

**The Politics of a Stateless Nation:**

The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism in post-union Scotland, 1707-  
1830

Conor Paul McLaughlin  
32226844

A Dissertation in part fulfillment of the requirements of the Degree of  
Bachelor of Arts (Honours) in Global Politics and Policy

Global Politics and Policy  
Supervisor: Dr. Arjun Subrahmanyam  
Murdoch University

## Abstract

The development of Scottish nationalism has generated significant scholarly debate. Much of the scholarship on modern Scottish nationalism has focused on the political elements, namely the project aimed at the establishment of an independent Scottish state. This generalisation of Scottish nationalism is misplaced as it does not sufficiently consider the historical circumstances that Scotland has been situated. Scotland did maintain an independent state until it voluntarily relinquished these claims following the ratification of the Acts of Union on May 01, 1707. The question of whether nationalism or nationalist sentiment in Scotland after the Acts of Union discontinued have not yet adequately been examined. This thesis will confront this gap by understanding nationalism in a frame other than political. Rather, this thesis will argue that more attention needs to be given to cultural nationalism, whose primary aim is the formation of national communities. Analysis of cultural nationalism which takes the form of a national *revival* will unfold through common factors that promote a national community: national language; literature; the arts; educational activities; religious cohesion; and economic self-help. Ultimately this thesis will demonstrate that the main concern for nationalists in post-union Scotland was not the re-establishment of an independent state but rather the revival of the Scottish community in light of the new political reality. This is largely due to the desire to redefine the identity of political communities in light of a retreat from politics.

## Acknowledgements

Almost a decade ago, as a young Scottish-Australian, I witnessed from afar, my country, Scotland rejecting the opportunity of an independent Scottish nation. I witnessed over time, a growing consciousness and favourability towards Scottish independence, from the 1980s, with a Scottish disdain for Margaret Thatcher triggered an upsurge of Scottish nationalism. The Scottish nationalist movement slowly but surely gained momentum, achieving Devolution and the election of the Scottish Nationalist Party. However, it was on the wave of three decades of inherent nationalist rhetoric that Scotland rejected independence. The result has triggered an almost decade-long pursuit in attempting to understand why this result had been the case. This dissertation represents the latest chapter in this pursuit.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Arjun Subrahmanyam for his patience and perseverance throughout this project. His encouragement, expertise, and generosity of spirit is truly appreciated.

Secondly, the program of study in which this dissertation is the culmination was undertaken with the support of the Mannkal Economic Education Foundation. The generosity of Mr. Ron Manners AO and his wife Jenny, and the contributions of all the Foundation staff are greatly appreciated.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to extend my sincerest thanks to my family. To my brother, Sean, my sister, Danann, and my parents, Francis and Angela, I would like to thank you all for the love, encouragement, and support provided not only through the course of this dissertation but for the support provided in allowing me to pursue my education goals.

Winston Churchill once said, “Of all the small nations of this earth, perhaps only the ancient Greeks surpass the Scots in their contribution to mankind.” I hope that this dissertation is a contribution to Scotland, its history, its beliefs, and the Scottish people.

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract</b>	i
<hr/>	
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	ii
<hr/>	
<b>Table of Contents</b>	iii
<hr/>	
<b>Declaration</b>	iv
<hr/>	
<b>Chapter One: Introduction</b>	1
<hr/>	
Introduction	2
Literature Review	3
Outline of the Study	11
<b>Chapter Two: Social Planning without a State</b>	13
<hr/>	
Historical Overview: The Acts of Union of 1707	14
Introduction	16
Depoliticising the Political Process	17
Scotland's public sphere crystallised	19
Conclusion	24
<b>Chapter Three: The Church of Scotland as Moral Innovators</b>	25
<hr/>	
Introduction	26
Cultural Nationalism as a Modernising Movement	27
The Social Crisis in Scotland	30
The Church of Scotland as Moral Innovators	31
The Church and Provisions for the Poor	37
Conclusion	39
<b>Chapter Four: Literature as the creator of all values</b>	40
<hr/>	
Introduction	41
The Vernacular revival of Scots	43
Romanticism as an index of Scottish nationality	45
James Macpherson and the myth of Scottish origins	46
Robert Burns and Scotland's national image	46
Walter Scott and the symbols of Scotland	48
Conclusion	49
<b>Conclusion</b>	51
<hr/>	
<b>Bibliography</b>	55

## **Declaration**

I declare that this dissertation is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work, which has not been previously submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

Conor McLaughlin

# Chapter One

## Introduction

On the 18th of September 2014, the Scottish electorate took to the voting booth in deciding the future of the nation by answering one fundamental question: “Should Scotland be an independent country?”<sup>1</sup> The 2014 Scottish independence referendum was witnessed as the culmination of a Scottish nationalist discourse as it resulted from the Scottish National Party (SNP), who had long based its political platform on the idea of Scottish nationalism and the goal of Scottish independence.<sup>2</sup>

When the results emerged of a majority of Scots voting against independence, those in favour of independence flooded streets to affirm their solidarity. The marches consisted of waving the Scottish flag and the Rampant Lion, to singing songs from Robert Burns’ *Scots Wha Hae*, Ronnie Anderson’s *Flower of Scotland*, and *The Bonnie Banks o’ Loch Lomond*.

The 2014 referendum was the latest in a series of expressions of Scottish nationalism. From 1296 until 1328, both William Wallace and Robert the Bruce were proponents of Scottish nationalism when they fought the English during the Scottish Wars of Independence. The 1745 Battle of Culloden, which advocated for a Scottish breakaway from Great Britain, also had its foundations entrenched in Scottish nationalism. More recently, the 1979 and 1997 devolution referendums, which were concerned with matters of Scottish home-rule, were witnessed as a parliamentary representation of Scottish nationalism.<sup>3</sup>

Scottish nationalism was particularly relevant in the early-eighteenth century, when the Scottish parliament were discussing the possibility of a political union with England. In 1704, on the eve of the union with England, Andrew Fletcher of Saltoun, a fierce advocate for an independent Scotland argued that ‘if a man were permitted to make all the ballads, he need not care who should make the laws of the nation.’<sup>4</sup> Fletcher here, touches on an interesting point, one that is often overlooked but remains inherent to Scottish nationalism. Here, Fletcher suggests that it is the cultural elements, the clothing, the language, and indeed, the

---

<sup>1</sup> Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, “Scottish independence referendum,” Open Government License of State Records (2014), <https://www.gov.uk/government/topical-events/scottish-independence-referendum/about>

<sup>2</sup> Lynn Bennie, “The Scottish National Party: Nationalism for the many,” in *Regionalist Parties in Western Europe: Dimensions for success*, ed. Oscar Mazzoleni and Sean Mueller (London: Routledge, 2017), 22.

<sup>3</sup> James Mitchell et al., “The 1997 Devolution Referendum in Scotland,” *Parliamentary Affairs* 51, no. 2 (April 1998): 166-167.

<sup>4</sup> Christopher Harvie, *Scotland and Nationalism: Scottish Society and Politics, 1707 to the Present* (London: Routledge, 2004), 11.

music, that will remain the bedrock of the nation, regardless of its political reality. In this case, Fletcher accurately predicted the way Scottish nationalism would survive.

This thesis argues, along the lines of Andrew Fletcher and his predictions, that is, following the Anglo-Scottish union in 1707, the primary form of nationalism that was exhibited in Scotland was not political, but rather, cultural. In doing so, I will demonstrate that this frame of cultural nationalism was adopted in the form of preserving a national community. Furthermore, I will endeavour to illustrate that three separate, but interrelated spheres were instrumental in preserving the national community of Scotland: The public sphere, the religious sphere, and the literary sphere.

## Literature Review

### *Dominant form of nationalism*

There is no single way to understand nationalism.<sup>5</sup> Nationalism may involve a combination of politics, culture, and economics, but for many of its most prominent scholars, politics remains the defining factor. Such is the argument made by Hans Kohn in *The Idea of Nationalism* (1944). Kohn argues that nationalism develops specifically in a political form.<sup>6</sup> This was typified by Elie Kedourie, who, in his book, *Nationalism* (1960) identifies nationalism as a political ideology, concerned only with the establishment or maintenance of an independent nation-state.<sup>7</sup>

The privileging of politics remains the dominant approach in understanding nationalism. In particular, this understanding was personified in the 1980s, when interest in nationalism as a field of study became prominent. Ernest Gellner in *Nationalism* (1964) argues that nations are an imaginary construct and nationalism is simply a vehicle to propagate the myth. He reiterates this by suggesting nationalism is not the awakening of nations to self-

---

<sup>5</sup> Sandra Wilson, "Rethinking nation and nationalism in Japan," in *Nation and Nationalism in Japan*, ed. Sandra Wilson (London: Routledge, 2002), 1.

<sup>6</sup> Hans Kohn, *The Idea of Nationalism: A Study in its origins and background* (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2008), 4.

<sup>7</sup> Elie Kedourie, *Nationalism* (United Kingdom: Hutchinson, 1966), 6, see also: Alan Finlayson, "Nationalism," in *Political Ideologies: An Introduction*, ed. Vincent Geoghegan and Rick Wilford (London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 2014), 100-102.



consciousness; it invents nations where they do not exist.<sup>8</sup> Furthermore, in *Nations and Nationalism* (1983), Gellner defines nationalism as a political ideology, which holds that national unity and national identity can only be expressed in a political form.<sup>9</sup> He argues that anything other than politics in nationalist discourse is but an epiphenomenon.<sup>10</sup>

Benedict Anderson in *Imagined Communities* (1983), routinely defines the nation as an imagined political community and therefore, nationalism as an ideology of the nation remains political.<sup>11</sup> In this he refutes Gellner's interpretation by suggesting that the nation is imaginary, not imagined. Anderson claims that Gellner confuses 'imagined' with 'fabrication'. More specifically, nations are imagined because of their political elements, as they can be readily defined in the nation-state. To put more simply, although a national community is imagined, politics remains the end game and as such, necessitates more attention.

John Breuilly in his book *Nationalism and the State* (1983), characterises nationalism as a form of politics, thereby confining nationalism as a purely political movement<sup>12</sup>. Breuilly states that to focus on anything other than politics concerning nationalism is to neglect the fundamental point of nationalism, that is, politics.<sup>13</sup> He does so by suggesting that nationalism is a political movement that seeks to gain or exercise state power and justify their objectives through their nationalist doctrines.<sup>14</sup>

Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger in *The Invention of Tradition* (1983), reinforce the idea that nationalism's primary aim is an independent state, but in doing so, they discuss the elements that engineer the conditions of this statehood. They argue that the elements that bond people together within a national apparatus are invented. They suggest that national traditions such as the flag, anthem, and symbols are invented so as to act as a means to an end

---

<sup>8</sup> Ernest Gellner, *Thoughts and Change* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1964), 169.

<sup>9</sup> Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006), 1.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid*, 124.

<sup>11</sup> Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 1991), 6.

<sup>12</sup> John Breuilly, *Nationalism and the State* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1993), 2-14.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid*, 1.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid*, 11.

of achieving political statehood.<sup>15</sup> These traditions provide cultural similarity, which forms the basis of political legitimacy.<sup>16</sup> Moreover, non-political elements such as culture are downplayed in their account, as they are invented and manipulated by elites concerned with the legitimization of political power.<sup>17</sup>

The Scottish case is anomalous in the study of nationalism. Perhaps this is because Scotland does not conform to the best-known models of nationalism mentioned above. In particular because Scotland in the eighteenth-century did not strive for statehood, instead voluntarily relinquishing this claim in favour of a union with England. As such, much of the scholarship surrounding Scottish nationalism has focused on the latter-part of the twentieth-century, when the demands for an independent Scottish state began to emerge. Prior to this, Scotland has hardly been mentioned in the study of nationalism.

Benedict Anderson's account is simple at best. Anderson believes that Scottish nationalism does not exist. For example, Anderson points out that the Anglo-Scottish union in 1707 came about precisely because of a lack of strong cultural markers between the two states.<sup>18</sup> The reasons for such are the lack of linguistic differentiation from the rest of Britain, the accepted inclusion in the British system and the proactive participation of Scots in the political and imperial system. For Scottish nationalism to be a political force, Anderson argues, it would require cultural repression and political exploitation by the British state, which he argues does not exist in the Scottish case.<sup>19</sup> In other words, Anderson argues that Scotland represents a poor example of a cohesive nation, and the lack of political independence reinforced this fact.

Hugh Trevor-Roper discusses what he identifies as the myth of Scottish nationalism. He argues that Scottish nationalism centred around elements of cultural identity, namely, the

---

<sup>15</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, "Introduction: Inventing Traditions," in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 13.

<sup>16</sup> Furthermore, Hobsbawm argued that nationalism's only interest for the historian lay in its political aspirations, and especially its capacity for state making, see Eric Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 1-13.

<sup>17</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, *Introduction: Invention of Tradition*, 13.

<sup>18</sup> See also, Steve Bruce, "A failure of the imagination: ethnicity and nationalism in Scotland's history," *Scotia* 17, (1993).

<sup>19</sup> Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, 88-90.

Kilt, the Bagpipes, and Tartan, are all modern constructs and therefore, cannot represent the nation.<sup>20</sup> He argues that the nationalism that developed during the time of union cannot be considered a nationalism, as it did not embody the elements of political goals, therefore, it was a mere form of protest.<sup>21</sup>

### ***The Emergence of Cultural Nationalism***

The preferencing of politics in nationalist discourse became the subject of wide criticism, for placing too much emphasis on the political dynamics of the nation-state. Understanding nationalism as a political ideology is restrictive, it omits other important dimensions of nationalism, like culture. The result is a serious underestimation of the scope and power of nationalism. The result was the subject of nationalism literature diversified and became more mature in its approach. The criticism argued that nationalism exists in various forms, rather than in a single dominant political version. Cultural nationalism was one major strand of the diversification of nationalism discourse.<sup>22</sup>

In much of the scholarly literature, cultural nationalism has become a stretched concept, encompassing the full fragment of cultural practices and texts.<sup>23</sup> Inspired by Benedict Anderson's *Imagined Communities*, researchers have gone in search of all the elements of culture that factor in the construction of national identity.<sup>24</sup>

---

<sup>20</sup> High Trevor-Roper, "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland," in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 15.

<sup>21</sup> Ibid.

<sup>22</sup> The origins of cultural nationalism can be found within the literature of German philosopher Johann Gottfried Herder, who advocated against the homogenization effects that politics brings and as such, the need to retain culture was paramount in the identity of a people. The leading study on Herder is F. M. Bernard, *Herder on Nationality, Humanity and History* (Montreal: McGill University Press, 2003).

<sup>23</sup> This field of nationalism argues that there are a wide range of agents that have been involved in the negotiation and transmission of discourses of the national interest. These agents include many people in the articulate elites inside and outside of government. For the purpose of this dissertation, my focus will be on those outside of government. As such, beyond the elite sphere, cultural nationalism also encompasses a great variety of ordinary and anonymous people who participate in cultural nationalism as much through their action as they do in any written or spoken manifesto, see: Sandra Wilson, "Rethinking nation and nationalism in Japan," in *Nation and Nationalism in Japan*, ed. Sandra Wilson (London: Routledge, 2002), 3.

