

Harrisburg University of Science and Technology

Digital Commons at Harrisburg University

Dissertations and Theses


Healthcare Informatics, Graduate (HCMS)

Spring 2020

Physical Therapy with Adjunct Therapies in Patients with Chronic Pain and Disability Post-Motor Vehicle Accidents

Lakshmi Subramanian

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.harrisburgu.edu/hcms_dandt

 Part of the [Analytical, Diagnostic and Therapeutic Techniques and Equipment Commons](#), [Health Information Technology Commons](#), and the [Rehabilitation and Therapy Commons](#)

Physical Therapy with Adjunct Therapies in Patients with Chronic Pain and Disability Post-Motor Vehicle Accidents

Lakshmi Subramanian

Harrisburg University of Science and Technology

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the

Masters Degree in Healthcare Informatics

HCIN 699 Professor Glenn Mitchell

April 17, 2020

Abstract

This project is a thorough literature review of studies concerning physical therapy interventions in conjunction with adjunct treatments for patients post-motor vehicle accidents focused on the therapy's efficacy as related to functional outcome measures. Physical therapy is frequently treatment of choice for patients after minor motor vehicle accidents. However, most patients seek concomitant therapies like acupuncture, chiropractic, epidural steroid injection, and psychological counselling. This paper seeks to gather data on the efficacy of different treatment modalities when used in conjunction with each other. Often patients are traumatised or develop anxiety about driving requiring counselling and therapy. The vast majority of patients subsequently develop chronic pain that is lifelong, and often debilitating with significant economic and psychosocial costs.

Introduction

Motor Vehicle Accidents are ranked by World Health Organisation as the second leading cause for death in young people with 1.2 million casualties worldwide every year. Additionally, an estimated 50 million people are injured in motor vehicle accidents annually. Long term care for these people who are injured in traffic accidents is often lacking and underfunded. Many symptoms in these patients show up only at a later stage and are not well researched. Current guidelines include treating physical and psychological symptoms to improve functional outcomes and quality of life. The standard practice includes physical therapy, however multidisciplinary treatment programs including counselling, therapy for PTSD, and alternative medicine are not well known. Research shows better outcomes for patients referred to adjunct care in addition to physical therapy as part of an interdisciplinary program than physical therapy alone. Patients may benefit from physical therapy in conjunction with psychological and chiropractic care in terms of functional outcomes and independence, quality of life, and satisfaction. The purpose of this paper is to review the literature for treatment modalities commonly prescribed for patients after a motor vehicle accident and their efficacy in various combinations.

Search strategy and selection criteria:

Searches were conducted in PubMed, EMBASE, PEDro, CINAHL, Cochrane using the following search terms – “motor vehicle accidents” and “road traffic accident” in combination with “physical therapy”, “rehabilitative therapy”, “acupuncture”, “counselling”, “massage therapy”, “behavioural therapy” using appropriate MESH terms.

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

Inclusion criteria:

1. Randomized controlled trials, cohort studies, or systematic reviews
2. All subjects were patients who sustained motor vehicle accidents
3. Outcome measures were clearly defined
4. All clinical trials included treatment with physical therapy combined with one or more adjunct therapies

Exclusion Criteria

1. Case reports
2. Patients population not specified
3. Data not available in sufficient detail

Literature Review:

Traffic casualties have a high cost, both in terms of human life, and socioeconomic and cultural consequences. A study of one thousand acute trauma victims presenting to an emergency department of a hospital in Iran, the direct costs (prehospital, hospital, physiotherapy, rehabilitation, out-patient visits, surgical interventions) and indirect costs (loss of productivity) together were estimated to be 2.19% of the Gross Domestic Product annually. Of great concern was that the mean age of disability was found to be 43 years (Rahmati, 2019) since more years of productive life will be affected. This financial burden is likely to be significantly higher in countries with poor healthcare infrastructure, systemic inequalities in access to healthcare, and widespread car culture.

Indicators Pre-Motor Vehicle Accident

It has been found that at-fault drivers in light motor vehicle crashes were known to have mental health problems, including depression and suicidal ideation, that could possibly increase risk taking behaviour that consequently lead to accidents (Sassi, 2018). Another study in Brazil indicated similar findings towards a link between mental health and risk behaviours assumed by people involved in motorcycle accidents (Coêlho, 2019) and frequently increased by alcohol consumption (Santos, 2019). These at-risk behaviours are often worsened after the accident, compounded by trauma and chronic pain. Additionally, the use of anti-depressants has been known to affect motor coordination along with alertness, cognition, and memory (Khong, 2012). Conversely the use of ADHD medication showed strongly protective effect in reducing risks of motor vehicle accidents (Boland, 2020).

