

Raising Gender Awareness in Translation through AVT and Advertising

Gora Zaragoza Ninet | Alicia Ricart Vayá

gora.zaragoza@uv.es | alicia.ricart@uv.es
Universidad de Valencia

Recibido: 15/01/2020 | Revisado: 16/05/2020 | Aceptado: 22/06/2020

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to describe a pilot study conducted with 46 Translation and Intercultural Mediation students in an English language module at advanced level. We adapt Borghetti and Lertola's five-phase model (2014) of intercultural awareness using subtitling, a modality of AVT (Audiovisual Translation) in order to tackle gender issues and gender-related language in the subtitling of the well-known *The man your man could smell like* Old Spice body wash advertisement. Results show that students failed to convey the ad's sexist message in their Spanish translation, which was further confirmed when comparing students' translation choices with the official Spanish dubbed version of the ad. This pilot study suggests ways for Translation and English language teachers to integrate the gender perspective in their teaching whilst students become aware of their power and responsibility as translators.

Keywords: Gender, AVT, Subtitling, Advertising, Translators' responsibilities

Resumen

Sensibilización de género en la traducción a través de TAV y publicidad

El objetivo de esta investigación es describir un estudio piloto realizado con 46 estudiantes de Traducción y Mediación Intercultural en un módulo de lengua inglesa nivel avanzado. Adaptamos el modelo de conciencia intercultural de Borghetti y Lertola (2014) mediante la subtitulación, una modalidad de TAV (Traducción Audiovisual) para abordar cuestiones de género y lenguaje en relación con el género en relación con la subtitulación de un anuncio de gel corporal de *Old Spice*. Los resultados muestran que nuestros estudiantes no consiguieron transmitir de manera satisfactoria el mensaje sexista del anuncio en su paso al castellano, lo cual se pudo confirmar al comparar la traducción de nuestro alumnado con la versión doblada oficial del anuncio al español. Este estudio piloto muestra cómo los profesores de traducción pueden y deben integrar la perspectiva de género en su docencia para que el alumnado tome conciencia de su poder y responsabilidad como traductore/as.

Palabras clave: género, TAV, subtitulación, publicidad, responsabilidad del/a traductor/a

1. Introduction

Since the 1990s there has been significant research on the use of AVT as a means to promote language learning (see, for instance, Lertola, 2019). Language learners can link the spoken word to the visual element, and they can also see how native speakers interact in everyday conversations, as authentic video material offers both linguistic (regional accents, register and grammatical and syntactical structures) and paralinguistic hints (body language, gestures) that allow students to appreciate language in use in a cultural context (Díaz-Cintas & Cruz 2008). In this line, a number of AVT studies aim to develop not only linguistic but also extralinguistic competences such as the intercultural competence; according to Borghetti & Lertola (2014), the action of subtitling itself is the best way to develop intercultural skills in a translation environment. Concurrently, the combination of studies on gender and AVT has been developing since the early 2000s (Flotow & Josephy-Hernández 2018). Some have focused on the raising of gender awareness through AVT and the field of advertising (see in particular the work of Corrius, De Marco & Espasa 2016a and 2017). However, although there is work on audiovisual translation as a means of improving students' language skills, there is a dearth of research and empirical evidence on the use of audiovisual translation as a means of raising students' awareness of an enduring globalised world of stereotypes showing gender inequality and lack of feminist values (De Marco 2011), which raise a cultural issue.

To bridge this gap in the language classroom, we focus on the translation of advertisements, which allows students to acquire multilingual and plurilingual competences in the subject of English Language 3 (C1 Advanced) of the Degree in Translation and Intercultural Mediation, at the University of Valencia, Spain. While students develop linguistic skills in both languages, mainly the features of persuasive language and characteristics of advertisements, and L1 translation skills, they study the adaptation of contents, concepts and ideas to the target culture (Mooij, 2004). With this purpose in mind, and based on Borghetti and Lertola's (2014) five-phase model, we adapted a teaching sequence whose implementation not only includes developing linguistic strategies, such as writing a review, learning idiomatic expressions or summarising, but also involves learning subtitling skills, which foster students' cultural and intercultural awareness –and consequently, translating skills (Borghetti & Lertola 2014)–, but also raising gender awareness, our main objective. Additionally, our study fosters socio-cultural awareness and translating professional skills with the development of computing skills, a combination that has become a requirement for the current multilingual professional situations translators face. Furthermore, the field of advertising enables the study of intercultural and gender and racial issues, which, in turn, pose interesting challenges in translation. Translators are not mere linguistic facilitators; they are cultural mediators and social agents whose role is essential in today's multicultural society.