<sup>24</sup> Eric Taylor Wood, "Cultural Nationalism," in *The SAGE Handbook of Cultural Sociology*, ed. David Inglis and Anna-Mari Almila (London: Sage Publishing, 2016), 430.

Anthony D. Smith, a former student of Ernest Gellner, rejected the political foundations upon which Gellner's theory was situated. For Smith, all nationalism has a cultural dimension; hence his insistence that nationalism is an ideological movement rather than a mere political movement.<sup>25</sup> In his book, *Nationalism and Modernism* (1998), Smith expanded the scope of which nationalism was analysed, by discussing culture as the basis of the nation and a national community and that the national community could be an objective of nationalism.<sup>26</sup> In doing so, he sought to demonstrate that cultural nationalism takes shape through a process of reinterpretation and rediscovery rather than mere invention.<sup>27</sup>

John Hutchinson expands on the depth and analysis of cultural nationalism. In his book *Modern Nationalism* (1994), Hutchinson argues that if political nationalism is focused on the establishment of an independent nation-state, cultural nationalism is focused on the formation of a national community.<sup>28</sup> For Hutchinson, cultural nationalism refers to the ideas and practices that relate to the intended reconstruction of a culture. He does not deny the importance of political ambitions but thinks we cannot overlook the recurrent significance of cultural forms of nationalism.<sup>29</sup> As such, cultural nationalism sets out to provide a vision for the nation's identity, history, and destiny, thereby presenting cultural nationalism as a means to understand the nation in terms of a shared culture. Hutchinson argues that ethnicity, culture, and its ties to history remain significant, and therefore, must be considered in the study of nationalism.<sup>30</sup>

Central to Hutchinson's assumptions is that nationalism is much more than a political project or doctrine, it is more flexible and fluid than the political foundations suggest. He argues that there is a tendency to conflate the nation with the state.<sup>31</sup> The state is an artificial creation, legitimated through a political class. The nation is a quasi-natural institution, like the family,

---

<sup>25</sup> See: Anthony D. Smith, *Theories of Nationalism*, (London: Duckworth, 1986); Anthony D. Smith, *National Identity*, (Las Vegas: University of Nevada Press, 1991).

<sup>26</sup> Anthony D. Smith, *Nationalism and Modernism*, (London: Routledge: Taylor & Francis, 1998), 8.

<sup>27</sup> See, Anthony D. Smith, *The Nation Made Real: Art and National Identity in Western Europe, 1600-1850*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013).

<sup>28</sup> John Hutchinson, "Cultural Nationalism," in *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Nationalism*, ed. John Breuilly (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 75. See also: Alan Finlayson, "Nationalism," in *Political Ideologies: An Introduction*, ed. Vincent Geoghegan and Rick Wilford (London: Routledge, 2014), 100-101.

<sup>29</sup> John Hutchinson, *Modern Nationalism* (London: Fontana Press, 1994), 41.

<sup>30</sup> John Hutchinson, *The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism: The Gaelic Revival and the Creation of the Irish National State* (London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 1987), 13-15.

<sup>31</sup> John Hutchinson, "Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism," *Australian Journal of Politics and History* 45, no. 3 (September 1999): 392.

it is a primordial expression of the individuality and the creative forces of nature. Like families, nations are natural solidarities; constantly evolving in a manner of organic beings and living personalities.<sup>32</sup> These personalities unite via the love for the nation. To Hutchinson, the nation is a source of unique charisma or unique energy, expressed in its origins, history, culture, and landscape.<sup>33</sup> Whereas political nationalism regards unity as based on a legal uniformity within the state, cultural nationalism argues that a strong sense of history allows for national solidarity to be combined with the powerful cultivation of individuality.<sup>34</sup>

Hutchinson draws three conclusions from his analysis of the dynamics of cultural nationalism. Firstly, is the importance of historical memory, notably past sacrifices in the formation of a nation. Secondly, there are often competing definitions of what the nation is, and this competition is resolved through trial and error during interaction with other communities. And thirdly, is the central role that cultural symbols play in group formation. These symbols remain powerful as they convey an attachment to a historical identity.<sup>35</sup>

Tom Nairn in *The Break Up of Britain* (1977) discusses the social composition of cultural nationalism.<sup>36</sup> Nairn argues that both forms of nationalism are guided by an intellectual class. Intellectuals are instrumental in guiding the nation to its primary goal, whether statehood or a community, they do this by furnishing the basic definitions and characteristics of the nation upon which a community is built. In stateless nations, Nairn argues that the political class has either not emerged or has been discredited and as a result, the intellectuals assume an almost quasi-natural leadership role, given their status in society.

To bring light to how cultural nationalism is institutionalised and projected, Hutchinson argues that cultural nationalism adopts the form of a historical revival that promotes a national language, literature, the arts, education, and economic self-help.<sup>37</sup> Hutchinson echoes Nairn's premise that the key agents of cultural nationalism are intellectuals and artists, who seek to convey their vision of the nation to the wider community. What triggers these groups

---

<sup>32</sup> John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 392; Anthony D. Smith, *Nationalism and Modernism*, 178.

<sup>33</sup> John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 399.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid.

<sup>35</sup> John Hutchinson, *The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 29-30.

<sup>36</sup> Tom Nairn, *The Break-Up of Britain: Crisis and Neonationalism* (United Kingdom: Common Ground Publishing, 2003), 97-98.

<sup>37</sup> John Hutchinson, *Cultural Nationalism*, 75.

into collective action is evidence of social demoralisation and conflict which they believe results from a loss of continuity with the national heritage and a subsequent adoption of foreign values.<sup>38</sup> The artists furnish the symbols, images, and vision of the nation, and the intellectuals, a vocational and occupational group, including professionals and education instructors communicate this vision to the community. The need to articulate and express this vision tends to be felt most acutely during times of social, political, or cultural upheaval.

Joep Leerssen discusses cultural nationalism in the frame of its apparent weakness, the concern with authenticity. To political nationalism, the nation-state is the most authentic form a national community can strive for. The state is rigid and therefore, cannot be conflated with another. As mentioned above, the nation is both fluid and flexible. Overcoming this, Leerssen argues that the somewhat opaque representation of the state ensures that the content of cultural nationalism is local, but the sharing of ideas and practices is national, thus bringing together individuals or groups into a national community framework. In reference to Scotland, Leerssen uses the example of Walter Scott. He identifies Scott's approach to romanticism, by adopting local characteristics of the Scottish people and projecting them for national representation became an important mechanism in the construction of a national community.<sup>39</sup>

Smith, Nairn, Hutchinson, and Leerssen all agree that the demarcation between political and cultural nationalisms is whether the primary concern is with the establishment of a strong community or a strong territorial state. Cultural nationalism in this sense, perceives the nation as a product of its unique history, culture, language, and geographical profile.<sup>40</sup> For the makers of Scottish cultural nationalism, the idea of Scotland had a power that exceeded political status.

### **Scoto-centric nationalism**

By the late 1990s, a new and deeper understanding of Scotland was starting to develop. As part of the Scottish understanding of the eighteenth-century, historians such as Tom Nairn

---

<sup>38</sup> John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 399-400.

<sup>39</sup> Joep Leerssen, "Nationalism and the Cultivation of Culture," *Nations and Nationalism* 12, no. 4 (September 2006): 562.

<sup>40</sup> Anthony D. Smith, *The Ethnic Revival of the Modern World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 2.

and Tom Devine vigorously challenged the established view of understanding Scottish nationalism as a political ideology.

The most powerful and dominant analysis of Scottish culture has been Tom Nairn's *Break Up of Britain* (1977). His later book, *After Britain* (2000) returns to some of these themes over twenty years later, albeit in a revised form. Nairn points out that culture is the only characteristic that could bind the Scottish community together post-union because of course, it couldn't be political.<sup>41</sup> In doing so, Nairn points to the structure of the union to create a new state but its inability to create a new nation. As such, although politics became an overarching theme of Great Britain, culture remained inherent to respective national contexts.<sup>42</sup> He argues that Scotland does not express nationalism in a political sense but instead projects *cultural sub-nationalism*. He argues that intellectuals accepted the reality of the union and as such, there was no call for the usual utility of desires of political independence, hence his emphasis on 'sub'. According to Nairn, the *cultural sub-nationalism* that Scotland experienced served to separate the Scottish *heart* from the British *head*. Following on, in *Faces of Nationalism* (1997), Nairn adopted another frame with which to understand Scotland. For Nairn, the uniqueness of the Scottish case posited what he calls *Upper-Class Nationalism*, which serves to represent the specific political demands for a Scottish nation-state, which is clearly demonstrated within the current SNP context and *Lower-Class Nationalism*, which is a more general identification with the Scottish people, its culture, and its history.<sup>43</sup>

Tom Devine was instrumental in analysing Scotland's place in the union. In *The Scottish Nation: A Modern History* (1999), Devine stressed the ability to reconstruct a national past through the differences between the nations of the union. As politics was seen within a British frame, Scotland had to be viewed from another. Devine thus communicated the history of Scotland within Great Britain.<sup>44</sup> Viewing the Scottish community through a political frame results in an insular approach of history.<sup>45</sup> Political nationalism thus, does not appreciate the uniqueness that the Scottish nation has to offer.

---

<sup>41</sup> Tom Nairn, *The Break Up of Britain*, 156.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibid*, 116.

<sup>43</sup> Tom Nairn, *Faces of Nationalism: Janus Revisited*, (London: Verso, 1997), 196.

<sup>44</sup> T. M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation: A Modern History*, (London: Penguin Publishing, 2012), ix-x.

<sup>45</sup> St Edmund Hall, "The "Death" and Reinvention of Scotland," uploaded June 20, 2013, YouTube video, 30:35, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z9GFbU0PUkU>

Similarly, in his book, *Scotland and the Union: 1707-2007* (2008), Devine emphasises the importance of the Anglo-Scottish relationship being anomalous. Although the Scottish Crown and Parliament had been transferred to London in 1603 and 1707, respectively, Scotland had maintained a unique system of laws, religion, education, and culture, which Devine argues acted as a catalyst for Scottish nationalism to be infused into the discourse of society.<sup>46</sup>

### **An Outline of the Study**

This dissertation will not assess the broader context of Scottish nationalism. Rather, the focus remains on the dynamics of cultural nationalism in Scotland between the formation of the Union of Scotland and England in 1707 until the end of George IV's reign in 1830. This will allow for a more extensive analysis on the elements that made up cultural nationalism during this period. Although I will provide a brief overview of the elements that culminated in the union, this only serves the purpose of showing the vacuum left by the relinquishing of statehood and subsequently, the role it played in promoting cultural nationalism. In doing so, I will treat cultural nationalism as a process or series of processes rather than an established or inevitable doctrine.<sup>47</sup> Cultural nationalism has never reached an end point, though critical milestones can certainly be identified. Cultural nationalism does not suggest a linear path as many political nationalists argue, but it is a combination of different elements that strive for the same goal. Although many cultural nationalists argue that the main goal of cultural nationalism is the establishment of a national community, I will argue that in Scotland's case, cultural nationalism was geared towards the revival of the national community.<sup>48</sup>

Although primary and secondary sources are employed throughout this dissertation, it must be emphasised that it is not my intention to explore an inclusive history of Scottish nationalism. Nor do I seek to provide full coverage of Scottish cultural nationalism. My purpose is much more limited: to highlight representative institutions, developments, and

---

<sup>46</sup> T. M. Devine, "Three Hundred Years of the Anglo-Scottish Union," in *Scotland and the Union: 1707-2007*, ed. T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), 9.

<sup>47</sup> Sandra Wilson, *Rethinking nation and nationalism in Japan*, 3.

<sup>48</sup> This is because the Scottish community had existed for centuries under an independent state and as such, revival is best suited to describe the process that was undergone.



---

individuals in the Scottish case that exemplifies standard aspects of cultural nationalism, to enable a general analysis of the dynamics post-union.

Chapter Two, 'Social Planning without a State', will provide a brief overview of the event that engineered the conditions for cultural nationalism to emerge in Scotland, the Acts of Union of 1707. In doing so, I will illustrate the Acts of Union, what it did and what it did not do and how this provided the basis for cultural nationalism in Scotland. As such, I will demonstrate in the aftermath of the union, in a nation without a political movement, cultural nationalism manifested itself in the public sphere. The public sphere promoted the revival of the Scottish community through creating a bond amongst the population within the medium of participation in decision-making processes, thereby, bringing separate sections of the community together.

The empirical core of this study is to be found in Chapter Three, 'Reason is the Enemy of Faith: The Church of Scotland as Moral Innovators'. This chapter analyses the Church of Scotland under the leadership of the Moderate Party. The Moderates promoted the revival of the Scottish community by bringing polarised sections of the community, namely traditionalists and modernists together into an overarching consensus. They achieved this through the medium of *moral innovation* - promoting modernisation from within. Modernising from within allowed the Church to modernise without abandoning tradition, thereby bringing polarised sections of the community together in the aim of revival.

In Chapter Four, 'Literature as the creator of values', I will outline how the vernacular role of the *Scots* language was used as a medium for reviving the national community on the grounds of bringing dispersed people together through a common communicatory framework. *Scots* served to construct a collective ethos by creating a unitary bond amongst the people. In Scotland, however, language often coincided with and became a platform for the romantic movement to promote a revival. Romanticists like James Macpherson, Robert Burns, and Walter Scott used *myths*, *images*, and *symbols* as mediums in creating illusionary bonds amongst the community. In doing so, the romanticists inspired a sense of collectivity in the degree that all Scots were linked in one way or another.

## **Chapter Two**

### Social Planning without a State

### ***Historical Overview: The Acts of Union***

At the end of March 1603, Elizabeth I of England passed, leaving her cousin James VI of Scotland as the heir to the English throne. James' ascension to the English throne resulted in the unification of the three realms of Scotland, England, and Ireland.<sup>49</sup> The union was mainly symbolic, with the Crown of Scotland and the Crown of England and Ireland remaining distinct, despite James' considerable efforts to consolidate the two crowns. More importantly, Scotland and England continued to operate as autonomous and independent states, with the parliamentary systems remaining separate in the two kingdoms.<sup>50</sup> Following the Union of the crowns, in 1607 the English parliament passed an Act of Union to merge the two parliaments of Scotland and England to create a single state. But no treaty was formally signed as there was considerable backlash from the English public.<sup>51</sup>

It would take almost a century for clearer political union discussions to re-emerge. On February 5, 1705, the House of Commons in England passed the Alien Act, which recommended to Queen Anne that commissioners be appointed to negotiate a possible Union between Scotland and England. The English opposition to a potential union with Scotland had now been abandoned.<sup>52</sup>

Many politicians and the monarch herself believed that a parliamentary union with Scotland was essential for the future stability and security of the two kingdoms. Twenty years earlier, King William III concluded that Scotland could not be governed in the existing context of the Union of the Crowns. A union of the Edinburgh and Westminster parliaments was essential.<sup>53</sup> A joint Anglo-Scottish parliamentary commission met in the spring of 1706 and drafted a Treaty of Union, with twenty-five articles to be presented to both parliaments.