There is evidence to suggest that motor vehicle accidents are more common in lower income areas as evidenced by spatial analysis of traffic accidents. A study conducted in Pennsylvania found an association between the probability of being injured in a motor vehicle accident and the socioeconomic status of the person injured in the accident (Aguero-Valverde, 2006) showing that households with lower median income could be linked with higher probability of motor vehicle accidents. These findings were affirmed by a similar study in Switzerland that found poorer people are at higher risk of suffering motor vehicle accidents (Nyffeler, 2017).

Indicators in Post-Motor Vehicle Accidents

Researchers in Taiwan found that the majority of people involved in a motor vehicle accident (68%) reported only minor injuries, with only 22% requiring hospital stays. Yet an

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

overwhelming 97.4% of the respondents experienced a loss of ability to work temporarily and 2.6% were permanently unable to return to work (Jou, 2014). A large study assessing 1500 people for trauma related symptoms after a motor vehicle accident found several key trauma-related features including intrusive recollections, situational avoidance, emotional reactivity, cognitive avoidance, and hyperarousal with exaggerated startle (Kazantzis, 2012). There is also research showing that women develop more severe PTSD symptoms than men across age groups, with middle-aged women worst affected, often associated with prior trauma exposure, lack of social support and differences in income (Kobayashi, 2018). A study looking at back pain from over 1.2 billion visits over a period of 2 years, found that about 70% of the patients visiting for back problems were in the 25-64 age group (Cypress, 1983).

It is estimated that up to 28% of the adult population in the USA, about 56 million people, live with chronic pain (Brennan, 2007) and millions more do so worldwide. From an analysis of the National Trauma Databank, a study assessing the prevalence of post-traumatic limb amputation found motor vehicle collisions to be the most common mechanism of injury, followed by machinery accidents (Barmparas et al, 2010). Not all amputees experience persistent pain however, and not everyone with acute pain develops chronic pain. Persistent Post-Traumatic Pain (PTP) and Persistent Post-Surgical Pain (PPP) are new terms that have evolved as a model for the transition from acute to chronic pain in individuals after trauma such as a motor vehicle accident and military trauma (McGreevey, 2011). While estimates of the prevalence of chronic pain vary, a study showed that about one third of amputees showed symptoms of depression, and more commonly in amputees with pain. Depression was also a key predictor of the severity of pain reported, as well as chronic pain in the subjects surveyed (Ephraim et al, 2005).

Treatment

These patients would most likely benefit from psychological therapy as an adjunct to physical therapy to recover. For patients with chronic pain and disability, both mental and physical, following a motor vehicle accident, a biopsychosocial approach may prove to be the most effective (Martinez, 2017). Specifically, Progressive Goal Attainment Programs and Cognitive Behavioural Physical Therapy are standardised programs with promising results with long lasting impact.

Another controlled cross-sectional study from Brazil found that patients often had low self-esteem and poor quality of life after a motor vehicle accident (Filho, 2016). A person-centred approach to physical therapy that humanised patients and prioritised their daily needs was found to be more effective than a disease-centred approach that focused on purely physical symptoms.

Pre-treatment motivation and readiness to self-manage pain and cognitive behavioural adaptation were found to be good predictors of treatment completion, functional outcomes, and return to work in patients after motor vehicle accidents (Tkachuk, 2012). Multidisciplinary functional rehabilitation programs were found to be most effective treatment for long term outcomes in patients who showed willingness to adopt active self-management techniques for symptoms.

A clinical trial in 109 adults found substantial rates of Major Depressive Disorder (MDD) and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) in people injured in motor vehicle accidents in Sydney (Guest et al. 2018). In another preliminary randomised controlled study by the same group of researchers, Cognitive Behavioural Therapy (CBT) with telephone support significantly reduced psychological distress in people with depression after a motor vehicle accident (Guest et al. 2018) showing the need for positive intervention.

