) objected to use of the term non-Western, and as well as discussing the limitations of the use of 'ethnic' and 'world' has also spoken of the difficulty of finding an accurate term to describe culturally diverse musics.

The term 'non-Western' conceptualizes others in negative terms, by implication the others do not belong. As I have argued elsewhere (Kwami 1993, 1996), the 'ethnic' label is unacceptable in educational contexts, whilst 'world musics' omits the so-called Western 'classical' tradition (p. 161).

With regard to the term ‘world’ music, Green (2001) comments on its absurdity, but unavailability, due to the fact that it is in general lay person usage (p. 3). However, Campbell (2004) recommends that the music community ‘moves on’ from the use of the term ‘world music’ preferring, instead, the term ‘global music’ to encompass “the study of music as it flourishes in some places in the globalized contemporary world- whether that music springs from a particular long tradition or results from global interaction” (p. 130). However, in other parts of the present project the terms ‘multicultural’ and ‘culturally diverse’ music are used with particular reference to those writing in the area of critical multiculturalism (Hambel, 2005, Bradley, 2008)

Like Dunbar-Hall, Bradley (2008) describes the problems associated with ‘multiculturalism’ as a term to describe official policies of cultural diversity promotion. According to Bradley, official multiculturalism has resulted in stereotypes, tokenism, and superficial descriptions of cultural difference, focusing on aspects such as festivals and food. In schools within the United States, such policies have lead to curriculum guidelines characterized by “heritage days,” and “black history month” (p. 2). However, Bradley believes that ‘multiculturalism’ has the potential to move beyond the kind of ‘cultural tourism’ approaches that are typical of multicultural policies and studies.

Multiculturalism is not just about expanding individual horizons or increasing personal intercultural skills; it is part of a larger project of justice and equality that demands we continue to make apparent to our students the power relations and racial coding embedded within music education practices, including multiculturalism (2006, p. 24).

Like Campbell, Bradley prefers the term ‘global’ as a way to describe “the varied musical practices of peoples and cultures from around the world” (Bradley, 2008, p. 5).

The ways that such terms are interrogated is dependent on the discipline that underpins or frames the viewpoint of the writer. Most of the literature referred to in the present research uses the terms in the context of music education research or commentary, rather than, for example, ethnomusicology, however, some, such as Patricia Campbell and Peter Dunbar-Hall, work across these fields. For comprehensive critical discussion of labels in the field of culturally diverse music education it would be sensible to read Schippers (2005, 2010). Most helpfully, Schippers suggests a framework for descriptive analysis of approaches to cultural diversity, which can be usefully applied to music education. This framework distinguishes between:

... **monocultural** approaches, in which the dominant culture is the only reference; **multicultural** approaches, where plurality is acknowledged but no contact or exchange is stimulated; **intercultural** approaches which are characterised by loose contact between cultures and some effort towards mutual understanding; and **transcultural** approaches, which represent an in-depth exchange of ideas and values (2005, p. 29).

For the purposes of the interviews in this research, the term ‘world music’ was used when it was clear that this was a familiar and meaningful term for the participants. In most interviews it was commonly understood by teachers and students to mean music other than Western classical or pop music. It was necessary to communicate with the interview participants in ways where the intent was understood and where my intentions were not to correct the participants for their use of terms, the implications of which they had not previously considered. When the term ‘non-Western’ is used in this research it has been chosen carefully to indicate musics other than the Western canon of art music or contemporary musics. Apart from the interviews the phrase ‘culturally diverse musics’ is used. When other terms are used, such as ‘global music’ it is in the context of the discussion of particular literature where that phrase is used by the author.

Chapter 2 Literature Review

Introduction

There is current wide-spread debate about the benefits and challenges of music education that is responsive to and informed by cultural diversity. Cultural diversity within this debate refers to both the diversity of the musical content of music education programmes and the performance repertoire of school choirs and instrumental ensembles, as well as to the ethnic diversity of the student participants. This debate typically addresses the following questions, among others: Why should we teach music from culturally diverse perspectives? Should music education be informed by the cultural heritages and ethnic identities of the students in the classroom, and the wider school community? Is it relevant or desirable to try to match music content with the ethnicities represented in the classroom? What is the relationship between ethnicity and musical identity? Is the classroom a valid setting for the teaching of diverse musics? Who is qualified to teach diverse musics? What dispositions, understandings, and support do they need? Should culture bearers from the community be invited in to teach such musics? If so, what challenges are associated with this? Should classroom teachers try to replicate the transmission methods of the peoples who made the music? Might Western learners be disadvantaged by the introduction of unfamiliar pedagogical approaches? What should we teach? How do we evaluate the authenticity or appropriateness of the musical examples we use in the classroom? If ‘multicultural’ music education only forms a small part of the music education experience, is it undermined or negated by the rest? (Drummond, 2005;

Dunbar-Hall, 2005; Folkestad, 2005; Johnson, 2000; Kwami, 1998, 2001; Robinson, 2010; Schippers, 1996, 2005, 2010; Wiggins, 2005).

This literature review examines literature that debates these and other issues, the understanding of which is central to the informed analysis of findings from the present project. The literature has been grouped in the following areas:

- **Culturally responsive and informed music education:** What is it? Why is it important? Who benefits from it? What are the philosophical and theoretical underpinnings of culturally responsive approaches? What are the challenges and barriers?
- **Pedagogical issues:** How can teachers teach in more culturally responsive ways? How do they address issues such as authenticity, context, community involvement and expectations? How do they manage assessment, performance, competition requirements and expectations within a framework of cultural diversity?
- **Teacher perceptions:** What do teachers think about music teaching within culturally diverse communities? What do they think are the key components for successful music education and does this perception fit with notions of culturally responsive teaching?
- **Student perceptions:** What do students think about the music education they are participating in, when considered from culturally diverse perspectives? How does music education respond to and facilitate the development of student identities?

Culturally Responsive Music Education

This section reviews literature that debates justifications for teaching music in culturally responsive, inclusive and informed ways. Much of this literature is underpinned by a critical theoretical viewpoint, including ‘critical multiculturalism’ and a ‘critical pedagogy’ of music teaching.

Among those who write about the benefits of culturally responsive music education there are those who emphasise extra-musical benefits, particularly with regard to the promotion of social justice in education. This body of writing fits broadly into the field of critical multicultural education, underpinned by a critical theoretical perspective (Bradley 2006, 2007, 2008; Hambel, 2005).

Australian researcher Hambel (2005) describes the evolution of multicultural education, from the failed and problematic policies of the 1970s towards a critical, transformative theory of education, referred to as ‘critical multiculturalism’. According to Hambel, this evolution is evident within Australian and American research in this field, if not yet visible within classroom practice, education policy or curriculum documentation. Building on the work of other critical multicultural theorists, such as Australian researchers, Kalantzis and Cope, and American researchers, Banks, Nieto, and Sleeter and Grant, Hambel writes of the importance of transforming education so that students and teachers engage in critical dialogue and action, challenging racism and inequality (p. 55).

Music education researchers whose work is underpinned by critical multiculturalism promote approaches to music education that challenge inequities and value diversity and

multiple perspectives. They examine music education through a critical theoretical lens, calling for a transformation of music education practices in order to create something that is more ethical, equitable, and socially just (Abrahams 2004, 2005, Baxter, 2007; Bradley, 2007; Mansfield, 2002; Jorgensen, 2007; Reimer, 2007; Regelski, 1998). These writers locate music education within wider societal concerns, in particular, equity issues associated with gender, ability, ethnicity and socio-economics.

Critical theory envisions a process of critique that is self-conscious, leading participants to develop a discourse of social transformation and emancipation. In this vein, critical theory raises our consciousness beyond the walls of the classroom and the boundaries of the school to broader social and cultural concerns. These broad social and cultural concerns connect well to education in general and for music education in particular (Abrahams, 2004, p. 45).

According to Thomas Regelski (1998), the co-founder of the MayDay Group which aims to apply critical theory to music education practices, a critical theoretical view of music education “provides the means for problematising, or seeing as problematic in newly transformed ways, many aspects of music education that are usually taken for granted as good or good enough” (p. 12). Critical theorists, such as Regelski, challenge the status quo, warning against an unthinking wide acceptance of ideological views or positions. According to Regelski, a critical lens should be applied to all aspects of music education that are or have the potential to become a privileged or hegemonic approach to content or pedagogy, including ‘multiculturalism’ itself.

For example, until recently public school music education consisted of an orthodox and doctrinaire advocacy of Western European art music. The challenge to this ideology of what music is and is good for has important consequences that, unfortunately, are not being pursued. Sadly, multiculturalism has become the kind of bandwagon that already shows signs of being an ideology (p. 7).

Researchers in this field believe that music education cannot hide from issues regarding culture and diversity that are becoming so important in wider education fields, and must face up to challenges that effect humanity at local and global levels (Jorgensen, 2007). For many of these researchers the music classroom is seen as the ideal site to confront such issues. Peter Dunbar-Hall (2005) advocates a cultural studies pedagogical approach, while acknowledging that many music educators may not be comfortable with the political debate that can be the consequence this. However, such an approach "...brings the music curriculum closer to the realities of everyday life - realities that involve poverty, ownership, and social justice (p. 34). While theoretical and more applied literature in this area is growing, there is an identified need for further research to examine music education practices through a critical theory lens, particularly within the field of culturally diverse music education (Butler, Lind & McKoy, 2007).

Music is characterised by some as being a very powerful tool for the development of identities and music education is, therefore, considered to be a key process for the socialisation of individuals and the shaping of social values and attitudes. For example, Greene (1995) has spoken of the power of the arts to develop social imagination. Through artistic experience people may develop a sense of what it means to be the 'other', developing empathy and understanding.

...imagination is what makes empathy possible. It is what enables us to cross the empty spaces between ourselves and those we teachers have called "other" over the years. If those others are willing to give us clues, we can look in some manner through strangers' eyes and hear through their ears (Greene, 1995, p. 3).

Bennett Reimer's work in this area proposes a link between artistic experience and the advancement of 'moral' behaviour (2007). He describes the concepts of equity and justice as socially constructed inventions of the human imagination. By using this logic, he claims, as does Greene, that there is a link between the quality of artistic experience and the development of an empathic understanding of the lives of others. Reimer counters arguments that music education and politics do not usefully belong together, and that music education should simply focus on musical skill and knowledge building, removed from any socio-political agenda. He also confronts the idea that it is unreasonable for teachers to be expected to take on social justice goals or activities when music teaching time and resources are already so constrained. Reimer argues instead that: "The two goals - advancing musical fulfilments, and advancing positive social/moral values are not in opposition. They are mutually reinforcing" (Reimer, 2007, p. 203). Like other writers Reimer sees music as being in a unique position to contribute to education framed by the ideals of social justice and acknowledges a continuum of approaches to balancing musical and moral learning. However, the socially constructed nature of 'moral behaviour' itself, and the ownership of the values that artistic experience is said to foster remains unquestioned in Reimer's work and much of the literature in this area. The nature of 'positive social/moral values' is assumed to be universally aligned with the largely white, Western, middle-class academic view.

An approach to music education that pays attention to unequal power relationships and the socially and politically constructed nature of educational systems, content and pedagogy is described by Abrahams (2004, 2005) and Schmidt (2005) as a critical pedagogical approach. This approach requires teachers to confront the traditional practices of music

education and the cultural values that underpin these. Also with this goal in mind, New Zealand researcher Janet Mansfield (2002) proposes the ‘differencing’ of music education. She is concerned about the privileged position of the Western musical canon and the associated ‘rules’ and concepts of music making. According to Mansfield, music education that is underpinned by an “aesthetics of difference” (p. 190) would allow the repositioning of previously marginalised or excluded musics and would challenge Western values regarding musical definition and meaning.

To acknowledge the diverse narratives of history and location in the construction of the curriculum might disturb the central ideological assumptions underpinning current and past practice in music education (p. 190).

Similarly, the concept of the ‘decolonized’ curriculum is an important central idea for those confronting the marginalization of groups within education, the privileging of Western ways of knowing, and in particular, educational practices that disadvantage or alienate indigenous peoples (Bradley, 2006, Mansfield, 2002, 2007, Smith, 1999). Bradley (2006) argues that “a great deal of thought in music education remains under the influence of lingering colonialism...” (p. 2). She calls for open discussion of racism in education, while acknowledging the discomfort that this may cause (p. 6). According to Bradley, the process of decolonisation involves the analysis of the ongoing influences of colonial practices on thinking and communication within music disciplines. This also involves confronting issues to do with whiteness, which holds a centred societal position, somehow beyond description, considered normal, ordinary, and not ‘other’. Notions of “whiteness” as a standard against which ‘the other’ is positioned, can be seen at the core of the normative, hegemonic position held by Western musics in the curriculum, and the Western musical lens used to appraise the music of ‘the other’. According to Bradley, an

analysis of the colonial legacy in music education would identify ways that discourse about music "...denigrates particular musical practices while elevating others" (p. 10). Bradley highlights the need for reflection on both the motivation for and outcomes of multicultural music education practices. Motivation for 'multicultural music education' may stem from a 'white' need to atone for past sins, and may only result in bringing the music of the 'other' in from the cold, to the warmth of Western institutions. In the context of these institutions, music educators may "...attempt to understand indigenous musical cultures through sometimes narrowly defined Western referents..." (p. 12). Bradley also discusses the danger of commodifying the non-Western repertoire for the purpose of adding "colour" to a musical performance in order to meet multicultural policy agendas. Bradley's ultimate goal is to eliminate racism from cultural thought and practices as they are evidenced in music education. The first step towards this is the acknowledgement of the assumptions that underpin educational discourse and practice, traced to colonial values. So, asks Bradley, how can teachers create environments that support student critique of race and privilege? A particularly helpful aspect of Bradley's work is the identification of some key dispositions that need to be developed in students and teachers if an anti-racist critical pedagogy of music education is to be enacted. These dispositions are: connectedness to people in other places and cultures, open-mindedness towards previously unfamiliar cultures, and concern for social justice (p. 17). In 2008, Bradley continues to highlight the need for teachers to think critically about repertoire choices and pedagogical approaches when including global song in the context of choral performance. She emphasises the need for teachers and students to interrogate the power implications of including diverse musics in choral programmes. She notes that the choir itself is a Western construct and that conversion of music from aural musical cultures into choral works for

the “school market” (p. 8) involves “notation and commodification” (p. 6). She encourages teachers to engage in critical conversation with students about these issues, acknowledging the challenge of enacting this critical discussion without destroying the joy of performance (p. 9).

Some researchers have focused their attention on the educational experiences of diverse learners and the necessity for teachers to respond to the diversity of their students in informed, inclusive, sensitive and critically reflective ways. In particular, some have highlighted the need for teacher education to provide better support to teachers who are facing the challenges of increasingly diverse student populations (Butler, Lind, & McKoy, 2007; Jorgensen, 2007; Richardson, 2007).

Of particular value for teachers who are reflecting on their pedagogical approach to the teaching of diverse students, is the work of Geneva Gay (2000). Gay rejects the notion that a good teacher is “good” in any setting with any student. “Many educators still believe that good teaching transcends place, people, time, and context. They contend that it has nothing to do with the class, race, gender, ethnicity, or culture of students and teachers” (p. 22). She believes that, in fact, good teachers place culture at the heart of their understanding of education, and carefully differentiate curriculum content and pedagogy to better meet the needs of diverse students. She argues that teaching cannot be decontextualised from the ethnic and cultural heritages and identities of the student participants without seriously undermining the students’ potential for success in the classroom (p. 23). She argues that “ethnicity and culture are significant filters through which one’s individuality is made manifest” (p. 23) and that therefore, to ignore cultural

and ethnic difference is to be unresponsive to individual strengths and needs. Her definition of culturally responsive teaching includes the following characteristics, relevant to the present project:

- **Culturally responsive teaching is validating** and “acknowledges the legitimacy of the cultural heritages of different ethnic groups”, and ‘builds bridges of meaningfulness between home and school experience” (p. 31).
- **Culturally responsive teaching is comprehensive**, aiming to teach the whole child within a caring community of learners, where educational excellence includes “academic success as well as cultural competence, critical social consciousness, political activism, and responsible community membership” (p. 31).
- **Culturally responsive teaching is multidimensional**. It encompasses “curriculum content, learning context, classroom climate, student-teacher relationships, instructional techniques, and performance assessments’ (p. 31).
- **Culturally responsive teaching is empowering**. It enables students to become “better human beings and more successful learners” (p. 32).
- **Culturally responsive teaching is transformative**. It shows respect for the cultures and experiences of students, recognizing their strengths, talents and achievements. It uses cultural heritage and experience as a valid pedagogical resource, and aims to help students to become critical citizens who recognize and actively combat inequity and oppression (p. 34).
- **Culturally responsive teaching is emancipatory**. It aims to liberate students from the “mainstream canons of knowledge and ways of knowing” (p. 35).

Gay (2000) comments that the largely European, middle-class cultural fabric of American schools is “so deeply ingrained in the structures, ethos, programs, and etiquette of schools that it is considered simply the “normal” and “right” thing to do (p. 9). Gay also stresses the importance of the co-construction of the curriculum as being important for maximizing students’ achievement. Students must be active participants in curriculum decision making to ensure relevance and to enhance students’ motivation. She believes that this is particularly important for students from ethnic minorities.

...Native Americans, Latinos, African Americans, and Asian Americans must be seen as co-originators, co-designers, and co-directors (along with professional educators) of their education. If the “creator, producer, and director’ roles of students of colour are circumscribed, and they are only seen as “consumers”, then the levels of their learning will also be restricted... Ethnically diverse students and their cultural heritages must be the sources and centers of educational programs” (p. 111).

The characteristics of culturally responsive teaching described by Gay provide a useful tool for the evaluation of progress towards a culturally responsive approach to music education, as well as discussion of student and teacher awareness of cultural diversity as either a strength or challenge in the music classroom. Similarly, the characteristics of the culturally responsive teacher defined by Villegas and Lucas (2002) add some further, helpful dimensions this picture. These include the recognition that there are multiple ways of perceiving reality, understanding of how learners construct knowledge, knowing about the lives of students and using this knowledge to “design instruction that builds on what they already know while stretching them beyond the familiar” (p. 21).

Central to culturally responsive teaching is the goal of removing obstacles to learning so that all students are able to access the curriculum and are not excluded due to structural,

instructional, or attitudinal barriers. Such concern for the identification and removal of barriers to music learning is articulated by Jorgensen, a key author in this area, in an article in a social justice focused edition of *Music Education Research* (July 2007). In the article, Jorgensen is concerned with the need to identify “societal, cultural, institutional, and psychological barriers to learning music” (p. 169). In a very detailed way she identifies the specific aspects of music teaching and learning that are problematic or potentially inequitable, and which are affected by extra-musical forces (p. 170). With regard to why music educators should concern themselves with such matters, she instead asks why they should **not**, given that “education is concerned with the array of aspects of human life and culture, and music education is interconnected with other aspects of education” (p. 173). Jorgensen’s book “*Transforming Music Education*” (2003) is a challenging and inspiring read for those who wish to examine music education critically. She describes her ideals as “a radical and critical pedagogy, one that is not satisfied with the status quo...” (p. 20). Jorgensen justifies the need for transformation by emphasising the fact that music education is a human activity “beset with the systemic problems that afflict the wider society” (p. 19). Her belief is that music education has both the potential and the responsibility to be a powerful agent of change and that such change is a necessity to create a fairer, more caring society.

I am in the company of those who believe that education ought to be humane. It ought to be directed toward such ideals as civility, justice, freedom, and inclusion of diverse peoples and perspectives. It ought to take a broad view of the world’s cultures and human knowledge and prepare the young to be informed and compassionate citizens of the world (p. 20).

Jorgensen also claims that music making is a key to the cultural survival of groups and individuals and that music education should aim to help people not just to survive, but to

flourish. For this to happen, music educators must identify and remove “oppressive structures” (p. 120) moving towards a more learner focused, negotiated approach.

A more learner-focused approach also appeals to Richardson (2007) who argues that the prevailing institutional norms and structures of schooling perpetuate the separation of students’ musical lives outside the school from the musical expectations of them that exist in school. She believes that while students can live comfortably in both worlds, this artificial separation is a barrier to equity. A further barrier is the perceived inadequacy of teacher education in preparing teachers to teach in culturally responsive, culturally relevant ways. Richardson calls for a more critical approach to music teacher education and identifies the need for student teachers to confront issues of inequity in music education throughout their training. Similarly, Hunsberger (2007) describes culturally competent teachers as those who take into account the lived experiences of the students, ensuring strong connections between “what children learn and what they live” (p. 422). Such teachers are active in their concern to remove barriers to learning for children that may result from children not having a strong sense of belonging and identity in the classroom.

Teachers demonstrating culturally relevant practices also hold strong dispositions regarding the success of all students. They believe that this success emerges as they help their students make consistent connections with their own community, national, and global identities (p. 422).

Many writers see a critical approach to music education as being not just desirable, but an essential contribution to the creation of a more just world. In such a world, students and their teachers are prepared to participate in and engage with cultural diversity with empathy, understanding and enjoyment, celebrating difference and actively working

against intolerance and inequity. Others see these claims as idealistic and a distraction from the purely musical benefits of multicultural music education. Others have a foot in both camps, acknowledging aesthetic and practical benefits as well as broader social goals and outcomes. Some identify a need for research to measure the success of multicultural music education in terms of the claims for broader social outcomes.

One claim which is often made is that studying world music can inculcate tolerance and respect for 'other' cultures in pupils, and many teachers will verify the beneficial effects of global musical perspectives. But very little research has so far been conducted to ascertain how successful the multicultural music curriculum is being in furthering inter-ethnic tolerance and understanding (Green, 2001a, p. 47).

Drummond (2005) questions the underlying assumption that "people are capable of changing their attitudes towards their own cultures and the cultures of others..." (p. 5). Drawing on research in the area of adolescent identity status development, he proposes that a stronger argument for multicultural music education is a musical one, located within individuals. According to Drummond, encounters with diverse musics and musicians through the media or within the educational environment may help young people to grow and develop as musicians, through providing intriguing, enjoyable and challenging aesthetic and practical experiences. "Here contact with significant practitioners in a range of musics may help the development of individual identity and lead to a range of musical vocabularies and practices. In time, a musical identity-achieved status may be arrived at" (p. 9).

Anderson and Campbell (1996) have identified specifically musical benefits of multicultural music education. One of the key benefits is the initiation of students into new, varied and exciting other sound worlds. Through this students may become "more

receptive to all types of musical expression” (p. 5). They also describe the way that multicultural music education can help students to reposition the musics they are familiar with away from the centre, allowing space for other musics, learning that “many equally sophisticated music cultures are found throughout the globe and that Western classical music is just one of the many varied styles (p. 5). However, most importantly, through multicultural music education they can become more astute and sensitive musicians, with an increased capacity to learn new repertoire, and to appraise and reflect on their own musics. Similarly, British researcher, Jonathan Stock promotes the benefits of gaining familiarity with non-Western musics and musical concepts as a way for Western music students to think more critically and gain greater insight into the workings of the musics they are most familiar with.

Musical concepts and habits that we have acquired through the enculturation process, through being born and bred within a particular culture, are sometimes overlooked; they become so ‘natural’ that we may no longer be able to perceive them. Studying a different musical culture brings these issues back to our attention, and thereby encourages a deeper understanding of our own music (Stock, 2002, p. 182).

Elliott (1995) provides four reasons why music education curricula should seek to become more inclusive of diverse musics. This provides a useful summary of perceived key benefits for society, and the potential benefits to the individual in terms of both identity development, and the development of musicianship.

(a) MUSIC is a diverse human practice; (b) induction into familiar Musics links the values of music education with the values of a humanistic education (c) the self-identity of individuals in a music class may benefit from affirming individual music-culture identities; and (d) the development of musical creativity can advance significantly when students realise how music is made and valued in other cultures (1995, p. 9).

This body of work is important for the present study as it provides a critical lens to view the perceptions of student and teacher participants, and also inspires a reflective debate regarding the social and political roles of music education and the educational and social responsibilities of music educators.

Pedagogical Issues

This section examines literature that explores pedagogical issues associated with cultural diversity and music education. Much of this literature debates the perceived need to remove the ‘Western lens’ through which teachers, and consequently students, typically analyse and describe all musics, and problematises Western educational approaches to planning and delivering music programmes and assessing student learning.

Caution regarding consideration of both the limits and potential of culturally diverse music education comes from Schippers (2005, 2010). Schippers acknowledges the abandonment of Western classical music as “the only reference for music education” (2005, p. 29). However, while viewing this as a positive shift in educational thinking and practice, he warns of the need for critical reflection on the success of initiatives aimed at providing culturally diverse music education. In particular, he acknowledges the need to carefully examine the values underpinning the content, pedagogy, and structural organization of such initiatives.

Butler, Lind, and McKoy (2007) warn against approaches to ‘multicultural’ music education that may lack depth and integrity, leaving students with little understanding of the context, function and purpose of the musical examples used. Guidance for teachers

regarding avoidance of a superficial approach is well provided by the work of Patricia Campbell (2004). Campbell advises teachers who wish to give their students a broad understanding of musical expressions (p. 14) to teach with attention to culture and context. She recommends that programmes allow students to experience diverse musics through listening, reading and viewing with the support of local culture bearers where possible. She suggests that ‘culture-specific units’ are taught so that students become “immersed in the music and its cultural meaning and function” (p. 14). This suggests a ‘teach one thing well’ approach as opposed to a more thinly spread ‘journey around the world’ approach. She also recommends a comparative approach where multiple examples of concepts such as ‘protest songs’ or ‘drones’ might be sought and compared across cultures (p. 14). This is similar to the procedural approach recommended by Kwami (1998) where the treatment of particular devices such as ostinato or hocketing are compared across cultures (p. 168). These approaches should not be confused with the universalist approach criticized by Dunbar-Hall (2000). The universalist approach is based on the assumption that all musics may be analysed using the same criteria.

In this approach, concepts, sometimes called ‘elements’, of music are held to be found in all music and universal as defining aspects of music. These concepts are listed as duration, pitch, structure, texture and timbre, and are used as the means of teaching and learning music regardless of its cultural origins and aesthetic stance (p. 128).

According to Dunbar-Hall this approach, evidenced throughout music syllabus requirements in Australia, is incompatible with education policy that aims to equitably address cultural diversity. The use of one privileged set of tools for analysis of all musics can mean that different perceptions of how music is constructed, and what music means to the people who make it, are ignored or misunderstood, resulting in the imposition of “one

way of hearing music” (p. 129). Further to this, in 2005 Dunbar-Hall cautioned that using Western-based concepts to analyse indigenous musics is in conflict with the holistic nature of indigenous musical practice “...an approach in which pitch cannot be separated from the words of a song, the rhythms of the music, the dance it accompanies, the story it describes, or the places where it can be performed (p. 35). He argues that music education that takes a “cultural studies” approach will encompass the idea that “different cultures have different ways of defining and valuing music” (p. 36).

While Dunbar-Hall, above, criticizes the imposition of ‘one way of hearing music’, others have focused their research concerns and education criticism on the privileging of one way of knowing about music, and one way of measuring this knowledge. British researcher Gary Spruce (2001) critically examined assessment processes in British schools that he feels reflect the privileged position of the Western classical tradition in music education. Despite changes to the National curriculum, which now requires diversity of musical content, and the evident inclusion of contemporary styles as well as non-Western musics in classroom music programmes, the methods of assessing student learning are still predicated on beliefs about the natural superiority of Western art music. This includes the objectification of the musical product, as well as the artificial separation of listener, composer and performer. According to Spruce, the ‘aesthetic’ construction of the act of listening is central to the ‘bourgeois-defined’ high-art tradition of music education. Within this tradition the role of music education is to educate the listener so that they are able to identify and analyse the component parts of the musical ‘object’.

In this model of aesthetic listening, where the role of the listener is to gain understanding of musical meaning as enshrined in the musical object, there is an implied ‘distancing’ of the object from the listener in order that it can be experienced with ‘disinterested contemplation’ (Hanslick, 1854/1891). However, the distancing from the musical object is not, necessarily, an ‘authentic’ way of listening to all musical styles (p. 121).

Spruce believes that the assessment of listening as a separate skill and knowledge-based activity ignores the diverse ways that people engage with and think about music. This division is also a problem in the area of performance, where, within the context of Western art music, importance is attached to the notated score, and where accurate performance of the written version is valued. Spruce comments that within non-Western musics, musical meaning may not be attached to melodic and rhythmic accuracy. “In music where there is no definitive version, no defining score where meaning resides, the notion of ‘wrong notes’ is much more problematic” (p. 123). According to Spruce, a requirement to notate non-Western musics for assessment purposes can result in the decontextualisation and aesthetic reinterpretation of the music.

... the music is notated – objectified into a fixed form – and then the criteria for assessing art music applied as though it were a Beethoven sonata. A hierarchy of performer and composer is imposed where it had not existed and the direct creative input of the performer that once lay at the heart of the performance is removed (p. 124).

Spruce believes that the teaching of non-Western musics needs to reflect the creative and performance processes of the music within its social context, at least in some part. In this way students can learn about the many ways that music is created, learned, and understood, focusing less on ‘product’ and more on ‘process’. Spruce emphasises that teaching and assessment methods need to fit with the context of the music being taught, so that music is not decontextualised and students are not disadvantaged.

Examination Boards' and schools' desire to embrace a wide range of musical styles and cultures while their thinking about music remains rooted in a Western art aesthetic, results in assessment reflecting and further articulating the low art – high art hierarchy. A consequence of the tension created by mapping a bourgeois aesthetic, cultural hegemony on to a multi-style multicultural content, is that in assessing musical achievement, those whose skills are not of the Western art tradition are inevitably disadvantaged (Spruce, 2001, p. 124).

In an earlier article (1999), Spruce writes of the 'hegemony of musical theory' (p. 76) and deals specifically with the debate over the place of notation in the curriculum. According to Spruce, Western music education has traditionally "elevated the ability to read music over purely musical skills" (p. 76). This results in the devaluing of music that is learned and communicated through aural - oral means. Spruce also argues that the high-status given to reading music serves as a "tool for social delineation" (p. 77).

Children who do not possess high linguistic and logico-mathematical skills, but who may nevertheless possess pure musical skills, are unlikely to be successful in such a music curriculum model and therefore be, once more, labeled as failures (p. 77).

Drawing on the work of Lucy Green, Spruce emphasises the need to dispel the myth that notation has 'autonomous value' (p. 81). He argues that its value should only be calculated in terms of how it supports learners to engage meaningfully with musical experience. The teacher should, therefore, teach notation in response to the needs and interests of the learner.

When deciding how (or indeed whether) to teach notation, the teacher will consider the *needs and aspirations* of the musical learner and the type of notation and the conceptual level which are appropriate to fulfill these aspirations (p. 81).

A further important point is the need for notation to be taught in a contextualized manner that is “rooted in authentic musical experience” (p. 81). In this way its meaning, purpose and relevance is recognisable, and, hopefully, valuable to the learner.

The concern expressed by New Zealand researcher Henderson (1998, 2003) about the possible disadvantage that may arise for some students when learning within a traditional Western European music programme is still very relevant to this debate. She questions whether a culturally skewed curriculum in favour of a traditional classical perspective may restrict the achievement potential of students from minority cultures.

Many music teachers are steeped within the tradition of Western European music and teach and measure progress most comfortably within this mind set. On the other hand, a significant proportion of their students have been brought up in an environment built on aural traditions; for instance, Maori/Polynesian music and the popular music of the youth sub-culture of today. While aurally acquired music skills are now more highly regarded than in the past, the musical goals set and tested nationally still pivot around the ability to read and interpret musical symbols and to compose with these (1998, p. 35).

Henderson has carried out a New Zealand participant-based study examining cultural influences on the self-perception of musical ability. She found that the participants did not rate their aural abilities, such as the ability to play by ear, highly. Henderson suggests that this “substantiates the theory of the dominant culture’s notation tradition impinging on the value of other skills” (p. 37).

Like Spruce (1999, 2001) Kwami (2001) highlights the definition of ‘literacy’ as a key problem for music educators, arguing that for most musicians, music literacy refers to the abilities to ‘internalise’ and ‘improvise’ (p. 144). He refers to some African musical

cultures where it is believed that musical literacy is a “basic human attribute” and that “all human beings are inherently musical” (p. 144).

For the majority of the world’s people, musical literacy does not involve the ability to read and write music, or to play music using conventional Western or other written notation. For many, musical literacy operates as the ability to communicate with others through music making in a practical way (p. 144).

According to Kwami, the emphasis within Western music education practice on written literacy privileges particular ways of thinking about music in time and space. Approaching music through Western eyes and ears is particularly problematic in the area of temporal organization, where, according to Kwami, “the linear dominates” (p. 146). With reference to the cyclical nature of the structures of some traditional African, Indonesian and Indian musics, he describes the complexity of temporal organization in non-Western musics.

Attempts by outsiders to understand time in non-Western musics, using Western analytical tools and categories may result in the artificial separation and examination of music elements and a loss of a sense of a working whole.

In examining African musics with ‘Western spectacles’, the architectural design of, say, a West African drum ensemble music could be explained in terms of polyrhythm or polymeter. However, such a perspective fails in that it may not be an accurate tool to use in explaining the reality of the music as perceived by ‘insiders’ or from an emic perspective. Such a perspective also loses the holistic view- that everything is linked in the ensemble, there really is no conflict between the parts, they complement one another (p. 149).

Similarly, Santos (1994) believes that the insider’s perspective is vital in the teaching of each musical tradition, for the “semantic and technical insights” (p. 31) that they bring. He emphasizes the importance of music educators understanding that different musical cultures will have their own methods of transmission. However, he acknowledges that replication of such methods brings with it some unique challenges. He provides examples

of education settings that have successfully adapted traditional teaching methods in order to create a new pedagogy that is manageable within the institutional setting.

...intra-cultural resources are necessary to devise methodologies of teaching which, whether in consonance with traditional teaching techniques or innovative approaches, would still be able to preserve the integrity of the musical tradition in all possible respects (p. 31).

An account of the adaptation of traditional methods using a comparative approach has been usefully provided by Australian researcher, David Goldsworthy. In the context of Gamelan teaching in an Australian education setting, Goldsworthy writes of the challenge and disorientation for students that occur when encountering a new musical world with “its own unique system of rules and procedures” (p. 12).

The teacher must encourage them to approach the new tradition on its own terms and not be influenced by Western musical preconceptions. At the same time, the teacher may wish to guide their understanding of the new tradition by referring to a common element in their own Western system. Such a comparative approach should be employed wisely lest it encourage an ethnocentric viewpoint (Goldsworthy, 1997, p. 12).

Aligning teaching method and music is a well debated challenge for music educators attempting a culturally responsive and informed pedagogical approach. Van den Bos and others (Goldsworthy, 1997; Schippers, 2005, 2010; Wiggins, 2005) have explored the complex issue of finding the teaching method that is appropriate for both the music being taught and the student group. They address issues associated with the fact that Western learners may be disoriented by the application of an unfamiliar and conflicting view of the roles of the learner and the teacher, and the removal of the developmental, scaffolded pedagogical approach that they are familiar with and constructed by as learners. Van den Bos describes the essential differences between Western and non-Western teaching methods and suggests the possibilities for an integrated approach. He positions the two

methods at either end of a continuum and emphasizes his belief that there are advantages and disadvantages to either approach. The non-Western approach he describes as ‘holistic’ with the development of understanding of musical meaning and expression as the paramount aim. The Western approach he describes as ‘analytical’ with the focus on the development of separate technical abilities. Van den Bos has identified marked differences in the role of the teacher, the conception of the student, and the construction of the teacher-learner relationship.

The central points of difference that he has identified are shown below.

The holistic and the analytic point of view compared

Holistic	Analytic
“playing the music’	“playing the instrument”
music remains in natural context	music “split up” in separate abilities, i.e embouchure and respiration, posture, rhythmical control, playing technique, reading written music, musical theory, expression and recitation
repertoire is starting point	separate abilities are starting point
“real’ repertoire	“pedagogical” repertoire
concentric curriculum	linear curriculum
oral transmission	transmission by (staff) notation
the teacher shows, the student imitates	the teacher guides and controls, the student learning process is explicit
teacher’s role is passive	teacher’s role is active

teacher must be a good musician

teacher must be a good methodologist

(Van den Bos, 1995, p. 169).

Van den Bos suggests some strategies for combining the strengths of both approaches. These strategies allow for the emphasis to be on musical context, meaning and expression which is a significant strength of the holistic method, while making pedagogical aims and processes more explicit. This would increase the focus on teaching and learning with greater awareness of individual learning pathways. The teacher within this model would be both musician and active teacher, with an ability to arrange ‘real’ repertoire for students learning purposes, without creating artificial pedagogical material. Van den Bos believes that this would be a major change for teachers from both music education traditions, but with clear benefits. He highlights the following potential challenges for Western education settings, if attempting to integrate non-Western teaching methods.

- 1) Teaching practice at Western music schools generally is individual, instrument-based and fixed on playing the canon of cultural heritage only after a long struggle with staff notation and technical difficulties on the instrument.
- 2) Western conservatories do not give much priority to didactical schooling of students who are to become music teachers.
- 3) Non-Western musicians in Western music schools often like to continue an oral practice in natural settings and do not wish to make concessions to pedagogical aims (Van den Bos, 1993, p. 170).

Schippers (1996) describes the same end points of a teaching methodology continuum, that is, analytic and holistic. He also describes a continuum between oral and notated systems.

oral.....notation
holistic.....analytic (p. 19).

However, Schippers emphasises the wide range of teaching methods “in different traditions and even within one tradition” (p. 19) that can be identified on these lines.

Every system of music education can be placed on these lines. Often the position on the two lines is roughly the same; Western classical music teaching is generally towards the right, while the traditional ways of handing down African percussion is very much to the left of the diagram. Japanese traditional music, however, is taught from notation but is entirely holistic, while South Indian classical music tends to be handed down orally, but in a very analytical fashion. Most music learning in practice involves a wide range of activities in different places on both continuum (p. 19).

In 2005 Schippers further debates the challenge of making pedagogical decisions regarding transmission methods issues within the context of culturally diverse music education. He suggests that teachers are attempting to address these challenges by using different strategies. The most common of these strategies is to adopt “a mix of two traditions of teaching” (p. 33). This is likely to be most successful when carried out in a very conscious and considered manner, and when the teacher is free from the barriers that can be caused by organisational and administrative pressures within institutions. (See also Schippers, 2010, p. 100).

A recurring theme in the literature is the importance and inherent difficulties of enabling students to appreciate or make meaning from musical works that have been produced within diverse and unfamiliar cultural contexts (Campbell, 2001, 2004; Gorfinkel, 2010; Stock, 2002). Linked to this is the issue of whether or not the classroom setting is an appropriate context for the appreciation of diverse musics. Writers in this area debate a variety of issues regarding the appropriateness of the classroom setting (Dunbar-Hall, 2002; Kwami, 1998; Schippers, 2005, 2010; Wiggins, 1993, 2005) including challenges resulting from the teacher’s possible lack of understanding and confidence, and the

artificiality of both the setting and the resources that are likely to be used to replicate music works and instruments from diverse cultures. The application of Western teaching methods to the music may result in an aesthetic approach that may not be appropriate, and concepts used to describe the inner workings of the music may not be relevant to the ways of knowing about music held by its makers, nor the audiences in its place of origin. Analysis of the music may be divorced from socio-cultural understandings of the story around the music, and the motivations and purposes of the people who made it. Recreation of the music may lack the right ‘spirit’ or sensibility, and a ‘pedagogical’ arrangement of the music may be relevant to student and teacher skill and resources but may result in something unrecognizable to previous makers of the music.

Campbell (2001) cautions that music educators need to take care when transplanting music from its original setting to the context of the classroom.

So great is our enthusiasm for this music, however, that there is the danger of taking without permission the music that is considered by the people to be their cultural property. Furthermore, once returned to our classrooms, there is a concern that we are decontextualizing the music, and that in our removal from the place in which we heard it, we have stripped it of its cultural meaning (2001, p. 60).

In *Teaching Music Globally. Experiencing Music, Expressing Culture* (2004) Campbell emphasizes the importance of teaching students about the context of the music in order to avoid many of the issues described earlier. She believes that it is vital that teachers help students to develop curiosity about music beyond its sonic qualities. This includes “knowledge of its instruments (and voices), elements, and contexts” (p. 214). She believes that students will be interested to learn about the cultural context of the music they are listening to and playing and this kind of contextualized learning will deepen their appreciation of the music itself.

Our K-12 students may find it highly stimulating to probe the music of their listening, participation, or performance for the circumstances of its origins, the means of its transmission, the functions it fulfills, the settings of its creation and re-creation, and the interpretations which performers give to its textual and expressive features (Campbell, 2004, p. 214).

Campbell also describes the way that developing understanding of the stories surrounding the music that students are experiencing in the programme helps to connect the music to their personal narratives, histories and interests, giving the music a human face and social meaning that they may relate to or be intrigued by (p. 217). Others argue in a similar vein that if students are to be able to meaningfully evaluate unfamiliar musics, then they need to understand something of the social system within which the music was created, as well as the intended function of the music within that system (Stock, 2002, p. 187).

With an emphasis on anti-racist pedagogical goals, Bradley (2008) discusses the importance of teaching the context of music. In her reflection on the challenges of teaching global song, she highlights the importance of including the historical and contemporary stories and meanings associated with the song. If this aspect is omitted she believes that there is danger that she, as a white teacher of “other people’s music” (p. 8) will continue the cultural imperialism she is committed to countering. For example, she states “I would not teach *Swing Low, Sweet Chariot* without discussing its meaning in the context of U.S slavery” (p. 8). Like Bradley, Australian researcher, Lauren Gorfinkel (2010) problematises the approach where music and culture are “thought of as separate entities and separately teachable

aims” (p. 46). She proposes an integrated approach that blurs the apparent boundaries of categories such as ‘popular’ or ‘Australian’ or ‘traditional’ music.

Students may also be encouraged to think critically about the meaning of ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ cultures in the context of music. Including materials from ‘other’ cultures within topics such as ‘popular’ music’ and televised music will help to avoid clichés which separate other cultures into ‘traditional’ and unmodern categories (p. 46).

Similarly, American researchers Jonathan Kramer and Alison Arnold (2010) propose that students can be encouraged to think about musics in terms of the shared ways people engage with music rather than in terms of Western musicological categories. This approach avoids the privileging of any particular musical tradition and characterises music as a “fundamental mode of expression of all people” (p. 1).

Studying diverse musics in relationship to this repertoire of purposes deepens students’ insight into the nature of music and the nature of the humans who make it, listen to it, enjoy it, and move to it. It further allows students to understand the particulars of their own musical experiences as local instances of widely practised forms of musical engagement (p. 1).

At a World Music Symposium in Basel in 1993, Wiggins argued that the learning of music from a musical culture other than one’s own requires experience within the cultural context of that music at some point in the learning process.

...there comes a point when it is important to learn the music in its traditional context, and we should be exploring ways of enabling this to happen. If we remove the music from its context, we are no different from the Eurocentric explorers of the past who acquired precious artifacts and took them back to museums in their own country (1995, p. 83).

Since then, Wiggins (2005) has further explored the nature of the learning experience for students learning a traditional music within an institutional setting. He has concluded that

it is very difficult for traditional methods of transmission to be replicated with any integrity in an education setting outside of the traditional learning context.

...it is virtually impossible for an institutional context to provide an appropriate method of handing down a tradition in respect of most musics... In an institutional context, I believe that the best we can aim for is a negotiation between and understanding of different methods of learning, and cultural knowledge about the music (not of the music) appropriate to the level of the learner (p. 20).

Similarly, Kwami (1998) questioned whether an institutional context is an appropriate or relevant setting for the transmission of non-Western musics. He highlights the issue of lack of teacher knowledge and confidence, suggesting that the community may provide a more relevant setting and more reliable sources of expertise.

In advancing the view that the community is 'real' and the school 'artificial', it could be argued that the best place for non-Western musics is indeed the community, or that 'community musicians' could be used to fill the gap in teachers' knowledge and skills (Kwami, 1998, p. 167).

Kwami also suggested that while we can view the classroom as having validity as a socio-cultural context in its own right, the outsider perspective on non-Western musics provided by the classroom teacher is problematic. He also questioned whether the classroom teacher is the right person to teach about all musics.

In the classroom, the tendency of music teachers is to focus on obvious elements. Teachers tend to abstract elements, which are defining qualities of music as they understand or conceptualise it, as they 'see' it, from their own perspective. And these may be the aspects that are relatively easy to replicate. The improvisational and other more problematical areas are often ignored (2001, p. 150).

Kwami highlighted the need for enculturation within music's intended context in order to provide musical experiences for students that have musical and cultural integrity. The reality of the classroom setting makes this a challenging goal. In particular he discusses

the conflict between the need to transmit cultural context and tradition as authentically as possible while allowing for creativity and invention based on traditional musical ideas. He argues that teachers must carefully consider ways to balance the “transmission and reproduction” aspect with the “creativity and production” requirements of music curricula (p. 143). The keys, according to Kwami, are sensitivity, openness, and commitment to confronting stereotypes and value-judgements. With these dispositions, he believes that “music can be understood and creatively worked with in an appropriate way in curriculum contexts” (p. 153).

Schippers (2005) claims that while the consideration of musical context is an undeniably vital part of music education experience, the dynamic nature of musical context needs to be understood. According to Schippers, many musics ‘travel remarkably well’(p. 30) and can be effectively recontextualised.

The ‘re-rooting’ of numerous traditions in new cultural settings challenges the idea that (particularly world) music should always be experienced in its original context (p. 30).

Similarly, with specific reference to the classroom setting, Gorfinkel argues that the classroom has its own validity and reality and should be conceived of as “another contact zone for the merging of cultures/musics in their ongoing and continuing journeys across different meeting points” (p. 48).

Authenticity of Music Examples, Setting, and Transmission Methods

Schippers (2005, 2010) has examined the complexity of the concept of authenticity in music education. He describes authenticity as a dynamic and complex concept that cannot

be defined in any simple or singular way. According to Schippers, the concept of authenticity is subject to and constructed by a multitude of socio-cultural meanings and decision making processes.

Authenticity in music is rarely a comprehensive reconstruction of an original; it is marked by subjective choices and conjecture. Striving for authenticity can be defined by following ancient sources, choice of instruments, composition of ensembles, recreating original settings or contexts, following established rules, or striving for vitality of expression, as in rock music. This can lead to conflicting interpretations of authenticity, ranging from academic reconstruction of a work or genre to liberal interpretation of only its spirit (p. 30).

Changing perceptions and definitions of the concept of authenticity and the implications for music education practice have been continuing threads in music education research, most notably within the International Society for Music Education Journals and conference proceedings (ISME 1992, 1994). Debate about the meaning and importance assigned to authenticity includes discussion about the necessity of preserving traditional musics through authentic transmission, the dynamic nature of music as an expression of culture, and the hybrid musical results of cultural fusion. These ideas fall within a wider theoretical debate about essentialism and constructionism, with those that argue that authenticity is simply a Western construct or invention, and those that argue that there is an original, or essential music within each culture that can be identified and reproduced (Johnson, 2000).

Swanwick, speaking at an ISME conference in 1994 focusing on Tradition and Change, preferred a definition of authenticity that encompasses the need to seek both reality and relevance in musical experience. According to Swanwick, this is in opposition to a definition of authenticity as reproduction, where the aim is to preserve musics for archival

purposes. He expressed the view that “we do have to ask whether it is the business of schools to have the perpetuation of traditions as their main priority” (p. 215). He instead proposes that schools need to focus on preparing students for the future, and music educators need to be ‘midwives’ not ‘curators’ (p. 216). At that time he was concerned that schools could easily become ‘closed systems’ (p.216) if too bound up with the reproduction and transmission of existing cultural artefacts and values.

The ultimate aim of music education is not to transmit a limited selection of values but to break out of ‘restricted worlds of culturally defined reality’ and promote ‘imaginative criticism’, bringing procedures and criteria out into the open (Swanwick, 1994, p. 224).

Swanwick emphasized the need for the educational version of the concept of authenticity to be one that seeks real-world musical examples as opposed to school-specific musics created for pedagogical purposes. Additional to this is his belief in the need for musical experience in education settings that is relevant and meaningful for the participants.

For music education I see this as the most powerfully motivating concept of authenticity and one which certainly involves the reality of music out there in the world. Cultural conservation, reproduction, comes at the bottom of my priority list for schools and colleges. It becomes an issue only when the other two conditions of reality and relevance are met (Swanwick, 1994, p. 220).

At the same conference, Reimer presented two extreme, conflicting positions on authenticity, in order to illustrate the need for a middle ground. One extreme position rejected any form of cross-cultural music sharing, and one emphasized universal experiences of musical understanding. From the perspective of the first position he emphasizes the dangers that may result from the Western analytical gaze upon the different musics of the world. In particular, he warns against the typical classroom composition and performance activities in response to world music listening and analysis

experiences (p. 230). According to Reimer, Western assumptions about the nature of creative processes and performance techniques, separated from an insider's understanding of musical context, can result in misrepresentation and cultural colonialism.

When we dilute the intimate connection between producing music and the contextual belief system of the music being produced, we make a mockery of that connection (p. 230).

Reimer goes on to criticize the extrinsic goals that are claimed by music educators regarding the wider social benefits of studying the music of foreign cultures.

Because music is so intimately bound to culture, it is facile and sentimental to believe that instructing students about music of cultures different from their own will cause them to achieve a greater respect for and acceptance of people from those other cultures, as is so often claimed (p. 231).

Reimer then takes a contrasting position where he argues that all musics are increasingly accessible to all, and that all musics are the heritage and property of all peoples in a global world. He suggests here that musical meaning can therefore be a universally shared experience. In conclusion, Reimer assumes a third position where he critiques the previous two viewpoints and locates a middle ground.

It goes too far to an extreme, I believe, to argue that each different culture is so different that no entry into its cultural realities is possible by anyone not a full-fledged member of it. But it also goes too far to an extreme, I would suggest, to argue the reverse- that every culture, no matter how different, is accessible easily if not fully to anyone desiring to enter it (Reimer, 1994, p. 242).

He concludes with some possibilities for the future of multicultural music education, arguing that we can all experience the musics of other cultures to some extent, and that music educators have a responsibility for...

...illuminating the two essential dimensions of all music – first, that is sonorous expressive form, not in isolation, but as culturally derived, and

second, that cultural values and experiences become music when given sonorous expressive form (Reimer, p. 243).

Another participant at this conference, Ramon Santos, describes authenticity as an elusive aspect of contemporary cultural dynamics (p. 29). He believes that the foundation of the concept of authenticity is the idea of “cultural stasis” (p. 33) which stems from a Western belief in the need to preserve cultural artefacts for study purposes, and to protect them from foreign or contemporary influences. This belief ignores the true dynamic nature of culture. Santos acknowledges the difficult task for music educators to provide educational experiences that sensitively value the insider’s perspective while allowing for innovation and new meanings within changed environments.

...the issue of authenticity in the teaching of different musical cultures appears daunting in the light of its implied demands on the intellectual, attitudinal and moral obligations of contemporary music pedagogy (Santos, 1994, p. 33).

Theresa Volk (1998) has provided an historical account of the development of multicultural music education, including changing views of the issue of authenticity, within the United States. According to Volk, in education settings in the late-nineteenth and early to mid-twentieth centuries the authentic or accurate performance of non-Western musics was considered unimportant. This was due to the assumption of the natural superiority of Western music. Melodies from the folk music of non-Western cultures might be selected for teaching purposes because of the beauty and usefulness of their melodies, but without regard for their cultural context.

In the past no one was particularly concerned about authenticity. Probably the general assumption was that if it was printed in the school music texts, it must be accurate. Many of the folk melodies were indeed accurately transcribed, but just as many were adjusted rhythmically, melodically, or

textually for didactic purposes. Publishers frequently “Westernized” unfamiliar musics for school use (Volk, 1998, p. 177).

According to Volk, the discipline of ethnomusicology, with its view of music as culture, gradually influenced music educators to pay attention to both accuracy and cultural context, treating non-Western musics with greater sensitivity and respect, and avoiding stereotypes. However, Volk also comments on some of the challenges inherent in multicultural education with regard to defining and categorizing a culture as one homogenous entity, and the possibility of taking a “museum mentality” (p. 7) where the focus is on preservation of traditional music practices. Volk notes that throughout the eighties and nineties, in particular, there was much debate about the issue of authenticity, within the context of ongoing discussion between supporters and detractors of the multicultural movement in music education. Detractors argued that the inauthentic presentation of different musics could result in the confirmation of stereotyped thinking about the people who have made the music and the cultures that they are representing within music programmes.

Indeed the entire issue of authenticity comes into question when considering that the very act of transferring music out of its cultural context and into the classroom destroys its authenticity. Proponents acknowledge this problem and say the simplest ways around it are to use recordings of authentic music and to invite community culture bearers into the classroom to present their music firsthand (p. 9).

Volk and others (Elliott, 1989, 1996) believe that the performance of music of another culture is the best way to develop understanding. She believes that with proper regard for the careful selection of performance materials “students of all levels can come close to authentic performance of an unfamiliar music culture” (p. 186).

However, Campbell (2001) reminds educators that added responsibility comes with the increased accessibility of different musics due to advances in music technology. She calls for sensitivity with regard to which particular examples are selected for education purposes, care in the way the music is taught and a respectful awareness of the people “whose musical expressions they are” (p. 59). With regard to the issue of authenticity, while acknowledging the difficulty of finding any consensus on the matter within music education literature, Campbell believes that classroom performance and the creative activities that often stem from these should pay attention to original sources as much as possible.

...we understand that music is never frozen or static, and that it changes as it is traded and shared. At the same time, we are compelled to recognize with our students the music as it is played out in the place of its origin, in its first (or earlier) sonic self, and for the ideas embedded within it as it was originally expressed. We owe it to the owners, the song-bearers - and to our students – to give full recognition to the source of the later musical inventions: from whence did the music come? (p. 61).

Guidance regarding the selection of diverse musical material for classroom use is also provided by Abril (2006). He questions any fixed definition of the term ‘authentic’ in that it can be argued that “music exists in a world where instruments, melodies, lyrics, people, and social contexts are in constant flux (p. 2). However, he proposes that it is important for teachers to find material that is as representative of the culture as possible, in order to “create culturally valid musical experiences” for students (p. 3). He advises that teachers should carefully evaluate the validity of resources in terms of the trustworthiness and integrity of publishers, musicians, the contextual information provided, and performance information. He advises consultation with culture bearers or other experts, and avoidance

of materials that perpetuate cultural stereotypes (p. 6). He emphasises the importance of the respectful portrayal of cultures different from the students' own.

The school curriculum helps children construct knowledge about themselves and others. For many students, school might be the only place they come to know cultures different from their own. The materials you choose offer you the privileged position of shaping children's way of seeing the world. Therefore, the musical experiences you construct should be sensitive and respectful of the music and people they attempt to portray (Abril, 2006, p. 6).

The difficulty of providing an authentic musical experience for students has been widely discussed in the literature, with some suggestion that 'authenticity' may not be a relevant or achievable educational goal within the unique setting of the classroom.

Although one may question the authenticity of the classroom transaction where non-Western musics are concerned, it is possible to describe the artificiality of the classroom as a reality in its own right. Indeed, 'school music' can be seen as having a rightful reality, an authenticity of its own, providing the skewed prevailing paradigm can be properly balanced so that it does justice to other musics outside of the sphere of influence of the Western classical tradition (Kwami, 2001, p. 150).

Some writers have commented that a requirement for authenticity may create an insurmountable barrier, and result in the exclusion of 'world' musics from music education programmes. Johnson (2000) believes that an inflexible and 'bounded' view of authenticity may stop people from teaching world music at all and believes that attempts at authentic musical experience for students have also to take into account classroom practicality. She sees authenticity as a relative and constructed concept, and is critical of an essentialist view, which is in opposition to an understanding of culture as flexible and dynamic.

What may be perceived as essential qualities are better understood as qualities that have, in certain times and places, come to represent a certain musical practice or culture. As musics change over time, some of the 'representative qualities' may shift; some may become less important, while

new ones take their places. Similarly, regional, even familial, differences within practices must be taken into consideration; therefore, even 'representative qualities' of a musical practice must be discussed in relation to a specific time and place (Johnson, 2000, p. 281).

Johnson is critical of calls for music teachers to provide authentic experiences with little guidance, and without advice on the criteria they might use to determine authenticity. She highlights the problems associated with a dichotomist view of authenticity, where there is an assumed opposite, that is 'inauthentic' with popular connotations of being 'fake' rather than 'different, but still valid' within a new context (p. 283).

While many writers advocate the use of culture bearers to help provide culturally valid and informed learning experiences for music students, many acknowledge the difficulties and challenges associated with this. In 1996, Schippers discussed the success of 'world' music programmes in the Netherlands. One of the key questions he raises regarding this global approach is the complexity of using traditional transmission methods in the context of the Western classroom. In particular, he highlights the need for strategies for monitoring the quality of the teaching that take into account the fact that the criteria for success are in themselves Western educational constructs. Schippers describes progress in this area in the Netherlands where in the context of teacher education a course was provided for world musicians who were untrained in a Western sense. Schippers states; "Rather than learning how to teach according to western methodology, they were taught to think how their music and system of teaching would be most efficient in the context of a western music school (p. 18).

Ann Clements' (2006) study of the experience of a Māori Kapahaka leader also highlighted some of the challenges and rewards of using a culture bearer to teach. In her study, Clements aimed to come to a "better understanding of the ways in which teachers can create meaningful multicultural music experiences for their students in an authentic and culturally sensitive way" (p. 1). She found that while the students were profoundly and positively impacted by the experience, the culture bearer in the teaching role experienced some difficulties. He often became frustrated with students' lack of cultural knowledge, their lack of a shared cultural vocabulary, the time-consuming nature of the task, and the lack of recognition for the contributions he was making (p. 12).

She concluded that:

...there are many positive attributes of the use of culture bearers and that students are gaining increased cultural and musical knowledge through participation in culture bearer led ensembles. This study has found that it can be a difficult process with frustrations stemming from students' lack of cultural knowledge and inexperience of culture bearers in teaching others (p. 12).

The use of culture bearers in schools is described by Schippers (2010) as being part of the development of "intercultural" education during and since the 1980s. He uses the term 'intercultural' to describe education which aims to foster interaction between cultures and highlights the difficulties associated with the use of culture bearers to achieve intercultural aims.

Culture bearers come into classrooms with very good intentions but often without sufficient musical and/or pedagogical experience. This can lead to very disappointing results as well, which may include negative stereotyping, the very opposite of the results that most educators are trying to achieve (p. 106).

Campbell (1997) acknowledged that there will always be etic and emic perspectives and that the outsider perspective will always be shaped by “personal and cultural ‘baggage’” (p. 36), therefore necessitating the inclusion of the insider perspective from culture-bearing performers, creators and listeners. She advocates the use of culture bearers within the classroom as one of a group of important principles of ‘world’ music education. The others are to “listen with a careful ear, repeatedly, study to know: the musical structures, the musical (and transmission) processes, the cultural context, the meaning and value of the music to the people, practice repeatedly, link to the music scholars, and check with them on long-lasting and late-breaking musical expressions” (p. 370.)

Similarly, O’Flynn (2005) advocates approaches to ‘intercultural’ music education that are interactive and pedagogical, learning directly from the musicians and communities where the music is practiced, as well as learning about the transmission methods for each musical expression (p. 197).

Student Perspectives

Research in the area of student perspectives on music education is rather sparse, however, there are some important and interesting findings available. New Zealand education researchers, Bishop and Berryman (2006) write of the importance of challenging adult assumptions about young people’s perceptions of education (p. 4). It is their view that in New Zealand, in particular, research that values the voices of students as sources of valid knowledge about the quality of their education and directions for reform, is rare.

While it has been usual for educational researchers to ask teachers, principals and even parents about young people’s education, it has been unusual to ask the young people themselves about their own understanding of their

classroom and schooling experience. It is even more unusual to use these young people's understandings as the basis for reforming educational practice in ways that will improve their educational achievement (p. 4).

Similarly, from an American perspective, education researchers Cook and Sather (2002) have been highly critical of the absence of students' voice and perspective in efforts to reform education policy and practice. Literature located for the present study covers adolescent musical preferences, their perceptions of music education, as well as the role and importance of music in their lives in and out of school. For perspectives on the musical practices and perceptions of younger children, Campbell's book *Songs in their Heads* (1998, 2nd edition 2010) provides case studies that explore children's musical practices, preferences and perspectives. This is an important text, providing guidance to classroom teachers, and music teacher educators.

The present study is concerned with students' views on the ways that music education may be responding, or otherwise, to their cultural identities and interests, and to the cultural diversity of local and global communities. These culture-related aspects are minimally addressed in the literature in this area, however, research findings regarding students' preferences and perceptions of music education, and of the role of music in their lives, are helpful and relevant.

The importance of music to adolescents has been investigated and reported on by North, Hargreaves, and O'Neill (2000) in a large study involving questionnaires sent to 2465 thirteen and fourteen year olds across twenty-two secondary schools. Conclusions from this study are that music is very important to adolescents for two main reasons. These are

that it allows them to portray a particular image to others, and that it allows them to “satisfy their emotional needs” (p. 255). This research appears to have been motivated by concern regarding the nature, quality and responsiveness of music programmes in British schools, and in particular, the conflict between music at school, and music experienced in out-of-school contexts. The findings confirm the concern raised above, highlighting the problem that young people report that music is extremely significant in their lives for a variety of psycho-social reasons, but school music appears to be ‘out of sync’ with the musical contexts that are most engaging for students. Further evidence that school music may be failing to meet the needs of young people is the high number who reported in this study that they had started tuition in an instrument and had given up, as well as the large numbers who reported negative views about classical music, commenting that the reason a young person would play or listen to classical music is just “to please teachers or parents” (p. 263), whereas they play or listen to popular music in order to “enjoy the music; to be creative/use their imagination; to relieve boredom; to help get through difficult times; to be trendy/ cool; to relieve tension/ stress; to create an image for themselves; to express their feeling/emotion; to please their friends; and to reduce loneliness” (p. 263).

More positive findings regarding student perceptions of music education have come from a more recent British study carried out by Lamont, Hargreaves, Marshall and Tarrant in 2003. Lamont et al investigated issues related to the level of student engagement with and attitudes towards musical activities in and out of school. They gathered data via questionnaires sent to 1,479 students aged eight to fourteen years. They also conducted follow-up focus group interviews with 134 students purposively selected from the original

sample. The study responds in part to largely negative findings regarding the success and effectiveness of school music in Britain (see Harland et al., 2002; Sloboda, 2001, O'Neill et al., 2002). These studies had shown music education to be a problematic area, where students register either absence of, or a marked decline in, interest, enjoyment, and participation in musical activities, most notably as they make the transition to secondary school. The authors highlight the potential conflict between the nature of music learning and participation in out-of-school contexts and in-school contexts as an ongoing issue for schools to contend with (p. 230). Despite this, the findings of the 2003 study were essentially positive and did not confirm the declining interest and overall negative perception of school music found in other studies. However, as the authors mention (p. 232) the positive findings may in some ways be attributable to the fact that schools participated on a voluntary basis and may have therefore have been positively pre-disposed towards the arts. The authors also believe that the positive findings reflect the shift in teacher attitudes described in Green (2002b) away from hierarchical assumptions regarding the inherent superiority of Western classical music. The authors conclude that “the inclusion of active music-making across a range of musical styles and genres is promoting a positive attitude amongst pupils, enabling them to assert a degree of ownership over their music-making that is far less possible with classical music (p. 239). While this study does not specifically address student attitudes towards or exposure to non-Western musics, nor issues to do with cultural identification with school music other than Western popular culture, it does hold some useful points of comparison for the present study.

British researcher Lucy Green has carried out a great deal of significant research in this area. Her interest in the sociology of music education has resulted in some very valuable insights into the adolescent world of music experience. The power of music to express social and cultural identities is seen by Green as a key challenge for teachers. She describes the way that music may be “worn” by young people in order to express cultural dimensions to others.

It can be worn by pupils as a public expression within the school, which may reveal or may indeed conceal part of the pupils’ private identity or, alternatively, musical ‘clothing’ may be worn only in the privacy of the home or other situations beyond the school. Particularly in the case of children and adolescents who are searching for identity as new adults in a changing society, music can offer a powerful cultural symbol, which aids in their adoption and presentation of a ‘self’ (Green, 2002a, p. 45).

Green discusses the challenges faced by teachers who attempt to change students’ musical tastes and practices as these may be deeply rooted in cultural group behaviour and preferences shaped by gender, social class and ethnicity.

According to Green, teachers need to be aware of the ways that classroom music making requirements and experiences may align with or be in conflict with the musical self-images and identities that students adhere to. She also warns of the importance of avoiding superficial value judgements of student musical ability.

Teachers can only benefit from being aware of the complex web of musical meanings with which we all negotiate, and of the intrinsic relationships between students’ social groups, their musical practices, and their overall musical experiences. In this way, we are less likely to label students ‘unmusical’ without first considering the deep influence of social factors on the surface appearance of their musicality; and we are more likely to respond sensitively to students’ genuine convictions about what music means, what it is worth and what it is to ‘be musical’ (p. 46).

The role of schools in providing fertile ground for identities to develop, fuse, connect, and multiply, is also well discussed by Thorsen (2002). He emphasises the role of school music in the construction and cultivation of a person's cultural identity, facilitating the development of curiosity about others from a position of self confidence and cultural competence (p. 6). He describes cultural identity as being multi-dimensional, a "mosaic" (p. 2) that includes ethnicity, social class, language, gender among other attributes.

In short, cultural identity expresses a flexible complex whole with many dimensions and alloys. Here the function of music is to give language for discussions in peer groups, to understand social changes in one's life, and give symbolic expressions that sum up values and memories, to feel in touch with ourselves, and our community (p. 2).

Thorsen's findings and thinking provides useful guidance for analysis of student interview responses for the present study, particularly with regard to the participants' descriptions of musical behaviour, activity and identity development in and out of the school setting.

A comparative study carried out by Stålhammer (2000) investigated the musical experiences of Swedish and British adolescents. From some initial findings Stålhammer identified three music "fields of force" (p. 39) that influence young people's musical attitudes and behaviours. The first field is the international music industry, the second is the cultural background and environment of the young person "... which has shaped and continues to shape cultural values, preferences and commitments" (p. 39). Third are the teaching contexts, including schools, universities, churches and private tutors. He investigated the ways that young people experience and relate to music with regard to these different contexts and found three categories of response from his interviews. These

categories are; “the spaces of music, the role of music, and music’s foundation of values”. The ‘spaces of music’ category refers to the experience of listening to music either alone or with others in a particularly conducive space where, essentially, the rest of the world has been shut out. The ‘role of music’ responses refer to the ways that music accompanies particular moods or emotions. Music’s social function- as a way to connect with others in a social group, also fits with this category. The category labeled, ‘Music’s foundation of values’ encapsulates a divide between school and community musical experience, where different or conflicting values are perceived to be underpinning the experience. This includes “on the one hand their own music – the music they have a personal and emotional relationship with – and on the other hand school music, the music that is valued and judged according to certain school-like and established value norms” (p. 41). Interestingly, while findings from the Swedish and British young people were largely comparable, the British participants expressed greater diffidence about their musical ability and were more likely to privilege Western classical music as being “the most valuable musical knowledge” (p. 42). These students were more likely to say that they lacked musical talent, if they didn’t meet the school’s achievement expectations. The Swedish students, in contrast, “valued their own music knowledge more highly and emphasized its quality to a greater extent even if this did not correspond to the school’s view of knowledge” (p. 42).

An Asian perspective on adolescent music education experience is provided by Ho and Law (2006). Ho and Law analysed written assignments from seventh grade students in a secondary school in Shanghai aiming to gather information about the students’ musical experiences and opinions both in and outside the classroom. Their analysis showed that

these Chinese students considered music to be very significant in their lives, providing a vehicle for them to express feelings, articulate emotions and thought, while providing a source of enjoyment and personal growth. However, they did not identify the teacher as having particular influence on their musical identities and development and described a conflict between home and school music. The researchers considered the implications of their findings for Chinese educational policy and school music education practice. They advocate greater diversity in school musical content and efforts made to better align student and teacher musical values, while attempting to expand student knowledge beyond the familiar.

Teacher Perspectives

This section reviews research that investigates music teacher attitudes, values and behaviours with regard to both the teaching of musics from diverse cultures and the teaching of culturally diverse students. The section draws particularly on the work of British researcher Lucy Green, as well as relevant studies from America and Australia.

In 2002, Green reported on findings from a large-scale longitudinal study of British secondary school teacher attitudes to music programme content. The study compared data gathered from two different samples of secondary teachers, one sample from 1982, and one from 1998. The teachers in both samples completed surveys about the use of different musics in their programmes, focusing particularly on folk, jazz, popular, classical, ‘world’, and avant-garde musics. The overall findings provided evidence of a significant shift in teacher attitudes towards, in particular, the teaching of classical music, popular music, and ‘world’ musics. The findings from the 1982 sample provided evidence of a belief among

teachers of the inherent superiority of the Western classical tradition and the assured place of classical music within music programmes. For these teachers the inclusion of classical music required no justification. It was considered to be a way to transmit culture, preparing students to enter the adult world of educated, cultured audience members with taste and discrimination. Classical music was seen to be everyone's cultural heritage, and despite the fact that the teachers confessed to needing to disguise classical repertoire to make it more palatable to students, it was considered to be an important antidote to the all-pervasive pop music. Data from the later sample showed a significant shift in thinking. While these teachers still viewed classical music very positively, and many still considered it to be a musical or cultural heritage that is relevant and important for all children, no teacher claimed its inherent superiority, and most considered it to be one of many valid musics for classroom use.