The treaty established a new entity: The United Kingdom of Great Britain, a term designed by James VI & I to reconcile Scottish fears of being annexed by England after the Union of

---

<sup>49</sup> David L. Smith, "Politics in Early Stuart Britain, 1603-1640," in *A Companion to Stuart Britain*, ed. Barry Coward (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2003), 233.

<sup>50</sup> David L. Smith, *A History of the Modern British Isles 1603-1707: The Double Crown* (Oxford: John Wiley & Sons, 1998), Chapter 2.

<sup>51</sup> Fitzroy MacLean, *Scotland: A Concise History* (London: Thames & Hudson, 2019), 71.

<sup>52</sup> T. M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation*, 3.

<sup>53</sup> Christopher A. Whatley, "The Making of the Union of 1707," in *Scotland and the Union 1707-2000*, ed. T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), 26.

the Crowns and the English fears of being ruled by a Scot. With a historic vote on January 16, 1707, the Scottish parliament dissolved itself by ratifying all twenty-five articles of the Acts of Union with a vote of 110-67. Thereafter, Scotland was to be represented in the Westminster parliament by sixteen members in the House of Lords and forty-five members in the House of Commons. Although an ostensibly new British parliament replaced the independent legislatures of England and Scotland, in reality an enlarged English parliament emerged.

The integration of the two kingdoms aimed at facilitating great power politics and state economic management.<sup>54</sup> The English were deeply entrenched in the great-power competition within Europe and required political security. The Scots were more concerned with securing trade access to the English domestic and imperial markets.

The Acts of Union was also significant for what it did not do. The realms outside politics and economics were to remain untouched. This meant that Scotland's judicial and educational institutions were to maintain their integrity.<sup>55</sup> More importantly, the union did not touch upon ecclesiastical questions. As the doctrine, liturgy, and Church governance of Scotland and England's religious organisations remained inherently different,<sup>56</sup> the Scottish and English parliaments, respectively, passed acts preserving the integrity of their churches.<sup>57</sup>

The scope of integration was questioned under Robert Walpole's premiership from 1708.<sup>58</sup> Under Walpole, the British state became proactively engaged with the state of Scottish affairs.<sup>59</sup> This interference brought forward a motion by the Scottish peers in the House of

---

<sup>54</sup> Within the Acts of Union, it specifies that the integration process was to be limited to fiscal matters, public law, and foreign diplomacy.

<sup>55</sup> Robert Harris, "Union of 1707," in *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, ed. Michael Lynch (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 605.

<sup>56</sup> See: Colin Kidd, *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993); Graeme Morton, *Unionist-Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860* (London: Tuckwell Press, 1998).

<sup>57</sup> Robert Harris, *Union of 1707*, 605.

<sup>58</sup> Robert Walpole is recognised as holding the office of Prime Minister of Great Britain from 1721 until 1742. However, Walpole was a leading figure of the Whig Party and a cabinet government developed under him from 1705 until 1721, when he became the official Prime Minister, see: Stephen Taylor, "Robert Walpole, first earl of Orford (1676-1745)," in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, (Online ed.) Oxford University Press.

<sup>59</sup> The Toleration Act (1712), the Patronage Act (1711), and the Malt Tax (1724) are but some examples of the active involvement of the British government in Scottish affairs.

Lords, which nearly dissolved the union.<sup>60</sup> Although the proposal was never likely to pass, the symbolic element of Scottish protest towards state interference in cultural institutions triggered Walpole to grant Scotland greater autonomy. It was against this backdrop of “English”<sup>61</sup> intrusions that the Scottish cultural nationalists attempted to reaffirm their freedom by assisting in the formation of a national community.

### ***Introduction***

All nationalisms maintain a cultural dimension. However, many scholars find it necessary to distinguish between political and cultural nationalism.<sup>62</sup> In theory, it may be difficult to distinguish between the two as they often overlap on ideas of self-determination. However, even though political and cultural nationalisms overlap in many respects, it stands to reason that they maintain different aims. As mentioned previously, the primary demarcation between the two is the end goal: an independent state or a national community. Even still, there has been a tendency to conflate the nation with the state and to focus on nationalisms that pursue state-building objectives.

Cultural nationalism is evident because the concept remains at the heart of nationalism, that of the nation, referring to an aggregate of people whose particular character is at least in part constituted by cultural factors.<sup>63</sup> Nonetheless, culture was treated as a mere side product of the wider societal developments that strived towards statehood.<sup>64</sup> Political nationalists argue that cultural activities were manifestations of the nation rather than as preoccupations of nationalism.<sup>65</sup> However, sidelining culture as a sub-standard of nationalism was in accordance with the understanding that statehood remains the primary goal. Scotland no longer had a state after 1707, therefore, as Tom Nairn has posited, the cohesion of the Scottish community post-union had to be based on culture, because it could no longer be based on politics.<sup>66</sup>

---

<sup>60</sup> T. M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation*, 22.

<sup>61</sup> Even though the intrusion was supported on the basis of the British government, the Scottish opposition in both the House of Commons and the House of Lords allowed for the English representation.

<sup>62</sup> For a comprehensive analysis of this argument, see Susanna Rabow-Edling *Slavophile thought and the politics of cultural nationalism* (New York: State University of New York Press, 2006).

<sup>63</sup> Joep Leerseem, *Nationalism and the Cultivation of Culture*, 559.

<sup>64</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), Introduction.

<sup>65</sup> Joep Leerseem, *Nationalism and the Cultivation of Culture*, 561.

<sup>66</sup> Tom Nairn, *The Break Up of Britain*, 196.

In this chapter, I will discuss that in the absence of a parliament, civil society became a primary vehicle on which to revive the national community. In Scotland, the civil society was understood within the frame of the public sphere. The public sphere was characterised as a platform in which all members of society can participate in discussions about the future of the country. In doing so, the public sphere created a dual attachment. Firstly, amongst the community as they served to *Scotticise* everyday social interactions, thereby reinforcing the Scottish community. Secondly, it developed an attachment to the nation, as people felt that though the *Scotticisation* process, only the Scottish community could guide the nation and its direction. Although the public sphere is multifaceted, in this chapter I will illustrate the role of the public sphere in Scotland through the varied learned societies that emerged shortly after the union.

### ***Depoliticising the political process***

Even though political and cultural nationalisms maintain different goals, Miroslav Hroch had demonstrated that both are expressed in an institutional arrangement.<sup>67</sup> Common to the interpretations of political nationalism is that cultural institutions maintain little importance within the nationalist process, and if they persist, are absorbed into political ambitions.<sup>68</sup>

Despite this, cultural nationalism argues that a national community is a spontaneous social order, it cannot be created like a state from above, but only from the bottom-up,<sup>69</sup> typically crystallised by civil society.<sup>70</sup> They argue that cultural institutions complement the social order because common pride in the nation's history and culture allows for social solidarity to be combined with a dynamic cultivation of the community,<sup>71</sup> whereas political nationalism calls for unity based on a legal uniformity within the context of the state.

---

<sup>67</sup> Miroslav Hroch, *The Social Preconditions of National Revivals in Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 155-163.

<sup>68</sup> Key examples of this process include postcolonial cultural movements, including Indian independence ambitions against the British and South African anti-apartheid ambitions.

<sup>69</sup> John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 400.

<sup>70</sup> Both cultural and political nationalisms, however, promote the rise of a civil society. The demarcation is that political nationalism sees a civil society as a means to an end of gaining an independent state, whereas cultural nationalism sees the rise of a civil society as an end in itself as the driver of progress.

<sup>71</sup> In this case, the term "community" is to be distinguished from the "constructed" order exercised by the state, see John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 400.

The civil society that cultural nationalism encourages is a citizenry engaged in a diversified public sphere in which all can participate,<sup>72</sup> no matter of social, economic, political, or religious status.<sup>73</sup> In strict terms, civil society or the public sphere refers to those areas of social life, notably the domestic world, the economic, cultural activities, and even local political matters that are organised by private or voluntary arrangements between individuals and groups outside the direct control of a central state.<sup>74</sup> As such, in the experience of stateless nations, civil society assumes a leadership function in guiding the nation. Cultural nationalism argues that the national community can only be revived if it is composed of an extensive and bounded network of self-activated individuals and groups who frequently function like a state but are not equal to it.

The implication of the leadership role that civil society assumed was that the key function for the clubs was to revive the national community by formulating a sense of devotion between members of the community and creating a sense of attachment between the population and the nation. Unlike political nationalism, where devotion was directed to the parliament, as the primary vehicle of the state, cultural nationalisms created a devotion between the people, who were the underlying force of the national community and a sense of devotion attached to the nation as members now felt they had a stake in its future.

But how does this apply to Scotland? After all, Scotland had relinquished its statehood and one might expect that cultural institutions had been subject to the rule and coercion of the British state. There is an important truth to this, but as noted earlier, the British state retreated in influencing Scottish affairs following Prime Minister Robert Walpole's decision. The granting of autonomy by Walpole allowed Scotland to survive as a distinct civil society within the confines of a unitary British state.<sup>75</sup>

---

<sup>72</sup> The public sphere, broadly defined, is an area of social life where individuals can come together to freely identify and discuss social problems, and through these discussions, influence political action. See: Jürgen Habermas, *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into the category of bourgeois society* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1989), 6.

<sup>73</sup> John Hutchinson, *Cultural Nationalism*, 76.

<sup>74</sup> David McCrone, *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a nation* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 42.

<sup>75</sup> Lindsay Paterson, "Ane end of ane auld sang: sovereignty and the renegotiation of the Union," in *Scottish Government Yearbook*, ed. A. Brown and D. McCrone (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), 105.

### *Scotland's public sphere crystallised*

The concept of a civil society had operated in a number of ways in eighteenth-century Scotland. It typically crystallised in a dense network of voluntary organisations and institutions which resulted from day-to-day interactions between people. Specifically, it took the form of semi-state bodies, most notably in the form of varied learned societies<sup>76</sup>. The distinctive feature of the public sphere in Scotland is that they operated according to Scottish rules and with Scottish members. In other words, setting up a learned society was used as a way of diluting politics in the face of relinquishing statehood, but also became the building blocks on which a national community could be erected.<sup>77</sup> They did this by inspiring a spontaneous love for the nation through a large scale-solidarity, constituted by the feeling of sacrifice that had been made in the past and of those one is willing to make in the future.<sup>78</sup>

The public sphere in Scotland gained its legitimacy through its broad support. Since legitimacy could no longer be derived from the Scottish parliament, since it had been disbanded, it had to gain its legitimacy in directing the country from the only other alternative source, the Scottish people.<sup>79</sup> To put more simply, cultural nationalists draw upon civil society as the root source of legitimacy in the absence of a state. The implications of the public sphere were to open up as opposed to closing down channels of communication between members of the community. Since the parliamentary system manufactured a divide between the political and common classes, the public sphere eliminated this problem by creating an integrated network within the Scottish community.

The key role of the public sphere in Scotland was to act as a bridge between the old Scotland, the state, and the new Scotland, the nation. The Scottish community remained and was not

---

<sup>76</sup> Although there is a debate surrounding the formal differences between a 'club', a 'society', and an 'association', I will use each of these interchangeably, or in an overarching theme of learned societies, see: D. D. McElroy, "The Literary Clubs and Societies of Eighteenth Century Scotland, and their influence on the literary productions of the period from 1700 to 1800" (PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1952).

<sup>77</sup> Anand C. Chitnis, *The Scottish Enlightenment: A Social History* (Totowa: Rowan and Littlefield, 1976), 195.

<sup>78</sup> Ernest Renan, "What is a Nation?" in *Becoming National*, ed. Geoff Eley and Ronald Grigor Suny (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), 53.

<sup>79</sup> The term Scottish people was used here as opposed to Scottish nation to capture the breadth of the organisational representation in the public sphere.



amalgamated into a broader British community because associational life was distinctly Scottish. In post-union Scotland, the density of associational networks served to *Scotticise* everyday social interactions. In other words, as we shall see in the next section, even though the Scottish community had existed for centuries, the Scottish community was revived post-union because of a newly-founded access to participate in the legitimate source of cohesion, civil society. The Scottish community revived itself, not because of an ancient connection to a state that now ceased to exist but because national identity was carried by a multitude of social organisations and institutions that was known as the public sphere. Nevertheless, the cultural institutional apparatus of the public sphere, whether it be educational, legal, or religious, provided a social template which has not only sustained Scotland as an idea, but has given it a social system of governance, a governance that was initially lost in 1707. To put more simply, the Scottish people are sustained as a community through its institutional practices.

The public sphere preached a revival of the community by returning to the spirit of the past encoded in Scottish culture.<sup>80</sup> In politics, the direction of the nation-state is directed by politicians and parliament. The traditional political leadership in post-union Scotland was discredited, and as a result, those involved in the public sphere assumed a leadership role. Those associated discussed and collaborated for the good of the nation and the national community.

The next section will, for the sake of simplicity, provide an empirical example of the varied learned societies. These societies gathered over port and claret, mainly in the many taverns around metropolitan Scotland, the *literati* exchanged ideas in a convivial atmosphere and aimed to enlighten the community.<sup>81</sup> As *The Scots Magazine* in 1755 put it: “The mission of these gentlemen was, by practice to improve themselves in reasoning and eloquence, and by the freedom of debate, to discover the most effectual methods of promoting the goods of the country”.<sup>82</sup> The Scottish public sphere was inclusive and comprised historians, scientists,

---

<sup>80</sup> John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 400.

<sup>81</sup> Rosalind Carr, “The Gentlemen and the Soldier: Patriotic Masculinities in Eighteenth Century Scotland,” *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies* 28, no. 2 (November 2008): 110.

<sup>82</sup> “An Account of the Select Society of Edinburgh,” *The Scots Magazine* 17 no. 1 (January 1755): 126-127.

political economists, philosophers, businessmen, doctors, and many other intellectuals.<sup>83</sup> These men sacrifice themselves for the nation not on the battlefield but through their time and energy in attempting to make the Scottish community more cohesive.

In the decades that followed the Acts of Union cultural institutions sprang up around Scotland: The Rankenian Club (1716), The Political Economy Club (1743), and The Poker Club (1762) are the selected few that I will provide illustrations as to their structure and how they engineered the conditions for the revival of the national community.<sup>84</sup> These clubs offered a new direction, by which the basis of the national community shifted from politics to culture.

### ***The Rankenian Club (1716)***

The first crystallisation of a learned society in Scotland came with the formation of the Rankenian Club in 1716, with the intention of tackling philosophical issues.<sup>85</sup> The initial impetus for the club's formation was to understand the conditions unto which Scotland entered the union. For centuries Scotland had successfully engaged in military defensive encounters with their more powerful southern neighbour. The sacrifices made by the likes of William Wallace and Robert the Bruce remain edged into the minds of all Scots. However, the understanding for joining politically with a once revered foe lay in the challenge, not on the battlefield but in the space of ideas, particularly Scotland's inability to absorb ideas that challenged the established order.