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

A combination of chiropractic techniques and epidural steroid injections was found to be effective in pain management for patients following a motor vehicle accident (Qian, 2018). In the study conducted by Qian patients received procedures at either cervical, lumbar, or both regions and reported a clinically significant difference in pain and function. There is however a lack of meta analyses in this subject area due to studies with small sample size in the literature, indicating need for further study with larger subject numbers.

After a traumatic experience like a motor vehicle accident, coping mechanisms adopted by the patients can determine functional recovery in patients. A study reviewed pre and post treatment measures of physical performance and quality of life self-reported measures at a multidisciplinary functional restoration program found improvements when patients adopted active coping methods instead of passive approaches (Hall, 2011). In addition to coping mechanisms, social support was found to a successful and necessary resource for people after motor vehicle accidents, with appraisal support being more beneficial than tangible support and belonging support for this particular population (Gabert-Quillen, 2012).

Conclusion

From this review of the literature, it is apparent that a holistic interdisciplinary approach including different specialities like physical therapy, chiropractic, and psychology can be most effective in recovery after a motor vehicle accident. While patients show improvement with each intervention separately, positive changes are most significant when integrated to provide synergistic, holistic treatment. However, many of the intervention studies conducted are preliminary studies with small sample sizes and cannot be easily generalized for a larger population. Additionally, socioeconomic and cultural aspects play a significant role in recovery and rehabilitation and will have to be considered specifically for each patient population. As the incidence of motor vehicle accidents keep rising, there will be increased

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

need for services to plan and manage care for victims of traffic accidents. Further research, perhaps from multi-institutional studies, will enable the formulation of an integrated multidisciplinary program for long term rehabilitation and disability management post motor vehicle accident.

References

- Aguero-Valverde, J., & Jovanis, P. P. (2006). Spatial analysis of fatal and injury crashes in Pennsylvania. *Accident Analysis & Prevention, 38*(3), 618-625.
doi:10.1016/j.aap.2005.12.006
- Barmparas, G., Inaba, K., Teixeira, P. G. R., Dubose, J. J., Criscuoli, M., Talving, P., Plurad, D., Green, D., & Demetriades, D. (2010). Epidemiology of Post-Traumatic Limb Amputation: A National Trauma Databank Analysis. *The American Surgeon, 11*, 1214.
- Boland, H., Disalvo, M., Fried, R., Woodworth, K. Y., Wilens, T., Faraone, S. V., & Biederman, J. (2020). A literature review and meta-analysis on the effects of ADHD medications on functional outcomes. *Journal of Psychiatric Research, 123*, 21-30.
doi:10.1016/j.jpsychires.2020.01.006
- Brennan, F., Carr, D. B., & Cousins, M. (2007). Pain Management: A Fundamental Human Right. *Anesthesia & Analgesia, 105*(1), 205-221. doi:10.1213/01.ane.0000268145.52345.55
- Coêlho, V. M., Santos, W. J., Santos, G. B., Albanita Gomes Da Costa De Ceballos, & Oliveira, B. D. (2019). Common mental disorders and risk behaviours in motorcyclists victims of traffic-accidents. *Revista Portuguesa De Enfermagem De Saúde Mental, (22)*.
doi:10.19131/rpesm.0260
- Cypress B. K. (1983). Characteristics of physician visits for back symptoms: a national perspective. *American journal of public health, 73*(4), 389–395.
<https://doi.org/10.2105/ajph.73.4.389>
- Ephraim, P. L., Wegener, S. T., Mackenzie, E. J., Dillingham, T. R., & Pezzin, L. E. (2005). Phantom Pain, Residual Limb Pain, and Back Pain in Amputees: Results of a National

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

Survey. *Archives of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation*, 86(10), 1910-1919.

doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2005.03.031

Guest, R., Tran, Y., Gopinath, B., Cameron, I. D., & Craig, A. (2018). Psychological distress following a motor vehicle crash: preliminary results of a randomised controlled trial investigating brief psychological interventions. *Trials*, 19(1). doi: 10.1186/s13063-018-2716-2

Guest, R., Tran, Y., Gopinath, B., Cameron, I. D., & Craig, A. (2018). Prevalence and psychometric screening for the detection of major depressive disorder and post-traumatic stress disorder in adults injured in a motor vehicle crash who are engaged in compensation. *BMC Psychology*, 6(1). doi: 10.1186/s40359-018-0216-5

