

# NIH Public Access

**Author Manuscript** 

AIDS Care. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2010 August 1.

## Published in final edited form as:

AIDS Care. 2009 August ; 21(8): 953–966. doi:10.1080/09540120802626212.

## A Systematic Review Comparing Antiretroviral Adherence Descriptive and Intervention Studies

Margarete Sandelowski, PhD, RN, FAAN [Boshamer Distinguished Professor], University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill School of Nursing

**Corrine I. Voils, PhD [Research Health Science Specialist]**, Health Services Research & Development Service, Durham Veterans Affairs Medical Center & Assistant Professor of Medicine, Duke University Medical Center

Yunkyung Chang, PhD, RN [Social Research Specialist], and University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill School of Nursing

## Eun-Jeong Lee, MPH, RN [Doctoral Student]

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill School of Nursing

## Abstract

We examined the extent to which studies aimed at testing interventions to improve antiretroviral adherence have targeted the facilitators of and barriers known to affect adherence. Of the 88 reports reviewed, 41 were reports of descriptive studies conducted with U.S. HIV-positive women and 47 were reports of intervention studies conducted with U.S. HIV-positive persons. We extracted from the descriptive studies all findings addressing any factor linked to antiretroviral adherence and from the intervention studies, information on the nature of the intervention, the adherence problem targeted, the persons targeted for the intervention, and the intervention outcomes desired. We discerned congruence between the prominence of substance abuse as a factor identified in the descriptive studies as a barrier to adherence and its prominence as the problem most addressed in those reports of intervention studies that specified the problems targeted for intervention. We also discerned congruence between the prominence of family and provider support as factors identified in the descriptive studies as facilitators of adherence and the presence of social support as an intervention component and outcome variable. Less discernible in the reports of intervention studies was specific attention to other factors prominent in the descriptive studies, which may be due to the complex nature of the problem, individualistic and rationalist slant of interventions, or simply the ways interventions were presented. Our review raises issues about niche standardization and intervention tailoring, targeting, and fidelity.

Reviews of descriptive studies have shown the many and varied factors influencing antiretroviral adherence (e.g., Ammassari et al., 2002; Mills et al., 2006; Vervoort, Borleffs, Hoepelman, & Grypdonck, 2007). Reviews of intervention studies indicate that the active component has yet to be identified that will produce consistently desirable adherence rates (e.g., Rueda et al., 2006; Rivet Amico, Harman, & Johnson, 2006; Simoni, Pearson, Pantalone, Marks, & Crepaz, 2006). The use of diverse measurements of adherence (Liu et al., 2001; Mannheimer et al., 2008; Paterson, Potoski, & Capitano, 2002), and recent findings that the levels of adherence required to achieve viral suppression and prevent drug resistance may vary with drug regimen (e.g., Bangsberg et al., 2006), complicate efforts to understand and improve adherence.

corresponding author: Contact information: #7460 Carrington Hall, Chapel Hill, NC 27599; Tel: 919.966.4298; FAX: 919.843.9969; Email: msandelo@email.unc.edu.

Intervention studies ought to be firmly grounded in empirically-based understandings of the problems to be targeted (Sidani & Braden, 1998). However, the congruence between factors identified through empirical studies to influence adherence and the targets of interventions designed to enhance adherence has not yet been explored. The purpose of the systematic review reported here was to ascertain the extent to which a set of antiretroviral adherence intervention studies targeted the facilitators of and barriers to adherence identified in a set of antiretroviral adherence descriptive studies.

## Method

This systematic review was conducted in the course of a research project aimed at developing methods to synthesize qualitative and quantitative research findings. Search and retrieval procedures were thus selected to accommodate methodological objectives, not to answer research questions about antiretroviral adherence per se. The goal was to obtain a well-defined but manageable sample of research reports with sufficient methodological diversity (i.e., different types of qualitative and quantitative studies) and topical uniformity (all on antiretroviral adherence) to permit the intensive analysis and experimentation with technique required in a study of methods. Specifically, we confined our search to published reports as unpublished reports contained no methodological variation not found in published reports. We confined our search to studies conducted in the United States as national differences in healthcare delivery and attitudes toward HIV infection would have added a level of complexity to analysis that would not advance the methodological aims of our study. We confined our search for descriptive studies to those conducted with women only. Reviews of studies conducted with men and women or men only (e.g., those cited above) indicate no factor influencing adherence not also found in women-only studies. Yet, additional factors are found in women-only studies (e.g., those related to reproduction and mothering); indeed, women's unique circumstances are often cited in reports of women-only studies as justifications for studying women only. Men-only descriptive studies can, thus, be considered a subset of women-only descriptive studies. Antiretroviral intervention studies conducted with women and men can be assumed to address factors common to both. All of these sampling delimitations constitute limitations to the review presented here, yet all systematic reviews entail such limitations (Sandelowski, Voils, & Barroso, 2007).

Forty-one reports of antiretroviral adherence descriptive (14 qualitative and 27 quantitative observational) studies were retrieved between June, 2005 and October, 2007. Forty-seven reports of antiretroviral intervention studies were retrieved in October, 2007. We used electronic databases housing citations to literature across the health, behavioral, and social sciences, including Academic Search Elite, Alternative Press Index, Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials, Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL), PsycINFO, PubMed, and Sociological Abstracts. We used variations (e.g., extensions, truncations, synonyms) of the following search terms to accommodate the distinctive features of each of these databases: HIV, AIDS, antiretroviral, adherence, compliance, clinical trial, intervention, and experiment. We augmented electronic searching with the use of ancestry and descendency approaches (Cooper, 1998), in addition to hand-searching the print collections of our university libraries for books, anthologies, and other documents on HIV/AIDS likely to include relevant reports.

### **Antiretroviral Descriptive Studies**

Reports of descriptive studies were eligible for inclusion if they were of empirical qualitative and quantitative observational studies of adherence to antiretroviral therapy conducted with HIV-positive women of any race/ethnicity, class, or nationality living in the United States, and published in or after 1997 (when protease inhibitors became part of the standard of care) to the

present (2007). We accepted reports of studies conducted with HIV-positive women that included HIV-positive men if an explicit research purpose was to compare women and men in relation to antiretroviral adherence and if the report contained findings focused on women.

