

# **Through the Eyes of Citizen Journalists**

**A Comparative Study of User-generated video reports and Professional TV news reports on 2011 Wenzhou Bullet Train Accident and Last Rescued Survivor “Little Yiyi”**

Xilong Wang

University of Helsinki

Faculty of Social Sciences

Media and Global Communication Studies

Master Thesis

September 2014

Tiedekunta/Osasto Fakultet/Sektion – Faculty Faculty of Social Sciences		Laitos/Institution– Department Media and Communication Studies	
Tekijä/Författare – Author Xilong Wang			
Työn nimi / Arbetets titel – Title From Eyes of Citizen Journalists: A Comparative Study of User-generated video reports and Professional TV news reports on 2011 Wenzhou Bullet Train Accident Last Rescued Survivor “Little Yiyi” in China			
Oppiaine /Läroämne – Subject Citizen journalism and democracy			
Työn laji/Arbetets art – Level Master’s Thesis		Aika/Datum – Month and year September 2014	Sivumäärä/ Sidoantal – Number of pages 84+27
Tiivistelmä/Referat – Abstract  <p>This study aims to examine the difference between user-generated online video reports and professional TV news reports on covering the last rescued survivor Xiang Weiye, widely referred in media as “Little Yiyi”, in 2011 Wenzhou bullet train accident in China. By comparing two different types of reports, this study focuses on several aspects, including the knowledge and skill in using camera and editing videos; the representation of experts and the general population; access to media materials and information sources; and style in narratives. Semiotic analysis is used in this study as the research method in order to compare and interpret video materials collected from online sources.</p> <p>Literature in this study includes discussions on theories of democracy, the media, and citizen journalism. Democracy and media theories provide knowledge in understanding the role of media and journalism in representing interests from different social groups in public discussion. Pluralistic viewpoints in news coverage, therefore, are argued to be crucial aspects in construction of public discussions that are capable of representing multiple social interests. Theories on citizen journalism provide knowledge of the nature of user-generated media content. By reviewing existing studies, this thesis argues that citizen journalism has the capability to provide additional viewpoints which are more likely to be ignored by the mainstream media due to reasons such as financial pressures and professional standards. Several studies on Chinese media system are also reviewed in this study in order to provide contextual information for the interpretation of data. Furthermore, discussions on video journalism and video witnessing are used to improve the interpretation of data.</p> <p>Results of this study show that citizen video reports are different from TV news videos. Citizen journalists are representing the news with a more subjective viewpoint and narration than professional TV news. Citizen journalists in China lack knowledge and skills in making and editing videos. They are able to report from a closer standpoint toward the community, but they cannot bring opinions from the community to their audience. Thus this study concludes that citizen journalists in China have not been able to bring different viewpoints into public discussion. However, they still have potential since it is shown that citizen journalists are aware of the importance of opinions from ordinary citizens.</p>			
Avainsanat – Nyckelord – Keywords Democracy, mass-self communication, network society, citizen journalism, Chinese media system, 2011 Wenzhou bullet train accident, online video reports, video witnessing			
Säilytyspaikka – Förvaringställe – Where deposited University of Helsinki, faculty of Social Sciences			

## Table of Content

1. Introduction to this study.....	1
1.1 Research question and research problem.....	2
1.2 The structure of this thesis.....	3
2. Literature Review .....	6
2.1 Between media and democracy.....	8
2.2 Internet and citizen journalism.....	15
2.3 Media system in China.....	24
2.4 Video journalism and video witnessing.....	30
3. Data and Methodology.....	35
3.1 Introduction .....	35
3.2 Data collection.....	38
3.3 Semiotic analysis as a research method.....	42
3.4 Coding and analysis of data .....	48
3.5 Validity.....	53
4. Analysis: Differences in video between citizen journalists and professional journalists .....	56
4.1 frequency of cuts and technique in camera usage.....	57
4.2 representation of the experts and the crowd.....	60
4.3 access and crediting to information.....	64
4.4 subjective-ness in narrative and video witnessing.....	66
5. Conclusion and Discussion.....	72
Bibliography .....	78
Appendix – coding sheets.....	85

## **1. Introduction to this study**

In July 2011, there was a severe bullet train accident in Wenzhou, southeast China. This accident led to 40 deaths and hundreds of injuries. It is the first severe train accident since high speed bullet trains have been put into use. There were rumors that the Chinese government attempted to bury the locomotive in order to hide the cause of this accident from public. At the same time, the cause of this accident is also related to the corruption case in February 2011, which involves several top politicians and government officials, including Liu Zhijun, Minister of Railway who is one of the main politicians that were promoting high speed bullet trains in China. He was sacked in February 2011 due to this corruption case. The accident attracted much attention and was heavily covered in the media during July and August in that year.

At the same time, many user-generated video reports have been published on one of the biggest online video sharing websites in China Youku ([www.youku.com](http://www.youku.com)). A large amount of these videos were related to the youngest survivor in this train accident, a two year-old little girl widely referred as “little Yiyi” in media, who was badly injured and lost both of her parents in the accident. Thus it also attracted my personal interest in finding out how these user-generated video reported this news event differently from professional TV news, since it is also related to the sensitive corruption case of high rank government officials.

There already exist many studies on the differences between citizen journalism and professional journalism in print and online media, (Ahva, 2010; Kaufhold, Lasorsa & Lewis, 2010; Nip, 2006, etc.) but not many studies have been done on video journalism. As a different medium video represents news story in very different ways, using image, sound and text. Therefore it interests me to find out how citizen journalists and professional journalists would use video differently in their reporting. At the same time, I connect my study with the theories about media and democracy. I am particularly interested in how the media could represent different interest groups in society and how it can have an influence on creating a democratic public discourse (Castells, 2011; Fenton, 2010). With media and democracy theories I am attempting to analyze and explore what is citizen journalism's role in China and find out whether it is able to represent alternative interest groups, such as ordinary citizens, in society that are silenced in professional media (Freeman, 2011; McNair, 2006).

### **1.1 Research questions in this research**

The aim of this study is to find out how user-generated videos report news related to “Little Yiyi” differently from professional TV news videos. Therefore the main research question for this study is: *how news events on 2011 Chinese bullet train accident survivor “little Yiyi”, is covered differently in online citizen video reporting through the video sharing website Youku, compared to professional video reporting?*

Recent research on professional journalists' opinions towards user-generated media contents shows that the quality of user-generated contents is always a concern for editors from media institutions. (Kaufhold, Lasorsa & Lewis, 2010; Örenbring, 2013, Anden-Papadopoulos & Pantti, 2013.) By quality it refers to both the visual quality of image and editorial quality which involves four watchwords of professional journalism: the “objectiveness” in storytelling, “credibility” in the trustworthiness of the information, “accuracy” in the correctly indicated information sources, and “fairness” in equal representation of different interest groups (Rosen, 1999, pp. 32-33).

Therefore I have four sub-questions:

*Do citizen journalists and professional journalists use the camera and edit their video content differently;*

*Do citizen journalists and professional journalists represent expert and ordinary citizen differently;*

*Do citizen journalists and professional journalists access their sources differently; and*

*Do citizen journalists and professional journalists narrate their story differently?*

## **1.2 Structure of this study**

In the literature review I will make a discussion on the role of journalism in society. I will discuss how journalism can contribute to the public sphere and

enhance the function of media as a platform to represent the opinions of the public. Then, changes in new media technology will be discussed in order to provide knowledge on the development of journalism in a network society. The literature review will also provide a review on theories on citizen journalism and the media system in China. I will discuss the difference between citizen journalism and professional journalism in existing research. A discussion about Chinese media system will provide contextual knowledge for the interpretation of data. Finally, the discussion on video journalism and video witnessing will provide knowledge on video as a medium used in reporting and research.

The third chapter discusses data and research methods. The first part will give brief information about my case study. The second part explains how the data is collected and selected from online sources. The reasons for data collection and selection methods will also be included here. The following third part will discuss the analysis method, semiotic analysis. It will include both theories and implications of this method. The fourth part in this chapter will explain how the data is coded and how the analysis process is designed. The last part in this chapter will discuss validity consideration of this study.

The fourth chapter represents the findings of this study. It is divided into four big topics according my research questions. The first section compares the difference in using camera and editing in citizen and TV news videos. The second section focuses on the differences in the representation of experts and ordinary information sources in both videos. The third section discusses how

information sources are credited differently. In the last section, I will discuss how the narrative of video news stories is formed.

In the last chapter, I will first have a general view about the results of my study, followed by a conclusion. I will also discuss the limitations of this study and suggestions for further research before this paper ends.



## 2. Literature Review

Several researchers have explored disasters and unexpected accidents as crucial events that represent the power of citizens in circulating and disseminating information with new communication technologies. September 11 and the London bombing were two significant events where videos made by citizens were widely used in news reporting. (Allan, 2004, pp. 70-71; Gillmore, 2008, p. 1; Anden-Papadopoulos, 2013a, p. 2; Reading, 2009.) The role of citizens was highlighted by the huge amount of user-generated content published on the internet, as well as the use of these by the mainstream media in reporting of the event. Castells (2011, p. 4) describes this kind of “multimodal mass media and the interactive, horizontal networks of communication built around the internet and wireless communication” as *mass self-communication*.

In this chapter I will discuss how this new phenomenon is shaping and changing the practice and structure of journalism. The focus of the discussion is on the role of journalism in fostering democracy. As Allan (2004, p. 215) points out, “democracy requires a far more robust exchange of viewpoints”, and “journalism is up to the challenge of giving them vigorous expression”.

Chinese citizen online video reports are used as a case study in order to find out how citizen journalists are reporting news event differently from professional journalists. As I will discuss in the following subchapters, dominant mainstream media agencies are still tightly controlled by the

government in China. Thus it is meaningful to see how citizen-generated video coverage in China has the possibility of representing more comprehensive views in the public sphere. It has been observed that both Western and Chinese professional media organizations are increasingly using citizen-generated media contents in their coverage. (Xin, 2011, p. 341; Anden-Papadopoulos & Pantti, 2013, pp. 966-967.) So a comparison of citizen video coverage and professional TV news coverage would be useful to see the difference between these two in the context of China.

In the first subchapter, the focus will be on the changes of power relations in the network era and its connection to democracy. Following Castells' analyses and various discussions on globalization and the network society, the second subchapter will discuss how the internet and online citizen journalism are allowing ordinary citizens to participate in public discussion so that they can make their voices heard, thus balancing their power with high class groups in order to achieve a more democratic society. The third subchapter will provide contextual information on the Chinese media system as a background for the case study. As Castells (Castells, 2011, p. 44) emphasizes, when analyzing media and power relationships in a global network society, the historical and cultural context of specific society need to be taken into account. He says, that "Each network defines its own power relationships depending on its programmed goals" (ibid., p. 44). Thus, in the third subchapter I will locate the case study in the context of the Chinese media system by making a historical review of its development. The last subchapter I will have a look at the characteristics of video as a special medium. It will draw a connection

between the developments of technology to the growing phenomenon of citizen video reporting.

## **2.1 Between media and democracy**

John Keane (1991, p. 168) defines democracy as “a system of procedural rules with normative implications... on who is authorized to make collective decisions and through which procedures such decisions are to be made.” His emphasis is the subject of decision-making. In his argument, the condition of democracy can only be met if citizens can take part actively in the decision making process in order to influence it through their own interests. This sometimes leads to contradictions or even conflicts between interests of different social groups. These contradictions come from the difference of the social status between different social groups, such as political elites and the working classes. Therefore, representing these contradicted interests can lead to political decisions that are more balanced between the interests of the more powerful elite classes and other social groups. Such political decisions will not only favor the interests and values of elite social groups.

It is normally impossible to present every individual's viewpoints and interest in the decision-making process. As Carpentier (2011, pp. 16-22) points out, the population size in almost any modern society prevents the kind of direct participation that was possible in ancient Rome, for example, where every citizen could take part in the decision-making process. Hence, instead of direct “participation”, citizens and their opinions are “represented” in the decision-

making process. Thus, “democratic theory focuses on accountability and responsiveness in the decision-making process” (Ferre, 2002, p. 205). Sufficient and comprehensive representation of the public in the decision-making process, as well as the feedback information from the decision-maker toward civil society, is a crucial condition to ensure democracy. This condition guarantees that the contradiction and conflict on the opinion that John Keane values in assuring democracy can be brought into the process of decision-making.

In order to better explain the connection between the democracy and media with power, it is useful to first look at the Habermasian (1974) definition of the “public sphere”, which is “a realm of our social life in which something approaching public opinion can be formed” (ibid., p. 49). In other words, the public sphere is an abstract social space where public opinions can be represented. This space is usually constructed by various forms of discourses taking place in different media platforms. The focus of Habermasian theory is to ensure a space that can represent public opinions in the best way possible. As Myra Marx Ferre emphasizes, “theories of public sphere focus on the role of public communication in facilitating or hindering [decision-making] process” (Ferre, 2002, p. 205).

Before we go deeper into the examination of the importance of representing public opinion and assuring democracy, we need to first have a more comprehensive understanding of power relations. Power, according to Castells, is the “relational capacity that enables a social actor to influence

asymmetrically the decisions of other social actors in ways that favor the empowered actor's will, interest, and value" (Castells, 2011, p. 10). He emphasizes the relational capacity of social power, by which he means that power is a "relationship", not an "attribute".

Drawing from Weber's idea on the nation and the state, Castells understands the state as an entity that claims "the monopoly of violence within a given territory" (Castells, 2011, p. 17). The dominant class's interests and wills can be protected by using the institutional powers of the state, like the military and the police force. He also points out that the widely accepted social values are an "expression of power" (Castells, 2011, p. 28), because the dominant class is positioned in a much stronger place in the power structure than lower classes in society. Thus, it is easier for dominant groups to gain more influence and define these social values. Hence, who is holding power in society can influence what social values are dominant. It further leads to imbalanced power relations between the dominant social class and other social classes.

According to the discussion above, the most important way to assure that democracy is a proportional representation of different interest groups in the decision-making process. Thus, the function of media and journalism in improving democracy is to act as a bridge between civil society and the dominant decision-makers, "to define and represent public opinion" (Lewis & Wahl-Jorgensen, 2005, p. 99). Representing interests of different social groups in public discussion can ensure that less privileged social groups can have an opportunity to exercise their power while participating in public discourses.

This allows the interests of these social groups to have influence on social values compared to dominant groups. Hence the political decision-making would not be dominated by the interests of social elites and ruling classes, in a top-down power structure. Heckett (2005, pp. 94-95) argues, a structurally pluralistic news system is what has the capability to ensure democracy.

