

KLENA, PAMELA LYNN, D.M.A. *Toward a More Inclusive Profession: A Qualitative Study of Female Wind Band Conductors.* (2020)  
Directed by Dr. John R. Locke and Dr. Kevin M. Geraldi. 63 pp.

Women are a minority group in the profession of wind band conducting. The purpose of this study, therefore, is to interview a select group of nationally-recognized women who are wind band conductors to glean insights into their experiences and perspectives. These distinguished women share their motivations, career and life experiences, and advice in non-confidential interviews. The profession of wind band conducting is enlightened by the participants who provided insights and context into their experiences, frames of reference, and viewpoints as women.

Three primary themes emerge from the data. Identity-masking and performance attire for female conductors is the first theme. Participants share experiences, wisdom, and opinions to contribute to this complex discussion. In the second theme, the participants describe personal experiences and provide wisdom for navigating both overt and subtle discrimination in the field of music. In the final theme, the participants state a desire to connect with and invest in future generations of women in the conducting profession. The researcher also presents secondary themes that emerge from the data and may be important avenues for future research.

TOWARD A MORE INCLUSIVE PROFESSION: A QUALITATIVE STUDY  
OF FEMALE WIND BAND CONDUCTORS

by

Pamela Lynn Klena

A Dissertation Submitted to  
the Faculty of The Graduate School at  
The University of North Carolina at Greensboro  
in Partial Fulfillment  
of the Requirements of the Degree  
Doctor of Musical Arts

Greensboro  
2020

Approved by

---

Committee Co-Chair

---

Committee Co-Chair

APPROVAL PAGE

This dissertation, written by Pamela Lynn Klena, has been approved by the following committee of the Faculty of The Graduate School at The University of North Carolina at Greensboro.

Committee Co-Chair \_\_\_\_\_  
John R. Locke

Committee Co-Chair \_\_\_\_\_  
Kevin M. Gerald

Committee Members \_\_\_\_\_  
Jennifer S. Walter

\_\_\_\_\_  
Welborn E. Young

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date of Acceptance by Committee

June 8, 2020  
Date of Final Oral Examination

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My sincerest appreciation to Drs. John R. Locke, Kevin M. Gerald, Jennifer S. Walter, and Welborn E. Young for their guidance and support through this degree. Thank you for your continued contributions to our field. I hope to hold this “splendid torch” for my students as you have for me.

To Professor Paula Crider, Dr. Elizabeth Peterson, Dr. Caroline Beatty, Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner, Dr. Emily Threinen, Dr. Mary Schneider, and Dr. Patricia Hoy for your words of truth, vulnerability, and empowerment for generations to come. Thank you for your strong resolve and hope for the future.

To Dr. David R. Holsinger, Professor Jack E. Williamson, Dr. James Batcheller, Dr. Mark Bailey, Mr. Tom DeLozier, Mr. George Hayden, Mr. Lee Huffaker, and Mr. Bill Burke for your continued encouragement, teaching, and fostering of my conducting and music education.

Finally, to family and friends: your love and support through this journey have proven invaluable. From the young girl who dreamed of becoming a conductor to the music educator I am today, I have you to thank.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER	
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
Statement of Purpose .....	1
Related Research.....	1
Procedures.....	4
Researcher Identity .....	7
II. THE PARTICIPANTS .....	10
Delimitations of Participants.....	10
Biographical Sketches of the Participants.....	11
III. IDENTITY-MASKING AND ATTIRE.....	24
The Visual Aspect.....	25
The Practicality Aspect.....	27
Confidence in Identity.....	29
IV. NAVIGATING OVERT AND SUBTLE DISCRIMINATION.....	31
V. INVESTING IN THE CONDUCTING PROFESSION.....	39
Advice for Conductors .....	39
The Teaching of Conducting .....	43
Hope for a More Inclusive Profession .....	45
VI. IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY .....	47
Commissioning with Purpose .....	47
Tokenism.....	48
Nurturing Healthy Relationships with Women in the Field .....	49
Issues Surrounding Tone of Voice for Female Conductors.....	50
Oversaturation in the Field of Collegiate Wind Conducting .....	50
The Universal Fear: Am I Good Enough? .....	51
Wisdom and Suggestions from Female Conductors to “Win the Position”.....	52

Celebration, Connection, and Mentorship for Continued Growth in the Field.....	52
VII. SUMMARY .....	54
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	57
APPENDIX A. CONSENT TO ACT AS A HUMAN SUBJECT .....	60
APPENDIX B. INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL .....	63

CHAPTER I  
INTRODUCTION

**Statement of Purpose**

Women are a minority group in the profession of collegiate wind band conducting. Although more women have obtained leadership positions in recent years, the ratio between male and female conductors continues to be disproportional.<sup>1</sup> The purpose of this study is to empower female conductors and enlighten those in the music profession by revealing and discussing issues important to women who are wind band conductors. The data gathered from participating female conductors were analyzed for themes and thus provided the basis of this research. The emergent themes from the data serve to benefit the profession of wind band conducting as a whole and function as a foundation for future research.

**Related Research**

The research available revealed that there was a large discrepancy between the percentage of male and female conductors in the collegiate wind band field. In a 1998 study titled “Women as Leaders of Collegiate Bands, 1950-1980,” Cheryl Jackson presented the historical background of women in the field of college bands. Jackson discussed how discrimination laws assisted in the hiring of women but failed to mandate

---

<sup>1</sup> Shannon Shaker, “Paucity of Female College Band Directors as Faculty and Conductors at National Conferences in the United States, 2017-2018,” DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2020.

attitudes legally. She stressed that the celebration of trailblazing women and continued awareness of gender issues within the field moved us toward advocacy of gender equity.<sup>2</sup>

Women on the college band podium have been considered a phenomenon. The discovery of the names of those women who were pioneers in the field of college band conducting is important. These women did not allow biased attitudes to keep them from careers as conductors of collegiate bands. Having celebrated the silver anniversary of the passage of Title IX, a look back can help us to under the present with more depth of meaning.<sup>3</sup>

Deborah Sheldon and Linda Hartley examined the gender of head band directors selected to perform at the Midwest Clinic from 1947 to 2008. In the 62 years of the conference, a total of 94 collegiate ensembles performed. All 94 collegiate ensembles listed a male head conductor; thus, zero were female conductors.<sup>4</sup> In her 2020 study, Shannon Shaker provided updated data revealing the paucity of female conductors at the Midwest Band and Orchestra Clinic and the College Band Directors National Association, both located within the United States. From 2009 to 2018, 23 collegiate ensembles performed at the Midwest Band and Orchestra Clinic. Of those collegiate ensembles, 20 listed male head conductors and three listed female head conductors. These data did not represent assistant or guest conductors.<sup>5</sup> Between the years of 1993 and 2019, the College Band Director National Association (CBDNA) Biennial Conference met a total of 14 times. Of the 14 conferences, 125 collegiate ensembles

---

<sup>2</sup> Cheryl Jackson, "Women as Leaders of Collegiate Bands, 1850-1980," *College Music Symposium* 38 (1998): 118-25.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid.

<sup>4</sup> Deborah A. Sheldon and Linda A. Hartley, "What Color Is Your Baton, Girl? Gender and Ethnicity in Band Conducting," *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 192 (2012): 39-52.

<sup>5</sup> Shannon Shaker, "Paucity of Female College Band Directors as Faculty and Conductors at National Conferences in the United States, 2017-2018," DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2020.



performed. Seven were conducted by female conductors representing 5.3% of the total. Additionally, Shaker's research revealed that only 11.3 percent of all university band directors in the United States were female at the time of the study, according to the data counted in the College Music Society (CMS) *Directory of Music Faculties, 2017–2018*.<sup>6</sup> This statistic has increased from 5.2 percent, as presented in Elizabeth Gould's 2003 study, covering the years from 1976 to 2000.<sup>7</sup> This 6.1 percent increase in female collegiate band directors over 52 years indicated progress, though these statistics continued to reveal sex parity among collegiate band directors has been non-existent.

Elizabeth Gould, in her 2003 study titled "Cultural Contexts of Exclusion: Women College Band Directors," addressed this slow pace of change through the cultural analysis of music, performance, and collegiate bands. Gould stated that investigating the perspectives of those who were marginalized may provide valuable insights to ignite a more progressive change.<sup>8</sup> In a study published in 2001, "Identification and Application of the Concept of Role Model: Perceptions of Women College Band Directors," based on the results of this study, Gould concluded that the presence of a role model was essential to positive professional identity and thus encouraged a formalized peer-exchange program organized by and within the profession.<sup>9</sup> Since this study, numerous programs have been initiated to mentor and develop female conductors, which allowed them to reach their full musical potential.

---

<sup>6</sup> Shannon Shaker, "Paucity of Female College Band Directors as Faculty and Conductors at National Conferences in the United States, 2017-2018." DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2020.

<sup>7</sup> E. S. Gould, "Cultural contexts of exclusion: Women college band directors," *Research and Issues in Music Education*, 1(2003): 1–17.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid.

<sup>9</sup> E. S. Gould, "Identification and application of the concept of role model: Perceptions of women college band directors," *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, 20 (2001): 14–18.

In a recent 2019 study titled “Patriarchal Killjoys: The Experience of Three (Women) University Band Directors,” Megan Foley presented the results of a qualitative study interviewing three female collegiate band directors. The researcher identified three themes related to the negotiating of identities, discrepancies between role and identity, and implementation of multiple strategies to be effective at the university position.<sup>10</sup>

A 2002 study by Brydie-Leigh Bartleet titled “Re-embodiment of the ‘Gendered Podium’” examined the historical and societal precedence of men developing the role of conductor. With the masculine body defined as the norm, the feminine body was then defined by the difference and perceived as other.<sup>11</sup> Bartleet’s study sought to dissolve the concept of the conductor as a male dictator to the ensemble, but rather redefined the role as a member who worked collaboratively with the ensemble. Bartleet called for further research to assist women in this elite profession to combat the notion of ‘otherness.’<sup>12</sup>

The previously mentioned studies called for continued research concerning the advancement of female conductors in the field of wind band. Through the gathering and examination of data collected from widely-respected female conductors, this study served to reveal and discuss important issues to empower female conductors further and enlighten the field of music.

## Procedures

The non-confidential data for this study were collected through recorded *FaceTime*<sup>®</sup> interviews of willing participants. The use of recorded *FaceTime*<sup>®</sup> interviews

---

<sup>10</sup> Megan J. Foley, “Patriarchal Killjoys: The Experiences of Three (Women) University Band Directors,” DMA diss., Boston University, 2019.

<sup>11</sup> Brydie-Leigh Bartleet, “Re-embodiment of the Gendered Podium,” *Context: A Journal of Music Research*, 23 (2002): 49–57.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid.

allowed for detailed personal accounts from the participants and provided a more private setting to investigate sensitive topics further. The interviews were semi-structured and consisted of key questions that help to define areas to be explored, and provided flexibility to the interviewer or interviewee to pursue an idea or response in more detail. This flexibility in structure supported the discovery of information that was deemed important to the participant and thus proved valuable to the study.

The participants were asked the following interview questions:

- When did you decide that you wanted to become a conductor?
- What were the most influential classes in your academic studies? Why?
- Do you have someone who served as your mentor?
- What is your proudest moment as a conductor?
- Tell me about your work/life balance. Do you have any advice?
- Was there ever a time when you felt discriminated against due to your gender?
- Has there ever been a time when you felt you had to mask your femininity on the podium?
- Do women bring anything unique or important to the field of conducting?
- As a minority in the field, do you have any advice for future female conductors?
- Are there any changes that you would like to see in the teaching of conducting?
- Do you have further ambitions that you still wish to accomplish?

