

MANUEL HOLOBOLOS' LETTER OF CONSOLATION TO THEODORA RAOULAINA

SOFIA KOTZABASSI

Codex *Hierosolymitanus Sancti Sepulchri* (*Panagiou Taphou*) 276 (H), most of it written by Patriarch Dositheos of Jerusalem (1641-1707), contains many Byzantine and post-Byzantine texts and documents, principally letters.¹ Among these, on ff. 148-151, is a letter of consolation addressed to Theodora Raoulaina on the death of her husband.² The letter is not known from other manuscripts and neither the name of her deceased spouse nor the name of her correspondent are mentioned in its title: the former is referred to as the “most noble *protovestiaros*” (εὐγενέστατος πρωτοβεστιάριος) and the latter as “most wise rhetor” (σοφώτατος ῥήτωρ).

Treu justifiably identified the author of the letter with Manuel Holobolos, who had held the title ῥήτωρ τῶν ῥητόρων since 1265.³ This identification meant that the deceased must have been Raoulaina's second husband, the *protovestiaros* John

I would like to express my gratitude to my colleagues G. M. Parassoglou, I. Polemis and I. Vassis for their valuable suggestions.

- 1 A. ΠΑΠΑΔΟΠΟΥΛΟΣ-ΚΕΡΑΜΕΥΣ, Ἱεροσολυμιτικὴ Βιβλιοθήκη, ἤτοι Κατάλογος τῶν ἐν ταῖς βιβλιοθήκαις τοῦ ἀγιωτάτου ἀποστολικοῦ τε καὶ καθολικοῦ ὀρθοδόξου πατριαρχικοῦ θρόνου τῶν Ἱεροσολύμων καὶ πάσης Παλαιστίνης ἀποκειμένων ἐλληνικῶν κωδίκων, 1. Sankt-Petersburg 1891 (repr. Bruxelles 1963) 333-353 (here p. 345).
- 2 See E. TRAPP u.a., *Prosopographisches Lexikon der Palaiologenzeit*, I-XII. Wien 1976-1996, Nr. 10942; see also S. ΚΟΤΖΑΒΑΣΣΙ, Scholarly Friendship in the Thirteenth Century: Patriarch Gregorios II Kyprios and Theodora Roulaina. *Parekbolai* 1 (2011) 115-170; A. RIEHLE, Καί σε προστάτιν ἐν αὐτοῖς τῆς αὐτῶν ἐπιγράφομεν σωτηρίας. Theodora Raulaina als Stifterin und Patronin, in L. THEIS – M. MULLETT – M. GRÜNBART (eds.), *Female Founders in Byzantium and Beyond*. Wien 2013, 299-315, and N. ZORZI, Una copista, due copistim nessuna copista? Teodora Raulena e i due codici attribuiti alla sua mano. *Medioevo greco* 19 (2019) 259-282 (here 259-261). The letter is the first letter of consolation that Theodora Raoulaina received; the second, on the death of her mother, Irene Eulogia Palaiologina, would be written to her ten years later, in 1284, by Patriarch Gregory II Kyprios.
- 3 See M. TREU, Manuel Holobolos. *BZ* 5 (1896) 538-559 (here p. 552). For Manuel Holobolos see *PLP* 21047. The letter is also mentioned by RIEHLE (see note 2), p. 311 and n. 61.

Raoul,⁴ since her first husband, the *protovestiaros* George Mouzalon, had been murdered in 1258,⁵ at which time Holobolos had most probably not yet entered upon his career as a rhetorician and did not have the title of rhetor.

That the letter refers to John Raoul is further supported by the fact that there is no mention of a violent death, and also that the widowed Raoulaina is described as a “most learned soul” (φιλολογωτάτη ψυχή), a phrase that could not have been used of her in 1258, when she was about 17 years old. This means that the letter must have been written in or about 1274, the year of John Raoul’s death, while both Holobolos and Theodora Raoulaina were still in Constantinople, for later their opposition to the ecclesiastical policy of the Emperor Michael VIII Palaiologos caused them both to be exiled, in Theodora Raoulaina’s case with her mother, Irene-Eulogia Palaiologina, to the fortress of St Gregory, near Nicomedia.⁶

The letter has the usual three-part structure: prooemion (ll. 4-12), the main section (ll. 13-80), and epilog (ll. 81-91).

The prooimion begins with the words δάκρυσι καὶ οὐ μέλανι τὴνδέ σοι τὴν ἐπιστολὴν ἀνεχάραξα (“with tears and not with ink did I indite this letter”), a phrase familiar from other sources⁷ with which the writer declares that he shares in the grieving for the loss of the deceased, and continues with the salutation to the recipient of the letter. The salutation is indirect: that is, the person to whom the letter is written is not directly named. Holobolos addresses the widow with two pairs of adjectives which accompany the words ψυχή and γέννημα: τρισευγενεστάτη καὶ φιλολογωτάτη ψυχή, and φιλαρέτου καὶ φιλοθέου μητρὸς γέν-

4 Ἰωάννης Κομνηνὸς Δούκας Ἄγγελος Πετραλίφης Ραούλ; on him see *PLP* 24125. John Raoul succeeded Theodora’s first husband, George Mouzalon, to the office of *protovestiaros*. For their wedding see GEORGIOS PACHYMERES, *Συγγραφικαὶ ἱστορίαι* II 13, ed. A. FAILLER, Georges Pachymeres, *Relations historiques*, I (*CFHB*, 24). Paris 1984, 153.21-155.5.

5 For the murder of George Mouzalon see M. AVGERINOU-TZIOGA, *The Murder of the Mouzalon Brothers in Byzantine Historiography*, in S. KOTZABASSI – G. MAVROMATIS (eds.), *Realia Byzantina (Byzantinisches Archiv)*, 22. Berlin – New York 2009, 13-16.

