

1 **Title**

2 Comparative metagenomics reveals a diverse range of antimicrobial resistance genes in
3 effluents entering a river catchment

4 **Authors**

5 Will Rowe, wpmr2@cam.ac.uk ¹

6 David W. Verner-Jeffreys ²

7 Craig Baker-Austin ²

8 Jim J. Ryan ³

9 Duncan J. Maskell ¹

10 Gareth P. Pearce ¹

11 **Affiliations**

12 ¹ Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK

13 ² Centre for Environment, Fisheries and Aquaculture Science, Weymouth, UK

14 ³ Environment, Health and Safety, GlaxoSmithKline, Ware, UK

15 **Abstract**

16 The aquatic environment has been implicated as a reservoir for antimicrobial resistance genes.
17 In order to identify sources that are contributing to these gene reservoirs, it is crucial to assess
18 effluents that are entering the aquatic environment. Here we describe a metagenomic
19 assessment for two types of effluent entering a river catchment. We investigated the diversity
20 and abundance of resistance genes, mobile genetic elements and pathogenic bacteria. Findings
21 were normalised to a background sample of river source water. Our results show that effluent
22 contributed an array of genes to the river catchment, the most abundant being tetracycline
23 resistance genes *tetC* and *tetW* from farm effluents and the sulfonamide resistance gene *sul2*
24 from wastewater treatment plant effluents. In nine separate samples taken across three years
25 we found 53 different genes conferring resistance to 7 classes of antimicrobial. Compared to
26 the background sample taken up river from effluent entry, the average abundance of genes
27 was three times greater in the farm effluent and two times greater in the wastewater treatment
28 plant effluent. We conclude that effluents disperse antimicrobial resistance genes, mobile
29 genetic elements and pathogenic bacteria within a river catchment, thereby contributing to
30 environmental reservoirs of antimicrobial resistance genes.

31 **Key words 3-6**

32 Antimicrobial resistance, metagenomics, aquatic environment, resistome

33

34 **Introduction**

35 Antimicrobial resistance remains a significant and growing concern for both human and
36 veterinary clinical practice (Levy and Marshall 2004, Davies and Davies 2010), with
37 infections that were once readily treated now being resilient to antimicrobial therapy (WHO
38 2012). The use of antimicrobial compounds exerts selection pressures on bacteria, leading to
39 the fixation of gene mutations, selection of resistant precursors and the up-regulation and
40 lateral transfer of antimicrobial resistance genes (ARGs) within prokaryotic communities
41 (Gillings 2013). The maintenance and transfer of ARGs is responsible in part for the rising
42 threat of antimicrobial resistance (Laxminarayan et al. 2013).

43 The collective pool of ARGs in a given environment is termed the resistome (D'Costa et al.
44 2006, Wright 2007). Although a proportion of these ARGs are genes that have evolved to
45 utilise antimicrobial compounds for functions other than defence, such as signalling
46 molecules or constituents of metabolic pathways (Linares et al. 2006, Dantas et al. 2008), the
47 resistome may also serve as a reservoir for ARGs that can be transferred to clinically
48 significant pathogens (Forsberg et al. 2012, Wellington et al. 2013). Indeed, ARGs are
49 commonly associated with Mobile Genetic Elements (MGEs) that facilitate the transfer of
50 ARGs between bacteria and enable their entry into the accessory genome of pathogenic
51 bacteria (William et al. 2013).

52 There is growing evidence showing that aquatic environments harbour ARGs, MGEs and
53 pathogenic bacteria (Chen et al. 2013, Lu et al. 2015, Devarajan et al. 2015). It is also likely
54 that these environments may host many uncharacterised and novel ARGs that may be selected
55 for under sufficient selection pressures (Bengtsson-Palme et al. 2014). Effluents that feed into
56 the aquatic environment have also been shown to contain ARGs, such as the effluents of
57 urban residential areas and hospitals (Li et al. 2015), as well as other wastewater and faecal
58 sources (Li et al. 2012, Pruden et al. 2006, Zhang et al. 2009) but the abundance and diversity
59 of these genes relative to background samples needs to be clarified. It is therefore crucial to
60 establish whether effluents entering the aquatic environment are carrying ARGs, along with
61 MGEs and pathogenic bacteria, thus contributing to the reservoirs of resistance genes that
62 may be utilised by pathogenic bacteria and subsequently re-enter human and animal
63 populations (Berendonk et al. 2015).

64 Previous studies into the presence of ARGs within the aquatic environment have utilised
65 techniques such as bacterial culture and polymerase chain reaction (Lu et al. 2015, Tao et al.
66 2010, Zhang and Zhang 2011). These techniques offer the ability to detect phenotypic
67 resistance (culture), or a panel of ARGs, but they are limited by culturing bias or inadequate
68 detection panels. Next generation sequencing techniques, such as metagenomics, offer the
69 ability to circumvent these limitations and identify all known ARGs within a sample (if
70 suitable reference sequences are available), providing a new approach for the environmental
71 monitoring of antibiotic resistance (Port et al. 2014).