One specific idea that the Rankenian Club tackled was Francis Hutchinson's theory of moral sense. The theory revolved around the premise that members of the community were pleased

---

<sup>83</sup> For a concrete example of the inclusivity of these clubs, see: T. M. Devine and Gordon Jackson, *Glasgow: Beginnings to 1830* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1995), Chapter 4.

<sup>84</sup> W. J. Argyle has described the process of revival in cultural nationalism as first identifying the nation, elaborating the nation within its context, and forming permanent cultural organisations to muster the population, see: W. J. Argyle, "Size and Scale as Factors in the Development of Nationalist Movements," in *Nationalist Movements*, ed. Anthony D. Smith (London: Macmillan, 1976).

<sup>85</sup> Arthur Herman, *How the Scots Invented the Modern World: The True Story of How Western Europe's Poorest Nation Created Our World and Everything in It* (New York: Three Rivers Press, 2001), 200.

with other member's happiness and uneasy at their misery.<sup>86</sup> The Rankenian Club became instrumental in the widespread adoption of enlightenment ideals and as a result Hutchenson's moral sense. This propagates what Richmond Campbell identifies as communal loyalty. By invoking a sense of empathy amongst the community, and through this, people feel morally inclined to sacrifice themselves for the entire community in pursuit of the community's happiness.<sup>87</sup>

Furthermore, the Rankenian Club became instrumental in the establishment of a registry of births, deaths, and marriages in Scotland through its offshoot platform,<sup>88</sup> the *Scots Magazine* (1739).<sup>89</sup> The Rankenian Club's ability to facilitate the creation of multiple registries served the purpose of what Norbert Elias notes as a human society.<sup>90</sup> As Scotland had a somewhat diluted image of a nation-state given their incorporation into the British state, the registry of births, deaths, and marriages created the idea that each individual is connected to each other through the nation. As such, the Rankenian Club proliferated the revival of the national community through allowing the Scottish people to be governed by the same moral conscious, that is, a devotion to each other and furthermore provided links for individuals so as to be absorbed into a broader Scottish nation.

### ***The Political Economy Club (1743)***

The Political Economy Club was founded in 1743 as a direct result of Glasgow's growing commercial environment. It is well documented that the primary impetus for Scotland entering into a union with England was for economic reasons. Although the majority of those who voted in favour of union were supporters of independence, they voted in favour based on what was best for the community, the advancement of economic conditions. They sacrifice their personal beliefs for the good of the community. Decades after the union, the economic

---

<sup>86</sup> Historically, Hutchinson's theory had not taken hold in Scotland primarily due to the class division that existed.

<sup>87</sup> Richmond Campbell, "Moral Epistemology," in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (online ed.) Stanford University Press, 2003.

<sup>88</sup> A. W. Ward, *The Cambridge History of English Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 614.

<sup>89</sup> Trevor Royle, *Macmillan Companion to Scottish Literature* (London: Macmillan Press, 1982), 258.

<sup>90</sup> Norbert Elias, *The Civilising Process* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1978), 254.

prosperity that was envisioned became a reality,<sup>91</sup> and the aim of the Political Economy Club was to maintain this prosperity so that the sacrifices made would not go to waste.

According to Alexander Carlyle, in his autobiography, he stated that the club's express design was to inquire into the nature and principles of trade.<sup>92</sup> From the outset, the club attracted support from merchants, businessmen, traders, farmers, and the peasantry as it was deemed that a prosperous economy would bring forth a cohesive community. The overarching theme within the Political Economy Club was that economic prosperity could be used as an instrument for the spiritual development of the Scottish people and as a result, the revival of the Scottish community. The spontaneous love for the nation emerged from the fact that the gamble of entering into a union for economic purposes had paid off.

### ***The Poker Club (1762)***

In 1757, the Westminster parliament passed the Militia Act of 1757, allowing England to establish a militia outside the British military apparatus. Soon after, various members from the intellectual elite became instrumental in promoting the Militia Act of 1760 to be tabled at the House of Commons, which called for the same conditions to be granted to Scotland. In tabling the motion, these members firmly believed that the establishment of a national force was essential for the grace and dignity of the nation.<sup>93</sup> Although the motion was rejected, the *Poker Club* was established in 1762 as a result. The club was founded by Adam Ferguson and Alexander Carlyle discussing the cause of promoting the establishment of a militia in Scotland.<sup>94</sup>

Although the rejection of the militia disallowed members of the community to sacrifice themselves in a physical form for the defence of the nation, the *Poker Club* became a platform where members of the community could sacrifice themselves in an intellectual capacity. Historically, the militia was a fundamental pillar of the Scottish nation and the clan system in which they operated provided a sense of shared identity amongst members of the community and the rejection of the Westminster parliament to re-establish a historical point

---

<sup>91</sup> T. C. Smout, "The Anglo-Scottish Union of 1707. I. Economic Background," *The Economic History Review* 16, no. 3 (1994): 459.

<sup>92</sup> Alexander Carlyle, *Autobiography of the Rev. Dr. Alexander Carlyle, Minister of Inversk* (Boston: Ticknor and Fields, 1861), 81.

<sup>93</sup> Richard Sher, "Adam Ferguson, Adam Smith and the problem of national defense," in *The Journal of Modern History* 61, no. 2 (June 1989): 243-244.

<sup>94</sup> *Ibid.*

of bondage instilled fear within members who felt that the cohesive elements of the community could continually be eroded.<sup>95</sup> As such, following the club's discussions, the British army eventually adopted various elements of the Scottish militia into the British imperial apparatus. Although the entity of the militia had been abandoned, remnants of the Scottish community could continue to live on in the new political and military reality.

### ***Conclusion***

A national community should not be treated as a unitary concept implying internal homogeneity, but as a loose confederation of overlapping networks of social interaction. Hence, a national community is a unit within whose boundaries are governed by social interaction. As each club discusses the national level, 'Scotland', this suggests the national community is the most important interaction network. The argument goes that the state is too small to solve the larger issues and too big to be sensitive to the local conditions. It is through this inadequacy that the civil society in the form of the public sphere emerged in Scotland.

The learned societies in Scotland constituted a minority of the public sphere, but they serve as a firm example of the dynamics of cultural nationalism. The members of the clubs were Scottish, discussing Scottish matters and under Scottish rules. They socialised within the club setting, not for personal ambition but for the good of the nation and its manifestations. In the midst of this, cultural nationalism became prominent as a rallying point for the intellectual class as a result of the Acts of Union. These sentiments do not suggest the desire for independent statehood, nor do they suggest anything remotely political. The nationalism that was exhibited by many Scots within the club setting was cultural. The British state was detached from household debate. The public sphere, as such, engineered the conditions for a climate of bonding between members of society and a sense of attachment to the nation. The vacuum left by a retreating Robert Walpole allowed the core of the intellectual community to identify and discuss what was the best path for the nation to take.

---

<sup>95</sup> A Scottish clan is a kinship group amongst the Scottish people. Clans gave a sense of shared identity and descent to members, see Martin MacGregor, "Clans of the Highland and Islands," in *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, ed. Michael Lynch (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 96.

## **Chapter Three**

### **Church of Scotland as Moral Innovator**

## ***Introduction***

Many of the political scholars of nationalism perceive cultural nationalism as a reactionary movement, which either seeks to block or is irrelevant to modernisation.<sup>96</sup> Common to these interpretations is that when faced with a more advanced external threat, cultural nationalism sought to secure the survival of the national community by adopting neo-traditionalism in order to reinforce the historic community.

This interpretation is a circumstantial one. Indeed, many cultural nationalists often impose a neo-traditional outlook in politics, religion, or society to insulate from the influences of foreign cultures.<sup>97</sup> The conventional scholarship has been that since Scotland lost its formal political independence in 1707, it did not have a national culture worthy of distinction. It lacked distinctiveness in terms of language and economics, being both English speaking and maintaining similar economic patterns and structures, and now it had chosen to merge its politics with its richer, more powerful and more modernised southern neighbour. Despite this, religion has been one of the persistent cultural characteristics of Scotland which distinguish it from its southern neighbour.<sup>98</sup>

In this chapter I will argue that the assumption of cultural nationalism adopting neo-traditionalism in the wake of modernisation has been mischaracterized in the Scottish case. Indeed, there were fragments of Scottish society that adopted neo-traditionalism as a principle of survival, but I will argue that the general trend puts forward not a primitivist but an evolutionary vision for the community.<sup>99</sup> Cultural nationalists in Scotland rejected neo-traditionalism as the basis on which to revive the national community, for traditionalism, that is, was rooted in an independent state, something that Scotland no longer had, nor did it advocate for an outright adoption of modernisation processes advocated for by integration with England, as this would undermine the unique Scottish qualities of the past. Cultural nationalists instead acted as *moral innovators*, which established ideological movements at times of social crisis in order to transform traditional belief-systems of communities and provide models for socio-political development that guide modernising strategies.<sup>100</sup> In doing

---

<sup>96</sup> Hans Kohn, *The Idea of Nationalism*, 429-430; Gellner *Nations and Nationalism*, 57-61.

<sup>97</sup> John Hutchinson, *Re-Interpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 402.

<sup>98</sup> See Callum Brown, *The Social History of Religion in Scotland since 1730* (London: Methuen, 1987), Chapter 1.

<sup>99</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 30.

<sup>100</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 30-31.

so, I will argue that the Church of Scotland provided a new map of identity for the Scottish community by combining virtues of historical tradition and modern progress at times when established practices and identities were shaken.<sup>101</sup>

I will begin by dispelling the myth that cultural nationalism is a reactionary movement. To do this, I will explain how cultural nationalism became a modernising movement through modes of moral innovation. Following on, I feel it is necessary to discuss the historical conditions unto which the Church of Scotland felt threatened by English modernisation and how the threat of modernisation affected the Church's outlook. Finally, I will discuss the practical elements in which the Church of Scotland, under the leadership of the Moderate Party promoted *moral innovation* in reviving the national community, notably in finding a middle ground between traditionalists and progressives in assisting the poor.

### ***Cultural Nationalism as a Modernising Movement***

Many scholars of nationalism agree that cultural nationalism makes a positive contribution to the task of unifying the national community within a given territory. But even among these, there is a consensus that cultural nationalism is a regressive force, which when confronted with modernisation, compensate for feelings of inferiority by retreating into history to claim descent from a once great civilisation.<sup>102</sup> These cultural nationalists seek to turn the nation into a folk museum, retreating into a mythical golden past.<sup>103</sup>

This idea was put forward by Ernest Gellner, who presents a paradoxical relationship between cultural nationalism and modernisation. Gellner argues that cultural nationalism is the creation of elites in backward societies, who, when threatened with a modernised society on which they cannot compete with, advocate for a nostalgic return to the pristine integrated world of folk and engage in linguistic and cultural reconstruction. He further suggests that the elites dramatise the grievances of the national community against an alien bureaucratic order to create an otherness towards the threat in the hope that this will galvanise support for the protection of the national community.<sup>104</sup>

---

<sup>101</sup> John Hutchinson, *Cultural Nationalism*, 86.

<sup>102</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 30.

<sup>103</sup> John Hutchinson, *Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 402.

<sup>104</sup> Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, 57-61.



In eighteenth-century Scotland, almost the opposite is the case. In the wake of modernisation encountered by the union with England, cultural nationalists rejected tradition as the basis of the revival of the national community and instead attempted to innovate by recreating the nation through an integration of tradition and progress,<sup>105</sup> so as to reinforce the uniqueness of the nation. Therefore, in the analysis of eighteenth-century Scotland, the political nationalism associated with Gellner deserves a reduced role.

Political nationalism holds that encountering external modes of modernisation creates a conflict over how to respond. However, it is common amongst cultural nationalists to view conflict as an essential component for the revival of the community, for it is only out of struggle and decay, can a nation regenerate itself.<sup>106</sup> Cultural nationalism is typically personified at times of social conflict between traditionalists and progressivists generated by the impact of external modes of modernisation on the established social order.<sup>107</sup> It is through this traditional-modern conundrum that cultural nationalists advance the revival of the national community by a means of a return to the inspiration of the national past, without truly being absorbed in its traditionalism.

As a movement, cultural nationalism rejects both traditionalism and progressivism as the basis of the national community.<sup>108</sup> Traditionalism sought the *survival* of the national community by embedding it within traditions of the past, thereby enclosing the national community within a stagnant representation. Progressivism sought a *reconstruction* of the national community, whereby tradition was abandoned because of its outdated irrelevance to society and instead, adopted foreign, more modern models of societal organisation, thereby discarding the uniqueness of the nation.

As a movement, cultural nationalism renounces the polarising effects between traditionalism and progressivism, arguing that they are both degenerations to the national community. They admire traditionalism and the human scale of the traditional community with its rootedness in the cohesive elements, namely, nature, family, and locality, but reject traditionalists' otherworldliness and its barriers to the equal contribution of all members of society as a

---

<sup>105</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 32.

<sup>106</sup> *Ibid*, 33.

<sup>107</sup> John Hutchinson, *Re-Interpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 402.

<sup>108</sup> Although it is common with scholarly interpretations of cultural nationalism to view the struggle as between traditionalism and modernism. For the sake of simplicity, as we shall see later, I will refer to modernism as progressivism in an ideological sense.

corruption of native values.<sup>109</sup> Similarly, they admire modernism's adherence to principles of rationality with a commitment to a mobile social order, but oppose its adherence to external universalist principles of modernisation.<sup>110</sup> Cultural nationalism as such, combines the virtues of both: the sense of unique identity provided by traditionalism with the vision of the community provided by modernism.<sup>111</sup>

Therefore, cultural nationalists should be considered as *moral innovators* - providing a new direction for society in times of social crisis.<sup>112</sup> Moral innovation seeks to revive a historical vision of the nation by redirecting the energies of traditionalism and modernism away from conflict and instead unite them in the task of constructing an integrated, distinctive, and autonomous community.<sup>113</sup> Cultural nationalism adopts *moral innovation* as a tool to transform the meanings of tradition and progress so as to infuse a new nationalist into the community by which distinction can be achieved not through an either-or scenario but through the integration of both. Progress had to be reduced from its universal application.<sup>114</sup> As modernity is guided by an internationalist framework, it needs to be appropriated to local conditions. Tradition, which holds relevance as the 'true' nature and representation of a society has to be discredited to its adherents. Discrediting tradition does not serve to eliminate tradition altogether, but it serves the purpose of illustrating that tradition is not a stagnant phenomenon, it remains a product of a mobile society whose past glories have resulted from a constant interchange with other cultures.<sup>115</sup> More often than not, as history has taught, modernisation comes not from the imposition of external alien norms onto a community but from a reflection of this modernisation, how it can best serve the individual community, and through this, processes of inner reformation can occur to the traditional order.

Cultural nationalism, therefore, is an evolving political movement. It disavows the passive isolationism of the traditionalists and presents the nation as a continually progressing culture in active contact with other societies.<sup>116</sup> Similarly, it disavows the assimilatory policies of modernism by providing a powerful critique of attempts to impose a foreign model of

---

<sup>109</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 33.

<sup>110</sup> *Ibid*, 33-34.

<sup>111</sup> *Ibid* 33.

<sup>112</sup> John Hutchinson, *Re-Interpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 402.

<sup>113</sup> *Ibid*, 403.

<sup>114</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 34.

<sup>115</sup> *Ibid*.

<sup>116</sup> *Ibid*, 35-36.

modernisation. Each nation is unique and maintains its own path to follow. Cultural nationalism, therefore, must be selected and adapted with respect to Scotland's uniqueness in historical circumstances to realise the sources of Scottish culture. The results of this have been particularly evident to the intelligentsia and involved with the Church of Scotland. Denying the necessary dominance of the English (religious system), they select from those alternative models the elements that will achieve their primary goal - the formation of a national community. The English model was subordinated in favour of indigenous values and modes of organisation. The motto of the Church of Scotland, *nec tamen consumebatur* - yes, it was not consumed - provides a striking metaphor for the Church's resilience against foreign models of religious affiliation.

### ***The Social Crisis in Scotland***

After the convening struggles of the seventeenth-century, Presbyterianism was restored as the established Church of Scotland. The restoration came about following the Glorious Revolution of 1688-89 as part of the Revolution Settlement of 1690.<sup>117</sup> The authority of Catholic bishops within the ecclesiastical hierarchy was abolished, and the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church was now the supreme governing body in Scotland. Nevertheless, the return to Presbyterianism in Scotland seemed to be insecure to many of its adherents. This insecurity was manifested in the idea that although Catholicism as a threat had largely deteriorated, the English Anglican Church provided a more modern, contemporary view of religious institutionalism. Though Scotland and England both shared a deep aversion to Catholicism, the distinctively Calvinist nature of the Scottish Church nevertheless separated the Scots from their southern neighbour.

In response, the Scottish parliament felt compelled to introduce limited reform, when in 1695, they ratified an old statute making opposition to the Church a capital offence to ensure the Church's survival, thus confirming in law, the state-sanctioned power the Church maintained.<sup>118</sup> State support for the Church was challenged with the possibility of an Anglo-Scottish union, as a closer association with England would reimpose the bishop system, albeit

---

<sup>117</sup> Thomas Ahnert, *The Moral Culture of the Scottish Enlightenment, 1690-1805* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014), 17.

<sup>118</sup> T. M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation*, 64.

Anglican.<sup>119</sup> The concern for the Church was that its independent Calvinist nature was at risk, as it would be assimilated into a broader, more modernised British Protestant framework.<sup>120</sup>

Similar to the reforms made in 1695, legal assurances were given to the Church by the Westminster parliament in the form of the Act of Security of the Church of Scotland (Security Act) in November 1706, preserving the integrity of the Calvinist nature of the Church of Scotland and outlawing other religious affiliations.<sup>121</sup> However, these assurances were called into question with the introduction of the Patronage Act (1711), which enabled the Westminster government to monitor and select the types of ministers for local parishes around Scotland,<sup>122</sup> and the Toleration Act (1712),<sup>123</sup> which granted the right for Scottish Episcopalians loyal to the Crown to worship freely without legal persecution by using the English Prayer Book.<sup>124</sup> Both Acts outraged the Church as it undermined the very nature of the Security Act. The consequences of the undermining of the Security Act created tensions amongst those associated with the Church over how to respond: adopt a neo-traditional Calvinist stance to reassert the Church's uniqueness from Anglicanism or progressively be absorbed into a broader British religious framework.<sup>125</sup>

### ***The Church of Scotland as Moral Innovators***

In explaining Scotland's character, history, and national attitude, nothing is more important than religion.<sup>126</sup> Similarly, as Callum Brown had pointed out, religion in Scotland had an important bearing on national consciousness. Scotland's religious history and unique set of religious circumstances had influenced politics for centuries. For a people whose sense of

---

<sup>119</sup> Karen Bowie, "Popular Resistance, Religion and the Union of 1707," in *Scotland and the Union 1707-2007*, ed. T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), 39.

<sup>120</sup> Hugh Blair, *An Analysis of the Moral and Religious Sentiment contained in the writings of Sopho, and David Hume Esq; & co* (Edinburgh, 1755), 22.

<sup>121</sup> Her Majesty's Stationery Office, "Protestant Religion and Presbyterian Church Act 1707," National Archives of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (1707), <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/aosp/1707/6>

<sup>122</sup> Robert Gillan, *An Abridgement of the Acts of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland: from the year 1638 to 1820 inclusive to which is Subjoined an Appendix Containing an Abridged View of the Civil Law Relating to the Church* (Edinburgh, 1821), 41-47.

<sup>123</sup> Douglas M. Murray, "Presbyterian Church and denominations, post-1690," in *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, ed. Michael Lynch (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2001), 83-85.

<sup>124</sup> The non-loyal Episcopalians continued to survive in the Highlands and continued to use the Scottish Liturgy.

<sup>125</sup> Thomas Ahnert, *The Moral Culture of the Scottish Enlightenment*, 18.

<sup>126</sup> Alastair Murdoch, *Religion and Scottish National Identity: Governing Scottish Presbyterianism in the eighteenth century* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015), Introduction.

nationhood was removed following the Acts of Union in 1707, religion remained one of the few facets of Scottish cultural life in which collective identity could survive.<sup>127</sup>

John Hutchinson has argued that religion, and specifically religious reform movements are an important group in cultural nationalism as they typically embody the first constituency of cultural nationalism.<sup>128</sup> Therefore, given the role of religion as a key pillar of Scotland's national consciousness, religious reformism within the Church of Scotland can assist in explaining the dynamics of cultural nationalism.

Cultural nationalism in its objective of reviving the national community is quite different from state-oriented nationalism. As mentioned earlier on, cultural nationalism is often generated from a grass-roots strategy in the absence of statehood. To demonstrate the distinct role that cultural nationalism plays in Scotland, one would have to show that the definition of the Scottish community is culturally unique and that the national community rests on some objective foundations. In Scotland, its religious structure and organisation made it culturally unique and the objective foundations rested on the basis of Calvinism as a distinct representation of the Scottish community.

John Hutchinson has noted that grass-roots strategies associated with religious reformism are typically crystallized by small groups of secular educated clergy who cluster around educational institutions.<sup>129</sup> In the Church of Scotland, clergy created a loose network of affiliation, along the lines of traditionalism and modernism seeking to build a distinctive national culture from the ground up.<sup>130</sup> These ministers were drawn together to defend the Scottish community from the threat of English intrusions, of repeating the experiences of the Toleration and Patronage Acts.

One of the clusters, the modernists, was led by Robert Wodrow. Common to the modernist interpretation was the Church needed to achieve a greater synthesis between science and

---

<sup>127</sup> Callum Brown, *The Social History of Religion in Scotland since 1730* (London: Methuen, 1987), 6.

<sup>128</sup> Anthony D. Smith has noted that in the face of a social crisis, three responses are typical: neo-traditionalism, assimilation, and reformism.

<sup>129</sup> In Scotland, religion and education had been bound together for centuries and it was common if not obliged for many who wished to attain a ministerial position within the Church of Scotland to have a formal tertiary education.

<sup>130</sup> The very nature of the ground up echoes the nature of the adoption of Presbyterianism in Scotland, against the hierarchical nature that was traditional with Catholicism.

religion. Science was categorised in eighteenth-century Scotland as the embodiment of progress, and those who rejected it were condemned to stagnation. Similarly, religion was seen as the proliferation of tradition, religion had remained at the heart of the Scottish community for centuries and although circumstances in Scotland had changed, religion had been transmitted from generation to generation. The synthesis would provide a laicisation of the church, a renovation of dogma into the light of progressive human reason, and the application of religious teachings to improve a temporal lot of the people, resulting in the combining of virtues of both traditionalism and progressivism.<sup>131</sup>

To accommodate the Church to this synthesis, attempts were made to modify the presbytery tradition.<sup>132</sup> Wodrow, argued in favour of a moderate stance within the Church as a medium between traditionalism and modernism.<sup>133</sup> In his, *History of the sufferings of the Church of Scotland (1723-24)*, Wodrow argued that the traditional foundations of the Church had caused stagnation. Similarly, Wodrow plays down the influence of the radicals within the Church, passing them off as extremists and dismisses them as not a representation of the Kirk as a whole. Wodrow maintained the ambition of portraying the Church as one of civic constitutionalism, an institution that did not adhere to radical policies, nor at the same time reject innovation. Wodrow's *History* demonstrated a clear effort to reinvent the Scottish religious tradition into one more suited to the changing political and intellectual environment of the early eighteenth-century.<sup>134</sup>

The modernisation process was not without its repercussions. Ebenezer Erskine, a senior member within the traditionalist cluster led a secessionist movement, which led to the establishment of the Secessionist Church in 1733.<sup>135</sup> According to Erskine, the Church of Scotland was abandoning its foundation of true presbytery principles and because of the

---

<sup>131</sup> John Hutchinson, *The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 38.

<sup>132</sup> See: Callum Brown, "Protest in the pews: interpreting religion and society in fracture during the Scottish economic revolution," in *Conflict and Stability in Scottish Society, 1700-1850*, ed. T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1990).

<sup>133</sup> Calvinism in Scotland had been used as a shorthand term to describe radical fanaticism.

<sup>134</sup> Colin Kidd, *Subverting Scotland's Past* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 68-69.

<sup>135</sup> A. L. Drummond and J. Bullock, *The Scottish Church, 1688-1843* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1973), 41.

prevailing moderate outlook in the established church.... are carrying on a course of defection from our reformed and covenanted principles.<sup>136</sup>

As the eighteenth-century wore on, disputes between the traditionalist and modernist wings about how to guide the Church became more frequent and increasingly bitter. As Erskine had left the established Church in favour of creating his own in 1733 and Robert Wodrow's passing in 1734, a vacuum emerged resulting from a lack of leadership for the clusters.<sup>137</sup> In 1758 and 1759 respectively, John Erskine and William Robertson both became ministers at the Greyfriars Kirk in Edinburgh.<sup>138</sup> Although both ministers at the same parish, Erskine and Robertson affirmed different theological outlooks. Erskine supported the traditionalist nature of the Church and emerged as replacement of Ebenezer Erskine as head of the traditionalist wing of the Kirk, commonly referred to as the Popular Party or Evangelical Party.<sup>139</sup> The Popular Party expressed fear of change, and therefore, rejected innovation by seeking to block ideas of progress that threatened to destroy the traditional customs of the Church. The Popular Party was convinced that the rationality of the Christian faith would overcome the problem of foreign intrusions by arguing that an educative response of Christian theology was necessary.<sup>140</sup>

William Robertson adopted a more moderate position echoing the sentiments of Wodrow that the Church had to find a middle ground between traditionalism and modernism to ensure its survival. Robertson eventually succeeded Wodrow as leader of the Moderate wing of the

---

<sup>136</sup> Note the word reformed in Erskine's quote. This suggests that the traditionalism of Scottish Presbyterianism was itself a reformed entity, which further reinforces the cultural nationalist observation that tradition is not stagnant, see Donald Fraser, *The Life and Diary of Ebenezer Erskine, A.M.: of Stirling, Father of the Secession Church, to which is prefixed a memoir of his father, the Rev. Henry Erskine, of Chirnside* (Edinburgh: W. Oliphant, 1831), 426.

<sup>137</sup> R. B. Sher, "Moderates, Managers and Popular Politics in Mid-Eighteenth Century Edinburgh: The Drysdale 'Bustle' of the 1760s," in *New Perspectives on the Politics and Culture of Early Modern Scotland* ed. J. Dwyer, R. A. Mason, and A. Murdoch (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1982), 179-210.

<sup>138</sup> The Greyfriars Kirk is a parish Church in the Old Town of Edinburgh. Given the Kirk's central location in the Scotland's capital (Edinburgh), Greyfriars Kirk was recognised as the authoritative institution of the Church of Scotland.

<sup>139</sup> It must be noted that from 1733-1758, the traditional wing of the established Kirk was fragmented due to increasing numbers of traditionalists defecting to the Secessionist Church.

<sup>140</sup> J. R. MacIntosh, *Church and Theology in Enlightenment Scotland: The Popular Party 1740-1800* (Great Britain: Tuckwell Press, 1998), 63.

Church and established the Moderate Party.<sup>141</sup> <sup>142</sup> The Moderate Party emerged in the 1750s under the leadership of William Robertson as a party which absorbed rationalism from the Enlightenment, and which despised the traditionalism and excess in religion.<sup>143</sup> The Moderate Party maintained the objective of making the traditionalist outlook of the Church compatible with the foreign models suggested through the Enlightenment.<sup>144</sup>

Underpinning a prominent space within the Church was the Moderate Party's governing ideology, moderatism. Moderatism was generally thought to be the Church's version of religious enlightenment, distancing itself from the more traditional ethos of the Church's past.<sup>145</sup> The exact nature of moderatism, however, remains a matter of prolonged debate. As Colin Kidd has pointed out, historians tend to use the term rather casually, describing a more polite religious outlook compared to the more traditional historical establishment.<sup>146</sup>

The Popular Party were the largest faction within the Church; however, they were less influential due to their divisions, resulting from varied social composition. Although in the minority, the Moderate Party, under Robertson's leadership, held sway in the Church under the political skills and intellectual calibre of its leadership.<sup>147</sup> Because of this sway, the Moderate Party was able to take control over the General Assembly, the governing body of the Church of Scotland. Through moderate control, William Robertson became the de-facto leader of the Church of Scotland.<sup>148</sup>

---

<sup>141</sup> It is important to recognise that the term Moderate was never used officially during the eighteenth-century but is now used in a contemporary sense to capture the dominant mood in the Scottish Church between the 1750s and 1830s.

<sup>142</sup> It is important to note that when referencing the Moderate Party of the Church of Scotland, I am not referencing the progressivism that advocated for an abolishment of tradition in favour of foreign, more advanced. The Moderate Party was instead, the primary vehicle on which cultural nationalism took hold in the Kirk. Under the leadership of William Robertson, it advocated for a middle-ground between traditionalism and modernism in order to bring the community together.

<sup>143</sup> Callum G. Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997), 17-31.

<sup>144</sup> Thomas Ahnert, *The Moral Culture of the Scottish Enlightenment*, 13.

<sup>145</sup> Colin Kidd, "Moderatism," in *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, ed. Michael Lynch (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 514.

<sup>146</sup> Ibid.

<sup>147</sup> Ibid.

<sup>148</sup> I.D.L. Clark, "From Protest to Reaction: The Moderate Regime in the Church of Scotland, 1752-1805," in *Scotland in the age of improvement: essays in Scottish history in the eighteenth century*, ed. Nicholas Phillipson and Rosalind Mitchison (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996), Chapter 2.



The Church that Robertson inherited was one of intrinsic division, inflexibility, and traditionalism. In *The History of Scotland 1542-1603* (1759), Robertson echoed Wodrow's sentiment by discrediting radical progressive Calvinism, claiming that it had done nothing of good for the nation. Robertson also recognised that the Church was in a rapid phase of decay, given this neo-traditional outlook, which enhanced the institution's rigidity, inflexibility, and inability to adapt and change.<sup>149</sup>

To overcome the polarisation that existed in the Church, the Moderate Party under Robertson engaged in *moral innovation* by encouraging a building on top of traditional customs as opposed to obliterating them.<sup>150</sup> The Moderates did this by challenging the traditional attitudes of the Church with the strategic necessity of watering down the high ecclesiology of the seventeenth-century.<sup>151</sup> Although the Moderate Party identified as Calvinist, their form of Calvinism was a less rigid version, one which could be accommodated more adequately in a secular society than the principles of traditional Presbyterianism.<sup>152</sup> In doing so, they presented a historicist vision of the community by presenting an innovative solution of preaching modernisation from within. They were circumspect in holding on to certain traditions and endeavoured to present their claims as to the legitimate outcome of Presbyterian inheritance.<sup>153</sup> The Moderate Party provided the Church with doctrinal flexibility and progressive positioning, resulting in a transitioning away from the traditional nature of the Church.<sup>154</sup> The Moderates, therefore, subjected the whole framework of the Church's religious belief to the same frames of critique as other forms of knowledge.<sup>155</sup>

---

<sup>149</sup> William Robertson, *The History of Scotland: During the Reigns of Queen Mary and of King James VI till his ascension to the Crown of England with a review of Scottish history previous to that period*. (Edinburgh, 1759), 222-223.

<sup>150</sup> Of course, there were conflicts within the movement over the balance struck between conserving distinctive traditions and the promotion of modernisation. Notably, the establishment of the Relief Church in 1752, which saw large numbers of orthodox members of the Kirk defect in the 1750s and 1760s, see Daniel J. Wells, "The Scottish Literati and the Problem of Scottish National Identity" (master's thesis, The University of Western Ontario, 1997, 21, ProQuest (DTG MQ28686)).

<sup>151</sup> Colin Kidd, *Moderatism*, 514.

<sup>152</sup> Thomas Ahnert, *The Moral Culture of the Scottish Enlightenment*, 67.

<sup>153</sup> A noted example of the positive effect of the Moderate Party in reducing the destructive energies of traditionalism and progressivism is William Robertson's close and respectful relationship with John Erskine and Henry Grieve, a senior minister who believed in ideas of progressivism.

<sup>154</sup> The dualism experienced by a middle ground between traditionalism and modernism allowed the institution to enjoy the support, or at least the permission of the people in its role as the moral guardians of the national community, see J. R. McIntosh, "Evangelicals in Eighteenth Century Scotland: The Presbytery of Stirling, 1740-1805 (Master's thesis, Stirling University, 1981), 19-29.

<sup>155</sup> M. A. Stewart, "Religion and rational theology," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. Alexander Broadie (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 31.

Taking up this theme, the Moderate Party argued that the hegemony of traditionalism or modernism was passing. According to Moderate Party ministers, progressivism within the Church had over-developed the international at the expense of the national. Scotland, which had been the formative hub of Calvinism, was destined for a new direction.<sup>156</sup> Alone, Scots had maintained their faith in Calvinism and harmonised this with the new ideas of reformism and modernism. To be modern was to be Scottish, it was traditionalism and progressivism that were outdated.

### *The Church of Scotland and Poverty*

Much of what has been discussed so far has been concerned with the ideological frame and implications of cultural nationalism. This section will provide an empirical account of how the Church of Scotland projected cultural nationalism in practice, through poverty provisions in order to grasp a better understanding of its contemporary relevance outside of the institution.<sup>157</sup>

The Church's role in assisting the poor were established before the union, in the Scottish Government Act of 1574, which provided a legal framework of classifications of poverty, and therefore, who the Church had a legal obligation to assist. The Act of 1574 declared that the Church of Scotland had direct responsibility for looking after the poor, thus enshrining in law the Church's position of poverty provision.

Following the abolishment of the Scottish parliament, the legal frameworks previously adopted become non-binding, therefore, reducing the legal obligations the Church maintained in assisting the poor. The most pressing formality was the legal classification of who could seek assistance from the Church. The old system allowed for only the blind, the crippled, the deaf, or the sick to seek assistance or beg for help. Under the traditionalist guise of the Church, the merely unemployed had to either find work, be imprisoned for seeking assistance, or be banished from the Church altogether.

---

<sup>156</sup> The founder of the Presbyterian Church of Scotland, John Knox held the belief that the Scottish people were chosen by god to be the starting point for the reformed movement, see Geddes MacGregor, *The Thundering Scot* (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1957).

<sup>157</sup> This is primarily to justify that moral innovation did not just occur within the institution but had tremendous impacts for the revival of the Scottish community, see J. R. McIntosh, *Evangelicals in Eighteenth Century Scotland*, 14.

The traditionalist guise of the Church viewed wealth as evil, which needed to be avoided or combatted. Wealth in this sense is an obstacle of faith and the need to assist the poor could only occur because of a loss of touch with Christian ethics. Progressives held the belief that wealth and prosperity were blessings from God and should be encouraged. As Scotland was experiencing economic prosperity as part of the union, a progressive mentality emerged amongst the modernisers, geared towards an individualistic mentality.<sup>158</sup>

The Moderate Party from the 1760s attempted to find a middle-ground between traditionalism and progressivism by combining the virtues of both. They adopted the progressive understanding that wealth and prosperity were a result of faith, thus maintaining the narrative that it was a blessing from God but at the same time adopted the traditionalist understanding of being conscious that as Scotland was experiencing economic prosperity, not all could benefit in the same way. In doing so, the Moderate Party expanded the provisions of poverty relief, encompassing those who had temporary misfortunes or disabilities.<sup>159</sup> The expansion was evidence of the Christian ethics inherent with the Church's traditional role but also recognised the economic potential that Scotland maintained.

During this time, some parishes were spending over half of their revenues on poverty relief programmes. However, the financial cost was of reduced importance to the Moderates. The new expression of the Church was a renovation of established dogma in the Church's narrow scope of assistance and served to bring the Church into the light of progressive rationality. John Gillies, a senior member of the Moderate Party recognised the Church's position as the medium between traditionalism and progressive stance. Firstly, assistance to the poor was considered an essential Christian duty and if the Church were to abandon one of the foundational elements of Christianity, the Church would have lost its soul. In addition, the latter half of the eighteenth-century was a period of sustained, though slow growth in prosperity, which affected many sections of the community, as such the Moderate Party did not feel obligated to reduce this wealth accumulation in the name of Calvinism.<sup>160</sup> In most

---

<sup>158</sup> As Thomas Smout has suggested, 'if we take a long view of Scottish history it does become difficult not to believe that Calvinism contributed certain things which could hardly help but favour the expansion of economic activity and the enrichment of cultural life', see T. C. Smout, *A History of the Scottish People, 1560-1830* (Glasgow: Collins, 1970), 96.

<sup>159</sup> The agricultural community during the long period of crop failure in the 1690s were not eligible to seek assistance. Under the new regime, they could now seek assistance during times of misfortune.

<sup>160</sup> T. C. Smout, "Where had the Scottish economy got to by the third quarter of the 18th century?" in *Wealth and Virtue: The Reshaping of the Political Economy in the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. I. Hont and M. Ignatieff (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1983), 45-72.

cases, the Moderate Party can be accredited as providing a social safety net in the absence of a state.<sup>161</sup>

### ***Conclusion***

Although it may seem counter-intuitive for many traditionalists and progressives to remain in the Church of Scotland as it began to adopt a moderate stance, their commitment to the established Church speaks to a greater point. The traditionalist wing and the progressives maintained the Church's integrity to defend the threatened community against the continuous challenges of English intrusions.<sup>162</sup> Despite this, cultural nationalism revived the Scottish community in two fundamental respects. Firstly, by highlighting the vigour of the historical past, *moral innovation* allowed the modernising groups to harness the traditional elements of the Scottish community for the purpose of modernisation. Secondly, by promoting the traditionalism that was inherent within the Church for centuries, *moral innovation* provided a powerful critique of foreign models of modernisation. The fruits of this were personified by the Moderate Party, contempt with the role to propel the Scottish community not just to survive English intrusions but to revive it so it can be the new vanguard of national progress.

---

<sup>161</sup> Rosalind Mitchison, "The making of the Old Scottish Poor Law," *Past and Present* 63, no. 1 (May 1974), 63.

<sup>162</sup> This is particularly relevant in the Scottish case, as it is often noted that William Robertson and John Erskine had a warm and mutually respectful relationship.

## **Chapter Four**

### Language and Literature

## ***Introduction***

The idea that cultural nationalism is a language movement is persuasive in nationalist scholarship and is coherent with a more general assumption that national and language groups are synonymous.<sup>163</sup> Indeed, a common language has played a role in traditional theories of nationalism, whereby language is seen as a noticeable marker of difference between nations.<sup>164</sup> Both Ernest Gellner and Anthony D. Smith have pointed to the importance of language in directing the identity of the nation.<sup>165</sup>

However, in Scotland's case, as we have cited, Benedict Anderson argued that one of the foundations for an absence of nationalism in Scotland was the lack of linguistic differentiation from England. Therefore, by using the dominant narrative of language and national groups being synonymous, Anderson equates Scotland's voluntary adoption of the English language as reason for the inadequacy of the Scottish nation.

Johann Gottfried Herder cited language as an index of nationality, which reveals the absurdity of nationalism as a political doctrine. However, cultural nationalism is judged irrationally for emphasising the cohesive elements of language in its ability to create a national identity. Critics of cultural nationalism view the ability of language to bring about cohesion as a facade, and are, in practice, political opportunists manipulating symbols to exercise power.<sup>166</sup> Nationalists essentially invent the power that languages have, in order to embed their political goals. Indeed, Elie Kedourie argues that languages, including dialects, are impossible objectively to define, and in the course of meaningless cultural disputes, nationalists have to appeal to cohesive criteria, like politics.<sup>167</sup> He goes on to argue that language is not a means of cohesion within a community, it is simply a mode of communication.<sup>168</sup>

Although there is truth in these declarations, critics misunderstand the nature of language and the role it plays in cultural nationalism. It is a major fault to characterise cultural nationalism

---

<sup>163</sup> John Hutchinson, *Re-Interpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 393.

<sup>164</sup> Chris Chhim and Éric Bélanger, "Language as a public good and national identity: Scotland's competing heritage languages," *Nations and Nationalism* 23, no. 4 (September 2017): 931.

<sup>165</sup> Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, 43; Anthony D. Smith, *Nationalism and Modernism*, 18.

<sup>166</sup> John Hutchinson, *Re-Interpreting Cultural Nationalism*, 394.

<sup>167</sup> Elie Kedourie, *Nationalism* (London: Prahbat, 1966), 73.

<sup>168</sup> *Ibid.*

as a language movement. Language is only one of many indices of nationality cited by cultural nationalists.<sup>169</sup> Even when language is the dominant trope, it is never mentioned alone. Even Herder, the founder of linguistic nationalism lists folksongs, poetry, dancing, and religion as additional emblems of national identity.<sup>170</sup> Additionally, Brass has noted the tendency for many cultural nationalist movements to adopt multiple techniques and construct multiple symbols in the effort of achieving their goal.<sup>171</sup>

In this chapter, I will argue that the role of language in Scotland has been mischaracterized. Language can express the inner consciousness of the nation; its continuity in history, its distinctive ethos, and its morally unifying factor. In doing so, I will discuss the *Scots* language and how it quickly developed as a critical component of cultural nationalism in post-union Scotland.<sup>172</sup> Although *Scots* was never the dominant language in the Scottish literary tradition, the role it played in provoking a sense of common identity will be explained. I will argue that the *Scots* language acted as a cohesive element and a silver lining for many Scots who had become separated from the Scottish past. In post-union Scotland, however, language was but one technique adopted by cultural nationalists. Language often coincided with and became a platform for the romantic movement which used *Scots* to give credibility to the various myths, symbols, and images which served to provide a cohesive element for the Scottish community.

As such, I will illustrate the romantic movement through the works of James Macpherson, Robert Burns, and Walter Scott. In *Ossian* (1761), James Macpherson engineered a myth of the origins of the Scottish people, which triggered an enthusiasm to discover the purest expression of the Scottish people and revive this in modern Scotland. Robert Burns' *Poems, Chiefly in a Scottish Dialect* (1786) depicted the image of Scotland through the Highlands. The Highlands shortcoming in adopting English models served as the region's greatest

---

<sup>169</sup> In an international context, race for Africans and religion for Arabs have all assumed national significance in place of language, see John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 20.

<sup>170</sup> Johann Gottfried Herder, *Reflections on the Philosophy of the History of Mankind* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968), 172, 177, 186.

<sup>171</sup> Paul Brass, "Elite groups, symbol manipulation and ethnic identity among the Muslims of South Asia," in *Political Identity in South Asia*, ed. D. Taylor and M. Yapp (London: Curzon Press, 1979), 51.

<sup>172</sup> While there is considerable debate as to whether *Scots* is classified as a language or a dialect, I adopt the position, along with Derrick McClure that *Scots* is indeed a distinct language on the basis of its systematically different pronunciations, orthography, and grammar, see J. Derrick McClure, *Scots and its Literature* (Aberdeen: John Benjamin Publishers, 1995), Chapter 1, 3, 4.

triumph. Burns portrayed it as the territorial homeland of the nation and in doing so, created an integrating effect by allowing all sections of the Scottish community to root themselves in the Highlands, thereby reaffirming the Scottish community through a geographical region. Walter Scott believed that the geographical entity of the Highlands could only go so far, to further validate the role that Highland played as a representation of Scotland, it had to become a living reality. In *Waverley* (1814), he discusses the ways in which he will achieve this and also through practical experiences with King George IV in 1822, Scott was able to unite the Scottish community through the trend of tartanry. It is not the case that Scottish cultural revival consists of Highlandism and clothing alone, but these have remained important discourses of Scottish culture.

### *The Vernacular revival of Scots*

A common language can provide a sense of community and some sense of security where traditional moral schemes have been disrupted by modernisation. In Scotland, the disruption caused by a union with England took a more lapsed approach. The English language was steadily adopted by Scots for centuries, becoming dominant in the central belt and the Scottish Lowlands, where the majority of the population resided. When speaking of Scottish languages, Gaelic is perhaps the most common example. With the adoption of the English language, Gaelic continually receded to the Scottish Highlands, the Scottish Islands, and the Outer Hebrides.

It has often been pointed out that issues of language have not featured in Scottish nationalism.<sup>173</sup> While it is rare to see any frame of Scottish nationalism focus on language preservation or protection. In eighteenth-century Scotland, language indeed, played a fundamental role in the revival of the national community.

Certainly, explanations within the scholarly literature usually stress the technical or practical reasons for the reduced role that *Scots* plays in promoting a national community. Some point to the absence of a common literary standard within *Scots*, as each region in Scotland maintained their own. The failure of *Scots* to develop as a medium for a modern culture, as as

---

<sup>173</sup> David McCrone, *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a nation* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 50.



it was a hybrid language encompassing element of Gaelic, English, Latin, and Greek and therefore, was not a true representation of the Scottish people.<sup>174</sup> Finally, the scarcity of Scottish-language teachers.

The common interpretation is to view the importance of the English-speaking world in England as a common source of employment and culture, and the Scottish government's failure to sustain *Scots* as a viable economic and social unit. For all these reasons, the pressures of a more dominant language culture, coming from England, overwhelmed the ill-equipped *Scots* language for a new reality. Sentiment in other words, had given way for utility.<sup>175</sup>

Such arguments, although true in the Scottish case, do not reflect the proper reality of *Scots*. According to John Hutchinson, the major trigger for language revival or language creation lay in the attempts of a centralising state to impose an alien language for purposes of cultural homogenisation.<sup>176</sup> Even though English was adopted voluntarily, it would be a mistake to dismiss the homogenisation effects of the English language based on the way it was adopted. To many, English continued to be a representation of the anglicising affects the union had on Scotland. Indeed, Robert Herne noted that following the union, the manners of the English, their fashions, and their mode of speech were slowly beginning to take over.<sup>177</sup> This caused a vacuum within the identity complex of Scotland post-union.

The Scots language is a marker of the distinctive identity of the Scottish people; and as such, for cultural nationalists in Scotland, the revival of *Scots* served as a revival of the unique creative energies of the nation, the memory which anglicised society had lost.<sup>178</sup> The preservation of *Scots* served as a lifeline to the Scottish national heritage and national identity.

Joshua Fishman noted that cultural nationalists use symbols such as language to claim a given group or territory by magnifying the differences between the proposed members of the

---

<sup>174</sup> Marie Robinson, "Scots Language," in *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, ed. Michael Lynch (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 573.

<sup>175</sup> John Hutchinson, *Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism*, 308.

<sup>176</sup> John Breuilly, *Nationalism and the State*, 123-143.

<sup>177</sup> St Edmund Hall, *The "Death" and Reinvention of Scotland*, 7:54.

<sup>178</sup> John Hutchinson, *Cultural Nationalism*, 81.

nation and outsiders, and by minimising divisions within the national group.<sup>179</sup> Thus, the transformation of *Scots* into a common literary standard was employed to unify dispersed populations into communities and distinguish them from the neighbouring English.

The widespread adoption of *Scots* as the vernacular served as a cultural symbol in the process of group formation to signify publicly, a commitment to certain values and systems of ideas. That being, the value of Scottish nationhood and the idea of Scottish identity. Indeed, the publication of *Etymological Dictionary of the Scottish Languages* (1808) by Reverend John Jamieson serves as a practical example for the demand and adoption of a common *Scot* literary standard.

### ***Romanticism as an index of Scottish nationality***

Critics of cultural nationalism claim that the adoption of *Scots* was simply a protest against the status quo. Mainly, it was a protest against the other - the English - whose anglicising effects threatened the integrity of the Scottish community.<sup>180</sup> Such arguments are unconvincing for several reasons. There are no philological grounds which *Scots* acted as an opposing force to English. English remained the dominant form of communication, *Scots* simply acted as supplementary advancement of the Scottish community.

A major strength of nationalists of eighteenth-century Scotland was their ability to use *Scots* as a platform to revive the national community. Language was a medium used in literature to evoke a traditional image of Scotland as a martyred nation. Through this, myths, symbols, and images gained a popular legitimacy as an important index for Scottish nationality. In doing so, romanticists became key drivers in promoting this agenda which excited a strong Scottish representation against the imposition of English society. James Macpherson, Robert Burns, and Walter Scott heightened the case of creating myths, symbols, and images as lifelines to national heritage.

### ***James Macpherson and the myth of Scottish origins***

---

<sup>179</sup> Joshua Fishman, "Nationality-Nationalism and Nation-Nationalism," in *Language Problems of Developing Nations*, ed. J. A. Fishman, C. A. Ferguson and J. Dos Gupta (London: Wiley, 1968), 45.

<sup>180</sup> Hugh Trevor-Roper, *The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland*, 15.

Although national groups throughout history have viewed themselves ancestrally to the past, romanticism intensified, extended, and embedded this sense of belonging, imbuing the defence and regaining of the national territory as a sacred duty.<sup>181</sup> Romanticism attracted a sense of devotion for Scots who viewed myths, images, and symbols as a spiritual resource.

In 1761, James Macpherson published *Ossian* which detailed a portrait of some of the earliest inhabitants in the region of what would become Scotland.<sup>182</sup> Even though it has been widely acclaimed that *Ossian* is a constructed myth, the value of *Ossian* was not in its authority as a record of fact, but in its ability to capture the spirit of the people.<sup>183</sup> The national spirit existed, not in its truth or authenticity but in the believability of its values.<sup>184</sup> Through the creation of a myth, Macpherson saw that they had symbolic importance as a valuable representation about the spirit of the people and of the nation.

What Macpherson was able to achieve was to trigger a competitive enthusiasm in Scotland to rediscover the bonds of the national community, as the myth of Scottish origins was portrayed as the purest expression of the Scottish people. However, Macpherson was not just concerned with recovering the national origins of the Scottish people but to mould these origins in ways that it could express the dynamics and values of the Scottish community, one that was becoming increasingly anglicised and increasingly diverse.

### ***Robert Burns and Scotland's national image***

According to William Butler Yeats, literature, in whatever form, story, poem, novel, is the greatest teaching power of all, it is the ultimate creator of all values.<sup>185</sup> Against the backdrop of the success James Macpherson had in provoking a revival of the Scottish community, Robert Burns, Scotland's national poet began his writings. Robert Burns remains an almost

---

<sup>181</sup> John Hutchinson, *Cultural Nationalism*, 80.

<sup>182</sup> Hugh Blair, *A Critical Dissertation on the Poems of Ossian* (London: T. Becket and P. A. De Hondt, 1763), 357-368..

<sup>183</sup> Adam Ferguson, *An Essay on the History of Civil Society* (Edinburgh, 1767), 76-77.

<sup>184</sup> *Ossian* also performed the function of reforming the Anglophile conception of the Highlander, transforming him from the warrior of the 1745 Battle of Culloden, a representation of intolerance, arrogance, and fanaticism to one of a noble and sentimental neighbour.

<sup>185</sup> William Butler Yeats, *Samhain*, October 1903.

mythic figure in Scotland's national consciousness, as he became widely accredited with keeping Scotland's history, culture and identity alive through his publications.<sup>186</sup>

Inspired by the fervour that *Ossian* had provided the Scottish community, Burns conceived poetry as a medium for reviving the national community, as it was an ancient tradition that evoked a sense of connection to the native culture.<sup>187</sup> It was through his literary models that Burns assured a place as a voice for the people by purifying Scottish literature from the decadent English enthusiasm and base it on the ancient image of the Highlands. What we are illustrating here, is what Denis Cosgrove calls the *terrain of power*. Cosgrove illustrates that the national environment are semiotic symbols, deeply embedded in the cultural constitution of Scotland, and integral to the distinct identity of the Scottish people.<sup>188</sup>

The Highlands remain unmoved, refusing to accept the stereotypes of the English. *Scots* as the dominant language in the region and 'barbaric' customs, sheltered the Highlands from processes of anglicization. As much of the Lowlands were gearing towards the vanguard of human progress through integration in the union and processes of anglicization, the Highlands as a peripheral culture, a barbaric region and a relic of the dark ages. Yet, it was from an advanced intellectual from English-speaking Ayrshire that a movement emerged to revive the national image of Scotland. It was against the backdrop of anglicization that the roles of the Highlands and Lowlands came to be reversed. The Highlands ceased to be barbaric, backward, and a relic of the dark ages. Rather, the Highlands now came to be represented as a territorial homeland, uncorrupted by the effects of anglicization. It was represented through its purity and writers like Burns viewed the Highlands as a repository of a moral image of the nation, it maintained unique characteristics that gave Scotland its individuality, it was a representation of the last true Scotland, when the Lowlands had lost its identity.

---

<sup>186</sup> Craig Cairns, "The Literary Tradition," in *The Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History*, ed. T. M. Devine and Jenny Wormald (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 100.

<sup>187</sup> Unlike the modern English style of literature, which had faded from the traditions of William Shakespeare, scientific realism had taken hold of the tradition. This realism in the eyes of many was spiritually destructive and did not account for the uniqueness of a community.

<sup>188</sup> See, Denis Cosgrove, "Prospect, Perspective and the Evolution of the Landscape Idea," in *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 10, no. 1 (May 1984).

Like most Scots, bound to England and anglicization by blood, language, economics, and union, but whose residence in Scotland put them on the periphery of the union, Burns felt that poetry could act as umbrage against the English, thus reaffirming Scottishness within the community. During the latter part of the eighteenth-century, the union had been consolidated and there was rising political confidence in the political union through Scots participation in the British Empire.<sup>189</sup>

In 1786, Burns published *Poems, Chiefly in Scottish Dialect*, a collection of poems that left a permanent legacy in the Scottish national consciousness. In the collection, Burns regularly represents the Highlands as a fortress of the nation to which groups, especially anglicised urban classes could turn to escape assimilation and experiencing moral regeneration.<sup>190</sup> It provided a site whereby groups from different regions found a common national identity. As David McCrone had pointed, each nation has an imagined geography which acts as a physical representation of the nation.<sup>191</sup> Burns ability to reimagine Scotland through the image of the Highlands had an integrating effect, binding urban classes of the Lowlands to a larger territorial unit by rooting themselves in the defence of an individualised homeland.

### ***Walter Scott and the symbols of Scotland***

After the success of Macpherson and Burns, Scots felt an obligation to acknowledge the Highlands as an official representation of the new nation. For Walter Scott, for the Highlands to gain more credibility as the vanguard of reviving the national community, it had to become a living reality. In doing so, the formation of tartantry, a cultural formation which has involved the appropriation of Highland symbolism by Lowland Scotland has largely been accredited to Scott.

In *Waverley* (1814), Scott illustrates the divisions inherent in Scotland as a result of anglicization, namely in the form of divisions between the Highlands and the Lowlands. Although Burns had gone a long way to alleviate these tensions, there remained an almost natural division between the two regions, the Highlands were still perceived through images

---

<sup>189</sup> The union was consolidated fully following the defeat of the Jacobite rebellion at the Battle of Culloden in 1745, in which the Catholic Jacobite's posed a mounting challenge to the British establishment, see Murray G. H. Pittock, *Jacobitism* (London: Macmillan, 1998).

<sup>190</sup> John Hutchinson, "Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration," in *Nationalism*, ed. John Hutchinson and Anthony D. Smith (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), Chapter 18.

<sup>191</sup> David McCrone, *Understanding Scotland*, 40.

of backwardness because of its failure to anglicise. Through this, Scott expressed the belief in the need for social progress that does not reject the traditions of the past. Scott's main fear was that in the process of modernisation, the customs and traditions of the Highlands would be lost.

Scott overcomes this fear by gentrifying the Highlands without abandoning its core values. The gentrification of the Highlands when Scott persuaded his close friend, King George IV to visit Edinburgh in 1822, the first British monarch to do so since before the union, when Charles II visited in 1651. Scott, as impresario for the visit, seized the opportunity to invent a pageant wherein ancient Scotland would be reborn through the medium of Highland culture. Scott drew heavily from Highland culture to assert the King's familiarity with the Scottish people. He persuaded the King to adore the sartorial elements of the Highlands, the kilt, the spawn, and tartan in an effort to reaffirm Scotland's distinction from England. Because of this, tartan became an instant *symbol* of Scotland and members of polite society eventually adorned their own version.<sup>192</sup>

Even though Scott's experience parallels Hugh Trevor-Roper's account of tartantry in his chapter of *The Invention of Tradition* (1983), which he claims that tartantry has no basis in history, it was an invented representation by an English King. This mischaracterized the power that symbolism of the Highlands had in reviving the Scottish community. Even though it was an invented tradition, what Walter Scott was able to achieve was to create a newly-founded Scottish identity, uniting Highlander and Lowlander in sharing the iconic symbolism of the Highlands. The pride of the Highlands was revived, and Scott generated a precedent of a national community which revolved around symbols that bound the nation together through a common identity that did not abandon the tradition of the Scottish community.

### ***Conclusion***

Even though Macpherson, Burns, and Scott all created their respective *myths, images, and symbols*, they all engineered the conditions for the nation that was imagined as sovereign. Even though the concept of sovereignty was born into correlation with statehood, the romanticists propelled the revival of the national community by undermining the legitimacy

---

<sup>192</sup> Magnus Magnusson, *Scotland: The Story of a Nation* (London: Harper Collins Publishing, 2000): 633.

of Scotland's portrayal as backward and divided. Regardless of Scotland's status or portrayal in comparison to England, the Scottish nation was to be conceived as a deep and qual comradeship, something that the romanticists personified in their writings.

## **Conclusion**

Scotland's future was in Scotland's hands



---

This thesis has argued that in post-union Scotland, the nationalism that was exhibited was not political, which maintains the ambition of establishing an independent state, but rather, cultural, whose aim is reviving the national community. I have demonstrated that cultural nationalism emerges out of a crisis of identity and in Scotland's case, this crisis was manifested in the Anglo-Scottish union of 1707. I have explained the dynamics of cultural nationalism and how it promoted the revival of the Scottish community in the absence of a state. In doing so, three spheres of influence became crucial in Scotland for this revival; the public sphere, the religious sphere, and the literary sphere.

Politics was often separated by those who could exercise power and those who were governed by it. Since a national community is a spontaneous social order, it cannot be engineered through politics, but only from the grass-roots. I have illustrated that this grass-roots strategy was adopted by the public sphere, namely the various learned clubs, associations, and societies throughout Scotland. The public sphere created an environment for discussion and dialogue over issues that were pertinent to the Scottish community. Additionally, the public sphere encouraged widespread participation, regardless of social, economic, or political status. It was only through this widespread participation that a national community can be formulated. If the community were properly engaged in the direction and decision-making process of the country, as they were in post-union Scotland, then a bond is created within the community through the character of participation.

Change is inevitable and through this change, national traditions have to be regularly redefined because of the new demands and realities that present themselves to the community. To shield themselves away from this change, many cultural nationalists retreat into tradition as a guard against intrusions that threaten the national community. I have demonstrated that in Scotland, cultural nationalism rejected traditionalism in favour of embracing change, not to the point of a loss of tradition but with the acceptance of modernisation processes. As such, I have shown that cultural nationalism in Scotland pivoted across a traditional-progressive dichotomy in the aim of reviving the national community. In doing so, through the example of the Church of Scotland, I have shown that a technique used in promoting the revival of the community was *moral innovation*, that is, promoting modernisation from within. As opposed to adopting traditionalism or modernisation outright, the Church of Scotland formulated a modernisation process without abandoning tradition. As

such, they were able to encompass both traditionalists and modernists by bringing polarised sections of the community together in reviving the national community.

