Shaping variation in the human immune system

Adrian Liston[1,2], Edward J Carr[3], Michelle A Linterman[3]

[1] Translational Immunology Laboratory, VIB, Leuven 3000, Belgium

[2] Department of Microbiology and Immunology, KU Leuven, Leuven 3000, Belgium

[3] Laboratory of Lymphocyte Signaling and Development, Babraham Institute, Cambridge, CB22 3AT, UK

Correspondence to adrian.liston@vib.be and michelle.linterman@babraham.ac.uk

Immune responses demonstrate a high-level of intra-species variation, compensating for the specialization capacity of pathogens. The recent advent of high-depth immune phenotyping projects in large-scale cohorts has allowed a first look into the factors that shape the inter-individual diversity of the human immune system. Genetic approaches have identified genetic diversity as drivers of 20-40% of the variation between the immune systems of individuals. The remaining 60-80% is shaped by intrinsic factors, with age being the predominant factor, and environmental influences, with cohabitation and chronic viral infections identified as key mediators. Here we review and integrate the recent high-depth large-scale studies on human immune diversity, with its potential impact on health.

Dissecting Variation Through Population Immunology Studies

The evolutionary arms-race between pathogens and hosts includes the constant refinement of host anti-pathogen mechanisms, and the reciprocal development of microbial strategies to circumvent these defenses [1]. While multi-cellular hosts bear the advantage of being able to specialize cells (our immune system) to the task of pathogen clearance, micro-organisms have the undoubted advantage in evolutionary speed. Because of this, the inter-individual diversity of the immune system in a species is an important mechanism for limiting the impact specific pathogens can have on the morbidity and mortality of a population. The maintenance of inter-individual diversity within the immune system is therefore a critical aspect of its function, albeit one that is often neglected in immunological research, for example, through the use of genetically identical mice housed under specific pathogen free conditions [3].

The archetype of diversity generation in the human immune system is the production of extra-genomic variation in the antigen receptors of the adaptive immune system (T cell receptor and B cell receptor). The combination of permutational choice in gene fragment selection with an error-prone system creates an essentially personal T cell and B cell receptor repertoire for each individual, with response capacity further molded by the structural diversity encoded by the highly polymorphic MHC locus [4, 5]. Clonal selection further shapes the repertoire in the periphery. However, even beyond the process of adaptive diversity, an enormous amount of variation exists in the number and functional status of each immunological component. Leukocytes, one of the key cellular mediators of the immune system, are epigenetically modified by the micro-environment and a myriad of other interactions to the point where each individual cell could be considered to exist in a unique status [6, 7]. These interactions shape the composition of an individual's immune system over their lifespan, for example driving the differentiation of naïve T cells into subsets with specialized functions, resulting in the context-dependent generation of Th1, Th2, Th17, follicular helper and regulatory subsets [8].

While a major focus of immunology research over the past decades has been in identifying and functionally dissecting these alternative activation states, there has been a growing appreciation that the plasticity of the immune system and the plethora of subsets and activation statuses results in dramatic individual-to-individual

variation in the immune system. In this review we concentrate on population immunology (see Glossary) studies, which we define as research which directly compares the status of the immune system (relative number of leukocyte subsets, activation status of leukocytes, production of non-cellular mediators) across a large number of individuals for the purpose of identifying the drivers of variation in the human immune system.

Human Immune Variation

The human immune system has a high degree of variation present between individuals. This variation manifests at the cellular and intra-cellular level, such as the differences in the relative frequency of different leukocyte populations and subsets, variation in the transcriptional and translational profiles of leukocyte subsets and variation in the functional capacity and polarization in response to immunological challenges such as vaccines [9]. This variability results in individuals with a different intrinsic susceptibility to different diseases. As an example, the concept of individuals being "Th1-biased" or "Th2-biased" is an articulation of this intrinsic variability, albeit a simplification of the multiple potential states the human immune system could adopt. More broadly, we consider the constellation of multiple cellular and molecular immune parameters within an individual to constitute the immune phenotype of that individual.

The use of high detail longitudinal analysis of the human immune system has revealed this immune phenotype to be highly stable. In principle, the variation present in immune phenotypes within the human population could be generated through either of two mechanisms. First, the human immune system could undergo a continual flux within each individual (producing high levels of intra-individual variation), a process which would in turn produce a high degree of inter-individual variation (**Figure 1a, Online Video 1**). Alternatively, the immune profile of individuals could have relatively low levels of temporal variation in a given individual, but with highly divergent phenotypes between individuals (**Figure 1b, Online Video 2**). In this case, an individual immune phenotype would constitute a 'stability island', around which the immune parameters remain fixed over time. Multiple immune phenotyping studies, investigating the relative frequency of leukocyte subsets and activation states, have found that while inter-individual variation is high, the immune profile of

84   each individual is remarkable stable, even over the course of multiple months [10-13],

85   favoring the second mechanism described above.

86   The long-term stability of an individual's immune system in the absence of

87   immunological challenge does not require that stability is maintained during infection.

88   One way to experimentally determine how an acute challenge impacts the immune

89   system in humans is to use vaccination. This enables the global assessment of the

90   immune system prior to, during, and following a known immunological stimulus [14].