72 In this study we have identified two distinct effluents that enter a single river catchment. Both
73 effluents originate from faecal sources and were sampled several times, immediately prior to
74 them entering the environment. Using a comparative metagenomic approach, we describe the
75 ARG content of these effluents, characterise the MGEs and pathogenic bacteria present, and
76 relate the abundance of these features to a background sample of the river source water, taken
77 from upstream of the effluent entry points.

78 **Methods**

79 ***Sample collection and DNA sequencing***

80 Water samples were collected from three sources within the River Cam Catchment,
81 Cambridge, UK. A pilot collection was made on 21st June 2012 (Rowe et al. 2015). Further
82 collections were made on the 2nd May 2013 and 4th August 2014. The effluent of the
83 municipal wastewater treatment plant (WWTP) (latitude: 52.234469, longitude: 0.154614)
84 was collected annually from the treated effluent discharge pipe that enters the River Cam. The
85 effluent of the University of Cambridge dairy farm (latitude: 52.22259, longitude: 0.02603)
86 was collected annually prior to it being applied to the surrounding fields as fertiliser, where it
87 subsequently enters drainage ditches that drain into the River Cam. The river source water of
88 the River Cam was collected at Ashwell Spring (latitude: 52.0421, longitude: 0.1497) once on
89 the 4th August 2014. Samples were collected in 10L sterile polypropylene containers,
90 transported at 4°C to the laboratory and processed within 2 hours.

91 ***Sample filtration, metagenomic DNA extraction and sequencing***

92 Similarly as in Dancer et al. (Dancer et al. 2014), samples were filtered under pressure at
93 approximately 2 bar using a pressure vessel system (10 L SM 1753, Sartorius). Samples were
94 first pre-filtered through 3.0 µm membranes (Millipore) at 2 Bar to remove eukaryotic cells
95 and debris. The filtrate was subsequently filtered through 0.22 µm membranes (Millipore) to
96 capture the prokaryotic cells, metagenomic DNA was then extracted by washing and
97 vortexing the membranes in phosphate buffered saline with Tween20 (2%) before enzymatic
98 lysis (Meta-G-Nome DNA isolation kit; Epicentre). Assessment of DNA quality and
99 concentration was made by TBE agarose (2%) gel electrophoresis and spectrophotometry
100 (Nanodrop ND-1000; ThermoScientific). For each sample, 2 µg of DNA was used to generate
101 Illumina paired-end libraries that were sequenced using an Illumina HiSeq2500. A full
102 description of the metagenomic samples used in this study is available in the supplemental
103 material (Table S1.)

104 ***Bioinformatic analyses***

105 *Identification of ARGs*

106 ARGs were identified using the Search Engine for Antimicrobial Resistance (SEAR) (Rowe
107 et al. 2015). In brief, the pipeline quality checks and filters metagenomic reads, clusters the
108 filtered reads to the ARG-annot (Gupta et al. 2014) database of horizontally acquired ARGs
109 and uses the resulting clusters to map the reads and generate a consensus sequence for each
110 ARG in the query metagenome. Consensus sequences are then aligned to online databases
111 (NCBI genbank, RAC, ARDB), annotated and given an abundance value based on the Reads
112 Per Kilobase per Million (RPKM) value from the read-mapping stage. A full description of
113 SEAR is available in supplemental methods.

114 *Identification of mobile genetic elements*

115 MGEs were identified by mapping metagenomic reads to a custom MGE database using
116 BWA-mem (default options) (Li and Durbin 2009). The MGE database was built from the
117 NCBI Refseq plasmid genomes dataset, combined with the representative sequences
118 generated from clustering the Integrall dataset (Moura et al. 2009) at 97% identity using
119 USEARCH (Edgar 2010). MGE mapping results with less than 90% coverage of the
120 reference sequence were discarded from the analysis. Successfully mapped sequences were
121 then binned into class I and class II integrons, transposons and mobilisable plasmids.

122 *Abundance analysis*

123 The ARG and MGE abundance data was normalised to the number of 16S rRNA sequences
124 as in Bengtsson-Palme et al. (Bengtsson-Palme et al. 2014). In brief, bacterial 16S rRNA
125 sequences were extracted from each metagenome using Metaxa 2.0 (Bengtsson-Palme et al.
126 2015) using default settings and then grafted to sequences from the SILVA RNA database
127 using Megraft (Bengtsson et al. 2012) and subsequently clustered using USEARCH (Edgar
128 2010). ARG abundance values were normalised to 16S sequences by dividing the number of
129 extracted 16S sequences by the length of the 16S gene (Bengtsson-Palme et al. 2014).

