

Fur, fangs and feathers: colonial and counter-colonial portrayals of American Indians in young adult fantasy literature

Alice Nuttall (2015)

<https://radar.brookes.ac.uk/radar/items/c2b39c47-ca72-43df-ad6d-615dba4faa49/1/>

Note if anything has been removed from thesis: Images on pages 28, 34, 117, 140, 145, 167, 175, 277, 332, 384, 388

Copyright © and Moral Rights for this thesis are retained by the author and/or other copyright owners. A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge. This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder(s). The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

When referring to this work, the full bibliographic details must be given as follows:

Nuttall, Alice (2015)

Fur, fangs and feathers: colonial and counter-colonial portrayals of American Indians in young adult fantasy literature

PhD, Oxford Brookes University

Fur, Fangs and Feathers:

Colonial and counter-colonial portrayals of American
Indians in young adult fantasy literature

By Alice Nuttall

Abstract

Although there have been many postcolonial studies of the portrayals of Native American characters in children's and young adult literature, the majority of these have focused on historical novels, rather than analysing fantasy literature. Additionally, I have found no direct comparisons between texts by Native and non-Native authors, and the impact of authorship on the representations of American Indian characters. I believe that a study of this area of literature is important, as it will serve to examine how the portrayal of Native characters in texts varies depending on the insider or outsider experience of the author.

In my thesis, using critical theory around Gothic, gender and queer studies, I analyse three examples of young adult fantasy literature; the *Twilight* saga by Stephenie Meyer, the *Tantalize* series by Cynthia Leitich Smith, and the novel *Wolf Mark* by Joseph Bruchac. In the first chapter, I study the texts' portrayals of Native American spiritual beliefs, comparing Meyer's use of Quileute legends to bolster her series' mythology with Bruchac's reinterpretation of Abenaki beliefs in *Wolf Mark*. In the next chapter, I focus on the role of Christianity in the novels, considering historical contexts of missionary movements and colonisation. Chapter Three analyses the novels from a gender studies perspective, considering the racialised representations of masculinity and femininity in the texts, while Chapter Four studies the theme of sexuality in the novels. Finally, in the fifth chapter, I look at postcolonial Gothic space in the novels, and its connections to frontiers and borders, both physical and psychic.

As a result of my research, I discovered that the Quileute characters in Meyer's novels correspond with images of Native peoples as 'savage' and animalistic, with Native men portrayed as violent and sexually threatening, and Native women as pitiable and subordinate. Her focus on the 'treaty line' established by the vampires, and the 'civilising process' the main Quileute character Jacob undergoes during his time with the Cullen family, perpetuate colonialist narratives. By contrast, Leitich Smith and Bruchac write against these stereotypes. Bruchac focuses directly on Abenaki characters, writing from an insider perspective that allows him to create a nuanced, non-stereotypical portrayal of a Native protagonist. Although Leitich Smith does not write directly about Native characters or cultures, her representations of gender, sexuality and race correspond with a counter-colonialist perspective.

My direct comparison of texts by Native and non-Native authors shows that an author writing from an outsider perspective is far more likely to use stereotypical portrayals of American Indian characters and cultures than an author with an insider perspective of a Native culture. It also indicates that young adult fantasy literature, with its emphasis on the boundaries between childhood and adulthood, can be used as a site for both conservative and radical narratives on colonialism and postcolonialism.

Acknowledgements

This thesis has been five years in the writing, and would never have appeared at all had it not been for the help of a great many people.

Firstly, a huge thanks goes to the people who supervised me over the years; Lis Jay, Steve Matthews, Dan Lea, and Eoin Flannery, who has been there for the duration. I apologise wholeheartedly for forcing the four of you to read the *Twilight* saga.

Thanks also to my colleagues in the Audio Visual team; Katie, Keeley, Ben, Paul, Stelios, and Tony (who very kindly told me about the fee waiver for part-time students, meaning that I didn't have to scrimp and save quite so much to get through my degree. Sorry about that time I nearly squashed you with the rolling stacks).

Finally, thank you to my friends and family, who have put up with me ranting about sparkly vampires for half a decade; truly the greatest test of loyalty and affection that ever was.

Terminology

Throughout this thesis, I have attempted to use the specific names of American Indian nations when possible. When writing more generally, I have used the words 'Native' and 'American Indian' interchangeably; as far as I have been able to ascertain, they are the most neutral terms available for referring to Native North American peoples.

Contents

Abstract.....	pi
Acknowledgements.....	piii
Terminology.....	piv
Introduction.....	p1
Chapter One.....	p22
Chapter Two.....	p78
Chapter Three.....	p135
Chapter Four.....	p204
Chapter Five.....	p263
Conclusion.....	p324
Bibliography.....	p339
Appendix 1.....	p359
Appendix 2.....	p381
Appendix 3.....	p384
Appendix 4.....	p385
Appendix 5.....	p387

Introduction

Building Blocks and Cementing Stereotypes

Primary Texts: *Twilight*, *Tantalize* and *Wolf Mark*

Texts aimed at children and young adults form an important area of study, not least because, as Clare Bradford et al argue, they often encourage certain mindsets or beliefs in their young readers:¹

Children's literature cannot escape, even if some of its practitioners would wish it to, from ideology, past or present. Because the text is for supposedly 'innocent' readers, it can scarcely be expected to be innocent of itself.²

While the 'ideology' of children's literature may be an unconscious inclusion, resulting from social influences on the author, it nevertheless impacts on the reader. The negative stereotypes that initially influenced the text are normalised and internalised, thus becoming self-perpetuating; new authors, influenced by stereotypes in works that they have consumed, may reinvolve these same stereotypes in texts that they produce. However, an awareness of these stereotypes can lead to their being challenged and deconstructed. This thesis will examine the portrayals of American Indian characters, cultures and related themes in a range of recent young adult texts. It will explore how the authors' uses of these themes relate to colonial stereotypes, either by conforming, or by initiating a process of deconstruction. The chosen texts are teenage fantasy

¹ Clare Bradford, Kerry Mallan, John Stephens and Robyn McCallum, *New World Orders in Contemporary Children's Literature: Utopian transformations* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), p1

² Peter Hunt, *Criticism, Theory, and Children's Literature* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Blackwell Publishers Inc., 1991), p14

novels by three contemporary authors; Cynthia Leitich Smith, Joseph Bruchac, and Stephenie Meyer.

Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight* novels have sold millions of copies worldwide, and have been adapted into high-grossing films. The first novel in Meyer's supernatural romance series was released in 2005, to immediate success. Although the story features vampires and werewolves, it is set in a real town, Forks, and much of the action takes place on a real reservation, La Push, home of the Quileute Nation. Several Quileute figures, notably the teenage werewolf Jacob Black, become central characters in the *Twilight* saga; in the final novel *Breaking Dawn*, Jacob takes over part of the narration, making him the only character other than Bella whose perspective is directly represented in the series.³ The prominent role of the Quileutes in the *Twilight* saga, and the popularity of the series, makes it an important focus of study when examining representations of Native peoples in recent young adult literature.

Two prominent Native authors, Joseph Bruchac and Cynthia Leitich Smith, have also produced young adult fantasy novels. Although his novels have not become a worldwide phenomenon like the *Twilight* series, Bruchac, a member of the Abenaki Nation, is a popular and prolific children's author. His work invariably features Native American protagonists in both historical and modern settings. While many of his novels are realistic fiction, others draw upon fantasy and the supernatural. His young adult novel *Wolf Mark* falls into the second category. It

³ Meyer began a novel titled *Midnight Sun*, a retelling of *Twilight* from Edward's perspective; however, following a leak of one of the early manuscripts, she abandoned the project. The incomplete manuscript is available for download from Meyer's official website, and I have referred to this novel fragment in this thesis.

follows Lucas, a teenage Abenaki boy who, after his father disappears under mysterious circumstances, learns that he is able to shape-shift into a wolf. A study of *Wolf Mark* reveals how writers such as Bruchac have used their insider knowledge of Native cultures to counter stereotypes and portray Native characters as realistic individuals, even within the fantasy genre. Cynthia Leitich Smith is a member of the Muscogee Creek Nation, and often writes about American Indian characters in modern settings. Like Meyer, she has also written a paranormal romance series featuring vampires, werewolves, and other supernatural creatures; the *Tantalize* series.⁴

Peter Hunt asks 'What exactly is being controlled in a text?', a question that will form a central part of this thesis' analysis.⁵ An examination of Meyer, Leitich Smith and Bruchac's works will outline the themes and principles that they choose to 'control', and the effects of these authorial decisions on the influence of their novels. It will also analyse the aspects of the texts which may be involuntarily included, rather than 'controlled', and their significance. According to Kimberley Reynolds, 'children's literature provides a curious and paradoxical cultural space...simultaneously highly regulated and overlooked, orthodox and radical, didactic and subversive'.⁶ From this reading, it becomes apparent that

⁴ *Tantalize*, *Eternal*, *Blessed* and *Diabolical* follow female protagonists as they attempt to survive and find love in a world where vampires and shapeshifters live alongside human society. Unlike many of Leitich Smith's other novels, this series does not feature any explicitly American Indian protagonists. Miranda, introduced in *Eternal*, is Chinese- and Scottish-American. Quincie, the heroine of the first novel in the series, *Tantalize*, is Italian-American. The only main character with any potential indigenous ancestry is Quincie's boyfriend Kieren Morales, whose father is Mexican-American; however, Mr Morales' family background is never explored, so this cannot be confirmed.

⁵ *Criticism, Theory, and Children's Literature*, p14

⁶ Kimberley Reynolds, *Radical Children's Literature: Future visions and aesthetic transformations in juvenile fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), p3

children's and young adult literature is a malleable genre, which can be used to promote vastly differing social and political ideologies, from the ultra-conservative to the ultra-progressive. Reynolds' analysis suggests a deliberate inclusion of these varying themes and political approaches; however, I believe that the unintentional perpetuation of social and political biases is also an important consideration, a study of which will reveal implicit and unconscious prejudices, dangerous precisely because of their less apparent nature. Analysing the works of these three authors will reveal the extent to which they conform to, or subvert, stereotypical representations of American Indians and associated colonial beliefs, determining whether they perpetuate or challenge colonialism, and whether the implicit undertones of the texts correspond with their overt themes and character portrayals.

The current popularity of young adult fantasy novels, particularly those featuring vampires, means that their influence on popular culture and their readerships has important implications. The fantasy genre has been described as '[containing] truths that help the reader understand today's world', and novels where fantasy and the Gothic intersect can lend themselves readily to the tensions and pressures experienced by adolescents.⁷ Bodart suggests that vampires have become popular characters in young adult fiction because, 'to adolescents who are also marginalized figures, outsiders struggling to become insiders or to become comfortable with their outsider status, the vampire's self-acceptance is something to aspire to'; essentially, the constructed deviance of

⁷ Carol G. Lynch-Brown, Carl M. Tomlinson and Kathy G. Short, *Essentials of Children's Literature* (Harlow: Pearson Education Limited, 2014), p128

the vampire is seen as desirable to those who wish to distance themselves from a perceived mainstream.⁸ Roderick McGillis' analysis of Gothic children's literature corresponds with this argument, suggesting that 'Adolescents are, perhaps, as intensely haunted or even more haunted than the rest of us...Their bodies as well as their social milieu are in flux', focusing on the child and adolescent's physical and mental transformations as they move towards adulthood.⁹ However, this conflict between normality and deviance – or rather, traits and statuses depicted as 'normal' or 'deviant' – is also a useful tool through which to explore marginalised social identities, such as racial and ethnic minorities. Supernatural characters such as the vampire are staple figures in Gothic literature, a genre which has also been used to explore issues of colonialism and postcolonialism; the postcolonial Gothic has become a subgenre in its own right. The marginalisation experienced by adolescents can be compared and contrasted with the marginalisation experienced by people of colour in a society that centralises whiteness; the ways in which these forms of marginalisation are presented, through the lens of the Gothic, are central to an analysis of the themes of power and race in the chosen texts. The literary potential of fantasy, combined with the trend towards social commentary and discussion of marginalised peoples in the Gothic, means that a study of young adult Gothic fantasy offers a useful perspective on representations of racism in media aimed at children and teenagers.

⁸ Joni Richards Bodart, *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill: The psychological meaning of supernatural monsters in young adult fiction* (Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 2012), p15

⁹ Roderick McGillis, 'The Night Side of Nature: Gothic spaces, fearful times', from *The Gothic in Children's Literature: Haunting the borders*, edited by Anna Jackson, Karen Coats and Roderick McGillis (Abingdon: Routledge, 2008), p231

The popularity of the *Twilight* series means that its representations of the Quileute Nation have had a noticeable impact on social perceptions of Native peoples. This is not to suggest that Stephenie Meyer is deliberately advancing a colonial agenda; however, critics have argued that her novels contain an implicit 'neocolonial sensibility' which '[maintains] positions of privilege' for white settler cultures, and positions Native peoples as Other.¹⁰ This thesis will focus on the construction and representation of the Quileute characters and community. It will analyse the extent to which the portrayal of Western and Native religious beliefs, the fantasy elements of the story, and the representations of issues such as gender, sexuality and class intersect with stereotypical images of American Indians. By examining Native-authored novels in the same genre as the *Twilight* saga, I will compare the texts' portrayals of these topics and determine the extent to which stereotypes are deconstructed.¹¹

Construction Material: American Indians in colonial literature

Early in my teaching career, a White student I knew asked me what I would be teaching the following semester. I mentioned that I would be

¹⁰ Roderick McGillis, 'Introduction', *Voices of the Other: Children's literature and the postcolonial context* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 2000), pxxiv

¹¹ The *Tantalize* novels do not focus directly upon Native characters, a fact which may initially make them seem unconnected to the subject of this thesis; as Michelle Pagni Stewart asks, 'If a story written by an Ojibwa author does not deal with topics indigenous to his or her people...would we still categorize that book as "Native American"?' (Michelle Pagni Stewart, 'Judging Authors by the Color of their Skin?: Quality Native American children's literature', *MELUS* 27(2), 2002, p179). However, many aspects of the *Tantalize* series can be interpreted as 'writing back' against colonial narratives; for example, the characters' reliance upon Native traditions like smudging, and the series' inclusion of sacred animals such as buffalo.

teaching a course on racism. She replied, with some surprise in her voice, “Oh, is there still racism?”¹²

The belief that we are currently living in a ‘post-racist’ world is, as Beverly Daniel Tatum’s experience with her student indicates, widespread and often unquestioned. The assumed absence of racism extends to the roles of people of colour in literature and popular culture. Non-white characters were once excluded, ridiculed or villainised; however, there are now many positive representations of people of colour in books, films and other examples of popular culture.¹³ However, problematic stereotypes are still prevalent in representations of all non-white characters, including Native Americans. According to Robert F. Berkhofer Jr., white characters in texts are positioned as ‘classifiers’, given agency and purpose; Native characters are ‘classified’, placed in the roles of one-dimensional stock characters rather than being central players in the narrative.¹⁴ This dichotomy suggests that ‘Native Americans were and are real, but the *Indian* was a White invention and still remains largely a White image, if not stereotype’; in short, that these texts have played a role in the classification of a marginalised social group by a dominant, classifying culture.¹⁵ This is particularly true of children’s literature and culture, where ‘Indians are completely denied as ever having existed, or [are] used, like building materials, to construct the façade of

¹² Beverly Daniel Tatum, “*Why Are All The Black Kids Sitting Together In The Cafeteria?*”: *And other conversations about race* (New York: Basic Books, 1997), p3

¹³ For example, black characters were often relegated to the roles of domestic servants or comic relief, such as Stepin Fetchit (Lincoln Perry), who built his career on portraying stereotyped African American characters. However, recent, centralised figures have included Storm from the *X-Men* comics and films, Sephy from Malorie Blackman’s *Noughts and Crosses* novel series, and Kitai and Cypher Raige from the sci-fi film *After Earth* (2013), played by Will and Jaden Smith.

¹⁴ Robert F. Berkhofer Jr., *The White Man’s Indian: Images of the American Indian from Columbus to the present* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979; first published 1978), pxvi

¹⁵ *Ibid*, p3

conquest...These [books] are honest reflections of the society in which Indian people must live...honest reflections of the way most white people think about Indians – as invisible, or as construction material for their own historic national fantasies.¹⁶ In this quote, Deborah A. Miranda describes Native American characters as being ‘constructed’ with a particular agenda, much like Berkhofer’s ‘classified...White image’, used in ways that support colonial narratives. According to Miranda, American Indian characters in literature produced by non-Natives are ‘never human beings’; instead, they are positioned as secondary in relation to the centralised white characters.¹⁷

These observations correspond with Edward Said’s arguments in his famous text *Orientalism*. Said suggests that ‘European culture was able to manage – and even produce – the Orient politically, sociologically, militarily, ideologically, scientifically, and imaginatively’,¹⁸ thus making this figurative location ‘a European invention’ rather than a realistic representation of place, time or culture.¹⁹ Said’s concept of the invented Orient can be transposed onto representations of Native American cultures in young adult literature. Traditions and events are reinterpreted to serve a political and sociological context that centres colonialist values, creating a ‘strategy [of] flexible positional superiority’ that centres white characters and positions Native characters as classified, using

¹⁶ Deborah A. Miranda, foreword to *A Broken Flute: The Native experience in books for children*, edited by Doris Seale and Beverly Slapin (Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press/Berkeley: Oyate, 2005), pp2-3

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism: Western conceptions of the Orient* (London: Penguin Books Ltd., 1995; first published 1978), p3

¹⁹ Ibid, p1

stereotypes which will be outlined and explored in this introduction.²⁰ When a reader considers this 'Orientalist' construction of Native characters in literature, it becomes clear that the implicit purpose of these representations is to shape attitudes towards these peoples and cultures. This ultimately positions them as Other, inferior in relation to white Western characters. Furthermore, when this dichotomy is positioned alongside the 'normalcy-deviancy' dichotomy found in many examples of Gothic literature, the result is to present Native peoples and cultures as 'Other', abnormal and potentially monstrous.

Myth and Monsters: The colonial and postcolonial Gothic

In addition to analysing the aspects of the texts that relate to postcolonialism and other critical theory surrounding studies of race and racism, the supernatural context of the chosen novels means that it is necessary to consider their place within the Gothic genre, and the relationship between the texts' Gothic elements and their portrayals of American Indian peoples and cultures. The connection between the Gothic and marginalised identities, such as those of ethnic minorities, has been frequently remarked upon. In *Our Vampires, Ourselves*, Nina Auerbach argues that the characterisation and popularity of vampires owes much to 'paranoia [and] xenophobia';²¹ the fear of 'the "dark" foreigner [and] invasion' that Cynthia Leitich identifies in the 'conversation of sorts' between her

²⁰ Ibid, p7

²¹ Nina Auerbach, *Our Vampires, Ourselves* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995), pvii

and Bram Stoker that forms the basis of the *Tantalize* series.²² Focusing on 'objects and practices that are constructed as negative, irrational, immoral and fantastic', the Gothic is a fertile ground for reinvoking and perpetuating negative stereotypes regarding people who are Other, whether because of their race, gender, sexuality, or other attributes.²³ Madrid's analysis of the process of Othering shows how easily this concept aligns with the Gothic and with horror narratives; he states that 'There is a darker side to otherness as well...The other disturbs, disquiets, discomforts...It provokes distrust and suspicion...The other makes people feel anxious, nervous, apprehensive, even fearful'.²⁴ Society constructs non-white people as Other, and therefore monstrous, making them ideal candidates to take on monstrous roles within literature; which, in turn, perpetuates the stereotype of an inherent Otherness and monstrosity in non-white people.

Any analysis must be careful not to oversimplify the Gothic; as Catherine Spooner argues, the Gothic 'no longer fits a convenient definition – if it ever did'.²⁵ The Gothic genre, like children's literature, is a flexible medium, which has been used by many authors to challenge social stereotyping and conservatism, '[giving] voice to suppressed groups' who are able to use the medium of fantasy and the supernatural in order to explore oppressive power structures.²⁶ Charles L. Crow suggests that it has been 'especially congenial to women authors, who

²² Cynthia Leitich Smith, *Blessed* (London: Walker Books Ltd, 2011), p459

²³ Fred Botting, *Gothic* (London: Routledge, 1996), p2

²⁴ 'Missing people and others: Joining together to expand the circle', *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, p19

²⁵ Catherine Spooner, 'Preface', from *Twenty-First Century Gothic* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010), pxi

²⁶ Charles L. Crow, *History of the Gothic: American Gothic* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2009), p1

found in it ways to explore alternative visions of female life, power, and even revenge', a freedom that has also been made use of by authors of colour.²⁷ Studies of the postcolonial Gothic reveal that it has also been used as a tool to challenge colonial themes in more traditional Gothic tales; for example, Victoria Amador argues that the African-American writer Jewelle Gomez, author of *The Gilda Stories*, uses her narrative to 'challenge a white supremacist discourse in which race and gender are constructed as differences, and difference is equated with inequality'.²⁸

The concept of 'primitivism' is an important consideration in an analysis of the representation of Native characters and themes in young adult fantasy literature, particularly that which draws upon Gothic tropes. During the Enlightenment, there was a focus on the idea of the 'noble savage' as a superior being, uncorrupted by negative traits associated with Western society; primitivism was romanticised. However, a negative interpretation of primitivism developed in nineteenth-century America, particularly in frontier areas where there was a great deal of conflict between Native peoples and settlers; for example, 'in 1882, a new secretary of the interior from Colorado wrote a furious letter to the commissioner of Indian Affairs, complaining about the "barbaric" customs of Indians'.²⁹ Portrayals of American Indians have often relied on concepts of primitivism and savagery (see Appendix 1). According to Paula Gunn Allen, 'Americans divide

²⁷ Charles L. Crow, editor, *American Gothic: From Salem witchcraft to H. P. Lovecraft, an anthology* (Chicester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013), p2

²⁸ Victoria Amador, 'Dark Ladies: Vampires, lesbians, and women of colour', from *Gothic Studies*, Volume 15, No. 1 (May 2013), pp10-11

²⁹ Robert Yazzie, 'Indigenous Peoples and Postcolonial Colonialism', from *Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision*, edited by Maria Battiste (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2000), p40

Indians into two categories: the noble savage and the howling savage...the noble savage is seen as the appealing but doomed victim of the inevitable evolution of humanity from primitive to postindustrial society orders'.³⁰ This view flourished in the nineteenth century, as Robert F. Beckhofer Jr. notes in *The White Man's Indian*:

The primitivist tradition did not create a favorable impression of the Indian; rather, it shaped the vocabulary and the imagery the explorers and settlers used to describe their actual experiences in the New World and the lifestyles they observed among its peoples.³¹

However, it continued in more subtle forms into the twentieth and twenty-first, and the focus on the 'primitivism' of Native peoples can be found in media from novels and films to school textbooks. As Allen continues, 'No Indian can grow to any age without being informed that her people were "savages" who interfered with the march of progress pursued by respectable, loving, civilized white people', a dichotomy between primitivism and progress that reflects the distinction between the affluent Cullens, who surround themselves with the latest technology, and the poorer Quileutes.³² When considered alongside the Cullens' refined natures, and the wild, uncontrollable temperaments of the werewolves, it becomes apparent that the stereotype of the Native American as 'primitive' is one facet of their characterisation as monstrous, and therefore as a racialised Gothic 'Other'.

³⁰ Paula Gunn Allen, *The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the feminine in American Indian traditions* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1992; first published 1986), p4

³¹ Robert F. Beckhofer Jr., *The White Man's Indian: Images of the American Indian from Columbus to the present* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979; first published 1978), p73

³² *Ibid*, p49

Critical Frameworks: 'Othering' and intersectionality

'Othering' is a term frequently used in postcolonial and anti-racist criticism, and one which can be strongly associated with the Gothic presentation of deviance and monstrosity. The term 'Othering' suggests that an attribute which places a person in a position of social dominance – for example, whiteness, heterosexuality, or an absence of disability – is coded as 'normal'. People who do not have these attributes are subsequently placed in opposition to 'normality'; they are 'Othered' because of their difference. Arturo Madrid describes Othering as 'feeling different...being on the edges, on the margins...feeling excluded...even disdained and scorned', illustrating the negative effects of the process of Othering upon those individuals who are Othered.³³ The effect of the specific Othering of Native peoples is described by Louis Owens:

European America holds a mirror and a mask up to the Native American. The tricky mirror is the Other presence that reflects the Euro-American consciousness back at itself...For the dominant culture, the Euro-American controlling this surveillance, the reflection provides merely a self-recognition.³⁴

Native characters in colonial literature have traditionally been stereotyped in a way that reflects colonialist biases, and are manipulated to establish an image of inferiority that legitimises colonial processes. Rather than automatically being innocent stories, texts aimed at children can be 'marked by a pervasive

³³ Arturo Madrid, 'Missing people and others: Joining together to expand the circle', *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, edited by Margaret L. Andersen and Patricia Hill Collins (Belmont: Thomson Higher Education, 2007), p19

³⁴ Louis Owens, 'As If An Indian Were Really An Indian: Native American voices and postcolonial theory', *Native American Representations: First encounters, distorted images and literary appropriations*, edited by Gretchen M. Bataille (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2001), p17

commitment to social practice, and particularly to representing or interrogating those social practices deemed worthy of preservation'.³⁵ According to critics such as Luis Nieves Falcón, children's novels became 'intellectual instruments to perpetuate subordination and exploitation'.³⁶ This view implies a deliberate, organised attempt at indoctrination; however, I believe that the prevalence of racist stereotypes during this period meant that colonial texts also unconsciously echoed social prejudices, featuring implicit rather than purposeful racism, something that has continued in texts up to the modern day.

While a reader may expect to find stereotypical or unrealistic portrayals of American Indian characters in texts written during this period of colonisation, they may also assume that these negative representations are absent from more recent literature. However, Miranda's foreword describes novels from the mid- to late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. These texts, she argues, have continued to support the development of a colonial mindset in young readers. In 'Indigenizing Children's Literature', Debbie Reese states that 'it has been difficult to dislodge narratives that misrepresent and marginalize American Indians...The field is more inclusive, but it has yet to shake the deep structures of Western thought...that frame Native as Other'.³⁷ Instead of dismantling colonial stereotypes, modern constructions of American Indian characters have absorbed and perpetuated these negative representations. Miranda's account in *A Broken*

³⁵ *New World Orders in Contemporary Children's Literature*, p2

³⁶ Luis Nieves Falcón, 'The Oppressive Function of Values, Concepts and Images in Children's Books', *The Slant of the Pen: Racism in children's books*, edited by Roy Preiswerk (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1980), p6

³⁷ Debbie Reese, 'Indigenizing Children's Literature', *Journal of Language and Literacy Education*, 4(2), 2008, p60

Flute outlines two problems with the portrayal of American Indians in recent children's and young adult literature. The first is erasure; texts which either ignore or make only passing reference to the presence of American Indian nations in US history, let alone in current American society. The second is misrepresentation; if the existence of Native peoples is acknowledged, they are reduced to 'building materials', rather than being granted agency and represented as realistic figures. Stereotypes of American Indians are simplistic in nature, but the colonial and discriminatory contexts that surround them are complex, as Appendix 1 explores. A study of racist ideologies indicates that there is a strong relationship between discrimination on the basis of race, and discrimination based on other attributes. Critical works such as *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, and *Identities: Race, class, gender and nationality* focus on the links between different forms of discrimination, and the importance of recognising these links when analysing oppressive views and practices:

All students of society and all who want to become effective citizens must become educated about the multiple identities that structure our social worlds in order to be able to understand, evaluate, and, if they choose, meaningfully participate in the struggles against identity-based forms of oppression.³⁸

African-American feminist Kimberlé Crenshaw summarised this linking of various axes of oppression as 'intersectionality', a critical approach that considers the relationship between and impact of multiple forms of discrimination. Crenshaw criticises the '[conflation of]...intragroup differences', arguing that 'the violence

³⁸ Linda Martín Alcoff, 'Introduction: Identities: Modern and postmodern', *Identities: Race, class, gender and nationality*, edited by Linda Martín Alcoff and Eduardo Mendieta (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005; first published 2003), p2

that many women experience is often shaped by other dimensions of their identities, such as race and class'.³⁹ Although Crenshaw's work concentrates on prejudice experienced by women of colour, the concept of intersectionality has been adopted by many branches of feminism, anti-racism, and other activist movements, which push for a focus on the relationships between various forms of oppression.

Applying Crenshaw's concept of intersectionality to literary texts invites a reader to engage in a more nuanced analysis of the theme of race, and how it relates to other aspects of a character's identity, such as their gender or sexuality. According to Kathy Davis, 'intersectionality addresses the most central theoretical and normative concern within feminist scholarship...the acknowledgement of differences among women'; however, it also provides a useful framework for studying marginalisations experienced by other groups, such as Native American men.⁴⁰ This thesis will explore the links between racism and other systems of social inequality, such as sexism, homophobia, and the division between people of different economic backgrounds, and examine how these issues manifest in fantasy novels featuring Native characters.

³⁹ Kimberle Crenshaw, 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color', *Stanford Law Review*, Vol. 43 (1993), p1242

⁴⁰ Kathy Davis, 'Intersectionality as Buzzword: A sociology of science perspective on what makes a feminist theory successful', from *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies*, edited by Helma Lutz, Maria Teresa Herrera Vivar and Linda Supik (Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2011), p45

Constructing Resistance: Colonial and counter-colonial writing

Many Native writers have deconstructed inaccurate portrayals of American Indian peoples in literature. Critical works like *A Broken Flute* draw attention to inaccuracies and implicit racism in children's texts. Novels by writers such as Sherman Alexie, Louise Erdrich and Art Coulson present well rounded, realistic Native characters that resist stereotypical simplification and, as Reese suggests, 'dislodge' negative tropes surrounding American Indian peoples.⁴¹ In their counter-colonial writing, Native authors have reinscribed various Western literary traditions and incorporated influences from their own cultures; Joseph Bruchac observes that 'Native Americans have not only mastered the literary forms of the West, but also drawn on their own oral traditions as they shaped those literary forms towards their own purposes'.⁴² This '[strategy] of interpolation' allows the authors to '[recreate] the enemy's language', subverting colonial tropes to present a counter-colonial message.⁴³ However, as negative depictions of American Indians are so entrenched in children's and young adult literature, this deconstruction is an ongoing process.

While there has been a great deal of critical work on the portrayal of Native Americans in children's and young adult literature and culture, and on

⁴¹ Sherman Alexie and Louise Erdrich have written many novels and short stories, such as *The Lone Ranger and Tonto Fistfight in Heaven* (Alexie) and *Love Medicine* (Erdrich), featuring Native characters in contemporary settings. Art Coulson is the author of *Robopocalypse*, a sci-fi novel where a significant portion of the human resistance against a robotic dictatorship takes place on a reservation.

⁴² Joseph Bruchac, 'Foreword: The gift is still being given', *Smoke Rising: The Native North American literary companion*, edited by Joseph Bruchac, Janet Witalec and Sharon Malinowski (Detroit: Visible Ink Press, 1995), pxviii

⁴³ *Unsettling Narratives*, p60

writing by American Indian authors, existing criticism has focused primarily on realistic fiction, rather than on fantasy. As far as I have been able to ascertain, there have been no direct comparisons of fantasy series by Native and non-Native authors. As young adult fantasy is currently a popular literary genre, I believe that a study of the representations of American Indians, and the counter-colonialist potential of Native-authored texts, is an important area of study. The thesis will also refer extensively to writing by Native critics. Their insider perspectives provide an essential view into the impact of stereotyping on Native peoples in modern society.

Paying attention to this criticism and these perspectives is particularly important for me, a non-Native researcher; as bell hooks notes in her text *Talking*

Back:

Even if perceived “authorities” writing about a group to which they do not belong and/or over which they wield power are progressive, caring, and right-on in every way, as long as their authority is constituted by either the absence of the voices of those individuals whose experiences they seek to address, or the dismissal of those voices as unimportant, the subject-object dichotomy is maintained and domination is reinforced.⁴⁴

As hooks suggests, it is impossible for a white writer to accurately study the establishment and deconstruction of stereotypes of American Indians without an in-depth focus on critical explorations of these stereotypes by Native writers. Because many Native critics, such as Adrienne Keene of *Native Appropriations* and Debbie Reese of *American Indians in Children’s Literature*, use blogging as

⁴⁴ bell hooks, *Talking Back: Thinking feminist, thinking black* (Boston: South End Press, 1989), p43

their main medium of critical expression, this thesis will use several academic blogs as secondary critical materials.

Chapter Breakdown

Although *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* and *Twilight* series are products of the twenty-first rather than twentieth and late nineteenth centuries, they exist in the context of earlier works. Because of this, they have been influenced to a certain degree by the four common stereotypes explored in Appendix 1. The *Twilight* saga implicitly incorporates these stereotypes, while the *Tantalize* series and *Wolf Mark* deliberately write against them. One way in which this is apparent is the different texts' treatments of Native American cultures and traditions. A critical analysis of the portrayals of these spiritualities, and the potential implications of their use in the novels, will form the basis of the first chapter. This chapter will examine the ways in which Native cultures and religious beliefs are 'Othered' in the *Twilight* series, and the ways in which this contributes to the view of the Quileutes as monstrous. It will also consider the role of cultural appropriation in this process of Othering, and the colonial framework surrounding Meyer's use of Quileute legends, before comparing *Twilight's* portrayal of Quileute culture with Bruchac's depiction of Abenaki beliefs and society.

The second chapter will examine the texts' uses of Western religious beliefs, with a particular focus on the relationship between Native peoples and Christianity, including an examination of colonial contexts such as the missionary

movements and religious boarding-school programmes. Once again, this chapter will use the concept of Othering as a critical framework, examining how Christianity is normalised in comparison to Native spiritual beliefs, and the impact of this normalisation on the representation of Native peoples. It will also consider the counter-colonial portrayal of Christianity as an Othered belief in *Wolf Mark*, and the emphasis on cultural renewal in both Bruchac's novel and the *Tantalize* series.

The third chapter will engage with an intersectional reading of colonial and counter-colonial writing, analysing the gendered aspects of the theme of race in the texts. Here, the thesis will focus on the different authors' representations of Native and white masculinity and femininity, and the implications for the texts' male and female characters. It will consider Gothic gendering and racialising through an intersectional lens, examining the impact of the texts' representations of these facets of characters' identities. The chapter will focus closely on the gendered and racial implications of the different portrayals of werewolves and vampires in the *Twilight* series, and the distinctions between the authors' representations of these Gothic creatures.

The fourth chapter will deal with representations of sexuality, exploring the racialisation of relationships and the depiction of non-white sexuality as monstrous. Using critical discussions around the queer Gothic and the Othering of non-Western perspectives on sexuality as a framework, the chapter will examine how the texts create conservative or radical narratives around a range of forms of sexuality, with an emphasis on the figure of the vampire as 'deviant',

and the relationship between this and Leitch Smith's identification of the traditional vampire as 'dark foreigner' and invader.

The final chapter will focus on the use of land and landscape in relation to territory and boundaries in the texts, with an emphasis on the role of postcolonialism in Gothic narratives set in the United States. It will examine both physical boundaries and the context of colonialism, and metaphorical boundaries between different aspects of characters' identities, using intersectionality as a critical framework to determine the underlying implications of the authors' choices in characterisation.

Chapter One

“Scary Stories”: Colonial and counter-colonial treatments of American Indian legends

Cultural Appropriation: A background

When non-Natives write about Natives, that’s colonial literature. It can be great literature, it can be wonderful, amazing, but it’s still colonial literature. And I think the United States forgets it colonized the Native Americans.¹

In this interview, Coeur d’Alene/Spokane author Sherman Alexie discusses the problems that occur when authors from a dominant culture write about marginalised groups. In much the same way as Said’s Orientalism was ‘a style of thought based upon an ontological and epistemological distinction made between “the Orient” and...“the Occident”’, Western attitudes towards Native Americans are framed by ideologies built upon policies of colonialism.² However innocent the author’s intention, the colonial context of writing around Native peoples means that, when written by cultural outsiders, Native characters are automatically positioned as Other. The term ‘cultural outsiders’ refers to non-Native authors, who do not have the same personal experience of American Indian cultures as Native authors. Alexie’s statement focuses on authors writing as cultural outsiders, rather than as insiders. His words suggest that one of the

¹ Sherman Alexie, in interview with Jesse Sposato, ‘The absolutely true interview with Sherman Alexie, an amazing part-time Indian’, (http://sadiemagazine.com/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=237&Itemid=235)

² *Orientalism*, p2

major problems with this form of writing is that it is inherently colonial, centring on the issue of cultural appropriation.³

The line between being influenced by a culture and appropriating that culture has been fiercely debated, as the nature of appropriation is often difficult to define. In her critical work *Adaptation and Appropriation*, Julie Sanders defines appropriation as something which 'clearly extends far beyond the adaptation of other texts into new literary creations, assimilating both historical lives and events'.⁴ According to Sanders, 'an adaptation signals a relationship with an informing source text or original'.⁵ Adaptations often relate directly to specific texts, with no negative consequences; *The Stars' Tennis Balls* by Stephen Fry does not erase or eclipse *The Count of Monte Cristo*, but instead provides a link back to the original novel, extending rather than overriding its literary influence. Joanne Harris' novels *Runemarks*, *Runelight* and *The Gospel of Loki* use Norse mythology, but do not purport to represent Scandinavian peoples.

In contrast to adaptation, 'appropriation frequently affects a more decisive journey away from the informing source into a wholly new cultural product and

³ Appropriation has long been a focus of concern in the writings of many Native authors, bloggers and critics. In his critical text *Playing Indian*, Philip J. Deloria discusses the problems surrounding the tradition of non-Natives 'dressing as an Indian' for costume parties and holidays such as Halloween (Philip J. Deloria, *Playing Indian* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998), p5). Professor Debbie Reese, author of the academic blog *American Indians in Children's Literature* points out the misrepresentation and stereotyping of American Indian peoples and cultures in mainstream children's and young adult texts. Another blog, *Native Appropriations*, written by postgraduate student Adrienne Keene, deals with cross-media examples of appropriation of Native cultures, whether in music videos, film, or fashion. Examples of appropriation featured on the blog include the release of the 2013 film version of *The Lone Ranger* and the problematic nature of Johnny Depp's portrayal of Tonto; the issue of 'Indian' sports mascots; and the fashion firm Paul Ryan's decision to throw an American Indian-themed promotional party.

⁴ Julie Sanders, *Adaptation and Appropriation* (London: Routledge, 2006), p148

⁵ *Ibid*, p26

domain'.⁶ This separation from the 'informing source' and creation of a 'new cultural product' may initially seem innocuous; however, the impact of adaptation and appropriation changes when the texts in question feature colonised peoples and cultures. When Sanders writes that appropriation '[assimilates] both historical lives and events', it is possible that a reader will assume that these lives and events will be assimilated accurately. The implication is that there will be no distortion of the reality of a particular culture, and that the representation will incorporate nuanced cultural and historical contexts. This has not been the case with literary and popular representations of American Indian cultures. In *Cannibal Culture*, Deborah Root argues that the imbalance of power between coloniser and colonised is as apparent in the creation of texts as it was in the settling of America, stating that 'It is the colonist...who will decide what is authentic and, by extension, what is worth paying attention to, saving, or stealing'.⁷ As a result, the world is viewed as 'a warehouse of treasure, with the plunder of choice this time more aesthetic than explicitly material'.⁸ The appropriation of Native cultures for mainstream consumption is indeed a form of 'plundering'; the abuse of elements of American Indian cultures, particularly legends and other spiritual beliefs, has an undeniable impact on modern-day Native communities, which will be explored in this chapter.

S. Elizabeth Bird describes the construction of American Indians in mainstream American literature and culture as 'mythmaking'. American Indian

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Deborah Root, *Cannibal Culture: Art, appreciation, and the commodification of difference* (Boulder: Westview Press, 1998), p21

⁸ Ibid.

characters featured in popular media are not accurate representations, but fictional constructions, described by Raymond William Stedman as ‘shadow Indians’ who ‘fight desperately on screen in defense of their asserted rights, but die trying to kill the white hero...They pledge their love to handsome army scouts, but soon their white doeskin dresses are stained with their own blood...They inspire thousands of athletic spectators, but usually disguised as court fools.’⁹ These ‘shadow Indians’ include the wild savage, the noble savage, the vanishing Indian, and the mystic Indian (see Appendix 1). These portrayals of American Indians are not only removed from reality, but were created with a specific colonial agenda. In some cases, this agenda is the justification of colonial practices such as enforced assimilation and the conversion of Native peoples to Christianity.¹⁰ These negative stereotypes were intended to influence public opinion against American Indian peoples, making colonialist policies more acceptable.

‘Honouring’: Justifications of appropriation

One of the most prominent aspects of ‘the civilizing and rationalizing mission of European settlement’ in the American colonial period was the concept and

⁹ Raymond William Stedman, *Shadows of the Indian: Stereotypes in American culture* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1982), p5

¹⁰ ‘The imagery of the stereotypical Drunken Indian – violent, lawless, impetuous – emerges clearly...as one of the instruments that attuned Western collective consciousness to the notion of a North America awaiting the civilizing and rationalizing mission of European settlement’, Bonnie Duran, ‘Indigenous Versus Colonial Discourse: Alcohol and American Indian identity’, *Dressing in Feathers*, p113

practice of Manifest Destiny.¹¹ A study of Manifest Destiny reveals that it ‘had a racial component...America’s self-defined Anglo-Saxons felt they held the leading role in educating, civilizing, and conquering the continent and dominating American Indians’.¹² Anglo-American settlers were constructed as a benign, paternalistic community whose task was to ‘educate’ and ‘civilise’ Native peoples, who were consistently positioned as childlike or primitive, and therefore in need of this benevolent domination.¹³ Consciously or unconsciously, literary and popular texts featuring American Indian characters served this agenda of either demonising or infantilising American Indian peoples. This process was intended to justify their assimilation into or destruction by white society,¹⁴ creating what Gerald Vizenor describes as ‘manifest manners...the simulations of dominance...the notions and misnomers that are read as the authentic and

¹¹ According to Robert J. Miller, ‘Historians have for the most part agreed that there are three basic themes to Manifest Destiny...The special virtues of the American people and their institutions...America’s mission to redeem and remake the world in the image of America... [and] a divine destiny under God’s direction to accomplish this wonderful task’. Robert J. Miller, *Native America, Discovered and Conquered: Thomas Jefferson, Lewis and Clark, and Manifest Destiny* (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2006), p120

¹² Ibid.

¹³ This is apparent, for example, in the establishment of the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) in 1831. According to Scott B. Vickers, ‘As the BIA went about its business trying to “civilize” its Indian wards, it consistently voiced the belief that civilization and Christianization were to go hand in hand toward helping the savage Indian achieve full membership of the human race’. (Scott B. Vickers, *Native American Identities: From stereotype to archetype in art and literature* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1998), p20).

¹⁴ Present-day society in the United States is multicultural, and even white American citizens have ties to a variety of different European cultures; for example, many Americans identify as Irish-American, Italian-American or German-American. However, several anti-racist critics have argued that present-day American society privileges and centres whiteness; for example, the documentary *White Like Me* claims that ‘white privilege continues to shape individual attitudes, electoral politics, and government policy’ (Media Education Foundation, ‘White Like Me: Race, racism and white privilege in America’, *Media Education Foundation* (www.mediaed.org/cgi-bin/commerce.cgi?preadd=action&key=421), accessed 3rd March 2014). When I use the term ‘white’ or ‘mainstream’ society, I refer to a society that engages in this structural privileging of whiteness, rather than specifically to white individuals.

sustained as representations of Native American Indians'.¹⁵ Non-Native authors' outsider perspectives contributed to the misrepresentation and misunderstanding of Native cultures, and their presentation as Other to Euro-American ways of living. The variety of colonial stereotypes position American Indian characters in 'an uneven exchange with various kinds of power'.¹⁶ This comprises either direct colonisation in the form of expansion and genocide, cultural colonisation in the form of assimilation, or the erasure inherent in the literary trope of the 'vanishing Indian'. In *Orientalism*, Said argues that 'once we begin to think of Orientalism as a kind of Western projection onto and will to govern over the Orient, we will encounter few surprises'.¹⁷ Although this thesis focuses on constructions of American Indians and 'Indian country' rather than Asian peoples and 'the Orient', several aspects of Said's theory can be applied to the treatment of Native peoples in Western literature.

In light of these historical manifestations of colonialism, the recent focus upon Native peoples and cultures in film, literature, fashion and other areas may seem positive. Rather than being positioned as inferior, American Indian cultures are instead viewed as a rich source of inspiration. Cultural outsiders have often attempted to defend accusations of appropriation by arguing that their intention was not to harm or erase, but instead to pay homage. Defenders of the naming of sports teams such as the Washington Redskins, the Atlanta Braves or the

¹⁵ Gerald Vizenor, 'Manifest Manners: Postindian warriors of survivance', *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, edited by Vincent B. Leitch (London: W. W. Norton & Co., 2001), pp1978-1979

¹⁶ *Orientalism*, p12

¹⁷ *Ibid*, p95

Chicago Blackhawks have attempted to justify the use of names and mascots as 'honouring'.¹⁸

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: lefthookjournal.wordpress.com

However, critics have responded by pointing out that the term 'redskin' is a racial slur, and that similar slurs regarding other ethnicities or social groups would not be tolerated as names for sports teams:

If what they say [about honouring] is true, then isn't it time we spread such "inoffensiveness" and "good cheer" around among *all* groups...we need an NFL team called "Niggers" to honor Afro-Americans...Teams like the Kansas City "Kikes", Hanover "Honkies", San Leandro "Shylocks",

¹⁸ An NFL spokesman commented on the Washington Redskins controversy with the statement "The name from its origin was always intended to be positive and has always been used by the team in a highly respectful manner" (Brian McCarthy, quoted in 'Washington face protests over Redskins name at Green Bay Packers', Steve Busfield, from *The Guardian Online*, Friday 13th September 2013 (www.theguardian.com/sport/2013/sep/13/washington-redskins-protest-green-bay-packers-oneida-indian-nation), accessed 24th November 2013).

Daytona “Dagos” and Pittsburgh “Polacks” will fill a certain social void among white folk.¹⁹

While many of the groups mentioned in Churchill’s article experience oppression and bigotry, the use of these slurs as names for sports teams would be widely condemned; therefore, it is hypocritical to excuse the use of a comparable slur referring to Native Americans. No matter how honourable its intent, the impact of appropriation is invariably damaging (see Appendix 2). In keeping with Miranda’s observation that American Indian characters written by non-Native authors are ‘used, like building materials, to construct the façade of conquest’, these characters become building blocks, supporting a social structure which encourages the consumption of Native cultural artefacts, practices and beliefs. This is apparent in the representation of Quileute culture, legends and spiritual beliefs found in Stephenie Meyer’s *Twilight* series.

Life on the Rez: Reality and fiction

In *Seduced by Twilight*, Natalie Wilson writes that ‘Literature historically played a huge role in the framing of Native Americans as uncivilized and savage, and Meyer’s texts, I argue, carry on that project’.²⁰ A close reading of the novels supports this statement. Meyer’s Quileutes engage with the modern world, and do not correspond with the ‘wild savage’ stereotype (see Appendix 1) of ‘lacking

¹⁹ Ward Churchill, ‘Crimes Against Humanity’, *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, pp337-378. Ward Churchill’s status as Native American has been called into question; however, the points he makes in this article are still relevant to the issue of appropriation.

²⁰ Natalie Wilson, *Seduced by Twilight: The allure and contradictory message of the popular saga* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2011), p159

any conscious or moral motivation'; instead, they have a substantial level of agency within the plot.²¹ However, many aspects of the depiction of the Quileutes imply that they are 'in need of paternalistic guidance, self-improvement, education, civilization [and] conversion', help which can be provided by the white settler vampires.²² *Twilight's* portrayal of the Quileutes owes much to the colonial gaze, both in its representations of everyday life for Native people in the twenty-first century United States, and in the series' use of Quileute legends.

There are several positive aspects to *Twilight's* depiction of the Quileute nation. A problem frequently identified by Native critics is that texts by non-Native authors often portray American Indian cultures as existing only in the past. For example, the *Indian in the Cupboard* series, despite its modern setting, focuses on historical American Indians, plucking its Native characters from the seventeenth century rather than from the present.²³ Alternatively, texts with contemporary settings may depict American Indians as culturally undeveloped and unable to cope with the modern world. In *Bearstone* by Will Hobbs, the protagonist Cloyd, a Ute teenager, is described to his new guardian:

"The school says he just won't do the work, but I'm not even sure he knows how. He's fourteen, but he missed four years of school back in Utah."

"Four years! Where was he?"

"Out in the canyons, herding his grandmother's goats. I think he's at least half-wild."²⁴

²¹ *Native American Identities*, p5

²² *Ibid*, p4

²³ The series makes only one reference to the fact that American Indians exist in the present day: "Tens of thousands of Mohawks, and other Iroquois tribes, have survived. A lot of them are still living in a few reservations around the US-Canada border. They still have their pride and their identity." (Lynne Reid Banks, *The Key to the Indian* (London: Collins, 1999; first published 1998), p171)

²⁴ Will Hobbs, *Bearstone* (New York: Atheneum, 1989), p8

This attitude is in keeping with historical Western opinions on Native methods of raising children. Prior to the Indian Child Welfare Act of 1978, bias against traditional ways of childrearing led to many Native children being removed from their families.²⁵ According to Andrea Smith:

The reasons children were taken from their homes were often vague and generally ethnocentric...Reasons that might be given for removal included ones such as children were "running wild". Native families were and are often targeted because they did not fit the dominant society's nuclear family norm. For instance, when Native children reside with multiple adults and family members in their extended families, the biological parents were and are often seen as "neglecting" their children.²⁶

Considering the prevalence of representations of Native societies as either primitive or consigned to history, it is heartening that a popular series shows American Indians participating fully in modern society. *Twilight's* Quileutes enjoy the same pastimes as their white counterparts; Billy Black and Charlie Swan go fishing and watch sports together, while Jacob mends cars and motorbikes, and goes to the cinema with Bella. Latoya Peterson, editor of the website *Racialicious*, points out that '[while] Jacob and his family live on a reservation...they are not perpetually in a time warp'.²⁷ Meyer subverts the trend of representing American Indian nations as either extinct or entirely separate from present-day American society. Additionally, the adaptation of the books into

²⁵ Despite the instatement of the Indian Child Welfare Act, the adoption and fostering of Native children remains an area fraught with controversy. Recent cases include that of 'Baby Veronia', a young girl whose Cherokee father contested her adoption by a white couple. As of 23 September 2013, Veronia remains with her adoptive parents.

²⁶ Andrea Smith, *Conquest: Sexual violence and American Indian genocide* (Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 2005), p41

²⁷ Latoya Peterson, 'Running with the Wolves: A *Racialicious* reading of the *Twilight* saga' (<http://www.racialicious.com/2009/11/26/running-with-the-wolves-a-racialicious-reading-of-the-twilight-saga>), accessed 6th June 2010

a successful film series has provided roles for young Native actors such as Chaske Spencer, as well as for more established actors like Graham Greene.²⁸ The descriptions of La Push in the *Twilight* novels initially seem realistic, neither romanticised nor tragic. Jacob lives in 'a small wooden [house] with narrow windows',²⁹ and works on his ancient car in a garage that is 'no more than a couple of big preformed sheds that had been bolted together with their interior walls knocked out'.³⁰ There is a distinct contrast between Jacob's reservation home and the Cullens' opulent dwelling; the Cullens' house is 'timeless, graceful...three stories tall, rectangular and well-proportioned', and their garage is stocked with luxury sports cars.³¹ It is true that the Cullens are inhumanly wealthy; however, there is also a difference between the economic resources of the Quileutes and those of Forks' white suburban population. Financially, Bella and Charlie are far closer to Jacob and Billy than they are to the Cullen clan; the Swans live in a 'small, two-bedroom house',³² with one bathroom and a cramped kitchen.³³ However, Charlie is able to buy Bella's truck outright, while Jacob must save in order to fix his car; unlike Bella, there is no indication that Jacob owns a computer; and Jacob's wardrobe is so limited that, in *Breaking Dawn*, he must borrow clothes from the Cullens. Although neither family is rich, it is clear that the Swans have more disposable income than the Blacks. This reflects

²⁸ Although the majority of Quileute characters are played by Native actors, the film franchise has been criticised for its decision to use a non-Native actor in the role of the most prominent Quileute, Jacob. Although Taylor Lautner claims some distant Native ancestry, this was only announced after the film was critiqued for choosing a non-Native actor.

²⁹ Stephenie Meyer, *New Moon* (London: Atom, 2009; first published 2006), p130

³⁰ *Ibid*, p133

³¹ Stephenie Meyer, *Twilight* (London: Atom, 2008; first published 2005), p281

³² *Ibid*, p7

³³ *Ibid*, p10

socioeconomic trends in the United States regarding the high rates of poverty on reservations.³⁴

Despite this difference, however, there is no suggestion that Jacob or the other citizens of La Push should be pitied because of their limited financial means. Instead, the community at La Push is described as strong and generally harmonious. The narrative also dwells on the beauty of the reservation lands, which Bella describes as ‘breathtaking...Islands rose out of the steel harbor waters with sheer cliff sides, reaching to uneven summits, and crowned with austere, soaring firs’.³⁵ These fond descriptions of the countryside of La Push, combined with the unsentimental depiction of the town itself, encourage the reader to accept the sense of pride that the Quileute characters have for their home. This is reflected by the real-life Quileute Nation’s attitudes towards La Push and the surrounding reservation; the tribe’s Facebook group publishes many photographs of the scenery around First Beach, and details events such as Quileute Days.

³⁴ According to the American Indian Relief Council, ‘the overall percentage of American Indians living below the federal poverty line is 28.2%...the disparity for American Indians on reservations is even greater, reaching 38% to 63%...there are 90,000 homeless or under-housed Indian families...30% of Indian housing is overcrowded, and less than 50% of it is connected to a public sewer...about 40% of on-reservation housing is considered inadequate...it is not uncommon for 3 to 4 generations to live in a two-bedroom home’. (American Indian Relief Council, ‘Living Conditions’, from *American Indian Relief Council* (www.nrcprograms.org/site/PageServer?pagename=airc_livingconditions), accessed 7th March 2014)

³⁵ *Twilight*, p99

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: Quileute Nation Facebook group

However, while this initial reading seems unproblematic, a closer analysis reveals that there are negative aspects to Meyer's representation of the Quileute consistent with Alexie's assertion that 'when non-Natives write about Natives, that's colonial literature'.³⁶ The series' depiction of reservation life includes no reference to the impact of colonial policies on Native American cultures. *New Moon* presents Jacob's home and lifestyle as that of someone who, although not rich, does not live in poverty. This approach has been criticised by readers; according to Brianna Burke, the series 'ignores the poverty and health problems that plague Native people across the United States at alarmingly higher rates than the rest of the population', something she describes as 'a purposeful

³⁶ 'The absolutely true interview with Sherman Alexie, an amazing part-time Indian'

omission, particularly when compared to the lavish existence of the Cullens'.³⁷ The prevalence of poverty on reservations is overwhelming, and there is substantial evidence to suggest that the myriad social problems, including 'starvation [and] environmental degradation', are 'the direct result of specific colonial practices'.³⁸ One such practice involves the status of reservation-dwelling Native Americans as wards of the federal government:

A central feature of US law and policy concerning Native Americans is the doctrine of a federal "trust responsibility" toward them. This doctrine is multidimensional, functioning variously as an extra constitutional source of broad power by the federal government abuse, as an engine of paternalism, and as a source of affirmative obligation beneficial to Native peoples.³⁹

As this statement suggests, the system of federal "trust responsibility" has not only been open to abuse and corruption,⁴⁰ but incorporates a paternalistic attitude that infantilises Native peoples. Despite their status as sovereign nations, American Indian tribes have historically been treated as dependent upon the guiding hand of Western civilisation;⁴¹ a 'projection' of settler values and the

³⁷ Brianna Burke, 'The Great American Love Affair: Indians in the *Twilight* saga', *Bringing Light to Twilight: Perspectives on a pop culture phenomenon*, edited by Giselle Liza Anatol (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), p214

³⁸ *Conquest*, p71

³⁹ S. James Anaya, 'International Law and US Trust Responsibility toward Native Americans', *Native Voices: American Indian identity and resistance*, edited by Richard A. Grounds, George E. Tinker and David E. Wilkins (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2003), p155

⁴⁰ For example, in April 2011, BIA officers on the Fort Peck Reservation were charged with embezzling more than \$1 million from a scheme designed to help tribal members with loans (*News From Indian Country*, <http://www.indiancountrynews.com/index.php/crimejusticecourts-a-lawsuits-sections-menu-109/11414-bia-officer-denies-federal-corruption-charges>).

⁴¹ This is, as Anaya goes on to note, a distinctly colonial policy; 'trusteeship exists over indigenous peoples irrespective of their consent...due to their "backward" and "uncivilized" character. Because of their inferior status, indigenous peoples are deemed incapable of adequately managing their own affairs, so "civilized" humanity must place them under its tutelage and bring them the "blessings of civilization". Anaya continues by stating that 'Trusteeship is thus a source of unilateral state power over indigenous peoples, and indigenous peoples' rights are reduced to those consistent with the "civilizing" mission'; in short, practices that are ultimately intended to benefit colonising powers are disguised as benevolent policies designed to raise

resultant 'will to govern'.⁴² This is reflected in the *Twilight* saga, where, as this thesis will show, the presence of the Cullen family is consistently portrayed as being beneficial to the Quileute Nation. The influence of the vampire family 'civilises' the Quileutes in many different spheres; they train the werewolf pack in warfare, give cast-off clothes and food to Jacob, Seth and Leah, and eventually bring Jacob into the family as Renesmee's future husband.

Policies such as the Dawes Act, put in place to facilitate the 'civilisation' of Native peoples, were significant factors in causing the poverty that continues on many reservations.⁴³ On the Quileute reservation, unemployment rates have been above 50% for the past three decades.⁴⁴ However, a reader of *Twilight* would have no indication of this widespread unemployment and the accompanying financial difficulties faced by the Quileute Nation; the impact of colonialism is downplayed throughout the series. Furthermore, while the *Twilight* series underplays the poverty that can be found on a reservation, it also portrays life at La Push as 'prosaic and banal' in contrast to the Cullens' affluent lifestyle.⁴⁵ By choosing Edward over Jacob, Bella is also choosing a comfortable future in rich, white society over a difficult life on the reservation. The disparities between the Cullens and the Quileute, particularly their colonial roots, are never explored.

indigenous peoples out of "savagery". ('International Law and US Trust Responsibility toward Native Americans', *Native Voices*, p157)

⁴² *Orientalism*, p95

⁴³ The Dawes Act, also known as the General Allotment Act, was passed in 1887. It involved breaking up reservation lands into individual allotments, to be issued to every adult male Indian on the reservation. Surplus land was sold off to white developers and farmers. The allotments were intended for farming, encouraging Native peoples to adopt a Western agricultural lifestyle. However, the land initially set aside for reservations was often chosen because it was poor farming land which could not be sold to white settlers. As a result, Native farmers struggled to earn a living, causing them to rely heavily on government support.

⁴⁴ Quileute Tribal TANF, Effective May 1, 2013 – April 30, 2016 (www.quileutenation.org/jobs/tanf_plan_2013_2016.pdf), p11

⁴⁵ 'The Great American Love Affair: Indians in the *Twilight* saga', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p214

This lack of context implies that the distinction between Edward and Jacob's economic means is simply a natural state of affairs, rather than the result of systemic social inequalities.

Alcohol abuse is also a major problem on a number of reservations. In her essay in the collection *Colonize This!*, Kahente Horn-Miller explains that 'alcohol [problems] are not new to any indigenous community'.⁴⁶ The high rate of alcoholism in Native communities has been linked to colonialism. In his study *Crazywater*, Brian Maracle states that 'the stereotype of the drunken Indian is much more than a dominating and unsightly phenomenon – it is a symbol of the holocaust that has wreaked destruction on the Onkwehonwe of Great Turtle Island for the past three hundred years, and the results have been horrifying'.⁴⁷ Alcoholism is not only a problem in and of itself; it also contributes to other problems, such as 'accidents, injuries, suicides, murders, arrests, jail terms, fires, drownings, sexual abuse, child abuse, child neglect, poor health, child apprehensions, unemployment and welfare dependency'.⁴⁸ While reservations are taking decisive action against alcohol abuse, alcoholism remains a problem for many American Indian communities in the present-day United States:

Alcohol abuse affects everyone in the native community. The two-thirds of the community that do not have a drinking problem – the social drinkers, the non-drinkers and the children – still feel the effects, in many different ways, when a friend or family member loses their job, home, family, life, or self-respect to alcohol.⁴⁹

⁴⁶ Kahente Horn-Miller, 'Bring Us Back into the Dance: Women of the Wasase', *Colonize This! Young women of color on today's feminism*, edited by Daisy Hernández and Bushra Rehman (Berkeley: Seal Press, 2002), p232

⁴⁷ Brian Maracle, *Crazywater: Native voices on addiction and recovery* (Middlesex: Penguin Books Ltd., 1994), p9

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid, p10

In the *Twilight* saga, however, alcohol is rarely mentioned, and is not focused upon in relation to the reservation. One could argue that by making no reference to alcohol at La Push, Meyer is avoiding the damaging stereotype described by Maracle; the ‘drunken Indian’, with its close links to the ‘wild savage’ and ‘vanishing Indian’ stereotypes. However, this also erases many of the problems faced by Native peoples. In another section of his study, Maracle lists alcoholism alongside ‘smallpox, measles, malaria, yellow fever and influenza’ as a disease deliberately introduced by Europeans in order to decimate the Native population.⁵⁰ The *Twilight* saga’s omission of alcoholism evades any potential colonial guilt that a non-Native reader may experience, offering a sanitised view of a reservation that does not live up to the reality explored by Native authors such as Bruchac and Alexie.⁵¹

There is further erasure of Native experience in the fact that none of the Quileute characters face any direct racism during the *Twilight* saga. Although Meyer has stated that the fantasy elements of her stories are not intended to be read as analogies for real social situations,⁵² there is an obvious parallel between the vampire-werewolf rivalry and racial bigotry. Each side describes the other using dehumanising slurs; the werewolves call the vampires ‘leeches’, while the

⁵⁰ Ibid, p18

⁵¹ Bruchac’s children’s novel *The Heart of a Chief* follows the story of a teenage boy who is brought up by his grandfather and great-aunt following his father’s admission to rehab for alcoholism. In Alexie’s *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-time Indian*, the protagonist’s grandmother is killed by a drunk driver, his sister dies in a house fire after passing out from alcohol consumption, and his father’s best friend is shot during a drunken argument.

⁵² When discussing whether Bella can be read as an anti-feminist heroine, Meyer argues that ‘this is not even realistic fiction, it’s a fantasy with vampires and werewolves, so no one could ever make [Bella’s] exact choices’ (Stephenie Meyer, *Breaking Dawn* FAQs, http://www.stepheniemeyer.com/bd_faq.html)

vampires refer to the werewolves as ‘dogs’. The treaty line segregates the two groups, and encounters between them are often violent, as indicated by a clash between Emmett and Paul.⁵³ However, this fantastic racism is the only kind apparent in the series. A quasi-racist remark is made in *Eclipse*, after a standoff between Edward and Jacob at Bella’s school; a student comments “My money’s on the big Indian”.⁵⁴ This occurs after Jacob leaves, however, and is only heard by Bella – Jacob himself is not confronted even with this mild example of racism. First-hand accounts indicate, however, that exposure to racist statements is part of everyday life for Native people:

When I was in the third grade, our class read *The Courage of Sarah Noble*. In this book they said Indian people were savages and murderers, they chop your head off and eat you alive and that we were not really people. When the class put on the play for the whole school, the kids started taunting me, calling me “stinky” and asking me how many people I’ve eaten.⁵⁵

They wanted to meet with me to talk about the school and see if I’d be interested in being the director...I walked in a little late, dressed in my coaching outfit. We introduced ourselves and Linda said, “So, Barbara, you are Native American? You don’t look like what I expected. I expected the Indian princess look.”⁵⁶

Raven Hoaglen is confronted with the ‘wild savage’ stereotype, while Barbara Potter is expected to conform to the idea of the ‘noble savage’ (see Appendix 1). Stereotyping is a sign of the existence of ‘gross inequalities of power’, and widespread belief in these stereotypes means that many Native people

⁵³ Stephenie Meyer, *Eclipse* (London: Atom, 2009; first published 2007), p79

⁵⁴ *Ibid*, p90

⁵⁵ Raven Hoaglen, quoted in *A Broken Flute*, p17

⁵⁶ Barbara Potter, quoted in *A Broken Flute*, p11

experience similar incidents.⁵⁷ As Said argues in *Orientalism*, these stereotypical representations of American Indian peoples allow non-Natives, particularly white non-Natives, a 'flexible positional superiority', creating 'a whole series of possible relationships...without [the non-Native] ever losing...the relative upper hand'.⁵⁸

Cannibalising the Quileutes: American Indian legends in the *Twilight* saga

The colonial gaze of the *Twilight* series is apparent not only in its erasure of racism and the effects of colonialism, but in Meyer's original reasons for including the Quileute Nation in her novels. Meyer has revealed that she based *Twilight* in Forks and La Push after conducting a Google search for the rainiest place in the United States.⁵⁹ She has stated that she did not visit La Push or speak to any members of the Quileute Nation before writing the novel, and that her decision to include Native characters was not based on any personal connection to or interest in American Indian nations. Instead, Jacob's role in the first novel is described as 'a device...Bella needed a way to find out the truth about Edward, and the conveniently located Quileute tribe, with all their fantastic legends, provided a cool option for that revelation'.⁶⁰ The language in this statement is distinctly appropriative; the Quileute are posited as 'convenient' and 'a cool option', as if they are a commodity or service rather than a nation in their own

⁵⁷ Stuart Hall, 'The Spectacle of the 'Other' ', *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices*, edited by Stuart Hall (London: Sage Publications Ltd, 1997), p258

⁵⁸ *Orientalism*, p7

⁵⁹ 'The Story Behind *Twilight*'

⁶⁰ Stephenie Meyer, 'Notes on *New Moon*' (www.stepheniemeyer.com/nm_thestory.html)

right. This is an indication of the level of cultural appropriation that exists in the *Twilight* series, which reaches its peak in the use and abuse of Quileute legends.

In *Cannibal Culture*, Root stresses the inextricable links between appropriation and colonisation:

As the West sought to affirm colonial domination over territory, the world increasingly came to be imagined as a vast warehouse of images: Other cultures became signs and fragments of a world destroyed in advance and of a difference and authenticity that could be aestheticized and consumed in the West...This is the true ruse of colonialist thinking and one that continues to underlie much contemporary thinking about culture.⁶¹

This view of Native cultures as ‘a vast warehouse of images’ whose use is unproblematic, or even “honouring”, is the core of the problematic nature of cultural appropriation. Root continues by arguing that ‘the presence of art can draw attention away from the extent to which its practice continues to be dependent on a rhetoric of exclusion and mastery’; in short, the continuing appropriation of Native images by mainstream white culture normalises this practice, and deflects attention from the colonial framework that surrounds it.⁶² Divorced from this context, various important elements of Native cultures, such as warbonnets, are reduced to ‘trendy, hip [and] ironic’ accessories.⁶³ This process is apparent in the *Twilight* saga’s use of Quileute stories. In *The Sacred Hoop*, Paula Gunn Allen states that ‘The two forms basic to American Indian literature are the ceremony and the myth. The ceremony is a ritual enactment of a specialized perception of a cosmic relationship, while the myth is a prose

⁶¹ *Cannibal Culture*, ppx-xi

⁶² *Ibid*, p18

⁶³ Anonymous, *My Culture is Not a Trend* (<http://mycultureisnotatrend.tumblr.com>)

record of that relationship'.⁶⁴ As Allen's summary implies, Native American legends carry great spiritual significance. The 'fantastic legends' rewritten by Meyer are a core part of Quileute religious and social identity. However, the handling of these legends in the *Twilight* series is in keeping with Root's 'warehouse' argument; they are treated as 'a cool option' to bolster the series' vampire and werewolf mythology, rather than as legitimate beliefs. In another section of *Cannibal Culture*, Root notes that '*wasi'chu*, the Lakota term used for white people, delineates a particular mentality, [associated with] consumption and excess'.⁶⁵ *Wasi'chu* translates as 'fat-eater', a term implying a literal consumption; however, the figurative consumption of American Indian legends by cultural outsiders such as Meyer has a devastating effect on Native cultures.⁶⁶ The *Twilight* series' manipulation of Quileute legends trivialises both the idea of the ceremony and the myth, treating them as plot devices rather than as a cornerstone of Quileute cultural experience, and using Native spirituality as a source of profit.

The first example of a 'Quileute legend' in the *Twilight* saga occurs in the first novel; Bella asks Jacob why the Cullen family, with whom she is already fascinated, are not allowed on the reservation.⁶⁷ Jacob's explanation includes a legend that 'claims that we descended from wolves – and that the wolves are our brothers still. It's against tribal law to kill them'.⁶⁸ While the *Twilight* series

⁶⁴ Paula Gunn Allen, *The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the feminine in American Indian traditions* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1992; first published 1986), p61

⁶⁵ *Cannibal Culture*, p10

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

⁶⁷ Sam tells Bella that "The Cullens don't come here." Bella notes that 'his tone had implied something more – that they weren't allowed; that they were prohibited'. (*Twilight*, p105)

⁶⁸ *Twilight*, p107

represents these legends as genuine Quileute stories, they have in fact been manipulated to support the mythology of Meyer's fictional world. In the article 'Twilight fiction doesn't always jibe with Quileute legend', Paige Dickerson notes that 'the legends about the origins of the Quileute people in the bestselling vampire books set in Forks and La Push have some resemblance to the real stories – they both involve wolves'.⁶⁹ As this phrasing suggests, there is only a passing similarity between the *Twilight* versions and the source material. Quileute elder Chris Morganroth III tells the story of K'wati, a figure who seems to have inspired *Twilight's* Taha Aki:

K'wati came into the area of La Push and found that there were no humans. He went to the mouth of the river and there were wolves, timber wolves...K'wati saw that there were no people in this area near La Push. So he transformed that pair of wolves into the Quileute people.⁷⁰

This particular legend is a creation story dealing with the origins of the Quileute Nation, and an important part of Quileute oral history. *Eclipse* distorts the story into what Deborah Miranda might describe as a 'building block' to bolster the *Twilight* series' werewolf and vampire mythology; a 'theft' that can be viewed as an 'act of postmodern colonialism'.⁷¹

It is apparent that Meyer was aware of the potential problems behind this authorial decision. She admits 'I was nervous about what the real life citizens of Forks would think [of the town being featured in the novels], and more especially with what the real life people of La Push would think – I'd taken some rather big

⁶⁹ Paige Dickerson, 'Twilight fiction doesn't always jibe with Quileute legend', *Peninsula Daily News* (<http://www.peninsuladailynews.com/article/20091130/news/311309987>)

⁷⁰ Ibid.

⁷¹ George E. Tinker, 'American Indian Religious Traditions, Colonialism, Resistance and Liberation', *Native Voices*, p237

liberties with their fictional history, and I wasn't sure if they would find it amusing or irritating'.⁷² Despite her misgivings, Meyer did not contact the Quileute tribal council or any Quileute legends in order to obtain permission to use the legends. However, as Wilson also notes, 'she did reach out to the owners of Bella Italia restaurant in Port Angeles to find out if it was okay for her to feature the restaurant...So, she got permission to write about mushroom ravioli, but not an entire people'.⁷³ This implies that a business is seen as belonging specifically to its owners, but Quileute culture is viewed as public property; goods from Root's 'vast warehouse of images' that are free for authors to use as they see fit. The idea that a story can belong to a particular people does not correspond with Western attitudes towards storytelling. Because of this, appropriation of legends by modern novelists is not viewed as problematic by Eurocentric society.

An analysis of the *Twilight* series must also consider Meyer's description of Quileute legends as 'fictional history'. This statement indicates the ubiquitous nature of *Twilight's* colonial perspective. The view of Native American beliefs as mere superstition, and a lack of understanding of the significance of these beliefs, has been a key factor in the devaluing and dehumanisation of American Indian peoples. Cheyenne writer Henrietta Mann argues that 'Many of the earliest Anglo-American immigrants to this hemisphere fled their homelands to escape religious persecution. Ironically, some forgot their religious fears and ethnocentrically presumed that their religions were superior to indigenous sacred

⁷² Stephenie Meyer, quoted by Natalie Wilson in 'Difficult dialogues at the NWSA: The colonial gaze of Stephenie Meyer and the resulting representation of indigenous peoples as monstrous', *Seduced by Twilight* (<http://seducedbytwilight.wordpress.com>)

⁷³ Ibid.

ways, an attitude that found its way into federal Indian policy'.⁷⁴ This policy included the banning of American Indian religious practices, such as sweat lodges, which were outlawed in 1873, and ceremonial dances. The California Missions of the late eighteenth century practiced 'forced conversions of native peoples to Christianity', a practice also found in government residential schools.⁷⁵ More recently, a governmental interpretation of Lakota beliefs under the First Amendment ignored the fact that Native religious practices are often directly linked to a specific location. This fact distinguishes Native spiritual beliefs from religions such as Christianity, where location does not hinder believers taking part in religious rituals:

In ruling that the [Lakota] tribes did not possess a property interest in Bear Butte, the [Supreme Court] said its decision was based on a distinction between the tribe's religious belief and their religious practice. The Court ruled that the two tribes were not forced from their religious beliefs, nor were they prevented from practicing their religion in spite of the loss of Bear Butte.⁷⁶

This decision took place in the 1980s. The ceremonies performed at Bear Butte by the Lakota are no longer significant if they are practiced elsewhere; however, the United States' Eurocentric position on religion does not accommodate this fact. These examples indicate that monotheistic, organised religions such as Christianity are privileged over Native religious beliefs by mainstream society. This attitude can also be found in Meyer's perception of Quileute legends as

⁷⁴ Henrietta Mann, 'Earth Mother and Prayerful Children: Sacred sites and religious freedom', from *Native Voices*, p195

⁷⁵ George E. Tinker, *Missionary Conquest: The gospel and Native American cultural genocide* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993), 42

⁷⁶ Donald L. Fixico, *The Invasion of Indian Country in the Twentieth Century: American capitalism and tribal natural resources* (Niwot: University Press of Colorado, 1998), p132

mere stories, rather than as narratives comparable in significance to Biblical texts; as Burke notes, 'relegating...tribal beliefs to "superstition" and "folklore" implies that all Native oral histories are invented fictional stories for amusement, like the fairytales of the Brothers Grimm'.⁷⁷ While Native oral histories and Western fairytales both contain some element of instruction, they are not comparable; Western fairytales are forms of entertainment, rather than sacred texts.

This trivialising attitude is not only apparent in the saga's use of Quileute legends, but in their perception within the narrative. The stories told to Bella by Jacob do not answer her questions, but merely provide clues. It is Bella's own research that leads her to discover the truth about the Cullens, when she reads an Internet source about 'Stregoni benefici: An Italian vampire, said to be on the side of goodness, and a mortal enemy of all evil vampires'.⁷⁸ In this section of the novel, Western technology and written history are established as more useful and informative than Native oral history, despite the fact that oral histories are an essential teaching tool. Furthermore, this perception of the inferiority of oral histories is shared by Jacob:

"Well, there are lots of legends, some of them claiming to date back to the Flood – supposedly, the ancient Quileutes tied their canoes to the tops of the tallest trees on the mountain to survive like Noah and the ark," *He smiled, to show me how little stock he put in the histories.*⁷⁹

⁷⁷ 'The Great American Love Affair: Indians in the *Twilight* saga', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p214

⁷⁸ *Twilight*, p117

⁷⁹ *Ibid*, p107, my italics.

Jacob also '[rolls] his eyes'⁸⁰ and refers to the legends as "Pretty crazy stuff."⁸¹ Tellingly, after he finishes recounting the stories, Jacob, 'with a hint of worry', asks Bella "So, do you think we're a bunch of superstitious natives or what?"⁸² This point in the novel could have been used to highlight the problem of internalised racism experienced by Native youth.⁸³ However, Jacob's attitude is not explored in any depth, a narrative decision that normalises his negative feelings towards his culture and presents them as natural. The concept of the 'superstitious native' links back to the stereotype of the 'mystic Indian' (see Appendix 1), associating the Quileute Nation with magic and fiction rather than rationality and reality.

Another important passage featuring Meyer's fictionalised Quileute legends can be found in the campfire scene in *Eclipse*. In this scene, the series introduces stories explaining the existence and nature of the Quileute werewolves. This inclusion is prompted by the increasing significance of the werewolf pack in the narrative; although originally 'a device', Jacob and his fellow Quileutes have, by this point, become major characters. The *Twilight* version of the werewolf legend begins when the body of a warrior chief, Taha Aki, was taken over by the spirit of his enemy Utapla.⁸⁴ In order to end Utapla's reign of terror over the Quileutes, the spirit of the real Taha Aki occupied the body of a

⁸⁰ Ibid.

⁸¹ Ibid, p109

⁸² Ibid.

⁸³ Native Hawaiian writer Haunani-Kay Trask describes her own internalised impression of Native inferiority in her essay 'From a Native Daughter': 'At school, I learned that the "pagan Hawaiian" did not read or write, were lustful cannibals, traded in slaves, and could not sing. Captain Cook had "discovered" Hawaii and the ungrateful Hawaiians had killed him...By the time I left for college, [this version of history] had won out'. (Haunani-Kay Trask, 'From a Native Daughter', *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, p45).