A pluralistic news system or pluralistic media system can be divided into two dimensions: internal pluralism and external pluralism (Benson, 2003, pp. 63-64). Internal pluralism means news coverage is differentiated inside one media organization, it is either ideologically pluralistic or institutionally pluralistic. Ideological pluralism means that similar news stories are framed differently, reported from a different viewpoint or that they reflect the opinions of different social groups. In contrast, institutional pluralism means that more opinions and different types of speakers are mentioned in the same story. On the other hand, external pluralism refers to news coverage that is differentiated across different media organizations. Based on his research, Benson points out that “multi-article” and “multi-genre” debate on the news media can help provide more multi-perspective news coverage. (Ibid., pp. 63-80.) What he wants to explain by this idea is that multiple stories and frames in news coverage can generate more pluralistic news coverage. It ultimately leads to more diverse opinions represented in the public sphere. Hence, pluralistic news coverage can generate more multi-perspectival representations. More diversified news coverage allows the participation of multiple public interests in influencing the decision-making process.

It is also argued that liberal pluralistic context is essential in facilitating a democratic public debate. The liberal pluralistic conception believes that within a liberalistic market environment, the “citizen’s right to freedom of speech can be best protected by a market-based mass media system” (Allan, 2004, p. 47). This is because a market oriented media system is guided by the demand of the public. In a liberalistic market environment, media generate its costs mostly through advertisements. Therefore it needs to take into account the interest of as many different social groups as possible in order to reach maximum profit. According to this perspective, media organizations in a liberal pluralistic context are capable of representing the pluralistic public demand due to its focus on a wide range of public groups’ interests. It is capable of facilitating the formation of multiple public opinions. By representing these public opinions, the liberal pluralistic media system is able to make the collaborative influence by interests from average citizens stronger than interests of elite groups. (Allan, 2004, pp. 48-53.)

At the same time, this liberal conception has its problems as well. For instance, in a highly market-dominated media environment such as the United States, mainstream media has been criticized for not being able to represent the public opinion and various interests of citizens (Gillmor, 2008, pp. 237-238; Rosen, 1999, pp. 30-32). Robert Hackett (2005, p. 86) has observed the failure of mainstream journalism to represent the public. He defines the position of the United States as a “populist” and “anti-elitist” stance. By “populist” he refers to strongly hyped and entertainment oriented media contents. By “anti-elitist” he means media contents that are blindly against political elite groups.

Especially under the financial pressure from the market, in order to gain support from its readers, media organizations tend to produce more “populist” and “anti-elitist” contents. It frequently leads to ignorance on the quality and credibility of media contents. In pursuing profit, news media are increasingly shifting to “sex, violence, sensationalism and invasion of privacy” (ibid., p. 87).

While such problems are observed in the so called traditional media, new media technologies have offered a possible solution. New media technologies have brought a notable improvement to the capability of media to represent pluralistic public opinions and to ensure a better democracy. The internet has made communication among individuals much easier and capable of reaching a broader audience. Citizens are provided with a wide variety of information on what they are interested in than before. Thus Dan Gillmor argues that the internet offers an alternative to “centralized media and rancid consumption” and generates “informed global conversation” (Gillmor, 2008, p. 209). The network society has provided more possibilities for citizens to gain access to information and knowledge. For example, many digital encyclopedias on the internet provide an easy way to search and access information on all kinds of topics like history and culture. People with sufficient knowledge can be more capable of participating in public discourse and making political decisions. As John Keane (1991, p. 168) argues, in order to achieve democracy, it is essential that citizens are informed with information related to decision-making so that they have the knowledge and possibility to influence the process.



However, new media technologies are not the perfect solution for the problems traditional media are facing. While Castells holds an optimistic view on new media technologies, many recent studies have shown that they have not really changed the media environment in reality. (Fenton, 2010; Curran & Witschge, 2010.) For example, Fenton's (2010, pp. 3-10) research shows that the internet has not really changed the dominating position of traditional media in the market. In contradiction to the theories which argued in new media technologies' ability to ensure more varied opinions, in reality, studies have shown that these differences are not represented as we think they should be in the new media platforms.

New media technologies are not only bringing changes, but also bringing new problems to traditional media. A rapid growth in the speed of information exchange leads to problems for mainstream journalism to represent different viewpoints and maintain its quality. Under intense pressure to publish news stories, journalists barely have time to conduct in depth interviews or even double check the sources. (McNair, 2006, p. 2.) Also, with less revenue generated from online advertisement and the market driven interests of the media organization, journalists, especially for the online media platforms, are rewriting stories by copying materials from few information sources. These sources are often widely used by other professional journalists. This results in a lack of variation both in the news stories and information sources, which is called as "cannibalization" of journalism (Freedman, 2010, pp. 41-42; Phillips, 2010).

Media is first of all a business. Though not all media organizations and journalists are in a pure pursuit of profit, pursuing profit is still undeniably a part of the aim of media organizations. Under pressure from the market and peer competition, it has been argued that media is not having the same capability to safeguard the interest of the citizens and represent the public sphere in reality as argued in democracy and media theories. Globally, government and big media organizations are controlling the information flow by using methods like copyright law to limit other organizations and individuals accessing media resources. (Gillmor, 2008, p. 209.) Therefore, diversity of voices in mainstream journalistic contents is actually very limited. Even in the internet, mainstream media are still dominating in the same way as what was the case with print media, so that “we are left with a public discourse that is largely homogeneous” (Fenton, 2010, p. 10).

Yet, at the same time, the development of citizen journalism in the internet is providing possibilities for an alternative solution toward the problems in mainstream media and new media technologies. The next subchapter will focus on the influence of the internet in relation to citizen journalism.

## **2.2 Internet and citizen journalism**

The internet has been developing very fast during the last two decades. It is now one of the major information sources for those living in countries with a network service. People can access the internet through a personal computer

or a cellphone anytime they need to. Thus Manuel Castells says “We are living inside the internet” (Castells, 2011, p. 64). Castells (ibid., pp. 10-13) brings out the term of network society to indicate the features of this new way of communication on the internet. By network society he means that societies, and different groups in these societies, are all connected with each other through new communication technologies. The relation between these groups is like a web; and different societies and groups are like nodes on this web. The advantage in the network society is the relation between different nodes on the web makes it easier and faster for them to communicate with each other.

There are many changes in media and communication brought by mass self-communication. One of the aspects is the interaction between content makers and audiences. Before the mass self-communication era, as Castells (2011, pp. 55-56) described, the relation between content maker and receiver was mostly one-directional. Media professionals were normally the ones who decided what the media produces and distribute, and news were also more like a one-way dissemination of information (Rodriguez, 2011, p. 250). But the technological development in mass self-communication era has led to a transition from this one way sender-receiver model into a multi-directional and interactive model. This new model has encouraged the development of citizen journalism. Under this network model, individual citizens are increasingly able to connect to more people than in a one-directional model.

What Castells means by “multi-directional modal mass media” is the fragmentation and segmentation in both the media sphere and its audience.

There is more and more variation between media organizations with the emergence of the network society. In the age of mass communication, media was mostly serving their audience as one group. The purpose of the media was to reach as big audiences as possible. The multi-directional and interactive model associated with new communication technologies increases the pluralism of the information available, which leads to the fragmentation of both the audience and the media itself. Unlike big media organizations, citizen-generated content usually pursues smaller audiences. Because of this, citizen-generated content is more individual, interactive and more closely connected to their readers. (Castells, 2011, pp. 77-81; McNair, 2006, p. 123.)

The development of new technologies and the internet has brought another significant change to media and communication. Stuart Allan (2005, pp. 70-71) has summarized five changes in network era. The first change is the “Immediacy of news coverage”. It means the internet has significantly shortened the time period between the events and the publication of news stories. The second is the “volume and breadth” of the news stories. It means the quantity and variety of news coverage is growing rapidly, especially in the digital media. The third is that the internet “allows disaffected groups and individuals to communicate with one another”, which leads to the dissemination of messages. It allows individual people to publish their own media content and reach a wide range of audience, ranging from political opinions to hate speech. The fourth change is the lack of “indispensable news and information resource” in the news coverage. It reflects the decreasing emphasis drawn on the importance of the credibility of the news sources. And

the fifth is “feedback loop and possibility to interact” which is referring to a more rapid exchange of information and interaction between journalists and their audiences. These changes are creating new possibilities but also bringing new challenges for journalism.

Under these changes, mainstream journalism is failing to represent the opinions of ordinary citizens in public discussions. One of the biggest reasons of their failure is caused by an increasing speed of news coverage. Allan (2004) argues that news is, first, seen as an “object of policy formation”. For instance, it is used as a tool to form representative democracy. Secondly, news is seen as a commodity whose purpose is to be “bought and sold”. Third, news is seen as public opinion which is used to generate debate in public sphere. (Ibid., pp. 3-4.) Because news is an object of policy formation, the increases of the speed of coverage on current events have led to a loss of quality in the depth of coverage (McNair, 2006, p. 237).

Due to the time pressure in publishing, professional journalists are not able to have enough time to collect audience feedback, though the feedback loop is more frequent in network era. Mainstream institutions are still not able to “listen” to their audiences. The time pressure has also led to a decrease of accuracy and credibility in news coverage because journalists do not have enough time to check every fact. (Gillmor 2008, pp. 237-238.)

Other than the increasing speed of news coverage, the failure of mainstream journalism to represent public opinions in network society is caused by the

professional practices of mainstream journalism. As McNair (2006, p. 126) has pointed out, mainstream media are treating political and social elites, as well as experts, as the major sources of information. Journalists consider them as more valuable and credible information providers. At the same time, citizens are still treated as passive information receivers, which fit into the one directional sender-receiver model in the pre-network society we discussed above. Hence McNair (2006, p. 46) argues that the public relation of media organizations that are treating experts and citizens differently is “a degeneration and corruption of the public sphere”. It is even doubtful whether such a thing we call global public sphere exists because news and discourses on the internet are very biased and entertainment-centered (Curran & Witschge, 2010, p. 103).

Professional journalists see many aspects in their products as a symbol of the difference between themselves and citizen journalists. Rosen (1999, pp. 32-33) has concluded “objectivity”, “accuracy”, “fairness”, and “credibility” as four watchwords for professional journalism. Örenbring (2013) has also pointed out three values that make professional journalism different from citizen journalism. The most important of these three values of professional journalism appreciated by journalists is the ability to decide what is valuable and worth knowing for their readers, and being able to filter the content for their readers. Thus, news media reflects not a world “out there” but “the practice of these who have the power to determine the experience of others” (Schudson, 2005, p.181). News is not a report on the factual but “a depletable consumer product that must be made fresh daily” (ibid., p.186).

Jay Rosen also considers the lack of participation by the public in traditional journalism as one of the reasons for the promotion of citizen journalism movement. He believes there is a need for individual citizens to take part in the media discussion. The coverage on traditional media is reflecting heavily on journalists' interest from the selection and format of stories. As he says newspapers are only "partially informing and forming" the public. In order to construct a public sphere, it is important to ensure citizens' access in participating in public discourse. (Rosen, 1999, p. 30.)

Now we should have a clear definition for citizen journalism. Citizen journalism or public journalism refers to a journalistic reform to allow individual citizens to "involve in the journalistic process and public discussion... which aims at connecting the media more closely with its reader" (Ahva, 2010, p. 13).

While traditional media and mainstream journalism are struggling to represent the opinions of the public, the rise of citizen journalism has benefited from technological development. With a much lower cost in both creating content and disseminating it by using the internet and other new media platforms, citizens can reach a large amount of people in a very short period of time. Strong interaction between users has made information exchange easier and more effective. Citizens are offered a rich amount of information which can lead them to participate in the decision-making process more actively. (Castells, 2011, pp. 63-71; McNair, 2006, pp. 123-129.)

Citizen journalism has been appreciated for its ability to provide content based on local sources and for its ability to collect opinions and ideas from a widely diverse sources and perspectives. (Kaufhold, Lasorsa & Lewis, 2010, pp. 164-167; Örenbring, 2013) Thus, citizen journalism has the possibility to contribute to the pluralization of public discussion, and also to represent various interests in the public sphere which can lead to a more democratic political decision-making.

The content and discussion generated from bottom up gives citizen journalism advantage to be closely connected to the community. As Rosen (1999, p. 297) argues, journalists should take a position inside the community and discussion rather than taking a position that is “above” the members of the community and that avoids getting close to them. While being more closely connected to the community, citizen journalism is capable of connecting to the people and capable of paying attention to the public life. Because citizen journalism is “more close to the community”, it has “more possibility to build physical interaction” with the community, and thus “reach the audience deeply” (Rodriguez, 2011, p. 251).

Compared to mainstream journalism, citizen journalism still has many limitations. One of them is its ability to gain access to information. Though generally considered with stronger ability to provide wide range of opinions, it is still important to emphasize that individual people have less of a possibility in reaching a wide range of people compared to big media houses. As



mentioned in the previous section, the global media sphere is still dominated by government institutions and big media organizations. These big organizations control most of the media capital in the market, therefore they can control what kind of messages are delivered to the majority of audiences, and can even control what values and meanings are contained in certain messages (McNair, 2006, p. 91). The effect that citizen journalists can have is still very limited. Their influence could be described as “thin” compared to the “thick” influence of big media organizations.

Because of a lack of access to information, citizen journalists would then rely on mainstream media. In order to reach large audiences, many citizen journalists have to raise the awareness of them by connecting to the mainstream journalists and big media houses. While being close to big media, it is normal that after a period of time citizen journalists are influenced by the routine or working code of mainstream journalism and lose their independence both on political and economic sides. (McNair, 2006, pp. 133-134.) Thus, citizen journalists might also be influenced by mainstream media, and then have the same perspective and position in their reports as mainstream journalists do. In this sense, it is hard to say if citizen journalism can really bring more variation to the public discourse under the influence of big media houses. (Couldry, 2010, pp. 150-151.)

There are also other problems in citizen journalism. Allan (2005, p. 72) sees the reliability of the information as the biggest concern regarding online citizen journalism. Unlike professional journalism practices which require a

clear indication of what sources are used, citizen journalism doesn't have any equivalent requirement. Online journalism and blogs are also replete with "exaggeration, error and even deliberative falsifications" (ibid., p. 72). Lack of ability to follow journalistic standard in content making and the lack of ethical awareness have been the main reasons why editors and professional journalists are holding a negative view on citizen journalism. (Kaufhold, Lasorsa & Lewis, 2010, pp. 169-171; Örenbring, 2013, pp. 37-39.) Professional journalists take the ethical code as one of their professional values in working as a special profession. It includes objectivity in reporting and responsibility for the credibility of information in their story.

Due to such problems, editors in mainstream media usually think, that the content produced by individual citizens is very subjective and entertainment oriented. Thus user-generated contents are usually considered by editors of publish house as low quality contents which do not have the required quality to be published. For example, in her research on citizen video journalism, Bock (2012, p. 642) has pointed out that citizen journalists are more subjective in their reporting. They tend to show the report as their own experience by revealing themselves in the story as the creator, and use more first person language to narrate the story.