130 *Taxonomic profiling and pathogen detection*

131 Taxonomic profiling of metagenomes was carried out by mapping sequencing reads to clade-
132 specific marker genes using the Metaphlan package (Segata et al. 2012) (default parameters).
133 Metaphlan output was then cross-referenced to the PATRIC database of pathogenic bacteria
134 (Gillespie et al. 2011) to annotate potential human-specific bacterial pathogens. Biomarker
135 discovery and identification of differentially abundant features between metagenomes from
136 2012, 2013 and 2014 was performed using LEfSe (Segata et al. 2011). Taxonomic profiling
137 and pathogen data was then combined and presented using the Graphlan package (Segata
138 2014).

139 **Results**

140 *Metagenome analysis*

141 We generated 29.52 Giga base-pairs of data across all samples, with the number of reads
142 produced from the total farm effluent samples being approximately double that produced from
143 the total WWTP effluent samples (Table 1).

144 **Table 1. Summary of the metagenomes generated in the present study.**

Sample	Read pairs	Gbp	Total ARG reads	% ARGs	% 16S
Farm effluent 2012	44337147	4.4337	7715	0.0087	0.1199
Farm effluent 2013	33060321	3.3060	2317	0.0035	0.0396
Farm effluent 2014	92074704	9.2075	13094	0.0071	0.0775
WWTP effluent 2012	28696239	2.8696	4205	0.0073	0.1086
WWTP effluent 2013	32980301	3.2980	250	0.0004	0.0366
WWTP effluent 2014	36636758	3.6637	3767	0.0051	0.0862
River source water 2014	27399641	2.7400	181	0.0003	0.0201

145 *Identification of antimicrobial resistance genes*

146 In the effluent from the dairy farm we found an average of 7709 reads (0.007%) matching
147 ARGs across the three samples. We found an average of 2740 reads (0.004%) matching
148 ARGs across the three WWTP effluent samples. Only 181 reads (0.0003%) were found to
149 match ARGs from the river source water. A significant diversity of ARGs was observed
150 across the samples, with 53 different ARGs found in total, conferring resistance to seven
151 antimicrobial classes (Figure 1, Table S2). There were 18 ARGs common between the farm
152 and the WWTP effluent samples. The river source water contained the lowest diversity of
153 ARGs (five ARGs, conferring resistance to two antimicrobial classes). When normalised to
154 the number of 16S sequences in each sample, the most abundant ARG across all the samples
155 was found to be *sul2* (sulfonamide resistance) in the WWTP effluent 2014 (0.097 copies per

156 16S sequence) and the least abundant ARG was *catB4* (phenicol resistance), found in the farm
157 effluent 2014 (0.0001 copies per 16S sequence). When looking at the effluents individually,
158 tetracycline resistance genes *tetC* (farm effluent 2012) and *tetW* (farm effluent 2013 and
159 2014) were the most abundant genes within the farm effluent samples. In comparison, the
160 aminoglycoside resistance genes *strA/strB* (WWTP effluent 2012) and the sulfonamide
161 resistance genes *sul1/sul2* (WWTP effluent 2013 and 2014) were the most abundant ARGs
162 within the WWTP effluent samples. On average, the abundance of ARGs in the farm effluents
163 was three times that of the river source water. Similarly, the average abundance of ARGs in
164 the WWTP effluents was double that found in the river source water. In terms of the diversity
165 of ARGs relative to the river source water, the farm effluent had an average of five different
166 ARGs for each ARG found in the river source water, whereas the WWTP effluent had
167 different 2 ARGs for each ARG present in the source water.
168 When comparing samples across the three years that the samples were taken, the abundance
169 of ARGs was found to decrease year on year in the WWTP effluent for all but sulfonamide
170 resistance genes, which were found to increase over time (11% average change in abundance
171 of sulfonamide resistance genes over three years). The largest change over time for the farm
172 effluent was the 10% increase in the abundance of aminoglycoside resistance genes observed
173 between 2012-2013.

174 **Figure 1. Abundance of ARGs found in each effluent sample, binned by antimicrobial**
175 **class.**

176 *Abundance of antimicrobial resistance genes is normalised to the number of 16S sequences*
177 *per sample. The MLS class of antimicrobial represents marcolides, lincosamides and*
178 *streptogramins.*

179 ***Identification of mobile genetic elements***

180 In conjunction with determining the abundance and diversity of ARGs, the effluents were also
181 interrogated for MGEs (Figure 2, Table S3). No MGEs were found to be present in the river
182 source water. Mobilisable plasmids were the most abundant class of MGE found out of the
183 combined metagenomic datasets, although no mobilisable plasmids were identified in the
184 WWTP effluent 2012 or farm effluent 2014 samples. Class I and class II integrons, as well as
185 transposon sequences, were found in all effluent samples. Class I integrons were more
186 abundant in the collective farm effluent samples, compared to class II integrons that were
187 more abundant in the collective WWTP effluent samples.