91   There is a general pattern that emerges from these systems vaccinology studies that

92   demonstrates the elastic response of the human immune system to acute challenge.

93   The early phase of the immune response (0-3 days post vaccination) is characterised

94   by the expansion of circulating antigen-presenting innate immune cells, which

95   activate T cells. The resultant expansion of T cells and the production of antibody-

96   secreting plasma cells peak at 6-10 days post-vaccination, and are followed by a

97   return to the pre-vaccination baseline [12, 13, 16-20]. The long-term functional

98   memory T and B cells that persist [21, 22], are not present at a sufficient numbers to

99   alter the cellular composition of the circulating immune system [12, 13, 16, 23-25]. In

100   principle, an individual's immune profile could elastically return to the original stable

101   state following this immunological challenge (**Figure 1c, Online Video 3**), or the

102   transient changes caused during infection could cause it to settle into a new stable

103   immunological state (**Figure 1d, Online Video 4**). The data for both gastrointestinal

104   infection (traveller's diarrhoea) and influenza vaccination in people suggest that the

105   'elastic rebound' model is appropriate [13]. In other words, individuals will generally

106   return to an immune phenotype similar to their original state after an acute immune

107   stimulus, although chronic infections may be an exception (see dedicated section

108   below). The presence of these two characteristics, longitudinal stability and elastic

109   rebound after challenge, allows the further dissection of which factors shape

110   diversity.

111   **Intrinsic Factors Influencing the Human Immune System**

112   *Age*

113   With advancing age the function of the immune system declines, rendering older

114   persons more susceptible to infection and less able to generate protective immunity

115   after vaccination [26]. Population immunology studies that have included age as a

116   variable have found that aging impacts on ~20% of immunological traits, and overall

contributes ~5% of total immune variation [10, 11, 13, 27]. Analysis of the specific traits impacted demonstrates that the ageing human immune system is largely characterized by a decrease in the frequency of precursor cells, and an increase in the number of T cells with an activated or memory phenotype [10, 11, 13, 27, 28]. The changing immune landscape over time is likely driven by a number of biological mechanisms. As the immune system is constantly interacting with both pathogens and commensals, it is thought that these interactions play a key role in shaping the human immune system, such as by increasing the number of memory cells with age [29]. However, work with germ-free mice demonstrates that T cells that have not 'seen' their cognate antigen can acquire a memory phenotype via homeostatic expansion [30, 31]. Memory phenotype cells are found in human cord blood suggestive of homeostatic expansion [32], but the assumed sterility of the *in utero* environment is questionable [33]. Ageing is characterized by an increase in proinflammatory cytokines, which alter the environment of the immune system. This in turn may alter the phenotype and function of immune cells in an antigen-independent way [34]. Because humans maintain their naïve T cell pool for decades by peripheral T cell division alone [35], and as the long-term impact of a single immune challenge is minute in the immune landscapes of healthy people [12, 13], it is plausible that the age-dependent skewing of the immune system from a naïve to memory phenotype may occur, in part, without recognition of cognate antigen or as a result of cross-reactivity [36, 37].

Despite the clear role for non-genetic factors shaping the ageing immune system, cellular phenotypes associated with ageing, for example the decline in thymic output and thus numbers of recent thymic emigrants, have high heritability [10, 11, 13, 38]. This suggests that the interplay of genetic and non-genetic factors is important for the development of ageing phenotypes. While the role for selection of genes that impact ageing phenotypes is an area of intense debate [39], human longevity studies show a clear role of genetics in impacting how well we age [40]. Specific studies on how genetics shape the human immune system have yet to be realized. Nevertheless, single nucleotide polymorphisms associated with longevity are also linked with functional changes in the immune system [40-42], suggesting a link between immunity, inflammation and health in older age.

Sex

It is clear that there is sexual dimorphism in immune-related pathology. In general, autoimmune diseases are more common in women than men [43], while men are more susceptible to infections caused by viruses, bacteria, parasites and fungi [44]. There is also evidence that women produce higher antibody titers in response to vaccination than men, suggesting sex can impact immune function [44]. Despite clear differences in functional outcome, the differences in the cellular composition of the immune system between men and women are few; women tend to have a higher CD4$^+$ T cell count, and lower natural killer (NK) cell counts than men, but otherwise no consistent differences are observed [13, 27, 45], suggesting sex has a larger influence on disease outcome than immune composition. This is supported by large scale phenotyping of clinical and immunological parameters in parallel, that indicates that sex has the largest effect on clinical phenotypes [27]. Interestingly, the functional and cellular differences between the sexes are more pronounced in men with high testosterone [46], and disappear after menopause [44, 45], suggesting that the sex hormones are responsible for these changes, although precisely how this is mediated has yet to be elucidated.