Language is a dominant trope associated with cultural nationalism. Language acts as a medium upon which dispersed members of the community come together through common communication. I have argued that although *Scots* was never the dominant language Scots adhered to, the vernacular revival of *Scots* served as a morally unifying factor between polarised members of the community, usually English and Gaelic speakers by provoking a common sense of oneness within the community. In addition, many scholars of cultural nationalism often cite the role of language in conjunction with other elements. In Scotland, the revival often coincided with and became a platform for the romantic movement in attaining credibility towards the ambition of bringing the Scottish community together. Romanticists like James Macpherson, Robert Burns, and Walter Scott adopted various techniques in promoting a revival of the Scottish community. I have demonstrated that through James Macpherson's *Ossian* (1762), *myths* were used to create an illusionary bond amongst the population. In articulating the myth of the origins of the Scottish people. Macpherson inspired a sense of collectivity, as it infused the idea that all Scots were descendants of a common ancestry, and therefore, an extended family. Robert Burns' *Poems, Chiefly in Scottish Dialect* (1786), perpetuated how *images* were used in creating a sense of attachment to a territory and as a result, the people associated with it. Burns engineered the conditions for which the Highlands, which maintained unique characteristics that were omnipresent in Scottish national consciousness, was projected as a representation of the Scottish nation. In doing so, Burns was able to revive the national community by rooting all Scots in a territorial homeland, regardless of their geographical location. In Walter Scott's *Waverley* (1814), I have demonstrated how he used *symbols* to form a conception of the Scottish community as symbols helped people to identify those who were part of their community. Scott created a newly-founded Scottish identity through the symbols of the Highlands, the Kilt, the Bagpipes, and Tartan. In doing so, Scott created a newly-founded basis of which the Scottish community could be revived, by uniting Highlander and Lowlander in sharing the iconic symbolism of the Highlands as Scottish.

Ultimately, this thesis shows that Scotland is an anomaly in the traditional scope of the eighteenth-century nation building. After voluntarily relinquishing its claim to statehood in favour of a political union with England, political power transferred to London, and the

vacuum that was left in its absence was swiftly filled by the cultural sphere. The degree of autonomy granted to the cultural sphere shortly after the union of 1707 allowed for Scotland's eighteenth-century future to remain in Scotland's hands, just outside the realm of politics. It was through this that the politics of a stateless nation emerged; the politics of cultural nationalism.

---

## Bibliography

### *Primary Sources*

An Account of the Select Society of Edinburgh. January 1755. *The Scots Magazine*.

Retrieved from:

[https://books.google.com.au/books?id=1wAAAAAYAAJ&printsec=frontcover&source=gb\\_s\\_summary\\_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false](https://books.google.com.au/books?id=1wAAAAAYAAJ&printsec=frontcover&source=gb_s_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false)

Blair, Hugh. *An Analysis of the Moral and Religious Sentiment contained in the writings of Sopho, and David Hume Esq; & co.* Edinburgh, 1755.

Blair, Hugh. *A Critical Dissertation on the Poems of Ossian.* London: T. Becket and P. A. De Hondt, 1763.

Carlyle, Alexander. *Autobiography of the Rev. Dr. Alexander Carlyle, Minister of Inversk.* Boston: Ticknor and Fields, 1861.

Ferguson, Adam. *An Essay on the History of Civil Society.* London, 1767.

Robertson, William. *The History of Scotland: During the Reigns of Queen Mary and of King James VI till his ascension to the Crown of England with a review of Scottish history previous to that period.* Edinburgh, 1759.

### *Secondary Sources*

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism.* London: Verso, 1991.

Ahnert, Thomas. *The Moral Culture of the Scottish Enlightenment, 1690-1805.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014.

- Bennie, Lynn. "The Scottish National Party: Nationalism for the many." In *Regionalist Parties in Western Europe: Dimensions for success*, edited by Oscar Mazzoleni and Sean Mueller, 22-41. London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 2017.
- Bowie, Karen. "Popular Resistance, Religion and the Union of 1707." In *Scotland and the Union 1707-2007*, edited by T. M. Devine, 39-54. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008.
- Brass, Paul. "Elite groups, symbol manipulation and ethnic identity among the Muslims of South Asia." In *Political Identity in South Asia*, edited by D. Taylor and M. Yapp, (Pages). London: Curzon Press, 1979.
- Breuilly, John. *Nationalism and the State*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1993.
- Brown, Callum G. *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997.
- Brown, Callum. *The Social History of Religion in Scotland since 1730*. London: Methuen, 1987.
- Cairns, Craig. "The Literary Tradition." In *The Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History*, edited by T. M. Devine and Jenny Wormald, 99-130. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Campbell, Richmond. "Moral Epistemology." In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (online ed.) Stanford University Press, 2003.
- Carr, Rosalind. "The Gentlemen and the Soldier: Patriotic Masculinities in Eighteenth Century Scotland." *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies* 28, no. 2 (November 2008): 102-121.
- Chhim, Chris and Éric Bélanger. "Language as a public good and national identity: Scotland's competing heritage languages." *Nations and Nationalism* 23, no. 4 (September 2017): 929-951.

---

Chitnis, Anand C. *The Scottish Enlightenment: A Social History*. Totowa: Rowan and Littlefield, 1976.

Clark, I.D.L. "From Protest to Reaction: The Moderate Regime in the Church in the Church of Scotland, 1752-1805." In *Scotland in the age of improvement: essays in Scottish history in the eighteenth century*, edited by Nicholas Phillipson and Rosalind Mitchison, 200-224. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996.

Devine, T. M. *The Scottish Nation: A Modern History*. London: Penguin Publishing, 2012.

Devine, T. M. "Three Hundred Years of the Anglo-Scottish Union." In *Scotland and the Union: 1707-2007*, edited by T. M. Devine, 1-19. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008.

Drummond, A. L. and J. Bullock. *The Scottish Church, 1688-1843*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1973.

Elias, Norbert. *The Civilising Process* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1978).

Fishman, Joshua. "Nationality-Nationalism and Nation-Nationalism." In *Language Problems of Developing Nations*, edited by J. A. Fishman, C. A. Ferguson and J. Dos Gupta, 39-51. London: Wiley, 1968.

Gillan, Robert. *An Abridgement of the Acts of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland: from the year 1638 to 1820 inclusive to which is Subjoined an Appendix Containing an Abridged View of the Civil Law Relating to the Church*. Edinburgh, 1821.

Gellner, Ernest. *Nations and Nationalism*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006.

Gellner, Ernest. *Thoughts and Change*. London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1964.

Harris, Robert. "Union of 1707." In *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, edited by Michael Lynch, 604-607. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

---

Harvie, Christopher. *Scotland and Nationalism: Scottish Society and Politics, 1707 to the Present*. London: Routledge, 2004.

Herder, Johann Gottfried. *Reflections on the Philosophy of the History of Mankind*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968.

Herman, Arthur. *How Scots Invented the Modern World: The True Story of How Western Europe's Poorest Nation Created Our World and Everything in it*. New York: Three Rivers Press, 2001.

Hobsbawm, Eric. "Introduction: Inventing Traditions." In *The Invention of Tradition*, edited by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, 1-15. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Hobsbawm, Eric. *Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.

Hroch, Miroslav. *The Social Preconditions of National Revivals in Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.

Hutchinson, John. "Cultural Nationalism." In *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Nationalism*, edited by John Breuilly, 75-94. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Hutchinson, John. "Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration." In *Nationalism*, edited by John Hutchinson and Anthony D. Smith, 122-132. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994.

Hutchinson, John. *The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism: The Gaelic Revival and the Creation of the Irish National State*. London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 1987.

Hutchinson, John. *Modern Nationalism*. London: Fortuna Press, 1994.

Hutchinson, John. "Reinterpreting Cultural Nationalism." *Australian Journal of Politics and History* 45, no. 3 (September 1999): 392-407.

---

Kedourie, Elie. *Nationalism*. United Kingdom: Hutchinson, 1966.

Kidd, Colin. "Moderatism." In *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, edited by Michael Lynch, 514-515. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Kidd, Colin. *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-1830*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Kohn, Hans. *The Idea of Nationalism: A Study in its origins and background*. New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2008.

Leerssen, Joep. "Nationalism and the Cultivation of Culture." *Nations and Nationalism* 12, no. 4 (September 2006): 559-578.

MacLean, Fitzroy. *Scotland: A Concise History*. London: Thames & Hudson, 2019.

Magnusson, Magnus. *Scotland: The Story of a Nation*. London: Harper Collins Publishing, 2000.

McCrone, David. *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a nation*. New York: Routledge, 2001.

McIntosh, J. R. *Church and Theology in Enlightenment Scotland: The Popular Party 1740-1800*. Great Britain: Tuckwell Press, 1998.

Mitchell, James, David Denver, Charles Pattie and Hugh Bochel. "The 1997 Devolution Referendum in Scotland." *Parliamentary Affairs* 51, no. 2 (April 1998): 166-181.

Mitchison, Rosalind. "The Making of Old Scottish Poor Law." *Past and Present* 63, no. 1 (May 1974): 58-93.

Murdoch, Alastair. *Religion and Scottish National Identity: Governing Scottish Presbyterianism in the eighteenth century*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015.



---

Murray, Douglas M. "Presbyterian Church and denominations, post-1690." In *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, edited by Michael Lynch, 83-85. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Nairn, Tom. *Faces of Nationalism: Janus Revisited*. London: Verso, 1997.

Nairn, Tom. *The Break-up of Britain: Crisis and Neonationalism*. London: Verso, 1977.

Paterson, Lindsay. "Ane end of ane auld sang: sovereignty and the renegotiation of the Union." In *Scottish Government Yearbook*, edited by A. Brown and D. McCrone (104-122). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1991.

Renan, Ernest. "What is a Nation?" in *Becoming National*, edited by Geoff Eley and Ronald Grigor Suny. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996.

Robinson, Marie. "Scots Language." In *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, edited by Michael Lynch, (Pages). Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Royle, Trevor. *Macmillan Companion to Scottish Literature*. London: Macmillan Press, 1982.

Sher, Richard. "Adam Ferguson, Adam Smith, and the problem of national defense." *The Journal of Modern History* 61, no. 2 (June 1989): 240-268.

Sher, R. B. "Moderates, Managers and Popular Politics in Mid-Eighteenth Century Edinburgh: The Drysdale 'Bustle' of the 1760s." In *New Perspectives on the Politics and Culture of Early Modern Scotland*, edited by J. Dwyer, R. A. Mason, and A. Murdoch, 179-210. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1982.

Smith, Anthony D. *Nationalism and Modernism*. London: Routledge, 1998.

Smith, Anthony D. *The Ethic Revival of the Modern World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

---

Smith, David L. *A History of the Modern British Isles 1603-1707: The Double Crown*. Oxford: John Wiley & Sons, 1998.

Smith, David L. "Politics in Early Stuart Britain." In *A Companion to Stuart Britain*, edited by Barry Coward, 233-253. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2003.

Smout, T. C. "The Anglo-Scottish Union of 1707. I. Economic Background." *The Economic History Review* 16, no. 3 (1994): 455-467.

Smout, T. C. "Where had the Scottish economy got to by the third quarter of the 18th century?" In *Wealth and Virtue: The Reshaping of the Political Economy in the Scottish Enlightenment*, edited by I. Hont and M. Ignatieff, 45-72. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

St. Edmund Hall. "The "Death" and Reinvention of Scotland." Uploaded on June 20, 2013. YouTube video, 54:11 min. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z9GFbU0PUkU>

Stewart, M. A. "Religion and Rational Theology." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*, edited by Alexander Broadie, 31-59. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Trevor-Roper, Hugh. "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland." In *The Invention of Tradition*, edited by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, 15-43. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Ward, A. W. *The Cambridge History of English Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Whatley, Christopher A. "The Making of the Union of 1707." In *Scotland and the Union 1707-2000*, edited by T. M. Devine, 23-39. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008.

Wilson, Sandra. "Rethinking nation and nationalism in Japan." In *Nation and Nationalism in Japan*, edited by Sandra Wilson, 1-21. London: Routledge, 2002.

Wood, Eric Taylor. Cultural Nationalism.” In *The Sage Handbook of Cultural Sociology*, edited by David Inglis and Anna-Mari Almila, 429-440. London: Sage 2016.

Yeats, William Butler. *Samhain*. 1903.

### ***Government Reports***

Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland. “Scottish independence referendum.” Open Government License of State Records. Updated September 18, 2014. <https://www.gov.uk/government/topical-events/scottish-independence-referendum/about>

Her Majesty’s Stationery Office. “Protestant Religion and Presbyterian Church Act 1707.” National Archives of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (1707). <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/aosp/1707/6>

### ***Further Reading***

Argyle, W. J. “Size and Scale as Factors in the Development of Nationalist Movements.” In *Nationalist Movements*, edited by Anthony D. Smith, 31-53.

Brown, Callum. “Protest in the pews: interpreting religion and society in fracture during the Scottish economic revolution.” In *Conflict and Stability in Scottish Society, 1700-1850*, edited by T. M. Devine, (Pages). Edinburgh: John Donald, 1990.

Bernard, F. M. *Herder on Nationality, Humanity and History*. Montreal: McGill University Press, 2003.

Bruce, Steve. “A failure of the imagination: ethnicity and nationalism in Scotland's history.” *Scotia* 17, no. 1 (1993): 1-16.

Cosgrove, Denis. “Prospect, Perspective and the Evolution of the Landscape Idea.” *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 10, no. 1 (May 1984): 45-62.

---

Devine, T. M. and Gordon Jackson. *Glasgow: Beginnings to 1830*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1995.

Finlayson, Alan. "Nationalism." In *Political Ideologies: An Introduction*, edited by Vincent Geoghegan and Rick Wilford, 99-118. London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 2014.

Fraser, Donald. *The Life and Diary of Ebenezer Erskine, A.M.: of Stirling, Father of the Secession Church, to which is prefixed a memoir of his father, the Rev. Henry Erskine, of Chirnside*. Edinburgh: W. Oliphant, 1831.

Habermas, Jürgen. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into the category of bourgeois society*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1989.

MacGregor, Geddes, *The Thundering Scot*. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1957.

MacGregor, Martin. "Clans of the Highland and Islands." In *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*, edited by Michael Lynch, (Page). Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

McClure, Derrick, *Scots and its Literature*. Aberdeen: John Benjamin Publishers, 1995.

McElroy, D. D. "The Literary Clubs and Societies of Eighteenth Century Scotland, and their influence on the literary productions of the period from 1700 to 1800." PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1952.

McIntosh, J. R. "Evangelicals in Eighteenth Century Scotland: The Presbytery of Stirling, 1740-1805." Master's Thesis, Stirling University, 1981.

Morton, Graeme. *Unionist-Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860*. London: Tuckwell Press, 1998.

Pittock, Murray G. H. *Jacobitism*. London: Macmillan, 1998.

Rabow-Edling, Susanna. *Slavophile thought and the politics of cultural nationalism*. New York: State University of New York Press, 2006.

Smith, Anthony D. *National Identity*. Las Vegas: University of Nevada Press, 1991.

Smith, Anthony D. *The Nation Made Real: Art and National Identity in Western Europe, 1600-1850*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.

Smith, Anthony D. *Theories of Nationalism*. London: Duckworth, 1986.

Smout, T. C. *A History of the Scottish People, 1560-1830*. Glasgow: Collins, 1970.

Taylor, Stephen. "Walpole, Robert, first earl of Orford (1676–1745)." *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (online ed.). Oxford University Press.

Wells, Daniel J. "The Scottish Literati and the Problem of Scottish National Identity" Masters thesis, University of Western Ontario, 1997. ProQuest Dissertations and Theses Global (MQ28686).