188 **Figure 2. Abundance of MGEs found in each effluent sample, binned by MGE type.**

189 *Plasmids were binned as mobilisation plasmids if they contained conjugation genes (*tra*, *mob**
190 *etc.) and integrons were binned as class I or II depending on the *Integrall* annotation.*
191 *Relative abundance of MGEs is normalised to the number of 16S sequences per sample.*

192 ***Taxonomic profiling and pathogen detection***

193 Finally, the effluent metagenomes were subjected to taxonomic profiling. At genus level, the
194 most abundant prokaryotes in the farm samples were *Pseudomonas* (farm effluent 2012) and
195 *Butyrivibrio* (farm effluent 2013 and 2014). The most abundant prokaryotes at genus level in
196 the WWTP samples were *Acinetobacter* (WWTP effluent 2012), *Thiomonas* (WWTP effluent
197 2013) and *Proteus* (WWTP effluent 2014). For the river source water, the most abundant
198 prokaryotic genus was *Sphingobium*. After cross-referencing the identified species level,
199 clade-specific marker genes for all the metagenomes to the PATRIC pathogen database, a
200 total of 35 species of potential bacterial pathogens were identified (Figure 3, Table S4). The

201 most commonly identified species were *Escherichia coli*, *Arcobacter butzleri*, *Eubacterium*
202 *rectale*, *Ruminococcus bromii* and *Salmonella enterica*. The WWTP effluent 2014 contained
203 the greatest diversity of potential bacterial pathogens, whereas the river source water and the
204 WWTP effluent 2012 were found to contain the lowest diversity.

205 **Figure 3. Metagenomic phylogenetic analysis and annotation of potential bacterial**
206 **pathogens.**

207 *The phylogenetic tree was built using Graphlan from the merged Metaphlan and LEfSe output*
208 *for the effluent metagenomes. The PATRIC pathogens are highlighted as red stars and the*
209 *external rings denote species prevalence in each metagenome.*

210 **Discussion**

211 Through the use of a comparative metagenomic approach, we have shown that two types of
212 effluent entering a shared river catchment contain ARGs and MGEs at higher average
213 abundances than in a background sample of the river source water. This would suggest that
214 effluents such as these are likely to serve as sources of ARGs and thus contribute to the
215 environmental resistome of river catchments and other aquatic environments. It may be
216 appropriate to routinely monitor such effluents as sources of ARGs, particularly when
217 considering the current view of ARGs as environmental contaminants (Pruden et al. 2006)
218 and the call for an environmental framework to tackle antimicrobial resistance (Berendonk et
219 al. 2015).

220 One such reason for the high abundance of ARGs in effluents may be the presence of
221 antimicrobial compounds that could consequently provide a selective pressure for the
222 maintenance of ARGs. There have been several studies that document the presence of
223 antimicrobial compounds, from both human and veterinary medicine, in the environment
224 (Kemper 2008, Hu et al. 2010). Although these compounds are often present at relatively low
225 concentrations, some studies have shown therapeutic concentrations of antimicrobials being
226 discharged into the environment, such as the effluent from Indian drug manufacturers
227 containing therapeutic concentrations of antimicrobial compounds (Larsson et al. 2007).
228 Subsequent studies by Larsson et al. found a high abundance of ARGs downstream of the
229 effluent discharge point relative to upstream of the manufacturers and when compared to a
230 Swedish WWTP (Kristiansson et al. 2011). While the environmental release of antimicrobial
231 compounds at therapeutic concentrations is largely prevented in the UK, Europe and US
232 through proper wastewater management and controls, clinically important antimicrobials can
233 be found in the environment at sub-inhibitory concentrations and it is possible that these very
234 low antimicrobial concentrations could be enriching for resistant bacteria and promote
235 increased persistence of ARGs (Gullberg et al. 2011). Thus, it may be pertinent to couple
236 future environmental ARG monitoring studies and risk assessments with information on
237 antimicrobial usage and the antimicrobial concentrations in the effluents being investigated.