But at the same time, it is also argued that these kinds of problems exist in both kinds of journalism. Professional journalists are often using exaggerations in their story in order to attract readers as well. But they tend to use special techniques in writing to make these exaggerations less obvious. On

the other hand, though citizen journalists use exaggerations in their story, these problems are more transparent and easy to find by its readers. (McNair, 2006, p. 123.) Thus it is very difficult to argue if user generated contents are more reliable than information from professional media.

As Rosen (1999, p. 295) says, the point of having journalists around is not to produce attention, but to produce wider variety of opinions on those already existing attentions. Citizen journalism has the possibility to provide more variation in the public, but how much it really has influence in the tough situation we are observing now is still very unclear.

In order to analyze such questions, we need to analyze them in specific media environments. Power relations between the public and the government, and also the construction of meaning and social values are best understood in particular contexts. (Castells, 2011, p. 26.) Therefore, in the following subchapter I will take a look at the Chinese media system.

### **2.3 Media system in China**

The current Media system in China is a complex mixture of heavy influence both from the political party and the market. Its development is a process of shifting between these two factors of influence. Chinese media researcher Pan (2005, pp. 96-103) has divided the development of media system in The People's Republic of China into three periods. The first one is from 1949 to the end of 1970s. In this period, media was serving as a mouthpiece of the

Chinese communist party and news coverage was highly political and ideologically oriented. Before the establishment of People's Republic of China, mass media was used by the Communist Party of China as a tool for information exchange and creating a bond with the people during the Sino-Japanese war and the following civil war against Kuomintang, the National Party during the 1930s and 1940s. Its purpose was thus highly political and ideologically bonded right from the beginning. Another Chinese media researcher Yuezhi Zhao describes this period of Chinese media system as a "mass propaganda and persuasion model" that is "a scene full of contradictions, tensions, and ambiguities" (Zhao, 1998, p. 4).

Due to its authoritarian nature, in this period of time between 1949 and the 1970s, the media treated people as "undereducated" individuals. The duty of the media was to serve the people; to let the people know what they should know, and more importantly under the direction of the Party. Hence the Communist Party of China had assigned the "Party principle" in guiding the media. These principles were: "they must accept the Party's ideology as its own"; "they must propagate the Party's programs, policies and directions"; and "they must accept the Party's leadership and stick to the Party's organizational principles and press policies". (Zhao, 1998, p. 19.) Under such circumstances, there was no independence of media as they were ultimately only a subject to party control.

In the second period, during the 1980s, there was a democratic movement in media and journalistic sphere that tried to make the public discourse more

open and separate the media from party control, shifting from a party-press system to a neo-liberal media system (Zhao, 1998, pp. 24-29; Pan, 2005). At the same time with the political reform led by the premier Zhao Ziyang, a democratization movement of the media and communication was emerging and challenging the Party Principle that was tightly controlling the media. The gradual marketization led by Deng Xiaoping's opening up policy led economic and cultural construction of the media with more stress placed on certain kinds of content such as business information and entertainment. This period of time is also the "Golden Time" for journalism in China, since journalists are both enjoying autonomy in reporting politically and feeling secured economically (Sparks, 2008, p. 15).

After the 1989 student movement, the development of media systems in People's Republic of China was going to a totally opposite direction. Because of the step down of reformist leader Zhao Ziyang and the rising tension between the public and government caused by the Tiananmen Square student protest, Jiang Zeming, the president of People's Republic of China held a public speech, re-assuring that the media's role was to "educate people" (Zhao, 1998, pp. 45-46). Thus after his speech, the government actually tightened its control of the media as journalists involved were fired and multiple semi-independent papers were closed (Sparks, 2008, p. 15).

The third period of the development of the Chinese media system is from the early 1980s onwards, when the government has resumed tight control over the media. While government tightened the control, there has been a dramatic

marketization of both private and party controlled media organizations. The media has turned to the market and has quickly become commercialized, resulting in an annual growth of 30% in advertising. Media has been relying mostly on the funds generated by advertising in the early 1920s, following the growth of economy. (Pan, 2005, p. 100.) But at the same time, journalists have still been strictly following the Party Principles in news coverage.

The media system in China after the reform is described by Yuezhi Zhao as a “propagandist/commercialist model” (Zhao, 1998, p. 161). While journalists and media organizations are pursuing financial benefit through following the demands of the market, government and party are still controlling professional journalism by assigning political principles and ideologies, as the same time as the journalists and media organizations carrying out the self-censorship.

The current media system in China is also described as a “bounded innovation” by Zhongdang Pan (2005, pp. 96-101). He explains it as a media system that is controlled by the political party and the state from the top of a hierarchy structure. This system is under the influence of a complex combination from political, economic, and ideological oriented principles. Under the economic principle media is encouraged to be more innovative and more pluralistic in order to meet the demand from the market. At the same time, this influence has been limited by political principles from the government, resulting in heavy censorship and self-censorship on information related to government and top politicians. It is a media system that is swinging between the Party, the market, and the audiences, trying to find a balance between them.

Spark (2008, p. 18) also points out that there is also strong “institutional continuity” in Chinese media systems, meaning that not only political parties, but also individual elite politicians are controlling the media through connecting to big media entrepreneurs. At the same time, there are also big regional and institutional differences among Chinese media organizations. For example, media in southern China is considered more liberal compared to other regions. The decision to choose whether to report when it comes to sensitive topics is also dependent on individual media organizations. But still, the government remains in control of the media and media organizations can get into big trouble if they go across the line. (Sparks, 2009, p. 342.)

The same system is also present in online journalism. Internet has been developing extremely fast during the last decade in China. By the year 2011, there were 440 million internet users in China and the internet penetration rate had reached 33% (Zhang, 2011, p. 2). The internet is becoming an important source for investigative journalism (Sparks, 2009, p. 345). There are many corruption reporting topics in print media that are inspired by online information. For example, a corruption case of the Red Cross in China started from a girl boasting about her wealth on social media with a profile title as CEO of Red Cross. Meanwhile, the government is tightly censoring the internet as well. With the official launch of the Great Firewall in 2006, the whole internet service has been under the government’s supervision, so that, for example specific keywords are censored and access to most oversea web services are banned. As Zhang (2011, p. 3) points out, though media in China

is gradually “withdrawing” from the direct political and ideological control of the Party, the Chinese media system is still very much limited inside a “national frame”. China is also one of the few countries that have legislation for regulating the internet. By 2008, the People’s Republic of China has already enforced 27 legislations on the regulation of the internet (ibid., p. 3).

Because mainstream media and professional journalism in Chinese media system are tightly under the limitation of government regulation and market orientation, their capability to represent the public sphere is very limited. In such circumstances, citizen journalism in China has the potential to become a major player in representing the public. The fast development of the internet and new communication technology allows individual citizens to exchange vast amounts of information with each other. They have also constructed a convenient platform for citizens to express their opinions toward the government and the ruling class.

At the same time, there have not been many studies on citizen journalism in China revealing the ability of citizen journalists in representing the public under media censorship system. Based on recent studies, citizen journalism is not showing a very strong capacity for representing public opinions thus far. Individual citizen journalists lack of both the ability to gain access to official information and the ability to gather as big amount of information as profession journalists (Nip, 2009, pp. 99-100). Xin’s (2010, pp. 341-342) study on citizen journalists’ reports shows that they are also under quite strong



Party control. Thus they often “fail to provide the public with information it needs badly” (ibid., p. 341).

Several studies on citizen journalism in China also show that it focuses on entertainment, and the “expression of nationalistic sentiments or hatred speech” (Xin 2010, p. 341; see also Wang 2011). But Xin emphasizes that citizen journalism still has the possibility of improving democracy. Hence, this study examines Chinese citizen journalism’s possibility of improving democracy by comparing how citizen video journalism is contributing in representing the public in relation to professional TV journalism.

## **2.4 Video journalism and video witnessing**

This section is focused on the characteristics of video as a visual medium for research and how it creates and shares the sense of witness in both the maker of video and its viewers. Video is a very complex medium because it contains not only visual images but also sound tracks. The analysis of video should look at both different visual components in the image, such as camera angles, frames, and how the “sound factor” is used, for example music and sound effects. These two sides are usually combined together as well. (Spottiswoode, 1950, pp. 44-53.) Thus data analysis requires a different strategy in researching video materials. Focus of the analysis is not only the structure and frames in the visual image, but also how the narratives are constructed by the combination of sequence of visual images and audio materials (Iedema, 2004, pp. 183-207).

There are several pros and cons in using videos as research materials in media and social studies. For pros, it is certain that video materials have brought a new opportunity for recording detailed and a “real-time” version of an event. It allows researchers to see the event “as it happens”. Moreover, videos can be played back and played in slow-motion. Digital videos are also easy to copy and share. They can even be zoomed in and out while playing. This allows more detailed and precise observation and analysis. Especially for interpersonal communication, it can show “non-verbal and visual aspects” in greater detail. (Health, Hindmarsh & Luff, 2010, pp. 5-9.)

Video also has its cons. Though it can record an event “as it happens”, it is still argued that it does not represent the reality as it is. What it can show to its viewers is only one or several aspects of the reality. Health, Hindmarsh and Luff (2010, p. 5) also emphasize in their article that video can only “capture a version” of the event that is happening. Views and opinions of film-makers on the event have a strong impact on which aspect of the real world is shown in the video. The directors are “at the command” of which segment of “visual world” and “sound world” are included by filming and editing the video work. (Spottiswoode, 1950, pp. 114-115.)

Journalists are often influenced and even tightly controlled by journalistic codes and work routines concerning which parts of the event and how the event can be shown to their audiences. “They only show as much as is considered artistically and logically necessary”, as Iedema (2004, p. 187) says.

For example, in TV journalism, powerful people or top rank managers are usually shown with a still camera angle and presented alone, while the so called common people are shown in groups or with a group of people in the background to present them as a part of “mass”. Iedema and Leeuwen (2004, pp. 193-200) call these journalistic codes and work routines “Editorial Rhythm”.

In recent years, video has also become one of the most popular mediums among user-generated content. As Anden-Papadopoulos (2013b) points out, the development of video camera and mobile phone technology in particular have allowed ordinary citizens to use videos to make a strong public testimony to social movements and disasters across the world. They are easy to carry and thus make it possible for its users to record what is happening around them. At the same time, internet and social media allows citizens to share their videos with others around the world. This figure is referred as citizen camera-witnessing by Anden-Papadopoulos (2013a, p. 2). She also distinguishes the difference between recording video on daily life and crisis events. Not like videos about daily life, videos about crisis events bring up a stronger sense of bearing witness that affect its viewers by connecting them to the “political notion of citizenship” while it involves moral and ethical judgement (Anden-Papadopoulos, 2013a, p. 4). It can generate a stronger sense of responsibility among its viewers to make them react to the video content. Thus, videos create a stronger sense of bearing witness because “bearing witness means take responsibilities” (Tait, 2011, p. 1221).

John Peters emphasizes two faces of witnessing: seeing and saying (in Reading, 2009, pp. 65-66; Tait, 2011, p. 1222). Seeing refers to video makers who see the event with their own eyes while being physically present in the event. Saying refers to viewers of the video contents who are “witnessing” the event from a distanced place. His point of emphasis is that people “seeing” the event and people who witness the event from others’ “saying” response to it differently. While witnessing an event from distance, viewers are only looking at it from a partially recorded video. They are not necessarily equipped with enough knowledge to respond to the event as strong as those who are physically present. Rentschler (2004, pp. 300-301) also argues, in order to respond, viewers need to have experience and knowledge of the event they witness. Hence it generates different levels of bearing witness between these two groups of witnesses.

Roger Silverstone further emphasizes that in order to call such visual contents like photos and videos as a media witnessing, it is important that these visual contents involve ethical bias, for example violence and suffering (in Reading, 2009, pp. 66-67). His argument is that taking risks and experiencing the suffering and pain can create a closer link between the witness to the moral and ethical practise, which makes the witness take more responsibility toward the event that they witnesses.

Then, to create the sense of bearing witness, it is inevitable for video content to contain and generate emotions. Pantti (2010, p. 170) argues that emotion is a powerful motivation for people to participate and to “inform political and

moral judgements”. While bearing witness requires the witness to involve in suffering, pain, and sometimes even death, it is likely it also involves strong emotions. As discussed in the previous subchapter, professional journalists tend to be neutral and create distance between reporting and its audience, they usually try to avoid represent the emotion in video content. Hence, user-generated content become stronger while making its viewers involved and creating the sense of witnessing since it is considered to be more emotional.

Thus the focus of this study is to examine how citizen journalists and professional journalists represent events differently in the case of reporting on 2011 Chinese bullet train accident survivor “Little Yiyi”. Professional journalists’ and citizen journalists’ differences in power and social class influences the way in which they cover different events, and, furthermore, citizen journalists are not tightly controlled by professional journalistic codes. The next chapter of this thesis will explain in detail the process of data collection for the case study and a discussion on semiotic analysis which is used as a research method.

### **3. Data and Methodology**

#### **3.1 Introduction**

This study is trying to find out the difference between the video coverage of citizen journalists and professional TV journalists. In order to find out these differences, I will compare the online coverage of 2011 Chinese bullet train accident in Wenzhou with citizen made online video coverage on Chinese video sharing website Youku and the professional TV coverage in Shanghai local morning news program “Eastern Eye”.

Research data in this study are six short video clips. Three of them are from Youku and the other three are from TV news program. All the data are accessed and downloaded through the internet (see subchapter 3.2. Data Collection for more information). The purpose of this research is to interpret the meaning contained in visual images in order to reflect on how people from different social power groups represent the same social event differently. It requires a deep inductive analysis on the data, which means I will start with a specific case study then generalize my findings into a broader conclusion.

A qualitative research method is designed in this research to help understand the data. Visual images are very strong in showing the social world “as it is”. It has the capability to show its audience a part of social event in great details. Diamond calls visual images as an “art of truth” (cited in Tagg, 1999, p. 255). But visual images are also reflecting the world with specific social and

personal values of their authors and their ethic judgment (Bourdieu, 1999, pp. 169-170). Therefore, user-generated videos in this study should be able to reflect the social values of citizen journalists and formulate a specific representation of the reality that is different from professional reporting. The hypothesis in this study is citizen journalists' specific social values lead to a difference style in reports from professional TV journalists.

Qualitative research methods are strong in “exploring the way people makes sense of their social worlds and how they express these understandings through language, sound, imagery, personal style and social rituals” (Deacon, Pickering, Golding & Murdock 2007, p. 2). Thus, this study applies qualitative research with semiotic analysis as the research method which aims to find out how different styles of journalism, both citizen and professional, are constructing and disseminating meanings through visual images.

Another very important reason for choosing qualitative research and more specifically semiotic analysis for this research is because of its flexible nature (Maxwell, 2005, pp. 2-12; Deacon, Pickering, Golding & Murdock, 2007, pp. 9-12). Gillian Rose (2007, p. 98) points out that signs “are not stable”, because one sign can have several meanings. Therefore, semiotic analysis emphasizes the flexibility of research in order to avoid misinterpretations of data and achieve higher credibility. There will be more detailed discussion on semiotic analysis itself later in the chapter.