We extracted from the qualitative studies all findings addressing any aspect of antiretroviral adherence and calculated their frequency effect sizes, or the number of reports containing a finding divided by the total number of reports (Sandelowski & Barroso, 2007). We extracted from the quantitative observational studies all relationships addressing adherence and another variable, and computed their effect sizes. The effect size index that we used is Cohen's d (Cohen, 1988), which is the standardized difference between two means (in these studies, the difference in mean adherence between two groups, such as drug users versus non-users). Calculating d enables comparisons to be made across studies because all differences in means are on the same scale. A value of 0 indicates no difference between means. Cohen suggested that values of .20, .50, and .80 represent small, medium, and large differences, respectively. Because we would not expect interventions to address factors that have not been shown to be related to adherence, we excluded findings that did not meet the criterion for a "small" effect size (i.e., any d < .20) in quantitative research. We used effect sizes instead of p-values, which are influenced by sample size to a greater degree (Rosenthal, 1984). We also excluded findings for which there was insufficient information for calculating an effect size even after contacting the authors. Whenever only bivariate or only multivariable findings were addressed in a report, we retained those findings, but in reports in which the same variable was addressed in both bivariate and multivariable analyses, we used the bivariate relationship. This is because an effect size for a partial relationship may be greater or lesser, depending on which variables are chosen to be included in the multivariable model. Multivariable findings, therefore, are less comparable than bivariate findings because they estimate different partial relationships (Voils, Barroso, Hasselblad, & Sandelowski, 2007).

We then grouped these findings into categories and the findings within these categories into factors favoring adherence and nonadherence. (Tables showing the results of these data extractions and computations are available from the first author on request.)

#### **Antiretroviral Intervention Studies**

Reports of intervention studies were eligible for inclusion if they were of studies published in or after 2000 to the present (2007) of any kind of intervention designed to improve antiretroviral adherence in any HIV-positive person living in the United States. We selected the year 2000 to accommodate the time it likely took for findings from adherence descriptive studies to make their way into adherence intervention studies. We included intervention studies conducted with both women and men as too few adherence intervention studies have targeted women only. We included all designs, including randomized controlled trials, nonrandomized studies, and within-subject studies with pre-post tests. We excluded reports of pilot studies if a later report testing the same intervention in a larger sample was available so that each intervention would be counted only once.

We extracted and tabulated information from each report on the nature of the intervention, the adherence problem targeted, the persons targeted for the intervention, and the intervention outcomes desired. Table 1 shows the results of this work.

#### **Report Quality and Procedural Validity**

All reports were reviewed by the first two authors, and all extractions, tabulations, and computations of findings were checked by at least two members of the research team, or discussed until consensus was reached in meetings of the entire research team. No reports of qualitative studies that met selection criteria were excluded for reasons of quality per se as any

methodological shortcomings they showed did not invalidate their findings (Sandelowski & Barroso, 2007). Entire reports of quantitative observational studies that met selection criteria, or specific findings in these reports, were excluded only if it was not possible (even with attempts to contact authors) to calculate effect sizes. No reports of intervention studies that met selection criteria were excluded as our goal was not to summarize their findings, but rather the problems and persons targeted for intervention and the interventions tested.

## Results

#### Factors Influencing Adherence in Descriptive Studies

The categories of factors most prominent (i.e., appearing in the largest number of different reports) in favoring adherence were: sociocultural factors (14 reports); relationship with healthcare provider (10 reports); attitudes toward and beliefs about HIV infection and antiretroviral therapy (9 reports); and, medication regimen and motivation/inclination to act (8 reports each). The factors favoring adherence appearing in the largest number of different reports across categories were: having a supportive family and having a supportive provider (6 reports each), and believing in the effectiveness and safety of antiretroviral therapy (5 reports).

The categories of factors most prominent in favoring nonadherence were: medication regimen (14 reports); sociocultural factors, and attitudes toward and beliefs about HIV infection and antiretroviral therapy (12 reports each), and substance abuse (including drug and alcohol abuse, 11 reports). In addition to the 11 reports comprising the substance abuse category, the most prominent factors across categories favoring nonadherence were: having side effects (13 reports); not wanting others to know HIV status (7 reports); and, uncertainty about the effectiveness and safety of antiretroviral medications and having no symptoms from HIV (6 reports each).

#### Factors Targeted in the Intervention Studies

The primary focus of the intervention reports—to improve adherence to antiretroviral therapy —was operationalized in different ways (e.g., adherence to dose or schedule, as measured by number or percentage of missed pills, self-report, pill counts, or Medication Event Monitoring System caps). Of the 47 reports, 23 featured outcome measures in addition to adherence, such as self-efficacy, social support, and a range of mental health indicators.

As shown in Table 1, the only persons targeted for intervention were HIV-positive persons themselves. Among HIV-positive persons, the primary targets were those with "poor" adherence (11 reports) and having a substance abuse problem (10 reports). In 9 reports, no specific population target was identified other than being HIV-positive. Women were the sole targets in 7 reports (including 1 report featuring women with substance abuse). Of the 40 remaining reports of studies with both men and women participants, in only 5 was sex difference addressed in relation to outcomes; in none of these were sex differences found.

Also as shown in Table 1, 20 of the 47 intervention reports target one specific problem favoring nonadherence, such as forgetting to take medications, depression, substance abuse, risky behaviors, or low health literacy. The problem most targeted in these studies was substance abuse (7 reports, excluding 2 reports that target persons with substance abuse but do not explicitly present substance abuse as an adherence problem). In contrast, the remaining 27 reports target either no specific factor (18 reports) at all or multiple factors influencing adherence (9 reports). The reports with no specific adherence factor identified typically contain reviews of the interventions previously tested to enhance adherence, not of factors found to

Page 5

favor adherence or nonadherence. The reports featuring multiple factors contain reviews of a host of factors shown or surmised to be related to nonadherence.

As shown in Tables 1 and 2, the interventions tested were either single- or multiple-component. Single-component interventions addressed one domain, such as direct observation of behavior, while multiple-component interventions addressed at least two domains, such as cognitivebehavioral elements directed toward knowledge, beliefs, social support, and behavior. Cognitive-behavioral interventions were the most prevalent interventions, used to address both single problems favoring nonadherence (e.g., substance abuse) and multiple problems favoring nonadherence (e.g., lack of knowledge, forgetting, low self-efficacy).

As shown in Table 2, the most prevalent problem-intervention combination was the *no specific problem/multiple-component* intervention (16 reports), followed by the *single problem/single-component* intervention (12 reports), *multiple problem/multiple-component* intervention (9 reports), *single problem/multiple-component* intervention (8 reports), *no specific problem/single-component* (3 reports, including 1 report testing a single- and a multiple-component intervention), and *multiple problem/single-component* (1 report testing a single- and a multiple-component intervention). Substance abuse is an example of a single problem addressed by single- and multiple-component interventions, including direct observation or administration, contingency management, and cognitive-behavioral therapies. Direct observation or administration is an example of the same intervention tested to address multiple problems, no specific problem (other than poor adherence), and one specific problem (substance abuse).

## Discussion

#### Extent to Which Intervention Studies Targeted Factors Found to Influence Adherence

Substance abuse was prominent as a barrier to adherence in descriptive studies and as a target of intervention in intervention studies. Family and provider support was prominent as a facilitator of adherence in descriptive studies, while social support was an explicit intervention component in 12 of the intervention studies and an outcome variable in one additional study. Social support was an implicit component in all of the interventions as any cognitive-behavioral or psycho-educational intervention constitutes a kind of social support.