6 See GEORGIOS PACHYMERES VII, 2 (= FAILLER, III, 23.23-25, as in note 4): ὅτι ἡ μὲν (sc. Εὐλογία Παλαιολογίνα) εἰς τὸ τοῦ Ἁγίου Γρηγορίου φρούριον συνάμα παιδί τῆ τοῦ Ῥαοῦλ γυναικὶ ἐξωρίζετο.

7 See *apparatus fontium* and additionally Nicolaus I Mysticus, *Epist.* 5.2 JENKINS–WESTERINK (μὴ νόμιζε μέλανι, ἀλλὰ τοῖς ἡμῶν δάκρυσι γεγράφθαι), Mich. Psellus, *Poema* 87.6 WESTERINK (δάκρυσιν, οὐ μέλανι, ταῦτ’ ἐγεγράφειν), Mich. Psellus, *Orationes funebres*, or. 3, 15.21-22 Polemis (δάκρυσι μᾶλλον γεγραμμένα ἢ μέλανι), Ioannes Tzetzes, *Epist.* 22, p. 39.20 Leone (ἐν δάκρυσι σχεδὸν πλέον οὐ μέλανι τὸ γράμμα χαράξας), as well as certain later writers, such as Patriarch Athanasios (ep. 54.1 TALBOT: τίνοι καὶ δάκρυσιν ἡβουλόμην ἢ μέλανι μᾶλλον χαράξαι) and Irene Choumnaina (ep. 14.56 Constantinides-Hero ταῦτα δάκρυσιν ἐγράφσαν μᾶλλον ἢ μέλανι).

νημα φιλόθεον καὶ φιλάρετον. The first pair relate to her aristocratic lineage, her education and her literary pursuits,⁸ the others to her piety and virtue, which according to the writer she inherited from her mother, Irene-Eulogia, who is described in similar terms.⁹

Once the writer has, in accordance with the tradition in consolatory literature, expressed the effect that the unhappy event had on him, he moves on to the main section of the letter, in which two thematic units may be distinguished.¹⁰

In the first, Holobolos speaks first of the great sadness and powerful emotion caused generally by the death of the *protovestiarios* (ll. 13-23), then of the grief of his friends, in which context he extols the virtues of the deceased (ll. 24-31), and ends with a description of the sorrow of Theodora's mother, Irene-Eulogia Palaiologina (ll. 31-39), and of Theodora herself (ll. 39-48).

In the second part (ll. 49-80), which forms the consolatory segment of the letter, Holobolos turns to Theodora, hailing her as *συνετωτάτη καὶ ἀγχινουστάτη ψυχή* and addressing to her a series of rhetorical questions with which he attempts to persuade her to cease her unremitting mourning over her husband's death, which is injurious to herself. He supports his exhortations with passages drawn from both religious and secular literature, citing (in chronological order) Job, who is the archetype of patience, then recalling the words of Plato, that incessant lamenting befits neither man nor noble woman, which she certainly is, and those of Xenophon, that it is harder to respond to good fortune with modesty than adversity with steadfastness and self-control, and bids her face this calamity with fortitude, like him with whom she shared the good things of life. He also bids her remember that ability is demonstrated in difficulties and that time and acceptance heal pain and misfortune.

Continuing, the author of the letter expresses his certainty that along with her youth Theodora has the necessary wisdom and nobility of nature, characteristics that she owes to the education given her by her mother. He also reminds her that piety dictates moderation in mourning, and patience, quoting the exhortation of the Apostle Paul to the Thessalonians that as Christians they should not sor-

8 See in this regard the literature on Theodora Raoulaina in note 2.

9 For the mother of Theodora Raoulaina, Irene-Eulogia Palaiologina, whom Holobolos describes as most decorous and held in reverence (l. 32), see *PLP* 21360.

10 With regard to the proimion and more generally the types of consolatory letters, structured following the teaching of Menander Rhetor for funerary/consolatory epistles with proimion, the encomium of and lament for the deceased, words of consolation, and an epilog with exhortation and words of counsel, such as we find in Middle Byzantine epistolography, see A. R. LITTLEWOOD, *The Byzantine Letter of Consolation in the Macedonian and Komnenian Periods*. *DOP* 53 (1999) 19-41.

row for the dead as do those who have no hope but remember that they shall rise again and be restored to eternal life. He bids her, finally, with a new form of address (τρισευγενεστάτη ψυχή), to bear the loss of her husband with courage, giving thanks to God for their union and for the assurance that her patience will be rewarded.

The letter ends with a brief epilog that includes the writer's prayer that God will comfort her and guide her through this tempest into a peaceful harbour. One remarkable feature of this letter is that while there are multiple references to Theodora Raoulaina's mother, there is not a word of the two daughters she bore her late husband, Irene Raoulaina Palaiologina and Anna Komnene Strategopoulina Raoulaina.¹¹

While Holobolos follows the established typology of the letter of consolation, he embellishes his text with hapax legomena (δακρυσίγραπτος, στεναγμόλεκτος, δεκαστομία), rare words (βαρυχηής, βαρυστένακτος), and phrases that may be borrowed from other Classical and Byzantine writers. It is particularly interesting to note that Holobolos cites at least five passages from the funerary oration for Procopius of Gaza written by his pupil, Choricus. Although Choricus of Gaza was praised by the Byzantines for the purity and elegance of his style, his work is only preserved in a limited number of manuscripts, the oldest of which, *Athous, Megistes Lavras* Ω 123 (1935), dating from the second half of the 13th century,¹² is contemporary with Manuel Holobolos.

The present edition reproduces the punctuation of the manuscript.