Gabert-Quillen, C. A., Irish, L. A., Sledjeski, E., Fallon, W., Spoonster, E., & Delahanty, D. L. (2012). The impact of social support on the relationship between trauma history and posttraumatic stress disorder symptoms in motor vehicle accident victims. *International Journal of Stress Management*, 19(1), 69–79. doi: 10.1037/a0026488

Hall, P. A., Marshall, J., Mercado, A., & Tkachuk, G. (2011). Changes in coping style and treatment outcome following motor vehicle accident. *Rehabilitation Psychology*, 56(1), 43–51. doi: 10.1037/a0022443

Jou, R. (2014). The amount of consolation compensation in road traffic accidents. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, 67, 21-29. doi:10.1016/j.aap.2014.02.003

Kazantzis, N., Kennedy-Moffat, J., Flett, R. A., Petrik, A. M., Long, N. R., & Castell, B. (2012). Predictors of Chronic Trauma-Related Symptoms in a Community Sample of New Zealand Motor Vehicle Accident Survivors. *Culture, Medicine, and Psychiatry*, 36(3), 442–464. doi: 10.1007/s11013-012-9265-z

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

- Khong, T. P., de Vries, F., Goldenberg, J. S., Klungel, O. H., Robinson, N. J., Ibáñez, L., & Petri, H. (2012). Potential impact of benzodiazepine use on the rate of hip fractures in five large European countries and the United States. *Calcified tissue international*, *91*(1), 24–31. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00223-012-9603-8>
- Kobayashi, I., Sledjeski, E. M., & Delahanty, D. L. (2019). Gender and age interact to predict the development of posttraumatic stress disorder symptoms following a motor vehicle accident. *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy*, *11*(3), 328–336. doi: 10.1037/tra0000366
- Martinez, Guillermo G.. "Physical Therapy versus Interdisciplinary Care in Patients with Low Back Pain and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms from Motor Vehicle Accidents." (2017). <http://digitalrepository.unm.edu/dpt/127>
- McGreevy, K., Bottros, M. M., & Raja, S. N. (2011). Preventing Chronic Pain following Acute Pain: Risk Factors, Preventive Strategies, and their Efficacy. *European journal of pain supplements*, *5*(2), 365–372. doi:10.1016/j.eujps.2011.08.013
- Nyffeler, C. (2017). Spatial analysis showing that deprived people are more subjected to road-traffic accidents: Case study in the Municipality of Vernier . *Authorea*. doi:10.22541/au.151173685.50941386
- Qian, Guo. (2018). Effectiveness of Cervical and Lumbosacral Epidural Steroid Injections (ESI) in Motor Vehicle Accident (MVA) Patients. <http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3451270>
- Rahmati, F., Doosti, M., & Bahreini, M. (2018). The Cost Analysis of Patients with Traffic Traumatic Injuries Presenting to Emergency Department; a Cross-sectional Study. *Advanced journal of emergency medicine*, *3*(1), e2. doi:10.22114/AJEM.v0i0.108

PT WITH ADJUNCT THERAPIES POST MVA

- Santos, W. J. D., Coêlho, V. M. D. S., Bonfim, C. V. D., & Albanita Gomes Da Costa De Ceballos. (2019). Alcohol and risky behavior in traffic among motorcyclists involved in accidents in a city in northeastern Brazil. *Traffic Injury Prevention, 20*(3), 233–237. doi: 10.1080/15389588.2019.1579318
- Sassi, S., Hakko, H., Rätty, E., & Riipinen, P. (2018). Light motor vehicle collisions with heavy vehicles — Psychosocial and health related risk factors of drivers being at-fault for collisions. *Forensic Science International, 291*, 245–252. doi: 0.1016/j.forsciint.2018.08.037
- Tkachuk, G. A., Marshall, J. K., Mercado, A. C., Mcmurtry, B., & Stockdale-Winder, F. (2011). Readiness for Change Predicts Outcomes of Functional Rehabilitation Following Motor Vehicle Accident. *Journal of Occupational Rehabilitation, 22*(1), 97–104. doi: 10.1007/s10926-011-9324-2
- Katzman, M. A., Bleau, P., Blier, P., Chokka, P., Kjernisted, K., Van Ameringen, M., ... Walker, J. R. (2014). Canadian clinical practice guidelines for the management of anxiety, posttraumatic stress and obsessive-compulsive disorders. *BMC psychiatry, 14 Suppl 1*(Suppl 1), S1. doi:10.1186/1471-244X-14-S1-S1