Whilst teachers' commitment to and respect for classical music does not appear to have lessened between the two questionnaires, the implications of many 1982 teachers, that classical music deserved to take up the most curriculum time on the basis of its superiority and its unquestionable status as cultural heritage, appeared to have waned considerably. Instead, teachers in 1998 were more likely to perceive the classical area as one music among many, a music of enormous value but not necessarily the prime contender for space in the curriculum, nor a music to be grasped in cultural or historical isolation (2002b, p. 28).

The place of popular music shows a reverse shift in attitudes. While viewed negatively in 1982, as a genre perhaps suitable for low-ability students or as a 'treat' at the end of a lesson, by 1998, its validity and importance was assured, although teachers in both groups acknowledge challenges related to their own currency and relevance when teaching popular musics. The teachers in 1982 were not asked to comment on the inclusion of 'world' music, however, new curriculum requirements for teachers to include musics from

cultures around the world, are reflected in changes to the questionnaire for the 1998 sample. The majority of teachers in the 1998 cohort emphasized the teaching of 'world' musics as an important part of their programme. The two most common reasons used to justify its inclusion were; to raise awareness of other cultures, and to reflect the ethnic diversity of the school population (p. 26). Green attributes the shift in teacher's musical and educational values to societal, technological, and National Curriculum policy changes.

My hypothesis is that we are witnessing a sea-change in music education, inspired by new practices, values and identities in the globalised and localised musical world we all inhabit (Green, 2002b, p. 29).

However, while this research has shown that the content of classroom music programmes has responded to social change, in particular to the rapidly increasing ethnic diversity of the student population, Green expresses concern that teaching methods have remained largely the same. According to Green, curriculum content has changed to include contemporary music styles, such as rock and pop, as well traditional and contemporary world musics. However, the approaches used for the teaching of these musics still reflect the Western classical approach, privileging, in particular, analysis and written literacy above informal appreciation and aural transmission methods.

Whilst schooling has recently incorporated a wider variety of musics into the curriculum, I would suggest that one of the tasks now facing music educators, not only in schools but in higher education too, is to make a serious assessment of the very different learning practices by which these 'other' musics have been passed down, and to consider what light such practices might shed upon our own (Green, 2002b, p. 29).

More general findings regarding teacher's attitudes towards and approaches to teaching music can be found in Lamont, Hargreaves, Marshall and Tarrant (2003). These researchers carried out interviews with 42 teachers responsible for music across 21 British

schools. The schools were a mix of primary and secondary schools. This was part of a larger study that included questionnaires and interviews with students aged 8 to 14 years, with a particular focus on student's levels of engagements with music in and out of the school setting. The teachers involved in the study expressed very positive attitudes towards curriculum music overall with five key themes emerging from the interview data. These themes give a useful insight into teacher values regarding the perceived benefits of learning music. Theme one was the importance of music, with a particular focus on the extra-musical benefits. The teachers expressed commitment to music as a subject largely because of perceived individual and social benefits, beyond the acquisition of music skill and knowledge.

Curriculum music was seen as a positive opportunity to complement the logical and cognitive aspects of literacy and numeracy with a more emotional, spiritual or affective side of learning, and as a means of achieving many of the Citizenship aims such as teaching perseverance and patience, an increased appreciation and respect for others, teamwork, and self-discipline (p. 233).

The contribution of music to the wider life of the school was also seen as an important benefit, as well as the opportunities extra-curricular music making provided to develop student confidence, enthusiasm, initiative and other leadership qualities. A second theme was that of access and inclusivity. Teachers commented that the inclusion of new areas such as 'world' musics and the increased use of technology had broadened the appeal of music and increased its relevance to diverse student populations. However, they expressed concern about constraints on time to adequately prepare students who are interested in a classical music learning pathway at tertiary level. The remaining themes identified by the researchers included issues around the skill and expertise needed to teach a changing music curriculum, in particular "specialist areas of 'world' music such as Indian raga,

samba and rap” (p. 234); also the challenges arising from transitions between primary and secondary education settings, where it was felt greater links were needed; and problems related to the provision and use of Information and Communication Technologies.

The concern expressed by the teachers in the study described above regarding the challenge of teaching unfamiliar musics is mirrored in findings from American studies (Benham, 2003; Legette, 2003; Butler, Lind & McKoy, 2007). In these studies, the challenge of teaching diverse musics is linked to the challenge of teaching increasingly diverse groups of students in culturally responsive ways. Some of the literature in this area proposes changes to teacher education so that it may better support student teachers to develop the dispositions and understandings needed to become culturally responsive and informed teachers. Accounts of the benefits or otherwise of field study, cultural internships, the use of mentors, directed ‘multicultural’ planning requirements, among other approaches are discussed as possible strategies to address gaps in teachers’ cultural knowledge as well as gaps in their ability to adapt to different cultural settings.

In an article in the *Journal of Music Teacher Education* (2003) Stephen Benham reflects on some of the challenges of teaching in an ethnically diverse setting. These reflections provide a useful insight into some of the key issues for teachers, teaching in increasingly diverse communities, for which many of them feel unprepared. In this article, Benham examines his particular cultural biases, lamenting his lack of cultural awareness and the difficulty he initially experiences in connecting with and understanding the children he is teaching. In particular, he identifies the ways that the ‘food’ and ‘festival’ approach to multicultural education that he has experienced in his own education background, has left

him with only superficial understanding of different cultures. This, in combination with the kind of sterile statistical and demographic information about school populations that is typically available to teachers, had left him unprepared to teach in a culturally informed manner.

In music education, this narrow focus has resulted in the perception that addressing cultural diversity in the classroom is more of a materials (curricular) issue than it is of developing teaching methods and styles that are culturally diverse. And arming teachers with a set of multicultural songs, dances, or other cultural icons is certainly easier than helping teachers to develop an understanding of, and the ability to work within, culturally diverse settings (Benham, 2003, p. 3).

Benham recommends that teacher educators address more deliberately the need for beginning teachers to be supported to become culturally responsive through teacher education programmes. He highlights mixed results from approaches where student teachers have been required to plan lessons on different cultures, and from approaches that include field experiences, referring to accounts of students having difficulty applying what they have learned in the field to a new setting. He does not completely reject the field experience approach, but is critical of the typically short term nature of these, where there is limited opportunity to engage in “long-term and meaningful interaction with another culture” (p. 4). He believes that ultimately, to be effective in operating and teaching in a new cultural context “the teacher must be the one who adapts and changes” (p. 8). The teacher must “learn about the worldview of the local community” (p. 4) and adapt his or her teaching to the local culture or cultures. In support of this, he recommends the use of mentor or expert teachers as well as the use of autobiography as a way to support reflection on critical classroom incidents.

The changing demographic of American schools is described variously in the literature as a source of challenge, concern, and inspiration to music educators. Legette (2003) discusses the disparity between the increasingly multicultural nature of the school population and the increasingly white, female, middle-class composition of the teaching profession. According to Legette, Teacher Education is not preparing beginning teachers to teach effectively in culturally diverse education settings, as is evidenced by the lack of confidence in this area expressed by teachers in a variety of studies. Legette has investigated the attitudes, values, and practices of public school music educators towards multicultural music education. He gathered data from a survey returned by 398 public school music teachers. The participants were from a mix of elementary, middle and high schools. His findings are that despite positive attitudes towards the teaching of multicultural music, few teachers included such material in any more than half of their classes or concerts and the majority of teachers (63%) reported that they “did not select material that reflected the ethnic make up of the class” (p. 5). The majority of teachers also indicated that they had received no training in the teaching of multicultural music at undergraduate level, and about half of the teachers had received some in-service professional development in this area. The researcher’s recommendation is for increased attention to this area in teacher education programmes.

Although music educators should upgrade their knowledge base as often as possible, school personnel and those involved in teacher preparation at the university level are encouraged to work more closely in preparing teachers so that they are better equipped to meet the musical needs and challenges presented by an increasingly diverse student population (p. 5).

The pressing need for culturally sensitive and informed teachers is discussed by American researchers Butler, Lind & McKoy (2007) with reference to the work of Villegas and Lucas (2002). Such teachers are aware of the influence of culture on learning and

recognise the multiple ways of knowing about and experiencing the world that will be manifest in culturally diverse classrooms. Such teachers also value the cultural knowledge that students bring to the classroom, aiming to build on this and “stretch them beyond the familiar” (p. 244). Culturally aware teachers are inspired and motivated by diversity in the classroom and do not confuse difference with deficit. Butler et al identify a need for research to provide information about the ways that such cultural competence and awareness can be developed in teachers. They also express concern that many teachers lack the commitment to teach in diverse settings, preferring the option of teaching in mono-cultural settings that are more similar to their own educational background. They describe the ways that strongly held teacher beliefs and attitudes may prevent teachers from embracing new ways of thinking.

It follows that the more teachers understand about how their own cultural backgrounds and ethnic identities influence their attitudes about other cultural groups, the more open they may be to recognizing the significance of culture and ethnicity as factors critical to teaching and learning (p. 245).

However, the challenging realities faced by well intentioned ‘white’ teachers, attempting to disrupt the privileged position of Western musics within American high schools is thoughtfully illustrated by Abril (2006). Abril provides a narrative-style account of the work of one teacher who introduced a Mariachi ensemble at her school.

This teacher’s experience is a mixed one, with barriers to success caused by her lack of experience and confidence, the reality of her personal history and education in Western classical music, the difficulty of achieving an effective balance between the skill-based and sociocultural components, and her status and image as a White, Non-Hispanic teacher. This account highlights some important questions.

What does it mean to teach from a multicultural approach in an instrumental ensemble? How can teachers experiment with new curricular offerings and approaches to teaching such that they are tolerated or accepted within an educational community? What can music teacher educators do to better prepare teachers to lead discussions surrounding sociocultural issues that relate directly to music - issues such as race, gender, and ethnicity? (Abril, 2006, p.6).

A Swedish study also links the personal histories of teachers to the underlying musical and educational values that underpin their practice. Eva Georgii-Hemming (2006) analysed narratives from five teachers regarding their personal experiences of music in a variety of contexts. The study is concerned with “the interaction between personal experiences and professional strategies” (p. 218) and examines the teacher’s view of music education and the way that classroom practice has been shaped by aspects of the teacher’s life history, including educational, political and cultural factors. The research is underpinned by a belief in the plural, fluid and subjective nature of people’s ways of knowing about and experiencing music. The researcher acknowledges the difficulty of gathering and analyzing such ‘slippery’ information.

...gaining access to people’s subjective reality and acquiring an understanding of the connections between the individual’s actions and a broader historical, cultural and social framework is not without its problems, from either a strategic or a scientific point of view (p. 219).

Georgii-Hemming’s finding from analysis of the teacher’s stories was that the teachers all wished to pass on to the students the benefits they believed they had received from musical experience within their own life histories. These were “pleasure and play, skill, and a sense of community, outlet for emotion...” (p. 233). However, the emphasis on hands-on experience meant that their teaching lacked space for “intellectual challenge, dialogue with and concerning tradition, or the role of music as a contributor to cultural

identity, or as a political force” (p. 234). She concluded that the process orientation of all of their teaching approaches meant that a critically reflective dimension was missing from the educational environment of their classrooms. This study fits with other research that aims to unpack the ways that teachers’ ideological beliefs influence their pedagogical choices.

Using the tools of discourse analysis with a critical theoretical underpinning, Thompson (2002) identifies ways that ‘world’ music may be constructed and ultimately “othered” through language and discourse, reflective of ideological positions held by the speaker, in this case, a secondary school teacher. Through analysis of interview data with one teacher participant, Thompson identified ideological positions and binaries that were evident in the language choices of this teacher. A post-structural approach to data analysis such as this is particularly valuable as educators and researchers grapple with issues related to cultural diversity in a post-colonial world. A post-structuralist lens enables a critical examination of the role of the teacher in marginalising both ‘world’ musics and student groups whose musical and cultural heritages are left out or given low status within programmes. Thompson’s insights into the ideological positions that may underpin a teacher’s “version of reality” (p. 16) and therefore shape the teacher’s pedagogical decisions and the discursive environment of the classroom are particularly useful. Her findings indicate that a language of ‘difference’ is applied consistently and frequently to ‘world music’ within the interview that is documented in the study, with European music as an implied central point of comparison. Thompson concludes:

The analysis has revealed a version of world music based on an ideology of difference, in which world music is constructed as ‘other’ to the ‘canon’ of European music through a series of binary oppositions pertaining to culture, musical function, pedagogy, and curriculum positioning. These constructions are complicated through discourses of familiarity, and accessibility, which

affect the teacher's ability to teach world music, students' reactions to various styles of music, and the place of world music in the curriculum (p. 19).

Thompson's findings are relevant to Marsh's (2005) comments regarding gaps in Australian music teacher education. She comments that Australian music teachers are not acquiring an understanding of the need for programmes with multicultural perspectives and nor are they gaining insight into the insiders perspective. Her views align with Thompson's analysis above, regarding the prevalence of an 'ideology of difference', which is perpetuated in many music teaching materials. Marsh acknowledges that some more recent publications have attempted to address this issue by foregrounding the role of music in the lives of real people who have bicultural experiences as member of a multicultural society (p. 39). The development of a multicultural fieldwork project within teacher education at the Sydney Conservatorium aims to address some of the issues highlighted by Thompson and Marsh (See p. 246 of the present project for further discussion of this).

A New Zealand perspective regarding teacher perceptions of culturally responsive teaching for Māori students has been helpful for this study. Narratives gathered and analysed by Bishop and Berryman from Māori and Pakeha² teachers show the ways that some teachers are thinking critically about issues to do with culture, identity, student engagement and achievement. In one narrative, the teacher articulates the importance of

² Pakeha is the term originally used by Māori to describe the European colonizers. It is now in common usage and describes New Zealanders of European heritage. It is likely to mean 'pale skin'.

understanding what it is that a Māori student brings to the classroom as a student. This teacher, and others interviewed by Bishop and Berryman, has understood that culture is not something to be left “at the school gate”.

...knowing that with Māori you don't just take on the student, you take on everything that comes with them. For example it could be his whānau [family], his raruraru [problems] and his aroha [love] (2006, p. 233).

A study undertaken by New Zealand researcher Clare Henderson (2003) investigated inclusiveness in music education, through observation and interviews with New Zealand music teachers and students. Henderson has a particular interest in raising the achievement of Māori and Pasifika students. She found that inclusive teachers believe that “traditional music programmes need adapting to develop these students’ abilities in alternative ways; and that they are not driven by the national programme first and the students second, but rather the reverse” (p. 8). These teachers also demonstrate that they value the musical interests and identities of the students and do not assume that all students value and understand Western art music. They also allow for the fusion of music and dance, acknowledging this as a feature of Māori/ Pasifika cultural traditions as well as being an important component of the contemporary music preferences of the students. However, she also found that many teachers identify barriers to student success in music that were evidence of “deficit theorizing” based on their attribution of culturally-linked learning and attitudinal deficits to the students and their whānau. Barriers identified by the students and their families included lack of relevancy between the students’ contemporary music world and the prescribed music programme, boredom with the theoretical component, feelings of inferiority when comparing skills with students who are classically trained, and expectations for solo performance.

Lack of congruency between what students and teachers see as barriers lies not only in who blames who for failure in the programmes, but also in the relevancy of the music studied; how it is taught; the importance of communication and relationships; and how music is practised and performed. . . . Again, the question of the hegemony of western traditions in music within multi-educational practice is raised (p. 11).

The centrality of dialogue between home and school culture within a school system based on critical multiculturalism is well discussed by Australian theorist Hambel (2005).

According to Hambel, the consideration of the student's home culture is vital to the development and implementation of culturally relevant pedagogical approaches.

Creating dialogue between the school culture and varied home cultures of students helps to transform the mainstream education system to reflect the norms and values of all students. Through incorporating the cultural backgrounds of students, the culture of schooling shifts and is redefined in terms of the many discourses of different students (p. 60).

Teacher perspectives, as well as the pedagogical challenges and issues that impact on teacher practice have been thoughtfully and thoroughly researched and debated from a variety of theoretical and philosophical perspectives. However, research into the experience of the learner continues to be a gap in the literature.

Chapter 3 Methodology

Introduction

This chapter describes the theoretical framework and method of investigation for the current research. It is divided into the following sections.

Theoretical Framework

Research Methods and Procedures

- Case Studies
- Setting
- Selection of participants
- Interviews
- Data analysis
- Data reduction

Validity and generalisability

Ethical considerations

Theoretical Framework

The topic area for this investigation is a complex one. The diversity and multiplicity of viewpoints on any aspect of music education is clear from the extent of the literature in this field. Therefore, a research paradigm that embraces complexity and multiple viewpoints was the most appropriate one in which to situate this study. Methodological decisions for this project were governed by the nature of the research questions.

In order to investigate these questions it was felt necessary to gain information directly from the participants in the context of the schools where music education takes place. The decision was made to carry out a qualitative investigation, framed by constructivist theory with a critical orientation, using a collective case study approach.

The participant's perspective lies at the heart of qualitative research. Since, in this project the views of teachers and students are the central concern, in-depth interviewing was chosen as the data-gathering technique that would best enable the participants to speak for themselves (Sherman and Webb, 1990, p. 5). Qualitative inquiry is concerned with the meanings that people make of their experience within particular contexts (Bogdan and Biklen, p. 7). It seeks to interpret experience and explain its significance. The positioning of the participant's voice and viewpoint at the heart of the questions under investigation is underpinned by the belief that human perception is subjective and socially constructed and that, therefore, there are multiple ways to interpret events and experience.

Qualitative inquiry has particular features that distinguish it from other approaches. It is naturalistic, in that it acknowledges the significance of the settings within which behaviour occurs and attitudes and values develop (Bogdan and Biklen, p. 4). It is concerned with processes, that is, how people come to believe what they believe and act in the ways that they do (p. 6). It is descriptive, and data is typically analysed inductively. Bogdan and Biklen summarise the key goals of qualitative inquiry.

The qualitative researchers' goal is to better understand human behavior and experience. They seek to grasp the processes by which people construct meaning and to describe what those meanings are (2003, p. 38).

The research questions reflect a critical theoretical orientation to the study; however, critical theory does not strictly provide the framework. Critical theorists in the field of music education assume that there are marginalized groups, and unequal power relations in the context of music education that lead to the privileging of some ways of knowing about music over others (Bradley, 2005, 2007, 2008; Jorgensen, 2007; Mansfield, 2002; Abrahams, 2004; Reimer, 2007; Baxter, 2007, Regelski, 1988). Critical theory assumes that social organisations, such as schools, privilege some groups over others through curriculum and pedagogical choices. Critical theorists are interested in the ways that social values are reproduced in schools. For example, some writers have explored the ways that a societal belief in the superiority of Western classical practical and theoretical knowledge may restrict notions of achievement and success in music education, confining them to the provision of evidence according to a particular way of knowing (Mansfield, 2002, Bradley, 2006). So, while analyzing the interviews in search of key themes, concepts and categories, my attention has also been directed to some specific ideas that have their roots in a critical theoretical world view. Popkewitz (1990) describes a critical science of teaching and learning that examines the “contradictions of educational practice” (p. 46). This notion fits with the discussion in this project of some of the contradictions between education policy and classroom practice, and also with identification of hierarchies of knowledge within music education (p. 49). Traditionally, critical theorists believe that reality exists “out there”; however, oppression leads to a false consciousness of reality. Emancipation is needed to recognize the nature of this oppression. This study does not have an emancipatory goal. The aims of this project are to uncover the teacher’s subjective, constructed reality of teaching, learning, relating to and communicating with students within the context of cultural diversity. This project does have a goal of “critical

enlightenment” as described by Kincheloe and McLaren (2003), that is, to ... “uncover the winners and losers in particular social arrangements and the processes by which such power plays operate” (p. 437). Kincheloe and McLaren (2003) present a re-conceptualisation of critical theory for the beginning of the 21st century.

... a reconceptualised critical theory questions the assumption that societies such as the United States, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, and the nations in the European Union, for example, are unproblematically democratic and free. Over the 20th century, especially since the early 1960s, individuals have been acculturated to feel comfortable in relations of domination and subordination rather than equality and independence (p. 436).

The theoretical framework for this investigation is more accurately described as constructivist, as defined by Guba, (1990, p. 25) and Schwandt, (1990, p. 266). Schwandt provides a helpful description of the key differences between a constructivist and a critical theoretical orientation.

If constructivism can be characterized by its concern with a hermeneutic consciousness - capturing the lived experiences of participants- then critical theory can be characterized by its critical consciousness- systematically investigating the manner in which lived experience may be distorted by false consciousness and ideology (p. 268).

Constructivism is a theory of knowledge that explains how learning and meaning-making happen. As a theoretical framework for research social constructivism shapes research questions and methodological decisions in ways that centralize the construction of reality within a social context (Guba, 1990).

Research Methods and Procedures

Case Studies

The term case study is not a methodological descriptor in itself. It merely indicates that what is to be investigated is a ‘case’ of some description. A single case study examines something quite specific, an integrated system that has identifiable boundaries (Stake, 2003, p. 135). For this project, the term “collective case study” is a better fit. Stake describes the collective case study as one in which a researcher may “jointly study a number of cases in order to investigate a phenomenon, population, or general condition” (p. 138). *Case one* is a sample of New Zealand teachers and their students, *case two* is a sample of Australian teachers and their students and *case three* is a sample of American teachers and their students. The phenomenon being investigated is teaching and learning music in culturally diverse education settings. Stake comments that the cases in a collective study “may be similar or dissimilar, redundancy and variety [are] each important”. They are chosen because it is believed that understanding them will lead to better understanding, perhaps better theorizing about a still larger collection of cases” (p. 138).

Settings

The cases for this study were selected in order to illuminate teacher and student attitudes and beliefs regarding cultural diversity in music education. The settings of New Zealand (Auckland), Australia (Sydney), and America (Seattle and Cleveland) were chosen to provide contexts that would tell three unique but comparable stories. Through prior reading and networking it had been possible to determine that each setting is home to researchers and teachers who are (a) interested in issues related to cultural diversity in

music education and (b) challenged by increasingly diverse student populations. While three schools were selected in New Zealand, and three in Australia, I made the decision to include six schools across two cities in America. This was because America is the least familiar setting for me and I considered it advisable to gather more data there to help me get a better ‘feel’ for the particular experiences, perspectives, and challenges of those school communities. In other words, I felt that I would need to hear the messages more than one or two times in order to interrogate them with understanding. The cities of Seattle and Cleveland were chosen because of my collegial connections with Professor Patricia Campbell at the University of Washington and Associate Professor Rita Klinger at Cleveland State University. Also, gathering data from two cities in America gave a greater range of perspectives reflecting the diversity of the American education experience, and I believed that this range would strengthen the significance of the findings.

Connection with experts in each setting who were willing to provide support made the project possible. The expert advisors were all working in either universities or agencies with direct relationships with school music educators, and had the following key attributes: professional concern with cultural diversity in music education, local knowledge of schools, involvement in the professional development of teachers, and in the Australian and American cases, significant research and resource publication histories in the area of cultural diversity in music education. Sampling has been purposeful and guided by recommendations from these experts in the field of music education. This guidance has been an essential component, particularly for the American and Australian cases. I believe that access to the inquiry sites would have been much more difficult and perhaps impossible without the support and insider knowledge provided by these expert advisors.

Selected schools were recommended by the advisors as having reputations for successful practice in the context of culturally diverse student populations. The teachers expressed pleasure at being asked to participate, particularly when they understood that they had been recommended by someone whose good opinion they valued.

Selection of participants

Letters were sent to each school via mail and email requesting their participation. Attached to this request letter was an information letter about the project as well as interview guides and consent forms for each individual participant (see Appendix A for examples). A follow-up phone call was made ten days after the letters were sent. If a school declined, a replacement for this school was selected after a further request for recommendations from the advisors, and the invitation process was repeated. However, of the twelve schools contacted, only two declined, one in Auckland and one in Seattle. Emails and telephone calls were then made to the Music Heads of Departments to arrange suitable interview times. The HODs selected the student participants. This seemed appropriate given the HOD's existing relationship with the students. The ethnicity of students was not a criterion for selection. The diversity of the school population and its wider community was seen to be the critical factor and it was not intended that students be seen individually as spokespeople for particular ethnic groups represented within the school population. Any student participating in the music programme was considered to be a valid informant with potentially valuable perspectives to share on both music education and issues related to cultural diversity.

The participants were music teachers and students who had elected to study music and were, mostly, in either years twelve or thirteen (the last two years of high school). At Sydney School B two eleven year old boys were enthusiastic about participating in an interview. Parental permission was sought and granted, so I decided to include them in the interview cohort. They were interviewed together. Numbers of participants differed across the settings. While I requested that a minimum of three student participants be invited to participate, in some schools more than three turned up to be interviewed, and in one school only two were available on the day. In this case, because the two students were both in lead roles in the school production, and the interviews were scheduled (by the teacher) during rehearsal time, they were interviewed together to save time. I found that it was necessary to be flexible and undemanding and to make the most of the opportunity to gather data that was available.

Information was gathered by semi-structured in-depth interviews, with the option of follow-up dialogue via email. The allowance for possible follow-up dialogue was made in case further clarification or detail was required. The interviews all took place in person.

Interviews

Qualitative research is characterized by the use of particular tools and strategies for gathering and analyzing evidence. In the case of this study, the major tool for data gathering has been in-depth, semi-structured interviewing, as described by Kvale, 1996, Berg, 2004, Janesick, 2004, Holstein and Gubrium, 2004, Bogdan and Biklen, 2003, and Stake, 1995, among many others. Interviewing was selected as a method because of the potential for gathering rich information that captures the multiple realities described by

Stake, and that is shared within a natural and positive interaction between the researcher and the participant. “The interview is the main road to multiple realities “(Stake, 1995, p.64). As Kvale (1996) states, “If you want to know how people understand their world and their life, why not talk to them?” (p. 1). Kvale uses a ‘traveller’ metaphor to illustrate the nature of qualitative interviews where the interviewer is on a journey of conversation-based discovery. This metaphor is particularly apt for this project. “The alternative *traveler* metaphor understands the interviewer as a traveler on a journey that leads to a tale to be told upon returning home” (p. 4). This approach fits with the overall constructivist framework for this study, which emphasizes “the constructive nature of the knowledge created through the interaction of the partners in the interview conversation” (Kvale, p.11).

Holstein and Gubrium’s description of the ‘active interview’ also proved helpful in thinking about the nature of the interviews for this project. They describe the interview as “a meaning-making conversation – a site and occasion for making meaning. It is more like a two-way informational street than a one-way data pipeline” (2004, p. 143). In a two-way, meaning-making conversation, ideas are shared, examined, rejected, and modified throughout. They do not leap easily, as fully formed answers, from the participant’s mouth. Meaning is “cultivated” (p. 143) during the interview. Janesick’s (2004) advice on the development of interview questions was also helpful.

Maykut and Morehouse (1994) describe the qualitative posture, or orientation, as “indwelling” (p. 25). Indwelling is defined as “understanding the other person’s point of view from an empathic rather than sympathetic position” (p. 25). They also comment that

to understand the complexity of human experience a complex research instrument is needed, that is, a human instrument- the “researcher-as-instrument” (p. 26). Sherman and Webb (1990) also emphasise the importance of the interview as a way to clarify the meaning of experience from the participant’s perspective, and they see the ‘human’ness of the interviewer as a potentially vital aspect of qualitative data gathering. “The human touch, the capacity to empathize with others, is essential to successful interviewing” (p. 130).

These ideas have been helpful in confirming the value of interviewing and the significance of the co-construction of meaning that occurs within the interview relationship. They have also helped me to understand the importance of taking time to develop rapport and empathy in the interviews, sharing my own background and experiences in order to build a relationship, and to develop trust and a sense of some common understandings between researcher and participants regarding teaching, music education, working with teenagers, being a parent, and undergoing study as an adult. These were often shared experiences, and helped mitigate the mis-understandings that may have resulted from me being a foreigner in Australia and the United States, unable to cast off the world view of a New Zealander.

The interviews all took place in the school setting. This decision was based on the belief that “action can best be understood when it is observed in the setting in which it occurs” (Bogden and Biklen, p. 5). The setting or context is seen to be a key influence on people’s actions, behaviour and assumptions. An interview guide was developed which provided shape and direction to the interviews, however, the order of questions differed in each

interview as each had a unique pattern and flow. The semi-structured nature of the interviews allowed the participants to develop ideas in ways that suited their particular views and experiences and allowed me, as interviewer, to be flexible and responsive, and to pursue particular angles and interests that seemed valuable and pertinent in a spontaneous, natural and conversational manner. However, on the downside of this approach, analysis of semi-structured interviews can be particularly challenging due to the complexity, unpredictability and ‘slipperiness’ of them. Flexibility sometimes meant that a question was left out altogether, or only dealt with superficially, and that mental notes made during interviews to revisit something in order to probe more deeply, were not followed up. Also, because of carrying out interviews one after the other with a constant awareness that time was precious for busy teachers and students, one interview experience would merge into another and it was easy to forget whether particular themes had been adequately dealt with by the person in front of you. And, of course, some people are easier to interview than others. In particular, some teachers took a ‘stream of consciousness’ approach that was hard to interrupt and redirect.

Case study research typically includes participant observation and the examination of documents for the purposes of methodological triangulation. However, for this project the focus was on teachers’ and students’ perceptions and attitudes, not on the evaluation of practice. It may be the case that what teachers say they do and believe does not reflect what they actually do in the classroom. Some of these gaps between perception and practice have been exposed by interviewing students as well as teachers. However, the gap between articulated belief and the reality of classroom practice was not the central concern of the project.

Carrying out the interviews, particularly with young people, has been the highlight of this study. I feel extremely fortunate to have gained access to schools and to have been welcomed by such willing and generous participants. All of the interviews felt like very positive experiences for me and for the participants. It seems that music teachers and learners love their subject and enjoy talking about it.

Data analysis

Guidance regarding approaches to data analysis came, in particular, from the work of Berg, 2004; Janesick, 2004; Maykut and Morehouse, 1994; and Wellington, 2000. Berg was particularly helpful in the area of coding, describing strategies that allow theory to emerge from data as it is analysed (pp. 278-288). Their advice on systematic approaches to seeking and noting patterns in the data were also very useful. Janesick's checkpoints for data analysis, reporting and interpretation (p. 109) also provided a useful framework for evaluating the rigour of my work as the analysis developed. The issue of whether the approach to analysis should be seen as inductive or deductive is well discussed by Maykut and Morehouse (p. 121). Typically, qualitative research methods are described as being inductive, that is arising from the "bottom up" as in grounded theory (Bogdan and Biklen, 2003, p. 6). However, Maykut and Morehouse acknowledge the way that qualitative researchers are likely to bring a theoretical lens to their work. They bring expertise and therefore informed 'hunches' (p. 121) or theories about what they might discover, however, this is very different from having a specific hypothesis to prove or disprove.

This distinction in research practice is critical and leads to a substantially different approach to analyzing one's findings. The process of qualitative data analysis takes many forms, but is fundamentally a non-mathematical

analytical procedure that involves examining the meaning of people's words and actions. Qualitative research findings are inductively derived from this data (Maykut and Morehouse, p. 121).

Wellington (2000) acknowledges that qualitative data analysis is likely to include some pre-established categories derived from the literature or reflecting a particular theoretical orientation, while other themes will have emerged from the data as it is probed for meaning (Wellington, 2000, p. 142). In this way, according to Wellington, qualitative data analysis may be seen as both inductive and deductive.

Existing categories, derived from past research and previous literature, can be brought to the data and used to make sense of it. But frequently there will be new data which require new thought and new categorization... (p. 143).

Data reduction

The interviews were recorded on a digital recorder and were transcribed in full.

The interviews were initially divided into two sections; rapport building/ gathering of biographical detail and main content. The rapport building/biographical details were used to create a short biographical narrative about each participant. The rest of the material was 'unitized', a process described by Maykut and Morehouse (p. 128): summarised, and then coded in terms of particular categories that emerged from close reading of the interview transcripts. This was presented in table format. This material was then further categorised in terms of the broad research questions (See Appendix A for Analysis Categories)

Validity and Generalisability

Interview transcripts were returned to the participants to check, and to make changes if they wished.

The three case studies in this project are intended to provide description and interpretation of the perceptions of members of these three groups on a particular topic. By looking for common and unique themes it has been possible to make some comparisons and to seek some explanations based on relevant literature in the field as to why the participants may think, feel and act in the way that they say they do. There is no intention to generalise to, for example, the rest of the American teaching and student populations based on these. However, that does not mean that some of the findings might not broadly reflect the experience of teaching and learning music in the Northern states of the USA, or within middle-class education settings in America, and some of the findings may well have resonance with others who recognise some of the issues, challenges, viewpoints that these teachers describe. As Bognan and Biklen state, the assumption of qualitative researchers is that “human behaviour is not random or idiosyncratic” (2003, p. 32). However, the intention of this project is not to generalise to the wider population, and generalisability is not a central value indicator for qualitative studies.

Walcott sums this up by emphasising what is to be learned from a case study, despite its uniqueness. “Each case study is unique, but not so unique that we cannot learn from it and apply its lessons elsewhere” (1995, p. 17). Wellington’s (2000) version of this notion is that “...in some ways all schools are the same, in other respects they are all different...” (p. 99). Drawing on the work of Mitchell (1983) he concludes

...even if case study research cannot produce or create generalizations, it can be used to explore them. Thus the study of a case can be valuable in exploring how general principles are exemplified in practice (Wellington, p.99)

Ethical Considerations

Ethical approval for this study was provided by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee. Participants in the study were given the option to be named or anonymous in the study. Most chose to be named. However, because some participants selected to be anonymous I decided to treat all participants as anonymous participants. Therefore the settings have been given signifiers (for example, Sydney School A) and all participant names have been changed. The student participants were of an age to sign their own consent forms, except for the two eleven year old students, described previously. Parental consent was gained for those students.

Chapter 4 New Zealand Case Study

Auckland, New Zealand

This case study includes music teachers and students from three secondary schools in Auckland, New Zealand. The teacher participants were selected on the expert recommendation of Stephanie Lees from the New Zealand Music Commission³, Robyn Trinick, music lecturer from the University of Auckland Faculty of Education; School of Arts, Languages and Literacies, and secondary school music advisor, Elizabeth Williams⁴. For this case I interviewed five teachers and eight students.

This chapter includes the following:

- A brief overview of the context of high school music education in New Zealand.
- Demographic information about the three participant schools.
- Biographical information about the participants.
- A summary of the results from interviews.
- Identification and discussion of significant themes, with links to relevant literature.

Overview of the Context of High School Music Education in New Zealand

A significant aspect of the context of education in New Zealand is the ongoing relevance of New Zealand's founding document, The Treaty of Waitangi.

³ The New Zealand Commission is a government-funded agency which provides programmes to support music education in schools, and to strengthen and promote the New Zealand music industry.

⁴ Elizabeth Williams is an advisor with Team Solutions. Team Solutions is a teacher professional development provider within the University of Auckland Faculty of Education.

This document affirms the partnership between the tangata whenua (people of the land) and the European (Pakeha) colonizers. In education, it means that acknowledgement of the status of Māori and Pakeha as treaty partners is intended to ensure positive educational outcomes for both parties, particularly with regard to the preservation and invigoration of language and other cultural treasures. It can be argued that for at least 150 of the 170 years since the signing of the Treaty, education policy and practice has fallen short in terms of honouring the Treaty, and has failed to create equitable, inclusive learning environments where Māori can experience success as Māori. However, the last decade has seen increasing efforts to improve educational outcomes for Māori students through culturally responsive teaching. Many of these efforts have come from Māori in the interests of Māori.

For minority groups indigenous to New Zealand or with permanent residence here, in particular Māori and Pasifika⁵ students, culturally responsive teaching is increasingly identified as an important factor in raising student achievement and closing gaps in terms of the education outcomes for minority culture groups. Importantly, the last decade has seen the development of Kaupapa Māori⁶ approaches to education for diversity. These have largely grown from significant work to raise the achievement of Māori students undertaken by Māori researchers and educationalists such as Russell Bishop, Ted Glynn and Angus McFarlane. Bishop, in particular, has worked to turn around what he has

⁵ Pasifika is a term used to describe people living in New Zealand who identify with the Pacific Islands because of ancestry or cultural heritage.

⁶ Kaupapa Māori approaches are those that are underpinned by Māori knowledge, ways of knowing, and a Māori world view.

described as the ongoing impact of colonialism on education and social outcomes for Māori. A decade ago he and others despaired at the continued colonisation of the education system.

No significant advancement is being made in addressing cultural diversity in society in general or mainstream education institutions, including classrooms, because current educational policies and practices in most Western countries were developed and continue to be developed within a framework of colonialism. As a result, the system continues to serve the interests of a monocultural elite (Bishop, 1999, p. 12).

Many students have benefitted subsequently from the Māori-led approaches to professional development of teachers such as Te Kotahitanga⁷ (Bishop, 2001). Such approaches aim to shift teacher attitudes so that they view minority students as “pedagogical assets” (p. 15) with much to offer. However, the authors make it clear that teachers must move away from the idea that these assets are limited to “feasts and holy days” (p. 16). They warn against the simplification and commodification of, in particular, Māori cultural knowledge where such knowledge is sanitised and packaged for consumption by the majority culture in ways that fail to benefit or enhance the educational experience of Māori participants (p. 17).

Bishop and others have examined the ways that the curriculum represents the histories and identities of Māori and other minority students, as well as the ways that curriculum content and pedagogical processes, in particular assessment requirements, continue to privilege majority ways of knowing and being in the world. They argue that education

⁷ Kotahitanga is a research and professional development project initiated in response to the underachievement of Māori students in mainstream schools.

needs to be inclusive of Māori world views, but in Māori controlled ways (Kaupapa Māori) to avoid the removal of cultural elements “from the context within which they make sense” (p. 28). In particular, the Māori voice must be facilitated so that it is included in the “historical and present storying” of New Zealand (p. 53). Bishop has inspired teachers to reflect critically on their teaching, asking them to identify whose reality and experiences are presented and considered legitimate (p. 55) and to ask “in what ways do pedagogic practices facilitate student voice?” (p. 162). Bishop’s findings from a project that gathered narratives from students, teachers, whānau⁸, and principals about the experiences of Māori students in education found that the biggest influence on the educational achievement of Māori students was the quality of their relationship with their teachers. Central to this relationship was the teachers’ ability and willingness to value students’ cultural knowledge and aspirations, as well as their efforts to nurture the relationship between home and school. Building Māori pedagogies into the programme was also seen as a key way to enhance educational outcomes for Māori students (Bishop and Berryman, 2006, pp. 256-257). To this end, McFarlane, 2004, has described ways that key Kaupapa Māori principles can be applied in education settings, including that people in the community should be valued as excellent resources, that aural/ oral learning strategies are valuable and can result in “deep” learning, and that it is very important to involve parents and families in their children’s education (p. 68).

⁸ Whānau is a Māori word denoting a kinship group.

The increasing number of international students in New Zealand has also resulted in an increased appreciation of the need for culturally informed and responsive classroom teaching. This has been at least partly motivated both by a concern for New Zealand's reputation as an inclusive educational host, and the desire to sustain and build lucrative international education markets. However, as Bishop pointed out over a decade ago, viewing such students simply as a commodity to be exploited ignores the benefits for all students that come from learning in culturally diverse classrooms (Bishop, 1999, p. 15).

New Zealand is an increasingly culturally diverse country, with significant numbers of Pasifika and Asian peoples in particular, choosing to make New Zealand their home. Pasifika and Asian communities are increasingly vocal and active in their efforts to be recognized and have their particular needs and interests met within education settings. This is having an impact on education policy and direction. For example, the *Pasifika Education Plan* published in 2009 outlines a programme to enhance educational opportunities and outcomes for Pasifika students. The Plan is based on the premise that Pasifika diversity is a strength that can be built on in education to benefit Pasifika learners.

Pasifika people have multiple world views and diverse cultural identities. They are able to operate and negotiate successfully through spiritual, social, political, cultural and economic worlds. Success in education requires harnessing Pasifika diversity within an enabling education system that works for young people, their families and communities. This requires the education system, leadership, and curricula to start with the Pasifika learner at the centre, drawing on strong cultures, identities and languages (Ministry of Education, 2009).

The Plan is underpinned by research findings, such as those from Fa'afai, Fletcher, O'Regan, Parkhill, and Taleni (2009) who found that "Pasifika students' literacy learning and overall learning was more likely to be enhanced when Pasifika values, language

identities and cultural knowledge were made an implicit part of the teaching and learning practices” (p. 24).

In New Zealand, the ability to value and address cultural diversity is currently considered a crucial aspect of education and other social policy areas. This is evidenced in the signing of the UNESCO convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expression in 2007 and can also be seen within the Ministry for Culture and Heritage’s work to support the ‘Cultural Well-Being’ requirements of the 2002 Local Government Act. This Act requires local authorities to consider ‘cultural well-being’ in their planning. Cultural well-being is described as “the vitality that communities and individuals enjoy through having the freedom to retain, interpret and express their arts, history, heritage and traditions” (Ministry of Culture and Heritage Web Site).

In education, an emphasis on the importance of culturally responsive teaching can be found in the *Best Evidence Synthesis* (Alton-Lee) which was commissioned by the Ministry of Education and published in 2003. This is a significant document that synthesises evidence-based research on teaching and learning and articulates findings related to the characteristics of quality teaching for a diverse range of students. Three findings that are particularly relevant to this study are that;

- quality teaching recognises and builds on students’ prior experiences and knowledge.
- student diversity is utilised effectively as a pedagogical resource.
- quality teaching respects and affirms cultural identity and optimises educational opportunities (p. viii).

These findings contributed to the shaping of the Ministry of Education Statement of Intent (2007) which emphasised the need for New Zealand's education system to;

- connect learning to family and community backgrounds
- create diverse learning opportunities and networks,
- use diverse teaching approaches (p. 12).

The revised New Zealand Curriculum was officially launched in November 2007. Its principles state that New Zealand children must "...experience a curriculum that; acknowledges the bicultural foundations of Aotearoa New Zealand; reflects New Zealand's cultural diversity and values the histories and traditions of all its people; has meaning for students, connects with their wider lives, and engages the support of their families, whānau, and communities' (p. 9).

In music education, the bi- and multicultural nature of New Zealand society is acknowledged within the music component of *The Arts within The New Zealand Curriculum* (2007). The discipline description states that "Music is a fundamental form of expression, both personal and cultural. Value is placed upon the musical heritages of New Zealand's diverse cultures, including traditional and contemporary Māori musical arts" (p. 21).

An increase in the development of culturally diverse music education resources is evident within the last ten years. In particular, song books developed in collaboration with community members and musicians representing Pasifika communities have been

welcomed by schools. These include Niuean, Samoan, Tongan, and Cook Island Songbooks⁹ that have been provided free to all primary schools. Another example of the rich cultural contribution of Pasifika communities is the increasing popularity of the Auckland Māori and Pacific Cultural Festival known as ‘Polyfest’. This festival is the largest Māori /Pasifika festival in the world and attracts approximately 9000 students who compete in traditional music and dance. Polyfest is a great source of pride for Māori and Pasifika youth and is a very important and visible celebration of young talent and cultural identity. The festival was established in 1976 and has been growing in numbers of participants and the ethnic diversity of the performers. In 1991 it widened its embrace to include Asian performers and in 2010, African groups performed on a ‘diversity’ stage aimed at celebrating the wider cultural diversity of New Zealand.

The student participants in this case study have all selected to study music for the NCEA qualification.¹⁰ Music programmes in secondary schools, both compulsory and elective, involve a combination of music theory, instrumental playing and performance, and the analytical study of music works. While musical examples used to illustrate the ‘elements’ of music may sometimes be non-Western, the tools for analysis generally reflect Western musical concepts and conventions. ‘World Music’ is typically studied as a unit in Year 10. Apart from this unit, music programmes are largely dominated by the study and

⁹ See for example, Ministry of Education (2002). *Au ‘Imene Kūki ‘Airani nō Tātou I Aotearoa nei: Cook Islands Songs*. Wellington: Learning Media.

¹⁰ The NCEA (National Certificates of Educational Achievement) is New Zealand’s qualification for senior secondary students. Student achievement is measured against standards through a mix of internal and external assessment opportunities. Standards are organised into levels of increasing difficulty.

performance of Western classical music and contemporary styles, reflecting the music education backgrounds of secondary school music teachers and the focus of music teacher education (Henderson, 2003).

Music is taught as part of a combined arts curriculum until year 8¹¹. In New Zealand, some primary and intermediate schools employ a music specialist, but most do not. Music is usually a mandatory subject in years 9 and 10 and an elected subject after that. As in Australia, secondary school music programmes are general musicianship programmes that integrate practical and theoretical components, including composition. Students also have opportunities to play as soloists and in various choral and instrumental ensembles.

Secondary schools also offer extra-curricular ‘cultural’ performing arts opportunities, such as Kapahaka¹², Sasa¹³ or Bollywood dance groups. These are often lead by students and/or culture bearers from the community. Schools may have one music teacher, or more than one, including some with specialist interests, for example, a choir director. All schools have itinerant instrument teachers to teach individuals or groups.

The flexibility of the NCEA qualification allows teacher and students to build individually tailored programmes, particularly at the senior level. These can include Māori Performing Arts standards which sit within Māori Studies. The same applies to technology standards

¹¹ New Zealand children can begin school on their fifth birthday (year 0). They become a year 1 student sometime during their first year of schooling. In year 8 they will be 12 years old. Year 9 is generally the beginning of secondary schooling, although some secondary schools include years 7 and 8.

¹² Kapahaka refers to Māori performing arts including song, haka, stick and poi dancing.

¹³ The sasa is a Samoan group dance.

relevant to music, such as recording, manipulation of digital media, or setting up PA system. Notation requirements are flexible, allowing representation as appropriate to the genre. National high-profile music events occur annually. These include; the Big Sing choral competition, Play It Strange, a song-writing competition, Rock Quest, a competition for school rock bands, Pasifika Beats, a competition for young composers where compositions must include particular cultural elements such as language or actions/movement, and the New Zealand Chamber Music Competition. These are all well supported by secondary schools.

A useful overview of New Zealand music education development and challenges over the last 100 years has been provided by Thwaites (2008). Thwaites was one of the writers of the Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum Document, written in 2000, and made compulsory in all schools from Years 1 to 13. Through four strands across Dance, Drama, Visual Art and Music, multiple literacies are developed through the following skill and knowledge areas: Developing Practical Knowledge in the Arts; Developing Ideas in the Arts; Communicating and Interpreting in the Arts; and Understanding the Arts in Context. However, this document has a reduced status currently as a “supplementary document” to support the highly regarded current curriculum document (2007). Thwaites expresses concern regarding the health of music education in New Zealand resulting, in particular, from a reduction in Music curriculum time within teacher education programmes and within school programmes. These reductions mirror the increasing emphasis on numeracy and literacy by both the previous and current government, linked to government concerns with preparing citizens for contribution to the “knowledge economy” with skills considered necessary for participation in the local and global market place. Thwaites is

also concerned that the potential within the New Zealand Curriculum for culturally responsive arts education is not being realized.

About the Schools

Auckland is the largest city in New Zealand with a current population of over 1.2 million. Approximately 55% of the population are of European descent, 11% are Māori (the indigenous people of New Zealand). Approximately 14% of the population are immigrants from the Pacific Islands, and around 18% are Asian. Around two per cent are Middle Eastern, Latin American or African (Statistics New Zealand- 2006 Census).

As evidenced below, socio-economic status is linked to the ethnic diversity of the school community. Schools with large percentages of Māori and Pasifika students are likely to be situated within communities of lower socio-economic status.

Table 1: Auckland Schools Demographic Information

School	Roll	Socio-economic status of community	Ethnicities
Auckland School A	Co-ed 1800	Low to middle	30% Indian 18% Pacific Island 17% European/NZ 15% Asian 14% Māori
Auckland School B	Co-ed 903	Middle to high	69% European/NZ 16% Maori 8% Pacific Island 4% Asian
Auckland School C	2241	Middle	36% European/NZ 10% Maori 17% Pacific Island 3% East African 8% Indian 5% Chinese

Student Biographies

This section introduces the New Zealand student participants and gives some insight into their family, community and school lives, music preferences and interests, and aspirations for future music making, work and study.

Peter (Auckland School A; Teacher - Kerry)

Peter is in Year 13. He has been learning music in a formal sense since he was six or seven years old. He began with learning the piano and theory “*from theory books*”. At 17 he is an orchestral percussionist, playing in a local concert band and the Auckland Symphony Orchestra. Peter comes from a musical family with parents and a brother who are all musicians. He is planning a career in music, including studying classical percussion performance at the University of Auckland, with an ultimate goal of playing percussion with the New Zealand Symphony Orchestra. Peter loves “*sound makers*” of all kinds and particularly enjoyed an opportunity to travel with an orchestra to China and purchase some unfamiliar instruments while he was there.

...we went into a Chinese music shop and I had a good play with most of the instruments in there. I bought some instruments as well which was quite cool. I bought a gourd flute, kind of a recorder with drones on the side. I love it. It's great. Also the different instruments, that aren't so culture based, but things like... Dr Seuss even created some... things where you blow into one end and then swing that end round or submerge that end in water and play that...it makes cool sounds as well.

Sina (Auckland School A; Teacher - Kerry)

Sina is in Year 13. She has a Samoan father and a Pakeha mother. Her mother plays piano and sings and her father “*is Samoan and music is a big part of his culture as well*”. Sina is

used to having singing as an important part of family celebrations.

Sina

We've grown up going to church so there's lots of singing and stuff at church and also at family get togethers. Especially with my Samoan family. They do a lot of singing.

TR

What sorts of things do they sing?

Sina

Traditional Samoan songs. I got a few half brothers and sisters and over the last few years quite a lot of them have got married and music is a big part of the ceremony and the reception as well, because lots of the families get up and they perform items as part of the entertainment. So, there's all that singing and dancing.

Sina's parents have contrasting views on the appropriateness of music as a career pathway.

Sina

Well my Dad would like me to be a doctor or a lawyer or something well paid. My mum, she's happy for me to do whatever I want. She's encouraging me to keep up with my music because it's a big part of my family.

TR

So, do you think your Dad thinks being a musician is a good career?

Sina

I don't think so. That's because music is just part of everyday life, it's not something you do as a career.

Sina is very interested in finding out about different musics from around the world and is considering studying ethnomusicology at university.

Silesi (Auckland School A; Teacher - Kerry)

Silesi is in Year 12. He is Samoan. Silesi sings and plays bass guitar and drums. His family are all musical. His brother is a song writer and his father has a recording studio at

home. Silesi enjoys a wide range of styles, including classical, reggae, rock, R&B and gospel. He enjoys some rap styles.

...probably rap, but in a singing way, you know how they've joined singing and rap, so I don't see me rapping. I'm good with lyrics but in like a more soulful, R&B way.

Silesi composes Christian gospel style songs that he describes as “*more like sort of love songs*”. He plays mostly by ear and says that he needs help with reading and writing conventional notation. Other people’s enjoyment of making music is a major source of pleasure for Silesi. One of the things he enjoys most about learning music at school is the opportunity it gives to share his love of music with others.

As an older student at Papatoetoe, like a senior student, now, like learning and knowing music, I want to teach other people, like you sort of let them feel the way you felt about music, like really passionate about music, and it's good to see other people, it's good to know that they feel the same way, and when they feel the same way it's really great to be in music, and like helping others know about music to make music grow.

Silesi plays in his church band. He is also in the 1st XV rugby football team, plays Samoan cricket and is a Waka Ama (traditional canoeing) competitor for his school. Visual art and drama are also strengths for Silesi. He plans to study the arts at university.

Seth (Auckland School B; Teachers - Elizabeth and Sam)

Seth is in his final year (year 13). He is a rock drummer who learns drumming from a private teacher. Depending on the mood he is in, Seth likes “*kind of the new age stuff, ranging from soft, mellow, melodic stuff to heavy stuff*”. He also enjoys including “*samba grooves*” in his original rock compositions. He has learned about Latin rhythms from his drum teacher. Seth is not particularly motivated when it comes to music theory and sees himself as a practical musician. He feels that music is a subject that he can relax in and

enjoy, which is different to the way he feels about other subjects at school.

All of them you just kind of sit there and listen, the teacher writes on the board, whereas in music you can go away and do your own thing, and create music.

Seth thinks that drummers sometimes “*get away*” with a lot in music, because their classically trained teachers don’t really know what they are assessing. He sees the music department as a place where he can come and practise, but without his drum lessons outside of school he probably wouldn’t be studying music at school. Seth is also studying Calculus and Physics and is considering a career as an acoustic engineer.

Dylan (Auckland School B; Teachers - Elizabeth and Sam)

Dylan is in Year 12. His “*whole family are musicians*”. Dylan is a guitarist, singer and composer. He describes the music he is into as “*musician’s music*”.

Not just your standard pop song lyrics that will remind you of the last time you broke up with your boyfriend or girlfriend, but ideas that stretch from the limitations of what everyone’s comfortable with, bands like Radiohead and Tool, who use different time signatures and different key signatures. Something that Tool does very well is make a riff and, you know, if you pretend a straight line is the riff, it will just go on a complete tangent at one point, but still recognising that it is the same song.

Dylan has some difficulty with reading and writing conventional notation and feels that this makes it hard for him to meet the academic requirements for composition; he would have to simplify his compositions to be able to write them down. He believes that most Māori students choose music to study at school because they want to play music. He doesn’t think that many Māori students see music as a career pathway “*because it generally tends to be just a party trick, to strum out some Bob Marley and sing along*”. However, this does not reflect his personal aspirations. Dylan is planning to study

contemporary music at university. His dream career is “*to become a proper musician, a performance musician. I’m alternative, so not mainstream and maybe writing for movies and even becoming a teacher one day*”.

Annabel (Auckland School C; Teachers - Sonja and Mark)

Annabel is in Year 12. Annabel started learning the piano at the age of six. She also learned violin, but found two instruments too much to cope with in the context of a busy school and sporting life. Her mother, brother and sister all play the piano. Annabel has “*gone through the grades*” with Trinity College and is now playing at an advanced diploma level. She is a good sight reader, but is less confident about improvising and playing by ear. Annabel doesn’t find learning music at school particularly challenging, however, she is planning to study for a music degree at university with a possible view to teaching music in a secondary school. Despite the lack of challenge, Annabel greatly enjoys her music classes. She particularly values the performance opportunities, and the friendships she has made.

We have so many good opportunities at this school and such good people to work with...A lot of encouragement and support. A lot of opportunities. We’ve just been to Sydney Opera House with the orchestra. That was amazing. And we have opportunities to perform in assemblies and like concerts and stuff...I’ve got loads more friends through music. Confidence in speaking and being around people. My close friends are musicians. It’s just a good way to relax and have fun.

Michael (Auckland School C; Teachers – Sonja and Mark)

Michael was born in China, and came to New Zealand at the age of six. He loves New Zealand. “*The environment, the people are really nice, and the politics and the society, it’s perfect*”. Michael began his formal music education at the age of eight. He was inspired to learn piano after hearing a primary school teacher accompanying school

singing on the piano. He also loves the sound of brass and plays a variety of brass instruments. *“Euphonium, trumpets anything. They are all the same principles”*. On the piano, Michael plays classical music, enjoys accompanying others and plays some jazz, although he feels that he lacks the knowledge of harmony needed to improvise. He composes for piano. *“Simple style, simple melodies. I wouldn’t say any style, maybe classical with hints of jazz and hints of modern rhythms”*. He would like to know about Chinese musics, but feels that there is no opportunity for him to learn about these. Michael chose to study music because he felt it would be easy for him due to his music education background outside school and it would also provide a setting for making friends. He enjoys the diversity of the class and values the opportunities he has had through music to be part of a group and to form relationships with other musicians.

TR

What do you think are the benefits of learning music at school for you?

Michael

You are meeting new people and being influenced by them.

TR

So, it’s about relationships with other people?

Michael

Yes

TR

So, do you think about that more than you think about learning music to make yourself into a better musician?

Michael

Yes, I’m more into talking to people.

Michael responds emotionally to music and this is at the heart of his enjoyment of learning and making music.

TR

Why do you love it so much? Is it because you are good at it?

Michael
I'm very sensitive so I can feel the music.

TR
So, it's the emotional side?

Michael
Yes. Some people like the technical side, or the showy off side. But for me, I just feel the music. I don't mind if I don't end up famous.

Michael plans to study music at university, then aims to be a concert pianist, or conductor or composer, or a combination of these.

Hannah (Auckland School C; Teachers – Sonja and Mark)

Hannah is in Year 12. She has been learning the flute “*on and off*” depending on the availability of teachers for the last five years. She also sings and plays piano and guitar.

Hannah enjoys both group and solo work, but suffers from “*stage fright*” when singing as a soloist. She enjoys improvising, but avoids much composed jazz flute pieces because “*jazz flute can be icky*”.

Improvisation is fun. It really helps with composition because you learn what works and what doesn't and when you are thrown into a situation where you've got to make something sound good on the spot you start learning how your instrument works an awful lot better than playing something that is rote learned.

Hannah enjoys singing R&B and soul music, but on the advice of her teacher is exploring musical theatre and more operatic singing styles. Music is Hannah's favourite part of the week. She enjoys the opportunities for self expression and the chance to mix with a group of like-minded people.

I like the way that we can express ourselves through whatever genre we like and how that we're with a whole bunch of people who are equally passionate about music.

Music is a possible career path for Hannah, along with professional soccer playing, sport science, law, or medicine.

Teacher Biographies

Kerry (Auckland School A)

Kerry's music education began with piano lessons at the age of seven. She also learned the clarinet and sang in choirs at high school. She became a "show junkie" after performing in a school production of *Viva Mexico*. She has participated in many shows since, both on stage and in various directing roles, and is now an active member of **** Performing Arts, a local theatre group. Kerry completed a BA with a music major at Auckland University before training to become a music teacher at Auckland College of Education. At this time she also completed her LTCL Teaching Diploma. She has been Head of the Music Department at Auckland School A since 1995. Kerry's love of the performing arts is what led her into music teaching, as well as her belief that music can be a pathway for students of all abilities to increase their belief in themselves, and grow in many other areas of their life and education. She loves the variety of challenges teaching provides and enjoys learning something new from her students every day. Kerry acknowledges that the life of a secondary school music teacher is a very full and busy one, with some overwhelming administrative and organisational requirements.

What I have to address is a choir, concert band, jazz band, Rock Quest bands, 3 Pasifika Beats bands, Chamber Group, Elite choir, it's really busy and probably the hardest things are when you come in exhausted from taking a choir to a performance the night before at the Auckland Town Hall and you have to turn around and teach the Year 10s. I find the hardest thing is balancing and trying to keep the importance of what happens in the classroom on a par with taking after school and lunchtime rehearsals, and we've got Production as well. It's huge. There are 2 other teachers and one teacher from Media Studies who takes the choir and plays piano for

Production. It's probably something that needs to be addressed by schools. You have a sports co-ordinator and you do really need a performance music co-ordinator and that person can come in and do the paper work and book the buses, all the admin things that you are trying to fit round teaching and planning. Admin tasks are not the best use of our time.

Elizabeth (Auckland School B)

Elizabeth grew up in Timaru. She loved school and planned to be a teacher from a young age. Her mother is a primary school teacher and Elizabeth initially planned to teach at the primary level, but changed her mind when she reached secondary school. She didn't know at that stage what subject she might teach as a secondary school teacher. When she left school she studied at the University of Otago.

The plan was to do a maths degree - that was behind my acceptance to training college. I ended up majoring in economics for want of something to actually complete my degree with. Along the way I threw myself into stage two drama and discovered I could get free singing lessons if I took performance voice – so I auditioned and was away.

After traveling and working overseas Elizabeth trained as a teacher at Christchurch College. Her first teaching job was in West Auckland, which has a high population of Māori and Pasifika peoples.

My Māori and Pacific cultural learning curve was soooooo steep but it just felt like the right place to be and the right thing to be doing. I don't remember any awareness of culture or ethnicity when I was at school other than a project I did in form two on Scottish clan shields – I was (am) very proud to be a [Scottish Name]. When I look back now I can see the Māori, Chinese and Tongan girls in my classes but I don't recall knowing that about them then.

She has now been at Auckland School B for 11 years. She considers Auckland home.

Elizabeth attributes some of her empathy towards students from ethnic minorities to her experience of coming out as a lesbian.

I had experience of not fitting in, of being in a minority – but I also came to understand the strength of a community. It was and is a big part of shaping my approach to life.

Elizabeth recognises the power of music performance to transform perceptions of a student's abilities and personal strengths.

Sometimes somebody will look at my role and say “My goodness, you've got this one and this one, and this one”. But they're my stars. I remember a boy who's year 13 this year. His first performance in year 11, I had tears running down my face. The next morning I said to staff. “You're not going to believe this”. I brought the video in to the staffroom to play to people, 'cos everybody had this boy down as an absolute wally. He was a pain to be around. And then he got a guitar in his hand, and Wow.

TR

It sounds like you really prioritise the student's needs and interests.

Elizabeth

Yes, that's developed over time. And I'm loving the job. And loving the kids. I hear music teachers talk about students and I think, for Heaven's sake, who are you in this job for?

Sam (Auckland School B)

Sam teaches in the music department at Auckland School B. He trained to be a teacher in England. He is as a professional jazz musician and he is a skilled improviser.

That performing experience has been useful for me, and playing in different musical situations makes me fairly confident as a music teacher that I can juggle lots of balls in the air and let things go where they might go and still keep a hold on things. I'm an improviser I suppose. I play jazz.

Sam also has a background as an Art teacher and believes that this influences the way he teaches music.

Coming out of art, I see music as gestures in time and space rather than something that is written down, it's a chord sequence that you play.

He also believes that teachers need to demonstrate passion in order to motivate and stimulate their students.

You need to be a performer in your own life. You need to be passionate and excited about what you're doing and the students will take that on board. It doesn't matter what your area is, you can still involve a lot of the students.

Sam has drawn on his own background and experiences as a music learner in the way that he works with students.

I started out teaching music with very little knowledge. I'm talking back in England. I'd been a relief teacher. I learned on the job. I'd only just found out what a chord was. I was going to jazz night classes and I'd go "that was really good, why don't I do that?", so for the next few weeks we'd ...so I had to learn about the different instruments. I did a lot of group music making. More and more, I'm just trying to get the students to do it- the writing down of notation follows that- we play the chord on the guitar and we say, "where do we put our fingers?, now let's make a chord chart and then we write it down", not the other way round. Any teacher needs to analyze the way that the students are learning, and in music we're learning by touch and feel and vision. I see some students who are paying no attention to what I am saying but are just watching my fingers.

Sonja (Auckland School C)

Sonja was born and educated in Belgrade in Yugoslavia. She attended a specialized music school from the age of six. Education at this school was free, with a requirement to pass exams in order to maintain your place in the school. It was a high pressure environment with a very comprehensive programme. She notes that New Zealand children have a very different understanding of what it means to be busy at school than she had.

At a certain point I had 18 subjects. That is why it's, for me, unbelievable when kids complain here. 'Oh five options is too many'. Well, it's nothing. And you don't have them everyday obviously and so you have to study on your own a lot and do a lot of your own research. I was having more specialized music subjects before university. It wasn't like here you cover a little bit of everything through music as a subject. I had harmony, counterpoint, history of music, national history of music, everything, chamber music, solo performance, choir, orchestra, everything, so it was completely different from what we have here. I was a bit surprised.

Sonja had studied music at secondary school for a further four years and then completed four years of music study at university. Her music education had an ethnomusicological component, focusing on the folk music of Yugoslavia. After university Sonja taught music for seven and a half years in a mainstream school. At the beginning of 1995 she left Yugoslavia and moved to New Zealand. *“...because of the obvious reasons. The country started falling apart. It wasn't as good as it was before.”*

Sonja taught music in secondary schools, ending up in her current position as Head of the Music Department at Auckland School C in 2002.

Mark (Auckland School C)

Mark *“hated”* school and didn't start learning music until he was about 13. He then became very involved in music making at his church.

I'd always had this passion inside me that I wanted to do something with music, but I didn't quite know what. I was brought up in the Presbyterian church. The next thing as a teenager I was taking choirs and choirs was like my forte and from there I started music, learning piano, singing and cello.

Mark also played the cello in his school orchestra. He had several different forms of employment after leaving school, none of which were satisfying. The desire to find a way to be involved in music making and teaching motivated him to have a change of career pathway and enter the teaching profession.

When I finished school I really didn't know what I wanted to do. So I went into the public service for a few years, and then into sales for a few years and then got into accounting and was there for 13 years. And then it was only a few years ago that I said I don't want to do this for the rest of my life. Because that passion for music kept burning inside me. Over the years I've been doing a lot of church choirs and community choirs and I said I'm going to uni to finish some papers and then to teach. So that's what I did.

His parents recognized his passion for music and were supportive of his decision to teach music. Mark is a quiet person who is skilled at forming relationships with students through effective and empathic communication and evident interest in the students as individuals.

TR

What is it about you, about your upbringing or whatever that enables you to cross that bridge so easily?

Mark

Well, I don't really know, because I'm normally quite a shy, quiet person, but I think since I've started, after my first year, I just like, and I still do, I absolutely love it here. I spent so many years working in an office, in a different environment, and now I'm standing in front of a classroom which just seems like a natural thing and it doesn't scare me and I think it's about getting on with all types kids from diverse backgrounds, and just making that effort to communicate with them.

Results of Interviews with New Zealand Students

Table 2: New Zealand Student Information Summary

Student (Pseudonyms)	School	Where born/ Ethnicity info
Silesi	Auckland School A	Samoan
Sina	Auckland School A	Samoan/European
Peter	Auckland School A	European
Seth	Auckland School B	European
Dylan	Auckland School B	Māori
Hannah	Auckland School C	European
Annabel	Auckland School C	European
Michael	Auckland School C	Chinese

Research Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

Despite the diversity of the student participants, there was a uniformity of opinion across the three schools regarding the issues associated with this question. Most of the students

had not considered that the cultural diversity of the student population or wider school community might inform their music programmes and were largely unable to provide examples of ways that responsiveness to cultural diversity was evident in the programmes. The majority view was that school music education is dominated by Western music knowledge and practice, that this is the norm in school music education, and not problematic. However, the positioning of ‘cultural’ music making as an extra-curricular activity was seen by some as an example of ways that their school, as a community, was inclusive and welcoming of cultural difference, providing “*something for everybody*” (Peter).

All of the students were very happy with their programmes as they were currently experienced, however, two students, Sina and Silesi, expressed concern that some students might feel excluded from music education participation because of the privileging of Western musics and were thoughtful about possible solutions to this issue. In contrast to the majority of the student participants, Silesi and Sina felt that the musical content of their programme should be relevant to and inclusive of the cultural connections and identities of the class members and wider school community. In particular, Silesi expressed a strong message of inclusion in his interview and a concern for the feelings of those who might feel excluded by a music programme that privileged one musical culture over others. Silesi expressed interest in learning about Samoan music at school, but was concerned that a focus on the music of Samoa might make other students feel left out. He had observed the fact that Indian students at the school do not elect to study music, and felt that a more musically inclusive programme might encourage those students to

participate in music. He had also surmised that cultural differences in terms of activity preference meant that Indian students were more inclined to choose sport over music.

TR

You have quite a big Indian community here, but they don't do music?

Silesi

But they are more sporty. I know one guy that plays the guitar.

TR

Do you know anything about Indian music?

Silesi

Yep, probably just Bollywood, like that whole sort of scene. There are dancers at school, and I think our school supports their Bollywood dancing groups and that.

When asked about whether or not music students should learn about diverse musics, Silesi made the immediate link to the cultural diversity of the students in the school.

TR

What about music from different parts of the world?

Silesi

Yeah, because there will be a big of range of people that come to our school...

TR

So, you think those students should be able to learn about the musics they might culturally identify with at school?

Silesi

That way you can involve them too, they won't feel left out.

TR

Do you want to learn about the music of the Pacific in your classes? Do think of Samoan music as something to study?

Silesi

Yep. That would be really nice. But like um, it would be good to arrange, not only just Samoan, because other kids would probably feel left out, so you'd do different, other, and it's good cos how we have genres of music but it would be pretty good if we had like music from other different places. I

reckon there's probably a way that they [Indian Students] would get involved if we had like Indian music studies at our school.

Similarly, Sina identified the culturally diverse nature of the school as a reason to include diverse musics in the programme, in particular, Māori, Pasifika, and Indian musics as these are the large cultural groups represented in the school. She was conscious of the absence of Indian students in the music department and expressed interest in having the opportunity to learn more about Indian musics.

Sina

New Zealand is really multicultural, like at our school we have a really large Indian community, but I don't know anything about their music. I'd like to know why their music is important.

Sina felt that student enjoyment of music learning was linked to their identification with the music they were studying.

Sina

It's really important because if you can't identify then you probably won't enjoy it and so you won't try and understand it or enjoy learning about it.

Peter felt that it is quite important for students to identify with music in the programme and expressed interest in having more diverse music content. However, he did not specifically link this to the diversity of the school population. He made the point that the music that he personally identifies with is Western music, and in that way, the school music programme is responsive to his musical identity.

Like other students, Dylan had observed that Indian students in the school do not elect to study music. Dylan attributed this to the nature of Indian cultural difference as opposed to any lack of responsiveness or inclusiveness in music education. Dylan attributed the comfort that Māori students might feel in the context of music education to the music

making experience that is a typical part of his perception of Māori community behavior. He believes that Māori students are attracted by the opportunities to perform, but are less enamoured with the theoretical components of school music learning.

TR

Do any of your Indian students here learn music?

Dylan

I think I've seen only one Indian person in music.

TR

Why do you think that is?

Dylan

Maybe because it's all part of the culture. Māori people probably learned to strum a guitar and sing-a-long with a folk song. I'm not too knowledgeable about the Indian culture.