The present paper is an empirical attempt to prove the potential of interlingual subtitling for raising gender awareness. In doing so, we present a case study in which interlingual subtitling is used to enhance students' gender awareness. We report a study with 46 Translation and Interlinguistic Mediation Studies students subtitling a TV commercial from English into Spanish. Our research attempts to investigate if the creation of subtitles actually provides an opportunity to identify sexist behaviour. In order to carry out our analysis, we adapted Borghetti & Lertola's (2014) teaching unit structure for intercultural competence. Furthermore, the subtitling of the commercial was part of a broader teaching unit containing other tasks and advertisements used to reinforce the development of gender awareness.

Our experience appears to confirm that students need to improve their extralinguistic skills and become more sensitive to issues related to gender, race and stereotypes.

2. Theoretical framework and literature review

2.1. AVT (subtitling) and language teaching

The use of audiovisual material in the classroom is considered a powerful tool for the teaching of languages, further supported by its communicative orientation. As Çakir (2006: 67) points out, students find this type of material stimulating as "video shows them how people behave in the culture whose language they are learning by bringing into the classroom a wide range of communicative situations". The activities that can be carried out in the (translation/language) classroom with audiovisual material could include exercises in which the use of multimedia elements is central; however, it should not involve the use of software and technologies that exceed the basic competences of students (Sokoli 2006). The use of appropriate software and technologies captures students' and young learners' definite attention. And since technology is part of their everyday norm, students become readily familiar with this mode of learning.

There are several modalities of audiovisual translation: dubbing, subtitling, voice over and audio description. Díaz-Cintas (2001) points out the convenience of explaining these to students, so that they have a global vision of the market and become aware of each modality's individual feature.

According to Díaz-Cintas (2003: 32), subtitling can be defined as "a linguistic practice that consists of offering, usually at the bottom of the screen, a written text that seeks to account for the actors' dialogues, as well as discursive elements that are part of the picture or of the sound track". Subtitling is characterized by presenting summarised texts, which address the restrictions of space and time of this modality and by changing from an oral to a written channel, which offers an ideal context for language learning. One of the first steps is to familiarise students with subtitling software (including Aegisub, Subtitle Workshop), which are free and easy to use. The subtitling procedure goes through different phases. Firstly, students are asked to define

the in and out times of individual subtitles ('spotting'), so these are synchronized with the audio. Secondly, they translate these from the source language (Spanish) into the target language (English), making sure they understand all the information. Thirdly, some corrections can be made at sentence structure to ensure dialogue flows. Finally, students do a screening of the final product with the subtitles and make any adjustments if necessary.

Certainly, one of the thorny aspects about audiovisual subtitling is that the viewer receives information simultaneously about the same message through spoken language, image and written text (Baltova & Lafayette 1999: 33). As Lertola (2013: 247) states, in recent years, various linguists have highlighted the usefulness of inter and intralinguistic subtitling in language learning, especially for reading and listening comprehension (Talaván 2011), oral production, acquisition of vocabulary (Lertola 2012), grammar, etc. The potential of audio-visual material for educational purposes and, in particular, the potential of subtitling has been recognised as a pedagogical tool which culminated in 2006 with the *Learning via Subtitling project*, funded by the European institutions. Students find it motivating, since they are involved in an active process in which they are asked to add subtitles to audiovisual material and create a new similar product. According to Sokoli (2006), another advantage of the *LeVis* platform is that it serves for autonomous learning and for distance learning and for classroom learning. In the process of translating the interactions of films or videos, various skills come into play, such as: taking notes or summarizing interactions, prioritizing information, listening to general or detailed information. The wide variety of material that can be used enables the exploration of different genres: some TV shows can help us exploit legal (*The Good Wife*, 2009) or medical (*Grey's Anatomy*, 2005) vocabulary. Teachers also have flexibility regarding video duration and the selection of material, so it is adapted to students' level, age and interests, etc. This project gave way to the *ClipFair* project in 2011, which also focuses on learning a second language through interactive dubbing and video subtitling. One of its advantages is that, in contrast with *LeVis*, it allowed for anyone to create and upload activities. *Clipfair*, which exploits both subtitling and dubbing, was developed based on the assumption that it is necessary to create multimedia tools and methods to stimulate the active learning and participation of the student, as teachers found it difficult to locate tasks that would engage learners and discourage passive viewing (Zabalbeascoa, Sokoli & Torres, 2012). The project aimed to cover the four competences and create educational material, such as an application for the translation (and subtitling/dubbing) of an audiovisual product. This tool was initially intended for teaching, but evolved into a collaborative platform, where students can work with 15 different languages and receive feedback from teachers or their peers. In the *Clipfair* platform we can find quality translations, as well as online teaching exercises.