In the following sections, I will first focus on the nature of the data and how it was collected. This section will give more detailed information on the reasons and procedure of data selection. The following section serves as a brief introduction to and discussion on semiotic analysis which is used as the research method. Then, the last section in this sub-chapter continues to explain and discuss about data coding. It is followed by a short discussion on validity.

### **3.2 Data collection**

This research offers a comparison of citizen video coverage and professional TV news coverage. Hence video data are collected separately on the differences of citizen-made videos and professional news videos. The total amount of data is 6 short video clips. The length of video clips varies, from 97 seconds to 230 seconds. Three of them are user-generated video reports and three are professional TV reports.

User-generated video clips are collected from one of the biggest Chinese online video sharing website Youku ([www.youku.com](http://www.youku.com)). These videos are downloaded with the website's own video downloading and uploading client program. Professional video clips are collected from the video archive of China Network Television ([www.cntv.cn](http://www.cntv.cn)), which is the official Chinese online television service founded by CCTV (China Central Television) in 2009. These videos are downloaded with online video downloading software FLVCD.



All user-generated video reports are video clips made by two non-professional journalists, username Xiliyan and Zhongguadedou. They also actively identify themselves in the internet as “Youku Shooters”. These are a group of active users who are frequently posting self-generated video clips on the website. They are also verified by the website itself as a special group. In youku.com there is a special video category for these videos in order for them to be distinguished from other postings by a special hashtag “shooter” (拍客) in the title of uploaded videos. Only verified video uploader – those “Youku shooters” – have the right to use this special hash tag in their video clips. Thus user-generated video data in this research are all chosen from this special video category. By searching with keywords “Little Yiyi” and “Wenzhou bullet train accident”, there are hundreds of videos which are posted long after the accident and which are merely a re-post of same video made earlier by other users. Therefore, using specific keyword “shooter” in data searching can help finding those video clips that are made by their original makers, since these users are a group of verified users who frequently post on self-made video contents.

All the professional TV news reports are video clips from the local TV news broadcasting in Dragon Television which is owned by Shanghai Media Group. All these TV news videos are chosen from the morning news program called Eastern Eye which is broadcasted between 7 am and 9 am in weekdays and from 7 am to 8 am on weekends. Two of the TV news videos are fully produced by professional journalists from Dragon Television. Among three video clips used in this research, there is one exception in the video titled

*Rescue of Little Yiyi* which contains a part which is made from raw video material produced by the accident rescue team on the site. Because there is clear post-editing evidence in the video clip, it is still taken as part of professional journalism video coverage due to the reason that the process of post-editing can still reflect on the professional journalistic agenda.

Videos from both citizen and professional coverage are collected by searching the key words “little Yiyi” (小伊伊) and “Wenzhou bullet train accident” (温州动车事故) in Chinese language in those two websites mentioned above. After a rough browse on video results received by these two keywords, additional keyword “shooter” (拍客) was used in the search on youku.com and additional keyword “Eastern Eye” (看东方) is used in China Network Television in order to find specific videos made by these two specific groups. The purpose of choosing professional TV news coverage from the same news program is to avoid variances caused by the different reporting habits and style by journalists from different media organizations.

In order to find as many available video clips as possible for this research, I also went through clips found by searching keywords “Little Yiyi” and “Wenzhou bullet train accident” which are not verified as Youku shooter made videos by the upload time between July 2011 and August 2011, which is the peak period when Wenzhou bullet train accident was reported on media. No specific videos among them are found which could help to form a new news topic in this research. Since these videos are posted two years ago, it is

possible that a part of posted videos by the normal users do not show in the search engine or have been taken off from the data archive already. I will also discuss this further in the data analysis section.

After the selection of data, three news topics (coded as topic 1 to 3) and six video clips were chosen for the analysis according to the principle that there is both one user-generated video (coded as video a) and one professional TV news video reports (coded as video b) on the same topic. (For detailed information on the video clips selected for the research, see Table 1.) The first news topic is the rescuing of Little Yiyi, the first report of which was on the 24<sup>th</sup> of July, 21 hours after the bullet train accident (Topic 1). The second news topic is the funeral of Yiyi's parents on the 4<sup>th</sup> of August (Topic 2). The third news topic is Yiyi's medical transfer from Wenzhou to Shanghai on the 22<sup>nd</sup> of August (Topic 3). User-generated videos are made by two users, Xiliyan and Zhongguadedou. Xiliyan is the author of video clips on Yiyi parents' funeral and Yiyi's medical transfer from Wenzhou to Shanghai. Zhongguadedou uploaded the video clip of Yiyi's rescue. Both of them are local residents in Wenzhou, the accident area, and were following and updating videos on the topic throughout July and August in 2011. During that time, Xiliyan uploaded 7 videos related to Little Yiyi and Zhongguadedou uploaded 5 videos related to bullet train accident. Professional videos are all selected from the news program of Eastern Eye in the video archive of cntv.cn.

Metadata of the video clips was also collected together with the videos. It includes information on the uploader of the video and date of uploading. This

data was saved together with each video in a text file. Due to the reason that there is no comment for videos on the video archive of cntv.cn, comments for user-generated videos were not collected. Metadata will be used in the analysis as brief social context information that helps in understanding and interpreting the data. It is often criticized that semiotic analysis concentrates heavily on its visual data (Deacon, 2007, p. 226; Berger, 1991, p. 31). Attention of the analysis has been on the visual image itself but aspects like the author of visual image and under what context the visual image is created is often ignored. It results in a lacks of connection with the social context and historical context of the data. (Berger, 2004, p. 31.) Thus in order to give a more valid interpretation of the data, this analysis will also try to build a connection between video content and its social context of the time these videos were created.

**Table 1: Details on selected video clips**

	User-generated video clips	Eastern Eye video clips
Topic No.	1A	1B
Title	[Shooter] 20 hours of survival, live video of the strongest little girl / [拍客]20小时求生存 实拍最坚强小女孩	Rescue of Little Yiyi /小伊伊的生命救援
Duration	02:51	03:30
Uploader	Zhongguadedou (种瓜的豆)	
Uploaded date	25/07/2011	29/07/2011
Source	www.youku.com	www.cntv.com
No.	2A	2B

Title	[Shooter] Thousands local citizen went for the funeral of Little Yiyi's parents in Wenzhou / [拍客]上千温州市民送别小伊伊父母现场	[Eastern Eye] Wenzhou: Little Yiyi couldn't attend parents' funeral because of further medical surgery / [看东方]温州：小伊伊再动手术 昨天未能参加父母葬礼
Duration	01:39	02:38
Uploader	Xiliyan (犀利眼)	
Uploaded date	04/08/2011	05/08/2011
Source	www.youku.com	www.cntv.com
No.	3A	3B
Title	[Shooter] Little Yiyi transfers to Shanghai for further medical treatment / 【拍客】小伊伊乘坐救护车转至上海进一步治疗	[Eastern Eye] News follow up: 23.7 bullet train accident survivor Little Yiyi arrive in Shanghai / [看东方]新闻追踪：7·23 动车事故伤员小伊伊抵达上海
Duration	01:37	01:35
Uploader	Xiliyan (犀利眼)	
Uploaded date	22/08/2011	23/08/2011
Source	www.youku.com	www.cntv.com

### 3.3 Semiotic analysis as a research method

The research method used in this research is semiotic analysis. Arthur Asa Berger argues that television is a very complicated medium because it “uses verbal language, visual images, and sound to generate impressions and ideas in people” (Berger, 2004, p. 173). To analyze online citizen video reports is similar to analyzing television programs. They are both constructed by a

complex combination of image, sound and verbal language. Therefore the focus of this study is not only on visual images, but also on language, sound effects and text in videos.

The study of semiology started with the work of Swiss linguist Ferdinand de Saussure. For Saussure, signs are a very basic way how any medium can function and carry meanings. In his definition, a sign can be understood as a combination of *signifier* and *signified*. *Signifier* refers to the sound-image of real world, and *signified* refers to the concept and meaning carried by the sound-image of real world. (Deacon, 2007, pp. 142 – 143; Berger, 1998, pp. 6-9.)

To explain this with an example, a white flower with yellow stamens or the word “daisy” is a signifier, which is an object that exists in the world. Then the idea or concept of a daisy in our mind is a signified. It doesn’t necessarily exist in the world, but it contains the way how we understand it. More importantly, there is a relation between signifier and signified. Sign contains both signifier and signified. Thus, when we see a sign, we could understand it by the relation between the “sound-image” (signifier) and the “concept” (signified) it connects to. (Berger, 1998, pp. 6-8.)

Saussure further explains how the meanings are understood by the relation between signified and signifier. This relation is named as binary opposition by later social science scholars. To Saussure, there is not just a relation between signifier and signified, but also oppositional relation between signs. He argued

that each sign has another sign that is connected to it with oppositional relation. For instance the word black and white carry different meanings and they are opposite to each other. Therefore we can understand them by their relation. Thus, Berger argues that signs and their relations are two key notions of semiotic analysis. (Berger, 1991, pp. 7-8.)

Saussure also emphasized that the relation between *signifier*, *signified* and sign is that they construct a meaning system and this system of meaning “does not inherit in things” but “is constructed, produced” (Hall, 1997, p. 24). There is not a “natural” correlation between a single *signifier* and a single *signified*. Instead their relation or the system of relations is defined by a common knowledge that is acquired through learning. By learning such common knowledge a person becomes a member of culture. For instance daisy nowadays does not only mean a kind of flower. It also connects to deeper cultural and social meanings of purity which are probably different from its usage decades ago. Hence people understand the meaning of a sign based on the system they learn from their culture. (Hall, 1997, pp. 21-24.)

The knowledge of the construction of relation between *signifier* and *signified* is the key to understand and interpret the meaning in visual images. Hence, Vannini emphasizes the importance of the relation between signifier and signified because the “interrelation of semiotic systems hold the codes or rules that govern the conventions of signification” (Vannini, 2007, p. 115). The primary interest of semiotic analysis is to understand how signs and the structure of the relations between signs make meanings.

Thus, reality presented by sign is mediated; it is an abstract meaning in people's mind which refers to the reality. Gillian Rose (2007, pp. 98-102) emphasizes that one sign can have different meanings, because in different cultures there exists different relations between signifier and signified. It means that the same signifier can be interpreted with different signified in different cultural context. It involves the differences in understanding the reality and different meaning of sign in different cultures. This, then leads to her argument on the importance of flexibility in semiotic analysis, because "different social group decoding signs differently" (Rose, 2007, p. 102).

Therefore, semiotic analysis is used as research method to interpret visual materials in this study. As Bell and Milic conclude, "[semiotic] analysis has the advantage of enabling a richer analysis of texts by focusing on the objective formal relationships, which to some degree account for differences in what, and how, image mean" (Bell & Milic, 2002, p. 203). Semiotic analysis is very useful in analysing videos because it can help find out the deeper meaning buried in visual and verbal images presented. By paying more attention to users of signs and to wider social context of how signs make meanings, the understanding and analysis of meanings can be more precise and accurate.

In semiotic analysis, authors of visual images also have influence on the meaning of signs. To explain this, later researcher on semiology, Roland Barthes developed two new terms in understanding signs: *denotation* and



*connotation*, also called by Barthes as the *two orders of signification*. Denotation is the first order of signification: “It describes the signifier and signified within the sign, and of the sign with its referent in external reality” (Fiske, 1990, p. 85). This is the obvious meaning of sign which can be easily understood by looking at it. Connotation, as the second order of signification is a bit more complex. It is the second level meaning of sign which involves the impact of emotions, feelings and values of culture. John Fiske (1990, p. 85) has used photography as an example to explain the difference of denotation and connotation. Denotation is what the mechanical production of object on film produced by camera, while connotation is the human selection of frame, angle and focus.

Therefore social semiotics emphasizes the social and historical context of visual image. American philosopher Charles Sanders Peirce notes the importance of social semiotics from structural semiotics in social study, which focuses on understanding “how people make, use and renegotiate semiotic rules” (Vannini, 2007, p. 115) rather than how purely sign and structures of semiotic rules make meaning. Pierce broke down the relation between signifier and signified into three levels: *icon, index, and symbol* (Rose, 2007, p. 83; Deacon, Pickering, Golding & Murdock, 2007, p. 143). *Icon* means that signifier has an apparent meaning connecting to signified. In this case, signifier physically resembles signified. For example a picture of a cat is an icon of a cat. *Index* means that the relation between signified correlates with signifier. For example, an exclamation mark correlates to the meaning of danger. Hall (1997, p. 18) also calls these two levels of relation which

signifier and signified are connected with an image or something exists in the world as iconic relation. Lastly, *symbol* means that there is an “arbitrary relation” between signifier and signified. In this relation, there is no correlation between a physical object and a meaning. Rather, it is connected to a written word or spoken language which are more abstract. Hall (1997, p. 18) defines it as indexical relation of signs.

Social semiotics thus also “tends ... to favour the study of culture, society...and other semiotic systems alongside verbal language” (Vannini 2007, p. 120). Videos are not only representing reality “as it is”, videos also contain contextual aspects such as a combination of specific cultural and social contexts. There are multiple semiotic systems in videos like image and sound. The use of signs and semiotics are also strongly influenced by the maker of videos. Therefore with its emphasis on contextual information, social semiotics could help gain a richer and more comprehensive understanding and analysis of videos that were chosen for this research.

Analysis on the meanings and relation of signs, also involve the power relation. Foucault (cited in Hall, 1997, pp. 48-51) argues that in the construction of common knowledge, the meanings of signs in the relation system are connected to the power structure of the society. The powerful have more influence to the construction and production of this system. Though later critics on Foucault disagreed with him on the degree of influence from the higher class in power structure, it is still argued that different classes in the power structure indeed have influence on the construction of meaning. Hence

Rose (2007, p. 5) explains, “Particular forms of representation produced by specific scopic regimes [e.g. film] are important to understand ... because they are intimately bounded into social power relation”.

In summary, semiotic analysis not only has the ability to interpret the meaning in visual imagery, it can also be used in order to make sense of the abstract signs used in video reports via other mediums, for example, in sound and language. Deacon argues (2007, p. 204) that in videos “language is often used to anchor the meaning of image”. Gillian Rose also points out that “semiology has an elaborated analytical vocabulary for describing how signs make senses and this is one of its major strength” (Rose, 2001, p .75).

Therefore semiotic analysis is used as the research method in the analysis of both citizen video reports and professional TV reports in this research. The focus of this research is on how they are differenced from each other, and how these differences are motivated by various social contexts.

### **3.4 Coding and analysis of data**

This section will explain how the analysis of data is designed and implemented. Following that I will also explain how and why the visual data is separated into single shots and then coded into written form.

Shots are unedited or uncut camera movements. It is also basic units in tele-film research. Each shot is constituted by a series of frame, or still images.