11 For Irene Raoulaina Palaiologina see *PLP* 24142 and for Anna Komnene Strategopoulina Raoulaina see *PLP* 26893.

12 A short description of the manuscript see in Coricio di Gaza, *Due orazioni funebri* (orr. VII-VIII Foerster, Richtsteig), introduzione, testo critico, traduzione e commento a cura di CLAUDIA GRECO (*Hellenica*, 36). Alessandria 2010, 28-29, and P. D'ALESSIO, *Aspetti della tradizione manoscritta di Coricio di Gaza* (I), in E. AMATO – A. CORCELLA – D. LAURITZEN (eds.), *L'École de Gaza: espace littéraire et identité culturelle dans l'Antiquité tardive. Actes du colloque international de Paris, Collège de France, 23-25 mai 2013* (*Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta*, 249; *Bibliothèque de Byzantion*, 13). Leuven–Paris–Bristol CT 2017, 495-498.

Ἐπιστολή τοῦ σοφωτάτου ῥήτορος παραμυθητική πρὸς τὴν πανευγενεστάτην Κομνηνὴν κυρὰν Θεοδώραν Παλαιολογίναν τὴν Ῥαούλαιναν, ὅτε τὸν θάνατον ὑπεδέξατο ὁ εὐγενέστατος αὐτῆς ἀνὴρ ὁ πρωτοβεστιάριος

5 Δάκρυσι καὶ οὐ μέλανι τὴνδέ σοι τὴν ἐπιστολὴν ἀνεχάραξα· τρισευγενεστάτη καὶ φιλολογωτάτη ψυχὴ φιλαρέτου καὶ φιλοθέου μητρὸς γέννημα φιλόθεον καὶ φιλάρετον· τὸ μέλαν δ' ἂν ἀποχρώζη τὰ γράμματα, θαυμάζειν οὐ χρὴ· ταῖς γὰρ ἀναστομωθείσαις τοῖς ἑμοῖς ὀφθαλμοῖς δακρῦων πηγαῖς, οἱ τῆς καρδίας συν-ομιλήσαντες καπνηροὶ στυγνοὶ στεναγμοὶ, τὸ λευκὸν ἐκείνων πρὸς τὸ μέλαν μετεχρωμάτισαν. κἀντεῦθεν δακρυσίγραπτος στεναγμόλεκτος ὁ ἐπιστολιμαῖος

10 Ἐρμῆς κατεπέμφθη σοι· οὐ φέρων περιηργυρωμένας τὰς πτέρυγας, οὐ χρυσίου περικεκοσμημένα χλωρότητι τὰ μετάφρενα κατ' ἐκείνον τὸν ψαλμικὸν ἀετὸν, ἀλλὰ πολλῶ τῷ κορῷ κεχρωσμένας κατὰ τὸν δαυϊτικὸν νυκτικόρακα.

15 Τίς γὰρ ἂν μὴ τις ἦν ἐκείνος λιθίνην ἔχων ψυχὴν, ἂν μὴ δρυὸς, ἢ θαλαττίου προῆλθε προβλήματος· καὶ μαστοὺς λεαίνης ἐθήλασεν ὅς οὐ τὸν σὸν γλυκύτατον ἐπένησε σύννευον, τὸν μέγαν, τὸν περιφανῆ, τὸν περιβλεπτον; Τίς ἦν ἐκείνος οὐπὲρ ἐπὶ τῇ συμπεσούσῃ δεινῇ συμφορᾷ, βλέφαρα μὲν οὐκ ἐσκυθρώπασε· πῦρ δ' ἐκείνου τοῖς ἐγκάτοις οὐ διήλθε, | (f. 147v) πρηστήριον, οὐ φουστήριον· κεραύνιον, οὐ λαμπτήριον· πολὺ δ' ἐκείνον περιέχρωσε τὸ μέλαν; Πολλοῖς πενθικὸς συνέ-

2-3 θάνατον ὑπεδέξατο: cf. Theod. Cyr., *De providentia*, PG 83, 760.17 (ὑπεδεξάμην τὸν θάνατον); Theop. Ochrid., *Enc. ss. mart. quindecim Tiberiopol.* 33.51-52, p. 160 Κιαρίδου (διὰ τοῦ ξίφους ὑπεδέξατο θάνατον) 4 δάκρυσι – ἀνεχάραξα: cf. Greg. Antiochus, *Epist. II ad Eust. Thessal.*, Bsl 24 (1963) 72, l. 358-9 Darrouzès (δάκρυσι μᾶλλον ἢ μέλανι τὴν παρούσαν διεχαραξάμην γραφήν) 7 τοῖς ἑμοῖς ὀφθαλμοῖς δακρῦων πηγαῖς: cf. LXX Ieremias 8.23 (ὀφθαλμοῖς μου πηγὴν δακρῦων) 9-10 ἐπιστολιμαῖος Ἐρμῆς: cf. Eusth. Thessal., *Epist.* 9.46, p. 44 Κολονοῦ (ἀλλ' οὐπω μὲν (ὅπερ ἔφην) ἐπιστολιμαῖον Ἐρμῆν) 10-11 περιηργυρωμένας – μετάφρενα: LXX Ps. 67.14 (πτέρυγες περιστερᾶς περιηργυρωμέναι, καὶ τὰ μετάφρενα αὐτῆς ἐν χλωρότητι χρυσοῦ); LXX Ps. 90.4 (ἐν τοῖς μεταφρένοις αὐτοῦ ἐπισκιάσει σε καὶ ὑπὸ τὰς πτέρυγας αὐτοῦ ἔλπιεις) 12 δαυϊτικὸν νυκτικόρακα: LXX Ps. 101.7 (ὡσεὶ νυκτικόραξ ἐν οἰκοπέδῳ) 13 ἂν μὴ τις ἦν ἐκείνος λιθίνην ἔχων ψυχὴν, ἂν μὴ δρυὸς: Hom. *Il.* 22.126 (οὐ μὲν πῶς νῦν ἔστιν ἀπὸ δρυὸς οὐδ' ἀπὸ πέτρης); Plutar., *Consolatio ad uxorem* 608C4-5, vol. 3, p. 533.19-20 Paton – Rohlenz – Sieveking (καίτοι οὐδ' αὐτός 'ἀπὸ δρυὸς οὐδ' ἀπὸ πέτρης' ἐγενόμην) 14 μαστοὺς λεαίνης ἐθήλασεν: cf. Thomas Mag., *Ecloga nominum* M 233.4 Ritschl (Θεόκριτος: ... ἢ ῥα λεαίνης μαζὸν θήλασδε); Arsen., *Apophth.*, cent. 12.20a, CPG Leutsch-Schneidewin, vol. 2, 548 (Ἀριστοτέλους: ... ἢ ῥα λεαίνης μαζὸν ἐθήλαξεν) 16-17 πῦρ πρηστήριον: cf. e. g. Theod. Prodr., *Carm. hist.* 64a, v. 17, p. 498 Hörandner 16-18 πῦρ ... κεραύνιον: cf. e. g. Eur. *Tr.* 80