238 Interestingly, the average abundance of ARGs was found to be greater in the farm effluents
239 than in the WWTP effluents (Figure 1). Although these two effluents are from differently
240 treated faecal sources, one being a treated effluent (sedimentation treatment) from a municipal
241 WWTP (i.e. predominantly human faecal source) and the other being an untreated effluent
242 from a farm (predominantly bovine faecal source), this finding does offer some insight into
243 the debate surrounding the relative impact of human and animal contributions to the
244 development of antimicrobial resistance (Phillips et al. 2004, Mather et al. 2013). The fact
245 that WWTP effluent had undergone a form of water treatment prior to being released into the
246 river catchment, whereas the farm effluent did not, may suggest that some form of water
247 treatment could reduce the abundance or diversity of ARGs. A comparison of WWTP crude

248 influent to the effluent could elaborate on the effectiveness of sedimentation treatment on the
249 abundance of ARGs. Studies have shown that wastewater treatment processes do not
250 completely remove ARGs (Wang et al. 2015) and that some WWTP processing can result in
251 an increase in the proportion of antimicrobial resistant bacteria in WWTP effluents (Harris et
252 al. 2012). Considering that effluents may also disseminate antimicrobial compounds, it raises
253 the question as to whether the combination of ARGs and antimicrobial compounds within
254 effluents is resulting in the expression of ARGs and the occurrence of phenotypic
255 antimicrobial resistance. This should be addressed in future studies that aim to assess the risk
256 of ARGs entering the environment.

257 In terms of the mobility of genes within the effluents, an array of mobilisable plasmids,
258 integrons and transposons were present in the metagenomes (Figure 2) and many of the ARGs
259 identified aligned to the Repository of Antibiotic resistance Cassettes (RAC) (Tsafnat et al.
260 2011). This raises the possibility that the ARGs within the effluents could be readily
261 mobilised into other bacteria, including both directly into pathogens also discharged into the
262 environment and environmental bacteria. These environmental bacteria in turn could pose a
263 risk as potential bacterial intermediaries, harbouring these ARGs in the environment prior to
264 transferring them into other pathogens.

265 Based on the observations in this study, it is recommended that future Risk Assessments
266 should incorporate direct MGE and pathogen detection with metagenomic assessments of
267 effluents entering river catchments, especially considering the absence of MGEs and the
268 lower diversity of pathogens found in the river source water. This study also showed that a
269 large amount of variation can occur between samples from the same sampling site, possibly as
270 a result of seasonal variation or other environmental factor related to sample collection. It
271 would be beneficial to future environmental risk assessments if the impact of seasonal
272 variation on ARG abundance could be determined.

273 We did however find five resistance genes in the river source water conferring resistance to
274 two classes of antimicrobials. When normalised to 16S sequences the river source water was
275 found to be accountable for the most abundant phenicol resistance gene and the third most
276 abundant aminoglycoside resistance genes out of all the metagenome libraries examined.
277 However, when using the raw SEAR abundance metric, that does not include normalisation to
278 the 16S sequences within the sample, the relative abundance of ARGs from the river source
279 water are reduced relative to the other effluent samples. This raises the question as to whether
280 16S normalisation is the most appropriate approach to metagenomic abundance estimates as
281 factors such as variation in 16S copy number can skew the data generated as well as
282 interpretation (Case et al. 2007). An alternative could be to use the RPKM value generated as
283 part of the SEAR analysis and featured in table S2.

284 The metagenomic approach used was relatively less sensitive than more direct-targeted
285 measures of known ARG abundance (e.g. qPCR-based detections (LaPara et al. 2011)). The
286 lack of sample replication at each time point also made comparisons between effluents less
287 certain. However the approach had the advantages that it was relatively unbiased and semi-
288 quantitative, giving a good estimation of relative key ARG and MGE abundance and diversity
289 across bacterial populations. It was also potentially able to detect novel ARGs that would
290 otherwise not be found using these more targeted approaches.

291 **Conclusion**

292 We have presented a detailed metagenomic analysis of effluents entering a river catchment.
293 Effluents were found to contain an array of ARGs, MGEs and pathogenic bacteria that, when
294 compared to a background sample of the river source water, were found to be more diverse
295 and abundant than in the river source water. This study has shown that the discharge of

296 effluents into river catchments contributes to the dissemination of ARGs, MGEs and
297 pathogenic bacteria, and may play an important role in the propagation of environmental
298 reservoirs of ARGs.

299 **List of abbreviations**

300	ARG	-	Antimicrobial Resistance Gene
301	MGE	-	Mobile Genetic Element
302	WWTP	-	Wastewater treatment plant
303	SEAR	-	Search Engine for Antimicrobial Resistance
304	RPMK	-	Reads Per Kilobase per Million
305	BWA	-	Burrows-Wheeler Aligner
306	RAC	-	Repository of Antibiotic resistance Cassettes

307 **Acknowledgements**

308 This research was funded by the Centre for Environment, Fisheries and Aquaculture Science,
309 GlaxoSmithKline and the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council.
310 Metagenomic sequencing was performed by the Sequencing Service and Wellcome Trust
311 Biomedical Informatics Hub, Exeter (UK).