Genetic Control Over Human Immune Variation

A likely driver for individual-to-individual variation in the settings of the immune system is genetic variation. Indeed, major studies into the genetic basis of variation in the cellular and molecular composition of the human immune system have found that genetic variation (e.g. common and rare variants, variations in copy number) accounts for 20-40% [10, 11, 47, 48] of total immunological variation (**Figure 2**). These studies have used either a twin or familial structure to estimate heritability. The twin studies use the classical ACE model (see **Glossary**), while Orrù *et al.* use a kinship matrix based on genotype to define relatedness [11]. Heritability estimates should therefore be considered with a broad definition of genetic variation, including (but not limited to) common, copy number and rare variants; heritable epigenetic modification and genotype-genotype interactions (for example, interactions between Killer immunoglobulin-like receptor gene variants and HLA variants determine the severity of CMV infection [49].

The range of heritability estimates, from 20 to 40% of total immunological variance, is likely to reflect both biological differences in the populations being measured and methodological differences in sampling and the choice of which immunological

183 parameters to include in the study of overall immune diversity. In this regard, it is
184 notable that the highest estimates came from analysis of the Sardinian population
185 (which is a genetic isolate). The lowest level of heritability was reported by Ye *et al.*
186 [47]. There were several features unique to this study: (i) transcriptome-level
187 analysis; (ii) tightly controlled sampling protocol (with only sampling between the
188 hours of 07:30-08:30, from fasted participants); (iii) cells were examined both *ex vivo*
189 and after stimulation and (iv) heritability was estimated from principal components
190 based on ancestry. It is tempting, when comparing the lower heritability in Ye *et al.* to
191 the other studies, to speculate that the transcriptome might well have a larger total
192 variance than the cellular composition of the immune system. For instance, it seems
193 plausible that the absolute expression of *CD4* mRNA may vary more markedly than
194 the frequency of $CD4^+$ T cells. In support of this proposition, an older study using only
195 basic immune populations found a much higher heritability estimate of ~70% [50].
196 This would indicate a hierarchy of genetic influence, with the strongest effects being
197 felt at the leukocyte population level, moderate effects at the level of subsets and
198 activation potential, and the weakest effects at the level of transcription. By inference,
199 environmental effects are likely to be strongest at the molecular level and would have
200 the weakest potential to influence major leukocyte populations. An exception may be
201 cis-acting regulatory polymorphisms, with some of the highest heritability found for
202 single protein expression markers and their corresponding gene (for example CD39
203 expression with *ENTPD1*, the CD39 gene, variants [38]). While it is debatable as to
204 which level of immune variation is the most relevant, given that the basic unit of
205 immunity is the cell it seems reasonable to us to focus on the variation present at the
206 level of cellular subset and function, rather than lower-order (transcriptome, single
207 gene expression) or higher-order (basic leukocytes) variation.

208 Beyond gross heritability analysis, several studies have explored the relationship
209 between specific genetic variants and individual immune parameters. To date, only
210 associations with common single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNP) have been
211 explored [11, 38, 47]. The relatively low number of individuals assessed in this
212 manner (compared to disease-based genome-wide association studies), and the
213 multiple classes of genetic variants missing from these studies (**Box 3**), preclude final
214 conclusions being made – there is more to be found from genetic analyses. However,
215 as may be expected, many of the SNPs identified that are associated with changes in
216 immune cell types are in or near genes with known functions in the immune system,

217 and in particular within genes that have been previously associated with
218 autoimmunity, inflammatory diseases and susceptibility to infection [11, 38]. These
219 findings strongly support the supposition that diversity in the immune system
220 contributes to the relative risk of the individual to develop immunological disease.

221 **Environmental Influences on Human Immune Variation**

222 The estimate of the contribution heritable (20-40%) and intrinsic factors (~5%) make
223 to the observed immunological variation suggests a major role for environmental
224 factors. Unlike genetic and intrinsic factors, which are readily identifiable and
225 measureable, dissecting out the individual environmental factors that may play a role
226 is confounded by the limitless list of putative environmental factors that could be
227 considered, the difficulty in collecting data for any of these factors, and the unknown
228 timeframe over which environmental factors may be acting. Nevertheless, there are
229 indications of the potency and nature of environmental contributors to immunological
230 variation. We recently assessed the immunological variation that is present between
231 opposite sex couples living with a child and found that the degree of variation was
232 50% lower than is observed in the general public [13], indicating that a convergence
233 in immune status occurs during cohabitation (**Figure 3** and **online video 5**). Even
234 with the proviso that couples are not randomly assorting, this data indicates that
235 environmental factors are potent, that they can modify the adult immune system, and
236 that they can be observed at the level of the household. The cohabitation effect is
237 likely to be driven through the accumulated impact of multiple smaller factors, as the
238 reduction of diversity evident within each couple was unique [13] (while convergence
239 driven by a single environmental factor would be expected to show a consistent effect
240 across multiple couples).