2 ῥαούλεναν H 4 τὴν δὲ H 9 δακρυσίγραπτος *harax legomenon* στεναγμόλεκτος *harax legomenon* 17 πριστήριον H

20 στη χορὸς, στεναγμοῖς συμμιγῆς, ὄλολυγμοῖς σύγκρατος, καὶ κρότος ἐντεῦθεν ἐξηχήθη βαρυηχῆς, καὶ παράμουςος· πολλοῖς περιέδραμε προθέλυμος πλοκάμων τιλμὸς, καὶ πρόρριζα βοστρύχων ἐγεγόνει σπαράγματα· πολλῶν κατηλακίσθησαν παρειαι τῶν ὀνύχων ὅσα καὶ ἀρότρων αὐταῖς ἐμβληθέντων· καὶ ἀκριβῆ τὴν εἰς βάθος ἐνεργησάντων διάτμηξιν.

25 Ὡ γὰρ οἶος ἀνὴρ, βαβαὶ τοῦ πάθους! ἀβάλε τῆς συμφορᾶς! θανάτου σειραῖς περιπέπτωκε· καὶ πρὸς τοὺς κελαινοὺς κατῆλθε κευθμῶνας νεκρῶν. ὦ οἶος ἀπῆλθεν ἀνὴρ· χαρίτων λιμὴν, πραότητος οἶκος, τόπος συνέσεως, ἐστία φρονήσεως, τρισευγενῆς τὸ σῶμα, τὴν ψυχὴν εὐγενέστερος, καλὸς τὸ φαινόμενον, κάλλιστος τὸ μὴ βλεπόμενον. ὦ οἶον ἀπέστη, οἶον ἐκρύβη, οἶον ἄστρον ἀμφιφαῆς ἔδου, καὶ σκότος βαθὺ τοῖς φιλοῦσιν αὐτὸν καταλέλοιπεν. ὦ οἶον πέπτωκε
30 τέμενος ἀρετῶν, ὦ οἶος ἀγαθοπραγίας ναὸς κατηρείπωτο· καὶ παντὸς καλοῦ καταγῶγιον καταβέβληται· τοῖς μὲν οὖν ἄλλοις ὅσοις φίλος καὶ προσγενῆς ὁ πολὺς ἐκεῖνος ἐτύχανεν ὦν, οὕτως ἐκεῖνοις συνετελέσθη τὰ τῆς συμφορᾶς, οὕτω τὰ τῆς λύπης ξυνεσκευάσθη πανόδυρτα βαρυστένακτα, τοὺς δὲ τῆς σῆς σεβασμίας καὶ σεμνοτάτης μητρὸς βυθίους καὶ καρδιακοὺς στεναγμοὺς, | (f. 148r)
35 τοὺς τῶν δακρῶν συχνοὺς ὄχετοὺς, τοὺς ὄλολυγμοὺς, ὄλονυκτίους, πανημερίους, τίς ἂν οὕτω γλῶττα περίτρανος δυνηθεῖ διατυπώσασθαι, τίς ἂν ῥήτορος δεκαστομίαν αὐχῶν, ἐξειπεῖν ἰσχύσει καὶ διηγήσασθαι; ὡς χελιδῶν, οὕτω φωνεῖ,