(Iedelma, 2004, pp. 188-191.) Because of the difference between still image and video material, there are slightly different methods used in analyzing different materials. For video material, syntagmatic analysis and paradigmatic analysis are mentioned as two approaches in analyzing the data. (Berger, 2004, pp. 16-23; Rose, 2007, p. 84.)

Syntagmatic analysis is focusing on the narrative of the video drama. It looks at how a chain of events are formed by interpreting the relation among a sequence of shots. In another word, it is to understand the narrative by looking at a series of shots. Its focus is on how “signs gain their meaning from the signs that surround them in a still image, or come before or after them in sequence in a moving image” (Rose, 2007, p. 84). This kind of analysis helps to uncover the manifested meaning from a video through as what Berger (2004, pp. 16-20) calls “what people do”. It reveals the meaning through how the manifested sequence of moving images is constructed by video makers.

Paradigmatic analysis, on the other hand, is focusing on “hidden pattern of oppositions in the signs” (Berger, 1998, p. 21). It means looking at detailed relations of signs. Meanings are carried in signs by the relation between *signifier* and *signified*. This method of analysis helps to uncover this relation of meaning hidden deep inside the sign. Berger explains paradigmatic analysis as “what people mean”, because it reveals the meaning carried by the sign itself in a still image. (Berger, 2004, pp. 21-23.)

In order to understand these two dimensions of analysis, Deacon (2007, p. 146) explains paradigmatic analysis as a “vertical set of elements” that exists in the still image which “one selects” to be analyzed; and syntagmatic analysis is a “horizontal chain in which elements are linked with each other according to agreed codes and conventions”. When applying it to the analysis of video materials, it means to have both a syntagmatic view from the narrative in the video and a paradigmatic view of the meaning carried by signs. For example, how the sequences of moving images are manifested in order to construct the story and how the oppositional relations are constructed are represented by the usage of camera angle, background sound effect and embedded texts.

The first step of data analysis is to code each video clip. First of all, each video clip is separated into single shots because shots are the basic units in video and in manifesting sequences and narratives. Each shot will be coded together with a serial number and its duration of time in the video clip. These single shots will be used as basic units in analysis. Each shot is separated from each other by coding, and they will be further coded in three different sections: visual, sound and text.

Coding of visual sections includes two subsections: camera and description. The subsection of camera includes both camera frame and angle. Camera frame includes panning, tilting and zooming. When camera is rotating horizontally it will be coded as panning. When camera is moving vertically it will be coded as tilting. Zooming is coded when camera is zooming in or out on one subject. Camera angle includes close-up shot, medium shot and long

shot. Close-up shot code is used when the subject in picture occupies most of the space. Medium shot is coded when the subject occupies approximately 50% of the space in picture. When the subject occupies less than 50% of the space in picture, it will be coded as long shot.

In the description part, the code serves as a more detailed description of the content of the visual image shown in the picture. For example what subject is shown in the image and what is the action of this subject. But there are some exceptions. Because there are several videos which contain photos from online sources, I will indicate them with bolded words and put the visual effect into description subsection as well in order to distinguish them from video images captured by video camera. Camera and description subsections will be put into two separate columns in coding sheet next to each other, but within the same section of camera.

The coding of sound is also divided into two subsections. They are titled as speech and background sound. All the speaking language that can be clearly heard and the subject of this speech are represented in the visual image is put into this category. This also includes non-diegetic narratives from journalists and interviewee. The focus of this research is how the narrative is constructed, therefore it is not strictly coded according to technical standards. But non-diegetic speech in this section will still be marked with a bold font in coding sheet. Background sound includes both non-speaking language and music used in videos. Speaking language by the crowd which subject of the language cannot be identified will also be put into this subsection. These two

subsections will also be put into two columns, same as camera and description subsections.

The last section in the coding sheet is text. This section includes all the news titles, interviewee information and written texts that are shown on the screen through post editing.

The coding of data has been repeated several times during this research in order to capture as much as possible the details in the video. It will also continue throughout the whole research process. As the research goes on there will very likely be new findings of coding elements which have been ignored earlier. These will be included in the analysis as well.

The data analysis is focusing on both technical factors and narrative in video clips. Through detailed analysis I intend to find out the differences on: *how citizen journalists and professional journalists use the camera and edit their video content differently; how citizen journalists and professional journalists represent expert and ordinary citizen differently; how citizen journalists and professional journalists access to information sources differently; and how citizen journalists and professional journalists narrate their story differently.* Discussion of findings will connect back to the theories and discussions of differences between citizen journalism and professional journalism in the literature review chapter.

Comparisons will not only be limited between user-generated videos and professional TV news that belongs to the same news topic. I will also compare user-generated videos and professional videos separately between different topics. By comparing the same type of videos across different topic, my aim is to see whether there are differences in covering different topics. By doing so, I am trying to avoid possible bias caused by differences on covering specific topics. For example, sensitive topics like report on Little Yiyi parents' funeral might be covered differently from others in both user-generated videos and professional videos.

### **3.5 Validity**

Government censorship is one of the major issues in this research. The Chinese government has already launched its internet censorship system at the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> century which is officially named the Great Chinese Firewall later in 2006. Also, under government principle mainstream media, especially television news, are not allowed to represent the government in a negative way. Due to the reason that Wenzhou bullet train accident was mentioned frequently together with the corruption case of Liu Zhijun, former Minister of Railways, who was removed from that position in February 2011, reporting on this accident which contains sensitive information towards top politicians was also censored. The regional government where the accident is was also attempted to conceal the true cause of this accident by burying the locomotive. This scandal made this accident an even more sensitive news topic with a lot of critics toward the government and Chinese Communist Party.



Therefore, such bias on data collection is taken into consideration during the collection and selection of data. Certain types of citizen generated video content that have sensitive elements might not be able to find its way in the data of this research, such as, showing the outrage towards the government's attempts to conceal the cause of this accident by burying the locomotive and down play the corruption case of the Minister of Railway. Such limitation to the data and this study is made aware in the research.

Furthermore, since my research started in 2013 and the actual data collection date is in November 2013, it is possible that part of videos were already removed from the online database of Youku.com or not shown in the search engine, especially those videos might contain sensitive contents or users who have uploaded sensitive video contents during last two years. Because it is possible these users' profiles are banned and all their videos are deleted from the website due to online censorship.

Professional news clips are all from the same local morning news program in Shanghai (Eastern Eye). I choose this specific news program because it is made by the provincial media organization Dragon TV which is considered as quality journalism in China. At the same time, it may also bring difference on the data since morning is not usually a peak time of TV news viewership. Therefore the range and focus of topics covered in morning news could be different from evening news program.

The coding and analyzing process was carried out over a long period of time, thus I saved a copy of videos to my local hard disk to ensure the accessibility to manage the data, since links and videos can go missing or crash due to various web connection problems. Therefore it is necessary to keep several copies of research data.

#### **4. Analysis: Differences between citizen journalists and professional journalists in video reporting**

This chapter discusses the differences in videos reports on the last survivor Little Yiyi in 2011 Wenzhou bullet train accident in China made by citizen journalists and professional journalists. Differences are divided into four major aspects: how they use the camera and edit videos differently; how they represent experts and ordinary citizens as information sources differently; how they access information sources differently; and how they narrate the story differently.

This case study shows that citizen journalists in China lack skills in shooting camera footage and editing their stories. Videos made by citizen journalists are more sensational and subjective compared to professional TV news videos. Additionally, citizen journalists tend to narrate news story as their personal experience, and they lack skills in narrating the story through editing as well. On the other side, citizen journalists are able to bring up images and narratives that are closer to the ordinary people. They position themselves inside the scene and among other witnesses. They are able to show the event from a different perspective that is closer to other people. Their ability to represent the public is still very limited when compared to professional journalists, due to a limited access to information and sources.

In the following subchapters I will discuss these differences in detail in four main topics. In the “Frequency of cuts and the technique in camera usage”

section I will discuss the skill of video recording and post-editing. “Representation of the experts and the ordinary citizen” section will focus on how different information sources are represented in videos. Then I will discuss the difference in access and indication of information sources in user-generated videos and TV news videos. The last section will focus on how citizen journalists and professional journalists narrate their story differently.

#### *4.1 Frequency of cut and the technique in camera usage*

The first difference in user-generated and professional video reporting is the technical use of the cut in editing. It is shown very strongly that professional journalists have more advantages in the use of technology in reporting. In professional video reports, every shot is cut and arranged neatly in order to make the images closely related to the content of narration and the news topic. Every shot is split between 3 to 5 seconds. Exceptions are only when there is an interviewee or anchorman talking. Citizen journalists, on the other hand, use much longer shots. Video from citizen journalists Zhongguadedou (author of video 1a) contains shots that are mostly longer than 15 seconds. Citizen journalist Xiliyan (author of video 2a and 3a) is using more frequent cuts, but most of the shots he uses are still more than 10 seconds.

While using longer shots, videos made by citizen journalists use camera panning or zooming very frequently (11 out of 18 shots). Professional journalists only used it in 6 shots. When using panning and zooming, the picture shows a lot of things that are happening around. But it also losses

focus and detail on the subject in the picture. For example, in user-generated video about Yiyi being transferred to Shanghai (Video 3b), Yiyi is always shown surrounded by other people with panning shot. Audiences cannot see much detail about Yiyi's medical condition through the picture. But in TV news video (video 3a), she is usually shown in the picture while using a still shot, which provides much more detail and information on her physical condition. Anden-Papadopoulos (2013b, p. 345) defines a large amount of camera movement in user-generated contents as camera "hyper-mobility". Because citizen journalists in this study like to show the surroundings through camera panning, it gives viewer strong feelings of looking from someone's viewpoint. The camera is moving in a similar way as how the human eyes functions. For example, in the video about Yiyi parents' funeral, the camera goes all around the scene to show how the funeral hall is filled with people (video 2a, shot 6). Bock (2012, p. 647-648) points out that user-generated videos tend to reveal the creator of the video. Long shots and panning give the video a strong subjective experience since viewers can clearly feel looking through someone's eye.

Other than differences in editing, this study also shows citizen journalists lack of technical skills in using the camera. The first example is adjusting camera settings according to different lighting environments. There are several wrong camera light settings in user-generated videos, especially when it is inside a dark room. For example, in the video about Little Yiyi's rescue, it is shot at night inside hospital (video 1a). The wrong camera setting makes the visual

image very unnatural and makes the picture lose sharpness. It decreases the quality of video greatly.

The other example is editing on sound. Sound in professional TV news videos are edited carefully. The voice of the narrator and interviewee are edited so that there is no other sound interfering with them. Noises from other subjects are usually toned down so the audiences are not distracted by them. In contrast, user-generated videos have limited editing of sound. Therefore all the sound from raw video recording is shown to the audience chaotically. It gives audiences a feeling of witnessing the event because they can hear about everything that is going on from the video. But on the other hand, this can also cause distraction and even cause difficulty for the audiences to get the information from video content. For example, when the uncle of Yiyi is being interviewed, the noise of people talking and walking is so loud that what he is saying cannot be heard (video 1a, shot 10).

The lack of skill in using camera and post-editing has decreased the quality of user-generated videos. Because of using a lot of long shots and camera movements, user-generated videos also show more subjective viewpoints in the content. The news story becomes a form of video maker's own experience of the event. These are two important reasons why user-generated contents are rejected by professional media. Professional journalists regard the quality of videos as one of the most important standards for qualifying a news story. Research on professional journalists' opinions towards user-generated contents also shows subjective representation is an important reason why

professional journalists do not approve of user-generated content. (Örenbring, 2013; Rosen, 1999, pp. 32-33; Kaufhold, Lasorsa & Lewis, 2010, pp. 164-167.)

Though it is not approved by professional journalists and editors, such subjective representation and low quality gives its audience a strong sense of being close to the community (Anden-Papadopoulos, 2013b, pp. 348-350; Anden-Papadopoulos & Pantti, 2013, pp. 966-967). With long shots, citizen journalists often show the image of whole environment around them. Unlike professional journalists who intentionally create distance between their audience and subject in news story by editing, citizen journalists position themselves as one of the witnesses in the community. Such positions can create a closer link between the video and its viewers. Anden-Papadopoulos also points out that (2013a, p. 9) audiences think user-generated videos make them feel more real and can give them stronger sense of witnessing the event and being physically present there.

#### *4.2 Representation of the experts and the crowd*

Representation of the experts and crowd differs a lot because of the different frequency of using cuts. Professional journalists are very precise about what they show to their audiences. Therefore those experts and their opinions are shown very strongly. They are always positioned alone in the middle of the frame with a medium shot focusing on their face. There is either nobody interfering in the same image, or they are positioned far behind this expert as a background. Even with interviewees that are normal citizens, they are

distanced from other “crowds” in order to put the interviewee forward. For example, when interviewing Yiyi mother’s colleague and student in the funeral (video 2b, shots 10, 11), they are also positioned in the middle of frame and other people walking in the corridor are in the back together with other crowds, mostly also with their backs facing to the camera.

Though there is only one user-generated video (Little Yiyi transfer to Shanghai, video 3a) which contains interviews, the expert or interviewee is normally shown together with other people. In such way, the interviewee is shown less different and distanced from other ordinary citizens in the picture than in TV news videos. For example, when showing the interview with the Director from Wenzhou 118 hospital, the doctor is shown in the camera together with journalists surrounding him asking questions (shot 7). And when showing Yiyi’s uncle answering questions from the journalists (shot 10), he is positioned on the right side of the camera, together with a group of journalists and their microphones.

Professional journalists in this case represent the experts as much more important information sources than other normal citizens. Among the 9 interviewees represented in TV news clips there are only two ordinary citizens, it is also that professional journalists tend to be much focused on the subject and topic mentioned in the news so they try to filter out all the irrelevant or less valuable information. As argued by McNair (2006, p. 126) and Heckett (2005, pp. 86-87), professional journalists prefer to take elite and experts as their information sources because they give more valuable information. In this



study, when the topics are related to Yiyi's medical situation and health condition, all the interviewees are people in positions of power in hospital or government. None of the nurses who are taking care of Yiyi's or her relatives were interviewed. Only in the news about Yiyi parents' funeral, two interviewees are ordinary citizens. It shows that professional journalists in this study regard experts as better information sources. When experts and government officials are available, they are usually preferred as information sources. Journalists only take ordinary citizen as information sources when the topic does not involve experts.

Citizen journalists, on the other hand, represent more ordinary citizens in their videos. They like to place themselves among the environment and people. Therefore they show the reaction or action of those who are around them. In this study, there are several shots from user-generated videos that contain images of women weeping. This happens, for example, in Yiyi's parents' funeral video (video 2a, shot 7) and in the video after Little Yiyi is moved into elevator while transferred from Wenzhou 118 Hospital to Second Affiliated Hospital (video 3a, shot 13). But at the same time, citizen journalists are not able to represent the opinion of other citizens. Because there is no verbal comment in all three user-generated videos, none of the videos contain interviews conducted by citizen journalists. Ordinary citizens in user-generated videos are shown rather as "faceless crowd". There is no interaction between the journalist and other citizens. Also, what are shown in these videos are pure emotions such as people weeping and walking. Comparison on what kind of online sources are used in user-generated and news videos also shows

that professional journalists are still having better selection in representing the opinions of ordinary citizens. Online materials used by citizen journalists are mainly pictures. But materials selected by professional journalists contain multiple screenshots from the comments posted by ordinary citizens online about Little Yiyi. It shows clearly in this case that professional journalists are more aware of the value of the opinion from the public.