TR

Do you feel that for Māori students, music is an attractive subject to choose?

Dylan

It definitely is. I think that Māori and Polynesian students come into music to play. They've always got a good sense of rhythm but hardly ever have the theory.

Hannah and Annabel expressed contentment with their programme as they currently experience it. They both feel that their programme is responsive to their particular needs and interests. Michael felt that it is not important for the students to either like or identify with the musical content of the programme.

TR

Do you think it is important for students to see themselves in the music programme and learn about music they identify with?

Michael

Related to them? That's not necessary because we are here to learn about music, we don't necessarily have to like it.

Research Question 2: What barriers to culturally inclusive music education are identified?

The students all appeared to accept that Western classical and contemporary music practice and theory should dominate the music education programme content and teaching methods. Until asked, it appeared that they had not considered that there may be cultural gaps or biases in their programme, nor that there may be ways to interpret the requirements of the NCEA to allow for the investigation of non-Western musics. Some expressed resistance to the idea that music programmes in New Zealand schools could be structured differently, commenting that ‘world’ musics were “*not in the curriculum*” (Michael) and there wasn’t time for “*lots of extras*” (Peter).

The major barriers identified by the students to more diverse and responsive content in the music programme were time, the apparent ‘fullness’ of the current curriculum and student motivation. However, Silesi was unable to identify any particular reason why the music programme should not be more inclusive of diverse musics. He clearly felt that by making the music offerings more diverse, other cultural groups in the school may feel more inclined to select music as a subject. Similarly, Sina was unable to identify the specific barriers that were preventing the music programme from being more culturally informed and responsive, and expressed a great deal of interest in experiencing a curriculum that was more culturally inclusive, particularly in terms of Māori and Pasifika musics. Her assumption was that music education is being practised as it must be practised and that there was currently no vehicle for student voice on the matter to be heard. She would like the opportunity to evaluate her programme in order to give teachers feedback about the quality of music education experience from the students’ perspective.

Peter's view was that the major barrier to more culturally diverse music education was lack of time. The programme, in his view, was already fully stretched and the inclusion of 'world' music would be an "extra" that could not easily be accommodated.

According to Seth, students usually learn about "their own music" outside of school, due to the fact that the music programme is largely driven by teacher preference and curriculum requirements. These present a barrier to a more negotiated, flexible and diverse approach to repertoire selection or teaching method.

Dylan identified the lack of accessibility and familiarity of non-Western musics as a barrier to them being successfully taught in a New Zealand school setting.

...it's a bit hard though because Indian or Chinese, they're not very accessible. Pretty much everyone learns either drum, bass, piano or guitar in the Westernised culture.

Hannah identified student motivation as a potential barrier to increased responsiveness to diversity. She felt that despite her personal interest, others may lack the motivation to learn about non-Western musics. She also felt that non-Western musics need to be learned in the context where they are made, so in fact the classroom setting may not be the right place to explore them.

Hannah

It's something I would be interested in. I think it would be hard to learn it unless you personally are wanting to do that. Like I want to travel when I am older and one of the things I want to do is actually go around the world and see the music parts of it because for that sort of thing you need to actually be there and see it and feel it rather than be taught about it.

Hannah also identified the constraints of a programme that seems to her to be stretched to its limits teaching Western musics.

I think it is something that would definitely interest me, but the programme is already pretty pressed for time, but I mean yeah, maybe, it's not something I've really considered before.

Michael commented that there would be no time to specifically include the musical heritages of the students, because learning in and about Western classical music is evidently the priority. However, he expressed a personal interest in all musics.

TR

What about including the musics of the particular cultural groups you have represented in the class? Would that be a good idea?

Michael

We don't have enough time, and interest. It's not in the curriculum.

TR

Would it interest you?

Michael

Yes, I'm interested in everything.

TR

What about Chinese musics?

Michael

I don't know anything about it. I would like to learn that, but there's no opportunity...It's just not in the curriculum. So, teachers don't teach it.

TR

Do you think that there just isn't time to cover these things, or do you think there is an assumption that Western music is the most important to learn about?

Michael

Both. Yes.

Research Question 3: What do students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

This question covered the students' perceptions about what should be included in their programme, how it should be taught, teacher qualities that would be likely to create a successful programme, and the benefits of being a music student in the school setting. The students all professed to enjoyment of their music programmes. They described similar personal benefits and identified aspects of the organisation, content and pedagogy that they felt were evidence of success.

When asked about the kinds of music and activities that should be included in the programme, while some students felt that there should not be limits on the kinds of music included, four of them emphasised the importance of learning about and playing Western classical music. Their reasons focused on the perceived historical importance of this genre and also that classical music was seen as the best vehicle for transmitting 'theory' and the 'rules' of music.

Silesi highlighted the importance of learning about Western classical music because of its historical importance, and because the theoretical component was useful for his composition work.

Silesi

Classical should still be there because it's really good for others to learn how it was back then. And the music that's there, is like all sorts of notes and it can really help with composition.

Silesi, who is a very active community musician, viewed the theory learning aspect of school music as an important vehicle for his growth as musician. He did not think that he could achieve this growth independently, or in the context of his community music

settings.

TR

Why did you choose to study music at school, instead of just making music outside of school?

Silesi

Because I want to grow. All musicians want to grow, and like write their own stuff, write music. I want to be at the top. I thought I could learn and grow more as a student just add on more information to what I know. I knew music but like when I started learning it, it wasn't as good as it is now.

Challenging as music theory was thought to be for some, the students' comments in general reflected a view that facility with theory was a key ingredient in being properly musically educated. According to Silesi, 'theory' needs to be taught young, before people become too engaged with practical music making, and more resistant to learning theory.

That [theory] should be really strong because our days people are more like practical but once they get older they know...and like composition starts coming in, they're gonna want to write their own stuff and it's harder for them to learn when they are older. It's easier to push it when they are little.

Students attributed deficits in theory knowledge to lack of application on their part.

TR

Do you read and write notation?

Silesi

I'm not that good at it. I'm more like... I play by ear. I can write it, but I'd probably need help.

TR

Do you have to simplify things [compositions] to write them down?

Silesi

Yeah. I'm getting there though.

Sina is confident with the theoretical component of music learning and has appreciated the opportunity to grow her theory knowledge since beginning her school music studies in

year nine. She sees this as an important tool for composition and is pleased that she can confidently read and write conventional notation.

Peter values a balance of theoretical and practical components in his programme. He describes this below.

It's quite well balanced in the amount of practical and theory, especially this year with year 13, we have two practical sessions a week, one composition or one performance, or two composition depending on which course you're doing.

Seth acknowledged a lack of personal motivation regarding theory and was pleased that his particular course would allow him to be successful without a heavy music literacy requirement.

Seth

I'm not really into the theory of music, I'm more practical....I think the course that Elizabeth has chosen for us is mainly performance and a little bit of arrangement- taking other people's music and arranging it, which I should do reasonably well in, if I put the effort in.

Dylan felt that Western classical music was the vehicle for learning theory and the “rules” of music making and composing. According to Dylan, it is therefore a very important component of a successful music programme.

Classical music is actually good, because it's the earliest example of using compositional devices such as harmonies and melodies moving in opposite directions. It's really a straightforward approach, because now days we've got all these revolutionary artists who just break all the rules. But you've got to learn the rules before you break them.

Hannah described her existing programme as being highly successful with its mix of creative opportunity, music history encompassing Western classical music and New Zealand popular music, and ‘theory’ classes.

I would run it pretty similar to this one with all of the opportunities and just the way that we are given the freedom to do composition and work on our performances as long as we actually have the work to produce at the end of the year. I like that freedom and I think that's very good because that's something that a lot of musicians feed off- it's just the freedom to express themselves through whatever type of music they're into. I think, we also do theory like once or twice a week and that's something that musicians obviously need to work on and we do history of music, through like Mozart and Beethoven and like New Zealand music like Zed or Crowded House or things like that.

Annabel highlighted the importance of learning about classical music because of its historical context.

Annabel

I think more like classical stuff that has a lot of history behind it. Certain styles I don't think are very beneficial- like modern day rap. They don't interest me.

Michael has learned theory outside of school and finds this component easy. He also identified Western classical music as an important component of the music programme. He felt that learning about non-Western classical traditions would be unlikely to capture the interest of music students.

TR

What about other "classical" music traditions in the world?

Michael

But they are neglected.

TR

Should we learn about those as well at school?

Michael

I don't think people would be interested in those things. They are already not interested in [Western] classical.

As well as Western classical music, all of the students reported that they were personally interested in 'world' musics and would like to know more about them, even if they

could not envision a way that more musical diversity could be included in their programme.

Sina believes that it is important to include the musics of Aotearoa/New Zealand as well as other neighbours in the Pacific, such as Australia.

TR

What kinds of musics should be included in your music programme?

Sina

Māori music, because we live in New Zealand and Māori culture is a big part of our society. And Pacific music, because they are our neighbours, and maybe Aboriginal music as well.

TR

So the music that is here and around us in New Zealand?

Sina

Yeah, I think that's important.

Peter felt that because Western classical music was the music that he identified with and already knew a lot about, he would value a programme that focused entirely on other musics, in order to provide more challenge and variety.

Peter

It is quite important to have something in the music curriculum that you can identify with, although I'd be quite happy to have a curriculum that didn't have any Western music, so that I could hear about the music of India or China or somewhere else.

Dylan felt that there may be a place for investigating aspects of pre-European Maori music.

It wouldn't make a whole unit by itself, but maybe putting it in there, some kind of thing, where it's like I don't know traditional Maori harmony is this or that. We actually did a unit in I think the 5th form on cultural music trying to make it sound like something from another country.

TR

What did you think about that?

Dylan

I thought it was actually really good because you really look into depths of all the cultures and you say to yourself what makes Indian Indian, what makes this and that this and that.

TR

Would you like to do more of that kind of thing? Do you feel that it would influence or inspire your own music making if you knew more about other kinds of music around the world?

Dylan

I think it would actually because the really good style of music is the fusion style, combining jazz and rock and stuff like that.

Hannah expressed interest in learning about non-Western musics, showing a developing understanding of the dynamic nature of music, with room to further develop her ideas.

I think Western music is quite influenced by a lot of different things around the world. It tends to morph into a whole bunch of different things. I have a friend who is Indian and he's real in to his Indian music and he's opened my eyes up to that genre. It's interesting the differences between them because some are really rhythmic and some are really emotional and yet Western kind of takes all of them and makes it in to their own. It's also a bit more passive, Western music, it grabs the emotion just as strongly but it portrays it in a completely different way. Traditional music is very out there and it's like this is what we want to say and this is what we're going to say.

Annabel also would like to have non-Western musics included in her programme. Her interest in non-Western music has been inspired by the presence and performance in her class of an Indian boy who sings classical Indian music.

TR

Have you thought about what kinds of different musics you would like to learn about?

Annabel

I like the idea of knowing about classical Indian music.

TR

Is that because you have a boy here who is a classical Indian musician?

Annabel

Yeah. He's a great singer.

Michael would like 'world' musics to be included as he is personally very interested.

TR

Do you remember learning about some 'World' music in Year 9?

Michael

No, I probably did, but I don't seem to remember.

TR

So, would you like 'World' music to be a stronger part of the programme?

Michael

Yes, definitely.

TR

Which parts of the world would you like to know about musically?

Michael

South America or Africa and Jazz.

The students talked about their interest in learning about the contexts of music they are performing or investigating. They also felt that contextual information was important so that they could perform sensitively and with understanding. Samoan student, Silesi, spoke about the need for a respectful approach to other people's music, however, he felt that it was acceptable for people to adapt Samoan musics for their own musical purposes as this could be an important part of their musical and cultural growth as a person.

TR

How important do you think it is to learn about the stories and the history of the music that you are learning? ...what the music means for the people who made it?

Silesi

That's really important cos it's sort of like a respect thing. In cultures they have certain rules and I think we should respect that. Cos there's like boundaries to other peoples music.

TR

Would it bother you if someone took a traditional Samoan song and used it out of context and changed it?

Silesi

No, cos it depends what sort of culture you are. There are some cultures that won't allow that.

TR

But you wouldn't mind that?

Silesi

No, because that's sort of like growing for them. If it works for them it's OK.

TR

So, you think its ok to take musical ideas and use them and adapt them.

Silesi

Yep, as long as they are growing as a person and it makes them feel good.

Sina also felt that music needs to be taught with sensitivity and respect for the original maker of the music.

Sina

Music is a big part of so many cultures and if you're ignorant towards the feelings of people you can upset people.

TR

So, what can schools do about that if they are teaching music from different cultures?

Sina

Well, like last year when we looked at the music of Moana Maniapoto, we didn't just study her and the music, we looked at the Māori culture as well so that we could understand why she had created the music in the way that she did and what it meant for her culture.

Peter, Annabel, Dylan and Michael were similarly interested in learning about and performing diverse musics using a contextual approach.

Peter

It's quite important because music is a big part of story telling and society and so understanding the culture behind the music and why they feel that [is important].

Annabel

When you are playing a piece you've got to what it's about. You can't just play it. You've got to know what sort of piece it is and why they wrote it. I always try to find out stuff.

Michael

Yes, if you just play music, without knowing this, something feels empty. I like to know what the artist was like and what background he came from.

Dylan

It's definitely important to delve into the backgrounds of the music for example with blues - it would be easy to play all the standard riffs that all the blues people play, but when you think about and you look into it you find out why did they play that music, why did it sound so sad? You know, the slaves playing and singing for freedom, you know, as their only way of expression. When you know the ideal behind something, when you know what the artist was trying to create, trying to express...if you know the idea behind the music, you can take that up and push it out through your own way.

With regard to how music should be taught, Dylan identified the need for music teachers in New Zealand schools to be skilled and knowledgeable in ways that would enable them to support Māori and Pasifika performance groups to develop their group playing skills.

Dylan

A music teacher to me preferably would have cultural experiences in say Maori and Polynesian field or just lots of group work really. Maori and Polynesian groups tend to have their Kapahaka and group stuff where they all just keep a steady rhythm with guitars strumming away and Island drums tapping away- learning to stay in rhythm from an early age, it's good because as soloist for the first year I just played by myself, but it's completely different when I started playing with other people- you have to listen around to everyone. So that's the most important thing that music

teachers need to have, that experience working with other people and be involved in playing music.

Pakeha student, Seth felt that it is important for New Zealand students to learn about Māori and Pasifika musics and felt that music teachers should be well informed about Māori culture, in particular. This was despite his personal lack of interest in Māori music. He acknowledged that the Māori music component of his programme had not been comprehensive so far.

Seth

We've only done one achievement standard on Māori music. It was contemporary music. It was composed by a European person- It was "Pounamu". That's kind of the only thing we've done about New Zealand culture. I'm not too interested in Māori music, but I do love Brazilian music and I'd like to know more about that.

Sina identified differentiated instruction as an important method for meeting the needs of diverse students.

Well, I think the way that it's run so that the students all get to work on different levels, we're not expected to be working at the same level, is really good, because you can work at your own pace, and you're not doing stuff that is way out of your depth. So, for example, in my music class when we are doing theory or aural work there are some working at level 1 and some at level 2, and some at level 3 in the same class.

Sina also felt that musical and cultural knowledge relevant to the New Zealand education setting was important.

TR

In your opinion what kinds of learning and cultural experiences does a music teacher need to teach music well?

Sina

They need to have a passion for music. I think having a good cultural understanding is quite important, especially in a school like ours that is really multicultural., so that when you're coming up with things that you might teach your class it's not all just classical music, you're teaching a whole range of different things.

An interview question regarding the nature of pre-requisite qualifications for secondary school music teachers revealed a privileging of Western classical training above other pathways to musicianship and, for some students, a particular view of what it means to be musically educated. Three of the eight students believed that a teacher's background in Western classical music, and in theory in particular, were the most important pre-requisites for secondary music teaching. One student felt that Western classical training would qualify a teacher to teach about all musics, whereas a rock music background, for example, may limit the teacher to that particular genre.

TR

In your opinion what kinds of previous learning and cultural experiences does a music teacher need to be a good music teacher?

Michael

Classical training.

TR

So, a really good rock musician couldn't be a music teacher?

Michael

No, there are basic principles.

TR

Why is classical training so important?

Michael

It's disciplined. It's showing the whole spectrum of what's in the music... To be a good teacher, you have to have that classical training. Then if the teacher gets classical students, he or she can work with them. If a teacher came from a rock background...I don't know, they would get training too, I'm sure they would know about harmonies and the backgrounds to the great composers.

TR

So it's the music theory and Western music history background that you are thinking about particularly?

Michael

Yes, so they should know everything from Palestrina to modern music. Whereas, those teachers that only know modern music.... It's all important because, without those classics there wouldn't be rock music. I think it is necessary for students to know the whole picture.

The quality of teaching was considered by all of the students to be a critical factor in terms of their development as musicians and their enjoyment of music learning.

When speaking about the attributes of teachers that were most likely to contribute to effective music education, teacher kindness and empathy were highly ranked.

Michael

We've got a lot of resources. Good studio. Good piano. And teachers. They are kind, good people. Well qualified.

For all of the students, the diversity of the student population, represented in their music classes, was considered to be a relationship building opportunity in itself. While Dylan commented that in his class students tended to “hang out” with students who shared musical interests, all students valued the opportunities to musically cross-fertilise that came from having different musical interests and different cultural backgrounds in their classes.

Annabel

Music is the best time of my week. I spend a lot of time down here. Everyone has a lot of different tastes and interests in our class. It's good to hear all the different styles

Peter commented on the inclusive and supportive nature of his music education experience in the school setting.

I feel very involved with the students and teachers. It's quite good. They are always there and ready to help inside and out of the classroom. I've never heard of anyone who felt ignored or excluded. The teachers do get around to most of the students and try to spend time with people...Between the ensembles and bands and cultural groups there is something for everyone.

Michael had similar feelings.

It's a group thing. You have friends, so you can talk to them, and they're from different backgrounds. They play different music, so you can interact.

Silesi valued the group learning opportunities where he could show leadership, support others and facilitate the enjoyment of all.

I try to get everyone involved. We have assessments at school and we have groups. That's when you can like form a group and people who are not enjoying it. You can just help them out and join them in your group.

Sina described music as the highlight of her week.

Well the students really love coming to music. It's kind of the favourite. And when we do things like our music performance evenings, we get really large crowds who come along and support everybody, because music is something that everyone loves and they look forward to coming to class. It's not one of those "oh no I have to go to music" it's "yay, I get to go".

Results of Interviews with New Zealand Teachers

Table 3: New Zealand Teacher Information Summary

Teachers (Pseudonyms)	School	Ethnicity info
Elizabeth	Auckland School A	Pakeha/European
Sam	Auckland School A	Pakeha/European
Kerry	Auckland School B	Pakeha/European
Sonya	Cleveland School C	European
Mark	Cleveland School C	Samoan

Research Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

Cultural diversity was seen by all teachers to be a positive characteristic of their school community. Elizabeth believes that diversity brings reality to the school setting.

The same things it brings to a school. Reality. It's why I like living in Auckland and don't want to go back to Timaru... the same reason I love going to the Lantern festival or the Avondale Market. It's stepping into different flavours, different smells, different music, different fashion, different ways of walking, greeting people. It just feels so much more real. I have no experience of teaching in a school that's not multicultural. I went to one and loved it but I didn't know anything else, and I think of schools in Auckland, and I wonder what it's like to be in a private girl's school. I may just be feeding the stereotypes that they have in reverse about this place.

Elizabeth, Sam and Kerry provided examples of ways that they respond directly and indirectly to the cultural diversity of the students in terms of content and pedagogical approaches. For example, while Elizabeth does not directly link music content to the cultural identities and heritages of students, she actively values student involvement in extra-curricular 'cultural' performance groups and enables them to use their participation and leadership for school assessment purposes. She makes an effort to attend these performances and sees her presence as an important validation of their musical worth and legitimacy for meeting NCEA assessment requirements. She also works to bring these performing groups into the mainstream of school life in order to provide a variety of contexts and audiences for their performances.

So for example at the Fiafia¹⁴ nights, or when the Niuean or Cook Island groups are practising around the school, I am there. I am at the practices and I talk to the kids about them. Or I find out who in my form class is in the Niuean group. If you are performing in the Cook Island group or Fiafia night then I can mark that as a group performance for a music assessment. If you are performing with the Kapahaka and you are doing a solo, fantastic, I'll be there. So they can use those as assessment. If the Cook Island group is

¹⁴ Fiafia is a Samoan word meaning celebration or gathering.

performing in the talent quest. Great. So one of my roles is to try and get those groups out of just the cultural setting and into the mainstream of the school so that the kapahaka group will perform the haka¹⁵ from their performance at the talent quest or something like that.

According to Elizabeth's account, students are often surprised that their 'cultural' music making is considered by her to be a valid example of musicianship skills. She has a theory that Māori students believe that "*things Māori stay on the Marae*"¹⁶.

They are surprised when, Māori students too, I've said what about the waiata you're doing with Kapahaka? And they've said- oh can we do that? . I had four or five kids last year get up and do their own version of the choral they did for Kapahaka last year as their group performance. And they say, can we use this, and "Of course you can, where does it say you can't?"

Elizabeth also tries to make it possible for students who are in the school's Māori language immersion unit to use Māori language in their song compositions. According to Elizabeth the students are surprised that this is acceptable to her.

Elizabeth

It's like when they are composing a song. The lyrics can be in any language you choose. If you write a song in Māori and I don't understand the words, then that's my problem, and I need to go and find out whether your setting of those words is appropriate. But that's my problem, not theirs.

TR

Are they surprised that you approach things this way?

Elizabeth

They don't believe me. This is where the kids from the immersion unit, not the mainstream, need convincing. They see their use of Māori language as quite separate from the music class.

¹⁵ Haka is a traditional Māori dance form.

¹⁶ The Marae is the meeting house and area for Māori ceremonial gatherings, important meetings and other cultural activities.

Sam, who teaches with Elizabeth, feels that the music programme should be responsive to the cultural backgrounds and identities of the students, but believes that this must be approached sensitively so that students do not feel put on the spot.

... you have to be careful, because you might have students that you know that they do Cook Island drumming, but you can't just say "hey, show us", I might quietly say, "will you show us that sometime?" and they might say "yeah sure". There's a section on Cook Island drumming in our World music unit, but then the students might get embarrassed and not want to do it at the last minute.

However, he sees the value of allowing students to see that culture bearers have different points of view about their musical heritages that all students can learn from. He describes the interesting experience of having some Japanese students reject their own classical music heritage, in much the same way that many Western students do.

It's really funny that we had four students from Japan last year and we played this music, classical Japanese music, but they knew nothing about it, well they knew of it, but they didn't want to know about it, so it was really good for our students to see that they had a point of view and that they felt similarly about their classical music as our kids. This was their classical music, and it wasn't popular music from the point of view of these students. We couldn't just say "this is Japanese music full stop".

Kerry believes that it is important that music learning is “real” and “relevant” for the students. While she doesn't base topics on the particular ethnic backgrounds or cultural knowledge of students in the class, she commented positively on the way that teachers and students can benefit from each other's expertise in different musics. She includes “cultural units” in her programme in year ten. “If we are doing a cultural unit the Samoan students teach them the Sasa”. She particularly values connections with the Pasifika student population and wider community and works hard to gather ‘authentic’ resources for a regularly taught unit on Pasifika music.

Sonya and Mark rejected the idea that programme content should respond directly to the cultural or ethnic backgrounds of the students in either music classes or the wider school population. They both felt that the job of music education is to provide a broad and general programme.

Sonya

We touch everything. I like to give everyone a wide range, it doesn't matter where you are from. You should know a bit about everything.

Sonya is positive about the contributions diverse students make to the programme.

They always bring their background into it and their family's background and some of them are very good in the music that they have at home

Sonya felt that 'cultural' music making outside of school, particularly within the context of the church, enhanced the students' skills and knowledge within a Western classical definition of musicianship and was therefore useful.

When I'm talking about ethnomusic, the music from the church, it increases musicality, they pick up tunes, they compose, they harmonise really well, so it does affect [them].

Mark's opinion was based on his awareness of a lack of space in the curriculum for, in particular, Pasifika musics. He acknowledged that students would not necessarily be provided with an opportunity to learn about their own musical/cultural heritages in any planned way within the music programme because of what he considered were the limitations of assessment requirements. He therefore felt that performance in extra-curricular cultural groups was the most likely opportunity for the student to engage with the music they may have a cultural connection with.

... there's really nothing reflecting Pacific Island culture in level 1, 2 and 3 NCEA, although there is the option to probably put that in, but in general it's about giving the majority of the kids a general overview, but I am aware of the cultural thing and the music of their cultures, and I think well if it isn't in the NCEA then I can use it in their performances.

However, Mark's response to students' cultural and musical differences is through the efforts he makes to get to know the students as individuals. He makes space in his day for students to share aspects of their personal or family lives with him and uses these opportunities to build strong, caring relationships with them as individuals.

Mark

Communication plays a very important part and I think the rapport that you have with students, and actually taking an interest in their...not personal, personal lives, but just their interests in general. A lot of kids come into my room at interval and lunchtimes and even after school and we have casual conversations about how things might be at home and if they are hungry and I have some food I'll offer them some food, just little things, and I think in the 3 years I've been here I've built quite a few relationships. I haven't gone out of my way. It's just happened.

Research Question 2: What barriers to culturally inclusive music education are identified?

Elizabeth, Kerry and Mark teachers commented that the participation of non-European students in their music programmes does not reflect the diversity of the school populations. They have also observed that different cultural groups engage with different music genres. For example, in Kerry's school there is only one Māori student choosing to perform Western classical music. All other classical performers are either Pakeha or Asian. In Elizabeth's school there are no Māori or Pasifika students choosing to play classical music. In particular, these teachers observed that Indian, Māori and Pasifika students are under-represented in music classes. The teachers had a variety of theories about why this is. Elizabeth believes that Indian parents, and some Māori parents,

discourage their children from selecting music as a subject as they prefer them to take on subjects that they feel are more likely to lead to a well-paid and well-respected profession.

Kerry expressed the same opinion regarding Indian parents.

I think within their culture music isn't seen as a valued academic subject, it's maybe something you do for fun. We do have a Bollywood evening every year but the music department has traditionally not been involved in that. It's run by one of the ... teachers here. Um yeah maybe not a career path. I think they do it for fun but that's where it stops. They study the more academic subjects at school.

Interestingly, she has not experienced any negativity from Māori or Pasifika parents about music as a career pathway, and these groups are reasonably well represented in her classroom. She attributes this to the success of family concerts that she has organised, support for which has strengthened over the years. These concerts have served to encourage Māori and Pasifika parental involvement in positive ways in the school.

Mark believes that some Pasifika parents either don't believe that their children are musical enough to study music at school, or don't think of music as a serious subject leading to a suitable career. However, he thinks that attitudes among Pacific Island parents are beginning to change.

TR

Do you have as many Pacific Island students as you would like? Do the numbers in music reflect the overall numbers in the school?

Mark

No, I feel that we could perhaps do a bit of a push for more, but I feel that it is probably to do with parents' attitudes. A few of them feel, I think, that they are not musical enough to take music.

TR

Do you think that some Māori and Pasifika parents are not keen for their kids to pursue a career in music?

Mark

Yeah, I think I'm not sure about Māori but I know with Samoan and Pacific Islanders in general, it's things like law and medicine that parents have been pushing for years for their kids to do, and that mindset is still out there, but there are a minority of parents who see that "Oh well, my child is gifted in music, they can have a career in music". I think it's a very small minority, but maybe mindsets are changing. There's been quite a few PI [Pacific Island] musicians who have kind of made it in the opera world or as, say, violinists and when Pacific Island parents see those people performing I guess that breaks down the barriers and they think "my child could do this."

Mark works hard to support the students to be successful with the written literacy requirements of the programme as he believes that this is a necessary tool to allow students to achieve musically. He works particularly hard with his Māori and Pasifika students in this area.

I'm quite a big pusher of these kids learning how to read notation because a lot of Māori and Pacific Island students do a lot by ear but I think reading is an added skill, even though they don't realize it now, for them to know how to read music. ...Because it's like giving them the best of both worlds. They are very good at using, say for example, a music programme like Garageband and that's just purely using their ear and then on the other hand they can sit down with a programme like Sibelius and compose in another style, a different genre and learn from there. It's like broadening their horizons I think and frustrating as it might be it's encouraging them to push themselves and I'm quite used to pushing people out of their comfort zones and beyond the edge in order to get the best out of them.

Most of the teachers identified assessment as a barrier to culturally responsive and inclusive teaching. In Elizabeth's opinion, music education assessment requirements over-emphasise written literacy. She thinks that this can mean that the students who play popular music and have not had private instrumental or theory tuition may be disadvantaged. These students are typically her Māori and Pasifika students, some of whom are also intimidated by the computer programmes that allow them to produce notated scores. She has tried to target support to these students to use the software and is

seeing some benefits there. Elizabeth also noted that an emphasis on written literacy for assessment purposes can mean that students who have composed something rhythmically or melodically complex have to simplify it in order to write it down. This is a source of frustration for them and for her. She tries to avoid having a programme that is driven by assessment, but finds this hard to avoid.

Their compositions are too complex for their notation skills. It's the same for everybody. Any ethnicity. The guitarists- some of their solos are amazing....I am spending more time with the kids trying to get them to write the piece down, than I am helping them to craft the piece. I'm really getting fed up with it.

Elizabeth perceives that performance in the Western classical genre is privileged by some teachers. She feels that this attitude can disadvantage some students and be a barrier to inclusion.

I go to moderation meetings, gatherings of music teachers and usually in Auckland within an area, but I remember going to a cluster meeting outside my area and I felt like a fish out of water. The person in charge had deliberately asked me to bring videos of some of my kids and looked at me with a grin on his face and said, "shall we just pop this on?" and I thought Oh great". And it was a video of kids doing drums and electric guitar after we'd had tape after tape of grade 7 violin and clarinet and Barbershop and I said that it was excellence at Level One. And one of the teachers said if that's excellence then all of mine will get excellence. I said "Well lucky you. This is only level one."

TR

So what do you think was behind that teachers comment?

Elizabeth

That music education is white, is classical, that those things come first. That it's not about popular music.

Kerry finds that some community attitudes to school participation can be a barrier. She wishes to encourage the Pasifika community to engage more with music department activities, however, she finds this difficult. She thinks that many of these parents are

sometimes intimidated by what they see as the authority of the teacher. They may also feel apologetic about what they perceive to be inadequate English. Kerry also identified a lack of resources to support the teaching of 'world' music units. In Kerry's opinion her teacher education did not prepare her for the complexity and diversity of music teaching in the real world.

Sam and Elizabeth have noted that not having a music background through private music tuition can be a barrier to success for minority students who tend to be from lower-socio economic backgrounds. He works hard to ensure that students are not disadvantaged by socio-economic issues and builds on what they will have done in primary and intermediate school.

None of the teachers felt that they had space to address non-Western musics beyond the unit taught in year 10, although Sam includes diverse music examples to illustrate particular music elements or concepts. He identified a lack of time for the kind of listening experiences that would give depth to a programme that is currently including diverse musics in a limited way.

Research Question 3: What do teachers believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

For Kerry, a quality programme is one that is responsive, regularly reviewed, and relevant to student needs and interests. Kerry manages to stay focused on promoting individual student achievement and enjoyment, despite the rather overwhelming nature of her teaching and administrative load. She has two choirs to direct, as well as a concert band and chamber group. During the year of her interview she had five bands entering the

Pasifika Beats competition and two bands entering Rock Quest, as well as a school production to organise. The diversity of the performance opportunities available to the students is evidence of the way that she values and encourages students to follow their particular passions and interests, while also endeavoring to give them general musicianship skills and knowledge through the NCEA qualification requirements.

Other key aspects of Kerry's pedagogical approach linked to cultural responsiveness include the fostering of tuakana-teina relationships (mentoring relationships between older and younger students), the production of a CD each year to celebrate musical performances of a range of students across ages and genres, the inclusion of music evenings each term that provide an authentic performance opportunity where students can be assessed for NCEA performance credits, and the continued involvement of ex-students in the musical life of the school. While Kerry tries to foster a very musically inclusive environment where students are free to perform the music they relate to, she only has the space to actively teach non-Western music during a music unit in year 10. This unit is titled *The Music of the Pacific* and includes Māori musical examples as well as musics from Samoa, Tonga, Hawaii and Fiji. According to Kerry, the music of Fiji provides a link to some aspects of Indian music. The unit involves the performance of a piece from each musical culture, and the students watch video recordings of performances from each country. Where Kerry meets resistance to the inclusion of diverse musics, she makes it clear that her job is not to teach only one kind of music and that variety is important to a general understanding of music. In the senior years there is no further time for specific study of 'world' musics, however, the students are still free to compose and perform in any style they like. The students are also able to perform in extra-curricular cultural

groups, such as Tongan, Samoan and Niuean dance groups. During the school's 'International Week' there is a concert providing opportunities for any cultural group in the school to perform. Kerry believes that the NCEA qualification provides a good balance for students, allowing them to explore their particular musical passions, with plenty of performance opportunity. However, she also is working hard to facilitate the students' development of strong aural and theory knowledge so that they are not disadvantaged in written examinations.

Elizabeth spoke of her efforts to create an inclusive, supportive environment where students would feel comfortable about taking risks.

Elizabeth

We value each performance, each instrument, each kid for their own sake, and we build up a sense of support from the class so that they value excellence, they don't value a type of music over another type of music. There's no sense of "if you don't like this music then you're not ok", it's like, "in this space, music is music, and this person happens to be a fantastic clarinet player and this person can rip out the best electric guitar riff" and they will sit and listen to each other quite happily- whoop and cheer and holler at each other's success, celebrating the student, celebrating them getting up and having a go... We work very hard on the idea that in the music classroom, this is a safe space to have a go, if you dare to make it unsafe for anyone else, then you will have to answer to this. There is no sexist, racist, homophobic language, no putdowns, that is the ethos of the school, but I think I push that even harder, because I know that every time a kid gets up, it's risky, they really are taking a risk, and especially the singers, I mean, I'm a singer, they've got nothing in front of them, so even if a kid gets up and plays two chords on the guitar, but they manage to stand there and talk to us, and they manage to not apologise, and they manage to have a go, then I expect that the class will honour that, and accept it, and that they know what's required of them as an audience.

The high standard of student behaviour in the music department was identified by Elizabeth as evidence of student respect and concern not to let their music teachers down by behaving badly either in or outside of the department. Elizabeth made a particular point

of describing the ways that she actively countered notions of a musical hierarchy, of good or bad, high art or low art music in her programme. Evidence of this was provided in terms of the description of performance evenings where all types of music offering are valued and affirmed by the audience of students and families.

Like Kerry, Elizabeth emphasised the need for relevance and connection to student interests and their worlds of emotion, self-expression and imagination. For Elizabeth, the enjoyment of music for its own sake should drive music education rather than the demands of assessment. Elizabeth, and other teachers, also emphasised the benefits of strengthening social connections among diverse students through music education that provides opportunity for cross-age and cross-cultural music making, while also fostering the development of a sense of self identity. Elizabeth also greatly values the opportunities to form good relationships with the parent community through performance evenings.

I get a lot of support from the parents. I keep talking about the performance evenings, but that's when it's most obvious. So for the senior performance assessments I always hold them in the evenings, and the students invite their families. I don't make a big public hoo-hah about it. I don't send letters home. They invite them [their families] to come along. And they always come along, and it's not unusual for all the students who are performing, for each of them to have a family member. And it gets to be a really nice relationship with the parents and me. Chat chat chat. And you just watch them glow with pride as their kids get up and play. They want to check with me how it was at the end. But they know. They know really.

In particular, Elizabeth endeavours to provide opportunities for self-expression. She believes that students are developing their music identities in the music classroom, and she has a key role in facilitating that while giving them the tools they need to achieve and grow as musicians.

It's letting the kids express their own selves in music. There has to be room for that. The music rooms are open before and after school and there is a lot of noise coming out of them. I can't stand some of the music they're playing and they know that, but it doesn't matter. I'm facilitating that happening for them. I see it as the real thing for them because it's more and more obvious to me that music is the first thing that you own as a kid - that's separate from your parents. It's your way of expressing yourself. It's taking them from where they are at now, getting the basics taught to them through that music, and then pulling them into something else.

Elizabeth likes to get to know her students well as individuals. She acknowledges the complex, multiple musical identities that students bring to the classroom, as well as their other strengths and interests.

I had a boy in year 11 and I didn't realize until half way through year 10, he's a top league¹⁷ player. He'd kept that very quiet. I knew him as a fabulous singer. He's a fantastic artist and he's now turning out to be quite a good song-writer. I didn't know all those parts of him. And he's a dancer. A dancer, and a singer and a league player and he is Niuean.

Elizabeth also teaches a 'world' music unit in year 10. The unit takes an ethno-musicological approach, exploring the meanings and purposes of music as a cultural phenomenon. At the end of the unit the students complete a composition task where they are able to fuse diverse musical ideas. Elizabeth ensures that they have a good understanding of the cultural contexts of the musics they are investigating before they are used as stimuli or content for composition. Where she lacks confidence in her own knowledge, she seeks advice from culture bearers. It is important to her to model the valuing of cultural knowledge and the use of experts.

You have to do this to combat the kids saying "that's weird." That's prefacing it with, "this is the scale that we are used to. That's our system,

¹⁷ Rugby league football

but there are others. And I can't show you this on the piano, but I can on the guitar or with my voice, and I can't hear this, but other people can." No sense of hierarchy, really careful with language, saying "I don't know, lets go and find out". Or, "I think this is the case, why don't we go and ask so and so" who happens to be a Niuean teacher, or "why don't we go and talk to Pa Chris on the Marae". Get somebody in to talk about that. Or one of the kids will say, "we've got one of those instruments at home because mum and dad went to China".

Sam ensures that his music classes involved plenty of "doing". He sees this as particularly important for keeping his Māori and Pasifika students motivated.

The main thing I'm doing with my Year 9 is to say, don't stop, don't think that you can't do this. It is only practice. They're getting a lot of practical experience. They're not sitting drawing a clarinet. They're playing and having fun. I try to make that happen as much as possible.

Having diversity in music classes is very important to Sam and he would like to have more Māori and Pasifika student involved, particularly in senior classes. He tries hard to ensure that these students experience success and want to continue with music as a subject choice. He says that playing an instrument is what hooks young people into music, however, a lack of itinerant instrument teachers is a problem. He believes that one of the great benefits of music education is learning to play with others.

Sam uses diverse music examples to teach music elements and concepts. He teaches some aspects of African Drumming in year 9 and contributes to the 'world' music unit in year 10. He is frustrated by lack of time to do this in depth. Sam ensures that when he teaches Western classical music the students see it as just one musical culture among many.

I make a real point of saying, this is only 400 years, and it's only a certain group of people within society at that time. A whole lot of other people were making their own kind of music and in fact some of these composers were borrowing from their music, their folksongs. We're all aware that people make a lot of music and it never gets recorded, never gets written down. It's what they do, it's what they like, and maybe that's mainly what music is.

Sam emphasised the potential for all students to succeed within a quality programme, rejecting notions of talent or giftedness as pre-requisites for achievement or enjoyment.

More strictly academic aspects of successful practice were identified by Sonya, including high teacher expectation of student achievement, and the extent of student preparedness for examinations. For Sonya the benefits of music education are largely cognitive, individually realised and related to academic performance and confidence in particular. These benefits include the development of a work ethic, and the ability to think both abstractly and creatively. Sonya's classes are a diverse mix of cultural and musical backgrounds and interests. She has a mix of rock musicians and more classically oriented students.

Some generations you notice you have lots of classical musicians. It's like my year 12 this year half the class are very strong musically, in theory, they are proper classical musicians. The other half are struggling a bit, like my year 11 is also strong, but most of them are rock musicians. They are really good musicians, but just different. So I just accept them as they are.

She aims to build on the students' strengths, while acknowledging and accepting their differences.

There is wide mix in almost every music class. If you look at this class for example, you have a couple of European students, you have a couple of Asian students, you have a few Pacific Island students and they are all different. They are doing similar programmes but I put the emphasis that counts for every class, especially for the senior school, I find the strong points and the weak points of the students and I focus on the strong points, so that's how they achieve their best.

At Sonya's school there are Indian students selecting to take music. These students typically choose to play in the orchestra, although one of these students is also studying Indian classical singing outside of school.

Sonya attributes the high level of academic success achieved by her music students to the way that she pushes them to succeed, not allowing anyone to just 'drift'. She links this approach to her personal biography where hard work was essential and expected.

Sonya

The secret of my success is probably my background. I push students to do as much as they can and I don't believe in "just, oh let them work at their own pace" and "don't push them too much, don't work too hard". There is not "too hard". If I can do it, they can do it.

TR

So, you attribute this to your own background in the music school and now you really want these kids to achieve success.

Sonya

If you just let them drift they are going nowhere. They have to be constantly reminded what they have to do and how to do it. I teach them sometimes wider than what they need. They feel more confident in exam situations, when talking about it, when writing a paper, they have more than what they need. That's really good for them

Sonya teaches a 'world' music unit in year 9. She takes a round the world approach for this where the students get a small taste of a wide variety of musics.

We do world music and they look at different examples from different countries. I approach it as every country has a different language and that language has its sounds. So even if you don't understand that language you will know what is it. If you hear Italian, you know it's Italian by the sound of it. So, the music will sound a bit different, especially ethnomusic. Then we work through a world music CD and try to guess where it is from and why, and we work on that.

TR

What parts of the world do you choose to cover in that unit?

Sonya

Oh we cover India, we cover Spain, we cover Italy, we cover France. A lot.

Sonya teaches the cultural context of each musical example to help deepen the students' understanding so that they are better able to recognize and appreciate diverse musics, and feel inspired to use diverse musical ideas in their own compositions. Sonya's school provides cultural performance groups as extra-curricular optional activities. As with the other schools these fall outside of the jurisdiction of the music department. There is also an annual Pacific night that includes cultural performances. Sonya draws on the folk music of her own home background to teach complex metres and inspire rhythmic creativity.

Because we have complex rhythms- lots of 7/8 and 9/9 and 10/8 and lots of funny combinations of rhythms. That's what I do with them. So they are familiar with it. They usually like it. And students start composing in 7/8.

Key Themes

The following key themes emerged from the interviews with the New Zealand teachers and students. Key themes are participant views that were judged to provide a significant thread in the overall discussion. Where a theme has emerged from only one or two interviews, this has been noted in brackets. All other themes represent the views of more than two participants.

The themes are grouped according to each research question and then discussed in an integrated way, with reference to relevant literature. This integrated approach is necessary due to the linked nature of the questions and the correspondingly linked manner in which participants have reflected on the web of issues connected to each question.

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to the cultural diversity?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- Cultural diversity as a positive characteristic of schools.
- It is important to value and validate student participation in and leadership of extra-curricular ‘cultural’ performance groups.
- It is important to acknowledge and value students’ musical lives outside of school.
- Students should be encouraged to sing and compose songs in first language (1 teacher).
- It is important not to assume cultural knowledge or expertise. Teachers must take care not to put students “on the spot” if asking them to share different cultural and musical identities in class (1 teacher).
- It is important to make links with the parent community.
- It is good to draw on the expertise of culture bearers in the classroom or wider school community (1 teacher).
- Music learning must be relevant to student interests.
- Teachers and students can benefit from sharing their different ways of knowing about music in the classroom (1 teacher).
- Job of music education is to provide a broad programme, it need not respond to the ethnic identities of student population (2 teachers).

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

Key themes from student interviews:

- Music education is dominated by Western music knowledge and practice. This is normal and not problematic.
- Extra-curricular ‘cultural’ groups provide the opportunity for response to diversity (1 student).
- Some students may feel excluded by the privileging of one kind of music over others (2 students).
- Music education should be informed by the cultural diversity of the school population (2 students).
- Teachers should have the knowledge to guide and support Māori and Pasifika performance.
- It is not important for the students to either like or identify with the music they study (1 student).

Question 2 : What are the barriers to culturally responsive music teaching?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- Some Māori, Pasifika, or Indian parents discourage their children from selecting music as a school subject.
- Some Pasifika parents don’t think that their children are musical enough to study music as school (1 teacher).
- Assessment requirements emphasise written literacy as a key indicator of musicianship. This can be a barrier to students who have not had private classical music tuition (1 teacher).

- There is a lack of resources to support the teaching of non-Western musics (1 teacher).
- There is a lack of time to teach non-Western musics in any depth.

Question 2: What are the barriers to culturally inclusive music teaching?

Key themes from student interviews:

- ‘World’ musics are not in the curriculum. (1 student)
- There is no time to teach anything other than Western classical or contemporary musics. The programme is full.
- Non-Western musics should be taught in context. The classroom would not be an authentic or appropriate context to learn about them (1 student).
- There is no opportunity for students to negotiate more diverse music content (1 student).
- Non-Western music study or performance is best located outside of the school curriculum and the music classroom.
- Non-Western musics are unfamiliar and inaccessible.
- Students would not be interested or motivated to explore diverse musics.

Question 3: What do teachers and students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- Creating encouraging, supportive environments for music learning is a top priority.

- Successful programmes are relevant to student interests and allow them to follow their passions.
- Pedagogical approaches facilitate strong teacher-student and student-student relationships.
- Content and pedagogical approaches do not promote a hierarchy of musics (2 teachers).
- Pedagogical approaches facilitate the continued involvement of ex-music students in the cultural life of the school.
- Content and pedagogical approaches ensure that students are well prepared for exams (1 teacher).
- The programme should be driven by enjoyment of music for its own sake rather than assessment requirements (1 teacher).
- That students are well behaved and show respect for and loyalty towards the music department is evidence of success (1 teacher).
- Pedagogical approaches ensure the development of cognitive skills, individual work ethic, ability to think abstractly and creatively. Students can achieve excellence as individuals (1 teacher).
- Pedagogical approaches and content foster the development of identity and provide outlets for creative self expression.
- Pedagogical approaches ensure the strengthening of social and community connections among diverse students.
- Pedagogical approaches create opportunities for older and younger students to make music together.

- Students should be able to compose and perform in any style they like.
- ‘World’ musics can be taught adequately in a unit of work in year 10.
- A ‘round-the-world’ approach gives students a satisfactory ‘taste’ of a diverse selection of musics.
- It is important to learn some contextual information about music being studied.
- It is important to ask for help from culture bearers where teacher knowledge is lacking (1 teacher).

Question 3: What do teachers and students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Key themes from student interviews:

- It would be interesting to learn more about non-Western musics at school.
- Classical music should be a key component of the music programme as a way to learn history, theory and the ‘rules’ of music.
- It is important to have a mix of composition, performance and theory, and Western music history.
- Learning music theory is necessary to be musically educated.
- Teachers should be classically trained. This will qualify them to teach about all musics;
- The programme should include traditional and contemporary Māori music and the musics of New Zealand’s neighbours in the Pacific (2 students).
- It is important to learn about the social context of music you are studying or performing.

- Non-Western musics must be taught with sensitivity and respect (2 students).

Discussion

The student participants in this case believe that they are participating in successful music education programmes, where their musical needs and interests are largely being met. The teachers, similarly, believe that they are delivering successful programmes, built on warm, productive, sensitive relationships with the students. The content of their programmes is intended to be as relevant and tailored to student needs as it can be, given the constraints of assessment requirements, time and resources. Some teachers emphasise Western classical music performance and theory more than others, and all of the participant teachers accept and value the particular musical interests and preferences that their students have. They endeavour to facilitate the acquisition of music literacy in creative and supportive ways, with more or less emphasis, or demand. However, in terms of response to the cultural diversity of the students, both teachers and students identified barriers. These barriers are largely structural, related to a perception of lack of time or resource, or are located within the perceived resistance of some cultural groups to participation in school music. Other barriers reflected student misunderstanding of the nature of music education curriculum requirements. For example, the view of several students that there is no room available in the curriculum for ‘world’ musics indicated that they did not view the curriculum as a flexible, negotiated process, but rather a fixed document that was clearly currently ‘full’. Michael’s comment that ‘world’ music is “*not in the curriculum, so teachers don’t teach it*” shows a view of curriculum as an object, rather than an action. In fact, the achievement standards for the NCEA, and the achievement objectives of music within the New Zealand Curriculum allow for the

inclusion of any musics, although the language of achievement reflects the discourse of Western classical music study.¹⁸

Some of these attitudes clearly create barriers that were not apparent to the participants. For example, language choices reflect a prevailing view among teachers and students that the study or performance of non-Western musics is ‘extra’ and ‘other’ (Bradley, 2006; Mansfield, 2007; Thompson, 2002) and therefore not considered to be core music education business. The participants argued that the marginal position of these musics is because they are beyond the main goals and content of music education programmes, as opposed to considering the fact that the *perception* of such musics as ‘other’ is the marginalizing factor. It is this perception that constructs non-Western musics as outside the norm. The language of “*additional*” and “*extra*” suggests a positioning of ‘world’ musics well away from the centre of musical concerns. None of the students described ‘world’ musics as having less intrinsic value than either classical or contemporary Western musics, however, there was a prevailing assumption that capture of the curriculum by Western classical music theory, practice and history is a non-negotiable norm in music education that is predetermined, and immune to outside influence.

The requirement to be able to read and write conventional notation, or analyse music using Western theoretical knowledge was seen as a barrier to inclusion for some teachers.

One teacher also commented that some Pasifika parents do not believe that their children

¹⁸ For example, “Demonstrate a knowledge of music works” and “Identify, describe and transcribe elements of music through listening to a range of musics” (NCEA assessment requirements).

are capable of studying music at school because they do not read and write music. These views suggest that the high status given to music reading can be acting as a “tool for social delineation” (Spruce, 2001) and presenting a barrier for some students (Henderson, 2003). However, teachers seemed to be at pains to help students over this hurdle, and all felt that they wanted students to learn to read and write music so that all possible musical futures were available to them. Teachers were also conscious of the socio-economic reasons why some students, who have not had private music lessons, may be struggling with literacy requirements.

All of the students expressed very genuine enthusiasm and curiosity regarding ‘world’ musics, but appeared to accept that the situation regarding what could and could not be included in the programme was beyond their or their teachers’ control. For the students with a particular interest in composition, ‘world’ music was seen as a possible untapped source of ideas and motivation for creative work. These students were curious about other sound worlds and the opening of these other sound worlds was seen by them, as it is by many researchers and music educators, as a strong potential justification for including diverse music in the programme (Campbell and Anderson, 1996; Stock, 2002).

The two Samoan students, Sina and Silesi (Auckland School A) were the most conscious of the ways that music education might marginalise or exclude particular groups of students through the privileging of one way of knowing about music (Jorgensen, 2007). These students both demonstrated “social imagination” (Greene, 1990) in their ability to empathise with those students who may not feel that music education, as it is currently practised, is for them. They comfortably connected music with culture as it is experienced

within the school community and saw music participation as a way to bring diverse groups together, with both music and social benefits. Their concern for the feelings and self-esteem of other students may reflect the collectivist nature of Samoan culture, which fosters interdependence and group success, or it may simply highlight the fact that some students, for a variety of reasons, are more disposed to reflect on links between education and social justice than others. Silesi, like other students, articulated cultural stereotypes “*Indians are more, like, sporty*”. However, this comment also provided a ‘face saving’ explanation on behalf of Indian students, emphasising his perception of their strength in sport as opposed to deficits in musicianship, as likely reasons for their non-participation in music education. It also meant that Silesi did not have to over-emphasise the possibility that the music programme itself might be at fault, reflecting his respectful attitude towards authority. The most striking aspect of Silesi’s comments was the immediacy of the link that he made between the diversity of people and what he believed should be the diversity of music programme content. According to Silesi’s world view, people are diverse, therefore music education should reflect that diversity. It is a relatively simple equation.

Sina articulated the view that students should have the opportunity to influence music content choices. She called for a more student-negotiated approach (Villegas and Lucas, 2002; Gay, 2000). This student, in particular, seemed well ready for the kind of critical discussion advocated by Bradley (2006), Dunbar-Hall (2005), and Hambel (2005).

Most of the students saw music education as something that should be informed by and responsive to New Zealand’s location in the Pacific, as well as needing to reflect the unique nature of the indigenous population, acknowledging, in particular, that Māori have

particular ways of participating in music in their communities that teachers need to understand.

One of the major barriers to cultural diversity in each of the programmes is the positioning of ‘world’ musics in a single unit in Year 10. This location results from the perceived lack of time for a more in-depth or spiral approach. This potentially gives the message that musical diversity constitutes a topic than can be “covered” as opposed to being perceived as a lived reality that could provide the underpinning or framework for all music teaching and learning (Jorgenson, 2003). These units focus largely on playing and listening experiences, and do not, in general, allow opportunity for critical discussion. However, two teachers did provide evidence of a critical approach. Sam engages the students in discussion about the relationship between religious and secular music making in history, when introducing classical music, and Elizabeth takes time to discuss issues related to the meaning and function of music in the context of her ‘world music’ unit.

The teachers in this case demonstrate many of the characteristics of culturally responsive teaching as described by Gay (2000) and Bishop & Glyn (1999). They know about and value the cultural identities and heritages of the students. They work hard to connect with families and are pleased with their success in this area.

When students perform in extra-curricular cultural groups, Elizabeth in particular, takes pains to attend these performances and uses them for assessment purposes. On the whole, these results show that these particular teachers are not guilty of using ‘world’ musics to ‘add colour’ to their programmes (Bradley, 2008). They value the musical lives of the

students and are interested in their involvement in extra-curricular ‘cultural’ groups.

One teacher expressed concern that students may feel put on the spot, or embarrassed if asked to provide a class demonstration of music they had cultural links to or some known expertise in. This teacher’s sensitivity to possible student embarrassment based on his teaching experiences, in particular with Māori and Pasifika students, is reflective of research findings that some students may lack musical self-esteem as a result of the dominance and privileging of Western Classical ways of knowing (Henderson, 1998).

In particular, all of the participant teachers emphasised relationships, which are at the heart of culturally responsive teaching. All of the teachers identified the positive nature of student-student and student-teacher relationships as evidence of a successful music department. The teachers described the strength of relationships with students as being central to their enjoyment of their work. Additional to this is the pleasure of seeing individual students succeed, as a result of a programme that endeavours to respond to their needs, and challenge and motivate them.

Emphasis on relationships fits with Estelle Jorgenson, who in *Transforming Music Education* places people and the relationships between them at the heart of the matter. She argues that “the human dimensions of music education are just as important as the material to be learned and taught and cannot be separated from it” (2003, p.124). These teachers appear to have embraced this idea. All of the interviews, students and teachers provided evidence of the “centrality of teacher-student interaction in the learner’s and teacher’s experience’ (Jorgenson, p. 124). The teachers also demonstrated that they know and care about the lives of their students outside of the school setting and worked hard to

engage with their families in order to enhance the student's experience of music education (Villegas and Lucas, 2002). For Elizabeth and Kerry in particular, their relationships with the students were central to their philosophy of teaching. Their personal warmth, and the regard felt for them by the students was very evident. The students were clear about the benefits of such positive relationships. This fits with Henderson's (2003) finding that students rated their relationship with their teacher as a key factor in their success in music education.

Implications

Despite the enthusiasm of the students and the dedication of the teachers, the 'colonized' curriculum is evident, in particular, in the student responses. The students are largely unaware of the multiple nature of music history. It is clear that classical music and music history have become synonymous. The diversity of global musical expression is not understood by the students. Somewhere in the programme there needs to be the critical interrogation of value-laden language such as "theory", "history" "rules" and "classical" that was common throughout the student interviews. Some deconstruction of these terms to determine the hierarchies and unequal relationships that underpin such terms is important. How to have such discussions in an engaging, stimulating and inclusive way is the challenge (Bradley, 2008). Sam, who includes some critical, contextualised discussion when introducing Western classical music seems on the right track. However, given the time constraints, an integrated approach is clearly needed, so that this critical tone can become a natural part of class discussion of any musics, rather than being artificially separated into a one-off unit of work.

Secondary school music students in New Zealand have the benefit of a very flexible, comprehensive qualification (The NCEA). Since the interviewing period for this research, its flexibility has increased, and, in particular, the emphasis on conventional written literacy, lamented by Elizabeth, has been reduced. The NCEA qualification allows students to have diverse musical achievements acknowledged and validated through assessment. Teachers have the freedom to develop personalised programmes that respond to the particular strengths, needs, and interests of the students. The qualification is worded in such a way that it allows for the performance or investigation of all kinds of music styles and genres. Music literacy expectations acknowledge aural learning and allow for a variety of representation systems as are relevant to the music genre. However, teachers' musical backgrounds and teacher education are likely to have focused on a much more limited view of music and musicianship. Despite the participant teacher's evident inclusive values, deep commitment and dedication, student understanding of diverse musics appears limited, and teacher responsiveness to cultural diversity is similarly limited according to student perception.

To be a culturally responsive teacher in New Zealand requires active awareness of the principles of the Treaty and the aims of the Pasifika education plan. We know from research (Bishop & Glyn, 1999, Fa'afai. et al, 2009) that academic achievement for Māori and Pasifika students is raised when the students' cultural values and knowledge are clearly part of the teaching and learning process. All of the teachers interviewed were working hard to support Māori and Pasifika students. However, they could strengthen this by ensuring that their programmes celebrate many musics. In this way they can 'operationalise' their declared valuing of cultural diversity. Underpinning this there needs

to be a strong theoretical and practical understanding of the ways that Western ways of knowing about music continue to be privileged and other narratives may be marginalised and ‘othered’ through their positioning as a separate combined topic entitled ‘world’ music. Central to this is the valuing of student voices. As Sina identified, it would be good if students had the opportunity to evaluate their courses and negotiate some of the content. Currently, many of the students believe that music programme content is largely dictated by teacher preference and student preference is what happens outside of the classroom.

It is clear that ethnicity does not dictate music preference (Schippers, 2010, p.30).

However, neither is it acceptable within an increasingly diverse society to present one history, invalidating the musical heritages if not the preferences of the students. Teachers need to be aware, as some students evidently are, of the power of music education to include and exclude.

Chapter 5 Australian Case Study

Sydney, New South Wales

In September 2008 I spent one week in Sydney visiting three high schools. The schools were all selected on the expert recommendation of Associate Professor Peter Dunbar-Hall of the Sydney Conservatorium of Music. During my visit I carried out interviews with each of three music teachers and nine music students.

This chapter includes the following:

- A brief overview of the context of high school music education in Australia.
- Demographic information about the three participant schools.
- Biographical information about the participants.
- A summary of the results from interviews.
- Identification and discussion of significant themes, with links to relevant literature.

Overview of the Context of High School Music Education in Sydney, Australia

Unlike New Zealand, which has a National Curriculum, the policy and requirements for music education are a state responsibility in Australia. Sydney is in the state of New South Wales and all schools music comply with the requirements of the NSW Board of Studies Syllabus for Music.

Music education researcher Kathryn Marsh states that culturally responsive teaching is a particular challenge in Australia “where the population is drawn from more than 100 ethnic groups, including Anglo-Australians, immigrants and their descendants, and indigenous Australians (Aborigines and Torres Strait Islanders)” (Marsh, 2005, p. 37). In the 1970s, Australia, like New Zealand and the United States, had emphasised ‘multiculturalism’ in education and other social policies. Awareness of the need for political acknowledgement of cultural pluralism resulted from ongoing social action across many areas of inequality, in particular, race, gender, disability and sexual orientation (Banks, Nieto, 1992). In Australia, Marsh describes a shift from assimilation policies to multicultural policies in the 1970s resulting from the indigenous protest movement and increasing social awareness of the challenges faced by both the indigenous peoples and the increasing migrant population. In New South Wales such ideological shifts have resulted in specific policy changes that have had a significant impact on education syllabus goals (p. 37). The *Cultural Diversity and Community Relations Policy: Multicultural Education in Schools* (2005) that superseded the *Multicultural Education Policy* (1983) requires that schools use inclusive teaching practices that recognise and value the backgrounds and cultures of all students. As a result of the 1983 and 2005 policies, cultural diversity is acknowledged in Music Syllabus documents from junior to senior levels (p. 38). However, Australian theorists (Hambel, 2005, Kalantzis and Cope 1999) researching in the area of critical multiculturalism believe that multicultural policies in education have led to the shallow inclusion of the easily identified, stereotypical ethnic features such as food and festivals.

They continue to advocate for transformation of the education system away from multicultural policies that focus on superficial ethnic differences, with ‘whiteness’ as the central reference point, towards the “deep inclusion of all cultures in every aspect of learning” (Hambel, 2005 p. 63).

Dunbar-Hall and Wemys (2000) describe music education in Australia as a “site of continual development” (p. 23). They have documented the significant impact of the introduction of popular music into the syllabus in the 1970s, and then, within the last decade, the introduction of multicultural music courses within teacher education. Such changes have influenced teachers to debate, for example, the role of notation in music education, and have caused a shift in the conception of the roles of the teacher and learner. According to Dunbar-Hall and Wemys, the teaching of popular music has created a culturally relevant vehicle for the inclusion of the contemporary musics of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island cultures, a requirement of the *NSW Senior Music Syllabus 1994*, as well as helping to facilitate a shift to more culturally diverse and responsive teaching overall (pp. 26-27).

The New South Wales syllabi for high schools reflect government policy requiring inclusion of the perspectives and histories of indigenous peoples and immigrant populations within education programmes (Marsh, 2005). However, subsequent reviews of music education (The Review of Aboriginal Education ‘Freeing the Spirit-Dreaming an Equal Future’, 2004, and the National Review of School Music Education, 2005) indicate that teachers lack confidence in teaching in this area and that the decontextualised nature of such teaching is problematic.

A survey undertaken by Dunbar-Hall and Beston (2003) found that the teaching of indigenous musics was variable, with difficulties in resourcing and depth of training. Also, teachers who were found to be including indigenous music acknowledged that this was only a recent addition to their teaching programme (Dunbar-Hall & Beston, 2003).

Dunbar-Hall and Mckinlay (2003) also provide a useful overview of the complexity of including indigenous music in curricula. They identify the political nature of this and the challenges of engaging with the debate that arises from such pedagogical decisions.

...like education, music education is not neutral. To teach indigenous musics is also to teach the historical, social and political contexts in which they exist, to raise the debate over the efficacy of the pedagogic act, and to uncover the dialectic and musical tensions (p. 39).

However, Bradley and Power (2010) describe instances within two schools where teachers have successfully used resources to support programmes that include Aboriginal perspectives and where teachers have formed partnerships with Aboriginal culture bearers resulting in a “significant move towards confidence in the teaching of Indigenous Australian Music (p. 98).

Gorfinkel (2010) has noted that while the NSW Music Syllabi for High School include direction for the study of musics from different cultures, these documents “do not necessarily promote the notion of music as a cross-cultural phenomenon” (p. 45) and that the use of the phrase “Music of a culture”, implies “any culture other than Western music or indigenous Australian (as these are other topics)” (p. 45). Gorfinkel is concerned about the non-integrated approach to the teaching of the cultural and political aspects of all musics in Australia and promotes the idea that these aspects should be embedded within

all music topics, with a cross-cultural approach, rather than contained within separate, one-culture focused topics.

Music in NSW is taught as part of a combined arts curriculum until year 6 ¹⁹(the final year of primary school), as part of mandatory course in years 7 and 8, and, usually, as an elected subject after that. The Higher School Certificate is the qualification that acknowledges the successful completion of internal and external assessment requirements in year 12. For the Higher School certificate students study courses entitled Music 1 and Music 2 depending on their music background and interests. According to the Syllabus,

Music 1 caters for students who have diverse music backgrounds and musical interests, including those with an interest in popular music. It therefore attracts students with a formal musical background as well as those with only informal experience. Music 2 focuses on the study of Western art music. It assumes students have a formal background in music, have developed music literacy skills and have some knowledge and understanding of musical styles (p.8).

Music 1 has specific objectives such as “to develop knowledge and skills about the concepts of music and of music as an art form through performance, composition, musicology and aural activities in a variety of cultural and historical contexts (p.9).

High School music programmes in New South Wales are required to take a broad, topic based approach that integrates the study of music concepts such as duration, pitch and texture, learning experiences such as playing, singing, and creating, and musical contexts

¹⁹ Children in NSW begin school aged 5 yrs. Years 1 to 6 are spent in primary school, and years 7 to 12 in high school.

such as ‘Australian Music’, ‘Music of a Culture’, or ‘Music for radio, film, television and multimedia’ (p. 11). This is underpinned by aims to develop key competencies such as “communicating ideas and information” or “working with others and in teams” (p. 14). A high school music or performing arts department may have one music teacher (for example, Anna in School A) or more than one, including some with specialist skills and interests, for example, a choir director. Some schools employ itinerant instrument teachers to teach individuals or groups. Teachers provide ensemble opportunities where they can. These are typically choirs, chamber groups, orchestra, jazz, concert or marching band.

About the Schools

The three schools are situated in suburban Sydney, Australia. Sydney is Australia’s most populous city, with approximately four and a half million inhabitants. Around one third of this population was born overseas and just over 2% are indigenous (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2010). According to the 2006 census, 21% speak a language other than English at home. Large migrant groups include people born in the United Kingdom, New Zealand, China, India and Italy.

Table 4: Sydney Schools Demographic Information

	Roll	Socio-economic	Ethnicities
Sydney School A	Co-ed 800	Low	87% Language background other than English Includes Chinese, Korean, Vietnamese, Middle Eastern, Italian, Greek
Sydney School B	Co-ed 770	Middle	44% Anglo-Australian 56% speak languages other than English, language groups include Middle East and Asia

Sydney School C	980	Middle	65% Anglo-Australian, 16% Asian, 14% Middle Eastern 5% Aboriginal.

Student Biographies

This section introduces the Australian student participants and gives some insight into their family, community and school lives, music preferences and interests, and aspirations for future music making, work and study.

Henry (School A, Teacher - Anna)

Henry emigrated with his parents from China to Sydney two and a half years ago. He is very happy in Australia, notably because he perceives life to be less pressured, giving him time to pursue activities beyond study. He found his schooling stressful in China.

TR

So why did you have to work so hard in China?

Henry

Because more competition because a lot of people around the country so you have to work really hard as a student to actually stand out.

Henry misses his relatives back in China and is looking forward to visiting them after he has completed his HSC exams. Henry likes all music styles apart from rap and pop. He particularly loves classical music. He is a violinist and loves to play with other musicians.

...it's just more fun because you've got to cooperate with other people and different instruments, melody comes together, it just comes like together, and it's fantastic and it has to be sometimes fixing and it's still good.

He particularly enjoys the interactions of different instruments in an ensemble

It's different instruments, we play together but we just like fit, it's like actually talking to each other. That's the amazing thing about music.

He thinks that music classes are appealing because music is relaxing and playing instruments is so enjoyable.

...after you've had a maths class and you just jump into a music class, so at least we forget all the worries, numbers, don't think about them – that's good.

Henry would like to have the opportunity to learn other styles such as folk and jazz.

However, because of the pressures of study in China, Henry had to put the violin away for a year and currently he is not able to afford violin tuition. He is looking forward to a career as a computer animator.

Ryan (School A, Teacher - Anna)

Ryan's family is from Thailand. Ryan, the youngest, was born in Australia. He plays rock drums and guitar and enjoys arranging songs. His dream jobs would be playing in a band or developing computer games. However, his parents would like him to become a doctor or lawyer. Ryan is planning to study sciences at university, but would secretly prefer to be studying music. He may decide to go against his parents' wishes and choose music, but is not sure of this plan. He thinks that music making helps him to be "open" and performing develops his personal confidence.

Sienna (School B, Teacher – Luke)

Sienna is sixteen and has a large family, including a mum, step-dad and three sisters. Her birth father is Tongan, but she doesn't have contact with him. When

she's older she thinks she will make contact with the Tongan side of her family, and is particularly interested in getting to know her step-brothers. Sienna lives two hours from the school by bus. She could attend a school that is closer to her home, but prefers to travel to School B because of the quality of the music programme. Sienna plays guitar and violin. To relax, she listens to Japanese pop, techno and rock music. She was introduced to Japanese music by her uncle.

It was actually my uncle, when I was about three he introduced me to a couple of Japanese TV shows, like the little cartoon ones. And then from there I sort of liked the music and that so I decided when I was about ten to do a bit of research on it. And I found that I quite liked it a lot, so...

Sienna is in the stage band at school and is the co-ordinator of the percussion ensemble. She finds music participation very calming in times of stress and enjoys the opportunities that music making provides to make new friends.

I make a lot of friends that I wouldn't have expected to make... Like I made friends with people in older years and I've met people outside of school who do music as well. And I thought if I didn't do this would I have really met these people?

When she leaves school she plans to have a gap year in Japan studying music, then return to audition for the Sydney Conservatorium. Sienna believes that success in music is largely about personal motivation and hard work.

Alam and Faraz (School B, Teacher – Luke)

These two twelve year olds emigrated from Iran with their families five years ago. They were interviewed together. Alam is a rock drummer, and plays in the percussion ensemble at school. Faraz is also a drummer, and plays guitar and piano. He is in the rock band, stage band and the percussion ensemble. Both Alam and Faraz say that their

parents are very supportive of their participation in music in and out of school. They also both feel that music is relaxing, cheers them up if they are feeling low, and calms them in times of stress.

Faraz

I like listening to rock, mostly Metallica. And I like Green Day, too. Yeah, they're pretty good, like when I'm seriously bored, well not seriously but mostly I go play musical instruments – to calm me down when I'm really angry or something because when I'm really angry whenever I play music it's just like, oh, you really grab music, be happy, and, yeah, like that.

They particularly enjoy listening to the messages and stories found in song lyrics. Alam plans to be an astronomer and a musician when he grows up and Faraz wants to be a doctor and a musician.

Josh (School C, Teacher - Richard)

Josh's family is Anglo-Australian and has lived in Sydney for many generations. Josh and other family members play a variety of instruments.