Lertola (2013) differentiates between interlinguistic subtitling, which involves two languages, and intralinguistic subtitling, which is performed with a single language. Within interlinguistic subtitling, which consists of the translation of an oral text from

one language to another in the form of a written text, she distinguishes two types: standard subtitling and inverted subtitling. In the standard type, which is the one that concerns our study, an audiovisual text is translated from L2 (second language) to L1 (mother tongue) in a written form. The pedagogical benefits of this practice are striking: L2 oral and reading comprehension, learning of linguistic and cultural elements of L2 through exposure to audiovisual material, and the translation exercise. In the translation process, students must understand the L2 text, which entails developing vocabulary skills and comprehension and, additionally, exercise their ability to write, summarize and paraphrase in L1. Furthermore, time and space constraints, which are characteristic of subtitling, require students to learn how to condense messages or even partially or totally omit certain unnecessary information. It will therefore be essential that they learn to discern between verbal information essential to understanding and information that is redundant or not crucial to the transmission of a meaning. Finally, translation helps them adapt a contrastive vision, allowing them to compare languages in linguistic and cultural terms, fostering the awareness of cultural differences for the development of skills and values that enrich their personal and professional life. As Byram (2012: 11) suggests: “the complementarity of language awareness and cultural awareness has to be realised both in the social, in linguistic practice, and in the psychological, in the linguistic and cultural identities of individuals”.

On the other hand, we must not forget that the translation process, especially subtitling, is a process that goes beyond the mere linguistic transference. Translators do not simply translate an original text into a target text. As Talaván (2013) affirms, when subtitling, it is also important to focus on the general sense throughout the translation process. Therefore, subtitlers must know how to condense messages since, due to space and time limitations and the way languages express things differently, a literal translation would be unthinkable. However, we might use literal translation to show students' similarities and differences between linguistic constructions in different languages. For pedagogical purposes, Lertola suggests the adaptation of subtitling rules, which are included in the “Code of Subtitling Practice of Ivarsson and Carroll” (1998). Following this, students are taught the importance of taking into account linguistic and cultural aspects as well as other features such as maximum extension in subtitling, which should be two independent lines at a syntactic and semantic level. As Díaz Cintas (2008: 10) explains, subtitles should be a full sentence, or at least, ensure that the lines are divided so they correspond to blocks of meaning. Díaz-Cintas and Remael (2007) highlight the relevance of segmentation and offer examples, such as not separating articles from names, adjectives or adverbs from the noun to which they refer, etc. Another aspect to keep in mind is synchronization: students must match the text with the exact moment a character starts to speak, and the text must disappear when it ends, without forgetting that the subtitled text must remain a minimum of one second and a maximum of seven on screen. Other aspects to be taken into account by students when subtitling can be the use of italics, when a person that does not appear on screen speaks, or the use of hyphens for dialogues between two people.

2.2. Gender in the Translation and English Studies Degrees

Although gender is part of General Competence CG1 in the Degree of Translation Studies at the University of Valencia, no specific modules, compulsory or elective, deal with gender as applied to literature, linguistics and/or language or translation teaching. The subject is covered as follows:

CG1: to develop ethical engagement, such as gender equality, equal opportunities, peace culture and democratic values as well as environmental issues, linguistic diversity and multiculturalism.

Furthermore, gender is also referred to as a Specific Competence (9) within the English Studies Degree:

SC9: To identify geographical, social, discourse and gender and sex variations including literary and non-literary contexts

This shows that gender is only referred to as one of a wide range of aspects which do not have much in common, being some sort of hotchpotch of concepts. The fact that gender is absent from our study plans (Degree in English Studies and Degree in Translation and Intercultural Mediation) and our university subjects has been termed as ‘gender blindness’. Gender blindness is described as: “failure to recognise that the roles and responsibilities of women/girls and men/boys are ascribed to, or imposed upon, them in specific social, cultural, economic and political contexts³”. ‘Gender-blind’ programmes, policies and attitudes do not take into account these different roles and diverse needs keeping a status quo that does not help transform the unequal structure of gender relations.

General competence 1 is also shared by the Degree in Translation Studies. Since there are no specific modules on Gender and Linguistic/Literary/Translation disciplines, it is entirely up to the lecturer to address gender issues and to decide whether to introduce and explore them in their teaching programmes. The problem is that since integrating gender in the curriculum is an individual choice, there is no testimony of practice of how gender can be developed in translation subjects. This partly justifies our study: to provide a methodology to explore gender in the language class by means of AVT and advertising.

2.3. Gender and AVT

According to De Marco (2006), the concept of “gender” is related to the role that both men and women play in society on the grounds of their ethnic origin, class, religion and sexual orientation. The reason why gender and translation have become a field of interest for research in the last decades can be explained by identifying and

acknowledging the agency translators have and their consequent power regarding the impact on how gender issues may be understood within a social system. Although the question of feminism and the media and more precisely, the issue of women's inferior representation in the media has been dealt with since the 1970s, the study of gender in the field of ATV is a relatively recent process dating from the early 2000s. As De Marco (2006) suggests "mass media are responsible because they control the kind of information and values that are spread in our societies".