312 **References**

- 313 Levy, S.B. and Marshall, B. (2004) Antibacterial resistance worldwide: causes, challenges
314 and responses. *Nature medicine* 10(12 Suppl), S122-129.
- 315 Davies, J. and Davies, D. (2010) Origins and evolution of antibiotic resistance. *Microbiology
316 and molecular biology reviews* : MMBR 74(3), 417-433.
- 317 WHO (2012) The evolving threat of antimicrobial resistance - options for action. WHO (ed),
318 Geneva.
- 319 Gillings, M.R. (2013) Evolutionary consequences of antibiotic use for the resistome,
320 mobilome and microbial pangenome. *Frontiers in Microbiology* 4.
- 321 Laxminarayan, R., Duse, A., Wattal, C., Zaidi, A.K.M., Wertheim, H.F.L., Sumpradit, N.,
322 Vlieghe, E., Hara, G.L., Gould, I.M., Goossens, H., Greko, C., So, A.D., Bigdeli, M.,
323 Tomson, G., Woodhouse, W., Ombaka, E., Peralta, A.Q., Qamar, F.N., Mir, F., Kariuki, S.,
324 Bhutta, Z.A., Coates, A., Bergstrom, R., Wright, G.D., Brown, E.D. and Cars, O. (2013)
325 Antibiotic resistance—the need for global solutions. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases* 13(12),
326 1057-1098.
- 327 D'Costa, V.M., McGrann, K.M., Hughes, D.W. and Wright, G.D. (2006) Sampling the
328 antibiotic resistome. *Science* 311(5759), 374-377.
- 329 Wright, G.D. (2007) The antibiotic resistome: the nexus of chemical and genetic diversity.
330 *Nature reviews. Microbiology* 5(3), 175-186.
- 331 Linares, J.F., Gustafsson, I., Baquero, F. and Martinez, J.L. (2006) Antibiotics as
332 intermicrobial signaling agents instead of weapons. *Proceedings of the National Academy of
333 Sciences of the United States of America* 103(51), 19484-19489.
- 334 Dantas, G., Sommer, M.O., Oluwasegun, R.D. and Church, G.M. (2008) Bacteria subsisting
335 on antibiotics. *Science* 320(5872), 100-103.
- 336 Forsberg, K.J., Reyes, A., Wang, B., Selleck, E.M., Sommer, M.O.A. and Dantas, G. (2012)
337 The shared antibiotic resistome of soil bacteria and human pathogens. *Science* 337(6098),
338 1107-1111.

339 Wellington, E.M.H., Boxall, A.B.A., Cross, P., Feil, E.J., Gaze, W.H., Hawkey, P.M.,
340 Johnson-Rollings, A.S., Jones, D.L., Lee, N.M., Otten, W., Thomas, C.M. and Williams, A.P.
341 (2013) The role of the natural environment in the emergence of antibiotic resistance in Gram-
342 negative bacteria. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases* 13(2), 155-165.

343 William, H.G., Stephen, M.K., Larsson, D.G.J., Xian-Zhi, L., Joseph, A.R., Pascal, S.,
344 Kornelia, S., Mohammed, T., Ed, T., Elizabeth, M.W., Gerard, D.W. and Yong-Guan, Z.
345 (2013) Influence of Humans on Evolution and Mobilization of Environmental Antibiotic
346 Resistome. *Emerging Infectious Disease journal* 19(7).

347 Chen, B., Yang, Y., Liang, X., Yu, K., Zhang, T. and Li, X. (2013) Metagenomic profiles of
348 antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) between human impacted estuary and deep ocean
349 sediments. *Environmental science & technology* 47(22), 12753-12760.

350 Lu, Z., Na, G., Gao, H., Wang, L., Bao, C. and Yao, Z. (2015) Fate of sulfonamide resistance
351 genes in estuary environment and effect of anthropogenic activities. *Sci Total Environ* 527-
352 528C, 429-438.

353 Devarajan, N., Laffite, A., Graham, N.D., Meijer, M., Prabakar, K., Mubedi, J.I., Elongo, V.,
354 Mpiana, P.T., Ibelings, B.W., Wildi, W. and Pote, J. (2015) Accumulation of clinically
355 relevant antibiotic-resistance genes, bacterial load, and metals in freshwater lake sediments in
356 central europe. *Environmental science & technology* 49(11), 6528-6537.

357 Bengtsson-Palme, J., Boulund, F., Fick, J., Kristiansson, E. and Larsson, J. (2014) Shotgun
358 metagenomics reveals a wide array of antibiotic resistance genes and mobile elements in a
359 polluted lake in India. *Frontiers in Microbiology* 5.

360 Li, J., Cheng, W., Xu, L., Strong, P.J. and Chen, H. (2015) Antibiotic-resistant genes and
361 antibiotic-resistant bacteria in the effluent of urban residential areas, hospitals, and a
362 municipal wastewater treatment plant system. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*
363 22(6), 4587-4596.