These questions were piloted in a semi-structured interview with two willing participants, both female collegiate band directors, who were not included in the final study. These pilot interviews provided valuable information concerning the order of the questions, time allotment for the interview, and questions that needed further refinement before the study. The author originally perceived that the interviews would last 30 minutes. The two piloted interviews conducted lasted 47 minutes and 69 minutes in length, indicating that additional time should be designated for each interview. Additionally, the author noted that the responses to questions about discrimination, advice, and ambition required the most time during the interviews. By adjusting the order of the interview questions, the questions that required more discussion were broken up by the remaining questions. The results/answers of the pilot interviews were not included in the study.

Before the interview, willing participants were provided with information concerning the study and given details concerning consent and privacy that were approved by the Institutional Review Board at The University of North Carolina at Greensboro. Information concerning the technical logistics of the interview was sent to the participant, and if requested, the participants received the interview questions in advance. An interview schedule was then confirmed with the participant, which allowed adequate time and flexibility for the interview questions and discussion.

During the recorded *FaceTime*<sup>®</sup> interview, the interviewer remained focused on key questions and subject areas but asked follow-up questions where clarification or elaboration was needed. The interviews ranged from 42 to 78 minutes, with the average length being 60 minutes. After the interview, the participants also received a follow-up

email acknowledging their involvement in the study, which prompted four participants to respond with further thoughts or clarification concerning the interview.

Throughout the study, participants were identified by name with answers attributed to them to support the themes that emerged from the data. During the interviews, if participants wished to preserve the anonymity of third parties during personal accounts and would simply say, “this is off the record.” This privacy was respected, third parties remained anonymous, and accounts given under the premise of “off the record” were not included in this study. Data, such as audio and files, were stored digitally on a password-protected workstation. All information obtained in this study is strictly confidential unless disclosure is required by law.

The interviews were conducted through the application, *FaceTime*<sup>®</sup>. The recording of these interviews allowed for accurate transcription. The interviews were transcribed manually and sorted with analysis software, *NVivo*<sup>®</sup>, which allowed for all data collected to be stored in one location with tools to categorize and classify data. This software aided in the sorting of themes, which allowed for the discovery of connections between data and unveiled new opportunities for further research.

### **Researcher Identity**

Women have been and continue to be a minority in the field of collegiate wind band conducting. I chose to pursue this vein of research and seek out those minority voices because I am a member of this profession. In her 2003 study, Elizabeth Gould stated:

Change in any culture is a slow process. This is compounded when members of the culture either do not acknowledge the need for change or are simply reticent to try alternatives to a system that has afforded great success to some individuals. The perspectives of others (those who may be marginalized due to race, gender, or sexuality, for instance) in that profession, however, may provide valuable insights in relationship to change.<sup>13</sup>

I am a 34-year-old White female who is a wind band conductor and music educator at a mid-sized university in the area of Detroit, Michigan. I have been in my current position for one year. Before teaching in higher education, I was a private school teacher for four years, having taught elementary general music, beginning, middle, and high school band, middle school orchestra, high school jazz band, percussion ensemble, music appreciation, and pep bands, and was the director of school musicals. I also served for five years as a graduate teaching assistant at two universities while completing graduate school. All three institutions I attended were predominantly White institutions. As a female conductor, entering the collegiate wind band profession initially as a graduate student, I yearned for community. Every experience was new, every struggle was raw, and I found myself experiencing isolation. As I embarked on further graduate studies as a doctoral student, I believed that it was imperative to listen intently, observe diligently, and gain different perspectives on how women in the profession were progressing. Throughout doctoral school, I had many questions, which included: Is change needed for women in wind band conducting? If so, how do I advocate for change? What does change look like in the profession of wind band conducting? How do women fit in? How do I fit in? I wanted to pursue these ideas as a capstone experience for

---

<sup>13</sup> E. S. Gould, "Cultural contexts of exclusion: Women college band directors," *Research and Issues in Music Education*, 1 (2003): 1–17.

doctoral study. So, I devised a qualitative study where I formulated more specific questions, rooted in research and curiosity. I then interviewed women in wind band conducting and collected their experiences to examine.

CHAPTER II  
THE PARTICIPANTS

**Delimitations of Participants**

The participants selected for this study were chosen based on a series of specific characteristics developed by the researcher. The participants self-identified as female and held, or currently hold, a position as a wind band conductor in a collegiate environment. The ensembles, under the direction of these women, must have performed in a national or regional College Band Directors National Association (CBDNA) conference, the Midwest International Band Clinic, or a statewide music education conference such as Texas Music Education Association (TMEA). The participants were also selected based on publications or presentations at the previously mentioned regional, state, or national conferences. The significance of this delimitation is that the ensembles, publications, or presentations have been peer-reviewed and thus validated by the profession.

The following women met the specified delimitations set forth by the researcher and willingly participated in the study:

- Dr. Caroline Beatty, *Director of Bands at Texas State University*
- Professor Paula A. Crider, *Professor Emerita at the University of Texas at Austin*
- Dr. Patricia Hoy, *Director of Bands Emerita at Northern Arizona University*



- Dr. Elizabeth Peterson, *Associate Director of Bands at the University of Illinois*
- Dr. Mary K. Schneider, *Director of Bands at Eastern Michigan University*
- Dr. Emily C. Threinen, *Director of Bands at the University of Minnesota*
- Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner, *Director of Bands at the University of Georgia*

### **Biographical Sketches of the Participants**

*Dr. Caroline Beatty* knew from an early age that she wanted to be a band director and began pursuing her music career in high school.

I had a sister that was a drum major, and so, of course, I wanted to do the same thing. Being in band was something I was going to do since I was in elementary school. In high school I was like, “This is my thing. This is what I want my major to be.” I always wanted to just go teach high school band. That’s what my goal was: getting in and out of my bachelor’s degree.<sup>14</sup>

After earning her Bachelor of Music Education degree from The University of Texas at Austin, she served as an assistant director at a high school in suburban Houston for five years. Jerry Junkin invited her to attend a conducting symposium at the University of Texas at Austin; Dr. Beatty attended and continued to attend the symposium for five consecutive years before deciding to pursue her master’s degree at that institution.<sup>15</sup>

After completing her master’s degree in conducting, Dr. Beatty served as assistant director at a suburban Houston high school for eight years. During her time as a high school band director, Dr. Beatty continued to participate in conducting symposia,

---

<sup>14</sup> Carolina Beatty, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

studying with conductors such as Mallory Thompson, Craig Kirchhoff, Michael Haithcock, and Larry Rachleff. Dr. Beatty found these conductors to be highly influential in her decision to pursue a doctorate and teach in higher education.<sup>16</sup>

I learned a lot more in a place where I could make mistakes, doing the high school job. I was having to teach really hard literature, so I learned so much from that. And then I was ready to do something else and I thought, “Hey, I have something I can offer the people that are coming through both as performance majors and music ed majors” because I’ve been out there and I’ve done it so I think I felt like I had something to offer.<sup>17</sup>

After serving as Assistant Director of Bands at Northwestern State University–Louisiana, Dr. Beatty pursued her doctorate in conducting at the University of Michigan.

Dr. Beatty currently serves as the Director of Bands at Texas State University. In this position, Dr. Beatty teaches conducting and band literature courses, conducts the Wind Symphony, and oversees general administrative and musical responsibilities of the Texas State University band program.<sup>18</sup> Dr. Beatty is interested in additional travel and learning how music is taught in other places.

It’s an adventure to go do this thing that I do in other places. We have our TMEA Region Bands. I do several of those events every year. Occasionally, I get to do an All-State. Those are starting to come in more for me to get outside of my state of Texas. And that’s exciting for me just because it’s going and doing it somewhere else and seeing what people are doing and hear how are we doing band in other places. I like to do that. I like the adventure of it. So that’s a goal: to just keep doing what I’m doing but getting to do it in places I’ve never been before. Those things are starting to happen, so that’s fun.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> Caroline Beatty, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

<sup>17</sup> Ibid.

<sup>18</sup> *Caroline Beatty*, 2019, <https://www.music.txstate.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

<sup>19</sup> Caroline Beatty, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

Dr. Beatty is an active member of the College Band Directors National Association, Texas Music Educators Association, Texas Bandmasters Association, and Phi Beta Mu International Band Fraternity.<sup>20</sup>

*Professor Paula Crider* decided to pursue a career in music education at the end of her sophomore year at the University of Southern Mississippi. She was influenced to pursue music education by her band director, Bill Moody.<sup>21</sup> She was always inspired by classes that addressed the deeper purposes of composition. When asked about her most influential academic courses, Professor Crider says the following:

Music history; my professor was a brilliant musicologist; his passion for the subject was contagious! Systems of Philosophy and Logic; opened my mind to far deeper levels of analytical thought. Also, Form and Analysis. I loved discovering the “whys” of composition.<sup>22</sup>

Professor Crider began her graduate studies at the University of Texas at Austin in music education while concurrently teaching band and general music at Allen Junior High School.<sup>23</sup> In 1970, she completed her graduate degree and was named Director of Bands at Crockett High School in Austin, Texas, making Professor Paula Crider the first female to serve as Director of Bands at a class 5A high school. The Crockett High School bands, under her direction, earned twelve consecutive University Interscholastic League Sweepstakes awards in musical excellence and were nationally recognized on the concert stage.<sup>24</sup> Professor Crider joined the faculty of The University of Texas in 1982 as the

---

<sup>20</sup> *Caroline Beatty*, 2019, <https://www.music.txstate.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

<sup>21</sup> Paula Crider, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 21).

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>23</sup> Keith Davis, “Renowned Band Director,” <https://www.ithaca.edu> (accessed August 9, 2019).

<sup>24</sup> Phi Beta Mu, “Paula Crider-Class of 2011,” <https://www.pbmalph.org> (accessed August 11, 2019).

Assistant Director of the Longhorn Bands, and in 1995 she was named Director of Bands. She remained at The University of Texas until her retirement. During her teaching career at The University of Texas, she was twice awarded the “Eyes of Texas” Award for distinguished teaching.<sup>25</sup>

Professor Crider has published articles in *The Instrumentalist*, *The Band Director’s Guide*, the *National Band Association Journal*, and numerous manuals for marching band methods, instrumental conducting, and brass techniques.<sup>26</sup> She is also the co-author of the *Masterwork Studies* series and the author of *The Conductor’s Legacy: Conductors on Conducting for Wind Band*. Professor Crider is a past President of the National Band Association and the American Bandmasters Association. When asked if Professor Crider still had further ambitions that she wished to accomplish, she replied, “I want to continue to improve my musical artistry. My goal is to be a life-long learner.”<sup>27</sup>

**Dr. Patricia Hoy** began her career as a performing musician. With two degrees in woodwind performance from the University of Redlands in California, she played in the studios of Los Angeles and worked as a woodwind consultant for a high school band.

A colleague from college invited me to come and work with his high school band as a woodwind consultant. Well, he finally convinced me to start taking some rehearsals. He pretended he had to leave and then he’d have me take rehearsals, and I really enjoyed it. In the long run he convinced me to get my teaching credential, but conducting still wasn’t primary at that point. I soon realized that with conducting I could use my musical expression in a similar way to what I was doing when I was playing my instrument.<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> Phi Beta Mu, “Paula Crider-Class of 2011,” <https://www.pbmalph.org> (accessed August 11, 2019).