However, it should be mentioned that there are two other video clips found later by the same author of the video on Little Yiyi's rescue (Zhongguadedou) that contain interviews with ordinary citizens related to the train accident. One is a man living near the crash site and claiming he saved 10 people on the night of the train accident, and another one is a woman who lost her daughter in the accident. Though the content of these two videos are not analyzed yet, it is not totally accurate to say that citizen journalists are not aware of using ordinary citizens as information sources only based on the finding from this case study. Two videos that show citizen journalists in China are still aware of the value of ordinary citizens as information sources. They still have potential to represent the opinions of ordinary citizens that are usually ignored by professional journalists.

This study shows that, in general, professional journalists are still representing ordinary citizens better than citizen journalists. Though they are treating experts as more important information sources, they are still aware of the value of the opinions from ordinary people. Though citizen journalists represent more ordinary citizen in their videos, they fail to bring up the

opinions from the community. What they have shown in videos are only their emotions. An important condition to create democratic society is for media to represent the opinions of the public and to bring these opinions into public decision-making (Habermas, 1974; Keane, 1991). With only emotions from the public, user-generated contents will not be able to form a public discussion that can represent public opinions.

#### *4.3 Access and crediting to information*

The case study shows that in general, professional journalists have more access to a wide range of information than citizen journalists. In TV news reports, there are many people acting as information sources, including doctors, citizens, and people from the rescue team. Citizen journalists in this case use people less as information sources. None of the user-generated video actually contains interviews that are done by the citizen journalists themselves. It is also difficult for them to get an interview. Interviews represented in user-generated videos are all shot from a far distance from the interviewee while other professional journalists are occupying the front space and asking questions.

Another finding about the access to information is the use of online material. All of the three user-generated videos use images and photos which are from the internet. These materials are used either as an intro to the news story or as an item that raises emotional response from its audiences. On the other hand, professional journalists use online materials with much more caution. They

usually use it when there are no other accessible raw materials or materials that can be regarded as having the same level of value as user-generated videos. (Kaufhold, Larsora, & Lewis, 2010; Anden-Papadopoulos & Pantti, 2013.) For example, in the latter half of video on Little Yiyi's rescue (video 1a), material used is a music video posted by other people on the internet which journalists may not have time and resource to make by themselves.

It should also be noticed that citizen journalists in this case study do not credit their sources as accurately and clearly as professional journalists. Interviewees in user-generated videos are credited but typically in an unclear way. For example, the doctor talking in video 1a (shot 7) is only credited with family name and a title as "Director of Wenzhou 118 Hospital". In shot 8 (video 1a), even with the text on the screen that says "Yiyi's grandmother waiting anxiously outside hospital room", there still can be heard clearly that two men outside the camera talking they don't know if the woman sitting in the chair is Yiyi's grandmother. Meanwhile, professional journalists are crediting their information sources clearly in videos with name and titles in a fixed format. Lack of crediting of information sources also makes audience of user generated videos have less trust on the information provided in it. It is also a major reason for editors to refuse using user-generated content in their news story. (Anden-Papadopoulos & Pantti, 2013, p. 9; Allan, 2005, p. 72; Örenbring, 2013.)

Finally, music is used heavily by citizen journalists to raise emotions and interpretation the emotion in visual image. In user-generated videos, slow and

heavy music is used to increase the emotion of sadness when talking about Yiyi parents' death and the train accident. This is shown extremely strong in the video about Yiyi parents' funeral (video 2b) in which music from both raw video recording and post-editing are used throughout the whole video. But it is not usually used by professional journalists. The only exception for TV news videos to use music is when journalists are using a music video posted on the internet by internet users. It is in the TV news video on rescue of Yiyi (video 1b, shot 14–28). The music contained in this video is from the same music video journalists borrowed from web source.

As several other studies on Chinese citizen journalism show, citizen journalists in China lack of access to information sources (Xin, 2010; Nip, 2009; Wang, 2011). A lot of materials used by citizen journalists in this case are pictures of Yiyi and her parents from the internet. Even when there are interviews, citizen journalists are just recording it from distance when professional journalists are asking questions. Nip (2009, p. 99) also points out, it is difficult for citizen journalists to get access to official information in China because usually government officials are not willing to talk to citizen journalists. Additionally, Sparks (2009, p. 345) points out that internet has also become an important information source for professional journalists to conduct investigative reports. Under such circumstances, it would make it even more difficult for citizen journalists to compete with professional journalists in terms of their accessibility to information.

#### *4.4 Subjective-ness in narrative and video witnessing*

Narratives in user-generated videos and TV news videos are very different. First, professional journalists and citizen journalists are narrating the story in totally different ways. In TV news reports, narration is always made through speech. It has fixed forms. At the beginning there is anchorman talking who gives the audience some background information of the news topic. Then in the news story there is always a narrator speaking, giving information related to the actual content of the news and connecting the comment of interviewees with the whole story.

User-generated reports in this study do not contain speech by the maker of the video, which is very different from Bock's (2012, pp. 646-648) observation on British citizen video reporters who are more willing to comment on the story and also reveal themselves to their audiences. The only exception from this study is in the video of Yiyi's rescue (video 1a, shot 7) which shows a middle aged woman sitting on a chair and there are two men talking outside the camera asking if that woman is Yiyi's grandmother. There is no information that indicates who is talking but it appears to me that one of these two men would be citizen journalists. In these user-generated videos, citizen journalists mostly use texts for the narration. At the beginning of these videos, texts with information about the topic and content of the video are usually used in the purpose of help the audience understand the content of visual images. After that, narration is largely done by the visual image itself, for example showing the audiences the location and surrounding where the video is taken. By contrast, professional TV news narrative is made strictly in an "objective" way.

Camera is mostly still and rarely having any movement except few times of zooming in or panning. It makes audience less aware of the position where the cameraman is. All the narration is done through neutral sounding verbal language from third personal tone together with visual images that are closely related to it. Therefore narration in TV news reports are easier to follow and more smooth than in user-generated videos.

As noted, John Peters argues there are two faces of witnessing. One is people who witness the event while being physically present; one is people who “witness” it from a distance through videos and images. For those who witness from distance, they can only respond to it and generate the sense of witnessing if they have sufficient knowledge about the event. (See Reading, 2009, pp. 65-66; Tait, 2011, pp. 1221-1222.) Thus, narration of story is important in making audience understand the story and enable them to generate the sense of witnessing. As Rentschler (2004, pp. 300-301) argues, storytelling helps audiences to understand, pictures don’t. It is also argued, that in order to make ordinary citizens participate in public discussion, they need necessary knowledge about public decision-making (Keane, 1991, p. 168). Anden-Papadopoulos and Pantti (2013, pp. 966-967) also point out that a lack of storytelling skills in citizen videos are making it difficult for audiences to understand and react to it. Thus, it is difficult for audiences of user-generated content to respond to it when the narration confuses its audiences sometime. In such circumstances, it is difficult for the audiences to be able to participate in public discussion because of a lack of knowledge about the event.

User-generated videos are also more subjective in their narration. The authors tend to tell the story from a personal viewpoint. Bock (2011, p. 646) has concluded three major ways how citizen journalists are telling the story from a subjective view. The first is that citizen journalists tend to use subjective language expressions. Since citizen journalists in this case do not use speech to narrate in their video, it is hard to directly compare this to her findings. However, in this study, most of the texts used in narration by citizen journalists are still in an objective tone (example: video 1 a, shot 1 and 15). There is only one exception. In the video on Yiyi parents' funeral, the texts used in narration are very subjective and sensational as well (video 2 a, shot 2). It is formed as a conversation between the author of the video and Yiyi's parents. In the text he even calls Yiyi's father "Brother" directly.

Other findings on subjective narration by Bock (2011, pp. 646-649) are that authors of user-generated videos are more likely to be known by the audience through making the video from a personal view as a personal experience and showing the maker of video to its audience through the picture. These two elements can both be found in this study. Citizen journalists like to position themselves in the scene. Though they are never directly shown in the image, the feeling that one person is making this video is still very strong through the movement and shakiness of camera. The story is also shown from a personal viewpoint since citizen journalists place themselves as one of the witnesses. Citizen journalists are narrating their story in a subjective way also by representing their own opinions on sensitive topics which are not mentioned in



TV news reports due to censorship in China. For instance, in the video about Yiyi parents' funeral, the citizen journalist is expressing his own anger towards the corruption scandal in the Ministry of Railway saying that Yiyi's parents who died in the accident are "going to the heaven without the bullet trains that are made in China" (accusing that it is bullet train made in China that killed them). The reason for such anger is the corruption case of Liu Zhijun, the former Minister of Railway, who was being accused by public online as having direct connection to the cause of 2011 Wenzhou bullet train accident. Liu was removed from his position in February 2011 and sentenced to death in 2013.

While being more subjective, more emotions are shown in user-generated videos. There are many examples of using emotional music and language by citizen journalists (video 1a, 2a). Not only the emotion of video makers, also emotion of the public is shown stronger than in TV news videos, such as weeping women and expression of hatred toward government corruption. Though emotions are also shown in TV news videos, they are represented in a more neutral way. In TV news about Yiyi parents' funeral where journalists use an online music video, emotions from the public are shown through online comments by internet users in written form. It is not as strong as in user-generated videos which show directly both the visual image and sound of a weeping woman.

It is argued, that emotional news reporting is becoming a problem for traditional media under market pressure and competition (Hackett, 2006, pp.

86-88; McNair, 2006, p. 11). Media scholars worry that emotional news stories would mislead the public and fail to represent public opinions fairly. But in contrast, some editors think it is important for the news to produce emotions, because emotion is a “powerful motivation” that makes the audience participates in public discussion (Pantti, 2010, pp. 170-171). Compared to this case study, it might be true for professional journalism, because media content can help audience understand the event they witness through narration. But it is doubtful if user-generated content could achieve the same goal since lack of good narration in citizen videos confuse its readers rather than provide knowledge needed to participate in public discussion.

## 5. Conclusion and Discussion

This case study focuses on the differences between Chinese online citizen video reports and professional TV news reports on 2011 Wenzhou bullet train accident survivor Little Yiyi. Analysis on six video data has shown similar characteristics between citizen journalism and mainstream journalism as covered in the theoretical discussion. Compared to mainstream journalism, citizen journalists are representing news events in a very different ways. Citizen journalists are able to get closer to the community and represent their story from the viewpoint of members in the community. In general, citizen journalists lack access to multiple information sources. Though there is larger number of common citizens represented in these three user-generated videos than in professional news videos, they are still represented as “faceless crowd”. It is not directly shown in this case study, but citizen journalists in China still have the possibility to contribute to an alternative perspective by representing citizens with lower social status (Kaufhold, Lasorsa & Lewis, 2010, pp. 164-167; Rodrigez, 2011, p. 251). Citizen videos have been found outside this study containing interviews with ordinary citizens related to this accident. Whether these videos are able to represent the opinions of the public or it is just a description of the accident is unclear. But it certainly shows that citizen journalists in China are looking for alternative information sources more than experts and government officials.

At the same time, the problems of citizen journalism are also revealed clearly in this study. The lack of knowledge in using cameras and editing software is

one of the main limits to the quality of citizen journalism in China. It leads to many other problems of citizen journalism such as subjective-ness in narration and credibility of user-generated contents. Citizen videos are narrated with more subjective viewpoint, usually as one of the witnesses. Also, narration in citizen videos is very poor compared to professional news reports. There is also more emotion and sensationalism in user-generated contents that is trying to link its audience to the story, such as using a lot of emotional music, showing emotions both from the video maker and the public. Without the skill in narration to help audiences understand the event, it would be difficult for ordinary citizens to generate the sense of witnessing and participating in public decision-making. (Reading, 2009, pp. 65-66; Tait, 2011, pp. 1221-1222.)

Lack of access to information, low accuracy and credibility of contents are also a problem for citizen journalists in this study. There are several cases where unclear information and even faulty information are used in citizen videos. These problems can influence greatly the quality of user-generated contents and whether citizen journalists are trusted by their audiences.

On the other hand, though professional journalists are having many problems such as treating experts as more credible sources and failing to represent the public under market competitions (McNair, 2006; Allan, 2004), in this study they are still able to include more variable sources in their story. Therefore, it is doubtful if citizen journalism in China can really compete with professional journalists and contribute to the pluralistic viewpoints of news, especially

under the environment of current Chinese media systems where professional journalists have more advantages such as access to government officials for information, budgets provided by big media organizations and more time to spend on reporting (Sparks, 2009, pp. 339-340). Therefore, Nip (2009, p. 100) comments that the value of Chinese citizen journalism is “the greatest when and where the professional media fail”.

But at the same time, I think Chinese citizen journalism certainly has its space to develop. First of all, citizen video journalism is still in its early phase in China. With the wide dissemination of smartphones and video cameras in China, ordinary citizens will be able to gain more knowledge about how to make videos and how to edit it. Also, it is argued that if professional journalists can offer technical training to citizen journalists, it would help in improving the quality of citizen journalists (Young, 2009, pp. 147-149). Though it is possible that through training from professional journalists, citizen journalists could also be influenced by professional journalistic standards (McNair, 2006), it is still a possible solution for problems of citizen journalism.

Second, with tight government censorship on big media organizations in China, there are certain news topics they are not willing to touch in order to avoid government penalties (Sparks, 2009). This leaves more opportunity for individual citizens to fill in this space left by big media organizations in the market. Lastly, the development of the Internet has provided citizen journalists a platform to communicate and publish their own contents. Though

government censorship has limited the citizen's ability to publish freely, the internet will still be the best environment for the development of citizen journalism.

It should be underlined that this study has its limitations. First of all the data is limited. Based on only three videos from user-generated and professional sources, it is very difficult to generalize the finding of this study into a broader view of the development of citizen journalism in China. As has already been noted, there are two other videos by the same author in this research containing interviews with ordinary citizens, even if such cases were not found in this study. Therefore it would require one or even several studies with a wider range and larger amount of video materials in order to give a more general and scientific conclusion about the level of pluralistic opinions represented in user-generated news contents. On the other hand, the case used in this study is from three years ago. With the fast development in technology, the way citizen journalists use internet and camera would also be changing all the time.

Secondly, there is some problem in the selection of research methods. The strength of the research method, semiotic analysis, is not shown very clearly in analysis and discussion of findings. It is certain that semiotic analysis can provide a deep interpretation on visual materials, but since discussion in my study has been focused on how citizen journalists use visual materials rather than visual image itself, it is not shown clearly how this research has benefited from semiotic analysis. With limited time, it is difficult for me to carry out the

research with another research method. This makes me wonder how the results of this study would differ if a better research method is used, such as qualitative content analysis.