364 Li, J., Wang, T., Shao, B., Shen, J., Wang, S. and Wu, Y. (2012) Plasmid-mediated quinolone
365 resistance genes and antibiotic residues in wastewater and soil adjacent to swine feedlots:
366 potential transfer to agricultural lands. *Environmental health perspectives* 120(8), 1144-1149.

367 Pruden, A., Pei, R., Storteboom, H. and Carlson, K.H. (2006) Antibiotic resistance genes as
368 emerging contaminants: Studies in northern Colorado. *Environmental Science and*
369 *Technology* 40(23), 7445-7450.

370 Zhang, X.X., Zhang, T. and Fang, H.H. (2009) Antibiotic resistance genes in water
371 environment. *Applied microbiology and biotechnology* 82(3), 397-414.

372 Berendonk, T.U., Manaia, C.M., Merlin, C., Fatta-Kassinos, D., Cytryn, E., Walsh, F.,
373 Burgmann, H., Sorum, H., Norstrom, M., Pons, M.-N., Kreuzinger, N., Huovinen, P., Stefani,
374 S., Schwartz, T., Kisand, V., Baquero, F. and Martinez, J.L. (2015) Tackling antibiotic
375 resistance: the environmental framework. *Nat Rev Micro advance online publication*.

376 Tao, R., Ying, G.G., Su, H.C., Zhou, H.W. and Sidhu, J.P. (2010) Detection of antibiotic
377 resistance and tetracycline resistance genes in Enterobacteriaceae isolated from the Pearl
378 rivers in South China. *Environmental pollution* 158(6), 2101-2109.

379 Zhang, X.X. and Zhang, T. (2011) Occurrence, abundance, and diversity of tetracycline
380 resistance genes in 15 sewage treatment plants across China and other global locations.
381 *Environmental science & technology* 45(7), 2598-2604.

382 Port, J.A., Cullen, A.C., Wallace, J.C., Smith, M.N. and Faustman, E.M. (2014) Metagenomic
383 Frameworks for Monitoring Antibiotic Resistance in Aquatic Environments. *Environmental*
384 *health perspectives* 122(3), 222-228.

385 Rowe, W., Baker, K.S., Verner-Jeffreys, D., Baker-Austin, C., Ryan, J.J., Maskell, D. and
386 Pearce, G. (2015) Search Engine for Antimicrobial Resistance: A Cloud Compatible Pipeline
387 and Web Interface for Rapidly Detecting Antimicrobial Resistance Genes Directly from
388 Sequence Data. *PloS one* 10(7), e0133492.

389 Dancer, D., Baker-Austin, C., Lowther, J.A., Hartnell, R.E., Lees, D.N. and Roberts, L.O.
390 (2014) Development and Integration of Quantitative Real-Time PCR Methods for Detection
391 of Mitochondrial DNA and *Methanobrevibacter smithii* nifH Gene as Novel Microbial Source
392 Tracking Tools. *Environmental Forensics* 15(3), 256-264.

393 Gupta, S.K., Padmanabhan, B.R., Diene, S.M., Lopez-Rojas, R., Kempf, M., Landraud, L.
394 and Rolain, J.-M. (2014) ARG-ANNOT, a New Bioinformatic Tool To Discover Antibiotic
395 Resistance Genes in Bacterial Genomes. *Antimicrobial agents and chemotherapy* 58(1), 212-
396 220.

397 Li, H. and Durbin, R. (2009) Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler
398 transform. *Bioinformatics* 25(14), 1754-1760.

399 Moura, A., Soares, M., Pereira, C., Leitao, N., Henriques, I. and Correia, A.n. (2009)
400 INTEGRALL: a database and search engine for integrons, integrases and gene cassettes.
401 *Bioinformatics* 25(8), 1096-1098.

402 Edgar, R.C. (2010) Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster than BLAST.
403 *Bioinformatics* 26(19), 2460-2461.

404 Bengtsson-Palme, J., Hartmann, M., Eriksson, K.M., Pal, C., Thorell, K., Larsson, D.G. and
405 Nilsson, R.H. (2015) metaxa2: improved identification and taxonomic classification of small
406 and large subunit rRNA in metagenomic data. *Mol Ecol Resour.*

407 Bengtsson, J., Hartmann, M., Unterseher, M., Vaishampayan, P., Abarenkov, K., Durso, L.,
408 Bik, E.M., Garey, J.R., Eriksson, K.M. and Nilsson, R.H. (2012) Megraft: a software package
409 to graft ribosomal small subunit (16S/18S) fragments onto full-length sequences for accurate
410 species richness and sequencing depth analysis in pyrosequencing-length metagenomes and
411 similar environmental datasets. *Research in microbiology* 163(6-7), 407-412.

412 Segata, N., Waldron, L., Ballarini, A., Narasimhan, V., Jousson, O. and Huttenhower, C.
413 (2012) Metagenomic microbial community profiling using unique clade-specific marker
414 genes. *Nat Meth* 9(8), 811-814.