... I started off playing the drums. But my dad plays guitar and there's always been lots of instruments in my house so I play everything really. I play guitar and bass and I've just picked up violin actually and I play ukulele and my uncle plays ukulele – just a little bit of fun and stuff. I don't play it passionately, the ukulele and violin and stuff like that, but I play some.

Josh started learning classical violin but is now a folk fiddler playing country and Celtic music. He listens mostly to contemporary rock and pop music. His favourite band is the Red Hot Chili Peppers. He is not a fan of classical or jazz music and his least favourite music is gangster rap. Words are important to Josh; he likes song lyrics to be meaningful. He enjoys jamming with friends but will wait until he leaves school before he puts

together a band. He learns a lot from his music teachers and from playing with others. He believes that music participation benefits him in specific ways.

It lets you have imagination. It lets you be creative. As a person it can help your character. Be more creative obviously. It lets you be more connected to other people. Like, because a lot of people have a lot of emotion towards music and they can find connection with each other through music. So, it's just a big world event sort of thing that everybody can be connected with each other with. So I don't know.

Josh has been accepted into a college to study audio engineering when he leaves school at the end of this year.

Gavin (School C, Teacher - Richard)

Gavin comes from a large family. They are Anglo-Australian and have lived in Australia for many generations. Gavin is a drummer. He does not like commercial pop music, but enjoys progressive rock and jazz. In his band he plays “heavy stuff”.

Metallica. More screaming kind of stuff. But, yeah, then pretty much just anything, as a drummer you've got to be open to everything and yeah. Like every now and then I'd play something really heavy and then I'd, it's very moody with your drums. You have to be open and it's very moody – you can one day want to play this and then one day want to play that.

Gavin loves learning music at school because of the fun learning environment, particularly compared with other subjects such as maths. He thinks music teaching would be a great career.

Gavin

It's just a really fun environment, like you come out of maths or something and you're gutted or something and then...you just walk into music class and there's always a smile on the teacher's face and all that and yeah, it's just really fun.

TR

So why are music teachers so smiley? What's that about?

Gavin

Well they must enjoy their job. Yeah. I don't blame them in the end, I reckon. If I was good enough at music to do it I reckon I'd love to. Who knows?

Gavin's other favourite subject is history.

Christos (School C, Teacher - Richard)

Christos is of Greek ancestry. His father and grandparents immigrated to Australia when his father was a child. Music and art play a large part in Christos's life.

Well if you saw the work on the doors, that was mine. So I like mixed media, post-modern, anything, and straight art as well – not graffiti. Stencilling and drawing, and yeah – so I really like creating stuff.

His music listening preferences have been greatly influenced by his father. He enjoys older style rock, blues and roots music. He does not enjoy pop music, and objects to the pressure on artists to have commercial appeal.

I dislike that kind of being subject to mainstream – like artists are kind of forced to follow a structure but you know, the only guarantee is the mainstream appeal, it's kind of against what music really stands for. It's not, that's when it becomes corporate and not really about the expression.

Christos appreciates the political aspects of rap music, and sees it as a good vehicle for people to express a political viewpoint.

I like people that talk about issues in society. So politics, whether it's right-wing, left-wing, at least they're expressing a political view... I mean in the nineties it was really big where people were talking about issues and early rap started off with basically cultural aspects of American society and talked a lot about discrimination and basically standing up. So I like when rappers or musicians have something important to say whereas it's not just words

He doesn't think that all musicians need to be conventionally literate in order to create music.

Not necessarily – it depends on the individual. Like it depends on what kind of music you want to create. Music really is just a form of expression. It's like anything. And you know, you don't have to be a prodigy or you don't need to read music to be able to create music. Like, it does help.

Christos believes that music is a powerful way to bring all kinds of people together, and strengthen the links between them.

TR

So it helped you to make friends?

Christos

Definitely. And friends that you normally wouldn't consider and you've got that one kind of link which then crosses, you know, into social paths. Normally you might hang with these group of friends but when you play with this person and you find a common link, and that kind of opens up new horizons.

David (School C, Teacher - Richard)

David is of Anglo-Australian ancestry. His family has lived in Australia for many generations. When he leaves school he is planning to study for a Bachelor of Music at the University of Western Australia, with a double major in English. He is then planning to train as a secondary school teacher. David enjoys the companionship associated with music classes as well as the opportunities to further his knowledge.

Just playing music with your friends, probably the most attractive thing about it. And pretty much furthering my knowledge of music theoretically and the history of it. Because I figure that as a musician the more theory you know the better you can express yourself.

He doesn't think that it is necessary for all musicians to be able to read music.

Yes and no. Like it's kind of fundamental in the whole music as a language kind of thing – but to play and to express yourself you don't really need to know how to read or write music, I mean I think that's the whole beauty of it.

It can be very simple, or very complicated. As long as it kind of satisfies what you're trying to do with it.

David has a particular interest in the links between friendship and music making and has carried out some research on this topic.

TR

And you've chosen music because of the relationships that you form with others – is that through playing with them in particular?

David

Yeah, pretty much. That's the big one. And I think through playing with them you get a relationship outside to that, because I actually did a research project myself and I'm like, how the strength of just a normal friendship really helps the musical relationship and how you get on with someone musically.

David plays bass guitar and enjoys listening to rock and funk music. He objects to the commercial music industry.

Yeah, it just seems like it always has an agenda behind it and I read this interview with Nick Cave and he said that in terms of like, lyrical content and substance, and I agree also, that pop music tends to lack substance because it always has the agenda of commerciality and making something, so it's not really about personal expression or anything. It's more of a product than an asset or anything.

David is currently in a band and composes songs for the band to play in funk, grunge and jazz styles. He thinks music at school is a relaxed and happy subject and music participation means a happy life.

Teacher Biographies

This section introduces the three teacher participants, providing insight into their family and education backgrounds, career pathways, teaching aspirations and philosophies.

Anna (Sydney School A)

Anna did not study music at school. After completing her secondary schooling she went directly to the Sydney Conservatorium of Music where she completed the four year Bachelor of Music (Music Education). She then taught for four years before applying for the HOD Creative Arts position at her current school. This is her first year in this position. She found her previous school to be lacking in an understanding of diversity. She made an effort to introduce musics of different cultures, with a successful focus on Japanese drumming, and an attempt to challenge conventionally literate students with the complexities and challenges of oral/aural learning. The challenge of cultural diversity was one of the aspects that attracted her to her present position, along with the belief that an HOD position might allow her to make a greater difference because of access to a budget and a clear leadership role. Anna is of Anglo-Australian ancestry.

In the following extract she speaks of her love of teaching in such a culturally diverse setting.

I love teaching and the reason I like it, working with schools such as this, and I was thinking about it the other day, I'd much prefer this to my first context because I, rather selfishly, get to learn a lot from the students. Here, every day I'm learning something new and it's really like they're teaching me, which is fantastic and in the end I teach others based on what they have taught me – so that's the best thing. And you learn so much. My library of music has expanded immensely because I have all of these things that I would never be able to access previously... students will bring in music... or they're going back home and I say, oh, if you see anything over there, bring back instruments from overseas, and some students here are so appreciative of being taught at all.

Luke (Sydney School B)

Luke comes from a musical family. His sister is completing her Masters of Performance in Flute at the Sydney Conservatorium. He attended his local co-educational state primary

and high school, and studied piano and trombone informally. He played in school bands as well as his own band with his siblings. Luke's mother is Anglo-Australian and his father was born in Malta. Luke was put off studying music at school by an unsatisfactory programme. After gaining his HSC in science subjects he made a last minute decision not to pursue the sciences and instead auditioned for the Sydney Conservatorium where he completed the four year bachelor of music (music education).

And so I studied all of the sciences and really high level maths and did really well for my HSC and then suddenly it was the day before I had to have my final in the first two choices in, I thought what on earth am I doing – I don't want to be a radiographer really. And I just changed all of my preferences to music education and luckily got interviews and auditions and started. But I hadn't done music at school because of that. Because I'd been avoiding it and because it was a weak programme at my school. So in some ways that's benefited me, that I came from a completely different direction into teaching. And into music teaching. But at the same time, I'm sort of only now understanding what it's like to be a music student in a school, for these students that I teach.

Luke has since achieved a Master's degree in Educational Management and Leadership from the University of Sydney. This year he has begun studying for his PhD. Luke began teaching piano and trombone privately at the age of fourteen. From Year 12 to the end of his bachelor's degree he also conducted a band in rural Western Sydney and a concert band for boys with behavioural difficulties in an inner city school in Sydney. His first teaching job was delivering the HSC (Higher School Certificate) course to students who had (for whatever reason) been unable to complete their schooling at a regular school and so were studying at TAFE (Technical and Further Education). *"These students were the same age as me and it was a pretty full-on experience."* After that Luke taught at a co-educational state high school in Western Sydney where he established a large band program. From there he won the Head Teacher position at his current school.

Richard (Sydney School C)

Richard is an Anglo-Australian “*descended from convicts on both sides.*” He has one brother. His parents and brother are “*completely unmusical.*” Richard attended a local public primary school followed by a private Christian school. In year 3 of primary school he began learning the clarinet with a private tutor and played in the school band. He taught himself the piano at age 15. Like Anna and Luke, Richard completed a four year Bachelor’s qualification at the Sydney Conservatorium. Prior to his present position he taught at a girls’ Technology High School. He held his position there for 4 years. Richard didn’t feel well prepared for senior teaching and worked hard to develop programmes of work at each level that would meet syllabus requirements and engage the students, with little support.

As much as I loved the time going to uni, I felt the lecturer that we had for senior music education didn’t really prepare us as well as we could have been. I still thought I was sort of flying in the dark. I was just going into the syllabus going ‘this is what it says we need to know, I hope I’m doing it the best way I can’.

Despite these initial challenges, Richard was extremely successful in increasing the numbers of students electing to study music in the school as well as establishing instrumental and choral groups.

At his current school, he is working to raise the profile of music in the school while establishing quality classroom programmes that engage and motivate the students.

Table 5: Australian Student Information Summary

Student (Pseudonyms)	School	Where born/ Ethnicity info
Henry	A	China
Ryan	A	Thailand
Sienna	B	Born in Australia, Tongan father
Alam	B	Iran
Faraz	B	Iran
Josh	C	Anglo-Australian
Gavin	C	Anglo-Australian
Christos	C	Born in Australia, Greek father.
David	C	Anglo-Australian

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

While most of the students did not feel that the music education they are experiencing is currently informed by or responsive to the cultural diversity of the students or the wider community, most of them articulated an inclusive view, suggesting that there would be both social and academic benefits from having a such a programme. Of the nine students interviewed, three rejected the idea of a programme where the cultural identities or heritages of the students might be considered a teaching resource, or where the programme might be informed by the cultural diversity of the wider world. These three students (Christos, Gavin and David) were from the same school (Sydney School C). Two of them were Anglo-Australian and one was of Greek ancestry, born in Australia. Notably, the school that these three attended was the least diverse in terms of student population.

Chinese student, Henry (Sydney School A), felt that the music programme content should reflect the culturally diverse nature of Australia. He saw this as an important way to bring people closer together.

Henry

Australia is a multicultural country, so the students should actually share like all the music from different countries or background.

TR

So why should they learn about music from different cultures? What's good about that?

Henry

For myself I just get interested in the thing because it's fascinating for different styles and for the other peoples' origin and it brings the people, like the different culture backgrounds – people from different background cultures together.

This student gave a particular example where drawing on the prior knowledge and skills of the students had been used as a pedagogical approach to the performance component of the programme. The student had clearly found the experience of playing an Arabic piece with other students both musically and socially satisfying. He also valued the opportunity he had to play some traditional Chinese music in a school performance.

For example, I got to play a piece of Arabic music...and I actually got to know the people like well. Other than before, wasn't before, like before I play these.

Ryan (Sydney School A) felt that it would be “pretty good” if students could learn about home music at school, particularly as this might make parents more approving of the student's choice to study music. He expressed enthusiasm for learning about the musics of his classmates, and was keen to have the opportunity to play unfamiliar instruments.

Sienna (Sydney School B) supported the idea of having a programme that was responsive to the cultural identities of the students in order to allow students to learn more about musics from their family background while allowing other students to “open their eyes” to something new. Alam and Faraz (Sydney School B) both expressed interest in knowing

about the musics of the other students in the class. They also liked the idea that the musics that were listened to at home by their parents, in particular the traditional Iranian songs favoured by their fathers, might be shared at school.

TR

How would you feel if your music teacher asked you to share with your class some of the popular or traditional musics that your mum and dad have taught you – how would you feel about that?

Alam

I'd feel really happy because a lot of those songs are really nice. It would be good to tell our classmates, like people from other countries, how your country plays their music. How they love their music.

TR

Would you feel proud about it?

Alam

Yes

Neither felt that they particularly wanted to learn about Iranian music at school themselves, because they were being educated about this at home, but they did like the idea of sharing this music with others, largely because of their confidence in its wide appeal. In their opinion this appeal came, in particular, from the traditional Iranian song lyrics which they felt were poetic with pleasing and useful messages for all.

Faraz

Like, some songs my dad still likes from then. Like some of the poetry ones. Yeah, he likes some of them.

TR

And do you like that too?

Alam

Yeah, some of them, like some of them have really nice meanings in them. When you actually think about it and when they talk about the world, they have nice meanings in them, so yeah.

TR

Does it interest you too Faraz?

Faraz

Yeah, my dad listens to these things as well. And it makes a lot of sense, like when you listen to the poetry and the music – yeah.

When asked about how they would feel if called upon to share home music with other students, they said they would feel happy and proud. They were also asked how they would feel if their fathers were invited to come along to the school as visiting experts. Their enthusiasm for this idea was tempered with some concern, based on experience, that some students might be disrespectful in their response. However, pride, at the thought of this, appeared to be the overriding feeling.

Alam

Well, it depends on where it is. If you stuck it at assembly I'd actually be proud. Because like all those people in our school, eight hundred people, it would be really great for them to know how the traditional songs have been played. Like, how olden songs are listened to now.

TR

So you'd feel proud about that. Would you feel that way Faraz?

Faraz

Yeah, but it's pretty annoying where someone, for example, they played a Chinese song and other people, they just laugh and all that.

TR

So you'd be, you might feel a little bit, what...

Faraz

I would be proud.

Josh (Sydney School C) expressed a strong belief in student choice. He objected to the idea that the music classroom should be dominated by “white kids’ music” and liked the idea that the classroom would feature diverse musics. He made the point that students need to “know what’s out there” before they can make informed choices about the kinds of musics they prefer, and felt that all students benefit from “knowing more things”, so in

that way a diverse programme would benefit students in a mono-cultural classroom as much as those in a more diverse classroom setting.

they need to offer enough for everybody. So they can't just, yep, have everybody down from all these different places and just say we're going to learn about this thing. The white kids' music pretty much, you know. So you want to try to relate to everybody. But then again we, my class is all Caucasian kids so we kind of just, I mean I wouldn't know what would happen in a very cultural, diverse classroom. But yeah, I think it would be a good idea to let the kids listen to all their own different culture's musics.

For Gavin (Sydney School C), the music programme appeared to provide an important opportunity for immigrant students to assimilate with white Australian culture. This meant that at some point they would need to leave behind the music of a previous home and learn about the Western musics that, in his opinion, rightly dominate the music classrooms of Australia. This student pointed out that, for him, once you are living in Australia, you are an Australian first and foremost. Being an Australian, for this student, entails learning about American and European musical influences.

...usually, like all the people who have been in the school, they've either come to Australia as like a one or two year old, or they've been born here and their parents have come from their background. So either way, probably nine-and-a-half, if not more, times out of ten – it will be they're Australian. So therefore you should be learning Australia's background. Australia's background musically is predominantly American or Europe. Not necessarily Asian or South American or anything like that.

This student did allow for the study of the musics of different parts of the world within a programme, but felt that the major focus for foreign students should be the study of the Western musics relevant to their new country.

Christos (Sydney School C) felt that it is better to have a standard curriculum for all, rather than one that is tailored in any way to the music backgrounds, preferences, or prior

knowledge of the students in the school. However, he did allow that if a student directly requested it, a particular “*cultural*” music might be able to be included in the programme, with teacher permission.

So if they actually said, sir or miss, do you think we could learn about this? ... I definitely think that should be allowed.

David (Sydney School C) felt that it is not possible to cater for everyone’s interests in a music class for practical reasons, however, the programme should aim to engender respect for all musics.

Question 2: What barriers to culturally inclusive music education are identified?

Barriers to inclusive programmes were similar to those identified in the New Zealand case, including a lack of time, and the importance of covering what the students considered to be key content. The general view was that you cannot do everything in the programme, and some things are best left for individual students to pursue in their own time. For one student, student interest was the main issue that needed to be taken into account when decisions were being made about programme content. For this student the evident range of student interests would be a barrier to any compulsory inclusion of ‘world musics’.

David

I think that always conflicts with ‘want’ and with ‘should’ – should we do that or do we want to do that. Because I think everyone has their interest and people want to learn about their interest and stuff. But I think it needs to have some relation to what people are interested in kind of thing. Like at home I was looking at Japanese music and like that really old kind of instrumental, minimalist kind of stuff, and it’s like learning about that because I was interested in the sounds and stuff. It’s like I want to kind of create different sounds and stuff instead of just playing basic kind of rock and classical kind of things. So I think it’s better if people can have an interest, because it’s always

hard to have across like a range of students.

One student mentioned the fact that some schools have very diverse populations and that therefore it would be impossible to respond to all cultures represented in the school. For this student, the diversity of the school was in itself a barrier to having a culturally responsive programme. Another student felt that the point was to have underlying messages that encouraged appreciation of all musics rather than attempting to have a representative programme. One student felt that the inaccessible or unappealing nature of some non-Western musics was a barrier to their inclusion.

Two students felt that the inclusion of non-Western musics should be left to student choice, but felt that a lack of student interest was likely.

Question 3: What do students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Discussion around these questions included identification of the key components of a successful programme, attitudes towards the inclusion of indigenous musics in the programme and discussion regarding the need or otherwise to include contextual information when teaching about a particular piece or genre. All of the students identified either two or three key areas for study within a successful music programme. These were performance “*practical*”, theory, and music history. When probed further about the nature of music history, most students identified the classical period in Western European music as a key point in any study of music history.

Henry (Sydney School A) emphasised the importance of having opportunities to perform as well as having some music history in the programme. He identified pop music as having the most appeal for historical study.

Henry
They should get a chance to perform.

TR
What else should they do?

Henry
Probably some bit of history.

TR
Okay. History of what music?

Henry
Classical or pop. If you do pop music history you'd probably get more interests.

Henry was particularly interested in learning about the context or story around a piece of music so that he could perform with sensitivity to the composer's vision for the piece. He referred, in particular, to his experience of playing an Arabic piece with other students.

For player, actually playing the instruments. You've gotta actually know what the composer is trying to express. So for that sound like the Arabic piece so it sound like expressing the natural beauty of the Arabic environment, so you've got all those castles and like desert and just imagine the people on camel and just walking through all that. So when play you just imagine those things, it just comes out good.

Ryan (Sydney School A) suggested that a successful music programme should include composition, theory, music appreciation and performance. He would like to learn about the musics of diverse cultures, through discussion of the music's context, as well as through playing. He feels that students should learn about classical and contemporary musics "*from all over the world.*"

Sienna (Sydney School B) had a perception of a music history component that might teach students about the beginnings of music.

I think you'd need to teach the practical side, but you would need to teach them about how music came into the picture, like how it sort of started.

Sienna saw the teaching of European classical music as being useful for teaching “*the theory side,*” but also felt that “*it would be great to learn more about different cultures.*” In particular she would like to learn about the musics of the Pacific, because “*its part of my background.*” Sienna also expressed interest in learning about Aboriginal music and dance, and valued this as a way to learn more about Aboriginal culture.

It's pretty interesting to see the sort of instruments and the way they perform their music. Because they have their own instruments, like the didgeridoos and that and they have like, dancers, like tribal dances and that with it, so it's quite entertaining.

Alam and Faraz both emphasised the importance of instrumental playing and the fun they experience through performance opportunities. They also acknowledged places for theory and composing in the programme. Their first choices of music genres to study at school were rock and rap, illustrating their enthusiasm for drumming, however, they also saw that learning musics of the world could provide them with inspiration for their own compositions. Both Alam and Faraz felt that learning about the cultural and historical context of music was very important.

Faraz

Definitely, because what's the point of learning music when it has something in it that you don't know the meaning of and it has something to do with the story, how the music was made. And like you don't know how the music was even made, so you don't have the meaning of...

TR

Right, so that meaning is really important to you? What it meant to the people who made it? Is that important to you as well Alam?

Alam

Yes, because, if they didn't want to, if they just make the music like that, they wouldn't know why they're playing it. If you like go say, oh, play African song, they would start playing, but you wouldn't know like how it started. How that culture started.

Alam recalled learning about Aboriginal music in primary school and felt that it was an interesting topic.

Yeah, they do stories with music. Like for example they make a fire and then they dance around it. That's quite interesting because it's a story that they trying to explain.

Josh (Sydney School C) felt that a successful music programme would introduce different music genres chronologically as part of the music appreciation/ theory programme. He felt that “*all kinds*” of music should be taught at school.

We should start off, I like to do it in chronological events. Like start off with classical and get it sort of like a jazz and then go to a rock and then go to a hip hop and a disco and then, you know, just work like that. Just do the whole entire genre the whole way through everything.

This student felt that the study of “*cultural*” music ought to be available as a choice for those interested. He had not made the choice to engage with such music, personally, as he liked to “*stay more with a Western society music.*” Josh claimed no interest in Aboriginal music, and felt that learning about it should be a student choice, and not compulsory. This was consistent with his view that no music genre should be forced on students; music study should always be a matter of student choice.

It doesn't really interest me. Because I don't like it that much really. But if you want to learn about it, then sure, its good to learn about. I don't really have much interest in it though.

Josh (Sydney School C) thought it was important to learn about the context and meanings of music for the people that made it. He saw this as a way to help him develop his own skills as a composer.

I like to listen to music and think where this came from, you know. Like you listen to lyrics and people worry about heart, sorrow sort of things and you kind of think, well this is deep emotional, I wonder where that came from. So I'm sure it's very important to know where things came from and how they are made. It's important to know that sort of stuff as well.

Gavin (Sydney School C) also highlighted music history as being a vital component in a successful music programme. This reflected his particular interest in history as a subject. He identified what he saw as key points in the history of music.

TR
What history? Whose history?

Gavin
Well, say like the Beatles. Like they sort of shaped music for how it is today. Like the inventing of the PA system, large crowds touring around the world extensively [sic]. Yeah, just people that have shaped music, I think. And then like the blues from New Orleans and, just, yeah, little things like that. You know, just like the creation of music, the Baroque period. Stuff, just things like that.

After further discussion Gavin was open to the idea that it would be beneficial to learn about the musics of other regions.

Well I think as a whole you should know where everything sort of came from. But not necessarily single it out to one country. You know, so maybe you could do like Asia, then Europe, then the Pacific, then the Americas, maybe like just break it up into general areas.

Gavin felt it was important to learn about the background to the music he is learning to play, particularly so that he can portray its emotional content appropriately.

Well, definitely you need to know a background of where the music originated, how it originated, how it was intended to be played to start with. And then how it's changed maybe, if it has changed. Because, yeah, certain styles of music need certain emotions. And certain feelings and all that, and you can't really depict that if you don't know the story behind it.

Christos (Sydney School C) identified performance, theory and music history as key components of a successful music programme.

Good strong practicals, I guess that isn't really – you know you need theory behind that as well. I think the other two things, you'd need the practical, but also, oh, you'd need a solid theory of music, just based on you know, compositions and what notes are, what they do. You know, you need to learn how to be able to use music and create music. And then the third is the history.

His view of music emphasised the importance of the study of Western European classical music.

Christos

...I think you have to have definitely some study of classical music, because that's where it all began.

When probed further on this topic, Christos suggested that classical music was a valid starting point for any investigation into music history because it was where we might find 'our' earliest records of music making.

Christos

Really it's more of a study of, you can't really go back to primitive times where they used to just bang on rocks and make noise, you know, because that's caveman – and that's where I guess everything goes back to that period. It's more the, where we have kind of record of. I mean you need some kind of foundation, some starting point, and that is where it's hard.

TR

Who's the 'we' that we're talking about?

Christos

History, the human race, kind of, like society.

This particular student felt that as well as classical music, students should learn about the roots of American popular styles.

...like rock would be the most popular subject that kids would want to learn about, which then turns into pop and there's all these off-branches, but that began with, you know, a mix of two different, you know, back in America with the white and African Americans and it merged aspects of country with gospel and rhythm and blues. And so it's kind of those main kind of... I guess post-twentieth century where they have a major emphasis on the history.

Christos felt that “cultural music” should be left to student choice outside of school.

...cultural music is something more I guess you'd go out and discover on your own after your teens.

However, he did see value in learning about musical differences within particular historical periods with Western music being the standard with which other musics might be compared. Christos spoke of Australia as a place with only 200 hundred years of cultural history. When challenged on that point he acknowledged that many Australians may prefer to ignore the reality of a longer, pre-existing Aboriginal cultural history. According to Christos the Australian population includes a “they” who prefer not to include Aboriginal culture within the framework of Australian identity.

Christos

And since we're Australian, I mean our culture itself hasn't had a, like two hundred years of history is not...

TR

Well, some people have had longer in Australia.

Christos

Oh, and it goes back to Aboriginal. But like everything you don't see, we don't exactly study Aboriginal music. And that's a big part of Australia...

TR

No, why don't you?

Christos
I'm not sure

TR
Do you think you should?

Christos
I think to a certain degree yeah. Even studying the instruments.

TR
That would interest you?

Christos
I think it would.

TR
Part of being an Australian

Christos
It is a part of every Australian's identity. Whether they like to think so or not.

David (Sydney School C) also described a successful music programme as one that included practice, theory, and music history. David identified the roots of contemporary American music as being an important area for study, as well as indigenous Australian music as a pathway to a deeper cultural understanding.

I'd definitely like, because it's, all music is like a reflection of people and stuff, and it's the same with the lyrics, it's just like a way of expressing wisdom and stuff like that. And it's good to, it helps to learn about the culture and stuff. Like learning about Australian music is I think very important because it helps you – the more you understand it the more you can respect the culture.

David recommended that the study of “*cultural music*” be kept for the senior years where he felt it would be of greater interest to students. However, he wished that he had had more opportunity to be informed about indigenous Australian musics.

David felt that learning about the cultural context of a piece of music should not get in the way of the aesthetic appreciation of the music for its own sake.

Sometimes I just want to enjoy music and stuff, but sometimes I'm interested in like what went into the music to make it what it is. Because it's very deep kind of thing, but I just like to listen, like different ways of listening to music and stuff. Sometimes you just want to enjoy it and just a pleasure kind of thing.

While none of the students identified music other than Western musics in any initial discussion regarding music programme content, four of the students referred to musics other than Western music as “*cultural music*.” For example, Josh, below, clarified my question regarding non-Western musics that could be included in the programme, by using the categorisation of “*cultural music*” as a descriptor.

TR

What about learning about other music, other than Western European and American contemporary music styles?

Josh

Like different cultural music and stuff?

Christos used the term “*cultural music*” to describe a music category that was outside of the musics that would logically be selected for study at school, seeing it as more suitable for voluntary exploration for young adults. He also used the term “*world music*” when expressing his own enjoyment of this category of music.

I like world music. Myself I like to listen to the music from different cultures.

David used the term “*cultural music*” to include indigenous Australian music and to describe a category of music that can be inaccessible or unappealing to younger listeners.

TR

Indigenous Australian music. So have you had an opportunity to learn about that music?

David

Not really actually. Oh we've looked at some indigenous music, like in the early years I think. It's kind of hard to want to listen to that kind of music when you're younger. I think in the senior years it's better to learn about cultural music...

Results of Interviews with Sydney Teachers

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

For Anna (Sydney School A), the students are at the centre of her planning and teaching.

I believe you have to really actually be attuned. You have to listen and respond to the dynamic of the individual classroom and make sure that they are feeling connected to what you are teaching.

Anna recognises the ways that student success in music can enhance self esteem and help students to have a positive image within the school community. She spoke of the success she had had in her previous school where some students with challenging behaviours had become more positively involved in school life because of recognition of their skills as musicians. This involvement also led to greater parent participation in school activities.

...this is what really worked well at my last school, a way of getting parents actually into the school was they saw, oh, wow, the school's valuing what we do. In recognising it, it's relevant, yeah, they're looking at the significance of it and I'm hoping that will bring them in because that worked with a group of the Pacific Island students I worked with, and that was a challenge.

...that had really lasting impact. I know some of them are still at school now because it gave them a positive face within the school as well because they kept being seen in a lot of negative circumstances, and they became more insular because of that and separate from the school. But when I gave them a chance to be recognised in doing something, you know, of worth and to be respected, for example they ended up going out and performing at the opera house and different outdoor venues. We made their costumes and the

parents got involved with the costumes and things like that. That started changing it, so I've seen it work before.

Anna took a variety of approaches to programme development. Sometimes her choices of music to study were in response to the ethnic groups represented in her classroom and sometimes she would select materials that were unfamiliar to all, in order to create challenge for all class members.

Anna

The other tactic I use is I think about what they're all very familiar with and I introduce them to something completely foreign to all of them. So in a way that makes them unified ...it's tempting to just go, okay, I'm going to explore what they know, and because that would be very valuable to them and I do that to an extent – but at the same time if I do that too much, I know I'm actually limiting their growth. Because it's through the school that they're going to have the opportunity to be exposed to unfamiliar things and the benefit here is that you generally don't have one [ethnic] group. So you can explore one, and it will be teaching another group and then vice-versa.

Anna's concern for connection and relevance means that she thinks critically about each topic as she plans. This is evidenced in her approach to teaching about musical instruments. She rejects the idea that discussion about and identification of instruments should be limited to the instruments of the orchestra. She endeavours to use the topic of instruments as a way to connect with students' prior knowledge, while ensuring that the students also develop understanding of conventional orchestral instruments so that they are not excluded from musical situations where that knowledge is important.

I think that, you've got to really think about what you're teaching. So not just teaching something because everyone's always taught it. For example like instruments of the orchestra; now it's important to give them access to that in terms of being able to communicate outside of school in different areas and things with that kind of language. But to spend a whole term as some people do on identifying those instruments, in that way – you could do it in a different way where you are looking at the classification of instruments and you're actually including the instruments that they know

and including their knowledge. Because if you engage in those discussions, then they feel a greater connectedness to what you are doing, a relevance – because the biggest issue I have, and it’s really in my mind this year because I’ve only been teaching the mandatory here, so they have to do the subject – is that some students struggle to see the relevance.

Anna has also used her skills in instrumental arranging to create a situation where students with different cultural and musical identities could play together. She has created a “fusion” ensemble of a small group of willing students from different cultural backgrounds, arranging music for them that develops musical ideas from their home musical cultures and supporting them to play together. She is clear about the wider social benefits of such activities, and this was reinforced for me by the positive way that a student subsequently spoke about this opportunity to play with a diverse group.

Anna

I looked at them individually, for example one of the students that you will speak to was very interested in the Manga culture and the music from that. He’s from a Chinese background but there’s also another student who has an Egyptian background and he absolutely loves to sing. He really wanted to perform in assembly. Apparently in the past he’s sung with a recording with the voice on it, and I said hmm, maybe we can do something different. So I took the recording that he gave me and I arranged it for all the people I could find in the school that played any instrument. That was six people. So I managed to find them. And I said, let’s do it. So what I did is I wrote out the parts and I took for example the year twelve student who’s a fantastic violinist who would never in his lifetime speak to this other student who was a fantastic singer. And then I found a wonderful drummer who once again, their paths would never cross. And the students I had on the flute, quiet as mice – it just would never have happened. But I brought this together for their rehearsals after rehearsing them separately and the students who were a bit more gregarious, shall we say, like the drummer and the singer, they’re oh like, that’s bad [good], how do you do that? ... they didn’t know the names of the instruments or anything. But it started a respect, and a relationship between unlikely people.

TR

So you had a little United Nations going there.

Anna

That's my own view. I want to get the kind of ensemble that brings together as many of the people that play different instruments, especially from their cultures... to create some kind of fusion, if you look at it that way.

Anna expressed a strong belief in the importance of valuing students' cultural knowledge. She did not want her students to think that a lack of knowledge of, for example, classical music, meant that they were not already musicians in their own right. She also saw that maintenance of cultural knowledge may be important for students who may be wishing to preserve cultural connections to their country of origin.

For example with the drumming, you have links across a lot of the different cultures, and they can learn from each other. It's getting them to use their skills in the classroom. I guess to put it in a nutshell, it's looking at valuing what they already know and recognising they're not, you know, empty vessels. And making sure they feel included and connected with the learning. So I think that music education can play a big role in that... especially with the cultures in the school...

I think the intrinsic benefit of music itself is it's a way of connecting with culture and maintaining an identity in things in terms of the significance to the students. So it's bringing something that's important to them, it could be, it's almost like a souvenir from where they've come from. And even say looking at second, third generation, like it seems to become even more important to them because they're trying to hold onto it.

Anna is committed to including diverse musics in her programme. She described her initial concern that she did not have the knowledge to teach diverse musics appropriately, particularly with experts among the students in the classroom. However, positive reinforcement from a student gave her confidence and confirmed her belief in the importance of facilitating student leadership opportunities.

I thought what can I teach them? I don't know. And I even said to a student here, I said look I'm working on it at the moment, I'm working to get a drumming group together of all the people that play the derbakeh [aka darbuka], like the Lebanese drum. And he said "why don't you do it?" And I said, "well I didn't think I have the skills for it". And he said, "no, no, no, you just do that". And he didn't see any problem with that at all. So... looking at students as leaders, accepting that they might have a very high level of skill in some things that you don't [is important].

Anna acknowledged the difficulty of communicating her desire to create instrumental ensembles in the school, where there previously were none. She has realised that the language of “*play*” and “*instrument*” can exclude students who don’t describe the music making that they do as instrumental playing, nor see themselves as a musician when they do not read conventional notation.

Anna

I mean I’ve tried to get information, I’ve put things in an announcement, but a lot of what I’ve found I have found by chance because sometimes when you put an announcement like that, they may play something or be involved in a thing, but they don’t see it as important to the school so I found people who, for example, played the bamboo flute, but he didn’t mention it before because I asked does anyone play an instrument? And they don’t see it as, you know, an instrument.

TR

It’s not an oboe or a violin.

Teacher A

Yeah, they say, well it’s not this. Or they’ll say no I don’t because I don’t read music because they make a judgement as to what would be valued, you know...

Luke (Sydney School B) also spoke about the importance of finding out about the students’ prior knowledge and experiences, cultural or otherwise, in order to plan a programme that has relevance for the students.

Although you could brand it as looking at the students’ ethnic backgrounds, it’s not really... you use the same skill I think in finding out what their interests are. Where they come from, what they know already.

In a similar way to Anna, Luke aims to create units of work that will allow all students to share what they know without privileging a particular knowledge set, for example, instruments of the orchestra.

TR

So do you think about the cultural identities and heritages of the students that you have here when you're planning your programme, or do you plan a programme that perhaps features diverse music, but is not linked specifically to who is in your classroom?

Luke

Yeah, that's definitely the way. So the first unit of work that I teach with year seven is based on instruments, but it's definitely not instruments of the orchestra. It's membranaphones, airophones, chordophones, and...

TR

Okay, so you teach categories like that?

Luke

Yeah, and I get them to talk about instruments that they know. So, of course, the students from Sudan talk about different instruments to the Tongan kids. The reason why that's the first unit that I teach is because it gives me that knowledge of the students' background to begin with. And it includes all of their prior knowledge in the lesson straight away.

Luke is also very aware of the multiple musical identities of the students he teaches. He acknowledged, in particular, the ways that students may be uncomfortable about sharing aspects of cultural heritage that, in the context of the classroom, might be seen to be different to the shared adolescent cultures that they also identify with. This teacher expressed a particular concern for student self-esteem in different ways throughout the interview. It was clear that many of his pedagogical decisions were guided by awareness of, and beliefs about, the kinds of classroom activities and processes that might undermine student self-belief and confidence, and actively avoided these.

Luke

...I've printed out an assessment task for year ten. Although I was reading it and looking at it and going it doesn't look like it's specific to the students' background, but I'm trying to encourage them to talk about music or musics from their cultural background. It doesn't always work.

TR

No, kids sometimes don't want to be put on the spot, do they?

Luke

Well the Japanese kids are the kids who are the only ones who will ever talk, and it was the same at my last school as well, about the music of their culture because the other kids – although it's their personal interests that they talk about, it's always their personal interest within a safe teenage context. You know, what they're happy to talk about in front of their friends.

Richard (Sydney School C) believes it is important to provide very motivating music learning experiences for the students, particularly in years seven and eight, where music is a compulsory subject. With that goal in mind, he teaches music concepts through topics that he believes the students will relate to and enjoy, such as film music. He also includes topics such as Australian Aboriginal Music, which is compulsory, and musics of other regions in the world, such as Africa, as an introduction to non-Western musics. For his older students, who are electing to study music, he introduces musics of other cultures. Some of these are musics of cultures which are unfamiliar to all of the students, but for one topic, he allows the students to choose, and in this case, sometimes the choice may be to study a musical culture that is represented by culture bearers in the classroom. This is not necessarily an intentional outcome of this optional topic, but it is a possibility that this teacher is open to. This teacher also expressed a preference for selecting musics that were in some way graduated in terms of accessibility, in order not to put the students off by presenting them with something that he considered might not have immediate appeal, for example, Indonesian gamelan music.

Richard

So in terms of a school wide music programme, building it up from the ground to get students interested and motivated, particularly with year seven and year eight – because they have to do it... So really, it's my philosophy that while there is musical knowledge that might not mean a lot to them, I try and put it into context so they can have some meaning. I picked topics like music from films and music from advertising and popular music. So music they can identify with. But yet I still do Australian

Aboriginal music and music of Africa to try and introduce them to music from other cultures.

TR

How much, if at all, is your programme informed by the cultural identities or heritages of the students that you teach?

Richard

When I do, other than the mandatory Australian Aboriginal stuff, I specifically do music of other cultures in year nine and I introduce two cultures that I think they wouldn't have had much experience in. Again, I start with something that should be popular, so I do the Reggae Rastifarians, because that's something that they will get into, and then I go completely off-centre and do Balinese Gamelan music from Indonesia, which is you know, hard to listen to the first time. And I get them into that, and then usually the last one I will say I'll leave it open and I'll say what do we want? what do we want to do together?

Question 2: What barriers to musically and culturally responsive approaches are identified?

The three teachers are similarly constrained by assessment requirements. The NSW syllabus requires that particular music concepts or 'elements' must be taught. Each teacher was conscious of trying to find meaningful ways to locate these concepts within contexts that would be relevant and appealing for the students. Richard (Sydney School C) expressed awareness of the cultural construction of music elements and the ways that use of these as tools for analysis for all musics may be inappropriate and reflective of the dominance of Western musical practices and categories.

Richard

It's almost that the syllabus works against it, [musical diversity] because it says there are six musical elements, pitch, tone, colour, texture, structure, but that doesn't always work in terms of analysis for other cultures. Like when I do gamelan music with them, I point out there's not a notational system. What there is, is dots and numbers. So that doesn't mean anything in terms of our duration and pitch. So I then try and talk about the fact that you've then got to work hard about how you can relate it our framework of knowing. So you need to, yeah, definitely step out of how we analyse music.

Richard has observed the way that assessment requirements limit the kinds of knowledge and ways of knowing that are considered valid for assessment purposes

It's like you have to be able to analyse music that has a four/four time signature or has a key signature that you can identify and has scales and arpeggios. Because when it comes to the HSC that's what the examiners want to see. They want to see the kids extract all the musical terminology from the song and be able to write about it. Whereas if you like, you know, if you had an Asian piece which is just pentatonic on one of those string instruments... there is stuff that you could say but it wouldn't allow the kids to demonstrate as much knowledge.

Luke (Sydney School B) identified systemic issues at tertiary education and policy levels that create barriers to diversity among the teaching population in New South Wales.

I think the whole university's admission scheme means that it's a particular type of student that makes it through to university. And I think that that has more to do with eleven years of a liberal government. I think it has to do with underfunding in public schools, lack of opportunities for schools outside of the Sydney metropolitan area. All those things just make it harder for other types of students to make it to university. And the lack of high quality music education courses in regional universities is definitely a problem.

Anna (Sydney School A) described issues to do with the assessment of performance and composition that can work against musical diversity. In particular she noted the difficulties associated with examiner knowledge of diverse musics and literacy requirements for students who may be composing within an oral/aural tradition.

It's certainly a difficult thing because I believe, I mean the way it's set up, it says you should explore different cultural music, but once again, when it comes to the exam I will put forward for someone to do what they're best at, but they say you have to have a contrasting programme of four different pieces. Now I know if I put forward, for example, this boy who is a fantastic drummer – he plays four contrasting pieces on that drum, he will not score as highly because they will say, oh, you know, there's not enough variety, I mean it's too similar because the markers may not truly understand the instrument itself...I think it's a bit of a barrier because what you find I think teachers end up doing is they will incorporate the students' understanding of the culture for maybe one or two pieces, but then for example he would be

pushed in to do something slightly different for the other two pieces. Because they know that they have to show this variation and repertoire so it is a bit of a barrier. I mean they have alternatives, they can do a composition.

TR

Does it have to be written down?

Anna

Well they do have to send through a copy, but it can be in, it doesn't have to be in a traditional form of notation, but at the same time any form of notation is not necessarily following the way it would be done culturally.

Anna also identified barriers related to accessing the experience and expertise of people in the wider community, in particular, the parents of students studying music. While acknowledging the difficulties of communicating with the parent community, many of whom do not speak English, Anna expressed optimism that by creating a culture of inclusion and celebration of many musics, parents would be motivated to be involved in their children's music education by the evident valuing of cultural knowledge.

We send newsletters home about what's happening at the school. I mean, there are immediate problems with that in terms of language. We don't get a lot of parent involvement in this school. And in this region that's a big problem. Like our parent and citizen committee that comes in, there are three people that come, and one of them is the president of it. So it's very difficult to engage in... And that's what I'm going to attempt to do with my work, by having a culturally inclusive music programme and actually getting the students exploring their own cultures through fusing them together. Hopefully, and this is what really worked well at my last school, a way of getting parents actually into the school was they saw, oh, wow, the school's valuing what we do. In recognising it, it's relevant, yeah, they're looking at the significance of it and I'm hoping that will bring them in because that worked with a group of the Pacific Island students I worked with, and that was a challenge.

It was clear from two of the interviews that large immigrant populations present both richness and challenge. This was particularly evident in the interview with Anna, who was newly employed at a school where the majority of the students spoke languages other than

English. The school population was also a transient one, with challenging influxes of students from particular areas, for example refugees from Afghanistan.

Another complicating factor, according to this teacher, was that many of the Muslim students at the school were there because they were unsuccessful in their bids to enter a private school with academic entry requirements. Conflict between ethnic groups was also an issue to be managed within the school, as was the difficulty of communicating with parents regarding children's participation and achievement within programmes. A very high level of linguistic diversity in the school was also a significant challenge for this teacher.

And you get a fluctuation of the dynamic within the student population because of the different groups, you know some are more dominant at some time than others, depending on the influx. Because when you get a new group introduced, like when the Afghani refugees came across – that changed the dynamic and they had some fitting in to do with some people you know, obviously the Lebanese students and all sorts of things.

Question 3: What do teachers believe about content and pedagogy within the successful music programme?

In one school that I visited, there was a long-standing tradition of student involvement in a marching band and other instrumental ensembles. In the other schools, a culture of participation in performance ensembles was either in a transitional stage due to changes in teaching staff, or yet to be developed. In the schools that I visited, cultural performance groups operating outside of the music departments were not in evidence, but the potential for these groups was there. That the programme would include practical and theoretical components was a given in this discussion, so the conversation focused more on pedagogical and philosophical approaches to programme planning and delivery. Topics

included approaches to planning, choosing musical examples, involving culture bearers, teaching indigenous musics, teaching classical music, and teaching music history. All three teachers put what they considered to be student interests first in terms of planning and programme development. All were conscious of student engagement and motivation and worked to ensure that their programmes had relevance for diverse students. In different ways they wanted to sow the seeds of future music learning and participation by ensuring that the students enjoy music classes. Luke spoke of the excitement that can come from performance in a music ensemble. He believes that it is important to get students 'hooked' in year seven, and that this kind of engagement can be a uniquely musical experience.

The first thing is that the students have an opportunity to feel the excitement and the buzz of being involved in music. It doesn't necessarily have to be a concert, it might just be the opportunity to play tambourine with the year twelve rock band while they're improvising on a chord progression and they don't even care that the year seven student is there. But the year seven student's going wow, this is cool. I try to make sure that every student in year seven has that feeling. As long as they have that, as long as they felt that, I think, and I've seen it, it wipes out every other subject. Because it's a real, human feeling. And you can be excited by English, but I don't think in year seven you can be. I just don't think that the syllabus allows for that. In year twelve, once you've built up that knowledge you can find Coleridge exciting, but, I don't know, that's me coming from a music education perspective.

None of the Sydney teachers spoke about their programmes in ways that suggested a privileging of Western classical music. Their programmes could be more accurately characterized as eclectic, with music concepts coming first, and diverse music examples being used as the vehicles to teach these concepts. They each include classical music examples and hope that the students will enjoy this repertoire. They endeavour to introduce classical music in narrative, contextualized ways that will engage student

interest. Some lamented the lack of opportunity to teach the classical repertoire more, as it was a personal passion for one teacher in particular, but none of them viewed it as being at the top of a possible hierarchy of music choices for either appreciation or performance.

One teacher had cultural diversity clearly at the forefront of her philosophical and pedagogical framework for teaching. She, therefore, was planning to build into her programme opportunities for non-Western performance groups. As well as taking a concept-based approach, she typically has an in-depth focus on two different musical cultures in a term, but also includes diverse repertoire within other topics.

Well what I try to do is to integrate the cultures as much as possible, but if I am focusing on teaching a certain aspect, I will, you know, explore it on purpose through very varying repertoire. And part of that is not just doing a range of pop songs, I might do contemporary music to engage them but it might be contemporary music from, you know, Fiji, or it might be contemporary music from this Afghani rapper. Rather than just going through that. So in the junior years I tend to take, in the first two terms, quite a concept-based approach to build up their understanding of the language and because we really have to explicitly teach certain language elements here, because it's not to be assumed. And whilst we're doing that we're exploring a really wide range of repertoire.

While most of the students identified music history as an important component of a good music programme, none of the teachers identified music history as a specific component of their programmes. For Luke, relevant aspects of Western music history are taught in contextualised ways that he hopes will engage student interest.

TR

Okay, one other thing that I noticed here in my student interviews is that when they talk about music history they meant one kind of music history.

Luke

Western classical.

TR

And I haven't been able, even when I probe that and say whose history are you referring to, they haven't been able to understand that question. Do

you think that would be the same with your kids here? And does it matter, do you think?

Luke

I think every time I talk about Western cultural music history, I'm talking in a way that tries to make my subject interesting, like if they turned on the TV, what would keep them listening. And if you talked about Beethoven and his love life and the audience reactions to his piece, they find that really cool and it's a way of jumping onto the next point. It's never actually talking about, I don't think I've ever taught a lesson on music history, based in any culture. So I guess if you asked my kids about music history, I don't think they'd even consider that as music history and they wouldn't, again, they wouldn't be able to answer the question I guess. I hope it doesn't matter because I guess I'm not teaching it.

With regard to the use of culture bearers to support the programme, none of the teachers had yet ventured into the community, although they each had knowledge of what this process might look like as a result of the field experiences they had had while studying multicultural music education at the Sydney Conservatorium.

Luke spoke of the success of "Harmony Day" at his current school. This festival day had provided evidence of community support for 'one-off' cultural performances that could, perhaps, be built on in the future.

TR

And is there any opportunity for example, to communicate with your community in any way? Might there be Samoan parents who might like to make that [cultural performance groups] happen at the school that you don't know about?

Luke

I don't know. I hope there would be, and I haven't thought of doing it though. But there is a multicultural soccer team which, I'm not sure how it works. Originally it was the thing that started off harmony day. Where we had, you know, the Afghani soccer team played the Tongan soccer team and they were ten minute games or something and, so it all happened in the one lunchtime. And harmony day came from that. Where we ended up with the international food festival. And then we did a concert in the hall that was run, it was the arts faculty's responsibility where Home Ec and things did the food festival, but the whole school was involved with it. And we did have

bollywood dancers there and we had the haka there and all sorts of different cultural performances.

All of the teachers were aware of resources to support them in the teaching of non-Western musics, and all spoke of performance groups that they had used to enhance their “world” music programmes.

Anna spoke of the ways that she endeavours to use pedagogical approaches that are appropriate to the music she is teaching. She sees the teaching method itself as being an important component of the lesson, however, she expects that the student will absorb this without spending a great deal of time pointing out the significance of the teaching method she is using.

I don't just go, okay, this week we're doing Japan, we're singing Sakura, and then next week we're going to learn this African song, and then next week, you know – I try and focus on different parts. For example, and this really reflects from my university training I guess with year nine, well I do it with year eleven, we were looking at Balinese gamelan music and we started by actually learning on the glockenspiels about as close as I could come to. But I tried to teach it in the way that I'd been taught...So the method of teaching it I think is part of how to learn.

The issue of the teaching of Aboriginal music was of particular interest. Luke felt that he would not include it in his programme if it was not mandatory. He was struggling to make it appealing to the students. This teacher felt that this was because of ‘overkill’ of the Aboriginal topic in primary school.

TR

I know that compulsorily, you have to teach an Aboriginal music topic. If you didn't have to teach that compulsorily, would you still teach it? You wouldn't? So why wouldn't you?

Luke

Because I just can't get the kids interested.

TR

Why not?

Luke

They've heard all the stories before. They've talked about it. They've done the paintings. They've done the rhythms. I don't have enough time to go into the detail that makes it interesting in classroom music. That's the same with any topic that I do. I just don't have time to go into the detail. And I can't get to that conceptual level with them that makes it interesting for them. I think it's my lack of knowledge in the area, but we do do it and they enjoy it, but it's really hard. The hardest topic I teach.

Richard has experienced difficulty with racist attitudes expressed by students about this topic, but feels that this is a challenge to overcome. He sees racism as part of the culture of Australia and is active in his endeavours to counter this. He feels that all students need to learn inclusive and respectful values and that music education provides an important context to teach positive social values. He tries to teach these values despite some opposition from students.

Because it does say now in syllabuses that we're supposed to, in our programmes and this is for every subject, reflect what's called key competencies, such as citizenship, and environmental awareness, I'm always aware of, you know, sneaking those things in. But the kids will often say, oh this isn't history, this isn't English, why are we doing that?

Richard is aware of, and sympathetic towards the viewpoints of students who feel that Aboriginal world views are excluded from schooling. This is one of the reasons why he would include indigenous musics even if they were not a compulsory part of the syllabus.

If it wasn't mandated in the syllabus, we have other influences that would say we do it anyway. Yeah, in fairness I would because I've even had Aboriginal students – back in my old school there's a couple here but not as many as there were at the old school. When they were in year seven and year eight, they'd actually talk to like the liaison officer for want of a better word, and they would say look, none of the teachers care about Aboriginal stuff, they just talk about it in passing and like we only do it in history and that's it.

He endeavours to include Aboriginal music in an integrated way, as a vehicle to teach particular music concepts such as rhythm.

Usually what I do, and this is brought up at university, when it comes to the study of traditional Aboriginal music, because the kids don't have a lot of experience in it, and because it's something that they should be culturally sensitive to and usually it's very common for them to make racist jokes against Aboriginals, it's just the culture of Australia. So what I would do, if we were doing rhythm or any concept, the song I would probably pick, or the artist or band that I would pick, I'll pick the band first, it's called Yothu Yindi- famous Australian rock band, because it combines the elements of traditional Aboriginal and rock. But if we can take it from the rock elements, discuss that, and then go back into what the traditional Aboriginal group, and I would look at the syllabus and say what words and aspects of duration and rhythm do they need to know, and then extract it all from that file.

With regard to countering racism in the music classroom, Luke also valued the opportunity to encourage critical thinking about culture.

...particularly music gives the opportunity to expose students to other cultures and I definitely get them to question their initial ideas about something after they've learnt a little bit about it. It is something that I specifically think about, but I think music education more specifically is about critical thinking and I think that it's a very good subject for teaching creative, critical thinking. And things like homophobia and racism are, all of those can be attacked in music.

Key Themes

The following key themes emerged from the interviews with the Australian teachers and students. Where a theme has emerged from one or two interviews, this has been noted in brackets. All other themes represent the views of more than two participants. The themes are grouped according to each research question and then discussed in an integrated way with reference to relevant literature. This integrated approach is necessary due to the linked nature of the questions and the correspondingly linked manner in which

participants have reflected on the web of issues connected to each question. Following the theme summaries, major themes are critically analysed and discussed with reference to relevant literature.

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- It is important to connect music programme content with students' prior musical/ cultural knowledge.
- It is important to preserve and raise student self-esteem.
- It is important to avoid privileging a Western way of knowing about music.
- It is important to create opportunities for students from different cultural backgrounds to play music together and musically "cross-fertilise."
- It is important to counter racist attitudes and teaching positive social values.

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

Key themes from student interviews:

- The music programme is not informed by or responsive to the cultural identities of the students.
- There is little 'world' music in the programme.
- We experience a feeling of pride when asked to share music from home with classmates (2 participants).
- Sharing music from home could cause both pride and embarrassment (2 participants).

- Sharing music preferences and backgrounds enables students to learn more about classmates.
- Sharing music preferences and backgrounds enables students to make interesting musical and social connections with others.
- It is important to learn music in a way that engenders respect for all musics.
- It is good to develop a broad knowledge of many musics.
- It is important to have a standard curriculum for all (1 student).
- It is impractical to try to connect with the cultural identities of students in the music classroom (1 student).
- It is important for immigrant students to assimilate to the Western music identity and preferences of contemporary Australia (1 student).

Question 2: What are the barriers to culturally inclusive music teaching?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- Concern about personal adequacy to teach diverse musics.
- Awareness of the culturally constructed nature of music elements.
- Concern about the limiting nature of assessment requirements that privilege particular ways to demonstrate music knowledge.
- Challenges related to communicating with parents and culture bearers within the wider school community about contributing to the music programme.

Question 2: What are the barriers to culturally responsive, inclusive music teaching?

Key themes from student interviews:

- Lack of time to cover topics beyond key areas (Western theory and practice).

- Student population is too diverse. It is impossible to respond to all cultures represented in the school.
- Aboriginal music has been taught in primary school. We don't need to learn about it again.
- Nothing should be compulsory. All music topics should be a matter of student choice (1 student).

Question 3: What do teachers and students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- It is important to acknowledge expertise among the student culture bearers.
- It is useful to teach concepts or “elements” of music through diverse music examples.
- It is important to prioritise student engagement.
- It is important to avoid privileging Western musics.
- It is important to consider the appropriateness of the pedagogical approach when teaching diverse musics (1 teacher).
- It is challenging to engage students with indigenous musics (2 participants).
- It is important to actively counter racism in the music classroom.

Question 3: What do teachers and students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Key themes from student interviews:

- A successful music programme will include practical/ performance, ‘theory’, and music history as the key components.
- Composition is also an important component.

- Music history should focus on Western European classical music and contemporary American music styles.
- Western European classical music is a “beginning point” for music history.
- Contextual information is important as a guide to sensitive and appropriate performance of diverse musics.
- Contextual information should not get in the way of music listening pleasure (1 student).
- Students should learn about all kinds of music, reflecting the multicultural nature of the Australian population.
- It is important and interesting to learn about Aboriginal music.
- Learning about Aboriginal music should be left to student choice.
- The study of non-Western musics is more suited to older students and should be left to student choice and preference outside of school time.

Discussion

The three teachers who were interviewed for this case study were all relatively recent graduates from the Sydney Conservatorium Music Teacher Education Degree Programme. This gave the case a particular flavour in that they were all young teachers, who had experienced the same pre-service teacher education. Of particular interest was the fact that they had each participated in a paper specifically designed to “encourage pre-service students to take a more active and personal approach to understanding and teaching the music of an unfamiliar culture represented within a pluralist Australian society” (Marsh, 2005, p. 39). This emphasis on cultural diversity within teacher education differentiates

these teachers from their American and New Zealand counterparts who had experienced more conservative approaches and content (Legette, 2003). The paper that the Sydney teachers had all completed involves a significant fieldwork project where each student engages in a “form of cultural immersion that takes place within the relatively invisible context of music making of diverse ethnic groups in a large Australian city” (p. 39). The project involves recording and transcription of musical items, interviews with culture bearers, development of a related school programme and reflection on the learning process they have experienced (p. 40).

Here is Luke reflecting on his participation in the course described above. He clearly valued the course and found it challenging.

It was pretty confronting to begin with, because I ended up in a Kurdistan refugee flat in Blacktown. I lived in Blacktown at the time but I just had no idea there was this hidden culture under there, you know, a housing commission house there and became very good friends with him and went to lots of concerts and it was fantastic that way, and it was certainly something that I wouldn't have done otherwise. I wouldn't be game to do it now as a teacher either, if I hadn't been forced to have that experience. On the other hand, though, I felt that we didn't really get a breadth of understanding, most of it, I think was a bit of an excuse for doing Aboriginal music where that should have been a separate course. In our lectures we did mostly Aboriginal music, which is fine, but that should have been a separate subject and in the multicultural music education subject I would have liked to have seen each week a different type of music so that it opened our minds a little bit and send us in different directions that way. Because I really felt that I did an Aboriginal music component class, which we totally should have been doing as a course on its own, and I did this research project that got me out there doing ethnomusicological study.

Anna spoke about the course as being ‘pivotal’ and ‘influential’, providing her with experience and strategies for connecting with culture bearers in the wider community. This linked to and enhanced an existing personal interest in diverse musics that she has taken with her into her classroom teaching.

That was extremely influential because it [cultural diversity] was integrated right from the start because I think at my university there's a great belief in the importance of it. So I had multicultural studies in music education so by that I mean, you actually had to go out and do field work, not just a tokenistic interview. You actually had to go into the culture and learn about it and look at all the aspects of it and that was really pivotal for me because that gave me strategies as to how to connect with community and to see it as looking at experts, you know, culture bearers coming into the school because I'd always had a passion for it so it started that way.

Given the aims of this paper and these teachers' participation in it, it was interesting to talk to them about the reality of their teaching now as they endeavour to put aspects of their teacher education into practice, with some mixed results. Anna had definitely absorbed the key messages of the paper, taken them to heart, and was attempting to 'live' these aims in her professional life. She had entered her teacher education with a predisposition towards an inclusive, informed, and curious way of viewing cultural diversity. She was primed, in a way, to respond positively to the field study aspect of the Multicultural Music Education paper, and this is evident in the culturally responsive way she now goes about her teaching. However, while her attitudes and vision reflect the goals of her teacher education, the reality that she finds herself in has created difficulties for her. While she espouses a very creative, problem-solving approach, lack of resources, difficulties with making contact with a largely non-English speaking parent population, and the challenge of creating a culture of music participation and achievement in a school which at present lacks such a culture are significant hurdles for a relatively inexperienced teacher.

Many of the themes that have emerged from the interviews with these three teachers provide evidence of the impact of pre-service teacher education on the thinking and

particular concerns and aspirations that they describe. With regard to their responses to question one, the three teachers were attempting to teach in socially just ways, with care and empathy and a strong sense of the ethical requirements of teaching. However, their approaches to cultural diversity differed in terms of emphasis, motivation, perception of barriers, and approaches to programme planning in terms of both content and pedagogy.

Butler et al (2007) define culturally aware teachers as being inspired by diversity in the classroom. It is my opinion that Anna fits this definition most comfortably. Luke and Richard are interested and knowledgeable about aspects of multicultural music content and pedagogy but are not necessarily inspired by the cultural diversity of the students they teach. The three teachers in the present study perceive their programmes to be free of underpinning musical hierarchies. They attempt to include diverse musical examples, and Anna is attempting to provide diverse instrumental playing opportunities, beyond the traditional Western ensembles such as concert band or chamber groups. Anna's efforts to provide opportunities for musical cross-fertilisation to occur was clearly significant for the students involved as they spoke about it at length and with enthusiasm, acknowledging in particular the socialization that occurred as well as the pleasure of the musical experience they had participated in. Thorsen (2002) comments on the importance of such events in schools for the multi-dimensional development of adolescent cultural and musical identities.

With regard to using the cultural heritages of students to inform the programme, only Anna was doing this in an intentional manner. However, when choosing a 'world culture' topic all three teachers chiefly choose music content that was either unknown to all of the

students, in order to create a ‘level playing field’ of unfamiliarity, or that would provide some diversity among music examples used to teach the ‘elements’ of music. Legette (2003) discusses findings where 63% of music teachers surveyed did not select music content that reflected the ethnic make-up of their class. Schippers highlights the possible irrelevance of this as an approach in societies where ethnicity is decreasingly an indicator of music identity or preference (Schippers, 2010, p. 30). The teachers in the present study were all open to the possibility that a music listening topic might coincide with the presence of particular culture bearers in the classroom, and sometimes Anna deliberately engineers this to occur, but this appears to be the least likely stimulus for a ‘world culture’ class topic for at least two of the three teachers. Luke’s ‘instrument’ topic does allow for students to share or investigate instruments that are relevant to their cultural background or interests, and so in this way he is using prior cultural knowledge as a tool for teaching and learning. Richard allows student choice for some topics and this means that musical cultures represented by members of the class are sometimes selected for study.

Anna most convincingly fulfills the description of the characteristics of a culturally responsive teacher (Gay, 2000), particularly in the way that she deliberately seeks out students with diverse musical skills to share, and in the way that she values the skills of culture bearers in her classroom. It is clear, also, that her intention is to build on this foundation as her confidence, resources, systems, and community connections grow and develop. She has the good intention to create “dialogue between the school culture and varied home cultures of students” (Hambel, 2005, p. 60), but needs time and encouragement to make this happen. The position of HOD music can be a very isolated one, as was evidenced by the descriptions of the teaching experiences of these three

participants. They have much to do, and in some cases, very limited resources with which to do it. For example, the effort involved in making contact with culture bearers, while acknowledged as an important aim, is, perhaps justifiably, in the ‘too-hard basket’ at the moment for these teachers when placed against what appear to be more urgent and basic concerns, such as resources, time, and administrative demands, in combination with issues to do with personal and professional confidence, self esteem and experience.

Anna

No, like I thought they were exaggerating. I didn't realise they were being honest when they said you are starting from scratch. I thought it was a figure of speech. Everything had been damaged in a way that I don't understand how it could be damaged. Like there was a bass guitar, there was an electric guitar and I went to get it taken in and apparently it had somehow corroded from the inside. So you can only imagine.

Implications

The Australian participant teachers identified challenges and barriers to culturally inclusive music teaching that reflect views expressed by Marsh (2005) as well as findings from similar British and American studies (Lamont, Hargreaves, Marshall and Tarrant, 2003, and Benham, 2003). Teacher concerns about their ability to teach diverse musics, and difficulties implementing strategies and applying philosophies from pre-service teacher education courses and field experiences are well discussed by Benham (2003).

The need for ongoing support and mentorship, as he suggests, would make sense for the participant teachers in the present study. In particular, those writing about the development of culturally responsive teachers (Gay, 2000; Ladson-Billings, 1995a, 1995b; Legette, 2003; Butler et al, 2007) believe that ongoing critical reflection and examination of issues to do with race and culture, including interrogation of one's own cultural auto-

biography, is necessary. With regard to critical reflection leading to action, the participant teachers have demonstrated critical awareness of the hierarchies embedded in traditional music education assessment (Mansfield, 2002, Spruce, 2001) and have attempted to overcome the barriers this may cause where possible.

Richard (Sydney School C) commented on the success of a one-off multicultural festival. Butler, Lind and McKoy (2007), Benham (2003), and Hambel (2005) warn against this “food and festival” approach as being potentially very superficial. However, in this instance, it appears to have been enthusiastically received by the parent and student communities and perhaps this enthusiasm will stimulate interest in a more sustained approach to a culturally informed and responsive curriculum.

All of the Australian students were delightful to talk to; they were forthcoming, open and thoughtful. Interestingly, they were positive about music making both in and out of the school setting and did not hold the view that one context was necessarily more relevant to their developing musicianship, or musical identities, than the other. This contrasts with findings from Stålhammer (2000) and North, Hargreaves, and O’Neill (2000). This may suggest that music educators in general have had some success in addressing this issue over the last decade, and that the participant teachers are successful in their attempts to make school music education as relevant and engaging as possible for their students. The success of Anna and Luke’s efforts, in particular, to preserve and enhance their students’ musical self-esteem and to foster their sense of status as musicians with valid skills and knowledge aligns with Green’s advice to teachers to think carefully and critically about what it means to be musical (2002, p. 46).

However, despite the generally inclusive intentions of the three teachers, it is clear from the student interviews carried out in Sydney that the concept of multiple music histories, as opposed to one large Western narrative that includes both the European classical music and the development of contemporary American popular genre and jazz, is not understood by the students. This is similar to Stålhammer's (2000) findings that showed that British students were more likely to privilege Western classical music knowledge as having greater value than other ways of knowing about music. While most students were open to the possibilities for including more culturally diverse repertoire in their programme, none of the students felt that they were already part of a culturally diverse programme, and none of them was able to articulate a concept of multiple music histories and narratives in the world, without considerable prompting from me. Most of them said that music history should be part of what they learned about in their music programme, and when questioned further about the nature of music history, referred to either European art music history or the development of pop or rock music in America.

Some students commented that Western classical music was "*where it all began*" so therefore it was fundamental to all learning about music and a cornerstone of his expectations regarding the content of music education programmes in schools. Within the students' perception of music history the "*all*" is Western music, and "*began*" refers to either the classical period in Europe, or to Africa, as the origin of slave ships taking African villagers to America where, according to student understanding, we can locate the beginning and subsequent development of blues, jazz, and rock 'n roll music. One student suggested that prior to any of this, we are talking about "*cave people banging rocks*

together". However, when my questioning signaled that there are other ways to think about this, it became clear from his thoughtful responses that he was well ready for a critical discussion of these issues. He was, in many ways, typical of other students, in that his initial responses were dominated by a hierarchical view of music that he had absorbed throughout his music-related schooling, followed by a more open exposition of the issues, reflecting a readiness to grapple with cultural concerns and for some, a readiness and interest in embracing other ways of knowing about and participating in music. There is a lack of literature in this area, particularly with regard to student beliefs and attitudes.

Three students who were relatively new Australians spoke very positively about what it was like, or could be like, to share 'home' musics at school. This contrasts with the prevalent teacher view, that students are likely to be embarrassed about being asked to share these aspects of their musical selves. The issue appears to be 'how' this conversation and subsequent sharing might take place. It needs to be in the context of a culturally inclusive, supportive, open environment where there is space for all voices to be heard and a spirit of intellectual curiosity and a positive desire to know one another musically. One of the students commented that it is always best to "*know more stuff*". Most of the students wanted the opportunity to broaden their knowledge of the big world of music, once their initially limited view was challenged. Again, there is a lack of literature about student perceptions of music education curriculum content with regard to cultural diversity.

The students' identification of music history as a key component of a successful programme is interesting in that none of them are participants in such a programme. Their

programmes feature a mix of theory and performance and music appreciation linked to theory, but no component entitled “music history”. Clearly music history, whether it be a culturally inclusive or exclusive narrative, has not been a solid component of their programme, but is, however, considered by the majority of students to be very necessary and important. In fact, their teachers claim that they teach aspects of history in very contextualized, integrated ways, and perhaps the students are not recognising it as historical content due to this integrated, non-labelled approach. When questioned about the importance of learning about Aboriginal music, given the unique nature of Australia’s cultural history, the students’ perceptions differed from the perceptions that their teachers attribute to them. Two of the teachers felt that the students are not interested in indigenous musics, however, most of the students expressed interest in the topic. One who said that he was not personally interested did not reject Aboriginal music as a legitimate component of the programme.

One student emphasized what he believed was a need for immigrant students to assimilate to his perception of the Western music identity and preferences of contemporary Australia. He was clear that once a person becomes Australian, they need to leave behind the cultural identity of their home country and embrace an “Australian” cultural identity. Critical reflection on the nature and reality of “Australian” music may have been facilitated by taking the approach described by Gorfinkel (2010) where diverse musics may be studied within broader topics such as ‘popular’ music. She refers to the ways that current communication technologies allow musics from around the world to be broadcast to the homes of immigrant Australians.

In this context, one could re-imagine the popular music of immigrant communities, which may be overseas and performed in foreign languages, as ‘Australian’ as any other “demographically’ segmented type of music. Thus the study of ‘music of a culture’ within other ‘topics’ can allow students to constantly probe at the very ‘cultural’ categories assumed in music studies, including what is meant by “Australian music while at the same time introducing students to new worlds of music” (p. 46).

Gorfinkel also discusses the way that student interest in diverse musics can be stimulated by exposure to the contemporary musical expressions of diverse youth cultures (p. 46).