Therefore, for further research on this topic I would suggest to make a study on more recent cases. With differences between cases during different time, it would be helpful to see how the development of citizen journalism in China is influenced by the development of technology. It is also worthwhile to make a case study with a different research method, such as content analysis to find out whether there are differences in results led by a different research method. In this research, I am looking at several different aspects of the nature of citizen journalism on comparison to professional journalists. It is difficult to dig deeper with limited space for a master thesis. Therefore, further research which focuses on specific topic in this paper would be also able to reveal other interesting aspects of citizen journalism. For example, a study focusing on how opinions from ordinary citizens and experts are represented differently in user-generated videos and professional news videos.

Pantti (2010) and Anden-Papadopoulos' (2013) studies show that professional media is showing more and more interest in using user-generated content in news reporting. In this study, citizen journalism has also shown its ability to provide information from an angle that is different from professional journalism. Therefore, understanding the nature of user-generated contents can benefit professional media organizations. It is important for audiences to understand user-generated contents in order to react to it; meanwhile, it is also

important for professional journalists to understand user-generated content in order to benefit from different viewpoints from citizen journalists.



## Bibliography

Ahva, Laura. (2010). *Making news with citizens: public journalism and professional reflexivity in Finnish newspapers*. Tampere University Press, Tampere. Acta Electronica Universitatis Tamperensis, no. 1020.

Allan, Stuart. (2005). "News on the Web: The Emerging Forms and Practices of Online Journalism". In: Allan Stuart (ed.) *Journalism: Critical Issues*. Maidenhead: Open University Press, pp 67-83.

Allan, Stuart. (2004). *News Culture*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Baptiste, I. (2001). Qualitative data analysis: Common phases, strategic differences. *Forum: Qualitative social research*, 2(3).

Bell, P & Milic, M. (2002). 'Goffman's Gender Advertisements revisited: combining content analysis with semiotic analysis', *Visual Communication* 2002 1:203.

Benson, Rodney. (2013). *Shaping Immigration News: A French-American Comparison*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Berger, Arthur Asa. (2004). Semiotic analysis. *Media Analysis Techniques*, third edition, London: Sage, pp. 3-40.

Bock, Mary Angeka. (2012). Citizen video journalists and authority in narrative: Reviving the role of the witness. *Journalsim*, 13(5), pp 639-653.

Bourdieu, Pierre. (1999). The social definition of Photograph. In Stuart Hall & Jessica Evans (ed.) *Visual Culture: the reader*. London: Sage, pp. 162-180.

Castells, Manuel. (2011). *Communication Power*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Carpentier, Nico. (2011). *Media and Participation: A Site of Ideological-democratic Struggle*. Intellect: The University of Chicago Press.

Couldry, Nick. (2010). New online news sources and writer-gatherers. In Fenton Natalie (ed.) *New media, old news: Journalism and democracy in the digital age*. Sage: London, pp. 138-152.

Curran, James & Witchge, Tamara. (2010). Liberal dreams of the internet. In Fenton Natalie (ed.) *New media, old news: Journalism and democracy in the digital age*. Sage: London, pp. 102-118.

Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. & Murdock, G. (2007). Approaching research. In *Researching Communications: A Practical Guide to Methods in Media and Cultural Analysis*. London: Arnold, pp. 1-13.

Fenton, Natalie. (2010). Drowning or Waving? New media, journalism and democracy. In Fenton Natalie (ed.) *New media, old news: Journalism and democracy in the digital age*. Sage: London, pp. 3-16.

Fiske, J. (1990). *Introduction to Communication Studies*, London: Routledge.

Freedman, Des. (2010). The political economy of the “new” news environment. In Fenton Natalie (ed.) *New media, old news: Journalism and democracy in the digital age*. Sage: London, pp. 35-50.

Gillmor, Dan. (2006). *We the media, Grassroots journalism by the people, for the people*. O'Reilly Media.

Habermas, Jürgen. (1974). ‘The public sphere: an encyclopedia article (1964)’, *New German Critique*, 1(3), pp. 49-55.

- Hackett, Robert A. (2005). Is there a democratic deficit in US and UK journalism? In: Allan Stuart (ed.) *Journalism: Critical Issues*. Maidenhead: Open University Press, pp. 85-97.
- Hall, Stuart. (1997). "The work of Representation". In Stuart Hall (ed.) *Representation: cultural representations and signifying practices*. The Open University, Walton Hall.
- Health, C, Hindmarsh, J, Luff, P. (2010). *Video in Qualitative Research*. [Electronic version] Sage, London.
- Iedema, Rick. (2004). Analysing Film and Television: a social semiotic account of Hospital: An Unhealthy Business. In Leeuwen, T & Jewitt, C (ed.) *Handbook of Visual Analysis*. Sage; London, pp. 183-207.
- Kaufhold, Kelly & Lasorsa, Dominic L & Lewis, Seth C. (2010). Thinking about citizen journalism: the philosophical and practical challenges of user-generated content for community newspapers. *Journalism Practice*, Vol. 4, No. 2, pp. 163-179.
- Keane, John. (1991). *The Media and Democracy*. Policy Press, Basil Blackwell.
- Lewis, Justin and Wahl-Jorgen, Karin. (2005). Active citizen or couch potato? Journalism and Public Opinion. In: Allan Stuart (ed.) *Journalism: Critical Issues*. Maidenhead: Open University Press, pp. 98-108.
- McNair, Brian. (2005). The emerging chaos of global news culture. In: Allan Stuart (ed.) *Journalism: Critical Issues*. Maidenhead: Open University Press, pp. 151-166.

McNair, Brian. (2006). *Cultural Chaos: Journalism and Power in a Globalized World*. Routledge: New York.

Myra Marx Ferree, William Anthony Gamson, Jürgen Gerhards, and Dieter Rucht. (2002). "Normative Criteria for the Public Sphere." In *Shaping Abortion Discourse: Democracy and the Public Sphere in Germany and the United States*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Maxwell, J. A. (2005). A model for qualitative research design. In *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Michael Schudson. (2005). "Four Approaches to the Sociology of News." In J. Curran and M. Gurevitch, eds., *Mass Media and Society*, 4<sup>th</sup> edition. London: Arnold.

Nip, Joyce Y.M. (2005). Changing connections: the News Media, the Government and the People in China's SARS epidemic. In: Romero, Angela and Bromley, Michael (ed.) *Media and Democracy in Asia*, Routledge: New York, pp. 28-40.

Nip, Joyce Y. M. (2006). Exploring the second phase of public journalism. *Journalism Studies*, Vol. 7, No. 2, pp. 212-236.

Nip, Joyce Y.M. (2009). Citizen journalism in China: the case of the Wenchuan earthquake. In Stuart, Allan & Einar Thorsen (ed.) *Citizen Journalism, Global Perspective*, Peter Lang Publishing, Inc, New York, pp. 95-106.

Pan, Zhongdang. (2005). Media Change through bounded innovations: Journalism in China's media reform. In: Romero, Angela and Bromley,

- Michael (ed.) *Media and Democracy in Asia*, Routledge: New York, pp. 96-107.
- Pantti, Mervi. (2010). The value of emotion: An examination of television journalists' notions on emotionality. *European Journal of Communication*, Vol. 25(2), pp. 168-181.
- Papadopoulos, Anden. (2013a). Citizen camera-witnessing: Embodied political dissent in the age of “meditated mass self-communication”. *New Media Society*, Vol. 0(0), pp. 1-17.
- Papadopoulos, Anden. (2013b). Media witnessing and the 'crowd-sourced video revolution'. *Visual Communication*, Vol. 12(3), pp. 341-357.
- Papadopoulos, Anden & Pantti, Mervi. (2013). Re-imaging crisis reporting: Professional ideology of journalism and citizen eyewitness images. *Journalism*, Vol. 14(7), pp. 960-977.
- Mirry, J. (2000). *Semiotics and the Analysis of Film*. The Athlone Press.
- Phillips, Angela. (2010). Old sources, new bottles. In Fenton Natalie (ed.) *New media, old news: Journalism and democracy in the digital age*. Sage: London, pp. 87-107.
- Rentschler, R Carrie. (2004). Witnessing: US citizenship and the vicarious experience of suffering. *Media Culture and Society*, Vol. 26(2), pp. 296-304.
- Rodriguez, Clemencia. (2011). *Citizen Media against Armed Conflict: disrupting violence in Colombia*. University of Minnesota Press.
- Rose, Gillian. (2001), Semiology: laying bare the prejudices beneath the smooth surface of the beautiful. *Visual Methodologies: An Introduction to the Interpretation of Visual Materials*. London: Sage, pp. 74-109.

- Rosen, Jay. (1999). *What are journalists for?* New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Schudson, Michael. (2005). "Four Approaches to the Sociology of News." In J. Curran and M. Gurevitch, eds., *Mass Media and Society*, 4<sup>th</sup> edition. London: Arnold.
- Sparks, Colin. (2008). Media systems in transition: Poland, Russia, *China*. *Chinese Journal of Communication*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 7-24.
- Sparks, Colin & Tong, Jingrong. (2009). INVESTIGATIVE JOURNALISM IN CHINA TODAY. *Journalism Studies*, Vol. 10 No. 3, 2009, pp. 337-352.
- Spottiswoode, R. (1950). *A Grammar of the Film: An analysis of film technique*. [Electronic version] The Regents of the University of California.
- Tagg, John. (1999). Evidence, Truth and Order: a means of surveillance. In Stuart Hall & Jessica Evans (ed.) *Visual Culture: the reader*. London: Sage, pp. 244-273.
- Tait, Sui. (2011). Bearing witness, journalism and moral responsibility. *Media Culture Society*, Vol. 33(8), pp. 1220-1235.
- Xin, Xin. (2010). "The Impact of 'Citizen Journalism' on Chinese Media and Society". *Journalism Practice*, Vol.4, No 3, pp. 333-344.
- Young, Chang Woo. (2009). OhmyNews: Citizen Journalism in South Korea. In Stuart, Allan & Einar Thorsen (ed.) *Citizen Journalism, Global Perspective*, Peter Lang Publishing, Inc, New York, pp. 113-142.
- Zhao, Yuezhi. (1998). *Media, Market and Democracy in China: between the Party Line and the Bottom Line*. Marston Book Services Limited, Oxford.

Zhang, Taofu. (2011). “Deinsertion” and “Withdrawal”: the First Exploration of China’s Regulation and Systematization of Internet. *China Media Report Overseas*, Vol. 7 (3), pp. 1-6.

Vannini, P. (2007). ‘Social Semiotics and Fieldwork: Method and Analytics’, *Qualitative Inquiry* 2007 13:113.

Wang, Jianlei. (2011). “Content analysis of citizen video news – based on the samples from *sohu*, *sina*, *youku* and *ku6* websites”. *China Media Report Overseas*, 7(3), pp. 29-42.

Örenbring, Henrik, (2013). Anything you can do, I can do better? Professional journalists on citizen journalism in six European countries. *International Communication Gazette*, 15(1), pp. 35-53.

## Appendix

### Coding sheet:

Blacked content in visual section means still photos are used in the shot; in sound section means non-diegetic sound; in text section means unedited texts in video clips.

### Sheet 1a:

		Visual		Sound		text
Shot s	Time	Camera	Description	speech	Backgrou nd sound	
1	00:00 – 00:13	Medium shot	Anchorman talking	On the 27 <sup>th</sup> we received a video clip from rescue team on the site. It shows how the last survivor in Wenzhou Bullet train accident, 2-year and 8 months old Little Yiyi is found and rescued.	-	
2	00:13 – 00:20	Medium shot	Rescue team (three men, one in middle, two on sides) cleaning on	<b>24<sup>th</sup>, July, 5:20 in the afternoon, 21 hours after the accident, rescue teams are still</b>	-	



			wreckage	<b>fighting on the wreckage of No.1115 bullet train.</b>		
3	00:20 – 00:34	Close-up	Zoom in on the one in middle	<b>We opened a board. One of us found there is a little hand moving under it. All of us are excited at that moment.</b>	-	Jiang Jianxu, Wenzhou Lucheng District Fire Brigade Qingfen Road Squadron instructor.
4	00:34 – 00:38	Medium shot	Rescue team looking for survivors, one man in middle, two on the side, half shown in image	<b>Down the hand, rescue team see a bended back of child. Then all the tools are put aside. In order to reduce the damage to its minima, rescue team use hands to dig into metal wreckage.</b>	-	
5	00:38 – 00:44	Close-up	Close-up on rescuer's hand reaching into wreckage		-	
6	00:44 – 00:48	Medium shot	Rescuer trying to open the wreckage		-	
7	00:48 –	Close-up	Rescuer who bend towards wreckage,	<b>Lookout for your feet, don't step on her.</b>	-	

	00:50		from back	(rescuer)		
8	00:50 – 00:57	Medium shot	People trying to take out the girl from wreckage	<b>During the process of cleaning wreckage, we heard she groan, which set our mind at rest.</b>	-	
9	00:57 – 01:03	Medium shot	People trying to open the wreckage in order to save Yiyi	<b>One, two three, good. (rescuer, multiple)</b>	-	
10	01:03 – 01:12	Panning, longshot	Yiyi been moved out from wreckage and putting into stretcher, (covered with cloth, couldn't see) surrounded by rescuers	<b>Doctor, where is doctor. Use cloth to wrap her up. Slow down, cover her eyes. (rescuer)</b>	People shouting and sound of people step on wreckage	
11	01:12 – 01:19	Panning, longshot	Nurse fixing yiyi onto stretcher.	<b>21 hours after the accident, 2-year and 8-month old Yiyi is successfully rescued.</b>	People yearling, sound of foot stepping on rock	
12	01:19 – 01:23	Panning, longshot	People carry yiyi away, nurse attending to her		People cheering and clapping	

13	01:23 – 01:44	Medium shot	Anchorman talking	Little Yiyi Survived, but her parents have left her forever because of this accident. On Microblog, people have found pieces of words her parents posted for her. They put them together and made a MV, this also becomes the last word Yiyi's parents left for her.	-	Most touching, Microblog last word retain love forever (lower bottom of screen)
14	01:44 – 01:53		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Little Yiyi at home before accident, close-up		<b>Music</b> Hallo Tomorrow by Milk and Coffe	
15	01:53 – 02:01		Fading. Black background with white text			Yiyi mother's last microblog post before accident
16	02:01 -02:08		<b>Photo</b> Fading. People carrying yiyi on a stretcher, long shot			
17	02:08 – 02:12		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Yiyi on stretcher, nurse next to her and			

			people standing in back		
18	02:12 – 02:18		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Back of an ambulance, people in white can be seen through window		
19	02:18 – 02:22		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Nurse and rescuer in ambulance taking care of yiyi, man holding infusion bottle in back, nurse bend down to Yiyi in front		
20	02:22 – 02:28		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Yiyi and nurse in hospital, close-up		
21	02:28 – 02:33		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Little Yiyi lying in hospital bed, facial close-up		
22	02:33 – 02:38		<b>Screen shot</b> Fading. Microblog post by other people, multiple		