<sup>26</sup> Paula A. Crider, “Paula A. Crider,” <https://www.nafme.org> (accessed August 9, 2019).

<sup>27</sup> Paula A. Crider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 21).

<sup>28</sup> Patricia Hoy, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 7).

Dr. Hoy earned her Doctor of Musical Arts degree in conducting at the University of Arizona. She served as Director of Bands at Northern Arizona University, where her ensembles performed at both regional and national conferences of the College Band Directors National Association. After serving as the director of the School of the Performing Arts, Dr. Hoy then transitioned to other administrative positions as Director of the School of Music at the University of Memphis and Vice President for Academic Affairs at Boston Conservatory.<sup>29</sup>

After a career as a professional musician, educator, and administrator for over 30 years, Dr. Hoy wrote *Arts Awareness*, a book that presented her worldview perspective founded upon her arts experiences. In her book, she shared creative concepts that helped to synthesize creating art with teaching, leading, succeeding, and living a more fulfilling life.<sup>30</sup> *Arts Awareness* now serves as the foundation of Dr. Hoy's media appearances, speaking engagements, workshops, and consulting services.

I just recently started some online classes about soft skills that you can learn through the arts. I teach how to incorporate deep learning in a regular rehearsal situation. Through a deeper learning, students can actually take what they're learning about how music works and transfer it to other things in their lives so that when they leave, they go, "Oh, that's the same as this," and they can start applying those things.<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup> Patricia Hoy, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 7).

<sup>30</sup> *About Patricia Hoy*, 2013, <http://artsawareness.com/about-patricia-hoy/> (accessed August 11, 2019).

<sup>31</sup> Patricia Hoy, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 7).

Dr. Hoy has a passion and a deep drive for educating the general public on the relevance of arts in higher education and how arts-based training can foster creativity, critical thinking, and decision-making.<sup>32</sup>

*Dr. Elizabeth Peterson* began her undergraduate studies at the University of Michigan as an English major. Throughout her first two years of college, she was a member of the marching band but still desired to play serious music and eventually transferred to the School of Music.<sup>33</sup> She studied trumpet with Armando Ghitalla and graduated from the University of Michigan with a Bachelor of Music Education and Bachelor of Literature, Science and Arts degree.<sup>34</sup> Dr. Peterson continued her studies at Northwestern University, where she received Master of Music Education and Trumpet Performance degrees. She recalls one of her most influential classes during her graduate degree in a music education philosophy course:

Bennett Reimer's philosophy class changed the way I thought about teaching music. Until then I just wanted to teach and I just wanted to have a great band and I didn't really know why. Bennett Reimer talks a lot about aesthetics and music for music's sake. And while I think music can be used for social justice—which seems to be the direction a lot of people talk about now—I believe that both of those things are really important. And we can't lose sight of the fact that music is an art form and it is based in our humanity and our ability to feel, and think, and emote. And Bennett Reimer said it better than anybody else.<sup>35</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> Patricia Hoy, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 7).

<sup>33</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 18).

<sup>34</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, 2019, <https://music.illinois.edu/faculty/elizabeth-peterson> (accessed August 11, 2019).

<sup>35</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 18).

Dr. Peterson earned a Doctor of Musical Arts in Music Education from Shenandoah Conservatory.<sup>36</sup> Before her appointment at Ithaca College in 1998, Dr. Peterson was an arts administrator and director of bands in the public schools of Ohio and Illinois.<sup>37</sup> During her time at Ithaca College, Dr. Peterson conducted the Symphonic Band, taught conducting and instrumental music education courses, and supervised the junior instrumental student teaching program. It was at Ithaca College that Dr. Peterson recalls the influence of an important mentor in her life, Dr. Mark Fonder.

Mark taught me how to teach college. When I started teaching there, I had been a high school band director and he had taught there for 12, 15 years before me. He took me under his wing in terms of how to teach a methods class, how to write a syllabus, what expectations to have of students, how to have higher expectations, and be fair. When I began conducting the Symphonic Band, he was always there for me. I would say he would be my first mentor.<sup>38</sup>

Dr. Peterson joined the faculty at the University of Illinois at Urbana–Champaign in 2015. She conducts the Illinois Wind Orchestra, serves as the placement coordinator for student teachers, and teaches courses in instrumental conducting.<sup>39</sup> In 2016, Dr. Peterson published a book titled *The Music Director's Later Years: Reflection with Wisdom*, released by Meredith Music. The book is comprised of interviews from late-career or retired music educators discussing a variety of topics relevant to the profession.<sup>40</sup> When

---

<sup>36</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, 2019, <https://music.illinois.edu/faculty/elizabeth-peterson> (accessed August 11, 2019).

<sup>37</sup> Ibid.

<sup>38</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 18).

<sup>39</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, 2019, <https://music.illinois.edu/faculty/elizabeth-peterson> (accessed August 11, 2019).

<sup>40</sup> Ibid.

asked about her proudest moment as a music educator, Dr. Peterson expresses the joy and pride she feels when conducting her band at the University of Illinois:

I'm also especially proud because in Illinois I have several non-music majors in the ensemble. You can tell they've been touched. Those folks don't have to do music anymore and chose to make time for it. And when they're happy to be in the ensemble, or they love the music, or they have a great concert and you know they know it or they tell you, that's a really great feeling. And I'm very proud of that. In some ways, I'm proud of our profession for those kids who are still making music. Someone in their life inspired them to keep going and that's really special.<sup>41</sup>

*Dr. Mary Schneider* knew early on that she wanted to teach and be a band director, which to her, was the combination of her love for music and her love for teaching.<sup>42</sup> She attended the New England Conservatory of Music, where she earned degrees in Horn Performance and Music Education. She then began a very successful public-school teaching career in northern New Jersey. Dr. Schneider discussed how, during her graduate studies at the University of Connecticut, she felt pulled toward a conducting degree.

And then I went for my master's degree in music education. And during that time, I was taking conducting classes and I got really intrigued with making music as a conductor. And the dilemma, for me was I really wanted to get better and to study and improve as a conductor. For me, it was one of those life choices. Because I had been teaching public school for a while in a great district, I just felt like I needed to make that change and that's when I went to Texas. I started taking some conducting symposiums in the summer, that really got me excited about it. And then I just took a big risk. I didn't necessarily go for my doctorate because I wanted to teach college. Actually, I didn't really know where it would bring me, but that's the next role. And I was fortunate to be accepted at UT Austin.<sup>43</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 18).

<sup>42</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

<sup>43</sup> Ibid.



Dr. Schneider earned her doctoral degree in conducting from the University of Texas Austin, studying with Jerry Junkin.<sup>44</sup> Dr. Schneider was elected to the American Bandmasters Association in 2013 and served in leadership roles for the College Band Directors National Association and the Mid-American Conference Band Directors Association.<sup>45</sup>

Dr. Schneider currently serves as Professor of Conducting and Director of Bands at Eastern Michigan University. She conducts the Wind Symphony, teaches graduate and undergraduate conducting and music education courses, and directs the *Music Now* contemporary music festival. Additionally, in 2018 Dr. Schneider was appointed interim Associate Director of the School of Music & Dance at Eastern Michigan University.<sup>46</sup> When asked about one of her proudest moments, Dr. Schneider states that her proudest moments are typically linked with special occasions or performance halls.

Last year I had the opportunity to go back to the state that I grew up in, New Jersey, and conduct the New Jersey All-State Wind Ensemble. That was a group that I had performed in and it was a real honor to be invited back to do that. But it was special to me not just because of that full circle. It was special because my mother got to attend. She still lives in New Jersey and some of my siblings got to attend. My mother has seen me conduct before, but I think just at this point in my career it was very special. I have some friends I taught with in the public schools that also came to the concert. I was proud of that. And my nephew came, and he had never seen me conduct before.<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>44</sup> Mary K. Schneider, 2019, <https://www.emich.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

<sup>45</sup> Ibid.

<sup>46</sup> Ibid.

<sup>47</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 20).

Dr. Schneider is an advocate for new wind music and maintains an active interest in that area of research. In addition to an active role in commissioning and premiering new works, her ensembles collaborate with diverse groups of composers regularly.<sup>48</sup>

*Dr. Emily Threinen* had a desire to pursue conducting and music education in her early teen years. She even tells a story of reconnecting with her high school band teacher, who shared a memory of Dr. Threinen coming in early to the band room to “wave her hands” around to Beethoven recordings.<sup>49</sup> After high school, she pursued a music degree at the University of Minnesota.

I came here as a music major, both as a clarinet performer and a music education major. I had the dual degree program. Observing my conductors and rehearsals elevated that interest again. Craig Kirchhoff was just so amazing. As someone that played the clarinet who was fortunate to sit relatively close to him, I just felt like I learned a lot. I started to understand just the level of depth and passion and knowledge. I started absorbing the deepness and richness of what that is. I just always was very inspired in his rehearsals and really loved it. I think in college my passion for music only got more intense.<sup>50</sup>

Dr. Threinen recalls being inspired not only by Craig Kirchhoff, but also by his conducting graduate students. She described being a part of an informal score study club where she was really inspired to become a better conductor.<sup>51</sup> After her undergraduate studies, she served as the Director of Bands at Harding High School in St. Paul Minnesota for three years and also performed as a clarinetist in the Metropolitan Symphony Orchestra.<sup>52</sup> Dr. Threinen earned a Master of Music degree in Conducting

---

<sup>48</sup> *Mary K. Schneider*, 2019, <https://www.emich.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

<sup>49</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 11).

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>51</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 11).

<sup>52</sup> *About Emily Threinen*, 2019, <https://cla.umn.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

from Northwestern University, studying with Dr. Mallory Thompson. Dr. Threinen explained how Dr. Mallory Thompson served as one of many important influences and mentors in her life:

She's got incredible ears. I think her stick technique is just some of the most exquisite refined stick technique, if you want to break it down to that. I think her ears are just ridiculous. She can hear anything. And she's really, really good at making quick, witty, spot-on adjustments with anything, whether it's a pitch discrepancy or just phrases and quiets, turning in just the right way. Maybe the second trombone part needs to be 10% louder. She just has a way of knowing exactly what to say and making significant differences quickly and clearly. And she's very intense and I love that about her. She is a terrific mentor in that way.<sup>53</sup>

Dr. Threinen earned a Doctor of Musical Arts in Conducting from the University of Michigan under the tutelage of Michael Haithcock.<sup>54</sup> Dr. Threinen served as Director of Bands at Shenandoah University, Director of the Duke University Wind Symphony, Director of the Concordia University Wind Ensemble, and Director of Bands at Temple University.<sup>55</sup>

Dr. Threinen currently serves as the Director of Bands at the University of Minnesota School of Music, where she conducts the Wind Ensemble, teaches the wind band conducting students, assists with the undergraduate advanced conducting courses, and provides leadership for all other University of Minnesota Bands.<sup>56</sup> Dr. Threinen is a Yamaha Master Educator and was elected to the American Bandmasters Association in 2016. She is also an active member of the World Association for Symphonic Band and

---

<sup>53</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 11).

<sup>54</sup> *About Emily Threinen*, 2019, <https://cla.umn.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*

Ensembles, College Band Directors National Association, National Band Association, and the National Association for Music Education.<sup>57</sup>

*Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner* completed her Bachelor of Music and Bachelor of Education degrees at Queens University. She earned her Master of Music degrees in Music Education and Conducting from the University of Victoria.<sup>58</sup> Dr. Turner has taught high school music and middle school beginning instrumental music in Toronto and taught choral music in Switzerland.<sup>59</sup> She earned a Doctor of Musical Arts in Conducting from the Eastman School of Music. She began her studies at Eastman in music education but shared how her degree path shifted.

I started as a PhD in music education because I'm an educator at heart. I think I still am. But I followed Don Hunsberger around like a puppy. I went to the window at every rehearsal until he finally got sick of me and said, "Do you want to conduct something?" And I said yes. Actually, I meant no, because I was terrified. But I ended up conducting *Al Fresco* by Karel Husa. I have no idea how it went because the first things that go when you're scared and nervous are your ears, as you know. But afterwards, he said, "You should be a conductor." I went, "Okay." And I switched to DMA in conducting and that was that.<sup>60</sup>

Before her current appointment, Dr. Turner served as the Director of Wind Ensembles at Cornell University. In this position, she led the Cornell Wind Ensemble on performing and service tours to Costa Rica, where they not only performed but led conducting classes with teachers and instrumental masterclasses with Costa Rican

---

<sup>57</sup> *About Emily Threinen*, 2019, <https://cla.umn.edu> (accessed August 12, 2019).

<sup>58</sup> *Cynthia Johnston Turner*, 2019, <https://www.conn-selmer.com> (accessed on August 14, 2019).

<sup>59</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>60</sup> *Cynthia Johnston Turner*, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

musicians. Additionally, the ensemble donated over 250 instruments to schools across that country.<sup>61</sup>

Dr. Turner currently serves as the Director of Bands, Professor of Music, and Co-Artistic Director of Rote Hund Muzik at the Hodgson School of Music at the University of Georgia. There she conducts the Hodgson Wind Ensemble, leads the graduate conducting courses, and oversees the entire band program. Dr. Turner is an active member of the World Association for Symphonic Band and Ensembles, the College Band Directors National Association, College Music Society, and National Band Association.<sup>62</sup> In addition to maintaining an active national and international guest conducting schedule, she has been invited, both nationally and internationally, to present her research on teaching and technology, innovative rehearsal techniques, and service-learning and music.<sup>63</sup> When Dr. Turner was asked who her greatest mentors were, she stated,

Most of my mentors at Eastman were musicology professors, other DMA students, PhD students, faculty in education where my one foot still was. My mentors now are younger women who seem to have it way more together and have so much more courage than I did. I am so inspired by that.<sup>64</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup> *Cynthia Johnston Turner*, 2019, <https://www.conn-selmer.com> (Accessed on August 14, 2019).

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>64</sup> *Cynthia Johnston Turner*, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

### CHAPTER III

#### IDENTITY-MASKING AND ATTIRE

Interview question seven, “Has there ever been a time when you felt you had to mask your femininity on the podium?” was asked of all seven participants, and responses to this question arose as the most prominent theme uncovered in the interviews. This question was created based on the results from Sears’s 2014 qualitative study which explored perceptions of a “conducting persona.” Sears revealed that two participants actively adopted “assertive” teaching styles to replicate male and female mentors. Another participant discussed avoiding feminine clothing to gain respect from colleagues and students.<sup>65</sup>

When asked the question, “Has there ever been a time when you felt you had to mask your femininity on the podium?” all seven participants responded with a simple and direct “no.” However, this simple answer was accompanied by a variety of experiences, caveats, and opinions almost exclusively related to performance attire. Although male conductors have a longstanding tradition of wearing a tuxedo for performance attire, the performance attire for female conductors has been ambiguous. Female conductors have often been initially judged by their appearance rather than their skills.<sup>66</sup> In the following

---

<sup>65</sup> C.A.Q. Sears, “The persona problem: How the expectations of masculinity shape the female identity,” *Gender, Education, Music & Society* 7, no. 4 (2014): 4-11.

<sup>66</sup> Loucia Lazarou, “Women Conductors: A Qualitative Study of Gender, Family, ‘The Body’ and Discrimination,” PhD diss., Durham University, 2017.

sections, the data revealed regarding identity through the lens of performance attire and the stress that female conductors experienced with this issue are discussed.

### **The Visual Aspect**

The researcher noted that all seven participants stressed the importance of feeling confident in performance attire. Although participants encouraged the confident freedom of self-expression in performance attire, they additionally listed other visual factors that the conductors felt should be noted in this selection process. Dr. Peterson, Dr. Turner, Dr. Threinen, and Dr. Schneider all specifically identified the importance of knowing how the attire fits and looks from the perspective of the audience.

I think as women, we have more choices than what men have, traditionally. Of course, we can wear a tux or a suit. I think for us there are a lot of different options and that's always an issue. I don't try to mask my femininity, but I am aware of how I look from behind, which I'm not sure men have to do.<sup>67</sup>

She added to this statement the importance of understanding that our profession was visual but cautioned female conductors to make every attempt not to distract from the music visually. Dr. Threinen shared this sentiment and recalled an instance of realizing faulty attire selection after the completion of the concert. This assessment bothered her, as she believed that nothing should detract from music being the central focus.

I really believe that the role of a conductor, all conductors, is to serve the music. Period. I don't want anything distracting with my hair or makeup or jewelry or cleavage or backside. I don't want anything to take away from that. So actually, a dress that I wore earlier this year, I saw a picture of myself from behind. I'm like,

---

<sup>67</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

“Ugh, that was too tight.” I didn’t know it and it didn’t seem that bad, but I just don’t want anyone to be distracted by that. When I walk out on stage and I’m making music, I don’t want anyone to be distracted from the music. Period.<sup>68</sup>

Concerning appropriate performance attire that has not been distracting from behind, Dr. Turner suggested relying on an honest opinion of a trusted friend. She also stated that this was particularly important in an era where male conducting teachers have been tentative to discuss this topic with female conducting students for fear that it may be misconstrued.<sup>69</sup>

I’m remembering an instance with one of my best friends. I had these diamond earrings while conducting orchestra. She said, ‘All I could look at was your earrings.’ And I went, ‘Oh.’ Now, does that mean that we have to go makeup-less and no jewelry? No. But I think discreet and professional is just the best way. Find people that are going to call you on it that you trust and know will be honest with you.<sup>70</sup>

A consistent sub-theme emerged from the data about the visual aspect of performance attire. All participants shared how they chose to embrace their individualism and never felt any reason to mask their femininity on the podium. However, these female conductors also stressed the visual awareness, particularly the backside, of performance attire selection. The participants shared stories of self-assessment and receiving feedback from trusted friends to help alleviate uneasiness surrounding this issue.

---

<sup>68</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 11).

<sup>69</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

<sup>70</sup> Ibid.



## The Practicality Aspect

Another sub-theme to emerge from the data was selecting attire based on practicality. Four of the participants discussed choosing outfits that were “comfortable” or “easy to move in.” Two participants shared that they consider the physical aspect of their profession and select attire that allowed for “breathability.”

If the goal of conducting has been to communicate through effective non-verbal gestures, freedom of movement was a necessity. Practicality of attire must be considered to most effectively allow freedom of movement. Dr. Threinen discussed the importance of practicality when selecting concert attire. For instance, she discussed the downfalls of wearing impractical shoes as concert attire, as it could have impeded expressive conducting.

High heels legitimately distort your posture. We all know that, right? I never go above two inches because it’s going to distort my weight and I’m going to do stuff with my lower back. I think if we’re going to wear a three or four-inch heel, you’re limiting your physical ability to be expressive on the podium. Period. You just are. That’s completely natural whether you’re a man or woman. To me, I don’t want to limit my expressive potential just to show that I’m a woman. It’s obvious I’m a woman.<sup>71</sup>

Additionally, when making music with others, human connection through the face and eyes has become integral. Dr. Threinen advised her students to keep their hair off their face to maintain that connection with the ensemble.<sup>72</sup> Parallel to selecting attire that allowed for available movement for conducting, three of the participants discussed the importance of professionalism. Although the participants did not clearly define the term

---

<sup>71</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

<sup>72</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 11).

“professional,” it was usually accompanied by the word “appropriate.” Dr. Threinen recommended female conductors to remain focused on the service to the music:

I believe that when we take our work seriously, we tend to focus less on ourselves and more on the job, the responsibilities. Yes, we want to look professional and appropriate, but in the end, it isn't about 'us,' it is about the music. Maybe we should all ascribe to a uniform. Here are questions to ponder: Would you want your heart surgeon to wear stilettos, fancy earrings, and something that makes that person feel feminine? Do you want your Delta pilot to wear something that makes her feel sexy and more like a woman? Or, do want these individuals to focus solely on their work and to wear whatever is necessary to get the job done in a professional and respectable manner? Yes, our craft is visual. Yes, people notice. So, then, each of us has to decide what we want people to notice.<sup>73</sup>

Dr. Threinen presented a series of thought-provoking questions to consider: Should female conductors ascribe to a uniform? By ascribing to a uniform, does this inhibit freedom of expression through attire that female conductors embrace? Should the respect and professionalism of the final product, whether flying a plane or performing heart surgery, be placed above all other peripheral uneasiness? In such a visual profession, was this truly a possibility?

She did note that it was important to be aware of issues such as attire, but advised female conductors not to be “paralyzed” by the issue. Dr. Threinen advised female conductors to remember what our purpose as conductors has been and to “enhance the experience, but not distract.”<sup>74</sup> As for our purpose as a conductor, participants unanimously stated that it was to serve the music. Professor Paula Crider furthered this purpose by adding an element of knowledge and compassion: “I have always found that

---

<sup>73</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 11).

<sup>74</sup> Ibid.

students don't care about gender if they know the person on the podium is a caring and knowledgeable music educator."<sup>75</sup>

### **Confidence in Identity**

Additionally, another emergent sub-theme from the data was the concept of confidence. In two instances, "confidence" referred to simply feeling confident as a woman. Dr. Patricia Hoy said, "I just felt confident in who I was. And I am a woman, so that's just the way it is [laughter]."<sup>76</sup> In other instances, "confidence" referenced how the attire reflected or influenced a personal belief system. Two participants specifically used the term "confidence" to reflect experience and accomplishment. Dr. Caroline Beatty stated that the further she progressed in her career, the less she began to care about what others thought. When asked if she thought about her attire, she stated the following:

Not as much as some other people. Just wear something you're comfortable wearing that you think you feel good in and there you go. I think I used to, though. If I think back enough on it, when I first started teaching, I thought I was supposed to do certain things. I was supposed to wear certain things and now I don't care [laughter].<sup>77</sup>

The conversation concerning the "appropriate" performance attire of a female conductor was complex and has become more openly and honestly discussed in research in recent years. For example, in a 2017 study addressing this issue, Loucia Lazarou states,

It seems that women conductors are intrinsically aware that, even if they use the power they have gained through years of hard work and proving themselves

---

<sup>75</sup> Paula Crider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 21).

<sup>76</sup> Patricia Hoy, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 7).

<sup>77</sup> Carolina Beatty, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

competent in comparison to men, people will still not stop criticizing them and commenting upon their choice of dress on the podium.<sup>78</sup>

Did these women feel that they were using attire to mask their femininity? In short, no. However, after studying the data, the researcher discovered that these female conductors generally did invest careful consideration when selecting attire as evidenced by the prominence of this primary theme.

---

<sup>78</sup> Loucia Lazarou, "Women Conductors: A Qualitative Study of Gender, Family, 'The Body' and Discrimination," PhD diss., Durham University, 2017.

## CHAPTER IV

### NAVIGATING OVERT AND SUBTLE DISCRIMINATION

The topic of gender-based discrimination toward female conductors has been a discussion that continues to permeate the field of wind conducting. Results from Loucia Lazarou's 2017 study showed that discrimination has been an ongoing issue:

Data taken from the interviews suggest that these issues still remain in the profession and the different ways women conductors face discrimination are sometimes intense. Findings such as people refusing to be directed by a woman conductor, being curious about them as well as abusing them, are some of the participants' experiences of the profession. The participants in the study have also noted that they have sometimes felt patronized, especially at the beginning of their career, because of people not taking them seriously or having doubts about their skills and abilities.<sup>79</sup>

Based on this related research, one of the interview questions directly addressed the topic of discrimination: "Was there ever a time when you felt discriminated against due to your gender?" The participants unanimously shared personal experiences of discrimination, many of which were emotionally difficult to recount. Participants also discussed the concept of "subtle" or "perceived" discrimination. In these instances of subtle discrimination, participants found it difficult to pinpoint the discrimination based on gender directly but strongly felt that it was present.

Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner described an overt, painful experience of discrimination that took place during an international engagement:

---

<sup>79</sup> Loucia Lazarou, "Women Conductors: A Qualitative Study of Gender, Family, 'The Body' and Discrimination," PhD diss., Durham University, 2017.

Yeah. It happens all the time. I wasn't really aware of it on a conscious level until relatively recently. I'd say the last 7 to 10 years. It was really obvious when I went to conduct on an international engagement. It was disgusting. There were a couple of members in this exceptionally good wind orchestra who just *knew* that they didn't think I belonged there. I had to work really hard to show that I was a capable conductor and musician. And I ended up talking to them afterwards to say, "I had this feeling during rehearsals. Am I off-base?" They said, "No. To be honest about it, we don't think women should conduct."<sup>80</sup>

Dr. Turner explained how she was hurt and had no reply to this honest response. She continued by explaining that this issue was non-existent in her current position because she has been actively a part of the culture and has proven herself to her students.

Discrimination has also permeated the hiring processes of universities. Another participant recalled an experience when a colleague recused themselves from serving on a search committee due to an unexpected bias. To this colleague, the possibility of hiring two female band directors at one university appeared to be "unfair" to the students. The colleague suggested that two female university band directors may neither be welcomed nor supported by high school band directors concerning recruitment. This participant expressed her frustration and disagreement with the accepted norm of having a predominantly male band faculty.

I had a colleague who was on the search committee as myself and when it was clear that a female was in the running as a finalist, this person recused themselves from the committee. I didn't understand their reasoning. Later I had this conversation, and they said, "Look. You're doing a great job. And I think it's fine that you're a female as director of bands. But I don't think we should have two females as band directors here. I don't think it's fair to the students. And I think that it would not do well for our recruiting because I think there'd be a lot of high school directors that would have a problem with that." My response was, "So it's okay to have four white males on a band faculty. Why is that not an issue? Why is

---

<sup>80</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

that not unfair to the half of the other students who are female?” I was trying to reason. Did I mention this colleague was a woman?

This account raised a series of additional questions about discrimination in the hiring process: Does an all-female band faculty actually affect recruitment either negatively or positively? If the predominant all-male band faculty has not affected the recruitment of females, why would the opposite affect recruitment? How do female conductors navigate unexpected issues of discrimination with other *females*?

Dr. Emily Threinen recounted a painful experience of overt discrimination during a competition. She recalled questioning the reasoning for such a decision and was met with an unhelpful, painful response.

There was something I wanted, and it was a competition, and there had never been a woman in this position, and I didn't get it. And when I went to the person that made the final decision, that person said, "We just aren't ready yet, and you'll understand someday." But it was never said why, but it didn't need to be said why because I knew. And so that was painful, for sure, and there was nothing I could do. I can't make myself a man.<sup>81</sup>

Dr. Threinen shared that she was certain that there was nothing she could do to change the outcome. This story demonstrated that while this overt discrimination exists, some outcomes of this discrimination simply will not change. While this experience of discrimination was difficult, Dr. Threinen continued on a path of focus toward refinement of her art, which, ultimately, led to success in her career as a conductor.

Even though subtle discrimination was immensely more difficult to address and pinpoint, an overwhelming number of the participants discussed this form of

---

<sup>81</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 11).

discrimination. Participants described subtle discrimination as a feeling of “resistance” or “pushback” from the ensemble. Participants claimed that while it was difficult to define this discrimination, there was no doubt when it was present. Dr. Mary Schneider discussed an experience of this “resistance” when conducting an honor band. Her response to overcome this discrimination was to prove herself. To her, the respect of the ensemble did not come automatically, and she had to prove herself to receive the respect she deserved. She also described resisting the urge to be overly strict to gain the respect or command of the ensemble.

I conduct honor bands all over. I’ve done All States and different levels. And when I do high school groups, not every time, certainly, but even at this stage of my career, when I first get on the podium with a high school group, especially if they don’t have a lot of experience with female conductors, it’s [discrimination] really palpable. There’s this sense of a resistance and I can feel that I have to prove myself. The respect doesn’t come automatically. There’s sort of an assumption that you’re going to be a pushover or that you don’t have the ability. But there is definitely what I’ve come to realize is gender-based discrimination. I have to prove myself and then it’s fine. But sometimes I have to be overly strict and I have to remind myself not to immediately develop those relationships. It’s odd.<sup>82</sup>

Professor Paula Crider, highly regarded in the field and by other participants in this study as a trailblazer among female conductors, also weighed in on the need to prove herself worthy of respect. However, she viewed the resentment that she received as a positive contribution to her resolve. Professor Crider believed that proving her excellence and worthiness contributed to her strength.

---

<sup>82</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).



Of course, especially at the beginning of my career when women were generally “not allowed” to be high school band directors. When I became the first female in the state of Texas to conduct a class 4A band (the largest class at the time) there was quite a bit of resentment. (e.g., I was taking a job that should have gone to a “deserving” male.) However, I view this as a positive. I always felt the need to prove myself. This made me stronger; it made me better.<sup>83</sup>

Discrimination, both overt and subtle, and how to navigate it is another primary theme that emerged from the data. All participants noted that not only identifying subtle discrimination but *addressing* subtle discrimination proved difficult. In navigating subtle discrimination, the participants suggested the latter approach—preparedness and confidence. When navigating issues of direct, overt discrimination, four of the participants suggested an approach of “addressing it directly” or using the situation as an opportunity to educate others.

Dr. Turner discussed an instance of addressing the issue of discrimination directly. She believed that it was important that female conductors clearly express how we would like to be treated.

I said, “I don’t know if you realize how sexist that is, but I’m going to point it out to you. Because I care. Because I care about you and I care about this relationship. But don’t ever say that again. And don’t say that to your female students or your male students.”<sup>84</sup>

She explained that she chose to do this to educate others and preserve the professional relationship. Dr. Turner goes on to say that she was not always this direct. She stated that when she experienced this discrimination, specifically with students, she typically

---

<sup>83</sup> Paula Crider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 21).

<sup>84</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

managed the situation “head-on.” She also said that earlier in her career, this was not the case.

But guest conducting, yeah. Occasionally. High school kids. How do I manage it? I usually manage it head-on. I’ll usually talk. I have no qualms about talking to kids privately about what I’ve sensed or what I’m feeling. They’ll usually say, “Oh, no. No, ma’am.” But the act of me saying, “Oh cool then. I’m totally misreading you.” And then it’s fine. But I generally either completely ignore it because I don’t have time for that shit or I’ll address it head-on. Earlier in my career I would feel like a “deer in headlights” all the time and I would think of something really awesome to say three hours later.<sup>85</sup>

Similarly, Dr. Caroline Beatty recalled an instance at a convention when, in an effort to educate others in discrimination, she experienced resistance or a lack of understanding. She specifically referenced Professor Paula Crider and the major obstacles that she overcame as a front runner in this field.

I think there are males in our profession who don’t understand that our path might be a little bit different for some females in our profession. They get roadblocks. Some males are like, “Well, I’ve had roadblocks too. What’s the big deal?” Well, it’s hard to describe that there are some women who have experienced very hard, factual roadblocks. It can be really hard to explain. Then I usually say “Well, no, it’s not really the same.” And if you talk to Paula Crider, I’m sure she could give you a lot of stories because she was one of the front runners of all this.<sup>86</sup>

A similar question arose from the experiences shared by Dr. Turner and Dr. Beatty. If female conductors chose to address the issue of discrimination directly, what did we say? Was directly addressing this issue the best course of action? How did we professionally and respectfully educate others on issues of discrimination? How did we

---

<sup>85</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

<sup>86</sup> Caroline Beatty, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

maintain delicate professional relationships in the aftermath of these situations? All of these questions warranted further examination. Perhaps by sharing the personal accounts of these female conductors experiencing real discrimination, others will be educated in the very real and current tensions that exist.

The suggestion of having approached discrimination with confidence and preparedness also occurred in the data. The participants shared experiences of directly educating others in discrimination and, simultaneously, experienced more internal resolve when facing these issues. Dr. Mary Schneider urged female conductors just to assume that there *will* be that gender bias. She then continued, stating that her response to that bias was just to work harder, rehearse harder, and strive for excellence in everything.

I think the first thing is just to realize that it's not you. That took me a while to realize. Just assume there's going to be that bias. Then I just work very hard in the beginning. I don't worry about what I normally establish in relationships. I just go right for the jugular and I just rehearse my butt off and call out everything . . . *everything*. It's interesting, I've gotten that resistance sometimes from females, from girls, which is fascinating to me too.<sup>87</sup>

Dr. Schneider's approach to discrimination has been to accept, even *expect*, its existence and move towards excellence in music-making. Similarly, Dr. Threinen relayed a situation of discrimination and suggested an approach of confidence. She described a situation when, during an interview, her "handling" of a section was brought into question. This particular interviewer doubted her ability to manage a particular section based on her gender. Dr. Threinen responded directly and confidently, assured in her

---

<sup>87</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

abilities as an educator. She urged female conductors to maintain resolve in their abilities despite biased judgment.

And I said, “I think the best answer to that is just watching me rehearse, and then you can decide how I manage that.” Then there were a couple of snickers from some of the other guys. However, when people see me work, I think there’s no question, and that’s when the judgment stops if there were to be one.<sup>88</sup>

Dr. Threinen continued with this advice for female conductors, stating that we should focus only on what we, as female conductors, *can* control. To her, we cannot control the views of others. We cannot control their actions, their words, and their opinions. What we *can* control has always been our preparedness, our focus, and the goal at hand. She also added that once this was the center of our attention, the concern for the discrimination and bias faded.

I don’t assume that people are going to judge me as a woman. I just don’t because I can’t control that. What I *can* control is how well am I prepared, how well am I delivering what I’m saying. We have a job to do and let’s make it happen. I just go do it, whatever that is. I’m just now so used to that that it doesn’t even occur to me that people would treat me differently.<sup>89</sup>

---

<sup>88</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 11).

<sup>89</sup> Ibid.

## CHAPTER V

### INVESTING IN THE CONDUCTING PROFESSION

Two of the interview questions were structured to prompt participants to look toward the future of wind band conducting as a profession. The first of these questions asked participants to share advice for future female conductors, and the second asked the participants to consider desires or innovations they would like to see in the field of wind conducting. These female conductors discussed advice on a wide variety of topics, from balancing family to continued professional growth, as they wanted to see inclusivity and progress in our field.

#### **Advice for Conductors**

Dr. Caroline Beatty discussed recommendations for conductors. She urged continued self-evaluation for growth. Along this path of growth, she also advised kindness towards others along this journey.

But I think my advice is always just try to be good at what you're doing and be good to other people while you're going down that path. I think that's how to be successful. You're just trying to get people to see what you do, and you're always just trying to communicate with the audience with whatever the music you're trying to present. So, audience development is always on my mind. I try to do that and I think everybody is. As far as *how* we teach it and *what* we teach: I always try to be a better teacher and I'm constantly evaluating myself. "Well, was that any good today?" and, "What can I do better because they weren't getting that?" It's about striving to be the best version of yourself.<sup>90</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup> Caroline Beatty, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

Dr. Beatty recommended creative audience engagement and continued growth as an educator. She posed advice that prompted conductors to ask: How can we best communicate music with our audience? As an educator, how can *we* adapt our instruction to serve the needs of our students best? Addressing these questions combined with responsive action may aid in our journey toward success.

Dr. Mary Schneider discussed advice on internal growth and resolve. She stated that women have been conditioned, through society, to needlessly and superfluously apologize for their desires. She encouraged young women to own their power, goals, and strength and to stop apologizing for those invaluable attributes. She stated from personal experience that when she owned her power and strength as a woman, occasionally it would cause a shift in the dynamics of surrounding relationships.

I would say, don't apologize. As women, we do this all the time. We try to make things and relationships better. I tell my younger students, we're just conditioned to say, "I'm sorry" all the time, myself included. That's just it: own your power and don't apologize. You may be called names, but just embrace it. Sometimes, as a Director of Bands, I have to be very strong in that decision-making process. And you'll see a different dynamic.<sup>91</sup>

Dr. Schneider continued to expand this advice to educators of future female conductors. She posited that the issue of "apologizing" and failure were linked to and deeply rooted in society. She proposed that the approach to teaching female conducting students may differ slightly than male conducting students. She challenged male teachers to work more diligently to support female conductors. After all, she (along with other

---

<sup>91</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

participants) specifically recalled instances of mentors who instructed with an encouraging approach:

Maybe your female students need a little more encouraging against stereotypes. Typically, male students are more confident. They have been raised in a society where that's valued and where they're conditioned to have a lot of time to fail and that not mean anything. Maybe your approach with female students has to be different. Are you willing to do that? As a male teacher, are you willing to work a little harder to really convince this young woman that she has the ability or the talent? And how many of us had someone who said - excuse me - "Yes. You can do this." And I think it's—again, I think it's just our society that has to change, as well.<sup>92</sup>

Dr. Elizabeth Peterson advised female conductors to be flexible in the journey that life presents. She discussed how it was natural and wise to plan for the future. However, without the willingness to be flexible along the journey, we could miss exciting opportunities. She also enlightened female conductors that it *was* possible to balance family life with excellence in our profession.

I think that would be my final piece of advice: planning is good, but life will happen. The one thing that women can't change and won't change is that we're the ones who will have babies or not. But if we're going to have babies and have a family, it's possible to do that and still be great band directors, or conductors, or teachers, because you just make it work. Just make it happen.<sup>93</sup>

Dr. Peterson went on to discuss how it can be difficult to juggle both family life and that of a career, but it was possible. She urged the future generation of female conductors to prepare, but be flexible when life happens.

---

<sup>92</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

<sup>93</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 18).

Dr. Threinen discussed the importance of nurturing relationships with mentors. She stated that this responsibility fell to the students, not the mentors. She explained that her mentors were precious, and she continued to learn from them. Dr. Threinen said maintaining this relationship has proven beneficial for her continued growth as a music educator.

But I will say, the student is responsible to keep those mentors in their lives. I think a lot of times when students or people leave their degree program, they go and just do their own thing. You can do that for sure, but even when I was a graduate student, I would send Craig Kirchoff my recital videos. I don't know that he ever looked at them, but I just wanted him to know I was growing., I wanted him to know he had an influence on me 10 years ago and here's what I'm doing now because of that influence. I always kept in touch with those people because they matter to me and because I continue to learn from them. But again, I have mentors and friends that have shared with me that once a person graduates, sometimes they won't see them until they bump into them at Midwest. So, I think the student, if they want to have an interactive relationship with the mentor, they can guide that and decide how close they want to be.<sup>94</sup>

To Dr. Threinen, maintaining relationships with teachers that will continue to help you grow in your art has been imperative. Her advice for future female conductors was to take the initiative and make the effort that was required to invest in these relationships.

Professor Paula Crider encouraged future female conductors to accept the higher expectations and to strive to be a "lifelong learner." She stated that female conductors *will* have higher expectations placed upon them, but to use this obstacle as a tool for success. Professor Crider, like Dr. Threinen, urged continued learning and growth as a music educator.

---

<sup>94</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 11).



You will have to be far better than average in order to be taken seriously. This is a good thing. Never cease to learn; to seek even more expeditious, creative, inventive, challenging, fun ways in which to share the magic of music-making with your students . . . whatever it takes! My Grandmother once shared a quote by Eleanor Roosevelt that has become my mantra: “No one has the ability to make you feel inferior without your consent.”<sup>95</sup>

The advice for future female conductors, passed down from those who have achieved success in the field, was invaluable. All of these highly regarded, accomplished women have high hopes for future female conductors.

### **The Teaching of Conducting**

All seven participants contributed aspirations for change in the instruction of conducting. However, two major sub-themes emerged from the data. The first sub-theme was the emphasis on musically-informed gesture in the instruction of conducting. Professor Paula Crider stressed the need for additional hours in conducting curriculum and emphasized the importance of informed musical opinion to guide conducting gestures.

More conducting hours are needed in the university curriculum. Usually one, or two at best are required of music education majors. This is simply not enough. Score study should be stressed *before* ever stepping on the podium. In too many conducting curricula, there is a disconnect between *gesture* and *music*. All the great moves in the world are meaningless without an informed musical opinion.<sup>96</sup>

Similarly, Dr. Patricia Hoy echoed the importance of teaching music through gesture. She also noted that this was more difficult to teach, and the instructor must personally demonstrate this expressive gesture in music.

---

<sup>95</sup> Paula Crider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 21).

<sup>96</sup> Ibid.

I mean, of course, you have to teach technique and all of these things that everybody becomes so interested in, but the most important thing to me is teaching music through your gesture. The music and the movement of the music to me is something that could really be added. Of course, it's harder to teach that. The teacher must have a really great sense of how music moves and how to create that momentum in a way that really says something expressively.<sup>97</sup>

The second sub-theme that emerged from the data on the instruction of conducting was that of encouraging authenticity in conducting students. Dr. Elizabeth Peterson discussed how all conductors, regardless of gender, brought unique attributes to the podium. She advised that first and foremost, the art must be considered. From there, the conductor should have incorporated their unique personality to bring the music to life.

I think different personalities bring different things to a rehearsal or concert. That is the goal for a young conductor - to find his/her personality - or teacher voice. Humor, kindness, caring, passion, enthusiasm—those attributes are all different for each of us. It is our job to use our own unique personalities and foster those personalities in our students. Of course, even more important is the music at hand - all conductors need to tap into that music and what the composer has created to elicit the best and most musical response. This is not about gender. I think about all the different persons I've seen conduct and rehearse over the years. Everyone is so different and the really good ones know how to use their personal and musical strengths to make great music both in rehearsal and in performance.<sup>98</sup>

Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner also stressed the need for teachers to encourage their students to be authentic. She believed that inauthentic leadership can be detected and stated that helping students discover who they truly were will not only aid in their musicianship, but also their leadership.

---

<sup>97</sup> Patricia Hoy, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 7).

<sup>98</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 18).

I feel that this is the heart of the matter: to teach young conductors to be their most authentic self on the podium. Musicians of any age, but especially kids, they see through facades. They see through dishonesty. They see through inauthenticity. The best thing we can do is to help a student figure out who they are as a person. That informs what they do as a musician. In essence, less gesture and more honesty. Just true integrity.<sup>99</sup>

In addition to sharing broad advice for female conductors, four of the female conductors offered extended recommendations to educators concerning the instruction of conducting. Two sub-themes developed from these visions for future instruction. First, the demonstrating and fostering of more musically-informed, expressive gestures must be included in conducting instruction. Second, these female conductors urged educators to promote authenticity within our students' conducting to further their musicianship.

### **Hope for a More Inclusive Profession**

In the sharing of personal hopes for the future, five of the participants commented on the need for more inclusivity in our profession. Two of the participants acknowledged that progress has occurred over the last ten years, but still emphasized that there was work to be done in the area of inclusivity of minorities. Dr. Mary Schneider discussed how this progress can begin in the conducting studios. To her, by not cultivating an inclusive conducting studio, that studio was contributing to a more deep-rooted cyclical issue. Dr. Schneider suggested that through the inclusion of minority students in all conducting studios, our profession will begin to see real progress.

There are still conducting studios in this country that have never had a female student in them or have had one over the course of 15 years. These studios are taught by well-known people and leaders in our profession. On the other hand,

---

<sup>99</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (May 22).

there are others who have been recruiting and speaking up for women's equality and people of color and have been really leading the charge. There are white males who have been leading that charge since before I even came on the scene and been super supportive. They understand the power of representation. To those people, some of whom are my friends, I say it's just like finding diverse composers; it's just harder to do. You have to do more work. They might not be knocking on your door. You're going to have to dig a little further to find diverse composers. Similarly, you might not have a female who's at a level yet that you would accept in your studio. You might have to cultivate this. But when you have a studio of conducting students, you're shaping the future of our profession. And when you don't have any females, you're screaming pretty loudly that women are not welcome. It's a cyclical thing. By not having any women in your studio or any people of color, you are basically announcing that that's not a welcoming studio and why people haven't been comfortable to come to you<sup>100</sup>

By starting the process of inclusion within conducting studios, Dr. Schneider believed that we can break the deeply-rooted cycle. Dr. Elizabeth Peterson recalled how she never had a female teacher role model. It did not bother her nor impede her success, but she suggested that having a profession that reflects a more diverse America could prove helpful for future generations.

I never really had a female teacher role model and it never really occurred to me. I didn't know that I couldn't do something, because I didn't see someone who looked like me. But we hear that expression a lot now that it's good for people to have other people in leadership roles who look like America, that look like each other. And I understand how that is maybe really helpful to people. I think I hope that that would change, that we would be a more colorful industry and more inclusive of all people.<sup>101</sup>

---

<sup>100</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

<sup>101</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 18).

CHAPTER VI  
IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

Throughout the interview process and examination of the data, several significant yet less consistent themes emerged. The following secondary themes may warrant further examination.

**Commissioning with Purpose**

Commissioning of music was another prevalent secondary theme that arose when participants were asked to look toward the future of our profession. Participants stated their concerns surrounding the urgency for commissioning wind band music. Dr. Cynthia Johnson Turner was one of two participants who discussed how we must commission music with purpose. To her, our purpose was to connect music and social activism.

I think that music and social activism is a must. We can't ignore what's going on. We don't have to get political, but there are big issues happening now with gun violence, equal rights, mental health, climate change, racism. I mean, there are things we can do. There is music to be played. There are concerts to be curated. There are people to reach out to and have discussions to make the concert experience very real. To make it not just about music, but to truly have conversation, a debate *through* music the way other arts are dealing with these things. I mean, there's so much to be done. I'm so inspired by that. But that's something we have to do. We can't not go there. We can't just keep commissioning new works for the sake of new works. I know that has merit, but we've done that. We need to re-perform the pieces that we commissioned 30 years ago. We also need to rethink the concert experience to try to help people have meaningful experiences when they attend.<sup>102</sup>

---

<sup>102</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

Dr. Turner's passion for connecting social activism and music and thus providing a truly meaningful concert experience raises several questions surrounding commissioning: How can we commission music that is relevant to our society? How can we curate concerts that are thought-provoking and encourage healthy conversations and debate? What pieces can we return to in order to create relevance in our art? How can we, as conductors, *commission with purpose*, works that foster meaningful concert experiences for our audience and even our students?

### **Tokenism**

Three of the participants discussed the concept of being the "token woman" for an event instead of being selected based on knowledge and ability. Dr. Elizabeth Peterson suggested one method to overcome this tokenism was to accept the invitation, demonstrate excellence, and receive further invitations based on that excellence.

I think we're in a much better place. And we're not done. We've got a long way to go, right? But at the same time, if you're asked to guest conduct, or I'm asked to guest conduct, or a woman composer's piece is being put on a program, we can't then say, "But don't do it just because I'm a token woman." We might be that token woman for that person who hired us. And then we just need to be really good at it and that piece has to be a really great piece. And then we get asked to do that gig again, because we were good at it, not because we were a woman.<sup>103</sup>

Dr. Schneider also has witnessed and experienced this same tokenism and recommended women to be direct and educate others:

I've had this conversation with many people and I don't get angry about it, I just try to educate. Here's how that goes: "I would love for you to be on this panel. You're amazing. You're a great musician. I've heard wonderful things. Blah,

---

<sup>103</sup> Elizabeth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 18).

blah, blah, blah, blah. Oh, by the way, and you happen to be a woman.” We just have to change that framework and help people understand how we want to be treated.<sup>104</sup>

It was apparent from two of the interviews that the women sometimes felt tokenized, selected to receive recognition or invitations based on gender instead of merit. Although only two perspectives were presented in these data, perhaps a deeper examination into the reality of being the “token woman” and healthy, professional approaches to this issue would prove educational to the field of wind conducting.

### **Nurturing Healthy Relationships with Women in the Field**

Another secondary theme presented in the data of four interviews was the difficulty navigating relationships with other women in academia, specifically in music. Three of the women claimed that relationships with other male colleagues were not as difficult as maintaining healthy and non-competitive relationships with female colleagues. Dr. Elizabeth Peterson suggested that insecurity or indirectness may serve as an underlying cause for these struggles.

I think we need to be direct. And I think maybe because we aren't in the same position as men in many career fields, there is a little bit of insecurity or worry that we're not as good as men. And so maybe that insecurity makes it harder to deal with one another.<sup>105</sup>

Further study into the idea of competition between women in higher education may need to be investigated. How can we foster healthy relationships within our field between women? Should women communicate differently with other women in higher education?

---

<sup>104</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 20).

<sup>105</sup> Beth Peterson, interview by Pamela Klena, 2019 (June 18).

### **Issues Surrounding Tone of Voice for Female Conductors**

In an era when the media scrutinizes every outfit selection, haircut, tone, and pitch of voice of female politicians and leaders to sway public opinion, how was this any different for female conductors interviewing or auditioning for a position? Two participants specifically mentioned the adjectives “shrill” and “snippy” as aspects for females to avoid or control in conversation and rehearsals. Has voice regulation been an issue discussed in the graduate studies of female conductors? Was this a conversation that should be honestly and openly discussed to further the progress of women in this field?

### **Oversaturation in the Field of Collegiate Wind Conducting**

Two of the participants shared a sincere concern for oversaturation in the field of wind conducting. Dr. Threinen shares this concern:

What is happening is that we’re taking our best and brightest music educators away from elementary, middle, and high school and putting them all in college jobs. We’re starting to see that our young musicians in the public schools and private schools are not doing very well. I think that there’s a bigger issue where a lot of people want to teach college because they want to teach future educators, and I do too. But I think what’s going to happen is we’re going to have all these overqualified people and no one to teach because there’s not enough of these highly talented, highly passionate people teaching at the fundamental level.<sup>106</sup>

Further exploration of the application, interview, and hiring processes of wind conducting graduate students entering the field may be warranted. What are the statistics of wind conducting graduates earning a collegiate position? How many of these graduates return to middle or high school positions? The data could reveal insight into the general state of

---

<sup>106</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 11).



the profession and aid in future counsel and acceptance of wind conducting graduate students.

### **The Universal Fear: Am I Good Enough?**

Throughout this study, three participants shared a very real and honest struggle surrounding their decision to pursue graduate studies in conducting. Painful and debilitating fears of “less than” or “not good enough” wove a strong connection through all of the personal experiences of three participants. Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner shared:

I'm just going to be honest with you because I've got nothing to lose here. I didn't think I was good enough. I wasn't talented enough, good enough, smart enough to do a doctorate. When I was accepted to the PhD program to begin with, I was really like, “Oh my gosh.” That was a real boost for my confidence that these big American schools thought I was smart enough to pursue a PhD in music education. And then when I was accepted to the DMA program in conducting, I thought, “Oh, I just got lucky. They needed another student.” I just made all sorts of excuses that I wasn't talented enough. I was my own worst enemy. But I was learning how to be a good musician. But more importantly, I was mostly learning about me and my insecurities, my own challenges and self-worth<sup>107</sup>

Dr. Turner's fears and sentiments were echoed through deeply personal stories of trials and successes. Perhaps more qualitative research surrounding these universal fears may be necessary to get a complete picture of how they manifest among women and other marginalized populations. For future students wishing to pursue graduate studies, understanding and relating to the struggles of those who have overcome these fears is invaluable for success.

---

<sup>107</sup> Cynthia Johnston Turner, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (May 22).

### **Wisdom and Suggestions from Female Conductors to “Win the Position”**

Three of the participants shared experiences of discrimination, wisdom, and personal trials surrounding job interviews. One participant shared that “even though we [female conductors] may need to adapt our behavior, dress, and timbre of voice to win the job, we must do so and deal with it later.” A study that dives into the truthful stories of the successes and failures of women interviewing in a male-dominated profession will prove fruitful for the future generations of female conductors. Additionally, this study may begin a discussion of appropriate and inappropriate interview practices and how to navigate these situations with professionalism.

### **Celebration, Connection, and Mentorship for Continued Growth in the Field**

The researcher identified an additional secondary theme throughout the experiences of these female conductors. Every single one of the participants recalled the name of another female music educator or conductor for whom they had great admiration. Dr. Threinen shared her pride for her inclusion as a female conductor, but more importantly, her role as a conductor in the 21st century.

In the end, although women are in a category and class (which I am proud to be within), we are all different. Each of us has our own stories, our own perspectives, and our own backgrounds. When asked “what it is like to be a female/woman conductor?” As I said to you, I know no other way. I can’t really remark on what it is like to be a woman conductor, but I can remark on what it is like to be a wind band conductor in the 21st century! And, now a mother who is trying to delicately balance work and personal life.<sup>108</sup>

---

<sup>108</sup> Emily Threinen, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 11).

Dr. Threinen shared how her identity is complex as a female, a mother, and a conductor in the 21st century, all of which were important to her. These different identities that encompassed her should be celebrated. Dr. Mary Schneider revealed her passion for celebrating the history of women as conductors and music educators:

I wish we were better at celebrating the women like Paula Crider. I mean, there are people that don't know those who came before us. And I think it's really important for us, as women, to really acknowledge and celebrate the sacrifices that came before us. We certainly know the male trailblazers when there weren't a lot of females around. And that's in history, and that's all over, right? So now I think it's time we acknowledge and celebrate those trailblazers.<sup>109</sup>

Continued honest, reflective celebration of women in the field of wind conducting has become imperative to preserving our history. Communicating the stories of trailblazers that came before will help to engender a passion toward more equal representation in the future.

---

<sup>109</sup> Mary Schneider, interview by Pamela Klana, 2019 (June 20).

## CHAPTER VII

### SUMMARY

The researcher collected and examined data from the experiences of accomplished female conductors. The non-confidential participants of this study met a series of criteria that established their prominence in the field through peer-reviewed concerts and publications. The biographical sketches of these female conductors represented a variety of backgrounds. Variety was found in the geographical locations, age, upbringing, education, and career paths of the participants. Despite the variety of experiences, vivid primary themes emerged from the data.

In response to an interview question discussing identity and the masking of femininity, all participants extensively discussed the issue of concert attire for female conductors. These conductors shared advice about the visual and practical aspect of attire selection. The participants of this study provided suggestions and opinions concerning performance attire. First, conductors should be aware of performance attire appearance from the back. Such a careful selection may prevent any visual distraction from the music. Additionally, practicality of the chosen attire must be considered to communicate non-verbally effectively through conducting. Also, the professionalism of the attire was absolutely critical since the purpose of the conductor has been to serve and uphold the integrity of the music. Finally, the selection of the attire should reflect the confidence, knowledge, and compassion of the conductor. The participants noted the importance of

wearing attire that embodied personal identity, which led to confidence. Advice and reflective questions from participants also recommended that conductors focus on the art of making music. Service to music should be at the core of all concerts. Attire selection was peripheral to the importance of excellent music-making.

Secondly, the participants revealed that every one of them had experienced instances of both overt and subtle discrimination. From the data, there was no doubt that blatant, overt discrimination existed toward female conductors. Subtle discrimination, which was more difficult to pinpoint and define, also emerged as a common component of the participants' experiences. They described these events of overt and subtle discrimination as painful. Through the recounting of these situations, two predominant sub-themes emerged for navigating both overt and subtle discrimination. The first approach to navigating discrimination suggested by the participants was to address the situation directly in order to educate others further. The second method for navigating discrimination was to maintain preparedness, confidence, and focus.

All of the women shared advice and visions for the future of the wind band conducting profession. Though the guidance from participants varied, the sheer quantity of data related to this question displayed a desire to invest in future generations. In addition to sharing advice for female conductors, the participants looked toward the future with hope and aspirations for change in the profession. Some of the sub-themes that surfaced included the implementation of musically-informed gestures in conducting instruction and fostering authenticity in conducting from the university students. Additionally, female conductors hoped for a more inclusive profession in wind

conducting. Participants shared a deep desire to witness and be a part of a more inclusive wind conducting profession.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bartleet, Brydie-Leigh. "Re-embodiment of the Gendered Podium." *Context: A Journal of Music Research* 2002: 49–57.
- Beatty, Caroline. "About Caroline Beatty." Accessed August 12, 2019. <https://www.music.txstate.edu>.
- Crider, Paula A. "Paula A. Crider: 2018 ANHE Band Directors Academy." *National Association for Music Education: All-National Honor Ensembles*. Accessed August 9, 2019. <https://nafme.org/wp-content/files/2018/05/Paula-A.-Crider-Bio-and-Headshot.pdf>.
- Davis, Keith. "Renowned Band Director Paula Crider Is Ithaca College's 2008 Arnald Gabriel Visiting Wind Conductor." *IC News*, November 25, 2008. Accessed August 9, 2019. <https://www.ithaca.edu/ic-news/releases/renowned-band-director-paula-crider-is-ithaca-colleges-2008-arnald-gabriel-visiting-wind-conductor-15679/>.
- Draves, Tami J. "Molly and Rachel Become Band Teachers: Teacher Identity Construction During Music Student Teaching." *Contributions to Music Education* 43 (2018): 95-115.
- Foley, Megan J. "Patriarchal Killjoys: The Experiences of Three (Women) University Band Directors." DMA diss., Boston University, 2019.
- Gil et al. "Methods of Data Collection in Qualitative Research: Interviews and Focus Groups." *British Dental Journal* 208 (2008): 291-295. <https://doi.org/10.1038/bdj.2008.192>.
- Gould, E. S. "Cultural Contexts of Exclusion: Women College Band Directors." *Research and Issues in Music Education* 1 (2003): 1–17.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Identification and Application of the Concept of Role Model: Perceptions of Women College Band Directors." *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 20 (2001): 14–18.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Nomadic Turns: Epistemology, Experience, and Women University Band Directors." *Philosophy of Music Education* 13 (2005): 147-164, 187-199.
- Howe, S. W. "A historical View of Women in Music Education Careers." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 17 (2009): 162–183.

- Hoy, Patricia. "About Patricia Hoy." *Arts Awareness*. Accessed August 11, 2019.  
<http://artsawareness.com/about-patricia-hoy/>.
- Jackson, Cheryl. "Women as Leaders of Collegiate Bands, 1850-1980." *College Music Symposium* 38 (1998): 118-25. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374323>.
- Jagow, Shelley M. "Women Orchestral Conductors in America: The Struggle for Acceptance—An Historical View from the Nineteenth Century to the Present." *College Music Symposium* 38 (1998): 126-45.  
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374324>.
- Klena, Pamela. "Interview with Caroline Beatty." *FaceTime*® interview. 22 May 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Interview with Cynthia Johnston Turner." *FaceTime*® interview. 22 May 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Interview with Elizabeth Peterson." *FaceTime*® interview. 18 June 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Interview with Emily Threinen." *FaceTime*® interview. 11 June 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Interview with Mary Schneider." *FaceTime*® interview. 20 June 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Interview with Patricia Hoy." *FaceTime*® interview. 7 June 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Interview with Paula Crider." Email interview. 21 May 2019.
- Lazarou, Loucia. "Women Conductors: A Qualitative Study of Gender, Family, 'The Body' and Discrimination." PhD diss., Durham University, 2017.
- Patton, M.Q. *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, Sage: 2002.
- Peterson, Elizabeth. "Elizabeth Peterson." Accessed August 11, 2019.  
<https://music.illinois.edu/faculty/elizabeth-peterson>.
- Phi Beta Mu – Alpha Chapter. "Paula Crider – Class of 2011." *Texas Bandmasters Hall of Fame: Sponsored by Alpha Chapter – Phi Beta Mu*. 2020. Accessed August 11, 2019. [https://www.pbmalph.org/pbmhalloffamebio.php?HOF\\_Number=233](https://www.pbmalph.org/pbmhalloffamebio.php?HOF_Number=233).
- Schneider, Mary K. "Mary K. Schneider." Accessed August 12, 2019.  
<https://www.emich.edu/music-dance/faculty/m-schneider.php>.
- Sears, C.A.Q. "The Persona Problem: How the Expectations of Masculinity Shape the Female Identity." *Gender, Education, Music & Society* 7, no. 4 (2014): 4-11.



- Shaker, Shannon. "Paucity of Female College Band Directors as Faculty and Conductors at National Conferences in the United States, 2017-2018." DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2020.
- Sheldon, Deborah A., and Linda A. Hartley. "What Color Is Your Baton, Girl? Gender and Ethnicity in Band Conducting." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education* no. 192 (2012): 39-52. doi:10.5406/bulcouresmusedu.192.0039.
- Threinen, Emily. "About Emily C. Threinen." Accessed August 12, 2019. <https://cla.umn.edu/about/directory/profile/threinen>.
- Turner, Cynthia Johnston. "Cynthia Johnston Turner." Accessed August 12, 2019. <https://music.uga.edu/directory/people/cynthia-johnston-turner>.
- Turner, Cynthia Johnston. "Dr. Cynthia Johnston Turner: Biography." Accessed August 14, 2019. <https://www.conn-selmer.com/en-us/education/clinician/profile/cynthia-johnston-turner>.
- Woolfe, Zachary. "Missing from Podiums: Women." *New York Times*, Dec 22, 2013, Late Edition (East Coast). <https://login.libproxy.uncg.edu/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/1470770756?accountid=14604> (accessed March 16, 2019).

## APPENDIX A

### CONSENT TO ACT AS A HUMAN SUBJECT

UNCG IRB Study #19-0359

## UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA AT GREENSBORO

Consent to Act as a Human Subject

Project Title: The Phenomenology of Accomplished Female Conductors: Their Lived Experiences

Principal Investigator and Faculty Advisor: Pamela L. Klena and Dr. Jennifer Walter

Participant's Name:

#### **What are some general things you should know about research studies?**

You are being asked to take part in a research study. Your participation in the study is voluntary. You may choose not to join, or you may withdraw your consent to be in the study, for any reason, without penalty. By choosing to participate, you are giving your consent to the researchers to use your real name in the research study. No pseudonyms will be used to de-identify data.

Research studies are designed to obtain new knowledge. This new information may help people in the future. There may not be any direct benefit to you for being in the research study. There also may be risks to being in research studies. If you choose not to be in the study or leave the study before it is done, it will not affect your relationship with the researcher or the University of North Carolina at Greensboro.

Details about this study are discussed in this consent form. It is important that you understand this information so that you can make an informed choice about being in this research study.

You will be given a copy of this consent form. If you have any questions about this study at any time, you should ask the researchers named in this consent form. Their contact information is below.

#### **What is the study about?**

The purpose of this research project is to gather information regarding the motivations, careers, and life experiences of accomplished female conductors. The data will be thoroughly analyzed and examined for themes, constructs, and interpretations that could serve as the basis for future qualitative and quantitative research. Your participation is voluntary.

#### **Why are you asking me?**

You have been selected because you are a female that has held, or currently holds, a position as a wind band conductor in a collegiate environment. In addition, an ensemble under your direction

has performed in a national or regional College Band Directors National Association (CBDNA) conference, the Midwest International Band Clinic, or a statewide music education conference such as Texas Music Education Association (TMEA). You may also be selected for this study based on publications or presentations at the afore mentioned regional, state, or national conferences. The significance of these qualifications is that the ensembles, publications, or presentations have been peer-reviewed and thus validated by the profession.

**What will you ask me to do if I agree to be in the study?**

If you agree to be in the study, the Principal Investigator (Pam) will interview you one time via Skype for approximately 90 minutes. The interview is semi-structured in nature, consisting of several key questions that help to define areas to be explored, while allowing the you the flexibility to pursue an idea or response in more detail. This interview will be recorded and the data input into a transcription software called NVivo. This software will help to analyze the data, examining it for themes, constructs, and interpretations.

**Is there any audio/video recording?**

The interview will occur during a pre-scheduled time through the internet software application, Skype. Skype can be used on a mobile device, computer, or tablet. Skype is free to download and allows for the audio/video of the calls to be recorded. The audio/video calls can be saved directly to the laptop and downloaded as an MP4 file. The recording of these interviews allows for accurate transcription. Because your voice will be potentially identifiable by anyone who hears the recording, your confidentiality for things you say on the recording cannot be guaranteed although the researcher will try to limit access to the recording as described below.

**What are the risks to me?**

The Institutional Review Board at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro has determined that participation in this study poses minimal risk to participants.

If you have questions, want more information or have suggestions, please contact Pamela L. Klana (principal investigator) and Dr. Jennifer Walter (faculty advisor) who may be reached at (770) 869-6664 or plklana@uncg.edu.

If you have any concerns about your rights, how you are being treated, concerns or complaints about this project or benefits or risks associated with being in this study please contact the Office of Research Integrity at UNCG toll-free at (855) 251-2351.

**Are there any benefits to society as a result of me taking part in this research?**

Women are a minority group in the field of wind band conducting. Although more women are rising to leadership positions within the collegiate wind band profession, the ratio between male and female conductors continues to be disproportional. This study is for the benefit of both the current and future field of wind band conductors and will additionally serve the social sciences in the analysis of women in male-dominated professions to reveal trends across a variety of disciplines.

**Are there any benefits to me for taking part in this research study?**

There are no direct benefits to participants in this study.

**Will I get paid for being in the study? Will it cost me anything?**

There are no costs to you, or payments made for participating in this study.

**How will you keep my information confidential?**

Throughout the study, you will be identified by name and your answers and comments will be attributed to you in order to support the themes presented in the data. During the interview, you may wish to preserve the anonymity of any third parties during personal accounts. This privacy will be respected, and third parties will remain anonymous. Data will be stored on a password-protected workstation through the use of Box for storing electronic data. Video recordings will be stored digitally as audio and video files. All information obtained in this study is strictly confidential unless disclosure is required by law.

**Will my de-identified data be used in future studies?**

Data will not be de-identified and will be kept indefinitely and may be used in future studies without additional consent.

**What if I want to leave the study?**

You have the right to refuse to participate or to withdraw at any time, without penalty. If you do withdraw, it will not affect you in any way. If you choose to withdraw, you may request that any of your data which has been collected be destroyed unless it is in a de-identifiable state. The investigators also have the right to stop your participation at any time. This could be because you have had an unexpected reaction, or have failed to follow instructions, or because the entire study has been stopped.

**What about new information/changes in the study?**

If significant new information relating to the study becomes available which may relate to your willingness to continue to participate, this information will be provided to you.

**Voluntary Consent by Participant:**

By signing this consent form/completing this survey/activity (used for an IRB-approved waiver of signature) you are agreeing that you read, or it has been read to you, and you fully understand the contents of this document and are openly willing consent to take part in this study. All of your questions concerning this study have been answered. By signing this form, you are agreeing that you are 18 years of age or older and are agreeing to participate, in this study described to you Pamela L. Klana.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

## APPENDIX B

### INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL



OFFICE OF RESEARCH INTEGRITY  
2718 Beverly Cooper Moore and Irene Mitchell Moore  
Humanities and Research Administration Bldg.  
PO Box 26170  
Greensboro, NC 27402-6170  
336.256.0253  
Web site: [www.uncg.edu/orc](http://www.uncg.edu/orc)  
Federalwide Assurance (FWA) #216

**To:** Pamela Klana  
Music  
Music Performance, 220 Music Building, Campus, Greensboro, NC 27402-6170

**From:** UNCG IRB

**Date:** 5/10/2019

**RE:** Notice of IRB Exemption

**Exemption Category:** 2.Survey, interview, public observation

**Study #:** 19-0359

**Study Title:** The Phenomenology of Accomplished Female Conductors: Their Lived Experiences

This submission has been reviewed by the IRB and was determined to be exempt from further review according to the regulatory category cited above under 45 CFR 46.101(b).

#### **Study Description:**

This non-confidential qualitative study will use semi-structured interviews with the consent of the participant to gather personal accounts and information from exemplary female wind band conductors. The participants are selected based on a specific criterion which is peer-reviewed by the profession and thus deems the participants exemplary. The data collected will be analyzed to search for themes or inconsistencies. These results will be organized by the themes and supported by the specific personal accounts of the participants. This original study will prove valuable in the preservation of the accounts of female wind band conductors and benefit the field of current and future wind band conductors.

#### **Investigator's Responsibilities**

Please be aware that any changes to your protocol must be reviewed by the IRB prior to being implemented. **Please utilize the the consent form/information sheet with the most recent version date when enrolling participants.** The IRB will maintain records for this study for three years from the date of the original determination of exempt status.

Please be aware that valid human subjects training and signed statements of confidentiality for all members of research team need to be kept on file with the lead investigator. Please note that you will also need to remain in compliance with the university "Access To and Retention of Research Data" Policy which can be found at [http://policy.uncg.edu/university-policies/research\\_data/](http://policy.uncg.edu/university-policies/research_data/).