While British researcher Lucy Green (2002b) has found a shift in teacher attitudes towards inclusion of more culturally and musically diverse content, she notes that while teacher practice with regard to music lesson content has changed, teaching methods have not changed in the same way. Methods by which music is analysed, musical ideas are recorded, and student achievement is measured still reflect a privileging of Western analytical tools and Western ways of knowing about music. Similarly, it seems that still lurking in the Australian music education undergrowth is a hierarchical view of music knowledge and musicianship. The strongest and most intractable transmitter of this message is likely to be assessment requirements, which demand application of Western classical tools of music analysis, with a uniform understanding of the conventions and language that underpin such analysis (Spruce, 2001, Dunbar-Hall, 2000). It seems to me that more intentional teaching around this issue is needed. Anna commented that the students “*pick it all up*” without her needing to spell out issues to do with, for example, why she might be using an oral/aural approach to teaching a particular piece. However, the student interview data overall suggests that there are other, more powerful messages about the ways of knowing about music that are important, that crowd out these more

subtle messages. An explanation for this may be found in Georgii-Hemmings (2006) findings regarding the strong influence of music 'process' within a teacher's musical life history. Process may dominate over the more critically reflective, intellectual aspects of music education, preventing critical discussion, and the shared development of socio-political and cultural awareness within the classroom music programme.

One of the interesting aspects of this case is that the teachers have all been through an intensive multicultural teacher education experience, and even if they had not completely embraced the messages from this project, they certainly articulated a clear understanding of the goals of the course. It seems that ongoing support and professional development is needed to shift practice, and that mentoring or supervision may be needed to help teachers to work more intentionally to foster critically literate students who are able to interrogate music education issues within the framework of cultural diversity.

Chapter 6 American Case Study

Seattle and Cleveland, USA

Introduction

In October 2008 I spent three weeks in North America visiting high schools in Seattle and Cleveland. These schools were selected on the expert recommendation of Professor Patricia Campbell from the University of Washington and Professor Rita Klinger from Cleveland State University. During my visit I carried out interviews with each of five teachers and 16 students.

This chapter includes the following:

- A brief overview of the context of high school music education in North America.
- Demographic information about the participant schools.
- Biographical information about the participants.
- A summary of the results from interviews.
- Identification and discussion of significant themes, with links to relevant literature.

Overview of the Context of High School Music Education in North America

This section discusses some aspects of music education history in North America as is helpful for an understanding of contemporary challenges. Issues associated with cultural diversity are particularly highlighted in this overview.

Campbell (1991) has traced the development of music education in America from a time when its inclusion was largely for utilitarian purposes associated with the perceived contribution of music learning to a healthy, useful and civilized society, to a more

aesthetic philosophy of music education purpose. Campbell argues that music education has maintained a place as an important entity in American education (p. 7) and she looks forward to the development of a comprehensive approach to music education where the goal of becoming musically literate embraces “an understanding of music aurally, structurally, historically, and culturally” (p. 20). A detailed historical analysis of changes to music education purpose and practice, with a particular focus on the development of multicultural music education, can also be found in Volk (1998). Volk describes multicultural music education in America as having been shaped by world events, political upheaval, and societal changes, particularly those related to the increasing diversity of the American population. These include world wars, desegregation, immigration rates and policies as well as ‘melting pot theories’ aimed at the assimilation and Americanisation of immigrants.

Multicultural education did not develop in a vacuum, but has been answering the larger agenda of American society as reflected by government actions for the greater part of this century (p. 122).

According to Volk, music education in the 19th and 20th centuries was characterized by the dominance of Western art music. Musical concepts were taught within the context of the German classical tradition and European folk song. However, a shift towards a more multicultural approach in the latter part of the 20th century was evidenced by the inclusion of African American and other ‘world’ music in choral repertoire, and the gradual acceptance of jazz and other popular styles in classroom programmes.

According to Volk, these changes have been led by music education leadership groups such as the National Association for Music Education (MENC) and the International

Society of Music Education (ISME), and influenced by ethnomusicological and anthropological theories and research. This shift to a multicultural approach has included a call for evaluation of the authenticity of musical examples used in education contexts, and a changed view of Western art music as just “one of many valid music systems in the world” (p. 126). Volk also documents challenges to the ethnocentric assumption prevalent throughout the 20th century that training in Western music would enable teachers to teach any kind of music.

The concept of music as a “universal language” upheld this idea, as did the fact that the first musics admitted to the curriculum were European, American, and Latin American folk musics, all based on the Western music tradition (p. 159).

Volk highlights, in particular, the changes that occurred between 1954 and 1967 as examples of the shifts in music education thinking and practice that have typified the twentieth century in America

As jazz studies, the results of research, and anthropology and ethnomusicology classes slowly began to have an effect at the collegiate level, music teacher education moved from an awareness of the need for changes to suggestions for how this could be accomplished. As a result, in thirteen years, the perspective in music education changed from one which saw Western music taught through the exemplar of folk songs and dances from many cultures to one which viewed the presentation of many authentic music cultures as a way to learn about music as a human expression (p. 83).

However, despite such progress, two decades later, Elliott (1989) criticised North American music education at that time as being ‘undemocratic’ in its ethnocentric and hierarchical approach to content and pedagogy, and its imposition of a Western aesthetic approach.

Our prevailing philosophy of music education advises us to treat music (all music!) as an aesthetic object of contemplation according to eighteenth century standards of taste and sponsorship. In view of these characteristics, a critical

question arises: What values are projected by a musical culture that insists that students play what is written; listen with ‘immaculate perception’; de-emphasize a music’s context of use and production; and follow the leader? (Elliott, 1989, p. 13).

More recently, Koskoff (2006) cautions that despite the rich variety and increasing diversity of the American population, the lingering influence of the European colonization of America is clear, particularly with regard to the evident privileging of “musical notation over the oral/aural tradition, ‘formal’ music learning over ‘informal’ and the material aspects of music making, such as the use of (ever more complicated and expensive) musical instruments, over the solo voice” (p. 18). Koskoff notes the historical ebb and flow of nationalism in America, commenting that in times of economic ease the celebration of cultural diversity is more evident, although this celebration is often underpinned by the ‘valorization’ and ‘commodification’ of particular social identities. However, in looking to the future of music making and sharing in the United States, she acknowledges “the potential for identities and musics to intermingle and cross borders, creating new groups, new musics and new interactions” (p. 20). She celebrates the potential for the development of new socio-musical forms, such as Northwest Indian brass bands, or American Indian Gospel “because these combinations are natural within the rich and complex contexts of social and musical plurality that have and always and continue to define the United States today” (p. 20).

One of the defining realities of high school music education in North America is the emphasis on instrumental and choral performance. In each of the participant schools, performance in marching and concert bands, choirs, orchestral and jazz ensembles is a great strength, and success in competitions is a source of both pride and pressure for

teachers, students and school communities. The importance of ensemble playing in high school music programmes, particularly in choirs and marching bands, is a product of America's colonial history. This is well documented by Campbell (1991) who describes, for example, the development of choral singing within singing schools in the 1700s. Such schools were established by English missionaries anxious to create musically literate and capable congregation members. The 20th century saw the proliferation of community and military bands and the subsequent association of band music with sport and other civic events. The employment of community and military band leaders in public schools, and the participation by school bands in competitions and festivals lead to a great deal of community enthusiasm for school band music and this became a very popular inclusion in the musical offerings of schools (Campbell, 1991).

School band programmes tend to focus around a yearly cycle of contests and sporting events and some have argued that the pressure and inflexibility of this, along with large numbers of student participants and some poorly skilled band leaders, leads to a questionable quality of music learning for the students. This issue appears to be a source of ongoing debate (see, for example, Pratt, 2009; Williams, 2007). Campbell (1991) acknowledges the criticism of ensemble-based music education, but argues that measurable and valuable music learning does occur in these settings. However, Pratt (2009) has argued that the narrowness of the performance repertoire of, in particular, marching bands needs to be challenged and that these groups should play more diverse musics. He believes that the teaching of such repertoire should also entail discussion of the context of the music, as well as performance opportunities that might have a strong cultural focus, with culture bearers included in the performance experience. Campbell

agrees that such ensembles need not limit themselves to one Western way of knowing about music, but can be “fertile grounds for the use of devices found in other music systems” (p. 247).

Typically, high schools offer students a choice of ensembles, for example, choir, marching band, or orchestra. There may also be a variety of jazz vocal or instrumental ensembles. Some schools, depending on funding choices, have separate theory, music history, or composition classes. Some schools also offer the International Baccalaureate diploma programme²⁰. Unlike New Zealand, which has a national curriculum, curriculum requirements are determined by individual states.

There are voluntary National Standards for Music Education and these are intended to guide teachers in elementary and high schools. However, as Williams comments, the Standards suggest that music education in the United States is based on a comprehensive, musicianship model, where students will be performing, creating, listening, as well as investigating links between music and culture. Williams questions the influence the standards have had on music education in high schools in the ten years or so since their publication. While elementary teachers are dedicated to implementing the standards, Williams doubts that there is the same commitment in high schools as high school music educators are evidently “stuck in a performance and notation-skills paradigm” (2007, p. 2). He argues that, in fact, most high schools are very limited by the long-established

²⁰ The IB diploma programme is an internationally recognized, standardized curriculum, aimed at preparing students aged 16 to 19 yrs for university entrance.

performance ensemble model. He believes that it is imperative that school music educators think about ways to make school music more interesting and technologically relevant and questions the quality of learning that takes place within the performance model. He is concerned about the decline in numbers of students selecting to study music, and the lack of participation in music activity beyond school. Clearly, this opinion is highly debatable, however, it is intended to provoke practitioner and policy maker self-reflection and review of current practice.

Finally, we have to be honest about what is taught and learned in the vast majority of performing ensembles. Generally, it has little to do with musicality, but more to do with performing technique and skill, abilities that are of little use to the majority of students after they leave high school. The pressures of performance preparation keep many students from receiving anything like a rich music education. I would suggest that our model of music education, as large performance ensembles, has failed and continues to fail (p. 4).

While Williams, above, laments the limitations of the performance ensemble model, Abril (2008) is concerned about the limits of this model from the perspective of cultural diversity. He argues that “divergent ways of being musical are not typically embraced within conservatory-style schools of music that are pervasive in the United States” (p. 4). He states that the typical ensembles to be found in high schools are viewed by many students as limiting and irrelevant to their music interests and identities.

Strategies for creating culturally responsive performing ensembles in the context of American high schools are suggested by Mixon (2009). He advocates broadening the definition of what can be considered quality literature to include music from any source that has cultural meaning for the students, and also supports the inclusion of more specialized ensembles, such as fiddle and mariachi groups alongside what are considered

traditional ensembles groups (choir, orchestra, marching band) (p. 3). He provides advice regarding the evaluation of resources, and advocates that teachers seek professional development from conferences and other music education courses, consult with culture bearers and local experts from within the student and wider school community, and demonstrate flexibility with scheduling so that students can participate in a variety of ensembles (p. 9).

About the Schools

Seattle

Seattle is situated in the Northwest of America in the state of Washington. It is a seaport with a population of approximately 582,454 (U.S. Census Bureau 2006). It is an increasingly ethnically diverse city. 70% of the population are European American, 13.1% are Asian, 8.4% are African American, 5.3% are Hispanic, 1% are Native American, and 0.5% are from Hawaii and the wider Pacific. 20% of the population speaks languages other than English.

Cleveland

Cleveland is in the state of Ohio, situated on the shores of Lake Erie. It is the most populous city in the state. The population is approximately 444,313 (U.S. Census Bureau, 2006). 51% of the population are African American, 41.5% are European-American, 7.3% are Hispanic, 1.3% are Asian, and 0.3% are Native American.

Table 6: American Schools Demographic Information

	Roll	Socio-economic	Ethnicities
Seattle School A	Co-ed 1,900.	Upper middle	85% European-American 10% Asian 5% African American, Native American, Hispanic, Pacific Island
Seattle School B	Co-ed 1,700.	Lower to middle	60% European-American 22% Asian 9% African American 7% Hispanic 2% Native American/Alaska Native
Cleveland School A	Co-ed 1,900	Middle	90% European American 10% Asian, African American, Hispanic
Cleveland School B	Co-ed 1,900	Low to middle	85% African American 13% European American 2% Asian, Hispanic, Native American, Pacific Islander
Cleveland School C	Co-ed 1,870	Low, middle, upper	60% African American 30% European American 5% Asian 5% Hispanic, Native American, Pacific Islander

Student Biographies

This section introduces the American student participants and gives some insight into their family, community and school lives, music preferences and interests, and aspirations for future music making, work and study.

Ayako (Seattle School A, Teacher - Peter)

Ayako is 17 years old and a senior at Seattle High School A. She enjoys all of her classes and is “*fairly laid back*”. Ayako has been playing the violin since she was three years old and has played in school orchestras since the fourth grade. She is also in a community

youth orchestra. Ayako is Japanese-American. Her parents were born in Japan and moved to America before Ayako was born. She is fluent in Japanese language; Japanese culture and traditions are very important to her and her family. Ayako's parents have taught her the Japanese folk songs that they learned at school as children. Her family and friends all love to play and talk about music.

Mi Cha (Seattle School A, Teacher – Peter)

Mi Cha is 17 years old and in her senior year. She plays in the school orchestra. Last year she studied music within the IB programme and enjoyed the musicological approach that this took. She is busy with many extra-curricular activities including the Future Business Leaders of American Club, volunteer work and sport. Mi Cha is Korean American. Her mother is a pianist and her father is a taekwondo master. Her father is beginning to take an interest in music, motivated by Mi Cha's enthusiasm and involvement. Mi Cha's mother grew up listening to and playing traditional Korean music. Mi Cha has learned this music also, as well as traditional Korean dance. She enjoys being able to compare and contrast Korean musics with the European classical music she learns at school. Mi Cha would like to pursue music as a career, but knows that she is expected to major in Business Studies when she goes to college.

Elizabeth (Seattle School A, Teacher - Peter)

Elizabeth is a senior student. She studies violin and plays in the school orchestra. In previous years she has been in the school choir and marching band. Elizabeth's parents and brother were born in China, and she was born in Seattle. While Elizabeth claims that she "*doesn't care about culture*", she has observed cultural differences between

American and Chinese approaches to music education. She doesn't approve of the lack of commitment and respect shown by American students, but also finds the Chinese way of teaching music too impersonal.

TR

So tell me, what is the Chinese way?

Elizabeth

Last year I went to an extra-curricular activity school. It meets after school and such and there are several levels and you just work on your extra-curricular activities. So there was one room filled with violinists and one teacher. But students were all teaching, learning separately and learning their own pieces depending on their level. And after a few minutes of practice the teacher would call them up and tell them to play for them. They play, and if she thinks they're good enough then she gives them a new song and says to go home and work on it. And if they're mediocre she says to stay and to practice that for a little while more. If not, it's pretty insulting when they say, well you really suck. Like in the end they say just go home before your father beats you for being so bad.

TR

Oh really?

Elizabeth

It's pretty bad. It's just really impersonal.

TR

And not very...

Elizabeth

Not encouraging at all, it's very competitive.

TR

So you think that way of learning doesn't suit you?

Elizabeth

I like the competition, but I don't like the harsh treatment.

TR

And you see that as a Chinese way of doing things?

Elizabeth

Mostly an Asian way.

Elizabeth likes all music except for country and gangster rap. She is particularly keen on Asian pop, including Mandarin, Japanese and Korean songs. Next year, she is planning to study medicine.

Mathew (Seattle School B, Teacher - Caroline)

Matthew is seventeen and looking forward to college. He is European American. He has applied to the Julliard School in New York and is excited about his prospects. Matthew is a very busy musician. He plays in the school orchestra, is lead trumpeter in the jazz band and is in several different brass and jazz quintets outside of school. Here he describes how he came to be a trumpeter.

I did have a choice, they tried to get me to play a violin and piano and neither of those worked at all. I just wanted to swordfight with the bow and stuff. And then in the fourth grade we were allowed to play in the school band and you know, everybody's this big and has no lungs, so I picked the trumpet because it was loud.

Matthew's aspiration is to be a studio musician on the East coast "*where there's lots of work and you get to play all kinds of styles and still make money*". His family are all musicians, but they don't play together.

TR
And why not?

Matthew
Well, let me see, my parents are divorced and my dad married another cellist so that's two cellos, a trumpet, a harp, my mum a violinist, she's now married to a conductor... oh no! Of course those aren't good for anything.

Matthew thinks that most of the stereotypes about musicians at school are probably true, particularly in terms of the marching band, which is typically populated by kids who "*don't make friends easily*". While he has enjoyed playing in all kinds of ensembles,

jazz is his greatest love. He particularly likes the opportunities to create that you have as a jazz musician.

...it's really fulfilling for me more in jazz than in classical music, because I feel like anybody can get on top of their instrument and play some stuff on a page, but if you listen to the other guys and make something spontaneously, you just compose. And if it sounds really good, that's about the most fulfilling thing I know.

Tristan (Seattle School B, Teacher - Caroline)

Tristan is 16 years old and a junior. Tristan's mother was born in India and his father is European-American. Tristan plays the viola. He loves the sound of the viola and enjoys playing a variety of genres, including classical, Celtic folk, and jazz. Tristan has learned about Indian music from his mother. He enjoys listening to classical Indian music, Bollywood and Indian pop music. He has aspirations to be a writer of short stories when he leaves school.

Eryn (Seattle School B, Teacher - Caroline)

Eryn is 17 years old, in his senior year. He is hoping to be accepted into a college, but is unsure about what he will study as he has many different interests. He is also considering enlisting in the army. His family is supportive of whatever decision he makes. Eryn is an only child, and lives with his parents and grandmother. He is of Native American heritage and has learned about this aspect of his cultural heritage from his parents. Eryn is a violinist in the school orchestra. He is looking forward to the Pumpkin Seed concert coming up for Halloween, featuring a rather "dark" and heavy repertoire. Eryn learned the violin through the Suzuki method, starting when he was six. He plays mostly classical music, but also some jazz and some Celtic fiddle. He also enjoys composing songs and

listens to all kind of music. He has not had an opportunity to explore musics other than Western art, show, and pop music at school. He thinks that music is something that has value for its own sake, but also has spin-off benefits such as the opportunity to make friends. Eryn thinks that the competitive nature of school music helps the students to strive for excellence.

Lydia (Cleveland School A, Teacher - Karen)

Lydia is a European American student in her final year of school. She is the Field Commander of the school marching band. As well as this, she is in the choir and also plays in a jazz band. Lydia plays the clarinet and would love to be a professional musician in an orchestra. She is planning to be either a history or music major when she goes to college. In her own time she enjoys listening to folk music from around the world. She thinks her music teachers are wonderful musicians who love teaching. She appreciates the high standards that are expected of music students. Music education has given her confidence, leadership skills and strong friendships.

Jeff (Cleveland School A, Teacher - Karen)

Jeff is in his senior year and looking forward to college. He is European- American. He is hoping to get in to the prestigious college where his mother works. This will mean that he gets his fees paid for him. Jeff plays the piano, sings, and plays trumpet and euphonium. He is in various choirs, a barbershop quartet and a wind ensemble. Music keeps him cheerful, keeps him thinking, and has been a source of fun and friendship.

Rose (Cleveland School A, Teacher - Karen)

Rose has been singing ever since she can remember. She also plays the flute, and composes songs for guitar. Music has been so important in her life that she is keen to share that knowledge and enthusiasm with others. She is planning to study to be a choral director. Her family are all active musicians in the community and support Rose's musical goals. Rose is European-American.

Rachel and Christopher (Cleveland School B, Teacher - Bryan)

Rachel and Christopher were interviewed together due to time constraints. They are both in their senior year. Rachel is an honours student and is co-president of the A Cappella Choir and also sings in the Gospel Choir. She is African American. Her mother was born in Trinidad. Rachel is playing Maria in the school production of *West Side Story*. Rachel loves learning music at school because of the opportunities it gives to express herself. She is planning to major in journalism at college.

Christopher is also African American. He comes from a long line of pianists and singers. He has been singing in choirs since the fourth grade and began studying piano when he came to high school. Christopher is in several different choirs, including the Barbershop Quartet, the A Cappella choir, and the Gospel Choir. He has the role of Tony in the current production of *West Side Story*. Christopher appreciates the opportunities to create something beautiful afforded by group music making. He believes that the students who select to study music tend to be “*pretty good kids*” and their achievements and behaviour give positive messages to the community about activities at their school.

Jasmine (Cleveland School C, Teacher - David)

Jasmine moved with her family from California when she was in the eighth grade. She is African American. Her father is an Episcopal priest and her mother is a librarian. Jasmine grew up around music, including singing, and listening to orchestral music. She has also been a dancer since she was four years old. She has studied “*modern, jazz, West African, Indian, Thai and spiritual dance*”. These different dance forms were available to her at the experimental elementary school that she attended in Berkeley, California. At her current school she has focused on singing. She is in the girls’ A Cappella treble choir. She enjoys singing in different languages and learning the cultural stories around the songs. She loves gospel singing and thinks that learning how to sing in a more classical style at school has helped her be able to transition between the gospel style of singing and other styles without ruining her voice. She believes that the same amount of passion goes into singing classical music as it does into gospel singing.

At the moment she is “*falling head over heels*” for a fusion of ragtime and gospel music. A highlight of her choral career so far has been singing the *Mozart Requiem*. Jasmine is planning to go to college in Atlanta. She would like one day to teach English in an urban setting.

Chelsea (Cleveland School C, Teacher - David)

Chelsea is an African American student in her senior year. She began learning the piano from her grandmother at the age of five years. She also plays the cello. Chelsea enjoys composing and is excited about having a piece for viola and cello that she has composed

performed in a school concert. She intends studying composition in college. In her own time she enjoys listening to both pop and classical music. Chelsea loves studying music at school. *“It’s a very homely environment with everyone because we all love each other”*. She thinks that she has great music teachers and believes that the quality of the teachers motivates the students to commit to whatever ensemble they are in whether choir or orchestra.

Sophie (Cleveland School C, Teacher - David)

Sophie is a senior student and the president of the choir. She was voted president because of her leadership qualities; she is confident and authoritative. Sophie is a singer and also plays piano and violin. She is African American and grew up singing gospel music in church. Her whole family love to sing. In her spare time she and her friends enjoy creating raps. She enjoys listening to many kinds of music, and loves to dance. Sophie thinks that the secret of musical success at the school is the pride that is taken in music performance. She particularly appreciates the opportunities she has had to travel with school ensembles, for example she has been to Spain with the choir and this year will be travelling to Italy. Sophie is planning to study medicine and is keen to move away from Ohio to attend college.

Carmel (Cleveland School C, Teacher - David)

Carmel is off to college next year where she is planning to major in music and psychology. She comes from a mixed ethnicity family.

“..my mum is half Irish, half German...my Dad’s black. God love him”.

Carmel remembers listening to German songs that her mother sang to her when she was little. Carmel's German cultural heritage is important to her and she has studied German language for the last three years. Carmel is a cellist. She loves studying music at school. She thinks that the school culture is very friendly and positive and the students and teachers are very enthusiastic about making music together. Carmel appreciates the way that the teachers consider the students' interests when they choose music to play. Students are often asked for repertoire suggestions.

Andrei (Cleveland School C, Teacher - David)

Andrei is Romanian and has been living in America for six years with his parents and younger brother. Andrei sings in the A Cappella choir and the Men's Octet. The Octet sings a variety of material, including gospel songs and songs from musicals. Andrei enjoys a diverse range of musics. The only music he doesn't like is hip hop as he doesn't think that hip hop is real music. Andrei is planning to go to college next year to study engineering and plans to keep up music as a hobby. He thinks that successful music performance is largely about hard work. Music is an important part of his emotional world and personal identity.

It's just everything, I mean it's a part of who you are. It's learning culture in a way, because that brings in so many things, music can. And it can also, you know, it can be your friend when you're feeling sad, pop in some Beatles and you... while my guitar gently weeps.

Teacher Biographies

Peter (Seattle School A)

Peter was in his 31st year of teaching at the time of his interview for this project. He has been band and choir director in many schools during his career and has a Master's degree

in conducting. Peter's current school enjoys a very good reputation for its performing ensembles with large numbers of students participating. He is proud of the fact that high numbers of his ex students continue to participate in music beyond school. His definition of a successful music education is one that inspires a life-long interest in music. While Peter identifies all sorts of intellectual and social benefits resulting from music learning, he suspects that students choose music largely because it is fun and they enjoy making music with their friends.

While we wish that they had maybe higher, loftier goals than that sort of thing, I think it just breaks down to as simple as that. You know, it's fun.

Caroline - Seattle School B

Caroline is the Head of Performing Arts at Seattle School B. In this role she has administrative responsibility for both Music and Drama. She also teaches three orchestra and two piano classes. Caroline has a Master's degree in Music from the University of New Mexico. She shifted to Seattle intending to be a professional orchestral violist, however, chose to teach instead, and has been doing that for the last 16 years. Nine of those years have been spent in her current school. She stills plays regularly in a symphony orchestra and recently has been "*dipping her toes*" into jazz. At home she enjoys jamming with her son who is a jazz pianist. She believes that one of her strengths as a teacher is her ability to attend to the particular needs of her students. She wants her students to feel loved and to have fun and she aims to inspire them to become life-long music learners and participants.

For example, I have a lot of really talented kids which I am very lucky to have. But most of the kids end up going to college and they don't play music any more. And so what I want for these kids is for them to have had a really excellent communal experience in music where they come into class and they have a very high level of achievement, but at the same time it be very

inviting, very loving, very positive, I'm trying really hard to make sure that kids feel really loved pretty much by me for sure, but I really want them to think of music as being fun. And so when they get older they'll remember it as a positive, so maybe they will really think about going out and watching a symphony or going out and you know, playing in a chamber ensemble or, you know, just participate in music. On any level, whether it's listening or performing, or whatever.

Karen (Cleveland School A)

Karen came to her present position because of the strong choral tradition and excellent reputation of the school. She has a PhD in conducting.

*I came to *** * High School because the tradition was here. It's always been outstanding. They're very culturally minded. It's less of a soccer mentality and many of the kids have grown up singing in children's choirs or participating at the **** Theatre and that kind of thing, so I think it's a combination of what I bring and a combination of what **** High School has been...*

She is excited by the opportunity to introduce the “choral basic literature” to her students and her love of music keeps her motivated. She is excited to hear her students “breath life” into a piece of music by bringing their own expression and interpretation to it.

And it's so good for them to use, you know, right-brain, left-brain, they're making instantaneous decisions at the same time as far as how to do that note. You know, how to place the note, how to sing it, how long should you sing it, what's the duration? And then also adding their own expression. That's important to me, to see kids do that. And my experience with that is more classical music. So it's exciting for me to see them sing their first Palestrina motet, you know, their first, what we're doing, you know, Eric Whittaker or Morton Lordson or Mozart or, it's the first time they sang Hallelujah Chorus, it's the first, you know....

Bryan (Cleveland School B)

Bryan has been teaching in his current position for nine years. He has a Master's degree in Choral Direction. He was head hunted from his previous position, and

made the change because of the reputation for excellent choral singing, historically if not currently, in his present school. He is a great believer in high standards of rehearsal discipline and etiquette, and has very clear ideas about the kind of vocal technique that he wants from his students to enable them to sing classical repertoire. His choir is largely African American.

Eighty-five percent are African American, and it's the blacks moving out of the black ghetto, coming up here for middle-class values.

According to Bryan, the standard of choral singing in the school had deteriorated markedly in previous years, due to the retirement of key teachers as well as funding and administrative challenges. Bryan's appointment at the school has largely been driven by school alumni who are keen to restore the reputation of the school's choirs and reinvigorate the vocal tradition. Bryan feels that he has a responsibility to give the students the confidence and discipline necessary to be successful in choral competitions. He believes that the students view him as the "white man" helping to lead them into the middle class.

But these kids are fighters here. I mean, they're scrappers, they view me as the white man who can make them successful in the white man's world. So they were watching and I've done the same thing when I was in a private school – took these kids to these festivals and competitions, made them sit and watch two groups ahead of time, because you have to teach them how to walk, how to act. You know, I want to bias the judge by how we walk in and the kids understand those words. Because they black [sic]. Bias – prejudice. We're going to prejudice the judge. They're gonna want, when they look at us they're gonna think, boy, we can sing.

David (Cleveland School C)

David wanted to be a music teacher from a very early age. After graduate school he worked full time in church positions and then went on to gain his doctorate in choral

direction. Currently he is an organist and choral director at his local church as well as being Director of Choirs at his current school. He has been in his present position for 12 years. David appreciates the fact that his current school values having a highly educated faculty and that several staff members have doctorates. Over 40% of the school population are enrolled in a performing ensemble. The school has 300 students in the marching band, which splits into four concert bands when football season is over. There are three orchestra classes and six different choral ensembles. David knows that his musical experiences growing up were very different to the experience of today's students.

I think in today's world, this ipod world is very interesting. On one hand I think it has closed students off. I always say that with the invention of the popularity of the ipod, everyone is plugged in, everyone has earplugs in their ears and I think they're missing what I call environmental music. When I was a child growing up, I heard the music my parents played in the house. I heard a lot of Frank Sinatra or they loved polkas, it was a German ethnic family, they loved listening to polkas on the radio. Or opera on a Saturday afternoon performance. And I think today's students are missing some of that because they're so plugged in. But on the flip side of it, the internet has just opened up so many, now when we sing, no matter what we sing, the students go home and Google it or Youtube it and they come back and they say, "hey, I heard a performance of this piece we're doing". So it really has opened up their world and it's very accessible, and almost with iTunes, they can buy any piece of music in the world for ninety-nine cents.

Results of Interviews with American Students

Table 7: American Student Information Summary

Students (Pseudonyms)	School	Ethnicity info
Ayako	Seattle A	Parents born in Japan
Mi Cha	Seattle A	Parents born in Korea
Elizabeth	Seattle A	Parents born in China
Matthew	Seattle B	European American
Tristan	Seattle B	Mother born in India, father European-American
Eryn	Seattle B	Native American
Lydia	Cleveland A	European American

Jeff	Cleveland A	European American
Rose	Cleveland A	European American
Christopher	Cleveland B	African American
Rachel	Cleveland B	African American
Jasmine	Cleveland C	African American
Chelsea	Cleveland C	African American
Sophie	Cleveland C	African American
Carmel	Cleveland C	Mother German, Irish, Father African American

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

None of the students in Seattle Schools A and B, or Cleveland school A was able to comment on ways that the music education they are experiencing is informed by or responsive to the cultural diversity of the participants or wider community. Students from Cleveland School B felt that their music education was culturally inclusive and welcoming and Cleveland School C students felt that they were experiencing music education that was both culturally informed and responsive. Most of the students felt that their cultural identities were important to them and some felt that this should be more actively acknowledged and responded to in the context of their schooling. Many students expressed interest in other ways of knowing about music that might be held by culture bearers in their classrooms. Some students noted that while classroom music education focused on Western classical or popular musical traditions, there was scope to include non-Western musics as an extra-curricular activity if a student has the motivation to initiate this.

The three students at Seattle School A all have a level of bi-musicality. They are all interested in and either perform or listen to the traditional and popular musics of their family cultural background. Ayako has learned Japanese folk songs from her parents and

is passionate about preserving her connection to Japan through participation in traditional Japanese cultural activities. Mi Cha performs in a Korean dance group and learns Korean music as a community-based activity. She feels that she is able to transition comfortably from participation in traditional Korean music making in the community to Western classical music making at school. Elizabeth listens to all kinds of Asian pop music. She would also like to learn traditional Chinese instruments and would like the opportunity to play contemporary compositions by Chinese composers for violin.

Ayako believes that students have musical identities linked to the ethnicity and culture of their families that they would like to share and investigate in the context of school. For Ayako the lack of diversity in the music offerings at school does not make sense given the very diverse nature of the student population.

I think exploring other kinds of music, other varieties is a really good way to experience music. We shouldn't always just stick to one topic and our class is very diverse, we have people from everywhere.

Her family experience of enthusiastically maintaining Japanese cultural traditions and interests, including music, while living in America, has influenced her feelings about this matter. Her friends, from other ethnic background, also enjoy sharing their musical and cultural heritages and identities with each other.

My boyfriend's Korean, so his parents like to tell me about all these old traditional Korean songs. They'll ask me about Japanese song. And then the two girls you just previously talked to, we're pretty good friends, so we talk about it and I don't know, I think it's really interesting. Like I see some similarities and a lot of differences and it's just really cool how the whole... like back in the day how people would come up with songs like that or, and then composing music is very like incredible – I could never do something like that.

Mi Cha thinks that teachers should take a ‘round the world’ approach where students are invited to share their expertise if they have prior knowledge of other musics. Elizabeth believes that it is important that students understand that there are multiple music histories. She illustrated this with the experience of going to China and being told that she should be playing the work of Chinese composers. She had not known that there were Chinese composers, because of what she perceives as the dominance of “*Bach and Beethoven*” in American high schools.

All of the students at Seattle School A recognize that school music education involves participation in and commitment to a particular musical world and they are all able to meet the performance expectations in that context.

In Matthew’s (Seattle School B) experience of music education so far, the diversity of the student population and the surrounding school community has no impact on or relevance to the music programme. In his opinion, students who have families who value European classical music, jazz, marching band and choral music will be very well catered for in the school. In Matthew’s opinion there is no interest, funding, time or motivation for anything else. He knows nothing about any other music traditions and would only be interested if he felt this would in some way benefit his instrumental playing. He is receiving a top quality version of the music education he values and wants, and is well on the way to being a top level participant in the musical world that he values, outside of school.

Tristan had not previously considered the relationship between the cultural community of the school, or the ethnic backgrounds of students, and the content and pedagogical

approaches of music education in school. If not for his Indian mother, he would not know anything about any musics other than Western art music and jazz. He thinks it would be fun to learn about diverse musics at school.

He thinks that it may be strange for students coming from different places in the world to be only educated about Western musics at school. He is also personally interested in finding out about musics that are indigenous to America. Tristan recalls his mother being asked to come to his elementary school to talk about Indian musics. He also recalls having opportunities to play diverse instruments such as Pacific Island drums at elementary school. Tristan commented that students who wished to start an extra-curricular group at the school, such as a Pacific Island drumming group, would be free to do so.

Eryn, who attends Seattle School B with Tristan and Matthew, is a Native American student. His cultural heritage is very important to him and he believes that all music students in America should learn something about the first musics of the land. However, he acknowledged that because “*there are not many of us left*” Native American music is not widely known about or accepted. While he likes the idea of having the opportunity to explore diverse musics, including the musics of his own family background, he cannot imagine how that could happen in the school setting, particularly given the minority position of the non-white students in the school. However, like Tristan, he commented that the school does encourage cultural groups that can meet outside of school programmes and sees that as a potential place for the performance of ‘global’ musics.

*And we do kind of have, well it's not part of the music programme, but it is part of the whole **** ethos, I guess you'd say. They have all these culture clubs and they obviously they meet and anyone can join pretty much. And*

we have this thing called the diversity centre, which is where they all just showcase whatever their culture is.

Lydia, Jeff and Rose attend Cleveland School A. Lydia has not had a chance to explore non-Western musics at school. However, she thinks that students would sign up for a class about “world” musics if one was offered. She expressed interest in finding out about the musical heritages of the students in the school and in being able to find out about music histories other than the history of European classical music. She noted that the school ensembles do not reflect the diversity of the school population. *“Choir is probably the most diverse, band, not at all”*

Jeff has also noticed that the choral and instrumental ensembles in the school do not reflect the ethnic diversity of the wider school. His theory about this is that some students are not serious enough about schooling to apply themselves to the demands of music education. He thinks that this may be a cultural issue. This view is evidence of cultural stereotyping and prejudice.

To be truthful, I really don't know, but actually it might have something to do – there's always a pattern, it almost seems that a lot of kids who will be in the band or anyone that really plays an instrument or takes something really seriously are usually the ones that take school a little seriously. And I mean, I don't think that it's that way, but a lot of times it's reflected in the classroom and other things that the people that are in these, in the musical programmes take everything a lot more seriously and it's always, either the people are naturally good or talented or they really work at it, and those are generally the people that really work hard and like, other classes, and I think maybe the other cultures might not put such high a value in music or they have the natural talent but they don't have the motivation to do anything with it.

He thinks that a possible solution to this might be if they had more diversity in the repertoire they perform. However, he believes that the opportunities for music

education are there, it is simply that some students are not choosing to take up the opportunities that are provided. Jeff remembers that in elementary school they sang and played a very culturally diverse range of musics. He thinks that American students come from a great range of places and so should know about the music of their personal cultures as well as the indigenous musics of America.

Rose believes that the non-white students at her school think that they won't be allowed into the music ensembles such as choir and orchestra. She thinks that some students have the impression that one of the ensemble directors holds racist views, and that students don't get on well with one of the others who is considered "*stand-off-ish*". They also perhaps consider that the ensembles are "*uncool*" and only for "*goody-goody white kids*".

TR

Tell me, you know, you've got quite a multicultural school here, but that multicultural nature of the school is not reflected in your ensemble groups. Why do you think that is?

Rose

I think, I have a lot of friends who are of different cultural backgrounds, I think that they all just, they think that because of their either racial or cultural background that they won't be allowed in – but that's not true. Because I mean...

TR

Why do they think they wouldn't be allowed in?

Rose

*Just because you know, oh, ****, the band teacher is racist, or...*

TR

Oh no

Rose

He's not. I mean we have, we have plenty of people from different cultures in all parts of the band, you know? It's...

TR

And what about choir and orchestra?

Rose

Oh, I mean, orchestra I think the orchestra director can come off as a little bit stand-off-ish sometimes. And I know I've had my differences with her, so.

TR

So people are a little put off, do you think?

Rose

Yeah, and just, I think that these people just think that the choir is for those goody-goody-white-kids, you know, and just don't realise that we don't care what you look like. If you can sing, sing, you know?

Rose has not had the opportunity to explore 'world' musics at school. She has a personal interest in multiple music histories and would like the opportunity to investigate beyond Western music in her school music studies. She doesn't know anything about indigenous American musics, but would like to learn about these.

African American students Rachel and Christopher (Cleveland School B) believe that all students are welcome in the vocal ensembles at the school and that there are opportunities for them to explore their cultural identities through music. They feel that their cultural history and heritage is valued by the school and that the musical director values talent no matter what cultural package it comes in. They have had the opportunity to study African American Music History in a dedicated course and the director has arranged for tuition in African drumming.

The students at Cleveland School C (Jasmine, Sophie, Chelsea, and Carmel) were confidently able to identify ways that the music programme was responsive to and informed by the cultural identities and heritages of students and the wider community. These students felt that the choral director, in particular, was responsive to the cultural identities of the students in terms of the music content that was selected for study and performance. Other identified ways included creating an inclusive environment where diverse students felt welcome, including a variety of material from around the world in concert programmes, negotiating with students about preferred repertoire, and creating an environment where students felt comfortable to suggest material that they identify with from a cultural perspective.

Jasmine believes that it is very important for the music programme to be responsive to the cultural identities of the student participants. She agrees with the view held by the school race relations group, that student achievement is promoted when students see people like themselves in leadership roles, for example as the composers or performers of music considered worthy of study. She also thinks it is empowering for students to learn about the richness of their own musical heritage, including musics from aural/oral traditions.

Having a connection to people that you may have derived from, that you're familiar with is a powerful thing to know, okay, you know, we created music and it's, like, I think people are so surprised when they hear a classical and they're like wait, classical in India – how can you have, but every type of music has a classical version. You know?

Jasmine also believes that as well as targeting the cultural heritages of the student population, it is important for music teachers to acknowledge the cultural groups that are missing from the community and provide opportunities for students to investigate some

of these unfamiliar musical cultures, so that they don't suffer culture shock when they "step out of the **** bubble"

You know, I think it's really important for educators to look at the population of the area and then what that area is missing also. You know, because growing up in California I was used to having many people, you know, a lot of my friends were from Colombia and from Portugal and from China and Japan and Thailand. You know, the Asian population here is much smaller. So I think it's even more important...

Chelsea believes that the lack of discrimination at the school has meant that students from minority backgrounds feel welcome in the performance ensembles, particularly the vocal ensembles. She also feels that the diverse repertoire that is performed by the ensembles, signals to students that diversity is welcomed and valued. This, in turn, has helped students to understand the reality of multiple musics in the world. The vocal ensembles perform material that reflects the cultural demographic of the school as well as opening their ears to other regions of the world.

Sophie believes that students of all cultures like to play in orchestras and sing in choirs and all should feel included in these ensembles. She is interested in the musics of the world. As an African American student she feels that she is able to explore different musics and ways of performing that are important to her in different contexts; the church and the school choir.

...I sing differently at church than I do in choir....because in choir I sing like an operatic - is that the word?- operatic voice and in church I sing like from my stomach and with more power and soul I guess.

Carmel thinks that the accepting and very positive culture of the school means that the students are interested in diverse musics and would welcome any student who wanted to share other cultural ways of knowing about music.

Alex knows about the traditional and popular musics of Romania because of his parents' heritage and musical interests. He lived in Romania until the age of eleven, when the family moved to America. Alex thinks that if he wanted to suggest a Romanian piece or composer, for example, a work by Georges Enesco, the choral directors and other students would receive this positively. Alex feels that in particular, the musical identities of the African American students are well catered for. He thinks that the students have varied understandings of music history in the choir, however, because of the diversity of material they perform, the students understand the multiple narratives that make up world music history.

Question 2: What barriers to culturally responsive and inclusive music education are identified?

Not all of the students were able to identify any particular barriers. For some of them the underpinning and accepted norms of music education itself ensure that particular ensembles are offered and a particular repertoire relevant to these ensembles, and expected by the community, is played. While students may be diverse, and other ways of knowing about music are evident within the student population, this is not considered relevant to music education as they know and experience it. Culturally responsive and inclusive music education is not an evident goal for these students, so therefore the consideration of barriers has not been an important or relevant part of their conversation and thinking about

the music education they participate in. However, some students were able to readily identify some particular barriers that were apparent to them. For example, Ayako and Mi Cha (Seattle School A) identified the pressure to be competition-ready as a performance ensemble as a major barrier to having more diversity in terms of the music that they play.

Ayako

When you're in a competition you have to have competition-ready music. And I guess the judges over here, they're used to songs that are played like original, like really classic stuff, so I think it's just easier if we pick those kinds of songs so they can help us. And every time we go to competition a judge will always give us constructive criticism to help us get better in our playing. I think that's one of the reasons why we pick like the classic stuff.

Mi Cha characterized high school music as needing to be “serious” and “sophisticated”, unlike elementary school music, where diverse instruments are used, and culture bearers are invited in to share their expertise. She also identified the privileging of written notation as a barrier to diversity. She gave the example of indigenous American musics that are not written down and are therefore not suitable to be studied in school. Mi Cha also identified the ubiquity of Western classical and popular musics as a barrier to experiencing more diverse musics.

Similarly, Elizabeth (Seattle School A) identified the pressure of competitions, expectations of matching particular repertoire with particular performance ensembles, lack of teacher knowledge, separation of playing and theory, and the perceived fullness of the curriculum as barriers to more diverse musical content.

Tristan (Seattle School B) commented that whereas in elementary school there are opportunities to explore and investigate diverse musics, that is not the nature of high

school music education. In high schools students commit to a particular instrument and a particular kind of ensemble such as marching band, orchestra or choir. This consequently limits the repertoire that will be played and the instruments available to play on. Eryn (Seattle School B) was unable to imagine a curriculum other than the one he is currently engaged with. He also saw that the majority position held by white students in the school would make it difficult for the musics of any other minority ethnic group to be taken seriously as a source of study or performance.

For Rose, (Cleveland School A) the major barrier that she was able to identify was the perceptions of the non-white students, that the music ensembles were not intended for them, and were not ensembles that they were likely to enjoy or feel welcome in.

Christopher and Rachel (Cleveland School B) did not feel that they were experiencing any barriers to the celebration of diversity or the inclusion of many musics in the programme. They felt that the vocal music department welcomes all who can demonstrate talent and that they were having opportunities to explore the diverse histories of American music. For them, the inclusion of gospel music in the choral repertoire was an example of culturally responsive music education.

The only barrier that Jasmine (Cleveland School C) could identify was the potential insularity of the school community, where teachers might not look beyond the cultural groups represented in the community to explore musics more globally. Sophie (Cleveland School C) has noticed that there are more African- American students in her choir than are typically in other school choirs. She thinks that her school culture is one

where the students get along very well and where it is not considered “*embarrassing*” to be in the choir as it might in other schools. Sophie thinks that everyone should have a chance to find out about their history at school. However, she hasn’t had a chance, at any school, to find out about any instruments other than the typical western orchestral instruments.

Like Sophie, Carmel identified the fact that participating in music ensembles in her school is not considered “*uncool*” or “*nerdy*” as a reason why the music ensembles reflect the ethnic demographic of the wider school. She suspects that this potential ‘nerdiness’ is what puts African American students, in particular, off participating in music education in other schools.

I think in the other schools I think it happens just because people think, like, oh, that’s not cool for me to do but I guess it’s okay for them. But I think here we just really think that’s just something we want to do. And it’s just like, we think it’s a good thing to be into instruments and be into music. But other schools may think like, oh, that’s kinda nerdy. But we think it’s awesome, like wow, you can play that, you’re really cool...

Carmel also thinks that the school actively helps students who might be experiencing economic barriers to music participation.

Question 3: What do students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

All of the students interviewed felt that they were participating in successful programmes. Unlike students in New Zealand and Australia, they are not involved in a general music programme that includes playing, music appreciation, and theory. Their music education at high school is very much focused on instrumental or choral performance. They may also be taking a theory class, which may include some elements of music history. They

may have chosen to take a specific music history class, or a class focusing on contemporary music styles, if such a class is offered. Therefore, they did not comment on music education as requiring a particular balance of topics or activities. Overall, they believe that successful music education is what they are currently experiencing. They like and admire their teachers and they identified many personal and social benefits and opportunities from learning music. Music education as it is currently delivered for these students is both enjoyable and useful. However, some of the students were able to identify ways that music education might be enhanced as an experience, and for some students, this meant being more culturally inclusive and responsive.

Ayako, Mi Cha and Elizabeth (Seattle School A) each feel that their music education could be enhanced by opportunities to investigate ‘world’ musics, in particular, the musics of their own cultural heritages and those of the other students in the class.

Ayako

I don't know about many Japanese kids here, I know a couple and they like music too. They play piano and they sing and it's usually the topic, music, when we talk about, what we like about music, and I'm pretty sure if they had a class or like an opportunity to learn more about it they would definitely take it.

Ayako and Mi Cha commented that participation in the IB diploma programme had given them opportunities to explore a greater diversity of musics than their other music classes.

Mi Cha commented that the IB programme had given her the opportunity to investigate ‘world’ musics through project work, using a topic-based, ethnomusicological approach.

This has whetted her appetite for further study of ‘world’ musics. Elizabeth, while enjoying her involvement in the school orchestra, would love the opportunity to play Chinese compositions and to learn about traditional Chinese instruments in school.

Ayako emphasised the importance of learning the context of music so that they can perform in an informed and more committed way, with understanding of the stories around the music.

Matthew, Tristan and Eryn (Seattle School B) liked the idea of greater diversity in the programme, but didn't think that this was at all feasible. They all felt that their programme is successful as it is, and that the content and teaching approaches reflect what communities expect from high school music programmes. However, Eryn feels that school music programmes should teach all students about indigenous American musics and acknowledged that this is currently a gap in his music education.

Lydia (Cleveland School A) liked the idea of being able to find out more about musics indigenous to America and Jeff (Cleveland School A) thinks that it is important to learn something about music history. He recalls that a music history class was offered in the previous year but he didn't choose to take it. He likes to know the stories around the music.

Rachel and Christopher (Cleveland School B) understand that there are all types of music styles that might be performed and studied at school. They think that it is particularly important to learn about the cultural context of the music so that they can sing with the appropriate expression and understanding.

*There are all types of music, you know, places and music. We sing a lot of spirituals, which, you know, and **** always, you know, he talks about the piece before we sing it. You know, and make sure we understand what*

we're singing because, you know, if we don't understand what we're singing we can't put our personal, you know, emotions into it.

These students have also had the opportunity to take a specific course on African-American music history. They have also enjoyed the opportunity to learn about African drumming from a visiting tutor. These students have valued these opportunities to explore their own cultural heritages and identities as part of the content of their high school music education and believe that this is an important component of a successful programme.

Jasmine (Cleveland School C) believes that it is important for all musics to be actively valued in music education so that it is a “*level playing field*”. This includes the contemporary music styles that students are listening to. Chelsea, like the other students interviewed at Cleveland school C, believes that successful music education includes diverse content, is inclusive and responsive to culture, and has high standards and expectations. According to Chelsea, the fact that the various school ensembles have been successful in competitions has made them attractive to student participants. Success has bred success, and created popularity and a ‘cool’ factor that some other school ensembles may lack. The variety of material chosen for performance has also made the choirs popular with diverse students. Chelsea, Sophie, Carmel and Alex are all participating in music education programmes that they feel are highly enjoyable and meeting their needs. The content is diverse and they value this. They have input into the repertoire and appreciate this negotiation process. The pedagogy and content in combination has fostered a very inclusive and positive culture for learning. Alex commented positively on the cultural diversity of the music they have performed.

However, he acknowledged that they don't get much opportunity to learn about the cultural context around the music because of time constraints. He identified this as a gap.

Results of Interviews with American Teachers

Table 8: American Teacher Information Summary

Teachers (Pseudonyms)	School	Ethnicity info
Peter	Seattle School A	European American
Caroline	Seattle School B	European American
Karen	Cleveland School A	European American
Bryan	Cleveland School B	European American
David	Cleveland School C	European American

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

This question encompassed discussion about current practice as well as discussion about ways that music education could be more responsive to and inclusive of student cultural identities and heritages in particular, and 'world' music more generally. While all of the teachers interviewed are aware of, and interested in cultural issues associated with the membership of their choral or instrumental ensembles, only some of them feel that they are actively engaging with the cultural identities or heritages of the students with regard to either repertoire choices or teaching method. For Karen, the goal is to introduce her students to Western classical choral literature. This is her motivation and great pleasure as a director. For Bryan, while including gospel repertoire is a way of valuing the heritages of African American students, the introduction of classical choral repertoire is viewed as a way to raise the standard of the choir and lift the students socially, in the eyes of the community. Peter and Caroline feel too constrained by time, resources, limited

professional knowledge, and competition responsibilities and expectations to explore ways to engage with the cultural heritages or identities of the students.

David feels that he is aware of and pedagogically responsive to the cultural heritages and identities of his students. For David, student views, interests, preferences, and cultural identities are a resource to draw upon when selecting performance material.

Peter (Seattle School A) does not currently respond to the cultural backgrounds of the students that he teaches. His programme is not responsive to, or informed by the cultural diversity of the wider community, nor the global nature of music as a phenomenon. He does not see that culture impacts on the ways that the students perform in the ensembles that he directs and is unaware of students' perceptions regarding issues related to music and cultural diversity. He thinks that the students do not have a hierarchical view of music, but suspects that they do not have an understanding of the multiple nature of music history. He believes that their understanding of musical diversity will be shaped by the media but not by music education experienced in high school.

According to Caroline (Seattle School B) the membership of the orchestra that she directs does not mirror the cultural diversity of the school. The students in the orchestra are mostly middle- to upper-class white students. She has some Asian students, a couple of African American students and a couple of Hispanic students across her three classes. She is aware that her students do not have a practical understanding of multiple music histories or narratives.

I think they fundamentally understand it, but they don't really get it. Because we don't do enough of that here. I mean I can guarantee you at least I don't. I wish that I did, and that's something that is for me becoming more and more important, especially as I get more students who come from all different places in the universe. And it's hard, though, for someone like me who's been doing this now for twenty-some-odd years and for me, because I don't know. I don't have the education to really go in and start talking about, you know, Balinese music or you know, African music or you know, these different types of music. And I would love to and I did get a little bit of a taste of that when I was doing the IB programme which I loved, but again it was something where I had to go and I had to learn about it before I was really able to bring it to my classroom. And you know, it's a time issue, and it's tough to be able to bring all of that in. But, yes, I do believe it's a huge, hugely important part of teaching and but I don't do enough of it, for sure.

Caroline thinks that “*it would be a blast*” to be able to teach in ways that are responsive to the cultural identities and heritages of the students. However, she feels that she doesn't have the time or resources to reconstruct her curriculum to be more responsive to cultural diversity.

Oh, I think it would be the coolest thing ever because I mean, I just think about the kids – for example Vietnamese music. I have quite a few kids who are Vietnamese. I know nothing about their music at all. And I don't think the kids really understand what it is that they know. You know, so it would be really fun to think about, so this year we're going to choose five kids, you know, cultures, we're going to do Vietnamese, we're going to do Somalian, we're going to do you know, southern Mexican music, you know what I mean. And really get specific with different areas where people's families are from. I think that would be great, but again it's a time issue and it's a how do I have the resources to even be able to do that? Instruments, you know, get the recordings...

Caroline expressed anxiety about how she would choose what to cover, and how she would provide a learning experience that had depth, given the time available and her own lack of content knowledge.

Karen's (Cleveland School A) choirs are essentially mono-cultural, European- American groups. She believes that the reason why her choirs do not reflect the culturally diverse nature of the school is because of the repertoire that they focus on. The repertoire is largely classical and she believes that this attracts students for whom classical music appreciation along with the extra-curricular study of a musical instrument and theory are the norms for them and their family.

It could partly be the repertoire that we work toward, I think. We're very classically oriented, not so much you know, popular music. And I think it's the culture also of the kids that are in the diverse groups. That sometimes they don't have in their background and culture – they haven't grown up with playing an instrument...

She is therefore in a chicken-egg situation where she is responding to the students that typically choose to participate in choirs at her school with repertoire that she believes is important and valued by this group and their families. In this way she can be seen to be pedagogically responsive to the cultural heritages and identities of these particular students. However, she is also aware that the repertoire and teaching method may serve to exclude some students. Karen suggested that students from less “classically oriented” backgrounds may be catered for by a class called Music for Today and by the opportunity to play in an off-shoot of the main orchestra that plays more popular repertoire and includes typical rock instruments in the ensemble

*I think it would be lovely to have you know, even perhaps some kind of a performing group. We do have a class called Music for Today – and a lot of kids will take that class and they do look at music of other cultures and then look at a wide variety of genres too. And also we do have an offshoot of our orchestras called the ***Project – which is sort of a rock orchestra. And it's an after-school thing and she will audition kids on you know, guitar, electric guitar, because they play the electric violins, the vipers. Okay, so she does have kids outside of the music programme who come in and play drums and you know, so...*

Bryan's (Cleveland School B) choral ensembles are largely populated by African-American students. Bryan believes that this leads to particular challenges for him as director. His major focus is on training his choral ensembles to be able to sing classical repertoire in competition-winning ways. He allows some singing of gospel songs, but is anxious that the typical gospel singing style does not influence their vowel sounds and intonation.

...with the African American experience, they all sing in their throat, and it's a raspy sound. So we had to spend so much time pulling the voice forward. Talking about placement. Vowel sounds.

Bryan provides experiences that he believes will be important and relevant for African American students. He includes some gospel music in the choir repertoire, but is keen to ensure that they sing the material "correctly" without "shouting and screaming". He selects musicals such as *Fiddler on the Roof* because of the relevance of the story to the school's Jewish community. Currently the school is rehearsing *West Side Story*. He believes that many of the students can relate to the social and cultural themes in the story.

David (Cleveland School C) believes strongly that the music programme should be responsive to and informed by the student population of the school. His school has close to 60% African American students.

I am very intentional about including the body of African American choral literature. I mean African American repertoire of spirituals is such a tremendous wealth of material and a major part of the choral repertoire of the world. And then of course the African music we've been doing. The world has discovered the music of South Africa in the last ten years or fifteen years, and students really enjoy that, so I feel good that we're definitely representing that, their culture.

David also feels that he has the opportunity to get to know his students. He works very closely with student officers who provide a useful way to keep informed about students' needs, interests and issues.

Question 2: What barriers to culturally inclusive and responsive music education are identified?

For Peter (Seattle School A) the barriers to culturally inclusive and responsive music education in his high school are largely related to time constraints and teacher knowledge.

The expectation to perform well in competitions is linked to these issues. Competition judges expect a particular repertoire. Peter is skilled at preparing students to perform this expected repertoire to a level of excellence. If he introduced a more diverse musical programme, this would detract from the goal and responsibility to be competition ready.

While supporting the concepts of culturally responsive and inclusive teaching from a philosophical perspective he does not feel equipped in terms of time, energy, or professional knowledge to put this philosophy into practice. Also, the school does not have the funding to introduce classes where 'world' music investigation or performance could be addressed. The school does not currently offer any extra-curricular opportunities to perform or study non-Western musics.

Caroline (Seattle School B) acknowledged that many of the barriers to teaching music in a more culturally responsive and informed way were due to her own lack of confidence and her desire not to add any more stress and homework to what is already a more than full-time job. While she wishes that she was introducing more diverse repertoire to her students, and helping them to understand more fully the diversity of musics in the world,

as well as acknowledging the different understanding and ways of knowing about music that her students were bringing to the classroom, she does not feel that she has the knowledge, time or resources to do this. She feels that she doesn't have the time to address the gaps in her knowledge. She also commented on the difficulties of resourcing a more culturally diverse programme, in terms of instruments, recordings and other teaching materials. Caroline also commented on areas where one might imagine there to be barriers, but where she felt that in reality she would find support for change. These areas were student motivation and opinion, and parent attitudes. She feels that after some initial concern, her students would be excited about the opportunity to explore the music of either classmates or selected regions of the world. She also feels that she would have no difficulty bringing parents along on the journey, such is the nature of her relationship with them, and their support for the activities of the school music department.

Realistically my parent community I believe would probably do anything that I felt was right. And they would probably support me a hundred percent.

Caroline believed that she would have no difficulty locating culture bearers to come and share their expertise in the classroom. She acknowledges that the barriers to inclusion of culture bearers, and the accessing of resources in the community such as the university gamelan, are of her own making and are located in the world of perception and imagination rather than reality. She admits that she, like other teachers, is probably trapped in "her own little world".

Honestly, probably they [culture bearers] would be the first people here. You know, I think they would love to do that. And you know, I think one of the things again is being a high school teacher that is so regimented in my own little world, I think that it's hard to really be mindful of remembering to go out and ask the community for help in doing things. Or if you want to do something new, there's probably a ton of people who would love to come in and talk about... Well I know for example the University of Washington,

they've got a huge gamelan, and you know, if I called over there and said hey, you know, can we come and could you do something, they'd be all up for that. I'm sure that's true. But it's just a matter of me doing it.

Like Peter and Karen, one of the other barriers that Caroline identified was the pressure of competition. While she describes herself as not being a competitive person, beyond striving for personal excellence, she acknowledges that emphasis on competitions and festivals is an historical reality in schools that needs to change. However, the major barrier for Caroline is time.

... it just takes so much time to do what I'm doing already, so for me to think about going and adding one more step to going over to the university and doing that, it just adds one more step to my day, it's like oh-my-gosh, it's so prolonging.

Karen (Cleveland School A) has been employed at her current school because of her excellent reputation as a choral director. The parent community and the school administration expect her to prepare her choirs to excel in competitions. This is her major focus.

It's sort of expected of me to go to contest, and so contest consists of going to district contest in March and getting a one, straight ones from the judges, and then going to state contest in May. And you sing three songs at each one of those and one of the songs must come off a list. So just to make sure that I'm singing songs appropriate for that particular kind of judging situation, I've always felt a little bit squeezed. You know? And in years where I just decide I'm not going to go to contest, which is tricky, I have to have something else I have to, you know, like I'm going on a trip instead. Then I have a little more freedom to choose, you know, different things. But you know, it might not be very well received in the contest situations because they are looking for standard rep. But so that, if you're asking what parameters might you know, exclude me from doing that, I would say the expectation that I'm going to participate in contest, I'm going to do that literature and I'm going to do well.

Karen acknowledges that the expectation that choirs will sing standard repertoire is a barrier to choosing more diverse material.

Bryan (Cleveland School B) believes that his programme is responsive to the cultural diversity of the students. He did not identify any barriers to this. This view was supported by the two students interviewed at this school. These students both believed that all students were made very welcome in the choral groups and that all cultural heritages were valued and celebrated. They also felt that this was part of the underpinning ethos of the school.

David (Cleveland School C) does not experience barriers in his school, generally speaking. The music department enjoys considerable administrative and community support. He highlighted some of these enabling aspects. One is the relationship with the middle school. He commented that there is a great deal of interaction between the music faculty and the middle school ensuring that students are well motivated and prepared to participate in music when they transition to the high school. Also, the school is located within a very artistic community. While the community is diverse *“racially and economically ... there’s a real desire for the importance of music and including music in our lives.”*

According to David the administration of the school is very supportive of the arts, employing highly qualified staff and ensuring that course timetables facilitate the easy scheduling of music classes into student time tables. *“I think the students are truly scheduled into their music classes first, and the other schedules kind of work around it-*

that's very unusual.” Additionally, the school offers music classes at honours level. This ensures that academically driven students see music as a realistic part of a “*strong academic portfolio*”. The one barrier to diversity that David is able to identify relates to the band programme. This programme is less diverse. David attributes this to the economic issue of instrument hire or ownership and the cost of private tuition. However, oddly, the orchestra programme, which has the same economic issues, is a diverse group. David was unable to explain this anomaly. He acknowledged that indigenous musics are not given space for performance or study in the programme. This is because he feels that Native American culture has been overshadowed by the cultural interests of the larger groups of immigrants that have come to America.

We haven't treated our indigenous people very well and they really are truly a minority in this country. When I think perhaps if they've been overshadowed by the large group of immigrants we've had in this country – the eastern European, African American, Asian... We have so many cultures that have come to us in the eighteenth, nineteenth century that I think in many ways that's overshadowed the native American.

David would like to be less driven by performance schedules. With more time and greater flexibility he would like to explore even more diverse material than he already does with his choral ensembles, particular with texts that are not in English. He feels well supported with resources to teach non-Western material, although he acknowledges that this repertoire was certainly not part of his own tertiary education.

Question 3: What do teachers believe about content and pedagogy within the successful music programme?

In the same way that Caroline and Karen expressed their views on this matter, Peter (Seattle School A) acknowledged that there is a difference between what he can and does do, and what he would like to do if he had the necessary time, resources, flexibility and

administrative support. He believes that a good programme should be broader and more musically diverse than his currently is, however, he is unable to see how this might be achieved. He is aware of experts he could go to for advice, and he is convinced that his parent community would be more than supportive of a change. However, he cannot see that the situation will change and feels that he is not at a place in his career where he has the time or energy to investigate or advocate for a change of approach to music education. Peter acknowledged that in some regions learning about indigenous cultures was being prioritized. He is also aware that elementary schools often include Native American musics in their programmes, however, he did not feel able to investigate indigenous musics or include them in his programme as he is fully extended and engaged with what he is currently doing.

As the North Western division president I oversaw six north west division states including Alaska, Washington, Idaho, Montana, Wyoming, and Oregon, and– quite a bit of heritage, native American heritage. For some reason, and there is here in Washington too, but for some reason not so much of a push here to learn or know about the native American culture, or music...

I think that in the primary grades, elementary grades, I think that those teachers are doing some of that. At least, when I go around and visit in the classrooms and that sort of thing, I see that some of that is done.

TR

What do you think the message is to young people if in the elementary grades we have multiple musical stories and then we come to high school and there's just one way to make music?

Peter

I agree. I agree and I'm not comfortable doing anything more than what I'm doing.

Caroline's (Seattle School B) major goal is to provide positive learning experiences for her students so that they will feel motivated to continue their participation in music

beyond high school. Her field is orchestral performance and within that she sees some gaps that need to be filled. One of these areas is composition. This is connected to a need for more diverse performance repertoire. If students were able to pursue an interest in composition, she feels that they would benefit from more diversity of repertoire so that they would have more to draw on as inspiration. In terms of diversifying the performance repertoire, Caroline likes the idea of students being able to explore perhaps one selected region in the world, rather than taking a ‘once over lightly’, round the world approach. She doesn’t think that any one world culture, beyond Western art music, should be privileged above others, so does not think that indigenous American musics warrant a unique position in the curriculum.

I think that should be something on the table just as anything else. I do. I think that people have to have a lot of respect for that. But again, I think that I’m kind of one of those people that believes that we have to have respect for all of the cultures, not just one. Not western, not American-Indian, not Iranian, over anything else. I think that you know, we’re all people and we all have different histories and I think that it’s important to look at them all, and have respect for those.

Caroline does, however, believe that music educators have a responsibility to counter racism in their classrooms, and that implementing a programme that valued cultural diversity would be a good step in this direction. Caroline liked the idea, suggested during the interview, of carrying out entry interviews with her students in order to find out about their prior music knowledge and identities, so that she might better build on this, value it, and respond to it in her programme.

For Karen (Cleveland School A), her role as choral director, as she sees it, is to introduce the students to the key basic literature of classical choral music.

Well, one of the things is my love for music, you know that's been sort of the thing that never fails me. Everything can, but that doesn't. And for me I love the kids taking this music that's just black notes on the page and they breath this incredible life into it and you wouldn't expect kids that age to be able to even focus enough to do something like that. But they do, and many of them are bright...I really feel that, yeah, to give them their choral basic literature just like an English teacher gives the literature that's appropriate you know, for their learning, just like the art teacher teachers, you know, this is Da Vinci, this is, you know, I would be remiss if I didn't teach that literature.

Karen (Cleveland School A) also feels a responsibility to nurture those very able students whom she feels can miss out on the support that they need to reach their potential when other students with challenging behaviours and learning needs may be considered the priority for targetted help and resources. While Karen recognises that she is somewhat constrained by requirements to compete with expected repertoire in choir contests, she is enthusiastic about exploring some more culturally diverse repertoire and has found some resources to support this change to her usual practice.

TR

Is there anything that really you have a strong feeling you would like to do differently? Or do you feel you're on a roll with what you do?

Karen

Oh gosh! I'd like to incorporate more of the music from cultures outside of Western Europe and America.

TR

You would?

Karen

Yeah. And that's what I like about the Earth Songs, you know. And I do use that a lot. I was a little bit hesitant when it first came out and people were using it and I thought oh-my-gosh I don't think I'd be very good at that. But there's wonderful literature. Just really good literature. It's just as challenging and just as rewarding so that's not a regret, I've been moving in that direction for the last five to ten years and I want to continue to do that.

Karen has not, as yet, invited culture bearers from the community to provide expert support or demonstration. If indigenous musics were to be part of music education she is unsure at what level that would be appropriate. She doesn't feel confident at this time to teach diverse musics. Her teacher education has not supported her development in this area and she wishes there were more resources to support this.

For Bryan (Cleveland School B), a successful programme is all about standards. Students need to be trained to meet standards of excellence so that they can perform classical and jazz repertoire and perform in school musicals. Through careful training, the students will become disciplined with exemplary behavior, particularly in competitive settings. He also believes in teaching aspects of social history through music. This is demonstrated by his inclusion of such pieces as the *Holocaust Cantata* by Donald McCullough in his repertoire.

David (Cleveland School C) believes that the music programme is successful when it is seen as something for the top scholars in the school to pursue. His current school is located within an educated community that values the arts. The school supports the idea that the arts are a good academic choice. David thinks that one of the major reasons why the choral and orchestral ensembles, in particular, are as popular to a broad range of students as they are, is that they are seen to be popular and successful. *"I think nothing succeeds like success. I think when you have a programme going, students want to be part of it."* He thinks that the students as a whole love performing. *"They love being in front of an audience, they love that goal of learning a piece of music and then presenting it to the public."* David pointed out that although Cleveland schools have a state syllabus for

music, and national standards that serve as a guide, teachers have a great deal of autonomy and are able to build their own programmes in response to the particular strengths and interests of their school community. He sees a gap in his programme in the area of improvisation and composition, which is one of the National Standards. David believes in the use of culture bearers to provide expertise in, for example, African drumming. He values opportunities to introduce such diverse experiences to the students, although he acknowledges that the instrumental ensembles in the school are all traditional Western groups.

Key Themes

The following key themes emerged from the interviews with the American teachers and students. Where a theme has emerged from one or two interviews, this has been noted in brackets. All other themes represent the views of more than two participants.

The themes are grouped according to each research question and then discussed in an integrated way with reference to relevant literature. This integrated approach is necessary due to the linked nature of the questions and the correspondingly linked manner in which participants have reflected on the web of issues connected to each question.

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- All students need to be introduced to the Western classical canon.

- Including material relevant to cultural groups represented in the school population is important.
- Music education in high school in America is unlikely to give students an understanding of musical diversity (1 teacher).
- Most high school ensembles do not reflect the cultural diversity of the school communities.
- Mostly middle class, white students choose to be in music ensembles (1 teacher).
- It is good to choose some repertoire that includes stories that minority students can relate to (for example *West Side Story* or *Fiddler on the Roof*).
- It would be good to be able to teach in more culturally diverse, responsive and inclusive ways.

Question 1: In what ways is music education informed by or responsive to the cultural diversity of the student participants, or the wider community?

Key themes from student interviews:

- We value and enjoy the music education we are participating in.
- Music education in high schools is not responsive to or informed by student cultural identities or heritages (students from 3 out of 5 schools).
- The study or performance of non-Western musics could be included as extra-curricular activities.
- We talk about inherited musics with our friends and families.
- We are interested in the inherited musical knowledge of other students.

- Students should be able to investigate the musics of their ethnic/ cultural backgrounds at school (1 student).
- Music programme content should reflect the diversity of school populations.
- Students should learn that there are multiple music histories.
- Elementary school music education is responsive to cultural diversity. High school music education has different expectations and priorities.
- All music students should learn something about first American musics (1 student).
- Music programmes should be informed by and responsive to the cultural groups represented in the school community, but should also include the study and performance of musics from the wider world in order to broaden student understanding (1 student).

Question 2: What are the barriers to culturally responsive and inclusive music education?

Key themes from teacher interviews;

- Concern about personal preparedness and competence to teach diverse musics.
- Concern about the limiting nature of competition expectations that privilege particular repertoire.
- Competition judges know about and value Western repertoire.
- Lack of time to address cultural diversity in music education.
- Teacher education has not prepared teachers to teach non-Western musics.
- Schools lack the funding to offer ‘world’ music classes.

