## Surface versus Bulk Coulomb Correlations in Photoemission Spectra of SrVO<sub>3</sub> and CaVO<sub>3</sub>

A. Liebsch

Institut für Festkörperforschung, Forschungszentrum Jülich, 52425 Jülich, Germany (Received 13 September 2002; published 3 March 2003)

Recent photoemission spectra of the perovskite series  $Ca_xSr_{1-x}VO_3$  revealed strong modifications associated with surface contributions. To study the effect of Coulomb correlations in the bulk and at the surface, the quasiparticle spectra are evaluated using the dynamical mean field theory. It is shown that as a result of the reduced coordination number of surface atoms correlation effects are stronger at the surface than in the bulk, in agreement with experiment.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.90.096401

PACS numbers: 71.20.Be, 71.27.+a, 79.60.Bm

Photoemission is a key spectroscopy for the investigation of electronic properties of strongly correlated materials. Because of its surface sensitivity, there is growing concern to what extent the data are representative of bulk properties and whether they need to be corrected for surface effects influencing the one- and many-electron properties. For instance, earlier photoemission data on  $Ca_xSr_{1-x}VO_3$  [1,2] indicated that  $SrVO_3$  is a strongly correlated metal and that  $CaVO_3$  is close to a metalinsulator transition with very little spectral weight at the Fermi level. In contrast, low-frequency bulk probes found metallic behavior regardless of Ca concentration [3]. In view of the relative simplicity of these perovskites, this discrepancy is indeed astonishing. For this reason CaVO<sub>3</sub> has been intensively investigated [4].

To identify surface contributions in photoemission from  $Ca_xSr_{1-x}VO_3$ , Maiti *et al.* [5] and Sekiyama *et al.* [6] performed measurements using a wide range of photon energies. As a result of the frequency dependent escape depth of the photoelectron, the spectra reveal striking variations evidently associated with surface modifications of the electronic structure: Emission from the coherent peak near the Fermi level is reduced and correlation-induced satellites have larger weight than in the bulk. On the other hand, the bulk emission from SrVO<sub>3</sub> and CaVO<sub>3</sub> was found to be remarkably similar, in agreement with low-frequency bulk measurements.

Strong spectral changes with photon energy were also observed on SrRuO<sub>3</sub> [7] and  $Ca_xLa_{1-x}VO_3$  [8]. Most likely, these are caused by surface contributions [9]. Another example is Sr<sub>2</sub>RuO<sub>4</sub> for which earlier photoemission data appeared to be in conflict with de Haasvan Alphen measurements [10]. Recent experimental and theoretical work proved that this discrepancy can be resolved by accounting for the surface reconstruction of Sr<sub>2</sub>RuO<sub>4</sub> which leads to significant changes in photoemission spectra [11].

The understanding of surface effects in photoemission from transition metal oxides is clearly important in order to distinguish them from bulk correlation phenomena. Although the electronic properties of strongly correlated materials are currently a field of intense experimental and theoretical investigation [12-14] surface effects have thus far received little attention [15]. In the present work, we use the dynamical mean field theory (DMFT) [13,16,17] to evaluate the surface and bulk quasiparticle spectra of  $SrVO_3$ . We show that because of the planar electronic structure of perovskite systems and the concomitant narrowing of the surface local density of states, correlation effects at the surface are more pronounced than in the bulk. In the perovskites, this enhancement is particularly strong since the local Coulomb energy is not far from the critical value for a metal-insulator transition. Such a trend had been predicted by Potthoff and Nolting [15] who studied the metal-insulator phase diagram for a semi-infinite simple cubic s band at half filling. Here we calculate the self-energy for a multiband system using a realistic local density of states appropriate for SrVO<sub>3</sub> and find qualitative agreement with photoemission [5,6]. We also comment on surface photoemission from CaVO<sub>3</sub>.