Flotow and Josephy-Hernández (2018) identify three approaches to study gender in ATV: feminist materials in Anglo-American audiovisual products with a translation into Romance languages; differences between dubbed and subtitled versions of Anglo-American texts, and; gay and queer text translations. Within the first approach, Flotow focuses on the translation of different English films into French, English and Italian (2018: 301). She describes how ATV "conforms to distributors' assumptions about the intended audiences' gender and values", or how sometimes terminology related to queer sexualities is non-existent or weak in Romance languages and tends to be erased or replaced with more conventional words. The inability on the part of Romance language industries to take on the Anglo-American genderlects, i.e., to match neologisms, queer references from the source is a current research topic. She also deals with the grammatical ambiguity of the English language and the need to account for a male or female translation when translating certain words such as "friend" or "lover" into Romance languages. Also, De Marco (2006) warns about the danger of translating from English into some Romance languages, such as Italian or Spanish where derogatory feminine terms like "stupid bitch" can be translated as "brutta puttana", thus adding a sexist nuance the original did not have.

3. Objectives

Our main goal is to assess the potential of interlingual subtitling as a means to raise gender awareness in the English classroom, we adapted Borghetti and Lertola's five-phase model on intercultural awareness (2014). Following Flotow and Josephy-Hernández's (2018) first approach, we focused on the translation of gendered content to analyse whether it was accurately reflected in the translation from an English original advertisement into Spanish. We aimed to evaluate whether our students achieved to translate gender-sensitive issues in their subtitled versions in contrast to the dubbed media version (see 5.5).

In addition, this experience was also designed to implement and develop several additional competences. Firstly, we aimed at expanding knowledge of linguistic content related to the field of advertising (vocabulary, language functions, grammar) following students' target level, in this case C1 (advanced), according to the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR). Finally, we also pursued the development of professional skills in the language class: students learnt how to use specific subtitling software, recreating in the language class conditions to what

they would face in a working context, as well as introducing, raising and debating subtitlers' multiple responsibilities.

4. Methodology

Our pilot study was conducted with a group of 46 students who were taking the subject of English Language 3 in the Degree of Translation and Interlinguistic Mediation during the first semester of the academic year 2018-2019. The advertisement chosen was Old Spice's *The man your man could smell like*⁴, which features well-known sportsman Isaiah Mustafa advertising a men's body wash. The commercial, which dates from 2010, was a huge hit at the time. The reason why we selected this particular advertisement is that it worked on several gender aspects. Besides, many derisive elements connected to women are enacted in the commercial, suggesting it may in fact be read as a satire of sexism.

Following Borghetti and Lertola's model (2014) (See table 1 in section 5 below), we divided our teaching unit for the subtitling process into five phases: motivation, global perception, analysis, synthesis and reflection, which were adapted to include the gender perspective. Additionally, we selected other advertisements from different cultures aimed at focusing our students' attention on gender issues, and we finally asked students to compare the original commercial with the Spanish official dubbed version in order to analyse further gender issues.

In the first phase – the motivation phase – a discussion was carried out in class on several aspects, under the teachers' guidance: advertising, persuasive language, publicity, cosmetic products as well as cultural and gender aspects in translation, etc. This was in order to lead them to think as translators about their responsibility and about the importance of cultural awareness knowledge in translation and different marketing strategies applied in different cultures. They were encouraged to look up some advertisements on cosmetic products in different languages to discuss in class groups different ways products can be sold. Students were required to think about different personal hygiene products and brands to reflect on how often they used these and whether these were also used in other cultures. They also had to reflect on whether these products were more commonly associated with the images and stereotypes of men and women. Finally, they had to think about how some brands could be translated into other cultures. In the second phase – global perception – students watched the advertisement in the English original version with English subtitles. In the third phase – the analysis phase – students focused on the linguistic and visual elements of the commercial as well as on gender and cultural elements to be taken into account. In the next phase – the synthesis phase – students worked in pairs and translated the English commercial into Spanish. Then they compared their translation with their peers' in order to contrast their translation choices, reflect on translation problems and agree on a final version.

A specific session was devoted to the subtitling of the commercial; firstly, students were given support on AVT software. They learned to transcribe the original script, translate, segment the translated text and adjust translated text to match image and time.

In the last phase (reflection), students carried out a peer-to-peer evaluation to analyse their subtitles choice. Their assessment was based on their accuracy in translation, command of the AVT modality and on gender awareness.