241 There are multiple promising candidates for the household environmental factors
242 capable of shaping the variation present in the human immune system. One of the
243 strongest is likely to be chronic viral infections, with discordance in cytomegalovirus
244 infection a major driver of immune diversity between monozygotic twins [10] (see
245 detailed section below). Other factors that are shared within household members and
246 are known to alter the immune state, and which could therefore drive household-level
247 immunological convergence, include smoking status [51], well-being [52, 53], pet
248 ownership [54], physical activity [55], obesity [13], diet [56] and environmental
249 pollutants [57, 58]. Each of these factors is also likely to influence the composition of

that individual's microbiota. The indirect microbiota convergence between individuals that share an environment (and thus the same microbiota modifiers) is also accompanied by direct transmission of microbiota between individuals in close proximity, enhancing microbiota convergence [59-62]. With the growing evidence that the microbiota composition, especially within the gut, influences the immune system [63-67], it is plausible that microbiota changes act as an integrator of multiple environmental factors, in turn shaping diversity within the human immune system. Seasonal change is another environmental factor that can influence immune variation [68], however it is unlikely to be captured in most study designs, as it would not induce variation between individuals living in the same region at a given time-point.

Bacteria and viruses are both able to establish chronic infections. For example *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and cytomegalovirus (CMV) are able to persist long-term in humans. Such infections can be established when the pathogen is able to evade sterilizing immunity, followed by formation of an equilibrium between the pathogen and host in which the inflammatory response is reduced to a level that can control the pathogen without causing excess damage to the host [69, 70]. The balance between host and chronic infectious agents is a complex one; ultimately the pathogen requires a live host for its continued survival so must exist in a balance of not triggering overt immunity and clearance, and not overcoming the host with disease. This constant interaction with the host immune system has an indelible impact on the immune landscape.

There are a number of chronic viral infections that rarely cause disease in healthy hosts with symptoms only becoming apparent in immunocompromised individuals [69]. Despite the lack of clinical disease, this long-term dynamic interaction between host and virus has significant impact on altering the cellular composition of the immune system. The best characterised of these persistent infections are CMV and Epstein-Barr virus (EBV). CMV influences the immune system directly, by increasing the frequency of CMV-specific CD4$^+$ and CD8$^+$ T cells to around 5% of the total T cell pool in people under 55 years old [71], the frequency of CMV specific cells increases further with age suggesting a dynamic host-pathogen interaction that continues to shape the immune system [29]. This effect is likely due to the combined impact of thymic involution with the continued stimulation of CMV-specific T cells clones throughout life [72]. The effects of CMV are not limited to antigen-specific T cells; global analysis of the immune systems either unrelated individuals or monozygotic

twins that are discordant for CMV demonstrate that presence of this virus alters the level of certain serum cytokines, such as IL-6, and frequency of many cell types including γδ T cells, granulocytes and memory CD8$^+$ T cells [10, 27]. It is clear that CMV has significant effects on the composition of the immune system, and intriguing that it seems to be the most extreme example of a persistent infection impacting the host in this way. A caveat for the role of CMV in these studies, is that their concordance for other chronic infections was not assessed [10]. However, individuals infected with herpes simplex virus do not exhibit the type of changes in their circulating T cell compartment that are driven by CMV [73]. Persistent EBV infections that have not caused acute disease (infectious mononucleosis) also result in the accumulation of virus-specific CD4$^+$ and CD8$^+$ T cells, but not as high a frequency as CMV specific T cells [74, 75].

Concluding Remarks

The advent of large-scale high-depth immune profiling ("population immunology") has allowed a first insight into the scope and nature of immune diversity within the human population. In the case of systems vaccinology, this variation has a clear potential impact on health, with altered efficacy of vaccination against infectious diseases [12, 18]. However, variation in the human immune system is likely to not only influence responses to infections, but also to impact on susceptibility to autoimmunity, allergy, cancer and the inflammatory diseases of ageing, such as diabetes, cardiovascular disease and neurodegeneration. To a certain degree this variation, and the resulting disease susceptibility, is 'locked in', owing to the influence of genetic and intrinsic factors. However, a surprisingly high influence of environmental control has also been observed, such as is revealed by the effect of cohabitation [13]. New studies need to be performed to identify the distinct interactions between environment and immune variation, however for parameters such as microbiome [64], diet [56], air pollution [57] and even anxiety [53], it is likely that much of the influence they have over disease susceptibility will lie in their capacity to modulate the immune system. Dissections of the particular environment-immune interactions that constitute disease risk have the potential to allow targeted modification of the immune system by lifestyle and environmental modulation (see Outstanding Questions). Regulation of environmental influences over the immune system through approaches such as dietary modification, restricting exposure to certain pollutants and monitoring microbiota changes would combine aspects of personalized medicine with

preventative medicine, and could have a profound impact on the way immunological health is managed.

Acknowledgements

References

1 Sorci, G.*, et al.* (2013) Immune evasion, immunopathology and the regulation of the immune system. *Pathogens* 2, 71-91

2 Hermsen, R.*, et al.* (2012) On the rapidity of antibiotic resistance evolution facilitated by a concentration gradient. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 109, 10775-10780

3 Davis, M.M. (2008) A prescription for human immunology. *Immunity* 29, 835-838

4 Zarnitsyna, V.I.*, et al.* (2013) Estimating the diversity, completeness, and cross-reactivity of the T cell repertoire. *Frontiers in immunology* 4, 485

5 Qi, Q.*, et al.* (2014) Diversity and clonal selection in the human T-cell repertoire. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 111, 13139-13144

6 Junkin, M.*, et al.* (2016) High-Content Quantification of Single-Cell Immune Dynamics. *Cell reports* 15, 411-422

7 Avraham, R.*, et al.* (2015) Pathogen Cell-to-Cell Variability Drives Heterogeneity in Host Immune Responses. *Cell* 162, 1309-1321

8 Murphy, K.M. and Stockinger, B. (2010) Effector T cell plasticity: flexibility in the face of changing circumstances. *Nature immunology* 11, 674-680

9 Tsang, J.S. (2015) Utilizing population variation, vaccination, and systems biology to study human immunology. *Trends in immunology* 36, 479-493

10 Brodin, P.*, et al.* (2015) Variation in the human immune system is largely driven by non-heritable influences. *Cell* 160, 37-47

11 Orru, V.*, et al.* (2013) Genetic variants regulating immune cell levels in health and disease. *Cell* 155, 242-256

350 12 Tsang, J.S.*, et al.* (2014) Global analyses of human immune variation reveal
351   baseline predictors of postvaccination responses. *Cell* 157, 499-513

352 13 Carr, E.J.*, et al.* (2016) The cellular composition of the human immune system is
353   shaped by age and cohabitation. *Nature immunology* 17, 461-468

354 14 Pulendran, B.*, et al.* (2013) Immunity to viruses: learning from successful human
355   vaccines. *Immunological reviews* 255, 243-255

356 15 Sridhar, S.*, et al.* (2015) Influenza Vaccination Strategies: Comparing Inactivated
357   and Live Attenuated Influenza Vaccines. *Vaccines* 3, 373-389

358 16 Sobolev, O.*, et al.* (2016) Adjuvanted influenza-H1N1 vaccination reveals
359   lymphoid signatures of age-dependent early responses and of clinical adverse
360   events. *Nature immunology* 17, 204-213

361 17 Querec, T.D.*, et al.* (2009) Systems biology approach predicts immunogenicity of
362   the yellow fever vaccine in humans. *Nature immunology* 10, 116-125

363 18 Nakaya, H.I.*, et al.* (2011) Systems biology of vaccination for seasonal influenza in
364   humans. *Nature immunology* 12, 786-795

365 19 Bucasas, K.L.*, et al.* (2011) Early patterns of gene expression correlate with the
366   humoral immune response to influenza vaccination in humans. *The Journal of*
367   *infectious diseases* 203, 921-929

368 20 Gaucher, D.*, et al.* (2008) Yellow fever vaccine induces integrated multilineage
369   and polyfunctional immune responses. *The Journal of experimental medicine*
370   205, 3119-3131

371 21 Kotturi, M.F.*, et al.* (2011) Human CD8(+) and CD4(+) T cell memory to
372   lymphocytic choriomeningitis virus infection. *Journal of virology* 85, 11770-11780

373 22 Yu, X.*, et al.* (2008) Neutralizing antibodies derived from the B cells of 1918
374   influenza pandemic survivors. *Nature* 455, 532-536

375 23 Li, S.*, et al.* (2014) Molecular signatures of antibody responses derived from a
376   systems biology study of five human vaccines. *Nature immunology* 15, 195-204

377 24 Yang, J.*, et al.* (2013) CD4+ T cells recognize unique and conserved 2009 H1N1
378   influenza hemagglutinin epitopes after natural infection and vaccination.
379   *International immunology* 25, 447-457

380 25 James, E.A.*, et al.* (2013) Yellow fever vaccination elicits broad functional CD4+ T
381   cell responses that recognize structural and nonstructural proteins. *Journal of*
382   *virology* 87, 12794-12804

383 26 Linterman, M.A. (2014) How T follicular helper cells and the germinal centre
384   response change with age. *Immunology and cell biology* 92, 72-79

385   27 Whiting, C.C., *et al.* (2015) Large-Scale and Comprehensive Immune Profiling and
386   Functional Analysis of Normal Human Aging. *PloS one* 10, e0133627

387   28 Goronzy, J.J. and Weyand, C.M. (2013) Understanding immunosenescence to
388   improve responses to vaccines. *Nature immunology* 14, 428-436

389   29 Griffiths, S.J., *et al.* (2013) Age-associated increase of low-avidity
390   cytomegalovirus-specific CD8+ T cells that re-express CD45RA. *Journal of*
391   *immunology* 190, 5363-5372

392   30 Haluszczak, C., *et al.* (2009) The antigen-specific CD8+ T cell repertoire in
393   unimmunized mice includes memory phenotype cells bearing markers of
394   homeostatic expansion. *The Journal of experimental medicine* 206, 435-448

395   31 Huang, T., *et al.* (2005) Commensal microbiota alter the abundance and TCR
396   responsiveness of splenic naive CD4+ T lymphocytes. *Clinical immunology* 117,
397   221-230

398   32 Zhang, X., *et al.* (2014) CD4 T cells with effector memory phenotype and function
399   develop in the sterile environment of the fetus. *Science translational medicine* 6,
400   238ra272

401   33 Aagaard, K., *et al.* (2014) The placenta harbors a unique microbiome. *Science*
402   *translational medicine* 6, 237ra265

403   34 Rodier, F. and Campisi, J. (2011) Four faces of cellular senescence. *The Journal*
404   *of cell biology* 192, 547-556

405   35 den Braber, I., *et al.* (2012) Maintenance of peripheral naive T cells is sustained
406   by thymus output in mice but not humans. *Immunity* 36, 288-297

407   36 Sprent, J. and Surh, C.D. (2011) Normal T cell homeostasis: the conversion of
408   naive cells into memory-phenotype cells. *Nature immunology* 12, 478-484

409   37 Su, L.F., *et al.* (2013) Virus-specific CD4(+) memory-phenotype T cells are
410   abundant in unexposed adults. *Immunity* 38, 373-383

411   38 Roederer, M., *et al.* (2015) The genetic architecture of the human immune system:
412   a bioresource for autoimmunity and disease pathogenesis. *Cell* 161, 387-403

413   39 Kirkwood, T.B. (2002) Evolution of ageing. *Mechanisms of ageing and*
414   *development* 123, 737-745

415   40 Willcox, B.J., *et al.* (2008) FOXO3A genotype is strongly associated with human
416   longevity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States*
417   *of America* 105, 13987-13992

418   41 Lee, J.C., *et al.* (2013) Human SNP links differential outcomes in inflammatory
419   and infectious disease to a FOXO3-regulated pathway. *Cell* 155, 57-69

420 42 Balistreri, C.R.*, et al.* (2012) Genetics of longevity. data from the studies on
421   Sicilian centenarians. *Immunity & ageing : I & A* 9, 8

422 43 Rubtsova, K.*, et al.* (2015) Sexual dimorphism in autoimmunity. *The Journal of*
423   *clinical investigation* 125, 2187-2193

424 44 Giefing-Kroll, C.*, et al.* (2015) How sex and age affect immune responses,
425   susceptibility to infections, and response to vaccination. *Aging cell* 14, 309-321

426 45 Jentsch-Ullrich, K.*, et al.* (2005) Lymphocyte subsets' reference ranges in an age-
427   and gender-balanced population of 100 healthy adults--a monocentric German
428   study. *Clinical immunology* 116, 192-197

429 46 Furman, D.*, et al.* (2014) Systems analysis of sex differences reveals an
430   immunosuppressive role for testosterone in the response to influenza
431   vaccination. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United*
432   *States of America* 111, 869-874

433 47 Ye, C.J.*, et al.* (2014) Intersection of population variation and autoimmunity
434   genetics in human T cell activation. *Science* 345, 1311-1316

435 48 Naitza, S.*, et al.* (2012) A genome-wide association scan on the levels of markers
436   of inflammation in Sardinians reveals associations that underpin its complex
437   regulation. *PLoS genetics* 8, e1002480

438 49 Jones, D.C.*, et al.* (2014) Killer immunoglobulin-like receptor gene repertoire
439   influences viral load of primary human cytomegalovirus infection in renal
440   transplant patients. *Genes and immunity* 15, 562-568

441 50 Evans, D.M.*, et al.* (1999) Genetic and environmental causes of variation in basal
442   levels of blood cells. *Twin research : the official journal of the International*
443   *Society for Twin Studies* 2, 250-257

444 51 Thomas, S.*, et al.* (2015) The Milieu Interieur study - an integrative approach for
445   study of human immunological variance. *Clinical immunology* 157, 277-293

446 52 Lasselin, J.*, et al.* (2016) Well-being and immune response: a multi-system
447   perspective. *Current opinion in pharmacology* 29, 34-41

448 53 Wouters, M.M.*, et al.* (2015) Psychological comorbidity increases the risk for
449   postinfectious IBS partly by enhanced susceptibility to develop infectious
450   gastroenteritis. *Gut*

451 54 Simpson, A. (2010) Effect of household pet ownership on infant immune response
452   and subsequent sensitization. *Journal of asthma and allergy* 3, 131-137

453 55 Gjevestad, G.O.*, et al.* (2015) Effects of Exercise on Gene Expression of
454   Inflammatory Markers in Human Peripheral Blood Cells: A Systematic Review.
455   *Current cardiovascular risk reports* 9, 34

456 56 Julia, V.*, et al.* (2015) The impact of diet on asthma and allergic diseases. *Nature*
457   *reviews. Immunology* 15, 308-322

458 57 Huang, S.K.*, et al.* (2015) Mechanistic impact of outdoor air pollution on asthma
459   and allergic diseases. *Journal of thoracic disease* 7, 23-33

460 58 Schuijs, M.J.*, et al.* (2015) Farm dust and endotoxin protect against allergy
461   through A20 induction in lung epithelial cells. *Science* 349, 1106-1110

462 59 Yatsunenko, T.*, et al.* (2012) Human gut microbiome viewed across age and
463   geography. *Nature* 486, 222-227

464 60 Song, S.J.*, et al.* (2013) Cohabiting family members share microbiota with one
465   another and with their dogs. *eLife* 2, e00458

466 61 Lax, S.*, et al.* (2014) Longitudinal analysis of microbial interaction between
467   humans and the indoor environment. *Science* 345, 1048-1052

468 62 Kort, R.*, et al.* (2014) Shaping the oral microbiota through intimate kissing.
469   *Microbiome* 2, 41

470 63 Narayan, N.R.*, et al.* (2015) Persistent effects of early infant diet and associated
471   microbiota on the juvenile immune system. *Gut microbes* 6, 284-289

472 64 Vatanen, T.*, et al.* (2016) Variation in Microbiome LPS Immunogenicity
473   Contributes to Autoimmunity in Humans. *Cell* 165, 842-853

474 65 Chu, H.*, et al.* (2016) Gene-microbiota interactions contribute to the pathogenesis
475   of inflammatory bowel disease. *Science* 352, 1116-1120

476 66 Gomez de Aguero, M.*, et al.* (2016) The maternal microbiota drives early
477   postnatal innate immune development. *Science* 351, 1296-1302

478 67 Oh, J.Z.*, et al.* (2014) TLR5-mediated sensing of gut microbiota is necessary for
479   antibody responses to seasonal influenza vaccination. *Immunity* 41, 478-492

480 68 Dopico, X.C.*, et al.* (2015) Widespread seasonal gene expression reveals annual
481   differences in human immunity and physiology. *Nature communications* 6, 7000

482 69 Young, D.*, et al.* (2002) Chronic bacterial infections: living with unwanted guests.
483   *Nature immunology* 3, 1026-1032

484 70 Virgin, H.W.*, et al.* (2009) Redefining chronic viral infection. *Cell* 138, 30-50

485 71 Sylwester, A.W.*, et al.* (2005) Broadly targeted human cytomegalovirus-specific
486   CD4+ and CD8+ T cells dominate the memory compartments of exposed
487   subjects. *The Journal of experimental medicine* 202, 673-685

488 72 Sauce, D*., et al.* (2009) Evidence of premature immune aging in patients
489   thymectomized during early childhood. *The Journal of clinical investigation* 119,
490   3070-3078

491 73 Derhovanessian, E*., et al.* (2011) Infection with cytomegalovirus but not herpes
492   simplex virus induces the accumulation of late-differentiated CD4+ and CD8+ T-
493   cells in humans. *The Journal of general virology* 92, 2746-2756

494 74 Long, H.M*., et al.* (2011) Cytotoxic CD4+ T cell responses to EBV contrast with
495   CD8 responses in breadth of lytic cycle antigen choice and in lytic cycle
496   recognition. *Journal of immunology* 187, 92-101

497 75 Vescovini, R*., et al.* (2004) Different contribution of EBV and CMV infections in
498   very long-term carriers to age-related alterations of CD8+ T cells. *Experimental*
499   *gerontology* 39, 1233-1243

500 76 Reich, D.E*., et al.* (2003) Quality and completeness of SNP databases. *Nature*
501   *genetics* 33, 457-458

502 77 Hargreaves, C.E*., et al.* (2015) Evaluation of High-Throughput Genomic Assays
503   for the Fc Gamma Receptor Locus. *PloS one* 10, e0142379

504 78 Flajnik, M.F. and Kasahara, M. (2010) Origin and evolution of the adaptive
505   immune system: genetic events and selective pressures. *Nature reviews.*
506   *Genetics* 11, 47-59

507 79 Willcocks, L.C*., et al.* (2010) A defunctioning polymorphism in FCGR2B is
508   associated with protection against malaria but susceptibility to systemic lupus
509   erythematosus. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United*
510   *States of America* 107, 7881-7885

511

Figure legends

512

513

514

515

516

Box 1. Limitations in SNP Genotyping Platforms

517

518 The SNP genotyping platforms typically used for genome-wide association studies
519 place an emphasis on common single nucleotide (>5% allelic frequency), which
520 accounts for ±90% of genetic variation in the human population [76]. This excludes
521 certain classes of genetic variation, notably copy number variation and rare variants,
522 which, while less common, may exert a disproportionate degree of influence over the
523 immune system. SNP genotyping platforms can also struggle with immunological loci,
524 owing to the enrichment for gene duplication events [77, 78]. For example, the
525 rs1050501 SNP in *FCG2RB*, confers susceptibility to systemic lupus erythematosus
526 and protection from malaria [79]. The pseudogene *FCGR2C* has an identical
527 nucleotide sequence in this exon, but is homozygous for the ancestral allele.
528 Genome-wide SNP platforms will discard rs1050501 at the quality control stages, as
529 it will not follow Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (that allele frequencies will remain
530 constant across generations in the absence of selection pressure) due to
531 contaminating signal from *FCGR2C*. These effects place a technical burden on
532 estimating the contribution of such loci, which may cause an under-estimation of the
533 genetic contribution of immunological loci.

534 **Figure 1. Opposing Models for the Properties of Human Immune Variation.**
535 Variation in the immune system can be represented as different points that can be
536 occupied on an 'immunological landscape'. **A.** The stochastic model is based on a
537 fluctuating immune system, where apparent diversity is observed due to taking single
538 snap-shots of an immune system in flux. **B.** The stability model is based on
539 individual-to-individual variation reflecting a consistent longitudinal difference, with
540 only minor changes occurring within healthy individuals monitored over time. The
541 stability model raises additional possibilities of elastic or inelastic stability. **C.** The
542 elastic stability model is based on individuals maintaining distinct immune variation,

consistently across time. While immunological disturbances (such as infection) can transiently alter the state, following the end of the disturbance, individuals 'rebound' to the original state. **D.** The inelastic stability model also has maintenance of distinct immune variation over time, however immunological challenges can disrupt the default state, resulting in a different stable state being achieved. The white flashes in C and D represent a immunological challenge, such as vaccination, or infection.