Electronic structure calculations for SrVO<sub>3</sub> within the local density approximation (LDA) [18] show that the conduction bands near  $E_F$  consist of degenerate  $t_{2g}$  bands derived from  $V^{4+}$  (3d<sup>1</sup>) ions. The filled O 2p bands are separated from the  $t_{2g}$  levels by a gap of about 1 eV, and the cubic crystal field of the V-O octahedron shifts the  $e_{o}$ bands above the  $t_{2g}$  bands. The  $t_{2g}$  bands can be represented via a tight-binding Hamiltonian with diagonal elements of the form  $h_{xy,xy}(k) = e_d + t_0(c_x + c_y) + t_1c_xc_y +$  $[t_2 + t_3(c_x + c_y) + t_4c_xc_y]c_z$ , where  $c_i = 2\cos(k_ia)$ , i =x, y, z, and a is the lattice constant. The  $t_i$  denote effective hopping integrals representing the V-O-V hybridization, where  $t_{0,2}$ ,  $t_{1,3}$ , and  $t_4$  specify the interaction between first, second, and third neighbors, respectively. Off-diagonal elements which vanish at high-symmetry points are very small and will be neglected.

Figure 1(a) shows the  $t_{2g}$  bulk bands of SrVO<sub>3</sub>. According to the planar electronic structure, the bulk density of states  $\rho_b(\omega)$  exhibits the characteristic asymmetric peak related to the Van Hove singularity at the X point [see Fig. 1(b)]. The overall shape of the bulk density of states agrees with LDA calculations [18]. At the surface, the  $t_{2g}$  degeneracy is lifted since only the  $d_{xy}$  band exhibits strong dispersion within the surface plane (the z



FIG. 1. (a) Tight-binding fit to LDA  $t_{2g}$  bulk bands of SrVO<sub>3</sub> ( $E_F = 0$ ). (b) Solid curve: isotropic bulk density of states; dashed and dotted curves: local density of  $d_{xz,yz}$  and  $d_{xy}$  states in the first layer of SrVO<sub>3</sub>.

axis defines the surface normal). To evaluate the surface density of states, we use a Green's function formalism [19] for semi-infinite tight-binding systems. The tightbinding parameters are assumed to coincide with those in the bulk, except for a small surface potential to ensure charge neutrality.

Figure 1(b) shows the local density of states  $\rho_s(\omega)$  of the  $d_{xz,yz}$  bands for the surface layer of SrVO<sub>3</sub>. Its weight is reduced at low and high energies but enhanced at intermediate energies. Thus, the effective width of  $\rho_s(\omega)$  is smaller than that of  $\rho_b(\omega)$  although their total widths are identical. The density of  $d_{xy}$  states nearly coincides with  $\rho_b(\omega)$ , reflecting the planar nature of  $t_{2g}$ states. It would be desirable to perform electronic structure calculations for SrVO<sub>3</sub> surfaces since they should provide a more accurate density of states. Nevertheless, the key effect discussed here, i.e., the narrowing of the local density of  $d_{xz,yz}$  states, should hold quite generally.

To interpret the experimental photoemission data, we evaluate the quasiparticle spectra by accounting for local Coulomb correlations. According to the one-electron properties discussed above, we are dealing with a non-isotropic system where two narrow bands interact with a wider band. This situation is reminiscent of the layer perovskite  $Sr_2RuO_4$ , which essentially consists of Ru sheets containing two narrow  $d_{xz,yz}$  bands interacting with a wide intraplanar  $d_{xy}$  band. The peculiar feature of this system is the fact the on-site Coulomb energy lies

between the single-particle widths of the nondegenerate  $t_{2g}$  bands:  $W_{xz,yz} < U < W_{xy}$  [20]. In the present case, the difference between  $d_{xz,yz}$  and  $d_{xy}$  bands at the surface is less pronounced so that  $W_i < U$  for all three bands. Nevertheless, since in the first layer the effective width of  $d_{xz,yz}$  states is reduced, the influence of Coulomb correlations on the surface bands should be stronger than on the wider bulk bands.

The key quantity characterizing the effect of Coulomb correlations is the complex self-energy. Since we neglect the weak hybridization between  $t_{2g}$  bands,  $\Sigma(\omega)$  is diagonal in orbital space. Despite this simplification, a full description of correlations near the surface would be exceedingly complicated since, in principle, it would require a mixed momentum/real space approach in order to handle the loss of translational symmetry normal to the surface. This could be accomplished using a cluster formalism where the semi-infinite system is represented via a slab of finite thickness. Unfortunately, the planar character of  $t_{2g}$  orbitals leads to a slowly convergent local density of  $d_{xz,yz}$  states, with many spurious  $1/\sqrt{\omega}$ Van Hove singularities stemming from the quasi-onedimensional hopping parallel to the surface. On the other hand, a cluster generalization of the DMFT is feasible today only for very small cluster size. We therefore ignore the momentum variation of the self-energy and assume that, for a given layer, it depends only on the local density of states within that layer. Additional coupling of the quantum impurity problems represented by the layers is probably small [15] and is neglected for computational reasons. The reduced dimensionality at the surface therefore enters the many-body calculation via the layerdependent density of states. In view of the local Coulomb interaction, this assumption seems justified for qualitative purposes.

Before discussing the quasiparticle spectra derived within the DMFT, it is useful to compare the frequency dependence of the self-energy in the bulk and at the



FIG. 2. Second-order self-energy of SrVO<sub>3</sub>. Solid curves: bulk  $t_{2g}$  self-energy; dashed (dotted) curves:  $d_{xz,yz}$  ( $d_{xy}$ ) selfenergy for surface layer. For clarity, the real part is shifted down by 3 eV. The straight line gives  $\omega - \epsilon_k$  for  $\epsilon_k = -0.5$  eV.

surface. For convenience, we give here the results obtained within non-self-consistent second-order perturbation theory since this provides a clear identification of the various orbital contributions to the diagonal elements  $\Sigma_i(\omega)$  [20]. Figure 2 illustrates the second-order selfenergy for U = 4.3 eV and J = 0.7 eV. The effective band narrowing at the surface yields a narrower distribution of Im  $\sum_{xz,yz}(\omega)$  compared to Im  $\sum_{b}(\omega)$  for the isotropic bulk. Because of the orbital mixing via the on-site Coulomb interaction Im  $\Sigma_{xy}(\omega)$  lies between these two distributions. From the Kramers-Kronig relations, it then follows that Re  $\sum_{xz,yz}(\omega)$  exhibits a more pronounced minimum below the band bottom than Re  $\Sigma_b(\omega)$ . Thus, as indicated by the line  $\omega - \epsilon_k$  for a typical band energy  $\epsilon_k$ , the surface satellite appears at a lower value of U than in the bulk. This qualitative picture is fully supported by the more accurate DMFT results discussed below.

In the DMFT, the self-energy elements  $\Sigma_i(\omega)$  are functionals of the bath Green's functions  $G_i^{-1} = G_i^{-1} + \Sigma_i$ . On-site Coulomb correlations are treated using the selfconsistent multiband Quantum Monte Carlo (QMC) method (for a review, see Ref. [13]). The temperature of the simulation is 125 meV with 64 imaginary time slices and several runs using 10<sup>5</sup> Monte Carlo sweeps. The quasiparticle density of states is obtained via maximum entropy reconstruction [21].

Figure 3(a) shows the bulk quasiparticle spectrum of SrVO<sub>3</sub> for two Coulomb energies in the critical region for the formation of incoherent Hubbard bands which are seen as satellites in the photoemission spectra [5,6]. The exchange energy is J = 0.7 eV [22]. These results show that U must be larger than 4 eV to obtain the satellite. The peak near 2 eV above  $E_F$  corresponds to the upper Hubbard band and agrees with inverse photoemission data [2]. Although for U = 4 eV there is considerable correlationinduced band narrowing and an emerging satellite shoulder, a larger U yields an even narrower coherent feature near  $E_F$ , with the missing weight shifted to the lower and upper Hubbard bands. Note that  $N_b(E_F) =$  $\rho_{b}(E_{F})$  which follows from the local approximation implicit in the DMFT for isotropic systems [23]. The most recent photoemission data [6] confirm this result.

The surface quasiparticle spectra for SrVO<sub>3</sub> are shown in Figs. 3(b) and 3(c). The lower Hubbard peak of the  $d_{xz,yz}$  states is clearly visible already for U = 4 eV because of the narrower local density of states in the first layer. A larger U shifts the satellite to higher binding energies. The comparison with the spectra shown in Fig. 3(a) demonstrates that correlation effects for a fixed value of U are stronger at the surface than in the bulk: The coherent peak near  $E_F$  is narrower at the surface and the incoherent satellite feature is more pronounced than in the bulk, in agreement with experiment [5,6].

The surface quasiparticle density of  $d_{xy}$  states in Fig. 3(c) is intermediate between  $N_b(\omega)$  and  $N_s(\omega)$  for  $d_{xz,yz}$ . Although there is little single-electron hybridiza-



FIG. 3. Quasiparticle density of states of SrVO<sub>3</sub> derived from DMFT. (a) Bulk  $t_{2g}$  states, (b) surface  $d_{xz,yz}$  states, and (c) surface  $d_{xy}$  states. Solid curves: U = 4.3 eV; dot-dashed curves: U = 4.0 eV; dashed curves: bare densities as in Fig. 1.

tion between  $t_{2g}$  bands, the local Coulomb interaction mixes them so that the  $d_{xy}$  surface spectrum involves contributions arising from the more strongly correlated  $d_{xz,yz}$ states. Another consequence of the anisotropic surface self-energy is the correlation-induced charge transfer between subbands [20]. Here, we find that 0.06 electrons are shifted from the  $d_{xy}$  to the  $d_{xz,yz}$  bands. The coupling between narrow and wide bands is a genuine multiband effect and underlines the fact that singleparticle bands in the presence of local Coulomb interactions cannot be considered independently.

Note that the many-body reduction of the quasiparticle band width is much larger than the surface-induced oneelectron band narrowing. On the other hand, since the onsite Coulomb energy is not far from the critical value for a metal-insulator transition, the band narrowing substantially enhances the influence of correlations at the surface. It would be interesting to perform angle-resolved photoemission measurements to determine the correlationinduced band narrowing of the SrVO<sub>3</sub>  $t_{2g}$  bands. For instance, the energy at  $\overline{\Gamma}$  should be only a few tenths of an eV below  $E_F$  instead of 1 eV as predicted by the LDA. Accordingly, the true  $t_{2g}$  bands should be considerably flatter than the single-particle bands. Also, measurements using polarized light could help to separate correlation effects in the  $d_{xy}$  and  $d_{xz,yz}$  bands.

We finally comment on the difference between CaVO<sub>3</sub> and SrVO<sub>3</sub>. According to bulk LDA calculations for CaRuO<sub>3</sub> [24], orthorhombic distortions cause a slight narrowing of the  $t_{2g}$  bands and a broadening of the Van Hove singularity above  $E_F$ . The same trend is found in CaVO<sub>3</sub> [25]. Assuming the same on-site Coulomb energy for the  $V^{4+}$  ions in CaVO<sub>3</sub> and SrVO<sub>3</sub>, this effect implies a weak transfer of spectral weight from the coherent to the incoherent peak, in agreement with the recent photoemission data [5,6] and DMFT calculations [25]. At the surface, however, such a shift of spectral weight should be more pronounced because of the band narrowing discussed above, in particular, since U/W is rather large. This effect is indeed observed in the photoemission spectra [5,6]. For a more detailed analysis, it would be important to carry out electronic structure calculations for CaVO<sub>3</sub> surfaces to investigate orthorhombic distortions and possible reconstructions. The latter presumably would reduce hopping also within the  $d_{xy}$  band, thereby enhancing surface correlations. Also, studies of incomplete screening of U at surfaces would be useful.

In summary, we have performed DMFT quasiparticle calculations for SrVO<sub>3</sub> in the bulk and at the surface. As a result of the planar nature of the  $t_{2g}$  states and the surface narrowing of the local density of states on-site correlation effects are more pronounced at the surface than in the bulk, in agreement with photoemission data. The two-dimensional character of *d* states near  $E_F$  is one of the hallmarks of transition metal oxides. The surface-induced enhancement of correlation effects discussed in the present work should therefore be a phenomenon observable in many materials.