19-20 κρότος ... βαρυηχῆς: cf. LXX, III Machab. 5.48.3 (βαρυηχῆ θόρυβον ἀκούσαντες) 21-22 κατηλακίσθησαν παρειαι τῶν ὀνύχων: cf. Nic. Basilac., *Monodiae, Or.* 1.136, p. 241 Pignani (αὐλακίζει καὶ ὄνυξι τὰς παρειάς) 24-25 θανάτου σειραῖς περιπέπτωκε: cf. Euseb. Caes., *Demon. evang.* 4.12.3, vol. VI, p. 169.24-25 Heikel (νεκροῖς σειραῖς θανάτου πεπεδημένοις) 25 κευθμῶνας νεκρῶν: cf. Eur. *Hec.* 1 (νεκρῶν κευθμῶνα) 26 πραότητος οἶκος: cf. Neoph. incl., *Πανηγυρική βίβλος*, or. 17.270-271, p. 345 Giagkou (τὸ τῆς πραότητος οἴκημα) 26 τόπος συνέσεως: LXX Iob 28.20 26-27 ἐστία φρονήσεως: Isid. Pel., *Epist. libr.* 2, Ep. 151.16, PG 78, 605.4 (ἐστία δὲ φρονήσεως) 27-28 καλὸς τὸ φαινόμενον, κάλλιστος τὸ μὴ βλεπόμενον: cf. Const. Manas., *Consolatio ad Joannem Contostephanum*, VV 7 (1900) 644-645, ll. 299-300 Kurtz (τὴν εὐπρεπῆ τὸ φαινόμενον, τὴν εὐπρεπεστέραν τὸ μὴ βλεπόμενον) 28-29 ἄστρον ἀμφιφαῆς: cf. Mich. Chon., *Ep.* 71.21, p. 97 Κολοῦ (ἀμφιφαῆς τις ἀστήρ) 30 τέμενος ἀρετῶν: cf. Nic. Mesarites, *Epitaph. in Joan. Mesar.* 2, p. 17.15 Heisenberg (τὸ τέμενος τῶν ἀρετῶν) 33 βαρυστένακτα: cf. Man. Holob., *Oratio in imp. Mich. Palaol.* I, p. 67.35 Treu (τὴν τότε βαρυστένακτον ἐκείνων βίαν) 34 βυθίους ... στεναγμοὺς: cf. Theod. Prodr., *Carm. hist.* 39.9, p. 382 Hörandner (καὶ πρὸς στεναγμοὺς ἐκκινουῖμαι βυθίους); Const. Manas., *Hodoeporicon* 1.52, p. 104 Chryssogelos (πολλοὺς στεναγμοὺς ἀνέπεμψα βυθίους) 36 γλῶττα περίτρανος: cf. Eust. Thess., *Or.* 10, p. 178.92-93 Wirth (τοιαύτη γλῶσσα περίτρανος); Euth. Torn., *Or.* 1, 3.13, *RÉB* 26 (1968) 58.17 Darrrouzes (τὴν γλῶτταν ὡς ἐπίπαν περίτρανοι) 37 ἐξειπεῖν ἰσχύσει: cf. Io. Chrys., *In Genesim hom.*, PG 53, 302.66 (ποῖα γλῶττα ἐξειπεῖν ἰσχύσει) 37 ὡς χελιδῶν ... φωνεῖ: cf. Hesych. Lex. letter tau 993 I. 1 Cunningham-Hansen (ὡς χελιδῶν φωνεῖ)

24 ὦ ... οἶαν Η 30 ἀν κατερείπωται? 37 δεκαστομίαν *hapax legomenon* (cf. Hom. *Il.* 2, 489: οὐδ' εἰ μοι δέκα μὲν γλῶσσαι, δέκα δὲ στόματ' εἶεν) φωνεῖ Η

καὶ ὡσεὶ τρυγῶν ἢ σῶφρων, οὕτω θρηνηῖ· μικροῦ καὶ τὰς ἀψύχους φύσεις συγ-
 40 καλουμένη πρὸς ὄδυρμους· καὶ πρὸς ξυναυλίαν ἐλεεινὴν συναγεύουσα. σὺ δὲ
 τὸ σῶφρον καὶ φιλοσῶφρον τὴν ἀρετὴν περιθρύλλητε· μελαμβαφῆς μὲν σοι πε-
 ρίκεται στολισμός, οἶον ἀπὸ κεραυνοῦ τινος ἀποσβολωθεῖς· γῆ δέ σοι στρωμνὴ
 τράπεζα σποδός· κλαυθμὸς δ' ἐπὶ ταύτῃ τροφή· καὶ πικρὸν σοι κέρασμα, δάκρυα·
 πρὸς τούτοις, ὄδυρμοὶ· κομποὶ· τῶ προσώπῳ δεινὸς ἀμυγμὸς· αἱμάτων ὁμοῦ καὶ
 45 δακρύων καταρροαῖ· βαρὺς κωκυτὸς, μέλος ἐπὶ τούτοις σοι καὶ οὐαὶ· θρηῆνος
 σειρήνων, καὶ κοπετὸς δρακόντων κατὰ τὸ λόγιον· καὶ ταῦτά σοι πάντως φασίν,
 οὐκ ἐκ διαλειμμάτων, οὐ μένουσιν, οὐδ' ἐξ ὥρας μεθ' ὥραν· ἀλλὰ πυκνὰ συνεχῆ τε
 καὶ ἀδιάκοπα, καὶ κατ' αὐτὸ τὸ βραχύτατον καὶ ἀκαριαῖον τοῦ χρόνου περιπαθῶς
 ἐκμετρούμενα.

Πλὴν ἕως πότε σοι ταῦτα συνετωτάτη καὶ ἀγχινουστάτη ψυχῇ; μέχρι τίνος
 50 τὰ τῶν στεναγμῶν ἀπαράκλητα τὰ τῆς συμφορᾶς ἀμετάβλητα; μὴ ἰσχὺς λίθων ἢ
 ἰσχὺς σου; τὰ τοῦ Ἰῶβ εὐκαίρως σοι φθέγγομαι, μὴ σοι | (*f. 148v*) τὸ σῶμα φύσεως
 οὐκ ἀνθρωπίνης, ἀλλ' ἀδαμαντίνης ἢ σιδηρείας ἔλαχε τὴν διάπλασιν· καὶ πέποι-
 θας μὴ οὐκ ἀγαθῇ τινι περιπεσεῖν διαθέσει νόσον ἐπαγούση· ἢ νόσῳ αἰφνίδιον