⁸⁴ *Eclipse*, p247

wolf and returned to the village.⁸⁵ A fight during which a young man was killed prompted Taha Aki's transformation into a werewolf:

Taha Aki's anger was the anger of a man. The love he had for his people and the hatred he had for their oppressor were too vast for the wolf's body, too human. The wolf shuddered, and – before the eyes of the shocked warriors and Utopla – transformed into a man.⁸⁶

There are some undeniably positive aspects to the campfire scene. By having Billy tell stories, the series is acknowledging the importance of the oral tradition in Native cultures. The passage invokes images of the movement of 'cultural renewal' that has become a priority for many tribes. As Joane Nagel writes, 'cultural renewal is concerned not only with the preservation of the old. It also has a face pointing towards the future'; cultural renewal is a key aspect of resistance against colonialism.⁸⁷ This scene combines a storytelling meeting and a community cook-out, suggesting a culture where traditional practices are not viewed as archaic, but rather as playing a vital role in current society.

However, as well as the problem of a fictionalised legend being presented as a genuine Quileute story, there are several inaccurate aspects to the scene. The campfire is attended by Bella, the tribal council, the wolf pack, and the women upon whom the young werewolves have imprinted. Bella refers to the gathering as 'La Push's most secret society', but comments that 'Other than a few teasing complaints – mostly by Paul – about keeping the bloodsucker stench

⁸⁵ Ibid, p249

⁸⁶ Ibid, p250

⁸⁷ Joane Nagel, *American Indian Ethnic Renewal: Red Power and the resurgence of identity and culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997; first published 1996), pp196-197

downwind, I was treated like someone who belonged'.⁸⁸ However, Bella does not 'belong'. She is not Quileute, Jacob has not imprinted upon her, and she has very few connections with other members of the tribe; her only other Quileute friend is Sam's fiancée Emily. The depth of this friendship is questionable, as Bella has not associated with Emily since the Cullen family's return. Indeed, Bella arguably 'belongs' at the gathering less than any other resident of Forks; she is devoted to Edward, who, as a vampire, is one of the Quileute werewolves' greatest enemies. Some American Indian nations allow non-Natives to attend certain ceremonies; however, the meeting in *Eclipse* seems intended as an educational opportunity for Bella and, by proxy, the reader. This is not the purpose of Native ceremonies, which are never held for the benefit of outsiders. Instead, ceremonies 'reflect the needs of a particular community...Indians do not generally believe that their way is "the" way, and consequently, they have no desire to tell outsiders about their practices'.⁸⁹ It is unthinkable that Bella would be invited to a meeting from which the majority of Quileute would be excluded, particularly when considering the difficult nature of her relationship to the tribe.

As Andrea Smith continues in her article:

They way to be respectful is for non-Indians to become involved in our political struggles and to develop an on-going relationship with Indian *communities* based on trust and mutual respect. When this happens, Indian people may invite a non-Indian to take part in a ceremony, but it will be on Indian terms.⁹⁰

⁸⁸ *Eclipse*, p241

⁸⁹ Andrea Smith, 'For All Those Who Were Indian in a Former Life' (<http://www.manataka.org/page1113.html>)

⁹⁰ *Ibid*, italics in original.

Bella is involved with the tribe solely on her own terms. She does nothing to help the Quileute community, and her motivation for listening is entirely selfish; she wishes to learn even more about the vampires. Another unlikely element of the meeting is that, as Jacob reveals, 'Kim and Seth and Leah are all first-timers, too'.⁹¹ Many Native cultures have some stories that are only told at certain times or in certain situations; for example, particular creation myths.⁹² However, the situation described in *Eclipse* is improbable; it is unlikely that an outsider would be allowed to listen to stories when the majority of Quileutes are excluded.

The behaviour of the younger Quileutes at the gathering also indicates Meyer's outsider status. Although Native cultures are not a monolith, the vast majority of nations encourage respectful attitudes towards elders. This respect is not apparent in *Eclipse*. At one point, Quil and Sam interrupt Billy to tease each other, something that would be unlikely to happen at a real Quileute storytelling event.⁹³ Novels written by Native authors, with insider perspectives, generally depict children and young people listening quietly and politely to elders, speaking only when they are prompted to do so:

When Nokomis finished [her story], no word was spoken. Omakayas could say nothing because stiff hairs prickled at the back of her neck.⁹⁴

"Look where your eyes are...When deer and rabbit were made, they were made with eyes on the sides of their heads. That way they see things sneaking up on them from all sides. They were made to be hunted. But

⁹¹ *Eclipse*, p243

⁹² In *A Broken Flute*, reviewer Gayle Ross describes one Cherokee creation myth: 'I don't tell this story publicly. It's part of the long creation story that is told in ceremony every year at Green Corn time. An elder once told me that the Earth needs to hear these stories, but how, when, and to whom they are told must be respected' (*A Broken Flute*, p296)

⁹³ *Eclipse*, p251

⁹⁴ Louise Erdrich, *The Birchbark House* (London: Orion Children's Books, 2000; first published 1999), p131

wolf, lynx, mountain lion, they were made with eyes in front. They are made to be hunters.”

Doda paused then. He just thought the question, he didn't say it. And I answered.

“My eyes are in front, Doda.”⁹⁵

As in *Wolf Mark*, Bruchac's insider knowledge of Native American cultures is apparent; his representations of interactions between elders and children is more authentic than that described by Meyer.

Another inaccuracy in *Twilight* is apparent in the fact that, as Billy begins his story, Emily takes notes; Bella reports that '[her] pen skidded across the sheets of paper as she tried to keep up with him'.⁹⁶ In *A Broken Flute*, Beverly Slapin describes a similar scene in a book by a non-Native author, featuring Diné (Navajo) characters:

A Diné child being told a story by an elder would be honored, she would just sit quietly and listen. She would not take notes – that would be rude, and Grandma would just walk away. The elder would tell a story to be learned, not written down – oral tradition is alive and well in Dinétah.

...
“It's unreal,” Gloria Grant told me, “that a Diné grandmother would demand that her granddaughter write. Because it's an honor to be told a story; you just sit there and do not one thing, that's how you take in a story and learn.”⁹⁷

Although Diné culture is different from Quileute culture, respect for elders and the oral tradition are common to both nations. Emily's note-taking, ostensibly to preserve the story for future generations – she is described as 'looking exactly like a student set for an important lecture' – is grounded firmly in Eurocentric

⁹⁵ *The Heart of a Chief*, pp13-14

⁹⁶ *Eclipse*, p244

⁹⁷ *A Broken Flute*, p46

cultural perceptions.⁹⁸ This scene, like Bella's online research in *Twilight*, depicts the Western written tradition as superior to the Quileute oral tradition. It would be more realistic for Emily to 'sit there and do not one thing' but attempt to memorise the story, in order to pass it on to the generations of Quileutes who follow her.

As well as delegitimising American Indian spirituality and misrepresenting Native cultures, appropriation by non-Native authors can distort Native beliefs. This is problematic in several ways. The adoption of 'Indian' beliefs by white subcultures, particularly the New Age movement, is a widespread and damaging phenomenon. Wernitznig argues that 'For the last fifteen years, approximately, esotericism has animated and fetishized an Indian hybrid...white shamanism...conflates 'synthetic' Indian cultures with blunt Caucasian itineraries'.⁹⁹ This distorts public perceptions of American Indian beliefs, either erasing the original tribes altogether, or perpetuating the stereotype that Native cultures and beliefs are "savage" and dangerous.¹⁰⁰ As a result, many literary texts have misinterpreted American Indian ceremonies.¹⁰¹

While the *Twilight* series does not portray the Quileute Nation as depraved or dangerous, certain elements of the fictionalised legends – which are presented

⁹⁸ *Eclipse*, p243

⁹⁹ *Going Native or Going Naïve?*, pvii-ix

¹⁰⁰ For example, there has been a great deal of controversy over Native use of the hallucinogen peyote in ceremonies. Phil Cousineau writes that 'peyote is a harmless cactus, which it is impossible to become addicted to, and to which not even a dingle misdemeanour, let alone a crime, has ever been traced. To members of the Native American Church it is a sacramental substance'. However, despite the religious status of peyote, there have been several attempts by the federal government to ban its use. (Phil Cousineau, *A Seat at the Table: Huston Smith in conversation with Native Americans on religious freedom* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), pp100-101).

¹⁰¹ For example, in *My Heart is on the Ground*, Nannie Little Rose states that the Sun Dance is carried out 'to show...bravery' (*My Heart is on the Ground*, p29). In fact, the piercing that forms a central part of the Sun Dance is intended to 'offer Wakantanka the greatest gift [the participants] have, their flesh and blood' (LaVera Rose, *Grandchildren of the Lakota*, quoted in *A Broken Flute*, p66)

to the reader as legitimate Quileute beliefs – give a negative and false impression of their history and social structure. As Wilson argues, the story of the Third Wife ‘depicts the Quileute as dualistic, hierarchical and patriarchal. This historic representation is ironic given that patriarchy was introduced to the Quileute *by whites*’.¹⁰² This application of patriarchy to an American Indian nation leads the reader to assume that social problems and inequalities faced by Native women are an inherent aspect of traditional society, rather than a result of colonisation.¹⁰³ Another distortion of history is apparent in the fictionalised legends, which make no mention of the colonial interactions between white settlers and the Quileute people. According to the *Twilight* version of history, the Quileutes traditionally had ‘only one’ enemy – vampires.¹⁰⁴ This contributes to the conflation of a real American Indian nation with fantasy creatures, similar to that found in *Peter Pan*. It also implies that settlers, soldiers and other colonising forces were not truly enemies to the Quileute nation. As Quileute history shows, this is not the case. Like many American Indian nations, the Quileute were not allowed to remain in their ancestral lands, but were relocated in order to free up

¹⁰² *Seduced by Twilight*, p167, italics in original

¹⁰³ These problems include a high level of violence, particularly sexual violence. According to Amnesty International USA, ‘Native American and Alaska Native women are more than 2.5 times more likely to be raped or sexually assaulted than other women in the USA...at least 86 per cent of the reported cases of rape or sexual assault against American Indian and Alaska Native women...[are perpetrated by] non-Native men’. This differs greatly from statistics regarding rape and sexual assault amongst people of other ethnic backgrounds; according to a report by the University of Minnesota, in 96-97% of rape cases, the victim and perpetrator are the same race (John Hamlin, ‘List of rape myths’, *Sociology of Rape: University of Minnesota* (www.d.umn.edu/cla/faculty/jhamlin/3925.myths.html), accessed 3rd March 2014). Amnesty International links this violence explicitly to colonialism: ‘Historically, Indigenous women were raped by settlers and soldiers, including during the Trail of Tears and the Long Walk. Such attacks were not random or individual; they were tools of conquest and colonization’. (Amnesty International USA, ‘Maze of Injustice’, *Amnesty International USA* (www.amnestyusa.org/our-work/issues/women-s-rights/violence-against-women/maze-of-injustice), accessed 3rd March 2014).

¹⁰⁴ *Twilight*, p107

profitable land for settling.¹⁰⁵ The Quileutes' culture was directly attacked by settlers; 'In 1889, a fire set by a local white destroyed 26 Quileute homes and almost all pre-contact artefacts held by the tribe'.¹⁰⁶ The loss of these irreplaceable artefacts would have been a devastating blow to the Quileute people. The erasure of the negative aspects of Indian-settler relations in texts such as the *Twilight* saga serves to assuage white guilt regarding the United States' colonial history.

As these examples demonstrate, the *Twilight* series is a clear illustration of problems that can occur when a cultural outsider writes about American Indian nations. The series misrepresents Quileute life, both in the colonial and modern eras, and distorts Quileute beliefs, equating them with fairytales. In the campfire scene, Bella takes on a pseudo-anthropological role, observing and commenting on a fictionalised version of Quileute society. The reader is encouraged to accept Bella's perspective, rather than considering the significance of the meeting to the Quileute characters. Having previously described herself as 'Switzerland' in the vampire-werewolf conflict, Bella assigns herself an ostensibly 'neutral' position; however, her authority rests not on a genuine neutrality, but on her white privilege. Claude Lévi-Strauss describes anthropology as having the benefit of 'the supremacy of observation', arguing that 'Knowledge lies on the outside'.¹⁰⁷ The example of the *Twilight* saga suggests that creating a link between Native

¹⁰⁵ According to historian Donna Hightower Langston, 'An 1855 treaty was negotiated that removed the Quileute to a reservation near the town of Forks, Washington' (Donna Hightower Langston, *The Native American World* (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2003), p282)

¹⁰⁶ Ibid.

¹⁰⁷ Claude Lévi-Strauss and Didier Eribon, *Conversations with Claude Lévi-Strauss* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991; first published 1988), translated by Paula Wissing, p154

peoples and vampires, werewolves and other monsters serves to trivialise any aspects of American Indian cultures that the authors include in their narratives. However, when the authors in question are cultural insiders, the results differ greatly.

Insiders Write Back: Native American beliefs and cultures in *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series

As noted above, many modern Native American communities are attempting to counter the effects of colonialism with sustained efforts towards cultural renewal. This can involve organising powwows,¹⁰⁸ or reviving ‘spiritual practices such as sweats and fasts’.¹⁰⁹ There is often an emphasis on the involvement of children:

I watched a group of secondary school children prepare for a summer “science” camp that would combine teaching about plants, animals, rocks and minerals with the experience their elders can still pass on of living off the land. A highlight of the camp experience is the hunting, killing, and dissecting of a caribou.¹¹⁰

A focus on cultural renewal is also apparent in *Wolf Mark*. In his afterword, Joseph Bruchac reveals ‘what I wanted to do...was to approach the idea of a man becoming a wolf in a very different way – from a modern American Indian point of view’.¹¹¹ Noting that representations of werewolves and shapeshifters in young adult literature were invariably written from a Western perspective,

¹⁰⁸ *American Indian Ethnic Renewal*, p201

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid*, pp196-197

¹¹⁰ Joy Hendry, *Reclaiming Culture: Indigenous people and self-representation* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), p113

¹¹¹ Joseph Bruchac, *Wolf Mark* (New York: Tu Books, 2011), p376

Bruchac countered this trend by drawing from his own Abenaki culture for his narrative, another example of cultural renewal. Throughout the novel, Bruchac combines Gothic literary tropes and traditions from various American Indian nations, creating a text that positions Native influences as an active and relevant force in modern young adult literature.

An initial reading reveals many similarities between Jacob from the *Twilight* series and Lucas, the protagonist of *Wolf Mark*. They are both young Native American men, who live with their fathers following the early deaths of their mothers. Neither boy is from a financially privileged background; Jacob's house '[resembles] a tiny barn',¹¹² and Lucas and his father live in a trailer, 'an elongated aluminum box' that Lucas refers to as 'the Sardine Can'.¹¹³ Both young men ride motorbikes and enjoy the outdoors; and, of course, both can transform into werewolves. Like the Quileutes of *Twilight*, *Wolf Mark's* Abenaki protagonists are not 'perpetually in a time warp', but are fully engaged with the modern world. This is a common feature of Bruchac's writing. Although he has written some historical novels, such as *Children of the Longhouse* and his retelling of Pocahontas' story, Bruchac has focused primarily on representing Native children in contemporary situations. Chris from *The Heart of a Chief* and Molly from the *Skeleton Man* novels, despite living in the present day, have been raised in traditional Penacook and Mohawk ways. The novels emphasise that this has prepared them for dealing with mainstream American society, rather than distancing them from the modern world.

¹¹² *New Moon*, p130

¹¹³ *Wolf Mark*, p7

Through Lucas, *Wolf Mark* explores realities faced by modern-day American Indians that are ignored in the *Twilight* saga. At the beginning of *Wolf Mark*, Lucas dwells on his father's heavy drinking and drug use:¹¹⁴

One look at my semi somnambulant sire should be enough for any pothead to rethink his habit...there's sometimes so much ganja smoke in the Sardine Can, that rusted wreck in which we reside, that my clothes reek of it. When it gets too bad, I unroll my sleeping bag and spend my nights outside to avoid the contact high.¹¹⁵

It is later revealed that Lucas' father has been faking his addiction and depression as part of a cover story. However, Bruchac's decision to include a prominent Native character apparently dealing with substance abuse problems means that the impact of these problems upon Native communities is not erased. Maracle states in *Crazywater* that 'Many of us [American Indians] are dysfunctional adults who are survivors of dysfunctional alcoholic families'.¹¹⁶ By including Thomas' apparent addiction to alcohol and drugs, Bruchac represents an aspect of colonialism that has had a devastating effect upon many American Indian communities.

To some extent, *Wolf Mark* can be read as a retelling of *Twilight*, incorporating the problematic aspects of modern American Indian life that Meyer's series ignored. The distinct similarity between Jacob and Lucas is undeniable; however, unlike Jacob, Lucas is the hero of the story, with an agency that Jacob lacks. Similarly, *Wolf Mark's* vampires, or *upyrs*, are suggestive of the Cullens. When describing the *upyrs*, Lucas notes:

¹¹⁴ Ibid.

¹¹⁵ Ibid, p23

¹¹⁶ *Crazywater*, p10

They've got the best clothes. Every label they wear is the most expensive. Top of the line. Casual High Couture. And they wear those threads with super style. They're not built square and blocky like I am. They're all tall, slender, pale-skinned. Their sharp-featured faces are positively classic – like those of runway models. Any one of them would be right at home on the fashion pages.¹¹⁷

Similarly, Bella dwells on the Cullens' model-like features:

I stared because their faces, so different, so similar, were all devastatingly, inhumanly beautiful. They were faces you never expected to see except perhaps on the airbrushed pages of a fashion magazine. Or painted by an old master as the face of an angel.¹¹⁸

A later encounter between Lucas and Yuri, the leader of the group of *upyrs*, seems to reference the *Twilight* series deliberately. Yuri, like Edward, can read minds, and Lucas' thought 'Do I ask him now if he's really seventeen or if he only looks that way?' echoes Bella's questions regarding Edward's age.¹¹⁹ The fact that *Wolf Mark* was published in 2011, after the *Twilight* saga had become a confirmed pop culture phenomenon, suggests that Bruchac is deliberately writing against that series' portrayals of American Indians. In the afterword, although he does not mention the *Twilight* series explicitly, Bruchac states that 'the European conception of the shape shifter known as a werewolf nearly always seems to be of a being that is out of control'.¹²⁰ This certainly applies to *Twilight's* werewolves, who, as Bella is constantly reminded, find it difficult to control their shapeshifting and harm humans as a result. This inherent 'savagery' is consistently countered

¹¹⁷ *Wolf Mark*, p38

¹¹⁸ *Twilight*, pp16-17

¹¹⁹ *Wolf Mark*, p245

¹²⁰ *Ibid*, p376

in *Wolf Mark*, along with several other negative tropes focused around stereotypes of Native Americans.

Bruchac attempts to rewrite the idea of a Native American man becoming a werewolf 'from a modern American Indian point of view', countering *Twilight's* narrative of savagery.¹²¹ This is immediately apparent in *Wolf Mark*, as Lucas' Abenaki ancestry is emphasised throughout the novel. While studying his family tree, Lucas notes that 'I've always known our family was mostly Indian with some Dutch and English married in'.¹²² Furthermore, Bruchac indicates that his protagonist has been raised according to Abenaki traditions. There is an emphasis on the importance of storytelling as a learning tool; Lucas learns about other indigenous cultures and environmental activism by listening to stories told by his father Thomas and his Uncle Cal.¹²³ Thomas' attitude to his son is non-authoritarian, similar to the relationship between Chris and Doda in *The Heart of a Chief*. Lucas notes that 'Dad's always been a man of few words, words always carefully chosen. Anything I want to share with him, he's going to listen to it. Really listen. He's ready to help in whatever way he can'.¹²⁴ This dialogue between Lucas and his father links to traditional Native educational processes. Like the importance of the oral tradition and respect for elders, a non-disciplinarian attitude to childrearing is something common to the majority of American Indian nations. Traditionally, children were expected to learn via example and advice, rather than as a result of strict rules and lessons, and were

¹²¹ Ibid.

¹²² Ibid, p167

¹²³ Ibid, p16

¹²⁴ Ibid, p53

'seldom physically punished...[but] lectured about the implications of wrongful and unacceptable behaviour'.¹²⁵ This is particularly apparent in the way that Lucas, and his father before him, are taught to face difficult situations:

I never knew my grandparents, but my father told me that they raised him to realize that "don't do that" is one of the least effective things to say to a young person. Tell your child not to do something and sooner or later, when you're not around, you can bet that kid is going to do it. Instead, Dad's parents always encouraged him to use his best judgment. Consider the consequences of any action.

Dad boiled it down to just one word.

"Think."¹²⁶

Rather than demanding obedience from his son, Lucas' father establishes a relationship based on mutual respect, giving Lucas the opportunity to learn from his mistakes. This anti-authoritarian family structure opposes the hierarchical construction of *Twilight's* wolf pack, where all members are subordinate to the Alpha.

Similarly, like the secondary school children in Hendry's narrative, Lucas has been taught practical and survival skills throughout his life. In his case, these skills have been adapted for his family's unusual circumstances, a result of his father's job in special ops: 'How many other kids my age were taught martial arts and weaponry from the time they could walk? At the age of seven I could disassemble an AK-47 and put it back together blindfolded.'¹²⁷ This practical education is similar to that described in another novel by Bruchac, *Children of the Longhouse*, set in the pre-contact era; one of the protagonists, Ohkwa'ri, is

¹²⁵ Leroy Little Bear, 'Jagged Worldviews Colliding', *Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision*, edited by Marie Battiste (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2000), p81

¹²⁶ *Wolf Mark*, pp101-102

¹²⁷ *Ibid*, p5

taught how to build shelters and make useful everyday objects by his father and uncles.¹²⁸ Both Lucas and Ohkwa'ri's educations evoke traditions that were common to many American Indian nations:

Historically, education among Indigenous peoples in North America was characterized by what would be considered today as experiential learning followed by authentic assessment. The whole environment was used as a "classroom". Children would observe their elders as they went about their traditional ways. They would then practice away from the adults to learn how to fully perform a task. They would wait until they felt competent before demonstrating what they had learned to an adult.¹²⁹

In *Wolf Mark*, Bruchac translates this traditional upbringing into the modern era. This suggests that Lucas' Abenaki heritage is a significant source of resourcefulness and resilience, and has provided him with useful knowledge.

Bruchac, like his protagonist, is Abenaki. As a result, in the sections of the novel that focus on Abenaki beliefs, Bruchac is writing about a culture of which he has personal, insider experience. He has also carried out extensive research into other Native cultures, making him a highly informed source. For example, in his novel *Eagle Song*, 'Bruchac locates the narrative in a culture not his own – here, in an Iroquois, not Abenaki, family...However...*Eagle Song* is informed by Bruchac's sense of what it is to belong to a marginalized group and by his research into Iroquois culture'.¹³⁰ This combination of an insider perspective and a thorough background of research increases the likelihood that the aspects of *Wolf Mark* dealing with Native cultures are an accurate and fair representation.

¹²⁸ Joseph Bruchac, *Children of the Longhouse* (New York: Puffin Books, 1998; first published 1996), p48

¹²⁹ Beverly J. Klug and Patricia T. Whitfield, *Widening the Circle: Culturally relevant pedagogy for American Indian children* (New York: Routledge Falmer, 2003), p29

¹³⁰ *Unsettling Narratives*, p12

When Lucas reflects on Native American cultures in the pre-contact era, it is reasonable to assume that his descriptions of traditional lifestyles are realistic rather than romanticised. The novel develops this theme of cultural appropriation and insider-outsider perspectives further, illustrating appropriate and inappropriate ways to learn about Native cultures. At one point, Lucas describes his father and uncle's interactions with other indigenous people and their communities:

[Dad and Uncle Cal] lived with indigenous peoples, tribes who followed the old ways. Uncle Cal and Dad were trying to protect the people and the forests from loggers and greedy outsiders. Some of them were armed mercenaries hired to wipe out the natives so that others could build roads, clear-cut the land, mine for gold, or build dams.¹³¹

Not only are Lucas' father and Uncle Cal members of indigenous nations themselves, they have taken the time to learn about other Native cultures first-hand. They have gained knowledge about their traditions, and contributed to their communities, without attempting to change these communities or obtain anything in return. This stands in stark contrast to Bella's relationship to the Quileutes of *Twilight*; she learns about their culture only to increase her knowledge of the Cullens, and her presence in Forks causes many problems for the Quileute community.

Contrasted with Lucas' father and uncle is one of his teachers, Coach Gretz:

I know a little about Gretz because he's an American Indian nut. His whole room is filled with Native artefacts and none of it is cheap tourist junk. He has a good eye and every item – from the Zuni kachinas and Iroquois

¹³¹ *Wolf Mark*, p16

baskets on the shelves, to his prize possession that hangs on the wall, a Navajo Two Hills rug – is a real collector's item.¹³²

This passage does not simply condemn Gretz; his refusal to buy 'cheap tourist junk' suggests some level of engagement with Native cultures, as he has clearly made an effort to source his collection from Native artists and craftspeople. By doing this, he has financially supported Native communities and avoided participation in the exploitation of American Indian cultures by people who produce fake Native art. However, his collector attitude carries colonial undertones; there is no indication that Gretz is interested in any aspect of Native cultures other than those which he can own. Significantly, Gretz easily gives up his 'prize possession', the Navajo rug, to the group of vampires attending Lucas' high school:

Yuri points at the rug, lazily hooks his index finger.

There's a moment of hesitation. Then Mr Gretz puts down his pen, stands up, and walks over to the wall. He unhooks the rug, rolls it up, and carries it to the doorway. As if nothing unusual has just happened, Mr Gretz returns to his desk, picks up his pen, and resumes his writing.¹³³

Lucas' engagement with his culture, by contrast, cannot be taken away; it forms an integral part of his identity. Even Lucas' name links him to his Abenaki roots; 'I loved the way [my mother] did that – softly saying [my father's] name or mine the Indian way. To-mas. Loo-kas. Just our names – but something in her tone always made me feel as if things were going to be all right'.¹³⁴ The difference between Lucas' and Coach Gretz's engagement with American Indian cultures

¹³² Ibid, p41

¹³³ Ibid, pp41-42

¹³⁴ Ibid, p47

emphasises the fact that a cultural outsider's enthusiasm cannot compare to an insider's lived experience.

As in the *Twilight* saga, *Wolf Mark* combines Native American legends and European myths to create a foundation for the novel's werewolf and vampire mythology. However, the use of these legends suggests that Bruchac is using the stories to create a counter-colonial reading of American Indian characters in young adult supernatural fantasy. Bruchac hints at a link between the transformation into a werewolf and his characters' Abenaki heritage:

As I hold the skin I see the beauty of its shining fur, feel the strength it wants to share with me...I know now that it was birthed with me, carefully set aside for the time when I was ready to accept my birthright. That, my father's brief instructions told me, has long been the way of our people. You must learn to be human before you can accept the power and not be lost in it.¹³⁵

This hint is made more explicit later; while reading through his family tree, Lucas realises that his shapeshifting forefathers are 'all from the part of the country that my Abenaki ancestors called *Ndakinna*, "Our Land,"...my direct male ancestors wore a second skin...although I may be a monster, I am not an anomaly'.¹³⁶ This strong connection to Lucas' past emphasises the fact that American Indian peoples have endured, despite colonisation and genocide. Bruchac's use of American Indian legends differs from Meyer's. Although he adapts his chosen tales to a modern context, he does not locate them within a single culture; indeed, *Wolf Mark* does not refer explicitly to any Abenaki stories. This avoids fictionalised versions of Native legends being associated with a particular culture,

¹³⁵ Ibid, p119

¹³⁶ Ibid, pp167-168

such as the recent association of the Quileute people with vampire stories. Instead, Bruchac includes more generalised beliefs, such as the fact that ‘among our Indian people, a wolf is not an animal to fear’.¹³⁷ The fact that Bruchac does not directly adapt a story about shapeshifters for use in *Wolf Mark* is important. In other texts, Bruchac has based his narratives on specific legends. One example of this is *Skeleton Man*, ‘a novel based on a story common in Native American traditions about a person who, having cooked and devoured her or his own flesh, becomes a skeleton preying on humans’.¹³⁸ In the acknowledgements section of *Skeleton Man*, Bruchac writes ‘I could not have written this book without the many lessons I’ve been taught by...tradition bearers [from various American Indian nations]’.¹³⁹ As this sentence indicates, Bruchac makes a point of communicating directly with tribal elders regarding traditional stories, and only uses Native oral histories in ways that respect these traditions. Although the story upon which *Skeleton Man* is based teaches important lessons, such as how to think one’s way out of danger, it is not a sacred story. It is therefore appropriate for Bruchac to adapt it for his novel, particularly as his adaptation does not distort the overarching theme of the story; namely, that ‘Not only do our Native American heroines take care of their own rescues, they often save the men, too!’¹⁴⁰

However, stories about shapeshifters are potentially far more contentious and divisive. The perception of shapeshifters differs greatly between American

¹³⁷ Ibid, p237

¹³⁸ *Unsettling Narratives*, p60

¹³⁹ Joseph Bruchac, *Skeleton Man* (New York: HarperCollins, 2001), pi

¹⁴⁰ Ibid.

Indian nations. In some cultures, shapeshifters are viewed as benign figures; however, amongst other tribes, the concept of shapeshifting, particularly after putting on an animal skin, is considered evil. The most notorious example of this can be found in Diné stories, where shapeshifters attain their malevolent magical powers after performing an act of great evil, such as 'killing a near relative, normally a sibling'.¹⁴¹ In his ethnographic text on Diné legends, Clyde Kluckhohn writes of the activities and manifestations of skinwalkers:

[Skinwalkers] are active primarily at night, roaming about at great speed in skins of wolf, coyote and other animals (bear, owl, desert fox, crow). This is one bit of witchcraft with which even the youngest Navaho is familiar. Indeed...“wolf” I have found to be the most common colloquial [term] for “witch”.¹⁴²

These legends surrounding shapeshifters were the cause of some of the negative reactions that occurred as part of the 'Spirit Hoods' controversy. DeeJay NDN, a member of the music group 'A Tribe Called Red', asks 'Why is it okay to have a hood mimicking a wolf head called “Navajo” when shape shifters are considered evil in the teachings of the Navajo?’¹⁴³ A Diné commenter describes her reaction to this particular product, the 'Navajo Black Wolf' hood:

...by the way, the idea of a spirit hood with “Navajo” in the name is absolutely, incredibly offensive, especially one that's a wolf head. Running around wearing what looks like an animal skin on your head – I don't even have the words to describe how taboo and horrible that is to Navajos. Shapeshifting is an evil thing...I'm completely horrified that someone is ignorant enough to try to associate a wolf spirit head with us.¹⁴⁴

¹⁴¹ Clyde Kluckhohn, 'Navaho Witchcraft', *Papers of the Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University*, Vol. XXII, No. 2 (Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1944), p15

¹⁴² Ibid.

¹⁴³ DeeJay NDN, commenting on 'The Privilege of the Yay Life Tribe' by Adrienne Keene, *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.com/2011/07/the-privilege-of-the-yay-life-tribe.html>)

¹⁴⁴ Commenter on 'The Privilege of the Yay Life Tribe'

Wolf Mark acknowledges this potential reading of the shapeshifter:

...darkness does sometimes enter our native traditions about men or women taking on animal shapes. There are stories of witches, those whose minds are twisted and who sacrifice a family member to gain that power. There are Abenaki stories of such twisted-minds who put on the wolf skin.¹⁴⁵

In order to avoid these implications, Bruchac takes a general concept and combines it with European fables about werewolves, creating a less contentious mythology to support his narrative. One might argue that, like Meyer, Bruchac has distorted American Indian legends. However, Bruchac's method actively avoids causing emotional harm to Native readers, while Meyer's writing process, however unintentionally, has been damaging; once again, Native characters are associated with savagery, animalism, and a lack of control.

Wolf Mark also includes several European myths regarding werewolves. The novel mentions the silver bullet as the only way to destroy a werewolf, a recurring trope in stories dealing with European-inspired werewolves.¹⁴⁶ It also covers a range of potential methods of transformation:

Old stories from Europe tell how a man or woman could sell his soul to Satan for power. In return, that soul-stripped human would be given a belt made of wolf skin. Put on that belt and be transformed into a wolf, a ravaging beast that sees humans as prey, tears their throats out, eats their flesh.¹⁴⁷

¹⁴⁵ *Wolf Mark*, p236

¹⁴⁶ Ibid.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid, p235. The idea of the wolfskin belt is less well-known than the more common concept of lycanthropy being transmitted by a bite from a werewolf. However, it has been used in recent fantasy texts, most notably in *Fool Moon*, the second novel in Jim Butcher's *The Dresden Files* series. It is possible that *Wolf Mark* features this particular legend in order to distance Lucas' transformation from the concept of skinwalking, which, as noted earlier, can be deeply troubling to readers from certain Native backgrounds. By associating Lucas' method of shapeshifting with European rather than Diné stories, *Wolf Mark* potentially avoids the 'taboo' nature of the transformation, preserving Lucas' heroic status.

One might argue that Bruchac's use of European folklore to create his werewolf mythology is appropriation akin to Meyer's fictionalisation of Quileute stories. Folklore has an undeniable cultural importance; as William R. Bascom notes, 'Folklore, to the anthropologist, is one of the important parts that makes up the culture of any given people...there is no known culture which does not include folklore'.¹⁴⁸ Furthermore, folklorists and historians have argued that there is a religious context to some European stories, including those featuring werewolves; 'Traditional belief in early modern Europe reflects both the syncretic and eclectic elements in Christian and...Jewish religious beliefs and practices'.¹⁴⁹ However, there is a distinct difference between the cultural role of American Indian legends and medieval European folktales. European myths are not part of Christian or Jewish religious canon, but are instead a social interpretation of the teachings of these particular religions. While writing about the role of the werewolf in demonological texts, Nicole Jacques-Lefèvre states that 'the metamorphosis symbolizes the placement of society's ban through solemn expulsion outside of the church's heart'; that lycanthropy was a metaphor for godlessness, rather than a key belief of the medieval and early modern Church.¹⁵⁰ By contrast, stories such as the Quileute legend of K'wati are still central to Native spiritual beliefs:

¹⁴⁸ William R. Bascom, 'Folklore and Anthropology', *The Study of Folklore*, edited by Alan Dundes (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1965), p26

¹⁴⁹ Kathryn A. Edwards, 'Introduction: Expanding the analysis of traditional belief', *Werewolves, Witches, and Wandering Spirits: Traditional belief and folklore in early modern Europe*, edited by Kathryn A. Edwards (Kirksville: Truman State University Press, 2002), pxiii

¹⁵⁰ Nicole Jacques-Lefèvre, ' "Such an Impure, Cruel, and Savage Beast...": Images of the werewolf in demonological works', *Werewolves, Witches, and Wandering Spirits*, p192

[American Indian] legends are not told merely for enjoyment, or for education, or for amusement: they are believed. They are emblems of a living religion, giving concrete form to a set of beliefs and traditions that link people living today to ancestors from centuries and millennia past.¹⁵¹

These aspects of the novel suggest that it is written partly as a direct response to the *Twilight* saga, and partly as Bruchac putting forward a Native perspective on the pop cultural link between American Indians and werewolves. A similar intention is apparent in Cynthia Leitich Smith's *Tantalize* series.

Genetic Histories: Allegories of Native ancestry in the *Tantalize* series

Like *Wolf Mark* and the *Twilight* saga, the *Tantalize* series features several prominent characters who are shapeshifters, most notably the half-werewolf Kieren Morales. Unlike Jacob and Lucas, Kieren is not Native American; instead, he is of Irish- and Mexican-American descent.¹⁵² There are no explicitly Native North American characters in the *Tantalize* novels. However, many aspects of the series that suggest that Leitich Smith is writing back against colonial stereotypes in young adult fantasy literature, albeit using less direct methods than Bruchac. At several points, the *Tantalize* series' presentation of shapeshifters subverts colonial tropes. For example, the series regularly focuses upon the marginalised social status of shapeshifters, encouraging their

¹⁵¹ Richard Erdoes and Alfonso Ortiz, editors, *American Indian Myths and Legends* (London: Pimlico, 1997; first published 1984), p xv

¹⁵² Although, as reported by the website *Cultural Survival*, 'Mexico's indigenous population is one of the two largest in the Americas...[and] more than one in ten Mexicans speaks an indigenous language', it is not explicitly stated that Kieren's father has any indigenous heritage. (Jonathan Fox, 'Mexico's Indigenous Population', from *Cultural Survival* (<http://www.culturalsurvival.org/ourpublications/csq/article/mexicos-indigenous-population>), accessed 25 January 2014).

comparison with marginalised ethnic groups in reality. Were-people in the world of *Tantalize* must pass as human in order to avoid hate crimes or ostracism; ‘Like most werepeople, Mama Wolf and her cubs were firmly in the closet – or, well, den – and the house was part of the illusion’.¹⁵³ The Morales family keep dogs because of Kieren’s mother Meara’s status as a full werewolf: ‘[Choosing new dogs] mattered, not only to Meghan’s morale but also to her family’s safety. By tonight, any sightings of a Wolf on the Morales property could be explained away by a harmless family pet’.¹⁵⁴ Prior to the popularisation of American Indian culture associated with the trend of ‘white shamanism’, many Native people also found it necessary to hide their cultural backgrounds.¹⁵⁵ Ned Blackhawk reports that ‘very few of my older Indian relatives were born in hospitals, and many of their births appear not to have been registered’.¹⁵⁶ This is reflected in the status of Leitich Smith’s werepeople: ‘It was common knowledge that werepeople...were never treated [or born] in hospitals...Lone Wolves, like Kieren’s mama, used midwives’.¹⁵⁷ Throughout the series, it is emphasised that shifters must keep their genetic heritage secret for their own safety, a fact that reflects Native American survival strategies within a colonised society.

These precautions are essential for the shifter community’s survival; as Quincie reflects in *Tantalize*; ‘The lynchings of werepeople...or cross burnings on

¹⁵³ Cynthia Leitich Smith, *Tantalize* (London: Walker Books Ltd., 2008), p41

¹⁵⁴ Cynthia Leitich Smith, *Blessed* (London: Walker Books Ltd., 2011), p88

¹⁵⁵ During a period of voluntary work on the Blackfeet reservation in Montana in summer 2011, I spoke to a tribal elder who had been brought up by his white grandmother. His grandmother did not inform him of his Blackfeet heritage until he was a teenager, and advised him not to reveal it to anyone outside the family.

¹⁵⁶ Ned Blackhawk, *Violence Over the Land: Indians and Empires in the early American West* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2006), p292

¹⁵⁷ *Tantalize*, p24

their front yards never even made the news unless there were photos, video. Even then, it was too often implied the victims might've somehow provoked the attack'.¹⁵⁸ Following the murder of the chef Vaggio at Quincie's family restaurant, Quincie is quizzed on her 'genetic history', a result of the police assumption that the murder must have been committed by a shapeshifter.¹⁵⁹ Similarly, Native Americans, along with other ethnic minority groups, report high levels of profiling by the police; in his semi-autobiographical novel, Sherman Alexie's narrator reports 'During one week when I was little, Dad got stopped three times for DWI: Driving While Indian'.¹⁶⁰ In *Diabolical*, Kieren discusses hate crimes committed against werepeople:

A Hyena skin from Vermont was sold on eBay. A US senator from Wyoming was quoted as saying it was legal to hunt shifters in animal form. According to a CNN/USA Today/Gallup poll, 44 percent of Americans agreed. Worse, 26 percent indicated it was okay if the shifter was in human form.¹⁶¹

The practice of hunting werepeople and selling their body parts parallels the treatment of Native people, living and dead, in the nineteenth century. Following the Sand Creek massacre, US soldiers '[rode] into Denver with 100 Cheyenne scalps proudly displayed...[along] with women's vaginas, men's penises, scrotums, and dead fetuses'.¹⁶² Like Leitich Smith's werepeople, nineteenth-century American Indians were hunted like animals; in 1846, a soldier's description of life on the frontier included the comment 'We kill plenty of game

¹⁵⁸ Ibid, p125

¹⁵⁹ Ibid, p23

¹⁶⁰ Sherman Alexie, *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-time Indian* (London: Andersen Press Limited, 2008; first published in the United States of America by Little, Brown and Company, 2007), p46

¹⁶¹ Cynthia Leitich Smith, *Diabolical* (Somerville, Massachusetts: Candlewick Press, 2012), p119

¹⁶² *Today is a Good Day to Fight*, p44

and the occasional Indian. We make it a rule to spare none of the bucks'.¹⁶³ In *Conquest*, Andrea Smith recounts another example from Andrew Jackson's time in the US Army:

Andrew Jackson...supervised the mutilation of 800 or so Creek Indian corpses – the bodies of men, women and children that he and his men massacred – cutting off their noses to count and preserve a record of the dead, slicing long strips of flesh from their bodies to tan and turn into bridle reins.¹⁶⁴

Considering both this and the current focus amongst many American Indian nations on repatriating Indian remains from museums and private collections, it is reasonable to read the *Tantalize* universe's trade in wereperson body parts as an analogy for the United States' treatment of Native peoples.

Additionally, the legal status of shapeshifters in the *Tantalize* universe is not equal to that of humans. In *Tantalize*, Kieren informs Quincie that 'werepeople and probable hybrids didn't have the same legal rights as humans',¹⁶⁵ while in the graphic novel *Tantalize: Kieren's Story*, the young werewolf reflects that 'It's not clear if we're even considered citizens under the Constitution'.¹⁶⁶ Similarly, federal policies have often resulted in the removal of the legal rights of Native peoples. Vine Deloria Jr writes that 'My father was of that generation of Indians who were not US citizens until they were adults. He had been classified as a non-citizen until he was twenty-three years old'.¹⁶⁷ This occurred in 1924, as a result of American Indian soldiers' service in the US Army

¹⁶³ Quoted by Stephen Longstreet in *War Cries on Horseback: The story of the Indian Wars of the Great Plains* (London: Sphere Books Limited, 1974; first published 1970), p209

¹⁶⁴ *Conquest*, p11

¹⁶⁵ *Tantalize*, p93

¹⁶⁶ Cynthia Leitich Smith, *Tantalize: Kieren's Story* (Somerville: Candlewick Press, 2011), p1

¹⁶⁷ Vine Deloria Jr., 'The Passage of Generations', *Native Voices*, p318

during the First World War.¹⁶⁸ The denial of rights to Native peoples has also occurred on a tribal as well as an individual level:

...when the Samish tribe (Washington) was declared formally “extinct” by the federal government, its remaining citizens (who, in the face of the official pronouncement, declared themselves very much alive) lost access, formerly guaranteed by treaty, to their ancestral fishing grounds.¹⁶⁹

The subaltern status of *Tantalize*'s werepeople reflects legal and governmental efforts to remove the rights of American Indian tribes and individuals. Leitch Smith's novels employ fantastic metaphors to explore real injustices.

However, Leitch Smith's use of werepeople to parallel the experiences of American Indians does not only relate to the negative treatment of shapeshifters in her fictional society. Unlike the worlds of *Twilight* and *Wolf Mark*, the *Tantalize* universe features a wide variety of animal-human shapeshifters. The protagonists also encounter weredeer, werecats, werebears and wereoposums, as well as a range of other animals. Other shapeshifters, such as werewhales, are mentioned during the course of the series. The types of animals that make up the shifter community are an important part of Leitch Smith's counter-colonial approach, as many of the animals mentioned hold positions of great spiritual significance within various American Indian nations. As Bruchac notes in his afterword to *Wolf Mark*, ‘the Wolf Clan...is one of the three main Haudenosaunee [Iroquois] Clans’.¹⁷⁰ The Bear Clan was one of the twenty-four clans of the Chippewa,¹⁷¹ with members attempting to emulate the qualities of the bear that

¹⁶⁸ *Widening the Circle*, p33

¹⁶⁹ *Real Indians*, p27

¹⁷⁰ *Wolf Mark*, p375

¹⁷¹ *The Invasion of Indian Country in the Twentieth Century*, p104

they admired.¹⁷² The importance of the buffalo to Plains tribes has been widely documented; not only was buffalo a staple of the Plains Indian diet, but important spiritual figures, such as the Lakota peoples' White Buffalo Calf Woman, are related to the buffalo. Similarly, whales are an important animal to many Pacific Northwest and Alaska Native cultures, where they have traditionally been hunted for food; for example, the Quileute Nation 'fished and hunted sea mammals, and were reputedly recognized as the best sealers on the coast'.¹⁷³

Leitch Smith has taken a supernatural figure, the werewolf, which, in the mind of the reader, is likely to be associated with European folktales. However, she then subverts this European connection by focusing upon other animals which, like wolves, have spiritual significance for many Native cultures. This subversion allows her to write back against the Gothic genre itself, a genre that Leitch Smith has critiqued for its portrayal of 'the [racial] "other" ' as evil, aberrant monster.¹⁷⁴ In the world of *Tantalize*, it is only vampires who are supernatural, a deliberate countering of the use of Gothic monsters as an analogy through which to 'Other' people who are marginalised by society. Shifters have evolved alongside humans, as stated explicitly in the graphic novel *Tantalize: Kieren's Story*; 'Like Wolves, their species [Opossum and Armadillo] are offshoots of ancestors that can be traced to the Ice Age, a time of giant mammals'.¹⁷⁵ Quincie notes that 'Wolves were born, not made. Natural. Not spooky, not demonic, no

¹⁷² Ibid, p107

¹⁷³ Quileute Nation, 'History', *Quileute Nation* website (<http://www.quileutenation.org/history>), accessed 25th January 2014.

¹⁷⁴ *Blessed*, p459

¹⁷⁵ *Tantalize: Kieren's Story*, p16

matter what The Right Wing might say'.¹⁷⁶ Like Bruchac, Leitich Smith portrays shapeshifting as a natural process which the majority of shifters are able to easily control, contrasting the *Twilight* representation of metamorphosis as a violent process and a result of sinister magic. The lack of violence associated with the *Tantalize* shifters removes any element of the 'savagery' that can be found in *Twilight*'s portrayal of the Quileute werewolves. Leitich Smith's reinterpretation of werewolves as both natural beings and as part of a collective of other were-creatures with links to Native beliefs suggests that, like Bruchac, she is attempting to encompass 'a modern American Indian point of view' in her young adult supernatural fantasies.

Spiritual Conflicts

In *Adaptation and Appropriation*, Julie Sanders argues that 'If fairytale and folklore make themselves particularly available for continuous re-creation and rewriting it is partly because of their essential abstraction from a specific context'.¹⁷⁷ This is true for European myths and folktales, but not for American Indian legends, which occupy positions of great spiritual significance and have an important cultural context for the tribes where they originated. As *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series indicate, certain aspects of American Indian stories and beliefs can be used in modern fiction without appropriating or manipulating an important part of a particular culture. However, in both cases, the authors have

¹⁷⁶ *Tantalize*, p53

¹⁷⁷ *Adaptation and Appropriation*, p84

avoided using sacred stories. Instead, they have limited themselves to generalised themes and concepts, such as the importance of wolves to many Native cultures. They have also avoided distorting these representations of American Indian beliefs, and, in Bruchac's case, have presented a realistic version of modern-day life for Native peoples. *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series provide examples of how Native beliefs can be used as inspiration for modern narratives without reducing a people or culture to the 'building materials' described by Deborah Miranda. The *Twilight* series, by contrast, treats Quileute stories and culture as 'a cool option' for creating a vampire and werewolf mythology. In *Cannibal Culture*, Root argues that:

...appropriation seems to involve a profound sense of entitlement on the part of the person or institution doing the appropriating, which behaves as if the desired objects or images *already* belong to it...Appropriation reduces the living people and culture to the status of objects...If we think we already own something, why would we ask anybody's permission to take it?¹⁷⁸

Meyer's perspective on Native cultures and stories is shaped by entitled colonial and Eurocentric thought patterns, which have been carried forwards into the novels themselves.

Unlike Meyer, Bruchac and Leitich Smith are knowledgeable cultural insiders; when writing about other Native cultures, Bruchac consults 'tradition bearers'. However, *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series also contain many references to Christianity and other organised, monotheistic religions. If a white, Christian author's use of Quileute legends can be considered appropriative, then is a Native author's use of Western religious beliefs equally problematic? As with

¹⁷⁸ *Cannibal Culture*, p72

the use of American Indian stories and beliefs in young adult supernatural fantasy, the reality surrounding this question is complex, and is highly dependent upon context. In order to reach a conclusion, I must turn away from the werewolf and focus more closely upon another common Gothic figure; that of the vampire.

Chapter Two

Heaven and Hell: Portrayals of Christianity and civilisation

Crosses and Colonialism: Missionaries, American Indians, and the Gothic

The werewolves of literature have changed to a certain extent over the years. Despite the argument by one critic that ‘the tragic, doomed werewolf of Hollywood’s Golden Age has mutated into a new animal entirely...the central character in a success story who can keep his sanity, his life, and his mate’,¹ werewolves have remained working-class and generally male.² Prior to its move into the literary sphere, the vampire, like the werewolf, was originally a folkloric figure; however, unlike the werewolf, the common representation of the vampire has changed immensely as a result of its transition from folk tale to Gothic novel:

The fictional vampire tends to be tall, thin, and sallow, the folkloric vampire is plump and ruddy, or dark in color...The two would be unlikely to meet socially, for the fictional vampire tends to spring from the nobility and to live in a castle, while the folkloric vampire is of peasant stock and resides (during the day at least) in the graveyard in which he was buried.³

Yoshitaka Inoue describes the folkloric vampire as ‘a fat, rubicund, heavy-bearded country man who made a surprise visit to his widow’, contrasting the ‘noble, sublime, and metaphysical’ vampire of later literary texts.⁴ The diversity of the vampire has been a continuing trend. In her text *Our Vampires, Ourselves*,

¹ Heather Schell, ‘The Big Bad Wolf: Masculinity and genetics in popular culture’, *Literature and Medicine* Vol. 26, No. 1 (Spring 2007), p112

² In the novel *Liar* by Justine Larbalestier, the protagonist’s werewolf family work a farm in upstate New York. In Kelley Armstrong’s *Bitten*, the heroine is the world’s only female werewolf. The central werewolf figure in the first three series of *Being Human*, George, is middle-class, but all of the other werewolf characters – Nina, Tom, Tully and Macnair – are working-class.

³ Paul Barber, *Vampires, Burial, and Death: Folklore and reality* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988), p4

⁴ Yoshitaka Inoue, ‘Contemporary Consciousness as Reflected in Images of the Vampire’, *Jung Journal: Culture and Psyche*, Vol. 5 Iss. 4 (2011), p84

Nina Auerbach argues that the literary vampire has undergone many transformations, stating that 'every generation creates and embraces its own [vampires]'⁵ and that 'vampires blend into the changing cultures they inhabit'.⁶ This is particularly true of young adult literature, where the vampire is often used to represent the changes that accompany the transition from childhood to adulthood.

Auerbach suggests that vampires are portrayed differently according to the motivations of the author and the values of their society.⁷ Often associated with 'excessive or non-normative sexuality', the implications carried by the vampire differ depending upon the social perceptions of the time regarding sexuality and other factors.⁸ Milly Williamson argues that early literary vampires such as *Carmilla* and *Dracula* '[existed] to frighten us into acquiescence, to reassert patriarchy, racial superiority, family values and chaste heterosexuality'.⁹ Wilson's commentary on the role of the vampire corresponds with this argument:

While many vampires are transgressive figures, I would counter that just as many vampire tales work to demonize the transgressions of the vampire in order to bolster rather than subvert societal norms...horror often serves a conservative function...the figure of the vampire has most often been used to represent a transgressive threat.¹⁰

⁵ Nina Auerbach, *Our Vampires, Ourselves* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995), pvii

⁶ *Ibid*, p6

⁷ Auerbach contrasts vampires with 'ghosts, werewolves, and manufactured monsters [which] are relatively changeless' (*Our Vampires, Ourselves*, p6). She suggests that the literary portrayal of werewolves is 'more aligned with eternity than with time', a declaration that does not fit in with a postcolonial reading of the Gothic genre – as the previous chapter explored, werewolves have been written according to specific colonial stereotypes, and can be very closely related to perceptions of cultural Others in contemporary society.

⁸ Deborah Mutch, 'Introduction: "A swarm of chuffing Draculas": The vampire in English and American literature', *The Modern Vampire and Human Identity*, edited by Deborah Mutch (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), p12

⁹ Milly Williamson, *The Lure of the Vampire: Gender, fiction and fandom from Bram Stoker to Buffy* (London: Wallflower Press, 2005), p1

¹⁰ *Seduced by Twilight*, p17

Vampires of the late twentieth century became sympathetic figures;¹¹ although still associated with transgression and excess, they became a literary device for '[exploring] Otherness from the inside', with the reader encouraged to empathise with them rather than fear them.¹² Finally, modern vampire protagonists such as Angel from *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, the Cullens from *Twilight*, and the eponymous family from *The Radleys* defy their transgressive natures and become paragons of restraint, resisting blood and the accompanying murder of humans. Far from being abnormal monsters, these twenty-first century vampires are 'ultrahuman',¹³ taking on a superheroic status; indeed, Edward is explicitly compared to popular superheroes.¹⁴

On the surface, these representations of the vampire differ greatly; however, the figure of the vampire invariably carries undertones of conservatism. Although every vampire poses a potential threat to the human protagonist, it is the "queerer" vampires' of young adult literature who are 'the more dangerous'.¹⁵ Heroic vampires are almost always part of a heterosexual couple or a nuclear family, or, in the case of the Cullens, both. The vampire, like the Gothic genre itself, has effectively been '[co-opted] by a conservative social enterprise'.¹⁶ As

¹¹ For example, the vampires in the novels of Anne Rice are depicted in a sympathetic light, as analogies for non-heteronormative communities.

¹² *The Lure of the Vampire*, p28

¹³ Deborah Wilson Overstreet, *Not Your Mother's Vampire: Vampires in young adult fiction* (Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 2006), p1

¹⁴ Prior to telling her that he is a vampire, Edward asks Bella for her 'theories' on what he is; Bella reflects 'I had been vacillating during the last month between Bruce Wayne and Peter Parker'. (*Twilight*, p77)

¹⁵ Hannah Priest, ' "Hell! Was I Becoming a Vampyre Slut?": Sex, sexuality and morality in young adult vampire fiction', *The Modern Vampire and Human Identity*, p62

¹⁶ *Our Vampires, Ourselves*, p186

Joni Richards Bodart argues, '[Gothic] horror is all about disintegration, falling apart, but the vanquishing of the monsters creates the opposite effect – reintegration, coming together – that brings a feeling of rightness and security'.¹⁷

Similarly, in his introductory guide to the Gothic genre, Fred Botting argues:

The terrors and horrors of transgression in Gothic writing become a powerful means to reassert the values of society, virtue and property: transgression, by crossing the social and aesthetic limits, serves to reinforce or underline their value and necessity, restoring or defining limits.¹⁸

The Gothic is cathartic; the narrative threatens radical change, but safety is established as this radicalism is defeated and a return to the conservative is secured. This allows the reader to 'face [their] fears, regain control of them, shove them into the light and show them for what they are'.¹⁹ This is also relevant to the adoption of Gothic themes by young adult literature; the 'threatened radical change' of the transitional period between childhood and adulthood is explored through engagement with and triumph over the monstrous. The return to conservatism is played out on many levels. The protagonist battles threats from literal vampires, but also flirts with the danger of the uncontrolled and vampiric desires of adolescence after leaving the regulated and controlled sphere of childhood, and before re-entering this sphere in the authoritative position of the adult. The texts portray Christianity as one tool or system of guidance available to the protagonist during this engagement with the 'monster', both within and without. The traditional use of crosses and crucifixes, holy water and prayers,

¹⁷ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill: The psychological meaning of supernatural monsters in young adult fiction*, pxxvii

¹⁸ Fred Botting, *Gothic* (London: Routledge, 1996), p7

¹⁹ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, pxxii

imply that it is faith rather than science that will save the hero or heroine from certain destruction at the hands – or fangs – of an aberrant figure. Christianity plays a significant thematic role in the conservatism of the Gothic genre.

All three of the authors featured in this thesis use references to Christianity and Christian beliefs, both explicit and implicit. In the *Tantalize* novels, Kieren wears a crucifix, which is later adopted by Quincie.²⁰ On her first visit to the Cullen house, Bella is surprised to find ‘a large wooden cross’, carved by Carlisle’s preacher father in the seventeenth century, hanging on the vampires’ wall.²¹ While neither the Swans nor the Cullens are churchgoers, Bella and Edward are married in a traditional Christian ceremony,²² by ‘the local Lutheran minister’, Mr Weber.²³ The *upyrs* of *Wolf Mark* are devout members of the Russian Orthodox Church; Yuri informs Lucas “I take communion, accept the blessing of the priest. I dip my fingers in the holy water. I am a sinner, but I confess...I follow Jesus Christ who died for all of us.”²⁴ At times, the Christian tropes in these Gothic texts are played straight. Kieren wears his crucifix not only because of his Catholic background, but because he knows that vampires are active in Houston. Similarly, at the end of *Blessed*, Kieren’s young sister Meghan attempts to test the newly undead Quincie: ‘Meghan pumped her plump, peach-fuzzy arm up at me, and I saw that she was holding a palm-sized bottle labeled HOLY WATER. “Drink!”’²⁵ However, the texts also feature subversions of these

²⁰ *Blessed*, pp19-20

²¹ *Twilight*, p288

²² Stephenie Meyer, *Breaking Dawn* (London: Atom, 2008), p49

²³ Dave Roberts, *The Twilight Gospel: The spiritual roots of Stephenie Meyer’s vampire saga* (Oxford: Monarch Books, 2009), p124

²⁴ *Wolf Mark*, p266

²⁵ *Blessed*, p450

tropes. Both the Cullens and the *upyrs* are immune to crosses and holy water, as is the wholly-souled Quincie, who decides 'If I could wield an angel's sword and bask in heaven's light, a little holy water couldn't hurt'.²⁶ This centring of Christianity confirms, rather than challenges, the conservatism of modern Gothic young adult texts. Christianity is not only a method by which to defeat the vampire; the vampire itself can be redeemed by accepting Christianity, and, on one subtextual level, Christianity is represented as a pathway to responsible adulthood. Quincie and the Cullens, who abstain from blood entirely, are associated with Christian beliefs and values. By contrast, evil vampires in the world of *Tantalize* can be repelled using crosses and crucifixes, and destroyed by holy water.²⁷

The conservatism of the Gothic genre is not only associated with portrayals of transgressive adolescence. Several critics have commented upon colonial subtexts that can be found within Gothic texts:

The Gothic has historically maintained an intimacy with colonial issues, and in consequence with the potential for disruption and redefinition vested in the relationships between Self and Other, controlling and repressed, subaltern milieu and dominant outsider culture.²⁸

If the Gothic is 'the intermediary between the world it describes and the conventional world', then Gothic fiction can be read as a translation of social

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ 'Father loves the dunking platform. It's his brainchild, his game. A spray of holy water burns like acid, but submersion creates a visual feast as the body evaporates on contact with an impressive *whoosh* noise – a crowd pleaser.' (Cynthia Leitich Smith, *Eternal* (London: Walker Books Ltd., 2009), p58)

²⁸ William Hughes and Andrew Smith, 'Introduction: Defining the relationships between Gothic and the postcolonial', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 5 Issue 2 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), p1

discourses, including colonialist thought, into a fantastic context.²⁹ Tabish Khair notes that ‘Gothic fiction is a “writing of Otherness”...it revolves around various versions of the Other, as the Devil or as ghosts, as women, vampires, Jews, lunatics, murderers, [and] non-European presences’.³⁰ Like the vampire, these figures are often set up in opposition to traditional patriarchal and Christian notions of society. Conservative representations of the vampire parallel assimilationist policies in the nineteenth-century United States, when government- and church-run boarding schools were established with a heavy emphasis on the importance of Christianity, and underlying policies summed up as ‘kill the Indian, save the man’. As one historian notes, ‘assimilation underlay everything [Christian] missionaries attempted’ in their work amongst Native peoples.³¹ Indian boarding schools were set up in order to ‘destroy...“savage languages”, “primitive superstitions” and “uncivilized cultures” [and replace] them with work ethics, Christian values, and the white man’s civilization’.³² While many of these boarding schools were government-run, others were directly associated with Christian organisations, such as St Boniface Indian School, which was run by the Bureau for Catholic Indian Missions.³³ This focus on assimilation, and the replacement of Native beliefs with Western, Christian doctrine, has been viewed

²⁹ William Patrick Day, *In the Circles of Fear and Desire: A study of Gothic fantasy* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1985), p14

³⁰ Tabish Khair, *The Gothic, Postcolonialism and Otherness: Ghosts from elsewhere* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p6

³¹ C. L. Higham, *Noble, Wretched, and Redeemable: Protestant missionaries to the Indians in Canada and the United States, 1820-1900* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2000), p24

³² Clifford E. Trafzer, Jean A. Keller and Lorene Sisquoc, ‘Introduction: Origin and development of the American Indian boarding school system’, *Boarding School Blues*, p13

³³ Tanya L. Rathburn, ‘Hail Mary: The Catholic experience at St. Boniface Indian School’, *Boarding School Blues*, p157

by many American Indian writers as an example of cultural genocide; as George Tinker writes, 'To state the case boldly and dramatically, my thesis is that the Christian missionaries – of all denominations working among American Indian nations – were partners in genocide.'³⁴ This statement may initially seem inflammatory, and indeed, Tinker qualifies it by continuing that this process was carried out 'Unwittingly no doubt, and always with the best of intentions'.³⁵ Many modern-day American Indians have embraced Christianity and adapted it to meet their particular cultural needs.³⁶ However, the historical process of Christianising American Indians was intrinsically damaging, leading to 'the destruction of Indian cultures and tribal social structures...devastating impoverishment and death'.³⁷ Furthermore, the process of promoting Christianity by devaluing Native spiritual beliefs 'generated a sense of low self-worth on the part of Indian converts', a taught 'rejection of...culture, history, and structures of spirituality' that resulted in a culturally ingrained 'self-hatred',³⁸ a sense of which is apparent, for example, in Jacob's dismissal of Quileute legends as 'crazy stuff'.³⁹

This undermining of valued social and spiritual figures fractured the structure of many different American Indian nations, rendering them vulnerable to colonisation. Tinker theorises that 'the process of Christianization has involved some internalization of the larger illusion of Indian inferiority and the idealization

³⁴ *Missionary Conquest*, p4

³⁵ *Ibid.*

³⁶ The modern Native American Church combines Christian belief with spiritual beliefs from various American Indian cultures, and both Peyote Woman and Jesus are significant figures in the religion. Browning, the principal town of the Blackfeet reservation in Montana, boasts several churches and Christian schools, but also hosts regular Sun Dances and sweats.

³⁷ *Missionary Conquest*, p4

³⁸ *Ibid.*, pp40-41

³⁹ *Twilight*, p109

of white culture and religion'.⁴⁰ The portrayal of Christianity in the *Twilight* series, and its use in relation to Gothic tropes and archetypes, echoes this process; as this chapter will examine, the implicit Christianity of the Cullen family sets them in opposition to the Quileute wolves, who are portrayed unfavourably in comparison. The Cullens' superiority reflects the distinctly vampiric qualities of other colonial policies, the most notorious being the federal government's focus on blood quantum. Blood quantum laws were applied across the United States after the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934, and, despite being labelled 'a racist ideology sprung from the ashes of colonial policy',⁴¹ are used by several American Indian nations to establish whether an individual can become an enrolled member of a certain tribe.⁴² Keene argues that 'blood quantum was introduced by colonial powers as a method of erasing Native people – "breeding out" the Indians until they no longer existed'; the implication being that intermarriage with other ethnicities would reduce the percentage of "Indian blood" possessed by individuals until they no longer "qualified" as Native.⁴³ This policy evokes the image of the vampire, controlling a population through the medium of blood.

⁴⁰ *Missionary Conquest*, p3

⁴¹ Ryan W. Schmidt, 'American Indian Identity and Blood Quantum in the 21st Century: A critical review', *Journal of Anthropology* (2011) (www.hindawi.com/journals/janthro/2011/549521), accessed 4th March 2014

⁴² For example, the Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians requires ½ degree blood quantum, the Navajo Nation requires ¼, and the Comanche Nation requires ⅙. Other tribes, such as the Cherokee and Osage Nations, have other requirements, such as a person being a direct descendant of an originally enrolled tribal member. It is important to note that different nations' decisions to use blood quantum laws are complex, and should not be read as discriminatory; indeed, tribal use of the laws has been viewed as resulting from the imposition of colonialist values.

⁴³ Adrienne Keene, 'Full blood, verifiable Native American: A weird experience at trivia night', *Native Appropriations* (www.nativeappropriations.com/2011/02/full-blood-verifiable-native-american-a-weird-experience-at-trivia-night.html), accessed 4th March 2014

'White and Delightful': *Twilight's* Mormon vampires

It is apparent from the beginning of *Twilight* that the Cullens are unusual even within the context of modern heroic vampire characters. Although in many examples of vampire fiction, such as *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, 'the teenage vampire serves as a threatening image of family values gone awry',⁴⁴ the Cullen children are well-behaved and restrained; as Charlie comments, "they're all very mature – I haven't had one speck of trouble from any of them."⁴⁵ The Cullens struggle occasionally with their bloodlust, but pose no real threat to the people of Forks. Even the volatile Jasper is able to attend a school where students carry out blood typing for their biology assignments,⁴⁶ suggesting that he is only a danger to humans under extreme circumstances. However, as well as being overwhelmingly good, the Cullen family are implicitly Christian, with a Mormon slant. This has important implications when considering the role of Native American characters in the series.

The relationship between Native peoples and Mormonism is complex. The Church of Latter-Day Saints was founded in the United States by Joseph Smith in the early nineteenth century, and is now 'the fastest-growing faith in the Western Hemisphere'.⁴⁷ Krakauer points out that '*The Book of Mormon* appealed

⁴⁴ Teresa A. Goddu, 'Vampire Gothic', *American Literary History*, Vol. 11, No. 1 (Spring 1999), p125

⁴⁵ *Twilight*, p31

⁴⁶ *Ibid*, p100

⁴⁷ Jon Krakauer, *Under the Banner of Heaven: A story of violent faith* (New York: Doubleday, 2004; first published 2003), p3

[to Americans]...because it was so thoroughly American'; the events described in the book occur in America, where, it is stated, Jesus visited before his ascension to heaven, and where he will be reborn.⁴⁸ This American foundation means that Mormonism explicitly references American Indians in its religious texts. According to Mormonism, 'the American Indian represents the descendants of the lost tribes of the House of Israel';⁴⁹ early Mormonism was 'inseparably connected to the task of evangelizing the Indian people' because they were considered to be a key part of the world that followers of the religion hoped to create.⁵⁰ In Mormonism, Native peoples 'represent lost brothers, falling kinsmen who are to be uplifted and restored to their former status as a great people'.⁵¹ However, the specific role of American Indians in Mormonism corresponds with Tinker's critique of Christianity as a doctrine which teaches the inferiority of Native peoples, representing them as 'being of "the blood of Israel" but "fallen and cursed with dark skin because of their wickedness"'.⁵² In order to 'become again a white and delightsome people', adherence to Mormonism was necessary.⁵³ In short, the Mormon Church promoted the idea that, if American Indians lived according to the doctrines of Mormonism, they would literally become white after their deaths,⁵⁴ a transformation which was posited as a

⁴⁸ Ibid, p72

⁴⁹ Garold D. Barney, *Mormons, Indians, and the Ghost Dance Religion of 1890* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1986), p2

⁵⁰ Ibid, p9

⁵¹ Steve Pavlik, 'Of Saints and Lamanites: An analysis of Navajo Mormonism', *Wicazo Sa Review*, Vol. 8, No. 1 (Spring 1992), p23

⁵² *Mormons, Indians, and the Ghost Dance Religion of 1890*, p7

⁵³ Ibid.

⁵⁴ Accusations of racism have dogged the Church of Latter-day Saints. Until 1978, black men were barred from holding the priesthood. Mormon leaders have recently addressed this in an online statement, writing that 'The church disavows the theories advanced in the past that black

reward.⁵⁵ The belief in whiteness as a reward for good behaviour reinforces the idea of white superiority, supporting and perpetuating racist power structures.

Many articles on the *Twilight* series have focused on the fact that Stephenie Meyer is herself a Mormon. One article in *The Guardian* was entitled 'Mormon who put new life into vampires',⁵⁶ while Alisa Valdes-Rodriguez writes that 'Meyer is a devout Mormon...who says on her website that her religion colors everything she writes'.⁵⁷ As this assertion suggests, many aspects of the *Twilight* saga correlate with Mormon beliefs and Mormon history.⁵⁸ Tammy Dietz writes that 'many of Meyer's ideas about [vampiric] immortality seem inspired by Mormonism...[the Cullens have] continued to increase their education and knowledge while immortal...they do not stop improving themselves'.⁵⁹ Edward is an accomplished pianist, who can speak several languages and has 'two graduate degrees in medicine';⁶⁰ Carlisle has studied 'music, science, medicine';

skin is a sign of divine disfavour or curse'. (Associated Press in Salt Lake City, 'Mormon Church Addresses Past Racism', from *The Guardian*, 10th December 2013

⁵⁵ Native writer Patricia Riley knew of 'a teenage Cheyenne girl, adopted by Mormons, taught to despise herself and her tribal religion, but promised that if she were good and followed all the rules she would be white when she died' ('Introduction', *Growing Up Native American*, pp22-23)

⁵⁶ Dan Glaister and Sarah Falconer, 'Mormon who put new life into vampires', *The Guardian* online (<http://www.guardian.co.uk/books/2008/jul/20/news.booksforchildrenandteenagers>)

⁵⁷ Alisa Valdes-Rodriguez, 'The politics of wizards and vampires', *Racialicious* (<http://racialicious.com/2008/12/11/the-politics-of-wizards-and-vampires>)

⁵⁸ One contentious event in Mormon history is the Mountain Meadows Massacre of 1857, where a group of Mormons, disguised as Indians, 'deceived, betrayed, and murdered over a hundred men, women and children' (David L. Bigler and Will Bagley, *Kingdom in the West: The Mormons and the American Frontier, Volume 12: Innocent Blood: Essential narratives of the Mountain Meadows Massacre* (Norman: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 2008), p16). According to John Granger, the recurring motif of meadows in the *Twilight* saga is 'a response to the challenge' posed by recent critical texts regarding the massacre, which portrayed Mormonism as 'inherently bloodthirsty, violent, secretive, and abusive to women and non-believers' (John Granger, 'Mormon Vampires in the Garden of Eden: What the bestselling *Twilight* series has in store for young readers', from *Touchstone* magazine, November/December 2009, Vol. 22 Issue 8).

⁵⁹ Tammy Dietz, 'Wake Up, Bella!: A personal essay on *Twilight*, Mormonism, feminism, and happiness', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p102

⁶⁰ Stephenie Meyer, *Midnight Sun*, unpublished partial draft (www.stepheniemeyer.com/midnightsun.html), p9

and Rosalie is a skilled mechanic.⁶¹ However, the role of Mormon beliefs in the *Twilight* saga is more complex than a reader might initially believe. Some critics have argued that Meyer's portrayals of these beliefs are, to some extent, subversive. Margaret Toscano points out that Meyer 'invariably puts love before obedience',⁶² in direct contradiction of 'the Mormon emphasis on right action'.⁶³ By insisting on becoming a vampire in order to spend eternity with Edward, Bella disobeys not only her father, Charlie, who has never approved of the relationship, but also Edward himself. Edward is shown to prefer the idea of Bella and himself spending the remainder of her natural life together:

"What? You're going to stay, but let me get all old anyway? Right."
His eyes softened, while his mouth went hard. "That's exactly what I'm going to do. What choice have I? I cannot be without you, but I will not destroy your soul."⁶⁴

Had Bella been subservient to Edward's wishes, she would not have made him promise to transform her after their wedding. Nor would she have set up an alternative route into vampirehood in the form of Alice and Carlisle, both of whom agree to change her if Edward refuses. Similarly, Bella rejects what Toscano describes as 'the principle that moral purity is maintained by exclusion, by the avoidance of even the appearance of evil'.⁶⁵ Rather than distancing herself from Jacob, thus eliminating the potential for a betrayal of her relationship with Edward, Bella accepts that she loves both young men. This moment in the

⁶¹ *Twilight*, p297

⁶² Margaret M. Toscano, 'Mormon Morality and Immortality in Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight* Series', *Bitten By Twilight: Youth culture, media, and the vampire franchise*, edited by Melissa A. Click, Jennifer Stephens Aubrey and Elizabeth Behm-Morawitz (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., 2010), p21

⁶³ *Ibid*, p30

⁶⁴ *New Moon*, p518

⁶⁵ 'Mormon Morality and Immortality in Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight* Series', *Bitten by Twilight*, p21

series, Toscano argues, 'reveals that most choices are not between good and evil, but between or among goods and evils. This is not standard fare for Mormon Sunday School discussions'.⁶⁶ *Twilight* subtly challenges a central tenet of Mormonism, obedience.

Generally, however, the *Twilight* series corresponds with both Mormonism and other conservative forms of Christianity. The series is renowned for its focus on abstinence before marriage. Bella and Edward do not become sexually active until after their wedding, and it is implied the other Cullen couples, not only Carlisle and Esme, are married; at one point, Edward comments "I suppose we'll have to go to [Emmett and Rosalie's] wedding in a few years, *again*."⁶⁷ Meyer has confirmed the marriages of her vampire couples.⁶⁸ The official reason behind Edward and Bella's pre-marital abstinence is Edward's supernatural strength; he fears that he will accidentally kill or harm Bella, describing her as 'breakable'.⁶⁹ However, as a conversation between the couple in *Eclipse* reveals, his concern is not simply related to their physical disparity:

The short laugh that escaped me was more shocked than amused. "You're trying to protect your virtue!" I covered my mouth with my hand to muffle the giggle that followed. The words were so...old-fashioned.

"No, silly girl...I'm trying to protect *yours*. And you're making it shockingly difficult."⁷⁰

Edward cites sexual abstinence as one of the 'rules' that must be followed in order to have 'a shot at heaven, or whatever there is after this life'.⁷¹ This is a

⁶⁶ Ibid, p25

⁶⁷ *Twilight*, p253

⁶⁸ Stephenie Meyer, 'Personal Correspondance [sic] #1', *Twilight Lexicon* (www.twilightlexicon.com/2006/03/11/personal-correspondance-1)

⁶⁹ *Twilight*, p271

⁷⁰ *Eclipse*, p453

reversal of the traditional depiction of the vampire; not a transgressive monster whose example must be avoided, but a model of restraint who should be emulated. Edward is committed to 'human [laws]' as well as those which apply to vampires, something emphasised by his awareness of the rules that he has broken;⁷² "I've stolen, I've lied, I've coveted...my virtue is all I have left."⁷³ The Christian undertones to this characterisation are clear; if the vampire can overcome his monstrous appetites, remaining chaste and virtuous, then both Bella and the reader, who is encouraged to 'step into her shoes', should strive to overcome their simply human urges.⁷⁴ Tammy Dietz notes that this focus on the importance of chastity, particularly for young women, is a core Mormon belief; 'In the Mormon faith, premarital chastity is paramount for girls and boys, but particularly for girls, who are viewed as the ones with the power to tempt...For girls, chastity is considered more important than life itself', something that is also true of Bella's chastity.⁷⁵ Edward refuses sex with her prior to their wedding because he is afraid that he might kill her, but, after they are married, he consents, despite the fact that Bella is still human and 'breakable'. This reversal of Edward's stance on sex implies that if Bella was killed during sex within wedlock, it would be less tragic than if she had died without her 'virtue'; as a married woman, she would still have 'a shot at heaven'.

⁷¹ Ibid.

⁷² Ibid.