Figure 2. Heritability of Immune Traits Across Different Populations and Study Designs. Published heritability estimates for individual immune traits. For each study, the study design, numbers of individuals and measurement strategy (blue, twin study; orange, family study) is displayed. For Ye *et al.*, heritability estimates for each individual trait were unavailable; the 'global' reported estimate is shown; this study used a population study design. Boxes depict interquartile range (IQR) and median. The whiskers extend up to the furthest datapoint or 1.5 x IQR, in which case outliers are plotted with dots. Abbreviations used: MZ monozygotic; DZ dizygotic.

Figure 3. Interaction of Genetics, Age and Environment on Immune Variation. Immune variation can be modeled as an 'immunological landscape', with individuals occupying different points on the landscape. A synthesis of current data would place the role of genetics as influencing the initial starting point on the immune landscape. This initial variation is molded by age, with predictable changes occurring over time, driving the same changes in different individuals. Local environment strongly modifies other variables, leading to factors such as cohabitation (pink) resulting in convergence between different individuals to a closer point on the immunological landscape.

Online Video 1. The Stochastic Model of Human Immune Variation. Variation in the immune system can be represented as different points that can be occupied on an "immunological landscape". The stochastic model is based on a fluctuating immune system, where apparent diversity is observed due to taking single 'snap-shots' of an immune system in flux. Under this model, the relative diversity between individuals will change dramatically over time, as each individual constantly moves through the immunological landscape.

Online Video 2. The Stability Model of Human Immune Variation. Variation in the immune system can be represented as different points that can be occupied on an "immunological landscape". The stability model is based on individual-to-individual variation reflecting a consistent longitudinal difference, with only minor changes occurring within healthy individuals monitored over time. In this model, the immune system of individuals can vary with time, but this variation is largely contained to a limited region on the immunological landscape (visualized through a depression in the landscape). The current data obtained from population immunology studies supports this model over the one presented in Video 1.

Online Video 3. The Elastic Stability Model of Human Immune Variation. Variation in the immune system can be represented as different points that can be occupied on an "immunological landscape". The stability model is based on individual-to-individual variation reflecting a consistent longitudinal difference, with only minor changes occurring within healthy individuals monitored over time. In this model, the immune system of individuals can vary with time, but this variation is largely contained to a limited region on the immunological landscape during the homeostatic context (visualized through a depression in the landscape). Despite this stability during homeostasis, the immune system can radically change during infection (visualized through the individuals turning black). Under the elastic stability model, these immunological disturbances are only transient, and following the end of the disturbance, individuals "rebound" to the original homeostatic state. Current data seems to support this model in most cases.

Online Video 4. The Inelastic Stability Model of Human Immune Variation. Variation in the immune system can be represented as different points that can be occupied on an "immunological landscape". The stability model is based on individual-to-individual variation reflecting a consistent longitudinal difference, with only minor changes occurring within healthy individuals monitored over time. In this model, the immune system of individuals can vary with time, but this variation is largely contained to a limited region on the immunological landscape during the homeostatic context (visualized through a depression in the landscape). Despite this stability during homeostasis, the immune system can radically change during infection (visualized through the individuals turning black). Under the inelastic stability model, these immunological disturbances create a lasting imprint on the individual's

immune variation, with a new homeostatic state being established at the resolution of infection. Infections that can establish chronicity are a good example of this model.

Online Video 5. Interaction of Genetics, Age and Environment on Immune Variation. Immune variation can be modeled as an "immunological landscape", with individuals occupying different points on the landscape. A synthesis of current data would place the role of genetics as influencing the initial homeostatic stability region on the immune landscape. Individuals show minor variation within their unique stability region over the short-term, however over the long-term the region of stability is molded by age, with predictable changes occurring over time, driving the same changes in different individuals (visualized by the downwards movement of the depression). In addition to the effect of age, local environment strongly modifies other variables, with factors such as cohabitation (with the pink flash indicating the initiation of cohabitation between the visualized individuals) resulting in convergence between the individuals to a closer point on the immunological landscape.

Glossary

Population immunology : The study of human immunology where the primary focus is to under the diversity of immune states and responses across a large population. Population immunology studies need to combine a high depth (e.g., detailed analysis of leukocyte population subsets or function) with large population size (typically between 100 and 1000 individuals) in order to identify the degree of immune variation and potential drivers.

ACE model: In the ACE model, total phenotypic variance is considered to be the sum of the variances attributed to genetic (A), common environmental (C) and unique environmental (E) factors. Twins share C and E, with monozygotic twins fully sharing A and dizygotic twins sharing 50%. Thus the assessment of multiple sets of monozygotic and dizygotic twins allows an estimation of the proportion of total phenotypic variance that is driven by genetic variation.