415 Gillespie, J.J., Wattam, A.R., Cammer, S.A., Gabbard, J.L., Shukla, M.P., Dalay, O., Driscoll,
416 T., Hix, D., Mane, S.P., Mao, C., Nordberg, E.K., Scott, M., Schulman, J.R., Snyder, E.E.,
417 Sullivan, D.E., Wang, C., Warren, A., Williams, K.P., Xue, T., Seung Yoo, H., Zhang, C.,
418 Zhang, Y., Will, R., Kenyon, R.W. and Sobral, B.W. (2011) PATRIC: the Comprehensive
419 Bacterial Bioinformatics Resource with a Focus on Human Pathogenic Species. *Infection and*
420 *Immunity* 79(11), 4286-4298.

421 Segata, N., Izard, J., Waldron, L., Gevers, D., Miropolsky, L., Garrett, W. and Huttenhower,
422 C. (2011) Metagenomic biomarker discovery and explanation. *Genome biology* 12(6), R60.

423 Segata, N. (2014) GraPhlAn, <https://bitbucket.org/nsegata/graphlan/wiki/Home>.

424 Kemper, N. (2008) Veterinary antibiotics in the aquatic and terrestrial environment.
425 *Ecological Indicators* 8(1), 1-13.

426 Hu, X., Zhou, Q. and Luo, Y. (2010) Occurrence and source analysis of typical veterinary
427 antibiotics in manure, soil, vegetables and groundwater from organic vegetable bases,
428 northern China. *Environmental pollution* 158(9), 2992-2998.

429 Larsson, D.G., de Pedro, C. and Paxeus, N. (2007) Effluent from drug manufactures contains
430 extremely high levels of pharmaceuticals. *J Hazard Mater* 148(3), 751-755.

431 Kristiansson, E., Fick, J., Janzon, A., Grabic, R., Rutgersson, C., Weijdegård, B., Söderström,
432 H. and Larsson, D.G.J. (2011) Pyrosequencing of Antibiotic-Contaminated River Sediments
433 Reveals High Levels of Resistance and Gene Transfer Elements. *PloS one* 6(2), e17038.

434 Gullberg, E., Cao, S., Berg, O.G., Ilbäck, C., Sandegren, L., Hughes, D. and Andersson, D.I.
435 (2011) Selection of resistant bacteria at very low antibiotic concentrations. *PLoS Pathog* 7(7),
436 e1002158.

437 Phillips, I., Casewell, M., Cox, T., De Groot, B., Friis, C., Jones, R., Nightingale, C., Preston,
438 R. and Waddell, J. (2004) Does the use of antibiotics in food animals pose a risk to human

439 health? A critical review of published data. *The Journal of antimicrobial chemotherapy* 53(1),
440 28-52.

441 Mather, A.E., Reid, S.W.J., Maskell, D.J., Parkhill, J., Fookes, M.C., Harris, S.R., Brown,
442 D.J., Coia, J.E., Mulvey, M.R., Gilmour, M.W., Petrovska, L., de Pinna, E., Kuroda, M.,
443 Akiba, M., Izumiya, H., Connor, T.R., Suchard, M.A., Lemey, P., Mellor, D.J., Haydon, D.T.
444 and Thomson, N.R. (2013) Distinguishable Epidemics of Multidrug-Resistant *Salmonella*
445 *Typhimurium* DT104 in Different Hosts. *Science* 341(6153), 1514-1517.

446 Wang, J., Mao, D., Mu, Q. and Luo, Y. (2015) Fate and proliferation of typical antibiotic
447 resistance genes in five full-scale pharmaceutical wastewater treatment plants. *Sci Total*
448 *Environ* 526, 366-373.

449 Harris, S., Cormican, M. and Cummins, E. (2012) The effect of conventional wastewater
450 treatment on the levels of antimicrobial-resistant bacteria in effluent: a meta-analysis of
451 current studies. *Environmental geochemistry and health* 34(6), 749-762.

452 Tsafnat, G., Coptly, J. and Partridge, S.R. (2011) RAC: Repository of Antibiotic resistance
453 Cassettes. Database 2011.

454 Case, R.J., Boucher, Y., Dahllöf, I., Holmström, C., Doolittle, W.F. and Kjelleberg, S. (2007)
455 Use of 16S rRNA and rpoB Genes as Molecular Markers for Microbial Ecology Studies.
456 *Applied and environmental microbiology* 73(1), 278-288.

457 LaPara, T.M., Burch, T.R., McNamara, P.J., Tan, D.T., Yan, M. and Eichmiller, J.J. (2011)
458 Tertiary-Treated Municipal Wastewater is a Significant Point Source of Antibiotic Resistance
459 Genes into Duluth-Superior Harbor. *Environmental science & technology* 45(22), 9543-9549.

460