- Music and ensemble direction is stressful and time consuming enough without additional expectations.
- Programme is driven by performance schedules.
- Cost of private tuition and instrument hire excludes minority students.
- Lack of diversity in performance repertoire means lack of diversity in student participants.
- There are no barriers, except to the inclusion of indigenous musics which are overshadowed by other minority musics (1 teacher).

Question 2: What are the barriers to culturally responsive and informed music education?

Key themes from student interviews;

- Students had not considered the possibility of barriers due to contentment with and acceptance of music education as currently experienced (3 schools).
- Competition is a barrier to diversity.
- High School music is expected to be “serious” and “sophisticated” and Western classical repertoire is more suited to this image.
- Students from ‘minority’ groups may not be ‘serious’ or ‘motivated’ enough to engage with formal ‘in-school’ music education.
- Western music is ubiquitous.
- Teachers lack the knowledge needed to teach diverse musics.
- The curriculum is full.
- High School music is limited to the repertoire considered appropriate for particular performance ensembles.

- Majority position of white students means that Western musics are privileged.
- Minority students don't believe that school music education is for them.
- School music is insular. Teachers need to look beyond the local community (1 student).
- School music may be looked upon by minority students as “embarrassing” or “uncool”.
- There may be economic barriers that mean that minority students who are more likely to belong to lower socio-economic groups are excluded.

Question 3: What do teachers and students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Key themes from teacher interviews:

- Programmes should embrace cultural diversity more than they currently do.
- The parent community would support more diversity in music programmes.
- The support of culture bearers in the community would be easy to find.
- Music education in high school should be a positive experience that creates life-long music learners and participants.
- Indigenous musics should not hold a special position. No one ‘world’ culture should be privileged (1 teacher).
- Students should be introduced to the basic literature of Western classical choral and instrumental music.
- Talent should be nurtured.
- Standards of discipline and performance should be high (1 teacher).
- Aspects of social history should be taught through music.

- Music should be seen as a choice for top scholars (1 teacher).
- Teachers should have the autonomy to plan a programme that is relevant to and meets the expectations of the school community (1 teacher).

Question 3: What do teachers and students believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Key themes from student interviews:

- Programmes are largely successful as currently experienced.
- Music education would be enhanced by opportunities to learn a more culturally diverse range of musics.
- It would be good to have the opportunity to investigate the inherited musics of students in the class as well as other ‘world’ musics.
- The IB programme successfully allows for investigation of diverse musical cultures.
- Indigenous music should be included in American high school music programmes.
- There needs to be more time to teach the context of musics.
- Teachers should have high expectations and standards.
- It is good when teachers negotiate content with the students.

Discussion

Despite the acknowledgement of the philosophical ‘rightness’ of culturally responsive and inclusive music teaching, most of the teachers in this case believed that it was their primary responsibility to teach what they considered to be the basic Western classical

literature to their students. They also felt that this was what they were best equipped to do, and, in some cases, that they had been employed in their current position on the strength of a reputation for teaching Western choral or orchestral repertoire particularly well. This reputation, skill and knowledge allowed them to consistently lead their ensembles to victory in regional and national contests. All of the teachers acknowledged that the teacher education they had experienced had not prepared them to teach diverse musics, and had not facilitated the development of the characteristics of a culturally responsive teacher (Butler et al, 2007; Gay, 2000; Jorgensen, 2007; Richardson, 2007; Villegas and Lucas, 2002). This also reflects the ongoing influence of the personal biography of the teacher (Georgii-Hemmings, 2006). The teachers in this case were all white, middle class, and of an age where their memories of teacher education reflected an era where Western classical musics were privileged and ‘world’ music was not considered an important component. This also fits with findings from Legette (2003) who suggests that while more recently trained teachers may be benefiting from teacher education programmes that pay attention to cultural diversity in music education, teachers educated in earlier decades are experiencing barriers to shifts in practice, in particular the difficulty of major attitudinal change, and lack of resource knowledge beyond typical Western repertoire.

Most of the teachers in this case were consistent in their expressed belief that culturally responsive, inclusive music teaching was important. However, for some of them this was an aspirational view, rather than a reflection on current practice. For most of the schools, the participants in the music ensembles do not reflect the diversity of the schools as a whole, nor do the teachers typically select repertoire that reflects the diversity of the school community. The lack of diversity in repertoire may be one of the main reasons

why the participants in music ensembles in some schools are largely white, middle-class students. Teachers and students identified a variety of reasons for lack of student diversity in ensemble groups, including that in some the nature and perceived image of the ensembles do not appeal to students from ethnic minorities groups, they may perceive that they are not welcome, or take from the limited repertoire of the ensembles that diversity is not wanted, including diversity of participants. White students in one school suggested that black students may lack the motivation and discipline needed to be successful in the school choir. These views highlight the need for a more evolved discussion of color as an issue (Bradley, 2007, 2008) as some students and teachers clearly adhere to stereotyped views of 'black' behavior and activity preference. For one teacher, the idea that black students benefit from acquiring the behaviour, discipline, and attitude considered necessary for credibly performing classical music, suggests a mix of deficit theorizing and colonial thinking (Bishop & Glyn, 1999; Mansfield, 2002; Campbell, 1999) regarding improving the lot of the lower classes through the civilizing effect of Western music making.

While this view may have underpinned the thinking of this particular teacher, and others, it was also mixed with a great deal of pride at the achievement of the students, and the student perception was of being valued and included within a positive, joyful music making culture, led by a teacher who believed in their ability to achieve excellence in their performance. Taking a cultural studies approach to music education would give space for discussion about culture, but, as Dunbar-Hall (2005) points out, the resulting discussion regarding social justice can be very uncomfortable. However, the political nature of music and music education should not be ignored (Gorfinkel, 2010; Reimer, 2007). Bradley and

others call for the open discussion of whiteness (Bradley, 2007, 2008; Hambel, 2005). Teacher education seems to be the important context for this discussion to take place, allowing the examination of personally held attitudes and values, uncovering underlying biases and prejudiced assumptions about the lives others (Butler et al. 2007; Hunsberger, 2007; Jorgenson, 2007; Richardson, 2007). Economic factors were also identified as potential barriers to participation, and this is clearly an ongoing issue for music education (Spruce, 2001). However, one school in particular (Cleveland C) was active in its attempts to minimise economic barriers to music participation. This school also had the most diverse, student-negotiated repertoire and, as a result of this and other strategies, the ensembles in this school reflected greater student diversity than other schools. This school expressed the view that it is important for music students that they are able to perform material that they identify with from a cultural perspective.

The popularity, diversity and success of the ensembles are consistent with Gay (2000) and Richardson's (2007) views about strategies for raising achievement in culturally diverse education settings, in particular, the importance of allowing students to be active participants in curriculum decision making. Some teachers held the view that students are unlikely to gain an understanding about cultural and musical diversity within the current music education system because of the limitations of the performance-based structure as well as the pressure of competition expectations which is an ever present structural barrier to diversity in American high schools. One teacher, in particular, acknowledged that he felt that, given current barriers to diversity, it was unlikely that students in American high schools can gain an understanding of the multiple narratives of music history or

contemporary practice. This is consistent with views expressed by Pratt (2009), Williams (2007) and others.

From the students' perspective, it was clear that all of the students greatly enjoy their music education, and, in particular, the performance opportunities they are experiencing. The level of excellence in performance in the participant schools is a source of pride for students, teachers, and the wider school communities. This excellence reflects a high level of dedication, commitment and skill on behalf of the teachers.

In contrast to the experiences they have had in elementary school, for students from three out of the five schools, music education is not seen as responsive to, or informed by the cultural identities of the student community, nor is it underpinned by a multi-music history perspective. However, many students in their private music spaces (Stålhammer, 2000) talk about diverse musics, including those of their family backgrounds. Most of the students acknowledged and expressed interest in the multiple musical identities of their fellow students, although for one student, this would only be of interest if he could see it impacting usefully on his own musical development within the Western musical world that he was currently excelling in. Some students recommended that 'world musics' might be better explored as extra-curricular activities. This is consistent with the views of many of the Australian student participants, and appears to be underpinned by view that the investigation of non-Western musics is positioned left of centre and should be a choice for those interested rather than an integral part of music education programmes. One (Native American) student believed strongly that all students should learn about first American musics and acknowledge their unique position in the history of American musics,

however, for the other teachers and students this was an area that appeared to be very much in the 'too-hard basket'. The views of writers in the field of indigenous education, such as New Zealand researchers Bishop and Berryman (2006), are relevant here. Their identification of strategies for raising the achievement of indigenous students through the explicit inclusion of their values and ways of knowing in classroom programmes offers an opportunity for teachers to critically reflect on the cultural responsiveness of their programmes and to act, deliberately and explicitly, through their pedagogy and content, in non-racist, inclusive and culturally informed ways.

One student made the point that not only should students learn about musics belonging to their cultural backgrounds, and those of their fellow students, but that they should be stretched beyond the ethnicities represented in the local community. For all students, the idea that there are multiple music histories as well as multiple contemporary music expressions was one that they would like to have the opportunity to investigate. This investigation would benefit students both in terms of musicianship as they discover new sound worlds (Anderson & Campbell, 1996), but also social imagination, and appreciation of the socio-musical lives of others (Greene, 1995; Jorgenson, 2003).

For two teachers in particular it seemed that the perceived barriers to culturally responsive teaching are overwhelming, despite excellent intentions. Lack of confidence in diverse musics was a key issue, including lack of time to address knowledge gaps.

Implications

In 1991 Campbell looked forward to the development of a more holistic, comprehensive approach to music education. Similarly, Williams (2007) refers to the musicianship focus of the national standards as being an opportunity missed. In 2004, Reimer lamented the limited teaching of the national standards beyond the first two that focus on instrumental and singing performance²¹. At that time, he summarized the key barriers to a fully realised, comprehensive music education. He described the potential for a general music education that would immerse students in diverse musical experiences, opening musical doors and responding to their particular interests and musical identities.

General music explores all the ways people are musical and all the many musics they create, enabling students to share their own and others' musical cultures as informed, insightful citizens. In addition, such a program allows people to discover particular roles that appeal to their interests, intelligences, and creativities. Rather than constraining all students to being musically the same, as we tend to do now, a good general education in music will have the opposite effect - to encourage as much diversity of involvements as there are musical opportunities (Reimer, 2004, p. 35).

Certainly the current performance model is a limiting one, even though the participant schools were all achieving excellence in this important area, and the students identified the joy of making music with their friends as a key reason for participation in music at school, as did students in New Zealand and Australia. However, there is clearly a gap in the experience of music education that needs to be addressed in the interests of social justice and the expansion of understanding and appreciation for music as it is practised by diverse

²¹ The National Standards for Music Education were developed and published by MENC: the National Association for Music Education in 1994. They are voluntary. Standard 1 is "Singing, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music". Standard 2 is "Performing on instruments, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music". There are nine standards.

peoples and cultures. This requires, if not a major shake-up to ensure that the intent of the national standards is realized through a general musicianship programme as described by Reimer (2004), at least a more critical multicultural approach (Hambel, 2005). One of the key barriers to any shift is the pressure of competitions and the limitations of expected competition repertoire. Students expressed this as a key insight into the lack of diversity issue. Assuming the status quo is maintained, for programmes shaped around performance, it is repertoire, the way it is chosen, the way it is introduced and the critical discussion that may be generated in incidental, integrated ways that could help to address some of the gaps in student understanding regarding the multiple nature of musical expression and history.

Critical discussion, in combination with teachers taking opportunities to find out about the cultural knowledge and musical identities of the students, if only to ensure that the language they use to talk about music is inclusive rather than exclusive, is an important aspect of culturally responsive music teaching. The students interviewed during the American part of this research were curious and open regarding multicultural issues in music education. They want to know about the many musics of the world and they want to know about the multiple musical identities of the students who share their classroom. In their conversations with friends of different nationalities, they discuss music, and share their diverse musical experiences.

The teacher at Cleveland School C seems to be fostering a culturally responsive, inclusive and informed music learning environment most successfully. Bradley (2008) warns against the inclusion of non-Western music to add 'colour' to the school programme, but for

Cleveland Teacher C it was clear that the inclusion of non-Western repertoire was genuinely about a celebration of the richness to be found among diverse music materials and the enjoyment and challenge associated with preparing such material for performance. Negotiation and the valuing of student voice seem to be a central theme in this school, which enhanced the perception of cultural responsiveness from the student perspective.

Interestingly, the participant teachers did not see the parent community as a barrier to diversity. One, in particular, felt that parents would be completely supportive of a more diverse programme, and that culture bearers in the community would be helpful and enthusiastic about offering their expertise and support. The teachers also saw their local universities, where there are known 'world music' experts and advocates as places to go to for resources and advice. However, it seems that only a reduction in performance pressure would give teachers the space to explore the potential of their communities to support, and provide resources for more cultural diversity in music programmes.

Chapter 7 Conclusion

This concluding chapter ties together the themes of the three case studies, identifying commonalities and differences across the settings, considering implications and suggesting strategies to address some of the issues that are raised.

This research has focused on perceptions of experience, however, through interrogation of the participant's perceptions, insight has been gained into the lived, practical reality of music education in the three settings, against the background of philosophy, policy and curricula. By interviewing both teachers and students it has been possible to discover areas where there is a lack of alignment between teachers' expressed beliefs and intentions and students' experiences.

The three case studies share more commonalities than differences. For example, there is much in common between the state syllabus requirements for music education in New South Wales, and the national curriculum and NCEA requirements for music education in New Zealand high schools. However, there are some notable differences between the ways that music education is conceived, organised and delivered in the American school settings compared with the Australian and New Zealand settings. In each setting it is clear that the aims of education policies regarding cultural diversity and the inclusive goals expressed through curricula are rarely enacted in practice. There is much potential but little solid realisation of this potential.

The expert advisors who recommended the participant schools in each setting will be pleased to find that the students are enjoying competitive success as musicians and positive relationships with their teachers and peers. However, they may be disappointed in the finding that while the rhetoric of music teachers was inclusive in tone, the reality of teacher practice was in some instances exclusive and uncritical and that perceived barriers to cultural diversity were proving insurmountable for some.

One of the key commonalities evidenced across the three settings is that teachers largely expressed inclusive values and claimed that they believed cultural diversity to be a positive attribute of their education setting. Most teachers said that they do not believe that they teach music in a hierarchical manner, privileging Western ways of knowing above others. Most teachers believe that culturally inclusive, responsive messages are embedded in their philosophy and practice, and are therefore available to the students. However, despite the inclusive values expressed by the teachers, it is clear that many students ‘read’ their music education somewhat differently and are not necessarily picking up on these messages. Most students perceived music education to be prescribed, teacher and competition-driven, and not open to student-led negotiation with regard to content or pedagogical approach. Most students felt that some musics due to their perceived seriousness and sophistication were more likely candidates for school music study than others. However, it is important to note that all of the students expressed enjoyment of the versions of music education they are participating in, and largely feel included and valued by their teachers.

Cultural diversity is a significant characterizing feature of the four cities that provided the settings for the collective cases for this research. While some of the school populations were less ethnically diverse than others, all were situated within ethnically diverse communities. All of the participants had ideas about the relationships between culture, identity, music and education that they were happy to share. Some of these ideas were well developed, indicating prior reflection or guided discussion on these matters. Some were clearly gathering and developing their thoughts as they spoke. For these participants, my questions had been the catalyst for consideration of issues that had not previously been part of their classroom or social discourse. All of the students and teachers welcomed the discussion and responded positively and thoughtfully. However, it was clear that in the context of the music classroom, most had not been offered the opportunity to investigate issues related to cultural diversity and music education in any planned way, nor had they considered this to be a gap in the music education they were participating in as either teachers or learners.

The following key questions were investigated in this research. This section compares responses across the three settings.

Question 1: In what ways is music education, as experienced by the participants, informed by or responsive to cultural diversity?

New Zealand and Australian teachers highlighted the importance of connecting with their students. They aim to do this by providing programmes that are relevant to student strengths and interests as much as possible within the perceived constraints of syllabus requirements. These teachers also highlighted the importance of valuing students' prior

cultural knowledge, and endeavouring to connect with families/ whānau. Their comments were largely relationship focused, and were evidence of a view of music education as a vehicle for modeling, and explicitly teaching, positive social values, including cultural awareness and inclusion. However, based on the students' comments, these values may be, in reality, more implied than explicit, and overridden by assessment and performance requirements that privilege Western ways of making and knowing about music. There is clearly a tension between the rhetoric of inclusion espoused by teachers and long-held, hierarchical views that contribute to cultural hegemony in music classrooms. These views have been established during the life course of music educators, through their own experiences of music education, through teacher education, and further reinforced by the expectations of schools, assessment requirements, competitions and festivals.

The American teachers were similarly concerned with building positive relationships with their students, but their comments reflected the limiting reality of performance-based programmes. Response to cultural diversity was seen to be a challenging, but desirable goal. However, two of the American teachers deliberately select diverse choral repertoire, and this, along with other inclusive strategies and behaviours, gives a message, according to staff and student perception, of cultural responsiveness. However, as Bradley (2008) points out, choirs are a Western construct. She is critical of the conversion of diverse musics into choral repertoire suitable for the "school market" (p.8).

Most of the students across the three case studies were unable to identify ways that their music programmes were culturally responsive, inclusive or informed. Those that were able to were from Sydney School A, (where students had contributed to a 'fusion' music

ensemble), Cleveland School B, (where students felt that cultural diversity was valued) and Cleveland School C, (where students felt that their opinions, preferences, and ethnic identities were informing decisions about repertoire). Almost all students expressed interest in learning about and playing diverse musics, including the indigenous musics of their current home, and in finding out about the musical heritages and identities of their fellow students. The one student who expressed no interest was an American student excelling in his chosen genre of jazz instrumental playing. He was unable to see how the study of ‘world’ musics would be useful to him. Two New Zealand students were notable in their concern that the privileging of Western musics might discourage some students from participating in music education. Similarly, several American students noted the absence of students from minority cultural groups in instrumental and choral ensembles. Many students across the three case studies described the way that they share music from their ‘home’ culture in the context of friendship and community music making outside of the school setting. American students noted that elementary school music education was far more culturally diverse than their high school music education.

Question 2: What barriers to culturally responsive and inclusive music education are identified?

There was much in common between the three settings regarding perceived barriers. Teachers across the three settings identified imposed, structural barriers to culturally responsive teaching. For New Zealand and Australian teachers these were assessment requirements that privileged ways of knowing about, analyzing and representing music based on European art music. American teachers identified the limitations imposed by competition expectations and performance schedules. Time was a factor for all teachers, reflecting a general underpinning view that the teaching of ‘world’ musics is an additional

requirement, on top of the time-consuming core business of music education. Australian and American teachers identified a lack of confidence and competence in the teaching of non-Western musics as a barrier, and New Zealand teachers identified a lack of resources. Some teachers acknowledged that they knew there were resources available, including university staff expertise, and community resources such as culture bearers among the parent community, but did not feel they had the time, or in some cases the strategies, needed to access these. American and New Zealand teachers identified a lack of emphasis in their teacher education on the teaching of 'world' musics. Notably, the Australian teachers had experienced a university course dedicated to multicultural music, and this appeared to be a significant ongoing influence on their thinking, if not always on their practice. New Zealand and American teachers identified reasons why the ethnic mix of their music classes or ensembles did not, in some cases, reflect the ethnic mix of the school population. In New Zealand, teachers felt that some Māori, Pasifika or Indian parents do not view music as a serious subject leading to a professional career path.

American teachers identified the cost of instrument hire and uniforms, as well the limited repertoire of some ensembles as potential barriers to participation for minority students. One teacher (Cleveland School C) did not identify any barriers, reflecting his perception of the overall success of the music ensembles in the school, and the successful response to cultural diversity from the music faculty.

A common theme across the three settings was the student belief that the curriculum is full. This suggests that student understanding of the content of their schooling is that it has been imposed upon teachers, is documented and compulsory, and is not flexible or

negotiable. This view reflects the enculturation that occurs as a result of the experience of schooling and suggests that some students may believe that their voice, opinion, interests and preferences are not relevant, and, even if voiced, are unlikely to have an impact on the direction of their learning. It occurs to me that in the context of, in particular, the New Zealand setting where the NCEA qualification allows a great deal of choice, flexibility, and tailoring to the particular skills and interests of individual students, that it would be good to highlight to the students the ways that they may take ownership of their learning while still meeting assessment requirements, emphasizing the flexibility and student-centred nature of the NCEA qualification. This is more challenging in the American setting, given the limitations of the performance-based approach as currently practised, however, the music faculty of Cleveland School C was successfully promoting student agency, negotiation and compromise in ways that appeared to place student interests in a central position while still keeping a keen eye on the achievement of competitive excellence that is so much part of the culture of music education in American schools.

Like their teachers, American students identified competitions as a barrier to culturally diverse and responsive music education. They perceived that judges expect particular repertoire. They also saw the limited nature of performance ensembles offered in high schools as a barrier. American students were concerned that their teachers would lack the knowledge to teach diverse musics. They had noticed that their choirs and instrumental groups in many cases do not reflect the diversity of the wider school populations. Some attributed this to minority students, specifically, African American students, not believing that the specific approach to music education on offer was 'for them' either because they could not relate to the repertoire, which they believe appeals more to the white majority,

or because they lacked the motivation and application needed to succeed in these competitive groups. Some felt that economic barriers may prevent participation of minority students who are likely to come from lower socio-economic status families. This issue warrants further exploration. Further research is needed regarding why some students may feel excluded from school music education and choose not to participate despite musical interest and active community music participation. Cultural stereotypes and prejudiced attitudes were evident in some participant comments. The impact of such attitudes may present barriers for some students. This is an important area for further study. Consideration of the perspectives of non-participants has been beyond the scope of this research.

Question 3: What do students and teachers believe about content and pedagogy within a successful music programme?

Australian and New Zealand teachers highlighted the importance of engaging learners through relevant content and varied, stimulating pedagogical approaches. Australian teachers are required to teach the ‘elements’ of music and endeavour to do this in integrated and meaningful ways using diverse musical examples. However, Sydney Teacher C questioned the validity of applying such categories of analysis to all musics, stating that he felt that this worked against cultural diversity in music education. Like New Zealand teachers, they also teach one-off ‘world’ music topics. On the whole, teachers believe that this topic-based approach gives a useful ‘taste’ of non-Western musics, but many would like to have more time to take an in-depth approach. Most teachers in New Zealand and Australia believe that their programmes do not reflect a hierarchical approach and that they do not give students the impression that some musics

are more valid for study or performance than others. However, this belief is not supported by findings from student interviews. New Zealand teachers emphasized the importance of building positive relationships with students, providing opportunities for younger and older students to work together, and creating an encouraging environment where students can follow their interests, express themselves musically, and become life-long music participants.

With regard to indigenous musics, these are compulsory components of music programmes in both New Zealand and Australia. However, two of the three Australian teachers believe that it is difficult to engage students with indigenous musics and they find this a challenging area to teach. American teachers had a variety of views on the place of indigenous musics within music education. David felt that there was potential for inclusion, but had not investigated this possibility. Caroline did not believe that indigenous musics hold a special place or should be privileged over others, and Karen was unsure about what level they should be included, if at all. For Peter, the inclusion of indigenous musics was considered too challenging given the pressures of his current position.

The American teachers, on the whole, believe that their role is to nurture talent and teach the basic literature of the Western European classical canon. However, all of the American teachers felt that it would be good to include more diverse musics in the repertoire for their particular ensembles. Interestingly, they all felt confident that their parent communities would support this. New Zealand and Australian students participate in broad programmes aimed at developing their musicianship in a variety of key areas. All of

these students expressed the belief that a successful programme is one that includes performance, theory, history and composition. This reflects the experience of the students and the fact that they are generally very positive about the nature of the programmes they participate in. Many of the students believed that Western Classical music was a vital component as it is the vehicle for learning theory. Most students in New Zealand and Australia equate both music theory and music history with the conventions and ‘great’ composers of Europe. To be musically educated involves having a working knowledge of music theory, including being able to read and write music using conventional notation. Most students also felt that their teachers needed to be classically trained to be effective music teachers.

Many New Zealand and Australian students also believed that ‘world’ or ‘cultural’ musics were best experienced out of the school setting, and were best left up to student choice. This also suggests a view that some musics are more serious than others and therefore more suited to formal music education. According to many students, Western classical music is serious and has ‘history’ and ‘rules’ that make it suitable for academic study. Several students in New Zealand and Australia understood Western classical music to be the beginning point of music history as it might be studied in the classroom setting. Some New Zealand students felt that a successful programme must include Māori and Pacific musics, and all of the New Zealand students felt that more diversity of music content would be a positive shift that would be interesting for them as music learners. Australian and American students would also like more diversity of music content, and American students would like the opportunity to find out more about the musical heritages and identities of their peers. Most students said they would value the opportunity to learn

about indigenous musics. American students who had had the opportunity to participate in IB classes enjoyed the ethnomusicological approach and content. All students across the three settings believe that the social and cultural context of musics should be taught. However, teachers commented on the challenge of integrating contextual information without losing student interest (Schippers , 2010).

With the notable exception of students at Cleveland School C, many students felt that there needed to be more opportunity for student voice, choice, negotiation about and evaluation of their teachers and programmes.

Reflection and Recommendations

What teachers may feel is implicit in their teaching due to the values that are underpinning their practice clearly needs to be made explicit, so that students are able to receive and reflect on clear messages about cultural diversity in music education. It is very much a case of actions speaking louder than words. Teachers may think one thing, but the organisational structures they work within, pedagogical decisions they make, and the language they use to talk about music, give conflicting and confusing messages. In particular, the realities of assessment requirements, the demands of competitions, the limiting structure of performance-based programmes, are all examples of ‘actions’ that speak very loudly, drowning out more inclusive messages. A vital component of effective teaching practice is the ability to reflect critically on one’s teaching, evaluating the appropriateness and relevance of content and teaching methods. Music education must be socially just in its conception and provision and music teachers need to ask themselves critical questions about their practice from the perspective of cultural diversity. What are

the underpinning messages of the music programme? What does it say about what is important and valid musical knowledge? Do I model openness to multiple musical expression and different ways of knowing about music? Is there a gap between the inclusive attitudes that I hold, and the reality of my actions and practices?

Throughout the interviews I was struck by the readiness of the students and most of the teachers to engage in a more critical discussion about music content and pedagogy. One way to create an environment where such discussion might become a natural and integrated aspect of the programme is to increase opportunity for students' voices to be heard, ensuring that teachers know their students in more holistic, personal ways than some currently do. This could happen through entry interviews or surveys allowing teachers to find out who their students are musically, what cultural knowledge they might bring to the classroom that they would be willing to share, what different musical identities they have or are in the process of developing, what their goals and aspirations are, how they see the nature of musicianship, what they expect from music education, what their present understandings about music literacy and history are. As Kalantzis and Cope suggest below, our pedagogical approaches must provide opportunities for teachers to know their students and allow for, and be informed by student diversity and complexity.

We need a pedagogy that is holistic, flexible and complex, that will allow children to present their multiplicities and complexities and their individual and collective diversities rather than a pedagogy that perpetuates teacher images (Kalantzis and Cope, 1999, p. 270).

Classrooms need to be places where children and young people can express and construct their multiple identities, rather than being shaped, constrained and misinformed by limited

views of what it means to be musical, what it means to be a musician, and what constitutes the musical world. In this way music classrooms will reflect the reality of the culturally diverse communities in which schools are located, celebrating the multiple musical identities that young people bring to the classroom, and the sound worlds that they inhabit outside of the classroom, while allowing room for new identities to grow.

For this to happen the relationship between identity development and discourse must be acknowledged. If the discourse of the music classroom is limited and exclusive, so the students will be ill-equipped to be musical citizens of a culturally diverse world, and sadly so will be the future music teacher. However, through guided discussion and debate the music classroom conversation can be enriched to be a more critically reflective, open one. Such debate requires the critically multicultural pedagogies described by Bradley (2008) and Hambel (2005). Teachers who teach from a culturally relevant, critical perspective are continuously aware of their students as “a unique group of learners who bring different discourses into contact with the culture of schooling” (Hambel, 2005, p. 69).

The inclusion of student experiences and the valuing of diverse musical expressions, particularly when experts may be present in the classroom and immediate school community, are vital components of culturally diverse music education. In describing the culturally responsive teaching that validates students’ lived experiences, Gay comments that culturally responsive teaching must “build bridges of meaningfulness between home and school experiences as well as between academic abstractions and lived sociocultural experiences” (p. 29). Gorfinkel promotes an integrated approach where the cultural and political aspects of all musics are discussed throughout, rather than only within specialized

“other music” topics (p. 45). She asserts that “every instant of musical creation and teaching, every note and rhythm, and the way these are talked about, is cultural and political” (p. 46).

The place of indigenous musics in school programmes was a recurring theme in student and teacher interviews across the three settings. It is important to consider the responsibility of music educators towards indigenous musics. Even in countries where there is no treaty ensuring that education policy acknowledges the unique position of the indigenous peoples, it seems that awareness of the first or early musics of the country where one lives is an important starting point. This needs to be an integral part of music education that is open to and curious about the diverse musics of the school community, and the wider world. However, if teachers take on board the suggestion from Schippers, Campbell et al, that rather than “doing” Aboriginal, or Māori, or Native American Indian music as a topic, teachers explored through concepts, such as lullabies or protest songs, songs of welcome, music that feature drones or ostinati, in ways that include the unique musics that are the cultural treasures of each country, it is possible to escape the burden of compulsion or political correctness, that seems to be off-putting to some teachers and students. The approach to context can be thought of similarly. Teachers need to learn to tell a good story, and celebrate the reality of the multiple narratives of musical history and its living musical traditions in ways that engage learners. All of the students said that they like to know about the people and context around the music, but through livelier tools and resources than a map.

The interest shown by the participants, and the advocacy for culturally responsive approaches to music education found throughout the literature in this field, does not equate with the rejection of Western European classical music in education. As Nieto (2000) states, education underpinned by critical multiculturalism is not about simply “substituting one truth for another” (p. 317). Culturally responsive classrooms, underpinned by a critical pedagogical approach, value multiple narratives and perspectives in order to better understand the social world. As Schippers comments, the goal of those working to promote cultural diversity in music education is to enhance and strengthen music education practices in ways that reflect the diversity of music learners and the communities they live in.

Learning and teaching strategies from other cultures (often with demonstrably successful histories stretching back for centuries) question preconceptions about learning and teaching music in Western mainstream traditions and institutions as well. This is not a threat to the status quo but an inspiration to evaluate and improve educational practices. The West now has the opportunity to come full circle in its interactions with other music cultures, from knowing only one culture, to exploration, to domination, to exoticism, to tolerance, to acceptance, to inclusion in a new and diverse reality (Schippers, 2010, p. xv111).

Nor is a prescription the answer. While it is helpful for teachers to have direction from curriculum documents, printed and on-line resources, a one-size-fits-all approach is not the answer. As British researcher Stephanie Pitts (2002) states,

Relying on a published scheme of work is an approach with some practical merits, but there is a danger that the acceptance of someone else’s thinking on music teaching will prevent the development of new ideas and limit the spontaneity enthusiasm that has always contributed to best practice in music education (p. 34)

Similarly, rather than calling for a prescriptive approach, Campbell emphasizes the need for creative, inspired teachers who are able to engage diverse learners with diverse musics.

Deep listening to musical expressions, and the participatory experiences that allow musicking to occur between and among people, requires inventive teachers with the ideas and enthusiasm for facilitating the connection between music and the individuals who comprise their classes (2004, p. 3).

Excellent professional development to supply ideas, motivation, enthusiasm and impetus, along with teacher education that embraces critical, transcultural approaches to cultural diversity is vital. As Schippers (2010) states: “It is not the music teachers of the world who are to blame; the main weaknesses lie in teacher training (p.107).

One great advantage that American students have over students in New Zealand and in some states in Australia, is the presence of specialist music teachers in many elementary and middle schools. In 2008, while gathering data in Seattle, I had the good fortune to be invited to attend a professional development day for elementary teachers at the University of Washington, convened by Professor Patricia Campbell. The joy, understanding and openness of these teachers and, in particular, their critical interest in the teaching of ‘world’ musics, was palpable. I felt very happy for the students of such skilled and enthusiastic teachers. Credit must go certainly to Patricia Campbell who has fostered this in her district and more widely, and whose ability to communicate with teachers through the dissemination of resources, research findings, and the leadership of professional development workshops has inspired teachers, fostering their curiosity about diverse musics, and giving them the confidence to try something new.

The aspect of teaching that all of the teachers involved in this research were most successful with is the building and nurturing of positive relationships with students. These teachers are very positive people. They articulate a strong ethic of care towards their students. Caroline (US) wants her students to feel loved. Elizabeth (NZ) loves her students and loves her job. These attitudes are the cornerstone of successful teaching and a great foundation for a culturally responsive pedagogy. Culturally responsive teachers care about their students. They want them to succeed within an environment that values who they are and the complexity each individual brings to the classroom.

The following recommendations have emerged from this research. They draw on some key ideas from relevant literature, but most importantly, they reflect the unique and valuable contributions of the students and teachers who participated in this research. They offer some ways forward to make deeper connections between intention and reality in music education practice that is responsive to cultural diversity.

- Engage students critically with music content and pedagogy, not in a way that detracts from the pleasure of listening and performance, but in a way that makes space for debate and establishes a critical tone. However, this needs to start with teachers critically engaging with the literature on cultural diversity in music education, using this to frame their evaluation of the effectiveness and relevance of their content and pedagogy. This kind of informed critical reflection will help them to initiate and facilitate useful, reflective discussion in the music classroom.

- If the syllabus requires the teaching of music elements, use diverse music examples (as some Australian teachers do) and underpin this with targeted, critical discussion about the choice of language, and the relevance of such categories of analysis for different musics.
- Make the time to seek expertise and involvement from culture bearers, bearing in mind the challenges, in the local community, as well as university music departments. Make use of the good will from parents. It is likely that they will support teacher's efforts to expand the musical horizons of the students and the wider school community.
- Encourage fusion music opportunities, as described by Anna (Sydney School A). This approach fits within the "intercultural" approach described by Schippers (2010, p. 30) and is a realistic goal until the time comes when teacher training, curriculum design, teacher practice align in such a way that would foster "transcultural" music education.
- When students are involved in extra-curricular groups, such as Sasa or Kapahaka, show that you value this as evidence of musicianship, as Elizabeth (Auckland School A) does.
- Be careful with value laden, exclusive language, such as "other", "different", "extra". (Thompson, 2002). Think carefully about references to music history, or the 'great' composers. Be deliberate and explicit when addressing cultural diversity. Do not assume that students will 'get the message'.
- Try a thematic approach. Rather than feeling overwhelmed by the "how" and "what" of teaching aspects of a particular musical culture, try exploring themes, concepts, and conventions that are common across musical cultures,

but differently expressed such as ‘Music and Love’ or ‘Music and Protest’ (See Schippers, 2010, pp. 175-179, or Campbell, 2004).

- Teacher education programmes need to embed cultural diversity and social justice within their music education programmes, equipping new teachers to teach music in culturally informed, responsive and inclusive ways. The multicultural music education programme offered at the Sydney Conservatorium provides a model that could be replicated elsewhere. Ongoing professional development for music teachers is also essential.

It is important to celebrate excellence in music making that has been nurtured by current pedagogical approaches, but to also advocate for the changes that makes sense in culturally diverse communities. Music educators need to use curriculum statements, syllabus requirements, or national standards to their potential, and also to challenge these where necessary. The possibilities and flexibility are there if teachers choose to interpret the requirements in ways that embrace cultural diversity. With curiosity and openness, rich programmes that are informed by and responsive to the ways that people make music locally and globally are possible. Existing programmes can be strengthened and expanded by using more critical, socially-just approaches, without losing the fun, the opportunities to nurture talent, or the joyful purpose that is at the heart of music education.

Bibliography

- Abrahams, F. (2004). The application of critical theory to a sixth grade general music class. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, (4).
- Abrahams, F. (2005). The application of critical pedagogy to music teaching and learning. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, (6)
- Abril, C. (2006). Music that represents culture: selecting music with integrity. *Music Educators Journal*, 93(1) 38-45.
- Abril, C. (2008). *Traversing unfamiliar waters in secondary instrumental music*. Paper presented at the Ninth International Conference of Cultural Diversity in Music Education, Seattle, WA.
- Alton-Lee, A. (2003). *Quality teaching for diverse students: best evidence synthesis*. Wellington, New Zealand: Ministry of Education.
- Anderson, W.M. & Campbell, P. S. (1996). Teaching music from a multicultural perspective. In W.M. Anderson and P.S. Campbell (Eds). *Multicultural perspectives in music education*. Reston, Virginia: Music Educators National Conference.
- Banks, J. (1989). Multicultural education: characteristics and goals. In J. Banks and C. Banks (Eds). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (2003). *Handbook of research on multicultural education* (2nd ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Barton, G. (2005). Creating a balance: Investigating a new model for music teaching and learning in the Australian context. In P. S. Campbell, J. Drummond, P. Dunbar-Hall, K. Howard, H. Schippers, T. Wiggins. pp. 95-102. *Cultural diversity in music education: Directions and challenges for the 21st century*. Brisbane, Australia: Australian Academic Press.
- Baxter, M. (2007). Global music making a difference: themes of exploration, action and justice. *Music Education Research* 9 (2) 267-279
- Benhabib, S. (2002). *The claims of culture. Equality and diversity in the global era*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Benham, S. (2003). Being the other: adapting to life in a culturally diverse classroom. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 13 (1) 21-33

- Bennett, A. (2004). Consolidating the music scenes perspective, *Poetics* 32(3-4) 223-234.
- Berg, B. (2004). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Boston: Pearson.
- Bishop, R. (2001) Changing power relations in education: Kaupapa Māori messages for mainstream institutions. In C. McGee & D. Fraser (Eds). *Professional practices of teachers*. Palmerston North: Dunmore Press. 201-220
- Bishop, R. & Berryman, M. (2006) *Culture speaks: Cultural relationships and classroom learning*. Wellington: Huia Publishers
- Bishop, R. & Glyn, T. (1999). *Culture counts: Changing power relations in education*. Palmerston North. New Zealand: Dunmore Press.
- Bogdan, R. & Biklen, S. (2003). *Qualitative research for education. An introduction to theories and methods*. Boston: Pearson Education Group.
- Bohlman, P. (2002). *World music. A very short introduction*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bos, P. v. d. (1995). *Differences between western and non-western teaching methods in music education. How can both methods supplement each other?* Teaching Musics of the World International Symposium Proceedings, pp. 169-179. Basel, Switzerland.
- Bradley, D. (2006) Music Education, multiculturalism, and anti-racism: Can we talk? *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, 5 (2) 2-30.
- Bradley, D. (2007). The sounds of silence: Talking race in music education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, 6 (4) 132-163.
- Bradley, D. (2008). *Global song, global citizens? "The world" in world choral music publications*. A paper presented at The Ninth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education, Seattle, WA.
- Bradley, M. & Power, A. (2010). *High school students engaged by programs of NSW Indigenous music*. A paper presented at The Tenth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education, Sydney, Australia.
- Burnard, P. (2007). Telling half the story: Making explicit the significance of methods and methodologies in music education research. *Music Education Research*, 8 (2) 143-152.
- Burnard, P., Dillon, S., Rusinek, G., & Saether, E. (2008). Inclusive pedagogies in music education: A comparative study of music teachers' perspectives from four countries. *International Journal of Music Education*, 26 (2).

- Butler, A., Lind, V., & McKoy, C. (2007). Equity and access in music education; Conceptualizing culture as barriers to and supports for music learning. *Music Education Research*, 9(2) 241-253.
- Campbell, P. S. (1991). *Lessons from the world. A cross-cultural guide to music teaching and learning*. New York: Schirmer Books.
- Campbell, P. S. (1997). Music, the universal language: fact or fallacy? *International Journal of Music Education*, (29) 32-39.
- Campbell, P. S. (2001). Heritage: The survival of cultural traditions in a changing world. *International Journal of Music Education*, (37) 59-63.
- Campbell, P. S. (2004). *Teaching music globally. Experiencing music, expressing culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Campbell, P. S. (2010). *Songs in the heads. Music and its meaning in children's lives*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Christensen, L. (1993). *Interdisciplinary perspectives in the teaching of world music*. Teaching Musics of the World Second International Symposium Conference Proceedings, Basel, Switzerland.
- Clements, A. (2006). Across cultural boundaries: Sharing cultural knowledge through music with the use of cultural bearers. *Journal of Research in New Zealand Performing Arts*, (1).
- Cook-Sather, A. (2002). Authorizing students' perspectives: Towards trust, dialogue, and change in education. *Educational Researcher*, 31 (4) 3-14
- Damm, R. J. (2006). Education through collaboration: Learning the arts while celebrating culture. *Music Educators Journal*, 93(2) 54-58.
- Dillon, S. (2006). Assessing the positive influence of music activities in community development programs. *Music Education Research* 8(2) 267-280.
- Drummond, J. (2005). Cultural diversity in music education: Why bother? In P. S. Campbell, J. Drummond, P. Dunbar-Hall, K. Howard, H. Schippers, T. Wiggins. pp. 1-12. *Cultural diversity in music education: directions and challenges for the 21st century*. Brisbane, Australia: Australian Academic Press.
- Drummond, J. (2008). *The music formerly known as classical: What place should it have in culturally diverse music education?* A paper presented at The Ninth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education, Seattle, WA.
- Dunbar-Hall, P. (2000). Concept or context? Teaching and learning Balinese gamelan and

- the universalist-pluralist debate. *Music Education Research*, 2(2) 127-139.
- Dunbar-Hall, P. (2002). Designing a teaching model for popular music. In G. Spruce (Ed) *Aspects of teaching secondary music. Perspectives on practice*. London. RoutledgeFalmer
- Dunbar-Hall, P. & Beston, P. (2003). Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander musics in Australian music education: Findings of a national survey. In R. Smith (Ed). *Over the top; proceedings of the XIV National Conference of the Australian Society for Music Education* Darwin: Australian Society for Music Education, 2003, 37-42
- Dunbar-Hall, P. & McKinlay, E. (2003). Historical and dialectical perspectives on the teaching of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander music in Australian education system. *Australian Journal of Indigenous Education*, 32, 290-40
- Dunbar-Hall, P. (2005). Colliding perspectives? Music curriculum as cultural studies. *Music Educators Journal*, 91 (33) 33-37.
- Dunbar-Hall, P. & Wemys, K. (2000). The effects of the study of popular music on music education. *International Society of Music Education*, (36) 23-34.
- Dura, M. (2006). Music, education, and multiculturalism: foundations and principles. *Music Educators Journal* 93(1) 18-18.
- Durrant, C. (2001). The genesis of musical behavior: Implications for adolescent music education. *International Journal of Education and the Arts*. 2 (5). 1-12.
- Eisner, E. (1998). *The enlightened eye. Qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice*. London: Prentice-Hall.
- Elliott, D. (1989). Key concepts in multicultural music education. *The International Journal of Music Education* (13) 11-18.
- Elliott, D. (1995). *Music matters: a new philosophy of music education*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Elliott, D. (1996). Consciousness, culture and curriculum. *The International Society for Music Education*, (28) 1-15.
- Fehr, R. C. (2006). Keeping track. *Music Educators Journal*, 93(1) 11-11.
- Fa, afoi, A., Fletcher, J., Parkhill, F., O'Regan, B., Taleni, L. (2009). Pasifika students: Teachers and parents voice their perceptions of what provides supports and barriers to Pasifika students' achievement in literacy and learning. *Teaching and Teacher Education*. 25 (1) 24-33
- Folkestad, G. (2005). The local and the global in musical learning: Considering the

- interaction between formal and informal settings. In P. S. Campbell, J. Drummond, P. Dunbar-Hall, K. Howard, H. Schippers, T. Wiggins. pp. 1-12. *Cultural diversity in music education: directions and challenges for the 21st century*. Brisbane, Australia: Australian Academic Press.
- Gay, G. (2000) *Culturally responsive teaching. Theory, research, and practice*. New York: Teachers College Press
- Georgii-Hemming, E. (2006). Personal experiences and professional strategies. *Music Education Research*, 8 (2) 217-236.
- Goldsworthy, D. (1997). Teaching gamelan in Australia: Some perspectives on cross-cultural education. *International Journal of Music Education* (30) 3-14.
- Gorfinkel, L. (2010). *Pushing the boundaries of 'music': Cross-cultural and cross-disciplinary possibilities for 'other' musics in the Australian music classroom*. Paper presented at the Tenth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education. Sydney, Australia.
- Gould, E. (2007). Social justice in music education: The problematic of democracy. *Music Education Research*, 9 (2) 229-240.
- Green, L. (2001a). Music in society and education. In C. Philpott and C. Plummeridge. (Eds) *Issues in music teaching*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Green, L. (2001b). *How popular musicians learn. A way ahead for music education*. England: Grover House Publishing Limited.
- Green, L. (2002a). Research in the sociology of music education. Some introductory concepts. In G. Spruce (Ed) *Aspects of teaching secondary music. Perspectives on practice*. London: RoutledgeFalmer
- Green, L. (2002b). From the western classics to the world: Secondary music teachers' changing attitudes in England, 1982 and 1998. *British Journal of Music Education*, 19 (1) 5-30.
- Greene, M. (1995). *Releasing the Imagination. Essays on Education, the Arts, and Social Change*. San Francisco, Jossey-Bass Inc.
- Guba, E. (1990). The alternative paradigm dialog. In E. Guba (Ed) *The paradigm dialog*. pp. 17-27. London: Sage Publications.
- Hallam, S. (2001). Learning in music: Complexity and diversity. In C. Philpott & C. Plummeridge (Eds.), *Issues in music education* (pp. 61-75). London: Routledge Falmer.
- Hambel, S. (2005). *Critical multicultural education: Beyond the constraints of policy*. In I.

- Milojevic and J. Yamanashi (Eds). *Researching identity, diversity and education: surpassing the norm*. Brisbane: Post Pressed.
- Hargreaves, D., Lamont, A., Marshall, N., & Tarrant, M. (2003). Young people's music in and out of school. *British Journal of Music Education*, 20 (3) 229-241.
- Hargreaves, D. & Marshall, N. (2003). Developing Identities in Music education. *Music Education Research*, 5 (3) 263-273.
- Hargreaves, D., Marshall, N., Purves, R., & Welch, G. (2007). Developing identities and attitudes in musicians and classroom music teachers. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, (77) 665-682.
- Harland, J., Kinder, K., Lord, P., Stott, A., Shagen, I., Haynes, J., with Cusgrove, L., White, R., & Paola, R. (2000). *Arts education in secondary schools: Effects and effectiveness*. Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research.
- Henderson, C. (1998). Cultural influence and self-perception of musical ability. *Sound Ideas*, 2 (1).
- Henderson, C. (2003) *Educational Inclusiveness and the Gifted and Talented Music Student*.
A paper presented at the World Gifted Conference, Adelaide, Australia.
- Ho, W. & Law, W. (2006). Students' music experiences, society and culture: Music education in Shanghai, China. *Music Education Research*, 8 (1) 47-64.
- Holstein, J. and G. Jaber (2004). The active interview. In D. Silverman (Ed). *Qualitative research. Theory, method and practice*. London, Sage Publications.
- Hookey, M. (1994). Culturally responsive music education. Implications for curriculum development and implementation. In H. Lees (Ed). *Musical connections: tradition and change*. pp. 84- 90. Proceedings of the 21st World Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Tampa, Florida
- Hunsberger, P. (2007) "Where am I?" A call for "connectedness" in literacy. *Reading Research Quarterly* 42 (3) 420-525
- Janesick, V. (2004). *"Stretching" Exercises for Qualitative Researchers*. Thousand Oaks, Sage Publications.
- Johnson, S. (2000). Authenticity: Who needs it? *British Journal of Music Education* 17(3) 277-286.
- Johnson, H. (2005). Dancing with lions: (Per)forming Chinese cultural identity at a New Zealand secondary school. *New Zealand Journal of Asian Studies*, 7 (2) 171-186.

- Jorgensen, E. (2003). *Transforming music education*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press
- Jorgensen, E. (2007). Concerning justice and music education. *Music Education Research*, 9 (2) 169-189.
- Kalantzis, M. & Cope, B. (1999). Multicultural education: Transforming the mainstream. In S. May (Ed.), *Critical multiculturalism: Rethinking multicultural and antiracist education* (pp. 245-276). London: Falmer Press.
- Kelly, S. & Van Weelden, K. (2004). Connecting meaningful music and experiences in a multicultural, multimusical classroom. *Music Educators Journal*, 90 (3) 35-39.
- Kincheloe, J. and P. McLaren (2003). Rethinking critical theory and qualitative research. In N. Denzin and Y. Lincoln (Eds). *The landscape of qualitative research. Theories and issues*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 433-488.
- Klinger, R. (1994). Multiculturalism in music education: Authenticity versus practicality. In H. Lees (Ed). *Musical connections: tradition and change*. pp. 91-103. Proceedings of the 21st World Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Tampa, Florida
- Koskoff, E. (2006) (Ed) *Music cultures in the United States. An introduction*. New York: RoutledgeFalmer
- Kramer, J. & Arnold, A. (2010). *MUS 00 "Understanding music": A culturally diverse curriculum for general students*. A paper presented at the Tenth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education.
- Kvale, S. (1996). *InterViews: An introduction to qualitative research interviewing*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Kwami, R. (1998). Non-western musics in education: problems and possibilities. *British Journal of Music Education*, 15 (2) 161-170.
- Kwami, R. (2001). Music in and for a pluralist society. In C. Philpott and C. Plummeridge (Eds) *Issues in Music Teaching*. London: Routledge Falmer, 142-155.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1995a). But that's just good teaching! The case for culturally relevant pedagogy. *Theory into Practice*, 34(3), 159-165.
- Ladson- Billings, G. (1995b). Towards a theory of culturally relevant pedagogy. *Journal of American Education Research*, 32 (3) 465-491.
- Legette, R. (2003). Multicultural music education: attitudes, values, and practices of public school. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 13 (1) 51-59.

- Letts, R. (1997). Music: universal language between all nations? *International Journal of Music Education*, (29) 22-31.
- Leung, C. C. (2004). Curriculum and culture: a model for content selection and teaching approaches in music. *British Journal of Music Education*, 21 (1) 25-39.
- Macfarlane, A. (2004). *Kia hiwa ra! Listen to culture- Māori students' plea to educators*. Wellington: New Zealand Council for Educational Research.
- Mansfield, J. (2002). Differencing music education. *British Journal of Music Education*, 19 (2) 189-202.
- Marsh, K. (2005) Going behind the doors: The role of fieldwork in changing tertiary students' attitudes to world music education. In P. S. Campbell, J. Drummond, P. Dunbar-Hall, K. Howard, H. Schippers, T. Wiggins. pp. 37-48. *Cultural diversity in music education: directions and challenges for the 21st century*. Brisbane, Australia: Australian Academic Press.
- Maykut, P. and Morehouse, R. (1994). *Beginning qualitative research. A philosophic and practical guide*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.
- McCarthy, M. (1997). The role of ISME in the promotion of multicultural music education, 1953-96. *International Journal of Music Education*, (29) 81-83.
- Mertz, M. (1998). Some thoughts on music education in a global culture. *International Journal of Music Education* (32) 72-76.
- Ministry of Education. (2000). *The arts in the New Zealand curriculum*. Wellington, New Zealand: Learning Media.
- Ministry of Education. (2009). *The Pasifika education plan*. Wellington. New Zealand: Ministry of Education.
- Ministry of Education. (2007). *The New Zealand curriculum*. Wellington, New Zealand; Ministry of Education.
- Mixon, K. (2009). *Engaging and educating students with culturally responsive performing ensembles*. *Music Educators Journal*, 95 (4) 66-75.
- New South Wales Department of Education (1983). *Multicultural education policy statement*
- Nieto, S. (2000). *Affirming diversity The sociological context of multicultural education*. New York: Longman.
- North, A., Hargreaves, D.J. & O'Neill, S. (2000). The importance of music to adolescents. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 70, 255-72

- O'Flynn, J. (2005). Re-appraising ideas of musicality in intercultural contexts of music education. *International Journal of Music Education*, (23) 191-203.
- O'Neill, S., Solboda, J., Boulton, M., & Ryan, K. (2002). Young people and music participation project: practitioner report and summary of findings. University of Keele.
(<http://rymeyouth.com/researchkeele/young-music-participation-keele-university>)
- Pitts, S. (2002). Finding the future in the past. Historical perspectives on music education. In G. Spruce (Ed) *Aspects of Teaching Secondary Music. Perspectives on Practice*. London: RoutledgeFalmer
- Popkewitz, T. (1990). Whose future? Whose past? Notes on critical theory and methodology. In E. Guba (Ed) *The Paradigm Dialog*. pp. 46-66, London: Sage Publications.
- Pratt, M. (2009). *The high school band's endless cycle going nowhere*. Blog. michaelpratt.wordpress.com September 5th 2009.
- Prescott, A. (2008) *Ethnomusicology meets music education: strategies for bringing diverse musics to all learners*. A paper presented at The Ninth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education, Seattle, WA.
- Primos, K. (2001). Africa. In D. Hargreaves and A. North. (Eds) *Musical Development and Learning. The International Perspective*, pp.1-13. London: Continuum.
- Reimer, B. (1994). Can we understand music of foreign cultures? In H. Lees (Ed). *Musical connections: tradition and change*. pp. 227- 244. Proceedings of the 21st World Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Tampa, Florida.
- Reimer, B. (2004). Reconceiving the standards and school music program. *Music Educators Journal*, 91 (1). 33-36.
- Reimer, B. (2007). Roots of inequity and injustice: The challenges for music education. *Music Education Research*, 9 (2) 191-204.
- Regelski, T. (1998). Critical theory as a foundation for critical thinking in music education. *Studies in Music*, 17 (4)
- Richardson, C. (2007). Engaging the world: Music education and the big ideas. *Music Education Research*, 9 (2) 205-214.
- Robinson, P. (2010). *Categorizing musics: the position of world music within the international baccalaureate diploma program*. A paper presented at The Tenth International Conference on Cultural Diversity in Music Education conference, Sydney, Australia.

- Santos, R. (1994). Authenticity and change in intercultural music teaching. 25-34. In H. Lees (Ed). *Musical connections: tradition and change*. pp. 25-34. Proceedings of the 21st World Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Tampa, Florida.
- Schippers, H. (1996). Teaching world music in the Netherlands: Towards a model for cultural diversity in music education. *International Journal of Music Education*. (27). 16-23.
- Schippers, H. (2005). Taking distance and getting up close: the seven-continuum transmission model (SCTM). In P. S. Campbell, J. Drummond, P. Dunbar-Hall, K. Howard, H. Schippers, T. Wiggins. (Eds). pp. 29-34. *Cultural diversity in music education: directions and challenges for the 21st century*. Brisbane, Australia: Australian Academic Press.
- Schippers, H. (2010). *Facing the music. Shaping music education from a global perspective*. New York: Oxford University Press
- Schmidt, P. (2005). Music education as transformative practice: Creating new frameworks for learning music through a Freirian perspective. *Visions of Research in Music Education* January (<http://www.rider.edu/~vrme>).
- Schwandt, T. (2003). Three epistemological stances for qualitative inquiry: Interpretivism, hermeneutics, and social constructionism. In N. Denzin and Y. Lincoln. *The landscape of qualitative inquiry*. pp. 292-331. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Sherman, R. and R. Webb (1988). Qualitative research in education: A focus. In R. Sherman and R. Webb. *Qualitative research in education: focus and methods*. pp. 2-21. London, Falmer Press.
- Sleeter, C & Grant, C. (1999). *Making choices for multicultural education: Five approaches to race, class, and gender*. (3rd ed.). Upper Saddle River: Merrill.
- Sloboda, J. (2001). Emotion, functionality, and the everyday experience of music: Where does music education fit? *Music Education Research*, 3 (2) 243-54.
- Smith, L. (1999). *Decolonizing methodologies: Research and indigenous peoples*. New York: St Martin's Press, LLC.
- Spruce, G. (1999). Music, music education and the bourgeois aesthetic: Developing a music curriculum for the new millennium. In R. McCormick & C. Paechter. *Learning and knowledge*. London; Sage Publications.
- Spruce, G. (2001). Music assessment and the hegemony of musical heritage. In C. Philpott & C. Plummeridge (Eds.), *Issues in music education* (pp. 118-130). London: Routledge Falmer.

- Stålhammer, B. (2000). The spaces of music and its foundation of values: Music teaching and young people's own music experience. *International Journal of Music Education*, 36, 35-45.
- Stake, R. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Stake, R. (2003). Case studies. In N. Denzin and Y. Lincoln. *Strategies of qualitative inquiry*. pp. 134-164. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- Stock, J. (2002) Concepts of world music and their integration within western secondary music education. In G. Spruce (Ed) *Aspects of teaching secondary music. Perspectives on practice*. London. RoutledgeFalmer
- Swanwick, K. (1994). Authenticity and the reality of musical experience. In H. Lees (Ed). *Musical connections: tradition and change*. pp. 215- 226. Proceedings of the 21st World Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Tampa, Florida.
- Thompson, K. (2002). A critical discourse analysis of world music as the 'other' in education. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 19(1) 14-21.
- Thorsen, S. (2002). Addressing cultural identity in music education. *Talking Drum* (84) 1-7.
- Thwaites, T. (2008). Music education in a new key: The dissonance of competence connectedness, culture and curriculum. *New Zealand Journal of Research in Performing Arts and Education*, (1).
- Villegas, A & Lucas, T (2002). Preparing culturally responsive teachers. Rethinking the curriculum. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 53 (1) 20-32.
- Volk, T. M. (1998). *Music, education, and multiculturalism. Foundations and principals*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Wellington, J. (2000). *Educational Research. Contemporary Issues and Practical Approaches*. London: Continuum Books.
- Wiggins, T. (1993). *Words about music: A response to some points raised by other speakers*. Teaching Musics of the Second World International Symposium Proceedings, Basel, Switzerland.
- Wiggins, T. (2005). Cultivating shadows in the field?: Challenges for traditions in institutional contexts. In P. S. Campbell, J. Drummond, P. Dunbar-Hall, K. Howard, H. Schippers, T. Wiggins. pp. 13-21. *Cultural diversity in music education: Directions and challenges for the 21st century*. Brisbane, Australia: Australian Academic Press.

Williams, D. (2007). What are music educators doing and how well are they doing it?
Music Educators Journal; 94 (1) 18-23.

Wolcott, H. (1995). *The Art of Fieldwork*. London: Sage Publications.

Appendix A: Method and Ethics

- i. Data Analysis Categories
- ii. Consent Form
- iii. Letter to Principals
- iv. Information Sheet for Participants
- v. Interview Guide Student Participants
- vi. Interview Guide Teacher Participants

i) Data Analysis – Categories (Grouped thematically)

Teachers	Students
<p>Personal biography Music interests and preferences Personal music participation Reflection on teacher education Reflection on previous teaching experience</p> <p>Description of current practice Reflection on current practice Reflection on school culture General challenges</p> <p>Teaching philosophy Beliefs about quality music education Success of music programme Perceived benefits of music education</p> <p>Cultural diversity Barriers to cultural diversity Culturally responsive teaching Barriers to culturally responsive teaching Barriers to music participation Inclusion of culture bearers Involvement of parents/ community Choices of repertoire Place of indigenous musics</p> <p>Student attitudes and beliefs Student music interests and preferences</p>	<p>Personal biography Description of current music participation Aspirations for the future Family music participation Music interests and preferences Self-perception of musical ability Personal beliefs/ philosophy</p> <p>Reflection on music learning experience Reflection on school culture Beliefs about quality music education Success of music programme Perceived benefits of music education Teacher attitudes</p> <p>Cultural diversity Barriers to cultural diversity Culturally responsive music education Barriers to culturally responsive music education Barriers to music participation Inclusion of culture bearers Choices of repertoire Place of indigenous musics</p>

ii) Consent Form

PARTICIPANTS

I have read the Information Sheet concerning this project and understand what it is about. All my questions have been answered to my satisfaction. I understand that I am free to request further information at any stage.

I know that:-

1. My participation in the project is entirely voluntary;
2. I am free to withdraw from the project at any time without any disadvantage;
3. Personal identifying information, including audio tapes of interviews, will be destroyed at the conclusion of the project but any raw data on which the results of the project depend will be retained in secure storage for five years, after which they will be destroyed;
4. This project involves an open-questioning technique where the precise nature of the questions which will be asked have not been determined in advance, but will depend on the way in which the interview develops and that in the event that the line of questioning develops in such a way that I feel hesitant or uncomfortable I may decline to answer any particular question(s) and/or may withdraw from the project without any disadvantage of any kind;
5. The researcher will endeavour to ensure that there is no discomfort or risk to me;
6. There is no remuneration for my participation in this project;
7. The results of the project may be published and will be available in the library. My anonymity will be preserved.
8. I understand that reasonable precautions have been taken to protect data transmitted by email but that the security of the information cannot be guaranteed.

I agree to take part in this project.

.....
(Signature of participant)

.....
(Date)

This project has been reviewed and approved by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee

iii) Sample Letter to School Principal

The Principal

16th June, 2008

Dear Principal,

I am a senior lecturer at the University of Otago College of Education and am carrying out doctoral research on the topic of Cultural Diversity in Music Education. The focus is on what schools are doing well in the area of music education, with a view to sharing examples of best practice with others in the music education community both nationally and internationally, as well as highlighting issues and challenges. There will be three secondary schools involved in the Australian- based phase of this project, as well as three in New Zealand, and three in the United States.

The music department at your school has been highly recommended as an example of the successful provision of a music programme that is responsive to cultural diversity. I am, therefore, hopeful that you would allow me to carry out some interviews at the school during September of this year. If it is acceptable, I would like to interview the HOD of your music department, and 4 or 5 students in years 12 or 13.

This project has been approved by the University of Otago Ethics Committee. Included with this letter are the information sheets, interview questions and consent forms for your information.

If you are happy for me to gather information through interviews with staff and students, please let me know by return email. If you would prefer the school not to be involved, I thank you for taking the time to consider the proposal.

I am happy to telephone you if you have further questions. You are also welcome to contact my supervisor, Professor John Drummond (#####).

Kind regards,
Tracy Rohan

Associate Director Primary Programmes
University of Otago College of Education
tracy.rohan@otago.ac.nz

iv) Information Sheet for Participants

Evaluating Culturally Diverse Music Programmes in Education Settings

INFORMATION SHEET FOR PARTICIPANTS FROM EDUCATION SETTINGS

Thank you for showing an interest in this project. Please read this information sheet carefully before deciding whether or not to participate. If you decide to participate we thank you. If you decide not to take part there will be no disadvantage to you of any kind and we thank you for considering our request.

What is the aim of the project?

The aim of this project is to investigate experiences of music teaching and learning within culturally diverse school communities.

What type of participants are being sought?

Teachers and students from secondary (high) school music departments who have a reputation for successful teaching within culturally diverse communities.

What will participants be asked to do?

Should you agree to take part in this project, you will be asked to participate in an interview. This interview will either be in person or via the internet. The interview will be scheduled at a time that suits you. It will take place in a setting of your choosing. The interview should take an hour at the most. After the interview there may be some follow-up dialogue by email to seek further information and clarification of points raised in the interview.

You should not experience any harm or discomfort from participating in this project. There is no payment for participating. Please be aware that you may decide not to take part in the project without any disadvantage to yourself of any kind.

Can participants change their mind and withdraw from the project?

You may withdraw from participation in the project at any time and without any disadvantage to yourself of any kind.

What data or information will be collected and what use will be made of it?

I will be collecting information from responses to interview questions and possible follow-up questions. This information will be analysed and used to write my PhD thesis.

If you wish to be an anonymous participant and you do not wish that the education setting that you represent be named in this study, you can indicate this on the consent form. However, you and your institution may be readily identifiable due to the public nature of your work and reputation. Therefore, you may choose to be a named participant. You can indicate this on the consent form.

This project involves an open-questioning technique where the precise nature of the questions which will be asked have not been determined in advance, but will depend on

the way in which the interview develops. Consequently, although the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee is aware of the general areas to be explored in the interview, the Committee has not been able to review the precise questions to be used.

In the event that the line of questioning does develop in such a way that you feel hesitant or uncomfortable you are reminded of your right to decline to answer any particular question(s) and also that you may withdraw from the project at any stage without any disadvantage to yourself of any kind.

The results of the project may be published and will be available in the library. If you wish to be an anonymous participant, every attempt will be made to preserve your anonymity.

You are most welcome to request a copy of the results of the project should you wish.

The data collected will be securely stored in such a way that only those mentioned above will be able to gain access to it. At the end of the project any personal information will be destroyed immediately except that, as required by the University's research policy, any raw data on which the results of the project depend will be retained in secure storage for five years, after which it will be destroyed.

Reasonable precautions will be taken to protect and destroy data gathered by email. However, the security of electronically transmitted information cannot be guaranteed. Caution is advised in the electronic transmission of sensitive material.

What if Participants have any Questions?

If you have any questions about our project, either now or in the future, please feel free to contact either:-

Tracy Rohan
Otago University College of Education
Telephone Number: #

or

Professor John Drummond
Department of Music
Telephone Number: #

This project has been reviewed and approved by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee

v) Interview Guide for Student Participants

What do you particularly enjoy about learning music at school?

Why did you choose to take music as a subject?

In what ways do you think this music programme is successful?

What do you see as the benefits of learning music at school for yourself, and for the wider community?

In your opinion, what kinds of previous learning and cultural experiences would best qualify a person to teach music in a secondary school?

What makes a good secondary school music programme?

What kinds of music should be taught in the programme?

Have you learned about indigenous musics at school? Should they be included in your programme?

How is the cultural context for the music included and taught in this programme?

How important is this aspect?

What opportunities have you had to learn about or perform music that you identify with in terms of your own cultural background?

Should the music programme be responsive to the cultural identities of the students in the class?

How important is it for you to learn about the music of your own cultural background at school? If not at school, where would be better?

What opportunities have you had to learn about other musics?

What kinds of music making are you involved in outside of school?

Has the music that you learn at school made a difference to the way you make music outside of school?

Which setting is more important to you as a musician- school music making or community music making?

Are there any barriers to you achieving well in music?

What are your musical plans for the future?

vi) Interview Guidelines for Teacher Participants

This school has a reputation for successful music programme. What do you think you are doing particularly well? How do you know you are doing these things well?

What are your beliefs about the nature of quality music education in secondary school?

What do you think are the benefits of learning music at school? Why do you think students choose music as an option?

How do you decide what musical content or examples to include in your programme?

How does your music programme respond to the culturally diversity of the school and wider community?

In what ways should the content and teaching methods of school music programmes reflect the cultural/ ethnic backgrounds of the students?

What are the benefits of having a diverse student population in terms of the music programme?

What barriers to cultural responsiveness do you experience as a teacher?

In what ways do your assessment requirements either constrain or support your approach to teaching music?

What do you feel you need to know about the cultural context of music before you teach it? How important is it to teach about the cultural context of music?

Do you feel well supported with resources to teach a diverse range of musics?

In what way did your pre- or in-service teacher education help you be a successful teacher of diverse musics and diverse students?

Are you able to draw on advice and input from community members to support your programme? How do you make this happen?

What barriers to learning music can you identify within school structures or systems, programme content or teaching methods? If there are barriers, what would help to remove these?

Appendix B: Interview Analyses

- i) Analysis of Interview- Elizabeth (Teacher - New Zealand School B)
- ii) Analysis of Interview- Anna (Teacher - Sydney School A)
- iii) Analysis of Interview- Caroline (Teacher - Seattle School B)
- iv) Analysis of Interview- Silesi (Student - New Zealand School A)
- v) Analysis of Interview- Christos (Student - Sydney School C)
- vi) Analysis of Interview –Mathew (Student - Seattle School C)
- vii) Analysis of Interview: Mathew (Student - Seattle School B)

i) Analysis of Interview-Elizabeth (Teacher New Zealand School B)

Participants	Full Interview Text Illustration of key messages in bold type	Category	Key messages	Link to Research Question(s)
TR	This school has a reputation for successfully teaching a diverse range of musics to a diverse student population. Tell me what you think you are doing particularly well?			
Elizabeth	There isn't a sense of 'that isn't music'. The kids will say, "could we listen to our music?" Well, that's music. Of course we can. There is no hierarchy, which is really born out in the senior school in the assessment evenings. We value each performance, each instrument, each kid for their own sake, and we build up a sense of support from the class so that they value excellence, they don't value a type of music over another type of music. There's no sense of 'if you don't like this music then you're not OK, it's like, in this space, music is music, and this person happens to be a fantastic clarinet player and this person can rip out the best	Reflection on current programme. Beliefs about music education.	No sense of hierarchy in the programme. Each student valued. Excellence valued no matter the genre. Celebrates students taking risks. No sexist, racist or homophobic language. High standard of behaviour expected.	3

	<p>electric guitar riff and they will sit and listen to each other quite happily- whoop and cheer and holler at each other's success, celebrating the student, celebrating them getting up and having a go. I am really consciously working towards that kind of ethos, right the way through, right from year nine- it's "what you do in this department is you have a go". The worst thing you can do, absolutely the worst thing you can do, is not have a go, and that is actually stated in the statement of pedagogy in the school scheme. That's what this department is about, and in a written test, it's "What's the worst answer you can put?" and they all go "No answer, Miss".</p> <p>What have you got to lose from having a go? We work very hard on the idea that in the music classroom, this is a safe space to have a go, if you dare to make it unsafe for anyone else, then you will have to answer to this. There is no sexist, racist, homophobic language, no putdowns, that is the ethos of the school, but I think I push that even</p>			
--	--	--	--	--

	<p>harder, because I know that every time a kid gets up, it's risky, they really are taking a risk, and especially the singers, I mean, I'm a singer, they've got nothing in front of them, so even if a kid gets up and plays 2 chords on the guitar, but they manage to stand there and talk to us, and they manage to not apologise, and they manage to have a go, then I expect that the class will honour that, and accept it, and that they know what's required of them as an audience. I say to them, well you are the leaders of etiquette. I do not want to hear that a music student has misbehaved. I don't think I could have been as explicit about this until relatively recently. One of the people you are going to talk to is our associate principal, my appraiser.....she has been really amazing in feedback to me, when I say, 'but this happened and this happened', and she will say, 'that happened because you had set up this and this and this' but because I have been by myself in the department I hadn't had anyone observing</p>			
--	---	--	--	--

	and saying this is what you have done. <u>This</u> worked well because they knew how to do <u>that</u> . This works well as a performance evening because they know. it's nice for me to be able to be explicit about that.			
TR	What kind of feedback do you get from families?			
Elizabeth	That the kids are happy. I get a lot of support from the parents. I keep talking about the performance evenings, but that's when it's most obvious. So for the senior performance assessments I always hold them in the evenings, and the students invite their families. I don't make a big public hoo- hah about it. I don't send letters home. They invite them, their families, to come along. And they always come along, and it's not unusual for all the students who are performing, for each of them to have a family member. And it gets to be a really nice relationship with the parents and me. Chat chat chat. And you just watch them glow with pride as their kids get up and play. They	Reflection on current practice. Community and parent involvement.	Lots of support from families for performance evenings. Challenging students are transformed by music participation.	3

	<p>want to check with me how it was at the end. But, they know. They know really. And we're only talking about the performance aspect, but for lots of the kids who are choosing music in this school, it's such a big thing. It's them, it's their soul. It's so much a part of them. Sometimes somebody will look at my role and say 'My goodness', you've got this one and this one, and this one. But they're my stars. I remember a boy who's year 13 this year. His first performance in year 11, I had tears running down my face. The next morning I said to staff. You're not going to believe this. I brought the video in to the staffroom to play to people, 'cos everybody had this boy down as an absolute wally. He was a pain to be around. And then he got a guitar in his hand, and Wow.</p>			
TR	<p>Can you talk some more about what you believe is a quality music education programme. You've talked about it being a safe place, where kids can try things out, and</p>			

	be accepted, and maybe achieve when they are not achieving in other parts of the curriculum.			
Elizabeth	Music for music's sake. Not music for assessment sake. The programme should acknowledge the soul.	Beliefs about music education	Music education should be driven by assessment.	
TR	How do you do that?			
Elizabeth	It's letting the kids express their own selves in music. There has to be room for that. The music rooms are open before and after school and there is a lot of noise coming out of them. I can't stand some of the music they're playing and they know that, but it doesn't matter. I'm facilitating that happening for them. I see it as the real thing for them because it's more and more obvious to me that music is the first thing that you own as a kid- that's separate from your parents. It's your way of expressing yourself. It's taking them from where they are at now, getting the basics taught to them through that music, and then pulling them into something else.	Beliefs about quality music education	Music programme must provide freedom for self expression.	3
TR	What's the range of music that students are			

	playing?			
Elizabeth	Avante-garde clarinet concertos, Death Metal, classics on piano, jazz piano, and lots of lots of rock.	Description of current programme.	Students play wide range of Western classical and popular musics.	3
TR	What about music from other parts of the world. African, or Indonesian, Pasifika musics?			
Elizabeth	That comes in as a big part of the year 10 programme.	Description of current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	'World' music is taught as a unit in Year 10.	3
TR	Tell me about that.			
Elizabeth	The aim of the unit, which is about a term's work, is that we throw a whole lot of music that they haven't heard before with a whole of questions. What is music?, what is it for?, who plays it?, where?, when?, what purpose?, for entertainment?, ritual?, do you have to pay for it?, is it free?, do you have to be young?, old,? female?, all those kinds of questions.	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	Unit is term's work in year 10. It takes a musicological approach.	3
TR	Do the students have an impression, perhaps from their parents, that reading and writing music, and playing or listening to Western classical music, is more important than other ways of			

	engaging with music?			
Elizabeth	No. Most of my kids are not coming in having had private lessons. I struggle with the notation thing, because when they're creating, and they do some amazing creations, the achievement standards demands that it's written down. Writing is really hard.	Barriers to music participation.	Students haven't had private lessons- struggle with notation. Notating for achievement standards is a challenge.	2
TR	So, unit standards would be the way to go?			
Elizabeth	Yep. For the Year 10 Musics of the world topic, at the end there is a composition task where they take 2 ideas – it may be a clapping sticks idea, or it might be a pentatonic scale, or a drum, at least two and combine them into a piece of their own, so sometimes I might end up with a heavy metal piece using the pentatonic scale, with a tabla rhythm. So they take bits and try and create a new flavour with it. They really enjoy that.	Reflection on current practice.	“World’ music topic includes a composition task. Students take a ‘fusion’ approach.	3
TR	Do you think there is any problem with taking aspects of music out of context and using them in different ways?			

Elizabeth	<p>Not if you have looked at them in their own context first. You have to do this to combat the kids saying “that’s weird” That’s prefacing it with, ‘this is the scale that we are used to. That’s our system, but there are others. And I can’t show you this on the piano, but I can on the guitar or with my voice, and I can’t hear this, but other people can, no sense of hierarchy, really careful with language, saying ‘I don’t know, lets go and find out’. Or, I think this is the case, why don’t we go and ask so and so who happens to be a Niuean teacher, or why don’t we go and talk to Pa Chris on the Marae. Get somebody in to talk about that. Or one of the kids will say, we’ve got one of those instruments at home because mum and dad went to China.</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p> <p>Inclusion of culture bearers.</p>	<p>It is important to teach in a contextualised, non-hierarchical way.</p> <p>It is important to ask for expert advice from culture bearers</p>	1, 3
TR	So, you do involve the community?			
Elizabeth	<p>If I can, if I have time. But I never purport to say, this is the truth about this. Instead it’s “this is what I’ve found out so far”.</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p>	Does not claim to be the expert.	1, 3
TR	I was looking at the			

	ethnic mix of this school....is this reflected in your music programme numbers?			
Elizabeth	It is in the junior school, but not in the senior school.	Cultural diversity.	Junior school music classes reflect cultural diversity of the school, but senior classes do not.	2
TR	Why is that?			
Elizabeth	In part, and I don't have proof for this, anecdotal evidence is that the Māori parents are not seeing music as a valuable course.	Barriers to cultural diversity.	Māori parents may not see music as a valid academic subject.	2
TR	Could that be because their children are more involved in music in the community rather than at school?			
Elizabeth	I don't know. Maybe it's not that there is not value placed on music, but that they want the kids to succeed – to increase Māori participation in business etc	Barriers to cultural diversity.	Māori parents may want particular career pathways for their children.	2
TR	So, they don't see music as a career pathway?			
Margararet	No.			
TR	What about the Pasifika students?			
Elizabeth	Similar stuff. The retention of Pacific kids through the school is an issue as well. Just holding on to the kids. I've got quite a number of Pacific Island boys at	Barriers to cultural diversity.	It is difficult to keep Pasifika students at school.	2

	year 11.			
TR	What music are they playing?			
Elizabeth	Mainly R&B. They are surprised when, Māori students too, I've said what about the waiata you're doing with Kapahaka? And they've said- oh can we do that? I had 4 or 5 kids last year get up and do their own version of the choral they did for Kapahaka last year as their group performance. And they say, can we use this, and "Of course you can, where does it say you can't?"	Music interests and preferences of students. Student attitudes. Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	Māori and Pasifika students mostly play R&B. Students are surprised that it is ok to include cultural (eg kapahaka) performances for assessment purposes.	2
TR	Why do you think they thought they couldn't use the Kapahaka performance for assessment purposes?			
Elizabeth	Yeah that's an interesting one. It may be because things Māori stay on the Marae. That could be part of it. It's like when they are composing a song. The lyrics can be in any language you choose. If you write a song in Māori and I don't understand the words, then that's my problem, and I need to go and find out whether your setting of those words is appropriate. But that's my problem,	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching. Student attitudes. Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	Māori students may think that things Māori belong on the marae. Students are free to write song lyrics in Māori. Not disadvantaged by this. Teacher must take responsibility for lack of cultural knowledge.	2,3

	not theirs.			
TR	Are they surprised that you approach things this way?			
Elizabeth	They don't believe me. This is where the kids from the immersion unit, not the mainstream, need convincing. They see their use of Māori language as quite separate from the music class.	Student attitudes. Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	Students don't believe that Māori language is relevant in music classes.	1,2
TR	Does the requirement to use notation hold them back?			
Elizabeth	It holds kids back from every background. It's a highly sophisticated skill. I try to do some slightly different stuff in terms of notation. A couple of boys last year in particular had created drumming pieces so I said draw me a picture of your piece. And that was just too left field for them. They got the hang of it. They got started, but they couldn't follow it through. They said "what do you mean?". And I said, draw me a picture and we'd done graphic score work, "if you tell me that that bit of the picture is to do with the bass drum and this is to do with the cymbal or whatever and you describe the story that you are telling and you	Barriers to music participation.	Use of conventional notation is a struggle for some. Encourages use of graphic notation as an alternative.	2

	draw me a picture, then that is a score”.			
TR	Was their composition more abstract than rhythmic?			
Elizabeth	No, it was strongly rhythmic, but they didn't have the skills to write it down, so we were trying to get them to even get a sense of the piece, it didn't have to be a hundred percent accurate, or be able to be played absolutely by somebody. And maybe I need more work on saying that that is also music.	Barriers to music participation.	Literacy expectations are barriers for some students.	2
TR	Maybe unit standards will be a help here.			
Elizabeth	Yeah. I've had some previous breakthroughs with a couple of them using the Sibelius software. Because as they're doing it they're learning notation. I had one of the Samoan drummers, threw him on the computer, and showed him how to find some drum patterns that were already on the computer, played them, and said 'which ones do you like?', showed him how to cut and paste those three which he didn't know how to do, he didn't have those basic computer skills. We got those up on a page	Barriers to music participation.	Computer software is helpful. Samoan drummers have had success with computer notation. In general Maori and Pasfika students avoid the computers. Need some targeted help.	2

	<p>and said, now play with them. And he sat there for an hour and a half and he played and understood what he was listening to, and hopefully he might be able to come up with something in the end that he'll be quite proud of. The others who can write... I realised the other day that there were no brown faces at the computers. So I talked to the teacher in charge of overseeing Pacific Island students and we've organised a workshop just for them. I want to just grab those boys so that it's just them and me. They've all created the music, but whether they will finish the task...</p>			
TR	<p>But also I guess you don't want them having to simplify their compositions so that they can write them down.</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>Their compositions are too complex for their notation skills. It's the same for everybody. Any ethnicity. The guitarists- some of their solos are amazing.</p>	<p>Barriers to music participation.</p>	<p>Compositions are often too complex for students to notate conventionally.</p>	2
TR	<p>Do you think the assessment requirement gives a message that your notation skills are</p>			

	more important than the quality and complexity of your creativity and composition abilities?			
	More and more. I am spending more time with the kids trying to get them to write the piece down, than I am helping them to craft the piece. I'm really getting fed up with it.	Barriers to music participation. Beliefs about music education.	Assessment requirements over-emphasize the importance of written literacy.	2,3
TR	What are the benefits of having a diverse student population in terms of the music programme?			
Elizabeth	The same things it brings to a school. Reality. It's why I like living in Auckland and don't want to go back to ***. The same reason I love going to the Lantern festival or the Avondale Market. It's stepping into different flavours, different smells, different music, different fashion, different ways of walking, greeting people. It just feels so much more real. I have no experience of teaching in a school that's not multicultural. I went to one and loved it but I didn't know anything else, and I think of schools in Auckland, and I wonder what it's like to be in a private girl's school. I may	Cultural diversity. Personal philosophy.	Enjoys the richness of a culturally diverse school and community.	3

	just be feeding the stereotypes that they have in reverse about this place.			
TR	How important do you think it is for students to hear and see themselves reflected in the curriculum?			
Elizabeth	Massively	Beliefs about music education.	Important for students to identify with the programme	3
TR	So, how do you try to do that in your programme?			
Elizabeth	Maybe not so much in the music, but in my way of being in the school. So for example at the Fiafia nights, or when the Niuean or Cook Island groups are practising around the school. I am there. I am at the practices and I talk to the kids about them. Or I find out who in my form class is in the Niuean group. If you are performing in the Cook Island group or Fiafia night then I can mark that as a group performance for a music assessment. If you are performing with the Kapahaka and you are doing a solo, fantastic, I'll be there. So they can use those as assessment. If the Cook Island group is performing in	Reflection on current practice.	Values students' extra-curricular cultural performances.	1,3

	<p>the talent quest. Great. So one of my roles is to try and get those groups out of just the cultural setting and into the mainstream of the school so that the kapahaka group will perform the haka from their performance at the talent quest or something like that.</p>			
TR	<p>Are those cultural groups open to all kids? You don't have to be Tongan, to be in the Tongan performance group?</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>No. Last year one of our year 13 girls...a little white blond Pakeha girl, with very English ancestry, was the queen figure in the Samoan group, and she took that role on having never been in the cultural group. And the other kids brought her into that role because she had been so supportive to them. She was a great maths student and had done a lot of maths tutoring with them and they gave her the honour of being the lead woman. And it was absolutely fine. It's not uncommon to have to set the timetable on Fiafia night around costume changes as a kid goes</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Student attitudes.</p> <p>Personal philosophy.</p>	<p>Cultural performance groups are very inclusive of other ethnicities and cultural expression.</p>	1,3

	from Niue to Cook Islands to Samoa because the kids are a mish-mash- as we all are. We even had some Highland dancing last Fiafia night and some Bollywood dancing too.			
TR	You don't have much of an Indian population here though do you?			
Elizabeth	No			
TR	We've touched on the aspects of NCEA assessment that constrain you, are there any other issues beside the requirements for written literacy? Are there any other issues around assessment that bother you?			
Elizabeth	I would like them to be able to give the kids more credit for the score reading stuff. If you don't have any private music background when you come to secondary school and you have a term in year 9 and 6 months in year 10, there is an awful lot of stuff you have to know by the end of year 10 in order to pick up a score and answer questions- it's enormous, because that's where you could get asked about Sasa, Haka, figured bass.	Barriers to music participation. Beliefs about music education.	Students who have no private tuition background can be disadvantaged by assessment requirements.	2

	<p>There is nothing that tells us the content. You teach to your strengths or you teach to what you think the kids want to know about early on and then you push as much else in as you can. That was the case with school cert [School Certificate- previous senior school qualification] as well.</p>			
TR	<p>So, do you find that you have to adapt the standard so that it makes sense for your kids?</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>Oh absolutely. I've come to that too. You don't want to get caught in that bind of 'what's in charge here?' That the assessment drives everything. "You are learning this for the test." With me it's important that the music we're studying is relevant to the music the kids are playing.</p>	Beliefs about music education	Doesn't want assessment to drive the programme. Music studied should be relevant to the music the students are playing.	3
TR	<p>It sounds like you really prioritise the student's needs and interests. You put them first. You focus on the love of music for its own sake, and then make sense of the assessment task in ways that will benefit the students as individuals.</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>Yes, that's developed over time. And I'm</p>	Reflection on current	Loves her job, and loves the students.	3

	<p>loving the job. And loving the kids. I hear music teachers talk about students and I think ‘For Heavens sake’. Who are you in this job for? And I go to moderation meetings, gatherings of music teachers and usually in Auckland within an area, but I remember going to a cluster meeting outside my area and I felt like a fish out of water. The person in charge had deliberately asked me to bring videos of some of my kids and looked at me with a grin on his face and said, “shall we just pop this on?” and I thought Oh great”. And it was a video of kids doing drums and electric guitar after we’d had tape after tape of grade 7 violin and clarinet and barbershop and I said that it was excellence at Level One. And one of the teachers said if that’s excellence then all of mine will get excellence. I said “Well lucky you. This is only level one”.</p>	<p>practice. Personal philosophy. Beliefs about music education.</p>	<p>Excellence at her school means something different to excellence at higher decile schools.</p>	
TR	<p>So what do you think was behind that teachers comment?</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>That music education is white, is classical, that those things come first. That it’s</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p>	<p>Other teachers believe that music education is not about popular</p>	<p>2,3</p>

	not about popular music.	Beliefs about music education..	music, reflecting white, middle class values.	
TR	Do you think that if assessment is tied to notation writing that increases the danger of a very “white” curriculum?			
Elizabeth	Especially if it doesn't have the breadth to look at other forms of notation. I had students who can be a bit of a “bleep” some of the time and he's a rock musician. And they were working on a composition and he shut himself in the store room with paper and crayons and pens and he said “I've kind of got a plan of it miss, not the notes yet, and I said that's great. Do me the plan. Show me the shape of this piece. He sat for an hour and he wrote and he drew. I said, tell me about this bit. And he said, the yellow bit means that it's this kind of mood. And then it moves into the blue. He said- “do you see music in colours? cos I do”. I was completely blown away. He was completely eloquent. He had filled two A3 sheets with the bits that the song was. It wasn't notation that I could follow if I was trying to play the	Barriers to music participation	Supports students to graphically record their pieces if struggling with conventional notation.	2,3

	guitar and he understood that and he understood that he could put some TAB in various places, but he'd done it all in colour and pictures as well.			
TR	What do you think music does for kids?			
Elizabeth	An identity, a release, a social connection, they gather together as mates around music, to talk and argue and be passionate.	Benefits of music education.	Music learning nurtures identity and social connections.	3
TR	Do you think other curriculum areas do those things as well or does music do it especially well?			
Elizabeth	Music does it outside the curriculum as well. If I can tap into that passion, tap into the fact that this is something they're really keen on and then teach them some crotchets and quavers so they understand some other kinds of music language along the way ... talk about the beats via their own music – that I'm completely out of touch with now.	Benefits of music education	Music is something for students to share and be passionate about.	3
TR	Are the kids competitive?			
Elizabeth	No. They celebrate somebody who plays really well. I do a lot of "Here's this little Year 9 fellow, come to high school, doesn't	Reflection on current practice. Beliefs about music	Students celebrate good performers. Teacher encourages them to be supportive audiences for each	3

	know anybody, popping him in with some year 13s and saying you guys should talk to each other. He should come to your band practice, come on in, come and join “. As long as I set it up in that way, they know that good piano/guitar/drum player, and I encourage them to be audiences for each other.	education.	other.	
TR	So you encourage cross-age performance groups?			
Elizabeth	Yes, and doing things constantly... we had a pianist last year who was just stunning at the piano and I kept saying, Kate is not the standard, you know, that's not level one. She's one of our "over the tops". That is not the standard at level one. She's fantastic and you love hearing her. She's got the X factor. You know that when you hear it. Who's got it in this room? And they can reel off the names straight away. "Who's got the x factor?", and they are quite happy about doing that.	Reflection on current practice	Encourages cross-age performance groups. Celebrate's students with the "x factor".	3
TR	So they celebrate each other's successes.			
Elizabeth	Yes, they do celebrate each other.			
TR	That is greatly to your			

	credit, don't you think?			
Elizabeth	I could say that now, I didn't used to be able to say that. And we celebrate progress. The day after a performance they know that what we do is sit down and watch the video. And they turn round after we have watched the video without me leading it and applaud the person who was playing on the video. And that person has sat for the whole time with their head buried with their hood up over their head, but they need to see themselves. And I then occasionally I perform as well on the performance nights. That's a bit of a challenge. (Co-teacher) and I have both got up and played in front of the parents. The first time that I did it I made such a boo-boo at the beginning I had to restart.	Reflection on current practice. Beliefs about music education.	Has encouraged them to celebrate both success and progress. Sometimes performs herself.	3
TR	The children see themselves much more broadly than their ethnicity? So, I'm a Samoan boy, rock musician, or R&B singer, or hip-hop dancer.			
Elizabeth	All those things. I had a boy in year 11 and I didn't realize until half	Knowing the students	Students have multiple musical and cultural	1,3

	<p>way through year 10, he's a top league player. He'd kept that very quiet. I knew him as a fabulous singer. He's a fantastic artist and he's now turning out to be quite a good song-writer. I didn't know all those parts of him. And he's a dancer. A dancer, and a singer and a league player and he is Niuean.</p>		identities.	
TR	<p>Have you got any Pasifika or Māori students playing classical music?</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>No.</p>	<p>Student interests and preferences</p>	<p>No Māori or Pasifika students play classical music.</p>	<p>2</p>
TR	<p>Do you think that's an economic issue? Is it about the ability to pay for private lessons or what?</p>			
Elizabeth	<p>There seems to be something of that in terms of the experience kids come in with. Although sometimes I miss them because they've had experience at year 8 and they just won't let me know. That's not just Māori and Pacific Island kids. They've had enough of the violin and they're not going to do that anymore. It's hard to catch them.</p>	<p>Barriers to music participation.</p> <p>Student attitudes.</p>	<p>May be an economic factor. May be that they don't let on what they know.</p>	<p>2</p>
TR	<p>Are there any assumptions made that if you are Māori or</p>			

	Pasifika that you should be playing a certain kind of music?			
Elizabeth	Not from me. Basically I just want them playing. (Co-teacher) is fantastic at that. He'll say I've got these 3 girls in year 9 and you've got to get them on the drums. He teaches the year 9s.	Reflection on current practice. Beliefs about music education.	Makes no assumptions that Māori and Pasifika students should play particular musics.	1,3

ii) Analysis of Interview- Anna (Teacher Sydney School A)

Participants	Full Interview Text Illustration of key messages in bold type	Category	Key Messages	Link to Research Question(s)
TR	Just to start with, can you talk a little bit about the education and career pathway that has lead to you becoming head teacher of music here.			
Anna	Okay, well I went straight to university after my HSC, so I went to the Sydney Conservatorium of Music for the bachelor of music, music education. That was a four year full time degree. And then straight after that I went and did one year of temporary teaching at a school in the *** which is near the water – so very interesting demographic. And then I did three years of teaching at *** Girls’ High School, which is in the *** region, so same region as this one.	Personal biography.	4 year degree at Sydney Conservatorium.	
TR	Okay.			
Anna	And then I applied and got the promotion for head teacher of Creative Arts at *** High	Personal biography. Description of current practice.	Head of Creative Arts in current teaching situation.	

	School.			
TR	Those teaching experiences, they have all been very different from each other I would imagine.			
Anna	Extremely different.	Reflection on previous teaching experience.	Has had diverse teaching experiences.	
TR	So what were some of the highs and lows of each of those settings?			
Anna	Well I think in the *** you had an extremely Anglo culture as in there was maybe one person from a different culture – as in there was one Asian student, it wasn't even that they were Chinese, one Russian student in each year. Like it was extremely, extremely Anglo. That was interesting – they had a very big band programme, very big support from parents and high expectations from the community. That was interesting, but I found they were a bit lacking, they had a really strong school culture, but they were kind of lacking in understanding of	Reflection on previous teaching experience.	Previous teaching situation was unresponsive to cultural diversity. Provided experience of Taiko drumming for the students to counter this. Personal valuing of diverse musics.	1,2,3

	<p>any kind of diversity because it was so mono-cultural.</p> <p>So what I did with them is I took an extension group of just the year sevens, and I was doing Japanese drumming at the time, Taiko drumming. So I arranged for a series of workshops over six weeks cumulating in a performance, because I was going to bring TaikOz out, which is a Japanese drum group from Australia, to perform for all of the year sevens. But I decided if I could get them to actually work with them... so they came out and did workshops. The leader that we got happened to be Japanese, though, not all members of the group are. And we taught them the basics of the Taiko drumming. They had rehearsals after school, so they developed an understanding of it. The lessons were entirely instructed in Japanese or without verbal cues at all. So by the end of it, this little group came out and performed for the</p>			
--	--	--	--	--

	<p>school, their own piece on the Japanese drums with all of the year sevens watching. We were more trying to give them an understanding through experiencing it. So that's what happened.</p>			
TR	<p>And did they welcome that experience? Did they enjoy it?</p>			
Anna	<p>They were a bit unsure at the start, but they really enjoyed it by then. In fact if I'd stayed there, we had a vision to continue it on further. We would have developed it as an ongoing programme and there was a possibility for them to maybe in the future go to Japan to perform, so naturally they were quite excited because it was so different from anything they'd done before. They had done so much training, but they'd never experienced anything where it was entirely done orally. There was no music, like sheet music. So they had to learn the whole</p>	<p>Reflection on previous practice.</p>	<p>Successful teaching experience of diverse musics. Students enjoyed newness of experience, particularly oral-aural learning. Personal interest in challenging classically trained students with other ways of knowing.</p>	<p>1,3</p>

	<p>piece, through memory, which was something that was totally unfamiliar to them. I was given the students, and they said well they're so good already, just keep them there. But I said look, they're not good at everything, there's the other side – so I just focused on developing that side.</p>			
TR	<p>You were developing their aural skills. These kids were very good at reading notation, but this would really stretch them.</p>			
Anna	<p>And they found it extremely challenging, and it's a very physical thing as well.</p>	<p>Reflection on previous practice.</p>	<p>Reiteration of challenge of aural/oral learning</p>	<p>1</p>
TR	<p>So that was a brave thing to do in a school that was not used to doing things outside of perhaps the Western classical genre.</p>			
Anna	<p>And their jazz bands. They love the jazz.</p>	<p>Reflection on previous teaching experience.</p>	<p>Previous school ensembles limited to classical and jazz.</p>	<p>1</p>
TR	<p>And other contemporary styles?</p>			
Anna	<p>No.</p>			

TR	Oh, no rock or...			
Anna	Concert band, jazz band.		Performance limited to jazz, concert band ensembles.	1
TR	Oh, okay.			
Anna	It's band. I love the jazz from that era, that scene is like the epitome.		Loves jazz	
TR	But now, you're in the school which is very different kind of demographic. Tell me about the students in this school?			
Anna	<p>Well this school is the opposite in terms of demographic because it has ninety-seven percent non-English speaking background students and about three percent Anglo.</p> <p>Predominately there are Arabic students, so they come in from a lot of different regions. You've got refugees, Afghani refugees in particular have come here. We've got quite a few Lebanese.</p> <p>Across the road we have **** which is the Islamic private school. So what you find is that in this area there are a lot of students who are</p>	Reflection on current school culture.	Is now in culturally diverse setting. Some students may not be high academic achievers	

	from those cultures but they go to that school and we kind of get the ones who don't get into that school.			
TR	Oh, okay.			
Anna	They have a very different culture over there, because I assist the teachers there. And you have to like pass year four to get into year five. And so we get people who were there and then...	Reflection on school culture.	Some students in current school have been unsuccessful in neighbouring school.	
TR	...were not successful academically, and then they come here? And this is just open entry, this school, isn't it?			
Anna	Oh yeah, comprehensive, it's a local high school, anybody can come here, we get a lot of international students so they pay from overseas to come here.	Reflection on school culture.	Current school is culturally diverse.	
TR	Okay. And you've got a lot of very recent migrant families in this area?			
Anna	Yeah, we've got quite a... mobile population. Because we've got people coming across so we get lots of 'through the year' enrolments,	Reflection on school culture.	Transient student population. Challenging and changing cultural	

	<p>because it's as circumstances... they're not necessarily coming to Australia because they particularly wanted to, you know, but they do. So we've got that plus we've got students going back overseas for long periods of time, so there's a lot of disruption to the schooling. And you get a fluctuation of the dynamic within the student population because of the different groups, you know some are more dominant at some time than others, depending on the influx. Because when you get a new group introduced, like when the Afghani refugees came across – that changed the dynamic and they had some fitting in to do with some people you know, obviously the Lebanese students and all sorts of things.</p>		<p>dynamics within current school.</p>	
<p>TR</p>	<p>Yeah, that's challenging, I can imagine. Can you talk a little bit about some of your beliefs about quality music</p>			

	<p>education? So I mean you are somebody who has delivered quality music education in a setting where you had all of the bells and whistles and families who expected certain things, and now you're in a very different school with some very different challenges but you are attempting to deliver quality music education here. So what are some of your underpinning beliefs about what quality music education is?</p>			
Anna	<p>Well I'm very driven by very strong underlying beliefs that have gone right from being at the very privileged school through to the last school I was at which was a similar demographic to here but it was an all girls' school. I believe that music education should be engaging, inclusive. I think that, you've got to really think about what you're teaching. So not just teaching something because everyone's always taught it. For example like</p>	<p>Teaching philosophy.</p> <p>Beliefs about quality music education.</p>	<p>Beliefs are deeply held.</p> <p>Music education should be engaging and inclusive.</p> <p>Students need to see relevance and feel connected. Make links to students' prior knowledge.</p> <p>Students from different cultures values music for different reasons.</p>	1,3

	<p>instruments of the orchestra; now it's important to give them access to that in terms of being able to communicate outside of school in different areas and things with that kind of language. But to spend a whole term as some people do on identifying those instruments, in that way – you could do it in a different way where you are looking at the classification of instruments and you're actually including the instruments that they know and including their knowledge. Because if you engage in those discussions, then they feel a greater connectedness to what you are doing, a relevance – because the biggest issue I have, and it's really in my mind this year because I've only been teaching the mandatory here, so they have to do the subject – is that some students struggle to see the relevance. Especially coming from a wide variety of cultures, some value music a lot more than others</p>		<p>Teacher should listen, and respond to the students.</p> <p>Uses two different strategies: teaching according to the cultures represented in the classroom, or teaching about something that is new for all students.</p>	
--	---	--	---	--

	<p>for very different reasons. So I believe you have to really actually be attuned, you have to listen and respond to the dynamic of the individual classroom and make sure that they are feeling connected to what you are teaching. So I tend to, in this environment I do teach... well I haven't had an opportunity to as much, it's been a bit of picking up the pieces, but actually looking at the cultures within the classroom, or the other tactic I use is I think about what they're all very familiar with and I introduce them to something completely foreign to all of them. So in a way that makes them unified because...</p>			
TR	None of them know about it.			
Anna	That's it. They're unfamiliar. For example we don't actually have a lot of African refugees here.	Teaching Philosophy.	African musics are generally unfamiliar to all.	1,3
TR	Right.			
Anna	So if we're looking at	Beliefs about	It is important	1,3

	<p>that kind of music and you make links across. For example with the drumming, you have links across a lot of the different cultures, and they can learn from each other. It's getting them to use their skills in the classroom. So valuing, so I guess to put it in a nutshell; it's looking at valuing what they already know and recognising they're not, you know, empty vessels. And making sure they feel included and connected with the learning. So I think that music education can play a big role in that, in terms of, especially with the culture in the school...</p>	<p>quality music education.</p> <p>Teaching philosophy.</p>	<p>to value students' prior cultural knowledge.</p> <p>It is important that students feel connected to their learning.</p>	
TR	<p>Yeah. And so what do you think are the main benefits of studying music for a young person?</p>			
Anna	<p>I think the opportunity for expression. I do not like to do any kind of connection with like, academic results and things that people are focused on. I think the intrinsic benefit of music itself in</p>	<p>Perceived benefits of music education.</p>	<p>Music learning helps students to express themselves. Music learning has intrinsic benefits</p> <p>Music learning helps students to connect</p>	1,3

	<p>terms of also... see what I believe is that I think there, it can... let me see... it's a way of connecting with culture and maintaining an identity in things in terms of the significance to the students. So it's bringing something that's important to them, it could be, it's almost like a souvenir from where they've come from. And even say looking at second, third generation, like it seems to become even more important to them because they're trying to hold onto it.</p>		<p>with culture and maintain cultural identity. Music is a way of holding on to cultural heritage.</p>	
TR	Right.			
Anna	<p>So I think it's an opportunity to explore that and to actually give them a chance to – it's hard to say.</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p>	<p>Important to provide opportunities for students to explore own cultural identities.</p>	1
TR	<p>Well the young people that I've interviewed in Auckland – when I ask them what they think are the benefits of learning music for themselves, they don't say that it's making them cleverer at maths – they don't</p>			

	<p>mention that at all. They say that it's helping them form relationships with other students, and that they're having lots of fun doing it. For lots of them, they say it's the reason they're still at school. Because it's that part of the day where they feel very successful, they feel they're doing something with their friends and others who are like-minded and they're really enjoying themselves and expressing themselves, they're developing some confidence, a bit of leadership – those sorts of things. Are those things that you would recognise as benefits for your students?</p>			
Anna	<p>I think definitely. I mean, we sometimes run into trouble with the subject because we do it in an engaging way, so they are having fun. So sometimes they don't realise they're learning things. So it's like, oh, one student who's run into quite a bit of trouble – he said, we were in a conference with the deputy and</p>	Perceived benefits of music education.	<p>Music learning is fun.</p> <p>Some students don't appreciate the value of experiential learning.</p>	3

	<p>the year advisor and myself and the student, and we were saying, look, you know, we're trying to do this, you know, this is what we're asking you to be engaged in. But he says oh but we don't do anything, we don't write anything down, you know, we've only written, you know, this many pages worth – that's how he saw learning.</p>			
TR	Oh.			
Anna	<p>But the best thing I've noticed here, I've only been able to, I'd say have a limited impact thus far at this school with this amount of time – but I did put together, I was working with different groups that were, you know, motivated and they brought themselves forward and they said, oh look I'm trying to do this. I looked at them individually, for example one of the students that you will speak to was very interested in the Manga culture and the music from that. He's from a Chinese background but there's also another</p>	Success of music programme.	Despite short time of teaching in this school, she has been successful in bringing diverse students together to make music. This is an example of successful practice, in the participant's view.	1,3

	<p>student who has an Egyptian background and he absolutely loves to sing. Like he adores it. He really wanted to perform in assembly.</p> <p>Apparently in the past he's sung with a recording with the voice on it, and I said hmm, maybe we can do something different. So I took the recording that he gave me and I arranged it for all the people I could find in the school that played any instrument. That was six people. So I managed to find them. And I said, let's do it. So what I did is I wrote out the parts and I took for example the year twelve student who's a fantastic violinist who would never in his lifetime speak to this other student who was a fantastic singer. And then I found a wonderful drummer who once again, they would never, their paths would never cross. And the students I had on the flute, quiet as mice – it just would never have happened. But I brought this together</p>			
--	---	--	--	--

	for their rehearsals after rehearsing them separately and the students who were a bit more gregarious, shall we say, like the drummer and the singer, they're oh like, that's bad [good], how do you do that, with the violinist and the... they didn't know the names of the instruments or anything. But it started a...			
TR	So they said that's bad meaning that's good? Isn't it?			
Anna	Oh yeah.			
Anna	They're like wow – how do you do that, that's amazing. So it started a respect, and a relationship between unlikely people. So they enjoyed...	Success of music programme.	Music making can bring people together- help form relationships	1,3
TR	So you had a little United Nations going there.			
Anna	That's my own view. I want to get the kind of ensemble that brings together as many of the people that play different instruments, especially from their cultures across together to create some kind of fusion,	Reflection on current practice	Aims to have ensembles that create cultural and music fusion.	1,3

	if you look at it that way.			
TR	Right.			
Anna	Playing different, but not just their own culture as well.	Reflection on current practice. Beliefs about quality music education .	It's good for students to play the music of other cultures as well as their own.	1,3
TR	Making music together, that's meaningful for them.			
Anna	Yeah, getting them to play...			
TR	So you've been here how long?			
Anna	I've been here since January.	Only been in present situation for 8 months.	Description of current practice.	
TR	Okay, that's a very short time in a new school. You'll be finding your feet.			
Anna	Absolutely.			
TR	So what are of the major challenges here that you're finding?			
Anna	Hmm – they're just rebuilding the school culture. In fact, they created the position for head teacher creative arts to address the fact that while trying to turn the school around, there was just not that much learning going in the classroom because of	Reflection on school culture. General challenges.	School is undergoing changes, including staff changes.	

	<p>behavioural problems and it was a bit chaotic from all accounts. Like lots of fighting and all of these problems. All of the executive have been changed within the last three years except for one.</p>			
TR	Executive meaning the management staff...			
Anna	<p>The principal, the deputies, and one of the parts of their mission they put in was to develop the performing arts in the school because what had happened was it wasn't happening. The teacher had stopped teaching music and she was just doing circle time with them. And I was hesitant to go by what they were saying, but she said that to me – she said yep, no I'm not interested, I don't teach music anymore. So I came in the position where there hadn't been music for the juniors really. They'd just been sitting talking about social skills. And there were no elective classes because they weren't offering it because they knew that there</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Reflection school culture.</p> <p>General challenges.</p>	<p>Job description is to rebuild the music programme, as well as develop a performing arts culture in the school.</p>	

	was no music being taught. But to change that, they made the position available for head teacher of creative arts, to come in here to establish the culture of the performing arts within the school.			
TR	So that's dance and drama as well?			
Anna	Dance, drama, music and visual arts.	Administrative responsibility for 4 Arts subjects.	Description of current practice.	
TR	Wow. That's a big job.			
Anna	That would be the challenge.	General challenges.		
TR	Have you got a background in visual arts, and dance and drama?			
Anna	Well I completed the same level of visual arts at the end of my HSC as I did with music.	Personal biography.	Has a strong background in the Visual Arts.	
TR	But then did you...			
Anna	High school certificates, your final exams in high school, and I was deciding which way I would go, visual arts or music. I did have a passion in the background, but it's still a big challenge. So there's three visual arts teachers,	Description of current practice.	Is the only music teacher.	

	and there's me – and I'm the music department.			
TR	You're the music department all by yourself?			
Anna	Yeah. So there's no one else comes in at all.	General challenges.	Professional isolation.	
TR	No itinerant teachers?			
Anna	None. Nobody.			
TR	So if a child wants to learn the violin, what do they do? Do parents have to find a teacher somewhere?			
Anna	Parents either have to find a teacher somewhere, or...I've applied for the funding and I put forward a proposal, I've managed to acquire some instruments just in the last week I got that through. And I've made links with teachers that I knew and from next term they'll be coming in and offering it in an accessible way because the students cannot afford – they might be coming from families where there are like twelve children, and music's not really valued in that family, they're looking at more the work kind of things, that, you know, sixth	Reflection on current practice General challenges. Barriers to music participation.	Attempts to overcome economic barriers to instrumental learning. Difficulty for students in getting instrumental tuition. Reiteration of isolation as sole music teacher.	2

	<p>child along the list, for them to go and get violins, this is nigh impossible. So the way I'm trying to make it a successful option for the students is by purchasing a set of instruments that they can hire from here at a much subsidised rate and to bring some teachers in with the group lesson so they have an opportunity to do that. Whereas previously, it's just, well they have to go find somebody. But in terms of in the classroom I will just have to teach whatever.</p>			
TR	You'll just have to teach with whatever.			
Anna	That sounds bad.	General challenges.	Challenge of lack of resources.	
TR	So what resources do you have in terms of instruments? I see you've got a drum kit.			
Anna	Yes, when I arrived we had a drum kit and...	General challenges.	Challenge of lack of resources.	
TR	You've got some little soprano glockenspiels?			
Anna	Yep. They're chromatic at least. When I arrived there	General challenges.	Challenge of lack of resources.	

	was just a drum kit.			
TR	Right.			
Anna	That's it. And there were two keyboards.	General challenges.	Challenge of lack of resources.	
TR	What about guitars?			
Anna	There were no guitars.	General challenges.	Challenge of lack of resources.	
TR	Oh.			
Anna	No, like I thought they were exaggerating. I didn't realise they were being honest when they said you are starting from scratch. I thought it was a figure of speech. Everything had been damaged in a way that I don't understand how it could be damaged. Like there was a bass guitar, there was an electric guitar and I went to get it taken in and apparently it had somehow corroded from the inside. So you can only imagine.	Reflection on current teaching situation	Previous music programme had not fostered a culture of caring for instruments.	
TR	It got wet.			
Anna	Yes.			
TR	So you're going to need to foster a culture where kids love music and they love the instruments and want to look after them.			

Anna	Well...			
TR	And don't want to let you down.			
Anna	That's true. It's all about establishing rapport. It is about relationships. And that's why I have students who will be able to speak to you because really when you're going in from scratch, you go in and actually seek them out and find them and really value, and give them a voice – I mean the school saying look, you know, we're valuing what you can do. I have this piano now, and I've just purchased your typical instruments. Your band instruments...	Reflection on current practice Teaching philosophy	Primacy of relationships. Sending message to students that they are valued.	3
TR	So you've got band instruments...			
Anna	I now have band instruments as of last week. They're still locked away. It's just starting out.	Reflection on current practice.	Resource situation is improving.	
TR	But it's going to rewarding, isn't it, as you build this?			
Anna	I wouldn't have taken it on if I wasn't going, you know...			
TR	How do you go with behaviour management?			

Anna	You have to be on your toes every single day. There's no day when you could just...	Reflection on current practice.	Behaviour management is challenging.	
TR	Relax.			
Anna	Relax. I mean with my year sevens I can because I established the culture from the start.	Reflection on current practice.	Has developed a more positive behaviour environment with younger students.	
TR	Now year sevens are what age?			
Anna	They're like twelve years old.			
TR	Okay.			
Anna	So possibly it would be year eight for...			
TR	Yes			
Anna	Their first year in the school they didn't know anything about the previous culture from here.	Reflection on school culture.	New students don't know about previous behaviour issues.	
TR	No baggage for them...			
Anna	No baggage, I just came in and like this is what we do here, but the year eights, they are a bit wrapped up in...	Reflection on current practice.	Has established a positive classroom culture.	3
TR	How it was before?			
Anna	...in their previous teacher and what, like for example their music lessons, because I keep trying to be positive, I'm	Reflection on current practice	Challenge of creating a culture of success and learning	3

	quite a positive person – and I said, no, no, you know something, you do know something. And what they’ve done in class was they did have some keyboards out which is why they’re probably all broken, and they were just like, sit on it with headphones mucking around. And that drum kit was in the store room where they just put a couple of boys in there and they would just...			
TR	Do anything.			
Anna	Anything, which is why the bottom of the drum kit has a hole in it.	Reflection on school culture.	. Previous lack of respect for instruments.	
TR	Oh.			
Anna	But, on the upside it is getting better because they see that I value music. Whereas the predecessor would talk openly negatively about the worth of music. She’d say oh, it’s not important, let’s do this other stuff. But now they’re starting to see there’s something of value, they see that I’m serious about it and that, you know, I’m interested and I’m	Reflection on current practice.	Establishing expectations and relationships	

	passionate about it, and I actually want to work with them.			
TR	And they're going to like and care about you, aren't they? As you build that rapport.			
Anna	Possibly.			
TR	Yes, of course they are. What's not to like? When you were at school, was it a pretty traditional kind of music education that you had?			
Anna	Yeah. I was at a selective school that was actually part boarding and part ***** school. So it was an agricultural high school which was interesting. Very traditional music education, although my teacher was a bit more into the contemporary music. Which was a challenge as well because to get into the conservatorium I had to go for exams in a repertoire that was very more the classical orientated.	Barriers to cultural diversity. Reflection on teacher education.	Requirement for classical training to be accepted at Sydney Conservatorium.	2
TR	Right.			
Anna	To that end I had to be doing that other repertoire but once there, you have to...			

TR	Diversify in what you do?			
Anna	Yeah. That's right.			
TR	So tell us a little bit now about the 'cultural diversity' aspects of your own teacher education, within the degree programme.			
Anna	That was extremely influential because it was integrated right from the start because I think at my university there's a great belief in the importance of it. So I had multicultural studies in music education so by that I mean, you actually had to go out and do field work, not just a tokenistic interview. You actually had to go into the culture and learn about it and look at all the aspects of it and that was really pivotal for me because that gave me strategies as to how to connect with community and to see it as looking at experts, you know, culture bearers coming into the school because I'd always had a passion for it so it started that way. I	Reflection on Teacher Education	Multicultural Studies at Conservatorium were inspirational. Course provided strategies for making community links.	1,3

	was looking at when I was little, I wanted to be an ethnomusicologist, and then I realised they have to sit down and break apart all the... and I didn't like that.			
TR	Be so analytical. You didn't want to do that?			
Anna	Yeah but I already had an interest, but then when I got to university we had these subjects and also the practical nature like the gamelan. I just kind of took that on and it's definitely a big part, because I was always interested in it, but I thought what can I teach them? I don't know. And I even said to a student here, I said look I'm working on it at the moment, I'm working to get a drumming group together of all the people that play the derbakeh, like the Lebanese drum. And he said why don't you do it? And I said, well I didn't think I have the skills for it. And he said, no, no, no, you just do that. And he didn't see any problem with that at	Reflection on current practice-influenced by multicultural university studies.	Importance of allowing students to be experts/ leaders	1,3

	<p>all. So looking at students as leaders, accepting that they might have a very high level of skill in some things that you don't. And that's a big part of my teaching is that I think you get different kinds of teachers. I'd like to think that I'm not one that has to be...</p>			
TR	All-knowing.			
Anna	<p>Yeah, I'm not like the big, showy, person out the front there who is the centre of attention. I try to get people who I recognise as having a greater understanding of different aspects and get them involved and get them in there. So if there's a student that knows more, fair enough, get them out there. A person from the community, like not just relying on my limited...</p>	<p>Teaching philosophy.</p> <p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p>	<p>Recognition of expertise among students and community.</p>	3
TR	<p>So in terms of your own parent community here, how will you communicate with them to find some parents who might like to contribute to your music programme?</p>			
Anna	Well it's a challenge	Community/	Challenge of	2

	because...	parent involvement. Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	communicating with parents.	
TR	Newsletters home, or what do you do?			
Anna	<p>We send newsletters home about what's happening at the school. I mean, there are immediate problems with that in terms of language. We don't get a lot of parent involvement in this school. And in this region that's a big problem. Like our parent and citizen committee that comes in, there are three people that come, and one of them is the president of it. So it's very difficult to engage in. And that's what I'm going to attempt to do with my work, by having a culturally inclusive music programme and actually getting the students exploring their own cultures through fusing them together. Hopefully, and this is what really worked well at my last school, a way of getting parents</p>	Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	<p>Reflection on current teaching situation</p> <p>Teaching Philosophy</p> <p>Aspirations</p> <p>Prior experience has shown her that parents will be more involved if she shows that she values their cultural knowledge.</p>	1,2,3

	<p>actually into the school was they saw, oh, wow, the school's valuing what we do.</p> <p>In recognising it, it's relevant, yeah, they're looking at the significance of it and I'm hoping that will bring them in because that worked with a group of the pacific island students I worked with, and that was a challenge.</p>			
TR	And this was in your previous school?			
Anna	<p>Yeah. But that had really lasting impact. I know some of them are still at school now because it gave them a positive face within the school as well because they kept being seen in a lot of negative circumstances, and they became more insular because of that and separate from the school. But when I gave them a chance to be recognised in doing something, you know, of worth and to be respected, for example they ended up going out and performing at the opera house and different outdoor venues. We made their costumes and</p>	Reflection on previous teaching experience.	In previous school, giving musical and cultural profile to Pasifka students was an effective way to create a more positive view of these students.	1,3

	the parents got involved with the costumes and things like that. That started changing it, so I've seen it work before.			
TR	At the moment you haven't got students electing to study music in the senior part of the school – but you will have in the future when you build things up.			
Anna	Well, it's already happening because there was no one this year and no one last year, no one the year before but the subject selections have just happened for year eight to year nine, year ten to year eleven, so we've got a full class for both of them.	Reflection on current practice.	Building the music profile in the school is important.	3
TR	That's great. It will be interesting to see whether there are groups within the school who don't select music. In New Zealand the Indian community typically don't choose music and it seems to be that it's about what their parents are valuing in terms of the future career prospects for their children			
Anna	That's true.			

TR	It will be interesting to see whether you have groups here who feel that way.			
Anna	<p>Well I think so. I mean there are a lot of times when parents, you know, they really want their children to be successful and to not have as many difficulties as perhaps they faced. And their children feel quite indebted... to an extent to follow through, especially for example international students who've been sent here at great sacrifice to parents ... but that's why I make a big effort to speak to those parents and to meet with those parents and to make a connection and to kind of put their minds at ease a little bit, because they may not have a full understanding of how our school system works.</p> <p>Especially in the middle years, when they're picking a subject – it's really is not going to affect what they do later at all. They should just do what they enjoy but they just think...</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Cultural diversity.</p> <p>Barriers to music participation.</p>	Need to help parents understand that selecting music as a subject won't disadvantage their students	2,3
TR	At the moment do			

	<p>you have any extra - curricular cultural groups happening in the school? Like for example, if you have a Samoan community here, there might be a sasa group happening or you might have a Bollywood dance group or a Kapa Haka group happening if you had a Maori community – those sorts of activities? Do you have any extra curriculum music making that’s not necessarily part of what’s happening in your department and is led by someone in the community or by students themselves?</p>			
Anna	<p>Unfortunately not to my knowledge. I know that was a big part of it at my last school and one of the things that was actually part of the group that went and performed at different things and you know, with their churches they would get together and that’s how I managed to build it up from that point, but from here, my difficulty is that there are a lot of contradictions in the way that for example with the Arabic</p>	<p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p> <p>Teaching philosophy.</p> <p>Barriers to culturally responsive music teaching.</p>	<p>Challenge of creating extra-curricular music learning opportunities.</p>	1,2,3

	<p>community, they're outside in their community, there is the kind of secular thing with the drumming and some, you know, singing and things like that. But at the same time, you have to be very careful because there is the sacred side where the music has a very distinct purpose. So it's been a bit more challenging here.</p> <p>The only way I believe that I've got the elective classes is because of what I've tried to pursue outside of the classroom in terms of bringing the students together, for example, the Egyptians singer and the Lebanese drummer, getting them together outside of the normal school context. But I've had to lead that at this stage. Because I just don't have the connections.</p>			
TR	<p>So there may be students who are engaging in community music-making that you might not necessarily know about it?</p>			
Anna	I mean I've tried to	Barriers to	Difficulty of	1,2,3

	<p>get information, I've put things in an announcement, but a lot of what I've found. I have found by chance because sometimes when you put an announcement like that, they may play something or be involved in a thing, but they don't see it as important to the school so I found people who for example played the bamboo flute, the *****, but he didn't mention it before because I asked does anyone play an instrument? And they don't see it as, you know, an instrument.</p>	culturally responsive music teaching.	<p>finding out about musical interests and abilities of students. Language of music making can exclude some students- eg "instrument", "musician".</p>	
TR	It's not an oboe or a violin.			
Anna	<p>Yeah, they say, well it's not this. Or they'll say no I don't because I don't read music because they make a judgement as to what would be valued, you know...</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice. Barriers to cultural diversity.</p>	<p>Students equate musicianship with music reading.</p>	2
TR	And what a musician looks like and sounds like?			
Anna	<p>Yeah, so they'd say I'm not one so they don't come forward and you have to really, really dredge</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice. Barriers to cultural diversity.</p>	<p>Teacher has to work hard to find students who make music outside</p>	2

	very deep.		of school.	
TR	<p>Could you use for example the student that's playing a bamboo flute, outside of the school, in some other context, use that for assessment purposes here? You know, if that child is electing to study music, do you have that flexibility? So that could be part of that student's individual programme?</p>			
Anna	<p>It's certainly a difficult thing because I believe, I mean the way it's set up, it says you should explore different cultural music, but once again, when it comes to the exam I will put forward for someone to do what they're best at, but they say you have to have a contrasting programme of four different pieces. Now I know if I put forward, for example, this boy who is a fantastic drummer – he plays four contrasting pieces on that drum, he will not score as highly because they will say, oh, you know, there's not enough variety, I mean it's too similar</p>	<p>Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.</p>	<p>Assessment requirements can be a barrier to diversity.</p> <p>Exam markers may not understand non-Western instruments.</p>	2

	<p>because the markers may not truly understand the instrument itself. So I think sometimes because of a bit of fear of not knowing themselves, that the student unfortunately...</p>			
TR	Is disadvantaged?			
Anna	Yeah. I don't understand that.	<p>Teaching philosophy.</p> <p>Barriers to cultural diversity.</p>	Examiners may be embarrassed by lack of knowledge of diverse musics and disadvantage students in their assessment.	2,3
TR	So do you think that the assessment expectation is a barrier for some students, preventing them from being recognised as successful in music?			
Anna	<p>Yeah. I think it's a bit of a barrier because what you find I think teachers end up doing is they will incorporate the students' understanding of the culture for maybe one or two pieces, but then for example he would be pushed in to do something slightly different for the</p>	Barriers to cultural diversity.	Reiteration of assessment as barrier.	

	<p>other two pieces. Because they know that they have to show this variation and repertoire so it is a bit of a barrier.</p> <p>I mean they have alternatives, they can do a composition.</p>			
TR	Does it have to be written down?			
Anna	<p>Well they do have to send through a copy, but it can be in, it doesn't have to be in a traditional form of notation, but at the same time any form of notation is not necessarily following the way it would be done culturally, because one of the reasons why we have a lot of trouble with literacy here is because with the Arabic cultures a lot of it, it's entirely oral traditions. Where there might be one person in the family that traditionally would be able to read, and that would just be the Koran. So, they're really working against, you know...</p>	Barriers to cultural diversity.	Literacy barrier disadvantaging students from oral traditions	2
TR	So when you are teaching non-Western music examples, how much do you think about			

	how that music would be taught, would be transmitted in its culture of origin?			
Anna	Well I think about it a lot and I can say this because up until this year I was teaching all of the years right through to twelve, and every single year, because its my particular interest, year twelve, year eleven, year ten, year nine, year eight, year seven, they all have incorporated into some aspects whether it's music from around the world, you know – so I don't just go, okay, this week we're doing Japan, we're singing Sakura, and then next week we're going to learn this African song, and then next week, you know – I try and focus on different parts. For example, and this really reflects from my university training I guess with year nine, well I do it with year eleven, we were looking at Balanese gamelan music and we started by actually learning on the glockenspiels about	Culturally responsive teaching. Reflection on teacher education.	Draws on university training for approach to teaching diverse musics.	3

	as close as I could come to. But I tried to teach it in the way that I'd been taught.			
TR	Okay.			
Anna	So the method of teaching it I think is part of how to learn. So if I go and say here's the music...	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	Tries to use culturally informed pedagogies	1,3
TR	Right.			
Anna	... it loses part of the purpose, and so we had a workshop on the actual instruments to get a greater understanding.			
TR	So do you talk to the students about these issues? You know, I'm teaching you in this way because...?			
Anna	I might mention it briefly. But I've moved away from doing a lot of the talking at the front. Like, do this, do that – a lot of what they've had was, you know, copying. So I felt if I explain it too much...	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	Tries not to over-explain.	3
TR	Right.			
Anna	Yeah, so what I might do is I'll say, you know, it will be an interesting challenge today because we're	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	Tries not to over-explain.	3

	learning it in a different way, but that would be about it. We wouldn't go any further into it.			
TR	No, okay.			
Anna	Because they pick it all up, I think.	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	Student pick up the messages without too much explanation.	3
TR	How much do you teach the other aspects of the context of the music? So how much do you talk about function and purpose and social meaning of the music that you teach?			
Anna	I think I teach it in the context of whatever the piece is. So, especially if we're looking at whether it's a more secular or sacred kind of thing. I teach enough so that they can respect the function of it. And especially if it's a different language – they have a greater understanding of what they're doing so that they can respect where it's coming from. But I don't really have too much allowance to go into you know, extreme depth because, I mean it is a little bit	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching	Provides some context for the music in terms of purpose and function, but focuses on experiential learning, through playing.	3

	<p>too content driven and I just try and focus on what I can do, it's just more experiencing, actually engaging in playing. But as we go along I explain those bits. Or I might give them a contextual overview kind of thing before I start.</p>			
TR	<p>Do the students use, and I'm not necessarily talking about these students, you know, in general, in your teaching experience – do they use for example the instruments, sounds, musical ideas from non-Western cultures, as springboards for their own composition?</p>			
Anna	<p>Just have to think... it's hard to say because a lot of the cultures I'm working with have had some level of influence from the Western cultures. For example, when I was working with the Pacific Islanders, I could recognise their chord progressions in things that were very...and the harmonies... So in a way that sprang from their own culture but at the same time there</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Cultural diversity.</p>	<p>Has noticed some examples of students fusing musical ideas from diverse musics.</p>	1,3

	<p>is that, kind of a Westernised styling, but it's still from what they are experiencing outside the school. So I see in that, because they were mixing around things, like especially with the harmonies. With the Arabic students, I think definitely with the drumming, I mean it's quite natural to borrow from this. For example, here's a really good example, one of the year eight students who I know can play really well on the derbakeh, where he would go into the drum kit much to the delight of all of his friends, and he would play something on there, but he's not playing what we would say is like a typical rock-beat – he was incorporating the [Lebanese] rhythmic patterns on there – so all the accent and everything. So he will relate it across into there. But in terms of, with the composition, I haven't seen as much, they are just emulating what they've heard not necessarily at this stage.</p>			
--	---	--	--	--

TR	So when they compose, in your experience, is it a lot of contemporary-style composing – are the students here into hip hop and R&B?			
Anna	Oh yeah, it's all rap. I interviewed a student who said 'I love all kinds of music, rap, hip hop, R&B'. That is what's most popular here amongst certain groups.	Reflection on current practice. Student interests and preferences.	Students mostly interested in contemporary American musics.	1
TR	So what are the good things about having a really diverse school population?			
Anna	Well I love it and I specially chose, and some students can't believe it, in fact one student said oh, are you leaving next year – and I said am I? I said where did you hear that? And he said, oh I heard from someone because you did good work here and so you got offered a job elsewhere and so you're going. So there's a real fear of people leaving.	Reflection on current practice	Commitment to this teaching position. Student expectation that she will leave soon, as others have.	3
TR	Ok.			
Anna	Yeah. So they have a lot of that feeling. But I wouldn't do that because I love teaching and the reason I like it,	Teaching philosophy. Culturally responsive teaching.	Learns from the students. Students very appreciative. Students bring	3

	<p>working with schools such as this, and I was thinking about it the other day, I'd much prefer this to my first context because I, rather selfishly, get to learn a lot from the students. Here, every day I'm learning something new and it's really like they're teaching me, which is fantastic and in the end I teach others based on what they have taught me – so that's the best thing. And you learn so much. My library of music has expanded immensely because I have all of these things that I would never be able to access previously... students will bring in music and I'd say, oh, I've got this, or they're going back home and I say, oh, if you see anything over there, bring back instruments from overseas and, some students here are so appreciative of being taught at all. It's the days that, like at the end of a class they'll shake your hand and say thank you for teaching me miss, and you know,</p>	<p>Cultural diversity.</p>	<p>music form home cultures to share.</p>	
--	--	----------------------------	---	--

	<p>that's nice. You don't get that all the time. Or it's good morning miss, you know, how are you today miss, like, just so appreciative. So you get a difference between how many generations of being here, but especially the first generation, they're just the most appreciative and valuing and, you know, you learn a lot.</p>			
TR	<p>Great. So your programme is informed by who is here, you're thinking about the different cultural groups that are in this school, but you're also including musics that are unfamiliar to the students.</p>			
Anna	<p>Because it's tempting to just go, okay, I'm going to explore what they know, and because that would be very valuable to them and I do that to an extent – but at the same time if I do that too much, I know I'm actually limiting their growth. Because it's through the school that they're going to have the opportunity to be exposed to</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p>	<p>While valuing students' prior knowledge, wants to challenge them with unfamiliar musics.</p>	1,3

	<p>unfamiliar things and the benefit here is that you generally don't have one group. So you can explore one, and it will be teaching another group and then vice-versa.</p>			
TR	<p>How do you approach the teaching of Western classical music? Do you teach the context of a classical piece in the same way you might teach about the context of a non-Western piece of music?</p>			
Anna	<p>Well I think the danger of going into a lot of background with one and then not the other is it's I feel, from my personal belief, is it's almost like you're trying to justify the work of the music a little bit in terms of, look, this is very significant to the culture and you go, oh, this and this and that. So it makes it different. Whereas I will teach a series of pieces, it's not necessarily like we're doing the whole term on, just this one thing. I generally do a term which really tries to look more in</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p> <p>Teaching philosophy.</p>	<p>Doesn't want to over-explain "world" musics, because doesn't do that for classical music. Doesn't want to look like she is justifying "world" musics.</p>	1,3

	depth at maybe two different cultures. But if I spend a long time going oh, this is here and this is the art work and then I don't for that for say when we do the Surprise Symphony – then it's like saying I need to justify this.			
TR	Right			
Anna	But I don't think it needs to be justified because I feel that we have certain concepts of music that we have to express to the students and I think we can learn that through any variety.	Reflection on current practice.	Can learn music concepts through any kind of music.	3
TR	So do you take a concept-based approach, sometimes? Do you say, we are going to explore rhythm and I'm going to talk about rhythm in the context of different music from different places?			
Anna	Well what I try to do is to integrate the cultures as much as possible, but if I am focusing on teaching a certain aspect, I will, you know, explore it on purpose through very varying repertoire. And part of that is not just doing a range of pop	Reflection on current practice. Culturally responsive teaching.	Teaches 'elements' of music through varied repertoire. Use pop music from all over the world- not just the US.	1,3

	<p>songs, I might do contemporary music to engage them but it might be contemporary music from, you know, Fiji, or it might be contemporary music from this Afghani rapper. Rather than just going through that. So in the junior years I tend to take, in the first two terms, quite a concept-based approach to build up their understanding of the language and because we really have to explicitly teach certain language elements here, because it's not to be assumed. And whilst we're doing that we're exploring a really wide range of repertoire.</p>			
TR	<p>Okay. In terms of those barriers to learning music, what else would you identify as being a barrier to you teaching in the way that you want to and in the way that you were trained, particularly in the area of multicultural music education?</p>			
Anna	<p>Sometimes barriers are things, structural elements such as to</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p>	<p>Would like to try cross-age, cross cultural</p>	<p>3</p>

	do with say a class' size or you have set class groupings whereas I might like to do something where, and what I'm actually looking at doing in the future is we're getting say, some of the more expert ones from different cultures within the school say, year nine, coming into the classroom to teach a small group.	Culturally responsive teaching.	groupings.	
TR	So some cross-age groupings, you'd like to do?			
Anna	Yeah, such as student leaderships. So recognising their understanding. You know, empowering them, so some of the ones that are a bit more outspoken are able to get up and perform in things, empowering the younger ones. Like the Egyptian singer who is very confident actually working with some of the younger ones and giving that connection. But I have to say in terms of barriers I've been quite lucky – or maybe I just don't see barriers. Because...	Reflection on current practice Teaching Philosophy	Recognising student expertise, Encouraging peer teaching. Doesn't see barriers.	2,3
TR	You see			

	opportunities.			
Anna	<p>... where ever there's something that stands in the way, I try and think around it and so I've never found that I've actually had to stop because of something. I've almost had to stop certain things, but there's always a way. If you really want to do it, you can always get around it and it just depends on what you think is the most valuable thing. Is this, you know, worth it? That's why I would have been happy to continue being a music teacher, but because I started feeling like I wanted to make, you know, even bigger changes, more at a structural level in terms of getting budgeting, that's why I went for the promotion position of head teacher. So that I had even fewer kind of barriers popping up and more power to more easily get around them. I don't know barriers.</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Teaching philosophy</p>	<p>Strength in problem solving.</p> <p>Chose HOD position so could make structural changes- more power to remove barriers.</p>	3
TR	No. Okay. So what is it about your			

	upbringing that's allowed you to be this problem solving, positive, optimistic, inclusive kind of person?			
Anna	Well I can't say there's anything particularly, although, I don't know. It's hard to see what's made a difference. I mean my aunty, she's a singer and she's very involved with different cultural groups and working with that, but...	Personal biography		
TR	What's your own ethnic background?			
Anna	Not very, see these are what the kids always ask and they've got such interesting stories that mine's very boring. Let's just, I don't know, a long time ago, I don't know, Scotland and Wales. In the school though, that's not very exciting because they can tell you, you know, they came from here and there.	Personal biography		
TR	Okay, and so your family have been in Australia for...			
Anna	Yeah, farming communities, like six generations or something. But I	Personal biography	Parents have encouraged her to be politicised,	3

	<p>guess because both my parents now are I guess academics, so they encourage you to evaluate situations and you know, really set high expectations and one of them is extremely pro-public education – she’s involved in public education so looking at that inclusiveness and opportunities for all. So she was involved in music teaching, right, this might be a reason, well they used to call like *** which is part of the south-west region, more out towards ***. So she was always involved in them so I grew up going through with, it was never seen as barriers, like they didn’t have a lot of resources and things, but she would do amazing productions and things with them and engage the students in things regardless. So I never saw that as being a reason...</p>		<p>concern for social justice.</p>	
TR	<p>So there’s an interest in social justice, politically in your family? And your family were keen that you would pursue education?</p>			
Anna	<p>It wasn’t like a</p>	<p>Personal</p>		

	pressure or something, they said, you know, you can be anything. As long as you do your best, the best garbage collector or whatever.	biography		
TR	Alright, look, it has been such a pleasure to talk to you. That was great. We've jumped around the questions.			
Anna	That's my circular thinking.			
TR	Not at all, that's just how conversations go.			

iv) Analysis of Interview- Caroline (Teacher Seattle School B)

Participants	Full Interview Text Illustration of key messages in bold type	Category	Key messages	Link to Research Question(s)
TR	What's your title here at school, Caroline?			
Caroline	I teach orchestra, three classes of orchestra and two classes of piano and I'm the music department head	Description of current practice.	HOD Performing Arts. Teaching orchestra and piano.	
TR	Okay, so you have overall administrative responsibility for music here?			
Caroline	Yep.	Description of current practice.		
TR	Do you have any responsibilities for any of the other arts, you're not looking after dance or anything else – it's just music?			
Caroline	Just music.	Description of current practice.		
TR	Just music, okay. Caroline, can you just tell me a little...			
Caroline	I have to review that – I'm actually performing arts, so I do do the drama. I'm sorry.	Description of current practice.		
TR	So do you teach drama?			
Caroline	I don't teach drama, but I am the department head so I kind of oversee it even though I don't really, I just, you know, in name only.			
TR	Do you have a dance programme here?			