38 τρυγῶν ἢ σῶφρων: cf. Claud. Ael., *De nat. anim.* 10.33.1, p. 249.6 Garcia Valdes – Llera Fuego – Rodriguez-Noriega Guillen (ὅτι σῶφρων ἐστὶν ἢ τρυγῶν) 39 ξυναυλίαν ἐλεεινὴν: cf. Mich. Chon., *Ep.* 121.17, p. 202 Κολοῦ (ξυναυλίαν ἐλεεινὴν ἀρμόττονται); Mich. Chon., *Or.* 22, vol. 2, p. 360.4 Lambros (ξυναυλίαν ἐλεεινὴν ἀρμωσώμεθα) 40 σῶφρον καὶ φιλοσῶφρον: cf. Nic. Basilac., *Monodiae*, *Or.* 2.94, p. 256 Pignani (τὴν δὲ γνώμην τὸ σῶφρον τε καὶ φιλοσῶφρον); Greg. Naz., *In laud. Cypr.*, *Or.* 24, 9, p. 56.10 Mossay – Lafontaine (καὶ τῶν ὑπὸ ζυγὸν ὄσα σῶφρονές τε καὶ φιλοσῶφρονες) 41 γῆ δέ σοι στρωμνὴ: cf. Palladius, *De gentibus Indiae et Bragmanibus*, 2.24.5 Berghoff (γῆ μοι πᾶσα στρωμνὴ) 43 ἀμυγμὸς: cf. Aesch. *Choeph.* 24 44-45 θρηῆνος σειρήνων καὶ κοπετὸς δρακόντων κατὰ τὸ λόγιον: cf. Man. Holob., *Or. in imperat. Mich. Palaeol.* 1, p. 68.4 Treu (θρηῆνον κατὰ τὸν θρηῆνον Σειρήνων, κοψάμενοι κοπετὸν κατὰ τὸν κοπετὸν δρακόντων); LXX Ezechiel 2.10.3 (θρηῆνος καὶ μέλος καὶ οὐαὶ); LXX Michaeas 1.8 (κοπετὸν ὡς δρακόντων) 47 ἀκαριαῖον τοῦ χρόνου: cf. Marc. Aur. imp., *Tὰ εἰς ἐαντόν*, 4, 48.2, p. 70.18-19 Farquarson (ἀκαριαῖον οὖν τοῦτο τοῦ χρόνου); Basil. Caes., *Hom. in hexaem.*, *Hom.* 6, 7.32, p. 360.8 Giet (ἀκαριαῖον τοῦ χρόνου) 50 τὰ τῶν στεναγμῶν ἀπαράκλητα: cf. Theod. Hexart., *Epitaph. in Steph. Choreget.*, p. 229.3 Sideras (καὶ ὁ στεναγμὸς ἀπαράκλητος) τὰ τῆς συμφορᾶς ἀμετάβλητα: cf. Nic. Basilac. *Progymnasmata* 38.25, p. 161 Pignani (οὕτω μοι τὰ τῆς συμφορᾶς ἀμετάβλητα) 50-52 μὴ ἰσχὺς λίθων ἢ ἰσχὺς σου; τὰ τοῦ Ἰῶβ εὐκαίρως σοι φθέγγομαι ...: LXX Job 6.11-12 (μὴ ἰσχὺς λίθων ἢ ἰσχὺς μου; ἢ αἱ σάρκες μου εἰσὶν χάλκεια); 51-52 τὸ σῶμα φύσεως οὐκ ἀνθρωπίνης, ἀλλ' ἀδαμαντίνης ... ἔλαχε τὴν διάπλασιν: cf. Anna Comn., *Alexias* 15, 11.22.11, p. 504.42-43 Reinsch-Kambylis (εἰ μὴ, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἀδαμαντίνῃ τίς ἦν ἢ ἄλλῃς τινὸς φύσεως διάπλασις) 53-54 νόσῳ αἰφνίδιον θάνατον ... ἀπειλούση: cf. Const. Manas., *Brev. Chron.* 2742, p. 150 Lampsides (νόσῳ ληφθεὶς ... θάνατον ἀπειλούση); Dem. Chomaten., *Ponema* 120.46, p. 131.41 Prinzing (νόσῳ σοι θάνατον ἀπειλούση); Niceph. Call. Xanthopoulos, *Hist. eccles.* 12, 6, PG 146, 764.21 (νόσῳ θάνατον ἀπειλούση)

55 θάνατον, ὃ μὴ δοίη Κύριος ἀπειλούση, καὶ διὰ ταῦτα, τοιαῦτα ποιεῖς ἄπερ μὴ ὅτι
 γε μόνον ὑπομεῖναι πέφυκε δυσχερῆ, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀκοῦσαι μόνον ἀφόρητα. Ἄφες
 πρὸς τοῦ Θεοῦ καὶ τῆς σῆς ψυχῆς, τὸ συνεχὲς οὕτω δάκρυ· τοὺς μακροὺς καὶ
 βυθίους οὕτως στεναγμούς, τὰς τῶν παρειῶν ἀνηλεεῖς ἀμυχὰς· δὸς ἀνακωχὴν
 60 τῷ πάθει μικρὰν· ἔστω σοι μὴ πᾶς καιρὸς τοῦ θρήνου καιρὸς, κείσθωσαν ἐκ δια-
 λείμματος οἱ στεναγμοὶ καὶ μενέτω κατὰ διάστασιν ὁ κλαυθμὸς· οὐκ ἀνδράσι
 φησὶν ὁ σοφώτατος Πλάτων, ἀλλὰ καὶ γυναιξὶ σπουδαίαις ὅποια σὺ, θρήνος γε
 ἐπιπρέπει μακρὸς· καὶ χαλεπώτερόν φησι Ξενοφῶν τὰ κρεῖττω φέρειν σωφρό-
 νως, ἢ τὰναντία τούτοις στερρῶς τε καὶ ἐγκρατῶς. μὴ τοίνυν τὴν μείζω τε καὶ
 πρῶτην καρτερίαν ἀσκήσασα τύχης οἷς εἰς ἄκρον καὶ ἀρετῆς ἀναδειχθεῖσα τὸ
 65 μέτριον ἔστερξας, δευτέρα φανεῖς τῆς δευτέρας καὶ τῆς ἐλάττονος· τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς
 εὖ χρησαμένη τε καὶ ἠδύνουσι, χρῆσαι καὶ τοῖς λυποῦσιν ὡς χρῆ, καὶ τῷ πάθει
 καὶ τῇ συμφορᾷ ἑαφήσοιτ'· δεξιὸς θηρευτῆς, μαχίμοις θηρσὶ δοκιμάζεται· καὶ
 κυβερνήτης ἀγαθός, ἀντιπνοίαις πνευμάτων | (f. 149r) οἷός ἐστιν ἀναδείκνυται,
 καὶ ψυχὴν εὐγενῆ συμφοραὶ καὶ λύπαι παρέστησαν· ἰδιώτη φάρμακον λύπης ὁ
 χρόνος ἐγνώρισται, τῷ δ' εὐγενεῖ σύνεσις τὴν συμφορὰν ἐθεράπευσε, καὶ σοφῶ
 70 τῆς ἰατρείας τοῦ χρόνου, τὰ τοῦ λόγου φάρμακα προηγῆσαντο. Ἐγκεῖται κάπὶ σοὶ