⁷³ Ibid, p454

⁷⁴ Stephenie Meyer, 'Twilight FAQs' (http://www.stepheniemeyer.com/twilight_faq.html)

⁷⁵ 'Wake Up, Bella!: A personal essay on *Twilight*, Mormonism, feminism, and happiness', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p100

This imposition of authority, particularly sexual authority, over Bella by Edward is important when considering the role of Christianity and the Gothic in the *Twilight* saga. Auerbach argues of *Dracula* that 'Vampirism...does not challenge marriage as it did earlier; it inculcates the restraints of marriage in a reluctant girl'.⁷⁶ While *Dracula's* presence triggers Lucy's subordination to the will of her fiancé and his male companions, the *Twilight* series takes the concept one step further, with the vampire himself demanding chastity, marriage and obedience in order for Bella to join him as his vampiric partner. This focus on patriarchal authority is why *Twilight* has been described as an explicitly Mormon vampire series.⁷⁷ Mormonism is an intensely patriarchal religion, something indicated by its religious texts and the official guidelines set out for practitioners; patriarchy itself is described as 'a question largely of law and order'.⁷⁸ This adherence to a divine rule is subverted to some degree in the *Twilight* series through Bella's rebellion against some of Edward's. However, she submits when Edward insists on marriage, despite the fact that she '[can't] say the word without making a face'.⁷⁹ This subordination of Bella's wishes to Edward's is represented

⁷⁶ *Our Vampires, Ourselves*, p80

⁷⁷ Anthony Petro and Samira K. Mehta, 'Big Vampire Love: What's So Mormon about *Twilight*?', *Religion Dispatches Magazine*, 4th December 2009 (http://www.religiondispatches.org/archive/culture/2052/big_vampire_love__what_s_so_mormon_about_twilight), accessed 12th June 2014

⁷⁸ A lesson manual for fourteen-year-old boys explained the entitlement this way: "The patriarchal order is of divine origin and will continue throughout time and eternity. There is, then, a reason why men, women and children should understand this order and this authority in the household of the people of God." (Deborah Laake, *Secret Ceremonies: A Mormon woman's intimate diary of marriage and beyond* (London: Warner Books, 1995; first published 1993), pp39-40)

⁷⁹ *Eclipse*, p445

as entirely positive; the wedding scene indicates that Edward was right, and that Bella's reservations about marriage were nothing more than 'silly'.⁸⁰

This dismissal of Bella's aversion to matrimony, and the sense that her world has been righted upon her marriage, emphasise the underlying message that Bella should submit to Edward. As a result of Edward's 'superior knowledge of both the supernatural and the natural world', the implication is that he knows what is good for her, whereas her decisions are coded as childish.⁸¹ The emphasis on Bella's 'silliness' not only positions Edward's stance as inherently 'sensible' in comparison, but the juxtaposition of the two views reinforces the gendered and generational power imbalance between the couple. Bella is constructed as an unruly child, Edward as a patriarchal adult figure; by marrying him and following his example, Bella moves from childhood to adulthood. This corresponds not only with Edward's status as a conservative vampire, but the ultimately conservative nature of the Gothic itself, where the 'return to simple domesticity' is celebrated; and, furthermore, with the young adult genre, where the protagonist must leave behind childhood and come of age.⁸² Donna Heiland argues that:

Gothic novels are all about patriarchies, about how they function, what threatens them, what keeps them going. And what becomes ever clearer

⁸⁰ During the ceremony, Bella reflects 'In that moment, as the minister said his part, my world, which had been upside down for so long now, seemed to settle into its proper position. I saw just how silly I'd been for fearing this – as if it were an unwanted birthday gift or an embarrassing exhibition, like the prom. I looked into Edward's shining, triumphant eyes and knew that I was winning, too. Because nothing else mattered but that I could stay with him'. (*Breaking Dawn*, p49)

⁸¹ Meenakshi Gigi Durham, 'Blood, Lust and Love: Interrogating gender violence in the *Twilight* phenomenon', *Journal of Children and Media*, Vol. 6 Iss. 3 (2012), p292

⁸² Fred Botting, *Limits of Horror: Technology, bodies, Gothic* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2008), p17

as one reads these novels is that patriarchy is not only the subject of Gothic novels, but is itself a Gothic structure.⁸³

The Cullen family become a microcosm of this Gothic structure. The patriarchal construction of domestic life is compounded in Carlisle Cullen, 'the undisputed patriarch of the Cullen clan'.⁸⁴ At the end of *New Moon*, when Bella asks the Cullens to vote on whether she will become a vampire or remain human, she reflects that Carlisle's decision is 'the vote that mattered most, the vote that counted more than any majority'.⁸⁵ Furthermore, Esme, despite her status as Carlisle's wife and a mother figure to the younger Cullens, does not have equivalent power to her husband – or, indeed, to the other men in her family; 'Her "son", Edward, is in fact several years "older" than her, and has far more authority within the family – although he too defers to Carlisle'.⁸⁶ Carlisle's wisdom and compassion is depicted as a positive aspect of his position as patriarch, rather than the reason for his assuming this position; he is patriarch because of his age and his gender, not on merit. The authority shared by Carlisle and Edward reflects facets of Mormon family and religious structures, particularly the fact that 'each worthy male over the age of twelve is "ordained" to the priesthood', giving him greater status in some circumstances than his mother or older female members of his family – much like Edward's greater authority in

⁸³ Donna Heiland, *Gothic and Gender: An introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), pp10-11

⁸⁴ Merinne Whitton, ' "One is Not Born a Vampire, But Becomes One": Motherhood and masochism in *Twilight*', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p132

⁸⁵ *New Moon*, p534

⁸⁶ ' "One is Not Born a Vampire, But Becomes One": Motherhood and masochism in *Twilight*', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, pp132-133

relation to Esme.⁸⁷ In 1995, the leaders of the Church of Latter-day Saints released a statement which 'reemphasized traditional roles for husbands and wives...Husbands are to provide for the family and wives to nurture the children'.⁸⁸ This is echoed in the Cullens' family set-up; Carlisle works as a doctor, while Esme runs the household.

Wilson argues that the Cullens' position as controlling colonisers is also related to their status as 'Mormon vampires':

Not only are males conceived as supreme [in Mormonism]...so is the white race. Though Mormons no longer hold to the "divinely ordained supremacy of the white race," the echoes of this belief still infiltrate the Church and certainly can account for the divinely white Cullens.⁸⁹

This focus on the 'divine whiteness' of the Cullen family is significant when considering the aforementioned belief that people of colour who follow the teachings of Mormonism will be rewarded by becoming white after their deaths. In his critical reading of the *Twilight* series, Mark Oshiro observes that this conversion to whiteness is also a side effect of the process of transforming into a vampire. When describing Maria, the vampire who recruited him, Jasper notes "They had such pale skin, I remember marveling at it. Even the little black-haired girl, whose features were clearly Mexican, was porcelain in the moonlight."⁹⁰ Oshiro points out the racist implications of the revelation that 'Even if you were any other ethnicity in your human life, once you're bit [sic] by a vampire, you

⁸⁷ Philip L. Barlow, *Mormons and the Bible: The place of the Latter-day Saints in American religion* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991), pxxvii

⁸⁸ Richard Lyman Bushman, *Mormonism: A very short introduction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), p110

⁸⁹ *Seduced by Twilight*, p136

⁹⁰ *Eclipse*, p293

become white', describing this aspect of *Twilight's* vampire mythology as 'whitewashing (literally)'.⁹¹ Generally, the concept of 'whitewashing' is related to the idea of 'colour-blindness', an approach which is often declared to be anti-racist; 'The goal of a color-blind America is an old and cherished idea...When segregation was legal...color-blindness meant abolishing the color-coded laws of southern apartheid'.⁹² However, the reality of 'colour-blindness' means that white privilege goes unchallenged, perpetuating racial inequalities; 'if people of color cry foul, if they call to attention the way they are treated or to racial inequality...white Americans (whose race and racial advantage are invisible) see them as asking for special privileges'.⁹³ In *Twilight's* form of 'whitewashing', racial tensions amongst vampires are removed by having every vampire literally become white, another example of the series' assimilationist perspective.

The representation of the Cullen family as Mormons suggests that this whiteness is next to godliness. Rather than being demonic creatures, the vampires of *Twilight* are equivalent to heavenly beings. Edward, Alice and Carlisle are paragons of virtue. Edward protects Bella's chastity until they are married, and Bella refers to him as 'an angel'⁹⁴ and 'a young god'.⁹⁵ At the end of *Breaking Dawn*, Alice becomes a saviour to the Cullens, the werewolves and

⁹¹ Mark Oshiro, *Mark Reads Eclipse: An (un)official journey through the experience of reading the third book in the Twilight series* (self-published e-book), p51

⁹² Michael K. Brown, Martin Carnoy, Elliott Currie, Troy Duster, David B. Oppenheimer, Marjorie M. Shultz and David Wettman, *Whitewashing Race: The myth of a color-blind society* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003), pp2-3

⁹³ *Ibid*, pp34-35

⁹⁴ *Twilight*, p394

⁹⁵ *Ibid*, p299

their allies.⁹⁶ Carlisle, meanwhile, is a Christ-like figure; a doctor who has never succumbed to his bloodlust, and who ‘found his calling, his penance...in saving human lives’.⁹⁷ Edward remarks that Carlisle “has always been the most humane, the most compassionate of us...I don’t think you could find his equal throughout all of history.”⁹⁸ Additionally, Carlisle is cast in the role of creator; he is responsible for the transformation of most of the Cullen clan. The *Twilight* saga implies that becoming a vampire is equivalent to ascending to heaven; Michael J. Goebel comments on ‘the religious iconography inherent with a three-day transformation resulting in resurrection’, and following this resurrection, Bella certainly seems to exist on a higher plane.⁹⁹ Although she continues to live on earth, her actions have earned her heavenly rewards; she receives strength, beauty, wealth, a loving family, her own supernatural powers, and eternal life. After a tense but ultimately bloodless confrontation with the Volturi, she and Edward are allowed to ‘[continue] blissfully into this small but perfect piece of [their] forever’.¹⁰⁰

The importance of marriage, patriarchal family structures and premarital abstinence, and the privileging of whiteness, are not the only themes in the series that correspond to Mormonism. In *Breaking Dawn*, despite the fact that her vampiric pregnancy is slowly killing her, Bella refuses to consider abortion. This could be considered a pro-choice position; she remains firm in her decision

⁹⁶ The novel culminates with Alice’s return to Forks in the company of Nahuel, another human-vampire hybrid whose existence convinces the Volturi that Renesmee is not a threat, and therefore cannot be legally destroyed.

⁹⁷ *Twilight*, p297

⁹⁸ *Ibid*, p252

⁹⁹ Michael J. Goebel, ‘“Embraced” by Consumption: *Twilight* and the modern construction of gender’, *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p173

¹⁰⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p754

despite pressure to terminate. However, Bella herself contradicts this reading when she states that continuing with the pregnancy is ‘not a choice – a necessity’.¹⁰¹ Meanwhile, the aversion of other characters to the pregnancy and the toll it takes on Bella’s body is represented as bigotry on their part. Significantly, one of Bella’s rare condemnations of Edward occurs at this point:

Edward had just called my little nudger a *thing*. He said Carlisle would get it out.
“No,” I whispered.
I’d gotten it wrong before. He didn’t care about the baby at all. He wanted to *hurt* him.¹⁰²

Although Bella disagrees with Edward on many occasions, she has, until this point, believed him incapable of harming anyone except hostile vampires. As Bella’s pregnancy continues, the ‘pro-life messages’ that Wilson identifies in the text become increasingly apparent.¹⁰³ Renesmee, like many of the *Twilight* vampires, has supernatural powers; she is able to transmit her thoughts to other people. She begins to display this ability before birth:

Edward, very lightly, put both of his hands against her huge, round stomach.
“The f-” He swallowed. “It...the baby likes the sound of your voice.”
...
“What’s he thinking now?” [Bella] demanded eagerly.
“It...he or she, is...He’s *happy*,” Edward said in an incredulous voice.¹⁰⁴

Even at this early stage, Renesmee has the capacity for a full range of human emotion. Although her gender is not apparent at this point in the text, her feelings

¹⁰¹ Ibid, p132

¹⁰² Ibid, pp133-134

¹⁰³ *Seduced by Twilight*, p60

¹⁰⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, pp325-326

certainly are; Edward also relays that she is 'startled'¹⁰⁵ when Bella shouts, and informs her that "He loves you...He absolutely *adores* you."¹⁰⁶ The only difference between Renesmee as a foetus and Renesmee as a baby and toddler is her level of knowledge; her personality, intelligence and natural abilities are established before birth, and it is therefore strongly implied that aborting her would be no different from murdering a human or vampire. As a result of this, Jacob and Edward's initial attitudes seem monstrous; when Jacob suggests "Hold her down and knock her out with drugs", Edward replies "I wanted to...Carlisle would have."¹⁰⁷ Edward's wish for Bella to have an abortion is not incompatible with Mormon beliefs; as Anna Silver writes of this section of *Breaking Dawn*:

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints officially condemns abortion as a sin, but does permit it, after counseling and prayer, in certain cases, including rape, incest, lethal fetal deformity, and when the mother's life and health are at risk. Meyer's position in the novel is well within Mormon orthodoxy.¹⁰⁸

This suggests that Edward's wishes are not intended to be read as evil, but as a result of desperation. Even at his worst, Edward is motivated not by bloodlust but by a wish to protect his wife. As previously noted Bella's wishes, however fervent, are characterised as 'silly'; Edward's attempts to make decisions for her own good are portrayed as a result of his 'overprotective' nature.¹⁰⁹ His wish to abort Renesmee is not represented as evil, but as a mistake resulting from his

¹⁰⁵ Ibid, p326

¹⁰⁶ Ibid, p327

¹⁰⁷ Ibid, p178

¹⁰⁸ Anna Silver, 'Twilight is Not Good for Maidens: Gender, sexuality, and the family in Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight* series', *Studies in the Novel*, Vol. 42, numbers 1 & 2, Spring and Summer 2010 (Denton: University of North Texas, 2010), p132

¹⁰⁹ Stephenie Meyer, *Eclipse* FAQs (http://www.stepheniemeyer.com/ecl_faq.html)

commitment to his role as an authoritative husband. His actions during this portion of the novel confirm his role as a conservative, rather than a demonic, vampire; rather than attempting to destroy the patriarchal ideal, he is attempting to save it by destroying an apparently monstrous creature that threatens his wife. The Gothic is partially subverted by having the vampire play become the key figure in an attempt to restore order. However, the subversion is not total; Edward is mistaken, and Renesmee is soon revealed to be superhuman like her father, rather than monstrous. As a result, Edward's failure – or rather, his acceptance of his mistake, and his realisation that not all of Bella's decisions are 'silly' – leads to a conclusion that reflects an even more perfect patriarchal ideal, in the nuclear family of Bella, Edward and Renesmee, who will exist 'Forever and forever and forever'.¹¹⁰

Mormon Vampires, Heathen Wolves: The Cullens as colonisers

The characteristics of the Cullen family that correspond with Mormonism – Carlisle's role as a benevolent patriarch, Edward's accomplishments and authority, and the family's eternal ties – are also portrayed as their most positive attributes. Being 'sealed' into this family is presented not only as a 'key element for Bella's eternal life as a vampire';¹¹¹ it is also the means by which Bella finds her place in the world. As the vampire Mrs Cullen, Bella is 'graceful' and

¹¹⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p754

¹¹¹ 'Big Vampire Love: What's So Mormon about Twilight?'

beautiful,¹¹² and can access numerous resources, both supernatural and financial.¹¹³ Throughout the series, the Cullens are presented as a civilising force. Having overcome their potential Gothic monstrosity, they also keep their latent ‘savagery’ in check through by adopting a ‘vegetarian’ diet. When considering this appearance of civilisation alongside the complex relationship between Mormonism and American Indian peoples, it becomes clear that the concept of the Cullen clan as an allegory for a good Mormon family has colonialist implications. Wilson argues that it is possible to ‘read the Cullens as persecuted Mormons, forced to migrate further and further west before finding their virtual Zion in Forks’,¹¹⁴ and, furthermore, that ‘*Twilight* justifies the rights of the white, Mormon Cullen vampires to inhabit Forks, while simultaneously suggesting that the Quileute people benefit from their presence’.¹¹⁵ As with Bella, who is ushered into a regulated and respectable adulthood by Edward’s influence, the paternalistic and colonising influence of the Cullens is represented as ‘improving’ and ultimately civilising the Quileutes.

This ‘benefit’ of the Cullens’ colonial presence is apparent in the case of Jacob, who, in *Breaking Dawn*, receives expensive clothes, gourmet food, and access to the Cullens’ garage of fast cars during his residence at the vampires’

¹¹² *Breaking Dawn*, p409

¹¹³ As a vampire, Bella gains a power which allows her to shield people from psychic attacks, such as Jane’s ability to induce pain. She is also able to use the Cullens’ vast finances to buy false passports for Jacob and Renesmee, setting up an escape route in case they lose the battle with the Volturi.

¹¹⁴ Natalie Wilson, ‘It’s a Wolf Thing: The Quileute werewolf/shape-shifter hybrid as noble savage’, *Theorizing Twilight: Critical essays on what’s at stake in a post-vampire world*, edited by Maggie Parke and Natalie Wilson (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2011), p202

¹¹⁵ *Ibid*, p203

house.¹¹⁶ Wilson describes this section of the novel as an illustration of the way that Jacob is 'slowly civilized by the Cullen clan'; like his best friend Bella, the unruly teenage werewolf becomes a responsible, if subordinate, adult.¹¹⁷ This 'shift...from a lower-class habitus to one marked by access to cultural signs such as books and classical music', often depicted as a mark of 'self-actualization' in literature, becomes a colonising process; Jacob's life with the Cullens is luxurious in comparison to the reservation.¹¹⁸ By submitting to and emulating the 'white and delightful' Cullens, Jacob is given access to a financially and socially privileged world. The Cullens' largesse does not extend only to Jacob. Following Leah and Seth's defection from Sam's pack, Edward approaches Jacob on behalf of Esme; "Esme was troubled by the hardships this is putting your pack through...The *homeless* part, particularly. She's very upset that you are all so...bereft."¹¹⁹ Seth is given new clothes and 'an overflowing plate of food'.¹²⁰ Esme's old clothes are set aside for Leah, and the pack is offered "any other physical object you might need, or transportation, or anything else at all. And showers."¹²¹ There are undertones of superiority in this section; in comparison to the ultra-white Cullens, the Quileute werewolves are depicted as hungry, dirty, and destitute, an image reminiscent of the 'wretched Indian' that Christian missionaries of the nineteenth century attempted to 'save'.¹²² This emphasis on 'wretchedness' and the 'bereft' nature of the Quileutes in *Twilight* is important; in

¹¹⁶ *Seduced by Twilight*, p93

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁸ *Unsettling Narratives*, p189

¹¹⁹ *Breaking Dawn*, p272

¹²⁰ *Ibid.*, p279

¹²¹ *Ibid.*, p273

¹²² *Noble, Wretched, and Redeemable*, p129

his preface to Fanon's *The Wretched of the Earth*, Sartre notes that 'the native had to love [the coloniser], something in the way mothers are loved'.¹²³ Although Sartre focuses on the figure of the mother – who, indeed, is eventually embodied for Jacob by his future mother-in-law Bella – the strong paternalistic figures of Carlisle and Edward emphasise both the raced and gendered dynamics of the power imbalance between the white vampires and the Quileute werewolves. It is no coincidence that, before the threatened battle with the Volturi, Edward refers to Jacob as 'My son'; his role as vampire patriarch and coloniser is fully established.¹²⁴

The Quileute werewolves are invariably presented as 'savage' in contrast to the Cullen family. As noted earlier in this chapter, Edward's wish for Bella to have an abortion is presented as being a result of misguided concern. Jacob, like Edward, also wishes for Bella to terminate the pregnancy; his motivations, however, are less pure. Although he cares deeply about Bella's welfare, his feelings are partly a result of jealousy:

I didn't want to see this, didn't want to think about this. I didn't want to imagine him inside her. I didn't want to know that something I hated so much had taken root in the body I loved. My stomach heaved, and I had to swallow back vomit.¹²⁵

Jacob reduces Bella to a body, a highly misogynistic attitude. The fact that it is the Native Jacob who displays this sexist and entitled perspective links to the stereotype of the misogynistic 'savage', sexually obsessed with white women.

¹²³ Jean-Paul Sartre, 'Preface', from *The Wretched of the Earth*, Frantz Fanon, translated by Constance Farrington (London: Penguin Books Ltd., 1974; first published 1961), p7

¹²⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p723

¹²⁵ *Ibid*, p174

His revulsion is not a result of Bella's illness, but relates to the fact that she has had sex with Edward. Jacob cannot bear the fact that the 'body [he loves]' and wishes to possess has already been possessed by the man he hates. As the narrative continues, the reader learns that Jacob is guilty not only of jealousy, but of other sins, notably lust:

I couldn't think about what he was suggesting...Borrowing Bella for the weekends and then returning her Monday morning like a rental movie? So messed up.

So tempting.

I didn't want to consider, didn't want to imagine, but the images came anyway. I'd fantasized about Bella that way too many times...I couldn't stop myself now. Bella in *my* arms, Bella sighing *my* name...¹²⁶

Unlike Edward, Jacob does not maintain rigid control over his desires. Where the Cullens are godly, monogamously married, and maintain a rigid control over their sexualities, Jacob's inability to police his lust positions him as inferior, profane and 'savage', in need of the civilisation and domestication offered by the vampires.

For Bella, Edward is depicted as a divine partner; as a result, Jacob is cast as the sinful option. Until the final book in the series, Jacob is set up as Edward's rival, an alternative romantic prospect. However, choosing Jacob will not provide Bella with any of the rewards that she attains for choosing Edward. In choosing life with a white vampire, Bella becomes immortal and beautiful; as the example of Emily indicates, choosing life with a Native werewolf results in potential disfigurement and a great risk of injury or death:

The right side of her face was scarred from hairline to chin by three thick, red lines, livid in color though they were long healed. One line pulled down

¹²⁶ Ibid, pp181-182

the corner of her dark, almond-shaped right eye, another twisted the right side of her mouth into a permanent grimace.¹²⁷

The illustrated guide to the series reveals that the injury Emily suffered was not a result of a deliberate attack, but a mere accident on Sam's part.¹²⁸ The fact that an accident can have such horrific results underscores the series' message that werewolves, and by implication Native people, are volatile and unpredictable. This is also apparent in less extreme circumstances. Edward either refuses to allow Bella to participate in activities where she may be injured, or provides her with safety equipment:

He came back with one object that was black and shapeless, and another that was red and easily identifiable.

"Please?" he asked, flashing the crooked smile that always destroyed my resistance.

I took the red helmet, weighing it in my hands.¹²⁹

This attention to safety is carried to absurd lengths; in *Breaking Dawn*, it is revealed that the car which Edward has bought for Bella has 'missile-proof glass and four thousand pounds of body armor'.¹³⁰ His concerns for Bella's sexual safety – her remaining chaste, in order to have 'a shot at heaven' – are no less stringent. Jacob, however, has no interest in preserving Bella's physical safety or her chastity. He enables her participation in dangerous sports such as cliff-diving

¹²⁷ *New Moon*, p331

¹²⁸ 'He tried to move away from Emily, throwing up his hand to warn her away... She stepped forward, refusing to let him back away from her accusations. When Sam burst into his wolf form, he took up much more space than he had as a human. His hand, still extended to warn Emily, turned into massive claws, which raked down her face and right arm.' (Lori Joffs and Laura Byrne-Cristiano, *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide* (London: Atom, 2011), p346)

¹²⁹ *Eclipse*, p234

¹³⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p7

and riding motorbikes, something which results in her injury.¹³¹ Throughout *Eclipse*, he makes many sexual advances, even under the guise of concern for her health: “You’ll be warm in a minute. Of course, you’d warm up faster if you took your clothes off...That’s just a simple fact...Survival one-oh-one.”¹³² Furthermore, Jacob’s commitment to Bella is portrayed as innately unreliable, a result of the werewolf process of imprinting: “You see, Jacob, *you* might leave *her* someday. Like Sam and Emily, you wouldn’t have a choice.”¹³³ Bella’s choice between Edward and Jacob, with Edward as positive and Jacob as negative, is a microcosmic version of the dichotomy between superior (Mormon/Christian, white) vampires and inferior (non-Christian, non-white) werewolves. Wilson summarises this reading of the series, and its colonialist implications:

...if we read the Cullens as persecuted Mormons, forced to migrate further and further west before finding their virtual Zion in Forks, we might interpret the Quileute as the descendants of the dark-skinned Lamanites who, if only they will accept Mormon/vampire ways, will be able to become themselves a “white and delightful” people instead of russet-skinned shape-shifters (much like Jacob has assimilated into the Cullen clan by the series close).¹³⁴

Not only has Jacob ‘assimilated into the Cullen clan’, but his imprinting on the white Renesmee ensures that his future children will be more ‘white and delightful’ than he. When considered in the context of policies such as blood

¹³¹ *New Moon*, p188

¹³² *Eclipse*, p491

¹³³ *Ibid*, p502

¹³⁴ ‘It’s a Wolf Thing’, from *Theorizing Twilight*, p202

quantum, this carries further implications of colonialism and the attempted destruction of American Indian nations.¹³⁵

Despite his rejection by Bella, the presence of the Cullens in Forks seems to have been of particular benefit to Jacob, who finds his true love in Renesmee¹³⁶ and becomes the leader of his own pack.¹³⁷ According to the rules laid out in the *Twilight* saga, this provides him with a position of authority in the Quileute nation; 'the Alpha wolf is not only the head of the pack, but also the chief of the entire tribe. As the tribe is now governed by council, the Alpha takes the position of the most senior tribal elder, despite his age'.¹³⁸ The other Quileute werewolves also attain physical benefits from their transformation. The illustrated guide to the series reveals that 'a male [werewolf] will undergo a noticeable growth spurt, affecting both height and musculature...For a female, the physical changes are much more subtle, mainly denoted by the definition of muscle rather than bulk or height'.¹³⁹ These physical attributes correspond with modern Western beauty standards; werewolf men are tall and muscular, while werewolf women are petite and toned. Muscular growth also gives the werewolves

¹³⁵ The policy of blood quantum has been described as 'genocidal' by some critics (Ryan W. Schmidt, 'American Indian Identity and Blood Quantum in the 21st Century: A critical review', *Journal of Anthropology*, 2011, www.hindawi.com/journals/janthro/2011/549521). Most famously, P. N. Limerick states 'Set the blood quantum at one-quarter, hold to it as a rigid definition of Indians, let intermarriage proceed as it had for centuries, and eventually Indians will be defined out of existence. When that happens, the federal government will be freed of its persistent "Indian problem."' (P. N. Limerick, *The Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1987))

¹³⁶ *Breaking Dawn*, p360

¹³⁷ *Ibid*, p225

¹³⁸ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p309

¹³⁹ *Ibid*, p304

enhanced strength and speed.¹⁴⁰ Although the Quileutes are werewolves as a result of their ancestry, the series confirms that the transformation is directly related to the presence of the Cullens in Forks:

The direct descendants of Taha Aki are born with twenty-four chromosomal pairs rather than the twenty-three of a normal human...This extra chromosome will not have any effect on the carrier if he or she is not in close proximity to vampires during all or part of the critical time between the onset of puberty and the age of twenty-five...It is the scent of the vampire that triggers the reaction.¹⁴¹

Effectively, the presence of the Cullens causes the Quileute werewolves to lose their human status, a scenario that echoes the colonial period of United States history. Accounts by European colonists served to dehumanise Native peoples not only in the eyes of settlers, but also to themselves:

At school, I learned that the “pagan Hawaiians” did not read or write, were lustful cannibals, traded in slaves, and could not sing. Captain Cook had “discovered” Hawaii and the ungrateful Hawaiians had killed him. In revenge the Christian god had cursed the Hawaiians with disease and death.¹⁴²

Native peoples became ‘savage’ as a result of arbitrary standards imposed by colonising forces; similarly, the fictional Quileutes only become monstrous in the presence of the colonising Cullens.

There are other dangers associated with becoming a werewolf in the vicinity of the Cullen family. Even before Jacob imprints upon Renesmee, an event which unites the vampire clan and the werewolf pack, the werewolves are

¹⁴⁰ ‘Normal people couldn’t run like this. Sometimes I thought it might be fun to enter a race – you know, like the Olympic trials or something. It would be cool to watch the expressions on those star athletes’ faces when I blew by them.’ (*Breaking Dawn*, p156)

¹⁴¹ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p303

¹⁴² Haunani-Kay Trask, ‘From a Native Daughter’, *Race, Class and Gender*, p45

called upon to defend Bella from Victoria's army of newborn vampires. The werewolves have their own reasons for engaging in this fight; their main motivation is to protect Forks and La Push from an unpredictable, dangerous group of vampires. However, they are recruited, trained and marshalled by the Cullens: "Jasper...has experience in this area. He will teach us how they fight, how they are to be defeated. I'm sure you can apply this to your own hunting style."¹⁴³ Although the pack exists to defend the local human population from hostile vampires, they are drawn into a battle between two vampire forces, a scenario which parallels the recruitment of local Indian tribes by various colonising armies.¹⁴⁴ The pack is insulted by Aro's insinuation in *Breaking Dawn* that they act as guard dogs; however, this is effectively what they have become.¹⁴⁵ Similarly, the treaty between the Cullens and the Quileutes contains a power imbalance. The treaty is drawn up to prevent any conflict between their two groups: "If they would promise to stay off our lands, we wouldn't expose them to the pale-faces."¹⁴⁶ However, while this treaty prevents the Cullens from entering the reservation, it also marks much of the land around Forks and La Push as not belonging to the Quileute people, thus opening it up for the Cullens to use as they wish. This is a colonial development; the Cullens have forced the Quileute to delineate their territory, and have immediately appropriated the 'surplus' land. The Cullens' use of this land is often in direct opposition to the

¹⁴³ *Eclipse*, p392

¹⁴⁴ For example, during their struggles for control of territory on the East Coast, the English and French forces allied themselves with the Iroquois and Algonquian nations respectively. These alliances form much of the background to the *Indian in the Cupboard* series; Little Bull instantly approves of Omri because he is English, and boasts of having killed and scalped several French soldiers.

¹⁴⁵ *Breaking Dawn*, p700

¹⁴⁶ *Twilight*, p108

Quileute people's wishes; for example, although the Cullens refrain from drinking human blood, many of their friends do not. Jasper's friends Peter and Charlotte are regular visitors, and while they have promised not to hunt in Forks, Edward does not trust them to keep to this agreement; 'Jasper's brother of sorts and the little vampire he loved were not like us; they hunted the usual way. They could not be trusted around Bella'.¹⁴⁷

These colonial aspects of the series are emphasised by the fact that, in contrast to real-world history, the treaty is only ever broken by Quileute characters:

"I guess I just violated the treaty," Jacob laughed.¹⁴⁸

How ironic that it would be Ephraim's own progeny that would violate the treaty he'd vowed to uphold...I supposed this meant I was now free to slaughter the small, defenseless tribe on the coastline, were I so inclined.¹⁴⁹

Edward, who is stated to be 'the most loving and unselfish and brilliant and *decent* person', casually jokes about committing genocide.¹⁵⁰ The flippancy of these two moments is particularly offensive when considering the history of colonisation. The *Twilight* saga has the fictional Quileute Jacob dismissing the treaty as unimportant, when many American Indian nations are currently engaged in bitter struggles to retain their remaining treaty rights.¹⁵¹ In the second extract, Edward's ironic contemplation of his apparent right to murder the people

¹⁴⁷ *Midnight Sun*, p148

¹⁴⁸ *Twilight*, p109

¹⁴⁹ *Midnight Sun*, p199

¹⁵⁰ *Eclipse*, p110

¹⁵¹ Examples include various Washington-based tribes fighting to retain their fishing rights, the Lakota struggle to regain sacred land in the Black Hills, and the real Quileute Nation's attempts to prevent parts of their reservation being ceded to the nearby National Park.

of La Push is implied to be a moment of dark humour. However, the massacre of entire Native villages or bands by white settlers or the US Army was a reality during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, one of the most egregious examples occurring at Sand Creek in 1864.¹⁵²

The Cullens are depicted as benevolent because they have not been physically violent towards the Quileute people; however, their colonisation of the tribe has nonetheless been effective. The members of the werewolf pack are valued for their usefulness to the vampire settler family, not as a people in their own right; they are dehumanised and infantilised, and their subordination to the vampires is portrayed as a positive outcome. Additionally, the success of the series has arguably contributed to the perpetuation of colonial attitudes towards the real Quileute people:

Just like the government agent sent to La Push in 1883 who gave Quileute children names from the Bible and American history (effectively erasing their own culture and history), so does the series stamp a new name on Quileute cultural legend – werewolf. This designation has been so effective that fans repeatedly ask about werewolves in Quileute legend, an action that understandably dismays tribal storytellers. Further, this representation has led some writing about the series to present the Quileute NOT as a real tribal nation, but as a fictional creation of Meyer's.¹⁵³

The fictionalisation of Native peoples can have a profound effect on the way they are treated, both politically and socially. It is easy to imagine a counterpart to the

¹⁵² On 29th November 1864, troops led by Colonel John Chivington attacked a peaceful group of Cheyenne and Arapaho camped at Sand Creek. The majority of people in the village were women, children, or men too old to fight, as the younger men were away hunting. In the *Congressional Testimony of Mr John S. Smith* (1865), a witness to the attack related 'I saw the bodies of those lying there all cut to pieces, worse mutilated than any I ever saw before; the women all cut to pieces...with knives; scalped; their brains knocked out; children two or three months old; all ages lying there from sucking infants...By whom were they mutilated? By the United States troops'.

¹⁵³ 'It's a Wolf Thing', *Theorizing Twilight*, p205

New York lawyer consulted by the Confederated Kootenai and Salish tribes commenting “Quileutes? There are really Quileutes? I thought the vampires killed you all.”

Angels and Demons: White Christian privilege

While Mormonism has clearly had an influence on the narrative of *Twilight*, Christianity in general occupies a privileged status in Meyer’s fictional world. Conservative Christian belief is apparent in Edward’s comments on the potential origins of vampirism, when he dismisses the concept of evolution:

“Couldn’t we have evolved in the same way as other species, predator and prey? Or, if you don’t believe that all this world could have just happened on its own, *which is hard for me to accept myself*, is it so hard to believe that the same force that created the delicate angelfish with the shark, the baby seal and the killer whale, could create both our kinds together?”¹⁵⁴

Jacob’s open rejection of Quileute legends is depicted as rational, but Edward’s dismissal of evolution is normalised. Recently, there has been an increasing amount of pressure from conservative Christian groups in the United States to have creationism taught in schools as an ‘alternative’ theory to that of evolution, with ‘academic freedom’ bills being introduced in several different states, a policy described as ‘a ploy for injecting religious belief into public school science classes, contrary to the establishment clause of the First Amendment’.¹⁵⁵

¹⁵⁴ *Twilight*, p269, my italics

¹⁵⁵ Sarah Posner, ‘Creationists cite ‘academic freedom’ to teach beliefs in schools’, *Aljazeera America* (<http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2013/10/9/under-the-bannerofacademicfreedom.html>), accessed 30th January 2014.

Twilight's positioning of creationism as a more legitimate explanation for life than evolution privileges conservative Christian belief within the narrative, subtly encouraging the reader to accept these doctrines without question – particularly as this creationism is espoused by that bastion of rationality and aspirational figure, Edward. Although the specific religious beliefs of individual characters are not explored in depth, it is confirmed that Bella's friend Angela Weber belongs to a Christian family.¹⁵⁶ The other members of Bella's peer group at school are largely negative characters; Jessica is a shallow gossip, Lauren is jealous and catty, and Mike and Tyler are immature. Angela, however, is 'a quiet girl, whose thoughts were usually kind', and who is portrayed as overwhelmingly selfless and generous;¹⁵⁷ she is devoted to her schoolwork and caring for her younger brothers.¹⁵⁸ Angela's construction as a good person is related to her status as a Christian, suggesting that she is written in order to include a positive view of Christianity within the narrative.

Angela is not the only character explicitly stated to be a Christian; Carlisle is also a believer. 'The only son of an Anglican pastor', the human Carlisle was trained to follow in his father's footsteps;¹⁵⁹ the fact that he keeps the cross carved by his father implies that he has not abandoned his faith despite his long existence as a vampire.¹⁶⁰ As this chapter has already established, Carlisle

¹⁵⁶ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p385

¹⁵⁷ *Midnight Sun*, p7

¹⁵⁸ '[Angela] was one of those rare people who had what they wanted and wanted what they had. If she wasn't paying attention to her teachers and her notes, she was thinking of the twin little brothers she was taking to the beach this weekend – anticipating their excitement with an almost maternal pleasure. She cared for them often, but was not resentful of this fact'. (*Midnight Sun*, p226-227)

¹⁵⁹ *Twilight*, p289

¹⁶⁰ *Ibid*, p288

occupies a Christ-like role within the world of *Twilight*; he is compassionate and caring, heals the sick, and raises people from the dead as vampires. He is also capable of forgiving even the most heinous crimes, as Edward reflects when he is on the verge of murdering Bella and her classmates:

In a few moments, there would be nothing left in me that would reflect the years I'd spent with my creator, my mentor, my father in all the ways that counted. My eyes would glow red as a devil's; all likeness would be lost forever...I knew that he would forgive me for this horrible act that I would do. Because he loved me. Because he thought I was better than I was. And he would still love me, even as I now proved him wrong.¹⁶¹

This passage contains many religious undertones; Edward regards Carlisle as his 'creator', a figure whose presence in his life lends him moral strength and who will always love and forgive him. Here, Carlisle is linked not only to Jesus, but also to God. These examples indicate that both Christian figures and Christian beliefs occupy a normalised place in the *Twilight* series that is not shared by Quileute beliefs, thus privileging Christianity over Native spiritualities.

Some critics have argued that the ultra-whiteness of the Cullens means that they too are Othered. Joo Ok Kim and Giselle Liza Anatol argue that:

...although Edward and his family are white and wealthy, their secret identity as vampires suggests a type of passing narrative, where characters attempt to blend into the dominant culture despite possessing the blood of another race.¹⁶²

Kim and Anatol continue by suggesting that 'Edward's coloring, and that of the rest of the Cullens, always sets them apart. Because their identity can be read through their *unnaturally* white skin color, they serve as members of a

¹⁶¹ *Midnight Sun*, p13

¹⁶² Joo Ok Kim and Giselle Liza Anatol, 'Trailing in Jonathan Harker's Shadow: Bella as modern-day ethnographer in Meyer's *Twilight* novels', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p192

metaphorical Other race'.¹⁶³ This view of the *Twilight* saga positions not the foreigner or the person of colour, but the rich, all-American, baseball-playing family as the Other. Bella, the everywoman, has far more in common with Jacob than she does with Edward; they are both children of single-parent families, and are from a working-class background. If, as Meyer suggests, Bella is to be viewed as a reader-insert character, then the reader too will be encouraged to view Jacob's home life as normal and Edward's as 'Other'. However, while this reading of the *Twilight* saga as a passing narrative has valid points, it does not consider wider contexts. It is true that the Cullens, and later Bella, do have to 'pass' for human, something that involves artifice and deception, and which positions them as a hidden danger concealed within small-town American society. This is particularly apparent in the scene in which Bella hides her new vampire attributes in preparation for a visit from Charlie:

"These will irritate your eyes – they won't hurt, but they'll cloud your vision...They also won't match your old color, but it's still better than bright red, right?"

[Alice] flipped the contact box into the air, and I caught it.¹⁶⁴

"The main thing is not to sit too still or move too fast."

...
"You'll be holding your breath as much as possible, but you need to move your shoulders a little to make it *look* like you're breathing."¹⁶⁵

The contact lenses are intended to mask Bella's red eyes, the mark of a newborn vampire. Her need to hold her breath is to prevent her from becoming crazed by Charlie's scent and attacking him. The fact that all members of the Cullen family

¹⁶³ Ibid, p201

¹⁶⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, pp500-501

¹⁶⁵ Ibid, p502

have advice to offer Bella suggests that they are continuously focused on their human masquerade. However, while they expend effort and energy in order to pass, they are not treated as Other by human society in the same way as marginalised groups, such as American Indians. Although the Cullens are isolated at school, it is apparent that they have chosen this isolation; they sit 'as far away...as possible' from the other students at lunch, and associate only with each other.¹⁶⁶

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: musewb.wordpress.com

This 'chosen Otherness' is in itself an example of privilege; the Cullens choose to withdraw, rather than being ostracised. They could engage with society and exploit their privilege at any moment, and frequently do so. Edward's good looks result in him receiving extra attention from the staff at La Bella Italia,¹⁶⁷ and the

¹⁶⁶ *Twilight*, p16

¹⁶⁷ Bella observes that the hostess 'welcomed him a little more warmly than necessary' (*Twilight*, p145), while the waitress 'smiled with unnecessary warmth' (*Twilight*, p146).

family's riches allow them to flout the rules on many occasions, such as when Alice and Bella are entering Volterra:¹⁶⁸

"I'm sorry, only tour buses allowed in the city today, miss," he said in English, with a heavy accent. He was apologetic, now, as if he wished he had better news for the strikingly beautiful woman.

"It's a private tour," Alice said, flashing an alluring smile...She put something into his palm, and folded his fingers around it.

His face was dazzled as he retrieved his hand and stared at the thick roll of money he now held.¹⁶⁹

Similarly, the Cullens' unorthodox methods of raising their children are tolerated. As the Cullens cannot be around humans on sunny days, owing to their sparkling skin, the family cover story is that they go camping:

"Is it normal for the...Cullens...to be out of school a lot?"

...
"Yes, when the weather is good they go backpacking all the time – even the doctor. They're all real outdoorsy."¹⁷⁰

The Cullen family are able to flaunt attendance rules and be regularly absent from school, without sanctions; even Edward's extended absences in the first novel and in *New Moon* have no apparent repercussions.¹⁷¹

By contrast, many Native writers have commented on the fact that traditional methods of childrearing are often misunderstood and condemned by mainstream schools. This is indicated by the 'Open Letter to a Non-Indian Teacher':¹⁷²

¹⁶⁸ Ibid, p149

¹⁶⁹ *New Moon*, p446

¹⁷⁰ *Twilight*, p135

¹⁷¹ Early in *Twilight*, Edward flees to Alaska after realising that he is powerfully attracted to Bella's scent. He does not return to school in Forks for several days.

¹⁷² Editors' note, from *A Broken Flute*, p9

He is not accustomed to having to ask permission to do the ordinary things that are part of normal living. He is seldom forbidden to do anything; more usually the consequences of an action are explained to him, and he is allowed to decide or himself whether or not to act...Didactic teaching will be an alien experience to him...He does not speak standard English but he is in no way "linguistically handicapped."¹⁷³

This letter illustrates the ways that a child whose upbringing has focused on various Native values and traditions can be misunderstood within a Eurocentric educational system. It advises the hypothetical teacher 'Do not mistake his patient courtesy for indifference or passivity', and informs the reader of the differences between Native and Western upbringings.¹⁷⁴ The letter is a response to a far-reaching and longstanding bias in United States society against traditional Native methods of raising children, which has, in many cases, led to children being removed from their families. The Cullens' white, Western, Christian privilege, by contrast, means that they can behave almost entirely as they wish; mainstream society accepts their way of living, and makes no attempt to interfere. The Cullens are not truly 'Othered' by their appearance and lifestyle, unlike American Indians, who, both in the past and the present, have suffered social sanctions for attempting to follow traditional lifestyles and beliefs.¹⁷⁵ The Cullens' privilege in comparison to the Quileute is particularly apparent in an encounter in *Eclipse*, when Jacob turns up at Bella's school. The school principal

¹⁷³ 'An Indian Mother', 'Open Letter to a Non-Indian Teacher', *A Broken Flute*, p8

¹⁷⁴ Ibid.

¹⁷⁵ Many Native children have been removed from their families because traditional childrearing practices, such as leaving children in the care of elders, were viewed as neglectful. More recently, Native children have been penalised at school for engaging in cultural activities. In February 2012 a Menominee student, Miranda Washinawatok, was suspended from her school basketball team for teaching a friend to say "I love you" in her language. In May 2013, Native students at two different schools from Alabama were penalised for wearing eagle feathers to their graduations. One student, Sky Walkingstick, was forced to remove the feather, while the other, Chelsey Ramer, was denied her diploma and issued with a \$1000 fine (this was later dropped).

tells Jacob “I suggest you remove yourself from school property at once, young man, before I call the police,”¹⁷⁶ then informs Edward “If you’re worried about any trouble, I’d be happy to [help].”¹⁷⁷ Bella notes that ‘Edward’s perfect grades and spotless record were clearly a factor in Mr Greene’s assessment of the incident’; however, it is likely that Edward and Jacob’s respective ethnic and class backgrounds have also influenced the principal’s opinion.¹⁷⁸ Additionally, this sentence confirms that Edward’s repeated absences are excused by the school; despite skipping class every sunny day, his record is still considered ‘spotless’.

The *Twilight* saga portrays the vampire as cultural insider, subverting some elements of the traditional Gothic and bringing in aspects of the suburban Gothic. Meyer’s narrative fulfils tropes associated with the suburban Gothic, where ‘one is almost always in more danger from the people in the house next door...than from external threats. Horror here invariably begins at home, or at least very near to it’.¹⁷⁹ While Carlisle is originally English, the other Cullens are American by birth; they are a threat that has sprung entirely from within American society. During the revelation of his true nature in *Twilight*, Edward stresses that he is dangerous, telling Bella “I’m the world’s best predator, aren’t I? Everything about me invites you in – my voice, my face, even my *smell*. As if I need any of that!...As if you could outrun me...As if you could fight me off.”¹⁸⁰ Later in the series, this potential for danger is extended to the entire Cullen family, when

¹⁷⁶ *Eclipse*, p84

¹⁷⁷ *Ibid*, p85

¹⁷⁸ *Ibid*.

¹⁷⁹ Bernice M. Murphy, *The Suburban Gothic in American Popular Culture* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p2

¹⁸⁰ *Twilight*, p231

Bella cuts her arm during a visit to their house: 'Dazed and disoriented, I looked up from the bright red blood pulsing out of my arm – into the fevered eyes of the six suddenly ravenous vampires'.¹⁸¹ These elements of the novel suggest that the *Twilight* series may be subverting the 'otherness' of vampires in a way similar to the *Tantalize* series; rather than the 'dark outsider', it is the white, Christian, ultra-American family who are the monsters.

However, the Cullen family only pose a minor threat to the people of Forks; Meyer's mainstream vampires have had their fangs drawn. Even Jasper, who finds abstaining from blood "so much more of a challenge" than the rest of his family, has succeeded in keeping to the Cullens' 'vegetarian' lifestyle for several decades.¹⁸² The Cullens are 'civilised', whereas the Quileute werewolves are depicted as wild, eating raw meat, running naked in the forest, and at such great risk of attacking their loved ones that they must constantly police each others' behaviour; 'Seth – gangly, fifteen-year-old Seth – had his long arms around Jacob's shaking body, and he was tugging him away. If Jacob phased with Seth so close...'¹⁸³ Despite the similarities in this scene to Jasper's attempted attack on Bella, there are different contexts to the two scenes. Jasper's 'savagery' is only unleashed when Bella cuts her finger. Jacob, by contrast, is in danger of phasing simply as a result of a conversation with Bella, implying that his 'savagery' lies much closer to the surface than that of a vampire.

In contrast to the suburban Gothic concept of the 'family next door' as the greatest danger, it is revealed in *Eclipse* that the only vampires who have truly

¹⁸¹ *New Moon*, p29

¹⁸² *Ibid*, p43

¹⁸³ *Breaking Dawn*, pp66-67

posed a threat to humanity have been non-white¹⁸⁴ and lived outside of the United States. When explaining how he became a vampire, Jasper tells Bella that “the covens in the South [do not] care much for what the humans notice or do not,”¹⁸⁵ and that “it has been war in [South America], constant war for centuries, with never one moment of truce.”¹⁸⁶ In comparison to South America, Jasper states, “the North is...very civilized”, a loaded description that posits the ‘Southern vampires’ as inherently ‘uncivilised’, or savage.¹⁸⁷ Oshiro identifies the implications of this description of vampire history:

Meyer is saying, in effect, that the only group of people who were capable of nearly ruining the world all lived south of the United States. And that in order for things to become safe, the Volturi (who are, by the way, entirely white) had to come exterminate all the brown vampires.¹⁸⁸

Meyer’s representation of non-Othered vampires is not as subversive as it initially appears. The Cullens only pose a minor danger to humanity, a fact that is linked directly to their status as white, Christian and civilised. In the *Twilight* universe, the ‘dark foreigner’ is still the figure to truly fear.

Bloofer Ladies: Vampire heroines and villains

The suburban Gothic undertones of *Twilight*, where the vampire is positioned as part of mainstream society rather than an obvious Other, are also apparent in the

¹⁸⁴ As Oshiro notes, all vampires become white after being turned; the term ‘non-white’ is here intended to refer to their human races and ethnicities.

¹⁸⁵ *Eclipse*, p288

¹⁸⁶ *Ibid*, p289

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid*.

¹⁸⁸ *Mark Reads Eclipse*, pp49-50

Tantalize series. This is a deliberate decision by Leitch Smith, who writes ‘*Blessed* and my two novels that preceded it – *Tantalize* and *Eternal* – are a conversation of sorts between me and [Bram] Stoker about several of his themes, including the “other”, the “dark” foreigner, [and] invasion’.¹⁸⁹ Throughout the series, Leitch Smith explores the concept of Othering, considering many of the intersecting axes through which an individual can be Othered. As Bodart notes, the shifter community are ‘treated like minorities have been treated throughout human history – being outed as any kind of were can mean losing one’s job, being forced to leave one’s neighborhood or town, or being subjected to a variety of other bullying and discriminatory practices’.¹⁹⁰ Racial Othering is apparent in the experiences of several different characters. The Morales family serve as an allegory for the treatment of non-white people in the United States, encompassing mixed-race relationships and passing narratives. Miranda is on the receiving end of racial micro-aggressions from her vampire ‘father’; Radford consistently fails to differentiate between his Chinese-American protégée and his late Japanese wife:

“Leiko was one of your people...”

I have no idea who Leiko is or was, but the name sounds Japanese...I’m Chinese American on Mom’s side, Scottish American on Dad’s. I’ve mentioned my heritage in passing to Father only once or twice.

I decide it’s best to ignore the “your people” reference. In his day, it was probably considered polite (or at least that’s what I tell myself).¹⁹¹

Similarly, Evie the Wereotter is Othered not only because of her species, but because of her sexuality. As a reader might expect from a Gothic and young

¹⁸⁹ Afterword to *Blessed*, p459

¹⁹⁰ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, p35

¹⁹¹ *Eternal*, pp66-67

adult series, *Tantalize* contains narratives revolving around the process of Othering. However, the series' Othering narratives become particularly complex when they are related to the vampire characters.

In the *Tantalize* series, 'vampirism is a demonic infection that gradually rots the soul', and which can affect everyone from any part of society.¹⁹² Leitch Smith's novels suggest that the kind of evil associated with vampirism can come from within as easily as without, corresponding with Murphy's idea that 'horror...invariably begins at home, or at least very near to it'.¹⁹³ Like the wholesome Cullen family, the *Tantalize* series' 'good' vampires have the potential to become dangerous. Even a shy teenage girl such as Miranda can become a monster:

Hanging from a corner of the ceiling, I tilt my head, spiderlike.

...
I flex, releasing my grip on the ceiling, falling to seize the girl's neck as I land, covering her mouth.

...
I don't realize in time that I've drunk too much.¹⁹⁴

This passage emphasises Miranda's inhumanity; she is described as 'spiderlike', and her actions resemble that of a predatory animal rather than a murderous human. Her behaviour and nature in this scene are set in contrast to her previous humanity; prior to her conversion, she is an average teenager: "She had a crush on Geoff Calvo. She dreamed of becoming an actress. She was bullied by Denise Durant. She listened to Christian rock and used lemongrass

¹⁹² *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, p35

¹⁹³ *The Suburban Gothic in American Popular Culture*, p2

¹⁹⁴ *Eternal*, pp223-224

bodywash.”¹⁹⁵ Miranda’s transformation, and the monstrous acts that she commits, imply that a potential for darkness can be found even in the most apparently innocent person.

This juxtaposition of normal girl and demonic being is a recurring theme of the series. Both heroines become vampires; Quincie at the end of *Tantalize*, Miranda at the beginning of *Eternal*. Both young women struggle with their demonic natures following transformation. The passage quoted above describes only one occasion on which Miranda succumbs to her appetite for blood. The castle where she lives has cellars full of prisoners upon whom the vampire residents feed, and on her first hunt, she kills so many people that ‘Songs are still sung in praise of that night, odes recited’.¹⁹⁶ Quincie exercises greater restraint, never killing a human; however, she is tempted to attack Kieren’s young sister Meghan, reflecting that ‘She smelled scrumptious’¹⁹⁷ and ‘Just down the hall – one door, two – Meghan would be so defenseless’.¹⁹⁸ The fact that Quincie poses a threat to a young child parallels Lucy’s role as the ‘bloofer lady’ in *Dracula*; upon becoming a vampire, she feeds exclusively from small children.¹⁹⁹ Where Lucy is implicitly characterised as an aberrant and abusive woman, however, Quincie, like Miranda, is coded as a predator; she is not targeting

¹⁹⁵ *Diabolical*, p108

¹⁹⁶ *Eternal*, p50

¹⁹⁷ *Tantalize*, p269

¹⁹⁸ *Blessed*, p110

¹⁹⁹ ‘During the past two or three days several cases have occurred of young children straying from home or neglecting to return from their playing on the Heath. In all these cases the children were too young to give any properly intelligible account of themselves, but the consensus of their excuses is that they had been with a ‘bloofer lady’.’ (Bram Stoker, *Dracula* (<http://www.planetebook.com/ebooks/Dracula.pdf>), pp252-253, accessed 12th June 2014)

Meghan out of a perverse inversion of maternal instinct, but instead, behaving like an animal choosing weaker and 'defenceless' prey.

Unlike Lucy, both Quincie and Miranda have been converted not by a 'dark stranger' from a foreign land, but by their fellow countrymen, underscoring the 'threat from within' that characterises the suburban Gothic. Bradley from *Tantalize* and Radford from *Eternal* are both Americans born and bred, from old Southern families. Radford, as the highest member of vampire royalty, The Dracula, has influence over human society; 'Worldwide law enforcement and militaries...we have something of an understanding about who's fair game and who isn't. They pay in blood if they violate our space. We pay in cash if we violate theirs'.²⁰⁰ Bradley, with his attempts to create an army of vampires in Texas, symbolises the possibility that American society itself holds the potential for anarchy and disorder. Unlike the Cullens, these two vampires pose a real threat to human society. Bradley's actions in *Blessed* are similar to those of the South American vampires mentioned in *Eclipse*, who created armies of vampires in order to gain power. However, unlike *Twilight's* Southern American vampires, Bradley is as 'civilised' and Westernised as the Cullens; he is an expert chef, who has published extensively in academic journals, and who owns enough property to make him a member of the vampire gentry. Meanwhile, Radford is comparable to the Volturi; he is surrounded with pomp and tradition, and occupies an exalted status in vampire society. By making the Dracula a home-grown American instead of a member of the old-world aristocracy, the *Tantalize*

²⁰⁰ *Eternal*, p75. Like the Cullens, the vampires of the *Tantalize* series have privilege within human society, particularly as a result of their amassed wealth.

series centres the danger faced by the heroines in the familiar rather than the foreign.²⁰¹

As one might expect of a story based on *Dracula*, Christianity is given a prominent status in the *Tantalize* novels. Indeed, it is depicted as one source of Quincie's self-control. Following her transformation into a vampire, she consoles herself by thinking of her faith; 'I'd always thought of myself as a believer...I closed my eyes and raised my grateful, tear-stained face to heaven'.²⁰² The most prominent aspect of the theme of Christianity in the *Tantalize* novels, however, can be found in the series' portrayal of angels. *Tantalize's* angels are represented in ways that are in keeping with ideas associated with mainstream Christianity. Zachary is a winged, beautiful being who is capable of producing 'heavenly light', and who reports to the Archangel Michael, 'The Sword of Heaven [and] The Bringer of Souls'.²⁰³ However, Christianity in the series is not closely associated with whiteness, as it is in the *Twilight* saga;²⁰⁴ the biracial Morales family are also devout Catholics. Furthermore, despite the Christian aspects of Heaven as described by Zachary, the narrative specifically states that no religion is given prominence over any other; 'Forget what you might have heard. There are no separate corps of angels for agnostics, atheists, Catholics, Protestants, Jews, Muslims, Mormons, Buddhists, Unitarians, Hindus, Druids,

²⁰¹ As if to underscore this point, the second *Dracula* seen in the series, Sabine, is French. In contrast to the madness and chaos of Radford's rule, Sabine brings stability to vampire society, suggesting that this 'dark foreigner' is not as threatening as she may seem.

²⁰² *Blessed*, pp20-21

²⁰³ *Ibid*, p22

²⁰⁴ In the film version of *Twilight*, the character of Angela is played by an Asian-American actress. However, there is nothing in the original novel to suggest that Angela is intended to be Asian-American. The film version also downplays Angela's religious background.

Shintoists, Wiccans, and so on'.²⁰⁵ Despite the prominence of Christian themes in the text, the *Tantalize* series implies that all beliefs are equally valid.

Tantalize does not shy away from exploring the potentially negative aspects of organised religion. In the passage quoted above, when she kills the weredeer, Miranda reflects 'I recall what my minister said back home. They're not people. They're animals in people skin'.²⁰⁶ A similar allusion can be found in the fourth novel in the series, *Diabolical*, when the half-wereotter Evelyn is describing her family background. She tells Kieren "My dad is the head of the New England Council for Preserving Humanity", an extremist group involved in the murders of several werepeople.²⁰⁷ While it is not explicitly associated with Christianity, the group's actions parallel those of the Ku Klux Klan or the Westboro Baptist Church, groups which draw upon Christian beliefs to justify violent or discriminatory action against marginalised groups that they have deemed Other. Evelyn also reveals her family's negative reaction when she discovered her wereotter heritage; "Dad wasn't there, thank God. Mom screamed at me that I was shameful and told me to leave and never come back."²⁰⁸ In the *Twilight* series, negative portrayals of Christianity are associated only with non-American characters. Carlisle's English father is described as 'an intolerant man' who 'was enthusiastic in his persecution of Roman Catholics and other religions'; Carlisle's escape from his father's influence and journey to America parallels the journey of the Pilgrims, who founded the United States in order to flee religious persecution

²⁰⁵ *Eternal*, p91

²⁰⁶ *Ibid*, p223

²⁰⁷ *Diabolical*, p119

²⁰⁸ *Ibid*, p120

in England.²⁰⁹ Americanised forms of Christianity, particularly the Mormon-like lifestyle of the Cullens, are consistently portrayed in a positive light. The *Tantalize* series avoids this black-and-white representation of positive and negative Christianity, instead showing that, even within American society, Christian beliefs can be the source of personal strength and compassion, or an excuse for acts of great evil. This reflects the relationship between Christianity and Native communities; while policies of colonial Christianisation had a negative impact on many tribes, some Native peoples have renegotiated Christianity in ways that correspond to their own cultures.

What Would Vampire Jesus Do? Fighting for the soul of the vampire

Wolf Mark's *upyrs* initially seem to correspond with the Stokerian depiction of vampires as mysterious foreigners who are both physically and sexually aggressive, drawn in explicit opposition to Christian ideals:

“*Khakhalya*,” Marina whispers by the side of my face. “Boy toy, want to play?” Then she puts her tongue in my ear. That does make it a little more difficult to stay still. I feel her hand on my hip, sliding along my thigh. Much more difficult.²¹⁰

The novel’s use of Christianity as a theme, however, is more complex. The *Tantalize* series contains a nuanced representation of Christianity, focusing both on the negative manifestations of Christian belief in contemporary American society, and on more positive forms of the religion. *Wolf Mark*, however, contains

²⁰⁹ *Twilight*, p289

²¹⁰ *Wolf Mark*, p68

a section that seems to manipulate Christian beliefs in a manner similar to the *Twilight* saga's appropriation of Quileute legends. Yuri and Lucas discuss the truth behind traditional methods of defeating vampires, with a focus on the role of the cross:

He reaches to unbutton a breast pocket and pull out a small ornate Russian orthodox cross made of silver. He presses it to his lips. To my surprise, nothing happens. Yuri laughs.

"What you think? I burst into flame, scream? I take communion, accept the blessing of the priest. I dip my fingers in the holy water. I am a sinner, but I confess. I am Russian Orthodox. I follow Jesus Christ who died for all of us and came back to life. *Ever wonder how he did that?*"²¹¹

The implications of this passage are emphasised further by Yuri's description of how *upyrs* are created; "[Our first] death – unless by fire – does not really kill us. We seem dead, but are in...incubation. And when we wake at last, we have become fully who we are."²¹² In the universe of *Wolf Mark*, Jesus was not a divine being, but an *upyr*. The use of Christian belief to bolster the mythology of *Wolf Mark* may seem similar to *Twilight's* appropriation of Quileute legends. If it is problematic for Meyer to rewrite Quileute creation stories, then surely it is also problematic for Bruchac to portray the most important figure in Christianity as a supernatural monster?

However, the context of the relationship between American Indian peoples and Christianity makes this issue more complex than it might initially appear. The reinterpretation of Christian beliefs by American Indian cultures has been an important part of recovery from colonisation, and many Native peoples have

²¹¹ Ibid, p266, my italics

²¹² Ibid.

aligned Christianity with their traditional beliefs. A prominent example of this process is the Native American Church:

The Native American Church has no officially authorized body of doctrine and no single system of ideas and symbols, but some broad generalizations still apply to most church members. They usually equate God with the Great Spirit...Jesus often replaces native culture heroes or guardian spirits to intercede between God and humanity, and He is sometimes identified with Peyote Woman in the cultus.²¹³

Furthermore, owing to historical context and social power structures, an American Indian use of Christianity has different implications to Christian appropriation of American Indian beliefs. Christianity occupies a privileged position in the modern United States; despite the official separation of church and state, Christianity wields great influence in American society. Every president of the United States has been openly Christian, and Christian groups, including Mormon groups, have successfully campaigned on legal and social issues.²¹⁴ Christianity is normalised, represented widely in media; many popular television shows have 'Christmas special' episodes, or show characters attending church.²¹⁵

By contrast, traditional Native beliefs are rarely represented with any degree of accuracy. They are usually depicted as strange, exotic and associated with the past, rather than as a normal part of everyday life. Furthermore, the

²¹³ Henry Warner Bowden, *American Indians and Christian Missions: Studies in cultural conflict* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1981), p211

²¹⁴ The Church of Latter-day Saints campaigned successfully against the passing of the Equal Rights Amendment, an act intended, among other things, to give women equal pay for equal work.

²¹⁵ Many scenes in *The Simpsons* take place in Springfield's church, and Reverend Lovejoy is a recurring character. Popular sitcoms *Friends* and *How I Met Your Mother* have had Christmas specials. These shows are not religious, but Christianity is given a prominent status that is not shared by any other religion.

colonial period specifically prevented American Indian peoples from practicing their traditional religions, and instead forced them to participate in Christianity, as

Allen describes:

The genocide practiced against the tribes is aimed systematically at the dissolution of ritual tradition. In the past this has included prohibition of ceremonial practices throughout North and Meso-America, Christianization...re-education of tribal peoples through government-supported and Christian mission schools that Indian children have been forced to attend.²¹⁶

The marginalised position of American Indians as colonised peoples means that the 'Nativisation' of Euro-American people has never occurred on the same scale and with the same colonial intent as the Christianisation of American Indians.²¹⁷

As Andrea Smith notes in her essay 'For All Those Who Were Indian in a Former Life', Native religions are not evangelical; 'Indian religions are community-based, not proselytizing...Indians do not generally believe that their way is "the" way, and consequently, they have no desire to tell outsiders about their practices'.²¹⁸

Although Bruchac is undoubtedly reinterpreting Christianity for the purposes of his narrative, the privileged position of Christianity in American culture means that he has an insider perspective of the religion. As a result of this, his use of Christian belief in his narrative is not comparable to Meyer's use of Quileute beliefs.

Leitch Smith not only shares this insider perspective, but her representation of Christianity does not disregard its religious significance. The

²¹⁶ *The Sacred Hoop*, p195

²¹⁷ During the period of US expansion, there were several incidents of American Indian tribes kidnapping white settlers. However, this did not occur on a grand scale, or with the intention of forcing white Americans as a group to adopt Native ways of life.

²¹⁸ 'For All Those Who Were Indian in a Former Life'

Tantalize series employs creative licence with regards to Christianity; *Eternal* and the following novels focus on the ‘Guardian Angel corps’, a group constructed like a government agency, who communicate via email (see Appendix 3). However, the themes explored within the series – sin, redemption, and the nature of the soul – correspond with traditional Christian beliefs. *Eternal* focuses on Zachary, an angel who, although not yet fallen, has “slipped”; he must save the soul of the vampire Miranda in order to regain his own heavenly status.²¹⁹ During *Diabolical*, Miranda, who has found herself in a pleasant version of Purgatory known as ‘the Penultimate’, must make amends with her victims before entering heaven; she is confronted by Tamara, the weredeer that she murdered in the hotel room, in a fraught meeting where Tamara refers to her as ‘the darling serial killer...[who] ripped away my dreams’.²²⁰ By the end of *Diabolical*, after saving Kieren’s life by filing a ‘Lazarus provision’,²²¹ Miranda has been redeemed and is permitted to enter Heaven with Zachary; ‘With my angel at my side, I cross into the divine’.²²² The *Tantalize* series presents a non-traditional version of Christian beliefs and an egalitarian Heaven that does not exclude any sentient being as a result of their faith. However, it also keeps a constant focus on the core aspects of Christian belief, and represents these beliefs in a positive light.

Wolf Mark, in contrast to *Twilight*, privileges Abenaki beliefs over Christianity. Abenaki spirituality is normalised within the narrative, while Christianity is implied to have been based on a misunderstanding; the

²¹⁹ *Eternal*, p86

²²⁰ *Diabolical*, pp282-283

²²¹ *Ibid*, p336

²²² *Ibid*, p349

reanimation of an *upyr*, rather than the resurrection of a divine being. The *Tantalize* series, by contrast, portrays Christianity as no more or less valid than other beliefs, and incorporates Native traditions alongside Christian imagery as a method by which to defeat the forces of evil.²²³ This is a clear subversion of colonial practices and intentions; however, it is not the only example of such subversion in the novels. A important part of the colonisation of American Indians was their representation by Euro-American society as Other, often by comparing them directly to animals. The link between Native peoples and animals continues to be apparent in modern texts; for example, Jacob and Lucas' status as werewolves in their respective novels. The next chapter will examine this animalisation of American Indians in the three sets of texts, and the implications of this for Native peoples in contemporary society.

²²³ In *Diabolical*, Zachary's holy sword and light, and Kieren's cross and supplies of holy water, are used to survive the Scholomance; however, the characters also engage in American Indian traditions such as burning sage.

Chapter Three

Monstrous Men and Frozen Women: Constructions of male and female bodies and the significance of transformation

'Ringed, streaked, spotted and speckled cattle': The animalisation of Native peoples

In 1790, Hugh Henry Brackenridge made 'some observations with regard to the animals, vulgarly called Indians', describing them as 'ringed, streaked, spotted and speckled cattle'; his dehumanising language is a strong example of the ultimate extreme of the 'wild savage' stereotype, the equating of Native peoples with animals.¹ Early Euro-American settlers viewed Native uses of land as 'uncivilised', as they were predominately hunter-gatherers rather than farmers, claiming that 'Indians had only "savage title" because they used most of their land for hunting and therefore left it thinly populated and underdeveloped'.² This argument 'became the standard rationalization for extinguishing their territorial claims and replacing them with white agriculturalists who would follow the Biblical injunction to "increase and multiply, replenish the Earth and subdue it" in the way that Indians allegedly could not'; an argument that privileges Christian beliefs over American Indian traditions, taking the dichotomy between different systems of thought to an extreme conclusion.³ The underlying belief was that Native ways of living were so different from 'civilised' lifestyles that indigenous peoples were in fact closer to animals than humans. Native peoples become 'a permanent

¹ Hugh Henry Brackenridge, writing in 1790, quoted in *War Cries on Horseback*, p11

² George M. Frederickson, *White Supremacy: A comparative study in American and South African history* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), p11

³ Ibid.

“present absence” in the US colonial imagination, an “absence” that reinforces at every turn the conviction that Native peoples are indeed vanishing and that the conquest of Native lands is justified’, as there are no longer humans present to contest ownership.⁴ Smith is exploring the stereotype of the ‘vanishing Indian’ in this passage, but one can read her words as relating to the absence of humanity that colonial ideologies imposed upon Native peoples. If Indians were animals, then there was indeed an ‘absence’ of humanity in the lands that settlers intended to occupy; killing the current residents was not murder, and forcing them off of this land was not theft.

Native peoples’ existing relationships with animals were turned against them in order to promote this colonial notion of American Indians as animalistic. In ‘The Sacred Buffalo’, Rosalie Little Thunder writes of the Plains tribes’ focus on the buffalo as part of their social structure.⁵ This connection between Plains Indian nations and the buffalo was warped by colonial policies, which targeted the indigenous humans and animals alike. There was an extensive campaign to ‘wipe out [the] buffalo and therefore tribes’; the resultant mass slaughter of the buffalo was intended to starve the people who depended upon them for food.⁶ Another notorious method of genocide included deliberately introducing diseases against which Native peoples had no natural resistance:

⁴ *Conquest*, p9

⁵ The buffalo, through its instinctive wisdom, had a sophisticated social system that we adopted. There were no “single parents” – grandmothers, grandfathers, aunts, uncles, mothers, second mothers, fathers, sisters, brothers, all actively contributed to the well-being of the young. We call this “tiospaye.” It takes a village to raise a child. It takes a herd to raise a good buffalo calf. (Rosalie Little Thunder, ‘The Sacred Buffalo’, *Rethinking Columbus*, p44)

⁶ *Ibid.*

“Out of our regard to them...we gave them two blankets and a handkerchief out of the Small Pox Hospital. I hope it will have the desired effect.”⁷

“You will Do well to try to Inoculate the *Indians*, by means of Blankets, as well as to Try Every other Method, that can Serve to Extirpate this Execrable Race – I should be very glad your Scheme for Hunting them down by Dogs could take Effect.”⁸

The dogs mentioned in this passage link to a less well-known policy; hunting dogs were also used against American Indian peoples:

Colonel Henry Bouquet, a French-speaking Swiss mercenary [in the 18th century]...favoured what was termed the Spanish method of dealing with [Native peoples], which meant loosing armoured dogs of war upon civilians. These dogs were trained to tear at and then eat human flesh.⁹

These methods of genocide evoke the extermination of pests; the similarities are indicative of the extent to which American Indians had been dehumanised by settler society, considered to be vermin rather than people.

A modern reader may assume that this animalisation of Native peoples has fallen out of favour. However, this is not the case. In *Comanches*, first published in 1974, T. R. Fehrenbach describes the titular nation in dehumanising terms, stating that the lives of the early Comanches involved little more than ‘Grubbing, hunting, killing, feasting, mating, dying, and giving birth’.¹⁰ Similarly, the ‘mystic Indian’ stereotype is still prominent. Despite being more positive than the representation of American Indians as ‘execrable’ animals, this view of Native

⁷ Simeon Ecuyer, writing on 24th June 1763, quoted in *The Tainted Gift: The disease method of frontier expansion* by Barbara Alice Mann (Santa Barbara: ABC Clio, 2009), p12

⁸ Lord Jeffrey Amherst, General of American Colonies, writing on 16th July 1763, quoted in *The Tainted Gift*, p16

⁹ *The Tainted Gift*, p7

¹⁰ T. R. Fehrenbach, *Comanches: The history of a people* (London: Vintage Books, 2007; first published 1974), p5

peoples as 'closer to the earth' than their white counterparts is both patronising and dehumanising. The association of American Indians with the natural world posits white Americans in opposition to Native peoples, as '[standing] for progress, technology and science';¹¹ according to these readings, 'whiteness [is] associated with purity, homogeneity, and mental, physical and moral superiority' – in short, with rationality as opposed to mysticism.¹² Native peoples are depicted as having a 'natural wisdom' that is associated more with instinct than intelligence; for example, Disney's Pocahontas has the power to 'listen with her heart' and therefore understand nature spirits and foreign languages.¹³ This representation of American Indians, like the earlier stereotype of the wild savage, is based upon a Eurocentric view of Native cultures. Allen writes that 'Novels that portray the Indian as primitive, earth-loving guru...are written out of a white consciousness, and by and large they reflect white understanding of tribal culture and the impact of white culture on it'.¹⁴ This 'white culture' is represented as progressive; Native peoples must assimilate, or become extinct.

The idea of the 'earth-loving guru' can result in the comparison of American Indians and animals just as often as the earlier, more obviously negative stereotypes. In Sherman Alexie's semi-autobiographical novel *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian*, the protagonist notes that 'Some of our teachers make us eat birdseed so we'll feel closer to the earth'.¹⁵ In Disney's

¹¹ *Today is a Good Day to Fight*, p14

¹² *White Enough to be American?*, p177

¹³ *Pocahontas*

¹⁴ *The Sacred Hoop*, pp77-78

¹⁵ Sherman Alexie, *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian* (London: Andersen Press Limited, 2008; first published in the United States of America by Little, Brown and Company, 2007), p30

Pocahontas, the ‘Colors of the Wind’ sequence positions the heroine as part of nature rather than civilisation, frequently comparing her to an eagle or other animals. Recent texts have conflated this link further; animal characters are often depicted using tropes associated with stereotyped representations of American Indians. The centaurs in the *Harry Potter* book and film series, for example, are constructed according to Hollywood images of American Indians; a stoic, mystical race, forced to live on small areas of land by a governing body,¹⁶ and, quite literally, a horse culture, with bows and arrows as their weapons of choice. This links them to the most typical manifestation of the American Indian in film and popular culture – the Plains warrior. As if to underline the parallels between *Harry Potter’s* centaurs and Hollywood’s Indians, the fifth film, *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*, introduces the centaurs in a manner evoking the Western film genre; they appear at the top of a ridge in the forest, holding bows and arrows, and accompanied by eerie flute music.¹⁷

¹⁶ “‘Your Forest?’” said Umbridge, shaking now not only with fright but also, it seemed, with indignation. “I would remind you that you live here only because the ministry permits you certain areas of land-” (J. K. Rowling, *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* (London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc, 2003), p665

¹⁷ The centaurs promptly carry off a white woman, Dolores Umbridge, an action which links to the trope of the captivity narrative, which will be analysed in the next chapter.

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: harrypotter.wikia.com

The association between American Indians and shapeshifters also remains popular in modern texts. In *Turn Coat*, a novel from the urban fantasy novel series *The Dresden Files*, a powerful Native wizard known as 'Injun' Joe – a racial slur in and of itself – transforms into a bear to fight a skinwalker.¹⁸ Indeed, the association of American Indians with shapeshifters is so prevalent that it was satirised in *Rich Hall's 'Inventing the Indian'*, a documentary focusing on representations of Native peoples. In the closing sequence, the co-presenter Dallas Goldtooth, while walking away from the camera, transforms first into a horse, and then into a 'rez car', which promptly breaks down.

¹⁸ It is stated in the text that 'Injun Joe' has bestowed this nickname upon himself in order to reclaim the slur. However, author Jim Butcher is not Native; as a result, he is writing from an outsider perspective, and I have seen little evidence to suggest that the term 'Injun' is genuinely being reclaimed by Native peoples.

Big Bad Wolves: The role of masculinity and race in the portrayal of Native American werewolves

Wolf Mark and the *Twilight* series both feature Native characters who transform into animals, specifically werewolves; however, the two texts handle this theme very differently. Bella's first encounter with the werewolf pack occurs in *New Moon*, when she is cornered by the hostile vampire, Laurent, and saved by the arrival of the wolves:

A huge black shape eased out of the trees, quiet as a shadow, and stalked deliberately towards the vampire. It was enormous – as tall as a horse, but thicker, much more muscular. The long muzzle grimaced, revealing a line of dagger-like incisors. A grisly snarl rolled out from between the teeth, rumbling across the clearing like a prolonged crack of thunder.¹⁹

This passage repeatedly emphasises the wolf's size, describing it as both 'huge' and 'enormous'; the depiction of the creature as 'grisly' and 'grimacing' stress its frightening and antagonistic nature. The effect involves an intertwining of the savage and mystic Indian stereotypes. The 'dagger-like' teeth invoke an image of being heavily armed, while the comparison of the snarl to 'a prolonged crack of thunder' makes the wolf seem not only animalistic, but akin to some kind of embodiment of nature.

Later in *New Moon*, we discover that this werewolf is Sam, the leader of the Quileute pack. However, connecting a human face to the terrifying creature from the clearing does not, in fact, humanise Sam. Sam is regarded as a pillar of the community in La Push, putting this role before personal interests such as

¹⁹ *New Moon*, p242

attending college.²⁰ However, Sam's role as protector does not make him any less intimidating. Besides a brief meeting on the beach in *Twilight*, Bella's first interaction with Sam takes place after Edward leaves her, when the young werewolf finds her in the forest. Although Sam is part of the search team, there to help Bella, he is written as physically imposing; a 'dark face' appearing 'impossibly high' above her.²¹ When Bella, who has been rendered near-catatonic by Edward's departure, does not respond, Sam's actions become potentially threatening:

His black eyes appraised me for a second, and then he shrugged. In a quick and supple motion, he pulled me up from the ground and into his arms.

I hung there, limp, as he loped swiftly through the wet forest. Some part of me knew that this should upset me – being carried away by a stranger. But there was nothing left in me to upset.²²

Sam, by 'carrying off' the vulnerable Bella, becomes a predatory figure. Furthermore, even in human form, Sam is coded as animalistic. Rather than running, he 'lopes', a term commonly used to describe an animal's gait.²³ Although he has not yet been seen in his wolf form, Sam is depicted as a threat from his first appearance.

Before examining the relationship between masculinity and race, it is important to note that the term 'masculinity' itself has many different implications.

Gender theory stresses that masculinity and femininity are socially constructed

²⁰ Sam has done many good deeds both for the reservation and for the town of Forks; as Jacob informs Bella: "There was this guy from up somewhere by the Makah rez, big guy too, scary-looking... word got around that he was selling meth to kids, and Sam Uley and his *disciples* ran him off our land." Ibid, p173

²¹ Ibid, p75

²² Ibid, p76

²³ 'Trailing in Jonathan Harker's Shadow: Bella as modern-day ethnographer in Meyer's *Twilight* novels', from *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p197

categories, and should not be seen as interchangeable with biological terms such as male and female. Suzanne J. Kessler and Wendy McKenna outline this biologically essentialist view of gender, explaining that ‘dichotomous gender role behaviors are overlaid on dichotomous *gender* which has traditionally meant two dimorphically distinct biological *sexes*’.²⁴ However, as many gender theorists have argued, gender is not dichotomous, not necessarily related to biological sex, and is not a precursor to certain patterns of behaviour. As these views indicate, gender identity and expression are complex areas of study. It is often more useful to focus on the constructions of ‘masculinities’ and ‘femininities’, rather than masculinity and femininity, positing these various gender expressions as ‘invented categories’ into which various individuals are placed as a result of social stereotypes and expectations.²⁵ Perceptions of masculinities are influenced not only by the concept of dichotomous gender roles – masculinity as opposed to femininity – but also by factors such as race, culture and class. Theories of intersectionality state that ‘neither race nor class nor gender operate alone...They do so within a system of simultaneous, interrelated social relationships’.²⁶ Constructions of masculinity imposed upon Native men or other men of colour have traditionally differed greatly from those related to white men; it is necessary to examine these differences in the context of the *Twilight* saga. Constructions of Native masculinity have traditionally differed from constructions

²⁴ Suzanne J. Kessler and Wendy McKenna, ‘Towards a Theory of Gender’, from *The Transgender Studies Reader*, edited by Susan Stryker and Stephen Whittle (New York: Routledge, 2006), p178

²⁵ Jeffrey Weeks, quoted in ‘Exhibiting Masculinity’ by Sean Nixon, *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices* (London: Sage Publications Ltd, 1997) p301

²⁶ Margaret L. Andersen and Patricia Hill Collins, ‘Systems of Power and Inequality’, *Race, Class, and Gender: An anthology*, p62

of white masculinity, encompassing 'modified forms of sexualities and genders [that] are produced or maintained in the hybrid societies' of colonialism and postcolonialism.²⁷ Dyer notes that 'Until the 1980s, it was rare to see a white man semi-naked in popular fictions...This was not so with non-white male bodies. In the Western...the non-white body is routinely on display'.²⁸ This dichotomy suggests that American Indians are associated with physicality. While Native masculinity involves this physical power, the power associated with white masculinity is far more comprehensive, encompassing social and political authority. The distinction between white and Native masculinity reflects the concept of 'dominant and subordinate masculinities' described by an intersectional approach to theories of gender.²⁹

Throughout the narrative, a strong emphasis is placed on the overtly masculine appearance of Sam and the other Quileute werewolves. Bella notes their 'long, round muscles',³⁰ and Jacob's 'solid, lanky build' and square jaw.³¹ The promotional material for the film version of *New Moon* carries this further, focusing explicitly upon the Quileute men's muscles and physiques.

²⁷ Laharucine Ouzgane and Daniel Coleman, 'Postcolonial Masculinities: Introduction', *Jouvert: A journal of postcolonial studies*, Vol. 2, Iss. 1 (1998), p1

²⁸ Richard Dyer, 'The White Man's Muscles', *The Masculinity Studies Reader*, edited by Rachel Adams and David Savran (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2002), p262

²⁹ Andrea Cornwall and Nancy Lindisfarne, 'Introduction', *Dislocating Masculinity: Comparative ethnographies*, edited by Andrea Cornwall and Nancy Lindisfarne (London: Routledge, 1994), p9

³⁰ *New Moon*, p323

³¹ *Ibid*, p131

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: examiner.com

There is an important colonial context to this focus on the Native male body. Krishnaswamy argues that non-white male bodies often carry a 'racialized construction of "femininity-in-masculinity" as a pathological condition', which may explain this absence of Native women in colonial literature; it was unnecessary to feature female characters, as male characters were already feminised.³² However, the hypermasculine presentation of Native men such as the Quileute werewolves indicates that these characters are not feminised in this situation, but animalised. While the American Indian man of colonial literature initially seems to be a powerful figure – a warrior or hunter – the stereotype of the wild savage, however manly, is still overwhelmingly negative, more animalistic than human. This is also apparent in the early American Gothic novel, *Edgar Huntly*. Charles

³² Revashi Krishnaswamy, 'The Economy of Colonial Desire', *The Masculinity Studies Reader*, p295

Brockden Brown describes the Indians in his narrative as ‘brawny and terrific figures’, directly linking their physiques with the terror that they inspire.³³ Similarly, in *The Indian in the Cupboard* series, Little Bull is described as a “superb specimen...Not an ounce of fat on him...Bright eyes, perfect teeth, skin and hair gleaming with health – splendid!”, a sentence that could just as easily be recounting the appearance of an animal.³⁴ This linking of hypermasculinity and savagery, and the conflation of that savagery with animalism, is pertinent considering stereotypes surrounding American Indian men. In colonial literature, Native men occupy a complex space upon which varying and often conflicting identities can be ascribed. In many examples of colonialist children’s literature, ‘images of “native adults” [were] complex – they [were] seen as...childlike...By contrast, the young English boy is preternaturally mature’.³⁵ This dichotomy continues in the *Twilight* saga. Physically, Jacob is twenty-five,³⁶ but characterised as immature. Edward is permanently seventeen, but his behaviour is far more mature; at one point, Bella tells Jacob “At least *he* can be a grown-up about this.”³⁷ Native men can be portrayed as childlike in order to justify white paternalism, as feminine in order to uphold white masculinity, and as animalistic in order to legitimise genocide, which is framed as ‘pest control’.

³³ Charles Brockden Brown, *Edgar Huntly: or, Memoirs of a sleep-walker* (Reprinted by BiblioBazaar Reproduction Series), p159

³⁴ *The Return of the Indian*, pp98-99

³⁵ Helen Kanitkar, “‘Real True Boys’: Moulding the cadets of imperialism’, *Relocating Masculinity: Comparative ethnographies*, edited by Andrea Cornwall and Nancy Lindisfarne (London: Routledge, 1994), p190

³⁶ During a conversation with Bella, Jacob tells her “I’m already older than you, physically at least...we reach full growth inside of a few months when the werewolf gene gets triggered...Physically, I’m probably twenty-five or something.” (*Eclipse*, p120)

³⁷ *Eclipse*, p115

The success of these attempts to inscribe particular subordinate identities onto the bodies of Native men rests on the use of language. Language is key to establishing and confirming the treatment of gender; according to Calvin Thomas, 'bodies produce language, just as language helps to produce the field of cultural intelligibility in which bodies make their appearance'.³⁸ If 'language is not neutral...[but] a shaper of ideas', then the language used to describe Edward and Jacob's bodies not only makes the power imbalance between the two young men apparent, but is a factor in creating that inequality.³⁹ Bella's descriptions of Edward's body transcend basic physicality; she describes his 'glass-smooth lips'⁴⁰ and 'the marble skin of his chest', positing his physical presence as a work of art rather than anything as mundane as a body.⁴¹ By contrast, Jacob's depiction as a creature of flesh and blood is exaggerated, the narrative focusing on 'the tendons and veins...under the red-brown skin of his arms, his hands'.⁴² Wilson argues that 'the *Twilight* texts uphold traditional notions of ideal masculinity that associate white males with mind, culture, and wealth, and nonwhite, nonwealthy males with the body, nature, and labor.'⁴³ However, I believe that Edward is focused upon as a 'body', but as one inherently superior to Jacob's; the comparison between the two young men positions the white male body as superhuman. This dichotomy between Native and white bodies becomes even more apparent when focusing on the portrayals of the young Cullen and

³⁸ Calvin Thomas, *Male Matters: Masculinity, anxiety, and the male body on the line* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1996), p29

³⁹ Dale Spender, 'Extracts from *Man Made Language*', *The Feminist Critique of Language: A reader*, edited by Deborah Cameron (London: Routledge, 1990), p103

⁴⁰ *New Moon*, p491

⁴¹ *Ibid*, p451

⁴² *Ibid*, p131

⁴³ *Seduced by Twilight*, p92

Quileute men as groups. Although Edward, Emmett and Jasper are all pale and beautiful, their descriptions emphasise their individuality:

They didn't look anything alike. Of the three boys, one was big – muscled like a serious weight lifter, with dark, curly hair. Another was taller, leaner, but still muscular, and honey blond. The last was lanky, less bulky, with untidy, bronze-colored hair.⁴⁴

By contrast, all of the young Quileute men are large and intimidating, with a homogenous nature to their appearance. This corresponds with the depersonalising stereotype of people of colour 'all looking the same':

Again, they reminded me of brothers, quadruplets. Something about the way they moved almost in synchronization to stand across the road from us, the way they all had the same long, round muscles under the same red-brown skin, the same cropped black hair, and the way their expressions altered at exactly the same moment.⁴⁵

The distinctions between the Cullens, when juxtaposed with the similarity of the Quileute characters, underlines the fact that the white vampires are privileged within the text; they are deemed more important, and thus deserving of greater character development. The Quileutes, by contrast, are depersonalised as well as dehumanised, becoming an anonymous mass instead of individual, significant characters. The white reader has a multitude of potential characters with whom to identify, many of whom are aspirational figures, portrayed as supernaturally beautiful, intelligent and talented. The Native reader is limited, not only by the peripheral nature of the Quileute characters, but also by their lack of development as individuals.

⁴⁴ *Twilight*, p16

⁴⁵ *New Moon*, p323

“My money’s on the big Indian”: The threat of the savage in *Twilight*

The physical portrayal of Sam, and by extension the other Quileute, as a mysterious and dangerous figure foreshadows his later characterisation. Before he joins the pack, Jacob describes Sam and his ‘disciples’ as being ‘like hall monitors gone bad’.⁴⁶ His fear of them invokes a dark inversion of the ‘mystic Indian’ stereotype; he describes them as a mysterious group with inexplicable and frightening practices:

“...now Embry’s following Sam around like he’s joined a cult. And that’s the way it was with Paul...He wasn’t friends with Sam at all. Then he stopped coming to school for a few weeks, and when he came back, suddenly Sam owned him...”

He was biting his lower lip and clenching his hands. He looked like he was about to cry.⁴⁷

The Cullen boys, on the other hand, are isolated and set apart from their classmates, but are never represented as threatening. Although the vampires emphasise their status as predators, the narrative invariably depicts them as benevolent and kind. Charlie sums up the local view of Edward, Jasper and Emmett; “...all of those kids are well behaved and polite. I had my doubts...I thought we might have some problems with them. But they’re all very mature – I haven’t had one speck of trouble from any of them”.⁴⁸ As Bella observes, ‘animals [have] a much wiser reaction’ to the presence of vampires than the human population of Forks, who view the Cullens as attractive and benign.⁴⁹ The

⁴⁶ Ibid, p173

⁴⁷ Ibid, pp177-178

⁴⁸ *Twilight*, p31

⁴⁹ *Breaking Dawn*, p413

hero, Edward, subverts the traditional idea of the Gothic hero; rather than being a '[hero-villain]...us in our most unrepressed moments', he instead encapsulates restraint and respectability, leaving his rival Jacob to '[run] roughshod over conventions of piety and civilized restraint'.⁵⁰ Jacob becomes Edward's dark counterpart, both in appearance and attitude.

Eduardo Mendieta observes that 'racism is a capillary to the sociality of both masculinity and femininity'; in short, racism is a key factor in social perceptions of men and women.⁵¹ The difference between the way white and Native masculinities are perceived by the people of Forks is highlighted in the scene where Edward and Jacob confront each other outside Bella's high school. The students of the school avoid Jacob because he '[looks] *dangerous* to them'.⁵² The passage dwells upon Jacob's imposing physique; Bella observes her classmates '[eyes widening] as they took in all six foot seven inches of Jacob's long body, muscled up in the way no normal sixteen-and-a-half-year-old had ever been'.⁵³ She also notes that 'Their eyes didn't linger on his face – something about his expression had them glancing quickly away'; this 'something' corresponds with further stereotypes regarding American Indians.⁵⁴ Jacob wears a 'calm mask',⁵⁵ a clear link to the concept of Native Americans as

⁵⁰ Roderick McGillis, 'The Night Side of Nature: Gothic spaces, fearful times', *The Gothic in Children's Literature*, p231

⁵¹ Eduardo Mendieta, 'Afterword: Identities: Postcolonial and global', *Identities: Race, class, gender, and nationality*, pp409-410

⁵² *Eclipse*, p77

⁵³ *Ibid.*

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, p76

stoic and humourless;⁵⁶ 'It was the face he used when he was determined to keep his emotions in check, to keep himself under control. It made him look like Sam, the oldest of the wolves, the leader of the Quileute pack...It was a stranger's face'.⁵⁷

The similarity between Jacob and Sam's expressions emphasises the sense of homogeneity that surrounds the young Quileute men. Although Bella confesses in the same scene that Edward can be equally fearsome in appearance ('his face was abruptly frightening – truly frightening. For a second, he looked like...like a *vampire*'), her classmates do not react in the same way as they do to Jacob.⁵⁸ Indeed, despite the fact that they are not friends, it appears that the other students are ready to defend Edward if necessary; 'I saw Mike next to Ben – Mike had one hand on Ben's shoulder, like he was holding him in place'.⁵⁹ Jacob's appearance codes him as a threat to the citizens of Forks; his Otherness in comparison to the white, middle-class Edward makes him seem dangerous. The Othering of non-white men was important in the early colonial period; as Dana D. Nelson notes, "white manhood" was a useful category for inventing national unity because it abstracted men's interests out of local issues

⁵⁶ This trope is satirised in Sherman Alexie's film *Smoke Signals*, in a conversation between the two main characters, Victor and Thomas:

Victor: You gotta look mean or people won't respect you. White people will run all over you if you don't look mean. You gotta look like a warrior! You gotta look like you just came back from killing a buffalo!

Thomas: But our tribe never hunted buffalo - we were fishermen.

Victor: What! You want to look like you just came back from catching a fish? This ain't "Dances With Salmon" you know! (*Smoke Signals*, Chris Eyre (Shadowcatcher Entertainment, 1998))

⁵⁷ *Eclipse*, p76

⁵⁸ *Ibid*, p79

⁵⁹ *Ibid*.

and identities in an appeal to a nationally shared “nature” ’.⁶⁰ This scene is a microcosm of this ‘abstraction’ of American male identity. Mike and Ben set aside their general ambivalence towards, or even dislike of, Edward, uniting against an Othered interloper. In ‘The History of Masculinity’, R. W. Connell writes that ‘masculinities are not only shaped by the process of imperial expansion, they are active in that process and help to shape it’.⁶¹ The differing constructions of Edward and Jacob’s masculinities are indeed active in the neo-colonial process of positing Native men as dangerous and white men as safe, despite the fact that within the fictional universe of the novel, Jacob’s very existence is intended to protect humans, whilst Edward’s natural purpose is to prey upon them.

Postcolonial criticism has challenged the colonial and neocolonial stereotypes associated with non-white masculinity. Laharucine Ouzgane and Daniel Coleman ask ‘if genders and sexualities are the products of cultural practices and institutions, as contemporary social construction theory claims, then what modified forms of sexualities and genders are produced or maintained in the hybrid societies of postcolonial places?’, a question that is particularly important to consider when reading texts that explore the interactions between the Gothic – a genre that focuses closely upon gender – and the colonial or postcolonial.⁶² Texts by many Native writers, including Alexie and Erdrich as well as Bruchac and Leitch Smith, treat constructs such as masculinity and femininity

⁶⁰ Dana D. Nelson, *National Manhood: Capitalist citizenship and the imagined fraternity of white men* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1998), p7

⁶¹ R. W. Connell, ‘The History of Masculinity’, *The Masculinity Studies Reader*, p245

⁶² ‘Postcolonial Masculinities: Introduction’, *Jouvert: A journal of postcolonial studies*

very differently to Eurocentric gender traditions.⁶³ As Bruchac's introduction to *Skeleton Man* indicates, the majority of pre-contact American Indian cultures did not endorse stereotypes such as the 'dependent damsel' in distress, but instead respected and promoted female agency, both in storytelling and in society at large.⁶⁴ As a result, it is unsurprising that Bruchac's Gothic works subvert the idea of the Gothic heroine as a victim, and make her a hero in her own right. This in turn allows his work to present alternative forms of masculinity, which have been established outside of the context of patriarchal authority.

Wolf Mark showcases such alternative views of masculinity, which have recourse to Native American traditions and histories rather than Western stereotypes. Bruchac's narrative echoes the difference in the physical appearances of Lucas and the vampires, but undermines *Twilight's* representation of the vampire group as superior. Lucas describes himself as less conventionally attractive than the *upyrs*, stating that 'They're not built square and blocky like I am. They're all tall, slender, pale-skinned...Their sharp-featured faces are positively classic – like those of runway models'.⁶⁵ However, Lucas' werewolf heritage means that he does not only focus upon the vampires' appearances, but on their scent:

⁶³ As previously noted in this thesis, constructions of gender in Native cultures differ greatly from those in European cultures. Mohawk writer Kahente Horn-Miller describes the roles of men and women in Mohawk culture: 'The men listened. It wasn't really about them, and in our tradition men do not impose their ideas on women. They shared what they knew about the history, the meaning and the past uses of the Wasase ceremony, but none of them got up to pass an opinion one way or the other. This was our issue.' (Kahente Horn-Miller, 'Bring Us Back Into the Dance: Women of the Wasase', *Colonize This!*, p234. The essay deals with the negotiations within Horn-Miller's community about the question of women entering the war dance.)

⁶⁴ *Skeleton Man*, pi

⁶⁵ *Wolf Mark*, p38

Aside from signature artificial fragrances, the dozen members of the Sunglass Mafia all smell the same. It's an ancient, almost musty scent...like the odor coming off an Egyptian mummy I saw once in a museum. Like old, dry death.⁶⁶

The perfumes used by the vampires to mask their disturbing scent indicate that their beauty may be a similar artifice. Their conformity to Eurocentric beauty standards is not an indication of their superiority, as it is with the Cullens, but part of their disguise. The disconnect between the *upyrs*' artificial beauty and their monstrous natures corresponds with the abject, which in turn underscores the postcolonial Gothic nature of the series; it is the 'civilised' settlers, rather than the Native characters, who are truly monstrous.

While *Wolf Mark* contains no comparable confrontation scene to the one between Edward and Jacob in *Eclipse*, Bruchac's novel emphasises the difference between social perceptions of Lucas and the *upyr* group. However, unlike the *Twilight* series, *Wolf Mark* makes this distinction explicit, and considers the wider sociopolitical contexts. Like the Cullens, the *upyrs* are implicitly trusted by the school authorities; 'Model student citizens of RHS. That's how the clueless adults all see them'.⁶⁷ By contrast, Lucas, like Jacob, is viewed as a dangerous figure, Othered as a result of his race and class. The narrative indicates that this is because of his race and his economic background. For example, Lucas recounts that soon after he arrived at the school, 'I got called into the office because somebody in the school was dealing dope and as a new kid living in a

⁶⁶ Ibid, p44

⁶⁷ Ibid.

trailer I was a suspect'.⁶⁸ Lucas and his father are viewed as potential criminals by the principal and others, despite the fact that they do not know about his personal circumstances; Lucas reveals earlier in the novel that only his best friend Renzo knows about his father's apparent drug use.⁶⁹ Although the principal's assumption is, on the surface, correct – Lucas is exposed to drug use on a daily basis – the fact remains that it is still an assumption, and one that would not have been made about the 'model student citizens' that make up the *upyr* group. *Wolf Mark* highlights this discrepancy in treatment; the *Twilight* series glosses over it, normalising these social prejudices.

Bruchac presents a non-aggressive masculinity that deconstructs patriarchal representations of manliness. While the novel characterises Lucas as strong, he is rarely aggressive; when he is grabbed by bullies upon his arrival at his new school, he recounts that 'I shook them off like a dog shaking off water'.⁷⁰ There are no undertones of anger in this description; rather than fighting back against the bullies, Lucas treats them as an annoyance that he does not wish to engage with. It is only after severe provocation – Maxico's kidnapping of his father – that Lucas becomes truly aggressive. This narrative development counters the 'wild savage' stereotype, suggesting that violence from American Indian men is not an innate trait, but a response to extreme circumstances. This corresponds with anti-racist critical positions on anger, such as radical feminist Audre Lorde's assertion that anger is an emotion 'loaded with information and

⁶⁸ Ibid, p206

⁶⁹ Ibid, p23

⁷⁰ Ibid, p11

energy' that can be used to survive in the face of racism.⁷¹ In *Wolf Mark*, these extreme circumstances are the actions of a corporation, a superstructure embodying Western colonialist and capitalist ideals. Lucas' increasing aggression throughout the narrative suggests that acts of violence perpetrated by American Indian men are a response to colonialism, which, as Maxico's research indicates, views Native peoples as animals to be exploited. Lucas' anger becomes a tool, one that he can use to counter colonialism.

The relationships between the werewolf characters are also important to an analysis of the difference in constructions of masculinity. While there are fraternal elements to the dynamics of the Quileute pack, their interactions emphasise an 'aggressive' form of masculinity where individuals are 'less willing to defer to others' plans or suggestions'.⁷² The pack members regularly fight as part of decision-making, and are physically and mentally dominated by the Alpha, Sam:

Yes, the Alpha decreed, his double voice blistering with the heat of authority. *There are no loopholes tonight. You, Jacob, are going to fight the Cullens with us...You are obligated to protect the tribe. That is why you exist. You will perform this obligation.*

My shoulders hunched as the edict crushed me. My legs collapsed, and I was on my belly under him.

No member of the pack could refuse the Alpha.⁷³

Twilight's werewolves exist as part of an authoritarian group based around patriarchal and patrilineal constructions of hereditary leadership; Jacob is only

⁷¹ Audre Lorde, 'The Uses of Anger', *Women's Studies Quarterly*, Vol. 25, No.1-2 (1997), p280

⁷² Fred J. Fejes, 'Masculinity as Fact: A review of empirical mass communication research on masculinity', *Men, Masculinity and the Media*, edited by Steve Craig (London: Sage Publications Ltd., 1992), p13

⁷³ *Breaking Dawn*, p205

able to resist and break away from Sam because of his status as a descendent of another male leader, Ephraim Black. By contrast, Bruchac's emphasis on the all-encompassing 'embrace' of Lucas' wolf skin evokes a parent-child relationship. This is underscored by the fact that Lucas is given his wolf skin by his father. Rather than the constant competition of the Quileute pack, Lucas experiences a peaceful transition into his new life as a werewolf, with a sense of nurture that is explicitly linked to the paternal. This is particularly apparent in the letter that Thomas writes to his son, explaining Lucas' werewolf nature:

I love you, son. No matter what you do, no matter what you have to do. And when I next see you, whether it is here on Earth or at the end of the road of stars our ancestors told us about, know that there'll be nothing but pride in my eyes and that my arms will be open for you.⁷⁴

The concept of masculinity as nurturing is often neglected in mainstream texts and social discourse. Nurturing and caregiving is far more often associated with femininity, as seen in a stereotype identified and debunked by Cordelia Fine; namely, that 'the female brain is predominately hard-wired for empathy...[while] the male brain is predominately hard-wired for understanding and building systems'.⁷⁵ Bruchac subverts dominant narratives of masculinity, centring a Native interpretation of gender paradigms.

To some extent, Meyer also deconstructs the idea of the Native man as inherently aggressive and 'savage'. Charlotte Huck identifies one way in which the 'web of gender stereotyping' impacts upon male readers, stating 'Seldom do

⁷⁴ *Wolf Mark*, p114

⁷⁵ Cordelia Fine, *Delusion of Gender: The real science behind sex difference* (London: Icon Books Ltd, 2010), pxix

we have a story in which a male character exhibits tenderness or compassion'.⁷⁶

The *Twilight* series counters this stereotype. One scene in *New Moon* focuses on

Sam's capacity for love, presented via his relationship with his fiancée Emily:

"Emily," [Sam] said, and so much love saturated his voice that I felt embarrassed, intrusive, as I watched him cross the room in one stride and take her face in his wide hands.

...
This was worse than any romantic movie; this was so real that it sang out with joy and life and true love.⁷⁷

Sam is also depicted as an 'honorable' figure, who, upon imprinting on Emily, refused to 'act out a charade' with his then girlfriend, Leah; he admits that he has fallen in love with Emily and ends the relationship.⁷⁸ By contrast, in *New Moon*, Edward carries out the 'charade' of pretending that he does not truly love Bella in order to force her to accept the fact that he is leaving; "Of course, I'll always love you...in a way."⁷⁹ Sam is honest, while Edward lies to Bella. Similarly, there are several scenes featuring other pack members that focus on attributes other than their wolfish aggression. In *Breaking Dawn*, Jacob encounters Quil playing with Claire, the toddler upon whom he has imprinted:

The weird part was, Quil was having just as much fun as she was...You never saw a real parent so jazzed to play whatever stupid kiddie sport their rugrat could think up. I'd seen Quil play peekaboo for an hour straight without getting bored.⁸⁰

⁷⁶ Charlotte Huck, 'Introduction', *Beauty, Brains, and Brawn: The construction of gender in children's literature*, edited by Susan Lehr (Portsmouth, New Hampshire: Heinemann, 2001), pviii

⁷⁷ *New Moon*, p333

⁷⁸ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p366

⁷⁹ *New Moon*, p70

⁸⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p153

Like Lucas' father Thomas, Quil demonstrates a fatherly and caring form of masculinity.

If Sam and Quil are represented in a more positive manner than the simple 'savage' stereotype, the same is certainly true for Jacob. In *New Moon*, during Edward's absence, he provides much-needed emotional support to Bella:

Jacob was simply a perpetually happy person, and he carried that happiness with him like an aura, sharing it with whoever was near him. Like an earthbound sun, whenever someone was within his gravitational pull, Jacob warmed them.⁸¹

By taking this emotionally supportive role, Jacob is assuming a characteristic rarely associated with boys in fiction; in the majority of young adult novels with female protagonists, the heroine's best friend and confidante is another girl. Jacob's position of agency within the context of the series is also counter-stereotypical. Rather than being relegated to dumb muscle, Jacob takes over the narration in the middle section of *Breaking Dawn*.⁸² Finally, and perhaps most tellingly, Jacob is depicted as a more healthy romantic option for Bella than Edward; Bella notes that 'If the world was the sane place it was supposed to be, Jacob and I would have been together', while Jacob states "He's like a drug for you...I see that you can't live without him now. It's too late. But I would have been healthier for you. Not a drug; I would have been the air, the sun."⁸³ It is only following his transformation into a werewolf that Jacob's violence becomes prominent. He becomes more aggressive, with an increasing lack of control over

⁸¹ *New Moon*, p145

⁸² This makes Jacob the only character other than Bella to officially do so, as *Midnight Sun* was never released.

⁸³ *Eclipse*, p599

his temper. In the film adaptation of *New Moon*, during a visit to the cinema with Bella, he snaps at his perceived romantic rival, Mike “Maybe you should go to the hospital. Do you want me to *put* you in the hospital?”⁸⁴ Jacob’s change in character signals his increasing conformity to a proscribed form of masculinity where ‘men are glorified as hunters and killers’; a ‘savage’ masculinity that has more to do with Western constructions of Native men than true Native masculinities.⁸⁵ When considered alongside the depiction of American Indian men in literature, the relationship between this manifestation of masculinity and Jacob’s attitude towards Bella is an aspect of the series that cannot be ignored. Edward too is ‘glorified as a hunter and killer’, as Bella’s loving description of him hunting reveals; ‘It was a surprisingly sensual experience to watch Edward hunting...His smooth spring was like the sinuous strike of a snake; his hands were so sure, so strong’.⁸⁶ However, unlike Jacob, Edward is never presented as a true threat to white women, represented by the character of Bella. Jacob’s aggression and violence carries undertones that, when considered alongside colonial portrayals of American Indians as animalistic, are potentially extremely damaging.

⁸⁴ *The Twilight Saga: New Moon*, directed by Chris Weitz (Summit Entertainment, 2009)

⁸⁵ Sherry B. Ortner and Harriet Whitehead, ‘Introduction: Accounting for sexual meanings’, *Sexual Meanings*, p6

⁸⁶ *Breaking Dawn*, p425

Of Dogs and Leeches: Fantastic slurs and Native men as animals

Jacob's adherence to a violent construction of masculinity is most apparent in his behaviour towards Bella. Prior to his transformation, Jacob's physical demonstrations of his attraction to Bella are non-threatening; 'His fingers touched my hair, soft and tentative'.⁸⁷ However, this begins to change on the night of his change; 'He reached out and took my hand firmly, wrapping his other hand around my wrist when I tried to pull away again'.⁸⁸ If the 'classic Gothic novel' comprises the story of 'an innocent young woman trapped by one man and rescued by another', the *Twilight* series fully encompasses these Gothic trends. Bella is targeted by the racialised, Othered Jacob, and 'rescued' by her marriage to the white vampire Edward.⁸⁹ Jacob's demonstrations of attraction to Bella become increasingly aggressive; in *Eclipse*, he kisses her against her will:

His lips crushed mine, stopping my protest. He kissed me angrily, roughly, his other hand gripping tight around the back of my neck, making escape impossible. I shoved against his chest with all my strength, but he didn't even seem to notice...I opened my eyes and didn't fight, didn't feel...just waited for him to stop.⁹⁰

The language in this section is deliberately violent; Jacob's actions are 'rough', and Bella is unable to 'protest' or 'escape'. Bella later tells Jacob "I don't count that as a kiss...I think of it more as an assault".⁹¹ This kiss, or assault, provokes Bella's first overtly bigoted comment towards Jacob. Significantly, this comment centres on his werewolf heritage; she tells him "I hope [Edward] snaps your neck,

⁸⁷ *New Moon*, p179

⁸⁸ *Ibid*, p212

⁸⁹ *Gothic and Gender*, p1

⁹⁰ *Eclipse*, pp330-331

⁹¹ *Ibid*, p476

you pushy, obnoxious, moronic DOG!”⁹² Upon first reading, this insult seems to refer solely to the vampire-werewolf rivalry – the vampires often refer to the werewolves as ‘dogs’, while the werewolves call them ‘leeches’. However, the series makes it clear that there is an explicit link between the pack’s lycanthropy and their Native backgrounds. This is apparent in the ‘Quileute legends’ told to Bella by Jacob in *Twilight*, and also by Jacob’s assertion that “What I am was born in me. It’s a part of who I am, who my family is, who we all are as a tribe – it’s the reason why we’re still here.”⁹³ By calling Jacob a ‘dog’, Bella is, within the context of the series, making a derogatory comment about his identity as a Native American and coding his sexual assault as racialised. Bella is not the only character who dehumanises Jacob in this way. Throughout the section of *Breaking Dawn* dealing with Bella’s pregnancy, Rosalie subjects Jacob to a sustained campaign of insults in which he is animalised:

With a pleased smirk, she set a silver bowl down on the floor next to me.
“Enjoy, mongrel.”

It had once probably been a big mixing bowl, but she’d bent the bowl back in on itself until it was shaped almost exactly like a dog dish. I had to be impressed with her quick craftsmanship. And her attention to detail. She’d scratched the word *Fido* into the side. Excellent handwriting.⁹⁴

If, as Wilson argues, Jacob’s time at the Cullen house can be interpreted as a civilising process, Rosalie’s actions imply that, at least in her eyes, Jacob can never be truly ‘civilised’, and will always be an animal. Edward engages in a similar dismissal of Jacob’s agency, not only dehumanising but infantilising his

⁹² Ibid, p332

⁹³ Ibid, p111

⁹⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p294

romantic rival; when Jacob states “may the best *man* win,” Edward responds “That sounds about right...pup.”⁹⁵ In this case, infantilising and animalising narratives are imposed over a Native man to stress his inferiority to his white rival.

One could argue that the Quileutes’ constant references to the vampires as ‘leeches’ is an equivalent insult, as is Jacob’s habit of responding to Rosalie’s comments with blonde jokes. However, vampirism is not associated with any particular ethnicity; in *Breaking Dawn*, Meyer introduces vampires from Egypt, Ireland, Romania and the Amazon rainforest. The term ‘leech’, although a slur, does not link to the Cullens’ racial heritages, whereas ‘dog’ is implicitly racialised when referring to the Quileutes. Similarly, Jacob’s blonde jokes, despite being misogynistic, differ from Rosalie’s dog jokes. Rosalie’s whiteness provides her with a position of privilege that Jacob lacks; according to Dyer:

Whiteness generally colonises the stereotypical definition of all social categories other than those of race. To be normal, even to be normally deviant...is to be white. White people in their whiteness, however, are imaged as individual and/or endlessly diverse, complex and changing.⁹⁶

In short, whiteness is presented as normativity, and so individual white people can be characterised as exactly that – individuals. By contrast, characters of colour are stamped with a homogeneity that underpins their Otherness; they are defined by their race, their lack of whiteness, while whiteness, positioned as ‘normal’, is set at a remove from race. Rosalie does not stand for white people within the narrative in the same way that Jacob and the other Quileutes stand for

⁹⁵ *Eclipse*, p341

⁹⁶ Richard Dyer, ‘The Matter of Whiteness’, *Privilege: A reader*, edited by Michael S. Kimmel and Abby L. Ferber (Boulder: Westview Press, 2003), pp26-27

Native people; there are many more white characters than Quileutes in *Twilight*, and they are not represented as a homogenous group.

Not only does the slur 'leech' avoid the racial implications of 'dog', but *Twilight's* representation of the negative attributes of vampires and werewolves are skewed in favour of the vampires. There is a running joke throughout the series that, to vampires, the members of the werewolf pack do indeed smell like dogs. In *New Moon*, when she learns that Bella has been spending time with the werewolves, Alice comments "Well, I guess that explains the smell".⁹⁷ Later, after Bella transforms into a vampire, she observes that 'Jacob didn't smell that much more human than the mountain lion',⁹⁸ and tells him "Huh. I can see what everyone's been going on about. You stink, Jacob" – a statement that dehumanises him further.⁹⁹ The novels do establish that vampires smell unpleasant to werewolves; upon first visiting the Cullen house, Jacob notes that 'The reek pouring through the door was overpowering'.¹⁰⁰ However, their smell is consistently described in terms that the reader will interpret as positive. While Jacob tells Bella that Alice smells "Too sweet – sickly sweet,"¹⁰¹ Bella reflects that 'Alice smelled unbelievably wonderful...To a human, anyway'.¹⁰² Later, as a vampire, Bella describes Edward's scent as 'honey-lilac-and-sun perfume'.¹⁰³ First as a human and reader-identification character, and then as a vampire and reader-aspiration character, Bella informs the reader that a vampire's scent is

⁹⁷ *New Moon*, p387. To emphasise the negative implications of the statement, the film version alters this line to "Bella, what is that godawful wet dog smell?"

⁹⁸ *Breaking Dawn*, p435

⁹⁹ *Ibid*, p436

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid*, p169

¹⁰¹ *New Moon*, p409

¹⁰² *Ibid*.

¹⁰³ *Breaking Dawn*, p415

more pleasant than that of a werewolf. The ultra-white Cullens are portrayed as superior to the Quileute, even on such a fundamental level as the way they smell.

Once again, *Wolf Mark* contains many similar elements to the *Twilight* series, yet interprets them in radically different ways. Lucas reveals that he, too, has a different scent to the majority of humans; 'You should see what it does to a dog – any dog, all dogs. As soon as any canine catches wind of me it does one of two things. It either whines frantically and tries desperately to escape or it whimpers and rolls over on its back to bare its throat in submission'.¹⁰⁴ However, Lucas' scent is not represented as unpleasant, like that of the Quileutes; it is merely different. Lucas is not dehumanised, in the sense of being positioned as inferior to humanity; instead, his diversity is emphasised. Furthermore, the fact that it provokes submission in dogs suggests that this difference empowers Lucas. This theme of empowerment is developed after Lucas has embraced his werewolf side:

Yea, though I walk through the valley of the shadow of death I will fear no evil...

And why is that?

Because I am the meanest SOB in the entire valley.¹⁰⁵

Lucas' werewolf heritage is presented as unconditionally empowering; the power that Jacob receives, by contrast, is conditional, and portrayed as a poor second to that of the vampires. As their werewolf natures are used as a fantastic analogy for their Native American statuses, this implies that Jacob is Othered because of

¹⁰⁴ *Wolf Mark*, p23

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid*, p160

his race, while Lucas is portrayed as equally valid and important as his white counterparts.

As with Jacob, several characters use canine terms when speaking to and about Lucas. Marina, one of the upyr group, tells him “Maybe we play later...*Doggi*,” an attempt to intimidate him through sexual aggression.¹⁰⁶ Later in the novel, the villainous Dr Kesselring uses the same term in order to emphasise his position of power over Lucas and his father; “Hello, doggies...I have you both now...Nighty-night, my pets.”¹⁰⁷ However, *Wolf Mark*’s more nuanced portrayal of the Native man as werewolf means that the references to Lucas as canine are not invariably negative. Lucas’ Spanish teacher calls him “*Mi pequeno lobo*”...Her little wolf’, a term of endearment.¹⁰⁸ Similarly, the interactions between Lucas and his father intentionally remind the reader of those between a dog and his master; ‘He puts his hand on my head like he used to when I was a little kid. He strokes my hair back...God, I love it when he does that. If I had a tail, I’d wag it’.¹⁰⁹ Initially, these scenes may seem evocative of comments Bella makes to Jacob; “You know, I never had a dog...I always wanted one, but Renée’s allergic.”¹¹⁰ However, a later exchange between the two emphasises that Bella’s concept of Jacob as an animal contains an inherent power imbalance:

“Sometimes I think you like me better as a wolf.”

¹⁰⁶ Ibid, p70

¹⁰⁷ Ibid, p339

¹⁰⁸ Ibid, p79

¹⁰⁹ Ibid, p52

¹¹⁰ *Eclipse*, p432

“Sometimes I do. It probably has something to do with the way you *can't talk*.”¹¹¹

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: basementrejects.com

Bella's view of Jacob as a dog carries undertones of obedience and tractability; she considers him a pet rather than an equal. These attitudes are not present in Thomas and Profesora Vega's treatment of Lucas. If Jacob's wolfish side corresponds with the idea of the 'wild savage', his doggish side embodies the stereotype of the 'good Indian', who faithfully serves his colonial masters – or, in this case, mistress (see Appendix 1). Lucas' relationship with his father, by contrast, is in keeping with that of a junior member of a wolf or dog pack; apt, considering that Thomas is also a werewolf.

Furthermore, the fact that it is the antagonist Dr Kesselring who refers to Lucas and his father as 'doggies' is important. Later in the novel, Kesselring's

¹¹¹ Ibid, p478, italics in original

accomplice, the police chief Frank, repeats the phrase “Honest Injun”,¹¹² which prompts Lucas to think ‘That one little racist remark alone is enough to make me want to rip out his throat’; although not a violent racist act, a microaggression such as this is damaging to Lucas.¹¹³ The fact that both ‘Injun’ and ‘doggy’ are used by villainous characters encourages the reader to reject this casual use of slurs. The language used by other characters to refer to Native peoples is a significant consideration when analysing the texts’ portrayals of American Indians; it is also vital to consider the language used with regards to the physical appearances and transformations of the male shapeshifting characters. If language is ‘not neutral...not merely a vehicle which carries ideas...[but] itself a shaper of ideas’, then the language used by Dr Kesselring indicates the extent to which he wishes to dehumanise Lucas and Thomas, and the language used by Lucas emphasises Kesselring’s prejudice for the reader.¹¹⁴

Russet and Marble: Race, beauty standards and body horror

There is an obvious difference in *Twilight’s* depictions of the physical appearances of white and Quileute characters. If race, along with gender, is one of ‘our penultimate visible identities’, and ‘visibility is [a] means of segregating and oppressing human groups’, then it is unsurprising that categorising differences in physical appearance has been identified as a key component of

¹¹² *Wolf Mark*, p348

¹¹³ *Ibid*, p349

¹¹⁴ Dale Spender, ‘Extracts from *Man Made Language*’, *The Feminist Critique of Language*, p103

racial ideology.¹¹⁵ These differences involve ‘the identification and separation of various visually identified somatic features: skin tone, hair colour and texture; nose, eye, ear and hand shape; genitalia; body shape, etc’, all of which were intended to sort individuals ‘into racialised hierarchies, with the category white invariably placed at the top of the “racial family tree”’.¹¹⁶ This appearance-based system of racial classification has had an impact upon many American Indian nations; as reservations were established, the physical appearance of the residents was used to classify them racially.¹¹⁷ When considered alongside images of white men, colonial systems of racial categorisation by appearance take on even greater significance. The Quileutes are objectified, not only through the focus on their muscles, but by the novels’ repeated mention of their ‘russet’ skin colour; as one critic notes, ‘Jacob’s skin color is important...because it marks him as the exotic sexual Other’.¹¹⁸ Over the course of the series, the Quileutes are displayed as exotic ornaments, but rarely granted agency, and always compared unfavourably to the white settler vampires.

In the cases of both the vampires and the werewolves, their supernatural status is acquired via a process of physical transformation. The motif of transformation, particularly one that features elements of the monstrous, is recurrent in the Gothic genre. This theme of changing form allows Gothic writers to explore what Botting describes as ‘unnatural constructions of otherness and

¹¹⁵ Linda Martín Alcoff, *Visible Identities: Race, gender, and the self* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), pp6-7

¹¹⁶ Bridget Byrne, *White Lives: The interplay of ‘race’, class and gender in everyday life* (London: Routledge, 2006), p22

¹¹⁷ According to Garrouette, ‘On some reservations, nineteenth-century Indian agents assigned and recorded blood quantum on the basis of the candidate’s physical appearance, making darker people into full bloods and lighter ones into mixed bloods with a pen stroke’. (*Real Indians*, p52)

¹¹⁸ ‘The Great American Love Affair: Indians in the *Twilight* saga’, *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p211

abnormality' with a specific relation to the physical body – and, in the case of the colonial and postcolonial Gothic, the distinctions between white and non-white bodies.¹¹⁹ Jacob tells Bella “When I...changed, it was the most...*horrible*, the most *terrifying* thing I’ve ever been through – worse than anything I could have imagined.”¹²⁰ In *Powers of Horror: An essay on abjection*, Julia Kristeva’s description of the abject is in keeping with the monstrous aspects of the werewolf’s transformation. Kristeva states that ‘The abject confronts us, on the one hand, with those fragile states where man strays on the territories of *animal*’.¹²¹ Jacob’s reaction to his initial transformation is in keeping with the fear, confusion, and body horror associated with the abject, and with the animalisation that the series makes an inherent part of his Native American background. When considering Jacob’s transformation through the lens of the abject, it becomes clear that Jacob’s fear is rooted in his transition from human to animal, and the resultant loss of control. Jacob’s status as a werewolf is ‘something rejected from which [he] does not part’ – or rather, from which he cannot part.¹²² The violence of the werewolves’ transformations is reiterated throughout the series, with the repeated motif of the pack ‘exploding’ into their wolf forms. Their bodies are written as constantly in flux, with their physical instability reflecting the ‘wildness’ of their tempers. Even by *Breaking Dawn*, the only aspect of being a werewolf that Jacob seems to enjoy is his ability to run fast, as is explored in the section

¹¹⁹ Fred Botting, *Gothic Romanced: Consumption, gender and technology in contemporary fictions* (London: Routledge, 2008), p15

¹²⁰ *New Moon*, p319

¹²¹ Julia Kristeva, *Powers of Horror: An essay on abjection*, translated by Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1982), p12

¹²² *Powers of Horror*, p4

where he considers participating in the Olympic trials.¹²³ However, even this apparently positive attribute is problematic. Jacob continues ‘I was pretty sure the testing they did to make sure you weren’t on steroids would probably turn up some really freaky crap in my blood’.¹²⁴ As Carlisle later reveals, Jacob’s assumption is correct:

Carlisle coughed self-consciously. “You have twenty-four pairs [of chromosomes], Jacob...I find your species fascinating. I suppose that the elements of vampiric nature have come to seem commonplace to me over the centuries. Your family’s divergence from humanity is much more interesting. Magical, almost.”¹²⁵

In short, Jacob’s werewolf heritage – and by implication, his Quileute heritage – can be read as a ‘divergence’ from humanity, adding a raced perspective to the Gothic idea of ‘human bodies as between species’.¹²⁶ Throughout the series, it is this blurring of the lines between human and animal that causes the werewolf characters the most harm; for example, Leah’s first transformation causes her father’s heart attack, and his resultant death. As their animalisation is a result of the presence of the vampires, it follows that colonisation is the cause of the Quileute characters’ abjection.

Initially, the transformation from human to vampire seems similar to that of the werewolves. During the section where Carlisle and Jacob discuss chromosomes, the doctor reveals that vampires, too, are different from ordinary humans at a genetic level. According to the biology established in the series,

¹²³ *Breaking Dawn*, p156

¹²⁴ *Ibid.*

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*, p237

¹²⁶ Kelly Hurley, *The Gothic Body: Sexuality, materialism, and degeneration at the fin de siècle* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), p10

vampires have twenty-five pairs of chromosomes. This, Carlisle initially believed, made vampires and humans “less related than a lion and a house cat”.¹²⁷ A further similarity can be found in the fact that the process of transforming into a vampire is not only ‘horrible’ and ‘terrifying’, but also torturously painful:

I felt the pulse behind the fire raging now in my chest and realized that I’d found my heart again, just in time to wish I never had. To wish that I’d embraced the blackness while I’d still had the chance. I wanted to raise my arms and claw my chest open and rip the heart from it – anything to get rid of this torture.¹²⁸

The abject nature of Bella’s transformation is emphasised by the imagery of bodily disintegration. Jacob’s description of Bella’s body during the birth scene echoes Kristeva’s argument that ‘the corpse...is the utmost of abjection’, the reduction of a human to an object, something even lower than an animal.¹²⁹ Jacob calls her a ‘broken, bled-out, mangled corpse...We couldn’t put Bella together again’.¹³⁰ Bella is fragmented, losing her human self and becoming animalised in a manner equivalent to that of the Quileute characters. However, for Bella, this is temporary; she soon transcends all of these negative states, becoming a vampire.

The route to vampiredom for the Cullens can also be associated with the abject. With the exception of Jasper and Alice, all of the Cullen family were

¹²⁷ *Breaking Dawn*, p236. Carlisle’s belief alters as a result of the conception of Renesmee, which “suggests that [vampires and humans are] more genetically compatible” than he had anticipated. Carlisle’s ‘lion and house cat’ comparison underscores the superiority of vampires over humans; they are more powerful, and more dangerous predators.

¹²⁸ *Ibid*, pp375-76

¹²⁹ *Powers of Horror*, p4

¹³⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p355

transformed into vampires as a result of fatal injuries or illnesses.¹³¹ However, unlike the many shifts in form experienced by the werewolves, the transformation from human to vampire occurs only once. In contrast to Jacob and the other Quileutes, vampires attain an absolute physical stability; as Meyer has revealed in discussions with fans, even their hair does not grow.¹³² McGillis argues that 'The Gothic gave us the post-human before we ever thought of genomes and cloning and other forms of altering the human form'; *Twilight's* vampires borrow this aspect of the Gothic, but change its implications from the horrific to the aspirational. Having moved through the abject, *Twilight's* vampires become sublime, attaining a state free from the dangers of fragmentation and disintegration which Kristeva, aptly, describes as 'sparkling'.¹³³ A character who changes into a vampire retains their human form, with the bonus of rock-hard skin that makes them all but invulnerable. Indeed, the only outward signs of the transformation are the heightening of their physical beauty and a change in eye colour:

My first reaction was an unthinking pleasure. The alien creature in the glass was indisputably beautiful, every bit as beautiful as Alice or Esme. She was fluid even in stillness, and her flawless face was pale as the moon against the frame of her dark, heavy hair. Her limbs were smooth and strong, skin glistening subtly, luminous as a pearl.¹³⁴

¹³¹ Rosalie is transformed after a brutal gang rape, Emmett after a bear attack, Edward when he is dying of influenza, and Esme after she jumped from a cliff, an attempted suicide following the death of her baby.

¹³² In a question and answer session posted on *Twilight Lexicon*, Meyer states that 'When someone becomes a vampire, it's as if they are frozen exactly as they are in that moment...Hair does not grow, nor do fingernails (if you cut your hair, you're stuck. That's why Alice's hair is so short – it was growing back from being shaved in the asylum)'. (Stephenie Meyer, 'Personal Correspondance [sic] #1', *Twilight Lexicon*)

¹³³ *Powers of Horror*, p12

¹³⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p403

Twilight's vampires are 'walking Greek gods who are classically beautiful as well as ageless, impossibly strong, and perfectly chiseled'; superior and aspirational figures.¹³⁵ The change is described as a painful but ultimately worthwhile transition to a perfect existence. Furthermore, this new existence brings with it beauty, wealth and immortality, with the added possibility of supernatural powers such as Edward's telepathy or Alice's gift for prophecy. *Twilight*'s vampires have the '*something added*' that Kristeva associates with the antithesis of the abject, the sublime.¹³⁶ The same cannot be said for the Quileute werewolves. Although the members of the pack are described as good-looking, Meyer does not use the same lavish praise for their looks as she does for those of her vampires; while Jacob has 'a very pretty face', he is not 'an archangel' like Edward. Although the werewolves have super-strength and speed, it takes the entire pack to hunt down and kill a single vampire, Laurent; vampires represented as superior to werewolves in every regard. Moreover, the werewolves' strength is associated with a lack of control and a propensity to violence that is almost entirely absent from the Cullen family; even Jasper's attack on Bella at her birthday party requires the provocation of her cutting her finger.¹³⁷

The *Twilight* series' portrayal of the body horror elements of shapeshifting are not unusual. The BBC television series *Being Human* begins one episode with a lengthy description of the pain and disruption to vital organs experienced

¹³⁵ *Seduced by Twilight*, p35

¹³⁶ *Powers of Horror*, p11

¹³⁷ *New Moon*, p28

by its werewolf characters as they change form.¹³⁸ Classic horror films such as *The Wolf Man*,¹³⁹ and parodies like Michael Jackson's 'Thriller', also focus upon this horrific aspect of transformation.¹⁴⁰

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: beinghuman.wikia.com

The *Tantalize* series initially seems to correspond to these tropes. Like *New Moon*'s Emily, Quincie has also been injured by the werewolf she loves:

His eyes in the evening light looked flat and yellow. I didn't feel the pain when I first heard the wet crunching...I looked down at my hands and felt the blood dripping and realized his nails...claws...had extended, piercing clear through, five crescent-shaped punctures, catching raw muscle and splintering bone.¹⁴¹

¹³⁸ The *Being Human* episode, 'Tully', opens with Mitchell's voiceover 'The werewolf heart is about two-thirds the size of a human's. But in order to shrink, first it has to stop. In other words, he has a heart attack. All the internal organs are smaller. So while he's having his heart attack, he's having liver and kidney failure too. And if he stops screaming, it's not because the pain has dulled – his throat, gullet and vocal chords are tearing and reforming. He literally can't make a sound.' This is played over the werewolf George's transformation scene.

¹³⁹ George Waggner, *The Wolf Man* (1941)

¹⁴⁰ John Landis, *Thriller* (Optimum Productions, 1983)

¹⁴¹ *Tantalize*, pp5-6

However, the abject aspects of Kieren's transformation must be considered in the context of the series. As this thesis has already explored, although Kieren and his family are of Irish and Mexican-American descent, it is possible to read him and the other shifters in the *Tantalize* series as metaphors for Native peoples in American society. Kieren's inability to control his shift acts as an analogy to the fact that he must hide his shifter status from society; furthermore, the fact that he is only able to shift fully and painlessly after spending time as part of a werewolf community suggests that it is this engagement with his heritage that has enabled him to do so. Kieren's problems can be read as an analogy for the psychological and spiritual troubles faced by American Indian peoples who were forced to hide their ethnic backgrounds at certain points in American history.¹⁴²

There are many aspects of Lucas' werewolf status that are similar to the construction of Jacob and the other Quileutes. Like Jacob, Lucas' ability to shapeshift is explicitly linked to his Abenaki heritage. While looking at a copy of his family tree, Lucas notes that 'All of the oldest [ancestors]...look to have been Indians',¹⁴³ and that 'my direct male ancestors wore a second skin...although I may be a monster, I am not an anomaly'.¹⁴⁴ This is an explicit decision on Bruchac's part; in his afterword to the novel, he describes a wish to represent the 'long and far from sinister connection between American Indian tribal nations and

¹⁴² In one essay, Debra L. Merskin writes 'When given a choice to be raised in the white society of my father or in my mother's mountain community, I chose white. It seemed safer. It was.' ('What Does One Look Like?', *Dressing in Feathers*, pp282-283). Similarly, an elder I spoke to on the Blackfeet reservation in 2009 described being instructed by his white grandmother to tell no-one about his Blackfeet heritage, in order to avoid racist violence and other discrimination.

¹⁴³ *Wolf Mark*, p167

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid*, p168

the wolves they often saw as relatives and as nations of their own'.¹⁴⁵ Furthermore, Lucas soon finds that his newly-discovered identity requires a great deal of control; 'Everything I've done since taking the skin in my hands has required an act of will greater than anything I've ever tried before...This must be what it feels like when you're a drug addict and in need of a fix'.¹⁴⁶ This need for control becomes even more essential when he comes into contact with humans:

For some reason I'm fascinated by the chubby newsman with the mike...Why do I keep looking at him? Soft neck. Round, piggy limbs. Nice and fat, he is. Why am I hoping that he'll just step away from the cameras and walk over here into the shadows? Why am I drooling?¹⁴⁷

As this section suggests, Lucas struggles with the temptations provided by his new, supernatural strength, and with basic drives such as hunger. In some respects, he is even more animalistic than the *Twilight* werewolves. While Meyer's Quileutes may attack friends or family in moments of extreme stress or anger, there is no suggestion that any members of the pack have ever been tempted to hunt or eat humans. Lucas, on the other hand, finds himself viewing humans 'like a wolf might view its prey...No empathy'.¹⁴⁸ Lucas' amoral distancing from humanity seems to carry a sense of the abject.

However, while there are potentially monstrous implications to Lucas' transformation, the transformation itself is not one of them. Jacob's first change is associated with fear, violence and revulsion, and Kieren's with struggle and

¹⁴⁵ Ibid, p375

¹⁴⁶ Ibid.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid, p152

¹⁴⁸ Ibid, p132

injury; both are, as a result, connected with the abject. Lucas', however, is very different:

The skin, my second skin, flows around me, embraces me, molds itself to me, melts into me. It fits to every contour of my body, to every pore of my skin...No pain. No agony...It's as natural as a butterfly emerging from its chrysalis.¹⁴⁹

The Quileutes 'explode' into their wolf forms; Lucas is 'embraced' into his. This peaceful, nurturing language de-emphasises the potentially Gothic nature of Lucas' transformation, distancing it from the abject. There is no disintegration of the self in Lucas' transition from human to animal. While this could potentially be read as conflating American Indians and animals, Bruchac's afterword serves as a reminder that he is writing from a Native American rather than a Eurocentric perspective, decentralising racist stereotypes; 'The Haudenosaunee (Iroquois) nations speak of how the wolf people have taught many things to humans, among them the lesson that all adults in a community must care for their children as do all of the grown animals in a wolf pack'.¹⁵⁰ This sentiment corresponds with the theme of the paternal masculine established in the novel through Lucas' relationship with his father and uncle. The link between American Indians and animals that is found in *Wolf Mark* does not reduce Native peoples to a position of inhumanity, but instead corresponds with pre-contact attitudes towards the relationship between humans and the world around them.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid, p122

¹⁵⁰ Ibid, p375

The Problem of Leah: Native womanhood in *Twilight*

One of the most striking changes that occurred as a result of the imposition of Christianity and 'civilisation' on American Indian peoples was the devaluation of the role of women. Allen writes of the incompatibility of 'gynocratic'¹⁵¹ pre-contact cultures and colonial Christian beliefs, stating that 'The Judeo-Christian view is hierarchical. God commands first; within the limits of those commands, man rules; woman is subject to man, as are all the creatures'.¹⁵² Women were central to the spiritual and social structures of the majority of American Indian cultures. The Christianisation of tribes damaged these cultures significantly; for example, the Iroquois, traditionally matriarchal, had their entire society upturned by the patriarchal nature of Christianity. As Allen continues, 'Colonization means the loss not only of language and the power of self-government but also of ritual status of all women and those males labelled "deviant" by the white Christian colonizers' – an Othering that is also apparent in the Gothic depiction of 'deviant' expressions of gender and sexuality as threatening.¹⁵³

While this chapter has focused on portrayals of Native and white men, an equally important aspect of the texts is their depictions of women, particularly of Native American women. As one might expect, Native women in literature have traditionally been characterised very differently to white women. American Indian characters in colonial literature are generally male; when female Native characters are included, they are often reduced to background figures whose

¹⁵¹ *The Sacred Hoop*, p2

¹⁵² *Ibid*, p58

¹⁵³ *Ibid*, p196

only role is one of subservience and drudgery.¹⁵⁴ In the context of colonial literature, 'white women's bodies embody the sexist racist fantasy of real womanness';¹⁵⁵ a result of the fact that 'whiteness...presents itself as the norm', while non-white bodies are Othered.¹⁵⁶ Essentially, the white female body is represented as 'pure' womanhood, whereas the Native female body is abjected and positioned as deviant. Where Native men are depicted as childlike or animalistic, Native women are dehumanised into the stereotypes identified by Keene; the 'ogre', or the 'sexy squaw', who exists only as a sexualised object.¹⁵⁷

Like constructions of masculinity, constructions of femininity and womanhood are complex, and are influenced by many social stereotypes and archetypes. Furthermore, the constructions of dichotomous, essentialist masculinity and femininity reinforce each other, setting out clear boundaries of what is considered 'masculine' and 'feminine' by mainstream society. Other social constructs, such as race and class, intersect with these rigid gender paradigms. As Lorde writes, 'ignoring the differences of race between women and the implications of those differences presents the most serious threat to the mobilization of women's joint power...As white women ignore their built-in privilege of whiteness and define *woman* in terms of their own experience alone,

¹⁵⁴ In *The Sign of the Beaver* Attean mocks the protagonist Matt for tending his family's vegetable patch, telling him that this is "squaw work" (*The Sign of the Beaver*, p52). As Joseph Bruchac notes in his introduction to the 2011 edition of *The Sign of the Beaver*, the word squaw 'has entered the English language with as much baggage as the "n-word" ...it's deeply insulting to refer to any American Indian woman as a squaw'. (Joseph Bruchac, 'Introduction', *The Sign of the Beaver*, pp.iii-iv)

¹⁵⁵ bell hooks, *Killing Rage: Ending racism* (London: Penguin, 1995), p2

¹⁵⁶ Heloise Brown, 'Introduction: White? Women: Beginnings and endings?', *White? Women: Critical perspectives on race and gender*, edited by Heloise Brown, Madi Gilkes and Ann Kaloski-Naylor (York: Raw Nerve Books, 1999), p7

¹⁵⁷ Keene also identified the 'wise grandma' as a commonly-used stereotype of Native women; however, this stereotype only applies to elderly women, and so is not relevant to an examination of Leah.

then women of colour become “other”¹⁵⁸. These differences, their associated stereotypes and the resultant othering contribute to what Susan Stryker describes as ‘social abjection’.¹⁵⁹ While Stryker dwells on the process of ‘stripping away gender and misattributing gender’ as the means by which people are dominated and made abject, this section will focus on the intersections between race and gender and how they result in a vast difference between the experiences of white women and Native women, with the subsequent abjection of Native women.¹⁶⁰

Texts such as *The Sign of the Beaver* take an objective rather than subjective view of Native women, creating what Rey Chow would describe as ‘[a] defiled image, [a] stripped image, [an] image-reduced-to-nakedness’.¹⁶¹ This idea of a reduction to ‘nakedness’ is important when considering the treatment of Native peoples by colonial literature; nakedness was associated with savagery; something particularly important when we consider another aspect of the ‘squaw’ stereotype.¹⁶² Native women are presented both as exaggerated examples of

¹⁵⁸ Audre Lourde, ‘Age, Race, Class, and Sex: Women redefining difference’, *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, p55

¹⁵⁹ Susan Stryker, ‘Transgender Feminism: Queering the woman question’, *Third-Wave Feminism: A critical exploration*, edited by Stacey Gillis, Gillian Howie and Rebecca Munford (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007; first published 2004), p61

¹⁶⁰ Ibid.

¹⁶¹ Rey Chow, ‘Where have all the Natives gone?’, *Feminist Postcolonial Theory: A reader*, edited by Reina Lewis and Sara Mills (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003), p326

¹⁶² Adrienne Keene, author of the blog Native Appropriations, describes this secondary stereotype as the ‘sexy squaw’, an image often used in Halloween and party costumes: ‘Native women have been highly sexualized throughout history and in pop culture. There are any number of examples I can pull from, the “Indian Princess” stereotype is everywhere – think of the story of Pocahontas, or Tiger Lily in Peter Pan, or Cher in her “half breed” video... We’re either sexy squaws (the most offensive term out there), wise grandmas, or overweight ogres. But the pervasive “sexy squaw” is the most dangerous, especially when you know the basic facts about sexual violence against Native women: 1 in 3 Native women will be raped in their lifetime [and] 70% of sexual violence against Native women is committed by non-Natives’ (Adrienne Keene, ‘Nudie Neon Indians and the sexualization of Native women’, *Native Appropriations*)

uncontrolled female sexuality, and as somehow less valid in their status as women than their white counterparts, a paradoxical status similar to that occupied by Native men. This is a stereotype that has been applied to many women of colour, as can be seen in hooks' statement that white privileged and colonial society deems 'real womanness' as something belonging only to white women.¹⁶³

The depiction of Native women in texts by American Indian authors differs greatly from these colonial stereotypes. The role of women in legends and stories from American Indian cultures is generally more positive than in European folk tales,¹⁶⁴ something noted by Bruchac in the author's note to his novel *Skeleton Man*, where he states 'the strong women in our traditional American Indian stories [differ] from the dependent damsels of European folktales who hope for a prince to rescue them'.¹⁶⁵ This acknowledgement of the strength of women, and a focus on the importance of their role in society, is something common to the majority of American Indian nations. Despite other differences between cultures, there was a near-universal 'fundamental respect for women *as women*'.¹⁶⁶ Allen states that 'Even in those tribes where something akin to male domination was present, women were perceived as powerful, socially, physically, and metaphysically'; destroying this position led to the Gothic abjection inherent in

¹⁶³ *Killing Rage*, p2

¹⁶⁴ According to one study of Grimms' Fairy Tales, women in European folk tales are subjected to 'a persistent pattern of silencing and silence'. (Ruth B. Bottigheimer, *Grimms' Bad Girls and Bold Boys: The moral and social vision of the Tales* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987), p72)

¹⁶⁵ *Skeleton Man*, pi

¹⁶⁶ John Demos, *The Tried and the True: Native American women confronting colonization* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), p96

colonialism.¹⁶⁷ As with male Native characters, these stereotypes have influenced modern non-Native representations of American Indian women.

The *Twilight* series includes three important Native women characters; Leah Clearwater, her cousin Emily, and Leah's mother, Sue Clearwater. Emily is a home-maker, devoted to caring for the pack. The narrative frequently shows Emily engaging in domestic activities; 'she flitted around her tiny house and yard, scrubbing at the spotless floor, pulling a tiny weed, fixing a broken hinge, tugging a string of wool through an ancient loom, and always cooking, too'.¹⁶⁸ This may seem to correspond to colonialist images of Native women as servile drudges; however, this is not necessarily the case. Bella also takes on all the domestic duties in her home. Her father, despite living alone for nearly seventeen years, is depicted as being incapable of cooking or running a house:

Last night I'd discovered that Charlie couldn't cook much besides fried eggs and bacon. So I requested that I be assigned kitchen detail for the duration of my stay...I also found out that he had no food in the house. So I had my shopping list and the cash from the jar in the cupboard labeled FOOD MONEY, and I was on my way to the Thriftway.¹⁶⁹

Esme, too, is a domestic creature; although her family does not eat human food and her adopted children are adults, her hobby as a house restorer places her firmly in the role of homemaker. Rather than corresponding to the stereotype of servile Native woman, Emily is instead consistent with conservative models of femininity which position women as nurturers and housewives. However, when

¹⁶⁷ *The Sacred Hoop*, p48

¹⁶⁸ *New Moon*, p350

¹⁶⁹ *Twilight*, p27

considering the more prominent character of Leah, the *Twilight* series' portrayal of Native womanhood becomes more problematic.

The only female werewolf in the Quileute pack, Leah is consistently positioned as an outsider. Her identification with masculinity is related to this outsider status, positioning her within a masculinised and therefore deviant form of femaleness. Judith Halberstam writes that 'arguments about excessive masculinity tend to focus on [non-white] bodies, or working class bodies'.¹⁷⁰ As a working-class, Native woman, Leah occupies an Othered position in the predominately white and affluent society presented in *Twilight*. Her dismissal of herself as '*a freak – the girlie-wolf*' suggests that she has internalised this sense of Otherness.¹⁷¹ Leah is juxtaposed with her cousin Emily, upon whom Leah's former fiancé Sam imprinted following the activation of his werewolf gene. Leah is initially described in terms that relate to stereotypical ideals of feminine beauty; Bella notes that she has a 'lovely face'¹⁷² and 'eyelashes like feather dusters'.¹⁷³ The fact that Bella explicitly calls Leah 'beautiful in an exotic way'¹⁷⁴ is problematic, relating Leah's looks to the colonial trope of the 'exotic Other' and, ultimately, the 'sexy squaw' stereotype identified by Keene. However, it is Leah's role in the novel, more than her appearance, which corresponds to damaging ideas of Native womanhood. Her involvement with the pack places her in what may customarily be viewed as a masculine world. The Quileute werewolves act as a militia defending the area around La Push and Forks, occupying the

¹⁷⁰ Judith Halberstam, *Female Masculinity* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1998), p2

¹⁷¹ *Breaking Dawn*, p318

¹⁷² *Eclipse*, p241

¹⁷³ *New Moon*, p149

¹⁷⁴ *Ibid.*

traditionally male roles of soldiers and enforcers. As a werewolf, Leah is athletic, priding herself on her speed; she also has the same aggression that is associated with her male counterparts. Maud Levin argues that 'Historically, in US culture, women's aggression has been repressed, frowned upon as inappropriate behaviour, or branded as low class'; in short, women, who already occupy an Other status, are Othered to an even greater degree if they deviate from acceptable expressions of femaleness.¹⁷⁵ Leah is trapped by her situation. If she conforms to feminine stereotypes, she is of no use to the pack; if she becomes an effective member of the pack, she compromises her femininity and is viewed as deviant by her pack 'brothers'. In either scenario, Leah will be isolated and Othered.

Critics have noted that women in *Twilight* who take on stereotypically masculine roles are generally presented as negative, a trope common to the conservatism of the Gothic genre. This is particularly apparent in the examples of antagonistic female vampires in the series; Victoria's attempts to raise and lead an army, and Jane's work for the Volturi as a brutal law enforcer, are imbued with a sense of deviancy. By creating an army of 'newborn' vampires, Victoria has formed the twisted equivalent of a family without the presence of a 'patriarch from whom [she can] draw legitimacy'; as a result, she is positioned as deviant.¹⁷⁶ Whitton continues with the argument that 'vampire mothers in the literal sense – as opposed to father-approved surrogates like Esme – are selfish and

¹⁷⁵ Maud Levin, *Push Comes To Shove: New images of aggressive women* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press, 2010), p3

¹⁷⁶ Merinne Whitton, '“One is Not Born a Vampire, But Becomes One”: Motherhood and masochism in *Twilight*', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p122

inadequate, and more often than not come to a bad end'.¹⁷⁷ While this is true of some 'vampire mothers' in the series, Victoria can also be viewed as an example of a woman taking on a stereotypically masculine role rather than a warped version of a stereotypically feminine role. Victoria's role in the *Twilight* series is not that of a bad mother, but a deviant woman who is attempting to assume the role of leader of an army; a role that, as the examples of Sam, Jacob and Jasper imply, rightfully belongs to a man. As a result of her transgression, Victoria is defeated in battle and brutally killed by Edward.¹⁷⁸ Jane does not attempt to assume a leadership role; she is, as Whitton would put it, legitimised by a patriarch, the Volturi leader Aro. However, her role as torturer and enforcer also places her in opposition to the traditional concept of women as nurturers. Jane, too, is punished for her transgression; she is humiliated when her power is blocked in the confrontation between the Volturi and the Cullens. Significantly, this is done by a conformer to stereotypical female roles; the new mother and wife, Bella.

Leah, too, is a woman occupying a masculine position; as a member of the werewolf pack, her role is similar to that of a fighter in a militia. However, rather than exploring the challenges Leah faces as the only woman in the group, the narrative focus remains on the viewpoints of the men of the pack, particularly Jacob. Leah is portrayed as a liability in battle, responsible for Jacob's injuries at

¹⁷⁷ Ibid, p133. By 'in the literal sense', Whitton means that the vampire 'mothers' create their 'children' themselves, by transforming humans into vampires.

¹⁷⁸ 'Edward was in motion again. Swift and coolly businesslike, he dismembered the headless corpse...he piled the quivering, twitching limbs and then covered them with dry pine needles...And then they were done, and the raging fire was sending a pillar of choking purple towards the sky.' (*Eclipse*, pp554-555)

the end of *Eclipse*: “Then Leah has to be an idiot trying to prove she’s as tough as the rest of us and I have to be the idiot who saves her.”¹⁷⁹ The implication is that, by virtue of her sex, Leah is not as ‘tough’ as her male counterparts. With regards to her physical form, she is ‘denied the full benefits of wolfhood’ that her comrades enjoy.¹⁸⁰

While one of the common characteristics of new-made werewolves is a sudden increase in physical mass and strength in human form...no corresponding change in Leah is remarked upon before the change, and her wolf incarnation is relatively small.¹⁸¹

As a result of her gender, Leah is viewed as a less useful member of the pack than the male werewolves. By contrast, the Cullen family values its female members, particularly the highly skilled Bella and Alice, whose vampire superpowers save the group from the Volturi at the climax of *Breaking Dawn*. This posits a Native community as more misogynistic than a white community, an inaccurate stereotype that regularly occurs in literature conforming to colonial tropes. The overall suggestion is that Native societies are innately misogynistic, while white societies are more enlightened and egalitarian. However, as *The Sacred Hoop* describes, women were traditionally highly respected in the majority of American Indian cultures:

The tribes see women variously, but they do not question the power of femininity. Sometimes they see women as fearful, sometimes peaceful, sometimes omnipotent and omniscient, but they never portray women as mindless, helpless, simple, or oppressed.¹⁸²

¹⁷⁹ *Eclipse*, p592

¹⁸⁰ ‘ “One is Not Born a Vampire, But Becomes One”: Motherhood and masochism in *Twilight*’, *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p128

¹⁸¹ *Ibid.*

¹⁸² *The Sacred Hoop*, p44

The loss of this power was a direct result of colonialism; however, Leah's position in the pack implies that her secondary status is a natural and traditional part of Quileute society. This erases the negative impact of colonialism on Native women, who have 'suffered a grievous decline [in status] since [European] contact', and implies that the abjection of Native women is inherent.¹⁸³

Leah is repeatedly depicted as a nuisance who disrupts every aspect of the pack's dynamics. In *Breaking Dawn*, Jacob reflects that Leah's physical presence has caused problems: 'Nudity was an inconvenient but unavoidable part of pack life. We'd all thought nothing of it before Leah came along. Then it got awkward'.¹⁸⁴ The fact that the blame is being placed on Leah for being sexually distracting, rather than on the men of the pack for objectifying her, is suggestive of victim-blaming.¹⁸⁵ While the pack operate under a mantra of self-control, it is clear that in this case, the responsibility for self-control is placed entirely on Leah. It is never suggested that the young men around Leah must learn not to look at or to fantasise about her; instead, Leah must learn not to change form unexpectedly. These sudden changes are a natural part of being a werewolf, and were excused when the pack was all male. It is clear that Leah is

¹⁸³ Paula Gunn Allen, 'Angry Women are Building: Issues and struggles facing American Indian women today', *Feminism and 'Race'*, edited by Kum-Kum Bhavnani (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), p42

¹⁸⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p259

¹⁸⁵ 'Victim-blaming has been identified by sociologists and social justice activists as a process by which the victim of a crime or of oppression is perceived as partially or wholly responsible for whatever has happened to them, as seen in this example of a potential attitude to relationship abuse: "She must have provoked him into being abusive. They both need to change"... This statement assumes that the victim is equally to blame for the abuse, when in reality, abuse is a conscious choice made by the abuser'. (Center for Relationship Abuse Awareness, 'Victim Blaming and Relationship Abuse' (<http://stoprelationshipabuse.org/educated/avoiding-victim-blaming/>), accessed 6th March 2014)

not only being expected to change her nature to fit in with the men around her, but is also being held to a higher standard than the rest of the pack.

The previous section of this chapter explored the differing implications of the werewolf and vampire transformations. Contrasting Leah and Bella highlights this difference. Supplementary material to the *Twilight* series reveals that ‘The shock of Leah phasing [for the first time] triggered her father’s fatal heart attack...It was extremely difficult for Leah to deal with her first weeks as a werewolf. She’d just lost her father and blamed herself for his death’.¹⁸⁶ Bella’s transformation also shocks her father – upon seeing her, his face displays ‘Shock. Disbelief. Pain. Loss. Fear. Anger. Suspicion. More pain’.¹⁸⁷ However, Charlie is able to adapt, leading Bella to realise ‘I [could] have both my new family and some of my old as well’.¹⁸⁸ Leah, by contrast, has lost most of her old family – her father and her ex-fiancé, Sam – and is generally disliked by her new ‘family’, the pack. The narrative indicates that Leah is at fault for her quasi-outcast status; she is shown to be deliberately disruptive.¹⁸⁹ Whitton believes that the pack ‘find her feminine mentality intrusive (their intolerance for her pain over Sam is contrasted with their seemingly boundless patience with Jacob’s agony over Bella)’; once again, Leah is being held to a higher standard than the men

¹⁸⁶ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p332

¹⁸⁷ *Breaking Dawn*, p506

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid*, p517

¹⁸⁹ In *Eclipse*, Edward tells Bella that Leah is using the werewolves’ psychic link to “[make] life exceedingly unpleasant” for the rest of the pack (*Eclipse*, p417). She does this by dwelling on the fact that Embry’s werewolf status means that “the prime candidates for his father are Quil Aleara Sr, Joshua Uley, or Billy Black, all of them married at that point...Now Sam, Jacob and Quil all wonder which of them has a half-brother.” (*Eclipse*, pp418-419).

around her.¹⁹⁰ By *Breaking Dawn*, Leah is so unpopular that, when she follows Jacob after his break from the pack, he tells her ‘*no one wants you here*’.¹⁹¹ This sentiment is echoed by Leah’s own brother, Seth:

Morning, boys.

A shocked whine broke through Seth’s teeth. And then we both snarled as we read deeper into the new thoughts.

Oh, man! Go away, Leah! Seth groaned.

I stopped when I got to Seth, head thrown back, ready to howl again – this time to complain.¹⁹²

Leah’s resistance to the Cullens’ offers of hospitality is portrayed as ungrateful and somewhat ridiculous. Rather than taking the food offered by Esme, Leah persists in eating in her wolf form, despite the fact that she loathes raw meat and must actively resist ‘[wincing] away as her human thoughts wanted to’.¹⁹³ The implication throughout these scenes is that Leah has brought her outsider status upon herself by being deliberately antagonistic to those around her. Furthermore, her disgust at her werewolf diet links back to the abject nature of *Twilight*’s werewolves. According to Kristeva, ‘Food loathing is perhaps the most elementary and most archaic form of abjection’;¹⁹⁴ Leah’s revulsion at eating animals she has hunted is associated not only with the abject nature of the corpse,¹⁹⁵ and the breakdown of boundaries such as those between life and death, but also with her loathing of her own body and her wish to escape rather

¹⁹⁰ ‘“One is Not Born a Vampire, But Becomes One”’: Motherhood and masochism in *Twilight*, *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p128

¹⁹¹ *Breaking Dawn*, p226

¹⁹² *Ibid*, p225

¹⁹³ *Ibid*, p314

¹⁹⁴ *Powers of Horror*, p2

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid*, p4

than sustain her werewolf form. Leah's wolf body, like Jacob's, becomes 'something rejected from which [she] does not part'.¹⁹⁶

The series' construction of Leah's character ignores the roles of gender and race in her marginalisation. For example, part of Leah's marginalisation occurs as a result of her pain over Sam. The narrative stresses that no blame should be ascribed to Sam for his abandonment of Leah; Edward states that "The way Sam is tied to his Emily is impossible to describe – or should I say *her Sam*. Sam really had no choice."¹⁹⁷ At the end of *Eclipse*, Jacob comments:

I remembered back when I used to think that Leah was pretty, maybe even beautiful. That was a long time ago. No one thought of her that way now. Except for Sam. He was never going to forgive himself. Like it was his fault that she'd turned into this bitter harpy.¹⁹⁸

The misogynistic undertones of this passage are clear; Leah is characterised as a 'bitter harpy', a gendered insult invoking the image of an ugly and aggressive female monster. The negative connotations of the image of the woman as monster are explored in Barbara Creed's *The Monstrous-Feminine*, where she describes 'the feminine body' as an aspect of 'the monstrous as constructed in the modern horror text'.¹⁹⁹ Leah's monstrous nature is connected to her status as a deviant woman, and her metaphorical 'ugliness' is implied to be a result of her anger over Sam and Emily's relationship, and of her deviance from gender stereotypes. Indeed, other than being described as "Poor Leah" by Bella, Leah

¹⁹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁹⁷ *Eclipse*, p418

¹⁹⁸ Ibid, p621

¹⁹⁹ Barbara Creed, *The Monstrous-Feminine: Film, feminism, psychoanalysis* (London: Routledge, 1993), pp8-9

receives very little sympathy, despite the validity of her anger.²⁰⁰ At one point, Jacob states that ‘she brought it all [the bad treatment she receives] on herself with the bitterness that tainted her every thought and made being in her head a nightmare’.²⁰¹ Leah is represented as selfish for experiencing emotional pain over her betrayal by Sam and Emily; she does not conform to the ideal of the self-sacrificing woman, and so is viewed as ‘ugly’ and unfeminine by those around her. Her depiction in the series suggests that her inability to forgive has resulted in the loss of her true femininity, replacing it instead with an aberrant and monstrous form of womanhood.

Not only is this negative construction of Leah sexist, it is contradictory; although she is depicted as selfish, a closer reading of the novels reveals that Leah is in fact one of the more selfless characters in the series. Later in *Breaking Dawn*, Leah confronts Bella about her treatment of Jacob. This is portrayed as one of Leah’s most heinous acts; she is described as having been “unnecessarily harsh...Bella’s been crying.”²⁰² A closer reading of Leah’s backstory, however, offers a different perspective. When one considers Leah’s past, it becomes apparent that, rather than being cruel, she held back in her ‘tirade’ against Bella.²⁰³ Leah’s unhappiness is a result of her and Sam’s transformation into werewolves, something that would not have happened without the presence of hostile vampires in Forks. Throughout the series, vampires that feed upon humans have only entered the local area to target Bella. Had Bella remained in

²⁰⁰ *Eclipse*, p417

²⁰¹ *Breaking Dawn*, p228

²⁰² *Ibid*, p338

²⁰³ *Ibid*, p339

Arizona, or not become involved with the Cullen family, it is unlikely that the werewolf gene would have been triggered. Sam would never have become a werewolf or imprinted on Emily, and Leah would have remained both human and engaged to the man she loved. Considering this context, the fact that Leah only chastises Bella for her emotional dependence on Jacob, rather than for being the cause of Leah's own pain, can be read as a strikingly selfless moment.²⁰⁴ The selflessness of this act is even more apparent considering the fact that Leah dislikes Jacob, and thus has no personal motive to defend him. However, she receives no credit for this; even Jacob reflects 'I wanted to punch Leah right in her stupid mouth'.²⁰⁵ A defence of 'pure' white womanhood is considered more important than countering the abjection of a Native woman.

There are many moments within the text where Leah has the potential to be portrayed as a positive representation of Native womanhood. For example, her rejection of the Cullens' hospitality could have been depicted as a moment of leadership, in which Leah refuses to assimilate to white cultural norms.²⁰⁶ However, the narrative of *Twilight* is intensely pro-assimilation, culminating in Jacob's imprinting on Renesmee and his acceptance into the Cullen family. As a result, Leah's actions are coded as misguided and unreasonable, rather than as a resistance to colonisation. Additionally, in the third section of the novel, when Bella returns as narrator, Leah disappears from the narrative. The fact that the series' most prominent Native woman is erased when the narrative focus shifts

²⁰⁴ Ibid, p229

²⁰⁵ Ibid, p344

²⁰⁶ Wilson argues that Jacob's gradual assumption of the Cullens' luxurious lifestyle is a process of assimilation; thus, one can read Leah's refusal to be fed or dressed by the Cullen family as an act of resistance.

back to a white woman is in keeping with hooks' summation that in current Western society, 'real womanness' is viewed as inherently white.²⁰⁷ Although her identity is established to some degree in Jacob's section of the novel, the switch to Bella's perspective places Leah back in the homogenised group of the pack. This removes not only her individuality, but also her femininity and, arguably, her humanity – she is returned to her former position as 'one of the boys', or, alternatively, one of the Cullen family's 'guard dogs'.²⁰⁸ According to Susan Stryker, 'stripping away gender, and misattributing gender, are practices of social domination, regulation and control that threaten social abjection'; Leah's masculinisation within the narrative places her in an abject and pitiable position, with no potential for change or release.²⁰⁹ The overwhelming implication is that Leah's story is not important enough to be resolved.

Frozen Women: White and Native female bodies and the role of fertility

When considered alongside wider colonial contexts, Leah's mindset and actions are not the only aspects of her character that are problematic; so too are the changes to her body that have occurred as a result of her transformation. During a conversation between Leah and Jacob, it is revealed that, since becoming a werewolf, Leah has stopped menstruating:

I remembered Leah's panic that first month after she joined the pack...Because she couldn't be *pregnant* – not unless there was some

²⁰⁷ *Killing Rage*, p2

²⁰⁸ *Breaking Dawn*, p700

²⁰⁹ Susan Stryker, 'Transgender Feminism: Queering the woman question', *Third-Wave Feminism: A critical exploration*, p59

really freaky religious immaculate crap going on. She hadn't been with anyone since Sam. And then, when the weeks dragged on and nothing turned into more nothing, she'd realized that her body wasn't following the normal patterns anymore.²¹⁰

The halt in her menstrual cycle leads Leah to question her femininity: 'Had her body changed because she'd become a werewolf? Or had she become a werewolf because her body was *wrong*? The only female werewolf in the history of forever. Was that because she wasn't as female as she should be?'²¹¹ However, these questions are never addressed or deconstructed. Whitton argues that 'it is implied that the cause of all Leah's suffering is her barrenness...It is the reason her lover Sam imprinted on her symbolically fertile cousin Emily instead of her'; Leah's tragic storyline is portrayed as being 'deserved' because, unlike 'good' women such as Bella, she cannot become a mother.²¹² Leah becomes a figure who 'identifies the boundaries of motherhood', one of *Twilight's* "other" women [who are] foils for the "good" woman', which is inextricably linked with fertility and domesticity.²¹³ The Otherness and inherent 'wrongness' of Leah's body is represented as fact, something that carries transphobic and misogynistic undertones. According to Oshiro, the subtext of this passage in *Breaking Dawn* '[erases] the existence of women who can't get pregnant, women who don't have vaginas, who don't want to get pregnant, and who might be different from [Meyer's] privileged position';²¹⁴ it suggests that 'menopausal women [which

²¹⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, pp317-318

²¹¹ *Ibid*, p318

²¹² ' "One is Not Born a Vampire, But Becomes One": Motherhood and masochism in *Twilight*', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p128

²¹³ Kristine Swenson, 'The Menopausal Vampire: Arabella Kenealy and the boundaries of true womanhood', *Women's Writing*, Vol. 10, No. 1 (2003), p29

²¹⁴ Mark Oshiro, *Mark Reads Breaking Dawn* (self-published ebook), p70

Leah identifies as] *aren't complete or genuine women*', presenting a limiting and conservative definition of womanhood that renders all women outside it abject.²¹⁵

It is true that *Breaking Dawn* puts forward a 'nightmare version of pregnancy – having a deadly enemy trapped within one's own body'.²¹⁶ The birth scene is one of the few moments in the series that explicitly corresponds with the abject, involving as it does 'the corpse...bodily wastes...[and] the feminine body', when Bella's body is torn apart by the half-vampire foetus inside her.²¹⁷

Bella's body, streaming with red, started to twitch, jerking around in Rosalie's arms like she was being electrocuted. All the while, her face was blank – unconscious. It was the wild thrashing from inside the center of her body that moved her. As she convulsed, sharp snaps and cracks kept time with the spasms.²¹⁸

However, motherhood itself is portrayed as sublime rather than abject; 'I was euphoric the majority of the time...The days were not long enough for me to get my fill of adoring my daughter'.²¹⁹ The representation of Leah in *Breaking Dawn*, particularly in contrast to the fertile Bella, implies once again that 'real womanhood' is associated with whiteness. Previously described as a 'harp', Leah is subtly linked to Greek myth, a genre 'populated with dozens of monstrous women...they are all women who cannot bear children, they are physically monstrous and they are totally destructive' – or, within the context of the Gothic, abject.²²⁰ While 'creation may be horrifying in Meyer's account...birth

²¹⁵ Ibid, p71

²¹⁶ Lisa Lampert-Weissig, 'Mormon Female Gothic: Blood, birth, and the *Twilight* saga', p5

²¹⁷ *The Monstrous-Feminine*, p9

²¹⁸ *Breaking Dawn*, p348

²¹⁹ Ibid, p527

²²⁰ Linda H. McGuire, 'From Greek Myth to Medieval Witches: Infertile woman as monstrous and evil', *Our Monstrous (S)kin: Blurring the boundaries between monsters and humanity*, edited by Sorcha Ní Fhlainn (Oxford: Inter-Disciplinary Press, 2009), p136

and its results are redemptive, if not holy'.²²¹ This redemption is available only to the 'white and delightsome' Mormon vampires, not to Leah, the Lamanite werewolf.

In addition to the misogynistic and transmisogynistic subtext of Leah's infertility, her belief that she is '*a genetic dead end...I'm twenty years old and I'm menopausal*' is sinister when considered in the context of colonialism.²²² The United States has an extensive history of carrying out forced sterilisation programmes that targeted the poor, people with mental and physical disabilities, and people of colour.²²³ Many of these programmes focused specifically on Native peoples:

In the US, the Department of Health, Education and Welfare (HEW) accelerated programs in 1970 that paid for the majority of costs to sterilize Medicaid recipients...it is not surprising that Native women became targets of the population craze when Indian Health Services (IHS) initiated a fully federally funded sterilization campaign in 1970.²²⁴

Smith cites studies showing that '5 percent of all Native women of childbearing age' in areas serviced by the IHS were sterilised during this period,²²⁵ and that American Indian women were in general 'twice as likely to be sterilized as were white women'.²²⁶ Angela Davis quotes an even more alarming statistic, suggesting that 'by 1976, twenty-four per cent of all Native American women of

²²¹ 'Mormon Female Gothic: Blood, birth, and the *Twilight* saga', p9

²²² *Breaking Dawn*, p318

²²³ Eugenics became a popular concept in America in the early twentieth century, with a 'focus on race, social control, and genetic "improvement"...[becoming] a social weapon'. (Nancy L. Gallagher, *Breeding Better Vermonters: The eugenics project in the Green Mountain state* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1999), pp1-2)

²²⁴ *Conquest*, p81

²²⁵ *Ibid*, p82

²²⁶ *Ibid*, p83

childbearing age had been sterilized'.²²⁷ Despite widespread condemnation, the practice did not stop in the 1970s; 'One woman I knew went into IHS in the 1990s for back surgery and came out with a hysterectomy'.²²⁸ Smith links this drive to sterilize Native people directly with colonial policies, stating that 'Native women, whose ability to reproduce continues to stand in the way of the continuing conquest of Native lands, endanger the continued success of colonization'.²²⁹ Sterilising Native women was a deliberate strategy intended to eradicate American Indian nations to make way for white expansion. Considering this history, it is chilling that the presence of the colonising Cullens has resulted in Meyer's most prominent Native female character becoming infertile.

Furthermore, in the *Twilight* saga, fertility is portrayed as a reward for good behaviour, while infertility can be viewed as a punishment for negative character traits. This is particularly apparent in the cases of Bella and Rosalie. Bella is rewarded for her premarital chastity and her love for Edward by becoming pregnant with Renesmee. Rosalie, by contrast, has always wished to be a mother; however, her transformation into a vampire has denied her this opportunity.²³⁰ Rosalie is changed following a vicious attack by her fiancé and a group of his friends, during which she was gang-raped and left for dead. Importantly, this is depicted as a direct result of Rosalie's vanity:

²²⁷ Angela Davis, 'Racism, birth control and reproductive rights', *Feminist Postcolonial Theory: A reader*, p363

²²⁸ *Conquest*, p85

²²⁹ *Ibid*, p79

²³⁰ 'Of course Rosalie could not conceive a child, because she was frozen in the state in which she passed from human to inhuman. Totally unchanging. And human women's bodies had to *change* to bear children. The constant change of a monthly cycle for one thing, and then the bigger changes needed to accommodate a growing child.' (*Breaking Dawn*, p126)

“It took some time before I began to blame the beauty for what had happened to me – for me to see the curse of it. To wish that I had been...well, not ugly, but normal...So I could have been allowed to marry someone who loved *me*, and have pretty babies. That’s what I’d really wanted, all along. It still doesn’t seem like too much to have asked for.”²³¹

The fact that Rosalie is portrayed as partly to her blame for her own death, and resultant infertility, implies that this is a punishment for her vanity and self-centred attitude. Furthermore, it makes her capable of monstrous behaviour; although Bella views Rosalie as her protector during her pregnancy, Edward reveals that “Rosalie’s always there, feeding [Bella’s] insanity – encouraging her. Protecting her. No, protecting *it*. Bella’s life means nothing to her.”²³² Leah’s statement ‘*That blond vampire you hate so much – I totally get her perspective*’ links her with Rosalie in what is arguably the vampire woman’s most monstrous moment.²³³ This suggests that Leah, too, is being punished with her infertility. Both women are blamed for situations that have been forced upon them, and it is implied that neither is worthy of a truly happy conclusion to their stories.

In the final section of *Breaking Dawn*, when Bella resumes her role as narrator, Leah becomes a background figure; the reader never learns whether her fertility returns, nor whether she achieves the independence she wishes for. However, Stephenie Meyer discusses Leah’s eventual fate on her website:

Leah is currently pretty satisfied with life. She’s free from Sam’s pack, which is a very happy thing for her. She’s the “beta” in Jacob’s pack, which she can’t help but be a little smug about around her pack brothers...Jacob has become the reliable friend that she’s been needing for quite some time, and he’s a real comfort to her, though they conceal their fondness for each other with constant bickering. She has absolutely

²³¹ *Eclipse*, p162

²³² *Breaking Dawn*, p181

²³³ *Ibid*, p316

no romantic interest in Jacob, and the whole Nessie [Renesmee] thing only bothers her in that it ties her to the vampires.²³⁴

There are some positive elements to this ending for Leah; she has been able to remain with her community, rather than feeling that she must leave in order to be happy, and to prevent Emily and Sam from feeling guilty. She has also attained a position of relative power, as Jacob's 'beta', countering the earlier subtext that a 'deviant' woman such as Leah has no place in society. However, this position is dependent upon her relationship with Jacob; Leah has no power in her own right, and, like the good vampire women, must be legitimised by a patriarch. This does not correspond to traditional positions held by Native women in pre-contact societies. For example, in Iroquoian culture, 'sachems were chosen from certain families by the Matrons of their clans and were subject to impeachment by the Matrons should they prove inadequate or derelict in carrying out their duties as envisioned by the Matrons'.²³⁵ Although pre-contact Quileute culture was very different from Iroquoian culture, the near-universal respect for women in Native nations means that, in a *Twilight* written according to genuine Quileute values, Leah would have been valued in her own right instead of as a result of her connection to a man. Instead of taking on a strong role within her community, Leah is subsumed by Gothic tropes; like the archetypal Gothic heroine, she is 'depicted in relation to [her] male counterpart...[existing] fully only in relation to [her] man in terms of the story'.²³⁶

²³⁴ *Breaking Dawn* FAQs

²³⁵ *The Sacred Hoop*, p33

²³⁶ Julianne Guillard, "You are exactly my brand of heroin(e)": Convergences and divergences of the Gothic literary heroine', *Girlhood Studies*, Vol. 4, No. 1 (Summer 2011), p51

Furthermore, there is no mention of any romantic prospects for Leah. In the *Twilight* saga, all 'good' characters have romantic partners by the end of the series – even perpetual bachelor Charlie is paired off with Leah's mother, Sue. Bella's reaction to Edward leaving in *New Moon* suggests that, within the world of *Twilight*, being single is the worst fate imaginable:

I was like a lost moon – my planet destroyed in some cataclysmic, disaster-movie scenario of desolation – that continued, nevertheless, to circle in a tight little orbit around the empty space left behind, ignoring the laws of gravity.²³⁷

Leah's single status and her infertility imply that she is less deserving of a happy ending than Bella, Edward, Jacob, and many others. Essentially, the novels suggest that Leah is not yet 'good' enough for a happy ending, perhaps as a result of her 'smugness' and continuing dislike of the Cullens. According to Diana Wallace and Andrew Smith, 'the Female Gothic plot...[features] the imprisoned and pursued heroine threatened by a tyrannical male figure', a narrative structure which describes Leah's position in the *Twilight* series; she is bound to the pack, and her sense of happiness is threatened by the whims of Sam and, later, Jacob.²³⁸ However, rather than having her female Gothic plot concluded by 'the closure of marriage', Leah remains single, languishing in a Gothic hinterland for potentially the rest of her life.²³⁹ Neither does she complete a young adult plotline – while Bella comes of age, becoming a fully-realised adult, mother and wife, Leah remains in an endless adolescence, perpetually subordinated.

²³⁷ *New Moon*, p201

²³⁸ Diana Wallace and Andrew Smith, 'Introduction: Defining the female Gothic', *The Female Gothic: New directions*, edited by Diana Wallace and Andrew Smith (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p3

²³⁹ *Ibid.*

As these examples indicate, portrayals of Native male and female bodies, when considered in the context of the United States' history of colonialist practices against American Indian peoples, carry implications that cannot be ignored. Tabish Khair writes that 'the Other is seen as a Self waiting to be assimilated...or the Other is cast as the purely negative image of the European Self, the obverse of the Self', and the examples of Jacob and Leah fulfil both of these potential presentations of the Other.²⁴⁰ Jacob is assimilated into the Cullen family, becoming an extension of the white vampire group's collective 'Self'. Leah, by contrast, becomes the 'purely negative' image of Bella; single and infertile, it is implied that she will never achieve the fulfilment of the married mother Bella. While Bella's transformation is associated with the sublime, Leah's, despite her 'exotic' beauty, corresponds with the grotesque and abject; the werewolf Leah is a 'freak',²⁴¹ while the vampire Bella is a 'freaking supermodel'.²⁴² Leah's character arc makes her a truly Othered figure; she is not strong enough to fight as well as the rest of the pack, not fertile enough to start a family, and not assimilated enough to be comfortable working for the Cullens. As a result of this isolation, Leah sees no possibility for a future around Forks, telling Jacob '*I'll get a job somewhere away from La Push*'.²⁴³ The narrative suggests that a woman who is 'not as female as she should be', and who can only emulate masculinity, has no true purpose in society and so must remove herself from that society as soon as possible. The *Twilight* saga's problematic depictions of

²⁴⁰ *The Gothic, Postcolonialism and Otherness*, p4

²⁴¹ *Breaking Dawn*, p318

²⁴² *Ibid*, p639

²⁴³ *Ibid*, p313, italics in original.

gender, and the differences between these representations and those found in *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series, also have an impact on the texts' representations of sexuality. This is particularly true when the intersecting subject of race is also considered. As a result of this, an analysis of raced representations of sexuality in the novels will form the basis of the next chapter.

Chapter Four

Breaking Boundaries, Breaking Binaries: Transgression, sexuality and romance in the texts

Vampy Vamps and Virgins: Sexual deviance and conservatism in the figure of the vampire

Vampires are often characterised as sexual monsters, both 'attractive and erotic in their deadliness'.¹ Several critics have identified vampiric bloodlust as a metaphor for sexuality. In his essay 'Hypocrite Vampire...', Botting describes vampires as 'figures of horror, deviancy or decadence', associated with transgressive behaviour, particularly sexual behaviour.² Tim Kane notes in *The Changing Vampire of Film and Television* that 'highly sensual scenes of vampirism, especially THE BITE, characterize [erotic portrayals of the vampire]'.³ Indeed, the actions of the vampire have not only been associated with sex, but with rape, as described by Karen Backstein; 'the very notion of "devouring" and "eating" someone is redolent of sex (and, in some cases, rape), and [the vampire] could have what he wants for the taking'.⁴ The representation of uncontrolled sexuality as perilous and potentially harmful dates from early examples of vampire literature. For example, in *Dracula*, the scene in which Mina and Dracula are found together is described in repugnant terms:

With his left hand he held both Mrs Harker's hands, keeping them away with her arms at full tension. His right hand gripped her by the back of the

¹ Bernard Beck, 'Fearless Vampire Kissers: Bloodsuckers we love in *Twilight*, *True Blood* and others', *Multicultural Perspectives*, Vol. 13 Iss. 2 (2011), p90

² Fred Botting, 'Hypocrite Vampire...', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 9, Issue 1, p17

³ Tim Kane, *The Changing Vampire of Film and Television: A critical study of the growth of a genre* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., Publishers, 2006), p44

⁴ Karen Backstein, '(Un)safe Sex: Romancing the vampire', *Cineaste* (Winter 2009), p38

neck, forcing her face down on his bosom. Her white nightdress was smeared with blood, and a thin stream trickled down the man's bare chest which was shown by his torn-open dress. The attitude of the two had a terrible resemblance to a child forcing a kitten's nose into a saucer of milk to compel it to drink.⁵

This scene contains a strong subtext of aberrant sexuality, suggested by the two characters' 'torn-open' clothing, their close physical contact, and the exchange of bodily fluids, in this case blood.⁶

The traditional Gothic's focus on aberrant sexuality is another indication of the genre's conservative nature. According to this reading of the Gothic, deviant figures are presented as horrific so the reader will celebrate their defeat:

The terrors and horrors of transgression in Gothic writing become a powerful means to reassert the values of society, virtue and property: transgression, by crossing the social and aesthetic limits, serves to reinforce or underline their value and necessity, restoring or defining limits.⁷

However, attitudes towards sexuality have changed since *Dracula*, and, as a result of this, vampires have evolved. Meg Barker states that 'the modern media vampire is an attractive, sexy creature, often used as a metaphor for human anxieties around issues such as sexuality and addiction'.⁸ *Wolf Mark*, *Twilight* and the *Tantalize* series are no exception; in all three, vampires are portrayed as sexually appealing, but also as dangerous. Gelder notes that texts featuring vampires 'often focus on youth, when sexuality is in its most formative moment'.⁹

⁵ Bram Stoker, *Dracula* (Kindle Edition), p250

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ *Gothic*, p7

⁸ Meg Barker, 'Vampire Subcultures', *Vampires: Myths and metaphors of enduring evil*, edited by Peter Day (New York: Rodopi, 2006), p114

⁹ Ken Gelder, *Reading the Vampire* (London: Routledge, 1994), pp93-94

As a result of this, many modern texts featuring vampires are aimed at a young adult audience, and have a strong focus on developing sexuality. Vampire stories aimed at young adults allow for the exploration of adolescent sexuality, but also of the social anxieties that surround the developing sexualities of teenagers.¹⁰ Adolescent sexual awakenings are paralleled with the bloodlust associated with vampirism, often portrayed as equally dangerous and destructive, and in need of careful regulation.

These interpretations suggest that, while modern Gothic novels featuring adults have allowed for a more liberal interpretation of the vampire, young adult Gothic novels continue in the conservative trend of the traditional Gothic, warning against the dangers of unregulated sexuality in an attempt to scare their target audience into acquiescence. The texts explored in this thesis seem to explore this interpretation. In *Wolf Mark*, Lucas describes the *upyr* Marina:

If it wasn't for that old, cold scent about her she really would be a candidate for at least a second-string spot in any testosterone-stoked dreams I might have. Now, though? No. Nightmares, maybe. She reaches a finger out to touch my forehead, brings it back, puts it in her mouth.

Her pleased smile exposes pointy canine teeth.

"Maybe we play later," she says. "*Doggi*."¹¹

This passage emphasises Marina's sexual appeal, but also her monstrous nature; both her scent and behaviour mark her as aberrant. According to Linda

¹⁰ This is apparent, for example, in the *House of Night* series by mother and daughter team P. C. and Kristin Cast. In the first novel, the protagonist Zoey Redbird arrives at the series' 'vampyre finishing school', and promptly witnesses a sexual encounter between two of the older students: 'In a little alcove not far from me were two people ... She was on her knees in front of him. All I could see of her was her blond hair'. The blonde girl described in this scene, Aphrodite, is the villain of the novel, characterised as 'bad' partly because of her overtly sexual behaviour. (P. C. and Kristin Cast, *Marked* (London: Atom, 2010; first published in the United States in 2007), pp64-65)

¹¹ *Wolf Mark*, p70

H. McGuire, 'the idea of a female monster is usually linked in some way with perceived or accepted ideas concerning women's sexuality or role in society', something that is certainly true of the two most prominent female characters in *Wolf Mark*.¹² The monstrous Marina is juxtaposed with Meena, whose flirtation with Lucas is innocent in comparison to that of the *upyr*. Marina, as well as being rendered an abject figure by her 'old, cold scent', consistently demonstrates an aggressive sexuality:

Marina, who's standing by Yuri's right side, eyes me up and down...and then halfway up again ending just below my waist.

"Good boy, indeed," she says in a throaty voice. "*Kol-ba-si-nu*. Very impressive."¹³

In this section, Marina is written as an example of a threatening form of female sexuality, similar to that of Dracula's wives.¹⁴ Both female vampires 'gloat' over the body of the narrator, assuming a position of sexual power within the narrative.

A reader might expect this depiction of female sexual dominance to be written as dangerous in a novel from the sexually conservative Victorian era. The fact that this sense of danger is also present in a modern novel, despite being rendered in a far more comical style than in *Dracula*, suggests that the sexually assertive woman is still viewed as deviant, particularly when this woman is, at least in outward appearance, a teenage girl. Additionally, there are colonial

¹² Linda H. McGuire, 'From Greek Myth to Medieval Witches: Infertile women as monstrous and evil', *Our Monstrous (S)kin*, p142

¹³ *Wolf Mark*, p277

¹⁴ 'The girl went on her knees, and bent over me, simply gloating. There was a deliberate voluptuousness which was both thrilling and repulsive, and as she arched her neck she actually licked her lips like an animal, till I could see in the moonlight the moisture shining on the scarlet lips and on the red tongue as it lapped the white sharp teeth.' (*Dracula*, p32)

implications to the fact that the white vampire sexually objectifies the Native werewolf; the non-white figure is reduced to an exotic body, placed in an Othered position, sexualised like the 'beautiful savage' stereotype identified by Peter van Lent, where the Native man is characterised as 'dashing, bold, undaunted, hell-bent, impetuous, and brave'.¹⁵ One could argue that this focus on 'undaunted, hell-bent bravery' as an attractive trait can be applied equally to representations of white men; for example throughout the *Twilight* series, Edward risks his life and fights with hostile vampires in order to protect Bella. However, the sexualised representations of white and Native men differ in the context of racial power imbalances. When Bella admires Edward's aggressive physicality, she does so by recognising his power and agency: 'Edward was faster – a bullet from a gun'.¹⁶ Jacob, despite the fact that he is a threat to Bella, is 'breakable' in comparison to vampires.¹⁷ Marina's attitude towards Lucas reflects a similar imbalance of power; her attitude is proprietorial, positioning Lucas as an accessory rather than an equal.

The dangerous sexuality of the vampire is also apparent in the *Tantalize* series. Unlike Marina or Dracula's brides, Bradley is not described as an overtly sexual being from his introduction; when Quincie first sees him, she notes his 'fair hair, widow's peak, gangly limbs',¹⁸ later reflecting that he 'wasn't classically handsome...His nose was too big, his smile too smug, his blond hair thinning on

¹⁵ Peter van Lent, "Her Beautiful Savage": The current sexual image of the Native American male', *Dressing in Feathers*, pp211-213

¹⁶ *Eclipse*, p553

¹⁷ *Ibid*, p589

¹⁸ *Tantalize*, p68

top...Bad dresser'.¹⁹ However, it soon becomes apparent that this is calculated; Quincie takes it upon herself to "turn him into Count Sanguini", a decision that compels her to focus on his sexuality.²⁰ Their working relationship becomes increasingly sexualised; during one meeting with Brad, Quincie reflects that 'It should've felt like work, not a date'.²¹ Bradley's seduction of Quincie happens slowly, and is reflected in her increasing attraction to him; 'More attractive than I'd thought at first glance...It was the kind of face that grew on you'.²² This seduction causes Quincie's death and transformation into a vampire: 'Later, when I woke up, I remembered kissing. I had a vague recollection of sucking on Bradley's wine-coated tongue while he sucked on mine...And I thought we'd drunk some more'.²³ Instead of an outright assault, like Dracula's brides' attempted attack on Jonathan Harker, or potential harassment like Marina's comment on Lucas' body, Brad's actions reflect a process of grooming. He is not merely attempting to attack Quincie, but to transform her and remake her. Although Quincie is undoubtedly Brad's victim, she is also central to his desires, becoming the focus of an obsession rather than prey to be consumed and discarded: 'I felt Brad's obsessive desire, the way he wanted it to be between us – at times raunchy and rutting, at times romantic and refined'.²⁴ Quincie is not simply a victim, but one who could '[consecrate] herself into a queen with disturbing alacrity';²⁵ Brad's fixation, his determination to "save the whole

¹⁹ Ibid, p79

²⁰ Ibid, p81

²¹ Ibid, p98

²² Ibid, p110

²³ Ibid, p232

²⁴ *Blessed*, pp424-425

²⁵ *Woman and the Demon*, p35

damned world for you, baby...[if that's] what it'll take", suggests that succumbing to his imposition of sexuality could give Quincie power, however demonic in nature.²⁶

Concentrating on Bradley as a sexual being brings out an element of transgressive female sexuality in Quincie herself. From the beginning, the novel is 'driven largely by female desire',²⁷ namely Quincie's lust for Kieren; 'Call me werecurious, but if my mission was to arouse the boy with the beast within, I'd have to tantalize his monster'.²⁸ However, as she begins to spend more time with Bradley, Quincie's sexuality becomes more obvious. This begins with a change in her wardrobe – 'fishnet stockings, black leather hot pants, and a black leather bustier' – a proscribed form of adult female sexuality which is linked with deviance, and implicitly with the demonic, corresponding with the 'monstrous feminine' of the traditional Gothic.²⁹ Quincie's transformation and sexual awakening eventually culminates in a scene paralleling the one between Dracula and Mina, albeit with far more explicit sexual imagery:

I reached out for Kieren, no foreplay, no fondling, tipped him back into the nearest black leather booth, climbed him like a ladder, straddled his hips, clamped my thighs tight, and sank in...Kieren moaned as his body went fluid, most of it anyway.³⁰

As the series continues, Quincie takes control of her sexuality along with her appetite for blood. She fears losing this control and succumbing fully to the transgressions that Brad endorsed; when Kieren reassures her that a mistrusting

²⁶ *Blessed*, p435

²⁷ '(Un)safe Sex: Romancing the vampire', p38

²⁸ *Tantalize*, p14

²⁹ *Ibid*, p186

³⁰ *Ibid*, p308

werewolf community “[doesn’t] know you”, Quincie tells him “It *will* be me...‘after a circle of seasons’”.³¹ Throughout *Blessed*, the vampire Quincie is in danger of losing herself to the deviant sexual role that has been forced upon her; she is ‘mesmerized’ by the sexualised scenes she witnesses at a vampire party:

...an eternal on his knees, nursing blood from a vein below his victim’s rib cage. As he gripped the backs of her thighs, the girl being bled jerked her hips forward, long blond curls falling across her tear-stained cheeks. Then she threw her head back again, and another aristocrat claimed her open lips with his own.³²

However, Quincie resists, and renegotiates both her sexuality and her vampirism on her own terms, resisting the ‘queen’ status offered by Brad and establishing her power under her own agency. She chooses to drink animal blood immediately, rather than transitioning slowly, as Miranda does, and eventually enters a loving and committed relationship with Kieren:

Just kissing, *kissing*, was so new to us. He tasted sweet and bitter. Like orange juice and beer. My touches were tentative, aware of his injuries. His were more assertive, mindful of me. We whispered things we’d never said before.³³

Quincie’s struggle transcends the dichotomy between the ‘[Gothic] woman’s angelic and demonic identities’; instead of succumbing to her vampiric darkness, or to social expectations of the ‘good girl’, she constructs her sexuality on her own terms.³⁴

This resistance of dangerous sexuality and reinscribing of the heroine’s sexual agency is a recurring theme in the *Tantalize* series. In *Eternal*, Miranda

³¹ *Blessed*, p338

³² *Ibid*, p290

³³ *Ibid*, p353

³⁴ *Woman and the Demon*, pp64-65

realises that her fractured soul means that embarking on a relationship with Zachary will condemn him to hell:

If Zachary keeps me, if he loses himself inside me, in my body and my love, though, he'll be a lost cause, too. Truly fallen, eternally damned. I can't let that happen, even if it means we could stay together, even if his touch humbles me, humanizes me.³⁵

Miranda, the self-confessed 'least vampy vamp in vamp history', chooses to keep her virginity and inhibit the sexually transgressive side of her nature in order to preserve her and Zachary's souls.³⁶ Her gradual change to consuming animal blood rather than human reflects her wish to keep control over the more deviant aspects of vampirism. If considered alongside Kane's description of 'THE BITE' as a metaphor for sex, the fact that Miranda no longer bites humans, and eventually shuns their blood entirely, suggests a rejection of the pre-conceived role of the vampire as seductive and destructive monster.³⁷ A vampire exercising control over her own appetites, and refusing to violate the boundaries between the heavenly and the demonic, distances Miranda from her nineteenth-century predecessors.³⁸

Leitch Smith subverts the traditional concept of the deviant vampire further through Quincie. Miranda's decision to end her existence as a vampire rather than stay with Zachary can still be read as conservative. Refusing a sexual relationship means that Miranda retains her virginity, something which, in a truly conservative text, would be key to her later ascension to Heaven. However, in

³⁵ *Eternal*, p301

³⁶ *Ibid.*

³⁷ *The Changing Vampire of Film and Television*, p44

³⁸ For example, Dracula's brides deliberately attempt to seduce and bite the engaged Jonathan Harker, actions which set them in opposition to the sacred institution of marriage.

Blessed, Quincie and Kieren enter a sexual and romantic relationship. Similarly, Miranda discovers that 'earthly pleasures', such as food and sex, can be enjoyed in Heaven; 'On the other side of the gates, we'll build our eternal lives, lives blessed with a whole new array of tantalizing and heavenly pleasures...If there's bacon-fried rice in heaven, who knows what other possibilities await?'³⁹ The implication is that love, not chastity, redeems; it is this love that renders Kieren and Quincie's relationship normal, rather than transgressive. Quincie's control is emphasised by the fact that she never kills a human or a shifter to feed, choosing to live only on animal blood. These examples suggest that the vampires of the *Tantalize* series are not necessarily sexually deviant figures, a deliberate undermining of the conservatism of the Gothic genre.⁴⁰

The vampires of *Twilight* also differ from traditional constructions of vampires. Where earlier vampire stories included 'heroic [human] men with pure hearts' as foils to the dangerous and seductive vampire, *Twilight* creates this pure male hero in the figure of the vampire himself.⁴¹ Like Miranda and Quincie, the Cullen family restrict their vampire appetites, from their diet to their sexual encounters, despite the difficulties that this presents. There is a clear sexual subtext to the passage where Edward discusses his family's diet, and his attraction to Bella's blood.⁴² Rhonda Nicol argues that 'Edward implies that when

³⁹ *Diabolical*, pp348-349

⁴⁰ Despite the lack of Native characters in the *Tantalize* novels, this counter-conservatism is, to some extent, counter-colonial; in contrast to the *Twilight* saga, Quincie chooses the young werewolf of colour over the aristocratic white vampire.

⁴¹ 'Fearless Vampire Kissers', p91

⁴² "But animals aren't enough?"

He paused. "I can't be sure, of course, but I'd compare it to living on tofu and soy milk; we call ourselves vegetarians, our little inside joke. It doesn't completely satiate the hunger – or

he was turned aged seventeen, his sexual impulses became permanently conflated with his thirst for blood, thus making it virtually impossible for him to experience sexual desire as something separate and distinct from bloodlust', thus embodying the image of the vampire's blood-drinking as a sexual metaphor.⁴³ Later in the series, Aro describes Edward's attraction as '*la tua cantate*';⁴⁴ Bella's blood 'sings' for him.⁴⁵ In *Midnight Sun*, Emmett remembers when he encountered a woman whose scent provoked a similar reaction:

...a sudden night breeze blew the white sheets out like sails and fanned the woman's scent across Emmett's face.

"Ah," I groaned quietly. As if my own remembered thirst was not enough.

I know. I didn't last half a second. I didn't even think about resisting.
His memory became far too explicit for me to stand.⁴⁶

Although Emmett is remembering an occasion upon which he killed and fed from a human, the focus on the 'explicit' nature of the act, and its provocation of feelings of longing in Edward, create a sexual subtext that is in keeping with traditional representations of the vampire.

Carole Veldman-Genz suggests that 'Meyer's espousal of sexual restraint and impulse control must...be read in the context of her well-publicized upbringing in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints...Her treatment of teenage sexuality speaks of and to current subcurrents in the US cultural climate,

rather thirst. But it keeps is strong enough to resist. Most of the time." His tone turned ominous. "Sometimes it's more difficult than others."

"Is it very difficult for you now?" I asked.

He sighed. "Yes." (*Twilight*, p164)

⁴³ Rhonda Nicol, ' "When You Kiss Me, I Want to Die": Arrested feminism in *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* and the *Twilight* series', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p119

⁴⁴ *New Moon*, p471

⁴⁵ *Ibid*, p490

⁴⁶ *Midnight Sun*, p47

silently referencing in-vogue Christian abstinence movements'.⁴⁷ The Cullens become 'idealized' figures that the reader is encouraged to emulate rather than reject, a stark contrast to the vampires of *Dracula* and other classic texts.⁴⁸ Edward and Bella's decision to remain abstinent until marriage is depicted as a certain way to achieve a 'happily ever after', and a model for the teenage reader to emulate.⁴⁹ Vampires outside of the Cullen family, by contrast, have a dangerous sexuality that makes them an explicit threat to humans. As they leave the Volturi, Bella, Edward and Alice encounter Heidi, a vampire who has used her sexuality to 'hunt' a group of tourists:

She was dressed to emphasize that beauty. Her amazingly long legs, darkened with tights, were exposed by the shortest of miniskirts. Her top was long-sleeved and high-necked, but extremely close-fitting, and constructed of red vinyl.

...
"Nice fishing," Demetri complimented her, and I suddenly understood the attention-grabbing outfit she wore...she was not only the fisherman, but also the bait.⁵⁰

The Volturi, like the vampire aristocracy of *Tantalize*, conflate sexuality and bloodlust. Even benign vampires, such as the Denali clan, are depicted as sexually threatening:

Mostly Tanya preferred human men – they were much more populous for one thing, with the added advantage of being soft and warm. And always eager, definitely.

"Succubus," I teased, hoping to interrupt the images flickering in her head.

She grinned, flashing her teeth. "The original."

⁴⁷ Carole Veldman-Genz, 'Serial Experiments in Popular Culture: The resignification of Gothic symbology in *Anita Blake Vampire Hunter* and the *Twilight* series, *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p48

⁴⁸ *Ibid*, p53

⁴⁹ *Breaking Dawn*, p742

⁵⁰ *New Moon*, p483

Unlike Carlisle, Tanya and her sisters had discovered their consciences slowly. In the end, it was their fondness for human men that turned the sisters against the slaughter. Now the men they loved...lived.⁵¹

Wilson argues that Tanya is positioned as an 'evil Eve' to Bella's 'good Eve'; while Bella resists temptation, Tanya seeks it out.⁵² Significantly, the promiscuous Tanya is denied the prize that the obediently abstinent Bella receives; an eternity with Edward. While the Denali clan are beloved friends of the Cullens, and seem to be happy in their chosen lifestyles, they do not achieve – or, it is implied, deserve – the 'happily ever after' that belongs to the monogamous Cullens.

This is a subversion of the traditional pattern of the Gothic. Wilson concludes that '*Twilight* vampires don't so much frighten us into acquiescence as lure us into it – if we love the likes of Edward, the saga promises, we too can have it all'.⁵³ However, it is a subversion that retains the Gothic genre's traditional conservatism, rather than offering the more liberal view espoused by the *Tantalize* series. Tanya and her sisters are an interesting contrast to the traditional vampire; they have achieved a 'conscience', and abstained from killing humans, as a result of their sexualities. The Cullen family are more conservative from the outset, automatically controlling their sexualities alongside their vampiric appetites. All of the Cullen couples are married, and are perfectly happy together; in *Midnight Sun*, Edward reflects 'Some days it was harder than others to live

⁵¹ *Midnight Sun*, p25

⁵² *Seduced by Twilight*, p29

⁵³ *Ibid*, p20

with three sets of perfectly matched lovers'.⁵⁴ Indeed, this absolute devotion is portrayed as being part of the nature of a 'good' vampire:

When change came for one of us, it was a rare and permanent thing. I had seen it happen with Carlisle, and then a decade later with Rosalie. Love had changed them in an eternal way, a way that never faded. More than eighty years had passed since Carlisle had found Esme, and yet he still looked at her with the incredulous eyes of first love. It would always be that way for them.

It would always be that way for me, too. I would always love this fragile human girl, for the rest of my limitless existence.⁵⁵

In keeping with the beliefs of conservative forms of Christianity, the series presents 'sex – along with marriage...as the reward for abstinence'.⁵⁶ Interestingly, this all-encompassing love means that a parallel can be drawn between the Cullens and the werewolves. The process described by Edward is remarkably similar to imprinting, which also enacts a permanent change upon the werewolf who imprints:

Everything inside me came undone as I stared at the tiny porcelain face of the half-vampire, half-human baby. All the lines that held me to my life were sliced apart in swift cuts, like clipping the strings to a bunch of balloons. Everything that made me who I was – my love for the dead girl upstairs, my love for my father, my loyalty to my new pack, the love for my other brothers, my hatred for my enemies, my home, my name, my *self* – disconnected from me in that second – *snip, snip, snip* – and floated up into space.⁵⁷

However, despite being written as positive, Jacob's imprinting on Renesmee is a loss. Although he still enjoys a close relationship with Bella, his father, and his pack, the above passage indicates that his connections to them are insignificant

⁵⁴ *Midnight Sun*, p56

⁵⁵ *Ibid*, p109

⁵⁶ Christine J. Gardner, *Making Chastity Sexy: The rhetoric of evangelical abstinence campaigns* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011), p13

⁵⁷ *Breaking Dawn*, p360

when compared to his attachment to Renesmee. By contrast, Edward's attraction to Bella does not diminish his love for his family; he still views Carlisle as a godlike figure, 'my creator, my mentor, my father in all the ways that counted'.⁵⁸ Similarly, Bella's depression in *New Moon* occurs not just because she has lost Edward, but also because she is mourning her connection with the entire Cullen family; 'it had been more than just losing the truest of true loves...It was also losing a whole future, a whole family – the whole life that I'd chosen'.⁵⁹ There is an echo of colonialism in the similarity between the imprinting werewolves and the vampires who are permanently changed by love. While the vampires are bound more closely together by their love, Jacob is distanced from his community and assimilated into the white Cullen clan.

Werewolf imprinting is depicted as a biologically-motivated process, entirely related to reproduction; '*You're drawn to the person who gives you the best chance to pass on the wolf gene...[or] to make stronger wolves*'.⁶⁰ The relationships between the werewolves and their imprints are grounded in physicality and the prospect of continuing the werewolf line. The connection between the married vampire couples, however, is represented as being a meeting of souls. Edward notes of his brother and sister 'Alice and Jasper...knew each other's every mood as well as their own. As if they could read minds, too – only just each other's'.⁶¹ Even Rosalie and Emmett, whose relationship is portrayed as shallower than that of the other Cullen couples, are soulmates.

⁵⁸ *Midnight Sun*, p13

⁵⁹ *New Moon*, p398

⁶⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p318

⁶¹ *Midnight Sun*, p4

Indeed, the fact that Rosalie saves Emmett after his bear attack by holding her breath and carrying him to Carlisle suggests a rejection of the most potent aspect of his human physical qualities, his blood. This is mirrored by Edward's refusal to indulge in Bella's blood, and, by implication, her body, a central aspect of the series; as Dietz writes, 'abstinence from premarital sex is so much a part of the story's suspense that there would not be much left without it'.⁶² In opposition to this, Jacob and Bella's romantic encounters are far more physical, and Jacob does not show the restraint that is a key component of Edward's character; when they kiss, Bella observes that 'I didn't have to be careful with Jacob, and he certainly wasn't being careful with me'.⁶³ Wilson suggests that this scene contrasts Jacob's physicality with Edward's 'virginity warrior status', associating Jacob with overt and dangerous sexuality.⁶⁴ Unlike Marina or Heidi, or Dracula and his wives, Edward and the other Cullens represent restraint with regards to sexuality, rather than transgression. However, in doing so, they fortify rather than subvert the conservatism of the Gothic genre, providing an aspirational example rather than a warning.

Straightening the Vampire: Queer theory and the Gothic

Traditionally, the vampire has not only been used as a metaphor for sexuality in general; texts featuring vampires have often depicted non-heteronormative

⁶² Tammy Dietz, 'Wake Up, Bella!: A personal essay on *Twilight*, Mormonism, feminism, and happiness', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p101

⁶³ *Eclipse*, p527

⁶⁴ *Seduced by Twilight*, p36

sexualities. According to Auerbach, 'Stoker cleaned up more than he degraded...he gentrified female vampires, who, for the first time, are monogamously heterosexual'.⁶⁵ The monogamy of Dracula's brides is debatable, as they attempt to seduce and feed upon Jonathan Harker; however, they are undoubtedly heterosexual. This is not true of earlier vampires. Sheridan LeFanu's novel *Carmilla* focuses, like *Dracula*, on a vampire's fixation and predation upon a young woman (See Appendix Four). However, unlike Dracula, the vampire Carmilla is also female. In this narrative, it is not only the "deviant" female sexuality' of the protagonist that must be regulated for patriarchal order to be restored; Carmilla's own 'deviance', as both a sexually aggressive woman and a lesbian, must be constrained.⁶⁶ However, in later examples of the Gothic, this patriarchal element is dismantled. Here, the vampire is often depicted as a positive and powerful queer figure.

In the context of queer studies, the term 'queer' does not necessarily refer to homosexuality, as Kathryn Kane notes:

Although a gay and lesbian positionality often facilitates a discourse of tolerance, acceptance and assimilation, "queer" was posed as a challenge to the social system. It is an open term; anyone who rejects heteronormativity can be queer.⁶⁷

⁶⁵ *Our Vampires, Ourselves*, p79

⁶⁶ Lois Drawmer, 'Sex, Death and Ecstasy: The art of transgression', *Vampires: Myths and metaphors of enduring evil*, p39

⁶⁷ Kathryn Kane, 'A Very Queer Refusal: The chilling effect of the Cullens' heteronormative embrace', *Bitten by Twilight*, p105

Queerness is posited as a 'multivariant signifier', encompassing a wide range of identities, all of which have provided inspiration for vampire novels.⁶⁸ Many modern vampires have followed in Carmilla's footsteps, being explicitly gay or lesbian. Others reject heteronormativity in other ways, linking to bisexuality or pansexuality,⁶⁹ or to exploring different manifestations of gender.⁷⁰ These examples suggest that, despite its conservative roots, the modern Gothic genre is useful for exploring non-heteronormative sexuality and romance, positioning the vampire as sympathetic rather than threatening. The modern queered vampire is positive, embodying an 'evolution' towards a more nuanced understanding of non-heteronormative sexualities in Gothic literature.⁷¹ According to Williamson, the queer vampire 'offers a way of inhabiting difference with pride, for embracing defiantly an identity that the world at large sees as "other"'.⁷² This may explain the appeal of the supernatural romance genre amongst young readers. Bodart argues that 'Teens are standing at the boundary between childhood and adulthood, part of them in each world, creating a duality that they share with the monsters'; the paradoxical and shifting nature of adolescence is reflected in and explored via fictional creatures, who occupy a

⁶⁸ Kate O'Riordan, 'Queer Theories and Cybersubjects: Intersecting figures', *Queer Online: Media technology and sexuality*, edited by Kate O'Riordan and David J. Phillips (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2007), p17

⁶⁹ For example, Thomas, the noble incubus of the *Dresden Files*, and his human girlfriend Justine regularly have sexual 'playmates' (Jim Butcher, *Cold Days* (London: Orbit, 2012), p140)

⁷⁰ According to an activist leaflet explored in an essay by Stephen Whittle, 'Queer means to fuck with gender'; both with gender expression, and gender stereotypes. (Stephen Whittle, 'Gender Fucking or Fucking Gender?', *Queer Theory*, edited by Iain Morland and Annabelle Willox (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), p115)

⁷¹ 'Dark Ladies', p9

⁷² *The Lure of the Vampire*, p1

fantasy version of this Othered and outsider position.⁷³ Teenage readers '[meet] these monsters and [recognise] their similar situation', thus learning 'how to be comfortable on the borderlines until they are ready to step forward into the adult world'.⁷⁴ However, despite the greater acceptance of gay, lesbian and bisexual sexualities in the modern era, the queer vampire remains an ambiguous figure. The texts all explore this nuanced status.

Some critics have argued that the queerness of the vampire is still apparent in the *Twilight* saga, as vampires are 'inherently queer in relation to humanity'.⁷⁵ Alice and Bella's relationship can be read as more than simply friendship; as with Edward, Bella spends much of her time with Alice focusing on the vampire's looks and scent:

Unnaturally still and white, with her large black eyes intent on my face, my visitor waited perfectly motionless in the center of the hall, beautiful beyond imagining...I locked my arms around her, gasping to inhale as much of the scent of her skin as possible. It wasn't like anything else – not floral or spice, citrus or musk. No perfume in the world could compare.⁷⁶

Furthermore, as argued by Kane, the vampire's bite has traditionally been read as a metaphor for sex. This theme continues in the world of *Twilight* – Bella considers that Edward's biting her in order to transform her into a vampire will make her 'belong' to him. Considering these sexual connotations, Alice's suggestion to Bella in *New Moon* carries lesbian undertones:

⁷³ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, pxxvii

⁷⁴ *Ibid.*

⁷⁵ Joseph Michael Sommers and Amy L. Hume, 'The Other Edward: *Twilight*'s queer construction of the vampire as an idealized teenage boyfriend', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p159

⁷⁶ *New Moon*, pp382-383

“Actually, Bella...” She hesitated, and then seemed to make a choice. “Honestly, I think it’s all gotten beyond ridiculous. I’m debating whether to just change you myself.”

...
“Did I scare you?” she wondered. “I thought that’s what you wanted.”

“I do!” I gasped. “Oh, Alice, do it now! I could help you so much – and I wouldn’t slow you down. Bite me!”⁷⁷

Following her change from human to vampire, the narrative implies that Bella’s focus on Alice is not homoerotic, but autoerotic; the form and scent that she so admires is one that she desires, and eventually achieves, for herself:

My first reaction was an unthinking pleasure. The alien creature in the glass was indisputably beautiful...her flawless face was pale as the moon against the frame or her dark, heavy hair. Her limbs were smooth and strong, skin glistening subtly, luminous as a pearl.⁷⁸

It is not only Bella who can be read as a potential example of homosexuality. Sommers and Hume argue that Edward himself is not only ‘queer in relation to humanity’, but implicitly gay:

The way romantic desire functions in this human-vampire relationship makes Edward queer on a different level – as a metaphorical portrait of “the gay boyfriend”. That term should not be seen as a sexual practice so much as a social construct of the boyfriend every young, heteronormative woman desires: the perfect boyfriend who is so perfect that he actually cannot be attainable (and thus is classed as “gay”).⁷⁹

I dispute the idea that Edward’s unattainable nature means that he can be ‘classed as gay’. Instead, he is a platonic ideal in every potential sense of the word, not only depicted as a perfect man, but distanced from human sexuality by

⁷⁷ Ibid, p436

⁷⁸ Ibid, p403

⁷⁹ ‘The Other Edward: *Twilight*’s queer construction of the vampire as an idealized teenage boyfriend’, *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p159

the nature of his superhuman body. Wilson notes that ‘we rarely see Edward’s body without clothes,’⁸⁰ and although Bella constantly describes Edward’s beauty, the image she creates is strangely unsexual. Bella often compares him to ‘a statue’,⁸¹ at one point calling him ‘as immobile as stone...a carving’.⁸² He does not breathe, his heart does not beat, and his ‘marble’ flesh is cold; his behaviour towards Bella prior to her transformation features a similar frigidity.⁸³ One critic quips that ‘Edward is the vampire, but it’s Bella who is the vamp’,⁸⁴ something indicated by his firm rejection of her sexual advances.⁸⁵ It is only after Bella’s transformation, when the pair can ‘love *together*...Finally equals’, that Edward is described in sexual terms; ‘I could taste his pure, vivid scent on my tongue and feel the unbelievable silkiness of his marble skin beneath my fingertips...My skin was so sensitive under his hands, too’.⁸⁶ Significantly, at this point in the narrative he has ‘warmed up’ to Bella, their respective body temperatures now ‘exactly matched’.⁸⁷ Rather than being coded as gay, Edward is instead written as too good for the human Bella, who constantly compares herself unfavourably to her vampire boyfriend:

Next to my little antique motorcycle, overshadowing it, was another vehicle...It was big and sleek and silver and – even totally motionless – it looked fast.

...

⁸⁰ *Seduced by Twilight*, p92

⁸¹ *New Moon*, p451

⁸² *Twilight*, p242

⁸³ *New Moon*, p451

⁸⁴ Eveline Brugger, ‘“Where Do the Cullens Fit In?": Vampires in European folklore, science and fiction’, *Twilight and History*, edited by Nancy R. Reagin (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2010), p241

⁸⁵ *Eclipse*, p444

⁸⁶ *Breaking Dawn*, p482

⁸⁷ *Ibid*, p392

I stared at the beautiful machine. Beside it, my bike looked like a broken tricycle. I felt a sudden wave of sadness when I realized that this was not a bad analogy for the way I probably looked next to Edward.⁸⁸

This state of affairs continues until Bella acquiesces to Edward's wish for her to marry him; this neutralises her 'potent' sexuality, turning her into a 'monogamous vampire', and raising her to Edward's sublime level.⁸⁹

Throughout the series, the Cullen family are associated with heteronormative social models. Marriage is idealised; Edward views the institution as 'nothing less than a way to safeguard Bella's virtue and her very soul...marriage is given tremendous moral authority, and a right world order that is profoundly anti-queer is established'.⁹⁰ Bella's attraction to other members of the Cullen family, such as Alice, is neutralised when she becomes a sister to the beautiful vampire girl. The birth of Renesmee compounds Edward and Bella's conformation to patriarchal and heteronormative structures. However, despite this apparent correspondence to traditional vampire stories, the method by which this conclusion occurs is very different:

Edward, having refused his fangs, is endowed with a fully working phallus...With a child, Edward is thus able to ascend into the full role of patriarch, not to replace Carlisle, but in a way that surpasses what Carlisle could manage; he becomes the head of his own biological nuclear family.⁹¹

Arguably, Bella occupies more of a queer position in the text than Edward. She vehemently opposes traditional marriage, telling Edward "I'm not *that girl*...The

⁸⁸ *Eclipse*, p233

⁸⁹ *Seduced by Twilight*, p122

⁹⁰ 'A Very Queer Refusal: The chilling effect of the Cullens' heteronormative embrace', *Bitten by Twilight*, p113

⁹¹ *Ibid*, p114

one who gets married right out of high school like some small-town hick who got knocked up by her boyfriend!”⁹² Bella’s resistance to heteronormative traditions is eventually overcome, restoring a patriarchal order; however, her feelings occupy a significant portion of the text, challenging these models to some degree. Furthermore, Bella seems resistant not only to marriage, but to monogamy itself. The fact that she finds herself in love with Jacob as well as Edward contains an implicit undertone of polyamory. Although she wants her chosen life as a vampire and a member of the Cullen family, she does not wish to abandon her potential future with Jacob; “The worst part is that I saw the whole thing – our whole life. And I want it bad, Jake, I want it all.”⁹³ Only marriage can put Bella’s world in its ‘proper place’ and confirm her heterosexuality.⁹⁴ The *Twilight* novels, like earlier Gothic novels, champion patriarchy and heterosexuality; however, they do so by embracing, rather than rejecting, the figure of the vampire.

The *Twilight* series’ heteronormativity and focus on marriage is unsurprising, considering that Meyer has confessed that her religious beliefs ‘[colour] everything she writes’.⁹⁵ Deborah Laake states that ‘The importance of marriage was the primary lesson of my Mormon girlhood’, whilst homosexuality is considered a sin by the LDS Church.⁹⁶ In his essay ‘The Hypocrites of Homosexuality’, Orson Scott Card, a Mormon author quoted by Meyer in the *Twilight* series, argues strongly against tolerance of gay and bisexual people in

⁹² *Eclipse*, p275

⁹³ *Ibid*, p600

⁹⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p49

⁹⁵ Alisa Valdes-Rodriguez, ‘The politics of wizards and vampires’, *Racialicious*

⁹⁶ *Secret Ceremonies*, p17

the Church of Latter-day Saints.⁹⁷ Gay Mormons are required to ‘remain both chaste and celibate’; the religion’s attitude to homosexuality suggests that same-sex attraction is seen as akin to a mental illness.⁹⁸ The official line of the Church of Latter-day Saints states that ‘homosexual *behavior* is a sinful moral choice rather than an acceptable lifestyle option or unavoidable part of someone’s personality’, but continues by arguing that ‘most Mormons recognize that some people...truly struggle with unwanted homosexual impulses’.⁹⁹ Queer sexualities are pathologised as ‘same-gender attraction’, a condition for which one ‘can usually get enlightened assistance from LDS-affiliated therapists...[who] help their clients reclaim what the Church teaches is their God-given heterosexuality’.¹⁰⁰ This passage codes gay feelings as ‘gender development’ that has gone ‘off-kilter’ and which must be rebuilt into a ‘proper sexual identity’.¹⁰¹ The description of homosexuality as ‘same-gender attraction’ that requires help from ‘therapists’ implies that gay, lesbian and bisexual people are suffering from a mental disorder rather than a legitimate sexual orientation. This pathologising of queer sexuality is in keeping with Gothic tropes, where the deviant figure of the vampire is associated with madness and the abject.

⁹⁷ ‘When one’s life is given over to one community that demands utter allegiance, it cannot be given to another. The LDS church is one such community. The homosexual community seems to be another. And when I read the statements of those who claim to be both LDS and homosexual, trying to persuade the former community to cease making their membership contingent upon abandoning the latter, I wonder if they realize that the price of such “tolerance” would be, in the long run, the destruction of the Church.’ (Orson Scott Card, ‘The Hypocrites of Homosexuality’, *Sunstone* magazine, first published in 1990)

⁹⁸ *Mormonism: A very short introduction*, p59

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*

In contrast to the *Twilight* saga, the *Tantalize* series normalises same-sex relationships, positioning them as equally valid as their heterosexual counterparts. In *Tantalize*, Quincie mentions a same-sex couple amongst the clientele at *Sanguini's*; 'I refilled water and wine glasses, helped the busers clear tables, and conferred in the hall with the lead singer from Luminous Placenta about placing a ruby-and-diamond engagement ring on her girlfriend Amber's blood cakes'.¹⁰² This casual reference to a same-sex couple normalises non-heterosexual relationships. *Diabolical* introduces a secondary character, the young half-Wereotter Evelyn, who talks candidly about her relationship with her girlfriend Ollie.¹⁰³ Although the series does feature some gay, lesbian and bisexual characters portrayed in a negative light, it is emphasised that it is not their homosexuality that makes them antagonists:

Ruby licked her lips as though she could read my mind, and before I knew it, bent to kiss me, kiss *me* on the lips. Warm, wet, smiling. Pulling back, her upturned green eyes peered into mine.

It was possible, I thought, that in time I might grow to hate her.
Good kisser, though.¹⁰⁴

The homoerotic nature of Ruby's kiss is not problematised; it is the fact that it occurs without Quincie's consent that is portrayed as immoral. Indeed, there are hints that Quincie herself is bisexual. This is implied not only by her description of Ruby as a 'good kisser', but by her thoughts regarding other young women, such as her classmate Quandra Perez; 'tall, dark, zowie, the kind of girl even straight

¹⁰² *Tantalize*, p198

¹⁰³ *Diabolical*, p122

¹⁰⁴ *Tantalize*, pp103-104

girls lusted after'.¹⁰⁵ Quincie consistently thinks of attractive women in the same terms as attractive men, and does not seem to include herself in the 'straight girls' she describes as 'lusting' after Quandra. Although she is in love with Kieren, the narrative encourages the reader not to assume that Quincie is heterosexual, undermining assumptions of heteronormativity.

To a certain extent, the *Tantalize* series continues with the tradition of using the vampire as a metaphor for homosexuality, particularly with regards to attitudes towards LGBT rights in contemporary American society. Quincie, already a potentially queer figure, feels that she cannot 'come out' as a vampire to her guardians, Mr and Mrs Morales. She fears that the Morales' anti-vampire stance, a result of their connections with the shifter community, will result in rejection and possibly in an attempt to kill her. At one point, underscoring the parallels between Quincie's vampiredom and the predicament of a gay or bisexual teenager in a homophobic family, Quincie literally hides in the closet to avoid outing herself; 'I shut myself in Kieren's closet, a hand gripping the handle of each plastic jug of holy water'.¹⁰⁶ However, while Leitch Smith's treatment of LGBT issues initially seems liberal, it draws upon dialogues of assimilation.¹⁰⁷ The *Tantalize* series' 'queer' characters are, upon closer reading, somewhat conservative. Quincie's relationship with Kieren is, despite her vampirism and his lycanthropy, a heteronormative, monogamous pairing. Same-sex marriage is a contentious issue in America, particularly in Republican states such as Texas,

¹⁰⁵ Ibid, p95

¹⁰⁶ *Blessed*, p111

¹⁰⁷ In this case, assimilation relates to conforming to normative expressions of sexuality, rather than culture.

where *Tantalize* is set.¹⁰⁸ However, while support of same-sex marriage is generally viewed as a liberal standpoint, some radical gay rights activists have critiqued the institution as an attempt at assimilation into heteronormative society. In his article 'Same-Sex Marriage: A queer critique', Michael C. LaSala points out the inherent conservatism of the privileged status of marriage in American society:

One could argue that we currently have a caste system of married people versus singles whereas unmarrieds must, for example, pay more for their own health insurance and suffer marginalization and stigma in our traditional family-oriented culture. Same sex marriage will likely perpetuate and replicate these inequities among gays and lesbians.¹⁰⁹

Similarly, a Chicago-based group, QUASH (Queers United Against Straight Acting Homosexuals) argues that 'gay and lesbian politics and activism all too often plays into the hands of normative culture, reinforcing its values, beliefs, and status'.¹¹⁰ In short, the fact that *Tantalize* contains implicit support of same-sex marriage and relationships does not mean that it opposes the inherent conservatism of the Gothic genre. The world of *Tantalize* is LGBT-friendly, critiquing homophobia and discrimination; however, it resists queerness, instead presenting a conformist view of non-heterosexual relationships. This assimilation

¹⁰⁸ In 2005, Texas introduced an amendment to its state constitution that specifically banned same-sex marriage. According to an article in *Reuters*, 'Rick Perry, the current governor [of Texas] and former Republican candidate for president, has said he "believes in the sanctity of marriage between a man and a woman, regarding it as the linchpin of the family unit and, thus, society as a whole."' (Jim Forsyth, 'Texas couples go to court to overturn same-sex marriage ban', *Reuters* (www.reuters.com/article/2014/02/11/us-usa-gaymarriage-texas-idUSBREA1A1LH20140211), accessed 11th February 2014)

¹⁰⁹ Michael C. LaSala, 'Same-Sex Marriage: A queer critique', *Psychology Today* (<http://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/gay-and-lesbian-well-being/201106/same-sex-marriage-queer-critique>)

¹¹⁰ Nikki Sullivan, *A Critical Introduction to Queer Theory* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003), p46

to non-queer paradigms is set in opposition to the series' subtle undermining of racial assimilation.

Tantalize's focus on gay and lesbian couples is another element that distinguishes the series from the *Twilight* saga. Meyer's idealised vampires do not express any obviously homophobic attitudes, but the society portrayed in the novels is staunchly heteronormative. There are no gay characters in the novels; indeed, the closest to a canon gay or bisexual character is a non-speaking guest in the wedding scene of the fourth film:

You've never heard of a gay character in the *Twilight* books or film series – until now.

Author Stephenie Meyer retold a fun story from the set of *Breaking Dawn: Part 1*...It involved her time filming the wedding scene in which she was an extra...“I was sitting with [producer] Wyck Godfrey...and we made up a backstory: He was a deputy policeman, and our marriage was on the rocks because he was in love with [Bella's father] Charlie.”¹¹¹

This character, created as a joke, is given no prominence in the film. The absence of gay and bisexual characters erases queerness within the series; queer sexualities are a punchline, rather than a legitimate part of the fictional world. Furthermore, homophobia is not absent from the novels. The way that the series' anti-LGBT attitudes manifest carries further problematic inferences with regards to Native peoples, as the only characters to display overt homophobia in the *Twilight* series are the Quileute werewolves. At the end of *Eclipse*, Leah confronts Jacob about his obsession with Bella:

“This is making me sick, Jacob. Can you imagine what this feels like to *me*? I don't even *like* Bella Swan. And you've got me grieving over this

¹¹¹ Andrew Sims, 'Stephenie Meyer tells story of creating only known gay *Twilight* character played by the saga's producer', from *Hypable* (www.hypable.com/2012/08/14/twilight-gay-character)

leech-lover like I'm in love with her too. Can you see where that might be a little confusing? I dreamed about kissing her last night! What the hell am I supposed to do with *that*?"¹¹²

Jacob's response to Leah contains similar sentiments:

"If you're upset about gender confusion, Leah...How do you think the rest of us like looking at Sam through your eyes? It's bad enough that Emily has to deal with *your* fixation. She doesn't need us guys panting after him, too."¹¹³

In this passage, same-sex attraction is described as 'gender confusion', a diagnosis similar to the 'off-kilter gender development' that forms the Mormon view of non-heterosexual sexualities. Sexuality is conflated with gender identity, something that suggests both a heteronormative and a transphobic perspective; according to this stance, the only circumstance under which a woman could be attracted to another woman, or a man to another man, is if they are 'confused' about their gender. This lack of distinction between gender and sexuality is not unusual; according to DePalma and Atkinson, 'transgressing sexual norms evokes fear and anger that gender norms have been transgressed as well, and the easy confluences of sex/gender/sexuality allow homophobia and misogyny to work hand in hand to castigate those who transgress any category defined by the heterosexual matrix'.¹¹⁴ In short, heteronormative ways of thinking feed into misogyny and transphobia, treating any non-stereotypical presentations of sexual or gender identity as 'Other', and therefore as dangerous. Later, Leah makes

¹¹² *Eclipse*, pp621-622

¹¹³ *Ibid*, p622

¹¹⁴ Renée DePalma and Elizabeth Atkinson, 'Exploring gender identity, queering heteronormativity', *Invisible Boundaries: Addressing sexualities equality in children's worlds*, edited by Renée DePalma and Elizabeth Atkinson (Stoke on Trent: Trentham Books Limited, 2008), p127

another homophobic joke at Jacob's expense; following an emotional conversation with Jacob's childhood friend Quil, she comments '*Thought you were going to make out with him*'.¹¹⁵ Once again, queer sexualities are treated as a punchline.

The negative attitude towards homosexuality displayed by Meyer's Native characters is another example of the *Twilight* series' outsider perspective. Traditionally, many Native cultures were accepting of same-sex relationships, or of fluidity in individuals' gender identities:

In truth, the ground American society occupies may once have been the queerest continent on the planet. The original peoples of North America, whose principles are just as ancient as those of Judeo-Christian culture, saw no threat in homosexuality or gender variance. Indeed, they believed individuals with these traits made unique contributions to their communities.¹¹⁶

Although it is important to remember that pre-contact American Indian cultures were not monolithic, it is true that 'alternative gender roles were among the most widely shared features of North American societies'.¹¹⁷ Acceptance of LGBT individuals and relationships, and of people who blurred gender boundaries, shared a similar near-universality amongst pre-contact tribes with social conventions such as respect for the elderly. According to Harriet Whitehead, 'Gender-crossers of some variety have been reported in almost every culture area of Native North America'.¹¹⁸ Rather than being Othered, pre-contact

¹¹⁵ *Breaking Dawn*, p265

¹¹⁶ Will Roscoe, *Changing Ones: Third and fourth genders in Native North America* (Basingstoke: Macmillan Press, 1998), p4

¹¹⁷ *Ibid*, p7

¹¹⁸ Harriet Whitehead, 'The bow and the burden strap: A new look at institutionalized homosexuality in Native North America', *Sexual Meanings: The cultural construction of gender*

American Indians who did not conform to heterosexuality or traditional expressions of gender were valued by their societies, often becoming holy men or women.¹¹⁹ These attitudes only altered as a result of colonisation, as stated in *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-time Indian*: 'Of course, ever since white people showed up and brought along their Christianity and their fears of eccentricity, Indians have gradually lost all their tolerance [for LGBT people]'.¹²⁰ According to Bleys, homophobia was inherent in the attitudes of colonists towards Native peoples; 'the American Indian too was described by some as 'feminine'...Gabriel Sagard claimed that "one can hardly distinguish the face of a man from that of a woman"...and described the lack of facial hair...among American men as a sign of feeble masculinity'.¹²¹ However, by making the Quileute characters the only proponents of homophobic attitudes, the *Twilight* series implies that homophobia is a Native problem, rather than an attitude endemic in modern American society. Once again, the Quileutes' history as a colonised people is erased, the 'savage' werewolves portrayed as less tolerant than the enlightened Cullen vampires.

and sexuality, edited by Sherry B. Ortner and Harriet Whitehead (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), p80

¹¹⁹ According to Roscoe, 'men who wore women's clothes and did women's work became artists, innovators, ambassadors, and religious leaders, and women sometimes became warriors, hunters, and chiefs. Same-sex marriages flourished and no tribe was the worse for it – until the Europeans arrived' (*Changing Ones*, p4)

¹²⁰ *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-time Indian*, p155

¹²¹ Rudi C. Bleys, *The Geography of Perversion: Male-to-male sexual behaviour outside the West and the ethnographic imagination 1750-1918* (London: Cassell, 1996), p45

Captivity Narratives and Neutered Wolves: *Twilight's* white-Native relationships

Like same-sex relationships, mixed-race relationships have historically been treated as Other in American society. In her critical text *White Women, Race Matters*, Ruth Frankenberg points out the divisive potential of interracial relationships in the United States:

Interracial sexual relationships have been a charged aspect of American culture, politics, and law since the beginning of Anglo settler colonialism. Marriage between whites and men or women of color was either actually illegal or not constitutionally protected for most of the past four hundred years. The first anti-miscegenation law...was acted in Maryland in 1661, prohibiting white intermarriage with Native Americans and African Americans. Ultimately, over the next three hundred years, thirty-eight states adopted anti-miscegenation laws.¹²²

These laws are not a thing of the distant past; Alabama did not repeal its ban on interracial marriages until November 2000, and 40% of Alabamans voted for the ban to be upheld.¹²³ Furthermore, polls suggest that a large number of Americans oppose interracial marriage even in the present day. A poll from 2012 revealed that 29% of Republican voters in Mississippi and 21% in Alabama believed that interracial marriage should be illegal; in November 2011 Kentucky church banned an interracial couple from attending services; and in May 2011 a secretary was fired from her church in Tennessee after her employers found out that her husband was black.¹²⁴

¹²² Ruth Frankenberg, *White Women, Race Matters: The social construction of whiteness* (London: Routledge, 1993), p72

¹²³ Suzy Hansen, 'Mixing It Up', *Salon* (www.salon.com/2001/03/08/sollors), accessed 11th February 2014

¹²⁴ HuffPost Weddings, 'Interracial Marriage: Many Deep South Republican voters believe interracial marriage should be illegal', *The Huffington Post*

Twilight, *Tantalize* and *Wolf Mark* all feature mixed-race relationships, both in a fantastic and non-fantastic context. Quincie and Kieren's relationship is considered controversial primarily because he is a half-werewolf and she is a human, and later a vampire. However, Quincie is also Italian-American, while Kieren is Mexican-American on his father's side. It is possible that Kieren and Quincie would face opposition to their relationship because of Kieren's ethnic background. If this is read as a parallel to the fantastic element of their 'mixed relationship', then several aspects of the text, particularly the first novel, take on a more nuanced meaning. *Tantalize* establishes that shifters do not use hospitals or other similar institutions where identification would be required. This distinction between humans and shifters parallels historical segregation laws. Quincie reveals that her Uncle Davidson had 'started treating Kieren like a potential niece defiler about the time we hit adolescence',¹²⁵ and he later tells her that he had Bradley transform her into a vampire because of their relationship; "It was best for everyone. You were, you and that boy...That beast."¹²⁶ The subtext of Davidson's bigotry is in keeping with the concept of opposition to an interracial relationship; Davidson literally prefers that Quincie be dead rather than romantically and sexually involved with a racial 'Other'. Davidson supports the stereotypical view that men of colour are a sexual threat to white women; his villainous status means that this view is presented as problematic, and thus challenged within the text.

(www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/03/12/interracial-marriage-deep-south_n_1339827.html), accessed 11th February 2014

¹²⁵ *Tantalize*, p28

¹²⁶ *Ibid*, pp237-238

A further deconstruction takes place in the fact that the real sexual threat to Quincie occurs in the form of a white man, Bradley. The moment of Quincie's transformation reads like either the precursor to or the aftermath of a rape scene:

The wine had been drugged...That seemed likely, given that the next clear realization I had was that someone had tied me to the rusty antique iron frame of a twin bed...My gym clothes were gone, and in their place, I was wearing a long, gauzy white nightgown. Sleeveless. Classy in a Victoria's Secret kind of way. Beige thong in place. Barefoot. Virginal, bridal, sacrificial.¹²⁷

Until this point, the novel has presented Brad's seduction from the perspective of Quincie, a young and inexperienced girl who reads his advances as romantic; 'I climbed off the chair, Brad spun me, and then we were waltzing, a skill I owed to the valiant six-week effort of a middle school gym teacher. Brad was good, a strong lead'.¹²⁸ However, following her transformation, Quincie realises that she has been groomed, expertly manipulated by Brad. In keeping with vampire lore, this process of sexual assault is related to blood; Brad captures and transforms Quincie by feeding her his own blood hidden in 'Blood and tongue sausages...rice pudding blood cakes...For all I knew, Bradley had been dosing me since that first bowl of rigatoni marinara'.¹²⁹ Leitch Smith's narrative plays on colonial depictions of white masculinity as civilised and refined, a 'chivalric model of manliness' that, according to colonialist dialogues, conveyed an inherent 'superiority'.¹³⁰ *Tantalize* exposes this 'chivalric' male sexuality as a façade, hiding a manipulative nature associated with processes of colonisation. Rather

¹²⁷ Ibid, p232

¹²⁸ Ibid, p136

¹²⁹ Ibid, p239

¹³⁰ Revathi Krishnaswamy, 'The Economy of Colonial Desire', *The Masculinity Studies Reader*, p292

than the 'dark stranger' of the traditional Gothic, the narrative plays on fears and tensions established within the suburban Gothic; the threat comes from the familiar, rather than the Other.

In opposition to the *Tantalize* series' deconstruction of the trope, the concept of the sexually threatening man of colour is prevalent in the more popular *Twilight* saga. According to R. W. Connell, 'masculinities are not only shaped by the process of imperial expansion, they are active in that process and help to shape it'.¹³¹ This is true not only of depictions of masculinity, but of the related representations of male sexualities. There are problematic aspects to the description of Sam's rescue of Bella in *New Moon*. Although he has no malicious intent, Sam is described in threatening terms. Bella is 'carried away by a stranger', an occurrence which fails to frighten her only because she is in a state of shock.¹³² Sam is coded as an aggressor even when aiding Bella. This introduction sets the tone for Sam's role in the rest of the series; he is consistently represented as a threat to the Cullens, culminating in his plan to destroy the family in *Breaking Dawn*. Furthermore, critics have noted that the image presented in Sam's introduction in *New Moon* – a physically powerful Native man carrying off a delicate, unwilling white woman – links back to a trope found in a popular genre of colonialist texts, the captivity narrative.¹³³

There is a great deal of controversy around the captivity narrative, with regards to both its role in literature and its historical context. The capture of settlers by American Indian tribes remains a contentious issue (see Appendix

¹³¹ R. W. Connell, 'The History of Masculinity', *The Masculinity Studies Reader*, p245

¹³² *New Moon*, p76

¹³³ 'Trailing in Jonathan Harker's Shadow', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p197

Five). There is a large amount of evidence to suggest that, while some captives did indeed suffer violent treatment, many were adopted as part of their captors' tribe.¹³⁴ For female captives, life with Native peoples often provided them with more opportunities than they would have been able to achieve in white society – as observed by Allen, women were revered in the majority of Native cultures. Castiglia argues that captivity 'caused many white women to investigate and ultimately to challenge the essentializing white discourses of race on which imperialism rested'.¹³⁵ However, the captivity narrative in literature has traditionally supported pro-settler perspectives; as Castiglia states, the genre was created 'to maintain the established interlocking hierarchies of race and gender in the New World'.¹³⁶ Current social biases 'still [teach] young white women that their greatest enemies are men of color and that they have nothing in common with women of color', a view that supports neo-colonial perspectives.¹³⁷ As a result of this, captivity narratives remain a popular device, and it is unsurprising that the genre is resurrected, at least in part, in the *Twilight* saga. There are two prominent mixed-race relationships in the *Twilight* series – Jacob and Bella, and Jacob and Renesmee. The first of these is constructed along lines that draw upon the trope of the captivity narrative.

¹³⁴ Christopher Castiglia, *Bound and Determined: Captivity, culture-crossing, and white womanhood from Mary Rowlandson to Patty Hearst* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996), pp6-7

¹³⁵ Ibid.

¹³⁶ Ibid, ppix-x

¹³⁷ Ibid, p12

Initially, *Twilight* seems to subvert the traditional pattern of the captivity narrative. Rather than being carried off against her will, Bella impulsively runs away with Jacob after Edward forbids her to associate with the werewolves:

Jacob waved to me urgently.

“Run, Bella!” he yelled over the engine’s roar.

I was frozen for a second before I understood.

...

It was obvious when we had reached the safe zone. The bike slowed, and Jacob straightened up and howled with laughter. I opened my eyes.

“We made it,” he shouted. “Not bad for a prison break, eh?”¹³⁸

This contrasts Castiglia’s model of the archetypical captivity narrative; ‘Savages threaten to rape and enslave the white woman. White men must kill them in order to rescue the woman and restore her to civilized society. Once back, she gratefully submits to patriarchal protection and control’.¹³⁹ Jacob’s ‘capture’ of Bella is initially written as a rescue; following her ‘prison break’, Bella reflects that ‘It felt great to be free’.¹⁴⁰ Furthermore, Jacob is often presented as a healthier romantic option for Bella than Edward. His statement “I was the natural path your life would have taken” is never disputed.¹⁴¹ This seems to favour the young man of colour over the white hero – a hero who is constructed as “the most loving and unselfish and brilliant and decent person [Bella has] ever met”, no less.¹⁴² At this point in the novel, Jacob’s ‘savagery’ has not been fully established.

However, as the novel continues, Jacob is increasingly depicted as a sexual threat, conforming to the damaging stereotype of the man of colour as

¹³⁸ *Eclipse*, pp169-170

¹³⁹ *Bound and Determined*, px

¹⁴⁰ *Ibid*, p171

¹⁴¹ *Eclipse*, pp598-599

¹⁴² *Ibid*, p110

rapist. This is a distinct shift in perspective from the earlier presentation of sexual threats in the series; in *Twilight*, Bella is the victim of an attempted rape by a group of men in Port Angeles, and then a sexualised attack by the evil vampire James; 'After luring Bella in, James presses up against her, stroking her hair'.¹⁴³ These rape threats originate from white men; however, they are only fleeting moments within the narrative. Jacob's increasing aggression towards Bella, meanwhile, is centred and emphasised. The kiss that Jacob forces upon Bella is written in similar terms to those that would be used to describe a sexual assault, and even their later consensual kiss has overtones of sexual aggression:

I knew he would take advantage of the situation. I expected it. I held very still – my eyes closed, my fingers curled into fists at my sides – as his hands caught my face and his lips found mine with an eagerness that was not far from violence.

*I could feel his anger as his mouth discovered my passive resistance. One hand moved to the nape of my neck, twisting into a fist around the roots of my hair. The other hand grabbed roughly at my shoulder, shaking me, then dragging me to him.*¹⁴⁴

The violent language used to describe Jacob's actions codes him as a sexual threat, a potential rapist who is '[trying] to force a response' out of the passive, victimised Bella.¹⁴⁵ Edward is able to 'contain his twin sexual and savage desires for Bella's body'; Jacob, however, is not, and the series uses his lack of control to imply that the Native werewolf's 'savagery' lies much closer to the surface than that of the white vampire.¹⁴⁶

¹⁴³ '(Un)safe Sex: Romancing the vampire', p40

¹⁴⁴ *Eclipse*, p526, my italics.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

¹⁴⁶ 'Blood, Lust and Love: Interrogating gender violence in the *Twilight* phenomenon', p288

From this point in the series, the captivity narrative continues in a conventional pattern, with the '[restoration of] civilized society'.¹⁴⁷ Although Edward does not kill Jacob, he nonetheless defeats him; *Eclipse* ends with the young werewolf running away from Forks, 'letting Jacob Black disappear behind [him]'.¹⁴⁸ Bella then 'submits to patriarchal protection and control' through her marriage to Edward, and her subsequent transformation into a vampire. From Bella's perspective, her transformation is the ultimate form of 'submission' to Edward: 'I wanted *his* venom to poison my system...It would make me belong to him in a tangible, quantifiable way'.¹⁴⁹ 'Belonging' wholly to Edward has the additional implication of entirely rejecting Jacob; the permanent change of becoming a vampire means that the future Bella imagined with Jacob, complete with children, would not longer be possible. Bella submits to the '[restoration of] limits' that signals the conclusion of a Gothic narrative;¹⁵⁰ although *Breaking Dawn* continues for several hundred pages, Bella, now a sublime vampire, no longer grapples with Gothic concepts such as hybridity, transgression of boundaries, or the fragmentation of the body. Although Jacob returns in *Breaking Dawn*, the captivity narrative, like the Gothic narrative, has played out. He is no longer a rival to Edward or a sexual threat to Bella. Instead, Bella realises that 'It was just like before, when we were hanging out in his homemade garage, just two friends killing time. Easy and *normal*'.¹⁵¹ However, the completion of Bella's captivity narrative is not the only event that has produced this outcome. It is

¹⁴⁷ *Bound and Determined*, px

¹⁴⁸ *Eclipse*, p628

¹⁴⁹ *Ibid*, p324

¹⁵⁰ *Gothic*, p7

¹⁵¹ *Breaking Dawn*, p433

equally dependent on another interracial relationship in the series; Jacob and Renesmee.

The Jacob-Renesmee pairing is as complex as the Jacob-Bella relationship, and contains similar colonial elements. Throughout the series, Bella has rarely engaged in the prejudice against the Quileute werewolves displayed by the vampires, and during *New Moon* and part of *Eclipse*, she seems to consider them a part of her extended family. Indeed, her comment in *Breaking Dawn* about always having wanted a large family includes Jacob and Seth, as well as her new in-laws, the Cullens.¹⁵² However, upon realising that Jacob has imprinted on Renesmee, she is furious. Her anger is understandable, as her daughter is a newborn baby; however, her expression of this anger focuses on Jacob's werewolf (and therefore, subtextually, his Quileute) heritage: "You *stupid mutt!* How *could* you? My *baby!*...I've held her all of *one* time, and already you think you have some moronic wolfy claim to her?"¹⁵³ She then condemns Jacob for thinking "you'll be part of my family as my *son-in-law!*", before physically attacking him.¹⁵⁴ The implications of this statement are couched in distinctly racist patterns of thought; some of Bella's best friends are werewolves, but she doesn't want one marrying her daughter.

Although Bella reconciles with the Jacob-Renesmee pairing, there are additional problems in the construction of the relationship between the young werewolf and the hybrid vampire child. In *Eclipse*, when teenage werewolf Quil imprints on the two-year-old Claire, an extended passage is devoted to justifying

¹⁵² Ibid, p298

¹⁵³ Ibid, p449

¹⁵⁴ Ibid, p450

the relationship and dispelling any paedophilic undertones. Jacob tells Bella “There’s nothing *romantic* about it at all, not for Quil, not now...You become whatever she needs you to be, whether that’s a protector, or a lover, or a friend, or a brother.”¹⁵⁵ The narrative continues by emphasising the fraternal and platonic elements of Quil’s affection:

“Quil will be the best, kindest big brother any kid ever had. There isn’t a toddler on the planet that will be more carefully looked after than that little girl will be. And then, when she’s older and needs a friend, he’ll be more understanding, trustworthy, and reliable than anyone else she knows.”¹⁵⁶

Similarly, it is stressed that Jacob’s imprinting on Renesmee has no sexual undertones; he tells Bella “You know I don’t think of her that way! Do you think Edward would have let me live this long if I did? All I want is for her to be safe and happy – is that so bad?”¹⁵⁷ Much like the ‘good Indian’ of colonial literature, Jacob becomes a servant figure, existing to satisfy Renesmee’s whims; the man of colour subordinate and devoted to the white woman.

The narrative also makes it clear that a sexual relationship is inevitably the end result for an imprinted pair. Jacob concludes his description of Quil and Claire’s relationship by asserting that “when she’s grown up, they’ll be as happy as Emily and Sam”,¹⁵⁸ and later reflects that ‘I did think it sucked that [Quil] had a good fourteen years of monk-i-tude ahead of him until Claire was his age’.¹⁵⁹ Jacob encourages Quil to date other women while Claire is a child, leading to a

¹⁵⁵ *Eclipse*, p176

¹⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁵⁷ *Breaking Dawn*, p450

¹⁵⁸ *Eclipse*, p176

¹⁵⁹ *Breaking Dawn*, p153

revelation that introduces another problem in *Twilight*'s depiction of mixed-race relationships. Quil tells Jacob "I don't notice girls anymore, you know. I don't see their faces."¹⁶⁰ The implication is that Quil's imprinting on Claire has resulted in his sexuality becoming dormant until their ages match. *Breaking Dawn* reveals that this is also true for Jacob. After finding out that Renesmee's rapid ageing will end when she reaches physical maturity, Edward notes that "Not once today did [Jacob] think about the fact that...Nessie will be fully matured in just six and a half years," to which Bella responds "He doesn't think of her that way."¹⁶¹ To make his relationship with Renesmee acceptable to the reader, Jacob has effectively been neutered. The metaphorical neutering of Jacob, like the metaphorical sterilisation of Leah, links back to the real-life sterilisation programmes carried out upon Native peoples, as well as the infantilisation of characters of colour in literature. By imprinting on a child, Jacob has been rendered childlike himself. While watching them play, Bella observes that 'Jacob was more of a child than Renesmee sometimes'.¹⁶² This is underscored by the fact that, despite Renesmee's youth, she is already a more dedicated scholar than her future partner: "If you're going to keep up with Renesmee, you're going to have to study a lot harder."¹⁶³ By contrast, Edward, who is almost a century old, does not have to give up his intellectual abilities or his maturity in order to be in a relationship with the seventeen-year-old Bella. There is no need for Edward to change because, unlike Jacob, he is portrayed as having impeccable self-

¹⁶⁰ Ibid, p155

¹⁶¹ Ibid, p750

¹⁶² Ibid, p535

¹⁶³ Ibid, p534

control over his appetites, both for Bella's blood and her body; his 'chivalric model of manliness' contrasts with Jacob's 'savage' boyishness.¹⁶⁴ The danger of Edward having 'a violent, instinctual reaction' to Bella's attempted seductions is threatened at several points throughout the series;¹⁶⁵ however, as Burke notes, 'although Edward *might* lose control at any moment, he never does, and so it is even more poignant that Jacob *does* lose control several times'.¹⁶⁶ Jacob's loss of control is associated with savagery, encompassing a construction of inferior masculinity and conflating the link between Native people and animalistic tendencies. Wilson argues that 'this contrasting depiction of Bella's suitors [and, in Renesmee's case, the comparison between her father and her suitor], with the white vampire as gentleman-hero and the Native werewolf as an aggressive cad, accords to racialised stereotypes of white versus non-white behaviour'.¹⁶⁷ Wilson develops this argument, stating that 'while Edward's sexuality is described as even more violent than Jacob's, his violence is depicted as sexy while Jacob's is framed as abhorrent', in keeping with the aforementioned stereotypes regarding white and non-white masculinity.¹⁶⁸ Jacob is only an acceptable member of Bella's family when he is no longer able to engage in this 'aggressive', 'caddish' and 'abhorrent' behaviour, having regressed to a symbolic childhood. This infantilisation of Jacob's character mirrors colonial constructions of the Indian as a childlike figure who must be taught by benevolent, paternalistic whites. In his

¹⁶⁴ 'The Economy of Colonial Desire', p292

¹⁶⁵ Carrie Anne Platt, 'Cullen Family Values: Gender and sexual politics in the *Twilight* series', *Bitten by Twilight*, p79

¹⁶⁶ Brianna Burke, 'The Great American Love Affair: Indians in the *Twilight* saga', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p214

¹⁶⁷ 'Civilized Vampires Versus Savage Werewolves: Race and ethnicity in the *Twilight* series', *Bitten by Twilight*, p68

¹⁶⁸ *Seduced by Twilight*, p130

essay 'The Facts of Blackness', Frantz Fanon writes 'The white man...had woven me out of a thousand details, anecdotes, stories', arguing that blackness is determined by the overarching dialogues of white Western culture.¹⁶⁹ Jacob, and by proxy the young male Native reader, shares a similar experience; Meyer's depiction of Native male sexuality as volatile and threatening is the latest in a long tradition of depicting the American Indian man as a savage sexual threat to the white heroine.

The trope of the man of colour as sexual threat to white women not only implies a demonisation of non-white sexuality; it carries further colonial connotations. *Twilight* emphasises the fact that Jacob's love for Bella, though aggressive and potentially destructive, is genuine, as is his love for Renesmee. By contrast, he has shown no interest in Quileute women, beyond a fleeting thought that Leah is 'pretty, maybe even beautiful'.¹⁷⁰ When viewed through the colonialist lens of *Twilight*, and alongside his journey of assimilation into the Cullen family, Jacob's interest in Bella and Renesmee suggests a rejection of his Quileute heritage in favour of settler culture, and a fixation on white womanhood as 'true' womanhood. Fanon discusses the role of sexuality and beauty standards in creating internalised inferiority in colonised peoples:

Out of the blackest part of my soul, across the zebra striping of my mind, surges this desire to be suddenly *white*...who but a white woman can do this for me? By loving me she proves that I am worthy of white love.

...
When my restless hands caress those white breasts, they grasp white civilization and dignity and make them mine.¹⁷¹

¹⁶⁹ Frantz Fanon, 'The Facts of Blackness', *The Masculinity Studies Reader*, p233

¹⁷⁰ *Eclipse*, p621

¹⁷¹ Frantz Fanon, *Black Skin, White Masks*, translated by Charles Lam Markmann (London: Pluto Press, 1986; first published 1952), p63

Wilson describes Jacob's use of the Cullens' house and cars as a process of assimilation; I believe that the focus on Jacob's sexual interest in Bella, and his future pairing with Renesmee, also serve to centre whiteness as pure and something towards which to aspire.

Although the narrative stresses that Jacob has no sexual interest in Renesmee, it is also clear that, when she reaches maturity, his feelings will change. Furthermore, it is apparent that he has had sexual longings for Bella; 'I couldn't stop myself...Bella in *my* arms, Bella sighing *my* name...' ¹⁷² In much the same way as Bella wishes to become like the Cullens, Jacob, unhappy with both his life on the reservation and his status as a werewolf, wishes to become like Bella. ¹⁷³ His longing for Bella to be 'round with [his] child' suggests a wish not only to possess her, but to inextricably combine himself with her, thus attaining an element of whiteness. ¹⁷⁴ Here, as in many other areas, Jacob differs from Lucas. Lucas has no interest in 'proving himself worthy of white love', distancing himself from Marina's advances. For Lucas, the love of his family and community is enough. While Jacob seeks the love of figures that the narrative positions as his superiors, Lucas is secure in the love that he shares with his father, his late mother, and Uncle Cal.

¹⁷² *Breaking Dawn*, p182

¹⁷³ Jacob refers to his house and belonging as 'crappy' (*Breaking Dawn*, p145), and focuses on the luxurious nature of the Cullens' possessions: 'another car – a standout even in the long line of vehicles that were mostly all droolworthy in their own ways...Did he actually *mean* to give me the keys to an Aston Martin Vanquish, or was that an accident?' (*Breaking Dawn*, p329). He refers to his transformation into a werewolf as "the most...horrible, the most terrifying thing I've ever been through – worse than anything I could have imagined." (*New Moon*, p319)

¹⁷⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p182

On the Rez: Relationships between Native characters

The majority of relationships in the *Twilight* series are between white people, or a white person and a Native person; however, there are some noteworthy relationships between Quileute characters. The most prominent mention of these relationships occurs when Edward reveals the reason for Embry carrying the werewolf gene, and carries negative connotations:

“His mother moved down from the Makah reservation seventeen years ago, when she was pregnant with him. She’s not Quileute. Everyone assumed she’d left his father behind with the Makahs. But then he joined the pack...the prime candidates for his father are Quil Aleara Sr, Joshua Uley, or Billy Black, all of them married at that point, of course.”¹⁷⁵

One could argue that portraying affairs and other marital problems within a community is realistic; however, there is no equivalent amongst the white community of Forks. Infidelity is depicted as a problem on the reservation, but not in white society; even the flighty Renée did not start seeing other men until she had left Charlie. This echoes colonial views of non-white sexuality being uncontrollable whilst white sexuality is restrained, a distinction that parallels the differences between the volatile werewolves and the cool, controlled vampires. This is the only mention of Embry’s mother in the series, and depicts as an adulterous woman who ensnares married men, a cardinal sin in the pro-marriage world of *Twilight*. Edward continues, “Now Sam, Jacob, and Quil all wonder which of them has a half-brother. They’d all like to think it’s Sam, since his father was never much of a father. But the doubt is always there. Jacob’s never been

¹⁷⁵ *Eclipse*, p418

able to ask Billy about that.”¹⁷⁶ The implication here is that fathering an illegitimate child is as morally repugnant as being abusive and neglectful, as Sam’s father was.

By having adultery associated only with the Quileute characters, *Twilight* contributes to a long-standing social and literary narrative that denigrates non-white sexuality. Women of colour are presented as hypersexualised, ‘constructed as promiscuous’ as a deliberate contrast to the image of the pure white woman,¹⁷⁷ whose purity is ‘theoretically dependent’ upon this ‘pathologized’ non-white female sexuality.¹⁷⁸ The distinction between Embry’s mother and Renee is important. Renee remarries several years after leaving Charlie; Embry’s mother has an affair before leaving the man assumed to be Embry’s father, and there is no indication that she marries later, or, indeed, was married at all. In the context of the emphasis placed on marriage in the *Twilight* saga, the story of Embry’s mother contains silent condemnation of her choices, her sexuality, and the choices and sexualities of the three potential fathers. All of these characters exist outside of whiteness, and therefore, the narrative implies, outside of ‘civilisation’.

The series’ presentation of relationships between the werewolf Quileutes are even more contentious than those of their human counterparts. This becomes apparent when considering the relationships between Sam and Leah, and between Sam and Emily. In both cases, these relationships are

¹⁷⁶ Ibid, pp418-419

¹⁷⁷ *White Lives*, p4

¹⁷⁸ Evelyn Hammonds, ‘Black (W)holes and the Geometry of Black Female Sexuality’, *Feminism Meets Queer Theory*, edited by Elizabeth Weed and Naomi Schor (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1997), p141. One example of this contrast can be found in the 1953 Disney version of *Peter Pan*, where Tiger Lily performs a sexualised dance for Peter, to Wendy’s shock and disapproval.

characterised by an imbalance of power. Sam's Alpha status gives him absolute control over Leah, which he abuses. Although their romantic relationship is over, he keeps her close by, despite the emotional pain that this causes her – pain which he would be aware of, as a result of the werewolves' mental link. Indeed, when Leah leaves the original pack to go with Jacob, Sam sends a representative to emotionally blackmail her into returning: "Sam wants you back...He wants you home, Lee-lee, where you belong."¹⁷⁹ Although Sam has abandoned Leah in favour of her cousin, he still wishes to possess her; if not physically, then psychically. Leah hopes that her break from Sam's pack will allow her to '*get a job somewhere away from La Push...Maybe take some courses at a community college*', and build an independent future for herself.¹⁸⁰ Leah states that she has been considering this course of action for some time; Sam's attempt to make her return to the La Push pack implies that he is attempting to thwart this aim. Their psychic link means that he would know her plans, and that he is not willing to let Leah go, no matter how unhappy his continued proximity makes her. This stance becomes even more sinister when we consider Leah's position in the pack. As 'the girlie-wolf', she is not one of Sam's 'brothers'; instead, as Sam's ex-girlfriend, her position can be considered equivalent to that of a second wife, occupying a lesser position than Emily. This links Sam with a villainous figure in one of the series' 'Quileute legends', Utlapa, who took several wives, 'something unheard of in the tribe'.¹⁸¹ The significance of this becomes apparent when we consider the potential reading of the series as a

¹⁷⁹ *Breaking Dawn*, pp262-263

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p313

¹⁸¹ *Eclipse*, p248

Mormon fairytale. While non-Mormons continue to associate the LDS Church with polygamy, Bushman states that 'the polygamy charge annoys Mormons because it is so far out of date. The largest body of the Mormons, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints, renounced polygamy in 1890 and officially forbids the practice'.¹⁸² Polygamy, a practice 'painted with a...critical brush', is not associated with the civilised Cullens, but with the 'savage' werewolves.¹⁸³

Arguably, Emily is placed in an even worse position than her cousin. Not only does Leah successfully leave Sam, but her status as a werewolf makes her a physical match for her former partner. Emily, as the object of Sam's imprinting, cannot leave him; furthermore, as one critic comments, 'Emily will always be vulnerable in her relationship with Sam since she lacks the potential to develop into a being with powers equal to her imprinted mate's'.¹⁸⁴ Like Leah, Emily can be read as a victim of abuse. However, the abuse Emily suffers is physical as well as emotional, and she bears the grotesque scars to prove it. The narrative is complicit in this abuse, emphasising the fact that Emily would not have been injured had she not provoked Sam's anger. The illustrated guide to *Twilight* depicts Emily as being to blame for Sam's attack:

She called him a liar and shoved him away. She told him that he was just like his father, that he was running away from his responsibilities like Joshua had.¹⁸⁵

Emily was pleased to see that her insult had struck home...She had just a fraction of a second to enjoy that pettiness.¹⁸⁶

¹⁸² *Mormonism*, pp2-3

¹⁸³ *Seduced by Twilight*, p151

¹⁸⁴ Kristina Deffenbacher and Mikayla Zagoria-Moffet, 'Textual Vampirism in the *Twilight* Saga: Drawing feminist life from *Jane Eyre* and teen fantasy fiction', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p38

¹⁸⁵ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, pp345-346

¹⁸⁶ *Ibid*, p366

Following the attack, Sam asked Emily ‘to tell him to kill himself so that he could escape the misery’ of having harmed her.¹⁸⁷ Both of these elements of the narrative – the fact that Emily is blamed for provoking Sam, and his threat of suicide – are in keeping with abusive patterns of behaviour.¹⁸⁸ Emily’s behaviour after the attack emphasises her status as victim; she has already become emotionally dependent upon Sam, and makes excuses for his violent actions:

Emily had asked for him to visit [her in hospital] because she knew how horrified he would be and how unintentional his action had been. She didn’t want him to blame himself for what was truly an accident. She had already forgiven him. She had also realized...that the one person she really wanted there with her was Sam. She felt lonely and incomplete without him.¹⁸⁹

As Durham notes, Sam’s violence towards Emily is excused by the pack and the community; ‘The fact that he attacked her so savagely that she was permanently scarred matters not a whit...In fact, Emily is held in high esteem among the wolves for her loyalty and understanding of Sam’s uncontrollable outburst’.¹⁹⁰ Emily is admired for standing by her abuser, despite the fact that he could easily harm her a second time.

Emily is not the only character in the series who has experienced domestic violence. In *Eclipse*, we learn that Rosalie’s transition from human to vampire occurred after she was gang-raped and left to die by her fiancé and his

¹⁸⁷ Ibid, p347

¹⁸⁸ The Edmonton Police Service in Canada cite threatening suicide as one sign of abuse (<http://www.edmontonpolice.ca/VictimSupport/WhatIsAbuse.aspx>), while the charity Women’s Aid includes blaming the victim for abusive behaviour as part of the ‘Denial’ aspect of abuse (<http://www.womensaid.org.uk/domestic-violence-articles.asp?section=00010001002200410001&itemid=1272>)

¹⁸⁹ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p347

¹⁹⁰ ‘Blood, Lust and Love: Interrogating gender violence in the *Twilight* phenomenon’, p290

friends. One could argue that this indicates that the series portrays violence against women realistically, as something which happens to women of all ethnicities and social backgrounds. Emily and Sam are working-class and Native, but Rosalie and Royce are white, wealthy and middle-class. However, there are important differences between the two women's stories. Rosalie's transformation allows her to avenge herself, '[overriding] victimization with the ability to exact revenge, without physical or social limits to restrict her'.¹⁹¹ Emily does not gain similar abilities, and so can never avenge her injuries, or defend herself in future against another of Sam's outbursts.¹⁹² Secondly, owing to the nature of imprinting, Emily has no romantic options beyond Sam. Jacob says of Quil and Claire, "Why wouldn't she choose him, in the end? He'll be her perfect match. Like he was designed for her alone."¹⁹³ The implication is that this is true for every imprinted pair. Additionally, the series establishes that a werewolf cannot remain apart from the object of his imprinting without going into a deep depression. As a result of this, it becomes clear that Emily has no choice but to remain with Sam. The contrast between Emily and Rosalie's stories suggests that white women can escape domestic violence and enter into a healthy relationship, but Native women must live with the threat of further violence.

There are also negative implications to the romantic bonds formed by the other werewolves, all of whom imprint on Quileute women and girls. This chapter has already focused on the problematic nature of the relationship between Quil

¹⁹¹ 'Textual Vampirism in the *Twilight* Saga: Drawing feminist life from *Jane Eyre* and teen fantasy fiction', p38

¹⁹² Ibid.

¹⁹³ *Eclipse*, p176

and Claire. None of the other werewolves apart from Jacob imprint on a young child, something which seems to suggest that these relationships are healthier by comparison. Paul imprints on Jacob's sister Rachel, who, it is implied, is close to his age. Their rapid engagement suggests that Rachel is as attracted to Paul as he is to her. Similarly, Jared's relationship with Kim is described as having 'no drama':¹⁹⁴

"[She] was just a girl he'd sat next to in school every day for a year and never looked at twice. And then, after he changed, he saw her again and never looked away. Kim was thrilled. She'd had a huge crush on him. She'd had his last name tacked on to the end of hers all over in her diary."¹⁹⁵

The major problem in Kim and Jared's relationship is the difference in their strength of feeling for each other. A 'huge crush' cannot be compared to the absolute devotion that accompanies imprinting. Additionally, the process of imprinting itself has a disconcerting subtext. Oshiro describes imprinting as 'a combination [of] predestination and something akin to rape',¹⁹⁶ pointing out that 'Meyer has given all the male werewolves the power to choose their soulmate (or have it chosen for them) and has removed any and all consent for those "destined" relationships from the females'.¹⁹⁷ I would take this further; the construction of imprinting in the series removes consent from the women upon whom the werewolves imprint; however, the male werewolves also seem to lose

¹⁹⁴ Ibid, p125

¹⁹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁹⁶ *Mark Reads Eclipse*, p18

¹⁹⁷ Ibid, p20

their power to give or withhold consent following an imprint.¹⁹⁸ As the *Illustrated Guide* to the series reveals, Sam ‘couldn’t even commit suicide without knowing for certain that this was what [Emily] wanted’.¹⁹⁹ The imprinters are programmed to fulfil the every wish of their imprintee, suggesting that they are permanently prevented from acting independently. By contrast, Edward and Bella are still able to make autonomous decisions; prior to the battle with the Volturi, Bella sets up an escape route for Jacob and Renesmee without informing Edward, underscoring her independence from her partner. Furthermore, imprinting occurs as a result of biological urges rather than interest in an individual’s personality or other typically human foundations for a relationship. This links with the stereotype of Native peoples as animalistic; the Quileute werewolves’ romantic relationships are based around ‘breeding’ rather than love.

In contrast to *Twilight’s* Quileutes, *Wolf Mark* offers a positive depiction of a Native couple in Lucas’ parents. Although Lucas’ mother dies before the novel begins, Lucas’ memories of her emphasise a sense of equality between her and his father. One of these memories reveals that Lucas’ mother was a Marine.²⁰⁰ This revelation informs the reader that Lucas’ mother was as physically strong and capable as her husband, despite the fact that, unlike Thomas, she was not a skinwalker. Throughout the narrative, their family relationship is depicted as close and loving. Lucas’ descriptions of life prior to his mother’s death contain no

¹⁹⁸ In *Breaking Dawn*, during a moment of despair over Bella’s probable death, Jacob drives to Seattle in an attempt to imprint: ‘Seemed like maybe getting your choices taken away from you wasn’t the very worst thing in the world. Maybe feeling like *this* was the very worst thing in the world’ (*Breaking Dawn*, p331). Although this passage is intended to reflect Jacob’s sense of hopelessness, it carries connotations of ‘happiness in slavery’, which are reinforced by Jacob’s contentment following his imprinting on Renesmee.

¹⁹⁹ *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide*, p347

²⁰⁰ *Wolf Mark*, p77

suggestion of any tension that a reader might expect between a teenager and his parents; 'Whenever the three of us had time to do anything special together, we'd always go to the nearest wild place – like a national park or a state forest – and run its trails together'.²⁰¹ Many of Bruchac's depictions of romantic relationships between Native peoples write back against the stereotype of Native families as dysfunctional. The parents of the protagonist Molly in his two-part series *Skeleton Man* and *The Return of Skeleton Man*, for example, are similar to Lucas' parents. Both are extremely accomplished; Molly's father has 'a Harvard MBA [and] works for a big bank',²⁰² while her mother 'has a masters degree in social work and has done everything from being a drug counselor in a prison to working with unwed mothers'.²⁰³ In several of his works, Bruchac acknowledges the effects of colonialism and poverty on Native families in his work. For example, the central family in *The Heart of a Chief* are deeply affected by the alcoholism of the protagonist's father. However, creating positive representations of Native couples such as Lucas and Molly's parents can be read as an attempt to represent Native experiences that are not given as much attention in literature as the stereotype of the alcoholic Native adult.²⁰⁴

²⁰¹ Ibid, p5

²⁰² Joseph Bruchac, *The Return of Skeleton Man* (New York: HarperTrophy, 2008; first published 2006), p18

²⁰³ Ibid, p25

²⁰⁴ Bruchac is also the author of *Code Talkers*, a text about the Navajo/Diné Marines whose work was crucial to the American effort in the Second World War. I believe that Bruchac's decision to make both of Lucas' parents ex-Marines was deliberately intended to link to this aspect of Native history.

“A Good Muslim Girl”: Meena, Lucas, and the Egyptian vampires

Twilight's werewolves are not the only non-white characters whose relationships have negative implications. In *Breaking Dawn*, Meyer introduces two Egyptian vampires, Amun and Kebi. The depiction of their relationship incorporates several Western stereotypes regarding gender relations in Islamic and Arab countries. Amun is a humourless, domineering figure; '[He] continued to refuse to touch Renesmee, and would not allow his mate, Kebi, to touch her, either'.²⁰⁵ With regards to Kebi herself, Bella notes '[she] never strayed farther away from Amun than his shadow, and I never heard her speak a single word'.²⁰⁶ In reality, the position of women in Islamic and Middle Eastern communities varies enormously depending on factors such as class, culture, and individual circumstances. While Amun and Kebi's relationship may be an accurate portrayal of some communities or individuals, it is not a norm throughout Middle Eastern societies, or throughout Islamic communities. However, the series' portrayal of the couple presents a homogenous, stereotypical view of Middle Eastern and Muslim relationships. Darraj argues that these stereotypes often result in a white saviourist attitude towards Arab women, particularly among white feminist movements:²⁰⁷

²⁰⁵ *Breaking Dawn*, p609

²⁰⁶ Ibid.

²⁰⁷ This is apparent in, for example, a statement by the French feminist group FEMEN. Following a call by several Muslim feminists asking the group to stop their 'Topless Jihad', the group issued a response that included the lines 'So, sisters, (I prefer to talk to women anyway, even knowing that behind them are bearded men with knives). You say to us that you are against FEMEN, but we are here for you and for all of us, as women are the modern slaves and it's never a question of colour of skin... You say you live the way you want. Being fifth wife in harem the maximum you can be is the favorite wife... Right?' (Inna Shevchenko, 'Topless in the Country of Hijab?', from *Huffingtonpost.co.uk* (http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/inna-shevchenko/femen-topless-in-the-country-of-hijab_b_3034211.html), accessed 17th September 2013)

“Of course, they [meek and silent Arab women] are oppressed; we [liberated assertive Western women with voices] must help *them*.” I have heard similar statements (with the notions in brackets implied) from white American feminists who wanted to save their Arab sisters but not to understand them.²⁰⁸

Darraj argues that ‘anti-Muslim sentiments...are inextricably linked to anti-Arab sentiments’, corresponding with the view of Muslim women as downtrodden and subordinate.²⁰⁹ As a vampire, Kebi should be a powerful figure; however, the narrative does not allow her to fight, or even to speak.

It is no coincidence that this construction of the oppressed Muslim woman is similar to that of the oppressed Native woman. In both cases, it is an idea that has been deliberately created to portray white, Western society as more egalitarian and enlightened than non-white communities, corresponding with tropes identified by Said in *Orientalism*. Amun’s patriarchal authority is represented as more damaging than Carlisle’s. While Carlisle is written as compassionate and an ideal leader, Amun is unpleasant, controlling and cowardly; before the confrontation with the Volturi, he declares that he will change sides if the Cullens appear to be at a disadvantage.²¹⁰ However, both men have an equivalent role; in formal situations, they assume the responsibility of speaking for their families. Amun’s interactions with the Cullens are fundamentally no different to Carlisle’s exchanges with the Volturi. The text emphasises that Kebi is ‘forbidden’ from speaking to the Cullens or interacting with Renesmee; however, it glosses over the fact that Esme is never called upon

²⁰⁸ ‘It’s Not an Oxymoron: The search for an Arab feminism’, p298, brackets in original.

²⁰⁹ Ibid, p305

²¹⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p656

to speak to Aro, or to represent her family. Even when dealing with the werewolves, a man, Edward, speaks on Esme's behalf; "Esme was troubled by the hardships this is putting your pack through...She asked me to speak to you privately about it".²¹¹ Esme does not address this with Jacob herself; instead, a man acts as her representative.

Later in her essay, Darraj comments that 'it doesn't make sense to me *why* Arab culture is attacked as anti-woman, as if no other culture has gender-oppressive traditions of which to be ashamed'.²¹² There are some potentially positive aspects to Meyer's depiction of a Muslim couple in the series; it is never suggested that Kebi is in need of 'rescue'. However, in addition to embodying anti-Islamic sentiments, the inclusion of Amun and Kebi is tokenistic and generalising. This is reflected by the fact that, like the secondary Quileute characters, there is little attempt to differentiate between the characters' appearances; Bella reports that 'the Egyptians all looked so alike, with their midnight hair and olive-toned pallor, that they could easily have passed for a biological family'.²¹³ As Kebi never speaks, she is never developed as a character, and is instead reduced to exotic window-dressing. By choosing not to develop the Egyptian vampires fully as characters, Meyer has allowed her narrative to correspond with damaging stereotypes regarding Islamic peoples, once again presenting white-centric, Western culture as 'civilised'.

In *Wolf Mark*, Lucas' love interest Meena is a Pakistani Muslim. Unlike Leitch Smith and Meyer's narratives, Bruchac emphasises that the potential

²¹¹ Ibid, p272

²¹² 'It's Not an Oxymoron: The search for an Arab feminism', *Colonize This!*, p303

²¹³ *Breaking Dawn*, p609

problems with their relationship are not simply caused by the fact that one party is a werewolf and the other is a human. Instead, he also dwells on the cultural and religious differences between the two characters:

There already were more obstacles between us than jumps in the high hurdles. Now there's a wall taller than the one the Israelis built to keep out the Palestinians...All that Romeo and Juliet had between them were feuding families. Try adding skinwalking on top of religion and different home continents.²¹⁴

Initially, *Wolf Mark's* portrayal of tensions between a Muslim community and Western society seem stereotypical, corresponding with the generalised belief that Muslim girls are meek, dominated by their fathers and other male relatives. Meena often focuses on the restrictions placed on her life, telling Lucas "If I had your freedom...I would get on that motorcycle of yours and just ride until I came to a place where I could do whatever I want."²¹⁵ Meena's father is described as religiously and culturally conservative; after Meena makes a risqué joke, Lucas reflects 'If her father ever heard her make a remark like that she'd probably be on the first plane back to Karachi'.²¹⁶ Later in the novel, another member of the school's Pakistani community, Fala, tells Lucas:

"Just a week ago a Pakistani girl in Europe was burned to death by her own father for going on Facebook and friending men. Mr Kureshi is too modern for that, but he is still very religious. If he knew our Meena was thinking of doing something like riding on a motorcycle with an American boy, she would be on the first airplane to Karachi. So we are stepping in and helping her return to her senses."²¹⁷

²¹⁴ *Wolf Mark*, p179

²¹⁵ *Ibid*, p8

²¹⁶ *Ibid*, p30

²¹⁷ *Ibid*, p173

However, when Mr Kureshi is finally introduced, it is revealed that Meena, Lucas and Fala have made the wrong assumptions about his attitudes; he neither disapproves of nor prevents the relationship. Bruchac not only deliberately subverts common assumptions regarding Muslims, but is also indicating that, despite being the victims of racist stereotypes, Native American peoples are not immune from participating in stereotyping.²¹⁸

²¹⁸ This is another common trend in Bruchac's work; in *The Heart of a Chief*, the protagonist Chris assumes that a new girl at his school is a white girl affecting Native ancestry, when in fact her father is Mohawk.

Chapter Five

Lines in the Sand: Borders, landscape, and liminal space

Former Frontiers: Negotiating colonial and Gothic spaces

Land and landscape play a central role in the history of Native American and Euro-American relations. The settlers' acquisition of land impacted hugely on Native and non-Native cultures; as Blackhawk notes, 'Reconciling the dispossession of millions with the making of America remains a sobering challenge, an endeavour that requires the re-evaluation of many enduring historical assumptions'.¹ During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the majority of interactions between settlers and Native peoples centred around attempts to acquire or retain land.² In *Today is a Good Day to Fight*, Mark Felton describes the centrality of land acquisition to the emerging United States, stating that 'The peace treaty that ended the American War of Independence in 1783 generously awarded the new United States control over all lands east of the Mississippi', a vast acquisition of new land which was soon open to settlers.³ This process of gaining control over large areas of land continued; Felton also writes that 'by 1848 the United States had annexed the Republic of Texas'.⁴ Later, American expansion reached the Great Plains, resulting in '[conflict]...over the

¹ *Violence Over the Land*, pp2-3

² For example, according to Chip Berlet and Matthew N. Lyons, '[President] Jackson and the Democratic Party spearheaded a policy of mass killing and systematic removal to eliminate all Native peoples east of the Mississippi...Jackson encouraged illegal efforts by southern states to extend control over remaining Indian lands and open them up to settlers and speculators, and he refused to enforce treaties, laws, and a US Supreme Court order protecting Native rights'. (Chip Berlet and Matthew N. Lyons, *Right-Wing Populism in America: Too close for comfort* (New York: The Guilford Press, 2000), p41)

³ *Today is a Good Day to Fight*, p13

⁴ *Ibid.*

emigrant trails'.⁵ As a result of these clashes, 'the United States moved to control the Indian peoples who lived on the Plains and remove their power to impede settlement'.⁶ This led to the settling of the Plains, and further eroding of the rights of Native peoples; 'Above all, the whites wanted land upon which to thrive, and the American government was ruthless in the methods it employed to rid the vast lands of the West of their aboriginal inhabitants'.⁷ As these events indicate, understanding issues around control of land are vital to comprehending both this period of American history and the literature that it inspired.

This 'control [of] Indian peoples' was key to the United States' retention of its newly acquired lands, and took many forms. The reservation system allowed the United States power over land which remained in the possession of Native peoples, giving the federal government the final say in the ways in which that land was used.⁸ Much of the land set aside for reservations – often chosen specifically because it was poor farming land that could not be sold off to white settlers – has proven to be rich in resources such as oil and uranium. Fixico argues that, both historically and recently, Native peoples have been required to change their traditional lifestyles in order to survive. Forced to become farmers in the nineteenth century, many tribes are now obliged to adopt Western business practices in order to preserve their remaining land:

⁵ Ibid, p14

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ One of the most prominent examples of this control was the Dawes Act of 1887, also known as the General Allotment Act. This act ensured that the land on reservations, rather than being communal, was divided into allotments to be assigned to all adult Native men. This was intended to encourage traditionally nomadic, hunter-gatherer tribes to adopt sedentary, agricultural lifestyles.

American capitalism, deriving from a tradition of Eurocentricism, has continued through the twentieth century to exploit tribal nations for their natural resources, thus forcing Indian leadership to adopt modern corporate strategies to ensure the survival of their nations and people.⁹

As this passage suggests, changes imposed on Native cultures and lifestyles by a capitalist, Eurocentric society are as prevalent in the present day as they were during the periods of settling and expansion, although the specifics of this capitalist expansion have changed over time. This suggests a process of neo-colonialism; although many Native nations are attempting to bring back traditional practices and values, they must divert much of their energy and resources into negotiating corporate practices in order to survive in modern American society.

Attitudes towards land in colonial literature, and literature set in the colonial period, often reflect the beliefs that prompted policies such as the Dawes Act. Attitudes found in many popular children's novels reflect the 'recurrent themes of cultural dominance, ethnocentricism and racism' that are 'woven throughout the last one hundred years of Anglo exploitation of Indian people and their lands'.¹⁰ Native characters are coded as either hostile predators or relics of a pre-industrial age; either representation places them as 'passive creatures who [form] part of the natural landscape rather than as active, present human beings whose existence, claims, history and culture [merit] attention and consideration'.¹¹ The introduction to this thesis focused on a quote from *Little House on the Prairie*, where one character argues "Treaties or no treaties, the

⁹ *The Invasion of Indian Country in the Twentieth Century*, ppix-x

¹⁰ *Ibid*, piv

¹¹ *White Enough to be American?*, p16

land belongs to folks that'll farm it. That's only common sense and justice."¹² The fact that this statement is not critiqued, combined with the novel's description of American Indians as 'savages', implicitly endorses this possessive, colonial attitude towards Native lands. By contrast, 'white middle-class family behaviors of consumption [are] validated as "natural" despite their negative impact on non-human nature'.¹³

Twentieth-century novels, such as *The Sign of the Beaver*, may avoid the 'wild savage' stereotype found in *Little House on the Prairie*; however, the sense of white entitlement towards land inhabited by Native peoples remains. Towards the end of the novel, the protagonist Matt reflects that 'This was the land his father had cleared to make a home for them all...It was his own land, too'.¹⁴ Matt has carried out the process of 'physically [combating] and [controlling] the environment' that was central to settling the West, and his actions have contributed to the impact of colonisation upon American Indians.¹⁵ When the local Native people leave as a result of the influx of settlers, Matt consoles himself with the thought that 'they said there was no end of land in the west...there must be enough for both white men and Indians'.¹⁶ This naïve belief is never corrected, leaving the young reader to assume that Matt is right, and diminishing colonial guilt for policies such as Indian removal. Fanon writes that 'the colonial world is a world divided into compartments'; by sending Attean and

¹² *Little House on the Prairie*, p132

¹³ Nicole Seymour, 'Down With People: Queer tendencies and troubling racial politics in antinatalist discourse', *International Perspectives in Feminist Ecocriticism*, edited by Greta Gaard, Simon C. Estok and Serpil Opperman (London: Routledge, 2013), pp204-205

¹⁴ *The Sign of the Beaver*, p114

¹⁵ Glenn Hooper, 'Introduction', *Landscape and Empire, 1720-2000*, edited by Glenn Hooper (Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2005), p1

¹⁶ *The Sign of the Beaver*, p117

his clan beyond the frontiers established in the novel, *The Sign of the Beaver* compartmentalises the Native and white characters, allowing the non-Native reader to avoid considering the implications for Attean as a victim of colonialism by placing him out of sight and mind.¹⁷ Matt's idealistic vision of his friend's future does not live up to the reality of 'a gradual erosion of "Indianness"' that comprised the Native experience during the period of Western expansion.¹⁸ In *The Sign of the Beaver*, as in *Little House on the Prairie*, the Native characters become 'invisible to those who did not want to see them'; a process that counter-colonial literature such as Bruchac's *The Heart of a Chief* attempts to undo, rendering Native peoples visible once more.¹⁹

As a result of these processes, the themes of land, boundaries and frontiers play an important role in colonial and counter-colonial literature; concepts such as boundaries, frontiers, and erosion can be applied both to the land of the American West and to its original inhabitants. Richard White argues that 'the boundaries of the American West are a series of doors pretending to be walls', implying the permeable nature of these arbitrary boundaries and emphasising that established borders were continually transgressed by settlers.²⁰ Borders and landscape are also key motifs of Gothic literature. Gothic novels traditionally explore 'the collapse of boundaries separating reality and fantasy,

¹⁷ Frantz Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth*, translated by Constance Farrington (London: Penguin Books Ltd., 1974; first published 1961), p29

¹⁸ *Today is a Good Day to Fight*, p12

¹⁹ Karen Ordahl Kupperman, *Indians and English: Facing off in early America* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2000), p239

²⁰ Richard White, *"It's Your Misfortune and None of My Own": A new history of the American West* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993), p3

fiction and life'.²¹ Transgression of boundaries plays a central role in the Gothic, allowing the narrative to create a contrast between the rational and the uncanny:

Gothic can be said to postulate two zones: on the one hand, the human domain of rationality and intelligible events; on the other hand, the world of the sublime, terrifying, chaotic Numinous which transcends human reason...These are separated by some manner of threshold, and plots invariably involve movement from one site to the other – a movement which, most often, is presented as a transgression, a violation of boundaries.²²

Described by Aguirre as 'Numinous', this kind of setting is more often referred to as liminal space. The similarity between the Gothic and colonial liminal is emphasised by Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, who writes 'the colonial space...is by its very nature a bifurcated, ambivalent space, where the familiar and unfamiliar mingle in an uneasy truce'.²³ This ambivalence allows liminality to become a powerful counter-colonial narrative tool; Colin Graham describes 'the "liminal spaces" of colonial discourse; marginal areas, where the ultimate opposition of coloniser and colonised breaks down through irony, imitation and subversion'.²⁴ Children's literature intersects with these elements of both Gothic and colonial literature, occupying a liminal, 'free-floating setting' where boundaries and landscapes shift, reflecting the malleable identities of the adolescent characters and, potentially, of the reader.²⁵ A recurrent theme in children's and young adult literature is the concept of 'growing up', and narratives from *Peter Pan* to *Twilight*

²¹ *Limits of Horror*, p6

²² Manuel Aguirre, 'Geometries of Terror: Numinous spaces in Gothic, horror and science fiction', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 10 Iss. 2 (2008), p2-3

²³ Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, 'Colonial and Postcolonial Gothic: The Caribbean', *The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction*, p233

²⁴ Colin Graham, ' "Liminal Spaces": Post-colonial theories and Irish culture', *The Irish Review* (1986-), No. 16, Defining Borders: Colony, City, Region (Autumn -Winter, 1994), pp32-33

²⁵ *The Gothic in Children's Literature*, p4

have followed a young heroine as she moves through the liminal space of late childhood into adulthood. As a result, many young adult novels have taken on Gothic tropes, setting the rational space of adulthood in opposition to the 'chaotic' space of adolescence.

When considered alongside the Gothic, the use of landscape, borders and boundary violations in colonial and counter-colonial texts takes on a metaphorical as well as a literal quality, comparable to coming-of-age allegories found in children's literature. Physical borders and frontiers are used to parallel the figurative transgressions described by Aguirre, creating narratives that condemn or celebrate resistance to the boundaries imposed by colonialism. When describing the use of land as a theme in Gothic literature, Botting notes that 'Gothic landscapes are desolate, alienating and full of menace...In the eighteenth century they were wild and mountainous locations'.²⁶ In *The Courage of Sarah Noble*, the reader is introduced to a similarly 'desolate', 'alienating' and 'menacing' landscape; 'Trees, dark and fearful, trees crowding against each other, trees on and on, more trees and more trees...Behind the trees there were men moving...were they Indians?'²⁷ In this passage, the 'menace' of the landscape is directly linked to the presence of American Indians, something also apparent in *Edgar Huntley* and *Little House on the Prairie*.

Similarly, the *Twilight* series, the *Tantalize* novels and *Wolf Mark* all include a strong focus on landscape and location, and on the question of borders and boundaries. In her reading of the *Twilight* saga, Keri Wolf argues that 'Meyer

²⁶ *Gothic*, p2

²⁷ *The Courage of Sarah Noble*, p12

constructs a world containing boundaries that are geographical, physical, and social'; this is also true of the other texts.²⁸ These borders are often literal, such as the 'treaty line' that exists between the Quileute and Cullen territories. However, the texts also exploit the metaphorical potential of the concepts of borders and boundaries, considering notions such as the border between human and inhuman, and the liminal space between childhood and adulthood. This chapter will explore the authors' uses of these themes, and their relation to the novels' colonial and counter-colonial representations of Native peoples.

Monsters in the Woods: Reclaiming rural and urban Gothic space

The landscapes explored in the texts correspond with tropes that surround Gothic landscapes, which are used as a location to '[explore] frontiers: between races, genders and classes; people and machines; health and disease; the living and the dead' – in short, the primary issues dealt with by the Gothic.²⁹ In the *Twilight* saga, the forest surrounding Forks is initially presented as a place of danger. In the first novel, Edward tells Bella "Don't go into the woods alone," informing her that he is "not always the most dangerous thing out there."³⁰ It soon becomes clear that this is an apt warning. During a game of baseball, held in a clearing in the woods, the Cullens encounter the hostile vampire James, who

²⁸ Keri Wolf, 'Bella and Boundaries, Crossed and Redeployed', *The Twilight Mystique: Critical essays on the novels and films*, edited by Amy M. Clarke and Marijane Osborn (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2010), p152

²⁹ Charles L. Crow, 'Introduction', *American Gothic: From Salem witchcraft to H. P. Lovecraft, an anthology*, edited by Charles L. Crow (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013), p2

³⁰ *Twilight*, p168

immediately decides to track and kill Bella. In *New Moon*, the hostile nature of the woods is extended, transforming this part of the landscape into a disorientating and alienating environment. The woods are the site of Edward's abandonment of Bella. The language used in this section is deliberately threatening; 'He pulled me along toward the east side of the yard, where the forest *encroached*'.³¹ After Edward leaves Bella, the forest becomes disorientating, a place where there is no sense of direction or time:

I walked and walked. Time made no sense as I pushed slowly through the thick undergrowth. It was hours passing, but also only seconds. Maybe it felt like time had frozen because the forest looked the same no matter how far I went. I started to worry that I was travelling in a circle, a very small circle at that, but I kept going. I stumbled often, and, as it grew darker and darker, I fell often too.³²

In this passage, Bella must negotiate a frontier that is alien and unfamiliar to her; the forest without the protection provided by Edward. She fails to master this landscape, which threatens to destroy her. Edward's abandonment of Bella in the forest not only shatters her sense of safety and causes her to have regular nightmares; it also leads to her total dissociation from reality:

The thick haze that blurred my days now was sometimes confusing. I was surprised when I found myself in my room, not clearly remembering the drive home from school or even opening the front door. But that didn't matter. Losing track of time was the most I asked from life.³³

This passage explores Bella's deep depression following Edward's departure, touching on the Gothic theme of madness.

³¹ *New Moon*, p67, my italics.

³² *Ibid*, p73

³³ *Ibid*, p102

New Moon constructs the forest as a threat to Bella's life, as well as to her sanity. As the novel continues, she takes up hiking, in an attempt to find the meadow that she and Edward visited in *Twilight*. She begins to master the Gothic space of the forest, but a chance meeting with the vampire Laurent shows that she is not yet powerful enough to survive alone in this environment. This hostile vampire does not hide his wish to feed from Bella; "...you've caught me at a bad time...I was hunting. I'm quite thirsty, and you do smell...simply mouthwatering."³⁴ The forest is represented as the perfect location for a hunt, making the landscape itself complicit in Bella's potential murder; 'He gazed around the small opening in the trees. "The scent will wash away with the next rain. No one will find your body – you'll simply go missing, like so many, many other humans."³⁵ The forest that 'encroached' upon Bella's house now threatens to swallow her entirely, mirroring Laurent's wish to devour her. Elisabeth Bronfen argues that night, in Gothic literature, is a 'counter-site' of the day; similarly, the forest becomes a 'counter-site' of the urban and suburban environments that Bella has previously occupied, such as Phoenix, Forks and Port Angeles.³⁶ Instead of being safe and familiar, the forest is wild and unregulated, and thus becomes a threat to Bella's safety.

The nature of the forest changes, however, as the series continues. The novels' urban spaces are shown to contain great danger – for example, the rapists in Port Angeles – and, in a comparable inversion, the forest is revealed as

³⁴ Ibid, pp240-241

³⁵ Ibid, p241

³⁶ Elisabeth Bronfen, 'Night and the Uncanny', *Uncanny Modernity: Cultural theories, modern anxieties*, edited by Jo Collins and John Jervis (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), p51

a potential sanctuary. At the conclusion of *New Moon*, Bella defies Charlie's authority, threatening to leave home if her father refuses to allow Edward in the house.³⁷ In doing this, her behaviour is comparable to Karen Coats' argument that 'like the revolutionary, the child seeks to test and perhaps throw off the stifling ego-ideals that he or she has internalized as a child under the rule of parents'.³⁸ Importantly, Bella makes this stand in a frontier environment, echoing the image of the bold settler seeking freedom from authoritarian masters; she would join the Cullens in their forest mansion, carving out her own space in *Twilight's* Gothic wilderness. This aspect of the *Twilight* series carries a message that is echoed in *Breaking Dawn* through the Cullens' confrontation with the Volturi; Bella and her chosen vampire family represent early American settlers who wish to gain independence from the authoritarian Old World, represented by Charlie and the Volturi respectively.³⁹ However, while this part of the series is ostensibly counter-colonial, it downplays the Cullens' colonisation of the Quileutes, erasing the colonial aspects of early American history.

In *Eclipse*, the forest is used as the location for a false trail, allowing the combined forces of the Cullens and the werewolf pack to manipulate the newborn vampire army. Here, the forest becomes part of Bella's defences:

I walked slowly, trailing my finger over anything close enough: the rough tree bark, the wet ferns, the moss-covered rocks.⁴⁰

³⁷ *New Moon*, p545

³⁸ Karen Coats, 'Between Horror, Humour, and Hope: Neil Gaiman and the psychic work of the Gothic', *The Gothic in Children's Literature*, p84

³⁹ This is underscored by the focus in the climax of *Breaking Dawn* on the character Garrett, a vampire who fought against the British during the War of Independence:

"The redcoats are coming, the redcoats are coming," Garrett muttered mysteriously to himself and then chuckled once. (*Breaking Dawn*, p680)

⁴⁰ *Eclipse*, p468

I pressed my hand against a rock within my reach...I started for the clearing again, pressing my palm against everything in my path.⁴¹

Although the forest is still dangerous – Bella’s injury is a result of her tripping and falling – she and her companions are able to use this danger to their advantage. The forest becomes a threatening place not for the Gothic heroine, but for those attempting to harm her, thus exploring the full potential of the Gothic. This increasing complexity in the construction of the forest reflects the significance of liminal space within the series. According to Madge and O’Connor, ‘liminality denotes rituals of transition, a “time out of time” where one is “betwixt and between” social status’.⁴² Bella is ‘betwixt and between’ the supernatural and human worlds; although not yet a vampire, her transformation is imminent. The colonial and Gothic tropes inherent in the construction of *Twilight*’s forest make it ‘a bifurcated, ambivalent space, where the familiar and unfamiliar mingle in an uneasy truce’, that reflects the heightened tension of this final stage of Bella’s character arc.⁴³

The liminal shift in the significance of the forest occurs as a result of Bella and the Cullens’ increasing connection to the werewolf pack. Early in *New Moon*, there are reports of a monstrous creature lurking in the woods; stories of a ‘giant mutated grizzly’ abound in Forks.⁴⁴ Bella’s first sighting of the werewolves plays with this threatening depiction of the ‘creature in the forest’. The wolves are

⁴¹ Ibid, p470

⁴² Clare Madge and Henrietta O’Connor, ‘Mothers in the making? Exploring liminality in cyber/space’, *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, New Series*, Vol. 30, No. 1 (Mar.,2005), p84

⁴³ Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, ‘Colonial and Postcolonial Gothic: The Caribbean’, *The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction*, edited by Jerrold E. Hogle (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), p233

⁴⁴ *New Moon*, p194

repeatedly referred to as 'monstrous',⁴⁵ and it is stressed that their size and power is enough to frighten a vampire; 'What reason would a vampire have for fearing an animal? And Laurent was afraid. His eyes were wide with horror, just like mine'.⁴⁶ However, the monstrous nature of the wolves is soon inverted; they ignore the vulnerable human Bella, instead targeting Laurent. Jacob's confirmation that the werewolves' purpose is to protect humans, rather than attack them, lessens the threat of the forest. The development of the Cullens' alliance with the pack continues this trend; during the events of *Eclipse*, Bella hides in the forest, protected by the wolves.

Bella also experiences changes that allow her to reinscribe and claim the Gothic space of the forest, making her another 'monster in the woods'. Following her transformation into a vampire, the forest is no longer a disorientating place; her newly enhanced senses allow her to understand the environment and command this Gothic location:

The forest was much more alive than I'd ever known – small creatures whose existence I'd never guessed at teemed in the leaves around me. They all grew silent after we passed, their breath quickening in fear. The animals had a much wiser reaction to our scent than humans seemed to.⁴⁷

Tabish Khair and Johan Högund argue that 'the old and modern vampire take the reader on trips from the imperial metropolis to the colonial periphery'; the vampire is used as a figure through which to explore complex political issues, as well as other themes such as individual feelings of Otherness. As a vampire, Bella

⁴⁵ Ibid, p243

⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁷ *Breaking Dawn*, p413

colonises and commands this 'colonial periphery', making it her own.⁴⁸ Her new-found gracefulness and her supernaturally strong body mean that the natural hazards of the forest no longer have any effect upon her; 'the rough forest floor [felt] like velvet beneath my bare soles, and the limbs that whipped against my skin [felt] like caressing feathers'.⁴⁹ Furthermore, Bella is no longer at risk from the dangerous presences that lurk within the trees; once the hunted, she is now the hunter.⁵⁰ The beginning of this final third of *Breaking Dawn* stresses the fact that, as the new monster in the forest, Bella is undeniably dangerous. While hunting the elk, she scents a human, and immediately succumbs to her vampiric nature; 'The scent ruled completely. I was single-minded as I traced it, aware only of the thirst and the smell that promised to quench it. The thirst got worse, so painful now that it confused all my other thoughts'.⁵¹ Indeed, it is only Edward's intervention that allows Bella to break off the hunt, sparing the human's life.

⁴⁸ Johan Höglund and Tabish Khair, 'Introduction: Transnational and postcolonial vampires', *Transnational and Postcolonial Vampires: Dark blood*, edited by Johan Höglund and Tabish Khair (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), p2

⁴⁹ *Breaking Dawn*

⁵⁰ 'I let myself drift with the scent, barely aware of my movement as I ghosted down the incline to the narrow meadow where the stream flowed. My body shifted forward automatically into a low crouch as I hesitated at the fern-fringe edge of the trees. I could see a big buck...' (*Breaking Dawn*), p416

⁵¹ *Ibid*, p417

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: filmdr.blogspot.com

Bella's monstrous nature is linked with her femininity and sexuality.

Following the hunt, Edward quips:

"We could go back...Whoever it was out there, if they were men, they probably wouldn't even mind death if you were the one delivering it." His gaze ran over my ravaged dress again. "In fact, they would think they were already dead and gone to heaven the moment they saw you."⁵²

Like Heidi in *New Moon*, Bella as a vampire becomes 'not only the fisherman, but also the bait', a result of her newly-gained extreme beauty and sex appeal.⁵³ This is echoed in Bella's mental linking of Edward's vampiric and sexual natures:

It was a surprisingly sensual experience to observe Edward hunting. His smooth spring was like the sinuous strike of a snake; his hands were so sure, so strong, so completely inescapable; his full lips were perfect as

⁵² Ibid, p424

⁵³ *New Moon*, p483

they parted gracefully over his gleaming teeth. He was glorious. I felt a sudden jolt of both pride and desire. He was *mine*.⁵⁴

Paradoxically, the shifting, liminal space of the forest becomes the site of a clear delineation of the vampire couple's sexual natures. Bound together by their marriage and by their status as vampires, Bella and Edward can embrace and explore their sexualities. Their love and desire no longer cross borders, but exist within safe and permanent boundaries; as vampires, they are unchanging, and as their strengths now match, it is impossible for them to harm each other. Becoming a Gothic creature in a Gothic space has rendered Bella's body and her primary relationship as anti-Gothic; triumphant, permanent, and impervious to damage.

This is not true, however, for all of the Gothic creatures in the series. As this thesis has established, the sublime vampires of *Twilight* are repeatedly contrasted with the abject werewolves. Leah and Jacob continue to reflect the liminal nature of the landscape that they occupy. Their bodies constantly shift, and each character is subject to the whims of another; Leah must obey her Alpha, Jacob, and Jacob his imprinted partner, Renesmee. As a result, they are not able to define their own identities and boundaries, as Bella does; instead, they have these aspects of their characters defined by another. This reflects the neo-colonial undertones of the series; in a fantastic parallel of United States history, the American Indian characters are controlled and regulated by settlers, rather than being allowed autonomy and self-determination. The establishment of the United States has been described as 'not truly a war to throw off the yoke of

⁵⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p425

colonization as is popularly imagined, but...a family squabble among the colonizers to determine who would be in charge of the colonization of North America [and] control the land and the lives of the indigenous inhabitants'.⁵⁵ As this process of colonisation has never been reversed, Gretchen M. Bataille argues that 'America never became postcolonial', a line of reasoning supported by Native critics such as George Tinker and Paula Gunn Allen, who write extensively on the continuing effects of colonisation on American Indian nations. *Breaking Dawn* echoes this history. The Cullens confront the Volturi, in a scene which represents the New World facing down the Old. The werewolf pack become one of the prizes at stake, as indicated by the Volturis' wish for 'guard dogs'. The white vampire settlers impose their authority on the indigenous Quileutes, who are manipulated into perpetuating Western patriarchal structures within their own society, as indicated by Jacob's absolute authority over Leah.⁵⁶ The *Twilight* series builds a neo-colonial narrative on a Gothic framework, presenting the ambiguity of the Gothic space through a colonial lens. Bella does not only colonise and control the forest, but its inhabitants; as Renesmee's mother, she has produced the cause of Jacob's final domestication.

Despite its centring of Gothic space, this section of the novel inverts several aspects of the Gothic genre. The forest remains a Gothic landscape, but the reader now views it from the vampire's perspective. As a result, it is

⁵⁵ Gretchen M. Bataille, 'Introduction', *Native American Representations*, pp14-15

⁵⁶ According to Allen, the imposition of patriarchy was key to the colonisation of Native peoples: '[Colonisation] has included...the degradation of the status of women as central to the spiritual and ritual life of the tribes...Colonization means the loss not only of language and the power of self-government but also of ritual status of all women and those males labeled "deviant" by the white Christian colonizers'. (*The Sacred Hoop*, pp195-196)

established as an accommodating rather than a hostile environment. Overt sexuality, too, is embraced rather than conforming to the traditional Gothic depiction of sexuality as dangerous.⁵⁷ On their honeymoon, the human Bella wakes up 'decorated with patches of blue and purple [bruises]';⁵⁸ after her transformation, the couple can participate in sex with 'No caution, no restraint...no fear'.⁵⁹ Crossing the border from human to vampire has not changed Bella's surroundings or her situation, but instead has altered the way in which she relates to her surroundings, both physical and metaphorical. The Gothic is turned on its head; rather than being saved from a dangerous environment, the heroine transforms to become part of the danger she previously faced. Arguably, this aspect of the *Twilight* series is more subversive than the *Tantalize* series. However, there are distinct differences between the two sets of novels; the most prominent of these is that, rather than being set in a rural environment, *Tantalize* and *Eternal* take place in two major cities, Houston and Chicago. In order to explore the role of the postcolonial Gothic in these texts, it is necessary to analyse the urban as well as the rural Gothic landscape.

⁵⁷ It must be remembered that this sexuality is taking place within the confines of heterosexual marriage, and therefore does not radically subvert the traditional Gothic; the conservatism of the genre means that the marriage of the Gothic heroine to a suitable man would invariably be championed.

⁵⁸ *Breaking Dawn*, p95

⁵⁹ *Ibid*, p482

Vampire Central: Gothic cities and urban landscapes

Gothic landscapes are not limited to rural environments, particularly in modern Gothic literature. If the genre ‘shows us not only the monster, but also ourselves...[drags] our fears out of the shadows and [forces] us to look at them and see who we are’, then it is unsurprising that the increasing urbanisation of Western society has been reflected in a rise in urban Gothic settings in literature.⁶⁰ Botting writes that ‘the modern city combined the natural and architectural components of Gothic grandeur and wildness, its dark, labyrinthine streets suggesting the violence and menace of Gothic castle and forest’,⁶¹ a trend that began as early as *Dracula*.⁶² Indeed, David Punter and Glennis Byron argue that the shift from country to city was key to the increasing popularity of the Gothic novel, stating that ‘the traditional social system collapsed as new types of work and new social rules were established’; the social anxiety caused by these new circumstances was a fertile ground for the creation of Gothic narratives.⁶³ In contrast to a close-knit rural community, the Gothic city comprises of strangers, any of whom may be a threat.

This urban Gothic landscape is apparent in *Eternal*. Leitch Smith begins by portraying the hostile and dangerous landscape through the perspective of a Gothic monster, the neophyte vampire Miranda:

My first trip to the city! It’s big; it’s brash. It’s a bloody blur.

⁶⁰ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, pxxv

⁶¹ *Gothic*, p2

⁶² Stacey Abbott argues that ‘Stoker sought not simply to relocate the Gothic tale to a new location but rather to reconfigure it for the modern world...*Dracula* yearns for more than blood, the “whirl and rush of humanity”’. (Stacey Abbott, ‘Embracing the Metropolis: Urban vampires in American cinema of the 1980s and 90s’, *Vampires: Myths and metaphors of enduring evil*, p125)

⁶³ David Punter and Glennis Byron, *The Gothic* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2004), p7

Father shows off, taking more than he needs. In the loop de loop (Father says it's just called the Loop), he tells me that the investment banker tastes of vodka. Later, at the blues club across town, he mocks the fading beat of a drummer's heart.⁶⁴

Unlike the restrained, 'vegetarian' Bella, whose preternatural self-control allows her to behave like she is "decades rather than days old", Miranda is a true monster.⁶⁵ Before she develops a sense of guilt over killing, she revels in the opportunity to hunt humans and drink blood; 'Our next stop is Greek Town, and, shoving a waiter against a brick wall, I hardly glimpse his face. I'm someplace else, diving into dark liquid, luxuriating in an endless sea...It's bliss'.⁶⁶ To some extent, the monstrous Miranda is a throwback, more aligned with Dracula and Carmilla than the twentieth- and twenty-first century vampires who experience the Gothic city 'not as an intruder but as a native'.⁶⁷ Despite being a modern American girl, Miranda is a newcomer to Chicago, and an 'intruder' preying on the safer human world. Teresa Goddu describes the Gothic as 'the repository for cultural anxieties'; Miranda's killing spree in the city represents fears about the impersonal nature of urban environments, in which people of lower social status, such as teenage runaways,⁶⁸ can be made to disappear with no consequences for the predators who destroy them.⁶⁹ However, as her conscience begins to re-emerge, Miranda shifts back to her former perspective, losing some elements of her monstrous nature. This change begins when she is served a human who

⁶⁴ *Eternal*, p46

⁶⁵ *Breaking Dawn*, p420

⁶⁶ *Eternal*, p47

⁶⁷ 'Embracing the Metropolis', *Vampires: Myths and metaphors of enduring evil*, p138

⁶⁸ 'Within the next hour, Father drops a drained runaway teenager (her bus ticket read *Iowa City*) into a nearby alley and asks, "Thirsty, sugar?"' (*Eternal*, p46)

⁶⁹ 'Vampire Gothic', p126

reminds her of her best friend Lucy; 'I want the girl to be quiet. I want to pluck out her eyes – hazel eyes like Lucy's – and suck them dry. But I can't. Not this time. Not this girl'.⁷⁰ Miranda is stopped from killing when she is reminded of her human connections with others, countering the isolating environment of the urban Gothic space that she inhabits.

When Bella crosses the border between human and vampire, her journey is one-way. Although she retains much of her compassion and conscience, and has no wish to harm humans, it is clear that she is no longer one of them. She reflects that 'It was like I had been born to be a vampire...I had found my true place in the world, the place I fit, the place I shined [sic]'.⁷¹ This irrevocable change in Bella's nature is emphasised by the fact that she needs "pointers on acting human" before Charlie's visit.⁷² Bella's loss of her humanity is positive, but it is a loss nonetheless. For Miranda, however, her transformation into a vampire does not remove her humanity. Instead, she occupies a liminal period in which she is, effectively, both human and vampire. Miranda embodies the sense of 'doubleness'⁷³ often associated with liminal space, and inhabits the 'two zones' that make up the Gothic, 'the human domain of rationality' and the 'Numinous which transcends human reason'.⁷⁴ This 'doubleness' relates not only to her place as part-human, part-vampire, but also to her position as a teenager; the narrative fulfils the Gothic trope of exploring the liminal years of adolescence, and the negotiation of identity. This is in keeping with Bodart's suggestion that

⁷⁰ *Eternal*, p62

⁷¹ *Ibid*, p524

⁷² *Breaking Dawn*, p501

⁷³ *Limits of Horror*, p9

⁷⁴ 'Geometries of Terror: Numinous spaces in Gothic, horror and science fiction', p2

the popularity of vampires is a result of their 'self-acceptance', something appealing to a teenage reader who may be questioning their own identity.⁷⁵ However, Miranda's experiences complicate this reading; ultimately, she does not wish to accept herself as a vampire. Miranda recognises that she still retains some elements of her humanity, however temporary; "This is my chance to die as some remnant of the girl I was, not the...what I've become."⁷⁶ Rather than becoming subsumed by her selfishness and her vampiric nature, Miranda chooses to remove herself from the Gothic space that she inhabits. Her plan is successful; she moves from the urban Gothic landscape of Chicago to the sublime space of the Penultimate, a positive form of Purgatory where she not only is unable to cause harm, but can make amends for her previous crimes.⁷⁷ Like *Dracula's* Lucy, Miranda is redeemed through death; however, unlike her nineteenth-century predecessor, she chooses this path of redemption. Miranda's redemption is a result of her own agency, rather than the decision of a group of male companions, and she retains this agency during her time in the Penultimate.⁷⁸

Through the medium of a specific Gothic location, the forest, the *Twilight* saga explores decisive and irreversible shifts in perspective that render a Gothic landscape safe for the supernatural creatures that inhabit it. Meyer uses Gothic tropes to destroy the Gothic potential of the vampire Bella and her surroundings.

⁷⁵ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, p15

⁷⁶ *Eternal*, p302

⁷⁷ For example, her murder of the weredeer Tamara.

⁷⁸ Although Miranda watches the action of *Diabolical* rather than participating directly, she is not a passive figure. At the end of the novel, she breaks into the Archangel Michael's office to file a 'Lazarus Directive', a piece of heavenly paperwork that will allow Kieren to be resurrected.

Crow argues that 'If the national story of the United States has been one of faith in progress and success and in opportunity for the individual, Gothic literature can tell the story of those who are rejected, oppressed, or who have failed'.⁷⁹ The protagonist Bella ends the series on a triumphant note, '[continuing] blissfully into this small but perfect piece of [her] forever', having mastered both her Gothic powers and the Gothic space that surrounds her.⁸⁰ At the close of *Breaking Dawn*, the only remaining Gothic creatures are the Quileute werewolves, trapped in the liminal space of their own shifting bodies and the physical territory that is no longer theirs, but controlled by the settler-like vampires. By contrast, the *Tantalize* series uses doubleness and 'the collapse of boundaries' to indicate that the Gothic potential of a supernatural creature cannot be transcended, and that Gothic environments still pose a threat to the creatures that inhabit them, or at least to those who hope to be redeemed.⁸¹ Rather than taking the form of monsters, these new threats are temptations that target the monstrous natures of these Gothic creatures. As a former member of vampire royalty, Miranda knows that she would be presented with future opportunities to feed from humans; she asks Zachary to destroy her "If not for me, then for every victim I'd take".⁸² Despite having attained great power, Miranda is still a Gothic heroine who must be saved from darkness. However, the location of this darkness has changed; there has been a shift from an external to an internal threat. The danger of the Gothic has crossed the frontier of Miranda's body; she has become part of the

⁷⁹ *American Gothic*, p2

⁸⁰ *Breaking Dawn*, p754

⁸¹ *Limits of Horror*, p6

⁸² *Eternal*, p303

Gothic landscape, and only extreme action – ordering Zachary to destroy her – can save her from being entirely consumed.

The boundaries explored in *Wolf Mark* are even more complex than those found in the *Tantalize* series. The forest that surrounds Lucas' home is not coded as threatening, unlike the landscape of *Twilight*; instead, it is a safe haven for Lucas even during his time as a vulnerable human:

The roots of an old pine tree reach out far to all the directions. Anyone seeking peace could trace those roots back to the trunk and find shelter under the branches of that symbolic evergreen. I've always felt some of that peace whenever I've come here.⁸³

The safety Lucas experiences is linked with his Native heritage; the pine is 'the Five Nations Pine', and is associated with the Iroquois nation.⁸⁴ However, later in the novel, the reasons for Lucas' feeling of safety alter. Following his transformation, his sense of safety in the forest can be attributed to the fact that, like Miranda and Bella, he has become the kind of monster that traditionally occupies Gothic spaces. Although he is a werewolf rather than a vampire, the text leaves no doubt that Lucas is as dangerous as Bella and Miranda. The danger that Lucas poses to humans is explicitly focused upon in the narrative; at one point, he considers luring a newsreader into the trees to eat him.⁸⁵ Lucas, like Bella, struggles with the challenge of suppressing his monstrous nature. However, the text stresses that the possibility of Lucas being consumed by this monstrosity is not inevitable, as it is with Miranda.

⁸³ *Wolf Mark*, p93

⁸⁴ *Ibid*, p92. Lucas is Abenaki, part of the Algonquian Nation rather than the Iroquois, but reflects that, despite the enmity between the two peoples, 'we were just as often their friends' (p93). This connects with the concept of pan-Indianism, a method of resistance to colonisation.

⁸⁵ *Ibid*, p152

The linking of Lucas' werewolf aspect with his Abenaki background means that the two sides of his nature are not 'bordered'; rather, they coexist, neither good nor evil. The reason for Lucas' Gothic transformation counters a potential problem with Bodart's reading of the Gothic monster as an aspirational figure for adolescent self-acceptance. A marginalised adolescent reading the *Twilight* series, for example a young reader of colour, may not identify with Meyer's vampires as a path to 'insiderhood' or self-acceptance; as Oshiro notes, the vampires of *Twilight* all become white upon transformation, a process that may reinforce the feelings of marginalisation in a non-white reader. Hughes and Smith argue that 'Gothic fiction...opens up to view the power relationships that the fictions of politics strive to conceal'; the *Twilight* series implies that the happiness achieved by Bella is available only to white, wealthy, heterosexual heroes and heroines, or to those who assimilate with them.⁸⁶ The Quileutes remain in a state of abjection induced by the presence of the vampires, who '[precede] and [possess them], and through such possession [cause them] to be'; they are defined and controlled by the Cullens.⁸⁷ However, Lucas' Gothic potential, and his personal power, stems from his Abenaki heritage, without drawing on the 'mystic Indian' stereotype found in other Gothic young adult series such as *House of Night*.⁸⁸ American Gothic has been described as exploring 'the

⁸⁶ William Hughes and Andrew Smith, 'Introduction: Defining the relationships between Gothic and the postcolonial', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 5, Iss. 2 (November 2003), p2

⁸⁷ *Powers of Horror*, p10

⁸⁸ In the *House of Night* series, much is made of the heroine Zoey Rainbird's Native ancestry; it is strongly implied that it is the source of her power. P. C. Cast describes the construction of her vampire society as 'heavily pagan and Wiccan based, with a huge influx of Native American myth and legend' (Vit Wagner, 'Fame's at stake for Cast of two', *The Star* (http://www.thestar.com/entertainment/2009/03/29/fames_at_stake_for_cast_of_two.html),

attraction and repulsion of a monstrous history [of colonisation], the desire to know the traumatic Real of American being and yet the flight from that unbearable and remote knowledge'; the abjection created by colonisation is explored at one remove, through the supernatural narratives of the Gothic.⁸⁹ Bruchac develops this relationship between the Gothic novel and American colonial history, creating an empowering narrative of Native American renewal.

The ambivalent Gothic space of the forest reflects this doubleness. Rather than being malevolent, the threat posed by Lucas to humans and prey creatures is depicted as natural. This is indicated by his impartial assessment of the two Maxico employees that he considers hunting; 'It's not anger or a desire for revenge. It's more like a wolf might view its prey. No fellow feeling...No empathy'.⁹⁰ Rather than establishing a clear boundary between the benign and monstrous aspects of his being, Lucas exists in a liminal space that is paralleled by the sometimes hostile, sometimes harmless forest. However, rather than being portrayed as uncanny and unsettling, Lucas' liminality is represented as a state of freedom and a potential source of power. Despite being both a Gothic monster and a young Abenaki man in a white-centric society, Lucas refuses to let himself be Othered, and therefore avoids becoming the 'Self waiting to be assimilated' identified by Khair as a central aspect of the intersection between the Gothic and colonialism.⁹¹ Lucas resists definition by outside forces, such as the Sunglass Mafia and Maxico; instead of bowing to their agendas, he

accessed 27 May 2014). Like Meyer, the Casts have appropriated 'Native American legends' for their stories and replicated stereotypes such as that of the 'mystic Indian'.

⁸⁹ Eric Savoy, 'The Rise of American Gothic', *The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction*, p169

⁹⁰ *Wolf Mark*, p132

⁹¹ *The Gothic, Postcolonialism and Otherness*, p4

negotiates his own space within his Gothic world, reversing the traditional narrative of the Gothic as 'a writing of Otherness' and positioning the white *upyrs* and Dr Kesselring as Other.⁹² Lucas establishes autonomy and mastery within a Gothic space, enacting a counter-colonial narrative and reinscribing Gothic tropes on his own terms.

Spooky Houses: Domestic and suburban Gothic locations

The texts do not focus only on landscapes and cityscapes as examples of Gothic settings. In *Wolf Mark*, there are three notable Gothic buildings; the deserted Drake House, Lucas' school, and Maxico's headquarters. The initial descriptions of the Drake House ironize locations associated with horror and the Gothic:

A mist is sweeping in, a diaphanous curtain being pulled up from the marshes behind the house. The light from the setting sun is as faint as a flickering oil lamp. The outline of the abandoned mansion fifty yards away is blurred by fog and twilight to the point where it seems like nothing more than a corny outdoor stage set.⁹³

However, upon entering the Drake House, Lucas finds that the building plays straight with Gothic tropes. The house contains dangerous family secrets; it is here that Lucas finds his wolf skin, and the family history written by his father. This use of the house as a location for the concealment and discovery of family secrets is an employment of a common Gothic trope. At the Drake House, Lucas also encounters the Grue, a creature from his nightmares:

⁹² *Ibid*, p6

⁹³ *Wolf Mark*, p96

A thing I've never seen or imagined before materializes in front of me. It's shaped itself from the dust, risen and gathered from the darkness itself. It looms over me...It doesn't stare at me. It stares into me.

...
Grue, I think, somehow knowing its name.⁹⁴

The Drake house is another example of a liminal space, poised between the past and the present, the real and the unreal.

Similarly, Lucas' school is a hostile Gothic space, controlled by the sinister Dr Kesselring and inhabited by vampires. Unlike the Cullen family, the inclinations of the 'Sunglass Mafia' towards the human students are not benign; after the *upyr*s release Lucas' friend Renzo, Marina comments "So sorry to see him go...I'm as hungry as a wolf...And I love Italian food."⁹⁵ The hostile nature of the school is emphasised by its structure, which, like *Twilight*'s forest, is consistently characterised as disorientating; Lucas describes its 'complex convolutions', comparing the building to the 'forgotten wings, vast secret rooms, dark hidden passageways' of Gormenghast, and noting that 'Every new student is given a map and still ends up getting lost'.⁹⁶ As a reader may expect from a Gothic novel, the use of the school as a Gothic location corresponds with social and generational anxieties; according to Christine Jarvis, the school is 'integral to the fears on which [young adult horror and Gothic novels] play...Schooling constructs much of young people's social and cultural environment and is intimately connected with many of their fears and anxieties'.⁹⁷ Furthermore, as

⁹⁴ Ibid, p49

⁹⁵ Ibid, p242

⁹⁶ Ibid, p66

⁹⁷ Christine Jarvis, 'School is Hell: Gendered fears in teenage horror', *Educational Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 3 (2001), p258

the protagonist, Lucas must contend not only with the role of the school in his development from child to adult, but also with social and historical contexts. As this thesis has already examined, Native children in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries were removed from their families and placed in residential schools. Modern school systems have often not accommodated Native students' specific needs. However, as in the forest, Lucas' werewolf nature puts him in a position of power and control, allowing him to master this Gothic location. His supernatural senses mean that he is able to manipulate the environment; 'I know all the shortcuts from one place to another...I sniffed out the places where the janitors hid their spare keys during my first week'.⁹⁸ Like Bella in the forest, Lucas exploits his own monstrous aspects in order to avoid becoming entrapped by the Gothic space that surrounds him.

The only Gothic environment which is truly dangerous for Lucas is the headquarters of Maxico. This danger is linked to Lucas' liminal nature. Lucas is at home in the forest because he is a werewolf; he is at home in the school and the Drake House because he is human and a part of the Drake family. However, the buildings and laboratories belonging to Maxico are associated with unnatural, manufactured creatures that are outside of Lucas' experience. Gary Farnell writes that 'Gothic is the name for the speaking subject's experience of approaching the Thing...a phantasmic construction of an unnameable void at the centre of the real'; in short, the abject described by Kristeva.⁹⁹ If this is the case, then Maxico is the most Gothic space encountered in *Wolf Mark*, populated by

⁹⁸ *Wolf Mark*, p66

⁹⁹ Gary Farnell, 'Theorising the Gothic for the Twenty-First Century', *Twenty-First Century Gothic*, p7

'Things' and creating a 'void' where nature cannot enter without being distorted and perverted. The recombinants, as they are known, are characterised as entirely separate from naturally occurring monsters such as the werewolves and *upyrs*. The scenes in Maxico's headquarters explore the antagonists' experimentation with the boundaries between human, animal, and monster.¹⁰⁰ These creatures allow the text to explore aspects of the Gothic associated with modernity, and with the hybrid space of liminality:

Doubleness clings to modernity: if it invents the liberties, it also produces an array of disciplinary mechanisms; if it seeks to enlighten, it also conjures up realms of darkness to penetrate and illuminate; if it realises a spirit of human progress, it also imagines spectres of regression.¹⁰¹

The recombinant embodies this doubleness, being both human and monster. It also emphasises a sense of duality in Maxico's work. While their genetic experiments indicate scientific progress, their purpose is 'regressive'; to provide super-soldiers, promoting violence and chaos rather than improving humanity.

The domestic space is also an important Gothic location, and the *Twilight* saga plays with the concept of the domestic Gothic. While the Drake House exaggerates stereotypical Gothic imagery, the Cullen house actively subverts Gothic perceptions of domestic and interior space. The initial description of the house is in keeping with what one might expect of an isolated homestead inhabited by vampires. On approaching the Cullen house, Bella notes that 'the

¹⁰⁰ Lucas states that 'The creature that's just tried to kill me is clearly a product of Maxico's gene-blending scientists. Once, I'm guessing, it was an African lion...But this beast is twice a normal lion's size now. Its huge teeth are like those of the ancient gape-jawed creatures that stalked the nights and the nightmares of ten thousand years ago...It blends feline and man in such a grotesque way that it looks as foul as it smells. Its eyes are mad and clever.' (*Wolf Mark*, p308)

¹⁰¹ *Limits of Horror*, p9

gloom of the forest didn't relent...The trees held their protecting shadow right up to the walls of the house that rose among them, making obsolete the deep porch that wrapped around the first storey'.¹⁰² However, upon entering, Bella finds an interior that is 'very bright, very open, and very large...The back, south-facing wall had been entirely replaced with glass...The walls, the high-beamed ceiling, the wooden floors, and the thick carpets were all varying shades of white'; the passage emphasises the lightness and airiness of the vampire family's home.¹⁰³ As a later conversation between Bella and Edward reveals, this is a deliberate subversion, both on the part of the Cullens and by Meyer herself:

"Not what you expected, is it?" he asked, his voice smug.

"No," I admitted.

"No coffins, no piled skulls in the corners; I don't even think we have cobwebs...what a disappointment this must be for you," he continued slyly.¹⁰⁴

Indeed, it is only when the house is empty of vampires that it takes on genuinely Gothic qualities. After the Cullens leave, Bella returns to the house:

...the house was there, but it was not the same. Though nothing had changed on the outside, the emptiness screamed from the blank windows. It was creepy. For the first time since I'd seen the beautiful house, it looked like a fitting home for vampires.¹⁰⁵

It is only in the Cullen family's absence that their house can be considered as 'fitting' Gothic tropes; in short, it is the removal of vampires that renders this space Gothic. In traditional Gothic texts, the removal of the vampire marks a

¹⁰² *Twilight*, p280

¹⁰³ *Ibid*, p281

¹⁰⁴ *Ibid*, p287

¹⁰⁵ *New Moon*, p161

return to normality.¹⁰⁶ However, in the *Twilight* series, it is the presence of the vampire family that prevents a space from becoming Gothic. After the Cullens leave, threats associated with Gothic transgression – for example, the hungry Laurent – return to Forks. The ‘creepy’ nature of the empty Cullen house underscores the fact that the vegetarian vampires represent an ideal, rather than deviancy, and protect their territory from the uncanny and dangerous aspects of the Gothic. In this reprised version of the conservative Gothic story, ‘monsters no longer render norms visible; they are the norm’;¹⁰⁷ the Cullens are not transgressive figures who threaten human society, but ‘secularized, socialized, and humanized’ characters who are intended to set an example to others.¹⁰⁸

The Swan residence is set up as an inversion of the Cullen house. Initially, there seem to be no potentially Gothic elements to Bella and Charlie’s home. Bella’s descriptions of the interior stress its ordinariness. The novel emphasises the lightness and homely domesticity of the building. Bella’s bedroom has ‘light blue walls...yellowed lace curtains around the window’,¹⁰⁹ while the kitchen has ‘bright yellow cabinets and a white linoleum floor’.¹¹⁰ However, although it does not contain any supernatural monsters or dark secrets, there are several Gothic tropes apparent in the description of the Swan house. While the Cullens’ home contains souvenirs from the family’s past, such as the cross carved by Carlisle’s father, there is nothing old-fashioned about their house, despite the fact that even

¹⁰⁶ For example, after Dracula is killed, Mina’s partial transformation into a vampire is reversed. Following Carmilla’s destruction, Laura and her father go on a tour of Europe.

¹⁰⁷ *Limits of Horror*, p12

¹⁰⁸ *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill*, p13

¹⁰⁹ *Twilight*, p8

¹¹⁰ *Ibid*, p10

the youngest vampires are nearly a century old. Filled with modern accessories, such as top-of-the-range cars and music systems, the Cullen house exists in an eternal present that reflects the family's immortal status. The Swan house, by contrast, is stuck in the past:

Nothing was changed. My mother had painted the cabinets eighteen years ago in an attempt to bring some sunshine into the house. Over the small fireplace in the adjoining handkerchief-sized family room was a row of pictures. First a wedding picture of Charlie and my mom in Las Vegas, then one of the three of us in the hospital after I was born...It was impossible, being in this house, not to realize that Charlie had never gotten over my mom.¹¹¹

Like a modern-day, gender-swapped Miss Havisham, Charlie has not been able to move on from his abandonment by Renee; instead, he has clung to everything that she left behind, including her paintwork. The Cullens live in a constant, comfortable present, but Charlie lives in a stasis that is orientated around a painful moment in his past. In effect, Charlie has established a Gothic foundation in what would otherwise be an ordinary suburban house. In typical suburban Gothic fashion, Charlie's house displays a 'connection between living environment and psychology'; it has become a physical manifestation of his loneliness.¹¹² Bella knows that evoking this moment will have such a substantial impact on Charlie that he will be unable to prevent her from going; a knowledge that has been gleaned from her observations of her father's house.

¹¹¹ Ibid, pp10-11

¹¹² *The Suburban Gothic in American Popular Culture*, p2. The all-encompassing nature of Charlie's loneliness is revealed towards the end of *Twilight*. When Bella must leave Forks to escape James, she echoes her mother's last words to her father before their divorce; "Just let me go, Charlie." I repeated my mother's last words as she'd walked out this same door so many years ago'. (*Twilight*, p344)

This Gothic foundation to the Swan house is soon expanded upon by Bella's involvement with the supernatural world. Unlike the traditional vampire, *Twilight* vampires do not need an invitation to enter a human residence, and throughout the series, Bella's house becomes more and more vulnerable to vampiric invasion. The borders between Bella's home and the supernatural world become increasingly permeable as the series continues, signifying a 'collapse of boundaries separating reality and fantasy' that puts Bella ever more in danger.¹¹³ Early in *Twilight*, Edward enters Bella's room at night to watch her sleep.¹¹⁴ Later, in *New Moon*, Alice enters the Swan house to determine whether or not Bella is still alive following her dangerous cliff dive. Although Alice and Edward are benign vampires, their presence still places Bella in danger. Resisting Bella's blood proves difficult to Edward throughout the series; his being in such close proximity places her in great danger. Similarly, Alice arrives at the Swan house so unexpectedly that she has not had time to hunt:

I looked up at her through my streaming eyes. Alice's neck was tight, straining away from me, her lips pressed together firmly. Her eyes were black as pitch.

"Oh," I puffed, as I realized the problem. She was thirsty. And I smelled appetizing.¹¹⁵

¹¹³ *Limits of Horror*, p6

¹¹⁴ The connections between this action and the activities of stalkers are not lost on Edward; 'I was repulsed by myself...How was I any better than some sick peeping tom? I wasn't any better. I was much, much worse' (*Midnight Sun*, p106). Here, Edward identifies himself not only with the supernatural threats to Bella's life, but also with the human threats she faces; the implied sexual violence of a 'sick peeping tom' is more closely linked to the rapists who nearly attack Bella in Port Angeles than with the vampires who attempt to kill her later in the series. As Karen Backstein notes, the series stresses that 'not all dangers come from the paranormal' (Karen Backstein, '(Un)safe Sex: Romancing the vampire', *Cineaste* (Winter 2009), p40).

¹¹⁵ *New Moon*, p383

In *Eclipse*, the Swan house is the site of a much more sinister vampiric incursion; one of Victoria's underlings enters and steals Bella's sweater, using it to give Bella's scent to the army of newborn vampires in Seattle. Once again, Bella's 'mouthwatering' scent and the new vampires' disregard for human life could have resulted in either of the Swans being killed had they been present in the house at that time.¹¹⁶ In *Breaking Dawn*, prior to the fight with the Volturi, Bella arranges for Charlie to be away from the house during the confrontation. This precaution is as necessary as those she takes to ensure the safety of Renesmee and Jacob; Bella fears that, if the Cullens lose the impending battle, the Volturi will also destroy her father. Rather than being a safe haven, Bella's childhood home is a relic of her father's past, with borders too permeable to offer any protection against the forces which threaten them both.

The motif of the house as a reflection of emotional pain is repeated in the series, in the character of Bella herself. According to Leggatt and Burnett, following Edward's departure, Bella compares herself to 'real estate':¹¹⁷

How could I explain it so that [Jacob] would understand? I was an empty shell. Like a vacant house – condemned – for months I'd been utterly uninhabitable. Now I was a little improved. The front room was in better repair. But that was all – just the one small piece. He deserved better than that – better than a one-room, falling-down fixer-upper. No amount of investment on his part could put me back in working order.¹¹⁸

This summary of Bella's emotional state is significant when considered alongside the character of Charlie and the setting of the Swan house. Renee's departure

¹¹⁶ Ibid, p241

¹¹⁷ Judith Leggatt and Kristin Burnett, 'Biting Bella: Treaty negotiation, Quileute history, and why "Team Jacob" is doomed to lose', *Twilight and History*, p42

¹¹⁸ *New Moon*, p216

had a devastating effect on Charlie, and *New Moon* implies that Bella, like her father, 'wouldn't ever have moved on' from the person she loves ending their relationship.¹¹⁹ After Edward leaves her, Bella becomes 'lifeless',¹²⁰ something that Charlie recognises from his own heartbreak; he tells Bella "I think that – that maybe you need some help...When your mother left...that was a really hard time for me...But I handled it...Honey, you're not handling it."¹²¹ The shortcomings of the Swan house, embodied by Charlie's inability to cook or run a home, reflect the emotional shortcomings of the two emotionally bereft occupants. Although not 'uninhabitable', the Swans and their house leave much to be desired. Bella is partly 'repaired' by her friendship with Jacob, and is later made entirely 'inhabitable' again by her reunion with Edward. Similarly, the Swan house is freed from stasis when Charlie begins a relationship with Sue Clearwater, who becomes a positive presence in the house, countering the spectre of Renee.¹²²

The unsafe domestic space as Gothic can also be found in the *Tantalize* series. The first novel establishes that Quincie Morris considers her late mother's restaurant to be an extension of her home, and its staff a part of her family.¹²³

¹¹⁹ Ibid, p370

¹²⁰ Ibid, p95

¹²¹ Ibid, p96

¹²² An alternative reading of this situation becomes apparent if we consider the gendered implications of the Gothic, specifically its focus on 'women's entrapment in the domestic sphere of the home' (Paulina Palmer, 'Lesbian Gothic: Genre, transformation, transgression', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 6, Iss. 1 (2004), p119). Renee escapes this Gothic feminine prison and rejects domesticity entirely, eventually separating from her daughter to travel with her new, younger husband. Sue, despite her forthright personality and her position on the Quileute council, becomes a domesticated figure, cooking and keeping house for Charlie. The stereotypically gendered nature of their roles – Sue as homemaker, Charlie as fisherman and law enforcer – carries additional racial connotations; the Native woman, Sue, serves the domestic needs of the white man, Charlie.

¹²³ 'I set the hammer beside my planner book on the hostess stand and hung Vaggio's framed photo next to those of my parents and grandparents and the first dollar ever earned at Fat Lorenzo's. There, I thought. The picture didn't fit the décor, but so what. No matter what we called

However, while the restaurant is a physical embodiment of Quincie's roots and her emotional connection to her family and friends, it is also constructed as a Gothic space. Like Bella's home, it is susceptible to invasion by monstrous forces. Unlike the vampires of *Twilight*, who threaten but rarely attack outright, *Tantalize's* monsters carry out an immediate and violent strike on a member of Quincie's chosen family:

That's when I saw the disjointed legs lying on the floor, jutting out from behind a prep station. It was partly the dark, irregular pattern on the beige cargo pants and kitchen clogs. It was partly the angle the legs were sprawled at, turned to each other as if for comfort. I smelled blood, urine. "Vaggio?"¹²⁴

Although the Swan house is not a safe location, it is not as dangerous to Bella as the forest. By contrast, in *Tantalize* the restaurant is the setting of the greatest danger experienced by the heroine. Although Quincie's final change from human to vampire – her effective death – takes place at Bradley's house, the restaurant is the site of her transformation.¹²⁵ Quincie's transformation, and the fluctuating level of danger that she faces, is reflected by the appearance of the restaurant itself. Initially a traditional family-run Italian restaurant, economic troubles force the business to rebrand.¹²⁶ As the novel continues, the restaurant takes on an appearance associated with Goth subculture. The dining room is enclosed by

the place or how we changed the interior design, this was still a family establishment. My family's establishment.' (*Tantalize*, p31)

¹²⁴ Ibid, p17

¹²⁵ While working as the head chef at Sanguini's, Brad feeds Quincie food and wine laced with his own blood. As a response to *Dracula*, the *Tantalize* series incorporates this aspect of vampire lore; a victim must consume the blood of a vampire in order to be transformed.

¹²⁶ 'All was well until last year when Pasta Perfecto opened a few blocks south. Though our regulars had stayed regular, their parking lot was twice the size of ours. Within six months, Fat Lorenzo's was in the red. Something had to change, I'd said, or we'd find ourselves out of business. Vaggio had argued that we should stick with Italian, claiming he didn't know how to cook anything else. Uncle Davidson had suggested the vampire concept.' (*Tantalize*, p9)

'crimson velvet curtains',¹²⁷ with 'faux painted "castle" rock walls, candlelike wall sconces, [a] crystal chandelier'.¹²⁸ Similarly, the clothing styles of both the staff and the clientele change:

One guy walked in with a spiderweb tattoo covering his entire face, a woman with porcupine quills threaded through her nostrils. A tall, very tall, and solid-looking red-haired man, neatly trimmed beard, dressed to the nines circa 1912, introduced himself in a pronounced Irish accent, "Mr Stoker, party of one".¹²⁹

The changes in the restaurant reflect the increasing peril surrounding Quincie, who is being slowly isolated from her friends – particularly Kieren – and groomed by Bradley. The shift towards a 'vampire theme' symbolises Quincie being slowly drawn into the literal vampire world.

However, the restaurant never becomes a completely hostile space. Although it has been the site of her betrayal and victimisation, the restaurant is also the location of Quincie's first act of resistance against Bradley, when she manages to stop feeding from Kieren:

"Tell you what, baby...I'll make you a deal. A more interesting one. Drink. Drink your fill. And then *if* you somehow manage to tear yourself from his throat in time to save him...fine...I'll back off, way off. *Adios. Addio.* Good-bye."¹³⁰

By meeting Bradley's challenge, Quincie reasserts her control, not only over herself and her appetites, but over the dangerous Gothic space of her restaurant. She recognises that this victory is Pyrrhic in nature, but also understands that

¹²⁷ Ibid, p190

¹²⁸ Ibid, p206

¹²⁹ Ibid, p194

¹³⁰ Ibid, p305

even reclaiming this single space denotes a level of strength that is almost impossible for a vampire to achieve:

I would lose both of them, Kieren to his Wolf pack and Bradley to – what? – San Antonio. But I wouldn't give up myself or my restaurant. I wouldn't let the blood win.

I embraced my pain, pulled together my shredded humanity. My fangs retracted, my hunger cooled.¹³¹

Quincie's act of resistance allows her to regain control of the restaurant, changing it from a threatening environment into one that reflects her new-found sense of self. Bradley has attempted to colonise her space, but by defying him, Quincie regains her sovereignty over the restaurant. The changes that Quincie makes to the restaurant after Brad leaves reflect both a return to her cultural roots, and her own attempts to recreate herself as a new form of vampire:

I grinned and told the chef, "I'm digging the Sinatra. We could start with Frankie and later in the evening switch to-

"Pavarotti," she finished for me.

Kismet. And cheesy, totally obvious, but I didn't care. It was Italian, fun, and most important, not what Brad would have done.¹³²

Like Bella, Lucas and Miranda, Quincie masters a Gothic space by becoming a Gothic creature. However, although her soul is at risk, Quincie does not lose herself as a result of her transformation. She is able to retain her humanity as well as embracing her new vampire existence. Neither damsel nor monster, by the end of the series Quincie is a triumphant figure. She has not only retained her restaurant and cemented her relationship with Kieren, but has also defied

¹³¹ Ibid, p310

¹³² *Blessed*, p136

Bradley; 'I would never belong to him, to anyone, against my own free will'.¹³³ Quincie resists the model of the traditional Gothic heroine, who is 'by definition passive', saving herself rather than relying on others to rescue her.¹³⁴ Her role as a member of the 'vampire gentry', specifically linked to owning land, emphasises the importance of her property, the restaurant, in securing her status as an autonomous and powerful figure.

Boarding School Bloodshed: The role of the Scholomance

Although Quincie can reclaim and reinscribe her restaurant, she is not able to control all of the Gothic spaces that she and her companions inhabit. The most dangerous domestic space is encountered in the final novel, *Diabolical*, in which the majority of the action takes place at an exclusive private residential college, Scholomance Preparatory Academy. *Diabolical*, like the other novels in the series, engages with *Dracula*, in this case building on a throwaway line in the original novel.¹³⁵ Leitch Smith fleshes out Stoker's Scholomance, creating an institution that has survived to the present day. The Scholomance of the *Tantalize* world is based in Europe, but has established a new feeder school in the United States. This development invokes processes of colonisation; a European style of education being imposed on the North American continent.

¹³³ Ibid, p439

¹³⁴ *In the Circles of Fear and Desire*, p18

¹³⁵ 'The Draculas were, says Arminus, a great and noble race, though now and again were scions who were held by their coevals to have had dealings with the Evil One. They learned his secrets in the Scholomance, amongst the mountains over Lake Hermanstadt, where the devil claims the tenth scholar as his due.' (*Dracula*, p344)

Although Scholomance Preparatory Academy is located in the United States, the implication is that students will continue their studies at the original European school, a procedure that corresponds with the aims of government-run boarding schools:

Back in the bad old days, the BIA representatives who maintained boarding schools...would go hundreds of miles and return with Native children. The philosophy, reflecting an errant missionary zeal, was to get native children away from their families, their elders, their tribes, their language, their heritage. They isolated native children so they would forget their culture.¹³⁶

The Scholomance students are indeed 'isolated' from their families and communities; upon arriving at the school, they realise that they are unable to call their parents or otherwise communicate with the outside world. The colonialist associations of Scholomance Preparatory Academy are expanded upon as the narrative continues, and the Gothic tropes that can be found in the story are an important part of this process.

Margaret Connell Szasz writes that 'of all the issues that whirl around Native American educational history, none is more driven by raw emotion and painful memory than [the boarding school]'.¹³⁷ It is true that some Native American students who passed through the boarding school system did not find their experience entirely negative; in *Boarding School Blues*, David Wallace Adams writes that 'some [students] found boarding school a welcome escape from the desperate economic and social conditions in their home

¹³⁶ Wilma Mankiller and Michael Wallis, *Mankiller: A chief and her people* (New York: St Martin's Griffin, 1994), p7

¹³⁷ Margaret Connel Szasz, 'Through a Wide-Angle Lens: Acquiring and maintaining power, position, and knowledge through boarding schools', *Boarding School Blues*, p188

communities',¹³⁸ and also focuses upon the empowering effects of participation in sports such as football, which was offered at many boarding schools.¹³⁹ However, as Margaret D. Jacobs argues, 'the fact that some Indian children and parents adapted to a coercive government policy and seized and reshaped it to meet their needs should not lend scholars to neglect an analysis of that policy or to conclude that it was benign'.¹⁴⁰ Most American Indian students found the boarding school system alienating, demoralising, and abusive, something reflected in Leitich Smith's construction of the Scholomance.¹⁴¹

Like the Cullen and Drake houses, the Scholomance outwardly evokes the Gothic. It is located in a remote, mountainous terrain, and associated with harsh, unpredictable weather.¹⁴² However, the Scholomance differs from the Swan house and Quincie's restaurant. Sanguini's and Bella's home are established as spaces which are intended to be safe, but which are invaded by hostile forces, a

¹³⁸ David Wallace Adams, 'Beyond Bleakness: The brighter side of Indian boarding schools, 1870-1940', *Boarding School Blues*, pp38-39

¹³⁹ *Ibid*, p49

¹⁴⁰ Margaret D. Jacobs, 'Indian Boarding Schools in Comparative Perspective: The removal of indigenous children in the United States and Australia, 1880-1940', *Boarding School Blues*, p204

¹⁴¹ In one essay, a Native historian describes the punishments issued to students at the Rainy Mountain boarding school: 'both sexes were subjected to humiliating and painful punishments that included being shackled to a ball and chain, forced to stand on tiptoe with arms outstretched, whipped across the palms of the hand, and made to kneel on two-by-four boards for extended periods. Some schools locked children in darkened closets while others humiliated boys by shaving their heads or making them wear dresses. One former student recalled runaways being forced to eat their own vomit after being subjected to a meal of spoiled food' (Clyde Ellis, "'We had a lot of fun, but of course, that wasn't the school part": Life at the Rainy Mountain boarding school, 1893-1920', *Boarding School Blues*, pp76-77).

¹⁴² 'The academy is a Mies van der Rohe-looking, four-story, rectangular building made of uniform thin steel columns supporting massive panes of tinted glass. What appears to be the basement is aboveground, and both the circular drive and the black-stone staircase leading to the entrance have been shoveled and sprinkled with sand.

The structure sits nestled among taller, snow-banked hills (mountains?) on wooded land along a fair-sized lake, which is oddly not frozen. The closest waterline is about a hundred feet from the front of the structure.' (*Diabolical*, p35)

'violation of boundaries' that renders the normal dangerous.¹⁴³ The Scholomance, by contrast, is designed to entrap and threaten its occupants. Its forbidding outward appearance reflects its dangerous status as 'a demonic institution in terms of fields of study, ownership, and origin'.¹⁴⁴ In contrast to the permeable Swan house and Quincie's restaurant, the Scholomance cannot be penetrated by anyone, including God himself; Miranda, watching from the afterlife, learns that 'the divine is absent' from the school.¹⁴⁵ During their time there, one student is killed as a result of the abusive training programme implemented by the staff. Another commits suicide, and all of the students suffer extreme emotional and physical trauma. Considering that the Scholomance is a boarding school, and that Cynthia Leitich Smith is of Muskogee Creek origin, I believe that the Scholomance is intended to reflect the abuses suffered by Native children at the residential schools.

The different roles played by the Scholomance students are in keeping with Ellis' argument that Native attendees of boarding schools 'used the schools to suit their own needs and purposes'.¹⁴⁶ Students Willa and Nigel are forced to join the school; Willa tells the others "My parents' biggest financial backer is an alumnus...This afternoon, they...announced that we were both transferring here. Never mind *asking* if we wanted to move or change schools."¹⁴⁷ Willa and Nigel are examples of students who have been sent to school in order to conform to an 'assimilationist agenda'. However, the majority of the students are attending

¹⁴³ 'Geometries of Terror', p3

¹⁴⁴ *Diabolical*, p106

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid*, p127

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid*.

¹⁴⁷ *Ibid*, p96

Scholomance Preparatory Academy by choice, a fact that reinforces their senses of agency. Bridget, who dreams of becoming a lawyer, is attending the school as a step on her career path.¹⁴⁸ Vesper enrolled at the college in order to destroy it, telling the others “I would’ve burned it to the ground, if you all weren’t trapped inside.”¹⁴⁹ Lucy is fully aware of the school’s true nature, and is attending in the hope that she will learn magical skills that will allow her to find Miranda:

“When I asked Seth whether I would find out here what had happened to Miranda that night in Dallas, he said yes...Everyone says I have to face that I’ll probably never see her again. But what if they’re wrong? What if she needs me?”¹⁵⁰

The trials that they face at the school allow the students to unite and become stronger, with the ultimate effect of saving not only Lucy’s soul, but also those of the deceased Nigel and Vesper. As Kieren reflects at the conclusion of the story, ‘For a while, we were a pack. A better, tougher pack than the Wolves I met in Michigan. We, the Scholomance students. I’ll always miss them’.¹⁵¹ This forging of bonds between students of different backgrounds reflects the solidarity between children of different tribes in the boarding schools; Native students put aside old tribal enmities in order to create a united front against the assimilation tactics of the schools and their staff.¹⁵²

¹⁴⁸ Ibid, p80

¹⁴⁹ Ibid, p266

¹⁵⁰ Ibid, p106

¹⁵¹ Ibid, p338

¹⁵² In recent years, several American Indian nations have reclaimed the concept of the boarding school: ‘[modern, Native-run] boarding schools provide some students with a sphere where they can be with other Indian students their age and work out a plan for the present and future. For some students, the schools help negotiate the larger, dominant world while allowing them to maintain and nurture their Indianness...Contemporary off-reservation boarding schools are a product of power change, one that is intended to be of positive value to American Indian students’

Crossing the Line: The use and abuse of Native bodies and the significance of the treaty line

As the previous chapter established, the captivity narrative is a prominent part of the *Twilight* saga. *Wolf Mark* contains an inversion of this captivity narrative. Rather than a white woman being carried away by an American Indian tribe, two Native men, Thomas and Uncle Cal, are kidnapped by a Western corporation, Maxico. The scenes set in the Maxico laboratories reveal that the corporation is using blood and other body parts from Uncle Cal and Thomas in order to engineer hybrid super-soldiers, such as the lion recombinant: 'They kept him alive – barely alive – to extract his blood and what his blood (and mine and Dad's) contains, the genetic material that makes Maxico's evil work possible'.¹⁵³ The abuse of a Native body for financial gain links with many controversial aspects of the history of relations between Native American and Euro-American peoples. Many American Indian nations are currently engaged in legal battles to repatriate Native body parts, such as skulls, skeletons and preserved brains, from museums, as described by David Thomas in his book *Skull Wars*:

Thousands of Indian skulls are still curated in America's museums, and the reasons they were brought there reflect archaeology's roots in the crass racial determinism of the nineteenth century. It is small wonder that many Indian people still associate archaeology with grave robbing.¹⁵⁴

(Patricia Dixon and Clifford E. Trafzer, 'The Place of American Indian Boarding Schools in Contemporary Society', *Boarding School Blues*, pp236-237).

¹⁵³ *Wolf Mark*, p302

¹⁵⁴ David Hurst Thomas, *Skull Wars: Kennewick Man, archaeology, and the battle for Native American identity* (New York: Basic Books, 2000), p120

It is not only Native cultures that have been appropriated under a colonialist society; Native people's physical remains have also been treated as commodities. This creates another link between colonialism and the Gothic; the defilement of bodies relates to the themes of 'decay and death; human sacrifice; murder; the corpse' that make up the abject.¹⁵⁵

The use of Native bodies by Western institutions is not only linked with nineteenth century archaeological practices. In *Conquest*, Smith details many ways in which American Indian bodies continue to be sites of experimentation and exploitation. She quotes Tom Baile, a resident of a Washington reservation which was located near a nuclear reactor:

As "downwinders," born and raised downwind of the Hanford Nuclear Reactor in Washington, we learned several years ago that the government decided – with cold deliberation – to use us as guinea pigs by releasing radioactivity into our food, water, milk and air without our consent. Now, we've learned that we can expect continuing cancer cases from our exposure in their "experiment."¹⁵⁶

Here, Native bodies are abjected by Western capitalist society, becoming 'human [sacrifices]' for industrial progress.¹⁵⁷ Uncle Cal's statement that "their [Maxico's] war is against the earth for sure" corresponds with Smith's assertion that damaging environmental practices in the United States have impacted upon

¹⁵⁵ *The Monstrous-Feminine*, pp8-9

¹⁵⁶ Tom Baile, quoted in *Conquest*, p66. Smith also writes of the impact of nuclear testing on indigenous peoples in the Marshall Islands, where, as a result of the high levels of radiation, the residents have 'continued to suffer cancer and major birth defects (including "jelly fish babies" – babies born without bones)' (Ibid, p67).

¹⁵⁷ *The Monstrous-Feminine*, pp8-9

American Indian people's bodies, even when they are not the deliberate subjects of experiments:¹⁵⁸

In areas where uranium is mined, such as the Four Corners...and the Black Hills in South Dakota, Indian people face skyrocketing rates of cancer, miscarriages, and birth defects. Men and women who grew up in Four Corners develop ovarian and testicular cancers at 15 times the national average.¹⁵⁹

Smith argues that 'Through the rape of the earth, Native women's bodies are raped once again', positioning the exploitation of nature as another example of colonial violence.¹⁶⁰ These issues have influenced ecocritical studies of the relationship between nature and humanity, with critical thinkers developing ideas that '[challenge] the hierarchy that has polarized humans and nature and advocates a biocentric perspective'; focusing on the relationship between humans and nature, rather than treating nature as a backdrop.¹⁶¹ Lucas and his family's beliefs correspond with many of those found in ecocriticism; apt, as, according to Dreese, 'American Indian philosophies have made a vital impact' on the development of this school of thought.¹⁶² Rather than embodying the 'mystic Indian' stereotype, Lucas, Thomas and Uncle Cal are linked to modern environmental processes that focus on and engage with Native peoples. As Serenella Iovino suggests, the 'political body' in Bruchac's novel becomes

¹⁵⁸ *Wolf Mark*, p303

¹⁵⁹ *Conquest*, p67

¹⁶⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁶¹ Donelle N. Dreese, *Ecocriticism: Creating self and place in environmental and American Indian literatures* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., 2002), p5

¹⁶² *Ibid.*, p6. Somewhat problematically, Dreese does not identify the specific 'American Indian philosophies' to which she is referring; without identifying the precise tribal origins of these beliefs, her use of these 'philosophies' could be viewed as comparable to Meyer and the Casts' use of 'Native American legends', thus corresponding to the 'mystic, earth-loving Indian' stereotype. However, many modern American Indian nations are leading struggles to protect the environment, for example the many tribes involved in the Tar Sands conflict in Canada.

'everything except a metaphor'; the experiences of Lucas, Thomas and Uncle Cal are an exaggerated version of the physical toll taken upon Native bodies by corporate colonialism.¹⁶³

Bruchac's decision to use male bodies to illustrate this is interesting, particularly in the context of the literal and metaphorical rape of Native women's bodies. In their essay on *Twilight*, Leggatt and Burnett suggest that 'Native women do not represent the land, a construction hit home by the fact that Leah Clearwater, the most prominent Quileute female in the series, fears that she might be sterile'.¹⁶⁴ Instead, they argue, the land is represented by Bella, who is '[passed] back and forth across the borderline...she is tied to the land and to the treaty that divides it'.¹⁶⁵ According to this argument, Bella represents the effect of settler colonialism on the landscape of North America. She is associated with the treaties and borders imposed by the settler vampires upon the indigenous wolves; however, she produces Renesmee, whose existence permanently links the two opposing sides. Bella as landscape promotes an assimilationist agenda; she defines, then dismantles, the treaty line, bringing the indigenous wolves into the settler vampires' camp. Using a Native female body to represent the land would require an introduction of elements of colonialism that the *Twilight* series

¹⁶³ Serenella Iovino, 'Toxic Epiphanies: Dioxin, power, and gendered bodies in Laura Conti's *Narratives on Seveso*' *International Perspectives in Feminist Ecocriticism*, edited by Greta Gaard, Simon C. Estok and Seril Oppermann (London: Routledge, 2013), p38

¹⁶⁴ 'Biting Bella', *Twilight and History*, p41

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid*, p42

actively avoids; namely, that colonialism is 'the central ecological and social problem for indigenous women around the globe'.¹⁶⁶

Bruchac's construction of the Native male body as land differs greatly from *Twilight's* use of the white female body. Lucas, Thomas and Uncle Cal are linked to nature in a way that initially seems to evoke the 'mystic Indian' stereotype; as shapeshifters, they are at one with the natural world. This link between human and nature is emphasised by Lucas' decision regarding Cal's corpse; 'I'll make sure his body is not dissected like a laboratory frog. I'll see that he's buried in the forest beneath a tree',¹⁶⁷ a resolution that Lucas and his father fulfil after their defeat of Kesselring.¹⁶⁸ However, the three men's connection to the land implies resistance rather than assimilation. They are contrasted with the artificiality of the recombinant; while that creature is entirely man-made, Lucas and his family's status as shapeshifters is 'birthed with [them]'.¹⁶⁹ By linking his Native male characters with the land, Bruchac creates a subtext of natural and cultural renewal within the narrative of *Wolf Mark*. While Leah is 'a genetic dead end', Lucas and his father become metaphors for ecological and cultural survival.

Corresponding with the abject, Maxico's work breaks down the boundaries between human and inhuman. In keeping with Botting's commentary on the 'collapse of boundaries' associated with the Gothic,¹⁷⁰ these monsters 'participate in a fantastic flight from a humanised world and towards an inhuman

¹⁶⁶ Chiyo Crawford, 'Streams of Violence: Colonialism, modernization, and gender in María Cristina Mena's "John of God, the Water-Carrier"', *International Perspectives in Feminist Ecocriticism*, p88

¹⁶⁷ *Wolf Mark*, p307

¹⁶⁸ *Ibid*, p369

¹⁶⁹ *Ibid*, p119

¹⁷⁰ *Limits of Horror*, p6

technological dimension', occupying a frightening and unnatural liminal space.¹⁷¹ The construction of the recombinant signals the abject fate that threatens Lucas and his father, where 'an Other [settles] in place and stead of [the Self]...an Other who precedes and possesses [them], and through such possession causes [them] to be.'¹⁷² Although Lucas does not recognise himself in the recombinant, he identifies a person close to himself; 'What I sense in this creature is something of the presence of my Uncle Cal. Here's where part of what they sucked from him went'.¹⁷³ The recombinant embodies not only a blurring of the borders between human and inhuman, creating an abject creature, but also of the borders between Native and Western. The lion-like monster represents the ultimate in assimilation and appropriation; the Native body itself has been twisted and perverted in order to advance Euro-American financial interests. Lucas' close connections with the natural world, emphasised during the scenes in the forest and in his family's background as environmental activists, allow him to recognise the artificiality of boundaries imposed by settler colonialism, and to cross them without harm.

This aspect of *Wolf Mark* indicates that colonisation has the potential to entirely remove the agency of Native peoples, manipulating them for commercial gain. However, the novel includes another, more nuanced representation of connections between Native and white peoples. Like the werewolves of *Twilight*, Lucas joins a team of vampires in order to fight a mutual enemy, but his motivations differ greatly from Jacob's. In *Eclipse* and *Breaking Dawn*, the

¹⁷¹ Ibid, p14

¹⁷² *Powers of Horror*, p10

¹⁷³ *Wolf Mark*, p309

Quileute pack joins the Cullen family to stand against Victoria's newborn army and the Volturi respectively. In both cases, these conflicts centre around Bella. Victoria is attempting to kill Bella in revenge for Edward killing her mate, James. The Volturi intend to destroy the Cullens because they believe that Bella's daughter, Renesmee, is an 'immortal child', a human turned into a vampire at a very young age and so unable to exercise control or keep the vampire world secret: "...they could not be taught. They were frozen at whatever level of development they'd achieved before being bitten. Adorable two-year-olds with dimples and lisps that could destroy half a village in one of their tantrums. If they hungered, they fed, and no words of warning could restrain them."¹⁷⁴ In both situations, the werewolves are accessories to a conflict that centres around Bella and the Cullens; while Jacob has a personal attachment to Bella and Renesmee, the other wolves participate simply because the vampire battle is taking place on their territory. Although the liminal space of the forest around Forks and La Push has allowed Bella to make the transition from victim to heroine, the conservative colonialism of the series is not undermined. Gendered hierarchies are partly deconstructed in the face of Bella's new-found power, but racial hierarchies remain solid, with Jacob and his pack subordinate to the Cullens. Using 'an antiracist, anticolonial ecocriticism', Bruchac does not only dismantle stereotypes surrounding Native peoples, but 'calls attention to the various subtle and not-so-subtle ways in which a white, colonizing perspective is very often privileged in

¹⁷⁴ *Breaking Dawn*, p34. 'Immortal children' are vampires who were turned as babies and toddlers, before they had learned self-control, and who were incapable of keeping the secret that is key to the vampire world's survival.

ecocritical studies', by centring Native characters instead of using them as 'building blocks' to support white protagonists.¹⁷⁵

Lucas' attack on Maxico differs from the Quileutes' battles with enemy vampires. He is aware that the *upyrs* are using him; 'I'm just what they need. Cannon fodder to clear the way for them. An expendable battering ram to get them in. Tall, dark, and stupid'.¹⁷⁶ However, Lucas has his own agenda; his main purpose is to 'get [his] teeth into the people who've taken [his] dad'.¹⁷⁷ Furthermore, as the son of a counterterrorist and part of a devotedly environmentalist family, Lucas opposes Maxico's policies of ecological terrorism. As a result, he shares some of the *upyrs*' concerns regarding the potential uses of Maxico's inhuman soldiers, and of the rest of their research. These shared motivations suggest a more equal balance of power between Lucas and the *upyrs* than can be found in the relationship between the Cullens and the Quileute pack. By the end of the series, the Quileute werewolves have effectively become the Cullens' 'guard dogs'.¹⁷⁸ They have had to make compromises in order to accommodate their vampire allies; significantly, they must allow vampires who feed on humans to stay close to La Push. The La Push packs are disempowered by their association with the vampires. They have had to compromise their very reason for being in order to serve the interests of the Cullens. Lucas, on the other hand, has been empowered by his werewolf heritage, and has established a far more equal alliance with his vampire comrades. At the end of *Breaking Dawn*,

¹⁷⁵ 'Streams of Violence', p89

¹⁷⁶ *Wolf Mark*, p280

¹⁷⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁷⁸ *Breaking Dawn*, p700

Edward refers to Jacob as “my son”, reinforcing his own role as patriarch.¹⁷⁹ Lucas’ final interaction with the *upyrs*, particularly Vladimir, implies friendship rather than paternalism: “You saved my life, *bratan*,” [Vladimir] rumbled. “Friends till death.”¹⁸⁰ Despite the fact that they both have personal agendas, Lucas and the *upyr* group work together as equals. This makes their working relationship different from that established between the Cullen family and the Quileute werewolves. In effect, both Lucas and the *upyrs* cross borders, learning from one another; in the *Twilight* saga, the cultural borders initially maintained by the pack are subsumed by a process of assimilation.

The treaty line established by the pack’s ancestors and the Cullen family is a key factor in the assimilation of the pack by the colonialist vampires. As this thesis has already determined, the establishment of this boundary evokes treaties between American Indian nations and the United States government, legal agreements which invariably favoured the settlers’ interests over that of the indigenous peoples.¹⁸¹ However, the treaty line is problematic both in its establishment and the manner in which it is maintained. The series implies that the treaty line is a necessity, a result of the Quileutes’ intolerance towards the Cullens, who are consistently characterised as heroic, godlike creatures. This intolerance is emphasised in the attitudes of Billy and Sam, who display extreme hostility towards the vampire family:

¹⁷⁹ Ibid, p723

¹⁸⁰ *Wolf Mark*, p373

¹⁸¹ Leggatt and Burnett points out that ‘Neither the Cullens nor the US government gave up anything in the treaty process; the Cullens were already “vegetarian”, so their lives were not altered to accommodate the Quileute, and the settler government acquired vast tracts of Native land without resorting to costly military solutions’ (‘Biting Bella’, *Twilight and History*, p29)

Jacob looked away again, ashamed. “Don’t get mad, okay?”

“There’s no way I’ll be mad at you, Jacob,” I assured him. “I won’t even be mad at Billy. Just say what you have to.”

“Well – this is so stupid, I’m sorry, Bella – he wants you to break up with your boyfriend. He asked me to tell you ‘please’.”¹⁸²

Although Bella now knows that Billy is correct about the Cullens, she dismisses his belief as ‘superstitious’,¹⁸³ a deliberate echo of Jacob’s earlier description of ‘Quileute legends’ as the beliefs of ‘superstitious natives’.¹⁸⁴ This passage codes Billy and the rest of the tribe as bigoted, rather than as resisting colonisation. Additionally, the series frequently shows the Quileute characters disrespecting the treaty. After telling Bella about the Cullens’ true natures, Jacob laughs “I guess I just violated the treaty.”¹⁸⁵ Later, in *Eclipse*, there is a clash between Paul and Emmett during a hunt for Victoria:

“He didn’t tell you that his big...*brother* crossed the line Saturday night?” he asked, his tone thickly layered with sarcasm. Then his eyes flickered back to Edward. “Paul was totally justified in-”

“It was no-man’s land!” Edward hissed.

“Was not!”¹⁸⁶

It is important to note that, during this discussion, the true facts of who crossed the treaty line first – Emmett or Paul – are not established. However, Edward’s near-omniscience implies that he is correct about the location being ‘no-man’s land’. The assumption that the Quileutes are in the wrong is underscored by the fact that Bella immediately thinks of Paul’s unpredictability, rather than Emmett’s equally well-established penchant for fighting; ‘Paul was Jacob’s most volatile

¹⁸² *Twilight*, p427

¹⁸³ *Ibid.*

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, p109

¹⁸⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁸⁶ *Eclipse*, p78

pack brother. He was the one who'd lost control that day in the woods – the memory of the snarling gray wolf was suddenly vivid in my head'.¹⁸⁷ Edward upholds the treaty even when he fears Bella may be in danger, following Jacob and Bella's 'prison break' in *Eclipse*. By contrast, Jacob is often tempted to attack the vampires, even when the rest of the pack are reluctant to do so:

Well, what are we waiting for? I asked.
No one said anything, but I heard their feelings of hesitation.
*Oh, come on! The treaty's broken!*¹⁸⁸

In this instance, Sam vetoes Jacob's wish to move against the Cullens, telling him '*Jacob, I have to think about what's best for this pack...Times have changed since our ancestors made that treaty. I...well, I don't honestly believe that the Cullens are a danger to us*'.¹⁸⁹ However, following the revelation that Bella is pregnant, Sam mobilises the pack to attack the vampires, despite the fact that this does not violate the terms of the treaty; Bella has been impregnated, not bitten. Portraying prominent Quileutes as the parties most likely to break the treaty is in direct conflict with the history of treaties between Native peoples and the United States government.¹⁹⁰ The group of Native American characters is presented as eager to breach established boundaries, and it is implied that assimilation is the only way to inhibit their unregulated natures. *Wolf Mark* emphasises Lucas' autonomy, and a sense of equality and comradeship between himself and the *upyrs*. Jacob and his brothers, on the other hand, are

¹⁸⁷ Ibid, p79

¹⁸⁸ *Breaking Dawn*, pp160-161

¹⁸⁹ Ibid.

¹⁹⁰ Following the 'Indian Wars' of the nineteenth century, Red Cloud stated that "They [the settlers and the US government and army] made us many promises, more than I can remember, but they kept only one; they promised to take our land, and they did."

represented as subordinate to the paternalistic Cullens, in need of having their boundaries established for them; entirely infantilised.

Collapsing the Boundaries: The texts' dissolution of borders and frontiers

In *Unsettling Narratives*, Bradford argues that the nature of boundaries and frontiers in colonial and postcolonial texts is complex:

Colonial frontiers were never simply lines between races, no matter how strenuously colonial discourses sought to maintain racialized distinctions. Boundaries in modern settler nations are even more indistinct, blurred by the mingling and interpretation of identities that characterizes the contact zone; in many texts, negotiations between cultures are mapped through narratives involving journeys and border crossings.¹⁹¹

The texts all use border crossings to explore these negotiations between cultures, but the methods they use differ greatly. The *Twilight* saga portrays the border as established and maintained primarily by the Quileutes, who deliberately wish to isolate themselves from the settler-like Cullens. The 'treaty line' is eventually dissolved by Jacob's relationship with Renesmee. This is depicted as a desirable outcome, indicating a growth in tolerance and understanding between the two groups. However, Wilson's critical reading of the text reveals that it is an implicit promotion of assimilation and colonisation. The series implies that the Quileutes, not the Cullens, must learn tolerance, and must compromise on situations that contravene their ethical beliefs.

Additionally, Jacob's alliance with the Cullens corresponds with Bradford's description of a Western rather than a Native form of personal growth; 'Self-

¹⁹¹ *Unsettling Narratives*, p148

actualization as it is represented in mainstream [Euro-American] children's texts often incorporates a shift out of poverty, or from a lower-class habitus to one marked by access to cultural signs such as books and classical music'.¹⁹² This process of self-actualisation is entirely individualistic, with no emphasis on the importance of community ties, a central aspect of many Native cultures. As Wilson describes, Jacob crosses the treaty line to become the adopted son of a wealthy white household. This transition is portrayed as wholly positive, with none of the negative implications of assimilation considered or unpacked. Jacob's relocation has distanced him from his Quileute peers – he is no longer able to communicate telepathically with members of Sam's pack. The scene in which he imprints on Renesmee explicitly states that Jacob's new relationship has severed his emotional ties with his family and community:

Everything that made me who I was – my love for the dead girl upstairs, my love for my father, my loyalty to my new pack, my love for my other brothers, my hatred for my enemies, my home, my name, my *self* – disconnected from me in that second – *snip, snip, snip* – and floated up into space.¹⁹³

Jacob's imprinting is a neat solution to the series' love triangle. The novel emphasises the fact that this is a positive conclusion for Jacob; he no longer feels any emotional pain over Bella. However, to achieve this, Jacob has lost 'everything that made [him] who [he] was', including his cultural ties to the Quileute nation; he has assimilated totally into the Cullen family. Although he is still the leader of a pack, their primary motivation is the protection of Renesmee, and of the other Cullens by proxy. The purpose of the imprinter is to fulfil the

¹⁹² Ibid, p189

¹⁹³ *Breaking Dawn*, p360

every need of their imprintee; therefore, Jacob exists only to serve Renesmee and the Cullens. By the end of the series, he has become an updated and supernatural version of the “good” Indian, sacrificing his heritage, culture and self in order to protect and serve a settler society. Initially a ‘device’, Jacob is developed over the course of the series into a well-rounded character; however, by the conclusion of the final novel, he has returned to the position of a ‘building block’, used to bolster a narrative that centres non-Native heroes and heroines.

Wolf Mark and *Tantalize* conclude with a different manifestation of the theme of border crossing. It is true that, by the end of their stories, the characters have transgressed various boundaries, both physical and metaphorical. However, unlike Jacob, this transgression has not resulted in their disconnection from their cultural heritages. At the end of *Wolf Mark*, Lucas has begun a relationship with Meena and has developed close friendships with the *upyrs*. However, he has crossed these cultural borders by embracing his Native heritage, rather than disengaging from it, as Jacob does. His friendship with the ‘Sunglass Mafia’ and romantic relationship with Meena are both achieved by his actions as a shapeshifter, something which is explicitly connected to his Abenaki background. The most important physical frontier transgressed by Lucas occurs when he and the *upyrs* attack Maxico’s headquarters. However, despite the risk to his sense of self – embodied by the recombinants – Lucas crosses this border without experiencing the fragmentation or abjection often associated with border crossings in the Gothic. His status as Native is crucial to this; the postcolonial Gothic undertones of the novel stress that physical borders on land are an

artificial product of Western capitalism, making Lucas' transgression an act of counter-colonial resistance.

A similar process can be found in the *Tantalize* series. *Diabolical* finds Quincie and Kieren confirming their relationship, having overcome the boundaries between their cultures and species. As in *Wolf Mark*, they have not done so by abandoning their roots. Quincie still runs her mother's Italian restaurant, with the supernatural theme reflecting her new-found status as a vampire. However, the *Tantalize* series uses its protagonists' cultural backgrounds to emphasise the fact that these borders are socially constructed, rather than a biological given. As in *Wolf Mark*, these boundaries are not naturally occurring; however, the borders found within the *Tantalize* series are more complex and nuanced. Rather than being imposed by a single entity such as Maxico, the social boundaries in *Tantalize* have developed over time, as a result of a myriad of perspectives and biases. The characters' different heritages initially seem to separate them; however, as the series progresses, it becomes apparent that their various personal histories have created more similarities than differences. For example, Kieren's status as a human-werewolf hybrid and Quincie's as a neophyte vampire initially seems to be an insurmountable obstacle to their romantic connection, as indicated by the reaction of a community of werewolves in *Blessed*:

"I won't pretend to understand why you would fight alongside Satan's minions or take one as your mate...[but] you will be celebrated..." Ivo glared at [Quincie]. "No matter the mistakes you have made. We understand all too well the seductive power of evil."¹⁹⁴

¹⁹⁴ *Blessed*, p365

However, Quincie is also a half-human hybrid of sorts. Although she is a vampire, with the associated supernatural powers, the fact that she has not killed means that her soul has remained intact. This has the effect of making her impervious to holy water and Zachary's heavenly light, something she has in common with her human counterparts. Like Kieren, Quincie straddles the line between the human and the supernatural; as a result, their relationship is easier than it had been when Quincie was entirely human. Kieren's superhuman strength is no longer a threat to her safety, as Quincie's power matches his. The two characters' religious heritages also play an important role in their relationship. As well as being of different species, Quincie and Kieren are from different cultural backgrounds; Italian-American, and Irish/Mexican-American. However, the fact that they both come from predominately Catholic cultures serves to connect them in both a natural and supernatural context; they are both a part of the same Catholic community, and adopt the same religious artefact, the crucifix, in order to protect themselves against hostile vampires. This aspect of the narrative suggests that borders can be crossed by finding existing common ground, rather than through assimilation.

While the *Twilight* series focuses on assimilation as a method of breaking down barriers between cultural groups, *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series explore the possibilities of multiculturalism. Meyer unconsciously privileges white Euro-American culture, assuming that the Cullens' lavish lifestyle constitutes a 'happily ever after' not only for Bella, but for Jacob.¹⁹⁵ Bruchac and Leitich Smith,

¹⁹⁵ *Breaking Dawn*, p742

by contrast, present cultural diversity as empowering. Meyer's narrative breaks down borders by annihilating cultural differences; Bruchac's and Leitch Smith's dismantle boundaries by presenting cultural distinctions as something to be cherished. In *Twilight*, settler tactics win out, while the worlds of *Wolf Mark* and *Tantalize* celebrate the concept of distinct but co-existent societies. In *Wolf Mark*, this is reflected by Bruchac's use of physical space and landscape in the novel's final scenes; Lucas and Meena move freely between the town and the forest, symbolising their ability to cross cultures while remaining true to their own backgrounds. Quincie has reinscribed her Gothic space in the form of her restaurant, taking control of an environment that was once used to control and threaten her. Bella, too, transcends boundaries and takes command of a Gothic space; however, in doing so, she subordinates the two prominent Native characters, Jacob and Leah. *Twilight's* use of Gothic landscapes and borders echoes historical processes of colonisation, whereas both *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series look forward to a decolonised future.

Conclusion

Destroying the Colonist's House: The impact of colonial and counter-colonial texts

Commercial Colonialism: The impact of the *Twilight* saga

One of the peculiarities of vampire fiction is that it has – with great success – turned a real place into a fantasy...It is impossible now to hear the name *without* thinking of vampires; the very word invokes an image of something unbelievable, something which inhabits an imaginary space rather than a real one.¹

Although Gelder is discussing Transylvania, his words can now be applied just as readily to the towns of Forks and La Push. The success of the *Twilight* series has undoubtedly had some positive effects upon the local communities on the Olympic Peninsula. A report by ABC News details the effects on the two towns:

Vampires ordinarily suck life out. But in the case of one damp, depressed, timber town in Washington state, they have breathed life in. Before “*Twilight*” author Stephanie Meyer put pen to paper, Forks, Wash., was on the ropes...Then Meyer picked Forks as the setting for her first vampire/werewolf novel, and the world – or at least readers of her novels and the movies that they spawned – rushed in. That influx of tourists has worked powerfully to Forks’ advantage.²

The Independent reports that the popularity of the *Twilight* series has boosted the revenue from tourism in the area by 1000%.³ Restaurants in Forks serve ‘Bella

¹ *Reading the Vampire*, p1

² Alan Farnham, ‘“*Twilight*” Fans Tourist Bonanza for Forks, Wash.’, *ABC News* (<http://abcnews.go.com/Business/twilight-series-fans-tourism-bonanza-forks-wash/story?id=20883181>), accessed 31st December 2013

³ Chris Leadbeater, ‘The haunting natural beauty of Forks – and there’s more to it than “*Twilight* tourism”’, *The Independent* (<http://www.independent.co.uk/travel/americas/the-haunting-natural-beauty-of-forks--and-theres-more-to-it-than-twilight-tourism-8326115.html>), accessed 31st December 2013

Burgers', and other local businesses sell memorabilia referencing the series.⁴ However, while the non-reservation town of Forks may embrace the commercial side of the series, the situation is more complex for the Quileute Nation. A report on the Quileute reaction to *Twilight* tourism noted that the interactions between American Indian nations and the tourist industry have historically been problematic. Nelson argues that 'Many tribes...have wrestled for decades over how to reap the economic benefits of tourism without falling prey to cultural exploitation', stating that 'the very nature of tourism encourages the invasion of privacy', something that goes against the traditions of many American Indian nations.⁵ According to observers, 'The road leading to La Push from Highway 101 is now lined with references to *Twilight*...the Internet is filled with Quileute charms, jewelry, T-shirts – even bottles of sand allegedly gathered from First Beach. Almost none of this is sanctioned by the tribe'.⁶ The actions of tourists and marketers echo the earlier acts of settlers and colonists; Quileute land and culture is seen as public property, open to appropriation and exploitation.

The influx of tourists has allowed the Quileute nation to profit to some degree. Traditional crafts have been adapted to include *Twilight* influences, such as 'purple-and-white "Team Edward" yarn hats', while the reservation's youngsters sell 'handmade charm bracelets, rocks painted with wolf paw prints,

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Bryn Nelson, 'The Quileute reservation copes with tourists brought by *Twilight*', *High Country News* (<http://www.hcn.org/issues/44.11/the-quileute-reservation-copes-with-tourists-brought-by-twilight>), accessed 31st December 2013. Nelson continues by noting that 'Many cultural traditions value secrecy... "Many tribes have some amount of skepticism – and for good reason," says Ben Sherman, president of the Native Tourism Alliance in Louisville, Colo. "They have had their cultures and their lands exploited in the past by outsiders, by people who are not tribal members and who perhaps benefited from some manner of tourism."'

⁶ Ibid.

and “La Push” and “Quileute” stickers, earning enough money to buy back-to-school clothing and supplies’.⁷ However, this revenue is only a fraction of the amount that is being made by companies using the Quileute name to sell products. As revealed in *The New York Times*’ op-ed ‘Sucking the Quileute dry’. “Twilight” has made all things Quileute wildly popular: Nordstrom.com sells items from Quileute hoodies to charms bearing a supposed Quileute werewolf tattoo...Yet the tribe has received no payment for this commercial activity. Meanwhile, half of Quileute families still live in poverty.⁸ As Riley observes, ‘It’s important to point out that the outside uses of the Quileute name...are quite likely legal. American intellectual property laws, except in very specific circumstances, do not protect indigenous peoples’ collective cultural property’.⁹ The Indian Arts and Crafts Act¹⁰ does not apply to *Twilight* memorabilia referencing the Quileute nation, ‘because there is no claim they were made by the Quileute’.¹¹ As a result, many non-Native retailers are using the Quileute name to earn money, without any return to the community from which they are profiting. Other nations have taken legal action in order to prevent the exploitation of their names; for example, the Navajo nation ‘has about 10 registered trademarks on [their] name, covering clothing, footwear, online retail sales, household products and textiles’.¹² The

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Angela R. Riley, ‘Sucking the Quileute dry’, *The New York Times* (http://www.nytimes.com/2010/02/08/opinion/08riley.html?_r=0), accessed 31st December 2013

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ The Indian Arts and Crafts Act, passed in 1990, made it illegal to sell any art or craft product that falsely claims to be produced by an American Indian person or tribe. Violation of the Act can result in a hefty fine or a prison sentence.

¹¹ ‘Sucking the Quileute dry’

¹² Associated Press in Flagstaff, ‘Navajo Nation sues Urban Outfitters for trademark infringement’, *The Guardian* (<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/mar/01/navajo-nation-sues-urban-outfitters>), accessed 31st December 2013. The Navajo nation took the clothing company Urban

Quileute, however, have not trademarked their name, and thus have no comparable legal recourse.

Despite being carried out by businesses and corporations rather than the government, the activities of the *Twilight* tourist and memorabilia industry are no less colonialist in nature than policies such as the reservation system or Indian Removal. Fixico makes a direct link between nineteenth-century colonialism and the colonising effects of twentieth- and twenty-first century capitalism. He argues that ‘American capitalism, deriving from a tradition of Eurocentricism, has continued...to exploit tribal nations for their natural resources’; that modern capitalism is, in essence, neo-colonial.¹³ The tribe’s attempts to adapt to this imposition of capitalism has also caused internal tensions; Ann Penn-Charles reports that she has ‘felt judged by some tribal members because she knits the names of “Twilight” characters into traditional cowichin hats’, stating that “‘They’re resentful. They think we’re selling out...It’s not. It makes your car payment, or those braces your kids need’”.¹⁴ Colonial, capitalist practices have a ‘divide and rule’ effect upon the indigenous community of La Push, counteracting community cohesiveness and strength.

When considering the social position of Native peoples in present-day America, this economic exploitation of the people of La Push is not the only problematic consequence of the *Twilight* series. The inclusion of a real American Indian nation in a fantasy series serves to fictionalise the Quileutes in particular,

Outfitters to federal court as a result of their using the Navajo name and imagery on a range of clothing and accessories, including underwear and hip flasks.

¹³ *The Invasion of Indian Country in the Twentieth Century*, ppix-x

¹⁴ New York Post, ‘Vampire Vacation’, *New York Post* (<http://nypost.com/2009/07/05/vampire-vacation/>), accessed 1st January 2014

and Native Americans in general. Where early colonial texts gave non-Native readers and audiences the impression of a 'savage race', and later examples established the 'vanishing Indian', neo-colonial fantasies such as the *Twilight* saga continue the idea of Native Americans as mythological creatures. As Anatol writes, 'Through young adulthood, children are impressionable, and can be emotionally and intellectually prone to automatically accepting the ideological constructs underlying all texts'; young readers are less likely to apply critical thinking to texts that incorporate colonialist messages, especially when those messages are reflected throughout society.¹⁵ Although the 'ideological constructs' Anatol refers to include gender stereotypes and hierarchies, the erasure of real Native peoples and their replacement with a fictionalised version is a central part of colonial ideology. The introduction to this thesis analysed Miranda's statement that American Indian characters are 'used, like building materials, to construct the façade of conquest, a place to house the Doctrine of Discovery'.¹⁶ The impact of the *Twilight* series suggests that this practice has continued into the twenty-first century. While the novels do not date from or focus on the colonial period, they embody neo-colonialist ideals, privileging whiteness and appropriating aspects of Native cultures in order to build their own mythology.

Jacob, Leah and the other Quileutes are undoubtedly more nuanced than the 'wild savages' of earlier children's literature. They are given developed personalities and motivations, and, in the case of Jacob, take a central role in the

¹⁵ Gisele Liza Anatol, 'Introduction', *Bringing Light to Twilight*, p4

¹⁶ Foreword, *A Broken Flute*, p2

narrative. However, the negative aspects of Meyer's use of the Quileute characters outweigh the positive. While Jacob and the rest of the pack are not one-dimensional, simplistically portrayed 'savages', they are associated with many 'savage' tropes; their animal forms and their aggressive sexualities both correspond with stereotypes of the American Indian as 'wild' and dangerous. They are subordinated to the colonising Cullens, and this conquest is presented as an ideal and beneficial outcome. These problematic aspects of the depiction of the Quileute characters are never examined or deconstructed during the series. As a result, it is likely that young readers will simply accept the assimilationist undertones of the *Twilight* saga, and mentally relegate the Quileute people to the realm of fiction. The entitled attitudes of businesses and tourists have already made it apparent that Quileute culture is viewed as open to exploitation; *High Country News* reports 'an MSN.com film crew working on a virtual Twilight tour filmed the reservation's cemetery without permission, pairing grainy images of the gravesites of respected elders with a creepy soundtrack'.¹⁷ This led to the Quileute Nation demanding an apology and removal of the footage, and the adoption of an etiquette guide for tourists.¹⁸ These guidelines include instructions such as 'Please be attentive to signage, and obey our individual tribal rules and regulations', 'Ask before photographing or recording an individual, an event, or activity', and 'Burial grounds and religious ceremonies are sacred and are not to be entered'.¹⁹ The need to state these rules explicitly

¹⁷ 'The Quileute reservation copes with tourists brought by *Twilight*', *High Country News*

¹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁹ Quileute Nation, 'Indian Country Etiquette', *Quileute Nation* (<http://www.quileutenation.org/indian-country-etiquette>), accessed 1st January 2014

implies that tourists and businesses have continued to engage in these activities. These attitudes correspond with Root's description of appropriation as the viewing of another culture as 'a vast warehouse of images' which can be consumed without repercussions.²⁰

Decentring Whiteness: Counter-colonial writing in *Wolf Mark*

Native-authored novels such as *Wolf Mark* and the *Tantalize* series challenge the implicitly neo-colonial undertones of series like the *Twilight* saga. *Wolf Mark* focuses on a Native protagonist who refuses to assimilate to a Western agenda, and includes extensive and accurate passages on Abenaki and other Native cultures. A common criticism of mainstream children's and young adult literature is that it centres whiteness; according to an article by Soraya Chemaly, 'the majority of children's books [are] still about white boys':²¹

The Cooperative Children's Book Center at the University of Wisconsin-Madison School of Education has conducted a survey of all kids and young adult books published each year since 1985. Of an estimated 5,000 children's and YA books released in 2012, only 3.3% featured African-Americans; 2.1% featured Asian-Americans or Pacific Islanders; 1.5% featured Latinos; and only 0.6% featured Native Americans.²²

Reading novels and seeing films with non-white characters can be beneficial to young white readers and audiences. Chemaly argues that 'Boys who grow up seeing themselves everywhere as powerful and central just by virtue of being

²⁰ *Cannibal Culture*, ppx-xi

²¹ Soraya Chemaly, 'Why are the majority of children's books still about white boys?', *Role/Reboot*, (<http://www.rolereboot.org/culture-and-politics/details/2013-09-why-are-the-majority-of-childrens-books-still-about>), published 5th September 2013, accessed 1st January 2014

²² *Ibid.*

boys, often white, are critically impaired in many ways.²³ Although Chemaly is focusing primarily on gender disparity in children's literature, her argument can be applied equally to the effect that privileging whiteness has on white readers, who are encouraged to implicitly centre themselves and consider non-white people and characters as 'Other'. In *Essentials of Children's Literature*, the authors discuss this aim of challenging Othering through texts aimed at young readers:

The goal of those who write, publish, and promote multicultural and international children's literature is to help young people learn about, understand, and ultimately accept those different from themselves...when young people read multicultural or international literature and realize how similar they are to children of different cultures...They are also challenged not to consider their own culture as the "norm" against which others are judged as strange or exotic.²⁴

However, this perspective still assumes that these 'young people' will be white, Euro-American readers, rather than young readers of colour who wish to see themselves reflected in the media they consume. Bruchac's focus on Abenaki culture in *Wolf Mark* suggests a deliberate countering of this assumption; he intentionally constructs a family and cultural atmosphere that is more likely to be familiar to young Native readers. Although the novel contains some historical and social backgrounds on American Indian nations, the tone of the novel does not imply that it is explaining this context to an outsider. While *Wolf Mark* contains some information on Native American histories and societies for non-Abenaki readers, these explanations do not overwhelm the narrative. This avoids positioning them as Other; instead of the text being constructed as a teaching

²³ 'Why are the majority of children's books still about white boys?'

²⁴ *Essentials of Children's Literature*, p216

tool for an outsider, it creates an assertively American Indian setting for young Native readers. The need for people of colour to see themselves represented in popular media is explored in a discussion between Zetta Elliott and Ibi Aanu Zoboi, who state that '[the]longing is so deep, you gravitate toward anything that comes up'.²⁵

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: www.bitchmagazine.org

Representations of modern American Indian characters will help to counter the popular conception that 'John Wayne killed' all of the original inhabitants of North America. Lucas is a high-schooler with family problems and a crush on his best friend, who can also fight Bond-style villains and transform into a superpowered, supernatural creature; traits which make him both a reader-

²⁵ Zetta Elliott, 'Black Girls Hunger for Heroes, Too: A black feminist conversation on fantasy fiction for teens', *Bitch Magazine* (<http://bitchmagazine.org/post/black-girls-hunger-for-heroes-too-a-black-feminist-conversation-on-fantasy-fiction-for-teens>), published 17th December 2013, accessed 1st January 2014

identification and a reader-aspiration character. This gives him a similar status to protagonists like Harry Potter or Artemis Fowl, rather than relegating him to the position of an exotic token. The similarities between the construction of Lucas and Jacob as characters are immediately apparent; however, the differences in the ways that their stories are resolved are important. Jacob ends his story as subordinate to a white, settler family, and specifically to a newborn baby. Lucas ends his as an empowered young man with the abilities and experience necessary to face future challenges.

Writing Resistance: Opposition of assimilation in the *Tantalize* series

The methods used to produce a counter-colonial narrative in the *Tantalize* series are more subtle; there are no explicitly Native characters. However, Leitch Smith includes anti-assimilationist messages in her novels; for example, the narrative of resistance that runs through the boarding school scenes in the final novel, *Diabolical*. Government policies enacted against American Indian peoples, such as the concept of blood quantum, are reflected in issues such as the medical status of shifters in Leitch Smith's paranormal universe. While Bruchac overtly decentralises whiteness by focusing primarily on Abenaki and Pakistani protagonists, Leitch Smith's novels comprise a more implicit critique of the impact of colonialism on present-day American society. She constructs a narrative heavily influenced by American Indian cultures and social discourses. For example, her heroines not only 'take care of their own rescues, [but] save the

men, too!', a trait that, according to Bruchac, is typical of legends belonging to various American Indian cultures.²⁶

Several other aspects of the *Tantalize* series suggest that Leitich Smith is placing an emphasis on Native rather than Western systems of belief. The inclusion of gay, lesbian and bisexual characters in the narrative is in keeping with traditional views of non-heteronormative people common to many different American Indian nations. These characters are not Othered; their sexualities are not portrayed as 'exotic' or unusual, but simply as part of their natures. Similarly, while religion and spirituality occupies a central position in the series, all beliefs are given equal weight, and proselytising is avoided. Andrea Smith notes that 'Indians do not generally believe that their way is "the" way', a view shared by Leitich Smith's angels, and apparently by her version of God, the 'Big Boss'.²⁷ These aspects of the novels implicitly defy current Western and neo-colonialist norms, where heterosexuality and Christianity are privileged.

Quincie and Miranda resist assimilation into the vampire world, which would ultimately destroy their moralities and their senses of self. If colonialism is read as vampiric, then the two heroines' defiance can be viewed as counter-colonial acts. Both young women refuse to consume human blood; they therefore refuse to benefit from the destruction of other human beings, and do not engage in the exploitation of human bodies. Exploitation of the body, and the destruction and consumption of humanity, are integral parts of the colonialism that was enacted against, and continues to affect, American Indian peoples. Quincie and

²⁶ *Skeleton Man*, pi

²⁷ Andrea Smith, 'For All Those Who Were Indian in a Former Life' (<http://www.manataka.org/page1113.html>)

Miranda are not the only protagonists of Leitch Smith's who rewrite the social and cultural narratives which are applied to them in the form of stereotypes, and, as a result, gain agency. Kieren refuses to become a 'beast', but negotiates his status as a shapeshifter on his own terms, retaining his sense of self and his control; a stark contrast to the stereotype of the unruly and threatening man of colour that is found in the *Twilight* saga. Rather than being represented as animalistic, Kieren is described as 'magnificent', having total control over both his body and his place in the world.²⁸ By the end of the series, he is connected fully to both his human and werewolf sides, and is in a loving, equal relationship with Quincie; unlike Jacob, whose desires are permanently subordinated to those of his imprinted partner, Renesmee.

Unvanishing Indians: The impact of Native-written young adult fantasy

Both Bruchac and Leitch-Smith decentralise whiteness, featuring protagonists who are Native American, Chinese-American and Mexican-American. As a result, these novels are unusual within young adult fantasy literature. As the *Tantalize* novels and *Wolf Mark* were written following the success of the *Twilight* saga, they can be read as a response to Meyer's centring of whiteness, and her presentation of Native peoples and themes such as gender, race, religion and sexuality. Where *Twilight* is implicitly colonial, *Wolf Mark* and *Tantalize* are staunchly counter-colonial. However, the extent to which Bruchac and Leitch Smith achieve these counter-colonial aims is debatable. Neither text has gained

²⁸ *Blessed*, p430

popularity equivalent to that of the *Twilight* series; while Bruchac and Leitich Smith are both successful authors, their novels have not become a worldwide phenomenon like Meyer's. At the time of writing, there is no indication that either *Wolf Mark* or *Tantalize* will be adapted for film, and the novels, unlike the *Twilight* series, have not inspired conferences and conventions, or generated volumes of critical analysis. While Bruchac and Leitich Smith's novels are important examples of counter-colonial writing, they simply have not reached as many readers as Meyer's series. As a result, they have less impact within the field of young adult literature.

Although the *Twilight* novels have sparked contention amongst critics, they do not break new ground in the genre of young adult literature. This may explain the basis of their appeal. The series is, at root, a predictable story, centring on a young, white, attractive heroine who defeats her enemies and finds true love. By contrast, the first novel in the *Tantalize* series ends with a parting; Quincie may have defeated Brad, but this does not prevent Kieren from leaving to join his new pack. *Wolf Mark*, despite ending with a kiss, focuses on an Abenaki hero and a Pakistani heroine, a pairing that would be highly unusual in the whitewashed world of bestselling young adult fantasy or Hollywood blockbusters. While the novels have enjoyed some acclaim, they perhaps remain too 'Other' to be considered by mainstream American society.²⁹ Nevertheless,

²⁹ *Wolf Mark* was selected for CBC Diversity's Goodreads bookshelf (Debbie Reese, 'Thumbs up to some titles on CBC Diversity's Goodreads Bookshelf', *American Indians in Children's Literature* (<http://americanindiansinchildrensliterature.blogspot.co.uk/2013/01/thumbs-up-to-some-titles-on-cbc.html>), published 7th January 2013, accessed 1st January 2014). According to their website, 'CBC Diversity Committee is one of five committees established by the Children's Book Council, the national nonprofit trade association for children's trade book publishers. We are dedicated to

the importance of Bruchac and Leitich Smith's texts must not be downplayed. As a result of their publication, Native readers may have more opportunity to see characters similar to themselves as part of a popular genre. Presenting Native peoples as part of this genre can be viewed as a step against the Othering that forms an implicit part of mainstream texts such as *Twilight*.

Texts are not only influenced by society, but influence society in their turn. As the news reports from La Push indicate, the representations of the Quileute nation in the *Twilight* saga have had a notable impact on the way this particular tribe is viewed by US society; as commodities and exotic objects available for popular consumption. American Indians are represented as fantastic, animalistic creatures who are distanced from mainstream society, which is coded as white and human. However, as Wilson argues, 'our world may be far from the post-racial, post-feminist utopia some claim, but it can at least be post-*Twilight* if we...refuse the seductive message that falling in love with a sparkly vampire will solve all our problems'.³⁰ *Tantalize* and *Wolf Mark* do indeed 'refuse [this] seductive message'; their protagonists resist the imposition of settler colonialist norms, focusing instead on building diverse and egalitarian social groups. The two Native-authored novels push back against the representation of American Indian characters as 'cool options' or exotic window-dressing; instead, they position Native peoples and ways of thinking as relevant, current, and central. A centring of American Indian characters in popular literature and film may result in a centring of Native peoples in the modern United States consciousness, and an

increasing the diversity of voices and experiences contributing to children's and young adult literature' (<http://www.cbcdiversity.com/about>)

³⁰ *Seduced by Twilight*, pp7-8

ultimate countering of erasure, appropriation, and the trope of the 'vanishing Indian'. Rather than being reduced to 'building blocks', the Native and other non-white characters in these texts build their own narratives and negotiate their own agency, promoting diversity and taking advantage of the potential for radicalism that exists in postcolonial young adult fantasy literature.

Bibliography

Books

Adams, Rachel, and David Savran, editors, *The Masculinity Studies Reader* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2002)

Alcoff, Linda Martín, and Eduardo Mendieta, editors, *Identities: Race, class, gender and nationality* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005; first published 2003)

Alcoff, Linda Martín, *Visible Identities: Race, gender, and the self* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)

Alexie, Sherman, *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian* (London: Andersen Press Limited, 2008; first published in the United States of America by Little, Brown and Company, 2007)

Allen, Paula Gunn, *The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the feminine in American Indian traditions* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1992; first published 1986)

Anatol, Giselle Liza, editor, *Bringing Light to Twilight: Perspectives on a pop culture phenomenon* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011)

Andersen, Margaret L., and Patricia Hill Collins, editors, *Race, Class, and Gender: An anthology* (Belmont: Thomson Higher Education, 2007)

Auerbach, Nina, *Our Vampires, Ourselves* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995)

Banks, Lynne Reid, *The Indian in the Cupboard* (London: Lions, 1992; first published by J. M. Dent & Sons Ltd., 1981)

Banks, Lynne Reid, *The Key to the Indian* (London: Collins, 1999; first published 1998)

Banks, Lynne Reid, *The Return of the Indian* (London: Lions, 1992; first published 1986)

Banks, Lynne Reid, *The Secret of the Indian* (London: Lions, 1990; first published 1989)

Barney, Garold D., *Mormons, Indians, and the Ghost Dance Religion of 1890* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1986)

Barber, Paul, *Vampires, Burial, and Death: Folklore and reality* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988)

Barlow, Philip L., *Mormons and the Bible: The place of the Latter-day Saints in American religion* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991)

Barrie, J. M., *Peter Pan & Peter Pan in Kensington Gardens* (Ware: Wordsworth Editions Limited, 2007)

Barrie, J. M., *The Definitive Edition of the Plays of J. M. Barrie*, edited by A. E. Wilson (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1948; first published 1928)

Basson, Lauren L., *White Enough to be American?: Race mixing, indigenous people, and the boundaries of state and nation* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2008)

Bataille, Gretchen M., editor, *Native American Representations: First encounters, distorted images and literary appropriations* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2001)

Battiste, Marie, editor, *Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2000)

Berkhofer Jr., Robert F., *The White Man's Indian: Images of the American Indian from Columbus to the present* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979; first published 1978)

Berlet, Chip, and Matthew N. Lyons, *Right-Wing Populism in America: Too close for comfort* (New York: The Guilford Press, 2000)

Bhavnani, Kum-Kum, editor, *Feminism and 'Race'* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001)

Bigelow, Bill, and Bob Peterson, editors, *Rethinking Columbus: The next 500 years* (Milwaukee: Rethinking Schools, 1996)

Bigler, David L., and Will Bagley, *Kingdom in the West: The Mormons and the American Frontier, Volume 12: Innocent Blood: Essential narratives of the Mountain Meadows Massacre* (Norman: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 2008)

Bird, S. Elizabeth, editor, *Dressing in Feathers: The construction of the Indian in American popular culture* (Boulder: Westview Press, Inc., 1996)

Bleys, Rudi C., *The Geography of Perversion: Male-to-male sexual behaviour outside the West and the ethnographic imagination 1750-1918* (London: Cassell, 1996)

Bodart, Joni Richards, *They Suck, They Bite, They Eat, They Kill: The psychological meaning of supernatural monsters in young adult fiction* (Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 2012)

Bottigheimer, Ruth B., *Grimms' Bad Girls and Bold Boys: The moral and social vision of the Tales* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987)

Botting, Fred, *Gothic* (London: Routledge, 1996)

Botting, Fred, *Gothic Romanced: Consumption, gender and technology in contemporary fictions* (London: Routledge, 2008)

Botting, Fred, *Limits of Horror: Technology, bodies, Gothic* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2008)

Bowden, Henry Warner, *American Indians and Christian Missions: Studies in cultural conflict* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1981)

Bradford, Clare, Kerry Mallan, John Stephens and Robyn McCallum, *New World Orders in Contemporary Children's Literature: Utopian transformations* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008)

Bradford, Clare, *Unsettling Narratives: Postcolonial readings of children's literature* (Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007)

Brenzo, Richard Allen, *Civilization Against the Savage: The destruction of Indians in American novels, 1823-1854* (Thesis submitted to the University of Wisconsin, 1973)

Brink, Carol Ryrie, *Caddie Woodlawn* (New York: Aladdin Paperbacks, 1962; first published 1935)

Brown, Charles Brockden, *Edgar Huntly: or, Memoirs of a sleep-walker* (Reprinted by BiblioBazaar Reproduction Series)

Brown, Heloise, Madi Gilkes and Ann Kaloski-Naylor, editors, *White? Women: Critical perspectives on race and gender* (York: Raw Nerve Books, 1999)

Brown, Michael K., Martin Carnoy, Elliott Currie, Troy Duster, David B. Oppenheimer, Marjorie M. Shultz and David Wettman, *Whitewashing Race: The myth of a color-blind society* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003)

Bruchac, Joseph, *Children of the Longhouse* (New York: Puffin Books, 1998; first published 1996)

Bruchac, Joseph, *Skeleton Man* (New York: HarperCollins, 2001)

Bruchac, Joseph, Janet Witalec and Sharon Malinowski, editors, *Smoke Rising: The Native North American literary companion* (Detroit: Visible Ink Press, 1995)

Bruchac, Joseph, *The Heart of a Chief* (New York: Puffin Books, 1998)

Bruchac, Joseph, *The Return of Skeleton Man* (New York: HarperTrophy, 2008; first published 2006)

Bruchac, Joseph, *Wolf Mark* (New York: Tu Books, 2011)

Bushman, Richard Lyman, *Mormonism: A very short introduction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008)

Butcher, Jim, *Cold Days* (London: Orbit, 2012)

Butcher, Jim, *Fool Moon* (London: Orbit, 2001)

Butcher, Jim, *Turn Coat* (London: Orbit, 2009)

Byrne, Bridget, *White Lives: The interplay of 'race', class and gender in everyday life* (London: Routledge, 2006)

Cameron, Deborah, editor, *The Feminist Critique of Language: A reader* (London: Routledge, 1990)

Cast, P. C. and Kristin, *Marked* (London: Atom, 2010; first published in the United States in 2007)

Castiglia, Christopher, *Bound and Determined: Captivity, culture-crossing, and white womanhood from Mary Rowlandson to Patty Hearst* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996)

Castle, Kathryn, *Britannia's Children: Reading colonialism through children's books and magazines* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1996)

Clarke, Amy M., and Marijane Osborn, editors, *The Twilight Mystique: Critical essays on the novels and films* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2010)

Click, Melissa A., Jennifer Stephens Aubrey and Elizabeth Behm-Morawitz, editors, *Bitten By Twilight: Youth culture, media, and the vampire franchise* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., 2010)

Collins, Jo, and John Jervis, editors, *Uncanny Modernity: Cultural theories, modern anxieties* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008)

Cornwall, Andrea, and Nancy Lindisfarne, editors, *Dislocating Masculinity: Comparative ethnographies* (London: Routledge, 1994)

Cousineau, Phil, *A Seat at the Table: Huston Smith in conversation with Native Americans on religious freedom* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006)

Craig, Steve, editor, *Men, Masculinity and the Media* (London: Sage Publications Ltd., 1992)

Creed, Barbara, *The Monstrous-Feminine: Film, feminism, psychoanalysis* (London: Routledge, 1993)

Crow, Charles L., editor, *American Gothic: From Salem witchcraft to H. P. Lovecraft, an anthology* (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013)

Dalgliesh, Alice, *The Courage of Sarah Noble* (New York: Aladdin Paperbacks, 2000; first published 1954)

Day, Peter, editor, *Vampires: Myths and metaphors of enduring evil* (New York: Rodopi, 2006)

Day, William Patrick, *In the Circles of Fear and Desire: A study of Gothic fantasy* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1985)

Deloria. Philip J., *Playing Indian* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998)

Demos, John, *The Tried and the True: Native American women confronting colonization* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995)

DePalma, Renée, and Elizabeth Atkinson, editors, *Invisible Boundaries: Addressing sexualities equality in children's worlds* (Stoke on Trent: Trentham Books Limited, 2008)

Dorris, Michael A., *American Indian Stereotypes in the World of Children: A reader and bibliography* (Metuchen: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1982)

Dreese, Donelle N., *Ecocriticism: Creating self and place in environmental and American Indian literatures* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., 2002)

Dundes, Alan, editor, *The Study of Folklore* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1965)

Edwards, Kathryn A., editor, *Werewolves, Witches, and Wandering Spirits: Traditional belief and folklore in early modern Europe* (Kirkville: Truman State University Press, 2002)

Erdoes, Richard, and Alfonso Ortiz, editors, *American Indian Myths and Legends* (London: Pimlico, 1997; first published 1984)

Fanon, Frantz, *Black Skin, White Masks*, translated by Charles Lam Markmann (London: Pluto Press, 1986; first published 1952)

Fanon, Frantz, *The Wretched of the Earth*, translated by Constance Farrington (London: Penguin Books Ltd., 1974; first published 1961)

Fehrenbach, T. R., *Comanches: The history of a people* (London: Vintage Books, 2007; first published 1974)

Felton, Mark, *Today is a Good Day to Fight: The Indian Wars and the conquest of the West* (Stroud: The History Press, 2009)

Fine, Cordelia, *Delusion of Gender: The real science behind sex difference* (London: Icon Books Ltd, 2010)

Fixico, Donald L., *The Invasion of Indian Country in the Twentieth Century: American capitalism and tribal natural resources* (Niwot: University Press of Colorado, 1998)

Frankenberg, Ruth, *White Women, Race Matters: The social construction of whiteness* (London: Routledge, 1993)

Frederickson, George M., *White Supremacy: A comparative study in American and South African history* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981)

Fry, Stephen, *The Stars' Tennis Balls* (London: Hutchinson, 2000)

Gaard, Greta, Simon C. Estok and Serpil Opperman, editors, *International Perspectives in Feminist Ecocriticism* (London: Routledge, 2013)

Gallagher, Nancy L., *Breeding Better Vermonters: The eugenics project in the Green Mountain state* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1999)

Gardner, Christine J., *Making Chastity Sexy: The rhetoric of evangelical abstinence campaigns* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011)

Garoutte, Eva Marie, *Real Indians: Identity and the survival of Native America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003)

- Gelder, Ken, *Reading the Vampire* (London: Routledge, 1994)
- Gillis, Stacey, Gillian Howie and Rebecca Munford, editors, *Third-Wave Feminism: A critical exploration* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007; first published 2004)
- Grounds, Richard A., George E. Tinker and David E. Wilkins, editors, *Native Voices: American Indian identity and resistance* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2003)
- Halberstam, Judith, *Female Masculinity* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1998)
- Hall, Stuart, editor, *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices* (London: Sage Publications Ltd, 1997)
- Harris, Joanne, *Runelight* (New York: Doubleday, 2011)
- Harris, Joanne, *Runemarks* (New York: Doubleday, 2007)
- Harris, Joanne, *The Gospel of Loki* (London: Gollancz, 2014)
- Heiland, Donna, *Gothic and Gender: An introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004)
- Hernández, Daisy, and Bushra Rehman, editors, *Colonize This! Young women of color on today's feminism* (Berkeley: Seal Press, 2002)
- Higham, C. L., *Noble, Wretched, and Redeemable: Protestant missionaries to the Indians in Canada and the United States, 1820-1900* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2000)
- Hogle, Jerrold E., editor, *The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002)
- Höglund, Johan, and Tabish Khair, editors, *Transnational and Postcolonial Vampires: Dark blood* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013)
- hooks, bell, *Killing Rage: Ending racism* (London: Penguin, 1995)
- hooks, bell, *Talking Back: Thinking feminist, thinking black* (Boston: South End Press, 1989)
- hooks, bell, *We Real Cool: Black men and masculinity* (New York: Routledge, 2004)

Hooper, Glenn, editor, *Landscape and Empire, 1720-2000* (Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2005)

Hunt, Peter, *Criticism, Theory, and Children's Literature* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Blackwell Publishers Inc., 1991)

Hurley, Kelly, *The Gothic Body: Sexuality, materialism, and degeneration at the fin de siècle* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)

Jackson, Anna, Karen Coats and Roderick McGillis, editors, *The Gothic in Children's Literature: Haunting the borders* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2008)

Joffs, Lori, and Laura Byrne-Cristiano, *The Twilight Saga: The official illustrated guide* (London: Atom, 2011)

Kane, Tim, *The Changing Vampire of Film and Television: A critical study of the growth of a genre* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., Publishers, 2006)

Khair, Tabish, *The Gothic, Postcolonialism and Otherness: Ghosts from elsewhere* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009)

Klug, Beverly J., and Patricia T. Whitfield, *Widening the Circle: Culturally relevant pedagogy for American Indian children* (New York: RoutledgeFalmer, 2003)

Krakauer, Jon, *Under the Banner of Heaven: A story of violent faith* (New York: Doubleday, 2004; first published 2003)

Kristeva, Julia, *Powers of Horror: An essay on abjection*, translated by Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1982)

Kupperman, Karen Ordahl, *Indians and English: Facing off in early America* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2000)

Laake, Deborah, *Secret Ceremonies: A Mormon woman's intimate diary of marriage and beyond* (London: Warner Books, 1995; first published 1993)

Langston, Donna Hightower, *The Native American World* (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2003)

Le Fanu, Joseph Sheridan, *Carmilla* (Kindle edition)

Lehr, Susan, editor, *Beauty, Brains, and Brawn: The construction of gender in children's literature* (Portsmouth, New Hampshire: Heinemann, 2001)

Leitch, Vincent B., editor, *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism* (London: W. W. Norton & Co., 2001)

- Leitch Smith, Cynthia, *Blessed* (London: Walker Books Ltd., 2011)
- Leitch Smith, Cynthia, *Diabolical* (Somerville, Massachusetts: Candlewick Press, 2012)
- Leitch Smith, Cynthia, *Tantalize* (London: Walker Books Ltd., 2008)
- Leitch Smith, Cynthia, *Tantalize: Kieren's Story* (Somerville: Candlewick Press, 2011)
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude, and Didier Eribon, translated by Paula Wissing, *Conversations with Claude Lévi-Strauss* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991; first published 1988)
- Levin, Maud, *Push Comes To Shove: New images of aggressive women* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press, 2010)
- Lewis, Matthew Gregory, *The Monk* (1796)
- Lewis, Reina, and Sara Mills, editors, *Feminist Postcolonial Theory: A reader* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003)
- Limerick, P. N., *The Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1987)
- Longstreet, Stephen, *War Cries on Horseback: The story of the Indian Wars of the Great Plains* (London: Sphere Books Limited, 1974; first published 1970)
- Lutz, Helma, Maria Teresa Herrera Vivar and Linda Supik, editors, *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies* (Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2011)
- Lynch-Brown, Carol G., Carl M. Tomlinson and Kathy G. Short, *Essentials of Children's Literature* (Harlow: Pearson Education Limited, 2014)
- Mann, Barbara Alice, *The Tainted Gift: The disease method of frontier expansion* (Santa Barbara: ABC Clio, 2009)
- McGillis, Roderick, *Voices of the Other: Children's literature and the postcolonial context* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 2000)
- Meyer, Stephenie, *Breaking Dawn* (London: Atom, 2008)
- Meyer, Stephenie, *Eclipse* (London: Atom, 2009; first published 2007)

- Meyer, Stephenie, *Midnight Sun*, unpublished partial draft (www.stepheniemeyer.com/midnightsun.html)
- Meyer, Stephenie, *New Moon* (London: Atom, 2009; first published 2006)
- Meyer, Stephenie, *Twilight* (London: Atom, 2008; first published 2005)
- Michno, Gregory and Susan, *A Fate Worse Than Death: Indian captivities in the West, 1830-1885* (Caldwell: Caxton Press, 2007)
- Miller, Robert J., *Native America, Discovered and Conquered: Thomas Jefferson, Lewis and Clark, and Manifest Destiny* (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2006)
- Morland, Iain, and Annabelle Willox, editors, *Queer Theory* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005)
- Murphy, Bernice M., *The Suburban Gothic in American Popular Culture* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009)
- Mutch, Deborah, editor, *The Modern Vampire and Human Identity* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013)
- Nagel, Joane, *American Indian Ethnic Renewal: Red Power and the resurgence of identity and culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997; first published 1996)
- Ní Fhlainn, Sorcha, editor, *Our Monstrous (S)kin: Blurring the boundaries between monsters and humanity* (Oxford: Inter-Disciplinary Press, 2009)
- O’Riordan, Kate, and David J. Phillips, editors, *Queer Online: Media technology and sexuality* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2007)
- Ortner, Sherry B., and Harriet Whitehead, editors, *Sexual Meanings: The cultural construction of gender and sexuality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981)
- Oshiro, Mark, *Mark Reads Breaking Dawn* (self-published ebook)
- Oshiro, Mark, *Mark Reads Eclipse: An (un)official journey through the experience of reading the third book in the Twilight series* (self-published e-book)
- Overstreet, Deborah Wilson, *Not Your Mother’s Vampire: Vampires in young adult fiction* (Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 2006)

Parke, Maggie, and Natalie Wilson, editors, *Theorizing Twilight: Critical essays on what's at stake in a post-vampire world* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2011)

Peake, Mervyn, *Gormenghast* (London: Eyre & Spottiswode, 1950)

Peake, Mervyn, *Titus Alone* (London: Eyre & Spottiswode, 1959)

Peake, Mervyn, *Titus Groan* (London: Eyre & Spottiswoode, 1946)

Preiswerk, Roy, editor, *The Slant of the Pen: Racism in children's books* (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1980)

Punter, David, and Glennis Byron, *The Gothic* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2004)

Reagin, Nancy R., editor, *Twilight and History* (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2010)

Reynolds, Kimberley, *Radical Children's Literature: Future visions and aesthetic transformations in juvenile fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007)

Riess, Jana, and Christopher Kimball Bigelow, *Mormonism for Dummies* (Hoboken: Wiley Publishing Inc., 2005)

Riley, Patricia, editor, *Growing Up Native American: An anthology* (New York: William Morrow and Company, Inc., 1993)

Rinaldi, Ann, *My Heart is on the Ground: The diary of Nannie Little Rose, a Sioux girl* (New York: Scholastic Inc., 1999)

Roberts, Dave, *The Twilight Gospel: The spiritual roots of Stephenie Meyer's vampire saga* (Oxford: Monarch Books, 2009)

Root, Deborah, *Cannibal Culture: Art, appropriation, and the commodification of difference* (Boulder: Westview Press, 1998)

Roscoe, Will, *Changing Ones: Third and fourth genders in Native North America* (Basingstoke: Macmillan Press, 1998)

Rowling, J. K., *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* (London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc, 2003)

Sanders, Julie, *Adaptation and Appropriation* (London: Routledge, 2006)

Said, Edward, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin Books Ltd., 1995; first published 1978)

Seale, Doris, and Beverly Slapin, *A Broken Flute: The Native experience in books for children* (Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press/Berkeley: Oyate, 2005)

Speare, Elizabeth George, *The Sign of the Beaver* (New York: Sandpiper, 1983)

Stedman, Raymond William, *Shadows of the Indian: Stereotypes in American culture* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1982)

Stoker, Bram, *Dracula* (Kindle Edition)

Stryker, Susan, and Stephen Whittle, editors, *The Transgender Studies Reader* (New York: Routledge, 2006)

Tatum, Beverly Daniel, *“Why Are All The Black Kids Sitting Together In The Cafeteria?”: And other conversations about race* (New York: Basic Books, 1997)

Thomas, Calvin, *Male Matters: Masculinity, anxiety, and the male body on the line* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1996)

Thomas, David Hurst, *Skull Wars: Kennewick Man, archaeology, and the battle for Native American identity* (New York: Basic Books, 2000)

Trafzer, Clifford E., Jean A. Keller and Lorene Sisquoc, editors, *Boarding School Blues: Revisiting American Indian education experiences* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2006)

Twitchell, James B., *Dreadful Pleasures: An anatomy of modern horror* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985)

Vickers, Scott B., *Native American Identities: From stereotype to archetype in art and literature* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1998)

Wallace, Diana, and Andrew Smith, editors, *The Female Gothic: New directions* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009)

Weed, Elizabeth, and Naomi Schor, editors, *Feminism Meets Queer Theory* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1997)

Wernitznig, Dagmar, *Going Native or Going Naïve? White shamanism and the neo-noble savage* (Lanham: University Press of America, Inc., 2003)

White, Richard, *“It’s Your Misfortune and None of My Own”: A new history of the American West* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993)

Wilder, Laura Ingalls, *Little House on the Prairie* (London: Egmont UK Limited, 2009; first published 1935)

Williamson, Milly, *The Lure of the Vampire: Gender, fiction and fandom from Bram Stoker to Buffy* (London: Wallflower Press, 2005)

Wilson, Natalie, *Seduced by Twilight: The allure and contradictory messages of the popular saga* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2011)

Films

Eyre, Chris, *Smoke Signals* (Shadowcatcher Entertainment, 1998)

Geronimi, Clyde, Wilfred Jackson, Hamilton Luske and Jack Kinney, *Peter Pan* (Walt Disney Productions, 1953)

Landis, John, *Thriller* (Optimum Productions, 1983)

Morris, Scott, *White Like Me* (Independently produced film, 2013)

Shyamalan, M. Night, *After Earth* (Columbia Pictures, 2013)

Wagner, George, *The Wolf Man* (1941)

Weitz, Chris, *The Twilight Saga: New Moon* (Summit Entertainment, 2009)

Yates, David, *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* (Warner Bros. Pictures, 2007)

Journal Articles

Aguirre, Manuel, 'Geometries of Terror: Numinous spaces in Gothic, horror and science fiction', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 10 No. 2 (2008)

Amador, Victoria, 'Dark Ladies: Vampires, lesbians, and women of colour', *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 15 No. 1 (2013)

Associated Press in Salt Lake City, 'Mormon Church Addresses Past Racism', from *The Guardian*, 10th December 2013

Backstein, Karen, '(Un)safe Sex: Romancing the vampire', *Cineaste* (Winter 2009)

Beck, Bernard, 'Fearless Vampire Kissers: Bloodsuckers we love in *Twilight*, *True Blood* and others', *Multicultural Perspectives*, Vol. 13 Iss. 2 (2011)

Botting, Fred, 'Hypocrite Vampire...', from *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 9, Issue 1 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2007)

Card, Orson Scott, 'The Hypocrites of Homosexuality', from *Sunstone* magazine, first published in 1990

Crenshaw, Kimberle, 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color', from *Stanford Law Review*, Vol. 43 (1993)

Durham, Meenakshi Gigi, 'Blood, Lust and Love: Interrogating gender violence in the *Twilight* phenomenon', from *Journal of Children and Media*, Vol. 6, No. 3 (2013)

Fairchild, Hoxie Neale, 'The Noble Savage: A study in Romantic naturalism', from *American Literature*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (Mar. 1929), p98 (accessed via JSTOR)

Fryberg, Stephanie A., Hazel Rose Markus, Daphna Oyserman and Joseph M. Stone, 'Of Warrior Chiefs and Indian Princesses: The psychological consequences of American Indian mascots', from *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 30:208-218 (Psychology Press, 2008)

Goddu, Teresa A., 'Vampire Gothic', from *American Literary History*, Vol. 11, No. 1 (Spring 1999)

Graham, Colin, '“Liminal Spaces”: Post-colonial theories and Irish culture', from *The Irish Review* (1986-), No. 16, Defining Borders: Colony, City, Region (Autumn -Winter, 1994)

Granger, John, 'Mormon Vampires in the Garden of Eden: What the bestselling *Twilight* series has in store for young readers', *Touchstone* magazine, November/December 2009, Vol. 22 Issue 8

Guillard, Julianne, "“You are exactly my brand of heroin(e)”: Convergences and divergences of the Gothic literary heroine', from *Girlhood Studies*, Vol. 4, No. 1 (Summer 2011)

Hughes, William, and Andrew Smith, 'Introduction: Defining the relationships between Gothic and the postcolonial', from *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 5 Issue 2 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003)

Inoue, Yoshitaka, 'Contemporary Consciousness as Reflected in Images of the Vampire', from *Jung Journal: Culture and Psyche*, Vol. 5 Iss. 4 (2011)

Christine Jarvis, 'School is Hell: Gendered fears in teenage horror', from *Educational Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 3 (2001)

Kluckhohn, Clyde, 'Navaho Witchcraft', from *Papers of the Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University*, Vol. XXII, No. 2 (Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1944)

Lampert-Weissig, Lisa, 'Mormon Female Gothic: Blood, birth, and the *Twilight* saga', *Academic.edu*
(http://www.academia.edu/2193693/Mormon_Female_Gothic_Blood_Birth_and_the_Twilight_Saga)

Lourde, Audre, 'The Uses of Anger', from *Women's Studies Quarterly*, Vol. 25, No.1-2 (1997)

Madge, Clare, and Henrietta O'Connor, 'Mothers in the making? Exploring liminality in cyber/space', from *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, New Series*, Vol. 30, No. 1 (Mar.,2005)

Ouzgane, Laharucine, and Daniel Coleman, 'Postcolonial Masculinities: Introduction', from *Jouvert: A journal of postcolonial studies*, Vol. 2, Issue 1 (North Carolina State University, 1998)

Palmer, Paulina, 'Lesbian Gothic: Genre, transformation, transgression', from *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 6, Iss. 1 (2004)

Pavlik, Steve, 'Of Saints and Lamanites: An analysis of Navajo Mormonism', from *Wicazo Sa Review*, Vol. 8, No. 1 (Spring 1992)

Reese, Debbie, 'Indigenizing Children's Literature', from *Journal of Language and Literacy Education*, 4(2), 2008

Schell, Heather, 'The Big Bad Wolf: Masculinity and genetics in popular culture', from *Literature and Medicine* Vol. 26, No. 1 (Spring 2007)

Silver, Anna, '*Twilight* is Not Good for Maidens: Gender, sexuality, and the family in Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight* series', from *Studies in the Novel*, Vol. 42, Nos. 1 & 2, Spring and Summer 2010 (Denton: University of North Texas, 2010)

Stewart, Michelle Pagni, 'Judging Authors by the Color of their Skin?: Quality Native American children's literature', from *MELUS* 27(2)

Swenson, Kristine, 'The Menopausal Vampire: Arabella Kenealy and the boundaries of true womanhood', from *Women's Writing*, Vol. 10, No. 1 (2003)

Yellow Bird, Michael, 'Cowboys and Indians: Toys of genocide, icons of American colonialism', *Wicazo Sa Review*, Vol. 19, No. 2, Colonization/Decolonization (University of Minnesota Press, 2004)

Television Programmes

Being Human (BBC Three, 2008 – 2013)

Rich Hall's 'Inventing the Indian' (BBC Four, 2012)

True Blood (HBO, 2008 – 2014)

Web Articles

American Indian Relief Council, 'Living Conditions', from *American Indian Relief Council*
(www.nrcprograms.org/site/PageServer?pagename=airc_livingconditions)

Amnesty International USA, 'Maze of Injustice', *Amnesty International USA*
(www.amnestyusa.org/our-work/issues/women-s-rights/violence-against-women/maze-of-injustice)

Associated Press in Flagstaff, 'Navajo Nation sues Urban Outfitters for trademark infringement', *The Guardian*
(<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/mar/01/navajo-nation-sues-urban-outfitters>)

Busfield. Steve, 'Washington face protests over Redskins name at Green Bay Packers', from *The Guardian Online*, Friday 13th September 2013
(www.theguardian.com/sport/2013/sep/13/washington-redskins-protest-green-bay-packers-oneida-indian-nation)

Center for Relationship Abuse Awareness, 'Victim Blaming and Relationship Abuse' (<http://stoprelationshipabuse.org/educated/avoiding-victim-blaming/>)

Chemaly, Soraya, 'Why are the majority of children's books still about white boys?', *Role/Reboot*, (<http://www.rolereboot.org/culture-and-politics/details/2013-09-why-are-the-majority-of-childrens-books-still-about>)

Devlin, Vince, ' "I thought John Wayne killed you all" ', (<http://newspaperrock.bluecorncomics.com/2009/08/i-thought-john-wayne-killed-you-all.htm>)

Dickerson, Paige, 'Twilight fiction doesn't always jibe with Quileute legend', *Peninsula Daily News* (<http://www.peninsuladailynews.com/article/20091130/news/311309987>)

Edmonton Police, 'What is Abuse?', *Edmonton Police Service* (<http://www.edmontonpolice.ca/VictimSupport/WhatIsAbuse.aspx>)

Elliott, Zetta, 'Black Girls Hunger for Heroes, Too: A black feminist conversation on fantasy fiction for teens', *Bitch Magazine* (<http://bitchmagazine.org/post/black-girls-hunger-for-heroes-too-a-black-feminist-conversation-on-fantasy-fiction-for-teens>)

ESPN, 'Harjo: Get educated', from *ESPN.com* (<http://www.espn.go.com/otl/americans/harjochat.html>)

Farnham, Alan, '“Twilight” Fans Tourist Bonanza for Forks, Wash.', from *ABC News* (<http://abcnews.go.com/Business/twilight-series-fans-tourism-bonanza-forks-wash/story?id=20883181>)

Forsyth, Jim, 'Texas couples go to court to overturn same-sex marriage ban', from *Reuters* (www.reuters.com/article/2014/02/11/us-usa-gaymarriage-texas-idUSBREA1A1LH20140211)

Fox, Jonathan, 'Mexico's Indigenous Population', from *Cultural Survival* (<http://www.culturalsurvival.org/ourpublications/csq/article/mexicos-indigenous-population>)

Giese, Paula, 'Indian in the Cupboard' (<http://www.kstrom.net/isk/books/middle/mi228.html>)

Glaister, Dan, and Sarah Falconer, 'Mormon who put new life into vampires', *The Guardian* online (<http://www.guardian.co.uk/books/2008/jul/20/news.booksforchildrenandteenagers>)

Hamlin, John, 'List of rape myths', *Sociology of Rape: University of Minnesota* (www.d.umn.edu/cla/faculty/jhamlin/3925.myths.html)

Hansen, Suzy, 'Mixing It Up', from *Salon* (www.salon.com/2001/03/08/sollors)

HuffPost Weddings, 'Interracial Marriage: Many Deep South Republican voters believe interracial marriage should be illegal', from *The Huffington Post* (www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/03/12/interracial-marriage-deep-south_n_1339827.html)

Keene, Adrienne, 'But Why Can't I Wear a Hipster Headdress?', from *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.com/2010/04/but-why-cant-i-wear-a-hipster-headdress.html>)

Keene, Adrienne, 'Full blood, verifiable Native American: A weird experience at trivia night', from *Native Appropriations* (www.nativeappropriations.com/2011/02/full-blood-verifiable-native-american-a-weird-experience-at-trivia-night.html)

Keene, Adrienne, 'Nudie Neon Indians and the sexualization of Native women', from *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.blogspot.co.uk/2010/06/nudie-neon-indian-stage-crashers-and.html>)

Keene, Adrienne, 'Oh, Spirit Hoods', *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.blogspot.co.uk/2011/07/oh-spirit-hoods.html>)

Keene, Adrienne, 'The Privilege of the Yay Life Tribe' *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.com/2011/07/the-privilege-of-the-yay-life-tribe.html>)

LaSala, Michael C., 'Same-Sex Marriage: A queer critique', *Psychology Today* (<http://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/gay-and-lesbian-well-being/201106/same-sex-marriage-queer-critique>)

Leadbeater, Chris, 'The haunting natural beauty of Forks – and there's more to it than "Twilight tourism"', *The Independent* (<http://www.independent.co.uk/travel/americas/the-haunting-natural-beauty-of-forks--and-theres-more-to-it-than-twilight-tourism-8326115.html>), accessed 31st December 2013

Media Education Foundation, 'White Like Me: Race, racism and white privilege in America', *Media Education Foundation* (www.mediaed.org/cgi-bin/commerce.cgi?preadd=action&key=421)

Meyer, Stephenie, *Breaking Dawn* FAQs (http://www.stepheniemeyer.com/bd_faq.html)

Meyer, Stephenie, 'Notes on *New Moon*' (www.stepheniemeyer.com/nm_thestory.html)

Meyer, Stephenie, 'Personal Correspondance [sic] #1', *Twilight Lexicon* (www.twilightlexicon.com/2006/03/11/personal-correspondance-1)

Meyer, Stephenie, 'The Story Behind *Twilight*' (<http://www.stepheniemeyer.com/twilight.html>)

Nelson, Bryn, 'The Quileute reservation copes with tourists brought by *Twilight*', *High Country News* (<http://www.hcn.org/issues/44.11/the-quileute-reservation-copes-with-tourists-brought-by-twilight>)

News From Indian Country, 'BIA Officer Denies Federal Corruption Charges', *News From Indian Country* (<http://www.indiancountrynews.com/index.php/crimejusticecourts-a-lawsuits-sections-menu-109/11414-bia-officer-denies-federal-corruption-charges>)

New York Post, 'Vampire Vacation', *New York Post* (<http://nypost.com/2009/07/05/vampire-vacation/>)

Peterson, Latoya, 'Running with the Wolves: A *Racialicious* reading of the *Twilight* saga' (<http://www.racialicious.com/2009/11/26/running-with-the-wolves-a-racialicious-reading-of-the-twilight-saga>)

Petro, Anthony, and Samira K. Mehta, 'Big Vampire Love: What's So Mormon about *Twilight*?', from *Religion Dispatches Magazine* (http://www.religiondispatches.org/archive/culture/2052/big_vampire_love%3A_what%E2%80%99s_so_mormon_about_twilight)

Posner, Sarah, 'Creationists cite 'academic freedom' to teach beliefs in schools', from *Aljazeera America* (<http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2013/10/9/under-the-bannerofacademicfreedom.html>)

Quileute Nation, 'History', from *Quileute Nation* (<http://www.quileutenation.org/history>)

Quileute Nation, 'Indian Country Etiquette', from *Quileute Nation* (<http://www.quileutenation.org/indian-country-etiquette>)

Quileute Nation, 'Quileute Tribal TANF, Effective May 1, 2013 – April 30, 2016', from *Quileute Nation* (www.quileutenation.org/jobs/tanf_plan_2013_2016.pdf)

Reese, Debbie, 'Thumbs up to some titles on CBC Diversity's Goodreads Bookshelf', *American Indians in Children's Literature* (<http://americanindiansinchildrensliterature.blogspot.co.uk/2013/01/thumbs-up-to-some-titles-on-cbc.html>)

Riley, Angela R., 'Sucking the Quileute dry', *The New York Times* (http://www.nytimes.com/2010/02/08/opinion/08riley.html?_r=0)

Schmidt, Ryan W., 'American Indian Identity and Blood Quantum in the 21st Century: A critical review', from *Journal of Anthropology* (2011) (www.hindawi.com/journals/janthro/2011/549521)

Shevchenko, Inna, 'Topless in the Country of Hijab?', from *Huffingtonpost.co.uk* (http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/inna-shevchenko/femen-topless-in-the-country-of-hijab_b_3034211.html)

Sims, Andrew, 'Stephenie Meyer tells story of creating only known gay *Twilight* character played by the saga's producer', from *Hypable* (www.hypable.com/2012/08/14/twilight-gay-character)

Smith, Andrea, 'For All Those Who Were Indian in a Former Life' (<http://www.manataka.org/page1113.html>)

Sposato, Jesse, 'The absolutely true interview with Sherman Alexie, an amazing part-time Indian', (http://sadiemagazine.com/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=237&Itemid=235)

Stoker, Bram, *Dracula* (<http://www.planetebook.com/ebooks/Dracula.pdf>)

Taylor, Rhonda Harris, '*Indian in the Cupboard: A case study in perspective*', *Qualitative Studies in Education*, Vol. 13, No. 4, 2000

Valdes-Rodriguez, Alisa, 'The politics of wizards and vampires', *Racialicious* (<http://racialicious.com/2008/12/11/the-politics-of-wizards-and-vampires>)

Wilson, Natalie, 'Difficult dialogues at the NWSA: The colonial gaze of Stephenie Meyer and the resulting representation of indigenous peoples as monstrous', *Seduced by Twilight* (<http://seducedbytwilight.wordpress.com>)

Women's Aid, 'What is Domestic Violence?', *Womensaid.org.uk* (<http://www.womensaid.org.uk/domestic-violence-articles.asp?section=00010001002200410001&itemid=1272>)

Websites

Anonymous, *My Culture is Not a Trend* (mycultureisnotatrend.tumblr.com)

CBC Diversity (www.cbcdiversity.com/about)

Keene, Adrienne, *Native Appropriations* (nativeappropriations.com)

Reese, Debbie, *American Indians in Children's Literature* (americanindiansinchildrensliterature.blogspot.co.uk)

Appendix 1

Stereotypes of Native Characters in children's literature

The 'wild' savage

Narratives featuring the 'wild savage' depict Native peoples as a threat to settlers, explorers and other representatives of white, Western civilisation, enforcing a '[distinction] between "them" and "us"' that encourages the reader to sympathise with the settler and fear the 'savage'.¹ In these texts, American Indians are 'presented as marauding, blood-thirsty savages, bogeys from the nightmares of "pioneers" who invaded their lands and feared the consequences'.² As this quote from Michael Dorris indicates, the historical reality of settlement makes the conflict between Native peoples and white settlers far more nuanced than is suggested by the 'wild savage'/'civilised white man' dichotomy. However, the stereotype has proved to be compelling, corresponding with narratives of 'slaying the monster' and protecting familiar, Eurocentric modes of living.

The prevalence of this stereotype in novels and Westerns cemented its popularity, allowing it to be carried forward into texts targeted at child audiences. *Little House on the Prairie* portrays American Indians as frightening, inhuman figures:

Their faces were bold and fierce and terrible. Their black eyes glittered. High on their foreheads and above their ears where hair grows, these wild men had no hair. But on their heads a tuft of hair stood straight up. It was wound around with string, and feathers were stuck in it.³

¹ *Orientalism*, p327

² Michael A. Dorris, *American Indian Stereotypes in the World of Children: A reader and bibliography* (Metuchen: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1982), pvii

³ Laura Ingalls Wilder, *Little House on the Prairie* (London: Egmont UK Limited, 2009; first published 1935), p89

The Ingalls family repeatedly describe the Indians as dirty, foul-smelling, and potentially violent.⁴ The novel erases the fact that the family have built their house in Indian territory, in violation of treaties made between the federal government and local tribes.⁵ In keeping with the colonial narrative, ‘The history books and story books seldom make it clear that Native Americans, in fighting back, were defending their homes and families and were not just being malicious’, an omission that removes the context for Native American attacks on white settlers.⁶ Ignoring this political context, *Little House on the Prairie* denies Native humanity and agency, implying that ‘savagery’ is the only reason for the hostility of the local Osage people. A statement made by the Ingalls’ neighbour Mrs Scott – “Treaties or no treaties, the land belongs to folks that’ll farm it. That’s only common sense and justice” – is never challenged.⁷

In another children’s novel from 1935, *Caddie Woodlawn*, the Native American characters are described as similarly animalistic and threatening:

During the first year that the children spent in Wisconsin, the Indians had come from all the country around to look at them. They had come in groups, crowding into Mrs Woodlawn’s kitchen in their silent moccasins, touching the children’s hair and staring. Poor Mrs Woodlawn, frightened nearly out of her wits, had fed them bread or beans or whatever she had on hand, and they had gone away satisfied.⁸

⁴ After two members of the local Osage nation visit the house, Pa comments “The main thing is to be on good terms with the Indians. We don’t want to wake up some night with a band of screeching dev-” before cutting his sentence short for the benefit of his children (p92).

⁵ In his review of the book, Dennis McAuliffe Jr notes that ‘Little Laura Ingalls, her sisters and their beloved Ma and Pa were illegal squatters on Osage land’ (*Little House on the Osage Prairie*, from *A Broken Flute*, p49)

⁶ Mary Gloyne Byler, ‘Introduction to American Indian authors for young readers’, *American Indian Stereotypes in the World of Children*, p40

⁷ *Little House on the Prairie*, p132

⁸ Carol Ryrie Brink, *Caddie Woodlawn* (New York: Aladdin Paperbacks, 1962; first published 1935), p6

After these visits, Caddie's mother tells her husband "those frightful savages will eat us out of house and home...the way they look at the children's hair frightens me. They might want a red scalp to hang on their belts".⁹ Although this aggression never materialises, the settlers remain afraid, gathering at the Woodlawns' home after hearing rumours of violence; 'People were restless and undecided...the redskins might only be awaiting the moment when they should scatter again to their homes to begin the attack'.¹⁰ The attack never occurs, but the local tribes are still coded as a danger to the settlers. This extract contains an example of the loaded language used to bias the reader against the Native characters; they are threatening to 'attack' the innocent settlers, rather than "warding off," "guarding" and "defending" their homelands'.¹¹ Brink's depiction of American Indian nations ignores historical fact and context, instead playing into what Felton describes as 'the Hollywood version of the American West [where] the whites represent righteousness, progress and civilisation, while the Indians are the bogeymen waiting in the shadows to do foul deeds to the settler or soldier'.¹²

These novels construct the 'wild savage' as a monstrous figure. The 'savage' will attack the innocent settler without reason or provocation, and reinforce the implicit suggestion that 'it is acceptable for one group of heavily-

⁹ Ibid, pp6-7

¹⁰ Ibid, p111

¹¹ Robert B. Moore, 'Racist Stereotyping in the English Language', *Race, Class and Gender: An anthology*, pp371-372

¹² Mark Felton, *Today is a Good Day to Fight: The Indian wars and the conquest of the West* (Stroud: The History Press, 2009), p11

armed, white people from a “civilized” country to claim and control the distant lands of non-white *others*’.¹³ There is no mention of the complex pre-contact cultures, or of federal policies that led to the destruction of these traditional ways of life. The removal of this context delegitimises Native resistance to colonial practices, framing it as unthinking violence. This reading of the situation is presented as fact, when instead it is an example of the ‘Western projection onto and will to govern over’ Native peoples.¹⁴ There is a subtextual association of whiteness with ‘purity...and mental, physical and moral superiority’, and of Indianness with ‘impurity...and mental, physical and moral inferiority’, an attitude which positions colonisation as a process of improvement; the taming of the savage.¹⁵

The ‘savage’ is not simply presented as a vicious animal; other texts feature a domesticated variation. In *Caddie Woodlawn*, the eponymous heroine encounters a Native man at the village store; ‘the storekeeper had laughed at her, saying in a reassuring voice “You needn’t be afraid, Caddie. He’s a good Indian. It’s Indian John.”’¹⁶ Although apparently harmless, this statement is steeped in colonialist sentiment. Indian John corresponds to the wild savage stereotype. He is a physically imposing figure, who indulges his curiosity without considering the feelings of others; upon seeing Caddie, he ‘[holds] her up in the air while he took a leisurely look at her hair’.¹⁷ John’s characterisation implies that

¹³ Bill Bigelow and Bob Peterson, ‘Why rethink Columbus?’, *Rethinking Columbus: The next 500 years* (Milwaukee: Rethinking Schools, 1996), p10

¹⁴ *Orientalism*, p95

¹⁵ Lauren L. Basson, *White Enough to Be American?: Race mixing, indigenous people, and the boundaries of state and nation* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2008), p177

¹⁶ *Caddie Woodlawn*, p111

¹⁷ *Ibid*, p7

he should be viewed not as an adult, but rather as equivalent to a young child. However, he is also 'good'; he does not offer any threat to the local white community, despite the many anti-Indian measures that were being put in place to benefit settlers at this time. By contrast, Native Americans who attempted to resist the expansion of US territory and their resultant displacement were coded as 'bad'. This simplistic dichotomy between 'good' and 'bad' Indians has persisted, creating the impression of the former as a dangerous animal, and the latter as a docile, domesticated creature.

This non-threatening version of the 'wild savage' is also evident in *The Courage of Sarah Noble*, published in 1954. The threat of the 'wild savage' is introduced via anti-Indian comments from children that Sarah meets during her journey:

“The Indians will eat you...They will chop off your head.”
“They will not hurt me,” Sarah said. “My father says the Indians are friendly.”
“They will skin you alive...”.¹⁸

After receiving nothing but friendly treatment from the local Native people, Sarah conquers her fear; however, her view of the Indians is still dehumanising. Sarah constantly conflates her Indian neighbours with animals. At one point in the narrative, after considering whether it is right to pray for the safety and wellbeing of her horse, the story continues 'Now she really had to stop and think. Was it right to pray for Indians? Did the Lord take care of Indians?'¹⁹ *The Courage of Sarah Noble* seems to promote friendship and trust between two different

¹⁸ Alice Dalgliesh, *The Courage of Sarah Noble* (New York: Aladdin Paperbacks, 2000; first published 1954), p10

¹⁹ Ibid, pp40-41

cultures; however, as Doris Seale observes, 'Friendship does not call people out of their names just because they are unfamiliar...Friendship does not wonder if people are human enough to pray for'.²⁰ Friendship does not; however, colonial paternalism does. It is futile for Sarah to pray for the Indians, because, according to the stereotypes established in the novel, 'there is no hope that Indians can be integrated into white civilization, since even good Indians are firmly bound to the "savage" culture'.²¹

The impact of the 'wild savage' stereotype on young Native readers is profound. In *A Broken Flute*, young reader Liz Reese comments on her experiences while reading *Caddie Woodlawn* in the third grade:

...it said that the Native Americans were massacring, murdering and scalping the pioneers and made belts out of their hair and skin. They made the pioneers seem like angels and the Native Americans seem like inhuman monsters. I felt hurt inside, my eyes were watering and I felt like I wanted to cry.²²

As Reese's account indicates, the prevalence of the 'wild savage' stereotype in literature, and the continuing popularity of this literature, has a negative impact on the emotional wellbeing of Native children. If 'most societies clearly reveal both their moral norms and their political ideologies through their efforts to acculturate the young', then the imposition of a belief in Euro-American superiority and Native inferiority will cause Native children to internalise this

²⁰ Doris Seale, 'Review of *The Courage of Sarah Noble* by Alice Dalgliesh', *A Broken Flute*, p260

²¹ Richard Allen Brenzo, *Civilization Against the Savage: The destruction of Indians in American novels, 1823-1854* (Thesis submitted to the University of Wisconsin, 1973), p2

²² Liz Reese, 'Liz's Story', from *A Broken Flute*, p14

sense of inadequacy.²³ However, the 'wild savage' is not the only stereotype that affects social perceptions of modern American Indians. Stories that avoid dwelling upon 'savagery' and violence are not necessarily any less damaging than those which relish descriptions of American Indians skinning settlers alive. Instead, these texts employ more complex, but equally harmful, stereotypes, such as that of the 'noble savage'.

The Noble Savage

The 'wild savage' stands in opposition to any sense of 'nobility'; if 'bad' Indians are portrayed as wild animals, 'good' Indians occupy a similar place in the narrative to beloved pets. However, colonial views of American Indians also gave rise to the concept of the 'noble savage'. The 'noble savage' stereotype became entrenched in social consciousness during the Enlightenment period, when 'information about the inhabitants of the New World became better known in the Old, [and] Native Americans entered the literary and imaginative works of European writers'.²⁴ Although Hoxie Neale Fairchild's work *The Noble Savage: A study in Romantic naturalism* defines the noble savage as 'any free and wild being who draws directly from nature virtues which raise doubts as to the value

²³ John M. MacKenzie, 'General Editor's Introduction', *Britannia's Children: Reading colonialism through children's books and magazines*, by Kathryn Castle (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1996), pvii

²⁴ *The White Man's Indian*, p73

of civilisation', the term has generally been associated with American Indians.²⁵ The characteristics of the 'noble savage' differ greatly from those of the 'wild savage'. Where the 'wild savage' is a monstrous figure, the 'noble savage' is presented as more humanised and restrained: 'Along with handsomeness of physique and physiognomy went great stamina and endurance...Modest in attitude if not always in dress, the noble Indian exhibited great calm and dignity in bearing...Brave in combat, he was tender in love for family and children'.²⁶ The 'noble savage' corresponds with ideas of innate goodness, suggesting that 'civilisation', rather than a lack thereof, was responsible for human degeneration.

The concept of the 'noble savage', famously featured in novels such as *The Last of the Mohicans* and films like *Dances with Wolves*, is also present in popular children's fiction.²⁷ A prominent example of the noble savage can be found in Lynne Reid Banks' popular series, *The Indian in the Cupboard*.²⁸ Unlike *Little House on the Prairie*, where Native characters are background figures, *The Indian in the Cupboard* features an American Indian character in a prominent role. It is true that Little Bull is dehumanised at several points; one character, Matron, describes him as a "superb specimen...Bright eyes, perfect teeth, skin

²⁵ Hoxie Neale Fairchild, 'The Noble Savage: A study in Romantic naturalism', *American Literature*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (Mar. 1929), p98 (accessed via JSTOR, 2nd March 2014)

²⁶ *The White Man's Indian*, p28

²⁷ In *The Last of the Mohicans*, the 'noble savage' Uncas is juxtaposed with the 'wild savage' Magwa. Similarly, in *Dances With Wolves*, the Lakota are depicted as noble in comparison to the 'savage' Pawnee.

²⁸ The five novels in this series follow the story of a young boy, Omri, who is given a cupboard, a key, and a plastic figurine of an American Indian for his birthday. From the beginning, the tone of the series is problematic; the figure is referred to as 'a second-hand plastic Red Indian' (Lynne Reid Banks, *The Indian in the Cupboard* (London: Lions, 1992; first published by J. M. Dent & Sons Ltd., 1981), p7). The term 'Red Indian' is a racial slur, and its use is not corrected until later novels in the series. Omri soon finds that any plastic figure becomes a real person after being locked in the cupboard. The first plastic figure to receive this treatment is the titular Indian, Little Bull, an Iroquois man from the eighteenth century.

and hair gleaming with health – splendid!”, language that might be used to describe a show animal, such as a horse or dog.²⁹ There is a clear imbalance of power between the white protagonist and the Native secondary character; Omri often abuses his greater size and strength, threatening Little Bull with violence in order to force him to co-operate; “Little Bull, if you shoot I’ll pick you up and squeeze you!”³⁰ Furthermore, the introduction of Little Bull emphasises his aggressive nature:

The Indian gave a fantastic leap into the air. His black pigtail flew and the air ballooned out of his loose-fitting leggings. His knife, raised above his head, flashed. He gave a shout...loud enough to make Omri jump. But not so much as he jumped when the little knife pierced his finger deeply enough to draw a drop of blood.³¹

However, while Banks highlights Little Bull’s violence – later revealing that he has taken thirty scalps – she does not simply condemn these actions, but instead encourages the reader to compare them to the violence of the present day:³²

Omri swallowed hard. Thirty scalps...phew! Of course things were different in those days. Those tribes were always making war on each other...Come to *that*, weren’t soldiers of today doing the same thing? Weren’t there wars and battles and terrorism going on all over the place?³³

By drawing parallels between eighteenth-century American Indian warriors and modern soldiers, Banks partly deconstructs the idea of the American Indian as an Othered savage, distinct from ‘normal’, white, Western people. The novels humanise Little Bull; rather than being presented as a stock figure, he is a

²⁹ Lynne Reid Banks, *The Return of the Indian* (London: Lions, 1992; first published 1986), pp98-99

³⁰ Lynne Reid Banks, *The Indian in the Cupboard* (London: Lions, 1992; first published by J. M. Dent & Sons Ltd., 1981), p84

³¹ *Ibid*, p12

³² *Ibid*, p33

³³ *Ibid*.

complex individual. However, many aspects of his portrayal correspond with the 'noble savage' stereotype, and his dependence upon Omri denies him agency within the text. Native critics have identified several problems with *The Indian in the Cupboard* series, particularly the nature of Little Bull's existence in Omri's world as an animated plastic figure. Michael Yellow Bird reads plastic 'cowboy and Indian' figures as toys that allow children to play at genocide, comparable to allowing children to 'buy bags of little toy African-American slaves and their white slave masters'.³⁴ Paula Giese suggests that the novels '[present] racism discreetly, while teaching the young white boy (reader identification character) how to behave like a good paternalistic colonial ruler'.³⁵ Other critics have extended this argument, stating that 'paternalism seems too mild a term for Omri's control of Little Bear' and critiquing scenes such as one where Omri threatens to deny Little Bull food if he continues to fight.³⁶ Omri's control of where and how Little Bull lives parallels governmental domination of the lives of Native peoples. Taylor concludes with the statement that 'the book's popularity must...be attributable to a readership that finds its stereotypical characterization and plot to be acceptable...Or, a more disturbing possibility is that the book is seen as a *classic* because its stereotypical, and inherently racist, ideas reinforce attitudes already held by the book's readership'.³⁷

³⁴ Michael Yellow Bird, 'Cowboys and Indians: Toys of genocide, icons of American colonialism', *Wicazo Sa Review*, Vol. 19, No. 2, Colonization/Decolonization, Autumn 2004 (University of Minnesota Press), p35

³⁵ Paula Giese, 'Indian in the Cupboard' (<http://www.kstrom.net/isk/books/middle/mi228.html>)

³⁶ Rhonda Harris Taylor, 'Indian in the Cupboard: A case study in perspective', *Qualitative Studies in Education*, Vol. 13, No. 4, 2000, p376. 'Little Bear' is Little Bull's name in the American versions of the novels.

³⁷ *Ibid*, p380

Furthermore, Banks does not reject the 'wild savage' stereotype entirely. The series corresponds to the dichotomy between 'good' and 'bad' Indians, similar to that found in *Caddie Woodlawn*. The Algonquian people, introduced as enemies of the Iroquois, are represented only as raiders and murderers. Rather than being written as a complex collection of cultures, the Algonquians are a depersonalised threat: 'He saw an Indian making straight for him. His face under the torchlight was twisted with fury'.³⁸ There is only one concession made towards the Algonquian people in the entire series; at one point, Omri reflects that if he had been given a plastic figurine of an Algonquian man, Little Bull and the Iroquois would have been placed in the role of the 'bad' Indians; 'But who were baddies? If Patrick, a year ago, had made him a present of some other plastic Indian, it might just as well have been an Algonquian, and then the Iroquois would have been the baddies'.³⁹ However, this important point is never reiterated; instead, the dichotomy of good, noble savage versus bad, wild savage is preserved.

Vanishing Constructs

As Miranda observes, the wild and noble savages of colonial children's literature were not replaced by nuanced and realistic characterisations of American Indians, but with less obviously offensive stereotypes. Many recent children's novels which seem to present a balanced, non-racist view of American Indians

³⁸ *The Return of the Indian*, pp133-134

³⁹ *Ibid*, p141

contain much of the same colonial ideology, presented in a subtler, more insidious way. These are arguably more dangerous than the old, obvious stereotypes. Even young or uninformed readers are likely to be able to identify explicitly racist and negative representations; however, poor research and misrepresentation of Native cultures are not so easy to recognise, particularly when the text is the reader's primary learning tool. These new stereotypes serve a similar role to their earlier counterparts, emphasising the superiority of settler culture. In the case of the 'vanishing Indian' stereotype, the implication is that Native cultures were inevitably doomed. This gave a 'romantic...impression of the Indian as rapidly passing away before the onslaught of civilization', a narrative that '[arouses] nostalgia and pity', but also absolves the white reader of any sense of responsibility.⁴⁰ The 'vanishing Indian' as literary device is central to Ann Rinaldi's *My Heart is on the Ground: The diary of Nannie Little Rose, a Sioux girl*.

My Heart is on the Ground follows the story of a young girl who is sent to the Carlisle Indian Boarding School in the 1890s. The fact that the protagonist is Lakota implies that Native characters will be portrayed sympathetically, rather than as villains. The novel contains several culture clashes and the accidental death of one of the students; however, there is little hostility from the white characters towards the Indian children. The novel ends with an atmosphere of friendship and understanding between the different cultures:

Mr Captain Pratt has been having private talks with every student in our class. He is making sure we are doing the right lessons for what we want to become.

⁴⁰ *The White Man's Indian*, p88

I told him I wish to become a teacher and help other blanket Indian children to learn. He said...by the time I finish Higher Education there will be schools on my reservation, and I can go back there and teach if I wish.⁴¹

This ending is uplifting for readers who know little about this particular period in history. Among readers with some knowledge of the boarding school system, *My Heart is on the Ground* has been widely criticised. The children who attended residential schools were forced to adopt European names and to speak English, being punished severely for speaking their own languages.⁴² Their hair was cut short,⁴³ and they were made to wear military or domestic uniforms rather than their traditional dress. Physical, emotional and sexual abuse was common, and many children died at Carlisle and at other schools; those who survived were deeply affected by 'distorted instruction about who Indian people were...many of those who survived Carlisle came out thoroughly brainwashed'.⁴⁴ Representing an Indian boarding school as benign erases the documented history of cultural colonialism that formed a central part of the ethos of these institutions.

One aspect of Rinaldi's novel that has caused particular outrage is her appropriation of names from gravestones at Carlisle. Rinaldi justifies her decision in the epilogue to the novel with this statement; 'Their personalities came through to me with such force and inspiration, I had to use them. I am sure that in whatever Happy Hunting Ground they now reside, they will forgive this artistic

⁴¹ Ann Rinaldi, *My Heart is on the Ground: The diary of Nannie Little Rose, a Sioux girl* (New York: Scholastic Inc., 1999), p167

⁴² Marlene R. Atlea/?eh?eh naa tuu kwiss, Naomi Caldwell, Barb Landis, Jean Paine Mendoza, Deborah A. Miranda, Debbie A. Reese, LaVera Rose, Beverly Slapin and Cynthia Leitich Smith, 'My Heart is on the Ground and the Indian Residential School Experience', *A Broken Flute*, p63

⁴³ In many Native cultures, cutting hair was often a sign of mourning. Forced haircuts were extremely traumatic for the children who attended residential schools.

⁴⁴ *A Broken Flute*, p58

licence, and even smile upon it'.⁴⁵ The dead Carlisle students have become the 'building materials' described by Miranda, used to construct a positive representation of a process of cultural genocide. As one reviewer observes:

...nowhere in this book is to be found the screaming children...being taken away from their homes...Nowhere is to be found the terrified children, stripped naked and beaten, for trying to communicate with each other...Nowhere is to be found the unrelenting daily humiliation, in word and deed, from the teachers, matrons and staff.⁴⁶

This erasure of historical context is compounded by the novel's inaccuracies. The review in *A Broken Flute* includes two subsections on the novel entitled 'Lack of Cultural Authenticity' and 'Lack of Historical Accuracy', citing factual problems that begin with the title:

A Lakota child in 1880 would not have referred to herself as "Sioux"...It is a French corruption of an enemy name used by the Ojibwe. She would have referred to herself by her band (Sicangu) or location (Spotted Tail Agency), or by her familial group, her tiospaye.⁴⁷

Further historical inaccuracies include the novel's assertion that Sitting Bull was a chief of the Cheyenne, rather than a spiritual leader of the Hunkpapa Lakota,⁴⁸ and its description of the Lakota people's rights to the Black Hills; 'The whites did not "give" the Lakota the Black Hills in a treaty; by treaty, the people were able to retain a portion of what had been theirs for millennia'.⁴⁹ Similarly, the novel's portrayals of Lakota culture and social structures are flawed. Nannie's difficult relationship with her brother is the source of much of the narrative's tension;

⁴⁵ *My Heart is on the Ground*, p196

⁴⁶ 'My Heart is on the Ground and the Indian Residential School Experience', *A Broken Flute*, p70

⁴⁷ *Ibid*, p63

⁴⁸ *Ibid*, p62

⁴⁹ *Ibid*.

Nannie comments that Whiteshield 'is my *tiblo*, my older brother, so I am to honor him. But how can I do so...He much time acts like a fool'.⁵⁰ Similarly, Whiteshield often belittles Nannie, telling her "Women's dreams are worth nothing,"⁵¹ and calling her 'a stupid girl'.⁵² However, the reviewers point out that 'Brothers and sisters have a special bond in Lakota culture that was even more pronounced in this time period. They were taught to honor each other above all, including spouses'.⁵³

Rinaldi's narrative corresponds with the aims of the boarding school system itself; it depicts American Indian cultures as unsustainable, spreads misinformation, and indicates that Native peoples must integrate fully in order to survive. Pratt believed that 'white Americans should "feed the Indians to our civilization"', and by the conclusion of the novel Nannie has indeed been consumed by Euro-American culture.⁵⁴ The reviewers argue that the ending, where Nannie is cast to play a pilgrim in the school's Thanksgiving play, indicates that 'this little girl has successfully made the transition from Indian to white – she has become a clear victim of colonialism'.⁵⁵

Texts that employ the 'vanishing Indian' stereotype do not only focus on forced assimilation. In many cases, the 'vanishing' is literal. In his novel *The Heart of a Chief*, Bruchac explores this issue through a literature class attended

⁵⁰ *My Heart is on the Ground*, p8

⁵¹ *Ibid*, p67

⁵² *Ibid*, p39

⁵³ 'My Heart is on the Ground and the Indian Residential School Experience', *A Broken Flute*, p64

⁵⁴ Clifford E. Trafzer, Jean A. Keller and Lorene Sisquoc, 'Introduction: Origins and development of the American Indian boarding school system', *Boarding School Blues: Revisiting American Indian education experiences*, edited by Clifford E. Trafzer, Jean A. Keller and Lorene Sisquoc (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2006), p3

⁵⁵ 'My Heart is on the Ground and the Indian Residential School Experience', from *A Broken Flute*, p68

by the protagonist, Chris. The class is studying *The Sign of the Beaver* by Elizabeth George Speare:

“There’s something wrong,” I say.

“Wrong?”

“About the book...At the end the Indians just go away. But that isn’t what happened...We didn’t go away. They tried to drive us off the land. They put bounties on our scalps. They burned our villages. But we didn’t go away.”⁵⁶

Prior to this discussion, Chris describes his teacher, Mr Dougal, as an individual who ‘like a lot of teachers in Rangerville...admires Indians in the past and doesn’t really pay much attention to those of us who are still here’.⁵⁷ This is an attitude frequently remarked upon by Native writers, who argue that the saturation of historical images of Indians gives the impression that they no longer exist in the present day. In an essay, Leitich Smith describes the pervasive nature of this stereotype:

It’s pretty stunning for me to sit down with a group of second-graders who tell me that Indians shot arrows, went on warpaths, and lived some time before the turn of the eighteenth century. From my point of view, just their use of the past tense is chilling.⁵⁸

At the conclusion of the novel, the most prominent Native character, Attean, tells the protagonist Matt that they will “Not come back...Not live in village again. Our people find new hunting ground.”⁵⁹ This implies that the Native characters’ leaving was their own decision, rather than a result of colonial policies, glossing over this uncomfortable aspect of history for the non-Native reader. Indeed, after

⁵⁶ Joseph Bruchac, *The Heart of a Chief* (New York: Puffin Books, 1998), p20

⁵⁷ Ibid, p19

⁵⁸ Cynthia Leitich Smith, ‘Frybread and Feather-free’, *A Broken Flute*, p19

⁵⁹ Elizabeth George Speare, *The Sign of the Beaver* (New York: Sandpiper, 1983), p116

Attean and the other Indians leave, Matt reflects ‘they said there was no end of land in the west. He reckoned there must be enough for both white men and Indians’.⁶⁰ This assumption, never questioned within the text, erases the further difficulties faced by Native peoples following their removal from their original homelands. Ostensibly, multicultural literature ‘can provide...children with a mirror that reflects who they are’; however, the trope of the vanishing Indian means that young Native readers are presented with a reflection of themselves only as doomed figures, rather than individuals with agency and hope.⁶¹ Furthermore, the image of Native peoples as ‘vanished’, and therefore extinct, has had legal implications for present-day tribes. In a recent court case involving the Salish and Kootenai nations, who were fighting to have four special needs children returned to their parents, a lawyer approached by the tribes responded “Indians? There are still Indians? I thought John Wayne killed you all.”⁶² Devlin points out ‘recall that this is an educated New York lawyer speaking. His city has the largest number of Indians living off-reservation, I believe. Yet he’s completely ignorant of Indian country today’.⁶³ If an ‘educated New York lawyer’ is ‘ignorant’ of the existence of Native peoples in the present day, it is reasonable to assume that many other non-Native people in the United States will share this ignorance, perpetuating the erasure of American Indians.

⁶⁰ Ibid, p117

⁶¹ ‘Indigenizing Children’s Literature’, p60

⁶² Vince Devlin, “I thought John Wayne killed you all”, *Newspaper Rock* (<http://www.newspaperrock.bluecorncomics.com/2009/08/i-thought-john-wayne-killed-you-all.htm>), accessed 2nd March 2014

⁶³ Ibid.

Fairies, Mermaids and Indians

These stereotypical views of real-world Native Americans have informed representations in other genres of children's literature, particularly fantasy stories. While the *Indian in the Cupboard* series contains several elements of magical realism, there are many texts set in entirely fantastic worlds that include American Indian characters, or characters clearly intended to represent American Indians. Arguably, the stereotypes found in fantasy texts are even more insidious than those in realistic fiction; the unrealistic setting may discourage readers from relating characters and situations to their real-life counterparts. A prominent example of this can be found in the play and novel *Peter Pan*.

Despite its reputation as a story focusing on childhood innocence, a close reading of *Peter Pan* suggests that the narrative is constructed along colonialist lines. Children's literature presented Britain as standard and colonised countries as strange and fantastical, and their inhabitants as inferior primitives. In *Peter Pan*, a group of children abandon their middle-class, early Edwardian London environment; a location that is portrayed as safe and normal, and to which they must return for order to be restored. They explore an exotic, often threatening world, peopled with fantastic creatures and characters. Neverland is a place of pure fantasy:

The Neverland is always more or less an island, with astonishing splashes of colour here and there, and coral reefs and rakish-looking craft in the offing, *and savages and lonely lairs*, and gnomes who are mostly tailors, and caves through which a river runs, and princes with six elder brothers,

and a hut going fast to decay, and one very small old lady with a hooked nose.⁶⁴

This focus on fantasy and fairytale makes the text's use of American Indian deeply problematic. As the emphasis in the above paragraph indicates, *Peter Pan's* Native characters are equated with fairytale creatures. Many inhabitants of Neverland, such as the fairies and mermaids, are based on figures from myth and legend.

Barrie equates his fictional Indians not only with these creatures, but with animals; 'In [Peter's] absence things are usually quiet on the island. The fairies take an hour longer in the morning, the beasts attend to their young, the redskins feed heavily for six days and nights...'⁶⁵ The introduction of the Indians of Neverland emphasises their 'wildness':

On the trail of the pirates, stealing noiselessly down the warpath, which is not visible to inexperienced eyes, come the redskins, every one of them with his eyes peeled. They carry tomahawks and knives, and their naked bodies gleam with paint and oil. Strung around them are scalps, of boys as well as of pirates, for these are the Piccaninny tribe, and not to be confused with the softer-hearted Delawares or the Hurons. In the van, on all fours, is Great Big Little Panther, a brave of so many scalps that in his present position they somewhat impede his progress.⁶⁶

The tribe's characteristics include aggression, to the point where they will fight and kill children. They are also depicted as being 'close to nature', in that they can move through the forest as quietly and stealthily as animals; 'Observe how

⁶⁴ J. M. Barrie, *Peter Pan & Peter Pan in Kensington Gardens* (Ware: Wordsworth Editions Limited, 2007), p13, my italics

⁶⁵ *Ibid*, p56

⁶⁶ *Ibid*, p60. The racist undertones of this section are compounded by Barrie's decision to call his Indians 'the Piccaninny tribe', a racist term used to describe black children.

they pass over fallen twigs without making the slightest noise'.⁶⁷ The stereotypes of the 'wild savage' and the 'vanishing Indian' are adapted for a fantasy context; Native peoples are positioned as animals and banished from reality, Othering them completely.

Barrie develops the Otherness of Neverland's Indians through the characterisation of Tiger Lily and Great Big Little Panther. The dialogue used by the characters is in keeping with 'the stilted speech pattern [the critics in *A Broken Flute*] call "early jawbreaker":⁶⁸

TIGER LILY: The Great White Father save me from pirates. Me his velly nice friend now; no let pirates hurt him.

BRAVES: Ugh, ugh, wah!

TIGER LILY: Tiger Lily has spoken.

PANTHER: Loola, loola! Great Big Little Panther has spoken.⁶⁹

Tiger Lily is also Othered by the intersection of her gender and her race; she is presented as sexualised in a way that her white counterpart, Wendy, is not. This is apparent in her introduction:

Bringing up the rear, the place of greatest danger, comes Tiger Lily, proudly erect, a princess in her own right. She is the most beautiful of dusky Dianas and the belle of the Piccaninnies, coquettish, cold and amorous by turns; there is not a brave who would not have the wayward thing to wife, but she staves off the altar with a hatchet.⁷⁰

The sexualisation of Native women in colonial texts has been commented upon frequently. According to Adrienne Keene, 'Native women have been highly

⁶⁷ Ibid.

⁶⁸ 'My Heart is on the Ground and the Indian Residential School Experience', *A Broken Flute*, p67

⁶⁹ J. M. Barrie, 'Peter Pan or The Boy Who Would Not Grow Up', *The Definitive Edition of the Plays of J. M. Barrie*, edited by A. E. Wilson (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1948; first published 1928), p549

⁷⁰ *Peter Pan & Peter Pan in Kensington Gardens*, p60

sexualised throughout history and in pop culture...think of the story of Pocahontas, or Tiger Lily in *Peter Pan*, or Cher in her 'half breed' video...We're either sexy squaws (the most offensive term out there), wise grandmas, or overweight ogres'.⁷¹

This representation of Native women as more overtly sexual than white women influences perceptions of Native women as sexually available objects, tacitly excusing exploitation of these women. It also enforces a Madonna-whore dichotomy that is steeped in sexism as well as racism. Throughout the narrative, Tiger Lily is presented as a contrast to Wendy. Wendy herself is a younger version of Mrs Darling; she symbolises purity, goodness, and Victorian reserve, while Tiger Lily displays her 'coquettish' and 'amorous' sides:

"You are so queer," [Peter] said, frankly puzzled, "and Tiger Lily is just the same. There is something she wants to be to me, but she says it is not my mother."

"No, indeed, it is not," Wendy replied with frightful emphasis. Now we know why she was prejudiced against the redskins.⁷²

Wendy's anger manifests itself against the entire tribe, rather than simply against Tiger Lily; her prejudice is not viewed as a problem to overcome, but as an acceptable state of mind. This legitimisation of prejudice, combined with the text's fictionalisation of American Indians, cements the damaging nature of Barrie's Native characters. The wide cultural influence of *Peter Pan*⁷³ means that

⁷¹ Adrienne Keene, 'Nudie Neon Indians and the sexualisation of Native women', *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.blogspot.co.uk/2010/06/nudie-neon-indian-stage-crashers-and.html>), accessed 18 January 2014

⁷² *Peter Pan & Peter Pan in Kensington Gardens*, p109

⁷³ The story of *Peter Pan* has been repeatedly reinterpreted in modern media. There have been two popular film adaptations by Disney, and Peter has also appeared in the corporation's video game *Kingdom Hearts*. The authorised sequel, *Peter Pan in Scarlet*, written by Geraldine McCaughrean, was published in 2006, and there have been several reinterpretations of the story,

this representation has had a far-reaching impact; 'Indians' are still to be found alongside fairies, pirates and mermaids, as costumes in fancy-dress shops.

such as *Tigerheart* (2008), *Tiger Lily* (2012) and *Wendy* (2003). Adapted versions of the characters have been used by many authors; for example, graphic novelist Alan Moore wrote a series of erotic comics, *Lost Girls*, which featured Wendy as a central character.

Appendix 2 Appropriation

As Root notes, 'It is possible to consume somebody's spirit, somebody's past or history, or somebody's arts and to do it in such a way that the act of consumption appears beautiful and heroic'.¹ 'Honouring' arguments ignore social and historical contexts that influence the position of Native peoples and their power within contemporary society. One example of this attitude can be found in the response from one of the co-founders of the 'Spirit Hoods' clothing company, following negative feedback from Native reviewers on their 'Navajo Wolves' collection:

In no way are we trying to demean or prostitute Native Americans, in fact their way of life has been so inspiring to us...For instance, us four owners went to a traditional Native American sweat lodge out here in California together. If anything we are inspired by Native culture and their respect for the land and its animals.²

Mendeluk's statement indicates that his perception of American Indian peoples has been shaped by stereotypes. His reference to a monolithic 'Native American *culture*' implies that he has absorbed homogenising stereotypes, which invariably feature Plains Indians (rather than, for example, the ways of life of tribes native to California). Furthermore, Mendeluk has internalised the stereotype of the 'mystic Indian'. The line 'us four owners went to a traditional Native American sweat lodge' suggests a belief that taking part in a single ceremony can give a cultural outsider full insight into American Indian cultures.³

¹ *Cannibal Culture*, p18

² Alexander Mendeluk, quoted by Adrienne Keene, 'Oh, Spirit Hoods', *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.blogspot.co.uk/2011/07/oh-spirit-hoods.html>)

³ *Ibid.*

This oversimplification and exoticisation of Native cultures corresponds with the trend towards 'white shamanism', explored by Dagmar Wernitznig. Wernitznig writes that 'for the last fifteen years, approximately, esotericism has animated and fetishized an Indian hybrid which oscillates between noble savage and primitivism'; a view which, once again, relies more upon stereotypes than genuine knowledge of and engagement with Native cultures.⁴ This not only contributes to the view of Native peoples as Other, but leads to them being perceived as commodities:

The focus is not so much on a realistic interest in Native American culture, but rather on an abstract appropriation of stereotypical Indian images and lifestyles. The result is an implicitly chauvinist attitude, benevolent towards the alien Other only for a personal interest.⁵

These 'white shamanistic' attitudes often lead to claims of 'self-identification as Indian', a practice which is 'used as a sort of access card to American Indian spiritual and cultural practices'; the co-opting and abstracting of Native cultures.⁶ These representations of Native cultures as commodities, created in part by colonial literature, influence portrayals of American Indians in modern texts. These texts in turn contribute to further commodification, particularly the reduction of religious items and beliefs to exotic objects that can be used by mainstream Western society.⁷ Instead of 'honouring' American Indian peoples,

⁴ Dagmar Wernitznig, *Going Native or Going Naïve? White shamanism and the neo-noble savage* (Lanham: University Press of America, Inc., 2003), pvii

⁵ *Ibid*, pxxxiii-xxxiv

⁶ Eva Marie Garroutte, *Real Indians: Identity and the survival of Native America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003), pp84-85

⁷ For example, warbonnets have become popular fashion accessories amongst the hipster subculture, and are often worn at festivals and in music videos. In a post on the 'hipster headdress', Adrienne Keene states 'The wearing of feathers and warbonnets in Native communities is not a fashion choice. Eagle feathers are presented as symbols of honor and

appropriation compounds the process of colonisation; as Root observes, 'this appreciation continues to be based on ugly and unequal power relations...it still comes down to a question of who takes and who gives'.⁸ Through cultural appropriation, Native peoples are fictionalised, and their beliefs and traditions are distorted and exploited for profit.

respect and have to be earned... having a drunken girl wearing a headdress and a bikini dancing at an outdoor concert does not honor me'. (Adrienne Keene, 'But Why Can't I Wear a Hipster Headdress?', *Native Appropriations* (<http://nativeappropriations.com/2010/04/but-why-cant-i-wear-a-hipster-headdress.html>), accessed 25th January 2014).

⁸ *Cannibal Culture*, p21

Appendix 3
Example of an 'angel corps' email from *Eternal*

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: *Eternal*, p63

Appendix Four Notes on *Carmilla*

Sue-Ellen Case describes the novel as ‘the first lesbian vampire story, in which the lesbian, desiring and desired by her victim, slowly brings her closer through the killing kiss of blood’.¹ The fact that Carmilla’s sexuality is represented as threatening is in keeping with the conservative nature of the Gothic, where ‘lesbian eroticism was codified as violent and transgressive’.² The defeat of the vampire generally means that the protagonists are rewarded with a restoration of patriarchal norms, a ‘conservative social enterprise that aims to restore discredited authorities’.³ This trend is apparent at the conclusion of *Carmilla*, when the narrator Laura is taken away by her father; ‘The following Spring my father took me on a tour through Italy. We remained away for more than a year’.⁴ However, the final lines of the novel imply that harmony has not been entirely restored:

It was long before the terror of recent events subsisted; and to this hour the image of Carmilla returns to memory with ambiguous alternations – sometimes the playful, languid, beautiful girl; sometimes the writhing fiend I saw in the ruined church; and often from a reverie I have started, fancying I heard the light step of Carmilla at the drawing room door.⁵

The fact that Laura engages in ‘reveries’ about Carmilla suggests that she still harbours an attraction towards her former companion. This ambiguous ending to

¹ Sue-Ellen Case, *Feminist and Queer Performance: Critical strategies* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p72

² Victoria Amador, ‘Dark Ladies: Vampires, lesbians, and women of colour’, *Gothic Studies*, Vol. 15, No. 1 (May 2013), p9

³ *Our Vampires, Ourselves*, p186

⁴ Joseph Sheridan Le Fanu, *Carmilla* (Kindle edition), p64

⁵ *Ibid.*

Carmilla implies not an acceptance of homosexuality, but that the evil represented by Carmilla has not truly been defeated.

Appendix Five Notes on Captivity

The concept of captivity as evidence of American Indian 'savagery' is still present in modern historical works; *A Fate Worse Than Death*, Gregory and Susan Michno state that:

There is no particular joy in relating what the captives experienced, but there is a need for it. Over the past several decades there has been a dramatic shift in perception about old heroes and villains. Today, white Americans are depicted as savage and greedy barbarians, while the Indians are said to have lived in peace with ecological wisdom. These role reversals illuminate history less than they simply elevate one group at the expense of another.¹

While this paragraph seems to call for a more nuanced look at history, other aspects of the text promote a return to colonial stereotypes of heroic settlers and savage Indians. They later state that 'if the Indians are eligible for reparations, then certainly the whites are eligible. It can be argued that white settlers suffered more killed, and lost more property'.² There is extensive historical evidence to dispute this assertion. While it is true that Native tribes did at times kill white settlers, there was never a sustained programme of genocide, both physical and cultural, carried out by American Indian peoples against Euro-Americans. Similarly, the loss of livestock and buildings suffered by white people does not compare in scale to the loss of Native land, as illustrated in this image:

¹ Gregory and Susan Michno, *A Fate Worse Than Death: Indian captivities in the West, 1830-1885* (Caldwell: Caxton Press, 2007), pxiii

² *Ibid*, p477

Image removed for copyright reasons

Source: www.3quarksdaily.com

Finally, it must be remembered that Native peoples were defending their land from invasion, while the settlers were carrying out this invasion.