23	02:38 – 02:42		<b>Screen shot</b> Fading. Microblog post by other people, multiple		
24	02:42 – 02:48		Fading. Microblog post by other people, together with white texts in black background		Mom think you are very sensible now, mom and dad need to leave for a long time, Yiyi need to take care of herself so mom and dad won't need to worry about you.
25	02:48 – 02:53		Fading. Microblog post by other people, together with white texts in black background		Remember that after you grow up, uncle will take care of you, all can be the witness; we are all your dads and moms.
26	02:53		Fading. Microblog		Your mom will

	– 02:58		post by other people, together with white texts in black background			safeguard you in heaven, memoirs of your growth, we will record for them. Be strong...
27	02:58 – 03:02		Back background with white text			But remembers me, what is courage. (lyric)
28	03:02 -03:07		Back background with white text			
29	03:07 – 03:12		<b>Photos</b> Fading. Two photos of Little Yiyi while sitting in the train		-	
30	03:12 – 03:30	Medium shot	Anchorman talking	Yiyi is only over 2-years old now. She might not remember what her parents' look when she grown up. But, fortunately, there is a video clip like this to conserve her parents' love. Hope with this love, Yiyi can come out	-	

				of the shadow, grow up healthy and strong		
--	--	--	--	---	--	--

**Sheet 2a:**

Shot s	Time	Visual		Sound		Text
		Camera	Description	speech	Background sound	
1	00:00 – 00:20	Medium shot	Anchorwomen talking	Welcome back, let's continue on our news. Parents of Xiang Weiyi, the last survivor of 7.23. bullet train accident, are both died. 7 o'clock last morning, their funeral ceremony was held in Wenzhou Funeral Parlor. The continuation of their lives, survivor Little Yiyi is still under medical attention in hospital.	-	News title, bottom of the screen
2	00:20 – 00:23	Longshot	People gathering outside funeral parlor	<b>In Wenzhou Funeral Parlor, Changan Hall, bodys of of Xiang Yuan and Shi Lihong</b>		
3	00:23	Medium	People standing in			

	– 00:26	shot	funeral hall	<b>are lying among flowers. Hundreds of colleagues and students from their work and school come to moan them with flower and tears. Even some citizens who are don't know them come to moan. Their relatives cannot help to cry out during the ceremony.</b>		
4	00:26 – 00:29	Medium shot	People standing in front of Yiyi parents' photo			
5	00:29 – 00:35	Close-up	Photo of Yiyi's parents in placed in funeral hall			
6	00:35 – 00:37	Medium shot	Woman crying in center, other people in background			
7	00:37 – 00:40	Medium shot	People walking in funeral hall, a huge flower basket is positioned in center right of image			
8	00:40 – 00:45	Medium shot	People with flowers standing outside the funeral hall			
9	00:45 – 00:49	Medium shot	People walking in queue outside funeral hall			
10	00:49 – 00:55	Medium shot	Woman talking to camera, with people standing in back		Hope Little Yiyi to be strong, health and grow up healthily. Health is the most important.	Colleague of Shi Lihong (mother)



11	00:55 – 01:02	Medium shot	Girl talking to camera in corridor, other people walking in back	I hope she (Yiyi) can fully recover after the treatment; it is the biggest comfort to her parents and family.		Student of Shi Lihong (mother)
12	00:12 – 01:07	Medium shot	Doctors doing operation on Yiyi's leg	<b>Second Affiliated hospital of Wenzhou Medical College published the latest treatment progress of Little Yiyi. Hospital hosted a surgery on Yiyi's most severely wounded left leg. Yiyi's state after surgery is good. The most worried thing is whether Yiyi's limb function can be restored.</b>		
13	01:07 – 01:13	Close-up	Closer shot on doctors during operation, same frame as last shot			
14	01:13 – 01:15	Close-up	Yiyi's leg lifted up by a doctor, covered with bandages and wounds			
15	01:15 – 01:42	Medium shot	Man talking to camera	Right now, if there is no other accident, recovery of lower left limb is quite good. About the recovery of limb function, the next		Lu Chaosheng, Chief of Medical Service, Second Affiliated

				recovery stage is a long one. As for how much of the function can be recovered, we cannot say for sure. It can only be seen by further inspection.		hospital of Wenzhou Medical College
16	01:42 – 01:45	Medium shot	Nurse working next to the bed in back while little Yiyi (center) is sleeping with respirator on her face	<b>While in hospital Little Yiyi often asks about her parents. Nurses and her family tried many ways to distract her attention.</b>		
17	01:45 – 01:50	Close-up, zooming in	Facial close-up on sleeping Yiyi,	<b>Currently, Yiyi is under good mental state.</b>		
18	01:50 – 02:12	Medium shot	Man talking to camera	She would ask why her parents are not here. Then our medical staff would talk to her to conceal it. Our medical staff would tell story for her, while there is anything mentions parents, our staff would		Pan Guoquan, Director of ICU, Second Affiliated hospital of Wenzhou Medical College

				change it to auntie or other appellation		
19	02:12 – 02:29	Medium shot	Same man talking to camera, with same frame	(Yiyi) usually can play some simple games, she usually can also posing with our staff, as well as telling stories. These are same as usual. In general, (her) mental state is good.		Pan Guoquan, Director of ICU, Second Affiliated hospital of Wenzhou Medical College
20	02:29 – 02:33	Medium shot	Little Yiyi lying on the bed, nurse takes care of her on the right side and another one feeding her food.	<b>Right now Yiyi still need to stay in ICU for further inspection. She will be transferred to general ward if she gets better. Journalists from The Dragon TV reporting from Wenzhou.</b>		
21	02:23 – 02:38	Close-up	Little yiyi eating			

**Sheet 3a:**

		Visual		Sound		Text
Shot	Time	Camera	Description	speech	Background sound	
1	00:00	Medium	Anchorman talking,	Let's turn to the last	-	News follow

	– 00:16	shot	calm and serious	been rescued survivor in the bullet train accident, Little Yiyi. After six hours on the road, 12:50 yesterday ...		up: 23.7 bullet train accident survivor Little Yiyi arrive in Shanghai (Title of the news, lower part of the screen)
2	00:16 – 00:20	Panning, medium shot	Ambulance coming into the frame	<b>The van transferring Little Yiyi arrived in Shanghai Xinhua Hospital this afternoon.</b>	Car engine	
3	00:20 – 00:24	Panning, medium shot	Little Yiyi and her grandmother getting off the van (centre), doctors helping (Left), journalists taking photos	<b>After get off the van, Little Yiyi is sent to the orthopedic room in pediatric building.</b>	Camera sound, people talking	
4	00:24 – 00:28	Zooming in, medium shot	Little Yiyi in her grandmother's arm (centre, back), nurses and another woman helping (front)	<b>Because Little Yiyi starts to cry, nurses attached as soon as they can the ECG monitor and drainage tube, then find toys to calm down the girl.</b>	Nurses trying to calm the kid down, kid crying.	
5	00:28 – 00:32	Close-up	Hospital bed and instrument			
6	00:32 – 00:37	Medium shot	Little Yiyi playing with toys in her grandmother's arms.	<b>Xinhua Hospital indicates they will arrange medical</b>	Girl talking, nurse	

				<b>examination for Little Yiyi as soon as possible.</b>	talking	
7	00:37 – 00:40	Medium shot	Three doctors talking together	Right now the most important treatment is to close surgical wound.	Doctors talking	
8	00:40 - 00:43	Close-up	Hands turning medical record	<b>Because of the severe wound on left leg, Little Yiyi has had five surgeries in Wenzhou already. In terms of how much the girl's limb function can recover, hospital says it is hard to say at this moment.</b>		
9	00:43 – 00:46	Close-up	Doctors in front of Yiyi's bed			
10	00:46 – 00:48	Close-up	Little Yiyi's leg wrapped with bandages			
11	00:48 – 00:50	Medium shot	Doctors on left checking little Yiyi, little Yiyi in her grandmother's arm on right			
12	00:50 – 00:53	Medium shot	Doctor talking to camera	Our first aim is to close the wounds, and then we'll think about lower limb function recovery. About how much of these muscle tissues can		Zhao Li, Director of Children Orthopaedic, Xinhua Hospital

13	00:53 – 00:56	Medium shot	Yiyi's grandma's hand, checking bandages on little Yiyi's leg.	recover and be retained, we need to have further inspection.		
14	00:56 – 01:01	Medium shot	Doctor talking to camera			
15	01:01 – 01:04	Longshot	Little Yiyi's grandma sitting on hospital bed, back to camera, little Yiyi in her arm, not shown in image. Another woman sitting on their left side.	<b>After settle down Little Yiyi, Xinhua Hospital arranged a meeting with a dozen of specialist. Both Shanghai Health Bureau and hospital say they will focus on the treatment of Little Yiyi</b>		
16	01:04 – 01:07	Longshot	Looking through the door, doctors sitting in meeting room, back to camera.			
17	01:07 – 01:11	Longshot , panning	Group of doctors talking around a table			
18	01:11 – 01:30	Medium shot	Man talking to journalist, nurses walking in background.	Xinhua Hospital is the major hospital for children healthcare. But Shanghai Health Bureau	Qu Jieming, Deputy Secretary of Shanghai	

				will also use all our resource, together with specialists in Shanghai to take part in the treatment of Little Yiyi		Health Bureau.
19	01:30 – 01:35	Medium shot	Anchorman talking with a smile on face	Hope Little Yiyi can grow up healthily with our love and help.		

**Sheet 1b:**

Shot s	Time	Visual		Sound		
		Camera	Description	speech	Background sound	
1	00:00 – 00:09		Black background with white texts		Slow music	After 7.23. railway accident, 2-years and 8-months old little girl, Xiang Weiyi, is the last being rescued survivor.
2	00:09 – 00:15		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Little Yiyi lying in stretcher, head covered with tower			

			and airbag put next to her head. Nurse taking care of her and rescuers carrying her.			
3	00:15 – 00:21		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Little Yiyi lying in hospital bed, head and face covered with bandage, a medical monitor above her head			
4	00:21 – 00:29	Tilting up, medium shot	Night, hospital building with people walking, camera slowly moving up			
5	00:29 – 00:35	Panning	A wall with doctors' photo, name and title on it			
6	00:35 – 00:42	Close-up	text on hospital building			<b>Clinic Hospitalization (text on hospital building)</b>
7	00:42 – 00:58	Panning, medium shot	Doctor surrounded by journalists, people outside	We are now redressing her vital state, with a series	People talking loudly	Director Ye from Wenzhou No.118 hospital



			picture asking questions	of treatments like reviving and anti-infection. Her current state is stable. Woman: Have you contacted Emergency Room? Yes, all is ready. Man: Is her life in danger? No.		talking about Yiyi's situation
8	00:58 – 01:12	Longshot	Middle age women sitting in chair, sadly, a young man is talking to her	<b>Who is that auntie? (Yiyi's) grandma? Maternal grandma? I'm not sure. (two men outside camera talking)</b>	People walking and talking	Little Yiyi's grandmother waiting anxiously outside hospital room
9	01:12 – 01:15	Medium shot	Sign of the layout of hospital building			
10	01:15 – 01:24	Medium shot	Man on right surrounded by microphone and	(Too much noise, cannot hear speech)	People talking and walking	Uncle of Little Yiyi

			people, talking with hands holding together			
11	01:24 – 01:36	Medium shot	Man talking to journalists, left side of face shown to camera	Can survive such a long time under a high temperature, this kid's vitality is strong. Such situation is rare.	People talking and walking	
12	01:36 – 01:44	Zooming in, longshot	Five polices guarding yiyi's room			
13	01:44 – 02:11	Panning, then still frame on weeping woman	Yiyi moving into elevator in a bed with police guarding, people gathering around, a woman start weeping after elevator door closes and leaving from left side of the camera to right			Yiyi transfer to another hospital
14	02:11 – 02:40	Close-up on little yiyi, then	Yiyi is put into ambulance, with police guarding and			Yiyi transfer to another hospital

		panning after the ambulance	people surrounding, then the ambulance leaves from right side.			
15	02:40 – 02:51		Black background with white texts		Slow music	According to latest news, parents of Little Yiyi are killed in the accident.

**Sheet 2b:**

Shot s	Time	Visual		Sound		Text
		Camera	Description	speech	Background sound	
1	00:00 – 00:07		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Yiyi's parents standing facing to each other together, smiling		Erhu music, slow	
2	00:07 – 00:14		Text scrolling up, black background with white texts			Brother, I won't cry, don't want to cry, though my eyes are shedding tears. Yuan (name of

						Yiyi's father), are you going to the heaven without bullet trains made in China? And together with those lives lost. They are same as you, innocent, bright and ordinary.
3	00:14 – 00:19		<b>Photo</b> Fading. A group of people moaning for lives lost in the accident, with lighted candles forming "7.23." on the round in front of them			
4	00:19 – 00:32	Medium shot	Photos of yiyi's parents in funeral parlor hall, a man standing in front of it and looking at them, other people			

			standing on sides.			
5	00:32 – 00:49	Longshot	Funeral hall is full of people moaning for yiyi's parents.		Music on funeral	<b>No matter how long you are gong, we can hear your voice. (sign on the wall)</b>
6	00:49 – 01:14	Panning, 360 degree, longshot	People standing around in funeral hall, flowers are putted next to the wall			
7	00:14 – 00:38	Panning, longshot	Shot from top of a building, coffins are carried away, people standing on the side of road		Women weeping, sound of people talking	

**Sheet 3b:**

		Visual		Sound		Text
Shot	Time	Camera	Description	speech	Background sound	
1	00:00 – 00:35	Panning, longshot	Rescuer moves little yiyi onto a stretcher and carry her away		People shouting, sound of	

			from the wreckage and then medical crew take her away.		machine	
2	00:35 – 00:48		<b>Photo</b> Fading. Little Yiyi lying in hospital			Since the moment of being rescued, her family hope Yiyi can receive better medical care. On 22 <sup>nd</sup> , August, around 6 o'clock, Little Yiyi is finally transferred to Shanghai for further treatment.
3	00:48 – 01:18	Panning, longshot	Little yiyi in her grandmother's arm coming out of elevator and walking out of hospital to ambulance, together	Smile, Smile, Cheers		

			with a doctor, a woman playing with yiyi and a woman with flower in hand			
4	01:18 – 01:24	Zooming in on the face of Little Yiyi, panning	<b>Photo</b> Little Yiyi waving to the camera while sitting in her grandmother's arm in ambulance			
5	01:24 – 01:37	Panning, medium shot	Ambulance leaving hospital from right side of camera, followed by another van and several people			