I thank A. Bringer for useful discussions and A. I. Lichtenstein for the QMC-DMFT code. I also thank S. Biermann for comments and for bringing Ref. [6] to my attention.

*Note added.*—After completion of this work, analogous QMC-DMFT calculations were reported for bulk  $SrVO_3$  and  $CaVO_3$  [25], demonstrating the similarity of these isoelectronic perovskite materials.

- [1] A. Fujimori et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 69, 1796 (1992).
- [2] K. Morikawa *et al.*, Phys. Rev. B **52**, 13711 (1995); I. H. Inoue *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **74**, 2539 (1995).
- [3] M. Onada, H. Ohta, and H. Nagasawa, Solid State Commun. 79, 281 (1991).
- [4] A. Fukushima *et al.*, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. **63**, 409 (1994);
   N. Shirakawa *et al.*, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. **64**, 4824 (1995);
   I. H. Inoue *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **88**, 236403 (2002).
- [5] K. Maiti, D. D. Sarma, M. J. Rozenberg, I. H. Inoue, H. Makino, O. Goto, M. Pedio, and R. Cimino, Europhys. Lett. 55, 246 (2001).
- [6] A. Sekiyama, H. Fujiwara, S. Imada, H. Eisaki, S. I. Uchida, K. Takegahara, H. Harima, Y. Saitoh, and S. Suga, cond-mat/0206471.
- [7] K. Fujioka et al., Phys. Rev. B 56, 6380 (1997).
- [8] K. Maiti and D. D. Sarma, Phys. Rev. B 61, 2525 (2000);
   K. Maiti, P. Mahadevan, and D. D. Sarma, Phys. Rev. Lett. 80, 2885 (1998).
- [9] A. Liebsch (to be published).
- [10] A. P. Mackenzie *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **78**, 2271 (1997);
   T. Yokoya *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **78**, 2272 (1997), and references herein.
- [11] K. M. Shen *et al.*, Phys. Rev. B **64**, 180502(R) (2001);
  A. Liebsch, Phys. Rev. Lett. **87**, 239701 (2001);
  R. Matzdorf *et al.*, Science **289**, 746 (2000); Phys. Rev. B **65**, 085404 (2002).
- [12] M. Imada, A. Fujimori, and Y. Tokura, Rev. Mod. Phys. 70, 1039 (1998).
- [13] A. Georges, G. Kotliar, W. Krauth, and M. J. Rozenberg, Rev. Mod. Phys. 68, 13 (1996).
- [14] K. Held et al., in Quantum Simulations of Complex Many-Body Systems: From Theory to Algorithms, edited by J. Grotendorst, D. Marks, and A. Muramatsu, NIC Series (John von Neumann Institute for Computing, Julich, Germany, 2002), Vol. 10, p. 175.
- [15] M. Potthoff and W. Nolting, Phys. Rev. B 60, 7834 (1999); Z. Phys. B 104, 265 (1997).
- [16] D. Vollhardt, in *Correlated Electron Systems*, edited by V. J. Emery (World Scientific, Singapore, 1993).
- [17] Th. Pruschke, M. Jarrell, and J. K. Freericks, Adv. Phys. 44, 187 (1995).
- [18] K. Takegahara, J. Electron Spectrosc. Relat. Phenom. 66, 303 (1994).
- [19] D. Kalkstein and P. Soven, Surf. Sci. 26, 85 (1971).
- [20] A. Liebsch and A. Lichtenstein, Phys. Rev. Lett. 84, 1591 (2001).
- [21] M. Jarrell and J. E. Gubernatis, Phys. Rep. **269**, 133 (1996).
- [22] J. Zaanen and G. A. Sawatzky, J. Solid State Chem. 88, 8 (1990); T. Mizokawa and A. Fujimori, Phys. Rev. B 54, 5368 (1996).
- [23] E. Müller-Hartmann, Z. Phys. 74, 507 (1989).
- [24] I. I. Mazin and D. J. Singh, Phys. Rev. B 56, 2556 (1997).
- [25] I. A. Nekrasov et al., cond-mat/0211508.