Our methodology could be summarised as follows:

Table 1. Methodology

Selection of AVT modality		
Selection of commercial		
Literature review on AVT and language teaching and gender and AVT.		
Selection of AVT teaching modality	1. Motivation	Discussion on cultural and gender aspects in translation
		Comparing advertisements in different cultures
		Raising cultural awareness
	2. Global Perception	Viewing of the original ad with English subtitles
	3. Analysis	Identification of cultural and gender elements
	4. Synthesis	Translation of the commercial into Spanish
	5. Subtitling	Commercial subtitling
	6. Reflection	Evaluation of subtitles
Discussion on gender issues in translation		
Teaching sequence design		
Implementation in 4 class sessions (8 hours)		
Subtitling workshop		
Assessment		

5. A teaching sequence to raise gender awareness through AVT

As indicated, in order to analyse gender-sensitive issues that are at stake in AVT, we decided to adapt Borghetti and Lertola’s five-phase model (2014) of intercultural awareness to tackle gender issues and gender-related language.

Table 2. Borghetti and Lertola’s five-phase model

Phase	Intercultural-oriented teaching devices	Objectives
1. Motivation		Activity presentation; Introduction of the subtitler’s multiple responsibilities; Basic information about the movie.
2. Global perception		Viewing of the video clip with the dialogue transcript.
3. Analysis	Form 1 Discussion 1	Identification of cultural and intercultural elements; Discussion of the subtitler’s multiple responsibilities in view of the subtitling task; Discussion about the clip cultural features in an intercultural perspective.
4. Synthesis		Translation of the original text; Synchronisation of the translated text with the video.
5. Reflection	Form 2 Discussion 2	Evaluation of subtitles in view of the subtitler’s multiple responsibilities; Discussion on cultural and intercultural issues.

5.1. Motivation

Activity presentation

Introduction of the subtitler’s multiple responsibilities

Basic information about the movie



Firstly, students were asked to describe the scene so as to elicit sexist elements, stereotyping, race and cultural issues in a class discussion. Students then carried out internet-based research on the commercial history: characters, plot, actors, product, selling strategies connected with or exploiting gender issues.

Upon their Internet search and the class debate, students became aware of gender-related issues connected with selling strategies for male products. There is controversy surrounding the commercial because it uses every possible sexist element and sexist language in order to subvert sexism or as a gender parody linked with advertisements which use the macho man image as a commercial device.

Lastly, we introduce the subtitler's responsibilities. As Ramière (2006) suggests, the responsibility that (students)/subtitlers ought to recognise with regard to the source culture is twice as intricate because their choices may influence the audience's perceptions of the target culture. A corollary of this is that students/subtitlers may be responsible for perpetuating (positive or negative) gender stereotypes. Borghetti and Lertola (2014) point out that the translator's function acquires notable ethical issues. Students are made to reflect on their own role in conveying a gender-inclusive mediation. Students are taught that, despite the fact that this may go against the wishes of some clients, it is their role as translators to delete any stereotypical or sexist references and use a more neutral, gender-inclusive language in line with newspapers -and the media in general-, the European Parliament and many other institutions around the world which endorse non-discriminatory language.

5.2. Global perception

Viewing of the video clip and linguistic familiarisation

Students were asked to watch the Old Spice commercial and discuss in groups how cultural differences and gender stereotyping are reflected in advertising. We asked them to pay special attention to characters, gender, race, clothing, attitudes and language. Unlike Borghetti and Lertola, we did not provide the clip manuscript but instead suggested a fill-in-the-blanks activity with the clip text, so vocabulary and listening skills could also be exploited:

Warm-up task: After viewing the commercial, fill in the blanks with the missing words

Hello, ladies.

Look at your man.

Now back to me. Now back at your man. Now back to me.

Sadly, he isn't me.

But if he stopped using lady (1) _____ (2) _____

...and switched to Old Spice, he could smell like he's me.

Look down. Back up. Where are you?

You're on a boat with the man your man could smell like.

What's in your hand? Back at me.

I have it.

It's an (3) _____ with two tickets to that thing you love.

Look again. The tickets are now (4) _____.

Anything is possible when your man smells like Old Spice and not a lady.

I'm on a horse.

5.3. Analysis

Identification of cultural and gender elements; discussion of the subtitlers' multiple responsibilities.

In order to discuss the clip's gender features from an intercultural perspective, we gave them a questionnaire so as to make them reflect on gender issues connected to publicity:

- Why do you think the character is a well-built black man?
- Why does the main character suggest that a lady smell is not cool or suitable for a man?
- Can you see a relation between the use of non-lady body wash with power and economic status?
- What is the purpose of comparing the superiority of the macho man figure and the lady-like man which is constantly made fun of in the commercial?
- How are non-macho men portrayed as inferior linguistically? What about the main character's superiority? Pay attention to the use of imperatives, body language, gestures, etc.
- Which linguistic elements could be offensive towards women and other LGBTI groups?
- Which linguistic and non-linguistic features describe the unequal relationship between (men) power and women?

5.4. Synthesis

Translation of the original text

Synchronisation of the translated text with the video

After watching the clip, we asked students to translate the clip into their mother tongue (Spanish-Catalan). Once aware of their responsibilities as translators and warned about the gender issues to be taken into account for their translation, students proceeded to translate the text. Discussion took place at this point, where some controversial issues related to gender appeared. The translation of the word "ladies", for example, appeared to be a controversial term, as they did not seem to agree on an exact equivalent in the Spanish language that would represent the implications of "lady" in the context of the commercial. Different options suggested by the students were discussed: *nenas*, *chicas*, *señoritas*, *niñas*, etc. The term *ladies* is translated into the singular: "Hola nena", as a strategy to make the listener feel more intimidated and more directly addressed by the black man in the first greeting. Thus, they were

asked to reflect on the need of being gender-conscious for specific translation choices regarding the image of women and femininity portrayed in the commercial. The different translation options for the *ladies* will be analysed in the next section where we will also compare the students' translation options with the official dubbed version.

Other aspects that they contemplated in relation to gender were the use of the imperatives in combination with the adverb "now". Students were conscious of the function of the imperatives, mainly used to underline the power of the speaker, yet doubted whether to omit certain words in their translations such as the verb "to look up" and/or the adverb "now" so as to make them more dynamic and emphasise the fact that the main character is giving orders to be followed immediately: "Mira a tu hombre", "Ahora a mí", "A tu hombre", "Otra vez a mí".

As to the synchronization of the text and the images, students were first provided with some training on segmentation; they were told how the characters should appear in two lines and how they should use fewer than 50 characters. They were shown some examples from Netflix, which sets a maximum of 42 characters and the BBC, which sets the total number of characters as 32-34.

5.5. Reflection

Evaluation of subtitles in view of the subtitler's multiple responsibilities

Discussion on gender issues.

Comparative analysis of students' subtitles vs. dubbed version

In order to assess students' subtitling choices and responsibilities, we decided to focus on four items which tackle gender-related issues and therefore implied translators taking decisions on controversial gender aspects which are key to the commercial and its underlying selling strategy. These are the following:

- Hello ladies
- Look at your man
- But if he stopped using lady-scented body wash
- Anything is possible when your man smells like Old Spice and not a lady.

Table 3 below shows students' translation choices in contrast with the official dubbed version:

Table 3. Students' translation of gender-related items and official dubbed version

Source text	Context	Target text	Occurrence		Official dubbed version
Ladies	Hello ladies	Hola chicas	Chicas	33	Qué tal cielo
			Señoritas	12	
			Niñas	1	
Your man	Look at your man	Tu hombre	Tu hombre	38	Mira a tu hombre
			Vuestro hombre	7	
			Vuestros hombres	1	
Lady-scented body wash	(if he stopped using) lady-scented body wash		Gel perfumado de mujer	8	De oler a florecitas
			Gel para chicas	2	
			Gel que huele a mujer	2	
			Gel de baño con aroma de mujer	2	
			Gel de baño de chica	2	
			Gel que huele a chica	8	
			Gel para mujeres	1	
			Gel de mujer	1	
			Gel de chica perfumado	3	
			Gel de señora	2	
			Gel perfumado para mujeres	1	
			Gel de ducha con olor a señora	1	
			Gel de ducha perfumado para mujeres	3	
			Gel con fragancia femenina	1	
			Gel de baño que huele a chica	1	
			Gel perfumado femenino	1	
			Gel con olor a mujer	1	
Gel de ducha que huele a chica	1				
Gel perfumado de chica	1				
And not a lady	(when your man smells like Old Spice and not a lady)		No como una mujer	14	No a flores
			No a chica	8	
			No como una chica	6	
			No a mujer	13	
			No a señora	3	
			No como una señorita	2	

The table 3 shows 46 answers from our students in relation to the four selected gender-related items. Having analysed these, we can state the following:

Firstly, the word ‘ladies’ in the context ‘Hello ladies’ was translated a total of 33 times as ‘chicas’, whereas only 12 occurrences of the word ‘señoritas’ were registered and only 1 student opted for ‘niñas’. Although any of the translations provided by the students would be suitable without a context, since all these words are synonyms, the translator’s choice for this lexical item becomes crucial in order to transmit the gender weight of the original message. Therefore, students need to acquire strategies in order to be more context-sensitive and to be able to attend to non-linguistic aspects, which are part of the translation process. It is essential to highlight that it is a strong self-confident black man who is uttering the word ‘ladies’ and whose physical attributes and flirting attitude are the triggers to the commercial’s message. The advertisement patronises women and everything that is considered as feminine with a commercial objective. From the commercial it can also be deduced that women are only interested in physical aspects, whether a body, a smell, or money. Furthermore, the commercial suggests women are interested in strong, powerful and well-off macho men who can provide them with diamonds and who have magical powers to take them to different places, etc. The metaphor of the horse is also indicative of power, submissiveness and sexual superiority. In contrast to students’ translation proposals for the term “ladies”, the official dubbed version shows an understanding of the context in terms of gender issues, rendering the word ‘ladies’ as ‘cielo’, which suggests sexual conquest, flirting and superiority.

Secondly, with regards to ‘your man’ in the phrase ‘Look at your man’, there were 38 occurrences of ‘tu hombre’, 7 for ‘vuestro hombre’ and only 1 for ‘vuestros hombres’. It is interesting to observe the choice of ‘vuestro’ instead of ‘tu’, the two possible options for translating ‘your’ in Spanish. This translation choice seems to suggest that the man’s superiority is such that it is every woman’s man and not just any woman’s. However, if we compare our students’ responses with the official dubbed version we can observe that there is general agreement in the choice of ‘hombre’ for ‘man’ in lieu of other options such as ‘chico’, or the more specific ‘amante’, ‘marido’, ‘compañero’, ‘esposo’, etc.

Thirdly, ‘lady-scented body wash’ in the context of ‘if he stopped using lady-scented wash’ is the item which caused the widest range of answers, the most frequent choice being ‘gel perfumado de mujer’ and ‘gel que huele a chica’, both having occurred 8 times each, followed by: ‘gel de ducha perfumado para mujeres’ (3 times). This was then followed by: ‘gel para chicas’, ‘gel que huele a mujer’, ‘gel de baño con aroma de mujer’, ‘gel de baño de chica’ and ‘gel de señora’, occurring twice each, and, finally, followed by other options which only occurred once each: ‘gel para mujeres’, ‘gel perfumado para mujeres’, ‘gel de ducha con olor a señora’, ‘gel con fragancia femenina’, ‘gel de baño que huele a chica’ and ‘gel perfumado de chica’. Students’ answers indicate once again a lack of training and translation sensitivity towards gender aspects as their choices of ‘mujer’, ‘señora’, ‘femenina’ and ‘a chica’ fail to render the

offensive message implied in ‘lady-scented body wash’. The commercial exploits this derogatory image of feminine qualities in order to sell its product: Old Spice’s commercial strategy is the promise that its perfume is so manly that it will turn any man into a macho man, rejecting everything that works against it, like a womanly scent. On the other hand, the official dubbed version’s choice of ‘a florecitas’ aptly renders the commercial’s message, working on the image of flowers described in feminine terms. The dubbed version’s translation, ‘a florecitas’, which suggests superiority and contempt towards feminine things conveys more aptly the commercial’s commercial strategy. This is further developed by our last example, ‘and not a lady’, in the context of ‘when your man smells like Old Spice and not a lady’, has been translated 14 times as ‘no como una mujer’, followed by ‘no a mujer’ (13 times), ‘no a chica’ (8 times), ‘no como una chica’ (6 times) and ‘no a señora’ and ‘no a señorita’ (3 and 2 times respectively). Whilst these two last examples fail completely to convey the commercial’s derogatory tone and message, due to the choice of ‘señora’ and ‘señorita’ which both -especially the first term- suggest respect, the rest of our students’ choice, again around ‘mujer’ and ‘chica’ also fail to convey the commercial’s moral. If we compare this to the official dubbed version, which was translated as ‘a flores’, once again working around the image of flowers as a feminine object, we can conclude that the official dubbed version, unlike our students, is successful in conveying and even strengthening the commercial’s message.

6. Conclusions

Borghetti and Lertola’s adapted model for teaching subtitling and intercultural awareness has allowed us to go a step beyond linguistic training when translating, providing tools to integrate and teach the gender perspective in the translation act.

Our teaching unit has proved useful in order to fulfil our initial proposal. Our main objective, raising students’ awareness about gender issues, has been successfully accomplished; students have become more conscious about the different decisions and responsibilities at stake when translating. Therefore, this pilot study has helped us not only to confirm the status of translation as more than a simple transfer of linguistic content, but also to regard translation as an act that entails further consequences and responsibilities. This research is essential for students to realise the importance of being gender sensitive and responsible for their choices in translation. This experiment has further allowed students to discern semantic poverty and the lack of accuracy and correspondence of their initial proposal with the original text.

Finally, with regards to teachers, this pilot study is an example that they must be aware of and, as a result, integrate the gender perspective in their teaching. Through this type of practice we aim at fostering the professionalization of students to provide translations which comprise of essential nuances other than linguistic. Students also become aware of their power as translators who can turn a text into something offensive or neutral according to their translation choice.

This study contributes to the teaching of gender and translation studies as a whole. However, this is a field that still needs to be developed. The present research underlines the need for more studies and didactic materials to raise gender awareness through translation which can be actively implemented in a class setting. Finally, further research exploring gender awareness in other AVT modalities, namely dubbing, free commentary and audio description, could also yield insightful results.

7. References

- Baltova, Iva & Lafayette, Robert C. (1999). Multisensory Language Teaching in a Multidimensional Curriculum: The Use of Authentic Bimodal Video in Core French. *Canadian Modern Language Review* 56, 32-48.
- Borghetti, Claudia & Lertola, Jennifer. (2014). Interlingual Subtitling for Intercultural Language Education: a case study. *Language and Intercultural Communication* 14, 423-440.
- Byram, Michael. (2012) Language awareness and (critical) cultural awareness – relationships, comparisons and contrasts. *Language Awareness*, 21:1-2, 5-1.
- Çakir, İsmail, (2006), “The use of video as an audio-visual material in foreign language teaching classroom”. *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology* 4. 9: 67-72.
- Corrius, Montse, De Marco, Marcella & Espasa, Eva (2016a). Situated Learning and Situated Knowledge: Gender, Translating Audiovisual Adverts and Professional Responsibility. *The Interpreter and Translator Trainer*, 59-75.
- Corrius, Montse, De Marco, Marcella. & Espasa, Eva (2016b). Gender and the Translation of Audiovisual Non-Profit Advertising”. *Revista de lenguas para fines específicos* 22. 2, 31-61.
- Corrius, Montse, Espasa, Eva & De Marco, Marcella. (2017). Balancing Gender Awareness and Professional Priorities in Advertising and Audiovisual Translation: an overview, in Santaemilia, J (Ed.). *Traducir para la igualdad sexual*, Granada: Comares.
- De Marco, Marcella (2011). Bringing Gender into the Subtitling Classroom, in Incalcaterra McLoughlin, Laura, Biscio, Marie and Ní Mhainnín, M. Á. (Eds.) *Audiovisual Translation: Subtitles and Subtitling Theory and Foreign Language Practice*. New York, Bern, Berlin, Bruxelles, Frankfurt am Main, Oxford, Wien: Peter Lang, 139-155.
- De Marco, Marcella (2006). Audiovisual Translation from a Gender Perspective. *The Journal of Specialised Translation* 6, 167-184. Retrieved from https://jostrans.org/issue06/art_demarco.php
- Díaz-Cintas, Jorge & Cruz, Marco (2008). Using Subtitled Video Materials for Foreign Language Instruction, 201-214.

- Flotow, Louise von & Josephy-Hernández, Daniel (2018). Gender in Audiovisual Translation Studies: Advocating for Gender Awareness, in Pérez González, Luis (Ed.) *The Routledge Handbook of Audiovisual Studies*, 296-311.
- Lertola, Jennifer (2019). *Audiovisual Translation in the Foreign Language Classroom: Applications in the Teaching of English and other Foreign Languages*. Voilans: Research-publishing.net.
- Lertola, Jennifer (2013). Subtitling in Language Teaching: Suggestions for Language Teachers, in Gambier, Yves, Caimi, Annamaria & Mariotti, Cristina. *Subtitles and Language Learning* (pp. 245-267). Bern: Peter Lang,
- Lertola, Jennifer (2012). The Effect of Subtitling Task on Vocabulary Learning, in Pym, A. & D. Orrego-Carmona (Eds.), *Translation research projects 4*: 61-70. Tarragona: Intercultural Studies Group.
- Mooij, Marieke. (2004). Translating Advertising: painting the tip of an iceberg. *The Translator* 10, 2, 179-198.
- Ramière, Nathalie (2006). Reaching a Foreign Audience: cultural transfers in audiovisual translation. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 6, 152–166.
- Sokoli, Stavroula. (2006). Learning via Subtitling (LvS): a tool for the creation of foreign language learning activities based on film subtitling. *MuTra Audiovisual Translation Scenarios: Conference Proceedings*.
- Zabalbeascoa, P., Sokoli, S. & Torres, O. (2012) ClipFlair Conceptual Framework and Pedagogical Methodology. Retrieved from <https://repositori.upf.edu/bitstream-/handle/10230/22701/ClipFlair%20ConceptualFramework.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>

Notes

1. <http://levis.cti.gr/>

2. <http://clipflair.net/>

3. European Institute for Gender Equality: <https://eige.europa.eu/thesaurus/terms/1157?lang=en>

4. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=owGyKVbfgUE>