Side effects were the most prominent factor found to impede adherence, yet interventions to target them were less discernible in the intervention reports. However, the reduction/ elimination of side effects may be more amenable to pharmacological than to cognitive-behavioral or psycho-educational interventions directed toward managing side effects. Despite the prominence of the social environment in facilitating or impeding adherence in the descriptive studies, interventions were directed solely toward HIV-positive persons, not, for example, the healthcare system or societal norms. Intervention components were largely in the cognitive domain, even when directed toward non-cognitive elements as, for example, when an educational, not a social, intervention was directed at teaching HIV-positive persons how to mobilize social support.

Researchers have argued that the overly individualistic and rationalist orientation to antiretroviral adherence cannot adequately address the "hybrid medico-experiential ways of knowing" (Mykhalovskiy, 2008, p. 138) of HIV-positive persons; the daily "health work" (Bresalier et al., 2002) of which antiretroviral adherence is only a part; the varieties of strategic nonadherence that paradoxically permit overall adherence (Broyles, Colbert, & Erlen, 2005); and, the episodic, dose-by-dose nature of medicine taking (Ryan & Wagner, 2003; Wilson, Hutchinson, & Holzemer, 2002). Both descriptive and intervention studies leaned toward the cognitive, but that lean may not capture the ongoing work of medicine taking and the larger sociocultural arena in which this work is embedded.

#### Targeting, Tailoring, and Fidelity in Antiretroviral Intervention Studies

Our review raises questions regarding the nature of the interventions themselves. Multiplecomponent interventions were typically presented in reports as especially suitable for addressing the many factors operating against antiretroviral adherence under the apparent assumption that complexity of problem must be matched to complexity of solution: that a shotgun approach to intervention (i.e., involving multiple components, in addition to multiple delivery channels and/or types of providers) will actually hit the one or more problems in play for any one person receiving the intervention at any given time. In 27 of the 47 intervention reports, either no specific problem or an array of problems influencing adherence were addressed. Interventions targeting many problems at once are as non-specific as the ones targeting no problem at all.

When authors described their interventions as tailored, they were most often actually referring to targeting the problems identified by individual participants as impeding their adherence (e.g., forgetting, lack of self-efficacy) with that component of the intervention that was to be mobilized whenever that problem was identified (e.g., memory prompting, skill-building). In some cases, they were referring to an intervention tailored to a particular medication regimen, not a problem or person per se. Targeting and tailoring were further indistinct when researchers described their interventions as intending to meet the special needs of entire social groups, such as women, Latinos, or substance abusers. Researchers were here invoking what Epstein (2007, Ch. 7) referred to as "niche standardization," whereby both the universalism of assuming that all HIV-positive people are the same, and the individualism of assuming that HIV-positive persons share no common ground with each other, are avoided. Tailoring in the intervention studies reviewed involved interventions delivered to individuals seen to have one primary group membership. At issue is which niches are the least likely to minimize differences essential to enhancing antiretroviral adherence.

The essential incompatibility between intervention tailoring and fidelity (a demonstration that an intervention was delivered as planned) complicates the implementation of tailored interventions. In most cases of tailoring, interventions were customized in a scripted way: for example, if the person expressed a knowledge deficit, the intervention protocol dictated what the interventionist was to do or say to reduce it. Unclear was how far tailoring could go before intervention fidelity was undermined. Intervention fidelity was addressed in 17 of the 27 reports of tailored interventions, but in none of them was the incongruity addressed between the tailoring of interventions and the standardization of interventions required to optimize intervention fidelity.

This raises the questions of how tailored an intervention can be before intervention fidelity is impossible to achieve and researchers can no longer claim they tested any one intervention at all, and whether any multiple-component intervention can be tested as a single experimental condition. Although tailored interventions have been found to be generally superior to control conditions (Richards et al., 2007), yet to be sufficiently differentiated in intervention research is whether it was the content, function, or form of the intervention that was standardized or, conversely, altered to fit (Campbell et al., 2000; Castro, Barrera, & Martinez, 2004; Hawe, Shiell, & Riley, 2004) some individual, social group, or situation. In tailored intervention studies, outcomes would need to be differentiated by the problem identified and the intervention component implemented in response to that problem.

In conclusion, our review suggests some congruence between factors targeted in antiretroviral adherence intervention studies and those identified in descriptive studies as influencing adherence. Lack of congruence may be due to the complex nature of the adherence problem, individualistic and rationalist orientation toward intervention, or simply the way interventions were presented. Our review also raises questions about the relationships among intervention

tailoring, targeting, and fidelity and, in the case of antiretroviral adherence interventions in particular, about how interventions are best structured to capture the ongoing work of adherence and variations in participants, social environment, and type of medication regimen, and to maximize the ability to draw credible conclusions about the effectiveness of interventions for achieving desirable adherence rates.

#### Acknowledgments

The method study referred to here, "Integrating qualitative & quantitative research findings," is funded by the National Institute of Nursing Research, National Institutes of Health (5R01NR004907, June 3, 2005-March 31, 2010). This material is the result of work supported, in part, with resources and facilities at the Veterans Affairs Medical Center in Durham, NC. Views expressed in this article are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the Department of Veterans Affairs.

## References

*Notes*. <sup>d</sup> = adherence descriptive study; <sup>i</sup> =adherence intervention study

- d. Abel E, Painter L. Factors that influence adherence to HIV medications: Perceptions of women and health care providers. Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care 2003;14:61–69. [PubMed: 12953613]
- Ammassari A, Trotta MP, Murri R, Castelli F, Narciso P, Noto P, et al. Correlates and predictors of adherence to highly active antiretroviral therapy: Overview of published literature. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2002;31(suppl 3):S123–S127. [PubMed: 12562034]
- i. Andrade AS, McGruder HF, Wu AW, Celano SA, Skolasky RL Jr, Selnes OA, et al. A programmable prompting device improves adherence to highly active antiretroviral therapy in HIV-infected subjects with memory impairment. Clinical Infectious Diseases 2005;41:875–882. [PubMed: 16107989]
- Bangsberg D, Acosta EP, Guptad R, Guzmana D, Rileya ED, Harrigan PR, et al. Adherence–resistance relationships for protease and non-nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors explained by virological fitness. AIDS 2006;20:223–231. [PubMed: 16511415]
- d. Berg KM, Demas PA, Howard AA, Schoenbaum EE, Gourevitch MN, Arnsten JH. Gender differences in factors associated with adherence to antiretroviral therapy. Journal of General Internal Medicine 2004;19:1111–1117. [PubMed: 15566440]
- Bresalier, M.; Gillis, L.; McClure, C.; McCoy, L.; Mykhalovskiy, E.; Taylor, D., et al. Making care visible: Antiretroviral therapy and the health work of people living with HIV/AIDS. 2002. Retrieved April 5, 2008 from http://cbr.cbrc.net/files/1052421030/makingcarevisible.pdf
- Broyles LM, Colbert AM, Erlen JA. Medication practice and feminist thought: A theoretical and ethical response to adherence in HIV/AIDS. Bioethics 2005;19:362–78. [PubMed: 16222853]
- Campbell M, Fitzpatrick R, Haines A, Kinmonth AL, Sandercock P, Spiegelhalter D, et al. Framework for design and evaluation of complex interventions to improve health. British Medical Journal 2000;321:694–696. [PubMed: 10987780]
- Castro FG, Barrera M, Martinez CR. The cultural adaptation of prevention interventions: Resolving tensions between fidelity and fit. Prevention Science 2004;5:41–45. [PubMed: 15058911]
- Cohen, J. Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences. 2. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum; 1988.
- i. Collier AC, Ribaudo H, Mukherjee AL, Feinberg J, Fischl MA, Chesney M. A randomized study of serial telephone call support to increase adherence and thereby improve virologic outcome in persons initiating antiretroviral therapy. Journal of Infectious Diseases 2005;192:1398–1406. [PubMed: 16170757]
- Cooper, H. Synthesizing research: A guide for literature reviews. 3. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage; 1998.
- i. Dalessandro M, Conti CM, Gambi F, Falasca K, Doyle R, Conti P, et al. Antidepressant therapy can improve adherence to antiretroviral regimens among HIV-infected and depressed patients. Journal of Clinical Psychopharmacology 2007;27:58–61. [PubMed: 17224714]