Caroline	No, but they do use dance, we have a musical that we do every year and dance is a huge part of it. And so one of the drama teachers is a dancer and she teaches tap dance. Tap dance is quite a big part of the whole drama programme for them in the second part of the year.	Description of current practice.		
TR	Do most performing arts programmes not have a dance elective that the students can do?			
Caroline	Yes, they do not have an elective. At least here in Seattle.	Description of current practice.		
TR	Oh, okay, that's interesting. Can you tell me just a few biographical details, you know, can you outline your career path to where you are now?			
Caroline	Okay, I got my bachelor and master's degree at the University of New Mexico in Albuquerque New Mexico, and I moved here sixteen years ago. I taught theory and violin for a couple of years at the University of New Mexico and then as a grad student, you know, in that programme, and then I taught two years in Albuquerque as a beginning teacher and then I moved here to actually go into playing the violin. I was thinking that I was going to end up playing in the symphony and doing that whole route. I was going	Personal biography	Classically trained. Performance violin.	3

	towards the performing end, which I did for a couple of years, but I ended up coming back to teaching. And so I've been teaching you know, for fifteen years out of the sixteen years that I've been here.			
TR	At this school?			
Caroline	I taught eight years in Bellevue and this is my ninth – gosh, how is that possible, I must have taught seven years in Bellevue and then this is my ninth year here.	Description of current practice.	Nine years in current position.	
TR	And you see yourself being here for awhile?			
Caroline	I... yes, I do. I imagine this will be my last big teaching job. I mean I may, I'm looking at maybe stopping after about another six years when my kids graduate from high school, and then doing something else for a while. But I imagine this will be my last big job.	Reflection on current practice.	This will be last teaching position.	
TR	Okay, and are you managing to get performing in at all?			
Caroline	I do. I don't perform as much as I used to, I used to play all the time. And now I just do some, I play regularly with the *** Symphony which is a 'pick up' orchestra for the *** Ballet. I used to play quite a bit with the *** Ballet and did a time of recording work here in term. But it's just	Personal music participation.	Performs in symphony orchestra	3

	impossible to do that and teach, and then have kids, so...			
TR	Right. Do you just play classical violin? Do you play folk fiddle, or jazz violin or anything else?			
Caroline	A few years ago I started picking up the jazz violin and started studying with a local jazz violinist, Michael Gray, who is a violinist for Pearl Django. And so I have done some, but not a lot. I dipped my toes in, so to speak.	Personal music participation.	Plays jazz violin	3
TR	Okay. And you don't find yourself jamming with the kids at lunchtime?			
Caroline	I don't here, but I do with my son. At home. Because my son's quite a good jazz pianist, so we do at home.	Personal music participation.	Son is jazz pianist. Plays together.	
TR	That sounds good. Now you've got a great reputation here, which is why Pat Campbell recommended that I come and talk to you. Can you tell me a little bit about what you think you're doing well in this job?			
Caroline	I think that what I'm doing well is that I'm really paying attention to the kids, and their needs and what it is that I want the kids to get out of my class. For example, I have a lot of really talented kids which I am very lucky to have. But most of the kids end up going to college and they don't play music any more. And so what I	Reflection on current practice. Success of music programme. Teaching philosophy.	Responds to students' needs. Creates an environment where students feel loved and valued. Aims to create life-long music participants.	3

	<p>want for these kids is for them to have had a really excellent communal experience in music where they come into class and they have a very high level of achievement, but at the same time it be very inviting, very loving, very positive, I'm trying really hard to make sure that kids feel really loved pretty much by me for sure, but I really want them to think of music as being fun. And so when they get older they'll remember it as a positive, so maybe they will really think about going out and watching a symphony or going out and you know, playing in a chamber ensemble or, you know, just participate in music. On any level. Whether it's listening or performing, or whatever.</p>			
TR	<p>Okay, so you're thinking about them as potential life-long music learners and participants...</p>			
Caroline	<p>I am trying to, yeah. Yeah, I really want them to just pay attention to what's going on around them and I want them to be very mindful. And I'm trying to be the same way when I'm teaching.</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Success of music programme.</p> <p>Teaching philosophy.</p>	<p>Students are encouraged to be attentive and "mindful".</p>	3

TR	Do you think that reflects the general ethos of this school?			
Caroline	I think so. It's interesting, when I first came here, our school is very competitive with, you know, with other schools – extremely competitive. And I in nature, I'm very competitive in spirit myself, but I am not competitive as a person. Like, I really want to do well, but I don't do well to beat somebody. I want to do well because I really want to aspire to do the best that I can.	Reflection on school culture. Reflection on current practice. Success of music programme. Teaching philosophy.	School has competitive culture, but she is intrinsically motivated to do her best.	3
TR	Right.			
Caroline	And I think that the difference for me is, I don't have that huge competitive spirit. And although I've done well and everything, but I think that that is little bit different, because I do think that there's a huge competition factor. Which is a little bit different than what I'm interested in.	Reflection on current practice. Success of music programme. Teaching philosophy.		
TR	Yeah. I'm sure it's not just this school...			
Caroline	Oh yeah, I mean there are different...			
TR	... competition seems to be a big part of school culture...			
Caroline	Right, and I'm just, I don't want that. I think everybody can be great.	Reflection on current practice. Success of music	Belief that all students can achieve	3

		programme. Teaching philosophy.		
TR	No, I'm with you on that. I've always been a 'give everybody a certificate for participating' kind of a girl.			
Caroline	Yeah, I mean I think it's cool that people win and everything, but just because you may not have played, you know, a certain way one day, you might have the next day.	Reflection on current practice. Success of music programme. Teaching philosophy.	Competitions give unfair 'fickle' view of student talent.	2,3
TR	So what do you think learning music does for a young person?			
Caroline	I think that it gives them all sorts of things. I think that it gives them again, a place where they feel they are a part of a group , I feel it's already an automatic social network. It gives them a place to really work on getting better. Or they can screw up completely and it's still okay . And next week they can play a little better and be patted on the back and that's okay. And I think it's a really good place for people to come and you know, work as a group. You know, where they really do learn those intricate lessons of how to sit next to someone that may not be your best friend but yet you	Perceived benefits of music education. Success of music programme.	Social benefits Learning to work as a group Risk taking in safe environment. Technical performance skills	3

	<p>get along by two months out or whatever. And you learn social skills, you're learning personal skills, you're learning... you know, and then of course you're learning all of the technical skills that you're, you know, you're reading on the page and you're doing something else with your hands and then you're paying attention, you know, even to something else. So multitasking, I think that it's a... I think that you're learning a ton in these types of groups.</p>			
TR	<p>The kids, perhaps, don't rationalise those reasons for themselves. What do you think attracts them initially to music? You know, why did they choose to study music at school, do you think?</p>			
Caroline	<p>Well, I think that it's like what it was for me. It's fun to learn something new and actually progress and do well at it. And to hear something that sounds good. You know, that you're really proud of. And I think that that's what it is.</p>	<p>Perceived benefits of music education.</p> <p>Success of music programme.</p>	<p>Students choose to study music because it is fun and they are motivated by making progress.</p>	3
TR	<p>So you think they're intrinsically motivated by the music making experience itself, and then those other benefits hit them as they go along?</p>			
Caroline	<p>Yeah.</p>			
TR	<p>Okay. I just want to talk a little bit about some</p>			

	<p>cultural issues – you’re teaching orchestra a lot of the time. Your demographic at this school is a diverse one, within a middle to upper class kind of community. Can you tell me a little bit about the demographic of the school and the demographic of the kids who are selecting to be in your orchestra?</p>			
Caroline	<p>Well, I wish that my orchestra was a mirror of the demographics of our school – I do wish that, but it’s not. We have mainly Caucasian, as you say middle to upper class students, white students. We have quite a few Asian students. I do have a couple of African American students and I don’t know, one or two maybe Hispanic kids. I think it’s a lot of the reason why the demographics are so different by the time they are in high school is what we were talking about earlier on – that how, what they were given in elementary school, which is really the only place where a kid can start playing an instrument. Because it’s very difficult for them to start by the time they’re in middle-school and it’s pretty much basically impossible to do by the time they’re in high school – if they want to.</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Cultural diversity.</p> <p>Barriers to cultural diversity.</p>	<p>Orchestra does not reflect the cultural diversity of the school.</p> <p>Regrets the lack of diversity.</p> <p>If students haven’t had the opportunity to begin learning an instrument in elementary school, it is too late to start at high school.</p>	1,2,3

TR	<p>Okay. You and I know that there are multiple music histories and multiple music stories in the world. Do you think that your students understand that there's more to music than the story of European Western classical music or the story of contemporary American music? That there's more happening musically in the world than that?</p>			
Caroline	<p>I think they fundamentally understand it, but they don't really get it. Because we don't do enough of that here. I mean I can guarantee you at least I don't. I wish that I did, and that's something that is for me becoming more and more important, especially as I get more students who come from all different places in the universe. And it's hard, though, for someone like me who's been doing this now for twenty-some-odd years and for me, because I don't know. I don't have the education to really go in and start talking about, you know, Balanese music or you know, African music or you know, these different types of music. And I would love to and I did get a little bit of a taste of that when I was doing the IB programme which I loved, but again it was something where I</p>	<p>Reflection on current practice.</p> <p>Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.</p> <p>Teaching philosophy.</p>	<p>Students don't really understand global music. Not enough exposure to it.</p> <p>Lack of experience , knowledge and time are barriers to more culturally responsive and informed music teaching.</p> <p>Believes that cultural responsiveness is important and teaching and regrets not doing more in this area.</p> <p>IB programme was more accommodating of cultural diversity.</p>	1,2,3

	had to go and I had to learn about it before I was really able to bring it to my classroom. And you know, it's a time issue , and it's tough to be able to bring all of that in. But, yes, I do believe it's a huge, hugely important part of teaching and but I don't do enough of it , for sure.			
TR	It sounds like there are some very real barriers for you.			
Caroline	Yeah, I think it's tricky.			
TR	Do you think that, you know, if we imagined a world where you're not constrained by the performance ensembles that you have and the kind of repertoire that you teach – if you either were teaching the IB programme or you had the flexibility to do things a little bit differently, would there be a logic to having a music programme that responded to or was informed by the demographic of the students that are here in this community?			
Caroline	I think that would be a blast.	Culturally responsive teaching	It would be great if music education was more culturally responsive and less driven by competition repertoire.	1,2,3
TR	Would it make sense to do that?			
Caroline	Oh, I think it would be	Culturally	It would be	1,2,3

	<p>the coolest thing ever because I mean, I just think about the kids – for example Vietnamese music. I have quite a few kids who are Vietnamese. I know nothing about their music at all. And I don't think the kids really understand what it is that they know. You know, so it would be really fun to think about, so this year we're going to choose five kids, you know, cultures, we're going to do Vietnamese, we're going to do Somalian, we're going to do you know, southern Mexican music, you know what I mean. And really get specific with different areas where people's families are from. I think that would be great, but again it's a time issue and it's a how do I have the resources to even be able to do that? Instruments, you know, get the recordings...</p>	<p>responsive teaching</p> <p>Barriers to culturally responsive teaching</p>	<p>great to respond to ethnic backgrounds represented in the school.</p> <p>Time and resources (instruments, recordings) are barriers.</p>	
TR	<p>...and perhaps teaching with a whole other pedagogical approach.</p>			
Caroline	<p>So it's a little tricky. I mean I think it would be a blast but I think that it would be difficult because at the same time, you know, I think that there are two ways to look at something like that. You have this performing aspect where I'm really lucky again, I've had a pretty decent orchestra</p>	<p>Culturally responsive teaching.</p> <p>Barriers to culturally responsive teaching</p>	<p>Students are able to learn about Western Classical music in depth with instruments, scores, recordings. Concerned that teaching of global musics would lack</p>	1,2,3

	<p>where we're able to play these great bodies of literature for the Western culture and so we're able to learn about that. But, at the same time, if you're doing that, how do you balance that with learning this and how can those kids really be able to get as much out of it if they're not performing on the instruments or understanding the music or how to listen to it and how to read it and you know, whatever?</p>		depth due to lack of resources.	
TR	<p>Sure. So you'd worry that maybe you were being superficial in what you did or it was token in some way?</p>			
Caroline	<p>I'm not sure I would think it was token, because I think that just even getting some sort of sense of the music and a basic understanding is a really cool... but it's hard to just do everything. You know, it's like you have to kind of choose what you're going to do.</p>	<p>Culturally responsive teaching. Barriers to culturally responsive teaching</p>	<p>Even a basic understanding would be valuable, but time and balance are issues.</p>	1,2,3
TR	<p>I notice that some literature suggests that we should choose to do one 'world' music and do that in depth, thinking that from that, kids will transfer some understandings. You know, that they will develop an understanding of the fact that there are many musics in the world and feel that 'I know</p>			

	about this one in-depth and it's opened my ears and my eyes to the possibilities of others. Would that be a possible way to approach it?			
Caroline	I think that's a really good idea.	Culturally responsive teaching.	Doing one "world" music well may be a good idea.	1,3
TR	How do you think the students would feel if you said "we're going to explore the musical heritages of some of you in this class".			
Caroline	I think they would at first go, no! And then I think once we got into it they'd be totally great. You know, any kind of change for kids, they all hate it.	Culturally responsive teaching	There may be some initial resistance from students.	1,2,3
TR	Right.			
Caroline	But I do think that they'd probably love it. You know. Realistically I do believe they probably would.	Culturally responsive teaching.	However, they would love to explore the musical heritages of class members.	3
TR	Do you know every student that I've spoken to so far in Auckland, Sydney and now here has said 'oh, I'd love that'. I talked to some little boys from Iran and when I when I asked them how they would feel if the teacher said we're going to listen to some music from Iran, both of their dads were particularly into traditional Iranian musics, they said oh we'd be so proud.			

Caroline	Oh how nice.			
TR	Do you think there's a logic to children, as students in America, all learning about first American musics?			
Caroline	I think that should be something on the table just as anything else. I do. I think that people have to have a lot of respect for that. But again, I think that I'm kind of one of those people that believes that we have to have respect for all of the cultures, not just one. Not Western, not American-Indian, not Iranian, over anything else. I think that you know, we're all people and we all have different histories and I think that it's important to look at them all, and have respect for those.	Indigenous musics	Indigenous musics should be respected, but all cultures should be regarded equally.	1,3
TR	Sure.			
Caroline	So I don't know if I'd say that any more above than anything else.			
TR	So you don't see a special position for indigenous musics?			
Caroline	Well, yeah, and you know, it's interesting because now that I live up here... well when I lived in New Mexico American-Indian music was very big and it was part of the culture, more so than it is here for sure. And so when I was there, it was around and I think people had a different	Indigenous musics	American-Indian music is not well known here, unlike Mexican American-Indian music in New Mexico	1,2,3

	viewpoint of it. And it's interesting because here of course the American-Indian population is large here, you know, in the north-west, but it's not the same as it was in New Mexico.			
TR	Why is that, do you think?			
Caroline	You know, I don't really know, I'm not sure exactly. But I do think that it's important to have respect for their music and have an understanding. And I, yeah, it would be great to be able to do that.	Place of indigenous musics.	Respect and understanding of indigenous musics is important.	3
TR	Sure. So do you think that music educators have a responsibility to counter racism in their teaching?			
Caroline	Absolutely.	Anti-racist teaching	Teachers should counter racism	1,3
TR	So how do you think that music education is placed to do that?			
Caroline	I think that what you're talking about right now, just with learning about different people's music from their different culture is the best way to do it. Because it's interesting. People love hearing it. And if you're part of that culture you'll really love it. And when you know how much pride as your Iranian boys said, when they felt that they had so much pride, then maybe they would have an empathy or an understanding for	Anti-racist teaching	Best way to counter racism is by learning about diverse musics. Students can learn empathy and understanding through sharing musics that may be culturally important to them.	1,3

	<p>another student who, when they listened to their Hungarian dance music, were they filled, you know, with that pride. Or, you know, any kind of music, it doesn't matter. So yeah, I think that that's probably a really great thing and we all need to think about it a lot more – I know I do.</p>			
TR	<p>One of the young people said an interesting thing at the previous school. She said that she felt that the emphasis on competitions and festivals worked against diversity, in that you need to choose repertoire that judges were going to expect and know and that were considered appropriate for competition in festivals. So you were unlikely to choose a student composition, or some more alternative repertoire for that reason. Do you think that was an insight that makes sense in terms of your experience?</p>			
Caroline	<p>I think that's a great insight, especially from a kid.</p>	<p>Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.</p>	<p>Festivals and competitions limit repertoire. It is insightful when students recognise this.</p>	2
TR	<p>Right.</p>			
Caroline	<p>She's on, you know, I think that that's probably right on. And I think that for programmes that are large, like probably the one that you spoke with,</p>		<p>There is a need for change to music education programmes to better reflect</p>	

	and our programme and a few others, I think it's hard for programmes like that where they've done things for so long a certain way for there to be change. And I think that, you know, we need to change that – you know?		cultural diversity. Change is difficult.	
TR	Really?			
Caroline	It's a little tough, but you know I do believe that that is important.			
TR	Yeah. What would your parent community think if you were suddenly.			
Caroline	Realistically my parent community I believe would probably do anything that I felt was right. And they would probably support me a hundred percent.	Parent and community involvement.	Parents and community would support change 100%	1,2,3
TR	Isn't that good?			
Caroline	Yeah, I do think that they would... I think that, you know, there are some parents who would definitely want me to do the normal stuff that we usually do, but I think they would, I personally think probably the parent community would be extremely supportive of change. More so than probably I'm even comfortable with.		Parents would support change possibly even more than she would be comfortable with.	
TR	That's wonderful.			
Caroline	Yeah, I think it is too.			
TR	Would you feel able to access culture bearers from the community to come and help you with			

	expertise?			
Caroline	Honestly, probably they would be the first people here. You know, I think they would love to do that. And you know, I think one of the things again is being a high school teacher that is so regimented in my own little world, I think that it's hard to really be mindful of remembering to go out and ask the community for help in doing things. Or if you want to do something new, there's probably a ton of people who would love to come in and talk about... Well I know for example the University of Washington, they've got a huge gamelan, and you know, if I called over there and said hey, you know, can we come and could you do something, they'd be all up for that. I'm sure that's true. But it's just a matter of me doing it.	Inclusion of culture bearers.	Engaging with the community is easier said than done. Culture bearers would help willingly, and the university would be supportive with resources. The challenge is taking the time to make the changes.	1,2,3
TR	Do you think sometimes, you know, that we imagine barriers because things feel hard and we sometimes imagine barriers that might not be there, in fact?			
Caroline	Oh yeah. I think the barrier that I find myself at least in, is that it just takes so much time to do what I'm doing already, so for me to think about going and adding one more step to going over to	Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	Time is a major barrier.	2

	the university and doing that, it just adds one more step to my day, it's like oh-my-gosh, it's so prolonging.			
TR	No, I understand that.			
Caroline	But I think it's important to do.			
TR	Yeah. I had an interesting experience in a New Zealand school with around thirty percent Indian population. In this school no Indian students choose to study music, at all. This appears to be because their parents are working very hard put their kids through medical or law school and they don't see music as a useful academic pathway, leading to a good job. So, you could think that Indian families are not interested in music education, and I couldn't find an Indian student to talk to. However, in my taxi back to the airport I had an Indian taxi driver and I was asking him about music education and what he thought about it and he said oh, my kids are at that school where I'd just been interviewing and I said how would you feel if the music programme included something about classical Indian music, and he said, oh, well I'm a trained classical Indian singer! And he asked 'Are they wanting someone to help			

	them out?’			
	INTERRUPTION			
TR	<p>So the people are out there, I think, that want to help.</p> <p>In terms of creativity, some of the kids that have had a chance to listen to some ‘world’ music say, you know, the sounds, the musical ideas, the instruments from non-Western music would be really inspiring for composition. Can you see a place for getting kids composing and creating using some non-Western music inspiration?</p>			
Caroline	<p>I think that would be really great. I have to say that one of the things that as you probably may have found already, we don’t do enough composition in our teaching here, at least in the United States that I know of. We do some and you know, as we talked about the IB classes because they’re required, but it’s very difficult to get the kids to... I shouldn’t say get the kids because it’s a total teacher issue – again it’s one more element of the teaching structure that I think people have a hard time getting into. Especially if you didn’t do a lot of it in college. And so for me, I think that just composition period would be amazing, to get</p>	Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	<p>No opportunity to compose with non-Western music as source of inspiration.</p> <p>Composition is a gap in the existing programme. It would be great, but it doesn’t currently happen except within the IB programme.</p>	2,3

	into that. But we don't really do enough of it.			
TR	So is there not a class that kids can elect, a composition class?			
Caroline	No.			
TR	So...			
Caroline	I mean there are students who definitely do composition. We definitely have kids who do it, but it's not part of their curriculum, here.	Reflection on current practice.	Some students compose in their own time.	
TR	Oh, I see. So essentially you're developing your own curriculum here? There isn't a book that says Music Education in Seattle should include the following.			
Caroline	Right. Although they're working on that. Finally. After many years.			
TR	And in that, do you know whether there's more of an emphasis on composition?			
Caroline	There is an element in there, on composition which I think is great. Yeah.	Description of current practice.	Curriculum in development includes composition requirement.	
TR	Right. So at the moment would it be a matter of a principal deciding that we can fund a teacher to teach composition class, it would be a choice that schools would have – to offer that?			
Caroline	I would think that probably it would be school-by-school kind of thing. They have these things that they're, I can't remember the name,	Reflection on current practice. Barriers to culturally	It's a challenge to include everything that's required in the programme.	2

	<p>they're CPBAs or something like, I should know, but I... anyway there's an element in there with composition. There are four different types of things that you can do. Sight reading, compositions, writing across the curriculum and there's another element, and I can't remember what it is. Because this is totally new. And I haven't gone to the class yet. But I know there are three parts of it. But I do know that the element of composition is being brought into, or hopefully will be brought into the curriculum so that's something that we need to do. I can say, for me, several years ago I started doing the writing across the curriculum, so I require my kids now to write quite a bit. Not quite a bit, but enough to where it will work. And so if somebody said to me, Caroline, you need to put this into your curriculum – well I'm definitely going to do it, but it's hard to add those elements.</p>	responsive teaching.		
TR	<p>Right, and there's nothing that says for a student to receive credits for the music that they've elected to do, they need to demonstrate that they've had experiences in composition. The requirement is not there</p>			

	yet?			
Caroline	No, not yet.			
TR	How do you choose your repertoire? At the moment you've got some...			
Caroline	Well, what I do is I really think about what students that I have and where my strengths are. You know, for example this year I'm really lucky because I have this incredible brass section – just amazing. And I have an amazing woodwind section. And so my strings are pretty strong, but they're not nearly as strong as my winds are. Also I have a fantastic cello section and I have a really good violin section. And so this year I've been able to choose some really tricky, I think, great repertoire. And so, you know, like for our first concert I'm actually going to be able to get away with doing the Shostakovich Festival Overture and Mars, you know, by Holst, and the Fourth Movement of the Berlioz, March to the Scaffold, and I'm really lucky because I've never had a group like this. And I don't know what happened, but...	Repertoire choices	Repertoire choices are based on the current strengths of the students as well as seasonal themes.	1,2,3
TR	Gosh, that sounds like a heavy...			
Caroline	Yeah, it's a pretty heavy thing. We're doing it because it's pumpkin season. We have to have			

	all this dark, you know... and so all the music is pretty intense.			
TR	Yeah, and they can play it. That's great			
Caroline	They can do that and so I choose a repertoire where I'm thinking that first of all I have the students to play, that we can do it well, and that they're going to get something out of it... hopefully.			
TR	Sure. Do they get to say or nominate any repertoire ever? You know, choose?			
Caroline	Yeah. We try and do some movie music and you know musical stuff.	Repertoire choices	Students can choose repertoire	3
TR	Do you have any formal way of finding out who the kids are, musically? Like when you have a new group of students, do they fill out anything or have an interview with you or a conference or anything where they get to say, these are the many musics that I am into and know about and are important to me?			
Caroline	No, but I think that's great idea. I try to listen to them, I talk to them, they usually come in, I'll have them come in and play for me and we talk some. You know, who are they studying with, what are they into, I try to find out if they're into sports and stuff like that. But you know, no, I don't do it about the music and that's a really great idea.	Finding out about student musical backgrounds and preferences.	It would be a good idea to conference with students about this.	1,3

TR	So they're all learning from a teacher outside of school?			
Caroline	No, uh-uh.			
TR	Oh, they don't have to. For some kids that would be a barrier.			
Caroline	Oh, yeah, and I don't want it to be a barrier. It's already a barrier, I don't want any more barriers.	Barriers to music participation.	Students don't have to have a teacher outside of school as this would be an economic barrier for some.	3
TR	Okay. You've talked a bit about the things that might be barriers for you in terms of having a more diverse programme. Your own teacher education, was there much about world music in your own teacher preparation?			
Caroline	No. There really wasn't. I mean there is a little bit maybe, but very little.	Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Teacher Education did not include "world" music component of any significance.	2
TR	There probably would be now.			
Caroline	Yeah, a lot more now. It started to kind of come in after I'd finished college.			
TR	Okay. And are there professional development opportunities for you in that area?			
Caroline	There are, but not a lot. Not a lot here at least. Some of the places that I get the best information is from, or at least involved in playing string		There are some professional development opportunities, but not many.	2

	instruments or you know, full orchestra, is at like ASTA conventions, the American String Teachers' Association. They're terrific. They also have some, they have some things over at the university, but not a lot. You know, it's unfortunate that they don't have more.			
TR	And are there lots of text resources, audio resources, that are easily findable for you on...			
Caroline	There probably are, there probably are but I personally, I'd have to say that it hasn't been something that I've...	Barriers to culturally responsive teaching.	Hasn't looked into resources to support a culturally responsive programme.	2
TR	You've been looking for. No.			
Caroline	In all honesty.			
TR	Fair enough. Alright, that's lovely, thank you so much for telling me all those things – it's just so interesting for me, really helpful.			

v) Analysis of Interview: Silesi (Student New Zealand School A)

Participants	Full Interview Text Illustration of key messages in bold type	Key Messages	Category	Link to Research Question(s)
TR	Please talk about what you enjoy about learning music at school.			
Silesi	As an older student at Papatoetoe, like a senior student, now, like learning and knowing music, I want to teach other people, like you sort of let them feel the way you felt about music, like really passionate about music, and its good to see other people, its good to know that they feel the same way, and when they feel the same way its really great to be in music, and like helping others know about music to make music grow.	Reflection on music learning experience. Personal beliefs.	Loves to share his passion for music with others	3
TR	So, you really enjoy other people's enjoyment of music?			
Silesi	Yeah, I do.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Enjoys others' enjoyment of music.	
TR	So, what kind of music do you play?			
Silesi	It's a pretty	Description of	Plays a range of	1

	massive range. Like there's classical and there's reggae and rock and then R&B.	current music participation.	pop and classical styles.	
TR	And what instruments do you play?			
Silesi	I play the bass guitar and I sing and I can play the drums too.	Description of current music participation.	Sings, plays bass and drums	1
TR	And what's your favourite singing style?			
Silesi	R&B. Gospel.	Music interests and preferences.	Loves R&B and Gospel	1
TR	You're not into Hip Hop and rap.			
Silesi	Yeah probably rap, but in a singing way, you know how they've joined singing and rap, so I don't see me rapping. I'm good with lyrics but in like a more soulful, R&B way.	Music interests and preferences.	Is good with lyrics. Likes soulful music.	1
TR	Do you write your own material?			
Silesi	Yep	Description of current music participation.	Likes to compose.	1
TR	What style do you write in?			
Silesi	More of R&B, that's sort of my style, sort of Christian Gospel songs.	Description of current music participation.	Composes gospel songs.	1
TR	So your lyrics are Christian messages?			
Silesi	More like sort of love songs.	Description of current music	Composes love songs.	1

		participation.		
TR	And your family? Is there a lot of music making in your family?			
Silesi	Yeah my brother's, my brother's really...he's got like about 50 songs written now but his music still hasn't been advertised yet, he's still working through that...and my dad has his own studio at home, it's not professional, but it's still good, because he's a computer technician, so that helps him with all the computer stuff.	Family music participation.	Father and brother are musicians – dad has studio at home.	1
TR	Do you read and write notation?			
Silesi	I'm not that good at it. I'm more like... I play by ear. I can write it, but I'd probably need help.	Self perception of musical ability. Barriers to music participation.	Plays by ear. Not confident with written literacy.	2
TR	Do you have to simplify things to write them down?			
Silesi	Yeah. I'm getting there though.	Self perception of musical ability.	Is working on literacy skills.	2,3
TR	Are you involved in any cultural groups here?			
Silesi	I was in the Samoan group for [Auckland School A].	Description of current music participation	Was in Samoan cultural group at school.	1
TR	Did you perform at Polyfest?			
Silesi	Yeah	Description of current music participation.	Performed at Polyfest.	1

TR	Do your parents want you to be a musician? Do they see that as a career for you?			
Silesi	Yeah. I do art too. And it's pretty strong. They're really supportive of what I do.	Reflection on current music participation.	Parents support his interests.	3
TR	So, you might be an artist as well as a musician.			
Silesi	Yeah, my parents really support me and they're really proud of me. Because sometimes they may think I've been doing wrong, or doing bad at school because I'll come home late, but it's just that I'm practising.	Reflection on current music participation. Personal biography.	Parents are supportive. Is diligent with music practice.	1
TR	It's not a detention then. <i>[laughs]</i> .			
Silesi	No <i>[laughs]</i>			
TR	What about sport?			
Silesi	Yeah, I play in the 1st XV and I did Samoan Cricket for school and I did Waka ama for school.	Personal biography	High sporting achievement	
TR	So, the school must love you?			
Silesi	Oh it's alright, cos I like to keep busy. It might be hard but I like to challenge myself.	Personal philosophy.	Likes to challenge himself.	
TR	And are you very involved musically at church?			
Silesi	Yeah, I'm in the band for church. I	Reflection on current music	Is in church band. It's hard	

	find it hard to go to practice for that.	participation.	to fit that in.	
TR	So, no sleeping in and lying around the house for you.			
Silesi	No, I go to bed at about 11 every night and then try to get up in the morning.	Personal biography.	Is busy and diligent.	
TR	What do you plan to do when you leave school?			
Silesi	I'll probably go to Uni and study arts and music, because these are probably my two strong main points. I do drama at school too. It's pretty strong too, so I could go any way with that.	Aspirations for the future.	Plans to go to university and study arts.	
TR	Why did you choose to study music at school, instead of just making music outside of school?			
Silesi	Because I want to grow. All musicians want to grow, and like write their own stuff, write music. I want to be at the top. I thought I could learn and grow more as a student just add on more information to what I know. I knew music but like when I started learning it, it wasn't as good as it	Reflection on current music participation. Personal beliefs/philosophy.	Chose music at school because wants to develop as a musician. Very motivated to achieve excellence.	

	is now.			
TR	In what way do you think that the music programme here is successful?			
Silesi	Probably just all the gear that they've offered us. I know that some schools are fortunate to have like guitars and probably a studio, like a nice one. Probably just how they've set it up for us and like all the...how they have the...when we go out for concerts and that. It's like we enjoy going to music, if it was like some other schools, we'd probably just sit there and do music, but here there's outside stuff to go to.	Success of music programme.	Appreciates school music resources and performance opportunities outside of school.	3
TR	So, you've got lots of opportunities to perform.			
Silesi	They have like in town, there's this guy, an opera singer, he was singing and our school got like about 10 tickets and I got one of those.	Success of music programme.	Appreciates opportunities through school to see performances.	3
TR	And what did you think?			
Silesi	It was really good. It inspired me hard out.	Success of music programme.	Seeing others' perform is inspiring.	3
TR	Did it? So, you			

	quite like some classical music as well.			
Silesi	Yeah. It's really nice. I sang at this New Zealand Music Month thing in an old people's home, in town at the library, me and my brother sang his original. That was the first time we've performed together. It was quite nice.	Reflection on current music participation.	Likes some classical music. Enjoyed performing with his brother.	3
TR	So, are you measuring the success of the programme here by the opportunities that you are getting? What about how inclusive it is? Do you feel that other kids feel the same way that you feel?			
Silesi	For me, it's that I want to grow more. I wouldn't really know about how other people think. That's why I try to get everyone involved. We have assessments at school and we have groups. That's when you can like form a group and if people are not enjoying it -you can just help them out and join them in your group.	Success of music programme. Personal beliefs/philosophy.	Aims for personal growth. Tries to include and involve others as much as possible.	
TR	So you're quite good at spreading			

	the joy I take it.			
Silesi	Yeah			
TR	What do you think are the benefits for you as a person from learning music? What does it do for you personally?			
Silesi	There's heaps of stuff that I want to do, that's why I try and open my options. I try to learn as much as I can in each subject.	Perceived benefits of music education. Personal beliefs/philosophy.	Wants to learn as much as possible.	
TR	So, you're working pretty hard in your other subjects.			
Silesi	The subjects that I am doing like the ones I know I'll go far in, I try my best in those. But I don't slack off in the other ones.	Personal beliefs/philosophy.	Works hard in all subjects.	
TR	So what are your other subjects?			
Silesi	Maths and English and Media Studies	Personal biography		
TR	You sound pretty goal focused. It sounds like you are keen to make the best of the opportunities you have.			
Silesi	Yeah, I am.			
TR	In your opinion, what kinds of cultural and educational background does a good music teacher need?			
Silesi	A really good music background,	Success of music programme.	Good teachers have sound	3

	probably like with the theory side of things. Fun music, like when they are teaching it, probably really good at playing an instrument. It could just be one, but if it's a range that's even better. And probably just communicating and like knowing how we think. It's good when we think alike.	Beliefs about quality music education.	music knowledge and can communicate well with students, and understands them.	
TR	What kinds of music should be in the music programme?			
Silesi	Classical should still be there because it's really good for others to learn how it was back then. And the music that's there, is like all sorts of notes and it can really help with composition.	Choices of repertoire. Beliefs about quality music education.	Classical music teaches about the history of music.	
TR	So that theory side...			
Silesi	That should be really strong because our days people are more like practical but once they get older they know...and like composition starts coming in, they're gonna want to write their own stuff and it's harder for them to learn	Beliefs about quality music education. Success of the music programme.	Need to learn theory when you are young. Need theory knowledge for composition.	3

	when they are older. It's easier to push it when they are little.			
TR	What about music from different parts of the world?			
Silesi	Yeah, because there will be heaps of range of people that come to our school...	Cultural diversity. Culturally responsive music education.	Music content should reflect multicultural nature of the school.	1,3
TR	So, you think those students should be able to learn about their musics at school?			
Silesi	That way you can involve them too, they won't feel left out.	Culturally responsive music education.	Culturally responsive music education is more inclusive.	3
TR	So, music is a way of including people			
Silesi	Yeah.			
TR	You have quite a big Indian community here, but they don't do music?			
Silesi	But they are more sporty. I know one guy that plays the guitar.	Cultural diversity.	Indian students don't choose music.	2
TR	Do you know anything about Indian music?			
Silesi	Yep, probably just Bollywood, like that whole sort of scene. There are dancers at school, and I think our school supports their Bollywood dancing groups and that.	Reflection on school culture. Cultural diversity.	Indian students choose to belong to Bollywood dance groups at school.	1

TR	Do you want to learn about the music of the Pacific in your classes? Do think of Samoan music as something to study?			
Silesi	Yep. That would be really nice. But like um, it would be good to arrange, not only just Samoan, because other kids would probably feel left out, so you'd do different, other..., and it's good cos how we have genres of music but it would be pretty good if we had like music from other different places. I reckon there's probably a way that they would get involved if we had like Indian music studies at our school.	Culturally responsive music education.	Would like to study Samoan music at school but not in a way that would exclude others. Would like to learn about musics from different places. That might encourage Indian students to elect music.	1,3
TR	How important do you think it is to learn about the stories and the history of the music that you are learning? Like what the music means for the people who made it?			
Silesi	That's really important cos it's sort of like a respect thing. In cultures they have certain rules and I	Personal beliefs/ philosophy.	Need to be respectful of other musical cultures.	3

	think we should respect that. Cos there's like boundaries to other peoples music.			
TR	Would it bother you if someone took a traditional Samoan song and used it and changed it?			
Silesi	No, cos it depends what sort of culture you are. There are some cultures that won't allow that.	Cultural diversity. Personal beliefs/ philosophy.	Some cultures are more sensitive than others to sharing their musics with people outside of the culture.	
TR	But you wouldn't mind that?			
Silesi	No, because that's sort of like growing for them. If it works for them it's OK.	Cultural diversity. Personal beliefs/ philosophy.	Personally happy to share for the benefit of others.	
TR	So, you think its ok to take musical ideas and use them and adapt them.			
Silesi	Yep, as long as they are growing as a person and it makes them feel good.	Cultural diversity. Personal beliefs/ philosophy.	Is happy to share musics for the benefit of others.	3
TR	Have you had a chance to evaluate your course and say what you think about it?			
Silesi	I'd say it's pretty good because the teachers really support me and they are always there for me, and they're like pushing	Success of music programme. Self perception of musical ability.	Teachers are supportive- helping him to learn theory.	3

	the theory and I know they are trying to push the theory and that's probably my main goal for music right now.			
TR	Have you had a chance to tell the teachers what you think about the programme?			
Silesi	I think they know because I really enjoy it and they can see that.	Success of music programme.	Teachers sense his enjoyment of music classes.	3
TR	Have you had many opportunities to perform music other than Samoan music or R&B?			
Silesi	Probably my last performances for my assessments was from Les Miserable, that was really good because it was a different range for me and different style and it's good because I am growing not just in R&B but in another genre.	Reflection on current music participation.	Performed music form Les Miserable to extend repertoire	
TR	How important is it do you think for students to have the music that they identify with in the music programme?			
Silesi	Yeah, because you want to be able to get into it, but you wouldn't know how, like with the history of R&B.	Beliefs about quality music education.	Important for students to identify with music programme content.	3
TR	Have you had a			

	chance to do that?			
Silesi	Yeah, like we had a chance to study like the Negro music and that was pretty good.	Beliefs about quality music education.	Enjoyed learning about Black American music history.	
TR	Has the music that you learn in school made a difference to the music you make out of school?			
Silesi	Yeah it has, because when I first started it was probably just music I had heard by ear, or just music my dad taught me and when I started learning at school it opened up a lot of music that I didn't know about , and it was pretty good because that's what I wanted. It has helped grow as a person and as a musician.	Perceived benefits of music education.	Learning music at school has opened up his music world. Learning to read and write music is important. Has moved on from aural/oral music transmission experienced at home.	3
TR	What's more important to you, making music at school or making music out of school?			
Silesi	Both, because other people see you and they get inspired and that's the same out of school too.	Perceived benefits of music education.	Likes to inspire others-in and out of school.	3
TR	It seems really important to you to inspire others and get people			

	involved. What do you think your future career will be?			
Silesi	Probably a school music teacher. Either an art or music teacher.		Wants to me a music or Arts teacher.	

v) Analysis of Interview- Christos (Student Sydney School C)

Participants	Full Interview Text Illustration of key messages in bold type	Category	Key messages	Link to Research Question(s)
TR	And how old are you, Christos?			
Christos	Sixteen.	Personal Biography		
TR	Sixteen. Right, and Christos, where are you from? Where is your family from?			
Christos	Basically a suburb away from Picnic Point, two suburbs, it's really local.	Personal Biography		
TR	Yep, so this is your local high school? And have you got other family here at this school?			
Christos	No, but my brother is coming in year seven.	Personal Biography		
TR	Right. And your family, "Christos" sounds like a Greek name. Is that right?			
Christos	My dad was from Greece, he came over here when he was a child. But my grandparents were born over there, lived their life then came over after the war, I think, yeah.	Personal Biography		
TR	And have you been to Greece?			
Christos	Not myself.	Personal Biography		

TR	Okay, so you've got relatives there?			
Christos	Yep.			
TR	Can you tell me a little bit about the things that you enjoy doing at school and you know, for fun outside of school?			
Christos	Well music obviously. It's a big part of my life as well as art.	Music interests and preferences.	Music and art are school and home leisure activities.	
TR	What kind of art do you like making?			
Christos	Well if you saw the works on the doors, that was mine. So I like mixed media, post-modern, anything like, and straight art as well – not graffiti. Stencilling and drawing, and yeah – so I really like creating stuff.	Personal biography.		
TR	Excellent. And as a musician, what sort of music do you like to listen to?			
Christos	A lot, I think I got influenced by my dad who was very into Led Zeppelin and the classic rock bands like that. He had a heavy influence on me. I really like blues and roots.	Music interests and preferences.	Likes rock, blues and roots music.	
TR	But you like the old rock?			
Christos	Old rock. And some new. Like Jack	Music interests and		

	Johnson, the very acoustic, mellow kind of stuff...	preferences.		
TR	Right.			
Christos	Also, the new kind of, I like Muse, they're a band that have just recently come out that I think are quite good.	Music interests and preferences.		
TR	And Australian pop music?			
Christos	Not really...	Music interests and preferences.		
TR	You're not a pop music kind of guy.			
Christos	I dislike that kind of being subject to mainstream – like artists are kind of forced to follow a structure but you know, the only guarantee is the mainstream appeal, it's kind of against what music really stands for. It's not, that's when it becomes corporate and not really about the expression.	Music interests and preferences. Personal philosophy.	Music should be about personal expression rather than commercial interests.	
TR	And rap?			
Christos	I don't actually mind it if it's got something to say. Like, I like people that talk about issues in society. So politics, whether it's right-wing, left-wing, at least they're expressing a political view.	Personal philosophy.	Music should have something personal or political to say.	
TR	And rap is a good vehicle for that.			

Christos	Rap is, and I mean in the nineties it was really big where people were talking about issues and early rap started off with basically cultural aspects of American society and talked a lot about discrimination and basically standing up. So I like when rappers or musicians have something important to say whereas it's not just words.	Music interests and preferences.	Early rap music was a vehicle for sharing political viewpoints.	
TR	What do you play?			
Christos	I play guitar and...	Description of current music participation	Plays guitar.	
TR	Acoustic guitar...			
Christos	Both electric and acoustic.			
TR	Bass?			
Christos	I can play bass. And drums. And I'm trying piano.	Description of current music participations.	Plays drums and piano.	
TR	And are you in a band at all?			
Christos	Yep. And...	Description of current music participations.	Is in a band.	
TR	Is that here at school, or...			
Christos	I formed it with some year twelve guys.	Description of current music participations.		
TR	Great. And do you perform anywhere?			
Christos	Only recently they	Description of	Is hoping to get	

	asked me to be their guitarist, so, hopefully soon get some gigs.	current music participations.	some gigs soon.	
TR	Sure. And your family, your parents families, your dad's an old rocker from way back. What else goes on at home?			
Christos	Well I think it started, he never played an instrument – he always wanted to. Like he just never did. But music was a big part of him because when he was eighteen he became a DJ and he did that for a few, he's forty-one now, but he did that for a few years, about ten, fifteen years – but then he kind of got sick of it.	Family music participation.	Father was a DJ	
TR	And you're not into DJ-ing?			
Christos	No, I don't really. I did it when I was younger. He showed me how to do it. I didn't mind it, you know I was very rhythmic, I liked that whole aspect of it, but I was more into... yeah. But that's what kind of influenced him, which then influenced me.	Reflection on music learning experience. Family music participation.		
TR	And what about your mum in all of this? Is she not doing something, singing, or...			
Christos	No, she's not musical at all. She sings in the shower I guess, but I	Family music participation.	Mum is not musical.	

	doubt that...			
TR	That counts, doesn't it. And your younger brother?			
Christos	I think he's been influenced by me and he's playing drums now, taken up drums.	Family music participation.	Brother plays the drums.	
TR	Good. And are you a composer?			
Christos	Yeah.	Description of current music participation.	Is a composer.	
TR	So what kind of things do you create?			
Christos	Anything from, I can create scores with violins, cellos, stuff like that, so classical music as well as modern or contemporary music. Like basically anything – because I've got a bit of music theory behind me which does help.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Composes in a variety of genres. Theory knowledge helps with this.	
TR	So you read and write using conventional notation?			
Christos	That's right. Recently I've been studying kind of more jazz ways which kind of have broadened my musical knowledge.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Recently exploring jazz styles. Broadening knowledge.	
TR	So do you think it's important for people to be able to read and write music in that way?			
Christos	Not necessarily – it depends on the	Personal philosophy.	Notation skills are useful but	

	individual. Like it depends on what kind of music you want to create. Music really is just a form of expression. It's like anything. And you know, you don't have to be a prodigy or you don't need to read music to be able to create music. Like, it does help.		not essential for musicianship.	
TR	Sure. Now you've been studying music here. So not always with ***, because he's new here. So you chose to take music in year... when can you elect it?			
Christos	You can, seven and eight you do it and it's compulsory to give everyone a chance and then year nine and ten you can elect.	Description of current music participation.		
TR	And you did?			
Christos	And I did. And then from year ten you then elect it again if you want to do it again.	Description of current music participation.	Has elected music since year nine.	
TR	Okay. Why do you think kids choose music as a subject?			
Christos	It's definitely the practical component of it. Kids don't do it, yeah, I'm going to learn about treble-clefs, and minims and stuff like that. They don't want to learn about Beethoven or classical	Personal philosophy.	Influence of popular culture inspires young people to study music. Seeing older students playing in bands is	

	composers. Really there's a lot of it is, it's all about modern music, like you might see some cool guitarist on the TV and then that you really like it. And that influences, popular culture influences kids today a lot with what they do. And I think with music especially, that what would be a big influence. Even seeing, you know, kids that are older than you that you kind of respect playing shows, playing gigs at school...		motivating. Students not attracted by classical music or 'theory'.	
TR	So it has cool image?			
Christos	I guess it is in a way. Like, it has a big influence, the whole image aspect of it.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Being a musician has an image that attracts young people.	
TR	So that's why people are choosing it, you think?			
Christos	I think so.	Reflection on music learning experience.		
TR	Okay. What do you think are the benefits of learning music? What does it do for you as a person, do you think?			
Christos	Well definitely, I mean studies have shown that kids that play musical instruments are a lot more socially better off. Like, even with interaction – it boosts a lot of self esteem for	Perceived benefits of music education.	Social benefits. Boost to self-esteem.	

	children.			
TR	Has it done that for you?			
Christos	Yeah.	Perceived benefits of music education.		
TR	So it helped you to make friends?			
Christos	Definitely. And friends that you normally wouldn't consider and you've got that one kind of link which then crosses, you know, into social paths. Normally you might hang with this group of friends but when you play with this person and you find a common link, and that kind of opens up new horizons.	Perceived benefits of music education.	Has more diverse group of friends because of common interest in music.	1
TR	I know exactly what you mean. What's the kind of previous learning or cultural experiences that qualify a person to teach music? What do you think somebody needs to know about to teach music well?			
Christos	Well I think they need a passion for starters. Because you can't, just like any lecturer, you know, you can't go into a class and expect to teach them when you don't have a flair for it yourself. You can't sit there and go okay, we're going to	Reflection on music learning experience.	Music teachers need passion and a personal flair for music. They need to engender respect.	3

	<p>learn about this. You need some form of edge. And kids, generally with all subjects they respect the teacher and if they have that respect for them, that's when they begin to learn. And that has a big factor on learning.</p>			
TR	So they need to be a performer?			
Christos	<p>Really, or they need to learn, they need to know how obviously to be able to play an instrument. And I guess university would be, I think that's the only way you can really become a music teacher. But even then, you need this kind of flair that kids just look at you and they want to learn about music.</p>	Reflection on music learning experience.	Teachers need to have studied music at university level.	3
TR	So you're inspiring, motivating?			
Christos	<p>Yeah, you need to inspire or motivate kids otherwise they're not going to want to learn. That's with any subject. You know, any teacher can open a text book and go okay, I'll learn this. It's all about different ways of challenging, you know, conventional teaching. That's what makes kids so interested in today –</p>	Reflection on music learning experience.	Students need inspiration to learn.	

	you know, you might have a teacher who opens up a book and goes okay, I want you to do this to this, explains it and then that's it.			
TR	But does that apply to every subject? That you want to challenge conventional ways of teaching, or does that particularly apply to music?			
Christos	Particularly to music because it's not exactly a text-book subject. It's not like physics or chemistry or anything like that, where you need to learn the material. You need to learn the material. You need to learn it, but you also need to put it in practice. It's, you know, it's just like a mathematician, he can do all the formulas but if you can't have it in practice, I don't think for science, but you know...	Reflection on music learning experience.	Music education requires theory and practice.	3
TR	Yeah, I know what you're saying. So the theory's not enough? It's the practical...			
Christos	You need, and that, the practical is a big part of kids learning to study music. Just like art, you know, kids don't study art to learn about the artist. It's something they have	Personal philosophy	Young people are most motivated by the practical elements in art and music. Practice is fun.	

	to do. They learn to paint the pictures. So it's just like music, kids learn to play the instruments. Like that whole practical component, it's fun hitting things, it's fun making noise, but, yeah...			
TR	Yeah.			
Christos	We've haven't exactly soundproofed. [<i>Lots of drumming in background.</i>] But kids just like that whole, it's fun, it's not exactly, it's learning, you're learning. You know, you have to learn, but you're having fun and...	Reflection on music learning experience.	In music you learn while having fun.	
TR	There's nothing wrong with having fun. It's all good. So what kinds of music should be in the programme? So what kind of music should you learn about at school?			
Christos	That's a tough question. It's really, that would vary between the individual. I mean, I think you have to have definitely some study of classical music, because that's where it all began.	Choices of repertoire.	The programme must include classical music because that is where music began.	1,3
TR	Where it all began?			
Christos	Oh, not about...			
TR	Think about that, because it's an			

	interesting thought? Isn't it? To say that all music began with European classical music. There's a lot of other music in the world.			
Christos	Really it's more of a study of, you can't really go back to primitive times where they used to just bang on rocks and make noise, you know, because that's caveman – and that's where I guess everything goes back to that period. It's more the, where we have kind of record of. I mean you need some kind of foundation, some starting point, and that is where it's hard.	Choices of repertoire.	Before classical music was “primitive” music. Classical music is the earliest music we have a record of. It can be hard to establish a beginning point.	1,3
TR	Who's the 'we' that we're talking about?			
Christos	What do you mean?			
TR	When you say that we, the music that we go back to, who, which 'we'?			
Christos	History, the human race, kind of, like society.	Reflection of music education experience.	Classical music is relevant to all peoples.	3
TR	Really? What about classical Indian music? Does that go back to Beethoven?			
Christos	I think, that's really depending on the culture.	Cultural diversity.	Some consideration of culture is	3

			important.	
TR	Right. So there's one aspect of music that goes back that you can trace back to classical European music, but then there's a whole world of other music that traces back to other places.			
Christos	Well exactly. I think you need to learn, you know, you need to have that cultural difference as well. Like, what we studied on, a whole piece that was on Mongolian music from pre-eighteenth century in Mongolia. And just it's, just to be able to see the similarities and difference between European music at the time and then another culture. And it's kind of you get this cross-cultural barrier that kind of becomes broken and you can see the links.	Culturally responsive music education.	It is important to learn about differences and connections between musical cultures.	3
TR	So are you interested in the many musics of the world?			
Christos	I like world music. Myself I like to listen to the music from different cultures.	Music interests and preferences.	Likes to listen to "world" music.	3
TR	And so you think that musics from a variety of cultures should be in a music programme in a school in Australia? You think that's			

	important?			
Christos	Not necessarily, cultural music, I mean if you're teaching the subject and children are learning about music – I mean that's something more, cultural music is something more I guess you'd go out and discover on your own after your teens.	Culturally responsive music education.	“World? Musics don't necessarily have a place in music education. It is more suited to personal study and discovery.	1,3
TR	Oh, okay. So, right so not necessarily learn about it at school?			
Christos	Yeah. But, they're more, basically you know, where music came from and certain aspects of music. Like most, depending on, like rock would be the most popular subject that kids would want to learn about, which then turn into pop and there's all these off-branches, but that began with, you know, a mix of two different, you know, back in America with the white and African Americans and it merged aspects of country with gospel and rhythm and blues. And so it's kind of those main kind of... I guess post-twentieth century where that they have major emphasis on the history.	Choices of repertoire. Reflection on music education experience. Culturally responsive music education.	It is valuable to learn about the socio-historical roots of different music genres.	1,3
TR	Do you think that it matters who the			

	children are in the school and where they come from? In terms of what kind of music education is taught, do you think that teachers should think about the cultural identities and heritages of the students in the school?			
Christos	It would be good, but it would be a bit... I mean the school's really multicultural. There's a lot of kids, and then again at other schools, you know, you've got schools where there is a vast amount, you know, mix of races, and then you've got schools where there aren't as many.	Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Not feasible for the music programme to be informed by the diversity of the student population.	2
TR	So should that influence the music programme? In some way?			
Christos	Not necessarily because then it's too, I think if kids are learning different things because it's based on the school, I think if there's a standard curriculum, that way it kind of, everyone gets to learn the same thing. It's not really if you have one Indian kid in the class then we all learn about the history of Indian music. I think that in moderation	Culturally responsive music education.	It's important to have a standard curriculum. Some response to other music traditions would be OK.	1,3

	would be like a good idea, like...			
TR	Do you think it's important to value what children know? What individual kids know in the classroom?			
Christos	Yeah, like any child that contributes to a lesson, like by all means, like all, the culture is a big part of their identity . And as the socialisation process, you know, that really has a big factor. The kids' identity and what they want to learn. So if they actually said, sir or miss, do you think we could learn about this... I definitely think that should be allowed.	Reflection on music learning experience. Culturally responsive music education.	Culture is an important aspect of identity. This may impact on what a student wants to learn and this should be catered for.	1, 3
TR	Are you interested in, for example, the musical cultural heritage of your grandparents? Parents and grandparents? Do you know about it?			
Christos	Not necessarily. I don't really find it that interesting. I mean, I respect my grandparents and I love them, but I don't think music was that big part of their lives. You know, they lived in a time with extreme poverty. I mean, my grandpa, when he was just a teenager, he got captured by a German	Music interests and preferences. Cultural diversity. Family music participation.	Not particularly interested in family music history. Not an important aspect of family experience.	1,3

	and was in a concentration camp with his two sisters.			
TR	So he wasn't doing a lot of music making, you think...			
Christos	Exactly. So that then goes back to the family, like you've got families that went through the great depression and that wasn't exactly a time where music was a big, you know, influence of society. But it's just, it changes with every individual. So that's why it would be so hard to teach in a standard curriculum that has to apply to all schools. And that's why I wouldn't necessarily be that interested in learning.	Family music participation. Cultural diversity. Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Diverse experiences of individuals would be hard to represent in a music programme.	1, 2, 3
TR	Okay. So what actual opportunities have you had to learn about other musics? The musics of other cultures? What opportunities have you had?			
Christos	Of other cultures?			
TR	Non-Western European. And not American contemporary either.			
Christos	Well definitely my dad's had a big influence like, I think if you find a certain style of music like jazz especially, there's some insane jazz players that	Reflection on music learning experience.	Dad has inspired him to explore a variety of musics.	

	aren't from England or America or... so that then, the discovery of one particular style of music will then lead you to the search of others. But...			
TR	So just really for your own interest? You've had a look at some other kinds of music. But through your schooling you haven't?			
Christos	Not really, no. But like if you like Bob Marley, then like his major icon which he has become to a point where... but then people like him then take you back to the roots of reggae music...	Reflection on music learning experience.	Interesting to learn about the "roots" of music styles.	3
TR	So you're interested in tracing things back to wherever it...			
Christos	Yeah, that's where it comes from and then you can kind of see the musical process in which it's been involved. Because that's what everything is, evolution, you know, we all build up and yeah.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Music is dynamic and evolves.	3
TR	Okay, good. So for you, what makes a really good music programme? In the school? What ticks the boxes for you if you had to kind of pick three things?			
Christos	Sorry, ticks...			

TR	Oh, what things would tick all the boxes for you?			
Christos	Oh, tick.			
TR	[<i>laughter</i>]Excuse my New Zealand accent.			
Christos	Well, definitely a practical side of it. But...	Reflection on music experience. Success of music programme.	Practical component is most important.	3
TR	So a good strong practical side.			
Christos	Good strong practicals, I guess that isn't really – you know you need theory behind that as well. I think the other two things, you'd need the practical, but also, oh, you'd need a solid theory of music, just based on you know, compositions and what notes are, what they do. You know, you need to learn how to be able to use music and create music. And then the third is the history. And that is where the tricky thing really lies because it's...	Reflection on music learning experience. Success of music programme.	A good programme needs a practical component, a theory component that includes composition and some music history.	3
TR	Oh whose history are you talking about?			
Christos	And since we're Australian, I mean our culture itself hasn't had a, like two hundred years of history is not...	Personal beliefs.	Australian cultural history is short.	1,3
TR	Well, some people			

	have had longer in Australia.			
Christos	Oh, and it goes back to aboriginal. But like everything you don't see, we don't exactly study aboriginal music. And that's a big part of Australia...	Personal beliefs. Experience of music learning. Indigenous musics. Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Australian history does include Aboriginal music history, but that isn't studied.	1,2,3
TR	No, why don't you?			
Christos	I'm not sure.	Personal beliefs. Indigenous musics.	Unsure why Aboriginal music isn't studied.	1,2
TR	Do you think you should?			
Christos	I think to a certain degree yeah. Even studying the instruments.	Personal beliefs. Indigenous musics.	Some study of Aboriginal musics could be appropriate.	3
TR	That would interest you?			
Christos	I think it would.	Personal beliefs. Indigenous musics.	Such study might be interesting.	3
TR	Part of being an Australian?			
Christos	It is a part of every Australian's identity. Whether they like to think so or not. But it, you know, has a big influence on, you know, before European settlers and aboriginals had big importance in music.	Personal beliefs. Indigenous musics. Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Aboriginal music is part of Australian cultural identity. Some people might not like this idea.	1,2,3

TR	Right. Are there any barriers here to you doing well in music? Anything stopping you, holding you back?			
Christos	<p>In two forms, it would either be the teacher or the actual class. I'm not saying in this circumstances, but just in general. If you don't have a good teacher, then you're not going to learn, you're not going to want to learn. And you are not, that's just with anything really. And your peers, your environment really, that has a big factor. If you have people, like in year nine and ten, sorry in year seven and eight you have everyone's trying every subject based on getting a feel for what they like. So high school finds passions for you and then things that you don't like. But with that there's a lot of kids that don't like learning about music and they, which is fair enough, because it's not for everyone. But then that has an influence on stopping you from learning. Once year nine and ten come along, it's the people that actually want to study it. And from there they kind of find</p>	Barriers to music participation. Success of the music programme.	A good teacher is essential. Sharing a class with unmotivated students hinders learning.	2,3

	a few people who, I don't like this. So then once you get to the senior years that's when people are basically here – yeah I want to learn this subject, I'm doing this for my HSC.			
TR	Once kids start to elect it makes a big difference. What are your plans for the future? Your musical plans?			
Christos	Musical plans. Just keep writing. I mean I enjoy it, it's an outlet for me really. Some kids like playing sport, I like playing sport but then I kind of found music.	Aspirations for the future.	Wants to keep writing music.	
TR	And what are your plans, what's your career going to be? What's your dream job?			
Christos	My dream job? If I had a dream job it would probably being a musician. But that isn't exactly...	Aspirations for the future.		
TR	A professional musician?			
Christos	A professional musician and I'm going to study graphic design.			
Christos	And it's, again close to the creative process, but a more stable career-wise.			
TR	And your parents, they			

	are happy that you are a musician? They support that?			
Christos	They do. I think my dad especially really likes to see me have a passion for something that has been important to him. Not as much as he wasn't one of those fathers that said, okay, trying to live through me. But it was an important part of him and he's kind of happy that it's become an important part of me.			
TR	Well, Christos, it's been a pleasure to talk to you and I wish you all the very best with everything.			

vi) Analysis of Interview: Mathew (Student Seattle School B)

Participants	Full Interview Text Illustration of key messages in bold type	Category	Key messages	Link to Research Question(s)
TR	Matthew is a student at Roosevelt High School here in Seattle and Matthew, tell me what year you are?			
Matthew	I'm a senior.	Personal biography		
TR	So next year what is going to happen to you? What are you going to do?			
Matthew	I'm definitely going to be going to music school, I don't know where yet, but I'm in the process right now of applying to Juilliard, Manhattan and Temple and Eastman. I'd most like to go to Juilliard, for a variety of reasons.	Aspirations for future music participation.	In process of applying to Juilliard.	3
TR	Well, why wouldn't you! And so, tell me about the process for getting into Juilliard?			
Matthew	First there is an audition tape, which is not especially extensive but they want to hear... I want to study jazz there – they want to hear you improvise on a variety of styles. And there's an application, and if they like your tape then you go audition there in the middle of winter. And, hopefully get in. That's all the pieces as far as I know.		Plans to study jazz performance	3
TR	Okay. Is there any requirement that you have to have multiple strengths, you have to play more than one instrument or anything like that?			
Matthew	I don't think they require that, but that's my musical identity and they like that definitely.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Has multiple strengths.	

TR	Really, so tell me more about your musical identity, what do you play?			
Matthew	I've been trying for the last several years just to do everything. I'm in the school orchestra, our school jazz band I've been for my whole four years been playing lead trumpet in there, so jazz band lead, I'm in several different brass quintets and jazz quintets and stuff outside the school. I was in the Seattle Youth Symphony for two years but that's all I could stand of that. I'm going to play a short solo...	Description of current music participation.	Plays in multiple ensembles.	3
TR	Backtrack – so what, you couldn't stand that because...			
Matthew	Oh, that, it was just too big. Double and triple everything and the conductor was a little Napoleon, up there, prancing and that. Painting circles.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Clear preferences about nature of ensembles and quality of leadership.	3
TR	Okay. So it didn't do it for you?			
Matthew	Didn't do it for me.			
TR	No, fair enough. And it sounds like you had plenty of other playing opportunities that were more your thing. So you prefer playing in a smaller ensemble than the big...			
Matthew	Yeah, I prefer to play small group jazz, but that's not where the money is.	Aspirations for the future.	Prefers small ensembles. Is concerned about earning capability as a musician.	3
TR	Oh, okay. So you're thinking about that – where the money is? So tell me about post-Juilliard, what do you see, or what's going to be your dream career?			

Matthew	Well I've always wanted to get to New York. Both my parents are orchestral musicians here, my dad's retired. And my dad went to Juilliard, studied cello, and my mom went to the new school to study violin and I never wanted to have one job and play one thing all the time for fifty years – so I'd like to play, I'd like to be a studio musician on the east coast where there's lots of work and get to play all kinds of different styles and still make money.		Wants to be a studio musician, with plenty of variety.	
TR	I'm sure you will, then. And do you have brothers and sisters?			
Matthew	Yeah I have, my sister is, I believe, in there practising harp.	Family music participation	Sister plays the harp.	
TR	So she's a musician as well. Does your family play together?			
Matthew	No, but everyone asks us that.			
TR	And why not?			
Matthew	Well, let me see, my parents are divorced and my dad married another cellist so that's two cellos, a trumpet, a harp, my mum a violinist, she's now married to a conductor... oh no! Of course those aren't good for anything.		Extended family members all classical musicians.	3
TR	Well that would make a weird ensemble. So tell me, apart from the fact that it's in your family – what else has attracted you to music as a career?			
Matthew	I'm not really sure, play – as a career, because it's the only thing I really enjoy doing.	Reflection on music learning experience.	Music is what he enjoys and is good at.	3
TR	It's what you're good at, what you enjoy.			

Matthew	Yeah, it's what I'm good at, what I enjoy.			
TR	Did you have a choice about starting to learn music, you know, when you were little? Did people just assume that you would?			
Matthew	I did have a choice, they tried to get me to play a violin and piano and neither of those worked at all. I just wanted to swordfight with the bow and stuff. And then in the fourth grade we were allowed to play in the school band and you know, everybody's this big and has no lungs, so I picked the trumpet because it was loud.	Personal biography. Reflection on music learning experience.	Chose trumpet in fourth grade.	3
TR	So you did the whole marching band thing and the ...			
Matthew	Oh yeah, I'm still in there.		Plays in marching band.	
TR	Playing at football games and all that business? Tell me about that. How does that feel? I have no experience of that. We don't do that in New Zealand.			
Matthew	Not at all?			
TR	No. We do have brass and pipe bands, but not marching bands linked to football matches in the way you have here. So what's that like, is it lots of fun?			
Matthew	It's lots of fun. It's a lot of work. I got into it just because all my friends were there, my freshman year and I sort of enjoyed it. You have no identity in the marching band, you're just one little piece.			
TR	Really? Is it cool to be in the marching band, or not?			
Matthew	Everybody, oddly at this school		There are	

	falls into easily recognisable groups that you would imagine – the stereotypes you think of. I would say they're all true.		recognisable stereotypes in school music ensembles.	
TR	So what is the stereotype of the marching band person?			
Matthew	Kids who don't make friends easily, in general. And I wouldn't say that of myself, but a lot of kids in there are – oh, he's, okay, we know who he is – and now as a senior who's done it for a while, I just suddenly am a leader and I suddenly have responsibility and respect and that's a lot of fun too.			
TR	What do you think are the benefits of being a musician? What does it do for a person?			
Matthew	You mean for me personally or for...	Perceived benefits of music education		3
TR	For you personally.			
Matthew	Well that's a focus. Any time I have some free time I have some stuff I could go work on. So that's always just in the back of my head, I could goof off or I could go practise this or work on breathing or anything.		Music learning provides a focus.	3
TR	Yeah? And you're motivated enough to choose the breathing, rather than the goofing?			
Matthew	Usually. For the most part.			
TR	Because it's obviously fun, as well?			
Matthew	Yeah, playing specifically, it's really fulfilling for me more in jazz than in classical music, because I feel like anybody can get on top of their instrument and play some stuff on a page, but if you		Pleasure of making good music with other musicians.	3

	listen to the other guys and make something spontaneously, you just compose. And if it sounds really good, that's about the most fulfilling thing I know.			
TR	And the fact that the other people that you're playing with will appreciate what you just did – does that come into it for you? The fact that they'll be getting off on what you just did and vice versa?			
Matthew	Yeah, I play with some really great people.		Enjoyment of fellow musicians.	3
TR	Have you made your friends around music?			
Matthew	Pretty much. Yeah. A lot of my older friends went into other things. I have good friends who are now on the football team and I don't see them much. Most of my friends are just like-minded musicians and some of them are completely un-like-minded – they don't agree on anything but we get along.			
TR	Okay. In your own time, when you just want to relax, what do you listen to?			
Matthew	A lot of stuff. I like big strong music, so I love Wagner and Shostakovich and a lot of heavy metal bands – Judas Priest and Black Sabbath and that kind of stuff. I just like big music – high trumpet players too, like Maynard Ferguson and Bill Chase.	Music preferences	Likes 'big' music.	3
TR	Okay, that's interesting. Now at this school and the other schools that I've been at, the major focus is on Western-European orchestral music as well as the typical band and			

	<p>choral repertoire. Have you had an opportunity anywhere in your schooling so far to learn about other music – music of other parts of the world? Because I’m sure that you’re aware that there are many musics in the world.</p>			
Matthew	<p>That’s a good question. I’m sure our arts education pales in comparison with New Zealand. We aren’t taught anything at all about art in school unless we take an art class or a music class, and even those are under-funded. So anything I know, pretty much, I either learned in class from Mr Brown in there, or Miss Edwards, or learned in my own time.</p>	Culturally responsive music education.	Arts education experience is limited.	1
TR	<p>Okay. So even thinking back to when you were at elementary school, did anybody share with you the idea of multiple music histories? Did you get a feel for that anywhere?</p>			
Matthew	<p>Yeah, our band director here, Mr Brown, I’ve been with his jazz band for four years and he does a really good job of tying in certain classical influences, African and Latin-American rhythms in jazz music and both jazz and the evolution of jazz and blues into rock and roll, and the influence that rock music had back on jazz and fusion. But that’s still pretty much Western.</p>	Culturally responsive music education.	Has learned about the evolution of jazz	1
TR	<p>Yeah, so you know that story pretty well. So, what about the contemporary and traditional musics of Asia, the Pacific, the many musics of Africa? Have you learned about these? Did you experience that anywhere?</p>			
Matthew	<p>No, I really don’t know anything about those.</p>	Culturally responsive	Has no knowledge of	1

		music education.	non-Western musics.	
TR	Do they interest you? Do you have ethnomusicological interest at all?			
Matthew	Somewhat, but just for things I could take and put back into what I'm playing.		Only interested in ethnomusicology if it might benefit his playing.	1
TR	Or that might influence perhaps compositions, or...			
Matthew	Yeah, and of course that's been done many time.		Aware of 'fusion' approaches to composition.	
TR	Right. Do you think that there's any logic to a music programme being informed by or responsive to the multicultural nature of the school population, or its wider community?			
Matthew	I don't think that should be the focus. I think it's way more important to have students admitted who are capable of playing the music at a high level, and I think that's much more important than making sure you have one of each of these. We do have a very diverse student population, but not especially in the music programme for whatever reason.	Culturally responsive music education. Barriers to cultural diversity.	Music programme should not be informed or influenced by the cultural diversity of the students or community. Is aware that music ensembles do not reflect the cultural diversity of the school population.	1,2
TR	So why do you think that the music programme doesn't reflect the wider diversity of the school?			
Matthew	Economic situations and cultural values. Western classical music and even American jazz music aren't	Barriers to cultural diversity.	There are economic barriers and many parents do	2

	really that popular. Young people aren't being taught about them and even their parents weren't, so they're not teaching children about this history of ours.		not inspire their children to be interested in classical repertoire.	
TR	Okay. Do you think that there's an economic issue there as well regarding who can pay for lessons for their kids?			
Matthew	Yeah, exactly. I would say that's a big factor of lessons and instruments. But also the interest of the student is like, kids don't spontaneously become interested in music that happened fifty years ago or a hundred. They have to be taught that. I was taught that.		If parents (beyond white, middle class parents) taught children to value classical music, instrumental ensembles would be more representative.	2
TR	Because your parents have particular kinds of values and interests. Right. Do you think there's any logic to the idea that American students who study music should know about first musics in America? That they should know about the indigenous musics of this country?			
Matthew	You mean American music?	Indigenous musics.		
TR	Yeah. Does it have a special place, do you think?			
Matthew	We encounter that so rarely. I wouldn't say I know anything at all about native American music.	Indigenous musics. Barriers to culturally responsive music education	Indigenous musics are rarely encountered.	2
TR	Do you think that you should and does it interest you at all?			
Matthew	Well, to tell you the truth it really doesn't interest me because the native American pre-European culture has		Indigenous history is not relevant to today	2

	virtually nothing to do with ours today – I think.			
TR	Do you think that that history is relevant to you in any way?			
Matthew	Only from a large scale, philosophical point of view. Yeah.	Indigenous musics. Barriers to culturally responsive music education	There may be relevance from a broad, philosophical perspective.	1
TR	And is there any place for that large scale philosophy in music education do you think?			
Matthew	Yes, but we're not there yet. We don't have the funding pretty much to get that in-depth.	Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Lack of funding	2
TR	Okay. What do you think is the message to young people, if, you know, perhaps at elementary school you take some journeys around the world in music – you might do a variety of things, but when you come to high school the music is almost all Western classical European or Western contemporary styles? What's the message do you think, culturally?			
Matthew	That that's a higher art which is of course debatable. It is certainly better documented than the for instance native American music. I am not aware of it even being written down much.	Barriers to culturally responsive music education.	Focus in music education causes perception of Western musics as "higher art". This is debatable.	1,2
TR	No, well many musics are not written down.			
Matthew	Exactly. That's why Western classical music is given a more scholarly position.		Notated musics are more highly valued in education.	2
TR	So you think we privilege			

	musics that are written and read?			
Matthew	Well yes, just like everything else. I mean literature and art too.			
TR	Do you think that young music students are aware that for example India has a rich classical music tradition, and that there are many musical cultures and traditions in the world?			
Matthew	Only very vaguely, I mean again we're not taught anything about any of that and if kids wanted to learn about it they'd have to take the initiative and go find out for themselves.		Not taught about any other traditions in schools. Up to students to research that if interested.	2
TR	Okay, so what do you think are the key barriers then to having a more diverse music programme?			
Matthew	Funding for education.	Barriers to culturally responsive music education	Funding is major barrier	2
TR	So choices about where you're going to spend your money?			
Matthew	Yeah, and that's a state thing too. We just aren't allocated money for that.			
TR	Okay. Do you wish there was more opportunity to compose music in your programme?	Success of music programme		3
Matthew	I think there already is a lot of opportunity if you're really that dedicated. There aren't any requirements.		Students can choose to compose if dedicated.	3
TR	Should there be requirements, do you think?			
Matthew	That would be nice in an ideal world. We just don't have that kind of programme anywhere		There are currently no requirements for	3

	in the school that I've encountered.		composition.	
TR	Right, so to sum up, as far as you know, the different cultural heritages of the students that you go to school with really don't impact on or enter into the shape of music education that you're experiencing?			
Matthew	Not especially, no.	Culturally responsive music education.	Cultural diversity of students has no impact on music education	1
TR	But for you, you're getting the music education that you want, really?			
Matthew	Yeah.	Success of music programme.	Music programme as it is, is meeting his needs.	3
TR	And it seems that you've launched for great success. Is that the case, do you feel?			
Matthew	Hopefully...			
TR	You're on the threshold.			
Matthew	... I'm doing all right.			
TR	Yeah, I can see that. Thank you very much for talking to me. I really appreciate it.			