57 βυθίους ... στεναγμούς: cf. *supra* l. 32–33 57 ταῖς τῶν παρειῶν ἀνηλεεῖς ἀμυχὰς: cf. Nic. Mesarites, *Descriptio ecclesiae SS. Apostolorum* 28.5.4, p. 909 Downey (ὑπὲρ τίνος τὰς παρειὰς ταῖς ἀμυχαῖς) 57–58 ἀνακωχὴν τῷ πάθει: cf. Georg. Acrop., *Annales* 52.38, vol. I, p. 103.7 Heisenberg (ἀνακωχὴν δὲ τοῦ πάθους οὐχ εὐρεν); Georg. Acrop., *Epitaphius in Ioannem Ducam* 17.11, vol. II, p. 25.8 Heisenberg (μηδένα χρόνον σχεῖν τοῦ πάθους ἀνακωχὴν); 58 θρήνου καιρὸς: cf. Ioan. Chrys. *In Ioannem hom.*, PG 59, 360.5 (θρήνου λοιπὸν ὁ καιρὸς) 59–61 οὐκ ἀνδράσι – ἐπιπρέπει μακρὸς: Ὁρθῶς ἄρ' ἂν ἐξαιροῦμεν τοὺς θρήνους τῶν ὀνομαστῶν ἀνδρῶν, γυναιξὶ δὲ ἀποδιδούμεν, καὶ οὐδὲ ταῦταις σπουδαίαις Plat. *Respubl.* 3.578a5; cf. Nic. Eugen., *Monodia in Theod. Prodr.* VV 9 (1902) 453.25–26 Petit (οὕτως εἴ τις θρήνος εἴ τις κλαυθμὸς θανάοντι νῦν ἐπιπρέπει σοὶ) 61–62 χαλεπώτερον – ἐγκρατῶς: Xenophon, *Cyropedia* 8, 4.14 (νῦν δὲ ὀρῶ αὐτοὺς τὰγαθὰ σωφρόνως φέροντας. δοκεῖ δέ μοι, ὦ Κύρε, χαλεπώτερον εἶναι εὐρεῖν ἄνδρα τὰγαθὰ καλῶς φέροντα ἢ τὰ κακά); cf. Choricus, *Op.* 8, 34.5, p. 72. 29–30 Greco (καίτοι Ξενοφῶντι δοκεῖ χαλεπώτερον εἶναι τὰγαθὰ φέρειν μετρίως ἢπερ ἐγκρατῶς τὰναντία) 62–64 μὴ τοίνυν τὴν μείζω – ἐλάττονος: cf. Choricus, *Op.* 8, 35.1–2, p. 72.30–31 Greco (μὴ τοίνυν τὴν μείζω καρτερίαν ἀσκήσαντες τῆς ἐλάττονος ἀμελήσητε) 66–67 δεξιὸς θηρευτῆς, μαχίμοις θηρσὶ δοκιμάζεται καὶ κυβερνήτης ἀγαθός, ἀντιπνοίαις πνευμάτων, οἷός ἐστιν ἀναδείκνυται: cf. Choricus, *Op.* 8, 35.4–6, p. 74.2–3 Greco (τὸν καλὸν ἐγὼ θηρευτὴν πρὸς τὰ μάχμα δοκιμάζω θηρία, τὸν ἀγαθὸν κυβερνήτην πρὸς ἀντιπνέοντας ἀνέμους τῷ πλοίῳ) 67 ἀντιπνοίαις πνευμάτων: cf. Man. Holob., *Or. in imperat. Mich. Palaeol.* 1, p. 73.34 Treu (πνευμάτων ἀκρίτων καταγιγνώδεις ἀντίπνοιοι) 68–69 ἰδιώτη φάρμακον λύπης ὁ χρόνος ἐγνώρισται: cf. Choricus, *Op.* 8, 35.9, p. 74.5–6 Greco (ἰδιώτη μὲν γὰρ φάρμακον ἔστω λύπης ὁ χρόνος) 70 τῆς ἰατρείας – προηγῆσαντο: cf. Choricus, *Op.* 8, 35.12, p. 74.7–8 Greco (δεῖ γὰρ τῆς ἰατρείας τοῦ χρόνου τὰ τοῦ λογισμοῦ φάρμακα προηγῆσασθαι)

56 an δάκρυον scribendum? 57 τὰς: ταῖς? H 65 χρησαμένη H 70 φάρμακα scripsi (cf. *app. font.*): τραύματα H