- i. DeFino M, Clark J, Mogyoros D, Shuter J. Predictors of virologic success in patients completing a structured antiretroviral adherence program. Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care 2004;15:60–67. [PubMed: 15358926]
- d. Demas PA, Thea DM, Weedon J, McWayne J, Bamji M, Lambert G, et al. Adherence to Zidovudine for the prevention of perinatal transmission in HIV-infected pregnant women: The impact of social network factors, side effects, and perceived treatment efficacy. Women & Health 2005;42:99–115.
- i. Dieckhaus KD, Odesina V. Outcomes of a multifaceted medication adherence intervention for HIVpositive patients. AIDS Patient Care and STDS 2007;21:81–91. [PubMed: 17328657]
- i. DiIorio C, Resnicow K, McDonnell M, Soet J, McCarty F, Yeager K. Using motivational interviewing to promote adherence to antiretroviral medications: A pilot study. Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care 2003;14:52–62. [PubMed: 12698766]
- d. Douglass JL, Sowell RL, Phillips KD. Using Peplau's theory to examine the psychosocial factors associated with HIV-infected women's difficulty in taking their medications. Journal of Theory Construction and Testing 2003;7:10–17.
- d. Durante AJ, Bova CA, Fennie KP, Danvers KA, Holness DR, Burgess JD, et al. Home-based study of anti-HIV drug regimen adherence among HIV-infected women: Feasibility and preliminary results. AIDS Care 2003;15:103–115. [PubMed: 12655838]
- d. Edwards LV. Perceived social support and HIV/AIDS medication adherence among African American women. Qualitative Health Research 2006;16:679–691. [PubMed: 16611972]
- Epstein, S. Inclusion: The politics of difference in medical research. Chicago: University of Chicago Press; 2007.
- d. Erlen JA, Sereika SM, Cook RL, Hunt SC. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy among women with HIV infection. JOGNN: Journal of Obstetric, Gynecologic, & Neonatal Nursing 2002;31:470–477.
- d. Gant LM, Welch LA. Voices less heard: HIV-positive African American women, medication adherence, sexual abuse, and self-care. Journal of HIV/AIDS and Social Services 2004;3:67–91.
- i. Garland WH, Wohl AR, Valencia R, Witt MD, Squires K, Kovacs A, et al. The acceptability of a directly-administered antiretroviral therapy (DAART) intervention among patients in public HIV clinics in Los Angeles, California. AIDS Care 2007;19:159–167. [PubMed: 17364394]
- i. Golin CE, Earp J, Tien HC, Stewart P, Porter C, Howie L. A 2-arm, randomized, controlled trial of a motivational interviewing-based intervention to improve adherence to antiretroviral therapy (ART) among patients failing or initiating ART. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2006;42:42–51. [PubMed: 16763491]
- i. Harwell JI, Flanigan TP, Mitty JA, Macalino GE, Caliendo AM, Ingersoll J, et al. Directly observed antiretroviral therapy to reduce genital tract and plasma HIV-1 RNA in women with poor adherence. AIDS 2003;17:1990–1993. [PubMed: 12960835]
- Hawe P, Shiell A, Riley T. Complex interventions: How "out of control" can a randomized controlled trial be? British Medical Journal 2004;328:1561–1563. [PubMed: 15217878]
- i. Holzemer WL, Bakken S, Portillo CJ, Grimes R, Welch J, Wantland D, et al. Testing a nurse-tailored HIV medication adherence intervention. Nursing Research 2006;55:189–197. [PubMed: 16708043]
- d. Howard AA, Arnsten JH, Lo Y, Vlahov D, Rich JD, Schuman P, et al. A prospective study of adherence and viral load in a large multi-center cohort of HIV-infected women. AIDS 2002;16:2175–2182. [PubMed: 12409739]
- d. Ickovics JR, Wilson TE, Royce RA, Minkoff HL, Fernandez MI, Fox-Tierney R, et al. Prenatal and postpartum zidovudine adherence among pregnant women with HIV results of a MEMS substudy from the Perinatal Guidelines Evaluation Project. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2002;30:311–315. [PubMed: 12131568]
- i. Ironson G, Weiss S, Lydston D, Ishii M, Jones D, Asthana D, et al. The impact of improved self-efficacy on HIV viral load and distress in culturally diverse women living with AIDS: The SMART/EST Women's Project. AIDS Care 2005;17:222–236. [PubMed: 15763716]
- i. Javanbakht M, Prosser P, Grimes T, Weinstein M, Farthing C. Efficacy of an individualized adherence support program with contingent reinforcement among nonadherent HIV-positive patients: results from a randomized trial. Journal of the International Association of Physicians in AIDS Care 2006;5:143–150. [PubMed: 17101806]

- i. Jones DL, McPherson-Baker S, Lydston D, Camille J, Brondolo E, Tobin JN, et al. Efficacy of a group medication adherence intervention among HIV positive women: The SMART/EST Women's Project. AIDS and Behavior 2007;11:79–86. [PubMed: 17028992]
- Kalichman SC, Cherry J, Cain D. Nurse-delivered antiretroviral treatment adherence intervention for people with low literacy skills and living with HIV/AIDS. Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care 2005;16:3–15. [PubMed: 16433105]
- d. Kalichman SC, Rompa D, DiFonzo K, Simpson D, Austin J, Luke W, et al. HIV treatment adherence in women living with HIV/AIDS: Research based on the Information-Motivation-Behavioral Skills Model of Health Behavior. Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care 2001;12:58–67. [PubMed: 11486721]
- d. Laine C, Newschaffer CJ, Zhang D, Cosler L, Hauck WW, Turner BJ. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy by pregnant women infected with Human Immunodeficiency Virus: A pharmacy claimsbased analysis. Obstetrics and Gynecology 2000;95:167–173. [PubMed: 10674574]
- i. Levin TR, Klibanov OM, Axelrod P, Finley GL, Gray A, Holdsworth C, et al. A randomized trial of educational materials, pillboxes, and mailings to improve adherence with antiretroviral therapy in an inner city HIV clinic. Journal of Clinical Outcomes Management 2006;13:217–221.
- Liu H, Golin CE, Miller LG, Hays RD, Beck K, Sanandaji S, et al. A comparison study of multiple measures of adherence to HIV protease inhibitors. Annals of Internal Medicine 2001;134:968–977. [PubMed: 11352698]
- d. Liu H, Longshore D, Williams JK, Rivkin I, Loeb T, Warda US, et al. Substance abuse and medication adherence among HIV-positive women with histories of child sexual abuse. AIDS and Behavior 2006;10:279–286. [PubMed: 16501869]
- i. Lucas GM, Mullen BA, McCaul ME, Weidle PJ, Hader S, Moore RD. Adherence, drug use, and treatment failure in a methadone-clinic-based program of directly administered antiretroviral therapy. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2007;21:564–574. [PubMed: 17711381]
- Lucas GM, Mullen BA, Weidle PJ, Hader S, McCaul ME, Moore RD. Directly administered antiretroviral therapy in methadone clinics is associated with improved HIV treatment outcomes, compared with outcomes among concurrent comparison groups. Clinical Infectious Diseases 2006;42:1628–1635. [PubMed: 16652321]
- i. Lyon ME, Trexler C, Akpan-Townsend C, Pao M, Selden K, Fletcher J, et al. A family group approach to increasing adherence to therapy in HIV-infected youths: Results of a pilot project. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2003;17:299–308. [PubMed: 12880493]
- Macalino GE, Hogan JW, Mitty JA, Bazerman LB, Delong AK, Loewenthal H, et al. A randomized clinical trial of community-based directly observed therapy as an adherence intervention for HAART among substance users. AIDS 2007;21:1473–1477. [PubMed: 17589194]
- i. Mann T. Effects of future writing and optimism on health behaviors in HIV-infected women. Annals of Behavioral Medicine 2001;23:26–33. [PubMed: 11302353]
- Mannheimer SB, Morse E, Matts JP, Andrews L, Child C, Schmetter B, et al. Sustained benefit from a long-term antiretroviral adherence intervention: Results of a large randomized clinical trial. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2006;43(Suppl 1):S41–S47. [PubMed: 17091022]
- Mannheimer S, Thackeray L, Huppler Hullsiek K, Chesney M, Gardner EM, Wu AW, et al. A randomized comparison of two instruments for measuring self-reported antiretroviral adherence. AIDS Care 2008;20:161–169. [PubMed: 18293124]
- Margolin A, Avants SK, Warburton LA, Hawkins KA, Shi J. A randomized clinical trial of a manualguided risk reduction intervention for HIV-positive injection drug users. Health Psychology 2003;22:223–228. [PubMed: 12683743]
- McCance-Katz EF, Gourevitch MN, Arnsten J, Sarlo J, Rainey P, Jatlow P. Modified directly observed therapy (MDOT) for injection drug users with HIV disease. American Journal on Addictions 2002;11:271–278. [PubMed: 12584870]
- d. Mellins CA, Havens JF, McCaskill EO, Leu CS, Brudney K, Chesney MA. Mental health, substance use and disclosure are significantly associated with the medical treatment adherence of HIVinfected mothers. Psychology, Health & Medicine 2002;7:451–460.

- d. Mellins CA, Kang E, Leu CS, Havens JF, Chesney MA. Longitudinal study of mental health and psychosocial predictors of medical treatment adherence in mothers living with HIV disease. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2003;17:407–416. [PubMed: 13678542]
- Milam J, Richardson JL, McCutchan A, Stoyanoff S, Weiss J, Kemper C, et al. Effect of a brief antiretroviral adherence intervention delivered by HIV care providers. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2005;40:356–363. [PubMed: 16249712]
- Mills, EJ.; Nachega, JB.; Bangsberg, DR.; Singh, S.; Rachlis, B.; Wu, P., et al. Adherence to HAART: A systematic review of developed and developing nation patient-reported barriers and facilitators. PloS Medicine. 2006. Open access online at www.plosmedicine.org
- d. Misener TR, Sowell RL. HIV infected women's decisions to take antiretrovirals. Western Journal of Nursing Research 1998;20:431–447. [PubMed: 9686522]
- d. Mostashari F, Riley E, Selwyn PA, Altice FL. Acceptance and adherence with antiretroviral therapy among HIV-infected women in a correctional facility. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 1998;18:341–348.
- d. Murphy DA, Greenwell L, Hoffman D. Factors associated with antiretroviral adherence among HIVinfected women with children. Women & Health 2002;36:97–111.
- i. Murphy DA, Lu MC, Martin D, Hoffman D, Marelich WD. Results of a pilot intervention trial to improve antiretroviral adherence among HIV-positive patients. Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care 2002;13:57–69. [PubMed: 12469544]
- i. Murphy DA, Marelich WD, Rappaport NB, Hoffman D, Farthing C. Results of an antiretroviral adherence intervention: STAR (staying healthy: Taking antiretrovirals regularly). Journal of the International Association of Physicians in AIDS Care 2007;6(2):113–124. [PubMed: 17538003]
- Mykhalovskiy E. Beyond decision making: Class, community organizations, and the healthwork of people living with HIV/AIDS. Contributions from institutional ethnographic research. Medical Anthropology 2008;27(2):136–163. [PubMed: 18464127]
- d. Owen-Smith A, Diclemente R, Wingood G. Complementary and alternative medicine use decreases adherence to HAART in HIV-positive women. AIDS Care 2007;19:589–593. [PubMed: 17505918]
- i. Parry MF, Wright P, Stewart J, McLeod GX, Tucker J, Weinberg AR. Impact of an adherence program on the health and outlook of HIV-infected patients failing antiretroviral therapy. Journal of the International Association of Physicians in AIDS Care 2005;4(3):59–65. [PubMed: 16867973]
- i. Parsons JT, Rosof E, Punzalan JC, Di Maria L. Integration of motivational interviewing and cognitive behavioral therapy to improve HIV medication adherence and reduce substance use among HIVpositive men and women: Results of a pilot project. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2005;19:31–39. [PubMed: 15665633]
- d. Patel PN, Grimes RM. Symptom exacerbation and adherence to antiretroviral therapy during the menstrual cycle: A pilot study. Infectious Diseases in Obstetrics and Gynecology 2006;2006:1–4.
- Paterson DL, Potoski B, Capitano B. Measurement of adherence to antiretroviral medications. JAIDS: Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2002;31:S103–S106.
- d. Phillips KD, Moneyham L, Murdaugh C, Boyd MR, Tavakoli A, Jackson K, et al. Sleep disturbance and depression as barriers to adherence. Clinical Nursing Research 2005;14:273–293. [PubMed: 15995155]
- d+i. Powell-Cope GM, White J, Henkelman EJ, Turner BJ. Qualitative and quantitative assessments of HAART adherence of substance-abusing women. AIDS Care 2003;15:239–249. [PubMed: 12856345]
- i. Puccio JA, Belzer M, Olson J, Martinez M, Salata C, Tucker D, et al. The use of cell phone reminder calls for assisting HIV-infected adolescents and young adults to adhere to highly active antiretroviral therapy: A pilot study. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2006;20:438–444. [PubMed: 16789857]
- Rathbun RC, Farmer KC, Stephens JR, Lockhart SM. Impact of an adherence clinic on behavioral outcomes and virologic response in treatment of HIV infection: A prospective, randomized, controlled pilot study. Clinical Therapeutics 2005;27:199–209. [PubMed: 15811483]
- i. Rawlings MK, Thompson MA, Farthing CF, Brown LS, Racine J, Scott RC, et al. Impact of an educational program on efficacy and adherence with a twice-daily lamivudine/zidovudine/abacavir regimen in underrepresented HIV-infected patients. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2003;34:174–183. [PubMed: 14526206]

- d. Remien RH, Hirky AE, Johnson MO, Weinhardt LS, Whittier D, Le GM. Adherence to medication treatment: A qualitative study of facilitators and barriers among a diverse sample of HIV+ men and women in four U.S. cities. AIDS and Behavior 2003;7:61–72. [PubMed: 14534391]
- Remien RH, Stirratt MJ, Dolezal C, Dognin JS, Wagner GJ, Carballo-Dieguez A, et al. Couple-focused support to improve HIV medication adherence: A randomized controlled trial. AIDS 2005;19:807– 814. [PubMed: 15867495]
- Reynolds NR, Testa MA, Su M, Chesney MA, Neidig JL, Frank I, et al. Telephone support to improve antiretroviral medication adherence: A multisite, randomized controlled trial. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2007;47:62–68. [PubMed: 17891043]
- Richards KC, Enderlin CA, Beck C, McSweeney JC, Jones TC, Roberson PK. Tailored biobehavioral interventions: A literature review and synthesis. Research and Theory for Nursing Practice 2007;21:271–285. [PubMed: 18236771]
- d. Richter DL, Sowell RL, Pluto DM. Attitudes toward antiretroviral therapy among African American women. American Journal of Health Behavior 2002;26:25–33. [PubMed: 11795602]
- i. Rigsby MO, Rosen MI, Beauvais JE, Cramer JA, Rainey PM, O'Malley SS, et al. Cue-dose training with monetary reinforcement: pilot study of an antiretroviral adherence intervention. Journal of General Internal Medicine 2000;15:841–847. [PubMed: 11119180]
- Rivet Amico K, Harman JJ, Johnson BT. Efficacy of antiretroviral therapy adherence interventions: A research synthesis of trials, 1996 to 2004. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2006;41:285–297. [PubMed: 16540929]
- d. Roberts KJ, Mann T. Barriers to antiretroviral medication adherence in HIV-infected women. AIDS Care 2000;12:377–386. [PubMed: 11091770]
- d. Roberts KJ, Mann T. Adherence to antiretroviral medications in HIV/AIDS care: A narrative exploration of one woman's foray into intentional nonadherence. Health Care for Women International 2003;24:552–564. [PubMed: 12851174]
- i. Rosen MI, Dieckhaus K, McMahon TJ, Valdes B, Petry NM, Cramer J, et al. Improved adherence with contingency management. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2007;21:30–40. [PubMed: 17263651]
- Rosenthal, R. Meta-analytic procedures for social research. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage; 1984.
- Rueda S, Park-Wylie LY, Bayoumi AM, Tynan AM, Antoniou TA, Rourke SB, et al. Patient support and education for promoting adherence to highly active antiretroviral therapy for HIV/AIDS. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews 2006;3:CD001442, 1–38.
- Ryan GW, Wagner GJ. Pill taking "routinization": A critical factor to understanding episodic medication adherence. AIDS Care 2003;15:795–806. [PubMed: 14617501]
- Safren SA, Hendriksen ES, Desousa N, Boswell SL, Mayer KH. Use of an on-line pager system to increase adherence to antiretroviral medications. AIDS Care 2003;15:787–793. [PubMed: 14617500]
- Samet JH, Horton NJ, Meli S, Dukes K, Tripps T, Sullivan L, et al. A randomized controlled trial to enhance antiretroviral therapy adherence in patients with a history of alcohol problems. Antiviral Therapy 2005;10:83–93. [PubMed: 15751766]
- Sandelowski, M.; Barroso, J. Handbook for synthesizing qualitative research. New York: Springer; 2007.
- Sandelowski M, Voils CI, Barroso J. Comparability work and the management of difference in research synthesis studies. Social Science & Medicine 2007;64:236–247. [PubMed: 17029691]
- d. Sankar A, Luborsky M, Schuman P, Roberts G. Adherence discourse among African-American women taking HAART. AIDS Care 2002;14:203–218. [PubMed: 11940279]
- d. Schrimshaw EW, Siegel K, Lekas HM. Changes in attitudes toward antiviral medication: A comparison of women living with HIV/AIDS in the pre-HAART and HAART eras. AIDS and Behavior 2005;9:267–279. [PubMed: 16088368]
- d. Schuman P, Ohmit SE, Cohen M, Sacks HS, Richardson J, Young M, et al. Prescription of and adherence to antiretroviral therapy among women with AIDS. AIDS and Behavior 2001;5:371– 378.
- d. Sharpe TT, Lee LM, Nakashima AK, Elam-Evans LD, Fleming PL. Crack cocaine use and adherence to antiretroviral treatment among HIV-infected Black women. Journal of Community Health 2004;29:117–127. [PubMed: 15065731]

- Sidani, S.; Braden, CJ. Evaluating nursing interventions: A theory-driven approach. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage; 1998.
- d. Siegel K, Gorey E. HIV-infected women: Barriers to AZT use. Social Science & Medicine 1997;45:15– 22. [PubMed: 9203266]
- d. Siegel K, Lekas HM, Schrimshaw EW, Johnson JK. Factors associated with HIV-infected women's use or intention to use AZT during pregnancy. AIDS Education and Prevention 2001;13:189–206. [PubMed: 11459356]
- i. Simoni JM, Pantalone DW, Plummer MD, Huang B. A randomized controlled trial of a peer support intervention targeting antiretroviral medication adherence and depressive symptomatology in HIVpositive men and women. Health Psychology 2007;26:488–495. [PubMed: 17605569]
- Simoni JM, Pearson CR, Pantalone DW, Marks G, Crepaz N. Efficacy of interventions in improving highly active antiretroviral therapy adherence and HIV-1 viral load. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2006;43(suppl 1):S23–S35. [PubMed: 17133201]
- i. Smith SR, Rublein JC, Marcus C, Brock TP, Chesney MA. A medication self-management program to improve adherence to HIV therapy regimens. Patient Education and Counseling 2003;50:187– 199. [PubMed: 12781934]
- i. Sorensen JL, Haug NA, Delucchi KL, Gruber V, Kletter E, Batki SL, et al. Voucher reinforcement improves medication adherence in HIV-positive methadone patients: a randomized trial. Drug and Alcohol Dependence 2007;88:54–63. [PubMed: 17056206]
- d. Sowell RL, Murdaugh CL, Addy C, Moneyham L, Tavokoli A, Misener T. Preventing perinatal human immunodeficiency virus transmission: Factors influencing women's intentions toward zidovudine therapy. Southern Medical Journal 2001;94:1177–1184. [PubMed: 11811856]
- d. Sowell RL, Phillips KD, Murdaugh C, Tovokali A. Health care providers' influence on HIV-infected women's beliefs and intentions related to AZT therapy. Clinical Nursing Research 1999;8:336– 354. [PubMed: 10855102]
- d. Sowell RL, Phillips KD, Seals BF, Misener TR, Rush C. HIV-infected women's experiences and beliefs related to AZT therapy during pregnancy. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2001;15:201–209. [PubMed: 11359662]
- d. Stone VE, Hogan JW, Schuman P, Rompalo AM, Howard AA, Korkontzelou C, et al. Antiretroviral regimen complexity, self-reported adherence, and HIV patients' understanding of their regimens: Survey of women in the HER Study. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2001;28:124–131. [PubMed: 11588505]
- d. Turner BJ, Laine C, Cosler L, Hauck WW. Relationship of gender, depression, and health care delivery with antiretroviral adherence in HIV-infected drug users. Journal of General Internal Medicine 2003;18:248–257. [PubMed: 12709091]
- d. Turner BJ, Newschaffer CJ, Zhang D, Cosler L, Hauck WW. Antiretroviral use and pharmacy-based measurement of adherence in postpartum HIV-infected women. Medical Care 2000;38:911–925. [PubMed: 10982113]
- i. van Servellen G, Nyamathi A, Carpio F, Pearce D, Garcia-Teague L, Herrera G, et al. Effects of a treatment adherence enhancement program on health literacy, patient-provider relationships, and adherence to HAART among low-income HIV-positive Spanish-speaking Latinos. AIDS Patient Care and STDs 2005;19:745–759. [PubMed: 16283835]
- Vervoort SC, Borleffs JC, Hoepelman AI, Grypdonck MH. Adherence in antiretroviral therapy: A review of qualitative studies. AIDS 2007;21:271–281. [PubMed: 17255734]
- i. Visnegarwala F, Rodriguez-Barradass MC, Graviss EA, Caprio M, Nykyforchyn M, Laufman L. Community outreach with weekly delivery of anti-retroviral drugs compared to cognitivebehavioral health care team-based approach to improve adherence among indigent women newly starting HAART. AIDS Care 2006;18:332–338. [PubMed: 16809110]
- Voils CI, Barroso J, Hasselblad V, Sandelowski M. In or out? Methodological considerations for including and excluding findings from a meta-analysis of predictors of antiretroviral adherence in HIV-positive women. Journal of Advanced Nursing 2007;59:163–177. [PubMed: 17543011]
- Wagner GJ, Kanouse DE, Golinelli D, Miller LG, Daar ES, Witt MD, et al. Cognitive-behavioral intervention to enhance adherence to antiretroviral therapy: a randomized controlled trial (CCTG 578). AIDS 2006;20:1295–1302. [PubMed: 16816559]

- i. Westling E, Garcia K, Mann T. Discovery of meaning and adherence to medications in HIV-infected women. Journal of Health Psychology 2007;12:627–635. [PubMed: 17584813]
- Williams AB, Fennie KP, Bova CA, Burgess JD, Danvers KA, Dieckhaus KD. Home visits to improve adherence to highly active antiretroviral therapy: a randomized controlled trial. Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 2006;42:314–321. [PubMed: 16770291]
- Wilson HS, Hutchinson SA, Holzemer WL. Reconciling incompatibilities: A grounded theory of HIV medication adherence and symptom management. Qualitative Health Research 2002;12:1309– 1322. [PubMed: 12474905]
- d. Wilson TE, Barron Y, Cohen M, Richardson J, Greenblatt R, Sacks HS, et al. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and its association with sexual behavior in a national sample of women with human immunodeficiency virus. Clinical Infectious Diseases 2002;34:529–534. [PubMed: 11797182]
- d. Wilson TE, Ickovics JR, Fernandez MI, Koenig LJ, Walter E. Self-reported zidovudine adherence among pregnant women with human immunodeficiency virus infection in four US states. American Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology 2001;184:1235–1240. [PubMed: 11349194]
- i. Wohl AR, Garland WH, Valencia R, Squires K, Witt MD, Kovacs A, et al. A randomized trial of directly administered antiretroviral therapy and adherence case management intervention. Clinical Infectious Diseases 2006;42:1619–1627. [PubMed: 16652320]
- d. Wood SA, Tobias C, McCree J. Medication adherence for HIV-positive women caring for children: In their own words. AIDS Care 2004;16:909–913. [PubMed: 15385246]
- i. Wyatt GE, Longshore D, Chin D, Carmona JV, Loeb TB, Myers HF, et al. The efficacy of an integrated risk reduction intervention for HIV-positive women with child sexual abuse histories. AIDS and Behavior 2004;8:453–462. [PubMed: 15690118]

_
2
_
_
U
-
-
_
-
-
()
<u> </u>
<
-
5
a
lar
lan
lanu
lanu
lanus
lanus
lanusc
lanusci
lanuscri
lanuscri
lanuscrip
<b>Tanuscript</b>

Sandelowski et al.

Table 1

Intervention, and Target Problem, Population, and Outcome in 47 Intervention Studies

Report	Target problem	Target population	Intervention	Outcome measured in addition to adherence
Andrade et al.	Forgetting	Persons with memory dysfunction	Memory prompting device	
Collier et al	NS	NS	Social support and scripted phone calls	
Dalessandro et al.	Depression	Depressed persons	Antidepressants	
DeFino et al.	NS	Inner-city persons with barriers to adherence	Educational, motivational	
Dieckhaus et al.	NS	Persons with imperfect adherence, at risk for poor adherence	Multi-component (Memory prompting devices, referral, social support, counseling)	
Dilorio et al.	Multiple	Prescribed therapy with at least 1 protease inhibitor	Motivational interviewing	
Garland et al.	NS	Treatment-naive or with no more than 1 regimen failure	Direct administered therapy	Retention and attendance rates
Golin et al.	NS	Persons failing or initiating therapy	Motivational interviewing	Self-efficacy, coping style, satisfaction with care, trust in provider, social support
Harwell et al.	NS	Women with substance abuse and poor adherence	Direct observation	
Holzemer et al.	Multiple	NS	Multi-component (knowledge, medication-taking patterns, role performance, provider relations)	
Ironson et al.	Self-efficacy	Minority women	Cognitive-behavioral-stress management	Psychological wellbeing, self-efficacy
Javanbakht et al.	Multiple	Persons with poor adherence	Case and contingency management	
Jones et al.	Multiple	Women	Cognitive-behavioral-stress management	Coping with stress
Kalichman et al.	Low health literacy	Persons with low health literacy	Informational-motivational-behavioral	Knowledge, intentions to adhere, self-efficacy
Levin et al.	NS	Persons starting new or changing regimen	Multi-component (medication cards, pillboxes, mailing motivational messages)	
Lucas et al., 2006	Substance abuse	Injection drug users on methadone	Directly administered therapy	
Lucas et al., 2007	Substance abuse	Injection drug users on methadone	Directly administered therapy	Time under direct observation, urine drug screening
Lyon et al.	Multiple	Adolescents and young adults	Family & peer group education and support	Knowledge
Macalino et al.	Substance abuse	Substance abusers	Modified direct observation	
Mann	Optimism/pessimism	Women	Writing about positive future	Optimism
Mannheimer et al.	NS	Therapy-naive persons initiating therapy	Social support (medication manager) v. electronic reminder system	
Margolin et al.	Risky sexual & drug-related practices	Injection drug users on methadone	Cognitive-behavioral (information, motivation, skill-building	Sexual & drug-related behavior, addiction severity
McCance-Katz et al.	Substance abuse	Injection drug users on methadone	Modified direct observation	Methadone concentration
Milam et al.	NS	NS	Cognitive-behavioral (preventive messages, education, skill-building, support)	

Report	Target problem	Target population	Intervention	Outcome measured in addition to adherence
Murphy, Lu, et al., 2002	NS	Documented adherence problem	Multi-component (education, behavior change, social support)	Coping, social support, mental health indicators
Murphy, Marelich, et al., 2007	NS	Miss at least 1 dose/week	Social cognitive (knowledge, skill acquisition, self-efficacy, support)	Coping, social support, mental health indicators, substance use, self-efficacy, intention
Parry et al.	Multiple factors	Chronically nonadherent	Cognitive; information, motivation, skill-building	
Parsons et al.	Substance abuse	Substance abusers	Cognitive-behavioral, motivational interviewing	Temptation for drug use
Puccio et al.	Incorporation of therapy into daily routines	Adolescents and young adults	Cell phone reminders	Missed phone calls
Rathbun et al.	NS	NS	Multi-component (education, monitoring, reminder devices)	
Rawlings et al.	Under-represented in research are over- represented among those with HIV	Persons "under-represented" in research	Education and empowerment counseling	
Remien et al.	NS	HIV sero-discordant couples together >6 months $\& < 80\%$ adherence	Couple-based social support	
Reynolds et al.	NS	NS	Telephone calls (self-care strategies)	
Rigsby et al.	Adherence to dose interval	NS	Cue-dose training and/or cash reinforcement	
Rosen et al.	NS	Persons with histories of substance abuse	Contingency management, substance abuse counseling, on-going review of adherence behavior	Substance abuse
Safren et al.	Forgetting	NS	On-line pager reminder system	
Samet et al.	Alcohol abuse	Persons with histories of alcohol abuse	Multi-component (reminder device, enhancement of self-efficacy, discussion of abuse, counseling)	Alcohol consumption
Simoni et al.	Social support, depression	NS	Peer support	Social support, depression
Smith et al.	Self-efficacy	Persons starting or switching to new regimen	Self-management, social cognitive (information, skill-management, social support)	Self-efficacy
Sorensen et al.	Substance abuse	Persons in methadone maintenance program & <80% adherence	Contingency management	Drug use
van Servellen et al.	Poor access and utilization of services, low health literacy	Low-income Spanish-speaking Latinos	Multi-component, culturally congruent (education, quality of life, risk reduction, communication skills, social support)	Health literacy, relationship with provider
Visnegarwala et al.	Indigence, institutionalization of healthcare	Indigent women newly starting therapy	Directly delivered therapy v. healthcare team strategy	Appointments kept
Wagner et al.	NS	Persons initiating or changing ARV therapy	Cognitive-behavioral/motivational (IMB)	
Westling et al.	Discovery of meaning	Low income women	Future (to enhance optimism and cognitive processing) v. neutral writing	Optimism
Williams et al.	NS	NS	Social support	
Wohl et al.	NS	Persons with 1 prior regimen failure	Direct observation v. case management	
Wyatt et al.	Risk behaviors	Women with histories of child sexual abuse	Cognitive-behavioral	Sexual risk reduction
Notes. NS=no specific problem or	target population identified			

NIH-PA Author Manuscript

Sandelowski et al.

NIH-PA Author Manuscript NIH

NIH-PA Author Manuscript

#### Table 2

## Combinations of Single v. Multiple Problems and Single v. Multiple Component Interventions

		Problem(s)
	Single problem	No specific (NS) or multiple (M) problems
Intervention compor	nent(s)	
Single-component	Depression/antidepressants (Dalessandro et al.)	NS/direct observation or administration (Garland et al; Harwell et al.; Wohl et al. <sup><math>a</math></sup> )
	Forgetting/memory prompting device (Andrade et al.; Safren et al.)	M/direct observation or administration (Visnegarwala et al. <sup>a</sup> )
	Substance abuse/direct observation or administration (Lucas et al., 2006, 2007; Macalino et al.; McCance-Katz et al.)	
	Substance abuse/contingency management (Sorensen et al.)	
	Low optimism/writing (Mann)	
	Discovery of meaning/writing (Westling et al.)	
	Adherence to dose interval/cue-dose training (Rigsby et al.)	
	Routinization of therapy/memory prompting device (Puccio et al.)	
Multiple-component	Low literacy/cognitive-behavioral (Kalichman et al.)	NS/M (Collier et al.; DeFino et al.; Dieckhaus et al.; Golin et al.; Levin et al.; Mannheimer et al.; Milam et al.; Murphy, Lu, et al., 2002; Murphy, Marelich, et al., 2007; Rathbun et al.; Remien et al.; Reynolds et al.; Rosen
		et al.; Wagner et al.; Williams et al.; Wohl et al. <sup>a</sup> )
	Self-efficacy/cognitive-behavioral (Ironson et al.; Smith et al.)	
	Substance abuse/cognitive-behavioral (Parsons et al.; Samet et al.)	
	Risk behaviors/cognitive-behavioral (Margolin et al.; Wyatt et al.)	M/M (DiIorio et al.; Holzemer et al.; Javanbakht et al.; Jones et al.; Lyon et al; Parry et al.; Simoni et al.; van Servellen et al.; Visnegarwala et al. <sup>a</sup> )
	Under-represented in research/education and empowerment counseling (Rawlings et al.)	

 $^{a} \textit{Note.}$  In these studies, two interventions were tested in addition to a standard-of-care condition.