75 σύνεσις πρὸς τῇ περιφανεῖ εὐγενείᾳ πάνυ πολλή καὶ ταῦτ' ἐπὶ νεαζούσῃ τῇ ἡλικίᾳ, καὶ ἀνατρεχούσῃ πρὸς τὴν ἀνάβασιν· ἔστι σοι καὶ λόγος ἰκανὸς, καὶ παιδεία ἢ ἐπιεικῆς, ἃ σοι προϋξένησεν ἢ περιφανεστάτῃ σοι μήτηρ ἅμα τε καὶ παιδευτρία. δεῖξον ταῦτα τῷ νῦν καιρῷ· καὶ σεαυτὴν παράστησον ὅποια κατὰ τὸ τᾶλλα, καὶ τὴν ἀκριβῆ καὶ μεγίστην πέφυκας θεοσέβειαν· οἶδας ὅπως ὁ τοῦ πνεύματος ῥήτωρ, ὁ μέγας Παῦλος, τοὺς ἐπὶ τοῖς κοιμηθεῖσιν ἀπαράκλητα θρηνοῦντας ἐπιτιμῶν καταμέμφεται· καὶ ἀπεικάζειν ἐθέλει τοῖς Ἑλλησιν, οἷς ἐλπίς ἀναστάσεως παντελῶς ἀπηγόρευται· οἶδας ὅποσοι καὶ ἠθικοὶ λόγοι τῷ χρυσορρήμονι καταβάλλονται, καὶ πείθουσιν ἰκανῶς ἐπὶ τοῖς τετελευτηκόσι μὴ λίαν ἀδημονεῖν, ἀλλὰ

80 τὸ πάθος γενναίως φέρειν διὰ τὴν εἰς τὸ μέλλον ἀποκατάστασιν.
 Ἄγε τοίνυν καὶ σὺ τρισευγενεστάτῃ ψυχῇ, φέρε τὸ συμβάν σοι πάθος γενναίως, ἀνδρείως, καρτερικῶς· εὐχαρίστησον τῷ συνδήσαντί σε τῷ μακαριστῷ ἐκείνῳ καὶ γλυκυτάτῳ συνεύῳ σοι, καὶ πάλιν οἷς οἶδε τρόποις αὐτός, διαλύσαντι, | (f. 149v) ἵνα καὶ τούτου χάριν, ὡς καὶ πολλῶν ἄλλων ἀγαθῶν πλεονεκτημάτων καὶ θείων, παρ' ἐκείνου κομίσῃ τὰς ἀμοιβάς.

85 Καὶ ὁ Θεὸς ὁ παρακαλῶν τοὺς ἀθυμοῦντας, ὁ τοὺς ἐκλείποντας ταῖς συμφοραῖς ἀναλαμβάνων· ὁ ἀνιστῶν τοὺς ἐκ δεινῶν συμβαμάτων κατερραγμένους, αὐτὸς ἀοράτως τὴν φιλάγαθόν σου κρατήσαι ψυχὴν, παραμυθήσαιτό σε, τῆς μακρᾶς λύπης ἀνακωχὴν σοι παράσχοι· καὶ τὸ πολὺ σοι κουφίσοι τῶν δυσχερῶν·
 90 κὰκ τῆς τῶν πραγμάτων τοσαύτης πολυκυμάντου θαλάσσης εἰς εὐγάληνον λιμένα πραεῖαις αὔραις ἐγκαθορμίσει σε.

75-76 ὁ τοῦ πνεύματος ῥήτωρ, ὁ μέγας Παῦλος; Man. Holob., *Oratio catechetica lecta quasi a Patriarcha Germano*, p. 11.16 Treu (ὁ τοῦ πνεύματος ῥήτωρ, ὁ θεῖος Παῦλος) 76-78 ὁ μέγας Παῦλος – παντελῶς ἀπηγόρευται: cf. 1 Thess. 4.13 78-79 ὅποσοι καὶ ἠθικοὶ – καταβάλλονται: cf. Ioan. Chrys., *De resurrectione mortuorum*, PG 50, 417ter-432 (CPG 4340); *In epistulam I ad Thessalonicenses hom. 7*, PG 62, 435-440 (CPG 4434); *Oratio in defunctos inedita* (CPG 4979) 81-82 φέρε τὸ συμβάν σοι πάθος γενναίως: cf. supra l. 80 (τὸ πάθος γενναίως φέρειν) 86 ὁ Θεὸς ὁ παρακαλῶν τοὺς ἀθυμοῦντας: cf. 2 Cor. 1.3 (ὁ ... Θεὸς ... , ὁ παρακαλῶν ἡμᾶς ἐπὶ πάσῃ τῇ θλίψει ἡμῶν) 87 ὁ ἀνιστῶν – τοὺς κατερραγμένους: cf. LXX Ps. 144.14 (ἀνορθοὶ τοὺς κατερραγμένους); LXX Ps. 145.8 (κύριος ἀνορθοὶ κατερραγμένους); Cyril. Alex., *Comment. in proph. Zachariam* IV, vol. 2, p. 431.25-26 Pusey (ὁ ἀνιστᾶς τὸ κατερραγμένον) 88 φιλάγαθον ψυχὴν: cf. Nicolaus I Mysticus, *Ep.* 13.14, p. 90 Jenkins-Westerink (ἢ ἐκείνου φιλάγαθος ψυχὴ) 90-91 εἰς εὐγάληνον λιμένα: cf. Germ. II patr., *Ep.* 3, p. 358.6 Lagorates (πρὸς τὸν εὐγάληνον λιμένα τῆς εὐσπλαγχνίας τοῦ Χριστοῦ); Man. Holob., *Oratio catechetica lecta quasi a Patriarcha Germano*, p. 13.29 Treu (οἶον εἰς λιμένα εὐγάληνον)

87 ἀναλαμβάνων scripsi: ἐπαναλαμβάνων H

ABSTRACT

The article offers a critical edition of the hitherto unpublished letter of condolence of Manuel Holobolos to Theodora Raoulaina for the death of her second husband, Ioannes Raoul, transmitted in the ms *Hierosolymitanus, Sancti Sepulchri (Panagiou Taphou)* 276.

Department of Philology
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki